
TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2013

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS – see p

VOORSTEL

Die HOOFSWEEP: Mnr die Speaker, ek stel voor:

Dat ondanks die bepalings van Reël 149(3) die volgende wetsontwerpe weer aan die gang gesit word en die oorweging daarvan hervat word van die stadium wat daarmee bereik is gedurende die vorige sessie:

(1) Die Wes-Kaapse Wetsontwerp op Gemeenskapsveiligheid [W8 – 2012].

(2) Wes-Kaapse Wetsontwerp op Vervoerinfrastruktuur [W9 – 2012].

(3) *Wysigingswetsontwerp op die Kaapstadse Internasionale Konvensiesentrum-Maatskappy* [W10 – 2012].

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, from the side of the ANC we can't support the motion as stated by the Chief Whip.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, have you raised an objection hon Uys?

Mr P UYS: Yes, at this stage against the motion.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. I then put the question: Those who are in favour of the motion will say aye and those who are against it will say no. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Can we just get order here, Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Can you repeat that?

Mr P UYS: Can you just repeat please.

The SPEAKER: Hon Uys, you say you object ... [Interjections.] Order, hon members! You say you object to the motion; is that what you said? [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Hon Speaker, can you just go through it? There are objections and there are ... [Interjections.] There are people talking ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Uys, do you want me only to record the objection?

Mr P UYS: No, I want you to let us vote on it, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: That is what I am doing, hon member; that's what I am doing. You can record the objection, if you want to do so, but if you want us to follow the process, that is the process that we are following.

Hon Uys, let me repeat myself to accommodate you. For the last time: Those in favour of the motion being agreed to will say aye and those who are against it will say no.

It seems that the ayes have it. Can we then proceed, hon members.

PREMIER'S STATE OF THE PROVINCE ADDRESS

(Debate)

The SPEAKER: I have received a copy of the Premier's State of the Province Address delivered in the House on Friday. The Address is printed in the minutes of the proceedings. I now place it before the House for debate.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker, hon Premier, members of the House, and Cabinet Ministers. Thank you very much for the opportunity.

Every Premier gets an opportunity once a year to inspire and bring hope to a province and all its people before disclosing the budget and unpacking projects. This Premier missed it and illustrated a spectacular lack of imagination, vision and direction.

Not only was the statement thin on policy, the one-time Mayor of Cape Town, DA leader and now Premier of the Western Cape proffered the citizens piecemeal offerings. Merely emulating the ANC, plagiarising others and hijacking the Nelson Mandela legacy.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The DA mimics ANC slogans, while showing a disingenuous and dangerous indifference to the need of the people. The Premier needs to do a reality check about her same-old-same-old approach.

Glossing over the debilitating issues of rape and other crimes, the socioeconomic abuse of the poor, the realities of the working class and the unemployed, the purging of black staff, rural underdevelopment, and the impact of making basic education even more accessible shows the absence of vision.

Not only did the Premier put forth cosmetic solutions mixed with pipedreams and schemes, she actually did so without shame in the face of the voices that continue to draw attention to the real state of the province.

This year the Premier's address seems more like a swansong. It indicates she is heading in another direction, leaving the Western Cape abandoned to its own devices. [Interjections.] She wraps up before she evaporates.

The Western Cape Premier is moonlighting as she comes here to rest after spending her time frolicking in other provinces despite the work she has to do for the people of this province.

Evidence has been seen of how, when provincial polemics arise, the Premier is moonshine and disappears like vapour before the sun, and flees elsewhere to make appearances in the front gardens of others instead of dealing with issues here in her own backyard. Remarkably, she has more to say about other provinces, but remains resiliently silent on salient matters here.

The questionable and elaborate history lesson we were given was further made ludicrous with jumbled information about the regional economy. The information jettisoned the issues of the majority withholding meaningful and sustainable solutions.

The Premier tries to prove herself by referring to a so-called "Better Together" and "whole of society" slogans", yet she perpetuates her inherent refugee inclination with at least four different references to people from other areas or countries that may well inculcate an intolerant and xenophobic reaction and further divide our people. Her lip service to nation-building is redundant by her own words veiled with euphemisms like "in-migration". When the moonshine of word-icing evaporates, Speaker, only the refugee tag stays.

The Premier does not provide detail on how to deal with the scourge of rape child abuse, gang violence, substance abuse, teenage pregnancies and the high incidence of TB. She says we have the highest incidence of solutions to TB, but what she fails to say is that we actually have the highest incidence of TB, which is a socioeconomic disease that plagues the poor daily.

In fact, if only the Premier could head off to the media with the same haste to denounce the violence our people experience in communities, like she did in response to me by denying the purging of black senior staff members. But she knows the truth: Since she took office five heads of department, including the DG, were forced to leave. They were slapped with gagging orders and disciplinary hearings; and other tactics are used to get rid of highly educated professionals in the province.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Who said that?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: In the most crucial department, social development, a DA youth member now acts as the head of department, after I warned you last year you can't appoint a CFO in such a crucial department. In that department there are several black skilled and experienced officials. They are good enough to meet protesters and receive memoranda on your behalf when you run away, but not good enough to run the department. It boggles the mind. I will use the next few weeks to give meat to my assertion. I've listened to a number of very fearful officials on the possibilities of them being fired. As their fears subside, I trust their story will be told.

In fact, her idea of all should work together is reminiscent of the gala breakfast arranged by the farm animals. She is like the hen that volunteers eggs, while the pigs have to donate their lives to supply the bacon. This is found in the many remarks that indicate everyone else carries a bigger burden than her own contribution to make her ideas work.

She told us we should start counting, I suppose because of our inferior education or something. Now let me do that. The Premier claims the DA-led government can only build a limited number of houses.

The PREMIER: That's national's problem.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: She is, in fact, so brave as to say houses will only be built at a rate of 15 000 per year, blithely further reducing her department's already lowered target that it has set for itself.

However, after governing for four years, if one uses her own figures, she should have delivered 60 000 units to date. What does the Premier, however, tell us in this regard? She boasts about her government's achievement of having built 48 200 houses. That is about 12 000 families that did not get the houses they were promised by the DA – measured against her own estimates and targets! Where did the fourth year of building evaporate to?

With this government's own reduced home building figures there are far more people who are disappointed and without a home. Against the DA's misplaced 19th century philanthropy

concern for the unemployed poor evaporates and the poor are reduced to voting cows in the DA kraal.

The spin and lies even go further than just being about the provision of adequate housing, as even the so-called supply of serviced sites only perpetuates the slums of informal settlements.

The handing-over ceremony for political point-scoring during a byelection that we saw around the province – such as in Witzenberg where title deeds were so-called “symbolically” given to the people, rather than the real “kaart en transport” ownership – smacks of gentrified truth. To give certificates for the show and then taking them back is like the empty promise to stop given by an abuser to a victim. Again the paternalistic mask of empathy quickly slips and glimpses of hope evaporate like fog or moonshine.

The lip service paid to the National Development Plan is premised on a misreading of the DA’s antimajority policies and rests solely on a parasitical understanding of a few that are permitted to suck super profits from the country. The DA just doesn’t see itself as serving the whole country, but rather drives divisive actions and wedges for political gain, which I believe is tantamount to treason. In this the refugee-as-problem mentality, for which the DA is famous, is very prominent.

The constant DA bragging and incessant boasting aimed at creating the perception of the Western Cape as being an island in an intercontinental competition is self-destructive and sick to the core. The notion that the province outshines all others is deprived of facts and figures to back it up. Materially the province has regressed since the DA took control.

According to the labour market statistics of the New Growth Path year period for the third quarter, the Western Cape slipped further behind other provinces like Gauteng, KwaZulu Natal and even Limpopo on many vital indicators, especially those pertaining to jobs and opportunity creation for the youth. While the Premier purports to cut a better deal for the youth this is all cheap and obfuscating political postulation.

Let's inform the Premier and the DA that Gauteng increased its youth jobs almost four times that of the Western Cape's 56 000, while Limpopo and Kwa-Zulu Natal has doubled that of the Western Cape. In fact, the Western Cape trails seventh amongst the nine provinces with only 3% higher employment figures, while Limpopo leads by 20%. Most new jobs for the youth were also created in Limpopo, Gauteng and the Northern Cape. This is a regression of spectacular scope for the Western Cape, which is fixated with comparing itself to other provinces. The DA's claims continue to evaporate like moonshine - again.

The DA's dalliances with hardened criminals like gangsters and druglords and effectively siding against law-abiding citizens has not gone unnoticed. The collection of donations and support from figures in the underworld for the DA by prominent leaders also does not go unnoticed.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You should know. It is claimed that arch criminals have the DA in their pockets. Even a high flyer like Donkey Booysen is said to get political protection from the DA as he was regularly seen in the company of certain DA leaders.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Who's that?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The nanny state has read us the riot act on all the evils in the world. Madam Premier, it doesn't work like that; it won't change just because you say it's wrong. It only changes when you empower our people to grow veggie gardens, ensure that the feeding scheme is well-balanced and that during elections when you hand out food parcels, you consider all of your instructions.

It changes when you get buy-in from the public because you have raised enough awareness. It starts with yourselves. The DA councillors who have driven drunk or without a valid driver's license should be charged.

Even more disconcerting are the recent reports – or not so recent reports - about the role of DA MECs Botha, Grant and Winde, as well as some DA councillors inciting and funding violent unrest, illegal land invasion ... [Laughter.] ... and the orchestrated stoning of councillors, public property and municipal staff in the Bitou Municipality in 2007 to destabilise the ANC. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Do you expect us to believe that?

The SPEAKER: Order, order!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: There are serious allegations of influencing the investigation. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members!

Die HOOFSWEEP(DA): Mnr die Speaker, op 'n punt van orde: ek teken beswaar aan teen die stelling van die agb Leier van die Opposisie wat van die Kabinetslede van ons Parlement karakteriseer as betrokkenes by 'n opstokery.

The SPEAKER: What?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No, I was busy with my microphone. I didn't hear. Can you repeat yourself, hon Chief Whip.

Die HOOFSWEEP: Mnr die Speaker, ek teken beswaar aan teen die stelling van die Leier van die Opposisie dat lede van die Parlement betrokke is by opstokery en geweld ...
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: That is not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon Leader of the Opposition, address the Chair.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Sorry, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Are you acknowledging that you said what the chief whip says you said?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I did so in my speech. I didn't do anything. What are you asking me, Mr Speaker?

Mr M G E WILEY: Scurrilous remarks.

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, I will deal with the matter later because I don't understand exactly what you have said, but I will ... [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Order! I will refer it to Hansard, and if there is anything of that nature I will come back to the House. Thank you very much. You may proceed, hon Brown.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: Is it in order for a member to show the Speaker that he must listen to the Chief Whip of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: That's not a point of order, hon Skwatsha. [Interjections.] You may proceed, hon Brown.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: In fact, Mr Speaker, we might correct that for the Chief Whip. If the Premier establishes an independent investigation, we would then be very happy to withdraw the statement.

This follows hot on the heels of the credibility issues plaguing the DA leaders, like the New Age breakfast, her utterances that there were no blacks in the Cape for over 300 years, the

TBWA communications contract and the improper DA cadre deployment, as well as, of course, the continuing Makhaza saga, or especially the fact that no evidence substantiated the claims of corruption under ANC tenure in this province – to name just a few.

This Premier would never get any recognition for her performance here last Friday. The glitz, the gadgets and the flowers could not spruce up her underwhelming act. [Interjections.]

As the Premier has passed the age for retirement, she should take a leaf from the book of eminent leaders and go to rest, or she should spend Thursday showing us something different.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Mr Speaker, thank you for the opportunity to take part in the debate on the State of the Province Address of Premier Helen Zille.

As the political executive, she reported back on the delivery mandates of the Western Cape Cabinet. Her report card is supported by evidence as contained in the many national accolades her government has received.

After receiving the National Development Plan, this government has acknowledged that this is the most comprehensive development plan South Africa has seen in recent times. In the spirit of Better Together, her administration offered three projects to be implemented as part of the National Development Plan. The Premier has referred to this in her speech – reducing red tape, the economic development partnership and the comprehensive after school programme.

In addition to that, the Premier also added a fourth one, the Youth Wage Subsidy project. The DA believes, and she believes, that giving the youth opportunities is the key to unlock economic growth and job creation. The DA believes she's opening opportunities for the youth. Under Premier Zille, these opportunities are open to the youth in this province.

However, Mr Speaker, it is sad and tragic that Premier Zille is the only Premier that implements the Youth Wage Subsidy in South Africa. No other ANC Premier is creating opportunities for the youth through the Youth Wage Subsidy, because it is trapped in an outdated communist alliance with the SACP and Cosatu.

Premier Zille is determined to further roll out opportunities for the youth, because she understands that the youth want freedom they can use. The ANC fought for the freedom of the youth, but now that they have that freedom, it prevents the youth from using that freedom. Premier Zille is determined to see that the youth have the freedom they could use.

Unlike your thinking, the youth is fully aware that the ANC is blocking the Youth Wage Subsidy, and they will punish you at the ballot-box in 2014.

Mr Speaker, the Premier has also referred to the criminal justice system in her speech. A sound and well-functioning criminal justice system is critical to any society that values the rule of law. Almost two decades into our constitutional democracy, far too many of our citizens fall victim to crime, and alarmingly substantial numbers succumb to serious crime. The Premier has alluded to the circumstances that gave rise to her appointing a Commission of Inquiry into alleged police inefficiency in Khayelitsha, after receiving representations from

civil society. The Western Cape High Court ruled against the national Minister of Police's application for an urgent interim interdict intended to stop the Commission.

What remains unresolved is the anxiety of large sections of the community at ineffective investigations of crime, the long delays at court and eventual acquittals on technicalities – for example, investigating officers not turning up at court, dockets gone astray, witnesses not subpoenaed, forensic evidence not available, or crucial witnesses simply not called by the prosecution.

‘n AGB LID: Skande!

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, are we to allow this state of affairs to continue and create circumstances where mob rule and vigilante killings displace the rule of law? Are we to allow that we degenerate into a state where victims of crime take the law into their own hands? Is self-justice a better option than to be subjected to a laborious and ineffective criminal justice system?

The Premier has also alluded to the lengths that the Western Cape Government must go in order to monitor progress, or mostly the lack thereof, in criminal matters that this government has an interest in, for example where we feature as a complainant. This would range from thefts at museums to motor vehicle accidents and more serious crime. We appoint watching briefs. In my view, this is necessitated by enduring impasses at courts. It should not be necessary if the prosecuting authority was in some way or another accountable to either the Provincial Executive or this legislature.

Our constitutional framework recognises provincial interests in the criminal justice system. It allows, for example, significant oversight over the Provincial Police Commissioner by this legislature. In a sense, the Provincial Police Commissioner is accountable to two spheres of government, the National Police Commissioner and the Provincial Executive. The Constitution also provides for the Premier of the province concerned to be a member of the Judicial Service Commission when matters relating to a specific High Court, including appointments to the Bench, are at stake.

