
TUESDAY, 25 FEBRUARY 2014

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: Order! In terms of Rule 144 there is a motion on the Order Paper. I recognise the honourable Chief Whip.

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I move the motion standing in my name on the Order Paper, as follows:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 149 (3) the following bills be revived and consideration thereof to be resumed from the stage reached with them in the previous session.

(1) *Western Cape Independent Health Complaints Committee Bill*

[B9 -2013].

(2) *Western Cape Monitoring and Support of Municipalities Bill*

[B10 -2013].

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections.

Agreed to.

Thank you, order of the day.

ORDER OF THE DAY

The SPEAKER: The secretary will read the order of the day. [Interjections.]

Order hon members, the order of the day.

Debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address.

The SPEAKER: I have received a copy of the Premier's State of the Province Address delivered in the House on Friday. The address is printed in the minutes of the proceedings and I now place it before the House for debate. I recognise the hon leader of the opposition, Ms Brown.

Ms L BROWN: Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker the first two decades of our freedom were dominated by the extraordinary spirit and magnanimity of our founding father, Tata Mandela. We give thanks for him. It is fitting to preface this address with the words of thanks offered by Uncle Kathy at Tata's funeral, and I quote:

"We have been blessed that under the collective leadership of the ANC we can proudly proclaim that South Africa belongs to all who live in it,

black and white. We are fortunate that today we live in a noisy and lively democracy. We are eternally grateful that dignity has been restored to all South Africans. We are forever grateful that the lives of many are improving, although not enough yet. We are deeply grateful for a Constitution that encompasses all that is good in us and a constitutional order that protects our hard-won freedom. Finally, we are infinitely grateful that each and every one of us, whether we are African, White, Coloured or Indian can proudly call ourselves South Africans."

Twenty years ago South Africans of all races and classes participated in the country's first free democratic election. The ANC led by President Nelson Mandela won an overwhelming victory in eight of the nine recently proclaimed new provinces. In the Western Cape the majority of the people rejected Madiba's brand of reconciliatory transformation and voted for the National Party. Our first Premier was former apartheid Police Minister, Mr Hernus Kriel.

This is where the real Western Cape story begins. There was a simple reason for this anomaly: demographics. The majority of people in the Western Cape were Coloured and White, not naturally, mind you, not organically, but by apartheid design. There were laws that restricted Africans from coming here and allowed those Africans who were here to be deported to the Bantustans. Does the Premier include these people when she speaks of "refugees"?

Because of these laws, the Western Cape of 20 years ago was significantly better off than the other provinces, not by accident, not because the people were cleverer, but again by design. While you might not have thought so if you lived in Hanover Park or KTC at the time, we had more teachers and better equipped schools, better healthcare, better social services, better policing, better just-about-everything than any of the other provinces. We also had the most experienced civil servants, many of whom migrated here from other provinces to support the National Party. Presumably these are not among the people the Premier calls "refugees".

When our Tata Madiba became President, one of his first tasks was to begin to dismantle the inequity, to shuffle the country's resources around to start to create a measure of fairness. As the best resourced of provinces it followed that the Western Cape would have to chuck a little extra in the pot. This balancing act was always going to be the hardest to sell here, in the face of a national opposition party, essentially selling itself on the promise of continuing the patterns of the past.

Madam Premier, I listened to the good news proclaimed in your fairytale on Friday. Authors of fairytales have the license to be creative. [Interjection.] They invent scenarios that inspire anxiety in their readers before the heroes come through with a happy ending. The problem with fairytales is when they are presented as fact, such as occurred in this House last week, and in the absence of critical or insightful media these facts take root in the minds of the people as the truth. The problem I had with the Premier's "Friday-fiction"

was that it deployed deliberate distortions to advance her agenda of creating a siege mentality in our province and our country.

Let us look briefly at the media response to your speech. There was a large amount of coverage about the point you raised about the Western Cape having to pay for the hordes of people who flock here from the Eastern Cape. One of your favourite refrains is to blame the influx of poor people to the Western Cape for any form of misery, mishap or maladministration in this province. You became so animated and outraged that it almost sounded credible.

On Friday, Madam Premier, you specifically alleged that the Western Cape received no compensation from national government for this clearly unwanted burden. You made it sound terribly unfair.

If you have not have been telling a fairytale, you would have had to mention the 2013 budget review telling in its explanatory memorandum to the division of refugee / revenue [Interjection.] It goes into some detail. You see the “refugee story” is in my brain. [Interjections.]

I do not think you will ever understand what it means for black people in this country when they are told they are not part of this country and that is why [Interjections.] and that is why [Interjections.]

And that is why it is a mockery to all of you. That is why you guffaw. That is

why you guffaw at it.

The PREMIER: No one said so!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Your party said my daughter is not wanted here. Where do you come with that?

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members!

Ms L BROWN: My party has never told you that. That is a lie [Interjections.]
But let me [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Ms L BROWN: Let me repeat my story, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon members Mr Magaxa, hon Minister Carlisle, order, please.

Ms L BROWN: So Mr Speaker what I am saying is in the 2013 budget review there is a thing called an “explanatory memorandum” and this is an explanatory memorandum to the division of revenue. It goes into the detail [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: [Inaudible.] students from this year [Inaudible.] 21 000 more

students this year [Interjection.]

Ms L BROWN: It goes into the detail on the allocation of substantial additional resources to provinces that have experienced an influx of citizens, such as the Western Cape. The document is freely available on the Internet, Madame Premier, and I recommend that you and the journalists who report on your speeches read it.

The PREMIER: We have got 21 000 students this year [Interjection.]

Ms L BROWN: If you read the document you would learn that the provincial equitable share formula is reviewed and updated with new data, such as census 2011. Members in the Budget Committee, do you remember in the Budget Committee that R 7 billion was allocated? Do you remember that? [Interjection.]

Now that money is allocated to make sure that we cover in-migration. It happens in Gauteng and it happens in KZN. There is compensation for in-migration in the country of our people's birth.

The PREMIER: Ten years late, yes, ten years late!

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L BROWN: There is compensation and that is the truth. Anything else is

an untruth.

The PREMIER: You are ten years late!

Ms L BROWN: Madam Premier you would also have been pleased that some of the journalists present picked up uncritically on your red herring that national government is deliberately punishing the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Ms L BROWN: For electing a DA government.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Ms L BROWN: By withholding funds and/or delaying the rollout of projects.

The PREMIER: By your incompetence. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L BROWN: Your anxiety sounded plausible.

The PREMIER: Your incompetence!

Ms L BROWN: To those who do not yet know, yet your story was riddled

with examples of taking Western Cape government credit for the delivery of projects actually delivered by national government. [Interjection.] DTI for example helped to facilitate the new Hisense and expand the Tellumat factories in Atlantis [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Yes, I said that. I said that in my speech. [Interjection.]

Ms L BROWN: But the Premier seeks to claim the credit.

The PREMIER: I said this in my speech.

Ms L BROWN: Ditto to the new hospitals in Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain.

The PREMIER: All the [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon, hon Premier, order please.

Ms L BROWN: Projects the Premier inherited from us. I wish the Premier would listen; like I listened to her, when I speak.

Mr P UYS: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Ms L BROWN: Projects the Premier - and she will address me tomorrow on

this matter - projects the Premier inherited from us five years ago. Once again Madam Premier you gambled on an uncritical and uninformed media not scratching too deep. [Interjections.]

The truth is that the Western Cape's mantle as the most efficient and best-serviced province is slipping on your guard, Madam Premier. Perhaps it is unfair to burden the leader of a national opposition party with a day job as a Premier. I am not sure that there is anyone who could do justice to both. The Western Cape is suffering as a result. It is not as if your cabinet is overburdened with supermen.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You will be surprised!

Ms L BROWN: Let us start with education - an area which the Premier knows well and condescendingly concedes has been turned around by national government. One would expect the Western Cape to come first when it comes to matric results, would one not? [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Yes, it does [Inaudible.]

Ms L BROWN: Five years ago we were coming first.

The PREMIER: Yes, with 75%.

Ms L BROWN: So how did we fare last year? Pretty shoddily, actually! We came fourth. As you were speaking on Friday, Madam Premier, children in the streets of Manenberg were yelling “abuse” at police, whom they accused of beating them up while conducting searches. It was a school day, but hundreds of children were on the streets. Six people shot in the past few days - the “gang war” is raging again. This in the best run province! Well, it depends where you sit, which side you sit on. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon Premier! Hon Premier, order.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker is it correct for the hon Premier who is still going to reply tomorrow to make a comment on every sentence that the leader of the opposition makes?

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon. That is why I called the Premier into order, hon member Mr Ozinsky. You may proceed, hon leader of the opposition, Ms Brown.

Ms L BROWN: Thank you Mr Speaker. If the Western Cape is the best run province, how is it that in 2011/12 more murders were committed here than in Johannesburg and Pretoria combined?

Mr P UYS: Hear-hear!

Ms L BROWN: How is it possible that in the best run province last year 303 police officers were attacked compared to the 77 in more populous Gauteng? Yet the MEC of Community Safety, the Premier and the DA are intent on discrediting the police. Madam Premier, you forgot to include these numbers in your Friday-fairytale and you forgot to mention the provincial curse of rape and sexual violence in this province.

Meanwhile, the picture that is emerging at the Commission into Policing in Khayelitsha is one of a dysfunctional and desperate community, without access to basic services, resources or jobs, and without much hope for the future.

An HON MEMBER: Where are the ANC councillors?

Ms L BROWN: Policing cannot take place in a vacuum without social and infrastructural support. Nearly every day we read horrendous stories of violence being committed against children. It seems that Western Cape children are particularly vulnerable.

Madam Premier, you are failing to deal with the causes or effects. Too many of our children are on the streets unsupervised. Their lives are endangered by predators. There is an urgent need to increase facilities in all of our townships to provide a greater level of protection for our children, particularly in their formative years.

Five years ago, Madam Premier, I think you impressed many voters with your promises to investigate corruption and pursue offenders without fear or favour. This was an objective we supported. In fact, many of the investigations you inherited were initiated on our guard. So where are all these corrupt ANC officials you have been shouting about, Madam Premier? Why do we get the sense that your investigations have failed, that your bark is more credible than your bite?

Mr M G E WILEY: Because you covered your tracks so well.

Ms L BROWN: Let us look at the delivery of housing - a critical area and one on which the Western Cape leads the nation in terms of backlog and here we read "homelessness and suffering". Between 2004 and 2009 the ANC-led government in the Western Cape oversaw the building of 75 000 houses and delivered 90 000 serviced sites. With increased budgets between 2009 and December 2013, the DA government has built approximately 60 000 houses and only delivered 47 000 serviced sites and these are not distorted ANC figures, as you have claimed, Madam Premier. They are supplied by your own civil servants.

According to Stats South Africa's labour market statistics, in the last year of recording the Western Cape lost 37 000 jobs and marched to say that they will be able to create 6 million jobs on the ANC headquarters. It was the only province that shed jobs in this period. The official unemployment figure in

the Western Cape has slipped. It is now at 23.9% compared to the 24.9% of the national average. For a province that has always had the advantage of superior economic infrastructure, this figure is a shame. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Do you want to read that again?

Ms L BROWN: The couple of thousand new jobs you sought to take credit for in your speech on Friday, Madam Premier, were not only pitifully few, but, as already explained, included jobs created in Atlantis thanks to the DTI. If there is a single indicator as to the depth of the inequity in this province then it has to be sanitation. According to City of Cape Town's figures, approximately 80 000 households do not have a toilet. Is it any wonder that we have a "diarrhoea season" in Cape Town; that children in the Mother City die because of preventable deaths? Precious few of these households could be expected to support the Premier's party, so they may as well not exist. These are the desperadoes who have flung raw sewerage in our streets; the people at the bottom of the socio-economic pile who have no hope of ever entering the gates of the "opportunity-society" for some that the DA would construct. We don't support the strategies and tactics they have adopted but we do share their pain.

It is reckless and unsustainable to defend privilege at the cost of providing basic facilities for the poor. You have power now in the Western Cape, Madam Premier, but at what long-term cost? For how long will you be able to

hold the poor at the gates? What real benefits will accrue to your children and grandchildren from the resentment and hostile division you are building today?

We have travelled for 20 years down our freedom road. There is no room for smugness and complacency. The journey is far from over. We have to build a country in which all people feel a valued part, and we are failing dismally to do that in the Western Cape. Instead, we are fomenting division and hatred; yes, hatred! That is what the so-called “pooh-flingers” feel.

It is incumbent on all of us, regardless of the parties we represent, to build a sustainable home in which all our people can live dignified lives. We cannot build a sustainable home on a foundation of extreme levels of wealth and poverty. We cannot build a sustainable home as long as black people feel unwelcome in our province [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: With the ANC it never stops [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: We cannot build a sustainable home on the expectation that the poor will sit back and accept their poverty indefinitely. We cannot build a sustainable home on the back of a political strategy to divide rather than to unite, and influx control is not an option.

Yes, you have power in the Western Cape now, Madam Premier, but your

pursuit of short-term gain for long-term pain is breathtakingly myopic. It is setting the Western Cape on an inevitable course of conflict that will ultimately disadvantage all of our people. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi! [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer over to you.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Thank you Mr Speaker.

I am not sure the hon member Ms Brown listened or even read the speech of Premier Zille of last Friday. In her State of the Province Address of 13 February ... [Interjection.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: You did not listen.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: 13 February 2009, the hon leader of the opposition, Ms Brown, flagged some of the corrupt dealings of her predecessor, Rasool, but Mr Speaker it was left to the current Premier to deal decisively with the corruption, maladministration and fraud that by then had become so systemic in the previous ANC administration [Interjections.]

One of the first measures of this government was to require accounting officers to review all the risk in the respective departments, Mr Speaker.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, there was no corruption!

The SPEAKER: Order! hon member Mr Skwatsha.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: These risks have been interrogated on a regular basis and served to inform our prevention plans [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Mr Speaker let us now turn to the national [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order. Proceed hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Thank you Mr Speaker. Let us now turn to the national development plan. This document reaches consensus that we need three things to make South Africa succeed to take South Africa forward as a nation.

Firstly Mr Speaker it is leadership. In her first State of the Province Address on Friday, the 29th of May 2009, Premier Zille referred to the state of the province we inherited from the ANC. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: And she said: “Our first analysis of the provincial government’s finances, assets and spending patterns has convinced us that we are not taking over a thriving enterprise.”

She continued: “Poor financial management across various departments has seriously undermined the capacity to deliver on their core mandates.”

Mr Speaker in 2009 hon Premier Zille’s administration inherited several departments that were in deep financial trouble as a result of poor management by the previous ANC government. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker in her State of the Province Address in 2009 Premier Zille made a commitment and I quote: “We intend to bring clean governance to this administration.”

Mr Speaker it is now public knowledge that because of the leadership of Premier Zille the Western Cape is the best run province in South Africa.

Mr H P GEYER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: There is no doubt about it. Mr Speaker the leadership and governance of all nine provincial governments were assessed by the office of the President through the Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation. President Zuma's own office brought out the report that is known as the MPAP management, performance and assessment report of 2013.

Mr Speaker now that these members of the ANC in this House deny the "good story", I brought out to this house a copy of this report - the good story of the Western Cape is documented in the report of the office of the President of Republic of South Africa, President Zuma, so nobody must deny the good story of the Western Cape.

Mr H P GEYER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: This is a confirmation Mr Speaker and if members of this House want a copy I am happy to send a copy to hon member Mr Skwatsha. I am happy to give you a copy of this report. [Interjections.] This is the good news as documented by President Zuma's office.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The first citizen of our country.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: The first citizen of our country. [Interjection.]

