
TUESDAY, 1 DECEMBER 2020

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams.]

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Order! Good afternoon, hon members, and guests here at this virtual hybrid model for the sitting of the House here today. We have hon members and the Premier here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officers and the Table staff. I trust that everybody has been connected to participate in the sitting of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in terms of Rule 1A of the Standing Rules with all our members that have the necessary electronic means.

I would also just like to highlight some key points and one is that we have a quorum here today as provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Members here, both here in the Chamber and on Microsoft Teams, have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. The members are also requested to please ensure that we are adequately socially distanced, which I can see, and I thank the Parliamentary staff for making sure that happens in the House, and then just to state that we are also offering language translation services, which are available both in the Chamber as per normal and on Microsoft Teams via their respective channels. It does require that you use a second device or your cell phone and if you have earphones available to please use that.

And then just finally, as ruled by the Presiding Officer in the sitting of the House on 23 April 2020, no interjections shall be permitted during the debate. In this regard I would also like to draw the attention of hon members to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

I now recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the appointment by the Rules Committee on 14 June 2019 of Mr R D Mackenzie as the Pension Fund Trustee of the WCPP and of Mr D America as an alternate be confirmed by the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to. I will now ask the Secretary to read the First Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Principle of the Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 7–2020]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary, I recognise the hon Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Two weeks ago, as we all know, the Minister of Finance, Tito Mboweni delivered his Medium Term Budget Policy Statement in which he introduced a beautiful poem, the *Rime of the Ancient Mariner*, to suggest that “we have been blown off course by a mighty storm in South Africa.” To quote:

*“And now the storm-blast came, and he
Was tyrannous and strong;
He struck with his o'ertaking wings,
And chased us south along.”*

Now I am no poet, Deputy Speaker, but one must question whether the *Rime of the Ancient Mariner* was the most appropriate poem under the circumstances, because in the end the Ancient Mariner shot the only symbol of hope, an albatross, and his ship sunk. Let us not forget the fate of the ship in the *Rime of the Ancient Mariner*, to quote:

*“Under the water it rumbled on,
Still louder and more dread:
It reached the ship, it split the bay;
The ship went down like lead.”*

Deputy Speaker, the fact is that we were not blown off course, but steered off course by a National Cabinet, who are the very opposite of what the Minister claims, almost comically, and I quote:

“...facing peril with the strong sense of direction, steadfastness, resolution and determination.”

Now no-one in their right mind could possibly think of the National Cabinet as steadfast, resolute, and determined. The fact is that the National Cabinet behave more like wasps in a jar and are responsible for steering us off-course towards a fiscal doom, which is why we are in deep economic trouble with stagnant economic growth, stunning revenue shortfalls, exploding budget deficits and staggering national debt. To illustrate the point, National Government borrowed a staggering R2,98 trillion over the past ten years between 2010/11 and 2020/21 and all National Government have to show for it is stagnant economic growth with a 7,8% contraction this year but more importantly, preceded by a 0,2% growth in 2019/20 and a staggering 11 million people unemployed in South Africa, which is why the sovereign credit rating agencies who do not play by the Queen Bee Rules, of course, switched to rapid fire last week and downgraded our sovereign credit rating to deep junk status.

When it comes to sovereign credit ratings we now hover precariously just above – wait for it – Bosnia, Iraq and Ghana. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Did that actually happen?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: We are the opposite of Bill Clinton's famous saying, "*It's the economy, stupid.*" [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Because here it is the politics, stupid, and nothing illustrates the point better than the R10,5 billion which will be spent bailing out zombie state-owned national airline, South African Airways. The fact is that when it comes to a choice between spending R30 million on maintaining and developing healthcare services at our hospitals, or spending R30 million on bailing out South African Airways, the main Opposition chooses to spend R30 million on bailing out South African Airways.

The fact is that when it comes to a choice between R11,5 million on clinical training and supervision of our health science trainees and the increased capacity of our healthcare work force, or spending R11,5 million on bailing out South African Airways, the main Opposition chooses to bail out South African Airways.

The fact is that when it comes to a choice between spending a million rand

providing effective agricultural support to smallholder and black commercial farmers, promoting and facilitating agricultural development by targeting beneficiaries of land reform, restitution and redistribution, or spending a million rand on bailing out South African Airways, guess what – guess what? The main Opposition chooses to spend a million rand bailing out South African Airways. The fact is that when it comes to a choice between spending R492 000 on reducing poverty and supporting food security or spending R492 000 on bailing out South African Airways, the Opposition chooses again – wait for it – to spend R492 000 on bailing out South African Airways. It is simply wrong, and we must not forget that the municipal budget was also slashed by R80,3 million in our province in this financial year to fund the bailout of South African Airways, which is why we should all congratulate the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Development and Tourism, the hon Deidre Baartman, for summoning the Minister of Public Enterprises, Pravin Gordhan, who for some reason is clinging on for dear life to the national airline to come and defend the indefensible right here in the Provincial Parliament in the Western Cape.

All this means, Deputy Speaker, that the Provincial Budget will be cut, after adjustments of course, for provincial equitable share formula data updates by a massive R2,5 billion over the medium term between 2021/22 and 2023/24 in the Western Cape. We are not going down without a fight and at least where the R2,39 billion in-year budget cut for compensation of employees is concerned, we have lodged an objection in terms of Section 79 of the Constitution to the Second Division of Revenue Amendment Bill 2020.

In a letter to President Cyril Ramaphosa, dated 27 November 2020, we drew his attention to our concerns that if brought into law, the bill will “infringe on the ability of the provinces to comply with their current contractual and legal obligations to all their employees and will impact on provincial revenue allocations in an unlawful and an unconstitutional manner.”

We will hence have no option but to seek legal redress in this regard, impacting as it will on our capacity to service existing collective agreements, deliver services and continue to perform as a functional organ of state. We cannot be expected, put simply, to cough up R2,39 billion that we do not have in the Western Cape, but despite the drastic budget cuts we have mobilised a combined R1,4 billion support package for jobs, for safety and for wellbeing in this financial year so that we can bounce back in the Western Cape, which includes an allocation of an additional R155,9 million to support small businesses by accelerating the maintenance and repair of infrastructure at schools, which includes an allocation of an additional R12 million to support small businesses which have been hard hit by the COVID-19 pandemic, which includes an additional R80,5 million to support businesses in the wine industry which have been hard hit by the COVID-19 pandemic; which includes an allocation of an additional R36,5 million to keep our children safe by accelerating the fencing of schools; which includes an allocation of an additional R20 million to appoint young people as safety ambassadors to drive violence prevention interventions; which includes an allocation of R15 million to improve the collection of data at emergency centres to support evidence-based violence prevention, and which includes an allocation of R4 million to appoint young people to support the development of literacy

and of numeracy at Early Childhood Development Centres in the Western Cape.

Of course with the resurgence of COVID-19 infections we have also R227 million earmarked and available on the Health Department's budget, R200 million earmarked and available on the Transport and Public Works Department's budget and R864 million available in the provincial reserves, all of which is available to fight the resurgence of COVID-19 infections in the Western Cape and, Deputy Speaker, we have done this because of course when people have jobs, people have dignity, and when people have dignity, people have hope; because when people are safe, people have dignity, and when people have dignity, people have hope; and finally, because when people are empowered, people have dignity, and when people have dignity, people have hope in the Western Cape. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues, Leader of the Opposition and all the members here in the Western Cape Legislature. Deputy Speaker, in his speech last week and today the Minister of Finance

and Economic Opportunities made it abundantly clear just how much trouble South Africa is in economically. The subheadings used by Minister Maynier last week and today tell the broad-brush story of the national economy clearly under severe stress.

Headings like “debt crisis”, which, Deputy Speaker, will be approaching over 80% next year, bailouts, budget cuts and wage wars, and I cannot emphasise enough, the impact – the devastating impact these budget cuts will have on frontline services and service delivery in our province because R2,5 billion is not small change, and of course we know that with the wage war that is coming between Government and the unions, the country would be brought to a standstill, and of course because you judge a person by his track record, not by what he is promising to do, we have seen the rating agencies downgrading South Africa, as the Minister said, because, Deputy Speaker, despite the optimism that South Africa had just under 34 months ago when President Ramaphosa stood in Parliament on 18 February 2018 and delivered a speech that gave many South Africans hope, in fact since he took over the country, things have been going in a different direction. The situation has become worse under his leadership.

Now all these headings are not telling a positive story about South Africa. They are also not headings which describe a situation which can be blamed to any significant extent of the pandemic only.

Even the additional budget for the COVID-19 virus, real costs would have

been more manageable without the rampant corruption, poor policy depreciation [audio distorted.] times incoherent communication which have come to characterise the South African Government.

However, Deputy Speaker, these headings do tell us that the National ANC Government cannot be trusted with running the economy of South Africa, and of course we are worried not only as the Western Cape but also as a country, we are seeing resurgence in COVID-19 cases. We are aware that the National Government would want to introduce the lockdown again, which is really not helping.

I think it is worth reminding the members of this House, Deputy Speaker, that the intention for the lockdown was to prepare the country in case we get overwhelmed in terms of the health infrastructure and I must also remind the members of this House that in June this year, when the Western Cape was experiencing high numbers of COVID-19 cases we were visited by President Ramaphosa who promised to fund the COVID-19 for the Western Cape and up until today that promise was never fulfilled, but that is how we have come to know President Ramaphosa. He is not a man of his word.

If ever a struggling increasingly discredited government was presented through the outbreak of the pandemic with an opportunity to re-establish itself, it was the National Government of South Africa.

If ever a government used the opportunity to demonstrate just how fatally flawed and ill-equipped it is to govern a modern state, it is the ANC National Government.

Deputy Speaker, one of the more shambolic and economically damaging areas of South African National Government activity is its ill-advised approach to the user management of a wide range of State-owned Enterprises and Agencies of various kinds falling under the control of the different State Ministries. Although as a result of disastrous governance issues and crippling financial challenges, the most obvious example of these are probably South African Airways and I think Minister Maynier spoke a lot about what is happening there and the bailout which was given to SAA, ESKOM, PRASA and many more, and also we have our own in the National Department of Transport. There are entities that are just financial gobblers and of 12 of those entities I think it is only one that is functioning properly, Deputy Speaker.

So all this is an indication of a government that has lost its direction and that is why the rating agencies had no choice but to downgrade South Africa because they can see that there is no policy direction and there is no leadership under this Government.

Deputy Speaker, in his special address to this House on 22 October 2020, the Premier stated the intention that the Province will establish a single transport authority for the greater Cape Town region. This will be a single

provincial public transport operating entity to consolidate public transport operation functions and enable improved integration and management of public transport in the Western Cape, across jurisdictions, modes and functions.

The entity will be responsible for the performance of existing provincial public transport operational functions and the joint performance and existence of the new found [audio distorted.] public transport operation functions in agreement with participating municipalities as expressly provided for in the National Land Transport Act.

The functions will include the operational management of road-based public transport, bus, minibus taxis, and if assignment proceeds it will also include rail. The entity would also be responsible for public transport systems including integrated monitoring, ticketing and information systems, and Deputy Speaker, the members of this House are aware that we recently held a National Taxi Lekgotla to formalise this industry because we have seen a number of challenges that are facing this industry that are contributing negatively to our economy and in our own province in the Western Cape, [inaudible.] Lekgotla, was, you know, preceded by our own provincial Lekgotla where we outlined the approach that we want to take as the Provincial Government of the Western Cape to formalise the taxi industry because this is a very important industry for us carrying more than 50% of the passengers in the entire Western Cape and it is in our interest to see this industry formalised, and of course we remain concerned

with the violence that is happening in this industry and we made it very clear that the condition for us to be able to partner meaningful with the industry is to make sure that there is peace.

The municipalities will retain their planning functions and the entity will take direction from these plans as we know that municipalities play a very important role as planning authorities when it comes to public transport. Planning integration needs to occur through the establishment of appropriate institutional structures across some of the key jurisdictional boundaries. In addition the entity will provide for the full participation of the CT and local municipalities as substantial stakeholders and decision-makers. In line with the Province's mandate to coordinate between municipalities, the entity will work in improving transport integration across the province through operational coordination with participating municipalities. This will necessarily require the establishment of the new coordination structures to enable regular engagement and alignment on operational issues.

Deputy Speaker, this will also help us as the Provincial Government to coordinate the functioning of the public transport, particularly rail, because the failures of PRASA are really affecting the poorest of the poor of the people of the Western Cape. That is why it is so important for us to get this right.

The Western Cape Government is not embarking on these actions

concerning public transport lightly or without considerable analysis of the situation. I am sure that we will enjoy the support of all people and organisations with an interest in the legitimate needs of our community residents and visitors and of course we will be taking... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We will be taking advantage of what President Ramaphosa said, where the private sector can now partner with Government to fix public transport. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much. [Microphone off.] [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We cannot hear, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Dugmore, if you will just take your seat. Is there a point of order? Did I hear something?

An HON MEMBER: Deputy Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ah, thank you. We are going to just – can I ask hon member Dugmore, we restart the clocks, please. Obviously the microphone was not on. Hon member Dugmore, would you please care to restart your speech?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Okay, just one second. I will be with you now, I am also just... Okay, right. Thank you, Deputy Speaker, apologies for that.

Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, members of the House and fellow South Africans, on this World Aids Day, 1 December, we as the ANC once again pledge to work with all of those who live positively with HIV to defeat discrimination and to ensure that all those who test HIV positive, like those who test positive for COVID-19, have access to affordable and quality healthcare. As per our President in his weekly briefing, we should acknowledge that over the last decade the number of new infections of HIV infections has decreased by over 60%, a significant achievement by the ANC-led Government and the people of our country. The President has also pointed to the fact that unequal relations between men and women contribute not only to gender-based violence, but also to the prevalence of HIV and it was interesting, Deputy Speaker, that the silence from MEC Maynier was deafening – not a word about gender-based violence and how this budget is going to address those particular issues.

Deputy Speaker, over a decade of DA perpetuation of past privileges, it is

cold comfort to now hear that they suddenly believe in our people's dignity and that they plan on giving people hope. In fact, I would appeal to MEC Maynier and his Department to look at the PERO as well as the MERO which have in fact informed these budgets because they are fatally flawed. Nowhere in the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook or the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook do we actually look at the state of our economy when it comes to ownership. It is one thing and we also agree that a job gives dignity, but greater dignity and greater hope is when people actually participate in the ownership of the economy and every year that the PERO and MERO fail to even address the issue of the lack of transformation in tourism and in other sectors of our economy, we are failing to give dignity and hope, and after a decade of DA prioritising only clean audits over service delivery, it is ironic that this DA Provincial Government wants to now recognise people's dignity and give them hope. But as the ANC, Deputy Speaker, we remain unconvinced that the DA actually does care about everyone's dignity and that they are prepared to give everyone hope. Rather than actively supporting black commercial farmers, and by black I mean African, Coloured and Indian, or supporting genuine food security by allowing small-scale farmers to secure leases from municipalities or sport facilities where they are actually needed, this Provincial Government does what it only knows what is best to do and that is to criticise, to blame and complain.

The politics of Helen Zille and her cabal unfortunately, Deputy Speaker, live on and another example on that was a dispute which has been declared

by the Premier and MEC Maynier as opposed to finding a constructive solution and if they are not criticising then they are spending R15 million to “improve the collection of data.”

In his address to this House on 22 October the hon Premier said:

“The Western Cape Government’s Budget over the medium term is likely to be cut by the same amount or more than is now going to be funnelled into the black hole, which is SAA.”

But just last week we got the true picture from National Treasury and the cuts of the Western Cape budget is nowhere near the same amount or more as the Premier indicated. If anything, Deputy Speaker, the Premier misled the House.

Let us be clear, Deputy Speaker, that with a drop in national revenue it is obvious that there will be cuts in budgets and all provinces are affected by cost of employee amounts. All provinces are affected but if one looks at the actual allocations in regard to the equitable share it is clear that what the Premier did, which is trying to create alarm, trying to create panic, such as MEC Maynier is trying to do with his Section 79 approach, it is not actually based on fact. This DA-led administration is about criticising, and certainly not about recognising the dignity of our people and have certainly not given our people hope for the last decade.

The DA administration is quick to blame National Government for cuts but is slow to recognise what National Government will be doing for the province as well, so as much as there were cuts, MEC Maynier through the Deputy Speaker, in regard to the equitable share, there were massive amounts over R1,5 billion in conditional grants for mass public employment in the ECD Sector, in Education, but you are silent about those issues because it is simply cheap and really kindergarten politics not to actually acknowledge this budget in its fullest sense.

The MED, Deputy Speaker, completely omitted to mention the economic reconstruction and recovery plan as announced by President Ramaphosa and for the sake of this House allow me to remind the hon Maynier of the key pillars of this economic reconstruction and recovery plan. If you even just attempted to align us and see the advantages, and not try and be “clever”, in inverted commas or “smart”, we would get a lot more done. The President talked about aggressive infrastructure development. He talked about employment orientated strategic localisation, reindustrialisation and export promotion, energy security, support for tourism, recovery and growth, gender equality and economic inclusion of women and youth and green economy interventions and then, very importantly, mass public employment interventions, strengthening food security and macro economic interventions. But we do not get any alignment by the MEC in regard to those particular interventions and what we also see, Deputy Speaker, is that the National Government has an immediate implementation plan with timeframes, with who is responsible,

with budgets, but this province told us just last week that they do not have an implementation plan. We must wait until February. That is on the record, and like the Safety Plan which has no actual implementation plan, the economic recovery plan in this province will be doomed to fail, so what we want from the MEC is a time-bound clear plan. Where is the investment going, who is responsible, what are the allocations, how do you integrate with the municipal infrastructure budget, but it is not this DA administration's interest to reaffirm investment in infrastructure and how central infrastructure development is to our economic recovery as a country.

Complete omission by the hon MEC on the investments into social housing; another complete omission by the MEC on investments into Tygerberg and Klipfontein Hospitals that are coming from National, another complete omission of the extra R7 billion provided by National Treasury to the equitable share to fee-paying public schools and Government-subsidised independent schools, as announced by Minister Mboweni – another complete omission, because the DA is not interested in giving our people dignity and have never been interested in giving our people hope. The hopes of domestic workers and other workers who have been saving for years to gain access to social housing in Tafelberg on the Main Road of Sea Point, those hopes have been crushed by this DA administration, yet they want to talk about dignity and denying domestic workers dignity of social housing close to where they work.

Instead of bouncing back from a global recession or global pandemic, this Government is asking the people of the Western Cape to bounce back from failed budgetary priorities that affect redress over the last ten years. One of the principles of the DA's economic justice policy is that "people can never be entirely equal."

In another place in the policy document it states that the underlying criteria for assessment would shift from placing emphasis on narrow criteria towards addressing the drivers of poverty and inequality. In other words there is a complete dismissal of our history as a country and a province whose inequalities are based on race, class and gender – an absolute denial of that.

One wonders how this DA administration is going to give our people dignity when they are in denial about how our communities in fact were born of these contributors to inequalities, race, class and gender. Give our people Broad-based Economic Empowerment and you give them dignity and hope. Recognise and do not dismiss the injustices of the past based on race, class and gender. Give our people land and you will begin to recognise the dignity of our people, but the DA policies do not provide dignity and hope.

I want to quote, Deputy Speaker, from the DA's Manifesto in 2019 when they say:

“A labour market flexibility exemption clause aimed at making the process to hire and fire employees simpler and allowing potential employees to opt out of the relevant sectoral minimum wage, which is R3 500, and it would have a new minimum of no less than the Old Age Grant.”

That is R1 800. I want to ask you, MEC Maynier, can you survive on R1 800? I want to ask the hon Premier, can you survive on R1 800? I want to ask MEC Bredell and hon Mackenzie, can you survive on R1 800... [Interjections.] Because your party’s very policies are actually saying the minimum wage of R3 500 is too little and that just shows exactly that this Government led by the DA is actually an anti-poor government.

What we are saying as the ANC, which actually will contribute to greater equality and we cannot only focus on jobs in a COVID / post-COVID situation, we have got to look at the inequality. Our organisation, the African National Congress is very clear, when we have committed to pass national legislation in this term to ensure worker ownership via worker trust share ownership schemes and cooperatives. [Interjections.]

This will in fact, Deputy Speaker, build on the minimum wage, making it into a living wage and actually ensure that wealth is shared so that workers get dividends and not simply a wage but this is something that the DA powers that be simply cannot grasp and are not prepared to implement.

So, if we do this, we believe that actually you will be giving dignity by giving and guiding legislation to ensure that there is actual ownership of the production. Even as workers then go into retirement they will benefit from the profits generated by those companies, but this is anathema to the DA. [Interjection.]

The hon Minister Madikizela comes from the community, Khayelitsha, a community created by the apartheid regime as a so-called new home for African people in our province, but the hon Madikizela through his party's policies wishes to actually deny that Khayelitsha was established along racial lines because race to the DA apparently is no longer important. They just mouth non-racism and do not understand the redress which is required because of racial discrimination.

The hon Madikizela wants the people of this province and of Khayelitsha to believe that the DA believes in their dignity and to give them hope while denying the very origins of the inequalities in Mitchells Plain and in Khayelitsha, to mention a few. There is little doubt, Deputy Speaker, our country's economy is in a dire state. The global economy is in a dire state. What is required from all of us is not to try and score cheap points by misleading this House and attacking National Government coming up with PR phrases such as "bouncing back". The MEC thinks this action that they are taking in terms of Section 79 is going to secure them votes that they have lost to the Freedom Front. It is not actually.

Those Freedom Front voters have already shown you in other parts of the country that they are rejecting the DA so as much as Helen Zille tries to force the DA to embark on a right-wing path, that is actually not going to assist the DA. The ANC In this House remains committed to ensuring that we strengthen confidence in our provincial economy and the national economy but we believe that this confidence can only be built through diversifications of sectors, especially the green and ocean economies, diversification in ownership as I have referred to... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and diversification in the sizes of our enterprises especially through encouraging SMMEs in our province. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Dugmore.
[Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Wow! Wow! Wow!

An HON MEMBER: I now recognise hon member Xego.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes!

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The recent presentation of the

Second Adjusted Estimates by the Western Cape Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities fail to live up to the expectations and inspire confidence in the millions of our people in the province who continue to live in abject poverty. These are the people without basic necessities of life and services such as shelter, water, refuse system, meaningful jobs paying decent salaries. Whilst the Minister's adjustments fail to take into account almost all these issues, he stood there and tried to teach us about what human dignity meant. The address was not only mediocre but also sounded like a broken record as it consisted of a repetition of quotes from the Western Cape Premier's previous speech.

As the EFF we are very much alive to the reality that there are additional allocations supplementing what has already been provided in the Departmental budgets for the financial year at issue. However, we still maintain that not only are these allocations insignificant, but they will not make any real impact on the lives of our people. Whilst maintenance and the repair of infrastructure in schools will create some jobs, these will not be significant jobs with decent salaries to be able to make own lives of a dignified life. They will only tend to be what we call it, peace jobs.

Furthermore, the majority of small businesses suffered great financial losses as a result of COVID-19 so their aim will first be to recoup their losses before they can even think of creating any real job opportunities. Another factor is that some of these businesses might have adopted innovative ways of producing outputs using less staff. So although

additional funding assistance will contribute something to these small businesses, there is no guarantee that these efforts will turn into real job opportunities.

It is not surprising coming from the DA-led Government, to think that throwing millions of rands into fencing will all of a sudden turn schools into a safe haven for children. The Western Cape is the epicentre of crime in the whole South Africa and no amount of fencing can stop and even reduce crime. It is like trying to treat a deep old wound using a plaster hoping that in no time it will be healed, all will be well and it is business as usual.

It is equally not surprising to see the DA resorting to using young people as the so-called safety ambassadors because we all know that their so-called Safety Plan was nothing but a sham, which sounds real but in the truth it does not exist.

The number of COVID-19 infections in the province is surging once again. In no time the Western Cape will need all hands on deck and whilst the Minister continues to speak about the dignity of our people, the DA-led Government continues to treat community healthcare workers who are also in the forefront of the fight against COVID-19 [Inaudible.]

The past week these workers had to come and protest outside this very same building for better pay and permanent jobs, amongst other things,

because the Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo failed to keep her promise. To show that this Government does not care about these workers, the Minister of Health in question refused to address them and to even receive their memorandum of demands. It is our view as the EFF that these additional adjustment allocations are nothing other than an attempt for the DA-led Government to do damage control ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Xego, your time is up.

Mr M XEGO: ...in a year in which they performed dismally in all fronts.
[Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you done, thank you very much. I recognise hon Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Deputy Speaker, are you able to hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear you clearly, thank you.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, fellow South Africans, today we are debating the Western Cape's Second Adjustment Budget, the first of its kind, a budget in a time of global health pandemic, a budget to save jobs and to save lives. It reminds me of one of my favourite quotes by Oprah:

“Do what you have to do until you can do what you want to do.”

Because, Deputy Speaker, as a province, we need to know that we need to do, what we have to do, until we can do what we want to do and that is exactly what Premier Winde and Minister Maynier have done.

In the Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism Standing Committee it was revealed that so far R65 million has been allocated by the Western Cape Government to support Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises in the province this year already. SMMEs are part of the core of any economy which is why the Western Cape Government has allocated R38 million intervention through the Western Cape Business Relief Fund. This fund has seen more than 2 000 jobs saved and over 230 SMMEs assisted through the fund.

Further, R14 million has been spent by the Western Cape SMME Booster Project which has had tremendous success, where 500 SMMEs have benefited, 443 jobs created, and a funding partnership of more than R40 million secured.

Township businesses and other innovative projects have not been left behind with R5 million allocated to a Furniture Manufacturing Design Studio in Nyanga, Expansion of Coding Labs and Prototype Makerspace Programme in Kraaifontein, Rapid Product Prototyping Programme in Thembaletu, an Enterprise Coding Lab and Donor [Inaudible.] Programme

at the West Coast College.

The Department of Economic Opportunities and Tourism has further allocated R1 million to the Western Cape Business Chamber Programme which saw five Business Chambers supported with 6 396 SMME beneficiaries and which led to the establishment of an informal beneficiary base of 2159 businesses.

Further, R1 million was allocated to the Early Childhood Development Centre Registration Project and this is proof that the Western Cape Government continues to recognise the significant and unique contribution that SMMEs make to the provincial economy. Millions of rands will be distributed to projects, programmes and private businesses which have far-reaching potential for creating and protecting job opportunities and the safety and well-being of Western Cape residents.

The DA in the Western Cape continues to prioritise and support SMMEs and programmes which create job opportunities and support the dignity of all residents, but Deputy Speaker, as much as I love Oprah, as a government we cannot emulate everything that Oprah does. We need to focus on spending the little that we have well, we need to stretch an already stretched budget, a budget that has been cut year-upon-year in order to fund zombie State-owned Enterprises.