Mr Speaker, so what do we have here? We have provinces involved in an oversight role over the Provincial Police Commissioner. Provincial needs and priorities must be taken into account when the National Policing Policy is formulated. Provinces, through their respective Premiers, have a vote when judges are appointed to the High Court, yet there is no accountability of the prosecuting corps to the provincial sphere of government.

In order to bring justice closer to the inhabitants of this province I suggest a review of the accountability of the prosecuting authority. The Regional Director of Public Prosecutions ought to be accountable also to the provincial legislature, or the Executive, in the scheme that currently warrants oversight over the Police Commissioner. By this proposal, I do not envisage absolute control over prosecutors, but instead some mechanism to ventilate systemic delays and to serve as a platform to inquire into reasons for not prosecuting.

I know there are review options, but it is taking years. We can summons the DPP to appear before committees of the legislature. It is an option to be considered.

There are many areas of concurrent national and provincial competencies and, rationally, I cannot see why the Regional Director of Public Prosecutions should not be accountable to the provincial legislature in the same way as the Provincial Police Commissioner. If this can be achieved it will be a small step in making justice in the provinces more transparent and accountable. After all, justice must be seen to be done.

Hon Premier, you have referred in your speech to the official Opposition that must become a bit sharper. Premier, their performances can't get any better. To be sharper, you need MPLs in the official benches who do research before they deliver speeches. To be sharper, you need Members of Parliament who connect with the community. They are disconnected with the local communities. [Interjections.] You need MPLs who attend committee meetings and make a contribution. You need MPLs who are present in the House when it matters. The front benches of this official Opposition are mostly empty. You can't get sharper with this Opposition. [Interjections.] Premier, you must understand that legislative oversight is not just about talking.

Hon Premier, let me ask you and the Speaker one question. There are the members of the official Opposition.

This is a legislature. Have they ever approached you or the Speaker to introduce legislature in the House? That is the job of a Legislature. [Interjections.] They have not done that Speaker, and that is why they cannot get any sharper. The sharp ones have left. Yusuf Gabru and Garth Strachan left. [Interjections.] This is why you can't get sharper. The frontbenchers of the ANC are all absent; this is why they can't get any sharper. You cannot speak about them

becoming sharper because by being sharper you have to be present, and they have been absent.

Mr Speaker, the National Development Plan (NDP) identified priority ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER: ... steps for provinces.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: Thank you, Speaker.

Mr Speaker, the National Development Plan identified priority steps for provinces. Firstly, Premier, the National Development Plan asked for Premiers to engage with the areas of the National Development Plan that relate to core priorities. Firstly, this the Premier has done in the field of Education, Health and Social Development. Secondly, Premier, the National Development Plan asked of you to identify specific national development proposals where implementation can start immediately. Premier, you have done this in the area of red tape, economic development partnership, comprehensive after-school programme, and you added a fourth one, the youth wage subsidy.

Thirdly, the National Development Plan asked Premiers to use the provincial 5-year plan to focus attention on how to improve the outcomes of core provincial functions. Hon Speaker,

the Premier has done this, and recently she reviewed it at the Western Cape Government “bosberaad”.

Fourthly, the National Development Plan asked Premiers to address weaknesses in the procurement system to ensure greater focus on value for money. The Premier recently did this in the Cabinet “bosberaad” and also before she introduced legislation in the House.

Fifthly, the National Development Plan asked Premiers to pay greater attention to the quality of management within departments. Premier Zille did this when she approved the final allocations last week at Cabinet. She also did this with the introduction of an outcome-based approach to governance, the dashboard, the Performance Development Management System (PDMS) and the outcome indicators.

Lastly, the National Development Plan calls on Premiers that they must strengthen administrative relations between the provincial departments and their national counterparts. Premier Zille is going out of her way to do this and has been invited to present three of her projects as pilot projects of the NDP. Intergovernmental Relations (IGR) remain a challenge, but she is committed to intergovernmental co-operation because her Administration believes in we are Better Together.

Hon Speaker, the national Government must see Helen Zille and her Administration as an opportunity because of her commitment to implement the NDP and her commitment is on record and it is clear.

Mnr die Speaker, ek sluit af. Ek het gister Die Departement van Koffie in Khayelitsha besoek en saam met die drie jong entrepreneurs gesels en hulle uitgevra oor hulle boodskap aan die jeug. Dit is wat hulle gister in Khayelitsha by die Departement van Koffie aan my gesê het, and I quote:

The youth must realise every day is a new day, with new opportunities that require discipline. The youth must dream wisely, and find their calling and their purpose.

Hon Speaker, these were the words of Vuyile Msaku, Womgama Baleni and Vusumzi Mamile. Like these three young men, this Administration believes in creating a life that you value. Therefore, this government believes in an open opportunity society, but fundamentally we believe in creating the freedom that you can use.

Ms T N BEVU: Mr Speaker, hon Premier, Ministers and members, when the DA came to power in this province in 2009 it came promising many things: clean & transparent government; highways of information technology for places like Khayelitsha & Mitchells Plain; economic growth that will create jobs for all; and intensive investment on green energy. The list goes on.

Fast forward three years. The Premier is still promising the same things. Hardly anything has changed except plans, plans and more plans that are not being implemented.

Democratic South Africa was born amidst high hopes for the reduction of income, poverty and inequality from their high levels under apartheid. The reality has been disappointing:

despite steady economic growth, which we never tire of hearing that it is a little higher than the national average in this province, income inequality has grown. According to the Oxfam recent report, China, together with South Africa is the country with the highest income inequality, and our province is the most unequal in the land.

Mr Speaker, the proximate causes are clear: persistent unemployment and low demand for unskilled labour, strong demand for skilled labour, an unequal education system, and a social safety net that is unusually widespread, but nonetheless has large holes.

Economic growth alone will not reduce poverty or inequality. Pro-poor social policies are important, but not as important as a pro-poor economic growth path. Unfortunately there is little sign of the political conditions changing to push for the promotion of a more pro-poor pattern of economic growth in this province.

Unemployment and poverty rates will remain high despite significant redistribution through government social cash transfers, but incomes continue to be distributed extremely unequally. There is no political will to change this. If there were, you'd see a situation where the bulk of the province's budget is spent in the rural areas and townships.

In her address, the Premier spoke more about national programmes than provincial ones. The politics of misinformation is also getting out of hand. When one listens to our officials about the bogus statistics shoved down our throats, one is reminded of Pascal, who, when writing in

the 17th century, noted how in his times the truth was so obscure and falsehood well-established – the same can be said of our times.

Year after year in the House we are fed false information that does not speak to our living conditions as we know them. I heard in the media that the Premier is now claiming that 80% of higher management in the Western Cape can be classified as being black. You don't even have to do much – just add up the human resources statistics of the various departments to discover that this information is incorrect.

The question is: Is the Premier willingly being misled by her department or is she herself deliberately misleading the public. Again we are told that the bulk of the budget goes to poor communities, yet the living experience of the poor shows that things are deteriorating, especially for those people who are living in informal areas like Enyunywini.

Take people who live in koBM as an example. These were the first informal areas here in Cape Town. Those people are now staying in the hall in Khayelitsha. Go and look there and you will see that now there are squatters. I don't know what is happening there. Maybe they are bringing toilets there. I don't know what is happening there, really. Nothing much has changed up to this day.

Go to the Atlantic Seaboard belt. There everything is working and improving every year, and the streets and infrastructure are properly maintained – but not if you happen to live in Hangberg or Imizamo Yethu; nothing is happening there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon Skwatsha! [Interjections.]
Order, hon Bevu!

Mr N NCEDANA: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Sit down, hon Ncedana, I didn't recognise you. Order! Can you take your seat, please.

Mr N NCEDANA: May I raise a point of order, please.

The SPEAKER: Take your seat, please. [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, on a point of order ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Skwatsha, take your seat!

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: A point of order is allowed in the House.

The SPEAKER: Order! What is your point of order, hon Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: It is calling you to order.

The SPEAKER: I've heard what hon Ncedana had said, that's why I didn't allow him to make it, because it wasn't a point of order. [Interjections.] I heard what he said.

Mr N NCEDANA: What did I say? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Can you repeat yourself, if you want to.

Mr N NCEDANA: What did I say, Somlomo? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You asked me why I wasn't stopping the hon Minister Carlisle.

Mr N NCEDANA: Somlomo, you must deal with this thing. Don't divide this House ... [Interjections.] ... because we came here to build this House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member! Take your seat, please.

Ms J HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, I would like to welcome my former principal, Mr Truter and his wife, Avril as well as Miss Marian Jantjies, Ms Jane Mathee, Ms Jacoba Pietersen and Mrs Lorane Taai.

I would like to congratulate the hon Premier, Helen Zille, on a distinguished and stirring speech. I would like to highlight some key aspects about the State of the Province Address.

Firstly, The Premier invited ordinary young entrepreneurs from this province to the State of the Province Address, which clearly shows that the Premier understands our mandate and that is that to govern is really about improving the lives of all citizens.

Secondly, Madam Premier has demonstrated that our young people in this province are viewed as important and know that they could play a significant role in contributing to our economy.

Lastly, I would like to share with you the unbelievable experience it was for the young people, from the business, The Department of Coffee, to share and market their business with the other guests during the lunch. Thank you, Madam Premier, for constantly making us aware that our mandate is to continue to fight poverty and unemployment.

Mr Speaker, researchers believe that single-minded, one-dimensional and crisis-orientated interventions are insufficient to address the complexity of problems that we face in a post-modern world. Neither blaming tactics nor negative media smear campaigns are the best route to follow to address these problems. It requires a much deeper and comprehensive approach.

Mr M C WALTERS: Hear, hear!

Ms J HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, it is only a whole-of-society approach, as mentioned by the Premier, that would effectively deal with these complex issues. This approach acknowledges the rich community resources and the willingness of civil society activists to effectively address these issues together with this government.

Our vision for the Western Cape is for an open opportunity Society in which every person has the means, the resources and the power to live a life he or she values. Our government's slogan is "better together".

The DA-led government stands for the eradication of poverty. We know that poverty is behind the many societal problems we face in this province. We are a government that puts our budgets where our heart is. That's why 76% of our annual budget is directed towards opening opportunities for people in poor communities through education –please note, Ms Tingwe ...

Ms M TINGWE: Where?

Ms J HARTNICK: ... health services, housing and social development programmes.

Ons jeug, mnr die Speaker, is die toekoms van ons land. Hierdie regering beskou hulle as kosbaar, waardevol en 'n integrale deel van die bou van 'n voorspoedige, gesonde en veilige samelewing. Ons is 'n regering wat nie beloftes maak en dit nie nakom nie. Hierdie provinsie word gelei met 'n aksie-gebaseerde benadering van leierskap. Die DA regering staan vir kritiese, skeppende en innoverende oplossings.

The Premier's Advancement of Youth (PAY) project has already produced huge successes in giving young people good apprenticeship programmes and training experiences. This is a project that has shown a start to breaking the shackles of poverty and marginalisation. I look forward to observing as well as monitoring the progress of the 750 interns who will be starting the programme in April.

Mr Speaker, we have to understand the times we live in. The youth of this province is tired of the empty promises made by national government. The Premier has emphasised that we have to develop our own version of the Youth Wage Subsidy. The results are speaking for themselves. We applaud the Premier for this innovative and proactive approach to young people. People generally predicted a tipping point, an epidemic of hopelessness in this country amongst youth. We are proud to say that with the leadership and foresight of our Premier, we will create a positive and healthy social epidemic of hope and enthusiasm for all young people in this province.

Ons onderwysstelsel in die provinsie is van die beste in die wêreld. Die wetenskaplike en sistematiese benadering tot die onderwys bied ons fantastiese geleenthede om 'n goeie basis vir leerders in die provinsie vas te lê. Die toegewydheid van die Minister van Onderwys en die Department om die standaard van geletterheidsvlakke te verhoog is van bostaande gehalte.

Another way of giving people of the Western Cape freedom they can use, is the roll-out of the Broadband Project.

The Department of the Premier in the Western Cape recognised that many poor and marginalised communities suffer from economic exclusion due to geographic and historic isolation; low levels of Information Communication Technology (ICT) knowledge and skills; and the lack of economic development and infrastructure in their areas; and the lack of information on job opportunities.

This Broadband project entitles the Western Cape population to access information for educational purposes, tender and business opportunities.

Mr Speaker, Broadband is essential for social and economic development. Economists agree that high-speed broadband increase economic growth. We therefore will continue to invest in affordable broadband infrastructure that could create an internationally competitive knowledge economy.

Mr Speaker, we are really excited about the future of this province, because we will come back in 2014. [Interjections.]

I thank the Premier for her State of the Province Address and the eloquent way in which she brought to our attention where we have come from, how we have succeeded and what still needs to be achieved. I also applaud her leadership skills and agree that by working better together we will become the best run regional government in the world.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, hon Premier Helen Zille's open opportunity society model centres around maintaining racial and class inequalities. It ignores the fact that we have inherited structural inequalities from apartheid. The DA expects the poor majority to pull up their socks, while apartheid robbed them of the socks to wear. I don't know where you are going to get the socks to pull up.

An HON MEMBER: Who stole their socks?

Mr K E MAGAXA: This a-historical approach was evident in the Premier's State of the Province Address. She placed an emphasis on the role of the State in empowering the private sector and investors that have benefited so much in the apartheid regime. However, her speech was devoid of any focus on the role of the State in providing decent living conditions to the poor.

This is, of course, not surprising. The philosophy behind the open opportunity society does not deem the provision of basic services to the poor to be a priority of the State. In the DA's eyes, the poor simply need to shape up on their own.

Most of the hon members on the other side of the House are apartheid beneficiaries, including collaborators. [Interjections.] Even the so-called liberals from your ranks did not believe in the oppressed having the full democratic right to vote. What the liberals believed in ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... was a qualified franchise for blacks.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Rubbish!

Mr K E MAGAXA: A qualified franchise is one where blacks will be able to vote only if they met ...

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: The hon Carlisle used the word "rubbish". It's unparliamentary. I want you to ask him to withdraw it, please. [Interjections.] He's been misbehaving the whole afternoon. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Could I address you on this, sir?

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He said the Liberal Party had a qualified franchise. I wanted to explain to him that that was incorrect, and I did. [Interjections.] But it was rubbish. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It was rubbish.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Hon members, order! Hon Uys, I will refer your request to Hansard. I didn't hear hon Carlisle say that. [Interjections.] Hon Carlisle, did you ...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Can I just save you that referral? I did say "rubbish" and I withdraw it. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Tingwe and hon members, order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: What the liberals believed in was a qualified franchise for blacks. A qualified franchise is one where blacks would be able to vote only if they met certain educational and land ownership criteria. This exposes the true colours of the liberals because, obviously, in an apartheid South Africa most blacks would have been disqualified from

voting. Then there were those amongst you who even served in structures that defended the apartheid regime. You will be called Colonel, Corporal and all that.

