

---

TUESDAY, 2 DECEMBER 2014

---

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We proceed to Interpellations on the Question Paper. The first interpellation is the hon member Ms Schäfer to Minister Winde. I see Minister Winde.

**INTERPELLATIONS:**

*Economic opportunities in the province's agricultural sector*

- 1. Ms B A Schäfer asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:**

What is his Department doing to expand and diversify economic

opportunities in the province's agricultural sector?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and to the hon member for the question.

First of all it is imperative that a conducive and enabling environment is created in order for the private sector to step in and grow the agri-sector, whilst at the same time driving our diversification goals.

In creating this enabling environment the Department offers the following support to the industry:

First of all, the Sustainable Resource Programme. This makes sure that we maximise our agricultural outputs with the smallest possible footprint, so perhaps in the example of the wheat industry where we look at practices as non- or no-tillage initiatives. We look at the FruitLook Projects where we actually look at water use within the agricultural sector so that we use satellite imagery and technology to inform us so we do not over-water, so we really make maximum use of our existing resources, but in the most sustainable way.

It is also recognised that we need to use proper research. Without proper research we cannot be competitive as a sector, so we spend quite a lot of time looking at research, for example how do we get our cows to produce the most

milk versus the kind of food consumption that they have. So it really is looking at efficiencies; looking at whether we are competitive within the international market or even locally and making sure that our research gets used in that process. We have at the moment about 90 research technology projects on the go.

We also look at the success and sustainability of the agricultural sector. So we look at farmer support. We look at land reform; at the moment there are 246 land reform projects that we have supported since 2009 because we have to make sure that we transform the sector itself.

We also have to look at markets and market access so we spend time in looking at the global environment; looking at where new markets are; how to open up new markets and get accessibility through the Department, also through linkages through Wesgro.

We also look at skills. We have to make sure that we train people involved in this sector. We have to make sure that we have sufficient Agri-professionals. We do this through our Agricultural College and Training Institute at Elsenburg but also linkages to our universities, Stellenbosch specifically, and other universities as well as other training colleges around the country and the sub-continent. And then of course we also have to look at the veterinary space specifically around management of animal diseases, and here perhaps highlighting avian influenza or African horse sickness. We have to make sure that we have the personnel and the know-how in how to deal with these so

that we can be sustainable that we can grow the sector. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think what is important is that agriculture is one of the primary pillars of the Western Cape economy and although the province contributes some 14% to the country's gross domestic product, it definitely generates almost 23% of the total value added by the agricultural sector in South Africa. So the Western Cape produces between 55% and 60% of South Africa's agricultural products which are valued at more than R7 billion per year. We know however that the numbers out there just do not paint a picture that one could really feel hopeful about. In fact unless a concerted effort is put into job creation in the agricultural sector I am afraid to say that South Africa will fail its people.

We know - and I have mentioned before - that 73 000 jobs have been lost in the agricultural sector since the second quarter of 2013 and yet the National Development Plan sets the goal of one million agricultural jobs by 2030.

Agriculture is to play a vital role in job creation and economic development for the whole of South Africa. We have heard from a number of reliable sources that this is possible to achieve, assuming there is enough political will and that the role players who need to execute a careful expansion of arable land, irrigation and correct crops, agriculture and agri-business have the capacity to provide that million additional jobs that we need in South

Africa by 2020. So the Western Cape remains the number one agricultural export province in South Africa. It follows that our producers are sensitive to international events which might affect our access to markets. It is also strategically important that we open new markets and gain better access to existing markets for our producers.

My question to the Minister is how do we go about doing that? How do we:

- (1) maintain existing markets;
- (2) explore and develop new markets especially in Asia and Africa;
- (3) grow and develop the domestic market?

We know that in 2009 the target was set to maintain the provincial export profile over a five year period. They can report that the exports grew from R13,9 billion in 2009 all the way to R16,16 billion in 2012, which represents a growth of more than 15% over and above the initial target. We have experienced great success with wine exports to China, where the Western Cape Government has supported exporters in building relationships with buyers in China and once again I would like to find out from the Minister, how do we continue our support to ethical initiatives of the fruit and wine industries and how does SIZA help us to achieve this goal? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. There are various

initiatives and correctly so. Regarding the one million jobs that we have all said we will play our part in within South Africa to create in the agricultural sector, one also at the same time has a bit of an issue because there are lots of contributing factors to job losses in agriculture, so we are doing quite a lot of work in the province.

I think first of all we should ask how do we grow specifically irrigated land, and I think there is a joint project where we are looking at what is happening with the expansion or the expansion of the dam wall at Clanwilliam. We still have some issues to sort out. We have got an extra 7 500 hectares of irrigated land coming on board. This really does help us with land reform, but there are some issues specifically around water use and the cost of water, so we have a big problem at the moment on what to charge for the water and I think the initial pricing is way in excess of where it should be. We need to look at payback of that expansion of the dam over a much longer period, because it is not going to be fair; we actually set new farmers, specifically, up to fail if we put them into a system where we are going to be charging them far too high prices for the water. It is not going to be competitive. So if we are to play our part in those one million jobs that is one area where we really have to do, and will be doing, a lot of work.

I think it is also about looking at opportunities in other areas. You spoke about exports specifically into China and yes, we had lots of growth of exports into China, but interestingly with regard to exports into Africa I think there is even more opportunity. We were very excited two years ago

when we saw the wine increases in selling wine into China, but we now saw the uptake, specifically the fast growth in Africa, we are now pulling. We are not putting more wine into China than into Africa. So there are lots of opportunities. We have seen a 23% increase in exports in the last four years into Africa as a whole. I think a lot more opportunities are coming up specifically looking at the African market, but we will continue looking for new markets wherever possible. A partnership between the Department itself and Wesgro must make sure that we do expand, because without markets we cannot really make the real difference.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, your time has expired. The hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In 1913 South African legislation systematically stripped black South Africans of their rights to own, reside on and cultivate land. This situation has continued long after the dawn of the democratic processes and interventions at national level. Even today the economic opportunities remain in the hands of white commercial farmers in this province.

The expansion and diversification of economic opportunities in the agricultural sector can only be realised when the doors both in production and markets are open to emerging and historically disadvantaged farmers.

In the main the emerging farmers suffer from skills gap, a lack of resources,

especially financial backing and most of all the right to own land and access to farming land.

In this province the equity schemes are not working as they should. Farmworkers are often kept in the dark. They are not invited to board meetings. Their livelihood is still not improving.

Cooperatives in farming do not seem to take off the ground in a more significant way. In the Western Cape cooperatives complain about a lack of business support from financial institutions and their commercial counterparts. We call on the Provincial Government and the MEC to do more to assist both emerging farmers and cooperatives in farming and engage financial institutions and commercial farmers to unlock some of the blockages affecting them and also to introduce more incentives in the municipalities for emerging farmers and cooperatives.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi! Mooi-mooi! [Onhoorbaar.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Farming in the Western Cape is vast and diverse. Therefore it is important to uplift and assist our farm workers on all levels. Farm workers and their families are isolated from

mainstream social interaction and do not have regular access to life skills training.

For us to be on par with the economic growth in agriculture we have to have skilled farm workers. It is therefore essential to build pride among farm workers and their families as they make a crucial contribution towards the economic growth in agriculture.

In accordance with the National Comprehensive Rural Development Programme, the Western Cape strategic goal is to create vibrant sustainable communities. Amongst others, the programme aims to coordinate the involvement of different government departments in farm worker development. It also creates skills training opportunities for farm workers and communities; creates sustainable employment for people in rural areas; establishes economic and infrastructure projects to facilitate economic growth.

As public representatives we also have a responsible to go out and inform the farm workers of all the opportunities that the Western Cape Government has to offer them. We need to ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired hon member Ms Maseko, sorry. Just finish.

Ms L M MASEKO: We need to shift away from “just develop”, of just

helping them to complain, without giving them information. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think hon member Ms Davids states that equity schemes are failing, yet we know that more than 60% have a success rate here. Solms Delta is a case in point, her own Ministers have hailed the success of that share equity scheme so I think hon member Ms Davids needs to check her facts ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] It is 1%. [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...but I think what we also do need to look at is we are very specific in our ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Who is the [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue. I will protect you.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. To be very specific, in the way that we target

our strategic plan in terms of agriculture. I have a graph here which focuses on a high growth potential versus labour intensive, and products such as olives, citrus, table grapes, vegetables, apples and pears that particularly are able to be grown in the Western Cape, show high labour intensive high growth potential and I am hoping that the Minister can make sure that the Department is giving attention to those high labour intensive products in order to create more jobs. As far as I can see here, in terms of horticulture we are able to produce products such as citrus, apples, grapes and mangoes, we are able to produce about 47 000 new on-farm jobs and 30 000 additional jobs in the value chain.

Mr M N PAULSEN: We do not want jobs. We want our own [Inaudible.]  
[Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: I think what is also important ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...is to grow the economy through aquaculture and to look at agriculture and agri-processing, and I wonder if the Minister could talk more about agri-processing because we know that that is really where the money is going to come from and the opportunities for economic growth are going to be [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: We want our farms back. We do not want jobs.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have only a couple of minutes here, so I am going to try and deal with all of those questions.

I think the first thing - I could hear it was not specifically the question but it was a bit of a banter across the floor here – members were talking about the 40% and I actually would like the Committee to please engage in the report that was done on the 246 schemes in the province, and when we set a grade as to say 62% was successful, it was measured then ... [Interjection] ...

Mr M N PAULSEN: That is all it is. It is a scheme.

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is a scheme.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...in a whole range of aspects so it was whether they were tax compliant, whether they were gaining market share. It really is a comprehensive report and I ask the hon member Ms Davids to listen; she asked the question but then she does not listen to the answer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: No.

'n AGBARE LID: Ja, ja. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: She must actually interrogate the report and then come back, because if you want to look at success and failure, let us look at start-ups in the SMME sector, they have an 80% failure, so you know ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker, we are not speaking about compliance. Go to the schemes and you will see what they did. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is where you draw the line [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: We are not speaking about compliance.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Do you want to ask me a question? You must stand and ask me a question. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...but let us talk about land reform, because that is the real crux, the real issue... [Interjections.] ...and so I have said that it is one of the biggest risks. I have taken it on at a provincial level. We are busy

establishing for the new financial year a special or dedicated Land Reform Unit now within the Department. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: We do not want land reform [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We have only one in South Africa. It does not exist in any other province. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: We do not want the unit. We want action. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Davids, please allow the Minister to proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It does not exist in any other province. We are setting it up because we are taking responsibility and we have heard in this House that at a national level, when it comes to land reform, 49% projects of land reform in this province... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is 1% in the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes, exactly. That is why we are taking it on.

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is 1% because you do not want to [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is less than 1% in all the other provinces where the ANC governs... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You do not want to [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...and 49% in this province with 349 million; 16% in all the other provinces put together ... [Interjections]

Ms S W DAVIDS: What is your role [Inaudible.] ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... total failure on behalf on the part of the ANC... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...total failure. [Interjections.] But that is why I am taking it on as a direct responsibility within my Department.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] You should speak about what your responsibility is.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So that is where we are going to look for those opportunities because I agree, we have to make that change.

Ms S W DAVIDS: But the Western Cape [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...and I guarantee you... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...that we will continue [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] the Western Cape [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...to lead the change with regard to ownership ... [Interjection.] ...within the agricultural sector in this province as opposed to all the other provinces. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: They are coming to the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Winde, your time has expired.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... because of Jan Van Riebeeck ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, give the Chair a chance. [Interjections.] That disposes of the first interpellation. We move on to Interpellation 2. Minister Madikizela.

*Flooding and fire affected dwellings*

**2. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

How long does his Department take to return people who are affected by flooding or fire that had to vacate their dwellings to be accommodated in community halls or centres to their dwellings?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The duration of stay in a community hall or centre after a disaster or emergency situation depends on the magnitude of the disaster or emergency as was the case in an area like BM section for example. [Interjections.]

In some cases it is possible to immediately rehabilitate the area in order for people to move back to their respective dwellings either on the same day or a few days later.

Mr M N PAULSEN: It is a disgrace. You must build houses.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In other cases ...  
[Interjections.] ...this action may not be possible and people would have to remain... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! There is too much noise now and too many unnecessary interjections. Please allow the Minister the opportunity.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In other cases... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, I am speaking at the moment and I am looking at you particularly. Please turn down your voice level as well. Minister Madikizela. You may take your seat.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, you must speak to those guys over there. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, I will watch the House. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Paulsen! Minister Madikizela, please continue.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In other cases this action may not be possible and people would have to remain in a hall or centre for a longer period. The City of Cape Town and other municipalities endeavour to move the affected residents back to their dwellings as soon as it is practically

possible. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, acknowledging the efforts of government in accommodating victims affected by flooding and fires in community halls or centres around the province, we must however raise our concern with regard to the inhuman conditions these people are forced to live under at these temporary accommodation centres. The living conditions in centres expose these residents to all sorts of vulnerability. In the recent weeks we received reports of social disorder residents are forced to live under. Women and children become prone to possible abuse and criminal activity. Children are exposed to excessive drinking and violence.

These residents are also exposed to health risks through contracting communicable diseases such as TB. The urgency of returning these people to their places of residence cannot be understated. We are very concerned with the complacency of the Provincial Government in addressing placing these residents in their respective areas. The fact that residents of Thabo Mbeki Informal Settlement and those of Nomzamo have spent months living in community halls with no indication of when they are likely to be placed, is indicative of this government's disregard of the poor and vulnerable.

Perhaps the Department will act much faster if the race and class condition of these residents were more aligned with those of the Democratic Alliance. The

reality of the situation is that there is a tendency to react very late to this problem. I was part. In fact I was the first public representative to arrive in Mew Way Hall where in BM section the fires ravaged that community, but the members who were supposed to be responsible who are paid actually to act timeously, and those people take days to arrive... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: They do not care about Khayelitsha.

The PREMIER: Oh sick, sick! [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I do not want the Mayor of the City of Cape Town ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You just want the votes of Khayelitsha.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...took four days to arrive there. [Interjections.] The MEC took weeks to arrive there. Therefore to me that is a high level of disrespect and recognition of their responsibilities as paid public representatives of our communities. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is quite interesting to listen to a public representative complaining that he was the first one to be at a disaster area, whilst he is being paid to be there; first to be there.

[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Well you are not the Chairperson, you must [Inaudible.]

Ms L M MASEKO: We do have disaster management in this province.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Please continue.

Ms L M MASEKO: We do have disaster management in this province and you have the scenarios that you will find that there is unlawful land occupation ...