In the 2020/2021 financial year, South Africa had to fund a R56 billion

bailout for Eskom. This year we have to fund a R10,5 billion bailout for SAA and everyone seems to forget that Eskom is due for another R33 billion in 2021/22 and another R23 billion in 2022/23 as revealed last year in the Budget Committee. This is separate to the R49 billion allocated to Eskom in the 2019/20 financial year.

Deputy Speaker, we cannot cut provincial budgets in order to bail out a SoE every single year. We are working with public money, money which belongs to the people of South Africa, but currently the National Government is giving out bailouts like it is Oprah's favourite things.

†Ons almal kan mos wragtigwaar nie 'n *bailout* kry elke jaar nie. Dit is mos nie reg nie! [All of us can surely not get a bailout every year. That cannot be right!]

The Western Cape Government has exercised unparalleled fiscal responsibility over the years, allowing the Province to now use its reserves and mobilise R1,7 billion for its fiscal transition support facility which can support departments in the medium term to find more cost effective and smarter ways of delivering services. This will support and cushion departments even after National Government cut the provincial equitable share. We therefore commend the Provincial Treasury for being prepared for such challenging economic times.

By using its own reserves, the Province is protecting the budgets of

critical services such as Education and Healthcare from spending pressures which would otherwise compromise the dignity and hope of Western Cape residents.

The budget cuts by National Government place significant strain on the Provincial Government's ability to provide service delivery to residents. Should the wage freeze on public employees' compensation fails, the R2,3 billion needed for salary adjustments will cause a liquidity squeeze to the Province's finances which it cannot afford. The steps announced by the Province will however see to it that the Western Cape is able to weather the current economic storm. Now the National Government must play its part and not continue to place undue financial pressure on the Province.

The adjustment to the provincial equitable share as per the final 2020 MTEF allocation letter in slide 16 of the Budget Committee presentation, which hon Dugmore attended, is 26,1 billion for the MTEF period, the period 2020/21 to 2023/24, Deputy Speaker, which will affect the provincial equitable share. This is separate to the R2 billion cut by the National Government in the First Adjustment Budget and the R2,3 billion cut in the Second Adjustment Budget, then because of Provincial Reserve Fund, the net cut in the Second Adjustment Budget is obviously R1,5 billion.

The total conditional grant increases in DORA were R62 million but the

total conditional contingencies are R128 million in the second adjustment, which created a net decrease of conditional grants in the Western Cape of R66 million.

Deputy Speaker, members of the Opposition must not mislead this House. The Budget Committee today unanimously adopted a resolution to invite the Minister for Public Enterprises, Pravin Gordhan and his Department to explain the rationale of the R10,5 billion bailout for SAA. The Committee would like that Department to explain exactly how it came to this R10,5 billion and how we determine how much money would be cut from each department and every province. We will thus call on the National Minister to account for the decision that it made, and I am hopeful that Minister Gordhan will participate and address the Budget Committee's concerns.

Furthermore, the Committee also unanimously agreed that it will call on the National Government to explain the impact on the finances of the Western Cape should the attempt by National Government to freeze the Public Wage Bill be unsuccessful. Both National and Provincial Treasury have expressed concerns over the failure of the wage freeze, saying that should it fail severe strain will be placed on Government budgets. Despite drastic budget cuts to the province this year by National Government, including cuts to our title deeds, land reform and provincial roads grant, the Western Cape is committed to creating jobs, dignity and safety for its residents. Deputy Speaker, I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape is in deep trouble. Our Government and this governing party is adrift, unable to present a coherent plan to navigate the financial turmoil we are in.

The so-called *Budget to Bounce Back* is nothing more than a Potemkin village, a pretentiously showy façade intended to mask or divert attention from this embarrassing fact.

This Government claims it will spend an additional R1,1 billion on jobs. R814 million of this is the Presidential Employment Initiative, which by design will fund additional posts in the education sector. This is creating jobs by direct employment, not by stimulating a sector of our economy. Then they have added in the R61 million additional conditional grant for road maintenance and R155 million for maintenance and infrastructure repairs at schools. Obviously infrastructure spending does generate jobs in the construction sector, but if they want to add the additional allocation to the infrastructure and claim this as contributing to job creation they must also subtract where this Government is failing to spend on infrastructure.

For example, the Department of Transport and Public Works has

surrendered R155 million from its transport infrastructure budget due to slow spending on road infrastructure projects.

It has also surrendered R45 million from its Public Works Infrastructure Budget because it has failed to spend this on the maintenance of Child and Youth Care Centres.

In addition to surrendering R200 million from its infrastructure projects, the Department has transferred R90 million from Transport Infrastructure projects due to slow spending, to non-infrastructure items like Integrated Transport Hub and the Go George project.

So, hon Deputy Speaker, when it comes to infrastructure-based job creation, we are actually in negative territory because this Government cannot spend the money it already has. It is profoundly dishonest to add in the additional allocations, but not to deduct the surrendering and the [Inaudible.] funding. The intention is obviously to mislead the people of this province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on the subject of misleading, this Government and the governing party claims that the source of all woes is the SAA bailout. They claim the Provincial Government's conditional grants were cut by R86 million to finance the bailout, but in actual fact the Province received a net increase in conditional grants of R81 million, and the cuts they refer to are in reality a reprioritisation of spending.

While they complained about the National Government policy to rescue SAA, their own 2019 election manifesto proposes that SAA be placed into business rescue. This is actually what has led to the need to find R10,5 billion. Perhaps, hon Deputy Speaker, they do not understand business rescue, or it just sounded good in a manifesto. But, hon Deputy Speaker, they never deal with the Minister of Public Enterprises' claim that if SAA was liquidated, the South African fiscus would have to find R18 billion to cover debt that would immediately become due.

Hon Deputy Speaker, at a time where we need level heads, smart minds and honest brokers, we have a government flailing about and purposefully misleading the people of this province. They are simply not up to the task.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Herron, your time is up.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Can it be? Thank you, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP, when we look at the medium-term budget we cannot look at the budget in isolation. We must look at the foolishness of National Government to bail out SAA. I cannot agree that we are just looking

at the Western Cape. We must look at everything holistically.

It is our Albert Einstein who said, and I quote:

“Insanity is doing the same thing over and over again, expecting different results.”

We cannot keep on bailing out, bailing out and bailing out and expect a different result.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Minister said that the Province, and he spoke about the Premier’s address, is choosing to focus on jobs, safety and well-being.

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, if this is so, why is the Premier contemplating to have district lockdowns? I read in the media that the Premier is sitting with the Cabinet on Friday to discuss potential district lockdowns because of the resurgence of COVID-19. Was the purpose of the lockdown not to assist the health sector to prepare for COVID-19 cases? The Western Cape cannot afford, the country cannot afford another lockdown. Thousands and thousands of our people have lost their jobs; small businesses will be bankrupt even further and never ever recover. The unemployment queues are getting longer and longer. We cannot make people to rely on Government to assist, because Government has failed them and will fail them over and over again. The UIF and SASSA were a disaster. People were disappointed and disheartened by the services they receive.

Did the Premier and his Cabinet research internationally and learn from best practices? I would advise the Premier to do best practices internationally and come back with a different result.

The ANC in the Western Cape should assist this Province to speak to the national counterparts, because the ANC Western Cape cannot divorce themselves from their big brother, because their big brother is the cause that we are in a financial mess.

Hon Deputy Speaker, another thing that I want to address this afternoon is that why does the Province and Government not look at people who do not have food? A mere R50 million was given for food by this Province for people in the most vulnerable communities, but people of course they will get the virus because they do not even have food. Why do we not look at proactive measures ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... like promoting immune boosters and giving people sufficient food? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Christians.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] speak to that, not [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I recognise hon member Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I believe that big brother is watching some of us, but let me get into it.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I believe that by creating a safer South Africa, a safer Western Cape, we can ensure prosperity for all resident, but before I get into the Medium-term Adjustments for 2020, I want to bring to the attention of this House again that over the last 10 years policing resources at National grew by 11%, while resources in the Western Cape grew by a mere 4,8%. Over the same period, hon Deputy Speaker, the police to population ratio in the province stands at 2,5% for every 1,000 residents, and 3,3% for every 1,000 residents at a national level. This is way below the United Nations Policing Ratio Standards.

What I can further say, hon Deputy Speaker, is that policing resources in our province are 6 percentage points lower than the National Police to population ratio, but we all know that here in the Western Cape population growth stood at 30,1% over the last 10 years. Typically any person who relocates from a different province to the Western Cape do so because they are attracted to better opportunities in the labour force and by greater chances to improve their standard of living, but we have seen that the ANC Government has chosen to cut essential services to the public, like policing and the budget for the courts and the NPA, to fund another bailout for the South African Airways.

The ANC ultimately has bankrupted the State and broken the economy to such an extent that the safety of South African citizens is now at an increased risk.

Hon Deputy Speaker, crime thrives in a broken economy. This can further be seen in the second quarterly crime stats that was released by SAPS, that shows an alarming decrease of 46,5% in crime detected as a result of police action. Hon Deputy Speaker, we need action and we need action from SAPS as in yesteryear. This is as clear as it can be. The stats back it up. The Western Cape is indeed severely under-resourced by an incompetent National Government.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape has further recorded four of the top 10 police stations for contact crime; eight of the top 10 stations where the highest number of murders have been recorded; and seven of the top 10 for attempted murder in our country. †Die Nasionale Regering kan nie en moet nie die Wes-Kaap as 'n stief behandel nie. [The National Government cannot and should not treat the Western Cape as a stepson.] Hon Deputy Speaker, we all know that these stats are horrifying and it stifles socio and economic mobility in the country, and furthermore there is a desperate need to increase the SAPS budget.

This finds reality on the ground for residents who have come to accept criminal behaviour as the order of the day due to the inability by National Government to adequately resource the police service to stem the tide on

crime. This is clearly evident, hon Deputy Speaker, in the DoRA Bill, which shows no action.

The issues are further compounded by the fact that businesses in our province are repeatedly being targeted by criminals. We cannot, and I say we cannot have an environment where business lack assurances for safety for both themselves, their staff and customers. Cases of extortion have expanded beyond businesses here in the CBD to areas like Khayelitsha, Bloekombos, Gugulethu and Wallacedene, and, hon Deputy Speaker, should such criminal activities slide into lawlessness, economic growth and job creation will be further hampered. It is vital that the National Police Minister act to curb this scourge, as it is not only aimed at businesses, but also at the poorest of the poor.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the fiscal [Inaudible.] at National Government level would not be depleted had it not been for looting, maladministration, bad policy and a failure to really table an economic policy that works for the people and prioritise the needs for more resources to improve safety responses in our communities and it is rather a shame that we are in this state at this moment, because the ANC deemed it appropriate to cut the budget for SAPS in spite of the state of gang murders in our province and rural safety in other areas of our province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this has placed a severe strain on Provincial Treasury and therefore, without reservation, I welcome the increase in the budget to

the Department of Community Safety. Hon Deputy Speaker, the increase in this budget by the Department of Community Safety showcases that the priority of the residents is first and foremost. If I check and if I go through all the adjustments for this particular vote and the entire vote, the upward adjustment for the Department is clearly actioned. Further it is an additional R20 million to appoint young people as safety ambassadors to drive violence prevention interventions in the Western Cape. Seventy officers have already been deployed in the province, which assist in patrolling communities that are plagued with crime and to address anti-social behaviours.

We have also in this budget seen the deployment of 1,000 youth in the EPWP programme, as well as training and placing of 120 peace officers in six municipalities.

Furthermore, hon Deputy Speaker, this budget will fund 45 Neighbourhood Watches for their invaluable work because we all know that they are the ears and eyes for SAPS on the road, on the streets.

I further wish to especially welcome an additional R36,5 million to keep our children safe by accelerating the fencing of schools in the Western Cape. The increase, hon Deputy Speaker, in this budget will further allow for a new intake of the cohort into the Chrysalis Academy that has been proven to assist thousands of vulnerable young people year on year.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is further encouraging that these projects will not

only be confined to the Metro, but also be extended to the rural areas under the District Safety Plans. The reality is that millions of people residing in rural communities are under siege due to the violent and vicious crimes due to a failing police that is presided over by a failing ANC Government.

The ANC has ultimately lost the fight against crime and our rural areas are becoming war zones. Farmers and farmworkers are sitting ducks and the ANC simply ignores their plight. We have been on the record numerous times, calling for a police service that is well-resourced, well-trained and capable to fight all levels of crime in our communities, whether in the Metro or in rural area.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the upward adjustments highlighted some of the steps taken in the whole of society approach by the Provincial Government to boost the Safety Budget here in the Western Cape. To not only supplement crimefighting efforts, but also to improve the safety of learners, residents in various communities, business, organisations; each and every person in the Western Cape.

The Western Cape Government has proven capable to manage a decentralised police service, where the ANC has dismally failed. I also say further it understands the importance of a functional and honest police service.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is regrettable that the last attention received from the National Government was a promise regarding the deployment of the Army for the attacks on our transportation services, when what we need are more SAPS officers. We need to build trust in this constitutionally mandated service and the restoration of a professional and efficient police service.

Hon Deputy Speaker, earlier during a Budget Committee, we noted that the ANC expressed their view not to support the vote. In other words, the ANC expressed their view by going against creating a safer Western Cape. The ANC went against the budget that will further efforts to violence prevention and law enforcement. Furthermore, the ANC went against investing in the well-being of residents.

