
THURSDAY, 1 JUNE 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: I now request hon members to remain standing as we observe a moment of silence in memory of the school children who tragically lost their lives on Tuesday, 30 May 2023. Our thoughts and prayers are with their families and loved ones.

[Moment of silence observed.]

Please be seated.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Yes, thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, we welcome the moment of silence for the victims of the tragic car crash near Mitchells Plain, but I want to put on record that about two or three weeks ago five children from one family in Mossel Bay died on our roads. I find it insensitive that in that Motion of Condolences we do not refer to those children. I would just like to put that on record.

The SPEAKER: Your point – actually it was a point of order – has been noted and will reflect in the Minutes of the Proceedings. I will now proceed, hon members.

I would like to remind hon members of some of the logistical arrangements. As has been the practice to date, hon members who participate in the Sitting of the House, from both the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff and via Microsoft Teams, our Standing Rules have been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the WCPP.

Hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to this Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve these connectivity challenges.

Hon members, the quorum requirements for this Sitting of the House are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Unless there is an indication of concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020. Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law.

Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order. The Serjeant-at-Arms have recorded members' attendance.

In instances where a Directive has not covered for a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules will apply. In instances where the Rules cannot be applied the Ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Hon members, all microphones have been muted. However, for those hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raised-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order, and I will recognise you. When an hon member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order, such an hon member may address the Presiding Officer, as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking. [Audio breaking up 05:27]

Hon members, you are requested to please ensure that your microphones are unmuted when the Presiding Officer recognised you, and when you are done

speaking to please mute your microphones. The media have always been granted access to the MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. I would like to remind members of the media that you may not use the chat room or speak or activate your cameras while the Sitting is in progress.

If an individual who is not a member of this House activates the microphone and video camera such member will be exited from the Sitting immediately. I request that those here today, who are not members, and the gallery, please observe the decorum of the House.

For this Sitting, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber, as usual, and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. Hon members participating in the Sitting of the House must please access the Language Translation Services via a second device.

Hon members, I would like to remind you that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings and to this end I would like to draw your attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules. With that being said, hon members, I now recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), that deal with the sequence of proceedings, that precedence be given in the following order, for the House to deal with the Motion – in terms of Rule 151(2), as part of the Order Paper – in the name of the hon C Murray:

That the House, as the representatives of 7,2 million people in the Western Cape – one of South Africa's nine provinces – notes the economic development and job creation that the African Growth and Opportunities Act (AGOA) provides the Western Cape through preferential access to the USA market for many of our exporters; notes that, despite the Western Cape having the lowest unemployment rate in the country with a 25,9% expanded unemployment rate for the first quarter of 2023, unemployment remains a challenge in the province; recognises the role AGOA plays in creating jobs where they are needed the most; recognises that South Africa has benefited tremendously from this Act through increased exports to the world's biggest consumer market, the USA; notes that the ANC's foreign policy, through their support of Russia's invasion of Ukraine, is putting South Africa's inclusion in any renewal of AGOA at risk; and notes that trade is a concurrent area of national and provincial legislative competence in accordance with the Constitution, Schedule 4, Part A.

Therefore, that this House resolves to reaffirm the USA and the Western Cape's friendship and important economic and trade ties;

supports the renewal of AGOA in 2025; calls on the President to take urgent diplomatic action by engaging with the United States on ensuring SA's inclusion in AGOA once again; calls on the Minister and the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition to support trade relations on behalf of the Western Cape in making every effort to negotiate in good faith for the renewal of AGOA; and emphasises strong bilateral ties with the US and commits to strengthening these ties.

And, as agreed in the Programming Authority, to afford a three-minute declaration per party, as they so wish, hon Speaker, and then subsequently deal with the Subject for Discussion.

I so move, Speaker, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the Motion?

No objections? Agreed to.

Hon members the next item on the Order Paper is in the name of the hon C Murray. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration for a maximum of three minutes.

I will now afford the individual parties an opportunity to do so. I now recognise the ANC. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I would like to request that we pass at this stage. Hon Khalid Sayed is having challenges with his laptop.

The SPEAKER: Alright, no problem. I am going to from the Chair make the ruling that I am going to continue, and if hon Sayed joins I will provide him with an opportunity to do so.

I now see the EFF.

Mr T KLAAS: No declaration in the EFF. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I see GOOD, hon De Villiers.

Mr P T DE VILLIERS: No declaration.

The SPEAKER: Just for the record there is no declaration from GOOD. The ACDP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker.

I think this topic is very important. We discussed it last week and it is important to note that the ACDP fully supports the AGOA issue and that South Africa have preferential treatment according to this, Speaker, this is so important and critical and I do not think that anybody can debate against this. We need this, and we need to protect it with everything we have. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I now see the Freedom Front Plus.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Speaker, ek dink hierdie saak is nou al holrug gery so ek sal nie 'n verklaring maak nie. Ons almal weet presies wat die situasie is. Die Vryheidsfront stem saam, ja. Ons moet asseblief ons verbintenis met die Verenigde State behou en ons moet optree op 'n staatsmanskaplike manier.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, I think this matter has been done to death so I will not make a declaration. We all know precisely what the situation is. The Freedom Front Plus agrees, yes. We must please maintain our relationship with the United States and act in a statesmanlike manner.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais. I now recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Speaker, no declaration from Al Jama-ah. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. Can I just check before I give hon Murray an opportunity, is hon Sayed online?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): (No audible reply.)

The SPEAKER: Alright, I do not get an indication, so I am going to continue, Chief Whip. I now recognise hon Murray. Oh, my apologies, just for the record, I recognise the DA. I assume it is hon Murray because the motion is in her name.

Ms C MURRAY: Thank you, Speaker, yes. Hon Speaker, I rise today to address the urgent issue of South Africa's inclusion in the African Growth and Opportunity Act which we all know as AGOA. As the representative of 7,2 million people in the Western Cape, we, the members of this Provincial Parliament, should be deeply concerned by the lack of urgency shown by the National Government in securing our country's participation in this vital trade agreement.

AGOA has played a crucial role in granting African countries, including South Africa, preferential access to the extensive US market. However, our continued participation in AGOA is now uncertain due to disorganised and inadequate efforts to engage with the United States. This is compounded by

the disastrous foreign policy regarding Russia's invasion of Ukraine.

The significance of AGOA to our economy, particularly in the Western Cape, cannot be overstated. It has been a lifeline for industries such as agriculture, automotive, metals and jewellery.

The value of South Africa's AGOA eligible exports has grown from \$417 million in 2001 to a whopping 1,9 billion in 2021, with five of the top ten South African exports to the US originating from our province alone. To address this critical issue, I have tabled a resolution that encompasses the concerns and aspirations of the Western Cape. This resolution highlights the economic development and job creation provided by AGOA. It acknowledges the ongoing challenge of unemployment in our province and recognises the benefits South Africa has derived from this act. It also notes the posed risk by the National Government's foreign policy decisions and emphasises the province's concurrent area of trade as per our Constitution.

Therefore, Speaker, I move that this House resolves to reaffirm the friendship and important economic and trade ties between the USA and the Western Cape, that the House supports and actively lobbies for the reauthorisation of AGOA in 2025; calls on the President to urgently engage with the US to ensure South Africa's inclusion in AGOA once again; calls on the Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition to make every effort to negotiate in good faith towards the reauthorisation of the AGOA on behalf of the Western

Cape, and emphasises, as well as commits to strengthening the strong bilateral ties between this Province and the USA.

Speaker, I humbly request the support of all members of this House in endorsing this declaration. It serves the interests of growing our economy and creating much needed jobs for all of our residents in this province. I so move.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Murray, before I put the question to the House, hon Sayed, I am going to allow you an opportunity, if you so wish.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, for your indulgence.

Speaker, the place where this particular Motion comes from would be funny if it was not so sad. Last week we tried our utmost to caution the DA's hon Murray to not get ahead of herself and bite off more than she can chew. It seems she declined to take our advice.

In last week's debate, the ANC did not fall into the hon Murray's trap, and even worse still, the hon Murray misconstrues the ANC's and therefore South Africa's foreign policy. Maybe we should be a bit more explicit. The hon Murray must go and study South African foreign policy first and not read tabloid articles on it or listen to the gossip of her peers. Yet, what the hon Murray is really doing with this Motion is confirming that she is singing for

the DA *Sappe* from right-wing Republicans in the United States of America. The DA and the hon Murray wanted us to reject and turn our backs on our US partners, notwithstanding our sharp differences with them. The ANC will never do that. We value our trade with the United States. We hold our relationship with the US in high regard and we will continue to work with the US Ambassador, despite the hon MEC Meyer misconstruing the conversation between himself and the Ambassador, which was held in confidence, I am sure. We know the views of the Ambassador and we will not use our discussions with him and/or his staff for political expediency as the hon Meyer and the DA do. In fact, I will be contacting the US Consulate in Cape Town to inform them of the breach of confidence by the hon Meyer and advise the US Consulate that the DA and its Federal Chairperson care little for confidence. [Interjections.]

In fact, he will even use confidential discussions to hit the ANC. That is all he and the DA care about.

Hon Speaker, the ANC would support this Motion if the line, and I quote:

"...notes that the ANC's foreign policy, through their support of Russia's invasion of Ukraine, is putting South Africa's inclusion in any renewal of AGOA at risk..."

If that particular quote is deleted, because it is simply not true. Hon Murray must read foreign policy and not tabloids, so we decline to support this Motion. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon members, I have to announce that there are currently 30 hon members present and entitled to vote and the House is therefore quorate.

The question put before the House is that the Motion be adopted. Are there any objections to the Motion being adopted?

HON MEMBERS: Yes, objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Yes, so there is an objection, hon members. I now put, those in favour of the Motion being adopted please say "aye".

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the Motion being approved, please say "no".

HON MEMBERS: No, no-no-no.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I think the ayes have it. Therefore the question put before the House has been approved, and the Motion has been approved. [Applause.]

Thank you very much, hon members. We will now deal with the Subject for Discussion. [Interjections.] Hon members, we are past that part of the Order Paper. [*00:18:21, microphone loses connection.]

We will now go to the Subject for Discussion, in the name of the hon T M Klaas, as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Klaas.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

The lack of access to land for poor, marginalised and emerging Black farmers (Black, Coloured and Indian) in the Western Cape

†Mr T KLAAS: Molweni, Somlomo. Mandibulise kunye ne-Premier, ndibulise nee-Ministers, nabo bonke abalapha kakhulu. Ndibonge uJulius Sello Malema osinike amandla ukuba sibe lapha.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Good day, Speaker. I also extend a warm greeting to the Premier, the Ministers as well as to everyone who is here. I thank the Honourable Julius Sello Malema for giving us the opportunity to be here today.]

The issue of the land remains cardinal pillar number 1 in the EFF and like the rest of the other six cardinal pillars, it is non-negotiable. In the EFF when we speak about access to land for Black people, it will always refer to the extended definition which includes Africans, Coloureds and Indians, just to

mention a few.

The Democratic Alliance and Freedom Front Plus still believe in the notion of divide-and-conquer in order to separate Black people and make sure that the status quo of landlessness remains intact. That is why not long we had a member of this House telling us that Black people are foreigners in this province, much to the excitement of the DA as if the Western Cape does not form part of South Africa. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr T KLAAS: Speaker, today they go around tabling Bills such as the Western Cape Powers Bill, which indirectly aims to usurp those powers reserved for National Government in their scheming ways of attempting to separate the Western Cape from the rest of South Africa.

Speaker, according to the 2019 National Land Audit Report more than 2,57 million hectares of agricultural land in the Western Cape was in the hands of White people, whilst Black people only owned more than 53 000 hectares. Coloureds owned more than 561 000 hectares and Indians 195 000 hectares, respectively. So even if we combine all non-White agricultural land owners, their ownership of land cannot even reach 50%... [Interjection.]

†Me A CASSIEM: Skande!

[Ms A CASSIEM: Disgrace!]

Mr T KLAAS: ...despite accounting for the large part of population. Speaker, in 2023 this skewed agricultural land ownership remains more or less the same, even under the Western Cape Agriculture MEC, who happens to fall under the extended definition of what constitutes being Black, so there is no transformation in this sector when it comes to the land ownership whatsoever.

When it comes to the residential land, the problem remains the same with a housing backlog of more than 500 000. This means that Black people in townships will continue to be cramped in those small yards with limited spaces and backyard shacks. Speaker, when it comes to matters involving land, the DA Provincial Government made sure that they put non-Whites in those Departments of Agriculture and Infrastructure so that no one blames White people when things go wrong or when there is a lack of transformation.

Speaker, there is also no transformation when it comes to the issue of spatial planning in the Western Cape. The Department of Infrastructure continues to create housing developments in areas and parcels of land which are too remote from places of business. When questions are being posed on why there are no social housing developments in the inner-Central Business District (CBD)... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members, there is a member on the floor.

Mr T KLAAS: ...we are being told that land is expensive. However, the same Provincial Government will go out of its way to litigate against an opportunity to turn the Tafelberg area into a social housing opportunity.

†Agbare Speaker, die DA het die Swart-, Bruin- en Indiërmense van hierdie provinsie gefaal en hulle gebruik nou van ons eie mense deur hulle in magsposisies te plaas en vir hulle te sê om nie betrokke te raak by enige aktiwiteite of programme wat sal lei tot transformasie van hul eie mense nie. Dankie. [Applous.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Hon Speaker, the DA has failed the Black, Brown and Indian people of this province and they now use some of our own people to by placing them in positions of authority and telling them not to get involved in any activities of programmes that would lead to transformation of their own people. Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much, hon Klaas. I now recognise the hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Speaker, I thank you very much and I just want to respond a bit to hon member Klaas. Hon member Klaas, through you, Speaker...

Mr T KLAAS: Why do you want to respond to that?

Ms L M MASEKO: ...has never been in government, will never be in government, he does not even have a clue of how to deal with the issue of land reform. [Interjections.]

†AGBARE LEDE: Ja, ja.

[HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: And the least he can do for today... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon members, hon members! Please take your seat, hon Maseko. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order? Order, members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker, that is a point... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, just give me one minute. Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Hon Sayed is on the floor on a point of order. Can I please ask you to allow the member on the floor? Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The point of order, Speaker, is it parliamentary for the hon Maseko to mislead the House? The EFF are in government in the country and in municipalities. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat. That is not a point of order. Hon Maseko, you may continue. [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Speaker, in this province that is best run and, I mean, statistics show all the time... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do you mean the sewerage next to my house that is overflowing? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

†'n AGBARE LID: Sy sal nie weet nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: She will not know. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon members, both on my left and right-hand side, this is... [Interjections.] Order members! This is a political debate so I am providing you with a little bit of leeway. Interjections are allowed, but please do not drown out the speaker or continue in running commentary. Hon Maseko, you may continue.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Speaker, I think hon member

Klaas is being disadvantaged to listen how the Government can be run by the ANC and it is unfair to him because hon member, I mean, he is in my Committee and all the time he listens when we are on the road, on the public hearings, to listen to what our communities are saying. So if we can be allowed to listen to us who are in Government – the best-run province in this country, what are we saying about the land reform? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We are holding Government accountable. We are holding Government accountable.

Ms L M MASEKO: So through you, Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): For once they must hold the DA accountable ... [Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Thabo Mbeki once said, and I quote:

"Land is the key to our future. It is the foundation of our economy and our society. It is also the key to our dignity and our freedom."

Mr T KLAAS: Why do you not go to the DA documents? Why do you keep on quoting our leaders? [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: The lack of... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Hon members, hon Chief Whip, I will recognise you now. Hon members, the hon Maseko is on the floor. Can I please ask that you allow the hon member to make her presentation and for those members that are on the Speaker's List you will have an opportunity to rebut when it is your opportunity to do so. Running commentary is not allowed. Again, I do not want to curb the freedom in this House, but please do respect the member on the floor and this is for both sides of the House. Hon Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, Speaker, I am covered by your ruling. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much.

Speaker, the lack of access to land for poor marginalised and emerging farmers in South Africa is a major challenge. This is despite the fact that many previously disadvantaged people are interested in farming.

The need for land in South Africa is rooted in historical inequalities characterised by land dispossession and concentrated ownership. Addressing land ownership and redistribution is necessary to achieve social justice, stimulating economic growth and reducing poverty. By ensuring equitable

access to land, South Africa can foster inclusive development, redress past injustices and promote social cohesion.

However, it is heartbreaking and after 30 years, the ANC National Government has not addressed the issue of land at all. As I stand here today, the ANC National Government currently owns 25 million hectares of land.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where are we now?

Ms L M MASEKO: Yet, the ANC and its ally, the EFF, believe that the only way to tackle the issue of land is by signing into law the unconstitutional Expropriation Bill.

Hon Speaker, the DA wholeheartedly supports land reform, but it should be done with a fair compensation. We firmly believe that there is no need to amend Section 25 of the Constitution as it already provides a framework for land reform and restitution.

The slow pace of reform is because of the ANC Government's incompetence, corruption and insufficient budget allocations. To tackle land reform you do not need to amend the Constitution or sign into law an unconstitutional Bill that will achieve nothing. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: You need good clean governance, sufficient budget allocations and a genuine compassion for fixing the wrongs in South Africa. The ANC has set a target of redistributing 30% of land by 2030 while currently they have achieved only 4% of land that is owned by previously disadvantaged individuals. One of the major projects initiated by the ANC in post-apartheid South Africa was the restitution of District Six which they failed so dismally. The project was launched in 1996 but unfortunately progress has been poor, to say the least, and that was run under about six Presidents.

These projects initiated by the ANC in 1996 has so far cost an estimated R1 billion and to this day more than 2000 beneficiaries are still waiting and the ANC is still dragging its feet. The ANC's lack of progress confirms that they do not care about land distribution and housing the most vulnerable.

While the ANC's focus is trying to arrange their Provincial Conference that should have already happened in 2019, the DA in the Western Cape has already allocated a budget of almost R10 billion for infrastructure development in the province just for this year alone.

Not only will this budget go directly to building thousands of houses, housing opportunities for our communities, but it will also be used to build new schools, hospitals and libraries as well as creating jobs. But as we all know, hon Speaker, whatever the ANC does is by corrupt and deceitful acts that create havoc and hurdles by being ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Members, hon Maseko, please take your seat. Hon members, there is a member on the floor. It is a political debate, but the running commentary on everything that the speaker on the floor is saying, and there is a rebuttal, is not allowed. Can we please respect one another?

I mean, we have eight more, nine more speakers to get through and if we do not stop it now, this is going to affect the decorum of the House. Can I please ask that you work with me and allow the member on the floor to continue. Hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Speaker. But in this DA-led province, hon Speaker, there are currently over a 100 housing projects that are being developed by a variety of stakeholders, including the Provincial Government, municipalities, private developers and non-governmental organisations that will create more than 20 000 housing opportunities. These projects are unfortunately delayed by political parties who encourage illegal land grabs. Both the ANC and the EFF have been caught encouraging illegal land grabs in various parts of the Western Cape.

