
THURSDAY, 28 FEBRUARY 2013

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS – see p

PREMIER’S STATE OF THE PROVINCE ADDRESS

(Debate resumed)

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, thank you for the opportunity. It was clear from the speeches of the opposition parties that they either did not listen to the State of the Province Address or they did not understand it, and I was tempted in my reply today simply to read the State of the Province Address again. However, I don’t wish to subject the hon members of the governing party to that ordeal, so I instead will address myself to the hon members of the opposition in the words spoken to them by one of their own, in fact, the ANC’s Chief Whip in the National Assembly, Dr Matole Motshekga, who had

some very good advice to the ANC caucus in the Western Cape shortly after they lost the 2009 election.

I quote what the hon Motale Motshekga had to say to his ANC caucus here in the legislature. He said:

Our role as the opposition party in the Western Cape Province must be constructive and informed by the multitude of challenges and problems faced by our communities. We must not copy and adopt bad political habits of criticising and opposing for the sake of scoring political points. The ANC is not in a publicity contest with anyone. We have a political programme to implement and we should therefore advance sound and superior arguments for all our criticisms and give credit wherever it is due. As the ruling party, our task is to remain exemplary to all South Africans.

Mr Speaker, the DA has taken that advice to heart but the ANC clearly didn't understand a word their Chief Whip said either.

The hon Leader of the Opposition, Ms Brown, has a new speech-writer, I see, who did a very poor job of plagiarizing Jeremy Cronin's speech in the National Assembly, not even taking account of the fact that in the National Assembly the ANC is in government whereas here they are in opposition. You would think that if anybody is plagiarizing a speech they would simply change that much of it.

However, Mr Speaker, there were some extraordinary and memorable prose, not to mention poetry, in the hon Leader of the Opposition's speech. Listen to this, Mr Speaker: "When the moonshine of word-icing evaporates ..." How's that for a phrase?

An HON MEMBER: Dramatic.

The PREMIER: I sometimes wonder whether the hon Brown proofreads her speeches before she delivers them in the House. She would know as she understands these things, as I do, that moonshine means a highly distilled, illicit, bootlegged liquor, which is clearly either what she or her speech-writer had been imbibing when they delivered the speech. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, she ended up with some patronising advice to me to retire. Well, I would like to advise the hon Brown to come out of retirement, where she has been comfortably ensconced for this entire term. Hon Brown, you've been retired on the job for years. We should feel gratified that you at least pitched up for this debate, where we had a rare sitting of the Leader of the Opposition. Indeed, most of that side of the House is usually missing in action, as the photograph by the hon Minister Ivan Meyer demonstrated. At a farewell session for one of their own hon members, only four members in the ANC benches were there. We should therefore be very honoured that a large number of them actually bothered to pitch up to listen to the State of the Province Address and my reply to it.

The only person who is not missing in action or retired on the job is the hon Ozinsky, and he didn't even get a chance to speak in this debate. The hon Ozinsky shows his colleagues up, and that is the worst sin you can commit in the ANC. If you rise above anything more than mediocre you are on your way out, which is why the hon Ozinsky is on his way out. [Interjections.] I think it is common cause that the performance of the hon members of the opposition in this debate has been pitiful, but fortunately for us they did us a huge favour of leading with their chins.

I've mentioned before the wonderful metaphors in the hon Brown's speech, like "gentrified untruth", "voting cows" and "parasitical understanding". All I can say is, very much to quote the late and unlamented Judge Rudolph Erasmus, "it rolls like duck's water off my back".

We have already had Marius Fransman, who has provided us with wonderful bedtime reading in the DA, because we've already compiled what we call our Marius Fransman dictionary, which is a magnificent work, full of extraordinary, weird and wacky imploding bombs and biased petticoats. Listen to this: Someone was described as a "ticking time bomb ready to implode". Then we had another wonderful one:

The eye of the storm rests pensively quiet, calm and almost tranquil, but it will stay its course and follows its trajectory, leaving in its wake the ravages of time and the milestones of history.

Winston Churchill must be turning in his grave. Then we have, I think in reference to me: “Her petticoat of bias is hanging out.”

Mr Speaker, I’m glad that the hon Brown never wants to be outdone by her archrival, but it was almost impossible to find anything but moonshine in the hon Brown’s speech. [Interjections.] Double H with a dash of O. [Laughter.] Mr Speaker, where she lifted from Jeremy Cronin’s speech she, in fact, distorted the facts and misled the House. Let me quote from the hon Brown’s speech:

According to labour market statistics for the New Growth Path year period during the third quarter of 2010 to 2013 ... –

and I quote directly, whatever that may mean –

... the Western Cape slipped further behind other provinces like Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal and even Limpopo on many vital indicators – especially those pertaining to job and opportunity creation for the youth ... while this premier purports to cut a better deal for the youth – all cheap and obfuscating political postulation.

The truth is that the Western Cape has a far lower youth unemployment rate than any other province, Speaker, far lower. In fact, it is half the unemployment rate of the Eastern Cape, and much lower than Gauteng and the Northern Cape, much lower than KwaZulu-Natal, North West, Mpumalanga, Free State and Limpopo. That is what matters. Where are the youth more likely to get jobs? The answer, Mr Speaker, is the Western Cape. That

is demonstrated by the fact that the difference between the broad definition of “unemployment” and the narrow definition of “unemployment” is the lowest in the Western Cape because young people have not given up on the chance of getting a job here.

The broad definition of “unemployment” is the definition that includes people who have given up looking for work, and in Limpopo, obviously, huge numbers of people have given up looking for work because there is no point in doing so. If it was easy to get work in Limpopo, people wouldn’t be streaming to Gauteng. So the critical measure is the measure of broad unemployment, the people who have given up looking for work. The difference between narrow unemployment rates and broad unemployment rates is particularly important because if there is a very small difference between narrow unemployment and broad unemployment, you know that people haven’t given up looking for work because they know there is a good chance of looking for and getting work.

The point is that in the Western Cape there is a tiny, tiny difference between narrow unemployment and broad unemployment, because people have the best possible chance of any of the provinces of getting a job here. But the ANC only counts narrow unemployment in the other provinces because so many people have simply given up looking for work in those provinces. So please don’t come to this House, hon Brown, with smoke, mirrors and moonshine because you are simply misleading the House. I read the entire report that you quoted and, in fact, there was nothing of what you said in it.

Mr Speaker, the hon Brown also had a lot to say about housing and again we all had moonlight, moonshine, smoke and mirrors, because in fact the hon Brown knows that since the ANC's days in the Administration here the housing subsidy has changed fundamentally. In those days the subsidy was used primarily, if not exclusively, for RDP or BNG houses. That has changed entirely. Those were built top structures.

Now the subsidy is divided between many more interventions. It is divided between the Enhanced Extended Discount Benefit Scheme (EEDBS); it is also divided amongst finance-linked individual subsidies that people can get; it is used for the programme under the National Home Builders Registration Council (NHBRC); it is used for Community Residential Units (CRU) upgrading; it is used for the extension of basic services; and it is used for transfers to municipalities.

The transfers to municipalities have been very substantial under the DA government, whereas the ANC government always tried to disempower municipalities and even kept housing accreditation from the City of Cape Town. The DA provincial government has sought to empower municipalities, ... [Interjections.] ... and transferred a lot of money ... [Interjections.] ... to local authorities – in fact, from R43 million in 2009 when we took office, to R58 million this year.

Nearly 10 000 more people benefitted from free basic services, and we also did an enormous amount to upgrade residential units. What we have done with the money is not only, as under the ANC, built top structures, what we have done is rectify thousands of

top structures that the ANC left in a pitiful situation and condition, but we also have extended the use of that subsidy to many more programmes so that many, many more people can benefit and so that at least people aren't sitting in the mess without any access to water, electricity and sewerage, and at least they have access to basic services.

When we talk about housing, Mr Speaker, we must compare apples with apples and we must compare the whole of the subsidy and what it is used for under the ANC and under the DA, not only one component of the subsidy under the DA with the whole of the subsidy under the ANC. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And they know it.

The PREMIER: They know it.

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.] ... the A-G said. The A-G said ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: But they come here, Mr Speaker, ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Even the A-G says something that's different to you today, Premier?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, they come here and tell what the hon Leader of the Opposition would call “gentrified untruths” – gentrified untruths.

The hon Brown alleges that the DA indulges in ...

Mr M OZINSKY: The A-G told us ...

The PREMIER: ... dalliances with hardened criminals. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky!

The PREMIER: The hon Brown alleges that the DA is involved in dalliances with hardened criminals, like gangsters and druglords. Let me say on this particular issue, hon Leader of the Opposition, that perhaps discretion should be the better part of valour on this issue because perhaps the ANC would like to sweep in front of its own door if it’s throwing stones from its own glass house – to use one of your mixed metaphors – on this particular matter, because in the next couple of months you might be in for a serious shock on precisely that point.

Mr Speaker, let me come to the Acting Head of the Department of Social Development, Robert McDonald.

Mr M OZINSKY: The spin doctor.

