
WEDNESDAY, 20 MARCH 2013

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS – see p

INTERPELLATIONS, QUESTIONS AND REPLIES – see p

RULING

The SPEAKER: Order! Before we start with the business of the day, I would like to make a ruling. [Interjections.] Hon Hani, please take your seat.

During the debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address on 26 February 2013, the hon Chief Whip raised a point of order, requesting me to rule whether it was parliamentary for the hon Hani to say that the hon Minister of Human Settlements, who was delivering his speech at the time, was telling lies. As I could not hear such words being uttered, I enquired

from the hon member Hani whether she did utter such words and she could not tell me, and I undertook to study the Hansard.

Having now had an opportunity to study the unrevised Hansard, I want to rule as follows: According to what was recorded in the Hansard, hon Hani uttered the following words, and I quote: "That is lies." The House has ruled many times that saying that another member is lying or telling lies is not only unparliamentary but it is also a negative interference attributed to the character of the member referred to.

I therefore order the hon Hani to withdraw the remarks and apologise.

Ms V HANI: Mr Speaker, I withdraw the remarks and apologise.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

INTERPELLATIONS

Hip Hop tender: irregular expenditure

1. Mr M Ozinsky to ask Ms H Zille, Premier:

- (a) Why was the expenditure by her department on the Hip Hop tender declared irregular and
- (b) what steps have been taken to recover this money?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, regarding the question of this interpellation, I am very aware that the Forensic Investigation Unit has briefed Scopa, including the hon Ozinsky, on this matter very extensively. The interpellation therefore cannot be because the hon Ozinsky does not know the answer; there must, as usual, be another motive behind this question, and I think I know what that is, Mr Speaker. I think it's the same motive as the ANC mouthpiece, that's called *The New Age*, had on 18 March when they claimed that I paid Hip Hop Media out to get rid of them from the profits.

Mr Speaker, as usual with those kinds of slants on issues, the truth is fundamentally different from what the ANC claims. In fact, the action to pay Hip Hop Media out was not initiated by this government; it was initiated by the hon Brown's term as the Premier, and we had to inherit that contract that had been entered into and the negotiations that were under way to try to shorten that contract initiated by the hon Brown.

To blame this government for the fact that Hip Hop had a valid contract with the ANC or the negotiations that the hon Brown entered into, that would require payment to Hip Hop to shorten that contract, is like blaming the DA Council in Cape Town for the ANC's decision to site the stadium in Green Point. One government inherits the contractual obligations of a previous government and is held responsible for them.

The truth is that when the hon Brown took over from the hon Rasool the government had already extended Hip Hop's contract for three years. The hon Brown did not want to retain that, so she had to try to reduce it. She thought to reduce it to four months and Hip Hop claimed as compensation R3,5 million. At that point, the 2009 election took place and the

ANC lost, and we inherited that negotiated process. In fact, we have whittled down the R3,5 million that Hip Hop was demanding to R300 000, which is a whole lot less than it would have cost us to fight the matter in court.

The hon Ozinsky knows this. The hon Ozinsky knows that we inherited an unbelievable mess ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please finish your sentence.

The PREMIER: ... due to the infighting of the ANC and that we, in fact, got the province off very lightly in comparison to the mess we inherited.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, it's a pity the hon Zille doesn't know the process of oversight – that the role of committees is to ask questions. However, the House itself plays a key role in oversight. It is in this House that you as the political head of this department must account for what the officials say to us in Scopa.

The difficulty with this issue of Hip Hop is that we really do not know what to believe. The hon Zille told the press that this Hip Hop contract was the beginning of Rasool's corrupt legacy. She told the press that she's not budging on the Rasool issue. She told the press that she's got evidence of corruption and that she's submitting it to the Commercial Crimes Unit, but let's look at what the hon Zille has done.

Let me say to the hon Zille that this question was submitted long before the article in *The New Age*. It is, however, interesting because things catch up with you. Besides the R300 000 your department paid to Hip Hop – remember you’ve alleged corruption – you appointed one of the directors of Hip Hop to the Economic Development Partnership, Mr Wicker. Scopa was told by an HR official in your department, “No one was dismissed because of the Hip Hop matter.”

Mrs Robson, the Head of the FIU, told Scopa, “There is no proof of corruption”, referring to this issue. Mrs Robson also told Scopa that she’s really sure, based on the evidence, even with the irregularities involved, that Hip Hop would still have come first. She was meaning first in the adjudication process to award the tender.

You instructed the Director-General to lay a complaint, and he made an affidavit. In that affidavit he quotes the affidavit of Mr Ashley Smith. Never once – and this was told to Scopa – did the FIU ever interview Mr Smith. Mr Smith is the one, and let me quote Mr Smith ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Ozinsky, please finish your sentence.

Mr M OZINSKY: Okay. I will go on to show you that the Premier has said one thing outside and their department have told Scopa the exact opposite of those things.

Mnr H P GEYER: Mnr die Speaker, die agb Ozinsky hardloop alweer dieselfde jakkalsdraaie wat hy op 6 Maart in die Skoor-vergadering gedoen het. Daar is drie maal aan die lid verduidelik waarom die ondersoek gegaan het en ofskoon daar ‘n konflik van belange was

weens die feit dat 'n lid van die Evaluasiekomitee nie homself verskoon het van die bodevaluasieproses nie.

Die agb lid moet nou vir die vierde keer mooi luister. He must listen carefully, Mr Speaker. The Bid Evaluation Committee member's failure to declare the conflict of interest has no impact on the awarding of the bid. However, although the conduct of the BEC member did not impact on the awarding of the bid, it does not alter the fact that the expenditure that was incurred is not in accordance with the requirement of applicable legislation. The expenditure was not incurred as a direct result of the BEC member's conduct, which is but one aspect of a far more comprehensive process and which has no material impact on the awarding of the bid.

Mnr die Speaker, dit is egter so dat die PFMA nie onderskei tussen tipes of grade van oortreding of nie-voldoening aan vereistes nie. Dit laat ons nou met 'n tegniese verpligting wat uitgevoer is en waar die agb Ozinsky oënskynlik moedswilliglik 'n sensasionele berg van 'n molshoop probeer maak.

The PREMIER: I think, Mr Speaker, the hon Ozinsky is not distinguishing between two completely separate issues. The one is the decision of the ANC government, under hon Brown, to challenge the extension of the contracts of Hip Hop that had been made under the ANC already shortly before the 2009 election. That was one issue that we had to deal with. The other issue, which is an entirely separate one, is allegations that Hip Hop was a conduit for payment to journalists to write favourable reports about Mr Rasool and his government. Those are two entirely separate issues and legally we have to deal with them separately.

If there was a legal contract with Hip Hop that was entered into under the ANC, and the ANC, under hon Brown, was in negotiations to pay them R3,5 million potentially to reduce the time of that contract and we inherited that situation, we can't simply unilaterally terminate a contract when nobody has been found guilty in terms of the other side of it, which is: was Hip Hop a conduit for brown envelopes to journalists?

Now the one piece that we've got about that is an affidavit by Ashley Smith who was a journalist. We immediately took that affidavit to the Serious Crimes Investigation Unit which has been investigating it ever since, and we've kept on asking where it is. The latest report I have had is that it is now with the Directorate of Public Prosecutions. We are awaiting their decision and they are going to have to take a decision as to whether there is sufficient evidence to lay charges in connection with Smith's affidavit that, in fact, Hip Hop was that conduit.

That allegation by Smith did not nullify or invalidate the contract that the ANC entered into with Hip Hop and which we inherited. We had to clear up the mess and got away very cheaply compared to the price that they were demanding from the ANC which was R3,5 million. We whittled it down to R300 000.

Thus the point is that the FIU could not interrogate Mr Smith; they've got no *locus standi* to call anyone who isn't an employee of this government. They could only interview people who were here and who haven't been fired. The point is that this was all about an internal conflict in the ANC. [Time Expired.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, perhaps the hon Premier needs some induction in answering questions. The question is: Why was the expenditure declared irregular and what steps have been taken to recover the money?

Let me put it on record that the department has taken no steps to recover the money. In fact, the department did not even register as a creditor in the insolvency case of Hip Hop, so there is no possibility of recovering any money. That is the first thing that the hon Premier should have told the House. The second thing she should have told the House was why it was declared irregular. I'll leave that for her to say.

Let me tell you that Mr Smith said in his affidavit:

The fact that my role in Hip Hop and possible tenders awarded to Hip Hop were seen by Orrie, Rasool, Aranes and I as compensation for my previous role in assisting Rasool ...

It is clear that Mr Smith is saying that the tender was awarded for a purpose. Now there's nothing stopping the FIU phoning Mr Smith and saying what evidence do you have, but they didn't even take that step. They didn't even contact him.

Also, there was only one tender in this department to Hip Hop. So, if the tender was awarded, as Smith says, to pay him back then that tender committee must be investigated. The investigation was done and the investigation of the Premier's department says there was no corruption involved. So therefore the whole argument of the Premier in submitting this case

to the SAPS falls away, because her own department tells her there was no corruption in the awarding of that tender.

You can't have it both ways; either there was a problem in awarding the tender or there was not a problem. This artificial situation they create between what is called the brown envelopes and Hip Hop is patently nonsense, because Mr Smith himself says that the tender was awarded to pay him. So where does the distinction come in?

It's not as if there were one tender for the brown envelopes and another tender for Hip Hop. It was the same Bid Adjudication Committee and if you say – and you must say it because your department says it – there was no corruption in that Bid Adjudication Committee, then you have to tell the public there was no corruption. That is the problem we have.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky!

Mr M OZINSKY: Can I have my last sentence?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr M OZINSKY: The problem we have is that all the steps that I've listed taken and not taken by the Premier's department shows that the Premier ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky! Please take your seat.

Mr M OZINSKY: ... has not prepared to recover the money she's obliged to recover under the law.

The PREMIER: It's amazing, Mr Speaker, that a member as experienced as hon Ozinsky can't distinguish between irregular expenditure, fruitless and wasteful expenditure and corrupt expenditure. They are all different categories.

Mr M OZINSKY: There's no category for corrupt expenditure.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: It is extremely bizarre that he does not understand the difference between ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, order, please!

The PREMIER: ... a bid evaluation committee and a bid adjudication committee. His question concerns irregular expenditure and the hon Geyer answered that question entirely.

The reason that it was declared irregular was that a member of the Bid Evaluation Committee, not an adjudication committee, had not declared a conflict of interest because of an intimate partner being involved in Hip Hop when he sat on the Bid Evaluation Committee.

As it happens, the investigation into that showed that this particular person with a conflict of interest had ranked Hip Hop last and that his evaluation had no impact at all on the awarding of the tender to Hip Hop. Nevertheless, because there was an undeclared conflict of interest it was declared irregular.

The issue of the allegations that Hip Hop was used as a conduit and the issue of the involvement of people who are not employees of the provincial government in that is an issue beyond the scope of the FIU. They have no *locus standi* to do anything about that and that is why we gave it to the police.

If the FIU could have dealt with it they would have. They couldn't, we gave it to the police and they've been working on the case for a very long time – I can't even put the number of months to it. We've enquired regularly about progress and now it has gone to the Director of Public Prosecutions and we're awaiting a decision on whether to prosecute.

I know the criminal justice system is not the most efficient in the world, which is something that Mr Ozinsky should take up with the national Minister, but we are doing our job and the FIU has done all that it possibly can and we are also still battling to clean up the ANC's mess. We were given a matter of emphasis in our audit because of this mess of Hip Hop.

Identifisering van en stappe teen leeders in protesaksies

2. Me J A van Zyl vra mnr D A C Grant, Minister van Onderwys:

(a) Watter maatreëls toegepas word om leerders wat gedurende skoolure aan optogte en/of protesaksies deelneem of deelgeneem het, te identifiseer en (b) watter stappe teen hulle gedoen sal word?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, at the outset let me explain that it is not possible to deal with the interpellation in the two neat components in which the question is asked. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: The reasons for this will become clear as I speak. My apologies to the hon member, but I'm sure she will see that no disrespect is intended.

Mr Speaker, regulating learner attendance at schools is first and foremost the function of the school. It is not undertaken by the department, although the department monitors overall patterns and individual exceptions very carefully. Learners are made aware of the attendance policy at school through the school's code of conduct, which determines the hours of attendance at school each day and the process that needs to be followed should a learner require permission for his or her absence.

Applicable links to the framework makes it clear that this code of conduct is aimed at establishing a disciplined and purposeful school environment dedicated to the improvement and maintenance of the learning process. I repeat – aimed at establishing a disciplined and

purposeful school environment dedicated to the improvement and maintenance of the learning process.

Mr Speaker, this code of conduct is not a set of rules put into place because the education system and schools like to control the lives of our young people. No, it is all about supporting the creation of a positive learning environment. For that reason learners cannot just absent themselves from school whenever they like and for whatever reason they like. While there are unavoidable reasons at times, such as ill health, playing truant is not made miraculously acceptable because people are protesting or marching for political goals.

It is not for nothing, Mr Speaker, that section 8(4) of the South African Schools Act states that nothing contained in the Act exempts a learner from the obligation to comply with the code of conduct of the school attended by such learner.

Should a learner deviate from the code of conduct it is therefore the obligation of the school to apply the relevant procedures related to the school's code of conduct and its learner attendance policy. Therefore, schools need to institute their own measures when dealing with learners who have absented themselves from school for whatever reason.

If the school system starts to differentiate truancy on the basis of the reason for the absence, it devalues the importance of school attendance. Schools make provision for a legitimate and confirmed absence, for example, illness or a family crisis. However, this legitimacy is not magically given, because the absence is based on a desire to protest or demonstrate.

Me J A VAN ZYL: Mnr die Speaker, ek weet nie hoeveel tyd die Minister wou gehad het nie. Hy het nie net twee weke gehad nie, maar vyf maande om met hierdie antwoord vorendag te kom.

Mnr die Speaker, op Vrydag, 9 November 2012, het die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Onderwys in 'n media berig gesê:

It was worried about the big absenteeism rate in De Doorns as a result of the farm workers' strike.

Dit kan nie net aanvaar word dat leerders wat afwesig was aan die protesoptog deelgeneem het nie, maar spesifiek by De Doorns was daar identifiseerbare gevalle. Gedurende die Staande Komitee van Onderwys se bespreking van die departement se jaarverslag op 16 November 2012, het ek aan die Minister en die HOD gevra wat die departement se optrede gaan wees teen leerders wat gedurende skoolure aan hierdie spesifieke protesoptogte deelgeneem het.

Geen aksies en/of planne is daarna bekend gemaak wat hierdie euwel sou aanspreek nie. Die identifikasie van leerders in hierdie spesifieke geval was baie maklik aangesien dit in 'n nuusinsetsel gebeeldsend was. Wat egter onaanvaarbaar is, is dat vakbondleiers toelaat dat leerders gedurende skoolure aan protesoptogte deelneem.

Die rigtinglose Minister van Basiese Onderwys, Angie Motshekga, hop van een skandaal na die ander terwyl leerders in Suid-Afrika uitgelewer is aan die stelsel van

ongedissiplineerdheid, disrespekvolle optredes, die laksheid van sommige onderwysers en 'n tekort aan basiese hulpmiddels soos teksboeke.

Herhaaldelike oproepe deur President Zuma dat onderwysers betyds moet aanmeld by skool en onderrig gee vir ten minste sewe uur per dag en dat leerders betyds moet wees, word nie deur die Minister of haar departement eerbiedig of uitgevoer nie.

Hierdie Minister en die departement in die Wes-Kaap moet optree om geld te bespaar op die vandalisme wat plaasvind gedurende protesoptogte waarin leerders deelneem, soos by die Dr Nelson Mandela Hoërskool in Crossroads.

Me C LABUSCHAGNE: Mnr die Speaker, wanneer dit kom by onderwys in die Wes-Kaap is dit ononderhandelbaar dat die beste belang van die kind die enigste oorweging moet wees wanneer besluite geneem of geïmplementeer word. Dit is die uitgangspunt van die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Onderwys en hierdie regering, en behoort die uitgangspunt te wees van elkeen wat optree in die onderwyssektor of dan in die belang van onderwys.

Die gevalle waar leerders betrokke was by protesoptogte en gewelddadige aksies oor die afgelope twee jaar is so kompleks soos wat hulle volop was. In die meeste gevalle word ons leerders opgesweep deur belangegroepe om die groep se doel te bevorder en dit het eintlik niks met die belang van die kind te doen nie.

Tony Ehrenreich se wekroep verlede jaar vir leerders en onderwysers om deel te neem aan 'n Cosatu-optog is 'n klinkklare bewys hiervan. Die aksies van onderwysvakbonde ontbloom

hulle dat hulle nie die belang van die kind of die stand van onderwys as 'n geheel wil bevorder nie, maar eintlik 'n organisasie is vir winsbejag en hul eie belange.

Die feit dat die vakbond self en die onderwysers wat aan die vakbond behoort, of die meeste van hulle, dan kan toelaat dat kinders betrokke raak by massa aksies en gewelddadige aksies is 'n bewys hiervan. Nog erger, die gedrag van onderwysers en unies wat veronderstel is om die rolmodelle vir ons jeug te wees, dra inderdaad die goedkeuring van aksies en gedrag, soos byvoorbeeld geweld tydens optogte, oor aan ons jeug. Hulle stel die voorbeeld. Op so 'n manier word dit aanvaarbare gedrag in ons samelewing en vir ons jeug as die opkomende generasie.

Mr Speaker, we cannot allow the rights that we have fought for so hard in our past to be misused today to infringe on our children's right to education. It is time that we accept the responsibilities that accompany our rights. It is time that the whole of society approach is also applied to education in the best interests of the child.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, the department supports the school in its application of the school's code of conduct. This could include the ratification of suspension as a sanction and exercising the HOD's right of expulsion as per the recommendation of the SGB. It also supports the school in many other professional ways when the learner persists in acting outside the code of conduct.

This may include counselling, interventions by the district and the provision of social services. However, in times of disruption or protest action outside a school or in a

community, we are also obligated to ensure that the school environment is secured and stabilised as far as possible so that teaching and learning can continue, where possible, and that the learners' day is not disrupted.

However, we are aware that there are circumstances that arise in communities that make it difficult to apply the standards or the process that I have described. For instance, the recent farm protests or service delivery protests – so-called – have placed children in a position where they are unable to attend or are prevented from attending school. These children are sometimes encouraged to take part in the protest action or are coerced to do so.

In these instances it is not always possible to apply the normal procedures. If, however, a learner chooses to miss school to take part in a protest march, or even just to go to a shopping mall, the normal processes apply and we will support schools as far as possible in this regard.

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, in 2012 Cosas had three official marches for which permission was granted; and Cosas being the learner movement that champions the right of disadvantaged learners, it is important to put the record straight that these marches took place on Friday afternoons after school hours. Furthermore, even the picket demonstrations done by Cosas – some for which permission was not received – took place after school hours.

Whilst individual members may have taken part, many of the picket demonstrations around the internal school processes, which took place inside school grounds during school hours, were not been done under the auspices of Cosas. Instead, Cosas was called upon by the learners to mediate during those picket demonstrations.

Whilst focusing on action taken against disadvantaged learners who have protested during school hours, MEC Grant's department and the government of Premier Zille have failed to focus on the underlying reasons as to why students are protesting. There is a crisis in the Education Department in the Western Cape under the DA.

The same energy that is used to focus on the protests should be utilised to address the poor school infrastructure, overcrowding at schools, textbook shortages, incompetent principals and a plethora of other failures of MEC Grant's department, which are at the core of learner grievances in the province.

Me J A VAN ZYL: Mnr die Speaker, hierdie Minister het die bevoegdheid, soos vervat in die Suid-Afrikaanse Skolewet 84 van 1996, asook die Wes-Kaapse Provinsiale Skoolonderrigwet 12 van 1997, om leerders in terme van wegbly en afwesigheid van skole aan te spreek.

Gedurende oorsigbesoeke aan skole erken skoolhoofde dat hierdie, asook ouerbetrokkenheid, 'n groot kopseer is waarvoor nog nie antwoorde en optrede gevind kon word nie. Gebruik die departement die wette as riglyne om daadwerklik op te tree? Dit blyk nie die geval te wees nie, gesien ook in die lig van die kommerwekkende hoë uitvalsyfer, die sogenaamde "drop-out rate". Die departement het 'n stelsel in plek waar daar op 'n daaglikse basis statistiek beskikbaar gemaak word met betrekking tot leerderafwesigheid by alle skole in die provinsie.

Mnr die Speaker, Cope wil dus 'n beroep doen op Premier Zille om 'n eenheid saam te stel bestaande uit kundiges, NROs, gemeenskapleiers, geestelike leiers, asook interdepartementeel, insluitende Onderwys, Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling, Gesondheid en Gemeenskapsveiligheid, om leerders wat gedurende skoolure doelloos in strate rondloop, en in enige ander plekke is behalwe by 'n kliniek of hospitaal, of soos vooraf met die betrokke skool gereël, insluitende protesaksies, sodanige omstandighede te ondersoek en op te tree binne die riglyne van genoemde wette.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, I just want to comment on the remarks the hon Tingwe made about "Cosas after school". If she reads the interpellation it is about "during school hours", so I am not going to say anything else further in that regard.

My concern about truant learners is that they are a safety risk for a number of reasons. The majority of truant learners are unsupervised. They are then vulnerable and could be placed at risk.

We also want to improve the lives of each and every learner in the province, and this begins with a quality education. To do this we need to ensure that learners are in the classroom utilising each and every minute of the school day. Truant learners miss valuable teaching and learning time, which will ultimately affect their academic performance.

We have repeatedly called on communities to assist us in reporting truant learners. Should a learner be absent from school, be it to take part in a protest or for recreation, then we encourage the public to contact any of our district offices or the Safe Schools Hotline on

0800454647 – or the school – to report truant learners. The school will deal with the learner or learners in terms of its code of conduct.

I want to advise the hon Van Zyl that I receive many phone calls during the day, through the Ministry, where children have been reported in various areas at various times, and we report this ourselves to Safe Schools and to the district truancy officers. We have some 23 safety field workers who provide the necessary support and guidance for learners and their families in dealing with truancy issues.

During the last year we have had three co-operative interventions in areas where there has been high truancy. This has not only encompassed the City of Cape Town, but it has also encompassed Minister Plato as well as Minister Fritz and, on one occasion, the Minister of Health as well – his officials – to get down to the root causes of why these children are not at school. So we are doing everything we can to ensure that our children are at school.

Medical students in Cuba

***3. Ms A J du Toit Marais to ask Mr T L Botha, Minister of Health:**

Whether his department supports the initiative in respect of South African medical students in Cuba; if so, why; if not, what is the alternative, if any?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon member for the question.

I discussed the initiative to recruit South African medical students for study in Cuba with the national Deputy Minister of Health, Dr Gwen Ramokgopa, who was tasked to be in charge of this project by the national Minister of Health.

In my interaction with her I requested her to tell me what the purpose of this programme is. Why does South Africa want to do this programme in Cuba? The official reply was that the purpose of this programme is to augment the training of health professionals for South Africa.

In that regard may I just mention that we in the Western Cape have only a 3,9% vacancy rate – that is a general vacancy rate, it might even be that we have less vacancies in health professionals themselves, but that is general vacancies in our department – whilst the general vacancy rate of medical staff in South Africa, in other provinces, exceeds 50%. So there is a huge difference in this regard. We respectfully declined the offer from the national department and did not participate in this Cuban programme.

After my alternative proposal to the national Deputy Minister as to what we were going to do to address her problem in augmenting the training platform and getting more health professionals trained, she actually endorsed what we were going to do and was very appreciative towards the Western Cape.

Mr Speaker, before I get to that issue, in terms of this programme students are required to relocate to Cuba, then they are required to learn Spanish, and they have to orientate in a foreign environment – that means the culture, the language and everything in that regard. This

requires an additional year over a very long training period – this is in addition to the medical curriculum that they have to follow. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, listen to this: In this programme students are only able to visit South Africa on two occasions during this seven-year period! I think that's truly inhumane to expect them to do that.