Whilst you conveniently suffer from collective amnesia about the privileges apartheid granted you as well as your role in defending them – thus denying in your mind that apartheid actually existed – you remain hell-bent on maintaining those privileges at the expense of the poor black majority.

Mr Speaker, in this deeply divided province, hon Premier Helen Zille's DA uses Africans that are poor and opportunists as puppets to entrench the apartheid legacy. They are sitting there.

The MEC for Human Settlements, hon Madikizela, is an example of an African from Makhaza. In Makhaza he provides open toilets that undermine the dignity of his own people. [Interjections.] He perpetuates the apartheid legacy by failing to focus on the provision of serviced sites. Even this he cannot deliver on.

One wonders who the colonial handler of this puppet is. Is it the madam who shouts about an open opportunity society – an open opportunity society which is used as a propaganda tool to disguise the DA's racist neo-liberal agenda that subjects our people to continuous poverty and indignity? [Interjections.]

Many of the delays in housing provision are a direct result of hon MEC Madikizela's interference. Instead of uniting our people around the provision of housing, Premier Helen Zille's MEC divides communities. This is not surprising. The DA seeks to gain support from

such divisions. In actual fact, the DA will never win our wards in the African community, except they will be dividing those communities. They will benefit from the divisions.

[Interjections.]

Premier Zille's administration has failed to build on the solid gains made by the ANC in this province. Since coming into power, for three years in a row the Department of Human Settlements could not even reach its own modest housing provision targets. They were the poorest targets they ever established. They could not meet them three years in a row.

[Interjections.]

They have consistently lowered their targets and underspent their budget. It is therefore unwarranted for the Premier to complain about National Treasury not providing sufficient funds to this province for the provision of housing. They even failed to spend the money they were given.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It's not true!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, residents in Khayelitsha and other parts of our province ...

[Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister Carlisle! Order, please!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... are struggling to rebuild their homes after the devastating fires. These fires are largely a result of poor housing provision on the part of the DA.

It is shameful that in her State of the Province Address the Premier did not even mention the displaced Khayelitsha residents currently being housed in the OR Tambo Hall. How dare you do that! The Premier and her MEC were absent in the aftermath of the fires. It was only the national leadership of the ANC, the Ministers who are not even residing in this province, who came all the way to visit. The Mayor and the DA Minister never pitched up there. [Interjections.] He had the audacity to only come during the memorial service of the victims.

Mr H P GEYER: Please try to talk sense so that we can understand.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA-led City of Cape Town, under the supervision of MEC Madikizela and the Premier, even failed to build houses for the displaced people.

An NGO, Gift of the Givers, which offered to build 100 houses there, could not start doing so, because the department failed to level the ground for them to build the houses.

The Premier must remember that these are the same residents who are affected by floods during winter. These are the same residents who protested last year against the open opportunity society's undignified living conditions. The Premier failed to address the residents' grievances.

The Premier's boasts that 96,9% of households in the Western Cape have access to toilet facilities is far from the truth. The Premier's administration has failed to provide the poor

majority with decent sanitation. In Rawsonville there are instances where five families share one toilet and 100 families share only seven taps.

Many toilets built by the City of Cape Town in Makhaza are not equipped with taps and sewer connections. This is despite an order of the Western Cape High Court in made in May 2011. Helen Zille's DA claims to be the defender of the Judiciary, yet they have scant regard for an order of the court and this is because this court order flies in the face of their open opportunity society model. Many of the toilets in informal settlements do not have taps and sewer connections are also far from functional. Toilets remain in a state of disrepair.

In light of the DA's excuse that more houses cannot be built because of a shortage of available land, it is sad that unutilised public property and space such as the Rondebosch Common is not even seriously considered by Helen Zille's DA for housing. It is international best practice for the state to use unutilised public property as space for housing. Instead, the Premier and her Mayor De Lille protect rich property owners in the leafy suburbs who fear the depreciation of their property values.

Mr Speaker, the ANC is opposed to violent service delivery protests. [Interjections.] However, we say that if the Premier continues to ignore the cries of the poor for decent living conditions, this province will experience more violent protests. In 2012 the Western Cape recorded the highest number of violent service delivery protests. [Interjections.]

Premier, poor people are frustrated by your inaction and absence. Their frustration is heightened by your dismissal of their grievances. People are asking themselves whether you

are really the Premier of the province or the National Assembly leader of the opposition. This is because you are more occupied with what the national government is or isn't doing than with what you are supposed to be doing here, in your province. [Interjections.]

Perhaps they don't know that you are a greedy opportunist, actually ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K MAGAXA ... who is a power monger.

SOMLOMO: Ixesha lakho liphelile mhlekazi.

Ms Z MAGWAZA: Finish your sentence.

Mr K MAGAXA: Can I finish the sentence? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K MAGAXA: Where there is power for the DA ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Finish your sentence, hon Magaxa. [Interjections.]

Mr K MAGAXA: Where there is power for the DA you are there. If Cape Town wins ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Order!

Mr K MAGAXA: ... you're the mayor.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Magaxa!

Mr M G E WILEY: You are disrespectful. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!.

Mr K MAGAXA: If the province wins, you are the Premier.

The SPEAKER: Hon Magaxa, order!

Mr K MAGAXA: You're always after money. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Magaxa! [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon Magaxa and hon Minister Botha, order, please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, it's very difficult to take this member seriously. [Interjections.]

Mr M C WALTERS: Ignore them.

The MINISTER: Then again, if he himself had to believe what he has just said now he would be sitting on this side, not on that side. If people believed anything you said, you'd be in power now. [Laughter.]

Let me say this, Mr Speaker, the sad thing about some of the things that were said by the speaker about some of the areas like BM, is that his party was in power for more than eight years, and what did they do about the plight of BM section? [Interjections.] No, no, what did you do about the plight the area was in? [Interjections.]

Let me also come to the figures that are always mentioned here and the fact that the ANC built more houses. Yes, Mr Speaker, indeed they did build more houses.

Mr M OZINSKY: Now sit down. That's the end of your speech. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER: The reality of situation as I'm standing here is that we need to spend billions of rands on rectifying those houses, because they were busy chasing numbers. [Interjections.] That's the reality of the situation, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, hon Minister, order! Hon Minister Botha, hon Ozinsky! [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: Hon Brown, I didn't disturb you when you were speaking. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I know.

The MINISTER: The reality, Mr Speaker, is this: Government, in fact, not only in this province, has to spend more than R50 billion to rectify the houses that the ANC is boasting about. [Interjections.] Now this shows that the ANC does not care about the poor people even though they claim to care about them. All they care about is chasing numbers so that they can be seen as people who are delivering. That's the reality. [Interjections.]

Ms V HANI: That's lies.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Hani, order!

The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, let me revert to my speech. The Premier in her address stated that the 2011 census revealed that the province's population grew by almost 30%.

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Speaker, op 'n punt van orde: agb Hani het gesê dat die Minister leuens vertel.

Ms V HANI: What?

Ms A ROSSOUW: You said he's telling lies.

The SPEAKER: Hon Hani?

Ms V HANI: Who said that?

Ms A ROSSOUW: ... [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You didn't hear that.

The SPEAKER: Hon Hani, please address the Chair. Did you say that the Minister lied? Hon Hani, address the Chair, please. The Chief Whip said that you said the Minister is telling lies in the House.

Ms V HANI: Who?

Ms A ROSSOUW: You.

Ms V HANI: Which Minister? Go check the Hansard.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Hani. We will check it. Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: The Premier in her address stated that the 2011 census revealed that province's population grew by almost 30% between 2001 and 2011. During this period, Mr Speaker, our population increased by 1,3 million people.

In order to build a healthy, prosperous province with opportunity for all, the Premier stated that we speak of a whole of society approach in which government, individuals and communities take responsibility and work together to create success.

The only way to support citizens to take responsibility in escaping poverty and breaking away from dependency and entitlement is to grow the economy, create jobs and capacitate them with skills. And in her speech the Premier detailed strategic interventions in areas such as enabling new business, skills development programmes and education interventions.

Now in the department of Human Settlements we are also focusing on creating an enabling environment that supports people on their journey to economic freedom. This year marks 100 years since the 1913 Land Act, which effectively dispossessed many South Africans of their land and their right to own land.

Human settlements has an important role to play in ensuring that people get title deeds to their houses and serviced sites, which helps in addressing the imbalance of the 1913 Land Act. Yet we have found in the Western Cape that many people have their house but have not received their title deeds. They are thus unable to participate in the property market or use their homes as collateral for loans.

This is why in 2011 we initiated a study to find out the extent of the problem and we found that under the previous administration, the ANC administration, the title deed delivery hadn't been done correctly and that over a third, or 36% of the 225 000 subsidy beneficiaries in the Western Cape since 1994, had not received ownership.

An HON MEMBER: Shoo!

We have now reduced this backlog to 28% through the issuing of 20 400 title deeds. With their title deeds in their possession, their properties are now “freedom they can use”.

It's not only in the issue of land reform that we are pushing transformation. We are also pushing transformation in economic sectors related to human settlements. The property sector is worth R4,9 trillion, Mr Speaker, and in 2009 contributed 8,3% of South Africa's gross domestic product (GDP), yet most agents are white males between the ages of 55 and 65. There is clearly a need to drive transformation in this sector that is sustainable, and which will allow for opportunities for members of other demographic groups of South Africa.

The Estate Agency Affairs Board was, with effect from 17 May 2012, relocated from the Department of Trade and Industry to the Department of Human Settlements, and the first national summit was held on 4 and 5 October last year in Midrand.

Yesterday, Mr Speaker, under my leadership, the department hosted the Western Cape Agents Consultative Dialogue. This is enabling us to lead the country by being the first province to host such a provincial summit which will produce practical steps on how to deliver opportunity, lower barriers to entry and train and capacitate previously disadvantaged individuals in the estate agents sector so that they may also participate in this R4,9 trillion wealth.

The most basic opportunity is having access to basic services. While the Western Cape is the national leader with regard to access to basic services, where according to the 2011 Census 99,11% of households have access to piped water, and 96,9% have toilet facilities, we set out to ensure that everyone has access to basic services by the year 2014 according to the National Minimum Standards.

The Premier stated that by December 2012 the access to basic services programme has ensured a further 10 995 people have benefitted from access to clean water, and 8 225 have benefitted from access to sanitation, and I am confident that we will be the first province to ensure that everyone has access to basic services by 2014. Other opportunities include the provision of service sites, the upgrading of informal settlements, integrated residential development, rental and social housing and individual subsidies.

The President, in his 2012 State of the Nation Address, stated that by April 2012, a R1 billion guarantee fund would become operational, thereby making it easier for people with a poor credit history to qualify for home loans, and this, in conjunction with the department's Finance Linked Individual Subsidy Scheme, or Flisp, would enable many more people in the GAP market to buy homes. The promised fund never became available, Mr Speaker, up until now. Secondly, the credit crunch beginning in 2008 has made it more difficult for people to get credit from the banks, and subsequently home loans. Despite this, Mr Speaker, since April 2009 we have spent R166,3 million on individual subsidies, including Flisp for the GAP market, and we have created 2 385 new housing opportunities.

One of the points we want to emphasise, Mr Speaker, is that you must not only see housing as a social issue, but we must also drive it as an economic issue so that people can benefit from it.

The above initiatives reflect a paradigm shift in the way that we are approaching human settlements. The shift began with the change in the name from the Department of Housing to the Department of Human Settlements, which reflected a move towards an integrated approach to creating thriving human settlements away from dotting the landscape with houses.

Previously the approach to the delivery of housing had been primarily social, with the intent to alleviate the social housing crisis through the provision of land and shelter. The paradigm shift is one from housing as deliverer of social opportunity, to a deliverer of economic opportunity.

Our multiple programmes reflect the embodiment of this change of thinking, for example, the issuing of title deeds which play such a fundamental role in the economic empowerment of land owners, along with the drive to transform the estate agents industry, which aims to provide jobs and create wealth for previously disadvantaged individuals. It is this thinking, Mr Speaker, that the best drivers of social change are economic opportunity and capacitation, which will determine the truth success of human settlements, and in the bigger picture, this province and the country. I thank you.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, the ACDP is pleased to be participating in this debate today and we thank the Premier for her State of the Province Address on Friday.

We acknowledge and congratulate the government on the important improvements and successes that were listed on Friday, but we believe that there are areas of improvement, and I would like to focus on some of those today.

The citizens of the Western Cape, as well as the rest of the country, all have legitimate expectations about the kinds of things that should be covered in a state of the province address. One of them would be to spell out what the challenges are that face the province, what the national issues are that the province is going to attend to and spelling out details in that respect.

One of the numerous national challenges that we believe ought to have been addressed is that of corruption. It remains prominent, with the Special Investigative Unit (SIU) confirming that some R25 billion to R30 billion per year is lost to corruption nationally. The citizens expected feedback on what this government has done about corruption to address its root causes and how it's going to pursue the Operation Clean Audit 2014 towards achieving that.

Like the ACDP, the DA has vociferously criticised and spoken out against all instances of corruption at a national level and across all provinces. The DA government has publicly committed itself to achieving Operation Clean Audit by 2014. But worryingly, nothing was mentioned about this in the Premier's State of the Province Address; nothing was mentioned about stagnation in movement towards clean audit in most departments, with only four

departments achieving financially unqualified audit outcomes with findings, the regression from eight departments with financially unqualified findings with no findings to four, and the regression in a number of departments with qualified findings audit outcomes or outstanding audits up to two from none.

The Auditor-General also cited numerous instances of irregular expenditure, fruitless and wasteful expenditure, material misstatements, non-compliance with laws and regulations and procurement and expenditure irregularities. The Western Cape Housing Development Fund remains outstanding. The Provincial Development Council was closed, but no financial accountability and oversight processes have been provided in that respect.

This oversight can only be unfortunate and regrettable, or it has been left out because it is not important to this government, or because somehow Western Cape corruption is somehow better than that which occurs in other spheres, ... [Interjections.] ... or other governments ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Tingwe, order! [Interjections.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: ... and therefore more acceptable. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: This is the House.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Therefore the message is that it is more acceptable because it is less than – because it is less than – corruption that is experienced in other provinces. [Interjections.] Or is it because there wasn't enough time to address it? If that is the case that can be ruled out.

The ACDP is deeply concerned about this glaring omission and strongly recommends that something be said ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister Carlisle!

Mr G C R HASKIN: ... or done about addressing this challenge.

In terms of Education, Speaker, the ACDP acknowledges the important progress that is being made across the Education department in the last several years, including that the National Senior Certificate pass rate has increased by some 3 800 learners. But is it good enough that only 57% of Grade 10 learners are retained in the school system until Grade 12 and that 82% of those pass? Just because these two figures are higher than in other provinces, and higher than the national average, does that mean that that is good enough?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... work in progress.

