
THURSDAY, 27 NOVEMBER 2014

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Before we proceed, the House will be suspended for a few minutes to take an official photograph.

House suspended at 14:16

On resumption at 14:23

The SPEAKER: Order! Be seated. Order hon members. During the debate on 20 November 2014, the hon member Mr Dugmore raised a point of order, requesting me to rule on whether it was parliamentary for the hon Premier to accuse another member of lying or being a liar. He alleged that the hon Premier used the isiXhosa word *†uyaxoka* in a direct reference to hon member Mr Magaxa. In her response to this point of order raised, the hon Premier said and I quote: “I said you are telling an untruth in Xhosa and that is not unparliamentary”. Various hon members gave their take on the exact

meaning of the expression used but because of my limited understanding of isiXhosa, I undertook to deal with this point of order once I have had an opportunity to consult our senior isiXhosa language practitioners.

I am advised that the word †xoka or †xoke means lie, lying or liar respectively and †uyaxoka means you are lying. Although the Premier intimated that to her knowledge there is a different meaning attached to the expression used, the generally accepted meaning of the word is unparliamentary and therefore has to be withdrawn. I now call on the hon Premier to withdraw the word †uyaxoka.

The PREMIER: I withdraw it, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order! Order, hon members! We are now - hon member Mr Dyantyi. Now that matter is dealt with we now move to the Order Paper. The first matter on the Order Paper, I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Notice of motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That notwithstanding Rule 198, precedent be given to Order Number 2 on the Order Paper.

The SPEAKER: Any objection? No objection? Agreed to. Hon Chief Whip.

(Notice of motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Standing Rules 203 and 204, sub 1; Interpellations, Questions and Questions to the Premier without Notice set down for next week be dealt with on Tuesday, 2 December 2014.

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That notwithstanding the provision of Rule 18, the hours of the sittings on Wednesday 3 December 2014 and Thursday 4 December 2014 shall be 10:00 until adjournment.

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That notwithstanding Rule 161 the House considers the principle and finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill B5 of 2014 on Thursday 4 December 2014.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the second Order.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

1. Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture on the impact of the Immigration Regulations, as contained in the Immigration Act, 13 of 2002.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The report tabled here today regarding the public hearings held on 25 and 26 September 2014, is to determine the extent to which the impact of the new Immigration Regulations 2014 has on the Western Cape economy and on the lives of people in general. Allow me to take you back a little in order to understand why it is that we are here debating this very issue here today.

On 26 May 2014, South Africa's new Immigration Regulations and well as the Immigration Amendment Act came into effect. Although the Act was

published in 2011, it only came into effect after the Immigration Regulations were finalised and adopted, the reason being that the regulations serve as the engine that enables the Immigration Amendment Act to operate. The new Immigration Regulations were published in the Government Gazette on February 14 and called for public comments by 28 February 2014, thus leaving only 10 working days for interested parties to study the new regulations and propose amendments or provide comments.

Although the Minister subsequently extended the deadline by another week, the opinion is that the process was done in an unreasonable haste and that the three weeks were insufficient to comment on a policy of this importance and magnitude. Mr Deputy Speaker, I cannot stress this enough. Three weeks was not sufficient time for stakeholders to comment on a policy of this importance and magnitude.

The regulations were signed into effect on 26 May 2014 and what must be noticed is that the regulations are the responsibility of the Minister, so they do not go through Parliament for consideration. This means that the regulations could not be tagged as either Section 75 or 76 Bills, thus this Parliament could not engage with this piece of legislation. Understanding this background and adding all the complaints sent through from various stakeholders and associations, including those that came through the Western Cape's Red Tape Reduction Unit, complaints that came to the Committee and a large amount of negative press over the sudden implementation, the Committee unanimously resolved on 27 August 2014 to consider the negative

impact of these Immigration Regulations by hosting two days of public hearings and engaging with stakeholders as the impact seemed to suggest that the implications are far reaching.

The Constitution states clearly that the role of legislatures is extended to public administration in that the public must be encouraged to participate in policy making. These public hearings provided an opportunity that many sectors felt were not afforded to them in the draft phase of the implementation of the regulations. Committees may investigate any matter of public interest that not only falls within their area of responsibility but also any matter that has a provincial impact, even if it is not within the oversight authority of the legislature.

In 2007, a joint study was commissioned by the Presidency and the National Treasury, to look at introducing Regulatory Impact Assessments into South Africa which was formerly adopted as a set of guidelines for the Presidency in 2012. Regulatory Impact Assessments are used worldwide to assess the impact of legislation on the economy, determine the cost benefit and potential risks that may arise and more importantly, to ensure that all stakeholders are given the opportunity to give input. We believe that these new Visa Regulations have failed to fulfil their constitutional mandate of public stakeholder engagement and through a parliamentary question received at the National Assembly, it was confirmed that no Regulatory Impact Assessment was ever done. No impact or cost benefit was ever assessed and most sectors were never consulted or informed.

An HON MEMBER: Skande!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: A total of 43 written and verbal submissions were received representing all the major bodies and associations affected by these regulations. They included representatives from key sectors such as tourism, immigration services, the film industry, the hospitality industry, conferencing, events and meetings industry, educational and training institutions, the business process outsourcing industry, two international schools based in Cape Town, modelling agencies and the wine industry and some of them are here in the gallery and I recognise them.

The Committee heard emotional stories of children and spouses being torn apart due to the new Visa Regulations hastily adopted. Just yesterday the French Consul General mentioned that 20 French learners are still not able to enter South Africa as a result of the new Visa Regulations. In order to preserve the objective and impartial nature and the intent of these hearings, the Committee also invited leading government officials and political leaders. This included the national Minister of Home Affairs, Mr Malusi Gigaba to brief the Committee on the nature of these regulations via letter on the 3 September 2014. The timeline of events can be found on page 77 of the report, tabled as Annexure E which led up to the eventual engagement with Minister Gigaba as tabled in Annexure F.

In his letter the Minister has indicated that an engagement with the Standing Committee may be useful in order to forge a better understanding of the

immigration regime and our own sphere of operations. The Committee is very grateful for the Minister's appearance before the Standing Committee and giving us the input and the Minister has promised to peruse this report. This gesture in the spirit of cooperative governance is greatly welcomed.

From the written oral submissions received and recorded, specific policy-related concerns have been raised under the various sub-sections of the Act. The report then provides conclusive findings on the impact of the regulations, the issue around capacity constraints which further exacerbates the problem; the question around human rights abuse and litigation regarding learners being kept out of schools and classified as undesirable, and the recommendations to this House and to the National Assembly.

The report also contains the Committee's recommendations to the Minister of Home Affairs on the Immigration Regulations. The Report shows that the Immigration Regulations will have a detrimental effect on the economy of the Western Cape and South Africa in general. It is evident that significant job losses will occur across all sectors with the possibility that some sectors would actually come to a standstill. As a result, a number of litigation cases have already been launched against the Department of Home Affairs. Red tape stymies investments, it threatens growth. Government cannot simply conjure up jobs. It creates them through easing the business environment, not adding more restraint.

In a recent article, Minister Gigaba stated that the amendments were in the

best interest of South Africa's security, particularly that of human trafficking, which the Minister alludes to on more than one occasion, while ensuring economic development and prosperity. While we recognise human trafficking as a hideous crime that must be acted upon, why is Minister Gigaba using Visa Regulations rather than the Prevention and Combating of Trafficking in Persons Bill signed into Law in 2013, which specifically tackles human trafficking as a crime? Is this not a matter of enforcement that must be looked at? After all the Act is there to ensure that the enforcement is put into operation. However, when asked about the effect of enforcement via a written question, the Western Cape Directorate for Priority Crime Investigation stated that no arrests have ever been made since its promulgation.

It is important to contextualise this very issue, how many incidents of child trafficking or human trafficking have Home Affairs intercepted in the last 12 months when we consider that there were 22 million passenger movements at OR Tambo and 12 million passenger movements at Cape Town International Airport over the last 12 months? How many such cases have been intercepted at our country's borders, crossing where millions annually pass through? Despite requests for more information, the Department of Home Affairs remains tight-lipped and vague about just how pervasive this issue is in reality.

The Committee recognises a need to implement corrective measures to reverse the situation and balance its security needs with tourism demands.

However in an environment of slow economic growth and declining tourism potential, the introduction of security controls must not impact on tourism growth. [Interjection.] I emphasise the seriousness of the findings of this report and believe that these regulations could tip South Africa into a recession if the impact is not carefully considered. [Interjections.]

Issues regarding [Inaudible.] application visas, the fact that maths and science teachers have been eliminated from the critical skills list and reported concerns into the loss of investment and ultimate job creation in the Western Cape economy must be taken seriously.

Minister Gigaba has also publicly stated that immigrants to South Africa are enjoying high quality service and improved turnaround times at our Visa Facilitation Centres. Yet no matter what the complaint the Committee received and always in the media, there was always a capacity constraint hampering the required turnaround times for visa applications across the world. This further hampers the entire problem and must be addressed. We once again acknowledge Mr Smith and his family in the gallery as a case in point; 300 days and waiting for visas.

Finally, in terms of Section 104 of 5 of the Constitution, the public hearings would like to assist the Committee to make recommendations to the National Assembly. [Interjections.] A Provisional Legislature may recommend to the National Assembly legislation concerning any matter outside the authority of that legislation or in respect of which an active parliament prevails over a

provincial law. [Interjections.] What is important here, recorded right here on this transcript and stated publicly, is that the Minister has said that should a better solution be on the table, he will gladly look at it.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we believe that this report would need to be taken seriously and the recommendations should be considered by the Minister. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that it?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The hon member Mr Davids.
[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ai, Mr Deputy Speaker, wasteful expenditure. That is what happened there. [Interjections.] We must state from the onset that these recommendations as forwarded by the legislature are nothing but a ploy to protect the rich white constituency of the Democratic Alliance. [Interjections.] The dishonesty of the Democratic Alliance in the entire process is mind boggling to say the least. The fact that the Committee wants to commission an independent Regulator Impact Assessment over and above the intensive work which has been carried out by the National Ministry in this regard shows the DA's racist attitude towards a black National Government. [Interjections.] This sends out a message which has always been an underlying truth... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... that the Democratic Alliance believes in the notion...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... that white... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please continue. You may continue. Order, the House is just too noisy.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You love my voice. This sends out the message which has always been an underlying truth that the Democratic Alliance believes in the notion... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon member Ms Davids. Is there a point of order or a question now?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: A point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker. Is it parliamentary to refer to a government in South Africa in racial terms? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: That it is a black government or a white government... [Interjections.] Rooi mannetjie... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order. Hon member Mr Botha that last comment must be withdrawn. That has been ruled - order! That last comment is unparliamentary. It has been ruled on before so you must withdraw that first of all.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I withdraw that comment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And hon member Mr Botha on the first point ...[Interjections.] Order! On the first point, whether reference to a group or the government being racist is unparliamentary; it is an unfortunate comment at the most but it is not unparliamentary. You are not referring to a specific member of the House, so it is in order. Please continue.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Ms Davids, order. Is there another point of order or a question?

Mr M MNQASELA: Yes, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is yes?

Mr M MNQASELA: I would like to know... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: I would like to know – this is a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

Mr M MNQASELA: I would like to know from the Leader of the Opposition; if now the ANC [Interjections.] - no this is a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! I am ruling it out. Order. That is not a point of order, it is a debating point. Please take your seat. Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is a debating point.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: This sends out a message, which has always been an underlying truth, that the Democratic Alliance believes in the notion that

white is right and black is not. The DA is summoning the National Minister Malusi Gigaba so the DA's [Inaudible.] tactics to treat ANC leaders like criminals because they do not serve the narrow white supreme interest. The Minister of Home Affairs was summonsed illegally by the Committee. Summonsed illegally, it was shown out; he was summonsed illegally but also it shows the Democratic Alliance's hostility towards meaningful engagement with the National Government led by the ANC.

This is particularly concerning as this particular issue is a national competency. If only the DA would put as much energy into improving the lives of our poor and working class within the Western Cape, as they do in protecting the interest of the whites. [Interjections.]

The new Immigration Regulations are intended to improve our ability to manage immigration effectively in a way which balances South Africans' openness to legitimate travellers as well as security imperatives. Unlike the DA whose only interest is their foreign business interests in the Western Cape. These immigration regulations are important for the security of our country as a whole and not only the Western Cape as the DA wants us to believe.

This illustrates how the DA defines the Western Cape outside of the Republic or South Africa. Perhaps I ought to remind Helen Zille or should I say Otta Helen Maree that there exists a country outside of her island.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Before the point of order - you are referring to a member of Parliament. You must address her as a member of Parliament.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I accept, Mr Deputy Speaker. Honourable Premier Helen Zille or should I say honourable Otta Helen Maree must realise that there exists a country outside of her island. The DA claims that there has not been extensive public participation in this regard. Not only is this claim untrue, it is also highly opportunistic to say the least.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: The initial publication of these regulations...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member Ms Davids, just one second. Minister Winde is it a question or a... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, will the member take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, are you prepared to take a... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker, but... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you prepared to take a question?

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, he has had enough time to speak, he can wait.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer is no, please continue.

Ms S W DAVIDS: The initial publication of these regulations was released for public comment in February of this year and the deadline was further extended to accommodate stakeholders to make submissions. This process itself started in 2007 as the Chairperson had said but the DA deliberately chooses to forget this.

Subsequent to that, Minister Gigaba also met with the Minister of Tourism, hon Mr Derek Hanekom, and with the tourism industry stakeholders including ASATA and the South African Tourism Council, and announced the formation of a joint task team between the department and the industry as a vehicle for ongoing engagement. When the Minister was here he also said there is always room for engagement and amendments. [Interjection.]

Furthermore, prior to the DA's cheap political stunt of summoning the

Minister on the basis of lack of public participation, the Minister has in actual fact publicly stated that he had a meeting with the DA's Leader of the Opposition in the National Assembly where they have met with DA officials and they made a submission.

The DA furthermore shows that it does not trust its complement in the National Assembly to deal with the issues around migration. Perhaps this is because the DA in the National Assembly's leader, Maimane, is a black person, who is incompetent. [Interjections.] Maybe that is the problem. [Interjections.]

It is interesting to note that the DA would go to such great lengths to make submissions and recommendations when it comes to visas but fails to address basic service delivery issues in the Western Cape while we have had such a lot of... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... marches to Parliament in the last few years.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Order, hon member Ms Davids. Order. Order! Just take your seat. Hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker. The current speaker is

promoting racism in this country and division in this country.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening very carefully – Order. Order! Order! Order! The hon member Ms Davids can continue. I am listening very carefully and if necessary I will stop the hon member Ms Davids if it goes too far.

Ms S W DAVIDS: We must also note that the DA would go through such extensive lengths in calling for public participation when it relates to issues of the elite and not of the poor.

Where was the extensive public participation when the DA led, City of Cape Town, ordered the eviction of the people of Lwandle [Interjections.] on a cold winter morning because the Residents Association wrote to the honourable Helen Zille to complain about the poor black people...? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order. Hon member Mr Joseph, I first see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order. The hon member Ms Davids is misleading this House. [Interjections.] She is misleading this House... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, hon Minister before you go too far

“misleading the House” is not a point of order, it is a debating point. Hon member Mr Joseph.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Where was the... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Order, there is another point...

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the point raised by the hon member Ms Davids now about Lwandle is irrelevant. It is not a matter of relevance in this topic that we are discussing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will listen to the relevance. The hon member Ms Davids has just mentioned it once but please continue. I will listen carefully.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You can see everyone is interested in this topic. Where were the public hearings when farm workers were being evicted from their homes? Where were the public hearings Beverley, hon member Ms Schäfer, where were the public hearings when the farm workers were evicted from their houses? Where is the human rights when it comes to our people in the Western Cape; where is it? [Interjections]

Mr D JOSPEH: Madam Speaker.

Ms S W DAVIDS: In its critique of the immigration regulations, the DA

deliberately ignores the National Minister's efforts... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! There are now two people standing.
Hon member Mr Josephs.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to continue saying that the point just raised about evictions is irrelevant to this ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That point has been ruled upon. Order! The point has been ruled upon and the hon member Ms Davids has moved on again. Please continue hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: We have to increase the number of Visa Application Centres abroad, particularly in India and China, where we have rapidly growing sources of tourism revenue. We must also know that these tourists that the DA is claiming to defend, come from countries with similar visa regulations.

Furthermore, after having considered submissions by different stakeholders on the regulations, the Minister has in actual fact already granted a postponement of the Unabridged Birth Certificate and Written Permission to June 1st 2015. This shows that the Minister continues to claim that he is open to further engagements and that legislative implementation is open to amendments.

The DA also does not mention that as part of the new regulations, companies that are granted business visas need to employ at least 60% South African or permanent residents of South Africa. That means we are speaking about job creation and also poverty alleviation. That is what the new regulations will do which was not done before. Before they only had to employ five people, now it is 60%. This is a direct intervention in addressing the crisis of poverty and unemployment in our country.

We remain resolute that the new immigration regulations are in line with our objectives of managing immigration efficiently and effectively in order both to facilitate socio-economic development as well as to protect the integrity of our borders and the sovereignty of our country. Amandla!

An HON MEMBER: Mooi!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, the hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP have serious concerns with the impact of the new immigration regulations. I do not think... [Interjections.] ... that the ANC realises the implications of the regulations and it is not well thought through. [Interjections.] There is no real world application... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... and this can be highlighted in the medical tourism

sector. Maybe the ANC is incompetent or ignorant. We know...
[Interjections.] ... that South Africa is struggling. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order, order! The general noise level in the House is too high and I am not talking about the speaker I am talking about members not speaking.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: We know that South Africa is struggling and lagging behind other emerging economies with our economic growth. [Interjections.] I hope that the members of the ANC in this House especially ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, you have had your turn, now please give him a chance.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... especially the Leader of the Opposition that will speak afterwards, will come to sense and realise that this will harm the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! One second. Is there a point of order or a question?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I just want to know...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Give the hon member a chance.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I want to know if it is parliamentary to call other people not sensible.

An HON MEMBER: Is this a point of order?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear that but it is not unparliamentary. It is not unparliamentary. Please continue. Please continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, how can the ANC say a better life for all if we are going to see massive job losses, especially in the tourism sector where they predict that 25 000 people will lose their jobs. How can the ANC say a better life for all if these immigration regulations are implemented [Interjections.] without considering the public. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, this is the last time, please. We cannot have a running commentary while you have just had your turn to speak.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Then it is true that the ANC who fought the liberation struggle before 1994, is not the same ANC that we have here today. Before 1994 they represented the people... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... and now they represent themselves. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second, hon member Mr Christians. Order! Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I want to know can the hon member take a question on what he just said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member is not prepared to take a question, please take your seat.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, no, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Will you please continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The lack of leadership of the ANC nationally has now filtered down through this province. Instead of voicing their dismay and disgust with the new immigration regulations, they are now doing the same and just taking from their counterparts and just taking orders. They have no say; this province has no say, and when the national leaders say 'jump', you ask how high? The poor people you claim to represent... [Interjections.] ... are the biggest losers in this scenario. Are the biggest losers! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Hon member Mr Christians, your time has expired.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before the next speaker speaks; I am not going to talk again about the unnecessary high noise levels in the House and I specifically want to address the back bench of the ANC. Hon member Ms Dijana and hon member Ms Makeleni are the two specifically who are making a constant commentary. I think it is you as well but please, refrain from doing that. Hon member Mr Paulsen, please speak.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is unfortunate that hon member Mr Christians calls us poor people losers. We have listened to various presentations made by parties affected by the visa regulations and although some of those were laughable, we must acknowledge that many of the services affected by these regulations have a huge bearing on our economy. Whereas the Department of Economic Opportunities has spoken about job losses, we should also see how it helps us to get South Africans to fill the gap in order to continue providing the affected services. It is always in this Department of Economic Opportunities where white monopoly capital rears its ugly head, arguing the fact that new visa regulations limit the steady influx of occasional settlers from Europe.

Unemployment is brutally high amongst South Africans. It therefore stands to reason that we ensure that South Africans are given preference to the few jobs that are available but we do know that our brothers from neighbouring states are easy prey to unscrupulous employers or white monopoly capital

who are fully aware of their desperation.

We have also heard the national Minister's commitment to address certain matters on a case by case basis. We are in agreement with the harsh measures imposed on visitors who overstay their welcome. We are a sovereign state and we should demand the respect we deserve.

In his book "How I Got Their Money Off the Rich: The Career of a Confidence Trickster", convicted German confident trickster, Jurgen Harksen - you should know him; he funded your party. You exist because he gave you money for your organisation. [Interjections.] He describes how he persuaded his rich victims to keep sending him money in South Africa during a nine-year run from the law. Harksen described how he hired a host of working class South Africans to act the part of American bankers. The Democratic Alliance should know this character very well. Very well. [Interjections.] The Desai Commission in 2002 told us how Harksen was contacted by the then Democratic Alliance Premier; you know that guy, that very good looking guy... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Paulsen, I am listening carefully. I am trying to get the relevance of the last line of argument. Please get to the point.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the relevance is that this was a man who was on the run from the law in Germany. He took refuge in South

Africa. He managed to dodge any regulations. He set up a very good relationship with the Democratic Alliance though. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! On that point I must stop you hon member Mr Paulsen, your time has unfortunately expired.

Mr M N PAULSEN: No. Mr Deputy Speaker, that is unfair, you interrupted me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have given you enough time.

Mr M N PAULSEN: No, Mr Deputy Speaker. No, this is terrible.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I know that this man...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: ... funded your political party but now you want to stop me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister. Hon member Mr Paulsen...
[Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: I am not a Minister yet. I will go speak to the Premier.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen. If I am addressing you, you listen. I have given you injury time. You have had more than your initial time, so please take your seat and remain quiet now. The next speaker, the hon member Mr Fransman. [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] the reality in front of us and the facts are the following that prior to 1994... [Interjections.] ... we had a reality whereby the apartheid regime had no proper controls; no proper ID's for black people, African, Coloured and Indian and they had the dompas. Between 1994 until today, we had to reorganise and re-engineer the public service system in the context of Home Affairs. What we have heard here today, is that members, hon member Ms Schäfer and others, talk about no public participation. Where were they when public participation was not there, when dompas issues and all those issues were put forward?

The second important thing here... [Interjections.]... is the fact that what we have experienced here is simply the following. There was a strengthening of immigration regulations and there were challenges. There were what we define as unintended consequences and we need to say that. That in itself, can never be a political game.

One of those challenges was the fact that it would be the reality that if you are in Shanghai and you need to move to Beijing in person, it will be a

challenge to move. You are going to have to spend time in Shanghai to Beijing before you even come to South Africa. That is the problem. No one can deny that problem and therefore we said, part of the redress on unintended consequences is the fact that we also need to put visa services in all those major cities. That is exactly the reason why the Minister of Home Affairs and the Minister of Tourism has met and MEC Winde knows that.

But what has happened here in the Legislature, and this is an address that I want to make to the diplomats... I want to address to... [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Sorry, sorry.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ...the diplomats in South Africa ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Fransman. Just one second.

Mr M MNQASELA: We are listening very carefully. The point of order is: are we allowed to say here “that MEC”, not the honourable member or the honourable MEC?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Chair will listen carefully. We all call one another honourable.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am going to watch my time and I really want ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give you injury time on that.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ... because there is attempted interventions here. The issue here is simple and this is an address to the diplomats. The DA has attempted to use the Legislature to pull the diplomatic community of South Africa that is based in South Africa into a bun fight in the party political agenda. That you must be ashamed of as the DA. MEC Alan Winde, you must be ashamed of that. How did it play itself out? They identified the issue of, as the Order Paper says 'job losses, economic impact, the people', that is the message.

The reality is that the Chairperson of the committee tried to summons; today she said there was good cooperation. Saying you summonsed the Minister; say you actually had what I would define as premature ejaculation in that particular process. [Interjections.] Because what has happened, she was summonsing... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order! Please take your seats. Hon member Mr Fransman, I think that is unparliamentary. You must withdraw that.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: I am withdrawing but I am really talking about a political process here. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. I know what you mean but please withdraw

that.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Ja, I withdraw. So what has happened...
[Interjections.] What she effectively did; she summonsed the Minister, she then realised that the Minister... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Just one second, is there a point of order or a question?

Mr M MNQASELA: Yes sir, is ejaculation political process?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela, I have already ruled on that and he has withdrawn it. Please continue.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: That is interruption on my time, Mr Deputy Speaker. What has happened then is they then attempted to summons, they then realised legally it was wrongful because they want to use the Legislature in summoning our National Minister. What has happened though is they had to eat humble pie.

What we are advising the MEC to do is in fact do not go that route. Do not pull the diplomatic community into fights amongst ourselves. We must have national pride, we must have national interest and we must admit that there are problems in terms of regulatory processes and therefore it was right to have proper immigration legislation.

We know that South Africa is the country with one of the highest, if not *the* highest, number of refugees from the other parts of the world into South Africa. All those are challenges, we must address that but we cannot address it when it comes to national realities in the context of this. What, however, did we do? The reality is that 40% of the world population is part of BRICS, South Africa being part of BRICS.

We also realise that a majority, if not one fifth of the world's GDP, is in the BRICS countries. We are part of that, we must celebrate those things. But if you have an MEC that goes as if he is not part of the South African spheres of governance, there is a problem. So what we are advising is let us deal with these things; let us engage with the diplomatic community. I would say please, avoid again being drawn into political mudslinging, because what the DA has done is they have exposed themselves. We will go to each of these diplomatic communities in South Africa and we will make sure that they understand national and domestic issues and domestic political fights should not be pulled in. It is a shame what the DA in this legislature has attempted to do over the last while.