I find it quite astonishing that the EFF would even suggest debating the topic of access to land when their actions directly delay housing projects in this province. Since 2013, the EFF has consistently called for land grabs, demonstrating a concern in this regard to the potential consequences of their

actions. Unfortunately their approach has not only put their lives on their own... [Inaudible, 00:33:40] ...but it also exacerbated tensions with communities.

The land grabs often result in confrontations with the South African Police Force, leading to a volatile and unsafe environment for all involved, crippling service delivery to our most vulnerable communities. As a direct consequence both the ANC... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Maseko, please conclude, your time has expired.

Ms L M MASEKO: I will just go to the last paragraph. I had a lot to say.

The SPEAKER: Hon Maseko, please just conclude the sentence. [Interjections.] Hon members, allow the member to conclude.

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Speaker, the only government that has to date put its money where its mouth is, is the DA in the Western Cape. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Masako. Please take your seat. [Interjections.] Order, members! Members, before the next member speaks, hon Marran! Members, you are offending the member on the floor's time when you continuously interject. That is not how the debate or the intention of this debate should run, so can I please ask that for the remainder of this

Speaker's List that you please allow the members to make their presentation and if you are on the Speaker's List you will have an opportunity to rebut.

Hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, Speaker.

We want to thank the EFF for bringing this Subject for Discussion to the House today and as the ANC, as it is well-known, we have previously raised that the key obstacle to land redistribution in the Western Cape is the Democratic Alliance, not other obstacles, and that remains the case today. Access to land for farming is but one issue. It is about access to land for human settlements, industry, small business and also social development.

The DA and Premier Winde in particular have not directed any resources to land redistribution in the Western Cape. They are fighting tooth and nail against the Expropriation Bill. They do not have the political will to change the unequal and discriminatory ownership pattern of agricultural land in our province. Apartheid, colonialism and an exploitative form of racial capitalism resulted in land dispossession of the majority of people, and placed it under the ownership of a racially exclusive minority.

The ANC strategy around land reform is built on three pillars: firstly, the restitution of land, secondly security of tenure, and thirdly, the critical issue of land redistribution.

The ANC in fact has made positive gains in regard to land restitution, more than 80 000 claims lodged nationally with just under 7 000 still outstanding. About 12 000 claims lodged in the Western Cape with only 266 still outstanding. What this amounts to is 2,9 million hectares nationally with just over 8 300 hectares in the Western Cape.

Let us look at Ebenhaeser, Covie, Elandskloof, Beeswater, also Richmond, Ndabeni and Tramway. These are all the result of the land restitution policy of the ANC. Our province faces serious challenges and massive housing backlogs, poverty, unemployment, across most municipalities, the ongoing legacy. The facts are that less than 3% of agricultural land is owned by black farmers, African, Coloured and Indian, 3%.

In the Western Cape the patterns of urban land ownership are racially skewed. White South Africans own 70% of such urban land. Coloured South Africans only 10%, Indians, 8% and Africans 3,5%. This in stark contrast to the demographics of the Western Cape as per census 2011, Coloured people constituting 48,8%, African people 32,8%, Indian, 1% and White South Africans 15%.

It is only in the Western and Northern Cape where in regard to urban land ownership, that the historically white population own the majority of urban land. In all other provinces the majority of urban land is owned by the black majority, African, Coloured and Indian.

The DA does not hear the cries of those trying to access and develop Sowesia near Groot Brak. They do not assist black farmers in KwaNonqaba Mossel Bay. They, however, do support the Stellenbosch Municipality who continues to lease vast tracts of agricultural land to white farmers – long leases at next to nothing. They continue to ignore African and Coloured farmers in Stellenbosch.

Dit is waarom die DA die groot struikelblok is, wanneer dit kom by grond in die Weskaap. Dit is die DA, niemand of niks anders.

Given that we have no political will from the DA and the crisis of landlessness is deepening, we as the ANC want to make a proposal for the way forward. Colleagues, we have a choice. We can either let this situation continue and worsen which will deepen inequality and poverty, or we can decide to come together and enter into social compacts at district and local level to address these challenges.

The current situation of access to land is the original South African sin, as described by President Ramaphosa. The violent dispossession of the land of the majority of African people, first nation people by racist colonial powers such as the Dutch, the English and French. It is unsustainable. We need to work together across all spheres of Government and with our communities, labour and business.

The former is a recipe for conflict and violence and populist calls for land

invasions. As the ANC we propose regional and local social compacts which will identify public and private land and then release such land to those who suffered unfair discrimination under apartheid – African, Coloured and Indian. We have thus decided to embark on a campaign of land identification and release across the 30 municipalities and gathering information on:

- All municipal, provincial, national and SOE land and buildings in their municipality.
- All existing leases of municipal land including the duration and costs of such leases.
- All land owned by public and private trusts, *commonage / meentgrond*.
- Well-located private land which is suitable for integrated human settlements, formal agriculture, urban agriculture, arts and culture and LED.

As the Leader of the Opposition I am arranging an opportunity for our caucus to brief the inter-Ministerial Committee on land, which is a Cabinet Committee chaired by Deputy President.

†Ons gaan nie wag vir agb Premier Winde.

[We are not going to wait for hon Premier Winde.]

†Soze silindele lo nkulumbuso.

[We will not wait for this Premier]

†Ons sal vir 'n ewigheid wag as ons vir die agbare Winde wag.

[We will wait for an eternity if we have to wait for the hon Winde.]

We are inviting all leaders of all political parties in this House to join the campaign for the identification and release of land to those who suffered unfair discrimination, and the establishment of social compacts. We are not going to wait for all these orders to be completed.

There are farmers farming vegetables on the wetlands along the N2 near Khayelitsha. This is City land. We will fight on behalf and with these farmers for a long term lease of the wetlands farming area.

There is Tafelberg, SABC, Rocklands, Die Bult Hoërskool property in George, Sowesia, Powertown, all these communities that are land-insecure. We urge communities across all regions to discuss these matters and come forward with proposals at local level which will advance security of tenure, speed up land restitution and most importantly advance land redistribution.

We have seen the bold step taken by the Theewaterskloof Municipality in the Overberg to award a long term lease to small scale Coloured farmers. We urge other municipalities to follow this route. While the DA complains about not getting access to national land, they continue selling land. It is municipal land.

†Hulle verkoop die grond aan hulle vriende. Dit is wat hulle doen in die Stad Kaapstad en Mosselbaai en ander plekke.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[They are selling the land to their friends. That is what they are doing in the City of Cape Town and Mossel Bay and other places.]

It is critical that the long awaited Expropriation Bill is finalised by the National Assembly this year.

†Die ANC ondersteun die Onteieningswetsontwerp. Die DA staan dit teen, hulle maak swart gevaar-geluide maar hulle belieg die mense. Hulle belieg die mense.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The ANC supports the Expropriation Bill. The DA opposes it, they are making *swart gevaar* noises but they lie to the people. They lie to the people.]

We also want to identify well located private land, the land shall be shared amongst those who work it. There shall be security and comfort.

†En die beste manier om die grootste struikelblok teen grondhervorming uit die weg uit te kry is om een besluit te maak. Die DA moet gaan. Die DA moet begrawe word volgende jaar en ons gaan dit doen.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[And the best way to remove the greatest obstacle to land reform is to take one decision. The DA has to go. The DA must be buried next year and we're going to do it.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, hon Dugmore, your time...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Amandla! [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Your time has expired. Hon members, I now recognise the hon De Villiers. [Interjections.]

Order members! Order members, there is a member on the floor. Hon De Villiers, you may continue.

Mr P T DE VILLIERS: Hon Speaker, the Western Cape likes to compare itself favourably to other provinces, but whether you agree or not, the assessment depends on where you live, and where you live 30 years after the end of apartheid, still largely depends on the colour of your skin. If you are a person of colour who works the land you are most likely to work other people's land because you do not own land yourself. This pattern of land ownership ensures the continuation of the socio-economic and spatial exclusion of the past.

Speaker, last week we discussed the importance of the benefits of AGOA. The prices of the Western Cape fruit and wine products are competitively priced on the US market. You could argue that this benefits people of colour through job creation, but it does nothing to transform structural exclusion from land and production ownership. Because farmers without land are like rugby players without a ball, they may know the game, but they are unable to play it.

Speaker, we live in one of the most beautiful parts of the world but the glitz and glamour of this well-run province hide a shamefully unaddressed pattern of exclusion that extends across from the West Coast to the Garden Route. Our agricultural sector has enormous potential to expand by creating opportunities for the less fortunate through training subsidies and provision of land. As representatives of the people it is up to us to turn our backs on the pattern of exclusion from land that slavery, colonialism and apartheid bequeathed and prioritised going down the road. Thank you, Speaker.
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon De Villiers. [Interjections.]
Order, members! Order! [Interjections.] Order members! Thank you, hon members. I will now recognise the next Speaker, the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I welcome this debate in this House and I am just very sorry that the sponsor

of the debate is not here because the model that he proposed is based on Venezuela. Thank you, Premier, for the information you sent me earlier this morning. The premise of this, hon member, is based on Venezuela. What happened in Venezuela? Here is the story.

They changed the Constitution in 1999, exactly what the EFF wants. They expropriated it without compensation in 2011, exactly what the EFF wants. Politicians benefited from land reform, exactly what the EFF wants. There was food production decline, exactly what will happen under their system; food shortage will happen, exactly as they foresee; food queues will happen all over South Africa. This is what will happen if we implement that. More riots will happen, as it happened in Venezuela, but more importantly, food trucks will be hijacked as a result of the food shortages – what happened in Venezuela. It cannot happen in South Africa. They brought in the army in Venezuela to distribute the food. This cannot happen in South Africa. The army had to distribute food, nobody on the borders. So you can imagine what happened there; total collapse of the economy in Venezuela and the net result, hon members, one million percentage of inflation.

This is not the model that we want to promote, but we welcome this debate, hon Speaker, because in the Western Cape Government and the Democratic Alliance, we support land reform. We must have land reform. For South Africa to succeed, we must have land reform and we must have it because this is the only viable solution, but we all know, as the Premier has indicated in his comments here, it is the responsibility of the National Department and

they have absolutely abdicated their responsibility and I am concerned because this is now clearly tied to food production and food security. We cannot go down the road of Venezuela. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, the DA does not support the land grabbing of the hon member of that side of the House, grab the land, because that is greedy, thieving of corrupt ANC whose version of land reform we have seen first hand with Ivan Cloete at Colenso, where the ANC wanted to grab the land and give it to an ANC comrade. That is their model of land reform – it's not going to happen in the Western Cape. I went there and I made sure that it is being stopped – not going to happen here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.] Order, members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon members, I think we know what the ANC model is, it is accumulation of wealth of the privileged few, not empowering the poor, and we certainly cannot support this. But, hon Speaker, the National Government's attempt to achieve land reform and land use has been a spectacular disaster. The former Minister of Land Reform, Nkwinti, he has put on record that he said: "My Government's land reform project is a 100% failure."

Now if your Minister that is responsible for managing it makes that statement it is clear the ANC has failed in land reform. This process has not been very successful and so we know... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip of the Opposition, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I just want to ask the MEC to speak softer, please.

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order, hon Chief Whip. Hon Minister, you may continue, but before you continue, hon members, can I please again caution you that running commentary is not allowed and it is not for the speaker on the floor to raise his or her voice in order to become audible because you are drowning out the speaker. That is not parliamentary. So can I please ask that you do not force the speaker to speak louder by your running commentary, drowning out the speaker.

Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Chief Whip of the Official Opposition. I will speak softer. Because the ANC's model of land reform is like this: they want to take your property without compensation. You do not own it, you rent it. The State owns your property and you become landless. What a failure! And so there is an alternative. The Democratic Alliance says, keep your property. We respect your investment, successful land reform, you must own your property, you must not rent the property. You must receive title deeds and you become the land owner, and so hon Speaker, we are following a different approach. It is called a commodity

approach for land reform. We established this in 2009 under the DA Government. We made sure that there are institutional arrangements because we can shout here and make noises, ultimately we have to put people on the land so that they can farm the land and so we use an institutional framework, a commodity approach and so we have seen some outcomes, and so, hon Speaker, we create an ecosystem of support to new farmers through market access. I want people that have land, they must successfully farm. They must have market access. We must give them mentorship, skills development based on the existing commodity networks.

The Department uses this approach to deliver targeted interventions followed by agricultural extension advisory services and we see positive outcomes for land reform. Through this approach, hon Speaker, the deciduous fruit sector was awarded R120 million from the Job Fund for the commercialisation of 20 Black commercial farmers. We support them to export the stuff. That is what we want. In fact, it is much more than what the National Government has set aside for Black farmers in this province. Since 2015, it aims at establishing 300 hectares of fruit trees up to 2029 and it created five 500 new jobs within the fruit industry and at the end of the programme, over R200 million had been invested in the deciduous fruit sector for land reform and so we will continue. But I think everything that this Government does, must be measured, and so we put up our land reform system in the Western Cape for independent evaluation, not by this Government and in 2019 the evaluation confirmed 72% success based on five critical factors: access to market, compliance with labour law and tax laws; extension to its business,

reinvestment in profits and the existence of sales and production records and the existence of a current updated business plan.

This is a model that works. This is the model that we promote in the Western Cape. This is the model where we see the results and the key benefits of the commodity approach and I think colleagues on that side of the House support the commodity approach to land reform. They are the commodity organisations who assist in terms of the struggling land reform projects and we support the process that work with commodities' organisations and mentoring and we also look at proper selecting of these beneficiaries. So the Western Cape Department of Agriculture is also responsible for skills audit of farmers, training of farmers, compulsory on-site visits, market readiness for training, access to markets, value adding to products, financial record keeping, product record keeping, the appointment of mentors in conjunction with the commodity partners.

Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture also collaborates with the PALS initiative and members are aware of this site. I am so happy that side of the House supports this initiative because it is a private-led land reform initiative.

I am so sorry, my friend, the hon member Klaas is not here. He sponsored the debate and he runs away from his own debate, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] Given the limited budget allocation for land reform in the Western Cape, we welcome and appreciate the PALS System.

Hon Speaker, while the ANC Government claims to be very serious about land reform, their budget, the allocation reflects a completely different story and so, hon Speaker, our land reform model works and it is continuing to work.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I want to conclude, hon Speaker, to say that there are two models of land reform. One that says that Government own the land, and you must rent it...

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon Minister. Please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The second model says, you must own it and we believe people must own the land.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I also want to thank hon

Klaas of the EFF who sponsored this debate, namely lack of access to the land for the poor, marginalised emerging Black farmers including African, Coloured and Indian in the Western Cape. But Speaker, we know that land reform is important and it must happen, but Speaker, to everybody this seems like a very noble gesture by the EFF, but the fact is they are talking about access but not ownership because the EFF leader is on record, speaking in Cape Town saying when the EFF governs all land must belong to the State so everybody will be landless, everybody will not own any property. So the question is, is this a noble debate or is this playing with words? I think the EFF is playing with words and the important thing is, I want to inform the voters of the Western Cape, I want to inform the voters of the South Africa, under EFF Rule you will have no property, you will have nothing and you will not have inheritance to your children. So Speaker, I want to say this is a policy position of the EFF, to take land away from the people. They are a danger to this country and we must stop them in 2024.

I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians.

I now recognise the hon Brinkhuis on the hybrid system.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Province is reported to have the most lucrative agricultural economy in South Africa but yet the Province has failed land transformation to promising Black farmers. Black people in the Western Cape own only 1%

of agricultural land in the province and the rest of the sector remains in the hands of White people.

In 2018, when the hon Premier was MEC for Economic Opportunities, he admitted to the Western Cape's slow pace of land reform. Five years later, nothing, nothing has changed. The Province must put a stop to illegal farm evictions and put methods in place to give farm dwellers a genuine option to own agricultural land so they can continue to live and farm on land they have been living on for decades.

The few black farmers are not getting enough support from the agri business, and many are doomed for failure. There must be strong support from the Commodity Approach System to ensure Black farmers continue to farm successfully and are not forced to rent out their farms to established White farmers. Black people face tremendous red tape and other challenges to get their land back. They are disadvantaged by the existing situation and land reform and the Province is further entrenching a system to keep Black people and Black farmers landless. The need for agricultural land is rising among Black people.

Al Jama-ah calls on Opposition parties who want to see justice for Black farmers to speak with one voice and to defeat this... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Brinkhuis, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: ...and to defeat the system, thank you, hon Speaker, and to defeat the system which deliberately withholds agricultural land from Black people.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. Speaker, I think this topic is one of the most interesting ones that have been discussed in this House in recent weeks. The issue is a complex one and one which is informed by multiple political, economic and historic factors, but what I have heard thus far from the Opposition has not been very inspiring. My hon friends in their singular in the EFF seem to think that land redistribution will be some sort of silver bullet that will solve the problems of this country and of this province. Speaker, I hate to be the one to spoil this fantasy. It will not.

Rather, the EFF's plans for land redistribution will lead to further chaos, further lawlessness, further instability at a time when our country can ill afford any further missteps. As I speak to you now our currency is in freefall, driven in large part by the ANC's insistence on supporting an illegal and unjust war in Ukraine, even though some of their members have argued that when the Rand falls, you can pick them up.

What the ANC has done, they have converted South Africa into a pariah state. Food prices, by contrast, continue to rise, as do the interest rates and the number of investors, businesses and recent graduates are fleeing our shores.

Speaker, we as a country are on a collision course with disaster led by a National Government. What our country needs is not more chaos, not more high-minded political ideology spewed by populous demagogues, but to be clear, Speaker, we in the DA recognise the injustices of the past.

We do support land reform, but not in the chaotic corruption, susceptible and economically catastrophic and unjust way proposed by those members opposite in red, in green, black and gold. [Interjections.]

If land reform is to be achieved without destroying our economy and creating economic hardships for millions more people, it will take a sober, effective leadership, leadership that the DA has a proven track record of.

On Tuesday, Minister Bheki Cele released South Africa's latest crime statistics. At this point, we know what to expect from these figures and yet they still somehow manage to prove shocking every single time. Almost 6 300 people murdered in the last 90 days, an instance of contact crime every 50 seconds, 146 sexual assaults per day! Frankly, Speaker, I do not understand how Minister Cele can still face the people of this country, given

this utter failure to stop our country being engulfed by a tidal wave of crime, especially crime in our rural areas.

