
THURSDAY, 10 AUGUST 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Good afternoon to all our members and to all our guests online. Before we proceed I would like to remind the members of some of the logistical arrangements and Rules specifically for this entire virtual Sitting.

I trust, hon members, that everyone has been connected to participate in this virtual Sitting of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in terms of Rule 1(A) of the Standing Rules, with all our members in remote attendance by electronic means.

The Western Cape Provincial Parliament remains fully operational with members also doing work in their constituencies to assist the public in whatever way possible as well as our committees playing their oversight role in an effective, efficient and transparent manner. Our Sitting today will be conducted virtually in terms of the Standing Rules and Directives issued on 17 April 2020.

Allow me to highlight and remind you of some of the important directives in this regard. The Secretary and his Administration will maintain dedicated technical support during this Sitting. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order. The Serjeant-at-arms will record members' attendance.

Members, all your microphones have been muted and you are requested to only unmute them should you need to raise a point of order. Please may I ask that you use the raise function on your computers to be recognised by the Presiding Officer, and, members, just to remind the media – who also have access to MS Teams – may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras. Finally, I would just like to say that for this Sitting, Language Translation Services are unfortunately not available.

Hon members, please be reminded that no interjections are permitted during these kinds of Sittings, and to this end I draw the hon members' attention to Rule 40 of the Standing Rules. Thank you. I now recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Good afternoon, Deputy Speaker, all hon members. Deputy Speaker, may I please ask the indulgence of the House. I move without notice:

That Questions to the Premier as per the Order Paper stand over until next week. The Premier is currently engaged in a very urgent and important meeting with regards to the strike action. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Chief Whip. I trust there are no objections. Are there any objections?

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): I just want to know something, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise you, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Yes. If you are going to postpone this meeting, will you again have a different list of people allowed to ask questions, or does the same list remain for the next meeting?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise you, hon... [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Will I still be on number 4 or not at all?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will recognise the Chief Whip to be able to answer as the Chief Whip heads the Programming Authority and the lists. Over to you, Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the list and the draw, as it took place this past Friday, is set, so I believe that the same will apply, that the matter will just stand over until next week.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Chief Whip. Hon Marais, is that in order?

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Very much in order, thank you, Chief Whip.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. There were no objections, so agreed to. So just for the record, the Questions to the Premier will stand over.

[Questions to the Premier to stand over as agreed to by the House.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. We now proceed to the Interpellations. I now recognise the hon Minister Allen.

INTERPELLATIONS

1. Mr G Bosman to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

How will devolution empower the Western Cape Government to address challenges surrounding community safety in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, Deputy Speaker. I trust that I am audible.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are audible.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank member Bosman for raising this particular interpellation. It is vital in terms of where we are and I would like to reply as follows.

Deputy Speaker, the current model of policing is centralised with one National Police Service for the entire country. That particular current system is hierarchical and provides that policy and instructions originate from the National Minister and the National Commissioner. Section 119(1) of the Constitution, Deputy Speaker, provides for a single police force with political responsibility concentrated in the National Executive. The objects of the Police Service are to prevent combat and investigate crime; to maintain

public order; to protect and secure the inhabitants of the Republic and their property and uphold and enforce the law. That is Section 205 of the Constitution, but, Deputy Speaker, with escalating crime rates across our entire country, together with declining rates of conviction of crimes, this system has showed year-on-year that it is incapable of dealing with the complex nature of crime in the Western Cape, including gangsterism, extortion, conflict in the taxi industry and violence fuelled by high levels of substance abuse and the availability of firearms and ammunition. Deputy Speaker, a devolved or more Decentralised Police Service would be more responsive to the policing needs of the Western Cape.

Deputy Speaker, when developing National Policing Policy, the National Minister of Police must consult the Provincial Governments to take into account the policing needs and priorities of the province, as determined by the Provincial Executive. That is Section 206 of the Constitution.

Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government annually compiles a policing needs and priorities report and submits it to the National Minister, but Deputy Speaker, despite this, it is not evident that these needs have been taken into account. We have often stated that fact. There is as yet no National Policing Policy nor is there a policy which makes provision for particular provincial needs. The policing powers of the Province are limited in terms of making recommendations on the PNPs, on the oversight over the police outlined in Section 206, and on making recommendations to the Minister on its findings.

It is a discretion in the current framework of the Minister, the National Minister, whether or not to implement the findings and, as I have stated, year-on-year it is hardly implemented, hence, Deputy Speaker, a devolved policing system would be more responsive so that we are able to attend to the needs in this province and the needs of diverse communities within it. It should be able to develop specific policy and operating practises to respond to these needs.

In addition, Deputy Speaker, key operational decisions should be evidence-based and informed by these needs. Policing resources could also be deployed based on where the need is most and monitored closely from a provincial level. The police would be held accountable to the Provincial Government, ensuring the Province has more effective oversight and control over the police.

Deputy Speaker, having decision-making and accountability located much closer to the communities could go a long way to restoring the communities' trust in the police. This particular call is now resonating even in KZN and in Gauteng. In Gauteng there is talk about a new policing model.

If I can go further, Deputy Speaker, being more responsive and having direct influence over deployment and operational decisions are likely to result in more efficient and effective policing and to impact by reducing the levels of

crime.

The manner in which we are strategically deploying our LEAP officers, Deputy Speaker, in areas where the need is greatest is clearly demonstrating the impact of doing so based on data and of evidence. The evidence-based approach of the Western Cape is already bearing some fruit. Based on the Fourth Quarterly Crime Stats between January and March, which was released in May 2023, murder increased by 3,4% in the country, but here in our province we saw a reduction of 14,1%. In 13 of our hotspot areas where LEAP is implemented, murder also drastically decreased. There were 872 murders... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: But we are consistently calling for this devolution of policing powers. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister, I recognise the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Good afternoon, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you very much to the hon Minister for his response. I think the Minister's words and the events of the last few days confirm what we in DA have known for a long time, that devolution is absolutely necessary for a safe and prosperous

Western Cape. If we are to have any hope of turning the tide, and win the fight against crime in our province we must help ourselves because National Government has proven incapable of helping us. For years, we have pleaded with the National Police Minister to allocate more resources to this Province. We have as a Provincial Parliament engaged with the National Police Service on the Policing Needs and Priorities but we have either been met with silence or empty promises in this province. As it stands now, the number of operational SAPS members in the Western Cape sits at a record low and it remains far below SAPS' own targets. Devolution will allow this Government to fill that gap, to train more police officers and ultimately make our streets safer. We have seen the value that the Law Enforcement Advance Officers have added in the last week during this turbulent, violent time and that is what at the core of the DA's push for devolution, not high-minded idealism, but a pragmatic approach to ensuring the safety of our people, and using the Minister's own words:

"The definition of insanity is doing the same thing over and over and expecting different results."

Unfortunately, management of the South African Police Service sitting in Pretoria has yet to catch on. For years they have maintained that the same outdated unresponsive, unscientific policing practises, meanwhile, the world has moved on, and so have our criminals, and leaving them behind.

Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bosman. I recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, it is shocking to see that the crime rate in this province has increased since the Premier introduced what it terms as the Safety Plan. However, it was obvious that there would be an increase in crime when the DA is put in power to run this province, because the only thing that was done through this introduction of the LEAP Programme was to terrorise homeless people and to conduct illegal evictions of our poor people as opposed to the real issue here, which is that of fighting murder and crime.

The Western Cape remains the capital of crime in South Africa, as it always features its many townships in the National Crime Statistics, when it comes to the top 30 stations in which murder has been committed. But, Deputy Speaker, it does not make sense how the same DA Provincial Administration, which could not and still cannot administer the so-called Safety Plan, that it would now demand the devolution of policing powers by introducing a flimsy and useless Provincial Bill titled the Powers' Bill.

Deputy Speaker, this week alone, more than four people have been shot and killed in the streets of Eastridge as a result of ongoing gang activity which has become a norm. This despite the Province having the so-called Safety Plan. Deputy Speaker, the crime statistics also show that the murder rate in Mitchells Plain alone is on the rise and this is really concerning for a

province which has a failing Safety Plan but still wants to be given a further task of administering the provincial policing system.

With this being said, Deputy Speaker, it makes me wonder, is it a good idea to ask for policing powers to be devolved into the province, whilst the Province is still failing to administer its self-imposed Safety Plan because what is this Minister doing through the Safety Plan to ensure that gang-activity decreases in areas such as Mitchells Plain?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Cassiem. I recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Deputy Speaker, can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you well. Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the ACDP has said it before and we are very strong of believing that evolution must go to the lowest, lowest level. It is clear that the ANC National Government has failed us as a province with under-resourcing of police personnel, under-resourcing of police [distortion] and it is a major problem. Now we know that National Government's responsibility is to protect our citizens but what does the Province have? It is only oversight powers and no operational powers. So when there is an

analysis done or we see that more police are needed in one area, the Province's hands are cut off and that is a major problem because according to me, and sitting on the Police Oversight and Community Safety Portfolio Committee, I know that when the Minister accounts, he knows, he and his Department know what happens on the ground, but they do not. Fortunately, he has a good relationship, the Department and the Minister have a good relationship with the Police Commissioner but that is not good enough. What is good enough is when our people are safe, when our people can walk the streets safely, and that is not happening; so, Deputy Speaker, the appeal from the ACDP is that we do not play political games, but think of the safety of our people. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I recognise hon Bans.

Ms A BANS (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, member Bosman cannot even convince Standing Committee meetings for this portfolio, yet he has the audacity to call for devolution, When the DA took office in the Province in 2009 the crime rate was very manageable. In the previous year the ANC Government had decreased the ratio of the reported murders by over 23,9% thanks to its effective and efficient crime-fighting strategies and close collaboration with communities. However, the DA dismantled all of this. It alienated communities and pushed them away from crime fighting. It weakened and destabilised Community Police Forums and failed to address the spatial design of crime hotspots, which contributed

significantly to the high murder rate. It is also the DA that started and continues to sustain extortion in the province by awarding lucrative contracts to companies linked to gangs and enablers of state capture. The DA's poor handling of the Community Safety portfolio has created fundamental weaknesses in the fight against crime. To mask its failures, the DA is now making frivolous calls for devolution. I want to state categorically that devolution is not the answer to fighting crime in the Western Cape. It is fake penicillin that will not work.

The ANC maintains that we have a single police service in the country and that this will not change. The Government's priority is not the establishment and implementation of a single police service in order to operationalise the 2016 White Paper on Policy.

The DA's proposal for devolution is fundamentally flawed and would have disastrous consequences for our province. We are already seeing this with the ongoing taxi unrest, which is being fuelled by none other than the racist Jean-Pierre Smith in the City of Cape Town. I therefore call on the MEC to denounce these frivolous calls by his party in favour of the implementation of a single police service. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Bans. I recognise the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon

Deputy Speaker, I brought this question to ask serious questions about policing and I hope that the rampant crime and the violence of the last week would allow my colleagues on the Opposition to rise above their own political buffoonery, but we really expect no real solutions from the ANC and the EFF as they have proven that they prefer to break the law rather than to uphold the law. A Western Cape devolved police service would ensure that we link detectives with prosecutors to improve prosecution outcomes. Perhaps the reason the ANC does not want us to have investigative and command and control of the police is because they know that the DA will not hesitate to arrest anyone involved in crime including politicians, and politicians, we know from political parties, have been involved in manufacturing crimes. I am surprised that member Bans has such a good grasp of the situation in the Western Cape but member Bans have not brought that to the Standing Committee. Standing Committee meetings that regularly happened, but we are not sure who the ANC spokesperson on policing is, but what we do know is that a DA-run Western Cape Police would establish regular maintenance of all resources... [Interjection.] ...a DA Western Cape Police would apply data and science in policing... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...and will make sure that we are strategic in our use of crime intelligence measuring results as we have seen with LEAP. [Interjections.]

We would learn from countries across the world and we will embrace technologies to fight crime.

Ms A BANS (ANC): When was the last Standing Committee?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): We would shift the ranking of officers based on qualifications and experience... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...and not employ political cadres into the police. We would also reinstate and reintroduce specialised units to address the niche categories of criminal behaviour and provide our officers with specialised training. The idea that a DA-run Western Cape is successful irks the ANC because they know... [Interjections.]

Ms A BANS (ANC): In your dreams!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...where the DA has invested in policing it has worked, and we have seen it with LEAP and we have seen it with our local law enforcement. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bosman. I now recognise the hon Minister Allen, but hon Minister Allen, before you begin, please, hon Windvogel and hon Bans, the Rules are very clear for a virtual

meeting. You will be muted by the staff whenever there are interjections. Thank you very much. You may proceed, Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I attempted to listen as carefully to their inputs because I value constructive criticism. I value inputs that can actually take our province forward. But I think when misinformation is spewed, when information that is spewed that has no basis in fact, I think that should be... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Allen, if you could just take a pause, I see that hon Sayed's hand is up. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No-no, Chair. Is the Minister able to take a question on behalf of member Bosman? Can he answer a question on behalf of member Bosman?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Would you like a question, Minister Allen?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I would speak to member Sayed directly after this Sitting and we can engage around that question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Deputy Speaker, as I have stated that I have listened carefully. I welcome and as Western Cape Government, we welcome constructive criticism. We welcome inputs. It was the ANC that shouted "Make Reagan the MEC" and the Premier listened. We are working tirelessly to make sure that we are able to move our province forward, but, Deputy Speaker, when misinformation is spewed, when allegations are made... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and when information is spewed that has no basis in fact, I think that should be called out. So let me pointedly begin. The EFF, for the record, in Parliament stated now that murder is increasing and we have seen now in the last quarter it is there for everyone to read. It was widely communicated on. Crime is increasing in our country. Here in our province we saw a decrease, a double-digit decrease. The only province with a double-digit decrease, but Deputy Speaker, we are not even happy with that. We are wanting to see further decreases because we know we are not just dealing with x-amount, that we are not dealing with that. It is x-amount of people that are murdered. We see that as people. We see it as lives. We see it as families and communities. So the EFF is quite incorrect in their statements.