[Interjection] ... and most of the time you will find that it is in uninhabitable wetlands. [Interjections.]

Then you will find that this wetland, when it is raining, there is obviously going to be flooding. Now if you ask the question what is the turnaround time going to be, do you think that the government has to take the same people and put them back where it is uninhabitable? That will not happen. You still have to have the budget to be able to do that. You still have to have the area and that it has the basic services. Now the question that has to be asked is do we have the budget, whilst the budget is being cut like that. If we have the budget we can do that. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Where is the budget going to? [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Are we as public representatives advising the communities that ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Where is the budget going to?

Ms L M MASEKO: ...not every open land is habitable. Thank you.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi! [Applous.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Magaxa.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] in Khayelitsha.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, you see, you hurt your own people. Shame on you!

An HON MEMBER: I cannot believe [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Shame on you! [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, arriving [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Shame on you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Arriving timeously to any disaster that affects our people as public representatives is fundamental.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is a high level of responsibility.

An HON MEMBER: You complain about it.

Ms M N GILLION: It is fundamental.

Mr K E MAGAXA: One has to understand that after these fires people occupy land by force, not because they are unlawful but because there is always a reluctance to respond timeously when those people occupy that particular land, and then you allow people to stay there years and years and then you forcibly remove them, or when the disaster comes you accuse them that they stay there unlawfully.

Me S W DAVIDS: Ja.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Why do we have agents who are maintaining our legislation? Why do we have law enforcement if we cannot use it to prevent those disasters? Why do we have a local government if we cannot respond to the socio-economic problems that emerge in those communities? The DA

must not try to pass the buck here, you know. The responsibility to take all those responsibilities lies with nobody else but the government in this party. The DA must stop referring to national. Here you are running the province.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly, ja.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is nice to march to that government. You can march to that National Government but you have the responsibility to deliver services to the people who you are ruling. You have won. You have been given a mandate and we accepted as the ANC [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...your mandate to rule, to run this government. Therefore it is your obligation therefore to act ... [Interjection] ...to those programmes; not try to pass the buck here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Member, your time has expired. [Interjections.] The hon member Mr Hinana. [Interjections.]

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. South Africa including Western Cape is a constitutional democracy province [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: It is the same country.

Mr N E HINANA: ...complying to the rule of law.

Mr M N PAULSEN: It is not a different country.

Mr N E HINANA: If members of this House ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: The Western Cape is part of South Africa.

Mr N E HINANA: ...would encourage the community to invade the land, a land that is prone to flooding and fire, and come to this House and complain that there is a fire, there is a flooding, then they have to take the responsibility, because you cannot be a responsible public representative and encourage the people to break the law and expect therefore to say that it is the responsibility of the government because most of the land that people are complaining about in terms of flooding and fire is the land that people themselves illegally unconstitutionally occupied ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: How can you say that [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

Mr N E HINANA: ...and it is therefore the responsibility of this government... [Interjection.] I want us further to stress that ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr N E HINANA: ...that the responsibility of the public rep... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Hinana, hon member Mr Dyantyi, is that a question?

†UMnu Q R DYANTYI: Ndifun'ukuqonda ukuba ilungu eliya liyaziva intobana, liyayiqonda ukuba ayikho lento liyithethayo? Ngumbuzo wam lowo.

\*I want to know if that member understands that what he says is nonsense? That is my question.

Mr N E HINANA: This ANC that we are talking about is not the ANC that was formed in order to make the rule of law compliant. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Speak about the DA. Leave the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Speak about the DA; leave the ANC!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Hinana. Order! Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I could not follow that and the Table agrees it is not a point of order.

Mr M MNQASELA: Ja, I am trying to.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That was my question.

Mr M MNQASELA: The member ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You do not have to explain. We know it is not a point of order.

Mr M MNQASELA: That is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Hinana, please continue. You still have time left. Please continue.

Mr N E HINANA: Okay. We are not making a joke when we say that the ANC [Inaudible.]. You cannot encourage the people to be destructive and we are therefore saying that the responsibility of this government including the public representatives of the Opposition are to say that the people should obey the rule of law and wait on the beneficiary waiting list so that they can be allocated.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Hinana, your time has now expired.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to maintain that nobody would encourage people to break the law. We as an ANC always condemn anybody who invade unlawfully, but the issue here at stake, which the DA must not try to defend, is that there are people who are still staying in halls as I am speaking to you now.

Ms M N GILLION: Ja.

Mr K E MAGAXA: There are people there in B Section [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: They must not invade land!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...in MB Section [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: For the second year this month [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...those people will occupy it the second year, this year. [Interjections.] On the 1<sup>st</sup> of January... [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: We are going to take it back. If you do not want to give it to us we will take it back.

Mr K E MAGAXA: These people will have finished two years of staying there near Moyo Hall.

Ms P Z LEKKER: By force!

Mr M N PAULSEN: ...by force!

Mr K E MAGAXA: There are people ... [Interjection.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Jy en wie? [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...all over the Cape who are affected by these disasters are still there... [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Jy en wie?

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...they occupy there temporarily, but they remain permanently there. [Interjections.] That is all what I am asking Minister Madikizela; how he will improve... [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Gaan haal eers vir jou 'n maatjie!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...the situation of those people because it is not nice ...

[Interjections.] He himself... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...he cannot live with his family in a home.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Just one second. Hon member Mr Paulsen and hon Botha, please, we cannot have a dialogue going while the member is trying to be heard.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Let us take it outside.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, please stand up.

[Interjections.] When the Chair asks for order the Chair exactly means that.

Please take your seat. Please continue, hon member Mr Magaxa.

[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. Under the ANC government we never experienced a situation where people who are poor are kept in halls for more than a month. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Really?

Mr K E MAGAXA: I still want the DA... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...factually to provide me with a case... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Skande, skande!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...where under Rasool government ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: That is untrue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...where under Rasool government in this province...  
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...people spent months in halls.

'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

Mr K E MAGAXA: I have been living... [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

Mr K E MAGAXA: I have been living myself in those areas. All my life I have been living in those towns ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Do not get excited Annemarie.

The PREMIER: Joe Slovo [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...in those shacks, but we never spent months in halls. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I want them to tell me that where... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Do not get excited Annemarie.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...and mention a date or a month where our people under the ANC government in this province were kept in halls. I challenge them to give me those facts.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member, is that a point of order?

Mr M MNQASELA: A point of order yes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Order!

Me S W DAVIDS: Mooi!

Mr M MNQASELA: A point of order. †Ndifun'ubuza eJoe Slovo babengahlali phaya eholweni? \*I want to ask if at Joe Slovo they were not staying at the hall?

An HON MEMBER: Not Joe Slovo. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon member Mr Marius Fransman ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! That is not a point of order. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Only two houses; only two houses.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired almost. [Interjections.] One sentence.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I never finished a month in halls.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] That disposes of this interpellation. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Sorry Minister still to respond, Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. There is a very clear indication here that the member who raised this interpellation did not really do a proper research. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: They never do. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me then first respond to... [Interjections.] ... the point that he is making that under the ANC rule people never stayed in community halls.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In fact he is correct. Under the ANC people were never provided with community halls.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: They were left outside.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: They were left to fend for

themselves.

An HON MEMBER: Ja. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And the classic example is exactly the example that my colleague has just made of Joe Slovo. [Interjections.] The fire disaster of Joe Slovo ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No man! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Can you listen? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Bend down to the mike.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The fire disaster of Joe Slovo kept those people away from Joe Slovo for months. You never provided any community halls. You are quite right. In fact I would urge you to look across the country ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who vote the ANC [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No-no-no, listen. [Interjections.] Listen! The Western Cape... [Interjection.] ...and the City of Cape Town in particular have the best record in terms of turnaround time to deal with disasters. It has the best record in terms of turnaround time to deal with disasters. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The ANC is not [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Secondly the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Feeding them rotten food.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...is the only province that provides starter kits for people to be assisted after a disaster. [Interjections.] The ANC government does not do that anywhere in the country.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And then you pretend to care for people. ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Stop spinning!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now let me tell you this.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You start [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The situation of Nomzamo is a very unfortunate one, but unfortunately it is the doing of the very same ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me tell you, the City of Cape Town... [Interjections.] Can you just listen: the City of Cape Town... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Hon member Ms Davids!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...this Department provided... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister Madikizela. Order, Minister Madikizela, just take your seat. One second.

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, I have been watching you. You comment on every comment from the Minister. This is not the way to do an interjection. You pick your time for an interjection and then you do it. You do not talk all the time. Please calm down a little bit. [Interjections.] Minister Madikizela, please continue.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The City of Cape Town timeously provided emergency kit for Lwandle people. The ANC Ses'khona prevented the construction of those emergency houses because they wanted ... [Interjection.]

'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: They wanted their own company to build ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...so that they can benefit. The City of Cape Town provided EPWP workers to quickly assist people of Lwandle... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish off Minister Madikizela ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So that they can be provided with accommodation... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister, order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And this ANC and Ses'Khona prevented people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, your time has expired. [Interjections.] Is that a question?

An HON MEMBER: No I want ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister, your time has expired. You must take a seat.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No I wanted to have a question.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is ... [Interjection.] Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, he can ask the question.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sit down! No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is no... [Interjections.] Order! There is no time available for questions.

The PREMIER: Ask your question.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Please ask the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We proceed to Interpellation 3.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Now he is giving you another ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Interpellation 3, Minister Botha.

*Speech, language and audiology services for children*

**3. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:**

What measures do his Department have to address speech, language and audiology services for children in the province?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. The Western Cape Government offers extensive service across all facilities, which includes audiology, speech therapy, hearing aids and cochlear implants. We recognise that the services in primary healthcare settings are still evolving.

Both Red Cross War Memorial Children's Hospital and Tygerberg Hospital have extensive services for children at a specialised level.

The distribution of speech therapists, language therapists, and those with dual qualification is as follows:

- Nine audiologists and 13 speech therapists employed at the three central hospitals;
- Three audiologists and four speech therapists at the regional and specialised hospitals;
- Six audiologists and eight speech therapists within the Metro District Health Services;
- Two audiologists and seven speech therapists within the Rural District Health.

Through the Premier's support the Department is embarking on a more dedicated project to screen all neonates; to improve the supply and maintenance of hearing aids, and to increase the number of cochlear implants performed. This is the pilot project that the Premier launched in September this year.

The ground-breaking pilot programme will benefit over 20 000 children who will have access to preventative, rehabilitative and curative services for speech, language and hearing disorders; provision of training of staff in the Mitchells Plain sub-district and at all levels of health services and improved referral and support systems.

The total amount allocated for the project is R13,7 million in 2014/15. An ear, nose and throat specialist has been appointed on 1 August 2014 to render surgical interventions at Red Cross Children's Hospital and reach out to the District Health Services to ensure project outcomes are achieved.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Botha. Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Congenital hearing loss is reported to affect three to six out of a thousand live births worldwide. Approximately 17 infants are born with or will develop hearing loss in South Africa each day. 85% of these infants depend on the public health sector for treatment. Hearing loss in infants must be identified and when possible treated prior to six months of age. If not, these infants may ultimately suffer from irreversible and permanent impairment in speech, language and cognitive abilities. If detected early these infants will have a better chance of developing skills equivalent to their peers by the time they go to Grade R.

I commend Minister Botha and the Department for making this essential service more accessible for those who need it. They must also be commended for proactive efforts to minimise current waiting times and reducing the backlog.

As a standing procedure hearing test assessments must be done to all newborns prior to discharge from hospitals. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Botha.

An HON MEMBER: It is another Botha.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh sorry, it is Hon member Ms Lorraine Botha, my apologies.

'n AGBARE LID: Daar is te veel Botha's daardie kant. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Me L J BOTHA: En gelukkig is daar net een agb lid mnr Paulsen. Mr Deputy Speaker, people living with disabilities is in no way excluded from the space the DA has created in which all can live lives they value. The provision of speech language and audiology services for children through the Western Cape Department of Health most certainly personifies this inclusivity.

The Bill of Rights states that “each child has the right to further education which the state, through reasonable measures, must make progressively available and accessible.”

The DA commends the Western Cape Department of Health for not only fulfilling their constitutional mandate but to also provide services which undoubtedly render children with hearing and speech difficulties fit for

purpose. This creates an open opportunity society for all. I thank you.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Fit for purpose.

The PREMIER: None of you are, absolutely none of you are.

An HON MEMBER: Fit for purpose.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: “Wit” for purpose.

Ms S W DAVIDS: “Wit” for purpose. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Ms S W DAVIDS: “Wit” for purpose. Daardie is ’n purpose; “wit” for purpose.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: You do not need to talk [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

An HON MEMBER: Joker-joker [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: You are disgraceful.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: You are disgraceful.

An HON MEMBER: You are disgraceful.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Honourable order, hon Leader of the Opposition, just allow your own member to speak. Hon member Ms Gopie. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Premier Zille [Inaudible.]

Mr P UYS: Ja, but the Premier [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have addressed the Premier as well, but your voice was slightly louder than the Premier's voice.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, she said: "You are disgraceful"

and I really request her to withdraw, because that is what she did.

An HON MEMBER: But you also [Inaudible.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: No, but I reacted because of her. That is the type of attitude that [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let me - Order! Order! [Interjections.] I did not ... [Interjection.]

Me S W DAVIDS: Dis Annemarie, Annemarie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I did not hear that but I am prepared to look at Hansard and if necessary I will come back on that. Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: I did say the hon member is disgraceful and I hold by that. It is something that I can say outside of this Chamber and this Chamber is supposed to give us more freedom of speech than what we are allowed to do outside the Chamber, so. [Interjections.] We are supposed to have more freedom of speech inside this Chamber... [Interjections.] ...than outside. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: We will also be rude to you. You are very rude.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: So I would like to repeat very loudly, the hon Leader of the Opposition is disgraceful and not fit for purpose. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And you are the worst!

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are the worst! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Order! Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Annemarie, you are the worst.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: I request, I request that ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman, I will [Interjections.]  
Order! I cannot hear you because your own members are making noise. ...  
[Interjections.] Please continue, hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Order, Mr Deputy Speaker, I request that you make a ruling now on what she said because in fact the Premier is a disgrace, not only for the Legislature, also for outside, and I can say it inside and outside. In fact she is a shame. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! I do not want the House to degenerate to that level. I am not going to make a ruling now. I will look at Hansard and if there were cases in the past where that specific ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sorry Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If that specific word was ruled unparliamentary ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sorry Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...I will certainly do so.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker, sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You do not have to go and look at Hansard. She said it now. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I confirm.

An HON MEMBER: She confirms.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, there is nothing to listen to in Hansard.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Now, she said it now.