Mr G C R HASKIN: It is work in progress, correct, but we need to acknowledge that the increase in learner enrolment is outpacing pass rate increases, firstly, and, secondly, it would be more important and more appropriate that benchmarking should not be the poor performances of other provinces; the benchmarking should be the extent to which this government is meeting the needs and the aspirations of the learners themselves, the families, the communities and the economy of the Western Cape which desperately needs education success. [Interjections.] That is what the benchmark should be; it should not be about how

this government is achieving above other provinces, because quite frankly that is easy to achieve. [Interjections.] It is easy to outpace other provinces; it is easy. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, in the ongoing programme to address widespread substance abuse, we acknowledge that the number of treatment centres has increased to 24 since 2008. Is this good enough?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, definitely not good enough.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Both the Department of Social Development ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, Minister Carlisle! [Interjections.] Order, hon Minister!

Mr G C R HASKIN: At least the Minister has picked up on my theme, Speaker. [Interjections.] Both the department ...

The SPEAKER: Minister, order! Hon Minister Carlisle, I just want to warn you ...

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, both the department and the HOD in the annual reporting process last year said that they could not verify the programme performance statistics that were quoted in Chapter 2 of the Annual Report of Social Development. Quite frankly, this is astounding; they should at least have been able to verify the statistics quoted. But the Auditor-General, worryingly, agreed with them saying that 92% of all indicators were not

verifiable, and that he was unable to obtain sufficient appropriate audit evidence to verify the validity, accuracy and completeness of what the department has published.

The question therefore is: What substance abuse deliveries have occurred since 2009 that are verifiable and that have produced sustainable, tangible results for the affected families and individuals? What is verifiable in that instance is that the Auditor-General is saying that it is not verified. [Time expired.]

Mnu N NCEDANA: Somlomo, Ndiyakrokra Somlomo ukuba uMnu uCarlisle

unentliziyo ethambileyo wena ngakuye ngoba ungxola udlula onke amanye amalungu apha ungamthethisi. Iinyaniso, le nto kuthiwa yinyani iyakrakra futhi yasoloko iphumelela xa ithelekiswa nobuxoki. Uyabona ke lo rhulumente walapha kuthwa ngurhulumente ovuleleke amathuba kubo bonke , thina asirhwaphilizi singcwele siziingelosi ezombeth'ingubo emhlophe. Kuyabonakala into yokuba le ngubo imhlophe ngapha ngaphantsi kwayo kukho amachaphaza egazi ngoba abantu bakuthu bebehlophekile ngexesha lengcinezelo yabamhlophe (apartheid), abantu bakuthi basahluphekile nanamhlanje. Uzakubheka eMitchellsplain ufike imeko yaseMitchellsplain isenjengokuba ibinjeya ngo2009. Ubheke eKhayelitsha, ubheke ngapha kwaNokuthula, iDa pha kwaNokuthula kuyacaca ukuba ibenenxaxheba enkulu eyidlalileyo ukuvuthuza nokuxabanisa ukuphixanisa abantu abamnyama. Kwabakho le nto babeyenza ngexesha leNgcinezelo le kuthwa “ yiblack on black violence” iinyaniso ke ziyaphuma. Benikade nixhentsa ngoLulama Mvimbi apha othe wathi wathi nguMemory Booysen ngoku kuthe cwaka. Xa ungena kwaNokuthula uzakufika estratweni ezenziweyo kukho istrato esenziweyo siphela pha phambi kwakulo Memory Booysen, esithi abanye abantu abanalo ilungelo lokuba babenetha ebheka ezindlini zabo,

open opportunities with equal society, equal mpixwano. Le nto Somlomo ichaza intomyokuba
aba bantu bahleli kweli cala lingapha ekhohlo basithele ngale demokhrasi yeli lizwe basithele
ngokulunga kwentliziyo katat'uMandela kodwa bangcolile ngoba uzakufika ngoku ubheke
apha eHout Bay .You can laugh at it. If you go to Hout Bay now you will find that in order
for young people to be employed on the Extended Public Works Programme they must carry
a DA membership card. [Interjections.] It is a fact. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: It is a fact. [Interjections.] Hon Minister Carlisle, order! Order, hon members!

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: Is it parliamentary for the hon Carlisle to say to the hon Ncedana, "That's a lie" which is then repeated four times?

The SPEAKER: It is unparliamentary. Hon Minister, did you say that?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, I said that Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Please withdraw that.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I withdraw that word and I will deal with it later.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, hon Tingwe! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

UKuba ubheka eHout Bay namhlanje abantu baqeshwa ngokuba benakhadi obulungu beDA uzakuthi ayilo rhwaphilizo olo? It took a young woman three weeks, after she joined the DA, to be employed. After she joined the DA she was then employed; she is working today.
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We have got proof of it.

Mr N NCEDANA: It is a fact. This government is the worst of its kind. We are never going to see improvement in the communities where poor people live.

In 2010 ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I would like to know if the hon member will take a question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tingwe, order! [Interjections.] Hon Tingwe, you are not the hon Ncedana.

Mr N NCEDANA: I will take a question after the meeting. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Proceed hon Ncedana.

Mr N NCEDANA: If you go to the Khayelitsha Hospital – it is beautiful and everything else that is happening there is a good thing – but the beginnings are static. A Health Council has

been established in the community to the exclusion of consultation with the people of Khayelitsha and the Khayelitsha Forum. These are the people who claim to be working Better Together. Where is the Better Together? You should say better only when you are a DA member. If you are not a DA member you are not welcome to participate. [Interjections.] Wena Mphathiswa kule nto uyithethathayo ndikuphendule Ngoku.

You talk about a forum that you hosted yesterday; you did not invite us. We are members of that portfolio committee. Where is your Better Together when you sideline other people not to participate?

Kukuza kule nto yezindlu, ngo2010 ...

USOMLOMO: Ixesha lakho liphelile mhlekazi.

Mr N NCEDANA: Alisoze. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired hon member; please take your seat. Take your seat please, hon Ncedana.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Speaker, Premier Zille highlighted the importance of education in her State of the Province Address. President Zuma also restated the importance of education during his State of the Nation Address. He reminded us that education was declared an apex priority in 2009. He longed for everyone in the country to realise that education is an essential service for our nation.

Basic education should provide our youth with the freedom they can use, should provide them with opportunities to create a better life and empower them for a dignified future they can value.

Deel van die Apex Prioriteite van Onderwys is om alle skole, veral arm skole, van hulpbronne te voorsien soos boeke en studiemateriaal vir leerders en onderwysers. Die nasionale plan vir onderwysdienslewering bestaan dus sedert 2009.

Mnr die Speaker, dit is kenmerkend van die ANC om te praat oor prioriteite, om 'n kommissie te loods om die prioriteite te ondersoek, en dan 'n plan of strategie bekend te stel om die prioriteite te laat seevier sonder dat implementering deurgevoer word.

Die stilsweye van President Zuma tydens die staatsrede oor die handboek-fiasco van Limpopo, asook die gemiddeld 1 000 onderwysers wat daagliks afwesig is by 450 skole, is 'n enkele bewys hiervan. Twee verslae deur die Federasie van Beheerliggame van Suid-Afrika dui op meer as 42 000 handboeke wat teen Sondag nog uitstaande was in Limpopo. 'n Enkele skool in Phalaborwa het 'n tekort aan 3 513 handboeke, terwyl graad 11 leerders in die provinsie vir meer as 17 000 boeke wag.

Deleted: o

Another plan of the ANC government is the National Development Plan (NDP). The NDP serves as the national government's answer to the triple threat of poverty, inequality and unemployment. The DA government in the Western Cape supports most of the NDP, believes in working Better Together and has been selected to pilot programmes.

According to the National Planning Commission chief of staff, Dumisa Jele, the Western Cape is the first province to show a degree of readiness for implementation – a real compliment to the Premier and the Western Cape Government.

Unfortunately, due to the incompetence in government – as portrayed by the amounts spent on consultants – and the lack of implementation, South Africans and the rest of the world have become sceptical of the national government's political will to enforce plans. This is taking away opportunities of a nation and leaves our nation without hope.

For example, last night at the Centre for Conflict Resolution in Cape Town, Adam Habib warned that the NDP serves as nothing more than poverty alleviation and it will not address inequality. According to him, the outrage of the poor – as was recently seen in Marikana, on farms and with service delivery protests across the country – is steadily fed by executives who own millions, by politicians who drive luxury cars and a President who spent millions on his homestead in Nkandla.

Mnr die Speaker, die Premier het dit ook duidelik gemaak dat ongelykhede in ons samelewing aangespreek moet word. Dit is van kardinale belang dat dienslewing op alle vlakke nie net bloot tydelike verligting bring nie, maar dat dit inderdaad ongelykhede aanspreek.

Die DA-regering het ook in 2009 Onderwys as 'n strategiese doelstelling geïdentifiseer, en reeds vroeg in 2010 het die strategiese doelstellings amptelik in werking getree. Hieronder is 'n definitiewe 10-puntplan met spesifieke fokus op verbeterde stelsels. Dit hou spesifieke

implikasies in vir kwaliteit onderwys deur middel van verbeterde geletterdheid en syfervaardighede, beskikbaarheid van handboeke en onderwysmateriaal, die aanspreek van armoede en misdaad in skole, as ‘n voorbeeld van “redress” om bloot ‘n paar uit te sonder. Sedertdien spreek die resultate boekdele.

Soos die Premier tereg gewys het is die fokus op skole in armer gemeenskappe besig om dienslewering in werklike “redress” te verander. Nagenoeg 80% van begrotingsbesteding wat items soos handboeke, skryfbehoeftes, leerdervoer en voedingskemas insluit, gaan aan die armste 60% van ons leerders. Agb Haskin, ek wil net een “benchmark” van die Wes-Kaap noem. Tussen 2009 en 2012 het die slaagsyfer vir skole in Kwintiel 1 tot 3 – dit is die arm skole – verhoog vanaf 56,9% tot 70,9%.

‘n Kenmerkende voorbeeld van wat vermag kan word deur deursettingsvermoë, harde werk en ‘n passie om dienslewering in die onderwys reg te laat geskied is die voorbeeld van die Nkazimalo Primêre Skool in Khayelitsha wat binne een jaar hul taaleksamen-uitslae verhoog het vanaf 2,6% tot 62,4%, en hul wiskunde-uitslae vanaf 51,7% tot 81,2%.

Nog ‘n “benchmark” is dat in die Wes-Kaap 99% van CAPS-werkboekbestellings afgelewer is. Alle tekortkominge as gevolg van groei in leerdergetalle word tans aangespreek en behoort teen die einde van dié week uitgesorteer te wees.

Om Onderwys in die Wes-Kaap te prioritiseer is ‘n volgehoue, fisiese oefening. Die voortdurende en volgehoue klem wat geplaas word op kwaliteit onderwysuitkomste – ‘n verhoogde geletterdheid en syfervaardigheid, verhoogde slaagsyfer in graad 12 en ‘n

verhoging in die kwaliteit van suksesvolle kandidate – word ondersteun deur die volgehoue en voortdurende opleiding van beide onderwysers en skoolhoofde.

Die onafhanklike eksamens wat die Wes-Kaap jaarliks ons leerlinge laat aflê, help om standarde van resultate te verseker om effektiewe beplanning en analiese te bewerkstellig – alles “benchmarks” wat stelselmatig deur die Nasionale Departement vir Basiese Onderwys in hulle strategie geïnkorporeer word. Dit alles is bewyse van hoe die DA-regering planne implementeer. Deur dienslewering te kan uitvoer stel die DA die Wes-Kaap se kiesers gerus in sy keuse, asook om dit hulle voortgesette keuse te maak.

Mnr die Speaker, basiese dienslewering in onderwys kan maklik gereduseer word tot bloot ‘n syferspeletjie. Die nasionale Regering bou 98 skole in die afgelope jaar. Die Wes-Kaap is op dreef om sy infrastruktuurplan vir onderwys te oortref met 25 nuwe skole en 20 vervangingsskole wat sedert 2010 gebou is. Die syfers is wel ‘n rekord van dienslewering en dit is dié rekord wat die nuwe infrastruktuurplan van 26 nuwe skole en 46 vervangingsskole ‘n werklikheid sal maak. So ‘n rekord van dienslewering verskaf aan elke leerder wat voordeel trek uit die nuwe skole die vryheid wat hy/sy kan gebruik om ‘n kwaliteit onderrig te bekom. Ek dank u.

Me E PRINS: Baie dankie, Adjunkminister! [Gelag.] Ek bedoel eintlik Adjunkspeaker! Ek gee u sommer nou al promosie vir volgende jaar!

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, toe ek Vrydag na die voorlaaste toespraak van ‘n DA-Premier in die Wes-Kaap geluister het, het die Premier my onwillekeurig aan die gesegde van “Jakkals prys

sy eie stert” laat dink. Dit is duidelik dat die feëverhaal wat die Premier hier aan ons voorgehou het, baie ure van kopkrap deur oorbetaalde spindokters geverg het.

In tipiese DA-styl het die Premier probeer voorhou hoe wonderlik dit in die Wes-Kaap gaan, deur met getalle en syfers haar gehoor te probeer begogel deur voorbeelde van gewaande suksesse aan te haal. Sy het egter gerieflikheidshalwe nagelaat om vier belangrike feite aan te stip, naamlik:

Eerstens, die grootste gedeelte van die programme wat sy aangehaal het, is ‘n uitvloeisel van die beleid van die ANC en dat die befondsing daarvan van die nasionale fiskus kom.

Tweedens, dat die meerderheid van die departemente in die provinsie onderbestee het op hulle begrotings om dienste te lewer, of soos in die geval van die Departement van Landbou, wat fiskale storting doen by Casidra.

Derdens, dat daar talle vakante poste in die Administrasie van die Wes-Kaap is, en, vierdens, dat verskeie departement in die provinsie negatiewe verslae van die Ouditeur-generaal ontvang het – insluitende haar eie departement.

Die Premier het na die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan verwys, en dan wil sy sommer weer, eie aan die DA, maak asof dit eintlik as gevolg van die DA se inspirasie is. Wat onduidelik is, is wie nou reg is – die Premier wat haar by Minister Trevor Manuel skaar, of haar Nasionale Vergadering-afterryertjie, Mazibuko, wat verlede week tydens die debat in die Nasionale

Vergadering haar twyfel uitgespreek het oor die President en die regering se toegewydheid oor die program.

Die Premier is baie in haar skik met die drie inisiatiewe binne die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan (NOP) wat aan die Wes-Kaap toegedeel is, maar in tipiese DA-verwaandheid verklaar die Premier dat hierdie provinsiale regering die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan gaan uitbrei met 'n eie verwronge idee van die jeugloonsubsidie.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dan ploeg die Premier, of haar spindokters, sommer met Minister Rob Davies se kalwers ook wanneer sy die skepping van die Saldanha Industriële Ontwikkelingsone wil toe-eien as 'n Wes-Kaapse inisiatief, terwyl die skepping van die sone te danke is aan die ANC-regering en die Departement van Handel en Nywerheid se verbintenis om nuwe geleenthede te skep wat werkskepping en kapitaal-invloei betref.