They make further statements that LEAP Officers are chasing homeless people. That cannot be further from the truth.

We have directly explained over and over the data-led and evidence-based approach, but let me say it again. We deploy our LEAP offices in our priority areas, in our 13 murder hotspot areas. We deploy them at specific times, places... [Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): In the white areas, yes, in very important areas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: They are only in our priority areas. We have explained that over and over, but for some reason... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am sorry to interrupt you, but could you just take your seat? Hon Baartman, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. Chair, I was trying to raise a point of order earlier, but I also do not want to interrupt the Minister, but on the online platform, interjections are not allowed. It is not the same as when we are physically in the Sitting. Otherwise, we cannot hear what the speaker on the platform is able to say. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, I know it is you, so if I can please ask rather put a comment in the chat function that at least

does not disturb anybody. Otherwise, we cannot hear and for record purposes Hansard will not be able to record that easily because of sound. My apologies, over to the Minister. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, like I have stated, we have explained our data-lead approach; our evidence-based approach and how that is actually reaping the results. SAPS itself is saying it is reaping results. The National Minister was here and he also said that there was a double-digit decrease here in our province so it is there for everyone to see and I am encouraging members to read and to make sure that they are able to have these engagements that can help us. We are wanting to engage in constructive ways. When comments are made about the Safety Plan, I have also stated this in the Standing Committee, that the Safety Plan was adopted in 2019. National Government, Cabinet at the National Level, adopted the Integrated Crime and Violence Prevention Strategy in 2020.

Deputy Speaker, that particular strategy is a carbon copy of the Safety Plan. It is a carbon copy of the Safety Plan, which was adopted by National Government. So when National Government is seeing what we are implementing, how we are implementing it, KZN wants to come and visit, to come and learn from our best practises so when I hear the question of what am I doing, other provinces also want to come and see what we are doing because they are seeing the benefit and they are seeing the inroads that we are making and dismantling crime, but we know, Deputy Speaker, we have a

long way to go and we will continue to push on because our fight is against crime... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...and we want to ultimately help and assist our residents. So when I hear that it is fundamentally flawed... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...people are saying that National Government's policy is fundamentally flawed. [Time expired.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes the Interpellation. In terms of Rule 202 we now move over to Questions as printed on the Question Paper. Just to remind the hon members, you will have to use the raising-hand function in order to be recognised, but to remind you that I will give the first opportunity to the person that has posed the question. I now recognise the hon Minister Allen.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**1. Mr C F Christians asked Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety**

With regard to illegal firearms confiscated in the province:

- (1) (a) Where does the SAPS store these firearms before destruction,
and
- (b) How many times are firearms destroyed per year;
- (2) Whether the SAPS has any plans to erect a facility in the province for the destruction of firearms?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much, Deputy Speaker. I trust that I am still audible your side?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are audible. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much, Deputy Speaker. I have received a response from the South African Police Service that replies as follows: On point (1) the information may not be released as it will compromise the security of the firearms that is in storage. They have also confirmed that it is destroyed bi-annually twice a year, and then on point number (2), the reply that I have received from the South African Police Service indicates that there are no plans to erect a facility for the destruction of firearms in the Western Cape,

but, Deputy Speaker, I would like to qualify that particular question and answer further. Based on the question which was posed, it was whether SAPS has any plans to erect the facility in the province for the destruction of firearms. They have stated that there are no plans.

On a technical basis, that is the current answer, because the plan has not landed in the APP as yet, and again, if we track it back to national policy, it flows all the way from National, and then it must land in various provinces so the technical question is no, but I can confirm to take it further, that based on a letter that I have received on 10 March 2023 that that letter actually confirms that we have already done a number, we have already had a number of engagements and that we have already written to National to request that there is a deviation from national policy to ensure that we can ultimately have the plans in place to build the storage here in our province. We are still awaiting feedback from National and it again, like member Christians has said, it again boils down to the fact that policy from a national level delays implementation in our province. It also hampers progress and it is against creating safer societies because our needs and priorities are not taken into account. So, to member Christians, via you, Deputy Speaker, although the technical question is no, the answer is no, because it has not landed in the APP as yet for the South African Police Service. I will make this particular letter that I have at my disposal on the firearm destruction site and where we are and where we have requested for a deviation, I will make that available to the member. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister Allen. Over to you, hon Christians, and then I recognise hon Cassiem.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, it is worrisome because we see killing every day on the streets. A 10-year old boy was shot the other day; four people in the same road in Manenberg and it is worrisome that the weapons are only transported biannually, and that is a major problem. We do not know where the safekeeping is, and maybe I must ask the Chairperson of Community Safety that we have an in-camera meeting again with SAPS because we need to know how do these guns that the gangsters have get into their hands and where do they get it from? It is a major concern. We just believe that one of the gangs now are having so many guns they outstripped the big gangs. So it is worrisome, Minister, and I just want to know, maybe I do not know, in your discussions maybe, but we do not know how many guns, biannually. I mean, it can be a lot of guns being stored somewhere and is it safe?

My question to you, Minister, is, people are getting killed daily with illegal guns, and are you sure that your Department is doing proper oversight to make sure that those guns do not land in the hands of gangsters? I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, member Christians, for that particular question. I can confirm that based on my discussions with the South African Police Service over the last financial year, no guns have been lost from that particular storage. That is in my discussions and I can confirm that is what I have received, I also would support your proposal to ensure that the Standing Committee can have a closed in-camera meeting about the storage so that certain questions can be posed in that regard, but we have also stressed and always stressed that we want to see that our oversight leads to better service delivery.

We have stated that we actually do not want the guns to only be transported biannually because it poses a serious risk. We want to destroy those firearms as quickly as possible and when we look at what we are doing as a Department as well by having our Canine Units predominantly outside of the City of Cape Town, I think many will be aware, where our Canine Unit in partnership with the City of Cape Town found 19 guns in the West Coast area and it was by all indications that those guns could have landed up in the City of Cape Town even. So, the transportation of guns even from other provinces into our province, could pose a risk, but I can assure you we are doing everything in our power to make sure because I want to be held accountable in terms of the oversight that I have said must lead to better service delivery. So, I definitely take your point and I hear your heart and I appreciate your input in this regard, but I definitely support your proposal for the Standing Committee to have in-camera engagement around this particular matter, and like I have indicated again, I will make the letter available to see where we

are in the process and you will again see that the deviation should be signed off by National Government and that is the hold-up. Once National Government should agree for us to have our destruction site we would be able to make sure that that particular site actually is fully operational here in our province. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. I recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, can the Minister confirm how many firearms have been confiscated from gangs within the last year in the Western Cape, please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much for that particular question. I will make sure that I provide all the correct information. I can confirm that LEAP together with the South African Police Service on a regular basis confiscate such a lot of firearms but I would not want to give an incorrect number based on the question, but I will definitely make sure that I get the full details and the exact number to the member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Over to you, hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Minister,

as you know, we have a scheduled visit to Pretoria to see the Central Firearm Destruction Site and to have that in-person meeting with SAPS because it is difficult to get answers from SAPS in the Western Cape, but can you tell us whether there has been any empirical research done by the South African Police Service to weigh up the pros and cons of having a dedicated Firearm Destruction Site in the Western Cape and whether that research is available to be shared perhaps on a confidential basis with members of the Committee, especially those members of the Committee that read.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman. Over to you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, member Bosman. There has been a number of discussions, but also a discussion paper on this particular one and I will make sure that that is forwarded to the Standing Committee as well. We have consistently echoed a similar sentiment and in my visit to a particular, to a potential Firearm Destruction Site, I was accompanied by Senior SAPS members including Deputy Commissioners here in our province, and we were literally all on the same page knowing that we should have a Firearm Destruction Site here but I will make that available to the member via the Standing Committee as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister, and the last opportunity is hon Bans.

Ms A BANS (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, it is either member Christians is very obsessed with this topic or he does not have other subjects to discuss, because it is like the hundredth time that we are discussing the same matter. If he wants to be a member of the DA and join on its revolution wagon he must just say so and stop wasting our time with the same topic. My question to the MEC therefore is, given that it is the standard procedure to send the illegal firearms to Pretoria for destruction on a biannual basis, what are the latest updates in terms of the 699 illegal firearms that were confiscated in the first quarter of the year? I ask this, Deputy Speaker, because of the tantrums that were thrown by JP Smith in the media about this issue. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Over to you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much. I will answer that question in two parts but I would firstly just want to once again say through you to member Christians, Deputy Speaker, that I appreciate this question. I appreciate that we are consistently discussing this because we have for a long period held firm that we need a dedicated Firearm Destruction Site here in our province, so I appreciate that we are putting this in Parliament again and that we are discussing it because we have seen when firearms are largely contributing to our murder rate, and it is the weapon of choice that has been used for all murders in our province. Hence, this is a vital conversation and I will appreciate if there is any

support from other political parties to ensure that we can have a dedicated Firearm Destruction Site here. There are so many benefits to having a Firearm Destruction Site in our province. It will also be a cost-saving mechanism, but also so many lives would be able to be saved once we have all our firearms that will be destroyed here.

Based on the specific question, we have that particular roster and I am unable to at this particular stage indicate when those firearms will be transported due to safety risk. Deputy Speaker, through you to member Bans, that was also one of my questions that I have asked the South African Police Service directly. They have provided information to me and have indicated to me the sensitivity around that particular process that when guns are transported biannually it is very difficult and it is against protocol to place that particular information in the public domain, considering the safety risk that is associated with it. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister Allen. That brings us to the end of that question. We now move over to Question 5. I see others have been withdrawn.

[Questions 2, 3 and 4 withdrawn.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise the Minister Maynier.

5. Mr M K Sayed to ask Mr D J Maynier, Minister of Education:

With regard to his Department's decision to close down Linda's Daycare Centre in Bonteheuwel following the death of a toddler over a month ago:

- (a) What are the reasons for his Department's decision and
- (b) What measures are in place to ensure the safety of children at ECD centres in the province?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for putting this question, which of course is about an unimaginable tragedy. We have offered our deepest condolences to the parents of the child who passed away, and of course they are receiving support.

I think, Deputy Speaker, it is important for members to draw a clear distinction between the investigation into the cause of death of a child, which of course is conducted by the SAPS, and our investigation, which is into compliance with norms and standards.

We can only address that which falls within our remit which is ECD-sites compliance with the norms and standards set out in the Children's Act. These legal requirements apply to all sites and must be enforced so that parents can have certainty that their child is attending a facility that meets the safety standards.

During the process of ECD registration various municipal compliance certificates must be issued in order to complete registration. A Monitoring and Evaluation Team visit sites to monitor health and safety requirements and the team also conducts visits at unregistered ECD facilities to determine if the facility complies with the minimum norms and standards and assists with guiding the institution with registration.

In the case of Linda's Daycare in Bonteheuwel, the site was not a registered ECD. Upon receiving reports of the child's passing at the site, our Department conducted a rapid investigation into whether the site meets the requirements of the Act.

The investigation revealed that the unregistered facility is not suitable to operate as a partial care facility as it does not comply with the minimum norms and standards for safety as prescribed in the Act and does not comply with legislative requirements at municipal and provincial level. A notice of enforcement of closure was thus issued on 17 July 2023 in terms of Section 85 of the Children's Act instructing the site to close. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to the Minister for the response and I note the response regarding the specific case in point. I just wanted to know, is the Minister and the Department considering, as I have raised this before,

working with existing NGOs that are on the ground, to actually empower ECDs to become compliant, to capacitate them to become compliant, like they have done and I think there is a good case that we have seen in the Kannaland Municipality in a few towns. Is there an intention for that to happen in the rest of the province? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I think it would be very sensible for our Department to look into how we can better collaborate with NGOs to support ECDs to become compliant.

The hon member will know that we are in the process of setting a new course, if you like, when it comes to early learning, following us taking over the ECD function and the Department is inter alia busy improving the quality of data in the ECD environment. We are certainly looking at streamlining the registration process and developing a Registration Management System. We are assisting ECDs to become compliant by providing, for example, signage, fire extinguishers, fire blankets for kitchens and smoke detectors, and we are also working with the World Bank to look into our longer term goals and priorities to improve Early Childhood Development in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Over to you, hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Minister, of the many unregistered ECDs in informal settlements across the province, how many are currently being assisted by your Department, this is for informal settlements specifically? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. As I have said in my reply we are working with ECDs in order to assist them become compliant. We have worked with about 110 ECDs. As I have said, to assist with signage, with fire-extinguishers, with fire blankets for kitchens and with smoke detectors. As to how many of those ECDs are in informal settlements, I would ask the member to put a written question and I will then be happy to furnish her with a comprehensive reply about how many ECD Centres are being supported in informal settlements in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Baartman?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Firstly, thank you to the Minister for the response, as well as to the Department for their conscientious attitude towards keeping learners safe. These circumstances surrounding this case are deeply tragic and I would like to join the Minister and colleagues in offering condolences to the parents of the deceased toddler.

With this in mind, Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask the Minister whether the Department has followed up to ensure that there are no children at the site. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. I can confirm that a notice of closure was issued on 17 July 2023 in terms of Section 85 of the Children's Act, instructing the site to close and subsequent to that, the Department has conducted two site visits and on both occasions we have confirmed that no children were on site.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. Any further follow-ups? Last opportunity? No?

Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Questions for Oral Reply. We will now move over to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145. I wish to remind you that it is two minutes per statement. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Deputy Speaker, may I start?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, one week ago today SANTACO in collaboration with various affiliated unions embarked on a protest action which has wrapped our province with fear, anger and bloodshed. Roads were blockaded. People were robbed, stoned, intimidated and shot. Hospitals were attacked. Ambulances burnt. Amidst all of this children and parents did their best to keep learning. Over the last few months, thousands of learners have been working diligently to attend extra classes and reverse the learning losses of the COVID pandemic because they understand that education decides one's future, but the last few days have seen an unjust, uncaring, selfish sector of the taxi industry stand in their way.

