

---

THURSDAY, 27 AUGUST 2015

---

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p**

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Good afternoon members, I would like to welcome our guests in the gallery and would like to draw your attention as guests to the Rules, which are displayed in the gallery. Then I would like to appeal to the members and ask that, as we have a fairly tight programme, I would like you to try and stick to the timeslot. I am going to be pretty strict about timing, so let us try and get as close to the time as possible and I hope that we will have a good session. Thank you. Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198 precedence be given to the subject for discussion. I move.

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections? Then hon member Mr Olivier, are you objecting?

†UMnu R T OLIVIER: Qhwabani kaloku. \*Clap your hands.

An HON MEMBER: No!

Mr R T OLIVIER: Oh sorry.

The SPEAKER: No, I am just wondering what is going on here. If there are no objections and as I said, agreed to, the item on the Order Paper is the subject for discussion in the name of the hon Olivier. It is now your turn, as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon member Mr Olivier.

**THE FAILURE BY THE DA WESTERN CAPE GOVERNMENT TO  
PROVIDE QUALITY EDUCATION TO ALL**

(Subject for discussion)

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you Madam Speaker. I was in a hurry, I did not hear you asking for someone to object. But I could not object on the subject that I have proposed.

It is really a shame and an abomination for Premier Helen Zille's administration to continue failing the learners from the working class and poor communities in relation to ensuring that quality education is provided at all material times.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is why she is not here.

Mr R T OLIVIER: This is so, despite the fact that some of these communities like Mitchells Plain and others have voted this party into power. As we ended the 2014 academic year it was already reported that about 10 500 learners were not placed in schools for the 2015 in this province, yet, the WCED failed to put strategic plans in place to alleviate this problem. Truth be told, this province has hon MEC Schäfer, who is very uncaring, ignorant, arrogant and in many occasions adopts "I do not care attitude", which is wrong and must be condemned at all costs. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is wrong.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, I agree with [Inaudible.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: If I was hon Minister Schäfer, I would have done the honourable thing and I am sure you will know what that means.

WCED promised the allocation of additional mobile classrooms to schools,

additional textbooks for those late arrivals and teachers posts were included in the planning for 2015. However, the opposite has happened throughout the 2015 academic year.

On Wednesday, 21 January 2015, while learners in the more affluent areas commenced with class, others in the working class and poor communities gathered in tens, stood along the roads for transport, walked distances past empty affluent schools to attend schools in the working class community and others were still on the waiting list, not attending any school, and therefore not receiving education.

Mnr C M DUGMORE: Dis die waarheid hoor.

Mr R T OLIVIER: A recent survey by women on farms in Wellington, Wolseley, Grabouw and Stellenbosch revealed that many learners who walked more than five kilometres to school get robbed, beaten up and at least two girls were raped on their way to school. The Western Cape Government has the audacity to say they do not have adequate resources and manpower to protect learners travelling to and from school and that this is the responsibility of the police and the community. Really, this is disgusting. [Interjections.]

In Moorreesburg learners were left stranded with no transport to Piketberg because the affluent school is full. The question that must be asked, when is a school full? The reality of the matter is that in many poor communities a

school is built for 800 learners but accommodates 1 100 plus. In affluent communities the schools are built for 800. They have 600 and that is then perceived to be full. Is this a case that they are keeping schools divided based on the old outdated race classification? This is the response that the MEC needs to respond to.

At Bonteheuwel Cedar Primary School more than 500 children shared one toilet and teachers had to go to neighbouring schools after the school was gutted and vandalised. It took the WCED almost two weeks if not more, to provide mobile toilets, thereby undermining the dignity of school communities. By July more than 300 learners were without schools in Dunoon and it took residents including parents to protest for the Department to act. Clearly those learners have lost six months of teaching and learning.

In June it was reported at Mitchells Plain that about 59 learners had still not been placed in any school during this 2015 academic year. A similar situation was experienced in Mfuleni and surrounding area.

Hon Minister Schäfer, do the correct thing and resign.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I am not going to resign.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, resign please. Do the right thing.

Mr R T OLIVIER: In July the Dunoon parent Angel Zethu was reported

saying that two children have been on the waiting list for the past two years. About 100 pupils are still not placed in formal schools during this 2015 academic year.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Shocking!

Mr R T OLIVIER: This is extremely shocking. A similar situation was experienced in the surrounding communities as well. The safety of learners travelling with the school buses is another challenge facing poor communities. Recently a school bus overturned near Stellenbosch, leaving two children critically injured and a third was in a serious condition.

In the recent past few weeks the Scottsdene Senior Primary School in Kraaifontein, the Hawston Primary School in Hawston and other schools' debacle show the lack of political will on the part of the Western Cape Government to swiftly act and resolve problems affecting learners of those poor communities. Why were learners at home for two weeks? Where is the integrated strategy involving affected departments?

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle gee nie om nie.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Why were learners not accommodated at nearby schools in Kraaifontein? Why was the Elsie's River community not consulted that learners were transferred to a school in the Elsie's River area? [Interjections.]

These questions point to an uncaring honourable MEC and the DA Government. In Bonnievale, Wittedrift, Wolseley and many others similar situations exist. We want to question the preserve policy, which allows working class learners to be transported past a half-full affluent school to another working class school. Is this not wasteful and fruitless expenditure?

All of these frustrations have forced angry communities to lodge complaints with the office of the Public Protector and the Human Rights Commission to investigate the outrageous negligence action on the part of the MEC and Government. It is time, hon Minister Schäfer, to do the honourable thing and resign. Do us that favour. [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, asseblief tog!

Mr R T OLIVIER: One also wonders whether the following schools will be completed or were completed on time, namely Brackenfell Senior Primary School, Protea High, Brackenfell Masakane Primary. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier, your time has expired. Thank you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: In closing, Madam Speaker, our call is for this Minister, who is uncaring, arrogant, to resign. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Max. [Interjection.]

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, today I want to affirm that the Democratic Alliance is committed to redress the injustices, the failures of the past. Where we govern we are committed to reduce the distances learners have to travel to get to quality education. We are committed to replace all apartheid school infrastructure and we are committed to implement the norms and standards [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You do not look convinced! [Laughter.]

Mr L H MAX: ...for public schools infrastructure which was left untouched by the ANC ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L H MAX: ...when they were in power in the Western Cape.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

Mnr L H MAX: The legacy from apartheid means that a lot of learners live far away from the quality education provided by the Western Cape Government. [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gaan Porterville toe.

Mr L H MAX: The result of this is that learners have to spend much of



their... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, order.

Mr L H MAX: ... day on transport back and forth to their schools, meaning that the learners arrive tired at school and come back from school exhausted.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We do not believe what you are reading.

Mr L H MAX: This reminds me of my primary school days when I had to walk 15 kilometres to school and 15 kilometres back, while the kombi with the white children drove past me in the rain, wind and extreme heat, whilst I had to bite the dust. [Interjections.]

It therefore creates a stirring pride in my heart... [Interjection.]

Me M N GILLION: Dis nog net dieselfde.

Mr L H MAX: ... to be part of this DA-led Government, which is building and upgrading hostels across the province... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hostels. [Interjections.]

Mr L H MAX: ...and have invested almost R49 million in school hostels to increase access to schools for poorer learners living in rural areas.

Me S W DAVIDS: Dis Transvaal [Onduidelik]

Mr L H MAX: The Government wants to help all learners that want to access quality education and it is therefore reviewing the Learner Transport Policy. We do this because we want to give all learners quality education, equal opportunities; not only for the two learners in Vermaaklikheid.

An HON MEMBER: You know what [Inaudible.]

Mr L H MAX: An important part of the DA's commitment to redress the past is to provide our learners with proper school infrastructure so that they do not have to study in the same conditions as the learners did during apartheid.

Many schools were built with inferior materials and without the necessities of a good school. The DA-led Government is therefore focused on replacing the old apartheid schools through the replacement school programme. [Interjections.]

The aim of this is to eradicate these structures and build the kind of schools that our people deserve. [Interjections.] Warren Buffett once said: *"Someone is sitting in the shade today, because someone planted a tree a long time ago."*

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is the ANC [Inaudible.]. That is the ANC. You are

right.

Mr L H MAX: It is for this reason that the DA-led Government...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L H MAX: ...of the Western Cape built schools of quality so that it can be used for generations to come. [Interjections.]

Me M N GILLION: Jy los die kinders buite die skole.

Mr L H MAX: The ANC only managed to replace 36 schools when they were in power, but the DA has already replaced almost twice as many schools, 56 in number. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L H MAX: While we strive to deliver even more schools, even faster, but better inherited backlogs from the ANC... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where?

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, you do not know... [Interjections.]

Mr L H MAX: ...upgrading and maintaining existing schools...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr L H MAX: We also need to provide new schools for the growing population.

An HON MEMBER: You are right.

Mr L H MAX: The DA delivers efficient and clean governance for the better for the people. [Interjections.] So while it was true that the ANC failed to provide quality education... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no services.

Mr L H MAX: ...for all in the Western Cape, the DA has delivered almost twice as many schools for the previously disadvantaged. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L H MAX: Our greatest contribution... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. I need to protect the speaker.

Mr L H MAX: One of our greatest contributions to learners in the Western Cape is the implementation plans of the DA-led Government for the norms and standards for public school infrastructure. The Western Cape Government will address infrastructure backlogs, maintain and build additional infrastructure... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Still you do not [Inaudible.] in our townships.

Mr L H MAX: ...like new schools, libraries, laboratories and sport facilities. This DA-led Government of the Western Cape is increasing spending on maintenance and infrastructure especially addressing school buildings, built with inappropriate materials. Even if the DA was to have done this as speedily as possible, it is important to bear in mind that the current budget constraints - and as long as National Government does not contribute more money... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Do not shift the blame!

Mr L H MAX: ...we will not be able to meet the demands as quickly as we would like to.

An HON MEMBER: We are not surprised.

Mr L H MAX: This fact makes it even more impressive when the Western Cape Government manages to double replacement of apartheid schools.

The facts speak for themselves. The DA delivers school infrastructure and dignity to the learners of the Western Cape... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Show them where.

Mr L H MAX: ...where the ANC failed to do so. This is why the voters keep coming back to us at election time where we are in power. [Interjections.] We promised to continue delivering freedom, fairness and opportunity for the learners of the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L H MAX: ...because our vision is the same as that of many South Africans who foresee a country... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: That is why [Inaudible.]. They see through you.

Mr L H MAX: ...which is equitable, prosperous, safe, and efficient. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please, members. Can we get some quiet to allow the next speaker. I see the hon member Mr Christians. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA delivers pizzas. [Laughter.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the ACDP believes... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry hon member Mr Christians, can I just call for order? There is too much noise. Allow the speaker to present. Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The ACDP believes education develops a nation's character and determines its future of prosperity. Against this backdrop I need to look at what the DA produced in government and what the ACDP's objectives are when it comes to education. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are the same.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: We must agree. [Interjections.] We must agree that lots and lots must be done when it comes to education.

Ms M N GILLION: That same principle.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The inequality of education still exists, but this was due to a deliberate system to dehumanise human beings of colour. That was by a previous system. The effects of this inequality are still felt generations down the line, but the ACDP believes that the unions have too much power. SADTU must be given a blood nose... [Interjections.] ...because they are not promoting the interests of our learners and educators. They are advancing the interests of themselves. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Another big challenge that we are facing is that year in and year out we are faced with 20 000 learners annually with no budget, so where you can provide you must now accommodate 20 000 extra learners you need a budget for. We need to say that R17.7 billion was given to education. Now it sounds big but it is a small amount to address the inequalities of the past. Another objective of the ACDP is that poorer learners should go to school and not be burdened by school fees.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I see in the budget that a huge amount was given to learners. It was increased with R1160 per learner and it means it will contribute to improve the resources... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...and the quality of education of these learners. We believe that the bulk of this - and if the members read the outline and the budget speech of the Minister they will realise that - more than R12 billion will go to public orderly education... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We do oversight.



Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...and then we as the ACDP look at what they have achieved and... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians, finish up.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Can I just conclude, Madam Speaker.

Ms P MAKELENI: That is why we do oversight.

The SPEAKER: Finish up.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I want to conclude by saying that I always say that e-Learning will transform our learners and we are very, very happy...

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...that a large amount is going to e-Learning to improve the teachers and our learners. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Well done!

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: We are doing oversight [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] Go to

those schools and see. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members can we [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Do not just read a speech. Go to the schools and see.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Makeleni. Sorry, if you do not mind, I am the Presiding Officer, if you can speak through me when you are addressing someone, but I do not think we should be engaging in discussion across the floor, so if you do not mind, I would like to recognise the hon member Mr Dugmore. If you can afford your colleague the opportunity to speak. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Me M N GILLION: Gooi kole, gooi kole.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. Madam Speaker, it was Dr Rosa-Maria Torres, the former Education Minister of Ecuador who made the simple but profound statement that a school is just a place in the community. What she was saying is that the community must take ownership of education and learning and that those who manage and lead our schools do so within the material conditions that prevail there. It was the new Labour Government of Tony Blair who shortly after winning the general election in 1997 appointed consultants to answer the question as to why some schools work and others do not. They reported that schools that are well led, managed and supported succeed in providing quality outcomes. In the context of deep and structural

inequality, unemployment and poverty providing quality education requires not only redress and the courage to transform, but it requires care and compassion for each and every learner, for all learners, not only the few.  
[Interjections.]

Quality education requires thus a transformative consciousness, a consciousness informed by context. Quality education needs inspired leadership; not only by our principals and teachers, but by those tasked to lead the department as a whole, and quality education requires redress and the conscious direction of resources to those schools and communities most in need. The highest percentage of rural primary school learners who are not enrolled in South Africa are from the Western Cape.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The budget for safe schools in the Western Cape has over the last seven years not kept pace with inflation. In the current financial year it amounts to a minuscule 0.16% of the overall budget.

Me M N GILLION: Skande!

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle gee nie om nie.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The Lagunya Finishing School in Langa, which provided thousands of working class black learners who had dropped out of

school before Grade 12 the opportunity to complete their matric, was closed by the DA. These learners do not have the resources to register at expensive private colleges, which middle-class children can afford. We will never forget that it was the DA under Premier Helen Zille's watch who closed down Lagunya, dashing the hopes of thousands. The Khanya ICT project to bring information and communication technology to our schools, which is part of quality, was closed down by the Democratic Alliance. No adequate alternative was left ... [Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: What did the ANC do?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...to support schools to maintain the massive infrastructure, which had been installed in all of our schools. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not true.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: For the last five years at least hundreds of computer labs have been dormant white elephants, despite informing Premier Zille personally about this, because I have given up on MEC Schäfer, and I have the SMS messages to prove it. She did nothing.

'n AGBARE LID: Sjoe!!

Mnr C M DUGMORE: Her MECs did nothing. Instead the excuse is used that we are preparing for Broadband roll-out. The denial of opportunity of quality ICT education through ICTs have impacted negatively on not hundreds, but thousands of learners from the most disadvantaged schools. I think we should say that while the Safer Schools Programme on its own can never be expected to resolve gangsterism and drugs, which plague so many of our schools like Bonteheuwel, Hanover Park, Grassy Park and Nyanga, surely a more substantial budget would assist. But more importantly the question needs to be asked as to why successive DA Governments since 2009 have failed to implement the social transformation, gang prevention and intervention strategic framework adopted by the Provincial Government in 2008. This outlines the clear strategy for Department of Community Safety, Education, Health, the National Prosecuting Authority, the Department of Justice, the City, all of them, and the Community Police Forum and the Bambanani volunteers against crime. The tragedy is that these pathologies of gangsterism and drugs have worsened and deepened since 2009. The DA - and I blame Premier Helen Zille directly for this - put narrow party interests above those of our province... [Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: Oh come on!

Mr C M DUGMORE: And chose to fight the ANC National Government. She gave a new meaning to blame-and-complain-politics.

This will be your legacy when you leave, Premier... [Interjections.] ...a

province where the social pathologies which impact on quality education are worse than they were when you started as Premier in 2009.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Those are the facts. The stats are there for all to see and you should be ashamed of yourself and you did all this and more, driving racist fears to try and drive a wedge between coloured and white people against African, and when you reached your ceiling of votes for the DA through racist mobilisation and the most base *Swart Gevaar* tactics, you had passed your sell-by date and the DA spat you out and then you gave us an MEC... [Interjections.] ... with no experience, who happens to be only one of two people who still support you in your own caucus. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not...

Mr R T OLIVIER: Do not get excited.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] I think you must SMS the [Inaudible.]  
SMS them.

The SPEAKER: Are you going to SMS the Speaker, hon member Mr Dyantyi, because you are right next door to your member and you are providing the

most noise. Hon member Mr Dugmore, you may proceed, but I would like to call your member right next to you to attention. He is providing a running commentary at the cost of your presentation.

An HON MEMBER: And what about the others?

The SPEAKER: You may proceed. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What about the others?

The SPEAKER: No, I have ordered, hon member Ms Wenger, I have ordered.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, could I just ask you, because I am trying to watch the time.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Could you ask the Table how much more time I have?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just checking... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: One minute left, hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just checking.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, and then you gave us hon Premier, an MEC with no experience, who over the last 15 months has neither provided leadership nor shown the slightest commitment to redress and equity. She has been petulant, arrogant and frankly incapable of leading the drive for quality education as outlined in NDP. As your clone, she has chosen to ridicule other provinces instead of trying to learn from them and share lessons. [Interjections.]

You have filled her head with a one track mind of blame and complaint politics that are no good for education and no good for our province. You and your predecessor have presided over the Western Cape falling from the number one spot in 2009 in terms of matric results to number four in 2013 and number three in 2014 and yet you close Lagunya and give extra classrooms to former Model C schools while overcrowding on the Cape Flats continues. Shame on you. You ignore calls from Wynberg Secondary for a new building and all of this is because you simply do not care enough. I put it to you, MEC Schäfer, that if 400 learners from Claremont were not in school 30 days into the school year you would have been fired. It is time for you to resign; not †ngomso, namhlanje \*not tomorrow, today. †Nie môre, vandag.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, your time has expired.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You need to go because you are bad for this province. You are bad for quality education.



The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, your time has expired. Thank you.

[Applause.] [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, fellow members and distinguished guests, the social political context in which we operate as South Africans is one of great social inequality. It is a legacy of inequality that we must now address, along with the generations to follow us.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ANC!

Mr B D KIVEDO: We have our work cut out for us in levelling out these inequalities and building a more inclusive society. Primary to levelling the playing field is education.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He speaks like an MEC.

Ms M N GILLION: He is the [Inaudible.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: I was party to the contention for a democratic South Africa and know firsthand, this is why the right to education is privileged as part of the Bill of Rights in the Constitution and so we must make it happen.

The reality is that the greater the level of skill that an individual possesses the greater the variety of choices that that person has in terms of how to go

about pursuing their own interest in living a life they value. One of the key issues plaguing the delivery of quality education in South Africa is that of the delivery of textbooks. This is a serious issue. Our children simply must have access to textbooks in order to learn. The Western Cape Department of Education is doing a thorough job of ensuring that each and every learner has a textbook to their avail. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell them. Tell them.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Yet we have heard a lot about the non-delivery of textbooks in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Where there have been delays in delivery, the delays have been addressed. Secondly, what causes the instances of delay, much more dynamic than the instance which we saw in Limpopo where textbooks were simply dumped and not delivered to the learners who so needed them. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: In the case of Maitland High School the order that the school placed for textbooks on the Western Cape Department of Education's online platform did not reflect on the website. As soon as the error was picked up it was addressed on the website and corrected. Extensions were then granted to those schools who could not have their orders met. The

WCED sent the letter to schools to invite them to place orders. Despite missing the initial extension for placing orders, Maitland High School placed their order as early as May 2015 and received their textbooks towards the end of that same month. This brings me to another important point in this particular case, that being that it was not all the students at Maitland High School who were without textbooks but those who were in excess...  
[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Somebody wrote for you.