The PREMIER: Robert McDonald. The ANC may have youth members of 36-years old, but the DA does not. [Interjections.] In fact, Robert McDonald has never been a member of the DA youth and he has never been a member of the DA, which is frankly quite surprising for someone of his intelligence and integrity, but he has never been a member of the DA or the DA youth. There are very few people I have ever worked with, Mr Speaker, who can hold a candle to the capacity and ability of Robert McDonald.

Let us come to the issue of ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky!

The PREMIER: Let us come, Mr Speaker, to the issue of the alleged purging of black staff. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, order!

The PREMIER: He is not a DA-cadre and never was, hon Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: He was your spokesperson.

The PREMIER: He was my spokesperson recruited on the basis of his professionalism and he is absolutely outstanding. When we recruited him on the basis of a first-class master's degree I had never met him in my life before. He is one of the most outstanding colleagues I have ever worked with. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, order!

The PREMIER: He has what are called transferrable skills, unlike anyone I know in the ANC.

Mr Speaker, the hon Brown accuses the DA of purging black staff, so I went to look up the figures and the statistics. In the past year, 2011-12, 66 permanently employed persons left the provincial government. Of these, 17 were African females and 16 were what under apartheid nomenclature would have been called “coloured” females.

Let me say what the reasons were because I asked to get all the reasons that they had given for leaving. Six out of the 17 African women went for better remuneration elsewhere. None, fortunately, died. None, fortunately, were dismissed for misconduct. None left because of the nature of the work; none went into retirement; but 11 were transferred to other departments, so of them six left for better remuneration and 11 were transferred to other departments usually to a promotion.

In fact, Mr Speaker, 85% of black women left the department for better remuneration – and that is what you call “purging”. It is a disgrace. It is deliberately misleading this House.

Mr M SKWATSHA: And the suspended ones?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The disciplined ones.

The PREMIER: You know, no one has to be fearful in this province if they are doing their work, hon Brown. [Interjections.]

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: That's not what happened.

The PREMIER: No one needs to be fearful in this province, whatever their political affiliation, if they are doing their work. Or is the hon Brown suggesting – and I think that she is, Mr Speaker – that black employees must always be above disciplinary procedures and that only white employees can be disciplined? I say this because I have never once heard the hon Brown speaking up for a white employee undergoing a disciplinary process.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Don't worry, I've even promoted white employees.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Then you're the problem.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I'm not.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Let me get to hon Bevu. I'll wait for her to end her conversation and then I'll reply to the points that she made. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Hon Bevu, I'm trying to reply to the points you made so I'm glad you've finished your conversation with your benchmate. Thank you.

The hon Bevu makes the nonsensical claim ...

Mr H P GEYER: As usual.

Ms T N BEVU: You always say that.

The PREMIER: ... that Cape Town is the most unequal city in South Africa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is.

The PREMIER: Well, I've got news for you. I refer you, hon Bevu, to the United Nations State of World Cities Report - and the United Nations is no friend of the Democratic Alliance, as you would know. The United Nations State of World Cities Report 2010/2011 compares inequality in the different cities of the world. The most unequal city in the world, Mr Speaker, tragically, is in South Africa. However, but it is not Cape Town, it is Johannesburg.

Mnr H P GEYER: Eina!

The PREMIER: That is out of the big cities. Let me tell you when they included South African towns as well, the most unequal in the whole country is East London. [Interjections.] The second most unequal town is Bloemfontein.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Don't go. Don't go.

The PREMIER: Uhamba ngantoni? You see, he's running away. It's called denialism, Mr Speaker, it's called denialism. Hon Skwatsha can't take anymore. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, tragically, so many unequal cities are in South Africa, the most unequal being East London, then Bloemfontein, then Ekurhuleni, then Pietermaritzburg, then Pretoria, ...

Ms T N BEVU: Then Cape Town.

The PREMIER: ... then Port Elizabeth, then Durban, and the least unequal city in South Africa is Cape Town!

Mr H P GEYER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Welcome.

The PREMIER: The least unequal city in South Africa is Cape Town. Vuka ma ulele sisi.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You people are having a great time.

The PREMIER: The truth is that we are still too unequal, Mr Speaker. Of course we are, and the DA works day and night to lessen that inequality, but to come here with this complete “imfungu-mfungu” and say that we are the most unequal city in South Africa is moonshine, smoke and mirrors.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

Mnu M NCEDANA: Somlomo, iNkulumbuso inalo ilungelo lokuthi iLungu lithetha imfungu-mfungu.

SOMLOMO: Awuthuku xa usithi imfungu-mfungu, xa usithi “imfungu-mfungu” kufana nokuthi “irubbish” ngesiNgesi, imfungu-mfungu ayiyonto ithukayo iNkulumbuso inalo ilungelo lokutsho.

Mnu M NCEDANA: Irubbish yintoni?

SOMLOMO: Mhlekazi imfungu-mfungu ayithuki, uba awuqinisekanga sinokuyolijonga elo gama lithetha ukuthini size nalo apha endlwini enkosi.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. In fact, “imfungu-mfungu” was an understatement. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The fact that ... [Inaudible.] ... that’s an understatement. In fact, it’s an overstatement.

The PREMIER: Hon Bevu, who is still talking, Mr Speaker ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Oh, my goodness me. Tell him to put her out.

The PREMIER: It’s better than sleeping, which is what you usually do. [Laughter.]

MsV HANI: That is the best way.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You’re the one who sits and sleeps here.

Mnr P UYS: Ja.

The PREMIER: Hon Bevu contends that 76% of our expenditure on the poor includes salaries in schools and hospitals, but it only includes salaries in our poorer schools and it only includes the salaries of medical staff who serve indigent patients, and that is absolutely appropriate. These are doctors and nurses working in clinics and hospitals that serve the poor.

Hon Magaxa, in his absence, who mentioned that members of the House were beneficiaries of apartheid: Yes, like Pierre Uys, yes, like hon Carol Beerwinkel, yes, like hon Ellen Prins ...

Mr P UYS: Yes, like Helen Zille.

The PREMIER: ... yes, like Joyce Witbooi, yes, like Patrick McKenzie, who were all in the Tricameral System when I was in hiding and hiding people like Tony Yengeni and Umkhonto we Sizwe. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hiding people, that's all.

The PREMIER: That's all. [Interjections.] I did an extraordinary amount of work in the struggle against apartheid. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: You know what, all the apartheid beneficiaries on your side of the House ...

Ms E PRINS: There's no-one ...

The PREMIER: ... like hon Prins with her new hat ...

Ms J WITBOOI: I never, never ...

The PREMIER: ... and various other people kept out the struggle heroes from these benches and they added zero value.

Ms J WITBOOI: She is not telling you the truth.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: At least they were not in the SANDF.

The PREMIER: Then the hon Magaxa accused hon Bonginkosi Madikizela of being a puppet. Now you heard from the brilliant speech that hon Madikizela made here exactly why he couldn't stomach ...

Mr M OZINSKY: The brilliant speaker!

The PREMIER: ... the lies and manipulation of the ANC. [Interjections.] Let's talk about who uses people as puppets, Mr Speaker. Let's look no further than Nkanini and Zwelitsha where the ANC councillor, Andile Lili, is using children as puppets. All of those children have been placed in local – in local, accessible schools – but for his own political ends he uses children as puppets and keeps them from getting an education so that he can manipulate them for political purposes. That is disgraceful, Mr Speaker.

Oh, welcome to hon Skwatsha. Wamkelekile, buti.

Mr Speaker, that is reminiscent of what the ANC did in the Northern Cape.

Ms J WITBOOI: She's losing it big time.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You never had it big time. [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: Wena ulahlekile sisi.

Die MINISTER: Jou heil lê nog by Van Schalkwyk, suster.

Me J WITBOOI: Nee, man, ... [Onhoorbaar.]

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, the actions of the ANC in Nkanini and Zwelitsha in the Western Cape are reminiscent of what the ANC did in the Northern Cape, which was keeping children out of school for six months, because they wanted their mayor to be replaced.

If you want to talk about using children as puppets ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It wasn't the ANC.

The PREMIER: It was the ANC because they were protesting against their mayor whom they wanted to be redeployed. That was an ANC mayor, and just like in Tlokwe, where the ANC didn't like their mayor, just like in the Northern Cape they used the most horrific methods of manipulating children and preventing them from going to school to get their political agenda on the table.

We recall what happened at Umyezo Wama Apile, when ANC activist, John Michels, threatened to use schoolchildren at that school to turn the ward upside down. [Interjections.] He then said they would use that school and the schoolchildren, and immediately after that the school was ransacked, the school hall was vandalised and classrooms were set on fire, while the pupils were desperate to save their books and their notes and while their teachers stared on in disbelief. That is who is using people as puppets and that is what I call manipulation, Mr Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: And ... [Inaudible.] ... in Hout Bay?

The MINISTER: Anyone.

The PREMIER: We've invited you to bring us one single shred of evidence.

An HON MEMBER: Hon Ncedana.

The PREMIER: Yes, we've asked hon Ncedana to do so.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: He can't.

An HON MEMBER: Only because I'm preventing them from being expelled.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes, exactly. That's what they don't understand.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: They do understand.