On completion of the Cuban programme each student is required to undergo, back in South Africa, another orientation programme to adapt to the South African health system at a South African health facility before they can graduate – before they can graduate – to begin to practise as a medical practitioner in South Africa. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister, please conclude.

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I have finished.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, the collaboration with Cuba forms part of the South African Government's drive to address a critical shortage of medical doctors in the country, particularly in the public health sector.

One of the main draw cards of Cuba's approach is its achievements in primary health care and proactive disease prevention in a country with a large rural population. As part of the new agreement, students would have to pay their own tuition fees, but the government would pay for students' other expenses such as airfares.

In July 2012, about 26 South African medical students studying in Cuba had to beg for food and accommodation at the South African Embassy there, after the troubled Limpopo Department of Health failed to pay for their flights back home. Why must the Limpopo Department of Health, which is a troubled department, pay for their air flights?

The Minister of Health ... [Interjections.] ... Aaron Motsoaledi said ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: The Minister of Health, Aaron Motsoaledi, said that it costs R750 000 to train a South African medical student in Cuba, but double that to train them here. Yet, with my research, at UCT Medical School, it costs approximately R760 000 to train a medical doctor. Accommodation and meals for all six years are included in this amount. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: There are also major differences between Cuba and South African medical schools. Medical universities in Cuba offer only one curriculum, while South African medical schools each have their own, with all having to meet requirements set out by the Health Professions Council of South Africa.

Cuban medical students are not allowed to even touch a patient until their sixth year of study, while South African students are allowed that level of interaction from their third year. The

Cuban approach is largely based on preventative care, which is medical doctor-based, while the South African system is largely based on the nursing profession.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The Western Cape government's refusal to give support, as per confirmation by the Minister, in respect of South African medical students in Cuba smacks of nothing else but a secessionist approach on the part of the DA. [Interjections.] This is no surprise at all. [Interjections.] If you had, you would really be creating an island in the Western Cape and not be part of the rest of South Africa. [Interjections.] You are objecting to anything and everything that the government wants. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order!

Mr M SKWATSHA: Listen to the hon Marais. She says that the Minister is actually the one who is lying. What is true is what she got at UCT. [Interjections.] The Western Cape is the only province in South Africa that does not support this initiative, and I guess all other provinces are just being led. [Interjections.]

Given the similarities between the NHI ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... and the Cuban health system, it makes sense for deserving students to pursue medical studies in Cuba, with the Cuban government funding it. That's the truth. The success of the Cuban health system is there for all to see.

Just mention one country that is better than Cuba in terms of its health system, a primary health care system, where people are able to say today that they were able to get rid of particular diseases. Most importantly, in a province where there is a shortage of black doctors from disadvantaged communities and many learners cannot afford the fees for medical studies, these bursaries should be something that is most welcome.

The MEC himself told the standing committee that there is natural shortage of black doctors in the Western Cape. At the same time, when refusing to engage in the standing committee on the topic, the MEC said ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Skwatsha!

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... that one of the reasons for the province denying our students this great opportunity is the fact that ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Skwatsha ...

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... there are very few vacancies for medical practitioners ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Skwatsha! Minister Botha, over to you.

Mr M SKWATSHA: My last sentence, sir.

The SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Botha. I tried to call you to order, but you didn't listen to me. Minister Botha, over to you. [Interjections.] Minister Botha, over to you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I'm sorry, Mr Speaker. Thank you very much. Mr Speaker, I mentioned that we found an alternative to the solution. The solution is that we need some doctors. Especially in the rural areas, there is a need for some doctors. The solution we found was to negotiate with our medical schools in the province. By the way, Mr Speaker, the deans of our medical schools are not in favour of this Cuban programme, as was reported by the national government and the national department. They have many reservations about this programme.

We negotiated with them additional opportunities, which our government will now engage, in finding students in rural areas. We have negotiated 13 for this coming year. We will find 13 candidates from the rural areas who will receive full bursaries from our government. [Interjections.] We won't send them away; they can go home every weekend. [Interjections.] They will get 100% bursaries. [Interjections.] No, I can't spell that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: That is our alternative. By doing that, we will address the direct problem where we have the shortfall and the shortage of students. That is in the Central Karoo, namely Laingsburg, Murraysburg, Prince Albert and Beaufort West; in Eden, namely Uniondale and Kannaland; on the West Coast, namely Saldanha Bay; in the Overberg, namely Cape

Agulhas, Theewaterskloof and Swellendam; and in the Cape Winelands, namely Langeberg, Witzenberg and Breede Valley.

By doing that, we will allocate the bursaries for their academic studies, and the province is well resourced in higher education institutions to deliver this service and therefore we do not need to send our students to another island, Cuba. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order! [Interjections.] Hon Skwatsha, order! Order, hon members, please!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, we in South Africa have a dire shortage of doctors, yet only 350 students have graduated via the Cuban training programme. [Interjections.] What happened to the others?

This leads to the other question: How effective is the Cuban training programme in reality? Is it also worth it ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Is it also worth it to spend R750 000 to train a South African medical student in Cuba? Hon Skwatsha, if the Cubans don't like their medical care, they will not say so as they will be locked up. [Interjections.]

We acknowledge the initiative in respect of recruiting South African students for the Cuba programme, ... [Interjections.] ... but respectfully declined the offer and did not participate in the programme. It is the Western Cape Department of Health's view that our institutions of higher education are saturated in the province at this time.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I want to conclude by saying that member Skwatsha – where is he now? – referred to the Western Cape ... [Interjections.] ... as an island. I want to remind him that Cuba is indeed an island and not the Western Cape. He said that this is compatible with our NHI. This is a very serious statement he made. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: I am very concerned. He said that our NHI which the national department envisaged and for which they are busy enrolling is compatible to a communist system. I think that is very dangerous, because do you know what that communist ... [Interjections.] Sit down! Sit down! Do you know what that communist system does, Mr Speaker? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: That communist system does the following. For instance, when you have HIV in Cuba you get locked up in a separate place. That is apartheid, my friend. [Interjections.] That is what you are supporting. [Interjections.] In other words, you want our patients ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Skwatsha! Order, hon Minister! Hon Skwatsha, take your seat, please.

The MINISTER: If you have HIV in Cuba you get separated and locked up. That is apartheid, and that is communism. That is why ... [Interjections.] In a communist country, and that is why ... [Interjections.] Tell me this: What is the real reason why South Africa is sending students to Cuba? The real reason is political. Maybe we don't have to go and look far for political reasons. [Interjections.] Your colleague, leader ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: Let us find out how many times your Comrade Fransman visited Cuba on this government's expense and how many times he brought Cuban cigars back instead of medical staff.

QUESTIONS

*Swartland regional shopping centre: Minister Bredell's powers
transferred to Minister Meyer*

***1. Mr P Uys to ask Ms H Zille, Premier:**

With reference to the Swartland regional shopping centre, why has she transferred the powers assigned to the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning of the Western Cape by the National Environmental Management Act, 1998 (Act no 107 of 1998), to the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, the reply is as follows:

1. The reason why I transferred Minister Bredell's powers to Minister Meyer was to ameliorate and possibly avert potential litigation relating to the Swartland regional shopping centre.

On 28 May 2008, the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning received an application for the proposed development of the Swartland regional shopping centre.

Three years later, on 3 August 2011, a certain Mr Rehrl lodged an appeal with Minister Bredell against the department's decision to refuse Environmental Authorisation for the proposed development of the Swartland regional shopping centre.

It is common knowledge that Minister Bredell's previous position was that of Mayor of Swartland Municipality. As such, he was involved in, and part of the Municipal Council that considered the development proposal. The appeal lodged with Minister Bredell specifically makes reference to utterances and, particularly, the endorsement decision by the Mayoral Committee of the proposed development application.

In its submission addressed to the Premier, the department justifiably expressed its concern that any appeal decision that will be made by Minister Bredell could be the subject of a potential review application in the Western Cape High Court on the basis of a perceived potential bias on the part of Minister Bredell.

The Department, on the advice of the Chief Directorate: Legal Services in the Department of the Premier, then recommended that the consideration of the appeal rather be reassigned to another Member of the Executive Council in the Western Cape, and all matters related thereto, in terms of section 137(b) of the Constitution and section 47(b) of the Western Cape Constitution.

On perusal and consideration of the department's submission, I approved the department's recommendation and, as I am empowered to do in terms of section 137(b) of the Constitution and section 47(b) of the Western Cape Constitution, I reassigned Minister Bredell's appeal functions in respect of the appeal relating to the proposed development and the consideration to Minister Meyer.

Mnr P UYS: Mnr die Speaker, kan ek vir die Premier vra wat die Burgemeesterskomitee se besluit was by die Swartland Munisipaliteit dat dit dan nou moontlik 'n konflik kon veroorsaak?

The PREMIER: It has nothing to do with the content of that decision. It has everything to do with the fact that Minister Bredell was part of one decision in his capacity as mayor and now

has to take a different authority's decision in relation to that previous decision, and obviously he cannot be a judge in a decision in which he had an interest. That is a conflict of interest in the process, irrespective of the substance.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, can the Premier just explain where this conflict will come in, because a municipality cannot take a decision in terms of environmental legislation only on planning legislation? Where is this conflict?

The PREMIER: It doesn't matter in terms of which process. Minister Bredell was part of one decision, in a municipality where he was the mayor, relating to a specific issue. He cannot in another capacity be part of reviewing the merits of a decision in an environmental context that he was part of taking previously. It's called conflict of interests and, in fact, the Legal Services Directorate advised me of such and I am not one to ignore their advice if it is rationally based, as this is.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, can the Premier tell us whether MEC Bredell has any interest in the shopping mall? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: The irony is that my removing this decision from Minister Bredell's jurisdiction is precisely to avoid any form of conflict of interest. I therefore have no idea what the answer is to that question, but can you imagine if I hadn't withdrawn this decision from

Minister Bredell's jurisdiction when he had a part in the decision-making in Swartland. Then he would have had a valid question to ask me. In this case you don't. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: This is your last chance, hon Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I just want to repeat my previous question because the Premier didn't answer it. They are two different pieces of legislation – planning and environment. How could there ever be a conflict? If the Premier is saying there is a conflict, it will be a conflict in all cases then, and this is definitely not a conflict. Just explain that, please, Premier.

The PREMIER: I really don't understand what the ...

Mr P UYS: [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Let me just explain that the hon Uys doesn't understand, because a number of decisions have to be taken in relation to whether or not a shopping centre may be built. Minister Bredell was part of one decision in one sphere of government. He is now asked to review an aspect pertaining to the building of that shopping centre in a different sphere of government. He cannot, in two different capacities where the whole purpose of the

Constitution is to have checks and balances, then be a judge in his own cause. That is a conflict of interest. I was advised to that effect by the Chief Directorate: Legal Services. I accepted that advice and that is why I appointed Minister Meyer.

Construction works on Hout Bay side of Chapman's Peak

2. Mr M G E Wiley to ask Mr R V Carlisle, Minister of Transport and Public Works:

- (a) What construction works, other than the toll booth construction by Entilini Concession (Pty) Ltd, are currently under way on the Hout Bay side of Chapman's Peak,
- (b) why is this construction necessary, (c) what is the (i) scope and (ii) value of these works and (d) when is the work due to be completed?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Wiley who asked the question. The answer is as follows:

- 2. (a) Slope stabilisation and rock fall protection measures over a distance of 600 m at the beginning of Chapman's Peak Drive on the Hout Bay side.
- (b) To stabilise the road cutting slopes and to prevent rock falls and debris spills onto the road.
- (c) (i) To construct gabion retaining structures, pin mesh and interceptor fences.

(ii) The value of the works is R15,1 million.

(d) The completion date is 9 April 2013.

Computer laboratory at Zwelihle Primary School, KwaNokuthula

3. Mr Z C Stali to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:

Whether it has been brought to his attention that the computer laboratory at the Zwelihle Primary School in KwaNokuthula in Hermanus has not been in operation for the past three years; if so, what steps have been taken by him or his department to address this situation; if not, what does he intend doing in this regard?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Stali for the question. The reply is as follows:

3. The school received a full and complete computer laboratory from the Khanya Project in 2011. The principal in the district confirmed that the laboratory is functional and has been so since it was set up. This was verified by the district as recently as Monday, 18 March 2013.

Schools in KwaNokuthula, Hermanus, levying school fees

4. Mr Z C Stali to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:

Whether there are any schools in KwaNokuthula in Hermanus that are still levying school fees; if so, (a) which schools and (b) what amounts are required by the schools in question as school fees?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Stali for this question as well. The reply is as follows:

4. Hermanus does not have an area called KwaNokuthula. I know one in Riversdale and one better in Plettenberg Bay. The township in Hermanus is called Zwelitsha.

There are three schools in Zwelitsha in Hermanus, namely Lukhanyo Primary School, Zwelitsha Primary School and Wahehe Secondary School. All three schools are no-fee schools and do not charge school fees.

Replacement of prefabricated classrooms, Grassy Park High School

5. Mr M Ozinsky to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:

- (a) What structures will replace the prefabricated classrooms at Grassy Park High School and (b) what is the policy of his department in this regard?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Ozinsky for the question.

The reply is as follows:

5. (a) The department has recently replaced six prefabricated units with mobile units, which will remain at the school until the school is replaced. We will replace some of the units with mobile classrooms because we would like to improve the learning conditions as far as possible until we are in a position to replace the whole school.

Replacing the school essentially means replacing with new brick and mortar structures old school buildings originally built with inappropriate materials. In most instances, the old structures are made from wooden or chipboard materials and were generally built during the apartheid era.

This government is currently trying to reduce the number of schools that have inappropriate structures. We therefore have a comprehensive replacement plan in place to try to address the backlog.

In the last three years, we have or are in the process of replacing 20 school structures. In the next three years, 46 schools are planned to be replaced. These will be funded through the WCED's infrastructure budget and the Accelerated School Infrastructure Development Initiative Programme.

Grassy Park High School is not on the infrastructure plan for replacement in this MTEF period, that is the 2013-14 to 2015-16 period. However, the district has indicated the need for the school to be replaced. This is being considered for replacement in the 2016-17 financial year.

- (b) Using our Geographic Information System and information obtained from the districts, we are able to ascertain which school buildings are in dire need of replacement.

The new GIS for infrastructure planning uses this base information, the utilisation levels of schools depicted geographically. In addition to this base information, it includes schools' specific data such as learner enrolment levels and trends, the actual and required size of school facilities, whether schools operate from leased premises or are built with inappropriate materials.

The new GIS, which is available and operational for all our districts, has provided us with better opportunity than before to interrogate and diagnose systemically school provisioning issues that may require investigative planning and delivery attention in the Western Cape.

With information obtained from the districts and the GIS, we are then able to determine which schools should be prioritised for replacement.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, given that long explanation, which doesn't explain any policy, could the hon MEC please tell the House whether he agrees with his Superintendent-General who told Scopa that it's the policy of the department not to replace prefabricated buildings with prefabricated buildings?

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I was of the impression that prefabricated buildings, the new mobiles, are temporary – that’s what I said in my reply to you – until we build a replacement school.

Mr M OZINSKY: Honestly, Mr Speaker, it’s difficult to understand when an official tells Scopa the policy is not to replace prefabricated buildings with prefabricated buildings and you know that is exactly what is happening in Grassy Park.

The SPEAKER: Order! What is the question, hon Ozinsky?

Mr M OZINSKY: My question is simply this: Why was it not possible to replace the prefabricated buildings with brick buildings and keep the existing brick structure for the rest of the school, which is what the school had requested?

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I can only speculate as to that answer, but I would guess that it was because of the time and budget considerations.

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon MEC, is it not unfair, then, for the school that you replace prefabricated buildings with prefabricated buildings and, in effect, the school now goes to the back of the queue in terms of the process. [Interjections.] Yes, exactly. It’s not budgeted for. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, the answer to that is very simple. In my previous longwinded answer that the hon member Ozinsky refers to, I spoke about prioritisation. There are many needs across all of our districts and circuits and these are prioritised based on the data that we have at hand.

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon MEC, if you talk about prioritisation, can I go and tell the headmistress of that school that the school will be getting new buildings in the 2016-17 financial year, as you said?

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, what I told the hon member ... [Interjections.] ...

Mr M OZINSKY: You said no.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: ... is that it is not budgeted for in the next MTEF, and whoever is in government after May 2014 will be able to answer that question.

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: Let me talk to the hon member. I just want to let the House know that as far as I am aware, the ANC replaced only 11 schools between 2004 and 2009. [Interjections.] I want to ask why the ANC did not invest in replacing such schools under their administration?

Mr M OZINSKY: Why can't you do it now? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: If they had we would not be sitting with a backlog, Mr Speaker, of over 200 schools. [Interjections.] All we are doing is our best to eradicate the backlog we've inherited. It seems to me like the obvious infrastructure investment, hence we accelerated the need to address the replacement needs of these schools. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Ozinsky, hon Magwaza and hon members, order! [Interjections.] Hon Minister, order!

Qualifications of the acting Head of Department of Social Development

6. Mr M Ozinsky to ask Mr A T Fritz, Minister of Social Development:

What qualifications does a certain person, whose name has been furnished to his department for the purpose of his reply, possess to be appointed as acting Head of the Department of Social Development?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, I would like to say salam alaikum to the guests in the gallery. [Interjections.] Shukran.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: Is the hon MEC allowed to address the gallery? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: It's a courtesy, man.

The SPEAKER: He was just greeting the gallery. He didn't address it. Please reply to the question, hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: It's good manners.

The MINISTER: It's good manners, yes. I want to thank hon Ozinsky for his question. I think it's a very important question. The reply is as follows:

6. The Acting Head of the Department of Social Development, Dr Robert McDonald, possesses a Doctor of Philosophy in Social Science, he has a Masters of Arts in English Language and Literature with distinction, a Bachelor of Arts Honours in English with distinction, a Bachelor of Arts majoring in English and Art History with distinction and a National Diploma in Fine Arts.

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon MEC, what would the message be to those experienced members of staff who have worked for many years in Social Development and who don't have qualifications in art but have qualifications in social development? What is the message that you are sending to them about this appointment?

The MINISTER: I think that's an absolutely excellent ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Can I just answer the question?

The SPEAKER: Yes, please, Minister.

The MINISTER: I think that's a brilliant response and I'll tell you why it's a brilliant response. [Interjections.] Hon Ozinsky, the precedent was set by you people before you appointed principals of schools to Social Development. That's why the department was collapsing and we have to fix it. [Interjections.] Yes, a whole lot of school principals were appointed there and we now have to clean it up. I really thank you for that. I think the notion is far broader than what you think. I think the Acting HOD is excellent and I think you know that.

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon MEC, you told us that the actual HOD is excellent, but he has no qualifications in social development. He comes from the City and he's no longer available.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Put the question. It's management.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The Acting HOD?

Mr M OZINSKY: No, the actual HOD, okay. [Interjections.] No, he's asking me. He's trying to get clarification on that.

The SPEAKER: Pose your question, hon member.

Ms NP MAGWAZA: It's the DA's thinking.

Mr M OZINSKY: Why should we not believe that both Mr Richardson's and Mr McDonald's appointments are simply cadre deployments ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Yes. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: ... by cadres of the DA from the City of Cape Town? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER: I must say the first part of your question is a different question. I think we're dealing with Mr Richardson. You once said to me in the House please move the man to finance. Now, I don't know, you say one thing, but you don't really know what you're asking for. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Last chance, hon Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon Minister Fritz, be open with the House: Have you moved Mr Richardson because he's not appropriate for the department?

The MINISTER: It's a different question. The question I was asked is what is the qualifications of my Acting Head of Department. There's another question where you will have ample opportunity for follow-up questions.

Mr M OZINSKY: Okay.

Assistance to Afrikaans-speaking learners from Du Noon with Afrikaans classes

7. Ms J A van Zyl to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:

Whether his department is considering assisting Afrikaans-speaking learners from the community of Du Noon with Afrikaans classes at the local school; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Van Zyl for the question.

The reply is as follows:

7. There has been a recent demand for Afrikaans medium for primary school learners. The two primary schools in Du Noon are oversubscribed and cannot accommodate an Afrikaans-medium instruction class. The only immediate solution is to transport the learners to schools offering Afrikaans-medium instruction.

Four hundred and seventeen Afrikaans-speaking learners from Du Noon in Grades R to 7 are being transported and accommodated at Vissershok Primary School; and then Grade

8 and 9 learners are being transported and accommodated at Alpha Primary School in Durbanville.

Table View Primary School also offers Afrikaans-medium instruction. These classes are smaller than the English-medium classes due to a lack of applications.

Persoon uit pos verskuif

8. Me J A van Zyl vra mnr T A Fritz, Minister van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling:

(1) (a) (i) Wanneer en (ii) waarom 'n sekere persoon, wie se naam vir die doel van die Minister se antwoord aan sy departement verstrekkend is, uit sy pos verskuif is en (b) waarheen dié persoon verskuif is;

(2) of hierdie posisie geadverteer is; so nie, waarom nie; so ja, wat die tersaaklike besonderhede is?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, the reply to the first part of the question is:

8. (1) (a) (i) At the end of December 2012.

(ii) There reasons were plain, and I hope the hon Ozinsky is here. It was incompatibility in style and direction between the HOD and the Executive, and that's putting it frankly. This has no inference on anybody's capabilities or lack of capabilities. I've just got to make that point.

(b) The official was moved to the position of Deputy Director-General in the Premier's Office.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Skwatsha and hon Uys! Your conversation is too loud.

The MINISTER: The reply to the last part of the question is:

(2) No, the position has not been advertised; I am busy talking to the Director-General and HR regarding that.

Me J A VAN ZYL: Mnr die Speaker, sou die Minister dan sê dat hierdie aanstelling van hierdie persoon nie "fit for purpose" was nie daar hulle na die tyd uitgevind het dat hy nie sy werk in hierdie departement kan doen nie?

Die MINISTER: Mnr die Speaker, ek dink ek het beklemtoon dat die hele kwessie gaan oor styl en, soos hulle in Engels sê, "compatibility". Ek dink dit moet daar wees. Ek dink dit is die punt en dit is die rede waarom daar gepraat is oor die hele situasie en die persoon verskuif is.

Me J A VAN ZYL: Was daar enige ander aansoeke vir hierdie pos gewees, en hoe is die keuring van hierdie kandidate gedoen?

The MINISTER: Are you talking about earlier now with the appointment? [Interjections.] Yes, we had a lot of other people, we went through the whole screening process, and we had the whole issue regarding interviews, the normal recruitment process. We couldn't find anyone suitable at the time.

The Department of Social Development is an incredibly unique department. I think Ms Magwaza will really support me in saying this. [Interjections.] It is such an incredibly unique department. [Interjections.] One wonders and wishes sometimes that when you interview people you will be able to see this or that about the person. I am again saying: In this case it was genuinely style and compatibility, and that is the issue.

The SPEAKER: Last chance, hon Marais.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Dankie, mnr die Speaker. Ek wil weet wat die proses was ten opsigte van hierdie persoon se verskuiwing.

The MINISTER: I think that is a very important point because the process is always important. I discussed my issues with the Premier. At the end it was my decision and the Premier confirmed that we could go ahead with that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Is it you, hon Ozinsky? That is the last chance. That is the fourth one.

Mr M OZINSKY: Thank you for your indulgence, Mr Speaker. I want to ask you, MEC: What was the formal process that was followed to remove Mr Richardson and then to place him where he is placed now?

The MINISTER: I discussed it, as I said, with the Premier. We had the whole process of sitting around the table and so on. [Interjections.] No, this is the point, but in the end it was my decision personally. It was just, as I said, incompatibility, but the process was there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry, hon Bevu. That was the last chance; that was the fourth follow-up question. I cannot allow you to put another question now.

IRT system: processing of permits for smaller buses

***9. Ms A Rossouw to ask Mr R V Carlisle, Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether his department has received any applications for the processing of permits for the smaller busses that have been purchased for the integrated rapid transport system; if so, what progress has been made with this process?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Rossouw for the question. The reply is as follows:

9. The Provincial Regulatory Entity (PRE) has received a total of 186 applications from vehicle-operating companies providing MyCiTi services in the Blaauwberg and inner city areas. These applications are all for the smaller so-called Optare buses.