To put it even in a different way, the ANC is against good governance with actual results and rather for looting, maladministration and corruption.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as I close off, we have already seen significant strides made with the deployment of the LEAP officers in areas like Hanover Park and Delft. This budget aims to further efforts of violence prevention and law enforcement, and by investing in safety responses, we create and promote jobs, which in turn restore dignity.

A vote against the Second Adjustment Budget in the Western Cape is a vote against the residents of the Western Cape, and I would urge this House to

support this budget vote. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Allen. I now recognise hon member Peter Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Minister Meyer, you are a great supporter of Premier Winde's recipe for change speech. I heard you. The Premier wants to focus on three North Stars: Jobs, safety, wellbeing, but the Premier added this beauty. He says he wants to give it to everybody, no matter who they are or where they come from. Well, Premier and hon member Maynier, the people you are talking about you want to empower: Zimbabweans, Malawians, Nigerians. They are flocking every day over our borders. They walk through De Lille's R34 million fence to come here and squat and get houses before our people. They are the illegal immigrants.

The jobs the DA want to create go to them, it does not go to local blacks or local coloured people. The R39 million you want to spend on local small businesses are wasteful spending. It cannot compete against foreign cartels who have taken over Green Market Square, the Grand Parade, Adderley Street, Bellville Station, Elsie's River, and this is under DA control. Coloured people and local black entrepreneurs are being suffocated and

drugs are being sold illegal to our youth.

Stop, DA! Stop feeling sorry for the foreign people. Feel sorry for your own voters, for the coloured people, for the blacks, for the whites who voted for you. Start feeling sorry for them, because otherwise a *coup d'état* is staring South Africa in the face. We will have our own Arab Spring. Just look at Africa's record, look at the *coup d'états*. Ghana had five, Liberia had two, Mali had three, Mauritania had six, Niger four, Nigeria six. For 32 years Nigeria was under the army. Then Sierra Leone had five, Togo had two. Do not think it is impossible. We can have a *coup d'état* here too, where the army decides to take over.

Already we had some political parties' leaders saying the people must go and get the police in their own homes here. Get them in their own homes, Malema! We will see what happens. Who is going to be gotten in his own home. We are heading for disaster, we are heading for civil unrest and unless the DA and other parties realise that we need federal autonomy, we need to go back and give to the coloured community what was theirs before 1910. The Cape Colony, we want it back. That was the Missions Act of 1909. All those areas that were given to us in terms of a trust must be given back, and I am glad the National Minister agreed with me, and I have got a report from her saying it will be done. 1,3 million hectares of land will be given back to the coloured communities before March next year.

So, Minister Maynier, you can moan all you like as long as you do not

have ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... the power to implement your policies, it is all just a fairy tale, a fairy tale created by the DA. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member Marais. I now recognise hon Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, the Premier, never before has South Africa and the Western Cape Province faced such a bleak future.

We have been affected by the global pandemic of COVID-19, as well as an economic recession which has been in the making for the last few years.

Recently South Africa has been downgraded to Junk Status, which does not augur well for the Western Cape and its citizens, as we have had to absorb severe budget cuts as alluded to by Minister Maynier in his opening remarks.

The Department of Social Development too has had to absorb significant cuts in the face of humanitarian crises. These cuts will affect the most vulnerable members of society, including women, children, persons with

disabilities and the elderly, amongst others.

A recent United Nations report indicates that there will be a 40% spike in the number of people needing humanitarian aid globally. Hon Deputy Speaker, it is not just in South Africa, but many countries are reporting a surge in cases of domestic and sexual violence, also known as gender-based violence, as well as increased levels of violence against children.

It is in this regard that I have committed to working with various spheres of government, civil society organisations, our NPO and FPO partners, and any other grouping of active citizens that aim to provide support to victims of violence and abuse, or are fighting to end violence.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to inform this august House, especially the hon member Herron, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, and place on record the fact that the National Department of Public Works and Infrastructure finally signed the memorandum of understanding between the Provincial Departments of Social Development and Public Works, on 29 October 2020. This after being launched on 4 March and the hon member Herron calling me out for dragging my heels. So I trust this clarifies any confusion that the hon member Herron tried to create by misleading this House.

Now that the MOU has been signed by all the necessary stakeholders, DSD, with the support of its NPO partners, will ensure that the six shelters will be ready to start taking clients in hopefully by the first quarter of the new year.

We only received the official signover and keys at the beginning of the week, so we need to work swiftly to operationalise these shelters. At the same time our existing shelters continue to provide the much-needed support to victims of gender-based violence.

This development, hon members, reaffirms our commitment to providing victim empowerment support services to those who desperately need it, especially during the 16 days of no violence against women and children.

Hon Deputy Speaker, violence against women and children sees and knows no race, ethnicity, class or political affiliation. Just this morning I attended the launch of a 24-hour tollfree number by the National Women Shelter Movement, to assist the National GBV Command Centre in assisting women and children who are affected by gender-based violence.

Our Government's recovery plan, which focuses on safety, jobs and employment, as well as dignity and well-being, is crucial to mitigating the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape Government has remained steadfast in providing services to the residents of this province, particularly the most vulnerable. Sadly the ANC National Government continues to leave this Government and its people out on a limb.

We have experienced the most irrational and draconian regulations ever imposed on citizens in any country in the world.

- We were told what clothes we could and could not wear.
- The most vulnerable citizens experienced delays with the SASSA SRD payment of R350.
- The queues outside post offices, that never received the required funds to pay grants continues.
- Not forgetting the hot food debacle where it was recommended that SAPS should be delivering food.
- Stopping the payment of ECD subsidies during the first few months of lockdown in the eight ANC-run provinces, resulting in a damning court judgment against National DSD and the eight provinces.
- The failure to communicate with the ECD sector timeously, which virtually decimated the sector with women bearing the brunt of job losses.
- And now, hon Deputy Speaker, we are challenged with the migration of ECD Centres from Social Development to the Department of Basic Education by – guess when? – 1 April 2021. So once again the Western Cape Government has to be the voice of reason and caution against rushing into any migration without considering all aspects, as it could have many unintended consequences, which will affect the lives of our young children.

We welcome it that an additional R53 million has been made available in the form of an Early Childhood Development Conditional Grant. Sadly it is almost too little too late, as it is the same ANC National Government that

almost decimated the entire ECD sector in South Africa, by its inability to lead decisively after Level 5 and 4.

An additional R51,281,000 has been received for food relief funding in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. This too though comes too little too late as these allocations, in my opinion, constitutes fiscal dumping. It places provinces under huge pressure to ensure that funding is utilised before the end of the financial year, which is 31 March 2021.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it would be remiss of me if I did not comment on the rampant looting, corruption and plundering of the public purse which continues unabated. I would like to request the ANC Opposition members especially, to add their voices to the call for an end to corruption, which is taking place across this country. The bailing out of SOEs like SAA and many others, impacts all citizens negatively across South Africa. We have chicken and beef in the sky, whilst the most vulnerable wait on the next plate of soup or *pap*. It is shameful, immoral and scandalous that a government can prioritise money for a blackhole SAA SOE at the cost of its citizens, who are living in abject poverty and do not know where there next plate of food is coming from.

We could do so much more if taxpayers' money was used for its intended purpose. More ECDs could be supported, as many continue to struggle with obtaining the necessary financial resources to meet all COVID-19 health and safety protocols with regards to reopening more feeding schemes, and

soup kitchens could be supported. We could have established more shelters for abused women and children; more facilities for older and disabled persons. We could have established more substance abuse treatment centres, which continue to be in demand as the use of drugs surges with crime on the increase.

We could have built more schools, hospitals, hired more social workers, doctors and nurses, and employed more SAPS officials, and the list continues.

Hon Deputy Speaker, Minister Maynier has indeed provided a sound and clear financial plan. A recovery plan whilst managing the COVID-19 resurgence challenge is really a difficult task to manage.

So I wish to call on all spheres of society and all members of the Opposition, to join us in rebuilding our economy whilst keeping our citizens safe and building a province in which each ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... resident is granted the opportunity to live a dignified life. We have made great strides. However, the needs and demands placed on our departments, especially ...[Interjections]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... in light of the severe budget cuts, will impact our collective efforts ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Marais – Minister Fernandez, your time is up.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, members of the House, fellow citizens. Let me join many in raising our voice in this Parliament regarding the long road we have traversed as a nation in the fight against the scourge of HIV and AIDS. We take our hats off to many men and women who continue to show their unwavering commitment in the health sector to carry the nation's health.

We must also recognise the period of 16 days of activism against violence on children, women and bow our heads in sorrow for victims of GBV in our province and communities.

We must further raise concern on the resurgence of COVID-19 in our province, and once again the same hotspot areas of the Cape Flats. What happened to the hotspot strategy and the budget allocated to it? Around May 2020, almost R1,15 billion was reported by Provincial Treasury to have been contributed to the hotspot strategy. Where is value for money?

I rise today, hon Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the African National Congress to reject this Medium-term Budget Policy Statement as announced by the hon member Maynier last week in this House. Whilst we are conscious of the state of global and national economy and while we are mindful of the drop in revenue in the national fiscus, we cannot support an MTBPS which continues to prioritise the privileged over the poor, and this under the banner of dignity and hope.

Hon members, let us be reminded that the political season is upon us and so this degradation of political conversation, using sound bites, is part of the propaganda and posturing to sow confusion amongst voters and avert them from the real injustice of human conditions in this province represented by the blue train detachment.

The Premier postures about dignity in framing his speech a month ago in this

House and the MEC follows suit without explaining to us what is meant by “dignity”? What are its elements, for who, and how will we measure such dignity of the Western Cape citizens if it is realised. We know, sitting on this side of the bench, that such term is not neutral and the blue train has clearly chosen what dignity means for the different categories of citizens of this province.

Nelson Mandela said:

“Overcoming poverty is not a gesture of charity, it is an act of justice, it is the protection of a fundamental human right, the right to dignity and a decent life.”

We implore the Western Cape Government to deal with inequality in this province as a sign of their political will on the right of dignity of its citizens. We call for economic dignity as explained by Gene Sperling, a US economic advisor in the Obama administration. That such should measure the cumulative impact of the economy and economic policy to human well-being. Such will help us direct our financial resources where most of our vulnerable citizens are, with a deliberate intention to alleviate their misery.

One myth this DA Government continues to feed is through its policy tribalism about idealised assumptions, about private sector led growth and job creation. Should the proof not be in the pudding or eating, as to date the market failure is evidence to structural deficiencies and uncompetitive

behaviour. Go and check and the Competition Commission market enquiry that relates in particular to some of the sectors of the economy in our province, has proven how they undercut economic dignity.

So how does the Premier and his MEC pin their hopes at faith in such, whilst evidence is looking them in the eye. Unless they could not care about such, that the song of dignity is just a farce.

It cannot be and it is not obvious that a job results in dignity. The reason the International Labour Organisation has for years called for decent jobs as such equals human dignity, and we await the MEC to actually answer the question from hon member Dugmore, if indeed R1,800 is something that he can live on, including the Premier.

“Without deviations from the norm, progress is not possible.”

This is a quote by Frank Zappa.

The Premier told us about 20,000 new jobs to be created through rapid interventions he set. No mention is made of this or where these jobs will be created by the MEC.

We heard from the Premier of 26 private sector investments which will create over 3,000 jobs, pump R30 billion into the economy and investment in property and construction sectors, logistics, health, and investment in

Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone and Atlantis. No details of how any of these will be achieved, especially since these jobs are reliant on an external stakeholder as a player – that is the private sector – where no clear accountability of such is explained. Maybe we should have called for the private sector to come and present to us and tell us about these jobs as per their own business plans and budgets if indeed such is feasible, before such claim is made by a party that is not even responsible for creating such jobs.

If dignity of our citizens through jobs is placed in the hands of the markets, then surely we have a bigger problem in our hands. Recently in Mossel Bay and George, from our recent Standing Committee oversight visit, we listened to business chambers accepting a preference of employing foreign nationals than locals, based on some untested perceptions they hold. Worse, this has seen illegal immigrants being used mainly in the infrastructure and construction projects, given their bargaining power which is weak and non-existent at most.

So cases of abuse and predatory practices are evident in these situations in the name of providing jobs. As such no dignity is realised in that relationship. Instead humiliation and domination as workers are expected to accept employment on whatever terms the employer dictates. This is true for big corporates where bullying is experienced, in particular in the same space where big contractors ignore national policies of local beneficiation, local participation in some cases, and pay emerging and local contractors less than the stipulated rates.

The announcement on SMMEs and the basic maintenance and repair of infrastructure at our schools is an achievement after repeated calls to this Provincial Government. We must commend this work of the Opposition in this House. Our ANC caucus and in particular the unrelenting hon member Khalid Sayed that has put pressure on WCED to prioritise the safety of our learners and educators, especially in the poorer parts of our province. We must call on Provincial Treasury to focus on harnessing capacity in the supply chain management to ensure increased fairness in procurement, to open up these economic opportunities to not only big business, but also local enterprises around those schools.

In the R39 million to SMMEs, can the MEC tell this House about impact of the first R27 million in the First Adjustment and how SMMEs in real terms were assisted and how much of this money went to ancillary costs? Again, the funding to the wine industry is important to this sector in view of the recent protests by black-owned brands calling for transformation of the wine sector. We ask hon MEC what happened to some of the announcements made by the Premier, like the Infrastructure Agency, that in your speech is now couched as an exploration of new institutional mechanisms and forms of financing. Are we again made to sign a blank cheque of exploratory work similar to the Premier's Safety Plan, without plans and clarity on where the public funds would be spent on?