Mr P UYS: It is very clear. Whenever the Premier is in this House there are problems and issues like this; whenever she is in this House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr P UYS: ...because she is the issue. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I did not say ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: She is running away from national.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: There is no order when she is here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, please listen. What I said was that I will look at the record and see if the specific word was previously

declared unparliamentary. I want to see if there is a precedent for that. If there is a precedent for that I will come back and ask the Premier to withdraw that.

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is fine.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is what I said. Will you please continue, who is on the floor, the hon member Ms Gopie. [Interjections.]

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is another sweetheart question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, my understanding is that you cannot refer to any other member in derogatory terminology. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: I have made my point that she is a disgrace. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, and you are complaining about the ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I have listened to both sides and I have heard both sides and if that word in that sense is unparliamentary both will

be required to withdraw that. That is my ruling. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, you have made a ruling. You have repeated the ruling and yet the hon members on the other side continually stand up and challenge your ruling. I am going to ask that you rule against them if they hold you in contempt again.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! I think the Chair will do that, but the Chair does not need support for that. The Chair will do that if it is necessary. [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Gopie, please continue.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is another sweetheart question. It is a pity that we only look at certain communities when this problem is discussed; not all deaf children or those with hearing loss in this province are treated equally.

An HON MEMBER: Says who?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Exactly!

Ms D GOPIE: Of the seven such schools there is only one for African children. It is Noluthando in the Cape Metro. It is also the only school for African autistic learners. [Interjections.]

This school only gets support from the Education Department and nothing at

all from Health. Noluthando does not even have a speech therapist. All it has is a testing room... [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Dis 'n skande!

Ms D GOPIE: ...with limited facilities. The only support it gets is when some student from the university comes to do practical work there. This school caters for ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Skande, skande, skande!

Ms D GOPIE: ...most of their parents are unemployed. The school and the children are far behind the fancy schools like those in Tygerberg and Worcester. It needs ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: This government does not care about those people. This government does not care about blacks... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It does not.

Ms D GOPIE: ...to work with about 153 children, but most of all... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Member, just one second. Is that a question?

Ms M M WENGER: A point of order Mr Deputy Speaker. It seems the member is in the wrong debate. [Interjections.]

Ms D GOPIE: I am not.

An HON MEMBER: You are in the wrong debate.

Ms D GOPIE: I am not. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The member's time has almost expired. If she was in the wrong debate she must continue.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Do you have a problem? You have got many problems. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: What is your ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue member. [Interjections.] Order!

An HON MEMBER: You do not even know.

Ms D GOPIE: It needs teacher assistance to work with about 153 children.

[Interjections.] ...but most of all about a third of these children do not have any hearing aid. What is this Department doing about that? This government just shifted half a million rand for listening devices at the province training institute, but cannot help poor children in need. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Gopie, your time has expired. Hon member Ms Wenger. [Interjections.] Order! I really want to appeal, hon member Ms Dijana, I really want to appeal to the back bench there on that side. You are making a continuous noise and we cannot continue like that. Please continue hon member Ms Wenger. [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. If we can treat children with hearing loss, balance and related disorders proactively we can prevent delays in children's development and increase their chance of a full recovery. Conversely not detecting these disorders early enough could mean extended rehabilitation processes and long term learning difficulties.

Prevention is certainly better than cure. This pilot in Mitchells Plain is much needed to determine if this kind of intervention can extend and widen access to audiology and speech therapies for children. There are currently limitations and this service is overburdened. For example District Hospitals such as the Red Cross Children's Hospital has a waiting list of over 800 children and this type of service is closed for new outpatient referrals, so this new project and screening introduces speech language therapy and audiology services across all levels of the healthcare system and is designed to increase

an open access and lessen the burden on current institutions.

This project should be commended and helped to succeed for the sake of the children.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Ms Wenger, your time has expired.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you. I would like to encourage members to support the Children's Hospital to raise funds in support of this project.  
[Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Wenger, Order! Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Red Cross War Memorial Children's Hospital is recognised for their Audiology Ear Clinic. This clinic caters for children with suspected hearing loss, recurrent ear infections, speech and language delays and head and ear trauma. The Carel Du Toit Centre must be acknowledged as being instrumental in creating a space in which deaf children learn to speak. From firsthand experience the Carel Du Toit Centre lives out their mission and believe that children with hearing loss have the same capacity as children with normal hearing to learn to speak.

The negative impact of hearing loss on older adults is significant. The major challenge facing people with hearing impairment is communication. As said by Minister Botha all the health facilities in the Western Cape like Groote Schuur Hospital, Tygerberg Hospital, Victoria Hospital, Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha Hospital do have audiology and speech therapists available and we commend the Minister to expand these skills to all our primary healthcare facilities in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. I am not going to deal with the conclusion which I prepared here, but I am rather going to respond to what was said here, because I think it was a very serious allegation to say that these services are only allocated to a certain population group or does not or would not include other population groups.

I just want to give a breakdown of the money that is allocated. It is not R500 000. It is R13,7 million of which R1,75 million is allocated to Red Cross for hearing aids and Tygerberg R1,75 million for hearing aids. Maintenance to hearing aids, R500 000 to Tygerberg and R500 000 to Red Cross. For cochlear implants R10 000 at Tygerberg and for screening and hearing impairments R4,7 million of which R3,76 million is allocated to the Metro and R940 000 to the Red Cross War Memorial Children's Hospital. So it is very obvious that this money is available to everyone in this province. Those institutions have no ethnic preference. In fact I think if one

would look at the clientele it would show exactly that and therefore I think it is regrettable that this member has referred to this as a “sweetheart question”. It actually is for me an indication to what extent she understands or perhaps does not understand the importance of ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Yes, not fit for purpose.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...the ability for people and children at a young age to be able to get the right treatment so that they can have a fair chance in life ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are the only one ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...to have exactly the same ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: According to you, you are the only one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So there is also then the pilot which is done in Mitchells Plain and I think that is where she got confused, although for a moment it sounded to me like a question of education which she responded to, but the pilot in Mitchells Plain was a pilot which was made available or possible by the Children’s Red Cross Trust; not the hospital, the Trust ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] about Noluthando.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...and also by the Carel Du Toit Centre at Tygerberg Hospital so these two institutions brought the offer to the table. The Premier facilitated it and it became a pilot project in Mitchells Plain but it has nothing to do with the other allocations which are already made of R13,7 million for everyone in the province ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Botha, your time has expired. That also brings us to the end of Interpellation number 3. We continue with the Question Paper. Questions for Oral Reply, the first question is from the Hon member Mr Lentit to the hon Premier. I see the Premier.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*New Questions to the Premier:*

*Key achievements and challenges: Western Cape Government*

### **1. Mr R B Lentit asked the Premier:**

What were some of the key (a) achievements and (b) challenges that the Western Cape Provincial Government faced during the past twelve months?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Deputy Speaker. I see that the hon member Mr Lentit is not here, but in his absence let me just summarise my answer to him. It is a very long answer so I can submit the answer to him. I will not go through it in his absence.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Keep it short and sweet! [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: I will answer the question in exactly the way that I choose to answer the question. [Interjections.]

In education we have reduced the number of underperforming schools significantly, while improving the learner retention rate and preventing school dropouts. It is a major achievement.

In health we have been reducing HIV transmissions, particularly mother to child transmissions, and our Chronic Dispensing Unit is perhaps amongst the best in the world. We run one of the very best HIV Programmes in the world.

Our broadband strategy, which finally got underway, despite SETA that is run by the National Government, is also at the cutting edge in the country and more advanced than anywhere else in the country.

The Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry is one of our major achievements. ...  
[Interjection.]

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi so.

The PREMIER: ...despite the huge opposition from the national Minister. [Interjections.] We have got it off the ground. We have also appointed a Police Ombudsman... [Interjections.] ...who is an extraordinarily competent person; also fired twice by ANC Presidents.

Mr M N PAULSEN: This is like her State of the Province Address.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am answering a question very briefly, that was put to me, which I could answer at great length if I so chose.

The MPAT audit outcomes have been quite extraordinary. The MPAT outcomes put the Western Cape at the top of every single category measured countrywide, and in fact out of the audit outcomes we received a 75% clean audit, by far the highest in the country. The next one was Gauteng at 54%. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They will give a State of the Province Address.

The PREMIER: So that was a very good outcome as well. In areas of challenges I refer to the state of the economy nationally, the fact that we

have only just over 1% growth. The unemployment that results out of that, the lack of leadership on the ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier, just one second. Is that a question or a point of order, what is that? [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think it is a real pity ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! On what basis are you talking? [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Are we going to listen to an entire State of the Province Address?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Please take your seat. That is not a point of order and neither is the question.

Mr M N PAULSEN: But this is going to go on forever.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: It comes from that side of the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: Let us sit outside. [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Gooi hom uit!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is not a point of order and you have addressed him previously and he is refusing your authority. Could you please rule in that regard?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will... [Interjections.] Order! Order! Order!

The Chair appreciates all the assistance but the Chair will act when the Chair needs to act. [Interjections.] Please continue, Premier.

An HON MEMBER: I am sorry!

An HON MEMBER: How do you like... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: As I said I am summarising this reply. Apart from the challenge of unemployment one of the biggest challenges in this province is the abuse of alcohol and drugs, which we are battling to keep ahead of, despite the fact that we have dramatically increased and subsidised the

number of rehabilitation centres. Crime and gangsterism are a very serious problem. Housing is always a serious problem especially with the very large numbers of people who wish to live in Cape Town. There is a shortage of land. There is a large infrastructure backlog. Those are the summaries of the major successes and challenges. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Madam Premier. Is there a follow up question, hon member Mr Fransman?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: The Premier started off, Mr Deputy Speaker, with a point around education. Does the Premier actually know that it is a fact that the worst performing province in rural enrolment of primary school learners is the Western Cape and that is while they are closing down schools? That is factual. Does she know that? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: The answer to that is that the closure of schools has absolutely nothing to do with the enrolment ... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: That is not the question.

Ms S W DAVIDS: The question, answer the question. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: You said that the enrolment of learners at school is a

problem... [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi hom!

The PREMIER: ...despite the fact that we are closing schools.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Roer hom!

The PREMIER: So you asked that question and I will answer it.

An HON MEMBER: Answer it.

The PREMIER: The closing of schools has absolutely nothing to do with the lack of access for some children in rural areas.

An HON MEMBER: It has everything to do with that.

The PREMIER: It has absolutely nothing to do with it. Schools that are earmarked for closure are those with tiny enrolments that are not viable and have multi-grade teaching in a single class and are not providing the children with decent education. That is why we want to consolidate them in schools where they can get specialist education at the specific grades. It is entirely for the benefit of the children. Children who drop out of school normally have parents who are either alcoholics or not interested in getting them into schools. [Interjections.]

That is the problem and where children drop out of school I would very much like to know about it because I will lay charges against parents for keeping their children out of school. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Is there a further follow-up, hon member Mr Fransman? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Jo, you have a bad attitude.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I will address again. Does the Premier actually know that it is factual that the Western Cape is worse performing when it comes to rural enrolment on primary schools and it is in fact very, very wrong to blame it on the fact that parents in rural areas are just alcoholics. That is why that is. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: In fact that is a shame. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

Mr P UYS: That is terrible.

The PREMIER: We have compulsory universal school enrolment. Any parents

who do not enrol their child who has to be at school is committing a crime. If the hon Leader of the Opposition knows of any child who is of school-going age who should be at school... [Interjections.] ... I will personally intervene.

Ms M N GILLION: Just watch the news programmes.

The PREMIER: The Government cannot compensate for bad parenting all over South Africa. ... [Interjection.]

Me S W DAVIDS: Julle het die [Onduidelik] kom bring met Jan van Riebeeck.

The PREMIER: The bottom line is this: parents are responsible for enrolling their children at school. [Interjections.]

Me S W DAVIDS: Julle het hom gebring.

The PREMIER: Where they do not do that we usually find social problems in the house; often alcoholism, often other kinds of abuse. It is a crime and anybody who do not register their children in a school and make sure their children go to school is guilty of a crime. [Interjections.] We are the only province that provides schools for everybody and offers free transport... [Interjections.] ... to schools. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order! Hon member Mr Fransman, your

third follow-up.

An HON MEMBER: The ANC is closing schools [Inaudible.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Bearing in mind that the Premier actually has just started to boast and now realised they are the worst performers when it comes to rural enrolment. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Yes!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Does the Premier know that only 5% of spend in the infrastructure portfolio on roads construction is actually going to previously disadvantaged individual companies?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Is that what the Premier is overseeing in this province?

Me S W DAVIDS: Hoor daar!

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor! [Tussenwerpsels.]

Me S W DAVIDS Hoor daar! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: It is the face for white monopoly capital.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh come on!

An HON MEMBER: That is true.

The PREMIER: The bottom line is I cannot answer specific questions on ...

[Interjections.] ... tenders allocated. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: All I can say is there... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: There is no corruption in our tender system. [Interjections.]

We do not have... [Interjections.] ...bridges that collapse in this province because somebody issued the tender to Julius Malema. That is the kind of way the ANC runs their tender system. It is all corruption. [Interjections.] It is all jobs for pals. [Interjections.] Here we run a clean system. The roads get built. They do not have potholes... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...and they work for everybody. When bridges collapse, when roads collapse, poor people ... [Interjection] ... who are using the road system are the first to suffer. [Interjections.] We do not have corruption. We do it properly according to the tender procedures and we run a clean government. [Interjections.] That is why we have clean audits and we serve the poor people much better in this province than they do nationally. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman. [Interjections.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, did I hear correctly that the Premier is saying that the reason why they have only 5% to black procurement in road infrastructure is because black contractors are not able to build proper roads and it is only white contractors who can do that? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: That is a complete and deliberate distortion, a complete and deliberate untruth that is told in this House. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: That is what he wanted me to say, but it is not what I said  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down. Sit down.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am talking now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Madam Premier, just one second.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier said, “It is a deliberate distortion”. I want her to apologise and [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.] You cannot say, “It is a deliberate distortion.”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Premier, the word “deliberate” has been ruled previously with “untruth” or with “onwaarheid” to be unparliamentary.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So in that specific sense [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I did not say “onwaarheid”. I said “distortion”.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You have to withdraw, withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier, there is... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: And “distortion”, may I address you on this question Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may Madam Premier. [Interjections.]  
Order, order!

The PREMIER: And may I address you on the big noise?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat, Madam Premier.

Mr P UYS: Why is she speaking? You are ruling Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have allowed the Premier to address me on that and that is the ruling.

