
THURSDAY, 18 JUNE 2015

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Order! Before we proceed with the business of the day, I would like to give guidance to the House regarding the application of Standing Rule 231(b) on the utilisation of unused portions of times allotted for Interpellations.

Rule 199 determines that the number of Interpellation debates on one and the same day be limited to three of 15 minutes each. Unused portions of time allotted refer to time not used in the allotted 15 minute allocated per Interpellation. In other words for example there are three Interpellations scheduled for a specific day. Time saved of the allotted 45 minutes will be transferred to question time.

On 7 May only two Interpellations served before the House and the unused portion of the allotted 30 minutes was five minutes, and therefore the five minutes were transferred to Questions for Oral Reply.

This is the existing interpretation of Rule 203 applied by the Table and should you feel that the procedure be reviewed you are welcome to submit representations in this regard to be considered at the Rules Workshop to be held in due course.

We now proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. I see the honourable, the Minister Bredell.

INTERPELLATIONS:

Hessequa Municipality: disposal of municipal assets

1. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Whether the Hessequa Municipality has acted in accordance with the Municipal Finance Management Act 2003 (Act 56 of 2003), the Constitution and other relevant legislation in regard to the disposal of municipal assets?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie agb Speaker. Ja, dit is moeilik, want gedurende die vorige sitting het ek 'n vraag geantwoord oor die aangeleentheid en die Interpellasie.

Die antwoord bly dieselfde. So ek sal herhaal wat ek gesê het, dat Hessequa Munisipaliteit 'n ongekwalifiseerde audit-opinie in 2013/14 boekjaar ontvang het. 'n Ongekwalifiseerde audit-opinie word uitgereik wanneer die finansiële state vry is van wesenlike wanvoorstelle en daar geen wesenlike bevinding oor verslaggewing, prestasiedoelwitte of nie-nakoming van die wetgewing is nie.

Hessequa Munisipaliteit se nie-nakoming en die bevrediging van die tersaaklike wetgewing is geleë in die audit-opinie uitgereik deur die Ouditeur-Generaal van Suid-Afrika. Die aankoop en die verkoop van munisipale kapitaal of nie-bedryfsbates vind plaas op 'n manier soos voorgeskryf in die Wet op Plaaslike Regering, Munisipale Finansiële Bestuur 2003, die Grondwet en ander tersaaklike wetgewing.

Ingevolge Artikel 14(1) mag die Munisipaliteit nie eienaarskap oordra vanweë 'n verkoopte bate of ander transaksies of andersins permanent van 'n kapitaalbate ontslae raak wat benodig word om die minimum vlak van basiese munisipale dienste te lewer nie.

Artikel 14(2) bepaal verder dat die Munisipaliteit eienaarskap mag oordra of andersins van 'n kapitale bate ontslae mag raak buiten die een wat in Subartikel 1 oorweeg is, maar slegs nadat die Munisipale Raad 'n vergadering wat oop is vir die publiek, belê het:

- (a) Op redelike gronde bepaal het dat die bate nie benodig word om 'n minimum vlak van basiese munisipale dienste te lewer nie; en
- (b) Die billike waarde van die bate en die ekonomiese en gemeenskapswaarde wat ontvang sal word in ruil vir die bate oorweeg.

Die munisipaliteit het aangedui dat dit voldoen het aan hierdie vereistes. Ek dank u.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. It is quite strange that MEC Bredell says that he dealt with this question previously. That was in regard to a very specific issue of Takkieskloof; en Takkieskloof is 'n plek waar die DA Raad probeer om daardie fasiliteit te koop ten spyte van die feit dat die jeug van Hessequa en baie ander mense daardie publieke bate gebruik, maar nietemin deur die werk van die ANC het ons dit gestop. But what this question is about... [Interjection.] ...is actually whether in regard to municipal assets and let me ask the MEC now... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Relevance?

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...besides Takkieskloof, can he give us in this House today a list of all the other properties which the DA in the Hessequa

Municipality has sold or are in the process of selling?

He, for instance, talks about legislation which refers to there having to be a situation where you cannot use that facility in regard to minimum levels of service, etcetera. How does he explain the fact that this municipality is busy selling and has sold pieces of land which could, MEC Madikizela through the Speaker, be used for integrated housing settlements; but we know that the DA is not interested in integrated housing settlements. They would prefer to sell these to private developers who have no interest with regard to social housing, and this is not only happening in Hessequa. It is happening in many other municipalities as well, so I want to know from this MEC; in this House today, can he give us a list - because I am sure he did his homework, we expect him to do his homework - of all the other properties owned by the municipality, which have in fact been sold already. And this House needs to know that the Mayor of that municipality wants to take upon herself the right to actually decide in a Mayco meeting, despite objections from her own councillors, and we have the delegations now which are currently being reviewed. She wants to take it upon herself as the Mayor, in closed committee without that consultation process, and that is why they got into trouble in regard to Takkieskloof, because they did not consult with the communities; and so behind closed doors are taking decisions to sell property, which could actually be used to maintain minimum levels of standards and to support integrated human settlements, etcetera. The question that we want to know is when is the MEC going to have the guts to actually intervene?

It is mainly the Mayor who is the problem; I am not saying it is all the other councillors who are the problem, but maybe he should also talk to former MEC Theuns Botha. En hy moet vir hom vra of hy saamstem met die proses van die verkoop van grond en hy moet ook vir ons 'n bietjie gaan ondersoek of enige van die raadslede baatvind in terme van die verkope wat plaasvind.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Eh, somlomo. It is very clear that we are now heading closer to elections. There is nothing that one can draw, you know. You are trying to listen, but you cannot get anything that the hon member is saying.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: But he is not saying... [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...because clearly the ANC is so hungry to get into the coffers of the municipality again. [Interjections.]

When we got there in 2011 we had to clean the mess that the ANC had left there. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Answer the question.

Mr M MNQASELA: Now one hopes and in fact wonders what it is that the ANC wants to achieve and Minister, what I want to say is that, you know ... †Inja ekhonkothayo imoto ehambayo iyakhonkothwa zizinja, xa ingahambi imoto ayikhokhotwa. *A barking dog ... I mean to say dogs bark at a moving car, they do not bark at a car standing still..

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is why you do not know, it seems... [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Now I want to encourage you to provide more support to that municipality... [Interjections.] ...so that the municipality can carry on doing the work that they should be doing and that is to provide services to the people of Hessequa. If you look at what is best for the municipality, I did mathematics at school; one plus one equals two, who does not know that?

If you do not allow the municipality to follow this route how are they going to manage this kind of facility and also they are not selling the entire area. They are simply dealing with a specific portion... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is why they are selling it.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...so that they are able to keep the municipality afloat and render basic services to the people. [Interjections.] Now please, Minister, let us ignore those who want to derail us in our programme of rendering services to everyone; making governance work for the voters who vote for a government in a place where they think that they need to be better governed,

because people do not want the ANC there. They want a good government and the DA government. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela. Your time is up.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. It is clear that the hon member in the purple suit today has not visited Takkieskloof. [Laughter.]

When he talks, he talks out of ignorance and the first thing I want to say to him, he was saying that the dogs normally start barking when the car is moving; en wat ek vir hom gesê het is dat die honde blaf baie hard as die kar agtertoe beweeg... [Gelag.] ...en die motor van die DA is besig om agtertoe op 'n baie vinnige manier te beweeg; nie net in Hessequa nie, maar in ander plekke, en hy weet dit.

So if you go to Takkieskloof, that is one place - and I want the MEC to please respond to this - those chalets, which they want to sell; yes, they say they want to leave the swimming pool alone. Those chalets are one of the only places where young people celebrate 21st birthday parties, who have these parties for the prospective husband or wife or holidaymakers. It is one

of the only affordable places for people to actually go to; yet the municipality, through mainly the Mayor, Emor Nell, wants to sell it. En ek sê weer, ek sê nie dis al die DA Raadslede nie, want van hulle is mos regdenkende mense. They understand that this thing has got more to do with certain alleged commitments made to certain developers with links, to certain of the councillors to try and make a quick buck out of that situation. That is why the MEC knows that the Auditor General will investigate the fact that they advertised Takkieskloof for sale and because they contravened this legislation he wants to defend the municipality that they have now suspended, but they have spent money already on advertisements etcetera, etcetera.

So the issue is that we have a DA that wants to sell - die bates van die mense; wat die mense gebruik; and this is the problem that they want to do that and they are using incorrect procedures to try to do this.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Hinana.

†UMnu N E HINANA: Somlomo. *Madam Speaker. †Thank you very much. Hon member Mr Dugmore, the principle of being a democrat and a law-abiding citizen is that whenever there is a law contravened, you lay a charge, because it would be fruitless for anybody to point out something is broken and that we do not have the remedial programmes to fix it.

However, what I want to say is that the municipalities - the officers went to

the elections on 18 May and the ANC lost the elections only to relinquish the power after four months. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No it is because... [Interjections.]

Mr N E HINANA: And this is the trend of the ANC's response whenever they have lost the elections. You can go wherever you want to go; the practical example, which is very recent, is... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Mr N E HINANA: ...is the Oudtshoorn Municipality, that when they lost, when they lose power... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Hinana, finish up please. Your time is up. Thank you. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I am not sure what election the hon member Mr Hinana is referring to, but in May last year there was a premonition when people went to go and vote... [Interjection.]

'n AGBARE LID: Siener van Rensburg.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Because when you look at the result in Hessequa already last year the ANC obtained a majority of the votes compared to 2011.

Now we know it is a provincial and a national election. Maar ek wil vir u sê een van die redes hoekom die mense teen die DA swaai is juis oor die verkoop van die bates van die mense.

It is secondly about the fact that the DA has put up electricity in Hessequa more than even the Eskom rates have gone up, and that is why you must come and visit there. When you go to buy electricity from the Spar, there is a surcharge as per a DA municipal decision. Through the Speaker I want to ask the MEC just to respond to three questions: please give us the names of all the properties that the DA have sold, because surely you did your homework. You are one of the more disciplined and hardworking members of the DA and we expect you to be able to deliver that to us today.

Number 2: can you tell this House without any shadow of a doubt that no member of the DA or their family members have benefited from any of these particular sales and can you then tell us whether you agree that the Auditor General would make a finding that there has been at least wasteful and fruitless expenditure in terms of advertising whereas the municipality in their own admission per Council resolution have admitted that they did not follow the correct procedures.

We expect you as the MEC in good standing, as the Chairperson re-elected and confirmed by the voters of the DA, to be able to answer this question. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Dugmore. I see the honourable, the Minister Bredell.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, dis eintlik baie jammer dat agb lid mnr Dugmore wat 'n oorsigfunksie het nie tussen oorsig en politiek kan onderskei nie, maar ek is baie dankbaar dat hy so bekommerd is oor die DA se stemme want miskien wil hy ook aansluit. Ek weet nie, soos ander van sy lede, maar u hoef nie bekommerd te wees nie. Ons stemme het amper verdubbel en dit sal nog aanhou verdubbel.

Die verkoop van stukke grond is eenvoudig, dit moet binne die regsraamwerk gebeur. Ek kan baie voorbeelde uitlig waar die agb lid bekommerd moet wees oor wat in ANC-beheerde rade aangaan waar jy in die oggend opstaan en dan is daar "Te Koop" bordjies op 'n parkie ingedruk deur 'n ANC-kader. So daar is baie sulke goed wat gebeur. In Hessequa gebeur dit nie. Dis die reg van 'n munisipaliteit om eiendomme... [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mnr C M DUGMORE: Soos Louis Scheepers, ook kaders.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Nee, dit is binne. Dit is die reg van 'n munisipaliteit om binne die regsraamwerk eiendom te vervreem. Hulle moet binne die wetgewende raamwerk werk. Wat hier gebeur het is die munisipaliteit het 'n proses begin. Daar is vir hulle uitgewys dat hulle

verkeerd is.

Mnr C M DUGMORE: Hulle was verkeerd, ja.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Hulle het nie daarmee saamgestem nie en toe kom daar 'n hofuitspraak waar hulle toe moet erken hulle is verkeerd en toe gaan hulle terug Raad toe en hulle is besig om die stuk grond nou te heradverteer. Hulle is besig om alles binne die regsraamwerk te doen so ons kan nie fout vind daarmee nie en as die keiser nie daarvan hou nie, is daar openbare deelname prosesse, dan moet hulle dit vir hulle gaan sê.

Ons kan nie eiendomme teen 'n verlies bestuur omdat sekere mense wil partytjies hou nie. Daar is 'n baie ernstige dissipline in munisipale finansies wat moet teruggebring word. Ek was by Minister Nene. Ek was by Minister Gordhan daaroor. Daar moet 'n nuwe munisipale finansiële model ontwerp word oor die gratis dienste-mandjie, oor al hierdie tipe goed want ons munisipaliteite is besig om bankrot te raak. Ons kan ook nie toelaat dat hulle al ons bates verkoop nie, so dit kan nie die gaping tussen die finansiële probleme regmaak nie.

Dan om te praat oor 'n burgemeester agter geslote deure, ek gaan my nie eers verwerdig om daaroor te antwoord nie. IBK vergaderings is altyd oop waar die DA in beheer is, so ook raadsvergaderings, en as die agb lid mnr Dugmore verskil kan hy dit vir my gee, want die DA se standaard oproep is

dat ons vergaderings oop is en oop sal wees.

Wat betref die oortreding van wetgewing, ek het aangehaal. As die Ouditeur-Generaal wys hulle het oortree dan sal daar gevolge wees. Ons tree op teen mense wat buite die wetgewende raamwerk optree, anders as die ANC wat alles onder die mat wil invee.

So die OG sal ons na kyk, enige DA-rade wat hulself verryk, enige DA-raadslede wat hulself verryk sal ek vir u sê sal nie 'n dag daarna in die party meer wees nie. Hulle sal geskors word. Daar sal 'n ondersoek wees en hulle sal afgedank word. Ons is nie die ANC nie.

Mnr C M DUGMORE: En hulle families?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: As hulle families verryk word sal ons optree teen hulle. Gee vir my die name. Ek sal jou waarborg daar sal opgetree word teen hulle. So ons het niks om weg te steek nie. Ons staan vir goeie oop regering, skoon regering.

Dankie agb Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes Interpellation 1.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We now move to Interpellation 3. I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

Tracking of non-retentive learners

2. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Education:

Whether her Department has any measures in place to track non-retentive learners?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker and hon Kivedo for the question. No, there is no mechanism in the Education Department to track a learner once they have exited the school system. Our learner retention, however, is a key strategic objective of the Western Cape Education Department and we do measure what is within our control, namely how many learners are retained in the system.

Because retention is such a priority the WCED is concentrating on improving how many learners remain in the system and finish their school. As a result of our interventions the Western Cape managed to retain 63.8% of learners who entered Grade 10 in 2012 and wrote the 2014 National Senior Certificate. The closest province to us was KwaZulu Natal with 55.2% - some 8.6% below us.

This has ensured that the WCED is implementing a range of measures to support learners at risk of dropping out, to meet this objective especially in Grades 10 to 12. As a result the Western Cape has the highest learner retention rate in the country according to independent research.

The learner population is relatively stable from Grades 1 to 9 because of national policy allowing learners to progress if they have failed more than once in an education phase. Most learners who drop out do so in Grades 10 to 12. The WCED previously focused on providing additional support to learners in Grade 12 and in recent years we have extended that to Grades 10, 11 and 12.

The focus is on numbers, not the matric pass rate. There is a difference. Other provinces have improved their pass rates, thanks to high dropout rates.