In fact, Speaker, the only place where this continuous tide of violence shows any sign of abating is here in the Western Cape. We have seen a 14,1% reduction in murder and a 9,9% reduction in rapes. Our LEAP officers have shown their worth like never before with Nyanga and Mfuleni, both dropping down the ranks of the most violent police precincts in this country. In the rural areas where our farmers and farm workers live we have seen that we are the only province in this country where the emerging Black farmers that the EFF and the ANC claim to fight for, make their living, we remain the only province to maintain our own dedicated boots on the ground, rural safety units. They work to ensure that those who live in these communities are kept safe and that they are not left behind. Speaker, I feel that I do not need to remind this House... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: I feel like I do not need to remind this House that the protection of our rural communities and our agricultural sector is not only about justice, but security, without adequate protection for our farmers and the logistical chains which keep us fed, our current problems with food inflation and the unavailability will look minor in comparison.

This Government understands that protecting our residents is not only

something that should be done to make our community safer, but something that has a greater effect on our society as a whole.

Speaker, I wrote on the issue of crime to illustrate my point. The ANC and the EFF says that they want to help people, but they have absolutely no idea how to do so. The EFF parades about on social media performing facile publicity stunts and spewing baseless rhetoric with zero plan to actually help people and the ANC seems intent on turning us into a Mafia state devoid of jobs, devoid of safety and devoid of hope.

Both parties spend so much time speaking of what ought to be instead of what actually is. They are incapable of confronting reality. They fail to understand that good, effective governance is needed to right the ship and that this needs to happen now. To fix this country, to restore hope, we need concrete, solid steps that need to be taken urgently and that is what the DA has to offer. By contrast, the ANC and the EFF's plans to improve South Africa can be summed up in one word – and out of deference to you, Speaker, I will not say that word in this Chamber, but it was used by Minister Thandi Modise in the National Assembly last week to describe what she claims was loaded onto a Russian cargo ship. I will give us all a hint. The word consists of two syllables, the latter which rhymes with “hall”.

By contrast to all of us, Speaker, this DA-led Western Cape Provincial Government soldiers forward quietly bringing real solutions to our residents. That is the reason why our Province is on track to halve the murder rate by

2029 and why we are the only province that is eliminating load-shedding for good. That is why we are the only province creating thousands of new jobs and in 2024, that is why the people of this province and of this nation and this province can look forward to a brighter future and through you, hon Speaker, I want to remind hon Bans that she is in the best-run province. She asked. Where is she? She is in the best-run province, the Western Cape.

I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bosman. I now recognise the hon Marais on the virtual platform.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you Speaker. Speaker, the issue of and the process of land restitution was debated, argued and finally agreed to at Codesa and [Inaudible.] between credible ANC leaders like Nelson Mandela, Walter Sisulu, Joe Slovo and the Freedom Front Plus leader at the time, General Constand Viljoen.

This agreement, Article 25, was mediated by the United States. For discredited ANC and EFF leaders to now demand amendments, is treason. It is spitting on the graves of their former leaders like Nelson Mandela and Sisulu.

The Freedom Front Plus will not and cannot support any amendments to Article 25 or any attempt at land grabs.

South Africa was formed in 1910, not in 2023. It was formed by the United Kingdom, whose colonies Natal, Transvaal, Cape Colony and Orange Free State were merged into the Union of South Africa in 1910. The ANC was not formed then. There was not even sight of the EFF. They know nothing about these talks and at the time they gave the Griquas Griqualand East and Griqualand West. Griqualand West used to be No Man's Land. It did not belong to anybody, and that is why it is still called Griqualand West. We have legitimate claims. Yes, the Griquas have legitimate claims. Also the TRANCRAA Act, which was formerly the Missionary Act of 1910, has given 23 rural areas to Coloured communities, first to the missionaries and now in 1998, the ANC Government wrote the TRANCRAA, that those colonies and those areas must be transferred to Coloured people.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr P J MARAIS: I therefore want to say let us stick to agreements. Let us not give in to land-grabbers. They have nothing to offer this country but to lead it to destruction. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Thank you very much. The next speaker is hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, Speaker. Good afternoon Premier, members present. I am not going to respond to all the previous speakers, but I just want to tell

some of the members, the hon Gillion, that our currency is in freefall because of your leader that listened to gossip, rushed to the USA and told them stories.

One would have thought after the US Ambassador had clarified the issue and have apologised to the South African people, one would have thought that your leader will rush again and tell them: "Look, but I have lied to you."

MEC, you told us about title deeds. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Ja, the title deeds, ja.

Mr P MARRAN: Tell us about Amalienstein and Waaikraal, two farms that are under your management. Ten years ago you promised the people of Dysseldorp and Zoar that you will hand over and give title deeds to them. Ten years later it is not the case. You cannot even manage two farms.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, please speak to the Chair.

Mr P MARRAN: Through you, Speaker, through you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, hon please take your seat. Hon Minister, is that an indication of a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It is a point of order. I hear that the hon member is asking me a question. Can I answer it?

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Hon Marran, have you posed a question to the hon MEC?

Mr P MARRAN: No. So Speaker, through you, the MEC cannot even manage two farms. Can you tell us about the ANC, two farms, that you have failed the people, the MEC has failed the people of Zoar and the people of Amalienstein for the last 10 to 13 years. [Interjections.]

Speaker, the hon Matlhodi Maseko, she could have chosen... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr P MARRAN: She could have chosen Helen Zille or Tony Leon but she chose to quote the ANC's Thabo Mbeki. [Interjections.] It clearly tells you there are no people in the DA that she can quote. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Members! Hon Marran, please take your seat, because, I apologise and I just think it is my duty to protect you on the floor. Can I please ask that the members on my left and right please allow hon Marran to make his contribution to this debate? I think it is highly disrespectful while the member is on the floor, when you are drowning out the member. Interjections are allowed, but please note that the minute you drown out the

speaker it affects and infringes on their rights. Hon Marran, you may continue.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, thanks, thanks, Speaker. We are not in a process to change Section 25 of the Constitution. We do not have to, because the 1975 Expropriation Bill give us the opportunity to amend that particular Bill to make sure that expropriation in the interest of the public gets to reality. We are busy with that particular process, so do not be confused with the 1975 Expropriation Bill and the property clause as it is in the Constitution. We are dealing with the Expropriation Bill and, Speaker, we only need six provinces to push that particular Bill through. The ANC is in charge of eight. We are going to push it through. It is going to become a reality. That is a given.

Hon Speaker, the ANC welcomes this debate on the South African land question, a thorny and very emotive subject as millions of our land hungry people still live on the outskirts of cities and towns, as far away as possible from places of economic opportunities. Our people remain landless due to centuries long land dispossession and economic exclusion. The month of June is a stark reminder of that painful past as it marks the 110th anniversary of the 1913 Native Land Act, which legislated the centuries-long dispossession of land which started with the arrival of the Dutch East India Company (VOC) in Cape Town in 1652.

About the Native Land Act, Sol Plaatje, the founding member of the ANC and

its first General Secretary remarked:

“Awakening on Friday morning, June 20, 1913, the South African native found himself, not actually, a slave, but a pariah in the land of his country of birth.”

Through this legislation, Black people were prohibited from owning 93% of the land, while demarcating the remaining 7% of native reserves. Bessie Head is indeed correct when she said:

“It is possible that no other Black legislation has so deeply affected the lives of Black people in South Africa as the Natives’ Land Act of 1913. It created overnight a floating, landless proletariat whose labour could be used and manipulated at will, and ensured that the land had finally and securely passed into the hands of the ruling White race.”

Through this legislation large pockets of land were reserved exclusively for ownership and use by White people, thereby dividing our country into prosperous Whites-only areas on the one side and increasingly impoverished concentration camps for Black people on the outskirts of cities, on the other side.

The Group Areas Act of 1950 is another piece of legislation that had a similar impact. 110 years later, South Africa is still struggling to redress this historical injustice.

In 1994, it was estimated that 83% of agricultural land was owned by White capital. This has not changed much since then. In 2018 the African Farmers Association of South Africa (AFASA) claimed that Black people owned only 1% of agricultural land in the Western Cape and that the entire value chain of the sector is White-owned. Stats SA's 2021 Agricultural Survey showed that the province with the largest income from sales of goods and services in the agriculture and related services industry in 2021 was the Western Cape with R74,9 billion or 19,5% of the industry total.

It is without doubt that the R74,9 billion is in the hands of Whites and this is what the DA is defending when it says the people must vote against the Expropriation Bill.

Hon Speaker, to accelerate the land reform process, the ANC resolved at its 54th Conference to allow for expropriation of land without compensation to take place. This is a necessary step to right the wrongs of the past. Expropriation Bill public hearings have started in the Western Cape. The ANC calls on all residents of our province to attend the hearings in numbers and support the Bill.

This is the same thing that they are doing on the BELA Bill. The DA is anti-transformational and has no interest in redressing the historical injustices. The enemies of progress and apartheid beneficiaries led by the DA are encouraging the people to vote against the Bill. This is not in the best

interest of the people but to protect the privileges of the few.

The same privileges can be seen in the H-2A program, the US initiative to allow employers or agents to bring foreign nationals to the United States to fill temporary agricultural jobs. Over 95% of all employees from the Western Cape are White, something that has been raised as a concern by the US Consulate-General to both the MEC and us as a Committee, who went over to California not so long ago. The above proves that the DA is a party for Whites-only interests and this is why it must be voted out of power next year.

Hon Speaker, despite slow progress and land reform, the ANC has done a good job to acquire land and redistribute it. For instance, in April 2021, the National Government handed over 764 000 hectares of land to the Covie community, near Plettenberg Bay in the Western Cape, after a successful land settlement claim, as part of efforts to accelerate land reform. The land is expected to positively impact 411 households' ability to gain financial freedom.

Moreover, the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Land took a resolution in 2019 that all State-owned land identified as suitable to be released for human settlement development through issuing power of attorney to the Housing Development Agency to enable the agency to undertake development preparation, planning and coordinated development implementation in collaboration with other spheres and sectors of government.

As a result of this, the National Department of Public Works and Infrastructure released over 35 hectares of land in the province. This includes pockets of land in Drakenstein, Mossel Bay, Stellenbosch and the City of Cape Town. In June 2016 a deed of sale was signed by the CEOs of HDA and SANRAL for the 55,124 hectares of land owned by SANRAL for the Knysna Corridor Development Project. Only 30 hectares were transferred to HDA. The balance was transferred to Knysna Municipality for human settlements. There are also portions of land...

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, please conclude, your time has expired.

Mr P MARRAN: There are other portions of land at Wingfield Military land and Tamboerskloof site that may be released for human settlements.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: This proves once more that the ANC is hard at work correcting the wrongs of the past.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Thank you, hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: I thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, before we conclude, there is one more speaker before we conclude the debate. I just want to remind members, that

when I indicate that your time has expired, your time has actually expired. It is part of Parliamentary Rules where a certain time is allocated per political party and allocated to a member. Can I please ask that you do not defy the Chair, and I am speaking to both sides of the House, when you are called to conclude, I was a bit lenient today because we had some time, and I allowed you to finish your sentences, but it does not mean that you can go on and on and on, and that is a general statement for both sides of the House. Now I have seen the hon Minister on my right and hon Marran on my left, so I will acknowledge you in that fashion. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Speaker, I want to rise on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Yes, sir.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: One of the values of this Government is caring. The member that is sponsoring the debate, we just want to find out from the hon member if he is fine, whether we need any medical support for the hon member... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Minister, that is not a point of order, so I am not going to entertain that. On my left-hand side, hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, I just want to check with you as the Presiding

Officer of this House, because through the speeches and even when the MEC has spoken, you have said his time is up, but allowed him to conclude, and I have not heard you basically speak from the top towards the MEC, and what you have done to me now. I thought, Speaker, you said my time is up, but conclude, which I have done. Now I am getting a warning from you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, firstly, I did not address you. I addressed the principle of when your time is up, your time is up, and without justifying my rulings because this is not the platform to do so, I in fact to that particular Minister that you are referring to, I in fact did do exactly that, and you can check, you can check the Hansard and you can check the transcripts so I will not entertain that any further and I will now recognise the hon Simmers. You may continue, hon Simmers. [Interjections.]

You may continue, hon Simmers. I heard that, hon Marran. You may continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, the Premier, my Cabinet colleagues, all members of the House and those online, but also our citizens following today's session, that are logged in. Firstly, thank you for member Klaas in absentia, for sponsoring I think it is quite a prudent subject matter for discussion, but Speaker, a few days ago when we experienced heavy rains across vast areas in our province, I hope that the member who sponsored today's debate actually visited such of these low-lying areas where land was actually invaded thanks to his party's and that of

the ANC's mantra with the notion of unoccupied land must be invaded or expropriated, and need I remind this House of the hon Dugmore's infamous SMS of 2018, which led to numerous land invasions in Overstrand, and those are facts, not gossip, like the hon member loves to peddle in this House.

Those destitute residents who have been misled by the EFF and the ANC party's chants, hon Speaker, now every winter since then, wake up to their informal structures flooded and their goods damaged. I think they would ultimately tell these two parties and their leadership even within this province that they have now vehemently manipulated these citizens, forcing them into a desperate situation, needing them to believe that what they were doing were right, invading land with the hope of jumping the queue to actually get a housing opportunity.

†So dankie vir jou SMS, agbare, deur jou Speaker, die agbare Dugmore se SMS is baie effektief of was baie effektief vir verkeerde redes.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[So thank you for your SMS, hon, through you Speaker, the hon Dugmore's SMS is very effective or was very effective for the wrong reasons.]

But these calls have not only cost the State millions of rands, hon Speaker, over the years, but it is has also endangered now the lives of these citizens living in these low-lying flood-prone areas, but what has been the cost of the

infamous SMS, among other things, and the incitement by other ANC structures in this province and the EFF and this is how costly the picture of land invasion looks, as we speak, hon Speaker.

In the year prior to COVID-19, the Department of Human Settlements spent R28,5 million to protect land that was earmarked for human settlements' development. However, following the incitement by the EFF and the ANC in this province and at the national level, encouraging residents to occupy land that was unoccupied, the very next year our expense in terms of the protection of land across this province ballooned to R340 million for the 2020/21 financial year, but it did not stop there. During the financial year of 2021/22, my Department spent a further R162 million across this province to protect land earmarked for settlement development.

R142,8 million of that spend was within the Metro, which saw the biggest insurgent surge in terms of orchestrated land invasions across certain areas across the City of Cape Town.

Hon Speaker, effectively all the amounts that I have just mentioned, and I exclude the bulk infrastructure cost that could have unlocked a lot of housing opportunities for our province, close to 1 000 housing opportunities for fully State subsidised housing assistance have been lost forever because of these actions by these two parties.

Approximately 600 people's lives, which we could have changed for the

better, who were qualifying beneficiaries, will no longer be in a position to have the quality of their lives bettered. They will now have to wait even longer. Once again, thanks to the infamous 2018 SMS. Thanks to the ANC in the Western Cape. Thanks to the EFF in the Western Cape and on a national scale. This is the cost when you peddle lies and you peddle rumours and you are trying to incite people by festering on their need for adequate housing opportunities.

Hon Speaker, in the last three years thus, we have seen in excess of 1 600 successful land invasions across our province. Let that sink in – the impact of one SMS and inciting the people to do what is wrong, all done with the hope of benefiting in the Local Government Election.

Hon Chair, as at 1 April, which means this financial year to date, my Department has already spent R10 million to secure land and to protect our sites. How many more people's lives could we not have changed? Instead, we now have to protect what so needs to be protected.

Coming to the matter of the Expropriation Bill, and any functional democracy and thank heavens our country still is a functional democracy. You cannot speak of "zero-sum compensation." That does not work. The security of tenure, the right for people to own their land and to do with their land as they wish, is enshrined in our Constitution. But once again, we can see on a national level, just like we can see in this Legislature today, just like we can see in this province, the ANC is a zombie party. All of their ideas are

zombie-orientated, with a zombie Opposition Leader in this House, who has no backbone. He only peddles lies and he peddled rumours and incites people through SMSes. That is what the ANC means in this province.
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that parliamentary, Speaker?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: That is what they try to accomplish through these ridiculous introduction of Bills and their comments.
[Interjections.] Hon Speaker... [Interjection.]

†Ek weet dit maak seer. Die waarheid maak altyd seer. [Tussenwerpsels.]
[I know it hurts. The truth always hurts.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members. Hon Minister, there is – please take your seat. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order? Is that a point of order, please?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, on a point of order, Chair, is it parliamentary for the hon MEC to refer to the hon Dugmore as a zombie? That is not the kind of language that we are supposed to use in this House.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, hon Minister, did you refer to any member in this House, hon member, as a zombie?

HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, I said the ANC in this House is a zombie. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, order members! [Interjections.]

Ms A BANS: Uh-uh, in the House, in your presence [Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Rising like zombies.

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip. My apologies, Chief Whip. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, because your hand was up first. I will recognise you and then the Chief Whip.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Speaker, I quite clearly heard the hon Simmers say that the Leader of the Opposition is a zombie so if you want to consult the Hansard I think you could do so, but it is quite clear for all of us he must withdraw that remark. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon members, as per the Rules and Procedures I posed that, on your point of order, I asked the Minister did he refer to any hon member in this House as a zombie, and he said no, he did not. He referred to a political party. What I will do is I will consult Hansard and I will revert back to the House.

Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you. I am covered with your latter response, because I was going to request that you listen to the Hansard, because I clearly heard him say with a "zombie-like Leader of the Opposition." Those were his direct words.

The SPEAKER: Alright, I will do so and I will revert back to the House. Hon Minister, you may continue.

Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, I had my hand up on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip, Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker, the hon Bosman from across the floor is now asking: "Where are the other zombies?" I think this is inappropriate. Let us move away from this. Let us get to the business of the House.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can I just remind members... [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, I do not know if you see my hand, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: ...that we are all hon members in this House and can we please respect one another as hon members. My apologies, hon Marais, is that a point of order?

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes, Speaker. Speaker, when you do give your ruling finally, I just want you to compare the word "zombie" to the word "racist" and say whether "racist" is acceptable, even a poster held up saying "racist" is acceptable but not "zombie" and tell us what is the difference, please.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, that is not a point of order. If you have an objection to any of my rulings or previous rulings, please follow the parliamentary procedure to do so.

Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, much of the Opposition comments are focused on what is perceived to be the DA's reluctance in terms of addressing the issue of land and also enabling the use of our own State-owned land in the interest of our people, so let me just put the record straight seeing that the Department of Infrastructure is the custodian of all of our Province's land and I will mention a perfect few examples which I think is quite pertinent which the members of this House irrespective of party, must be made aware of. These are facts, not fiction.

Earlier today, we saw the announcement by Minister NomaFrench Mbombo that the Netcare Ceres Hospital building has now been officially transferred through to the Provincial Department of Health. This means that this building will now be repurposed to serve the greater Ceres community and those surrounding communities would also benefit from this hospital.