We have seen a young woman, a matric learner harassed and intimidated into staying home as she attempted to prepare for the most important educational milestone of her career thus far. She is just one of the more than 850 000 learners who have been kept home from school due to this strike, losing even more teaching time and it is not even the first time this year the taxi mafia has stopped children from going to school. Enough is enough!

It is further sickening to see Opposition parties attempt to blame the DA for the strike when they were the ones who encouraged it in the first place. Deputy Speaker, the strike has lost any sense of legitimacy, has become a free for all of violence and looting and, as always, the ones who suffer most are the children. If the taxi unions are not open to sensible solutions the most

vulnerable in our province will continue to suffer. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon. Baartman. I recognise the ANC. Are any of the members speaking on statements today from the ANC?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker, am I audible?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are audible.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

Deputy Speaker, our country has made significant progress in terms of women's rights. We have passed many laws in Parliament that strengthen the fight against GBV and femicide and protect women from violence and discrimination. We have seen a significant increase in the number of women in the corporate world, women in Parliament, in the judiciary and women graduates. However, there are still many challenges that women face, both in our province and the country at large.

The face of poverty, unemployment, inequality is indeed black and female. Our province has a high rate of gender-based violence and femicide, and we are yet to deal decisively with the challenge of gender-based violence. We note and welcome the words of President Ramaphosa that their

emancipation... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): ...therefore cannot be achieved without economic empowerment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I recognise the EFF.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, Deputy Speaker, Deputy Speaker, the date 9 August remains a special day in the South African calendar dating back to 1956 when thousands of heroines engaged into a peaceful march to the Union Buildings led by activists as Lillian Ngoyi, Helen Joseph, Rahima Moosa and Sophia Williams-De Bruyn. These women left everything behind at the face of adversity and marched against pass laws in order to reclaim their rights flowing from natural justice when it was unfashionable to do so. These were strong and courageous women who paved the way and showed light to those who were to succeed them.

Deputy Speaker, it is this these women who, when faced with the phrase “Each generation must, out of relative obscurity, discover its mission, fulfil

it, or betray it," chose to fulfil their mission without fail. With that being said, as a society and as women, we continue to face challenges to this day and era. In a male-dominated patriarchal society, women continue to be denied access to economic opportunities and are often expected to put in double or triple the efforts in order to be appointed in the same position as men. Deputy Speaker, it is even worse when they are contesting for a position of power where they are constantly overlooked or discouraged by often being told that they will not make it to the top. However, despite all of these challenges, women continue to make strides in various sectors of our economy and social life, and they continue to perform exceptionally well in positions of power without needing the validation of men.

Other social ills that women continue to face on a daily basis are issues concerning gender-based violence, femicide and rape.

In conclusion, Deputy Speaker, as the EFF, we call on all women to unite and report these social ills. We also call law enforcement agencies and the powers that be to take the matters concerning women seriously and to assist them without prejudice. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Cassiem. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Women now have equality under the law, but still gender-based violence is with us, as is rape,

discrimination and daily prejudice. Speaker, we can do better and with the daily reality of violence so many of our women face, we must do better.

This Women's Month I ask the men of our province, what are you doing to ensure that your sisters, your mothers and your daughters are free? How are you contributing to making our country and our province a better place for all women?

I ask these questions because the call of 1956 has not yet been answered and there is still a long way to go before our women are truly free. Hon Deputy Speaker, we must ensure that the God child is given the means to stand tall and to be independent of any man. We must give her the tools she needs to do so. We must ensure she receives the best education and opportunities and must reach out to those opportunities that are available and that she is kept safe from those that would do her harm. We must do this because without freedom for women, there is no freedom for any one of us. Let us all unite, and I share the sentiments of my other colleagues in this debate today. Let us all unite around the shared vision of a truly equal and just Western Cape and let us fight to make that vision a reality. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Plato, I now recognise GOOD.

Mr P T DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I hope the Premier is aware that all the hotspots in the Western Cape for violence, shooting and killing as well as school break-ins and gangsterism and

inappropriate health services are happening after the people were expropriated and dumped by the apartheid government. We were uprooted and planted in barren land. Some, like me, are privileged, after my parents were stripped naked to work themselves back to human acceptance. What is left in the barren land cannot grow. It cannot prosper, but they learn how to survive.

My question today is did the Premier plan or does the Premier have any plans to reverse this inhumane evil or is it best to cover up racial apartheid with economic apartheid by keeping the people poor and dependent on handouts?

I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the ACDP strongly condemns the recent spate of acts of vandalism perpetrated against the Western Cape schools during the winter school holidays. At least 38 schools reported incidents of break-ins and vandalism. Stolen items were fencing, fire- and safety-equipment, security gates, water pipes, windows, cables, computers and the list goes on. Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is asking the community not to buy stolen goods, but reported to SAPS and also our community is the ears and eyes on the ground and they will have critical information regarding stolen goods from schools. We also plead to the community to please report it to SAPS. It is our children that suffer. Now the Department must take other funds, what could be used to improve the

learning of our learners, it is now being used in order to replace vandalised and stolen equipment. Deputy Speaker, this cannot continue. We cannot go backwards. We will have to prioritise the education of our children and take a stance against these gangsters, these criminals that come and break into schools must stop but the Department cannot do it alone. We will all have to take hands and stand against this vandalism of our schools.

I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The taxi strike shed light on the stark economic inequality, perpetuated by the DA's policies, which eerily resembles the tactics of economic exclusion. The taxi industry primarily supports the livelihoods of black individuals in the Cape Flats region, yet, we witness a clear stifling of the economic efforts. This economic exclusion perpetuates historical injustices and stands as a glaring reminder of a system that once marginalised the very same population. We must separate criminality against genuine concerns and the collapse of stakeholder relations between an industry and Government, and in this case, the taxi industry, as part of the private sector that the DA Government has been happy to receive awards from, when it made them look good through the Blue Dot. It is crucial to acknowledge that the consequences of the strike extend beyond transportation, people having been unable to attend work, and

shop shelves remain empty due to the disrupted supply chains. This ripple-effect underscores the urgent need for a swift and comprehensive resolution and attitude from Government towards the industry.

The ANC calls for a moratorium on taxi impoundments until all legal and technical issues are resolved, open public participation in reviewing the Cape Town Traffic By-law, actively asked, and gave SANTACO cooperation with SAPS and other law enforcement agencies to close down on the criminal activities along the taxi strike, restrained by the City of Cape Town in the use of combative communication and actions that risk fuelling further tensions; calls for more assistance to working class communities in the Cape Flats within the areas to protect scholar transport, workers getting to the public transport stops terminus, train stations, clinics, etcetera.

In conclusion, the taxi strike brings to the fore issues that extend beyond mere transportation disruptions. It shines a light on deeply rooted economic injustices that demand our immediate attention and we cannot put our hands on the sand.

As we move forward let us consider the ANC proposed solution as a step forward towards a fairer and more equitable society.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ... for fairer and more equitable society. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up. Thank you very much hon member, I recognise the DA.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA-run Western Cape Government has allocated over half a billion rand this financial year alone for upgrading initiatives to improving former settlements.

Some settlements set for upgrading include Dunoon, Airport Precincts, Kosovo Main, Thabo Mbeki, Welmoed, Silvertown and many more.

A significant sum of R506 million is being invested to provide essential services such as clean water, sanitation, electricity and other basic amenities to our informal settlements this year. This will be funded by the Department of Infrastructure's 2023/24 Informal Settlements Upgrade Partnership Grant.

Currently there are 40 projects underway across the province, each at various stages of development. Notably 10 of these projects are in the implementation phase and are set to deliver 2 007 serviced sites, while three projects are already providing basic services to their beneficiaries. The remaining projects are being prepared for delivery over the Medium-Term

Expenditure Framework period.

Additionally to improve overall fire safety in our informal settlements, the Western Cape Government has taken proactive steps by installing 13 000 fire alarm systems throughout informal settlements in the province. These fire alarms play a crucial role in providing early warnings and ensuring the safety of communities in the Western Cape. To date R2,6 million has been spent on these fire alarm systems.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA-run Western Cape Government will continue to prioritise the needs of our most vulnerable communities. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus notes with utter dismay that recently the Metro Council, controlled by the DA in the Cape, has introduced a point-based system whereby points are given to applicants according to their race.

They are required to stipulate on the form when they apply for the beach permit to trade there whether you are Black, whether you are Coloured, Indian or White and if you are Black you get the most points and if you are White, you get least points, no points. Coloureds get less points.

This is seen as racism in the extreme. One gentleman approached me and he said he has been trading on the beaches at Clifton for 20 years, but when he wanted to have his permit renewed he was told no, he is not being renewed because he is not Black.

Many existing Coloured vendors had also their permits cancelled. The DA – and the Freedom Front notes – has been implementing ANC's discredited racist Labour Equity Policy, which was twice thrown out of court when challenged by the Solidarity Trade Union. As recently as June the court again ruled in favour of Solidarity.

You cannot take away a man's job and give it to another one of a different race merely to apply labour equity. Taking away the permits of existing permit holders on our beaches in the Cape and giving it to Black applicants, is against the law and I am sorry that the Premier is not here today. He had to answer this, but he stayed away.

Hon Deputy Speaker, many existing Coloured vendors, they feel discriminated against. Even now when apartheid is supposed to have been scratched, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise your hand, hon member Philander.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon

Deputy Speaker, it was clearly indicated at the beginning of the Sitting where exactly the Premier finds himself.

It is misleading to say that the Premier is not in the House because he chooses not to be in the House. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Deputy Speaker, I do not think that [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Philander, I note that, but ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not a point of order.

An HON MEMBER: Or abuse.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): [Inaudible.] point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, one minute. Hon member Marais, first of all, hon Chief whip, it is the prerogative of the person making the statement and that can be corrected through an executive statement, but I cannot judge the content of hon member Marais's speech, even if it is

misleading.

So, hon member Marais, is that a further point of order against a point of order? [Inaudible.] going to take that hand.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Deputy Speaker, I will rest with your ruling, but I do think that the Chief Whip should be far better educated in this regard. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, no, hon member Marais, do not go down that road now.

An HON MEMBER: You should listen.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, that is not a point of order.

No, no, hon member Sayed, I see your hand is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: No, no, Chair, it is fine. I was just going to say that I did not really see the need for this type of fight right now, because hon member Marais just made a point, then there was – I just, I think let us continue smoothly, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. We will continue with your indulgence, thank you.

I now recognise Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the Al Jama-Ah party is calling on the Province to intervene in the City of Cape Town's decision not to release the impounded taxes.

The City's rejection of the Minister of Transport's call to release the impound taxis smacks of ignorance, arrogance and no consideration for the negative impact it has on hundreds of thousands of poor people.

The ongoing strike action only adds to the existing socio-economic conditions of poor and vulnerable people throughout the province. School children now idling at home see the strike action as an opportunity to loot and vandalise properties. We call on parents and community members to prevent school children from taking part in any acts of violence such as looting, theft and arson.

Sadly we live in a society where violence is a norm, occurring every day and this has desensitised people, as well as children. They are exposed to not only violence which occurs during strike actions, but also the daily violence perpetrated by gangsters in their neighbourhoods.

The City's refusal to look at positive ways to stop the taxi strike only leads to

increased violence. [Interjections.] This cannot be treated with a pinch of salt. [Interjections.]

Imagine if this situation [Interjections.] ...[Incomplete.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is hon member Marais. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members – thank you very much. Hon Marais, apologies, can you please put your hand down. Over to your, hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. This cannot be treated with a pinch of salt.

Imagine if this situation was playing out in Constantia and other leafy suburbs where livelihoods, property and lives of school children would be affected. There is no doubt that the Province and City would have found meaningful solutions to the situation. The lives and livelihoods of poor and Black communities cannot be of less value than of those living in Constantia and attending Model C schools.

The City should concede ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ... to the Minister of Transport's call, release the impounded taxis and those who have committed offences must appear in court. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Brinkhuis, thank you for that.

I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, allow me to greet you and also in the same breath wish all the *imbokodos* of the WCPP a blessed yesterday and just to say to them that we are proud of you guys and that we love you dearly as the *imbokodos* of this province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is a well-known fact that the worst performing municipalities are all governed by the ANC or their allied partners such as the Patriotic Alliance, while the DA municipalities continue to outperform. The top five municipalities in South Africa are all DA-run. Do not take our word for it, take the word of the Auditor-General. While most municipalities in the Western Cape performed well in the latest Auditor-General's audit report, a few remain of concern.

Therefore, hon Deputy Speaker, the Standing Committee of Local

Government embarked on an oversight visit to the worst three performing municipalities in the Western Cape. Beaufort West governed by the ANC and the PA is an extreme worry as it has been revealed that Beaufort West owed creditors R137 million, while their Eskom debt stands at R91 million. While the finances in the municipalities are of grave concern, they even managed to rake up a bill of R27 million that is owed to the AG.

This is indeed extraordinary and tells us exactly what we need to know about ANC and PA governance: corruption and maladministration 101.

Hon Deputy Speaker, after Cameron's dreadful, unsuccessful attempt to remove me as Chair, we were finally able to conduct our oversight, but I will forgive him, he wants every bit of attention after losing out on his leadership position. We will dearly miss him next year.

In an attempt to hold the municipality to account the Committee unanimously agreed to order Beaufort West to provide a full list of each of its creditors to whom they owe millions.

While Kannaland, Beaufort West and Laingsburg have all been ordered to provide ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sileku, if you could just hold that sentence, I see there is a hand up. Hon member Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, Chair, on a point of order. There is no "Cameron" in the House. It is hon Dugmore or member Dugmore. I think let us refer to each other in the proper terminology. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. Hon member Sileku, if you can just remember to do that, please. Thank you very much. Over to you.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): It is well-noted, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

While Kannaland, Beaufort West and Laingsburg have all been ordered to provide the Committee with the names of the Audit Committees in their respective municipalities, the DA in the Western Cape will continue to hold these municipalities to account, fighting for the residents of those areas who long for service delivery that has collapsed under the ANC ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): ... and PA. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sileku.