Ms M N GILLION: What is the question?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We will continue to focus on providing as many learners as possible with the quality education as far as possible until matric. We have however identified the need to track learners after school, but it does not fall within the Education Department, and I will engage with Minister Winde's Department as part of our Provincial Strategic Goal 2 to ensure that learners who leave the school system are tracked to see whether they are taken up into employment or higher education. Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I thank Minister Schäfer for her response and it is just indicative of the way the Western Cape Education Department is handling and also managing education in this province as a high priority and also a success story. [Interjections.]

I am more concerned about the sporadic non-retentive learners, who - under the guise of bunking and loitering and leaving school and being ill-disciplined - fear certain subjects, not being and wanting to be at school because of fear of certain teachers, etcetera, and being victimised and those learners are falling prey to gang bosses. They become couriers and they work right against the grain of the Strategic Goals 1, 2 and 3 of the Western Cape Government in terms of building resilient communities and also positive outcomes and a sustainable growth potential for young people, so these learners with great potential become actually learners or youth at risk, falling through the net at times.

I am not pointing fingers at anyone, I am not only talking about DA learners now. I am talking about learners in general. [Laughter.] Ja, so those are the issues that concern me. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: What is the question?

Mr B D KIVEDO: The point that I want to make is that the instrument that

Madiba gave us to say that “education is the greatest tool to change your circumstances...” [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...is becoming null and void. Nothing is happening to that as far as I am concerned and some people are being quiet. They do not report the situation to the Education Department. They see learners wandering on the streets, loitering on the streets, being out of school, bunking etcetera. Please take our hands and report these issues so that we can in any case muster all our energy. Hulle sê mos “die een se dood is die ander een se brood.” [Tussenwerpsel.]

'n AGBARE LID: Ja. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr B D KIVEDO: So we all work together in terms of salvaging and securing the retention of our learners at school in terms of our freedom, in terms of our fairness, in terms of our opportunities that we want to offer these learners. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, as public representatives and members of Provincial Parliament we are all constituency heads in different areas of the province. So we each have a responsibility to our constituents

and part of our responsibility is going to the ground witnessing firsthand the situations in our communities. On each occasion that I engage with my constituency in Mitchells Plain I witness many school-going-aged children in the streets and on several occasions I have engaged with them and asked them why are they not in school.

Some of them were talking about “it is boring, ons het nie geld vir die skool nie”, but the core reason is the lack of motivation and parental responsibility in some of our broken families.

Although the Minister has mentioned many examples of what the Minister is doing to retain schools, none of those will help if there is no parental motivation to keep the kids in school, because they fall along the way and the Department’s efforts will become an exercise in futility if our parents and we as community leaders do not become involved.

We are all *Better Together* and it will be more beneficial for all constituency heads, parents, learners and communities to take hands in order to improve the education outcomes and opportunities for youth development.

That said, I take this opportunity to perhaps also pose a question to the Minister, that you should keep our kids at school until five o'clock and get our parents and our communities to go to school in the afternoon and go and assist and monitor and do homework with the kids because that will build resilience and it will keep our kids educated in school.

I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Olivier. [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Now Madam Speaker [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr R T OLIVIER: If you allow me before I contribute to this Interpellation, I think the Interpellation is whether the Department has measures in place to track non-retentive learners. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Mr R T OLIVIER: The answer from the MEC was no. In my view we should have then proceeded with something else.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Mr R T OLIVIER: That was the question, maybe I am not sure what are we now contributing towards, because we do not do justice to the same questions we are asking. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, you should have told that to your members.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Now for me, Chair, it therefore means that the MEC
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... must ensure that we do have measures in place, if not the Education Department must do it, we must as a collective, as an executive to see how we deal with the issue. I am happy that he is saying that these are not only their learners, they are all around our own communities, leaving school before reaching matric and they are dwelling around and some of them are part of groups that of course come back and stop our own kids when they go to school, prohibit those who want to go to school to go and join gang groups and these are the challenges that we face, but for me the question was basically simple and clear. If there are no measures, what is the Minister's plan to ensure that at least there are measures so that we track those and see how they get back into the system? If not, how do we then ensure that those really finish their higher education and matric and go to higher institutions, but †Somlomo, yhazi isilonda xa sibola umane ubrasha siphela sibola ngaphakathi *Madam Speaker, you know, if you keep on brushing the sore, it ends up rotten inside. †Yinto eyenzeka pha mna ndicinga *that is what is happening there, part of the contribution †zendima yento yokuba abantwana bahambe esikolweni ngaphambi kwexesha yinto yokuba akho *is that children have to leave school early because there are no measures †yeyokuqala – leyo *that is the first one. †Okwesibini e-e into eyenzekayo sine infrastructure

crisis pha, kuthiwa abantwana abana toilet ubheka esikolweni kodwa akukho zi toilet uyothini esikolweni, *Secondly what is happening there, we have an infrastructure crisis whereby there are no toilets at school. How are they going to relieve themselves if there are no toilets at school? These other issues †siyamcela u MEC *we humbly ask the MEC.

The the other problem that we sit with is overcrowding in school. Some of the kids go home and do not come back because there are 40 in a classroom.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier, your time has expired.

Mr R T OLIVIER: So these are the issues, and [Inaudible] MEC do have measures in place. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you Madam Speaker. I just want to remind the hon member Mr Olivier that there is a truancy programme within our schools and all I want to add to what has already been said by the speakers that spoke before me is as the old African proverb reminds: “It takes a village to raise a child”. Therefore it becomes our responsibility, of all of us and of community leaders within our communities, including parents who are ultimately responsible for our children. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Kivedo. Order please

members. There is too much noise.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I am concerned about this culture of “devil do not care” among certain learners although there are measures in place in terms of MNE and tracking, and also following up to enhance the retention rate at schools. It goes without saying that there is an in-built structure in the whole process in the Education Department in terms of regulating, in terms of also streamlining the process. So I have no doubt in my mind that this truancy programme and also the follow-up and the tracking system are in place, but what my concern is... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: ... that our children who for some or other reason, and I have listed a few in my initial speech, bunk school, or drop out of school. This is a strong appeal to all of us, irrespective of party politics, irrespective of class, culture and race or whatever the case may be. We stand in one common realm and that is to give account and to take accountability and responsibility for our children and to say that my child is your child and I will not turn a blind eye if I see one child straying from school. It is one child too many. So we have to turn back and if we had the 99 sheep - all the pastors in this House will know what I am talking about - in the kraal, the one sheep that is not in the kraal we will go and fetch.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo your time... [Interjection.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: And this is what it is all about. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, thank you. I see the hon the Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much Madam Speaker.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. Too much noise.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you hon member Mr Kivedo for clarifying what you meant by retentive learners; that you were focusing more on the issue of bunking and truancy. Obviously we have measures in place for that. We have truancy officers who are extremely busy as we are equally concerned about the number of learners who are not in school and bunk school.

In fact I also see children and when I do, I ask them who they are. What concerns me is exactly what you said, it is parental responsibility. Some parents just do not care and I did a recent latecomers visit and I saw two children who went to the high school, but who looked like they were primary school children who were walking across the road; I went and asked them why they were not at school and whether their mother knew they were not at school. They were late for school. The school locked them out, which they

should not have done, which we addressed, but the point is the mother was there at home. She did not work. She did not bother to take her children to school to make sure they got to school; to make sure they were let into school. Instead she sent them down the road to get water for her whilst she was still in her pyjamas.

Now you are right. We all have to take responsibility. It is not only the Education Department's responsibility. It is the parents who have the primary responsibility to ensure that their children are at school.

As far as truancy is concerned, we have a lot of interventions. We have Safe School field workers who assist the school with investigating allegations of truancy through home visits. They also assist with facilitating and assessment of truant learners and placement for interventions with the support of the educators, parents and circuit team. Our Safe School field workers also liaise with support structures to assist the school and school community with creative and sustainable structures to deal with truant and at-risk-learners.

Other special measures include personal development plans for individual learners at risk at all levels; interventions to address truancy and collaboration with other Departments and agencies to address broader societal issues.

There are a number of reasons of course why learners do not stay in school, why they drop out of school. We are also looking at a number of

interventions; also partly, we cannot extend school hours as such. It involves a whole lot of negotiation with teachers obviously but if parents do not care whether their children get to school they will not care whether they stay at school until five o'clock either.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Schäfer your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Time up, okay, thank you. [Time expired.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of Interpellations. We now move to Questions. I recognise the Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. In arrangement with hon member Mr Fransman, the Premier is absent and she has asked that the question stand over and hon member Mr Fransman has been notified actually.

[New question for oral reply by the Premier to stand over.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. We then move to Question 10, for which I see the hon Minister Fritz.

Question standing over from Thursday, 28 May 2015, as agreed to by the House:

Rehabilitation centres for offenders

10. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Social Development:

Whether there are rehabilitation centres that have contributed to integrating offenders into society after they have been on the wrong side of the law; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you Madam Speaker. The question falls slightly outside our legal framework, so it deals more with Correctional Services and the Parole Board and the specific programmes that the Parole Board put in place for reintegration of offenders, so that is the answer. Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: I am comfortable with the answer, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Okay. We then move to Question 2, I see the hon Minister Winde.

New Questions:

Eskom's tariff increase

1. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

What is the estimated impact of Eskom's tariff increase on Western Cape consumers and business sectors relevant to the province's (a) Gross Domestic Product and (b) Consumer Price Index?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much Madam Speaker.

- (a) Eskom's post tariff increase will result in a significant decline in economic growth. According to the Deutsche Bank a tariff increase between 15 to 25% will cut the growth rate by between 0.2 and 0.4 percentage points in South Africa. This stands to reduce the growth rate of the Western Cape economy by the same amount and of course this is absolutely disastrous specifically for our SMME sector, which employs 60% of our working population.

In addition in agriculture research shows that production falls significantly in response to rising costs of inputs. The most influential of these being electricity, followed by fertilisers, pesticides and petroleum products. The Western Cape Department of Agriculture analysed the impact of this productivity decrease. It was found that a productivity loss of 1% would lead to a 3% decrease in GDP of the

South African economy. The volume of agricultural production would decline by 1.54%. Agricultural and food products export will decline by 3.12%. Household and labour income will decline by 2.81% and 2.7% respectively and more than 129 000 jobs could be lost to the South African economy.

- (b) The proposed tariff increases along with the rising costs of goods and services will hit residents' pockets the hardest. Energy is a substantial expense for households. The electricity price has a weight of 4.13% in the consumer basket. It has been estimated that the proposed tariff increase will raise headline inflation by about 0.5 percentage points over a year to an average of 5% and 6.5% for 2015 and 2016 respectively. Research from the Western Cape Department of Agriculture found that the productivity loss linked to the rising cost of electricity will impact on the cost of consumer goods. The productivity loss of 1% could lead to about a 3% decrease in GDP for the South African economy.

At the same time the consumer prices of primary and cultural products would increase between 0.21% - this is for horticulture and 0.33% for animals or animal products. The prices of agri-processed products would increase between 0.35%. That would be primarily for grain and milk products and 0.097% primarily for meat products. This obviously read in conjunction with the fuel increases, the weakening of the rand does not bode well for the economy.

The SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question, hon member Mr Lentit?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] He is busy with the Minister.

The SPEAKER: He is busy. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I have the next question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Lentit, no follow-up?

Mr R B LENTIT: No.

The SPEAKER: I see hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Also a question, not from him. MEC, I think all of us are concerned with the tariff increase, however, I would want to know in terms of the tariff increase, what would you suggest should be the plan of Eskom in relation to tariff, because there is a discussion now that says rather put that increase maybe not for people in the communities like your ordinary people, but maybe for business, for people with big capital. But we also hear that if Eskom is not increasing the tariff the challenge that we are going to have is actual load-shedding, meaning that when we have load-shedding the cost is going to be more so therefore... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam, if you could take your seat please.

Is it a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: Is there a question there somewhere? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The point of order is noted. Hon member Mr Tyatyam, your question please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: My question is complicated. I have to explain properly. [Laughter.] So MEC, what option do we have between the tariff hikes or do we take load-shedding; I want your view on that.

An HON MEMBER: Now that was not so difficult!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much for that follow-up.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I think primarily to the point as raised, there are a couple of answers to this question. The first thing when we talk of the cost of load-shedding on our economy, when we go to Schedule 1 it is R20 billion per month; 2, R40 billion; 3, R80 billion per month and of course that exacerbates it even more. You are absolutely correct, but primarily the responsibility should have been right up front. Right in the very beginning it

is one of management. There should have been far better management, Kusile and Medupi would not be four, five and six years post where they are actually coming on power now. We have already had enough power to avert load-shedding, if there was much better management from the ANC's side within government, number one.

Number two, we are sitting with an archaic system in mindset of how we will have one single producer trying to produce power for the whole country. The whole world is moving to multiple producers and we should be doing that in a far quicker way, but of course that is again policy mindset within the ANC, which is driving us into an economic disastrous abyss.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to ask the hon MEC and, given his reply, whether he is prepared to give the House a commitment that he will investigate all municipalities, in particular the Hessequa Municipality, who are actually imposing a tariff above the Eskom tariffs, which is actually causing an outcry among all consumers, both rich and poor in Hessequa; and whether he thinks that that strategy by certain municipalities is actually conducive to lowering the basic cost of living as per the National Development Plan?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is very interesting when the hon member Mr Dugmore asks me

about a commitment, because two and a half weeks ago I was in Saldanha Bay and the acting CEO of Eskom, Mr Brian Molefe stood on the platform and he made a commitment. He said: “I make a commitment here that there will be no load-shedding in the month of June” and a week later we went back into load-shedding, so it was very difficult for him making those kinds of commitments. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But I also think that it is rather strange that the hon member [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Mr K E MAGAXA: He qualified that sentence.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: He did not. I was there. He did not qualify that sentence.

The SPEAKER: Order please hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] that sentence, you are misleading us.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, order please. The Minister is on the

floor. He is responding to a question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, and then the next part of the question to the hon member from Hessequa, I am absolutely certain that Hessequa did not increase their electricity tariff by more than 25.3%, and then perhaps also while I am on the floor to reply to the interjection from another hon member from that side of the floor.

I was there and in actual fact Mr Brian Molefe made that statement three times from the stage and I was there to see it. You were not there.

Mr M G E WILEY: Where was the honourable [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It was not that way. I can help you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. No follow-up questions? Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr M G E WILEY: Were you there?

Mr K E MAGAXA: I know what was said there.

Mr M G E WILEY: Were you there?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to ask in the light of MEC Winde's response and in particular his statement that the South African Government and the ANC as the leading liberation movement of this country have not sought other providers. What is his explanation in regard to the renewal programme that is going on... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you still a liberation movement? [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: The wind energy; the solar energy; and also the fact that there is a serious process [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...in regard to encouraging businesses to become providers of electricity; some of whom are already doing that and selling to the grid. Does he not think that he in fact is misleading... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. Minister and hon member Mr Magaxa there is a member on the floor.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...given the reality of green energy; given the reality of businesses already selling to the grid.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much for that follow-up. So first of all while we

are talking about municipalities and expensive power the municipality with the highest tariff increase and the most expensive per unit electricity in the Western Cape is the ANC run municipality of Beaufort West, first of all. Second of all I go back to my original answer, which spoke to the single power supply in answer to your question, so the reap programme obviously does have other power supplies coming into the system but again through the same system and managed through Eskom and through one single national energy ministry.