This is but one example where through a caring Government such as the DA-led Western Cape, we are ensuring that thousands of people will now benefit from the Ceres Hospital with access to quality healthcare in their reach.

So this is a Government that truly prioritises the well-being of its citizens because too many buildings and land parcels, unfortunately, which were earmarked by this Department through its other sister departments have either been invaded or organisations have been encouraged by people within the ANC and the EFF to actually invade these portions of land or buildings which were earmarked to improve our people's lives.

Hon Speaker, on the one hand, we have an ANC that has been sleeping at the wheel for nearly 30 years. That is a fact. You can see the country has been on autopilot for many, many years, but we have all had to watch horribly in great horror the dismal failure of the ANC's version of land reform through their various examples which they boastfully did so, posed here again today in the House.

However, the same party is very quick, hon Speaker, and opportunistic to jump on a bandwagon to start peddling certain matters to the citizens of our province without having all the facts, but what else could we expect from a party that is on autopilot led by a zombie at the national level? What else could we expect, hon Speaker?

Hon Speaker, further examples of where we are empowering small scale farmers, once again you think of utilising our land in various non-metro areas, Sandkraal Farm, which is in George, a land which has now been effectively earmarked and transferred to the Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development for those small-scale farmers in Sandkraal Farm in George. But we added a provision as part of our transfer request that a functional CPA be established; that the DALRRD must be at liberty, and then only transfer the property to the CPA because we want to ensure that that will be a success story, not a wishful story which trumps up and comes out as an erroneous mistake like we have seen in other examples in other provinces where land has been transferred to small-scale farmers, but we can go one step further, it is a pity the hon Marran is not here. He mentioned Amalienstein, and Zoar, he mentioned Deyselsdorp, and I am sorry to tell the member he is once again being misinformed, but what could one expect when you depend on information from dysfunctional ANC structures instead of just looking up the correct facts on a matter?

In terms of Amalienstein, which is in Zoar, small farms, 5,6 hectares are in the process of being transferred to that community for community use, that is

fact. Secondly, in terms of the Waaikraal Farm which I believe ...
[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: No, but that is being done by National Government, not by the Provincial Government.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: The hon Marran was referring to Deyselsdorp, Oudtshoorn. Once again, hon Speaker, we are in the process of finalising the transfer to that community so that they can benefit from these two farms. These are but some of the examples I can make.

This DA-led Provincial Government over the last few years has transferred close to 18 hectares of usable land to the people. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, this is a Government, contrary, in contrast to National we do not sleep. We do not talk of land reform. We exercise land reform, functional and in the interest of the people of our province and that is what our message is to this province and our stakeholders. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, hon Minister, please take your seat. [Connection lost.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE OPPOSISIE: Moenie mense belieg nie!

[The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Don't lie to people!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. Members, that concludes the debate on this subject.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We will now move on to Interpellations as contemplated for in Rule 197. I now recognise the hon Allen, Minister Allen.

INTERPELLATIONS:

[Interpellation 1 withdrawn.]

2. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

Whether the Walking Bus Project will be reinstated; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: *Baie dankie, Speaker.* Thank you, Speaker. I wish to say thank you to member Christians for this particular interpellation and I want to reply as follows, that the Walking Bus project was established by the Department. However,

this particular project was then later moved to the City of Cape Town, and no longer resides within the Department.

It will be remiss of me to not add, Speaker, that just yesterday the Premier and myself saw similar programmes like the Walking Bus, that are being rolled out across the province by the municipalities. We have always been clear in that municipalities, Government, National Government, all have a role to play in combating safety, and in Drakenstein the Pink Ladies, for example, do similar programmes in terms of patrolling and of walking our young people to and from school, and that it is a consistent effort that we are making via our bilateral discussions with municipalities, but also with the South African Police Service. Thank you. (Audio breaks up throughout address).

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Minister, for your reply. Minister, we know how the Walking Bus concept works. It is people that walk the learners to school, and they were paid a stipend, and as you correctly say it was introduced by then Minister Plato in 2016, and when he became Mayor it was transferred to the City.

I visited a couple of schools and Minister Wenger is here, we visited the Walking Bus out in Delft when she was Standing Committee Chairperson of

Community Safety. It worked.

What I want to ask you, did you make an audit of how many Walking Buses similar to what we have now and what we had previously, because there is a decrease in the safety of our learners being at schools, visiting schools in the townships, and you ask the principal or teachers why are learners absent from school, and they will tell you it is because of turf wars. Now we know in these Walking Buses the parents, community workers that walk the children to school and back home, they are seen in the community and our children are safe. So Minister, being your Department, you know it started with your Department – it is now being Transport – but the question is, too many of our learners are not safe travelling to school, and they must walk, and when there is a fight they stay at home. It is unacceptable. They lose work. They fail. We get school dropouts because of this. It is a major, major problem, and that is why I am asking, if you can maybe look at it and see how your Department can assist maybe municipalities or whatever it is, to have Walking Buses fully operational. I do not have the numbers but the numbers have decreased significantly, and if we do not ensure that our learners get safely to school and from home, they are going to drop out and we are going to sit with a drop-out rate, and that is our biggest problem. We are trying to retain our learners in school, but then we must also help and assist with their safety. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and many thanks to the Minister for his response, and while I too would have liked to hear more on how this initiative is implemented in other municipalities, I understand it no longer falls under the purview of his Department, and I will directly engage colleagues in the City of Cape Town as well. However Speaker, I cannot help but feel that this initiative represents a continuous and recurring trend in which provincial entities such as the Minister's Department are forced to use their limited resources in order to compensate for the failures of our National Government.

In addition to initiatives like this, we know the Western Cape Education Department now also employs school resource officers to keep our children safe, so I cannot help but feel that none of this would be necessary if we have a National Government that simply fulfilled its mandate to provide safety from the start, because we know safety is the competency of SAPS.

With this in mind, Deputy Speaker, I would like to, through you, ask the Minister if he knows of any resources that SAPS has devoted to guaranteeing the safety of our learners as they make their way to and from schools, and if he can please share with us what form any resources from SAPS has taken and what has the result been from intervention from the South African Police Service, whose mandate this is.

The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Now we move

over to hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, due to the crisis of gangs in the province many children have to cross the gang parts on their way to school and in the process facing their lives in danger. This is why a group of parents, many of them who are mothers, has decided to start the Walking Bus Initiative. Member Plato, when he was the MEC, understood the importance of the initiative and adopted the project as his own. This is something he repeated when he was the Mayor of Cape Town, providing the parents with stipends and other necessary support. The ANC welcomed this in principle, because we understood the importance of communities playing a role in community safety. We always maintained that the scope of Walking Busses should be expanded to allow them to be placed in schools as well.

When member Plato was demoted to a backbencher, the project was also stopped. This is the same thing the DA did with the Blue Dot and the Red Dot Programmes, when they dealt with Madikizela. Geordin Hill-Lewis came in, said that the Walking Bus initiative was not sustainable and its budget ballooned over the years. Funds were diverted to a professionalised Community Safety Unit. In this new initiative by the Mayor, volunteers are complaining, saying that they are not getting paid for over two months. We demand an end to this exploitation of people. MEC Allen, through the Safety Plan must make provision to support communities to play an active role to the fight of crime. The MEC must tell us why this cannot be possible. I thank

you, Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I know the function of SAPS, and I know the hon member is right. SAPS is failing us, we cannot depend on SAPS, so I cannot think the safety of our learners is more important. SAPS is failing us in many, many areas, but we need to prioritise the safety of our learners and that is why I am asking the Minister to please look at that, and looking at the way forward. If you can come back or just give me a written reply to say this is where we are at the moment, but no I have been in Hanover Park, I have been in Manenberg, those are the cries of the people that our people are not safe, because you know it is terrible in the townships, you know. The one gang belongs to the one turf and the other gang to the other turf, and when there are fights our learners suffer. They get shot, they get murdered and it cannot continue, so I know you have got a small budget, but maybe your Department can play a leading role with municipalities to ensure that something similar like the Walking Bus continues. I know it is not your responsibility, it is SAPS' responsibility, but I am asking you because those are the cries for help from the community, what can the Western Cape Government do to ensure the safety of our learners going to school, and going back, and we know we have a lot of success stories of the Walking Bus and that is why that is my reference point. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I recognise Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Member Christians, thank you so much. I will definitely via my office write to each and every municipality to request an update from those municipalities with regards to their particular safety initiatives. I can confirm over the last year we have had summits in each and every district which comprised of each and every municipality, and I will definitely within 24 hours write to each and every Mayor to get an update on their particular safety initiatives in the various municipalities. Like I have said, member Bosman, through you, Deputy Speaker, just yesterday I saw the Pink Ladies doing similar initiatives like the Walking Bus within the Chicago area of Paarl, and we are always, Deputy Speaker, encouraging our municipalities to also step up further. Member Bosman, Deputy Speaker, touched on the school resource offices. I think it is very vital to also mention that the reply from a parliamentary question on 9 May 2023 from member Baartman to the Minister of Education in the Western Cape, gives information with regards to our school resource officers that also play a vital role in terms of the commute, the routes, but also safeguarding our students to and from school.

I think it is vital, Deputy Speaker, to also note that in our engagements with the South African Police Service we have seen, and I think each and every member of this particular House will be fully aware of February and of

March when there was extra visibility, extra deployment, in the area of Mfuleni and of Khayelitsha, we actually saw dramatic decreases in crime in those particular areas. It did come, however, at a huge cost in the taxi barricade in those particular areas covering Mfuleni, Khayelitsha, parts of Tafelsig as well, so we have seen the extra visibility do go a long way, and through you, Deputy Speaker, to member Bosman, I will commit to again highlight this to the Provincial Commissioner, highlight this to our district commissioners, because we need visible policing at strategic times. We know the routes that our learners are walking and as such we have always advocated for that data-led approach when we know it is school, after school, we are even engaging our MEC for Transport around when traffic officers are in certain areas, when they conduct their business, even when they go to work if they go via certain routes, because that extra visibility does go a long way.

Member Bans, thank you so much for your contribution when you spoke. I was reminded, and maybe member Sayed will also remember this time, there were probably five, six, at the height of the Station Strangler tormenting our communities, and there were forms of Walking Buses when I walked to Caradale, when people walked to various schools, so this is an initiative, in its simplicity that as a government we identify with, that we see can work, hence we are always looking at ways to foster the relationships with our municipalities to also step up. The Premier did hear your remark with regards to the budget, and I will leave it at that, because we are always looking at how we are getting, how we are advocating for extra budget so that we can make allocations to various initiatives, but, member Bans you asked a very

direct question, why this cannot be possible, why can this not be possible?

I would appeal again to members of the Opposition, the Official Opposition, that once we get to our Equitable Share debate and when those discussions happen, I will sincerely trust that the Opposition will support us because we have often seen we are not getting our fair share, and if our fair share should be landing we will definitely then have more money in order to have safety initiatives across our province. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, the hon Minister. That concludes that interpellation.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move over to Interpellation 3. I recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

3. Ms A Cassiem asked the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:

- (1) What is her Department doing to eradicate the inequality in the society by assisting small township businesses with funding for the purposes of growth;
- (2) whether there are any achievements that her Department can point out that benefited and continue to benefit small township

businesses in that regard?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Government acknowledges the immense importance and potential of the township economy in the Western Cape and South Africa. This point is demonstrated very clearly in the 2022 Provincial Economic Review and Outlook which showed that approximately 30% of employment in South Africa came from the informal economy, and 19% of employment in the Western Cape, which amounted to 439 000 jobs in the Western Cape in the first quarter of 2022. The Department of Economic Development and Tourism has now finalised the growth-for-job strategy, which is explicit in its approach that the informal and township economies are part of this All-of-Government Strategy and the document takes cognisance of the rural and urban dimensions in its approach with a clear spatial lens.

More specifically the strategy makes clear that inclusion requires growth that is jobs rich, and a spatial dimension to grow the economy in the formal, informal and township sectors. At its core is the understanding that Government needs to play a role in getting the fundamentals of growth right, such as energy, water and infrastructure, and this must include enabling the success of informal businesses, as well as formal businesses in the private sector.

Furthermore, initiatives such as assisting businesses to register and giving

them exposure to funding opportunities are important for economic growth and job creation. As such the Provincial Government actively partners and collaborates with the private sector, civil society, and other levels of Government to assist as well, through our own projects and collaborations. While the Department of Economic Development and Tourism does not provide direct funding, we do fund and support organisations that assist SMMEs, including township businesses through the SMME Booster Fund. Some of the organisations that we work with and fund include R Labs and the Bicycle Empowerment Network (BEN), as well as the Association for Savings and Investment, South Africa.

The SMMEs supported are in areas including Belhar, Bishop Lavis, Khayelitsha, Langa, Malmesbury, Ocean View, Masiphumelele, Mitchells Plain, Montagu, Beaufort West and Gugulethu. The support provided to these businesses through our partnerships and funding enables them to be sustainable to expand and to employ more people. In addition to the SMME Booster Fund and through the Business Development Support Programme, the Department provided township businesses in Drakenstein with non-financial support, including equipment, machinery and marketing collateral to enable SMMEs to continue to operate and hopefully grow.

Further to the support I have already spoken to, the Department also works with development finance institutions and agencies like the Small Enterprise Finance Agency (SEFA) to link SMMEs, and specifically township businesses with access to funding. As I have informed the House recently, I am advised

that since 2019 the SMME Booster Fund included a category to support municipal infrastructure development which resulted in the establishment or support of informal and township trading places. In Hessequa, four business units and a hub to support light industrial types of businesses; in Bongoletu five traders in containerised units; in Langeberg a trading site serving 22 existing and new informal traders; in Mossel Bay 17 refurbished containers which housed 23 local businesses; in Swellendam a SMME Trading Zone supporting six businesses; in Laingsburg four units to accommodate businesses in the retail sector; in Cape Agulhas six trading containers, in Witzenberg Industrial and Business Space through 10 customised containers; and in Mossel Bay 19 trading units and a further hub for 15 local businesses and three day traders. The programmes that I have mentioned speak to some of the work the Department is doing to help small township businesses to grow, and to help unlock the full potential of the township economy. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. I now recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, Speaker. The Western Cape remains one of the most unequal and untransformed provinces in South Africa. This is made worse by the fact that this DA-led Western Cape Provincial Government has a narrow view on economic investment and on who should be the drivers on job creation. Total dependence on the private sector, especially foreign direct investment for purpose of job creation, does not always yield the expected

positive results. Modern economies require an interventionist state which will guide and release resources allocated.

In the Western Cape people cannot always be told to go and seek employment opportunities even in situations where the same people can be empowered to be employees themselves. What is required is a willing Government which is prepared to invest in small township businesses, as well as turning informal settlements into formal ones.

Since the Pick n Pay Spaza Shop Programme which ran between 2017 and 2021 failed, this Government has not come up with a substantive mechanism that will intervene in assisting and transforming the township economy. The downfall of this Spaza Shop Programme was as a result of a DA's stance that the private sector must create employment and Government must watch from the distance, because had the Provincial Government played an interventionist role in the collaboration with Pick n Pay, then they could have realised earlier on that certain Spaza Shop owners are struggling and indeed in need of assistance. In that way the Government can intervene early to make sure that Spaza Shop owners receive all the help they need, and their businesses remain in operation until such a time that they can be able to totally stand and operate on their own without needing any assistance.

In conclusion today as a result of these failures by the Provincial Government, some of the Pick n Pay Spaza Shop owners remain out of business, after incurring debt, and are forced to go out there to queue for

employment opportunities where they could have been employers themselves.

With this being said, my question, how will the Department make sure that future investments in small businesses in this province remain sustainable?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Cassiem. I now recognise the hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: I thank you, Deputy Speaker. Thank you for your opening remarks Minister. It is clear that you and your Department realised the value that stands to be unlocked in our informal economy. A consistent challenge for these businesses has been access to funding to expand and increase their revenue, which of course will lead to increased job creation. The work done by your Department to integrate informal businesses into the formal economy where they will have access to registered financial institutions and desperately needed funding will surely pay dividends in the way of increased economic activity. The SMME Booster Fund is especially an impressive initiative that helps our entrepreneurs to get their business up and running and to take it to the next level. These are after all our entrepreneurs we need to give every chance to build up their businesses and to create jobs.

Minister, could you please elaborate to our residents how they can benefit from the SMME Booster Fund, and how they could possibly apply for it? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon America. I recognise hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker. Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, the hon Cassiem and I should agree that the MEC's Department does not have the political will, to eradicate inequality in our society. And so therefore she does not see how assisting small township businesses can help eradicate inequality, unemployment, and poverty within our community.

[Audio distorted – 1:57.16] Along that, in September last year, the hon Nkondlo whom I am standing in for today, sponsored the debate on ...[Audio distorted.] this very discussion. The response from the MEC was underwhelming ...[Audio distorted.] National Government as usual. The hon Nkondlo then sponsored another Interpellation in March this year. This time, it may be coming from another angle of ...[Audio distorted.] from the ...[Audio distorted.] especially indisposing them to funding opportunities.

Again, the hon Cassiem can guess. The hon MEC again blamed the National Government, speaking about corruption, telling us about things we know she does today, instead of answering to the Interpellation. The hon MEC has now been in office for a full year. She has had no impact whatsoever, on the provincial economy. She has ...[Audio distorted – 1:58.15] ideas. She has taken up no suggestion given to her by our Opposition benches, and she is stone deaf to the needs and desires of the township economy. The hon MEC has been as stone deaf as her predecessors were.

It is for these reasons ...[Audio distorted.] that they take. They should use small township businesses to become ...[Audio distorted.] capital. Like ...[Audio distorted.] is the one being a [Inaudible.] capital. So, the MEC risks ...[Audio distorted.] good suggestion rather than what they have achieved.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up. Thank you very much. Hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker, the Department must also realise that township economy is very ...[Audio distorted.] bigger diversity. While some businesses remain small and informal, some remain illegal, but cannot be assisted to comply with the law, be legal and registered.

For example, since some of the Black and Coloured people in townships are not qualified for formal ...[Audio distorted.] and as a result of not earning enough salaries, most of them end up taking loans from loan sharks who are operating illegally. However, what is important here is that those loan sharks have already shown the willingness to be in business, however their difficulty might be the issue of compliance with the requirement of the National Credit Regulator, as well as getting additional funding for purposes ...[Audio distorted.]

The Government can create a programme in which they call out all those ...[Audio distorted.] are interested to be in this sector and then assist them

with the registration process or guidelines up until those individuals have received their NCRs ...[Audio distorted.] and operate. From that point, Government can also assist these registered businesses by introducing them to the stakeholders who will assist them on how to run those businesses formally. It all starts with registering a company, applying for the NCR licence and then, operate the business.

