

No 3

REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

**DEBATES OF THE
PARLIAMENT OF THE
PROVINCE OF THE
WESTERN CAPE**

(HANSARD)

**FIRST SESSION – SIXTH PARLIAMENT
OF THE PROVINCE OF THE WESTERN CAPE**

29 AUGUST & 12, 19 AND 30 SEPTEMBER 2019

CABINET

The Premier	Mr A R Winde
Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities	Mr D J Maynier
Minister of Health	Ms N Mbombo
Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	Mr A W Bredell
Minister of Human Settlements	Mr T A Simmers
Minister of Agriculture	Dr I H Meyer
Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport	Ms A J Du Toit Marais
Minister of Transport and Public Works	Mr B S Madikizela
Minister of Social Development	Ms S Fernandez
Minister of Community Safety	Mr A T Fritz
Minister of Education	Ms D A Schäfer

OFFICE-BEARERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

Speaker	Mr M Mnqasela
Leader of Government Business	Mr B S Madikizela
Deputy Speaker	Ms B A Schäfer
Leader of the Opposition	Mr C M Dugmore
Chief Whip : DA	Ms M M Wenger
Chief Whip : Opposition	Ms P Z Lekker
Secretary	Mr R Adams

MEMBERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT PARTIES

Democratic Alliance = DA
African National Congress = ANC
African Christian Democratic Party = ACDP
Economic Freedom Fighters = EFF
AL JAMA-AH = AL JAMA-AH
Freedom Front Plus = FF PLUS

Allen, Reagan Ivan	DA
America, Derrick.....	DA
Baartman, Deidre Maudelene.....	DA
Bakubaku-Vos, Ntombezanele Gladys.....	ANC
Bans, Anyanda Precious	ANC
Bosman, Gillion	DA
Botha, Ms Lorraine Juliette.....	DA
Bredell, Anton Wilhelm	DA
Christians, Ferlon Charles	ACDP
De Jager, Isgak	AL JAMA-AH
Dugmore, Cameron Muir.....	ANC
Fernandez, Ms Sharna Gail.....	DA
Fritz, Albert Theo	DA
Herron, Brett Norton.....	GOOD
Kama, Mesuli	ANC
Lekker, Ms Patronella Zingisa	ANC
Lili, Andile	ANC
Mackenzie, Ricardo Denver	DA
Madikizela, Bonginkosi Success	DA
Makamba-Botya, Nosipho.....	EFF
Marais, Petrus Jacobus	FF PLUS
Marran, Patrick	ANC
Marais, Ms Anroux Johanna Du Toit	DA
Maseko, Ms Letta Matlhodi.....	DA
Maynier, David John	DA
Mbombo, Ms NomaFrench	DA
Meyer, Ivan Henry	DA
Mitchell, Daylin Gary.....	DA
Mnqasela, Masizole.....	DA
Mvimbi, Lulama Lennox	ANC
Nkondlo, Ms Nobulumko Degracia	ANC
Philander, Wendy Felecia	DA
Sayed, Muhammad Khalid	ANC
Schäfer, Ms Beverley Ann.....	DA
Schäfer, Ms Deborah Anne	DA
Simmers, Tertuis Alfred	DA
Smith, Danville	ANC
Van der Westhuizen, Andricus Pieter	DA
Wenger, Ms Mireille Mary.....	DA
Winde, Alan Richard	DA
Windvogel, Rachel	DA
Xego, Melikhaya	EFF

**PERMANENT DELEGATES TO
NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

Arnolds, Andrew	EFF
Gillion, Ms Maurencia Natalie.....	ANC
Labuschagne, Ms Cathlene.....	ANC
Londt, Johan Jaco	DA
Labuschagne, Ms Cathlene.....	ANC
Njadu, Edward Zoyisile.....	ANC
Sileku, Isaac Mbulelo	DA

INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS

Affordable housing in the city centre – Motion	258
Agricultural economy: transformation of – Motion.....	311
Alpine Primary School: multiple burglaries – Motion.....	193
ANC interim Provincial Committee – Motion.....	323
ANC Youth League: 75th Anniversary – Motion	418
Andile Mbenyane inaugural Pre-season tournament – Motion	321
Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports	10, 13, 56, 132, 149
.....	196, 260, 326, 358, 433, 508, 518
Annual National Crime Statistics – Motion.....	410
Annual Provincial Sports Awards – Motion	499
Apartheid-era school names – Motion	406
Army: deployment of – Motion	174
Attacks on trucks – Motion.....	423
BBBEE status level of suppliers - Department of Health – Motion.....	167
Backyard dwellers – Motion.....	406
Beach exclusion by-law – Motion	357
Biko, Stephen – Motion.....	428
Bitou Municipal Council: court ruling – Motion	247
Border protection – Motion	407
Bullying in schools – Motion	346
Cape Access Centre: Laingsburg – Motion	350
Cape Flats: economic situation – Motion	347
Cape Town City FC – Motion.....	239
CCTV at rail stations – Motion	504
Cederberg: illegal election of Speaker – Motion	238
Cederberg Municipality: unlawful motion of no confidence – Motion	170
City of Cape Town Councillors – Alderman Titles – Motion	188
City of Cape Town: irregularities – Motion	250
City of Cape Town: property rates – Motion	352
City of Cape Town: selling off inner city land – Motion	506
Clanwilliam Dam wall: raising of – Motion.....	310
Communicare Housing Agency – Motion.....	503
Condolence - motions	
April, Wayne Donovan (L M Maseko).....	172
Arendse, Sheval (R D Mackenzie)	245
Boyes, Carrol (R D Mackenzie).....	251
Claasen, Stewart (W F Philander).....	195
Delpont, Neville (D Smith).....	195
Dukani, Jeannie (N D Nkondlo).....	195
Finger, Leyden (M Kama).....	426
Gonono, Peter Makhaya (R Windvogel).....	175
Grendon, Paul (G Bosman).....	413
Hartley, Lincoln (G Bosman)	425
Joseph, Hilton (M Kama).....	426
Koloane, David (C M Dugmore)	192
Maritz, Bradley (D G Mitchell)	175
Mazembe, Kungawa (L J Botha)	189
Mello, Janika (R D Mackenzie).....	412
Mpiko, Thulani (D Smith).....	313

Mugabe, Robert Gabriel (C M Dugmore)	432
Nieuwenhuys, Jan (R I Allen)	426
Nkabinde, Jabu (M M Wenger)	199
Nyangiwe, Simtembile (R I Allen)	426
Opperman, Moira (L M Maseko)	176
Pretorius, Estienne (D G Mitchell)	193
Saunders, David (W F Philander)	500
Swartland, Maxwell (D G Mitchell)	182
Thopps, Anthea (A Bans)	172
Titus, Chad-Lee Titus (D Smith)	195
Titus, Charis (D Smith)	195
Titus, Miguel (D Smith)	195
Van Wyk, Chris (P Marran)	320
Veldman, Sazi (C M Dugmore)	430
Williams, Chester (B N Herron)	364, 415
Wilsnach, Maryam Ali (W F Philander)	187
Winde, William David (M M Wenger)	151, 188
Congratulatory / Wishes – Motions:	
Ameeroedien, Rayana (F C Christians)	416
ANC - Ward 95 By-election victory (D Smith)	322
Booyesen, Lee-Shane (R D Mackenzie)	257
Calitzdorp Cellars: Awards (M G Bosman)	353
City of Cape Town (R I Allen)	173
Department of Human Settlements (L M Maseko)	417
De Wet, Martus (F C Christians)	356
Fernandez, Austin (F C Christians)	320
Hart, Ulvard (M M Wenger)	420
Jacobs, Faez (R D Mackenzie)	253
Jacobs, Kelly-Marie (A P van der Westhuizen)	316
Joon, Susanna (M G Bosman)	349
Mallick, Azraa (F C Christians)	502
Matthee, Keith (F C Christians)	356
Matsaluka, Chuma (A Bans)	176
Modise, Khotso (F C Christians)	356
Ndlovu Youth Choir (R I Allen)	502
Pokwas, Michael (D America)	190
Rice, Kenny (M M Wenger)	420
Rice, Sean (M M Wenger)	420
South African Homeless Street Soccer Team (R I Allen)	191
TSU Private Security Firm (M Kama)	432
Tunzi, Zozibini (A Bans)	244
Van As, Poppie “Aunty” (D M Baartman)	185
Van Staden, Roelof Erasmus (D G Mitchell)	314
Williams, Dr Athol (R D Mackenzie)	352
Clanwilliam Dam wall: raising of – Motion	310
Comprehensive Safety Plan – Motion	498
Crime: scourge of – Motion	494
Crime and safety – Motion	165
Crime statistics – Motion	408
DA: implosion of – Motion	495
DA: retrenchments – Motion	424

Dam levels: high price of water – Motion	412
Dam levels, increase in – Motion	177
Day hospital: incorrect prescription, consequence of – Motion	180
Deputy Speaker:	
Acceptance speech by	8
Election of	7
Rulings of,	324
Diaz Primary School: replacement school – Motion	312
Drakenstein Municipality: state of financial affairs – Motion	242
Economic transformation: policy paper on – Motion	408
Energy security and Eskom's failures – Motion	237
Expanded unemployment rate: lowest – Motion	180
Eskom bailout: impact on unemployment rate – Motion	168
Eskom: Security points – Motion	349
Etzebeth, Eben: alleged racial incident – Motion	354
Farm attacks: Elandsberg, Clanwilliam and Redelingshys – Motion	246
Fire fighters protest – Motion	501
Fires: Tygerberg Hospital and Mitchells Plain Day Hospital – Motion	499
Fransman, Marius – Motion	507
Gender-based violence: multi-party committee meeting – Motion	411
Gender-based violence: Provincial Government employees, vetting of – Motion	419
Gender-based violence: victims – Motion	424
Gentrification and legacy of apartheid spatial planning – Motion	242
George Municipal Manager – Motion	497
George Municipality: investigation – Motion	405
Go George and MyCiti Projects: challenges – Motion	169
Haron, Imam Abdullah – Motion	428
Health: state of – Motion	170
House, Business of – Motions	199, 268, 364 438
Illegal firearms: recovery of – Motions	351
Informal settlement fires: increase in deaths – Motion	255
Institute of Race Relations: appointment of Helen Zille – Motion	194
Jewellery store robberies – Motion	257
Kleine Akker farm evictions – Motion	319
Kwafaku School: experimental building – Motion	348
Labour Force Survey – Quarter 2 results – Motion	249
Land ownership and spatial legacy: skewed patterns of – Motion	166
Learner numbers: increase in – Motion	165
Learners: alcohol and substance abuse – Motion	178
Learners: unplaced – Motion	178
Lion cubs: smuggling of – Motion	357
Maimani, Mmusi: house – Motion	505
Malibu High School: policy on African hair – Motion	409
Masiphumelele fire – Motion	179
Masiphumelele fire: displaced residents – Motion	192
Matric pass rates – Motion	345
Matric results: decline – Motion	494
Members, new:	
Election of Deputy Speaker of Western Cape Provincial Parliament	7
Election of Premier and Speaker of Western Cape Provincial Parliament .	3

Oath or Solemn Affirmation	2
Member's statements, by	153, 230, 295, 338, 397, 484
Metrorail: derailment – Motion.....	506
Mhlanga, Elijah, DBE spokesperson: condemnation of – Motion	256
Mondale High School – Motion	171
Motion of no confidence: DA Deputy Mayor and Speaker, Matzikama – Motion	182
Mrwetyana, Uyinene – Motion.....	353
Municipal Economic Review and Outlook	511
Murder of pregnant mother of two – Motion	246
Murders in the province – Motion	190
Murders: women and children – Motion	181
MyCiti N2 Express Service – Motion	429
National Minimum Wage Act – Motion	259
National Prosecuting Authority – Motion	410
National Thusong Service Excellence Awards – Motion	496
National Women's Day – Motion	167
NCOP:	
Authority of delegation to vote	8
Permanent delegates, Appointment of.....	9
NHI Bill – Motion	249
Ongoing drought – Motion.....	346
Police functions: devolving of – Motion	252
Potchefstroom by-election: Freedom Front victory – Motion	495
Premier:	
Acceptance speech by.....	4
Election of	3
State of the Province Address	39
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	59
State of the Province Address – Reply to Debate.....	132
Prisoners: rehabilitative services – Motion	409
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook	511
Rail transport system – Motion.....	345
Registrar of Members' Interests, Appointment of	11
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities And Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (Consideration)	507
Rocklands Civic Centre: provincial heritage site – Motion.....	319
Rules: Operating Rules for sixth Provincial Parliament	11
Rules Committee: Representation of parties.....	12
Rural Development Strategy – Motion	347
Safety: effects on tourism and the economy – Motion.....	238
Safety issues and murders – Motion	173
SANDF: Deployment of in the Cape Flats – Motion	504
SAPS and emergency services: attacks on – Motion.....	166
SAPS successes: Laingsburg – Motion	355
School examinations – Motion	419
School infrastructure and backlog – Motion	310
Schools and effects of crime – Motion	407
Schools: violence at – Motion	350

Sekhokho, Seth – Councillor – Motion.....	503
Simmers, Hon Minister: electricity bill – Motion	186, 240
Simons, Ray Alexander – Motion	431
Small bus operators: strike – Motion	355
Small business development – Motion	348
Spanking of children at home – Motion.....	498
South Africa: unravelling of – Motion	237
Speaker:	
Acceptance speech by	6
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women’s Month	200
Election of	5
Guidance:	
Rule 65	337
Rulings of	325, 483
Special Economic Zones; impact of –Motion	493
State Capture: Commission – Motion	318
Strand Community Safety Forum – Motion.....	317
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	439
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape.....	369
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province.....	268
Temporary Chairpersons:	
Appointment of	11
Traffic police: innovative use of technology – Motion	178
Truck attacks: impact of – Motion	427
Truck drivers: violent attacks on – Motion.....	404
Tygerberg Hospital: dismissal of three doctors – Motion	312
Tygerberg Hospital: drowning – Motion	501
United Democratic Front – 36th anniversary – Motion.....	315
Ward 5 By-election – Motion.....	322
Waste-to-energy plans – Motion	494
Water and electricity – high cost of – Motion	311
Water systems: poor state of – Motion	168
Westerford School: sanction against prefect – Motion.....	358
Western Cape Department of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries – Female Entrepreneurship Awards – Motion.....	254
Western Cape Youth Parliament – Motion.....	183
Whitehead, Melissa: guilty finding – Motion.....	316
Williams, Chester: memorial at Newlands Stadium	364, 414
Women in Humanity Arts Festival – Motion	183
Women’s Month – Motion	184
World Robot Olympiad South Africa – Motion	252
Yomelela Primary School: shooting of principal – Motion	430
Youth Rehabilitation Boot Camp – Motion	422

INDEX TO SPEECHES

ALLEN, R I

Annual Provincial Sports Awards	499
Condolence - motions	
Niewenhuys, Jan	426
Nyangiwe, Simtembile	426
Annual National Crime Statistics	410
Congratulations / Wishes:	
City of CapeTown	173
Ndlovu Youth Choir.....	502
South African Homeless Street Soccer Team.....	191
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	126
SAPS and emergency services: attacks on	166
Statements	153, 305, 339, 489
Strand Community Safety Forum	317

AMERICA, D

Congratulations / Wishes:	
Pokwas, Michael	190
City of Cape Town Councillors – Alderman Titles	188
Dam levels, increase in	177
National Thusong Service Excellence Awards	496
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Statements	159, 491
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	439

BAARTMAN, D M

Cape Access Centre: Laingsburg	350
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Van As, Poppie “Aunty”	185
Economic transformation: policy paper on	408
Energy security and Eskom’s failures	237
Eskom bailout: impact on unemployment rate.....	168
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities And Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (Consideration)	507
SAPS successes: Laingsburg	355
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women’s Month	227
Special Economic Zones – impact of	493
Statements	161, 399

Subject for discussion:

Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities	449
Waste-to-energy plans.....	494
Western Cape Department of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries – Female Entrepreneurship Awards	254
World Robot Olympiad South Africa	252
Youth Rehabilitation Boot Camp.....	422

BAKUBAKU-VOS, N G

Gender-based violence: Provincial Government employees, vetting of ..	419
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Spanking of children at home	498
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women's Month	204
Subject for discussion:	
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	369

BANS, A P

Attacks on trucks	423
Beach exclusion by-law	357
Cape Town City	239
Condolences, Motions of:	
Thopps, Anthea	172
Williams, Chester	366
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Matsaluka, Chuma	176
Tunzi, Zozibini	244
Eskom: Security points	349
Etzebeth, Eben: alleged racial incident.....	354
Murders: women and children	181
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women's Month	220
Statements	342
Tygerberg Hospital: drowning	501
Women's Month.....	184
Yomelela Primary School: shooting of principal.....	430

BOSMAN, G

Condolence - motions	
Grendon, Paul	413
Hartley, Lincoln	425
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Calitzdorp Cellars: Awards	353
Joon, Susanna	349
Fransman, Marius.....	507
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Statements	230, 397

Subject for discussion:

Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	375
Western Cape Youth Parliament	183
Women in Humanity Arts Festival	183

BOTHA, L J

Condolence - motions	
Mazembe, Kungawa	189
Cederberg Municipality: unlawful motion of no confidence	170
Farm attacks: Elandsberg, Clanwilliam and Redelingshys	246
Learner numbers: increase in	165
Mhlanga, Elijah, DBE spokesperson: condemnation of	256
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	109
School examinations	419
Statements	231, 340, 401

BREDELL, A W

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Statements, response to	153, 492
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities	478

CHRISTIANS, F C

Bullying in schools	346
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Ameeroedien, Rayana	416
De Wet, Martus	356
Fernandez, Austin	320
Mallick, Azraa	502
Matthee, Keith	356
Modise, Khotso	356
Condolence - motions	
Williams, Chester	366
Matric results: decline	494
Mondale High School	171
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	108
Schools and effects of crime	407
Statements	160, 232, 342, 400, 488
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities	448
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	378
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	281

DE JAGER, I

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	115
Subject for discussion:	
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	285

DUGMORE, C M

Condolence - motions	
Koloane, David	192
Mugabe, Robert Gabriel	432
Veldman, Sazi	430
Winde, William David	188
Gender-based violence: multi-party committee meeting	411
Gentrification and legacy of apartheid spatial planning	242
Institute of Race Relations: appointment of Helen Zille	194
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	59
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities	474
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	394

DU TOIT MARAIS, A J

Condolence - motions	
Williams, Chester	364
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Subject for discussion:	
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	385

FERNANDEZ, S G

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	91
Subject for discussion:	
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	380

FRITZ, A T

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	86
Subject for discussion:	
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	390

The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	275
--	-----

GILLION, M N

Subject for discussion:

Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	458
---	-----

HERRON, B N

Condolence - motions

Williams, Chester	364
-------------------------	-----

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
----------------------------------	---

Premier:

State of the Province Address - Debate.....	93
---	----

Speaker:

Debates of:

Commemorating National Women's Month	212
--	-----

Statements	159, 300, 341, 487
------------------	--------------------

Subject for discussion:

Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	447
---	-----

Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	377
--	-----

The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	280
--	-----

KAMA, M

Condolence - motions

Finger, Leyden	426
----------------------	-----

Joseph, Hilton	426
----------------------	-----

Andile Mbenyane inaugural Pre-season tournament	321
---	-----

Crime and safety	165
------------------------	-----

Crime statistics.....	408
-----------------------	-----

Illegal firearms: recovery of	351
-------------------------------------	-----

Jewellery store robberies	257
---------------------------------	-----

Learners: alcohol and substance abuse.....	178
--	-----

Learners: unplaced	178
--------------------------	-----

Lion cubs: smuggling of	357
-------------------------------	-----

Murder of pregnant mother of two	246
--	-----

Police functions: devolving of	252
--------------------------------------	-----

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
----------------------------------	---

Safety: effects on tourism and the economy	238
--	-----

Safety issues and murders.....	173
--------------------------------	-----

Sekhokho, Seth - Councillor.....	503
----------------------------------	-----

Subject for discussion:

Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	383
--	-----

TSU Private Security Firm	432
LABUSCHAGNE, C	
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities	446
LEKKER, P Z	
Affordable housing in the city centre	258
Informal settlement fires: increase in deaths	255
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	123
Simmers, MEC: allegations of electricity theft.....	240
LILI, A	
Biko, Stephen	428
Simmers, Hon Minister: electricity bill	186
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Statements	154
MACKENZIE, R D	
Alpine Primary School: multiple burglaries	193
Army: deployment of	174
Border protection	407
Comprehensive Safety Plan	498
Condolences, Motions of:	
Arendse, Sheval	245
Boyes, Carrol	251
Mello, Janika	412
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Booyesen, Lee-Shane	257
Jacobs, Faez	253
Williams, Dr Athol	352
Expanded unemployment rate: lowest.....	180
National Prosecuting Authority	410
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	70
Prisoners: rehabilitative services	409
Rail transport system	345
Rocklands Civic Centre: provincial heritage site	319
Rural Development Strategy.....	347
Small business development	348
Statements	233, 343
MADIKIZELA, B S	
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	66
Statements, response to	403
Subject for discussion:	

Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	467
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	372

MAKAMBA-BOTYA, N

Crime: scourge of	494
Fires: Tygerberg Hospital and Mitchells Plain Day Hospital	499
Malibu High School: policy on African hair	421
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women's Month	225
Statements	398, 486
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	444
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	374

MARAIS, P J

Condolence - motions	
Williams, Chester	367, 414
Oath or solemn affirmation.....	2
Potchefstroom by-election: Freedom Front victory	495
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	102
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women's Month	214
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	451
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape	379
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	282

MARRAN, P

Agricultural economy: transformation of	311
Communicare Housing Agency	503
Condolences, Motions of:	
Van Wyk, Chris	172
Kleine Akker farm evictions	319
Land ownership and spatial legacy: skewed patterns of	166
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Statements	231, 489

MASEKO, L M

Backyard dwellers.....	406
Condolences, Motions of:	
April, Wayne Donovan.....	172
Opperman, Moira	176
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Department of Human Settlements	417
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women's Month	217
Statements	297, 484

MAYNIER, D J

Municipal Economic Review and Outlook.....	511
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	77
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook	511
Subject for discussion:	
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	289

MBOMBO, N

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Subject for discussion:	
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	283

MEYER, I H

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	111

MITCHELL, D G

Condolences, Motions of:	
Maritz, Bradley	175
Pretorius, Estienne	193
Swartland, Maxwell	182
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Van Staden, Roelof Erasmus	314
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Public Rail Transportation, state of	239
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	105
Statements	295
Truck drivers: violent attacks on	404

MNQASELA, M [SPEAKER with effect from 22/05/2019]

Acceptance speech.....	6
Debates of.....	214
Commemorating National Women's Month	200
Election of Speaker	5
Election of	5
Guidance:	
Rule 65.....	337
Rulings of	325, 483

MVIMBI, L L

CCTV at rail stations – Motion.....	504
Go George and MyCiti Projects: challenges.....	169
SANDEF: Deployment of in the Cape Flats	504
Metrorail: derailment	506
MyCiti N2 Express Service	429
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
State Capture: Commission	318
Statements	232
Subject for discussion:	
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	270
Ward 5 By-election	322

NKONDLO, N D

Condolences, Motions of:	
Dukani, Jeannie	195
BBBEE status level of suppliers - Department of Health	167
Cape Flats: economic situation	347
Labour Force Survey – Quarter 2 results	249
Maimani, Mmusi - house	505
National Minimum Wage Act	259
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	81
Simons, Ray Alexander.....	431
Statements	339, 397
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	442
Truck attacks: impact of	427

PHILANDER, W F

Condolences, Motions of:	
Claasen, Stewart	195
Titus, Chad-Lee Titus	195
Titus, Charis.....	195
Titus, Miguel	195

Wilsnach, Maryam Ali	187
Williams, Chester	415
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
National Women's Day	167
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women's Month	200
Statements	234, 402
Tygerberg Hospital: dismissal of three doctors	312

SAYED, M K

ANC Youth League: 75th Anniversary	418
Apartheid-era school names	406
Diaz Primary School: replacement school	312
Haron, Imam Abdullah	428
Kwafaku School: experimental building	348
Malibu High School: policy on African hair	409
Matric pass rates	345
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	116
School infrastructure and backlog	310
Schools: violence at	350
Small bus operators: strike	355
Statements	304
Westerford School: sanction against prefect	358

SCHÄFER, B A [DEPUTY SPEAKER WITH EFFECT FROM 22/05/2019]

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Acceptance speech	8
Election of Deputy Speaker	7
Rulings of	324
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women's Month	210

SCHÄFER, D A

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	119
Statements, response to	306

SILEKU, I M

Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities	464

SIMMERS, T A

Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	97

SMITH, D

Cederberg: illegal election of Speaker	238
City of Cape Town: irregularities	250
City of Cape Town: selling off inner city land.....	506
Condolences, Motions of:	
Delpont, Neville	195
Mpiko, Thulani	313
Congratulations / Wishes – Motions:	
ANC - Ward 95 By-election victory	322
DA: implosion of	495
DA: retrenchments	424
Dam levels: high price of water	412
Drakenstein Municipality: state of financial affairs.....	242
Fire fighters protest	501
George Municipal Manager	497
George Municipality: investigation.....	405
Masiphumelele fire: displaced residents	192
Motion of no confidence: DA Deputy Mayor and Speaker, Matzikama ..	182
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Statements	160, 296, 484
Subject for discussion:	
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	286
Water and electricity – high cost of	311
Water systems: poor state of.....	168
Whitehead, Melissa: guilty finding	316

VAN DER WESTHUIZEN, A P

Congratulations / Wishes:	
Jacobs, Kelly-Marie	316
Bitou Municipal Council: court ruling	247
Clanwilliam Dam wall: raising of	310
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Ongoing drought	346
Statements	162, 344
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	453
Traffic police: innovative use of technology	178

WENGER, M M

ANC interim Provincial Committee – Motion	323
House, Business of – Motions.....	199, 268, 364, 438
Condolences, Motions of:	
Nkabinde, Jabu	199
Winde, William David	121
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Hart, Ulvard.....	420
Rice, Kenny	420
Rice, Sean	420

Masiphumelele fire.....	179
Murders in the province	190
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate	128
South Africa: unravelling of	237
Statements	305, 486
Subject for discussion:	
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	268

WINDE, A R [PREMIER with effect from 22/05/2019]

Acceptance speech	4
Election of Premier	4
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women's Month	207
State of the Province Address	39
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	59
State of the Province Address - Reply to Debate	132
Statements, response to	235

WINDVOGEL, R

City of Cape Town: property rates	352
Condolences, Motions of:	
Maritz, Bradley	175
Day hospital: incorrect prescription, consequence of.....	180
Gender-based violence: victims.....	424
Health: state of	170
NHI Bill.....	249
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women's Month	222
United Democratic Front – 36th anniversary	315

XEGO, M

Condolence - motions	
Williams, Chester	367
Mrwetyana, Uyinene	353
Oath or solemn affirmation	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address – Debate	115
Statements	339

REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

DEBATES

OF THE

PARLIAMENT OF THE

PROVINCE OF THE

WESTERN CAPE

(HANSARD)

FIRST SESSION – SIXTH PARLIAMENT OF THE PROVINCE OF THE WESTERN CAPE

The sign* indicates a translation. The sign †, used subsequently in the same speech, indicates the original language

THURSDAY, 29 AUGUST 2019

337

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 358

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. I recognise the hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I rise to inform the House that questions to Minister Madikizela will stand over with the agreement of the relevant questioner. Thank you.

Agreed to.

GUIDANCE ON RULE 65

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. I just want to before the business proceeds just make a point about Rule 65. If you recall, hon members, in the debate on 22 August 2019 members requested the Presiding Officer, both myself and the hon Deputy Speaker for an opportunity to explain themselves in terms of Rule 65, where they felt they have been misquoted or misunderstood by other hon members.

As Presiding Officers we dealt with the requests on their merits and I am of the view that fairness prevailed in all those cases. Fairness prevailed in all those cases.

The following important information, however, relating to the application of this Rule, I would like to bring it to the attention of the members here that an explanation during a debate is only allowed with the prior consent of the Presiding Officer. Explanations will only be allowed when a material part of a member's speech has been misquoted or misunderstood. Members are allowed an explanation and may not introduce a new matter and no debate is allowed upon the explanation itself. The Presiding Officer/s may request that a member provides the text of the explanation prior to making a decision on the granting of such a request. So the explanation may not contain offensive language, court controversy, debate the matter or contain charges or attacks on another member.

The Rule cannot be used by members to request that the member speaking explains himself. I think this is important, hon members that the Rule cannot be used by members to request that the member explains himself or herself, on any matter he or she is raising at the present time.

It is very clear that this Rule is not intended to settle political disputes and does not provide an opportunity to get a second bite at the cherry in conveying the message.

Hon members operate in a political environment where contestation takes place all the time and where arguments are won and lost on the ability to persuade others of your point of view. The general rules of debate provide for sufficient protection of members when debating issues and will be enforced by the Presiding Officers on a very fair basis - on a very fair basis. These Rules should be utilised only when warranted in strict compliance with the above prescripts.

Furthermore, Presiding Officers are expected to make a judgement call on whether a material part of a speech has indeed been misunderstood or misquoted and it cannot be expected of the Presiding Officers to do so without properly applying their minds in this regard.

Hon members, we are of the view that the Rule can be improved or otherwise, then there is an opportunity to engage the Presiding Officer, the Speaker and the Rules Committee, because fortunately currently we are revising the Rules of Order and that will then be the best opportunity with the Rules Review Committee and the subcommittee that the Rules Committee has appointed. So I trust that this guidance, hon members, does shed some light insofar as this specific Rule and its application is concerned. I therefore thank you, hon members.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr R I ALLEN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, yesterday, 28 August 2019, the South African Police Service via its official Twitter Account announced a joint oversight visit by the Portfolio Committees on Police and Defence and Military Veterans, to some of the communities in the Western Cape where SANDF troops have been deployed.

They made the announcement using the hashtag #OperationLockDown.

The Standing Committee on Community Safety received that invitation on 27 August 2019, at eleven minutes past four, which is the day before the actual oversight meeting. This letter was dated 23 August. However, it was only signed off on 27 August by the Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee on Police, the hon Tina Joemat-Pettersen.

History confirms that the hon Joemat-Pettersen is no stranger to controversy and the blatant disregard displayed in the “after-thought-invitation”, confirms that instead of #OperationLockDown, the ANC is hell-bent on #OperationLockOut when it comes to supporting the DA in the Western Cape.

The DA-led Western Cape Government has proven itself as an enabling partner in making this province a safer space for everyone. It has upheld its constitutional obligations in a united form, because it understands that safety is everyone’s responsibility. We thus call on the Opposition to join hands and disband this #OperationLockOut. Safety is everyone’s business and we have no time to politic. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, there are too little women owning and taking part in our economy and the DA does not care about correcting this gender inequality.

The PREMIER: That is not true.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The DA does not even care that it does not have a representative ratio of women in leadership and other areas. In fact, the DA is totally silent on women empowerment. Instead, leaders like former Premier Helen Zille made fun of women in legislatures and thought they were just seat warmers.

But in this month, National Women’s Month, we need a clear stance on this particular matter from the DA as a governing party in the province. In the Western Cape we have too little women in management and in business in general. Especially in the wine industry, there are very few women participating in the industry. We need real owners beyond just the brand owners, but we know this Government is not women-friendly and it does not have a women-friendly budget and clearly it does not regard women as equals that should be empowered to take up their positions next to other people in society. Thank you.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I rise on behalf of the EFF to acknowledge the role that is being played by the Khayelitsha Development Forum in proposing its crime intervention initiative. The initiative called “Uyabonwa”, envisages the instalment of CCTV cameras in crime hotspot areas around Khayelitsha.

We therefore note this initiative serves as a stellar example of the role played by communities in combating crime. The EFF notes that the National and Provincial Government should be playing a significant role in assisting that this initiative goes forward, despite the challenges that are experienced.

Our people have been dying like flies in the townships for years, while the most practical and progressive inputs on how to combat crime that have been made by various stakeholders have fallen on deaf ears. We therefore call on Government at a provincial level to support this initiative wholeheartedly.

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members of this House, as the sun sets and the curtain is drawn on celebrating Women's Day and Women's Month 2019, Mr Abuse will still be lingering in the dark. We have seen during this month the highlights of women successes, the resilience portrayed by many women. Women being carried by other women and even women being praised by men.

However, hon Deputy Speaker, the abuse perpetrators are still men. Cases of men being abused by women are still few. The abuser comes in different forms. They come dressed in suits, dressed in overalls, dressed in shorts and T-shirts, in name brands like Giorgio Armani, Gucci and La Coste. Some come even dressed in their †“Help-my-sterk-lyk-hempies”. [“Help me look strong shirts.”]