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, Mr Magaxa also said that we had the highest number of service delivery protests in the Western Cape.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It's not true, not true!

The PREMIER: Well, let me say this to you: I have before me an extract of the Maplecroft Report, Mr Speaker. The Maplecroft Report, which the honourable opposition probably doesn't know about ... [Interjections.] ... is a country risk report produced about countries all over the world. This is a country risk report about South Africa, so this is what people all over the world are reading about South Africa.

This country risk report says:

Evidence indicates that alongside demonstrations about service delivery some Western Cape protests are politically motivated in an attempt to discredit opposition to the ANC. Service delivery protests are most frequent in the Western Cape than anywhere else in the country suggesting that some demonstrations are politically motivated.

These protests followed a threat by the ANC Youth League to make the city ungovernable. This strategy suggests that the frequency of such protests may increase in the run-up to the 2014 election, particularly if close contests emerge

between the ANC and other parties posing greater strategic risks for local government.

So, yes, the ANC's agenda, Mr Speaker, is to make this province ungovernable and, yes, they do that under the guise of service delivery protests – and it isn't only international reports that are saying so.

It's tragic for this province and you'd think that if the ANC in the Western Cape cared about the poor people in the province, they would be desperate to present a different picture to the world so that people would want to invest here and so that we can grow the economy here and create jobs. Not so, Mr Speaker. They don't mind destroying the prospects of the poor for their own political agenda and that is the tragedy of it.
[Interjections.]

The Municipal IQ states – and they are an independent think-tank on municipalities in South Africa:

The major cause of protests in the Western Cape was political tension between the ANC and the province's ruling party, the Democratic Alliance.

There you have it, Mr Speaker, that is the reason and that is the root. I'm not saying there aren't people who have serious problems with their living conditions.

Mr M OZINSKY: Everyone is very happy.

The PREMIER: There certainly are people, and many people, who have serious problems with their living conditions, but the vast majority of them have come to the Western Cape from the ANC-governed provinces, because they have better prospects here.

As I said in my speech, Mr Speaker, between censuses our population grew by 30% and yet we kept up with basic service delivery on the national norms ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Is it?

The PREMIER: Yes, it is, and we've achieved outcomes higher than any other province, especially those that had out-migration ... [Interjections.] ... and not in-migration. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Stick to your own province.

Mr H P GEYER: You wouldn't know.

Mr M OZINSKY: The A-G told us. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister Madikizela and hon Ozinsky!

The PREMIER: I'm coming to the Hon Haskin. Hon Haskin, thank you for your comments at the beginning. I appreciated them very much, but that was where it ended. Hon Haskin mentioned that I didn't analyse corruption, but hon Haskin is Chair of Scopa

and he knows that every quarter he gets a full briefing from our Forensic Investigation Unit (FIU). He knows that the entire backlog of investigations that we inherited from the ANC has been caught up and that no backlog from that period exists anymore.

He knows how much we have strengthened the FIU to fight corruption. He knows that there has been a 110% increase in expenditure on our FIU since we took over. [Interjections.] He knows.

Mr M OZINSKY: Successful cases.

The PREMIER: He knows that we have worked extremely hard at recruiting outstanding individuals so that we can convince every member of staff in the province that they will get caught if they are corrupt, unlike the ANC who had a pitifully weak FIU on purpose so that they could steal this province blind.

An HON MEMBER: On purpose.

The PREMIER: The hon Leader of the Opposition has often asked me, as she did again in the debate, why we make accusations of corruption but no-one ever seems to come to court. That is an extremely good question, Mr Speaker, and I have a list in front of me ...

The PREMIER: ... about all of our cases that we have taken to the police. I'll just quote some of them, because this is pages long. You'll remember the Jewellery City case.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I don't remember anything.

The PREMIER: It goes back as far as 2008 when we lodged a complaint.

Mr M OZINSKY: It had nothing to do with the province.

The PREMIER: It's got everything to do with our allegations of corruption ...

Mr M OZINSKY: This province.

The PREMIER: ... and the depth of corruption in the ANC. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, order!

The PREMIER: I'm coming to this province, because there's a whole thick dossier here.

The SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon Ozinsky, your running commentary is totally unacceptable.

The PREMIER: This was an R8,5 million alleged corruption scam, Mr Speaker, and every time we ask about what's happening to it – the last time being in February 2013 – we are told the Hawks are still busy with the investigation. The Hawks, Mr Speaker, since 2008 are still busy with the investigation. That's why they scrapped the Scorpions and replaced them with the Hawks, because the Scorpions were a little too effective in

these investigations and they were replaced with the Hawks. If you want to see some puppets, let's look at them.

Then there was a case under former Mayor Nomaindia Mfeketo's Office, in which there was alleged corruption of R1 million. When we asked in February how this was progressing – and we ask on a regular basis – we were told the matter keeps on shifting between the SCCU and the DPCI. Advocate Vogel gives instructions to Col van Niekerk and it is done and then it is back with the SCCU just to get further instructions. Talk about delays and obfuscation and moonshine and smoke and mirrors, and there it is.

Mr P UYS: A lot of moonshine.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: And lies.

The PREMIER: Then you've got the brown envelope case – well known to this province.

[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I know you won't forget that.

Mr M OZINSKY: Your department says there was no irregularity.

The PREMIER: We did not say there are no irregularities and we certainly did not say there was no attempt to bribe journalists.

Mr M OZINSKY: That's what they told us.

The PREMIER: This matter is currently, we are told, at the Office of the Director of Public Prosecutions for a decision and we had to read in the newspaper, Mr Speaker, that the Hawks had dropped the case. At a Cabinet meeting, where the Provincial Police Commissioner was reporting, we asked him to explain to us why this case had been dropped and that was the first the Police Commissioner had heard about this, so he's undertaken to find out for us why the case has been dropped.

Mr M OZINSKY: The department says there was no problem, that's why.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: But it doesn't match, Max.

The PREMIER: What we are seeing here is what we've seen in so many other cases and I've got dossiers of them here. I'll just take one example.

In a case involving alleged corruption against two traffic officials that dates from 2004, we kept asking what had happened to this case and you won't be surprised to hear, Mr Speaker, that the matter was withdrawn on 30 May 2012, almost exactly a year ago, because the witnesses were no longer available.

Now you see, Mr Speaker, if you obfuscate and drag things out long enough the witnesses die or go and live somewhere else or can't remember, which is the very best way of getting rid of a case. It is not surprising to me that traffic officials use that kind of

trick, because they have the best example in the world of the State President of South Africa, the hon Jacob Zuma, who's dragged out his case for seven years and I'm sure he's waiting to do precisely the same.

He is making absolutely sure that he never has to stand before a court of law and answer over 700 charges of corruption against which these are actually petty offences. Therefore, if our President doesn't stand up and answer to corruption charges in court, how can we expect lowly traffic officers and other officials to do so? So, as we always say, Mr Speaker, a fish rots from the head.

Mr Speaker, the hon Haskin made the extraordinary statement that we had stagnated in our audit outcomes. Let me show you a table from the Auditor-General. Under the ANC in 2008-09, there were zero percent clean audits – 0%. That is what we inherited here, zero percent clean audits.

Last year, or the year before last, we pushed that up to 23% clean audits and last year it was 42% clean audits as we tried to turn around the mess we inherited. That is hardly stagnation, Mr Speaker, and I hope in the current year we will improve on that, but we have a lot of work to do.

In any event, as the Chair of Scopa, I believe that the hon Haskin should know that the Western Cape Housing Development Fund is not outstanding. The audit has been submitted and it is a clean audit – a 100% clean audit.

Mr M OZINSKY: The 30 September was the date it was supposed to be submitted.

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, it has been submitted and the Development Fund got a clean audit. Hon Ozinsky says it was submitted late and, yes ...

Mr M OZINSKY: It hasn't been submitted.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky.

The PREMIER: ... the Development Fund had an extension. Why did it have an extension?

Mr M OZINSKY: There was never any extension.

The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, order.

The PREMIER: It did, because under the ANC it was so bad that they got a disclaimer – a disclaimer, Mr Speaker – and then when we took over they asked us to move to the Grap system and the Housing department worked so hard ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Premier. There's a point of order.

Mnu M NCEDANA: bendicela ubuza ukuba iNkulumbuso ingawuthatha na umbuzo

The PREMIER: No, I'm not wasting my time on answering his questions. I haven't even got a single question from the speech he made that I can answer, let alone ...

Mr M OZINSKY: Tell the truth about the Housing Board. They did not submit on time.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: The truth, hon Ozinsky ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: That is the truth. You said it.

The PREMIER: ... is that the Auditor-General told them last year they had to move to Grap.

Mr M OZINSKY: That's not what the A-G told Scopa.

The PREMIER: They had to move to Grap. They did move to Grap, which was a monumental undertaking ...

Mr M OZINSKY: That's not what they told Scopa.

The PREMIER: ... and, in fact, in interaction with the Auditor-General they said that if they could finish the Grap transfer they could get a clean audit ...

Mr M OZINSKY: That's not what the A-G told Scopa.

Me J WITBOOI: Mnr die Speaker, kan u nie asseblief reël dat die Premier die Stoel aanspreek nie?