Vehicle-operating companies applied for non-contracted scheduled bus services and all applications were published in the *Government Gazette* to allow interested and affected parties the opportunity to submit comments and representations in relation to the applications.

The applications were also referred to the City of Cape Town for directions in terms of its integrated transport plan. Four objections were received from interested parties in relation to the applications. They included Golden Arrow Bus Service and three taxi associations operating on the main road in those areas.

Public hearings took place on 4, 5 and 6 February 2013. The PRE has now taken the decision to grant the following applications to: Kidrogen (Pty) Ltd, 74 applications granted and 17 licences so far uplifted; Trans Peninsula (Pty) Ltd, 96 applications granted and 16 operating licences uplifted; Golden Arrow Bus Services, 16 applications granted and none yet uplifted. A total of 186 applications have been granted.

Subsequent to the issuance of the operating licences, the City has launched the new Salt River/Walmer Estate/Cape Town MyCiTi route. Vehicle-operating companies have also received service notices to replace 12-metre buses currently used to provide services on

the Table View feeder routes with smaller Optare buses by Saturday, 16 March. The bigger vehicles will then be used to provide MyCiTi services on the trunk routes.

Rassistiese uitlatings: stappe teenoor raadslid

10. Mnr P Uys vra mnr A W Bredell, Minister van Plaaslike Regering, Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning:

Of enige stappe teen 'n sekere raadslid, wie se naam vir die doel van die Minister se antwoord aan sy departement verstrek is, gedoen is nadat dié raadslid rassistiese uitlatings gemaak het; so nie, waarom nie; so ja, wat die stappe is?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMHEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, ek bedank die agb lid vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

10. Die Raad van die Mosselbaai Munisipaliteit op 'n raadsvergadering van 25 Oktober 2012, na oorweging van die dissiplinêre komitee se verslag gedateer 28 September 2012, het raadslid Moodie met 'n bedrag van R10 000 beboet en versoek dat sy 'n openbare verskoning aanbied.

Die raadslid het geappelleer teen die besluit van die Mosselbaai Raad op 24 Oktober 2012.

Na deeglike oorweging van al die dokumente het ek beslis om die besluit van die Mosselbaai Raad te bekragtig en dus die appèl van die raadslid verwerp.

Mnr P UYS: Mnr die Speaker, kan die LUR vir ons verduidelik of die raadslid toe dienooreenkomstig die R10 000 boete betaal het?

Die MINISTER: Mnr die Speaker, nee, ek is nie bewus daarvan nie. Ons kan die raad nader en uitvra. Dit was haar straf en ek het die appèl gehandhaaf, so ek neem aan die raad is besig met die proses om die geld van haar te verhaal, maar dit is 'n aanneming. As dit die agb Uys behaag, sal ek die raad nader en vra of sy die geld al terugbetaal het.

Mnr P UYS: Mnr die Speaker, beskou die LUR dit as voldoende optrede teen 'n raadslid wat so 'n ernstige rassistiese uitlating gemaak het by die Mosselbaai Munisipaliteit?

Die MINISTER: Mnr die Speaker, ons bestuur die wetgewende raamwerk waarbinne ons opereer. Ek het nie die mag om 'n straf te vergroot of te versag nie. Ek het net die mag om toe te stem daartoe of dit heeltemal van die hand te wys. Dit is wat ek as LUR kan doen, maar ek kan vir u sê dat die DA hierdie klag as ernstig beskou en dat die DA, as 'n party, ook 'n dissiplinêre proses begin het teen die persoon. Ek dink nie dit is gepas dat ek daardie proses se uitkoms tans gee nie want ek moet dit nog na my provinsiale Uitvoerende Komitee toe neem.

Chronic dispensing unit

***11. Ms A J du Toit Marais to ask Mr T L Botha, Minister of Health:**

How (a) is the chronic dispensing unit (CDU) in the Western Cape currently administered and (b) does it function and (c) is it being developed?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, the reply to the question is as follows:

11. (a)-(c) Since September 2012 the chronic dispensing unit (CDU) services have stabilised in the metro. The services have now expanded to include ARVs and alternate site deliveries. These are in line with the change in the department's operational needs to enhance the patient experience. Alternate sites, such as old-age homes, are used to reduce patient waiting times and to alleviate the service bottlenecks experienced at pharmacy service points, continuously improving on the quality of care to our patients. A total of 6,06% of all patient medicine parcel deliveries in the metro are already at alternate site deliveries.

The CDU services were expanded during the festive period in December by the dispensing of four months' ARVS for patients and for migrant workers that may leave the province for their end-of-year breaks. In the past it was a shorter period. We did that over a four-month period for their convenience so as not to revisit facilities and to assist them while they were absent or away. This enabled their uninterrupted care by making adequate medicine supplies available to them. Other

patients received a month's supply of medicines in preparation for the festive season to see them through the usual break that they take during this period.

The CDU is to be rolled out and expanded to all rural districts – and this is very important – in the 2013-14 financial year, commencing with the West Coast District in March 2013. By the end of the calendar year it is planned to have completed the CDU rollout in the province as per the concluded service level agreement with the service provider. There appears to be an organic growth of the CDU services within the existing service that we have provided. Where a year ago we had 160 000 prescriptions dealt with at this institution we are now at 189 000. If I remember correctly, in 2009 when we took over there were just about 120 000. So, it is a significant improvement but with the roll-out now to the rest of the province, which started this month, to the rural districts it will obviously make a huge difference and it will be a very positive patient experience.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Minister, is u van mening dat die huidige diensverskaffer oor die nodige kapasiteit beskik om 'n volhoubare diens te lewer?

Die MINISTER: Mnr die Speaker, baie dankie aan die lid vir die vraag. Die huidige verskaffer, ten spyte van die groeiprobleme wat ons gehad het en die implementering van die stelsel van die een verskaffer na die ander en die probleme aan die begin, is al die probleme nou uitgesorteer en vaar die verskaffer nou baie goed.

Die verskaffer is 'n reuse internasionale instelling. Dit is 'n baie, baie groot kontrak en ons glo dat hulle beskik oor al die middele in hul mondering om vir ons hierdie diens te lewer en uit te brei. Dit was baie moeilik gewees om 'n verskaffer te kry, nie net om oor te neem wat daar is nie, maar om dit uit te brei oor die hele provinsie soos wat ons dit uiteindelik wil hê, waar ons uiteindelik die hele provinsie se kroniese medikasie dek met gesentraliseerde aflewering by adresse wat gerieflik is vir ons pasiënte sodat hulle nie meer onnodig fasiliteite hoof te besoek nie.

Dit gaan 'n geweldige lading wegneem van ons primêre gesondheidsfasiliteite was sal maak dat ons diens ook daar aan diegene wat dan daar is baie sal verbeter.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, in the light of the problems that had been encountered in the past in relation to the chronic dispensary unit, the Minister seems to be confident now that ...

The MINISTER: What is the question?

Mnr P UYS: Hy's nie bang nie.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Just to further improve, has the Minister looked at the experience of the chronic dispensary unit in Cuba? [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, no, I haven't looked at the Cuban model but, as far as I know, Cuba hasn't got such a model. I may be wrong, and we haven't investigated it, but I'm told that it's a very unique system worldwide that I've inherited in its smaller format and which we are now expanding.

I can only imagine, Mr Speaker, that if you used the Cuban model where you separate patients with HIV and put them away so that no one can find or see or touch them, you have to deliver medicine to them.

The SPEAKER: It's your last chance, hon Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: No, I only asked one question.

An HON MEMBER: Cuba is a small island.

The SPEAKER: This is your chance to ask a second question and due to the time, hon Skwatsha, we will allow you to do that. It is up to the Speaker. [Interjections.] You can pose your question.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I still have two.

The SPEAKER: Pose the question.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I wanted to know whether the Minister would not be interested because the chronic dispensary unit in Cuba is also regarded as one of the best in the world ... [Interjections.] ... in spite of the serious allegations ... [Interjections.] ... the Minister makes about ...

The MINISTER: What's the question?

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... cigars in Cuba.

The SPEAKER: What's the question, hon member?

Mr M SKWATSHA: I have asked the question.

An HON MEMBER: What is it? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Do you follow the question, hon Minister Botha? [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: I also want to know if the Minister can tell me whether he can repeat the allegations about cigars outside the House.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, I'll say it right there.

An HON MEMBER: Not you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, it's a very, very, very ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister Carlisle! Order!

The MINISTER: It's a very important question coming from my colleague, hon Skwatsha. I was not aware of the Cuban system which is so excellent ...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Let me say that if the system is as good as the Cuban cigars, then it must be a very good system.

Regarding the Cuban cigars, I am prepared to repeat outside of the House that when I took office, on the floor my Ministry is on we found a room that was locked. When we opened the room we found thousands of unmarked Cuban cigars.

An HON MEMBER: Tax evasion.

The MINISTER: The previous Minister of Health was your comrade, the provincial leader and Deputy Minister, Marius Fransman.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You're getting the language right, comrade leader.

Matters pertaining to vacant posts in the Department of Health

12. Ms A J du Toit Marais to ask Mr T L Botha, Minister of Health:

What was the rate in respect of vacant posts in his department as at the latest specified date for which information is available?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon member for the question regarding the vacancies in our department. The reply is as follows:

12. The current vacancy rate for health is 4,12%. We have 31 672 funded posts in the department, of which 30 366 are filled and 1 306 posts are vacant. Of the 1 306 vacant posts, 414 posts are in the nursing group and 562 in the group staff excluded from OSDs, which represents 1,31%, and 1,77% of the 4,12%.

I may also mention, Mr Speaker that it is by far the lowest vacancy rate in the country. As I've mentioned, the average vacancy rate of medical staff in South Africa is about 50% – just over or just under – but in our province it's 4,12%. Then I can also add, Mr Speaker, that we have added more than 3 000 new staff members since we took office in 2009.

Measures against traders who force pensioners

to spend their grants at their enterprises

13. Ms J L Hartnick to ask Mr A T Fritz, Minister of Social Development:

Whether his department has any measures in place against traders who are forcing pensioners to spend a part of their grants at such enterprises; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, the reply to the question is as follows:

13. No. It's not my competency, it's Sassa's.

Measure to counter the registration of the name "rooibos" in France.

14. Mr M C Walters to ask Mr H G van Rensburg, Minister of Agriculture:

- (1) What is his department doing to counter the reported attempts by French interest to register exclusive rights to the name "rooibos" in France;
- (2) whether, in this regard, there is a level of co-operation with the Departments of Trade and Industry and of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries in the national sphere that is being undertaken by his department; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker, die antwoord is soos volg:

14. (1) en (2) Dié van u wat redelik lank hier is, sal onthou toe ek in 1999 hier gekom het, het ek beseef dat ons name soos “rooibostee” moet beskerm. Ek het dan ook in 2000 gekom met konsepwetgewing om produkte wat uniek is aan ons plaaslike omgewing, soos rooibos, te beskerm. Ek kon egter nie daarin slaag nie want die nasionale regering het die grondwetlikheid van hierdie benadering uitgedaag.

Intussen het hulle niks daaraan gedoen nie en het die Franse maatskappy, Compagnie de Trucy, verlede jaar gevra om die naam “rooibos” by hulle te registreer. Ons het die rooibosbedryf gehelp in hul beswaar. Intussen het ons ook geskakel met die Departement van Handel en Nywerheid en met die Departement van Landbou en ons het vir hulle gevra of hulle nie asseblief die Wet op Produkstandaarde kan gebruik om die rooibosnaam te beskerm nie. Dan het ek self ook met die Europese ambassadeur gepraat en hom gevra om ons te help dat ons rooibos, wat eg Suid-Afrikaans is, vir die Suid-Afrikaanse mark kan behou.

Sake aangaande die Ouditeur-Generaal se verslag

oor die Munisipaliteit Cederberg

15. Mnr H P Geyer vra mnr A W Bredell, Minister van Plaaslike Regering, Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning:

Of die verslag van die Ouditeur-Generaal oor die Munisipaliteit Cederberg in sy besit is; so ja, watter meganisme bestaan wat hom in staat stel om sy oorsigrol oor munisipaliteite

in die Wes-Kaap uit te voer ten einde behoorlike dienslewering aan belastingbetalers te bewerkstellig?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, ek bedank die agb lid vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

15. Nee, die verslag van die Ouditeur-generaal ten opsigte van die Cederberg Munisipaliteit vir die 2011-12-boekjaar is nog nie beskikbaar nie en derhalwe nie in my besit nie. Dit word verstaan dat die Ouditeur-generaal wel 'n bestuursbrief wat die auditverslag voorafgaan aan die munisipaliteit beskikbaar gemaak het.

Met inagneming van my moniterings- en ondersteuningsrol ingevolge die Grondwet, het ek die Uitvoerende Burgemeester onlangs versoek om my van 'n afskrif van sodanige bestuursbrief te voorsien ten einde my in staat te stel om te bepaal welke bystand deur my en my Departement van Plaaslike Regering verleen kan word.

Een van die meganismes wat aangewend word om uitvoering te gee aan die provinsiale oorsigrol is die assessering van munisipale auditverslae tesame met munisipaliteite se reaksie op die tekortkominge soos deur die Ouditeur-generaal uitgewys. Laasgenoemde is 'n vereiste van die Plaaslike Regering: Munisipale Finansiële Bestuurswet. Hierdie funksie word gesamentlik deur die Departement van Plaaslike Regering en die Provinsiale Tesourie uitgevoer.

Mnr H P GEYER: Mnr die Speaker, ek wil vir die agb Minister vra of dit korrek is dat die Ouditeur-generaal 'n voorlopige ouditverslag deurstuur. Is daar nie 'n gevaar daarin dat wanneer die finale verslag deurkom dit 'n probleem kan veroorsaak nie?

Die MINISTER: Mnr die Speaker, ja, ek het altyd 'n probleem daarmee dat ons met die terme "draft"-verslae" of "nie-finale verslae" begin werk, want met hierdie verslae kan ons besluite neem wat mense se lewens vernietig, en dit kan nogal problematies wees. Hierdie verslae lek uit en kom in die openbare domein en dan word mense skuldig bevind voordat hulle die regmatige geleentheid gekry het om hulself te verdedig. Dus het ek 'n geweldige probleem daarmee.

Dit het ook met hierdie tipe verslag gebeur dat dit uitgelek het, en ek neem aan dit is waarom die vraag gevra is. Ek weet die munisipaliteit is besig met die Ouditeur-generaal se kantoor want die verslag het nie tussen politieke partye uitgelek nie; die Ouditeur-generaal het hierdie verslag aan die Openbare Vervolger beskikbaar gestel. Nou is daar 'n redelike koppestamp en vraagteken oor die pad vorentoe.

Ek dink in ons oorsigrol oor die lang termyn is dit baie belangrik dat ons finaliteit kry oor die definisie en die magte van "oorsig". Ek dink dit kan ons in die toekoms help, maar ek is nie 'n voorstander daarvan dat ons op tydelike verslae werk nie.

Mnr H P GEYER: Mnr die Speaker, dit is duidelik dat die Minister sukkel om sy hand daarop te lê. Is die Minister bewus dat die Ouditkomitee van Cederberg die verslag gister met die Burgemeester en die Munisipale Bestuurder bespreek het?

Die MINISTER: Nee, ek is nie bewus daarvan dat hulle dit bespreek het nie. Ek het dit op skrif aan die Burgemeester gestel dat ek bewus is van die probleme in Cederberg en gevra of hulle dit dalk goed sal ag om hierdie verslag aan my bekend te maak sodat ek kan bepaal waarvandaan die ondersteunings moet kom en wie die munisipaliteit kan ondersteun en ook sodat ek kan sien of daar enige hulpbronne is waarmee ons hulle kan ondersteun.

Ek het 'n kort brief teruggekry, wat daarop dui dat dit 'n tydelike verslag is en dat hulle dit nie aan my beskikbaar gaan stel nie. Dit help nie ek, as Minister, volg dit verder op nie, want dan gaan ons op die ou einde in 'n hof staan en dan gaan hulle vir my sê ek werk op 'n onwettige verslag. So ek gaan nou maar geduldig wees en wag vir die finale verslag en dan sal ons daarmee werk.

Ek kan die Huis verseker, mnr die Speaker, dat die prosesse baie lank is in plaaslike regering. Die wettiese prosesse is baie kompleks en baie lank, tot ons almal se frustrasies, maar mense moet weet dat as jy verkeerd optree, gaan die wet jou inhaal. Dit gaan lank neem, maar ons gaan by jou uitkom.

Matters pertaining to the backlog of toilets in the Western Cape

16. Mr A M Figlan to ask Mr B S Madikizela, Minister of Human Settlements:

- (1) (a) What was the backlog in the Western Cape in respect of toilets operating on a running water system as at the latest specified date for which information is

available, (b) what (i) is the background to and (ii) are the reasons for the backlog, (c) how many people in our province still have to make use of the bucket toilet system and (d) what measures are being taken to address the issue;

- (2) whether there are any places in our province where it is not possible to introduce the running water system; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, the reply is as follows:

16. (1) (a) and (b) According to the sources at our disposal, 106 235 families in the Western Cape do not receive the minimum acceptable level of sanitation, according to a prescribed national norm of 1 toilet per 5 families, at January 2012.

(c) The 2011 Census figures showed that there were 59 931 families who made use of various forms of toilet systems.

(d) The department has taken steps to address the problem by embarking on an access to basic services programme which is aimed at improving the level of sanitation service provided in the province, to meet the national norm of five families per toilet, especially in informal areas, by 2014.

- (2) There are areas in the province where it is not possible to provide waterborne sanitation to everyone. These areas include informal settlements where current densities are too high to allow for construction. In some areas there is adequate bulk

infrastructure. As we know, the backlog in infrastructure in the province is more than R20 billion, as we speak. Also, we cannot spend public money on the pieces of land that are privately owned.

Mnu A M FIGLAN: Somlomo Enkosi Mphathiswa bendifuna ukuqonda nje ipesenti yabantu abasasebenzisa amabhakethi njengegumbi langasese apha eNtshona Koloni, ingaba ithini na?

UMPHATHISWA: Besele ndilichazile inani mhlekazi, mandiyiphinde ziintsapho ezinga 106 235. Okkoqala ezisahlala kwiindawo apho zingafumani iinkonzo ngokwamkelekileyo ngokwemigaqo yokuhlala koluntu kodwa ke ngokwamanani eStats SA ziintsapho ezinga 59 931 ezisebenzisa inkqubo yamabhakethi kodwa ke mandithi ezinye zesystem ezibizwa ngenkqubo yamabhakethi aziyonkqubo yamabhakethi ngokwenyani kodwa ziintlobo ezahlukahlukeneyo zokusetyenziselwa ilindle ezikwafana nenkqubo yebhakethi, igumbi langasese eligronjelwe emhlabeni neVIP nezinye.

Mnu A M FIGLAN: Uzakundixelela ipesenti kodwa ke kusalungile, bendifuna ukuqonda ke ngoku Mphathiswa intokuba ngo2014 ingabe sakube sohlukene na nenkqubo yokusebenzisa ibhakethi nengegumbi langasese, sizakuwufumana laa mngomo zizibekele wona wokuba iphele inkqubo yamabhakethi ngo 2014?

MPHATHISWA: Enye yezinto ekufaneleke intokuba siyiqonde nebangela ukuba kubekho uxinzelelo, ndiqinisekile ilungu uFiglan unokukwazi ukuba eli Phondo ukusukela ngo 2001 ukuya ku 2011 ikhule ngomyinge ongangange 30%. Ngoku ke ukuba ngaba uyayiqonda imeko yabantu abeza eNtshona Koloni ngabantu abeza bezokukhangela amathuba

emisebenzi, bafike ke bahlale kwiindawo apho kungekho khona iinkonzo. Ngoku andikwazi kuqiniseka ndithi izakube ingekho inkqubo yokusetyenziswa kwamabhakethi. Kwinani elikhona ngoku sicingba ngo 2014 ngokwenani elikhoyo ngoku abe akekho umntu osebenzisa inkqubo yamabhakethi kodwa ke eyona nto ndingazukwazi ukuyithetha kukuba akukho mntu uzakube engasebenzi nkqubo yebhakethi ngoba yonke imihla abantu beza apha eNtshona Koloni bafike bahlale apho kungekho khona iinkonzo. Ingxaki kukuba ukuze abantu basebenzise izindlu zangasese ezinamanzi zale mihla kufuneka sakhe. Njengokuba sisalele ngasemva kulwakhiwo ibangela loo nto ukuba ingxaki ibenkulu kakhulu.

Mnu K E MAGAXA: Mphathiswa, Ingaba uyayiqaphela intokubana xa kunxulumananiswa norhulumente wangaphambili nihamba ngonyawo lonwabu?

MPHATHISWA: Masingadibanisi izinto ezingadibaniyo ngoba apha sithetha ngokusiwa kweenkonzo ngokwemigaqo yeenkonzo ezisisiseko. Xa ujonge ipesenti noxa kusekho iindawo ezisasebenzisa inkqubo yangasese yamabhakethi xa ujonge ipesenti yabantu abazifumanayo iinkonzo, eli phondo lizinkqenqezela lodwa ngokwamanani akhoyo. Kanganga 91% yabantu apha bayafikelela kwiinkonzo zokuthuthwa kwelindle ngaphezu kwalo naliphi na elinye iphondo. Noxa zisekhona iindawo ezinengxaki kodwa ke ayiyonyani intokuba sisilele ngasemva ngoba senza ngcono kakhulu kunamanye amaphondo.

Mnu K E MAGAXA: Bendicela ke usenzele into ebonisa ukuba le nto uyithethayo yinyani ukusukela ngonyaka ka 2004 ukuya ku 2009 nokusuka ku 2009 ukuza apho sime khona.

UMPHATHISWA: Ndicinga ukuba olu lwazi aluyomfihlo eluntwini luyaziwa andazi ke mhlekazi noba ufuna ndimenzele umsebenzi wakhe na kodwa ke ndizakumnika olu lwazi ngoba lulazwi olusoloko lufumaneka. Nolwazi lwakutshanje IweStats SA ngokwemigaqo yamaphondo afikelela kwiinkonzo ezingundonqo, olu lwazi lupha. Ndizakukhangelela ndikunike ukuba awukwazi kuyenza wena loo nto.

The SPEAKER: Order! It was the last chance, hon members, for both of you. There were four follow-up questions: Two from hon Figlan and two from hon Magaxa. Thank you very much.

Sake aangaande munisipale howe

17. Mnr J J Visser vra mnr A W Bredell, Minister van Plaaslike Regering, Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning:

- (1) (a) Hoeveel munisipale howe daar tans in die Wes-Kaap is en (b) wat die funksie van munisipale howe is;
- (2) of sy departement 'n rol speel ten opsigte van dié howe; so nie, waarom nie; so ja, wat die tersaaklike besonderhede is?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, ek bedank die agb lid vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

17. (1) (a) Daar is 11 munisipale howe in die Wes-Kaap. Tien munisipale howe is geormerk vir die Stad Kaapstad en een vir die Mosselbaai Munisipaliteit.

(b) Munisipale howe handel hoofsaaklik met die vervolging van verkeersoortredings en oortredings ingevolge die munisipale verordeninge soos sonerings en bou, waterbesoedeling, afvalbestuur, lugbesoedeling, vuurwerke, informele handel, parkering, ens. Munisipale beamptes is deur die Direkteur van Publieke Vervolging gemagtig om die rol van munisipale aanklaers uit te voer. Die munisipaliteit moet voorsiening maak vir aanklaers, plekke en die administrasie van die howe. Die Departement van Justisie en Grondwetlike Ontwikkeling voorsien die voorsittende magistrate.

(2) Die instelling van 'n munisipale hof vereis aansienlike finansiële en regulerende verpligtinge.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, take your seat, please.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, there is no translation at all.

The SPEAKER: Translation from English to ...

Mr M SKWATSHA: From Afrikaans to English. I can't even hear isiXhosa.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Afrikaans is Spanish, anyway.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Sorry, Minister. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, you may proceed. It seems there is translation. We'll find out what's happening.