You have also gone silent on any budget for the grand plans you had been

raising in the public on municipalities in good financial positions to pursue alternative energy.

Lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, we must be concerned that the Premier's recovery plan and this Adjustment Budget shows no real intent by this Government to deal with income inequality that is prevalent in the province. This is a battle that we shall never back down on and are already being joined by many voters as shown in the DA losses of by-election in this province.

So this idealised assumption of a job and dignity in it, is superficial and mischievous, as the DA project of one South Africa crumbles conference by conference as white supremacy clutches at straws to keep it together. We must ask in this House where is the Speaker of this House? Maybe the sayings in the media are true, that he may feel unsafe in the presence of the Leader of Business. So we need answers in this regard.

As you complain and whine, the ANC-led Government under President Cyril Ramaphosa must implement the National Economic Recovery Plan to deal with structural issues of the SA economy towards rebuilding an economy different from yesterday, one that is inclusive to all, one that guarantees economic dignity for all. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Nkondlo. I now recognise hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you for the members of the House for the contribution to this debate, and thank you for those that were present today [Inaudible.] contributed to this very important [Inaudible.] debate.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on this World AIDS Day we recognise and hold hands with everyone that battles with this terrible disease and will work hand-in-hand with Government eradicate this disease.

We thank the Western Cape Government under the leadership of Premier Winde and Dr NomaFrench that consistently works in destigmatising this disease in our community.

We also want to thank everyone Government and Parliament as well, that continuously work to combat violence against women, including [Inaudible.] activism, and thank the Western Cape Government for running their programmes 360 days a year to ensure our women and children are safe.

Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to hon member Dugmore. Our [Inaudible.] against [Inaudible.] successful HIV/AIDS Policy Managing Act. History [Inaudible.]

I would like to remind the hon member [Inaudible.] was the ANC his [Inaudible.] that led a campaign, the HIV/AIDS denialism for HIV/AIDS [Inaudible.] been a member of good standing for many years. Those lives are

lost and the last one that [Inaudible.] I think it was 300,000 lives lost and remember this ANC [Inaudible.] humanitarian [Inaudible.] hon member Dugmore was a member for [Inaudible.] because the truth does hurt.

The [Inaudible.] lack of a [Inaudible.] agenda from the National Government, and this is a stark contrast to the Western Cape Government, which is a real meaningful plan for HIV [Inaudible.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the hon member Dugmore was in the committee when the Western Cape [Inaudible.] recovery plan was tabled. He has been party to many of these committees [Inaudible.] hon member Herron was not even present, but he has got strong opinions, but we all know washing line opinions do not hold.

Our plan represented by the Western Cape Government get people to work and their lives set on a course to dignity. We enable people to their full potential. We do not create dependency on the [Inaudible.] but at the same time we maintain a vibrant safety net for those who need, for example our support to the wine sector, which employs a tremendous number [Inaudible.] as well as our [Inaudible.] which [Inaudible.] of the lockdown was the only one to continue despite Basic Education seeking to stop the Western Cape Government from feeding our children. In fact, hon member Nkondlo, thank you [Inaudible.] to Minister Schäfer. It is pity that you now accept credit for the Western Cape Government's work, but it is great to see that you are acknowledging our work is getting done, despite the fact [Inaudible.] but

thank for that nonetheless.

And hon member Dugmore, *in absentia*, I know you can listen to the recording, let me remind you again of what Premier Winde said, and I quote:

“The Western Cape Government’s budget over the medium-term are likely to be cut by the same amount or more that is now going to be funnelled into the black hole, which is SAA. Let me be crystal clear, over R10 billion is going to be taken out of the mouths of the poor to pay for our failed State airline.”

This is where this R10 billion comes from. The Premier did not say the Western Cape Budget will be reduced by R10 billion, hon Deputy Speaker.

Ultimately the Western Cape is able to achieve with what we have and what we will do, because we have exercised sound fiscal management over many years, unlike the ANC which is bailing SOEs as a direct opportunity cost for service delivery and lifelines year after year.

This is exasperated by the consistent bloated Cabinet, enlarged Government structures for cadre deployment and widespread corruption and wasteful expenditure, revealing a distinct lack of principled governance by the ANC.

Hon member Dugmore, via you, hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC, by taking – thank you for coming back, hon member Dugmore, I will be softer. The ANC,

by taking away billions from the poor, it is the only party that insults the dignity of the poor. How do you take away money from Health, the police, Education – from the poor – to give to the select few that can afford to fly? That is an insult to dignity, hon member Dugmore, that is an insult to millions of people that are supposed to travel by train, which by the way, hon member Dugmore, the Mitchells Plain line is still closed. The Central Line is still closed. People cannot get to work because of mismanagement by the ANC, and if anything, hon Deputy Speaker, if the ANC really wanted to sort out transport in this country, that R10 billion would have been much better spent on PRASA and fixing the Cape Flats' line, as opposed to serving chicken and beef in the air.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA does care, hence the DA is the only party that is now taking this funding matter to court, and well done, Minister Maynier, the only Province that bothers to take this seriously, and on that matter, hon Deputy Speaker, I was debating on the NCOP and hon member Maynier, I was so embarrassed, and in fact I should be celebrating, but I was embarrassed, the Limpopo and the Free State did not even bother to meet, to give an opinion on this Division of Revenue Bill.

Billions are being taken from their provinces and they did not have the decency to give an opinion on what the impact on their provinces should be.

So when we talk good governance, hon Deputy Speaker, even the members of the ANC, some members of this House, come to the budget meetings, give an

opinion, even if they disagree. The two provinces who are battling at the moment, battling, did not even bother to have a meeting, and when I raise it, Minister Tito Mboweni just lowered his head, and it is there for everyone to see on You Tube. That is the terrible state the ANC is in, and that is the state they put the country in.

So if hon member Dugmore is serious about dignity, he would phone up his colleagues and say, “Comrades, †*hoekom dan man?* [Why then, man?] Go to the meeting, have an opinion.” That is how you restore dignity, hon member Dugmore, by holding your colleagues to account for their terrible behaviour, by not having a budget meeting, one of the most important committees of Parliament that determines the future of funding in your province, and during a pandemic. They did not even bother to pitch. Is that not disgraceful [Interjections.] That is disgraceful, hon member Dugmore, and that is taking dignity from the poor.

It is the ANC in those provinces that strips the dignity, it is the ANC in this province by not supporting this budget vote for the poor, this good budget vote, they are stripping the poor from their dignity [Interjections.]. The ANC discontent for the poor, and consistently in their behaviour by voting against all these budgets. That is contempt for the poor. Even poor people [Inaudible.], hon member Dugmore, it is not the only solution to dignity.

It is quite sad that the National Government thinks that public sector jobs are going to get this country out of our economy, unfortunately I have got words

for President Ramaphosa: It is not going to happen. Change your policies, change your policy. Consistent policy, not giving billions to ailing black hole enterprises like SAA, and taking money from the poor, like the police, Health and Education. That is what is going to help this economy, not throwing R10 billion down the drain, creating temporary jobs and expecting the economy to somehow recover it. That is not what is going to do it.

The policy of keeping SAA, the policy of bailing out SAA to the tune of R40 billion over many years, the policy of cadre deployment. These are policies that keep the poor people poor, and that is the problem.

Hon member Xego, the Safety Plan has already been implemented. The officers are on the scene and already deployed to communities. You see, hon member Xego, with these – via you, hon Deputy Speaker - having taken place, we already see a decline in some of these community.

And talking about COVID-19 infections which were mentioned, hon member Xego, I would remind you it was your party, the EFF, that went to Brackenfell without masks. It was your party that toyi-toyed without masks, spreading the virus in this community, you, hon member Xego, should actually take responsibility for that, because the spreading of the virus is by those not wearing a mask in close distance with each other, no social distancing, and that is what you should actually apologise for to the House, because that is what your party has done. That is on you.

Hon member Herron, thank you for your contribution. I would like to remind hon member Herron of a term called “economic opportunity cost”, which I am sure he is familiar with. It is rather to spend money on housing, health and those safety needs, and innovation opportunities that create jobs, and giving it to SAA, as you know, it is a big opportunity lost. So why is hon member Herron defending the SAA bailout? That is what I am asking myself when I am sitting here. Why is it so important for him, for the Good/ANC alliance, to stay intact? Are there Cabinet compositions that must be considered? We know that his political mother needs to stay there for their party to survive.

You see, hon Deputy Speaker, it is worth noting that hon member Herron did not even attend the Budget meeting thus far – I cannot remember seeing his face in the Budget meeting. How do you inform a view not attending such an important meeting where billions are being discussed?

You see, the problem with the ANC/Good washing line alliance is that it never will stay, because washing lines dissipate.

You see, hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape has been great in managing this budget process, and thank you, Minister Maynier, for doing what you can with the little you have been given. Despite the fact that they dealt you a very bad hand, somehow you still find a miracle, and I think the spekboom that you brought here last year, that it is still growing inside this Parliament, and that is what consistently shows why we are the best government in this country.

Moving forward, hon Deputy Speaker, I would honestly ask our members to stay safe, wear a mask, and, hon member Xego, please do not organise rallies where people do not wear a mask, no social distancing, and you spread the virus.

And, hon member Nkondlo – lastly on hon member Nkondlo – it is not the propaganda that brought us here, it is not the lack of income that brought us here, it is not the economy that brought us here, it is the ANC that brought us here. It is the ANC’s bad policies that brought us here, and when you quote Nelson Mandela, frankly Nelson Mandela was ahead of his time, and I think with all his quotes, if you read it properly, he is directing it to the ANC. Stop stealing, stop maladministration, stop implementing bad policies, look after the people, give the people hope, but that is not what your party is doing, hon member Nkondlo. We are the party of process ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, please.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... and principles, and that is what we will consistently do where we govern this province ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Your time is up.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... and we will do so well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Please stay safe, wear a mask and adhere to safety regulations. I thank you.

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor! [Applous.]

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... hon member. I now recognise hon Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: [Inaudible.]

So I would like [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Deputy, hon Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order?

An HON MEMBER: Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you can just take your seat, there

is a point of order. I recognise the hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It seems the hon Minister of Finance does not have his microphone on.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much for alerting me. I will ask him to start again, thank you.

Mr B N HERRON: Yes, start again, please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

I began by thanking the hon member Ricardo Mackenzie for his spirited and robust response [Interjections.] to the debate, and then I went on to say that I would nevertheless like to take this opportunity to respond particularly to the Leader of the Opposition, the hon member Cameron Dugmore, but also to some other members who participated in the debate.

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, on National Conditional Grants. The hon Leader of the Opposition makes a remarkable statement and says I was silent on the matter. Well, let me quote from my speech during the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement, where I said, and I am not quoting myself:

“We have also received ...”

Wait for it:

“... welcome National Government funding to support jobs, safety and well-being in the Western Cape.”

Evidence, I would suggest, hon member Mackenzie, that the Leader of the Opposition was once again listening with his mouth, but not his ears.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on the whole question of alignment with National Policy. Again the Leader of the Opposition makes a remarkable statement and says that we are not aligned with National Government, particularly the evidence is on infrastructure.

Well, hon members, I am sure you recall Premier Alan Winde’s special address, and I quote – this is the Premier – on the whole question of infrastructure, where the Leader of the Opposition suggests that we are not aligned, he says:

“As I have explained earlier, we have made the bold decision to invest heavily in infrastructure in the Western Cape in order to achieve our jobs priorities.”

And he goes on to say:

“And so we have therefore taken a decision to explore for the

first time in the history of this province the possibility of borrowing money from financial institutions to specifically invest in infrastructure that will enhance economic growth and job creation.”

Moreover, moreover the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement contains a detailed, a detailed statement on page 41 and page 42, setting out our new, ambitious agenda on infrastructure, and yet the Leader of the Opposition, the hon member Cameron Dugmore, says that we are not aligned. Yet again he must have been listening with his mouth, not his ears.

We have also, as he knows, invested a R155,4 million in the maintenance and repair of infrastructure, including infrastructure at schools, in order to support small business, which I thought that the hon member Brett Herron would have supported as we shift spending from where we could, where we can spend, to where we could not spend, because of lockdown regulations, in a way that support small businesses, supports and saves jobs and of course invests in existing infrastructure assets in the Western Cape. But no.

On the whole question of economic inclusion, the hon Leader of the Opposition, Cameron Dugmore, says that our plan is fatally flawed – but he completely of course misses the fact that the R8,5 million allocated to the wine industry is allocated specifically to support 38 black-owned businesses and support 240 jobs.

But talking, hon Deputy Speaker, about silence. The Leader of the Opposition said nothing, said nothing about the fact that we are cutting the Title Deeds Restoration Grant, which does in fact transfer ownership to people without land. He said nothing about the fact that we are cutting that grant by R23,2 million to support the bailout of SAA. What did we hear from the Leader of the Opposition? Nothing, silence.

The Leader of the Opposition also has nothing to say about the fact that we are cutting a million Rand from the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Grant to support black farmers. What did we hear from the hon member Cameron Dugmore? Nothing, silence.

On the whole question of implementation. The Leader of the Opposition says there is no implementation plan. Well, I would like to tell the Leader of the Opposition this is not National Government. The plan is not the project. We are already implementing the plan.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is it?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: [Interjections.] And had the Leader of the Opposition been listening with his ears and not his mouth [Interjections.], he would know that we are already supporting small business, 230 small businesses [Interjections.] through the COVID-19 Support Fund, which is set out on page 337 to page 385 of the Budget books [Interjections.]

