
THURSDAY, 2 JUNE 2016

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. [Interjection.] Order! We now proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the honourable the Minister.

An HON MEMBER: The Premier.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, the Premier, sorry Premier, my apologies. You see, hon member Mr Dyantyi talks about the Speaker and the Premier and he throws me completely off course. The honourable, the Premier.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

INTERPELLATIONS

Interpellation standing over from Thursday, 12 May 2016, as agreed to by the House:

Child-sex trade, reduction of

1. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Premier:

What programme is her Department implementing to reduce the increase in child-sex trade in the Western Cape?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Madam Speaker. This is a most serious issue and I reply as follows. As I have stated before in this House extensive legislative reform that establishes various structures and institutions providing for the safeguarding of children's rights has been implemented since the Provincial Constitution came into effect in 1998. Such legislative reform includes the passing of the Children's Act and the Child Justice Act. The objectives of these pieces of legislation are the following:

To provide protection to and care for children and to provide structures and services for promoting and monitoring the wellbeing of children and reform the Criminal Justice System to make provision for the protection of

vulnerable children and children with special needs.

Many of the powers required to be performed in terms of current provincial policy relating to children's issues are now in fact carried out by social workers whose powers are delegated to them by the head of the Department of Social Development and I would like to come to the role of the Department of Social Development because they inform me that they are addressing the challenge of the sexual exploitation of children through a specialist non-profit organisation that receives funding and implements programmes in three areas where the issue of child sexual exploitation has been found to be most prevalent. These are instances where children are found in truck stops and shebeens in the company of older male adults and then provided with drugs, alcohol or money in exchange for sexual activity.

The areas that have been prioritised are Atlantis, including Mamre, Witsand, Pella and Blouberg, Delft, including Mfuleni and the surrounding areas, Beaufort West including Leeu-Gamka, Prince Albert, Murraysburg and Nelspoort. With Beaufort West being a transit area, children tend to be most vulnerable as a result of the truck-stops there.

The target groups include both girls and boys between the ages of 10 and 18 years. However, it is noted that boys are reluctant to come forward to participate in the programme due to the perceived stigma and taboo that is associated with boys reporting sexual exploitation.

For 2015/16 a total of 469 children and 360 parents and adults participated in programmes that are aimed at preventing and addressing the critical issue of child sexual exploitation. The types of services or programmes often include public education about child sexual exploitation and trafficking, assessment services, therapeutic services, referrals to further services that is Child Protection Services where a need for statutory intervention is determined; ongoing support services to children and their parents and families and working with other stakeholders such as the Department of Justice, the National Prosecuting Authority, Sexual Offences Courts, Children's Courts, the South African Police Service, the Department of Education and the National Department of Social Development.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, your time has expired, thank you. I now see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Children's Summit was held in 1992, on the 27th May to the 1st of June, here in the Western Cape but it had children from all over South Africa; at that time it was the Eastern Cape, the Southern Cape, Northern Cape, Boland Border, Midland, Southern Natal, Northern Natal, South Orange Free State, Transkei, and Venda. All those children came to participate and give their input in relation to the negotiations of Codesa that were going to take place. They addressed their issues and handed their issues and their resolutions to the then head of International Relations of the ANC, Thabo Mbeki.

Article 5 of those resolutions, says: “All children have the right to be protected from all types of violence including physical, emotional, verbal, psychological, sexual, political, gang, domestic and racial violence.”

You will also see all those issues that were raised in that summit in our Constitution today because they were reflected, they were adopted by the leaders who were there, consulting with those stakeholders.

It also further says that children have the right to be protected from maltreatment, neglect, sexual trade, abuse and degradation. In the Western Cape Constitution the Constitution talks of the Commissioner for Children which must promote in particular: health services, education, welfare services, recreation and sport for children and make sure that all departments, both provincial and national, are monitored to make sure that they implement those actual elements in terms of the Constitution.

As it is, in the Western Cape, the issue of the Commissioner for Children has still not been addressed, even after the process of public hearings took place in relation to the amendment of the Bill... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam, your time has expired. Thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Okay. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Yes, I was also there when the Constitution was negotiated so I know exactly which clauses were put in where and why that was done. But of course rights have to be translated into reality and in the first part of my answer I was explaining how we are translating rights into reality in the Western Cape, which brings me to the Western Cape Education Department's role. In addition, the Western Cape Department of Education has indicated that they have no confirmation of any claims of a sex trade in schools, but are very aware of the dangers of sexual abuse of any kind.

The Western Cape Education Department deals with the threat of sexual abuse in a variety of ways including the following: first of all we have the "Abuse No More" Protocols, in terms of which educators are obliged to report any suspected cases of sexual abuse of children in terms of legislation protecting the rights of children. The Western Cape Education Department introduced protocols in 2001 to provide schools with advice on how to deal with any form of abuse.

The Department provided these protocols in 2014 following amendments to the legislation. The Western Cape Education Department revised guidelines jointly with the National Prosecuting Authority and in collaboration with a wide range of agencies involved in child care.

The Department provided extensive training to schools on the revised protocols and that is very important, because often teachers are the first

people who pick up that there is a problem of abuse and now they are obliged in law to follow up every single case, and they do. If they do not and we discover that the child was demonstrating some kind of symptom in a classroom and was not followed up, that teacher is guilty of misconduct and we follow these issues up. The Western Cape Education Department employs social workers and school psychologists in every circuit. [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: What about [Inaudible.]?

The PREMIER: Well, what about Marius Fransman? The Western Cape Education Department employ social workers and school psychologists... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...in every circuit who will investigate any claims of sexual abuse in collaboration with other agencies, including the police and the Department of Social Development. The social workers advise schools on how to deal with incidents of sexual abuse in line with their “Abuse No More” policy. Then we have a Safe Schools Call Centre where learners and any concerned individual at all can contact the Safe Schools Call Centre for advice or to report any suspected case of sexual abuse of children... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: And may I just give the number, it is 0800454647.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: 0800454647.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Premier. I see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thanks, Premier. I must say, Premier, if there are no claims from your Department of Education around the sex trade that also takes place at schools, clearly you will never get anything else from that Department. Therefore you must do something with the person that leads that Department, because as we know the sex trade is a highly, highly organised...
[Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: By SADTU?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Not all schools have SADTU. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: SADTU.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: And it is going to higher levels, particularly in areas that are poverty-stricken, particularly in areas like Western Cape, where you

have the rich and the poor are evidently there and where you have family break-ups. It talks about our province, where violence and other dysfunctional things are taking place. There are low levels of job opportunities. I am talking about our province. All those speak to our province. There is a high level of drop-outs at schools, you know. If you do not get that from your Education Department, Premier, I am sorry, because that is the reality that we are living in. For instance, amongst other things which are so prevalent here in our province, is the actuality of the sexual trade linked to tourism that is also taking place. I am not sure that we will get that from... [Interjection.] I hope that your MEC will brief you on what has been happening for some time in this province around that, because it is known, as research has been done, that sexual and other trade exist and pimps are also trained here in this province.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam, your time has expired, thank you. I see the hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Speaker, the matter of child sex trade is a criminal matter that falls within the responsibility of the criminal justice system under the National Government. Provinces have no operational control over the police which is tasked with combating, investigating and preventing crime. So let us look at the National Government's track record: in a question I posed in this House I was told that the Western Cape Hawks have not made any arrests nor charged any arrested persons in terms of the Prevention and Combating of Trafficking in Persons Act. It means we have

legislation to deal with child sex trade and human trafficking but the criminal justice system is just not making use of it.

Then there is the Child Protection Register which was established in 2010 as part of the Children's Act. A person convicted for serious violent crimes such as murder or rape shall be disallowed from working with children, but this register has only 400 names on it despite over 290 000 of these cases with children victims, which were reported to police between 2010 and 2013.

In Child Protection Week we must ensure that the criminal justice system is delivering on its mandate to reduce child sex trade and protect children.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, it is the gangs and syndicates in our province - we know that our province is the murder capital – that are highly involved in this particular recruitment of children and forcing them to be involved in the trade. The issue which we want to raise again and on which we have not had any response from the Premier is: when is the Constitution of the Western Cape going to be implemented in this regard? [Interjections.]

And secondly, Premier, when are you going to take out the dead wood in your Cabinet, because you do have seasoned people who have run this Department before who are seasoned police, who have been there before. This is what we have been saying about the National Commissioner... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...that you want a seasoned person, a policeman. We do have a seasoned person. [Interjections.] There is the hon Max here. In fact under him we were able to deal with the issue of PAGAD, we were able to deal with the issue of gangsterism, we were able to deal with the issue of drugs, that we were very wrong at that stage... [Interjections.] So why are we unable to do the same now? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Tyatyam, thank you. I now see... [Interjections.] Order please members, there is a speaker on the floor.

The PREMIER: My time has not started yet.

The SPEAKER: No. Order please. Okay, Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Well from what the hon member Mr Tyatyam said, it seems clear that he has a lot of information about the alleged sex trade happening in schools, so why is he not bringing that to the attention of the Department of Education and the police? [Interjections.] If he has that information, it is a criminal act not to disclose it and we are waiting for you to come with that information, seeing that you have claimed here that you know about this and that we should know about it too. So we are waiting for your information and your affidavits with that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: It is absolutely true that there is a terrible amount of abuse of young women by older men and in fact this is to the extent that it has become a kind of cult known as blessing - known as blessing!

A national survey found that one in three young people is abused and then there is a big article in the newspaper giving different categories of 'blessers' and saying it is wonderful to be a 'blesser' and if you are a blessee you get high heel shoes if you are in one category and you go overseas with your 'blesser' in another category. All of this culture is encouraging the kind of abuse that the hon member Mr Tyatyam stands up here and looks so holy about. When is the ANC going to stand up and condemn this culture of blessing, because that traps young people into the situation and makes it common-part of South Africa's culture, which is absolutely unacceptable and it results in a level of abuse that we currently have.

If the ANC comes here and is so holy about all the work that we are doing here, and I listed some of the things we are doing... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Could they tell us what they are doing in their provinces? [Interjections.] If a Children's Commissioner was so effective you would have set up Children's Commissioners in other provinces or at least when you

were here.

The SPEAKER: Premier, talk to me. [Interjections.] Order!

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, this seems to be the only issue the ANC can raise but they know where the Children's Commissioner is in the process. They know exactly where. Currently we are finalising the research... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order please.

The PREMIER: ...and policy and... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry Premier, can you please take your seat. There is a member on the floor.

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry Madam Speaker, I wonder if our speaker could be protected from the Chair, please. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members. When there are too many interjections that actually drown out the speaker then it does become a concern, so yes, whilst the Premier was on the floor interjections were allowed but it got to a point where we could not hear each other, so I would like to ask, we are on Channel 408 today, let us put our best foot forward and let us respect the speakers on the floor as they speak. Premier, you may conclude, thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.] We have had this scandal with SADTU and the “jobs for cash scandal and expose.” If they had to do an investigation of the abuse of young people in schools by many SADTU teachers there would be another scandal of monumental proportions and that is an absolutely critical issue for us to go into but the ANC has no credibility to do it, because Truman Prince after being filmed on television was re-elected the ANC Mayor. They tolerate that kind of behaviour. They celebrated it. They call it blessing and then they come here and get holy in this House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Premier. That concludes Interpellation 1.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We now move to New Interpellations. I see the hon Minister, Minister Grant.

New Interpellations:

Metrorail infrastructure: vandalism of

1. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

Whether the continued acts of vandalism of Metrorail infrastructure are an infringement of the rights of commuters and if these acts of vandalism are affecting the economy of the Western Cape negatively?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can I please ask that you...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, in answering the question from the hon member Mr Max whether the continued acts of vandalism of Metrorail infrastructure are an infringement on the rights of commuters and if these acts of vandalism are affecting the economy of the Western Cape negatively, our response is:

Firstly, commuter rail is the backbone of an efficient public transportation system and is intrinsically linked to the realisation of opportunity whether these are economic opportunities or jobs, socio-economic or recreational activities. Daily 622 000 citizens depend on the passenger rail network, as a critical link in the realisation of such opportunity. Disruptions to the commuter rail service have a direct impact with major disruptions to the service such as what we have seen in April 2016, having far-reaching consequences, direct and indirect costs and spillovers into other modes of transport, thereby increasing congestion.

Secondly, even smaller scale almost daily disruptions on the various networks whether these are signalling problems or sets being out of service continue to affect thousands of commuters and deny them an efficient safe and on-time public transportation system.

Thirdly, the following seven negative effects on the economy have been identified:

Cost of disruptions to the economy which include productivity loss, reputational damage, these run into hundreds of millions of rands. Within two weeks the cost of damages to Metrorail's infrastructure amounted to R70 million, and its available infrastructure - the number of coaches - has been severely affected. Thirdly, the firing of workers due to latecoming; fourthly, the dropping of salaries due to latecoming; then the loss of approximately 750 000 person hours when all trains are running two hours late in one day; the increase in road congestion: private vehicle users are already running late due to the spillover effect. Already the average cost of congestion from private vehicle users is at R1 266 per person per month, which includes time and fuel or approximately 20% of their vehicle costs; and then finally, an increase in overtime paid to meet customer needs and the impact on social costs where parents are absent from home leaving children alone and vulnerable.

Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thank you so much, Minister Grant, for that response. This DA-led Government of the Western Cape knows exactly what is the most important principle of economic empowerment and that is economic capacitation and economic emancipation is only possible through education. [Interjections.] So it is no wonder that the Western Cape Education Department is the best in the country and you know why I am saying this, is because in the Western Cape we capacitate people, children. We capacitate students. We capacitate contractors. We capacitate learners. We capacitate students / children by virtue of the Premier's Advanced Youth Programme, so Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L H MAX: ...all those people which we capacitated through economic emancipation have to make use of this transport system in the Western Cape. Children who have to go to school to receive this have to make use of this and this hooliganism, this sabotage of the train system cannot be tolerated. It undoes what this Western Cape Government has done. So what distinguishes us as the Western Cape from National Government is simple. [Interjections.]

In the Western Cape - yes, there is a saying: "An army of deer led by a lion is more to be feared than an army of lion led by a deer..."

In the Western Cape we have got a lioness who is leading the pack. At National we have got a deer.

An HON MEMBER: They are 'blessers'. They are 'blessers'.

Mr L H MAX: So Madam Speaker, what I am trying to say is let me say...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L H MAX: There is only one political party in this country who keeps South Africa relevant and that is the Democratic Alliance. If the Democratic Alliance fails South Africa fails and we will not tolerate that these hooligans who actually burn our trains, who sabotage our railway lines are going to undo this and therefore what is of concern is according to Mr Walker there was a reluctance from the police to investigate it and I trust that the Minister responsible already took it up with the relevant authorities within the police. We cannot tolerate it, it must not be tolerated. We cannot afford it.