Abusers are often well educated and hold professional jobs. A recent survey by the South African Council of Educators around teachers' misconduct for sexual abuse against learners per province is as follows:

- Eastern Cape, 19%;
- Northern Cape, 20%;
- KwaZulu Natal, 16%;
- Gauteng, 17%;
- Free State, 27%;
- Limpopo, 24%;
- Mpumalanga, 30% and
- Western Cape, 5%.

And in the Western Cape, it is 5% too high. Abusers have also mastered becoming the abuser. For some of them it is a topic around the braai, as to who holds the trophy for doing it best. It is absolutely appalling.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we have to condemn abuse 365 days a year. We also have to start naming and shaming for who they are, for to abuse is a criminal offence. Hon Deputy Speaker, the worst form of abuse is the emotional kind, no physical scars are left to be seen, but the perpetrators know how to break down inch by inch, piece by piece, until the victim has no sense of self-worth and are then manipulated like a piece of putty.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Deputy Speaker, abusers are mainly men and Deputy Speaker in an Afrikaans saying, †“n Man is ‘n bok en ‘n bok is ‘n bliksem”. [A man is a *bok* and a *bok* is a bastard.] I thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh really!

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. At the last sitting of this Parliament, the Minister of Education, hon Schäfer, expressed confusion about the difference between double and triple.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No, you were confused.

Mr B N HERRON: ...and she asked me to explain the difference. So, here is a simple lesson in maths:

- A property of 17 hectares of land was offered to the City of Cape Town for R88 million.
- City professionals said this was over-valued and the City owned larger parcels of vacant land, already reserved for housing nearby.
- The City elected not to buy this property at R88 million.
- The “agent” for the owner, came back with a lower offer of R58 million.
- This was still according to the City experts, more than double the value of recent sales in the area.
- The City said “no”.
- The Provincial Government bought the land anyway.
- MEC Madikizela was correct when he said the City had investigated the land.
- It is true. The land acquisition officials determined that R58 million was more than double the real value.
- The Province ignored that advice and last week MEC Simmers confirmed that the Province had paid R64,6 million for some of the land, not all of it.
- In fact, some critical servitude portions of the land are still to be acquired.
- So, if R58 million is more than double the market value, then I trust that MEC Schäfer can understand that R88 million must be triple the market value.
- And, I am happy to share this evidence with her if she needs it.

An HON MEMBER: Thanks.

Mr B N HERRON: More concerning, hon Deputy Speaker, is that 5 hectares of the 17 hectares they bought is not developable, because it is in a floodplain. So, this means that the Province has paid R5,4 million per developable hectare instead of R2,3 million per developable hectare, which is the price of the City’s nearby recent acquisition at Annandale.

So, for the Minister’s clarification, this is more than double the market price. In fact it is 2,4 times the price, but the House should take note that no-one will answer why they did not use the free land that was offered to them at Potsdam.

At zero cost for Potsdam, the price of Doornbach is, mathematically speaking, infinitely more expensive. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish off.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Today is a sad day as our Christian brother is unfairly persecuted for standing up for what is right. The ACDP believes that abortion is murder and stands firmly behind our Christian brother, Dr Jacques de Vos. Brother, you are not alone. We are with you. Dr De Vos has a desire to advance the right of the unborn child. He never tried to persuade anybody, but motivated that scientifically proven, the unborn child is a human being.

Hon Deputy Speaker, Dr De Vos, a former intern at 2 Military Hospital has been charged by the Health Professions Council of South Africa for unprofessional conduct and was prohibited from practising medicine due to his views on abortion. As a result, he has appeared on 27 August 2019 before a disciplinary panel in Cape Town. The Health Professions Council has taken two years to give him a hearing.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as the ACDP we support Dr De Vos and we are asking other Christians to rally behind him. The ACDP party members supported him at his hearing and we will again be there when he appears in October. Let us unite with Dr De Vos and support him at his hearing in October, showing the Health Professions Council that they are up against millions of Christians with the same view.

We ask the Health Professions Council to stop persecuting Dr De Vos for his pro-life views and demand that his medical licence be reinstated with immediate effect. The ACDP wants to appeal to Christians to sign a petition online to stand with our dear brother Dr De Vos. Remember Christians, together we will overcome evil, because evil can only prevail when good people keep quiet. Thank you.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, statement on the Children's Commissioner and rights. The Western Cape has been fed DA lies, smoke and mirrors. Some of these lies come from the tenure of Premier Helen Zille, who walked in and promised a constitutional Children's Commissioner would be installed. She then ran away from her own brainwave, and even tried to make optional this constitutional duty. She tried to tell us research is needed on the topic. Repeatedly we found out that research had been done. She lied to us. The rights of children get trampled upon regularly in the Western Cape as this DA Government does not care for their future.

Just yesterday thousands of children were stranded next to roads due to a dispute between the Education Department and bus operators.

In various locations we find children living next to roads in pouring winter rain, some not even attending school. Ironically these children are the victims of evictions and thrown off farms with a house. Some are expected to also change schools where they will not be taught in the same language.

A Children's Commissioner could have assisted. Now we urgently need National Government or some competent institution to investigate these abuses of poor and vulnerable children. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In March 2019 a bombshell report titled "The High Level Review Panel Report on the State Security" was released by the Presidency on how the SSA has been repurposed by the ANC-led Government to serve the political interests of the ANC and its then-President Jacob Zuma, his Cabinet friends and cadres – some of whom remain in Parliament and in the National Cabinet, today.

The report showed the blatant disregard for legislation, unlawful spying and criminality. Naturally, one has to question its sister organisation, the SAPS Crime Intelligence. South Africa faces one of the highest crime rates in the world, with gang violence being most prevalent as well as organised crime.

SSA and SAPS Crime Intelligence need to work together to improve public safety. However, the Crime Intelligence Unit has also been a victim of the SSA intelligence as they lack effective strategies to do their work. We therefore call on President Ramaphosa to urgently appoint a review for the dysfunctional SAPS Crime Intelligence Unit. If Crime Intelligence is not beefed up urgently, the impact of the army will not be felt by communities. We do not only need the army; we need to fight crime intelligently.

A case in point is the truck burning and truck hijackings of recent. This has been happening for months in KwaZulu Natal. We know this has started to happen in Cape Town. How our Crime Intelligence did not pick this up is beyond me, when the video footage of this has ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... been circling on social media for months. Many undisputed facts and arguments confirm there are issues within Crime Intelligence. Yet, we receive no response, no clear strategy from our National Minister of Intelligence and our police, with integration on the Western Cape policing needs and priorities. We have a poor and under-resourced Crime Intelligence Unit.

Our people are dying on a daily basis, because of the lack of Crime Intelligence strategies in this country. When will enough be enough? We need intelligence now. We need intervention now. We need the President to act now, to sort out our dysfunctional Crime Intelligence in this country.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Agbare Adjunkspeaker, ons het die afgelope maand Vrouemaand gevier. Dit is 'n wonderlike inisiatief in reaksie op die historiese miskenning van vroue se regte. Maar ons kan nie ontken dat 97,4% van ons gevangenes mans is nie. En die 2,6% van vroue wat tronk toe gestuur word, se oortredings is dikwels deur mans, en spesifiek mans naby aan hulle, ontlok.

Suid-Afrika se tronkbevolking uitgedruk as 'n persentasie van die totale bevolking is dubbeld dié van ons buurlande. Hoekom is so baie mans en veral jong mans, vandag in die tronk?

Ons aandag is ook in die afgelope week met die ontplooiing van die Weermag in sekere gemeenskappe, opnuut gevestig op die probleem van bendes en interpersoonlike geweld. Waarom reageer sommige mense en kennelik veral mans, met geweld op konfrontasies? En hoe kan hierdie tendens verbreek word?

Gedrag is iets wat aangeleer word. En ons ken die gesegde: "Woorde wek, maar voorbeelde trek." Volgens Statistiek Suid-Afrika word net 36% van kinders, tot op ouderdom van 4 jaar, groot met beide hulle biologiese ouers. Die meerderheid kinders kom dus uit enkelouer-gesinne. En ekonomiese realiteite maak dat baie ouers minder tyd met hul kinders deurbring as wat in die verlede die geval was.

Ons het volwassenes nodig wat deur goeie voorbeelde as rolmodelle vir kinders kan optree. Gelukkig vind ons hierdie rolmodelle in ons skole, by ons kerke en by talle jeugbewegings. Ons vind hulle in ons woonbuurte waar hulle deur hul voorbeeld bure se kinders help vorm.

Ek wil daarom vandag hulde bring aan daardie vrywilligers in alle gemeenskappe, veral mans, wat as goeie, voorbeeldige rolmodelle vir ons seuns dien. Ek dank U.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, over the past month we have celebrated Womens Month. It is a wonderful initiative in reaction to the historical denial of womens' rights. But we cannot deny that 97,4% of our prisoners are men. And the 2,6% of women who are sent to prison, their transgressions have often been caused by men, and specifically men close to them.

South Africa's jail population expressed as a percentage of the total population is double that of our neighbouring countries. Why are so many men, and especially young men, in jail today? Over the past week, with the deployment of the army in certain communities, our attention has again been focused on the problem of gangs and inter-personal violence. Why do some people and especially men react with violence to confrontations? And how can this trend be broken?]

Behaviour is something that is learnt. And we know the saying: †*Woorde wek, maar voorbeelde trek*. [Example is better than precept]. According to Statistics South Africa only 36% of children up to the age of 4 years grow up with both their biological parents.

The majority of children therefore come from single parent families. And economical realities result in many parents spending less time with their children than in the past.

We need adults who can act as good role models to children through being good examples. Fortunately we find these role models in our schools, in our churches and in several youth movements. We find them in our suburbs where through their example they help to mould the neighbours children.

I therefore want to honour those volunteers in all communities, especially men, who act as good, exemplary role models for our sons. I thank you.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

RAIL TRANSPORT SYSTEM

(Notice of Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates our ailing rail transport system and the impact on our road infrastructure.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates our ailing rail transport system and the impact that this has on the road infrastructure.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

MATRIC PASS RATES

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates factors contributing to the poor and declining matric pass rates in the Western Cape Province. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the factors that contribute to poorer education and to the declining matric pass rates in the Western Cape province.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

ONGOING DROUGHT

(Notice of Motion)

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the effect of the ongoing drought in certain regions of the Western Cape; and the province's readiness for the next drought in those areas that have benefitted from this year's winter rains. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the effects of the ongoing drought in certain regions of the Western Cape and the province's readiness for the next drought, especially in those areas that have not benefited from this year's winter rains.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

BULLYING IN SCHOOLS

(Notice of Motion)

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates how this Government is going to deal with the ongoing scourge of bullying in our Western Cape schools.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates how this government is dealing with the ongoing scourge of bullying in our Western Cape schools.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

RURAL DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

(Notice of Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the rural development strategy with the focus on hospitals, human settlements, policing and social development.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Rural Development Strategy and its focus on hospitals, human-settlement development, policing and social development.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

CAPE FLATS: ECONOMIC SITUATION

(Notice of Motion)

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the economic situation in the Cape Flats.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the economic situation on the Cape Flats.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

KWAFAKU SCHOOL: EXPERIMENTAL BUILDING

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes the promises made by the Public Works Department and the Education Department to the parents and learners of the KwaFaku School in Lower Crossroads are broken as this experimental building with the styrofoam cladding will not be replaced in time at the end of the year. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House urges the Education Department and its Minister to take all possible steps to prevent violence at schools, as it is reported that there have been 40 knife stabbings at schools so far this year.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT

(Notice of Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates small business development, youth development, the funding and the impact of non-payment on small businesses.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates small-business development, youth development, funding and the impact of non-payment on small businesses.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**ESKOM: SECURITY POINTS**

(Motion)

Ms A P BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House urges all municipalities and also Eskom to secure all security points after a 9-year old boy from George died of electrocution. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House urges all municipalities and Eskom to ensure the safety of all electricity points after a nine-year-old boy from George died of electrocution.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**SUSANNA JOON: TEACHER
LONG SERVICE**

(Motion)

Mr M G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Ms Susanna Joon has been a teacher at Excelsior Primary School in Calitzdorp for the last 36 years; further notes that Ms June will be retiring this month and congratulates Ms Joon for her long years of dedicated service to the learners of the Kannaland Municipality. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Ms Susanna Joon has been a teacher at the Excelsior Primary School in Calitzdorp for the last 36 years; further notes that Ms Joon will be retiring this month; and congratulates Ms Joon for her long years of dedicated service to the learners of the Kannaland Municipality.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

SCHOOLS: VIOLENCE AT

(Motion)

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House urges the Education Department and its MEC to take all possible steps to prevent violence at schools as it is reported that there were 40 knife stabbings at schools so far this year. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the promises made by the Public Works and Education departments to the parents and learners of the KwaFaku Primary School in Lower Crossroads have been broken as this experimental building with styrofoam cladding will not be replaced before the end of the year.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

CAPE ACCESS CENTRE: LAINGSBURG

(Motion)

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that approximately 800 to 1 000 community members visit the Cape Access Centre in Laingsburg per month – 10% of the community; further notes that this Centre trains community members to pass the International Computer Drivers Licence; have introduced an e-learner program to assist community members to breach the technological gap so that they can write the ICDL; commends Mr Edward Gelandt, the Centre manager for going out to farming communities on Saturdays when the Centre is closed – during his own, personal time – to train them in the various computer skills; commends the Centre further for assisting youths in drawing up CV's, completing tertiary education applications and assisting entrepreneurs with business proposals and congratulates the Cape Access Team in Laingsburg with the excellent work they are doing in the community. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that approximately 800 to 1 000 community members (approximately 10% of the community) visit the Cape Access Centre in Laingsburg per month; further notes that this centre trains community members to pass the International Computer Driving Licence (ICDL) and has introduced an e-learner programme to assist community members in bridging the technological gap in order to write and pass the ICDL; commends the centre for assisting young people with drawing up CVs and completing tertiary education applications, and for assisting entrepreneurs with business proposals; further commends Mr Edward Gelandt, the centre manager, for going out to farming communities on Saturdays when the centre is closed, during his own personal time, to train them in the various computer skills; and congratulates the Cape Access team in Laingsburg for the excellent work they are doing in the community.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

ILLEGAL FIREARMS: RECOVERY OF

(Motion)

Mr M KAMA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the South African Police Service recovered 1 037 illegal firearms in the province between November 2018 and July 2019; applauds SAPS for the great work and calls on the National Commissioner to ensure that all these guns are destroyed and not sold back to the gangs. I so move. [Applause.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr M KAMA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the SAPS recovered 1 037 illegal firearms in the province between November 2018 and July 2019; applauds the SAPS for the great work; and calls on the national Commissioner to ensure that all these guns are destroyed and not sold back to gangs.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

DR ATHOL WILLIAMS

(Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mitchells Plain-born author, Dr Athol Williams, for hosting the first ever Cape Flats Book Festival in Lentegeur, Mitchells Plain this weekend; further calls on all the people of the Cape Flats to attend this all important book show and show their support. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mitchells Plain-born author Dr Athol Williams for hosting the first ever Cape Flats Book Festival in Lentegeur, Mitchells Plain; and calls on all the people of the Cape Flats to attend this all-important book show and to show support.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**CITY OF CAPE TOWN
PROPERTY RATES**

(Motion)

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the high number of objections against Cape Town's property rates and general dissatisfaction with the City unilaterally increasing payments to tax working-class people out of their homes. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the high number of objections raised against Cape Town's property rates and the general dissatisfaction with the City's unilateral increases which are taxing working-class people out of their homes.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

**UYINENE MRWETYANA
MISSING STUDENT**

(Motion)

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that a 19-year old student, Uyinene Mrwetyana, has been missing since 24 August 2019; further notes that it comes against a backdrop of women going missing in the province for the past few years; further notes that women have disappeared, highlights how unsafe women and children are in the province, therefore calls on the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and the MEC for Safety and Security and all political structures and the wider community to intensify the call for Uyinene to be brought home safely. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M XEGO: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the case of Uyinene Mrwetyana, a 19-year-old UCT student, who has been missing since Saturday 24 August 2019, further notes that this disappearance happened against the backdrop of many women going missing in the province in the past few years; also notes that Uyinene's disappearance highlights how unsafe women and children are in this province, so such so that they can even go missing in broad daylight; and calls for the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, the Minister of Community Safety, all political structures and the wider community to intensify the search and to ensure that she is brought home safely.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CALITZDORP CELLARS: AWARDS

(Motion)

Mr M G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Mr Danie van der Westhuizen and his cellar team of Calitzdorp Cellars in Kannaland Municipality have won several awards at the South African National Wine Show of 2019; further notes that these awards will go a very long way in creating more employment opportunities for the people of Kannaland, who are suffering under the impact of the drought and congratulates Mr van der Westhuizen and his cellar team on this prestigious award where they won the Champion Port Trophy for their Vintage Port 2019 as well as the Gold Medal for their Red Muscadel 2019 and wishes them well in their journeys and future endeavours. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Mr Danie van der Westhuizen and his cellar team at Calitzdorp Cellars in the Kannaland Municipality have won several awards at the South African National Wine Show 2019; further notes that these awards will go a long way in creating more employment opportunities for the people of Kannaland who are suffering as a result of the drought; congratulates Mr van der Westhuizen and his cellar team on receiving the Champion Port Trophy (Vintage Port 2019) and a gold medal for their Red Muscadel 2019; and wishes them well in their future endeavours.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**EBEN ETZEBETH
ALLEGED RACIAL INCIDENT**

(Motion)

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House urges the investigation authorities to thoroughly probe last week's weekend brawls in Langebaan at the Sport's Bar and Jag Club where senior Springbok rugby forward, Eben Etzebeth, some pals and local residents got involved in a gun-pointing-knife-stabbing of two people, brick throwing with damage to his car, physical assault and reportedly racist utterances hurled around and also urgently makes public their findings to clear up any confusion that may exist. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House urges the investigation authorities to thoroughly probe last weekend's brawls at a sport bar and yacht club in Langebaan where senior Springbok rugby forward Eben Etzebeth, some friends and local residents got involved in gun pointing, the stabbing of two people, the throwing of brick (with damage to his car), physical assault and, reportedly, racist utterances; and also makes public their findings urgently to clear up any confusion that may exist.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**SAPS SUCCESSES
LAINGSBURG**

(Motion)

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that it was reported that two suspects, aged 33 and 35, believe to be wanted in criminal cases in Gauteng, Limpopo North, have been arrested during a routine patrol by SAPS in Laingsburg Municipality; further notes that the police seized four illegal firearms and ammunition after searching the suspects' vehicles; also notes that the three firearms with filed-off serial numbers, one firearm of a deceased lawful owner, 21 9mm rounds of ammunition, 3 revolver rounds ammunition were seized as well; congratulates the SAPS Laingsburg Station for these arrests and confiscation of firearms and commends them for their hard work and dedication towards the community.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that it was reported that two suspects – aged 33 and 35 and believed to be wanted in connection with criminal cases in Gauteng, Limpopo and North West – have been arrested during a routine patrol by the South African Police Service (SAPS) in the Laingsburg Municipality; further notes that the police seized four illegal firearms and ammunition after searching the suspects' vehicle; also notes that three firearms with filed-off serial numbers, one firearm of a deceased lawful owner, 21 9 mm rounds of ammunition and three revolver rounds of ammunition were seized; congratulates the Laingsburg Police Station for these arrests and the confiscation of firearms; and commends the SAPS for their hard work and dedication to the Laingsburg community.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

SMALL BUS OPERATORS: STRIKE

(Motion)

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses concern over the strike by small operator buses that provide essential learner transport to learners that stay too far from the schools to walk there and that this House urges the Department and the MEC to timeously settle differences to avoid such strikes in future, as it leaves poor parents in a panic as they cannot afford alternative transport and that we commend all parties for bringing this past week's strike to a quick end. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses concern over the strike by small operator busses that provide essential learner transport to children who stay too far from schools to walk there; urges the Department and the Minister to settle their differences in time to avoid such strikes in future as it leaves poor parents in a panic as they cannot afford alternative transport; and commends all parties for bringing the past week's strike to a quick end.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

**MARTUS DE WET, KEITH MATTHEE
AND KHOTSO MODISE**

(Motion)

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House applauds Advocate Keith Matthee, senior counsel, together with Attorneys Martus de Wet and Khotso Modise of De Wet Wepener Inc. Attorneys, who offered to assist Dr De Vos *pro bono* to defend him at the disciplinary hearing against the Health Professional Council of South Africa for the fight to advance the right of an unborn child. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House applauds Advocate Keith Matthee SC, together with attorneys Martus de Wet and Khotso Modise of De Wet Wepener Attorneys, who offered to assist Dr De Vos *pro bono* in his defence at a disciplinary hearing brought against him by the Health Professions Council of South Africa for his fight to advance the rights of an unborn child.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LION CUBS: SMUGGLING OF

(Motion)

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the actions taken by authorities against people who smuggled one or possibly two lion cubs from Limpopo to Athlone; further welcomes the arrest of one suspect and the rescue of these wild animals from urban enclosures. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M KAMA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the actions taken by the authorities against people who smuggled one or possibly two lion cubs from Limpopo at Athlone; and further welcomes the arrest of one suspect and the rescue of these wild animals from their urban enclosures.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

BEACH EXCLUSION BY-LAW

(Motion)

Ms A P BANS: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes concerns of another by-law Cape Town intends putting in place with unenforceable stipulations that will gatekeep to only allow certain people on beaches, excluding poor or homeless residents and banning crude language; further notes that even human rights activists questioned this by-law and that ordinary people think the City and its leaders are lunatics, like with the drive to criminalise and fine poor people living on the streets. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and expresses concern over another rubbish by-law that the City of Cape Town intends putting in place, with unenforceable stipulations, that will not only allow certain people on beaches (excluding poor or homeless residents) and will ban the use of crude language; further notes that even human rights activists questioned this by-law and that ordinary people think that the City and its leaders are lunatics, keeping in mind the recent drive to criminalise and fine poor people who are living on the streets.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

**WESTERFORD SCHOOL
SANCTION AGAINST PREFECT**

(Motion)

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the light sanction at the Westerford School in Rondebosch, where a prefect's badge was taken for only two weeks after a racist utterance. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the light sanction issued by the Westerford School in Rondebosch where a prefect's badge was taken away for only two weeks after a racist utterance.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes Motions Without Notice. Before we adjourn, members, I would like to inform the members that the CPA Annual General Meeting will commence immediately after the adjournment of the House. That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:25.

ANNOUNCEMENTS TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

THURSDAY, 29 AUGUST 2019

COMMITTEE REPORT

Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism (the Committee) on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates to the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, dated 23 August 2019, as follows:

1. Four vacancies occurred on the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (the Board) due to the upcoming expiry of board memberships at the end of March 2019. Three of the Board members' terms were extended to March 2020; however, one of these Board members, Ms Julinda Gantana, was appointed as Acting Head of the Provincial Treasury and could no longer serve on the Board, and thus resigned as a Board member.

2. The Provincial Treasury advertised the vacant Board member positions in the Provincial Gazette, Vukani, the Mail & Guardian, Die Burger and Weekend Argus on 26, 27 and 28 July 2018, and on the Provincial Government Jobs Portal.
3. The Committee was requested, by a letter of referral sent on 30 July 2019 to the Office of the Speaker at the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, to recommend candidates to fill the four vacancies. The matter was referred to the Committee in the ATC of 2 August 2019.
4. Section 3(1) of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Act, 1996 (Act 4 of 1996, as amended) stipulates: "The Board shall consist of seven members, appointed on a part-time basis, by the Executive Council in accordance with the prescribed procedure, which shall provide for public participation in the nomination of candidates for appointment; provided that the standing committee of the Provincial Legislature responsible for this Act shall evaluate all candidates as to their suitability for appointment."
5. On 6 August 2019, the Provincial Treasury briefed the Committee on the process leading to the shortlisting of candidates. The Committee was provided with a list of 13 candidates to evaluate. The Committee then resolved to evaluate the candidates through an interview process.
6. One candidate, Ms June Williams, declined the interview as she had already accepted a position on the independent audit committee in the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board.
7. The Committee, having interviewed the 12 candidates, reached consensus and recommended the following candidates in alphabetical order:
 - 7.1 For the first immediate/current vacancy:
 - Mr Terrence Arendse
 - Mr Rowan Nicholls
 - Ms Sinazo Ntshinka
 - Ms Linda Nyati
 - 7.2 For the second immediate/current vacancy:
 - Mr Terrence Arendse
 - Mr Rowan Nicholls
 - Ms Sinazo Ntshinka
 - Ms Linda Nyati
 - 7.3 For the first future vacancy arising at the end of March 2020:
 - Mr Terrence Arendse
 - Mr Claude Bassuday
 - Mr Rowan Nicholls
 - Ms Sinazo Ntshinka
 - Ms Linda Nyati

7.4 For the second future vacancy arising at the end of March 2020:

- Mr Terrence Arendse
- Mr Claude Bassuday
- Mr Rowan Nicholls
- Ms Sinazo Ntshinka
- Ms Linda Nyati

8. The Committee resolved to review the current Western Cape Gambling and Racing Act, 1996 (Act 4 of 1996 as amended), and that the Provincial Treasury should review the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Regulations (PN 239 in PG 5054 of 7 June 1996).

Report to be considered.

FRIDAY, 30 AUGUST 2019

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

The Rules Committee has established the following subcommittees in accordance with Standing Rule 91(g) and the following Members have been appointed to serve on these subcommittees:

1. Subcommittee on Physical Infrastructure and Internal Related Arrangements

Schäfer, B A (Convenor) Maseko, L M
Mitchell, D G Lekker, P Z Herron, B N

2. Sexual Harassment Policy and Leave of Absence for Members

Wenger, M M (Convenor) Baartman, D M Mitchell, D G Lekker, P Z
Makamba-Botya, N

3. Subcommittee on the Review of the Rules

Mitchell, D G (Convenor)

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

Annual Report of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 tabled in terms of section 60 of the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, 2009 (Act 10 of 2009), as amended:

The Speaker:

Annual Report of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament for 2018/19 (Vote 2: Provincial Parliament).

Referred to the Parliamentary Oversight Committee.

TUESDAY, 3 SEPTEMBER 2019

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

1. Annual reports of provincial departments for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 tabled in terms of section 65(1)(a) of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999), as amended:

(a) Minister of Community Safety

Annual Report of the Department of Community Safety for 2018/19 (Vote 4: Community Safety).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(b) Minister of Education

Annual Report of the Department of Education for 2018/19 (Vote 5: Education).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Education and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(c) Minister of Health

Annual Report of the Department of Health for 2018/19 (Vote 6: Health).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Health and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

2. Annual reports of provincial entities for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 tabled in terms of section 65(1)(a) of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999), as amended:

(a) Minister of Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism

(i) Annual Report of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board for 2018/19 (Vote 3: Provincial Treasury).

- (ii) Annual Report of the Western Cape Tourism, Trade and Investment Promotion Agency (Wesgro) for 2018/19 (Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(b) **Minister of Community Safety**

- (c) Annual Report of the Western Cape Liquor Authority for 2018/19 (Vote 4: Community Safety).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(d) **Minister of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning**

Annual Report of CapeNature (Western Cape Nature Conservation Board) for 2018/19 (Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(e) **Minister of Agriculture**

Annual Report of Casidra for 2018/19 (Vote 11: Agriculture).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

FRIDAY, 6 SEPTEMBER 2019

ANNOUNCEMENT

The Speaker:

Referral of document to committee in accordance with Standing Rule 92: Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport

Report of the Western Cape Police Ombudsman on an unresolved investigation regarding policing in the Overstrand area, Western Cape.

TABLING

The Speaker:

Minister of Community Safety

Report of the Western Cape Police Ombudsman on an unresolved investigation regarding policing in the Overstrand area, Western Cape.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 433**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. I recognise the hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I wish to inform the House that Oral Questions to Minister Schäfer and Minister Marais will stand over with the concurrence of the questioners.

(Motion)

And then hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), that precedence be given to the motion printed on the Order Paper in the name of the hon member Herron; and thereafter the Subject for Discussion also as printed on the Order Paper in the name of hon member Lekker.

Agreed to.

I would like to bring to the attention of the members as I welcome the guests in the gallery that hon members, the political parties each have two minutes on this specific motion and therefore the opportunity will be as such, and do not do three minutes; two minutes. I would like to let members speak without me saying your time is up. I now recognise hon member B Herron. Thank you hon member.

LATE CHESTER WILLIAMS

(Motion of condolence)

Mr B N HERRON: Mr Speaker, I move:

That the House, noting that South Africa and the Western Cape lost a sporting hero and a true model with the untimely and sudden passing away of former Springbok rugby player, Chester Williams, on Friday 6 September 2019, acknowledges:

- (a) the late Chester William's contribution to South African sport and to uniting South Africans;
- (b) that his passing is a loss to our country and our province; and

- (c) his work as a rugby coach, mentor and his many charitable contributions;

and therefore expresses its condolences to his wife, Maria, his family, friends and colleagues.

Thank you, Hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, it is fitting that we take this short moment to pay our respects to a great son of the Western Cape soil. It has been reported that as recently as six weeks ago and at his last public appearance Chester was asked what he wanted his legacy to be and he answered, a great dad, a great husband, a great son, a great friend and a great rugby player. By every account Chester's legacy is all of this and more. Every tribute that has been expressed since his untimely passing on Friday confirms that Chester Williams was a star on the field and off the field. At a fragile time, as the South Africans were breaking down barriers and learning what it was like to live in a normal and just society, Chester played a major role in unifying us and in breaking down abnormal racial barriers, using his talent, his authentic character and the power of rugby and sport.

His role in uniting South Africans did not end in the Springbok rugby team. He continued to inspire, coach and mentor. Sadly his coaching talents were overlooked by many in his home country and he was forced to export these to other parts of the world.

Hon Speaker, I propose that this House acknowledges his contribution to building our country and for giving us hope when we needed it most, that we express the hope that his memory and achievements will continue to inspire South Africans. I ask that this House, on behalf of the people of the Western Cape, conveys our condolences to his wife Maria, his children Ryan, Matthew and Chloe and his family, friends and colleagues. May they find comfort in the universal love and respect that has been expressed for Chester, and a brief note, I would like to remind the people of the Western Cape that his memorial service at Newlands on Saturday is open to the public. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: It is with great sadness that the Western Cape Government mourns the sudden loss of the legendary Chester Williams. We have indeed lost an iconic Springbok, a true leader and devoted advocate of rugby at the University of the Western Cape, the greater province, country and large and the world over.

Always generously smiling, Chester led by example through compassionate inspiration, determined motivation and his profoundly deep love for our beloved country. His presence, acumen and passionate drive will surely be missed in South African sport, particularly in the Western Cape. We express our heartfelt condolences to Chester's family, friends, loved ones and all he encouraged. May his legacy continue to live on through the Chester Williams Rugby Foundation and the aspirations of our younger generation. We trust his life's work will not only inspire but motivate for increased participation in sport to unite South Africans as the nation he wholeheartedly advocated for and proactively helped shape.

Following consultation with the family I confirm that the provincial state funeral was granted by the Presidency, as the late Chester Williams will be laid to rest on Saturday 14 September 2019 at Newlands Rugby Stadium. As approved by the Presidency, the National Department of Arts, Culture, Sport and Recreation South Africa, the Provincial Departments of the Premier and Cultural Affairs and Sport, we will bid our final farewell to Chester Williams at an official funeral on Saturday.

Hon Speaker, even in his absence he continues to unite different spheres of Government to the benefit of a greater cause. May his legacy long live on. I thank you.

Ms A P BANS: †Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you Speaker.] Earlier this week South Africans were awoken by the sad news of the passing of Chester Williams. The news of Williams' passing sent shockwaves not only throughout the rugby world but through the entire country. Nicknamed the "Black Pearl", Chester started his rugby career playing provincially before making it into the national rugby squad. We take note that Chester in the year 2000 was playing for the Golden Lions with a colleague of ours, Patrick Marran.

Chester was a rugby stalwart and was one of the many heroes that played in the 1995 World Cup game that was won by the Springboks. He was the only person of colour on his team and went to change the face of South African rugby forever. While serving as motivator to those around him, Chester showed prowess on the field and was able to use his love for rugby to unite the country. He served as a beacon of hope for many black players who dreamt about playing for the national team and was proof that the apple does not fall too far from the tree. Williams' uncle Avril was the second black man to play for the national team and made his debut in 1984 when playing against England. Chester went on to follow in the footsteps of his uncle years later. Chester transcended various barriers and will always be remembered as a symbol of talent and transformation. Even at the end of his rugby career, Williams continued to break boundaries a lot and give hope to young black rugby players, who went on to transform South African rugby. It is because of the contribution of Chester Williams that we have national treasures such as Siya Kolisi among many others. At the time of his untimely death he was a rugby coach at the University of the Western Cape, proof that he was passionate about grooming and nurturing young talent.