Which brings me to the Leader of the Opposition's final statement, which is about support for the poor. Well, for the entire week, hon Deputy Speaker, the hon Leader of the Opposition, Cameron Dugmore, has been huffing and puffing about what Premier Alan Winde allegedly said about SAA. Well, the truth is, the real truth is and the real test is not what Premier Alan Winde said about SAA, the real question is what the hon Leader of the Opposition, Cameron Dugmore, is doing about the SAA, and the answer, we all know, is nothing, silence, nothing, which ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is in business rescue.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...which [Interjections.], which we all know is wrong [Interjections.]. He knows it is, wrong, I know it is wrong and he knows that I know it is wrong [Interjections.]. It is simply an inditement. It is not just a political wrong, it is not just a failure of politics, but is in fact immoral to bail out a failing national zombie State-owned airline like South African Airways and cut spending to the poor, especially the poor in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much [Applause.], hon Minister Maynier. That brings us to the end of our speakers. That concludes the debate on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the Principle of the Bill?

An HON MEMBER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection?

An HON MEMBER: No objection.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, no objection.

An HON MEMBER: There is an objection here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, you are objecting?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Fine, we will then move on. Just a second.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I would have been disappointed if he did not. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections] Right, I have to announce there are currently 36 members, hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorum. Hon member Dugmore, I see that smile on your face, but that does mean that we then have to vote.

Those in favour – the House, the question put before the House is that the Principle of the Bill be approved. Those in favour of the question put before the House, please say “yes”.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Yeeessss!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the question put before the House ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... please say “no”.

An HON MEMBER: No!

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: I counted two of them.

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the aye's have it quite clearly. The question is approved.

An HON MEMBER: Obviously.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much.

I will now ask the Secretary – give me a second – to read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, the House will deal with the separate votes from now onwards. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on COVID-19 on its Oversight and Public Participation Activities undertaken during the period 14 April to 24 November 2020.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. I recognise the hon member Wenger.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. The Ad Hoc Committee on COVID-19 was established to conduct oversight over the Executive in its management of the Corona virus pandemic. Today we have returned to this House to discuss the work done by this Parliamentary Committee over the last eight months.

On 31 December 2019, the World Health Organization became aware of a viral pneumonia in Wuhan in the People's Republic of China. This disease is

now globally known as COVID-19. The vast majority of people who have contracted this Corona virus have recovered. A small number are experiencing lingering symptoms called “long” COVID-19 and many have tragically passed away from this Corona virus.

At the outset we remember every person whose life has been taken by this disease and those that are suffering its aftermath, which has changed our world and impacted every household across the world. As of today, globally, there have been 63,5 million confirmed cases, 1,5 million deaths and 44 million recoveries.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on Thursday 5 March 2020 the National Institute for Communicable Diseases confirmed the first COVID-19 case in South Africa. Ten days later South Africa was in a declared state of disaster. A few days after the first case was announced on 11 March 2020, the National Minister of Health Zweli Mkhize, announced that the first laboratory confirmed case of COVID-19 in the Western Cape. On the same day the WHO declared the COVID-19 outbreak as a global pandemic. On 15 March 2020 President Cyril Ramaphosa declared a national state of disaster to integrate and coordinate disaster management mechanisms to prevent and reduce the outbreak of COVID-19 and on 23 March announced that South Africa would be placed under a nationwide hard lockdown.

This Level 5 Lockdown was in place between 26 March and 30 April. We all remember those difficult days of lockdown where South Africans were

legally bound to stay at home. Our borders were closed but our governments were open and working hard to beat the clock on getting health systems ready for what was to come.

Two weeks into this unprecedented hard lockdown the Provincial Parliament was already at work. The pandemic and the nationwide lockdown proved to be a moment for us at the WCPP to step up and go virtual, setting new standards and leading the way in embracing technology with innovation and creativity.

On 14 April, the Speaker of this House constituted the first Oversight Committee in South Africa to monitor, receive briefings and engage Government representatives on their response to the COVID-19 pandemic. Thus the COVID-19 Ad Hoc Committee was born and continues to meet regularly as a recognised constituted committee of the Provincial Legislature.

The Committee consisting of 15 members appointed on a proportional basis represent six out of seven political parties represented in this Parliament. The Committee's first order of business was to devise 12 themes to centre our work around, enabling us to concentrate on the areas impacting the lives of our residents.

1. Health responses and preparations.
2. Policing, security, and police brutality.
3. Food security.

4. Protection of the vulnerable.
5. Disaster management and local government oversight.
6. Economic recovery, support, and livelihoods.
7. Transport and infrastructure.
8. Schooling and Education.
9. Human settlements.
10. Citizen surveillance.
11. Intergovernmental relations and community cooperation.
12. Government finance and budgets.

This structured approach has given the Committee the necessary teeth to really unpack the impact of COVID-19 on the Western Cape, inviting and questioning some of the most important national and provincial departments entities and role player.

The Executive and top management of the Western Cape Government came week after week to brief the Committee and provided weekly reports so that as public representatives we were able to scrutinise the work of the Government and ask some of the most pertinent questions. This mechanism continues to enable members to report back to their constituents across the length and breadth of our province. In this way we truly live out the mandate to be a people's Parliament.

We looked into everything from provincial oxygen supplies to bereavement counselling, to the informal economy. We checked that we had sufficient

food supply from farms during the lockdown and why the price of eggs increased, to feeding schemes for children, the closure of ECD centres, the reopening of schools, the transport of healthcare workers and the provision of PPE for nurses.

We took on SASSA and the UIF for closed offices and the police for heavy-handedness and we learnt about how long COVID-19 can survive on different surfaces and how the lockdown has reduced pollution levels. We were informed of the tens of thousands of daily calls to the provincial call centre and the backlog of queries from a concerned and confused citizenry.

We looked into livelihoods and economic recovery, disaster management and if our phones were being monitored for track and trace. We interrogated testing, hospital bed numbers and food parcels. We saw the building, the use and closure of the CTICC Hospital of Hope and we interrogated budgets and how much all of this was costing. Three state of the art field hospitals were built, recognised by leading epidemiologists as success stories of effective leadership. We witnessed the Western Cape Government living out its value of innovation even in the midst of a crisis such as the diabetic project, run by the Western Cape Department of Health. This groundbreaking project reduced the mortality rate amongst diabetics from 28% to just 4.5%.

In addition, the Western Cape Government in conjunction with the City of Cape Town and other partners has developed systems to monitor COVID-19 outbreaks through screening waste water. Deputy Speaker, using Microsoft

Teams the Committee was open and accessible to all. The public, the media and other interested stakeholders had been able to access virtual sittings of the Ad Hoc Committee online and live stream on YouTube.

Times are changing and the WCPP has stepped forward to join ranks as a world leader in virtual Parliament, but Deputy Speaker, we did not just hear from Government. No. We listened to the citizens of this province and we spoke to survivors of COVID-19 and their experiences of stigma and their care in the healthcare system. We heard from NGO's in the private sector to understand people's lived experiences, their frustrations, their fears and their hopes.

We asked members of the public to tell us what they thought of Government's response. 17 000 people responded. As the Constitution of the Republic and the Western Cape ask of us, the Provincial Parliament facilitated public participation in the activities of this committee. We embarked upon a three-pronged public participation programme between 22 July and 14 October. The first public participation process was through a series of citizen engagements in the Committee, based on the themes that we had agreed upon at the outset.

The citizen engagement programme sought to include discussions with various stakeholders outside of Government so that we could engage with the private sector and civil society organisations to gain a broader understanding of the subject matter. We heard from the private hospital groups, hospital

facility boards, NGO organisations assisting the elderly and care homes and the association for persons with disabilities.

We heard from the independent schools associations and school governing bodies, from unions with various chambers of commerce, trade organisations, Vinpro and Agri Western Cape. Second, we made a call for submissions from the public on their view of Government's responses during the pandemic. This process was rolled out via a series of questions published on social media through info graphics and adverts published in mainstream newspapers and community media.

Interested stakeholders were encouraged to submit their comments via an email address or on WhatsApp voice notes and messages and the third stage of the public participation process was the public hearing held with civil society organisations and members of the public who addressed us and described their experience and how COVID-19 has affected their lives and those of the stakeholders they represent.

We found an overwhelming support for the wearing of masks, including some comments that those who are caught not wearing masks, should face prosecution. We were told of long cues for SASSA grants and no social distancing in cues. The SASSA call centre did not answer calls. Allegations were made of UIF and TERS not being paid over to employees by employers. Concerns were raised around the fact that sanitisers were not always available on public transport, including the use of questionable sanitizing

products.

Many inputs received thought it unfair that taxis could operate at 100% while there were still restrictions on other gatherings and family visits. Stakeholders raised concern around the fact that school fees had to be paid while children were home-schooling. Some stakeholders noted that the distribution of PPE at schools were satisfactory and the majority of schools conformed to requirements of temperature checks, social distancing and the wearing of masks.

Stakeholders indicated their disappointment that parents were left without support for their childcare needs as ECD centres remained closed during the pandemic. Many concerns were also raised about the availability of food support and as a prominent finding throughout this engagement there were many, many comments about the disaster management regulations which were seen as punitive, confusing or contradictory and creating hardship. The Western Cape Government however received accolades for the swiftness within which the healthcare facilities were upgraded in response to the pandemic. As the Chairperson of this committee, I tried my utmost to follow the principles of impartiality and fairness and to open up spaces for Opposition parties. I would like to thank my colleagues on this committee from both sides of the benches for their robust participation in this oversight undertaking and for the mostly cordial manner in which we worked together.

I am sure I speak on behalf of all members, by giving thanks to the

procedural officers, Mr Waseem Matthews for the first quarter and Ms Zaida Adams and senior procedural officer Ms Lizette Cloete for the full duration for their outstanding efforts and hard work. We thank you. We express our deepest gratitude toward the thousands of healthcare workers, doctors, nurses, and Government officials and civil society members that worked and continued to work to hard to ensure our survival. And thank you to the Premier and the Provincial Cabinet for steering us through these troubled waters.

Deputy Speaker, we are well aware that COVID-19 will be with us globally for a while still. At the same time we are cognisant of our role to play as parliamentarians with a duty to oversee the work of Government especially at a pivotal moment in history as this is a concerted effort which requires a deep commitment to the values of constitutional democracy.

It requires a willingness to become creative through technology and wisely use the resources we have at hand to demonstrate transparency to our residents. Our work as Parliament in response to COVID-19 is by no means done. And so we continue diligently in the public interest by tabling this report. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. I now recognise hon Windvogel. Is it – hon Windvogel have you heard me? Yes.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Good afternoon Deputy Speaker, Premier, Leader of the Official Opposition and hon members. Speaker, far too little and way too late. This is the general feeling one gets reading this report. As a report had been superseded by the present upsurge of the killer pandemic that attacks us in the Western Cape through the back door, and the front gate, at the same time.

The tragedy is that more people are dying daily and falling ill at an alarming rate, while the Corona virus blooms up dangerously and the report was written under the impression that COVID-19 figures were decreasing. The report reflects on the Province 2:13:16 [Inaudible.] the emergency equipment and packing away the field hospitals.

Deputy Speaker, and then even before this report is discussed the complacent Provincial Government is sent back to the drawing board with COVID-19 hitting us again. Both the Southern Cape and Cape Town Metro are daily suffering serious mortalities. These are now hotspots again. Everything must be taken out of storage again. Feedback is that the public facilities in the Southern Cape, the province's second most populated area, cannot deal with the upwelling and private hospitals, also cannot handle the growing numbers. Patients die daily and healthcare workers are also under attack.

Even doctors fell ill. In these dire times Speaker, this report comes out painting a much rosier picture than life's reality. In fact, the report belies the truth. The Province let its guard down. That is the reality. Deputy Speaker, the field hospitals and emergency equipment need to be unpacked as soon as possible. The report romanticises the renegade theory of herd immunity, while this is discredited worldwide.

In fact, the force and speed of the upsurge, disproves the theory and those who put high hopes on it to find a quick solution to the unknown virus. Another gap in the report is looking at the so-called "second wave infections" and re-referencing Europe. Eurocentric [Inaudible.] is notable while AC and other areas around the globe, even suffer a third wave.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in fact, some readers' remarks that the sanitised final report reflects mostly the DA's position and sympathise more than anything else. The ANC will work to assist in this war against the unknown where we build a ship while sailing it against the tempest. We need to plead with all residents to help to push this disease back. We have done so before. The ANC pleads with all to avoid crowded situations, to limit infections. Wash your hands and sanitise your hands regularly. Wear masks for protection. Observe healthy distance from others and avoid unnecessary contact in general. Refrain from travel and the drinking places or face harder lockdown. Let us all do this for our own sake and all those around us that we care about.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we cannot accept the report as it is and what it stands for. We will abstain from supporting it. The Committee has its work cut out for it, to deal with the upsurge, conduct more critical oversight and hold the Executive to strict account. We do not need more sweetheart approaches. People are dying and they rely on us to also tighten measures on our side to help fight this battle. Deputy Speaker, we cannot let them down. We are elected to serve them and especially the poor and vulnerable. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon member. I now recognise the hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Greetings to the Premier and all people observed. When a first case of COVID-19 pandemic was reported in the Western Cape, the first prevention mechanism should have been to quickly address the issue of people who lived in congested informal settlements. This is so, due to the fact that the Corona virus spreads through small droplets, especially when people are in close proximity of each other.