[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please members. I now see the hon Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much and I welcome this interpellation by my colleague hon member Mr Lennit Max. These unlawful

acts of vandalism are serious acts of economic sabotage and have to be condemned in the strongest possible terms. A workforce that is constantly late for work due to cable theft and trains being burnt means that the productivity does not reach its potential results, thus resulting in millions lost to our economy each day. It is very much distressing that the majority of people that are affected when the trains are being vandalised are the workforce but it cannot be true that the people who burn and vandalise those trains are angry because the train is late, because nobody would contribute to his lateness by burning the train. It is therefore true that the saboteurs are people who are against the government and therefore are people that have to be thoroughly investigated. We therefore call on the Metrorail to intensify the security around these trains and to protect the commuters because those people who come late at work at times face charges of being late and they at times end up being dismissed. So it is true that the need for intensification in their investigation and arrest must be made so that we protect the economy of this province.

In the first two weeks of April alone the alarming damage to Metro infrastructure was estimated to be R70 million and a staggering 37 trains were being burnt only within the period of 12 months. This is totally unacceptable. The ripple effects are immense as many of the commuters rely on Metrorail to play a crucial role in ensuring that the people that use them reach their destiny timeously. It is not only an economic issue but it is one that also borders on human rights violation and those rights of bordering and commuting under safe conditions must always be encouraged.

Failure to deliver the basic services to our people is a travesty of justice. We need... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired hon member.

Mr N E HINANA: ... to drive an economy that would create jobs and protect our infrastructure. Thanks. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I must say that I am actually very disappointed in the way that the hon member Mr Max has phrased this particular interpellation and what it reveals is the fundamental ideological bias of the Democratic Alliance and which interest they represent. [Interjections.]

There is nothing wrong in terms of discussing what the economic impact is of the thuggery and the sabotage which is going on but the problem with the framing of this interpellation is that it would de-emphasise the issue of safety of workers, of the human rights of people and that is consistent with the ideological approach by the MEC and the Premier when they talk about Tafelberg for instance, where in terms of that policy which the DA has crafted they would put too a particular emphasis on economic development and ignore the requests of their own Department in regard to social housing. So here we have a situation where there is a focus on the economy and MEC

Grant talks about productivity loss and docking of salaries and so on but where is this Government's commitment to the safety of our people? We have seen it and that is why I am genuinely disappointed in hon member Mr Max. He has raised a legitimate issue about provincial traffic and safety.

We have raised concerns that the DA cut and destroyed Bambanani and that is why school violence partly is worse than it was. [Interjections.] So the issue is do you worry about the profits? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Is the concern only about the profits of business?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, all business, only business.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: And we believe that we need to boost our economies but without peace and without safety you cannot have economic development. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon member Mr Dugmore, will you take your seat please. I need to address hon member Mr Magaxa. Can I address you please? The question that was posed across the floor to the honourable Wenger or not the question, it was a statement: "You were not born here..."

and then you continued.

Mr K E MAGAXA: “Not born yet...”

The SPEAKER: Not born yet. Okay, hon member Mr Magaxa, it is inappropriate to engage in a conversation like that. [Interjections.] No-no, hold on please members. [Interjections.]

We cannot simply start engaging in crossfire with each other. It cannot be, so we have a speaker on the floor, I am asking that you respect the speaker on the floor and to both sides of the House; you cannot engage each other while there is a speaker on the floor. Thank you. [Interjections.]

You may proceed... I have addressed both sides of the House. You may proceed, hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, may I just address you on a point of order, is it legitimate for me to ask if you could inquire from the Table as to how many seconds I have left?

The SPEAKER: Ten seconds left, I am told, hon member Mr Dugmore.

Ms M N GILLION: No ten minutes, it is ten minutes. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Okay. So the point is this is incorrectly phrased because

this DA Government has not put safety of learners, of commuters, of our people first and that is why this focus is actually misleading and misdirecting the solution... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore your time has expired.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We need to work together to solve this. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please members. This is a serious business we are in. Let us start taking the issues at hand seriously please. I now see the honourable Hinana.

†UMnu N E HINANA: Ndicela nifake le mikhala ukwenzela nizokuva ndiza kuthetha isiXhosa. Somlomo, eli lizwe linengxaki yabantu abatshabalalisa impahla, ngakumbi impahla le bayisebenzisayo. Ukuba siyaqaphela kakhulu lo mkhuba wokutshabalalisa impahla ngumkhuba abantu abawufunda kudala wokuthi ukuba into abayithandi mabayitshise. Siya kukhumbula ukuba bekude kutshiswe nabantu kuba bengahambisani naloo mntu okanye umntu ebizwa ngempimpi, yaye ndifuna ukuyithetha nokuyigxininisa, ngakumbi xa sibhekisa kubantu abantsundu into yokuba ilihlazo le nto siyenzayo ngoba ukuba uyajonga ubukhulu becala abantu abasebenza ezitreyinii ngabantu abamnyama, yaye nabantu abasebenzisa eziya treyini ikwangabantu abamnyama. Ngoku uzibuza umbuzo wokuba ukuthi mawutshise, isizwe sakuthi sabantu abantsundu ngubani oza kusiqaphela ukuba sisizwe sabantu abakhathalayo? Yaye ndiyafuna ukuyisa kwinto ethi enye imvumi ekuthiwa

nguMbongeni Ngema yakhe yathi lo mzuzu nina nibulalana, ezinye iintlanga zibala imali nina nibala izidumbu. Ngumkhuba lowo ekufuneka ukuba siwunyevulele, ngumkhuba ekufuneka ukuba masingawukhuthazi ngoba udala ihlazo nokuzisa umkhuba ombi kuhlanga lwabantu abamnyama. Enkosi.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

Mr N E HINANA: Please insert your devices so that you can hear because I am going to speak in isiXhosa. Madam Speaker, this country has a problem of people who destroy property, especially property that they are using. If we look back, mostly this tendency of destroying property is a tendency that people learnt long ago that when they do not like something they must burn it. We shall remember that even people were burnt because they did not agree with someone or they were called a sell-out, and I want to say and emphasize that, especially when we refer to black people, that what we are doing is a disgrace because if you look most of the people who work on trains are black, and most of the people who use those trains are black people. Now you must ask yourself the question: for you to burn, who is going to recognize our black nation as a nation of caring people? And I want to take this to what one singer, Mbongeni Ngema once said, while you are killing each other, other nations are counting money and you are counting corpses. That is a tendency we need to do away with, this is a tendency that we need not condone because it brings disgrace and a bad tendency to the nation of black people. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, thank you so much. It seems to me that hon member Mr Dugmore's memory is very short because you know, the Premier of the Western Cape recently, last year or so, took the SAPS to the Constitutional Court. She instituted a Commission of Inquiry. Why? Not because it was just something... [Inaudible.]. It is because, hon member Mr Dugmore, she put the people of the Western Cape first. This DA Government put the people first. [Interjections.] You know, the South African Police Service... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Max address the Chair please.

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, I will do so. The South African Police Service is managed by the National Government. What hon member Mr Dugmore is actually doing, he is blaming his own Government, his own party, for not delivering. He is talking about the Bambanani. Bambanani was an ANC election engineering machine. It was canvassing for the ANC. It is an ANC army. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

Mr L H MAX: So what we did here in this Government, we transformed them to focus on the needs of the people [Interjections.] so honourable Madam Speaker, [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is getting worse, there is gangsterism all over.

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, 30 train carriages were destroyed in this sabotage attempt. It cost about R200 million. 131 workers were dismissed. Now those are monies which could have been used for salary increases and for other needs to address the needs of the people, but let me tell the hon member Mr Dugmore, the past is behind us, the future is not with us yet. What is left with us is the present. Leave the little politics and the cheap politics and make a contribution to what is needed to take the Western Cape and South Africa forward so that South Africa can be a better place for us all and for our children. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I wish I had more than two minutes to sum up and firstly I would like to thank everyone who participated in this mini-debate, and just to say that the denying of the means to the realisation of opportunity to the citizens of this province is a very serious concern to me and should be a very serious concern to Metrorail and PRASA as well who are the owners and operators of Commuter Rail Services in the Western Cape.

As to the phrasing of this interpellation I am happy to say in terms of safety, Madam Speaker, to this House today, and I have just checked with my colleague Minister Plato, we have had since October last year at least five

serious high-level interactions with SAPS and Metrorail as a result of the lack of follow-up of all the cases of theft, vandalism and other acts, including arson and malicious damage to property, and basically what we need is accountability for those actions. That is at the bottom of getting the rail system safe again, that there is accountability. We are engaging with committed role-players in the field. What are we doing about this to ensure that we find workable solutions to the challenges that our commuters face on a daily basis? I have already been on record in this House to say that we are passing legislation and that work is well advanced.

In conclusion I want to say that acts of vandalism of critical transport infrastructure are tantamount to economic sabotage that requires appropriate, timeous and targeted interventions by the State in all three spheres of Government to ensure that every effort is made at protecting key enablers of economic activity and despite these challenges we will continue to work towards solutions in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. That concludes Interpellation 1.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We now move to Interpellation 2. I see the honourable, the Minister of Education, Minister Schäfer.

Breedee Valley Municipality: schools offering agricultural studies

2. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Education:

What are the reasons why schools in the Breede Valley Municipality do not offer agricultural studies or agricultural education?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker. The answer to the question posed in this interpellation - thank you to hon member Mr Tyatyam - is that there are no reasons, because it is not true that schools in the Breede Valley do not offer agricultural subjects. Currently there are six schools in the Breede Valley that offer agriculture subjects, one of which is an agricultural school. These include Boland Landbouskool in Agter-Paarl; Augsburg High School, La Rochelle Girls High School and Kayamandi Secondary School in Stellenbosch. The school governing body is ultimately responsible for applying for an extension of the curriculum offerings at any school and to date no other school in that area has applied for same.

Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. I see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you Madam Speaker and MEC. It is clear that that area, Breede Valley Municipality, is one of the key agri-regions in this province. It provides and plays a key role in our output as a province to the national agricultural system. It is very disturbing that when we are looking at Breede Valley - in my view one of the key areas where agriculture plays a

key, important role - we do not spend time to get our children educated at a younger age. Get them educated so that they will bring more sustainable work but also to bring innovation into agriculture around this particular area. Whilst we do not have a school at the moment, it is also quite concerning that when we also look at the issue of food insecurity, this area is one of those counted as part of the insecurity areas and yet we do not invest more in actually changing the situation in this particular Breede Valley Municipality.

I am sure that out of the schools there in the municipality there are only about six schools that are involved in food gardening; let alone subjects of agriculture, as a subject, but in food gardening. Out of all the schools that are there, there are only six schools are involved. Clearly one would want to understand what is the complementary role that is played by MECs, what do they communicate amongst themselves because in agriculture the MEC would know that that area has great potential for our province and nationally.

Therefore I am also sure that when hon member Mr Kivedo speaks here - fortunately he was one of the principals in the area - he is going to speak about the need that we are not, as a province, making sure that we cultivate and nurture young people as they are and ensure that they develop to be what we want them to be. In fact yesterday, or two days ago, we had a presentation from the Agriculture Department where they were telling us at the Committee that there is a lack of innovation, particularly in this field of agriculture.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam your time has expired, thank you. I

see the hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, hon Premier and hon Chair of the Opposition and members of the Executive and fellow members and the media, I thank the hon member Mr Tyatyam for raising this specific issue. It is a very relevant issue.

I am however a little bit baffled, my dear colleague, by the fact that he just focuses on the Breede Valley, although we have rural and farming communities throughout the country. But I understand, the Breede Valley is the jewel of the Western Cape, *né*. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

Yes. In this case one should ask how many schools, if any, offer agricultural science as a subject countrywide. Okay. Breede Valley is not alien to me. You are right. I have been the principal there. I have been Executive Mayor for three years so I was keeping my feet on the ground so it places me in a position to endeavour to answer that question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!.

Mr B D KIVEDO: In the Breede Valley and environs this subject has been offered at two Worcester high schools until 2001, namely Vusisizwe in Zwelethemba and Worcester Secondary. In both cases the offering of the subject has been terminated due to the prospective teachers resigning and my dear colleagues, a declining interest in this subject has also been recorded.

[Inaudible.] It is there for the taking.

In close proximity to the Breede Valley two schools, namely Iingcinga Zethu, Ceres and Skurweberg, Koue Bokkeveld offer the subjects; it is just...

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Op-die-Berg.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Op-die-Berg. In the entire Cape Winelands the subject is being offered at the following schools: Boland Landbouskool in Agter-Paarl, Paarl Boys High in Paarl, Porterville High. A popular agricultural school is Augsburg High in Clanwilliam, and Vredendal.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, please your time has expired.

Mr B D KIVEDO: It needs to be mentioned that agricultural sciences are not offered at any of our tertiary institutions except at the University of Stellenbosch. The minimum requirement to qualify as a teacher in agricultural studies is a B.Sc with Agricultural Science as principal major...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, thank you, your time has expired.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, what one would want to understand from the Minister, what is the Minister going to do to make sure that we nurture young children and make sure that agricultural education is not only something that we want to do in colleges or at the University of Stellenbosch, but that we have an opportunity to make sure that we continue to develop what hon member Mr Kivedo is saying is the jewel there in Breede Valley? Because whilst we talk of the CRDP taking place all over the province, we continue to neglect the fact that we need more work in relation to young people in that area of Breede Valley.

What we also do not have is more participation from the municipality in terms of making sure that we cultivate young people around this particular goal, making sure that they understand. Because what we do not want to do is continuously produce children who are going to be labourers and must work to enrich other people and work for certain families, rich white families, so that they continue to prosper and all of the other communities must actually go, one; undernourished and two; even though they grow the food, they are unable to feed their families properly and unfortunately Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I however have good news for hon member Mr Tyatyam, in the sense that as I speak at this very moment there are discussions with farmers, private sector, Worcester Business Forum, emerging farmers as well as the Breede Valley Municipality at a place called Kleinplasië. I will take you there. I will take you, to look at implementing training in agricultural management sciences, looking at two curricula options. The first one, one livestock or one animal vis-à-vis three crops; and the second option is three crops versus one animal. Seeing that the Breede Valley is a crop-producing area as you rightfully mentioned and it is specifically grape or wine farming, I believe they will opt for the second option. Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, I see the Minister.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I want the Minister to speak now.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. It does not appear that the hon member Mr Tyatyam listened to my answer because he is still saying that we do not have a school there at the moment. I

said we have six schools there who do actually offer agricultural subjects. Yes, but never mind that, I mean... [Interjections.]