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Sy doen dit; sy sê “Speaker” elke twee minute.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: It’s noted, hon Witbooi. Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: We see the same delaying tactics and obfuscation here, Mr Speaker, because they don’t like the truth. In fact, if there wasn’t an agreement to allow for an extension, why did they get an unqualified and, in fact, totally clean audit?

Mr M OZINSKY: There was no agreement. The Auditor-General would never agree to such a thing. It’s illegal to agree to it.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: He can’t carry on like that.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Throw him out.

The PREMIER: The bottom line, Mr Speaker, ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: There have been other Premiers who came here and said what the A-G said, when the A-G did not [Inaudible]...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: What is wrong with you?

An HON MEMBER: Nothing.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: And what happened to that?

Mr M OZINSKY: Remember.

The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky!

The PREMIER: The Housing Development Fund is not outstanding, because the exact words of hon Haskin was ...

Mr M OZINSKY: When was it taken to ... ?

The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky!

The PREMIER: ... "the Housing Development Fund audit remains outstanding". In fact, they got ...

The SPEAKER: Premier, Order!

The PREMIER: ... an unqualified audit. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Premier! Order, order, order! Hon members on both sides, especially hon Ozinsky, I've requested you to please stop your running commentary, but you carry on. I just want to warn you that I'm not going to accept that from either side. It's too loud. We can't hear the Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, indeed, Mr Speaker. Hon Haskin continued to say that 925 of indicators are not verifiable in the Department of Social Development and then he used substance abuse as an example. Now with respect, Mr Speaker, that was a very poor example because, in fact, all of those indicators were verifiable.

Mr M OZINSKY: It wasn't.

The PREMIER: In fact, there was a verified total of 5 480 clients over one year in 24 treatment centres - there were many more outpatients - and that was almost double what the ANC managed to do in seven centres under their administration.

I'm interested to see that hon Ncedana wants to ask questions here, because he didn't ask a single question or make a single reasonable point in his entire speech, so I can't deal with anything. It was all moonshine.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Moonshine, smoke and mirrors.

The PREMIER: I love “moonshine” and I love “word-icing” and I love “gentrified untruths”. I love all of those fantastic words. We’re starting a Lynne Brown dictionary as well, Mr Speaker.

Now we have the wonderful hon Prins, who really led with her chin. [Interjections.]

‘n AGB LID: Ag, nee.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mnu M NCEDANA: Bendiba Somlomo uthi ukulungele ukuthatha umbuzo ngoku.

The SPEAKER: The Premier indicated that she’s not ready to take any questions. You may continue, hon Premier.

Mr M NCEDANA: But that’s not what she said now.

Ms M TINGWE: Just take one question.

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, hon Ncedana had an opportunity to make points and ask questions in his speech and he entirely failed to use that opportunity.

Hon Prins accused the DA of divide-and-rule tactics, of playing political games, of promoting xenophobia and of not criticising labour brokers. Let me first say that I empathise, and I emphasise that I empathise, very deeply with hardworking people who are struggling to make ends meet, and there are tens of thousands of farmworkers in this position.

It is also a fact, Mr Speaker, that so many farmworkers come from the most fertile land in the subcontinent to the far less fertile land of the Western Cape, because they earn much better in this province. That is the fact even though we all accept that it would be very difficult, if not impossible, for a family to make ends meet on a farmworkers' salary.

I don't say this. Ben Stanwix, who is a highly respected researcher, has done research into farm wages across South Africa and the Western Cape on this table is far above the national norm for both the urban and the rural minimum wage; by far the highest in the country. [Interjections.]

Let me tell you, Mr Speaker, that Mr Stanwix found in his research, that although there was hardly any chance of a national government labour inspector pitching up on any farm— because the national government doesn't do its job - to check whether the minimum wage was being paid, farmers in the Western Cape still paid the minimum wage, and more.

Mr M OZINSKY: So they can afford the new one.

The PREMIER: Well, you see, hon Ozinsky, raises a very important point. He says: Why is there such a move to mechanisation if farmworkers in the Western Cape were already paying above the minimum wage? Why can't they afford to pay the minimum wage?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Moonshine.

The PREMIER: Well, the truth is that when people's packing houses are burnt to the ground, when equipment worth millions of rand are burnt to the ground, when coolrooms worth tens of millions of rand are burnt to the ground – often not by workers at all, but by people from outside stoking unrest – then farmers think again.

An HON MEMBER: The ANC.

The PREMIER: I'll come to that, because there is very clear proof of the number of ANC people who were involved in that process and they will have to take full responsibility for the thousands of people who lose their jobs – the thousands of people who lose their jobs.
[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: That is their strategy ...

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, let me emphasise the point that despite the fact that Western Cape farmers were paying above the minimum wage in both rural and urban areas, they did so even though they knew that there was virtually no chance of being inspected by the Labour department. They did it out of their own free will and because it was right and

because it accorded with the law. I just wish people who know they could get away with rape also did what was right and didn't continue in the way that they do.

Let me speak a little about this tragedy that occurred in our rural areas and talk about the political games that were being played. We've been accused of playing political games, Mr Speaker, but if you look at the statements of every politician, Marius Fransman, Tony Ehrenreich, Tina Joemat-Pettersson, Pat Marran, Nelie Barends – all ANC officials – the only people who didn't appear on the scene to stop violence and to drive a wedge between people were the ANC Ministers who actually could have done something about it.

It deserves to be stressed again, Mr Speaker, that the ANC and Cosatu sets the minimum wages, but where was Minister Oliphant, the Minister of Labour, when all this was breaking out? She was overseas. She spent eight weeks overseas during this particular period. Minister Oliphant was a particular elephant that was definitely not in the room. In fact, she was not even in South Africa. [Laughter.]

The Minister of Defence, Minister Mapisa-Nqakulu, when it was quite clear that the police couldn't cope because they were so thinly stretched, did nothing. Minister Mthethwa did nothing to intervene to help. I wrote to President Zuma twice and three months later I received an acknowledgement of receipt. [Laughter.]

I also wrote to complain to Minister Baloyi about the complete absence of Co-operative Governance in dealing with the farm strike. He wrote back this month – this month, Mr Speaker – and said he was planning a workshop on the subject.

Well, Mr Speaker, I want to talk a little bit about the real story of the farm strike, which has never been told before. I want to tell the real story about the farms strike in the House today. It started on a farm called Keurboschkloof. I've heard a lot about this particular farm because it was owned by a farmer called Pierre Smit, one of the grape and wine farmers in the Hex River Valley.

Pierre Smit, by every account that I've either heard of him or read of him, was a decent farmer. In fact, the very minimum wage on his farm was R90 a day, and then R105 rand a day, and then R110 a day, and then R127 rand a day and an hourly rate of R14,51. That's certainly not a fortune, but it was significantly above the minimum wage set by the ANC.

Then Mr Pierre Smit, who everyone in our South African way called Pierrie Smit, became ill and the farm was taken over by something called the South African Fruit Exporters (Safe). Now Safe is in partnership with a BEE company called Bono. It won't surprise you that Bono, Mr Speaker, was started by an ex-ANC MP called Evans Malokisa Nevondo.

Mnr H P GEYER: Nooit!

An HON MEMBER: Yo!

The PREMIER: Then the minute Safe, an overseas company in partnership with a BEE company, took over Mr Pierre Smit's farm in South Africa, what did they do? The very

first thing they did, Mr Speaker, was to cut wages to a flat rate of R64 a day – below the minimum.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Wow, after they received BEE!

The PREMIER: They took millions for BEE, but the first thing they did was to cut the minimum wage ...

Mr M OZINSKY: Whose BEE? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ... of R99, R105, R110, R127 rand a day under Pierre Smit, a white Afrikaner running Keurboschkloof. The BEE company takes over and cuts wages to a flat rate of R64 a day, which is even below the minimum wage set by the ANC Minister of Labour. [Interjections.]

Mr H Geyer: Skande!

The PREMIER: How do you like that scandal? [Interjections.]

Hulle skaam hulle nie; hulle is heeltemaal skaamteloos.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: They're used to it. [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, order!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.].

The PREMIER: Are they? [Interjections.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Leader of the Opposition.

The PREMIER: I'm not talking about "Bolo". I'm talking about "Bono".

There was, of course, massive unhappiness and one lady who was interviewed said that from an hourly rate of R14,51 her wages were dropped overnight by this BEE consortium to R10,60 an hour. So the workers, understandably, went on strike on 27 August 2012. And who was there stoking up the strike of course? None other than some very well-known ANC activists!

I did a lot of reading about this Bono and about Safe and it was fascinating. Hon Brown spoke about the DA sucking super profits from this country. Rich irony!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You've done it already. It doesn't need to be a ...
[Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Safe was started and is run by one Anton de Vries. Anton de Vries is not a South African De Vries, he hails from Holland. He wrote an article, which I tracked down in Nederlands. Fortunately I did two years of Nederlands at university. It was a

fascinating article, Mr Speaker. It is called “Oogsten in Afrika”, which means “Harvests in Africa”. He says:

In 1997, na die afschaffing van de apartheid vertrok Anton de Vries naar Zuid Afrika om te gaan ondernemen. Samen met zijn zakenpartner richtte hij er fruitexportbedrijf Safe op.