So this meant that people who lived in small, congested spaces would have a high risk of contracting the Corona virus. However, it is shocking that out of the 500 informal settlements that were identified by Government in the Western Cape, only three were chosen for dedensification purposes. That is Dunoon, Cossova and Khayelitsha.

Furthermore, even with these three chosen informal settlements, no real work has been done for purposes of dedensification in any of them. Instead of providing people in these areas with an open space of land and houses we saw the DA-led Western Cape Government cutting the budget intended for the provision of housing by more than R200 million. With this kind of gross negligence by the Government that claims to have people's interests at heart, and respect for their dignity, it comes as no surprise that Khayelitsha and the Klipfontein sub-districts recorded the highest number of COVID-19 related deaths in the province. The Government long neglected these areas. Processes of informal settlement in these areas were now concerned on how they can best safeguard the spread of the Corona virus amongst the white people who reside in the leafy suburbs.

It is for those reasons that the very same DA Government pushed for the quick easing of lockdown restrictions and the opening of businesses as their white friends from Stellenbosch were now losing profits. It is equally disappointing that this report is quiet on the issue of illegal evictions that were carried out by the DA Government during lockdown.

Deputy Speaker, the COVID-19 food relief packages which were intended for the poorest of the poor, were utilised by the DA ward councillors and Executive Mayor for political ends and patronage. These food packages were delivered to those who do not need them, as a thank you token for having voted for the DA in power. In those areas that the DA did not receive over one vote, those poor people were denied these food relief packages as a

punishment.

Hon Deputy Speaker, with regards to safety, the South African Police Services and the law enforcement was not only inefficient, but useless. The fact that crime statistics were low during hard lockdown cannot be attributed to the work of the police but rather to the citizens' discipline, as they listened to the call by the President to remain indoors. The police were hardly visible, especially in townships even with the aid of the South African military. To this day Deputy Speaker, they continue to remain invisible in townships such as Khayelitsha where criminals are roaming the streets, holding communities ransom by demanding the so-called protection fees.

When police are called to respond to crime in townships, they respond by either saying they are short staffed, or they do not have enough vehicles or resources. However, they are called to protect a racist school in Brackenfell. They descended in high numbers and all of a sudden have enough resources and use excessive violence against black, peaceful protestors.

Deputy Speaker, police in this province are quick to respond and when they are called in white suburbs by white people, in contrast they are a no-show when they are called in townships by black people. In protest against racism the same police will appear on national television being assaulted and pushed by white racists and they do nothing about it, but they will be quick to use excessive force against peaceful black marchers who will only be singing. As the EFF we are tired of this kind of treatment and our people cannot bear

it anymore. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon member, I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. This Parliament can be proud of the work done by the Ad Hoc Committee on COVID-19. We thank the Speaker for establishing the Committee, Chairperson for the manner in which the Committee was led and all the members for the manner in which the Committee exercised oversight. We must also thank Dr Keith Cloete and his team at the Department of Health for their hard work and dedication but also for his frank engagement with the Committee. And we thank all those who came to the Committee to brief us over the past 7 or 8 months.

COVID-19 thrust the whole world into an unprecedented period of turmoil. Governments were compelled to make hard decisions about economic and social restrictions and the pandemic brought out the worst and the best of political leadership. It exposed science sceptics and political opportunists. It tested community and society solidarity. In the Western Cape we saw remarkable responses of solidarity and care from so many people in communities.

Shortly after lockdown was announced over 200 community action networks sprung up in Cape Town to support those who were vulnerable, destitute and hungry. Good people reaching into their pantries and their pockets to help

those who were unable to do so. The people of this province were overwhelmingly kind, caring and responsive and we must thank them for that.

Hon Deputy Speaker, unfortunately there were those who were unable to find empathy and care. In Mouille Point a couple observed hunger and desperation from their flat window as lockdown hit the exceptionally marginalised people, those who live on the streets, hard. When the couple started to cook for the one hundred odd street people living on the Atlantic Seaboard, and to feed them from the boot of their car, they were harassed by some neighbours, by the Metro Police and by a SAPS captain from the Sea Point police station and when this intimidation did not stop them from feeding the homeless people, their car was petrol-bombed and totally destroyed.

It is difficult to comprehend the meanness and hate that lead to the bombing of a car because the owners are feeding hungry people. Of course, the people were hungry and still on the streets during the hard lockdown because the leadership of the City of Cape Town did not act out of empathy or care. They used the lockdown as an opportunity to clean up the streets. Rounding up homeless people and transporting them to a concentration camp. They dumped over 1 500 homeless people on a cold damp field in remote Strandfontein where they were expected to live in marquee tents, sleeping several hundred people each.

The people started to flee that camp from the day it was established. That

camp lasted six weeks and cost the people of Cape Town R53 million. It was a massive failure of compassion and leadership. It was the worst of politics. The mean-spirited leadership of the City of Cape Town did not end there. When the restrictions on the informal trading were lifted by the Minister it took the City six weeks to fully implement a permitting system trapping micro-traders in destitution whilst the City leadership claimed it needed clarity on what the new regulations meant. This is another failure on leadership and care. The worst of political leadership.

Hon Deputy Speaker, two months ago South Africa moved to the lowest level of restrictions as we appeared to have relatively successfully weathered the worst and avoided overwhelming our health systems. The early and hard lockdown was widely regarded as the right call and as having assisted our country from collapsing under the worst of possible scenarios, but not everybody thinks so, or not everybody says so.

The leader of the DA, John Steenhuisen said the only thing the lockdown achieved was the devastation of our economy, and he said, “Whether we call it Level 1, 2 or 3 or 6 it does not matter, it should not be there at all.” And from early on our Premier, his Government and DA members of this Parliament stated calling for the complete lifting of all restrictions prematurely and opportunistically. The DA used public fatigue as an opportunity to undermine the message from the National COVID-19 Command Council. The DA was unable to resist the political opportunities the restrictions presented, and some DA leaders embraced and promoted herd

immunity theories.

Now, Deputy Speaker, our province faces a surge in infections, the so-called “second wave” and our Premier and his Government is looking to introduce local lockdowns. The DA in this Government have consistently undermined the urgency and necessity of restrictions, challenging just about everything. And now as the Premier contemplates the need for a local lockdown to contain community transmission, the DA leader, John Steenhuisen says, there is no evidence it works.

If the science says we must return to lockdowns then we have no choice but the DA who must now implement a lockdown have destroyed their own credibility on the issue. This is a culmination of unprincipled opportunism, conflicting messaging and political expediency. We could have avoided the second wave if DA leadership had conducted themselves with responsibility and political maturity and try to gain the system for political purposes. This is the worst of political leadership. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. I recognise hon Christians.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear, hear-hear!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Firstly, I want to thank the Chairperson for the non-partisan way that she chaired the

Committee giving all parties, irrespective of size, the opportunity to address issues and I want to commend her and all members. Members were well prepared coming to these meetings, engaging the Executive and other role players. And also, allow me also to say well done to the support staff for excellent work done.

We had our work cut out for us and the task was a difficult one, but we were up for the task. The establishment of this Ad Hoc Committee by the Speaker in accordance to the Standing Rule 119(1)(b), was an innovation for we as members to engage the executive on a regular basis. The Executive and the police, National Government and all relevant role players.

This Committee was meaningful and insightful, helpful because here as members we could engage members of the Executive and other role players with burning issues. On a regular basis we were confronted by the public and we could address these issues almost immediately. I know as a province we are richer because of the work done by this committee. We were also very encouraged by communities who had absolute little to eat, sharing with those who had nothing to eat. It proved to us that the people of the Western Cape showed that we care and that we can defeat this Corona virus and conquer it going forward.

I know, HON Deputy Speaker, that there were a lot of issues and a lot of stuff that we've discussed and there is still work to be done, because now of the second wave, but Deputy Speaker, it was a pleasure serving on this

Committee and the ACDP support this report. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: I just had to get my mic on. Hon Deputy Speaker, today is World Aids Day and the Western Cape has a total of 452 210 people living with HIV Aids and now we are once again faced with another deadly pandemic, COVID-19. Deputy Speaker, as we speak Mitchell's Plain had a surge of COVID-19 cases from 88 to 251, Khayelitsha from 78 to 130 over the past two weeks. Tygerberg has 369 new COVID-19 cases and Klipfontein 205 within the past seven days.

Now the Ad Hoc Committee of 24 November has shown that COVID-19 has negatively impacted the livelihoods, thousands of limited individual freedoms and lifestyles and high levels of unemployment has increased [Inaudible.]. We therefore require, Deputy Speaker, an aggressive socio-economic health response strategy to this COVID-19 challenge. Now our communication tagline says, "Stay Safe, Move Forward". Really? What does this mean? "Stay Safe, Move Forward". It does not speak of any urgency nor does it spell out the immense danger of this COVID-19 Coronavirus.

Hon Deputy Speaker, neither does this message convey the urgency needed as a response for [Inaudible.] should be a key element in the fight against the spread of COVID-19. There are still too many people walking around with no mask, either out of arrogance or stupidity. They have marches with thousands

of people without masks, not observing any social distancing. It is utterly stupid and a danger to society as a whole. I am concerned especially that the number of testing being done has decreased from 236 per 100 000 in October, it is down from 506 people that was tested per 100 000 in July. So we now have 236 per 100 000 tested as against double that almost in July 2020.

We cannot allow this Corona virus to continue living among us, undetected. For as long as this Corona virus continues to dominate our lives the poor and the vulnerable, the abused women and children will suffer the most as a result of this increased Gender Based Violence occurs, fuelled by lockdown regulations.

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, law should regulate people's behaviour. Non-compliance should have serious consequences for offenders but there are no consequences for those who march in our streets without masks in their thousands. There are no consequences for nightclubs that do not observe these regulations. So, what is the use of these regulations? Having declared a state of disaster on 15 March empowering Ministers to pass regulations, without giving law agencies the necessary cohesive powers to enforce compliance has made this State look indecisive and helpless in the face of calamity. We have been playing fiddle while Rome has been burning.

The City of Cape Town should formulate by-laws to curb irresponsible night life behaviour and they should prescribe serious penalties for offenders. Non-compliance in wearing of masks and not observing social distancing has

caused another spike of infections while the State has got the appearance of a toothless bulldog. At the same time, total lockdown of businesses has virtually destroyed small, medium enterprises and caused thousands of job losses without halting the COVID-19 express train.

Lockdowns and lockdowning our economy will lead to economic disaster and invite more criminal activities. We are now robbing trucks. We are burning our trucks. That is the only response Africa knows.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon members [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: When they are mad, they destroy! When they are unhappy, they burn up! They break it down. The Western Cape has [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up. [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: ...the best quarantine and capacitated province should have been given [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Time is up! Time is up!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais your time is up [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: ...a free hand in handling this pandemic. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I wonder if he can hear me? Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: He usually has two minutes. He cannot even finish in five.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais you did not hear me, but your time was up. Thank you very much. Hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, many of you may be familiar with Ian Mitroff's book published in 1998 with this title "Smart Thinking for Crazy Times". Mitroff explored the process of using critical thinking to ask the right questions and solve the right problems in any company or situation. The COVID-19 pandemic certainly led the world into crazy times and asked of us to respond by asking the right questions. To this effect this House established the Ad Hoc COVID-19 Oversight Committee on 14 April 2020. While the ANC initially did not appreciate the importance of asking the right questions, I am glad to say that they eventually participated.

The establishment of a committee to oversee this Government's response to crazy times and whose report is serving before us today was unique among the nine legislatures. Unfortunately, a speech of five minutes cannot do justice to the important and wide range in work that this multi-party committee undertook. What happened in other provinces in the absence of similar Ad Hoc COVID-19 Oversight Committees?

In Gauteng our biggest and best resource province and as confirmed by Premier David Makuru [Inaudible.] their procurement was beset by corruption up to Cabinet level. Even staff in President Ramaphosa's office was implicated by reports of irregular involvement in emergency procurement for personal protective equipment. Their smart thinking was directed on who to rob the public purse in this crazy times.

The Nasrec field hospital in Gauteng opened late and without pipe oxygen and proper equipment and at a cost of R380 per day, it only admitted 34 patients during the first 26 days of November and this wastage of tax payers' money is said to continue for at least two more months. This is an ANC Provincial Government's version of smart thinking in crazy times.

In stark contrast to this the Ad Hoc COVID-19 Committee's report contains many examples of real smart thinking in the Western Cape. The Hospital of Hope was finished long before similar temporary facilities in any of the other provinces. And on opening day it was fully kitted with piped oxygen and the necessary equipment. This is what can be achieved by smart thinking in crazy times.

The report by the Ad Hoc COVID-19 Committee also contains numerous other examples of innovation or smart thinking. Then from the publishing of the emergency procurement results, public transport solutions for health workers, the home delivery of chronic medicine to plans to ensure the safe return of learners and educators to schools. An important aspect of the

Western Cape's response was the cooperation and communication between provincial departments. The Western Cape soon added to its addressing of the risks of the infection, plans to alleviate the enormous hardship caused by national regulations.

While the report contains numerous favourable examples of this Government's response, its task was not always made easy. Entities that one would expect to support humanitarian relief efforts were creating obstacles. And example of such a crazy action was the complaint laid by the Human Rights Commission with the South African Police Services against MEC Debbie Schäfer, just because she dared to alleviate malnutrition by reinstating the school feeding schemes. Crazy times and crazy responses indeed.