The PREMIER: I am addressing ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: No you are busy with the ruling, Mr Deputy Speaker. You are busy with the ruling.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Chief Whip Mr Uys, allow me the opportunity. I am listening to the Premier.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I was asked a question about whether I knew that 5% of the contracts ... [Interjection]

Ms M N GILLION: No, no, no, no.

An HON MEMBER: A point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms M N GILLION: A point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The PREMIER: ...in this province had been given to previous disadvantaged people.

An HON MEMBER: Just ask her to withdraw. She must be asked to withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier, just get to the point of the “deliberate” part. I want you to withdraw.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Withdraw!

An HON MEMBER: She must withdraw.

The PREMIER: I am not going to withdraw it, because I am explaining ...  
[Interjection] ...

Ms M N GILLION: No! No! No!

The PREMIER: I am addressing you on the subject, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am  
addressing you on that subject. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, please. Please take your seat.

The PREMIER: I did ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley! Order! Please take your  
seat.

The PREMIER: I did not at any stage intimate ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: She did say that.

The PREMIER: ...or even concede that that figure was correct.  
[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You did say it. Withdraw!

An HON MEMBER: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: I did not even intimate ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ...that that figure was correct. [Interjections.] I said I do not know what the figures are ... [Interjection] ...

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is not an explanation [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...and I continue to say we do not have corruption.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Madam Premier ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: That was a deliberate distortion of my answer. He heard it, so did you, and I am not withdrawing it [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order Premier.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier is going directly against your ruling.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: She says: “I will not withdraw”, although you said: “Premier, withdraw.” She said: “I will not withdraw.” She must leave this Chamber immediately. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Now, yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier. [Interjections.] Order! Order!

Mr P UYS: Now go! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: She must leave! She must leave! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids.

The PREMIER: It is a deliberate distortion. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no you [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: She said it again; on a point of order Mr Deputy Speaker...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip Mr Uys, I heard that and I am going to make a ruling, but I am giving the ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: You made a ruling already, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...the hon Leader of the Opposition of a chance.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Oh since when?

The PREMIER: He asked me if [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will just hear the hon Chief Whip first and then I will give my ruling.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, your translation of what the Premier said ... [Interjection]

An HON MEMBER: No. Uh-uh!

Mr M G E WILEY: There is a rule in this House that when someone is addressing the Chair everybody else keeps quiet.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: Now I would like that to be honoured please. You translated her word from English “distortion” as an “onwaarheid”, which is an incorrect translation.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

Mr M G E WILEY: If she had said it is a “totale onwaarheid”, then it would have been a withdrawable offence.

An HON MEMBER: It is not [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: However, she said it is a distortion which is not an untruth, an interpretation of an untruth.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: Because what the hon member gave there was a distortion.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: And he did do it deliberately.

Ms S W DAVIDS: She said “deliberate”. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Of course it was deliberate. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, you made a ruling.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, you are putting the Chair in a very difficult position. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Fransman, just one second. I am busy now. It is very difficult for the Chair to rule on the ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Leave the House!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...on nuances of words in this case. I did say if “distortion” is exactly the same as “untruth”, then it is clearly unparliamentary.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...and I am prepared to have a look at the Hansard ... [Interjection] ... and at dictionaries. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No! No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I am prepared to look at the dictionaries to ascertain whether “distortion” in fact means “untruth” and if that is so, it is totally unparliamentary. Premier ... [Interjection] Order! Premier, you may want to assist me on that. ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: You made a ruling Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat honourable member. I am listening to the Premier.

Mr P UYS: She said: “deliberate distortion”.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, Mr Uys. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: You made a ruling!

Ms M N GILLION: You made the ruling Mr Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms M N GILLION: You made the ruling.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am very aware that to say “someone told a deliberate lie” is unparliamentary. I did not say that. A distortion is not a lie. A distortion is bending someone’s words to suit your own purposes. That is what a distortion is... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is an English... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...and I stand by my position that that was a “deliberate distortion” intended by the hon Leader of the Opposition.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No!

Ms M N GILLION: No Mr Deputy Speaker.

The PREMIER: It cannot be that we have more freedom of speech outside this House than we have inside this House... [Interjections.] ...and if the words “deliberate distortion” is going to be ruled unparliamentary then there will be more freedom of speech outside this House than there is inside this House and I cannot be part of a House that curbs freedom of speech to that extent and I am happy to leave this House if you rule that “deliberate distortion” is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Leave. Leave the House [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, my ruling was that if “distortion” means exactly the same as “untruth” then it clearly was unparliamentary. I am prepared to come back and say to the House “distortion” is an untruth or not.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My ruling now is that it is not unparliamentary per se now, unless I come back tomorrow and rule it unparliamentary.

Ms M N GILLION: Then we will see!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, I want you to ...  
[Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, but you made a ruling. You said that the Premier must withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did say that.

Mr P UYS: Now the Premier said she is not going to withdraw.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! I may have said that and I may also change my ruling. Nothing is wrong with that.

Mr P UYS: Under pressure!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have not changed my ruling.

Mr P UYS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have just reserved my ruling till tomorrow morning. That is what I said. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: No, no!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not going to allow too much further debate on this.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: No, no, no, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is the second time in this sitting that the Premier tries to become the Speaker. You have a ruling. It was the words “deliberate distortion”. All of us know that is unparliamentary. It is wrong and we are going to call on the Speaker now not to in a sense buckle on a party-political position on this thing.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I take exception to that hon member Mr Fransman. I will not allow the Chair to be addressed in that way. I have made my ruling. The ruling is that I have reserved my ruling till tomorrow morning and I will come back with a ruling. [Interjections.] Madam Premier, do you want to say something final? [Interjections.] Order! Order! Premier.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am happy to leave the House if it will help you ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: ...but I am here today to answer questions without notice ... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Leave the House.

The PREMIER: Unlike President Zuma who never arrives in the House to answer questions without notice. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: I am here to answer questions without notice which is my accountability to the people who elected us. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: If you want me to leave and make it easier for you, I am happy to do that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: I am very happy to do that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Madam Premier. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Order! Can I just make the - Madam Premier. Chief Whip, I have not asked the Premier to leave the House. If the Premier wants to leave the House now it is a voluntary leaving. I said to the Premier and I said to the House that I will come back tomorrow with a considered ruling on this, and we cannot continue in this vein forever. I need to carry on.

Mr M G E WILEY: Carry on! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We have exhausted this topic now. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is an abuse of [Inaudible.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I then see the... [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: No-no, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You are changing the rules!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: We are now addressing you ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You are changing the rules!

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ...because what we have just seen is the fact that the Speaker has ruled and the Premier has pressurised the Speaker to in fact change the position ... [Interjection] ... and that is in fact wrong. What we are seeing here is an abuse of parliamentary process ... [Interjection]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: We are seeing an abuse by the Premier in the context of this sitting and we actually have seen just now the Legislature buckling under that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: We will leave the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: It is another “deliberate distortion”.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! If a party wants to leave or members want to leave that is fine, but we are going to do it orderly.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, we are leaving!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...and I will give the opportunity now to the second ... [Interjection]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are breaking the rules for one person.

An HON MEMBER: For one person! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The second question. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are afraid of Annemarie.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, we are not afraid of Godzilla! [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: No you do not have to answer! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P UYS: No, you do not have to answer. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are afraid of Annemarie. [Interjections.]

ANC members leave the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We continue with the second question.  
[Interjections.] Order! Hon Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBER: Are you staying?

Mr M N PAULSEN: I am staying. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Ja, Mr Deputy Speaker, this behaviour is not very good for this Parliament. I am going to ask that the matter be referred to the Conduct Committee for consideration.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If that is the wish then we must follow the correct procedure and come with a motion in that regard, whatever the motion would wish to be. I see the second member is not here to ask the question, so that question will then fall away, unless the Premier wants to respond to that

question.

The PREMIER: I will respond to that question with ease.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: From hon member Mr Dyantyi to the Premier.

*Senior Management Services posts: Department of the Premier*

**2. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Premier:**

Whether any Senior Management Services (SMS) posts have been declared in excess in her Department in the current financial year; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Seeing that the questioner in the first question also was not here and I answered the question, let me do this one as well.

I am informed that in 2013 the branch Human Capital of the Department of the Premier was refined into the branch People Management Practices.

The functions of the Directorate Performance Management and Development were transferred into two other directorates and said directorate was subsequently abolished. This was done after a process of due consultation with organised labour. The director of said directorate could not be matched and placed in terms of the approved Human Resource Principles and

Personnel Plan into a vacant post after various attempts to find a suitable placement.

In November 2014 he was officially declared to be in excess. He is currently being utilised optimally and is performing functions within the Chief Directorate People Management Practices as the Head, Priority Unit.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then continue with questions standing over from Thursday. Hon member Mr Hinana to Minister Schäfer.

*Question standing over from Thursday, 27 November 2014, as agreed to by the House:*

*2014 matric pass rate: percentage target*

**7. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether her Department has set a percentage target for the 2014 matric pass rate; if so, what (a) is the target and (b) were the plans implemented to achieve it?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Education Department prefers to focus on the number of passes for the 2014 Matric examinations because percentage pass rates are not reliable measures of success. For example schools and provinces can easily

improve pass rates by culling weaker learners from the system before they reach matric. Our objective however is to improve the retention rate at schools by encouraging more learners to stay in school and to write matric.

The WCED measures success by increases in the number of learners writing matric and achieving good results. Our targets for 2014 therefore include the following:

- To increase the number of learners passing matric from 40 558 in 2013 to this year's stretched target of 43 000;
- To improve the quality of passes by ensuring that about 20 000 or 40% pass with access to Bachelor Degree studies;
- To reduce the number of underperforming schools by 50%.

Our preparation for the 2014 Matric exams began in 2012 by ensuring that Grade 10s acquired the knowledge and skills needed to remain in school until Matric. Most learners who drop out of school across the country do so after Grade 9.

The WCED's interventions included providing study guides and advice to all Grade 10s and by providing special support to individual schools as required.

Support for Matrics in 2014 included the following:

- Reports to schools providing detailed analyses of 2013 results;
- Intensive management support from our district offices;
- Mentoring programmes; tutoring programmes both after school, on

weekends and during school holidays;

- Subject specific support for schools with historically low pass rates;
- Additional textbooks in critical subject areas;
- Tips for Success books for every matric giving study guidance for every subject;
- Exam paper exemplars for practice purposes;
- Online resources including previous exam papers and videos on selected subjects.

I look forward to the release of the results in January next year. It is already evident that the Western Cape has retained more learners in the system than any other province as well as ensuring that our commitment to a quality National Senior Certificate has also extended to the marking up of our matric papers. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am impressed with the quality of response that the MEC is giving and therefore I have no further questions. ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next one. New questions, hon member Mr Christians to Minister Botha.

*New questions:*

*Ebola outbreak, potential: emergency hospital*

**3. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Health:**

Whether his Department has identified an emergency hospital to be utilised in the event of Tygerberg Hospital becoming overcrowded due to a potential Ebola outbreak; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Tygerberg Hospital will be the first port of call for Ebola patients. Should a situation arise where there are more than four patients, which we consider highly unlikely, there is a contingency plan in place.

Tygerberg Hospital has another isolation ward dealing with infectious disease cases which will serve as a backup ward. Should the second Tygerberg Hospital ward fill up, Groote Schuur Hospital will also be used as they have an isolation unit and infectious virology specialist. Containing Ebola patients at Tygerberg Hospital is key to halting secondary infections and preventing an outbreak.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We continue with the next question, hon member Mr Christians to Minister Fritz.

*Gang recruitment of youths*

**4. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Social Development:**

Whether his Department has any plans to address the social circumstances of youths who find themselves being recruited by gang bosses; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. I want to start off by saying that before we can even think of answering this question we want to repeat the call to the President to please deploy the army to our townships to stabilise our townships.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Our communities are under siege and they are not doing a thing to do that.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And then we can start talking about the kind of programmes that we are... [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Why do you not build better communities?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Keep quiet.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Build better communities.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...the strategies that we are addressing and our strategies are mainly to address issues specifically around preventative programmes that we have for young people. There is a host of those preventative programmes and then further intervention programmes specifically looking at the Chrysalis model and we have seen the success of the Chrysalis model and we are rolling that out, and it is very difficult to even send our social workers into some of these communities because our townships are under siege.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...and this National Government who must care more about the people of the Western Cape must get it into their thick skulls.

Mr M N PAULSEN: No this government should care more about the people of the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Shut up!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is a follow-up question, hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the Minister whether programmes such as the Youth Cafes help prevent youths from becoming involved in gangsterism.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you hon member Ms Wenger for that. We also have the rolling out of the Youth Café's moving up to a total of seven and I want to say with the Goedverwacht Trust we also have similar cafés as the Youth Cafés that they roll out. We are very encouraged by a number of those initiatives including from the private sector, PetroSA giving us R6,5 million to also roll out some Youth Cafés on that side, the Mossel Bay side. It is so good to see the Mayor of Mossel Bay in the House.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We continue with the next question, Question 5, Minister Botha.

*Breastfeeding, promotion of*

**5. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:**

What measures do his Department have to promote breastfeeding in the province?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, this reply is 16 pages. Can I perhaps hand it in with the permission of the questioner?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If there is no objection it can be done.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be done. Thank you. We then proceed to Question 6, hon member Ms Du Toit Marais to Minister Fritz.

*Police stations: victim friendly rooms*

**6. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Social Development:**

Whether victim friendly rooms at police stations in the province have been brought to his attention; if so, (a) how many rooms are there, (b) what facilities and (c) services are provided?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you for the question hon member Ms Du Toit Marais. The victim friendly rooms and voluntary lay counsellors are under the auspices of the South African Police Services. There are victim friendly rooms activated in 150 police stations; 21 satellite stations; four railway stations or police stations; six FCS Units and one contact point.

In the SAPS National Instructions Tool of 2013 victim empowerment, it states:

“A victim friendly room is a dedicated room at the police station or facility to provide a space for victims of intimate violence to make their statement in private in a non-threatening environment.”