We are saying that the growth problems in the Western Cape are because of a lack of inclusive and a lack of shared growth. Please convene public hearings, MEC, please convene public hearings... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ... when it comes to evictions, when it comes to shared growth issues, when it comes to the fact that the poor in the Western Cape are not seeing the expenditure from the Provincial Government as they are supposed to see it but only the elite does. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Leader of the Opposition, your time has now well expired. [Applause.] The hon member Ms Schäfer. Sorry, hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think before I get into my speech, the first thing that I must do is just deal with this... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Premature ejaculation.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: It has been said here but I am not going to repeat those words in this House of the hon member Mr Fransman. I think it is very interesting in the words that he says and the way he speaks, specifically about the international fraternity. The way he speaks about the Ambassadors and the Consul-Generals that are in our country. First of all he was fired from a position where he actually was supposed to be in contact with those people and he obviously has not spoken to one of them ... [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Exactly.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: ... because every single one of them stands together on this issue. It is not denied. He also makes a statement specifically about the other MEC's. He also has not spoken to any one of them either because we all stood together on exactly the same position at Tourism Minmec with the National Minister, so he obviously does not know what he is talking about.

But let me get back to this debate, and I want to perhaps use my opportunity to just have one other reaction and that was to the first speech that we heard in the House from the hon member Ms Davids, and I could not believe what I heard coming out of her mouth 20 years into democracy. It reminded me very much of - and those of you who have not seen it should have a look - the cartoon that was in the *Business Day* today. And it is a cartoon where it shows this picture of our President's head hanging off a crane, depicting a wrecking ball. And you see the State-owned enterprises, the National Prosecuting Authority, the economy, the Public Protector and Parliament all smashed to pieces.

Of course they missed out Nkandla, the arms deal, the SABC, the Post Office, SAA, Eskom, the textbooks, etcetera, and of course visas. And what does this all talk about? It talks about ANC policy and this is a dismal failure. This specific issue on visas is an absolute failure and then that hon member stood up and said "this is going against a black National Government".

An HON MEMBER: That is racist.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: I wrote it down in inverted commas on the top of this cartoon and I actually wrote - I did not write 'National' - 'Black Nationalist Government' and I thought: 20 years ago, those were the exact same words that came out of a white Nationalist Government. It is very interesting where we are going to in this country. [Interjections.]

This is about policy. This is about ANC policy, an absolute failure of ANC policy. And I want to first of all thank the Standing Committee for holding these hearings, for allowing the industry... [Interjections.] ... to voice their concerns... [Interjections.] as to what... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is coming, it is coming...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, please allow the Minister to speak. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen how we... [Inaudible.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No it is not a [Inaudible.] to her.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister. Order! Order! Order! Order hon member Ms Davids, this is your last chance please. I am really serious, if you are

going to make running commentary all the time, then you will not see the end of this debate.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker, then you must also speak to the members on the other side... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will look at all that.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ...who is provoking me because I am not going to keep quiet if they keep on mocking me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order hon member Ms Davids. Hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I know that you have ruled on this matter but you have addressed her on three occasions now and on top of it she wants to reprimand you for speaking.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will not allow that and I am watching carefully. Thank you very much.

Mr M G E WILEY: We really must appeal that the Rules be applied.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will do that. Minister Winde, you can continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. So what we are debating today is absolute ANC policy failure, where we introduce regulations to deal with problems that we have and we all agree there are problems. But what we do is we put regulations in place that are actually going to create far more problems for this country. We have 1,4% projected growth going forward for this country; power failures and visas together are going to push us into recession.

And when you take the speech of the hon member Mr Fransman and he says we have not noticed it yet. We must start to look at the numbers and the cancellations that are happening. We have got to start to look at the budget spend and I talk about Trafalgar Tours who have redirected their whole budget spend on family holidays to South Africa to send European families now to other parts of the world and not to South Africa. They have stopped all budget spend.

When we have a look at [Interjections.] what happens and you heard a statement by their Chair that people have been waiting for 300 days for a visa. But let us also think about 37 days in a single room in our airport, where a woman is held, the wife of a shopkeeper who works in the Eastern Cape. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Disgrace.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Disgraceful, absolutely unacceptable. And this is this political party whose policy we are busy debating here today, the absolute failure of this policy. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Disaster.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: And you heard the kind of racial comments that were made [Interjections.] but then you heard the other side and the hon member Mr Fransman talking about the BRIC countries. I will show you now the implication of these regulations of which the hon member Mr Fransman should know all too well as the rest of this party should know.

Now we have just finished an analysis to have a look at the GDP growth versus jobs growth in our economy, a review of the last five years. Which sector do you think comes out way above every other one when you look at growth economically and jobs growth? The highest of the whole lot in the last five years; 6,8% GDP in tourism but 7,8% growth in jobs, the highest. This attacks that growth absolutely head on.

So let us have a look at the implications of this piece of legislation. [Interjections.] First of all, the implications on our province where we have competency; in South Africa the top 20 tourist destinations in South Africa are as follows The top, number 1, V & A Waterfront. The second in South

Africa, Cape Town Central City; the third in South Africa, Cape Point; the fourth in South Africa, Table Mountain Cableway; the fifth in South Africa, the Winelands; the sixth in South Africa, the Cape beaches; the seventh in South Africa, flea markets and craft markets in Cape Town in the Western Cape. The eighth, Western Cape Nature Conservation; the ninth, Robben Island and the tenth, the Garden Route. The eleventh attraction in South Africa are the Durban beaches. So the first 10 attractions are all in the Western Cape. This is going to affect people who work in this industry in this province that you have been talking against. [Interjections.] That is the first thing.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: You are assuming that.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: The second thing... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Really!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: ... Let us have a look at tourism growth into this region [Interjections.] in the last five years. [Interjections.] Where has this economy grown from a tourism point of view in the last five years and out of which markets? Where has the biggest growth been? And the biggest growth

at 29,6% in the last five years has been out of China, a BRICS country, hon member Mr Fransman, a BRICS country.

The second highest growth into this region is 18,3% over the last five years, from where? Brazil, a BRICS country, hon member Mr Fransman. The next one is 15,8% in the last five years from which country? India, hon member Mr Fransman, another BRICS country that you were talking about. Then Lesotho at 18,5%.

So then let us have a look at what it is like to get a visa if you want to come to this country to spend your money so that poor people can get jobs in the fastest growing sector and where the most potential lies, in tourism. This sector, tourism, that this political party's policy is now going head-on against and going to affect jobs, primarily poor people, in this province.
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Daar's hy.

An HON MEMBER: Of which he is not paying [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: So if you have a look at the countries that need to get a visa, it is unbelievable when you do the study to have a look at which countries need an entry requirements visa in advance. Guess what? China. Guess what? India. Guess what? Angola. Guess what? Nigeria. Guess what? Kenya. These are

countries in Africa, BRICS countries. These are the countries for which it is the most difficult to get a visa to come to South Africa. And the hon member Mr Fransman, in his position before he was fired, should know that because that was where he was [Interjections.] as a Deputy Minister. He should have been right way up on this document on this legislation from long before it was even advertised.

Then we spoke about the window period for comment and advertisement. One week extra on two weeks is not very much for public comment but it would also help that if that public comment that was taken into account, would have actually then said to the drafters of this piece of legislation, ‘hang on a second, I think we are making a mistake’. Because, as I said before, in this piece of regulation the plaster has been pulled away from the wound. So I guarantee you that what is happening with this piece of legislation... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, sorry, there is a point of order. I did not see the member rising. [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Lekker, is that a point of order or a question?

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is question, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you. Minister Winde, do you have proof that hon member Mr Fransman was fired? [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much for allowing me the question. I have absolute proof that he was fired, because he is no longer the Deputy Minister. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He is actually sitting in this House straight opposite me. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Now if he was not fired he would still be serving as a Deputy Minister in the Cabinet of President Zuma, but he was fired and now he is sitting over here in the Opposition benches... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He was fired ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...which he is not very often in those benches. [Interjections.]

He is normally absent from this House. [Interjections.] But thank you very much for that question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I see members raising their hands. Hon member Mr Tyatyam, is it a question? [Interjections.] Order! Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I just want to know if ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Another question?

An HON MEMBER: Give another question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a question?

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is a question, a question, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, are you prepared to take another question? [Interjections.] Please proceed.

An HON MEMBER: Bring the [Inaudible.] Bring it!

Mr S G TYATYAM: I just want to know if hon member Mr Mnqasela was fired. Is he also here from national Parliament? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. Thank you very much for that question.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Now that was a very good question. Now you see what happens here is the hon member who sits directly behind me was actually promoted because he went from “opposition” there to “in government” on this side.
[Interjections.] [Applause.] Any more questions?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, there is another hand. Order! Hon member Ms Davids! [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Davids.
[Interjections.] Minister Winde please proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, I see the hon Leader of the Opposition is stopping all questions from that side of the House, but quite frankly... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, I called you when you did not listen, but I will give you a chance now. Is it a question or a point of order?

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A question. Minister Winde, are you prepared?

Ms S W DAVIDS: A question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, I just want to know Minister Winde, you have now shared with us a lot of information and documents that you were reading from [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] The question, where is the question?

Ms S W DAVIDS: My question is, is that correct, was it confirmed because last week you also shared information with us and it was not confirmed. It was the untruth that you shared with us [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: So is this information that you are sharing with us now the truth?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We want questions. The Minister is prepared to take questions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, please respond if you want to.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Or continue with your speech. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That information is not ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Is it a point of order ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: First of all this... [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Because he was hitting farm workers. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: I am not sure exactly to what the hon member Ms Davids is
referring to as documents that were untruths.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Last week.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: But I stand by every single number and every single word that is

in this document as well as the document from last week, and last week's debate was on farm evictions and it is quite interesting the number of meetings I have had since that debate on farm worker evictions. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Minister Botha was hitting farm workers.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Quite frankly with the number of people that that hon member invited to this House [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...and actually understanding what they had to say after the debate was very, very interesting... [Interjection] ...and interesting to see their feeling around specifically the ANC post that debate, but I can assure the hon member Ms Davids that I stand by every single number and every single word that I have reported on. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Do not tell stories.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But this issue - and we might have had a little bit of fun now for a few minutes - is a very, very serious issue. Visas are a very serious issue

for the economy of this country. They are a very serious issue for the poor people of this country and especially in a sector like tourism. Of course visas are going to affect the economy across the board, but tourism primarily and the ANC identified tourism themselves as a sector that is really one of those sectors that we can actually get people into jobs quickly. We can create businesses quickly. It is an opportunity sector if ever there was one, but the policy of this political party now is very unfortunate because through this regulation we are now starting to close the doors, not necessarily on all of those visitors, because they will go to other places in the world.

Who we are really, really closing the doors on are the poor people of this province and the poor people of this country who really were looking for opportunity in this new South Africa of ours and policy and regulation from this political party are closing the door in their face. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, thank you, your time has expired.

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is your view. That is your [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Schäfer. [Applause.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are speaking for the whites here.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes, I think I have a whole list of responses to the ANC but I think it really deviates from the seriousness as

Minister Winde has alluded. This document really is one of the first and it is the only one and I feel that it is certainly something that needs to be taken seriously. The report that was released by Grant Thornton was kept very much under wraps for a long time which specifically spoke to the unabridged certificates but we have stressed to Minister Gigaba that this document was not done for racial reasons. It was not done for political reasons either. It was done out of absolute concern for people who are being impacted by this and industries that are seriously feeling the impact of these regulations, and it is not just tourism. It stretches right into business. I know that hon member Mr Paulsen mentioned the fact that we should give opportunity for South Africans to get jobs and I absolutely concur with him, but what we must understand, the reality is that middle managers are not available in South Africa; where particularly in the business processing units industry we are having to bring out middle management who can actually train and upskill South Africans into middle managers, so we cannot deny the fact that visa regulations are having an impact on business and on education and on tourism. Again I would like to stress the fact that in Minister Meyer's address the Provincial and Municipal Economic Reviews and Outlooks he stated that many of the problems related to the economy are largely the result of a failure of leadership at national level to implement the right policies and we are seeing this across the board. So with that in mind I would really like to talk about the last part and this is really the important part, I feel, because in terms of Section 104.5 of the Constitution - I previously said that public hearings would assist the Committee to make recommendations to the National Assembly - states very clearly that a provincial legislature may

recommend to the National Assembly legislation concerning any matter outside the authority of that legislature or in respect of which an act of Parliament prevails over provincial law. The point is really on page 77, that we want to table this report and we want to put our recommendations forward from this House to the National Assembly, that are made on page 58 of Section 104.5, and I would just like to touch on what that is. I believe it is very important because it touches on every other aspect of legislation going forward for this country; and I believe that if you really are interested in actually contributing and being able to fix up this economy, legislation needs to have a guideline and I refer to page 58. The first point that we feel very strongly about is that regulatory impact assessments in respect of all regulations promulgated in terms of national legislation should be undertaken, that the publication and tabling in Parliament of any intention to adopt regulations specifying subject matter ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Schäfer just finish off, your time has expired; just your last sentence.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...of the regulation soliciting comments must be made, so I would like to just say the last sentence, that I hereby table this report and ask that this House supports the recommendations made to the National Assembly relating to Section 104.5 of the Constitution. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes your speech. That also concludes the debate on this Order. Are there any objections to the agreement of this report? There is an objection. I then put the question: those in favour will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against, “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it, and so they have. The objections of the ANC and also of the EFF, do you want your objections recorded?

An HON MEMBER: Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The objections of the ANC and the EFF will be recorded. We now proceed to the Interpellations on the Question Paper. Interpellation Number One, I see the Minister of Finance.

INTERPELLATIONS:

Revenue generation and debt management: municipalities

1. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Finance:

- (1) What is the state of revenue generation by Western Cape municipalities;
- (2) whether the debt management strategies employed by the various municipalities are effective?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you to hon member Mr Dyantyi for this interpellation. This is indeed a very important interpellation and it was also recently discussed at the National Budget Council Lekgotla; the issue of income generation in Western Cape Municipalities.

Earlier this year on 30 September we tabled an Extraordinary Provincial Government Gazette on the status of income generating capacity of municipalities for the first quarter. En vir die eerste kwartaal van die finansiële jaar vir munisipaliteite is daar 'n totaal van R11.53 miljard of 27.5% van die aangepaste operasionele inkomstebegroting van R41.968 miljard rand gegenereer.

Soos op 30 September in die Provinsiale Koerant gepubliseer is die uitstaande skuld verskuldig aan munisipaliteite R8.8 miljard, waarvan inwoners R6.9 miljard of 78.9% skuld, nie-regeringsorganisasies R0.110 miljard of 1.2% van die skuld en dan kommersiële verbruikers

R1.823 miljard of 20% skuld, terwyl ander verbruikersdebiteure 'n kredietsaldo van R0.070 miljard weerspieël, of 0.8%.

Oor die algemeen het alle munisipaliteite geloofwaardige skuldbestuurbeleide en strategieë in plek en ek is besig met verskeie inisiatiewe saam my kollega, Minister Bredell, Minister van Plaaslike Regering en ook fiskale pogings om verbeterde invordering van inkomste te verseker, maar soos ons tans gehoor het in hierdie debat, die huidige verswakte fiskale posisies soos gereflekteer in die Fiscal Economic Review Outlook, people are under severe stress in South Africa. Not only our government is under severe stress, but the low growth projection of 1.4% also puts people under difficult situations and this will also impact on income-generating capacity of municipalities. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you, hon MEC. I also want to suggest upfront that you put the DA template you are reading from aside, and let us have a conversation about this issue, and I want to say upfront on the issues the MEC has raised, I want to give him credit out of four issues for one issue: the ability to have reduced government debt into almost a zero percent. Treasure that and that is the end of me clapping hands for you ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, you are a patronising oke.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...and I want to go further therefore, because the question is also how effective is the debt management in municipalities, and if the MEC believes that it is effective we should not be sitting with a debt of close to R10 billion as he has indicated.

In fact the MEC seems to be suggesting that not much can be done to reduce that debt because of the following issues that he has raised:

- (1) The rising unemployment;
- (2) The rising indigence, meaning poor households getting more and more, because we have just in June had a presentation and three months later the figure is rising. It is not going down;
- (3) And the third issue he is raising as a justification for this is the bleak economic outlook of the country.

I get that is a point you are making; and I want to bring to his attention the hypocrisy of this government because at the same time when they raise the point about an economic outlook in the country that is not looking good at 1.4% in the medium term, they make the point that the Western Cape is faring far better.

An HON MEMBER: That is true.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now if the Western Cape is faring far better, it is better, why would we sit with the problem and now that MEC Winde has introduced the top ten, I want to go to the top ten municipalities of this province so that we deal with this top ten issues. There are actually eleven, I am leaving the West Coast District because that district does not really affect this issue we are talking about. We were told a few months ago that those top ten have got clean audits - all of them; and we are made to believe that is good news.

I want to take you to those top ten municipalities in relation to this topic that we are talking about and say to the MEC in terms of the indigent numbers in those ten municipalities - that is the City of Cape Town, Knysna, you have three of those in the Southern Cape, three of those in Cape Winelands ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, your time has expired for this slot. You will get another bite of the cherry just now.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will definitely come back because I think...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...I want to persuade you to get the [Inaudible.] in this thing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Provincial Government is able to give an accurate account of debtors relating to various services. Management and financial systems are in place to monitor the accounts owed to municipalities as well as the entities and provincial departments. Municipalities in particular rely on the income for services rendered and therefore it is important that revenue collection is managed according to the policy of the respective institutions. Records indicating the outstanding amounts for various services from nought to 30 days to over 120 days are available for all organs of State, commercial as well as the households.

The amounts mainly outstanding, we need to note, are due to disputes and queries. The government departments and municipalities have to project an income in order to deliver the services to all.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie, ek kom terug!

Mr D JOSEPH: A projection on income for outstanding amounts is guided by the policy information letters to the people, warning letters and where necessary the legal action.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: U moet lekker luister as ek terugkom.

Mr D JOSEPH: The important point that we need to note here is that debt management is also related to leadership and in particular political will that is heading the departments. It is important, and therefore the Indigent Grant Policies that are implemented to help the poor is there, however, if a company or individual is unwilling to pay after reasonable circumstances have been taken into account the onus is on the provider of the services to take the necessary action, where necessary.

The Western Cape Government understand the financial circumstances of the people and people are struggling and job opportunities are negatively affected by the slow economic growth and sad to say, it is the policy of the ANC National Government that is failing our people. I thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. The hon member Mr Dyantyi. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let me continue on the top ten. You have three of those in the Southern Cape, three in the Cape Winelands, City of Cape Town, two in Overberg and the West Coast. In eight out of those ten municipalities the debt of indigents is rising. The City of Cape Town, just as an example, in the last financial year compared to the previous financial year rose by 200 000 of indigent. If that is not a crisis, somebody must then say what is? How do we define that?

It is only two municipalities that had a drop in the indigent, because here we are talking about the living conditions of our people. It was Theewaterskloof and Breede Valley and I know the reasons why, and Breede Valley had nothing to do with hon member Mr Kivedo, the fact that he was there. [Interjection.] Also common in those top ten municipalities - and we have said in this House, I am going to repeat for you – is that there is rising protest. If in this province you had 644 protests, 398 were in the City of Cape Town; 126 in the Southern Cape, 120 in the Cape Winelands. Does that not make sense? Can you read the connections in the things that you are talking about, because you said to us “clean audits, these are best municipalities...” I am saying in those best municipalities is where major problems are happening. Is this something that you as this DA-led Government want to say to us you are happy about?

Clearly not all is well in all of those ten municipalities. I actually want to make the point that in terms of the debt owed to commercials, meaning businesses, there is R1.8 billion, which is 20% owed to them. I want to help this MEC by giving him some ideas after the response he has made.

Hy gooi die hande in die lug, dat daar niks meer is wat ons kan doen nie.

I think there is more that can be done, because if R1.8 billion, 20% is owed to private sector and businesses they would need to be more effective with those municipalities in the same way you did to government departments.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Dyantyi, your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: If I may finish this ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have got another slot.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I know I do, maybe stop everybody else, and then just [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have given you injury time this time around.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you. [Time expired.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. When we interacted with the department on the issues around spending, in fact debtors and creditors, we realised that more than R6.7 billion is owed to municipalities, but the reality is this is a more than 90-day period. You will find that it varies from one municipality to the other, but I think it is important to admit the problem that we have. There are municipalities - the case in point I would mention Central Karoo District and I would mention Oudtshoorn - when we interacted with them as a committee because the Auditor-General says the department must make an intervention in that particular municipality - they told us

R103 million is owed to them. I think that was one municipality, and I think that hon member Mr Dyantyi would also agree that we said we need to look at this very closely, but the question is there must be a clear difference that where the DA is in power we do things better than where the ANC is in charge. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Mnqasela, your time has expired. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Your time has expired. [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No thank you. Maybe he was not listening because the top ten municipalities are all run by the DA, but let me proceed. I said I wanted to give him some ideas that are going to be important when you break down the R1.8 billion, the 20%.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, just one second. What is that hon member Mr Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: This interpellation is not top ten. It is an interpellation. It is clear, not top ten.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is irrelevant.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Please continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: If he needs a workshop I will do it afterwards.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue. You are wasting your own time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...that it is going to be important that he breaks that down into those SMMEs that are struggling, but also that he must be able to deal harshly with those established businesses, and in terms of the 6.8 to household it needs to be looked at as to whom are the most vulnerable, but also at those that can afford and do not pay. For those who are saying, “ANC policy is failing this country”, let me just read you something that you might want to go and digest, and this is coming from the World Bank Report; it says South Africa has had more success using fiscal policy tools to reduce inequality and poverty than eleven peer countries which includes Brazil, which has an unemployment of less than 5% when ours is over 20%. It goes further to say R3.6 million South Africans have been rescued from poverty because of free basic services and grants, because of the kind of fiscal policies, so if Minister Winde speaks about ANC policy that is not working he only has to read a World Bank report for him to understand ...
[Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: 26% is unemployed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...South Africa is in good hands under the ANC.
[Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: 26% is unemployed [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is important that you understand all of those kind of issues [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What are you smoking?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...and I must also in finishing [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] That is why 60% votes for the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Nkandla [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...help the MEC, because he is throwing his hands in the air, say you do not have to go any further; please read your Financial Fiscal Commission recommendations on the issue of these revenues and then making the following recommendations... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You've got to stop taking [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... that municipalities should explore new and innovative methods to generate revenue and collect outstanding debt. That is what between yourself and MEC Bredell must be done instead of claiming poverty and secondly, municipalities need to ensure that their tariffs are cost reflective and sensitive to the indigent profile of municipalities in order to

minimise municipal consumer debt levels. It is important that you do that.
[Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Dyantyi. Your time has now well expired. The hon Minister Meyer. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: [Inaudible.] indigent policies.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We know if hon member Mr Dyantyi wants to know the real story, in Gauteng and KwaZulu Natal respectively the debt crisis is R41 billion and R10.1 billion respectively ... [Interjections.] ...so if you want to present a workshop go to Gauteng and KwaZulu Natal. You cannot lecture us. There is a lot of work to do in KZN. So what you have to do, ask us what are we doing in this space of revenue collection in terms of capacity of municipalities.

We are not throwing in the towel. We are following the MGRO process, and let me show you the results of that particular process of revenue capacity and cash management. Last year we did an MGRO process in two of their municipalities, one is Matzikama, and we have agreed with the municipality to do a cash management to develop a cash flow reporting timeframe. That is for September 2013 to September 2014; what is the outcome? No progress. That is Matzikama. Let us now go to Cederberg - the same story, no progress. Cederberg, Kannaland [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Kannaland, no progress. So you really can only have... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...real capacity and income generating capacity when you have effective political leadership which is absent in the ANC. [Interjections.] Yesterday the President said the ANC is in a crisis.

An HON MEMBER: Terrible!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This is the demonstration of the crisis that the President has spoken about, but I must admit the hon member Mr Dyantyi [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Meyer, one second.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am happy to take your question.

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, it is actually a point of order. I would like to ask you to make a ruling Mr Deputy Speaker, when it was widely reported that the President referred to the ANC facing trouble. He did not use the word “crisis”, yet in this House the MEC is misquoting the President. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Again Hon member Mr Dugmore that is not a point of order. It is a debating point. The Minister can continue.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You love the ANC hey.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Well, if hon member Mr Dugmore does not read the newspapers the crisis is here. Wake up! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not what the President said.

An HON MEMBER: Well, who listens to him?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Well, whether it is a crisis ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Wake up and smell the [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...whether it is “in trouble”, it is coming to the same point. South Africa as a country as a result of the ANC is imploding because of the quality of the leadership of the ANC and hon member Mr Dyantyi raises a very important point ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, conclude. Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I want to conclude. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We can increase the income generating capacity of municipalities if we have better quality leadership, not the type that we have under the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you. [Time expired.] We move on to Interpellation 2. The honourable Minister Schäfer.

Vandalism and theft at schools: financial implications, of

2. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Education:

What are the (a) general and (b) financial implications of vandalism and theft at schools?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In addition to financial costs the social and other costs of vandalism includes demoralising staff and learners at school.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Show a bit of excitement [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Shush man, hon member Mr Paulsen.

Degrading of the teaching and learning environment and facilities ...
[Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Education is sexy. [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen! [Laughter.] Hon member Mr Paulsen, please! Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: The comment made by the hon member Mr Paulsen is that ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: May I finish?

Mr M G E WILEY: He referred to the minister as “sexy”. That is an unparliamentary ... [Interjection.] [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: No. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I did not ... [Interjections.] Order! Order! It may be so but I did not hear that. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: I said education is sexy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, he referred to education. Minister Schäfer. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much. May I continue?
May I start again please?

In addition to financial costs the social and other costs of vandalism includes demoralising staff and learners at school, degrading of the teaching and learning environment and facilities, stress and increased safety concerns. It also takes officials and educators off tasks as school governance, principals, teachers and officials have to spend time and effort dealing with the issue. They have to spend time dealing with law enforcement agencies and security issues and organising repairs as well as counselling for learners and teachers.

Every hour spent dealing with vandalism represents time taken away from supporting learners in working through the curriculum. Secondly, the WCED spends about R10 million a year on emergency repairs as a result of damage from major incidents of vandalism at schools. We should be spending this money on improving opportunities for children. School vandalism not only comes at a cost to the Education Department but to that of the learners and the community as well.

For instance, R10 million could employ an additional 33 educators in our schools a year; ensure that an additional 9 000 learners attend no fee schools or provide over 60 000 additional textbooks. R10 million could feed almost four million learners every day.