In conclusion, if this Provincial Government would do that with those businesses in the township economy, then that will help with the bridge in inequality as well as making sure that unemployment is eradicated. We cannot always only look at established businesses when we want to eradicate the issue of high unemployment. The aim ...[Audio distorted.] employers. So, with this being ...[Audio distorted.], can this Department show us where is this [Inaudible.] diversified illegal or informal businesses to enter the formal business sector and succeed. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Cassiem. I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It is interesting that the hon member from the EFF chooses to focus on one programme. It would interesting to know what about the rest that I lay out in chapter and verse repeatedly in this House. And quite frankly, it is a very tired and quite frankly, lazy narrative to say that the Western Cape is the most unequal province in the country when it is not.

In respect of the hon member from the ANC, he obviously had a prepared speech that he could not bring himself to deviate from because if he had actually listened, I did not mention the National Government once. And of course, it is in keeping with ANC character that they would rather attack the player than the ball ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ...as the ANC often chooses to do because they cannot argue on the facts.

So, in closing and to build and continue on the impactful programmes and initiatives as mentioned in my opening and in my Budget Speech in March of this year, we have tabled a R1,5-billion budget for Vote 12 for the 2023 MTEF, which includes a R55,5-million allocation over the MTEF for alternative energy support for SMMEs. This support is to help businesses in township and informal economies so that they can continue to trade.

I also announced that the SMME Booster Fund will be continuing in the 2023/2024 financial year with an R8,18-million allocation and R4,61-million has also been allocated for the continuation of the 2022/2023 Booster Fund for this year. I am also excited to confirm that the new ...[Audio distorted.] of the SMME Booster Fund for 2022/2023 will be launched in the next few weeks. This fund is demand-led, and it is a collaborative ...[Audio

distorted.] to help enhance SMMEs and the SMME ...[Audio distorted.] system to select and then target categories of SMMEs and entrepreneurs which include businesses that are youth owned, women owned, owned by people living with disabilities and to support township-based businesses.

Another great partnership which is making a difference in improving opportunities for residents, is the I-CAN centre in Elsies River, which is a flagship and pioneering community-based centre developed in partnership with the City of Cape Town which provides digital skills programmes. This impressive centre had more than 94 000 visitors to date and has provided over 13 827 ...[Audio distorted.] in commission of free, donor funded and paid courses providing opportunities and value for money for those to seek to learn at the centre. It offers both entry level and vendor certified vocational digital skills training and has also received accreditation from the MICTSETA for two ICT qualifications. This unique offering positions the I-CAN centres as a place for empowerment and hope for a better future.

All of the programmes I have spoken to work on the principles which underpin our new Growth For Jobs strategy which sets out that the role of the state is to facilitate economic opportunities for citizens by expanding choice and the independence of its residents without limiting individual freedom. In support of this principle is the further understanding that we ...[Audio distorted.] redress which is needed to correct the wrongs of the ...[Audio distorted.] achieved by pulling more people into the economy, by stimulating competition, improving skills and productivity, raising investment, reducing

poverty and increasing employment for a fair society. Guided by our core values of accountability, competence, integrity, responsiveness, care, respect, and innovation, and by implementing our bold economic plan that envisages a provincial economy that achieves a breakout ...[Audio distorted.] in economic growth, resulting in sufficient employment and opportunities ...[Audio distorted.] confidence, hope and prosperity for all. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] That now brings us to the end of Interpellations. We move over to Questions as printed on the Order Paper. I wish to advise the hon members that once the hon Premier or Minister has started the reply to the Oral Questions ...[Audio distorted.] please to use the chat facility for the Sitting of the House to indicate they want to have a follow-up question. And when they ...[Audio distorted.] and it goes up. There are four opportunities ...[Audio distorted.] opportunity to respond. I recognise the hon Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

New question to the Premier:

1. Mr C M Dugmore to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

With regard to the list of properties that were handed over to National Government in 2009 by the Provincial Government for human-settlement purposes and subsequently reversed after 2009 by Premier Zille:

- (a) What were the reasons for the former Premier's decisions;
- (b) What is currently happening on these sites; and
- (c) How many houses have been built on each property?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you very much to the hon Leader of the Opposition for this question. Obviously, if you look at the question, I had to ...[Audio distorted.] and so, part (a).

The Cabinet Minutes clearly indicates the intention of the Cabinet for the properties in question to remain in the ownership of the Western Cape Government. The decision to cancel the Memorandum of Understanding was conveyed by the Western Cape Government to the national Minister of Human Settlements in terms of Clause 11 thereof, which provided for a one month notice to terminate the agreement. As per the cancellation notification, the cancellation of the MOU did not detract from the Provincial Government's commitment to enter into agreements with the Housing Development Agency on a project-by-project basis within the framework of the co-operative governance, to develop suitable land for housing in the Western Cape.

And then, the (b) and (c) part of the question and I will go through these parcels of land. The first one, portion of Erf 26439, Cape Town, in the extent approximately 18,8 hectares and this piece of land is in the process of enablement to rezone and acquire development rights for, first of all, an eco-

neighbourhood, an integrated education space, for affordable housing, for public facilities and for open spaces, while providing equitable access to cultural heritage.

The second piece of land ...[Audio distorted.] Erf 3346, Constantia. The intended development could not proceed as the property is in an area classified by Planning as 'discouraged development', and so that is the position of that piece of property right now.

The remainder of Erf 3331, Constantia. Leased to the American International School of Cape Town until the end of that lease, which is 2031, for education purposes ...[Audio distorted.]

Erf 3035, also in Constantia. Transferred to the Constantia Land Restitution Beneficiaries on 25 March 2020 under Title Deed. So, perhaps linked to the earlier discussions in this House, that piece of land was transferred as per the Land Restitution.

Portion 10 and 18 of the farm Joostenbergvlakte, Paarl Rural. Repairs to the residential units have commenced and this is for the use of or continued use of human settlements.

Erf 30470, Cape Town. This comprises of erven, and it has got 28297 and so it goes through, but of course, you will get this in writing. There are 14 different sub-erven of this property at Mowbray. This process of engagement

is with the University of Cape Town for student accommodation.

Then Erf 24262 ...[Audio distorted.] which is a portion of Erf 22988 Parow, Ravensmead. This was transferred to the City on 27 March 2019 for housing purposes on that portion and the portion that is not for housing is being developed as the Ravensmead CDC.

Erf 1588 Constantia, Plumstead. This was allocated the Western Cape Education Department for the utilisation for the Norman Henshilwood High School.

Erf 78141 Cape Town, Southfield. This is reserved for restitution and housing development.

Erf 3842 Philippi. This is allocated to the Education Department for the use of Vuyiseka Secondary School.

Then, Erf 2420 Hartenbos. Currently, ...[Audio distorted.] in the process ...[Audio distorted.]

Wilderness. This is an informal settlement and has potential for further in-situ upgrades in partnership with the George Municipality.

Erf 331 Hoekwil, Wilderness Heights. Currently being let to an NPO to be included as part of an envisaged upgrade of an informal settlement.

Then, Portion 1 of Farm 544 Cape Rural District. This land has been subject to a large-scale invasion and has been de-proclaimed as a nature reserve.

Then, Erf 952 Kleinvlei is reserved for future Government needs. This is Health and Education.

Erf 773 Outeniqua, Strand is vacant.

Erf 109533 Cape Town, Charlesville forms part of land available for human settlement development.

Erf 17030 Bellville, Belhar. Development ...[Audio distorted.] of the property for emergency housing and is being considered and planned for at the moment. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Dugmore. You posed the question.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you ...[Audio distorted.] hon Deputy Speaker ...[Audio distorted.] Western Cape Cabinet led by former Premier Zille and including the current hon Premier in 2009, decided to take back all these properties. And given further that it is now 2023, which is 14 years later, it is clear from the answer of the hon Premier that not a single human settlement has been built on this land.

No ...[Interjections.] you have got plans, there is not ...[Audio distorted.] and I asked, the question was ...[Audio distorted.] which said that how many houses have been built on each property. And in the response that you gave now, unless you are going to give me something else in writing, it is clear that this DA Provincial Government took back the land from ...[Audio distorted.] that was going to go to the ...[Audio distorted.], physically. And that is why we are going to each one of these properties. We have been through and there is nothing. [Interjections.]

So, the reality is that this Government is clearly not building houses on land where we could have had progress ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, your question.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And that is why I want ask the ...[Audio distorted.] has not a single human settlement, a single house been built on these properties which you and hon Zille took back from the HDA in 2009, 13 years ago.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.
[Interjections.] Over to you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and again, to the hon member. Let us first get to the real issue here and I am sure the House needs to be reminded of this. These properties that were taken back, were taken ...[Audio distorted.] back ...[Audio distorted.] the election in 2019. Suddenly, the ANC Government in this ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...[Audio distorted.]
...2019?

The PREMIER: Yes. Oh, 2009, sorry. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The PREMIER: The day before the election in 2009, the day before the election in 2009, the ANC Government in this province transferred all of these pieces of land ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: But what was done by the Bitou Municipality in 1994?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: To the national ...[Audio distorted.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Bitou Municipality did the same thing in 1995 ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, no. You cannot have interjections if you are online. Just one minute, hon Premier. Hon Mvimbi, that is out of order, please. Thank you. Please allow the hon Premier to complete his feedback. Thank you. Over to you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: So, the day before they transferred. Of course, they understood the day before the election they knew they were going to lose the election and then, I mean, I was looking at what ...[Audio distorted.] was part of that and ...[Audio distorted.] from that Cabinet. ...[Audio distorted.] they transferred this land. ...[Audio distorted.] thinking about the transfer of this land and what National Government did. I have just read out to you exactly what happens to all of these pieces or what is happening to all of these pieces of land.

Now, of course, one, two, three, four, five, six pieces of land are in the human settlements process. Some of them are existing human settlements or houses on them that are being refurbished. Other ones are being developed or have already been handed over to the City of Cape Town or are in negotiating with other municipalities for human settlements.

But that very same reason as to why we did not want to hand these pieces of land over to the ANC because when this ANC party was in power in the City

of Cape Town, they made a massive mistake because they transferred land to the National Government. Not in 2009, but in 2006, they transferred a piece of land to the National Government. And this hon member stands here, and he says the DA has done absolutely nothing. Now, I have spent my whole time answering him his question to tell you exactly what is happening on every erf of this ...[Interjections.] on every erf ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]... the House.

The PREMIER: On every erf.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The PREMIER: I gave you a detail of everything that is happening on each of those pieces of property. The piece of land that was handed in 2006 by Nomaindiya Mfeketo when she was the Mayor, she handed it also to the National Government. They should have reversed that then and there. Do you know what piece of land this ...[Audio distorted.] [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...[Audio distorted.] the land in 1994.

The PREMIER: This piece of land ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: They did the same thing. They transferred the golf course. They transferred the golf course 1994 ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: In 2006 ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi!

The PREMIER: ...District Six ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: The golf course in Plettenberg Bay ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Deputy Speaker, is this a free for all for all interjections? Hon Mvimbi must be called to order.

The PREMIER: ...run by the ANC and if ever there was a piece of land that should have been used to address the ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What have you ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ...absolute injustice of apartheid, it should be this piece of land. An absolute flagship piece of land. Can you imagine if the Democratic Alliance had this piece of land called District Six and we were busy doing two or three times the size of Conradie on that piece of land right now, making the biggest difference possible for the citizens of this province. ...[Interjections.]

And so, if this hon member wants me to go through how many

...[Interjections.], since that piece of land. We stopped that piece of land being transferred to the ANC who would have done absolutely nothing with it, and I have told you exactly what we are doing with all of those pieces of land. But at the same time in this Government, if I take each year by year, the number of housing units handed over and the number of serviced sites handed over year by year by year, it actually ends up with 96 455 housing units and serviced sites, another 85 659. That gives you 235 853 opportunities handed to citizens in this province by this Government.

If we had given that land to the ANC, they would have treated it exactly the same way that they have treated District Six. In actual fact, next year at the election, we will reverse that, and we will get that land handed back, and can you imagine Conradie-styled developments with housing opportunities and schools and work opportunities all in this space called District Six. We will make that difference. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. [Interjections.]
Hon Dugmore? Hon Dugmore? [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, just give me a second if you can.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just have a seat for a second, please. Hon Mvimbi, hon Marais: Rule 40 states very clearly on a hybrid Sitting that you cannot interject via the virtual platform and shout-down the microphone. So, if you want to be part of the interjections you have to be here in person because we cannot have you interjecting online. I recognise you, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to remind the hon Premier of the ...[Audio distorted.] of the question. The question specifically says in regard to these properties, how many houses have been built on each property and the reality is, not a single house has been built. And the hon Premier is actually misleading this House because that was my question. And if you are shaking your head, can you show me or tell me now on which of these seven ...[Audio distorted.] the truth is and that brings me to my last question.

All these properties which were given back to them in places like Constantia, the DA has refused to build a single house on any of these properties. And I can assure you if the HDA, the Housing Development Association, had those properties, in 13 years, in 13 years the DA did not build a single house. Do not tell me about 260 000 on other properties. I asked you a question through the hon Speaker. I asked the hon Premier a question and I would like you to consider this, hon Deputy Speaker, because my question and which I want to repeat: (c) how many houses have been built on each property since 2009. That is the question. Can you please answer the question through the hon

Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Over to you, hon Premier.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And do not blame the National Government.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. As I have said already, and I am not going to read all of this out again. Some of these pieces of land have been redistributed to citizens who have made claims against the piece of land. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Answer the question.

The PREMIER: Some of these pieces of land are ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The PREMIER: ...in Human Settlements' hands ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That does not ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ...for housing development. Some of them have got existing human settlements ...[Audio distorted.] on them and we are upgrading those houses. And some of them have, as I have said, got schools on them or have

been allocated to schools. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What about the houses?

The PREMIER: I have told you exactly what is happening on every single one of these pieces of land. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I recognise hon Fry. [Interjections.]

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: In other words, it is zero.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Okay, I can hear you.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I want to thank the hon Premier for his detailed response. Hon Deputy Speaker, we all know that the need for affordable housing is great across South Africa and that the ANC National Government is sitting on vast stretches of land, unused, which are in prime locations to ...[Audio distorted.] housing. So, I wish to ask the hon Premier whether there has been any indication or commitment from the National Government to release mega properties such as Acacia Park and

Ysterplaat, Wingfield and Youngsfield military bases to accelerate the Province and City's commitment to provide affordable housing. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.
[Interjections.] One minute. Hon Dugmore, your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. If you look at the question, this is a very specific question. Look, I want to ask you to rule on whether the question by hon Fry as a follow-up, given that it has nothing to do with this particular question ...[Laughter.] which talks about particular properties. [Interjections.] Can ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Can you indicate whether ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, I ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...hon Fry's question is allowed, given that it does not relate to the topic.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, the question on human settlement is not for me to decide. The hon Premier decides if that is a new question, he is

not answering it. I cannot make a decision on substance. So, I am going to allow the hon Premier to proceed. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you. Thank you very much, to the hon Fry. Thank you very much for that question. Again, asking a question about land and you know that we have made many, many applications. The interesting thing was that and we have a new member of GOOD in the House today, but when the previous Minister or just recently previous Minister that was actually responsible for Public Works, she was the custodian of the land, when she was the Mayor. And I want to say that she actually wrote to the National Government to say ‘Please, we want you to transfer more land for us to make real, meaningful changes for human settlement’ and it is specifically those pieces of military land.

So, obviously, GOOD is part of the ANC in the coalition government with ANC and it was interesting that when she got into the ANC ...[Audio distorted.] at a national level, they obviously said to her, ‘No, no, no, you can be part of this Government, but no ways are you going to give extra land to the Western Cape’, because the ANC is first of all, incapable of delivering ...[Interjections.] ...[Audio distorted.] are incapable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat. One minute. Hon Bans, hon Windvogel, there is a point of order, hon Premier. ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: [Audio distorted.] the Premier.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is a point of order. Hon members, please, I have a point of order. If you can just take your seat. Hon de Villiers, what is your point of order?

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): There is no way that the hon Premier can say that we are in coalition with anybody. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon de Villiers ...[Interjection.]

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): And I want him to take it back because that is a lie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon de Villiers, that is not a point of order. The hon Premier may proceed. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Windvogel! [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel. Hon Windvogel?

An HON MEMBER: You can use your R1-billion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, one minute. The hon Premier is

ready to speak. You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. So, if I can just finish that part of the question and that is that the ANC is absolutely incapable of delivering because otherwise, they would give us these chapter and verse of these amazing models in Limpopo or these amazing delivery models in KZN or in the Free State or in Gauteng. They are not able to do that. They are incapable.

But that is why they want to punish the citizens of this province and not transfer those pieces of land that can be properly utilised for making sure, and that is the real land issue here. They hold onto it because they want to punish the citizens. Well, the citizens are going to punish them next year at the polls. And then, I do want to say ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: I do want to say, hon Deputy Speaker, that the ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What about the lands that belongs to you as the Western Cape? Leave the national alone.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, no, no. Please can we mute the hon member. [Interjections.] No, no, please! That is against Rule 40: no

interjections online. You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. And I just want to say through you, hon Deputy Speaker, to the hon member of GOOD, is that the ANC and GOOD are absolutely in coalition. In a number of municipalities, they are working together and failing the people ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Utilise the land that we have in the Western Cape ...[Audio distorted.]

The PREMIER: ...and when ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: ...a Cabinet Minister from GOOD is responsible for land in this country and does not deliver to the citizens, they are part of the national Cabinet, that political party. So, they cannot say, 'No, we are not part of this coalition' or 'We are not part of Government'. They are absolutely ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ANC satellites.

The PREMIER: ...part of the Government and they are failing the citizens, just as the ANC is failing the citizens of this province. [Interjections.] And when you work together in a government, that is called a coalition.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Dugmore, that is your last opportunity, number four, to your question.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Given that the hon Premier in his response, has admitted that not a single house was built on any of these particular properties, I would like to ask him again whether he would actually formally answer the question as to Question 1(c) how many houses have been built on each property. Actual houses built between 2009 and 2023, which is 13 years. Because, hon Deputy Speaker, I would suggest that the hon Premier is lying to this House. I would suggest that he is lying, and he is refusing to answer the question and admit that the DA Government has not, on those properties in the years spanning 2009 to 2023, built a single house.

So, I would like as a final question, to ask: are you lying to this House, hon Deputy Speaker to the hon Premier, or could you actually tell us and admit that not a single physical house from planning to actually, completion of construction has been built. Can you please, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, tell the House the truth.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. No, I am not lying to the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That ends Question 1. We move over to Question 2. I recognise the hon Minister Simmers.