Ms J WITBOOI: The best citizen! [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Our President of South Africa presented this report and the President is confirming that people are now denying in this House that there is a good story in the Western Cape. It is documented, Premier, by the office of the President. But I come back to this report and so Mr Speaker in terms of this report the Western Cape is the number one province in South Africa for a number of things, which I will return to later, but Mr Speaker, Premier Zille also provided leadership in other areas that she mentioned in her speech, for example she provided leadership in the launching of the 110% Green Economy Project. She provided leadership in the issue of the broadband. She provided leadership in the safety and security sphere together with Minister Plato, a new Community Safety Bill, now a Community Safety Act, and my colleagues will further speak about this matter.

Ms J WITBOOI: Please wake him up!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Unlike President Zuma, President Zille provided leadership.

Ms M TINGWE: President Zille! (laughing)

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Premier Zille provided leadership. [Interjections.] But because President Zuma is not providing leadership we look up to Premier Zille to provide that leadership. [Interjections.] Leadership is critical in terms of the national development plan. [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Jou hart [Onduidelik.]

Me J WITBOOI: Ekskuus tog?

'n AGBARE LID: Jy gaan 'n hartaanval kry as jy so [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms J WITBOOI: No!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Colleagues, leadership according to the NDP is critical but what do we get from President Zuma in return? We get quiet diplomacy. We get - he is quiet on Nkandla, he is quiet on Guptagate. He is quiet on the SABC.

Ms J WITBOOI: Mamphela!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: He is quiet on the police incompetence. Mr Speaker, President Zuma is quiet on the matters of the State.

Ms M TINGWE: [Inaudible.] quiet on porta-potties.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Mr Speaker Hon Premier Zille has demonstrated leadership in her State of the Province Address when she referred to the progress that this government has made since 2009.

Mnr die Speaker die tweede aspek wat die nasionale ontwikkelingsplan aanraak is aktiewe burgerskap. Mnr die Speaker daar is konsensus aan die ontwikkel dat ons nie moet vra wat kan die Staat vir my doen nie, maar wat kan ek vir Suid-Afrika doen. Mnr die Speaker onder leiding van Premier Zille het sy aktiewe burgerskap sentraal geplaas in haar regeerkunde argitektuur. Met die slagspreuk “Beter Tesame” erken sy die rol van die Staat as fasiliteerder van geleenthede maar asook die rol van die burgery om daardie geleenthede te benut en persoonlike verantwoordelikheid te neem en te eien. Mnr die Speaker op die wyse beweeg sy weg van die afhanklikheid-sindroom en beweeg sy weg van ’n passiewe burgery en plaas aktiewe burgerskap sentraal.

Mnr H P GEYER: Hoor-hoor!

Die MINISTER VIR KULTUURSAKE SPORT EN REKREASIE: Sy bevestig dat aktiewe burgerskap deur middel van die oop-geleentheidsgedrewe samelewing moontlik is en ek haal aan uit haar toespraak: “This is a society in which everyone has the chance and the means to use opportunities in life, and where everyone takes responsibility for using those opportunities.”

Mnr die Speaker sy beklemtoon dat die Staat en burgery elkeen hul verantwoordelikheid met erns moet opneem. Onder haar bewind het ons drie nuwe hospitale gebou en onder haar leiding en die Minister van Gesondheid bevorder ons gesonde lewensstyl. Met gesonde lewensstyl bevorder Premier Zille aktiewe burgerskap. Die vele gesondheidsklubs in die Wes-Kaap is ’n bewys dat die Zille-administrasie daad by die woord gevoeg het. Twee weke gelede het ek dit in aksie gesien, mnr die Speaker, toe vroue en jeug deelgeneem het aan ’n gesonde lewensstyl program by die Bellville-Suid Rekreasiesentrum. Saam met my was agbare lid me Anroux Du Toit Marais.

Agb lede, Premier Zille is so ernstig met aktiewe burgerskap dat sy self deelgeneem het aan ’n ‘wellness’ program saam met haar kollegas. Sy het ook self deelgeneem aan ’n gesonde leefstyl ‘big walk’ in Manenberg. Die vroue in die gemeenskap van Manenberg het gewys dat aktiewe burgerskap deur middel van gesonde lewensstyl ’n realiteit is vir die mense in Manenberg.

Mnr die Speaker terwyl die President Zuma kiesers beeste belowe na die verkiesing - belowe President Zuma die kiesers beeste na die verkiesing -

vestig die Wes-Kaap 'n kultuur van aktiewe burgerskap. Hoewel ons nog 'n lang pad in die Wes-Kaap moet loop het Premier Zille die paradigma van passiewe burgerskap na aktiewe burgerskap verskuif.

Mr Speaker many colleagues in this debate will highlight the other opportunities this government has created under her administration.

Thirdly, Mr Speaker, the NDP propose a capable state to achieve the objectives of the National Planning Commission. It is public knowledge that the Zuma-administration has failed the test of a capable state. The reference is in the MPAT report, the Public Service Commission, the AG report and the Census. [Interjections.] I am accepting the report [Interjections.] I am accepting the report because it is your President.

Ms M TINGWE: Please!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: This is a report that confirms that South Africa, under Zuma's administration, has failed the test of a capable state [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Witbooi, order!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: The office of the President Mr Speaker [Interjection.]

Ms M TINGWE: Listen to yourself!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Mr Speaker what hon member Ms Tingwe must know is that this report was tabled in the national cabinet and it was approved by the cabinet so this is the report of the government of the Republic of South Africa. The office of the President did an assessment of all the provincial governments in South Africa, Mr Speaker, and eight provincial governments failed the test in this report. In terms of this report the Western Cape is the number one province in terms of governance, the number one province in terms of strategic management; the number one province in terms of financial management; and the number one province in terms of human resource management.

Mr Speaker we have seen in a space of five years how Premier Zille has turned this province around. How did she do this?

Firstly she did an honest assessment of the state of the State. Secondly she and her administration did an assessment of the problems facing this government. Thirdly she set out the outcomes her government wanted to achieve. Fourthly her administration developed a provincial strategic plan to deliver on those outcomes and lastly Mr Speaker her administration developed clear measurable indicators to measure progress.

Mr Speaker the Premier has informed the National Planning Commission that they must see the Western Cape not as a threat but as an opportunity. Under

Zille's leadership she presented case studies for successful implementation for the national development plan to demonstrate her absolute commitment to help and keep South Africa succeeding. Her track record in governance is a further proof that the Western Cape has a capable state to deliver on the objectives of the national development plan.

Mr Speaker in conclusion the evidence is clear. The Western Cape has produced a good story. The good story is confirmed in the MPAT report, in the AG's report, in the Public Service Commission's report, in the Census report. This is a good story [Interjection.]

Ms M TINGWE: Yo! Porta-potties.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Mr Speaker and hon Premier, the Western Cape has produced a good story. If you question the good story hon member Mr Skwatsha then you question the Chapter 9 Institutions of the Constitution. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: I am now going to show you that you are now questioning the Constitution [Interjection.] You question the Public Service Commission [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Meyer [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: You question the Auditor General. You question the Census ... (intervention)

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: This is the good story; maybe [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, order hon Minister Meyer, please finish your sentence.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Okay. My sentence is [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no good story!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: The Western Cape [Interjections.]

Ms J WITBOOI: There is no good story!

Ms M TINGWE: Hallelujah!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: The Western Cape

has produced a good story and the government of President Zuma
[Interjection.]

Ms J WITBOOI: No good story!

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: The government
of President Zuma confirmed the Western Cape has a good story. I thank you.

Ms J WITBOOI: No good story! [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Porta-porta.

Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Hulle kan nie daai goed
so [Onduidelik.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais over to you.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you Mr Speaker. [Interjection.]

Ms J WITBOOI: You do not have a good story.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Witbooi!

Me J WITBOOI: Anroux, ons hou baie van jou!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: For the past five years the hon Premier has addressed us on the state of the province and each year we are witness to the progress the Western Cape is making in all departments of provincial government.

Een spesifieke departement wat van krag-tot-krag gegaan het en nog steeds gaan is die Departement van Gesondheid. Nieteenstaande die uitdagings wat die departement ondervind lewer die departement 'n omvattende pakket van gesondheidsdienste aan die mense van die Wes-Kaap.

Over the past five years Minister Botha and his department increased wellness and decreased the burden of disease so that people can live lives they value.

R27 biljoen is spandeer op gesondheids-infrastruktuur oor 'n periode van vier jaar wat die oprigting en ontwikkeling van 17 klinieke, 12 ambulansstasies, 8 distrikshospitale insluitende die Khayelitsha en Mitchells Plein Hospitale, 13 streeks-en gespesialiseerde hospitaalprojekte, 21 sentrale hospitaalprojekte en vyf patologie laboratoriums en die Wes-Kaap Verpleegkunde Kollege tot gevolg het. Sedert die DA aan bevind gekom het is die vakante poste vir verpleegkundiges verminder vanaf 30% tot slegs 5%.

The hon Premier so rightfully said citizens cannot take advantage of their

opportunities if they are not healthy.

So onlangs soos November 2013 het die Wes-Kaap Regering mobiele gesondheidstasies om leerders te ondersoek bekendgestel. Hierdie inisiatief is die eerste in Suid-Afrika. Vyf mobiele, mees moderne eenhede besoek skole regoor die provinsie om Graad R en Graad 1 leerders veral in die diep platteland en arm areas te ondersoek. Gehoor-, visie-, oog-, oor- en velondersoeke sowel as voorkomende tandheelkundige dienste word verskaf. Mediese toestande word dus vroegtydig gediagnoseer. Waar nodig word lede toepaslik verwys na gesondheidsinstansies. Investerings in die gesondheid van kinders is 'n belegging in die opvoeding en onderwys en hierdie inisiatief van die Departement van Gesondheid en Onderwys is tekenend van die omgeëre regering wat ons is. Daar is talle voorbeelde van suksesse en die uitnemende implementering van gesondheidsdienslewering in die Wes-Kaap wat toeganklik is vir individue en gesinne in ons diverse gemeenskappe. Voorbeelde hiervan, en ek noem slegs enkele, is die Thembaletu Kliniek in George wat dramatiese bydrae lewer tot die voorkoming van behandeling van MIV-Vigs en TB en versorging van gemeenskappe in die Suid-Kaap.

The providing of medical male circumcision services at health facilities in the Western Cape decreases the transmission of sexually transmitted diseases and a number of preventable facilities involved with the practice.

Die Rooikruis Oorlogsgedenk Kinderhospitaal se nuwe Aansteeklike Siektesentrum wat die eerste pediatriese kliniese navorsingsentrum in 'n

kinderhospitaal in Suid-Afrika is. Die toegewyde Adolescente Psigiatryiese Eenheid in die Tygerberg Hospitaal; die opgradering van die Uniondale Kliniek wat die pasiënt ondervinding verbeter en die sukses van die Kroniese Medisyneverspreidingseenheid.

I am proud to mention, I am proud to congratulate the Robertson Hospital for being awarded the National Public Institutional Pharmacy of the Year 2013 Award by the Pharmacy Council of South Africa. On the 5th of November 2013 Minister Botha announced the 120 contracts signed with pharmacy groups and individual pharmacies across the province to provide family planning and immunisation services. This will cut the queues at health facilities and address long waiting periods. This initiative has leverage, growth and health economy of the Western Cape and immediate benefits to the private sector and patients.

Mossel Bay Hospital was awarded the prestigious Mother-and-Baby-Friendly Hospital Initiative Accreditation. This international accreditation has been awarded to six of the seven maternity units in the Eden district.

Mr Speaker as we all know infant mortality is the death of a child less than one year of age. Infant mortality takes away society's potential, physical, social and human capital. Factors contributing to infant mortality are low levels of education, poor environmental conditions and lack of political and medical infrastructure. By improving sanitation, providing access to clean drinking water, available immunisation against infectious diseases and public

health measures help to reduce high rates on infant mortality significantly in the Western Cape. This is a clear indication of our commitment to service delivery in all departments of the DA-led government and the healthy lifestyle to each and every citizen, rich and poor, in our diverse communities.

Mr Speaker what counts in the Western Cape is not the mere fact that we as the DA are governing. It is the difference we made to the lives of our people that determine the significance of the way we govern. I thank you.
[Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha over to you. [Interjection.]

†UMnu M SKWATSHA: Enkosi Somlomo, lamagqabantshintshi entetho ndizoyenza apha namhlanje ndinika imbeko kongaskhoyo igqala lomzabalazo wenkululeko, eliwe kuleveki iphelileyo ubawo uMamtembu Qumbela, uBawo uQumbela ngomnye wabantu abalwele loMzansti Afrika umtsha ngela xesha ebewulwela loMzantsi Afrika umtsha ubawo uQumbela abaninzi kwelacala bebelwela into yokuba ungabikho loMzantsi Afrika umtsha.

* Mr M SKWATSHA:: Thank you Speaker, the brief statement I am about to make here today is to give respect to the late veteran struggle freedom fighter, who died last week Mr Mamthembu Qumbela. Mr Qumbela is one of the people that fought for the new South Africa at the time Mr Nqumbela was

fighting for this new South Africa most from that side were fighting that there should be no new South Africa.

Mr Speaker, Madam Premier, sometimes politicians engaging in debates such as these tend to focus so intensely on statistics and mind-numbing numbers in order to prove their points, to the extent that they fail to see the bigger picture.

The bigger picture is this: South Africa is located in Africa. We have sizeable white, Coloured and Indian populations but the overwhelming majority of our citizens are African. It was this realisation of this simple fact that I think, Madam Premier, which undoubtedly lay behind your desperation to kiss Sis Mampela in public. [Interjections.]

We are an extraordinary country that produced an array of extraordinary leaders of the calibre of Walter Sisulu, OR Tambo, Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela. Ironically these leaders and others such as Chris Hani, Sobukwe and Steve Biko all came from the Eastern Cape. You would call them refugees, Madam Premier.

When apartheid crumbled, the ANC, embodied by our beloved Madiba, surprised the world with its call not for vengeance, but for unity and reconciliation. Tata Mandela wanted to build a country in which all felt a part, a country that cared for all its citizens, a country in which all people could enjoy freedom of speech and conviction and movement, a country in

which all people could live with a measure of dignity.

I would like to quote him. I quote: “As I walked out the door toward the gate that would lead to my freedom, I knew if I did not leave my bitterness and hatred behind, I would still be in prison.”

The word that comes to mind is magnanimity. We saw it, not only from our leaders, but also from our people. If you may remember the TRC hearings, how victim after victim of apartheid police would relate ghastly stories about deaths, disappearances and torture of loved ones, but were willing to forgive the perpetrators. It was none other than the TRC Chairperson Archbishop Tutu who subsequently commented that he wished our white compatriots had participated in the commission proceedings in the same magnanimous spirit as our black compatriots.

Mr Speaker in this context it is deeply insulting for the Premier to refer to black citizens moving to the Western Cape as “refugees”.

'n AGBARE LID: Ag hene!

Mr M SKWATSHA: And for the predominantly white male members on the DA side of the house to sit and snigger about it.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Siestog! [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: It is deeply insulting for the Premier to present the influx of black children to schools in the Western Cape as a financial burden on the Western Cape and therefore a problem, when the truth is that the budgets all provinces receive are tweaked each year to take account of population movements.

The PREMIER: No that is wrong [Inaudible.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Let me tell you a story about [Interjections.] Let me tell you a story about refugees in the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You do not know what is going on [Inaudible.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: You, Madam Premier [Interjections.] would have regarded my late father Mzikabawo Skwatsha as a refugee. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Mr M SKWATSHA: You Madam Premier would have regarded my late father as a refugee. Born in Herschel in the Eastern Cape, he went to Johannesburg before moving to Cape Town in the early 50s. Like all African new arrivals, he was taken on a truck to the Pinelands area, where he was submerged in a large chemical bath, like cattle dip. Later, he worked as a chef in the then-Prime Minister's residence at what we now call Genadendal.