The other alternative that he speaks about is exactly where we do play, our energy game changer group, in which Eskom does sit, in which National Treasury does sit, and in which the City of Cape Town is leading the process of allowing companies and private individuals to put power into the grid and I absolutely support that because that does create the new modern system. We are trying to facilitate as quickly as possible the system where at the moment as many producers can put into specifically the City regions into the grid. We are also busy as the Western Cape with an EIA so that we are actually ahead of the game with regard to putting gas into the system and hopefully we can actually get to a constitutional arrangement where we can get that power to come directly into the City Region Grid, which would mean the five bigger municipalities in the province. This would then start really moving our energy discussion into a competitive space, which would then stop this massive increase that is actually running away from us and causing a huge problem within our economy and is obviously going to - as it goes at the moment - cause many, many more job losses than we are seeing at the

moment. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Game changers.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I would just like to ask the follow-up, very short question. I think it is a yes or no answer unless you decide to dodge the question of course, but can I ask whether the MEC and the party that he represents, the DA, support the privatisation of Eskom?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: You must go, Eskom must go.

The SPEAKER: That concludes Question number 2. Members before we move on to the next question, may I ask that when you do your follow-up question it be short, sharp and succinct. Try and get to the point so that we can move along please, and now I see the honourable Minister of Local Government, Minister Bredell.

*Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs
and Development Planning: high turnover of staff*

**2. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government,
Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

(a) What is the impact of the high turnover of staff in his Department on service delivery and (b) how many (i) Chief Directors, (ii) Directors and (iii) Deputy Directors have left his Department since April 2014 to April 2015?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie Agb Speaker. Dankie aan die agb lid mnr Dyantyi vir die vraag. Ek probeer net vasstel of hy gaan staan vir 'n posisie as leier by die ANC se kongres, dis te sê as dit gaan plaasvind. Die Departement verwag dat... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die Departement verwag dat ons alle JPP doelwitte vir 2015/16 sal bereik. Hoofdirekteure was daar geen. Direkteure was daar twee bedankings en Adjunkdirekteure tien. Dankie.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: My first follow-up Madam Speaker. Can the MEC just indicate the demographics of those that have left? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the Minister.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek het die vraag beantwoord. Ek het nie geweet hulle wil alle besonderhede hê oor die vraag nie. Die vraag het vir my gegaan of ons ons werk kan doen... [Tussenwerpsel.]

The SPEAKER: That is a new question [Interjection.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: En dit is wat ons gedoen het so ek dink dit is 'n nuwe vraag. As ons wil weet van die kleur en die geslag van almal ensovoorts dan kan ons dit sekerlik kry. Op hierdie stadium dink ek dit is irrelevant. Ek dink dit gaan daaroor of ons departement ons werk kan doen met die bedankings en van waar ek staan, is dit ja, ek is tevrede ons kan, en wat belangriker is vir my is die rede hoekom mense bedank. Dis vir my baie belangriker as die bedanking self en ek kan vir u verseker dat 95% van die mense bedank het weens 'n beter aanbod, met ander woorde dit is 'n opleiding en ons doen goed in daardie gebied.

An HON MEMBER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just before I go to my second take... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: That is your second one. You are on your feet.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am saying wait, just before I get to that. Minister, this question says, let me read it to you. It is in two parts. The first one says, “What is the impact of the high turnover of staff in your Department on service delivery?” That is one.

Two, it says, “those chief directors, directors, how many have left?” That is the second part, and my follow-up was very clear. Of those that have left what are the demographics so if you do not know, sir, you do not know. Let me ask my second question, the follow-up.

The SPEAKER: That was a new question. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I can answer.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: My second question... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is your question.

The SPEAKER: Okay, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not a question.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not a question. That is what you left. My second question, a follow-up, when we were here last year in 2014 during the annual report the Minister promised that there is going to be stability in the exodus of staff. Are you succeeding in that?

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Bredell.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, laat ek nou vir die agb lid mnr Dyantyi sy vraag lees en per vraag antwoord.

Wat is die impak van hoë personeelomset in sy departement? Geen. Ons gaan ons werk doen?

Hoeveel Hoofdirekteure en Direkteure en Adjunkdirekteure het geloop of het bedank? Hoofdirekteure: geen; Direkteure: twee en Adjunkdirekteure: tien. Dis die vraag, en die vraag is beantwoord, so ek hoop hy doen beter by hulle Provinsiale Kongres want anders gaan hulle hom definitief nie instem nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not the question. He is not answering the

question.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agbare Speaker [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, sy derde vraag, ons sal ons
werk doen. Ek is tevrede. Ons het geen probleem nie. Dankie.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: My third follow-up, hon Speaker. Will the Minister share
with us what is his intervention strategy given the fact that there is a crisis in
his department of staff leaving. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Bredell.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, dis duidelik dat die agb lid
mnr Dyantyi weet nie wat om te vra nie, want ek het gesê ek is tevrede. Nou
sê hy, hy is ontevrede. Dan moet hy maar besluit wat hy daaraan wil doen.
Die sukses daarin is [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just answer the question. [Interjection.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die sukses daarin...

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] the Department. Sit down. Just do that.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, order please.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek sal ook so reageer as ek sulke 'stupid'
vrae vra, agb Speaker. Agb Speaker... [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell, please take your seat. Is it a point of
order Chief Whip?

Mr P UYS: The MEC said it is a stupid question. I want him to withdraw that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister. [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN

ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, ek sal dit terugtrek maar dit is definitief nie 'n intelligente vraag nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die feit bly staan dat wanneer jy 'n goeie opleidingsprogram het - en ons moet dit besef en ek het dit vir die agb lid mnr Dyantyi gesê toe ons ons JPP gedoen het - dat ons eintlik baie trots kan wees dat ons jongmense geneem het, hulle opgelei het tot op 'n vaardigheidsvlak... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle gaan uit daardie departement uit, elke dag.

'n AGBARE LID: Hulle kry beter aanbiedinge.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Kan ek antwoord?

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, jy kan antwoord.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Stel u belang in die antwoord?
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, jy kan antwoord.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Nou sit dan en luister asseblief.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: As jy kan antwoorde gee. [Tussenwerpsel.]

An HON MEMBER: There are problems there.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, wanneer jy 'n suksesvolle opleidingsprogram het dan sal mense bedank want daar is groter departemente wat baie beter salarisse aanbied. Ek sal vir u voorbeelde noem van mense wat R300 plus R1000 beter aanbiedinge gekry het as wat ons hulle kan betaal. Ons kan hulle nie 'n hoër salaris aanbied nie en ek gun daardie mense daardie geleentheid so ons doen 'n bydrae en ons is baie tevrede daarmee. Baie dankie.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Mr Olivier was on the floor but I think he is going to allow you to speak hon member Mr Dyantyi. It is the fourth follow-up.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, would the Minister accept that all of those that have left happen to be black? Would he accept that? That is the question.

An HON MEMBER: That is a new question. [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN

ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, behalwe dat dit 'n nuwe vraag is, as ek die agb lid mnr Dyantyi verkeerd bewys sal hy erken dat hy vir die Huis so pas nie die waarheid vertel het nie of mislei het? [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms M N GILLION: Ai! Answer, just answer the question.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Want ek sit met die lys voor my.

Ms M N GILLION: But you said you do not have it. You mislead the House.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek het 'n lys en die lys is nie net swart mense nie. Dankie agb Speaker. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms M N GILLION: He is misleading the House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. We now move to Question 4. I see the hon the Minister of Finance.

Head of Department: WCGRB

4. Mr Q R Dyantyi to ask Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Finance:

- (1) What were the reasons and rationale for him to eliminate the Head of Department: Horse Racing and Betting from the organogram of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (WCGRB);
- (2) Whether he received a request from the WCGRB to do away with the position mentioned above?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Madam Speaker and thank you to hon member Mr Dyantyi for this question. The position of Head of Racing and Betting became vacant as the incumbent received a better job offer in the private sector and she has resigned. No individual was eliminated from the organogram. After the resignation of the Head of the Department, the Western Cape Gambling & Racing Board took a decision to rationalise the functions performed by the Racing and Betting Programme under the Licensing, Gambling and Betting Compliance Department.

The new structure aims to bring about improved efficiency through the streamlining of operations and the elimination of the duplication of processes, thereby promoting uniform operating procedures. What happened was a redistribution of functions within the Gambling Board.

There have been no job losses within the Racing and Betting Unit as staff has been absorbed within the Compliance and Licensing Sections of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am certainly not asking about job losses. I am sure you know that. My follow-up Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, please address the Chair in your response. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: My apology, Madam Speaker. Can I now proceed?

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I asked the hon MEC, did you change or did you not change the organogram, and introduced and took away the Head of the Racing and Betting? Yes or no?

An HON MEMBER: It is called “chicken and eggs”.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes or no.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, I am going to answer this question but not on the terms of the hon member Mr Dyantyi because I am going to give the full context of this answer.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes or no.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I have not removed a position within the Gambling Board since it is not within my power. The Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board has taken such a decision themselves, have referred it to me because in terms of the regulatory framework, when something has a financial implication, the MEC for Finance responsible for that particular public entity must also ratify that particular decision. So it is not correct that the MEC for Finance has taken away a particular function. It is the Board who has taken that particular responsibility. They have taken a decision and because of the implications financially they have consulted with the MEC for Finance.

This was also signed off and this matter is no secret. I do not know why the hon member Mr Dyantyi wants to create the impression that there is something secretive. If he has read the APP, this matter was also referred to in the APP of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board so there is nothing unethical about this particular process. There is nothing illegal about this particular process. The due processes were followed and I am happy to answer any follow-up question in this particular regard. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want the MEC to relax.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Jy moet ontspan.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Did the incumbent, MEC Meyer, leave after you had written a letter to the Board or before that? It is another simple question.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, this hon member is asking whether I have written a letter or whether the person has left after I have written a letter. I have received a request, because the request had financial implications and this request came from the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board after they had taken a resolution on this matter. And I have looked because as the MEC for Finance certainly it is my responsibility to exercise financial oversight and when I saw that it is within the financial framework, there were no financial risks to this government, I ratified the decision which the Gambling Board has taken. But let me give further information, because I think I know what this hon member Mr Dyantyi is trying to fish for.

This matter had to do with a saving of R816 000 for that particular position. [Interjection.] The Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board did write to me and given the complexity of the regulatory environment of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, they have requested me if they can appoint two additional law-enforcement officers and I have agreed that that matter can be done... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a separate matter. You know it too.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...because I know what you are up to, because I got the lead that you got, from the Gambling Board. That same lead that you got preceded me, so this is what has happened hon Madam Speaker. [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek kom terug daarna. Wag 'n bietjie daarmee.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: There was no interference by the MEC. This was a decision that was taken by the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board and they have approached me in terms of the financial implications, and I have ratified the decision, which they have taken because there was not any financial risk to this Government. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you Madam Speaker. It is getting interesting but let me put my next follow-up question. Is the MEC aware of the financial risk to the Board as a result of his instruction that forced the change and did away with this Head of Betting and Racing? Is he aware of the financial risk?

The SPEAKER: Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Firstly, the Minister has not given any instruction. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, I like that. Watch this space.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, order, the Chief Whip is on the floor. Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, yes, can I just follow-up on that question. Did the MEC not request them, the Board, to do away with that to get the two other positions, and then of course the Board had to fall in with the request of the MEC?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: There was a written request. If the hon members would like to receive that documentation, I am happy to submit it to the Standing Committee. There was a written request by the Gambling Board to the MEC.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the last follow-up on Question 4. Can we now move to Question 5? I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

Special school for failed matriculants

5. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Education:

Whether her Department has plans to open a special school for those matriculants who have failed or want to rewrite their matric exam in order to improve their results; if not, why not; if so, what are the

relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Madam Speaker, and hon member Mr Dugmore. No, it would be impractical to open one special school for the purpose given the logistics of learners getting to and from the facilities; given the size of the province amongst other reasons. Learners who have failed or want to rewrite or improve their results may enter the supplementary examination in March of the following year or register to rewrite at the end of the following year at a centre in the district in which they reside.

This year all learners who qualify for supplementary examinations in the Western Cape received additional assistance, which included a full support programme that provided lessons for candidates writing supplementary examinations by our Telematics Service; extra tutoring at centres in the various districts as well as previous exam and answer papers, previous exemplar exam papers and memoranda.

Adult Basic Education and Training is available to adults who want to finish their basic education and outcomes-based programme ABET aims to provide basic learning tools, knowledge and skills and provides participants with nationally recognised qualifications. There are ABET Centres in each of the eight education districts. There are currently 73 ABET Centres in the Western Cape, which now fall under the Department of Higher Education and Training.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore to follow-up.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, as a follow-up question I would like to ask whether the MEC would consider a petition by at least 2 000 learners who are requesting the additional possibility of attending such so-called finishing school in the sense that they find it more advantageous to have teachers in front of them, teaching them, helping them to either improve their results or to pass matric they have failed, especially those who are not now writing according to the CAPS Curriculum but the National Curriculum Statement, whether she would consider such a petition?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I will consider any request that comes from any learner in the province but the problem is we have already had similar schools in this province, as you well know, which you actually announced in 2005 that you were closing it in 2006. That same school, Lagunya as you well know, remained in existence until 2009 when Minister Grant in fact closed it for the reasons that it was too expensive. Teachers were under-utilised and also the attendance was erratic.

We have tried this year as far as our progressed learners are concerned to take them to a special facility to give them additional assistance and at the moment what we are encountering with them is that they are not willing to go to such a facility, so I am quite interested to hear that you have got people. I am always prepared to listen and we will assist them where we can, but we

cannot establish specific schools necessarily, but we can certainly discuss ways of assisting them if they wish to have assistance, if they do not fall within the ABET system.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The second follow-up question, hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC whether she then is basically telling this House and the learners of the Western Cape that if you have money to go to a Damelin or a Progress College to repeat your matric then you can be assisted, but if you do not have money the WCED, which is a public education department, is not prepared to go the extra mile to actually help those matrices to complete their matric?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am not sure that the hon member Mr Dugmore was listening to my answer, because that is not what I said at all, in any way, shape or form.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is no answer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: If they are adult learners who failed matric the previous year, if they failed matric this year, they can get assistance for the supplementary exams from the Education Department next

year. If they are currently progressed learners and need additional assistance we can help them. If they are adult learners they go to ABET Centres, which is what you implemented when you were MEC, which is a national policy and which falls under the Department of Higher Education, which does not fall under the Provincial Education Department. So I said we will consider any request within our mandate and if it is not within our mandate we will try and assist to liaise with the relevant people involved, but that is not what I said, and you know that is not what I said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your third opportunity. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC that given that when the ANC was responsible for the Education portfolio we actually refused and did not accede to the suggestions from certain officials in the WCED to close down Lagunya Finishing School, and that in fact it was the DA MEC Grant who closed the Lagunya Finishing School, dashing the hopes of thousands of young people. Do you therefore agree with the decision that your predecessor made to close the finishing school?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As I said the decision was not taken by my predecessor first. It was taken by you on 12 December 2005. Then MEC for Education in the Western Cape, Cameron Dugmore, did not approve the closure at that point but he recommended that the school should function until the end of the year, 31 December 2006, and that an ABET Centre should

be established in the building of Lagunya. So it was not initially his decision, but it was his decision subsequent to that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: And given the reasons I have already said as to why he closed it, I absolutely do agree because it was not in the interest of the learners. The learners were not attending and the teachers were not being used properly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there another one? Your last opportunity, hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to ask the MEC who was the MEC in 2009 when the Lagunya Finishing School was closed, dashing the hopes of thousands of matriculants? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It seems that hon member Mr Dugmore has a problem with his hearing today.

'n AGBARE LID: Kyk hoe bloos hy.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The learners were not attending. The

attendance was erratic. The Minister at the time was Donald Grant, who enforced what the ANC had decided in 2006. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! We proceed to Question number 6. Minister Plato.