The ANC in the Western Cape would like to convey our sincerest condolences to the friends and family of Chester Williams. As a nation we have lost a national hero and we will forever be grateful for the contributions that were made by Chester. I thank you, †Somlomo. [Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bans. I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, today on behalf of the ACDP I would like to express my heartfelt condolences to the Williams family. When someone's life is snatched away on such a young tender age of 49, we all think that death has won, but the love of God conquered death when he raised Jesus from the dead more than 2000 years ago. Yes, love conquered death.

Hence the Bible in Corinthians posed the question:

“Where, oh death, is your victory? Where, oh death, is your sting?”

Hon Speaker, that is why we can celebrate the life of Chester Williams because he will live forever in our hearts. We all know that he is a well-known rugby player and that he was part of the Springbok team lifting the Webb Ellis Trophy and he was then nicknamed “The Black Pearl.” Chester will live on in our hearts as a beacon of hope; the smiling Springbok, a beacon of inspiration, a pioneer on and off the rugby field.

The Bible further goes as follows and says:

“I have fought the good fight. I have finished the race. I have kept my faith.”

Chester, you have fought a good fight and you have finished the race. Hon Speaker, our thoughts and prayers are with the family. I thank you.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you Hon Speaker. On behalf of the EFF we rise to convey our sincere condolences to the Williams family. Chester became a prominent member and played a significant role in the momentous victory in the 1995 Rugby World Cup. The role he played was not only limited to helping the South African national rugby team win the World Cup, but he also pioneered the breaking down of apartheid barriers within the sport. He exemplified the end of the oppressive and apartheid regime by being a non-white player within a team full of white players in an era when it was uncommon to do so.

Off the field of play he became the face of the Springbok rugby team heading into the World Cup as his image was on each and every poster and billboard around the country. Chessie, as he was then known, was seen as a living icon across and more so by those from underprivileged backgrounds, such as Breyton Paule, who followed him into the Boks side and went on to win 64 caps in the Springbok team.

Today the role he played in the national rugby team continues to inspire thousands of South African children of colour who were previously excluded from rugby. Despite his efforts and hard work Chester later outlined in his 2002 autobiography, titled *Chester*, that following the World Cup, he was later racially abused by his fellow teammate in a provincial rugby match, James Small. Chester went on to point that a lot still needs to be done in the country to tackle issues of racism in the rugby sport. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Xego. I now recognise hon member P Marais.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Dankie agb Speaker. Chester Williams, is daar klaar gesê, was die Swart Pêrel van Springbok-rugby maar hy is nou 'n juweel in die hemelse kroon en namens die Vryheidsfront Plus wil ek my innige meegevoel uitspreek teenoor sy vrou en kinders. Ons harte deel hul smart. 'n Ster het voorwaar geval.

Sy verbysterende vaart en vier drieë teen Samoa in 1995 sou die oorlede en legendariese Gerhard Viviers genoem Spiekerish "Spiekeries" oor die radio laat brul het, "Chessie, Chessie, jou doring, jou drie-dubbele doring!" [Gelag.] Maar, hy kon dit nie doen nie, hy het 'n jaar vroeër gesterf.

Chester, ek wens jy kon die afgelope dae inluister hoe vele bewonderaars en selfs jou kritici jou nou lof toesing. Jou onvergeetlike en aansteeklike glimlag, jou sagte geaardheid, jou baanbrekersvermoëns, besorgdheid en liefde vir jou vrou en kinders het my herinner aan die Amerikaanse sanger Nat King Cole se "*Unforgettable, that is what you are*",

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Chester Williams, it has been said already, was the Black Pearl of Springbok rugby but he is now a jewel in the heavenly crown and on behalf of the Freedom Front Plus I want to express my heartfelt condolences to his wife and children. Our hearts are sharing their grief. A star has fallen, indeed. His astonishing speed and four tries against Samoa in 1995 would have moved the late and legendary Gerhard Viviers, named "Spiekeries" to roar over the radio, "*Chessie, Chessie, you star, you triple star*" [Laughter.] But he could not do it, he died a year earlier.

Chester, I wish you could have listened in to how many fans and even your critics were singing your praises over the past few days. Your unforgettable and catchy smile, your gentle nature, your pioneering abilities, care and love for your wife and children reminded me of the American singer King Cole's "*Unforgettable, that is what you are*", †unforgettable, our rugby star, dearest Chessie, it is incredible that someone so unforgettable could make four tries so unforgettable too!

And after having named two Newlands stands after rugby greats, like Dr Danie Craven and Jan Pickard I think it would be most fitting... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: ...for this Parliament to recommend to the Western Province Union to rename the Railway Stand after Chester Williams. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon member Marais.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you. May I request the hon members that the House rise.

[Moment of silence observed in honour of the late Chester Williams.]

The SPEAKER: May his soul rest in peace. Thank you, hon members.

**TAKING ACTION AGAINST GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE
AND FEMICIDE IN THE WESTERN CAPE**

(Subject for Discussion)

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there are a number of stakeholders that have been invited. They are sitting in the Speaker's box. The Commission for Gender Equality, Ms Nonandi Diko, legal adviser, Ms Benita Sterris, Acting Provincial Manager; Mr Khaya Dlulane, Commissioner Nissen's assistant. The South African Human Rights Commission, Ms Nthabiseng Moleko, Commissioner, and we have also invited the judiciary. There was an apology from Judge President Hlophe. Because of the nature of the debate all the stakeholders need to be part of whatever is deliberated on in order to bring fruition to the debate.

In that spirit we are now going straight to the debate. Good luck, hon members. I recognise hon member Bakubaku-Vos from the African National Congress. [Applause.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: †Ndiyabulela Somlomo. [I thank you speaker.] †I rise this afternoon to join millions of South Africans, especially fellow women and children who are saying, "Enough is enough!" Action must be taken to end femicide, rape and violence against women and children. Last week thousands of women took to the street to demand urgent measures to be carried out to bring to an end continuing brutal killings of women in the country. Protests were triggered by a spate of rape and brutal murders of women.

A boxing champion, Leighandre Jegels who was shot and murdered by an ex-boyfriend who had a restraining order against him. A UWC student, Jesse Hess, who was murdered alongside her grandmother in Parow. Other names include a pregnant Sadieka Newman from Manenberg; Monica Marlow, Lynette Volschenk, Meghan Cremer and Nwabisa Mthumeni, who was taken from her home in Site C on Friday night by brazen criminals who shot and wounded her boyfriend. Her body was found with bullet wounds at the Wolfgat Nature Reserve. The attack on women continued unabated. The lifeless body of a woman was found with rocks over her face in Gugulethu on Friday morning; in Lotus River a 27-year old woman died in gang crossfire on Saturday. On Tuesday a CPUT nursing student was kidnapped while leaving the Tygerberg Hospital and was raped in the bushes next to Bishop Lavis Magistrate's Court.

Hon Speaker, what saddens me is that all these events took place during August, a month we use to highlight the plight of women. It is safe to then conclude that we had a month from hell. The most shocking murder was that a young Uyinene Mrwetyana, a UCT student who was raped and murdered inside a post office that is a few metres from a police station in Claremont. Her body was later dumped in a field in Khayelitsha. A Post Office employee was later arrested. In the gallery we have Uyinene's grandmother, uMasitshaba Pauline Koka, a leader of the ANC Women's League in Zwelethemba, particular in Breede Valley. Here she is, still mourning for her child. [Applause.]

In the gallery we have a grandmother umama uMasitshaba not that †nguye yedwa kodwa ayinguye-yedwa olahlekelwe kufuneka siqinisekise ukuba sikusiphula neengcambu ukuhlukunyeza nokubulawa koomama nabantwana. [not that she is the only one who has lost a child but we have to ensure, to uproot to the core the actions of abusing and killing women and children.]

To her and all other mothers who have lost their daughters and grandchildren. †sithi uxolo zimbokodo. [we say sorry great women.]

We had failed you as a society and Government. Indeed you could have warned your daughter not to go out at night and wear short and revealing clothes, but †asikwazi ukuthi emntwaneni uzungayi phaya ngoba kukho umbulali okanye uzungayi esikolweni ngoba kukho umbulali kuba kuzo zonke ezi ndawo zingamasebe kaRhulumente kulapho abantu bafanele ukuncedwa khona kodwa yena u-Uyinene ufele ezandleni zomsebenzi karhulumente kwisakhiwo sikarhulumente.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[We cannot say to our children do not go there because there is a killer or do not go to school because there is a killer because all these are government institutions and that is where people are supposed to get help but unfortunately for Uyinene she died at the hands of a government official in a government building.]

†Indeed, Shakespeare was correct when he said that “hell is empty and all devils are here.” These devils are sometimes our husbands like the 44-year old KZN man who is accused of hanging his three young children and 16-yearold daughter, Ayakha Jiyane. They are our sons, like a 14-year old boy who was arrested for stabbing his mother to death in Kalkfontein last month. These devils, like in the case of Uyinene, are sadly Government officials who in their line of duty interact with women and children on a daily basis.

As we speak many teachers who have been accused of sexual assault and other forms of violence against women and children are in classrooms. As the ANC in the province we will be tabling a motion in the House on the Western Cape Government to compel all Provincial Government employees, including those employed through the EPWP in various municipalities, to undergo a vetting process and report accordingly.

Hon Speaker, according to statistics by the World Health Organisation, South Africa has the fourth-highest femicide rate in the world with an estimation of 12.5 victims in every 100 000 women. Not every murder case is classified as femicide. This means the actual murder rate of women is even higher when other factors are included. Statistics indicate a woman is murdered every three hours in South Africa. Additionally crime stats shows 7000 sexual offence cases recorded in the province particularly in the Western Province. Such numbers prompt women in South Africa to ask questions like #AmINext? This was a rally call on Government to take drastic measures to protect women and children.

The French Government with a femicide rate of 0.18 ploughed millions of euros into tackling the problem. They rolled out over 1000 women shelters in the country. In contrast the Western Cape which reported the highest number of women and children in the country is under-funding women shelters. In the gallery we are joined by Captain Nomvuyo Mithi from Kayamandi Police Station and Mary Nkopane, the coordinator of the Kayamandi Trauma Centre. They are sitting up there.

The shelter opened its doors in 2007 but never received any funds from the Provincial Government. All its applications are rejected through private donors it used to house and run programmes for victims of violence. Due to lack of funds it was forced to close down its safe house. It is now assisting victims of rape and violence who are referred by social workers and police. It may shut its doors on any day as it no longer has funds. There are many other examples, hon Speaker, of shelters that are closing down in the province due to lack of funding.

During the Speaker's Debate on Women's Month the Premier stood here and admitted that his Government was not doing enough to ensure women's safety in the province. Here is the challenge to him, uTata uPremier.

†uNkulumbuso uyibeka kakuhle [the hon Premier puts it very nicely] Tata Premier, there is no excuse. Enough is enough. You promised during the Speaker's Debate on Women's Month, you stood there and admitted that this Government was not doing enough to ensure women's safety in the province. Here is the challenge to you. You must take ownership of the situation and make funding available for shelters and there is no excuse, we will be dealing with Adjustment Budgets soon. We have to agree that the 16 shelters and four emergency shelters that the Provincial Government is funding is not enough... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, your time is nearing its end so you have to wrap up.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you Speaker.] It is not enough given the crisis we are dealing with. In closing I want to support women of the country who have been making calls for harsher punishment for the violent crimes against women and children and particularly those calls by the ANC's Women's League.

The SPEAKER: †Enkosi kakhulu mama. [Thank you very much mama.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Enough is enough! †Wathint'abafazi, wathint'imbokodo! [You strike a woman you strike a rock!] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Bakubaku-Vos. I am going to request that the procedure or the Rules of this House, guests are allowed to obviously as you are here now, observe the proceedings, and watch the debates as they ensue but they are not allowed to participate so you may not clap hands, whilst it is tempting to do so.

I also imagine if I was sitting there I would want to clap, but it is something that we do not do here in Parliament, so may I request that we do not do so, so that we do not break the Rules of this Parliament. Thank you very much. Now I recognise the Minister of Transport and Public Works, hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Enkosi Somlomo. To the Premier, Cabinet colleagues, members of the House, †ndibulise kubo bonke omama namalungu asindwendwe lweyo namhlanje. [I greet you all and all the mothers here today.]

Hon Speaker, we must call this debate exactly what it is. This is not a gender-based violence debate. This is a debate against women who are violated by men, which has become a norm. These are animals who do not deserve the title of being called men. These are people who have been slaughtering our children, sisters, mothers and even grandmothers every day. Hon Speaker, today the National Minister of Police released again the stats, the crime stats in South Africa. It is really heartbreaking to have noticed that once again sexual offences particularly against children are increasing.

The stats are telling us that it has increased by 4.6% which translate to 899 sexual offences against children that were reported and we do know that there are many more that are not reported. Now it is high time, hon Speaker, for us as men in every corner of our society, because the last thing I want us to do in this debate is to give the impression that it is Government and Government alone who must deal with this problem, and hon Speaker for a very long time, besides isolated cases, we have been absent or played a very minimal role as men and we have allowed victims which are women to lead this campaign and that is why I volunteered, hon Speaker, to be part of this debate because it cannot be that when we discuss this we make it a responsibility of the victims. Now it is high time for real men to stand up and say: "Not in our name." That is why, hon Speaker, I really want to appeal to the members of this House that this must be a clarion call for all of us to come up with practical measures to deal with this.

Again, hon Speaker, I want to also go back down the memory lane just as hon member Bakubaku-Vos did. We remember, hon Speaker, on 3 February 2013 we woke up to a horrific story of a 17-year-old young girl who was gang-raped, disembowelled with her abdomen slit open at a construction site. Now hon Speaker, I want to describe these incidents because I am getting somewhere. Anene Booysen's death sent shockwaves through the nation. There was anger and frustration at how this young woman's life was ended. We sent messages of condolences, organised marches and called for maximum sentences.

Five years later, hon Speaker, that horrific incident was again followed by another one in the same area in Bredasdorp. Jordine Pieters was found raped and killed at a limestone factory. Not long after that, Courtney Pieters, who was only three years old - three years old - was again raped twice before she was killed and buried in a shallow grave in Elsie's River.

This month again we have seen a number of young women who were killed and I think my colleague has mentioned many of those women, but I also want to follow suit and mention them.

Jesse Hess was a student at the UWC, who was found dead with her grandfather in Parow.

Janika Mallo, a 14-year-old from Mitchells Plain was also raped and found dead with her head bashed, in her grandmother's yard. Lynette Volschenk was also mutilated and her body parts were found in her flat in Bellville. Meghan Cremer's body was found in a sand mine on a farm in Philippi. She was allegedly murdered during a robbery involving three men who had previous convictions. Uyinene Mrwetyana was also raped and killed by a monster who works in our offices.

Now with all these incidents and many more, hon Speaker, it cannot be business as usual. Hon Speaker, I want to take a moment here, and pay my respects to one of my unsung heroes who responded to a call because I think we have been saying men must take a stand and unfortunately people like him get very little attention and recognition. Hon Speaker, Andrew Klein from Klapmuts was killed by a group of nine young men, because he disturbed them from raping a woman in the particular area, and may his soul rest in peace, and I do want to take this opportunity and thank the EFF councillor Lucinda Hansbaard for the role that she played in assisting the family and this is a clear indication, hon Speaker, that we must take the whole-of-society approach in dealing with this matter, and I feel embarrassed because Lucinda was supposed to be here and I am told that it is because of our trains and Minister Mbalula; those are the reasons why she is not here, because of the delays which we have seen in Bellville she could not be here. Hon Speaker, I want us to be honest with ourselves. Our system failed this rape victim in particular. I am saying "our" because I want to own up. I do not want to blame National Government and blame any other people. I want to own up here today as a man and say our system failed this rape victim that I am talking about, who was assisted by Andrew Klein. The Department of Health failed her after she went to hospital, but she did not get proper assistance. The Department of Social Development failed her, because she did not get the counselling that she needed. Now this is the story of many other women, but I am making an example with this one in particular.

The Department of Police failed her because her rapists are still roaming the streets and the killers of Andrew Klein are still roaming the streets, but I want to thank my colleagues who intervened upon hearing about this story and make sure that they make the necessary follow up.

Hon Speaker, all these incidents are showing a very disturbing pattern and that is why I thought it was important to mention them. We are dealing with a complex matter here that does not require easy answers. These are not normal human beings. No normal human being can rape a three-year-old child twice and kill her.

Mr P J MARAIS: Animals!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They have no soul, hon Speaker.

That is why we need experts to examine all these cases and individuals involved so that we can understand what we are dealing with. Yes, hon Speaker, protests and marches will raise awareness, but ultimately we need to get to the root causes of these things.

Now hon Speaker, populist responses and calling for the death penalty will not solve this problem. These will not deter drug addicts who become zombies and oblivious to these acts. It will not deter children born with foetal alcoholic syndrome because their brain is so severely affected that 80% of the time they cannot tell between right and wrong. This will not deter, hon Speaker, people with personality disorders. It will not solve the problems of children who join gangs because they have no role models, fathers who are role models. These are some of the challenges that we really need to get to the bottom of, instead of calling for easy solutions and populist solutions.

Hon Speaker, we need to start by getting our house in order as Government by protecting victims in our spaces, as I made an example of many of the departments that failed the woman who was saved by Andrew Klein. A lot has been said about Uyinene and again I want to repeat this young girl was raped and killed by our employee. Thousands of girls are sexually exploited and impregnated by teachers and some of us know these things and we are not doing anything about them. Here in the Western Cape, there is an example of a doctor who was fired for raping a patient; and another one for raping his colleague. We have a disturbing culture of sex for jobs, sex for tenders, sex for marks and these things are done by people in the position of influence like myself. These are the things that we need to deal with, hon Speaker. It is time to act and not just talk and this is my appeal in this House here today, hon Speaker. Whatever role that we play as members, a member of a family, a leader in your community, the holder of a public office, make every effort to counter the scourge that we are addressing this afternoon. We all have influence, not just Government. I think we can blame Ramaphosa, we can blame Alan Winde. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, you need to wrap up now.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: All that I am saying, hon Speaker, is that this is a clarion call for all of us in our spaces, whether in churches, whether as politicians, whether as leaders to really step up and play the role that we should be playing as fathers and citizens of this province. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister Madikizela. [Applause.] I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you hon Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters pledges its full support for the protest that began on 2 September 2019 in Parliament and all other actions that have been undertaken by South Africans in a bid to call out and put pressure on Government to urgently prioritise gender-based violence and violence against children, which manifested itself in the ruthless rapes, murders, kidnapping of women, children in the past few weeks.

The root of the gender-based violence and violence against children is the core belief by society that women and children are possessions and properties that can be used and dispossessed with no consequences. The Economic Freedom Fighters reiterates its stance during the Women's Day Debate held on 25 August 2019 and that anti-black, anti-poor and anti-women laws and policies legislated by the very same people sitting on these benches further cement the badge of shame women wear simply because they are women and that they must change. The EFF further reiterates that the time for nice speeches and talks and talk-shows is over and we should be working towards implementing programmes that will uproot patriarchy forever. The EFF reiterates its call for ensuring that women and children have all the support, resources and knowledge to claim their rights. The EFF calls for all Government departments to work extra hard to change the socio-economic conditions our people find themselves in, by providing land, work and basic services and hold the other two spheres of Government accountable.

The EFF challenges this House to resolve on establishing a multilateral women's caucus that will comprise of various NGOs, civil societies, Government departments and academics with the primary mandate of facilitating public hearings on gender-based violence and violence against children and to ensure the implementation of demands made by various memoranda submitted over years.

In closing, hon Speaker, the EFF would like to pay its condolences to the families of Uyinene Mrwetyana, Janika Mallo, Jesse Hess, Sandisile Mona, Nwabisa Mthumeni and all other women and children who have senselessly lost their lives in the province these past few weeks and there are yet no justice that has been given to them and before I sit down, hon Speaker, I also want to iterate on the issue of women that are being marginalised at Government spheres that we need to make sure that, at especially the Department of Justice, that we need to employ female judges that when they are taking decisions, they are taking decisions knowing the issue of carrying a child for nine months, how painful it is when we are losing so many rape cases because we do not have any belief that men can take a crucial decision in taking these decisions at a court level, so that is my take on this. Thank you Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Makamba-Botya. I now recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you hon Speaker, good afternoon. I want to concur with the EFF that we need to recognise and we need to support but we also need to stem the tide against toxic masculinity, especially in political parties where people are anti-women. Hon Speaker, as hon member Bakubaku-Vos said, the voices of those most vulnerable in our society and in our province are no longer silent. Our mothers, sisters, daughters, they are shouting louder and as men and as leaders we have allowed their voices to be diminished amidst the muffling of inept policing and the weight of bureaucracy.

Hon Speaker, our women are shouting against the inability of the state and they are asking Government to uphold their most basic human needs, safety and the need to thrive socially.

Hon Speaker, they want to feel safe in their homes, on our streets, on our trains and at our post offices. They want us as representatives of the people to ensure that they live, work and play in cohesive safe spaces. This is what they told us when we visited them two weeks ago in Laingsburg. They lamented the state of services they received. We saw the neglect that our rural communities face because they are being held hostage by gangsters and the evils of tik. Our mothers, our daughters suffer at the hands of intimate family members. We heard the stories at the ill-equipped Laingsburg Police Station. Yes, hon Speaker, we bore witness to the victim support room that is well stocked but cannot be used due to a lack of personnel. We bore witness to the social crisis in this small town that is ravaged by drugs and is being held hostage by broken drug-obsessed young men and a local authority with the inability to coordinate a response.

Hon Speaker, although our visit was a harsh slap of reality we were also confronted with solutions, innovations and ideas that came from men and women. I was particularly inspired by the work of a young female social worker and her commitment to hosting drug-intervention programmes, sometimes even when only four men came. The local librarian with the passion shared her commitment to improving access to reading materials and providing a safe space for women and children. She provides a refuge filled with fictional information to for one moment allow these women and children to escape the harsh realities of their lives.

Hon Speaker, through you I would like to bring the attention of the House to a remarkable young man we met, Mr Edward Galant, the coordinator of the Cape Access Centre at Laingsburg. Mr Galant, by showing that men needs to play a role, uses the opportunities provided by this Western Cape Government to not only manage the physical facility which is tiny and wholly inadequate for the massive need, but he has acquired a particular unique set of skills to train others in his community with computer literacy skills because, hon Speaker, he wants to train those on the surrounding farms because he is not waiting for the Fourth Industrial Revolution. He is training the women and children in his community for the work of today.

Hon Speaker, we know there are many change-makers and innovators working side by side with our women. We can only debate and we can continue to debate gender-based violence but until we provide support, resources and scale up the work that is being done by these change-makers we are not doing enough. Hon Speaker, intimate femicide forms part of a massive problem that is part of the larger gender-based violence problem and we know it is the men in our communities that are hurting our female companions.

Hon Speaker, I hope that the President is serious when he says that he wants to open more specialised courts and especially because we know that the Justice Department plans to close 33 specialised courts due to lack of funds. Our fiscus is under a lot of pressure and I do not foresee the Minister of Finance providing this money for specialised courts without taking the money from another vital service.

It is with this in mind, hon Speaker, that I would like to challenge the Premier and President Ramaphosa to immediately start exploring ways to significantly scale down the amount of money that is spent on VIP protection for politicians and to redirect these funds into gender-based violence programmes such as expanding the work that is being done by the Department of Social Development, the Department of Health in this province, the University of Cape Town, the National Prosecuting Authority, and SAPS through the child death review.

Hon Speaker, this firm commitment will go a long way in ensuring that specialised courts have the norms and standards which they currently do not have. It will go a long way in ensuring that we provide more rigorous training to the frontline staff to ensure that they are properly equipped to deal with the horrors that are reported to them on a daily basis; to ensure that we can vet all state employees and to ensure that we do not have criminals waiting to pounce, pounce like they always do, and to stem the tide we need to improve our social infrastructure and communities hon Speaker. We need locally based community driven policing that is victim friendly. When any victims of gender-based violence use their considerable courage to report this violation to the police they must be met with someone who shows empathy and does not engage in secondary victimisation.

Our communities must know the top notch detective and forensic science will assist them in ensuring a conviction. Hon Speaker, I am afraid if we do not have actions, timelines, clear implementation and continuous monitoring and evaluation that is aimed at stopping the murder of our elderly, our women, our children and members of our LGBTQI+ community in this Western Cape and in this country, we will become in the words of Langston Hughes in "*A dream deferred*", when he asks:

"What happens to a dream deferred?

Does it dry up
like a raisin in the sun?
Or fester like a sore —
and then run?
Does it stink like rotten meat?
Or crust and sugar over —
like a syrupy sweet?
Maybe it just sags
like a heavy load.
Or does it explode?"

Hon Speaker, we are busy exploding. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Bosman. I now recognise hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. Last month I asked this House to pay respect to the bravery of women living in conditions which physically place them at enormous risk. Woman and girls who must walk at night through dark unlit narrow alleys that not even the police are prepared to patrol.

I also spoke of girls and women who are forced to walk in the dark to distant taxi ranks or travel on train carriages where they are groped, robbed or assaulted?

Of course, hon Speaker, gender-based violence and femicide takes place in every community, affluent and poor, but for some women the urban form of our cities and towns disproportionately disempowers them and forces them to face risks they could otherwise minimise. Debates and discussions do not help. We need action.

The Provincial Government - create safe spaces; give women who face violence the option to leave; build more shelters; ensure that the police treat women with respect especially those who report domestic or sexual violence. I see that we have distributed the South African Police Services' domestic violence pamphlet but there cannot be a member of this House who is not aware of how women are treated when they try and force a domestic violence protection order. So to the Provincial Government, use your oversight functions and the Western Cape Community Safety Act to audit police stations and to check how women's complaints are being handled. Make it safer for women and children and girls to use public transport. Last year we implemented a Rail Enforcement Unit to improve safety on the trains. Keep that Rail Enforcement Unit running. Send the MyCiTi bus back to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain so that women do not have to walk in the dark to remote taxi ranks.

Hon Speaker, the ANC introduced this topic for debate. Last week the GOOD leader Patricia de Lille proposed an amendment to the criminal laws to make special provision for femicide as a crime. To the ANC, make sure your Government and colleagues fast-track the amendment so that we can offer better legislative protection as soon as possible. Define femicide and law as a specific defence and legislate against men who offend.

Hon Speaker, of course as the hon Minister Madikizela mentioned, laws and criminal interventions will not resolve this scourge alone. We need to look at how we are raising boys into men; what we teach about masculinity; why femicide and gender-based violence happen and what we need to do to stop it. We can and we should look to the law to introduce action but we must also look at ourselves and each other and find our role in ending this. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Herron. [Applause.] I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you hon Speaker. The ACDP welcomes this debate today, namely taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape, but hon Speaker, this problem is not a Western Cape problem. It is a nationwide problem. South Africa is indeed in deep trouble because of the disintegration of society. There is a breakdown in our families due to a mother, a daughter, a wife, a grandma or sister brutally raped or killed, leaving the family without a loved one. A son or daughter who does not have the comfort to be tucked away in the evenings. More and more we see these big problems and we need solutions to these problems.

Now as politicians we can debate and we can talk about numerous interventions and we can talk about the course of action but hon Speaker, no mother gives birth to a child to be a rapist; to be a killer or a murderer. The big problem in our society, and we have heard yesterday at Chrysalis, is the absent father. We as fathers need to play a role. We as husbands need to play a role. Somehow society influences our young boys growing up. We know of unemployment, drugs, gangs, we know of overcrowded homes, it is sad to see that people are living in cramped-up houses where parents need to share the space with their children in one room, so somehow hon Speaker, we must look at the moral compass inside of us and we need to influence society positively, irrespective of how insignificant it may seem, but we must take this responsibility at home in our community in our workplace, and we must take personal responsibility and as the Minister said, take the responsibility, take ownership, and we cannot change it all, but if we make a difference it is a step in the right direction. Hon Speaker, regardless of where we are, I still believe that we need God's hand in all of this. We must fall on our knees and pray and we must not talk about prayer, but we must really earnestly pray and I want to conclude with this solution in the word of God and I want to read it, 2 Chronicles 7:14... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is nearing...

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: "If my people who are called by my name will humble themselves and pray and seek my face and turn from their wicked ways, I will hear from heaven, I will forgive their sin and heal their land."

Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Christians. I could not stop you, you were reading a verse, I have never done that to my pastor in church so you intimidated me there. [Laughter.] May I now request hon member P Marais.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Hoor-hoor!

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hear-hear!]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you hon Speaker. Hon members, the current spate of murders and rapes of women and children has evoked anger amongst our people of all cultures and races. They are calling for drastic action, not speeches, not promises, not big volumes of reports. They want action! All men in South Africa should respect, protect and love women and not act like vicious animals preying on women and causing them to live in fear. Between 2015 and 2016 the murder rate of women has increased by 117% so who can argue that if we had not had those men, these women would have lived? Sexual offences against women increased from 31 000 to 70 000. Our country's Constitution should not allow perpetrators of such crimes to feel protected by its unqualified rights to life and dignity of people. Sentences for such crimes should neither be diluted by early parole for supposedly good behaviour, good in the jail, come out and murder again.

South African men have declared war on the mothers of this nation. Murderers and rapists do not deserve the sympathy and the protection of any society in the world. If our women continue to be murdered and experience untimely death then this nation itself can become extinct. It is time to address this issue. A resolution by this House should request drastic action by National Government, even if it means amendment to the Bill of Rights or Criminal Procedure Act.

Hon Speaker, the Western Cape society is in a state of lawlessness and moral decline. I therefore appeal to this House that we should look at the possibility of single-gender schools for boys and single-gender schools for girls up to Grade 8. We need more centres for abused women like the one in Saartjie Baartman. We need social workers to do regular visits at home to look at conditions there. We want minimum penalties which should be increased considerably to match the viciousness of these crimes and we should stop curtailing... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Marais, you need to wrap up, sir.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thanks, sir. We should stop curtailing the rights of churches from teaching healthy lifestyles, standards and morality and we should not take away the authority of parents over their kids. It is not the job of politicians to say how I must discipline and raise my child. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. I now recognise the Minister of Social Development, hon member Fernandez.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!
[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, hon members, guests in the gallery, fellow South Africans, I am angry. I am completely outraged at the level of gender-based violence taking place in South Africa today. To call it what it is, it is murder.

The crime statistics released this morning paint a bleak picture of just how dire the situation is. The amount of rape cases in South Africa has increased by 3.9% from the previous financial year; from 40 035 rapes in the 2017/2018 financial year, to 41 583 rapes too many. Sexual assault increased by 9.6%; attempted sexual offences increased by 3.9%; and contact sexual offences by 2.7%. 4 649 women were reported to have been raped in the Western Cape, of which 2 005 were between the ages of 0 and 9, Mr Speaker. This is an indictment; it is the shame of our nation.

Last week we witnessed approximately 20 000 protestors converging outside the National Assembly in condemnation of the ongoing violence and abuse being experienced by women in society. After years of women's cries and appeals falling on deaf ears, the President addressed the women of our nation. In the words of the President he has promised to:

- Overhaul the national register of sex offenders.

- He also highlighted that he will ask Parliament to consider the national register be made public. This will require an amendment to the Constitution.
- That there be harsher minimum sentences for gender-based violence and violence against children. The State should oppose bail for those who have raped and murdered women.

Mr P J MARAIS: Amen!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT:

- Life imprisonment for acts of rape and killing of women, where life means life with no parole.
- All gender-based violence cases that have been closed will be reopened and reviewed.
- The President promised an inter-governmental approach to providing rapid response to women in distress.
- The introduction of emergency response teams for LGBTQ and abuse against women and children.
- That rape tests kits will be available at all police stations.
- The implementation of a national plan to address gender-based violence through school programmes and the Health and Social Development Departments.
- The Minister of Finance will be asked to provide additional funding against gender-based violence.

To quote the President, he said:

“We are going to find the money.”

The President will also ask Parliament to debate the implementation of emergency interventions against gender-based violence. As a nation we wait in keen anticipation to see whether these commitments are fulfilled as no timeframes were given.

We do need all spheres of society to come together to ultimately address gender-based violence. Our nation has the legislation and institutions to support the empowerment of women; promote gender equality and oppose oppression and all forms of violence against women, yet violence is still being experienced by women on a daily basis.