Mnr die Speaker, die ANC-regering erken die belangrike rol wat Landbou in die Wes-Kaapse ekonomie speel. Die Premier het in haar toespraak daarna verwys maar die Premier erken nie die mense wat jare lank teen 'n hongerloon 'n bydrae gelewer het om die landboubedryf te help bou tot waar dit vandag is nie.

Dit is die werkers.

Die Premier verwys in haar toespraak na seisoenale werkers wat uit Zimbabwe, Lesotho en veral die Oos-Kaap kom. Dit is nou daardie mense wat maklik deur sekere elemente "refugees" genoem word.

Dit kom voor dat daar 'n afspeel van die minimumlone is aan inwoners van die gebied teen dit wat aan buitelanders betaal word, wat tot rassehaat en wrywing kan lei.

Daar word deur die Premier vermakerig voorsien dat daar baie verliese in landbou in die provinsie gaan kom. Wat duidelik vir my hier uitkom, is dat sy tevrede klink met die feit dat die minimumloon van R105 werkverliese te weeg gaan bring. Nêrens in haar toespraak het sy die boere aangemoedig om die minimumloon te implementeer en gebruik te maak van die opsie wat die Minister daargestel het vir sukkelende boere nie. Sy het nie vir die boere verduidelik dat hulle om kwytskelding kon aansoek doen nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Almal weet hoekom sekere boere nie van hierdie opsie gebruik wil maak nie, want dan sal ons bewus raak van die 10 plase, viertrekvoertuie, strandhuise, kinders op universiteite wat elkeen hul eie woonstelle het en die miljoene rande wat in die banke is. [Tussenwerpsels.] Ons weet waarvan ons praat. Dan sal ons sien dat u-hulle almal soos julle daar sit – en dit is hoekom u-hulle so raas – belange by die plase het. [Tussenwerpsels.] Doen aansoek sodat ons kan sien wat julle het. Julle weet mos wat julle het. Dan sal ons sien ...

Mnr M C WALTERS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek wil net versoek dat die spreker vir u aanspreek en nie die lede aan die ander kant nie.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ek sal haar dophou. Baie dankie. Agb lid, u kan voortgaan.

Me E PRINS: Ons sal dan sien dat die mense oor die jare heen tevrede moes wees met die krummels terwyl die base en hul families die room afskep van die werkers se sweet.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die feit dat die Premier van die loon van R105 praat asof mense dit nie verdien nie, wys vir ons duidelik dat sy saamstem met die minimumloon van R68, die klein bedrag, wat die mense verdien het. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit moes in baie gevalle huishoudings van 20 onderhou. Sies! Ek skaam my as ek die Premier van die land is! [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die ander politieke speletjie wat hier gespeel word, is om verdeeldheid aan te blaas. Ons noem dit “divide and rule”. Ons almal weet dat De Doorns ‘n baie sensitiewe gebied is waar xenofobiese voorvalle telke male uitbreek het tussen plaaslike gemeenskappe en buitelanders ten opsigte van die persepsie dat buitelanders hul werke kom afvat. Dit lyk of die Premier in hierdie toespraak die vreemdelinghaat aanhits. Dit is niks nuuts nie dat die Premier dié tipe politieke speletjies speel nie.

Tydens die stakings op die plase het sy as leier van die provinsie ‘n baie belangrike geleentheid gemis om eerder mense te verenig in hierdie provinsie. In plaas daarvan het sy politiek gespeel. [Tussenwerpsels.] Sy het verkies om politieke munt uit die situasie te slaan. [Tussenwerpsels.] Selfs DA-ondersteuners het daarna verwys. Gewetenlose arbeidsmakelaars het ook geen kritiek van haar gekry nie.

Daar is ook geraas gemaak deur die DA oor koshulp aan plaaswerkers gedurende die opstand. Dit is baie vreemd inderdaad dat die DA wat gereeld vir volstruisboere om hulp by die nasionale regering gaan aanklop, nou beswaar maak dat dieselfde regering arm mense sonder reserwes help in tyde van nood. Dit is veral vreemd omdat die DA juis bekend is as die kospakkie-politieke party. [Gelag.]

Ek wonder hoekom die Premier deesdae so stil is oor die aandeeskemaprogram. Die Premier het op elke platform groot geraas gemaak dat die aandeeskema die beste model in die Wes-Kaap is vir grondhervorming. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde!

Me E PRINS: Daar word ook gespog oor die 58 aandeeskemas in die Wes-Kaap. Niemand praat oor hoe die arme plaaswerkers op sommige aandeeplase misbruik is om die miljoene van die regering in te palm om bankrot ondernemings te herfinansier nie. Te veel van hierdie skemas het klaaglik misluk.

Dit bewys weer dat hierdie Premier net vir die elite en bepaalde groepe praat en dadels vir die armes omgee. [Tussenwerpsels.] U weet wat gebeur. [Tussenwerpsels.] U weet wat gebeur. Kom met die waarheid. [Tussenwerpsels.] Ek vra aanhoudend vir u wat die stand van die plase is. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde!

Me E PRINS: U weet wat die werklikheid is, dat baie van dié plase bankrot gespeel het.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid, orde! Sien die Stoel so af en toe raak.

Me E PRINS: Baie van ons mense het tot nou toe geen dividende ontvang nie.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid, is u klaar?

Me E PRINS: Ek is nog nie klaar nie.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ek wil u net vra om die Stoel van tyd tot tyd aan te spreek.

Me E PRINS: Kan ek maar aangaan?

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: U kan voortgaan tot ek u stop.

Me E PRINS: Die Minister wat hier sit, wat nou so 'n groot bohaai maak, weet presies wat aangaan. Hy het in antwoord op 'n vraag van my in hierdie Parlement vir my 'n uitdruk gegee van 58 plase. Hy het egter nie eers een keer vir my gesê dat van die plase bankrot gespeel het en weer terug is na die wit plaasboere nie. Hoe kan ons hier sê dat aandelekemas die beste oplossing vir grondhervorming is?

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie vir die geleentheid om aan hierdie debat deel te neem.

I am tempted to put my speech aside and only deal with what was said in the House thus far, but I will have to discipline myself to rather do my speech. [Interjections.] I want to take this opportunity to congratulate the Premier on her speech. It was an excellent speech. I also want to congratulate her on the significant achievements of her government. Dit is nou nie net 'n kwessie van jakkals prys sy eie stert nie, want die feite is daar. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, I think that a government should be evaluated against the following: Creating opportunities, ensuring equality, doing proper redress and delivery, and reconciling the nation. I am certain that if we succeed in doing that we would ensure a freedom for all our people that they could really use. This is a constitutional commitment by us as a government, and that is what we should adhere to.

However, the facts are undeniable. Even the hon Leader of the Opposition mentioned in the past that she actually inherited a very difficult government. We spoke about this in the past. She tried to make ends meet in a few months with the mess that she inherited. It is therefore well documented.

If the Premier mentions in her Address what we achieved in the four years, explains the vision and shows the progress that we've made, document it, it is not pie in the sky. They are all facts.

An HON MEMBER: It's fire on the ground. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER: Then the hon Leader of the Opposition says that this government does not have a vision. How on earth can you say that this government does not have a vision?

The hon member Haskin said that we shouldn't compare ourselves to the rest of the country, but we often hear, every day, how bad we are in terms of the rest of the country. We are an island and we are many things. We endure many accusations, but when we say what we

achieved in South Africa, then we should not compare it to the rest of the country. That is not acceptable.

There is not a single province in this country that can say today that over the past four years they improved their audit outcomes, except the Western Cape. There is not a single province in this country that can say that they have a cleaner administration, but we can. There is not a single ...

An HON MEMBER: You're blowing your own horn.

The MINISTER: I'm blowing my own horn, yes.

An HON MEMBER: But they are facts!

The MINISTER: I'm actually showing you that you do not have one. There is not a single ...

An HON MEMBER: A broken horn. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER: Time out! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please continue, Minister.

The MINISTER: I'm sorry for that, Mr Deputy Speaker. There is not a single province in this country that can boast about or claim a better education over the past four years. There is not

a single province in this country that can say that they have a better health service.

[Interjections.] There is not a single province in this country that can say that they have created more jobs, percentage-wise, of the population – not in numbers – ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Percentage and numbers ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: ... and economic growth that the Western Cape has achieved. No one can say that. This is a province without vision.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we witness every day how the ANC provinces are collapsing. We witness every day the corruption that's happening. We do not only witness it; we deal with the consequences of it, we pay for it, we provide the services, and we are not complaining about that because we are so glad ... [Interjections.] No, we are not. [Interjections.] We are not complaining about that. We regard ourselves very fortunate that we have the means to look after those people as well, because what would otherwise happen to them? Your government is too pathetic to look after them. [Interjections.] Your governments in the rest of the country are deteriorating. You are falling apart. You are collapsing. It is a fact in this country. [Interjections.]

It is against this background, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we should evaluate a government. It is against this background that we should evaluate strategic objectives and outcomes. [Interjections.]

There are so many issues that the Premier mentioned in her speech. There are so many, and we can add to them. Many of those were mentioned here today already. I am going to go through my notes very quickly, because there are so many things that were mentioned. The Premier said that 76% of our budget is spent on the poor. It is not our own determination. We can look at that. We can give you the analysis on how we spent that 70%. [Interjections.]

All the figures about the clean water and basic service delivery to households are available. It is by far the best in the province. As I have mentioned, we deal with 1,3 million people more in the province than three or four years ago. We are then accused because the national government has chosen this province for very important pilot projects for the NDP. I actually think that by choosing us to do this is a very strong endorsement of what we are achieving. At least the national government is giving the acknowledgement, which you are – what was the word you used? – not sharp enough to realise. [Interjections.] What is similar to ...

Mr M OZINSKY: Yourself is the opposite.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It's called Theuns Botha.

Die MINISTER: In Afrikaans noem ons dit sommer net stomp. [Gelag.] Julle is te stomp.

Me J WITBOOI: Stompie Botha.

Die MINISTER: Ja.

Mr Deputy Speaker, look at the 5 500 bursaries that we funded. Look at the achievements with the Advancement of Youth Payment Scheme, where we have given so many of the youth an opportunity. Look at the Work and Skills Programme. Look at the Development Bank investment of R64 million to create another 1 000 work opportunities. Look at the roll-out of the Broadband project, where we will capacitate so many people to become economically active. Look at the initiatives of One Cape 2040. Look at the government's implementation of the benchmark tests in our education system, where 1,6 million textbooks were distributed in our province. Look at the 650 additional educator posts that were created. So we can go on.

If you look at all of this then you realise that this is not only a government with a vision. I think the Premier was very modest when she spoke about what we've achieved in this government, especially against the background of what we've inherited – the mess that you recognised and which you acknowledged that we've inherited in this province.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: We always had a good education system and a good health system.

The MINISTER: Well, we've improved on every indicator in this province. There is not a single indicator on which we have not improved.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to refer to the capital projects that we are currently busy with in Health. The capital projects currently in Health are one of the best examples of redress, where

we invest the most ever in the history of this government on infrastructure in previously disadvantaged areas. That is really creating an opportunity for people second to none.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I also want to refer to the remarks made here today. In the first instance, the hon Leader of the Opposition referred to the DA boasting. I think the hon Leader of the Opposition should rather acknowledge what we've achieved here. If she's honest about the interest of the people of our country, then she should acknowledge what we've already achieved.

It's not that we say that there are no challenges. We also do not say that we are perfect and don't ever make mistakes, but the numbers speak for themselves. When we say that before 16 000 people were on ARVs and now 143 000 are on ARVs, how can you then say that we do not have a vision? How can you then say that we are not successful? [Interjections.] Are you denying the people of this province these things that we are doing for them? [Interjections.]

The hon Leader of the Opposition has again referred to race, and I'm really disappointed that she did this.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I will always refer to race.

The MINISTER: When are you going to release yourself ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I'm not scared of dealing with race.

The MINISTER: ... from this intoxicated burden that you are living with? [Interjections.]
You survive on your history. [Interjections.] The fact of the matter is, Mr Deputy Speaker,
that the ANC ... [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER: ... had an opportunity ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Race is reality.

The MINISTER: They had an opportunity in this province – that's also reality.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: If only a white person living in Khayelitsha ...
[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER: The ANC had an opportunity in this province.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: How long can she carry on, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Leader of the Opposition! You've made your interjections. The Minister can now continue.

The MINISTER: Try to behave yourself like a leader of an opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, Minister.

The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the question I ask is: What is it that the leadership of the ANC in this province, which include you, are doing to establish better governance? They are trying their very best to find a problem in a programme which is very exciting. What is Marius Fransman doing in this province? [Interjections.] Do you know what he's trying to do? He's inciting violence. He wants a province that's ungovernable. That is what he wants for the people of this province. He wants a government which fails. How can that be a party that wants to take over a government and becomes a responsible government? [Interjections.] That is a vision to be ashamed of actually. That is all that Marius Fransman can do. He's never spoken to us in the media or directly about any governance issue. He's never said to us: Here is an alternative. The members across me are also ashamed of him. [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, as the Premier said in her State of the Province Address:

There is no other area in the province where the whole of society approach has a more important role to play than in tackling crime and violence.

Some examples of this philosophy in action include partnerships with the religious community. Before I go into detail about this partnership, I wish to demonstrate to the House that our projects are based on analysis – precisely so that we can use our limited resources where they are most needed. Year after year, the annual crime statistics released by the SAPS are criticised for being released only once-yearly, and by the time we get them they are outdated.

With this in mind, the Western Cape Department of Community Safety has now developed a system which allows us to use alternative indicators to crime statistics, and last year, we released the first ever Shadow Crime Report.

The information from the report allows us to be more responsive, allocating our limited resources more effectively and to move away from a one-size-fits-all approach to crime. It allows for localised responses according to the safety needs that exist in communities. This information has permitted us to identify, for example, a profile of victims, based on factors such as gender, race or age.

Similarly, we were able to analyse the age group of victims and found that 63% of murder victims in the Western Cape were between the ages of 18 and 35 years old, yet population demographics tell us that the 30-54 age category accounts for the highest number of

population in the province, meaning that younger people are disproportionately becoming victims of murder.

We also now know more about the cyclical nature of murder in certain areas. These indicators tell us that January and February, generally, have the lowest numbers of murders with a peak over the festive season in December.

With this information at hand, we partnered with the religious community to keep our youth in this concerning age group positively occupied over the periods when the murder rate was at its highest. Through this partnership we kept young people busy with activities ranging from sports to seminars, and over the past festive season we reached out to almost 6 000 youth in that category.

My department is visiting various communities suffering the trauma of brutal rapes and crimes against women. We are engaging with communities so that together we can prevent these horrid crimes, such as those allegedly committed by an ANC MEC, a person in a highly trusted public position.