Safe schools has a budget of R24 million of which 60% has already been

spent on security infrastructure this year with the balance going on to programmes that influence learner behaviour and mobilise community support for schools. The department allocates funding to schools for general maintenance in terms of national norms and standards. This includes repairs for minor incidents of vandalism. Schools manage these repairs internally. The department and schools could spend these funds better on improving the quality of education in schools. At the end of the day vandalism represents theft from our learners. While we can and do try to safeguard our schools with additional security measures we cannot win the fight against school burglary and vandalism without community support as schools, given their extensive physical infrastructure, are very difficult areas to secure.

Atwood Primary School is a good example of the role communities can play. Before 2012 this school was targeted by vandals on a frequent basis. The school community of Hanover Park then decided to rally together to protect their school, patrolling school grounds after school hours and during school holidays. Their active engagement in protecting their school has proved successful. They have had only one incident of burglary and vandalism at the school since.

The WCED would like to see other communities take an active part in the safety and security of their schools as in the situation we have seen at Atwood. Our safest schools are normally those in communities that support these schools for example via an ongoing surveillance and volunteer work at the school.

Other examples of schools where the community have played an important role in combating vandalism are Masiphumelele Senior Secondary in Philippi, and Die Duine Primary in Lotus River.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Schäfer, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon co-members, members of the Provincial Government, members of the media and distinguished guests. [Laughter.] After each full holiday we are confronted with the spike in reports of vandalism of school premises. [Interjections.]

After the recent September school holiday it was reported that 23 schools were vandalised and burgled despite increased security provision during this holiday period.

The vandalism and theft from the very institutions that create opportunities for all through education, is atrocious. For the 2014/15 financial year the Western Cape Education Department will build three new schools, three existing schools will be expanded, five schools will receive 40 new Grade R classrooms and 130 schools are scheduled for maintenance.

The DA commends the department on their efforts to provide quality education through establishing infrastructural plans, executing their construction and implementing maintenance projects.

These efforts are continuously trampled on ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He is gone. The Speaker is here.

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...and proven futile with each... Madam Speaker [Laughter.] These efforts are continuously trampled on and proven futile with each case of vandalism and theft. What is especially disheartening is that the perpetrators of these crimes are from the surrounding communities. In effect the community is being robbed from receiving quality education by their own community members.

Mr M N PAULSEN: No it is [Inaudible.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: The quality of education is not solely the responsibility of the Education Department, but all role players should be held accountable. These role players include learners, educators and the community the school serves, which consists of parents, caregivers and residents of the area. Each of these role players benefit from the quality education received at provincial schools.

I urge all communities to assist the Western Cape Education Department in

protecting educational institutions because it is established to open opportunities for all in the province. Safeguarding our schools should adopt a holistic approach in which communities take ownership of schools in their areas by being vigilant and reporting suspicious behaviour. I thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wow! Wow!

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

Mnr M N PAULSEN: Mooi!

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Botha ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Short and sweet!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, order please.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, earlier this month Joe Slovo High School in Khayelitsha was vandalised and the damage estimated to 40 000. Reports have mentioned that the Western Cape Education Department has already spent R500 000 repairing damage at this one school earlier this year.

So much more could have been done with the reported R900 000 to improve the quality of education not only at this school, Joe Slovo, but at many other schools across the province. Taking into consideration the total amount

mentioned by the Minister earlier, how many extra resources could have been purchased from the unnecessary expense of repairing damages caused by vandalism?

The vandalism and theft of any public institution is unacceptable and like hon member Mr Kivedo acknowledged, communities, parents, learners and all who benefit from the quality education provided in the Western Cape should be held accountable and take responsibility. I commend the Western Cape Education Department for their swift action in repairing damaged schools because no child's right to receive an education should be further violated especially due to vandalism. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Olivier.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Please, hon member Mr Paulsen, your interjection is becoming disruptive. Kindly contain yourself please. [Interjections.] Proceed, hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, we must remind him of last night's whitewash. He will be quiet.

Mr M N PAULSEN: A whitewash [Inaudible.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Chair, maybe he forgot.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Proceed hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: The scourge of vandalism and theft generally occur during weekends and school holidays and it affects mostly the school in poor and the working class communities. In general classroom windows are broken, reading materials have been stolen, copper wires, cables, computers, kitchen equipment, electrical appliances gets stolen. All of the stolen materials and equipment affect teaching as well as the financial budgeting processes, which cause enormous constraints on the taxpayer's money.

The question that must be asked is what are the concrete steps the department are taking? What is the department doing in increasing security around schools such as the programmes of Bambanani, if you will still recall, and how are communities also empowered and drawn in and consulted and encouraged to be involved in the safer school campaigns?

There are confusion and mixed signals coming from both the department in announcing such schools and on the other hand developments of policies not to announce such schools, which is definitely confusing the communities out there.

Are the community police forum involved in assisting the department and ensuring that those schools are safe and that the material and equipments at schools are safe? We understand that the department is not able to do this alone but with the assistance of communities but are these communities really involved? We call on the department to work closely with other relevant departments and develop a workable practical intervention and a plan to ensure that this scourge does not occur.

This plan should be based on proactive measures instead of reactive intervention. The Safer School Project Campaign must be expanded to all schools in hotspots communities and even before vandalism is taking place. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you Madam Speaker. School vandalism is a problem but we have to look at some of the causes of these things that are taking place, and who are these kids or who are these learners and what are they stealing from our communities. We note that for example I would not be going to Khayelitsha to go and steal a kettle from a school there, so the people stealing at the schools are likely to be from those communities. It is likely so in Mitchells Plain, the same in any other areas in South Africa. Someone is not going to drive far to steal a small item. So 90% of the items being stolen from the communities are by people within the communities so our community leaders, our pastors, our church leaders must take ownership

and identify who are those learners, who are the kids and report them and make them love their school so they can take ownership of the schools, and once they do that we will have less vandalism at school, so it all comes down to our community leaders, to our political leaders in our communities and as the DA we strongly encourage those values. We strongly encourage kids to take ownership of their schools, the principals with the kids. I remember when I played rugby in my school we had to clean the school after hours ... [Interjection.] ...so I think it is important that ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: You probably did not make the team, hon member Mr Paulsen, so it is important that people who are in the communities, who are in the schools, the matric learners get involved in the schools, whether over weekends or after school so they can take ownership of the school. The more they are going to love the school the less they are going to steal from the school because there is peer pressure, there is pressure from tik and all these social ills out there, so I think just like the DA we thank the Minister for the hard work they are doing, but even if you allocate a billion to it, it is not going to solve the problem. The problem is going to be solved if the communities get actively involved and work with the learners from those areas to try to find solutions to the problems. I thank you. [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi, mooi! [Applous.] You are learning from the ANC. Mooi, mooi, mooi!

The SPEAKER: I recognise hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Agb Speaker, ons het gehoor het van die strukturele en ekonomiese sowel as finansiële en ook opvoedkundige impak wat vandalisme op skole het. 'n Week gelede het ek verneem dat in Calitzdorp die voedingskema van 'n bepaalde skool totaal gestroop was met potte en al. Dit het jong kindertjies, weerlose en weerbare kinders, kwesbare kindertjies van sewe, agt jaar oud gelaat met leë magies vir die hele dag.

Dit bring my by die punt dat bo en behalwe die tasbare kwessies daar ook kwalitatiewe kwessies is soos hierdie. Watter effek het dit op die psige van die kind, op die self [Onduidelik.] die selfkonsep, waar onderwys die grootste investering in ons land moet wees, word hierdie kinders dit ontnem. Dit gaan oor ontneming, dit gaan oor vervreemding en dit gaan ook oor 'n kriminele daad in terme van die marginalisering van die kinders uit die hoofstroom-onderwys.

Dit is 'n tweede kans opsie wat ook nie gebied word aan hulle nie en dit is krimineel op sigself. Loopbane wat verwoes word, hoopgewende toekomste wat verlore gaan en ook 'n inkomste-generering en die moontlikheid van 'n nuwe môre.

Ek wil net ten slotte sê ook dan dat die Onderwysdepartement Wes-Kaap kennis neem van hierdie situasie. Daar is proaktiewe maatreëls in plek. Daar is kontingensieplanne in plek. Daar word voorsorg getref. Ons is nie besig

met skadebeheertegnieke en -tegnologieë nie. Daar word vooraf beplan en strategieë uitgewerk om hierdie misdadigheid, brutaliteit en kriminaliteit hok te slaan. Baie dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr M N PAULSEN: Mooi Afrikaans. Jou Afrikaans is baie kleurvol.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, your interruptions are now becoming painful... [Laughter.] ...and in terms of Rule 41 which is maintaining order in the House I need to ask you to compose yourself and take a more serious approach to what is happening here. If you do not mind, I do not want to caution you, please ... [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Madam Speaker, I complimented him. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No, hon member Mr Paulsen, you can compliment him outside of this space. Thank you. I now recognise Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker. I think we all agree that the problem of school vandalism is a far broader problem that not only resides in the Education Department. It has to be a whole of society approach to deal with it, which is what we are trying to do in the Western Cape Government as far as our mandate extends. I think the hon member Mr Olivier knows by now that we have a huge amount of programmes in the department to deal with safety at schools. We have an entire Safe Schools Directorate which is unfortunate but is necessary and we will do so as long as

we have to.

I agree with hon member Mr Mackenzie that if we allocate a billion rand to it, it will not solve the problem on its own. Unfortunately we cannot allocate a billion to it because of the ANC's mismanagement of the finances in this country our budgets are all being slashed next year [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...but never mind that, we will still continue to look after our children as best we can. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Another DA template. You must just throw the ANC, just throw.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No, you must wake up. You guys must wake up to the reality. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As far as the communities are concerned they really do need to take ownership. Where are the parents of these children who are vandalising schools all the time? Where are their responsibilities to look after their children and give the correct guidance to them? But ultimately a school is a community asset. Everybody should help

protect the schools as it is fundamental to the future of our children. The more money we spend repeatedly fixing vandalised property the more we reduce much needed opportunities to improve teaching and learning in our schools. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: That concludes Interpellation 2. We now move to Interpellation 3. I recognise the hon Minister Grant.

EPWP employment policy on special projects

3. Mr M Mnqasela asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

What is the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) employment policy on special projects in his Department?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Madam Speaker, and to the hon member Mr Mnqasela for the interpellation.

The Department of Transport and Public Works is the coordinating department for the Expanded Public Works Programme. There are four participating sectors as follows: the infrastructure sector; the social sector; the environmental sector; and the non-state sector.

Other departments of the Western Cape Government which are involved where appropriate are for example Social Development and Environment

Affairs and Development Planning.

At municipal level the programme is delivered and managed through district municipal forums supported by the Department of Transport and Public Works. Over the five year period from 2009 to 2014 the work opportunity target in the Western Cape was 295 958 and the number of work opportunities created was 401 939.

With regard to programmes such as the National Youth Service Apprenticeships and the Building Facilities Maintenance Scheme the process of recruitment is as follows:

Advertisements are placed in all local newspapers; advertisements and application forms are placed at public buildings in the communities which include e-centres, Thusong centres, local libraries and municipal offices through their youth offices. Postal addresses are supplied and applicants can also drop off applications via our walk-in centres situated at 99 Wale Street; and applicants are short-listed based on criteria set out by SETA and also in accordance with our national and provincial guidelines on equity.

Furthermore, we have the EMPIA which is our Empowerment Impact Assessment Unit which focuses on assessment within local communities inclusive of local labour availability; subcontractor empowerment for suppliers and manufacturers.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Ndicela nifake ezi zinto zenu. Somlomo mandibulele kakhulu ngeli thuba, nakuMphathiswa. Enyanisweni abantu abaninzi babanethemba xa kukho amathuba anje ukuba baza kuqesheka. Xa urhulumenthe eza kwakha isikolo, eza kwenza indlela, nokuba uza kucholachola inkunkuma abantu bayazi ukuba baza kuqeqsheka. Uyabona ke Mphathiswa, ingxaki esiba nayo , ndiyabulela xa uyacacisile into yokuba isixa sabantu, ngoba eli nani ulikhankanyileyo lingaphaya kwamakhulu amane amawaka, ngabantu abaninzi kakhulu bakwaziyo ukuqesheka kule nkqubo. Siyayazi ke le nkqubo ukuba asiyonkqubo iqesha abantu isigxina , yinkqubo eqesha abantu ithutyana. Ingxaki esiba nayo ke kukuphindaphinda kwabantu abanye, ubone ukuba bona baqatywe into ethile okanye bahlamba kumlambo othile wabo. Eleleke ukuba kuqeshwa unelaka umamthile, eleke ukuba kuqeshwa unelaka umamthile. Abafumani thuba abanye abantu njengokuba kufanele ukuba iyenzeka ngokomgaqo-nkqubo, ifanele ngokomthetho ukuba iyajikeleza, amathuba omsebenzi. Ngoku ibangele ukuba kubekho iingxaki kwezi ndawo kufanele ukuba siqesha khona abantu, kuba kusetyenzwa khona ngokwezi nkqubo. Ndifuna ukuthi ke, ndifuna ukuqonda phaya kuMphathiswa ukuba xa usiya kwezi ndawo zisemaphandleni ngoba uzibalile uMphathiswa ezi ndawo wathi baya kumathala eencwadi babeke khona izibhengezo zokuba nanga amathuba emisebenzi, baye nakwiinantsika, aMaziko eThusong babeke khona ukuba nanga amathuba emisebenzi. Umbuzo wam ke ngoku kukuba xa usiya emaphandleni, kweziya ndawo kuthiwa ngesiBhulu ziiPlatte Land wenza

njani, kuba akekho la Maziko eThusong phaya? Kubakho la maziko angoomahambangendlwana. Ndingakwenzela umzekelo mna ngoku, phaya eGansbaai naseFrankfort iindawo eziphantsi kwam akukho ziofisi zikhoyo zisisigxina. Apho ukwaziyo ukuthi nantsi iThusong, ngoba zezi zihambayo. Uyayazi Mhleka Olivier le nto ndiyithethayo, ngamaziko ahambayo. Amane efika aphinde ahambe. Nakwezinye iindawo, eSwartland.

Ndiyakhumbula ukuba yeyona ndawo ikude. Ukugqibela kwethu phaya kwakusiliwa ngemisebenzi kamasipala ngoba oomasipala abayiphathi ngendlela eyenza ukuba abantu babone ukuba amathuba ngawethu sonke. Kwaye abanamsebenzi abantu bemisebenzi ukuba unxibe isikipa esiluhlaza, esimdaka okanye esinjani, ngoba ke ezibomvu andazi nokuba sezikhona na. ngoba abantu bonke bafuna umsebenzi. Ngoko ndiyacela Mphathiswa ndifuna ukuthi siyafuna ukubambisana, masisebenze sonke kodwa masiqinisekise ukuba abona bantu baziimpula zikalujaca, abona bantu babethwa kakhulu, bathwaxwa kakhulu yindlala siyabanceda.

*Please put on your devices. Madam Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity, and to the MEC. Indeed many people become hopeful when there are opportunities like these that they will be employed. When the government is going to build a school, to build a road even when they are going to collect refuse people know that they will be employed. You see MEC, the problem we have, and I am glad that you explained that many people, because the figure you mentioned is more than four hundred thousand, many people get employed in this programme. We are aware that this programme does not

employ people permanently, they are employed on a temporary basis. The problem we have is people who repeatedly get employed, as if they smear themselves with something or they their own river where they wash. Every time people are employed maMthembu is lucky, every time people are employed maMthembu is lucky. Other people do not get the opportunity as should be according to the policy, because that is how it should happen by law, the process should rotate job opportunities. That causes problems where we are supposed to employ these people, which is where this programme works. I want to say this, I want to understand from the MEC that when one goes to the rural areas as the MEC counted the areas and said they go to libraries and post advertisements of job opportunities. They also go to Thusong Centres and post job opportunities. My question is when you go to the rural areas, the one referred to as the Platteland in Afrikaans, how do you work, because there are no Thusong Centres there? There are only mobile centres. I can give you an example now, in Gansbaai and Frankfurt, my constituencies there are no permanent offices, where one can say this a Thusong centre, because they are mobile. The hon member Mr Olivier knows what I am talking about, they are mobile centres. They come and go. Even in other places like Swartland.

I remember it is the furthest place. The last time we were there people were fighting for municipal jobs, because the municipalities do not handle the process properly so that people can see that these opportunities are for us all. And people who want work do not care whether you are wearing a blue T-shirt or a brown one or whatever, because I am not sure if the red ones are

there, because all people want jobs. Therefore I appeal to the MEC, I want to say we want to work together. Let us work together but make sure that we assist the poorest of the poor, those who are most exposed to hunger.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you Madam Speaker. The Premier of the Western Cape said in her election campaign that the DA would create six million job opportunities should the DA come to power. Interestingly enough on October the 10th, 2014 the number one launched a massive plan to create six million EPWP work opportunities by 2019. Indeed the Democratic Alliance welcomes it that the ANC takes note of job creation strategies. The DA does not care that you plough with its oxen. The DA wants permanent sustainable work opportunities for all the people of South Africa in order for South Africa to work. The DA recognises the EPWP project to use existing government and public entity budget to be reduced and alleviate unemployment.

Workers are able to earn an income, to be deployed through the labour market and entrepreneurial activity; through the development of infrastructure programmes much needed skills are transferred, work experience gained and real permanent job opportunities are created. The development of skills contributes to the general well-being of individuals and our families and the restoration of our community would continue and the roll-on effect on our country as a whole will have positive outcomes.

We welcome the removal of alien vegetation that has a negative impact on our rivers and scarce water supplies and we work towards the rehabilitation of our wetlands control and waste management. A better managed environment will extend more tourism opportunities, projects and communities. We welcome it that unemployed unskilled individuals, young people, disabled persons women and men would be given opportunities.

The honourable MEC Mr Grant, my request is that in considering this EPWP project for the people we need therefore to also consider the extension of the time because it is not sufficient that people can be given a six month period to work, because within that period it is crucial for anyone to make an impact in his life but because of this EPWP project families are benefiting because families manage to feed, to clothe and school ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Hinana ... [Interjection.]

Mr N E HINANA: ...so the extension for a period of a year will be much appreciated. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Enkosi Somlomo. I just want to say, Madam Speaker, this is one of the very important programmes because just by its nature its design is to ensure that we intervene where it hurts the most. We have issues like people being employed in these projects for a week or two without focusing on whether those individuals are targeted, especially those who can

learn by ensuring that you upskill them; look at what it is you can do to identify the kind of pertinent skills that you need to address to ensure that the next opportunity that comes it does not have to be sweeping again. If they sweep this time, next time they can press the computer. So we need to ensure that when companies come out working in these communities, whoever the service provider is that has been employed by the department or a municipality for that matter, it must take into account those things.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. As we all know the African National Congress is driving the Expanded Public Works Programme given the slow growth in our economy and the need to absorb youth labour the National Development Plan; this has been picked up in the ANC's Manifesto which talks about six million opportunities and we welcome this programme. It is just a pity that the MEC did not refer to Government Gazette of 18 February 2011 which actually refers to who should benefit from the Expanded Public Works Programme.

- (1) Firstly those beneficiaries should be locally based;
- (2) Secondly in order to spread the benefits as broadly as possible a maximum of one person per household should be employed, taking local available labour into account;
- (3) Thirdly that workers from other areas may be employed if they have the

skills and those could not be found locally and targets are 55% women, 40% youth and 2% people with abilities.

So that is in the National Government Gazette which is guiding this process but yet we have the bizarre situation where a DA Municipality in the Hessequa has come up with something which has no reference anywhere. It is called the “shake-shake policy” in the words of the community, literally this is a potluck where names are put in a bag and names are simply drawn out, and what is strange is the fact that DA organisers appear to be the beneficiaries of this potluck. I want to ask the MEC today is he prepared to launch a committee of inquiry into the Hessequa Municipality for not following national guidelines, not following his own guidelines from the department ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: The national guidelines [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...that he leads using a shake-shake, putting names in a bag; pulling out those names; not making sure that people from every household are benefiting ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...not meeting the women's ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Orders members. Sorry.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And it is not surprising that the tide is turning against the DA and Hessequa because of practices like this. That is why the ANC got a majority in 2014 and we will get a greater majority in 2016. [Interjections.] I ask the MEC is he prepared to investigate Hessequa Municipality's so-called "shake-shake scheme" which is in defiance of all the national and provincial guidelines?

Mr D JOSEPH: We are scolding the ANC there. We are scolding the ANC.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela. [Interjections.] Order please members. Allow the member to speak.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you Madam Speaker. I understand why hon member [Inaudible.], I mean hon member Mr Dugmore... [Laughter.] Ja, I always refer to my colleague. [Interjections.]

Thank you. There is not much difference... [Interjections.] ...but let me say thank you hon member. Let me just say that I remember when back then in the days I was the councillor and the Premier was my constituency head. I used to make the same noise that is made now by the ANC and asked the Premier, who was my constituency head, to come and tell the ANC to intervene. They never intervened, because the ANC is used to employing friends. It is used to employing cadres, as you call them. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The DA.

Mr M MNQASELA: The ANC - no, I allowed you to finish. The ANC is used to employing brothers and sisters and securing those jobs and now when we come with a policy that works for everyone ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You shake-shake!

Mr M MNQASELA: The ANC is crying ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...because you are not used to the fair system. Now they can no longer employ their friends only, because we have opened the purse. [Interjections.] We are employing everybody.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M MNQASELA: Now they cry because you are in the opposition and when we employ everybody because we govern fairly and openly for everybody now it hurts you. Why should it hurt when Ma Dlamini is employed and Mam Sodwe is employed and Ma Stato is employed?

An HON MEMBER: Six from one house?

Mr M MNQASELA: Unlike your policy that wants Mam Thembo, Mam Thembo, Mam Thembo. ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: So you have to fault the national policy?

Mr M MNQASELA: That is the problem. The Minister [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr M MNQASELA: The Minister is saying ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Shake-shake!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...this is the programme and now you stand up, you talk about “shake-shake”. The Minister did not talk about shake-shake. Let me just say this... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mngqasela, your time, please finish your sentence.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you Madam Speaker, before I make this proposal. My proposal to the Minister is that we have ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Shake-shake!

Mr M MNQASELA: We externalise this project where we have a service provider independent from the ANC or whoever. Then we can monitor that.

An HON MEMBER: Shake-shake.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Grant.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] the shake-shakes are yours. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: The shake-shakes are yours. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Allow the Minister to speak.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I would like to thank all members for taking part in this rather lively interpellation.

The EPWP is bound to work within the framework of the departmental guidelines set out within the policy on community participation and recruitment and selection of local labour in construction contracts for the Department of Transport and Public Works which is implemented for mostly works education, works health and roads infrastructure projects; when it comes to recruitment selection and employment opportunities within the

special projects of the department.

However, because our interventions within the Department of Transport and Public Works differ from short-term employment opportunities to training interventions the advertising of such opportunities may differ from programme to programme. Within this policy it is clearly indicated that a transparent, free and fair process should be adhered to at all times. But I will look at the shake-shake programme in Hessequa ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Shake-shake!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I have made a note, and also... [Interjections]

Mr M N PAULSEN: The shake policy.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...I just want to tell the hon member Mr Mnqasela that I hear your plea for the rural areas, and I am extremely sensitive to that; to support economic development in the Western Cape we need to invest where there is growth potential and therefore it is very difficult to balance these programme where there is demand for stronger economic growth elsewhere.

Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Grant. That brings us to the end of

Interpellations. We will now deal with questions as printed on the Question Paper. The first question for oral reply, the hon Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

New question to the Premier:

Services provided by the Department of the Premier

1. Ms L J Botha asked the Premier:

Other than online services, how are the people of the province made aware of the services provided by her Department?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The Department of the Premier primarily provides services internally to other departments in the Western Cape Government. These transversal services include support to the Executive; strategic programmes and corporate services. One of the services provided by the Department's Centre for Innovation is to make information on government services available through various channels. There is the call centre, the email centre, the walk-in centre, the SMS helpline, the please-call-me, social media, fax, and ordinarily what is now known as "snail mail".

Two exercises are underway to grow the awareness of the existing eight contact channels. These are a re-branding and marketing exercise for the

Western Cape Government Contact Centre, which will specifically highlight the different avenues of the assistance available and the services at the citizen's disposal through these channels; and then secondly a focus on social media to include our social media icons and/or user names and website URL across all Western Cape Government communications, including above and below the line media. The Cape Access Centres are amongst the e-government services provided by the Centre for e-Innovation directly to citizens. Information on government services is also available at these venues.

The locations of the centres are as follows: Beaufort West, Bitterfontein, Bongolethu, Bredasdorp, Ceres, Citrusdal, Conville, Doornbaai, Dysselsdorp, Elim, Genadendal, Gugulethu, Hawston, Ilingeletu, Klawer, KwaNokutula Kwanonqaba, Ladysmith (or Ladismith), Laingsburg, Langebaan, Louwville, Mbekweni, Mossel Bay, Murraysburg, Nduli, Paarl East, Plettenberg Bay, Prince Albert, Riversdale, Robertson, Saturnus, Struisbaai, Swellendam, Thembaletu, Thembaletu Library as well, Vanrhynsdorp, Waboomskraal, Zolani, Zwelethemba.

These centres are planned for the year ahead. They are in Grabouw, Van Rhynsdorp, Oudtshoorn Training Centre, Kayamandi, Cloetesville, Kranshoek, Piketberg, Vredendal.

The Department of the Premier complies with regulatory requirements regarding the adoption of a Public Service Charter and service delivery

improvement plans for key services; specifically the monitoring of frontline service delivery by the Western Cape Government and the provision of e-government information, communication and technology services.

Frontline service delivery monitoring is conducted at service delivery sites throughout the province together with the Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation in the Presidency. The department briefed the Selection Committee of the Premier on this work on 28 August 2013. I have highlighted aspects of the e-government work already.