Yes, we have in fact got 25 schools in the province that offer agricultural subjects and three of those are complete agricultural schools which is Oakdale Landbouskool in Riversdale, Boland Landbouskool in Agter-Paarl, and Augsburg Landbou Gymnasium in Clanwilliam.

However, food gardening and agriculture are not quite the same thing and although it is not my area of expertise, I think I even know that much. However, I do understand, I completely agree that food gardens are important and encourage those wherever I can in school where they have sufficient land available. As far as innovation is concerned we in fact just met about a week ago with an organisation who wants to help us establish more food gardens in schools using hydroponics with the view of actually making the vegetables and fruit available for sale as well, to try and make themselves sustainable so it will teach them valuable life skills as well as using it for school purposes if they wish, as well as being able to see it and teaching them entrepreneurial skills. So we certainly are onto innovation in the province. We also work very transversely with other departments in this Government, particularly Economic Opportunities. We are working with the skills game changer particularly to ensure that our young people are upskilled and that their learning in school are aligned with the needs of the economy. Important for agricultural science are obviously maths and science subjects and we have a very definite focus on increasing the numbers of learners who are taking

particularly pure maths in schools as well as science subjects. So we are very much involved in trying to ensure that all our learners have the available opportunities in life. Of course people also have to want to take agricultural science but for those who maybe do not know it, I have also put a very big focus on career, to further better career guidance at schools and we have certainly improved over the last few years with making available information to learners at schools as to what careers are out there for them to participate in. So I think we are quite covered and we really are working very hard to ensure that all our learners have opportunities available to them.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, your time has also now expired. That brings us to the end of Interpellations.

[Debate concluded.]

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We proceed with questions on the Question Paper, for oral reply. The first question I believe will stand over. The second question, hon Hinana to Minister Grant. Minister Grant.

[Question 1 standing over.]

Abalone, smuggling of

2. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

Whether any smuggling of abalone and other illegal substances in the province by means of public transport, such as long distances busses and taxis, has been brought to his attention; if so, what mechanism is in place to curb the smuggling?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In response, the answer to the question is yes, it has been brought to my attention that abalone and illegal substances are being transported on our road network by means of public transport such as long distance busses and taxis.

These are examples of confiscations of illegal substances transported on public transport vehicles detected by Provincial Traffic: firstly, on 24 July 2010 on the N1 near Caledon, Tik to the value of R2.8 million; on 18 January 2011 on the N1 near Beaufort West, heroin and Mandrax, R6 106 300. Just a correction, Madam Speaker, I see 24 July - that is obviously N2 Caledon, not N1. Then thirdly on 20 January 2011, the N1 near Beaufort West, cocaine to the value of R19 million; on 24 February 2011 on the N2 / Knysna, dagga, R56 800 and then on 16 October 2012 on the N1 near Worcester, Mandrax to the value of R88 000.

Provincial Traffic in dealing with the second part of the question, what mechanism is in place to curb the smuggling, Provincial Traffic has regular

road-blocks on all provincial and national routes and maintains a high level of visibility in order to curb road transgressions and offences such as these. Traffic officers have been instructed to search all vehicles including public transport vehicles for the transportation of illegal goods when these vehicles are stopped for weight measuring at weigh-bridges.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, hon member Mr Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thanks MEC. In the subsequent investigation of these smugglers and peddlers, has it been found that there is a connection between the people who use these abalone and drug substances with the drivers because anything that enters the bus or the taxi has to be known by the driver so that if there is a roadblock everyone must be accountable for the persons that... is the investigation linking the peddlers with the drivers as well?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker in response, I think the example that the hon member Mr Hinana is referring to is possibly a separate case which is being investigated of a long-distance bus which was caught in Somerset West and if that is the case you are referring to, that matter is under investigation and wherever public transport vehicles are involved in transporting of unlawful poached or smuggled material and creatures [Inaudible.] then these companies can have their operating licences withdrawn by the PRE after the holding of a Section

79 hearing. That is of course independent, Mr Deputy Speaker, to the criminal case which would follow in the course of the normal SAPS duties.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, a follow-up?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask MEC as a follow-up question if he could indicate to us in terms of his reference to roadblocks, which particular roads has the Department focused on in regard to setting up roadblocks to deal with the particular problem raised by the hon member Mr Hinana.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, these roadblocks are normally at key points. We collaborate with SAPS and I am very happy to say that there is very good cross-pollination between SAPS and ourselves with regard to intelligence, particularly along the known smuggling routes where it comes to issues like abalone or lobster for that matter. As far as drugs are concerned we largely rely also on tip-offs, and that is why that one big cocaine bust which came from Knysna came from inside information, but we target largely high traffic routes on the N2, the N1 and to a lesser extent the N7. We have also had roadblocks on the R27 to Saldanha.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Chief Whip should realise that abalone comes from the sea mainly in the Western Cape, but I would like to ask the MEC as a follow-up question, and also noting the very solid cooperation that he says has been received from the South African Police Service, which story changes from the previous interpellation not by him but someone else who said they do not work with them. My question is would it not be a good idea considering that the abalone comes from the sea and the roads around Stanford, Gansbaai and Hermanus are actually the source and would it not be also an effective strategy to focus on those roads closer to the source of where the abalone is actually poached from?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I feel I am back in my former life where we were involved with the Green Scorpions, trying to deal with lobster poaching and abalone at that time. I am very well aware of where those are poached, and obviously we look at evidence-based practice in this Government and we also link with people who are based where you are obviously going to have to ship those goods, and that is largely through the port of Cape Town as well as Johannesburg. So a lot of these busts, if I could call it that, that happen, are on the route to OR Tambo or to Cape Town Harbour or Cape Town International Airport, but yes, you are correct hon member Mr Dugmore. I will take it up with our traffic authorities to see if we can maybe catch them closer to the source because it is quite apparent that about 40%, from what I

hear, are found just through routine inspections as opposed to tip-offs, which come and need to be coordinated not only with our own provincial traffic resources but with municipal resources as well, for example in George or other towns along the Garden Route on roads which can link up to O R Tambo Airport. Most of these smuggled goods are fresh goods and they have a shelf life and they need to be flown out the country to get to their destination or they basically are frozen and sent by sea-freight.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wiley, the last opportunity?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can the hon Minister confirm that in one of these big drug busts it was found that the car was ANC branded and driven by an ANC party organiser? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes, that is only one example. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. We then proceed to the next question, hon member Max again to Minister Grant. Hon Minister Grant?

Centre Manager posts: filling of

3. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

- (1) Whether his Department has any intention of filling the Centre Manager posts; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;

(2) whether there are any other posts which his Department intends to fill; if not; why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank the hon member Max for his question.
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, just one second hon Minister.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I just want to ask, is it procedural that an MEC responds to a question when the asker of that question is not actually present in the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Hinana was present in the House.

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, no. Mr Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are we getting to number 3 now?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Are we not on Number 3?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is no obligation on the asker to be present in the House. The asker can [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: I think it is actually quite unacceptable conduct.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is a subjective view but there is nothing in the Rule Book prohibiting it. Hon Minister Grant, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The answer is: yes, subject to the COE cap being lifted and funding being secured.

The second part of the question: yes, as specifically provided for by the Provincial Treasury in the 2016 budget process.

Mr Deputy Speaker, then I have a list - it was asked what the relevant details are. I can certainly give it to the hon member Max but I have a list of some 30 posts here which basically are not filled yet in my Department and I will pass that on to the hon member Max.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. There is no objection to that? Hon member Dugmore, is it a follow-up question?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In the absence of the person who asked the question, I would like to ask as a member of this Portfolio Committee if the MEC can be more specific and actually tell us when these 30 posts that he refers to, and for which he will provide the information to us, will actually be filled? When will they be advertised and when is the likely date by when these posts will be occupied by warm bodies? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I cannot respond definitively because these are various disciplines within my Department and they are not all Cape Town based posts. They are in traffic engineering, structural design, pavement technology, contracts, maintenance in Eden, road maintenance in the Winelands, immovable asset management, general infrastructure, electrical services, quantity surveying services and then in Metro education regions there are engineers and then there is an architect. In the Eden/Karoo Winelands there are architectural services for health, there are two posts; community health centres, clinics, a chief engineer grade A in the Winelands. Hospitals: the Metro East and West; and then property acquisitions, a director which is a Head Office post and then a special task team.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we also, in my Department, have to rely on the CSC to basically do all the advertising and processing of these, the filling of the posts and that takes some time. My Department does the short-listing and then the interviewing process and hands it back and I am not sure offhand but if my memory serves me correctly and from experience, that process can take anything between – depending on the response, of course –three to nine months to fulfil that process.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Then, hon member Magaxa? Hon member Magaxa, second opportunity?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Okay, no, I do not know whether this question is relevant to the second part of the question. I wanted to check if the freezing of the previous consultants posts that were removed from the Department, is there any replacement in the form of employment of other people from the same Department?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the question relates to employees and not to consultants but I just want to say to the hon member Magaxa that we are doing our best to limit consultants because of the outside costs and to row the boat with the oars that we have got.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, do you want to use the opportunity?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. If I could just ask the MEC whether he would be willing to, not only provide the list of those posts that he referred to, but also outline the timeline in regard to when those posts will be advertised and filled.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am very happy to do that, to share it with the hon member Dugmore and also with the hon member Max.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then proceed to the following question, next question, Question number 4, again the hon member Max to Minister Grant. Hon Minister Grant, Question 4.

Centre Manager appointment: minimum qualification required

4. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

(a) What is the minimum qualification required for appointment as a Centre Manager for Provincial Traffic and (b) how many of the current permanent appointed Provincial Traffic Centre Managers possess the minimum qualification?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you once again to the hon Max for the question. In response to question part (a), the current minimum appointment requirements for a Provincial Traffic Chief is as follows: firstly, a relevant tertiary qualification, a three-year diploma or degree or equivalent; secondly, a minimum of eight years traffic law enforcement operational experience; thirdly, three to five years supervisory experience; fourthly, seven to ten years working experience in the field of traffic law enforcement; fifthly, a valid Code EC driver's licence and then, finally, no criminal record.

In terms of part (b) of the question, five of the seven permanent appointed Traffic Chiefs have the required minimum qualifications; two Traffic Chiefs

do not have the necessary qualifications but were appointed before 2008 when these minimum requirements were not laid down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, no follow-ups there. We can proceed to the next question. Question number 5, I believe stands over.

[Question 5 standing over.]

Sonskynvallei, Mossel Bay: schools planned

***6. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether any schools are planned for Sonskynvallei, Mossel Bay; if not, why not; if so, (a) when will the schools be built and (b) for how many learners will provision be made?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. No schools are planned for Sonskynvallei in Mossel Bay. This is a small community that has been developed on the outskirts of Hartenbos. Before consideration would be given to the development of a new school in the area, expansion of existing schools will be considered.

The closest school is Hartenbos Laerskool with 970 learners, including Grade R and pre-Grade R.

In terms of long-term planning, WCED has indicated the development of two new schools in the broader Mossel Bay area in its 10 year planning framework. No sites have yet been earmarked for these developments.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, any follow-up?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you MEC. What is the capacity of this Hartenbos School? I believe it is up to capacity and just to ask you whether you are aware that there are 154 top structures that are going to be built in Sonskynvallei, starting July this year?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. I do not know the capacity but given that it includes Grade R and pre-Grade R and it is only 970, I assume it must be in the region of about 1 000 or so. I was not aware of that, no, but our Department is always looking at developments that are occurring across the province and looking at the hotspot areas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys?

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, what is the distance between Sonskynvallei and Hartenbos and do you provide public transport for the learners to Hartenbos School?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I do not have the distance between the two schools but as you are aware, any learners who are travelling to school and who live more than five kilometres away from the school qualify for learner transport. If they are further than five kilometres away and are not receiving that, please will you let me know and we will look into it.

Mr P UYS: So they are not getting transport, of course. You said it is a very small community; what is the size of the community, of the learners? If it is a small community you must know who the learners are that are possibly going to school in that community. You must know that, of course.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: This is a very new question, I mean I really do not have details of the size of the entire community but I rely on the information I receive from my officials who have advised that this is not a hotspot in relation to the entire province and the extreme pressures that we face throughout the province in various areas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, your last opportunity?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. This came to the fore when the NCOP visited Sonskynvallei and thank you to the MECs who attended. Why did you not attend this very important NCOP visit to Sonskynvallei and address the province then? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister, do you want to respond to that one?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I am quite happy to respond to that, because I was attending the one in George and I can only be in one place at the one time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question, Question Number 7, hon member Tyatyam to Minister Plato. Hon Minister Plato?

Manenberg, gang violence and killings

7. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Community Safety:

What are he and his Department doing to resolve the problems of gang violence and killings in Manenberg?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reduction of gang violence remains a top priority of not only the Department of Community Safety but for the whole of the Western Cape Government. The community of Manenberg has, for a number of years, been one of the gang hot-spot areas. Our interventions are to be considered from two perspectives: the first being the strategic co-operation with law enforcement agencies and in particular the South African Police Service and

the State Security Agency. In this regard my Department made inputs to the new National Anti-Gangs Strategy that was drafted by the National Intelligence Co-ordinating Committee and which is to be tabled at the Justice, Crime Prevention and Security Cluster Cabinet Committee during June 2016. We are working closely with the office of the Western Cape Provincial Police Commissioner to draft a comprehensive and inter-departmental implementation plan in support of this new National Anti-Gangs Strategy.

The Cabinet *Bosberaad* of May 2016 has already decided that the provincial co-ordination in support of the National Gang Strategy shall take place within the Provincial Strategic Goal 2: Improve Educational Outcomes and Opportunities for Youth Development.

The Department has furthermore worked closely with the City of Cape Town in the establishment of the Stabilization Unit who are deployed mainly in Manenberg under the auspices of the Metro Police Service. An amount of R10.2 million has been provided for, within the MTEF period, to strengthen and expand the work of this successful anti-gang Unit. In May 2016 four Safety Kiosks were handed over to the Metro Police in support of the work of the Stabilisation Unit in Manenberg and other communities.

The second set of interventions is aimed at safety promotion and social crime prevention within the community of Manenberg. In this regard we have, and shall continue with, our programmes and projects in support of the

Neighbourhood Watch structures in the area.