So that brings us to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6) I now

give one or more members of the Executive an opportunity to respond to Member Statements, for not more than 5 minutes collectively.

Are there any Ministers who would like to respond? Over to you, hon Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I just wish to confirm, for the sake of the record, that the Premier of course is not in the House because he is attending to urgent business in relation to the taxi strike.

I would furthermore like to thank the hon member Ferlon Christians for supporting our call to take hands for the community to report cases of vandalism at our schools to the South African Police Service, because, as he correctly says, we cannot do it alone and ultimately the safety of our schools requires a strong partnership with school communities in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Are there any further Ministers who would like to put in, would like to deliver anything on their Executive statements? No? Thank you.

That is the end of Member Statements. Hon members, I would like to hand over to the Speaker. I just want to check that he is online and then [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: I am online, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] Speaker. Thank you very much.

[The Speaker takes the Chair.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and good afternoon, hon members.

We now move on to Notices of Motions in terms of Rule 151. In terms of Rule 151 all Notices of Motion by members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing it on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and is published on the Order Paper below the line.

We now move on to Rule 150, Motions Without Notice and I would like to inform you that in terms of the Standing Rule 150, pertaining to Motions Without Notice, condolences and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to the Plenary, and members are also reminded that Motions Without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolences will not be allowed in the Sitting, that have not been processed by the

Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 25 July 2023, political parties did submit the names of hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a motion without notice in the Sitting of the House.

I will therefore just for noting and for the purposes of the minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon member N D Nkondlo, hon member M K Sayed, hon member M Kama, hon member G Bosman, hon member G Bosman, hon member G Bosman and hon member D America.

I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Hon members, are there any objections? No objections, agreed to and these motions will appear in the minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard in each individual member's names, as if the member had read them out aloud.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates Clint Abrahams, a University of Cape Town (UCT) PhD candidate, architect and lecturer from Macassar, on winning a prestigious 2022 Social Responsiveness Award; notes that Abrahams is the Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment's (EBE) first recipient of this award; and notes that the award honours work that contributes to the country's cultural, economic, political, scientific and social landscape, and cements community service into the university's research, teaching and learning.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the passing away of the ANC veteran and community leader, Comrade Themba Wilson Sidina, from Gugulethu; notes that he passed away on Sunday 30 July 2023 at the age of 81 following a long period of illness; notes that Comrade Sidina was a towering political figure, not only in the life of the ANC in the province, but also as an unsung anti-apartheid hero; notes that he was heavily involved in various civics, trade unions and sporting bodies, and actively recruited young people to join uMkhonto we Sizwe (MK) through his work in various sports clubs; notes that Comrade Sidina dedicated his life to the struggle for freedom and democracy; and extends condolences and sends a message of strength to his family,

friends and comrades.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the passing away of Leon-Lee Andile Madolo (32) from Khayelitsha; and sends heartfelt condolences to the family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the five schools from the Western Cape who walked away as winners at the ATKV's Applous school choir competition; congratulates the Pinedene Primary School from Ravensmead, Cape Town, for winning the Merit category on 26 July; congratulates the Laerskool Eversdal in Durbanville, Cape Town, for winning the Merit category on 27 July; congratulates the Laerskool Gene Louw in Durbanville, Cape Town, for winning the Prestige category on 27 July; congratulates the Hoërskool De Kuilen in Kuils River, Cape Town, for winning the Merit category on 28 July; congratulates the Hoërskool Stellenberg for winning the best performance of a school-written piece on 29 July; and notes that these schools performed

extremely well and did a tremendous job in representing this province.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Banyana Banyana women's national football team for their excellent performance in the Football World Cup thus far; notes that they have written their names in the history books of South African soccer, as they managed to qualify for the final 16 while also securing their first-ever win at a World Cup; sends its absolute best wishes to the team as they continue representing South Africa at the World Cup; notes that they have made us extremely proud; and notes that they did a tremendous job in uniting the nation and promoting hope.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Proteas women's World Cup team for their stellar performance during the Netball World Cup; notes that they played tremendously and made all of us proud; notes especially their excellent performance against the Silver Ferns of New Zealand, who are the reigning champions; notes that they managed to secure a final second draw against them and will go down as one of the most famous World

Cup matches to date; and notes that they did an excellent job in promoting pride and hope among South Africans.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr D AMERICA (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the City of Cape Town for successfully budgeting R5,2 billion for the expansion of the MyCiti bus services; notes that this expansion will see communities like Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain, Nyanga, Philippi, Ottery, Hanover Park, Wynberg and Claremont all get access to the world-class MyCiti bus service and will service about 1,5 million people; notes that this plan will make great strides in creating an integrated mobility system in the City of Cape Town, despite the reluctance of the National Government to devolve rail to capable municipalities; and also notes that this expansion is set to create an estimated 9 000 job opportunities in the metropolitan area's south-east communities and an additional 1 008 jobs will be created to operate these expanded services.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The SPEAKER: I will now afford the opportunity to members to move Motions Without Notice as per Standing Rule 152(d) and this could also include Motions Without Notice that were not approved in the Programming

Authority meetings.

Hon members are reminded that 30 minutes as per Standing Rule 152(d) will start now. I recognise the hon member Kaizer-Philander.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move that the House:

Condemns the senseless violence and criminality which has marred the ongoing SANTACO minibus taxi strike and the perpetrators behind it.

Notes that while every South African and resident of the Western Cape has the constitutional right to protest, the violence and intimidation this past week is criminal and in contradiction to the values of our democracy.

Further notes the hypocrisy and politicisation demonstrated by certain political parties represented in this House related to the taxi strike this week. Initially parties like the ANC and EFF publicly supported the taxi strike, but when things turned violent they disingenuously sought to put the blame at the feet of the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Government.

It was under the previous ANC Administration that a Taxi Inquiry was instituted in 2005 and which found that the industry was “governed by

chaos". Now the leaders of the said Government, such as member Dugmore and Ebrahim Rasool, want to politicise this matter and throw stones. They had all the power to implement the rule of law and their dismal failure brought us here.

Instead of unequivocally denouncing the violence and criminality demonstrated by those affiliated to the strike, the ANC and EFF have sought to score cheap political points at the expense of commuters, road users and Western Cape communities.

Instead of holding the taxi industry to account ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... the ANC and the EFF ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, please just hold on. Hon member Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker. Is it correct for the hon Chief Whip to refer to the former Premier and former MPL, Mr Rasool, as being part of the Government? He is not part of the Government. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon Sayed, that is not a point of order. That is a

point for debate as per the statement, so I will revert to Hansard and check the actual motion and revert back to the House.

Hon Chief Whip, you can continue.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Instead of holding the taxi industry to account, the ANC and the EFF employed lazy and loaded arguments related to race, whilst completely ignoring how poor regulation of the taxi industry puts the lives of countless of Western Cape residents at risk. I so move, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kaizer-Philander. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Thank you very much, there is an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): [Inaudible.] regulation when you incentivise the same taxi industry.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, the process is, I put that to the House, there was an objection and it will now be printed on the Order Paper.

I now recognise the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker,

I move without notice:

Takes note of the Grassroots ECD Training Centre and the impact it has on women's lives.

This House notes that the Grassroots Educare Trust is a partner non-profit organisation of the Department of Infrastructure's Expanded Public Works Programme.

As the oldest Early Childhood Development facility in South Africa, the Grassroots Educare Trust manages and supports 200 unemployed youth and 160 parents through the EPWP.

This House notes that the EPWP supports the ECD Assistant Project and the Playground Project. The Department's support ensures that the NPO can pay its 360 participants a monthly stipend to facilitate the individual and children development programmes. Through the ECD Assistant Project, the Grassroot Educare Trust assists the Western Cape Department of Education in the registration and re-registration of ECD centres and partial care facilities with the majority of these being in rural areas.

This House further notes that there are 2 200 facilities and 360 beneficiaries and a countless number of children that benefit from this programme. This partnership enables communities through investment

in social infrastructure and the safety and well-being of our communities in a critical component of building a better future. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Maseko. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I now recognise the honourable member America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Good afternoon, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the National Minister of Transportations' defiance of her own National Land Transportation Act after she has been publicly calling for the release of mini-bus taxis that have been impounded for breaking the rules of the road. She is unfortunately not above the law.

That this House further notes with great concern that the Minister of Transport is more concerned with pleasing the taxi industry than safeguarding our roads from illegal drivers and unsafe road behaviours. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member America. Hon

members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There is an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon member Mvimbi.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Object, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, we have moved on. I am recognising hon member Mvimbi. Your objection has been noted. Hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: I am going to move on in the interest of time. Hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House is concerned over the Cape Town taxi strike's severe consequences on the sector of schooling, leaving almost half a million learners, which include matriculants, at such a critical time of the year without access to classes. This disruption undermines the stability in the sector during a critical phase. We urge for a collaborative action to swiftly address this crisis and safeguarding of learning. The protection of learners must be provided to all forms of scholar transport. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: None, we support.

The SPEAKER: There is no objection, agreed to. I recognise the hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. On behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern the detrimental consequences stemming from the Cape Town taxi strike, particularly the adverse effects on small businesses in Black townships. This disruption has led to substantial job losses among the already vulnerable population as workers struggle to commute to their workplaces. We condemn any actions that perpetuate suffering among our people. It is evident that the impact aligns with a distressing narrative that the DA aims to exploit, revealing a disregard for the well-being of Black communities. We stand united against such practices, advocating for collaborative solutions to uplift our people and protect their livelihoods. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Nkondlo. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

[Interjections.] There is an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now move on to hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Windvogel?

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: I am going to move on. I now recognise hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House takes notice that Brown's Farm Library in Phillipi now remains closed following vandalism and theft by opportunistic criminals. These latest criminal incidents took place recently during the taxi stay-away period. The criminals took books, computers as well as electrical appliances, whilst leaving doors and windows broken. It is estimated that it will cost close to R60 million to repair the library and return it to

its former state. The library assisted learners as well as job seekers who often visited in order to do school research as well as searching for work opportunities online. Another incident also took place in the library in August 2022 where staff members at the library were robbed, resulting in the library closing for over a month. It is now shocking that in light of knowledge by this DA Provincial and Local Government that the library is susceptible to crime, no efforts were made to beef up security. This proves to show that the DA Government does not care about resources intended for Black communities in townships. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Cassiem. Hon members, are there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Thank you very much, hon members, there is an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House takes notice that yesterday the country celebrated National Women's Day. The country also witnessed hundreds of domestic workers, made up of women, marching all the way to the Union Building in order to submit a memorandum to the President of the country against the violation of their rights. It is sad that in this day

and age women in this sector still suffer from sexual abuse, constant attacks by dogs and being exploited without compensation at the hands of their employers. The abuse of women remains entrenched in society with little and close to nothing being done about it. The statistics concerning gender-based violence also continue to rise with each day passing. The dysfunctional policing system also exacerbates the matter as a majority of cases do not even make it to the prosecution desk as a result of incompetent and unwilling police personnel. As women we call for a better society in which women can live freely and be afforded to enjoy the full set of their protected constitutional rights. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Cassiem. Hon members, are there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection, agreed to. I move on to hon member Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Klaas, I can hear you.

Mr T M KLAAS (ANC): Yes. I move without notice:

That the House takes notice that since the beginning of the taxi stayaway protest by members of the taxi industry, the province has been marred by various elements of criminality involving, but not limited to, murders and looting. Whilst the taxi stayaway protest is welcomed as it stems from a justifiable cause, the EFF condemns criminals who have used it to their own opportunistic ends in order to further their own greedy criminal ways. It is cruel and inhumane to decide to take someone's life or property without just cause. As humans we must not degrade ourselves to this barbaric level. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Klaas. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection, we do not welcome the stay-away.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection and it will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon member Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): I move without notice:

That the House to note and condemn the killing of 5 people in Mbekweni on Monday night in a mass shooting that claimed the lives of 3 males and 2 females, with the youngest victims aged 12 and 14 respectively. We call on law enforcement to arrest all those who are responsible for the unfortunate incident. We cannot live idle in a society where people are butchered on a daily basis in our townships. As a society we must also come together and assist law enforcement agencies whenever we possess knowledge of who is behind these acts. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Klaas. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon member Murray.

Ms C A T MURRAY (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that our most vulnerable communities are being held at ransom [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: My apologies, hon member Murray. You may continue.

Ms C A T MURRAY (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

That the most vulnerable communities are held at ransom by the

inconsiderate and reckless actions of a few and the provincial economy as a whole is being brought to a standstill. While we have the right to protest, we do not have the right to damage property or endanger the lives of others.

That this House further recognises the heroic efforts of the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town in trying to find an urgent and lawful resolution to the strike and to bring it to an end, as well as related violence.

Notes further that the strikes do not just impact on the taxi industry, but also cause damage to both personal and private property, including critical infrastructure.

That the House notes that the strike action undermines both investor and tourism confidence in our provincial and national economy, with the UK's foreign Commonwealth Office issuing a travel alert last Friday to British nationals who plan to visit Cape Town. This has the potential to reverse the significant progress that we have seen in recovering and growing our tourism sector since the pandemic.

Notes further that the action to impede access to the Cape Town International Airport is irresponsible and damages the reputation of Cape Town as an international tourism destination, thereby threatening the thousands of tourism-related jobs in the City [Inaudible – video

distorted.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Murray. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection, motion agreed to. I recognise the hon member Bosman.