In 2014/15 financial year the Department of Social Development supported the training of 200 lay counsellors including that of VEP SAPS members in basic standardised victim empowerment support training. This initiative is a collaboration between the Department of Social Development, South African Police Force, Business against Crime, and the Victim Empowerment service providers. Those are NGO's working within that sector. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Follow-up question hon member Ms Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the Minister whether aside from the victim support rooms the Department provides other types of victim support?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, that is a very interesting and important question. For the new financial year, where women who are victims of intimate sexual and other personal violence, we will be looking at giving them an Expanded Public Works Programme stipend to firstly skill them and secondly to see that they are placed where they can be independent

of the husband or the boyfriend who is abusing them, so they can get away from that relationship that is such a violent relationship, and I think this is a practical 365 campaign, not a 16-day campaign.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question, hon member Mr Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to ask Minister Fritz, in terms of the victim support, psychological and also in terms of capacitation and empowerment and as far as jobs are concerned, whether it can also be expanded to include a victim offender dialogue to rope in the offenders as well so that they can get to a sort of a truce or reconciliatory [Inaudible.] fashion. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you hon member Mr Kivedo. I think it is another good follow-up question. I started to do that in the Child Justice System where we actually create restorative justice where we actually get the victim and the perpetrator in the same space to reconcile and to see that we stop the cycle of violence. That is very, very possible. In fact I think NICRO already started with the restorative justice approach to many of the kind of petty offenders specifically. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We proceed to the next question, Question 7, hon

member Ms Botha to Dr Meyer.

*Department of Finance: public awareness of services*

**7. Ms L J Botha to ask Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Finance:**

Other than online services, how are the people of the province made aware of the services provided by his Department?

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker en dankie aan agb lid me Botha vir hierdie vraag. Die Provinsiale Tesourie lewer 'n indirekte diens aan die publiek aangesien dit hoofsaaklik die terrein is van lynfunksiedepartemente, openbare entiteite en die 30 munisipaliteite om direkte dienste aan die gemeenskap te lewer.

Die Provinsiale Tesourie se mandaat is vervat in Hoofstuk 7 van die Grondwet van die Wes-Kaap, Artikel 18 van die Wet op Openbare Finansiële Bestuur, 1999 en Artikel 5 van die Wet op Munisipale Finansiële Bestuur, en in terme van die voorgaande is dit die Provinsiale Tesourie se verantwoordelikheid om sy kliëntdepartemente, entiteite en munisipaliteite te ondersteun en te help om hul finansiële bestuur te verbeter.

Nieteenstaande die voorafgaande vind daar deur middel van periodieke Verskaffer Ope Dae en in vennootskap met ander regeringsbelanghebbendes en munisipaliteite gestruktureerde interaksies met verskaffers en kopers plaas

om besigheidsgelenthede en die regulering daarvan in provinsiale departemente en munisipaliteite te bevorder.

Ons het tans ook geleenthede vir werkskepping asook geleenthede vir beurse en ons het tans 64 beurshouers in die Provinsiale Tesourie. Een-en-twintig sal aan die einde van 2014 afstudeer. Hulle sal ook werksaam wees in die onderskeie provinsiale departemente en spesifiek om die CFO-funksies in die verskillende departemente te ondersteun.

Ons het ook so pas 24 nuwe beurse toegeken vir die 2014 finansiële jaar waar hierdie studente aan tersiêre instellings gaan studeer ten einde ons finansiële kapasiteit in die provinsie ook verder uit te bou en tans is 21 van daardie mense ook tans werksaam in die Provinsiale Tesourie. Ek dank u.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar 'n opvolgvraag, hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. I just wanted to know is providing bursaries one of the hon Minister Meyer's department's functions?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, to the hon member Mr Paulsen, every particular department has a functional responsibility to build the capacity and build the human capital within your department. Given the nature of the important role of good governance in this Western Cape and in continuously improving on a year on year basis to improve the financial

capacity and financial competence of old in the municipalities and also within the Provincial Government, it is a natural duty and the responsibility of every single Minister here, and this government takes this very seriously in terms of building human capital, and that is why the audit results speaks to the capacity that we do throughout this Western Cape Government, so the answer is yes, it is part of the responsibility of government and every single Minister has the same level of responsibility as I have.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we continue with Question number 8, hon member Ms Botha to Minister Bredell. Minister Bredell.

*Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs  
and Development Planning: public awareness of services*

**8. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Local Government,  
Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Other than online services, how are the people of the province made aware of the services provided by his Department?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, met die toestemming van die lid sal ek vra om die vraag in te dien. Dit is 'n baie lang antwoord. Benewens die aanlyndienste van kommunikasie in my Departement gaan dit ook oor twee departemente plus Cape Nature in my Departement. Die

natuurlike neiging is om te kyk na die elektronika en hoe ons ons elektronika kan gebruik om ons kommunikasienetwerke te verbeter.

Dan as ek dit sê gaan hand aan hand daarmee dat ons ook nog steeds voortgaan met die ou tradisionele maniere van pamflette en brosjures want in 'n sekere mark is dit meer toeganklik en met die inwerkingstelling van ons breëband sal ons natuurlik die kapasiteit hê om baie meer met ons mense elektronies te kan kommunikeer, maar met die toestemming van die lid sal ek graag die volledige antwoord elektronies wil indien.

'n AGBARE LID: Geen beswaar, so dit sal so gedoen word. Question number 9, Minister Plato.

*Report a Cop, Reward a Cop campaign*

**9. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

(a) How many complaints have been lodged via the Report a Cop, Reward a Cop campaign since its inception, (b) what is the nature of these complaints and (c) what was the outcome of these cases including information on any legal or disciplinary action that have resulted from the complaints lodged?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you, and also to the member for the question.

(a) The total number of incidents reported since the Reward and Report a Cop campaign was launched is 1 576 for the period July 2012 to 28 November 2014, of which 1 482 were complaints received via the complaints line and also the SMS code number. Ninety-four were enquiries or rewards which were dealt with immediately by the Department of Community Safety.

(b) Then question (b) the answer to that is the nature and number of incidents received:

- Communications between SAPS and the community: 240
- Quality of investigations: 137
- Response from SAPS: 326
- Complaints against management: one
- Behaviour of SAPS officials: 819
- General complaints: 45
- Acts of alleged criminality: seven
- Complaints against other State Departments: one

That is the tally of 1 576.

(c) Question (c), 1 207, that is 77% of the complaints were finalised up to date of which 540 complaints were found to be substantiated and SAPS indicated that remedial steps will be taken or in some cases already have been taken including disciplinary steps, but it is important to note that

the office of the Provincial Commissioner do not provide the Department with any detailed information on the outcome of the disciplinary steps taken. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to know from the Minister whether he considers this campaign to be a successful one.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, looking at the nature of the complaints and looking at the people lodging the complaints, they were mostly satisfied with the responses received and that the Department pays attention to each and every complaint. I think they are relatively happy and I think there is room for improvement and we must definitely continue with this campaign.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That then brings us to the end of Questions. We continue with the Order Paper, Questions to the Premier without Notice. The two members who were drawn to ask questions are not here, so we will skip that. We then get to Statements by Members. I see the DA first. Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais.

#### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Since the detection of the first case in 1978 a lot has been done to disarm the scourge of HIV/Aids. The HIV/Aids pandemic has been around for the last 34 years and should no longer be a stranger to us. The danger that we may face is that of familiarity which breeds contempt.

Yesterday, 1 December, marked World Aids Day 2014. The global theme for the campaign is *Getting to Zero*, zero new HIV infections; zero discrimination; Zero Aids-related deaths.

I take this opportunity to commend the Western Cape Department of Health in their efforts to provide a space and assistance in creating wellness in the province.

In terms of working towards a goal of zero Aids-related deaths, the Department has made major strides in attaining this goal.

HIV prevalence among the reproductive age population, which is 15 to 49 years, in the Western Cape has increased from 5.3% to 7.8%. People living with HIV/Aids are living longer with the disease and this is attributed to the successful progress the Western Cape Department of Health has made with improved access to antiretroviral treatments and therapy.

This is a feat in our fight against HIV and Aids. As leaders striving to achieve zero, scientists ranging from medical to social scientists are doing

their best to getting to zero. Their efforts will not yield much if individuals do not see themselves as responsible for at least their own health. Personal responsibility in this sense is the determination by each one of us to do what is needed to get to zero. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the DA again, hon member Ms Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: You must be enjoying this.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M N PAULSEN: This why you always want... [Inaudible.]

Ms L J BOTHA: The 2014 holiday season is upon us. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: ...to govern alone.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon member Mr Paulsen, you are alone. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You get more done actually.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Steel wool. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Steel wool?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms L J BOTHA: The festive season is typically ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Hon member Mr Paulsen, Madam Premier, I heard that. Hon member Mr Paulsen, please withdraw that.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Botha, please continue.

Ms L J BOTHA: The 2014 holiday season is upon us. The festive season is typically characterised by family time and a breakaway from the stressful pressures of everyday life. For many, no such break is afforded.

I take this opportunity to acknowledge our Emergency Medical Services staff, health professionals and law enforcement officials as they gear up for their busiest period of the year.

While most of us are enjoying festivities with loved ones, EMS personnel

will be rendering this invaluable lifesaving services to the people of the Western Cape. Although EMS officials provide essential out-of-hospital services, for the wellbeing of the public, many a time EMS staff are threatened and attacked. This is unacceptable.

Today I pay tribute to the unsung heroes, who are EMS staff, who work under immense pressure, under extreme circumstances. I urge communities and all role-players to assist the Western Cape Department of Health and law enforcement officials in ensuring the safety of EMS personnel as they work around the clock to save lives that would otherwise be lost. I call on all present and the public at large to show EMS officials and their lives the respect it so duly deserves this festive season and beyond. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The EFF.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On 1 December 1834 over 38 000 slaves lit up bonfires on Table Mountain and Signal Hill in celebration of the end of slavery in the Cape of Good Hope. Over 180 years later all their descendants are still modern day slaves, abundantly cheap later, ready for white monopoly capital to exploit and discard at will.

We may not have chains and locks on our limbs but the racial discrimination, labour brokers and contractors, low legislated minimum wages for unskilled workers and the wage gap between racial groups, housing bonds, loans and other debt, the miseducation of black children and all other forms of modern

day slavery are proof the colonial blueprint on which the society of our forefathers was constructed on is still intact, just changed tactics. Until all our people are fully emancipated and have ownership of not only their lives, but livelihood, there is nothing to celebrate. The events of December 1834 were just a transition from one form of slavery to another; not an abolishment as history books would like to make us believe. ... [Interjection.]

From 5 December we will be expected to celebrate the Father of the Nation Madiba's life by the very same government, ANC in eight provinces and the DA in one, that has done everything but live up to his wishes.

Madiba valued people's lives and would have never tolerated shacks, evictions and our people being shot at 20 years after democracy, yet we have over 283 informal settlements in this province of a backlog of 500 000 houses. Our target is just over 10 000 units annually and we evict people like we are sweeping away dead flies in the coldest of seasons. Madiba was about peace and equality. How do we then explain the DA's silence on all the race related attacks in this province? [Interjections.]

Madam Premier, I have a copy of the open letter to you. You still need to respond, in case you have not received it. The DA rejected a motion by the EFF three sittings ago to come up with programmes and campaigns to combat racism and act on them. This speaks volumes!

Madiba has always emphasised the importance of an educated nation, yet this

government was quick to try and close about 27 schools and cares less about the fate of the over 45% who drop out. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Paulsen, your time has expired.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you very much. [Time expired.] ... [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: You did not like that. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Madam Premier, Order! Is that a point of order, Madam Premier?

The PREMIER: The hon member Mr Paulsen for the EFF said that he wanted me to respond to a question. I am very happy to do so if you will give me an opportunity to do that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier, unfortunately we cannot do it now. This is Statements by Members. I see the next one is the DA again.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The 2014 festive season is upon us and it comes with the end of the school year and the much anticipated December school holiday. In this time children are afforded a

break from school, which means they have more free time on their hands.

In this period they are not occupied with the positive sporting activities and valuable life lessons provided by the MOD centres at different schools in our community.

It is for this reason that I call on parents, caregivers and the community as a whole to look after the most vulnerable in our society. I encourage all role-players to incorporate cultural practices with children, teach them games you played as children, or simply visit one of the many heritage sites across the province.

I also encourage parents to engage in sporting activities with the youth, keep them active, occupied and mostly safe. We are *Better Together* and we all have a role to play when it comes to the safeguarding of our children because it does in fact take a village to raise a child. It is heartening to know that the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport is going the extra mile in providing cultural and sporting activities to the youth in the Western Cape during the holidays.

Amongst others these will include baseball, soccer, volleyball, tag rugby, music workshops and life skills in places such as Athlone, Bonteheuwel, Ceres, Oudtshoorn and Koekenaap, to name a few areas.

That said, I wish all a happy, healthy festive season especially the children of

the province. I sincerely hope that they will be included and that this will contribute to the social cohesion of the Western Cape. I thank you.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, again the DA. Hon member Mr Joseph.

[Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On Friday past it was announced in the Cape Town Magistrate's Court ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just one second. Is that a point of order, a question, what is it?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, is it parliamentary for a member of the DA to ask me to leave this House before it gets dark? [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! That is not a point of order. That is a frivolous interjection or comment. Please continue hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: On Friday past it was announced in the Cape Town Magistrate's Court that Mr Andre van Deventer was found guilty referring to Ms Gloria Kente about a racial comment and he said, he quoted, "It was pathetic because he stole our land."

The Equality Court found Mr Van Deventer guilty of hate speech and

harassment and ordered him to pay R50 000 and apologise. The lady wants not just an apology to herself, but she wanted Mr Van Deventer to apologise to the public.

These unwelcome incidents of racism and any form of discrimination must be condemned in the strongest terms. Every single case of abuse must be highlighted together with any form of discrimination irrespective of race, gender, religion, culture or association.

Ons kan nie toelaat dat na 20 jaar van demokrasie wat ons bereik het en met nasiebou dat enkele voorvalle van diskriminasie toelaat dat dit ongedaan gemaak word nie.

The DA promotes the rule of law, independence of the justice system that will ensure that our democratic values are protected. Given our history of a divided past we must promote tolerance amongst each other and we are mandated by our voters to show leadership in nation building, respectful diversity and support programmes that underlie the Bill of Rights. I thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do you not want to walk out?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. There is one more from the DA. Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Today's [inaudible] is very pertinent. In February this year the ANC councillors disrupted the City of Cape Town's council meeting in objection to the draft Budget being tabled. ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Chaos erupted and draft budgets were thrown across the floor.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Order! What is that hon member Mr Paulsen?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would just like to know from the honourable ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you want to ask a question? Order! Order! Order hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: ... hon member Ms Schäfer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Why she gave herself [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: That is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you want to ask her a question?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have to get her permission first.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: She is not prepared. Please take your seat.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Chaos erupted and draft budgets were thrown across the floor. Mock AK47s were waved in the air and council had to be adjourned for more than two hours. Yet this is the tenth consecutive year that the City of Cape Town has received an unqualified audit [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Inaudible.] when you have real AK47s.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: A record for any metro council in South Africa...  
[Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Inaudible.] should have real AK47s.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The awards list for a DA-run City is so long that they

have a special page dedicated on their website just for achievements and awards. Many of these awards are awarded by National Government.  
[Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Inaudible.] and awarded.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...such as the best Metro ranking in top housing; the Finance Directorate named as Top International Performer; Top Municipality for Water and Electricity Services; Top MFA Award; MyCiTi recognised as world leader in universal access. Disruption has continued in the City of Cape Town's council with Mayor De Lille stating that the ANC has complete disregard for the important work of council and the fact that they appeared determined to waste rate-payers money. I could not agree more. ANC obstructionist tactics... [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Inaudible.] The DA spent R60 000 on a Bosberaad.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...continue in this Parliament too. Another such example is seen in this very place. ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The DA [Inaudible.] spend R60 000 on a Bosberaad.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Setting the tone for this is member Sharon Davids who is often absent from her parliamentary duties. Hon member Ms Davids' failure to consistently attend committee meetings is a sure sign that she is not

committed to the workings of this Parliament in the interest of the people of the Western Cape.