During the 2015/2016 financial year, training was provided to 60 volunteers from Heideveld, Phoenix, Kei Kas, Greenhaven Crimewatch, the Downs, Vanguard and Welcome Estate Neighbourhood Watches. These Neighbourhood Watches all operate in the immediate vicinity of broader Manenberg. For the same period the Neighbourhood Watch structures were provided with equipment in the form of 65 pairs of boots, 13 torches and 21 bicycles.

We also continue to work closely with the Community Police Forums and other structures in the area and have made funding and training available to them via the Expanded Partnership Programme. We also continue to recruit youth at risk within Manenberg to participate in our Chrysalis Youth Development Programme and the Youth Work Programme which equip such youths with three months' intensive training and nine months' work placement. We continue to assist also FET Colleges in recruiting students in at risk areas and here we focus primarily on students or learners involved or youth involved with drugs and gangs and so forth.

We also conduct watching briefs over many of the gang related cases in court and continuously report to the Provincial Commissioner and the Standing Committee on cases of poor policing. In this regard we are supported by the office of the Western Cape Police Ombudsman who attends to complaints from communities about poor police services.

We have furthermore established important partnership agreements with the religious fraternity within Manenberg to provide youth with diversion activities and programmes during the school holiday period. During the 2015/2016 financial year a total of five such partnership agreements were signed which benefited a reported 900 children from Manenberg.

In addition, during 2015/2016 I have personally conducted four walkabouts in Manenberg in partnership with the South African Police and community structures like the CPF and local Neighbourhood Watches.

The drug problem and availability of guns in our communities remain a major concern.

As a whole we must find ways to stop the flow of drugs and availability of guns which so often fuel the gang fights as they are closely linked to the drug trade. For years now we as a whole, as the Government, police and communities and as a collective, struggle to find the necessary answers.

Our support to the Stabilisation Unit and its subsequent success is evidence of what effect specialised police units can have in a particular area and we have been asking since 2011 for these units, to be reinstated and it is not done as yet and we believe the reinstatement of the specialised units can help to tackle the scourge of gangsterism and drugs on the Cape Flats. I hope that the new gun and drug specialised units under the Hawks, as announced by President Jacob Zuma, are able to have success on a larger scale.

The questions about Manenberg are also applicable to other areas on the Cape Flats affected by gangsterism and drugs. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, follow-up?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In light of the heightened violence that is taking place in most of the Cape Flats areas, what has the Minister done in relation to the Constitution of the Western Cape, Chapter 8 section 66 (1) (d). What have you done to make sure that there are good relationships between the community and the police, because some of the problems which have taken place in these areas are because there is no interaction – we have been told that there is discussion amongst members of communities and the police in this regard. What do we have practically – so that we do not talk about paper work that has been done, so that we tick boxes that this paper work has been done, this legislation has been done or not done. What, practically, are we putting in place? What programmes can we talk to that are really opening matters between the police and the community at the moment?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the follow-up question. A lot is happening currently on the ground in many areas across the province, specifically in the gangster stricken areas on the Cape Flats.

I think our programmes in many of the communities speak for themselves. I

have raised a couple. First of all, the relationship with the South Africa Police Service is a sound relationship, we are working very closely with them. Even last week, even during this current week on my walkabouts, in my meetings in many communities and community halls, SAPS is always present. They walk with us, they address the issues with us. Even with regard to our programmes, our FET College initiative to lure the young gangsters away from gangsterism. I think I have reported in this House already just last year, that we managed to draw just over 6 500 such youngsters away from drugs and gangs and put them into FET Colleges for them to better their lives and that process is continuing. It is currently happening as I speak.

Our other divergent programmes - partnerships with the religious fraternity - those are also on-going. For the upcoming June/July holiday period we have already signed agreements with a couple of the religious sectors out there to keep the youth busy and that will also continue. And in Manenberg I did mention to you a figure of just over between 900 to 1 000 being kept busy over the December/January holiday period. So those are just some of the interventions. Our walking bus initiatives in many of the communities, also with the SAPS, with our structures such as Neighbourhood Watches and CPFs are on-going.

The main issue, what we do not have control over is to stop the flow of drugs, to stop the guns, to confiscate the drugs and confiscate the guns and to take a case up to the level of the courts. That is primarily the task of the

South Africa Police Service. Our conviction rate in the Western Cape, specifically on the Cape Flats, is dismal, very, very low and we need to find answers for that. There is really no consequence for people committing crimes such as murders and involvement with drugs and gangs. That is a major problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wenger first?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Given that violence and in particular gang violence in Manenberg is such a great concern and policing is an important part in preventing and combating that gangsterism, why is it so that over the last six years, so since 2010, Manenberg Police Station has 40 less visible police officers and 13 less detectives than they did six years ago?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think that was raised before, the situation in Manenberg regarding manpower at that specific police station; likewise others, not Manenberg alone, I need to say that. It is dismally low and we did appeal to the SAPS management already to rectify the situation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Tyatyam, do you have a follow-up?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. In his response earlier on

the MEC was saying that they are also interacting ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... with work done by their Ombudsman. What I want to know from the Minister: what is the work done by the Ombudsman? What are the recommendations that are there in terms of dealing with the situation in Manenberg, because every week for the past two or three months we have seen an increase in the murder rate statistics there. So, we have an Ombudsman, we have someone who has assisted you in Khayelitsha. What are the recommendations currently or how do we change the situation there?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, what the member was saying is definitely not the role of the Ombud's office. The Ombudsman's office's role is specifically dealing with poor service delivery in effective policing, complaints received from the public regarding poor service delivery. The issues you raise are primarily operational issues for the police management to look at. Unfortunately it is out of my domain and out of my office. As I receive the information, the complaints myself, I refer them to the Provincial Commissioner for his attention.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Just lastly ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last opportunity, hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Just lastly, Mr Deputy Speaker, do you think that you have good relations with the Provincial Police, because some of the issues that you are saying are out of your range are just a matter of communication with the colleagues, you know? Do you have a good relationship with them and if not, why must we continue to ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Tyatyam, the question does not relate directly to the question. Maybe the Minister wants to respond but he is not obliged to respond to that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am quite happy to respond to that question, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me say to the hon member, from where I am sitting in this position, I am not always in a position to be the nice guy. If there are problems, if there are specific issues, we are also there to speak up about specific issues and from time to time the people you talk about might not like your stance, might not like the manner in which you deal with a specific issue.

We are not here only to laugh with one another and that sort of thing. If there is mismanagement, if there are service delivery complaints, in accordance with the Constitution, section 206 of the Constitution, it is the duty of the MEC to bring those issues under the attention of the Provincial Commissioner. If I am not happy with the manner in which the Provincial

Commissioner deals with those specific issues, I have the right to contact and bring those issues to the attention of the National Commissioner of Police and I believe the relationship is quite sound. I myself and the new Provincial Commissioner, we talk from time to time, we phone one another, we have had our meetings; this morning my office was talking to the Provincial Commissioner's office on various policing matters.

I believe it is a sound relationship but if there are specific issues and we raise it, it does not mean that the relationship is not sound. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to Question number 8, hon Tyatyam. Hon Tyatyam, again your question to Minister Schäfer. Minister Schäfer?

Security for teachers and learners

8. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Education:

What is she and her Department doing to provide a secure environment for teachers and learners at schools in the province?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. 246 schools are provided with the minimum-security measures, which are: appropriate fencing, burglar bars, security gates and an alarm linked to armed

response services. The alarm is the first line of defence against would-be burglars.

1 245 schools, as per completed safety committee templates, are also encouraged, in line with the third prong of our strategy, to forge partnerships with the Neighbourhood Watch, Community Policing Forums and especially the community that lives in close proximity to the school.

The schools are further encouraged to liaise with their local police station to do periodic patrols. Every school is linked to a police station as part of protocol between SAPS and the DBE. 1 245 are currently linked to a station as per the completed school safety committee templates.

The armed response companies are also requested to do more frequent patrols, as we believe that visibility of law enforcement is a good deterrent to would-be vandals and burglars.

Every school safety committee, which every school is supposed to have, was required to complete a safety audit. We then supported 246 schools with target hardening security mechanisms in 2015-2016 which include: security gates, stone guards, in line with the Directorate Physical Resources norms and standards, raising or reinforcing of low fences with razor wire.

Apart from the target hardening security mechanisms we, at the request from the schools, implement developmental programmes. Developmental

programmes include: life skills for learners at risk to prevent possible problems, or cope better with existing situations related to teenage pregnancy, sexuality, sexual abuse, drug abuse, gender inequality, gender-based violence, bullying, HIV and AIDS, racism and other social problems. In 2015, 5 140 learners, 49 educators and 120 educators participated in holiday programmes whilst 2 348 learners, 57 educators and 19 parents participated in after school programmes.

Safe Schools units train educators and learners in conflict management and mediation which assist with the management of discipline. Each year the primary focus is on the 50 Core Schools.

School Safety Committees and SGBs, which include the learner component in high schools, also receive training in Occupational Health and Safety, this includes training in first aid and fire fighting as well as the development of Safety and Evacuation Plans. 156 schools were trained during the first quarter of 2016.

Apart from these measures, other pro-active measures that are taken to make schools safe and resilient are the deployment of holiday security at specific schools. In 2015-16 on average 410 schools per quarter received holiday security. The security is deployed from 12-hr security to 24-hr stationary shifts. The strategy is determined by the categorisation of the school, based on SAPS and Safe Schools Call Centre statistics.

We operate a Safe Schools Call Centre, which schools can access on a toll free number. The Call Centre, depending on the call, will ensure that the school is supported by the relevant emergency agency and receive information of psycho-social support. The Safe Schools Call Centre received 2 120 calls during the first quarter of 2016.

The most effective strategy is to involve the community, who becomes the custodians of the school during school holidays, weekends and on other days, by informing the law enforcement agencies and the school principal of illegal entry onto the school premises.

The principal is responsible for the implementation of the school's code of conduct at all times. Search and seizure exercises are performed at school level where it is necessary and requested by the school but is dependent on co-operation from SAPS. 23 schools requested search and seizures during the first term of 2016 and items found on learners include knives and dagga.

So the answer to the question is, we are doing quite a lot to ensure that we have safe school premises and environments.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, yes, yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to take one case which I believe the Department has been following. It is in relation – I am not going to give the name and the name of the school – to the boy

who has about eight transgressions and those transgressions relate to either teachers or the pupils of that school, to the extent that we are told that some of the pupils at that stage were not going to school because of the fears. You might have seen the report in the last month around this particular issue.

So one would want to know what the Minister has done to actually alleviate and change the situation because if it continues it means that there are many dropouts that you are going to have in this particular school? Is there any proper counselling process that has taken place and what is happening with the boy?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: If the member wants to know an answer on a particular case, I would appreciate it if you ask that particular question. The matter is being investigated but as you will also appreciate, when it comes to learners the action has to be taken by the governing bodies and very often that is where we have problems because the Department cannot force the governing body to take action against the learner. I do know the case you are referring to and I believe there also were more circumstances to that case than actually were reported but it is under investigation so I cannot say anything further at this point.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, second one?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, listening to your response and given the fact that a couple of days ago teachers organised

a symposium and the outcome really was that teachers feel that they are not safe at schools and opting to leave the profession. Don't you think that the Department has a bigger role to play to assist governing bodies in ensuring that teachers do not leave the profession?

From what I am hearing from you it is the responsibility of the governing bodies and the principal to implement whatever there is, but in this event where teachers are at the point of saying they want to leave the profession, don't you think that your Department needs to intervene urgently to assist and to ensure safety – because obviously there are cases that those teachers have highlighted in terms of why they want to leave the service.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Wiley, I think he has come to the end of his question. Was that your point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member Olivier. It is extremely concerning obviously that teachers are not feeling safe in their workplace environment and we always do everything we possibly can to assist them. I know also that it is not only issues regarding SUBs, it is general security issues which are a problem, as we all know. We also know that we are under-resourced by the SAPS and that is contributing to the

problem.

SUBs certainly do need capacitation as far as disciplinary action is concerned against learners and we have had a recent discussion on that issue and I certainly have asked my Department to ensure that they are better capacitated to make sure that, where necessary, action is taken against learners but it certainly is not only for the Education Department to do. We are doing everything we can. If you have any suggestions as to what else we can do, with the necessary budget, I would be very happy to hear them. But it is a huge concern that our teachers are not feeling safe and we are doing everything we can do but we have to have the co-operation of all role players in the security arena.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a further one, hon member Tyatyam, another short question?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Without going all over the place, just take another example, a teacher this time, not a pupil. What have you done in relation to this teacher who was beaten up and robbed in the classroom?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As I said, if it is something that happened by a learner then the school governing body must introduce disciplinary procedures and that matter is also still being investigated.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The teacher [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The teacher beat up a teacher?

Mr S G TYATYAM: The teacher was beaten up and robbed in a classroom.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: By a learner?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. [Inaudible.] You do not know?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No, I said if it is by a learner then it is up to the governing body to institute disciplinary action.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I am asking about the teacher, the health and welfare of the teacher ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Okay. No, no, teachers always are able to access counselling services if anything like that happens and, if I recall correctly, in that case that has been offered and given to that teacher.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. We will then proceed to the next question. The next question is Question number 9, hon Lekker to ask Minister Plato. I see Minister Plato.

Police stations: Brown's Farm or Samora Machel

9. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) Whether there are plans to build a police station at (a) Brown's Farm or (b) Samora Machel; if so;
- (2) whether land has been procured for this purpose; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you and also to the member for the question regarding Brown's Farm, Samora Machel and police stations.

The need for the construction of a new police station at Brown's Farm is indicated on the Capital Works priority list of the Province as priority number 6. The need has not yet been encompassed on the National Annual Performance Plan, or called the APP.

The construction of a new police station at Samora Machel/Weltevreden was encompassed on the National Annual Performance Plan. It was scheduled for site clearance during the 2015/2016 financial year, but all efforts to secure a site for this purpose have been unsuccessful. Planning and design was scheduled for the 2016/2017 financial year but this cannot proceed at present due to the unavailability of a site. No land has been procured for both areas

as yet.

But it is, however, necessary to stress that these communities most in need of well-resourced policing services cannot be appeased with promises in attempts to calm protesting residents.

I requested timelines for the three stations promised to be erected, fully staffed and operational. To date, I have yet to receive any information.

A similar promise of a mobile police station for the Brown's Farm area was made by the former Provincial Police Commissioner, Mr Lamoer, in October 2012 when he announced that a new mobile police station would be opened in the area soon.

Most recently, according to Lieutenant Colonel Norman Joseph, as per various media reports on 22 April 2016, a fully-fledged police station was on the cards for the Brown's Farm area.