Manenberg: anti-gang strategy

6. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Community Safety:

What is his Department doing to implement an anti-gang strategy in assisting the residents of Manenberg who have started a WhatsApp group to alert each other of any gunshots in the areas and identifying perpetrators?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. The Department's anti-gang initiatives are based on a whole of society approach to create safer environments. This requires that all role-players play their part. This needs to be supported by specifically a capable and capacitated police force, which the Department believes includes specialised gang and drug units.

The Department's interventions focuses on youth and on community support. The Department engages youth through training and placement and supports communities via support to the CPFs, the neighbourhood-watches, NGOs and

offers a basket of services to communities in general and in Manenberg the member referred to in his question for the financial year 2014/15; it includes the following: Neighbourhood-watch Training and Expanded Public Works Programme; Crysalis youth workers trained and placed at institutions with stipends; the Youth Safety Religious Programme engages youth in programmes during school holidays.

The Department funded four different religious organisations to the amount of R37 500 per organisation and just over 500 youth attended during that specific period.

FET Colleges Bursary Drives: the Department held a Youth Focus Safety Outreach in Manenberg. That was yesterday. The Department of Community Safety has an existing partnership with Northlink College to assist in increasing youth safety by targeting our younger residents. The vulnerable youth, youth involved with gangsterism and drugs and out of school youth to prevent them from getting involved in these wrong things, and we help them to pursue their further education or training to work towards careers and have all the information they need to make responsible decisions and choices and not fall victim to negative social behaviour like gangsterism.

This partnership has already provided more than 2000 plus study opportunities to youth-at-risk through Northlink and other existing FET Colleges. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you. Thank you, Minister Plato, for that. I just want to know the one problem that we have is with the number of gunshots that we have in Manenberg and I want to know do the SAPS assist?

An HON MEMBER: The question.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Do the SAPS assist your initiatives and this WhatsApp initiative, did you speak to the people to try to assist other communities at risk because I think it is a brilliant initiative. With all the programmes you have, do you have the SAPS buying into those programmes to assist the residents in Manenberg?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You look good when you ask questions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the question. Yes, yesterday in Manenberg police were present in full force. They do assist even in carting the youths to the event and also giving to them the necessary talks and that sort of thing so I think the relationship in that regard between the Department and the police is quite good.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, thank you Minister, for that answer. In the same spirit, what is your attitude towards leaders of the DA that are involved [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, does it relate to this question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That are involved with the same gangsters that are frustrating the communities [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Of Manenberg.

Mr K E MAGAXA: In Manenberg?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Now you brought it closer to home. Hon Minister Plato, do you want to reply to that one? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I think his last remark is on Manenberg. Then you need to provide the names of those people in Manenberg that are involved. I do not know.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I ask this question out of concern. I do not want to politicise this question, because we are playing with communities' lives. So I am asking the question, the WhatsApp groups, did you investigate that; in Manenberg they are using the WhatsApp when they hear gunshots, because the problem you have is the police gives you one figure and the community gives you another figure, but the communities are helping one another. Did you investigate that and did you speak to other communities to maybe have this WhatsApp group in other areas when there are gunshots, telling police and all of those types of things, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The same initiative in Manenberg we are finding in many other areas, and the Department do assist the Manenberg community, even on Monday I had a meeting with the Safety Forum. The previous week I had meetings with other NGOs in Manenberg. A lot of the Manenberg safety leadership CPF neighbourhood-watches were present yesterday at our event, but I need to say the big problem is while police do respond and they try their best, they are however definitely under-resourced and it is difficult for them to track down where and when someone is going to shoot. That is a difficult situation. The police patrols this side, a shooting takes place on the other side. We need to flood the communities with security personnel to stop the shootings, but we do not have the

personnel to do that and that is our big problem in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, the last opportunity.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, thanks, Minister Plato. I also want to ask, Minister, what are you going to do with some politicians who are aligned to the DA, who are pleading to the cause not to imprison gangsters in this province.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, my answer to that is, following the newspapers, the Democratic Alliance took decisive action, unlike the ANC, and I want to put the question back to the ANC. Newspaper articles that the ANC in the Western Cape invite top underground figures to their rallies as VIP-guests... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And to let those underground figures sit on the stage in the same row with the President [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Sitting with gangsters [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: President Jacob Zuma, and no action was taken against that, so I want to ask you by the same token; we took action, you have not taken any action; where is your action and when is it going to happen? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon member, the time - the four supplementary questions have been exhausted on this question. We move to Question number 7.

An HON MEMBER: Mark my words... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Plato.

Shortage of police officers

7. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Community Safety:

When will the shortage of police officers in the province be addressed?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thanks to hon member Mr Christians for this question. The following entry level constables were recruited for employment in the province and are currently busy with a basic police development learning programme. That is now to train them as police officers.

For the 2013/2014 financial year it is 546 recruits and for the 2014/2015

financial year it is 735 new recruits. It must be noted that the training stretches over a period of two years and the first recruits will be available at police stations only by the end of 2016.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Minister Plato. We have done a couple of oversight visits and I have also as a member of the Standing Committee visited police stations and the number is significant. The shortage of the [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What is your question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The figure is something like 7000 shortages... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We know that. Ask the question.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...of police officers in the Western Cape. [Interjection.] My question is, these 500 and 200 or 700 will not address that problem because it is only after two years. We are suffering. Did you have any discussions, as the Standing Committee our Chairperson wrote to the National Commissioner?

Ms M N GILLION: What is your question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: We did not get a satisfactory answer. Did you engage with the National Commissioner? What is the plan of action because even these numbers do not address the shortages in the Western Cape?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member. [Interjections.] Order! Before the Minister responds can I just again appeal that members ask their questions in a concise form. Do not make long introductions. I will allow a short introduction but then get to the question and one question only. Minister Plato to respond.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. I had many engagements with the National Police Commissioner, with the National Minister of Police, I think ten days ago when I had the opportunity to speak at the NCOP in the presence of the National Minister, that was my issue. Police just see that and brush it off as a complaint from the Western Cape Government, but at the P&P the policing needs and priority meetings that is the one issue raised over and over again by the public. Visible policing in our communities is non-existent as a result of that. We have 85% of our police stations in the Western Cape under-resourced and let me say, my oversight visits, the oversight visit by the Chairperson of the Standing

Committee, show that even at night-time in gangster-stricken areas at police stations there is sometimes one lady police officer behind the counter.

An HON MEMBER: This is exaggerating.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No it is true. [Interjections.] It is true. It is fact. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a fact.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The officer that was shot and killed in Klapmuts, Captain Britz, was one man alone behind the counter, shot dead. He had no chance against four guys walking into the charge office.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Shocking.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The police officers are at risk and the police let go over 10 000 reservists and they are talking about job creation? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Bring back Bambanani.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We are saying to the police bring back all the reservists. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Employ them immediately and Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Look who is talking.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Bambanani.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Bambananis the hon member Mr Dugmore referred to, they do not roam the streets. They only open gates at schools. [Interjections.] The role of the Bambanani, as we understood it, is a different piece of cake.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We misunderstood the role of the Bambananis. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: It was the [Inaudible.] of the principals.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Chief Whip. Sorry, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr C M DUGMORE: No point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A point of order hon member Mr Dugmore?

Ms M N GILLION: Let Carol.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask a question of clarity. [Interjection.] No, it is not what you think, Anton Bredell.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it, it is a point of order that you are asking a question on?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a point of order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I need advice here now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: When we hand in questions on the Order Paper to be asked, if your question is directed at the wrong MEC or the wrong Department is it not put onto the Paper or is it taken to the correct person? I would like to know why this question is here, because MEC Dan Plato does not have jurisdiction over the police.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Yes, he does.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, he does not.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order, member.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: He has oversight over them.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: He has oversight over them Mr Deputy Speaker. He does not have a right to determine when they get... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, thank you for that. I am not going to argue. [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Mr Wiley, let me just deal with that point. Do you want to address me on the same point?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, with all due respect, your position here is not as advice office. If he has a problem he must speak to his Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Let me deal with that, first of all. There is a Questions office who deals with questions. If a question is clearly addressed to the wrong Ministry it will be sent to the correct Ministry. I am not going to make a ruling on whether this specific question falls under the

auspices of this Minister. It has appeared on the Question Paper and we have dealt with the question but the general policy is that if it is a clear-cut case that the question was addressed to the wrong Minister it will be sent on administratively to the correct Ministry and if the receiving Ministry feels the question does not belong there, there is also a process to pass it on to get it to the right one, but I am not going to make a comment on the question whether the Minister has oversight over the police and things like that. That is something else, but let us proceed. Minister Plato, do you want to respond?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I have to respond to the hon member Carol Beerwinkel, just to clarify that issue, because she gives a clear indication that I do not understand my responsibilities. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Haibo.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Let me say oversight means where there is a systemic problem in SAPS it is my duty as MEC to identify that problem and to convey that problem to the national police leadership and also to the provincial police leadership. I sit with the PC every week with my list of issues I pick up during the week and complaints received from the public and raise it with him. That is my role and even to identify to the PC what is happening at the stations, shortage of police officers and non-visibility of police in our communities; that is part of my oversight responsibility.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Plato. That could be a topic for a different discussion. We proceed now with the Question Paper, with the Questions as printed. The second one, hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: On a point of order, through you, I would just like to ask MEC Plato if he is prepared to withdraw his reference to hon member Dogmor. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Plato, I did not hear that, but if you did say that.

Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Luister, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, laat ek nou gou vir u sê, dalk lyk agb lid Carol Beerwinkel soos agb Dugmore en vice versa. I do not know. [Laughter.] As dit is dat ek dit verkeerdelik gedoen het, dan trek ek dit terug.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie. Ons gaan voort. Hon member Mr Wiley, is that supplementary?

Mr M G E WILEY: It is a last question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, Order! Hon Plato, Minister Plato, there is the last opportunity for a supplementary question on this question. You may proceed.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you Minister. Given your answers, would you agree that we are sitting with a “Veary, Veary” serious situation? [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister, if you want to respond to that. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, to answer the question... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: In relation to the question about the shortage of resources, I have said it before; we are heading for a time-bomb in the Western Cape.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a DA problem.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I rather want to address you as Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And I am not going to look at the hon member Mr Dyantyi. I want to say through you to the hon member Mr Dyantyi he must listen to what hon member Ms Beerwinkel has said.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Democratic Alliance does not have any operational control over SAPS. He is misleading this House because his party... [Interjections.] ... is in control of the South African Police Services. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Thank you. We proceed to the next question. That is Question number 8. Hon member Mr Tyatyam to Minister Plato. Minister Plato it is you again. [Interjections.]

Philippi East: recent violence

8. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (a) What are the causes of the recent violence that is taking place in Philippi East and (b) how has the Provincial Government intervened?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the question. As reported by SAPS through the ProvJoints, the causes of the violence in Philippi are related to land invasion and housing delivery

demands and general services.

The Department of Community Safety through its participation on the Western Cape Provincial Joints chaired by SAPS was in question to make interventions into the violent unrest in Marikana informal settlement. Since 25 April 2015 the Department has facilitated various conflict resolution sessions and meetings at the Local Philippi East Police Station attended by representatives of the Marikana Development Forum, the SAPS Police Station Commander and CPF executive members and other community leaders.

The purpose of these engagements was to reduce the violent conflict and to get the leaders to speak to relevant municipal stakeholders peacefully. I personally intervened with organisations in Nyanga, Lower Crossroads, Marikana and Philippi East Police Station and also at community halls in the area. The intervention came after the service delivery process left the area with noticeable scars. Houses were burnt. There was damage to property, leaving people homeless and lives were lost.

After various engagements by officials, myself, the police and leadership of the area the local community identified the need for neighbourhood-watch training and equipment support and further training that could immediately facilitate local peace initiatives. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you. †ku MEC iquestion yam ubalekele kude kuyo sesinengxaki yezi service pha kutheni abantu baye bavunyelwa bayokwakha pha kwindawo ebekumele ukuba abokhi kuyo? Kuba pha eRondebosch common net abantu bazise amaplanga abo phayana bayasuswa kwangelothuba, so kutheni bangasuswanga kwangelathuba pha? Njengoba sinengxaki ye services ezingekhoyo pha xa kuthiwa kulelwa lonto? *Thank you MEC, you have run away from my question. Now we have a problem with services there. Why did they allow people to build on a place which they were not allowed to, because in Rondebosch Common, once the people bring their planks there, they get removed immediately. So why did they not remove them? Now we have a problem with service delivery, and that is the cause of the fight.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is the crux of the matter in that whole area, but it is not an issue for the Western Cape Government alone to address and for one Department like Community Safety. [Interjections.]

The fact of the matter is that the local authority, like the City of Cape Town, have a big say in this and I have proposed in a letter to the Mayor that we and the City of Cape Town will have to come together with the leadership to resolve that issue. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a second follow-up, hon member Mr

Tyatyam.

†UMnu S G TYATYAM: iCity of Cape town nayo I under iDA kutheni kuzofika because abantu bala community pha abakahlali kakuhle nangoku kusanqolotywana ebusuku and la community leyana iMarikana ayikabina services nangoku sithetha nje kutheni kungeka intervinner pha kula area okanye kuyajabulwa kumana kubonwa abantu besifa pha? kuba ukuze sibone u gornment eyo intervinner pha oweDA sibabone after kufe abantu abayi phaya eMarikana so ingaba kufuneka kuqhubekeke kubulawa abantu phayana?

*The City of Cape Town is also under the DA. The community there is not settled. Even now they are still killing each other during the night and the Marikana community still has no services as we speak now. Why is there no intervention, or are you happy hearing about killings there? The government only intervened when we had about seven people who were killed in Marikana. Do you want this to continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato to respond.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I received a communiqué from the City of Cape Town that they will provide services to the perimeter of that piece of land. The notification I received is that the Marikana - that specific piece of land we are talking about - is private land and it is very difficult, it is not warranted for the City to provide services right onto that piece of land. So that is the problem we are facing and that is why we need to engage, we need to talk, to find an amicable way of how best to address that issue. Thank

you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, is there a further follow-up, hon member Mr Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, †kune pensioners phaya eLower Cross Road ezitshiselwe izindlu zazo, ezitshiselwe izindlu zazo izindlu ezingekalungiswa nangoku kuyanetha ngoku, kunabantu abaluze impahla zabo kuyanetha ngoku ingaba wenza ntoni? Le intervention ingade ibonakale because phayana nangoku infact bendingabuzi kuye bendibuza ku Premiur uwuthathe ngokwakhe lombuzo so ndizowubuza kuye ubungayi kuye lo mbuzo uyathanda ukuthatha imibuzo le question kutheni le intervention ingekenzeki ukuncedisa ababantu bahlelelekileyo ngoku?

*There are pensioners in Lower Cross Roads whose houses have been burnt down and not even fixed now. It is raining now and they lost their belongings. What is being done to intervene? Because even now, in fact - I was not asking him. I was asking the Premier. He took the question and I will ask him but this question was not for him. He likes to take up questions. Why are interventions not in place yet to help the poor?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker, I think the violent portion of the question is for me.

An HON MEMBER: No but it was not... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is more appropriate for me to answer that portion [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Human Settlements portion of the question is a new question for my colleague over there... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No it is not.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And he will have to answer to that. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last opportunity, hon Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, †kumphathiswa lo wozokhuseleko kanye pha ingaba ezingxaki zenzeka ngokuba kungaziswa inkonzo abantu bangahlali kwindawo ezifanele abantu zenza ukuba eyakhe idepartment ngakumbi ubundlobongela, busokolise yena nalamapolisa athe akakho ingaba ayincedisi na lento yokuba failure ukuzisa iiservices neenkonzo ebantwini yenza udlame ekuhlaleni ngoba abantu bahleli ebugxwayibeni na?