Hon Speaker, for too many years there have been thousands if not millions of women in our country who have been forced to remain silent in the face of ongoing abuse and violence that they have experienced, and also witnessed in their communities on a daily basis.

However, in my honest opinion, hon Speaker, I think we have moved beyond domestic silence. The heart-breaking situation of a UCT student at the post office was just the tip of the iceberg with regards to how gender-based violence has reached a tipping point in South African society, in that it is happening in public spaces, in our malls, public toilets, schools, hospitals, Legislatures and even Government departments.

Hon Speaker, now more than ever we need to lead with purpose and intention. However, Government cannot solve this problem alone. It requires a whole of society approach that includes all role players working together.

As a government we are working transversely to deal with the scourge of gender-based violence. One such initiative is making use of weekly mortuary figures from the Provincial Department of Health to keep the Province up to date with the true nature of the situation. Although at many times these figures have been high, the public deserves honesty as this Government strives to be transparent. I would hate to think what the real numbers would read if all provinces adopted a similar approach to check in with their mortuaries every Monday morning.

Mr Speaker, I implore all role players: SAPS to social workers, to prosecutors, to take seriously the threat to women to ensure that no case get struck off the roll because a J88 has disappeared, or because a bribe has been paid.

We also need a concerted effort to deal with protection orders effectively. How many women have been killed whilst they have protection orders in place? We also need to ensure that victims are afforded the dignity and respect when they actually report cases of assault at SAPS and throughout the process.

A key contributor to the scourge of violence being experienced across our communities, is that of substance and alcohol abuse. The vast majority of lawlessness being experienced in our society is a consequence of drug and alcohol-related crime.

Drug-related crime data for the Western Cape indicates an increase from 52 742 cases in 2009 to 81 344 cases, according to the crime stats released just this morning. We ought not to be scared about having conversations about re-evaluating the paling criminal justice system. At this level we certainly do need to look at the sentences imposed on perpetrators.

Hon Speaker, who would come forward with evidence of being raped or sexually abused, when they are fully aware that they would be putting themselves at far greater risk because of the likelihood of the perpetrator walking free with no bail? How do we deter the very criminals who are holding our communities at ransom, when the biggest deterrent to them committing crime, that is the possibility of one going to jail for life, is not working at all?

An HON MEMBER: Mmm.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: There is no hiding the fact, hon Speaker, that we are a broken society. Inter-generational trauma is real and the entire justice system needs an overhaul.

Hon Speaker, the responsibility does not rest on Government rolling out victim empowerment programmes and partnering with shelters. We need to start having these difficult conversations in our homes with our men, with our sons, with our grandsons; in crèches, in schools, the workplace, even in Legislatures and Government departments; because it is not only sexual assault, it is harassment, patriarchy, intimidation and bullying that too needs to be considered.

The challenges we face are huge, but not insurmountable. However, it requires a whole of society approach and to that end I must extend my sincere thanks to all stakeholders, the NGO's, councillors, CPF's, Neighbourhood Watches, SAPS, our justice community and all other stakeholders who contribute to supporting victims of gender-based violence, and ensuring that we work together to eradicate this scourge, 365 days a year.

Today I say enough is enough. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Fernandez. I know recognise hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Premier, hon members and the guests in the gallery. Like in Thomas Sankara's words, and I quote:

"I hear the roar of women's silence. I sense the rumble of their storm and feel the fury of their revolt."

I myself standing here, hon Speaker, can feel the fury of the revolt of the thousands of women who converged in front of Parliament to say *tkwanele*. [enough.]

The brazenness with which these evil men kill innocent women and children is really shocking. It is as if it is done with impunity. For this reason I support calls for the Government to impose harsher sentences for all crimes against women and children. It is now to prove to these evil men that South Africa is not a lawless state.

The President last week, as other members have said, hon Speaker, addressed the nation in which he announced additional measures to be implemented immediately to halt these atrocious crimes against women and children.

Included in these was the 11 dedicated Sexual Offences Courts that will be opened this financial year to improve conviction rates. Another was that of overhauling and modernising the national register, as said by hon members, of the gender-based violence offenders, to ensure it is effective in combatting gender-based violence, and that this register must be made public.

The President also stated that rapists and murderers of women and children should get a guaranteed life sentence, and life sentence should mean life sentence, with no possibility of bail or parole.

Hon Speaker, another important measure that was announced by the President was that of reviewing all gender-based violence cases that have been closed, or that were not properly investigated. This is important because senseless killings did not only start now. Last year, as the Minister alluded to earlier, we were shocked by high profile murder cases such as that of Karabo Mokoena, Aviwe Jam Jam, and many others.

A few years ago it was the story of Anene Booysen, as mentioned. In 2003 it was Lorna Mlosana from Khayelitsha who was raped and murdered because she was accused of spreading AIDS in the community. While many were convicted, some murderers are still walking free and were never convicted.

Hon Speaker, when we marched last week with other young people to Parliament, I was struck by a placard which read, and I quote:

“That the only thing necessary for evil men to thrive is for good men to do nothing.”

Hon Speaker, women of this country are continuously abused by men and as good men we must take full responsibility and unite to end this carnage. It starts with us here in Parliament, in councils, in all positions of authority, in all the three spheres of government. How we treat women in our offices and organisations will go a long way in changing the attitude of all men in society.

On behalf of a few good men, hon Speaker, out there, allow me to convey my heartfelt condolences to the mothers and families who lost their daughters. To the survivors we say we have heard your cries. †Sithi kwanele. [We say enough.] You are not alone and must no longer suffer in silence.

Hon Speaker, but what we cannot do today is to come here and moan and seem hopeless in the face of those women. We must be able to respond to the call of the debate and say what action must be taken.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M KAMA: The President, hon Speaker, when he addressed the nation, said, and I quote:

“We will strengthen the emergency teams at provincial level, which will bring together the police, Social Development, Health, Justice and Education, to continue providing rapid and comprehensive responses to all forms of violence against women.”

And today we must be able to say as a Parliament, that the leader of the Executive must be able to lead all the departments that I mentioned here, to compliment the call that is made by the President.

Mr Speaker, communal toilets in Khayelitsha have turned into places of sexual assaults and femicide, as they are mostly found in areas with insufficient lighting. We, at this moment, want to call on the MEC of Community Safety to work closely with and support initiatives like the Uyabona Project by the Khayelitsha Development Forum. We will also ask the Committee to give them an opportunity to present on this project.

While emphasising the call that was made earlier by hon member Bakubaku, that all Government employees in the province, in Government entities, those in the EPWP's, be screened, so that we can identify those who are sexual offenders and perpetrators of gender-based violence, because Government cannot be represented by people who, in the face of the people, are perpetrators of such crimes.

Hon Speaker, what we are dealing with is not just a policing issue as some are suggesting. We are dealing with a societal problem. It is a deadly problem of men's violence against women and children. Any strategy to respond to this issue should place at the centre community involvement. The biggest challenge on the struggle against gender-based violence is that many of these cases are not reported.

In some instances, hon Speaker, they are not reported because the victims are abused by breadwinners at home, who put food on the table and do everything for the family. This makes it difficult for them because they know that the first people who will defend these perpetrators are their parents. They are also going to be defended by the communities because of their social status in the communities.

It is for this reason that we, as the ANC, support the call that our communities need to be active participants in this. Hon Speaker, the President took the nation into confidence when he said we will ask the Minister of Finance to allocate additional funding to the National machinery to coordinate our campaign against gender-based violence.

As we are approaching the period of Budget amendments, and we agree with the Deputy President. Must I ... [Interjections.]

†USOMLOMO: Hayi gqhibezela.
[The SPEAKER: Please finish up.]

†Mr M KAMA: Ndiyagqhibezela. [I am concluding]. We agree with the Deputy President in the NCOP when he said the Premier of the Western Cape is a good man, and we are saying he is a good man.

Now as a good man there is nothing that is stopping him from also complementing what the President is saying and finding money to ensure that in the province ... [Interjections.]

†USOMLOMO: Siyabulela.
[The SPEAKER: We thank you.]

Mr M KAMA: ... these initiatives are supported. Thank you, hon Speaker.
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. †Siyabulela [We thank you.] hon Kama.

Now I recognise the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport, hon Minister Marais.

The MINISTER FOR CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

†Agb Speaker, die land fokus elke jaar in Augustus op spesifieke gebiede wat 'n rede tot kommer vir vroue en meisies is. Dit is geen geheim dat Vrouemaand 2019 nie 'n viering was nie, en dat die nadelige gevolge van geslagsgebaseerde geweld en vrouemoorde media beriggewing oorheers het.

Duisende het in die openbaar betoog teen die patriargale ideologie wat vrouens en meisies onderdruk in die grondwetlike demokrasie in Suid-Afrika.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Hon Speaker, the country focusses every year in August on specific areas that are a reason for concern to women and girls. It is no secret that Women's Month 2019 was not a celebration, and that the detrimental consequences of gender-based violence and women's murders have dominated media reporting. Thousands have demonstrated in public against the patriarchal ideology that suppresses women and girls in the constitutional democracy in South Africa.]

†Mr Speaker, contrary to popular belief, gender discrimination is not a women's issue to be engaged on by women only, but it is a global problem and closer to home, a South African dilemma, which requires us all, particularly men, to do better because sadly men are more likely to listen to men.

It is pivotal to urgently unite in challenging, dismantling and transforming the systematic, institutional and ideological patriarchy that still oppresses women and the girl child as it is literally a matter of life or death.

A paradigm shift and a call to action is much needed. What we are experiencing now is the symptoms of a long erupting crisis. However, the cause is the root problem which urgently requires a whole of society approach to holistically tackle the patriarchal structures perpetuating systematic gender discrimination and inequalities which is still institutionally accepted, maintained and mainstreamed long after emancipation and 25 years into our legitimate democracy.

The reality is women live in a constant state of fear, in an unsafe warzone, killed, raped, assaulted, insulted, avoided and stigmatised day in and day out. It is no wonder we feel, think and now finally ask out loud, "Am I next?" It is now a blessing to make it home in one piece after surviving the abundance of traumatic experiences lived through as a woman imposed upon us, and particularly so by men.

Mr Speaker, the truth of the matter is we live in a society where doing what is morally right is considered weak, because if you live in a world of scoundrels and delinquency, you take pride in wrongdoing, misconduct and antisocial behaviour as it is all you know.

However, I refuse to be defeated by the *status quo* because I have witnessed first-hand time and again how through sport, arts and cultural affairs lives are completely turned around, from at risk, to filled with potential, as behavioural change is the foundation.

Yet and still this alternate is second to a life of crime, devastating choices made as a result of hegemonic conditioning in not questioning the way things are, such as the existing rape culture, culpable patriarchy, over-sexism and female abuse by the minute.

Most striking about the responses to the protest against gender-based violence and femicide, is the oblivious; what can we do? What can I do?

Mr Speaker, in reply I would suggest you contact the Clifford Martinus's, the Bongani Mathiso's, the Ricky de Reuck's, the Sergio van der Ross's, the Nigel Savel's, the Shaquile Southgate's, the Emile Jansen's and the Ernesto Love's and likeminded partners in our communities. These men, all in the gallery today, would be happy to involve you in their behavioural change programmes; radically shifting mind-sets from fatal destruction to hope-inspired, self-empowerment, community upliftment through understanding our contextual framework and offering alternative lifestyles in safe spaces, capacitating those we serve in our most vulnerable communities.

†Mnr Clifford Martinus en Bongani Mathiso - right up there in the gallery - in samewerking met formidabele vroue, soos Anthea Martinus, bestuur die Oasis Place, Linking Lives Together organisasies in Philippi, wat in die omgewing van Parkwood, Lotus Rivier en Grassy Park, en selfs so ver as tot by Bredasdorp en Swellendam, ondersteuning lewer aan jeug in areas waar bendegegeweld hoogty vier. Hulle is nasionaal aktief betrokke en werk saam met gewaardeerde internasionale vennote met die bestuur van die Wêreldbeker Sokkertoernooi vir hawelose mense.

Straatsokker word gebruik om lewensvaardighede aan te leer en afrigting, mentorskap en versorging is maar 'n paar van die dienste wat beskikbaar gestel word om hierdie individue te help om beter weergawes te word van die mans in hulle gemeenskappe wat die spoor byster geraak het.

Ricky de Reuck en Sergio van der Ross, ook in die galery, het gemeenskaplike doelstellings en verskeie suksesverhale om te vertel en bedryf die YMCA Cape Flats organisasie saam met sy Natalie.

YMCA Cape Flats, sentraal geleë in Strandfontein en Mitchells Plein, bied selfbemagtigingsprogramme deur onder andere sokker, kadette, geakkrediteerde vaardigheidskursusse, bewusmakingsveldtogte en jeugkampe, en skep 'n veilige ontspanningsruimte om kwesbare jeug die geleenthede te bied wat nodig is om positiewe agente vir verandering te word.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr Clifford Martinus and Bongani Mathiso - right up there in the gallery - in cooperation with formidable women such as Anthea Martinus, manage the Oasis Place; Linking Lives Together organisations in Philippi provide support to youth in areas where gang violence is rife, in the vicinity of Parkwood, Lotus River and Grassy Park, and even as far as Bredasdorp and Swellendam. They are active nationally and cooperating with valued international partners, work with the management of the Homeless World Cup Soccer tournament.

Street soccer is used to learn life skills, and coaching, mentorship and care is but a few of the services made available to help these individuals to become better versions of the men in their communities that have gone off the track.

Ricky de Reuck and Sergio van der Ross, also in the gallery, have common goals and have several success stories to tell and run the YMCA Cape Flats organisation along with his Natalie.

YMCA Cape Flats, centrally situated in Strandfontein and Mitchells Plain, offers self empowerment programmes through amongst others soccer, cadets, accredited skills courses, awareness campaigns and youth camps, and creates a safe recreational space to offer vulnerable youth the opportunities that are necessary to become positive agents for change.】

Around the corner and co-founded by Nigel Savel – also in the gallery – and his equally determined wife, Sher’neil Savel, is the 9 Miles Project: Going The Distance. Based at Strandfontein Pavilion, boasting the biggest tidal pool in the Southern Hemisphere, and now fully established in Elands Bay and St Francis Bay. Proactively engaging surrounding communities, the 9 Miles Project envisions a transformed society where created opportunities are maximised and our youth in coastal informal settlements are effectively developed, empowered and integrated into their communities and society through surfing and swimming, while making provision for economic development through the acquired crafts.

Mr Speaker, Mr Emile Jansen, who is also our National Book Week ambassador, right in front of me in the gallery, and Shaquile Southgate, live the Heal the Hood brand. The Heal the Hood Project was created in 1998 by Emile Jansen of Black Noise, one of South Africa’s pioneering rap groups. The focus of the organisation came about by the realisation of the importance of the interaction between various communities and ploughing back into our communities.

Emile then included all the community outreach projects he was initiating in Black Noise as part of Heal the Hood Project, and thus expanding the concept of putting back. The Each One Teach One methodology, coupled with Do For Self Concerts and principles, helped lay the foundation for this.

They have come a long way in providing holistic youth activities; information that addresses community issues and creates a sense of self-worth to help them become active participants in a democratic society, while creating a sustainable network of youth artists nationally and internationally, through which jobs and new skills are created; art products and arts-related information can be distributed.

Mr Speaker, Mr Ernesto Love is the epitome of once you get out, positively give back. He is unfortunately not here this afternoon. Equipped with his own lived experience with incarceration, traumatic realities and world rehabilitation, Ernesto Love drives constructive youth development programmes creating awareness and shaping perception through sport participation, advocacy and mentorship with prisoners as they confront their transgressions, understand its destructive nature and seek behavioural change mechanisms to the benefit of a healthy society.

The gold thread dovetailing these organisations is their vision to disrupt the *status quo* through arts, cultural affairs and sport, while creating economic opportunities to render at risk brings an asset to upliftment, empowerment and reconciliation of our vulnerable communities to augment its sense of safety, belonging and pride.

These organisations serve as dispatchers from the front line. Mr Speaker, if only our now plundered National coffers allowed, as a province we would be able to invest more in our arts, cultural affairs and sport. As our Chief Cultural Director, Mr Guy Redman, always reminds:

“We would not have a public outcry for the army if we simply deployed a well-resourced Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport.”

†Agb Speaker, gesamentlike pogings moet aangewend word om die huidige en toekomstige geslagte toe te rus met die vermoë om empatie te betoon, te verbeel en te skep, en die sleutel om hierdie vermoëns te ontwikkel ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Hon Speaker, joint efforts should be applied to empower the present and future generations with the ability to show empathy, to imagine and to create, and the key to develop these abilities ... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: I will request the hon Minister to wrap up.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: ... is 'n lewenslange opvoeding.

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ... is a life-long education.]

We pledge our support to the protest against gender-based violence and femicide. We are in mourning for all women who did not get a chance to achieve all they dreamed of. We will never forget because, as Chimamanda Adichie reminds, and I quote:

“Feminism is a radical idea that women’s safety is more important than men’s feelings.”

While great strides have been made to empower women, a serious cause for concern is who is preparing men for these empowered women.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister Marais. I now recognise the Minister of Community Safety, hon Minister Fritz.

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Baie dankie, agb Speaker, Enkosi Somlomo. [Gelag.] Baie dankie, agb Speaker.

[Translation of Afrikaans/isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Speaker, Thank you Speaker. [Laughter.] Thank you, hon Speaker.] Thank you very much.

†USOMLOMO: Wamkelekile Mphathiswa.

[The SPEAKER: You are welcome hon Minister.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I notice hon Minister Marais spoke in English so I am a bit confused, but †ek sal maar die Afrikaans praat vir die [I will rather speak the Afrikaans for the] hon member Marais. I am talking about that Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: I wanted you to understand. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Okay, thank you. I want to start off this afternoon, on behalf of the Government, but also on behalf of all men, hon Speaker and hon member Marais, I want to extend my sympathy to the grandmother and the lady – just also wave – yes, the grandmother of one of the victims – but also to all the other grandmothers and mothers of all victims who had their children taken away early by us men. Not by some foreign people from the moon or from Mars, but from us here on earth in this society; here where you can feel me – I am not a ghost, you can touch me – and I want to say that, hon Speaker, because we tend to say there, we tend to want to say there, the Government, something that you cannot see.

We are the men who are responsible for it, and today I want to say let us acknowledge and admit and say we are – even in our subtleties we do not even realise sometimes the way we speak to some of our women colleagues and the way we speak at home; that we have some kind of power relations, and I want to today apologise publicly to all the people in the public gallery, to the nation, to the province and say we are sorry as men, and we want to start with us.

I think hon member Bakubaku-Vos emphasised that we must start in this Parliament, but I also want to speak to all of us, when we talk about it, because we were elected by the people, we have a responsibility that we make sure that the people, as many of us, hon Speaker, are safe. That as Government – and I think our Premier did say to the hon EFF, the Premier did say that he will really start looking at a number of the basics, hon Speaker; the basics in what we as Government can do to get it right.

And so let me start with some of those examples where we talk about getting the basics right, because I think some of our members and I want to say the hon members, I really want to also say thank you, and this is not my debate, but I want to thank all the hon members for first, for one of those few times in our House where we do not point fingers at each other; where we embrace each other; where we see the seriousness and where we want to say come, we all collaboratively work and we solve the problem.

I am serious when I say let us embrace all our members for this collaborative approach forward; for this united front to our public that elected us to move forward.

And so it is important we ask what is it this Government is starting to do, and how are we going to roll out all those programmes that I think many of our departments have already started, and I can just talk a lot about one programme that I know very well, because I started the programme when I was in another portfolio.

We did not just do it as Government, we asked youth what is it that they wanted, and they came to us and they said they wanted safe spaces where all of them, as women and as men, by the way, and as men, where all of them can feel safe and if I have a problem in that space, then I can go into a particular room called the chill room, I can go to the chill room and when I am in that chill room, other people, professionals in that space, will know that I need some kind of intervention; some kind of socio-psycho, psycho-socio intervention. Those were called Youth Cafés, and it is still Youth Cafés and I want to say it is going quite well.

But I also want to just caution – and I am not pointing fingers; I am so careful to point fingers and to blame – that the call today for more shelters and for more drug rehabilitation centres, we must just remember that as a government we are in this very-very tight corner and the context, I just want to say – and I am not pointing – I really want to say how do we go past it. We are in a really tight budgetary financial situation and I like what the Minister of Finance, David Maynier, says all the time, and you will notice “I massage very-very clearly” but the Minister and the Premier are saying, “Guys, let us see how are we going to get around the problem.” We are not going to say that is the problem. There is the wall, how are we going to climb over the wall and get past the problem, and assist where we really can? And specifically as it pertains to gender-based violence, and so it is a very-very important point because I want to start off with my dear colleague, Bakubaku-Vos – I like the way she says the surname – where she says that we must start vetting our employees.

Now I really want to say to the hon member, in this province every single member, every member of this Government is vetted and I am talking about every staff member, and in fact we are just busy with – I know there were some ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And the Post Office?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... interviews. I am coming to your Post Office now; do not worry, I will come to the National Post Office now, which belongs to your Government.

Every single one is vetted and people do not get appointed without vetting. I want to emphasise what you and hon member Kama are saying about the vetting. Hon member Kama takes it further and he says we must also vet the Extended Public Works people in our employ, and the public, the community works people.

That is an important point, because it is in that space where people are still not vetted and we must actually look at that, so that is a very-very important proposal.

You know, in France they can roll out a thousand soldiers because they are a very-very rich and First World country. I think we must try as far as possible to make every home a safe home in our communities. We must make every place a shelter for safety, and it may not be the house three doors away, but it may be my house where I can invite that woman who I see in the road, and invite her in and try and get Social Services to assist me in keeping that woman safe, and so I think it is an important point.

I also need to say that I find it completely incomprehensible how someone can be employed – because we are in Government, I do not know, perhaps the Post Office is a kind of parastatal, but I cannot see how anyone can be employed without proper vetting.

I want to go to the second point or theme that came out of all the discussions this afternoon, hon Speaker, and that is that the criminal justice system must be fixed. The criminal justice system, starting from the arrest of the person and in fact not even starting from the arrest, starting with how do we get people arrested? Because we know many a times we inform the police of a perpetrator or some person who is accused, who is just walking around, a suspect; how do we get him arrested?

And I want to say to this House today one of the issues from where we are assisting the police and we need to correct, hon members Lekker and Sayed, we need to correct the way we get our Community Police Forums right. We must continue and we must emphasise that these elections coming off must happen – from September. It must – yes, you can look at each other; it must happen, you can have your summit, it will happen, and, hon Speaker, we must get our basics right. Community Police Forums, Neighbourhood Watches must be corrected so that they can assist the police in getting those perpetrators arrested.

When they are arrested we must have properly trained detectives and you have seen my statistics about the detectives, the state of detectives. We must have proper crime detectives that do not leave part of the evidence on the floor – of the girl in Heyns Park, you know, Maleka, who was just left there.

An HON MEMBER: Janika.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Janika, yes, who was just left – and to that end we amalgamate with the hon member Reagen Allen and hon member Kama and I know hon members in the back, very-very powerful members in that committee – and member Christians – we must get that right.

They must assist us in getting the police to do it right by our oversight, but also the Departments' oversight, to get that right, because I think that was what the hon member Brett Herron said.

That it is okay to have these little pamphlets about domestic violence but when you get to a police station you are just dismissed as a woman and chased away. We must stop the nonsense, hon Speaker, and we must get our basics right. Then I think a lot of our problems will be solved.

The problem in South Africa is the basics are not done right. †Ons wil al die mooi goed doen; ons wil vlaggies hang [We want to do all the nice things; we want to hang little flags] – we want to march and have human chains right to Sir Lowry's Pass. Get the basics right when you walk into a police station.

To that end again I want to say we want to get those rape kits at every police station; we want those centres that the lady with the ANC cap there at the top works in, one of those – I do not know, but she is not a captain, hey? I hope she is not the police captain, but the lady in the Support Centre, in the Support Room at the police station. We must get it right, and we must also train our ladies who work in that group. They are the people who are the first to be met, who give the empathy and make the women feel at home if they are feeling bad.

But I also want to say, hon members, that when it goes from there and when the docket is handed to the prosecuting authority, hon member Bakubaku-Vos, when it is handed to the prosecuting authority, the docket must stand the test of a trial. It must be able to convict the person, the accused. It is no use we rush things and then we cannot get convictions. We must get a conviction, and the broader criminal justice system – including Social Development, the probation officer; including everyone - must work to make sure that we get and secure a conviction, and so when they are in court; when the magistrate sees it, he will then have no option, because you do not interfere with the independence of the magistrate, but he will have no option if the evidence is so supportive ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you need to wrap up.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That cannot be, sir, I have 12 minutes, hon Speaker. This is five minutes. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] I think your watch is wrong. [Interjections.]

But, you know, a point I really want to make, hon Speaker, is that criminal justice includes the prison system.

Now if they do not start, if they do not do proper rehabilitation, if rehabilitation is not happening in our Correctional Services, we can forget that those people coming out will be so violated also because they get raped inside. They come out and ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and it will just cause more problems.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I thank the House, I thank the Speaker for taking my time away. Very-very thank you. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: I need to address this. Hon Minister Fritz, your time – I need to address you on that question. Your time was 12 minutes and I gave you 12 minutes two seconds. [Interjections.] So you owe the Speaker time.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Generous!

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Very generous, Mr Speaker. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: I now recognise the Leader of the Opposition, hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Hon Premier, members of this House, and especially our guests; those families that are here today representing victims who have fallen in the last weeks, and also organisations representing, for instance, the Women's League and the Young Women's Desk, and all organisations that have come today – the Gender Commission, Human Rights Commission, thank you very-very much for joining this debate which has been sponsored by the Chief Whip of the African National Congress, hon member Pat Lekker.

Mr Speaker, just to say that we have decided to bring this debate to the Legislature today not only to tap into the collective wisdom of all the members and parties represented here today, and I think we have seen that today. From the Leader of the House, hon member Madikizela, to all of the speakers; I think there has clearly been the demonstration of a commitment to work together across political lines to actually deal with this issue.

But we have not only brought this debate to the House to pay our deepest condolences to all those families who have lost loved ones due to vicious assaults, murders and rapes, but, Mr Speaker, we have also brought this debate to the House today to actually make a very genuine attempt across party-political lines to work together to end the scourge of gender-based violence.

So for us, Mr Speaker, hon Premier, this is not an ordinary debate and you will see when we explain the fact that we will be moving a motion later on this afternoon, is that we want to actually keep the momentum going; we want to keep the focus on this particular matter because we all know a society safer for women and young girls is a society safer for all of us.

So in the motion that we will move later we are trying to commit all of us so that we do not just simply react to the terrible tragedies of Uyinene and others, but that we show the seriousness that we have to continue in a sustainable way. It is clear that our communities over the last number of weeks have expressed their anger; they have expressed their outrage at the ongoing murders of women and young girls, and clearly the call out there is that enough is enough.

I think it is clear that we need to heed this call and do absolutely everything in our power, Mr Speaker, to stop this violence that destroys the future of so many, but I also think the speakers today have said, in very measured ways, that we have to avoid the temptation to believe that there are actually quick-fix solutions to this problem, and I think very significantly - and I hope that this represents a new era in the history of this Legislature – it is very easy to begin to blame and complain, and that does not actually bring us anywhere.

It does not mean that if we have an issue with the Premier or have an issue with the President we do not raise those issues, but our approach to this matter is a genuine attempt to find solutions. This is a battle that does not have quick-fix solutions, it is going to need our involvement as members each and every day, but we must have accountability and us as members of this House also have a responsibility as oversight to look at the budgets that we have allocated to deal with these particular issues.

In our province we note that the crime stats today for instance reveal that seven out of the 10 police stations where murder is at its worse, are actually from our province, and if we look at those communities: Delft, Mitchells Plain, Nyanga, Philippi, those are communities where poverty, inequality and unemployment are at their worst.

So that means that we need an integrated approach led by the President and yes, led by the Premier in this province, to bring all of our departments together to specifically focus on those communities, because as we are able to deal with unemployment and as we are able to deal with poverty, we begin to create hope for our communities and especially our young men and our young women.

So these are the realities that we need to focus on, and that is why, Mr Speaker, I have, as Leader of the Opposition, with the support of our ANC caucus, engaged yourself and the leaders of all political parties represented in this House – the only party that we were not able to engage is hon member De Jager from Al Jama-ah, who was busy today, but every single party that we have engaged have indicated support for the motion that we are going to table later on today, which would indicate the continued commitment to work together to solve this problem.

So in fact what we are trying to do today, hon members, is to establish a new tradition in this House, so that we do not only come here, engage in debates and discussions, but we actually take resolutions which commit us to certain practical steps to support the communities we serve and that we also represent in resolving the challenges that we face.

Our job, as MPLs, is to play an oversight role in regard to the members of the Provincial Cabinet and the departments that they lead, and we do this through our Standing Committees, through our constituency work and also the deliberations on documents such as Annual Performance Plans. But we should never forget that the Constitution to which we have sworn allegiance and made an affirmation to, also requires of us to work cooperatively across all spheres of government, and unless national, provincial and the local spheres are working together with our communities, we are not going to get on top of this issue.

So, Mr Speaker, hon members and members of the gallery, the motion that we are going to table later this afternoon is to the following effect: that this House, noting the ongoing gender-based violence in our province and nationally, and having taken note of the matters raised during the debate this afternoon, and believing that it is critical that this House is fully briefed on all national, provincial and local initiatives underway in this province to prevent such violence and support the victims, resolves to request the Speaker to constitute a multi-party committee which will plan an inclusive meeting by the end of October, where all spheres of government, NGO's, community-based organisations, women's organisations and relevant stakeholders will be invited to share progress and challenges with the aim of ensuring ongoing momentum in the campaign to end gender-based violence and femicide.

So by proposing a motion like that and getting the support of all political parties, we think that we are setting a new tradition in this House to begin to mobilise around, in this case, one particular issue that unites all of us, across party, across race, across gender, across religion.

We know that there has been a national summit in 2018 convened by the President, where our province and many stakeholders were present as well. A declaration was adopted, but I think as our President tells us to now †kahulesa [hurry up], to speed up, that is what our people expect from us. They expect all of us as MPs, as MECs, as the Premier, as our President, to show the willingness to †kahulesa [hurry up], to speed up and to actually bring programmes which are going to make a difference.

I welcome the views of all, especially the males of this House, who have indicated a personal commitment to get involved in this. I think there is work that we can do in our schools, in our curriculum, and we have looked, for instance, at certain programmes, such as ones conducted ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... in Kenya ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... you need to wrap up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... which is "No means No". We need to find those examples of programmes which help to change the behaviour of young men and women.

So let us see today as a start and let us commit in October to coming back to find lasting solutions by working together. Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Leader of the Opposition. Thank you, hon members. That concludes this debate, and thank you to the spirit that ensued in dealing with this matter, a very important matter before us.

[Debate concluded.]

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, as we have heard today the teaching of the values of entrepreneurship and coding for girls in education is more important now than ever.

The alarming 55% unemployment rate in South Africa means that we need to do more in our pursuit to educate and prepare young people for the world of work and the future of employment. This means that we need to shift our thinking and our approach to the values we teach young people.

An opportunity exists to embed entrepreneurship and the teaching of the values of entrepreneurship into our primary and high schools. This will go a long way in ensuring that the growing youth population have a better arsenal of skills to enable them to either be more employable or to start their own enterprises.

Entrepreneurship programmes in schools can be the engine fuelling innovative employment generation and economic growth in our province. Only by creating an environment where entrepreneurs can prosper and where entrepreneurs can try new ideas and empower others can we ensure that many of the world's problems will not go unaddressed and can be solved in the Western Cape.

The roles that young girls can play is significant as we are one of the few provinces on the continent that is starting to see female tech entrepreneurs emerge.

We are seeing through programmes such as Girl Code – a club using volunteers to lead weekend coding clubs for high school girls, who want to have strong foundation skills in basic programming. Girls are able to learn the personal values of entrepreneurship, values such as honesty, passion, determination. These are the values that need to be embedded into our current teaching of entrepreneurship education in schools. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. I see the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The World Economic Forum Africa, here in Cape Town last week was informed that “gender inequality has been found to be costly on a macro level”. The United National Development Programme estimates that the failure to integrate women into national economies costs sub-Saharan African countries a combined R1,4 trillion in lost productivity every year.

Whilst this House has continued its normal business to engage with women issues through debates, motions, statements and the likes, the killing of children, teenagers and young women continues unabated.

It has been concluded widely through economic costing literature that “the whole of society pays for the costs of not addressing violence against women: it is not a private matter”. If this Provincial Government is prepared to pull out all the stops in its economic growth efforts, even against the national economy constraints, the same is warranted in drawing down female killings right on our shores.