To assist in ensuring that the people of these communities receive the quality safety service delivery that they deserve, I have already engaged the Department of Public Works and the City of Cape Town to assist the South African Police Service in finding a suitable site for a police station and I await their feedback. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the Minister whether he would consider adding to that request for the timelines also an undertaking from the South Africa Police Service that when those stations are built, that the requisite number of additional police officers will be secured for those stations so that we do not have a situation like Mitchells Plain where it was a case of robbing Peter to pay Paul, where officers from Mitchells Plain were simply transferred to Lentegeur when that was opened.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I note the request from my honourable colleague. I find no problem in making such a request to the Provincial Commissioner.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Gillion for the second supplementary question.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I need to know from the MEC regarding the land issue for the site for these police stations: when did he make contact with the different departments and the City of Cape Town and when is he expecting an answer back from them, because what is important is if this is planned for, we cannot plan without having the available land? So what is the time frame that he has given this Department?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I just need to advise the hon member that I assist the police in this regard. It is not my duty or that of my office but we are working closely together with SAPS, we understand the need to find a suitable site and I did write letters some time ago and maybe at a later stage I can give you some more exact information pertaining to this issue.

It is the primary duty of the National Department of Public Works to find a suitable site, but it seems to me they had problems in doing that and that is why I entered the debate to assist them in finding a suitable site and we hope we will find such a site very, very soon. I was also in contact with my local colleague Minister Grant, also to assist in that regard. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed. Question number 10 will stand over.

[Question 10 standing over.]

Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme: funding

11. Ms S W Davids asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

What is his Department doing with the money of the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme (CASP) which is supposed to help small-scale farmers?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you to hon member Davids for the question.

The purpose of the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme is to provide effective agricultural support services, to promote and facilitate agricultural development and these are by targeting beneficiaries of land restitution and land redistribution and other black producers who have acquired land through private means and are engaged in value-adding enterprises.

The Department adopted a commodity approach in 2009 and has followed this ever since. This is an arrangement that draws in multiple spheres of government and the private sector, each understanding their unique roles, working from the same plan, towards achieving the same outcomes. The value of this approach is that it has facilitated access to mentorship support and markets for smallholder farmers from their commercial counterparts in the province, and thereby facilitates the graduation of the former into the higher category. A total of 456 farmers – these are smallholder farmers - across the province had been supported since 2009 targeting key commodities of the Western Cape. Furthermore, over 7 000 households have benefited from our

suitcase programme aimed at enhancing food security at the household level.

In addition, CASP grants allow for the strengthening of the extension and advisory services through the Extension Recovery Plan. The Department has introduced Smart-Pen technology, which has also enhanced the quality and visibility of the extension services across the province. The Smart-Pen technology allows the managers to view in real-time the kind of advice rendered to farmers and thereby enabling them to respond timeously when there are challenges.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Minister is all over – this fund must be used for small-scale farmers. My question is: what is the Department doing with the money of the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme which is supposed to support small-scale farmers?

In the last year the MEC said that the small-scale farmers in the Western Cape are only 1%. Now we are speaking about supporting the small-scale farmers, you are supporting black farmers that also came into the sector and all of them. We are speaking about small-scale farmers because the money is for the small farmers. National is giving that money for small-scale farmers. You are saying we only have 1% of small-scale farmers in this province, so what is the Department doing with the other money? Thank you.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

An HON MEMBER: Minister, you are not a blesser.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Okay, it is always difficult to [Inaudible.] Yes, all over the place is getting around the province, that is right. You need to do that a little bit more often.

The second thing is, what are we doing with our CASP money? I will tell you what we are doing with our CASP money, Mr Deputy Speaker, we are spending it. [Interjections.]

We then also measure it and the hon member has been on this Committee for a long time, she has had all of the annual reports, all of the reports on how we spend that money and of course how we measure how we spend that money as well and you will know that in this province 62% of those farmers who receive that money are in the successful category, which is way, way higher than the rest of the country.

And of course you would have also seen that we have put that at 70% success rate as the new target for this year and as when we spoke in the Standing Committee, I said: you know, it is quite risky even putting 70% because in the normal SMME space you have got an 80% failure rate for SMME start-

ups. Here we are calling for a 70% success rate, which is a pretty tall order but my predecessor attained 62% with this Department. It shows that kind of support, alongside the money and of course in the model that we have approached in this province where it is called the commodity approach where the [Inaudible] growers or the table grape association, those farmers are sitting in those same committees, helping with mentorship, helping with support to change this.

So now the hon member speaks about CASP and that is exactly what CASP is, and then she spoke about 1%. Now the 1% is a totally different issue; that talks about land reform and if she wants to talk about land reform other than what we have got in this question – because this question talks about CASP, it does not talk about land reform. And we can get into that but that is a whole different debate and I really would like to enter into a debate in that space because, quite frankly, when we speak about land reform and that 1% and the money that is supposed to become available for land reform, which is not only the CASP money, that is different money. And if you remember last time we were in this House there was a bit of a bun fight about that money because this side of the House was very excited about their land reform money; to make a difference to the 1% we need R2 billion a year in this province just to reach the 20% national development target, R2 billion.

Now there is money available, it sits in the Department of Land Reform and Rural Development but guess what they spend their land reform money on? Guess what they spend the money on? And this hon member said we want

people to own land ... [Interjections.] They build gymnasiums in Beaufort West. [Interjections.] I mean this is just crazy, when people are desperate for land, when we want to take that 1% to a different level. But do not worry, we will, along with those partners in this commodity approach and when that measurement comes out we will see where we have got to in this province, in our term, moving from 1% to a different number.

I can assure you it is going to be a very different number to what the rest of the country has because in the rest of the country's space where your political party has the policy directive and has the budget, you spend it on other things. [Interjection.] It is totally ridiculous. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is why I am saying ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Davids, just one second. I will first see the hon member Lentit. I will come back to you.

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can the Minister give us some feedback on the current status of the Bellevue Project that he supported under the Rural Development Department? Bellevue.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am not sure whether it relates to the question but you are welcome to take it. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It absolutely relates to this because this is where again land reform - and the hon member Davids actually brought the 1% into it – this is exactly in that 1% discussion where land does become available. And Bellevue, which I am sure you are all quite aware of, this is where black farmers are put on land but still today, two and a half years later, of writing regular letters to the Minister and the Deputy Minister, we still do not have a lease contract for those two farmers on that property. [Interjections.]

My Department is looking at even finding them alternative land now and we have already had the private sector farmers, the commercial farmers around, bailing them out for electricity bills and water bills. [Interjections.] There is still no support. I mean this is a basic thing for this Department to get right, but of course they are not concentrating on that, they are spending their time building gymnasiums. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I thank you, hon Minister, for the one of Bellevue. You see, hon Minister, you must do your work. [Interjections.] I had a meeting with the National Department officials and they are going to interact with those stakeholders so that they can get the lease and we are having the next meeting – maybe you must come and sit in – on the 9th of June. Hon Minister, I will invite you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you for that one. So we are going back, hon Minister, to the small-scale farmers. Small-scale farmers in the Western Cape do not feel that we are really appreciating them. Yes, officials can come to us with nice reports but the actual fact is, what is the reality out there? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: And then, hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... I want you to interact with ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, just one second. Hon member Wiley? [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is not statement time, really. You know the Rules of the House are very clear. [Interjections.] There can be a preamble to a question of a short duration and then a question. This is just statement making.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Wiley, I am listening carefully and the member was coming to the question now. Finish it, please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, I am finishing up, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Maybe the Minister and our Standing Committee must go out there. I will even submit the names of the small-scale farmers with the queries and then we must go and visit and get the real facts from the people, thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: There was no question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you want to respond you are welcome to respond.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So perhaps I will respond. You know, I did not really get the question out of that but I would welcome the names to be submitted because we would love to go and have a look but perhaps just continuing in the vein, seeing it was a follow-up question, if you notice the hon Deputy Minister of

Land Reform in the National Assembly the other day replying to the budget debate, he lashed into this Department and myself in exactly the same vein on why we allowed this chicken farm in the Swartland area to fail. Why this farm where we are getting black farmers going, we just actually did not allow or did not give the support for this farm to succeed, this CASP money has been spent, et cetera, et cetera. So I am listening to this debate, I am texting Mr Mogale Sebopetsa in the Department saying, what farm is the Minister talking about, we need to deal with this, this is unacceptable. And Mr Sebopetsa says: well, we have got nothing on record of this chicken farm in the Swartland but we will investigate.

I then write a letter to the Minister to say: Minister, here is the piece of Hansard on where you lashed this Department and myself for not supporting these chicken farmers in the Swartland area, but please can you explain to me which farm it is because we apologise if we have not done our job, we really want to get in there and fix it. Well, to date, three times he still has not answered my letter but we have actually found out which farm he was referring to and this was a farm that the National Department decided that they did not want to give to the Western Cape. They gave this, the support of this farm to the ARC and asked them, which is not their job, at a national level to develop this farm in the Swartland. That is the farm he is talking about that is a failure. So again I ask the hon member that please, this is her political party that is failing dismally at a national level, really, really shocking stuff. And I actually welcome her getting involved in the Bellevue farm and please give me that date, I would love to be there. I hope the same

officials are there that were there when I called the meeting, that have been there month after month. I hope that all of them are there, because it would be quite nice to ask them how come it has taken them two and a half years to get to this space where it should have taken a month to get a lease.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Would the Minister say that this is a case of the chickens coming home to roost? [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you need not reply to that. We will then proceed to the next question, Question 12. Hon Davids again to Minister Winde.

Small farmers: Philippi and Picketberg

12. Ms S W Davids asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

How is his Department assisting the small farmers of (a) Philippi and (b) Picketberg?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Department has adopted a commodity approach through which smallholder farmers are being

supported, exactly as per the previous question. This support includes production inputs, infrastructure development and capacity building through extension and delivery of accredited and non-accredited training.

Two parts to the answer, the first is Philippi or Philippi Horticultural Area. The Department supports a number of smallholder farmers in the area as part of the land reform programme, in conjunction with the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform. Since 2009 the Department has supported a total of 14 smallholder farmers with the means to produce, as well as the required infrastructure to strengthen their businesses, mainly in the poultry and vegetable production commodities. A total of R15 million has been spent in the last three years. As in other regions, these farmers are supported through the commodity approach processes. And of course perhaps I can refer you to - we have had a number of these farmers in the House to congratulate them. You will remember Mrs Japie with 10 000 chickens supplying Pick 'n Pay chains across the province, et cetera. So those are the type of farmers.

We also have an office in support of these farmers. The Philippi office is based in the Philippi Business Village and continues to provide extension and advisory services to all farmers in that area.

Then b), the Piketberg area. The Department supports a number of smallholder farmers in this area, in conjunction with the land reform programme and the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform and this is also since 2009, the Department has supported a total of 12

smallholder farmers with the means to produce as well as give them the required infrastructure to strengthen their businesses. And in addition we have spent R12 million there now in the last while and this is also the area that we have focused on - over and above the general CASP and extension services, this is also an area that has received drought relief money and if you remember the R11 million last year that we made available, primarily went into this area as a key area affected by the drought. I also personally visited all those farms with the drought that we had supported financially and you know I will take any further questions if there are more to answer on that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question? [Interjection.] Is there a follow-up question, hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Minister has spoken around Philippi, that is fine. My question is on Picketberg specifically. Hon Minister, you are saying that during the drought you spent R11 million there, but there are two farmers there which went through serious drought and they were not assisted. And again I will give you those names and you can go to them and question them yourself.

So even at our visit there, it was said that yes, they had the interaction with the Department but nothing came from that interaction with the Department. So, hon Minister, how are you keeping your Department accountable to make sure that they are really assisting Philippi and Picketberg? Because currently, hon Minister, in Picketberg, two farmers are now saying they are not going to farm anymore, they are giving up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So again they are referring back to the Picketberg area and the farmers there. If I have not received their names I cannot put it through into the system, so I am not sure if they have applied or not and please give it to me, I will check and ask those questions. There are obviously criteria, we cannot just hand out money if it is not necessary and we also go and have a look at those specific farms when they do make application for that kind of support.

Perhaps in addition to the National Department, it was quite interesting specifically referring back to the Philippi area – I am not sure if you are aware but both the National Minister of Agriculture and the Deputy Minister of Agriculture had a meeting yesterday about the Philippi Horticultural Area. I am not sure if you know about it. It is quite interesting; whenever the National Minister or the Deputy Minister visits any province in this country, they always ask the MEC for Agriculture to join them. They never do that in

this province. But quite interesting, they were having this meeting last night with the Philippi Horticultural Area and guess what they did, at the last minute – they still did not invite me or go through my office but what they did do is ask the Department please, please, please tell us about what kind of support is given to the Philippi Horticultural Area so we can at least ask some questions for them. [Interjection.] And this is exactly...they do not know what happens in that area but they do not even have the courtesy to involve the local elected representative in that specific area here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! The time allotted for questions has expired. [Interjections.] Order! The time allotted for questions has expired. The two questions that stand over will be printed in Hansard. The replies will be printed in Hansard.

We then proceed to Questions to the Premier without notice. The first one is again the hon member Ms Davids. [Interjections.]

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, my question to you is: what is the position of your Government on the rezoning of the Philippi Horticultural Area which will result in the sale of the land to private developers in the context of the threat to sustainable food security and job creation for the residents of Philippi, Mitchells Plain, Nyanga, Khayelitsha,

Gugulethu and Manenberg, which are amongst the most vulnerable communities in Cape Town?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, rezoning is a function of Local Government, it is not a function of Provincial Government and as you know we are autonomous spheres of government and I cannot comment on a rezoning and I certainly cannot even comment if an appeal comes to the provincial sphere of government because that role is the role of the hon Minister of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, your first opportunity.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Is Madam Premier now confirming that the wellbeing of developers is more important than the livelihood of the emerging farmers and residents of these communities [Interjections] and the greater Cape Town in terms of provision of food security? Are you saying that?