*Hon Minister are the problems that are happening there, those of service delivery, people not staying where they are supposed to stay, does that make

his Department, especially the misbehaviour that gives him and these police which he says do not exist - is it not what causes the failure of service delivery to the people? That causes violence in the community because people are in the wilderness?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to get back to a previous point I have made. I definitely cannot speak about the services issue and also the housing issue and the land issue. I think maybe it could be a question for my colleague Minister Madikizela, he is listening - to answer at the next meeting. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then proceed to the next question. Question 9, hon member Mr Tyatyam to the hon Minister of Cultural Affairs, hon Du Toit Marais.

Initiation of boys in the winter season

9. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

What is the preparation of her Department for the initiation of boys in the winter season?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you hon

member Mr Tyatyam for this. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ...for this question.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis 'n eerste een daar, daar is hy.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Initiation is a cultural practice with health implications.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy kom nou!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, you know the convention. Please allow the Minister.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport has developed a protocol to create a safe and enabling environment for initiates. Initiation as a culture rite of passage is practiced by the Xhosas, Hlubis and Sothos in the Western Cape.

Initiation seasons in the Western Cape are during winter from May until July and some are from November to January of each calendar year. Only Xhosas practice initiation during winter.

The management of initiation has three phrases, which are the pre-initiation, during-initiation and post-initiation. The response contextualises efforts from DCAS in preparation for a safe and enabling winter initiation season.

In total there will be 25 initiation sites for the winter season. Site visitations were undertaken with Chairpersons of Initiation Forums and environmental officers of the respective municipalities. A workshop was held in March 2015 with traditional surgeons, carers, environmental health officers, CapeNature, the Department of Health and Cultural Affairs and Sport to address aspects of the relationship of dehydration and death; parental consent and environmental awareness.

Contact meetings with 19 Initiation Forums were held during the months of May to June, the purpose being to prepare for the season for example medical screenings, directory of emergency services, should it be required. 72 traditional surgeons and carers have been trained in first aid in June 2015. It was 10 until 12 June.

The training focused on basic first aid to equip them to respond to minor injuries. Thermal blankets have been produced by DCAS to assist against the winter cold. The Department of Health procured protective clothing for the carers. A workshop on indigenous knowledge system and medical procedures related to initiation was facilitated by a medical doctor who has undergone initiation.

This workshop was aimed at the carers and traditional surgeons. An interview with *Radio Zibonele* was done with the Khayelitsha and Mfuleni Initiation Forums to announce the season, the importance of parental consent and an incident free rite of passage for the upcoming season.

It is important to note that a monitoring team will do site visits while initiation is in transit for early detection and to appropriately deal with challenges.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

†UMnu S G TYATYAM: Enkosi, Sekela Somlomo. Ndicela ukubuza kumphathiswa seleyile ukuyobona lamagqwetha athetha ngawo? Ndicela ukumbuza seleyile ukuyowabona lamagqwetha nentaba ezi kuthethwa ngazo okanye uzazi apha encwadini?

*Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can I please ask the Minister if she has seen the doctors she is speaking of? Also, I please want to ask if she has been in an initiation school or does she only know that by reading a book?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Du Toit Marais to respond to that interesting question.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. No, I have not been. It is a cultural sensitive issue and it is only the forums that decide on this and thus I have not been there. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Thank you Minister. Is there a follow-up, hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Is the MEC aware of any botched initiations that have taken place in the Western Cape as recently sadly experienced in the Eastern Cape?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Du Toit Marais. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: No, not to my knowledge in the Western Cape but nine boys in the Eastern Cape undergo medical [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no-no. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] If there are no follow-up questions - is there another one, hon member Mr Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, †Ndicela nje ukuqonda ndimvile uMEC xa ephendula ndifuna nje ukuqinisekisa ukuba uyayazi na ngokwesiko lethu lokwakuka akanalo ilungelo lokuya phayana xa abafana beyofakwa ndifuna nje ukuqonda enzela engenzi mhlawumbi lo mpazamo ndifuna nje ukuqonda nje ukubangaba uyayazi na lonto leyo ukuhlonipha ke isiko eli lethu.

*Please, I want to understand. I have heard the MEC when she answered. I want to be sure that she knows that according to our culture of circumcision, she has no rights to go there whilst boys are taken in. I want to understand, she must not make that mistake. I want to know if she is aware that she needs to respect our tradition.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Du Toit Marais.

An HON MEMBER: Is that a question?

An HON MEMBER: No, that is not a question.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: I do not think it is really a question. As I said, it is a cultural and sensitive matter.

Mr R T OLIVIER: So you will not go.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: So I will not go.
Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last opportunity hon member Mr Tyatyam.

†UMnu S G TYATYAM: Bendicela ukuqonda kuMphathiswa ukuthi ingaba kulonyaka kule season ye Winter sijonge amakhwenkwe amangaphi esixhosa azokwaluka namakhwenkwe amangaphi vesisuthu azokuya entabeni so ndifuna ukuqonda ukuba sesizenzile I numbers zethu sijonge kubuywe nini?

*Please, I want to know from the MEC that in this year, this winter season, what is the estimation of Xhosa boys going to initiation school, and Sesotho boys going to the bush? So I want to know, have we done our calculations and what is the return time?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Du Toit Marais. Minister, before you respond, hon member Mr Hinana, is that a point of order?

Mr N E HINANA: Yes, please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, †ndifuna ukulungisa Iqabane lam eli, ayinokwenzeka into ethi umntu ongutata abuze umntu ongumama imibuzo enje eyenza into yokuhlekisa into yesiko lesintu ilihlazo kwalento afuna uMinister ukuba makayiphendule kodwa uyayazi ukuba yinto yamadoda le yana makangathathi uhlazo lolwaluko alucingayo azolubuza u Minister, uhlaza isiko lethu.

*I want to rectify my comrade. It cannot happen that a man asks a woman such questions, making our culture a laughing matter. It is a disgrace what he is asking, wanting the Minister to reply on, knowing that this issue is for men. He must not bring up the thinking of circumcision and ask the Minister. He is disgracing our culture.

An HON MEMBER: A point of order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Thank you Minister. Hon member Mr Hinana, I am not going to respond to that. The Minister was on her feet to give a response. The Minister may respond in the way she wishes to respond. I understand it is a sensitive issue but the Minister may respond.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister Du Toit Marais, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Hon member Mr Hinana, as I said, and as you should know, it is only the Xhosas that are doing initiation in winter and I am not sure how many but I will ask my Department and give you the number. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. The time for Questions has

long expired. We move on to the Statements by Members. The rest of the unanswered questions will be printed in Hansard. There are quite a number of questions that were not dealt with today but members were keen to ask supplementary questions and that took up all the time.

[Question time expired.]

[Replies to Questions 10 to 17 to be printed in Hansard].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Statements by Members. I recognise the DA first. The DA, for statements; hon member Mr Mnqasela.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr M MNQASELA (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to commend the Western Cape Disaster Management Department for its world-class resource and response measures in dealing with the issues of disaster.

This is the only province that has a fully-fledged disaster unit, where the Chief Director is at the level of the HOD and is well functioning and well resourced, and that is what we are very proud of as the Democratic Alliance.

The Provincial Flood Preparedness Plan and Strategy was shared with the Department of Water Affairs in 2014 and the Department of Water Affairs adopted that plan and used it as a benchmark for the entire Department in the

country and that says the Western Cape †iyasebenza *is working.

We want to further ensure that we commend the Western Cape Department of Disaster Management in the way in which it has supported municipalities in the development of their own plans. Last week when we did the cluster visits to the Cape Winelands District they were even able to show us if there is an incident here, for instance in Langeberg they are able to zoom in and put a live stream where you can see the incident like you are watching television, because that is how they want to deal with disasters in real time, and then show that those victims are able to receive help and are able to feel that this Government of the Western Cape cares for the people, especially the poor.

[Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Mnqasela, your time has expired. I see the ANC, hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI (ANC): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape ANC celebrates the release of the Cuban Five, Gerardo Hernandez, Antonio Guerrero, Ramon Lubanino, Fernando Gonzalez and Rene Gonzalez, who were unfairly detained for more than a decade. We welcome them on our shores. The ANC played an important part in getting the last of these heroes and heroine released.

The month of June is celebrated as the Youth Month, where we commemorate the selfless contribution of young people to the freedom and democracy we

enjoy today.

This year marks the 39th Anniversary of the doleful occasion where youth of 1976 lost their lives during the Soweto Uprising on 16 June.

The year 2015 also marks 21 years of democracy, which coincides with 60 years of the Freedom Charter. We celebrate the Youth Movement under the National Anthem: Youth Moving South Africa forward.

I have noted with concern the Provincial Government's hypocrisy and lazy thinking tendencies. This Government could not even draft its own youth month statement. Instead they copied a bulk of NYDA youth month statements, including its theme, which states: "Youth Action for Economic Freedom in our lifetime."

The question that should be asked is who is the DA fooling here? What do they know about economic freedom in our lifetime? Or should I put it this way: how is their Western Cape Youth Development Strategy going to lead young people attaining the vision of economic freedom in our lifetime?

The DA is feeding the people of the Western Cape with lies in their whole of society approach, which seeks to protect the interests of privileged people in the Western Cape. Is the economic freedom that they are referring to the 3000 jobs for young people that hon member Ms Botha was bragging about the other day?

The DA cannot talk about youth action for economic freedom when they are currently planning to close down schools, when hundreds of children across the province are sitting at home because they could not be enrolled at schools in 2015.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Is the action they are talking about the bunch of young people actively involved in gangs and crime... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Ms Makeleni, your time has expired. Please finish off.

Ms P MAKELENI: or is it the youth that is addicted to drugs and alcohol abuse? For as long as the civic society structures for youth developments are not prioritised by the Premier the picture will remain the same forever.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Mr B D KIVEDO (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, the June school holidays are upon us once again, officially commencing on 26 June. It is usually during the school holidays that we see a spike in already increasing school vandalism cases.

On several occasions I have stressed the necessity of a holistic approach to redress this issue. To my dismay, I opened the *Cape Times* on 3 June to read how one organisation of principals felt that taking responsibility and ownership of their schools was asking too much from poor communities. Slaan my dood met 'n veer! [Gelag.]

If this is not the democratic South Africa for which government ought to be of the people, by the people for the people? Is this not the Western Cape in which we are *Better Together*, hon member Mr Dugmore?

What motivates their claim, especially if the Minister and her spokesperson elaborated on many examples of poorer areas where community action is in fact happening?

The Department can only redress incidents at schools if they are made aware that they exist. How does this organisation propose that the Department is made aware of incidents if not with the help of the community? Although I understand the dire needs within the poorer communities, I also know that in these communities education and educational institutions are held in high esteem.

This organisation agrees that the problem is a socio-economic one. However, this organisation should be reminded that education is the foundation for socio-economic development and growth, which enables the vulnerable from poorer communities to rise above their circumstances.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member, please finish off. Your time has expired, the last sentence.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I then conclude to their claim that it is too much to ask of poor communities to report vandalism, with the wisdom of Dr Martin Luther King Jr that our lives begin to end the day we become silent about things that matter. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Thank you hon member Mr Kivedo, your time has expired. I see the EFF, hon member Mr Joseph? Not? I see the DA, hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The spirit of Ubuntu is inherently amongst all the Africans since their birth. The spirit of Ubuntu means that you cannot exist in isolation. We are interconnected. Ubuntu extends the belief in a universal bond of sharing that connects all humanity.

Ubuntu made us what we are today. It is the mark of our Constitution that paved the way for civic engagement. Our shared heritage was born out of reconciliation and forgiveness. We should acknowledge that and live the gift of Ubuntu.

The spirit of Ubuntu does not allow and teaches when you are an adult or you are a child: you do not play with a “poo”, because that is un-African. The

potential of Ubuntu is a positive force, which is ignited through the culture, arts and storytelling.

Steve Biko once said: “The greatest power of the world may have done wonders in giving the world an industrial and military look, but the great still has to come from Africa - giving the world a more human face.”

In Africa we do not have as people of Africa what is called “inkedama”, an orphan because we believe in the communal ownership. That is what makes us today to be the human beings and we encourage all of us to embrace the spirit of Ubuntu, because we are looking after each other, as much as we are looking after the fragile, the disabled and the aged. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC, hon member Ms Lekker.

An HON MEMBER: It is very sad. Shame!

†UNksz P Z LEKKER (ANC): Enkosi Sekela Somlomo. *Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. What shameful shambles as the real DA reels from one scandal to another! In less than a week three senior DA leaders were caught out with evidence where they publicly showed what the DA is really about...

an opposition held together by various characters for the sake of opposing.

Cape Town ward councillor Willie Jaftha of Belhar in a letter shocked even the judge as he pleaded with the Western Cape High Court for leniency for the convicted hitman Reyaaz alias “Katjies” Dennis of the George alias “Geweld” Thomas 28’s gang after they were found guilty of murder and many other serious crimes.

Cape Town Ward Councillor John Heuvel of Macassar was recorded on tape where he used racial slur when he called a security guard “a dom or stupid K-word”, while he was busy abusing council facilities for his sand mining business.

DA MP and a former member of this House, Archie Figlan found guilty by the DA of a sexual attack on an employee of the party, in full view of others during a public march and Figlan got only a slap on the wrist!

The ANC still waits to hear what the DA decided on its Cape Town Eastridge Tafelsig Ward 99 Councillor, Maria Weavers in another case of racism.

We saw in the latest *Weekend Argus* the DA big shot, Cape Town Councillor J P Smith, also known as the Sheriff of the By-law City, after months of denial now basically admitted guilt indirectly or directly and illegally paying Manenberg’s notorious HL gangsters for so called protection at City construction sites. [Interjections.]

The DA rots from the head while Cape Town burns and people die. The DA has become an assembly of crooks and gangsters. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker, your time has expired. I see the DA, hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The year is 2029 and we are celebrating ten years of DA in National Government. After 10 years of DA Government, what does South Africa look like? How have South Africans' lives been changed for the better? Let me tell you...

At last we have a government that is animated by the extraordinary potential of all South Africans and we work to realise the potential of this great country. Our government sees its main job as creating a better tomorrow and recognises the best remedy for redress is to improve education and growing the economy. Priority is given to safety, affordable healthcare and clean government. A small government of 15 ministries work for South Africans and provide quality service. In 2029 South Africa is very different.

An HON MEMBER: What do you know? Let me give you... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M M WENGER: We have, for the first time, realised an annual economic

growth rate of 8% and we are envied by many in the developing world for our business-friendliness and reputation as a hub of innovation.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Oor ons dooie liggame.

Ms M M WENGER: Our society is characterised by fairness and by justice. South Africans feel more empowered and confident about the future. In this South Africa you can make it if you work hard. [Interjection.]

Your destiny is determined by your efforts and available opportunities and not by the circumstances of your birth... [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Loop aan!

Ms M M WENGER: And a better education system together with a growing economy means more and more opportunity; and for those unable to take advantage of these opportunities, a sustainable safety net is there.

In 2029 we have a sense of community and a sense of care for one another. Our country is safer than ever before with a competent, highly equipped police service. The healthcare system works and our health institutions are renowned... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! There is too much... [Interjections.]
Order! There is too much noise from this side of the House please. Allow the

member to continue. Are you finished member; not yet?