A report on the implementation of the service delivery improvements plans is contained in the Annual Report between pages 29 and 38. Other platforms include paid for advertising campaigns for radio, print and outdoor media. These services are secured through a transversal tender coordinated by the Department of the Premier. This advertising provides information on Western Cape Government services. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you Madam Speaker. I just want to know, I am just following up; what is the turnaround time for addressing complaints lodged by communities through the Call Centre? Please.

The PREMIER: I cannot give the exact turnaround time or average turnaround time off the cuff and I would not like to give wrong information,

so if the hon member Ms Botha can please just submit a question, I will find that out for her.

The SPEAKER: Any other follow-up question? We now move to Question 1, the hon Minister of Health, Minister Botha.

Questions standing over from Thursday, 20 November 2014, as agreed to by the House:

Chronic medicine stock outs

1. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Health:

What is his Department's plan to deal with and avoid chronic medicine stock outs at health facilities?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. As a result of poor management and the late award of pharmaceutical tenders by the National Department of Health as well as the removal from contracts of coded medicines not listed in the National Essential Medicine List, certain medication is currently in short supply in the Western Cape and other provinces. Many of the new contracted suppliers are also unable to increase their production immediately in order to meet the demands of their contract with National Government. These stock-outs are unfortunately affecting all districts and substructures in the province.

The Western Cape Department of Health is doing its best to manage the shortages. The Medicine Depot is allocating any available stock as soon as it is received, to health facilities. This means that the depot is currently providing limited amounts of stock on a daily basis to ensure greater distribution to all districts and sub-districts. The medical depot is also repackaging certain medicines available in bulk into smaller “patient-ready pack sizes” so that these can be distributed more widely.

To support this distribution strategy the facilities have been requested not to place large orders but rather to replenish stock more frequently. In addition the Western Cape Department of Health is also sourcing medicines off contract and is engaging with contracted suppliers to expedite delivery by air shipment or to procure stock from alternative suppliers at an additional cost.

The provincial department is also proactively interacting with the pharmaceutical industry on an ongoing basis to source all available medicines required by facilities. Furthermore the department has released guidelines advising on alternative medication that may be used safely in certain cases when stock is unavailable. We are encouraging patients to ensure that they utilise all existing medication in their possession which is within the expiry dates before requesting a repeat prescription. This will assist the department in ensuring that all facilities have access to the medication that is available.

I have informed the National Minister as well as the National Department of

Health in writing of the knock-on effect of the late award of tenders and the deletion of items from contracts. My office received correspondence from the National Minister this week acknowledging that the matter is receiving attention.

I have also issued a media statement release to inform patients and conducted several radio interviews on the topic. I have the documentation of the communication between myself and the National Minister and department as well as a statement here available, and in the personal interaction at the NCOP last week I also handed that same letter over to the Minister by hand, which he then read and he came to me after the debate, acknowledged and said that he will immediately attend to the issue.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you Madam Speaker. Minister Botha, seeing that most of these people that do go to the health facilities are elderly people, are poor people that must go there and be told that they must come back the next day, is there no other way the department could have informed the people even before coming to the facility and sit there the whole day till three o'clock and then be told come back the next day?

The SPEAKER: Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The situation is a very, very unfortunate one.

It does not only affect the poor people or old people. It affects many or the whole range of patients. The medicine that we are talking about are more than a hundred items and they are now trying their very best to catch up with the late tender administration to get the medicine as soon as possible. It is a very unfortunate situation. We try and deal with it as effective as possible as I have explained in this document and there is actually nothing more I can add to it than what I have explained here.

The SPEAKER: Follow-up question? Okay, we will then go to Question 2 again to the Minister of Health, hon Minister Botha.

Patient transport waiting times

2. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Health:

What are the waiting times to transport patients from day hospitals and clinics to level 1 tertiary health care facilities?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you Madam Speaker. This is on the transport from patients to day hospital, from hospitals to tertiary healthcare facilities. Currently the average time for patients to be delivered to tertiary facilities from clinics and CDCs has improved from the previous year. For this quarter Priority-1 cases, which are the most urgent, average time is approximately one hour and 15 minutes from clinics and CDCs and for Priority-2 cases, which are non-urgent, approximately two hours and 30

minutes.

It should be noted that this timeframe is from the moment that the incident is booked at the control room to the time the patient is delivered to the tertiary facility.

It should also be noted that in many cases patients are not transferred directly from primary healthcare facilities to tertiary facilities but instead are transferred to district or regional level hospitals. These timeframes are then likely to be similar or shorter.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Minister Botha, is there a plan to make the time even shorter than the two hours that because it is the two hours that people are not satisfied with?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Let me repeat that the priority cases are one hour and 15 minutes since it has been booked at the control room and the non-urgent cases are two hours and 30 minutes, so the two hours and 30 minutes for non-urgent cases would not receive as much attention from us as the urgent cases. The urgent cases are those that we are always striving to have a shorter period. It all depends on distances and availability of vehicles and the booking system that we are following. We have and we are currently investing a few hundred million in a new booking and tracking system, which

is partially implemented or installed but which will be fully implemented over the next two years and when that is done we are sure that we would reach the maximum or the shortest possible time that we would be able to transport patients.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: My follow-up to the Minister is what about those areas that ambulances cannot go into because of crime? Is there any plan put in place for those areas?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is a totally new question although it is a very important question and therefore I am going to speak to it. There are very, very few places which we do not enter due to crime and if there are any place identified as such it is for a very short period. We have a very close relationship with the police services. We have thought of many, many ways on how we can improve the situation. The ambulance staff and EMS staff are very reluctant to have any security with them because they are concerned that that would attract more attention and that might actually be to the detriment eventually rather than to their assistance. We are also working very closely with neighbourhood watches in these areas and it is a very unfortunate event or situation that people who are trained and employed to save the lives of other people are themselves victims of crime and their own lives are in danger, and so as politicians we should all in our constituencies and in our wards and where we are deployed spread the message that this is

unacceptable and that our people should rather be protected so that they can save other people's lives.

The SPEAKER: We now move to New Questions. I recognise the hon Minister Schäfer.

Learners, placement at schools

2. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:

Whether her Department has any plans to deal with learners who have applied but have not yet found placement at schools; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you Madam Speaker. The Western Cape Education Department has accommodated about 99% of the learner population in the province and is currently placing the remaining 1%. This is not unusual for this time of the year. The department operates a very large system accommodating more than one million learners across the province. It should also be noted that current figures submitted by schools indicate that the WCED has sufficient places available to accommodate all learners. The challenge is that these places are not necessarily in the area where parents are looking for admission.

The WCED has applied the following measures to help parents place learners:

using data from our new Schools Admission Management Information System to identify available places in schools; District officials contact schools to resolve cases where learners are on waiting lists; District officials engage schools to free up additional spaces where possible, establishing additional classes at schools where possible, deploying mobile units to critical areas as needed; calling community meetings in areas such as Kuils River and Brackenfell to assess the needs.

The WCED has appealed to parents to enrol their children earlier to avoid issues with placement and additional posts have been reserved for growth posts when schools open in the new year. Every year a proportion of parents requiring assistance either replies late or insists on places at schools of choice, while refusing alternatives available. Issues of language medium and subject choice in the higher grades are also factors in some cases. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, I just want to bring under the Minister's attention that in the *Argus* on the 25th it says: "There is no place at school for 10 500 learners next year..." talking about the Grade 1s and the Grade 8s. Is the Minister assured that these peoples will be placed? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes thank you to the hon member Mr Christians. The information in the *Argus* came from our Department so I am

very well aware of it. The good part about that is that we now have a tracking system where we actually know what the exact numbers are and we are confident that we will place all learners before the beginning of the term.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I would like to ask a follow up question: given that at the beginning of this current year 2014 there were, by information provided by your own department, at least 1 200 learners from Mitchells Plain who were not placed within two months after the commencement of the school year, can you give this House a guarantee specifically in regard to Mitchells Plain that all learners will have a place come the first day of the academic year in 2015, and I can show you the names of those that were not accommodated?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: There apparently appears to be a dispute about the numbers. I am not quite sure if your numbers are correct but I cannot guarantee anything. You know full well that people come into the province. We do not always know how many are going to come in. New learners come into the province. We do make projections as to how many we anticipate and in the areas we anticipate but we do not always know until the last minute so we cannot guarantee that they will have a place on day one. The ones who are registered on our system now who have applied in advance as required and requested, we are confident that they will be placed.

As far as the Mitchells Plain matter was concerned it was a very unexpected incident. There were people who were moving from Khayelitsha to Mitchells Plain, from a different area to another and it was completely out of the ordinary. They wanted to go to particular schools in that area, but I mean we manage the situation as it happens. I cannot guarantee anything unfortunately.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, the response was completely wrong in the context of Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha, the bulk of the children were in fact from Mitchells Plain. Did we hear correctly that the MEC says that she cannot guarantee that these children who currently - this 10 500 - will not be placed come January, whether it is in the first or the second day, because there is at least a month before that particular period. Did we hear the MEC saying that she cannot guarantee it, and not to use the 'inkommer' story as an excuse?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker. Perhaps the hon member Mr Fransman should listen to the answers instead of him assuming what he heard. I said we will find place for the 10 500. We cannot guarantee that every learner who is in the province at the beginning of next term will necessary have a place on day one.

The SPEAKER: We then move to Question 2. I recognise Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, Question 3.

The SPEAKER: It is actually Question 3.

Provincial buildings, poor state of

3. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

Whether he or his Department have any plans to address the poor state of provincial buildings; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, thank you to the hon member Mr Christians for the question. The answer is yes, the department does plan on an on-going basis to address the state of provincial buildings. These plans are constrained by the funding envelope available over the Medium Term Expenditure Framework. A facility condition assessment is conducted on an annual basis. This enables the department to compile a scheduled maintenance list.

The assessments consider the condition of each building in terms of:

- (a) Mechanical aspects for example the lifts, air-conditioning, water supply;
- (b) Electrical aspects for example light fittings, back-up generators where applicable, for electrical supply;
- (c) Building aspects for example structural elements and building fabric.

Each building facility is rated on an eight point scale with one indicating poor condition for example, i.e. it has serious defects such as roof leaks, electrical non-compliance; and eight indicating at the other end of the spectrum, good condition.

The maintenance list is prioritised on an annual basis with work considered to be critical rating one to four, followed by work where the rating is five to eight. It must be noted that as a result of the constrained budget envelope not all critical work is necessarily undertaken and completed in the specific financial year.

The SPEAKER: No follow-up? We then move to Question 4. I recognise the hon Minister of Health.

4. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Health:

What is his department doing to improve ambulance and patient transport services?

The improvement in ambulance and patient transport over the last three years

is the result of pro-active measures. Emergency Medical Services performance is predominantly measured by assessing the proportion of urban Priority-1 emergency patients who are attended to within 15 minutes of their call for help. Despite rapidly escalating workload and limited resources, EMS has embarked on various initiatives that have improved efficiency. Four years ago, the EMS achieved 15 minutes response time of 34% of the workload of approximately 325 000 incidents.

This is a sharp contrast to the performance reported for the last performance cycle in which we received 71.3% with the workload of 616 000. This is in the face of service provided throughout a large province with geographically diverse requirements, terrain and distances to patients and health facilities, which means in effect that the quality has actually doubled.

Since 2011 emergency patient volumes have increased dramatically. From 2011/12 to 2013/14 there has been a patient load increase of 19% from 520 000 to 616 000.

Since 2011/12 we have increased the number of scheduled ambulances - those that are available to do the work - from 142 to 166 in 2013/2014. That is a 17% increase.

Inter-facility transfers have increased year-on-year from 130 000 in 2011/12 to almost 170 000 to date, which is a 30% increase. This has placed a significant burden on the service. It takes longer to receive transport and

hand over these patients. This is reflective of the general increase in patient load within the department and can be seen in the 18% increase in emergency centre patient load over the same period, which is 624 000 to 739 000.

HealthNet or the planned non-emergency patient transport has grown to a size where it requires individualised strategies and management. As I have referred to in my previous question within the Metropole five years ago, 978 000 patient trips occurred, but with the 15% increased patient load we are now dealing with 1 125 000 patients to be transported or that were transported during the last financial year.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gopie? We then move on to the next question, which is Question 5. I recognise the Minister Grant.

Western Cape Provincial Parliament, shortage of accommodation

***5. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether the accommodation shortage for the Western Cape Provincial Parliament has been brought to his attention; if so, how will he address this issue?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Madam Speaker, and to the hon member Mr Uys for the question.

In response, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament did not submit a User Asset Management Plan, what we call a UAMP, for the 2015/16 period. A project list was however submitted.

Additional office work stations were provided during 2014 as part of the modernisation of existing office space of Parliament's officials in order to accommodate additional staff, as well as to achieve greater efficiencies and for better utilisation of space.

The budget for 2015/16 and beyond has not been finalised and projects listed by the Western Cape Provincial Parliament are under consideration for being prioritised with all the other needs received from the various departments or entities.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you Madam Speaker. Can I just ask, is it compulsory or do you prefer or do you send a letter out to all the departments that will get a service from you to have a User Asset Management Plan and is that the preferred way to go?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It has resulted in better service levels from us to the user departments, especially big departments like education, health, general buildings. It is just the recommendation that is a more efficient way to communicate and to work

together. It also helps us to plan better.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Minister Grant, maybe you can respond, why did the Provincial Legislature then not submit this User Asset Management Plan? I am sure you called on them to submit this.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: As you know we did receive a project list, which has been dealt with and in fact I think I saw it in your office at half past one this afternoon. So we are well aware of the needs of this Provincial Legislature [Interjections.] ...and we will obviously respond to ongoing demand.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis alreeds... after one o'clock this afternoon.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you. It is good that you caucus before the time. Can I just ask, Madam Speaker, what are the most pressing needs that you saw in this list, I am sure in your office and in the Speaker's office?

The SPEAKER: Sorry, may I ask was that question addressed to the Minister or, because you said: "May I ask the Speaker."?

Mr P UYS: I am addressing the Minister, the MEC.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Let me respond to the original question and that is the accommodation shortage for the Western Cape Provincial Parliament; let me say broadly we are aware that there are some 42 members of this House, which figure is based on original population estimates of the province around when it was 4.2 million. We are now trending ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Six million.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...trending towards six million so depending on consultation, because if things had to change - if I am not mistaken, the two thirds majority in this House - then obviously we would need to increase the size of the House and then we would have to look very seriously at the accommodation capacity of this particular building for Parliament.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you Madam Speaker. The MEC...

The SPEAKER: The last one.

Mr P UYS: ...and I am not referring to the Constitution and amendment to that. I am referring to the needs that are on the list that you have now in your office. What are the most pressing needs that you see on that list, and I am sure it is a very long list?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: With respect, I do not look at every list. I am aware of issues such as water, I am aware of issues such as the lift from the first floor to the seventh floor, which by the way, just for the honourable member's attention, will be installed. It had to be imported from overseas and go through a long supply-chain process and that lift we are hoping to install and commission by about March 2015. So there are various needs and we will deal with them on a priority basis through the Liaison Committee. I would also like to take the opportunity to say to the hon member Mr Uys, yes, we do have a service level agreement between the Provincial Parliament and my department, which was signed on the 5th of September 2014 by the Secretary of Parliament. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: We now move to Question 6. I recognise the hon Minister of Finance. Minister Meyer.

Financial Management of Parliament Act, 2009

***6. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Finance:**

To what extent will the Financial Management of Parliament Act, 2009 (Act 10 of 2009), as amended, influence and determine the activities of his Department and what support will the Western Cape Provincial Parliament receive?

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie, agb Speaker, en dankie aan agb lid mnr Uys. Oor die korttermyn word daar nie verwag dat die Wet op die Finansiële Bestuur van die Parlement, soos gewysig, 'n groot impak sal maak op die aktiwiteite van die Provinsiale Tesourie nie.

Tweedens, ons voorsien nie dat die ondersteuning soos tans aan die Wes-Kaapse Provinsiale Parlement gebied wesenlik oor die korttermyn sal verander nie.

Die Wet vereis egter dat die finansiële state van die Wes-Kaapse Provinsiale Parlement in ooreenstemming met die Standaarde van Algemeen Erkende Rekeningkundige Praktyke, die sogenaamde GRAP, opgestel moet word en daarom kan dit moontlik van die Provinsiale Tesourie verwag word om sy ondersteuning dienooreenkomstig te wysig. Daarom sal die Provinsiale Tesourie in oorstemming of in oorleg eerder met die Sekretaris van die Parlement se ondersteuning volgens die behoeftes van die Wes-Kaapse Provinsiale Parlement aanpas. Daar is wel personeelimplikasies vir die Provinsiale Parlement in terme van rekenkundige vaardighede om die nuwe oorskakeling na GRAP te fasiliteer en die Provinsiale Tesourie, indien

genader word, sal ook hier graag hulp wil verleen in die verband. Ek dank u.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Uys.

Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Die LUR sê dit is nie nou dringend noodsaaklik nie. Dit is eintlik verkort wat hy sê, maar die implementering van hierdie Wet is 1 April. Hoe voorsien hy dat daar aan al die vereistes voldoen sal word?

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Tans is die eienaar van hierdie wetgewing binne die domein van die Speakersforum en die Speakersforum onder Voorsitterskap van die Nasionale Speaker van die Nasionale Vergadering het ook konsepriglyne geformuleer vir die implementering van hierdie finansiële Wetgewing en sodra hierdie finansiële konsepregulasies - want hulle is die eienaar van hierdie konsepriglyne - deur hulle goedgekeur word sal die Provinsiale Tesourie wel beskikbaar wees om daar te attesteer, maar in die tussentyd kan ons nie wag vir 1 April nie. Daarom is ek ook in deurlopende kontak met die Speaker asook die Adjunkspeaker, die hoof van die Provinsiale Tesourie is ook in kontak met die rekenpligtige beampte van die Provinsiale Parlement. Dit is 'n saak wat intens bespreek word by die Speakersforum en ons geoktrooieerde rekenmeesters in die Departement van Finansies of die Provinsiale Tesourie gee ook van tyd tot tyd advies in hierdie verband soos wat hulle ook doen ten opsigte van alle openbare entiteite in die verband, so daar is ook spesifieke riglyne vir die LUR van Finansies voortspruitend uit hierdie konsepriglyne en daardie goed het reeds

vereis dat daar bepaalde konsultasies moet plaasvind in antisipering van die implementering van hierdie nuwe Wetgewing en daardie konsultasies vereis dat die LUR van Finansies must consult and the consultations must include specifications of Parliament's expected revenue.

It must also include specifications of proposed expenditure requirements per the main division. The MEC must also consult Parliament regarding the purpose of each main division and explanations and other information substantiating the proposal. The MEC for Finance must also consult in terms of the specifications of the allocations and also details in terms of transfers to other entities and also must have discussions in terms of plant, expenditure, and certainly this is what we are already doing in that particular spirit and we will continue to support the Provincial Parliament as they migrate to GRAP.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Uys.

Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Kan ek vir die LUR vra of daar enige departement nou binne hierdie provinsie is wat aan die GRAP vereistes voldoen en dit implementeer?

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, daar is reeds 'n migrasie van die provinsiale departemente wat reeds daarnatoe gemigreer het. Selfs die Western Cape Gambling Board het ook reeds 'n proses om te migreer. Verskillende departemente is ook in verskillende fases van migrasie.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Ons gaan voort. Question Number 7, Minister of Local Government, Minister Bredell.

Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs

5 pillars of the Back to Basics Programme

7. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

How is his Department planning to operationalise the five pillars of the Back to Basics Programme adopted by the Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, with regard to its oversight role to municipalities and (b) what are the timelines?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSACE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie aan die agbare lid vir die vraag. Dis 'n redelike lang antwoord so ons hardloop gou hierdeur.

Tot op datum het die Departement van Plaaslike Regering 'n reeks vergaderings met ons nasionale kollegas en 'n werkswinkel met COGTA gehou, asook interne besprekings, om sodoende die pad vorentoe te ontwikkel en dit te koördineer en in lyn te bring met die huidige ondersteuningsinisiatiewe van die departement ten opsigte van die

Terug-na-Basiese Program.

Om die Terug-na-Basiese Program te bedryf het die Departement van Plaaslike Regering 'n taakspan in die lewe geroep. Die taakspan bestaan uit Nasionale COGTA, die Departement van Plaaslike Regering, Provinsiale Tesourie; Departement van Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsontwikkeling; die Departement van Water en Sanitasie, die Departement van Menslike Hulpbronne; die Departement van Vervoer en Publieke Werke en die Suid-Afrikaanse Plaaslike Regeringsvereniging, SALGA.

Die rol van die taakspan is om werk by geprioriseerde munisipaliteite, met die ondersteuning van die betrokke departemente, te koördineer en in lyn te bring. Die vyf pilare is reeds in die Wes-Kaap van stapel gestuur alhoewel dit in die vooruitsig gestel word dat die aanwysers en die kriteria soos deur COGTA voorsien word, die bestaande aanwysers verder sal versterk en ondersteun. Die kriteria sal ook aangewend word om die funksionaliteit van ons munisipaliteite te bepaal.

- (1) Die eerste pilaar: plasing van mense eerste en onderhandel met die gemeenskappe. In die proses om regeringsdienste na die gemeenskap te neem, ondersteun die departement munisipaliteite met die ontwikkeling van wyksoperasionele planne en wykskomitee byeenkomste. Om die funksionaliteit van ons wykskomitees en Thusong Sentrums te verseker, onderrig die departement wykskomitees en Thusong personeel ten opsigte van gemeenskapsgebaseerde beplanning en openbare

deelnameprosesse. Die departement voorsien inligtingssessies aan gemeenskappe deur die Gemeenskapsontwikkeling Werkersprogramme om mense te ondersteun met die toegang tot regeringsdienste; en ook soos ons hier staan oor hierdie twee dae is ons besig met al die kommunikasiebeamptes en die Speakers in Goudini om hulle te onderrig en om die wykskomiteestelsel met hulle deur te praat, want ons dink dit is baie belangrik om interaksie met ons gemeenskap te bevorder.

- (2) Die tweede pilaar, die lewering van basiese dienste: Infrastruktuur-ontwikkeling is die sleutelfokus van die departement. Dit word van munisipaliteite verwag om op 'n kwartaallikse basis aan die departement verslag te doen ten opsigte van die toegang tot basiese dienste, naamlik water, elektrisiteit, sanitasie en vullisverwydering. Dit word van munisipaliteite vereis om die hoeveelheid huishoudings wat toegang tot hierdie basiese dienste het te rapporteer. Die departement moniteer ook die implementering van die Nasionale Armlastigheidsbeleid of gratis basiese dienste.

Die Direktooraat van Munisipale Infrastruktuur ondersteun die munisipaliteite deurgaans met die MIG proses. Die MIG proses sluit die volgende aktiwiteite in:

- (1) Die betrokkenheid in die Munisipaliteit se beplanningsproses;
- (2) Tweedens die fasilitering van interaksies met Sektor Departemente

veral om blokkasies uit die weg uit te ruim;

- (3) Die herbeoordeling en beoordeling van projekte;
 - (4) Die fasilitering van maandelikse MIG koördineringsvergaderings;
 - (5) Die monitering van vordering van die projekte en die implementering daarvan. Dit is die tweede pilaar.
- (3) Die derde pilaar is goeie regering: die departement rapporteer reeds op die aanwysers van hierdie pilaar betreffende die politieke samestelling van die raad en raadsvergaderings, gemeet teen wetgewing, oortreding van gedragskodes, bedrog en korrupsie en die dissiplinêre gevalle.

Verder, die huidige ondersteuningsinisiatiewe deur die departement hanteer die uitdagings wat deur die munisipaliteite deur die verskeie projekte en gesamentlike projekte, soos die Munisipale Regering Oorsig en Uitkyk, MGRO, in samewerking met die Provinsiale Tesourie, ondervind word.

- (4) Die vierde pilaar, gesonde finansiële bestuur: die departement, in samewerking met die Provinsiale Tesourie, assesser die finansiële stabiliteit van elke munisipaliteit in die provinsie op 'n jaarlike basis deur die Plaaslike Regering Medium Termyn Uitgawes Komitee. Om inter-regering beplanning en begroting te versterk en in lyn te bring,

fasiliteer die departement IDP indabas in alle distrikte en onthou ons kry tans almal betrokke, nasionaal, provinsiale en plaaslike regering sit tans om dieselfde tafel in ons IDP indabas.

Die volgende is ondersteunende inisiatiewe tussen die Departement van Plaaslike Regering en die Provinsiale Tesourie:

- (1) Leiding in die ontwikkeling van toepaslike tariewe wat bekostigbaar is en sal verseker dat volle invordering van kostes en verbeterde munisipale inkomstes bekom word,
- (2) Tweedens, ontwikkel 'n omkeerplan vir finansiële gestremde munisipaliteite soos die Swellendam Munisipaliteit en om te verseker dat die munisipaliteite finansiële stabiel raak;
- (3) Leiding met infrastruktuur beplanning, belegging en instandhouding van munisipale bates,
- (4) Die bevordering van die invordering van water en elektrisiteitverspreiding en om die verlies te beperk tot onder 10%;
- (5) Bystand met die ontwikkeling van bate- en vervangingsbeleide, wat baie belangrik is;
- (6) Bystand met inkomstebestuur en effektiewe uitgawe inisiatiewe wat

indiepte oorsig van die befondsingstrategie vir die opbou van die Kapitaalvervanging Reserwefonds in alle munisipaliteite insluit.

- (7) Gedeelde dienste, die IYMs, die *Dashboard*-verslag vir Sentraal Karoo sowel as opleiding vir die begrotingsverbeterings, die MFMI opleiding om aanpassing te verbeter;
- (8) En dan die hou van maandeliks IYM begrotings en kontantvloei ontledings. Dit is die S71 Verslag en assessering, om die werklike kontantposisie en risiko verwant aan oor- en onderspandering van die begroting te verseker.
- (5) Die vyfde pilaar, om die bou van institusionele bekwaamheid in terme van die menslike hulpbron kapasiteit te monitor; ons staan die departement by met die vul van die posisies van die munisipale bestuurders, senior bestuurders wat rapporteer aan die munisipale bestuurder, prestasiebestuurstelsels en organisatoriese herontwikkeling. Die departement versamel munisipale vorderingsinligting betreffende die vyf sleutel-areas op 'n kwartaallikse basis en stel 'n kwartaallikse verslag op wat spesifiek toepaslike munisipale ondersteuningsinisiatiewe en -intervensies in die toekoms sal bepaal.