So, he started a fruit export industry. Now listen to who his partner was.

... en dankzij een belang van eweneenz 50% in Bono daarvoor de andere helft in bezit is van het voormalige Zuid-Afrikaanse parlementslid, Evans Malokisa Nevondo, heeft zijn een management contract voor nog een 20 boord bedrijwing bekom.

So Safe came and had six contracts to manage farms and got 20 more through their partnership with Bono, including Keurboschkloof. The first thing they did when they took over was to cut the wages of the workers, sparking the first strike.

Then, and I love this – this guy is boasting about how white foreigners can make a fortune out of BEE in South Africa.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: They must just have the right partners here.

The PREMIER: Exactly.

Ms M TINGWE: No.

The PREMIER: Exactly. He's boasting in this article about how, when you get the right ANC partners in South Africa, you can make a fortune from BEE, primarily by cutting the wages of the workers.

An HON MEMBER: Gee. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Primarily by cutting the wages of the workers! Let me read this to you - the cross heading is "Blanke man" and he says:

Safe-dochter Bono, de in 2008 opgerichte joint venture met oud-politicus Nevondo, maakt namens Safe handig gebruik van het landbouwbeleid dat in de jaren negentig door toenmalig President Mandela werd vormgegeven.

This basically means that this particular gentleman and Safe made very good use of their BEE partner, the old politician Nevondo, to get wonderful advantages out of the agricultural policy that was established by President Mandela.

Mr M OZINSKY: Your hero.

The PREMIER: Then, listen to this:

Sterker nog: Bono is opgericht om ...

Listen to this; this is so classic:

Bono is opgericht om van de landelijke grondpolitiek te profiteren.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: At least they're honest.

The PREMIER: They put it in the article. They say they saw their gap with BEE policies and they set up this company to profit from it. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: He then says – listen to this, Mr Speaker – like every other BEE partner in this country ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Oh yes, they must. They must do it.

The PREMIER: Wij zijn ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: I'm not surprised that they don't want me to read this because it's so devastating. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

Mnr H P GEYER: Die waarheid moet uit.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It's like you made your money before, you see, and now the black people ...

The PREMIER: I've never made a cent like this. Quite frankly, I come from a very poor family that was absolutely honest and is still modest, in fact.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You don't have to justify anything.

The SPEAKER: Hon Brown, order!

The PREMIER: Now listen. ... "Wij zijn, een officiële partner" ...

Mr P UYS: On a point of order, Mr Speaker: I would urge that you urge the Premier to stick to one of the three official languages.

The PREMIER: I'm translating.

Mr P UYS: I can't see how this can be translated. [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Jy kom dan van den Nederlande af.

Mnr H P GEYER: Het jy so ver afgedwaal van jou "roots" af?

Die MINISTER: Jy is dan 'n Hollander.

Mnr P UYS: Dan kan ek opstaan en Frans lees.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Jy's 'n Hollander, jy kan nie Frans lees nie, man.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr H P GEYER: Ek skaam my vir jou.

Mr J WITBOOI: Wat is jy? [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Premier, you may continue.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, there are three official languages. The speaker can't go outside that framework.

The PREMIER: I will translate.

Mnr P UYS: She can't.

Die MINISTER: Wat wil jy nog uitdink? [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr P UYS: Dit gaan nie werk nie.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Premier, proceed with your speech.

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I give you the undertaking that I will translate it into one of the official languages, but I have to read it because it's so classic—

Bono is opgericht om van de landelijke grondpolitiek te profiteren.

Mr P UYS: Do you understand that?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Uys, the Premier said she would translate it into one of the official languages. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I'm about to translate if given the opportunity. [Interjections.]

Mnr H P GEYER: Die waarheid maak seer.

Mr P UYS: But it can't be right.

The SPEAKER: Hon Uys, take your seat, please. The Premier has already said that she's going to translate it into one of the official languages.

Mnr H P GEYER: Vat die pyn, broer, vat die pyn. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Premier continue with your speech. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon Witbooi!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: And it's against the rules to read. [laughter.]

The PREMIER: That comes from someone who read her whole speech which she hadn't even proofread before. [Laughter.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It's against the rules to read your speech here for the first time.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Who did that? You?

Mnr P UYS: Wat sê Jan van Riebeeck nog verder?

Die MINISTER: Goed, mooi. Maak so.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Uys!

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ten minste was Jan van Riebeeck nie 'n oorloper nie.

The PREMIER: He says—

...Sterker nog, Bono is opgericht om van die landelike grondpolitiek te profiteren.

Listen to this—

Wij zijn een officiële partner van de regering.

Mr M NCEDANA: Somlomo..

Mr P UYS: There's no translation.

The PREMIER: I'm going to finish the paragraph and translate. You'll understand every word I'm saying, hon Uys. [Interjections.]

Mr M NCEDANA: Somlomo..I just...

The SPEAKER: Order! The Premier will translate it when she has finished the paragraph.

The HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: I'm responding to the point of order. It will be translated by the Premier. [Interjections.] Premier, finish your paragraph and translate it for us, please.

Mr M NCEDANA: Somlomo

Nksz M TINGWE: e Order !

The SPEAKER: Hon Tingwe is it the same..

Nksz M TINGWE: e Order !

MINISTER OF HEALTH: You can't say Order...

Nksz M TINGWE: Ewe ngoba umgaqo-siseko uneelwimi ezintathu apha eNtshona Koloni mhlali-ngaphambili.

The SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon member.

Ms M TINGWE: So it's allowed in this House?

The SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon Tingwe. The Premier will translate it.

Ms M TINGWE: It is allowed in this House?

The SPEAKER: Yes, she's allowed to. She will translate it.

Ms M TINGWE: It is allowed?

The SPEAKER: Yes, she's allowed.

Ms M TINGWE: So, everybody is allowed to speak any other language?

‘n AGB LID: Ja

Mnu M NCEDANA: Somlomo,...

The SPEAKER: As long as you are able to translate it, you are allowed.

Mnu M NCEDANA: Somlomo, bendingakathethi mna ...

The Speaker: Order! Hon Tingwe, order!

The PREMIER: Ich wel auch Deutsch redder, Speaker, und über setzen.

Mr M NCEDANA: I'm worried, Mr Speaker. You did not hear what I was going to ask.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, I will give you a chance to make your point.

Mr M NCEDANA: You didn't.

The SPEAKER: I'm giving you a chance.

Mr M NCEDANA: You're doing it for the second time.

The SPEAKER: I'm giving you a chance now to speak.

Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Speaker, you must deal with this matter. I'm saying you did not hear me. You made the ruling and in the last sitting you did the same thing.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, I'm giving you a chance now.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Praat, man.

Mr M NCEDANA: No, it can't be correct. In terms of the Rules you must hear me and then respond.

The SPEAKER: I'm giving you that chance now, hon Ncedana, so that I can hear what you have to say.

Mr M NCEDANA: I'm asking you why were you making the ruling before you heard me? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. No, no, hon Ncedana, I'm giving you a chance. If you don't use it then Premier may continue with your statement. I give you a chance, but you don't use it.

Mr M NCEDANA: No, no, you give me a chance because I'm asking you: How do you make a ruling before you hear my side? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

Ms M TINGWE: Order! It's here in this Province.

SOMLOMO: Nksz Tingwe, ndakukhuphela ngaphandle sisi.

Mnu M NCEDANA: Somlomo. nisikhuphela ngaphandla. You say this because we are asking you to stick to the Constitution of the province? You have no power to overrule the Constitution. You can't!

The SPEAKER: Hon Ncedana please take your seat. Premier, continue.

Mnu M NCEDANA: Usikhuphele ngaphandle kuba sisithi namathela kumgaqo-siseko wePhondo.

Ms M TINGWE: [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, there's no provision in any of the Rules for the Premier to translate. She must use one of the three official languages. We have a translating service. She must accept there are not 12 official languages. There is 11, and three in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Under which Rule?

Mr P UYS: She must just accept that there are not 12 languages; there are 11, and three in this province. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Your point is noted. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Take your seat, hon members. [Interjections.] No, no, no! I am not going to allow you. [Interjections.] Hon members ...

The PREMIER: I'll read in Afrikaans. I will translate it to Afrikaans as I'm going along.

The SPEAKER: Are you going to read in Afrikaans now?

The PREMIER: I'll read in Afrikaans.

The SPEAKER: Hon Skwatsha, ...

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I understand the logic of what you are raising, that she is going to translate. [Interjections.] Regarding the prescription of three languages, we don't know what she will be translating, whether it is what is there. [Interjections.] That's the difficulty, because ...

The SPEAKER: Can I make a ruling on this one? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: May I ask, Mr Speaker, that anyone in the House please point us to the specific Rule that they are referring to, where you cannot read another language and translate it. [Interjections.] Give me that Rule. You are referring to the Constitution of the province. I'm talking about the Rules of the House. There is no such Rule.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, can you finish ... [Interjections.] Order, hon members?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I can understand why they are so terrified about my reading this paragraph. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tingwe, order!