KPMG on the “economic cost of GBV in SA” reminds us that “GBV is a breach of socio-economic rights of women as enshrined in the Constitution of this country.” If so, as members of this Parliament, both individually and collectively we are liable if this scourge continues in our midst.

The social and security cluster can tell us of the direct, or tangible costs incurred in response to each case of GBV. Families, communities, where both victims and perpetrators hail from, have not been heard of their indirect, or intangible costs of their agony and emotional distress. The opportunity cost as a loss of monetary value to the families and their endowments are still to be revealed, including the loss of human capital to the economy of the lives lost to GBV.

In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, it is no surprise that Cape Town has again recorded in the top 10 of murder capitals in the country, with many of our townships from the Cape Flats. The socio-economic conundrum of the Cape Flats Planning District as presented by the MERO of 2018, reports that the economic decline from this particular planning district moved from 6% to 0,2% between 2007 and 2019.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off please.

Mr N D NKONDLO: Thus, Mniki-Mangalise said “We cannot continue with business as usual, as if it is possible to discuss ease of doing business in South Africa and the Western Cape when half the population is frozen in fear.” Thank you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters condemns the unbecoming and criminal acts of xenophobia reported in various areas of Cape Town including Samora Machel Township. The cause for these attacks is based on the misconceptions that fellow African brothers and sisters are the main cause of crime and the shortages of jobs in the country, amongst other things.

The Economic Freedom Fighters note these attacks as evidence of the failure of Government to provide basic necessities to its people and equally distribute resources and services such that they are attacking each other. The attacks are also evidence of how wounded we are as a black nation and the direct result of the move for reconciliation instead of justice and the failure of Government post-1994 to facilitate dialogues around race, identity and diversity.

South Africans are still at a stage where whites foreigners are treated as tourists and investors and black foreigners are called *kwerekweres* and made to feel like they do not belong. It will be xenophobia today, *gatvol* Capetonians and the DA saying all black people must go back to the Eastern Cape tomorrow and it will be some other reason the next day.

The silence of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament Cabinet gives an impression that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament truly believes the DA's stance that "black people are refugees in the Western Cape and are putting pressure on the Province's resources" and that this stance applies to non-South African blacks as well.

The EFF's condemnation of the xenophobic attacks is in no way brushing off some of the genuine concerns of our people around drugs peddling, human trafficking, fraud, hijacking of buildings, etcetera, but is a call for the Western Cape Government to take centre stage and do its job, so that our people do not continue killing each other while fighting over crumbs.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. I see the DA. Are you rising on a point of order?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I am rising on a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The member is misleading the House. The DA has never said that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister, there will be an opportunity to respond later if you so wish. I see the DA.

Ms D BAARTMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I hope the DA would not say that. I am originally from Port Elizabeth, so I will be in trouble. Fellow South Africans, the Special Appropriations Bill was introduced and tabled by the Minister of Finance, Mr Tito Mboweni, on 23 July 2019 in the National Assembly.

Section 1 of the Bill specifically aims to appropriate an amount of R59 billion out of the National Revenue Fund for the Department of Public Enterprises in order to assist Eskom with its financial obligations; R26 billion is for the 2019/2020 financial year; and R33 billion is for the 2020/2021 financial year.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on that note, yesterday in the National Assembly we heard that it is actually R69 billion that Eskom is going to need over three years, and we were told in the beginning of the year, it is R59 billion. That is not including the Special Appropriations amount of R26 billion and R33 billion. So the Minister of Finance needs to tell us, is it R59 billion or is it R69 billion, because divided by 9, that might mean that the Western Cape would have to give an additional R7 billion, on top of the R13 billion, if we had to cut our budget. Which one is it? [Interjections.]

In terms of the briefing that the Director-General gave, they said that Eskom is using the money because of a ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms D BAARTMAN: ... "debt reliant liquidity situation" [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms D BAARTMAN: South Africa needs affordable electricity for all, hon Deputy Speaker. We thus welcome the City of Cape Town, Mayor Plato's announcement that despite ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Members.

Ms D BAARTMAN: ... NERSA wanting the City to pay Eskom 15,6% more to purchase bulk electricity, the City will only be increasing their tariffs by 8,8%. Energy efficient savings mechanisms such as ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, members.

Ms D BAARTMAN: ... energy saving streetlights have assisted in keeping the increase lower than the National Government's increases. The National Minister of Finance has released lately a growth strategy document, stating that the state should encourage competition with existing state monopolies. We call upon the National Ministers of Finance, Energy and Public Enterprises to urgently commence the restructuring of Eskom as we cannot allow Eskom to continue bankrupting our province. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Two weeks ago we, as the ACDP on a national, provincial and local level mentioned that our Christian brother, Dr Jacques de Vos is being persecuted by the Health Professions Council of South Africa for his views on pro-life. Dr De Vos is facing a disciplinary inquiry for protecting the life of the unborn child. A petition was signed by hundreds of thousands of Christians if not millions by now, to demand the immediate reinstatement of Dr De Vos.

The hearing would have been held on 3 and 4 October 2019 but now we heard that the Chairperson is no longer available, and we also heard that the Prosecutor for the Medical Council did not furnish the necessary documentation to the defence team of Dr De Vos, has failed to do so. We now hear that the hearing is scheduled for 28, 29 and 30 October 2019. As the ACDP we encourage Christians to attend the hearing in their thousands to show the Health Professional Council an injury to one is an injury to all.

We as the ACDP wholeheartedly support Dr De Vos for taking a stance, for advancing the voice of the voiceless, meaning the unborn child. As the ACDP we ask the Health Professional Council to stop persecuting our Christian brother Dr Vos for his pro-life views and reinstate him immediately. I thank you.

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, Matric is one of the most important but underrated ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I cannot hear, hon members.

Ms L J BOTHA: Okay, okay. †Ek praat nou. Rus. [I'm speaking now. Rest.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can continue.

Ms L J BOTHA: Matric is one of the most important but underrated certificates an individual can have. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

Ms L J BOTHA: It is the key document that can assist you to secure many things in life. [Interjections.] In the professional field, it is the minimum requirement to get a job. The majority of vacancies demand a matric certificate and without it, opportunities for employment become more and more uncertain.

We often neglect the driving forces behind matric exams – our teachers. The effort by teachers is all year round until the very end when the pens are laid on the table after learners' write the final National Senior Certificate papers. And then they face the critiques on the results and have to kickstart the whole process towards improvement once again to ensure every learner has this underrated certificate.

I would also like to pay tribute to the support staff of the WCED in the exam office. In our last Standing Committee meeting it became evident just how much effort this preparation entails. I would also like to thank parents for their involvement in this process and in communities who oversee this process. These individuals play vital roles in our learners' futures. The Provincial Education Department is ready to conduct these credible examinations. All critical processes have been completed and the Provincial Department of Education is only waiting for the commencement dates of the examinations. The DA would like to take this time to extend their best wishes to all candidates writing their final matric examinations. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the EFF? Freedom Front Plus. Oh, Freedom Front Plus first. Hon Marais, are you doing a statement?

Mr P J MARAIS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No? Okay.

Mr P J MARAIS: I do not have a caucus to ask questions to my Ministers. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see Al Jama-ah is also not here and then I see finally the DA. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, you have got one in caucus.

Ms W F PHILANDER (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, members of this House, we are sick and tired. We have had more than enough of the trampling upon our human rights as set out in the Constitution of this country. We have reached the one year anniversary of the Presidential Summit on Gender Based Violence, where the President acknowledged how the gross human rights violations are tearing communities apart. Mr President, did you forget?

The array of promises and plans has not surfaced. Meanwhile on a daily basis, we see, and we feel the pain, the desperate outcries, the absolute hopelessness, the hurt and the pain in the eyes of our mothers and our daughters. Straight talk, Mr President. Why are you neglecting the fact that 1 out of 5 women in this country ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W F PHILANDER: ...has experienced physical violence? [Interjections.] We are sick and we are tired of your ignorance. The only conclusion can be ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjections.]

Ms W F PHILANDER: ... that it does not affect you, not for a day in your life! We cry, we scream, we march, night vigils, we have reached a point of no return. What more must we do if a government ignores the outcry ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. [Interjections.] Hon member Smith.

Ms W F PHILANDER: You have got the purse. †Niemand is so blind soos dié wat nie wil sien nie! [Tussenwerpsels.] [No one is as blind as those who do not want to see! [Interjections.]] What more must we do if a government ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F PHILANDER: ...ignores the outcry of the mothers across the length and the breadth of our country. What more must we do? More importantly, what have we done?

In the rural part of our country, often the forgotten ones, the Eden Karoo region alone saw a 400% change in reported cases of violence against children under the age of 18. In Paarl East attempts increased with 250%. What does that tell you? We are nowhere near the end. With one voice, we the women, mothers across our diverse nation ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjection.]

Ms W F PHILANDER: ...we are singing at the top of our lungs †“Senzeni Na, Senzeni Na” [“What have we done, what have we done”] Mr President, what have we done?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr W F PHILANDER: In South Africa levels of femicide are five times higher than the global ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member your time is up.

Ms W F PHILANDER: We are sick and tired, Mr President. With fear in our eyes we are asking, who is next? Am I next?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Is there a Minister? [Interjections.] Hon members, can we have some order please? Is there a Minister that may want to respond in terms of the Standing Rule 145.6?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see Minister Madikizela. [Interjections.] Can I have some order please?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, Madam Deputy Speaker. Madam Deputy Speaker, this is a very ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we have order please?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: This is a very serious issue that I want to respond to that was raised by the EFF because as we all know that our country is under siege. Now, I want to address three elements in what the hon member of the EFF said.

The first thing that I want to talk about is that, as the Democratic Alliance, we have strongly condemned violent action against people from other countries but also against fellow South Africans. The hypocrisy that I often hear from many leaders is quite shocking, because South Africans are seen as perpetrators of violence and yet, if you look at the stats that are before us, Madam Deputy Speaker, as of 10th of September there are 12 people who lost their lives in this violence and only two are from other countries. 10 are South Africans.

And yet it is quite shocking when you hear leaders becoming populist and not saying these things as they are. It cannot be condoned. Violence against people of other countries and also South Africans – we cannot condone that. That is the first thing.

An HON MEMBER: My turn.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The second thing that I want to talk about is that the EFF has been talking about open borders. Now, let me be clear. We are a country with rules and laws, and we are a constitutional democracy where the laws must be respected. If I go to Nigeria, I cannot tell you the laws that I must – they even want to know how much I have in my bank account! Now, that is a fact. [Interjections.]

Now, we want everyone who comes to South Africa to do the same. It cannot be that South Africa can be a “free for all” when we are expected to follow laws when we go to other countries. That can never be. So that is why we are saying, anyone who comes to South Africa is welcome to come, provided that those individuals follow the laws of this country.

Now if you want open borders, win the elections and then open the borders, but unfortunately, currently we have laws under this government! You will only make your own laws once you win the election and then open the borders. You cannot then want to have your own rules when we have the law and the Constitution of this country, because you are actually advocating for people to break the law and the Constitution of South Africa. We just cannot have that.

The last thing that I want to say, hon Deputy Speaker is that we must say things as they are. We must condemn the illegal activities that many foreign nationals are conducting in South Africa, including South Africans by the way, but the arrogance with which these illegal activities are conducted – there are places that are notorious for these illegal activities conducted by known foreign nationals.

Nigerians are known for being drug dealers, turning our kids into zombies. They are known for trafficking. They are known for turning our sisters into prostitutes. That can never be. We cannot have a situation where we give away the sovereignty of our country to people who come here and break our laws and then we must say, that is okay. It can never be.

Therefore we are saying people who come here legally must be protected, but people who do not respect our laws, the law must take its course and we must make sure that we condemn violence on both sides. It must not be one-sided. Thank you.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

TRUCK DRIVERS VIOLENCE ATTACKS ON

(Notice of Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the effects of violent attacks on truck drivers in the Western Cape which have gripped the province in recent weeks; further that this House debates the impact of such acts of criminality on the Western Cape’s economy. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the effects of violent attacks on truck drivers in the Western Cape, which have gripped the province in recent weeks, and the impact of such acts of criminality on the Western Cape's economy.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

GEORGE MUNICIPALITY: INVESTIGATION

(Notice of Motion)

Mr D SMITH: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes that MEC Bredell has finally authorised an investigation into allegations relating to maladministration, fraud, corruption and/or any other serious malpractice at George Municipality; notes further that while the move is welcomed, it is not enough, and there are many other municipalities that are facing similar allegations, like your Knysna Municipality; and calls on the MEC to authorise investigations into corruption allegations in Knysna Municipality, City of Cape Town and all the other municipalities in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: And Laingsburg.

Mr D SMITH: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes that Minister Bredell has finally authorised an investigation into allegations of maladministration, fraud, corruption and/or any other serious malpractice at the George Municipality; notes further that, while the move is welcomed, it is not enough, as there are many other municipalities that are facing similar allegations, like the Knysna Municipality; and calls on the Minister to authorise an investigation into corruption allegations at the Knysna Municipality, the City of Cape Town and all the other municipalities that have been investigated by the Hawks.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

BACKYARD DWELLERS

(Notice of Motion)

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the prioritisation of backyard dwellers and the roll-out of housing in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the prioritisation of backyard dwellers and the rollout of housing in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

APARTHEID-ERA SCHOOL NAMES

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you very much, Madam Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes calls made by the African National Congress for the Western Cape Education Department to take responsibility and to own the process of changing apartheid-era names of our schools; notes further that the ANC finds these apartheid-era school names such as Jan van Riebeeck High School, ... *[Interjection.]*

†'n AGB LID: Jy los vir Jan uit!

[An HON MEMBER: You leave Jan alone!]

Mr M K SAYED:

...D F Malan High School, Rhodes High School and Eben Dönges High School and many more as a perpetuation of a particular history in this country ... *[Interjections.]* where anything that was African, and black was dismissed as inconsequential and of no historical value; and calls on Western Cape Education Department to immediately initiate a process of changing apartheid-era names of our schools. I thank you. *[Interjections.]*

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M K SAYED: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes calls made by the African National Congress for the Western Cape Education Department to take responsibility and own the process of changing apartheid-era names of our schools; notes further that the ANC finds these apartheid-era school names – such as Jan van Riebeeck High School, DF Malan High School, Rhodes High School and Eben Dönges High School and many more – as a perpetuation of a particular history of this country where anything that was African and black was dismissed as inconsequential and of no historic value; and calls on WCED to initiate immediately a process of changing apartheid-era names of our schools.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

BORDER PROTECTION

(Notice of Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates our porous borders, border protection laws and the impact of unprotected borders in our communities. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the Houses debates our porous borders and the impact of unprotected borders on our communities.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

SCHOOLS AND EFFECTS OF CRIME

(Notice of Motion)

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the outcry over crime occurring in and around our schools in the Western Cape that is gravely affecting our learners and teachers. I thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the outcry over crime occurring in and around our Western Cape schools that gravely affects our learners and teachers.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

ECONOMIC TRANSFORMATION POLICY PAPER ON

(Notice of Motion)

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Policy Paper issued by the National Treasury namely, "Economic Transformation, Inclusive Growth and Competitiveness: Towards an Economic Strategy for South Africa." I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the policy paper issued by the National Treasury, namely "Economic transformation, inclusive growth and competitiveness: Towards an economic strategy for South Africa".

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

CRIME STATISTICS 2018/2019

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the 2018/2019 crime statistics.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M KAMA: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the crime statistics for 2018/19.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

**PRISONERS
REHABILITATIVE SERVICES**

(Notice of Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact or effectiveness of rehabilitative services for prisoners including conditions which allow for the accused to get bail and the processes for their integration into our society.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of rehabilitative services for prisoners, including the conditions which allow for excused persons to get bail, and the process for their reintegration into society.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

**MALIBU HIGH SCHOOL
POLICY ON AFRICAN HAIR**

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M K SAYED: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with concern that reports that Malibu High School still views African hair or the Afro as not adhering to the school's code of conduct; notes further that several learners with Afros were basically ordered to plait their hair or find new schools next year; calls for a further investigation into the reports; and reiterates its calls to MEC Schäfer and for her Department to conduct a review of all codes of conduct of schools in the province to identify and to do away with sections that allow for discrimination against learners. I thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M K SAYED: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with concern reports that the Malibu High School still views African hair or Afro as not adhering to the school's code of conduct; notes further that several learners with Afros were ordered to plait their hair or find new schools next year; calls for a further investigation into the reports; and reiterates its calls to Minister Schäfer and the WCED to conduct a review the codes of conduct of all the schools in the province to identify and do away with sections that allow for discrimination against learners.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

Mr M KAMA: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

ANNUAL NATIONAL CRIME STATISTICS

(Notice of Motion)

Mr R I ALLEN: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, in line with the hon Kama, that we debate the Annual National Crime Statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact it has on citizens in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the annual national crime statistics released by the national Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

NATIONAL PROSECUTING AUTHORITY

(Notice of Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the effectiveness of the National Prosecuting Authority.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the effectiveness of the NPA and the Hawks.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE MULTI-PARTY COMMITTEE MEETING

(Motion)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House, noting the ongoing gender-based violence in our province and nationally, and having taken note of the matters raised during the debate this afternoon, and believing that it is critical that the House is fully briefed on all national, provincial and local initiatives underway in the province to prevent such violence and support the victims, resolves to request the Speaker to constitute a multi-party committee which will plan an inclusive meeting by the end of October where all spheres of government, NGO's and other relevant stakeholders will be invited to share progress and challenges with the aim of ensuring ongoing momentum in the campaign to end gender-based violence and femicide.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the ongoing gender-based violence in our province and nationally, and having taken note of the matters raised during the debate this afternoon and believing that it is critical that the house is fully briefed on all national, provincial and local initiatives underway in the province to prevent such violence and to support the victims, resolves to request the Speaker to constitute a multi-party committee which will plan an inclusive meeting by the end of October where all spheres of government, NGOs and other relevant stakeholders will be invited to share progress and challenges with the aim of ensuring ongoing momentum in the campaign to end gender violence and femicide.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE JANIKA MELLO

(Motion of condolence)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Madam Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House extends our deepest condolences to the family of young Janika Mello, whose body was found in her grandmother's backyard; furthermore, that this House condemns the spate of gender-based violence in the Western Cape and our thoughts and prayers go out to all those affected. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends our deepest condolences to the family of Janika Mello, whose body was found in her grandmother's backyard, and furthermore condemns the spate of gender-based violence in the Western Cape; and notes that our thoughts and prayers go out to all those affected.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

DAM LEVELS: HIGH PRICE OF WATER

(Motion)

Mr D SMITH: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that all the Western Cape water supply systems are above 85% full, except ... *[Interjection.]*

An HON MEMBER: Not all! Not all.

An HON MEMBER: Except!

Mr D SMITH:

...except Theewaterskloof Dam. *[Interjection.]*

†'n AGB LID: Jy moet mooi sê!

[An HON MEMBER: You must say it right!]

Mr D SMITH:

... that is at 71.67%; and that we further note that despite the remarkable recovery of our dams the ratepayers ... *[Interjection.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D SMITH: Must I start over this one?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, the ratepayers ... [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH:

... the ratepayers are still paying high prices for water; and calls on municipalities, especially the City of Cape Town, to stop profiteering from water by overcharging the poor. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: And Beaufort West Municipality.

Mr D SMITH: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that all the water supply systems in the Western Cape are above 85% full, except for the Theewaterskloof Dam that stands at 71,67%; notes further that, despite the remarkable recovery of our dams, the ratepayers are still paying exorbitant prices for water; and calls on municipalities, especially the City Of Cape Town, to stop profiteering from water by overcharging the poor.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

LATE PAUL GRENDON

(Motion of condolence)

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you. Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of anti-apartheid photographer and artist. Mr Paul Grandon, who passed away on Monday. Mr Grendon was a brave photographer and artist who documented the atrocities of apartheid under sometimes difficult circumstance. His art also reflected on the journey into democracy and can be seen in the work that he has done with young people and people who are displaced. His contribution to the establishment of the Lwandle Migrant Museum and the work of the District Six Museum is well documented. I note that this House further send our condolences to his wife Tina Smith, his family and friends. We wish them all the strength during this time. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of anti-apartheid photographer and artist Paul Grendon who documented the atrocities of apartheid under sometimes difficult circumstance; notes that his art also reflected on the journey into democracy and can be seen in the work that he has done with young people and displaced people; further noting that his contribution to the establishment of the Lwandle Migrant Museum and the work of the District Six Museum is well documented; and further send our condolences to his wife Tina Smith, his family and friends and wishes them all the strength during this time.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**LATE CHESTER WILLIAMS
MEMORIAL AT NEWLANDS STADIUM**

(Motion)

Mr P J MARAIS: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House unanimously passes a resolution requesting the South African or Western Province Rugby Unions to honour the memory of the late Chester Williams, nicknamed the 'Black Pearl' and hero of the 1995 Rugby World Cup, by renaming the Railway Stand at the Newlands Rugby Stadium after him, thereby honouring his memory and legacy. I so move.
[Applause.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this house unanimously pass a resolution requesting the South African or Western Province Rugby Union to honour the memory and legacy of the late Chester Williams, nicknamed the "Black Pearl" and hero in the 1995 Rugby World Cup, by renaming the Railway Stand at the Newlands Rugby stadium after him.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE CHESTER WILLIAMS

(Motion of condolence)

Ms W F PHILANDER: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys and expresses our sincere condolences and sympathy to Uncle Wilfred Williams of Paarl, of which the late Chester Williams referred to as his number 1 fan, and who Chester idolized as a young boy for playing for the national black team. To his brother, Emile, sister, Anthea, wife Maria and the children, extended families and friends and the Albions Rugby Club where it all started. May God provide you with strength and acceptance during this very difficult time. That the youth of Paarl and the greater Drakenstein draw inspiration from the life of a remarkable man, who against all odds, persevered in his quest of breaking barriers. May the dear soul of the Black Pearl of Paarl, rest in peace.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms W F PHILANDER: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this house conveys and expresses our sincere condolences and sympathy to Uncle Wilfred Williams of Paarl, which the late Chester Williams referred to as his number 1 fan, and whom Chester idolised as a young boy for playing in the nation's black team; and to his brother, Emile, sister, Anthea, wife, Maria and the children, extended families and friends and Albions Rugby Club where it all started – may God provide you with strength and acceptance during this very difficult time; and further notes that the youth of Paarl and the greater Drakenstein draws inspiration from the life of a remarkable man, who against all odds, persevered in his quest to break barriers. May the dear soul of the black pearl of Paarl, rest in peace.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

RAYANA AMEEROEDIEN

(Motion)

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you very much, Madam Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges Rayana Ameeroedien that invited women from all over Cape Town to free self-defence classes – †as die mans nie wil hoor nie, dan moet hulle voel! if the men do not want to hear they must suffer!] Deputy Speaker, an article of 9 September 2019 highlighted the Thai Fighter took the initiative to offer young girls and women free self-defence classes after seeing thousands of women standing up against gender-based violence. The classes are being offered at the Fitness Academy, situated in Phoenix House, School of Industries in Plantation Road, Ottery; Deputy Speaker, the ACDP wants to thank her for the selfless deed and would want to wish her the best for her future endeavours. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges Rayana Ameeroedien who invited women from all over Cape Town to free self-defence classes for the month of September; noting that an article dated 9 September 2019, highlighted Muay Thai Fighter, Rayana Ameeroedien took the initiative to offer young girls and women free self-defence classes after seeing thousands of women standing up against gender-based violence; notes that the classes are being offered at Ray's Muay Thai Fitness Academy, situated at the youth centre, Phoenix House, School of Industries in Plantation Road, Ottery; further notes we thank Rayana Ameeroedien for the selfless deed, and would like to wish her all the best for her future endeavours.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: SUCCESSES

(Motion)

Mr L M MASEKO: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the progress made by the Department of Human Settlements in delivering on their promise of empowering Western Cape citizens through home ownership. Last week Minister Tertuis Simmers delivered 33 title deeds to residents of the Ebenhaeser community near Vredendal; further notes that progress made in accelerating the delivery of title deeds to the elderly citizens of this province, such as Ms Elizabeth Pedro, who is 85 years and Mr Koordom Cloete, who is 81, who waited for nearly more than 30 years to receive their title deeds. The Western Cape Government promotes social inclusion through property ownership in an open opportunity society. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr L M MASEKO: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House commends the progress made by the Department of Human Settlements in delivering on their promise of empowering Western Cape citizens through home ownership; notes the last week Minister Simmers delivered 33 title deeds to residents of the Ebenhaeser community near Vredendal; further notes that progress were made in accelerating the delivery of title deeds to the elderly citizens of this province, such as Ms Elizabeth Pedro, 85 and Mr Koordom Cloete, 81, who waited for nearly 30 years to receive title deeds; and further noting that the Western Cape Governments promotes social inclusion through property ownership in an open opportunity society.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

ANC YOUTHL LEAGUE: 75TH ANNIVERSARY

(Motion)

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you very much Madam Deputy Speaker for noticing me. I move without notice:

That the House notes that on 10 September this year the African National Congress Youth League turned 75 as it was launched at the Bantu Men's Social Centre in 1944; notes further that the ANC Youth League was formed to supplement, consolidate and give new impetus to the struggle against racial oppression as championed by the African National Congress, and to be preparatory political school for cutting edge cadreship, [Interjections.] some of the conditions that necessitated the formation of the Youth League still exist today and that we appreciate that it has produced many leaders and heroes over the years, including some members here today, both in the African National Congress ... [Interjections.] and even some representing other political parties in this House, and wishes it strength as it continue to champion issues of youth in the country. [Interjections.] I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr M K SAYED: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that on 10 September this year the African National Congress Youth League turned 75 as it was launched at Bantu Men's Social Centre in 1944, notes further that the Youth League was formed to supplement, consolidate and give new impetus to the struggle against racial oppression as championed by the ANC, and to be preparatory political school for cutting edge leadership, some of the conditions that necessitated the formation of the Youth League still exist today; appreciates that it has produced many leaders and heroes over the years, including some MPLs that are here today, representing the ANC and some even representing other political parties; and wishes it strength as it continues to champion issues of youth in the country.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

SCHOOL EXAMINATIONS

(Motion)

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House extends best wishes to all candidates writing examination, especially our Grade 12 learners during their final external examination period. That this House further commends teachers for the hard work towards ensuring all Grade 12 learners receive their all-important National Senior Certificate. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends best wishes to all candidates writing examination, especially our Grade 12 learners during their final external examination period. That this House further commends teachers for the hard work towards ensuring all Grade 12 learners receive their all-important NSCs.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE
PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT EMPLOYEES: VETTING OF**

(Motion)

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I move a motion without notice:

That the House notes with concern the unhindered violence and barbarism perpetrated against women and children by men; notes further that many women and children are exposed to danger on a daily basis as their colleagues and teachers and/or care givers have committed serious crimes in the past; recognises that immediate measures to halt these attacks and ensure women and children safety need to be implemented; and calls on the Western Cape Government to compel all provincial Government employees, including those employed through the EPWP in various municipalities, to undergo a vetting process and report back to the House in due course. I move so.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Can I amend the motion to remove “after”. [Laughter.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the unhindered violence and barbarism perpetrated against women and children by men; notes further that many women and children are exposed to danger on a daily basis as their colleagues and teachers and/or caregivers have committed serious crimes in the past; recognises that immediate measures to halt these attacks and ensure the safety of women and children need to be implemented; and calls on Western Cape Government to compel all provincial government employees, including those employed through the EPWP in various municipalities to undergo a vetting process and report back to the house in due course.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

SEAN RICE, KENNY RICE AND ULVARD HART

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates three South African representatives training at the Peninsula Canoe Club and Fish Hoek Surf Life Saving Club for their outstanding achievements in the Canoe Ocean Racing World Championships; brothers Sean Rice and Kenny Rice came first and second place in the Men's Canoe Ocean Racing World Championships. Sean Rice completed the 22 kilometre course 38 seconds ahead of his younger brother, Kenny; and Ulvard Hart won first place in the U18 Junior Canoe Ocean Racing World Championships. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates three South African representatives training at the Peninsula Canoe Club and Fish Hoek Surf Life Saving Club for their outstanding achievements in the Canoe Ocean Racing World Championships; notes the brothers Sean Rice and Kenny Rice came first and second in the Men's Canoe Ocean Racing World Championships. Sean Rice completed the 22 kilometre course 38 seconds ahead of his younger brother, Kenny; further notes that Ulvard Hart won first place in the U18 Junior Canoe Ocean Racing World Championships

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

[The Speaker takes the Chair]

**MALIBU HIGH SCHOOL
RACISM AND DISCRIMINATION**

(Motion)

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the gender and racial discrimination events that took place at Malibu High School in Blue Downs, Cape Town on 29 August 2019, where black female learners were forced by the school to adhere to a racialized and discriminatory interpretation of the school's code of conduct wherein they were told they are not allowed to wear Afros;

The EFF still calls for the Western Cape Department of Education to suspend the school principal and the teachers involved pending the investigation and to make sure that proper investigations are initiated as a matter of urgency;

The EFF further calls for counselling to be provided to the learners who faced inexpressible humiliation and discrimination in Malibu High School. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: No, this motion is full of speculation.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. [Interjections.] Are there any objections to the motion [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Being moved without notice.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House:

- (a) Notes the gender and racial discrimination events that took place at the Malibu High School in Blue Downs, Cape Town, on 29 August 2019, where black female learners were forced by the school to adhere to a racialised and discriminatory interpretation of the school's code of conduct in accordance of which they were told they were not allowed to wear Afros.
- (b) Notes that nine Grade 11 learners were summoned to a disciplinary hearing on Wednesday 4 September 2019 but that the disciplinary hearing was revoked after the learners' lawyer and parents liaised with the school.
- (c) Notes with concern that, despite various engagements with the school, the Department of Education, the learners' lawyers and the learners' parents, the school has decided to make a U-turn and continues harassing learners.
- (d)

Notes that the learners who have already suffered enough trauma and harassment are being called to sign documents that they know nothing about and without their parents' consent or their lawyers' consent; notes further that this is wrong and that the matter must be attended to urgently.