Hon member Mr Tyatyam is on record to have them agree to the public hearings and to Minister Gigaba addressing the Standing Committee. We also have on record hon member Mr Magaxa who supported the annual report for housing, yet backtracking because he was given his orders. In fact the ANC's left hand does not know what the right hand is doing and lately we are seeing the majority party in national Parliament accusing the Democratic Alliance of being disruptive, this following the obvious efforts by the national Parliament to assist President Jacob Zuma in his efforts to avoid accountability for the Nkandla Gate. As the PERO so aptly put it, the "e-Zuma virus strikes again."

'n AGBARE LID: Dis waar.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The ANC can show very little successes here and the obstructionist behaviour only further exposes the ANC's desperate need of leadership at all levels. Their political infighting with those within the Youth League and that with the Gauteng Premier will only get worse. Soon the ducks will find other ponds to swim in. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Schäfer, your time has expired. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Order! Order! That brings us to the end of Members' Statements. We now move on to Motions. Are there any motions

where notice is given? Nothing? We then move on. Are there any Motions without Notice, hon member Ms Wenger.

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Bitou Community Police Forum under the leadership of Mr Bruce Richardson as well as the organisers of the Plett Rage Festival. This event sees some 12 000 matriculants visit the small town of Plettenberg Bay for 10 days of fun. The local community has put in place numerous and innovative security measures to help keep the youth safe during this period of merrymaking. Their efforts should be commended.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

Mr B D KIVEDO: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its condolences to the families of the 36 workers who were murdered while asleep in Mandera County, Kenya.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that SASCOC terminated the membership of the Western Cape Sports Confederation. We urge all parties to urgently remedy the situation to ensure that no sporting code in the Western Cape is negatively affected.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without

notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the International Convention Centre's Chief Executive Officer, Julie-May Ellingson, for winning the esteemed title of "Africa's most Influential Woman in the Public Enterprises Sector" recently. Ms Ellingson was one of over 11 500 nominations received from 43 African counties. Ms Ellingson was also recognised as one of the top 40 women in the Meetings, Incentives, Conferences and Exhibitions Industry in September 2014.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Namibian Government for becoming the first country on the continent to conduct general elections electronically. I so move, thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House moves appropriate action to be taken against Herman Kruger who chased a service provider out of his office, uttering the words, “ Get your ‘black ass’ out of my office and I do not speak to...” using that horrible “K-word” on the 21 of November 2014.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without

notice?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: I object.

An HON MEMBER: Do you know whether it has been proved or not?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Are you objecting to that?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: I object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be printed on the Order Paper. Any further?  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further motions? [Interjections.] Hon member  
Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Maverick Trading, a 100% black owned company that specialises in polymer concrete products and contributes 100 jobs to the Western Cape economy, with the Western Cape Exporter of the Year Award.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any further? Any further motions? That then concludes Motions. We continue. Hon member Mr Mnqasela, what was that?

Mr M MNQASELA: A motion, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are rather late.

Mr M MNQASELA: No I raised the hand, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow you. Please continue.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is that member there.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the successful launch of the Working on Fire Programme in Stellenbosch yesterday, in order to provide support to municipalities and all fire victims during the fire prone season in the

Western Cape.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, do you also want one?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please go ahead.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the Class of 2014 all the best for 2015 and hopes none will have to strike and burn down schools, so that their right to education is realised.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection? It will be printed on the Order Paper. Any further motions, for the last time, no further motions? Hon member Mr Paulsen?

Mr M N PAULSEN: What is wrong with [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, was that your last one?

Mr M N PAULSEN: My last one, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then finish with Motions. We continue with the Order Paper. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

## **ORDER OF THE DAY**

Consideration of principle of *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill*

[B 5 – 2014] (Minister of Finance).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think it is most unfortunate that it seems the ANC can only function in an atmosphere

of chaos and only perform when the cameras are here, but it certainly does create ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Is the camera's working?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...an atmosphere of peace and quiet and law and order and it just goes to show that where the ANC is absent we have law, order and productivity.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Today we debate the Adjustment Appropriation ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: That is very unfair.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...of the Western Cape Province against the background of a failing National Government and a failing ANC. Even the President admits it.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The contrast between the performance of National Government and the performance of the Western Cape is startlingly obvious and it is easy to see why the National Government is becoming

increasingly paranoid. It seems that they are running out of ideas as fast as our country is running out of money. We take no joy in that quite frankly. It is a matter of serious concern, but when we have a crisis it is necessary to accurately analyse the cause of the problem and use all available resources at our disposal to try and fix it. Instead we see the ANC-led National Government doing exactly the obvious. We have a President who is too scared to appear before Parliament to answer questions as he is constitutionally mandated to do.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Yes.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: This is hardly surprising.

Mr M N PAULSEN: What has this got to do with the Adjustment Appropriation Bill?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Excuse me, I am talking now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, that will be ...  
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: This is hardly surprising ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, the Chair will decide that. Just listen carefully.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Chair, I am getting there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: This is hardly surprising. He cannot even make a speech.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Make me.

An HON MEMBER: Come on!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Oh my word, hon member Mr Paulsen. This is hardly surprising. The President is scared to come to Parliament. He cannot even make a speech at the ANC Youth League Congress Consultative Conference without being censured by Gwede Mantashe.

Perhaps he has been kept out of Parliament deliberately to avoid him taking one foot out of his mouth to replace it with another.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear! ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: You must stop this obsession with Jacob Zuma and the ANC.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Stop the obsession with me while I am speaking. We have state owned enterprises [Interjections.] [Laughter.] ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No, I certainly do not.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Please continue Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We have state owned enterprises that are failing year after year and being bailed out with our money. [Interjections.] ...yet at no stage does the government seem to say: "Let us consider the possibility that just maybe this isn't working. Let us see how we can do things differently."

Instead we see denials and scrambling around trying to keep things hidden from us such as the real state of Eskom, the real state of the SABC, the real state of SAA and even the real state of the economy and with the paranoia comes an increasing fear of competition. When we look at the performance of the Western Cape it is quite clear from the Auditor-General's report that we are doing a good job.

We have 78% of our departments achieving clean audits with the rest unqualified. The closest province to us was Gauteng with 54%. You will not see money here hon member Mr Paulsen, in the Budget, for fire pools or chicken coups at public representative's private residences, nor unaffordable

trillion rand secret nuclear deals. You will see money for service delivery of which about 80% goes to the poor and as the vast disparity between the Western Cape and other provinces becomes increasingly clearer with the local government elections looming the paranoia of the ruling party is intensifying. They are being terrified of competition as they quite rightly fear being shown up. It thus becomes critical to control the messages that go out to the public as well as the Budget.

As a result we are seeing increasing attempts to interfere in or centralise powers that constitutionally belong to provinces. Recently a letter dated 23<sup>rd</sup> of September 2014 was sent directly to the principals of several schools in the Western Cape by the DBE informing them that the national Minister will be visiting their school on a specified date to collect information on key aspects that impact on school and district functionality and to monitor implementation of the IQMS for 2013. The principals were instructed to be available and provide a list of evidence like they were under some kind of interrogation of over 20 different items from class registers to furniture.

Mr M N PAULSEN: You have to liven up yourself.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Apart from the lack of protocol in not even informing my or the Premier's Office of the intended visit and only informing the HOD at the last minute, this interrupted teaching and learning and our principals have complained. Why did she not ask the officials in the WCED who are appointed and paid for this purpose, for the information?

Surely she has more pressing issues to deal with.

There are ongoing references now to uniform messages, standardisation and sector responses. This is a clear attempt to avoid provinces speaking out on their own and obviously the more the ANC can control the messages that go out the more they can hide from the increasingly despondent public about what is really going on.

Mr M N PAULSEN: This is supposed to be about this Appropriation Bill.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We all know about Mr Hlaudi Happy News Motsoeneng, whose contract has just been extended by the deeply compromised SABC Chairperson, Ellen Tshabalala with the invisible BCom degree and post-graduate diploma in labour relations.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister Schäfer, I am just allowing the hon member Mr Paulsen to raise a point of order about relevance.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, how is this relevant to the Adjustment Appropriation Bill? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We will explain it to you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I will explain it to you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: No, you are taking [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Paulsen, you address the Chair when you ask the questions. Minister Meyer, do you also want to address me on that?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think you can explain to the hon member Mr Paulsen what is the significance of a second reading debate, and it is on the Order Paper for the member's reference. I would like to read it to him so that he can fully understand what we are busy with. [Interjections.] No, it is on the Order Paper. You asked for the relevance.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order Minister Meyer, is that a point of order that you are raising?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It is a point of order. The relevance of this debate is "oorweging van die beginsel" and in the second reading debate it is a "political debate" so the hon Minister Schäfer may proceed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, Minister Meyer, I was going to say the same, except to say that it must also relate to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill. It has developed over the years that we go very wide but I want us to come back to the core of what it is really about. It is a wide

political debate but it is not a national debate. It is a provincial debate, but please continue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am contrasting the principles of how the Western Cape manages our finances versus that of National Government.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Absolutely!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Now we will go back to what I was saying. We all know about Mr Hlaudi Happy News Motsoeneng whose contract has just been extended by the deeply compromised SABC Chairperson, Ellen Tshabalala with the invisible BCom degree and post-graduate diploma in labour relations.

As a result of cadre deployment rather than the appointment of people with suitable skills the Happy News is also under threat because the SABC, like Eskom, has not bothered to maintain its infrastructure with the money they received. So it now becomes even more necessary to control provincial communication.

In November 2013 we had a Treasury Circular encouraging provinces to allow national to buy their communications for them. Why? So they can continue propping up the 'Gupta Gazette' or perhaps it is another fund to plunder now that the others have all but run out. Obviously this affects the

province's budget.

Now we have heard that there is a policy in the pipeline that will centralise all media buying at a national level which is not only a gross abuse of power but also undermines the strength of the free media, one of the most crucial institutions in our democracy.

This is one excellent way of ensuring that National Government controls all of the communications budget as well as the message that goes out and that means our communications budget in the province will be affected. That will certainly avoid this irritating DA-run province from being able to show them up.

The President has also established the National Education Collaboration Trust in an attempt to co-ordinate, recentralise private sector CSI funding under the purportedly noble objective of improving education.

Unsurprisingly the private sector is showing reluctance to contribute to this trust in the absence of proper plans.

In the Western Cape even with the drastic cuts we are going to have to make in our Budget, we are doing everything to maintain frontline services in education, health and social development. It is bad enough that we have to make these cuts because of the ANC's disastrous economic policies but now that National Government has also squandered billions on corruption and

mismanagement, unlike the Western Cape, they are trying to justify inappropriate and unacceptable moves on the grounds that they will save money.

An example of this is the ill-conceived proposal that is disastrous for inter alia our publishers and that is the single State textbook. It appears that the Minister was softening a bit on this issue until I read late last week that the DBE has announced that textbooks for the 2016 school year which normally takes an absolute minimum of six months to produce, have to be submitted by the 16<sup>th</sup> of January 2015, failing which they will not be included in the catalogue.

Of course the Department will have the State textbook ready and it is possible that no other textbooks will be ready in time, or they will have to be rushed and will be of an inferior quality. This can then be used to justify the fact that only one textbook is suitable for the catalogue and the objective will have been achieved. What a farce. This is simply the single State textbook by stealth. Never mind the publishers that could go out of business or have to retrench staff, thus continuing our economic downward spiral in the province and the country, and never mind the quality of our education. The ANC would rather sacrifice freedom of choice and the economy for control at all costs.

The DBE has also been talking of centralising procurement, which we currently do in our provincial budgets and ensuring that stationery and

textbooks are delivered by the South African Post Office of all places. At that rate the materials might just be delivered at the end of the school year, if they pay their staff.

In the Western Cape we have used our Budget to negotiate deals with publishers which include delivery and it is working very well. We are committed to bringing quality education to all our learners and we will not compromise on that.

The DBE is also very nobly offering Funza Lushaka Bursaries to people who wish to study teaching, but even this is a subtle form of control over what is happening in the provinces, as they decide who receive the bursaries. They decide who receive the bursaries with no input from the provinces and then they pressurise provinces to place these teachers and of course we have to pay their salaries.

It is understandable that we do not wish to waste money that the State has spent on training these teachers, but our information is that the quality of some of the bursary holders are not what we would like. By pressurising provinces to choose these people it deprives other possibly better teachers of an opportunity to find a post. This ultimately compromises our learners. The DBE is even now saying that if the bursary holders are not placed in a province they will place them in other provinces. Since when does the national department have the authority to place teachers?

Another department that is the target of centralisation attempts is the Department of Social Development. I am advised that the national Minister of Social Development is pushing for the draft Social Development Council Bill, which would turn Minmec into an executive decision-making body; the decisions of which would be binding on provinces. We believe that her legal advisors have informed her that this would be unconstitutional but she is apparently still wishing to pursue it. This is hardly surprising. The ANC is not exactly a fan of the rule of law and due process. We have seen it in Parliament. We have seen it with the President's reaction to Nkandla, the Guptas, Schabir Shaik and Jackie Selebi and of course we have noted with increasing alarm the evisceration of the NPA to protect the President's own special and very personal interests.

In the Health Department the ultimate centralisation proposal is the National Health Insurance, which will in its current form centralise health services, currently a concurrent competence, and reduce the provinces to NHI offices. The centralisation of the procurement of pharmaceutical products has led to stock-outs in the Western Cape because of poor contractual administration and in the Department of Community Safety, even though it has very limited powers, one important one that it does have is to have input into the National Policing Priorities. Yet, year after year the national priorities bear no resemblance whatsoever to those identified by the province after a comprehensive consultation process.