Mr M SKWATSHA: No, Mr Speaker. Where would I get the English? We're interested in the response.

An HON MEMBER: I hear the English.

Mr M SKWATSHA: No. [Interjections.] Whilst they're working on it I can listen. [Interjections.] He can speak in English. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Who's in charge? Why is there no translation? Find out. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, can I try to do it in English. We're going to sit here the whole night.

Mr Speaker, I'll be quick:

17. (1) (a) There are 11 municipal courts in the Western Cape, ten in the City of Cape Town and one in Mossel Bay.

(b) The municipal courts deal mainly with the bylaws of municipalities.

- (2) The establishment of a municipal court requires a substantial financial and regulatory due diligence within municipalities and that can become a big issue later. That is what the question is all about.

As a follow up on the municipal court topic, at the last Western Cape Legal and Constitutional Task Team meeting on 7 and 8 March 2013, the department requested the management of municipal courts in the City of Cape Town to inform the participants of the legal and practical implications of managing a municipal court system.

Mr J J VISSER: Is it possible, hon Minister, that a lawyer can, as part of community work, act as a chairperson at a municipal court as they do at the small claims courts?

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, to be honest with you, I think we need to do some more homework on this topic, because it's also going to come down to the affordability of a system like this. You must realise that our municipalities are under huge pressure financially – the sustainability and well as the affordability of municipalities. So before you take that route, I think it's crucial that we sort out the financial implications as well as the questions the member posed. I think we need some time to do some more homework on this topic.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, a follow-up question: I'd like to know who presides over these municipal courts. Are these people who are magistrates or what qualifications are required for this?

The MINISTER: I can just repeat that the Department of Justice and Constitutional Development provides the presiding magistrates and that can be one of the problems, because they can say that they don't have the capacity. So that will be one of the issues that would have to be investigated further.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Is the court at the iKapa Municipality a municipal court?

The MINISTER: Which one is that?

Mr M SKWATSHA: It's the iKapa Municipality. Ngumbawul'ejaji yayo leya.

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I'm not aware of that court. The up-and-running municipal court that I know of is in Mossel Bay. We have visited that one. I am not aware of the iKapa one. The City of Cape Town is investigating establishing another 10 municipal courts, but is obviously looking at the financial implications of that court system.

Ontwikkeling van windenergie in die Wes-Kaap

18. Mnr E J von Brandis vra mnr A R Winde, Minister van Finansies, Ekonomiese Ontwikkeling en Toerisme:

Of daar enige finansiële en/of ander ondersteuning aan die verskillende (a) maatskappye en (b) nywerhede as geheel verleen word vir die uitbou en ontwikkeling van die windenergiebedryf in die Wes-Kaap; so nie, waarom nie; so ja, wat die tersaaklike besonderhede is?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMICAL DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, in response to Question 18:

18. (a) No direct financial support is provided to the individual companies within the wind energy sector.
- (b) However, support is provided to this sector through programmatic work – that’s within the department – much of which is implemented through the GreenCape Sector Development Agency and also in co-operation with Wesgro. The allocation to GreenCape for the 2012-13 financial year amounts to R2,860 million. This funding is utilised as follows:
- Lobbying national government on policy matters that impact on the sector, including the issue of local procurement of components and the need to create market clarity about the future expansion of the national renewable energy programme;

- reducing as far as possible the provincial administrative burden on potential wind developers, and ensuring effective co-operation between provincial departments. This includes contributing to the review of the Land Use Planning Ordinance and ensuring the readiness of transport authorities to facilitate the transportation of wind energy components across the provincial roads;
- offering information platforms to industry, ensuring that developers understand policy developments as far as the Western Cape is concerned, and ensuring that the Western Cape government is sensitised to industry and sector concerns; and
- offering investment support services to developers and investors through Wesgro.

The Department of Economic Development and Tourism has also co-operated closely with the City of Cape Town to make available land in Atlantis for the development of green manufacturing focused on supplying componentry into the renewable energy programme. A number of manufacturers are in the process of considering a green manufacturing park in Atlantis; the medium-term goal is to establish a Special Economic Zone in Atlantis, focusing on green manufacturing.

Sake aangaande sonenergie in die Wes-Kaap

19. Mnr E J von Brandis vra mnr A R Winde, Minister van Finansies, Ekonomiese Ontwikkeling en Toerisme:

Of daar enige finansiële en/of ander ondersteuning aan die verskillende (a) maatskappye en (b) nywerhede as geheel verleen word vir die uitbou en ontwikkeling van die sonenergiebedryf in die Wes-Kaap; so nie, waarom nie; so ja, wat die tersaaklike besonderhede is?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, you'll notice that this question is exactly the same as the previous one insofar as the wording is concerned, except for one – instead of wind this one looks at solar. My answer is exactly the same, so without repeating that I shall table the answer.

Reply as tabled:

19. (a) No direct financial support is provided to individual companies within the solar photo-voltaic (PV) sector.

(b) However, support is provided to this sector through programmatic work, much of which is implemented through the GreenCape Sector Development Agency, in co-operation with Wesgro. The allocation to GreenCape for the 2012-13 financial year amounts to R2,860 million. This funding is utilised as follows:

- Lobbying national government on policy matters that impact on the sector, including the issue of local procurement of components; definitions of local content for the purposes of calculating content credits in the national RE

procurement programme; and the need to create market clarity about the future expansion of the national;

- reducing as far as possible the provincial administrative burden on potential solar energy developers, and ensuring effective co-operation between provincial departments;
- offering information platforms to industry, ensuring that developers understand policy developments as far as the Western Cape is concerned, and ensuring that the Western Cape government is sensitised to industry and sector concerns; and
- offering investment support services to developers and investors through Wesgro.

The Department of Economic Development and Tourism has also co-operated closely with the City of Cape Town to make available land in Atlantis for the development of green manufacturing focused on supplying componentry into the renewable energy programme. A number of manufacturers are in the process of considering a green manufacturing park in Atlantis; the medium-term goal is to establish a Special Economic Zone in Atlantis, focusing on green manufacturing.

VERKLARINGS DEUR LEDE

Mnr H P GEYER (DA): Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dienslewering in Suid-Afrika is besig om te misluk. Klerksdorp was onlangs in die nuus, waar die situasie so versleg het dat Eskom die hele dorp se elektrisiteit wou afsit omdat die ANC-beheerde munisipaliteit dit nie betaal het nie. Waar is die geld van die belastingbetalers wat wel hul verpligtinge vir dienslewering nagekom het?

State hospitals towards the north of the country are contributing to the burden of disease instead of fighting it. In the Mankweng Hospital in Limpopo 535 patients died between October 2012 and February 2013. This is absolutely shocking and upsetting, and it was made worse by the fact that the Limpopo MEC for Health knew what was happening but did nothing about it.

Tomorrow we are celebrating Human Rights Day. Is this the norm the ANC government is creating for human rights by setting failure as the standard? That is why so many people visiting the Western Cape are overwhelmed by the standard of local government in this province. The DA has exceeded expectations and is delivering throughout the Western Cape.
[Interjections.]

We acknowledge the many challenges we face and tackle them head-on. Also, in the few ANC-run municipalities in the province we do not wait for them to solve problems; the DA solves it for them.

Die ANC-geleide Munisipaliteit van Cedeberg het maande lank verseg om die strate in die enigste DA-wyk skoon te maak. Die DA het egter na 'n gewag ingespring en dit self

reggestel. Dit is egter kommerwekkend, want belasting word betaal vir hierdie dienste. Die vraag is: wat doen die ANC met die geld?

Die DA staan uit as die enigste opsie vir dienslewering en beter regering. Die leiding van mense kan nie langer geïgnoreer word nie. Die DA sal opstaan teen die mislukking van die ANC en munisipaliteit na munisipaliteit verower om die hoop wat leef in die Wes-Kaap regoor Suid-Afrika te versprei. [Tyd verstreke.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, on 21 March 2013 we celebrate Human Rights Day. It is on this day that we celebrate our hard-won freedom and the Constitution.

The Constitution is the embodiment of the Freedom Charter, in which our vision for a nonracist, nonsexist, unitary and prosperous state is enshrined. All members of the House have taken the Oath of Office to abide by the Constitution and to fight against exploitation and build a nation right here in our own province.

In 2013 we also commemorate the hundredth anniversary of the Native Land Act that robbed black people of their right to land. It was an Act which ensured that 85% of the people, all black, lived on 15% of the land and that 85% of the land was occupied by whites.

We celebrate Human Rights Day against this backdrop and, more recently, months of struggle for dignity against slave wages, poor living conditions and unrepresentative land ownership in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You must get a passport.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Skwatsha, please give the member a chance.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: And the Deputy Chief Whip, actually. We must reject the notion by the Premier that farm workers cannot fight for their own human rights. As human beings they cannot know that they are exploited, they must be told by somebody. We must fight against the DA legitimising the exploitation of farm workers.

Farmers and farm workers must build the farming community and the agricultural economy, because we cannot be led by a party that wants to take us back to the dark days of apartheid.

Mr H P GEYER: You take us back there.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You live in another country. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, I was shocked by media reports on the shambles health centres across the country were in and could not understand how the role-players of these facilities allowed the state of health care to decline to the deplorable level at

which it is now. Some facilities are operating without running water or safe methods of medical waste disposal, while others lack laundry services for soiled linen.

Mr Deputy Speaker, at a Northern Cape facility nurses have to fetch water from tanks in the village before carrying out their health care duties, because a water pipe had burst three years ago. Three years ago, Mr Deputy Speaker!

This is not the first time we are made aware of the state of health care nationally. In February this year, it was brought to our attention that mortuary records revealed that 535 people had died in the space of four months at Mankweng Hospital in Limpopo due to the unavailability of resources. At one stage the mortuary was so full that dead bodies were kept in the wards.

With the national state of health care being in a shambles, the Western Cape is clearly aware of what should not be done. Therefore the Western Cape Department of Health is the leader of health care in the country.

I encourage Minister Botha to promote the Western Cape's alternative proposal to the NHI, the Universal Health for All plan, which stresses the need to strengthen the health system using the current successful Western Cape public sector health delivery system as a model, together with increased partnerships with the private sector. In this way the national state of health care may be redressed and South Africans will be equipped with freedom they can use.

Me J A VAN ZYL (COPE): Mnr die Adjunkspeker, ek is jammer die Minister van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling is nie nou hier nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! U kan voortgaan. Het u 'n probleem?

Me J A VAN ZYL: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die vertaling is nie reg nie.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Kan ons hoor? Gaan maar voort.

Me J A VAN ZYL: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dit is jammer dat die Minister van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling nie nou in die Huis is nie. Die antwoord op Vraag 8 vroeër vandag gegee deur die Minister van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling was nie oortuigend genoeg vir Cope nie.

Indien, soos die Minister beweer, die kwalifikasies van die vorige departementshoof voldoende was om so 'n uiters belangrike departement te bestuur, maar onaanpasbaarheid een van die oorsake was vir die verskuiwing, is dit onaanvaarbaar dat die departement, wat reeds gebuk gaan onder verskeie kritiese vakante posisies, 'n departementshoof verloor of dat hy verskuif word. Dit is kaderontplooiing, gevolg deur kader herontplooiing en hoe lank voor kader her-herontplooiing plaasvind.

Die Minister en menslike hulpbronne kon 'n oplossing gevind het vir die probleem en nie net die simptoom gedokter het deur die betrokke persoon te verskuif na 'n ander departement nie. Hopelik gaan dit beter daar in die Direkteur-generaal se kantoor siende dat beide voormalige werknemers van die Stad Kaapstad was.

Verder, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, is dit 'n klap in die gesig van kundige amptenare wat sekerlik die geleentheid gegun kon word om as waarnemende departementshoof van die Departement van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling te dien.

Mr Z C STALI (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA pumps out spin and lies and uses smoke and mirrors while it juggles with the figures.

The PREMIER: What nonsense.

Mr Z C STALI: The most recent example is the media release of the intended increase of licence fees for motor vehicles. In this statement it is boasted that the Western Cape gives good value for money. A table is supplied in which it shows how favourably, supposedly, the province compares with four other provinces. The public is misled by lower fee figures than what is factually correct in the official regulations of the *Provincial Gazette*, which are much higher.

Closer scrutiny shows the Western Cape to be the province with the highest licence fees for all forms of vehicles and that overburdened motorists are hit by various increases such as petrol hikes. What is even more upsetting is that the time for responding closed on Monday, while most people only had the misleading figures to work on and not the inflated fees that will soon be charged.

The ANC says the implementation of the new fees should be held back by MEC Carlisle in the light of the flawed and misleading processes. The ANC says Carlisle's department got a

massive allocation from the national government and it cannot even spend its budget. Clearly it does not need more money.

MEC Carlisle also speaks with a forked tongue: On the one hand he claims lower fatality figures for the province, yet in a release on 19 February 2013 he bemoans the under-reporting of road deaths. Which one is right? [Time expired.]

Me C LABUSCHAGNE (DA): Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, President Zuma het in sy staatsrede verwys na onderwys as 'n noodsaaklike diens in Suid-Afrika. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde, agb Uys en Minister Carlisle!

Me C LABUSCHAGNE: Die sentiment is weer verlede Donderdag aan 'n groep gemeenskapsontwikkelingswerkers beaam in Boksburg toe President Zuma hulle bemoedig het om aan ouers, skoolbeheerliggame en ander belanghebbendes die regering se erns oor te dra om skole sentras van uitnemendheid te maak.

Ook in sy repliek op die debat oor die Staatsrede het hy bevestig dat daar van staatsamptenare verwag gaan word om harder te werk en meer doeltreffend in hul dienslewering te wees.

Die wekroep tot verhoogde proffesionaliteit in die onderwys is 'n sentiment wat deur die DA-regering in die Wes-Kaap gedeel en ondersteun word. Onderwys is 'n beroep wat hoop skep vir die volgende generasie. 'n Goeie opvoeding, wat prioriteitaandag ontvang vanaf die

leerder, die ouer, onderwysers en skoolhoofde, is die enkele veranderlike wat 'n hele familie se noodlot in een generasie kan verbeter.

Dit is die hoofrede waarom amper 'n derde van die begroting jaarliks aan onderwys toegestaan word. Deur die sistematiese verandering om effektiewe en doeltreffende stelsels te implementeer, word kwaliteitonderwys nie net voorsien in die Wes-Kaap nie, maar word die ingestelheid teenoor onderwysers ook aangespreek.

Deur vakkennis van onderwysers uit te brei, die voortdurende opleiding en ontwikkeling van onderwysers en skoolhoofde, asook die uitbou van leierskap, eienaarskap van taak en verantwoordbaarheid, word waardering en respek teruggeplaas in die professie.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek bedank die onderwysers, beheerliggame en skoolhoofde wat hul taak met professionaliteit verrig en doen opnuut 'n beroep op diegene wat hulself nog nie daartoe verbind het nie. Dit is wel moeilik om sisteemvernuwing teweeg te bring terwyl vakbonde die fokus wegskeur van die belangrike taak op hande en eerder fokus op protesaksies en geweld.

Deur die fokus terug te plaas op die beste belang van die kind en onderwys as 'n geheel en etiek in die professie uit te bou, sal dit nie nodig wees om onderwys as noodsaaklike diens te verklaar nie.

Mr R B LENTIT (ID): Mr Deputy Speaker, this Human Rights Day coincides with the National Water Week. I am an active campaigner in my constituency for water conservation.

We are way past the era where we reflect on the ghosts of the past; we need to focus on the demands of progress. We need to focus on the tools and resources we need to provide for our people, who still do not have access to clean and safe running water. Water could well prove to be one of the greatest constraints to future growth.

The Western Cape has a productive agricultural sector that produces about 60% of our exports. This fact alone makes great demands on our precious water resources. A prediction at the 2011 United Nations World Water Conference, co-hosted by the Western Cape government, was that we could fail to meet our water demands by the year 2025.

In ensuring that this resource is protected for future generations, it is crucial that we educate consumers and our communities about utilising it in a much more efficient manner. Our very lives depend on this.

There are endless campaigns for preventing water wastage, but there is a widespread lack of understanding why saving water is vitally important. A simple behavioural pattern that I have observed is when laundry is rinsed under running taps. It is the minor issues that add up and grow into major causes for concern.

It is not enough that municipalities have indigent grant policies for payment arrangements on utility arrears accounts. While this is a policy I support, it is also essential that, in addition, our people learn how to appreciate and respect their basic human rights instead of violating their own resources and endangering their future.

I appeal to every one of us in the House to note the United Nations Water Conference prediction for the 2025 water demand and supply concerns. We must not allow that one of the most basic human rights, which we fought for, is squandered.

Mr M G E WILEY (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, last week the Minister in the Presidency, Trevor Manuel, visited Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain to report back and to discuss solutions to gangsterism, substance abuse and violence. Accompanying him was the provincial Police Commissioner, Gen Lamoer.

If Minister Manuel was just another citizen, one could understand his concern about the horrendous levels of violence, abuse and gangsterism terrorising many of these huge residential areas, but he is not. He is, and has been for some 15 years, a Minister in the ANC government and for many years the Minister of Finance. Under his watch, the police budget grew stratospherically from single digits to over R60 billion and police numbers shot up from 125 000 to close to 200 000.

Yet the complaints about poor policing standards and service delivery, vigilante justice and the lack of SAPS support for CPFs and allied infrastructure were again major topics at the meeting. The question is: Why has the ANC government not addressed these aspects in the extraordinary growth in the SAPS budget?

A few years ago, SAPs insisted on taking back control of the CPFs but failed to capacitate them. In years past, SAPS failed to support CPFs infrastructurally, so the Department of

Community Safety at provincial level had to step in to give them an annual administrative allowance. It came under threat of censure from the Attorney-General so it had to be stopped.

Similarly, despite rampant growth in gang activity in recent years, together with a massive spike in the drug trade, SAPS closed down the antigang and antidrug units and refuses to reopen them. Why is this? Gen Lamoer said that the police's relationship with communities was improving, but that residents had to have more trust in them. Respectfully, this is simple denialism.

The reason why Minister Manuel and others were there at that meeting was because of a total breakdown in trust in the SAPS that has seen over 100 vigilante killings in the area in the last year – two this last week alone. The NGOs and CBOs have petitioned the Premier for an inquiry. After months of getting no response from the ANC government, or Gen Lamoer, the Premier appointed a commission of inquiry into the lack of SAPS service delivery in Khayelitsha.

The ANC, via Minister Mthetwa, opposed this vehemently and the matter is now at the Concourt. Similar opposition has been voiced against the Community Safety Bill. [Time expired.]

Ms M TINGWE (ANC): The DA-led Western Cape government this morning was dealt ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: A blow.

Ms M TINGWE: ... a second serious blow in the Cape High Court when the full judgment in the saga on the closure of poor black schools was handed down on the eve of our national Human Rights Day – with costs. [Interjections.]

The ANC welcomes the judgment indicating that not only human rights, but also children's rights, were disregarded by the callous DA's overly hasty and ill-considered drastic decision to marginalise thousands of disadvantaged learners – mostly the children of farm workers – and that it had acted against widespread objections.

The court also noted the MEC's indifference – the conduct of the MEC falls below the standard required by the Constitution – ... [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Fritz and the hon member Brown, please quiet down. Please continue, hon member.

Ms M TINGWE – and slammed his patently farcical hearings. It also said he could not ignore the lasting effects of educational segregation or apartheid.

The ANC urges the DA government to accept that it did not engage in proper prior consultations with communities or individuals and that it has wasted up to R4,5 million of taxpayers' money – knowing full well how wrong it was – which could have built many schools.

The victory for the Save our Schools campaign is not just keeping the majority of the schools open, but also preventing the DA from closing another 30 schools this year. MEC Grant is not fit for purpose. He must be fired if he doesn't resign in shame.

Interestingly, the Minister was silently undermining this process by encouraging educators from the schools that he wanted to close to be transferred to other schools. Now some of these schools will be left with vacant educators' posts. [Time expired.]

Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP joins the people of South Africa in conveying our sincere condolences to the families and friends of the 22 people, including two children, who lost their lives in the tragic bus accident this last Friday.

Representatives of the ACDP gathered at Site C with members of the community at the Twelve Apostles Church to show their support and to pray for the victims and their families and for the speedy recovery of the dozens of passengers who were injured in the accident.

The ACDP welcomes the investigations announced by MEC Carlisle. It also notes the statement of the bus company, Atlantic Charters and Tours, that its carrier operating permit that was issued in January 2013 was valid until 2016, while the vehicle licence and operating disc was valid until August 2013. It is concerning to note that the roadworthy certificate of the bus had expired just two weeks before.

The ACDP notes Atlantic Charters and Tour's statement that on the day of the crash, just four hours before the accident, the bus was stopped in Beaufort West by Western Cape traffic

officials and taken to the provincial testing station, where it was inspected thoroughly for roadworthiness and overloading and that no problems with the vehicle were found.

Assuming this to be so, the ACDP joins those calling for answers, not only as to why the crash occurred, but what exactly the Western Cape traffic officials tested for just four hours before the accident.

This is not a good start to the Easter Road Safety Campaign either. The Western Cape government has made much of its Safely Home campaign and the relative successes it has achieved. However, if this very high-profile campaign comprises elements such as the stopping and testing of long-distance passenger liners where patent and latent defects are not picked up and addressed before the bus proceeds any further on its route, then these stops could be nothing more than a paper exercise that is leading drivers to believe that everything is fine when it may well not be. If these are not road-worthiness tests, then what are they? The ACDP calls for answers in this regard.

Finally, the ACDP urges all road users to be vigilant, extra cautious and to obey all the rules of the road at all times, especially over holiday periods such as Easter, which is upon us, when traffic increases dramatically.

Ms J L HARTNICK (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, tomorrow, 21 March 2013, we celebrate Human Rights Day. Although I am aware of the considerable strides we have made in promoting human rights in South Africa, today I question whether we can, in fact, celebrate Human Rights Day with the recent spate of human rights violations with which we are faced.

Every day our news reports are inundated with stories of horror. There are stories of gang rapes, of minors being sold as sex slaves by their own parents, of defenceless babies being sexually violated, of domestic violence, of gang killings, and of police reservists being stripped and forced to parade in their underwear, to name but a few incidents. These are all violations of the human rights enshrined in our Constitution.

Mr Deputy Speaker, have these human rights now only become ink on paper? Have these human rights, which our struggle heroes fought for with their lives, now been reduced to stories we only read about in the history books?

Today I challenge everyone in the House to proactively make an effort to counter these violations. We are in a position to make a difference. We owe it to the people of the Western Cape to foster a caring society and to create an environment in which all South Africans can live lives they value.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is time to redress the social ills plaguing the Western Cape and paying only lip service to it is not the solution. By working better together in implementing proactive programmes to not only improve the standard of living, but also to change the mindset of defaulters we can redress the situation.

CONSTITUTIONAL RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN NCOP AND PROVINCIAL LEGISLATURES

(Notice of motion)

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, mindful of the important constitutional relationship between the NCOP and the Provincial Legislatures, as well as the requirement of co-operative governance, debates the constitutional relationship between the NCOP and the Provincial Legislatures in South Africa.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

LOOMING STRIKES AT BUS RAPID TRANSPORT SYSTEM

(Notice of motion)

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the claims of looming strikes surrounding the Bus Rapid Transport System in the DA-led City of Cape Town.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

STRATEGIE TEEN GEWELD TEEN VROUE EN KINDERS

(Kennisgewing van voorstel)

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek gee kennis dat ek gaan voorstel:

Dat die Huis die implementering van die strategie van die DA teen geweld teen vroue en kinders debatteer.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid gestel.]

FAILURE TO DEAL WITH TAXI CONFLICT

(Notice of motion)

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates MEC Carlisle's failure to properly deal with the taxi conflict in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

WESTERN CAPE GOVERNMENT ABSENT FROM DEPUTY PRESIDENT'S SPEECH AT NCOP

(Notice of motion)

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the fact that the Western Cape was the only provincial government not represented at the debate on the Deputy President's speech to the NCOP last week.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Do you have it in writing, Mr Ozinsky? Please supply it to the Table.

An HON MEMBER: He's busy writing it.