Die departement sal Terug-na-Basiese aanwysers deur die kwartaallikse munisipale prestasiemonitering daarstel. Om dit moontlik te maak sal die departement sy bestaande aanwysers vir die Terug-na-Basiese dienste met al

die tekorte wat binne die bestaande aanwysers geïdentifiseer is, by die verslag byvoeg. Ek dank u.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Dyantyi.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker; and thank you, Minister Bredell, for that comprehensive response. Can you tell us out of these 30 municipalities, is there any municipality that is not supporting this programme that you have outlined and if any, what is the reason for that municipality?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is a good question. We support all the municipalities. I had a session ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: With some of the others?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No, we support all municipalities. I do have a one-on-one meeting with the National Minister because remember there are still a number of municipalities that are on the LGTAS, the turnaround strategy and I said to them it is actually the same thing. It is just changing the name. So let us not throw out the baby with the bathwater so we are basically going to change the name of the LGTAS to “Back to Basics”, because every time there is a new minister or there is new political leadership

we do not want to change the whole system for municipalities. They get confused and at a certain stage they will not trust us, so we had that and part of this whole session was also to look at how we can reduce our reporting, because currently the national department asks questions directly to municipalities. It frustrates us because then we go a week later and ask the same questions and that is why we draw up a whole diagram to show the National Minister that everything that we are asking from the municipalities is in the Back to Basics, and we have also determined the gaps with them and we will fill that gap so that there is one reporting system, so we are also busy with that. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, follow-up.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie. MEC Bredell, given the limitations in terms of capacity of their department as you have mentioned a few days ago, are you confident that this department in its monitoring and oversight role is now ready to drive and monitor the Back to Basics Programme with those five pillars that you have outlined?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, I am quite comfortable with the capacity within. I think we have got a very competent team and remember the Back to Basics Programme was actually what we were doing in the Western Cape. It is not something new for us, because if you look at the list, our reporting systems fit in 100% so it is not something new that we are going to

tackle and we have evaluated our municipalities. There are two that they say are in the ICU so I think those municipalities must get special attention to get them out of there, and obviously then there are a couple that has got low capacity and let us work from there upwards. Those who are in a good space I think we can leave so that they can carry on with their work.

I have already met with two of the municipalities within the ICU section. We have convinced them, all the political leaders to have a council meeting focussing on service delivery and to get rid of all the other stuff. It is very fragile but currently it is working. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The third one, hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much. MEC Bredell, have you found out if all of the municipalities have agreed, and would there be any additional funding needed or would they be able to drive the Back to Basics with its five pillars using the existing finances, because that is what the Minister indicated right upfront?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It is a difficult one. It is one that we actually need to debate and look at the whole financial model because you are actually asking me now also on a national programme, and what is the

National Minister going to do. Remember, to be quite honest with you, in the Western Cape the municipalities compared to a lot of the other municipalities are in a good space. I think currently we can do a lot within the current budget. Then we are going to go into the cycle of the IDP round where we get national, provincial, and the local government to plan together. We have half a day with each municipality. Last year - I do not actually want to quote figures, it might be off a bit - something like 46 officials from national, 216 from province and 128 from the municipalities worked together, planned together, and that IDP meetings obviously will lead to the budget and budget implementation plans, and I think what we will then do is obviously focus first on infrastructure, especially. We will then as three spheres of government support planning to get it to the national through a funding application, and that will compare or compete with other funding applications all over the country. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Question Number 8. Minister Fritz. Minister of Social Development.

8. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Social Development:

Whether any children have been removed by his Department from safe homes since 2009 due to human rights violations; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you Mr Deputy

Speaker and thank you for the question. Just a point of clarification on the question, I have discussed this with the member. There are safe homes. There are safety parents and they normally accommodate six children; to a maximum of six children; and no children were removed from any safety parents. In fact those parents are carefully trained and selected and screened to be safety parents and those are parents where at twelve o'clock at night we have an emergency with a child that needs urgent placement; we will then take that child to a safety parent. So I think that is the issue, and then of course we have Child and Youth Care Centres which is slightly different but those are what I think you meant by "safety parents". Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on then to the following question, Question Number 9. Hon Minister Botha.

9. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:

Whether HIV testing is compulsory for women in early stages of pregnancy attending antenatal clinics; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is not compulsory. However, HIV-counselling and testing is strongly advised during pregnancy, as the benefits of early tests and enrolment in HIV-care will greatly benefit the unborn baby, resulting in them being born uninfected. All pregnant women attending the antenatal clinics for the first time or booking

to attend the antenatal clinic are counselled and offered HIV testing. Compulsory testing will be in contravention to the South African Constitution; considered a violation of basic human rights. Pregnant women who are not ready to test during their first visit will be counselled and offered testing at follow-up antenatal visits up until delivery.

Counselling offers women the opportunity to know the importance of prevention of HIV and the elimination of mother to child transmission, keeping themselves and their partners alive. Effective counselling yields excellent results and we have current a mother-to-child transmission of below 2%.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the following question, Question 10, again Minister Botha.

10. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:

Whether any private medical aid clients made use of the services provided by the public health sector in the province?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the tenth time today. Yes, medical aid clients do use public health sector facilities in our province. An analysis of the last three financial years indicates that in 2012/13 7 100 medical aid patients were treated in the Western Cape hospitals. In 2013/14 the number increased to 7 213 and this financial year to

date the number stands on 7 374 but it is now still far from the end of the financial year. The latter shows a marked increase. I also have a little table here to show the sub-districts in this regard which I can hand in, if you so wish. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is no follow-up. Or is there a follow up?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Who is asking the follow-up?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We want a follow-up yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please get up, hon member Ms Gopie, yes, thank you. You may put your question. [Interjections.]

Ms D GOPIE: My follow-up on that, is that not the reason why we have shortage if private goes to the public and also why are we not referring our public people also when we have a shortage to get in at private?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: There is the National Health Act in the country and there is the Constitution. We are not able to refuse anyone our services. There is a means test applicable so we do apply the means test and people will pay according to their means. Some of them might have private medical aid but we have to render the service to them. Then may I also just remark

that we have in all sectors and all and all together more than 20 million patient interactions per year. We have close to 83 000 people at any given moment at our facilities during the working day so 7 000 in total in that relation is really very small.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Then that concludes this question. I understand Question Number 11 will stand over, is that the case, hon member Mr Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker, and Minister Schäfer has indicated to the member now that she has had to leave to go to Gauteng, so that question we will ask to stand over please.

[Question 11 by hon member Mr Hinana to Minister Schäfer to stand over.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That then brings us to the end of question time. We will now move on to Statements by Members and I see the DA first, hon member Ms Maseko.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. What type of world are we living in today? That is the question that I was left with when doing the preparation for today.

Twenty years on and the battle against women and child abuse continues. It is

sad to know that women and child abuse still continues to dominate the local and international news.

Our society is tormented by violence. The victims of this violence are most vulnerable women and children. Yet even though we see this plague within our society, we do not know just how bad the situation really is because it is under-reported or in most cases ignored.

In the Cederberg area recently circumstances led to the brutal killing of a two and a half year old girl at the hands of her own parents. Their household was characterised by domestic violence, alcoholism and substance abuse. The father was abusive towards the mother even before the child was born, although it gradually became worse over time.

The fact that it was ongoing desensitised those who looked on. It was normal for the neighbours to see the mother walking around with a blue eye. It was normal for the father to beat the mother. No-one took the initiative to report the case because they thought it was only police or social workers who could report the serial beatings. They simply did not know better. Needless to say things only continued to deteriorate until one day when the beating took place the father came after the mother with an axe. Thinking that the father of her child will stop at the sight of his daughter, the mother took cover behind the girl and used her as a shield, but it failed to stop him. He hacked the daughter with the axe and she died.

We can imagine that, as a child being picked up and raised into the air by a parent, is exciting. I wonder whether in her little mind she could conceive that the people who are meant to protect her would kill her. Today the father has been released on bail and the mother is still living with him; the household still characterised by alcoholism, substance abuse and violence.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Ms Maseko, your time has almost expired, just finish off the last sentence.

Ms L M MASEKO: The more we ignore these acts of violence the more we ignore the urgency with which they need to act on it. Today I salute you, baby girl. Lala ngoxolo!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. I see the ANC, hon member Ms Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The whole world in these days focuses on the campaign of no violence against women and children, and the DA in this only province it governs, does less than the minimum to raise the awareness. Instead it is silent on another criminal racist attack on a defenceless woman in the only metro area it controls! [Interjections.]

What a travesty not to immediately condemn the assault and abuse of a 52 year old mother of six and Claremont cleaner at the onset of the annual period to focus on this problem. [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

Me S W DAVIDS: Skande!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Is it because the DA protects its base constituency and ignores the fact that five grown white men kicked the black woman while she was on the ground? This followed hot on the heels of another horrendous race incident in the leafy southern suburbs where a vigilante member of the DA favoured neighbourhood watch assaulted a woman. What is her only sin?

An HON MEMBER: How do you know it is a member of the DA?

Me S W DAVIDS: Skande!

'n AGBARE LID: Sies man! [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: A black house worker, she dared to be in the street in the area she works in. Did the DA say anything significant about the incident?

[Interjections.] No!

'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

Ms P Z LEKKER: No! Again it protects its core constituency or is it because the perpetrator is a pal of the Premier's bicycle chums?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: The ANC condemns all these deplorable criminal acts and supports our National Government's call for a year-long campaign against all violence and vulnerable people like our women and children.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] politicise that.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the DA. Hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Yes, thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and I will come from a different angle on the activism against the violence against women; that the DA supports the pledge to reduce the greenhouse gas emission up to 34% by the end of this decade. The DA's green economy encourages sunshine and wind to be harnessed to diversify energy sources. The inhalation of smoke causes major respiratory problems and is the cause of 3 200 deaths per year, mostly the victims are women and children.

We are saying that solid fuel cooking is one of the major causes of the household fires, especially in informal settlements, resulting in loss of property, and most of the time women and children are the victims.

Children suffer unnecessary burns due to the cooking in unprotected areas. The collection of wood is a major cause of deforestation. Gasses and soot released by the cooking fires pollute the air and contribute to the climate change.

Time spent on collecting wood for cooking by women and children could be used constructively to study, to ensure a better life for young women and their children. The most vulnerable in our society which are women and children are unnecessarily exposed to criminal elements and nature while they are collecting this firewood.

We understand that most of the time women previously were regarded as the last citizens and they are inheriting today the brunt of being the people who are not regarded, hence wherever violence rears its ugly head women and children mostly become the victims of those crimes.

If we are to reach the millennium goals set to reduce poverty and violence against women and children, we should start at home. Clean solar stoves should be investigated not only for their environmental and safety features but also for the economic opportunities and skills development that will accompany it to improve the lives of women and children.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Hinana, your time has unfortunately expired.

Mr N E HINANA: In conclusion, the DA encourages job creation and cleaner, healthier lifestyles. The most vulnerable in our society, women and children, must be able to go about their daily chores in a safe and clean environment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired now. I see the EFF.

Mr M N PAULSEN (EFF): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On 9 August 2014, 18 year-old unarmed Michael Brown was murdered by police in a St Louis suburb of Ferguson. He was shot while avoiding an altercation with the police. When he put his hands above his head and went on his knees, he was shot in the head with multiple shots to his chest. His body was left for four and a half hours in a pool of blood, in the scorching heat.

A gruesome image similar to that of lynched slaves hung in trees for hours so the rest in the plantation would behave lest they suffer the same fate in the hands of the very system that saw black people as cheap labour that is to be kept poor or rendered invisible and still does.

America has been burning since, literally and figuratively. Waves of blacks, social movements and other sympathisers have taken to the streets to express their anger, their fear, their frustration and try to chant a song we have been singing to no avail for hundreds of years, “black lives matter.”

What is happening in Ferguson is a reminder that a world wrought with institutionalised racism, reconciliation without justice, where the status quo is still intact and sweeping the race question under the carpet, is feeding a volcano waiting to erupt. Money, wealth, resources and power stayed in the same old hands while blacks remain poor and a new elite black, itself still subject to racism, has been created to give an impression that all is well when it is not.

People are impatient and outraged at the racialised violence in this world, violence in this case not just being bloodshed and riots and dead or injured bodies but also that our children are under-educated, our health institutions are mortuaries for breathing people, our people are landless and do not own anything, that our communities are plagued by poverty, unemployment, crime and drugs and all this just affects one race and everyone else keeps dismissing this fact instead of fixing things. [Interjections.]

Yes, you can deny it Mr Fritz, Uncle Tom. What makes us think what is happening every ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M N PAULSEN: ... minute in Ferguson will not take place here. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon member Mr Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, calling a member a derogatory term like “Uncle Tom” is absolutely unparliamentary and must be withdrawn.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I agree with that. I do not think it is parliamentary. Please withdraw that reference.

Mr M N PAULSEN. No problem. I withdraw. We do not need to wait until people march to the streets, destroy all in their path and burn Parliament like they did in Burkina Faso at the end of October but if this is the only option we give our people ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M N PAULSEN: ... as was the case in Burkina Faso ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Paulsen, your last sentence. Your time has expired with your injury time. Please finish off.

Mr M N PAULSEN: ... and is the case everywhere else. Thank you very much9. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired. I see the DA.

Mr M MNQASELA (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, 2014 marks 60 years since the

signing of the Women's Charter, 20 years since the birth of our democracy and 16 years since the 16 Days of No Violence Against Women and Children campaign.

Now what it says is that in order to break this chain of abuse of women and the onslaught of the brutal killing of our children, as explained by hon member Ms Maseko, we must empower the household. We must empower women and ensure that we break the cycle of poverty that continues to destroy our country.

An empowered woman is an empowered household. We know that if a woman is working everybody in that household enjoys the benefits.

Almost 200 000 women per year are abused in this country and 66 000 are reported. Only 4 500 perpetrators are convicted. It is because a woman will go and report but because she is a mother, she thinks about her children at home. This is the same woman who is a breadwinner who feeds all of us.

Now we need to intervene. The manner in which we make policies as legislators sitting here is to ensure that we better the skills of women, that we up-skill households through ensuring that women are better able to take care of themselves in order to take care of the household ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and creating responsible men. Thank you. Your time has expired. I see the ANC.

Mr S G TYATYAM (ANC): Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I must say we must all today really be obliged to express gratitude to the ANC Women's League and the ANC government for this brave initiative of 16 Days of No Violence Against Women and Children; its consistency for women emancipation and fight against women and children abuse as well as its creation of a non-racial and non-sexist society. It has been there. It is not new to us.

Notwithstanding these achievements, the Western Cape under the racist and sexist party (DA) has climbed to a higher echelon of racism and women abuse.

The Madam and Eve racist agenda of the DA is furthering animosity amongst communities. The racially-laden violence meted against domestic workers has been explained.

Furthermore, UCT, under her leadership, at some stage has reneged from its transformative agenda and has been transformed into a breeding ground for sexists, racists and fascists institution of white supremacy. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Is it a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I have been listening very carefully to the hon member Mr Tyatyam and he is now basically accusing a member of this House of being a racist.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Which one?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will check with him. I did not hear it that way. Hon member Mr Tyatyam, are you referring to members of this House?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Which one?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am asking you. Are you referring to members of this House with those references.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not? I will then accept your word and please continue.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Under the DA's stewardship, racism as well as Madam and Eve behaviour is notable ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: You say that with a president like Zuma!

Mr S G TYATYAM: Ask what happened to Lindiwe Mazibuko, ask what happened to Mbali Ntuli; when they were suddenly alienated and were rudely awakened and made aware of their African skin tones in Madam's den. And that one, Mnqasela. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Tyatyam, your last sentence. Your time has expired already. Just one second before you continue. Hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is unparliamentary for a member of this House to point to another member and say "that one".

Mr S G TYATYAM: Which one?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not sure if the member pointed directly to a specific member and threatened him. Did you do that?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, I would never do that. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam, your time has expired but I will give you one sentence, then you must take your seat. Order, one last sentence.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Therefore no-one should be astonished when the Speaker of the National Assembly is vilified and bombarded with racial and sexist slurs masquerading as freedom of speech. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of your speech. [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am going to ask that the video of the hon member's statement be reviewed. He categorically said he did not point and it will show clearly that he did. He says he would never do something like that but he did. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, can you also please then look at how the Chief Whip now pointed directly here at me. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can leave that in the hands of the Chair. The Chair will follow up on that if necessary. Order. I see the DA.

Mr B D KIVEDO (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, during his keynote address at the ANC Youth League Consultative Conference last night, President Zuma admitted that the ANC is in trouble and the party has been shaken. [Laughter.][Interjections.] Obvious.

The DA has been saying this all along. It comes as no surprise when considering the evident factionalism, prevalent tribalism, in-fighting, power mongering and adverse falling apart of the parastatals. Telkom is disconnected, Eskom is in the dark, SAA is flying without wings ... [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order

Mr B D KIVEDO: ... and the Post Office fails to deliver. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order! Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: The SABC ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: Attention, Deputy ... [[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo I want to protect you but you must help the Chair to protect you. When I ask for order you must take your seat. I am again appealing to the back bench there of the ANC, those three beautiful ladies: you are making too much noise. [Interjection.] Minister Winde? Order! Order! Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, the person reading is right behind me and I could not hear anything. I think he needs to start again. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. Order. Hon member Mr Kivedo, please continue. Order.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you for your protection Mr Deputy Speaker. Please give me a chance and I am going to make use of the time that I lost [Laughter.] The SABC: the only music that I hear on radio and TV is a slow version of “The Death March”. [Interjections.].

But while the ANC is imploding, the DA is growing in support. [Interjection.]. In the Eastern Cape, the DA won a ward off the ANC, going from 33% to 52% yesterday. [Applause.]

Back home, we received 55% of voters’ support in Grabouw, the strongest in 3 years. We retained ward 2 in the Overstrand Municipality with an outright 75% majority.

As President Zuma has now admitted, the ANC is indeed in trouble and have certainly been shaken. The people on the ground have made this clear. The people of South Africa are fed up with the ANC’s poor governance which is leading a fledging democracy to a fragile, if not a failed state. [Interjection.] More and more voters are looking to the DA for redress ... [Interjection.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr B D KIVEDO: ... an open opportunity society, effective service delivery ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: ... and good, clean ... [Interjection.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: ... transparent and accountable governance. [Interjections.]

Thank you. [Interjections.][Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please take your seat. Hon member Mr Kivedo, I know you were excited but when the Chair asks for order it means order. It means your time has expired.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I am sorry Mr Deputy Speaker, I could not hear you.

[Interjections.] There was too much noise.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the ... [Interjections.]. Order. I see the ACDP. [Interjections.].

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): The African Christian Democratic Party in the Western Cape is concerned ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Before we carry on. Can I just ask that the general level of noise in the House comes down and I am again appealing to the corner at the back of the ANC. There is too much continuous noise there. Please continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The ACDP in the Western Cape is concerned that a backlog of blood samples by the National Department of Health could lead to traffic offenders causing more deaths on our roads. 15 000 perpetrators in the Western Cape had their cases dropped in court because of the backlog of blood samples.

Due to the backlog, cases are being thrown out of court and these offenders are back on the street.

The ACDP is calling on the Western Cape Government and in particular, Minister Botha, to engage with the national Department of Health to urgently address the blood sample backlog to ensure that reckless drivers are not allowed onto our roads. The national Department of Health failing is failing the people of the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC, hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC is extremely concerned about the tens of thousands of children of school going age not yet in school or not yet placed and still languishing around in the dusty streets of our townships trying to find a place.

The crisis grows in Western Cape schools as the present registration is not on target and according to recent reports about 10 500 children still cannot find places in schools. The crisis is huge with possible closures of schools, learner transport in tatters; too many children of school going age are languishing in our streets and the highest provincial drop-out figure particularly in the rural communities.

Weeks after the start of this year we also saw thousands still not in school particularly in areas such as Mitchells Plain. On a daily basis we see more stories in newspapers of children not in school. Just yesterday the *Daily Sun* reported about a ten year-old boy who is still not in school. [Interjections.].

Whether it is special needs, poverty or identity documents, no child should be deprived of an education.

The ANC has people helping to identify these kids and assisting them in getting into schools. The ANC calls on this DA-run Western Cape Government to treat this issue as a priority and not merely an administrative task.

The ANC also calls on national government to intervene where necessary with regard to the poor in this province and to place kids before the start of a school year. The DA does not seem to be concerned about kids in the poor and affected areas. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Ms M M WENGER (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Non-ferrous metal theft in our province is a crime that is wreaking havoc with our

economy and which is causing devastating effects on our daily lives. It causes electricity blackouts and trains to be late. Copper theft is estimated as costing our country R16 billion per year and copper theft is 43% higher than a year ago. The scale of theft is so grave that South Africa has become one of the world's leading exporters of copper, and the Western Cape exports tens of millions of Rands worth of copper, despite the fact that we do not even have a copper mine in the Western Cape.

Cable theft alone saw 58 000 cases reported last year. The costs of replacing these cables for infrastructure cost enormous sums. This does not consider the extra amounts spent on security to help prevent further theft of cable. But considering the opportunity costs of service delivery and what that money, used to replace stolen cabling, could have been used for, is cause for concern.

In order to combat this type of crime innovative solutions are needed. Firstly the Democratic Alliance calls on the South African Police Service to make non-ferrous metal theft a separate crime category, so that it can be measured and tracked. Second, the Democratic Alliance calls on the National Police Department to establish specialised units for non-ferrous metal theft similar to the "Copper Heads" of the City of Cape Town. This unit has had many successes in catching thieves with over 140 arrests last year. And thirdly, the Democratic Alliance supports the police in amending the Second Hand Goods Act which will require financial transactions between scrap-metal dealers and

sellers to be done through the formal banking system, to prevent theft and fraud. This will help law enforcers to trace and track perpetrators and will provide an additional layer of accountability. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of Members' Statements. We now move on to Motions. We will first do motions where notice is given. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Ms Wenger.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, in light of the recent racist attacks in the province, debates ways to eradicate racism and debates ways to foster a culture of tolerance and non-racialism amongst the citizens of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the growing division between citizens and increased racism under this DA-led government in the Western Cape.

[Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? [Interjections.] You cannot object. He is only giving notice now. Hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the developing crisis in Eskom which has a negative impact on the economy as well as ordinary people on a regular basis.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the turnaround strategy of the Department of Local Government to bring about the much needed change in governance and administration in municipalities.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon Leader of the Opposition?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House deliberates this DA-led Western Cape Government's fabrication and excuse that black people inclusive of Coloured and Africans do not possess the required skills to fill posts to attain employment equity.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, as in National Parliament, has a sitting where the Premier of the province is to account for her performance and that of her government but without these binding debate rules which essentially make sure some voices are heard and others censored.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the IDP Indaba Programme ...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice will be taken.

Mr M MNQASELA. No. They were making a noise.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Are you finished?

Mr M MNQASELA: They are making a noise. I cannot even hear myself now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order! There is too much noise. Please give the hon member Mr Mnqasela a fair chance.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the IDP Indaba Programme as implemented by the Western Cape Department of Local Government.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? No further motions; then we move on. Are there any Motions Without Notice? I see the hon member Ms Wenger first, then the hon member Mr Dugmore.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House strongly condemns the appalling recent racial incidents in the Western Cape which were violent in nature, and that this House encourages every citizen of this province to play their part in ensuring a tolerant, non-racial South Africa. [Applause.]

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House establishes a multi-party ad hoc committee consisting of 7 members to investigate whether the Premier has deliberately

misled this House when claiming on Thursday 13 November 2014 during an interpellation, that the Provincial Department of Human Settlements had completed the development of a Provincial Housing Strategy as committed to by the Premier in the State of the Province Address on Friday 20 June 2014 and further to establish whether the conduct of the Premier constitutes a violation of the Oath of Office as assented by her on 21 May 2014.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Are there any further? Hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the small business owners, of whom the majority are pensioners, who received the title deeds to their shops after forty long years. The forty one title deeds and fifteen certificates of ownership were handed to 56 business owners from Langa, Gugulethu and Nyanga, better known as Lagunya.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges that the wave of violent protests and supposed land grabs are as a result of this government's failure and unwillingness to meet the basic human rights of the poor of this province.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.
Hon member Ms Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes, with sadness, the passing of struggle veteran, Bernard Richard "Bozza" Koelman after hospitalisation in Oudsthoorn, and conveys its condolences to his family, friends and comrades.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Mackenzie first.

Ms R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Blind Cricket World Cup commences today and wishes all the countries participating in this event the best of luck and may the best team win.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges and appreciates the 16 Days of Activism campaign which takes effect as of yesterday but requests that it is not just another black male bashing masquerade as has been the case previously.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its sympathies to the family and friends of Dr Suzan Tamara Robinson, commonly known as “Sue”, who died on Saturday, 22 November 2014 at the age of 89. She was a well known specialist who worked at the Red Cross Children’s Hospital in Cape Town.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Ms Lekker first. Hon member Mr Paulsen?

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Inaudible.] profanity in the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot ... What did you say?

Mr M N PAULSEN: The hon Minister Winde is using profanity in the House here. Is it parliamentary for him to do that? He said “moer”. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, I am not sure if Minister Winde did

say that but if he did say that it is unparliamentary and I will ask him to withdraw that.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would not normally react to this thing but I actually asked why does he want to “moer” me because that is exactly what he said to me. [Interjections.] If he has any integrity he will own up to that and I apologise for saying “moer”.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you withdraw as well?