My mother, Nonkosi, was also from the Herschel. The dates of her visits to my dad in Cape Town were recorded in her Dompas, which I have here. Looking at those dates, I can tell almost to the day when I was conceived. [Laughing]

Ms M TINGWE: Yo!

Mr M SKWATSHA: This is how apartheid controlled us, even when we should be conceived. My father carried a reference book infamously known as the Dompas and was not considered South African. Neither of my parents was considered South African, let alone Western Cape citizens. They were regarded as citizens of the Transkei. They even carried travel documents as citizens of the Transkei.

Even I, ironically, who was born in Cape Town, did not qualify for a reference book because they were born in Transkei.

Ms L BROWN: Yes.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I also received a Transkeian citizen called a “travel document”, not a citizen of the Western Cape of South Africa, though I was born here.

Ms L BROWN: A refugee.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Of course that was a long time ago; and this year we celebrate the 20th year of our freedom, and a good story that has already been told, and we say there is much to be celebrated, because the South Africa of today is unrecognisable to that of yesterday – although it is arguably not so unrecognisable in the Western Cape.

New arrivals are no longer dipped, for example. They can no longer be forced to live in a particular location or work for a particular employer, but I believe that the Western Cape government is pursuing a deliberate agenda of not providing facilities or services for new arrivals. I believe that under your watch, Madam Premier, the Western Cape deliberately seeks to prove to new arrivals in our province that this is not for them the “land of milk and honey”, that they should rather go home.

The Constitution does not permit influx control, but it doesn't mention anything about discouraging urbanisation from the Eastern Cape. Is urbanisation not a worldwide trend? Are social scientists not predicting that about 80% of the world's population will be living in cities within 15 to 20 years?

So let us look at the life in the Western Cape today. To what extent has the province and City facilitated the integration of our people across the physical barriers that used to divide us? Have you helped to weave a unified social fabric?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Have you presided over the delivery of services and dignity to the poor so that the rich can sleep without their alarms on at night? Have we shed our crowns as the world capital of foetal alcohol syndrome, Tik, murder and rape? The answer is an emphatic no.

When I go shopping in Cape Town it often strikes me that security guards in the shops watch me more closely than they would watch the hon Theuns Botha, because of my less pigmentation. [Interjections.] When I go to restaurants, my table is often a dark island in a sea of much paler shades. [Interjections.]

The same goes for Newlands Rugby Stadium. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Continue, continue.

An HON MEMBER: What about [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M SKWATSHA: Why are we different to Johannesburg or Durban or East London or Bloemfontein?

An HON MEMBER: The most of the [Inaudible.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Why do most of the top recording artists in the country base themselves in Johannesburg when they come from Cape Town?

Ms M TINGWE: Uh-huh, yes.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Why do the majority of our young black professionals track north? The informal settlements of Barcelona, Kanana, Philippi and Site B in Khayelitsha where the bucket system stills prevails, the Mayor of Cape Town could hardly spend more than 30 minutes in the area and all that time she had her mouth covered, and our people stay in such a situation. The kind of sanitation provision one experienced a week ago in Villiersdorp makes one convinced that this DA government does not care about our people.

You take credit for the construction of our hospitals in Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha which were created through the national conditional grant. To be fair, construction was completed under your watch.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I agree.

Mr M SKWATSHA: And they are fantastic facilities. But the level of management and care on offer is way below the standard at which it should be; and it's not just the people of Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha who must battle for their place in the sun. The Public Protector was dismally unimpressed with Gugulethu Day Hospital last year.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes, Uh-huh.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The elderly continue to experience chaos at Hanover Park. Facilities in poorer areas have suffered repeated shortages of medicines. Are you getting the picture, Madam Premier?

Our children are the only children in the country who are denied the opportunity to participate in the Cuban doctors' programme. No-one asked them.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ag!

Mr M SKWATSHA: No-one asked them. They are denied by this government.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes. [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yet from the other provinces, we hear reports that their graduates return from Cuba with high levels. [Interjections.] You have no right to deny our children.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr M SKWATSHA: This negative trend in the province's state of health is in much contrast to the success we have experienced in healthcare [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members.

Mr M SKWATSHA: In the rest of the country over the last five years. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Skwatsha, Order! Your time has been expired.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Can I go with my last sentence?

The SPEAKER: You are allowed.

Mr M SKWATSHA: My last sentence.

The SPEAKER: Yes, of course.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Under President Zuma life expectancy in this country has improved [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you honourable.

Mr M SKWATSHA: For the rest of our citizens and that is the good story that we have today. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Amandla!

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Skwatsha. [Applause] Order! Hon member Mr De Villiers, over to you.

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, hon Premier, hon Ministers, hon members of the legislature and all guests, it is indeed a privilege to be part of this debate because this is where we as politicians can tell the people of the Western Cape and South Africa what we have done with the blood-sweated taxes and what performances we gained to develop a better life for them. It all boils down to accountability, responsibility and trust of their future.

Mr Speaker I just want to address something here: you know the ANC over there they are actually like [Inaudible.].

An HON MEMBER: What, like?

Mr M DE VILLIERS: People from the Eastern Cape ‘word buite verband geruk’. [Tussenwerpsel.]

Me J WITBOOI: Ons het nie uit verband geruk nie!

Mr M DE VILLIERS: The ANC is misleading the people.

Ms M TINGWE: How?

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Ms Tingwe [Inaudible.]

Mr M DE VILLIERS: We bragged about it that in spite of our budget allocation from national government we still can supply other people from other provinces with service delivery. That is the truth. Not like you saying, “refugees”. You are twisting the information [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Who is saying that?

Mr M DE VILLIERS: And you are twisting the truth. [Interjections.] National government - if you can just keep quiet [Interjections.] National government only gives to provinces [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha, hon members, order!

Mr M DE VILLIERS: National government only give provinces money [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Witbooi.

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Money for those people registered on the population list of that province [Interjections.]. And that is the truth. We are bragging about it that we can also assist other people coming to this province to give them service delivery. That is the truth Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker the Western Cape Province under the leadership of the Premier and the Democratic Alliance is a better place to be as when the ANC, SACP and Cosatu alliance were in government in the Western Cape. In this session of Parliament they have tried to make the Western Cape Province ungovernable by the strikes of farm workers, the inhumane throwing of human faeces and others, but without success. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members order.

Ms M TINGWE: Where have you been [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Tingwe! Hon member Ms Tingwe.

Mr M DE VILLIERS: The AG's report 2012/2013 showed and stated categorically [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Better than the ANC.

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Stated categorically that when coming to good governance and accountability the Western Cape government is the best. [Interjections.] Their municipalities under the control of the DA management are better than those under ANC, SACP and Cosatu management.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon. Take your seat, hon De Villiers. Chief Whip over to you. [Interjections.]

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Speaker dit is regtig vir 'n lid onmoontlik om sy toespraak te lewer [Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You are a serious zero [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle order [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! There are two members that I just want to warn you again, Hon member Ms Witbooi and hon member Ms Prins, if you do not stop really I would chase you out of this House. [Interjections.] Hon two members, hon, you carry on all the way when the Speaker is on the floor. [Interjections.] You may continue hon member Mr De Villiers.

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Thank you Mr Speaker. The President said to the nation in his State of the Nation Address that they delivered a good story to the people of South Africa. Indeed South Africa is better than before 1994, thanks to former Presidents Mandela and Thabo Mbeki for their leadership [Interjection]

But since President Jacob Zuma took over, he messed up. [Interjections.] The economy could not pick up. Unemployment increased. Wasteful and irregular expenditure increased. More corruption increased. The fuel price jumped sky high and the support from government to countries under communist rule, dictators and undemocratic governance increased. [Interjections.] You are talking about Cuba. Cuba is under a communist party. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Let me tell you [Interjections.] Let me tell you the story which President Jacob Zuma and the ANC alliance did not tell you. [Interjections.] Since 2009 unemployment increased with 1.4 million people with no jobs and the youth are the most. Statistics South Africa's report stated that the Western Cape government created 98 000 jobs [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Mr M DE VILLIERS: In the last quarter of 2013 [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

Ms L BROWN: That has got [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha!

Mr M DE VILLIERS: 7% of all [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: The member is on the floor.

Mr M DE VILLIERS: 7% of all new jobs created, were created by the DA government. Financial regulations and control are the backbone of a good successful government. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker a shocking statement is that 93% of national government departments failed to comply with financial regulations and control and that is actually my duty in the National Council of Provinces to do oversight over the national departments. That means that President Jacob Zuma's management did not enforce stringent measures to prevent corruption, wasteful and irregular expenditure. [Interjections.] Even the overspending on budget allocations... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.] to promote corruption.

Ms M TINGWE: Where?

Mr M DE VILLIERS: ...by national departments was the order of the day.

[Interjections.] That is the sad story which Jacob Zuma did not tell.

[Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Come back home!

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Only in Gauteng according to Corruption Watch, 38% of corruption happened in Gauteng. The Gauteng government loses R6 billion a year to wasteful and irregular expenditure. This money is more than the annual budget of 2013/14 of human settlements and social development together in the Western Cape. This money can be used for a very good reason in the Western Cape if that money is coming to us. This money, Mr Speaker, that money, wasted, is the sad story about the ANC government.
[Interjections.]

Let us look at the states of accountability of national departments for fruitless and wasteful expenditure. Let me give you some numbers.

Ms M TINGWE: Yo! Like the porta-potties!

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Justice Constitutional Development: R 39.2 million; Rural Development and Land Reform: R35.7 million; Public Works: R 4.3 million.

'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Cogta: R 503.3 million for irregular expenditure. Correctional Services: R363.8 million, and so I can carry on. The Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape state of governance is in a very good state and quality of deliverance. Our roads and schools are better. [Interjections.] Employment, health, tourism and service delivery on basic services are far better than in provinces under ANC control.

The story of “Better Together” is confirmed by independent role players and also by the national government, not by us, your government in the National Assembly under ANC rule. So if you as the people of the Western Cape choose to go backwards on the quality of life, please go and vote ANC, but if you choose for a better delivery on your life, please use your mind and vote DA. [Interjections.] A story to tell people in other provinces: choose a better future for you and your children. Make the change in your life.

Ms M TINGWE: The porta-potties!

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Ms Tingwe.

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Make the right choice. Vote DA and you also can be amongst people who believe in “Better Together” as one nation [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon De Villiers.

Mr M DE VILLIERS: Not a divided nation. I thank you very much Mr Speaker. [Applause] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, over to you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker before I start I would like to remind hon member Mr De Villiers as well as Minister Meyer, you have to decide. You cannot cherry-pick. Do you believe in the national government or do you not? You cannot one minute praise them and the next minute you cut them down or you cut them off.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Hooray for the national government!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker the DA's reign in this province for the past five years is not a good story to tell, because all they have managed to do was to increase the divide between rich and poor [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Oh really?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They show scant regard for the dignity of people.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Rubbish!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Distort the facts between [Interjections.] distort the facts when it suits them.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Rubbish!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Always shift the focus to other provinces when confronted with injustices.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Rubbish!

The SPEAKER: Order! Order Minister, Minister Carlisle, order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: For everything [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Hon Mr Speaker, Mr Speaker [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Mr Speaker you made a ruling on that.

Mr P UYS: Hon Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I ruled on both sides.

Ms M TINGWE: No, you did not.

The SPEAKER: Both sides.

Mr P UYS: Wag eers. Mr Speaker ... (intervention)

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: He was even interrupting when you were making a ruling earlier on. You must please address hon Minister Carlisle.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys I am ruling on both sides. You may continue. Hon member Ms Witbooi, order, hon Minister Carlisle.
[Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Hey Witbooi, sit down.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Kry vir jou 'n 'job' [Onduidelik.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Hon members, order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They blame national government for everything they did not achieve, even if the responsibility rested with them as the ruling party of this province, but Mr Speaker, let me start with education over the past five years, because it actually reads like a horror story. The idea of running education like a business backfired as they reeled from one crisis to the next,

because they forgot that education is about people, not balance sheet figures on paper in a boardroom.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is not about [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: So Mr Speaker I will address different issues in brief of this DA horror story. Today Mr Speaker, about almost 40 days after schools have reopened about 900 learners are still looking for placements and that is only in Mitchells Plain.

The PREMIER: That is nonsense. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The DA boasts with the lowest school dropout in the country.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Rubbish!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is misleading!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But Mr Speaker [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You are misleading the house.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What is important for the ANC is that every child that should be in school is in school.

The PREMIER: Oh really!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Let us look at learner transport. [Interjections.] The handling of the Reenendal bus disaster looks like a horror story on its own.

Ms L BROWN: Oh yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: First the learner transport report was classified as “confidential”. Then the department availed this much classified report to a journalist [Interjection.]

Ms L BROWN: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: So that the public could discuss it but not the oversight body, Scopa. [Interjections.] Then later they admit that the classification was a mistake.

An HON MEMBER: Open opportunity.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But the plot thickens. When learners from that same Reenendal are stranded at the beginning of this academic year with no

transport to take them to Knysna this DA government appoints the same company involved in that terrible accident two years ago. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Not from Reenendal to Knysna, are you mad?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: So much for the safety of our learners.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Is that really a good story to tell Mr Speaker? Textbooks are not delivered. Furniture and equipment are not delivered to technical schools for instance.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Are you in Cape Town now?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: In rural areas like De Doorns, Pacaltsdorp, Slangrivier, schools are still waiting on teachers for critical posts.

An HON MEMBER: Can you listen? [Laughing]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Is it a good story to cram 78 learners into a classroom in Barrydale for instance? Luckily those parents stood up to the department and they got results. Now that is a good story. Mr Speaker does the Cape High Court or the DA rule this province? On the same day of the

State of the Province Address [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, we rule.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The Western Cape Education Department was ordered by the Cape High Court to provide adequate security to schools in Manenberg. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We know about that.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Why should a court remind the DA of their constitutional mandate to provide [Interjections.] a safe and secure learning environment? [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker this is but one of many instances where the Cape High Court intervenes on behalf of learners. Need I remind this House that the MEC was ordered by the Cape High Court not to close 27 schools.

The PREMIER: The one court case in the High Court [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Need I remind you also that those same schools showed marked improvement in their results last year. That is a good story.

An HON MEMBER: That is a good story.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Then the spin on the election-foefie of extra no-fee schools: what the Premier did not say in her boast session was that the R70 million to be used for this purpose comes from the infrastructure budget for early childhood development allocated by education, but Public Works was too slow to spend the funds and the implication - Grade R classrooms will not be built or refurbished. Education will have to find that money to replace it. How can that be a good story to tell?

Premier Zille, your continuous secessionist tendencies and ideologies when referring to fellow South African citizens from the Eastern Cape [Interjection] who choose the Western Cape as their home just proves that you want to portray the Western Cape as a country on its own for the rich and privileged.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Rubbish!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But you remain silent when those very people become domestics and labourers in your constituencies. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker let us talk about jobs. The DA wants us to believe that the investment by Hisense and Tellumat in Atlantis was due to their effort, but Mr Speaker we all know that national Ministers Ebrahim Patel and Rob Davies were instrumental in facilitating this initiative [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They chased away

the investors [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Because they see the Western Cape as part of South Africa. That is a good story to tell. Surveys over the years, over the last five years since April 2009 show that 61% of the new jobs created in the Western Cape have gone to whites who constitutes 17.5% of the total provincial population [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is impossible. It is impossible, where did you get that - those stats?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: 3.1% of jobs went to coloureds, which constitutes 0.5%.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Where is your source?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: 8% of the jobs [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Where is your source?

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Carlisle.

Ms J WITBOOI: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Africans actually lost jobs, but constitute 28.5% of the population in this province.