Question standing over from Thursday, 25 May 2023, as agreed to by the House:

5. Mr P Marran to ask Mr T A Simmers, Minister of Infrastructure:

Earlier in the year he reported that housing project handovers were being delayed ‘due to violence, extortion and intimidation by gangs over the past five years’:

What has his Department done to end this paralysis caused by the gangs?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and once again, thank you for the hon member Marran for agreeing to let it stand over because I was booked off sick. I did not run away like certain people told this House.

Hon Deputy Speaker, several project sites have been subject to violent disruptions. The full causes of the disruptions are difficult to discern as contractors are reluctant to divulge information fully, to the Department. A significant portion of the disruptions seem to be linked to extortionary tactics that may be associated with what has been characterised by research groups and the media, as the construction mafia-type activities. Violence, extortion,

and intimidation in housing projects mainly carried out by firstly, so-called business forums which are local associations of businesses extorting contracts for members by threatening violence and disruption, and sometimes, actually doing it or groups loosely defined as gangsters, extorting contracts for small local contractors which ultimately may then be required to pay protection money to these so-called gangsters or business forums.

It is unclear whether gangsters demanding protection money should be considered in the same category as the construction mafia, given the desperate modus operandi of the group ...[Audio distorted.] which may require its own set of separate targeted interventions.

Towards the end of 2022, my Department held a roundtable discussion to consider the impact of the construction mafia on departmental housing construction projects. The purpose of the meeting was for regional and ...[Audio distorted.] project teams to recount experiences in projects involving violent disruptions on construction sites that may be due to the construction mafia and point to any solutions to foil disruptions that may have proved effective.

My Department employs various strategies to counter the scourge of violence, extortion, and intimidation by gangs in and or on housing projects. As a department, we work closely with the community leadership which includes project steering committees, sub-council managers and yes, ward councillors. Regular contact is maintained with SAPS, Public Order Policing Services,

and the City of Cape Town's Law Enforcement. Cases of threats of extortion, intimidation and shooting incidents are also registered with SAPS.

Further to this, the Department also requests both SAPS and Law Enforcement to conduct daily routine patrols to our various sites. My Department has also improved security on sites through private security deployment to various projects. In some instances, this may require specialised security services to reinforce security on sites to ensure safe and conducive working conditions for all the workers.

The responses mainly encompass measures directly aimed at preventing violence occurring on building sites through limiting access to sites via physical and legal means and increasing security. These measures may close off a key tactic of extortionary actors, but they raise project costs and may inadvertently represent an assension to the demands of extortionists to employ the local businesses they favour or to which they are connected. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon Marran. Is he not here? Okay, then you may proceed, hon member. I recognise you.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. My question to the hon Minister would be if there are any houses, in fact, projects that have been delayed for more than a year as a result of extortion? And if so, what

are the interventions that are put in place and how many beneficiaries are affected? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the follow-up question. If it is in order ...[Audio distorted.] through you, hon Deputy Speaker, to the member, I can actually provide a detailed list of sites and how many beneficiaries have been affected because there are quite a number of projects in the City of Cape Town and also, a few in the non-metro areas which have been affected by these forms of extortion ...[Audio distorted.]. I would love to empower the hon member with the correct information. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, housing projects all across the province are being delayed due to the growing number of land invasions. Has your Department identified any specific groups of people or organisations who are encouraging these land invasions? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: [Audio distorted.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): [Audio distorted.]... pleasure, hon Minister. Hon Minister, housing projects all across the province are being delayed due to the growing number of land invasions. Has your Department identified any specific groups of people or organisations who are encouraging these land invasions? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and I will answer the hon member in two stages because the one part, I have briefly touched in my formal response to hon member Marran which are these so-called business forums which are now becoming prevalent on many of the sub-councils in the City of Cape Town, for instance, where we do have projects and even where the City of Cape Town has projects. We are also seeing its ugly head rearing itself in the non-metro areas by operating under the auspices of these so-called business forums. But ultimately, they seek to extort and prevent, you know, a fair and transparent process in terms of those individuals that get afforded an opportunity on the site by the main contractor.

Secondly, we have also ...[Audio distorted.] various lessons that we have learnt since 2019 and indeed, sadly, hon member, certain political parties are

playing a very coordinative role. We have seen this, for instance, at Forest Village which a project which is nearly 99% complete, where a specific political party actively encouraged ...[Audio distorted.] in the construction happening on site and we were forced to actually approach the High Court for an urgent interdict to prevent that from happening and to ensure that construction does follow through on that site.

We have also seen where we do try to gain access to informal settlements to do enumeration studies, hon Deputy Speaker, through you to the hon member. Once again, where political parties play a very central role in asking their members present in these specific informal settlement areas, to prevent my Department and even NPOs or NGOs to gain access so that we can do proper and full enumeration to assess the true state and the need within those informal settlements.

So indeed, hon member through you, hon Deputy Speaker, it is a mixture of both, but we are seeing at some point that there is a true conversion of certain political parties fronting through these business forums because they even seek to extort and gain possible funding through these acts of extortion on various sites across the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise you, hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would like to

ask the hon MEC with regards to F8448 in the City of Cape Town, the stretch that starts in Gugulethu towards ...[Audio distorted.] Crossroads and Nyanga. What are the delays? What has been done with regard to his first article that was in the newspaper speaking about extortion from that time up until now, what has been done besides the ...[Audio distorted.] 26 housing units that were handed over to community members? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and through you, to the ANC Chief Whip. Thank you for that question as well. If it in order, I can provide the hon member with an actually very detailed response in formal writing. Once again, so that the hon member is empowered because there are certain projects in specific ...[Audio distorted.] is one which concern ...[Audio distorted.] supposed to be and the impact of extortion of the so-called business forums on our own progress on specific project sites, ballooning the security costs as we speak. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further ...[Audio distorted.]. I have got hands up. I will give it to hon Christians ...[Audio distorted.] thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Just a question. Is hon Minister aware of certain housing projects where people

move in and they are not the beneficiaries, and they pay councillors to ...[Audio distorted.] occupy houses ...[Audio distorted.] aware of those projects. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Firstly, I am not aware of any such project because beneficiaries are approved. They sign a deed of sale prior to getting their keys ...[Audio distorted.] from the provincial Department, which we then obviously do through the local municipality. [Audio distorted.]... There is, however, what we have done, hon Christians, through you, ...[Audio distorted.] hon Deputy Speaker is that some of these legally qualifying beneficiaries ...[Audio distorted.] sign for their keys ...[Audio distorted.] actually then get approached by some of these business forums, so even ...[Audio distorted.] organised syndicates, offering them massive amounts in cash to rent these units.

Now sadly, according to the way the process works, hon Deputy Speaker, the ward councillor or in the City of Cape Town ...[Audio distorted.] council structure needs to inform their housing department and accordingly, build up a paper trail to act on this. But we have been alerted to this, we are aware of certain provincial projects where this has been happening. We have actually approached, hon Deputy Speaker through you to the hon member, the State Attorney for a legal opinion ...[Audio distorted.] regarding what happens

...[Audio distorted.] once we have given that key. They actually act illegally because for the first eight years and there are specific reasons which they must apply for which will allow them to sell the house, yes, but I need to authorise that as the custodian of those projects.

But other than that, they are actually not allowed to sell those units. It is a bit of a grey area in terms of renting out or leasing of these houses which is in the State Attorney's opinion, which we have received. We are actually busy formalising an SOP which we will be engaging Local Government on because it is becoming a massive problem. Given that in certain projects, even military veterans ...[Audio distorted.] in certain projects in the City, has wholesale been sold or rented out to organised crime to such a state that those local ...[Audio distorted.] ward councillors now ...[Audio distorted.] asking us how to actually take back those units. Hence, my approach to the State Attorney for a legal opinion because it is becoming a ...[Audio distorted.] very massive problem for us. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Question 5. We now move over to new questions. I recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

2. Mr P Marran to ask Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Agriculture:

With regard to the Premier's comments that President Putin will be arrested:

- (1) Whether the agricultural trade between the Province and Russia was placed in jeopardy by the Premier's statement; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) Whether there has been any negative reaction to this statement, especially by agriculture organisations in the province; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (3) What is the value of the agricultural trade between the Province and Russia?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. †Daar is tans geen uitvoerstatistiek wat die aanname ondersteun dat die Wes-Kaapse handel met Rusland in gedrang is weens die Premier se verklaring nie. Dit is egter ook belangrik om daarop te let dat daar sedert die COVID-19-pandemie groot ontwrigtings in markte was en die Russiese inval in die Oekraïne het onstabiliteit en wêreldwye kommoditeitspryse verhoog.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[There is currently no export statistic supporting the assumption that the Western Cape trade with Russia is in jeopardy due to the Premier's statement. However, it is also important to note that since the Covid-19 pandemic, there have been major disruptions in markets and the Russian invasion of Ukraine

increased instability and global commodity prices.]

†Die tweede gedeelte van die vraag, agb Adjunkspeaker. Daar was geen formele of negatiewe reaksie waargeneem of ontvang deur die Departement vanaf die landbou-organisasies oor die Premier se verklaring nie. En in die 4de kwartaal van 2022 het die Wes-Kaap landbouprodukte ter waarde van R397 miljoen uitgevoer wat 'n afname was van 8% vergeleke met dieselfde kwartaal in 2021. Dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The second part of the question, hon Deputy Speaker. There was no formal or negative reaction observed or received by the Department from the agricultural organisations concerning the Premier's statement. In the 4th quarter of 2022, the Western Cape exported agricultural products to the value of R397 million, which was a decrease of 8% when compared to the same quarter in 2021. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise you, ...[Audio distorted.] hon member.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, what is the number of companies from the province that are benefitting from the trade relations between Russia and the Western Cape and whether the hon MEC has reached out to them after the hon Premier's reckless remarks; and

what is their reaction to the unfortunate ...[Audio distorted.] sentiments.
Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek sal daardie inligting graag na die Huis wil bring want die vraag is hoeveel van daardie maatskappye is in Russiese besit in handel tussen die Wes-Kaap en Rusland. Daardie inligting is nie nou tot my beskikking nie, maar ook geen verdere inligting is van daardie maatskappye onder my aandag gebring nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to bring that information to the House because the question is how many of those companies are in Russian ownership in trade between the Western Cape and Russia. That information is not now available to me but no further information from those companies has been brought to my attention.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, ...[Audio distorted.] Hon Minister. Hon ...[Audio distorted.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you to the hon Minister, if the hon Minister can perhaps give us a comparison of how ...[Audio distorted.] investment, the West, the UK, EU and the United

States compare with the trade relations that the Western Cape or South Africa has with the Russian Federation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Agb Adjunkspeaker. Ek het spesifiek ook na daardie inligting gekyk want die agri-export ...[Opname versteur.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker. I have also specifically looked at that information because the agri-export ...][Audio distorted.]

from the West to the United States is in the region of R25,4 billion. Agri-export from the Western Cape to the European Union is in the region of R245 billion and this ...[Audio distorted.] is therefore R270 billion, whereas our agri-export to Russia is only R33,2 billion. It is only 9%, whereas the rest is 81%.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, is the Western Cape considering to pull out of all trade relations with Russia or what contingency plan does the Department have

...[Audio distorted.] to close the gap of this astronomical injection into the province? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Well, hon Deputy Speaker, I have just indicated now that the trade between the Western Cape and Russia only constitutes 9%, but the question is are we considering withdrawing from these particular trade agreements. Well, this is particularly not the mandate of this Government to withdraw from such agreements. This is the mandate of the Minister of the hon member, belonging to her party, and I would rather ask that she puts that question to the Minister of DTI in the National Assembly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and once again, through you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Through you to the hon Minister. Hon Minister, are you aware that the Governor of the Reserve Bank has warned the South African Government of the devastating impact of possible sanctions on the South African economy as a result of the controversy around Lady R, the

Russian ship. And specifically, the serious allegations made by the US Ambassador of potential weapons export to ...[Audio distorted.] on the impact that such international sanctions would have on the economy of the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Well, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you to hon member Bosman. We know that the South African economy, but also, particularly the Western Cape economy is linked to the global economy and therefore, it has serious implications as reported by the Governor of the Reserve Bank, should any sanctions be imposed on South Africa.

Certainly, it will lead to massive job losses, massive return of foreign direct investment and this is certainly something that we cannot afford in South Africa. I think when the Governor of the Reserve Bank issues such a notice or a warning, it is something that we need to take seriously because as the Governor of the Central Bank responsible for the monetary policy and the flow of money both internationally and locally, I think this is a serious warning. And because of this, the hon Premier will soon invite the Governor of the Reserve Bank to address the Cabinet in this regard.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Question 2. We move over to Question 3. I recognise the hon Minister Bredell.

3. Ms P Z Lekker to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

With regard to the National Government's intervention to stop grant allocations to municipalities in the Western Cape because of non-performance:

- (a) What factors led to this non-performance, (b) how much in total has been lost to Western Cape municipalities and (c) how has his Department intervened?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member Lekker for the question.

All provinces were affected by the proposed stopping and reallocation of the Conditional Grants. The annual Division of Revenue Act (DoRA) allows for the transfer of grant funds to be stopped if National Treasury identifies that the funds are unlikely to be spent. This is one of the grant management tools provided for in DoRA. Section 18(2) of DoRA and Section 38 of PFMA set out the requirements for the process that National Treasury must follow before stopping of grant funds.

All municipalities were provided with an opportunity to object to the

proposed stopping of the grant funds and the Provincial Treasury was informed. Some of the factors that led to the stopping of these grants includes the delays and late appointment of contractors, due to supply chain capacity challenges, and non-responsive tenders. An example of this is where a municipality went through the whole entire procurement process, only for the appointed contractor indicating that they do not have the required capacity to do the work, and then the process must start all over again.

Delays during construction are another reason that we have picked up, due to unforeseen circumstances not known during the planning stages. An example of this is where a project was in progress and was well down the planning line. However, when they open up the land there was an unforeseen pipe that they could not plan for and then there were delays in the construction phase.

It should be noted that as funds are only stopped where they were already unlikely to be spent, the Finance Minister decided to stop a portion of the relevant grant. Therefore, it does not impact service delivery. The amounts stopped are also then reallocated to municipalities that can accelerate their spending, understanding that the impact of service delivery would also need to be accounted for of this accelerated delivery in municipalities that benefit from the reallocation of the funds.

The core for me in this question is the following, hon Deputy Speaker, and that is that a total of R61,3-million in grant funds were stopped from the Western Cape municipalities while a total of R454,9-million was reallocated

towards the Western Cape. So yes, we lost R60-million, but we gained R455-million, plus/minus. The Western Cape Department of Local Government regularly engages with municipalities before, during and after the stoppage process.

Interventions before the stoppage process include monitoring and evaluation meetings by the Department's project managers. So, we have got meetings with all the municipalities, we sit down with them because we really want to help and to assist them to spend the money. Then, there is the professional support and technical advising services by the Department of Engineers. There are intervention meetings by provincial MIG ...[Audio distorted.]. There, they assess the progress and look at possible red tape issues. We identify key risks. There is provision of advice to and guidance to the municipalities, and facilitation and support from various stakeholders.

Then also, the management meetings with municipal managers by the chief director responsible for the units. So, if they had gone through the first process and we are still worried, and we still do not get a reaction, we then escalate it to the municipal managers and chief directors. Ensuring accountability for the grant progress and the required interventions from the relevant accounting officers and addressing specific challenges are also done.

Then, the next phase: the interventions during the stoppage process includes: when we see that we cannot go further and that National is going to stop, then assisting the municipalities with the preparation because there is also

engagement. National does not just send an email. They engage with us, and we support the municipalities in making their case. Participating in stopping engagements to ensure recommendations are fair and do not affect service delivery; and assist municipalities with their responses to National Treasury.

And then, the last phase: interventions after the stoppage. We engage with each municipality during May 2023 to adjust their planning to account for the impact the stoppages will have on the implementation of the current projects, and then continuation of monitoring and evaluation as well as professional support and technical advisory services. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Firstly, I think it is important to note that the intervention by the National Government points to a failure by this hon MEC's Department, to ensure that non-performance in municipalities does not take place. And maybe, for a party and a provincial government that like to brag about how great they are, this is definitely a scandal, and no amount is little. Therefore, I think it is important that the hon MEC tells us why his Department did not at all prevent this scandal from happening in the first place.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The scandal of these things and I understand the hon member's question and that she is worried, but I can assure her that we work very closely with municipalities. We are the only province that year-on-year spend over 90% of MIG, but there will be unforeseen circumstances. You open up a piece of land and there is a pipe, a big pipe. They are not small pipes, they are big. Then, they must stop. There are safety issues and they run out of time.

It is also not that they lose the money. In most of these cases, the money will just be shifted to the next financial year like a rollover. But they must first hand it back ...[Audio distorted.]. The core of this is that we manage because we are very hands-on with our municipalities. We managed to gain plus/minus R455-million where we had to say sorry, there is R60-million that we cannot spend. So, actually, there is a net gain. But if we go on like this, then we must look at the different municipalities and we can go there, but then we go into a political debate on this because there is only one DA-run municipality who has not spent R2-million. The rest are all ANC municipalities.

So then, we can go there, but it is a struggle. We are very hands-on and the sad part of this is that we would love to get Knysna to spend their money because it speaks to service delivery to the people. They are the same people who elected them, and we would love to get Beaufort West to spend their money. So, people must hold their leaders accountable. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, as highlighted in the recently ...[Audio distorted.] released Auditor-General's Audit Outcomes Report ...[Audio distorted.] for the municipalities, Beaufort West, Kannaland ...[Audio distorted.] are the challenge. Is the Department receiving any aid or assistance from the National Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs to help remedy these ailing municipalities? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, we actually need to have a serious debate on that question. Obviously, I am a firm believer that we all need to work together, but currently, the system and the spheres of government make it very difficult for us. We cannot interfere. We must work with the municipalities. We have got the plans. Hon Minister Marais can testify that we have got Beaufort West under a 139(5), but we cannot do the work on their behalf and to go there with your teams, you spend hours and hours of time there and as soon as you leave, they just go on with their old, old nonsense.

So, it is very difficult for a province to just intervene. I am a firm believer

that if we want to save municipalities, we are not going to save them through a District Development Model (DDM) or any model, but we need to look at the new financial model, we need to bring back discipline within the municipalities and we seriously need to discuss consequence management. If you do not act, like if you do not use the Auditor-General's report. If you diverge from the audit opinion, there must not be a ...[Audio distorted.], you are under administration because you cannot do your job. We must stop having all these long court cases that get dragged out while people are actually just filling their back pockets. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. With regard to municipalities that were affected here, be it whichever political party that municipality is controlled by, what systems are there in place? Is it not the hon Minister's responsibility to ensure that non-performance is attended to and to avoid such? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, and that is exactly what we do. That is why we spend over 90% of our money and those municipalities who want to work with us, they manage to spend their money. It is those that do not want to work with us who ignore us. We do not just rock up or come to

the sessions when we train them, when we go with our Red Tape Unit to go and support them. They ignore ...[Audio distorted.] the system and they play politics with the system and then, they must now go and explain to their voters why they have not spent their money. It is a simple ...[Audio distorted.] democratic principle. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, can you perhaps share with us what in general, the percentage ...[Audio distorted.] budgets being spent by municipalities in the Western Cape and how does it compare with those municipalities in other provinces? Would you consider it to be good, excellent, or bad? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you. Capital spending is very important. I think we are doing fairly well. We are not where we should be because there are a lot of factors playing into this. I think what we have missed in lot of municipalities' budget processes, is also the population growth and the impact of ...[Audio distorted.] that on your services.