Ms M M WENGER: No, I am not finished. Our public health institutions are renowned for their efficient people-centred approach. Overall South Africa is a much better place. Our foreign policy is founded on human rights and an emerging powerful economy. In the DA's future, South Africa is both a leader and a beacon of hope. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. [Interjections.]
Order, I see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Mr Deputy Speaker, newspaper reports of a 16-year old Grade 9 learner in Belhar being allegedly gang-raped repeatedly by an unknown number of fellow students in a classroom during school hours is an abomination. [Interjections.]

What is even more disturbing is the fact that the victim is too scared to go to the police station, because her life is being threatened. I believe that the perpetrators who belong to the schools, belong to the Sexy Boys.

The ACDP believes that a school should be a safe environment, a stimulating environment for all learners. This is vital so that they can have a meaningful life and positively contribute to the building of a prosperous South Africa.
[Interjection.]

We therefore urge the Minister and the Department to conduct an investigation into this matter. We want to know how is it possible that a learner can be raped during school hours. We also believe that the matter is of utmost concern and that these learners cannot excel when they need to be in school. It is important that a clear message will be sent of zero tolerance, clearly communicated to all learners that they are there to learn and not to violate the law. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you ACDP.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I now see the ANC.

Mr C M DUGMORE (ANC): Madam Speaker, it is important that this House reflects very seriously about the plight of the De Waal Drive residents. It is clear that despite their appeals and despite their requests that MEC Madikizela is simply not listening.

An HON MEMBER: He ran away.

Mr C M DUGMORE: In fact there is a Xhosa expression saying that †la mfo Mphathiswa uyateketa *he speaks with forked tongue. En dit bedoel basies dat hy praat met twee tonge of miskien drie. No, he is not speaking in tongues, he is speaking with a forked tongue, because it is very clear that on

the one hand he says... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, sorry, if you could take your seat.
Is it a point of order, Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, Madam Speaker, it is a convention that any allusion to a member lying is not acceptable. In the past... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Where is that? [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: In the past to say for instance “jy skiet spek”, was unacceptable parliamentary and in this particular case to say someone speaks with a forked tongue means that they are actually not telling the truth.
[Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

Mr M G E WILEY: And I wonder if we could have a ruling on this matter, please. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down. [Interjections.] Continue hon member Mr Dugmore.

The SPEAKER: No, I am just reflecting on what was said. I did not hear the hon member Mr Dugmore say the Minister is lying. He says he speaks with a

forked tongue and I think that could be interpreted in any way so I will allow that and ask the hon member Mr Dugmore to proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Continue!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. So on the one hand the MEC says that there will be no evictions but then at the same time he indicates that those who cannot pay their rent, who have been increasing at an alarming rate, will have to move. The issue basically is that there is a need for integrated human settlements and we need to analyse why in certain areas properties are being offered for sale and not in others. Is it about the fact that the poor are not able to stay in well located land with a sea view? Is it because the DA has promised these houses to certain developers who are waiting in the wings? It is clear that we need to look at this issue in its entirety and consider all aspects of the situation in regard to the overall need for integrated human settlements and we need a full investigation into this and all other properties that belong to the Provincial Housing Department.

The ANC says that we must not just speak about integrated human settlements and transformation but we must actually take practical steps. There is still no provincial housing strategy for the Western Cape as promised by the Premier and all we see in communities like this is the increased gentrification and the marginalisation and exclusion of poor families. This in many senses would amount to nothing less than another District Six forced removal for some of these families.

It is clear that the Standing Committee on Integrated Human Settlements should conduct a full oversight visit and establish the facts about this as we cannot rely on the Democratic Alliance or the forked tongue of MEC Madikizela. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I now see the DA.

Mr D JOSEPH (DA): Madam Speaker, thank you. I would like to reflect today on the DA led Western Cape Government, that has the ability, compared to other provinces, showing how we work together, Better Together, with the people in this province in achieving more with less money than the other provinces. [Interjection.]

National Treasury has confirmed this in their annual statements. [Interjections.] It is there that we have [Interjections.] and if the Western Cape compares itself just to Limpopo which has a population of 5,4 million [Interjections.] it means that the Western Cape, with 6,1 million according to the census is doing more ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... more work with less money. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Mr Joseph. Sorry. Can I just ask the

Minister and the member engaging across the floor - there is a speaker on the floor please. Thank you. You may proceed.

Mr D JOSEPH: The Western Cape with a population of 6,1 million compared to Limpopo, of 5,4 million, is able to deliver more services than Limpopo Province. The fact is that Limpopo Province received R43 billion compared to the Western Cape and with the equitable share that they received they do not know how to spend this money. [Interjections.]

In the ANC led Limpopo Province, where better services are expected by the people, it is very clear that they under-spent by R1,3 billion and they have R100 million in unpaid invoices. [Interjections.] hence the Housing and Health Department in the Western Cape has received additional appropriation from National Treasury because in the Western Cape we know how to spend the money.

In the Western Cape the DA delivers clean and effective governance. In Limpopo the salaries have gone up by 79% ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon members.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... and in Limpopo the highest unemployment rates apply. In the Western Cape we have good governance and good service delivery with 80 000 employees while in Limpopo they have 120 000 public employees.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Joseph, finish up please.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is actually shocking that they are not able to serve the people with that amount of money. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Members that ... [Interjections.] order please! Hon members, please! That is the end of members' statements. Hon Minister Winde, please. We will now move on to the Executive Statement. The hon Minister of Community Safety, Mr Dan Plato, has requested to make a statement. I now afford the Minister the opportunity. I recognise the hon Minister Plato.

EXECUTIVE STATEMENT

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, thank you for the opportunity to set the record straight on some unfair aspersions cast against the leadership of the Western Cape Department of Community Safety as well as against the Premier of the Western Cape.

During the Provincial Parliamentary Sitting of Thursday 21 May 2015, the Chief Whip of the Opposition, the hon Pierre Uys, made some serious allegations about my Department and alleged that the Premier was negligent because she did not know about the matter to which he referred.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister can you take your seat please? Hon member Ms Gillion, is it a point of order?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes, Madam Speaker. I rise on a point of order and I want to affirm on a previous ruling that no personal reflections or attacks will be made in this House.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gillion, I do not see the relevance of your point of order. What the Minister is doing is responding by means of an Executive Statement to a policy issue that affects his department, which is in the interest of the House. You may proceed, Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, thank you. Firstly, the hon member Mr Uys accused the Premier of not knowing about a letter sent by the National Department of Labour regarding a review of compliance of the Employment Equity Act by the Department of Community Safety. He claimed that the letter had been sent to the Premier; therefore she should have known about it.

The Notice of Review of the Department of Community Safety, which was received on 27 October 2014, had in fact been issued to the Head of the Department at the time, Dr Gilbert Lawrence and not to the Premier, as alleged.

It should be noted that in terms of the EE Act, individual government departments are classified as employers in their own right. The responsible person in terms of the Act is the CEO, in our case the HOD. The role of the relevant unit in the Corporate Services Centre of DotP is to support the Department in the administration of EE governance as agreed to in the CSC Service Level Agreement. The relevant unit in the CSC cannot take any decisions on behalf of client departments.

In addition, the matter was entirely administrative in nature and the CSC did not find it necessary to even inform the Premier about it. The Honourable member Mr Uys has misled this House.

Secondly, the honourable... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister would you take your seat please. Hon member Ms Gillion is it a point of order?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes, Madam Speaker. I rise on a point of order again. [Interjection.] Are you the Speaker, MEC? [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Ms M N GILLION: ... that a member must bring a substantive motion to the House to make such allegations. And any member cannot abuse that, not even the Executive Statement for this purpose.

The SPEAKER: Your concerns are noted. Point of order Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: May I address you on this please Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: You may.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, it has become a custom from the ANC's side to make personal and unfounded statements during their statement time, and the only opportunity that the governing party has to respond and to correct those misstatements is during an opportunity of this nature, which is Executive Statements. And it relates to the policy of this Government, because the accusations that are made from the other side there, is that they are not following policy and that they are misleading the House.

There is a natural right called the *audi alteram partem* rule, and that is a right of self. [Interjections.] Thank you, I am addressing the Chair, thank you very much. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys I am being addressed on a point of order.

Mr P UYS: [Inaudible.] point of order and rule on that.

The SPEAKER: No, but this is another...

Mr P UYS: It is a speech now, Madam Speaker.

Mr M G E WILEY: I can make a speech as long as I want. I am addressing the Chair! [Interjections.]. Thank you, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You may continue.

Mr M G E WILEY: I conclude; the fact of the matter is that this side of the House is entitled to respond to accusations made by the other side, especially if they are false accusations, and we are rightfully using the mechanisms provided for in the Rules. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: I have listened to both points of order. In terms of hon member Ms Gillion's point, it is the Department's ability, through an Executive Statement, to come back to the House around a matter that is and has been the subject of a previous statement. I also want to say that I do not see any reference in terms of it being personal aspersions because it was the hon member Mr Uys who actually made those statements, that the Minister, by virtue of an Executive Statement, is clarifying to set the record straight. The Rules do make provision for an Executive Statement in terms of public information that is necessary for the House and in this instance the Minister is rebutting what hon member Mr Uys said two weeks ago in the House. He is setting the record straight. Sorry, hon member Ms Gillion, hon member Uys is on the floor.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. We agree with you on that first part, but the point that was raised was “the hon member Uys has misled the House.” That is the point and that is wrong; of course they may make an Executive Statement and of course we listen to them and of course we will respond to them, but that specific section and the sections to follow in the same way.

Mr M G E WILEY: Do not worry. We will refer it to a committee.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: May I address you please? Madam Speaker, the issue of a substantial motion, if you can go back into previous rulings and communications, that is what I am referring to. [Interjections.] Is the Chief Whip the Speaker? Madam Speaker, please.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gillion ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Is the Chief Whip the Speaker?

The SPEAKER: He is not.

Ms M N GILLION: Now please protect me.

The SPEAKER: You may speak. Hon members we have not used an Executive Statement in the House before and there are very clear guidelines around when an Executive Statement is being made and in this instance the Minister is responding to something that has been recorded in Hansard and that according to his departmental record, as I understand it, has been misstated. So, the purpose of his Executive Statement is to set the record straight, so in terms of the Executive Statement it is perfectly okay for him to say that hon member Mr Uys indeed misled the House. That is the purpose of the Executive Statement. [Interjections.].

Ms M N GILLION: No, go back into your record.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I just want to know, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Go back into your records.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Are we creating now a precedent ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Mr S G TYAYATM: ... around the issue of the Executive Statements, that Executive Statements or Executive - they can use whatever words or accuse people or use unparliamentary words? Are you saying that?

The SPEAKER: No, hon member Mr Tyatyam ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: This is what I want to ask.

The SPEAKER: I think what possibly you are not hearing, is that what Minister Plato is doing, he is rebutting the statements that the hon member Mr Uys made in the House two weeks ago, which was recorded in Hansard and his Executive Statement to clear his department, he is now using an Executive Statement to set the record straight.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, we agree on that one, but in the same vein we are asking whether we can use words that are not parliamentary to refute ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: You must [Inaudible.].

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because there are many other words that can be used. This is what we are raising.

Mr M G E WILEY: Which words?

Mr S G TYATYAM: "Misled" in particular, if you do not know. If you do not know, read. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr P UYS: An Executive Statement is nothing different than a normal debate or discussion as in the House. [Interjections.] The same rules apply ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please sit down, Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr P UYS: The same Standing Rules apply. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P UYS: It is the perception of that hon member that there is a misleading. [Interjections.] It is wrong to say that, because it is not to say an hon member is misleading the House.

The SPEAKER: I would like to have the final word on this; if Minister Plato had said you deliberately misled the House it would be deemed unparliamentary but because he said you have misled the House, I am going to allow him to proceed and that is my final word on that. Hon Minister you may proceed.

Mr P UYS: Just one other issue, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.] There was a comment made by the hon Chief Whip ... [Interjections.] There was a comment made by the hon Chief Whip that you are in the minority, meaning you do what we tell you to do.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes exactly!

Mr P UYS: And that is the wrong point here. Here we must be treated all equally.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely, you are right. Chief Whip Wiley I am not going to entertain any more discussion. I have made a ruling and I am going to ask the hon Minister to proceed, because if it is anything to do with the previous comment, I think we need to move on.

Mr M G E WILEY: No, I am not going to refer to the previous comment. What I would like to refer to is the right of any party to correct a misstatement. It is their right to do so, and it is the right of the ANC at the next sitting to make statements to correct whatever is stated that they do not feel comfortable from this side here. But what really worries me is that the hon member Mr Uys, the Chief Whip of the Official Opposition ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Is that a point of order?

Ms M N GILLION: What is a point of order? What are you ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: He is the subject of the statement and yet he is constantly up. Is that not a conflict of interest?

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley, could take your seat please.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Maxaga we are now going to proceed. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The hon member Mr Uys stated as fact in a follow up question, and I quote: “Why in the total expenditure on training for Black employees was no money spent in the Department of Community Safety, although there was a budget of R1.3 million”.

The matter of expenditure on the training of black employees is raised in the Department of Labour Review Assessment Form. My department’s response is recorded as “to be sourced” as the information is not readily available in

race categorisation format. In fact, it is not a prescribed metric in any reporting on training or on EE.

Looking at the reported table on training accessed during 2013/14 by the employees of the Department, it is noted that 91.5% of staff trained are in fact black employees. It can be deduced that the same percentage of the expenditure was taken up by the training of black employees. Please note that the term “black” does not equate to “African” in terms of the EE Act.

It should be noted that my Department is responsible for the identification of training needs and the nomination of employees to attend training and not the relevant unit in the CSC. Therefore, the insinuation that the Premier should have that knowledge at her fingertips is mistaken.

As is confirmed by the final financial figures for 2014/15, the Department of Community Safety did not underspend on our training budgets as was stated by hon member Mr Uys. In fact the Department exceeded the statutory required spending of 1% of total Cost of Employment.

Again, Madam Speaker, in that respect the hon member Mr Uys has misled this House.

Honourable Speaker, the half-truths, assumptions and aspersions cast by hon member Mr Uys regarding the Department of Community Safety’s compliance to employment equity legislation requires me to provide clarity on this

allegation. I need to educate the honourable member on this entire process and also enlighten the rest of this House as well as the public who might have been misled by the hon member Mr Uys' misinformation.

It should be noted that, prior to the review being instituted, my Department and the Corporate Services Centre in DotP embarked on a process to draft a new EE Plan because of the shift of Traffic Services staff from the Department of Community Safety to the Department of Transport and Public Works. Thus, the issue under review was already being done and it is not clear why the Department of Labour did not ask that simple question before expending unnecessary resources.

The main issue raised by the Department of Labour relates to the required workforce analysis which must be based on employee information gathered by completing Form EEA1. The practice in the Western Cape Government has been to extract the relevant information from the PERSAL System as captured from the Z83 Application Forms completed by all employees.

The relevant unit in the CSC executed all the steps in the compilation of a new EE Plan for the Department per the recommendations of the Department of Labour. The new plan was consulted with the Department of Labour and, upon conclusion, was submitted as part of the final conclusion of the Department's response to the review.

Finally, the Department of Labour reviewed the new EE Plan and concluded that the Department complied with the recommendations. From the review process it is concluded that no gross non-compliance matters were found. The hon member Mr Uys was trying to create a controversy out of a routine administrative task. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Plato. Parties now have the opportunity to respond and you have up to three minutes for your response.

Mr P UYS: There is a speakers list, Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: There is a speakers list.

The SPEAKER: I recognise the honourable, the ANC.

Mr P UYS (ANC): Thank you, Madam Speaker. MEC Plato requested this opportunity but he failed to really utilise this and set the record straight as he was claiming to do. At least I must acknowledge that his department - and that is coming from himself - Community Safety was put under review in terms of the Employment Equity Act by the Department of Labour, and at least he accepted that.