- (e) Notes the Western Cape Education Department's failure to protect the learners and to hold the school's management accountable for the racial discrimination showed by the school principal, Mr Links, some of the teachers and the school's caretaker; notes further that various recordings have been provided as evidence but, so far, only the caretaker has been suspended.
- (f) Calls on the Western Cape Education Department to suspend the school's principal and the teachers involved pending the investigation and to ensure that proper investigations are initiated as a matter of urgency.
- (g) Calls for counselling to be provided for the learners who faced inexpressible humiliation and discrimination at the Malibu High School.
- (h) And calls on the Western Cape Education Department and the national government to collaborate and implement race, gender and diversity workshops to sensitise staff and learners about different cultural backgrounds and identities.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

YOUTH REHABILITATION BOOT CAMP

(Motion)

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the SAPS, Western Cape Department of Social Development, Capstone Solutions NGO, the Community Police Forum and Councillor Potgieter from Laingsburg organised a youth rehabilitation boot camp in Oudtshoorn for 27 vulnerable youth from Laingsburg between 6 and 8 September 2019;

Further notes that the programme included sessions such as Code of Conduct Drill Cadet, a talent show, fitness training, the importance of school attendance, substance abuse, domestic violence, the Sexual Offences Act, bullying, positive behaviour, not being a 'runner' for drug lords, and suicide prevention;

Acknowledges the theme of the camp, 'Light at the end of the Dark Tunnel', which highlighted the difficult circumstances these children grow up in and encouraged each child to choose to strive for their full potential in life;

Congratulates the SAPS, the DSD, Capstone Solutions NGO, the CPF, and Councillor Potgieter for organising this remarkable rehabilitation camp. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes that the South African Police Service (SAPS), Western Cape Department of Social Development (DSD), Capstone Solutions NGO, the Community Police Forum (CPF) and Cllr Potgieter in Laingsburg organised a youth rehabilitation boot camp in Oudtshoorn for 27 vulnerable youth from Laingsburg between 6 and 8 September 2019; further notes that the programme included sessions such as the Code of Conduct Drill Cadet, a talent show, fitness training, the importance of school attendance, substance abuse, domestic violence, the Sexual Offences Act, bullying, positive behaviour, not being a 'runner' for drug lords, and suicide prevention; and acknowledges the theme of the camp, 'Light at the end of the Dark Tunnel', which highlighted the difficult circumstances these children grow up in and encouraged each other to choose to strive for their full potential in life; and congratulates the SAPS, the DSD, Capstone Solutions NGO, the CPF, and Cllr Potgieter for organising this remarkable rehabilitation camp.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

ATTACKS ON TRUCKS

(Motion)

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern and condemns the ongoing attacks on trucks on the N7; notes further that four trucks have been torched in separate incidents since Monday in the province, leaving at least one driver seriously injured after a petrol bomb was thrown in his truck while he was sleeping; calls for an urgent intervention by the Government and police to help quell the tensions. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes with concern and condemns the ongoing attacks on trucks on the N7; notes further that four trucks have been torched in separate incidents since Monday in the province, leaving at least one driver seriously injured after a petrol bomb was thrown in his truck while he was sleeping; calls for an urgent intervention by the Government and Police to help quell the tensions.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE VICTIMS

(Motion)

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Western Cape is reeling from the rape and murders of women in the province; notes further that young innocent women like Jesse Hess, Sadieka Newman, Nwabisa Mthumeni, Janika Mallo and Uyinenene Mrwetyana all died at the hands of evil men; expresses shock and dismay at the fact that Premier Winde and all his MECs did not visit a single family; and conveys heartfelt condolences to the families, friends and colleagues. [Interjections.] I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Who did not visit them? [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Western Cape is reeling from the rape and murders of women in the province; notes further that young, innocent women like Jesse Hess, Sadieka Newman, Nwabisa Mthumeni, Janika Mallo and Uyinenene Mrwetyana all died at the hands of evil men; expresses shock and dismay at the fact that Premier Winde and all his Ministers did not visit a single family; and conveys heartfelt condolences to the victims' families, friends and colleagues.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

DA: RETRENCHMENTS

(Motion)

Mr D SMITH: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes reports that following an underwhelming showing of the 2019 elections including allegations of squandered R400 million campaign chest, the DA is retrenching staff at its parliamentary caucus and various Legislature caucuses; notes further that the DA is a sinking ship, [Interjections.] even its funders are pulling out as they cannot back up a dying party; expresses its shock and retrenching staff will only worsen the country's unemployment; and sympathises with the employees that will be retrenched ... [Interjections.] after the DA is bragging about a government that is creating jobs. Thank you. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr D SMITH: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes reports that – following an underwhelming showing in the 2019 elections, including allegations of a squandered R400-million campaign chest – the DA is retrenching staff at its parliamentary caucus and various legislature caucuses; notes further that the DA is a sinking ship as even its funders are pulling out as they cannot back a dying party; expresses its shock as retrenched staff will only worsen the country's unemployment; and sympathises with the employees who will be retrenched.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

LATE LINCOLN HARTLEY

(Motion of condolence)

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of Mr Lincoln Hartley. Mr Hartley was a committed probation officer in the Department of Social Development regional office in Vredenburg; I further move that this House notes his contribution to the Department as it was evident at his funeral which was attended by officials from SAPS, the Justice cluster and local government. That we send our condolences to his family and friends. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notices the passing of Mr Lincoln Hartley, who was a committed probation officer in the Department of Social Development Regional Office in Vredenburg; and notes his contribution to the department, which was evident at his funeral that was attended by officials from SAPS, Justice and local government, and convey our condolences to his family and friends.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE LEYDEN FINGER AND HILTON JOSEPH

(Motion of condolence)

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the attacks and murders of police officers in the province; notes further that two police officers were murdered on two separate incidents, the first was Warrant Officer Hilton Joseph who succumbed to his injuries when they were attacked while they were on patrol duty in Mfuleni, his colleague remainS in a critical condition in hospital. In another incident, an off duty officer, Leyden Finger, was stabbed to death in an apparent robbery in Kleinvlei; welcomes the arrest of suspects for officer Joseph's murder and conveys sincerest condolences to the families of the officers and wishes the injured cops a speedy and full recovery. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M KAMA: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the attacks and murders of police officers in the province; notes further that two police officers were murdered in two separate incidents, the first was Warrant Officer Hilton Joseph who succumbed to his injuries when they were attacked while they were on patrol duty in Mfuleni, his colleague remains in a critical condition in hospital; notes that the second was an off-duty officer, Leyden Finger, who was stabbed to death in an apparent robbery in Kleinvlei; welcomes the arrest of suspects for officer Joseph's murder and conveys sincerest condolences to the families of slain officers and wishes the injured cops a speedy and full recovery.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**LATE OFFICER NIEUWENHUYS
AND OFFICER SIMTEMBILE NYANGIWE**

(Motion)

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends our deepest condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of Officer Nieuwenhuys and Officer Simtembile Nyangiwe, and SAPS member Hilton Joseph who lost their lives in the line of duty; furthermore, that this House condemns the attacks on officials within the safety and security service; our thoughts and prayers go out to all those affected. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends our deepest condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of Officer Jan Nieuwenhuys and Officer Simtembile Nyangiwe, and South African Police Service member Hilton Joseph who lost their lives in the line of duty; furthermore condemns the attacks on officials within the safety and security service; and notes that our thoughts and prayers go out to all those affected.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

TRUCK ATTACKS: IMPACT OF

(Motion)

Ms N D NKONDLO: †Enkosi Somlomo [Thank you Speaker] Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House debates the impact of truck attacks on the economy of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: That motion sounds similar to the one by hon Bans. Are they? The similarity is there. Is that correct, Table staff? Okay. Can we proceed. Thank you. Are there any objections hon members? No objections. [Interjections.] Pardon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection that it is moved without notice.

The SPEAKER: Oh, you have an objection that it is moved without notice. The motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon members, I now recognise hon Sayed.

Ms N D NKONDKLO: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House debates the impact of truck attacks on the economy of the Western Cape.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

**LATE IMAM ABDULLAH HARON
ANNIVERSARY OF DEATH**

(Motion)

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you very much. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes this month marks the 50th anniversary of the murder of the courageous Imam Abdullah Haron's; it was his death anniversary and notes further that the religious leader and stalwart against apartheid was killed by the security branch of the apartheid government in detention at the Cape Town central police station on 27 September 1969 and was buried on 29 September at Mowbray Muslim Cemetery and welcomes the decision to declare Imam Abdullah Haron's gravesite and the Al Jamia Mosque Stegman Road, Claremont as heritage sites. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes this month marks the 50th anniversary of the murder of the courageous Imam Abdullah Haron; notes further that the religious leader and political activist was killed by the apartheid security branch in detention at the Cape Town central police station on 27 September 1969 and was buried on 29 September at Mowbray Muslim Cemetery and welcomes the decision to declare Imam Abdullah Haron's gravesite and the Al Jamia Mosque in Stegman Road, Claremont where he lead, heritage sites.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**LATE STEPHEN BIKO
42ND ANNIVERSARY OF DEATH**

(Motion)

Mr A LILL: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that today marks the 42 years anniversary of Bantu Stephen Biko's assassination; notes further that he was arrested at a road block on 18 August 1977 under the Terrorism Act No 83 of 1976 and taken to Walmer Police Station where he was assaulted and tortured into a coma, suffering major head injuries, and on 11 September he was loaded into the back of a Land Rover, naked and restrained in manacles and driven to Pretoria Central Prison where he died on 12 September 1977, and remembers and salutes him for his contribution in the liberation struggle of SA. Thank you. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that today marks 42 anniversary of Bantu Stephen Biko's assassination; notes further that he was arrested at a road block on 18 August 1977 under the Terrorism Act, 1976 (Act 83 of 1976), and taken to Walmer Police station where he was assaulted tortured into a coma, suffering major head injuries, and on 11 September he was loaded into the back of a Land Rover naked and restrained in manacles and driven to Pretoria Central Prison where he died on 12 September 1977; remembers and salutes him for his contribution in the liberation struggle of SA.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

MYCITI N2 EXPRESS SERVICE

(Motion)

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the MyCiti bus service has not operated in Khayelitsha and Mitchell's Plain since the end of May due to contractual issues between the City of Cape Town and the N2 Express Joint Venture; further notes that the City plans to pull out of negotiations and appoint a new vehicle operating company, as confirmed by Mayor Plato, Felicity Purchase and Angus McKenzie, after giving the shareholders a deadline of 28 September for the N2 express service to be reinstated; rejects the plans of the City of Cape Town; and calls on the MEC to intervene and resolve the impasse and resume operations. I move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the My Citi bus service has not operated in Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain since the end of May due to contractual issues between the City of Cape Town and the N2 Express Joint Venture; notes further the City plans to pull out of negotiations and appoint a new vehicle operating company, as confirmed by Mayor Plato, Felicity Purchase, and Angus McKenzie, after giving the shareholders a deadline of 28 September for the N2 express service to be reinstated; rejects the plans of the City of Cape Town; and calls on the Provincial Minister to intervene and resolve the impasse and resume operations.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: Official.

LATE SAZI VELDMAN

(Motion of condolence)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing of comrade Sazi Veldman, a former Robben Island prisoner, an MK combatant and an army general in the South African National Defence Force; notes further that comrade Sazi recently retired from the army and acquired his PhD; and conveys its heartfelt condolences to his family, his comrades in the ANC and South Africa at large, we have lost a true soldier and combatant who was dedicated to the service of the movement and the people of South Africa. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing of Cde Sazi Veldman, a former Robben Island prisoner, an MK combatant and an Army General in SANDF; notes further that Cde Sazi recently retired from the army and acquired his PhD; and conveys heartfelt condolences to his family, his comrades in the ANC and South Africa at large; and notes that we have lost a true soldier and combatant who was dedicated to the service of the movement and people.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**YOMELELA PRIMARY SCHOOL
SHOOTING OF PRINCIPAL**

(Motion)

Ms A P BANS: Thank you. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern and condemns the shooting of the Principal of Yomelela Primary School in Khayelitsha who was shot in his office during a robbery at his school; notes further that Principal Sibongiseni Dlaku was busy typing up a newly reported rape case when gunmen entered and shot him in the hand and upper abdomen, and took his laptop, phone and car keys; wishes him a speedy and full recovery; and calls on the Provincial Government to prioritize school safety as the lives of learners and teachers continue to be at risk. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern and condemns the shooting of the Principal of Yomelela Primary School in Khayelitsha who was shot in his office during a robbery at his school; notes further that Principal Sibongiseni Dlaku was busy typing up a newly reported rape case when gunmen entered and shot him in the hand and upper abdomen, and took his laptop, phone and car keys; wish him a speedy and full recovery; and calls on the provincial government to prioritize school safety as the lives of learners and teachers continue to be at risk.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**LATE RAY ALEXANDER SIMONS
15TH ANNIVERSARY OF DEATH**

(Motion)

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that today marks the 15th year since the passing of Ray Alexander Simons, the Secretary of the Communist Party in 1934 and 1935, who together with Helen Joseph, Lilian Ngoyi and Florence Mkhize helped found the Federation of South African Women which fought for women's rights and participated in drafting the pioneering Women's Charter; notes further that in 2004 she was bestowed the ANC's highest honour of Isithwalandwe for her contributions to the liberation struggle; and remembers her for her teachings and legacy. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that today marks the 15th year since the passing of Ray Alexander Simons, the secretary of the Communist Party in 1934 and 1935, who together with Helen Joseph, Lilian Ngoyi and Florence Mkhize helped found the Federation of South African Women (FEDSAW) which fought for women's rights and participated in drafting the pioneering Women's Charter; notes further that in 2004 she was bestowed the ANC's highest honour of Isithwalandwe for her contributions to the liberation struggle; and remembers her for her teachings and legacy.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE ROBERT GABRIEL MUGABE

(Motion of condolence)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and joins the people and the Government of Zimbabwe in mourning the passing of President Robert Gabriel Mugabe who served as the country's Prime Minister from 1980 to 1987 and as President from 1987 to 2017; notes further that President Mugabe who passed on at the age of 95 on Friday was the liberation hero and the revolutionary that championed Africa's cause ... [Interjections.] against imperialism and colonialism; and commiserates with the family and children of the former President who will be laid to rest at the weekend. [Interjections.] I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and joins the people and the government of Zimbabwe in mourning the passing of President Robert Gabriel Mugabe who served as the country's Prime Minister from 1980 to 1987 and as President from 1987 to 2017; notes further that President Mugabe, who passed away at the age of 95 on Friday, was a liberation hero and revolutionary who championed Africa's cause against imperialism and colonialism; and commiserates with the family and children of the former President who will be laid to rest at the weekend.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

TSU PRIVATE SECURITY FIRM

(Motion)

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the private security firm, TSU Security, which responded swiftly to a call after a 26-year-old woman from Khayelitsha who was raped by a taxi driver for over 10 hours and dumped near Spier Wine Farm in Stellenbosch; notes further that the victim took a taxi at 07:00 to work in Stellenbosch as usual, she was alone with the taxi driver, who took an unfamiliar route, and raped her until after 5.00pm, and welcomes the arrest of the suspect who was caught by security guards of TSU Security while stuck in traffic in Makhaza. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M KAMA: Hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the heroics of the private security firm TSU Security, which responded swiftly to a call after a 26-year-old women from Khayelitsha, who was raped by a taxi driver for over 10 hours, was dumped near Spier Wine Estate in Stellenbosch; notes further that the victim took a taxi after 07:00 to work in Stellenbosch as usual, she was alone with the driver in the taxi, who took an unfamiliar route, and raped her until 17:00; welcomes the arrest of the suspect who was caught by security guards of TSU Security while stuck in traffic in Makhaza.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: Immediately when we adjourn we are reconvening the CPA AGM. So I suggest that members remain seated to deal with the business immediately. I thank you.

The House adjourned at 18:24.

ANNOUNCEMENTS TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

THURSDAY, 12 SEPTEMBER 2019

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

- 1. Tabling of document in terms of section 32(1)(a) of the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act, 2000 (Act 32 of 2000):**

Stellenbosch Municipality

First amendment of the fourth generation Integrated Development Plan (IDP), 2017–2022.

- 2. Annual Report of the Financial and Fiscal Commission and in compliance with the provisions of section 220(1) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, as amended, read with section 26 of the Financial and Fiscal Commission Act, 1997 (Act 99 of 1997), as amended:**

Financial and Fiscal Commission

Annual Report for 2018/19.

MONDAY, 16 SEPTEMBER 2019

COMMITTEE REPORT

REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON HEALTH ON AN OVERSIGHT VISIT TO THE KHAYAMANDI CLINIC ON 7 AUGUST 2019

The Standing Committee on Health, having conducted an unannounced oversight visit to the Khayamandi Clinic in Stellenbosch on 7 August 2019, reports as follows:

Delegation

The delegation included the following Members:

Democratic Alliance (DA)

Allen, RI Botha, LJ

Philander, WF (Chairperson)

African National Congress (ANC)

Windvogel, R

Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF)

Xego, M

Additional Members

Bosman, G (DA)

Bans, AP (ANC)

Ms N Jamce, Procedural Officer, accompanied the delegation.

1. Introduction

The Standing Committee resolved to embark on an unannounced oversight visit to the Khayamandi Clinic in Stellenbosch as part of its oversight mandate over the Department of Health and in compliance with its programme.

2. Overview

The Khayamandi Clinic (the Clinic) was opened in 1993 in Khayamandi, a township at Stellenbosch in the Breede Valley region. Khayamandi is regarded as one of the developing townships situated in Stellenbosch due to the migration of people from the surrounding farms and other provinces. According to the 2011 Census Report by Statistics SA, the population of the Khayamandi community was approximately 24 645, however, this population has grown immensely over the past five years.

The delegation visited Khayamandi Clinic on Wednesday 7 August 2019. The objective of the visit was to experience first-hand and to assess the services offered by this health facility. The Standing Committee wanted specifically learn about the challenges experienced by the Clinic, the successes achieved by the Clinic, and the impact that the Clinic has had on the community of Khayamandi and the surrounding areas.

3. Findings

- 3.1. The Khayamandi Clinic operates five days a week from 07:30 to 16:00 and is closed on weekends and public holidays.
- 3.2. The Clinic renders a comprehensive healthcare package of care to a population of 190 110, to an average of 17 960 people per quarter, equalling 5 500 adults and 1 113 children per month.
- 3.3. The Clinic provides health services to a total of 300 to 350 patients per day.
- 3.4. The Clinic offers preventative and curative services with a special focus on children, women, HIV and Aids, and sexually transmitted infections (STIs).
- 3.5. The Clinic has a complement of 25 permanent staff members, including a medical officer who is available at the facility every day and a second medical officer who visits the Clinic twice a week.
- 3.6. Patients for speech therapy from Khayamandi are referred to the Stellenbosch Hospital.
- 3.7. The Clinic's TB defaulter rate is 5,1% and is considered to be very low. Patients who are diagnosed with HIV or TB are registered on the system for the commencement of their treatment and for follow-up purposes.
- 3.8. The burden of disease continues to escalate, especially infectious diseases and chronic diseases. However, HIV and TB are regarded as the largest burden of disease at the Khayamandi Clinic.
- 3.9. The Clinic has low treatment default rates and this can be ascribed to the work of the community health workers.
- 3.10. The delegation was informed that the Primary Healthcare Manager visits the Clinic once a month and the visits are more frequent when there is a need.
- 3.11. The Committee was informed that a piece of land has been bought by the Municipality from the church and will be signed over to the Municipality in a week's time.
- 3.12. There is a newly appointed Health Committee at the Khayamandi Clinic. The delegation was also informed that the Community Health Forum was dissolved as it had become too politicised.
- 3.13. The electronic filing system is not in place and this causes delays and congestion in the waiting area.
- 3.14. There is no permanent pharmacist stationed at the clinic. A pharmacist visits the facility two to three times a week and this arrangement leaves two pharmacist assistants in charge of the pharmacy.
- 3.15. There were three air conditioners that were not working during the visit.

4. Challenges experienced at the Khayamandi Clinic

- 4.1. During the visit, the Committee was further informed about the shortage of medical stock. This was highlighted as a national challenge due to the contract of a medical supplier that has come to an end.
- 4.2. Infrastructure is a major challenge at the Clinic and the Department of Health is struggling to acquire land to build a new clinic.
- 4.3. The admission, reception and filing areas are inadequate.
- 4.4. The pharmacy is too small with an inadequate waiting area.

- 4.5. The filing system is a major challenge due to the shortage of space and the long time it takes to allocate folders to patients.
- 4.6. There is high staff turnover at the Clinic and the process of the Department in filling the vacancies takes long.
- 4.7. The staff shortage, including a shortage of doctors, was highlighted as a challenge at the Khayamandi Clinic.

5. Successes of the Khayamandi Clinic

- 5.1. The Members were informed that the Chronic Dispensing Unit distributes chronic medication to a community church and patients collect their medication there.
- 5.2. The Clinic has well-functioning appointment and triage systems.
- 5.3. There is a smooth functioning baby clinic at the Clinic.
- 5.4. The Mother-to-Child Prevention Programme is very successful.

6. Recommendations

The Committee recommended that:

- 6.1 The Department installs a prefab structure to be utilised to store files.
- 6.2 A queue marshal and TV sets be considered in the waiting area of the Clinic.
- 6.3 The Municipality should consider allocating funds to refurbish the baby room and to make it more baby-friendly.

7. Resolutions

The Committee resolved to conduct a follow-up visit to the Khayamandi Clinic. For this visit, the Committee will invite community health stakeholders, the Municipality and district health councillors to attend the meeting.

8. Requested papers or documents

The Committee requested the Khayamandi Clinic to provide:

- 8.1 A list of the Clinic's maintenance needs; and
- 8.2 A copy of the Clinic's User Immovable Asset Management Plan (U-AMP).

9. Acknowledgments

The Committee wishes to express its appreciation to the entire staff of the Khayamandi Clinic for their dedication and hard work in providing the communities of Khayamandi and the surrounding areas with good healthcare services under trying conditions.

10. Conclusion

The Committee successfully concluded the oversight visit to the Khayamandi Clinic.

TUESDAY, 17 SEPTEMBER 2019

TABLING

The Speaker:

Annual report of provincial department for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 tabled in terms of section 65(1)(a) of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999), as amended:

Minister of Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism

Annual Report of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism for 2018/19 (Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 508**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), I move without notice that precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion.

Agreed to.

Hon members, guests, ladies and gentlemen, please allow me to recognise as part of the guests in the gallery, visitors from the St. Florian Boys Choir from Upper Austria. [Applause.] They sang beautifully for us during lunchtime, and food was just flowing because we were enjoying the music. They even sang Nkosi Sikelel' iAfrika in all languages. They did not mess it up. They sang, all of them, beautifully. [Interjections.]

Yes, they sang beautifully. Also amongst our guests in the gallery we have Crystal High School from Bonteheuwel. [Interjections.] [Applause.] †Welkom by die Parlement. [Welcome to Parliament.] †Wamkelekile. [Welcome.]

HON MEMBERS: Hanover Park.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: ...and also Hanover Park. †Mooi! Welkom, welkom! [Applous.] [Good! Welcome, welcome! [Applause.]] You know, the Speaker works with a list that is before him so in future do not impose the list from the City, but we will make sure that my team forward this list in advance, but thank you, you are all welcome, equally. Please enjoy the sitting. The rules here are that you can enjoy by observing but you do not participate. To the guests from Austria, you cannot sing when you are excited here. [Laughter.] Alright, now we are going to the debate as moved by the Chief Whip. I just need the speakers' list. Thank you. The person that is going to lead the debate is hon Derrick America from the Democratic Alliance. I recognise you, hon member America.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

BUILDING SUSTAINABLE, RESPONSIVE AND PEOPLE-CENTRED MUNICIPALITIES

(Subject for Discussion)

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you hon Speaker. Before I commence with the debate, may I declare that I was once a pupil at Crystal High School and I was a prefect also there. Thank you. [Applause.]

Having said that, Hon Speaker, Section 40(1) of the Constitution of South Africa stipulates that Government is constituted by three spheres, which are distinctive, interdependent and interrelated. With regard to the local sphere of government, Section 152 of the Constitution sets its main objectives to providing a democratic and accountable government to local communities; providing services to the communities in a sustainable manner, promoting social and economic development, promoting a safe and healthy environment and encouraging the involvement of communities in local government matters. This power is to give effect to the objective of the local government in municipalities that is vested in the Constitution. It empowers the municipality to govern and manage its own affairs, while being subject to the provincial and national legislation.

Hon Speaker, the mandate of the National Council of Provinces outlined in Section 42(4) of the Constitution is to represent the provinces and ensure that local interests are taken into account in the national sphere of government. Bearing this in mind, the NCOP undertook its first provincial week of the Sixth Parliament this week. This included joint oversight visits with the respective Provincial Legislatures to monitor the delivery of services to communities. The provincial component of the delegation was a multiparty delegation consisting of the Democratic Alliance, the African National Congress, the Economic Freedom Fighters as well as observers from SALGA in the form of the Chairperson, Mr Anton Coetzee, and his delegation. In consultation with the NCOP delegates and the parties in the Western Cape Legislature it was agreed that the Bitou and the Mossel Bay Municipalities will be visited.

Hon Speaker, it would be remiss of me not to state from the outset that the Mossel Bay Municipality was rated as the Top Performing Municipality in the country according to the Good Governance Africa 2019 Index of local municipalities. This is of no coincidence as the municipality is led by the Democratic Alliance, a party which prides itself in clean and effective governance. Under the capable leadership of the Mayor, Mr Levendal, it was announced on arrival that the municipality is the only one with a comprehensive rural development and safety plan. The delegation has visited KwaNonqaba Waste Transfer Station, Mountain View Housing Project, the Access to Basic Services Project and the Early Disablement Toilet Project.

The Mossel Bay Desalination Plant was commissioned in 2010 and 2011 and is fully functional. The dam level in the municipality remains a concern as it currently sits at about 50% and it is predicted to drop below the 50% mark. However, the plant will be back in operation in a week's time. Mossel Bay has a growing population in both the formal and the informal settlements.

Despite this the Municipality's revenue for the 2018 and 2019 financial year has exceeded the R1 billion-mark and continues to grow.

Hon Speaker, in contrast, the ANC-led Bitou Municipality faces significant challenges with many key posts being unoccupied and financial challenges being of grave concern. It is to be noted that the Municipality has significantly overspent their operational budget. This led to the spending of R22.6 million being spent from the Municipality's Human Settlements Grant, to fund operational expenses. No credible explanation could be provided. Furthermore, the Auditor-General reported that the Municipality's procurement process and contract management is not compliant with legislation. This could lead to corruption and unnecessary litigation. [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: Talk about George.

Mr D AMERICA: It was brought to the attention of the Committee the staggering number of law suits with third parties amounting to R22.4 million while the irregular expenditure of R16.7 million gives credence to our concern. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, it is clear from the aforementioned that this municipality faces a myriad of challenges relating to governance and finances alone. Even the NCOP as an institution yesterday released a statement stating their concern relating to the bad management of various projects in the Bitou Municipality.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): We have a problem with the statement [Inaudible.]

Mr D AMERICA: The Bitou Municipality, hon Speaker, remains dependent on tourism in the area... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members, order!

Mr D AMERICA: Although some aspects of this are positive, it is not sustainable and fails to take on the development of new industries. The ongoing development of RDP homes and private estate homes in the municipality is a silver lining. However, despite this job creation is staggeringly low. Hon Speaker, the current economic climate of the country has placed massive pressure on municipalities to deliver. Additionally, population growth poses another challenge. Where there is political stability and capable administrators appointed the level of service delivery is significantly enhanced.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): So why did the voters vote against the DA in the Cederberg?

Mr D AMERICA: Municipalities implicated in corruption and malfeasance must be identified... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon members. Hon member Dugmore, order! [Interjections.] May I request, hon member America, will you please take your seat, sir. [Interjections.] Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker. I ask that we respect the convention that a member delivering his maiden speech be allowed to speak without heckling. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. I think the Leader of the Official Opposition will help me and talk to the members of his party so that we respect that. Hon member America.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, a point of order. All his interjections, is that not breaking the maiden status? He made so many interjections before his maiden speech, so this cannot be a maiden speech. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais! Hon member America, will you please remain seated, sir. I just want to deal with the one point of order by hon member Marais. That does not remove, hon member Marais, the privilege of the maiden speech, because that was not in this debate, because now he is speaking in the convention and that I think we must just, consistent with the convention, respect that process. [Interjection.] Hon member Dugmore, the Leader of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): I am just on a point of order asking for your ruling. It is true, as the Chief Whip says, hon Speaker, that there is a convention that we do not interject when there is a maiden speech, provided of course and as my understanding of the convention goes, that the speech itself is not a party-political speech.

An HON MEMBER: It is not.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): ...and what we have seen from the hon member is that he is singing the praises of the DA in his maiden speech so he should not expect special treatment, especially because the DA has been defeated in Cederberg. That is going to happen.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Enjoy the [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Order! Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Will you please take your seat, hon Chief Whip. Hon member Dugmore, I gather the point that you are trying to impress in the House. However, the convention is that we must respect that convention. The spirit here is that we must respect the convention. If there is somehow a place where you felt that the rule has been broken by the member himself, there is an opportunity to deal with that during the debate. So I am going to do the same because we must be consistent so that there is a principle that we must uphold and that is the spirit and I am appealing to this House to respect at least that spirit as a matter of convention. So I hope that we are all on the same page in that regard. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker, just a reminder that the convention is that a person delivering their maiden speech should be allowed to speak uninterrupted, but the convention further is that the speech may be party-political, but it may not be controversial and I think that my colleague has not been controversial in his remarks and therefore would abide by your request here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Thank you, hon members.

Ms N D NKONDLO: That is why we have the Speaker here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, thank you. I just want to allow hon member America to conclude.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You have a minute and a half.

Mr D AMERICA: Wow! Okay. Thank you. Despite the various challenges within the province it is clear that municipalities in the Western Cape exceeds in terms of service delivery and governance compared to the rest of South Africa. Empirical data and analysis support this.

As it was announced earlier this year that 12 of the best performing municipalities in the country are in the Western Cape, guided by the Constitution of South Africa, this DA-led Western Cape Government has fulfilled their duties of capacitating, monitoring and supporting municipalities to deliver on their development mandate.

Lastly, hon Speaker, I would like to thank the members of the delegation for their critical and constructive engagement in the various deliberations which we have had over the past few days and to our support staff for arranging the logistical support that they have provided us. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member America. For the purposes of the debate I think I just need to give context so that our guests understand what is happening today. We had the NCOP and Western Cape Provincial Parliament visit week, which lasted for three days, since the 16th on Monday, and hon members came back this morning. It was in Bitou and Mossel Bay. So this is the debate as the outcome of that visit. So we have got here the National Council of Provinces' members who are here and also we have SALGA present here, the Chairperson of SALGA, hon Alderman Coetzee. So let us please remember in that context, that is what we are dealing with. Hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker, and greetings to everyone in the House including members of the gallery. Let us thank the NCOP for the oversight week, including the debate that helps us to call for action in the observations made during the visit. I must say I am a bit shocked. I actually when I was listening to the Chair of the delegation, thought he was in a different visit than mine.

Having said that, Local Government remains a critical sphere known to be at the coalface of service delivery and in direct contact with the people. The citizens, in their endeavour to give meaning to their constitutional right to participate in government, uses the door of Local Government and have lived experiences and the concept of one government and therefore I think this week

part of the visit helps us to invoke a Section 152 in looking at how our Local Government promotes social and economic development and encourages the involvement of communities in Local Government matters and I think with the observation I think the theme of the debate helps us to understand how far are we realising sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities in our province.

In the two municipalities in Bitou and Mossel Bay that we visited, which are part of the Garden Route District Municipality, the third-largest in the province, I think one of the critical things that one observed is actually a visit that was, yes, informative but also exposed critical challenges that need immediate attention in these municipalities. The agenda for local economic development and its integration in pursuit of inclusive economy is a glaring point to share with the House.

Spatial realities continue to present the persistence of apartheid legacy when one considers the geography of poverty and under-development. Given the Bitou's location as the last town in transit to the Eastern Cape, which becomes prone to high levels of in-migration, the situation itself imposes service delivery demands as demonstrated in the increase of housing. This challenge then poses onto us as Government our planning and innovation capability to respond to this particular reality and whether we are prepared to depart from yesteryear's approach, especially the apartheid special outlook.

From the three projects that we visited one is concerned with how we seem to continue the old order with little room to break away from our past in both where we visited the housing developments KwaNonqaba and KwaNokuthula which predominantly have black townships and beneficiaries that are mainly low or no-income earners. What is available is the 45 square metre house, where about three to four households are to reside. In these there are minimal considerations of proximity to other amenities specifically economic activities. This situation and Government's response ferments the geographical poverty.

The Louis Fourie Development which we saw in Mossel Bay presents a different model from this that shows innovation combining the BNG and FLISP in Mossel Bay. Of interest in this project, hon members, is the stretching of the envelope by providing a habitable integrated development which in terms of the architectural design that is appealing and includes landscaping that surely will give fair property value to the development but includes things like shopping malls, a school and other amenities to consider the social and economic needs of this community. Is it not time that we actually look at how we roll this out in all other communities because what is important to us is to ensure that we really move away from our past and if this could be done by the Mossel Bay Municipality within the same BNG and FLISP grant allocation one begs the question, Minister of Human Settlements, why is it that we cannot look at this model to replicate also in other communities in providing the dignity to our people and the desired integration. One of the areas to be explored is also the economic beneficiation of the rand value spent in these infrastructure projects, which is supposed to give a chance and trigger economic opportunities to these beneficiaries.

One of the things that once again we need to consider is that the comfort of EPWP jobs cannot be sustained, as even the reported challenges and the resistance of BEE contractors to forge the win-win subcontracting relations continue to present financial leakages of this deliberate investment by Government. The report from Bitou of how the main contractor and the local subcontractor strained relations actually resulted in delays in the project, which are unwarranted, and I think this also says how do we as Government respond to these particular challenges.

I must say, hon Speaker, one of the things that we should not ignore in our realities in these particular communities, is the labour dynamics that we continue to look at in these areas where the labour market extremes of low-skilled and unskilled versus the skilled results in huge income gaps. Actually it results once again in ensuring that we are slow in departing from the apartheid spatial relations and if then we get into both in the Bitou and the Mossel Bay Municipality you can actually be able to see the difference when you move from KwaNonqaba and you go into town, that you still are sitting in the Western Cape and in the South Africa of yesteryear.

One of the things that the HSRC study of 2017 tells us is that the 20 richest municipalities are mainly in the Western Cape and a strong correlation is to be found between the municipality level poverty rates where the higher the poverty rate a municipality had the more likely it was also going to have that in future years, so this suggests spatial patterns of poverty have not changed much over the years and these particular historical territorial distinctions, hon Premier, remain important sources of social and economic differentiation today, so if there is anything in as far as an economic war room I would call upon you to start elevating this matter that whilst we look at municipalities, and we want hon Chair of the Committee, to talk about the successes of the municipality only from the basis of party-politics... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, I would like you to wrap up please.