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...of the expected number of scholars or learners, resulting from the fact that their enrolment rate is on the rise, which is obviously a good thing as it means more and more young people are getting access to education. The doors of learning and culture should be opened.  
[Interjections.]

What this means is that schools need to retrieve at least 95% of textbooks that have been used by students who passed the grade. Failure to do so in addition to the fact that we often see more students enrolling than what is expected and the massive budgetary constraints that the Department of Education faces in the Western Cape, will mean that our children will not get the level of education that they need to become active participants in building a new South Africa to its potential.

It is indeed so, despite the fact that the National Minister of Basic Education,

Ms Angie Motshekga, refuses to do away with the crippling practices like the quintile system, that the Western Cape continues to yield excellent pass rates.

[Interjections.] Hon member Mr Dugmore, excellent pass rates...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: I must commend... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: In conclusion I must commend the Department of Education in the Western Cape on the rapid response... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We know you will not say that.

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...that they continue to showcase in dealing with the various challenges that they face in the delivery of quality education to our youth. I thank you for listening.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] I see the hon member Mr Joseph. Members, can you please settle down? [Interjections.] Hon members...

Mr B D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, what do we mean when we talk about quality education to all? We will demonstrate through this debate how the DA Government in this province is selectively providing education to learners along racial lines.

The Economic Freedom Fighters' founding principles on education states that education shall be free, compulsory, universal and equal for all children. The 2014 Matric results categorises the top 20 schools as providing quality education.

What is wrong with this list? "Nothing much", would be the normal response of the DA members, but in essence it speaks about the unequal society we live in. Those who have financial resources receive the best education possible. The situation in township schools is totally the opposite. Now ask yourselves, why do we not have Ravensmead High, Elsies River, Florida High, Langa High School and Matthew Goniwe High Schools on the list? Our schools do not... [Interjections.] ... reflect institutions of learning compared to the ones on the list. It looks pale on the list. The top 20 are all better resourced in terms of computers, extra murals, extra teachers, extra lessons, small class sizes of less than 30 children per class. Let us compare them to our poorly resourced schools.

The huge class sizes of 35 to 70 learners; no computers; no electricity, underfed children, gang violence in the communities, little extra murals if at all; no library facilities; no extra lessons; broken windows; no money for

extra teachers. Not to take anything away from the top 20 schools, but I await the day when it will be the norm at all schools in the Western Cape.

Preschool teachers took to the Cape Town streets on August 15, 2015 to demand the Western Cape Government's support to improve children's education and as EFF we support such initiatives. The Provincial Government is not assisting ECD Centres in low income areas. Most of these ECD Centres operate independently.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Joseph, your time has expired.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Can I conclude?

The SPEAKER: You must finish up. Your time has expired. Thank you.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you. [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Premier, members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, to engage the official Opposition

in this House in any discussion concerning quality is becoming more and more difficult. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Not because the Western Cape Government is short of examples... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...of quality service and facilities, but because the official Opposition seems to have lost any idea of what quality means. [Interjections.] In fact it appears to many people, including the voting public across the country... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...that the ANC is determined to undermine and pull down anything which smacks of quality. [Interjections.] Quality is not a new or a modern concept.

Ms M N GILLION: When the schools fall apart.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is certainly not a by-product of South African politics in the year 2015. [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: You just [Inaudible.] schools that fall apart.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What is perhaps the definitive quote about what quality is dates back to more than 300 years BC and came from Aristotle himself, when he said: “*Quality is not an act. It is a habit*”, and it is a habit which sorely needs to be restored to public life in South Africa and a habit which the ANC appears to have lost completely. [Interjections.] They do not understand that when they buckle to the will of their union partners... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...or is it their union masters and opposed competency testing for teachers and for markers that they are undermining the very quality of schooling that all young people in this country deserve? Even the democracy, which we treasure, and which was first held up internationally... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...and a model worth emulating is almost daily stripped of its real quality.



The SPEAKER: Sorry Minister Grant, order, could you please take your seat? Hon member Mr Olivier and hon member Mr Tyatyam, interjections are allowed, but you are doing a running commentary there. I am going to appeal to you to please allow the Minister to speak. I must comment that when the Opposition Party speaks you are afforded the silence basically. Please respect... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No, no, no.

The SPEAKER: Members, please respect the member on the floor. That is what I am asking. So a running commentary is not going to be allowed. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister Grant.

Mr R T OLIVIER: They do not... [Inaudible.] Also by Public Works.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier, I have just spoken to you a minute ago, thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...of its real quality by a National Government, which undermines the role of Chapter 9 institutions, neglects crucial quality defining services such as power generation and is unable to come close to protecting the people who live in this country. [Interjections.]

Under these circumstances quality is muscled out of the window by greed, nepotism, fraud and fear. [Interjections.] Common sense becomes a decidedly uncommon characteristic.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Such a poor speech!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And so, during the Adjustments Appropriations debate in this House... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon member Mr Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...on 3 December 2014, we were subjected to a lecture by a member of the official Opposition who explained how the ANC Government was responsible for “*the incredible story of Dr Daniel Mtimkulu, who has actually been part of the team to design the new Prasa locomotive...*” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...and this would not have happened if it was not for the ANC investing in education and skills. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Unfortunately, as we know now, hon member Mr Dugmore was 100% accurate in his use of the word “incredible”, because subsequent developments demonstrated there was no substance in the lecture that he gave to this House. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: What about the department from other [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We on this side of the House... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...take no pleasure in the unfortunate downfall of Mr Mtimkulu and others caught out in the same embroidering of their qualifications. This type of deception has too many dangers in it for this country. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: What happened to the school in Hawston?

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...for sensible people to be pleased about it. However, it does illustrate...

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...how far removed from a true understanding of quality and quality control the ANC has become. You see, John Ruskin, the English social philosopher in the mid-1800s knew what he was talking about when he pointed out that quality is never an accident, it is always the result of intelligent effort. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: That is why there is no [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...and so quality anything including quality schooling has to be worked at, often slowly, but always with quality objectives and benchmarks in mind. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Slowly!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And this is what this Western Cape Government has done in schooling in six years.

Ms S W DAVIDS: The one slowly is you.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: This government has never been afraid to set targets and to monitor its performance.

Ms P MAKELENI: Oh yes you are.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It does not claim that it always achieves these targets... [Interjections.] ...and it does not deny that occasionally it does make mistakes, but these mistakes are always examined openly and critically with a view to improving quality even further ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is it, tell them.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...and in this way real sustainable improvement is brought about... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are weak. Sit down.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...improvement which provides a solid base for further gains. [Interjections.] The success of this approach was confirmed again... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are running away.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...on the release by Stats SA on Monday of its report on municipalities, which shows the Western

Cape is providing the greatest number of free basic services to the poor.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Nyanga.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Let me now turn to just two examples from my own time as Minister of Education...

[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: What about Filcon?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not go there.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...before I address the isolated but significant school building problems which we are dealing with.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just explain how you got from number one to number four.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: As early as 2013...

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...I took the

decision to equalise the amount per learner paid to all no-fee schools in National Quintiles 1 to 3 in the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Scottsdene!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...as a meaningful contribution to improving resources in these schools. By definition all of the learners involved are learners from poor financial backgrounds, who would then have access to improved quality education and ultimately better life opportunities. The cost of this improvement was calculated at R24 million for the 2013/14 year and R26 million for the 2014/15 year, but the Western Cape Government did not stop there. In the same year it was decided to improve significantly our funding to 300 fee-paying schools, i.e. schools not in National Quintiles 1 to 3, which serve less affluent communities. Despite limited finances we were able to increase their subsidies by roughly 25% in 2013/14 at a cost of R18 million, and by a further 73% in 2014/15 at a cost of R53 million. These two carefully researched and planned initiatives put more than R120 million into improving education quality at schools serving the poor.

Mr C M DUGMORE: What about [Inaudible.]

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: These were not the

only initiatives, but to illustrate the commitment to the delivery of improved quality it is true as John Ruskin said: *“Quality is never an accident, it is always the result of intelligent effort.”*

Mr P UYS: Scottsdene!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I now want to address the issues relating to a few schools about which questions have justifiably been raised in the recent past.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] is still there.

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I must make it clear that generally there is no one... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] Winelands.

The SPEAKER: Order, member, sorry. Hon member Mr Dugmore, please. Hon Minister Grant, please take your seat. Members, you cannot interrogate the member while he is speaking and hon member Mr Dyantyi, you are just throwing it across the floor there and it is inappropriate. Heckling, I said, we cannot do this constant interjection. I am going to appeal to you to afford the courtesy to the member who is presenting, allow that individual to speak,



because you are asking questions, but because you are so busy making a noise you actually do not hear the answer, so please members, let us display courtesy and respect the speaker on the floor. You may proceed, Minister. Yes, hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: On a point of order, I would like to know, Madam Speaker, whether MEC Grant is prepared and brave enough to take a question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: He is not prepared to take a question. You may proceed, Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I must make it clear that generally there is no one reason for any delays as the circumstances vary from school to school and site to site. In the case of only four schools there is a common thread and I will deal with these together at the end of my speech. In the case of the two Concordia Schools in Knysna there has always been a challenge of availability of suitable land. In the end Concordia Primary can be built only when Concordia High School is completed early in 2016 and the site on which the existing mobile school is positioned is freed up for the primary school. This site should be handed over for the construction of the primary school by May 2016.

Vuyiseka High School has been delayed by a combination of contract cancellation, continued community interference, well outside the community

provisions allowed for in the contract and violent unlawful industrial action, which was resolved only by a court order. Despite these disruptions an occupation certificate is expected to be issued by mid-February 2016.

I now turn to the four schools linked by a common thread. At the outset I must stress that the common thread is not one which relates to actual construction. The schools are all well built, i.e. the shortcomings are not as a result of the contractor's failure or of poor workmanship. The concerns which have been raised and which were identified during the usual processes of quality control are the result of the structural integrity of the design work by the project design engineers. The extent of the potential problems is not evenly distributed through these four schools and these have been accurately determined by the specialist engineer appointed by my Department to examine all drawings even though these had been signed off by the project design engineers. The removal of any learners from any areas of potential danger was a non-negotiable for my Department and the Western Cape Education Department.

Ms M N GILLION: Like the four years in Hawston.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The report of the specialist engineer will enable decisions to be taken about the necessary remedial steps. All legal steps have been taken to ensure that termination of the contract of the project design engineering company without affecting the professional indemnity involved, and without closing the door on further

legal claims to offset any additional construction costs. My Department and I were ready last week to present a detailed report in the company of the specialist engineer to Scopa. We are treating this matter and its resolution with the utmost urgency and seriousness. We do not take our responsibilities for the safety of our learners lightly... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Come before Scopa.

An HON MEMBER: Your own Chief Whip [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...nor do we downplay the importance of protecting the proper investment of public money and infrastructure.

An HON MEMBER: You are running away.

The SPEAKER: Minister Grant, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: However, Madam Speaker, we must bear in mind that the four schools are less than 1% of the schools we have built. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

The SPEAKER: Members, can we have silence please. [Interjections.] I see the hon Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Hon Madam Speaker, while we have just heard here today that this province in terms of education is the best, when we have heard again that it is best quality roll-out, that this is indeed the province of milk and honey. I am mandated by those whom I serve, which is the poor and the vulnerable, those from the previously disadvantaged community, that indeed so they are still posing the question: "Best for whom?" The education in this province as we have just heard from my colleagues is taking a chaotic turn for the worse and those poor communities do not share in the fruits of your *better*. While you and those in the leafy suburbs cannot imagine one teacher teaching 45 to 50 learners per class, which becomes the norm in black communities under your guidance, while your policies determine in fact a ratio of 38 learners per teacher, this is the harsh reality that our learners and teachers face daily. Where do you see any quality in that overcrowded classroom?

That brings me to the point of quality, as we have just heard MEC Grant speaking about. Let us analyse, he is speaking about Aristotle and quality. Quality has to do with subjective and objective factors. Quality has got to do with the socio-economic realities of our society. Quality has to do and it depends on the criteria that one has applied it to, so we cannot talk about quality in abstract. That is the fundamental contradiction that we are faced

with here today, because it has got to do with correcting quality education in a much more equitable and equal situation. If we do not address that, the following becomes the reality. If you look at education in South Africa, let us not demonise what has come before us. Let us realise what has come before us was a situation where our people has in a sense been disadvantaged. Now hon Mr Lennit Max makes the point about a kombi when he was a young person, the child, and the kombi passed him. I want to say that kombi is still there.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ja, it is still passing.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Where are you? That kombi is still there. It is still passing the children of De Doorns. It is still passing the children of Dunoon. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: The question is did you sell them out? That is the question, because you are the governing party in this province. [Interjections.] So what you must address is that issue. [Interjections.]

What we are sitting with around quality education, MEC Grant has just spoken about quality. Let us hear his quality. He is actually saying it is not an issue, it is still quality, if at least a 1200 learners for the last month are not being able to be in a class in Kraaifontein.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes. [Interjections.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: That is what you have just said here today. What he is saying it is quality to bypass, to move 20 kilometres from Kraaifontein to Happy Valley and to dump poor black children, African and coloured children in Happy Valley... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ...whilst there is a school in Brackenfell under your custodianship with only 200 to 300 learners.

Ms M N GILLION: Exactly, yes.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: That is what you mean with quality. That shows the deep rooted sense of racism. What we are seeing... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: What are we seeing in this quality MEC Grant is speaking about? Say to the public that only five out of the thirteen schools under the ASIDI programme actually have been completed, only 38%. Say to them that more than 2000 learners as we stand here today, whether it is in Dunoon, whether it is in Kraaifontein, whether it is in Bloekompos or

whether it is in Mitchells Plain, they are still not in class. It is the same MEC of Education, the former MEC of Education, that did the following. Your records stinks by the way. [Interjections.]

What he did... [Interjections.] ... he actually closed 27 schools, he then said the MEC or former MEC of Education said children of Beauvallon must walk from Hanover Park to Bishop Lavis.

An HON MEMBER: Race card, race class.

Mnr M L FRANSMAN: Want julle gee nie om nie. That is what you have done. Now if you look at the spite of gangsterism in that area, if you look at the spite of dropouts from what the MEC Education did, actually I must say some of that blood of those children is directly alluded to what you have done in that situation. That is the dilemma that we have.

What we are sitting with is an MEC of Education currently who actually does not understand education. Rural schools - the National Department of Basic Education says what the MEC and the Department of Education in the Western Cape is doing is closing schools, whilst they are supposed to do the following: they are supposed to provide proper e-Learning material for those poor rural farm schools. They are supposed to put up screen TVs. They are supposed to put in subject advisors. They are supposed to put in library trolleys. That is what you are supposed to do. What is your answer? Your answer is closing those schools. Let me tell you what is the basis of that. The

basis is we want quality in numbers and therefore if the schools are closed approximately 60 000 learners can be affected by that one action that she wants to perform in terms of 321 learners... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: That is what we are experiencing. So what we are saying, if they close those schools, these 329, as they intend to, remember we will go to court. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: MEC Grant has not yet apologised to the public for wasting millions of taxpayers' money by taking poor rural working class children to school.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: But it has got... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, Minister Grant.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: You have lost the case. You know you have lost the case. [Interjections.]



The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, we won that case.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: You have lost the case.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman, please take your seat.  
[Interjections.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: You have lost the case. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Members, order please. We cannot continue in this way.

An HON MEMBER: Loser.

The SPEAKER: There is a speaker on the floor. The same approach, I said when there is someone speaking you have to manage yourself so we cannot get into a slurring match here, whether you need to deliberate around things, but this is not the platform so afford the speaker the opportunity so that he can present his case, and if a question needs to be posed, do that, but we cannot just allow this to carry on. So I am appealing to you, it is early in the day, let us practice discipline and get this thing right, please. Thank you. You may proceed.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: So initially they have lost... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: They have lost the case of 27. He wasted millions of rand. This new MEC of Education goes directly in the same context, will be wasting millions of rand. Now the question is, why are they doing this? It is because they want to show to the public they have got quality education, because what they are doing, is they are closing hundreds of schools... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ah, nonsense.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: So those children will not be registered. What that means is those children will not be in the system of education and what it further means, Premier Zille, is so that your marks nationally can look good.

The PREMIER: Rubbish.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: That is the difficulty that we have, because a child that is not in class is not being assessed at the end of the year in terms of the exam results. That is the bottom line that we have, so what is the ANC saying? The ANC is saying stop your skewed development. The second thing that we are saying is we must address the issue of the support for principals and school-governing bodies properly.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman, your time has expired, thank you. [Applause.] Hon members, sorry, if I may, Chief Whip just take your seat please. When we are in the House we do not talk about “he and she”. We have honourable members. I think it would be appropriate in your discussion when you are referring to anybody it is not “she or he”, the hon member I think it would go a far way in terms of maintaining the dignity of the House. Chief Whip Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes thank you, Madam Speaker, I just want to refer you to your opening remarks where you did ask that members of the gallery are not participants in this debate. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. If I may caution the members in the gallery. Thank you for being here, but you cannot participate in any way, so there are no running commentaries from the gallery. Thank you. Everybody in the gallery, all our guests. I now see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker. Today’s topic that the DA-led Western Cape Government has failed to provide quality education for all is erroneous, misguided and unfounded. My colleagues have already outlined a number of our successes and measures we have put into place since coming into power in 2009 in the Western Cape, which will all assist in improving quality throughout the system, especially for the poor and disadvantaged communities. Quite frankly the ANC’s hypocrisy knows no bounds.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: From reporting me to the Human Rights Commission for applying the very same policy that was applied under the ANC Government to writing blatantly false information on a closed Facebook page, so that we cannot comment and give the correct facts.

An HON MEMBER: We cannot hear.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The ANC also seems to have lost its memory as to what things were like under their government. It is evident that the ANC is exhibiting the last kicks of a dying cause. [Interjections.] The reality is that what this debate is really about is an attempt to obfuscate the ANC's dismal performance [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. Sorry hon Minister Schäfer, if you could take your seat. We are talking about respect here. You might not agree with the Minister and you might have a view on her but at least afford her the opportunity to do her presentation. [Interjections.] You may proceed Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker. It is evident that the reality is... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, your attention please. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...that what this debate is really about is an attempt to obfuscate the ANC's dismal performance in education wherever they are in power. It is well known that the best way to improve performance is to measure it. Under the DA the Western Cape is the only province to have implemented a number of processes to measure our performance and thus know what we have to improve, and yes, we do have to improve. Unlike most, if not all other provinces, we have reliable information at our disposal so that we can see how well or how badly we are doing. We are the only province to conduct systemic tests in Grades 3, 6 and 9, unlike the DBE's ANAs these are internationally benchmarked, independently marked and can be reliably compared year-on-year.

The importance of these tests was highlighted in a NEEDU report released late last year, which recognises the importance of systemic testing of learners for the improvement of language and maths. The results provide extremely useful information which can be used by officials and principals in planning their improvements strategies. Even the Department of Performance, Monitoring and Evaluation in the Presidency has said that the ANAs need to have the characteristics of our systemic tests in order to provide reliable information. Of course SADTU is not in favour of these. They have an innate aversion to any independent measure of performance, which probably explains why these have not been implemented nationally as we all know that SADTU is crucial to the electoral successes of the ANC.

Die PREMIER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We are the only province to have instituted competency assessments for the appointment of principals and are working on rolling them out to deputy-principals and HOD appointments this year. [Interjections.] Well at least she has got... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We are the only province to insist on competency testing for our matric markers. Once again other provinces are too scared to do this in case SADTU opposes it and why would anyone oppose these unless of course they are too scared that they will not pass the tests themselves.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is what they are saying.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: What kind of quality is that? The ANC who stands here today accusing us of not providing quality education has not implemented any of these quality improvement measures either nationally or in any province that they govern. Why not? [Interjections.] The ANC likes to claim... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Ms M N GILLION: The ANC in the Western Cape... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: May I continue?