UITSLAE EN EFFEK VAN GRAAD 3, 6 EN 9 TOETSING

(Kennisgewing van voorstel)

Me C LABUSCHAGNE: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek gee kennis dat ek gaan voorstel:

Dat die Huis die uitslae van die onafhanklike Graad 3, 6 en 9 toetsing en die effek daarvan op onderwysdoelstellings in die Wes-Kaap debatteer.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid gestel.]

**FAILURE OF THE WESTERN CAPE GOVERNMENT
TO SUPPORT YOUTH AT RISK**

(Notice of motion)

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the failure of the DA-led Western Cape government to properly support youth at risk.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

PRIMÊRE GESONDHEIDSORGDIENSLEWERING IN WES-KAAP

(Kennisgewing van voorstel)

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek gee kennis dat ek gaan voorstel:

Dat die Huis die suksesse van die primêre gesondheidsorgdienslewering in die Wes-Kaap debatteer.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid gestel.]

INFERIOR SERVICE DELIVER IN POOR AREAS

(Notice of motion)

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the inferior service delivery in poor areas by the DA administration in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

UBUMDAKA ABAHLALA KUBO ABANTU ABAHLUPHEKILEYO

(Isaziso sesiphakamiso)

Mnu M NCEDANA: Mnu Ukukele Somlomo, ndinika isaziso sokuba:

Le Ndlu ixoxe ngobonyhuku-nyhuku obugcwele kwiindawo ezihlala abantu abahluphekileyo apha kwiSixeko saseKapa.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I could not follow, Mr Ncedana, but I take it that it is a formal notice and you will sign it and submit it to the Table.

RAPE AND ABUSE CRISIS UNDER PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT

(Notice of motion)

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the crisis of rape and abuse under the DA-led provincial government.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

**LEARNER AT ATHLONE SCHOOL OF THE BLIND
RETURNS AS EDUCATOR**

(Motion)

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

- (1) congratulates Mr Rodney van Staden, an educator at the Athlone School for the Blind in Bellville South. Mr van Staden completed his school career, Grades 1 to 12, at this special school and after matriculating, studied at the University of the Western

Cape where he successfully achieved his educational qualifications and returned as an educator to the Athlone School for the Blind this year;

(2) and shows its support by translating this communication to Mr Van Staden in Braille.

The SPEAKER: Order, Mr Lentit! Is this a notice of motion or is it a motion? Are you giving notice or are you moving a motion?

Mr R B LENTIT: I'm sorry.

Mr P UYS: It was in the wrong place.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: He was sleeping.

SCHOOL IMPROVEMENT PLAN

(Notice of motion)

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the school improvement plan of the Western Cape Education Department and its implications to provide quality education to all learners in the province.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

FAILURE OF EDUCATION IN THE WESTERN CAPE

(Notice of motion)

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the failure of education in the Western Cape with poor support to learners, shortages of facilities, lack of equipment at schools, shortages in learning material, few teachers and violence at our schools.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

SHUTTING DOWN OF SOCIAL AND INFORMAL ECONOMY

(Notice of motion)

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the shutting down of the social and informal economy by the DA-led administrations.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

**LEARNER AT ATHLONE SCHOOL OF THE BLIND
RETURNS AS EDUCATOR**

(Motion)

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

- (1) congratulates Mr Rodney van Staden, an educator at the Athlone School for the Blind in Bellville South. Mr van Staden completed his school career at this school, and after matriculating, he studied at the University of the Western Cape and returned ...

The SPEAKER: Order, Mr Lentit! There is a point of order.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: This is still a motivation in a notice of motion.

Mr R B LENTIT: Can I just put it in context?

Mr M OZINSKY: Irrespective of where he says it, it's the same thing. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I take your point. Get to the end of your motion as quickly as possible, because you're starting to motivate.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I continue:

Mr van Staden returned to the Athlone School of the Blind as an educator; and

(2) supports the translation of this communication to Mr van Staden via Braille.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

VICTIMS OF KAYAMANDI SHACK FIRES

(Motion of condolence)

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the families and friends of the people who lost their lives in the Kayamandi shack fires and sympathises with all the displaced families.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

HEX RIVER PASS BUS ACCIDENT

(Motion)

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its sympathy with all the victims and their families of the 12 Apostle Church in Christ in Khayelitsha. A horrific accident last week on Friday in the Hex River Pass claimed the lives of 24 people and only 37 people survived.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

PRESIDENT ZUMA RE-ELECTED

(Motion)

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the re-election of President Jacob Zuma as the ANC leader, the appointment of a NEC and the endorsement of the National Development Plan as the blueprint going forward to improve the quality of lives of our people. This is our first sitting ...

[Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! No objection to the motion. [Interjections.] I can't hear properly. Is there an objection to the motion without notice?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections, and therefore the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

LATE HASSAN HOWA HONOURED

(Motion)

Mr A M FIGLAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Hassan Howa, one of the founding members of the anti-apartheid South African Cricket Board of Control (Sacboc), who has been honoured posthumously with an honorary degree, D Phil in Community and Health Sciences, from the University of the Western Cape on Monday, 18 March 2013.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

GLOBAL EARTH HOUR

(Motion)

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and supports the significance of Earth Hour, a global initiative by the World Wildlife Fund, taking place this Saturday between 20:30 and 21:30 and calls on all electricity users in the Western Cape to switch off all nonessential electricity-using appliances for that hour whilst also committing to sustainably changing their usage patterns from here on out.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

LATE HUGO CHÁVEZ

(Motion of condolence)

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys a message of support and condolence to the people of Venezuela on the passing away of their president, a champion of human rights and the reliable ally of the poor, Comrade Hugo Chávez.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion without notice?

[Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.]

LATE SGT FRANCOIS JACOBS

(Motion of condolence)

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deepest sympathy to the family of Sgt Francois Jacobs, SAPS member stationed at Gugulethu, who was brutally murdered in Philippi the day before yesterday.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

LYNNE BROWN EN MCEBISI SKWATSHA VERKIES TOT NUK VAN ANC

(Voorstel)

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis—

- (1) Lynne Brown en Mcebisi Skwatsha gelukwens met hul verkiesing tot die Nasionale Uitvoerende Komitee (NUK) van die ANC; en
- (2) kennis neem dat Marius Fransman nie verkies is as lid van die NUK nie, en
- (3) Lynne Brown en Mcebisi Skwatsha gelukwens met hul ontplooiing in die Noord-Kaap.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Goedgekeur.

WYLE CORNÉ BOOYSENS

(Roubeklagvoorstel)

Mnr J J VISSER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye betuig met die familie en kollegas van Corné Booysens van Melkbosstrand wat tragies op Maandagoggend, 4 Maart 2013, dood is in 'n ongeluk as gevolg van 'n botsing met twee kapers in die middestad. Sy sal onthou word vir die toewyding en entoesiasme waarmee sy haar werk benader het.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Goedgekeur.

CONGRATULATIONS TO MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE

(Motion)

Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Minister Gerrit van Rensburg, the Western Cape Minister of Agriculture and rural development, on being intronised as a Commandeur du Vin de Bordeaux en Afrique du Sud, by Hanneli Rupert-Koegelenberg and Danie de Wet at a function on Vergelegen Farm, Somerset West. The Commanderie extended this distinction for the Minister's contribution to the wine industry and the Western Cape Burgundy Exchange Programme. It is indeed a great honour for Minister Van Rensburg and the Western Cape.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

LATE CHRISTOPHER MSABALALA

(Motion of condolence)

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House shows its respect to the family, comrades and friends of Comrade Christopher Msabalala, a veteran of uMkhonto weSizwe, who passed away at the end of February.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

ERKENNING AAN NOODHULPDIENSTE NA BUSONGELUK

(Voorstel)

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis aan Mr Kenny Africa, sy personeel en die noodhulpdienste erkenning gee vir hul toewyding en professionaliteit met die hantering van die busongeluk by De Doorns.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Goedgekeur.

LATE MAVIS MAKELENI

(Motion of condolence)

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of the veteran ANC activist in the Western Cape, Mavis Makeleni, who will be laid to rest on Saturday.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO CAPE TOWN INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT

(Motion)

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Cape Town International Airport on its rating as the Best in Africa for the third year in a row.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

LATE UVIWE MZINGELWA

(Motion of condolence)

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family and friends, as well as the students and teachers of the Ned Doman Secondary School, on the death of 17-year-old Uviwe Mzingelwa, who died on 19 March 2013 whilst travelling on a Golden Arrow bus.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

LATE GAVIN MKHIZA

(Motion of condolence)

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of the first SAPS officer killed in 2013, Gavin Mkhiza.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

PROFESSOR KARABUS EXONERATED

(Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

- (1) expresses great relief at the United Arab Emirates medical board's decision to exonerate Professor Karabus, a respected and elderly medical doctor from Cape Town, of any wrongdoing during his treatment of a terminally ill child 10 years ago; and
- (2) hopes that he will be allowed to return home without delay after seven months in detention in that country.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I'd like to make a change to that motion – to congratulate the Department of Foreign Affairs. [Interjections.] They did the work. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! This is just a notice of a motion. When it's moved finally you can move an amendment.

DANK AAN MEDIESE NOODDIENSPERSONEEL EN SKOOLHOOF

(Voorstel)

Me C LABUSCHAGNE Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis—

- (1) hul dank en waardering oordra aan die Mediese Nooddienspersoneel sowel as aan mev Joey van der Westhuizen, skoolhoof van Cheré Botha LSEN Skool in Bellville, vir hul spoedige en doeltreffende optrede wat moontlike noodlottige gevolge voorkom het toe die kinders vanoggend deur ses swerms bye aangeval is tydens 'n uitstappie op die gronde; en

- (2) 'n spoedige herstel toewens aan die 26 leerders en vier onderwysers wat gehospitaliseer is.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Goedgekeur.

CONGRATULATIONS TO JAMES MATTHEWS

(Motion)

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the anti-apartheid struggle poet from the Cape Flats, James Matthews, on having received an honorary doctorate at the age of 86 years from the University of the Western Cape.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

COMMENDATION TO LUMKA YENGENI

(Motion)

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends ANC member of the National Assembly, MP Lumka Yengeni, for initiating a successful Grade 12 Mathematics and Physical Science tuition programme at four high schools in Langa.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

**ERKENNING EN DANK AAN REDDINGSDIENSTE
EN BRANDBESTRYDERS**

(Voorstel)

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis erkenning gee aan die lede van die reddingsdienste en brandbestryders en hulle bedank vir hul onverpoosde toewyding aan die slagoffers van padongelukke en vir die voorkoming en blus van vure en brande gedurende die afgelope seisoen.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Goedgekeur.

LATE AMINA CACHALIA

(Motion of condolence)

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of anti-apartheid activist, prominent member of the SACP, outspoken figure during the 1956 women's march against the pass laws, gender activist and former ANC Member of the National Assembly, Amina Cachalia, who passed away earlier this year.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO WINNERS AT FLEUR DU CAP THEATRE AWARDS

(Motion)

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate all the winners at the Fleur du Cap Theatre Awards, hosted at the Artscape Theatre in glamorous style. Winners of the 20 different categories each received a silver medallion and a R15 000 cash prize.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

LATE BABALWA NTABENI

(Motion of condolence)

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of student leader, gender activist, former national treasurer of Sasco, ANC member and official in the national Department of Higher Education, Babalwa Ntabeni, who passed away last week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

BEST WISHES TO ORGANISERS AND PARTICIPANTS

IN CAPE EPIC MOUNTAIN BIKE RACE

(Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the organisers and participants in the Cape Epic mountain bike race, considered by many as the premier event of its kind in the world, all the best for a successful completion of the race.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

VICTORY FOR ANC IN WITZENBERG

(Motion)

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House recognises the ANC's resounding victory in a Witzenberg municipal by-election, and congratulates their candidate in gaining a DA ward.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion without notice?

[Interjections.]

HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

CONGRATULATIONS TO RHETT HALKETT

(Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its heartiest congratulations to Rhett Halkett from Fish Hoek for being appointed as the national hockey captain with the task to build the team for the Rio Olympics.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

(Consideration of principle)

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I rise on the occasion of the second reading debate on the budget as tabled on 7 March 2013. Of course, the second reading debate is the political and policy debate around the budget – how we're spending our money and where we're spending it. I look forward to listening to some of the ideas coming, probably, from the opposition in this debate.

We have to spend this R43 billion in the context of the global economy. We must understand where the global economy is at the moment and the kind of pressure that we are under as this region within South Africa. We also need to understand what's happening in the USA and specifically the EU, our core markets, and the pressure that's putting on our businesses while we are trying to grow our businesses to create more jobs and more employment within that context at the same time.

We welcome the Bric conference, which is to take place later this month, where we will have the leaders of the Bric countries right here in South Africa. Perhaps I will speak about that in a while. Perhaps we can use that as the first lever to really try and change Brand South Africa. Trying to change this economic space in which we operate as a region within a country, within Africa and within the world is very, very difficult with the kind of Brand South Africa that we have at the moment.

Earlier today in the discussions and in a motion that was put forward by hon Marais there was congratulations for two members of the House for their position in the NEC of the ruling party of this country. I would like to use this opportunity to say specifically to those two members that we need leadership to take charge of Brand South Africa at the moment.

If we are really to make a difference to those 573 000 people in this region who wake up every day without a job and without hope, we need to make that difference. It will do quite a few things if we can fix, through leadership, Brand South Africa as it stands at the moment. It will, first of all, fix confidence in our economy.

That R650 billion that's sitting with our businesses in South Africa is not being reinvested and not being put back into the economy to create the growth and jobs that we all need. It is actually being invested in other parts of Africa. It is also Brand South Africa that is deterring investment from outside South Africa to this region, deterring general trade with our region, deterring tourism and all kinds of economic activity within our region. We need to make sure that we change that Brand South Africa.

I don't need to remind you of what we've been through in this last while; whether it's been Marikana or whether it's been how the world views us from a policing point of view. It's not really so much about our newspapers, as it is about the kind of pictures that the world sees of how our police force treats people from Mozambique, who are trying to find an opportunity in our country.

That picture which I just held up now, where you saw someone being burnt alive, where you see people tied behind vehicles and where you see our police officers involved in a shoot-out at Marikana, those are the kinds of brand damage problems that we have across our country and they are massive.

As the hon member on the other side of the House said, we would like to have a debate on rape in this province. What's happening to our women and children in this country is shocking and it all leads to that brand damage that I'm talking about within the context in which we have to operate. The member correctly asked that we have a debate on it, but perhaps I should just remind the member that yesterday a councillor of the ANC was arrested for the alleged rape of a 13-year-old girl.

This kind of stuff in our country is shocking and horrendous and we have to deal with these matters seriously from a leadership point of view. I hope that the hon Brown and the hon Skwatsha take these kinds of discussions to the national leadership body, the NEC, of the ruling party of this country. We need to take these brand damaging issues in our country and start to deal with them.

Let's take the other issues like the SABC and SAA as examples. I actually saw a Southern African tourism magazine that came out yesterday and on the front page of the magazine and in a big article inside the magazine we see, "Saving SAA, another CEO gone". How are we supposed to grow tourism in our regions when these are the kinds of things we see. This is Southern African messaging that's going out there.

When we look at corruption and the kind of message that Nkandla is putting out across the world, and if we've got to operate within this brand of South Africa, we need to make sure that we try in this region to spend our money appropriately and in the right places to make a difference to those people.

We welcome the extra R7 billion that the census will bring to our region over the next three years. We know that we're spending most of our money, as we always have, in health and education, but at the same time we're also making sure that we spend on infrastructure. We have to spend on mechanisms to grow the economy while we hopefully address that brand damage. While we wait for the global markets to change we have to spend money on accessing those new markets across the globe so that we can actually start to make a difference to our economic bottom line.

On the topic of infrastructure and listening to the discussions earlier in the House when we heard that in the previous term of the ANC 11 new schools were built, we can say thus far in this term, 26 new schools and 21 replacement schools have been built. With this budget another 26 new schools, 46 replacement schools and 124 new Grade R classrooms are going to be built and 420 schools are going into maintenance programmes.

These are the kinds of investments that we need to make so that while we're waiting for the brand to change and waiting to gain access to new markets and while our companies are busy gearing up for those new markets, we're spending money in the right place. We can actually effect change to our economy through how money is spent in the region, and at the same time making sure that we are spending our money correctly and in the right places.

We ask that the House keeps their oversight going, specifically around those areas. We'll see at the end of this financial year where we stand, but if you look at the progressive spending over the last four years of this government's term, you will see continuous efficiency gains and the continuous spending of more and more money in the spaces that effect changes, specifically, as I've said, for those 573 000 people for whom we need to create jobs. There is a special focus on the youth and we are trying to find opportunities for them while the economy is changing and while we're creating that new economy for ourselves.

With that, Mr Deputy Speaker, I look forward to this political discussion on the R43 billion budget and I'll continue with the rest of my inputs at the end of this debate.

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan (NOP) is Suid-Afrika se ontwikkelingsraamwerk om armoede uit te roei en ongelykheid aan te spreek teen 2030. Die DA-regering in die Wes-Kaap ondersteun die NOP se doelwitte en is doelgerig om beter tesame die plan te verwesenlik.

Meer belangrik as die plan om die NOP te verwesenlik, is die politieke wil en die vermoë van die Wes-Kaap se regering om dit wel te laat realiseer. Selfs die nasionale Beplanningskommissie se kantoorhoof, mnr Jele, is dit eens dat die Wes-Kaap die eerste provinsie is wat die nodige vlak van gereedheid toon om die NOP te implementeer, soveel so dat vier loodsprojekte van die NOP vir implementering in die Wes-Kaap vir die jaar beplan word.

Daar blyk 'n vertroue in die Wes-Kaap se DA-regering te wees deur die kiersers sowel as die nasionale regering om effektiewe dienslewering te behartig. Die vertroue spruit uit 'n vereenselwiging met 'n oopgeleentheidsgedrewe samelewing vir almal wat die DA onderskryf. Die vertroue word verder bevestig deur die goeie regeringsbeginsels, deursigtigheid en die klas van leierskap wat die DA-beheerde regering deurgaans ten toon stel.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die stand van die ANC-leierskap, die magsbehepthed van die ANC, hul vergulsing aan die Staatskas en hul absolute onvermoë om 'n doeltreffende regering te wees, steel geleenthede van almal in ons nasie.

Mnr H P GEYER: Hoor, hoor!

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Hierdie karaktereienskappe van die ANC word verpersoonlik in die tipe leiers wat hulle aanstel, die optrede van hul leiers asook hoe daar teen hul leiers opgetree word. Dit is tragies dat politieke onverdraagsaamheid, selfs binne dieselfde party, lei tot die verlies van lewens.

Dertig polities-gemotiveerde moorde het oor die afgelope vier jaar in KwaZulu-Natal alleen voorgekom. In September 2012 is 'n ANC-lid doodgeskiet en 'n ANC-raadslid en twee ander beseer by dieselfde vergadering. Op die Suidkus van Durban is die takvoorsitter en taksekretaris koelbloedig vermoor deur 'n ANC-jeugliga takleier van dieselfde area.

In die Noordwes staan agt mense tereg op die moord van 'n ANC-beampte. Van dié wat aangekla is, sluit in die Noord-Wes provinsiale ANC-jeugliga leier, 'n ANC-wyksekretaris, 'n ANC-raadslid, asook die Noord-Wes ANC LUR vir Plaaslike Regering.

Mnr H P GEYER: Skande!

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die Nasionale Vervolgingsgesag het sewe mense vir bedrog, korrupsie en geldwassery, met 'n waarde van R49 miljoen, in die Noord-Kaap gearresteer. Onder die sewe is 'n ANC-lid van die nasionale Parlement, Yolanda Botha, en 'n ANC Noord-Kaap LUR vir Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling, Alvin Botes, asook die ANC Noord-Kaap voorsitter en LUR vir Finansies, John Block.

Meer as R30 miljard gaan jaarliks verlore as gevolg van korrupsie. Dit is R30 miljard wat gesteel word van die behoeftigste mense van Suid-Afrika wat sodoende van geleenthede ontnem word.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die stand van leierskap in die ANC word nie net in die regering waargeneem nie, maar ook in die partystrukture self. Die posisie van 125 ANC-raadslede is in die gedrang nadat daar probleme ondervind is met die benoeming van die ANC-kandidate in die 2011 plaaslike regeringsverkiesing. Selfs in die Wes-Kaap is daar streng bedenkinge rondom die nominasies vir die posisies en die stem vir kandidate en leierskap. Agb Skwatsha sal ons meer daarvan kan vertel. [Gelag.]

Dit is die gebrek aan kwaliteitleierskap wat bewys dat die DA-regering in die Wes-Kaap die enigste regering is om die visie van Suid Afrika te realiseer.

‘n AGB LID: Mooi!

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, President Zuma het ‘n gulde geleentheid van die hand gewys deur nie sterk op te tree teen Minister Joemat-Pettersson nie. Dit skep ‘n gevaarlike beginsel dat ‘n regeringslui kan optree nes hulle wil as hulle aan die regte faksie van die ANC behoort. Dié Minister se woordvoerder is onlangs tydelik geskors, bleikbaar na aanleiding van ‘n brief waarin hy in sy persoonlike hoedanigheid kritiek teen die optrede van Marius Fransman uitgespreek het. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Wanneer die ANC-leierskap wel optree, is dit nie tot voordeel van die mense van Suid-Afrika nie. Minister Sisulu het onlangs ‘n DA-wetsontwerp op verkryging en handeldryf met die staat van die hand gewys. Dié wetsontwerp is soortgelyk aan die Wes-Kaap se Wet op Verkryging wat daarop gemik is om korrupsie te voorkom.

Wanbestuur en wanbesteding blyk aan die orde van die dag te wees waar die ANC in regering is. Minister Joemat-Pettersson het onlangs meer as R10 miljoen spandeer op 7 500 kospakkies. Teen nagenoeg R1 340 per kospakkie is daar ernstige kommer oor effektiewe besteding. Gauteng se hoogtepunte sluit in die nagenoeg R700 000 wat die Premier op ‘n ontbytvoorlegging gemors het en die R7,5 miljoen wat op die onderhoud van die Premierswoning spandeer is.

Mr M OZINSKY: So, what about yourselves.

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Die provinsiale Departemente van Menslike Nedersettings in Limpopo en die Oos-Kaap kon ook nie hul begrotings van onderskeidelik R294 miljoen en R284 miljoen onderskeidelik spandeer nie. Die Vrystaat se R40 miljoen webblad en die Nala Munisipaliteit wie nagelaat het om finansiële jaarverslae in te dien vir die 2007-08-, die 2009-10- en die 2010-11-boekjare is maar nog voorbeelde daarvan.

Die vernaamste voorbeeld van wanbesteding bly nog steeds die besteding van die belastingbetalers se geld aan President Zuma se privaat woning.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, daarteenoor hou die DA-regering in die Wes-Kaap die Grondwet as raamwerk, die beginsels van demokrasie, verantwoordbaarheid en deursigtigheid as 'n gids in die strewe na 'n oopgeleentheidsgedrewe samelewing vir almal as mikpunt om beter tesame 'n Wes-Kaap en 'n Suid-Afrika te bou wat elke persoon verdien.

'n AGB LID: Hoor, hoor!

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Dis die taak wat die bekwame en kwaliteit-leierskap van die DA vergestalt het in die begroting van 2013.

Die PREMIER: Mooi!

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Dit is die diensleweringkontrak wat die regering met die mense van die Wes-Kaap gesluit het en wat die mense aan die DA toevertrou het om te lewer.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think I should just remind myself that this is the Second Reading debate of the Western Cape's Appropriation Bill. I am not going to divert attention from the Western Cape by running all over South Africa. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, we are talking about the Western Cape budget now.

Let me start by thanking the national government for the generous 10% increase in the revenue of the Western Cape ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: With whose money? [Interjections.]

Ms C BEERWINKEL: In spite of confirming ... [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I will protect you. Please continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Kan hierdie holruggeryde storie van wie se geld en belastinggeld nou net end kry, want ons almal betaal belasting. [Tussenwerpsels.] Ons is nou moeg daarvan.