Ms N D NKONDLO: We must also consider the reality of people that are still living in such areas, on the basis of race and gender as the apartheid used to be. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Nkondlo. †Uyewandimamela kakuhle khange undisokolise ungase benzenjalo bonke. [You have listened to me very clearly, you did not give me a struggle. I wish all could do that.] I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya. *Manxuba*.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you hon Speaker, and greetings to the House and people in the gallery. I will not dwell much on the findings of the tour that we had with these two municipalities. The report is here to be tabled in this House by the Committee.

The visit to Bitou was rather an eye-opener to all of us how municipalities actually prioritise services to communities. Chapter 3 and 7 of the South African Constitution provide a general vision and mandatory policy framework which must be followed in order to build sustainable, responsive accountable based and people-centred municipalities.

A recent report by the Auditor-General, Chapter 9 institution, on the performance of municipalities across South Africa paints a bleak image with regards to the governance of municipalities. The key problems established during the audit of municipalities include flouting governance laws, disregarding recommendations made by audit bodies, threatening auditors, concealing and hiding financial statements, amongst other things. Moreover in the 257 municipalities audited for the 2017/2018 financial year only 18 received clean audits. This is a regression from 33 municipalities that had received clean audits in the previous year. 62 municipalities worsened and only 22 showed improvement. The principal causes of such poor performance by the majority of these municipalities are due to the lack of political will to do a right thing for the right reason by those who govern; lack of meaningful engagement with communities and lack of oversight accountability.

These factors combined constantly lead to irregular expenditure, material non-compliance with relevant mandatory legislative requirements and the inability to plan, spend and collect the revenue. Furthermore, Speaker, it is worth noting that the inability to collect debt from municipal consumers is widespread and often results in municipalities being unable to balance their books. It was the case with the Municipality of Bitou where they had a huge amount under bad debts so we have a serious problem there. These accounting failures normally lead to lack of service delivery for the people. Moreover such maladministration by those who govern these municipalities lead to lack of sustainable infrastructure with regards to roads, sanitation and water, to name a few. Commonsense provides that low capital spending on infrastructure cannot result in a sustainable infrastructure in the short and long term for these municipalities. Leadership sets tone at the top of any organisation. Where leaders are unethical, exercise disregard for proper governance, compliance, control and under-committed to transparency and accountability, this will filter through to the lower levels of the organisation and the results will be non-delivery of service to the people.

The possible solutions as EFF: Section 40(1) [*00:30:12] of the Constitution mandates cooperative governance amongst the three spheres of government, national, provincial and local. The Constitution further makes it clear that although these three tiers of government are distinctive they however remain interdependent and interrelated.

Furthermore Section 154 (1) requires both national and provincial governments to support and strengthen the capacity of municipalities to manage their own affairs, to exercise their powers and to perform their functions so municipalities cannot be left alone to do as they please. Other tiers of government must exercise oversight. Assist them with strategies, programmes, funding and other resources to enhance internal capacity.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, you must please wrap up.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: This also must involve determined municipal politicians who are willing to take on the leadership. The amendment of the Public Audit Act 25 of 2004, which came into effect in 2019, is also another step towards legally pressing the accountability and responsiveness from the municipalities.

Whilst previously the Auditor-General could only make recommendations to these municipalities, the new amendment act gives teeth to the institution by providing him with powers to refer ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: †Ndiyabulela kakhulu. [Thank you, your time is up.] Your time is up, thank you. Thank you hon member Makamba-Botya. Now I recognise hon member Labuschagne.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Hon Speaker, hon members, we all know that the Auditor-General's report indicates a steady decline in the state of municipalities in our country. One of the biggest concerns in the 2017/18 report is the lack of accountability with the domino effect on financial stability of municipalities especially in rural areas.

A lack of leadership and management are further contributing factors of municipalities in distress. Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities indicates the ideal we strive towards. The fact that we are debating this today is proof of this Government's commitment to accountable local governments and might be the reason why the picture of municipalities in distress is not that bleak in the Western Cape. We know that sustainability implies that our needs as humans should balance out available resources as well as ensuring future resources. Therefore, the biggest challenge for local governments are how to manage resources such as water, energy, housing, waste management and very importantly, finances. "Responsive and people-centred" implies that municipalities must focus on the needs of citizens and respond to those needs through effective service delivery. Hon Speaker, the role and functions of municipalities must also be understood within the context of the Constitution, specifically Chapter 3 that focuses on cooperative government and intergovernmental relations. Chapter 3 spells out that all spheres of Government are distinctive, interdependent and interrelated. It further makes provision for legislation to promote and facilitate intergovernmental relations.

Therefore the Systems and Structures Act provides the legal framework for municipalities as well as for Provincial and National Government regarding Local Government. Section 160 of the Municipal Systems Act is about non-performance and maladministration of municipalities. It gives the MEC of a province the right to request information or appoint a person to investigate if he or she has any reason to believe that the municipality cannot or does not fulfil their statutory obligations or that maladministration, fraud or corruption has taken place or is taking place.

In the context of the subject, namely building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities, as well as the serious findings of the AG report, we should ask ourselves the question: what are the contributing factors why the processes and systems as indicated in the Constitution and legal framework are not effective? The NCOP is the sphere of Government at the end of the line when Section 106 of the Systems Act must be implemented. In 2019 only, 15 Section 139 interventions have been initiated in the NCOP.

That means that 15 more municipalities to the already more than 40 have been subjected to a form of administration or have been dissolved. Despite the concern that there is no real database on how many municipalities are under administration in each province or any indication of how effective each intervention was, the biggest concern is that regarding misinformation to residents. Very often our work in the NCOP exposes members of Parliament to the political realities of dysfunctional or failing governments. We often bear witness to administrations that lack political will, transparency and ineffective management as well as municipal interventions that are often riddled with processes that are compromised and deviated from their intentional purposes. This is naturally coupled with politically manipulated blame games, misinformation and dishonesty with the affected communities.

On Tuesday we experienced this firsthand in Bitou where false perceptions and blame games were raised. Fortunately we were able to remedy these by having a constructive and engaging discussion that diffused any ambiguity. Considering the economic climate of the country it is becoming difficult to balance service delivery with available resources, coming up with new ideas and ensuring functional Local Governments that focus on the people. Even in our own political parties we must maintain a sense and level of ethical behaviour and governance. A frequent trend in the NCOP sees the interest of political parties supersede the interests of communities, especially when there are concerns, interventions.

Hon Speaker, while there is a lot more work to be done the Western Cape is already setting the benchmark for the rest of the country in terms of clean, effective, transparent and ethical governance. 12 out of the 18 municipalities received a clean audit from the Auditor-General for the 2017/18 financial year. This is indicative of the success of the Western Cape Government. The lessons and successful methods of the Western Cape Government should not just be used for political bragging but should serve as inspiration for other provinces to strive for better governance. This can result in far more open relations and cooperative governance in the long term. It starts with leadership and the DA will continue to lead where we govern. I thank you.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. The world and South Africa have changed significantly since 1994. Doing business or doing government as usual through a strongly centralised system is not allowing us to keep up with this changing world. In 2017, hon Speaker, 65% of South Africans were urbanised and we are predicting that 80% of South Africans will live in urban areas by 2050.

Hon Speaker, cities and towns are the pathways that South Africans will take to prosperity and local government is key to the future of our country but we have to ask ourselves whether local government is ready for this or empowered for this. Our municipalities must provide for people who are already living there and they need to be empowered to prepare for the future that is coming. This is why we need to turn government on its head. We must abandon centralised structures and instead empower municipalities with the powers and functions to build prosperous, safe and socially inclusive communities exactly where people are living.

Local government must take the lead to create an environment that is sustainable and liveable, where people are safe and employed with equitable access to services and opportunities. The duplication of functions at provincial and municipal government is expensive and wasteful. Devolving powers to municipalities will also bring Government and elected representatives closer to the communities they serve. Duplicated functions like housing, transport, health, climate change action should be progressively devolved from National and Provincial Governments.

The necessary economic growth to take our country and our people forward must be nested with an environmentally sustainable green economy. Our climate is changing far more rapidly than scientists have predicted and time is running out for us to meet our global warming targets. Developing countries are most at risk from climate change. In South Africa we have already seen the impact of floods, fires, droughts and heat waves. We must act urgently, hon Speaker, to reduce our carbon emissions and our impact on global warming and we will not achieve our targets without the leadership of municipalities.

Hon Speaker, there is no planet B and time is running out for the one earth that we have. Sustainable, responsible people-centred municipalities is the pathway to staying alive and municipalities must be given the powers and the functions to prepare for the future. Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, the ACDP welcomes this debate today. It is an important debate, an important topic to talk about building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities, but firstly, hon Speaker, sadly to say after 25 years some of our poorest communities still do not have adequate services. Hon Speaker, I just want to refer to the Auditor-General's report, Mr Kimi Mkwetu is saying that two municipalities did not even hand in their outstanding financials. That is Laingsburg and Kannaland. Now hon Speaker, that is the smallest municipalities you can get under the sun and yet they did not render in any financials and then we have three municipalities in the Western Cape that had qualified audits: George, Oudtshoorn and Beaufort West. So hon Speaker, the problem is these have been sad stories and bad stories for a long time. I want to know what the Minister is doing with his Department to intervene because this is the frustration we see when we see people burning tyres, the throwing of stones because people are frustrated. They are not getting adequate services, because, hon Speaker, the important thing is people want to see leaders that are accountable; leaders that are efficient and transparent and that is the type of leaders we must emulate. As political parties we must make sure that we get the right candidates to be our councillors out on the ground because the important thing is that is - like the other speaker said - the coalface. People want to see. They do not look at Government and say National. They look at Government as a whole and they want services and something must be done about that. If I look at the report further where they have done the oversight visit it is said that in the Western Cape and North West the bucket system is increasing. The bucket system is increasing if you go to the Statistician General, the bucket system is increasing. [Interjections.]

†Die HOOFSWEEP (ANC): Is dit seer?

[The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Does it hurt?]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: In North West and the Western Cape the bucket system is increasing. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So it tells me, hon Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... that in certain areas people do not have any dignity because they cannot use toilet facilities and that is the problem. You check, you check, you check. You read, you read, you read. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not go there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You must try and wrap up, hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, so the Department of Local Government has got a vision, a vision of having well governed municipalities, integrated municipalities, sustainable municipalities and we want this Local Government to play a bigger role to ensure that our people get the services required. I thank you.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Speaker, fellow South Africans, this week we observed two contrasting life lessons. The first was characterised by Bitou Municipality's motto to be the best together. In particular the words "to be" always seem to refer to a future state - a continuous skirmish to a better tomorrow, but not today. The second lesson was characterised by Mossel Bay Municipality's motto, "Explore endless horizons", a lesson of exploration that permeated throughout every engagement and every programme we witnessed in the Mossel Bay area.

At KwaNokutula Waste Transfer Station in Bitou we learnt that the station can receive used oil, e-waste, household hazardous waste and general household refuse. Part of the waste is then transferred to the Petro SA landfill facility in Mossel Bay, the district facility, and the main concern, however, was that the vast amount spent on waste transport costs to Mossel Bay. The Mayor then indicated that they would like another permit to be approved for a new landfill site in Plettenberg Bay, but hon Speaker, money is not always the answer and more is not always better. Upon inquiry I found that the reason behind the excessive transport costs was because the waste was previously transported via the rail system, which is now unsafe.

The inquiry also revealed that the railway and Kaaimans River railway bridge needed repairing due to the damage sustained during the floods of 2006. It was thought that the line to George would then reopen in 2020 but this is sadly not the case. So the money the Municipality requires to subsidise their transport costs and to acquire another landfill is not necessarily because there is more waste at the site, but because of the dilapidated bridge and railway.

This has also negative impacts on the tourism economy as the Outeniqua Choo Tjoe was one of the main attractions in the area.

The Bitou Municipality further appealed to us that the new electricity licensing proposal from NERSA suggesting an increase in Eskom licensing distribution areas would impact the revenue stream and debt collection for other municipal services; while their belief that they would have capacity to take over the grid supporting the City of Cape Town's court application to prove that municipalities can distribute electricity. Bitou's problem is bigger than simply taking over the grid. It is bigger than more money and it is bigger than more permits. Their problem is a lack of vision, innovation and exploration. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: So you are correct [Inaudible.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: In the Mossel Bay Municipality we found similar programmes for recycling but what set them apart was the local work at the Kwanonqaba Waste Transfer Station's Oom Roux, whose own initiative to go through the waste and then put any plants or miscellaneous recyclable items aside to repurpose in other residents' homes, was a success. What sets them apart was that they currently give teachers at the local primary school points for recycling and as a reward the Municipality provides classrooms with worm farms in which vegetables can be grown. Furthermore, in terms of innovation they could formalise their composting facility at Hartenbos and by doing so they could increase their recycling performance from 18% to 25% in the future. Despite not having enough waste to make large renewable energy projects viable at the moment, like the Drakenstein Municipality... [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Or Knysna.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: ...they still issued a notice to request any ideas from the community, local entrepreneurs and businesses in order to turn their waste into energy. [Interjections.] For turning waste into... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Please let us not drown the member on the floor. Please proceed, hon member Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: In order to turn waste into energy they would require 2000 tons of waste per day. Currently they only produce 8000 tons of waste per month. They also identified a proposed special economic zone in order to grow their economy with the focus on the oil and gas sector and the ocean's economy. They have even found innovative ways to fund this proposed project through private partnerships and commercial loans. Their electricity losses are below the national average and more than a third of the electricity revenue comes from commercial and industrial consumers. In order to convince customers to use their grid instead of Eskom's they have packaged their services around their grid, making the areas assigned to the Municipality more attractive to investors. Further their technical services are already completely off the grid boasting that they are never looking back.

Hon Speaker, this week we indeed saw two contrasting stories regarding waste-to-energy programmes and these are critical to local economic development - a story of success and one of stagnation and it is up to leaders in various communities to decide whether they want to live up to their mottoes, continue waiting to be the best for tomorrow or whether they want to explore the endless horizons.

Do we want money or do we want innovative finance? Do we want houses or do we want communities? Do we want more landfills or do we want energy security? Waste may not necessarily be the most glorified industry, but it can help us to take back our power. I thank you. [Applause.]

†Die ADJUNKHOOFSWEEP (DA): Daai is warme kole.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Those are hot coals.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! I now recognise hon member P Marais.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, hon members, first I wish to congratulate the Minister and his Department for having received the most clean municipal audits for the years 2017/2018 [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: hear-hear!

†Me D M BAARTMAN: Afrikaans asseblief.

[Ms D M BAARTMAN: Afrikaans please.]

Mr P J MARAIS: 12 out of the 18 audits, announced nationally by the Auditor-General, came from the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr P J MARAIS: However, there is no room for complacency and chest beating because what is disturbing is the fact that the percentage of municipalities in the Western Cape that achieved clean audits have declined from 70% to only 40%.

†Nou die Ouditeur-Generaal het dit toegeskryf aan 'n verslapping van beheer by sommige munisipaliteite en dit moet dadelik aangespreek word. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Now the Auditor-General ascribed it to a slackening of control by some municipalities and it should be addressed immediately. [Interjections.]] The West - I want to tell you what the Auditor-General said. [Interjections.]

†n AGBARE LID: Dit is ou nuus!

[An HON MEMBER: It is old news!]

Mr P J MARAIS: We have observed that the lapses in controls in certain municipalities in this province were largely non-adherence to statutory submissions of financial statements and audits. Now, Mr Chairman...

An HON MEMBER: Hon Speaker.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, I want to give a little bit of advice if I am allowed to? I do not want to complain. How do we solve this problem? It is all of ours problem. It is not a party problem. It is a Western Cape problem.

†Ek wil aanbeveel dat die Minister van Plaaslike Bestuur 'n ministeriële komitee in die lewe roep wat soos 'n rondgaande inspektoraat sal optree en munisipaliteite deurlopend en gereeld sal besoek. Hul stelsels en hul boeke nagaan en terug aan die Minister rapporteer. Miskien kan die Minister oorweeg om een van die Departement se direkteure, 'n verteenwoordiger van SALGA en 'n gekwalifiseerde rekenmeester vir die doel aan te wys. Hulle moet onverwags by munisipaliteite kan opdaag of op kort kennisgewing.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[I want to recommend that the Minister of Local Government establishes a ministerial committee that can operate as a circuit inspectorate and visit municipalities continuously and regularly. Examine their systems and their books and report back to the Minister. Perhaps the Minister can consider appointing one of the Department's directors, a representative of SALGA and a qualified accountant for the purpose. They must be able to arrive at municipalities unannounced or at short notice.]

We need an early warning system if our oversight function is to be meaningful and effective.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, you need to wrap up.

Mr P J MARAIS: I will, sir, and political parties must also take some of the blame. The educational qualifications and skills of some councillors and mayors are not impressive enough to qualify them as councillors in charge of effective, efficient service delivery because one cannot build a strong structure with inferior material. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Marais, your time is up.

Mr P J MARAIS: I thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Klap hande, komaan! [Gelag.] [Applous.]

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Clap hands, come on! [Laughter.] [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon members. Order, hon members, I am sure we have clapped now. Thank you. I recognise hon Van Der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Speaker, die gebiede van beide Bitou en Mosselbaai het van die mooiste kuslyne en die pragtigste natuurskoon ter wêreld en beide steun swaar op vakansiegangers en toerisme vir hul plaaslike ekonomieë. Beide is sogenaamde B-tipe munisipaliteite en beide val onder die Tuinroete Distriksmunisipaliteit. Beide ervaar ernstige uitdagings wat nie uniek is aan daardie deel of die res van ons land nie; uitdagings soos met die hantering van afval in sensitiewe gebiede en veral uitdagings met die voorsiening van behoorlike behuising vir die vinnig-groeiende vraag na huisvesting en soos wat dit oral die geval is, is die begroting van die sentrale regering vir beide munisipaliteite vir die bou van huise nie genoeg nie en is al meer inwoners van hierdie munisipale gebiede aangewese op informele behuising. Daar is dus baie ooreenkomste tussen hierdie twee munisipaliteite maar die verskille wat ons hierdie week gesien het, was oorweldigend.

Mosselbaai Munisipaliteit is gelukkig dat daar politieke stabiliteit is en dat die DA in beheer is, en dit is nie kontroversieel nie. Dit is 'n feit. [Tussenwerpsels.] In Bitou het die beheer 'n paar keer gewissel en word die beheer tans uitgeoefen deur 'n koalisie van die Active United Front en die ANC met burgemeester Peter Lobese die enigste verteenwoordiger van die AUF, 'n klein plaaslike party, en die verskil tussen 'n politiek- en administratief stabiele, soos in die geval van Mosselbaai, en 'n onstabiele politieke en administratiewe gebied soos in die geval van Bitou, kon nie beter geïllustreer word as deur die onderskeie aanbiedings van die twee owerhede hierdie week nie.

In die geval van Bitou is daar 'n gebrek aan begrip vir die rol van ander regeringsfere en instellings en hierdie onkunde lei op sy beurt tot spanning, agterdog, wanpersepsies en valse voorstellings. Om maar een so 'n voorbeeld te noem, alle distriksmunisipaliteite het 'n bepaalde oorsigrol ten opsigte van gesondheids- en omgewingskwessies en het die mag om aktiwiteite wat van die regulasies afwyk na inspeksie te sluit. Die burgemeester van Bitou het groot gewag gemaak van wat hy gesien het as ongehoorde optrede deur die Tuinroete Distriksmunisipaliteit deurdat hulle na bewering 'n geheime forensiese ondersoek ten opsigte van Bitou sou geloods het. [Tussenwerpsels.] Volgens die distriksmunisipaliteit was dit bloot 'n roetine inspeksieverslag rakende die vasteafvalbestuur in Bitou en waarin bepaalde tekortkominge geïdentifiseer is en waar Bitou die kans gegee is om die gebreke reg te stel. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, the areas of both Bitou and Mossel Bay have some of the most beautiful coast lines in the world and both are depending heavily on holidaymakers and tourism for their local economies. Both are so-called B-type municipalities and both resort under the Garden Route District Municipality. Both are experiencing serious challenges that are not unique to that part or the rest of our country; challenges such as with the handling of waste in sensitive areas and especially challenges with the provision of proper housing for the rapidly growing demand for housing and as it is the case everywhere, the budget of the Central Government for both municipalities for building houses is not adequate and more and more inhabitants are dependent on informal housing.

There are thus several similarities between these two municipalities but the differences we have seen this week were overwhelming.

Mossel Bay Municipality is fortunate that there is political stability and that the DA is in control, and that is not controversial. It is a fact. [Interjections.] In Bitou the control has varied a few times and presently control is exercised by a coalition of the Active United Front and the ANC with Mayor Peter Lobese the only representative of the AUF, a small local party, and the difference between a politically and administrative stable, as in the case of Mossel Bay, and an unstable political and administrative area as in the case of Bitou, could not be better illustrated than by the respective presentations of the two authorities this week.

In the case of Bitou there is a lack of understanding of the role of other spheres of government and institutions and this ignorance in turn leads to tension, suspicion, misconceptions and false representations. To name only one such example, all district municipalities have a definite oversight role with regard to health and environmental issues and have the power to close activities deviating from the regulations after inspection. The Mayor of Bitou made a big noise about what he saw as intolerable action by the Garden Route District Municipality in that they have allegedly launched a secret forensic investigation with regard to Bitou. [Interjections.] According to the District Municipality it was merely a routine inspection report in connection with the waste management in Bitou in which specific shortcomings were identified and where Bitou was given the opportunity to rectify these shortcomings. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It was good when we governed [Inaudible.]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Onder die huidige politieke leierskap en administrasie in Bitou het 'n potensieel pragtige behuisingsprojek tot stilstand geknars met stygings in kostes en politieke onrus. Danksy die ingryping van hierdie Provinsiale Regering se Departement van Menslike Nedersettings is hierdie projek figuurlik uit die vuur gekrap [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Under the present political leadership and administration in Bitou a potentially excellent housing project ground to a halt with escalations in costs and political unrest. Thanks to the intervention of this Provincial Government's Department of Human Settlements this project has figuratively been pulled from the fire. [Interjection.]]

†n AGBARE LID: Ag asseblief!

[An HON MEMBER: Oh please!]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...en word daar tans pragtige vordering getoon... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...and presently excellent progress is shown... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...maar die gras wat oor die hope groei toon duidelik dat daar vir baie lank geen aktiwiteit was nie. Die spanning en dubbelpraat in Bitou het gemaak dat dit 'n baie bekommerde... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...but the grass growing over the mounds shows clearly that for very long there has been no activity. The tension and doublespeak in Bitou have caused that it was a very worried ... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon member Van der Westhuizen, please take your seat. I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I was under the impression that we had agreed that we would respect the convention of maiden speeches. I therefore ask that hon Van der Westhuizen be allowed to proceed with his speech uninterrupted. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members, there is a point of order by the Chief Whip. Now the Speaker did not hear what the Chief Whip was saying because the noise was of unprecedented measures. I would then want to hear what the Chief Whip had to say. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Hon Speaker, to repeat, hon Van der Westhuizen is attempting to deliver his maiden speech. I therefore ask that the convention be respected.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. Hon members, may we please as I have indicated earlier - I would not want to belabour the point; that we proceed in that regard. Are we all in favour?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you Chair. How much time do I have left now, three and a half minutes?

The SPEAKER: You now have three minutes.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Three minutes, thank you. †Watter vars bries was dit dus om Mosselbaai hierna te kon besoek. Alhoewel hierdie munisipaliteit ook ernstige uitdagings het, is daar 'n positiewe gees onder die politieke en administratiewe leierskap en hulle getuig van goeie skakeling en samewerking met ander regeringsfere en uitstekende toegang tot eksterne geldbronne. Dit was verblydend om inisiatiewe te sien waarvolgens inwoners se lewensomstandighede daadwerklik verbeter word; inisiatiewe soos die bou van *en suite*-toilette vir veral bejaarde en verswakte inwoners; behuisingsprojekte met innoverende ontwerpe wat gemik is op die skep van gelukkige gemeenskappe, en dankie aan agb lid Nkondlo wat erkenning daaraan verleen het vandag.

Dit was 'n plesier om te ry deur netjiese skoon woonbuurte, woonbuurte verteenwoordigend van die hele spektrum van sosio-ekonomiese omstandighede. Goeie politieke en administratiewe leierskap en stabiliteit is duidelik in die beste belang van kiesers maar as ons kyk na die uitslag van die Mei 2019 Provinsiale / Nasionale Verkiesings is dit duidelik dat al meer kiesers hul steun uitbring vir kleiner partye wat aan weerskante van die politieke spektrum lê en die uitslae van verskeie tussenverkiesings insluitende gister onderstreep hierdie tendens. Daar is dus 'n groot moontlikheid - ek wil byna sê, daar is 'n gevaar - dat die stabiliteit in goeie dienslewering wat verskeie Wes-Kaapse munisipaliteite die afgelope jaar ervaar het, met die 2020/2021 verkiesings iets van die verlede kan wees.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[What a fresh breeze it was therefore to visit Mossel Bay afterwards. Although this municipality also has serious challenges, there is a positive spirit among the political and administrative leadership and they show evidence of good liaison and cooperation with other spheres of government and excellent access to external financial resources. It was heartening to see initiatives through which residents' life conditions are improved in reality; initiatives such as the building of *en suite* toilets for especially aged and vulnerable residents; housing projects with innovative designs aimed at creating happy communities, and thanks to the hon member Nkondlo who today gave recognition to that. It has been a pleasure to drive through neat and clean neighbourhoods, neighbourhoods representative of the whole spectrum of socio-economic circumstances. Good political and administrative leadership and stability are clearly in the interest of voters, but as we look at the result of the May 2019 Provincial / National Elections it is clear that more and more voters bring out their support for smaller parties on either side of the political spectrum and the results of various by-elections including yesterday's underline this tendency. There is thus a big possibility – I almost want to say danger – that the stability in good service delivery which various Western Cape municipalities have experienced over the past year, may be something of the past with the 2020/2021 elections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Waarom is koalisies met kleiner plaaslike partye, na my oordeel, hoogs onwenslik? Die geskiedenis het vir ons gewys dat hierdie kleiner koalisie-vennote, die sogenaamde “king makers”, vinnig van vennoot verwissel en dat hulle keuse van vennoot dikwels berus op die vergoeding gekoppel aan die posisies wat hulle onder sulke scenario's aangebied word.

Bekwame senior amptenare word in hierdie tye van onstabiliteit te gedienstig geag aan die politieke party en word goue handdrukke aangebied, en met die vertrek van hierdie kundige en effektiewe amptenare word ons munisipaliteite geknou op 'n manier wat jare neem om weer te herstel.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Why are coalitions with smaller parties, in my judgement, highly undesirable? History has shown us that these smaller coalition partners, the so-called “king makers”, quickly change partners and that their choice of partner is often based on the remuneration coupled with the positions that are offered to them under such scenarios.]

Experienced senior officials are being regarded in these times of instability as being too loyal to the political party and are offered golden handshakes, and with the departure of these knowledgeable and effective officials our municipalities are damaged in a way that takes years to repair.]

†'n AGB LID: In Oudtshoorn.

[An HON MEMBER: In Oudtshoorn.]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Na ons besoek aan Mosselbaai en Bitou [Tussenwerpsels.], kan 'n mens maar net weer 'n oproep tot kiesers rig: stem slegs vir partye wat u stemme ernstig sal opneem; wat 'n langtermyn visie het [Tussenwerpsels.] en waarvan 'n mens kan verwag dat hulle by hulle beginsels sal hou. Stem vir partye waarvan die openbare verteenwoordigers nie met posisies en beloftes van groter vergoeding omgekoop sal word nie, en waar daar interne dissipline is wanneer verteenwoordigers [Tussenwerpsels.] hulle beginsels versaak, en wees versigtig vir die talle nuwe politieke partye wat tussen nou en 2021 se plaaslike verkiesing soos sampioene gaan opskiet. Ek dank u. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: After our visit to Mossel Bay and Bitou [Interjections.], one can only once again call on voters to only vote for parties that take their votes seriously; that have a long term vision [Interjections.] and from which one can expect to keep to their principles. Vote for parties of which the public representatives are not bribed by positions and promises of greater remuneration, and where there is internal discipline when representatives [Interjections.] start neglecting their principles, and be cautious of the many new political parties that between now and 2021's local elections are going to spring up like mushrooms. I thank you. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] Thank you hon member Van der Westhuizen. Hon members, thank you. I now recognise hon member Gillion. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Speaker, before I start, let me raise this discomfort with the pre-empted political agenda, that was so obvious, by the DA in this provincial week. [Interjections.] This is not how we should support local government. [Interjections.] Otherwise we will lose the purpose of the Provincial Oversight Week.

The NCOP should also investigate the member who issued a one-sided media statement and the outcomes of the oversight visit, before we could even conclude a report.

An HON MEMBER: It should have been [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: But rest assured, Mr Speaker, we were not drunk or blind as the members this side of the House. [Interjections.] You cannot wish us away [Interjections.], we were part of this oversight. [Interjections.] I am very grateful, Mr Speaker, for the opportunity to be part of the team that is participating on the report-back session following our provincial week programme.

It is important to stress that the purpose of the provincial week was to solace the provincial interest and to ensure that we, the delegates to the NCOP, to keep abreast of developments, as well as service delivery challenges facing this province.

I am also very grateful to have been part of oversight visits to various municipalities in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Mmm.

Ms M N GILLION: I sometimes wonder where these members of the DA get their courage from to misleading the nation [Interjections.] through catch phrases like “corruption-free government” [Interjections.], or “best-run government”.

Evidence gathered from these visits to municipalities disproves all these claims. [Interjections.] Bitou Municipality is the case in point.

An HON MEMBER: Of what?

An HON MEMBER: Who?

Ms M N GILLION: This municipality is experiencing serious cash flow challenges, which forced it to fund its capital expenditure from its own reserves. As the result decreasing municipal reserves. [Interjections.] The municipality also financially bridge the Human Settlement Grant with over R22 million.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh.

Ms M N GILLION: The AG also highlighted ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yôh.

Ms M N GILLION: ... that the municipality incurred [Interjections.] an operation over expenditure of R32.6 million, as it spent R605.5 million over its R573 million operation budget. Whilst some may be quick to judge and cast aspersions against municipal officials and council, but can we pause for a second, Mr Speaker, and ask what really cause these challenges?

The main reason is that the Provincial Government did not pay all DoRA allocations ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ag shame.

Ms M N GILLION: ... for Human Settlement Grants. MEC Simmers and his Department must account for the R22 million it has not paid to the municipality. [Interjections.]

It is generally accepted that some of the serious challenges facing municipalities can be ascribed to weak provincial oversight and monitoring of local government and compliance, and lack of consequence management. This was explained to everyone present in the oversight visit.

When we speak of these challenges facing municipalities we should also put a spotlight on the ineffective oversight and interference by the Provincial Government and MEC ... [Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: Dit is julle mense.

[An HON MEMBER: It is your people.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... which resulted in destabilisation of certain municipalities.

Mr Speaker, the Finance MEC presentation clearly stated that district municipalities' sustainability is under threat. Some of the reasons for this were listed as budget implementation [Interjections.] challenges and slow capital expenditure.

The presentation showed that Cederberg Municipality [Interjections.] did not report a positive cash and cash equivalent balances.

An HON MEMBER: You have been going on during [Inaudible.].

Ms M N GILLION: This will be a thing of the past [Interjections.] as the municipality is now back in good hands. After yesterday's by-election the ANC took over this municipality. [Interjections.] [Applause.] Allow me to congratulate the ANC ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Ms M N GILLION: ... on its resounding victory.

An HON MEMBER: Overwhelming. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Other municipalities, Mr Speaker, like Matzikama, Witzenberg, Drakenstein, Breede Valley, Overberg, Theewaterskloof [Interjections.], Kannaland, Mossel Bay, Bitou, Knysna, Central Karoo, Laingsburg and Beaufort West are experiencing liquidity risk. [Interjections.]

The Provincial Government seems to know what is needed [Interjections.] to address these challenges.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members, let us not drown out the hon member that is speaking.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you for the protection, Mr Speaker, [Interjections.] but somehow it is not implementing them.

The Finance MEC presented good governance drivers, which, if implemented, would help municipalities turn the tide. Good governance is at the heart of the effective functioning of municipalities. We were told this by Graham Paulse, the HOD of Local Government. While the HOD reported that all councils in the province are functional, except for Cederberg, where there is instability, he did not stress the problem enough.