The PREMIER: The source, the source? [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Let us not forget the loss of thousands of jobs as well. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: [Inaudible] or tomato sauce!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: How is this a good story to tell? [Interjections.] But Mr Speaker, the real good story about investment and job creation by DTI are encompassed in this document in front of me here, with opportunities and money spent as well as opportunities created by SEDA, a huge document with lots of opportunities by national departments to the value of millions of rands. A recent analysis of spending by provinces Mr Speaker also showed that KwaZulu Natal, Northwest and Mpumalanga were the top three spenders on their half-year budgets. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape featured at number eight out of nine.

'n AGBARE LID: Hene, waar val jy uit?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Where? How is that a good story, but Mr Speaker,

the horror continues. [Interjections.] World class services for rich and poor and no services for the rest and poor services for the rest; instead of delivering services to communities who clamour for it [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It sounds like the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The City of Cape Town decides to spend money to change a logo. Why fix what is not broken, and the audacity to do so without even consulting its own citizens, yet they profess “Better Together” and active citizenship.

Now Mr Speaker with regard to the audit outcomes of the municipalities the latest report by the AG is just alarming. Only 12 of 30 municipalities received clean audits.

The PREMIER: Only twelve?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: 18 show material misstatements. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Only 12.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: 15 have fruitless and wasteful expenditure. [Interjections.] 12 have problems with procurement and this is the pattern. According to the AG the main reason for this is ineffective management, non-

filling of vacant posts, and a lack of consequences for poor performance.

Mr M OZINSKY: Whether you get to deal with [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: How can this possibly be a good story? [Interjection.] Today I do not even want to touch on hostile takeovers and clinging to power and repeat offenders like Kannaland and Swellendam and Oudtshoorn. But finally Mr Speaker for this horror story to be rewritten the DA needs to realise that this province is an integral part of South Africa and can do nothing without allocation from the national government.

An HON MEMBER: Or the taxpayers.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: So when the ANC tries to build South Africa and to eradicate inequality, to take South Africa forward together, we as the ANC will not stand by and watch the DA accept taxpayers money [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is the ANC's senseless [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister Carlisle.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: To advance their skewed agenda at the expense of those for whom freedom means the right to be treated equally and with dignity in this province. Only when that happens will the DA have a good

story to tell.

An HON MEMBER: Never!

Ms L BROWN: Hear-hear.

An HON MEMBER: I do not believe that.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Van Rensburg over to you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker it was a pleasure and a privilege to listen to Premier Zille deliver her State of the Province Speech on Friday. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It was with a great sense of pride that I could relive the five years with our Premier. [Interjections.]

Mnr die Speaker as ek die afgelope 15 jaar saam met Premier Zille kan opsom dan is dit as volg: sy het 'n passie vir arm mense, vir mense wat swaarkry en haar hele provinsiale rede [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms M TINGWE: That is why she is the only one [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Hon member Ms Tingwe!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Haar hele provinsiale rede het gewys dat sy wil graag 'n verskil maak aan mense wat swaarkry. Elke persoon in die Wes-Kaap moet weet dat hy of sy belangrik is, dat ons hulle belange op ons hart dra al is hulle daar ver en dit is waarom ons ry van Stofland in die noorde tot Merweville in die ooste om juis om te gee vir mense wat swaarkry en vir arm mense.

Ms M TINGWE: So proud!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: En dit is hoekom ons 76% van ons begroting spandeer aan arm gemeenskappe. [Tussenwerpsels.] Kan ek vir die agb lid me Witbooi net iets sê?

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Nee wat, nee los haar.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ek weet sy soek graag spanning hier tussen ons, maar sy moet kyk na my lyftaal. Sy moet kyk na die lyftaal van my leiers aan my linkerkant [Tussenwerpsel.]

Me J WITBOOI: O hemel!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: En weet u wat [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Ms Witbooi order.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: As ek kyk na u lyftaal dan sien ek mense wat beswaard is [Tussenwerpsel.]

Me J WITBOOI: Nooit!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dan sien ek mense wat nou nie wil opkyk nie; dan sien ek mense wat se gesigte hang [Tussenwerpsels.] Dan sien ek mense wat vol spanning is. [Tussenwerpsels.] Premier, baie dankie [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Pierre en Carol het julle lekker ore aangesit.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie vir die elektrisiteit wat u moontlik maak het dat ons dit vir plaaswerkers ook kan gee. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Pierre het julle lekker aangesteek. [Onduidelik.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ons wil graag vir arm plaaswerkers gee

wat arm mense in die dorpe ook het en kan kry.

Mr M OZINSKY: What about the rich [Inaudible.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Kom ons kyk 'n bietjie wat het gebeur op 14 April 2004 toe die DA hier in die Wes-Kaap 27% van die stemme gekry het. Juis daai stadium het die NNP 10.8% gekry en die ANC 45% en die storie dat die ANC die Wes-Kaap wil terugvat, hulle het hom nog nooit gehad nie. Hulle kon nog net 45% in die Wes-Kaap kry. Dis die meeste. Hulle het toe met die NNP se 10.8% geregeer [Tussenwerpsels.] Maar weet u wat, hulle het vergeet van die arm mense, agb lid.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: En die regering!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Hulle het onbevoegde vriende in posisies aangestel. Onthou nog vir Ramatlakane wat sy eie Nkandla gebou het. Onthou nog vir Rasool wat hom beskerm het. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Daai een [onduidelik] wat 'ge-fire' was.

Mr M OZINSKY: They fired the head of the department.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Onthou nog [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mr M OZINSKY: He was not appointed by us.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Kom ons onthou nog vir agb lid mnr Ozinsky [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mr M OZINSKY: He is the head of the department appointed [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Kom ons onthou vir agb lid mnr Ozinsky [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Never [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Bly nou stil man!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Agb lid mnr Ozinsky, ek wil vir jou prys. Kom ons onthou agb lid mnr Ozinsky wat [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: I do not want to be praised by you!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky order!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Wat saam met ons gewerk het om [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Om Rasool skuldig te bevind. Kom ons onthou vir agb lid mnr Ozinsky wat saam met ons gewerk het om Rasool hier uit te kry [Tussenwerpsels.] Maar Mnr die Speaker wat gebeur toe, nadat Rasool skuldig bevind is, word hy die ambassadeur in die VSA. Wat gebeur met agb lid mnr Ozinsky wat geveg het vir geregtigheid? Hy word in die duisternis uitgewerp. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit is hoe die ANC met mense werk. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms J WITBOOI: No!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, you know it!

Mr M OZINSKY: That is nonsense; you defended [Interjection.]

'n AGBARE LID: Komaan!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You know it. [Interjection.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ons het [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Jou mense het jou uitgesorteer [Onduidelik.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ons het in 2004 elf mense hier gehad. Ons het daar gesit. Ons het hard gewerk, en weet u wat gebeur toe in 2009? Ons kry toe 51% van die stemme, maar weet u wat, die ANC se stemme daal van 45% na 31%.

'n AGBARE LID: Dis nog te veel.

The PREMIER: Shame!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: As ek dit vooruitskat op wat op die 7de Mei gaan gebeur, dan gaan u net 17.8% van die stemme kry; 17.8.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ja, ek skat ook dit. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: En die DA gaan 65% kry.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Dis reg.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Maar Mnr die Speaker toe gebeur daar nog iets in 2009. Die Zuma-ramp tref Suid-Afrika. Elektrisiteit se pryse styg die hoogte in. Medupi kragstasie word nie klaar gebou nie. Dit sal die kragstasie in die geskiedenis wees waaraan daar die langste gebou is, terwyl ons 'n krag-

nood het [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms M TINGWE: [Inaudible.] thank you.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Zuma spandeer meer as R 200 miljoen op sy eie huis. Die Guptas maak 'n skande van Suid-Afrika om hier te kom land, en 'n bespotting, en so kan ek aanhou. [Tussenwerpsels.] Die President kan nie die arbeidsektor bestuur nie, en onbekwame polisiëring veroorsaak 'n ramp by Marikana en dit is nie ...(tussenbeide)

Me J WITBOOI: Vertel ons van die soen! [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: En dit is nie iets om oor te lag nie. Kom ek gesels met u.

Me J WITBOOI: Vertel van die soen, daai soen wat [Onduidelik.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Te veel stres [Tussenwerpsels.]

Me J WITBOOI: Vertel ons!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Te veel stres maak die liggaam siek en daarom is my agb vriend hier bang u kry 'n hartaanval. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, Hon member Ms Witbooi, order.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker hoe lank kan 'n mens se liggaam dit hanteer as jy jou permanent moet skaam vir jou leier? Wie van u is bereid om vandag hier op te staan [Tussenwerpsels.]

Me J WITBOOI: Ons kry nie skaam nie.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: En as u 'n toespraak kan maak en sê “Ek is trots op Jacob Zuma. Ek is trots op die aksies van Jacob Zuma.” [Tussenwerpsels.] Ek daag u [Tussenwerpsel.] Ek daag u. Doen dit in u toespraak. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Hulle kyk nie eers op nie!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker mense in ander provinsies vra: “Hoekom kan ons nie ook goeie paaie hê nie? Hoekom word skole nie by ons gebou nie? Hoekom is ons hospitale nie in orde nie?” [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Where is this now?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ek wil vandag vir die Premier vra, sit vir ons 'n groot ‘billboard’ op, Premier, by die N7 daar by Vanrhynsdorp, by die N1 daar by Drie Susters en by die N2 daar anderkant Plettenbergbaai en sê daarop: “Welcome in the Western Cape. See the difference. Welcome in the Western Cape.” [Interjections.]

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Where is the [Inaudible.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Maar Premier, op die agterkant van die ‘billboard’ moet staan, as die mense terugry dan moet hulle lees: “It can happen in your province as well.”

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It can happen in your province as well.” [Interjections.] Premier, dit is die boodskap wat ons wil uitstuur. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I rest my case.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Kom ons praat bietjie oor grondeise, wat u sal graag wil hoor. As daar daardie 380 000 uitstaande grondeise, mense wat nog nie kon eis nie, ek kry daardie mense jammer. Hulle verdien ernstig aandag en die vraag is na 20 jaar, hoekom kon daardie mense nie eis nie? Het die regering hulle nie in kennis gestel nie of het hulle eise net bloot [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Are you scared they claim on your farm?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Het hulle net bloot weggeraak in die proses

[Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Are you scared to lose your farm?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Of het hulle hoop verloor met die ANC regering [Tussenwerpsels.] En daar waar die eise afgehandel is, daar sien ek murasies wat skree ten hemele want daar is nie ondersteuning vir daardie mense nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: Ozinsky has got a problem.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: As ons nie goeie bestuur het nie [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: I never had a problem with [Inaudible.]

Ms J WITBOOI: No.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: As jy 'n myn sou vat en jy bestuur hom nie goed nie [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dan het jy net 'n gat in die grond. [Tussenwerpsels.] Mnr die Speaker ons moet vir mense wat nog nie 'n kans

gehad het om te kan eis nie die geleentheid gee om 'n wettige eis te kan indien, maar hoekom dit nou 'n verkiesingsfoefie moet wees, dit verstaan ek nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ons moet tog seker maak dat daar 'n geordende struktuur in plek is wat hierdie heropening kan bestuur vir 'n beperkte periode en dan moet dit ook vinnig afgehandel word dat hierdie onsekerheid nie permanent daar is nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Dit is waar [Onduidelik.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ek wil praat oor die drie P's in Landbou, en dit is Tina Joemat-Pettersson, Pieter Mulder en Nosey Pieterse. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Vriende, die Noordwes Provinsie kry R46 miljoen vir ramphulp. Hulle kry dit nie uitgedeel nie, want 'n kontrakteur moet aangestel word en hy moet 30% van die geld kry, maar hy het nie die vermoë om dit uit te deel nie. Pieter Mulder kom van daardie gebied, maar hy is doodstil. Hy help hulle nie. Wat doen ons van die Wes-Kaap? Soos goeie bure vra ons vir die landbouers “skenk asseblief voer vir die noorde.” Ons reël 'n trein met Transnet en daardie voer is besig vandag om gelaai te word en dit sal Maandag in die noorde aankom. [Applous.]

Baie dankie aan Transnet, baie dankie aan Amoré Bekker van RSG wat almal in hierdie proses gehelp het, maar kom ons kom terug na Pieter en Tina toe.

[Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What a couple!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: 'n Onwettige tender van R800 miljoen word toegeken aan Sekunjalo. Die OB vind dit is onreëlmatig. Ek weet nie of dit dalk aan een van Tina se vriende toegeken is nie, maar kom ons vra bietjie wat het Pieter gemaak? Het Pieter geweet daarvan? As hy geweet het hoekom het hy stilgebly?

'n AGBARE LID: Dan het hy nie 'n 'job' nie.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: As hy nie geweet het nie wat maak hy in daardie ministerie? Hoe kan jy in 'n ministerie sit en jy weet nie van 'n tender van R 800 miljoen nie? Wat doen Tina nou? Sy probeer die vissers paai tot 26 April tot met die verkiesing. Wat doen Pieter nou? Hy bly doodstil. Hy praat nie oor die vissers nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Vriende, ek wil sluit Mnr die Speaker ...(tussenbeide)

Me J WITBOOI: Drink 'n klein bietjie water.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: 'n Klein bietjie water. Ek wil graag hier

aan die einde so bietjie van my hart met u deel en ek wil graag praat met die lede wat 'n lang pad saam met my kom. Die meerderheid van u, soos ek u ken, het 'n hart vir die mense van Suid-Afrika.

'n AGBARE LID: Dis waar ja.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Veral daardie mense wat opsien na u vir leierskap in die land. Terselfdertyd agb Ellen, weet ek, dat interne spanning 'n mens doodmaak, maar dit maak oor 'n party dood. Ek en die agb lid mnr Uys en die agb lid me Witbooi was in so 'n party wat deur interne spanning doodgemaak is, en ek is bekommerd. Dit is hoekom ek - ek sien dit ook in u. [Tussenwerpsels.] Maar die vraag is, Mnr die Speaker, hoe lank gaan my vriende hier - die gematigdes - wat ek glo wat die meerderheid in die ANC is, hoe lank gaan hulle nog die situasie verduur?

'n AGBARE LID: Nie lank nie.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Hoe lank gaan hulle nog stilbly? Hoe lank gaan hulle liggame nog bereid wees om hierdie skandes te vat?

Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Nie lank nie.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Hoe lank kan 'n mens aanhou om jou te skaam vir jou leier? [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Vriende, hoe lank wil die agb lede nog sien hoe Suid-Afrika agteruitgaan? [Tussenwerpsels.] Mnr die Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker hierdie gematigdes hier weet dat die gematigdes in Suid-Afrika hoort bymekaar, dat ons dieselfde visie [Tussenwerpsels.]

Me J WITBOOI: Ag my hene!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dat ons dieselfde visie en dieselfde droom het.

Die SPEAKER: Agb Minister Van Rensburg, u tyd is om.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ons kinders verwag dit van ons. Dis tyd dat ons opstaan. Have the guts [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Minister Van Rensburg.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie.

'n AGBARE LID: Uitstekend! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! [Interjections.] Order! Over to you hon member Mr Figlan.

†UMnu A FIGLAN: Enkosi Somlomo, ndivumele ukuba ndithi xa imoto ihamba izinja ziyayikhonkotha, [Uphazamisko.]

*Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Allow me to say when a car moves dogs bark at it. [Interjection.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Sorry on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is it hon member Mr Ozinsky?

Mr M OZINSKY: The hon Minister Meyer is holding up placards in the house. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer, just put it down.

Mr M OZINSKY: There the hon Minister Botha is now getting it.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Botha you just put it down; thanks. Over to you honourable.

†UMnu A FIGLAN: Enkosi Somlomo, ndivumele Somlomo ndithi xa imoto ihamba izinja ziyayikhonkotha, kodwa xa imile ziyayintsontsela. [Uphazamisko.] Icacile intoyokuba sihamba ngendlela elungileyo. [Uphazamisko.]

*Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. However when parked, dogs pee against it. [Interjection.] It is clear that we are heading in the right direction. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Order!