The PREMIER: I can understand it, because they are terrified to hear what this says. [Interjections.] I'm now going to read it in Afrikaans, Mr Speaker, which is one of the official languages of this province, and I will translate it as I go along:

Sterker nog: Bono is opgerig om van die landelike grondpolitiek 'n wins te maak. Ons is 'n amptelike vennoot van die regering. Die meeste blankes sien niks daarin nie, maar ons beskou dit as 'n geleentheid. Ons het kontakte tot op die hoogste vlakke van regering. Dit is ons grootste krag. Dit is ons grootste krag. Ons kontakte tot op die hoogste vlakke van regering. Afrika bied enorme geleenthede aan ondernemende Nederlanders, maar jy moet dit net wil aangryp. En dit is nie maklik nie, want in Suid-Afrika is swart vroue op die hoogste sport van die leer maar blanke mans, al is hulle onder, kan hulle geleenthede vind en gebruik.

Dit is die vertaling in Afrikaans. [Tussenwerpsels.] This is the most honest exposition of the legalised corruption that is BEE under the ANC. [Interjections.] It is entirely corrupt and immoral to use rules and laws to make a profit by cutting farm workers' wages so outrageously. [Interjections.] That is what started ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: That is what started the uprising. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: Well go and look. He says this himself. [Interjections.] Yes.
[Interjections.] You can go and investigate it.

Mr M OZINSKY: Where's the corruption?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky! [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: Is the Premier allowed to misuse the forum of this House to attack people who have not any way of defending themselves?

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: Then she alleges corruption when she doesn't show any corruption.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky! You are totally misusing your opportunity. That's not a point of order that you are raising.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Premier, over to you.

Mr M OZINSKY: She hasn't proved any corruption but she says we're corrupt.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky! Order! Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, now we have the extraordinary allegation that the DA is trying to fuel xenophobia. I refer to two research papers – one by a very well-known trade unionist, Jan Theron; and the other by a very respected research institute called the Forced Migration Studies Programme at the University of the Witwatersrand. Jan Theron investigated the xenophobic violence in the area of De Doorns and he concludes that:

All studies confirm that the allegation made by the Minister of Labour that farmers employ Zimbabweans because they can pay them less, was without foundation.

In fact, he says – and this is quite extraordinary – that far from being xenophobic, farmers help Zimbabwean workers by pleading with the Department of Home Affairs and, in fact, succeeding in getting a satellite office in De Doorns to register them and to enable them to work on the farms.

Jan Theron's research confirms what I've been hearing on the ground that, in fact, farmers like employing Zimbabwean workers because they are so skilled.

Before the ANC's friend, Robert Mugabe, destroyed the farming sector in Zimbabwe they had a thriving farming sector, and they have many highly skilled workers who have

been driven off the farms. Highly skilled farm experts were driven off the farms in Zimbabwe. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: They are now living in Cape Town.

The PREMIER: In fact, their headquarters were in De Doorns and farmers from across the province came to fetch skilled workers in De Doorns.

Mr M OZINSKY: Highly skilled farm owners.

The PREMIER: Yes. Let me say this, Mr Speaker. The ANC claims to oppose labour brokers, and they say that we don't attack labour brokers. That is what the hon Prins said in her speech. In fact, not only don't the ANC oppose labour brokers in the farming sector, the ANC are the labour brokers in the farming sector.

Mr Speaker, what do Pat Marran and his wife do for a living? [Interjections.] He's a moonlighting councillor, full of moonshine, because he's actually a labour broker. [Interjections.] Let's find out what people like Nelie Barends are saying, and I'd be even very fascinated to dig a little more deeply into Nosey Pieterse, maar dit nou daar gelaat. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, what happened was that the labour brokers, amongst whom very prominent ANC members ...

An HON MEMBER: Councillors.

The PREMIER: ... and some councillors, got together and tried to ratchet up their placement fee from R5 per worker per day to R10 per worker per day. That's what they did, and the Zimbabweans said: "No, we don't want to work through labour brokers. We will work directly with the farmers and we won't charge any placement fee." The problem then was that much of the xenophobia was stoked by labour brokers with close links to the ANC because the Zimbabweans were undercutting their profits and their placement fees and making workers poorer. [Interjections.]

Here it is. Some responses reported that dissatisfied labour brokers pressured local leaders and incited local residents to attack and chase away Zimbabweans.

Such mobilisation was facilitated by the fact that some contractors are also ward committee members. I saw that for myself when I was in De Doorns, and the roles that Pat Marran and Nosey Pieterse played because, as these research papers show, labour brokers are divided on ethnic lines between groups. Pat Marran facilitated, primarily, Basotho and other workers, but then this incompetent government comes along. Because they cannot police our boundaries and borders.

Marius Fransman, instead of doing his job as Minister of Foreign Affairs, comes and stokes up these divisions and for some extraordinary reason only one group of migrant workers from neighbouring countries – the Zimbabweans – got an exemption and were given amnesty so that they could work here, and the Basotho didn't. Suddenly the dormant labour inspectorate became very active and started fining the farmers in De Doorns a lot of money for employing the Basotho, so they stopped employing the

Basotho. [Interjections.] The Pat Marrans and other labour brokers were very upset about this because they facilitated the Basotho, because the Zimbabweans didn't want labour brokers. That was another reason behind the problems that we face. I saw it for myself.

Listen to this from the research paper:

Displaced Zimbabweans widely believe that the local councillor, Mpumelelo "Poyi" Lubisi, and the former Mayor of Breede Valley, Charles Ntsomi, were either directly involved in organising the violence or at least tolerated or indirectly supported it.

Then they give a whole lot of verifications for those allegations.

Mr Speaker, it's a disgrace. Not only does the ANC stoke xenophobia to protect their labour broking businesses, but they are prepared to band together to skim a R10 placement fee per day per worker from the wages that they had. [Interjections.] This is research that started in the 2008-09 xenophobia and was perpetuated in the xenophobia that we saw in the most recent outbreak.

What you have, Mr Speaker, is Zimbabweans working on farms and then renting RDP houses that were given for free to South Africans, who then move into shacks and, understandably, complain about their living conditions. So we have a vicious cycle all initiated and perpetuated by this incompetent government who is in alliance with unbelievably corrupt leaders in both Lesotho and Zimbabwe that cannot do anything with the most productive and fertile land in South Africa ... [Interjections.] ... and that then

prey on people's misery by driving crony policies that are dressed up as BEE to fleece the workers and make a few politically-connected people rich and then ensure that they stay in misery.

That is the true story of the farm violence. [Interjections.] That is the true story of the farm violence, and that is why the majority of people arrested for violence were not farm workers at all. [Interjections.] The farm strike was driven by farm workers who wanted to get work and could not get work because of the ANC's incompetent policies.

That does not mean that farm workers are satisfied with their lot – not at all. It does not mean that they can live on those wages – not at all.

Mr M OZINSKY: They must keep quiet.

The PREMIER: They must never keep quiet, because we have rights. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: We have rights, and people can speak up and protest in South Africa. We support trade unions to do that and everything else, but what we say is absolutely essential, that it shouldn't be accompanied by burning down the very infrastructure that makes farms viable. It should be accompanied by making the 30% of the most fertile land in South Africa in the Eastern Cape under tribal tenure viable and producing food

and jobs. It should be accompanied by a proper foreign policy that doesn't have to lead to so many wretched refugees having to seek a better fortune elsewhere. That is the truth.

The hon Max Ozinsky can't stand the fact that the party that he once believed in – because he can't possibly believe in it any more – undertakes these kinds of corrupt deals with foreign people who are trying ... [Interjections.] ... to benefit and become rich out of the corrupt deals that pass for BEE deals.

LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: She can now also read your mind.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: The hon member is misleading the House, because I was thinking the exact opposite thing of what she says I'm saying. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! Hon Ozinsky, I don't have the facts of what both of you are saying, so I won't regard it as a point of order until I have those facts. [Interjections.] Order! You may continue, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The question I'd like to ask the hon Prins when she stops talking and stroking her neighbour is: Who is dividing and ruling and who is defending unscrupulous labour brokers? They are just two questions for her. Then the hon Prins got to the question of share equity schemes. Quite frankly, she doesn't have a vague clue of what she's talking about. [Interjections.] Sy kan gerus met die agb Minister Van Rensburg gaan praat of dalk ook met prof Mohammad Karaan, want daardie gawe ome sal haar 'n bietjie reghelp en verduidelik wat aandeeskemas is.

Me E PRINS: Ek weet presies wat aangaan en julle almal weet wat aangaan.

Die PREMIER: Julle het geen benul wat aangaan nie.

Me E PRINS: Julle weet wat aangaan.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde, agb Prins! Orde! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: How patronising.

The PREMIER: No, I'm not patronising at all. [Interjections.] Let me tell you – and you're a genius ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.] ...and everybody else is silly and stupid.

The PREMIER: Let me tell you a little bit...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: ... Let me tell you a little bit about share equity schemes, hon Brown.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Please, not another lecture!

An HON MEMBER: Why not? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: We are governing, unlike you.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You tell us a long story about why you ...
[Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Brown, order!

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz and members, order, please!