Mr M N PAULSEN: I apologise too ... I withdraw. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we continue? I see the hon member Ms Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the international drive of 16 days of activism against violence targeting women and children as it was launched in South Africa by President Jacob Zuma on 25 November 2014.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. I see the hon member

Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House applauds A B de Villiers as the ICC Cricketer of the Year.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House pledges solidarity with the protesters in Ferguson, the families of Michael Brown and Amir Rice and all families before them whose children's lives have been cut short and wasted by an anti-black state which gives them nothing to live for and annihilates them when they live too long.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

[Interjections.] Order. Are there any further? Hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 17 year-old Ajax Cape Town defender, Rivaldo Coetzee, for earning his first cap for Bafana Bafana, the youngest player who managed this accolade. [Applause.]

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Ms Schäfer first.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Jeanne Groenewald from Elgin Free Range Chickens, for recently receiving the Western Cape's Top Commercial Entrepreneur Award at the Premier's 2014 Entrepreneurship Recognition Awards in Paarl.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without

notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Ms Gopie first.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends waiter Abongile Vincent Nopa for setting a wonderful example during the month we focussed on people living with disabilities, when he was recently spotted feeding a severely affected person in a wheelchair in the Canal Walk Wimpy. He is the kind of person who epitomises everything our nation stands for.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Ms Lekker first.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House applauds the South African Police for its purge of corrupt officials, with the latest case in point, the arrest of 11 Parow policemen arrested for bribery and corruption.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Ms Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House encourages all Western Cape citizens to join the drive to conserve energy and look at renewable alternatives in order to reduce reliance on or use electricity effectively. [Interjection.]

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Are there any further? For the last time, are we done? Hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA is fast to hold public hearings on visa requirements but does not want to investigate ongoing evictions or human rights abuses in this province.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order

Paper. Hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the poor state and neglect of many of our schools under the DA-led provincial government, for example, the prefab Wynberg High School that was to last 25 years.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? Is there an objection? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the collusion by big construction firms on bids to build the 2010 World Cup stadium, and calls on the DA in the City of Cape Town to effectively prohibit those said companies from trading with the City for a period of five years.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order

Paper. Hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the fact that the oldest liberation movement on the African continent and the largest in this country, the glorious ANC, will celebrate its 103rd birthday and 60 years since the Freedom Charter in Cape Town come January.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the family, friends and colleagues of Barrydale SAPS, with the passing of Sergeant Ncumisa Bokleni, who selflessly served her community until the end when she tragically died in an accident and was buried last weekend.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without

notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Are there any further....? For the last time, can we continue?

We then proceed to the Order Paper. The Secretary will read the first Order.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

2. Consideration of Committee Reports on the Annual Reports of Departments, their entities and the Western Cape Provincial Parliament for the year ended 31 March 2014.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the honourable Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The debate on the tabling of the Annual Reports is an important step in the process of oversight over the Executive. For a new Parliament, all the committees have performed admirably in interrogating the departments and public entities and I want to thank all the members for the spirit in which this was achieved.

In the case of the Rules Committee Review of this Parliament, Vote 2, there were some concerns raised, most of which I am pleased to say are already effectively being addressed by the current administration under the stewardship of the newly installed Speaker. Already this term, the Rules Committee has met on several occasions and additionally an Internal Arrangements Sub-Committee has been established. This committee

comprises: the Deputy Speaker, the Chief Whip of the Majority Party and the Chief Whip of the ANC. They interrogate all aspects that have been raised by members, from the appropriateness and functioning of our facilities to security, to media related matters.

Importantly, the on-going lack of clarity relating to this Parliament precinct and attendant security concerns has again featured prominently in discussions. In my discussions with the Speaker I am very encouraged in her determination to address this longstanding and irksome matter which goes to the heart of the independence of this Legislature and its ability to function optimally.

It is a fact that this building is an old one and that facilities were designed and built in a time when both configurations and the use of certain types of building materials are now outdated, even prohibited. In the case of the latter, it is common knowledge that blue asbestos was discovered in a little-used room on the 6th floor after water damage was investigated following extensive rains. I am satisfied that the administration acted promptly at the time, evacuating the room, sealing it and initiating an investigation into the extent of the threat. I personally witnessed and questioned the expert who was inspecting the roof spaces and I was assured that no threat existed to members outside the sealed space but I agree that some communication to this effect should have been sent out earlier to pre-empt rumour especially by those with malicious intent. [Interjection.]

Contrary to accusations made in this House, a service level agreement does exist between Parliament and the responsible department for the up-keep of the facility. This has been witnessed by all members following the upgrade of facilities in offices during our term as well. Furthermore, it is common cause that our facilities are cramped, both for staff and the members and that this matter will have to be addressed in the near future.

This aspect will receive greater importance in time to come when the topic of increasing our membership to be in line with the province's substantial increase in population is discussed. It is imperative to ensure that the citizenry are adequately represented and that they have access to members. We cannot afford to become a remote entity from the broader population.

As an adjunct I have just been informed that the Opposition microphones in the National Assembly have been turned off to prevent them from speaking and I would suggest that we make a much larger chamber because it would appear that Opposition at National Assembly will have to come to the Western Cape Legislature to be able to articulate their grievances against National Parliament. [Interjection.] This matter will be canvassed by the Internal Arrangements Committee [Interjections.] and recommendations by way of the reports to be made to the Rules Committee.

The Speaker has additionally indicated to all members [Interjection.] that a review of the standing ... [Interjection.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde, agb lid mnr Dyantyi.

Mr M G E WILEY: I want some protection please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please give the hon member Mr Wiley a fair chance.

Mr M G E WILEY: The Speaker has additionally indicated to all members that a review of the Standing Rules of the House will be undertaken in the new year to ensure that they are current and reflect the will of the members. Matters also to be explored by the Internal Arrangements Committee will be the Governors' models of legislatures to ensure that members are given the opportunity to take full ownership of their institution and to entrench the separation of powers.

This does not necessarily mean a complete physical separation but greater clarity and delineation at the very least. I am personally very satisfied that we are going in the right direction and ask that the members support the Committee report.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think the tabling of the reports today obviously gives us, as the House, the opportunity to reflect on the progress as well as the challenges of the year under review

but I think what it also does is: this particular year under review actually comes at the end of five years of administration and rule by the Democratic Alliance and many of the issues which have been picked up throughout these particular reports actually reflect on what is a very important distinction to make. On the one hand it is critical and I believe all of us are united around the fact that we want every entity in this province and we want every department to actually get a clean audit. All of us are united by that and all of us should acknowledge, as we do, progress which has been achieved.

An HON MEMBER: It is a basic task [Inaudible.].

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is something that all of us need to aspire to. The issue of Annual Reports that must be reflected on is actually the quality of governance and the quality of service delivery as experienced by the majority of people in this particular province. So in many ways these Annual Reports give us an opportunity to reflect on whether, besides in certain areas, progress is made in regard to achieving the clean audit outcomes that we require. It allows us to look honestly at the actual service delivery of five years of DA administration and I think what is very clear is there are four disturbing truths which begin to emerge from looking in detail at these particular reports, and I want to touch on these four disturbing truths this afternoon.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole! Brand hulle!

Mr C M DUGMORE: The first one is that it is undeniable, if one looks at the Annual Report of the Department of Community Safety, that crime and violence have actually worsened dramatically in priority crimes during this period of DA government and this year under review is no exception. [Interjection.] Now to be very ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, you are sitting next to a live microphone and you are actually interfering with the recording of the hon member Mr Dugmore's voice. Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: It would be very easy to simply blame, as hon members often tend to do, national policing and national government but the reality is that if you look at what happened over these five years, for instance, disbanding community initiatives such as the Bambanani Programme; reducing the amounts of money spent on community police forums and actually supporting a community driven approach, to the setting up of social transformation programmes in 27 areas, that this failure on the part of the Democratic Alliance has resulted in the worsening of priority crimes not only in this year under review but over the last five years. That is the truth that is a legacy of five years of DA government.

The second truth, which is very disturbing, is that the truth in the figures of these Annual Reports shows us that the representivity, in particular of Coloured and African men and women at senior management levels, has worsened under the DA government. The stats will show you what I am

talking about - senior management levels have got worse. This is something that should concern all of us.

What concerns the ANC is that when one looks at all of these Annual Reports, it is very clear that this is explained away with a cut and paste insertion to all the reports around appropriate candidates not being available. That is why, to really understand these annual reports, what we are going to have to do is actually call for the list of applicants who have applied for these particular positions because clearly there is a basis to dispute the fact that there are not competent people from historically disadvantaged communities being appointed. So that is the second disturbing truth that emerges across all of these departments.

The third one goes to the heart of creating security for our people and living out the clause in the Freedom Charter which talks about houses, security and comfort. This Annual Report as well as the four reports preceding it of DA rule indicate very clearly; whereas under the ANC administration an average of 18 000 houses were built each year, over that period in office, that has dropped down to 11 000 housing units under this provincial administration. [Interjections.] Hopefully this MEC will improve that but his predecessors must explain [Interjection.] why this particular situation has resulted. [Interjection.] Exactly, I forget. So this particular MEC needs to take responsibility as well as the Premier.

A lot of this has to do with the Premier's political statements about who does and does not belong in this province; the so-called refugees; the failure to release strategically located land; this is an indication that there is no political will to actually deal with integrated human settlements and provide, because there is a perception that those that will be provided for, whether they are backyard dwellers or whether they are people historically from other provinces, will not politically support the Democratic Alliance.

There is no other way to explain how this province has reduced the average yearly turnover of houses under the ANC compared to now. That is 18 000 average. [Interjection.] The facts show that. I will show you the statistics for that.

The fourth truth, which I think all of us as parents should be disturbed about, is the fact that in this province, under the watch of the DA, the matric performance has dropped from first position [Interjection.] to fourth position in the country and that is a reality that you cannot ignore.

So, when we look at these Annual Reports all of us want clean audits but when one actually looks at the delivery ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE ... of this provincial government in the area of community safety ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, sorry. Is it a point of order?

Mr B D KIVEDO: It is a point of order. That is an untruth. The figures have been manipulated [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo ...

Mr B D KIVEDO: The Western Cape ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, a point ...

Mr B D KIVEDO: ... is number one.

The SPEAKER: A point of order, hon member Mr Kivedo ...

Mr B D KIVEDO: The figures have been manipulated. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, that was not a point of order. Hon member Mr Dugmore, you may proceed.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I have noticed that at least two minutes of my time has been taken by these points of order. [Interjections.] So, these are the facts which actually lie in the annual reports. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members, please allow hon member Mr Dugmore to speak.

Mr C M DUGMORE: As we reflect on these Annual Reports, we need responses from the members on the opposite side of the House to deal with these facts which have emerged and are contained in these annual reports.

If we then specifically look at Transport and Public Works, we have a very disturbing issue, because that particular committee [Interjection.] has asked for information to be provided by the committee by a certain date but yet we have a situation where through a procurement process in the Department of Transport and Public Works it emerged in the process of these committees that one of the officials, who actually sat on the procurement committee, previously worked for the company in question, Filcon, but did not make a declaration ... [Interjection.]

HON MEMBERS: Skande!

Mr C M DUGMORE ... and yet that committee went on to appoint Filcon, whose contract was subsequently cancelled, despite the fact of us asking for all that information by a certain date as reflected in our committee, we have not yet received that. I then want to go to the Department of the Premier. We have asked the Department of the Premier that this information be provided to the committee by 20 November. Now, hon member Botha has not provided that information to us and there are questions why we pass

resolutions when the relevant departments do not stick to the deadlines but the Department was supposed to provide us by 20 November all documents related to what was in fact an embarrassment to the Department of the Premier.

Four Audit Committee reports were never tabled at the Audit Committee [Interjection.] and what begins to emerge from information that we have received is that senior officials of the Department actually sabotaged those reports reaching the Audit Committee because they themselves have been implicated [Interjections.] in regard to suppressing certain information. We have not received that. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie are you standing on a point of order?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It was a point of order but actually more clarity. The hon member Mr Dugmore is clearly misleading the House. Those dates are completely wrong. The reports are coming.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie, that is not a point of order. I see the hon member Mr Joseph. Members can I appeal to you ... Hon member Mr Joseph, before you speak, may we just get some calm and little bit of silence so that we can afford the member an opportunity, please. Hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The 2013/2014 annual report of Provincial Treasury speaks of a department with experienced, good leadership in the names of the Premier's Minister, Alan Winde and the HOD, Dr J C Stegmann. Both these leaders were supported by excellent staff who understand the drive for ensuring that the Western Cape Government becomes the best regional government in the world.

A well functioning department with various programmes and sub-programmes, that is managed by qualified and experienced staff, forms the basis of stable financial management and leadership that creates an environment for good governance. According to the Accounting Officer, Dr Stegmann, the global and economic environment presented a risk for Provincial Treasury and in order to address the increased socio-economic challenges, the department had to ensure that greater value for money is achieved especially within the municipalities.

The entity within the department, namely: The Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, under the leadership of Ms Lapoorta and CEO, Dr Matsapola continued with a robust strategic plan to regulate gambling in a fair, transparent and equitable way. Both the departments and the public entity received unqualified audits in the 2013/2014 financial year.

It is important that I recognise the role of the A-G and the audit committees and all stakeholders associated with the achievement. The systems of internal control lay the foundation for the performance, integrity and reliability of Provincial Treasury playing a leading role in this regard. The supply chain

management forums established for provincial and municipal officials place more emphasis on Treasury regulations. An under-expenditure of .07 by Provincial Treasury reflects on leadership, financial management and good governance. This is a solid basis for the new Minister, Dr Ivan Meyer, as well as the new Standing Committee on Finance, who have an oversight role over the executive for the department and the entity. Two members of the public participated through oral submissions and their concerns were referred to the department namely: Electronic Procurement Systems, managed by Ariba and the lack of information relating to VPUU.

The Standing Committee will ensure that all recommendations are acted upon including the employment for disabled persons that was raised, historically disadvantaged units that [Inaudible.] need to take place and the possibility of providing free access to on-line government services. Madam Speaker, I move that the House adopts this report. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: I now see the hon member Ms Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, firstly I would like to thank the Standing Committee on Premiers, Members, for fulfilling the oversight mandate through constructive engagement in the committee meetings and visits. I also take this opportunity to acknowledge and applaud the support received from Committee Administration. The Western Cape Government firmly believes in an open opportunity society for all. This society can only be created be in space where good, clean, effective, inclusive governance is the order of the day. It is only through accountable and a purposeful leadership that efficient

service delivery is provided for the people. This said, as Committee Chairperson I commend the Premier and her department for their outstanding performance in service delivery to the people of the Western Cape through good governance. The Department of the Premier with its transversal component is responsible for executive support in which they render relevant and timeous executive governance support services to the executive and Director-General of the Western Cape Government, ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

Ms L J BOTHA: ...Provincial strategic management to support the Premier and Cabinet professionally in order to effectively exercise the executive authority in respect of provincial strategic management. The 2013/14 Annual Report of the Department of the Premier has evidently shown the department's commitment to the responsibilities. They were open to being held accountable before the Standing Committee for any challenges they were faced with during the financial year under review. For the financial year 2013/14, the Department of the Premier received a clean audit opinion with no findings on predetermined objectives. For this I applaud the Premier and her department for being both responsible and accountable in creating an enabling environment in which people can live lives they value through an open opportunity society.

By definition, accountability is the quality of State of being subjected to giving a statement or explanation of one's activities, conduct and discharge

of commitments and duties all of underlining or explanatory reasons, causes, grounds or motives. Responsibility is a quality of State of being answerable as a primary source, course, motive or agent of something. With these definitions, together with its transversal role, the Department of the Premier has most certainly progressed in realising the vision of becoming the best run regional government in the world. Proof of the Department of the Premier's accountability is the department engaging with the Standing Committee on challenges they have faced and explained their shortfalls. As the Chairperson I am under no illusions that the Department of the Premier is perfect. We are very much of the opinion that there is room for improvement and look forward to seeing how the shortfalls have been redressed and improved in the next annual reports. Under the leadership of the Director-General and the transversal nature of the Department of the Premier, the Western Cape Government achieved the highest percentage of management standards at level 4 and the top two performing departments across the country were from this Western Cape Government. To emphasise the positive outcome of good, clean governance, the Western Cape performed exceedingly well in the 2013/14 management performance assessment tool cycle through which the Department of the Premier was scored best Performing Department with a staff compliment of less than 2 000 country wide in key performance areas 2, which is governance and accountability. I could go on and on about stressing the importance of good governance for service delivery to the people using actual examples from the Western Cape Government of the Premier. However, I am disheartened that no other province can be afforded the pleasure of commending the good governance of their Premiers and

departments, let alone the country or the President. [Interjections].

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Botha, the last sentence, please.

Ms L J BOTHA: I will encourage firstly other provincial governments to follow the exceptional example of the Western Cape Government to improve the service delivery to the people. That said, I propose that the 2014 Annual Report of the Western Cape Department of the Premier be supported by this House. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, yesterday a shocking revelation was made by the Auditor-General of South Africa by reporting irregular spending of public money by National and Provincial Government Departments from R27 billion in the previous financial year to R62 billion in this current year. The report further shows that 72% of government departments and public entities were ignoring or not complying with the PFMA. Saying that, this means that there is a blatant disregard for spending taxpayers' money. There are 309 national and provincial departments and entities and that were responsible for R62 billion in irregular expenditure. But everything is not doom and gloom. And as chairperson of SCOPA in the Western Cape we have a good story to tell about the spending of the Western Cape Government. [Interjections.] The Public Accounts Committee, [Interjections.] having considered as part of our oversight role for the 2013/2014 Annual

Reports...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...of the thirteen departments...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS:the Western Cape and the [Inaudible.] and the Western Cape Provincial Parliament ... [Interjections.] have seen an improved number of clean audit opinions. In other words 18 of the 23 auditees have obtained clean audit. This means an improvement of 48% in the previous year to 78% in this financial year. [Interjections.] Seven auditees, meaning 30%, moved from financially unqualified opinions with findings to clean audit outcomes. Ten auditees, meaning 43%, remain with their clean audit status. The committee is, however, concerned with one entity, the Western Cape Liquor Authority, that regressed from an audit opinion of being unqualified with no findings, with an opinion unqualified audit with findings in the 2013/2014 financial year. In this response the committee would like the entity to improve its areas of internal controls in order to work towards improving audit outcomes ...[Inaudible.]... The committee also raises concerns with transversal issues that relate to GMT vehicles purchased by the departments and they are still required to pay daily tariffs and mileage for vehicles being used. The committee also had a concern with the IT controls....[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

An HON MEMBER: Say...

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

An HON MEMBER: I just wanted to ask the member what does he

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No, I do not want a question from the member, he must please sit down.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians, before you speak ...
[Interjections.] Hon members, there is a buzz that is actually interfering, if you can just tone it down please, and afford the member to present his report, thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Further concerns were the internal audit matters. Various vacancies were not filled until audit and that meant that they could not cover all the audit risk areas. So those were the concerns of the committee. Although the ANC can say what they want, apart from this...[Interjections.] ...the Western Cape performs better than Gauteng and better than the National Government. [Interjections.] Talk is about that this

Government...[Interjections].

An HON MEMBER: Sit down.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: This means that this Western Cape Government have good governance. It means that we have competent, disciplined and dedicated officials in this province. [Interjections.] It means that we have proper monitoring systems in place. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Christians. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Madam Speaker, will the hon member Mr Christians take a question?

The SPEAKER: He has indicated that he will not.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No, no, definitely not. [Interjections.] In conclusion, the committee wants to thank the Premier, the Ministers, yourself and the Secretary, Heads of Department, the Auditor-General, auditory committees and all the role players for the information provided towards ensuring efficient and productive oversight outcomes from this process. The committee noted the attendance of community organisations, the Bishop Lavis Community Outreach Forum, Mitchell's Plain Advice Office, Grabouw Community Organisation, African Voices, Khaya-Langa Human Development and we as a committee has said we thank these

organisations...[Interjections.]...but we believe that these processes must be made public so that we can have more participation from members of the public. I move that this House supports this report. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Community Safety Standing Committee considered the Annual Report of the Department of Community Safety for the 2013/2014 financial year. The department has received five consecutive clean audits...

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms M M WENGER: ...and has been named as one of the top performing departments in the country by the management performance assessment tool which is awarded by the Presidency. The committee recommended that the department be commended for its good financial governance and performance. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, please!

Ms M M WENGER: The department has been characterised by innovation and in many ways has been a path-finder. It has shifted from disparate projects to a focused evidence-based programme of action, grounded in its mandate. The Community Safety Act is a first of its kind for any province in South Africa.

The department is defining oversight as contemplated in the Constitution of the Republic and proving the catalytic effect that oversight can have. The Watching Briefs Programme, which the committee welcomed as an innovative and useful oversight tool, has seen positive outcomes. Trained legal experts and final year law students observed and reported on proceedings in court to identify....

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Wenger, please on a point of order may I ask hon member Mr Dugmore and the hon Minister Winde to please kindly refrain from having a conversation across the floor? The hon member Ms Wenger is speaking. [Interjections.] You may continue. Thank you.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you. Trained legal experts and final year law students observe and report on proceedings in court to identify systemic police failures with the particular focus on gang-related crimes. This team monitored a total of 785 cases during the previous financial year. In the final half of that year 71 cases were removed from the court roll due to police inefficiencies. The department reported these to the Provincial Commissioner who took action. The result was 44% of cases being reinstated on the court roll and 39% resulted in disciplinary action being instituted against those responsible officers. The expanded partnership programme in which oversight is co-produced creates a funding model for CPF's. The committee encouraged the department to ensure proper payment processes to CPF's in order to capacitate them and to adhere to good governance principles. The rolling out of the Act has influenced change within the department and caused the

department to consider its staffing profile and capacity. Concern was raised about the low number of female senior managers. The recommendations of the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry and its impact on the department were raised and the committee noted the expenditure of the commission in the period under review. The department has continued to strengthen and expand its whole of society approach to safety through partnerships with SIDS, FET colleges and the religious fraternity. Thousands of our youth from crime and gang-affected communities have been placed in FET colleges to either complete matric or to learn a trade. Or they have been taken into holiday programmes run by churches, mosques and other religious organisations to be kept safe and to learn. Some 700 youth at risk have passed through the Chrysalis Academy and have been shepherded into work opportunities by the department's focus on job placements of Chrysalis graduates. The committee expressed concerns generally about crime and violence, particularly violence against women and children. We found that the department is addressing matters of safety at provincial buildings through the Beyond Safety Approach Project and has developed a transversal safety and security risk management strategy which is starting to bear fruit. To quote the late Mr Nelson Mandela: "Safety and security don't just happen. They are the result of collective consensus and public investment." The Provincial Government has no operational control over law enforcement and policing and I remind hon member Dugmore that policing is a National Government responsibility ...[Interjections.]...to prevent and combat crime. That being so it will be interesting to know why the Western Cape police is the most under-resourced in the country where 85% of our police stations are under resourced, yet

provinces like the Free State have an over-supply of members. We would like to know why it is so. [Interventions.] However, the Department of Community Safety...[Interventions.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, please!

Ms M M WENGER: ... has used oversight and the whole of society to create collective consensus and public investment into safety. The committee recommended that the Department should raise inadequate crime intelligence responses with the national Police Minister and recommended that the National Prosecuting Authority brief the committee on the witness protection programme, so that we can be sure that victims and witnesses are protected. I wish to thank the members of the committee from the DA, the ANC, and the ACDP as well as other members who participated in the committee, for their constructive contributions. In conclusion, I request that the House adopts this report. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Ms Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Annual Reports from departments for the period under review illustrate one important point that this DA government continues to blatantly serve its white constituents while ignoring the needs of the poor of this province.

An HON MEMBER: Amandla!

Ms T M DIJANA: They have presented one copy of the Annual Report for all the departments, revealing their copy and paste system which is clearly visible for all to see. These reports are characterised by variants owing to poor planning, under-representativity, regional demographics and low target setting. So the DA can give to themselves the title of over-achievers. Partial achievement does not manifest into an achievement and henceforth an absolute failure. [Interjection.] History has taught us that as long as social-economic conditions are not addressed, the DA's equal opportunity approach, while not addressing the imbalances, was and always will be doomed to failure. [Interjections.] Poor infrastructure is a fundamental problem, safe toilets, operational street lights, safe schools and job creation ought to be prioritised. Evidently the DA has no vested interest in cultivating community relations as alluded to by their Khayelitsha Commission report.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Ms T M DIJANA: The divide and rule tactical strategy of the DA, which is inherently premised on apartheid tactics, is revealed when comparing the lopsided capacitation levels and resources availed to the National Government-initiated Community Policing Forums and Provincial ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms T M DIJANA: ...Government's Neighbourhood Watch...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Ms Dijana! Hon Minister Winde, are you standing on a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: I am asking, Madam Speaker, if the hon member would kindly take a question?

An HON MEMBER: I know! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: This is an Annual Report!

Ms T M DIJANA: Of 150 CPFs, only a miniscule are receiving due attention, while the latter are accorded stipends and the requisite equipment not afforded to the former. Bambanani Project phase created solid relationships between communities and the department with vibrant CPFs taking the lead. The Neighbourhood Watch's role is only used to undermine the previously effective CPFs. Where is the DA's and Plato's conscience while they are evidently marginalising CPFs; albeit well-versed on issues of community voluntarism anticipated by the National Government?

The ANC is well-acquainted with the DA's theatrics, ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms T M DIJANA: ...and henceforth urge them not to single out the murder of the tourist killed in Gugulethu to seize headlines, when scores of township residents are maimed daily with no such discordant noise forthcoming from hypocrites on that side of the House. When we were governing this province, the ANC was able to arrest the increase in crime levels. However, there has been an unrelenting upsurge in criminality owing to the DA's unashamed skewed treatment and divisive strategy implementation in the Western Cape. The issue of under-expenditure is a cause for concern. The Department of Environmental Affairs under-spent its budget by R2 600 070 by not filling vacancies. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members!

Ms T M DIJANA: Of grave concern is their omission of Africans in Senior Management which makes this an all-white boys' club comprising of 80% of this demographic! Does the DA realise and accept that we are no longer in the apartheid era, it is 2014? Why are other demographics not represented in this department? This speaks to the heart of lack of transformation and institutionalised racism in this DA-run province.

HON MEMBERS: Ja! Ja!