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The ANC likes to claim that when they were in power for those of them who can remember that far back, we were at number one position in the matric rankings. But let us have a look at this in more detail. [Interjections.]

In 2009 the pass rate was 75.7%, which had declined a full 10% since 2004. After four years of DA Government the pass rate in 2013 was 85%. [Interjections.] Between 2004 and 2009 when the ANC was in power... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The highest number of matrics passing in any one of the five years they were in power... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...was just over 34 500. In 2014 after five

years of DA Government it was just over 40 000. This is over 5 500 more learners passing and gaining access to opportunities. In 2009 the number of learners obtaining a bachelors pass was just over 14 300. In 2014 18 524 learners achieved the bachelors pass; 4200 more than in 2009. That is 5 153 more learners obtaining the quality pass required for university entrance and the number of learners in our lowest quintile schools achieving a bachelor's pass has doubled. In the 2014 NSC we remained the province with the highest percentage of bachelor's passes at 38.8%.

Similarly, our maths and science pass rates increased by 8.4 and 20% percentage points respectively. In 2009 there were 85 underperforming schools. Last year there were 30, a reduction of 55. In the 2014 NSC the Western Cape was the only province in the entire country to achieve a pass rate of 80% or more in every one of our districts. Our retention rate remained higher than any other province. More than 6% higher than Gauteng; over 20% more than the North West, and over 16% higher than the Free State.

Our Metro East district, historically the worst performer, achieved the fourth-best results out of our eight districts, with 81.2%. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...increasing their pass rate by 15.1 percentage points since 2009. It is significant to add that almost half of the schools in the Metro East are situated in Khayelitsha. The schools in



Khayelitsha achieved a pass rate of 76.1% in the 2014 NSC, an improvement of some 23% since 2009. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: All those teachers are SADTU members [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Most of them.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: In addition, the final results for the 2014 NSC revealed not one... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore.

An HON MEMBER: Name him, Madam Speaker.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Name him, please.

Mr M G E WILEY: I must appeal, please, can you please treat the hon former Minister of Education with the same contempt that the electorate showed him in 2009. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Members, before we go, Rule 39, let us listen to Rule 39: "A member may not interrupt another member who is speaking, except to call attention to a point of order or a question of privilege."

Members, we need to listen to this. Rule 41 says that: “Order must be maintained by the Presiding Officer.” So I am appealing to you to cooperate, display respect and discipline in terms of allowing the proceedings to continue. You may proceed, Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In addition the final results for the 2014 NSC revealed not one underperforming school in Khayelitsha. Under the ANC in 2009 there were 15. [Interjections.]

These results are hardly a sign of poor quality provision of education in the Western Cape. We are focused on improving the quality across the system, for all, not just on one performance indicator, but instead the ANC desperately tries to cling onto one incident here and another there, which they try to use to portray us as an uncaring government, when exactly the opposite is true. This year, thanks to the ANC’s disastrous economic policies, lack of ethical leadership, corruption and maladministration we are facing severe financial constraints.

An HON MEMBER: We will say the same.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] education.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As if that is not enough, the National Government negotiated wage increases across the board, which are above

what we expected and budgeted for. I do not think any reasonable and prudent government could have expected above inflation increases in the current fiscal climate, let alone a 28.5% increase in medical aid.

The effect of this is that we have to find R1.3 billion over the MTEF in Education alone and as the purse strings tighten my Department has had to try and find innovative and creative solutions to simply maintain our existing services, because contrary to what far too many people seem to believe there is not a bottomless pit of money.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek is hopeloos in Afrikaans.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: During these exercises of financial gymnastics we have been steadfast in refusing to cut our pro-poor benefits. We are also retaining the norms and standards funding to schools of R1 116 in 2015 and will be increasing this to R1 177 in 2016 per child per year in accordance with national norms and standards, but in the ANC Government Limpopo Province they have slashed their norms and standards funding to the poorest schools to R322.50 per child per year. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because they are trying to convince [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: How is that for quality education?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: And the Free State, which has a very favourable teacher learner ratio, spends 96% of its budget on teacher's salaries. So they have lots of teachers but they have got no money for anything else. We are doing everything possible to continue providing quality education, but it is becoming increasingly difficult through no fault of ours. Unsurprisingly... [Interjection.] I do not respond the way you like to respond, that is the only point.

An HON MEMBER: You do not respond [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Unsurprisingly people are flocking to the Western Cape to enjoy the fruits of the DA Government. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We cannot blame them. The difference is clear for everyone to see but the law of supply and demand is becoming under threat here. We have seen the issue of Dunoon recently and earlier this year at Mfuleni where people think they can occupy a site of their choice and then demand schoolteachers and jobs. Yesterday the Dunoon matter was settled. Today I am now informed that it is no longer settled because the real issue at stake here is not the learners, but is actually jobs for teachers and now they have realised that they actually cannot control who gets those jobs they are now unhappy again. Well, I am afraid it is time to say this now loud and

clear. Where there is demand there is not always supply. Every year we see about 20 000 new learners coming to the Western Cape. Very often many people come at the last minute or even during the year.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is because we the parents are here.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Because they like the Western Cape. I do not blame them. Yet, they expect schools to be ready and waiting for them.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Most recently we saw the illegal occupation... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Most recently we saw the illegal occupation of a vacated mobile school site in the Dunoon area by people claiming to have hundreds of children who could not get into school. After our officials trawled through several lists of names containing between varying 45 to 760 names it was found ultimately that there were 119 of compulsory school-going age. If we had simply succumbed to the demands without verifying the status of the learners we could have sat with another school that we simply cannot afford and in a few months time they will have

been marching to the Department's offices demanding a brick school.  
[Interjections.]

The right to a basic education is a fundamental constitutional right and the Western Cape Government is committed to providing all learners who find themselves in this province with access to quality education, but to do this we need to be able to plan properly and we need money. A school is not planned and built overnight. We do not have pools of teachers waiting to be placed at schools. We also do not have a transport system waiting to take any learner who happens to arrive to school. [Interjections.]

These things all take a lot of planning, and there are systems and policies in place to ensure the effective management of our very stretched resources.

An HON MEMBER: Shame on you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The National Treasury acknowledges that we are not getting the actual amount that we are entitled to and desperately need from the equitable share... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You just do not understand. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: They say that... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Unbelievable! They say that they need to phase it in... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa. Sorry Minister Schäfer, please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: Name them, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I would like to address you, please [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Shame.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker. I trust this is not coming off my time. The National Treasury acknowledges that we are not getting the actual amount that we are entitled to and desperately need from the equitable share. They say that they need to phase it in and cushion provinces against significant changes. So while the WCED awaits National Treasury to phase in the new provincial equitable share, we are left to cover the cost of increasing numbers every year. Quite simply it is time for the Western Cape to be cushioned, because if we are not and as things currently stand there will not be money for extra teachers next year and there will not be money for extra schools or classrooms next year other than what is already

in our plans. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And you have no plan whatsoever.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We will engage with National Government as we are committed to providing quality education for all in the Western Cape, as we have been doing since 2009, but instead of the ANC coming here, trying to say that the province that is functioning the best in the country is not providing quality education, they should go and get their own house in order so we can receive the funds we need to look after our learners.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As far as the issues that have been raised, hon member Mr Olivier, you will know, you know exactly what happened in Scottsdene, we could not put them in the Kraaifontein School because there were over a thousand learners there and they would not have all fitted there. There was a perfectly good school at Eerste River, which refused to allow the learners from Scottsdene to go there, even though they are not there, they are not going to be in the school till next year and that is why they stayed there. Would you rather us put them in a school that is at risk and let the school fall on top of them potentially? Then imagine what that would have been crisis. We could not do that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.



The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As far as the school buses are concerned we cannot control how the bus drivers drive. We do our best but we cannot be with them every single day. It was a tragedy. I went to visit the people personally and fortunately nobody was killed. As far as affluent schools are concerned, we in fact are building extra classrooms at many affluent schools to allow for more people to be taken into those schools.

Bonnievale we are busy dealing with and by the end of the year the extra classrooms should be there. Hon member Mr Dugmore, we have dealt with this issue before of Lagunya. You decided to close that school. Your ANC Government decided to split higher and basic education. They are not under our Department any longer. Learners out of school must go to higher education. [Interjections.] Computer labs... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Computer labs you might not know...

The SPEAKER: Order please members. [Interjections.] Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon member Mr Dugmore, I am addressing your issue, but you are not listening. We refurbished 3350 computer labs last year.

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon Minister Schäfer, please take your seat. I would like to ask that Minister Grant and the hon member Mr Dugmore set up an appointment to talk through the issues... [Laughter.] This is clearly not the place across the floor because it is distracting to other members who are trying to listen to the presentation and I have now picked up that these two members are engaging in a debate, which is inappropriate.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I apologise.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Tyatyam, are you standing on a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, Madam Speaker, I just want to ask through you that to get the two Ministers to go to Scopa, both of them.

An HON MEMBER: Really!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Your comment is noted. [Interjections.] Okay, can we get some order here please people, let us settle down. You may proceed hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker. As far as Mitchells Plain learners are concerned, we have heard this allegation for months and months and months, nobody has brought us any names of any people in Mitchells Plain, despite us having meetings with various

organisations and requesting. In fact we offered to go and fetch the list from their offices and they refused. So until someone shows me where they are we will be unable to deal with those people. [Interjections.]

Computer laboratories, as I said we have done 3350 smart classrooms this year, hon member Mr Dugmore, and we are busy with our roll-out of our e-Learning plan. [Interjections.]

As far as the patronising comments about my head being filled by the Premier... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I have my own head, thank you, with my own mind, so she does not need to fill it with anything... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, the Table staff are keeping a close eye on the time and unfortunately the Minister is allowed to speak until her time has expired, and I am certain the Table staff will alert me as to when the time expires, so maybe focus on the presentation rather than on the clock. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: There is a small [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: There is one speaker here.

The SPEAKER: Ja, I also have something. You may proceed, Minister Schäfer. We have a backup in case you did not know. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much. As far as school closures are concerned we in fact won the court judgment in the Supreme Court of Appeal. Hon member Mr Fransman, you might have missed that. You are not here very often. We won that court case and in fact we will be closing schools as the National Government has been doing all along and wants to close 1500 even though it is not actually their mandate to do so. When we close schools we will ensure that the learners have alternative [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer, your time has now expired.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you members. That concludes the debate on this subject.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We will now proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the hon Minister of Finance, Minister Meyer.

## **INTERPELLATIONS:**

### *Municipalities struggling with audit outcomes: capacity support*

#### **1. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Finance:**

Whether there is a marked progress in the capacity support given to municipalities struggling with audit outcomes?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Madam Speaker, and thank you to hon member Mr Dyantyi for this interpellation. Yes, the Provincial Treasury in consultation with the Department of Local Government developed the MGRO process, the Municipal Governance and Review support programme to assist municipalities with the objective to improve their governance processes and consequently their audit results. All 30 municipalities are supported in the Western Cape as part of the MGRO process. Since the inception of the MGRO process there has been marked progress in terms of the capacity building support for municipalities over the past three years.

The Provincial Treasury has identified support to capacitate municipalities inclusive of those struggling with the improvement of financial management. The following support has been provided by the Provincial Treasury to build capacity of municipal financial officials:

(1)The Provincial Treasury in partnership with the University Business

School has developed accredited training material and training has been provided to municipal officials in the following areas:

- Public sector governance;
- Auditing and performance information;
- Supply chain management;
- Risk management;
- Predetermined objectives;
- Budget and Treasury Office structure guidelines as well as municipal financial management information and cash management.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Provincial Treasury has also established forums to provide a platform to set best practices and to address municipal challenges. In addition, the Provincial Treasury has implemented capacity building strategies to support municipalities to comply with the municipal regulations on minimum competency levels and the implementation of financial management internship programme.

In response to the specific challenges relating to the improvement of audit outcomes the Provincial Treasury has also implemented support initiatives. The action plans were assessed by the MGRO process and engagements with the municipalities provided feedback on their progress towards addressing the audit issues raised. Audit assessment readiness were conducted in selected municipalities that received an unqualified audit, with matters.

In addition the Provincial Treasury has provided support to all municipalities in the preparation for the 2014 annual financial statements and will continue to support on technical accounting issues to municipalities through the provincial treasury help desk facility during the audit execution phase. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you very much Minister Meyer for your response to the question on support you are giving to struggling municipalities. My emphasis, perhaps to have a proper conversation let me just take you through and just remind each other about who we are talking about here.

The following municipalities in terms of the Auditor General's report, not one report, are struggling municipalities in terms of the audit outcomes and these are the following municipalities: Kannaland, Oudtshoorn, all Central Karoo municipalities, Overberg district, Swellendam. I am doing it slow, so that you can write it down. Swellendam. In the West Coast it is the following municipalities: Berg River, Cederberg, Matzikama, Saldanha and in the Cape Winelands it is the following municipalities: Stellenbosch, one of the richest municipalities that we have in this province. We will talk about that one at some other time, and all of these struggling municipalities in terms of the Auditor General's report, they have their CFOs or vacancies in key positions more pronounced and in about 21% in these municipalities you have that

particular problem.

I appreciate what you were saying in terms of the things that you have outlined, the MGRO, supporting all the municipalities and so on, the training that you are doing, and you have listed those issues including establishing forums and so on. I think we need to talk about where the problem is then, because if all of these things that you are mentioning, which are supposed to give results, are not yielding any action - I want to give you examples that I think you should know by now, and here are the following examples. Let me start right at the end in the Central Karoo.

In all of those municipalities just under the issue of financial and performance management, which lists the following issues: proper record-keeping; processing and reconciling controls; report and compliance and so on, all of those aspects are in red. They are not in red for one year. They have been red for a number of years. In fact the Auditor General's report says they have not moved at all.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, your time has expired for this particular slot. You will get another one.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not want me to continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not at this stage.



Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I must say that one of the things that the Auditor General highlights in the 2013/14 report, which is no different from the 2012/13 audit report, is that municipalities often struggle to collect the money that is owed to them and we are now sitting at R8.2 billion and they are saying only 37% is likely to be collected by municipalities and that is an average of R3 billion.

Now obviously what begs the question here is to what extent are we able to assist them to ensure that they are at least able to collect, not 37%, but at least something not less than 60% and one being mindful of the fact that some of the main debtors here are the businesses as well as Government Departments; what are we doing then to say to the Government Department: "If you do not pay we are going to switch off the lights. If you do not pay we are going to switch off the water."

We cannot really allow Government Departments not to pay Government, especially when we talk about municipalities, which is the primary source of their survival. I hear hon member Mr Dyantyi opportunistically mentioning also in spite of that problem - actually I should be saying to the municipality and the current administrator there that well done for implementing the measures that they are putting in place, and we want to see them, in the next

year. What are we going to see, which the ANC or parties have actually created that mess there... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, your time has expired. The hon member Mr Dyantyi, from now onward. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, your time starts now.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Just to quickly deal with the government-owed debt. There is 11% owed to Beaufort West Municipality. You were there and that is owed by Public Works. He is not here now, this MEC who was talking quality. He owes that municipality the debt, the recovery, the revenue that you are talking about, the Government. He is not far, just in front of you. Speak to him, and the next point I want to make just on that, MEC Bredell, when he was here I asked him: "Give us three things that make you not to sleep at night, that you might find out there", and he listed the following things: the bulk infrastructure, ageing and maintenance of that infrastructure and the issue of revenue, so he knows about it.

Hulle doen niks oor daaraan nie. That is the issue. They know about where the problem is. They are doing nothing about it. So it is not a new thing that you are bringing that the Auditor General was asking here a month ago. There is no answer to it. We might have to help on that, but let me quickly go to MEC of Finance, because the point I am trying to make here is that you are putting all of these things to us. There is no marked progress on what you are

doing and something else must be done. You cannot repeat doing the same thing for five years and there is no improvement, because the Auditor General and the Department were saying this to us, in fact during that time you were nowhere to be seen. We could not even speak to Treasury as we are going to all of these municipalities. They are saying the following things, which have been there for more than three years, the issue of limit capacity and knowledge to address the Auditor General's finding. This is a basic thing. We should not even need to take them to those causes that you have highlighted here and, the second thing also related to the issue of capacity. They have been listed each year after year and you can go to Beaufort-West and all those municipalities, Kannaland has the same problem. The Auditor General raises the same thing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, member your time has expired again. Hon member Mr Mnqasela. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me just highlight that one of the challenges that we must also be honest about, Minister, is that officials and politicians who steal money from the municipalities and the serial offenders who go around stealing from here when they are caught they run to another one, especially... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...especially in the municipalities like Oudtshoorn,

Cederberg, and even the Overberg where the ANC is in charge. All of these municipalities have inherently been problematic, so we need not play politics in terms of this, because my job as the Chairperson of the Standing Committee is to ensure that we go wherever it hurts and fix the problems, and the Central Karoo District Municipality as a district, if there is chaos there how are they going to assist the local municipalities, so that is a challenge that I think, Minister, we need to provide more support to those municipalities...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...so that they improve the way they govern there. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, your last opportunity.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I think if we said to the MEC of Education that she must pack and go, I would want to repeat that to MEC of Finance, because if he speaks about Central Karoo, here it is, they have been unqualified. You have made that point, unqualified for five years with matters of emphasis, for five years they have been like this, you can see the picture here, and yet you have an MEC who cannot take them to the next level. The question is what are you doing? Why are you in this job and in fact your Department could not even help us in terms of Kannaland around some of the things that you are raising critically, and Kannaland has improved mainly on its own from the disclaimer

that they had into at least now a qualified audit. [Interjection.]

No-no, it is not him. He has failed on all of those issues. We were with them there. We asked questions: “What is it that you did that helped you?” So I just want to rest my case there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. I do agree with the hon members that took part in this debate in terms of the vacancy matters, this is a serious matter and I do agree that we need some interventions particularly at municipal level, but for this financial year we have budgeted R21.8 million to deal exactly with some of these matters that the hon members have raised. But I am not going to solve their own internal political problems in the Central Karoo, because what you have in the Central Karoo is political corruption by a political party and they want me now to get involved in their internal political struggle. [Interjections.] I am not going to deal with those particular matters so the picture is very clear from the Auditor General. It says there, systemic political leadership problems in that particular municipality and those political leadership problems must be solved by that particular political party, but that is where the problem lies. The same in Kannaland, the same in Cederberg, the same in Oudtshoorn, but let me rather show to the hon member the emerging picture that the Auditor General has spoken about.

This is the picture that he has seen for himself and in terms of this picture there is a year-on-year progression in terms of the auditees. What we have done consistently, we have looked at what the issues are raised by the Auditor General in terms of the audit outcomes? Based on these issues we developed a self-assessment by the municipalities jointly. We then developed a governance action plan for the audits and specific matters are then dealt with.

Let me go specifically to the matters that we are currently dealing with in the place that you have spoken about, because we are asking ourselves what are doing in Beaufort West. Currently ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister Meyer, your time has unfortunately expired. You will not have a chance to tell them. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Is it true... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your two minutes have expired.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It cannot be. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! We move on to the second interpellation.

*Sexual abuse at schools*

**2. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether her Department has any measures in place to address the prevalence of schools becoming sites of sexual abuse?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker and hon member Mr Kivedo for the question. The question assumes that sexual abuse is prevalent, which implies being widespread, which is not entirely true according to the figures we have at least, but nevertheless the WCED views all forms of sexual misconduct in a very serious light and one incident of sexual misconduct [Inaudible.] is one too many. Sexual misconduct is a broad societal issue that plagues our society and needs to be addressed at all levels. It requires a transversal approach by Government, NGOs and the private sector.