The PREMIER: Ninety per cent of the ANC's land reform schemes have failed – 90% countrywide. Of the money that was spent on that failed land reform could have, at market value, bought 37% of all the agricultural land in South Africa. That's the kind of waste that we've seen under the ANC.

But listen to this: One of the disasters was Zebediela. Zebediela, as we know, was a world-famous citrus farm in South Africa. [Interjections.] One of the first steps taken by the ANC in implementing its land reform policy was to take over the administration of all existing state-sponsored schemes in the former homelands. The presiding officers were dismissed and replaced mainly by affirmative action candidates or political cronies.

Take the Zebediela citrus estate in Limpopo as an example. When it was taken over by the now defunct Agriculture and Rural Development Corporation in 1996, it was the world's largest citrus estate. Some 565 000 trees were producing an estimated 400 million oranges a year. At the height of the season, 15 000 cases of citrus were packed every day in one of the world's most advanced citrus packing sheds. Three million of these cases were sold annually on the lucrative export market. In 1994, this crop was worth some R30 million. That was when we became a democracy. This crop was worth R30 million in 1994.

By 2001, six years after the take-over by the ANC's Agriculture and Rural Development Corporation, corruption, theft and maladministration have brought about Zebediela's ruin. Of the original 2 260 ha and the trees in 1994, less than half of that, only 800 ha were left in production. Listen to this: Due to lack of proper management, more than half of the remaining trees had died and been chopped up for firewood. [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ek huil sommer!

The PREMIER: By 2001 the estate was running at a loss of R35 million, after having made profits of R30 million. It was running at a loss of R35 million a year, and ARDC's custodianship was finally terminated after the death of Zebediela. That is the ANC's model of land reform.

Mr Deputy Speaker, 90% of their schemes have failed, but 90% of the DA's equity share schemes have succeeded – the exact inverted model. [Interjections.] Let me tell you what

they succeeded in. [Interjections,] They succeeded in empowering workers, in making workers ... [Interjections,] ... owners of farms and in making those farms profitable and lucrative. [Interjections.] That's what they succeeded in. [Interjections.]

Let me ask the honourable ANC another question, Mr Deputy Speaker? How do you think they have turned around Zebediela? [Interjections.] How do you think, Mr Deputy Speaker, they have turned around Zebediela? They have done that by introducing equity share schemes ... [Interjections.] Equity share schemes in Zebediela today. Today the Blaze group has a 51% stake in Zebediela, the community holds 35% and the workers hold 14%. It has been turned around and it is starting to flourish again. That, I hope, explains to the hon Prins what an equity share scheme is. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: It is not a partnership between Mr De Vries and an ANC MP to milk the workers; the equity share schemes empower the workers and they are the DA's proposals on land reform. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: In fact, Mr Deputy Speaker, the National Development Plan (NDP) has based its entire set of proposals on developing the DA's model. [Interjections.] Go and read the NDP. It is one hundred per cent a development. [Interjections.] It is 100% a development on the DA's proposals. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Number one, they say we must finish the audit of state land which the ANC did not do in 20 years. Number two, they say get tribal tenure under ownership that makes it productive, and, thirdly, extend equity share schemes. That is what it says, three proposals, and the DA agrees with it one hundred per cent.

Let me say something to the hon Magwaza. The hon Magwaza accused us of failing to assist NGOs, especially those who deal with rape victims. We have increased our budget, Mr Deputy Speaker, for victim empowerment services from R7,6 million to over R17 million ... [Interjections.] From R7,6 million to over R17 million for the 2013-14 financial year.

Let me give you a list of some of them. We provide counselling and/or places of safety for up to 20 000 victims of violence per year at departmental offices and via the following NGOs, and I will read them to you. Athlone House of Strength; Carehaven; Creating Effective Family Shelter for Victims of Violence; L'Abrie De Dieu Safe House; Nonceba Shelter; Place of Hope Lansdowne; Rosemore Refuge for Battered Women, Phambili; and Saartjie Baartman Centre for Women and Children, of which we give 25% of its total costs. If we were going to, Mr Deputy Speaker, give a hundred per cent of Saartjie Baartman's costs, as I would love to do, it would cease to be an NGO; it would be an extension of government.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we give to Sisters Incorporated, we give to St Anne's Home Shelter for Women; we give to the United Sanctuary Against Abuse; we give to Worcester House of Hope; we give to Samila Gender Counselling; we give to Mitchells Plain Crisis Line; we give to Saphila Ekurhuleni Community Organisation; we give to the Trauma Centre; we give to Mosaic; we give to Khululeke Multi-cultural Counselling Services; we give to Rape Crisis Cape Town Trust; we give to Famsa Western Cape; we give to Famsa Outeniqua; and we give to Creating Effective Families and we give to the Second Mosaic, which is in the Mitchells Plain Care Centre. We also do a whole lot of other preventative work which I won't go into detail about now.

The hon Magwaza, just like the hon Brown, ... obekekileyo, obekekileyo uMagwaza. She said to me that I must ...thath'umhlaphantsi, thath'umhlaphantsi, mamelani sisi kufuneka uvuke xa ulele sukuhlala phantsi phakama uze kum ndivuka ekuseni ndikhwele ibhayisekile yam nawe yenza njalo, ngoba, ngoba? It's good for you. [Interjections.] Uyazelaphi... ngoba ndenza njalo nam. ungugqirha wena? Mamela sisi xa [ayivakali]... ndingenakukhwela Ibhayisekile yam ndinqumle iDevil's Peak ndizakuhlala bhaxa phantsi ndinyothe njengawe ndithathe umhlaphantsi. Obekekileyo uMagwaza uthe uthe kukho iiNdlovu kule Ndlu,... [ayivakali.] ... ndifuna ukukuxelela ukuba zininzi apha kule Ndlu.

There isn't only an elephant in this room let me say.... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Who is the elephant?

An HON MEMBER: Only one.

The PREMIER: Only one.

MINISTER FOR Health: You.

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, let me get to the hon Skwatsha. [Interjections.] The hon Skwatsha. It's sickening to be exposed like this, isn't it, hon Brown. [Interjections.] It's sickening and painful to be exposed like this.

The hon Skwatsha came to the House and made a very serious allegation, Mr Speaker. The hon Skwatsha said that a woman went to our new state of the art Khayelitsha Hospital which has a 1% mortality rate in the busiest accident and ICU unit in the country, trauma unit in the entire country, which has a minimal 1% mortality rate. He said that a woman went there for a contraceptive injection and died after having been given the wrong injection.

I got hold of the lady's name so that I could follow up the case, and I obviously will not repeat her name here. But the investigation led by the head of Health in the province shows that this lady was a regular patient in the terminal phases of Aids. She arrived with septic shock and died in the Khayelitsha Hospital as a result of complications of Aids. She was not even on injected contraceptives at the time – not even on injected contraceptives at the time; she was on oral contraceptives. But you might have thought

hon Skwatsha that if she had full-blown Aids her husband might also have taken a bit of trouble around contraception. Might you not have thought that?

The husband made the allegation that the woman had died after going for a contraceptive injection. I don't know who was fooling who – maybe she told that to her husband – but it was patently not true. [Interjections.] Because we have investigated it and we know why the woman died because there is a file there. [Interjections.] And hon Skwatsha gave the name of the person. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Go and look at the file.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: We haven't mentioned the name of the person, so there is no breach of confidence. [Interjections.] He didn't mention it here. [Interjections.] That is his fault for mentioning it; I didn't mention it. He mustn't mention people's names with lies in the House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order!

The PREMIER: If the hon Skwatsha wants confidentiality he mustn't come here and name people's names and then tell lies about how they died. Because I can ask the head

of Health to investigate and he has exposed that for a complete untruth. But the hon Skwatsha goes and tells South Africa and the world that in our very best hospital in this subcontinent that dedicated doctors and professional staff are killing people with wrong injections when, in fact, it is the opposite of the truth. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where did you get the name?

The PREMIER: Well, if he didn't get the name, I got the name from him. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, hon Skwatsha!

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: Is the Premier saying that I told lies here? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I am saying that he told fundamental untruths in the House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I think the Premier did ... [Interjections.] Order! Order! I think the Premier did use the word "lie" and that is unparliamentary, Premier.

The PREMIER: I withdraw; thank you, Speaker.

Let me say this ...

Mr M SKWATSHA: Can I ask you a question?

The PREMIER: Yes, you can ask me a question. I will sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are allowed to ask a question, if you want to.

Mr M SKWATSHA: So the Premier now says I made “fundamental untruths”.

The PREMIER: Yes, I did.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that your point of order? Is that a question or a point of order?

Mr M SKWATSHA: It is a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can ask a question.

The PREMIER: Yes, I said that.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I heard you saying that ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The question is over. [Interjections.] You asked a question and you got a reply. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Just get to the point and ask the question. Mr Skwatsha, is that your ... [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! Mr Skwatsha, is that your question?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Botha ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Skwatsha, are you finished with your question?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, I am.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier, you can continue.