The PREMIER: It would be best if the hon member Davids' responses and follow-up questions were not written before she listens to my answers because she sits there and takes the questions from the researchers and all the follow-ups from the researchers that take absolutely no account of what I have just said. So, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is just a farce in this House

because the entire point is that we are supposed to debate across the floor, but the hon Davids asks a follow-up question which makes it absolutely clear that she has not listened to a word I said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, your last opportunity.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker, through you to the Premier. I understand what she said. She is speaking about rezoning, rezoning is under the municipality but you are the Premier of the Western Cape and this is very important within the Western Cape. Is the Premier aware that the Minister of Agriculture and Economic Development, hon Alan Winde, is not in support of this rezoning and subsequent development and does he have no intent of supporting that development?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, we have not discussed this in the Cabinet and I am sure that anybody who wishes to make a comment, when a potential rezoning may or may not be advertised by the City of Cape Town – because I do not know what their intentions are and I do not interfere or stray into the preserve of an autonomous sphere of government – then people can make their comments and due process can be followed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We proceed to the second questioner, the hon member Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, through you. The hon Premier in her 2009 inaugural speech highlighted the necessity of a concentrated strategy to grow the economy and to create jobs or job zones, as she said at that time, that would ensure employment opportunities in the Western Cape. I would like to ask, what was her Government's approach to develop a strategy around this commitment and can the Premier unpack what progress has been made regarding a job strategy and how did this strategy evolve? Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Deputy Speaker. Yes, the job zone strategy was one that I mentioned in 2009 and it is one that we have been working on very hard and which has evolved very well in the last seven years.

Firstly, we have two special zones; one is an industrial development zone around Saldanha Bay and the other is a green economic zone around Atlantis, both on the West Coast, both seriously economically disadvantaged and both with very serious unemployment levels. So I am very pleased to say we have been working well with the National Government and the Local Government in the affected areas and particularly with the Department of Trade and Industry and the Department of Economic Development at national level, we have been working to ensure that everything is in place for the Industrial Development Zone and to create a hub, an industrial and manufacturing hub and oil and gas service hub around Saldanha Bay, which is a natural deep

water port.

It is also crucial that we take advantage of a crisis and turn it into an opportunity in the green energy space and that is what we are doing in Atlantis and with enormous help from the City, have made it very attractive for people and industrialists especially, to buy land in Atlantis and to start green manufacturing enterprises there – not only green manufacturing enterprises there but other manufacturing enterprises and in fact they have created many hundreds of job opportunities in that context.

What has also flowed from it is another very important consideration, which is ensuring that the skills are in place, so that people can take up those job opportunities and that is why we have a Skills Game-Changer, very particularly for the oil and gas sector, so that the oil and gas sector, as it develops around Saldanah Bay's Industrial Development Zone, will be able to be serviced by South Africans who have the relevant skills, which obviously requires working back into the schools to ensure that children have the right subjects to be able to get the right technical and artisan training, in order to be able to be employed in that very important and growing sector with enormous potential.

Equally, because we are beginning to sort out the energy problem in the Western Cape, it gives us a massive competitive advantage within investment generally, and the idea is to turn the entire province into a flourishing job zone which looks as if it is coming to fruition, because even though we are in

an economic crisis and even though in the rest of the country unemployment is going up very dramatically, in the Western Cape, despite the fact that our population has grown very substantially, we are bringing unemployment down as a percentage. That is an extraordinary achievement in the current context and it focuses and points to the success of our strategies to align our investment as Government, our efforts as Government into the sectors that are going to grow.

The other crucial sector that has shown enormous potential is tourism. The efforts that we have put into it, with a bumper tourism season, despite all the efforts of the National Government to make it difficult for tourists to come to South Africa, we nevertheless had a bumper tourist season and because young entrepreneurs get into developing new apps like *Airbnb* and other things, you find a situation where there are a lot of people starting their own tourism businesses in their own houses and creating jobs. So these are all very important indicators.

The other issue is in agri-processing and again all over the province you see people working in agri-processing to convert products, our natural products like aloes [Interjection.] our products like Rooibos tea and all of those into very beneficiated products that create new markets, manufacturing jobs ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Premier, just one second. There is too much comment from the other side which is not constructive at the moment.

Hon Premier, please continue.

The PREMIER: So we have three sectors that are growing very significantly and creating jobs and those are the sectors that we are facilitating with our policies across the board. The important thing is that we have done an enormous amount and with the regeneration of the small harbours that we hope is going to follow, despite the incredible delays put on us by the National Government, with Aquaculture and various other things, we look as if we are well on the way to economic growth and job creation in this province. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Dugmore, you are talking together with the Premier. It is difficult to hear the Premier while you are having a conversation there across the floor. Please contain yourself. Hon member Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Premier mentioned the population growth. Now based on the latest census figures and also the current Game-Changers Strategy, will the current Game-Changers Strategy be able to have room in its strategy to create more jobs and what are the plans in hand?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please repeat, the Premier couldn't hear the question.

Mr R B LENTIT: Based on the latest ... [Interjection.] †Bly stil! [Keep quiet!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue. Hon member Dugmore, please allow the member to proceed with the question.

Mr R B LENTIT: Based on the latest census figures, that indicates that there is a growth in the population of the Western Cape, specifically the Metro area, and with the current Game-Changer Strategy, since 2009 and where we are now, since 2014 with the new Game-Changer Strategies of the Premier and her Cabinet, will the new Game-Changer Strategies make room or is there room for improvement or to adjust the strategy to make way or to increase job opportunities? Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. It is a very important question. Almost every one of our Game-Changers is designed to create a pipeline in which our citizens will be well prepared for jobs and our economy will be able to take them up. That is the priority of the policies of this Government and the interventions that we are making, so we have to create a conducive environment for economic growth hence broadband, hence energy, hence the focus on the areas in which we can grow quickly enough to create the jobs for the job seekers that we have but also to gear education and training and especially technical and vocational education and training towards the jobs that we foresee being created in the emergent industries.

So the Game-Changers are very much focussed on that. There is the Energy Game-Changer which goes without saying because unless you have a reliable energy supply no one is going to invest and already when the rest of the country has stage one load shedding, the Western Cape does not. So, if we can guarantee potential investors electricity in the Western Cape, we have an enormous competitive advantage for investment and for jobs.

Another Game-Changer, as I said, is skills development. We have put an enormous amount of work into identifying where the economy is growing, what priority skills are needed, in tourism particularly, in oil and gas, in agri-processing and other sectors of the economy and we are aligning that into the further education and training sector, now called the TVET sector, to ensure that our young people are getting the skills that they need.

Another crucial Game-Changer is e-learning. In this modern world, on the backbone of broadband, all young people are moving into a digital era and it is very important that when they go to work and when the economy and knowledge economy create opportunities, people must be digitally literate. They must be information literate, they must know how to harness technology to solve problems. And that is why we are introducing e-learning which is critically aligned to the whole notion of economic growth and job creation and skills acquisition so that our young people are informationally literate and can apply that literacy in any context in which they happen to be in the future.

Then we also have the After-schools Game-Changer. Many young people find themselves on the streets after school with nothing productive to do and that is where they fall prey and are vulnerable to the gangs, the drugs and the blessers. And in that context we want to create a context in the after-school space, at schools, at centres, at libraries, where young people can be productively involved in academic support activities, in sports activities and in cultural activities.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: And in all of those areas we are making really, really good progress. So those are just some of the Game-Changers. I'm not going to mention all of them, because some are not directly aligned to economic growth and skills, but the vast majority of them are, because we know that if we want to aim towards social inclusion, especially people who come here with very few skills and very few opportunities, that social inclusion is going to be facilitated first and foremost by the possibility of getting a job.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Lentit, your second opportunity.

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Based on the response from the Premier, and if I can just summarize this, not summarize but to make my question a bit shorter, are there any investment opportunities to complement the Atlantis Economic Zones for the future?

The PREMIER: Absolutely. Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. For every major investment there are spin-off investments. So, if we succeed in turning Saldanha Bay into the major rig repair hub of the Southern Hemisphere, you can imagine the downstream opportunities for businesses to open in that area. They are enormous. A lot of skilled work has to go into rig maintenance and repair, but there are a lot of back services and right down, for example, to domestic support services for people who go and live and work there and run the businesses there. So it's a whole pipeline of opportunities that gets created by major investment.

I am delighted to say that specifically with Atlantis, when some people start showing interest in industrial investment in a particular area, it takes off and as we know *Hisense*, which is one of the world's largest technology manufacturers, has established its major factory outside of China in Atlantis, and has delivered such good results in terms of productivity, in terms of sales, in terms of quality, in terms of export volumes and in terms of revenue, that they're about to increase that facility very substantially. And they are also spreading the good news across China about the good value and the skills and the work ethic that are available in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we then proceed to the third question.
Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, what are

the implications for Government of the judiciary intruding into the Executive's role as found in yesterday's, 1st June 2016, Appeal Court Judgment in a matter between MEC of Social Development Western Cape versus the Justice Alliance of South Africa?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have not yet read the full judgment, but I have read a comprehensive summary of the judgment, and in my view it is highly significant. We have a very good Constitution, but currently we are in the process of giving substance through case law to the spirit and the letter of the Constitution. And yesterday's judgment seems to have been a very, very important milestone in this process.

The Justice Alliance of South Africa brought this case to challenge a decision of the Department of Social Development and Education about the potential future uses of a facility. This went to Court and to cut a long judgment to the bone, firstly the case was lost in the Western Cape High Court. We appealed that case. It went on appeal and the Appeal Judges upheld our appeal and overruled the Judge in the Western Cape High Court, and the ruling said very plainly that a decision around how to use a public facility and how to allocate a public budget, is the decision of the elected Executive in a province, and that the courts cannot encroach on that decision on the basis of separation of powers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko, your first opportunity.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, how does the Western Cape Government manage the negative public opinion which is created by High Court Judgments that are wrong in law?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Yes, some, it is very unfortunate that there are still some judgments that are so patently wrong in law as that High Court judgment was. It was very obvious even to me from the beginning, that that judgment was wrong in law. But all Judges will make a mistake at some point in their careers. All Judges will make a mistake, which is why our Constitution allows for appeal mechanisms. That is part of the checks and balances of a judicial system. So when we believed we had a case to go on appeal, we went on appeal and we won that appeal, and so in the interim obviously the public debate has significant implications, but all's well that ends well. Because when the Supreme Court of Appeals said we were in the right, which we believed from the beginning, it settles the matter and it shows that NGO's, however well-intentioned they may be, don't have a right to take decisions for Government, and nor can courts take decisions for Government.

NGO's can certainly challenge us in court if we violate the Constitution or the law, but they cannot challenge us in court around policy decisions that

Government makes and if they want to make policy decision, they must also stand for election and get into government, and then they can take the policy decisions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko, your last opportunity.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. If I may ask: hon Premier, what is the cost to the Western Cape Government in time and money when well-meaning civil society groups try and take over the right of the Government to make policy decisions on how to use resources?

The PREMIER: Yes, thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, the cost is tremendous. The cost is tremendous because we spend a lot of money on unnecessary court cases that we eventually win. But it takes a lot of time, it takes a lot of effort, it takes a lot of money, but often the worst consequence is the fact that we cannot implement a policy that is intended to be for the benefit of the people of the Western Cape. And so I sometimes wonder whether some of these cases, certainly not all, but some of them are brought to impede rather than facilitate service delivery.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear, hear!

The PREMIER: And it is extraordinarily frustrating, but we live in a country that is a democracy under the rule of law, and so people must be able to exercise their rights. But that is what makes it all the more important that

this case law is established, because in future, people, no matter how well intentioned, will not be able to simply go along and bring a case on an issue that is for the Executive of a politically representative structure to decide, because their lawyers, I hope, will advise them that as this precedent has been established before, they will be wasting their time and their money by launching such a challenge. And that is how one builds a body of case law in a democracy.

Exactly the same can be said the other way around. So, for example, we have spent seven years establishing the principle of separation of powers with respect to the National Director of Public Prosecutions and the National Prosecuting Authority, to say that they have to take decisions independently of political considerations and in that instance, no politician or political considerations can impinge upon this sphere of authority or autonomy of the judiciary. And this judgment says that it works both ways.

Now of course we have spent an enormous amount of money on this particular venture and an enormous amount of time, and the sad thing is that we were unable to implement our policies in the usage of that facility. That all has a tremendous cost, but maybe in the end the cost may be worthwhile if we establish a body of case law that entrenches the rule of law, defends the Constitution and defends the critical principle of the separation of powers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. The time allotted for the questions to the Premier has expired. We will now proceed to Statements by

Members. First statement by the DA. Hon member Mitchell?

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Annually the month of June is celebrated as Youth Month in South Africa, and as we near National Youth Day on June the 16th, I take this opportunity to acknowledge the significant strides the DA-led Western Cape Government has made in positive youth development.

Each day the media reports on the social ills within our communities and bearing the most brunt is our young people. Gang violence and substance abuse are spiralling out of control because the National ANC-led Government is dragging their feet on intervening on the dysfunctional state of the criminal justice system through SAPS, the National Prosecuting Authority and the Department of Justice.

Against all odds, there are young people who are taking heed of the opportunities made available to them. Through the enabling environment provided by the DA-led Western Cape Government, they have made a conscious decision to not be youth at risk, but rather youth with possibility, with potential, with prosperous futures ahead of them.

Amongst the many examples of increasing opportunities for youth development, I refer to the Premier's advancement of Youth Project, the Year

Beyond Project, the Department of Culture Affairs and Sport's MOD Programme, the Department of Social Development's Youth Cafés, Economic Opportunities, Youth Entrepreneurship Projects and the Western Cape Education Department's commitment to providing quality education for all.

The DA-led Western Cape Government has proven to not only have the plan to bring the change we need to move South Africa forward again, but we have the political will and determination to put the people of our beloved country first by creating positive youth development programmes and job opportunities by embedding good governance and integrated service delivery. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. This DA is fast to preach to others, but slow to set the example. The latest DA sex scandal is the sex texts to a prospective municipal job seeker, one Pumie, by controversial DA Bitou Mayor, Memory Booysen. The DA wants all other parties to suspend erring public representatives, but Booysen is untouchable. The DA has yet to investigate the serious allegation of its face in Bitou.

Booyesen is no stranger to weird goings-on. Under his tenure massive housing fraud took place and major electricity theft, and miraculously Bitou got a clean audit rubber-stamped from the Auditor-General - which proves it is not about good governance, but ticking the accounting and compliance boxes.

While the DA gave its usual denial and claims all allegations are just politicking ahead of elections, Booyesen admitted the texts came from his phone ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please Hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ...and WhatsApp account ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier can you please take your seat.

Mr R T OLIVIER: He is saying ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: He claims the public ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, can you please take your seat. Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The hon member is attacking the integrity of the Chapter Nine Institution.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, noted. You may proceed.

Mr R T OLIVER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Let me continue with Chapter Nine. While the DA gave its usual denial and claims all allegations are just politicking ahead of the elections, Booyesen admitted the texts came from his phone and WhatsApp account. He claims that the public messages were sent while his phone was in for repairs.