Obviously as our schools are microcosms of society these problems do manifest themselves in our schools. Incidents of sexual misconduct can involve both staff and learners and can range from inappropriate comments to inappropriate relationships and assault.

As such the WCED runs regular and continuous training at schools to inform employees of the consequences of sexual misconduct and that the WCED has a policy of zero tolerance in that regard.

Vetting of new employees is done painstakingly and no employee who has been dismissed as a result of sexual misconduct will be allowed to re-enter the profession. A block is placed on the state employee record system, Persal, so that they cannot generate a departmental salary should they move to another province.

The WCED gives top priority to investigations of complaints concerning sexual misconduct by staff and applies appropriate sanctions whenever staff are found guilty of an offence.

Schools deal with misconduct including sexual abuse in terms of their codes of conduct depending on the nature of the offence concerned. Schools may also apply to the Department to expel learners in cases of serious misconduct. The WCED has provided guidelines to schools on how to deal with any form of abuse including sexual abuse in our Abuse No More Policy. The guidelines include procedures to follow and counselling for both the victim and the alleged perpetrator as required. Learners may call the WCED Safe Schools Call Centre, for advice on how to deal with sexual abuse including bullying that may be of a sexual nature.

The Department employs social workers and school psychologists in every circuit who can investigate and provide support as required. They can also advise schools on how to apply appropriate measures in line with our Abuse No More Policy. The Life Orientation curriculum covers sexuality education also at appropriate levels for every grade. Thank you.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Agbare mnr die Adjunkspeaker, in 'n mate wat die verklaring betref speel ek so 'n bietjie duiwelsadvokaat. [Tussenwerpsels.] Die konteks waarbinne ek die saak stel dat skole 'n plek word [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Duiwelsadvokaat! [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr B D KIVEDO: ...van seksuele misbruik het ek geneem uit 'n poniekoerant, en ek stem saam met die Minister dat dit 'n oordrewe saak is, soos in die koerante gestel. Ek het dit opsetlik gedoen dat ons die waarheid en ook die geldigheid daarvan kan toets. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Seksuele teistering en misbruik is 'n samelewingsprobleem en skole is 'n integrale deel van 'n samelewing. Dit is nie 'n aparte entiteit nie. So dit spil oor in die skole ook en dit kom dikwels voor onder bepaalde omstandighede. Dit is nie 'n endemiese saak nie. Dit is nie 'n patologie nie. Dit is 'n saak wat by verskeie geleenthede voorkom so dit is eintlik wat ek daardeur wou sê, maar nou het ons ook 'n problematiese ding in terme van wetgewing, dat seksueel aktiewe kinders - daar word wette gepromulgeer om seksueel aktief te word teen die ouderdom van twaalf jaar oud. Kinders wat nog met Barbie-doll poppe moes gespeel het, kan nou seks hê. [Tussenwerpsels.] en ek dink 'n ander faktor wat ook dan 'n rol speel is die statusrol van onderwysers en ook

die outoriteit dat hulle dit misbruik en kinders word dan oorweldig, veral 'n 13-jarige, 12-jarige kind se diskresionêre magte moet bevraagteken word, eerlikwaar in terme van ja of nee.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the term *in loco parentis* - ek is smart, nè - which is Latin for in the place of a parent, refers to the legal responsibility of a person or organisation to take on some of the functions and responsibilities of a parent. *In loco parentis* is a legal doctrine describing a relationship similar to that of a parent to a child. It refers to an individual who assumes parental status and responsibilities for another individual, usually a young person without formally adopting that person. For example legal guardians are said to stand *in loco parentis* with respect to their wards creating a relationship that has special implications for insurance and workers compensation.

Ek wil miskien net afsluit deur te sê skole is eintlik spasies of kontekste vir leer en dat hulle verpligtinge en ook hulle regte erken moet word.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: En dit is presies wat die Wes-Kaapse Onderwysdepartement doen.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Order agbare, jou tyd is verstreke.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie. [Tyd verstreke.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Voor ek die agbare lid me Lorraine Botha sien, ek wil net myself rig tot die agbare lid mnr Joseph. U het pas die lyn gebreek toe u ingekom het. U is nie bewus daarvan nie, maar ek sal u verskoon. Daar loop 'n denkbeeldige lyn van agb lid mnr Christians af tot in die middel van die vloer tot by die Tafel. So as u inkom en hy sit reeds dan moet u agter hom om stap en nie... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Orde! Ons gaan voort. Die agbare lid me Lorraine Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, our schools cannot be defined as sites of sexual abuse. Our schools are rather defined by excellent pass rates and the many after-school programmes that keep our children off the streets. Our schools are defined by the fact that the door of learning is always open.

What happens in our schools is learning. This is underpinned by the fact that parents from all across South Africa are sending their children to the Western Cape for schooling. It is a testament to the quality of education that is rolled out in our province.

I want to be clear that as Government we do take this subject extremely serious and have zero tolerance for inappropriate behaviour. We have preventative programmes in place to ensure that it does not happen in the first place. The Western Cape Department of Education has partnerships with other Departments in the Western Cape Government including Social

Development and Health. They also partner with community organisations on the ground to ensure the safety of our learners. Our learners are also taught their rights and they are informed of what to do when they feel that they are being threatened, chiefly, that they are to report it immediately.

I reiterate that we take the welfare of our learners very seriously and creating a stable and healthy learning environment is of utmost importance. Our learners are being educated to one day become democratically and economically active and thus we must continue doing all we can to help them achieve this. I thank you.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie agbare lid. Ek moet net myself korrigeer. Die agb lid mnr Uys is heeltemal korrek. Ek het deurmekaar geraak omdat agb lid mnr Christians regop gestaan het op daardie stadium, maar hy het nie gepraat nie. So dit is wanneer 'n spreker praat en jy kruis die lyn, dis die probleem. So moenie dink ek gee vir u nou nuwe inligting nie. Dit is verkeerd gewees. [Gelag.]

An HON MEMBER: Mr Deputy Speaker [Inaudible.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, a few months ago a learner was reported to have been sexually abused by another learner in class. Currently a number of principals are undergoing legal processes where they are accused

of sexual harassment.

What is worse at our schools is that in the recent past a pastor was reported to have sexually abused a female on school premises. So I think this issue and with the measures in place our view is that stricter actions need to be taken on this issue. I hear what the MEC is saying that they will not reappoint previous offenders. There is training at school in this regard, there is sexual education at school and there is a call centre, but what we are asking is that this matter, if we send our kids to school, wherever we are we must feel safe and we must know that our kids are in good hands. We are not sending our kids to school to be sexually harassed by educators, by fellow learners, and so forth, so it is a very important matter. Dit is nie kat en muis speel nie. Dit is 'n belangrike aspek en dat ons ernstig, en dat die Departement ernstig moet optree.

If there are measures we must look at those measures. If they must be reviewed, it must be reviewed but what is important is that our learners must feel safe when they are at school and not be exposed to sexual harassment.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die probleem is daar is nie leierskap daar nie.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Agbare lid mnr McKenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, earlier on the member Mr Dugmore said the community must take ownership of education and it is in

that vein that we fully support what the Minister said earlier on. She talked about the programmes and policies that are in place but all of us, it is our responsibility, whether we work in our constituencies to encourage our community leaders and our pupils and our children to report these matters; look through the programmes and policies and procedures including calling the safety school line, which all of these members of the House have attended and visited the safety school on an oversight visit; to encourage our children in our homes to start using the facilities available to them and start calling the lines and reporting these matters so as the honourable member rightly say that these individuals do not come back to school and do not become repeat offenders, as the MEC earlier indicated. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The feedback from my colleagues fall very sweet on my ear and I am particularly glad to hear that teachers are being screened and profiled before being employed especially against the backdrop of the sexual offenders list. That to me is comforting and also the signing of the teachers' code of conduct to oblige teachers to see that they adhere to certain basic principles and imperatives in terms of guiding their role and navigating them through their career. Finally I feel heartened by the fact that in the case of an alleged sexual offence that it is properly investigated, verified, empirically verified and that there are disciplinary hearings, if in the case of convictions that the convictions are fair, that there are fair outcomes and I think this is the route to go and in this

way we would perhaps combat and also alleviate this specific problem. I thank you so much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon member Mr Kivedo, ek gaan nie daarop ingaan in wetgewing nie, dit is nie ons mandaat hierso nie, so ek gaan dit na die Nasionale Wetgewer oorlaat. Yes, you are very smart. *In loco parentis*, as one who did Latin means in the place of a parent, yes.

Hon member Ms Botha, yes, we do have learning in our schools, but unfortunately we do still have incidents of sexual abuse and harassment, which is unacceptable, and it still is a concern, even if there is one, but we will continue to do as much as we can to prevent it, and if it is found we will deal with it swiftly and very harshly.

Hon member Mr Olivier, yes, there was an incident a few months ago. I have gone into that incident. It is a concern to me. The problem there was that the facts were very vague. The learner refused to lay charges. She was taken to the police by the principal. She refused to lay charges. She is being treated by psychologists and she is given assistance at the school, but it is a disgrace to me that learners can do something like that to other learners. It is more of a disgrace to me that teachers can do that to a learner, it is an abuse of power and it is unacceptable. If you have any ideas as to how we can improve I will

welcome them from you.

Hon member Mr Mackenzie, thank you, yes, it is the responsibility of all of us and it is also the responsibility of parents. Where do these learners learn this behaviour? The parents also have a role to play in teaching them what is acceptable and what is not acceptable and then finally, hon member Mr Kivedo, we might do it against the sexual offences list, but in fact I do not have too much faith in that list. It has for a very long time not been updated properly. It is not complete. I think the way we are dealing with it is in fact better because on the Persal system - which is a national staff system and it is also reported to SASE - whenever there is someone found guilty of such an offence that is a double-check. So yes, it is a concern. We will continue to deal with it and it is unacceptable. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That disposes with this interpellation.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Interpellation 3, hon member Mr Magaxa to Minister Madikizela. Minister Madikizela.

*Families waiting for housing: Saldanha Bay*

**3. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**



What are the full details of the situation regarding what happened to the 16 families in George Kerridge, Ward 9 Vredenburg in the Saldanha Bay Local Municipality who were removed from their plots with a promise that they would benefit from a housing development which was supposed to have taken place three years ago?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. The actual number of families that we moved is 14, not 16. These families were always earmarked to be accommodated in George Kerridge Phase 2, UISP 252 Enhanced Site Service Project.

In this project each beneficiary household acquires access to a fully serviced site. Sites have been allocated to the 14 concerned families but only three families have moved to the sites.

The remaining eleven families refused to move as they are demanding top structures. They were never part of the Ikamvalethu Top Structure Project of 464 houses and will only be considered for future housing projects together with other beneficiaries of the George Kerridge Phase 2 UISP 252 Project and it also should be noted that in terms of the directive from the National Minister we are now making all attempts to ensure that we prioritise the most deserving people and these are the people, who are about 40. These are the people who are the child-headed households and these are also disabled people. So at present the eleven families are settled on a neighbouring temporary location area with shared water and toilet facilities. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Chairperson thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, actually my intention on this matter is not to pick up a fight with the MEC. In 2011 a PHP project was supposed to build about 900 houses in this ward, but only 463 were built. The rest were relocated to temporary plots with no basic services and they are still there to this date. 42 beneficiaries were removed from where their plots were originally because the municipality promised to put in place proper infrastructure for building houses. Four years later this has proven to be an empty promise. About 166 plots had their business plans approved but the project was stopped. What is almost concerning is this 16, honourable Minister, because I have got their particulars with me. I can assist you with those particulars, who were removed from original plots, placed on plots with no basic services and we are told that houses cannot be built on their plots on the basis that that is an open space. These families have been paying municipal account bills on those plots, while not staying there, since 2011.

Matthew Reid, ward councillor of ward 9 at George Kerridge, has been writing letters to the MEC since 28 April 2014 and he has not received any response and that is why I want to appeal to the EMC because those are poor people. Paying services for a place you are not even living in, which has a potential even to discredit him in terms of the chances to acquire any credit anywhere if one is having a lot of money that he cannot afford to pay. I am

just raising this matter so that we will take it as a matter of urgency.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Maybe if I can give the background and the project description it will make sense about the 14 families because I agree with the Minister, it is 14 families, of which three have moved to the UISP Programme.

In 2007 the Department approved an emergency housing programme project to provide rudimentary shared services to 152 households in the informal settlement called George Kerridge on the outskirts of Ongegund Vredenburg and 2011 it was decided to convert this project to an Upgrading of Informal Settlement Programme Project for 978 households. This project would provide fully serviced sites and be followed by top structures through the People's Housing Process at a rate determined by available funding and Saldanha Municipality Council priorities; up till then the Saldanha Bay Municipality had proactively partially serviced 375 sites from own funding for which they were refunded by the Department during September 2011. Now we must remember that in 2007 it was the ANC Municipality, now after 2011 it is the DA-run municipality. Altogether 527 sites were partially serviced by the end of 2011.

From the reimbursed funding received from the Department the Saldanha Municipality awarded a tender to install a proper level of roads and storm-water management to these 527 sites.

Now housing delivery via the PHP under the project name of Ikamvalethu has progressed well. The unfortunate part is hon member Mr Magaxa, that the 14 families were not part of the top structure project and cannot be allowed to jump the queue. The only thing that was there for them was for them to move to the service sites, which they refused to do.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Member, your time has expired in this slot.

Ms L M MASEKO: I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think it is not bad for one to say she does not understand something when she really does not understand. The reality there is, I am talking about people who are still paying. They have been removed. They are not talking about top structures. I do not know what the honourable is talking about, because I never talked about the top structure here. I am talking about people who have been genuinely removed because there was a development that was to take place so that they can have access to basic services. Therefore those people have been moved to temporary areas, but which do not have those services, but the problem that concerns them is that they keep on receiving rates that they are owing to the municipality on that place. Their understanding is that they have been removed, because it is an open space according to the municipality. But that contradicts that knowledge when they receive that kind of account. That is

the problem here, that I am appealing to the MEC to address. That story that the Chairperson of the Human Settlements is howling about, I do not understand.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thanks very much. At present the eleven families that are settled on the neighbouring temporary location areas are having the services with the shared water and toilet facilities. I want to make an appeal to the hon Minister, to his leadership and spirit of humanity; amongst these people that are here there is a particular person who is so old, who is called Malilwana [Inaudible.] who was born in 1944 on the old plot number 10643.

I want to make an appeal, Minister, and I know that you have been saying this for a long time, that we need to take care of the old, the disabled and the young ones, that you take this upon yourself that you assist this person, because if the person is now 71 and does not have a house it is going to take a very long process for that person to get a house and by the time that is approved and done and he had to be relocated to the house, the person might be gone already and we do not ... (intervention)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: And we do not want to face a situation like that, please...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Hinana, your time has expired. Thank you. Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thanks Mr Deputy Speaker. I think all I want to appeal for is that the MEC must make a follow-up. I am prepared to provide him with the details of those families that are residing currently in an informal settlement with no services while they are having in terms of the rates and so on a space on their name. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker and to the hon member for raising this issue with me. I think there are two issues here. I think I agree with the hon member Mr Magaxa that *tezintsapho kufuneka zibhatele ngoku, kodwa zingahlali kulendawo bezihlala kuyo, ndifuna ukuqinisekisa mhlekazi into yoba ndizoyilandela lonto. Siqinisekise ukuba elotyala labo liyacinywa, because akufanelekanga ukuba bayabhatala bengahlali kulondawo. But indawo yesibini yintoyoba into eyenzekayo unyanisile, I think umhlali ngaphambili naye xa enika lembali yinto yoba emva koba kwathathwa isigqibo sokuba bonke aba bantu bazolungiselelwa mhlekazi uMagaxa banikwe izindlu into eyenzekayo yinto yoba lento yenziwa in phases ngelishwa aba sithetha ngabo ngoku bebengekho kule phase yokuqala bazoba kule phase yesibini izindlu eziyi 252 but into esiyithethayo silisebe sithi mabasuke kulendawo bahleli*

kuyo bamuvele kwindawo ebhetele because lendawo sithi mabamuvele kuyo ine site ine toilet ezi flaswayo I sevisiwe landawo so that balinde phantsi kwemeko ezibhetele because I PHP lendlela esizoyenza ngayo lento, so izothi ifika I project babe besezizeni zabo so nantso into esiyithethayo so into endizoyenza ndizoyilandela lomcimbi woba bebhataliswa, so that bazocinyelwa ityala labo and then sikwazi kwakhona ukuzama intoyoba bayi understande into yobana siba mover kulendawo ingekho right kule ibhetele so that xa kufika le Project yePHP ifike bakwazi ukwakhelwa Enkosi.

\*Those families who need to pay now but are not staying where they used to stay, I am assuring you sir that I will follow that up. I will make sure of that. Those accounts will be cleared because they are not supposed to pay rates while not residing there, Secondly, I think it is true when the chairperson gave this report because a decision was taken that all them would be put in places, hon member Mr Magaxa, and be given houses. What is now happening, this is done in phases, unfortunately these people we are talking about were not in phase 1, they will be in phase 2 with 252 houses. What we are saying, as the department, is that they must move out from where they are residing now and move to a better place because the place we are moving them to is a site with flushing toilets, the place has been serviced, so that they can wait under better conditions because we will do it in a PHP way. When the project starts they will be on their sites, so that's what we are saying.

So I will follow up the issue of paying the rates, so that their accounts can be cleared, and then make them to understand that we are moving them from the

bad site to the better site, so that when the PHP project arrives, we build for them. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I guess [Inaudible.] MEC of Education.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That ends the interpellation.

[Debate concluded.]

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Questions for Oral Reply. I have been informed that Question number 1 has been withdrawn.

[Question 1 to Minister of Local Government, Environment Affairs and Development Planning withdrawn.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then move on to Question number 2. Hon Minister Madikizela.

### *Youth: skills development programme*

#### **1. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether his Department has a skills development programme for youth;



if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker and from the Chairperson. The Youth and Human Settlements Programme or Youth Brigade is currently being implemented by my Department within the following municipalities:

- Oudtshoorn in Rose Valley PHP, a three year apprenticeship in plumbing. There are 15 learners and the second year to start in November 2015.
- The City of Cape Town Mountain View PHP, three year apprenticeship in plumbing and electrical. There are 15 learners in plumbing and there are 15 learners in electrical and the second year will start next month for this particular apprenticeship;
- A skills programme in Ocean View was completed in 2015 for painting and decorating. 13 candidates completed successfully of whom six are currently employed by a Mellon Housing Initiative as painting subcontractors and carpentry; 11 candidates completed of whom four are currently employed by Mellon Housing Initiative in carpentry.
- [Inaudible 00:57:04] Initiative with Bardale. I think we have just lodged that project recently. Masilingani Paint Project would be implemented as follows: in terms of skills programmes there will be 30 bricklayers, 20 plasterers, 15 people who are involved in carpentry and 15 in plumbing. So the training will commence on the

31<sup>st</sup> of August.

So these are young people that are involved in our various apprenticeships within the Department and those are the areas where they are involved. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Well done.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, hon member Ms Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. I just want to find out from the Minister, the small municipalities that are struggling especially in the rural areas, that roll-out, are you going to introduce and oversee that that happens in those rural areas?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, what we are doing now, because we can have a certain number of intake per year, we are rolling this out to different municipalities, as I have mentioned we started in the City of Cape Town and moved to Oudtshoorn, and we just launched another one here now in the City of Cape Town and we have been communicating this to various municipalities so our intention is to roll it out to a number of municipalities, as far as we can reach.

Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next question,

Question number 3, again Minister Madikizela.