Mr Deputy Speaker, another partnership using the whole of society approach is our partnership with FET colleges. Many of our youth would like to study or to gain a skill but don't know that it is possible. I have gone with the department across the province – from the platteland to the Cape Flats – to speak to the unemployed youth of the province. Along with Northlink, we have encouraged them to take advantage of bursaries for various courses and trades.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is only through a whole of society approach that we will win the war against crime, and this war starts by mobilising the youth. When our learners graduate from high school and go on to study at a tertiary institution, they are in a much better position to find employment, opening up opportunities for them.

However, while we are focusing on preventing crime, we must acknowledge that one of the greatest deterrents to crime is a properly functioning criminal justice system. While most of the criminal justice value chain is located with the national government, our Constitution confers oversight responsibilities on provinces when it comes to the police.

In an attempt to bolster oversight, we have introduced the Western Cape Community Safety Bill into the House. It focuses on improving how we conduct oversight, clarifies what this oversight role entails and also promotes safety partnerships as well as the betterment of police-community relations.

Contrary to what some of those who oppose the Bill say, the Bill in no way seeks to control or interfere in the operation of the SAPS. In terms of the Constitution, the control and management of the SAPS rest with the national government.

At the same time, the Constitution clearly states that each province is entitled to monitor police conduct; oversee the efficiency and effectiveness of the police service, including receiving reports on the police service; and to promote good relations between the police and the community. The Constitution further states that in order for provinces to carry out these

functions, a province may investigate or appoint a commission of inquiry into any complaints of police inefficiency or breakdown in relations between the police and any community.

Oversight can act as a catalyst for improved police efficiency, and that is what we are after – better policing for the people of this province. Looking at the fiasco with the original investigating officer assigned to the Oscar Pistorius case, it is time that the SAPS understand that there are some serious systemic problems within the service that need to be addressed.

It is an understatement to say that the police were hammered in the press this past weekend.

The editorial in the *Weekend Argus Sunday Edition* reads:

National Planning Minister Trevor Manuel last week identified as an area of urgent concern, levels of skill, training and commitment amongst civil servants, calling at the same time for “serious consequences” to be visited upon state employees failing to live up to the public trust ... but nowhere are they more resonant than in the case of the police.

The *Weekend Argus* called the Pistorius detective matter a profound embarrassment and a humiliation for our nation.

It goes on to say that the ANC government has been more concerned with controlling the police than it has with empowering them, which is likely one of the reasons why our Community Safety Bill and the Commission of Inquiry are both being challenged.

Profoundly, the newspaper editorial says:

... in the face of institutionalised incompetence, crime is never going to be beaten.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we however firmly believe that with the help of proper oversight, these systemic problems can be identified, and fixed. We do not want to look back and blame; we want to look forward and fix the future, fix the problems, so that we have better police and together, we can in fact beat crime.

An efficient police service, plus a whole of society approach to preventing crime, can allow us to be free from fear – when our young women can walk home at night without the fear of becoming victims of brutal crimes and our young men have opportunities to reach their full potential and not get caught up in street or fight gangs.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please finish off. Your time has expired.

The MINISTER: This, Mr Deputy Speaker, is freedom that you can use.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I ask myself: Where is the Premier of this province when the people in the Western Cape are distressed, hurt and in need of leadership?

She runs away or goes into hiding! She refuses to come out in person to receive petitions and memoranda from the people of the province. She peeks at protesters from behind the curtain in her office. [Interjections.]

She and her Cabinet stay in their ivory tower reminiscent of a Marie Antoinette that responded to the pleas of the hungry French for bread by saying let them have cake!

Is it then a surprise that this Premier could not find one woman to appoint in her Cabinet? [Interjections.] This Premier does not take women serious. She only uses them as messengers to collect memoranda from protesters. [Interjections.]

Her reaction is left wanting when one considers that gender-based violence in this province far surpasses that of most other provinces in the country with unacceptable levels!

It is ironic that the Premier claims that this province is world-class, but does very little when only on occasion speaks of this outrage against our mothers, sisters and children. There is nothing concrete, save for a general admonishment and the fleeting mention of the Booysen outrage.

It is even more ironic that this Premier and her MEC, Mr Albert Fritz, absolve themselves of responsibility and picket at national Parliament, making demands on national government! She runs to the TV cameras to react to her purging of black staff, but cannot find time to do the same about the spike in the horrendous rape and killings of women.

This happens while this Premier's government fails to assist NGOs that deal with gender-based violence by massive cuts on funding to rape centres for abused women and children, such as the Saartjie Baartman Centre!

This cripples this organisation, leaves it helpless and forces it to turn away an average of around 10 women a day.

Is it any wonder that the Premier does nothing about her MEC who makes insensitive statements, blaming the victims of gender-based violence? He must retract and apologise to the families involved. The Premier fails to adequately address this scourge when she in general speaks about it rather than to specifically target the perpetrators.

The Premier as a woman fails to side with the mostly female victims and says nothing about refusing bail to perpetrators.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

Ms Z MAGWAZA: The Premier fails to come up with a strategy to tackle the scourge in her province.

I have with interest listened to the Premier pontificating on three young entrepreneurs whom she wanted to elevate as a shining example of youth that does not get raped and murdered because it follows a path she wants to create.

This unfortunate offset is shocking. It postulates a contrast between the young role models taking up entrepreneurial challenges against those young women who were so brutally tortured, raped and murdered. This is another example of how totally irrelevant and callous this DA-led government can be.

What is even more surprising is the fact that the Premier brags here with the three men and their coffee venture. She brings Wongama Baleni, Vuyile Msaku and Vusumzi Mamile here for her speech. She parades them on the gallery; she mentions them by name and points them out. Afterwards I personally interviewed them for several minutes to establish how they started their business.

Firstly, it was presented as if their investment and business is a shining example which is to the credit of the Western Cape provincial government. They are not. They did not receive any assistance whatsoever from the DA government.

The only thing I could establish is that the Premier met them at a public event and now jumped onto their story to piggyback and wrongfully take credit for something she had no hand in.

Ms Z MAGWAZA: She pretends to care for the youth and to assist them to access opportunities, but she brings the threesome here for all to see, without helping them in any way.

She claims to offer a so-called full range of support services to new entrepreneurs, without admitting that the three young men from Khayelitsha did not get this. She even fails to say that her government reduced the Red Door access points, which should in fact help young people at this level to access opportunities.

The Western Cape had the highest spending on children-at-risk programmes when the DA took over and now it has regressed to third position, or lower. This is an indictment against this Premier in a province where children are exposed and vulnerable to many dangers.

On the issue of children, the Premier speaks volumes on the regional economy, but avoids the elephant in the room: She did not say one word about her government's arbitrary closure of twenty poor black and coloured schools. [Interjections.]

She also has a lot to explain after the High Court gave her a dressing-down for attempting to interfere in the judicial process with political gamesmanship. She must publicly apologise for that. [Interjections.]

The DA's own professed concern that it cares for the poor and unemployed is exposed when most of its inaction and failures are in the areas of inferior services to the poor. A simple example is the dealings with the farmworkers on starvation wages in De Doorns and the frequent violence experienced by this vulnerable group. Not a word is heard of the needs of these people who mostly suffer of malnutrition and whose clinics are closed to punish them.

Instead racial tensions and xenophobia were fuelled by this DA government. The Premier has no plan to deal with the social ills in our society. This province deserves better than a lack of critical and responsive leadership on real issues worrying residents. The Western Cape deserves better than a Premier seeking refugees behind every bush. [Interjections.]

Ndunankulu thatha umhlalaphantsi awubenzeli nto abantu abahlwempezekileyo beli phondo, ndiyabulela

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, as I'm standing here I'm thinking of two songs and a poem. The one song is from the group, Swedish House Mafia, and it goes, "Don't worry, son, heaven has a place for you". [Interjections.] "Don't worry, son, heaven has a place for you." [Interjections.]

Ms E PRINS: Sing it!

The MINISTER: The other song I would apply is *Chasing Numbers*; and the poem is in Afrikaans and applies to Ms Magwaza.

Dit sê: Die wêreld is my woning nie, Me Magwaza.

I am quoting these three things, because, Mr Speaker, I want to understand the kind of logic that is being used. Someone must really please explain it to me. Mr Ozinsky, please, after the sitting can you explain it to me? You say that there are three young men who without government assistance started their own innovative coffee shop called The Department of Coffee and use them as an example – but there are hundreds of other entrepreneurs out there. And you know what hon Magwaza's criticism is? Oh, the state did not support them.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We didn't give them anything. They did it on their own and it's commendable. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT: Exactly! The second point hon Magwaza make's that worries me is that she says we have failed children at risk, while last year we invested R14 million in the MOD centres - more than anyone else, Mr Speaker – for children at risk to be cared for in the afternoon, for children who get raped in the afternoon when they get home and there is no mother at home because, you see, poor mothers work. The point is they're not at home. The other issue is chasing numbers. The second song I was thinking of is *Chasing Pavements* by Adele. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, I wonder how many of these hon members have stopped glorifying the poor, stopped romanticising the poor and stopped vulgarising the poor. [Interjections.] I wonder how many of them really care about the impact of all the programmes that we roll out, for example, hon Haskin, the drug programme.

It is because I went to all the centres and asked where their verification is. Mr Skwatsha will remember me always going to places. Everyone always has these nice registers and the ANC is always very happy with registers. The questions I ask them is: What and where is the substantive evidence? That is what I ask, because I've said we shall not write that it is verified unless it is substantiated. Then we get slaughtered for doing the work correctly!

We get slaughtered by the hon Leader of the Opposition in the House who made a generalisation about purging people. I want to put it to the House this afternoon, look at the forensic investigations in my department. Look at the number of forensic investigations and look at the money that was stolen from the department ... [Interjections.] ... and then you won't say another word.

Hon members of the opposition, let us not joke about this. We all know, and we all knew, what was happening. Just before the DA government came in you appointed a whole lot of people to chief directorships, to whatever, although they weren't even qualified. So, let's not make jokes about service delivery to poor people. [Interjections.]

It is in that context, Mr Deputy Speaker, that it makes me sick to the gut when I then read that the Minister of the Department of Women, Children and People with Disabilities, Lulu Xingwana, said "Enough is enough" – on rape. It makes me sick when the Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development, Jeff Radebe, says, "We're thinking of reinstating the sexual offences court". Where are those courts? He removes everything that works. I know that because I worked with those courts and I know exactly what happened.

I marched, by the way, with hon Magwaza and hon Prins. In fact, they had very high high-heels on and I had to assist them with the marching. We marched through the streets of Bredasdorp and she said, "It's so good, Minister, that you're marching with us". Then on Wednesday she says I am the biggest joke. She marched with me to the place where the child was murdered and she said, "Minister it's so good to have you with us". She said it was a united front and they took photos of us.

Then on Wednesday she supported her leader, Marius Fransman, who said I said I'm blaming the victim. I never said I blame the victim. Hon member, you were with me. When I made the speech I said we can never blame the victim.

It is interesting when you look at a specific case, Mr Deputy Speaker, to note that in this country there's one law for poor people and another law for connected people.

Mr H P GEYER: Yes.

The MINISTER: I'm talking about Prince Sifiso Zulu, who was released yesterday.

An HON MEMBER: So?

The MINISTER: He's from President Zuma's inner circle. He served nine months of a three year sentence for killing two people while driving under the influence of alcohol. One person was left seriously disabled in that accident. We know he was released because he's connected. The law does not serve the poor but serves the elite sitting opposite me. Then they talk about the poor. Stop vulgarising the poor.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the issue of gender violence, rape and abuse of women and children is a major issue for DA. We have prioritised the issue in a very practical way, not the way Marius Fransman did when he woke up one morning, saw the headlines and rushed to a funeral, vulgarising the funeral and quoting things I never said.

Mnr H P GEYER: Skande!

The MINISTER: This is why the people will not vote for you. They will punish you during the 2014 elections.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Marius Fransman is a shame.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, what our colleagues in the House forget is that we've had a national council against gender based violence, which is supposed to be implementing a sustainable programme against gender-based violence. This body has been so mute and quiet about the spate of violent rapes and murders in the province. We'd like to know exactly what this council has been doing since its establishment. We haven't heard a word from the chairperson of this body. [Interjections.]

Unfortunately the National Council Against Gender Based Violence ... [Interjections.] ... was first announced ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister. Ms Magwaza, you cannot react to every sentence of the Minister. You can't give a running commentary. Please try and contain yourself. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: The National Council Against Gender Based Violence was eventually established on 10 December 2012 – International Human Rights Day, hon Skwatsha – and its responsibilities include driving the implementation of 365-day action plan; not 16 days of activism, but 365 days. [Interjections.] You know what, suffice it to say, Mr Deputy Speaker, nothing came of it. We are now 57 days into the new year and the council does not seem to have anything ready ... [Interjections.] ... for implementation.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, will the Minister take a question?

The MINISTER: No, no, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Minister is not prepared to take a question.

The MINISTER: So, Mr Deputy Speaker, I can continue in the same way as the hon member. The number of cases reported to SAPS for violent sexual crimes continues to rise without much being done about it. My dear friend, the hon Minister of Police, Minister Nathi Mthethwa, is very proud when he releases the crime stats year after year, claiming an increase in the number of arrests. After all, it shows that the police are doing their job correctly, but how many of those reported cases result in arrests and I'm talking about final arrests. More importantly, how many of those arrests result in convictions?

Hon Ozinsky, let me tell you what the figures are. [Interjections.] Last year 64 415 sexual offences were reported to the police. [Interjections.] Of these, only 6 913 cases were finalised. Listen to this: only 4 500 actually resulted in convictions. Are we serious about addressing the spate of rapes and violent crimes against women? We cannot be.

I remember dealing with a case recently where a frantic women phoned me and asked why the court gave bail to a particular offender. It wasn't a rape but a sexual assault, and the prosecutor said the accused had only touched her.

Hy het gesê: "Hy het net aan haar gevat. Dit was niks ernstig nie."

This is what our judiciary thinks about our women and I think that should be corrected. Should our national government not be outraged by this? Is this not a crisis that should kick into gear every resource we can spare? Hon Magwaza, should you and your Women's League not be handing over petitions to the national Parliament with all the national Ministers? You should have marched there.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Don't try to ...

The MINISTER: In this province we do everything in our power, with very limited resources, to fight the scourge of violent crimes against women and children. One of the practical things that we are doing, Mr Deputy Speaker, is rolling out extensively the issue of our youth programme and Minister Plato already alluded to that.

Today Minister Meyer, Minister Grant and I met some Swedish philanthropists, and they promised to partner with us to roll out more of our youth programmes so that we make a visible impact and not just chase numbers. Then we'll see the difference in the lives of those children. I want to invite hon Magwaza to come with me and take my hand again like we did in Bredasdorp. Let's march to make a difference to those young people. [Interjections.]

Then, hon Magwaza's favourite topic - food. We've spoken about the MOD Centres and the roll-out is starting now. We shall continue to give food and we shall think innovatively when dealing with the food issue for people who really need that. We have carefully looked at giving out food to children at schools who are desperately in need of that.