Ms T M DIJANA: This shows that not only is this DA government characterised by institutional racism, but also extreme patriarchal

chauvinism, hence the escalation of racial attacks against our people.
[Interjections.] Notwithstanding the aforementioned disingenuity of the DA...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Dijana...

Ms T M DIJANA: ... they further utilise provision of Human Settlements ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Dijana. Hon Minister Grant, are you standing on a point of order?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, can I just ask the hon member to shout a bit louder, I can't hear her.
[Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: My voice is like this, that means you discriminate against me, I can't help that my voice is like this. [Interjections.]..Notwithstanding the aforementioned disingenuity of the DA they further utilise provision of human settlements as their mobilisation tool because they lack the direct access to the black vote. Hon MEC Madikizela and the DA instigate tensions between backyarders and informal settlement dwellers and the resultant black on black violence by drawing from their divide and rule strategy with the aim of deceiving the latter into voting for them through prioritisation of the latter for housing projects. Houses built more than 5 years ago are yet to be occupied! This is evident in the Oscar Mpetha Square conflict in Nyanga as

well as in Langa's Joe Slovo informal settlement which is solely characterised by inadequate or complete lack of consultation with affected communities culminating in enormous cost implications and extreme wasteful expenditure as these developments have to be rebuilt. Who will account and pay back the money now? [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: They impose steering committees on these communities because they want them ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, please!

Ms T M DIJANA: They impose steering committees on these communities because they want them to select the DA's own suppliers derived from their constituencies including hon MEC Madikizela's brother, Thobile Madikizela. Does not the inclusion of your brother, Minister, constitute a clear case of conflict of interest?... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dijana, sorry. Hon Minister Madikizela, are you rising on a point of order?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, I would like to challenge the hon member on the statement that she is making. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Point of order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The point of order is that she is misleading the House. [Interjections.] I would like to challenge this hon member on a point of order. [Interjections.] Just sit down.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, you need to raise a point of order. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, these are serious allegations that the hon member is making. I would like to challenge her on that. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: It is not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: It is not a point of order, Hon Minister Madikizela. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Please sit down. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Madam Speaker, I would need my time because he has wasted my time now.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Dijana, we have suspended the clock, so you

may proceed. Members of the Opposition, will you please afford your hon member the opportunity to speak, please?

Ms T M DIJANA: Hon MEC Madikizela, you also failed to submit a report on consultants utilised by the Department to SCOPA, a clear attempt to hide collusion with predominantly rich and white private companies. That is the only constituency you care about!

Clearly the DA government lacks interest and direction in delivering on its mandate. Over the last five years you have only managed to deliver 12 000 houses per year versus ANC's output of 15 000. Two thousand houses less were built per annum during your term of administration, yet you continue to propagate a narrative of being better administrators than the ANC. This is all an inherent and delusional fallacy of the DA messaging. In your reports you further allude to anticipated increases in backlog of housing settlements delivery. When are you ever going to prioritise our people? All this is allowed to occur while our people in Hangberg, Joe Slovo, Freedom Square and Imizamo Yethu and many other areas continue to live in squalor without the most basic of services, their only sin being that they were born black! [Interjections.]

The DA must desist not deceiving our people and claiming easy victories when the contrary is evident for all to see. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to make this observation. The Western Cape is the only province that is governed by the Democratic Alliance. And I can tell you that more and more people increasingly are beginning to say they wish Western Cape was like water, when you open your tap, even in if you are in the Eastern Cape, the water that comes, becomes blue. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Because that is how excited people are about the DA. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ...other provinces!

Mr M MNQASELA: We recently opened a hospital in my constituency [Inaudible] that is top class. I have never seen anything like that in any of the provinces. [Interjections.] You go ...[Interjections.] No listen, listen. Hon member Ms Gillion is not here. But she was going to tell you. [Interjections.] You go to Mitchell's Plain, you see the hospital that is there, you go to Khayelitsha, you see the hospital that is there, ...[Interjections.]...so it is undisputed truth that the DA is the biggest thing to happen in South Africa.[Interjections.] And I can tell you....

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela, sorry. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, that the member who is not sitting in her place should not be interjecting here. Please address that hon member.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Not to interject when she is not sitting in her place.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I hear what you said. I did not see or hear the interjection, but member, I would like to encourage you if you do want to participate to take your rightful seat in the house. Thank you. You may proceed. Sorry, before we go on, hon member Mr Paulsen?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Will the hon member take a question, Madam Speaker?

Mr M MNQASELA: [Laughter]. When I am done, outside. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Proceed, hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: That is why, in observing this Annual Report, it is quite an important thing to reflect on the trajectory in this country. It is very important that when we do this as the Western Cape, we wish that every province, when they look in the mirror, they can see the Western Cape ...[Interjections.]...because the reality now is that science is telling you that it is practical, because the other Premiers in other provinces are scared to look at their provinces anymore. [Interjections.] And when you go around the country it is clear that the Western Cape is the best. Now the local government turn around strategy for instance that has been implemented by

the Department of Local Government in the Western Cape has ensured that there are more and more clean audits coupled with the best service delivery in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] And there are still municipalities in this province that are governed by the ANC ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry, hon member Ms Davids, you may interject, but you have given a running commentary, please kindly refrain.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker...

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr M MNQASELA: The importance about what I am highlighting is that I am trying to ensure that the ANC can see the benefit of them sitting in this province, because what we are delivering, we are delivering to them too. So when we talk about the best, they are enjoying the best. [Interjections.] So that is the reality and we are talking about a shared and inclusive economy in this province. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Haai! No, No! [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Let me just highlight that 78% of our budget, in fact, 83% of the Western Cape budget is spent in poor communities. [Interjections.] No, you do not live there. You would not know ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, Members. Order, please!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...the grant that the province transfers to municipalities with the presentation here by the Financial and Fiscal Commission and the National Treasury...you must listen to this. They came here, it's not our product, it is the product of the ANC nationally. They came to us in this Chamber to say we are happy with the Western Cape. [Interjections.] No, they came. You cannot pause them, because your President also with the pillars that were mentioned earlier ...no, no, no. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Your President ... Speaker, let me go to the next point. There has been an issue with the ICT in especially the rural communities, their municipalities. And the Department of Local Government came in, led by Minister Anton Bredell in absentia. This department that he led intervened and said let us serve a better way of managing ICT and at times having a shared programme so that each municipality, despite being far, despite lacking the kind of expertise, can have a very good ICT support system. And I am sure they cannot say no to this one.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngqasela, your last sentence, your time is expired.

Mr M MNQASELA:: They disturbed me. Alright. [Interjections.] Let me say in closing that all municipalities in the province now have functioning MPAC's and as a result MPAC's - the municipal public accounts committees - watch that money is spent properly. The last part ...[Interjections.]...and eventually what we have done is to launch...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Finish, please, hon member.

Mr M MNQASELA: What we have done finally is to have the symposium of local government in this province and launched WCAPA which is Western Cape Association of Public Accounts Committee which I am chairing. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order! Thank you, Minister. I see the hon Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker, as the Chairperson of the Standing Committee for Human Settlements I am happy to report that the Department of Human Settlements received a clean audit for the financial year ending 31st March 2014. [Interjections]. I would also like to thank the Committee members for the monitoring oversight functions throughout the year and for their approval of the adjustment of Appropriation B(5) of 2014. More appreciation goes for the contribution to hold the Department accountable, and while we are on the road of being accountable, on behalf of the Minister I would like to challenge hon member Ms Dijana that she needs to prove that the Minister's cousin [Interjections.]... she needs to prove that the Minister's

cousin is receiving preference because of him and if she can gather proof, then we will resign, and if you don't get the proof you do resign as a member of Parliament. The department has committed [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members, order!

An HON MEMBER: You resign if you can't prove. [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Order, please! Hon Ms Dijana and hon Minister Winde, order please.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you. The department has committed itself to actualising the concept of integrated and sustainable human settlements and to continue on its transversal management approach with limited resources. Guided by the National Development Plan 2030 and 2040, the department decided to focus on three areas in order to maximise the impact regarding the delivery of human settlements in order to deal with problems such as in-migration, [inaudible] infrastructure and limited resources. And in doing that they concentrate on upgrading informal settlements in order to provide basic services to all citizens, strengthening partnership with the private sector in order to increase affordable houses for people aiming above the free subsidy threshold. [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: If the members can keep quiet, because the members of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements approved what the department

is delivering. So if you can keep quiet and listen because they know what's happening, and you don't know. Even in the face of adversity the department was able to introduce alternative building technologies on the Delft Symphony Project to assist the suitability of [inaudible] building methods. We feel the subsidy might [inaudible]. This was met with community resistance which was diminished once beneficiaries were able to see and occupy their completed houses.

The sector education and training authority in collaboration with the department is in the process of endorsing three training programmes to uplift and upskill unemployed youths [Interjection.] ...thereby empowering the communities to assist themselves in terms of their housing needs.

I am happy to report that the department aided all 24 municipalities by cleaning up the housing demand database of all duplications and deceased persons, thereby ensuring a true reflection of beneficiaries.

In addition the department developed and approved the following policies: municipal guidelines for responding to farm residents' housing needs in the Western Cape and policies to improve title transfer in Greenfields subsidy housing projects. Two policies have been developed for the financial year under review, which is a framework policy of the selection of housing beneficiaries in ownership-based subsidy projects. This is to enhance the fairness and transparency in the selection of beneficiaries, by defining set norms and standards. Regarding the policy to improve title transfer in new

Greenfield subsidy housing projects, the essential goal of the policy is to achieve timeous transfers of title deeds to housing beneficiaries in new Greenfields projects. [Interjections.]

Further, here to the hon member Ms Dijana, the department in collaboration with the City of Cape Town should develop a contingency plan to deal with land invasions and evictions. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Maseko please finish.

Ms L M MASEKO: The Committee recommended that...[Interjections].

The SPEAKER: Hon member your time is up, please finish.

Ms L M MASEKO: Once again I reiterate my appreciation for the department's clean audit outcome for the year under review and I request that this House adopts this report. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Members, can we just try and reduce the level of buzz in the House, please. The hon member Mr Paulsen will now address us.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, Madam Speaker. For two weeks we were presented with annual reports of the various departments of the Western Cape Government. The reports were almost oblivious of the prevailing conditions out there. I see we even received trinkets which say that we're a Western

Cape Government that cares; we must stop believing our own propaganda.
[Laughter.] [Interjections].

Most departments in the Western Cape Government, especially the Department of Education, the Department of Community Safety along with Health are mere band aids applied to gaping wounds that exist here and everywhere else in South Africa, so if you want some help there's some Band-Aid here. [Interjections.]

Education in South Africa is no different from any other capitalist country. More than 45% of learners have dropped out before reaching matric and the department's failure to highlight this very important fact is evidence that this government wishes to ensure that there is a steady supply of cheap labour and the State's commitment to effect a person's right to education is reduced. Furthermore it is regulated that no person is allowed to leave school before the stipulated age. Why then do we see so many dropouts prior to Grade 10? Another shocking revelation is the department's admission that the statistics contained in this annual report are not reliable.

Moving to community safety, drug and gangsterism are major crime activities that exist in black communities. Drugs form the major economy in impoverished communities and the middlemen for this economy are the gang bosses. They are the middlemen because not even the drug industry is controlled by blacks. It is also part of white monopoly capital. The MEC for this department is therefore just an ambassador for white monopoly capital

maintaining a stable drug economy. The Department of Community Safety was sincere about eradicating our communities from the scourge of gangsterism and drugs. Then what role will those recycled old white men in the guise of consultants play in achieving this? [Interjections.]

Let us look at the portfolio of that professional farmer, MEC Botha. I see he is not here. He is the owner of several farms. I don't know whether to classify him as a land owner or a land thief. [Laughter.] He is the owner by night and his day job is to manage the death of the working class. Those institutions, those mortuaries are merely an attempt to provide health care to the suffering class. If the defence is that you build those facilities, hon member Mnqasela, in an attempt to provide health care to the suffering class...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, order hon member Mr Paulsen.

An HON MEMBER: Order, I just want to know if any member can call another member in this House a thief? I object strongly to that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, would you care to explain the statement that you made? You indicated that the Minister was a thief by night or something to that effect.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Madam Speaker, can I please continue...

The SPEAKER: No, now please we need to go back to that. Clarify.

Mr M N PAULSEN: He is the owner of several farms and I don't know whether to classify that as land owner or land thief. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: And then the next statement...?

Mr M N PAULSEN: He is the owner by night and his day job is to manage the death of the working class.

An HON MEMBER: There's no speech, there's no speech.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, I think it would be unparliamentary to call a fellow member a thief. If that is what you are intimating by referring directly to the Minister of Health, I would ask you to withdraw, please.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Is he going to give back the land? I withdraw. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, I am not saying this tongue in cheek, this is a serious matter...

Mr M N PAULSEN: I'm serious, too. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, on a point of order, member Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, his next sentence is probably worse, because – and I would like him to read it again – essentially he is also calling the member a murderer. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Madam Speaker, I got an extra minute this week but they're taking that minute and some more. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, for the record, the clock is stopped on a point of order, but we need clarity around that statement so will you please read the next statement.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Those institutions, those mortuaries are merely an attempt to provide health care to the suffering class.

An HON MEMBER: No, no.

Mr M N PAULSEN: If the defence is that you...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: It was the sentence after calling him a land thief...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, hold on , we are pressed for time, I think in the interests of getting to the facts I will refer to Hansard and come back to the House with a ruling. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr M N PAULSEN: So if your defence is that you build those facilities, those hospitals, then tell us who benefits most from the construction projects? It is white monopoly capital. [Interjections.] Our failures will be addressed by Social Development one day. Not so, MEC Fritz? But of course with that dwarfish budget that one day is very far in the future. MEC Madikizela, don't you just miss the land occupation campaigns? Because if you were to go back to your former, truly, honourable self, you would admit that the Department of Human Settlements lacks humanity. Awaiting a home is like a lottery; the shock of being told you're a beneficiary could even cause one's death. MEC for Transport and Public Works, the reward for showing complete distaste for educating black children is to manage the front office of the white monopoly capital...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, you may finish, your time has expired.

Mr M N PAULSEN: MEC AWB (A W Bredell), he seems like such a nice man, he really does. So I wonder why he would punish municipalities where his party does not govern? He treats them like proverbial stepchildren, and I'm going to make a pact with him...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, your time is up, please finish.

Mr M N PAULSEN: If he makes sure that those stepchildren get better treatment next year, I'll praise fish for swimming. Thank you very much.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms D A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. While the ANC lambasts the DA on almost every aspect of the Annual Report, maybe the ANC should read the *Business Day* today where the Western Cape – and I have to admit Gauteng too, so let's give credit where credit is due – have been acknowledged as the top two provinces for clean audits. May I just reiterate, that's 18 out of 23 clean audits in the province. So we do need to acknowledge credit where credit is due. Clean audits should be encouraged and not pooh-poohed. And then with regard to hon member Paulsen, I would like to just add that his declaration of assets involves more than one house; the hon member is not a poor member, as far as I remember he owns seven properties, so may we just speak about ownership. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Madam Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

Mr M N PAULSEN: It is a point of order. Madam Speaker, the hon member has no proof of that information, she should not mislead the house.

The SPEAKER: It is not a point of order, hon member Mr Paulsen.

Ms D A SCHÄFER: The Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture considered the Annual Report of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism and its reporting entities the Western Cape Tourism Trade and Investment Promotion Agency called WESGRO and the Western Cape Liquor Authority for the year ending 31 March 2014. I am happy to report an unqualified audit for the Department and its entities. The Department's key focus is to support the creation of an enabling economic environment to achieve this goal. The Department focuses specifically on five key areas, namely the growth of the economy, reducing the level of unemployment, improving overall business confidence, increasing infrastructure investment and skills development. And may I just say that it is very important that this Department remains a success, because it creates the environment for business to grow in this province. One of the successes of the department specifically is the Red Tape Reduction Unit, which has

already addressed in excess of 90% of the queries raised. The sector and trade development have created more than 700 jobs and the establishment of the Saldanha IDZ and the rollout of broadband are two projects that will continue to drive the Western Cape as a competitive and attractive place for business. In terms of youth unemployment, the work and skills programme is key to providing paid internship for school leavers. Following its successful merger with Cape Town Roots Unlimited, WESGRO took ownership of a revised mandate of promoting trade and tourism and investment into Cape Town and the Western Cape and is responsible to promote and market Cape Town and the Western Cape as a preferred destination of tourism and business. The mandate of the Western Cape Liquor Authority is also threefold, to regulate and facilitate liquor licence holders in the Western Cape and reduce illegal liquor trading to promote the responsible use of liquor in the Western Cape. Its strategic objectives are to improve compliance of liquor authority and improving compliance of liquor authority by issuing licences and monitoring the conditions to which they are being used. And also most importantly to reduce negative socio-economic impact of liquor abuse. [Interjections.]

We will also turn our attention to the Department of Agriculture and its entity the Cape Agency for Sustainable Integrated Development in Rural Areas, known as CASIDRA, for the year ending 31 March, who has for the last three consecutive years, 2011, 2012, and 2013, been named by the South African Institute for Government Auditors as the South African department with the best annual report. We need to give them credit for that. And the

Western Cape Department of Agriculture has a broadened extensive mandate to provide a wide range of development research and farmer support and farmworker programmes to the agricultural community in the Western Cape. What must be commended again, is the Agriculture Department with the prestige farmworker forum in South Africa. CASIDRA must also be noted as a 25 year old listed company which serves as the official implementation agency for the Department of Agriculture in the Provincial Government of the Western Cape as a whole. CASIDRA is therefore responsible to plan and implement all the development programmes and projects for the Western Cape Provincial Government. Both departments for the year under review and the entities must be commended for the audit outcomes and the hard work that both HOD's did to achieve the outcomes as set out in the report and for being so accessible to the Standing Committee. The committee request that the House considers this report.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Olivier.

†UMnu R T OLIVIER: Somlomo ingxelo yonyaka yingxelo ejonga umsebenzi esiwenzileyo kunyaka odluleyo. Ukuba yinto esiyiqondayo ukuba yiyo leyo ithetha ukuba xa siza kujonga kule ngxelo yonyaka osandula ukudlula, izinto nje ezimbalwa ngakumbi kwezemfundo. Sibona kukho sisixa mali esingangekhulu elinamashumi amathu anesibhozo lezigidi zeerandi esiza kugqithiselwa kweminyaka ngenxa yokuba izikolo zingakhiwanga okanye zingagqitywanga kwangethuba. Leyo yimali ebinokusetyenziswa kwezinye iinkalo ukunceda abantu bethu baphume kule ndala sihleli sikuyo. Yimali

ephoswa kwingxowa enomngxuma ngulo rhulumente weDemocratic Alliance. Simosha imali yabarhafi . kukho izikolo ezibini endifuna ukuzikhankanya, iTouwsratten Primary School eseGeorge neBrackenfell. Bekufanele ukuba sele zinikezelwe ngoNovemba, azikanikezelwa. Loo nto yinto esiyicaphula kule ngxelo nisinike yona. Kukho izikolo kwingxelo ezine ezitsha ekuthiwe ngokwesicwangciso somsebenzi wonyaka eziza kwakhiwa. Asiziboni zigqityiwe, zinikezelwe. Nithi masiyamkele ingxelo phantsi kwezo meko zinjalo. Sivile kule veki iphelileyo njengokuba besisitsho imini yonke, kuba kaloku sisoloko sithetha into enye. Ngabantwana abalishumi lamawaka anesihlanu abangekabhaliswa. Abazazi ukuba baye phi, bajikeleza ezitalatweni. Bahamba baye kuqhekeza ezi zikolo sithetha ngazo kuba kaloku thina asikwazi ukubafaka ezikolweni kwangethuba. Somlomo, zizinto ezo esithi lo rhulumente makazithathele kuya, angazibaleki yingxaki yakhe. Makazise ebahlalini afune ukuba ancedwe engakwazi ukuzinceda kwayena. Le ke yingxaki eza kubangela ukuba abantwana okanye iinkokheli zangomso zingakwazi ukuhambela phambili kuba singakwazi ukubafaka ezikolweni kwangethuba. Somlomo izinto eziza kuthi zenzeke ngenxa yezi zinto, siza kubona abantwana abangekho zikolweni bemitha phambi kwexesha, besitya ezi ziyobisi uthetha ngazo, bengena kula maqela emigewu uthetha ngawo kuba abanantio yakwenza. Sifuna ke kungamane kugxekwa uthontelwano kweli phondo ngoba la manani sithetha ngawo ngamanani akhoyo ngoku, phambi kokuba abantwana bakwamanye amaphondobawelele apha. Ndinexhala ke Somlomo ngabantwana abaphuma phakathi esikolweni. Umzekelo ngowama 2012, iklasi yematriki yaqala ngowama 2001 ngenani elisi 1.1 isigidi, kodwa abo bantu baya besihla bathi befika kwisigaba

seshumi babe besisigidi. Kwaba kubi kakhulu kuba bathi befika kwimatriki babe bengamakhulu amahlanu amawaka. Loo nto ithetha ukuba ikhona ingxelo yokuphuma phakathi kwabantwana kweli phondo.

*Madam Speaker, an annual report is a report that looks into the work we have done in the previous year. If we understand that to be what it is, that means when we look at the report of the past years\few areas especially education, we see that there is an amount of R138 million that is going to be passed on to the next year because schools were not completed or built in time. That is money that could have been used in other areas to help our people get out of the suffering they are in. That is money that is being thrown into a leaking bag by the Democratic Alliance government. We are wasting tax payers' money.

There are two schools that I want to mention, Touwsratten Primary school in George and Brackenfell. They should have been handed over in November, they have not. That is what we get from the report you have given us. There are four new schools in the report that were supposed, according to the annual performance plan, to be built. We do not see them completed and handed over. You say we must accept the report under those circumstances. We heard last week as we said this morning because we always repeat the same thing. There are 10 500 children who are not yet registered. They do not know where to go, they roam the streets. They go and break into the same schools we are talking about because we cannot register them on time.

Madam Speaker, these are the things we say this government must take upon themselves and resolve and not run away from because it is their problem. They must take them to the communities and ask for assistance as they cannot help themselves. This is a problem that is going to cause these children or future leaders to have no direction because we cannot register them in schools on time.

Madam Speaker, what is going to happen because of these things? We are going to see children who are not in schools fall pregnant before time, and use the same drugs you are talking about, joining the gangs you are talking about because they have nothing else to do. We want you to stop blaming it on influx into this province because the numbers we are talking about are the figures we have now, before children from other provinces come here. I am concerned, Madam Speaker, about children who drop out of schools. For example in 2012, a matric class started in 2001 with 1.1 million children, but by the time they got to Grade 10 they were 1 million, and when they got to matric they were 500 000. That means there is a problem of drop outs in this province.

†Madam Speaker, under the ANC Government the drop-out rate was constantly decreased by 46% in 2006 to 42% in 2009 whereas under the DA-led government it has steadily increased to 44% in 2013. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is empirical evidence. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: How can the public continue to be failed in terms of registering particularly kids at farm schools. The case in point in this regard is the Gouda School where kids on farms must travel to Mbekweni and in Paarl 45 km and must get up 6am in the morning to be able to catch a train or bus and be back at 6pm in the evening, because there are no schools nearby. In fact, the Department is failing to create new schools for those kids. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: What is worse is the appalling condition of transportation of these kids. Case in point is the Rheenendal incident which all of us know about. Poor quality assurance done by this department, nothing is being done in terms of this transportation of schools. Is this government really committed in addressing this epidemic that continues to entrap the rural farm communities in the past, undermining the gains of our young democratic society? Is there any explanation when you look at the Department of Local Government's exodus of senior personnel to other institutions? Is the department doing anything to address this issue and this is one area that we have also picked up in the report. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ...Undisputed...

Mr R T OLIVIER: We are accepting that there is clean audit, but is that clean

audit really translating to the service delivery, as you could see in this year under review the increasing service delivery protests from municipalities, while we are boasting about clean audits. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr R T OLIVIER: These are facts. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members!

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is a question that we need to answer. The question that the DA needs to answer is whether they are really serious about addressing the backlogs of schools, are they in a position to address the exodus of senior officials, are they in a position to address the increase protest marches from our communities and municipalities? Madam Speaker, would you believe that this DA ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Is it a point of order hon member Ms Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, I just want to ask is it parliamentary for an hon member to stick out his tongue at me? [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Who's that, who's that?

The SPEAKER: Proceed.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I want to make a case of sexual harassment, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Mnqasela ...

Mr M MNQASELA: I am sorry, Speaker, I have no answer for the hon member. [Laughter] I am disappointed at her. She is misleading you and the House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. May we then proceed. [Interjections.] Order, please, hon members. Allow hon member Mr Olivier to finish.

†UMnu R T OLIVIER: Nimosha ixesha ... (Akevakali). Somlomo umbuzo wethu uthi, ukwamkela le ngxelo ezi zinto sizikhankanyileyo ithini iDemocratic Alliance ukuzilungisa? Enkosi.

*You are wasting time ... [Inaudible]. Madam Speaker, our question is, in accepting this report, what is the Democratic Alliance doing to fix the things we have mentioned? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Max. [Interjections.]

Mr L H MAX: As a Chairperson and a member of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works it is my honour to report to this House the

results of some of the Standing Committee's observations for the year ended 31 March 2014. The Department of Public Works and Transport has a constitutional obligation to execute a very important role in all aspects of service delivery to the people of the Western Cape. Obviously there can be no service delivery without infrastructure. No infrastructure, no service delivery.

An HON MEMBER: We agree there.

Mr L H MAX: I am pleased to share with this House that the department achieved an unqualified audit opinion for the year under review.
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That's the only thing they do!

Mr L H MAX: And obtained productivities of Africa's most productive public entity award for its project backlog in reaching more than 21 000 transport operating licences which were cleared to ensure continued operational efficiency. To deliver its services more effectively to its client, a new organisational structure was introduced. As part of the department's regional focus on unlocking the potential of the Western Cape through infrastructure investment, a Western Cape Infrastructure Framework was developed. Furthermore, sixteen major road infrastructure projects were completed. And that is unlike the claims of hon member Olivier.[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: More people don't have cars.