*Housing opportunities for women*

**2. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether any women from the Western Cape benefited from housing opportunities that the National Minister of Human Settlements, Minister Lindiwe Sisulu announced during 2014; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think if I am correct, hon member Ms Maseko, Chair, you want to know whether any women contractors from Western Cape benefited from housing opportunities that the National Minister Ms Lindiwe Sisulu announced during 2014?

My Department is implementing the following initiatives that involve women in partnership with a number of parastatals and other Departments:

- Small, medium and micro enterprises: currently we are utilising the services of 14 SMME women contractors with regard to unblocking of projects within the PHP space.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: May I ask a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: May I ask the Minister a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is busy replying to a question now.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But I would like to ask him a question Chair, a follow-up, in response to that before he even goes further.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not the practice that you interrupt the Minister to ask a question while he is responding to a question, but if the Minister is prepared to take the question... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I have not even finished responding to the question, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Minister is not prepared to take a question.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You will, afterwards you are going to, afterwards hey?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Afterwards, okay.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There are currently 14 SMME women contractors who are busy with the unblocking of projects within the PHP.

We have a total of 26 contractors that were appointed and we are going to use 15, which is more than 50% of the women, and the Department has committed just over R176 million for this project, where women are involved. Currently my Department also implements the [Inaudible.] Human Settlements programme which also involves women, and these are the problems that I spoke about in my previous answer. Out of 80 potential candidates in the projects that I spoke about, that we are implementing in Bardale, 36 females indicated their interest to participate in this particular programme of 8 individuals as part of our Youth Brigade that we launched in Bardale.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable... no follow up question? Do you want to use the opportunity for a follow up question?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reason why I started there was because the Minister was answering a question and it says: "Whether any women from the Western Cape benefited from housing opportunities that the National Minister..." – and the question goes on. The Minister answered about women contractors; he is just proving the kind of sweet-heart question they keep putting. How did he know that the question was about women contractors? And he was answering about women

contractors. That is why I stopped him in the middle.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister you may respond.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is because the announcement that was made by the National Minister referred to women contractors, so it has nothing to do with the fact that this was a sweet-heart question. That is why... [Interjections.] ... I am answering this question this way because I am linking it to the announcement that the Minister made. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. We proceed to Question number 4. Hon member Mr Max to hon Minister Grant. Hon Minister Grant?

*Pedestrian safety: N7 - Dunoon*

**3. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

What steps are his Department taking to ensure the safety of pedestrians along the N7 in the Dunoon informal settlement?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you hon member Mr Max for the question. The Department of Transport and Public Works has identified the N7, the Dunoon area, as a critical hazardous location and as such the location receives

particular attention under a project called “Operation Zero.” Operation Zero is an evidence-based operational plan focusing on identified hot spots with the aim of reducing road fatalities at these locations. At the N7 Dunoon area, Provincial Traffic law enforcement together with stakeholders, such as SAPS, the City of Cape Town Traffic and Metro Police, deploy patrol teams to ensure high visibility on a daily basis. Officers are also dedicated to the area, specifically during peak hours, to assist pedestrians to cross the N7 safely.

Other initiatives relating to the N7 include the next phase of average speed-over-distance technologies planned to be rolled out on the N7, which will include the Dunoon area, in order to address the speeding problem experienced on the route.

Secondly, as part of the upgrade of the route there will be increased street lighting. This process is in an advanced tender stage and is in the process of being awarded.

Thirdly, the subway in the vicinity of Dunoon has been cleared, which will make for easier pedestrian passage under the N7. Enhancements are being considered around the subway in order to channel pedestrians in that direction.

Fourthly, pedestrian and driver awareness interventions are held in Dunoon from time to time, in collaboration with various partners, including the City of Cape Town.

Finally, the fifth step is that I personally met with the stakeholders from the Dunoon area in order to brainstorm solutions with our officials and will continue to engage with the community. A further meeting is in the process of being set up with the community.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow up? Hon member Mr Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Could I ask the MEC, when he states that he has met with the community members, if he could please indicate which structures from Dunoon he actually engaged with? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which structures? Answer to the question.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Let him answer himself. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: There is no-one home. [Interjections.] Because there was no-one home. The answer is: on 18 June there were at least 6 NGO organisations, together with a packed hall, at half past six to eight o'clock in the evening, and that was followed up with the formal meeting with the ward councillor on 28 June with all the community leaders. They are now looking at the proposals we are making for



enhancing safety and that is the next meeting I alluded to. But that involves all the other people on the other side of the highway, so we have bracketed both sides of the N7.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Dugmore, another one?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much. So would the Minister agree that those structures in Dunoon, including the ANC, are offering their full co-operation in regard to actually dealing with these particular challenges? [Interjections.].

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, where people's lives are at risk there is no party affiliation. We serve everyone without fear or favour. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question. Question 5, also hon Minister Grant.

*Conradie Hospital site: development of*

**4. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

What are the future plans for the development of the Conradie Hospital

site, after the demolition of buildings?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to hon member Mr Max for another question. Cabinet has agreed to select a number of game-changers drawn from the Provincial Strategic Priorities and at the November 2014 Cabinet Bosberaad the Better Living Model was approved as a game-changer. This seeks to efficiently design, fund and develop identified sites into residentially mixed-use developments with the intention of establishing key replicable levers to unlock state property.

In support of this programme the Conradie Hospital site was identified to serve as a pilot development for a mixed-use, mixed-income and mixed-tenure development. This was affirmed at the Provincial Cabinet Bosberaad on 22 April 2015.

The Better Living Model Steering Committee has been created to support the delivery of the joint Game-Changer Project on the former Conradie Hospital site between the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town. A professional technical team is in the process of being appointed to work with the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town to develop the detailed proposal for the site.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC if he could name the members of the Steering Committee that he referred to.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the most important person is Mark Munro, who is the transaction leader of that team.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further? Hon member Mr Dugmore, a second one?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Yes. Could I ask is Mr Munro an official or a private consultant?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, Mark Munro went through a selection process by a panel of experts and he was appointed. He comes from the private sector.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, number 3?

Mr C M DUGMORE: And then the third question I would like to ask is: in regard to the team that has been appointed, could you confirm or deny that that team has broad based economic empowerment status and at what level?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, people are engaged in the Department in terms of quality and basically on merit. Obviously if there are candidates who are historically disadvantaged of equivalent quality, then they will get preference. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question; Question number 6. Hon member Ms Botha to hon Minister Plato. Hon Minister Plato?

*Rape cases: 2014/2015 financial year*

**5. Ms L J Botha to ask Mr D Plato, Minister for Community Safety:**

(a) How many rape cases were reported at police stations in the Western Cape for the 2014/2015 financial year, and (b) how many of these cases resulted in successful convictions?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. SAPS inform me that they are not at liberty to provide us with the statistics as they will only be released later this year when the National Crime Stats are released.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No further follow-ups there. Then we move to question – is there a follow-up? Hon member Ms Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Given that the SAPS' policy shifted from releasing the crime stats twice a year to once a year, are you finding that this release is hampering your ability to do effective oversight?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes. We are in negotiations with SAPS for a more regular release of crime stats so that we can follow the trends, so that we can have a sense of where to shift our resources to. Currently it is not possible to do anything like that. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You will agree MEC that even without the stats you know where the problem is in Khayelitsha, so you do not need those stats. Do you agree with me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister? [Interjections.] Order, order. Is that a point of order? I could not hear.

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, just one second. Hon member

Ms Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: A member is not permitted to request an opinion from the Executive, if that is my understanding of the Rules of the Questions.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think it is a fair question. Minister Plato if you want to respond to that?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Despite the release of the crime stats we do our best to deal with any criminal issue wherever it might occur.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question, Question number 7, hon member Mr Kivedo. Hon Minister Plato again.

*Safeguarding of learners in rural areas*

**6. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

With reference to increasing reports of learners becoming victims of criminal activities in rural areas on their way to and from schools, (a) what safety measures are in place to safeguard their safety and (b) terminate criminal activities in the areas?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, rural safety co-ordinators in the rural areas must, in accordance with the rural safety strategy, engage with schools in the rural community in terms of projects and programmes on rural safety.

Rural safety co-ordinators patrol the said routes to and from schools during their normal patrol. Sector Managers and social crime members, responsible for programmes at schools, visit all schools to enhance the safety at schools and also safety of scholars.

Rural safety co-ordinators address the occurrence of crime through communication with the relevant school authorities and parents; also we engage with the local SAPS from time to time to ensure police increase visibility in these areas where crime is happening, and we also engage with our local CPFs and Neighbourhood Watches, as crime occurs.

Rural safety plans are also in place in most of the rural areas where the Police Sector Commander Officer is in charge. All rural safety issues get addressed by all the above-mentioned structures as they are brought to our attention, and the plea is to report all incidents, all safety issues and all safety concerns.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Follow up question. Thank you, Minister Plato, for the

answer. So what I want to get clear is: with respect to these rural safety officers who are entrusted with this specific function, is it an inter-sectoral engagement; so the Department of Education is involved, Safety, Transport and other institutions?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: As I have indicated, it is a combination of entities involved, not only the Department of Education; they will never be able to deal with safety on its own. It is a partnership; Department of Community Safety, Education, South African Police, Neighbourhood Watches and CPFs etcetera.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids first.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. My question to the MEC is, can he indicate to us where in the rural areas, just mention one area, where this is implemented?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, my take is that the rural safety plan has got to be in place in all areas. I go around from area to area, quite often, to inspect if it is in place. Many towns, many areas.

An HON MEMBER: Where?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Even your area, if you are in charge of your area. [Interjections.] That is it. [Interjections.]



An HON MEMBER: There is nowhere.

An HON MEMBER: Where?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: All areas in the Western Cape.

There are many towns, many areas in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Where?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Think for yourself. Thank you.

[Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Ms Dijana first.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to know from the MEC: when are you intending to develop it in my area? Because you know that in my area there is nothing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Not correct. Then I want to say to the hon member that she is not aware of what is happening in her area.

There is a rural safety... [Interjection.]

Ms T M DIJANA: How? How?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... plan in place in Beaufort West. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms T M DIJANA: In Beaufort West?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, the last opportunity.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I want to agree with member... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You must ask a question please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: My first question was not answered but my second question is if the MEC can give us a written report on that - what he just said because it is not implemented in the rural areas.

An HON MEMBER: It is not a question. You must request a written reply.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I disagree with that. Let me say, last year in Worcester with your Deputy Minister Skwatsha and your Deputy Minister Tshwete [Interjections.] and with the Deputy Minister for Police... [Interjections.] ... we released the Rural Safety Plan for the Western Cape in Worcester. I was part of the launch; it was a massive, big launch and a lot of ANC speakers were present with me on the stage when we launched it. And not, and let me say... [Interjections.] ... not one of the ANC members sitting here was present. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]. Order! We move on to Question number 8. Hon member Mr Kivedo. Hon Minister Schäfer?

*Mathematics and natural science: learner qualifications*

**\*8. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether there are any measures in place to ensure that learners who perform well in mathematics and natural science are encouraged to qualify themselves in education; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The CAPS for Life Orientation in the General Education and Training and FET phases cover the content for Careers and Career Choices. Learners are expected to complete an interest questionnaire from Grade 7 to determine their interest in

a career field of study, which leads to a specific career. Learners must research a variety of career opportunities that fall within their interest field. One career opportunity to learners is obviously the teaching profession; they are exposed to the important role of teaching and the value of becoming a teacher. Learners are taught the importance of scarce skills in Mathematics, Life Sciences and Physical Sciences. Learners are also encouraged to follow a career in teaching throughout their years at school.

The fact that there are bursaries and financial aid available is also emphasised. Learners have access to NSFAS funding in order to become teachers. The Funza Lushaka Bursary Scheme is also available should they wish to pursue a career in the teaching profession, provided that Mathematics and Sciences is part of the course of study at a university. This provides an incentive for them.

The bursary is awarded by the Government and is available to students electing to study a certain degree, diploma or certificate course, e.g. the B.Ed Degree, Advanced Diploma in Education or the Post Graduate Certificate in Education with the intention of becoming a Mathematics or Science teacher.

The Funza Lushaka Bursary is awarded to students for the duration of their study course and a student is assured of employment once they have successfully obtained the required qualification.

We have a number of Maths and Science focus schools across the province but the emphasis is not specifically on teaching as a profession but rather to encourage those who have the ability to take Maths and Science as subjects. I do think it is something we could look further at in order to enhance our efforts to highlight the importance of Maths and Science teachers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you for the response hon Minister; it is very heartening. I do not think it will be fair of me to ask for figures at this stage but perhaps at a later stage I would be interested to know, especially from universities, colleges and other institutions; how many students are enrolled for their B.Ed or Teachers Diplomas or whatever the case may be with Mathematics and Physics as majors.

An HON MEMBER: You said you are not going to ask the question.

An HON MEMBER: He thinks she cannot answer.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Ja.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: You can ask the question but I cannot answer because it does not fall within my Department, it falls under the National Department of Higher Education.

Mr B D KIVEDO: That is why [Inaudible].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there no further follow-ups? [Interjections.] No further follow-ups. Then we proceed to Question number 9. Hon member Ms Wenger to Minister Plato. Minister Plato?

*IDZ: Saldanha police station, capacity and resources*

**9. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Given the development of the Industrial Development Zone, whether there are any plans to provide additional capacity and resources to the Saldanha police station; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, my apologies. Let me just grab my stuff quickly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question number 9.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, go to the next question please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will let Minister Plato find his papers. Let us proceed to Question number 10. [Interjections.] Question 10, hon member Mr Dyantyi to Minister Bredell. [Interjections.]

*Oudtshoorn: intervention by COGTA*

**10. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

What monitoring and support plan has his Department put in place to ensure that the intervention by Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs (COGTA) succeeds in Oudtshoorn?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Die onlangse ingryping in Oudtshoorn Munisipaliteit is inderdaad 'n provinsiale ingryping ingevolge Artikel 139(1)(b) van die Grondwet en die aangestelde Administrateur is verder getaak met die implementering van die ondersteuning en die Goeie Regeringspakket soos voorgestel deur die Minister van Samewerkende Regering en Tradisionele Aangeleenthede. Die Administrateur is beklee met al die magte en die funksies redelik benodig om te verseker dat behoorlike funksionering van die munisipaliteit en die Raad herstel word. Die Administrateur sal bygestaan word deur 'n span amptenare van hierdie provinsie sowel as van Nasionaal.

My Departement van Plaaslike Regering het deur sy moniteringsfunksie voor die inwerkingtreding van die ingryping reeds verskeie kommerwekkende aangeleenthede binne die munisipaliteit geïdentifiseer; die tekortkominge deur my en my Departement geïdentifiseer tesame met dit wat deur die

Minister van SARTA in die Ondersteuning en Goeie Regeringspakket geïdentifiseer is, sal nou ingesluit word in 'n omvattende ondersteuningsplan.

Die Administrateur wie aan die Provinsiale Uitvoerende Gesag verantwoordbaar is sal maandeliks aan my as die verteenwoordiger van die Provinsiale Uitvoerende gesag skriftelik verslag doen. Ek sal op my beurt aan die Minister, die Nasionale Minister verslag doen soos en wanneer benodig. Dankie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can I just ask a quick one? When is the next report expected from the Administrator, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, I do not have the exact date. Currently I am actually getting weekly reports, but we have settled on a monthly report. I will meet Mr Chetty again tonight. There are a lot of things that we are busy implementing and so forth, and we know that Municipalities are reporting fatigue, but myself and Minister Gordhan keep a close eye on this. It will be around about the end of this month, more or less between the 25<sup>th</sup> and the 30<sup>th</sup> of the month.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Second question hon member Mr Dyantyi?



Mr Q R DYANTYI: A comment from your side MEC that the issues that could come out of that report from the Administrator; to implement them without fear or favour.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Definitely. To get the municipality right we need to act without fear and favour and my knowledge of the Administrator is that he will. We have got a support team there. We must remember I am a firm believer that one person cannot turn a municipality; it is a team of people and they will all obviously report to him.

We have managed at least to have the first Council meeting without people chasing one another out of the Council Chamber and they have debated, there were thorough debates and things, but they have completed the first Council meeting I think in two years; that is a positive, and there are really still a lot of issues, but I will not play with peoples' lives. There are a couple of reports, a couple of investigations, we have got a forensic unit there and if a person is guilty we will take the right procedures through the courts and then the media can take it up there, but we will not play politics with peoples' lives.

Minister Nel and I went to Oudtshoorn and I also put it there to the senior personnel "if you have done nothing wrong, you do not have to fear." We are not going to play bad politics within the media. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Does the MEC believe that this is the best intervention compared to the botched one that you yourself and the Mayor of Cape Town and others wanted to implement before this came in?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I do not quite understand the question and I cannot understand why the question is being asked because you know Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC must really not try to make politics out of this. They have got a member on their PEC, Mr Faiez Jacobs, who wants to take this into the political domain; he is going to bleed badly within that debate, I can promise him that. This is the ANC's mess that we are trying to solve... [Interjections.] ... so there is no... [Interjections.] Ja, ja, and the ANC knows it. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No, this is two years of the ANC's mess that we are trying to solve... [Interjections.] ... where the ANC – and I did not want to take this debate there but they want to, and then we go there. They have neglected to adhere to our Constitution, they just ignore this country's Constitution in that Municipality, they ignored any principles of law for two years, they have run legal fees up in millions, and they must

realise the people are not stupid; the people know that.

So Mr Faiez Jacobs can go to the newspapers, we will tackle that debate one of these days but we will do the right thing. And currently I have got a very good working relationship with the National Department, because I am still of the opinion that I serve the people and we need to do the best for the people, as I want to do the best for the people in Cederberg, as I want to do the best for the people in Kannaland, as in Beaufort West, but we will need to work together, and Provincial Government and National Government must realise they are not the boss of Local Government. They must support and they must come with a support package to make Local Government work. That is our job and I really wish that we also can enter into agreement in some of our other municipalities where myself and the National Department will go in and solve the issues. Thank you.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: MEC Meyer [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then revert to Question number 9 which had been standing over for a while. Hon member Mr Plato.

*IDZ: Saldanha police station, capacity and resources*

**11. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Given the development of the Industrial Development Zone, whether there are any plans to provide additional capacity and resources to the Saldanha police station; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Baie dankie dat jy my uitgehelp het, ek waardeer dit. Looking at the question, the resources allocation at Saldanha, that specific police station, my answer is as follows: During the 2013/14 financial year five posts were allocated to Saldanha; during the 2014/15 financial two posts allocated and during the 2015/16 financial year current, another two posts.

What is happening in cases like these, when assessments get done, as more people move into a specific area, police do assess the resource allocation at the respective police stations and then they allocate more personnel accordingly. It is exactly what will happen in this case at Saldanha as well. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there a follow-up? Hon member Ms Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you. I would like to ask the Minister whether the new officers that are going to be allocated to Saldanha are new recruits, meaning that it will be two years before they join the police station, or have they already been allocated?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is unfortunately back to point one of the question; they are unfortunately new recruits; some of them are already busy with their training and as they are finished with the training they will be allocated. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Wenger, a second one?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you. I would like to know if there has been a study to determine how many more police officers will be needed for the Industrial Development Zone in Saldanha and whether the new allocation matches or will be sufficient for the new developments there.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The [Inaudible.] across the Western Cape and across South Africa is still in place. As I said earlier, as a situation in any area, any town changes with a massive influx like we anticipate will happen at the IDZ in Saldanha, my take is that the police will accordingly also provide more manpower to that station as well, including other resources such as vehicles, equipment etcetera.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, follow-up?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: MEC do you have the same response in other areas that

are growing even faster than what the IDZ will be growing, that are currently growing faster? Are you beefing up police in those areas?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is my understanding and that is why on a week to week basis I have a session with the Western Cape Police leadership. As I receive information I filter it down to them and obviously they fill me in with regard to such instances as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley, this is the last opportunity, the fourth one.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you very much. Hon Minister can you confirm that you do not appoint any police officers, so you do not beef up any police forces at all? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister do you want to respond to that?