Ms G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the tragic death of LEAP officer Zanikhaya Kwinana, who was killed while carrying out his duties in Nyanga on Friday. While patrolling the area with two other officers, Officer Kwinana's vehicle came under fire and was struck multiple times by bullets fired by unknown assailants. While the other two officers escaped with their lives, Officer Kwinana died of his injuries. Officer Kwinana exemplified the courage and devotion to duty of the Western Cape's LEAP officers and his loss continues to send shockwaves through the Western Cape. I move that the House should recognise that Officer Kwinana's death was an horrific consequence of the lawlessness seen over the last few days and should call for the urgent apprehension and punishment of his killers. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bosman. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon member Pretorius.

Mr G PRETORIUS (DA): Good afternoon, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the attacks on various facilities of the Department of Health and Wellness over the last week. In recent days ambulances, hospitals and clinics have found themselves at the receiving end of looting and vandalism and many patients have had to be relocated and transferred.

I also move that the House should note that attacks on healthcare facilities and staff can never be justified and should condemn those who have participated in or encouraged these attacks, and further that the House notes the exemplary work of the Department of Health and Wellness in continuing to treat people of the Western Cape in spite of large-scale disruptions and outright violence perpetrated against the Department's facilities. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Pretorius. Hon

members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

No objections, agreed to. I recognise ...[Interjections.]

Mr M I SILEKU: [Inaudible.] without notice:

That this House takes note of the oversight visit conducted by the Standing Committee on Local Government to Kannaland, Beaufort West, and Laingsburg.

That this House notes that Kannaland has been put on a budget plan in an attempt to aid the municipality. However, they have only met 6 of the 48 targets. Overspending is occurring in various areas, including excessive salaries, overtime and performance bonuses for municipal staff and councillors, as well as motor vehicle allowances. R66 million is owed to creditors. Eskom and the Auditor-General are owed R47,07 million and R8,08 million respectively and their grant spending for the 2022/23 National Grant Allocation, is only 28,31%. Beaufort West owes creditors R137 million. They owe Eskom R91 million and they even owe the AG R27 million. That is truly shocking. Laingsburg owes creditors R9 million and this has increased by 15% over the period of one year and they do not submit financial reports timeously. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sileku. Hon members, are there any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker? Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, is there a point of order because I am just putting the motion to the House?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Yes. Do you allow one to move amendments to motion like this? To actually correct some inaccuracies and fallacies in their motion as it currently stands, or is that simply regarded as an objection?

The SPEAKER: That is simply regarded as an objection and it will be printed on the Order Paper. I now again put the question to the House. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?
[Interjections.] There is an objection, it will be printed on the Order Paper.

Hon members, before I conclude this section of the Sitting, I just wanted to give an opportunity to hon member Mvimbi if he is available.

An HON MEMBER: I am available.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, I am going to allow you your motion without notice.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and sincere apologies previously. You were too fast for me. I move a motion without notice:

That the House deeply mourns the loss of lives during the Cape Town taxi strike. It is imperative that the DA-led City of Cape Town urgently releases all wrongly impounded taxis and that there is a moratorium on impoundments whilst legislation is being reviewed. We call for new inclusive laws to prevent further tragedy. Swift action is needed to protect citizens, drivers and businesses while fostering harmony. Let us prioritise safety, collaborative solutions and prevent further loss of life. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Mvimbi. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Thank you very much. There is an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Windvogel, are you available?

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Windvogel?

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Yes, yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Okay, I am going to allow you an opportunity.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, on behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

That the House wishes to address the dire state of mental health services within the Western Cape Health Department. The glaring shortage in psychiatric beds in our facilities, coupled with an alarming surge in mental health issues, present an unacceptable crisis that demands immediate action. At a time when mental health challenges are on the rise, it is deeply disheartening to witness individuals facing extensive waiting periods, with some waiting up to a year, for a mere 30-day evaluation. This delay exacerbates their conditions, jeopardises their well-being and perpetuates a cycle of suffering. We call upon the Democratic Alliance, DA-led Western Cape Government, to prioritise this critical issue with utmost urgency. It is imperative that mental health receives the attention it warrants as it affects the lives of countless individuals and families. I so move, thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There is an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Hon members, that concludes this section on Motions Without Notice and we will now deal with the Matter of Public Importance as in terms of Standing Rule 143 as printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, you are on mute. Can you unmute yourself.

MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Can you hear me, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, now I can hear you. Hon member Dugmore, over to you.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you. Thank you. hon Speaker, let me thank you for finally granting us this opportunity to debate the

ongoing minibus taxi strike as well as what could be described as a governance crisis as a matter of public importance. This decision hopefully marks a turning point for our Legislature.

Last week our request to debate the same issue was turned down as you well know, hon Speaker. That in fact [Inaudible.] was opportunity.

It is common knowledge that since 2019 every request for a debate on a matter of public importance or urgent public importance by the ANC and the Opposition, has been refused by DA appointed Speakers. We as MPLs are elected representatives of the people of our province. We are accountable to them and the constituencies we serve. Part of our task, hon Speaker, is to bring their concerns, their fears, their hopes, their dreams and also their ideas to this House.

We should be listening more. We should be opening the space for debate and not closing it down. The Premier and his MECs are accountable, hon Speaker, to this House.

Thus on matters like the taxi strike they must account here for what they are doing to resolve this crisis in the minibus taxi industry. What they are doing about safety in this regard, the impact of violence and the fear of commuters, communities, workers, the business sector, as well as the education sector.

Never again, hon Speaker, should this House be shut out from debating and

seeking sustainable solutions.

I want to focus on a clear set of eight proposals to deal with the crisis and then also point out lessons learned from the events of the last week.

1. That the City of Cape Town must immediately suspend the impoundment of taxis. This would be a concession by the City.
2. The immediate suspension of the strike. This would be a concession by SANTACO.
3. The appointment of a mediator by the CCMA to establish a mechanism and a timeframe to release all minibus taxis that have been unlawfully impounded in conflict with national legislation.
4. That the mediator determine a process and timeline to address the concerns of the taxi industry, the City, the Province and the National Department of Transport.
5. A strong commitment to report back to and engage with communities.
6. To reopen public participation to review the City's bylaw.
7. The active cooperation by the taxi industry with the South African Police and law enforcement agencies to ensure the safety of

communities, learners and the broader community.

8. A commitment by the City for active restraint by their leaders regarding the use of [Inaudible.] communication and actions that risks fuelling further tensions.

Our country has a history of racist violence and brutal repression against the majority of South Africans. We have a proud history of gallant resistance to the system of apartheid and colonialism. We have a history of deliberate economic exploitation and exclusion, but, hon Speaker, we also have a proud history of resolving conflict, dealing with issues of violence and political differences through genuine negotiation and conflict resolution.

The Constitution of our Republic is a product of struggle and yes, also of compromise. It lays out clear values and principles and calls on us to build our country and to redress the injustices of the past via legislation and the allocation of resources.

As the ANC we support a public transport system which is integrated, safe, affordable and reliable. We need to accept that the minibus taxi industry is exactly that. It is an industry. It is a critical component of our public transport system in our province, along with rail, with bus and the rapid transport bus system.

The taxi industry is largely Black-owned, with African and Coloured

operators and owners having built this industry over decades. A lesson we hope the City has learned from this crisis is never again to demonise an entire industry. Never again to brand an entire industry and its leaders as criminals and thugs.

A second lesson and a basic lesson is not to lie to the people. We have seen the City's J P Smith openly lying by saying in July this year that impoundments have begun in terms of the new City bylaw and then a few weeks later in August saying that not a single taxi has been impounded in terms of this bylaw. This is the shameless conduct which lies at the very root of this conflict, the violence, the division and the disruption which has hit our City.

It is not surprising that some analysts and commentators have described J P Smith as the real thug in this situation.

The DA and JP Smith in particular, have ignored the lessons of our divided past. Their only response has been to mimic the so-called †kragdadigheid [high-handedness] of P W Botha and the National Party. They have sought to impose collective punishment.

Let me make it very clear that as the ANC we condemn each and every act of violence, of arson, of intimidation and lawlessness. We will never compromise on the need to uphold our law and protect and defend our constitutional democracy. Those who have committed arson, violence, must

be brought to book. There can be no debate about that. As the ANC we also support the rule of law. We will never compromise that fundamental principle of our Constitution.

In this regard the statement by J P Smith, supported by Mayor Hill-Lewis, that they will impound 25 minibus taxis for every vehicle set alight, is nothing but fascist collective punishment. This statement not only undermines the rule of law, but is the antithesis to our Constitution. The perpetrators of arson ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... must be arrested and charged.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It is critical that ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Ja?

The SPEAKER: I see a hand, so I am going to allow, hon member Murray, is that a point of order?

Ms C A T MURRAY (DA): Hon Speaker, through you, if the hon member would take a question of whether this is the Council Sitting, focusing on arguments, actions or ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Murray, hon member Murray, before you pose the question, let me ask the hon Dugmore if is he is prepared to take a question?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: At the next oversight visit where there is more time I welcome, the hon member is welcome to engage further. May I proceed?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Murray, the hon member is not prepared to take your question. I recognise the hon member Sayed. Is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker. That was not a – I mean she actually went to ask the question. She was supposed ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: You are not the Speaker.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon member Murray was supposed to say, "Can I ask a question?" not go ahead and ask the question. She is also not supposed to be asking questions to hon member Dugmore ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... she must ask questions to her MECs who are [Inaudible.] at the moment. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed, you are completely out of order now. Hon member Sayed, you are completely out of order. I have allowed you a point of order. I have ruled before you rose on a point of order.

So that is not a point of order and, hon member Dugmore, my apologies, you may continue.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Government must work with and support the industry regarding resolving issues of permits and routes, training of drivers, setting up of businesses and cooperatives in the transport value chain.

We must also put all of our efforts together to get all Metrorail lines operational again. This will require all spheres of Government to work together and we hope that the Premier and the Mayor will keep J P Smith out

of these attempts to get Metrorail moving again.

It is not as surprising that some analysts have actually labelled the DA's conduct as the launch of their election strategy to divide the working class and poor along racial lines and project themselves as the so-called custodians of law and order. In the process they have caused irreparable damage to the city. Damage to property, death, destruction, disruption of education, violence against women and children. They have actually damaged all attempts at healing the divisions in our city.

They have set up a narrative against them and drawn a laager around those who they regard as "us". This is the DA recipe: divide and rule.

I want to take this opportunity to commend the swift response and intervention by the ANC National Government, in particular Minister Chikunga and her Department. We also salute civil society for their role. As the ANC and alliance partners we have worked tirelessly since last week with the Minister, the industry and civil society to find immediate and lasting solutions.

This, hon Speaker, we will continue to do. We have put forward 8 steps as a way out of this crisis.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: As the ANC we will engage with the City to actually [Inaudible.] the business the [Inaudible.] sector. Not only will we seek lasting solutions, but we will seek to reconcile, to unite ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore, your time has now expired.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... and build peace in our city and province.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, thank you very much, hon member Dugmore. I now recognise the hon Premier, Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon Dugmore for [Inaudible.]...

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, my apologies. Hon member Kama, is that a point of order?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kama, what is your point of order?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Yes, thank you very much, hon Speaker. I want to address you on a matter which I think equates to undermining the responsibility of oversight that is with this House.

I think earlier the Chief Whip, hon Speaker, moved a motion that we get the Questions to the Premier without notice, to stand over to the next Sitting and that was agreed to and the understanding then was that the Premier is not available, and I want to check with you, hon Speaker, that are we going to allow this House to run as the Premier feels and how he wants it to run? Because the Speaker, the Chief Whip would have not said he is not available for the whole Sitting, would have moved that part to a later part of this meeting so this meeting has an understanding that the Premier is not available.

So are we just going to allow him to come into this House, just debate and leave the House, when this House would have from programming been given an opportunity to ask questions to him without notice, and I think most of the issues that were being debated here would have been asked to him directly, but we were told he is not available. He is now all of a sudden available to just talk and leave. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Kama. I recognise the hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Can you hear me now, hon Speaker?
Ja. Hon Speaker, also on a point of order. I was called by the Chief Whip who indicated to me and asked whether the question that I would put to the Premier without notice could stand over until next week given the unavailability of the Premier.

Now the issue is that if the Premier is now back in the House, could we request that the question to the Premier without notice is placed back on the agenda? Because I think as member Kama has said, it is completely out of order. We agreed to this, it seems, on false pretences.

An HON MEMBER: Ag, Cameron, keep – shhh.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: We had understood that the Premier needed to be in a debate. So what I would like ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... to ask you, as a point of order, is whether we can ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... bring back, whether we can bring back the question to the Premier without notice after we have finished this debate, so that we are not ...[intervenes]

Mr L L MVIMBI: No! It must be done now. It must be done now.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Yes, that is what I mean.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon member Mvimbi, there is a member on the floor.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Either now, but it must be done today. It must be done today.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, firstly that is not a point of order from both hon member Kama and hon member Dugmore. The question was put to the House earlier. The House agreed that it will stand over and for that reason I am going to continue with the debate. The questions to the Premier, as agreed by the House, will stand over until the next Sitting.

Hon Premier, you may continue.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: That is really shocking, hon Speaker.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Speaker?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It is really shocking.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kama, is that a new point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): No, it is me, hon member Mvimbi.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, member! Order, members, there is a member on the floor. I recognise hon member Kama, then hon member Mvimbi, then hon member Philander and then hon member Sayed.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): No, thanks, hon ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): I also have my hand up, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, I will give you an opportunity too.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Maybe I was misunderstood because you have ruled on what was not my point of order. I am aware of the motion and that we have agreed to that motion, but what I am raising with you, hon Speaker, is that the reasons that were given in that motion were that the Premier is not available to be in the House. So that is why we agreed to a

motion.

Now it looks like we were misled in that motion because the Premier is here now. Had we known that the Premier is going to be in the House we were going to reject that motion.

So as the motion came it said the Premier is not available. Unless if it is a question of us going forward to take up the issue of being misled into agreeing to something that is not there in the House.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kama, thank you very much. Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] Kaizer-Philander.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, for the opportunity. Hon Speaker, just to put in context with regards what is alleged.