The invitation by the Western Cape's Ad Hoc COVID-19 Committee to the public to participate in its work and the vast number of submissions received from the public was in stark contrast to the work of the National Coronavirus Command Council. Never did this Council invite the public to participate and provide input before announcing its far reaching and often highly damaging regulations. It dismally lacked smart thinking for crazy times.

The decisions of the National Coronavirus Command Council caused a humanitarian crisis. It seemed oblivious to the devastating effect that poverty has on lives. Its lack of smart thinking caused the courts when approached by the DA and other concerned entities, to set aside many of its

silly regulations. Unfortunately, often the damage was already done. It is during crazy times that evidence of real leadership and smart thinking is demonstrated. I can foresee that this detailed report will become an important source of information for future studies of how this Government responded with smart thinking in crazy times. I recommend that this House adopts the report. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the hon Minister, Dr Ivan Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise to take part in the debate on the Ad Hoc Committee on COVID-19 of the Western Cape Parliament. I rise to present the Western Cape Cabinet's response to the Ad Hoc Committee's report. I firstly want to express our thanks and appreciation to the Chairperson of the Ad Hoc Committee, our Chief Whip Ms Wenger, and all members of this committee. In the spirit of transparency, accountability and openness, this Government fully participated in the work of the COVID-19 Ad Hoc Committee. The Western Cape Government has followed an approach based on the values and principles of this Government and I will respond to the report of the Ad Hoc Committee through the lenses of our values and principles.

The first value of this Government is caring. Right from the start our approach was to care for the citizens of the Western Cape during this global pandemic. That is evident in the testimony of our Government's responses to

the Ad Hoc Committee. The Premier led the caring campaign and he personally visited patients at the various sites together with members of his Cabinet. The Minister of Social Development, Minister Fernandez, took charge of our humanitarian relief efforts as a sign of our approach to care for our citizens and the most vulnerable members of the community.

The Minister of Local Government also allocated an additional R60 million to support the humanitarian relief efforts of municipalities across this province. Caring for our children and older persons were and still is central in our COVID-19 response. As per the report, the Western Cape Department of Social Development also issued guidelines and protocols for the prevention and management of COVID-19 infections in long term care facilities.

Madam Deputy Speaker, the second value of this Government is competence, and we are seeing what a huge difference it makes in having competent people, staff and officials of this Government in managing this pandemic. The competent manner in which the Premier, the hon Winde, and the Western Cape Minister of Health, Dr Nomafrench Mbombo managed this pandemic is truly remarkable and acknowledged by Minister Mkhize, the National Minister of Health.

As per the report of the Ad Hoc Committee, the first incident of COVID-19 happened in the Western Cape on 11 March 2020. The Head of the Department, Dr Keith Cloete, appeared before the Ad Hoc Committee on

Sunday 7 June 2020, and he briefed the committee. He is one of the most competent health managers in South Africa and his excellent management of COVID-19 is evident. We have also seen the competence of the Director General, Dr Harry Malila, all our heads of departments in the Western Cape, in the hotspot areas. It makes a huge difference. We have witnessed this competence at our weekly COVID-19 Cabinet meetings also today. Competence helps when you are dealing with a pandemic of this nature.

Madam Deputy Speaker, I was personally deployed to work in the Witzenberg and the Cape Winelands area. There I worked closely with Dr Philips, an equally competent and capable health team. To date are having a 91% recovery rate. This is the result of collaboration and working with competent people. Other Ministers have reported the same level of competence in their various hot spot areas.

The third value of this Government is accountability. Various departments appeared before the Ad Hoc Committee to account with honesty before the Committee. Accountability also mean to account for things that did not go well. We did, as reported to the Ad Hoc Committee, experience some challenges with out national counterparts. In the spirit of accountability, the Provincial Treasury led by the Minister of Finance published a supply chain due diligence report on the purchasing of PPE. Given what is happening in the rest of the country the Western Cape Government has set a new standard of accountability and we are encouraging all other provincial departments in South Africa to do the same. The hon Deputy Speaker and members of this

House will note that the Provincial Treasury has again to date published a fifth edition of the procurement disclosure report.

This report reveals that the Western Cape has spent to date R1.7 billion on COVID-19, thanks to the Minister of Finance. It is quite shocking how President Ramaphosa's Government failed the test of public accountability throughout this pandemic. As per the report, a testimony of the Provincial Treasury was very accountable and transparent about the fiscal impact of COVID-19 on the budget envelope of the Western Cape Government.

The Western Cape Government is now calling on President Ramaphosa to account and make good on his promise when he visited the Cape Town International Convention Centre – he made a promise that this Government will receive R5 billion to manage COVID-19 in the Western Cape. Madam Deputy Speaker, he has to date failed to deliver on this promise. The people of the Western Cape will hold him and his Cabinet accountable for his failure to deliver on a public commitment that he made.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the next value [Interjections.] of this Government is integrity. Political office bearers and officials that appeared before the Ad Hoc Committee gave an honest account of our management of COVID-19. This Government led by Premier Alan Winde and his administration, led by Dr Harry Malila and Dr Keith Cloete and all the HOD's in this Government are men and women of integrity [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Honourable [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...and confidence and trust levels have increased weekly in terms of the public opinion of how the Western Cape Government manages the COVID-19 crisis. Honourable [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister. Hon Minister if you can just take your seat, please. I see there is a point of order or a raised hand. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, is the hon MEC willing to, is hon MEC willing to take [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Would you like to take a question?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...a question. Yes, is he willing to take a question on the denialism of the COVID-19 regulations by the Western Cape Government, on the Provincial Government, not the [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, I am [Interjections.] waiting for the Minister to respond. Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I do not respond to juniors.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Minister has decided not to. Thank you very

much, hon Sayed [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): From a point of order, Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): On a point of order, Deputy Speaker, can the Minister refer to fellow members of the House as juniors? That is ageism. We are not going to burr the provincial, Deputy Speaker can you hear me [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is not a point of order, thanks, hon Sayed [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Not going to burr governance with ageism.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...let the Minister complete. We have had a good session. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you hon Deputy Speaker. From the beginning the Premier and his Cabinet resolved to establish a dashboard

open to the public. We adopted a data-led and evidence-governance approach in decision-making. Such an approach builds public confidence. Our data integrity was updated weekly, checked and verified daily. Because we are dealing with a global pandemic, last seen in 1918 with the Spanish Flu, we needed to think outside the box. This Government also adopted innovation as a value of this Government during the appearance of the Health Department before the Ad Hoc Committee it testified that the innovative ways in managing COVID-19 in the Western Cape Province.

Dr Cloete testified before the Ad Hoc Committee that the COVID-19 daily dashboard has been nominated for an IP Innovation Award and that you will find on page 21 of the report. As per the ad hoc report, Madam Deputy Speaker, we have seen how the usage of high flow nasal oxygen on COVID-19 patients ensured greater recoveries from the disease in place of ventilators. This innovation made all the difference in both high care environments and acute environments.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Transport and Public Works Department as mentioned by hon member Van der Westhuizen also used very effective, the Red Dot Taxi Mobility system to transport COVID-19 patients and PIY to and from quarantined isolation facilities. This innovation made a big difference to avoid stigmatization in our communities. This service was launched with the taxi industry on 18 May 2020 [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Another very successful innovation, hon Deputy Speaker, was the COVID-19 Support Finder launched together with the City of Cape Town and Wesgro. This innovation assisted businesses to navigate and access the many support funds available to them. The last value of this Government, hon Deputy Speaker, is responsiveness. Throughout the Ad Hoc Committee's report, it became clear that the Western Cape Government was very responsive to the requests and questions by the Committee. The Premier held regular COVID-19 updates, via digicomms in line with the value of responsiveness. I want to thank the Premier, our Health Minister, Dr Keith Cloete and the Director-General for being very responsive in front of the Committee, appearing on behalf of the Western Cape Government. As you have seen in this report, every Provincial Minister and head of department have been allocated to hotspot areas. In all of these areas they have been very responsive. This is in contrast to the National Government. What we very clearly see in this report, is that the National Government was missing in action in managing COVID-19. The working group 5 of the Ad Hoc Committee has looked into Government's response to COVID-19. As per the Ad Hoc Committee's report, the National Government has seriously failed the people of South Africa. I conclude, Madam Deputy Speaker.

Lastly, Madam Deputy Speaker, the report gives an account of the Western Cape response and we have led this pandemic through the values of caring, competence accountability, integrity, innovation and responsiveness. Lastly this Government wants to thank the citizens of the Western Cape, the NGO's,

the community-based organisations, the faith-based organisations, members of this Legislature for their support in managing COVID-19 as well as all the staff of this Government and all the health care workers of this province. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Wenger.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I would like to thank all the hon members for their contributions to this debate on the Ad Hoc Committee's report. Hon Windvogel talks about "too little too late". Perhaps she was not paying attention when the Western Cape went through its first wave and the Province managed to flatten the curve, prepare for the peak and get through it without being overwhelmed. What was too little or too late about that? But perhaps she was referring to the Eastern Cape where it was thought dignified to transport sick patients in tuk-tuks and then bleed the taxpayer to the tune of R100 000 per bike and then backtrack saying that these are medicine transport vehicles.

The hon member astoundingly uses the word "complacent". Complacent? That is the very last adjective that could possibly be used in relation to the Western Cape response. The Government is relentless in its efforts, releasing daily statistical updates and consistent transparency. This is in stark contrast with Gauteng, which does not even know how many COVID-19 cases it has. Leading statisticians are asking if Sesame Street's Count Von Count, is doing

Gauteng's numbers. Gauteng has lost control of its data and is currently harmonising its data because it is reporting less COVID-19 cases than it has COVID-19 patients currently in hospital.

Complacency, however, might be the word that could be used for the National Government and other provinces when it comes to PPE procurement. As we have seen the vast and disgusting corruption taking away taxpayers' money for service delivery to line pockets. Further Deputy Speaker, I am not sure which report hon Windvogel was reading but our report does not make any mention of herd immunity. Not one! And if the ANC had such objections to the report, why did they agree to adopt this report just last week and also agreed with the previous monthly reports that make up the bulk of this report? Why the U-turn? The only answer I can get to is petty politics.

I would like to thank Minister Meyer for the Government's response. To him and to all the Ministers and HOD's that contributed to this report through the many briefings and reports provided to us, thank you. I would also like to thank the members that made constructive inputs today. It is clear that we have worked hard. Many, many hours of preparation which this report is testament to. It is also clear that every resource at our disposal has and must continue to be combined and concentrated to achieve safety for both our lives and our livelihoods.

The pandemic has had widespread effects on every aspect of our lives, from our health to the education of our children, our businesses and our finances,

our mental wellbeing, our futures and government at all levels. South Africa is currently following the rest of the world in the trajectory of the Corona virus and second surge. And so, as the Western Cape Government continues in its efforts to manage this Corona virus, so as the Government continues to respond to this pandemic, so too will we continue to perform our oversight role over the Government. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Wenger. That concludes the debate on this report. I have to announce that there are currently 35 hon members present and entitled to vote and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the report of the Ad Hoc Committee on COVID-19 be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted?

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have an objection in the House. [Interjections.] I have an objection in the House. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] In order for the members to have their respective votes on the abovementioned question and that the report be recorded correctly, I will enquire from the Chief Whips to indicate their respective party's positions on the question. So for political parties represented in the WCPP by no more than one member, I will then also enquire from the members of such parties whether any such

members wish to recover a vote different to the vote of their party. Will the Chief Whip of the DA please indicate whether the DA is in support of the approval of the question?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. We support the approval of the report of the Ad Hoc Committee on COVID-19.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Are there any individual members of the DA who wish to record a vote different to the vote of their party?

An HON MEMBER: No. †Hulle moet volg. [They must follow.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Chief Whip of the ANC, please indicate whether the ANC is in support of the approval of the question.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The ANC is not in support, Chair. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any – thank you. Are there any individual members of the ANC who wish to record a vote different to the vote of their party?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted thank you. Will the parliamentary leader of

the EFF please indicate whether the EFF is in support of the approval of the question?

Mr M XEGO: No, we are not in support.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any individual members of the EFF who wish to record a vote that is different to the vote of their party?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: No, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted thank you. Will the hon member of the GOOD party please indicate whether the GOOD party is in support of the approval of the question?

Mr B N HERRON: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, we will support it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you. Will the hon member of the ACDP please indicate whether the ACDP is in support of the approval of the question?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Yes, Madam Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports the report.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Will the hon member of the Freedom Front Plus party please indicate whether the Freedom Front

Plus Party is in support of the approval of the question?

Mr J P MARAIS: The Freedom Front is in support of the acceptance of the motion, Madam Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Will the hon member of the Al Jama-Ah, hon Secretary is he in the House? No? He is not. I am going to leave Al Jama-Ah out. I just want to tally the support votes versus the not. Thank you very much. I have to announce that there are 24 aye's and 11 no's in support of the approval of the question and as I said, 11 are opposed to the approval of the question.

The question on the report of the Ad Hoc Committee has therefore been adopted. The names of the individual members and their support or otherwise for the question before the House will be recorded in the minutes of the proceedings to ensure a full record of the voting on the consideration of the question. Please note hon members, before I adjourn that on Wednesday 2 December 2020, and Thursday 3 December 2020 the proceedings will commence at 10:00. That concludes the business for the House and the House is adjourned. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all members will be exited from the meeting. I thank you.

The House adjourned at 17:10.