Mr M G E WILEY: It requires an answer please, for the record. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I do not understand that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Look, as I have said, I think what is important is that continued assessment of the area and obviously if there is – let me first and foremost say to you, we are facing a major

resourcing problem in the Western Cape. I think the reports are that we are 5 000 manpower under-resourced. So let me further say, we continuously talk to the police and to the national political leadership about the current situation in the Western Cape and I have to agree that 85% of all police stations in the Western Cape are currently under-resourced and that is a major problem. It is hampering even rural safety, an issue we were talking previously about, hampering continued visible policing, so we are facing issues and problems, but despite that we still address the situation and try to assist the police as far as we can.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next question which is now Question number 11. Hon member Ms Uys to ask Minister Mbombo, Minister of Health. Minister Mbombo?

*Surgical procedures: interns not supervised*

**12. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Health:**

Why are interns performing surgical procedures without supervision at hospitals?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. The Department is not aware of any interns performing surgical procedures without supervision. If the member has any evidence of this we would like to encourage that the evidence be brought forward, as we all know that it is illegal to allow

students to perform any surgical procedures if they are not supervised by at least a registrar. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker may I just ask the MEC, and thanks for the answer, what is the number of interns working in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I do not have that information right now because it is a statistic, so I do not know how many interns are working in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, a second opportunity?

Mr P UYS: Well, that is normally a big issue because everybody knows what that number is there. May I ask whether they enquired at any stage, from any organisation, especially the Health Professionals Council in South Africa, whether there are any transgressions happening?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: There has not been anything of that sort. Again, as I indicated earlier, we might know in terms of how many in the intake of students, but with regard to the interns it depends on the progression through the programme, because it is only in their sixth and seventh year where they become interns. And then the issue of transgressions,



we are not aware that there have been any. Also considering that for all training hospitals it is a requirement to meet the legal requirements in order for them to be accredited by the Health Professional Council.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, your third opportunity.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. May I ask the MEC what mechanisms did you put in place seeing that you are not aware of anything happening, to actually detect these procedures taking place by interns within your Department, in the light of studies that show that one in every three interns do surgical procedures without supervision?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: As I indicated earlier, if the member has got that evidence he must bring it forward. We do not have any of that, because it is illegal for interns to practice without supervision. So if you have got that evidence bring it forward.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a fourth one, hon member Mr Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister, in terms of what you have said that it is illegal to perform surgery without the necessary supervision, if I am in possession of the information and do not go and report a crime, do I not then become an accessory to the crime? [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, is it ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I did not hear the last part. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: If they do not report a crime, if the member is aware of a crime and does not report the crime, does he not become an accessory to the crime? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! We proceed to the next question. Question number 12. Hon member Mr Uys again. Minister Mbombo?

*Safety of staff and patients at health facilities*

**\*12. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Health:**

What is she and her Department doing to ensure the safety of (a) staff and (b) patients at health facilities?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Firstly in terms of the response, we have got policy imperatives, which is the Provincial Cabinet, which has designated the Department of Community Safety who is the custodian of Safety and Security. Number 2, we have got the Western Cape Provincial Security Strategy, and number 3, we have got our own Departmental Provincial Security Plan. And then in addition to that we are spending about R189 million for this financial year on security. For example in Mitchells

Plain, about R10 million for the security infrastructure upgrade and also for example in the Tygerberg Hospital where we have an emergency infrastructure upgrade and CCTV camera control rooms which have been previously equipped, for example at the Tygerberg Hospital. In addition to that we use the Chrysalis graduates that have been deployed as community leaders and officers within the hospitals and also have metal detectors at the entrances.

Then in the high risk areas, for example in Gugulethu, Manenberg, Hanover Park, Mitchells Plain and Tafelsig, we have beefed up security. Also note that we have got a standard package for the low risk areas and a standard package for high risk areas. Other safety measures are to develop a joint operational plan with SAPS, the Metro Police, law enforcement and also to increase private security through our service providers. In addition response vehicles from private security services providers also escort the staff in those areas. We have also revised our standard operating procedures for staff and visitors in terms of visiting times and also a prioritised infrastructure upgrade, including security.

We also conduct security risk assessments with assistance from DOCS in most of the facilities. We also keep information about all incidents reported. So that is just a summary of those.

The SPEAKER: A follow-up question?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thank you to the MEC. May I ask, what is then the different role between your Department and that of Community Safety? It seems like there is a synergy between the two, but what is that synergy?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: As I indicated earlier, it is part of the security strategy of the Western Cape Provincial Government for all the Departments. In addition to that, you will have your own departmental security plan. So what I was mentioning now I was mentioning in terms of the Department's security plan. We, with Safety, because they are the custodians of Safety and Security within the province – as I indicated earlier, for example the project within the Tygerberg Hospital, which is a tertiary hospital where they make use of, for example, the community liaison officers and also beef up the security in terms of the infrastructure. So they have got several projects within the Western Cape.

Then for us, we also have got our own; roughly if I can, just a summary of the Western Cape security approach in terms of the security strategy. We have a security structure where it starts from the head office, goes down to the district and then to the facilities. And then you will have the security systems where we use the hybrid model in terms of the in-sourcing – I mean the in-house plus the outsourcing. And then you have the upgrade of the infrastructure where we have to abide by the minimum norms and standards according to SIRA, which is the Security Act.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thank you MEC. So when you call for tenders for security companies, is that your Department's responsibility or is that the responsibility of the Department of Community Safety to appoint private security officers?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: As I indicated earlier, we adopted a hybrid model, which is the outsourcing and the in-sourcing. Currently we have about 1 274 private security guards, which are from outside, and then we have about 87 which are employed by us in-house, where we normally use them in areas like the neonatal wards and all of those. So in terms of private security, in terms of the whole process of the supply chain, it starts with the demand.

It is the same issue with the infrastructure where the Department of Public Works becomes the responsible implementing agent and then we are the client. So when it comes to private security demands, the first phase of the supply chain comes from us and then that is where we have a discussion in terms of the specs, so that we can then meet the requirements according to the SIRA, which is in terms of the bidding and all of that. It is in-house but in terms of analysing compliance it is the DOCS who goes and visits and assesses the place in order for the person to meet the requirements.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys?

Mr P UYS: And lastly – thank you, Madam Speaker – could the MEC maybe give us a number in the last month of the incidences of security breaches that took place at any health facility?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am not aware of any security breaches except in general terms where we find, like in Tygerberg, where there was a cable that had been stolen for example, and also in some of the areas like Hanover Park where you find that a CCTV camera was stolen. But we do not have security breaches where security is in place.

Also, I ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Probably. Also remember that in some of the [Inaudible.] we also have decentralisation. For example as I indicated with the Tygerberg project, we are working with the DOCS and then GSH do their own, in terms of standing alone. They have got their own, because it is also a tertiary hospital where we have decentralised the services.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. No follow-ups. We move to the next question.

The hon Minister of Health, a question from hon member Mr Fransman.

*G F Jooste Hospital: closure of*

**13. Mr M L Fransman asked the Minister of Health:**

(a) What is the reason why the GF Jooste Hospital was closed down permanently and (b) when was this decision taken?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Firstly it is inaccurate to state that the hospital has been closed down permanently; it was decommissioned.

An HON MEMBER: Okay, it's not actually [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Decommissioned. And also the Klipfontein area comprises of Manenberg, Gugulethu and Nyanga because the G F Jooste Hospital falls within that sub-district. G F Jooste Hospital before it was decommissioned was the only hospital that was serving the area. As you might be aware Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha were only effective later on. G F Jooste as we all know started in 1976 as an old age home, where it ended up being a hospital and then because of the amount of the patients it then ended up being extended. As a result, in 2013 the CSIR reported that the hospital structure was a health hazard because of the conditions and then it was decommissioned.

So the decommissioning period was between July 2013 to July 2014. At that time the Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha Hospitals were being commissioned. As I indicated earlier the G F Jooste was serving Manenberg, Gugulethu, Nyanga, Klipfontein and part of Khayelitsha East.

So now patients will be able to attend those two district hospitals that were not there previously. It used to be only the G F Jooste that was there. Then in addition to that, because there are challenges around the Manenberg area, related to injuries and violence, the Heideveld Emergency was opened together with the observation beds. In addition to that a Carnation Ward within Lenteguur was added to accommodate the psychiatry patients. In addition to that beds within the Helderberg Hospital were also commissioned to accommodate that.

So that was the time that it started. So at the time it was because it was a health hazard and the recommendations at the time were to demolish and then to rebuild a district hospital again.

HON MEMBERS: [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman? Hon Dyantyi you have a member on the floor please. Thank you. Your first follow-up.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, when is the rebuilding happening, as you have just correctly at the end said? [Interjection.] The hon MEC said right at the end, the rebuilding was to happen after the initial decommissioning.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In November 2014 the analysis was done to



review the rebuilding because of the increase in the number of the population in the Western Cape, also in the interests of the patients around the area and also in terms of the disease profile.

So it was realised that that scenario to demolish and then rebuild could not fit in because the scenario had changed completely because of the increase in the population and because of the kind of patient profiles. Also noting that G F Jooste at that time was not providing obstetrics and also paediatrics, which are about mothers and children.

So that means now that area, three years later, needed to have such services that were not there prior to that. And that when the recommendation was made, at the end of 2014, what was actually needed was no longer a district hospital, which is quite minimal in terms of the services, but it needed a regional hospital, and also because of the increase in the population, at least a 550 beds hospital.

So this year there was a submission to the Cabinet, where we have to submit a request in terms of asking permission to change from a district to a regional hospital. By that time we had already made an assessment and we found that that site is about 3 hectares and what is needed for 550 beds is about 7 hectares and we could not fit in there.

So where are we now? We have submitted the business case to National in terms of changing from a district to a national hospital and then for the

2016... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: A national hospital?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes. For the 2016 budget we have to start in terms of what needs to happen. Probably as you are aware when it comes to the infrastructure gate system, the whole part of stage 1 takes about 18 months where we have to do all this, the design and all of that. So roughly now we are busy with the design and/or the planning stage of phase 1. It takes about 18 months. By 2017, 2018, 2019 – it takes about four... [Interjections.] ... so roughly it takes about four years to build a hospital. By 2017, the next budget, we have committed in terms of the initial stage to rebuilding the hospital.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Follow-up?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, what we have just heard from the MEC, from decommissioning and then to rebuilding it, as she said earlier, now to the closure. What consultation took place with the community to actually close this particular hospital?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: As I indicated earlier the hospital was not closed, it was decommissioned. So during the processes... [Interjections.] ... as I indicated earlier, the processes, with the decommissioning from July 2013 to July 2014, that is when the community was consulted at the time.

Now in terms of assessing the situation which started now, it happened in November 2014... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...November 2014. So the submission went to the Cabinet early this year because you cannot start with consultations outside without firstly getting approval to change from a district to a regional hospital, and you cannot start with consultations until, as part of the whole hospital bed plan nationally; it is a business case that has been approved. So that is where we are now, and then afterwards that is where you now start with the consultations. [Interjections.]

Specifically for the hospital. But remember... [Interjections.] ... for the whole of Manenberg, it is part of the whole upgrade, the hospital is part of the whole process where there is already a community action plan in consultation with the communities about the whole aspect of the Manenberg upgrade.

The SPEAKER: Okay. I see hon member Ms Wenger and then the hon member Mr Fransman.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Given the shift from a district to a regional hospital and the increase in the number of beds as well as services, what kind of investment will the Department of Health be making

in this community and surrounding areas? [Interjections.].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Generally in terms of that we envisage...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: A 550 beds regional hospital is about roughly R3 billion including health technology because when you build a hospital you look at the infrastructure, the actual building construction, everything about it. And in terms of the policy you must remember, as I indicated earlier, the Department of Public Works is the implementing agent and then we are the client, and then in terms of the provisions there ... [Interjections.] ... it talks about employing the local people ... [Interjections.]... for everything. Local is not only the subcontractors and small companies. Remember that this is a... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Remember that this is a big hospital, so in terms of the people who are familiar with the infrastructure construction they will know that it is code 8 and above. [Interjections.] So it means that small companies will benefit around that, but not only the small companies. I indicated that it is technology, it is everything, infrastructure. We are talking about the economic upliftment of the community around that area.

[Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Order please hon members! Hon member Mr Fransman, the final question. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Magaxa you have a speaker on the floor. Hon member Mr Fransman, you may proceed.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, we have just heard that the hon MEC is talking about the difficulty about finding land. The reality is opposite that old site there are 7 hectares of land. This is the statement; is this true that end of 2012 the Provincial Government said – and are you changing from that MEC – the following: “The present planning is to close G F Jooste at the end of March 2013. It is planned that the construction should start in April 2013 and it will take approximately 36 months to complete. The half a billion rand reconstruction of G F Jooste will provide a full range of services for the people living in the area with specialist outreach and support.”

What we are now hearing MEC, you are now talking about another five years of planning to make an assessment. Tell the people of Manenberg that you have decided as a Provincial Government, under Premier Zille, to actually close... [Interjections.]... G F Jooste. That is what has happened here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members! I cannot allow this.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Maybe you want to correct yourself because

you say April 2013. Remember the decommissioning was July. But what I am saying is that even if that was then at the time, you have to consider that actually the hospital was still functioning. [Interjections.] So in July 2013 the report recommended that the hospital could not be utilised ... so it was ... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: 2013 [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am talking about later on. And also again, remember that when it comes to - probably because at least now, I am talking to the former Health Ministers, at least you understand, I do not have to explain in detail. You know very well that when you have to plan...[Interjections.]... around the health infrastructure either for a hospital or whatever, that is determined by the conditions, the illnesses around that time. So even if you plan to do A, B, C, D in 2015 or 2017, if the conditions change you have to respond to those conditions. [Interjections.] So it is always like that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, we now – order, please hon members.

An HON MEMBER: We will see next time.

The SPEAKER: We move to the last question. [Interjections.]. Order, please hon members, we have a speaker on the floor. Hon Minister Grant?

**14. Mr M L Fransman asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

(a) What measures are in place to ensure quality and effective construction of public buildings, (b) how are these measures enforced and (c) what punitive measures are taken if a contractor does not comply with these measures?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The answer to question 14(a). The following measures are in place: The procurement of contractors registered on the Construction Industry Development Board, registered contractors that grades contractors, in respect of the class of works and level of ability and capability to undertake construction work.

Secondly the implementation of completely revamped contract document templates utilising the latest available contractual mechanisms to ensure contractor compliance and high quality construction work.

Thirdly, the introduction of the NEC3 as a standard sector contract to improve contract management and control and to enhance a co-operating behaviour pattern in the execution of construction projects. This contract also facilitates sufficient cancellation where necessary.

The employment and utilisation of adequately trained in-house and consulting built environment professionals to ensure maximum utilisation of the available contractual documentation and resources.

And finally, fifthly, under (a), prerequisites of construction guarantees in respect of work rendered by contractors and professional liability insurance in respect of work rendered by independent built sector professional consultants.

Under (b), the measures are enforced through rigorous execution of contract conditions, ensuring compliance from all sides, including the contractor, consultants and in-house staff.

Secondly, development and continuous review of sector specific contract administration templates which are mandatory to be used in the execution of all construction contracts.

Thirdly, certification and verification of all completed construction work by consultants and in-house built environment professionals with full professional liability and accountability.

Madam Speaker, (c), in terms of the sector contracts the measures include contracts being subject to *inter alia* delay damages – in other words late completion penalties and low performance damages, penalties for inadequate



performance as a standard feature in all the contract documentation templates.

Actions that an organ of state can take against contractors for non-performance include firstly, recovering of all costs, losses or damages incurred or suffered as a result of poor performance. Secondly, blacklisting the contractor on the National Treasury database of restricted supplies and restricting the contractor from obtaining business from any organ of state for a period not exceeding ten years. Thirdly, convening an enquiry into any breach of the CIDB Code of Conduct and imposing the relevant sanctions.

All actions must be taken in accordance with the applicable procurement and CIDB regulatory frameworks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Fransman?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, based on the response of the MEC, just in terms of punitive measures, were any of the contractors that did not comply with its tender specifications and processes in fact blacklisted, or any of its directors blacklisted over the last 12 months?

An HON MEMBER: That is [inaudible] the consultants you appointed.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, as I said earlier in my speech today, when I was drowned out by a cacophony of sound from the Opposition benches, obviously we have put the contractor on notice and we are busy evaluating that situation. [Interjections.] And I said that we would report to the Standing Committee of Transport and Public Works with a specialist to evaluate it. We are doing everything to try and ensure that the liabilities for which the contractors are responsible are adhered to, so that the Government does not lose money and that we recover costs wherever we can from the contractor.

One of the things that I did say was that the concerns that have been raised – and maybe you did not listen properly because of all the noise – are as a result of the structural integrity of the design work by the project design engineers, and the report of the specialist engineer will enable decisions to be taken about the necessary remedial steps. But what we are not going to put at risk is the safety of our children.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, clearly the MEC does not even require silence not to understand, because I did not refer to any particular... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: You actually went for a particular score. I did not talk about that.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I did not mention [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Is there a point of order?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: You just did.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Fransman, sorry. Is it a point of Order Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: It is very clear what the Rules say, is that you can refer to the answer to the previous question and then you immediately ask your question. [Interjections.] The Leader of the Opposition is using it to do personal attacks. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, thank you. Your point is noted. Hon member Mr Fransman, you can engage the Minister in your response questions. Remember we spoke about “she, he” and “you”; it is hon Minister and hon member please.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: I will never allow an hon policeman to try and police me so I do not ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman ... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Not you, Wiley, not you.

The SPEAKER: No!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Not you.

The SPEAKER: That is unparliamentarily hon member Mr Fransman. You need to withdraw that statement please.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Which part of the statement?

The SPEAKER: You said “not you Wiley”, and “the policeman” and you are making a personal reference to the member.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Not hon Wiley.

The SPEAKER: Kindly withdraw that statement.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: I will withdraw the fact that I did not say “hon Wiley.”

Can I continue, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: You may.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: The MEC in fact referred to a particular score. The question is, if he refers to that, the question is did the MEC, the moment when those issues were identified on the Filcon contracts, also blacklist Filcon or any of its directors?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I do not deal with these issues routinely on a day to day basis and I did not mention Filcon. Is Filcon part of your question today?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Answer the question.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I have been in this House and I have told you what happened with Filcon. We went through the full processes. I am absolutely convinced that all of my officials who dealt with the Filcon matter did so transparently and efficiently. The fact that Filcon... [Interjections.] ... subsequently defaulted is neither here nor there. [Interjections.] Okay? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, do we hear... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Excuse me. Hon member Mr Tyatyam, is it a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Really a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Okay, proceed.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because you have ruled in this House that we must not use “you” or “her”, you must say hon member.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely.

Mr S G TYATYAM: And the hon Minister is using that, and I want to ask you Speaker to be firm with the Minister. He must withdraw. He has been doing that throughout this meeting.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Tyatyam. Hon Minister, you need to refer to the member as honourable member. Thank you. Will you

withdraw please?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed, hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Is it therefore clear that if we look at the answer that the MEC has given on (c), punitive measures, that they have actually decided not to put any punitive measures in the context of what the MEC said he will take when there is any misconduct, that the MEC has refused to in fact blacklist Filcon or any of its directors? But we have picked up a hunting down of small SMME contractors in his Department. Are we seeing this reality at play?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I am not sure if that is a question or a statement, but the hon member is welcome to put it to me in writing and I will give you the necessary answer.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members that concludes the end of Questions. We will now move to Questions to the Premier without notice. Are we all on the same page? Thank you. I recognise the hon member Mr Magaxa.