Mr A M FIGLAN: The Democratic Alliance vision for South Africa is of an open opportunity society for all, a society in which every person has the right, the space and the capability to be themselves; develop themselves and pursue their own ends as an equal citizen of South Africa.

†The proof is in the pudding. Last year iCity of Cape Town isebenzise imali 56% ye budget yakhe kwindawo yabantu abahluphekileyo.

*The proof is in the pudding last year the City of Cape Town utilised 56% budgeted for the poor.

Ms M TINGWE: For the porta-potty.

†UMnu A FIGLAN: Iphindile kwakhona iCity of Cape Town yazama ukosula izikweliti zabantu iANC yavota ikuchasa oko. [Uphazamisko.]

*Mr A M FIGLAN: Again the City of Cape Town tried to remove debt created by the people but the ANC voted against that. [Interjection.]

In the Western Cape over the past five years the Democratic Alliance has had the opportunity to give practical substance to the vision. In providing a safe community for all, the Western Cape government has embarked on the drastic reduction of fatalities on our roads by the end of 2014. Through the action of Minister Robin Carlisle and the Department of Public Works a major mind shift has indeed taken place amongst the road users in the Western Cape, which has drastically reduced the number of lives lost on our roads. The DA acknowledges the combined efforts that media, traffic, law enforcement, South African police and emergency services has played which helped to formulate and deliver effective road safety messages.

Minister Carlisle has instituted 24/7 a year around enforcement, not just roadblocks during Christmas and Easter. This and other measures have been directly responsible for the dramatic decrease of 30.1% death on our roads despite the increase of traffic. This regular and diligent law enforcement on the roads include creating a road consciousness and awareness among road users; to check on the roadworthiness of the vehicles especially buses and taxis travelling on the provincial roads and the removal of all unroadworthy vehicles, unlicensed vehicles and drivers; the installation of an average speed over distance camera covering a total of 350 kilometres of the provincial most dangerous roads. Now you say we do not care about the people; alcohol

blitz through targeted roadblocks throughout the province, which has been supported by limited alcohol trading hours. These road safety awareness measures have placed personal decision-making back into the hands of the citizen and may then add to calls to be more conscious and abide by the rules of the road.

Mr Speaker a noteworthy success of the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements is the provision of service sites which are supported by the necessary infrastructure. Service sites have given families the opportunity to build their own homes. The high cost of rectification necessitated a professional task team. Badly built houses cost the province ± R43 million which could have been used to build more houses.

The [inaudible] professional resource task team were implemented to ensure quality houses to our people most in need thereof. These professionals include engineers and town planners who assist municipalities who do not have appropriate qualified personnel in creating an executive standardised housing project. This team has been instrumental in the early detection and alienation of infrastructure challenges; fast-tracking projects and securing the general addition and timeous delivery of housing projects.

While acknowledging present constraints in meeting housing targets it should be noted that the biggest contributing factor is the deliberate dragging of the feet and reluctance of the national government to transfer land suitable for housing to the Western Cape. That is another “caring of the poor”. The living

conditions particularly in the Western Cape are being addressed through alternative building technology projects. The technology used will ensure that homes stay cooler in summer and warmer in winter, thereby reducing energy costs and limiting dampness.

Another process by which the department is addressing seasonal conditions such as wet winters and fire-hazard prone summers is reblocking. Reblocking is based on the special reconfiguration of homes in informal settlements whereby the houses are rearranged and reconstructed to minimise open space in the specific settlement. With the latest figure of 4 015 shacks destroyed by fire last year, doing reblocking is now of paramount importance. Other benefits of reblocking are the reorganisation of space to allow for roads and bulk service; rebuilding of housing which leads to retardant resistance and fire protection; the elimination of flooding and the prevention of grey water, and a sense of pride amongst the community and the lifting of their morals. As one community leader stated: “We are not building homes; we are building people...”

Through reblocking also the promised tap- and flush toilets per informal houses has taken a quantum leap forward and has become a reachable reality. On behalf of all the citizens of the Western Cape and especially those without means to provide for themselves, the Democratic Alliance would like to thank the present government for all they have accomplished over the past five years to make Western Cape the best run provincial province in South Africa. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Figlan.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor, mooi!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Haskin over to you.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you very much Mr Speaker. The ACDP's consistent approach is to acknowledge and congratulate government on their successes achieved as highlighted in the Premier's State of the Province Address and to highlight ongoing challenges where government should have and must perform better.

The reality is that this government has indeed performed better than the ANC government, but two factors provide the context for these achievements. Firstly the ANC government set a very low bar in their period in governance in this province. It was possible for any government to have achieved better, in the ACDP's view, than the ANC did in their term of office here. But secondly an important point raised, and that is that the Western Cape generally and the City in particular benefited from generations of preferential infrastructure development and government investment pre-1994, ensuring that we will always have a head-start on other provinces. Nobody ever mentions this.

Whilst the ACDP is pleased that the DA-led government listed its successes, we are disheartened that many of the growing social, safety and economic challenges still facing our people were simply ignored or glossed over.

If you walk in or drive through many rural towns, the Cape flats and the areas of Khayelitsha, Langa, Gugulethu and surrounds, the realities evident in these communities confirm that the majority of our poor and struggling households continue to struggle for years on and 20 years into our democracy. For too many their opportunities have not improved.

Their struggle as evidenced in numerous research reports, studies and government documents, confirm that their struggle is against rampant gangsterism, sexual violence and drug- and alcohol-related crimes that are tearing the very fabric of our communities and families apart. Growing poverty, unemployment and inequality in the Western Cape; limited sporadic or no access to basic services for thousands of families; the City that is fast becoming the most unaffordable City to live in, in South Africa; a government that tells communities rather than asks communities; where public participation is more like a tick-box exercise, rather than an authentic exercise in the further development of a social partnership compact with communities. This is not a “good story for all” as the Premier tells us to believe, proving the point that our province remains a deeply divided province, with the divisions worsening year by year.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, tell her, tell her. [Interjections.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: But this is not all the DA's fault. This is not all the DA's fault. The Premier correctly cites examples of how national government is interfering and blocking the Western Cape government [Interjections.] Even the AG has agreed with these assertions.

Mr M SKWATSHA: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha, order.

Mr G C R HASKIN: The ACDP agrees that the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry was blocked by the ANC in every possible way with great expense to the public purse and at the expense of improving safety and security for Khayelitsha residents and beyond [interjection] for the ANC's purely narrow, political aims. SAPS responsiveness to challenges raised by communities, the Standing Committee and this DA government are ignored routinely by SAPS. SAPS relations with communities, the MEC and departments remain fraught with problems, primarily, but not solely initiated by SAPS themselves at national and even provincial level, who appear unwilling; who appear willing to drag their feet to confuse and frustrate at the expense of improving safety and security for our people.

The ACDP agrees with the DA that the division of revenue allocations to the Western Cape clearly continue to fall short of our population growth

statistics and forecasts, severely impacting on the ability of government to provide services to our people. Yet the ACDP agrees with the ANC that the DA should not by implication therefore blame those thousands who are migrating to the Western Cape from other provinces. It is not their fault. They ought to be engaged as these people who are moving to the Western Cape ought to be engaged as partners [Interjection.]

Ms M TINGWE: They should be present all the time [Inaudible.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: And not dismissed as expensive refugees or whatever one wants to call them [Interjections.] Yet, the ACDP believes a constructive partnership-approach by the DA government in its inter-governmental relations and work with the ANC national government departments, would have produced far more positive results than has been achieved, as opposed to the adversarial critical approach the DA seem to have adopted as default.

Whilst many criticisms against the ANC are valid, not all criticisms are. How is it that the DA criticises the ANC in relation to the temporary nature of the job opportunities they have created and projected nationally [Interjection.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Tell them, tell them, yes!

Mr G C R HASKIN: Yet trumpet their own temporary job-opportunity successes [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, they are putting down now.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Which are based on the national framework and the model. The true measure of a government having delivered on its promise of a corruption-free efficient public sector is not limited to the levels of foreign direct investment, but must include a balanced assessment of the audited financial statements from the AG and the challenges contained therein. While trumpeting the DA's successes in human settlements and criticising the ANC for inflating their own performance in the annual report of 2008/2009, the reality is that the audit outcomes of the housing development fund under the DA have regressed in the last year and this would have been the case in the previous year too, had the department not chosen to submit their report late, just to secure a more impressive audit outcome. [Interjections.]

This boils therefore down to the same thing: government fiddling reports and processes to improve the story of their own delivery successes and failures. As Chair of Scopa, I am asking the Premier to send that FIU report to us so that we can deal with it.

Another concerning audit outcome was that of Cape Nature that also regressed to a qualified audit opinion with findings. Our experience with them last year was that they were cagey and found it difficult to answer basic questions about what they were doing to address the concerns in Cape Nature.

[Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Yes [Interjections.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Further aggravating this problem was that the challenges and shortcomings raised in the draft report of the State of the Environment-report that was released last year, warned of serious environmental challenges facing the Western Cape. Each person in the Western Cape generates more greenhouse gases than the average South African and more than the individuals in Brazil, India and China. The Western Cape province generates 8.4 tons of greenhouse gas per person, on par with developed European nations [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Haskin [Interjection.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: That we in the Western Cape use more energy than the rest of the country to produce the same contributions.

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Haskin, thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Was that six minutes?

The SPEAKER: Yes, that was six minutes. [Interjections.] Order! Hon Minister Fritz, over to you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you Mr Speaker. Before I come to my written speech, I feel so incredibly offended by the narrative [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh my goodness!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That emerge on this side of the House, that I need to make three points before I go to my written speech. [Interjections.] The one Mr Speaker, Mr Deputy Speaker, is how we have - we are now even in the ANC's side. We do not talk about the poor any more. We are now talking about the African poor. We are now even racialising the poor [interjections] and the honourable leader ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: No!

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The hon leader of the house of the opposition, hon Ms Lynne Brown, who I have a lot of respect for, raises the issue, and it honestly offended me Mr Speaker. [Interjection.]

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: She raises the issue that

people from Heideveld and Hanover Park - and I happen to come from Hanover Park. I grew up in Hanover Park [Interjections.] - will admit that the conditions in the apartheid years were better than the conditions in Langa and Nyanga. [Interjections.]

Now let me say to the hon leader of the opposition [interjections] that I went to school which was known as a 'plankie skool' in other words a school made of planks, a pre-fabricated school with one tap, the hon leader of the opposition; one tap, and during - and I remember - during intervals hon Mr Deputy Speaker we queued [Interjections.] And when it is about your time [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: When it is about your turn [Interjection.] Order, is there a question?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, I want to ask you a question.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No I have not got time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is not prepared.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No time, I have got no time. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat.

Ms L BROWN: [Inaudible.] This is the point.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: When it was your turn to drink a little bit of water the bell would ring and you would be chased back by your prefects and the honourable leader of the opposition has the audacity to say that our oppression was not as bad as the oppression of everyone else, in fact I happen to go to Langa High, and I went to E D McKenzie High on a number of occasions as early as 74 and I tell you the schools were far better than ours, so please do not give degrees of oppression. Oppression is oppression. It is evil and it is evil. [Interjections.]

And the sad point Mr Deputy Speaker is that the nationalist has become the ANC now. They are the ones who are now classifying everything. [Interjections.] They are now the nationalists and the beautiful point [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: That is not [inaudible] the communist became the DA.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The beautiful point the hon member makes, the beautiful point the hon member of the opposition makes and she makes an incredibly beautiful point, hon Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Look behind you.
Be careful.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Please continue.

Ms L BROWN: That is rubbish!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And she makes the most beautiful point when she says, and I wrote here, the reason why the majority - oh sorry. She says we all - and I say we all agree with the honourable leader of the opposition that we need to build a sustainable province for all the people of this province to live in [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Yes, and a nice one.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And a sustainable one where you can - if you are from Brooklyn and your skin happens to be more white, but you are poor, you must also be included in the society, and if you are a young boy in Mitchells Plain who because you just happen to be a little shady, now you do not know what shades of [Interjections.] You know, that you will be accepted at a college or a university to study [interjections] and this is unfortunately where we have gone back to. We have gone back to racialisation of the poor in this country [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: What is the point?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And I need to say to the honourable Ms Brown, you know one of the interesting points about the electorate. [Interjection.] They are not stupid. It is that reason [Interjection.]

Ms L BROWN: That we know.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is that reason why the so called coloured people in the Western Cape have never since 1994 voted for the ANC [Interjections.] And it is that reason Mr Deputy Speaker why they have got 301 votes in Strandfontein recently, which amounted to less than 5% [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: And in Saldanha.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And the DA got 80.4% and they will say that [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And they will say that, and this, they will not say that. They will not say that, but honourable [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: When the lies stop, when your lies stop.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker let us go to the story and to the narrative and I like the word [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no story.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I like the word “narrative” far more better than most people are saying.

Ms L BROWN: Far better!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And one of the issues that the Premier responded to the other day in the State of the Province Address was with you know the story where you start lying and you are lying and you think the lie becomes the truth, and this is the problem they are trying to do. They have nothing else so they try and tell a lie and a lie and the truth [Interjection.] And one of the lies they are all the time telling hon Mr Deputy Speaker is that the NGOs are not funded properly in this province. Now here we have [Interjections.] Here I have before me the Financial and Fiscal Commission’s report and their submission for divisions of revenue 2014/2015 [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Exactly! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It found that the Western Cape Department of Social Development spent the biggest portion of its budget, 68%, on transfer payments to NGOs.

An HON MEMBER: Yo! Wow! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Now the hon members [Interjections.] The hon members who do not know anything, they do not know what transfer payments are. Those are contracts with NGOs [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! Order! Order! I think - Order! hon opposition leader Ms Brown. The noise level in the House is too high. Please bring it down and hon Minister Carlisle, hon Minister Carlisle your interjections are too frequently. [Interjections.] Please continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The ANC even goes further, the Auditor General says the department also ensures exceptional value for money and that is the point noted by the AG, by the Auditor General, you know you always try and point the AG to us, and so hon Mr Deputy Speaker who is benefiting from this, and we are not saying the black or the white or the so called coloured poor. We are saying “the poor” - period! We are sick and tired of classifying and racialising the poor. [Interjections.]

Hon Mr Deputy Speaker let us go on and let us talk about young people. Last month it was an honour, a very, very big honour for me to launch the country's first Youth Café in Rocklands, Mitchells Plain, while you know and while the Café encompasses aspects of an ordinary café, it is far more than that. It deals with innovation. It deals with young people's thinking and hon Mr Deputy Speaker what young people are also able to do is very, very importantly access a meal, but then also it goes far beyond just to go looking for a job or job seeking. It is far more than that. It is saying to young people "You can actually conceptualise your own creativity through your creativity, your own job and become a great, great entrepreneur that will take you out of poverty and you will continue to go for education." And what is interesting about the young people coming to us, we have been completely overwhelmed by the response of that, where we initially catered for 50 young people per day there are 150 accessing our services and a whole lot of young people are now saying they want to go and finish their matric, and so, speaking about the matric result it is so interesting how the ANC always talk about numbers and how they say: "Oh you are fourth". The hon member Ms Beerwinkel said: "You are now fourth", and no-one says [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker no-one asked what kind of fourth are we. No-one asked what is the quality of those passes. [Interjections.] No-one asked when you go with me, and they must go with me to University and see young people stand there with a great pass, with a Bachelor's pass, but they are not accepted at the university [Interjections.] And this is the problem that they are not able to do, and this is the problem why the hon members on this side

of the house, that is why they all the time, you know, getting like that [Interjections.] Because we have to get on your side of the house, hon member Mr Skwatsha. [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Do not go [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker the hon members on this side are talking about “yes, we started the three hospitals.” Yes, they did, and the problem with the ANC - they must really just acknowledge this - is they will start everything but they can never finish it. Go to Kimberley now.