Premier Helen Zille, on the 10th of April 2011, sang his praises in *The Memory Booyesen Story* and presented him as an inspiration to all South Africans, as well as the mayor of courage, principle and integrity. Is this Premier protecting this face of the DA who, in our view, has admitted to sending this text message? I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Agbare Speaker, my verklaring vandag in dié Huis is ‘n tydige en ernstige wekroep op almal om eerlik te besin oor die betekenis en relevansie van Jeugdag binne die huidige tydsgewrig. Die Soweto jeugopstand in 1976 is ‘n werklikheid. Dat dit die koers van ons land se geskiedenis radikaal op ‘n ander trajek geplaas het is waar. Dit is egter die katalisator wat die protes ontketen het, wat onder die loep geneem moet word. Volgens oorlewering was Afrikaans as die sogenaamde taal van die onderdrukker die lont in die kruitvat. Dit sou die vure letterlik en figuurlik aanblaas.

Ek, persoonlik, byt swaar aan dié stukkies pseudo-geskiedenis, drogredenasie

en oud-modieuse mitologie.

Taal, synde *lingua franca* kan nie onderdruk nie. Indien wel, dan het D'Almeida se Portugese taal en Lord Milner se Engels, en ook Jan van Riebeeck se Hollands ons inheemse bevolkings onderdruk. Waar gaan die lys eindig, want die voorbeelde is legio. Taal, Afrikaans se oorsprong lê diepliggend in ons inheemsheid en multikulturele vermenging van daardie meta-narratief van kreolisering, en dit is die ding wat ons vandag verguis en verwerp en verneder en marginaliseer.

So ek staan vandag hier en lewer my verklaring in Afrikaans, die mooiste, soetste taal. Ai! Maak dit van my 'n onderdrukker? Ek wat die stryd vir vryheid in Afrikaans gestry het en steeds aan 'n nuwe provinsie en Suid-Afrika bou en ek doen dit oorwegend in Afrikaans. Is die 13% swartes, 53% bruines en 37% blanke Afrikaanssprekendes almal onderdrukkers? 'n Taal is 'n vorm van selfuitdrukking, dit definieer jou beeld, jou psige, jou bestaan, jou waardes, jou integriteit en ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, my statement today in this House is a timely and serious call on all to be honest in considering the significance and relevance of Youth Day in the present time frame. The Soweto youth uprising in 1976 is a reality. That it radically placed the course of our country's history on a different trajectory is true. It was however the

catalyst that set off the process, that should be looked at closely. Tradition has it that Afrikaans as the so-called language of the oppressor was the fuse in the powder keg. It would have fanned the fires literally and figuratively.

I, personally, find it this piece of pseudo-history, weird reasoning and old-fashioned mythology hard to believe.

Language, being *lingua franca* cannot be suppressed. If so, then D'Almeida's Portuguese language and Lord Milner's English, and also Jan van Riebeeck's Dutch, had suppressed our indigenous peoples. Where will the list end, because the examples are legend? Language, Afrikaans's origin lies deeply in our indigenusness and multicultural mix of that meta narrative of creolisation, and it is the thing we today vilify and reject and humiliate and marginalise.

So I stand here today and deliver my statement in Afrikaans, the most beautiful, sweetest language. Oh! Does that make me an oppressor? I, who fought the battle for the freedom in Afrikaans and am still building toward a new province and South Africa and I do that mainly in Afrikaans. Are the 13% blacks, 53% Coloureds and 37% white Afrikaans speakers all oppressors? A language is a form of self expression, it defines one's image, your psyche, your existence, your values, your integrity and... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo, your time has ...[Interjection.]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dit spreek direk tot jou humaniteit ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: It speaks directly to one's humanity...[Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Expired.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Afrikaans en die debat rondom ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Afrikaans and the debate around... [Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo ...[Interjection.]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: ... en as wetenskaptal in ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: ... and as scientific language in ...[Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo, your time has expired. Kindly take your seat, kindly take your seat. Thank you. Hon members, statements for the record are limited to two minutes. Parties get an allocation, so please try not to exceed it, and if I do call you to order in terms of time, whilst you might be passionate about your speech, I would want you to respect the Chair in terms of calling time. We also do have the IEC coming in at five o' clock, so I would like to keep it as strictly as possible to the two minutes. Thank you hon member Kivedo. In the absence of the EFF, I see the DA.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Enough is enough. The Metrorail commuters have faced a double whammy with wildcat strikes and intensification of vandalism. I deeply share Metrorail commuters' impatience

with delays and disruptions in the Cape Town Metro. Our people deserve a much better service than what is currently provided.

I therefore welcome that the courts have ruled in its favour and found the South African Transport and Allied Workers Union, SATAWU, in contempt of court. These workers have let hundreds of thousands of commuters suffer for their own power battles. It is therefore a positive development that these 130 ill-disciplined workers have been dismissed and will not be allowed to return to work.

Our law enforcement agencies must double their efforts to ensure that we see an end to train vandalism. We are about to spend billions on new commuter trains. If they are also going up in flames, we are in deep trouble.

We see our roads get more and more congested because commuters are forced to find alternatives to trains. Vehicle occupation is increasing as a result. This is not sustainable. I want to thank Metrorail in the Western Cape for standing up to the bullies and I sincerely hope that this is the beginning of the end of our trouble. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, the DA lies when it claims it works so well with National Government. In fact, it does not cooperate openly and honestly. Instead, it obstructs and frustrates National Government in open

acts of hostility and defiance.

This is evident in the instruction the DA Social Development MEC, Albert Fritz, in a letter he gave to his Head of Department to prohibit any worker from taking part in an imbizo in Beaufort West, to deal with poor people's problems and to extend assistance to the most marginalised. MEC Fritz went as far as to threaten workers that would attend, with charges of insubordination. This again approves the DA does not care for the poor at all.

This non-caring DA also demolished another place of religious worship in Delft, bribes other counsellors to cling onto power at all cost like in Witzenberg, allow schools to decay and the construction of shoddy schools that threatens the lives of our children, or allow their Community Safety MEC, Dan Plato, to entertain hardened criminals, like druglords ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: ... and gang bosses in order to make heroes of them, that puts the lives ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, take your seat ...[Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... of our children in jeopardy. I thank you, Madam

Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The hon member gets carried away by verborities to such an extent she forgets to put the honorific in front of our own members. They are honourable members.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Despite the continued challenges that farms find themselves in, it has been a great relief that finally the members from National Parliament have unanimously agreed to declare the drought a national disaster.

Madam Speaker, this is despite the ANC in the Western Cape's denial of the severity of the drought, both in South Africa and in our province, as well as the rest of the country. Let me remind this House just what was said, and I quote the three points made by hon member Dyantyi. He is not here, where is he sitting?

“1. Drought is just a PR exercise.

2. Let us therefore locate this drought debate within this broad context so that we do not fall into the trap of sensationalising of serious issues like drought.”

And he said:

“Basically there is no need for a diversion of a national disaster.”

The current drought gripping South Africa has affected 34 million people living without water and farmers are facing severe hardships, of which almost 1600 settlements in the Western Cape are affected by this drought.

Farmers and millions of people working on the land have and continue to face escalating food prices, food insecurity, water shortages and job losses. Yet the response of the ANC MP's and National Government in dealing with this drought thus far has been beyond dismal. In fact it's been like an ostrich with its head in the sand, complete denial.

We hope now that the money owed by National Government will finally be paid over to us to assist our farmers in need, and that through a strategic response plan the needs of farms to ensure long-term food security is rolled out. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of the ACDP, I see the ANC.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Mossel Bay is another DA abused and mismanaged municipality. How bad it is became even more evident in a letter written by the booted municipal manager, Dr Michelle Gratz to DA

leaders. She was about to resign on the eve of the election as she knew the DA will not be coming back, and DA mayor, Marie Ferreira was quick to kick Gratz out and cut her communication to prevent Gratz from exposing too much of the DA ills.

Gratz spilled the beans, she lifted the veil on DA infighting, publicity stunts, DA people just after fast food, chasing away hard workers and the fact that for years it did nothing good for the people of Mossel Bay.

One can also include the fact that the DA abuses officials for party political gains, like the dedicated IEC municipal electoral officer, Edward Jantjies, serving the DA. It proves how the DA governance rots to the core with interference and cadre deployment. I already laid a charge in September, Madam Speaker, at the IEC National and Provincial, against Mr Jantjies, and what did the DA about this? Nothing. DA Provincial Leader, Patricia de Lille, attacks all but her very own errant DA members and rotten deployed cadres. It is time to kick the DA out.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA. Order, please hon members.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, it is very clear what we are dealing with here. We are dealing here with the ANC that has failed in this province, the ANC that has nothing left but to look for every spookie they can find where there is none. We know in the Overberg District Municipality, where member Gillion was the mayor, in 2005 before she left, lots of money was

spent on parties and jamborees, because they could not understand the governance system. When we were in the Overberg last week - we were out there, and the week before cluster A visited Overberg - where was this member at the time? She was busy throwing stones, blocking the N2, and then that resulted in a loss of income to the province. She can say where she was. She can tell us where she was.

Madam Speaker, we are dealing here with an ANC that is very desperate ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: The ANC, when they governed Oudsthoorn ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat.

Mr M MNQASELA: We are sitting now with R18 million ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngqasela ...[Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... owed to service providers.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Is it a point of order hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes. Madam Speaker, is it parliamentary for a member to mislead the House by referring to an hon member throwing stones on the N2 while they were on a cluster A? Is it parliamentary?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, as a presiding officer I hear your concern in your point of order, but I cannot contest the truthfulness of what another member says in the House unfortunately. So if we could continue. Hon member Mngasela?

Mr C M DUGMORE: On a point of order, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, may I address you on that hearing? I think we would at least expect a commitment to investigate that statement, because the danger is that if a member, as member Mngasela has done, cast aspersions on another member about breaking the law - he is alleging that hon member Gillion was throwing stones on the N2. That is a very serious allegation and I would, on a point of order, like to request you to ask the member to withdraw that or failing that, to then actually investigate the veracity of that statement, because it's casting aspersions on a fellow member.

The SPEAKER: Your point is noted hon member Dugmore. Chief Whip

Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. There are remedies that the hon members on the other side, if they feel aggrieved, can take, and standing up in this House is not one of them, in that way. They have got Whips to do these things. Why is it that they never use their Whips, the way we use our Whips? That is what they are there for. Good order.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members. I have noted the concerns. Order, please hon members. I will revert to Hansard. I will interrogate the statement and I will, if necessary, get back to the House. You may proceed, Hon member Dugmore you seem to have an issue?

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed hon Member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: When the ANC was in charge of Oudtshoorn, they left service providers and creditors unpaid. We have more than R18 million of debt that is owed to creditors, and now the administration that is installed there by the Provincial Government is busy dealing with that. Now this is the ANC that we're talking about. The ANC that has failed to get even a single audit in the Central Karoo District Municipality. All the municipalities where you are in government as the ANC, you have failed to score one clean audit, because the National Minister of the ANC,

Mr Weekend Special, Des van Rooyen, believes that there's no need to have clean audits in South Africa. That man is dreaming. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, Mossel Bay received clean audits. Guess what happens here? Honourable Pierre Uys comes here and says Mossel Bay has failed.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mnqasela, your time ...[Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: When you get a clean audit ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mnqasela, your time has expired. Thank you. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, just on a point of order. Could I ask in terms of our practice in regard to statements, I think I really would appeal to you to apply a common approach, because what we have just heard was not a statement. Firstly the member didn't have a statement in front of him, secondly, secondly ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip take your seat please.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And I also request that this Chief Whip go on a

workshop, because I'm on the floor now addressing you, and he is standing up as a ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, I don't know if that was a point of order, but it was rendered as a statement within the two minutes time period. Again, what a member chooses to present as a statement I have no control over unfortunately. So that now concludes Statements. Can we now move to Notices of Motion please hon members. And before we go, may I remind you, and at this stage I would like to welcome the delegation from the IEC, that we do have another commitment, so can we move along swiftly please. I see the hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: This is Statements? Motions, sorry, Motions, I ...

The SPEAKER: Motions, we now move to Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given?

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of drugs, crime and violence in Western Cape Schools.

I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by member]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House deliberates on bringing more responsive and people centred local government to the public of the Western Cape.

I thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by member]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of crime and violence on the provincial health care system and the failure of this DA Government to ensure the safety of staff and patients in the public health care facilities.

I thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by member]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Motion with notice: That the House debates the Western Cape municipalities achievement of a 73% clean audit and the spin-offs thereof, and further the implications of Gauteng getting 33% and KwaZulu-Natal 30%.

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Tyatyam. Are you ...?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Are you saying without notice?

The SPEAKER: No, no. Are there any motions where notice is given?

Mr S G TYATYAM: He said without notice.

Mr M G E WILEY: He corrected himself.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member Hinana, do you acknowledge that there was an error? With notice? He has corrected. Hon member Dugmore

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the shoddy workmanship of various

construction companies and the failure to adequately monitor these construction companies by the Department of Transport and Public Works, the Western Cape Government, which has resulted in five schools this year being declared unsafe by structural engineers.

[Notice of motion as moved by member]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move that the House commends the joint collaboration between the Western Cape Department of Social Development and Sozo Foundation for launching the Sozo Youth Café in Vrygrond over the past weekend.

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: That was clearly not with notice. Can we just get clarity on that please. [Interjections.] But we're not there, just wake up.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo, we are busy with motions where notice is given.

Mr B D KIVEDO: My apology.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Olivier and then hon member Lentit.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House investigates allegations that a principal at a Cape Town High School is facing corruption charges after allowing rubble to be dumped on the school premises, and accepting R160 000 in return.

I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by member]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the violence in Grabouw and its related causes.

[Notice of motion as moved by member]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Tyatyam, are you ...? Okay. Are there no other motions where notice is given? We then now move to Motions without notice. I see the hon member Botha, hon member Hinana and then hon member Tyatyam.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

†Me L J BOTHA: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die inhegtenisname van 14 SASSA-amptenare wat verbind word met die R85 miljoen diefstal van die armste in ons gemeenskappe verwelkom. Ons vertrou ook dat hierdie diewe aan die pen sal ry.

Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes arrest of 14 SASSA officials who are linked to the theft of the R85 million from the poorest in our communities. We trust that these thieves will suffer the consequences.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Are there any objections to the motion? No objections, agreed to. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, hon member Hinana before you go. Members if we can try not to comment on people's dress code or how they look or how fat or thin they are please. Let's stick to the protocol.

Ms L J BOTHA: Small things amuse small minds, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Hinana you may proceed.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That his House congratulates the Western Cape ANC Youth League for successfully and consistently campaigning for the return of honourable Marius Fransman peacefully into their fold.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Is there an objection? No objections, agreed to. Where's the objection? There was no objection. Who objected? Sorry? Okay there is an objection. Order hon members. Let's just regain our composure here and do this in a decent way. Hon member Tyatyam you may proceed.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes hon member Mackenzie a speedy recovery after he was quickly taken out of this building, assisted by members of his party. We wish him well and good rehabilitation from whatever sickness made him dizzy before he entered this House today.

Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Objection? There is, there is an objection. Hon member Kivedo you may proceed.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House commends the joint collaboration between the Western Cape Department of Social Development and the Sozo Foundation for launching the Sozo Youth Café in Vrygrond over the past weekend.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon member Joseph and then hon member Mngasela. I see you hon member Gillion. First hon member Joseph please. Sorry.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the Good Hope Shepherd-Proteas Anglican Church on its 130th anniversary celebration this year. The church has been the place of worship for the residents of Protea Village since the Group Areas Act was enforced. Today this community aims to build bridges, bring justice, offer conflict resolution and bring healing in their society.

I so move, thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objection, agreed to. I see the hon member Gillion and after that I see the hon member Mngasela.

Ms M GILLION: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that from the 29th of May to the 5th of June 2016 it is Child Protection Week, where government and civil society pay attention to serious issues faced by children. While in this province many innocent young children die from gang shootings, the government focused its work on opening Youth Cafés. I need to commend the National Government for highlighting the plight of child labour on

farms and exploitation, as well as unaccompanied minors from the neighbouring countries through this year's theme "Let us all protect children to move South Africa forward."

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. Yes, there is an objection. There is an objection, it will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Kivedo and the hon member Mnqasela and then hon member Dugmore.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Agbare Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis 'n Graad 6-leerder aan die Laerskool Lochnerhof in die Strand, Christiaan Brandt, gelukwens met sy insluiting in die Suid-Afrikaanse span wat aan die 20ste wêreldbyeenkoms vir uitvoerende kunste in Los Angeles in die VSA vanaf 8-12 Julie gaan deelneem. Christiaan het reeds vier goue medaljes vir verskillende dansstyle verower en is aangewys as die beste junior seun.

Baie dankie.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I without notice:

That the House congratulates a Grade 6 learner of the Lochnerhof Primary School in the Strand, Christiaan Brandt, on his inclusion in the South African team to participate in the 20th world meeting for performing arts in Los Angeles in the USA from 8-12 July. Christiaan has already won four gold medals for different dancing styles and was chosen as the best junior boy.

Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. I see the hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNAQSELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the DA mayoral candidates for this year's local government elections, and wishes them well. This formidable team will continue the excellent work, commitment and dedication by the current mayoral team that has propelled this province to be the best province in the country on all levels, since 2006 when the DA took over the government in the City of Cape Town, what we

popularly know now as the best Cape Town story - and expanded its excellence to the province as a whole and the districts in all the municipalities. We govern well where we govern, and we govern very well in this province. I move that this House commends these municipalities.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, take your seat hon member Mnqasela. There is an objection. Hon member Tyatyam, do you still wish to raise your point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, yes. It is not the first time. The other time it was hon member Wenger doing the same thing. I think, Madam Speaker, you must be firm when you are ruling.

An HON MEMBER: What rule? According to what rule?

Mr S G TYATYAM: When we are doing a motion, the thirteenth time that you do it, you are not doing ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members please ...[Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: You cannot motivate.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, please address me as the Chair. Hon members, you cannot involve in a debate across the floor or without engaging the Chair now. If there is an issue around that statement, then we need to address it, but we certainly cannot allow the House to get into what is happening here right now. I cannot attest to what the hon member is going to speak and I need to be alerted if it has been addressed before. It is the right thing to do to alert me, but I think I would like to make a request to both sides of the House.

You understand and you know the Rules of motions with notice and without notice. Please ensure that before you come to the sitting, you have a clear understanding of what is required.

Mr S G TYATYAM: If they don't know they must come to me, I will assist them.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely, I will ensure that I give them your number. Any other motions with ... No, no, the hon member Makeleni was holding on. Hon member Makeleni, hon member Schäfer, hon member Dugmore.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you Speaker. I move that ...

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Ms P MAKELENI: Motion without notice ...

Mr P UYS: You said the names and hon member Dugmore was next.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, if you don't mind hon member Dugmore, may I allow hon member Makeleni to proceed and then you can go next? It is really difficult to manage all the hands and people bobbing up. You may proceed hon member Makeleni and then hon member Dugmore will go next.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes Cecil Lolo, the late Ajax Cape Town star, was posthumously awarded the MTN 8 Last Man Standing accolade for being the most outstanding player in the tournament, and I hope it brings consolation to his family, team-mates, friends and fans.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. I see the hon member Dugmore first and then hon member Schäfer.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the hosting of the Youth Road Safety Summit, set to take place at Ratanga Junction on the 3rd and 4th of June 2016, which together with other provinces will culminate in a national

Youth Road Safety Summit, with the objectives to give young people a voice on road safety, to contribute to a positive shift in attitude towards road safety and behaviour among young people, and furthermore to launch the Youth Declaration for Road Safety and commends the National Government for making this intervention.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. I see the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Tracy Chambers for being elected at the World Economic Forum in Rwanda as one of the 12 Social Entrepreneurs of 2016 by the Schwab Foundation who recognises men and women for outstanding entrepreneurial activities that benefit the marginalised and poor. Ms Chamber's Clothing Bank provides unemployed single mothers from townships with two years of training to become self-employed business women. 829 women have graduated, with another 800 women currently enrolled in the two year programme. Since 2010 these women have collectively generated an income for their families to the value of approximately R40 million.

Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there objections to the motion? No objections. I see the hon member Kivedo and then the hon member Tyatyam.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Agbare Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die 300 Suid-Afrikaanse brandbestryders van Werk met Vuur, wat op uitnodiging van die Kanadese Regering tans besig is om die brand wat vir die afgelope twee weke woed en reeds 50 000 hektaar in Kanada verwoes het te help blus, alles van die beste toewens en bid vir hul veiligheid.

Baie dankie.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the 300 South African fire fighters of Work with

Fire, who at the invitation of the Canadian Government are currently busy fighting the fire that has been raging for the past two weeks and has already destroyed 50 000 hectares in Canada, all the best and that we pray for their safety.

Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections? No objections, agreed to. I see the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Khayelitsha businessman, Luvuyo Rani, who was named the 2016 Schwab Foundation Social Entrepreneur at the World Economic Forum in Kigali, Rwanda.

Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. I see the hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House, with utter dismay, reports that civic organisations from across the City are becoming increasingly concerned at the cosy relationship between the DA-led City of Cape Town and private developers, which results in inappropriate developments being bulldozed through with objections routinely ignored; calls on the House to institute an investigation into these serious allegations, and appeals to civic society to stand their ground and keep on fighting this ruthless and brutal DA Government.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are objections, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Hinana and after hon member Hinana, hon member Makeleni.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House welcomes June as Youth Month and therefore makes a clarion call to the current youth to emulate the 1976 youth by taking their education seriously.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections, agreed to. I see the hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the success story of the artist, Eric Karagwa, who recently hosted his third gallery exhibition to show his landscape paintings at the Carmel Art Gallery; notes his is a good story to tell as the Rwandan refugee started working as a car guard at the Constantia Village Shopping Centre when he arrived in South Africa in 2004; further notes that he worked his way up to become a renowned artist; and congratulates Karagwa on his hard earned success.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. I see the hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the handing over of a mobile police station in Site C Community, the oldest township in Khayelitsha, and lauds SAPS for responding positively to community requests.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections, agreed to. I see the hon member Botha and then hon member Gopie.

†Me L J BOTHA: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye betoon aan die gesin, familie, vriende en gemeenskap van Piketberg met die heengaan van Melvin Jonathan na 'n lang siekbed op Saterdag 14 Mei. Mnr Johnathan het jare lank die gemeenskap en sy kinders gedien as prinsipaal van Groenvleiplaas Primêre Skool en het 'n blywende en positiewe impak op almal gelaat.

Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family, friends and

community of Piketberg on the death of Melvin Jonathan on Saturday, 14 May, after a long illness. Mr Jonathan had for many years served the community and his pupils as principal of Groenvleiplaas Primary School and left a lasting and positive impression on all.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. I see the hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Motion with notice that:

The House sympathises with Sizeka Mbandezeli (23) who had a stillbirth in Karl Bremer Hospital where she was told her baby died five days ago. She blames the negligence and uncaring attitude of nurses in the City's Delft Day Hospital, that earlier turned her away and calls on the MEC to investigate this serious allegation.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are the any objections? No objections. Sorry, is that an objection?

Mr D JOSEPH: No, I just want to clarify it is a motion without notice.

The SPEAKER: We are busy now. Are there objections? We are dealing with motions without notice.

Mr D JOSEPH: No, I think, I want to correct the statement she made when she said the notice.

The SPEAKER: Okay, I will revert to the Hansard and get back on that one, thank you. The next speaker, I see hon member Gillion, Hon member Botha and Chief Whip Wiley. Can I do it in three's hon members, and then we can maintain some order, thank you?

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the 25th of May 2016 was International Missing Children's Day, when hundreds of missing children are remembered and serves as an annual reminder to renew efforts in reuniting missing children with their families, honour those who are still missing and make child safety a priority. I call on the Western Cape Government to renew its efforts of reuniting families with their missing children, following the 175 children that were reported missing last year.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections, agreed to. I see hon member Botha.

†Me L J BOTHA: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Die Huis sy medelye betoon met die gesin, familie en vriende van Anneliza Swarts en haar dogter Jaylin Swarts wat hul lewens in 'n tragiese, gru-motorongeluk verloor het op 14 Mei in Porterville.

Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family and friends of Anneliza Swarts and her daughter Jaylin Swarts who lost their lives in a tragic horror car accident on 14 May in Porterville.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Lawhill Maritime Centre's Brian Ingpen on receiving the South African Maritime Industries Maestro Award. He has dedicated the past nineteen years to promote the advancement of specialised maritime education in South Africa. The Lawhill Centre is allied to Simon's Town High School.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Ajax Cape Town Under 19 soccer team for winning the NextGen tournament in Amsterdam, after beating Tottenham Hotspurs two to nil in the finals, and commends the Ajax Cape Town Youth Academy on their strength and success in producing players of high quality.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections, agreed to. I see the hon member Botha.

†Me L J BOTHA: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye betoon met die gesin, familie en vriende van Lecardo Carolus wat tragies sy lewe in 'n gru-motorongeluk verloor het op Saterdag 14 Mei in Porterville.

Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family and friends of Lecardo Carolus who tragically lost his life in a horror car accident on Saturday, 14 May in Porterville.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Agreed to. Hon member Davids your turn. I apologise for overlooking you earlier.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. This is a very important motion. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Paarl athlete, Ruswahl Samaai for his sterling performance at the IAAF Diamond League meeting in Rabat, where he long-jumped 8,38 metres to equal the African all-comers' record and his own personal best on Saturday 22nd May 2016, and he is from our House.

Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. The hon member Botha and Chief Whip Wiley. First, hon member Botha.

†Me L J BOTHA: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Die Huis Ilham Groenewald gelukwens met haar aanstelling as 'n nuutverkose lid van die Suid-Afrikaansr Rugbyunie se Uitvoerende

Raad. Die Kaapse Sportadministrateur sal die eerste vrou wees om in die Raad te dien.

Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Ilham Groenewald on her appointment as a new member of the Executive of the South African Rugby Union. The Cape Sport Administrator will be the first woman to serve in the Council.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. Chief Whip Wiley.

†Mnr M G E WILEY: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die branderroeiers Shaun Rice en Jasper Mocke, albei van Vishoek, gelukwens met hulle vertoning in die Molokai-wedren oor 54 kilometer in Hawaii op Sondag 29 Mei. Die Suid-Afrikaners het in die kompetisie skoonskip gemaak toe Hank McGregor die byeenkoms vir die vierde keer gewen het, met Rice tweede en Mocke derde.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the surf paddlers Shaun Rice and Jasper Mocke, both from Fish Hoek, on their performance in the Molokai Race over 54 kilometres in Hawaii on Sunday 29 May. The South Africans made a clean sweep in the competition when Hank McGregor won the event for the fourth time, with Rice second and Mocke third.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Any objections? No objections, agreed to. I see the hon member Olivier and after that the hon member Gopie.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House note with great sadness the passing on of four Ndesi family members during a suspected arson attack on their shack in Bloekombos early on Sunday morning, 22nd May 2016; calls on the police to speed up the investigation; and expresses sincerest condolences to the family and friends of the victims, Ncumisa (30), her daughter Thamara (13), with nieces Lisa (13) and Qhama (5).

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections, agreed to. I see the hon member Botha and then hon member Gopie.

†Me L J BOTHA: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Elton Koopman 'n spoedige herstel toewens na sy operasie op 1 Junie as gevolg van veelvuldige beserings wat hy opgedoen het in 'n gru-motorongeluk op Saterdag 14 Mei in Porterville.

Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes Elton Koopman a speedy recovery following his operation on 1 June as a result of multiple injuries he sustained in a horror car accident on Saturday 14 May in Porterville.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the heartless destruction of a religious place of worship in Delft by the Western Cape Government.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There's an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Olivier. Hon members, order, order

please! Hon members, we have the delegation from the IEC waiting for us, so we don't have time to get into other issues. Let us just deal with the matter at hand. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House condemns the Provincial Department of Education for allowing infrastructure to decay and the Provincial Department of Public Works that does not keep maintenance up or upgrade current schools to ensure optimal learning environments that are conducive to give all learners the best chance in life in the Western Cape.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Members are there any more motions without notice? Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls on the DA to save money as part of the Western Cape Legislature's austerity measures and follow the ANC not to send any inter-parliamentary delegate during the financial year on any

overseas excursions like the upcoming Commonwealth Parliamentary Association events in Bangladesh and Mauritius.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are objections. Yes? Hon members does that conclude motions without notice? Is there still one more? Hon member Tyatyam?.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House during National Youth Month congratulates the youth designers from Khayelitsha and Gugulethu, who produce under the label *Deep Settle Movement*, on their first export to New York and these designers are Asanda Qumelwana, Christoper Mayiji and Fezile Retyu, who work at the Motale Bus Service depot in a small office on their Gugs label items.

Thanks.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion? Have we exhausted motions without notice? Okay. Hon members, that concludes

that session. Before we adjourn, I would like to remind members that a briefing by the Electoral Commission of South Africa, the IEC, will commence after the adjournment in the Chamber. So I am asking hon members, kindly, can we just take a quick break to allow our guests to come in and be seated, and then we can proceed.

That then concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned, thank you.

The House adjourned at 17:26.