## **QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE:**

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to ask the Premier, how do you reconcile the R33 million spent by the City of Cape Town towards a sport event, with your response in the debate last week in defence of your failure to implement recommendations from the Khayelitsha Commission where you have arrogantly and ridiculously claimed that Khayelitsha ward councillors should spend their ward allocation to keep CCTV cameras working?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, I do not do budgeting in the City of Cape Town.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

An HON MEMBER: It is that side.

The PREMIER: That is a question that needs to be put to the hon the Mayor.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] There are two follow-ups. Hon member Mr Magaxa your first one?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes. In the light of the fact that the Khayelitsha



Commission highlighted already well known challenges of congestion, poor infrastructure, such as roads, street lighting and poor service delivery as the major contributing factors in dealing with crime in Khayelitsha, why therefore the DA... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, can I just stop you please? Hon Ministers... [Interjections.] ... Ministers Grant and... [Interjections.] ... Ministers Grant and Winde.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I think the passion between hon Schäfer and hon Mnqasela is too tight. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Members, please, can we display some respect? We have a speaker on the floor. Thank you. You may proceed hon member Mr Magaxa. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon Premier, in the light of the fact that Khayelitsha Commission highlighted already well known challenges of congestion, poor infrastructure such as roads, street lighting and poor service delivery as the major contributing factors in dealing with crime in Khayelitsha, why therefore the DA led City of Cape Town and the Province taking so long to respond to the simple identified issues despite the fact that the City of Cape Town is among the richest municipalities in the country?

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: There are 20 recommendations flowing out of the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry and the Province has implemented all of those that we can do without the signature of the National Minister which is what is delaying the process.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Magaxa your final follow-up.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Ja. Seemingly, hon Premier, you are experiencing problems. Now I just want to find out, now that you have been forced to step down as the DA Leader, do you perhaps feel that the Mayor of Cape Town does no longer take you seriously, and you have been reduced to a lame duck level with no authority and [Inaudible.] feeling helpless?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa – Chief Whip Wiley. [Interjections.] Members sorry... [Interjections.] ... apparently there is a point of order, sorry. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, the Rules are very clear; the follow-up questions are meant to refer to the original question. Now the Premier has already answered the section relating to Cape Town. It has got nothing to do with that. So it is relating to the Khayelitsha matter.

The SPEAKER: Related to the – thank you.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: But, Madam Speaker, the issue is the way I understood that third question, it relates to the fact that if the Premier is a lame duck she cannot therefore implement the Khayelitsha report. [Interjections.] That is the issue. And therefore we want the answer on that one. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Noted. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Max. Premier? [Interjections.] You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Yesterday I had a report back in Khayelitsha to go step by step through all the recommendations that we have been able to implement within our mandate and to identify those we have not been able to implement, because there needs to be a Memorandum of Understanding which the National Minister refuses to sign, despite the fact that we sent him a draft Memorandum almost a year ago.

What we have done is held very successful Community Police Forum elections, trained Community Police Forums; we have also held Sub Forums throughout Khayelitsha to focus on specific areas. We have been working very well with the Cluster Commander and the various police stations in that area and in addition we have incorporated the Khayelitsha Commission recommendations in the Annual Police Plan that we are submitting for incorporation in the National Annual Police Plan.

We have also committed a task force there that has worked very well with communities to stop vigilante killings and things have been improving

significantly. But on 95% of the recommendations we can only act if an instruction goes to the South African Police Services, which we are not empowered to do. And obviously that has to come from the National Minister because our Constitution envisages a delicate balance of power and oversight and checks and balances between three spheres of government.

So we believe that in the interests of the people of Khayelitsha and in the interest of the police in Khayelitsha the National Minister should put his signature at the bottom of a piece of paper; the police want it, the people of Khayelitsha want it, the City wants it, the Province wants it. That is what is intended by co-operative governance.

Let me get to a couple of other issues here. The ward allocations; Madam Speaker, I think it would be a very wise idea for communities across South Africa – but perhaps they do not have ward allocations in ANC run municipalities, but certainly across Cape Town what should happen is that residents should ask their councillors... [Interjections.] ... what councillors should be asked is what they are doing with their ward allocations, because in DA run wards those allocations are used to the benefit of the people... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

The PREMIER: ... that really support service delivery.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon members, a question was posed to the Premier; she is now responding. Please afford her the courtesy of response because if you raise your voices you will not hear the response. Thank you. You may proceed, hon Premier. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] that is why they can do that.

The SPEAKER: Heckling, interjections, we know the rules of the game, please. Thank you. Allow the Premier to proceed. You may proceed hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Madam Speaker. Where the DA runs a ward, those ward allocations are spent directly on service delivery issues for the people. In ANC wards they are spent on less honourable things. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a generalisation.

The PREMIER: It is not a generalisation. In fact I would be so bold as to say that the ANC introduced ward allocations as a covert method of funding their organisation and mobilisation in ANC wards. [Interjections.] And I have seen a lot of evidence of that.

Indeed, I am told, by the person in the City who manages this, that Khayelitsha has the second highest allocation of CCTV cameras by the City

directly... [Interjections.] ... in the entire ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And that is as it should be. And if... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

The PREMIER: And if every ward councillor in Khayelitsha just added one or two CCTV cameras it would make an enormous difference and they stopped buying loud hailers and holding parties and doing other things.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: CCTV cameras is a ward allocation.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, your finger please. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: I would like to just remind... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not an answer.

The PREMIER: ... the hon the Opposition.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Nice!

The PREMIER: I would just like to remind the hon the Opposition that I was

nominated uncontested as the Leader of the DA. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: No-one else was nominated. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order guys! Hon member Mr Tyatyam. Sorry, the Premier is responding. [Interjections.] Hon members, order please. Allow the Premier to respond. You posed the question. A statement was made and the Premier is now responding to the statement. Please afford her the opportunity. You may proceed. [Interjections.].

The PREMIER: And, Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shhh!

The PREMIER: I took an autonomous decision to stand down before the congress rather than wait till the next congress because I knew that everyone would know that it would be my last term and if you know that someone is in office for a last term, jockeying for positions begins and I did not want the DA to spend two years jockeying in the succession race because our job is to focus on the voters... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

The PREMIER: ... and not to focus internally on internal power positions. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: You can take your seat please. Is it a point of order?  
[Interjections.] Hon members, please, there is a member on the floor.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, our understanding here is that the Premier is actually not answering the question. The issue is, and this is the point of order... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hold on. Sit down.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: No-no-no, I am putting a point of order.  
[Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: What is the point of order, hon member Mr Fransman?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: The Premier... [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, there is really no reason why the Premier must explain why she was forced out of the DA leadership. There is no way. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hold on. Hon members!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: You were forced [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon member Mr Fransman, I am here as a Presiding Officer to provide technical and procedural advice. I was going to talk to hon member Mr Magaxa's second



follow-up question which was not a question, it was more a statement requesting an opinion, and what the Premier is doing now, she is talking to that statement as far as – the hon member Mr Magaxa is nodding his head, which means he is in agreement. So if we may proceed please. Thank you. Proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: You see some of us are not in politics for power's sake, we are trying to advance a set of values and ideals. [Interjections.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Liberal white [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: And the important thing is, Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Liberal white [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order? Hon Premier, sorry.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, Madam Speaker. I just want to address you on this exact same question, because I feel that there is no justice in relation to my question. My question is based on the two first questions that I have asked. Now that she told us ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Not “she”, the hon Premier.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am sorry. The honourable – I am sorry for that, I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The hon Premier said she is not, the hon Minister said... [Interjections.] ... the hon Premier said to us that she is not the Mayor and then my question therefore was whether now that the Premier is no longer a Leader of the DA does she feel helpless in terms of ... [Interjections.] ... making it a point that the policies that the DA takes... [Interjections.]... are executed as per her instruction? Does she feel helpless now?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa – if I may. Hon Premier, hold on – if I may, remember the purpose of a follow-up question, how the respondent answers I have no control over so if you ask question A but someone answers B, C and D ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible]

The SPEAKER: No-no, but the question itself. So we are not going to get into the nuts and bolts of it. And hon member Mr Magaxa conceded that he made a statement, he asked the Premier something and she is now responding to him hon member Mr Fransman, so can we proceed on those grounds? Thanks you. You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed. So, Madam Speaker, as I was saying; one of the key reasons is that I did not want the DA to be involved in a succession battle internally for two years up till the next congress and maybe even three years, and that would be a very unfortunate thing, unlike in the ANC where they are constantly involved in succession battles. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Mr Fransman?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, why does the Premier not just say the reason why she had to step down was for the mere fact that there would have been a top management white leadership elected ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman, sorry, I need to... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: That is the reason!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman, I need to address you. You cannot – take your seat please Chief Whip. You cannot tell the Premier what she needs to answer. If that is what you would like to hear you can wait for the response but you cannot influence and lead to say “tell us this.” If that is what you would like to believe you can, but the Premier answers in a way that she deems fit, so you are leading this conversation to say this is happening and it is in fact not so. So what you want to hear and what you are really hearing you need to discern and work with. You may proceed, hon

Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I also want to point out that the hon the Opposition clearly does not understand constitutional democracy, because in this party we separate the party and the state. My role as Premier... [Interjections.] ... and my role as Leader of the Democratic Alliance were entirely separated. In my context as Leader of the Democratic Alliance I cannot ... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: You are not the leader anymore.

The PREMIER: ... instruct an independent sphere of government to do something or not to do something, neither can I as Premier. So my power to execute my role as the Premier is in no way affected at all by the fact that I am no longer a Leader of the Democratic Alliance. The basic idea of the separation between party and state is a riddle and a mystery to the hon the Opposition, although they claim to support the Constitution. [Interjections.] That separation is absolutely fundamental and it can only be breached in the most extraordinary situations.

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members.

The PREMIER: And while I am the Premier I will execute the role of the Premier... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: ... as required by the Constitution and the law and the Mayor will execute her role as Mayor as required by the Constitution and the law and we will be an example of co-operative governance but I will not, and certainly not for party political reasons, tread on the sphere of a separate sphere of government and nor will the Mayor do that in this province, because that is how we understand the Constitution. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Members – sorry Chief Whip – before we move to the second question, we have a question and then there are two follow-ups. Allow it to be a follow-up question. If you present and make a statement and you request an opinion, that does not constitute a question, so let us try and keep it to questions and follow-ups related to the matter at hand. Thank you. Hon member Mr Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I want to refer you to our Rules of the House, 2049 of the Rules ... [Interjections.] ... and that the member called, may put one question in a concise form and immediately after reply thereto, two supplementary questions, which must relate to his or her original question...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Or to the reply.

Mr M G E WILEY: Or to the reply. Now with due respect, the hon Leader of the Opposition has managed to insert himself twice in two.

The SPEAKER: In two.

Mr M G E WILEY: He is not the member. The member was the hon member Mr Magaxa who has left the House.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley, your comment is noted. Sorry. I have the Rules with me and I try and familiarise myself and I would like to believe that I am the Presiding Officer and I will take my cue from my workbook here. However, co-operation is expected from all members. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, your finger.

Mr DYANTYI: Oh, okay.

The SPEAKER: Please put your hand in your pocket. Thank you. [Interjections.] So in order for the proceedings to go by, we need everyone to co-operate and I trust that the members will familiarise themselves with the Rule Book before the next sitting, because we seem to be swaying from the Rules. Let us try and keep it ordered. We now move to the second question, which is from hon member Mr Mnqasela. And might I add, question time of 20 minutes is pretty close to expiring, so when the 20 minutes are up I shall have to cut that. Hon member Mr Mnqasela? [Interjections.] Hon members, your co-operation is required.

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Kuthetha mna noko ngoku, khanime madoda \*It is my turn to speak now, keep quiet. †Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to ask the hon Premier whether her Department is succeeding in the plans as outlined in the Department Strategic Plan of enabling the Western Cape Government to improve the quality of life of all people, in particular in the area of good governance, integrated service delivery in the Western Cape, one through partnerships, innovation and people excellence and its alignment to the National Development Plan? That is the question that I am asking.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Mnqasela. Hon Premier that was a very lengthy question; I trust you have grasped it. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Madam Speaker. We have just completed the Provincial Strategic Plan for our term of office accompanied by 8 game-changers, all of which are highly innovative and are designed to achieve very specific outcomes over our term of office, but there are markers along the way which tend to indicate to us that we are on the right path.

I think it is worth noting that in the recent National Govan Mbeki Awards, run by the National Department of Human Settlements, the Western Cape was awarded the prize for the Best Integrated Residential Development, the Best Community Residential Upgrading Programme and the Best Informal Settlement Upgrading Programme and the Best... [Interjections.] ... and the Best Institutional ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Fransman.

The PREMIER: ... Housing Programme in the country. [Interjections.] Now that was really very-very impressive and one of the hon members of the Opposition says “where”; well one I know was in Bitou, one was in Swellendam... [Interjections.] ... one was in Cape Town. [Interjections.] And so all of these issues show just exactly how the Department of Human Settlements is making a major, major impact.

The SPEAKER: Order! Thank you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: No, I am not finished. I have just started.

The SPEAKER: No-no. The question time to the Premier has expired.

The PREMIER: No-no-no.

The SPEAKER: But you can answer the question.

The PREMIER: Oh, can I just answer this question?

The SPEAKER: Ja, you can just finish this question.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Well let me just look at the recent MPATS. Now the MPATS, which is the Management Analysis,



also done by the National Government, shows that on every single score the Western Cape ranks highest in the country on human resource development, including the management of employment equity; on financial development and management, on strategic leadership and governance and on governance and administration, on all four of those we are right on the top nationally. [Interjection.]

Then, if you want another indication, I was very amazed to read last night on Politicsweb that new statistics have come out of Statistics South Africa and indeed on every single indicator of service delivery – water, electricity, sanitation, refuse removal – the Western Cape far outstrips every other province, and on the critical issue of bucket toilets, in some ANC run provinces the number of bucket toilets has actually increased and in the Western Cape they have gone down by almost 50%. [Interjections.]. So it shows you the Statistics SA, the MPATS, the National Housing Awards, those are just some indicators along the way that we are doing what we are supposed to be doing. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members the question time to the Premier has now expired. We will now move to Statements by Members. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There will now be an opportunity for Members Statements. I recognise the DA.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. I want to really highlight that strengthening financial controls, coupled with compliance on the part of legislation at municipal level has been a very good test; that in fact, that is one of the things that makes it possible to witness good governance in local government and we have seen it between 2009 and 2014 and where we are seated now in 2015, with the year ending June 2015 for municipalities they have been able to spend 78, in fact 98% of their own MIG grants by end of June and 100% have been achieved mainly in the DA municipalities.

The ANC municipalities have achieved something like 60%; I remember one of them 41%. It is a disgrace, that we want to actually address. [Interjections.]. When the DA took the government here in the Western Cape, quite commendable is that from zero clean audits, we are now sitting at a rate of 17 clean audits at municipalities [Interjections.] and one municipal entity, Convenco, being a very clean municipal entity, but what we are saying, even though we have made such progress, our road to reach the maximum impact in addressing the plight of the most vulnerable, we are slowly and steadily getting there, but it remains an imbroglio that we ought to address so that steadfastly and quite pragmatically ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable Mngqasela ... [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... we are able to say we have arrived. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you ... [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Thanks ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, statements are two minutes. Try and stick to the two minutes please. I recognise the ANC.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The under-performance, no care and disregard by the DA and Speaker towards the Provincial Parliament's staff and citizens [Interjections.] is shocking and at its lowest level. A report to the Parliamentary Oversight Committee last Friday revealed:

- insufficient training of staff; meaning that certain services would need to be halted;
- No ICT disaster recovery with the danger that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Corporate and Parliamentary Services would come to a standstill;
- The Western Cape Provincial Parliament Committee Support Services is on the brink of collapse; [Interjections.]
- Increase in fatigue, [Interjections.] use of sick leave, friction between staff, [Interjections.] anxiety or depression and decline in the quality of work;
- Much needed intervention on the psychological effects on staff is neglected; [Interjections.].

The Speaker knew for months that this institution could “come to a standstill” and that the committee section “is on the brink of collapse if much needed interventions do not materialise soon”. [Interjections.].

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

Mr P UYS: On the top of this, Madam Speaker, the Legislature neglected to notify Public Works of its infrastructure needs by the end of July as required in its Service Level Agreement with them.

People rightly ask, what did the Speaker’s responsible executive authority of this Provincial Legislature and the management do about the crisis ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: ...Was it ignored? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: While pretending in statements to the media to engage the problem and still study the report, the Speaker has, in fact, weeks ago, rejected a clear proposal ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What?! [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: ... to aid the problem areas and, in writing, told staff to make do with what they have! So ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, your time has expired. [Interjections.].  
Thank you. I move to the next [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: So, Madam Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, your two minutes are up...[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: ... you clearly are not fit for purpose. Shame on you and the DA.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I see the DA. [Interjections.].

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Ever since SANRAL has set their eyes on the N2 and the N1 in the Winelands, they have eyed an opportunity for more money and more power. A hugely bloated project with several upgrades that the Western Cape does not need and some upgrades that SANRAL could actually finance well within its existing budgets. A so-called R7.9 billion project six years ago is now estimated to becoming R59 billion.

HON MEMBERS: Yoh!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: But what I really want to talk about today, is its misuse of power and blatant propaganda, and here we have a state entity which operates as a political operative, taking up the space that is supposed to be done by representatives of the people ...[Interjection.] So SANRAL places huge expensive double-page spreads in all the newspapers across South Africa ... [Interjection.]... spewing complete political propaganda and then goes on a charm offence for Gauteng motorists by roping in celebrities in a TV commercial appealing to the public to pay tolls. [Interjections.]. It is shocking that SANRAL, instead of using ...[Interjection.]: ...innovative solutions and finding effective ways of collecting funds for the upgrades, they want to instead spend R59 billion, yet the upgrades actually only amount to R22.5 billion. How can SANRAL be pushing it through, getting National Government to approve the project before knowing what the actual cost is going to be? What is equally outrageous [Interjections.] is how SANRAL is spending taxpayers' money on expensive advertising like this one, using propaganda [Interjections.] to convince voters and stakeholders that expensive toll roads are the only future way of building new roads. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the EFF. [Interjections.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, the Western Cape Government has all along been proud of its endeavours to root out corruption and has been extremely vocal on corruption committed in parts of government not under its control. It, however, does very little and tacitly encourages corruption by its

own employees. As an example, and there may be many others:

When the Khayelitsha Hospital was opened in about 2012, it was widely reported that there were allegations of jobs being sold. After complaints from a whistle-blower, it was discovered that the main culprit was an employee who worked in the Department's HR Department. This person was accordingly, correctly so, taken to a disciplinary hearing by the local management, and dismissed.

Subsequently the employee referred the matter for arbitration and the Arbitrator confirmed the decision of the Department and confirmed the dismissal and found him guilty of corruption. This case, the case number PSHS 934-11/12, and the Arbitration Award is dated 3 July 2012.

What happened next is beyond comprehension. Suddenly the same employee was appointed in a contract at Caledon Hospital. This appointment, we believe, was a further corrupt practice orchestrated by officials at the head office of the Department. We can only assume that these people are in cohorts with this individual and there are still corrupt practices taking place in the HR Department of Health. Our information [Interjections.] is that the management at the Caledon Hospital was pressurised to employ this individual under the pretext of some administrative provision. We argue strongly ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Joseph ...[Interjection.]

Mr B JOSEPH: ... that there is no legal basis to take such an employee back and even if such a legal basis...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired. [Interjection.]

Mr B JOSEPH: ... then surely the moral basis must outweigh it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, the Department of Social Development, led by the hon MEC Albert Fritz's office, embarked on a seven month outreach programme from January to July of this year. The programme covered all regions in the Western Cape and reached just over a thousand youth.