An HON MEMBER: Hooray!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: There is still a hospital. There is a hospital that is not finished. [Interjections.] They started the prison and the original money for a prison in Kimberley was R 100 million. It is now R 150 million. They cannot finish projects and this makes this government different to most of the national cohorts. [Inaudible.] And I think those are some of the issues that we need to say. They talk about and they did it, you know, hon Mr Speaker they talk about the issue around drugs and the abuse of drugs and gangsterism and one of the reasons why it is continuing to flourish, you know, in Eldorado Park we saw it, in Gauteng, how President Zuma sent in the army, how he sent in forces to go deal with the gangs. Of course, this is the Cape flats. Of course we do not care about the poor of the

Cape flats. Of course they can murmur and shoot each other here in the Cape flats because they do not care as a national government. No wonder they punish the poor for not voting for them, and therefore it is now springing up in Khayelitsha. Our gang problem is getting out of hand in Khayelitsha now. We just saw the murder of a boy the other day in Crossroads. [Interjections.]

And so our record speaks, Mr Speaker, Mr Deputy Speaker, to an increased access and facility and expenditure of fighting the scourge of drugs. The honourable leader of the opposition Ms Brown also spoke about the safety of children. This is the only province where 100 000 children are in ECDs and we do not fund ECDs in Sea Point and in the richer areas. All our funding goes to the poor, but we do not distinguish whether you are white or black or so-called coloured. You will be funded if you are poor and that is what the honourable - I do not know, the honourable [inaudible] why he is in the communist party, and his class is committed, some class to the side, because he has forgotten about class; no more colour. If you are poor, you are poor. [Interjections.]

Hon Mr Deputy Speaker I want to talk about the very interesting project specifically in the Eerste River area where we have piloted the outpatient [interjection] where we have piloted an outpatient project.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister please continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Where we have piloted the

outpatient project for children at Eerste River and in Mitchells Plain and I want to say our project is running phenomenally well with specifically targeting early interventions, but also targeting the whole issue and the whole point about drug and alcohol abuse.

Mr Deputy Speaker, persons with disabilities are also high on the list of priorities for this province. On the 18th of March I am hosting a round table engagement in Mitchells Plain bringing together individuals and organisations operating in the disability sector across Mitchells Plain. [Interjections.] And you know what is interesting, what is very interesting hon Mr Speaker, the ANC has forgotten the disabled people. They have forgotten the disabled people, like they forgot everything else.

Mr M SKWATSHA: No, no, no.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And I can vouch for that. I work with the disabled people. I see it all the time.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to go on, hon Mr Speaker and Mr Deputy Speaker, our programme on children and families do significant work around the importance of strengthening families. We continue to roll out our parenting programme also focusing extensively on the role of men and particular fathers and I think how some of our fathers here in

the house are taking their responsibility seriously [Interjections.] And I hope that we are really moving forward and taking that seriously. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Another very interesting point and my counterpart in the ANC always accuse me of this but I want to make this point very quickly. According to the media reports the World Health Organisation recently raised concerns about food and the food crisis in South Africa, not so much about the shortage of food, but the fact that people do not necessarily know where and how to access this [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Fritz, your time has almost expired. Just finish off.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] I see the hon Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, thank you. Recently I asked the National Minister of Police and the Provincial Commissioner of Police to reappoint thousands of reservists to SAPS. Station commanders told me they want the reservists to be reappointed immediately.

Police visibility is a major problem in manning of our violent-stricken and gangster-stricken communities. It was a big mistake to let go of so many thousands of reservists. It affects police visibility a great deal and we see the effect of that wrong decision every day. Our message is clear Mr Speaker, appoint them right now. It is well established that the Western Cape government has only an oversight role and no operational control over SAPS.

In the State of the Province Address on Friday Premier Helen Zille discussed the environment in this province where numerous attempts of the Western Cape government to increase the safety of our communities are blocked by the national government. It is a relief that the Community Safety Act enacted last year will allow us to carry on with our duties in a defined way and which will give effect to the principles of accountability, transparency and partnership. The Community Safety Act was signed into law by the Premier of the Western Cape on 4 April 2013. [Interjections.] Funding has been made available to the Department of Community Safety for the implementation of the Community Safety Act over the MTF period. [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I would like to repeat what the Premier said on Friday. In October 2013 the Constitutional Court confirmed the powers of provinces to conduct oversight over the police through the judgment delivered by the Deputy Chief Justice [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, I am trying to listen to Hon Minister Plato. Lower your voice.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Oh sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I was talking about this list.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And unanimously adopted by all 11 Constitutional Court judges. This was after the High Court had already given this provincial government the green light to carry out its oversight responsibilities, where the two courts have now confirmed that the Western Cape government is moving in the right direction when it comes to policing oversight. Unfortunately the national government's attempt to prevent us from carrying out our Constitutional oversight duties resulted in lengthy delays and cost to this government which could have been avoided.

Section 33 of the Act states that the Act comes into operation on a date fixed by the Premier, by proclamation in the Provincial Gazette, allowing for a progressive approach to the implementation of the Act. [Interjection.] We want to get it right and that is why we have chosen to implement the Act progressively and not all at once. We want to allocate resources effectively and efficiently. [Interjection.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: So you say.

Ms M TINGWE: No, he is not.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: On 18 October 2013 Sections 1 to 25, and Section 28 and 33 of the Act came into operation. We constantly refer to a “whole of society approach” towards increasing safety and we have honoured this commitment in the Act. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker the Community Safety Act provides for the establishment of the Provincial Safety Advisory Council to, amongst others, make recommendations to the provincial Minister of Community Safety with regards to regulations [Inaudible] [Interjection] in terms of Section 33 of the Act. We believe that this Advisory Council will prove to be a most diverse body in order to assess the safety challenges of this province and provide guidance on the best solutions to these challenges.

Another first for South Africa will be the establishment of a police ombudsman which will operate independently of the SAPS as envisaged in the Act. The organisational structures and budgets are in place for the establishment of the office of the Western Cape Police Ombudsman. This will be in place by August 2014. The ombudsman will provide for an independent and impartial police complaint system and give a voice to those people who have been affected by poor policing and those who ultimately want to see a better, more effective and more efficient police service. The

ombudsman will go a long way towards helping the police to provide a better service. The other elements of the Act, such as the neighbourhood watch accreditation, strengthening of community policing forum structures and the broad implementation of the “whole of society” concept by means of formal partnerships will be fully implemented during the 2014/2015 financial year.

As the Premier mentioned, much has already been achieved through the expanded partnership with CPFs across the province with the vast majority already participating. We have already seen the benefits of the partnership with civil society and will continue to strengthen these partnerships. On Friday the Premier mentioned one of these partnerships that our Act aims to strengthen. She said the Department of Community Safety has been pioneering the youth and religion safety initiative over the past few years that allows religious and faith based organisations, through funding from the department, to run their own youth safety programmes in their communities over the school holiday period.

To build on what she said, I wish to share with you that just yesterday I met with a large number of religious and faith based organisations who were participants in the recent festive season project. We announced that, based on the success, this partnership will continue with another round of projects being implemented over the Easter holiday period. Mr Deputy Speaker, the youth and religion safety partnership project started at the end of 2012 and has continued from one successful holiday period to another. We have provided almost R2,5 million in financial assistance to 96 organisations,

working to develop youth social crime intervention initiatives on a local level and in areas affected by gang violence and high levels of crime in the Western Cape. Close to 20 000 youth have already benefited from this programme. Some of the areas in which the project was rolled out include: Khayelitsha, Worcester, West Bank, Elsies River, Mitchells Plain, Woodstock, Delft, Nyanga, Lavender Hill, Langa, Gugulethu, Manenberg, Bonteheuwel, Kensington, Kewtown, Heideveld, Hanover Park, Grassy Park, Leeu-Gamka, Lotus River, Malmesbury, Philippi, Samora Machel, Oudtshoorn and Knysna.

Over the past two years the partnership that my department has created with Northlink College has also seen hundreds of youth, many of whom are youth at risk or youth gangsters, enrolled to study towards a higher education qualification. For every youth at risk whom we can get off the street and into a classroom, there will be one less youth vulnerable to anti-social behaviour, to gangsterism and also to criminal behaviour. We have seen the positive results and will continue to engage with communities in need to make the Western Cape a safer place for everyone. We are focusing on the promotion of professional policing through effective oversight. The department has also increased its capacity to assist especially poor communities with effective safety promotion programmes. This is most evident when comparing the budget allocated to these activities, which was about R41 million in the 2010/2011 financial year against the amount of R80 million allocated for the 2014/2015 financial year.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we believe that the Community Safety Act will go a long way towards providing clarity on the role of a provincial government when it comes to safety and an even longer way towards increasing the safety of our communities across the province. I would like to close off today by making it clear that the Premier has the full support of the Department of Community Safety in making this province a safer place for all to live, to work, to play and the relax in. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. Your time has expired. I see the hon mem Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me start by concluding that the hon Minister Fritz is a victim of brainwashing by the new liberality cause. His narrow understanding of nationalism is killing him actually. I am a nationalist.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We know.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am a progressive nationalist. Everybody this side is fighting for a national struggle. Therefore, our understanding of nationalism in South Africa is not dealing from a class context.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Therefore, to us race and class are interrelated

phenomena. We will liberate this country through those two interrelated phenomena, Sir.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You forgot about the poor.

Ms L BROWN: Class, class [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, as a revolutionary organisation the ANC's objective is to consolidate and advance the national democratic revolution through transforming society from white managed interest to the interest of the majority. The policies of the ANC will therefore always be biased towards the poor.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They are marginalised.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Over the past 20 years remarkable advancement and achievements have been made in increasing access to services such as water, sanitation and electricity. In this year's State of the Nation Address, President Jacob Zuma reported that national government has begun an intensive programme to eliminate the bucket system. That is a national problem.

The president was correct when he said that we have a good story to tell. About 3 million free housing units and more than 855 000 serviced sites ...
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... were delivered since 1994 benefiting more than 16 million people. Nearly 500 informal settlements have been replaced with quality housing and basic services ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... over the past five years with around 850 000 free houses ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... having been built.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Hon Minister Carlisle, please you are going to get a speaking turn very soon and I have said before your strong voice and the frequency of using it makes for a very lethal combination in the House, so please tone it down and give the hon mem Mr Magaxa an opportunity to speak.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As an historically advantaged province, the Western Cape can no longer remain an outpost of racial segregation. This province should be setting the pace.

No matter how much Premier Helen Zille wants to spin and waste taxpayers' money with her fairy tale manufactured audits, the facts tell you that the ANC had a much better housing delivery record than the racist and classist administration of Helen Zille.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Do you want a calculator?

Mr K E MAGAXA: The ANC built a total of 75 000 units when we governed the Western Cape whilst the DA has built less than 60 000 and continues to annually fail in reaching housing delivery targets. It is not a story. It is fact [Interjections.]. Since I arrived here you never met a single target you have set. The ANC built more houses with far less of a budget than that of Zille's administration.

Mr M G E WILEY: The honourable Member.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA-led City of Cape Town has even admitted that it lacks a clear housing delivery policy and plan. Perhaps this is why the city prefers spending R7,2 million on the cosmetics of designing a logo [Interjections.] as opposed to investing this in human settlements. [Interjections.]

Helen Zille is so embarrassed with the failure of her incompetent MEC Madikizela that she resorts to bragging ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just take your seat. Is that a question?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. The hon mem Mr Magaxa constantly refers to the hon Premier as “Zille”. [Interjections.] She is an honourable member of this House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I will ... Please continue but take heed of that. It is the Premier of the province.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Okay. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Honourable Helen Zille is so embarrassed with the failure of her incompetent MEC Madikizela that she resorts to bragging about 119 674 housing ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Just take your seat. Hon Minister Carlisle?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The honourable member now refers to the honourable Madikizela as “Madikizela”. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I did not hear ... [Interjections.] Order! Order. Minister Carlisle, I did not hear the last part. He was referring to him as what?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He referred to him as “Madikizela” not honourable Madikizela. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Okay. The point is honourable Madikizela ... [Interjections.] Order please. Order! Order. The point is we are honourable members and please refer to members as such.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Characteristic of the DA’s Hollywood spin, Zille, Helen Zille, hon Helen Zille [Applause.] seeks to give the public the impression that the DA is delivering. Not only does she fail to tell us that only 59 764 houses were built, but she refuses to tell the people of the Western Cape that the ANC delivered 157 255 decent and dignified housing opportunities when we governed of which 75 000 were actual houses [Interjection.] not just opportunities. [Interjections.]

Not only was her instruction to the FIU to do an audit of the 2008/2009 annual report produced by the then department of Local Government and Housing a gross abuse of state resources [Interjection.] to score cheap party political points, but her assertion that the ANC did not build as many houses as the annual report claimed is a direct attack on the integrity of her own officials such as the then HOD J P Daniels and former acting HOD Roy Ragubar.

She labels the report as an ANC thumb-suck. Is honourable Zille saying that officials of the Human Settlements Department lied?

The PREMIER: Many officials were forced to ... [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: In yet another common attack on a Chapter 9 institution honourable Zille also cast aspersions on the office of the Auditor General who signed off on the annual report. Is the Premier claiming that the AG was biased towards the ANC? She also questions the ability of her own DA MPLs [Interjection.] to pick up inaccuracies and so-called lies in annual reports. She is extremely disingenuous to only cite the 2008/2009 annual report to try and falsely claim ANC housing delivery failures when she knows that we governed from 2004 onwards, not just that one.

An HON MEMBER : Hear, hear!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Clearly, honourable Zille cannot afford to see MEC Madikizela being exposed for the failure that she is. [Interjection.] She knows that she cannot rely on the support ... [Interjections.] - he can be a she man. [Laughter.] - of the other Africans in the DA who have been made – I am a non sexist - aware of her racist and patronising approach.

Instead of speeding up housing delivery for the poor and eradicating informal settlements, honourable Zille and her PAC land advisor, Patricia De Lille, make excuses and show their failures by pleading to President Zuma for the

land of Wingfield and Youngsfield. This smacks of dishonesty and political grandstanding at the expense of the poor.

According to research presented by Professor Keith Gottschalk, the Graaf Family Trust rents Wingfield to the SA Air Force and strictly stipulates that it is for military use only. Read the report, Madam.

Instead of crying for national government owned land, honourable Zille must tell this House what has happened to the huge tracts of prime land worth R500 million that she demanded from the then Minister of Human Settlements, Tokyo Sexwale in 2009, which land Sexwale transferred. Honourable Zille cannot cry about needing national government to sign off on the release of land when she and her PAC land advisor are not making use of land which is in their hands.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: In fact, the Premier must provide us with a full audit of land at their disposal which is not in need of national sign off.

Those of our people reduced to the squalor of porta potties in the townships and families who were forcefully removed during the Group Areas Act would like to know what has happened to the vacant tracts of prime land in Constantia.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is shameful that low-cost houses are not being built on Rondebosch Common. Young people from disadvantaged backgrounds who have entered the job market would like to know why GAP housing is yet to be earmarked for the Mowbray Golf course. They want to be nearer their work places. The Ndabeni people would like to know what has happened to the Oude Molen land. [Interjection.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, while honourable Helen Zille pays lip service to a policy of integrated human settlements, the DA refuses to build houses for the poor on available land in the shadows of Table Mountain. Clearly she and her racist party are opposed to integrated human settlements.

True to her white liberal mindset, honourable Zille is comfortable with racial segregation. This is the same honourable Helen Zille who calls our people refugees and who fought against learners from other areas enrolling at Grove Primary where she served on the school governing body.

Honourable Zille and the DA are hell-bent on protecting white privilege. This is why honourable Carlisle once led an anti-poor march by rich whites against the ANC provincial government when vacant land in the leafy suburbs was going to be made available for housing.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You are insane.