But he and the people who drafted the statement prefer not to inform this House that on 3 March 2015 the Department of Labour wrote to Adv Brent Gerber, Director General and Head of the Department of the Premier – and that was not the 27th of October that he quoted; he failed to quote any letter

after 27 October last year. This happened on the 3 March 2015 [Interjections.] and in that letter directed to Adv Brent Gerber by the Department of Labour – and of course he is the DG and the Head of the Office of the Premier – it says, and I quote: “This office deems it expedient to inform you of the steps that were followed by the Department of Labour after placing the Department of Community Safety under review in terms of the Employment Equity Act.”

And then, on 21 May, more than two months after 3 March, I asked that question to the Premier in the House and she failed to answer that question. [Interjections.] But further to that ... [Interjections.] ...on 28 May the Speaker said it was misrepresentation and that there was no letter received. No letter, but the letter was received on the 3 March.

The question we must ask here is who is misleading this House? And it is very clearly both hon Minister Plato and the Premier. ... [Interjections.] and now MEC you continue with this misrepresentation.

Further, MEC you said in your statement the Corporate Service Centre – and he said that – in the Premier’s department, not his department – did not find it necessary [Interjections.] to even inform the Premier. [Interjections.] That is where the problem is. [Interjections.] But MEC how far will you go to try and defend the undefendable? A failed attempt to rescue the Premier. How can you MEC ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: There is a speaker on the floor.

Mr P UYS: I want to ask the question; how can the MEC be that insensitive and non-caring to say – and he said it twice in his statement – that this matter is entirely administrative in nature. They are under review by the Department of Labour and they can be taken to the Labour Court. [Interjections.] But we understand why he said this. This is the clear position of the Democratic Alliance.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Hon member Mr Uys your time has expired.

Mr P UYS: Can I conclude? You do not want me to conclude, Madam Speaker? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: If it is a short sentence you may finish. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: This is the crux of the matter. That is why the Speaker had to intervene in the caucus at National Assembly. [Interjections.] That is why member Mazibuko had to leave.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: They cannot be trusted with employment equity. [Applause.] You cannot be trusted. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: I now see the DA.

Ms M M WENGER (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I am so pleased that Minister Plato has clarified this matter. [Interjections.] It has now become clear as crystal ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order please.

Ms M M WENGER: ... that during the sitting on 21 May this House was indeed misled.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members! Hon member Ms Wenger take your seat please. Order, please hon members. Can we allow the member to... Thank you. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The hon member for the ANC was being rather economical with the truth when he claimed during Questions to the Premier that the Department of Labour had placed the Community Safety Department under review. [Interjections.] We know that this is misleading because the Department was not placed under review, its

employment equity figures were reviewed because of an organisational change. There is a big difference.

A letter from the Department of Labour was sent to the Head of the Community Safety Department and this letter was so administrative in nature that it was not necessary to inform the Premier. [Interjections.] To have then attacked the Premier on this issue was disingenuous and duplicitous. [Interjections.]

The hon member Mr Uys made it sound as though the Department of Community Safety was in such dire breach of employment equity standards that it had been placed under review by the Department of Labour. [Interjections.] This was misleading in the extreme. [Interjections.]. We now know that the reason why this review came about ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms M M WENGER: ... was because the Department lost a significant number of its staff – in fact more than half – to the Department of Transport when Traffic moved over. [Interjections.]. This required a review of the Employment Equity Plan. [Interjections.] The Department of Labour jumped on the issue without checking that the Department was already in the process of doing exactly this. [Interjections.] Be that as it may, the recommendations from the Department of Labour were included and in fact the new

Employment Equity Plan is, according to the Department of Labour, fully compliant [Interjections.] and no gross non-compliance issues were found.

The facts are a far cry from the misleading statements presented to this House by the ANC. But there is more. The ANC using its usual tactic and which can only see things through race coloured lenses ... [Interjections\.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Wenger...

Ms M M WENGER: ... tried to make the Department ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please. Is it a point of order hon member Mr Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I ask the hon member a question? [Interjections.] Is it about 2029 that she is reading now ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: She is not willing to take a question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Employment equity, is that 2029? [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi she is not willing to take a question. Thank you. You may proceed.

Ms M M WENGER: The ANC, using its usual tactic, and which can only see things through race coloured lenses, tried to make the Department of

Community Safety out to be prejudicing certain race groups. [Interjections.] He said, and I quote: [Interjections.] “The total expenditure on training for black employees was no money spent, although there was a budget of R1,3 million.”

We now know that this is utter nonsense, incorrect and misleading. The Minister has just told us that 91% of staff that receive training are in fact black employees. And furthermore the Department trained and spent more than the statutory required 1% of total cost of employment. A far cry from what the ANC wanted this House to believe.

Madam Speaker, it is my sincere concern that sweeping, factually incorrect and misleading statements can be made over and over and over in this House. Surely as honourable members there must be some form of accountability and integrity to what comes off our lips. [Applause.] [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] I see the EFF.

Mr B D JOSEPH (EFF): Madam Speaker, this has got to be the most disappointing and most humiliating statement, especially from someone who I expect to be held in high regard like the Western Cape MEC, Dan Plato. Instead of responding to the crucial issues raised by most members in this House during the Provincial Parliamentary sitting of Thursday 28 May 2015, the MEC decided to relegate to the levels of the likes of Kenny Kunene and Gayton Mackenzie by writing an open letter (Executive Statement) without

much substance to hon member Pierre Uys. How the Programming Committee could be wasting our valuable time as members of this House to debate such mediocrity is beyond comprehension.

Maybe the hon MEC can assist in explaining what portion of his statement is executive and how a statement based on one member's pronouncement can be considered an MEC's Executive Statement?

Hon MEC, what was discussed here on 28 May, amongst other things, was your Department's capacity to bring about the integrated approach to crime in the Western Cape, your department's willingness to put aside politics and collaborate with SAPS in preventing, combating and investigating crime in our province and the absence of relationship between the Department of Community Safety and other provincial departments such as the Department of Education, the Department of Health, the Department of Human Settlements and the Department of Labour.

It is very important for us to know that merely arresting people without addressing the underlying socio-economic issues such as landlessness, poverty, unemployment, substandard education, inability to access social services and pushing people into overcrowded, under-serviced settlements will never affect crime in our communities. The number of arrests in the past years have increased significantly; however since 2011 the rate of annual crime reduction has slowed down and there has been an increase in the most significant categories of crime ever since.

Looking at the bigger picture, the police may be reaching a point where they are doing considerable harm to community relations. More than one-third of the South African population trust the police and in 2013 stats revealed only one in ten young people trust the police in South Africa.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Joseph your time has expired.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Can I conclude, Chairperson? Madam Speaker, if the MEC has personal issues with hon member Mr Uys ... [Interjections.] Parliament, which is an institution where executive decisions are taken that will significantly change our peoples' lives ... All members of this House, including the Cabinet, should respect why they are not having this conversation on another platform. [Interjections.] [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is the place!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the ACDP. Hon members can I call for order please? There is another speaker.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Madam Speaker, the ANC is taking this House into gutter politics. [Interjections.]. It seems to me the EFF is on it and it is going to sink. [Interjections.]. Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: As SCOPA Chair and as a member of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, people ... [Interjections.] These members can read the annual report; the annual report says the following: [Interjections.].

An HON MEMBER: SCOPA?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Page 10 of the annual report says the following, in the first paragraph: “The Department has managed to achieve the fifth clean audit consecutively.” That is what it says. [Interjections.] Secondly it says [Interjections.] since the Presidency ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... since the Presidency introduced the Management Performance Assessment Tool, the Department of Community Safety has been one of the top performers in the country. [Interjections.] Now if the matters that hon member Mr Uys is raising ... [Interjections.] If these matters are substantial, they would never get accolades for being one of the top performers in the country.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Now let me say the following, because it is clear to me that this side of the House do not read the annual report.

An HON MEMBER: Oh-oh-oh!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: They do not read the annual report [Interjections.] because if you go to “Training”, page 100 – and let me tell you, go to point 3.1.1. [Interjections.] R1.3 was spent on training.....

An HON MEMBER: Why are you shouting? Don't shout!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...and when I engaged the Department, the Department told me that they spent more than 90% on black formerly disadvantaged communities. [Interjections.] So surely... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Sorry, hon member Mr Christians, if you can just tone it down a little please. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: They can turn the mic down. I speak like that, Madam Speaker. I speak like that.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Especially when I am excited because of untruths. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon members. [Interjections.] Order! There is too much noise in the House. [Interjections.].

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: We are really hitting a low point in this House because the ANC does not contribute to any debate in this House. Everything they do is negative, everything they say are half truths and everything they do is misleading. [Interjections.] So I am asking Eerwaarde Gopie, lead the people out of the dark. You know Eerwaarde, lead them out of the dark [Interjections.] because they are busy sinking. [Interjections.] They are busy sinking. [Interjections.] God het mos die waarheid lief. Ons is pastore. Lei hulle uit die donkerte. [Interjections.]

So this is what I want to say in conclusion; it is true what hon member Ms Wenger said. It was an administrative concern. It was not even necessary to tell the Premier about it. [Interjections.] When I also investigated I found out it is because Traffic is no longer there. [Interjections.]. But instead of addressing the matter, hon member Mr Uys comes with untruths, unfounded, and I want to encourage you, being the Chief Whip, to contribute positively to this House and not negatively.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I thank you. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That, members, concludes the Executive Statement. We now move to Notices of Motion. Are there any motions where notices are given? I see the hon member Ms Schäfer.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Winelands Toll Roads.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That this House debates the school infrastructure backlogs in the Western Cape as stipulated in the WCED Plan released on 12 June 2015 and the mitigation plans by the Department.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That this House debates the importance to reduce road traffic and to increase the use of public transport and rail freight services.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the effectiveness of this DA Government's recently launched Preparedness Programme and the plight of ordinary people affected by the winter season.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That this House discusses the successes and challenges of the Western Cape Municipalities at the hand of the audits as discussed in the Auditor General's report of 2013/14 and propose solutions to streamline the problem.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That in June, which is Youth Month, the House debates youth unemployment and ways to provide our young people with work opportunities.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the national allocation of funding to Local Government in relation to the NDP.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr P UYS: Province.

An HON MEMBER : IDP. It is already there.

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any more notices of motion? Okay. We now move to Motions Without Notice. Are there any motions? I see the hon Mr Mnqasela and then the hon member Mr Olivier.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Enkosi Somolo, *Thank you Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House extends its condolences to the family, friends and fellow sportsmen of the former Springbok rugby captain †uBawo *Father Thompson Magxala of Nyanga East who died in Cape Town on 14 June at the age of 73 after a long illness. †UBawo *Father Magxala was the Captain of the Leopards, also known as the African XV, of the South African Rugby Board, against the British Lions touring team in 1974. He was honoured for his contribution during apartheid, which was rare. He was one of the more than 40 previous and current rugby captains who were honoured in 2013 by casting their hands and signatures in clay. I thank you very much.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the latest killing of yet another Bredasdorp teenager, Ms Japhta, 14, and commends the good work by the SAPS for arresting the accused.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House wishes the Muslim community Ramadaan Kareem. May this holy time be a blessed and spiritually fulfilled month. [Inaudible.].

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon member Mr Mnqasela, then hon member Ms Botha and then hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House takes note of the swift and transparent steps by the

Democratic Alliance taken to bring two of its public representatives to account on conduct related matters.

No political party can be seen to pay lip service to the conduct of its representatives and these steps should be a warning to any person wanting to represent the Democratic Alliance which insists on the highest standards, both on performance and on their conduct. The tax paying public expect and deserve nothing but the best of our public representatives.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? Yes. The objections will be recorded on the Order Paper.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Sorry, just on a point of order. If one reads the framing of what was supposed to be a motion without notice but was actually a statement, I think we should really – and I want to appeal to you, Madam Speaker – possibly organise a workshop so that some of these members can understand the difference between a motion and ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Noted.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, the hon member does not even know the difference between purple and burgundy.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr M MNQASELA: You must start in kindergarten and get your facts right.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela, please take your seat. I see the hon member Ms Botha and then the hon Member Mr Olivier. Order members. Hon member Ms Botha.

Ms L H BOTHER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House send its condolences to the family of Mr Melvyn Fourie, the principal of Edendale Primary School in Manenberg who passed away on Monday 15 June.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members. Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon member Mr Olivier and then hon member Mr Joseph and hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the poor condition of a bus that was recently hired to transport members of this Legislature to George in pouring rain and

cold weather and that the policy should be reviewed on the procurement of such vehicles for official use by relevant Oversight Committees.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objection? Objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I then see the hon member Mr Joseph. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House wishes to commend DA Leader Mmusi Maimane for calling for an urgent debate of President Omar Al Bashir's unconstitutional departure from the Republic of South Africa.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? Yes, there is an objection. It will be recorded on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie and after honourable Mackenzie it will be hon member Mr Tyatyam, then hon member Mr Christians and hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the Cape Traditional Singers, which is a Cape Malay choir, who are currently performing in Amsterdam as part of

the Netherlands' biggest annual festival, the Holland Festival, which is underway until 23 June. I move so.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Hon member Mr Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Department of Trade and Industry that took a group of 28 South African leather and footwear manufacturers to China on a three month shoe design and manufacturing techniques capacity building programme, which included Western Cape entrepreneurs.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates a teenager from Mitchells Plain, Khalid Bosch, 18, who abandoned a life of drugs and gangsterism and went back to school. Bosch will complete his matric this year and he will fulfil his dream of becoming a chef. Joining a gang at the age of 9 and

having tattoos at the age of 10, he took a hard decision to turn against gangs. That is so difficult in the townships. Bosch is a reminder to young people caught up in gangsterism and drugs that it is never too late to change. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Mr Hinana and then the burgundy suit. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the chaotic and violent culture when losers of elections in the ANC and ANC Youth League and EFF conferences become the trademark where pangas, guns and metal are brought into the conferences. [Interjections.]

That this House further notes that the new factions are forever exposing themselves on how intolerant they become when confronted by defeat in fair elections.

That this House notes the re-run of the ANC Youth League Conference in eThekweni and the consequent assistance through court interventions. [Interjections.] These are the alarming indications that South Africans can expect when the ANC loses power in fair elections. [Interjections.]
Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

[Interjections.] Hon member Ms Botha, do I see you?

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House acknowledges and commends the passion and drive of Dr Du Toit and Sister Whittles in their management of Swellendam Hospital which has become an excellent example of health care. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie and then the hon member Ms Gopie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Department of Cultural

Affairs and Sport for supporting safer initiations by providing advanced first aid training to traditional surgeons and initiation carers. The first 43 surgeons and carers received training in Cape Town from the 10th until the 12th and a similar event is being held in Oudtshoorn from the 17th until the 19th. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon member Ms Gopie. [Interjections.]. Hon member Tyatyam we have a member on the floor. Hon member Ms Gopie you may proceed.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the deteriorating state of public health in the province, especially the Wesfleur Hospital in Atlantis, where at least three dubious deaths were reported in the past month alone.

The SPEAKER: Any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the patently untruthful statement by the DA National Leader, Mmusi Maimane, that claimed the DA has created millions of jobs in Khayelitsha, an area that according to Census 2011 has less than 400 000 residents.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.
[Interjections.] I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie and then the hon member Ms Botha.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges that the Blombos Cave in the Blombosfontein Nature Reserve in the Southern Cape and the Elandsfontein Fossil Dune Site on the West Coast have been declared Provincial Heritage Sites.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela and then the hon member Ms Botha.