Centralisation generally does not work. It creates opportunities for corruption

to be centralised on a grand scale and is usually inefficient. We have seen how our National Government has destroyed our parastatals and most of our departments. Our Constitution provides for separate and distinct spheres of government with their own budgets and we will insist that our powers are respected.

We will also continue to ensure that our successes are communicated far and wide until the voters allow us the opportunity to run the national departments in the same way as we do in the Western Cape; free of corruption in a transparent and cost effective way for the benefit of all who live in it. Thank you.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, alvorens ek begin met my betoë wou ek graag vriendelik verneem of ek miskien die tyd wat geallokeer is aan... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die PREMIER: Hoe nou?

Mnr B D KIVEDO: ...agb lid me Beerwinkel ook mag neem, asseblief.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Kivedo, u het net ses minute en u het

klaar 'n minuut daarvan gebruik, so...

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Jammer. Ek gaan spesifiek hierdie toespraak in Afrikaans lewer, gegewe die feit dat die ANC Afrikaans minag en dit is ook 'n ode aan Blade Nzimande spesifiek. 'n Mislukte staat of 'n mislukkende staat, dit is nie die land wat misluk het nie, maar die ANC self.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dit is nie my skuld dat die ANC nie die vermoë het om te kan onderskei tussen 'n staat en 'n party nie. Dit is hulle eie probleem en dit is meer as semanties. Dis 'n kognitiewe probleem. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die feit van die saak is dat Jacob Zuma dit self gesê het dat die ANC is in diep moeilikheid. “Ons is aan die skud en aan die bewoë en ons moet introspeksie neem van onself.”

Dit is 'n aanduiding dat hy sê ons is 'n swak, brose, fragiele, sukkelende, mislukkende staat.

'n AGBARE LID: Suid-Afrika is baie mooi. Dis pragtig [Onduidelik.]

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Die feit is hierdie is ook 'n noodkreet aan die ‘Zuma Beskermingsvereniging’, dié wat hom staande moet bly hou dat hy kan voorgee dat hy kan beweeg tussen politieke struktuur en die sosiale kultuur

van die land. Hy kan nie navigeer tussen die twee nie. Daarom is hy waar hy is. [Tussenwerpsels.] Daarom moet hy in sy bunker gaan versoening en ook troos vind. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die feit van die saak is Johan Rupert het gesê: “Bankrotskap hoop stadig maar seker op, maar die einde daarvan is dodelik en skielik.” Amen. [Gelag.]

Daar is besliste tekens van 'n mislukte staat wat die ANC is. Hy is in die eerste plek verrot tot in die kern. Hy laat geen dissidente toe nie. Enige een wat teenspraak het word uitgeneem *ala Marikana*. So jy moet jou mond hou in die oë van Zuma.

Mnr M N PAULSEN: Daarmee stem ek saam.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Daar is geen maatskaplike hegting nie. Daar is vrees. Die armes word afgeskeep. Daar is vergrype en daar is die hele Kodesa-idee en daarom glo ek vandag Kodesa was die afkorting vir “Kom ons deel en steel alles.”

'n AGBARE LID: Die ANC beleid.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Die Speaker van die nasionale party is ook lid van die beskermingsvereniging van Zuma. Bedags is sy die voorsitter van die ANC maar sy ‘moonlight’ as 'n deeltydse Speaker. Dis haar ‘casual job’. Dis haar stukwerk, en dan sit ons met 'n kreperende demokrasie, wat hulle eie skepping

is, 'n vallende Eskom pikdonker. Want Maandae skree hulle: "Hire me!"  
 Vrydae skree hulle: "Fire me!"

"I wanted to stay on in Eskom. I have the passion, maar ek soek die severance package." [Gelag.]

Telkom - ons is een van die dae terug by "Nommer Asseblief!" met 'n slingerfoontjie. Die SAA het nie meer vlerke nie. SABC saai nie meer uit nie. Sanral se spore het nou opgepak. Die Poskantoor se sakke is leeg. Jy gaan nie 'n Kersgeskenk kry nie. En wat van al die Gates? They are on their way to the gate of hell. The Gupta Gate, the Nkandla Gate, the Schabir Shaik Gate and all the Gates! [Laughter.] Die feit van die saak is die ANC moet beseef of hy dit wil weet of nie... [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: The other gate is the housing gate.

'n AGBARE LID: Ja.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dit word voorgegee dat hierdie... [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: The housing gate, stolen money!

Mnr B D KIVEDO: ...JZ in beheer is van die land. Hy het beheer verloor. Dis 'n verskansing. Dit is hoe 'n diktatorskap lyk. Ons kan opkyk na die noorde en vaskyk in die bril van Bob Mugabe. Daar is geen verskil nie. Daarom soek al

hoe meer en meer mense die skoon regering van die DA, deursigtigheid, verantwoordelikheid, verantwoordbaarheid en ook 'n oop geleentheid tot selfs by die EVV [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Ja.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: ...tot selfs by die “rooi keppies.”

'n AGBARE LID: Ja.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Vir die ACDP, vir elkeen wat aan skoon regering wil deelneem is die geleentheid daar. Ek wil ter afsluiting sê, wat vandag gebeur het is 'n aanduiding van die verdwyning van die ANC geheel en al.

An HON MEMBER: They can walk out [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dit begin so. Dit begin eers in die Raadsaal. Hulle is besig om te verdwyn, te verdamp, soos mis voor die son. [Tussenwerpsels.] Die einde is naby.

Johan Rupert het gesê: “Die bankrotskap kom skielik en hy is dodelik.”

Baie dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor, mooi-mooi! [Applous.]

An HON MEMBER: Very nice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I rise in support of this Adjustment Appropriation Bill. We have reached a key point as a government in this province wherein we now have to increasingly focus our efforts and re-prioritise. This Adjustments Appropriation Bill helps us do this or do just that [Interjections] ....

Mr M N PAULSEN: The mandate is bigger than that.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: This Bill is about shifts and it is a pity that the ANC is not here because I think one of the issues that we find is people do not understand that this is the adjustment period, and this is the Adjustments Appropriation Bill. It is about shifts and how and where we have allocated funds. [Interjections.] The amount overall remains the same - get that into our heads. Thus, the shifting of funds still falls within our emphasis on efficient government and good governance. After all this is what the majority of Western Cape voters who gave us an electoral mandate asked from us, especially given how the past ANC government failed them spectacularly in this regard.

As the Department of Social Development we have experienced significant

Budget pressures. The primary source stems from decisions made by the National Government on condition of services, like those salary increases that we did not budget for which were made without additional funding being provided to cover them. The Budget shortfall for compensation of employees has mainly been within Programme Two where the service delivery staff is located. That is an important point.

Other funds have been shifted to re-prioritise statutory obligations and sharply improve the quality of services rendered. As we study this Adjustment Appropriation Bill, we need to consistently remind ourselves that as the Department of Social Development we have statutory obligations on our Budget which places considerable stress on the Budget. But in my view they are welcome additional obligations on this Department. Some of the statutory obligations referred to are within; the Children's Act, the Child Justice Act, the Older Persons Act, the Prevention and Treatment of Substance Abuse Act and I can go on. These are just some pieces of legislation which are mandatory for the Department to implement and come at great cost to do so.

The Department has had to shift away R7 million from the ECD Programme. This has been due primarily to many of our NGO partners running ECD Centres not complying with national legislation and norms and standards within that sector, in terms of the Children's Act.

In addition, the Department dealt with situations of poor accounting of funds

that had been paid over and some of the NGOs could not prove the impact they have claimed to have made. In order to ensure the continued care and protection of children, the funds were shifted into our child and youth care centres. I think this is a very important point for honourable members to note. This has proved invaluable especially given the high referral rates to our child and youth care centres at the moment. The extra funding has been instrumental in helping maintain the high norms and standards as per the Act.

The Appropriation Adjustment Bill is in line with our drive as a department to consolidate services and improve our systems and as a department we know all too well what it means to aim, to make the greatest impact on finite resources, few resources, meneer verkleurmannetjie. The Budget shortfall within goods and services were mainly within Programmes Two and Four and the projected overspending relates to the increase in security services and importantly, compliance to the norms and standards within places of safety.

On this note I would like to re-emphasise the point that compliance with statutory regulations comes at a great cost and we are obliged to comply. Thus the shifts have been in favour of key areas addressing childcare and protection, parcel care, substance abuse, victim empowerment, disabilities and poverty alleviation – all these classes have seen an increase of spending over the last five years and we are very proud of that. The Adjustments Appropriation Bill should also be viewed in the context of a whole of society approach, as a department. No government can address the myriad of issues faced by society alone. The approach involves all spheres of government and

builds partnerships with the private sector, NGOs, communities and individuals. The Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill will be delivered in real and tangible ways by our Department, in partnership with our NGOs and various community based initiatives. The NGO sector plays a major role in helping build a self-reliant society and the Department has increased funding to NGOs over the past five years to just over R946 million, almost R1 billion.

The question is: are we getting return on our investment and that is the hard question we must ask? However, they have to undergo fundamental transformations especially in the light of the re-prioritisation of funds. These changes are important if we are to empower and serve our communities better. We have greatly strengthened our capacity to manage the funding of NGOs, to render social services on behalf of the Provincial Department. If NGOs are not delivering or complying with the norms and standards then we act and I want to emphasise we will act. The days of funding NGOs for the sake of funding them are long gone and our approach is heavily skewed towards outcome based, impact driven and monitoring of NGOs impact.

Indeed our driving resulted in the Financial and Fiscal Commission in their submission for the 2014/2015 division of revenue, filing that our Department spends the bigger portion of the Budget, which is 68% on transfer of payments to the NGOs, than any other province in this country and we are incredibly proud of that.

In line with the Appropriation Adjustments the Department is well into the process of rationalising and applying strict impact and outcome based assessments of our NGOs. Our system allows us to be able to identify irregular financial transactions by NGOs we find, and more importantly spot possible corruption and fraudulent conduct. As we consider this Adjustments Bill, which effectively sees the Department re-prioritise funds, we cannot allow any scenarios to exist where public funds are being misappropriated by anybody. Every Rand counts. It is important that strict governance criteria and financial management practices are complied with and when it comes to NGO funding especially, as it is the public's funds that are being used and that this Department manages, we shall not apologise for being very, very strict on that. Indeed, our view is supported by many funding institutions such as the Mandela Childrens Fund and private owners I have met with recently, to discuss issues related to the impact of NGO investments and the impact of NGOs in our communities.

The consensus is clear, NGOs need to work smarter and build partnerships to deliver. As a department the major reasons for under-spending have been due to non-compliance by NGOs and this Appropriation and the Appropriation Adjustments deal with that. Our initiative as a department has borne fruit and the clean audit achieved in the last financial year is testament to this and this is what the hon member Ms Gillion must get into her head; it is only through accountability and proper systems that we deliver better.

In conclusion, I would like to say that the Department of Social Development

will deliver on this Adjustments Appropriation Bill and we will continue to seek increasingly efficient ways to deliver to our communities. NGOs too will play a crucial role in this regard and we can address the many social ills that face this province by working better together. Thank you. [Applause.]

AGB LEDE: Hoor-hoor!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is a pity there are 30 minutes going to waste and I only get three. Last week I referred to those Band-aid departments, yours is one of them MEC Fritz, who failed to address the conditions created by centuries of exploitation and oppression. Needless to say, under the prevailing economic order or disorder, that is all they will ever be; Band-aids [Interjections.] I refer to Health, Education, Human Settlements, Community Safety and Social Development.

Thanks to this Adjustments Bill, Education and Health will now be even bigger Band-aids. Now if you had the will to change the conditions of our people you would adjust the Budget which would seek to address firstly the landlessness and homelessness [Interjections] of our people and secondly our lack of access to economic opportunities. Here is what you do instead; in Agriculture you glorify the landlessness of our people with awards like Farmworker of the Year [Interjections],

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM : We need them.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Speak of wasteful expenditure or rather expenditure just to insult black people [Interjections.] Through Wesgro you create and maintain new channels for white owned business and bemoan the fact that the new immigration regulations limit the steady influx of the occasional settlers from Europe. The only industry where blacks dominate, the taxi industry, is the latest target of this Western Cape Government's own wrecking ball, MEC Mr Grant. [Interjections.] Not content with having terrorised black families with threats and attempts of closing down their schools, he has now turned his focus to the taxi industry. You now have the traffic police as part of your portfolio and there is a marked increase in the number of fines issued to taxi drivers. You even intend impounding taxis. [Interjections.]

This is of course to pave the way for the expansion of the City of Cape Town's MyCiti Bus project. Yes, hon member Ms Schäfer, let us do things differently. I agree. Should we not be investing money in educating and training of taxi operators and the upgrading of taxi ranks rather? It is more than just families of taxi operators who will be victims, like those 26 families in Wynberg and Plumstead whose homes will be demolished. [Interjections.]

This is not just about a bus route, it is more about feeding the appetite of white monopoly capital. [Interjections.] The proposed route would put

R4,1 billion of tax and ratepayers' money into the pockets of white monopoly capital [Interjections.] MEC Grant's department is getting an extra R48 million to wreak this havoc [Interjections.]

The Economic Freedom Fighters wish to put on record that in 20 years of neo-liberal policies, along with the rationale underlying the appropriation of budgets, the conditions of poor people have not been addressed. There are solutions to all these social ills but it is going to be a case of "you can't teach an old dog new tricks". We should start to build capacity in this government [Interjections] that will eventually lead to the abolishment of that corrupt system of tenders. Yes, it is corrupt. Let us [Interjections.] show confidence in our ability to deliver an efficient operation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order hon member Mr Paulsen. Minister Winde is that a point of order ?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM : Mr Deputy Speaker, will the hon member Mr Paulsen take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr M N PAULSEN: No thank you. [Interjections.] Let us show confidence in

our ability to deliver an efficient operation that can deliver services to our people. The establishment of a provincial construction company is long overdue. Let us train [Interjections.] people to build hospitals, homes, schools and construct highways that will lead us to truly integrated communities. We do believe that it will take a courageous government to sever ties with white monopoly capital. If this DA dominated government does not have the courage then the people of the Western Cape will elect a government that does. [Interjections.] [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Hon member Mr Paulsen. Your time has expired [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: [Interjections.] Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Now I understand why the Economic Freedom Fighters will never govern. [Interjections.] I understand why the Western Cape voters have rejected parties like the EFF. [Interjections.]

Ms B SCHÄFER: Exactly.