Crazy. [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Hon Minister Carlisle. That is unparliamentary. Please withdraw that.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Can I just ask ... I said he was insane and his brain is gone? Which one must I withdraw?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Both of them. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I withdraw that he is insane and that his brain has gone away and I apologise unconditionally.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is these undignified living conditions borne out of honourable Zille's refusal to pursue a proper integrated human settlements policy that leads to the social distance that feeds into crime in our communities. The non-delivery of service and improvements for the people of Khayelitsha contributes to crime according to the Khayelitsha Police Commission.

It is because our people are fed up with the uncaring honourable Zille that thousands will descend on this Legislature on Thursday. I hope that the Premier will afford the masses and their brave leadership the dignity that

they deserve by accepting their petition and then meaningfully engaging with them.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Just finish off, your time has expired. Last sentence.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is anti-poor that the Premier labels those fighting for the poor as the poo-brigade. [Interjections.] It is undemocratic for the ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Magaxa. Your time ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: DA-led City of Cape Town to call for the expulsion of a councillor who has been leading ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... a peoples' struggle.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The hon mem Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. There is nothing like a little bit of Marxist rhetoric to get the blood boiling. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order hon mem Mr Wiley. Order. Just

take your seat. Is there a point of order?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Raise your point please.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Is it parliamentary for the speaker to wear takkies in the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: For the speaker with a lower case or caps? [Interjections.] For the speaker there? No. It is a point of order which we will not entertain now. That point of order will not be entertained. I am not going to rule on clothing at the moment. Please continue. That is a frivolous point of order. Please continue hon mem Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I hope I get some penalty time for that. The Premier's State of the Province Speech last week wherein she clearly tabulated the extensive achievements of her government over the last four years was an illustration of an administration that is focused, structured, policy driven and sensitive to the needs of the broader populace.

A host of surveys, both independent and government, throughout the period has shown that the Western Cape is well governed by international standards, delivers to the vast majority of its citizens and is acutely aware of the

challenges and shortcomings that need to be addressed. Constant adjustments to budgets and strategies show flexible management of a civil service that is professionally led. In the words of the previous speaker, they set the pace.

The governing party of the Western Cape province, the Democratic Alliance, is in fact an opposition party in the broader South African political context. In this way one can accurately get a unique insight into what a DA administration may look like in other provinces and even the national government when it gets that opportunity, a prospect that is becoming even more likely by the day. But how does the Opposition in the province fare against the DA especially if it were to become government in the Western Cape?

To all intents and purposes this only applies to the ANC, the national ruling party and, the only party to have a chance, albeit very small, of challenging the DA for power in this province. And here as providence would have it we have ample evidence of how the ANC would govern the Western Cape. Just last week, the Auditor General delivered its report to the Public Accounts Committee for the topic of consultants employed by the Western Cape Departments of Health, Transport and Public Works during the period 2003 – 2011. The results were horrific.

During the period 2003 to 2009 when the ANC governed this province, some R8 billion was spent in this category by those departments. The findings of the AG relating to these costs were damning. Poor or no planning; absence

of strategies; lack of capacity to manage contracts; lack of monitoring and evaluation; money simply disappeared and could not be accounted for; contracts were simply extended with nothing to show for the previous periods; contract terms were loose and years taken to get them signed; no accountability.

The ANC wants these same individuals to run this province again. That is what Freud said is a sign of insanity - trying to do the same thing again with a different result. The ANC always claims that the Western Cape has the most advanced infrastructure and therefore the DA cannot claim credit for anything but when they were in control they almost drove the government in the province into the ground. Hulle het agteruit geboer.

All six of the areas concerned, relating to the consultant usage identified by the AG, were addressed by the DA administration within a few years and agreed systems were put into place. The numerous qualified and adverse reports were soon replaced by unqualified reports and clean audits. Clean government was restored, disaster was averted, service delivery to the poor soared. But there were other areas of comparison that the Premier lifted out that stressed the divide between the ability of the two major parties to understand and reinforce democracy, namely policing.

Again an anomaly exists. Policing is a national function and provinces must oversee this activity. Provinces are dependent on SAPS to report in order to hold them to account. It took four years for SAPS to deliver an annual report

to this Parliament, a legal requirement. In the meantime, the crime situation together with the SAPS obligation to combat it became so serious that the Premier appointed, at the request of the residents, the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry. The Police Minister fought it tooth and nail and the delay undoubtedly contributed to further deaths and serious crime to those poor residents. So much for a caring ANC government.

Both the inquiry and the annual report showed unequivocally what we all suspected: crime is on the rise, police resources, especially at station level, are stretched to the limit and all indications are that the Western Cape has been deliberately marginalised as far as resources are concerned. Close to 60% of all the 2 400 SAPS vacancies in the country are found in the Western Cape. The public order police, despite a sharp increase in politically inspired riots are half of what they were and only some four urban police stations were built in 20 years despite a dramatic increase in the population. A 30% increase in the last ten years. How has the ANC responded to these alarming facts and their hard won discoveries? Annelize van Wyk, Portfolio Chair for Police in the National Assembly, instead of celebrating these efforts to extend oversight over the executive and to bring attention to the ongoing plight of the millions of citizens being destroyed by crime, has objected to the DA initiatives every step of the way, from the Community Safety Act, to the inquiry, to the annual report process. She cannot tolerate that the provinces have constitutional responsibilities and they have extensive powers to show up the ANC's inability to hold its office bearers to account. If they did, then they would have to replace many of those individuals. But instead,

they are putting more and more questionable characters into positions of authority and trust. Witness McBride who, his terrorist background aside, does not have a single achievement behind his name to warrant [Interjection.] becoming the head of probably the most sensitive of posts, namely IPID, the body that must investigate police crime.

In Ms van Wyk's article, a full page was devoted to a personal attack, she says I refuse to criticise the Metro Police. Well, the reason is simple. When I request the Metro Police to report to this Legislature, they do so extensively, transparently and with full account unlike IPID, which reports to a National Police Minister, a situation we opposed fiercely from this province, and which is largely dysfunctional. The CIVOC – City's Civilian Oversight – is merciless on aberrant police behaviour, is transparent and deals swiftly with cases placed before it. The City reports in depth with an analysis of every aspect of their policing: crime stats, absenteeism of members, promotions, vehicle stats, duty hours and so on. With SAPS we have to use alternative mechanisms to get information, as people like Ms van Wyk feel we are not entitled to this information. The City Police have demonstrated time and again that despite its small size it is flexible, has created units specifically catering for crime categories like gangs, drugs and ferrous metals. SAPS are neither flexible, nor transparent in this regard and delegates officers on a part-time basis to a massive and pervasive crime deluge originating from gangsters.

How can an officer do justice to two sensitive jobs under these

circumstances? When Ms van Wyk so ardently defends the police in a selective one eyed fashion, the way she does, she does a gross injustice to every victim of crime who would have been better protected had the police at station level been resourced in a way which would have been according to SAPS own minimum standards level. How does she explain when the National Commissioner stated in this Chamber that the public can expect four vehicles with two officers in each vehicle on duty in a two sector station every shift and yet that same station can only muster a single vehicle time and again? How does she explain this to the queues of ordinary people waiting in service centres for service because the station manpower is totally out of sync with the surrounding population density and is already 20% under strength?

According to SAPS's own figures the worst crime affected stations have the lowest police to population ratios. I wish to read to you a quick statement.

“To highlight the causes of the recent increase in crime in the Western Cape; foreign influx and economic refugees.”

And that was not the Premier who said that. That came from Nathi Mthethwa, Minister of Police, when he released the annual crime statistics last year.

Hon MEMBERS: Woah!

Mr M G E WILEY: Why do you not address the dysfunction that is the duty

shift system that entrenches poor service delivery, a housing policy that guarantees the lower ranks will only stay in poor areas? Ms van Wyk staunchly defends the plethora of exorbitantly expensive elite units whose primary task appears to accompany VIPs and ANC big-wigs. Although they are categorised as visible policing, giving the impression that they are part of the local station strength, the reality is that they are of little help at station level because they are not integrated into the system and some recent examples seriously question their ability to deal with local crime scenes. Do these units and others we do not know about, account for the 600% increase in the police budget, while the National Commissioner boasted that local stations received only a 60% budget increase over the same period? Is there any surprise that the 2013 South African Survey indicates that private security guards are being recruited at a rate of six times that of the South African Police Service. Ms van Wyk, as an ANC member, which is the governing party, which party is becoming a threat ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY : ... to national security in this democracy ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Thank you. Hon Minister of Human Settlements, Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Premier in her 2014 State of the Province Address

stated:

“Our government has resolved to align everything we do to our overriding objective of combating poverty and promotion opportunities for all through policies that encourage sustained economic growth; that attract, develop and retain skills and capital; and that drive infrastructure development.”

Building integrated and sustainable human settlements in our province is critical to building social cohesion and eradicating poverty, which is why 93% of the human settlements budget is spent on housing programmes aimed at people earning less than R3 500 per month. She also stated, Mr Deputy Speaker, that since 2009 we have delivered 119 674 housing opportunities over 16 programmes and created 37 130 jobs using the services of around 147 broad based black economic empowerment companies.

Now, let me then come, Mr Deputy Speaker, to the lies that are spread by the ANC in terms of the delivery and tell you the real story of the ANC's delivery. [Interjections.] When we took over this province in 2009 there were 46 blocked projects and even though these projects were blocked and nothing was happening they were part of the figures that were counted by the ANC as their achievement.

An HON MEMBER: Aah!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now these 46 projects comprised about 15 000 houses in total. Now let me tell you some of the reasons why these projects were blocked, and by the way, because the ANC was in power no portfolio of evidence was required. Money was spent on these projects and therefore they were also counted as achievements. These are some of the reasons why these projects were blocked: some houses overlapped erf boundaries, some houses were badly built, were unsafe or were built on unsafe material and some due to maladministration.

As I said, these 46 projects comprised 15 000 units. We, as the Department of Human Settlements, spent money to unblock these projects which meant we spent money again that had already been spent and wasted by the ANC. We spent more than R200 million unblocking these projects. That simply means we had to spend another subsidy amount on each and every one of these houses, which were by the way counted by the ANC as an achievement. Now that is the real story of their achievement.[Interjection.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, there is another challenge that we found is also a lie that has been perpetuated by the ANC as their delivery. We found that many of the recipients of government houses prior to 2009 had effectively been left disempowered without title deeds to their houses. [Interjection.] Now title deeds give beneficiaries true dignity, security of tenure and economic empowerment as land owners, as well as the ability to partake in the property market which is one of the very important elements of delivering houses. It is not just about shelter but it is also to ensure that people become property

holders.

In 2011 we commissioned an Arcus Gibb study to assess the extent of the problem and we found that across the Western Cape 86 350 people or 36% of the people had no title deeds. Let me tell you why these people had no title deeds. Because the ANC was so obsessed with chasing numbers they disregarded some very important planning processes, because they wanted to be seen delivering. [Interjections.] The reasons why these people will never have the prospect of owning a house is because the challenges I am talking about still exist.

Mr M OZINSKY: You are really on the defensive hey?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The first of the reasons for the backlog is unopened township registers - which is one of the requirements before you build a house. The second reason is unsigned sale agreements. Thirdly, the general plan not approved is a clear indication that the ANC did not care about these things; the ownership legalities, the rezoning issues and general administrative challenges. These people, Mr Deputy Speaker, will never have a prospect of owning a house legally because these very important planning processes were overlooked by the government of the ANC which claims to have delivered for these people.

Mr Deputy Speaker, along with the legacy of tens of thousands of unissued title deeds we also faced the legacy of shoddy workmanship. In fact, if the

ANC managed to build two million houses nationally I would be very surprised. The figure of three million that they are talking about is a fictitious figure and I will tell you why I am saying that, Mr Deputy Speaker. According to a report presented to the National Department of Human Settlements by the Department of Human Settlements to the Portfolio Committee in 2012, the government had an estimated rectification bill of almost R60 billion [Interjections.], which is more than the arms deal, to fix the houses that the ANC claimed to have built across the country. With R60 billion you can actually build the entire backlog of houses in the Western Cape. This is the extent of the problem that we are talking about. That is why I am saying I am very surprised by the three million figure they are talking about, and would be if they have even reached two million.[Interjections.]

In the Western Cape alone, since 2009, we have spent almost R43 million to rectify houses that were built by this government.

Mr M OZINSKY: So what happened to the ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Today we are making sure that all houses built are guaranteed against structural defects for five years by the National Home Builders Registration Council, ensuring that people inherit houses that will last and that they can pass on to their children. Our strategic approach to human settlement delivery is in line with the National Outcome 8 for human settlements especially with our focus to ensure that

everyone in the Western Cape living in informal settlements, backyards and overcrowded families has access to basic services by 2014.

To ensure this right we committed to develop a province wide plan for in-situ upgrading when this administration took over government in 2009. An informal settlements database was compiled in 2010 and completed in 2011 and the Access to Basic Services Programme, which is a province wide plan for in-situ upgrading, was launched in 2012. That is why despite the challenges that we are facing in this province when it comes to sanitation, this province is the best performing province, according to the Census; when it comes to households with access to piped water, which is standing at 99.1%; with households with access to ablution facilities or toilet facilities standing at 96.9%.

This is a clear indication that despite the challenges that we face, as a result of the growing population in the province, as Census 2011 pointed out, we continue to do better than any other ANC controlled province when it comes to services that we deliver here. This is the real story about the ANC delivery when they claim that they have delivered three million houses, when they claim again that they have delivered more than the DA did in this province. The reality of the situation is this that during the ANC administration, and which is part of the reason why we had this problem, is that there was no requirement from the AG to verify the delivery that the ANC is talking about, which means most of these figures were thumb-sucked and were put on the annual report and we were told that it was delivery.

Mr M OZINSKY: Should it not be taken against the official ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Actually, Mr Deputy Speaker, this was also confirmed by the officials, not only in the province but in all the municipalities. The fact that there was no requirement from the AG to provide evidence led to a situation where people were asked to produce figures that were not credible.

Mr M OZINSKY: I asked [Inaudible.]. He said nothing.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I do want to make this point very clear, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we have noticed a trend by the ANC people, and this is something that is happening now, where they are disregarding the democratic right of a number of people in a number of events that we attend to deliver services. We have noticed over the last few weeks that when we, as government, go to people to deliver a service, we get confronted by a number of ANC people, wearing ANC T-shirts, led by some of the leaders to disrupt those events. [Interjections.] It is a clear indication of the bankruptcy when it comes to leadership from this side. I do want to make this point that part of the reasons that were stated here on Friday by the Premier where she disputed the figures that are produced by the ANC, is we have evidence, loads of evidence based on the studies that we had done by independent companies, that can prove the lies that the ANC is spreading, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon mem Mr Ozinsky?

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I listened attentively to the honourable Premier's speech hoping to hear something new, some new meaning which indicates that its leader has created an a new approach to save the DA from the political crisis it finds itself in. Instead of going into the elections confidently she is on the back foot. Long gone is the hope of 30% of the national vote. Now she is wondering whether she can even get the 18% she got last time.

An HON MEMBER: 16%

Mr M OZINSKY: Sorry 16%

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You must get your facts right.

Mr M OZINSKY: Instead of some way forward all we got was quotes from her previous speeches, a kind of concise, selected speech. This reflects the failure of her strategy to make the DA what it is not. Mamphela Ramphele has shown decisively that there is no credible African leader with a record in the liberation struggle who will feel at home in the DA [Interjections.] who would be prepared or is able to lead the DA. Not even the Premier's best friend, her ideological clone, her kitchen table confidante was prepared to

join the DA. If Mamphela refused, who would? If the honourable Premier's central hope in the last five years has been that the DA would be some kind of example of DA rule for the rest of country one wonders why Mamphela Ramphela rejected this example. The real reason is that the example has come at the cost of the country and the constitution because the DA and the Premier believe that maintaining white power in one part of the country, the Western Cape, is more important than developing South Africa as a whole. This is the real reason the Premier is not leading her party in the national assembly and why she needs to use the honourable Mazibuko as cannon fodder, black cannon fodder against the ANC heavy hitters. [Interjections.]