Ms M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges Paul Mashatile, the ANC Leader in Gauteng, for his courageous stand against the ANC led Government's finding on the Nkandla Report.

That the House welcomes his acknowledgment of the gross transgressions against the people of South Africa and supports his notion that the government can no longer afford to spend more money on Nkandla whilst millions of South Africans are complaining about the state of this particular programme. [Interjections.] I so move. [Interjections.].

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! There is an objection. [Interjections.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Any further? Hon member Ms Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the commendable passion and drive with which Ms Kleinhans, the principal of Kleinfontein Primary School in Swellendam manages the farm school that has achieved many accolades. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. I see the hon member Ms Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the recent manhandling and lockup of *Cape Argus* health reporter, Siphokazi Fokazi at the Chestnut Clinic in Belhar where she exposed the fact that patients were consulted in open spaces and offer apologies to Fokazi.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Mackenzie and then the hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Jemima Kleinbooi and Sheline Bothma from Bonnievale who participated in the Eden/Cape Winelands Drama Festival. Their hard work has afforded them the opportunity to attend a

ten day programme at Stellenbosch University where they will receive further in-depth training on different aspects of theatre. I move so.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Dugmore, then hon member Ms Schäfer.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House noting the need for mobility, especially in rural areas and between rural areas and urban centres, further noting economic benefits that flow, including agriculture, tourism and affordable public transport, noting further the current state of the rail line and the infrequent trips along the Overberg and Southern Cape line, and that this House believing firstly, that mobility is critical to the success of the National Development Plan, that with improvement in the quality of the line an increased number and types of trips will boost economic transformation in these two regions, and believing finally that a co-operative approach is required between all spheres of government and Transnet. [Interjections.] Therefore this House resolves to request the National Ministers of Transport and Public Enterprises to urgently convene a discussion with all role players in the Overberg and Southern Cape to consider the possible alternatives to improve the quality,

diversity and the regularity of this critical railway link. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? [Interjections.]

Agreed to. Hon member Ms Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House extends its condolences to the family and friends of Jenna Louw, the young girl who fought so bravely with a degenerative disease called Pulmonary Arterial Hypertension. Jenna was unable to make it to her 21st birthday in October this year. However we must continue to honour her memory by supporting her campaign “Get me to 21” raising awareness for organ donors. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to.

Hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I move without notice:

That this House welcomes the Constitutional Court ruling against the

repayment of an amount of R250 million to Shuttleworth.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker can the member read his motion? We did not hear the motion. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I asked for objections. [Interjections.] Nobody objected, so I presumed it was okay. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Okay. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House commends Minister Marais and the Department for officially launching the partnership between the Western Cape Government and the Dreamfields on Youth Day, 16th June 2015. This partnership offers youth across the Western Cape the opportunity to take part in sporting activities and also talk about issues affecting them and their communities.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being

moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to move without notice that the House... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, have you got a signed written notice?

Mr C M DUGMORE: I beg your pardon?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Have you got a signed written notice in front of you?

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Rules are very clear; you have to hand in a signed written notice when you ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: No sorry, I am moving without notice, sorry. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That does not change the Rules. I will give you a chance to write something quickly. [Laughter.] Somebody else will then move. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Okay, please proceed.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Sorry. I have found it. [Laughter.] Mr Deputy Speaker I move without notice:

That this House welcomes the event which will take place on Saturday, involving the Deputy Minister of Public Service Administration, Comrade Ayanda Dlodlo, who will be convening a career summit for over 400 youth from the Hessequa area and sees this initiative as a worthy intervention in regard to Youth Month and may it continue. Amandla! Thank you. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is there any objection to the motion... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We object. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to the motion being moved without notice. [Interjections.] Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like that hon member Mr Dugmore immediately table that document because I suspect it is going to be used as evidence against him. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Yes, I will give the hon member Mr Dugmore the benefit of the doubt in this case. I see the hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thanks Chair. I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Rustenberg Wines as the recipient of the Old Mutual Trophy for the Most Successful Producer Overall at the prestigious Wine Show at the Cape Town Convention Centre last Friday.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon Member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Bafana Bafana for their 2-1 win over Angola in the international friendly held at the Cape Town Stadium on Tuesday, on Youth Day and thanks the spectators of Cape Town who came out in their droves to support our boys.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House recognises the writer and motivational speaker Anthea van der Pluym of Hermanus, a victim of violence, abuse and a burn survivor for turning tragedy into feat and turning these challenges into opportunities. That the House thanks Anthea for her contribution to the construction of alternative, burn-safe and green economic homes in Zwelihle, constructed with 3 500, 2 litre recycled bottles and providing work for at least 40 people, thereby making a positive contribution to address the chronic housing challenge in our country. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates A B de Villiers for receiving five awards at the 2015 Cricket South Africa Awards. These include the South

African Cricketer of the Year for the second successive year, ODI Cricketer of the Year, South Africa's Player of the Year, South Africa's Fans' Player of the Year and his record breaking fastest ODI century won him the 'So Good' Award. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? agreed to. Hon member Ms Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Victoria and Alfred Hotel on earning the Hall of Fame Award from *Trip Adviser* in recognition of consistently stellar service. Excellent service is key to creating more jobs in the Western Cape's tourism industry. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House celebrates the excellent work done by the Western Cape municipalities and congratulates them on their performance in the Auditor General's Report 2013/14 and that the Western Cape Government in providing support to this is commendable. 18 clean audits and 14 unqualified is commendable. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion? Is there objection to the notice being moved without notice? The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further notices? For the last time. Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes the recent charges of two officials who allegedly engaged in corrupt activities in the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. It is also noted that these activities took place during the period of March 2008 to March 2009. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? [Interjections.]. Is there an

objection? You are just waving to me. Okay, the motion is agreed to. Any further notices? That then disposes of notices of motion. We then proceed with the Order Paper. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

ORDER OF THE DAY

1. Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Finance on the *Financial and Fiscal Commission Amendment Bill* [B 1B – 2015] (NCOP), Ratification of final mandate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The House received the report of the Standing Committee on Finance on the *Financial and Fiscal Amendment Bill* (B 1B – 2015) conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill. The mandate has been sent to the NCOP. There is a Speakers' list on the topic. I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, the importance of having strong institutions requires that the Constitution and the Rule of Law and accountability are observed at all times. One of the challenges that we have in terms of this Bill is that we have made some proposals, and of course the other members of the Standing Committee have the right to their own views, and opinions, but we do feel quite strongly, but this particular institution is one of the few that has been able to remain focused and very much robust in raising issues of financial accountability and financial management systems, one of which, when the case of the equitable share came about and Section

216 of the Constitution was in fact invoked without the Executive authority of the National Executive, which is the Cabinet, and that was done deliberately by National Treasury. The Financial and Fiscal Commission came out very clearly and said you cannot have a situation where you ignore the support that you need to provide to municipalities and simply withdraw.

And there were more than 16 municipalities that were affected as a result of that. That shows the kind of institutional capacity that this organisation has and the fact that it needs more support on the part of Government. So we do feel quite strongly that it is an important institution but the kind of proposals that come to us make it difficult for us to support this particular amendment to the Bill.

The principle of the institution remains and we support the institution, but this particular Bill in its current form cannot be supported. One of the challenges is that the Chairperson is the only permanent person on the Board. Now what happens if the Chairperson is not there? Other members, at least one or two more members, were of the view that you should ensure that at least one or two are also permanent so that in the event that the Chairperson is not there, we can ensure that the Board is not left in limbo. But the ANC would not accept that, which is quite strange.

So one of the other areas was the very nuanced approach that the ANC is taking here, where they want to pay members of the Board from the Department instead of the Board being responsible for its own financial

affairs. Like the IEC and other institutions. We are saying there is a problem here. Of course my colleague is going to raise other issues relating to accountability and of course Section 10 (2) (a), (b) and (c), where we felt that there were other issues that he is going to talk about.

But let me just say, without wasting time, the ANC is messing up with the FFC and we will not be party to that jamboree. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member, your time is expired. The hon member Ms Beerwinkel. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen to us now.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me say upfront that the ANC opposes the proposal as put by the DA today. Those amendments are absolutely frivolous and without real substance. [Interjections.] Because the remuneration for one of the posts that they are specifically referring to, does not even exist in the ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible] caucus [inaudible].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... in the Amendment Bill. And I also know that one of the other amendments that they are against is the fact that the Commission needs to consult. After consulting with the Minister they can do certain things. Now, it smacks of double standards when even just earlier in the

House today we heard how entities consult with the Minister before they do things. That is exactly what this Fiscal Commission also wants to do. [Interjection.] But the main purpose of any amendment of any progressive organisation or institution or department is when they want to remain current, because legislation changes and of dynamics of time and conditional changes also happen. Amendments have to be done. And this Bill is no different.

For the sake of those who did not sit in this presentation by the Fiscal and Finance Commission, let me just remind you of some of the changes that they want to effect. The main objective of these amendments is to strengthen the institutional and governance function but also to bring terminology up to date; to remove outdated transitional arrangements and to delete repetitive provisions, so that the Act is in full alignment with the Constitution and the Public Finance Management Act 1 of 1999.

So how are they going to do that? They will achieve that by doing the following: they want to shift a problem that currently exists there; that the Chairperson is also the CEO and is also the Accounting Officer. So that will change. So to shift the Chief Executive and Accounting Officer responsibilities from the Chairperson to a newly elective administrative post for a suitably qualified Chief Executive Officer who will then also be the Accounting Officer as well as the Secretary of the Commission.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a little workshop. Just a little one.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This person will be appointed for a renewable

period not exceeding five years. And this Mr Deputy Speaker ...
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] help your office.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... is to avoid a situation where the Chairperson of the Commission has oversight over himself and the Commission.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hoor nou daar.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The newly appointed CEO will be afforded the right to delegate some of his or her duties to other members of the Commission should he or she feel so. Also that the Commission has the right to determine its own strategic management and direction, that vacancies should be filled within a period of six months of the post becoming vacant... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Isn't that logical?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... to determine the length of office of the Commissioner, to regulate control of conduct of members of the Commission and to implement Section 219(5) of the Constitution, which specifically says national legislation must establish frameworks for determining the salaries, allowances and benefits of Judges, the Public Protector, Auditor General and members of any Commission provided for in the Constitution, which is what they are doing. It was not in the Act before.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So you are not happy with that?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They also want to determine that the terminology used in the Act complies with the Constitution and other financial legislation. Also to determine ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Maimane's DA.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... how different spheres of Government or organs of state, when assigning powers to each other, should take recommendations from this Commission into account.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The new Democratic Alliance [Inaudible.] DA.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And then ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order hon member Mr Dyantyi. Just remember you are sitting next to a live microphone. You are interfering with the recording of the member's speech.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And then, Section 16 of the current Act was very vague in terms of what the rules of procedure of the Commission should be. In fact it was just two lines. It now includes the right of the Commission to make its own rules regarding effective corporate governance, the clear

distinction between roles of the Chairperson and the CEO, also the conduct of employees, but more importantly, it now includes a clause that allows the Commission to make certain rules regarding the acquisition of information, the requests from other organs of state, but to do this after consultation with the Minister. And that is basically the issue that the DA is against, that after consultation with the Minister, decisions should be made.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that what you want?

Mr C F BEERWINKEL: So therefore, we as the ANC, say we support the Bill as it is presented to the NCOP by the ANC and we do not agree with the DA's proposal with those amendments. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, we have seen in the past how public institutions, government departments and entities mandates have been chopped and changed in the name of strengthening organisation capacity, improving service delivery and ensuring that they deliver on the mandate. So even when Bills that appear to be necessary are presented in the Legislature one cannot help but wonder what the ANC have done with the bloated Cabinet in the National Parliament, one of the most expensive in the world, to reward President Zuma's loyalists.

Similarly, we have seen [Inaudible.] the payment of President Zuma's

loyalists; Ben Ngubane at Eskom, [Inaudible.] the IEC's Ellen Tshabalala and Transnet, even when they know that comrades carry fake qualifications. Public servants are told today that our fiscus cannot afford anything more than 4.8% yet we sit here today to consider the recommendations of a Bill which does nothing but increase an already ballooned public service wage bill.

To many it may appear that a R1.5 million financial implication will not make a dent on the overall fiscus. It is the principle. As the EFF, we warn government not to engage in legislation amendments, [Inaudible.] that will do nothing but provide an opportunity for more of President Zuma's loyalists to be appointed CEO's. The EFF does not support the Financial and Fiscal Commission Amendment Bill. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Christians first.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP cannot support the amendment of this Bill. One important factor I want to talk about is the independence of this Commission with the Minister having that power to consult. He will not consult, he will instruct. And after those instructions every other thing that will happen will be because of the directive of the Minister. So we cannot support this. The ACDP supports [Inaudible.] in institutions. We support accountability and all of those things and all the terminologies that must be in line with the Constitution. We support that but we cannot have a Minister's finger being the puppet master and control the

Commission as he sees fit. So we cannot support this Bill and I am surprised that the ANC cannot see this. They cannot see that the Minister will control this Commission and they will not be autonomous. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Agb lid mnr Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think it is important to start by acknowledging that we do have a Constitution and that the Constitution is requesting the independence of the FFC and that the Financial Fiscal Commission must be subject to only the Constitution and the law. It must be impartial on the one hand and on the other hand it must be allowed to perform its functions in terms of the Acts and the Acts prescribed by Parliament.

So, the focus point is independence and impartiality. Further, it is important to note that this Commission has to make rules regarding its own functioning and distinct roles and there is this relationship between the Chairperson of the Commission and the CEO. What is important about this process is that all provinces had to give in negotiating mandates and then it is followed by final mandates and this province have followed that to the letter by even having a special meeting as part of our oversight visits last week. I want to acknowledge and thank the members for their role and commitment here, serving the Western Cape and proving good governance.

What is interesting is that some of the other provinces have failed to have

public hearings, they have failed to submit their mandates on time and they have not followed due procedures like we have to follow in this province and that is not a sign of good governance.

Mr P UYS: Which one?

Mr D JOSEPH: So, it is very important that the House notes this. What happens where the ANC governs in the National Assembly? We are part of that but it is important. It must be a lesson. That is why the DA in the National Government warns every year, when they vote and they vote against the ANC's budget. It is because of bad governance. You cannot have a Constitution and regulations and go against them when it suits you and that has become a trend of the ANC. As the member of the EFF indicated, there are financial implications whether we like it or not. Once we continue by appointing people into institutions it does have financial implications because there is remuneration and conditions of service that we have to comply with and in this case it is approximately R1,5 million that is at stake here. Then the issue about the Minister. It is correct. Independence means independence. Independence does not mean that we have to ask the Minister permission and this Commission will be restricted in carrying out certain functions if it is up to the Minister, the way the ANC operates nowadays. We know. They need that approval. Initially we started off by saying we support the Bill subject to certain amendments which were turned down at the NCOP and therefore we do not have a choice actually. In the Committee and in this House we have taken the decision not to support because there is too much

interference by the ANC into parastatals and government institutions and that is becoming a grave concern in this country. I thank you.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER. Thank you. Order. That concludes the debate on this topic and I put the question; are there any objections to the ratification of the confirmative authority on the Western Cape's delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. The question is to not support the Bill. Those in favour will say aye.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against, no.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it. [Interjections.] and so they have. [Interjections.] Order. The objection ... Order, can I just get clarity. The objection of the ANC and of the EFF will be recorded.

[ANC and EFF dissenting.]

The question is therefore agreed to.

Before we adjourn, can I just remind members that the Budget Committee will commence after the adjournment of the sitting and that concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:31