In this way, the government is confirming that we are serious about improving the lives of the poor. The point here, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that while the Census informed the allocation, the DA government needs to stop rubbishing national government at the drop of a hat.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But then they must start performing.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Accept the fact that people will migrate ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: That's actually not necessary.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... but never again refer to the drain on health and education and housing opportunities. Stop moaning and complaining and get on with the job of governing this province as part of South Africa.

The DA's latest mantra is to become the best run region in the world ...

Mr J J VISSER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... and their absolute support for the National Development Plan. It is not about theoretically bandying about numbers and statistics on paper, it's about what tangible visible changes are brought about in people's lives. It's the people we serve who will determine whether you are the best run region in the world.

Ms E PRINS: But we don't see it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, the success and legacy of the NDP will be in the way we grow the economy, alleviate poverty and create employment to change the lives of the poor for the better, together.

MEC Winde shouldn't ask us for ideas about policy changes. I am going to show you, MEC Winde, how your own colleagues are disregarding your dream and vision for a best run region in the world. You need look no further than right amongst your own colleagues.

How can one address this budget and how it affects spending without referring to the gross underspending on infrastructure by the end of December – which meant they only had three months left to spend the rest of it – when Education had spent 52% of its infrastructure; Health, 59,2%; and Transport and Roads, 72,6%; and Public Works only 35,5%?

That meant that the rest of the budget had to be spent in the past three months. So watch this space when we get to the annual reports.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Watch this space, you're right.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, if a region declares itself as the imminent best run region – in the world, no gal – then I would imagine that every child can attend school close to home in conditions conducive to learning and of equal standards, people have sustainable employment, ...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It wasn't meant to be like that.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... equality of life can be seen, living conditions are acceptable, crime is almost nonexistent, areas where the poor live are clean and services are rendered, its government genuinely cares for its people, it accepts criticism with grace and decorum becoming of its stature and does not resort to personal attacks on people or diminishes the opposition's rights to deliberate by derogatory remarks about their size, culture, person, their history or their heritage. Neither does it do so by playing one up against the other and its leaders lead by example That is a well run region.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You're right.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: However, Mr Deputy Speaker, let me just point out a few examples of why I think that this notion of a best run region in the world is still a blue-sky pipe dream and how in reality there isn't support for the principles of the NDP. I'm just going to touch on a few departments to prove my point.

Let me begin with Education.

The PREMIER: [Inaudible.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: She can't possibly have read it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Shame. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTYSPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I can even tell you how many pages the document has, MEC Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: How many?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: In spite of the damning judgment that MEC Grant got this morning, he still had the audacity to send arrogant and veiled threats across the floor, when the statement about education was read. This is the same department that went reeling from one disaster to the next last year.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And continues.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Also, this is the one department that deals with every eligible schoolgoing child in the province, but tries to deprive the poorest learners of that opportunity.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the appropriation for education is R15,6 billion in the 2013-14 financial year. Last year, at the end of the third quarter, only R4,3 million of R9,571 million for Dinaledi Schools was spent. Now let me tell you what Dinaledi Schools are supposed to do. They are supposed to increase the number of learners taking Mathematics and Physical Science to Grade 12, with a particular focus on female learners.

What are the criteria? At least 50 learners per grade must be enrolled for Mathematics, 10 to 12. Schools with less than this number may nevertheless be eligible for inclusion. At least 60% of learners from Grade 10 to 12 must be enrolled for maths. Now how difficult can that be, Mr Deputy Speaker? Yet there are a miniscule number of Dinaledi Schools across this province. Instead the top pupils are taken to a special school and yet the money is not spent – R4,3 million of about R9 million by December. When would they have spent the rest?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: January.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Only 13% of the R11 million for the refurbishment of technical schools was spent. More than a year after a technical school opened last year, three work stations are still empty. No practical work can be done. Again, what does the Division of Revenue Act say about the reasons why they are getting this conditional grant? It states:

To improve the conditions of technical schools and modernise them to meet the teaching requirements of learners in their field.

Why are those schools not getting their equipment more than a year later? Of R11 million ...

‘n AGB LID: Hulle het die boeke.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They don't need theory, sir. They need practical experience in a technical school. Educators were not appointed in terms of the target with the excuse that the difference is immaterial. Can you imagine that? The difference of teachers that are not

appointed is immaterial. Yet the principals complain about the laborious process they have to follow to get staff, and jobs are lost in the process. In spite of all these disasters, this is ... [Interjections.] Let me show you something – because for every one educator not appointed, 35 learners are lost.

Mr Deputy Speaker, for education with a budget of R15,6 billion, this is the review that they give us. This is the plan for the year. Health, with the same budget – compare that – that is their APP ... [Time expired.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP welcomes the additional appropriations to the Western Cape that are based on the census results. We also welcome the commitment of the government to fulfilling its role in meeting the developmental challenges elaborated on in the National Development Plan, which proposes a social compact to reduce poverty and inequality and raise employment and investment.

With regard to education and health, we welcome the fact that between these two they are contributing over 60% in the medium term to the budget of the province; R15,6 billion in 2013 for education, which is an 8% increase; and R15,8 billion for health, which is a 7,4% increase.

With regard to social development, Mr Deputy Speaker, the 14% increase in payments to NPO partners delivering a basket of much-needed social welfare services to communities in need is definitely welcomed, specifically the substance abuse appropriation of R81,4 million.

I welcome the views of the Minister with regards to Brand South Africa. The recent ratings downgrades by the three agencies send important and worrying signals to domestic and foreign investors. Rating agencies cited labour unrest, service delivery protests and violent strikes as major contributing factors to this downgrade.

The Western Cape government must address these issues immediately and sustainably to the extent that it can. Apart from what the Minister has said, Brand South Africa should also show that it cares for the farm workers. Given that we have 175 000 farm workers in the Western Cape and that agriculture is the pillar of the Western Cape's economy, contributing some 55% to 60% of South Africa's agricultural exports, we all understand that the role of farm workers is pivotal and that the role they play in contributing to the food security of South Africa and the Western Cape is vital.

However, in this regard we are disappointed to see that the subprogramme dealing with farm worker development, which is aimed at training and capacitating them, is inadequate for meeting the needs of the farm workers specifically. Let me just quote from the Budget book, page 500. The department itself says that:

Farm workers are isolated from the mainstream social interaction and do not have regular access to life skills training and support services. But the budget that has been appropriated in this regard is inadequate.

They themselves acknowledge it by saying that:

It is therefore essential to educate farm workers and to build their self-respect and capacity as they contribute significantly towards the success of the sector. On an annual basis the Subprogramme: Farm worker development is inundated with requests from farm-worker organisations and NGOs to fund life skills projects for farm workers. However, due to a limited budget only a small percentage can be funded.

But this was the opportunity, Mr Deputy Speaker, to change that. This was the opportunity to provide an adequate budget so that these needs that the department is inundated with every year can be addressed given specifically the labour unrest that has happened in the Western Cape over the last two or three months. This was an opportunity that should have been addressed and the ACDP believes it is a missed opportunity. [Time expired.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ons debatteer vanmiddag 'n begroting van R43 miljard waarmee ons in die Wes-Kaap 'n verskil wil maak vir arm mense. Ek het die agb Beerwinkel jammer gekry terwyl sy so gesukkel het met haar toespraak ...

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Why?

Die MINISTER: ... en die rede daarvoor is dat sy weet wat die werklikheid is, maar haar party het uit voeling geraak met die hedendaagse realiteite van Suid-Afrika. Elke keer as 'n probleem opgelos moet word, grawe hulle dieper in die verlede in en probeer om dit daar op te los. Ons sal moet leer dat ons probleme van die toekoms in die hede kan oplos en nie in dit wat 'n honderd jaar terug gebeur het nie.

Dis moeilik om die Suid-Afrikaanse handelsmerk te bou. Dis moeilik om potensiële beleggers te kry as die ANC mense verskrik met praatjies van super-belasting, nasionalisering en 'n verbod op die besit van eiendom. Beleggers in die land word afgeskrik met korrupsie en swak ANC-leierskap.

Kort nadat ons mynbousektor 'n bloedige en onwettige staking in 2012 ervaar het, hits die ANC mense aan om dieselfde in die Wes-Kaap te doen. Die mynbousektor word deur grootskaalse afleggings in die gesig gestaar, maar steeds word werkers in die Wes-Kaap aangehits om onwettig te staak en werklose mense word aangehits om chaos te saai.

Die ANC het geen gevoel vir arm mense nie. Hulle misbruik arm mense vir hul eie politieke gewin.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: En skoolkinders. Daar's die waarheid.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die ANC staan op die kantlyn en kyk hoe ons plaaslike hoenderbedryf ondergaan as gevolg van goedkoop invoere vanuit Suid-Amerika. Vir elke hoender wat ons invoer, voer ons ook 2 kg mielies in wat daardie hoenders gevreet het.

Die ANC is besig om ons mielie-diervoer- en hoenderbedryf te benadeel. Ons voer werkgeleenthede uit.

Mnr M OZINSKY: [Onhoorbaar.]

Die MINISTER: Agb Ozinsky, die ANC-beleid maak ons mense arm. Die ANC het toegelaat dat ons nie meer rooivleis kan uitvoer nie. 'n Heining wat moet keer dat bek-en-klouseer nie in Suid-Afrika kom nie, word nie in stand gehou nie.

Mnr H P GEYER: Dit is so. Dis 'n skande.

Die MINISTER: Die ANC staan aan die stuur van die mees gesofistikeerde regering in Afrika, maar dit kan nie 'n heining in stand hou om ons mense te beskerm teen bek-en-klouseer nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ANC is besig om toe te laat dat ons appeltaalvoere uit die Wes-Kaap gestop word as gevolg van die verlies van ons swartvlek-vrye status. Hulle moes net roetine blokkies afmerk om te sê die Wes-Kaap het nie swartvlek nie, maar dit is nie gedoen nie.

Die ANC is nie bekommerd oor arm mense op appeltaal nie. Die ANC laat toe dat Eskom-elektrisiteit so duur word dat dit vir besighede onlewensvatbaar is. Die ANC maak geheime elektrisiteitsvoorsieningstransaksies met sekere firma's wat tot nadeel van die res van die ekonomie is. Tog bly Eskom die besigheid in Suid-Afrika wat die hoogste salarisse betaal. Wat van ons arm mense?

Die PREMIER: Ja.

Die MINISTER: Agb Premier, ek dink dit is tyd dat ons ook vir ons plaasbewoners gelyke voordele beding – met betrekking tot gratis water en gratis elektrisiteit – as dit wat mense in stede kry.

Kom ons kyk na die Clanwilliam Dam. Daar kan ons 3 000 nuwe boere – arm mense – help. Op 18 Augustus 2010 gee die Minister kennis in die *Staatskoerant* dat die damwal verhoog gaan word. Op 12 Desember 2011 onderteken haar departementshoof en my departementshoof ‘n gesamentlike ooreenkoms dat ons gaan kyk na ‘n studie van hoe ons die water by die mense gaan kry en waarmee ons hulle sal laat boer.

In Oktober 2012 weier die Minister om verder deel te neem aan die proses. Voel sy enigiets vir arm mense as sy weier dat 3 000 nuwe boere die water kry wat ons in die Clanwilliam Dam kan opgaan?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They don't give a damn!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Die ANC het met sy aksie tydens die landbou-onluste gewys dat hy landbouers wat op die grond lê eerder in die tande wil skop as wat hy hulle wil help.

Wat sê u leier Marius Fransman? [Tussenwerpsels.] Hy gebruik die K-A-K-woord. Wil u regtig ‘n leier hê wat so ‘n woord gebruik? U wat ordentlike lede van die ANC is, wanneer gaan u teen hom optree?

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Hulle is te bang vir hom.

Die MINISTER: Hoe lyk die landbou se winsgewendheid? [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: You guys don't go to the toliet? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER: Ons koringplase kry slegs twee korsies en 'n halwe sny brood van die brood wat op die winkelrak lê. Daarmee moet die besigheid vir die res van die jaar onderhou word. Dit sluit dan lone, salarisse en ander bedryfsuitgawes in.

Die tafeldruifboere in die Berg- en die Hexrivier boer die afgelope jaar op 'n beraamde verlies van R17 000 per hektaar. Hul insetkoste het die afgelope 10 jaar met 11,5% gestyg terwyl hul inkomste in dieselfde tyd net met 5,7% gestyg het.

Wat die wynboere betref, gaan net 54c van 'n bottel rooiwijn wat vir R30 in die drankwinkel verkoop word na daardie plaas. Die staat kry R5,54 uit aksyns- en BTW-koste. Die staat kry 10 keer meer as die boer, maar doen niks om ondersteuning vir die landbou daar te stel nie.

'n AGB LID: Die staat is in die drankbedryf.

Die MINISTER: Een liter bottel melk verkoop vir R10 in die winkel en daar gaan net R3 terug na die plaas. Water is selfs duurder as melk.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek kan nog vir u 'n klomp voorbeelde noem van kostedruk in die landbou.

Niemand wil die probleem sien en ondersteuning gee nie. Die arme liewe Tina is so besig om haar eie personeel af te dank of om haar eie probleme te hanteer en geld te spandeer dat sy nie tyd het om by die landbou uit te kom nie.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Sy “worry” nie oor die landbou nie.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Kom ons kyk wat doen die DA vir arm mense in die Wes-Kaap. Ons wil graag hê dat grondhervorming suksesvol moet wees, daarom propageer ons aandeelhoudingskemas waarvan 95% suksesvol is, maar die ANC gebruik die 5% wat onsuksesvol is en gooi daarmee die baba met die badwater uit. Die DA kry dit reg om 60% van die ander grondhervormingsmodelle suksesvol te bedryf. Die ANC in die ander provinsies kry net 10% reg.

Ek gaan Maandag vir u ons tweede boek van suksesse wys van landboustories in die Wes-Kaap. Ek daag enige ander provinsie of die nasionale regering uit om vir my een bladsy van sukses te skryf.

Die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Landbou is die enigste departement wat 'n plaaswerkerontwikkelingsprogram het. Die agb Haskin is nou nie hier nie, maar hy is reg. Ek dink ons spandeer nog te min geld op plaaswerkerontwikkeling, maar daar is geen ander provinsie wat

‘n sent op plaaswerkerontwikkeling spandeer nie. Dit is net ons wat bekommerd is oor arm mense. Die Wes-Kaap kyk na nuwe markte vir ons boere, of hulle klein of groot is, en daarom kyk ons spesifiek na die potensiaal in China, Indië en die res van Afrika.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek wil afsluit. Dit is duidelik dat die DA verstaan hoe ‘n regering moet bestuur moet word en wat sy funksie en verantwoordelikhede is. Die ANC is wel goed met sentimentele praatjies oor die verlede maar kan nie die werk doen wat nodig is om ‘n beter lewe te maak vir ons arm mense nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Dit is jammer dat die suksesse van die DA tot die Wes-Kaap beperk sal bly vir solank as wat die res van die land deur die ANC van sy suksesse beroof word.

Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, it was refreshing to listen to the Minister presenting the budget in the House, which seems to be more focused on market systems that are aimed at helping the people of the Western Cape to create more jobs ...

The PREMIER: Do you know how it was created? [Interjections.]

Mr M NCEDANA: It would really be appreciated, Madam Premier, if you were to learn one skill that you lack, that of listening, which is a very important skill. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, member.

Mr M NCEDANA: However, Mr Deputy Speaker, the devil is in the detail of how this budget is going to be implemented. We have seen APPs being presented in the House before and we have also seen funds being shifted because the intended objectives were not met. We would like to see this budget and the APPs, as they were presented, being implemented and the targets met.

If we were to achieve that, then the poorest of the Western Cape will say, “DA, you have done the job well”, and that’s what we want. I guess every political party would want to see the services being rendered to the people.

The second aspect deals with the will of the political leadership in this government. They should not spend more time accusing other people but dealing with corrective measures. Where we think we have made mistakes we should focus on correcting those mistakes. I was in Philippi the other day. By the way, I wanted to show you a speech – I will print it. Earlier on, one of the speakers referred to the perfect, clean cities and yet when I go around to the poorer communities I still see filthy streets.

If this budget is there to improve the lives of the people, it must speak to those issues. I want to live in the street, as I live in Harare, Khayelitsha. I want my street to be clean, the same way it is when I drive in Groot Constantia. That’s the kind of government we are looking for.

The time for a government that blames every day, a government that says this person is better than that person, that the other person is deploying ...

The PREMIER: [Inaudible.]

Mr M NCEDANA: No, Premier, listen. You talk about cadre development and you talk about fit for purpose, but your Minister, with due respect to the Minister, did not convince me today. It was very clear that the DA is deeply involved in cadre development and redeployment. [Interjections.] Don't argue with me on that issue. All I need from you as a person elected by the majority of the Western Cape is to do your work. That work must not only be directed at the affluent communities; that work must be directed at the poorest of this province. [Interjections.]

The budget is correctly focusing on health and education. I was at the Harare Police Station on the 13th of this month. About seven vehicles are broken. An old woman came in to say: "I laid a complaint two days ago and no arrest has been made. I have to look for other places to sleep because I'm scared to go back home because the person I laid the complaint about is still there." There are seven broken vehicles standing there.

I am raising this because the budget must talk to those issues. I don't care whether it's Lamoer or somebody else, the issue is that that old woman who was at the police station must be helped. There must be a person there to help that woman. [Interjections.] That's the budget we are talking about.

The second aspect is this. You see, Madam Premier, the kind of meal we ate and why we ate that meal when we grew up was in many respects not out of choice. It was because we could not afford what you can afford. You can't incite people to say that many people die because

they eat the wrong stuff. We are compelled to eat the meat that we eat and the kind of meal that we eat – the starch – because we can afford to buy that starch.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just finish off, please. Your time has expired.

Mr M NCEDANA: As I finish, I think that the Premier of this province must stop being childish and do her work. [Time expired.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the main impression of the budget is that the DA totally failed the people of the province ... [Interjections.] ... by not uniting all residents in words and deeds by addressing social and economic challenges and specifically the problem of the poor.

However, let me interrupt myself one second and refer to the hon Van Rensburg. On 16 March, he delivered the speech he delivered now to the farmers in Mossel Bay. [Interjections.] On 17 March, Wilmar James gave exactly the opposite to what you said. He said: “Let’s import poultry. Let’s bring it into South Africa. The poor people need it.” I can show you his quote. Please wake up to your own policy and help the poor. Do not carry on with the nonsense you do. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, for the past three years, the Department of Human Settlements have not met their own very unrealistic, low targets. The provincial housing backlog now stands at 600 000 units, while we know municipal services are poor in areas with the greatest housing needs.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in the 2010-11 financial year, the MEC said that they will embark on a new strategy, a strategy that will shift from houses to serviced sites by creating more serviced sites in informal settlements. In that year, they set a target of 18 000 but only achieved 11 000. Now, in the 2013-14 financial year, they regressed even further by setting a target – and it's really an embarrassing target – of 7 000 serviced sites. [Interjections.]

Then the MEC said that they will not be chasing numbers this year, but it is all about numbers, quality numbers. With a 600 000-unit backlog and a target of only 7 000 serviced sites, it is all about increasing the amount allocated for housing opportunities, ... [Interjections.] ... speeding up the delivery by the department and municipalities in the private sector, using a substantial portion of the R3 billion additional allocation to this province received from the national government for housing. What do we see of that R3 billion in the housing budget? Nothing. Therefore, Mr Deputy Speaker, the people of this province don't need an MEC who has given up on them and failed them with the rest of the Cabinet.

Further to the DA's non-delivery, the Auditor-General could not express an opinion on the Western Cape Housing Development Fund's financial statements for the 2010-11 financial year. The 2011-12 financial statements were not completed on time, as determined in the Public Finance Management Act. This is the first time you find this in the past 10, 20 years, and not only that specific one.

Mr Deputy Speaker, ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, without addressing and fixing the problems and challenges of the Western Cape, speakers from the DA – and we saw this today again – would prefer making comparisons, most of the time far from the reality of the situation.

However, one comparison they actually avoid is that of unemployment. With an unemployment rate in South Africa of 24,9%, the question must be asked: What is wrong? Why the failure in the Western Cape? With an unemployment rate of 24,9%, almost the same as national, but with the Western Cape enjoying the infrastructure, geographical location and funding transfers, this province is by a big margin underperforming and failing the people of the Western Cape and South Africa.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in her dealings with the national departments, why is it so difficult for the Premier to tell the truth? In her State of the Province Address on 22 February 2013, she said, and I quote:

... the Regional Head of the Department of Justice and Constitutional Development, Adv Hishaam Mohamed, ... have informed the Commission (of Inquiry) ... –

the one in Khayelitsha that was referred to –

... in writing that the Justice Department ... will not co-operate with the Commission.

That was her quote. This, of course, Mr Deputy Speaker, is not true.

The PREMIER: Of course it's true.

Mr P UYS: Adv Mohamed wrote to the Commission, and you had the letter. [Interjections.]

He wrote to the Commission and said:

We advise that an appeal has been noted in this matter and we therefore deem it prudent to await the outcome of the appeal before approving access to records, interviews with court staff. We advise that we will commit appropriate resources, including human resources and capacity, to your requests for records and information once the matter has been finalised.

That's the information. Mr Deputy Speaker, it is far from what the Premier said and implied – another attempt to wrongfully discredit the justice department and national government departments in general. This comes after the Commission itself put the hearings on hold, pending the Constitutional Court ruling.

The Public Protector's finding on the procurement of communication services by the Department of the Premier from TBWA Hunt Lascaris determined that the failure by the Department of the Premier to employ proper demand management constituted maladministration. The Premier then undertook in writing to take corrective measures to prevent a recurrence of the failure in demand management processes and further that demand

management processes on required contracted services to commence well before the contract expires.

Mr Deputy Speaker, knowing the maladministration – and that was pointed out – and supply chain management failure of the company's contract and they confirmed ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Finish off.

Mr P UYS: ... on 30 May that the Department of the Premier should embark upon a fresh procurement process, what did they do? They extended that without any consideration of the funding or any consideration of the Public Protector or the rule of law. [Time expired.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is interesting that the hon Uys mentions Adv Hishaam Mohamed. If there was ever the ultimate cadre deployment, he was it. First he was an ANC councillor while he was the Head of Justice in this province and now he sits on the ANC PEC, and I think he actually sat on the NEC at one stage as well. [Interjections.]

He says that the DA government is a failure. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: If one of the barometers of failure is that we don't spend millions of rands on the Opening of Parliament or food festival imbizos right around the province, then, yes, we have failed.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, last night, when reading an article in *Time* magazine, I came upon a set of paragraphs that perfectly reflected my feelings at present. I would suggest it represents the feelings of many other South Africans as well as observers of this country.

The article written by Alex Perry was one I had been trying to avoid in the last number of days because it's simply too depressing. It was the cover story about the Oscar Pistorius/Reeva Steenkamp disaster. The article, covering some eight pages of probably the widest-read general news magazine in the world, is not so much about this terrible human tragedy, but a stunning indictment of South Africa today, its government and its lack of direction. Policing, or the lack of it, and the fear of crime featured prominently.

Two paragraphs in particular stood out, and I quote:

Why does no one trust the State? For blacks, it's partly because of South Africa's historical legacy. And for all South Africans, but particularly for whites, it's partly because the ruling African National Congress (ANC) is tarred by corruption and criminality. Scandals involving government ministers seem like a weekly occurrence. About a tenth of South Africa's annual GDP – as much as \$50 billion – is estimated to be lost to graft and crime. The past two national police chiefs were sacked for corruption. In the south-eastern city of Durban last year, all 30 members of an elite police organised-

crime unit were suspended, accused of more than 116 offences, including theft, racketeering and 28 murders. The initial lead investigator in Pistorius' case, Detective Warrant Officer Hilton Botha, was removed after it emerged that he faced trial on seven counts of attempted murder. Most damning of all, the ANC's self-enrichment has helped widen the inequality that first propelled it to power. The result of this dismal record is that while murder rates are down from their peak, the resentment and violence continue.

Unable to rely on the state, South Africans are forced to cope with crime essentially on their own – and over time, that has shaped the nation. Policing is largely a private concern. In 2011, South Africa's private security industry employed 411 000 people, more than double the number of police officers. In the townships, vigilante beatings and killings are the norm.