The purpose of the programme was to engage with youth around the challenges they face, to unpack these challenges and to work with them to find solutions to these challenges. One of the outcomes of these programmes was the Skills Transfer Programme.

The Skills Transfer Programme, in partnership with CapeNature and Community Chest will offer a customised package of skills development workshop for youth who are not educated, employed, skilled or trained.



The workshops will include basic knowledge of the principles and practical skills in project management, event management, financial management, business resources, marketing and life skills.

Participants will also be networked in the events industry with the local areas and tools will be provided with a toolkit for advancement.

Furthermore, these youth, and some of them have been linked to existing opportunities with the Government, the private sector and other civil agencies that will be supported and guided when they start their own enterprises.

The Skills Transfer Project has started already, with a total of 60 participants which will be launched, I think, tomorrow. I want to thank and commend the Minister of Social Development for this ground-breaking initiative. He is putting the DA's vision of freedom, fairness and opportunities [Interjections.] into practice. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker [Interjections.], I want to make a statement on the land issue and some of the very strong misleading statements [Interjections.] that we have seen by the hon Ms member Schäfer. Hon member Schäfer, I quote, says: 194 claims were settled ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No! ... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ... in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]. She then says that the Western Cape had the highest number of these claims settled and approximately R1.5 billion to that effect. What she did not say to the public is that actually the Commission for Restitution of Land Rights is not a Provincial Government focus and its responsibility; that what she attempted to do was to mislead the public and we do not believe that any hon member must use and quote and misrepresent those figures in the way that has happened. What we can say is that Rural Development and Land Reform is a national competency. [Interjections.]. What we can say is that the provincial office ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry ... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ... in the National Department ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ... Hon member Fransman, if you could take your seat. Is it a point of order, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: [Inaudible] take a question?

The SPEAKER: Would you take a question? [Interjections.].

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Can I continue? I will do it afterwards if he gives me time. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, he will not take the question.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ... that what we have is the fact that there is a provincial office that does not report to the Provincial Government, it reports to the National Department [Interjections.], but what we have seen here is the fact that the hon member could not understand the role and responsibility of a Provincial Department [Interjections.] of Agriculture in this case [Interjections.]. Therefore we are extremely concerned that under MEC of Agriculture, Alan Winde, what he has done, is trying to push out and evict the people of Elsenburg [Interjections.] and we give notice that we will not allow that to happen. That is the land reform that you are giving.

What we picked up [Interjections.] is the eviction of the people in Dunoon and other areas, in particular, De Novo between Kraaifontein and Stellenbosch. This is provincial state land [Interjections.] residing under Public Works and Transport and that is the land reform that we are extremely concerned about meaning ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman, please finish up your time has expired. [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ... whilst the ANC National Government contributes

land we are seeing ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please finish up ... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Let me just make my ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired ... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: So, can I give my final point? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I have applied the rule. [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Because you have done it for everyone else on that side.

The SPEAKER: No, I have applied the rule consistently. When the time is up I say the time is up.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: So can I say that while the ANC does deliver on that we are seeing the hon MEC of Agriculture trying to push people off the land.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]. I see the DA. Sorry, hon Chief Whip Wiley. Let us proceed.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Before I start with my

statement, let me take this opportunity at the end of this month to thank all in the Western Cape Province and our country. We have taken moments of their time to celebrate women this month and always. I note, with gratitude, the rare crop of genes that has created this beauty with strength, abundance of love and peace. I salute all women of this world.

The Flamingo Heights community wanted a decent living space and ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please, hon members, there is too much noise.  
[Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: ... they took the lead. They did not wait for Government to build for them, but rather took initiative and contributed financially as well as physically. This is a community that does not believe in dependence and chose to be independent. They have moved away from the typical ANC Government dependency syndrome. We saw an inter-sectoral engagement between public, private and non-governmental stakeholders with the women in the community leading the charge. Together with the City of Cape Town, the community formalised an informal settlement.

However, as Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements, it is clear that having hard infrastructure is not enough. There are spheres of government that need to be more proactive in delivering services to the community in order for it to be called a decent living environment.

As a nation, there are social ills that are spreading like cancer through our society. ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible]

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! ... [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: ... I say this because the community at Flamingo Heights are in need of support in combating social ills like drug abuse. The South African Police Services takes hours upon hours before responding to calls for help from the community, this despite the fact that the police station is less than one kilometre away.

We must support and motivate our communities so they can have the platform of a safe environment in which they can pursue the opportunities that the Western Cape Government is enabling.

As public representatives in our respective portfolios, we must declare war against drug abuse, crime and disease.

This is the only way for the Western Cape to scale greater heights of development that will unshackle our people from the decades old scourges of

poverty. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]. I see the ACDP [Interjections.].

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... Sorry, hon member Mr Christians, just before you speak, can I call for some order? There is too much noise. Can we please just afford the hon member an opportunity to speak? [Interjections.]. He will keep his volume down, but if everyone is quiet, he will not have a need to shout. [Interjections.]. Okay. So, let us be quiet and then we will [Interjections.]. Thank you, you may proceed Hon ... [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP strongly disagrees with, rejects and condemns the statement by SWEAT, Sex Workers Education and Advocacy Taskforce's, Social Manager, Dr Gordon Isaacs, who is of the view that high schools should teach pupils about homosexual sex. In fact, it is nauseating. That Dr Isaacs in his own suggestions on how the syllabus should include gay sex education includes discussion of penetration, anal sex, oral sex, frottage and kissing. The ACDP calls on the Western Cape Government not to condone, support or normalise sin [Interjections.] and our learners should be discouraged to engage in homosexual sex. [Interjections.]. God has given sex to us to glorify him [Interjections.] and to fulfil his design [Interjections.] for procreation. Genesis 1:28 says, "and God blessed them and God said to them be fruitful and multiply" [Interjections.] "and fill the

earth and subdue it". [Interjections.]. So the purpose of sex is to glorify God and to bring forth children. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]. Order! Order! [Interjections.]. Order! I see the ANC. [Interjections.]. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, the recent vandalism in George where a number of *Go George* buses were damaged is a matter of deep concern for the ANC. We are pleased that the situation has now stabilised and that the SAPS have made some arrests. The majority of buses are now running although the Thembaletu Pilot remains on hold. [Interjections.]. I would like to pay tribute to the ANC Southern Cape region, [Interjections.] the sub-region as well as our councillors who literally did not sleep as they tried to bring calm to the situation ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBERS: Ja ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... and engage with communities and the taxi industry on the ground. ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... integrate ... [Interjections.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Hon member Mr Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, in terms of the Rules you must have a statement that you can hand in. This is the second week the hon member does not have a written speech he can hand in. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]. This is not a motion, this is a statement. [Interjections.]. Hon member [Interjections.] you may continue. [Interjections.]. Please continue, hon member Mr Dugmore. [Interjections.].

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, integrated, affordable, reliable, predictable and safe public transport [Interjections.] is central to the ANC Government's mobility strategy. [Interjections.]. BRT, along with interventions to recapitalise the rail network and passenger rail system is critical to the realisation of the priorities listed in NDP 2030, an outstanding issue remains policy regarding a subsidy to the minibus taxi industry. We would, however, be making a mistake if we believe that we are already out of the woods in George. This is so because despite progress which has been made, there are essentially two very serious challenges which remain. The first relates to the failure of the DA in George and the Province to deal with the issues raised by affected parties, i.e. some drivers who complain that they have been left out of the process. I am in possession of a letter from the George Mayor where it is clear that one of the contributing factors to the violence which occurred lies at the door of the DA who failed to act on their own commitment by implementing a decision taken on the 6<sup>th</sup> of August

2015, signed by the George Mayor, to actually meet with affected parties.

The second issue relates to the fact of governance issues and management of the George Link (Pty). A management report conducted earlier this year raises alarm bells, yet the MEC has said nothing about its contents. I believe that a forensic audit [Interjections.] into George Link (Pty) is urgently needed and that such investigations should focus on financial management, governance, employment, procurement and nepotism. As the ANC we are committed to resolving the problems and making *Go George* work [Interjections.] for the people [Interjections.] and the industry as a whole. We call for a transparent process and a genuine commitment [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... to seek solutions [Interjections.] through dialogue.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. The DA.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is a fact that the new Parliamentary Oversight Committee installed a few months ago is going to significantly increase oversight over the management of the Legislature, and it is working. This should be celebrated. The Committee was created in line with the Financial Management of Parliament and, Provincial Legislatures Act of 2009. [Interjections.]. Historically these oversight functions or legislatures [Interjections.] were performed by the Rules Committee chaired

by the Speaker. You should listen. You will learn something.  
[Interjections.]. In order to bring a more independent oversight over  
legislatures the FAMPLA was enacted nationally with the intention ...  
[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Point of order, Madam Speaker.

Mr M G E WILEY: ...that ordinary members ... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Hon member ... [Interjections.] Is  
it a point of order?

Ms S W DAVIDS: I raise a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker, because as  
the Hon Chief Whip of the Legislature the hon member must know he is not  
supposed to say “you” and whatever ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, yes. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: He must withdraw. [Interjections.]. He stated to  
[Interjections.] the hon ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member, please refer to a member as  
“Honourable Member”.

Mr M G E WILEY: I pointed to that general side and then never spoke to anyone specifically [Interjections.]. In order to bring a more independent oversight over Legislature, FAMPLA was enacted nationally with the intention that ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: ... ordinary members ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...of legislature ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wiley, there is another point of order. Is it on the same issue?

Mr S G TYATYAM: On the same issue, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley, it is difficult for me to judge whether in fact you referred to one member or the group.

Mr S G TYATYAM: He was specifically ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: For the sake of progress I would suggest that you [Interjections.] just refer to the hon member.

Mr M G E WILEY: Okay. The hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. The chairmanship would come from the members and not the executive. However, I understand the speakers in other legislatures in South Africa insist on chairing their own Oversight Committees which rather defeats the whole exercise of independence but this is typical of how the ANC operates. Our Speaker needs to be congratulated unreservedly for supporting the installation of this committee and its workings. The FAMPLA stipulates certain other changes regarding internal audit and accounting procurement and software additions.

These have significant cost implications and coincide with the austerity measures which the President announced and which only the Western Cape appears to be taking seriously. [Interjections.]. These threats were referred to in the report tabled in front of the committee last week. The report also refers to the Parliamentary staff and their workload. Speaking as the Chief Whip of the Majority DA ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member ...

Mr M G E WILEY: ... the one who interacts with the staff ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley, just one second, there is another issue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, there is ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a point or order?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is it proper for the hon members on that side not to listen to the Chief Whip when he is ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, that is not a [Interjections.]. Order! That is a frivolous point of order. Please continue. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ... who interacts with the staff on a daily basis, I consider them to be generally professional, are committed and work hard, especially the committee section which is particularly active, again busy with rigorous oversight in the Executive. However, it is significant that the ANC Chief Whip on the other side did not support the Western Cape Parliamentary staff taking place to the annual Better Together Games and rather wanted committees to take place. [Interjections.]. In resolving these challenges [Interjections.] a number of actions need to be taken. The first is that the Speaker and her senior officials are lobbying the Treasury for sufficient funds to ensure the smooth transition to accommodate FAMPLA. Secondly,

efficiencies in the scheduling and clustering of committees needs to be explored. Both these actions are currently under way. I find it enormously significant ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley, your time has expired; just your last sentence. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. That the Hon leader of the Opposition has left because he thinks ... [Interjections.] there is another set of rules that applies to him. [Interjections.]. But we need to take cognisance of the fact ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ... there is a report in front of this House about his attitude towards law. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! That disposes of Statements. We now move onto Motions. Notices of motions first. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Ms Davids?

## **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the progress of land reform in the Western Cape and the DA Provincial Government's remarks that the party was responsible for the success rate of settlements of land claims in the Western Cape. I thank you.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Are there any further?  
Hon member Mr Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Western Cape's Disaster Management Plan, with specific focus on risk assessment, risk reduction as well as response and recovery action plans. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, notice is taken. Hon member Ms Dijana?



Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House investigates the allegations that residents from Langa who have been on the housing waiting list for more than twenty years have been overlooked by the Department of Human Settlements for new housing in the area in its flagship Hostel Transformation Project. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, notice is taken of that. Are there any further? Hon member Mr Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House investigates the reasons for the delay in completion of the four schools that were due last year.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: You are welcome.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, notice is taken of that one. Are there any further? Hon member Ms Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the uncaring and callous manner in which a primary school, 25 years in existence with staff who have served therein as many years, were informed at the beginning of the third term that the Department of Education had not renewed the lease and that the school will close at the end of this year. [Interjections.]

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken of that one. Any further? [Interjections.]. Is there nothing further? Then we move on to the next category which is Motions without Notice. Are there any motions without notice? Hon member Mr Mackenzie?

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Wayde van Niekerk of Kraaifontein for winning the men's 400 metre final at the 2015 International Association of Athletics Federations World Championships in Beijing yesterday. [Applause.]

The Western Cape's Wayde van Niekerk is now the fourth fastest man in history in the 400m race. Wayde van Niekerk beat reigning

champion LaShawn Merritt of the United States of America as well as Olympic Champion, Kirani James of Granada. It is also a South African and African record. I move so. [Applause.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I sense there is no objection to the motion [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Being moved without notice? No, objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Ms Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the 14 member Kaapse Klopse Troupe, of the Cape Flats Pennsylvania Club, well with their participation at an international event celebrating heritage from across the globe at the World Culture Festival 2015 in Indonesia.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon

member Ms Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the national Minister of Health, Aaron Motsoaledi, a speedy recovery following his hospitalisation. I so move. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Ms Davids next.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the disingenuous and misleading tomfoolery remarks made by hon member Beverly Schäfer that the DA was leading in terms of land restitution and the settling of land claims. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mr Hinana? [Interjections.]

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Department of Social Development and Hon Minister Alfred Fritz for the opening of the first Khuseleka Centre at the Saartjie Baartman Centre in Manenberg as a One stop Victim Empowerment Centre for abused women where all Government and NGO partners and stakeholders will be based so that survivors of abuse have a more efficient and effective service. So I move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion be moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Joseph?

Mr B D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Chloe Gilbert for attaining first place at the 2015 Western Province Full Contact Karate Tournament held on 22 August 2015. Then the House further congratulates the karateka of Portlands and Woodlands for its achievement of first, second and third places at the tournament. Then the House also commends Sensei Gavin Smith for the good work being done in Woodlands and Portlands. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Mr Tyatyam were you standing to move a motion just now? Okay. Then it is this side. Hon member Mr Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its condolences to the family and loved ones of Mr John Tromp, in life a lecturer at CPUT, who was buried on Saturday, 22 September 2015.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Then it is hon member Ms Makaleni, and then I will come back this way.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Peggy de Villiers from Somerset West, on five medals and breaking two world records at the 2015 World Deaf Swimming Championships in San Antonio, Texas, at the weekend.  
[Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Mr Max?

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works for completing two vital roads, amongst others the Blanco Road in George and Merweville in the Central Karoo. [Interjections.]. Both projects will be a great contribution to the communities and in growing the local economy. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker. This is a breaking news motion without notice:

That the House congratulates Anaso Jobodwana for breaking the South

African 200 metre record in a record time of 19.87 seconds, a few minutes ago, to win a bronze medal at the official IAAF World Championships in Beijing. It is South Africa's second medal of the championships. Thank you. [Applause.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is no objection to the motion being moved without notice. There is no objection to the motion itself. Motion is agreed to. Hon member Ms Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends SAPS which thwarted two mall robberies in the province earlier in the week in Kenilworth Centre and later at the Waterstone Village Shopping Centre, where two suspects were arrested. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections to that motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Gillion first and then hon member mr Kivedo?

Ms M N GILLION: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing



voor:

Dat die Huis kennis neem van die tragiese dood van twee lede van Numsa se Atlantis Plaaslike Kantoor, Jessica Veoffe, die organiseerder en Lesley September in 'n kop-aan-kop botsing net buite Darling gister. Ons innige meegevoel aan die families en ander lede van Numsa as 'n geheel.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Agb lid mnr Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its heartfelt condolences to the family and loved ones of Mr Theo Erasmus, in life principal of Nuwe Hoop Sentrum vir Gehoorgestremdes in Worcester, who passed away last week.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Die ADUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis? No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the carnage on the provincial roads that have claimed the lives of more than 30 people in the month of August alone, and that between January and July 2015 a total of 742 people died of which almost half were pedestrians, and urges a concerted effort by all to ensure that safety on roads is improved.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Ms Dijana?

.

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates SAPS with the ongoing successes in the battle against drugs with multiple seizures of various substances at, amongst others, Beaufort West and the Cape Town International Airport, preventing this poison to enter the province or be distributed to our youth. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member

Mr Kivedo?

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the swift and effective action of Operation Combat in apprehending and arresting a former police officer, Colonel Chris Prinsloo, for illegally selling firearms and ammunition to gangsters in the Western Cape.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Ms Gillion?

An HON MEMBER: Operation Combat [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the recent study by the Medical Research Council and the Duke University School of Medicine on Tik addicts in the

province which found that many addicts in the Western Cape had classic symptoms of mental illness, including depression and post-traumatic disorder, but very few of these users had ever received mental health treatment.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to.  
[Interjections.] Hon member Mr Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Hawston Public Library in the Overstrand Municipality for being declared a winner in the category of Children Services for the year 2014 by the Department of Culture and Sports in the Western Cape.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Mr Dugmore, do you want to get up?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that 25 August 2015 marks the fifth anniversary of the death of ten Blackheath children who died when the taxi they were travelling in was hit by a train at a level crossing and that it urges all levels of government to work together to ensure that level crossings are made safer for pedestrians as well as motorists. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. First the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Flower Valley Early Learning Centre for the creation of an excellent and exciting tourism event, and this event will be in Overberg – a Full Moon and Magic in the Fynbos – on Saturday 29 August. This event will consist of an entertainment walk to the fynbos hilltop to watch the moon rise and listen to moon stories followed by music and fire dancing. We wish them well in this exciting endeavour. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion being

moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Ms Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends UCT for naming its building after the late struggle activist and academic, Dr Neville Alexander, who was imprisoned on Robben Island from 1964 to 1974 and is known for his role in the struggle for democratic and non-racial South Africa.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Ms Dijana first.

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes a documentary highlighting the racial injustice and prejudice experienced by students of colour who attend Stellenbosch University, and encourages all such institutions to accelerate transformation. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.]. No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. First the hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the City of Cape Town for setting the stage for the second Cape Town Fringe Festival which is to take place in the City Hall precinct, the V & A Waterfront, and for the first time, in Langa. This 11-day festival is a celebration of music, theatre, the performance arts and comedy and will run from 24 September to 4 October. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Ms Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the unnecessary racial tensions brewing at the Elsenburg Agriculture Training Institute between students and calls on all to find amicable solutions for it.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Mr Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Marine Biologist, Alison Towner, Meredith Thornton and Wilfred Chivell, for making use of the unusual opportunity to perform an on-site necropsy on an adolescent female white shark in Kleinbaai in Gansbaai. The DICT team was assisted by Marine Dynamic's International Marine Volunteers (IMV) co-ordinator Francois Swart, as well as Georgia French and Simone Rizutto from Sussex as well as Stellenbosch Universities in both the retrieval and dissection of the shark. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion be moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Are there any further? Have we exhausted the category? Hon member Mr Mnqasela, another one?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:



That the House congratulates the Camphill Farm Community in Hermanus, an NPO that provides homes and work for people with intellectual disabilities, on being officially certified as an Organic Dairy Farm. The farm has committed to the Organic Participatory Guarantee System (PGS) which is an assurance system that guarantees adherence to the set standards and the principles that have been agreed to on the green road of farmers, consumers and retails. And I so move, thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. I take it there are no further motions? If not, then that we have reached the end of the business of the day and the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:19.