I have engaged the Chief Whip of the Official Opposition this afternoon at 13:45, who then directed me to the hon member Dugmore. I informed the hon member that by the time, as per the Order Paper, that we will deal with questions to the Premier, the Premier will not be available at that point and requesting if we can move that specific section to next week, of which it was

concurrent, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Point of order. Point of order.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, thank you very much, hon members.

Hon Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: On a point of order, please.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, I think it must just be put on record that the manner in which this has been done is deeply disingenuous. The – and I want to concur with the other members who have raised this particular objection.

This is not acceptable because the Premier now comes into the House. We were of the understanding that he is not going to be available at all. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. Hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker. I think, hon Speaker, I rise on the same issue of the basis of the information provided to arrive at a decision. I appreciate what the Chief Whip of the Majority Party is providing now, which is more detailed of which was not shared with the House at the time, including when the MEC of Education also in his opportunity after the statement, he never provided those details.

So the House cannot be misled and we cannot have a Parliament that is reduced to being toothless by the Executive because the Premier will come in as and when he wishes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, my hand was up.

Mr L L MVIMBI: I am fine, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Dugmore and then ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, the last point – ja. hon Speaker, my point of order that I want to address you on is the false statement from the DA's Chief Whip.

The DA's Chief Whip informed me not that he would not be available at the time of the questions to the Premier, but that he would not be available at all. That is what the Chief Whip told me and I really want to request that she does not mislead the House. Because clearly if he was going to be available later it would have been no problem to simply move questions to the Premier later. I think this House is truly being manipulated now by the DA Chief Whip. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair, for giving me this opportunity and [Inaudible.] actually like to rise on a point of order in terms of Rule 59 for the respective members Dugmore, Kama, Sayed and Nkondlo casting aspersions upon the Chief Whip.

My understanding is actually that part of the message to, for example, Chief Whip Lekker was that the Premier was called to an urgent and important meeting with SANTACO, which was part of the message that was sent to the respective Chief Whip of the Opposition, that is an example, and because of that, at the time the hon Premier was not available for QTP. The House has further then said, "Yes, we agree QTP will stand over."

Now, we all know that this is a debate of public importance and part of the topic is the taxi strike which involves SANTACO. Do we really expect the

hon Premier to not sit down with the respective stakeholders to then come to a conclusion on this particular matter, and I propose that we move forward as a second matter of the particular topic. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I am covered by the hon Deputy Speaker and support the proposal for us to move forward. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much. I will now allow the last opportunity to hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Speaker. I do note in terms of the comments made by the hon Deputy Chief Whip and the hon Premier's time allocation here, but I confirm that that particular meeting took place and the hon Premier actually showed leadership by being in that meeting, chairing that particular meeting which included a number of SANTACO leaders, but also, all spheres of Government here in the Western Cape, including the City of Cape Town. So, that is actually leadership. So, the comments made are actually distasteful. So sorry. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, honourable ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): We meet with lies and deception ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Absolute nonsense.

The SPEAKER: ...Minister Allen. Hon Sayed, hon Nkondlo. Hon Sayed, is that a new point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker. With respect to the respected hon Allen. I know he did not intend to necessarily raise that point of order. He was asked by some of those inside of the DA who want to use him. But just to indicate. This was not an opportunity to report on the meeting. We saw the video and would expect that the hon Premier reports on the meeting when he does speak.

What we would like to propose, and that is why I had my hand up, is that after the debate, we then go to the Questions to the Premier without Notice. Surely, we can do that. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I have ruled. Previously, there was a question put to the House. The House agreed that Questions to the Premier will stand over. We are in the middle of, or we have just started a debate in terms of Rule 142, in the interest of the citizens because it is a matter of public importance. I do not want to entertain any further points of orders on this

because the citizens are watching. So, for that reason, I recognise the hon Premier, and we will continue with the debate as scheduled.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Kama, I am not entertaining any further points of order on this matter.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): There is no further point, hon Speaker. You have not ruled on the misleading part, but I want to hear the reason because I am not disputing that there was a motion that was moved which was agreed to. But there was misleading; we were misled that the hon Premier is not available on the day. If we were told that the hon Premier would later be available on the day ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...like in the debate now ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Kama, you are rehashing ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...we would have not agreed to the motion ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...and asked that the ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Kama, you are rehashing. Hon Kama! You are rehashing previous points of order ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): You have not ruled on this issue!

The SPEAKER: I have ruled on the matter.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): No, no, you have not. What is ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: We will continue with the debate as scheduled on the Order Paper. If you have an issue ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): What is your ruling ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ...with my ruling, then you use the parliamentary Rules that are available to you. You use them.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I am not disputing the rulings, but I am asking what is the ruling on the misleading part. I am not disputing. I just want to get what is the ruling ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Because there was no ruling.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): You have not ruled on the issue where we were misled to believe that the hon Premier is not going to be in the House for the whole day. That is the ruling that we want. We are not disputing whatever your ruling is, is going to be final, but what is the ruling on that part?

The SPEAKER: Well, I cannot rule on the facts because I was not party to that conversation. But what I will do in the interest of moving forward, I will revisit Hansard and see what was recorded into the record, and I will revert back to the House. Hon Premier, I now recognise you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Listening to the last bit of debate, one wonders whether the ANC really thinks that this is a matter of public importance or not. So, first of all ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): We asked ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ...before I get onto what I want to say, we have been trying to deal with this taxi crisis of a strike and the implications of that strike, the criminal activity that has happened as a result, the death, the destruction, the impact on the poorest of the poor and it is an issue that has to be dealt with decisively and properly.

When I managed to finally get an agreement today after lots of meetings late into the night last night and again, this morning with National Government,

with Provincial Government, with Local Government, and SANTACO, we agreed to have a meeting today. It nearly went off the agenda and then, it came back on. Unfortunately, the meeting with SANTACO was delayed by an hour and we could only start it at 1 o'clock. I then sent a message to the Chief Whip to say unfortunately, I need to make a choice here. This is a very important issue that has to be dealt with, this taxi strike. In the interests of our citizens, we need to make sure that I am involved in this meeting, and we had the meeting.

I informed the Chief Whip that there is definitely a possibility that I am not going to make it back to Parliament. I had to make a choice: back to Parliament in time for Questions to the Premier. I cannot involve myself now in programming. We had the meeting and generally, these meetings with SANTACO take quite a long time. This meeting ended about 22 minutes ago or 25 minutes ago. As soon as it had ended, I thought well, a perfect time to come back to Parliament.

I cannot influence programming or the decisions that the House made around my questions. I had sent a message to the Chief Whip. Whatever the House makes in their decision, I will abide by. But this is a very serious issue and instead of just staying away post the meeting with SANTACO, I thought it would be the right thing to come and then take up the slot in this debate.

So, I would like to start off by some of the statements that hon Dugmore made. Thank you for putting this on the agenda as an important topic for

discussion. I absolutely agree with you. What I do not agree with you is that we do not ...[Audio distorted.] or that this is a governance crisis. Where I also do not agree with you that I know as being the Chief Whip of the Opposition, when he, the very hon Dugmore, was in Government in this Provincial Parliament and in Provincial Government, I was never allowed, or our party was never given the opportunity to entertain a debate on importance to the public by way of the provincial law or otherwise. So, he must not come here with his high and mighty, just go and have a look. We apply the Rules and here, you have been given the opportunity. And I thank you for the question and we need to use that opportunity.

I then want to say that obviously, this strike called at, I want to say an unannounced last minute, by the taxi industry was very, very unfortunate. What was also very unfortunate is that when it started off that morning, where suddenly you saw political parties and even National Government in meetings with the industry before they called the strike. No further feedback to a provincial government or a local government. That raised many questions, and it still does in what political involvement there was in this strike from the very beginning. And those questions will be raised, and I hope that when this is all over, that we have a proper investigation around the strike.

But our job right now is to make sure that we find a mechanism that law and order is always applied, that we understand that in the Task Team what was the cause of the strike, why did it happen, and where do we find each other in

between. And I want to say from the outset: we need to make sure that we are looking after the safety of our citizens, the safety of our commuters. Crime and road safety and let us ...[Audio distorted.] to the taxi industry, public transport, and safety of our citizens on the road.

One just has to think of that tragic incident at Buttskop where there was a major accident, and our school children actually lose their lives. Not so long ago, our House was in a massive debate and discussion around the consequences of public transport, the taxi industry and school-goers in Mitchells Plain losing their lives. We have to make sure that we find a place of mechanism of using laws, using regulation, legislation and policing of those laws in finding a safer environment for our commuters in this province.

I absolutely agree with the hon Dugmore when he says we have to move forward, find a way in which the taxi industry, PRASA and hopefully, devolved PRASA responsibilities to a region where the trains are operating, where buses are operating in an integrated safe and reiterate safe, cost city, our province on a daily basis. We have to move towards that environment.

Of course, why are we in this position because there is a disagreement around impounding ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, your time has expired. Can you please conclude.

The PREMIER: Where there is a disagreement around impoundment. We have got to find a safe environment that enables public transport to operate. That needs law and order. But I must say that I think we have put a really reasonable offer on the table with the taxi industry and I sincerely hope that the industry ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Premier. The time has expired.

The PREMIER: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters in the Western Cape condemn in the strongest terms what has now become an abuse of power by the DA-led Provincial and Local Government in the proposal of delaying to issue taxi permits to deserving taxi operators, followed by the impounding of their minibus taxis. On 3 August 2023, the South African National Taxi Association in the Western Cape took a decision to take out all taxi operations in the province. This move took place following the frivolous impoundment of a number of taxis by the City of Cape Town under the newly passed bylaw which makes it possible to impound them, in cases where a fine would ordinarily be the competent decision.

The aftermath of these events has resulted in taxi commuters being stranded and unable to go to work, children being unable to attend school and

generally, the related impact on the economy of the province. The situation has been deteriorating in such an aspect that this also allows for opportunities and [Inaudible.] to try by killing people, stoning their cars and looting shops. While the situation [Inaudible.] unfortunately, blame should squarely be placed on the Western Cape Government and the Local Government's attempt to collapse the Black and Coloured economy and transport system.

This modus operandi is the provincial regulated end-kit to spite taxi operators with issuing taxi operating licences and for the City of Cape Town to impound taxis operating whilst waiting for their permits. The long-term orchestrated goal is to disadvantage the taxi industry in the province in order to make sure that the highly subsidised Golden Arrow and MyCiTi bus services remain profitable and operate without competition from the taxi industry. The discontinuation of the Blue Dot taxi funding by Provincial Government was the first step in the long service of what was to follow with an attempt to disempower the taxi industry.

In light of the above, the fact is that the Provincial and Local Government find themselves in untenable position. As the EFF, we call on the National Minister of Transport and the Minister of the Cooperative Government to intervene on this matter on hand in order to prioritise the livelihood of our people, as well as finding a lasting solution that will remedy the current impasse. With that said, we also call for the removal of Mayoral Committee member for Safety and Security in the City of Cape Town, J P Smith, who has

been using every second of his time to exacerbate the situation where there have been innocent people losing their lives in the process. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Klaas. Right on time. I now recognise the hon de Villiers.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Hon Speaker and hon members, I stand shocked before you over the events of the past week. A week ago, as we said in this Chamber, trying to find ways to make this Province better for all its citizens, the Mayor of Cape Town, Georgen Hill-Lewis, and his Mayco member Safety and Security J P Smith, took the first of a number of decisions that have set not only Cape Town, but the entire country on a path of war. The immediate result of that decision was that at least 200 000 were left stranded in Cape Town CBD on Thursday night. The long-term effects have left death and destruction in their wake.

On Tuesday, and again yesterday, these same two rebels without a cause, decided to respond with arrogance and impunity to the National Minister of Transport and again, defied the wishes of the people of Cape Town, the Western Cape and indeed, South Africa, for calm negotiation. I thank the hon Mackenzie and the hon Premier for their positive contributions to the discussions with the National Minister but ask that the Federal Executive of the Democratic Alliance seriously considers suspending Mayor Georden Hill-Lewis and alderman J P Smith ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank ...[Interjection.]

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): ...and have them properly investigated for the role in this disaster. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon de Villiers. I now recognise the hon Minister of Health and Wellness, hon Minister Mbombo. Hon Minister Mbombo?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Can you hear me, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: I can hear you now.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Fellow Cabinet colleagues, hon members, thank you very much for raising this topic. As the famous saying goes: when the elephants fight, the grass suffers. Over the past week in the province and specifically around the Metro, we have witnessed the extended upheaval as a result of the taxi strike which has been aggravated by rampant levels of violence in our communities. It has led much of the public and media's attention to be on visuals of vehicles burning, innocent civilians being stoned and even murdered, supermarket looting and everything.

However, hon Speaker, this does not mean everything else is fine and is able

to weather the storm that is currently facing us. Just because one is not able to see smoke, it does not mean that there is no fire. There are many invisible fires, hon Speaker, in addition to the smoke caused by the fires of the health network. We saw an ambulance being burnt on the first day of the strike and the clinic Nolungile, Site C, the only clinic in that area, we have seen that being burnt.

Hon Speaker, this is the current situation for the House. Just today, I had an opportunity to visit three hospitals in the City. Those were the New Somerset Hospital, the Mowbray Maternity and the Red Cross Children's Hospital. While everything may seem perfectly normal on the outside, inside it is a completely different story. While all are aware that the health system has faced many challenges and has experienced chronic underfunding from the National Government, COVID-19 left us with a wounded health system. We are still not healed. But when we see what has now happened, it is about where we will find that things are going from bad to worse for the health system.

Our health system can be described as a determined, but exhausted long-distance runner who is committed to finishing the race. With the advent of these strikes, this runner has effectively had their legs amputated by the knees. Hon Speaker, just imagine in New Somerset, around 18 nursing staff were not able to get to work. There were even doctors and nurses working in the Central Sterile Service Department to ensure that medical equipment is cleaned. This goes to show how severe the impact is when there are

insufficient support staff to do the much-needed support services for hospitals. Without these, no surgeries or births would take place.