Mr M MNQASELA: Because there is just [Interjections.] nothing to listen to. You were given three minutes and you said nothing. [Interjections.] We have seen how the EFF, in fact even when they sponsor debates themselves, they do not know, they have no clue what to say [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Now, when you consider this Adjustments Budget, our intention is to ensure that the people of the Western Cape, from all corners, can begin to enjoy ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... the benefits of voting rights. We want to say to them; we will not let them down, we want to say to them; you voted the right way, we want to say to them; your money is safe, we spend it wisely, and you know unlike the EFF ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: On contracts. You spend money on contractors.

Mr M MNQASELA: The leader of the EFF was sitting in the National Assembly [Interjections.] when he was leading the ANC Youth League. They had what is called “On Point” in Limpopo. That has left a legacy of very bad governance in that province [Interjections.] and the effects are still felt to date. Right now I can tell you ...

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon member Mr Paulsen, you will get your chance!

Mr M MNQASELA: We are sitting here in a province where last week when we dealt with this Appropriation Budget, the Adjustments Budget, we said let us ensure that we prioritise key services. [Interjections.] We have said for instance, dealing with local government, we understand the importance of the community development worker unit as part of a very important programme in reaching out to communities, in ensuring that communities have a platform within which to raise their concerns but also ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Which platform?

Mr M MNQASELA: But also a programme to respond to community demands, through facilitating what we call transversal programmes. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No one said that [Inaudible].

Mr M MNQASELA: And through the same unit. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] thing all the time.

Mr M MNQASELA: No you can haggle until you get tired. Through the same unit [Interjections.] we are able to deal with the programme of Thusong where we have mobile units throughout this province of the Western Cape, even the far flung areas [Interjections.] to Ceres, to Lamberts Bay, to Bitou [Interjections.] ...

An HON MEMBER: Bitou.

Mr M MNQASELA: Yes, to Pearly Beach, to Beaufort West, to Laingsburg. I am talking about the most remote places in this province. We are able to reach out to [Interjections.] and address the concerns of people. We are bringing many departments to these Thusong Programmes and we are saying no more shall people in rural areas in the province feel that they are far from services – we want to bring them closer. So this Appropriation is helping because it is an Adjustments Budget to ensure that we are able to reach where it hurts the most. [Interactions.] I am very happy that at least this province is one province that can give hope [Interjections.] to the people of this province and it is a province that will become a catalyst to the many hopeless South Africans who wish that one day when they open their taps, the water turns blue. [Interactions.] Because the problem in this country ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which budget, my [Inaudible.] budget ...

Mr M MNQASELA: The ANC that is the ruling party in South Africa, they tend to believe that they own black people [Interjections.], they think they own the poor masses of this country ...

An HON MEMBER: White people or black people ?

Mr M MNQASELA: That is why the EFF will never rule [Interjections.] because you come from the same vessel. The only reason why you are

wearing a red uniform is because you have been thrown out of the door because of ill-discipline where you come from [Interjections.] otherwise you would be wearing green, gold and black [Interjections.] so do not come blame us.

An HON MEMBER: What colours?

Mr M MNQASELA: I am very happy that we are able to provide support to municipalities through what we call the Western Cape Treasury's Municipality Governance Outlook ("WEMGO") which is a process that is designed to improve clean governance in municipalities, and over and above that what we have been able to witness in this programme is an important aspect of concentrating on governance and monitoring evaluation and support, where we have what we call the IDP Indaba Programme on the five districts and the Metropolitan Municipality of Cape Town. We have never seen that anywhere else in this country where the provincial government comes to the districts and says let us look at your IDP, let us look at your programmes that you have approved as the municipality, and ensure that we align them and ensure that you provide consistent support.

Over and above that, because of the transversal nature of the Department led by Minister Anton Bredell, you have to do that kind of programme and support so that the money that has been allocated to municipalities is spent. Now you go around this country for instance to provinces like Gauteng where more than R800 million has been misappropriated on bad management, poor

leadership, on the three biggest metro's – Ekurhuleni, Tshwane and Johannesburg. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER : I agree with you.

Mr M MNQASELA : Because they are just thieves, they steal, they eat until their time has gone; like this, their backs go like this; their mouths are like this and then in they go like this; they cannot even walk that's how they steal [Interjections.] - like your commander in chief, he cannot walk. Now I am saying, I am particularly ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order !

Mr M MNQASELA : I am saying that I am particularly impressed with the manner in which we have dealt with this Appropriations Budget because this is what I call the “DA Grinding Blue Machine” [Interjections.] I did not mention red. Do not talk. The “Grinding Blue Machine”.

We are saying that in municipalities we need to ensure that you provide support on Human Resources Management - ensure that when you employ you do not employ people without skills, you employ people who will execute the mandate as it is defined in the Municipal Finance Management Act. And we are doing so because we are very much aware and conscious of the fact that this government is one big organisation [Inaudible.] this country because everybody when they look at the Western Cape they wish that they could

come and live here. That is why every year [Interjections.] you see more and more people wanting to come and stay here. It is not by coincidence. It is because people are conscious that government is better and life is better in the Western Cape than anywhere else in this country.

When you go around the world you read newspapers, you listen to the media, they say they wish something could come about in South Africa to change things around because investors are losing confidence in the country but there is more confidence in this province. You go around ... †ujikeleza ubone ukuba kuyakhiwa \*you go around and notice there is construction going on. †You know there is buildings going up whilst in other provinces buildings are going down. The money is safe. We have clean audits. In fact, this year 2013/2014, municipalities have delivered more than 50% on clean audits. You do not see it anywhere in this country. Be my guest EFF [Interjections.] if you are still there.

Now the point that might surprise you is that there is a hotline nationally that has been called the “Presidential Hotline”; I was particularly disappointed when I read that 179 326 queries have been logged [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Do not tell me. You must tell the ANC this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon member Mr Mnqasela your time has expired. Just finish off that point.

Mr M MNQASELA: Out of all of these none have been responded to adequately – less than 2%. Now I am worried because it says people next time will not vote for the ANC, they will reject you, thanks to the DA government in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Will you be here next year?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, please give the hon member Minister Meyer a chance to give his reply.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker en ook dankie vir die geleentheid om deel te neem aan die Tweede Lesingsdebat oor die Aansuiweringsbegroting. Soos u weet die Tweede Lesingsdebat is 'n politieke debat waar die breë beginsels bespreek word. Dankie aan al die lede wat deelgeneem het aan hierdie debat.

Die Tweede Lesingsdebat is ook 'n unieke geleentheid vir die verskillende politieke partye om die beginsels van hulle onderskeie partye in hierdie debat uit te dra. En hierdie regering se beginsels is die volgende:

Ons ondersteun die beginsels van 'n konstitusionele demokrasie want in 'n konstitusionele staat moet die regering van die dag en die uitvoerende gesag by monde van die Premier en die wetgewing en by monde van die President

en die Nasionale Vergadering rekenpligtig wees. Dit beteken dat die President vrae in die Huis moet beantwoord soos wat Premier Zille vandag in hierdie Huis gedoen het.

Secondly we are implementing the whole of society approach in this Adjustment Budget because this approach is followed to break through the silos and to maximise our collective impact in this government. We also follow the principle of evidence based practice as a government [Interjections.] As a government you work with taxpayers' money and you cannot have experimentation and failed projects.

Many members of the Opposition in this House, since May, have spoken in this House without any evidence and therefore they have left this House because they have no evidence to take part in this debate, so they are running out. As hon Minister Schäfer said; they are running out of ideas. We are a responsible government, not the SABC or a spaza shop. In the Adjustments Appropriation Bill you will clearly see the focus is on the citizens. Broadband e-government and e-education are all focusing on the end user, the citizens, in this Budget.

We are tabling the Bill in this Legislature because it will create public value, as opposed to President Zuma who is only interested in private value for himself and his family. Die agb lid mnr Kivedo is korrek en dankie vir daardie mooi Afrikaans. South Africa is not a failed state but as he pointed out the ANC is a failed party. Daar is egter gevaartekens in ons politieke

landskap. Mense weier om in Suid-Afrika te investeer as gevolg van die politieke leierskap van President Zuma en dit impakteer op die Begroting.

Suid-Afrika se staatsbeheerde korporasies moet meer doeltreffend bestuur word en baie van die openbare korporasies het reeds in duie gestort en miljoene rande word jaarliks gemors, Telkom, Eskom, die Suid-Afrikaanse Lugdiens en die SAUK.

Now I have news for the hon member Mr Paulsen. He has asked in this debate for a government construction company, well we have one. In the National Government it is called the National Department of Public Works. It is a state construction company, [Interjections.] only investing in Nkandla and building there. [Interjections.] You have said that you want more Nkandla's ...

An HON MEMBER: Outsource.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE : In this Adjustments Budget you are calling for more money for Nkandla state owned companies. There you have it. The hon member Mr Paulsen wants more state owned companies like Nkandla and the National Department of Public Works [Interjections.] That is what you have asked in this debate and we are going to keep you to that promise. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER : Ja.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES : Suid-Afrika se belastingbetalers kan nie meer bekostig om groot risikoprojekte te finansier nie want ons weet dat die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan propageer hernubare energie [Interjections.] terwyl die President en die kollegas aan daardie kant van die Huis propageer R1 triljoen se projekte vir kernkrag.

Die kultuur van “It’s our turn to eat” moet ook gestaak word want dit erodeer ons finansiële volhoubaarheid in Suid-Afrika. Kom ons kyk ‘n bietjie wat gebeur in ANC-provinsies, by die ANC Mompela Munisipaliteit.

They - in their report - are unable to meet their financial commitments and obligations. But look what the Mayor is doing in a municipality - rooi mannetjie luister. [Interjections.] Where they are unable to meet their financial commitments ... [Interjections.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde, daar is vantevore beslis dat daardie verwysing onparlementêr is. Jy moet net terugtrek. [Tussenwerpsels.] Orde, orde! Hon member Mr Paulsen, when the Chair speaks you remain quiet.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek vra saggies om verskoning.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Jy moet net terugtrek, dis al.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Ek trek terug.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Gaan voort.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: In 'n ANC munisipaliteit, waar die munisipaliteit nie sy finansiële verpligtinge kan nakom nie - the Mayor of that particular municipality, to this hon member in this House and the ANC watching on television, your ANC run municipality cannot meet their financial commitments but the Mayor spent R600,000 for the new Mayor's official home. So this is not for his office, this is at his private home. Now the ANC Mayor sees nothing wrong with this because he is merely following the example of Number One [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Skande!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE : State construction companies are what you have called for and this is what you are getting in that province. [Interjections.]

South Africa is in a constitutional, political, economical and fiscal crisis. The President knows this, the ANC knows this and certainly the voters know this. The crisis is here. [Interjections.] If there is still any doubt about the recent report of the eighth Auditor-General on the performance outcomes of the audits, it makes interesting reading.

Let me show you: in the Eastern Cape, irregular expenditure - R2,6 billion; Free State - R2,4 billion; KZN, where the President comes from, where they have a state owned construction company parked next to Nkandla, irregular expenditure - R4,3 billion [Interjections.]. Hon members, in Limpopo where the hon member - where you come from ... [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: I am not the ANC.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE : Limpopo, where your leader comes from.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I do not come from Limpopo.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE : Well, Mr Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM : I thought you were the ANC.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I was born in Cape Town.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE : Well... [Interjections.] where the leader of the EFF comes from. In the National Assembly, irregular expenditure [Interjections.] increased to R3,5 billion and we know who sits behind that. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon members, in Mpumalanga the irregular expenditure increased from R234 million [Interjections.] to R1 billion in the current year. Mr Deputy Speaker, hon members of this House, do yourselves a favour tonight, just go on Google and type in the words “ANC corruption” [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE : You will get in Google ... [Interjections.] Right listen, you did not know what this debate was about. [Interjections.] We had to lecture you and you have to sit now. Listen to what we are doing. You did not know what a secondary debate is. You do not know what this debate is about and you took part in this debate. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You were asking the hon member Ms Schäfer what the debate is about. [Interjection.] You have no idea what this debate is about so shut up!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, sit down please. Order, hon member Mr Paulsen. Hon Minister Meyer, that is unparliamentary. Withdraw please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE : I will withdraw but will continue to lecture

the hon member Mr Paulsen. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE : He does not know what a secondary debate is and we are lecturing him. After this debate there is a test for you online, on Google. Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer ... Hon member is that a question? [Interactions.] What is that? Order. Let me first hear from the Minister. Hon Minister Meyer, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No! If you type in the word, “ANC Corruption” in Google you will get 1,6 million hits on the site but the situation is much worse - that is on Google. If you search on another search engine – the Yahoo search engine - and you type in the word “ANC Corruption” it takes you to 30 million hits. [Interjections.] Well, I will not go there. You have seen about Limpopo ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: How was the DA [Inaudible.]?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE : The scale of corruption by the ANC [Interjections.] is costing the taxpayers and during the current fiscal crisis people are suffering and the ANC keeps on stealing taxpayers’ money. [Interjections.] The Auditor-General, as the hon Minister Schäfer has

indicated, gave the Western Cape 78% for clean audits; Gauteng 54% [Interjections.]

The hon member Ms Schäfer has today in this House worn a badge where she gave the President one out of ten. [Interjections.] The DA passed and the ANC failed the test. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Ek sluit af. Die ANC het vandag hier uit hierdie Huis gestap omdat hulle geen argumente in die debat kan voer nie. Hulle het die Ouditeur-Generaal se verslag gesien, hulle het gesien die Wes-Kaap se ouditverslag is op 78%, hulle het gesien die ANC en die President is in 'n krisis. Die ANC is nasionaal in 'n krisis maar in die Wes-Kaap is die ANC 'n ramp en hulle het nie die vermoë om die regering in die Wes-Kaap aanspreeklik te hou nie, daarom het hulle uitgestap. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dankie aan die agb lede wat in hierdie debat deelgeneem het.

My thanks to hon Minister Schäfer, hon member Mr Kivedo, hon Minister Fritz and the hon member Mr Mnqasela. Thank you for your contribution in this debate. I now request the House to approve the principle of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill tabled on the 20 November 2014, in this Legislature. I so move.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Meyer [Applause.]. That

concludes the debate on the consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the Principle of the Bill? No objections. [Interjections.] Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: I want a division.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You cannot ask for a division as a solitary member. You can record your objection. The objection of the EFF will be recorded. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House will deal with the separate votes from now onwards, that is, from tomorrow onwards. Can I just confirm before we adjourn that the outstanding rulings will be given as soon as they are ready. Tomorrow might be difficult due to the House starting early and the tight timeframes but if not tomorrow then certainly on Thursday.

Thank you. That brings us to the end of business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:55.