One could easily add, since the article was published just on 11 March, the horrendous instance where a Mozambican national was dragged behind a police vehicle and later found beaten to death in a police cell, another case where a court interpreter was assaulted and dragged by another SAPS member, the Tatane killing and Marikana massacre currently under way in full view of the public. Without a shred of doubt, these and many other cases are undermining and tarnishing the reputation of both SAPS and South Africa here and abroad. We talk about damage to brand.

The Independent Police Investigation Director (IPID) reported that 797 people died in police custody in the 2010-11 financial year. Last year, 144 members were charged with murder and 91 for rape. Clearly, this is a service under severe stress, and one just has to speak to any SAPS member to understand just how demoralised they are. Many examples can be shown

daily of members on stress leave, sick leave or simply AWOL. Suicide and domestic violence incidents and divorce are worrying. Resignations and requests for transfers are commonplace.

At one SAPS station near where I live, there have been nine resignations or transfers in 12 months, without replacement; one suicide; and last week or the week before, at least one case of domestic violence, where a member was shot by a spouse.

The net result is that where there should be 10 members per shift per National Service Standards, only 5 members' names appear on that list per shift, and that is before any leave categories, detached duty, courses or AWOL are taken into account. Routinely I get phoned to say it happens that there's only one or two members who arrive on shift for duty, and this for a population of overwhelmingly indigent people of over 80 000.

At this station, the trauma room, a Wendy house, has been steadily falling apart and has had to be summarily closed because the black mould is affecting the volunteer counsellors and patients. Normally there are 80 cases a month.

The question is: How does this crisis get addressed? Building morale and reputation in an essential service is not an optional extra; it has to be a national priority. Standards must be uncompromisingly high and any indiscretion has to be dealt with immediately and openly. The internal disciplinary mechanism cannot be allowed to become a refuge for leniency, as is the case now.

Minister Mthethwa reported to Parliament that the police had to pay out R300 million for civil claims in three years. The cases largely going to SAPS have risen from 3 007 in the 2010-11 financial year to 5 090 in the 2011-12 financial year. Contingent liabilities have jumped from R5,3 billion to R20,5 billion in seven years. This means that's money set aside to pay out claims.

Leadership has to be led by example and beyond reproach. Above all, the Executive has to stand by its staff, to trust its appointment and insist on a level of service that strives for excellence and competence. Obviously, this is not the case in SAPS or the Ministry at present, nor is there a willingness to be held accountable. If there were, Minister Mthethwa would have resigned or he should have been fired by the President. Instead, the President remained silent and Minister Mthethwa takes an extended honeymoon, following a lavish wedding at the height of the crisis.

Such dereliction cannot and would not be tolerated in any decent democracy. The country suffers in both reputation and economic uncertainty as a result. *Fortune* magazine, a few months ago, had a four-page article on Brics, that is, Brazil, Russia, India and China, to which South Africa parasited itself onto. It's meant to be Brics. In that four-page article, they don't even call it Brics; they call it Bric, the old acronym, and they don't in four pages mention South Africa once. That's how much our reputation is worth. *Fortune* magazine is the most read business magazine in the world. [Interjections.]

The SAPS wallows in hopelessness, with a Commissioner who has not implemented a single strategic corporate initiative to address the stagnated and suffering service. The only thing

that grows in the annual budget are these specialised units designed to keep the ANC hierarchy and their property safe and the rest impoverished population at bay. Even the Minister in the Presidency, ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please finish off.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... Trevor Manuel, last week stated that communities are losing faith in their police. [Time expired.]

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is shocking to note that the Western Cape is the only province that has been experiencing ongoing tensions in the taxi industry, with the DA-led government failing to mediate impartially in these conflicts. [Interjections.]

The DA's failure to act decisively not only comprises the livelihoods of taxi operators and commuters, but has resulted in the squandering of taxpayers' money on industry structures that are in a dysfunctional state.

Whilst the provincial Department of Transport and Public Works speaks of conflict resolution units for the taxi industry and MEC Carlisle boasts of having the taxi industry under control, this government fails in its duty to resolve disputes within taxi industry bodies. These very bodies receive funding from the taxpayer.

Through his inaction, MEC Carlisle defends, favours and legitimises his incompetent and corrupt political agents in the industry. [Interjections.] This he does to undermine those in the industry who hold him accountable.

The majority of taxi associations in the Western Cape do not have confidence in MEC Carlisle, except for a few who benefit from his patronage and selective and deliberate inaction.

Issues surrounding the Mitchells Plain Taxi Forum's suspension of 12 of its 15 taxi associations by their 10-member board, of which only four members are active, speak directly to this legitimising of incompetence and corruption by MEC Carlisle – the DA's self-proclaimed provincial spokesperson on corruption and clean governance.

The 12 member association were suspended for raising legitimate grievances regarding the Forum's governance issues which are supposed to be monitored by Santaco Western Cape and the provincial Department of Transport and Public Works. [Interjections.]

The associations complained to the Forum's leadership that members have not been receiving training, for which the department provides funding; forum meetings have not been called; financial reports on the spending of funding coming from the department have not been presented to members; and that the AGM has not been held. [Interjections.] It must be noted that according to their own undertaking, it is the responsibility of MEC Carlisle's department to ensure that these AGMs are held.

Not only did the Forum's leadership fail to address these complaints, but the chairperson, Mr Nezaam Abdurahman, and Secretary, Mr Henry Arthur Williams, both of whom receive a salary from MEC Carlisle's department, demanded payment from the associations upon their request for financial reports.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

Mr Z C STALI: After the Board's refusal to address these concerns and the call an AGM, the 12 associations passed a vote of no confidence on the Board. They registered their complaints as individual members with Santaco Western Cape, whose duty it is to address such issues.

The Western Cape Chairperson of Santaco, Mr Vernon Billet, who is a supporter of MEC Carlisle, has flatly refused to address any of these concerns raised and the vote of no confidence. [Interjections.] He has instead accepted the suspension of the associations without charges and subjected them to a fruitless DC process at the expense of the taxpayer.

When engaged on his refusal to address the issues, Billet who gets R30 000 a month from MEC Carlisle's department, argues that the Forum is not accountable to the provincial Constitution of Santaco which has disciplinary recourse, but to the national Constitution which has no disciplinary recourse. This is despite the fact that the budget which the Forum gets from MEC Carlisle's department is dependent on them fulfilling the mandate of the provincial Constitution.

MEC Carlisle is unfortunately not attentive to this. Despite the associations raising all their concerns with the MEC, he has neglected his responsibility and has allowed taxpayers' money to be wasted by failing to mediate.

The MEC has also refused to put any pressure on his ally, Mr Billet, to take the action that he is mandated to take.

It is indeed a shame on the MEC and this government that this MEC of corruption and clean governance refuses to mediate whilst his department funds the activities of the Forum and Santaco. It is in MEC Carlisle's selfish and narrow political interest for no action to be taken.

At the expense of the industry, commuters and taxpayers, the MEC does not mediate in this conflict because he wants to protect his agent of Santaco, Mr Billet, from ultimately losing the election as Santaco provincial Chair.

For his own narrow political interests, MEC Carlisle gives Billet free rein even though he does not help taxi associations. We would like to know how much money his department gave to Billet for the Cata and Codeta peace rally. We would like to know why the money was given to Billet. When was the money accounted for? Who accounted for the money? How much money was accounted for?

Mr Carlisle protects Mr Billet, his ally, the Chair and the Secretary of the Forum, namely Abdurahman and Williams, upon whom Billet is depending to ensure that he is re-elected as Santaco's provincial Chairperson.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member, your taxi has almost come to a standstill now. [Laughter.] Just finish off. [Interjections.] You can finish your last sentence. [Interjections.] Thank you.

Mr A M FIGLAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank you for the opportunity to take part in this debate. The hon Premier has my full support when she says that this province and South Africa face many problems, but as long as there is progress every day, the Western Cape will meet its set targets and thereby improve the lives of all the citizens of the Western Cape.

Seventy six per cent of the Western Cape's annual budget is spent on those who are less fortunate than what we are. It is geared to make the best possible educational and health services, and housing and social development programmes available to everybody.

The Western Cape has set aside R49 billion for the quality education of its children – it is more than a third of the provincial budget. It has to be noted that R100,6 million will provide extra teachers across all grades in the poorest schools.

The youth of the Western Cape should be encouraged to make use of all the opportunities which are available to them: We provide the best quality education. Year-on-year results have shown that – and the people of South Africa have taken note of that. The opportunities have been made available to all: It remains the duty of the individual to set a personal goal, study hard at one of the available ... [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, I think you should ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you. It remains the duty of the individual to set a personal goal, study hard at one of the available facilities and persevere in his or her endeavour to obtain that goal. It is only hard work that brings about change.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I'm a bit concerned because last month the City of Cape Town wrote off some rates where the ANC voted against it. They are the people who are looking after the poor. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape government has made it possible through its Youth Development Programmes to accommodate the Youth Wage Subsidies to companies. The youth employment incentive scheme means that companies employing young people will help to create jobs and develop skills. At the same time, the companies will pay less tax.

The Premier said that by giving in to the pressure from Cosatu, the ANC has prevented 200 000 young people from benefiting from the programme and stopped the creating of more than 80 000 new jobs.

The employment of youth workers will most certainly not replace other workers. It is a perception that has been created by those who oppose the Youth Subsidy. By making it possible for the youth to be more readily employed, a stronger workforce will be created. Essential workplace skills will once again be transferred which will contribute to the

strengthening of not only the Western Cape but of the South African economy in its entirety – highlighting the “Better Together” strategy of the DA.

Work experience gained through the Internship of the Premier’s prestige Advancement of the Youth Project has done much to enable the youth. There cannot be enough emphasis placed on the power of being able to help yourself.

The Western Cape government has set aside R140 million to create jobs over the next three years. The Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP) will sustain more than 250 000 medium-term job opportunities in the infrastructure, social, economic and environmental sectors. These are not just interventions, but real placements that will alleviate the plight of the poor in this province.

The province will also make R112,2 million available for the three skills intervention programmes for unemployed youth. Of this amount, R65,1 million has been awarded by the Jobs Fund. These programmes will focus on the development of skills, the training of artisans and the CAPACITI 1 000 programme.

The training of 500 artisans in the past year will contribute to the establishment of the Saldanha IDZ which has been completed in collaboration with the National Artisan Moderation Body which recognises prior experience of artisans without formal qualifications. The employment and enabling of the youth will not only be an effort by the government, it will be in partnership with the private sector – once again, Mr Deputy Speaker, better together.

Entrepreneurship, skills development and education are the only vehicles out of poverty. We therefore welcome the expansion of the Small Enterprise Development Agency. The continued meaningful support and advice given to new and emerging small, micro and medium enterprises will benefit entrepreneurs to a fair share of more than R24 million of the Enterprise Development Fund in the form of incentive grants. Quality support on matters ranging from how to develop a business plan, control a budget and export products, will be provided to hundreds of businesses.

The Western Cape is an integral part of South Africa: The National Development Plan must work for the whole country and the plan has to be implemented. Because the Western Cape can be relied on, we have been chosen by the national government to pilot three crucial initiatives under the NDP.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your last sentence, please.

Mr A M FIGLAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the growth has been made possible by the excellent credentials of the DA in government. [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, for the 2013-14 financial year, the Western Cape Department of Community Safety was allocated R388,5 million.

For the same period, R154 billion was allocated at a national level for the security cluster. The SAPS received R67,9 billion of that amount. The police also spent R131 million. This is

one-third of what we are allocated for carrying out all our services on legal fees, defending themselves against claims against them.

With a sizeable chunk of the ANC national budget going towards policing, one would expect to have an efficient and competent police service, yet this is clearly not the case. While there are many good police officers out there, it has become clear that there are also far too many officers who do not deserve to wear their badges.

By working better together, we can help the police to fix their future and ensure the best possible policing for our communities. Unfortunately, the ANC national government is not interested in oversight. They are not interested in partnerships. While it pleases me that the police I encounter at my public meetings and gatherings are supportive of our initiatives, it is disappointing that the ANC national government and the senior police leadership are still adamant that they can do things on their own and don't need oversight.

I must, however, thank some of the provincial leadership for trying to work with us. I understand it is not always easy when they must take direction from an ANC government at national level that is arrogant and insist on carrying on with business as usual. The time for business as usual is over. The time for partnerships is now. The time for innovation is now.

Mr Speaker, the Constitution of this country requires that oversight be carried out over the police and that we monitor police conduct. The Constitution allows any provincial government to appoint a commission of inquiry, yet national government resist our attempts

to carry out our constitutional duties and with their mammoth budget still fail to provide an efficient police service.

The police need all the help they can get and we are offering to help by simply asking the ANC national government to respect South Africa's Constitution and to allow us to carry out our constitutional duties.

Perhaps if the ANC government stopped ignoring the South African Constitution and started respecting our Bill of Rights, we would have a better police service and then police officers would not tie a man behind their vehicle and drag him through the streets. We would have communities that don't turn to vigilante violence as a result of losing faith in the police, and we would have prosecutions that put our criminals away instead of a court system that often sees police as the direct cause of the guilty walking free.

We will carry on with our constitutional mandate and help the communities where we can. We are waiting for the ANC national government to accept our help. We want to work with the police. Our oversight can help them provide a better service to our public.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, a number of members on that side of the House have made the absurd suggestion that the DA leadership or the DA policies somehow contribute to some successes in the province. [Interjections.]

The real truth is that not even the Premier, the national Leader of the DA, believes that the DA is an organisation that can take South Africa forward. [Interjections.] We know that

because it has been widely reported in the press that the hon Zille went to the federal leadership of the DA and proposed that the DA should be dissolved ... [Interjections.] ... and that another organisation should be formed which is led by Mamphela Ramphele. [Interjections.] That is what she thinks about the DA. [Interjections.] She has no confidence in the policies of the DA. [Interjections.] But, more importantly ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: Thank you. But, more importantly, she has no confidence in the leadership of that party. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member! Is that a question or a point of order?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, will the hon member take a question? [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No.

Mr M OZINSKY: If the Chief Whip gives me more time I will take his question after my speech.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Is that yes or no?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer is no. Please continue, hon member. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: With more time, I will have more time ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: In the hon Winde's time. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please continue.

Mr M OZINSKY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Let me repeat: Not even Helen Zille has confidence in the DA, or its leadership, to lead South Africa ... [Interjections. ... because if she had confidence she would not have gone to the Federal Executive of the DA and argued that the DA should be dissolved. [Interjections.]

Let me also say that the hon Zille owes the province and the country an explanation for that step. Why does she think the DA should be dissolved? Why does she think this leadership cannot lead the DA? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon Minister! [Interjections.] Order! I can't hear the hon Minister. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: On this side of the House, apart from the Premier, I am a member of the Federal Executive, and that has never happened ... [Interjections.] ... in the Federal Executive.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! That is not a point of order. [Interjections.] That is not a point of order. Please continue. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Thank you. It might not be a point of order, but it is not even the truth because the DA has never responded to the articles in the press that have made this point. You are too scared to go public on this issue. [Interjections.] Let me tell you why the hon Zille believes the DA should be dissolved. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! There is another interruption. Hon Minister, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: Can the hon Ozinsky please address the Chair. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will look at that. Please continue, hon member Ozinsky, and address the Chair. Thank you.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, the reason why she believes the DA should be dissolved is the same reason that we have been raising about this party and the leadership of this government that is meant to drive this budget. The reason is that there is no credible

black person who opposed apartheid who will join the DA under this leadership. [Interjections.] There is not one. [Interjections.] There is not one credible person who opposed apartheid who will join it. [Interjections.] Even those who ideologically find themselves in the DA, like Mamphela Ramphele, will not join the DA. That is a telling indictment.

A further reason is because of the white leadership of this party. If you just look over there you will see this leadership. [Interjections.] Even the Premier does not have confidence in the DA. Not only that, the Premier doesn't even have confidence to present DA policies. [Interjections.] All they can present in this debate is the National Development Plan (NDP), the NDP that was adopted by organisations that were led by the ANC. [Interjections.] This party doesn't even have confidence in its own policies. All it is doing is saying: Implement the NDP, the NDP which was adopted by an ANC government. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, let me say that when it comes to policies this government has been a failure. At the beginning of their term the hon MEC for Housing said: We are going to align housing policy with DA policy; we are not going to build houses, we are going to give housing opportunities. The facts are clear, even when it comes to housing opportunities – serviced sites. In the 2009-10 financial year, the government delivered 12 388 housing opportunities. [Interjections.] Yes, you don't want me to give these statistics. [Interjections.] In the 2010-11 financial year, 3 028 housing opportunities were delivered, a drop from 12 000 to 3 000, not even a quarter. During last year, only 8 686 housing opportunities were delivered, not even reaching the level of sites that the ANC government was able to give. Similarly with houses.

Does the hon Premier take action against this MEC? No! [Interjections.] Why does she not take action against this MEC? It is because he is the only African in that Cabinet. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: If she was to remove that MEC ... [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: ... there would be no African in that Cabinet. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! The hon Ozinsky is strong enough to make his own speech. [Interjections.] Mr Skwatsha, I am busy addressing the House.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are one of the culprits who is trying to assist him all the time. Please try and be quieter and give him the chance to make his own speech. Continue, Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: When you look at the Auditor-General's summaries of this government's performance, the most notable thing is the fact that the Auditor-General continually points to the lack of leadership from this government. [Interjections.] For instance, when the Auditor-General summarises all departments when it comes to effective leadership, what does he raise? It remains unchanged; oversight and responsibility, a regression; HR management, unchanged; policies and procedures, a regression; action plans, a regression; and IT, an improvement. [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: I suppose that's Limpopo.

Mr M OZINSKY: No, this is the Western Cape. [Interjections.] This is the Western Cape. [Interjections.] The list goes on. He says in his report, and this is an overall report about the whole government:

Responsibility for commitment not monitored effectively by management and MECs; management not taking ownership of key controls; inadequate discipline of credible monthly reporting and financial performance and compliance by management through use of internal control units.

When he looks at the key drivers for clean audit outcomes he has smiley faces and sad faces, like the hon Premier's face today. [Interjections.] And what are the sad faces? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: Sad faces. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please continue.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, there are sad faces when it comes to an increase of interaction between audit outcomes and MECs to provide assurance on credibility of information, in other words ,the MECs didn't do that. When it comes to encouragement of MECs to monitor progress on key controls you see a sad face. Those are the key issues that relate to the role of this leadership of government, and the Auditor-General reports a "sad face".

We also note, for instance, in the audit outcomes an increase in awards to employees of this government. This is an increase under DA time, and we are waiting for the hon Premier to stand up and say she is banning employees of government from doing business with government. [Interjections.] When? We are waiting to see the action. [Interjections.] The DA somehow claims that their policies have led to more growth in the province.

In fact, as the hon Uys has pointed out, the advantages of the province are not reflected in the statistics. For instance, the national unemployment figure is 24,9%; the unemployment figure for the province is 23,9%. There is no effective difference between them.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Your time has almost expired. Just finish off your last sentence.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is all very well to speak to yourselves, but deal with the facts that are presented by the Auditor-General and you will see that your government is failing to give oversight over the past ... [Time expired.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dit is baie duidelik dat die ANC nou kaderontplooïing opsygesit het en hulle volg nou ‘n nuwe plan, die “Manguang bashing-plan”. Enige mens wat nie vir President Zuma gestem het nie, moet nou met wortel en tak uitgeroei word deur die ANC.

Net hierdie week het ons gesien hoe ontbind hulle Limpopo se ANC-Jeugliga, die ANC-Jeugliga van Suid-Afrika sowel as the ANC-leierskap in Limpopo, en het hulle vervang met die volgende – ook met ‘n klomp taakspanne. [Tussenwerpsels.] My koppies het opgeraak. [Tussenwerpsels.] Ek kan nie meer vir u verduidelik nie want ek het nie genoeg koppies nie!

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde!

Die MINISTER: Hulle is die “taakspanparty” en hulle gaan uitmekaar val net soos hierdie koppies omwaai as ons bietjie hard praat!

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, na die begrotingsrede was die ANC ook weer baie vinnig uit die blokke om te kritiseer, maar die feit van die saak is hulle het alreeds ‘n beleid aangeneem – ons is in ‘n verkiesingsjaar – en die beleid se naam is “Kom ons maak die Wes-Kaap onregeerbaar”.

Ons het niks meer verwag van die ANC nie, want dit was nog nooit 'n party wat kon bou nie. Orals spreek die ANC-rekord net tot afbreek. Orals in hierdie land waar die ANC in beheer is, breek hulle af.

Mnr die Speaker, die DA-regering het hom egter ten doel gestel om die inwoners van die provinsie te dien deur topklas dienste daar te stel, en ons sal aanhou om doelgerig na daardie teiken te werk.

Ek wil die ANC en die mense van die Wes-Kaap herinner dat die ANC 'n geleentheid gehad het om die Wes-Kaap te regeer, maar hulle het die mense van die Wes-Kaap, soos die mense van Suid-Afrika, miserabelik gefaal. Hulle het die mense miserabelik gefaal deur hul eie agendas, hul eie "ek" bo die mense van die Wes-Kaap te stel.

Die DA se begroting is in die kol en spreek tot die onderhoud van bates; dit spreek tot die bou van nuwe infrastruktuur; en dit spreek tot armoedeverligting. Ek wil vir Minister Winde se hele span en die DA-beheer in hierdie provinsie baie geluk sê met hierdie poging.

Mnr die Speaker, ons word op 'n daaglikse basis bewus gemaak van die onvermoë van die ANC om effektief te regeer, en alles in hul vermoë word nou gedoen om korrupsie hok te slaan, maar dit is korrupsie wat die ANC self geskep het deur kaderontplooing.

Trevor Manuel het op 12 Maart 2013 by 'n simposium in die Oos-Kaap gesê dat die korrupsie binne die regering 'n bedreiging vir die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan is.

My colleague in his budget speech made a strong call on all government departments to deliver. After all, we are the government to serve those who trusted us with their future. In fact, we have a service delivery contract with our communities across the province, and Minister Winde's budget reflects the importance the provincial government has attached to the upliftment of those who are really in need by allocating approximately 76% of the provincial budget to social issues, upliftment and service delivery.

Why are we in the Public Service? Perhaps we should remind ourselves that, in fact, the word "Public Service" says it very clearly: We are here to ensure that our government and our municipalities are sustainable, affordable and deliver the services that our communities are in dire need of and voted for.

Mr Speaker, we have been witness to so-called service delivery initiatives in the other provinces that have fallen flat as a result of cadre deployment, whereas our efforts in this province are excellent, but this must spur us on to do even better in the future. We should leave no stone unturned in achieving what we have set out to do, and that is to become the best run provincial government in the world.

It is a well-known fact that a well-developed infrastructure is the key to job creation, and in our ongoing efforts to address poverty, this government will continue its initiatives to develop a corruption-free, efficient public sector. The key, therefore, to job creation is going to be infrastructure development and in this regard the departments and municipalities are going to

have to deliver on infrastructure projects that have been promised to the people of the province.

Mnr die Speaker, om net weer eens te herhaal: ons is die enigste provinsie wat jaar-op-jaar ons munisipale infrastruktuurtoekennings spandeer, en dit is 'n bewys van hoe ernstig ons dienslewering aan die publiek opneem.

The sustainability of our municipalities as well as the affordability are paramount and I have on a number of occasions over the past two years repeated this call, and we are now at that point in time where we have to ensure that we have municipalities that start functioning in the right way.

We also need to ask ourselves if we are really giving our people value for money. We are continually trying to relieve our communities of stress and problems they experience from poor leadership at municipal level, and ensure that they actually get value for money in terms of service delivery.

Mnr die Speaker, maar 'n snoek vrot van sy kop af en die werklike probleem is 'n leierlose, n selfdienende, selfgesentreerde en onbevoegde nasionale regering. All-out efforts are required to see how provincial government can address these critical issues we are all facing on a daily basis.