In Mowbray Maternity, it was more than 20 nurses. It is a mere day after Women's Day, a day meant to celebrate women and yet women are being faced and affected even more. Both they and their unborn children are in limbo to access the maternal healthcare services. This increases any complications that may face women with high-risk pregnancies meaning when a strike is over, hon Speaker, and they are able to access this service, it may be too late because these are high risk pregnancies. At the Red Cross, hon Speaker, the total staff absenteeism today was 110 workers of which 45% were nurses.

Despite this situation, the hospital's amazing team still managed to do a heart and liver transplant in the Red Cross. Actually, in Groote Schuur, they had a whole complete heart transplant as well. In Tygerberg, hon Speaker, when I was there on Monday, around 120 nurses were not at work. I could go on and on about the figures in the specific facilities, but the crux of the matter is this. Those who have been able to get to work have been working without a moment to spare. Just imagine a 12 hour shifts every day since the strike started.

At a number of these facilities, many of the nurse support teams have to sleep there at the facilities, meaning they leave their families there and then, they have to sleep in the hospitals. In Mowbray, they do not even have a nurse's

home. At least in Tygerberg and others, they do have a nurse's home where they have to find a hole, put their mattresses there and have to sleep there. Many of our science students, luckily, hon Speaker, from our local universities, particularly Stellenbosch and UCT, are now volunteering to assist with providing additional capacity. This is the situation which we are currently facing and which has forced us to do some of the following.

Elective surgery, hon Speaker, now remains open – I mean, sorry, postponed and only emergency surgeries are being conducted. Taking note that we are coming from COVID-19 where we still ...[Audio distorted.]. It means it takes us back, moving backwards. This is also in our out-patients departments. They are open, but patients may have to wait longer in order to receive these services. In Karl Bremer Hospital there is a reduced capacity. But health facilities that are most affected are in the most-poorest impoverished areas: Philippi, the Nyanga, Gugulethu, Dunoon and [Inaudible.] When you close these facilities, it means that the next one that is open becomes overloaded. The City of Cape Town clinics, most of them, the majority of them, have been closed throughout the strike.

Hon Speaker, lastly. It is not only in the Metro, but also in the non-Metro. The Paarl Hospital has been functioning with a reduced capacity, despite that the clinics are all open. Additionally, hon Speaker, our emergency medical services remain ready to respond to emergencies, however certain volatile areas will still experience a delay in response to time as both ambulances and forensic pathologist services have to be escorted by law enforcement.

In the end when this strike ends, our facilities will be inundated by admissions of sick patients who were not able to get medical treatment. Just because on a daily basis in the high-risk clinics like say in Mowbray, the high-risk patients need to come. There are normally about 100 per day, but now it is about 40. Come next week or tomorrow whenever the strike is over, it means that those patients, there will be more of them and some of those cases will have become complicated. While everyone is allowed to exercise their right to ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please conclude. Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Without health workers, hon Speaker, there are no health services. For the sake of the patients, our children, the most vulnerable, we are appealing for the strike to end and if not, we appeal for the ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ...safe passage for the health workers. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: ...hon Minister. Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I now recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the taxi strike has brought delivery vehicles to a standstill. Everybody is now feeling the pinch. Lack of groceries on the shelves, vegetables, and bread, even the shortage of fuel are the consequences of this strike. But hon Speaker, the call of the ACDP is that there should be appointed an independent investigator to see who all is behind this because lives have been lost, buses torched, cars being burnt, and we cannot continue in this vein. And as the ACDP, we also want to thank the hon Premier and the Mayor and the hon Ministers for their intervention and their willingness to sit down with SANTACO to negotiate the way forward.

Hon Speaker, this must stop. Our children are losing precious hours not attending school. The figures I received this morning are something like 850 000 learners are not at school and here, the Western Cape wants to try to give more classes so that what they lost in COVID-19 can be made up. Now, they are losing again. So, this has got a domino effect because now, the parents of those learners are also kept at home and school fees are due, and there is a domino effect. As the ACDP, we are calling again on the hon

Premier, the Western Cape Government, the City, the National Government and SANTACO to sit down and work out an agreement so that people can be safe again. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. I recognise the hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, public transport should be seen to be safe, reliable, well maintained, not overcrowded and affordable. That is why in Luxembourg in the year 2020, they scrapped fares on public transport. The people are very happy. No competition, nobody fights with anybody.

Secondly, reliable public transport has a great impact on the ability of workers to get to their work and also for children to get to school. The impounding of some taxis was drastic, but not unexpected since regulation of the taxi industry was done very amateurishly. We must remember, 70 000 minibus taxi clashes were reported in 2020. Taxi licences are given out like lollipops at a school bazaar. Anybody can get one and when competition is uncontrolled, like it is here, drastic action must be maintained in order to control it.

In Durbanville where I live, I noticed up to 100 taxis at a small taxi rank, blocking roads, swearing at motorists who complained, riding on pavements to overtake cars and ignoring red robots. And where were the traffic officers? The DA's chickens have come home to roost. Five people were

killed during this strike by taxis, a British doctor amongst them. It is lack of good governance and regulation. Stop issuing more taxi licences until a proper needs analysis has been done in the townships. We cannot just go on giving out taxi licences and afterwards complain. Draw up a Bill of Passenger Rights ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, your time has expired.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): And ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please conclude.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Alright. We need a Bill of Rights for passengers, and it must be written into a municipal bylaw. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): In the meantime, stop impounding ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...taxis.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais. I now recognise the hon Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety, hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, hon Speaker. Hon Premier, hon members, the Western Cape Government wholly subscribes to the rule of law. It is a sphere of government that believes that the law should be adhered to and enforced without fear, without favour and where it is required. Regardless of who you are or the position that you hold, the law should apply at all times. When there are individuals, hon Speaker, or any entity that seeks to conduct themselves outside of the parameters of law, it leads to lawlessness which could ultimately lead to anarchy. But let me be clear, hon Speaker. In this province, this will never be allowed.

We have further seen the rise of opportunistic crimes taking place leading to sporadic incidents of attempts to loot and looting. Those attempts were quickly foiled, and arrests have been made. Hon Speaker, we ensured via our oversight role over the South African Police Service, that all law enforcement agencies, including Traffic, including LEAP, including our Metro Police, were and continue to be strategically deployed and particularly, in our hotspot areas. We have consistently had in excess of 1 500 officers, including our Traffic and LEAP officers, working around the clock to address the issues that might arise.

Hon Speaker, we have a beautiful Constitution that allows us to protect and to protest, but this has to be done in a peaceful manner without infringing on the rights of others. Sadly, hon Speaker, as a result of this strike, violence

and lawlessness led to five people losing their lives. None of these killings should have occurred and this is a complete tragedy. Their families will never see them again. While I am waiting for further information on the various individual victims, I can confirm that it included one dedicated LEAP officer by the name of Officer Kwinana, who at the age of 33 was in the prime of his life and he was confirmed a victim last week, Friday. On Sunday, I visited the home of the father of four and I conveyed my sincere condolences, but I could see the pain, the agony. His sister told me he was the breadwinner of their entire family.

Hon Speaker, taking an alternative route was to be the last action that that particular LEAP officer had to face. Also, it included a British national which because of the taxi blockage, his GPS redirected him and that was ultimately his last time alive on earth as well. It is really sad, and it is as a direct result of the strike action. So, those responsible for these deaths should ultimately be able to answer for it. We will not allow for any of these to go unanswered because we have that oversight, our Court Watching Brief will also monitor those particular cases.

Hon Speaker, there has to be recourse for every single death, the damages, and everything else where violence has occurred. On Monday, we saw 43 taxis seeking to block access to Cape Town International Airport. SAPS and law enforcement swiftly ensured that the blockade could be removed, with their vehicles being impounded while 43 drivers were arrested. To date, more than 120 arrests have been made and I expect even more arrests to be made

following a number of the CCTV cameras that are being looked at. 145 cases of malicious damage to property have also been recorded, 28 vehicles were burned and various other matters, including attempted murders, are being investigated.

Hon Speaker, the fact is: had there not been a taxi strike, no violence, no lawlessness, everything that is unfolding and that we have seen over the last week, would not have occurred. We cannot have a situation in our province where violence erupts and it leads to people dying, it leads to looting, and it leads to ultimately people losing out and that is what this Government has been fighting for. And we are working incredibly hard, hon Speaker, to reduce murders in our province.

The last Quarter Crime Statistics showed that we had a 14,1% decrease in the murder rate, which was the highest in the entire country. When murder is increasing on average in our country, it is decreasing here. And this strike has required us to divert resources. Instead of now combating crime, particularly murders in priority areas, officers have had to keep peace in the strike so that there is not violence in those protest actions.

But hon Speaker, we are being taken away from creating safer communities with the matter that is currently unfolding and we are trusting it will end in the very near future, because we want our residents to get back to work. We want law and order, and we want our officers to be on the ground so that they can look for those perpetrators, track them down, trace them so that they can

ultimately be held accountable. Officers will continue to be present and visible, and the law will ultimately be enforced.

Thank you so much to each and every hon Cabinet Minister, to the hon members that have helped, that have assisted. Each and every department has played a role to make sure that we are able to get through this time, a difficult time, to help our commuters, but we know we cannot do it without the communities. We had over 17 000 Neighbourhood Watches that we also communicated with, and they then sent relevant information to their sector commanders so that it can be quickly operationalised in order to bring stability where there are sporadic incidents. We could not have done it without the cooperation of all our partners.

We will continue, hon Speaker, to make sure that this Province is the province that other provinces look to where they ask us in order to provide them with information on best practices, how we are implementing programmes, how we are addressing or implementing a data-led and evidence-based approach where we have consistently ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...led ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ...your time has expired. Please conclude.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Speaker, once again, we are saddened that we have had to see people being murdered in our province and we have extended our sincere condolences to those loved ones and family members.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: To whom are the rules there.

The SPEAKER: I now recognise the hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, allow me to send our condolences to the families who have lost lives. Others are still in critical condition from the violence that ensued since Thursday last week when the taxi strike was declared. Today, we gather to discuss a critical issue that not only impacts the transportation sector, but also holds profound economic and social implications for our communities. The ongoing taxi strike brings to light several layers of deprivation concerns that deserve our attention in the City and the Province.

Let me further, hon Speaker, pose this question to the hon Premier in our midst of where his citizen-obsessed rhetoric is he was selling to this House from the past few Sittings, when scores of women, children and ordinary citizens had to walk from the CBD right up to Khayelitsha on the N2, whilst

leaving others at bus terminals without transport to go home. Where were he and his colleagues when the learners walked from Athlone and got to Manenberg Police Station around 8 PM as there was no transport for them.

His Government with his trigger-happy stooge, J P Smith, that he gifted with R1-billion under the guise of a Safety Plan when he took office so as to fund his political rascality. All J P has done is to cause chaos and bring agony and mayhem to the efforts of the Black majority in the informal economy, unashamedly even during COVID-19. It was he who used the same methods to the informal traders right here in Rylands, kicking and manhandling fruit and veg stalls of people just trying to put food on their tables.

One of the books written in the 1800s titled *The Administration of Justice for Governors, Meritorious Rulers and Kings*, explains this phenomenon of one of the most unpleasant relics of colonial legacy which is the issue of elected tenured political office holders, state governors to be precise, exercising unmerited power to depose of their opponents and silence dissent. Something written all over the abuse of Section 80 of the National Land Transport Act through the inequitable application of justice as raised by Mr Trevor through this 2021 City Traffic bylaw.

We welcome the decision by SANTACO to go to court so we can all be mediated against this politically self-emasculated and untrained ego of J P Smith and his cheese-boy Mayor. We have to be concerned about law and

order, but most importantly, as the book advises, that a ruler's obligation is the provision of social justice and protection of the property of the state's residents. We must understand the responsibility of power and its use, as the Constitution guides us in its spirit to ensure just, fairness, and human dignity is upheld.

What then should we make of the fuss of DA optics that claim a City that Works for You and its citizens obsessed. Maybe, we must admit that we have arrived at the truth of the DA going back at a high speed to the relics of the past apartheid tricks, †skiet en donder, swart gevaar, [shoot and beat-up, Black danger] as they are losing any sense of imagination and innovation of how a future South Africa must be. A future away from its past, but highly cognisant of never to repeat such atrocities under its watch.

The Western Cape economy has done nothing but kept Black people at the periphery of its growth, even with its high applauses of ticking the right boxes of governance. The Cape Flats remains a warzone under their watch and little, if anything is fundamentally done to drive the local economic development of these areas. Instead, this DA Government enables exploitation of this sector.

Having seen the money that the taxi industry makes and them sitting with MyCiTi busses that are parking in depots, and to date, have not broken even. To realise the investment made, theirs now is to push and curtail the taxi industry and its market share through the draconian bylaws. We have seen

the problems that led to the last taxi conflict of problems in determining and declaring routes timeously. That is frustrating and creating red tape for entrepreneurial activity of the taxi industry that is highly flexible as it picks opportunities of new developments in the City quicker, whilst transport planning is tailing behind.

The hon MEC of Safety recently, when asked about what he is doing to curb extortion towards township enterprises, his answer clearly stated nothing, whilst they claim the Safety Plan and boots on the ground. Where are these boots on the ground when required to protect ordinary kids to go to school and the elderly to go to clinics? Instead, schools and clinics by management of the Health and Education Departments have been temporarily closed.