The honourable Mazibuko can take the hits but she is not good enough to be a presidential candidate and we wonder why.

Hon MEMBERS: Why?

Mr M OZINSKY: If the A team is not in the national assembly, the A team must be sitting here and this is the A team that exposes the DA, one female out of eleven in the cabinet. One African out of eleven in the cabinet. Three coloureds out of eleven in the cabinet. Six white men out of eleven in the cabinet. That is the real DA - A team.

An HON MEMBER: Ag come on. Nonsense.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M OZINSKY: The failure of the DA project to use the Western Cape as an example and to attract black voters is clearly shown by their record of delivery in the province. This is ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: How many leaders are there in the ANC?

Mr M OZINSKY: This is the province with the most governmental resources in the country. The DA found the province with the most skilled civil servants in the country. You found the province with the best provision of services in the country already there. This is what you found but you claim it as your creation. The Census data shows that the service delivery is at higher levels in the province but it has been so for a very long period of time. Long before the DA was in government significant gains were achieved in the years when the NP and the ANC were dominant. That is 1994 to 2009. [Interjection.] In fact the question we should be asking is whether the province has performed to the best of its abilities given the significant advantages that it has inherited. A look at Census data shows that delivery achievements in other provinces have been much more dramatic than in the Western Cape.

Mr M G E WILEY: From the lowest possible base.

Mr M OZINSKY: I fear to raise this issue lest the honourable Premier again misuse the FIU for her narrow party political processes but let us look at

some of the statistics. When it comes to housing in the Western Cape in 1996, 82% of the population already lived in formal houses. This declined to only 80.2% by 2011 when the DA was in power. By comparison, Gauteng, which experienced a 10% greater increase in population than the Western Cape, in the same period, increased access to formal housing from 74.8% to 79.8%. Of course the number of houses built in Gauteng is far higher given that their population is more than double that of the Western Cape.

When it comes to sanitation, which is an important political issue created by the Honourable Premier in this province, despite the propaganda, the Western Cape at 91.6% is not the province with the highest percentage of households with access to flush toilets. Gauteng again holds this distinction with 96.3% of households having flush toilets, followed by the North West at 91.8%. [Interjections.] Western Cape comes third under the DA. When it comes to changes in access to flush toilets over time, all the other provinces beat the Western Cape in the scale of delivery over the last 17 years. This is the result of the huge backlog inherited from apartheid and the amazing delivery of services in ANC ruled provinces since 1994 [Interjections.] For instance in the Eastern Cape in 1996 only 64% of households had access to flush toilets whilst by 2011, 80% had flush toilets – an increase of 25%. In the Free State the figures are even more impressive, rising from 70.5% to 89.9% - an increase of 27.5%. How is it possible that in a city like Cape Town with so many engineers, a clean audit, even a DA government, it is unable to service the main roads of the African areas of the city? Khayelitsha, Philippi, Nyanga etc. Look at Mew Way. Look at Klipfontein Road. Look at

NY108. Why is it then honourable Premier ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Because no-one reports potholes!

Mr M OZINSKY: ... that so many people like the forum of religious leaders for instance are shocked to see and realise this for the first time when they go to those areas because according to your propaganda there is no road with a pothole in Cape Town. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: The potholes are reported [Inaudible.]

Mr M OZINSKY: But the reality is that the whole of Khayelitsha is full of potholes and you do not consider it to be part of Cape Town. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It has been reported twenty times.

Mr M OZINSKY: This is the real story of the DA government. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER. Order. Order! Please continue.

Mr M OZINSKY: This is the DA who claim to be fighting corruption in government but it is them who oversaw and defended the inflated price of the Cape Town stadium. We now know that was a result of the collusion of the construction industry. It is them that oversee and continue to defend the

serious irregularities in the Convention Centre and Founders Garden.

An HON MEMBER: Come on!

Mr M OZINSKY: It is the Premier who instead of fighting corruption paid out Hip Hop Media and appointed one of their Directors, Mr Wickham, to the Provincial Development Partnership. It is the honourable Minister Carlisle who last week in SCOPA defended the appointment and payments to Brand Talk, a company he has previously accused of corruption. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Oh my word. What!

Mr M OZINSKY: This directly contradicts what he said in the 2011 State of the Province Address in the House where he said that the appointment of Brand Talk was irregular. Last week in SCOPA he defended that appointment.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: He did not do that.

Mr M OZINSKY: He did! You sat there next to the department. You said there were no irregularities.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You are misleading [Inaudible.]

Mr M OZINSKY: I am not misleading and on a point of order ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order

Mr M OZINSKY: ... can that member say I am misleading? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Order! To say that someone is misleading the House is not unparliamentary.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, you know that if he thinks I am misleading the House he needs to bring a motion to the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is correct but he can say that across the floor. It is not unparliamentary. Please continue.

Mr M OZINSKY: Well then it is just a nonsense comment. We sat in SCOPA for hours and hours listening to honourable Minister Carlisle defending the appointment of Brand Talk. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: And it is shown by the actions of the government because

no serious action has been taken [Interjections.] against any official besides giving them warning letters. If the corruption was so bad why did the hon Minister Carlisle not do anything about it?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Why are you not coming back?

Mr M OZINSKY: When they talk about the previous corruption ...

An HON MEMBER. It has nothing to do with [Inaudible.]

Mr M OZINSKY: They talk about corruption in the previous government but directly under the Premier's watch, her department and honourable Minister Carlisle's department has cleared all that corruption. We will never forget how in the past term they have covered up corruption in Swellendam. They are continuing to do so in Oudtshoorn where one of their Councillors, Nel, has committed fraud [Interjections.] by forcing the DA caucus to write off his legal debt running into millions to the Council.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: [Inaudible.] ANC debt.

Mr M OZINSKY: No. It is the DA caucus that wrote off the debt.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH : It is not millions. You must [Inaudible.]

Mr M OZINSKY: The same thing occurred with Gerhard Ras a DA member

in Matzikama which has been neatly swept under the carpet. Gerhard Ras owes R2 million to the Matzikama Municipality [Interjections.] also for his debt and in a fraudulent manner they reached an agreement to drop the case and to make sure it did not reach a judge. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER. Order.

Mr M OZINSKY: This is the same government which instead of admitting that Speaker Esau was corrupt and racist in his position meekly redeployed him to the National Assembly where he still serves.

This is the government which claims to believe in openness but chose to keep the report on learner transport secret after 14 children died in a bus accident while in their care. It was the DA ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon mem Mr Ozinsky. Your time has expired but I will allow one sentence. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY. Can I finish my last sentence? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish off.

Mr M OZINSKY: This is the government which fights to the death against development in white areas but is prepared to develop a wet land at Princess Vlei ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired.

Mr M OZINSKY: ... because it is a black area. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before I ask the honourable Minister Carlisle to speak can I just clarify the remark when you say somebody is misleading the House. If Minister Botha had added that he was misleading the House and he knew it or you are aware of it then there is intent involved and it is unparliamentary but to simply remark he is misleading the House is not unparliamentary per se. Minister Carlisle.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On 26 August 2008, the Premier, who was then the honourable Lynne Brown, the MEC for Transport and Public Works who is the leader of the ANC in this province, the Director General, Head of Department for Transport and Public Works, Head of Treasury and the Minister of Finance who was a chap called Strachan. They got together and they resolved ... okay. Listen. Noted that as regards to public transport, which is only one of six of the branches in my department, over the last three years, [Interjection.] over the last three years has spent around ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Skwatsha? Order. Order. Is that a point of order?

Mr M SKWATSHA: When the hon member Lynne Brown was Premier, the honourable Fransman was not ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a question? Order.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Mr Skwatsha you cannot get up and make a point just like that. You must either ask a question or make a point of order. Please continue. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We can deal with the transfer date but he was actually at the meeting. [Interjections.][Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue now.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The department over the last three years has spent around R500 million on that area with a further R200 million being planned this year, therefore the committee resolves that Mr Manyati, who was the HOD of that department, prepares a report detailing the following: As from 2005/06 what has all that money been spent on? This is Premier Lynne Brown. It is not us okay? [Interjection.].

Ms L BROWN: It must be ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What did it buy, she asked? What did it buy? On whom was it spent she asked? On whom was it spent? What were the results? I can tell you they were nothing and she knows it. What are the ... [Interjection.] This is your own report. What are the current commitments and contracts and with whom, together with the associated time scales? That is the ANC talking about the ANC.

Now what we have seen this afternoon, Mr Deputy Speaker, is an exhibition of loyalty which I find almost profound from the hon mem Mr Ozinsky ... [Interjection.] ... for whom I have regard for because this ANC government inherited even before us all the green and wonderful pastures of the Western Cape. The wonderful officials and all the things that have been spent before under apartheid, but what happened when they inherited it? They inherited it. They were 45% the electorate and growing, and growing fast. Within three years I moved a motion here that Premier Rasool had misled the House immediately supported by the hon mem Mr Ozinsky and supported by many of the front row. Not him ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: And Skwatsha. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... but many of the front row for which they will walk the plank. And that is what happened to the ANC. I have high regard for the people here who had the guts to stand up

against corruption in their own ranks and to take on the hierarchy that was corrupt [Interjections.] and they are all paying the price for it.

Mr M OZINSKY: Why did you not take action?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They are all paying the price for it ...

Mr M OZINSKY: You had the power.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They all paid the price for it. The hon mem Mr Ozinsky will go into the wilderness. Those two good folks there are going to the national parliament. I do not know what is happening to the hon mem Ms Magwaza okay. I hope that she will make it back, It would be good ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: She is going ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... to have someone of integrity in the ANC ranks here as a new leadership is emerging, a new leadership of struggle heroes. Not like the hon mem Mr Ozinsky, not like the hon mem Mr Skwatsha, not like hon Minister Grant. [Interjection.] Struggle heroes like ... The new leader who is going to be in here was the man who famously said "I never heard of Mandela until he was released from jail" [Laughter]. That is who is going to lead the ANC in this House

[Interjection.]. Avery supported by another struggled hero the hon mem Mr Uys [Interjections.][Laughter.]

This is the new ANC [Interjections.] I will tell you something Mr Deputy Speaker, in 1994 I happily left politics, left it in the hands of the ANC with regard to what they have done and achieved for my country. But that ANC does not exist anymore and it will be finally finished off in this House by the very person that the then Premier was talking about. Where she sits today he will sit in two month's time and that is not the ANC I believe in. It is not the ANC that this front row believes in ...

An HON MEMBER. No, no, no, no. That side!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... except for that honourable member there, Sir. [Interjections.] Let me reassure the hon mem Mr Ozinsky. Let me say this. I said I have regard ...

Mr M OZINSKY: How many people have you fired?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Hundreds, thousands, [Interjection.] millions, you should look back, you should look back in my ... [Interjection.] You should look back in my capitalist record, you would be shocked! [Laughter.] But, Mr Deputy Speaker, I have regard for him and if I had been involved in corruption or anyone here had been involved in corruption, he would have found us out ...

Mr M OZINSKY: We have.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Just like I found
[Interjection.] them out. Just like I found them out.

Ms L BROWN: And it was party [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I want to say to
the hon member Ms Brown for whom she knows very well I have regard, for
the hon mem Mr Skwatsha ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Just give it to your friends [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is lovely
[Interjection.] It is lovely ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Can you quieten
down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon Minister Winde and hon mem
Mr Ozinsky.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Why are you so worked up Ozinsky?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Okay. Relax!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon mem Mr Ozinsky.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I am worried about honourable Max. Can I say this?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I want to say to these people for whom I have regard that it is lovely to be in a party where people do not steal.

An HON MEMBER: What? Are you sure?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It really is.
[Interjections.] It is lovely to be in a government where people do not steal
[Interjection.] It is lovely, okay? [Interjections.]

Now, there is nothing irregular about the Cape Town Convention Centre, the Founder's Garden, [Interjections.] He need not worry about that.
[Interjections.] Okay. We hear all about the poor. The ANC and the poor

and I share my colleagues' thing. I think it is offensive the way the poor are used. [Interjection.] There is only one proper business for a political party with regard to the poor and that is to make them rich. There is no other business for them.

An HON MEMBER: And you are failing.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No other business for them. You make them poor and let us talk about how you make them poor. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Look at the Census.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Since the ANC came to power, electricity has gone up by 340% [Interjections.] Since the ANC came to power, fuel has gone up by 221% [Interjections.] and who does that affect?

Hon MEMBERS: The poor.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Not to talk of E-tolls and a few other things, but let us talk also about employment. The hon Minister Winde and I were a bit stunned when the hon member Ms Brown, leader of the opposition, noted with great regret that unemployment had slipped from 24.9 to 23.9.

Ms L BROWN: I did not!

An HON MEMBER: Yes you did.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:, That is exactly what she did.

An HON MEMBER: We hope it slips for ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We want it to slip more and more and get smaller and smaller but I thought I would share with her the latest statistics on job growth. We will all be delighted to know that in the last quarter of last year that 141,000 jobs were created. We have been going down so it is nice that we seem to have turned a bit of a corner. 98 000 of those 141,000 were created here in the Western Cape.

Ms L BROWN: By whom?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They were created here.

Ms L BROWN: By whom?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: In the last quarter, [Interjections.] It does not matter by whom. By small businesses, big businesses but ... [Interjections.] I do not understand this you see ... [Interjections.] 70% [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, of all jobs created in the last quarter, were created here [Interjections.]. If I can say...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... If I can say to the hon mem Mr Haskin [Interjections.] You are wrong. You are wrong.

An HON MEMBER: About what?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The greatest differentiation between rich and poor is not in this province. It is the smallest and it is shrinking. [Interjections.] So let us get a few facts into position here. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: It depends on where you live hon Minister Carlisle. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ag come on!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We live in the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Both the leader of the opposition and the hon mem Mr Ozinsky gave reasons. It is interesting they say but you are not better, the Premier's story is not true ...

Ms L BROWN: Because I said the same story she said.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Ja. Ja but you had an unfair advantage so the story must be true.

Mr M OZINSKY: No.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: If it is a fairy tale why do you have to explain it to us how we achieved the fairy tale?
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is not listening well.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I listen very well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Carlisle just one second. Order. There is too much dialogue going on at the moment. I want to listen to the main speaker and if there are interjections fine but do not react on everything. Please continue.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: So the story is actually true and what both speakers forgot to mention was that we did inherit a massive advantage, huge. It was nothing to do with, well it was to do with us, but I mean it was a huge advantage. We inherited an administration where over R500 million a year was being stolen so that gave us an immediate [Interjections.] that gave us an immediate advantage of R500 million a year [Interjections.] and that is why, Mr Speaker, I have been able to increase the spending on education alone, educational infrastructure by three times. But let me come to the hon mem Mr Magaxa across from here [Interjection.] and the first thing I want to tell you ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The first thing I want to tell him ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The first thing I want to tell him is that forget about your vanguard revolution. The ANC have missed the bus. [Interjection.] Did you see what happened on the East Rand when you had, what 8 000 people at your specially paid concert etc. Next door is the real revolutionary with 50 000 and even us, in Polokwane of all places draw three times more than the ANC. [Interjections.] So I want to say this ... [Interjections.] I want to say this ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... Order, order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Hon mem
Mr Skwatsha, the first four minutes of your speech you spoke for all of us ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Carlisle your time is almost expired.
Please one sentence.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: My last sentence.
The honourable President Zuma said the ANC will rule until the second
coming of Christ. We had better prepare ourselves. It is coming soon.
[Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Its true!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] Order, order. That
concludes the debate on the Premier's State of the Province address. The
honourable Premier will reply to the debate on Thursday 27 February at
14:15. The House is adjourned. [Interjection.].

The House adjourned at 17:15