Mr Speaker, maybe I must repeat this also in the House. In fact, I want to quote what Nelson Mandela said in a speech in 1994 at a Cosatu congress:

If the ANC does to you what the apartheid government did to you, then you must do to the ANC what you did to the apartheid government.

Ek wil ook 'n paar items aanhaal wat vandag in die Huis gelewer is. Die agb Beerwinkel het gesê ons moet die ANC uitlos. Ek wil haar herinner dit is die nasionale ANC-wetgewing wat in die pad staan van ekonomiese groei. Die enigste manier om armoede te beveg, is deur ekonomiese groei. Sy praat van die kwaliteit van lewe. Sy moet gaan kyk in die sensus-dokumente dat die Wes-Kaap doen die beste op gratis basiese dienste, die Wes-Kaap is nommer een op basiese dienste, op luukshede doen ons mense in die Wes-Kaap ook die beste – dit wil sê, die lewe in die Wes-Kaap is beter as in enige ander provinsie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER: Mnr die Speaker, sy praat ook baie oor skole. Ek wil u herinner dat wanneer ons na skole kyk, sal ons sien dat 97,3% van ons leerders toegang tot skole het. Die regering van die Wes-Kaap doen sy deel; dit is nou die mense, die ouers en ons in hierdie Huis wat die kinders moet aanmoedig om skool toe te gaan en hul geleenthede te gebruik, maar hierdie regering het die geleentheid geskep dat 97,3% van ons kinders kan skoolgaan.

Ek weet nie of die agb Uys die Huis probeer mislei nie, maar hy sê munisipale dienste is swak. Hy moet in die sensus-dokumente gaan kyk. Dit is die beste in die land. Hoe gaan dit in die res van die land? Hy praat oor behuising, en die agb Ozinsky praat ook oor behuising. Laat ek hulle herinner dat my kollega sal kom by die bou van huise en hy sal sy teikens

behaal. Ons is net eers besig om die gemors-huise wat die ANC gebou het, ...
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Die SPEAKER: Orde, agb lede!

Die MINISTER: ... te herbou. [Tussenwerpsels.] As ons nie die ANC se huise hoef te herbou
het nie, dan sou ons al baie verder gewees het. [Tussenwerpsels.] Die agb Uys mislei die Huis
...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Die MINISTER: Mnr die Speaker, die agb Uys mislei die Huis as hy praat van werkloosheid
van 24,9%. Hy kan na die sensus-dokumente gaan kyk wat hy duidelik nog nie gelees het nie.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Die SPEAKER: Orde!

Die MINISTER: Ek sal vir hom die statistiek gee. Die werkloosheidsyfer volgens ...
[Tussenwerpsels.] ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Uys, order!

Die MINISTER: ... Statistiek Suid-Afrika is 29,8% in Suid-Afrika, en in die Wes-Kaap is dit
die laagste in die land teen 21,6%. Gaan lees jou dokumente. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Die MINISTER: Mnr die Speaker, ek wil die agb Ozinsky herinner ... [Tussenwerpsels.] ...

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

Die MINISTER: ... dat ek verwag niks meer van hom as 'n rassistiese toespraak nie, want die jare toe hy gebore is, kon net swart mense by die ANC aansluit, en dit lyk my hy het nog nooit na 1996 'n veranderende denkwysse ondergaan nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr die Speaker, ek wil herhaal: Die skoon oudit ... [Tussenwerpsels.] Die agb Ozinsky haal dokumente aan en ... [Tussenwerpsels.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Die MINISTER: ... hy gesels oor die skoon oudit. Ek wil vir agb Ozinsky herinner aan wat hierdie jaar gebeur het. Landbou was nommer een in die land; die Departement van Publieke Werke en die DA was nommer twee, gesamentlik, so die Wes-Kaap doen die beste en hulle kan dit nie vat nie.

Ek sê vir u dankie en baie geluk, kollega Winde. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Uys, hon members, hon Ozinsky, hon Ministers, order! Minister Winde, over to you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, I want to first of all thank all of those members who took part in this debate.

An HON MEMBER: Who made sense.

The MINISTER: Yes, as my colleague here says, “Who made sense”. That means I don’t have to address too many issues, but I will try to answer many of the questions and the issues raised.

I want to thank hon member Van Brandis, firstly, as chairperson of the standing committee, for the process that he has been leading over the past two weeks. He also spoke about the National Development Plan and there was a thread in that regard coming through the debates today.

He spoke about the four pilot projects. I must also reiterate that whether it was in the Economic Development Partnership (EDP), whether it was the formation of the EDP or the National Development Plan, the commissioners were involved in that process. This government, this Cabinet, also had two full Cabinet interactions with the commissioners and the Minister in the formation of the National Development Plan. In the last meeting we showcased many of our projects, including those four pilot projects that were spoken about. In a full Premier’s council all the Ministers and all the departments, and, of course, all the

municipalities were involved in an interaction with the National Development Plan. Obviously we, as a province, will support it absolutely. The plan itself is a good plan, and we will make sure that in this province we do deliver on that plan, even though it is not bought in wholeheartedly by all the members of the ANC.

The hon Beerwinkel started off talking about national government's money. I am very glad she moved over to say it is actually taxpayers' money – and it is taxpayers' money – and we've got to make sure that we spend this taxpayers' money wisely and efficiently. Of course, when you talk about taxpayers' money we must understand that there is a massive burden in this country on those taxpayers. We have got to grow the economy so we actually increase the number of taxpayers.

There are nearly 7 million taxpayers with 17 million people drawing down on grants. We need to make sure that we change that balance. We need to grow the economy. We need to shift the gini coefficient. Everybody in the House speaks about delivery to the poor. That is when we have to utilise reports. Those of you who need reminding, go and have a look at the gini coefficients. Of course, we know what the gini coefficient in the province is. We have a lot of work to do; we have a long way to go.

Go and have a look at the differences in the gini coefficient over the last while. Go back five years and look at the gini coefficient, and have a look at it now five years later, and you will see the difference. The big difference is that if you take measurements of metros in the different provinces you will see that the City of Cape Town moved from one of the worst gini coefficients to the best performing metro as far as the gini coefficient is concerned in South

Africa. As I said, we've still got a long way to go, but you will see, as the hon Minister Bredell said, that whenever these measurements come out you will find that this province has the best delivery numbers. Of course, these delivery numbers are indicators. We have to continue spending our money in the right place so that we change those numbers year-on-year for the better of the people of the province.

The hon Beerwinkel spoke about infrastructure spend. I am not going to go into that now because we are talking about the budget going forward. The infrastructure spend of the province will be measured at the end of this financial year, but go back and have a look at when the ANC governed the province and the infrastructure spend.

The hon member spoke about the third quarter. That is just sucking a number out of the middle of the year. Why didn't you talk about the first quarter and the percentages in the first quarter? [Interjections.] Of course, they report to the House quarterly. Have a look at the end of the day and judge us overall in the term on delivery on infrastructure and judge us on the end of the financial year.

She spoke about the size of the book that counts. I want to say it is not the size of the book that counts. She holds up two annual reports and says, "Look at this thick one; this must be much better than this thin one." It is actually about the content in that book; not the size of the book. [Interjections.] At the end of the day, it is about changing the outcomes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: She said a lot about Education, but it is about changing the outcomes over time. I mentioned the gini coefficient. It is about changing the gini coefficient measurement constantly over time. In Education it is about exactly the same thing. We must all agree that if you look at the outcomes of South Africa's Education as measured internationally by the World Economic Forum, by the Competitiveness Report, you will see how shockingly South Africa comes out as opposed to our spend – one of the highest spends in the world. Have a look at the measurements over time, but I will leave that to my colleague, the Minister of Education, when we get into the Votes, and he will show you that in the province that change is constantly happening. [Interjections.] That change is constantly happening.

I want to thank the hon Haskin for again mentioning Brand South Africa. It is for us to deliver what we want to do. As I said in the very beginning, the Brand South Africa that we have to deal with at the moment is a massive hindrance for us to really change that unemployment rate and to really grow our economy.

You also welcomed the budget and I thank you for that. You spoke about Brand South Africa. This Cabinet met, I think, three weeks ago with the agency Brand South Africa, but we actually need that leadership, as I said, to come from those members in the House that sit on the NEC and get them to start to take that leadership and responsibility for Brand South Africa. [Interjections.]

You spent a lot of time talking about agriculture and what's happening within agriculture. It was interesting post these strikes that in South Africa as a whole 51 000 jobs were lost just in

the month of January in agriculture. The hon Van Rensburg spoke a bit about that and he will also address that in his budget Vote.

The hon Van Rensburg really spoke about where the ANC policies keep people impoverished and keep people poor versus the DA policies. That reminded me of a speech that was made by Margaret Dongo, an opposition MP in the Zimbabwe Government – this was many years ago, I think about 10 or 12 years ago. She made a statement that governments in Africa don't really want to make a difference to the poor; they want to keep their people poor because that keeps a hand-hold on the public that they are supposed to serve. [Interjections.] I think that is absolutely what the ANC do. They try to keep their people poor, but I promise you that in this province we do exactly the opposite. The proof at the end of the day is in the pudding ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: The hon Ozinsky was speaking about this earlier. What would have happened then is that the ANC would not have lost the last election in the province; the voters decide at the end of the day. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: But you lost in eight provinces.

The MINISTER: The hon Ncedana ... [Interjections.] But just you watch; I'll get to you now, Mr Ozinsky.

The hon Ncedana also spoke about the budget but he said the devil is in the detail and he spoke about the annual performance plans ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Ozinsky and hon Brown, order!

The MINISTER: ... and making sure that we stick to those plans with their measurements. He spoke about political will in fixing the mistakes and taking responsibility for actually making sure that those plans get delivered on. I can assure you that with the systems in place within the government, with the mechanisms of dashboard reporting and with the mechanisms of our cluster systems, transversal, we will make sure that we actually take that political responsibility to deliver on these plans that we have put in place.

The hon Pierre Uys first of all spoke about housing delivery. What he didn't mention was the R50 billion that South Africa has to spend specifically on the ANC's "chasing numbers policies" where they had to chase the numbers, and now those houses are falling to pieces and we've got to make sure that we go back in to repair those houses. [Interjections.]

There is also direction into the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon members, hon Minister, hon Magwaza, order! [Interjections.] Hon Minister Madikizela and hon Brown, order! We can't hear the Minister. [Interjections.] Hon Brown, Order!

The MINISTER: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

You will also see that there is considerable investment going into infrastructure, because if we don't have the infrastructure in place we cannot build those houses. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Brown, order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Proceed, hon Minister. [Interjections.] No, your interjection is too loud, hon Brown. I cannot allow you.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I was not speaking now.

The SPEAKER: Thanks. Proceed, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I think you are biased; that's the problem.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Brown, take your seat. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I respect her. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order!

The MINISTER: The hon Uys also spoke about the unemployment numbers and the hon Bredell also mentioned them. Take the 24% that we speak about in the budget speech as of today, and look at the numbers that the Census come through with in the now narrow 21,6% in the province. If you consider that over the last 10 years – over 10 years ago it was 25,1%, coming down to 21,6% – and you have a look at that with a 30% growth in the number of

people in the region over that period of 10 years, it is quite phenomenal considering the downturn in the economy. You should also have a look at that gap between narrow and expanded versus the national gap between narrow and expanded. People come here for opportunities, but over that period people have also been finding those opportunities.

The hon Wiley again spoke about the brand and the brand damage specifically that the police are giving us internationally as a nation. He also spoke about the lack of leadership within the police. That is absolutely key where it is; it is a lack of leadership. Wherever you see brand damage you will see the leadership needs to step in and take control and charge. [Interjections.] Exactly, hon Brown. I hope you are going to use your position on the NEC ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Exactly the same lack of leadership ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: ... to take forward ... [Interjections.] I am talking about the leadership and you'll see in the reporting in the province how it turns to the positive. [Interjections.] Let's talk about the lack of leadership ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: ... at a national level that turns to the absolute negative.

You mentioned the contingent liability number of R5,3 billion growing to R20 billion. That is really an astronomical number and it is unacceptable that we have those kinds of contingent

liabilities. Who is monitoring that budget? It is leadership again, and I hope the hon Brown will pick that up because it is damaging our brand tremendously. [Interjections.]

The member spoke about *Time* magazine. It goes to this whole discussion, and that is what I started with – we cannot afford it. We have to turn that around and we all need to take that responsibility of turning that massive brand damage around.

Mr Speaker, I now come to the hon Stali. I am not sure what I need to say there. I think most of your speech you can save again for the budget Vote on Transport; you can just repeat it again. I am not going to answer the hon Carlisle's questions. I wrote down here, "Who wrote your speech?", but I won't get into that. What I do want to say is you made a very strong ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: ... statement about "Minister Carlisle's corrupt political agents". I trust that you stand by your statement, leave the House and move straight to the police station to lay a charge. [Interjections.] I trust that you will do that so that when you stand up here later when we have the budget Vote you can say, "I made that statement in the House and I've gone and laid the charge" because then you stand by your statement. You cannot make those kinds of statements without following through. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Carry on, please, Minister.

The MINISTER: I want to thank hon Figlan for his contribution. He spoke about jobs, he spoke about the youth and he spoke about skills, all specifically focused at changing the lives of the poor and about creating opportunities for the lives of the poor. You also spoke about the NDP pilot programmes, and I have mentioned that already.

I also want to thank hon Minister Plato. You also went to the brand damage that the police are doing to our country, and we need to make sure we take charge of it. You spoke about our role as oversight and exactly what's happening at the moment, where the ANC are trying to block that role of oversight. We will persevere and we will push through and make sure that we play our role in that leadership space of making a difference for the people in the province.

When the hon Ozinsky started off it seemed as if he was pretty worried about the stuff that is said about the DA in the newspapers. Don't worry about that; let's go back and check and see what the voters decide at the end of the day – what the voters decided in the last election in the province – and see what the voters do in the next election ... [Interjections.] Nationally, yes. Let's go and see the change because continually we've grown in strength and continually you've lost in strength.

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: You are obviously not reading the numbers correctly.

Quite interestingly, you also spoke about housing opportunities and when we came in with the DA policy of housing opportunities. It wasn't long after that that the national Minister of Housing started following through with exactly the same comments that we'd been making all along. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, he actually destroyed ... [Interjections.]
They were badly built. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You also spoke about the National Development Plan, ... [Interjections.] ... but in your own political party ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: ... only half of them seem to support the National Development Plan.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Magaxa! Order!

The MINISTER: I noticed that the hon Bredell wasn't warned when he took out his cups again ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Carry on, please.

The MINISTER: I am sorry that we didn't actually get to see you talking about those cups. I saw that the Speaker was giving you some leeway there.

You spoke about the Auditor-General's report, and perhaps I must also speak about the Auditor-General's report. The hon Ozinsky showed that one over there, but what about this one here? You need to go through this one. I can assure you that we will continue ... [Interjections.] This is the one that the Auditor-General across South Africa launched last week. If you go and have a look at this you will see that the Western Cape continually outperforms any of the other provinces – continually – and we will continue to do that. We will continue to push the boundaries to make sure that this measurement helps us deliver on the other measurements that I've spoken to. Whether it be job creation, the growth of our economy, or whether it be the gini coefficient changes, we will continue to use these various tools and we will always push the boundaries to try and outperform ourselves year-on-year to get better and to improve. That's exactly what we will do and we will continue to do it, unlike the ANC in other provinces.

Mr Speaker, I came across this newspaper – a 24-page newspaper – that was distributed by the Free State Province. It is a Free State provincial newspaper distributed nationally. I wonder how much money this cost and why it was only used at the end of the financial year, why 24 pages of a provincial government needs to be sent across the whole of South Africa to report on how it does. [Interjections.] Perhaps as the leadership ... [Interjections.] Perhaps as the leadership in the ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: ... NEC, hon Skwatsha and hon Brown who has just left, will take those kinds of issues up because it is about leadership that we need to take those strong stances across South Africa to change the brand, to change the way we spend our money and how we spend our money. I will give that to you, hon Skwatsha, if you want it. We need to show how we spend our money correctly and efficiently in the interests of the people that we govern.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: Can the hon MEC address the House through the Speaker, please?

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I repeat: I hope hon Skwatsha and hon Brown take up these leadership issues at a national level, because we in the province are ... [Interjections.] We in the province need that leadership change to change the way and the inefficient mechanisms within the ANC government that are taking us as a country downhill. We need to change those things. We will continue to deliver the best that we can. We will continue with the kind of reporting that we get in the province, outperforming any other province, and we will continue to strive to improve that year-on-year.

Debate concluded.

Principle of the Bill approved.

**WES-KAAPSE WETSONTWERP OP
VERVOERINFRASTRUKTUUR [W 9—2012]**

(Finalisering)

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Speaker, die Wes-Kaapse Wetsontwerp op Vervoerinfrastruktuur sal die Minister van Vervoer in die Wes-Kaap, of die relevante munisipaliteite, die nodige gesag gee om die verantwoordelikheid vir die vervoerinfrastruktuur te kan neem.

Dit sal die verantwoordelike gesag in staat stel om die beplanning, ontwerp, konstruksie, bestuur en finansies verbonde aan vervoerinfrastruktuur effektief en doeltreffend te behartig. 'n Belangrike voorsiening in die wetgewing is die appèlproses wat dit moontlik maak om teen die besluite wat geneem word, te kan appelleer.

Die wetgewing is sonder enige wysigings eenparig deur die Staande Komitee op Finansies en Ekonomiese Ontwikkeling aanvaar.

Vir al die bogenoemde redes ondersteun ek die wetgewing.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, firstly, the hon member Ncedana asked that all these Bills be printed in three languages; they are printed in all three languages.

This is a Bill which replaces 16 Acts, some of them going back as far as 1940, and it amends one Act. It deals with a whole range of matters regarding transport, advertising, infrastructure and many other things to do with that. There is nothing controversial about it.

I want to thank the people who have helped put it together over many years, particularly Malcolm Watters and his team up there, and I would ask the House to support the Bill.

Debate concluded.

Bill finalised.

**CAPE TOWN INTERNATIONAL CONVENTION CENTRE
COMPANY AMENDMENT BILL [B 10B — 2012]**

(Finalisation)

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, this is a technical amendment to the International Convention Centre Company Act of 2000. It is really getting the Bill ready as we will be spending a lot more money, as a province, over the next few years to double the size of the Convention Centre. I think we are also using this opportunity because the Bill has been around for a while, to clean up technical areas that needed to be cleaned up.

We know that the Convention Centre has been a huge success as far as job creation is concerned and attracting investment into the region. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: We know that just in the last financial year they have contributed R2,55 billion to the national GDP and R902 million to the provincial GDP and they have also provided 7 082 jobs. A total of 514 events have been held in the Convention Centre and they have a client satisfaction of 81%.

This amendment is so that we can make sure that the operations of the board and the operations of the Convention Centre itself, and our relationship with this municipal entity – and also as a co-partner, and any areas where we needed to clean up – are fixed and amended. It aligns it to the PFMA and it allows us the mechanisms and processes to make sure that we improve governance with this entity.

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Speaker, die Wysigingswetsontwerp op die Kaapstadse Internasionale Konvensiesentrum-maatskappy maak voorsiening vir die tegniese voorskrifte wat nodig is vir die uitbreiding, soos die Minister reeds vir ons verduidelik het. Die uitbreiding is natuurlik noodsaaklik om die beste internasionale konvensiesentrum-bestemming in die wêreldvisie te wees en te kan realiseer teen 2020.

Die sukses van die Kaapstadse Internasionale Konvensiesentrum-maatskappy is al goed gedokumenteer oor die afgelope nege jaar van sy bestaan, en Kaapstad het nagenoeg 'n 50%-

markaandeel vir konferensies wat in Afrika gehou word. Boonop is daar reeds oor die 800 bevestigde besprekings wat so ver vooruit dateer as 2020.

Mnr die Speaker, die Minister het uitgewys waarvoor hierdie wysigingswetsontwerp voorsiening maak.

Ek kan net verder kommentaar lewer om te sê dat tydens die formele oorweging van die konsepwetgewing in die staande komitee is beswaar aangeteken deur die ANC-verteenwoordiger, agb Beerwinkel, oor klousule 3. Klousule 3 maak voorsiening vir die aanstelling van een of meer geskikte persone van buite die diens van die provinsiale regering as provinsiale verteenwoordigers in die Raad van Conenco, en die besoldiging van hierdie persone.

Oorweging en 'n wysiging aan die klousule om die ANC te akkommodeer, was egter onsuksesvol. Ten spyte hiervan het die res van die lede, en al die ander partye van die komitee, geen beswaar aangeteken nie en is die konsepwetsontwerp, met die addisionele wysiging aan klousule 3, wel aanvaar.

Mnr die Speaker, vir al die bogenoemde redes ondersteun ek die Wysigingswetsontwerp op die Kaapstadse Internasionale Konvensiesentrum-maatskappy, en ek bedank, in besonder, me Bianca Mpulasa vir haar toewyding en hulp. Sy het regtig uit haar pad uitgegaan om hierdie wetgewing deur te voer.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, I firstly want to thank the chairperson of the standing committee for allowing me in the committee meeting to express my concerns about certain clauses. However, I would like to explain them myself here today.

Most of the amendments stipulated in the Cape Town International Intervention Company Amendment Bill are but bells and whistles and braces amendments.

However, Mr Speaker, the most fundamental amendment is the additional inclusion of clause 3, as you've just heard, which provides for the appointment of one or more persons from outside the employ of the provincial government and for their remuneration. However, it doesn't make sense that just by extending the Convention Centre that necessitates an amendment of representation.

The reason for this amendment is also because this person, or persons, may possess a specific skill or qualification, or have experience that, in the opinion of the provincial Cabinet, might benefit Convenco. The above appointee may then be paid such remuneration, as to be determined by the Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism.

Here are my concerns, Mr Speaker. That person or those persons must then exercise the powers and functions of a provincial representative and in the best interests of Convenco; that sounds like a contradiction. It must be remembered that this person is being paid by the province to sit on the Convenco board, yet Convenco pays its own board members.

The Convenco Board consists of 14 members: 4 for the City of Cape Town; 2 for the Western Cape – currently two officials who are not paid by the board because they are already remunerated in the province; 5 independants; 1 reserved for Sunwest; 1 CEO; and 1 CFO. Why then, Mr Speaker, can these experts with the skills and expertise not come from those five independent positions? Who pays the piper calls the tune. Why does the Western Cape want to hold onto its representatives, and why did we not see any of these allocations made in any budget for the possible remuneration of those representatives?

This is all about control of the board via the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes, I know. His eyes can only go one way. If this is an open and transparent process, then one doesn't understand why the specific clause has to be added in the way that it was added because in general it is the responsibility of the province to have representatives there, and it is also the responsibility of either the Minister of Finance, or Economic Development, to make those changes. So there is a specific reason why this clause was put in the way that it is, and that was my objection to this amendment to the Bill.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, I firstly want to thank the chairperson of the standing committee for dealing with this legislation and getting it to the House.

I must perhaps also use this opportunity to answer the hon Beerwinkel. Firstly, we already have two seats on the board. They are not remunerated because they are officials of this government, and government officials represented on any board will not be remunerated, but we are spending a huge amount of taxpayers' money.

We also understand that we have a thing called "King 3" and we have to understand that when we put forward nominations of people to boards we will nominate them in the best interests of the taxpayers' money and of the province. We also need to know that should we need to put a specialist on that board in the interests of the province and our shareholding in this Convenco Board, we will still remain a minor shareholder. Whoever we put on the board – whether it is one of our senior officials or someone from outside with a certain specialist expertise – and as we spend money on this centre in the interests of the province to make sure that we have the right people there to give us the right representation, we will still remain a minority shareholder. So it is not about taking control of any board; it is about the best interests of the people of the province in an entity where we have a minor shareholding.

The hon member spoke about change and the budget process. It doesn't have to come through a budget process because we don't even have any person nominated. It creates the opportunity for us, should we need to in the outer year, which you will already see in the budget the amount of money that we've put in for the Convention Centre, or our contribution towards the upgrading of the Convention Centre.

Mr Speaker, I therefore move that we conclude this piece of legislation.

Debate concluded.

Bill finalised (ANC dissenting).

The House adjourned at 19:00.