Paradoxically, we see how bold the Mayor and his MMC offer protection to many of these townships to be transported to the CBD to serve the elite and those in the Centre, as indeed, without their service of the economy of the City will come to a halt. So, ensuring that workers are there to hold the City's economy is their priority and so, they must be protected. But there is no regard about their safety within their communities as when they come back home, they must evade stray bullets, something that has even been a known in these communities. The DA must be reminded that Black lives are not only good for a vote, but Black lives also are striving for economic inclusion and are deserving of prosperity in this province and in this region. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I now recognise the hon Minister of Mobility, hon Minister Mackenzie.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. I am going to put off my camera because the Wi-Fi is very poor where I am. Hon members, today is the eighth day of a minibus strike that has been seen as devastating for the safety and mobility of the people in our province. It absolutely cannot go on and we are working around the clock to resolve the immediate situation. My colleagues have spoken to the impact of the strike and the stories continue to emerge while we are debating here right now. The associated violence, intimidation and destruction have terrorised communities and placed enormous pressure on essential services and law enforcement.

Many are mourning the loss of loved ones and colleagues. People have been unable to get home to their families or to work, schools, shops, clinics, and other critical sites. Even those people who have private vehicles and do not rely on public transport have been unable to travel in some areas without fear of being attacked. Our other transport operators, Golden Arrow Bus Service and MyCiTi, have kept running their services as best as possible under incredibly volatile conditions. Where possible, these services have added fleet capacity to get people home.

Routes have had to be suspended due to extreme vandalism of busses and threats to the safety of drivers and passengers. Our enforcement agencies are stretched with escorting busses and needing to also prioritise trucks

delivering food to areas where the shelves are bare. This state of affairs is unacceptable and must be avoided at all costs in the future.

As the Western Cape Government, we are working extremely hard to resolve the ongoing issues in the industry and establish new terms of agreement that will protect the safety of commuters and all road users. The only way this will be successful is if we work together as Government and industry leadership on solutions that will improve mobility and support transport operators. Most importantly, there needs to be peace on our roads and in the community that has borne the brunt of the strike. We reiterate our call for an end to the strike so that minibus taxis can return to work, and we can all move forward. While we work towards an urgent resolution of the strike, political parties must stay clear of this space.

Over the last week, since SANTACO Western Cape moved to announce the strike, we have seen political parties attending meetings, fuelling the fire with disingenuous rhetoric, creating confusion in the media and derailing the hard work of the relevant stakeholders in the process. And critically, this political interference and opportunism is undermining the legitimate concerns of the minibus taxi industry, which is a crucial sector for transporting over a million people in our province. Hon members, let me repeat. The reason we are here today dealing with this chaos is the failure of over decades of ANC Government's failure to subsidise the minibus taxi ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Blame game ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...industry in the country. Let me give a bit of context so the hon members are aware.

In fact, I am going to take you as recently as on 31 July 2020, in a Standing Committee chaired by Chairperson Mmoiemang, attended by the then Minister of Transport, Fikile Mbalula, talking about the National Taxi Task Team. Hon members, in that meeting they talked about the formalisation of the minibus taxi industry. In fact, hon members, to quote from that meeting which is available on Google if the hon members would like to do that, the problem statement identified by the Minister of Transport, who is now the Secretary General of the ANC, he said:

“The interventions of the taxi industry began in 1995 with the first administration of the then Minister of Transport established the National Taxi Task Team. It culminated in the final recommendations presented in 1996 and accepted by the then Government.”

In fact, hon members, there is another quote which I am going to give you more context to. To quote from that Standing Committee in the National Parliament, chaired by the ANC National Standing Committee, addressed by the National ANC Minister of Transport. He said:

“25 years later, stock had to be taken on how far the Department had come.”

Now, this is, hon members, in the conditions that we are operating. Since 1996 the ANC Government by admittance of their own members, have done nothing to change the face of the minibus taxi industry. So, when hon member Dugmore, hon member Nkondlo, hon member Sayed and whoever of the ANC tried to attend a meeting on Monday morning of a Task Team to address the issue of the minibus taxi industry, I was deeply offended. I was deeply offended on behalf of the 60-million people of this country where this ANC Government ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable, hon Minister ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...has done absolutely nothing ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...over the last 30 years ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Mackenzie ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: This is why he is very childish.

The SPEAKER: Please take your ...[Interjections.]. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Only a blame game.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, can I be heard please? Hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): What the hon Mackenzie has just done now is to lie; is to lie in this august House. He was ...[Interjection.] the context. We were called by the Minister to have a meeting before he arrived. It has got nothing to do with ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: [Interjection.]...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...needing to go to a meeting where he was. He must not come here and mispresent facts ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed! Hon Sayed ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We are all trying to find a solution.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): He is a liar.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, firstly, that is not a point of order, but it is equally unparliamentary.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Like the ANC is a liar.

The SPEAKER: It is equally unparliamentary ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): It is how they lead, they lead with lies and deception.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there was an hon member on the floor. There was a point of order by the hon Sayed and hon Sayed, I need to call you to order. It is unparliamentary to refer to another hon member of the House as a liar. There are processes that you can follow if you want to bring any sort of information to the attention of the House. ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): There was a contravention ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: That is unparliamentary. And can I please ask
[Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): And the hon Nkondlo ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Can I please ask the hon member who keeps interjecting that you are going against Rule 40 of the Standing Rules which we all agreed to. With that being said, hon Sayed, is that a new hand and a new point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no, hon Speaker, it is an opportunity for me to withdraw. I would like to withdraw the remark to say that hon member Mackenzie has lied. He is misleading the House. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Your withdrawal is noted. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Let me repeat, hon Speaker. When I arrive at a meeting with ANC hon member Dugmore, ANC hon member Nkondlo, ANC hon member Sayed and any other ANC member present, I am deeply offended on behalf of the 60 million people in this country to attend a meeting ...[Interjection.] to address issues that were created by the ANC. It is a factual statement that based on minutes of the Standing Committee of National Parliament, based on minutes at meetings ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): There are no facts there ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...attended by the National Minister of Transport, that they have failed to deal with the minibus taxi industry for over 30 years.[Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): ...to take responsibility. ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: So, I am deeply offended ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! ...[Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): You are killers. You are killers!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: The creators of the problem ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): You are still misleading.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...who attend a meeting to address ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): What have you done to Red Dot and Blue Dot?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): That is how you won that post by lying.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Still misleading!

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): And how you became an hon MEC.

The SPEAKER: Can I please ask ...[Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): They will kill us!

The SPEAKER: ...that the Table staff please mute all hon members. ...[Interjections.] Hon members, we have come to the end of the debate. Everyone had an opportunity to make their contributions. The hon Minister is now being afforded an opportunity to make his contribution. If you do not agree with the content, that is unfortunately not something that I can rule on or can navigate through. The bottom line is that everyone that is on the Speakers List had an opportunity to make their submissions and I ask your indulgence to allow the hon Minister to make his submission as per the time allocated on the Speakers List. With that being said ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): You are too old to ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ...hon Minister, you may continue.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): You are too old. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, so when hon members talk about, and we heard hon member Dugmore and hon Nkondlo talk about the bylaw, by their own admission of the National Minister of Transport who was my co-Chair in this meeting, it is national legislation, not a bylaw. So, the hon members Dugmore and Nkondlo are clearly not well informed.

Hon Dugmore is right, we have a proud history of sorting out conflict in this country, but it needs to be done in good faith. Hon Dugmore was a member of this Parliament; he was a member of the Executive with the former Premier who has now suddenly become an expert on taxi matters. If they deeply believe in an integrated transport public system, they would have dealt with these matters 10, 15 years ago. Now, we are dealing with it. We are sorting it out as the DA-led Western Cape Government. We are the only government in this country who had a functional Blue Dot system. We are the only government in this country who tried to formalise the minibus taxi industry. Not the ANC Government ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable, hon Minister. ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: They have done nothing since 1994.
...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, my apologies. There is a point of order. Hon Bosman, is that a point of order?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Yes, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I rise on Rule 45 and ask that the hon member withdraws the statement that hon Minister Mackenzie is a killer.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): There was a statement made from hon member Nkondlo and hon member Windvogel that hon Mackenzie is a killer. I think that is not parliamentary and it cannot be allowed to stand, especially with this unruly behaviour.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Do not lie. I never said such a thing. Do not lie, Bosman!

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, there is an hon member on the floor. I will give you an opportunity. Hon Bosman, that was a point of order raised by the hon member. Hon Nkondlo, can I now provide you with an opportunity. Did you refer to the hon Minister as a killer?

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Speaker, please assist this hon member. You know, this thing of lying about people. You can even go to Hansard. I have not even said such, anything close to that. This thing of your DA members who lie and try to deceive people using lies. I have never said such a thing.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Equally again, we are all hon members, and you cannot refer to a member of the House as a liar or refer to any member as lying. I will, hon Bosman, refer to Hansard and I will come back to the House with a ruling. Hon Sayed, was that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is not. Hon Speaker [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...is hon member Mackenzie willing to take a question on his service for the ANC Government?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: No.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, there was a point of order. Hon Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: No.

The SPEAKER: The hon Minister is not prepared to take a question, hon Sayed. Then, hon Windvogel, is that a point of order?

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): No, hon Speaker. I was the one calling them killers because they have blood on their hands. †Hulle het bloed aan hul hande, [They have blood on their hands] but I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Windvogel. Hon Windvogel has withdrawn. I have already ruled that I will still come back and consult Hansard and make a ruling on the point raised by hon Nkondlo in the interests of hon Nkondlo's point. Hon Minister, you may continue.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, is that a point of order?

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker. Now that you have determined that I have never said such, I think you have to go back to hon Bosman to withdraw or apologise because he cast aspersions on my integrity.

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, like I said. Hon Windvogel has withdrawn. I have already ruled that I was going to come back to the House in your interest, so I will do so at the next available opportunity. Hon Bosman, is that a new point of order?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): No, hon Speaker, I am happy to withdraw and correct my statement that it was hon Windvogel who referred to the hon Minister as a killer. My apologies to hon Nkondlo.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That will reflect in Hansard as such. Hon members, can we continue. Hon Baartman, is that a new point of order because I am not going to allow any further points of order on this particular point.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is a new point of order, hon Speaker, and it follows out of a previous point of order, but it is not on the previous point of order. It is in terms of precedence of this House in terms of Rule 66. Aspersions cannot be made that when a member makes a point of order that that hon member is making aspersions on another person. The whole point of putting points of order is for us to ask yourself as Speaker, for advice and guidance and rulings on matters. So, it cannot be alleged that [Interjections.] that hon member Bosman has said ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): You kindergarten teacher.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...something and that that must be true ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Do you not want to go to kindergarten and teach?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...because he has asked for advice ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): You are the Speaker that gives us advice in this regard. ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): You are wasting our time!

The SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): And that cannot stand, otherwise it will happen again and again. Thank you.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): You are wasting our time.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, honourable ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Hon Speaker, you made a ruling.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. Your point is noted. I will now let the hon Minister continue.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, hon

Dugmore talks about: what is the antithesis of our Constitution? And what is the antithesis of the Constitution, hon members, is the fact that the ANC Government has done nothing to support the minibus taxi industry. The minibus taxi industry are our partners, and we will continue to work with them to deal with public transport in the Western Cape.

What is the antithesis of the Constitution is the blatant destruction, theft, collapse of our transport system: PRASA, Transnet, SAA, Post Office, and all other transport systems, including the collapse of Metro Rail. That is the antithesis of the Constitution and that is what the hon Dugmore should be talking about because he was an Executive when this has happened in the country. The Western Cape Government is picking up the pieces and it will push towards improving mobility for the people that we serve.

And in fact, hon members, in other parts of the country the chaos has been allowed to proceed. Let me remind the hon members, when the chaos was happening in the Eastern Cape and I have said it in this House before, hon Speaker, not once, 150 attacks on busses. What did the Eastern Cape Government do? Their MEC, in writing, told a private business operator to give his business to the minibus taxi industry. That is not how the rule of law works. Unacceptable behaviour and this is what the ANC members are used to. Not us. We are working with the minibus taxi industry as partners to restore the rule of law. The ANC has failed commuters and communities by handing over power to individuals to create more chaos.

The Western Cape Government is resolute in our commitment to dealing with the complex challenges in the industry. There is a lot of work to be done and we have just begun. The Minibus Taxi Task Team that was created in prioritising this work, has made clear progress. The Task Team managed in under four months from the creation of our Task Team, managed to hand over positive decision letters by our Provincial Regulatory Entity to the minibus taxi industry. SANTACO has even acknowledged it the other day during the strike. But unfortunately, progress still needs to be done.

It is difficult to deal with progress in under a short period of time created by over 30 years of mismanagement by the ANC. But like any other country ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Where were you the past eight years?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...we must abide by the rule of law, specifically as MPLs, we need to adhere by the rule of law and negotiate in good faith to ensure the minibus taxi industry is finally professionalised. Something that the ANC has never contributed to facilitating. The eight points that were created or mentioned by hon member Dugmore has already been worked on. Some of them just do not make sense.

There are Rules in this House. There are laws in this country and hon Dugmore, as an elected member of this country cannot follow suit with his colleagues in National Government just to call blatantly for a moratorium.

You do not suspend your laws like that, hon Dugmore, via you, hon Speaker. There are laws in this country, and we must work together to restore credibility for our commuters in the Western Cape, who are working hard to get to work. That is our role as Government and that is what we will consistently work towards achieving.

So, I am asking our colleagues to please work with us. Do not try and negotiate bad deals behind the tables. Do not arrive in meetings with your ANC regalia and try to derail the process. Bring constructive proposals to these principles because that is how we work. We want to fix the minibus taxi industry. They are a partner to us. We love commuters using public transport in this country and we, as the Western Cape Government, will continue to do so as we want to achieve mobility for people in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Mackenzie. [Interjections.] Hon members, that brings us to the end or concludes the debate on this subject. Hon members, please join me in allowing me to wish the hon Minister of Social Development, hon Minister Fernandez, a happy birthday. I trust you had a good day, hon Minister. And on behalf of the House, a happy, happy birthday.

Hon members, that concludes the business for the day ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Happy birthday, hon Minister. Happy

birthday.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Happy birthday, hon Minister.

The SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon colleagues.
Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Is it not also your birthday, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: That concludes the business for the day, hon members. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited from the sitting. The House is now adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:15.