For instance, if 125 000 people move to the Western Cape, we are going to

need 25-million litres of extra water next year. I do not think those equations are brought into the debate within our local government spheres and therefore, our 15-year water plan is such a good plan because it puts that economic growth and population growth that we cannot escape from upfront, so that municipalities can use it as a planning tool. Those are the kind of systems that we support ...[Audio distorted.] to municipalities ...[Audio distorted.], but now in the budget for municipalities to understand all this ...[Audio distorted.] of putting the budget behind that [Inaudible.]. We cannot force it. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That brings us to the end of Question 3. I will move over to Question 4. I recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

4. Mr P Marran to ask Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Agriculture:

With regard to China's import of corn from South Africa:

- (a) Whether the Provincial Government has started discussions on how corn exporters from the province can benefit from the Chinese market; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details; and
- (b) How many farmers from the province benefitted to date from China's import of corn from South Africa?

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker. Aan die agb mnr Pat Marran. Die Wes-Kaapse provinsie is nie eintlik 'n groot produsent van mielies nie, aangesien dit 'n somergewas is. Daar is wel 'n beperkte hoeveelheid wat wel geproduseer word, ...[Opname versteur.] hoofsaaklik ook wat onder besproeiing is vir dierevoer. Om hierdie rede voer die provinsie nie mielies uit nie en dus is geen boere in die provinsie in die verband bevoordeel as gevolg daarvan nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. To the hon Pat Marran. The Western Cape province is not a producer of maize as it is a summer crop. There is a limited volume that are produced [Audio distorted.] mainly that is under irrigation for animal feed. Therefore, the province does not export maize and thus no farmers benefitted in the province.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, GrainSA has said:

“China is a consistent buyer in global markets and gaining access opens a potential big export relationship for South Africa. Hopefully, this is the beginning of a constant exporting relationship which helps to

stimulate local grain production.”

Given this view ...[Audio distorted.] by GrainSA and the potential of gaining access into the Asian market, what plans and strategies are in place to ensure the Western Cape farmers are not left behind and they actually need to take advantage ...[Audio distorted.] of these trades. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Agb Adjunkspeker. Ja, dit is korrek. En nou, ons is ook 'n graanprodusent in 'n graanprodusentestreek, maar jy weet dat in terme van die wêreldbehoefte is ons ook in.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, that is correct. And now, we are also a grain producer in a grain producing region, but you know that in terms of the world demand we are also involved.]

We are also a net importer of wheat because we cannot produce an adequate supply due to the nature of the country, so we are an importer. We also know the difficulties that emerged as a result of the war in Ukraine because Russia and Ukraine are responsible for about 40% of the global wheat ...[Audio distorted.] export.

What we do in the Western Cape, we have some engagements with China. We have engagements too, with particular different markets particularly the wine market. We have regular exhibitions, wine tasting events both in Hong Kong, but also in mainland China because that is a huge market, particularly red wine which is very favourable in that particular market. So, we will do everything possible for our farmers to continue with exports.

In fact, this Department has allocated, for example to SATI, which is the South African Table Grape Industry, R2-million, also to get into that market. And I am happy to report to this House that that had a massive knock-on effect in terms of further growth in terms of exports in that particular market. It is a global big market, and we will do everything possible.

Later this year, the hon Premier will also undertake a visit to Shandong in China. We understand we have a bilateral relationship with China in terms of the Regional Leaders' Summit which consists of the following regions: Quebec in Canada, Bavaria in Germany, Upper Austria in Austria, as well as São Paulo in Brazil, as well as Shandong in China. So, all of these are a very important part of our international trade relations.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, through you. I note that the hon Minister has said that the Western Cape is not a net

importer of wheat and that the Western Cape contributes the least. And I think the research shows that it is just over 36 000 ...[Audio distorted.] tons, noting that the Free State is the largest exporter of corn.

Can I perhaps ask if the hon Minister is prepared to provide an educational opportunity to the Standing Committee and perhaps educate them because of the Opposition, in terms of what the main exports of the Western Cape are. And noting, the second part of my other question as explained by hon Marran in terms of asking the hon Minister to respond on behalf of the whole of South Africa, does the hon Minister perhaps have insight over whether hon member Marran thinks that hon Minister Ivan Meyer will be heading to the Union Buildings ...[Audio distorted.] next year.?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you to hon member Bosman for that question. I am quite happy if there is a request from the Chair of the Standing Committee to come and brief the Standing Committee on our trade relations. I think the hon members of this House will know that one of my strategic ...[Audio distorted.] priorities, through the hon member De Villiers ...[Audio distorted.], one of my strategic priorities in this post is market access because to us, it is very important.

He will also know that the Western Cape is 10% ...[Audio distorted.] of the population. He will also know that the Western Cape is also 10% of the

geographical area of South Africa, being 129 000 square kilometres in size against 1,3-million square kilometres in size for the whole of South Africa, and because of that we are now responsible for 55% of South Africa's agricultural export. So, market access is very important.

We are a net exporter of fruit. We also ...[Audio distorted.] South Africa, not only ...[Audio distorted.]. All the agricultural exports go to the African continent and we are particularly happy in the context of the African Continental Free Trade Area Agreement. So, this is very, very good news. But should they require some further information in terms of trade relations, we are happy to do so.

Whether I am heading towards the Union Buildings: I think the voters will decide next year, but ...[Audio distorted.] the hon member has that confidence in me. I will certainly take it up with the hon member and he must just provide me with the necessary documentation. So, I am ready to sign the declaration into the Union Buildings.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any further responses, questions? No. That brings us to the end of Questions. Our time is up. We will now – the outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard. We now move over to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to use my Member Statement today to express my sincere gratitude to the countless men and women who have worked so incredibly hard to cut down the amount of violent crime in the Western Cape Province. This week saw the release of the latest crime statistics which cover the 1st Quarter of this calendar year. While I am aware that I have stated this in my debate speech earlier, I feel it best repeating. The Western Cape has seen a year-on-year reduction of 14,1% in murders and a 99,9% decrease in rape. In a country that has suffered from unspeakable levels of violence for so long, we cannot afford to overlook the significance of the figures. They prove beyond any doubt that the Safety Plan is working, and that this Provincial Government is on the right track.

But there is still a lot more ground to cover. Even a single murder, rape, robbery, kidnapping or instance of extortion is unacceptable. All of us must commit to the vision of a crime-free future for South Africa and the South African citizen who must most urgently commit to this vision, is Minister Bheki Cele.

If he does, perhaps 2023 will finally be the year in which the Minister uses his R100-billion budget to end the under-resourcing of the SAPS in the Western Cape and finally commits to intelligent and data-led crime fighting strategies, the same strategies that have been proven by our provincial Department of Community Safety and Police Oversight. I call on Minister

Cele to urgently detail his plans for the Western Cape and to address the long-standing issues of policing in this strategy. The Western Cape has implemented a policy that works, and it is high time that he does the same. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ANC.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC in the Western Cape notes the release of the 2022/2023 4th Quarter police recorded Crime Statistics and it is elated by the 14,9% drop in the murder rate ...[Audio distorted.] when compared to the same period last year. Every tenth crime worsens the province. The SAPS always takes the beating for it. So, it is correct that this decrease in the murder rate ...[Audio distorted.] is attributed to its sterling work.

The Western Cape, however, still maintained eight stations in the top 30 murder stations and we call on the SAPS provincial management to put more focus on those stations where crime increased. This includes Nyanga, Gugulethu, Mitchells Plain and Delft, which are nationally in the top three and number one in the province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we welcome the decreased murders in Mfuleni, Harare, Kraaifontein and Khayelitsha. All these stations are known for their history of violent crimes, especially mass murders. The SAPS management in the province, together with the CPFs and other community crime fighting

structures, should be commended for their efforts to combat violent crimes in the province. We call for more effort to be put in those stations where violent crimes and murders continue to rise.

The DA, through hon Premier Winde and hon MEC Allen, must not be allowed to claim easy victories. More could have been achieved if the LEAP officers worked under direct SAPS command and were not made into JP Smith's private army, and if the Provincial Government played its role addressing the spatial design by ensuring proper lighting and improved accessibility in crime hotspots. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] I recognise the EFF.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Hundreds of children across the Western Cape continue to ...[Audio distorted.] to walk long distances, crossing busy main roads and putting their lives at risk due to being forced to attend schools in other communities due to the shortage of space in their own. While some parents have no choice, but to force their kids to walk, others are forced to make means of any affordable and available transport to get their children ...[Audio distorted.] to their schools in other communities. And even though the Province provides scholar transportation, not all are lucky enough to meet its requirements and benefit from it, forcing them to alternatives to access education.

On Tuesday, while on her way to school, 12-year-old Chairmaine from Tambo Village was killed while crossing Duinefontein Road in Heideveld when she was tragically hit by a taxi. In a separate incident on the same day, another five children were killed in a tragic accident on AZ Berman Drive, also while on their way to school in Mitchells Plain, when the bakkie they were travelling in lost control and crashed. These kids, too, were travelling from another community to attend schools in Mitchells Plain. Some of them were said to have travelled from Khayelitsha.

A few weeks before this on 24 April, on the same ...[Audio distorted.] stretch around about the same time, another primary school student was killed and several others injured in a taxi crash also on AZ Berman Drive, while travelling to schools, once again, also from Khayelitsha. Two months before that, on 29 January a matriculant was killed on the same road in a car accident just a day after residents took to the streets to protest over traffic control and proper road measures to be implemented on AZ Berman Drive, following ongoing incidents or rather, accidents.

The fact of the matter is that the number of children being killed on this road has increased over the years and yet, nothing has been done, despite the residents' pleas for assistance. The root cause of this is that many of these kids must walk or travel via public transportation out of their communities to access education and have to rush daily to make it in time for schools or else they would need to face consequences for late coming.

The Economic Freedom Fighters herewith notes how this DA-led Municipality and Provincial Government have ignored residents' pleas for assistance on several occasions ...[Audio distorted.] which has ...[Audio distorted.] for children walking or travelling to school, and calls for stricter measures to be implemented when it comes to transporting school children, along with the visibility of Law Enforcement at all schools ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): ...to ensure that no driver is intoxicated using unroadworthy vehicles and mainly, transporting children in conditions which ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): ...would endanger them. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr C FRY (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, on Friday I tabled the Western Cape Provincial Powers Bill before the Standing Committee on Premier and Constitutional matters. This Bill is motivated by recognition, but the ANC National Government is unable or unwilling to act in the best interests of the residents of the Western Cape. ...[Audio distorted.] † Lixesha ngoku. Dit is

nou tyd. [It is now time.] Now is the time for the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and Executive to identify areas in which the assertion of provincial powers is necessary and explore all available legal steps to provide services to its residents.

If passed, the Western Cape Provincial Powers Bill will play an important role in ensuring that the Province assert existing powers or seek additional powers in the areas of policing, public transport, energy, trade, and harbours. Time and again, the people of the Western Cape have been failed by a National Government that lacks the political will, urgency, and know-how to tackle the very serious challenges of rolling blackouts, failing infrastructure, economic strife, and runaway crime.

Through this Bill, the Western Cape can be empowered to, among other things, identify and remedy failures of National Government, promote the assertion of existing provincial powers, and actively seek the assignment or delegation of additional power. The DA remains committed to the devolution of national powers to capable provincial governments. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Hon Deputy Speaker, we hear daily about all the song and dance of this Province, but we do not address the imbalances between rich and poor. It is a fact: gutter education promotes crime in all its forms in our province. The Western Cape Education Department (WCED)

should focus on the thousands of unplaced learners in appropriate schools that have parents struggling and panicking. We are now facing a lack of education and I do not want to imagine what we are going to face a few years down the line.

When Model-C schools needed the numbers to secure pro rata jobs, their doors were open to all. The school in Moorreesburg, namely Dirkie Uys, has turned people of colour away to attend the schools built in their area without any necessary facilities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, to prevent losing lives again, GOOD proposes the following: that the WCED revises the current school placement in place; that the WCED develops a transportation plan for learners travelling more than 2 kilometres to and from school; and that the WCED in consultation with the Safety Support Portfolio, strengthens the measures in place.

Hon Deputy Speaker, GOOD expresses our heartfelt condolences to the families of the five children who have lost their lives and calls on this House to ensure complete support to the families and the one child recovering in hospital. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. [Applause.] I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy

Speaker, the ACDP in the Western Cape is absolutely mind boggled that robbers will stoop so low as to enter into a school and rob educators and learners of their cell phones and essential equipment from the school. To crown it all, the robbers hijacked a parent's car and sped off. This all happened while the Grade 12 learners wrote their supplementary exams at the Noxolo Xauka Primary School, Khayelitsha, on Tuesday, 30 May. Learners who had the courage to rewrite supplementary exams are now traumatised due to the actions of these perpetrators.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP in the Western Cape urges residents to report this matter to the police if they have any information relating to this unfortunate incident. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the ANC.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC rises to express its disappointment in the cyberattack that has befallen this Legislature. Even more so, the ANC wishes to note with utter dismay how the leadership of this institution has responded to the attack. Today is day 10 of the cyberattack. The Parliamentary Oversight Committee sat last week, and they were briefed on the attack, but this briefing was, indeed, a briefing.

The leadership of this institution has not taken political parties into its confidence to admit that their systems were not sharp enough. The leadership

of this institution has not been open and transparent about the extent of this attack. Transparency and accountability are precisely the values and characteristics of democracy that this House and its leadership should be promoting.

The ANC has consistently criticised the bloated budget awarded to Programme 1 of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament (WCPP) budget which is Administration. When criticised, the bloated Office of the Speaker and the bloated Office of the Secretary, we were told and assured that the reason for the huge increase in Programme 1's budget was because of ITD services. Yet, the reality remained: a 29% increase in the budget of the Office of the Speaker, a 35% increase in the budget of the Office of the Secretary, and a decrease of 11% in Institutional Enablement, the budget for computer services was cut by 54%.

There is no way we can blame ITD staff for this cyberattack. They suffer under the tyranny of a WCPP leadership that continuously bloats their offices, while critical services, such as ITD have to suffer budget cuts. It is typical DA-leadership, cuts for everyone else, cuts for essential services, cuts to critical budgets, but no cuts to the leaders. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] I recognise ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): *Ja, ja*, it is true. It is true!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, last week a certain hon member of this House brought wild accusations to the floor without them being ...[Audio distorted.] substantiated. This follows a long history of certain hon members on the opposite side of the isle, wilfully using their parliamentary protection to grandstand and besmirch the characters of others.

†Dit was onopreg vir die leier van die ANC om agb Minister Simmers daarvan te beskuldig dat hy van laasweek se Sitting weggehardloop het, as gevolg van sekere bewerings, en kyk wie het nou weggehardloop. [Tussenwerpsels.] Soos gewoonlik is die ANC se weergawe van gebeure ...[Tussenwerpsel.] ...ver van die waarheid af. [Tussenwerpsel.] Die agb Minister was nie in die Huis nie weens sy siekteverklaring, maar wat anders kan ons van die skynheilige ANC verwag.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[It was dishonest of the leader of the ANC to accuse hon Minister Simmers that he ran away from last week's Sitting, because of certain allegations, and look who has now run away. [Interjections.] As usual, the ANC's account of events ...[Interjection.] ... is far removed from the truth. [Interjection.] The

hon Minister was not in the House because of his sickness statement, but what else can we expect from the hypocritical ANC.] Unlike the ANC, the DA has a long track record ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We were told ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, can I please be protected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We were told now we are ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...of holding anyone accused of wrongdoing accountable, both inside and outside of our party. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC is throwing stones from a glass house ...[Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): The ANC feels that the hon Speaker was doing that [Audio distorted.] while the pain is still there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...the Speaker was running away from accountability ...[Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): ...but the victim is no longer ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no. Please mute the hon member, thank you. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Unlike the ANC, the DA has a long track record of holding anyone accused of wrongdoing accountable, both inside and outside of our party. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC throws stones from a glass house. They speak about running away from accountability, yet they cannot even get their own house in order. Whilst we are all present and working today, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...the ANC currently has got two members who have been suspended from party activities, yet they still draw taxpayer funded

salaries from this Legislature ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...so the hon Dugmore is so concerned about removing officials. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I ask through you, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...when will those members accused of corruption, fraud, and incitement to murder ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...be removed by your party from this House. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please ...[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): At least we deal. We deal.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are going to have to speak up. Hon members, can we please allow the hon member to speak. ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They forgot ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): There is ...[Audio distorted.] discipline.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Where are your members?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, one minute please. Hon Marais, just hold on. I cannot hear the hon member online. Please, hon members, we have given each one an opportunity. You may proceed, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is not ...[Audio distorted.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...the preamble to the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...to the Western Cape Constitution begins with the words:

“In humble submission to Almighty God, we, the people of the Western Cape.”

Emphasis on ‘people of the Western Cape’. Now, the Freedom Front Plus recognises that the indigenous people of the Western Cape were the Khoi and the San, Griqua people. We also recognise the region was subsequently settled by successive waves of people including Dutch, German, French,

Malay, British, Xhosa, and other cultural groups. We also recognise Afrikaans which was an indigenous language of the Western Cape, and which remains the most widely spoken language in the province. [Interjections.] And we also recognise the demographic compositions of the people which differ substantially from the rest of South Africa.

Therefore, I give notice that the ...[Audio distorted.] MP the ...[Audio distorted.] to vote, hon Deputy Speaker, and the Secretary and the hon Premier, of my intention to formally record the will of the people of the Western Cape in a Bill to be identified as a people, who then in accordance with customary international law, the injunction of which is affirmed in the South African Constitution, shall be entitled to exercise their right to self-determination and to provide for matters incidental thereto.

This Bill has already been given to the proper ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...officials of Parliament, which I will be tabling ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...as the Western Cape People's Bill. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, Al Jama-Ah extends its deepest condolences to the families, schools, and communities on the tragic loss of five learners who died in a horrific road accident on their way to school on Tuesday, 30 May 2023. We pray for a speedy recovery for the injured learner.