Our Chrysalis programme is the flagship programme and will continue to be. We made a difference when we took over, but I don't want to pointing fingers. I want to talk about what is in the present and the turnaround strategies that have taken place. You know I always invite you and I again want to ask members of the House to please attend the next graduation ceremony so you can see for yourselves.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: So long as we know you are turning around.

The MINISTER: It's good. Please come and visit and see that. We are also extensively conceptualising the programmes in our facilities for awaiting-trial children and sentenced youth. In this regard I want to say that those programmes include gender education, young offenders and gender equality and the message that great men do not rape. That message comes out very, very strongly.

I want to conclude by saying I saw all the ladies from the ANC in black last week. I hope you were mourning the vision of your national government not going in the right direction. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mnr M J R DE VILLIERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, Helen Zille, members of the provincial Cabinet, members of the provincial parliament, officials of the provincial departments, honoured guests and listeners to radio and tv broadcasts. Today is a very important day for all of us. You will hear the responses of members of Parliament to the State of the Province Address. You must decide who is playing political games to mislead the

voters and who can be trusted with your vote and support in the coming byelections and provincial and national elections in 2014.

Agb Premier, ekself het u toespraak drie keer deurgelees en vandag kom hier lede van die provinsiale parlement en hulle sê dat u nie 'n visie het nie. U visie is baie duidelik in the toespraak. U het 'n kort, samevattende opsomming gegee van wat die kiesers in die provinsie van die verskillende Ministers kan verwag in die komende begroting.

U gee baie goeie leiding in die verskillende departemente en ek kan die kiesers daarbuite verseker dat híerdie Ministers kán ontwikkel, beplan en dienste lewer. Dit is al in die verlede bewys.

Dit is so teleurstellend dat lede van die ANC wat ook in die vorige regering in die Wes-Kaap was dit nie kan verstaan. Die Premier kan mos nie die Ministers se begrotings en hierdie debat hier kom hanteer nie. Sy moet die leiding gee en dit is gedoen. [Tussenwerpsels.] Baie dankie daarvoor.

The Premier clearly stated that 76% of the provincial annual budget is allocated to the poor. [Interjections.] Even the hon Leader of the Opposition did not read the Premier's speech. [Interjections.]

Me J WITBOOI: Hoekom het hulle jou hier weggevat?

Mnr M J R DE VILLIERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, most of the poor in the province live in the rural areas and from 2001 the population of the Western Cape grew by 1,3 million people. This growth is mostly in the poorest of the poor percentage of the population. This shows the DA-led Western Cape government knows what they are doing, and that is to provide to the poor. [Interjections.] To provide to the poor! [Interjections.] You must go out there, hon member, and explain to the poor what you are saying to the House today.

The NDP of the government – listen to this – ruled by the ANC-SACP-Cosatu alliance said that the fundamental goals are good governance, good leadership, a capable state and the implementation of the goals and policies of government.

Ek gaan baie rond as gevolg van die werk in die provinsies. In die ander provinsies kan u gaan kyk na die paaie. Dit lyk asof die slaggate groei in die paaie en die hase kan wegkruip in daardie slaggate. [Laughter.] Gaan kyk maar. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Gaan kyk ook na die situasie ten opsigte van die misbruik van fondse. Dit is die grootste teleurstelling dat u wat hier sit, wat deel is van die nasionale regering onder die ANC-SAKP-Cosatu alliansie, sulke dinge hier kom praat.

U sê nie hoe u die arm mense in die ander provinsies deur nalatigheid teleurstel ten opsigte van ontwikkeling en dienslewering nie. [Tussenwerpsel.] Kom sê dit hier. Kom sê dit hier!

Mr Deputy Speaker, just go to Limpopo, KwaZulu-Natal and the Eastern Cape. Let's talk about the education in the Eastern Cape; I don't have to tell you about it. I don't have to tell

you about the textbooks in Limpopo and Mapumalanga, you know about it. These provinces are mostly of a rural nature with poor people who are living there. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Hierdie regering, die ANC-SAKP-Cosatu alliansie stel al die arm mense teleur. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! There are too many conversations going on while the member is speaking.

Mr M J R DE VILLIERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, these members actually believe in a failed state, namely ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, they want that.

Mnr M J R DE VILLIERS: ... rule through unrest, protest, burn down, cut down, destroy, degrade, etc. This is why, under Marius Fransman, in the Western Cape the unrest and protests are happening and will increase. Just be sure that the people in the Western Cape are clever and cannot be misled by a small group of hooligans who do not care for the good and growth of communities, but for their own political agenda and benefit. [Interjections.]

They don't believe in co-operative governance and that other parties, voted in by the electorate, can also govern and do so better than them. They don't believe in it.

We, in the DA-led government, are very much concerned about and interested in the growth of work skills of young people. That is why we actually make funds available to develop this. The DA government cares for all the people, also those living in local governments under the ANC-SACP-Cosatu alliance. We are not like them, who suppress people that support other political parties. In my area, if you are a DA member and supporter you won't get work. In my area in the Central Karoo, you won't get work.

The DA believes in the Constitution of South Africa and in the right to associate with whatever and whomever you believe in. We believe in the right of everyone to share and participate freely in the wealth and economy of the land and South Africa.

We don't store textbooks. [Interjections.] We don't hide textbooks. [Interjections.] We hand them out. We hand them out to the schools according to the language of the school and according to the order submitted by the principal.

Gaan kyk waar spandeer ons geld. Ons identifiseer die probleme – dwelmmiddels, alkoholmisbruik, ens.

We put R17,7 million towards victim empowerment. Read it! [Time expired.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am both pleased and disheartened by the fact that ... [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: ... the Premier opened her 2013 State of the Province Address by making a reference to our Emergency Medical Services officials. I am pleased, as they render an invaluable service to the province, but also disheartened, as these heroic individuals are being attacked while saving the lives of others.

At least eight incidents of violence or threats against Metro Emergency Medical Services (EMS) personnel occurred between January and July 2012. Together with the Premier, I urge each citizen to ensure the safety of EMS officials so as to increase wellness across the province.

The Premier was indeed accurate in saying that all of us in this House share a deep sense of horror at the series of brutal rapes and murders in recent weeks. Police statistics show that around 144 women report rape each day. However, the Medical Research Council (MRC) estimates that only 1 in 25 women reports a rape. The MRC also found that a woman was killed by her partner every eight hours.

The shock surrounding the rape and brutal murder of Anene Booysen reminded me of the rape and murder of Valencia Farmer, who had been stabbed 53 times, 40 times in the back, after being gang-raped by at least six men in 1999. Similar to Anene Booysen's case there was public outrage against violent sexual behaviour.

The media widely reported on it, NGOs and community groups became vocal about their anger at the inhumane crimes and social media sites were inundated with letters from all over the world condemning these violent acts against women and children.

I am in agreement with the Premier that we need a whole of society approach where government, communities, families and individuals understand and act upon their specific responsibilities to create a safer society for women and children. For this reason I was disgusted at the ANC for using the heartbreaking death of Anene to politicise rape, both at Anene's funeral as well as a day before the State of the Province Address.

Violent sexual crime is not a political issue, it is an issue that has to be resolved with all role players working better together and not pointing fingers at inopportune times.

In the DA we choose to implement proactive plans as opposed to only rendering lip service. Last week, 13 February 2013, the Standing Committee for Social Development launched the Proactive Plan Against Violent Sexual Crimes, and it was approved by the entire committee. The proactive plan sets to gather all relevant and most recent research statistics and information on sexual crimes in South Africa. The goal is to generate suggestions for provincial and national governments on how to prevent ... [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mnr H P GEYER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek wil net vra dat u die spreker beskerm teen die lopende kommentaar aan die anderkant, asseblief.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ek sal dit dophou. Ek is nie bewus daarvan nie, maar ek sal dit dophou. [Tussenwerpsels.] Orde!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: The goal is to generate suggestion for provincial and national government on how to prevent violent sexual crimes and to ensure the successful prosecution of criminals.

Together with the national, as well as local spheres of government, the DA in the Western Cape will look into workable suggestions, plans and possible projects to counter the plague of violent sexual crimes in South Africa. Proactive efforts will be more beneficial for creating a caring society and fostering social cohesion, so that all people can live lives they value.

As the Premier mentioned, another area where a whole of society approach is crucial is our provincial healthcare system. I take this opportunity to congratulate the Department of Health on the launch of the partnership with the Clicks Group, the launch of the Health Foundation in Stellenbosch, the first birthday of the Khayelitsha Hospital and its gold award for the best functioning pharmacy in the province as well as for having the lowest emergency unit mortality rate in the country.

I also congratulate the department on the official opening of the new Malmesbury Community Day Centre clinic, the upgraded Grassy Park and the T C Newman Day Care Centres and the Oudtshoorn Clinic. All these outstanding developments in health care set the Western Cape apart from other provinces which have more problems than successes due to management flaws.

It also increases wellness in the province as well as reduces the burden of disease, again showing that the DA delivers, creates an open opportunity for all and affords the people of the

Western Cape freedom they can use. It is a shame that the same cannot be said about the national Minister of Women, Children and People with Disabilities, who chooses to spend R2,1 million on furniture instead of service delivery to the vulnerable. [Interjections.]

Me C LABUSCHAGNE: Skande!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: For the poor – she does it for the poor! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Ms J A DU TOIT MARAIS The Premier again brought it to our attention that 80% of our health budget is spent on preventable conditions, such as noncommunicable diseases caused by smoking, alcohol abuse, unhealthy diets and physical inactivity.

As the Chairperson of Standing Committee on Health, I undertake to focus on these avoidable diseases and, together with the committee, raise awareness that unhealthy lifestyles are depriving others of their rights. I am under no illusion that reducing the burden of noncommunicable diseases will be an easy task, but is the solution to many other social ills with which we are faced. Behavioural change is a priority – an essential one – which we ought to look into collectively.

I thank the Premier for an accurate State Of The Province Address, one which not only focused on the successes we've enjoyed thus far, but also mentioned the adversities we are

faced with and the many challenges we are yet to overcome and will overcome. By leading by example, we will create a caring society and foster social cohesion and in that way reduce poverty in the Western Cape so that people can live lives they value.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon MEC Theuns Botha ...

An HON MEMBER: Your friend. [Laughter.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... asks where is this thing that the Leader of the Opposition speaks about in relation to the Western Cape being the best province.

According to labour market statistics for the New Growth Path year period, the third quarter 2010 to 2013, the Western Cape slipped further behind other provinces like Gauteng, KwaZulu Natal and even Limpopo and it's not the ANC that says that.

Mr P UYS: It's facts.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Gauteng, in fact, increased its youth jobs fourfold in comparison to the Western Cape's 66 000 ... [Interjections.] ... while Limpopo and KwaZulu Natal doubled that of the Western Cape. The Western Cape trails seventh amongst the nine provinces. [Interjections.] This is a fact and it is the truth. [Interjections.]

The hon Minister of Community Development says we must not politicise rape and murder, and the ANC agrees. What we cannot afford, however, is to allow a government to be in dereliction of its responsibility to make sure that it looks after the poor.

What we did a day before the State of the Province Address was we said that not everything is as sunny as the DA professes it to be. Hon Ncedana speaks about how nice the Khayelitsha Hospital looks, but what happens inside? [Interjections.] Ordinary women go for an ordinary family-planning injection and they are giving the wrong injection.

Ms V HANI: It's sad.

Mr M SKWATSHA: What happens there? The buck stops there. What happens there? I am speaking about Phundi Sapoti who was buried three weeks ago. You may say we are politicising it when we talk about it, but when people from Khayelitsha ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You're jealous, man.

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... are given wrong prescriptions at that particular hospital, we are going to raise that. We think that instead of running away from collecting the memorandum the MECs for Health and for Social Development, or the Premier, ought to have come to fetch the memorandum so that we could address these issues together in order to make a difference.

Mr K MAGAXA: It's taking responsibility.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, taking responsibility.

In her typical secessionist manner, Premier Helen Zille portrays the Western Cape as the model province for service delivery, but all is not well in the province. Too often we have witnessed failures of political grandstanding by her DA-led Government, which negatively affects health care provision to the poor and vulnerable. [Interjections.]

The Premier falsely claims that health care services in this province prioritise poor communities, yet she fails to address the inferior quality of these services. You put all your money into it, but if the quality of the services is inferior, you're not achieving anything. [Interjections.]

Whilst she gloats about the Western Cape having the highest TB cure rate, she fails to tell us the whole truth. The whole truth is that the DA-led Western Cape has the highest TB cure rate, because it has the highest TB infection rate.

An HON MEMBER: In the world. [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: It has the highest TB infection rate, because the socioeconomic conditions of our people are bad. [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: There is no proper infrastructure and no proper housing, hence people are getting TB cheaply. That's the whole truth.

We support initiatives, for instance, for a healthy lifestyle, but we think that, hon Premier, you're overemphasising this point about obesity in a very insensitive way.

The PREMIER: Why?

Mr M SKWATSHA: You forget that in this province where 60 % of our people live from hand to mouth emphasis is really insensitive. The poor majority in this province goes home to a meal of starch, bread or pap not a glass or bottle of red wine accompanied by a healthy meal prepared by a domestic worker whilst listening to Chopin in the background.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Your racism is showing, sir.

Mr M SKWATSHA: If racism is the truth so be it. At the height of the farmworker uprisings in November 2012, Premier, your government through your MEC for health closed several healthcare clinics in the De Doorns area.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But they were invaded.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Patients suffering from chronic conditions and diseases had no place to go for treatment. The clinic was not closed due to staff being in danger. This was done to force the lowly paid farmworkers to desist from striking.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Oh, come on.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Premier, you and your MEC punished poor farmworkers and their families by denying them basic healthcare. Aren't we supposed to say something about how the DA treats black lives.

This year the DA-led Government will close the G F Jooste Hospital in Mannenberg. [Interjections.] Temporarily closed for years ... [Interjections.] ... and when one considers the fact that these poor people do not have enough money there is no solution being looked at for how we transport them to another facility.

The DA has even failed to provide a sufficient amount of beds to hospitals used by poor people who cannot afford the comforts of private hospitals. Revelations in November last year about Helderberg Hospital in Somerset West are a case in point. Many critically ill patients were forced to sleep on benches. This is the Western Cape of our dreams where service delivery is at its best.

The uncaring DA fixed the Eerste River bed crisis by firing the whistle blowing medical professional who spoke out. This is the same party that preaches about so-called protection of whistle blowers.

The DA has failed dismally to ensure that patients from amongst the poorest of the poor are cared for in hygienic conditions. The Public Protector pronounced on the issue of Gugulethu Day Hospital – the Public Protector, not the ANC.

The Premier's DA government has also shown scant regard for the provision of lifesaving chronic medication to disadvantaged people. The province's medicine dispensing chaos last year attests to this. Repeated shortages have become characteristic of this Premier's government. [Interjections.] Under the Premier's watch, insulin for diabetics, inflammatory reducing and chemotherapy treatment are not readily available in hospitals serving the poor.