Mr M OZINSKY: Sorry, Mr Speaker, on a point of order: Is it parliamentary for the Premier to say a member told “fundamental untruths”?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

Mr M OZINSKY: Because the question here is the honour of the member. [Interjections.] And to tell “fundamental untruths” is to lie. There is no other way of interpreting that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let me think about that one; it is very much a border case. To say it is an untruth is parliamentary, but to put a motive to it brings you over the edge. Premier, you can assist me by withdrawing the “fundamental” part.

The PREMIER: Yes, I withdraw that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: I say it was totally wrong to come to the House and claim that someone had died as a result of a wrong injection, when the women, who was never on injected contraceptives, had come for an injected contraceptive. And without finding out the truth or checking the facts with the Department of Health he comes here and repeats the story in the privilege of Parliament. And frankly, hon Deputy Speaker, the hon Skwatsha owes the doctors and nurses of the Khayelitsha Hospital an unconditional apology. [Interjections.] And if anybody needs to withdraw what he said, it is the hon Skwatsha, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You said so here. [Interjections.] It is not the husband now, it's you. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The hon Skwatsha told some further untruths, Mr Deputy Speaker. Oh, sorry, I withdraw that, Mr Deputy Speaker. The hon Skwatsha further misled the House ... [Interjections.] ... when he said that at the height of the so-called farm worker uprising the clinics were closed to spite the farm workers when, in fact, that does not accord with the facts, if that is parliamentary, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The facts are that the clinics were only closed when the police could not guarantee the safety of staff either at the clinics or en route to the facilities. In fact, in certain situations

staff were threatened and despite this the threatened staff provided the services. EMS was placed on alert and patients were transported to nearby hospitals, where necessary. It is unfortunate that allegations of this nature are made against health workers and health services where, in many instances, people deliver these services despite the volatile situation and the risk to their lives.

As regards to the misleading of the House on the G F Jooste Hospital, the hospital will, in fact, relocate during the construction period for the new hospital, and during this time alternative access to emergency care will be provided at the Heideveld Community Health Centre, with a temporary emergency centre and a 30-bed unit for interim hospitalisation, where necessary.

The Helderberg Hospital is indeed a facility under tremendous stress because it certainly cannot cope with the growth in demand.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, is the Premier prepared to take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is that a question?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is the hon Premier prepared to take a question?

The PREMIER: Yes, I am.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Can I give you something, Premier?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You can ask a question.

The PREMIER: No, you can ask a question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am waiting for the question.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I would like to give you the ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Go back to your seat please. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Please go to your seat. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Mr Skwatsha, I have allowed you the opportunity to ask a question, and that's all. You can do that afterwards. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! No. [Interjections.] Take your seat please. [Interjections.] Hon Skwatsha, take ... [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon Skwatsha, take your seat please. [Interjections.] Hon Skwatsha, order! Please do not abuse the opportunities given in the House. I've given you an opportunity to ask a question; you've asked your question, remain seated.

Mr M SKWATSHA: But I said can I give her something and she said yes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not prepared to allow that now, you can do that afterwards. [Interjections.] You can do it afterwards.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Can I now do it?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier, you can ... [Interjections.] Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, may I address you on something please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I want to ask you to please take action about the conduct of this member in the House with what he just did now. [Interjections.] It is unacceptable in terms of the order of the House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will deal with that.

Ms M Tingwe: Rule number?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Will the House please come to order.

Mr N NCEDANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I just deal with this point. [Interjections.] Mr Ncedana, please come to order. The matter has been disposed of. Mr Skwatsha was not allowed to go over the floor, although the Premier said she would accept it; I didn't hear that. That

can be done afterwards. It is not done now; the Premier is on the floor, the Premier will continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I accept your ruling, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The hon Skwatsha also attacked our plan and our partnership with Clicks to extend our clinic services. Mr Speaker, he says that we don't have Clicks stores in poor areas, and he specifically mentioned Gugulethu by name. I know that the hon Skwatsha doesn't visit Gugulethu often ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He stays there.

The PREMIER: But if he lives there, as he claims to do ... [Interjections.] If he lives there, as he claims to do, may I point out to him where his local Clicks is. His local Clicks is in Steve Biko Drive, and the store manager is Mr Richard Yokwe, and his phone number is 0216384151, and his working hours are 9 to 6 weekdays. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] So you can go to your local Clicks for family planning services, hon Skwatsha.

In closing, ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: You didn't have to stay, hon Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: It's torture. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: In closing, Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC used Jeremy Cronin's bizarre statement as the key refrain running through all of their lamentations which described us as "voracious suckers of mega-profits from the poor". That was the phrase. [Interjections.] I wonder if you've heard of Roux Shabangu, the buddy of Bheki Cele. Have they heard of Khulubuse Zuma and the Aurora Empowerment Systems and Pomodzi ... [Interjections.] Have they heard of Gul Zama Zuma or Jagdish Parekh and the Imperial Crown Trading Sishen deal? Have they heard about Nomwabua Sambudla, President Zuma's son-in law, and the deal on the new headquarters for the Department of Public Service and Administration headquarters? Have they heard of President Zuma's nephew, Mandla Xaba, who was awarded a contract worth R300 million to run Durban Metro's bus fleet, which was awarded without a tender and went to a company linked to Xaba following the collapse of the previous operator, of which Xaba was also a director?

Now, the hon Skwatsha – and I haven't finished my list yet – asked a valid question. He said: "What has Zuma got to do with this?" My answer to him is that if we're described as "voracious suckers of mega-profits from the poor", let me give you a list of the people connected with the honourable President of South Africa who has sucked mega-profits from the poor? We also know what happened to Aurora; we know what happened on Paomodzi; we know what happened on Imperial Crown Trading; we know what

happened to the Durban Metro bus system ... [Interjections.] I am just doing a few of the many.

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, this is my favourite. **Bucebo** General Trading, Kwazulu-Natal Legislature. **Bucebo** General Trading is a company belonging to Nokululeko Mhlongo, the mother of two of Jacob Zuma's children, but not one of his wives, who was awarded a multimillion rand catering contract by the KwaZulu-Natal Legislature in 2008. The tender was awarded without being advertised in the Tender Bulletin, and before the expiry of the 21-day review period for tenders. Can you imagine, a multimillion rand catering contract because you are the mother of Jacob Zuma's children! I can only imagine how MaKhumalo must feel. [Interjections.] I can only imagine what MaKhumalo must feel; she must be very very upset that she only got a tuckshop at Nkandla. [Interjections.]

Then we had President Zuma's big ex-buddy ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: ... Julius Malema and Onpoint Engineering and all the things that they got while they were still friends with President Zuma. Look at what is happening to him now that he has fallen out of favour; he has been taken to the cleaners.

We know what happened to Phosane Mngqibisa who got R6 million in management fees for an indaba in which he was hardly involved. We know what happened to the R1,25 billion tender of Vivian Reddy, another one of Zuma's buddies. We know about

EduSolutions. We know just like with this “Oogsten-in-Afrika”, which means “oeste-in-Afrika”, just to quickly translate before I get into trouble, and their partnership with Bono, that all these BEE fronts are legalised corruption that, in fact, undermine the empowerment of poor workers and that suck mega-profits from the poor; that’s what we see.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in contrast, what does the DA do?

Ms HANI: We don’t want to hear.

The PREMIER: You don’t want to hear, I am sure you don’t want to hear because it is too painful. [Interjections.] We believe in genuine BEE. [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: What is that?

The PREMIER: I will read it to you, I will tell you what “genuine BEE” is.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Come over, we will show you!

The PREMIER: Many things. [Interjections.] Many, many things. We are strong supporters of genuine BEE, not using political fronts to suck mega-profits from the poor.

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, yesterday in the City of Cape Town, the Mayor of Cape Town announced that the council would recommend the adoption of a resolution to write off the interest on the arrears for properties with a municipal property valuation of R300 000,

or less, by 31 December 2013. That was the Democratic Alliance's proposal ... [Interjections.] ... to empower the poor. Mr Deputy Speaker, this will bring the total amount of charges to be written off for qualifying poor residents to R472 million written off their debt. That is empowering the poor. But you know what, Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC in the City Council refused to support it. [Interjections.] They refused to support it. [Interjections.] Who is undermining the poor? [Interjections.] Who claims to have the interests of the poor at heart?

The only party that seriously has the interests of the poor at heart is the DA. [Interjections.] The ANC stands exposed in their hypocrisy, corruption and crony enrichment and power abuse.

Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I am aware of the fact that I am not allowed ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that a point of order?

Mr H P GEYER: It is a point of order. I am aware of the fact that I am not allowed to give notice of a motion at this stage of the proceedings, but I wish to inform you that I intend dealing with the utterances of hon Skwatsha ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! That's not a point of order. [Interjections.] Order! Order! That is a frivolous point of order. That should be raised at the beginning of the

proceedings of the House if you want to bring a motion and there are procedures for that.

[Interjections.]

RULING

Order! Before we adjourn can I just, for the benefit of hon member Ozinsky who raised the point of order, and also for the benefit of the Premier, say that using the word “untruth” per se is not unparliamentary, but when you add a motive to it like saying “it is a deliberate untruth”, or “it is an untruth and you know it”, or “it is a fundamental untruth”, then I would say it is unparliamentary.

The House adjourned at 16:15.