The Western Cape Education Department advocates that learner safety is very important to the Department. The recent tragic accident tells a different story on the Department's concern for learner safety. Neither does the trauma learners endure daily when gangsters go on shooting sprees in and around school premises. Neither is the Department concerned for learner safety when learners have to walk past several shebeens and drug dens on their way to and back from school, exposing them to harassment and in many cases, violent attacks from gangsters.

To come back to Tuesday's tragic accident, it is deplorable that the Department wants to shift the blame on parents to ensure safe school transport for their children. No parent will wilfully put their children's safety at risk. The WCED must get to the bottom of this tragic case. It is a clear indictment on the WCED's poor performance to ensure that every school is equipped with the necessary resources and has space to accommodate learners at schools closest to their homes, and for the safe and secure learning environment, thus alleviating the burden on parents to fork

out extra transport costs. Many parents do not have a choice to provide their children with the best transport to school. Parents want their children ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is up. I recognise the DA.

Mr G PRETORIUS (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I have often drawn attention to the fact that our provincial Department of Health and Wellness does not get the recognition it so clearly deserves. Their provision of adequate healthcare is one of the most challenging aspects of service delivery for any government to get right. Even in wealthy countries, we see healthcare systems struggling under ever increasing burdens and in a country like ours where disastrous economic policy has plunged our nation into darkness and despair, the provision of healthcare is more difficult than ever. And yet, despite everything, this Government is making progress.

Recent months have seen our Health Department's R1,3-billion efforts towards an aggressive infrastructure improvement and expansion begin to bear fruit. At the new Somerset Hospital in Cape Town, efforts are underway to improve the experience of patients by upgrading and expanding the

hospital's operating theatres and constructing a new acute psychiatric unit.

The Brackengate transitional care facility is rapidly approaching fully operational status, meaning that even more beds will soon be available to lessen the number of patients seeking treatment at Helderberg, Eerste River, Tygerberg and Karl Bremer Hospitals. And finally, a R36-million project is underway to revitalise and expand Stellenbosch Hospital.

Hon Deputy Speaker, these initiatives prove that despite the horribly unfavourable situation created by the ANC Government at the national level, DA governments remain capable of leading and delivering regardless. With this in mind, it is safe to say that the DA remains the only party capable of pulling the country as a whole out of its current predicament. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. That brings us to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or members of the Executive an opportunity to respond to the hon members' statements for not more than five minutes collectively. Are there any hon Ministers who would like to respond? No. We seem to be fine. That brings us to the end of Members' Statements.

Before I continue to the final part of the programme, I erred in remembering to wish the hon Minister Wenger a very happy birthday today. [Applause.]

MOTIONS

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move over to Notices of Motion. In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motion are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the unsafe transportation of learners to and from schools.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates mass and fatal shootings that seem to be common in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Western Cape Provincial Powers Bill.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the possible collusion between the police and gangs in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the functioning of healthcare facilities in the province.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Western Cape Provincial Parliament cyberattack.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the delay in getting the railway lines and related infrastructure in the Western Cape in working condition to the benefit of the community.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will now move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform you that in terms of the new Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 30 May 2023. Hon members are also reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this Sitting, that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 30 May 2023, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this Sitting of this House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following member motions have been approved by the Programming Authority: hon Bosman, hon Christians, hon Kama, hon Lekker, and hon

Bans.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the athletes who were selected for the Proteas team that will be representing South Africa at the Netball World Cup in July this year.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I move without notice:

That the House applauds teenage sisters Cleo and Amy Adriaan of Bishop Lavis; notes that the sisters, 17 and 14 years respectively, will present their talent at an international robotics competition in America in July of this year; notes that they are part of Team Syre, the robotics team at Goodwood College; notes that Byron Lukas of the *Daily Voice* wrote in the 24 May edition that the sisters had success in the national competition that was held in Johannesburg in February month; notes that the two sisters build and programme robots from scratch; notes that, for the national competition, they designed, built and programmed their robot called “Shrek”; notes that Shrek is programmed to fetch and bring items; notes that their proud parents, Josh and Yolanda, say their

daughters spend day and night with their books and at the robotics laboratory; notes that the sisters are excited to make the trip to the USA: Cleo says, “this will be one of my highlights for my matric year, but I would love to go sightseeing and see how things work in the first tech challenge because it is different to what it is here in SA.”; notes that the sisters need funding of R100 000 to make the trip and the family is busy with fundraising to meet this target; and wishes Cleo and Amy well in the coming competition.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with pride and congratulates sisters Cleo Adriaan (17) and Amy Adriaan (14) from Bishop Lavis who have been invited to showcase their talents at an international robotics competition in the USA; notes that they have a talent of building and programming prototype robots from scratch; notes that their latest design that got this spot in the competition is a robot named Shrek that can fetch and bring things; and wishes the teens all success with the competition because they will be representing the country. †Halala mantombazana halala.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep shock and sadness the passing away of comrade Mithrasagaran ‘Murthie’ Naidoo; notes that Murthie was a political activist, political prisoner, banned person, Communist Party member and member of the Parents of Detainees Committee (an organisation set up to assist political detainees during apartheid); notes that he was first detained in 1965 on his way to visit his brother Indres Naidoo who was imprisoned on Robben Island for sabotage; notes that he was arrested at the airport in Cape Town and was held overnight in a dark, filthy cell in Roeland Street prison; notes that the loss of such an eminent liberation fighter should move us to cherish, defend and sustain the freedoms and opportunities we enjoy today in a free South Africa; and sends heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of this struggle stalwart. †Hamba kahle Mkhonto.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates the SA Operational Task Team of Crime Intelligence, Home Affairs, International Relations, Interpol, the NPA and the Hawks (DPCI) for the arrest of Rwandan’s fugitive, Fulgence Kayishema, who was on the run since 1994; notes that Kayishema is alleged to have orchestrated the killing of 2 000 women, men and children at a church in Rwanda during the 1994 genocide; notes

that he has been living in Paarl under a false identity of Donatien Nibashumba; and congratulates the team for the stellar work of arresting such criminals.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in the individual members' names as if that member had read them out aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity to hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 152(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that 30 minutes as per the Standing Rule 152(d) will start now. I recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you. I move without notice:

That the House notes that on 16 May 2023 elderly people went out in their numbers to picket outside the Nyanga Clinic demanding better

healthcare services, such as adequate doctors and an adequate supply of medicine; further notes that these elderly people have been subjected to long queues over the years, whilst there is also a high rate of medical files going missing in that clinic; and in conclusion, I am concluding by asking that the Western Cape Department of Health and Wellness to start having 24-hour clinics across the province, especially in townships and rural areas, which continue to experience high demand of medical services; such an initiative will also assist in making sure that residents do not queue the whole day in order to receive medical attention. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, objection to ...*[Interjection.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Klaas. Is he online?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Yes, I am online.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue, hon Klaas. *[Laughter.]*

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): I move without notice:

That the House notes that the security of tenure is of paramount importance when it comes to security guards, cleaners, porters, temporary nurses and gardeners who work in different Western Cape Government departments as outsourced workers; further notes that most of these workers are mostly denied access to loans and other benefits by the mainstream financial sector markets for purposes of bonds and other needs incidental thereto due to lack of job security; and concludes by asking all Western Cape Government departments to insource all workers falling in similar categories so that they can have security of tenure, which will improve their lives to escape perpetual poverty. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Yes, objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon

Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the outcome of the arbitration hearings of the sacked Heathfield High School principal, Mr Wesley Neumann, will be known within one week from now; further notes that Mr Neumann was victimised, harassed, and sacked by the Western Cape Education Department for abiding by a School Governing Body's decision not to re-open the school during the first wave of COVID-19 in 2020; further recognises that the decision taken by Mr Neumann was in the best interest of the learners, educators, and the school community considering the vast differences in resources and challenges from school to school; further recognises the solidarity and support displayed for Mr Neumann by the Special Action Committee, progressive educators, and the public at large; that this House joins the Special Action Committee in saluting Mr Neumann and his family for enduring this persecution from the Western Cape Education Department for more than three years. I so move. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): I move without notice ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. If we can just – your microphone. Please can you begin again, just for the record purpose.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Is it on?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): No problem. I move without notice:

That the House takes note of the Andries Tatane Clean-up campaign introduced by the Economic Freedom Fighters to keep communities clean in the whole of South Africa including the Western Cape; and further notes that the campaign was launched in response to failures by all spheres of government including municipalities which cannot execute the service delivery mandate of keeping communities clean by picking up waste; and concludes that in the Western Cape the campaign has a positive impact not only in keeping township communities clean, but also forcing DA-run municipalities to execute their service delivery mandates. So, I move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to

the motion being moved without notice?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Object!

An HON MEMBER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections? Agreed to [Interjections.]

Hon MEMBERS: Yes, no, an objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You agree? [Interjections.] You were shaking your head, sorry. No, no. [Interjections.] There are objections. I recognise the objections, hon Bosman. Thank you. That motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): I move without notice:

That the House takes notice of the recently released 4th Quarter South African Crime Statistics covering the period of 1 January 2023 to 31 March 2023; further notes that Cape Town Central Police Station remains number one in the country when it comes to stations with a high number of reported crimes, whilst Deft also continues to remain at number three in the country when it comes to high rates of murder, with the murder ratio increasing by 11,9% in the whole Western Cape Province in the period under review; and concludes that the Western

Cape remains the crime capital of South Africa as it is clear that the Safety Plan is useless. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Klaas, it was hardly audible, but I am going to pose. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object!

An HON MEMBER: No objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion ...*[Interjection.]*

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Objection! *[Laughter.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise ...*[Interjection.]*

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Order! I now recognise the hon America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House expresses profound sorrow and grief at the tragic loss of five innocent children who tragically lost their lives in a devastating car accident in Mitchells Plain while on their way to school, as well as the young 12-year-old girl who was fatally hit by a car in Heideveld on Tuesday, 30 May 2023. The knowledge that these precious lives could have been saved makes these tragedies even more heart-wrenching. That the House deeply mourns the untimely deaths of these young souls and stands in solidarity with the grieving families who have been robbed of their beloved children. We offer our heartfelt support during this unimaginably difficult time; calls for collective efforts to strengthen the fight against the use of illegal school transportation vehicles. It is imperative that we take decisive measures to prevent further tragedies and ensure the safety of all children commuting to school; and urges that those found responsible for operating illegal school transport vehicles be prosecuted to the fullest extent of the law; holding these individuals accountable will serve as a deterrent and send a strong message that such reckless actions will not be tolerated. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Sileku.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): On behalf of the hon Sileku, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you. I move without notice:

That this House acknowledges and commends the exceptional performance of the majority of municipalities in the province, that have achieved remarkable results in both the Auditor-General's Annual Audit Outcomes Report and the Ratings Afrika report; that this House extends its heartfelt congratulations to the municipalities of Saldanha Bay, George, Mossel Bay, and Swartland for their remarkable achievement in securing their positions among the top five best-run municipalities in the entire country. Their dedication to effective governance and sound financial management deserves admiration and recognition. That this House takes note of Kannaland, Beaufort West, and Laingsburg municipalities who continue to fall behind. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There ...[Interjection.]

Hon MEMBERS: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Kaiser-Philander.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that today, 1 June, marks the annual celebration of World Milk Day. World Milk Day was established by the Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations in 2021, in recognition of the importance of milk as a global food. The day is also a celebration of the dairy sector; pays special tribute to our dairy sector here in the Western Cape and recognises that our province is home to more than 30% of the milk producers in South Africa; notes that the sector is a billion-rand industry and a vital contributor to our agricultural economy. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to

the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I now recognise the hon Mvimbi. Is he online? Hon Mvimbi? No? No one in his place? I am going to move on. I recognise the hon Lekker ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you there? You may proceed, hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and is saddened by the death of five school children who passed away in the most tragic way. A bakkie that was transporting the children to school crashed into a bus. This problem speaks to a bigger issue about accessibility of schools around our poor and working-class areas, where there are very few safety checks for various transport operators and the DA Government is doing very little in this regard; that the House demands that the Western Cape Transport Department's Law Enforcement impounds all bakkies and unsafe scholar transport. We appreciate the driver being arrested and we hope justice is served. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, I know there are a lot of

similar motions. I am not going to rule on that, but I am going to just pose to the House. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. ...[Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There will be – noted. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with shock that the Herzlia High School in Cape Town is indoctrinating and publicly admits to influencing their learners on racism and prejudice against Palestinians; that the House condemns this school and its management for encouraging its learners to join the Israeli Defence Force who are currently killing innocent Palestinians and expanding a racist imperialist state. We call on the hon Premier to intervene on this matter. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the struggles of the poor and working class Bitterfontein community on the West Coast to keep their children in school due to learner transport challenges. The school in Nuwerus is 16 kilometres from Bitterfontein and parents cannot afford to pay for the hired transport to school causing a very high dropout rate; that the House calls on the Western Cape Education Department to make provisions for these learners as the matter has been brought to their attention. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being printed on the Order Paper – my apologies. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections?

An HON MEMBER: We object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We have objected. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Sayed again. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That House notes with serious concern the high number of applications for Black children (African, Coloured, and Indian) that are being rejected by the so-called prestigious former Model-C schools in the province; notes further that as the ANC we are already inundated ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...by complaints from concerned parents ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...many of whom applied to eight different schools and have been

rejected by all eight schools; ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...this includes Mr. Adams who applied to various public government schools for his son Ayaan only to receive rejection letters from all of them; Mr. Adams says this outcome left him deeply troubled and it raises serious concerns about the fairness and transparency of the application process; Mr. Adams, who resides 2,2 kilometres from Wynberg Boys and Wynberg Girls Junior School, has had applications for his daughter rejected by the Girls school, even though she is at the top of her Grade 4 class at Golden Grove and is actively participating in sports; notes further that a similar case is that of Ms Galada, a teacher by profession who applied timeously and correctly to five different schools and was rejected; ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...by all 5 schools; ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): My hand has been raised. Recognise me.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...the first option was Rouxville Primary and the second was De Kuilen Primary, both of which are within 5 minutes' drive ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...from her home and two other schools that rejected her child are in Brackenfell; notes further that she wrote to us seeking assistance, ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...stating: ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Recognise me!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...“this application system is failing us as parents because I applied a

day after the applications were opened in March and submitted all what was required, and yet my child has been rejected by all schools”; acknowledges that the online application system and admissions policies of schools, especially in the former Model-C schools, are used to discriminate and keep African, Coloured and Indian learners out of the schools to keep the schools White; and calls on hon MEC Maynier and hon Premier Winde to directly intervene and bring to an end this racist practice by schools to keep out Black learners. This is why the ANC supports the BELA Bill to deal decisively with these discriminatory practices – a Bill opposed by the racist DA and their bedfellows, the Freedom Front Plus and the ACDP. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection, objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. [Interjections.] Hon members, one minute. Hon Klaas, your hand is up. You cannot have a point of order in a motion without notice. [Interjections.] And then you were shouting. So, can I just ask: do you have something pertinent to interrupt the hon member on a Motion without Notice? Hon Klaas?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Yes, this was. Yes, this was something that is urgent. We, as the Standing Committee of the Infrastructure ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon Klaas. [Laughter.] You do not have a right to describe, to explain, to defend in this part of the Motions of the House. [Interjections.] So, you just need to vote.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker, just for the apology. The apology.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): It just was the apology.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon Klaas, sorry. Apologies. I am not going to accept that. So, I am just going to for the record say that there are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Just give me a second. I now recognise the hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the funding challenges faced by the child protection service organisations in the Western Cape. As the country commemorates Child Protection Week, Western Cape NGOs find

themselves in a hopeless place, as the subsidies received by NGOs from the provincial Department of Social Development amount to a mere 42%, whilst they have to carry the burden of child protection services heavily on their backs. As seen in the media reports, Children's Institute senior researcher, Lucy Jamieson, said, "In the Western Cape, NGOs render 55% of all child protection services, but they are required, by law and service level agreements, to deliver the same standards of care as the Government for a fraction of the costs." Not only are these NGOs unable to do basic child services, they have to let go of staff because of budget constraints. We urge and demand Social Development MEC, hon Sharna Fernandez and her Department to take a stand and do what is right to protect the children of the Western Cape. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with shock the rising violent crimes and murders in Swellendam which are becoming a serious concern in the community as the people are not feeling safe; notes further that Leaton September,

an innocent young man, fell victim to these crimes as he was brutally murdered in Suurbraak, and sadly became one of the many statistics amongst the young people killing each other in Swellendam; laments the ongoing murders of youth by other young people that are becoming a norm in Swellendam while the hon Western Cape hon Premier does not seem to care about the plight of victims of crime in the rural areas, as his so-called Safety Plan does not provide for the deployment of LEAP officers outside of the Metro; and calls for the expansion of the hon Winde's Plan to also cater for areas outside of the Metro so that victims of crime in areas like Swellendam can also feel safe. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: None.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Windvogel. *[Interjections.]*

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): *[Laughter.]* Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the visit by ANC MPLs to the Langa

Day Hospital in Bonteheuwel on Monday where we saw for ourselves a number of serious challenges hampering service delivery in the facility; notes further that many challenges at the facility were caused by the delays in the filling of critical posts, like that of the facility manager which was only filled in January this year, and while many other vacancies have been filled, we call on the Provincial Government to prioritize the filling of the help desk as well as the clerk vacancies; further notes that as the ANC we are extremely concerned with the administration system at the hospital which by management's own admission is a bit of a mess, as patients' folders were lying in the passage behind the pharmacy; even in the pharmacy area, folders were disorganised, and as a result of this, the hospital has a big challenge of duplicate folders with some missing important patient history; acknowledges that the challenges of the hospital including long waiting hours at the facility emanates from this poor filing system which is as a result of delays by the Provincial Government to do the much important infrastructure development at the facility, which would include building a bigger and effective reception area; accepts that the poor services of the challenges at the hospital should be partly blamed on the DA Government and not on the management which is doing a good job under the circumstances; and calls on the Provincial Government to accelerate the infrastructure development at the hospital, as well as for the Standing Committee to go on an official visit to the hospital soon. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I now recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commemorates the 100th anniversary of the ending of the Irish Civil War and continues to call for the unity of all republicans in Ireland; calls on the Irish Government to convene and resource a Citizen's Assembly on the unity of the Irish people to plan and prepare for constitutional change; furthermore, encourages the Irish Government to use its international diplomatic resources to secure a date for a unity referendum; calls on all progressive international political and civic forces to support the process of constitutional change and the achievement of Irish unity. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. ...[Audio distorted.] Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No, there are objections. [Interjections.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Hon members.

...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is because you support a

...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, can we have some order, please.

...[Audio distorted.] ...comes to the end of this Sitting. ...[Audio distorted.]

That also concludes the business for the House and the House is now adjourned. The Secretary will end the meeting and all members will be exited from this session. Thank you very much.

The House adjourned at 18:07.