Mr L H MAX: The department is also leading South Africa's first known Metro Integrated Public Transport System. [Interjections.] Aimed at enhancing growth mobility.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr L H MAX: George was adopted as a pilot project for the rollout to larger cities.

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Mr Max, I think ... are you raising a point of order?

Mr M MNQASELA: There is a member in this House, who says: "my shit bus". I want to know is that parliamentary? I am very disappointed in him. Hon member in the red.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, will you stand, please?

Mr M N PAULSEN: The hon member is misleading, I said "MyCiti bus".

The SPEAKER: No, no, I heard you saying "My shitty bus". So will you please withdraw that hon member Paulsen?

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Laughter] I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed, hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Now what I just said, is unlike the claims of hon member Olivier, who said that this government is not involved in transport. Now I don't know where he is living, because everybody else in this province, when they enter this province, is telling me – black and white – that our roads are the best. [Interjections.] [Applause.] It is proper infrastructure, it is clean, is usable, rich and poor use these roads. [Interjections.] The alarming high number of fatalities ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr L H MAX: ..the fatalities on our roads which also include scholar transport is for the committee a serious concern, but we are very pleased that the department embarked upon a campaign called: “It takes a second to save a life.” This campaign already yielded a 30% reduction since 2009 in road fatalities. The alignment between the provincial and national spheres of government in terms of public transport is also appreciated. The committee also commended the department for being awarded the floating trophy for the overall best performing department for the monitoring performance assessment tool award for 2013. Now this is unlike hon member Davids’ allegation that there is no service delivery to the poor in this province. [Interjection.] Now you know...

The SPEAKER: Order, please. [Interjections.]

Mr L H MAX: This award was awarded by the President's Office.
[Interjections.] Now in other words what she is saying

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr L H MAX: ...is that the Department of the President is insane in handing out awards to the Western Cape for doing nothing. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We want the output, hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: So on this particular point, it was brought to my attention by the hon Minister that paragraph 2.2.2 of the report which reads as follows: "loss of life..."

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Max, sorry, your time is up, but finish your sentence. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, there is a point of order, hon member Mr Max.

Mr P UYS: Will you please rule, is it correct for an MEC who is the

executive, to interfere in the report of the legislature? [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Ah that is rubbish.

Mr P UYS: That is why they do not even speak here!

Mr M G E WILEY: The report is weak.

The SPEAKER: Hon Members, kindly refrain...sorry, Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: If the member wants to put an amendment, he is entitled to put an amendment irrespective of where the information comes from.

Mr P UYS: [Inaudible] ...is in the report.

The SPEAKER: Very well. Hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker, is it parliamentary for a Chief Whip to say “rubbish” in the House?

The SPEAKER: Hon Members, you leave me with a dilemma. There are too many conversations going on. I am going to have to go and review Hansard and get back to you. Hon member Mr Max, have you finished?

Mr L H MAX: May I just table the Amendment, Madam Speaker? The

Amendment should read, par 2.2.2: “Loss of life during 2013 on roads in the country amounted to approximately 17 000 people annually at a cost of R308 billion.”

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Is it a point of order?

An HON MEMBER: The order, Madam Speaker, is when you have told a person that they must just summarise, you are allowing more than that.

The SPEAKER: I asked him to complete his sentence.

An HON MEMBER: ...Making a statement.

An HON MEMBER: Madam Speaker, could you clarify for the House. What is the procedure to formally bring an amendment, because we are sitting here not having received any notice of an amendment to the report that was tabled. There is a verbal assertion and I am just concerned that the Chairperson of the committee may be under the impression that that constitutes a formal motion for an amendment, so could you please just clarify how we are going to deal with this or any other amendment to the report.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: The point that the hon member Mr Max refers to is that there is a quotation in that report about national statistics and it says it is the

provincial statistics [Interventions.] May I finish ...[Interventions.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members.

Mr M G E WILEY: I asked to address the Speaker. I am addressing the Speaker. You have been here as long as I have, you understand how the process works. Madam Speaker, if this House approves the report in its current condition, then the whole House - because all the committees have approved the individual reports - has approved it; if you approve it, you are approving it with a mistake in it, so it is being brought to your attention. [Interjections.] If the House approves the report in its current condition, it will be approving a flawed report. Now that it has been brought to our attention that there is a flaw in it, it is prudent for the House to make the amendment to ensure that the House passes a good report.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I have just been guided by the table staff and they have informed me that they can indeed bring an amendment. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, can I just clarify. Thank you for that response, but is it up to the member during his participation during his speech in the participation to move that, are we now formally being asked in the middle of the speech to second that amendment, or will it be brought later, please?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Dugmore. I think to bring clarity, when we deal with the actual report in the next session the amendment will be presented and then the House would need to vote on it. So it does not form part of the exercise here. Thank you. [Interventions.] Hon member Mr Kivedo, I see you.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Agbare Speaker, baie dankie. Ek rapporteer graag oor die Jaarverslag van die Departement Onderwys as volg. En ek dink wat belangrik is, ek wil net so 'n bietjie kontekstualiseer en sê waarbinne die onderwysfunksie dan plaasvind en dit is vir die DA, dit is vir die ANC, dit is vir die ACDP en ook vir die EVV. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit is die skep van 'n oop geleentheid samelewing vir almal wat dit wil hê. 'n Instaatstellende omgewing.

'n AGB LID: [Onhoorbaar.] ...ons skole.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: En dit is wat bevorderlik is vir leerderonwikkeling, groei, werk en 'n lewe waaraan mense waarde kan heg. [Tussenwerpsels.] Die belangrikste uitkomst van onderwys... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon member Mr Kivedo, there is a point of order, can you take your seat, please? Hon member Mr Tyatyam, is it a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, it is not a point of order, but there is no translation

here. [Interjections.] So I do not know, because I want to listen to the hon member Mr Kivedo.

The SPEAKER: Have you got channel 2 Afrikaans to English? [Interjections]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, they are gone now.

An HON MEMBER: It is still in Afrikaans. [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: I can continue in Afrikaans?

The SPEAKER: I have just been informed that it is channel 6.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Channel 6. Are you comfortable hon member Tyatyam? [Interjections.] Thank you. Daar's hy.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, you may proceed.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Thank you. Die belangrikste uitkomst van onderwys is die herstel en die verbreding van integriteit en waardigheid. The Department had strategic goals, the first one to improve language and mathematics in primary schools. Secondly, to increase numbers and passes in the National Senior Certificate and thirdly reducing the number of under performing schools. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Mr Kivedo.

An HON MEMBER: Madam Speaker, they are not translating, they are talking amongst themselves, I can hear them. They are not translating.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Well, I will have to get a service officer to check on that.

Mr B D KIVEDO: [Laughter]. It has arrived. I will speak in English.

The SPEAKER: Has it been restored, hon members?

An HON MEMBER: Not yet unfortunately.

An HON MEMBER: You can speak English, it is fine.

Mr B D KIVEDO: No, there is no problem.

The SPEAKER: It has now been restored.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Has it been restored? Thank you. Do not tell me we are hallucinating, hearing voices. [Interjections.] Are you comfortable? Right. The 2013/14 report indicated that significant progress has been made entertaining these goals and now as an example the pass rate for National Senior Certificate are 86,5. And now I am turning back to my dear colleague

and fellow hon member, the hon Cameron Dugmore. As a former astute Minister of Education, I am going to give you some homework. I hope you would not mind. You know, my name is part of the education process. If you can just go and Google James Myburg [Inaudible.] It is under the title “The real matric pass rate.” 30 June 2013 and the crux of that is that the combination of retention and pass rate is still the highest in the Western Cape. Hurrah! [Laughter]. Yes, but I will pass it on to you.[Interjections.] No fine, I give credit to Gauteng as well. Make no mistake. We are all South Africans, but I think you Google this brother.... [Interventions.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order. Will the hon member please take her seat? [Interjections.] Hon Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I didn’t hear the word translated “Hurrah”. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue, hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, the WCED administers independently a set Grade 3, 6, and 9 test in language and mathematics. They also undertake systemic tests with regards to annual national assessments, administered, tested and marked by external service providers. Now this my dear and hon colleagues leads to credibility, gaps are identified and rectified, it leads to improvement in language and mathematics, especially in the primary schools and the school performance can be equated with a healthy

and safe and secure school environment. I think that is what our hon member Theo Olivier alluded to. But we all know we have the same school project in place. I know the Bambanani fell away, but there are certain mechanisms in place to keep our school children safe. Then there is also the school resource officer pilot, responsible for the construction of 158 new schools, the replacement of 33 schools and also the maintenance of 183 schools. As far as the professional development is concerned, emphasis has been placed on the upgrading of qualified teachers in the mathematics and science. I think overall we can be quite happy and also comfortable and satisfied with the outcomes in terms of this report; I know there is room for improvement, but we are moving in that direction, but the emphasis is not only on quantity, but quality as well. We are not only chasing numbers. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] You see, that is the main thing. And then also the step-up as far as ELSSEN is concerned, the schools for learners with special disabilities, the technical as well as the skills development schools as well as ABET for adults.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, your time has expired. But just one sentence?

Mr B D KIVEDO: That can't be. I am sorry. My apologies, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr B D KIVEDO: [Interjections.] I will have to summarise then. Let me take

this opportunity. I really apologise. I get a little bit worked up. I just want to take this opportunity to thank all my Standing Committee: the DA, the ANC, as well as the ACDP. It is the pity we do not have the EFF there. All officials, the Minister of Education, Ms Schäfer, as well as our co-ordinators. Thank you very much for your hard work and we are looking for better results next time. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has now finally expired. The hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The DA-led government hides behind the veil of unqualified audit, as if it cares about the poor majority of this province. We know that clean or unqualified opinions are not equal to service delivery. [Interjections.] You must know that one. In all 99% of these departments of the government, they all under-spent with a whopping R411 008 million. The money that was not used, ...[Interjections.] ...it was supposed to have been used by the departments. There are many people who did not get service delivery, because your departments under the DA did not service our people. [Interjections.] And I can tell you amongst the problems that we have seen in SCOPA, one is that all these departments did not fill strategic posts ...[Interjections.]...There is poor service in the Department of the Premier, it is the weak link and none of you are raising that, you know. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: I must ask, Mr Deputy Speaker, how can service delivery improve if critical positions are vacant in the department? Not only for this term, but for the other financial years they have not been able to fill. I think it is going to be important that we must not allow and accept this shared services in the Department of the Premier to continue as they wish, not filling critical positions. Because unemployment here in this province is 35% and it includes graduates. People who are qualified need to be given an opportunity here. They must be given a chance by this government and I can tell you Premier you must be ashamed. She must be ashamed, because what have been reported by the AG is that her department is a cause of concern. Amongst the first is the leadership of that department. Is the compliance around the laws and legislation of the department being followed? The predetermined objectives are not being achieved by the department, by the management. Amongst other things in the predetermined objectives most of the targets that are being set in the APP were not achieved. How do we make sure that people get service delivery? It is important to make your unqualified audit or clean audit, but it is important to use the resources you are given to make sure that services are given to our people ...[Interjections.]... you know.

It is going to be important amongst other things that we have been told by the AG, that it casts across the department, that we have a challenge; there is cause for concern around the internal audit processes, so it is going to be important that we must not ... [Inaudible]... we are talking about the service

delivery to our people, particularly the people that suffer, the poor of the poorest. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who was that?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because people in Constantia and other affluent areas, they are benefiting...[Interjections.]...from you....[Interjections.]...your cousin is benefiting. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] And I can tell you the blame must be put centrally on the shoulders of the Premier, because in the Premier's department everything is centralised. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Your time is up. [Laughter.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Everything is centralised in that department and that cripples many departments. Many departments are becoming a cause of concern because one department has failed to make sure that they deliver and service other departments properly. That is why all other departments are getting red or yellow, because one department is supposed to do shared services around vacancies. Hon member Mr Wiley, if you do not know that vacancies, you must come, you are invited, you must come to SCOPA, so that we can go through this properly. Because when you do not employ the right people in the departments...[Interjections.]...that is what you get [Inaudible]. Many of the departments here lack leadership around the oversight of IT governance and IT governance affects our security. It affects our security and we have been told by AG that that is one amongst the major challenges that

our government is having, and it is going to be important that we must accept, we must acknowledge other things that have happened so that we are able to move forward to rectify those things. I know that some of the senior staff ...[Interjections.]...cried yesterday to actually dispute what the AG was saying. We had to go to a special urgent meeting, because some of the senior managers tried to say that the AG is wrong and we told them yesterday that the AG is right and in fact some of them did not even pitch or come to the meeting, because they knew that they were trying to do something that was wrong, trying to say that what the AG has reported was actually flawed, which it was actually not. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: SCOPA! [Inaudible]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Amongst the causes of concern that we must have as members in this Parliament is that conditional grants...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Mr Tyatyam, just finish off, your time is already expired.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, it is fine. Conditional grants were not spent properly and some of the conditional grants had to be rollovers. You are given money to spend and we must not be surprised tomorrow when National or other departments are refusing to give us money, because we are not spending the money for taxpayers. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time is expired. Thank you. Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have a formal speech prepared and I just want to make sure that in terms of the process of the House, do I submit the formal speech ...[Inaudible]...because I also need to respond to some of the things the member said to just unlock the untruths. [Interjections.] So I will try to mix it. Just to quickly go back to hon member Dyantyi on the issue of yesterday. Member Dyantyi, the reason why they came back to SCOPA yesterday was to rectify information so that the report goes out. It does not go out with bad information written on...[Interjections.] And if you have read your report ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...before the time and in the commencement it would have been in the report. It is important that is rectified, because it is information in the public that is wrong. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon member, I will try to get order to the House, is that what your point of order is?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can I ask the hon member

Ms Beerwinkel that I want some quiet before the member can proceed please.
I have to talk to you once a day. Please continue.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: This whole debate this afternoon was very unfortunately rationalised by the opposition party. They focus on the angle that they had no concrete input as to why things happened...[Interjections.]...they are just rationalising. The report that Minister Dugmore is referring to, it is written in the report when we are going to receive the information. Yet, now he sits here and says they never received the information from the officials. Of course you are never going to receive it, because we have done the report yesterday and part of the process of what we are doing now is finalising the report. [Interjections.] I am going there. The committees and guys that you had presented to us, we thought these guys were genuine who came to SCOPA and were public and were coming to present to us in the meetings. Yesterday when I was at the by-elections, guess who were at your desk? Those same officials from the Mitchells Plain office who came to sit in our meetings, giving concerns, so you obviously sent them there to come and waste our time in the committee while you are sitting in the by-elections in Grabouw yesterday, so really...[Interjections.]....

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: In terms of the strategic posts we identified, we said in SCOPA in all the other committees we have identified a couple of

vacancies that the department already started filling and obviously next week they will be filled. The way you indicated with these strategic posts was that it is high priority and was not filled, so Mr Tyatyam, you are misleading the House. But let me continue my prepared speech or I am going to waste time. [Interjections.]

The Standing Committee on Cultural Affairs and Sport commends the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport for ensuring a socially inclusive creative and active Western Cape. The 2013/14 Annual Report highlights the different achievements which prove that the department has delivered on the strategic objectives and their strong energy between good corporate governance and effective service delivery. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I cannot hear in terms of this discussion...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I am trying to find out who the culprit is, but it appears to be hon member Ms Davids.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Can I help you, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If it is hon member Ms Davids I will ask her to please refrain. Hon Minister Meyer, yes, I did identify the culprit. Thank you. Please continue.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, we just want to congratulate the department for receiving a clean audit under the leadership of Dr Ivan Meyer, the former MEC and the new MEC, Nomafrrench Mbombo; we have no doubt that they will receive it again this year. They received some outstanding awards over the last year, but I am not going to go through it due to time constraints, but one was the Best Participation Social Project Award, more recently they also received the Public Service Award for being the second best department in the country when promoting ethics and integrity, which is brilliant. They are only one of two of the nine departments countrywide of Departments of Cultural Affairs and Sport that have received clean audits. So it shows you that they are doing something right, they support major events, more recently the Cape Town Jazz Festival, the Cape Town Carnival, the Burger Fees, Suidoosterfees, they are now making big inroads into our libraries, they are spreading 121 libraries into the rural areas. We just want to commend the MEC and the HOD for the work they have done for the last year and wishing them the best of our support, and in our committee we have received support from the ruling party and from the other parties as well to say they support the budget vote, just noting that the vacancies will not impact on the delivery next year, so I hereby table the report and say that we support the[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, you are

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Anyone to support the vote, anyone to vote for the

report to be approved?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is expired. Order, I see the Hon member Ms Marais.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek wil net graag agb lid Dugmore wat 'n regte Rip van Winkel is herinner dat die 27 prioriteitsareas is deur Premier Lynne Browne self gestop as gevolg van die disfunksionaliteit daarvan. Niks met die DA te doen nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

AGB LEDE: Hoor! Hoor!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, Mental Health is not simply about the absence of mental illness, but rather the presence of mental health and wellbeing. Mental health deals with how you feel about yourself, realising your own potential, how you relate to others and how you deal with the opportunities and challenges of everyday life. Mental health is just as important as our physical health. It is high time we start looking after our minds and in turn our wellbeing. The Annual Report of the Western Cape Department of Mental Health and Social Development states that help is available from professionals, including counsellors, nursing practitioners, social workers, occupational therapists, psychologists, general practitioners and psychiatrists. A range of treatments can be obtained by community health centres, district hospitals and specialised psychiatric hospitals. Drugs and alcohol abuse continue to play an important causative role in emergency

cases and hospital admissions. Heavy drug abuse can lead to mental illness. People who are at risk for mental illness, increase that risk when they abuse drugs. Minister Botha and Minister Fritz and the departments are commended for rendering specialist services for people with mental illnesses and drug abuse. The Annual Report of Health reflects the service pressures that continue to impact on expenditure and staff capacity especially in the large district and central hospitals of the Metro. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order, hon members.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Even with this pressure the department is the best performing health department in the country. Early childhood development is significant to the future of our children and our society as a whole. The Department of Social Development has substantively increased the ECD unit cost funding to increase compliance to legislative norms and standards and the opportunity to remunerate ECD practitioners better. I need to mention that society, media and authorities often ignore and neglect the violence experienced by women and girls living with disabilities. The services provided by the Department of Social Development to victims of crime and violence as well as the integrated programmes and services to people living with disabilities and their families are commended. I am extending an invitation to all the members in the House to visit a Youth Café in Rocklands or Vanguard Mall. Through these café's young people are reached for training and development programmes. Health promotions and social cohesion seeks the development of community and individual measures

which can help people to develop lifestyles that can maintain and enhance a state of wellbeing. We can only live lives of value if we take personal responsibility for our own wellbeing. Both the Department of Health and Social Development acknowledge that a single issue approach to wellness is ineffective. An integrated approach is necessary and are clearly portrayed in the implementation of the vision and mission to provide quality health for all and to a self-reliant society.

Adjunk Speaker, my dank aan die lede van die Staande Komitee en aan die koördineerders vir die opwindende ses maande wat verby is. Baie dankie.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agb lid. The hon member Mr Lentit. Order!

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. You know, before I get to my speech, I just want to say that next week when we discuss the adjustment of Appropriation Budget, this side of the House will once again [Inaudible] the hon member from the ANC, member Tyatyam, that the National Government gave money to the Western Cape that some of the other eight provinces indicated they won't spend before the end of the next financial year. We, this province, received money for education, for housing and for public works. [Interjections.] I thank you for the opportunity to[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, please allow the member an opportunity to speak.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank you ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may continue.

Mr R B LENTIT: Can I get my time?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, continue.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank you for the opportunity to participate in this important debate. I will now use this platform to report to the House as the Chairperson of the Standing Committee of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and the Annual Report outcomes of the department and its entity CapeNature for the 2013/14 financial year. The department was awarded with an unqualified audit report with findings which was due to unpredicted technical issues. The Auditor-General's report confirms that the department fulfilled its mandate through the practising of an accountable environment and planning legislative processes. The Accounting Officer's system for supply chain management was completed and implemented. The Western Cape Land Use Planning Act was approved at the end of the reporting financial year. The review of the Provincial Spatial Development Framework, which included the Growth Potential Study of Towns and Provincial Spatial Plan was completed. The State of the Environmental Outlook Report was released in 2013. The Western Cape Climate Change Strategy and action plan was finalised. The Waste

Management Licensing Plan was implemented and most of the province's waste disposal facilities were licensed. The annual Monitoring and Evaluation Report was ready on the implementation of municipal integrated waste management plans and integrated Waste Management Plans were assessed during the financial year.

We welcome the positive steps taken by die Department to develop a waste minimisation guideline. The focus on small business recyclers and to determine how construction waste could be utilised is a step in the right direction.

On Air Pollution, the remediation of contaminated sites was dealt with on a case-by-case basis as required under the National Environmental Management Act.

We thank the Department for their assistance to the 24 municipalities in the development of air quality management plans. We also encourage the remaining municipalities that have not yet adopted air quality plans, to comply as soon as possible. The Department also assisted municipalities in developing and drafting spatial development frameworks and their human settlement plans. We welcome the strong value based leadership team of Cape Nature that takes such excellent care of the biodiversity in the Western Cape.

Ek stem saam met agb lid Dijana dat vakante poste 'n groot probleem is, terwyl daar begrip is vir die probleem, moet dit met hernude ywer aangepak

word. En dit is maar al wat die agbare lid en ek as 'n uitdaging van die Departement kan noem, want dit is al wat sy genoem het van die hele Departement, want sy het nie gefokus op haar eie portfolio nie. It is under this leadership and the political will that the Department and the entity have progressed from a qualified audit report to an unqualified audit report. Despite tight budget controls, CapeNature performed well. Their control processes and procedures ensured that the necessary compliance was adhered to. Progress was made with the Management Effective Tracking Tool. This is a scoring method to apply to the management of the nature reserves which will be extended to include all the protected areas in the current financial year. The Department should take note of access roads to protected areas as this could impact on the ability of fire engines or ambulances to access areas during emergencies.

The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning is an important actor in the Western Cape Government's growth and jobs strategy. Dis goed dat die Departement ons plaaswerkers en ons arme mense van die platteland se vermoëns uitbrei deur opleidingsprogram wat werkskeppingsgeleenthede vir hulle in die bewaringsomgewing skep. As ons rondom ons kyk, dan is ekonomiese geleenthede en werkskeppingsgeleenthede oral om ons. Ek wil my amper verstout om te vra dat Minister Bredell en sy department moet oorweeg om navorsing te doen, me Beerwinkel,...

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: U tyd is verstreke, maak net klaar.

Mr R B LENTIT: ...oor hoe om die lekkerste wildevarc voor te berei – wat ‘n probleem is in die Overberg omgewing – dan kan die Buffeljags-vroue dit saam met die suurvye bemark; want dit is ‘n goeie werkskeppings- en bemagtigings inisiatief.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr R B LENTIT: Therefore I hereby ask that the House supports the report.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your report is accepted. Baie dankie. Please now listen carefully. We are going to adopt or consider the various reports one after the other. That concludes the debates on the different reports. I will now put the question on the reports individually.

I put the Report on the Annual Report of the Department of the Premier. Any objections to the report?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would just ask for clarity about the implications of 2.5 on page 175 of the tabling where the committee requested the department to provide the committee with a report by 20 November which is already past and those reports have not been provided to the Chairperson. Is there an implication of us adopting a report like this when that date is mentioned and the Premier’s department have failed to meet that deadline?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is very difficult for the Chair to intervene and to change a report now. The method to change a report is to come with an amendment. So the ideal situation would have been for somebody to come with an amendment to the House to change that. I take your point that the deadline is around the corner, but I cannot unilaterally change the report. So your remedy would be to propose an amendment? Then we just simply carry on then.

I ask the question: Any objection to the adoption of the report? No objection agreed to.

I put the Report on the Annual Report of the Provincial Parliament. Any objection to the report being adopted? No objection agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Provincial Treasury and its Entity the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board. No objection to the report being adopted? Report agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Community Safety. Are there any objections to the report being adopted? No objection, agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Education. No objection to the report being adopted? Agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Health. Any objection to the report being adopted? No objection, agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development. No objections to the report being adopted? Agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Human Settlements and its Entity the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal. No objections to the report being adopted? No objection, agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and its entity Cape Nature. No objections to the report being adopted? Agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Transport and Public Works and its trading entity Government Motor Transport upon which an amendment that were moved by the hon member Max. The amendment on page 208 of the ATC. Now I will read the amendment to members. In paragraph 2.2.2 right in the middle, the amendment is that the one sentence be omitted and be replaced by another sentence. The sentence that comes out, reads as follows:

Loss of life on roads in the Western Cape amounted to approximately 18 000 people annually at a cost of R308 billion. The amendment is that that

sentence be omitted and replaced by the following:

Loss of life during 2013 on roads in the country amounted to approximately 17 000 people annually at a cost of R308 billion.

I therefore put the amendment to the House. Mr Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Could you just read that again, because you said ‘loss of life 2013’. Just read that sentence again.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, the proposed amendment is as follows and I quote: “Loss of life during 2013 on roads in the country amounted to approximately 17 000 people annually at a cost of R308 billion.” So I put the amendment. Those in favour of the amendment, those in favour of the amendment, say “Aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against: No?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you agree there is no objection to the amendment being adopted? I therefore put the report as amended. No objection to the report as amended? Agreed to. Report is agreed to. We

continue.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Agriculture and its entity Cape Agency for Sustainable Integrated Development and Rural Areas, CASIDRA. Any objections to the report being adopted? No objections, agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism and its reporting entities, the Western Cape Tourism, Trade and Investment Promotion Agency and the Western Cape Liquor Authority. No objection to the report being adopted? No objection, agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, the Western Cape Cultural Commission, the Heritage Western Cape and the Western Cape Language Committee. No objection to the report being adopted? Agreed to.

I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Local Government. No objections to the report being adopted? The report is agreed to.

I put the report of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts on the Annual Reports of Departments, their entities and the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. No objection on the report being adopted? Report is agreed to.

That then brings us to the end of business for the day, it concludes the business for the day and the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 19:46