The Premier speaks glibly of the success of the world class Khayelitsha Hospital, an ANC initiative which you properly completed

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Was it a bad one?

Mr M SKWATSHA: What happens there is bad. We would like to praise the dedicated work the emergency medical personnel serving the poor in our province, but the Premier and the MEC are failing to take concrete steps to ensure their safety.

Despite their failure to provide proper health care to the majority of people at tertiary hospitals, the DA government is hell-bent on maintaining full control of Tygerberg and Groote Schuur Hospitals. This is despite these being national assets that are funded directly by national government.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Not nationally.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The proposal by the Minister of Health, Dr Aaron Motsoaledi, to move control of South Africa's tertiary hospitals from provinces to the national government is being vehemently opposed by the secessionist DA.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Just like the Post Office.

Mr M SKWATSHA: You should rather keep quiet. The DA's opposition to addressing inequality is shameful. In addition to denying our people the right to more doctors and improved service delivery at tertiary hospitals, through its opposition the DA is seeking to prevent South Africans from all provinces from accessing healthcare that is directly funded by the national government.

Premier Zille is building a Berlin wall between the Western Cape and the rest of South Africa thus entrenching inequality. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: It doesn't belong to you.

Mr M SKWATSHA: As a result of the apartheid legacy, some provinces in our country do not have and never had tertiary healthcare. It is thus only right that tertiary hospitals in the Western Cape can be accessed more readily by South Africans from all provinces, so you are not doing anyone a favour.

The Premier also announced the partnership with the Clicks Group, but there has been no explanation of how the partnership will unfold. [Interjections.] Clicks is often a luxury; there

are no Clicks stores in most of the rural areas or in Gugulethu. It remains to be seen how these immunisation and family planning services will be provided in African townships in particular.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Is there one in Manenburg?

Mr M SKWATSHA: The inferior service delivery of health care to the majority in this province since Premier Zille assumed office in May 2009, has resulted in MEC Botha's department stumbling from crisis to crisis.

The Premier gloats about them taking over in 2009 and inheriting an education system in crisis – and hon Theuns Botha made that point today. It is true that when the ANC took over we inherited a crisis because of previous governments where the same Premier was an MEC for Education ...

An HON MEMBER: For one year.

Mr M SKWATSHA: This is why we've got that particular problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M SKWATSHA: The DA government under Hernus Kriel and ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Skwatsha your time has expired. Please finish off.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I want to finish by saying ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M SKWATSHA: This issue about purging of African people ... [Interjections.] In the Department of the Premier a coloured assistant director ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I'm just reading the sentence ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That must be a very short sentence. Your time has expired.

Mr M SKWATSHA: In the Department of the Premier a coloured assistant director without the necessary qualification has been promoted to a director's position whilst a senior African deputy director, who is an advocate, was bypassed in the Premier's department.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, member, your time has now expired.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Number two ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired unfortunately.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Number two ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Interjections.] Order! Please take your seat. [Interjections.]
Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I've listened to everything that has been said today and I thought I'd just pick out some of them.

Mr M OZINSKY: I thought the Premier replies.

Ms J WITBOOI: This is not your job to do that.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Why not?

An HON MEMBER: Why you?

The MINISTER: Why? You must get used to being losers. They must get used to being losers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are a couple of things I want to say to the Leader of the Opposition. She talks of a purging of black staff.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER: Now, you could say I purged Mr Manyati, but you failed to sign his contract when you were Premier.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Yes, but that's ...

The MINISTER: Why was that?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: But you know ...

The MINISTER: Why was that? Was that because you're a racist? [Interjections.] Was that because you wanted to purge black staff? [Interjections.] It was because the hon Leader of the Opposition knew very well what was going on under Mr Manyati.

'n AGB LID: Ja.

Die PREMIER: Ja.

The MINISTER: That's what it was about ... [Interjections.] ... but she didn't have the courage to do what she should have done and when I did it that's called purging black staff. [Interjections.]

Let's talk about provinces, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: No, come on. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: He won.

The MINISTER: So, he won.

Mr M OZINSKY: Yes.

The MINISTER: But he's gone. [Interjections.] He's gone. When they wouldn't make him go, when they didn't have the courage to throw him out ...

Mr M OZINSKY: We let him go.

The MINISTER: ... when they didn't have the courage to throw his political boss out, Mr Deputy Speaker ...

Mr M OZINSKY: We let him go.

The MINISTER: ... they moved him to another department and now he plans to come back.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURE AND SPORT: Talk about Marius.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Let's talk about provinces.

Mr M OZINSKY: You were useless, just like she's been.

The MINISTER: I'm many things, my friend, but I'm not useless. I did what you didn't have the guts to do. [Interjections.] What you didn't have the guts to do! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Interjections.] Order, Hon Ozinsky.

An HON MEMBER: Straighten up.

The MINISTER: Let's talk about provinces. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, they get very excited and sensitive about provinces. It's not about provinces; it's about the DA versus the ANC.

Mr M OZINSKY: It's not. [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: Yes, yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is. What is it?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I come from Limpopo. That's my home, that's my turf. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You're a refugee.

The MINISTER: I'm a refugee. [Interjections.] It's about one system of government versus another.

Ms J WITBOOI: When are you going home?

The MINISTER: Let's have a look at that other system of government, Mr Deputy Speaker. They lecture us on the poor.

An HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The MINISTER: They lecture us on the poor.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER: The hon Leader of the Opposition talks about ... [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Luister, man.

The MINISTER: ... the plague ... [Interjections.] ... of the poor families. She talks about the voices of the poor that we don't listen to.

Mr M SKWATSHA: You don't even know the poor.

The MINISTER: She talks about the violence of the poverty of the poor. She talks about her concern for the unemployed poor. Hon Magaxa talks about the poor. The poor, he says ...

Mr K MAGAXA: Because I represent them. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Who do you represent?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... and so they go on.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister. I'm looking at the left side of the Chamber. We can't continue like this. You can't react to every comment made by the Minister. Give him a fair chance to make his speech. [Interjections.]

Mnr H P GEYER: Gooi hulle uit.[Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Leader of the Opposition, I'm still speaking. I will carefully look at the House, but we can't carry on in the way we're doing now. [Interjections.] I'm looking at both sides, but I'm specifically looking at the lefthand side.

The MINISTER: I want to say to my colleagues on this side to take note of what they tell you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: They're talking nonsense.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Hear them, hear the pain in the Inaudible.] ... that they feel for the poor and then remember they stole the poor's money.

Mr M C WALTERS: Yes.

Ms V HANI: Who is stealing?

Mr M OZINSKY: You can't believe that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Order! Mr Deputy Speaker, the MEC here says "they worry about the poor" ...

Mr M G E WILEY: Is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I'm listening.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... and then accuses each one of us in the House of stealing from the poor. I really would like you to rule on that, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I'll rule on that. Minister, when you said they stole from the poor, did refer to specific members?

The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, if I gave that impression I withdraw it, because what I meant to say is that the ANC stole from the poor.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Are you saying, Mr Deputy Speaker, that I'm allowed to say that all the ex-SADF members sitting there are murderers and have blood on their hands? Is that what you're saying is okay in the House?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: On your side as well. [Interjections.] As long as you mention those from your side as well. [Interjections.] Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Your side.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I'm dealing with this specific point of order. The member has given us the assurance that he referred to the ANC in general and not to individual members of the House and that is acceptable. [Interjections.]

Mr K MAGAXA: On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker: The ANC is represented by us here.

Mr H P GEYER: So what?

Mr K MAGAXA: There is no separation between us as individuals and the ANC in the House. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What about you? Yes, we don't know about you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! All members are aware that we distinguish between references to individual members and references to the party in general. I've accepted the hon member's word that the reference was about the party in general. Please continue, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I hope I'm going to get injury time, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr M OZINSKY: Why, are you knocked out?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: there can be no doubt, with great respect to hon Magaxa, that when the ANC was in power here members of that party stole the poor blind. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: How come you're government ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: They raped the poor.

Ms V HANI: Prove it!

The MINISTER: We don't have to prove it; I will present you with hon Brown's reports.

[Interjections.] Can you believe, can you believe ...

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: They fired the Premier for it.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... after everything that's happened here, after she was part of firing the Premier right here ... [Interjections.] ... she says, "What happened, I don't know about it?" [Interjections.] What did you fire him for? What did you fire the others for? It's amazing, they can't remember now. Suddenly there's a ... [Interjections].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: Now the concern that this province has is that the very person that embodies that they are said to be bringing back here as Premier ...

The PREMIER: Yes.

Ms M TINGWE: Who?

Mr H P GEYER: Skandia!

The MINISTER: ... and that's a matter of concern, I hope for every single member of the House.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Marius Fran man!

Mr H P GEYER: It'll be a nightmare if he is coming here as your leader.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, order!

The MINISTER: Let me just touch on some other things, sir. Hon Prims refers to the employment of unemployed youngsters as a twisted strategy. Doesn't that say everything? It's a twisted strategy to give young, unemployed people a job.

Ms E PRINS: I never said that.

The MINISTER: Why? Because her party says it's a twisted strategy.

Ms E PRINS: I never said it.

The MINISTER: You said it. [Interjections.] We'll look at Mansard. You said it.

Ms E PRINS: Ek het nie.

Die ADJUNGSPEAKER: Orde, gab Prims.

The MINISTER: Hon Medina says that EPWP jobs are given on the basis of party membership. [Interjections.] Now, I want to tell you ...

An HON MEMBER: It is.

The MINISTER: Yes, yes. Now, I put this challenge to the hon member: You can select any EPW project you want, anywhere in the province.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Denial.

The MINISTER: You can even select three. [Interjections] I will then take the hon member to the one he selects ...

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Denial

The MINISTER: ... and then he must show me. [Interjections.] He must talk to the people there and he must show me where there was party preference. [Interjections.] I will tell you this: The reason I'm making these points is that they have a reflection on the hon Premier's speech.

Mr P UYS: You must tell them. Take up the offer.

The MINISTER: Yes, there's an offer, take it up. One of the Premier's first instructions to me was that on every contract we do, roads or buildings, I want you to absolutely eliminate patronage. I tell you, we have eliminated patronage.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It's EPWDA.

The MINISTER: We have eliminated patronage; there's no more patronage. Not like there was when you were a member of the ANC, when being in power was how you could give jobs to your friends. [Interjections.] No longer true, I'm afraid. [Interjections.]

Then we get the thing of the three young men with their coffee shop. I was actually amazed. How can the Premier boast about the coffee shop, because she didn't give them any money? You know, what the Premier was doing was to celebrate success.

The hon member knows that I spend a lot of my time with the taxi industry. Nobody gave them any money. Must we be angry at the government for not giving them any money or must we be proud of people who did it by themselves? We are proud of those three people, because they did it by themselves but we did help [Interjections.] Was it not you? Then I apologies. Whoever it was.

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH: It was her.

Ms P C MAGWAZA: It wasn't.

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I also thought it was her. Anyway, we are also pleased because we created a reasonably safe and fertile space in Khayelitsha in which these things could happen.

The PREMIER: Of course.

The MINISTER: There was also talk about farm wages and about poor farmers. You see, I agree with my colleague here: You vulgarise the poor. You exploit the poor and when your party stops stealing from the poor then you can talk about the poor, not before that.
[Interjections.]

Let's talk about farmworkers. Which province, Mr Deputy Speaker, has for at least the last 13 years, consistently been the highest payer of farm wages in South Africa?

Mr M OZINSKY: Then why are they struggling to pay now. ?

The MINISTER: Now that's the interesting question.

Mr M OZINSKY: They can't have it both ways.

The MINISTER: Why is it, sir, that the province that pays the highest wages has a farmworkers' strike?

Mr M G E WILEY: Exactly!

The MINISTER: Now, how did that happen?

Mr M OZINSKY: The conditions are worse.

The MINISTER: Not Limpopo. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon Ozinsky!

The MINISTER: Throw him out.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will decide on that. Please continue.

The MINISTER: Not Limpopo.

Mr M OZINSKY: Verwoerd made more sense than you.

The MINISTER: I thought there would be an affinity between the hon member and Verwoerd.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, continue with the speech. Don't react to every comment.

The MINISTER: So, one has to ask that question. One also has to ask this question: Of the 220 people arrested only 93 claimed to work on farms. So the question is: Where did the other 130 come from?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: They were bused in by the ANC.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Who here knows about those
130? Who here? All silent. Was it Mr Fransman on his own?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And Khaya. He bused them in [Laughter.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Why don't we just accuse everybody since we are
accusing ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: You see the guilty conscience there, Mr Deputy Speaker. I say "Who here
knows anything about it?" ... [Interjections.] ... and she asks "Are we all guilty?" I don't
know. Are they all guilty? [Interjections.] Did they burn down ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: How do you know who it is? That's the point.

The MINISTER: Somebody spoke, sir, about a Berlin Wall. I think it was hon Skwatsha – a
Berlin Wall between this province and the rest of the country.

Nksz N P MAGWAZA: Ewe.

The MINISTER: Does the hon member know what a sallyport is? A sallyport is something
you come out of.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: We know what a sallyport is, yes. We must have a sallyport. Nobody can know it. Only you know it.

The MINISTER: From here we come to take what we do here to the rest of South Africa. [Interjections.] It's not a wall. It's a place to launch from, to demonstrate to people what can be done – what I believe the hon Leader of the Opposition and the hon Ozinsky would have done if you'd had some time, but you didn't have time.

The fact remains that the hard thing that we have to deal with is do we go back to the past, Mr Deputy Speaker, as a province and as a country? Do we go back to the era of Hip Hop and BrandTalk?

Mr M OZINSKY: There's nothing wrong. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: Do we go back to that or do we go forward to new and more hopeful South Africa?

Mr M SKWATSHA: You said there's nothing wrong, Premier.

Mr M OZINSKY: You appointed them to the Economic Development Agency.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please continue, Minister. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes. Yes.

Mr H P GEYER: You're not on the floor, man.

The PREMIER: I didn't nominate anybody.

Mr M OZINSKY: You did.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No, she didn't

The PREMIER: I didn't.

Mr M OZINSKY: You did.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: In terms of labour ...

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No, she didn't.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... it's actually a fact ...

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: She didn't. Ask a question. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... that employment in Gauteng has gone down. Not by much, but it's gone down, quoting from the same report that you quoted from.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: But the Western Cape has gone down further.

The MINISTER: I and quoting from the same report as you did, but let's quote something much more telling from that same report, Mr Deputy Speaker. In the fourth quarter of 2008, there were 3,9 million South Africans who wanted to work and who didn't have a job. In the fourth quarter of 2012 there are 4,5 million South Africans who want to work, but who don't have work. So, we actually don't have time for the kind of nitpicking that we heard here today. If we are to solve those problems ...

Ms J WITBOOI: Please sit down.

The MINISTER: ... it must be a time of examining our record and not your prejudices and deciding for the future. [Time expired]

Debate concluded.

The House adjourned at 17:25.