The Mayor of this municipality recently overstepped his legislative mandate by conducting disciplinary hearings against all ANC councillors and found them guilty for contravening the ...[Interjections.] - can I be protected?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members [Interjections.]. Hon members, order. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you. ... code of conduct for councillors. Mayors do not have such powers. [Interjections.] This was brought to the attention of MEC Bredell, who refused to act against the Mayor. That Mayor does not know his mandate and should be suspended, [Interjections.] but luckily was removed yesterday by the power of the people through the ballots. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, the HOD also mentioned that all municipalities have anti-corruption measures. I am worried and think these anti-corruption measures need to be revealed. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members [Interjections.] ... hon members [Interjections.], I need your indulgence. We have a very important debate and it is up to the conduct of members how we are able to take the matters raised by the communities forward.

Now it is a bit of a worrying situation, so I am requesting hon members, that we please respect the proceedings so that we are able to continue seamlessly. You have three minutes left, hon member.

Ms M N GILLION: I just hope you saved my time, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I did.

Ms M N GILLION: I am worried and think these anti-corruption measures need to be reviewed, for example the NCOP has been busy with the "Love Knysna" petition since 2015, which raises serious issues of corruption and maladministration [Interjections.] in this municipality. It raises serious irregularities with ISDF tender and places Premier Winde and MEC Bredell at the centre ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Ms M N GILLION: ... of the challenges in the municipality. [Interjections.] Due to the seriousness of the issues raised in the petition, [Interjections.] the NCOP referred some matters to the Public Protector for investigation. Those who have are seen to be fighting corruption ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms M N GILLION: ... in the municipality ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Gillion, will you please take your seat. Hon the Chief Whip of the Opposition.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, we have a speaker on the floor and I would like to request that you rule on the levels of noise that are in the House. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon Chief Whip. Ja, if you were to sit in this Chair. [Laughter.] You will understand the difficulty that the House in general is creating. I could point members on both sides who are making this difficult, but thank you, hon Chief Whip of the Opposition, I hope you will assist me and the Chief Whip will also assist me on the other side. I recognise you, Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. It is really good to have the hon member from the NCOP back in this House and I welcome her back here, but I would like to ask - and she remembers the convention - the speaker on the floor whether she would take a question?

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms M N GILLION: I will take the question when I am back here. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Never.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, thank you, hon members. Then the question is not being entertained, hon Premier, unfortunately. Let us proceed. Hon member Gillion. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Those who have are seen to be fighting corruption in the municipality are targeted and purged. MEC Bredell is at the centre of attempts to discipline and remove Mayor Mark Willemse and councillor Peter Myers. This will result in the destabilisation of the municipality. [Interjections.]

It is unsurprising that the MEC is also at the centre ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order! Please proceed, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Can you please protect me against the MEC of Human Settlements. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] the money.

The SPEAKER: Order! Please proceed, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Speaker, I think you must add more time. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms M N GILLION: It is unsurprising that the MEC is also at the centre of chaos in the George Municipality.

An HON MEMBER: Wow.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh.

Ms M N GILLION: Investigators, on 10 September, started the duty of looking ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Will you please take your seat. There is a point of order. Hon Chief Whip.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I rise on a point of order on Rule 59(1)(a). The member is imputing improper motives on another member of this House.

An HON MEMBER: It is hot in the kitchen. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, thank you.

An HON MEMBER: It is hot in the kitchen.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I am sure we will recognise that we have agreed here that when you want to make a statement that has a bearing on the integrity or the dignity of a member sitting in this House, it must be done by means of a substantive motion, and the Rules allow for that, and in this case the hon member has not done so, and you are doing it differently and that becomes a matter that we cannot allow because it is out of order.

So you must proceed without feeling intimidated that you cannot speak, but do so within the Rules, please.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: And with that then you must withdraw that point that you made.

Ms M N GILLION: Which point, Mr Speaker? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: About the individual ...[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Which one?

The SPEAKER: ... MEC.

Ms M N GILLION: Which one? [Interjections.] No-no-no, Mr Speaker, you cannot [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: The ...[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Speaker, please allow me to address you. You cannot just rule, "Withdraw the statement," and you do not tell me which one. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Gillion. I was still on the floor to assist the hon member. What you must withdraw is the statement where you said the hon member is part of the chaos in George. [Interjections.] Ja, but I am saying "he is the centre of that", ja. You know, those are the semantics. Do not draw the Speaker to the debate. [Interjections.]

So what I am requesting here, I think we have been doing this very well. We have been having a very good debate.

So I am simply highlighting the area which the member knows that you must withdraw that specific area, specific section of the speech, and then proceed with the speech.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Speaker, I never said he is part, I said he is at the centre.

So which one ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Remove the ...[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... must I remove?

The SPEAKER: Remove the one "at the centre".

Ms M N GILLION: Okay, I will do so. I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: I withdraw "in the centre". [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon member.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, thank you. [Interjections.] Okay, Mr Speaker, DA insiders are telling us that the DA caucus had a meeting with MEC Bredell ...[Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: Yes!

Ms M N GILLION: ... who apparently gave the instruction ...[Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: Yes!

Ms M N GILLION: ... to table the motion to suspend Trevor Botha, the municipal manager [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Indistinct.] making it wrong.

Ms M N GILLION: No, Trevor Botha thinks his suspension [Interjections.] is a demonstration of political retaliation after he reported the R350 million Old Mutual Investment ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Sanlam.

An HON MEMBER: Huh?

Ms M N GILLION: ... allegations of corruption to the police.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Sanlam!

Ms M N GILLION: Graham Poulse confirmed that there are only two Section 106 investigations underway. They are in Bitou and George Municipalities.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh.

Ms M N GILLION: I have my reservation with Horizon Forensic investigations in Bitou ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, you need to wrap up.

Ms M N GILLION: We need to check the possible conflict of interest as this company was employed by the council to conduct an investigation [Interjections.], who never gave a report to the municipality, but sent it, sorry, to the MEC.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time is up.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I now - thank you, hon members. I now recognise hon member Sileku. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Another maiden.

Mr I M SILEKU: Hon †Somlomo [Speaker], hon members, fellow South Africans, Alderman Anton Coetzee, chairperson of SALGA Western Cape, †goeie middag [good afternoon.]

Since 1994 it has been anticipated that Local Government will play a significant role in the New South Africa. The 1998 White Paper on Local Government envisaged a local government sphere and a core of socio-economic development, a vision confirmed by the 2012 National Development Plan, NDP.

Numerous indicators unfortunately however suggests that Local Government sector is not optimally fulfilling its assigned mandate with many municipalities in disarray.

†Hon Somlomo [Speaker], during my first visit as a member of the National Council of Provinces, I have come to learn of a new phrase in Local Government, “ICU”. Meaning our municipalities are on life-support. When you are on life-support †zimbini izinto ezinokwenzeka, oyokuqala imeko yakho ingabangcono okanye imeko yakho ingaqhubekela ibemaxongo ngakumbi. [There are two things that can happen when you are on life support, firstly your condition can get better or it can deteriorate.]

It can never be acceptable for us to allow †ooMasipala bethu bahambe beqhubekela besiba kwi meko ezimaxongo sijongile. [our Municipalities are in bad condition and we are zooming in on this.]

Mr Speaker, we need to be bold enough as the Government when we deal with what takes place in our municipalities that are in ICU. All of us in this House know who and where the source of this comes from, because during our visit, which consists of all political parties, I was fortunate enough to be part of the conversation, uninvited of course, when a member of the ANC said, after a visit, “I am so worried about the ANC [Interjections.], because the ANC municipalities governed by them, are in disarray.” [Interjections.]

In the Amahlati Local Municipality [Interjections.] in the Eastern Cape [Interjections.] ... In the Amahlati Local Municipality in the Eastern Cape, municipal property was damaged with the main offices and other buildings having been torched, while in the Msunduzi Local Municipality in KwaZulu Natal, councillors intentionally avoided council meetings with the sole purpose of making sure there is no quorum. [Interjections.] In Kwakwani Local Municipality in the Northern Cape, the Mayor has been on sick leave for two years. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ANC.

Mr I M SILEKU: His family uses municipal property to do personal business without any consequences. [Interjections.]

Mr E Z NJADU: Order, Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr I M SILEKU: There is infighting amongst the majority party, which is the ANC ...[Interjections.]

Mr E Z NJADU: Order, order, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr E Z NJADU: Point of order, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

Mr E Z NJADU: A point of order, Chair. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, there is one Speaker, so I will help you here.

An HON MEMBER: There is only one.

The SPEAKER: I recognise hon member Njadu and then after which the Chief Whip.

Mr E Z NJADU: Chairperson, this oversight was in the Western Cape ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr E Z NJADU: ... and let us focus on the oversight which was on the Western Cape [Interjections.] and we must highlight the issues that were [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr E Z NJADU: ... the issues were in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr E Z NJADU: We cannot come with issues of - we are from the NCOP, yes ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr E Z NJADU: ... but Speaker, it was a provincial week [Interjections.] and not an NCOP week.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat.

Mr E Z NJADU: It was a provincial week. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please take you seat, hon member. [Interjections.] Hon members ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Please remember that [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: ... please let us conduct ourselves in a manner that recognises the decorum of this House. [Interjections.] I recognise the Chief Whip, then the LOGB. The Chief Whip.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. First of all that was not a point of order in terms of our Rules, but what I would like to ask is that it is hon member Sileku's maiden speech in this House [Interjections.] and therefore that we respect the principle that we have agreed to, thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Hon member Sileku, will you please remain seated. Thank you, sir. Hon LOGB?

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, thank you, but I am covered. I just wanted to draw the attention of the member who was raising the point of order. The topic of the debate. The topic of the debate is talking about building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities [Interjections.].

It says [Interjections.] ... No-no-no, no, I am talking about the topic of the debate. [Interjections.]

So there is absolutely nothing wrong from a member of the National Council of Provinces [Interjections.] drawing comparisons relevant to the topic with other areas. [Interjections.]

So relevance here is the issue and the member is very relevant. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members [Interjections.] ... Thank you, hon members. Thank you, hon Minister Madikizela, there is another point of order, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I think we must remember what is our mandate. [Interjections.] We are discussing Western Cape and we are only responsible for the Western Cape, and we have no power and authority over any municipality in any of the other eight provinces, so I would agree with the member that we must discuss what is our mandate. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. [Interjections.] Hon members, let me, let me assist the House. We have, as part of the debate, members from the National Council of Provinces and you will agree with me that they go around the country and that includes the Western Cape as part of the country ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: ... because the Western Cape is not an island.

An HON MEMBER: Absolutely.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Now [Interjections.] ... now ... please do not speak whilst the Speaker is speaking.

An HON MEMBER: That is why [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: What then happens in that spirit is that because of the nature of the debate, it is a political debate. Members will not be circumscribed to specifications because of the nature of the debate. It is a wide-ranging political debate.

So I am requesting that members be tolerant of somehow a debate that might be unfamiliar in terms of what you expect it to be, because of the nature of the debate, which is the topic of the day.

So that is in that spirit.

So I will entertain any conversation that seeks to talk to the matter, irrespective of the limitation in terms of provinces, especially from members of the National Council of Provinces, because we know we have got a convention here. When there is a topic it has to be consistent with our mandate, but NCOP's is broad. Hon member Njadu?

Mr E Z NJADU: Mr Speaker, I am not saying that Western Cape is an island, but this event was a provincial week, meaning it was led by the Provincial Government. The issues that were discussed were the issues of importance for the province.

As a NCOP member I am representing the Province. All provinces [Interjections.] had their own provincial weeks.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon member Njadu. Now I want to [Interjections.] - alright, hon members, I have already made the ruling on this matter. There is no further debate. Now we proceed. [Interjections.] Hon member Sileku.

Mr I M SILEKU: Hon Marais †ndiyakuva kodwa andiyiva lento uyithethayo [Hon Marais, I hear you but I am not hearing you.][Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: How many?

Mr I M SILEKU: Are we still in Polokwane? [Interjections.]. The salary bill is standing at 69%; that is way above the norm of 35%.

An HON MEMBER: Talk about [Inaudible.].

Mr I M SILEKU: Mr Speaker, I agree that we need to change the way our municipalities are governed in South Africa. [Interjections.] We must make sure, as others spheres of government, and do whatever is necessary ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Please proceed, hon member Sileku.

Mr I M SILEKU: [Interjections.] We do whatever is necessary in assisting as per the Constitution and other relevant legislation. It is very critical that the three spheres of government work together for the betterment of our people, especially the most vulnerable.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr I M SILEKU: We cannot allow what happened to the Clanwilliam Dam to continue.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr I M SILEKU: The feasibility study for this project was concluded in 2007 [Interjections.] and the construction is long overdue. The National Government has failed the community of the West Coast and their municipalities by taking more than a decade to implement the project.

If the Clanwilliam Dam was lifted in time, the community would not have been severely affected by the drought.

Hon †Somlomo [Speaker], if we are truly honest and care about the lives of the poor, we urgently need to look at how municipalities are funded by the National Government.

Currently 9% of the national fiscus goes towards local municipalities. It is a known fact that some municipalities are highly dependent on national grants and struggle to broaden their rate base. On top of that debtors have this disease of not paying for services rendered.

Mr Speaker, I know what I have said is very depressing to the ears but not all is lost. I have been part of a municipality that was confronted with the possibility of not paying salaries of municipal workers due to the decision taken by the previous administration under the leadership of hon member Gillion, who was the Mayor for 2008 until 2010. [Interjections.] Incurred in [Interjections.] Overberg District Municipality.

When they got the municipality there was reserves, but when we got the municipality in 2011 we had to come and beg the Minister of Finance to allow us to pay out the grant in time so that we pay salaries of councillors [Interjections.] and what we have done because ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr I M SILEKU: ... you had a very decisive Government ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sileku ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: 2010. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... will you please take your seat.

Ms M N GILLION: Even that is ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I recognise the Chief Whip of the Opposition. Hon members, [Interjections.] order! The Chief Whip of the Opposition.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, I have taken note of members exchanging words in the House and in that respect hon member Maseko is using a phrase or rather a word “looters”, and I actually am concerned if whether that name is referring to any member of this House sitting on this side of the ANC. Thank you. [Interjections.] And also can you rule whether that name is parliamentary. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Chief Whip of the Opposition. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Order. Order, hon members. Hon member Maseko, were you referring to a specific member? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What word?

Ms L M MASEKO: Mr Speaker, my freedom of speech must not be when I am in here really it has to be [Inaudible.]. I never said anyone is a looter, I said “looters”. Whoever who feels he is a looter will react, but I never mentioned anyone. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon member, please take your seat. [Interjections.] The name itself, the question that was raised by the Chief Whip ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Armed robbers.

The SPEAKER: ... of the Opposition [Interjections.] ...

Ms N D NKONDLO: Armed robbers.

The SPEAKER: ... and the Chief Whip was asking whether the [Interjections.] ... Order, the Chief Whip of the Opposition was asking, hon member Lekker, whether the name itself is parliamentary. Yes, it is parliamentary, but it may not be used to point at an individual in terms of Rule 59. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: So if Rule 59 [Interjections.] - in this case the hon member has explained that she did not relate to a specific member, but she used the name, threw it in the air. In that manner then we proceed. Hon member Sileku, will you please take your stand?

Mr I M SILEKU: I am almost done, colleagues, do not worry. [Interjections.]

On top of that [Interjections.], hon †Somlomo [Speaker], you know ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He has hit a nerve.

An HON MEMBER: Huh-uh.

Mr I M SILEKU: ... that leadership that took over that municipality that was left broke by hon member Gillion even took a resolution that says we are going to forfeit our upper limits for two consecutive years; we did not get any increases. [Interjections.]

And what we also did was to welcome the intervention from the Department of Finance in the Western Cape and Local Government in turning around the situation.

An HON MEMBER: Jô. [Interjections.]

Mr I M SILEKU: Today I can proudly say they rendered shared services in that particular Overberg District.

Ms L M MASEKO: Hear-hear!

Mr I M SILEKU: They pay salaries on time of employees and they receive clean audits.

An HON MEMBER: We are sheep.

Mr I M SILEKU: There is stability in that council; they work like, I am telling, a glove in a hand.

Hon †Somlomo [Speaker.] the first steps towards changing municipalities were well-described by his excellency, Deputy President of the Republic, D D Mabuza, when he visited NCOP. When he spoke about the Premier of the Province ...[Interjections.] he said:

“When I meet the Premier of the Province, I feel much confident, because when I look at the Premier of the Western Cape, he is focussed ...” ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You need to ...[Interjections.]

Mr I M SILEKU:

“... he is focused; he does not play politics.”

The SPEAKER: You need to wrap up, hon member.

Mr I M SILEKU: And that is the kind of leadership that we need in Local Government. [Applause.]

We do not need leaders; we do not need leaders [Applause.] ...

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Thank you. Hon members - please take your seat, hon member Sileku. I recognise hon member Kama. Hon member Kama, what is your point of order, Sir?

An HON MEMBER: Nobody wants to [Inaudible.].

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, †Somlomo [Speaker]. I rise on Rule 59. [Interjections.] We were [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Please do not intimidate the hon member.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kama, please proceed.

Mr M KAMA: The hon member, Mr Speaker, said that hon member Gillion left the municipality broke.

An HON MEMBER: Speaker ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M KAMA: That casting aspersion is exactly [Interjections.] ... Mr Speaker, it is exactly ... Mr Speaker, I do not know [Interjections.], I do not know whether ...[Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: Weet julle is klaar.

[An HON MEMBER: Know you are finished.]

Mr M KAMA: That is exactly, Mr Speaker, as saying the MEC is at the centre of chaos in municipalities.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Because he presides over the municipalities.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Now he presides over the municipalities; now when you say he is at the centre, it is the same as saying a mayor has left the municipality broke. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, *baba*.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon member Kama ...[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Speaker, can I rise on a point of order?

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Can I ask you to ask your member that side not to point fingers at me while another member is raising a point of order [Interjections.] and the issue here is, Mr Speaker, history has no blank pages.

Mr J J LONDT: Just blank cheques.

Ms M N GILLION: No, history has no blank pages. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member Gillion. I would like to ask the hon members [Interjections.] ... when you rise on a point of order, let us not rise on a point of debate, because there is a thin line, but the point of order that has been raised by hon member Kama on hon member Sileku, just be circumspect of the Rule 59. It is very important as we proceed here.

What is the exact point that you want the hon member to withdraw, hon member Kama?

An HON MEMBER: His finger. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: The point that it is hon member Gillion who left the municipality broke ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Bankrupt.

Mr M KAMA: ... because it implies that it is her who stole the money. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: She was the mayor. [Interjections.]

Mr J J LONDT: Are you saying she stole the money?

An HON MEMBER: She was the mayor.

The SPEAKER: I will consult my clever people and make a decision shortly. [Interjections.] Because this is a matter of Rules, so I am going to rule before we adjourn the debate now, ja. [Interjections.]

May I please request that hon member Sileku proceed? Circumspect of the Rule 59.

Mr I M SILEKU: Ja, I am done. Like I was saying, the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You only have ...[Interjections.]

Mr I M SILEKU: ... excellent Deputy President ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You only have 10 seconds.

Mr I M SILEKU: ... of the Republic said the Western Cape Premier is the best appointment, he is alright. [Interjections.]

This is the type of leadership that is needed. Not leaders that use municipalities as a tool to fight back when they have lost elections [Interjections.] during conferences, like the ANC does in North West; which is burning today. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sileku. [Applause.]

†n AGB LID: Hier was die kole. [Tussenwerpsels.]
[An HON MEMBER: Here were the coals. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I recognise hon member De Jager.

Mr I DE JAGER: Mr Speaker, hon members, †salaam alaikum [peace be upon you] to each and every one, and to the guests in the gallery.

The South African Constitution states that the municipalities have the responsibility to make sure that all citizens are provided with services to satisfy their basic needs.

This part of services delivery is slow and no delivery has been done. Example: the rural areas in Swartland, namely Chatsworth and surrounding areas, has no roads, sanitation, infrastructure, no proper schooling and the high crime risk can go on and it can go on, and the Kalbaskraal housing issues, among other issues as well.

Mr Speaker, I have been listening to all the other members here today and it is a sad point when we go out to the areas and we see the conditions of the areas, and we are gunning one another here ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hey.

Mr I DE JAGER: ... on these issues, where we are supposed to go out and make the decisions and to repair these provinces or areas outside there. I do not know why they take the oath here and they go on like this; gunning, taking the blame-game. This one blaming that one; that one blaming that one. Here, we are all here as one to repair and to make right whatever has been done wrong.

So I ask the hon members here to stop playing the blame-game; whether it is ANC, whether it is DA, whether it is who, but we are here as one to rectify whatever was wrong outside. I thank you. [Applause.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, all of us were in this Chamber, or most of us, on 16 September, and I want to refer hon members to the overview of the state of municipalities in the Western Cape, because what we have heard today, Mr Speaker, is comments around the two municipalities that we visited: Bitou as well as Mossel Bay.

Now when you look at the back of this document you will see there is a governance index where they actually list the capacity to deliver services within the prescribed legislative framework and they mention here that seven Western Cape municipalities are in the national top 10.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: And I want to mention that Bitou in fact is number 5 in South Africa, and the hon members have been comparing Mossel Bay to Bitou, and in the Provincial Government's own survey, which they cite, in fact Mossel Bay is two worse than number 5; it is only at number 7.

An HON MEMBER: That is number 1.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: So here we have a situation where effectively, as hon member Gillion said, unfortunately a very important visit by the NCOP, because all of us would agree [Interjections.] that we have to focus on how we support Local Government.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: There are problems, but the challenge is that when the NCOP has a political agenda to specifically arrive and to only attack one particular municipality when they actually ignore what we were given here, that Bitou is number 5 and Mossel Bay is number 7.

So how do you reconcile what you are saying in this Chamber with the report of this Provincial Government's own department which cites that Bitou is in fact ahead of Mossel Bay in terms of its ability [Interjections.] to deliver services?

So I think, Mr Speaker, it is absolutely critical that we become objective, but maybe, Mr Speaker, the issue is that the colleagues on the other side of the House are particularly defensive today, because when you look at what happened yesterday, it is actually a tremendously ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shocking.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... serious body blow ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... that has been delivered to the Democratic Alliance when it comes to Local Government. Do you know that in Buffalo City, for instance, the DA support dropped by 2%? Do you know that in Potchefstroom, Mr Speaker, the DA support dropped by 27% [Interjections.], and they in fact lost a ward to the Freedom Front? Do you know that here in Saldanha ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sure.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... the DA lost 28% of their support in Saldanha mainly amongst Coloured voters?

An HON MEMBER: Unbelievable.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: And do you know that in the Cederberg [Interjections.] not only did the DA lose 21% of their support, but they lost that ward to the ANC.

So I think the problem that we are having here today is despite the fact that we want to be objective, the DA has not recovered from the body blow which was delivered yesterday ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Applause.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... which indicates that their chances in 2021 [Interjections.] are being affected because of what voters actually feel about how you are governing [Interjections.], and I think we must, we must remember that, but clearly we also need to be serious about this debate, because the Constitution says very clearly that our local governments have got absolutely critical roles to play, and in our constituencies we have to make sure that services are being provided in a sustainable manner; that socio-economic development is promoted; that we do get out local governments to work hard to provide a safe and healthy environment, and we must involve our communities and, Mr Speaker, one of the concerns which I would like to raise with the NCOP members, is that when we visit municipalities one of the critical constitutional mandates is the involvement of community.

So we cannot go to a community and only meet with councillors; we have to meet with the ward committees; we actually have to meet with the beneficiaries of housing developments so that we actually get a better sense of what is going on [Interjections.], but what was very important in the NCOP briefing document - we want to thank our colleagues for that - amongst the key challenges which are mentioned as facing local government, are also, besides the lack of effective support and capacity of finance, there are two important issues that are mentioned as challenges. One is the inappropriate interventions ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... and also the absence of [Inaudible.] cooperative governance as required.

Now when we went to Bitou we had a situation where the Mayor, for instance, told us that he had worked very closely with the former MEC for Housing; where there was an agreed programme of action to deliver housing over a medium-term, but what had happened since MEC Madikizela had been replaced by MEC Simmers, there had not been a single engagement with the municipality to look at [Interjections.] the overall housing layout plan. So what we have is one MEC ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... in fact undermining cooperative governance which had been built up in terms of a programme to deliver housing across the whole of Bitou, and instead what we have is an MEC, and it is hon MEC Simmers, Premier Winde, who has actually gone to individual communities there without once having actually met with the municipality and that is a fundamental problem. [Interjections.]

If we are trying to build cooperative governance, and I hope that SALGA ...[Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: We went to the community.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... will take note of this and that SALGA will be consistent and actually in our report indicate very clearly ...[Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Make up your mind [Inaudible.].

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... that just as Mossel Bay Municipality - which happens to be under DA control and Bitou happens to be under coalition - that should not mean that any MEC can treat that municipality with disdain, and in fact undermine ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... a programme of work that had been agreed to by a predecessor. That creates chaos and that is not a recipe for cooperative governance.

So I think it is important that when we ask MEC Bredell for him to not be inappropriate in his interventions, and to also make sure that he builds cooperative governance. I think the question that MEC Bredell needs to answer today to this House is how can it be when a municipal manager, following his responsibility, reports that a Maco member in George has in fact, has a situation where he has not declared that his son was involved in a R300 million investment in Old Mutual, of which his son is benefiting, why in that particular instance - and I am not, apparently not allowed to allege bias and I am not alleging bias, because apparently that is casting aspersions - but the MEC owes this House an explanation. Why was that councillor not actually dealt with when it is clear that he did not declare that his son was in fact the broker which scored the commission out of this particular deal [Interjections.], and it is that kind of lack of cooperative governance and fairness and consistency, which impacts on the quality of Local Government, and I think we need to - and once again hon member Danville Smith has reported that, "Yes, we acknowledge that the MEC did write back to the Cederberg Municipality and said ..." ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You need to wrap up, hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... "... that the Mayor had not conducted himself properly," but why did you not act to suspend the Mayor for that kind of activity? [Interjections.]

So what we are asking for, let us take Local Government seriously, let us be consistent in the way that we deal with these ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... and Premier Winde, we are asking [Interjections.] Premier Winde ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... to ask MEC Simmers to show ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member Dugmore ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... Bitou respect and actually meet with the municipality. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: ... thank you very much. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Thank you, thank you, hon members, thank you hon the Leader of the Opposition. [Interjections.]

Hon members [Interjections.] ... Minister, will you please take your seat? Hon members, I can see that there is appetite to even cross the floor. [Interjections.] But let us please not do so now; not at this stage, it is too early for that.

Hon member Londt, what is your point of order, sir?

Mr J J LONDT: Mr Speaker, I just want to find out, are members of the NCOP allowed to ask questions to the members in this House as well?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are.

Mr J J LONDT: So I just want to ask if the hon Minister Bredell is willing to take a question? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell? Hon Minister Bredell says yes, hon member Londt. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mr Speaker, question.

Mr J J LONDT: Minister Bredell, do you think the fact that hon member Dugmore has not been in government for more than 10 years, is the reason why he does not know how Local Government works? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell? [Interjections.] Hon Minister Bredell, I recognise you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, thank you very much. Thank you to everybody ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members! Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you to everybody who participated within this debate. I am very tempted to start to answer all, but I am going to stick first of all to the speech I prepared ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... because I really think that it is important that we do get to some facts.

I have asked the NCOP when they left here, that they go with an open mind, not an empty one, and really come back with some gist to their visit so that we can use this to build a better future for our people in this province.

Mr Speaker, upon reflection I ask myself the question: why do governments exist and function the way they do? The simple answer I could come up with was we are here to serve and to protect the interests of the people who have elected us to be in this House here today.

I can state that my Department want all municipalities - it does not matter which political party is in control - all Western Cape municipalities to be successful, to be the top 30 municipalities in this country, and we will always keep on supporting our municipalities to reach that goal.

By improving the lives of citizens remain centre to the existence and the purpose of Local Government. The problems that are facing our society today is poverty, unemployment and inequalities.

Mr Speaker, I believe that we must build a sustainable, responsive and people-centred Local Government. Local Government is the sphere of government closest to the people. This is where the need for service delivery, both visible and immediately expected by our residents.

It is therefore important that if we are to address the challenges facing our society, we must [Inaudible.] in creating an enabling environment wherein municipalities are able to deliver on their mandate. We need a transformative Local Government that acts as an agent of change, which ensures acceleration of service delivery.

Hon members, a sustainable, responsible, people-centred Local Government is municipalities that:

1. Actively respond to the needs of our citizens.
2. Engage and involve its citizens on the choices and decisions it makes in addressing their needs; and
3. Can balance the responsibility to deliver services against its ability to remain viable, and that is crucial.

Mr Speaker, municipalities therefore focuses on two distinct yet interconnected aspects which are both required in unison to ensure success. These aspects are internally and externally to a municipality.

The internal factors focus on the optimal utilisation of resources so that it can respond positively to the external environment and provide services to the communities. The reality is that the country is currently facing an economic downturn.

We have also got huge corruption within our country. We spend millions and millions of rand on Zondo Commissions, and yet no outcome. That money could have been spent on service delivery. We could have built schools; housing opportunities; create health opportunities for our people. [Interjections.]

This is evident when you look at the number of households requiring assistance in terms of indigent subsidies which increase year on year. The main focus of my Department is to assist municipalities to build their own capacity so that they are strengthened internally to be in a position to attract investors and to respond to the needs of the communities that they serve.

Mr Speaker, through various programmes my Department is focussing on building the capacity of municipalities for sustainability. The following are some of the examples:

- Implementation of a municipal specific support programme that focuses on the most vulnerable municipalities within this province; and to address the needs in terms of five key focus areas. This includes:
 - Good governance;
 - Service delivery;
 - Institutional capacity;
 - The need of communities; as well as
 - Financial sustainability of municipalities.

To date four have successfully exited this programme and of which three have recently received clean audits.

- Building capacity of both councillors and officials through training, mentoring and coaching opportunities.
- Training of our ward committees.
- Training of the impact members to improve oversight to municipalities.
- Training on the code of conduct of municipalities.
- Training and equipping ward committee members

Are all aspects that we need to make Local Government work within this province.

Capacity building of municipalities also includes:

- A focus on the external environment with a focus on innovation and improving service delivery. This deals with how municipalities are conducting their business.
- Developing a client service charter is an aspect that I am very excited about and that I know that my Chairperson of Local Government will support me in, to make this a success.
- How to pull resources within a particular area or focus area through facilitating shared service opportunities, and encouraging municipalities to enter into internal municipal cooperation agreements.

And I think that is also an aspect that needs more attention and we work very hard to pull this off in this province.

- Establishing of a special vehicle to address water security in the Greater Karoo.

A responsive and people-centred municipality continues to find innovative ways of involving communities on aspects which affect their lives. This means that such a municipality has to stay well-informed of the ever-changing environment.

Mr Speaker, my Department is currently looking at new and innovative measures to intensify and modernise the way in which we consult our communities and ensure that public participation reaches the intended impact, and this is also where I want to call on the Standing Committee to support us and to help us and to criticise us, because at the end of the day we owe it to the communities to interact and to get our communication channels vested within out municipalities.

The following are some of the people-centred initiatives:

- Using technology to facilitate the responsiveness of municipalities to the need of their communities through the rollout of a web-based application, named GovChat, which will be available to residents in this province. GovChat will be launched by the National President and therefore some of the members will see that we have parked our initiative, because when the President announces GovChat, we want to put our resources and see if we can be the first province to pull that off. [Interjections.] We think we owe it to our people, and we are very excited that people can directly communicate with their municipalities.

We all need to understand that that will put enormous pressure on the back office within municipalities and this Department will play a crucial role in trying to get that back office ready and up and running.

- Assisted municipalities with standardised websites which will facilitate ease of navigation for communities that are searching for information on a municipality.
- Roll-out of the Tucson concept whereby a central facility within a municipal area is identified and designed to bring Government services closer to the community that they serve.

I am pleased to announce that during the Tuscon Service Excellence Award on 17 September, celebrating the 20 year anniversary since its start in 1999. The Department of Local Government in the Western Cape was the overall winner in two categories. The two categories are for the most outstanding province in Tuscon coordination, as well as the outstanding mobile Tuscon at provincial level, and I want to take this opportunity to congratulate my team. I think I have done brilliantly reaching 1.3 million citizens in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Possibly the most challenging aspect is to maintain a balance between the financial sustainability of our municipalities, and affordability of services to communities.

In the next five years my Department will support municipalities with infrastructure development and asset care. These programmes are critical to service delivery as they ensure that the lifespan of the assets is expanded to ensure value for money.

In addition, my Department has embarked on a number of research projects so that we are in a better position to guide and to advise municipalities on a number of aspects; research on the following areas is being undertaken:

- Comparisons and trend analysis of service charges and tariffs charges by all municipalities.
- Comparison and trend analysis of poverty rate charges across the province.
- Research and trend analysis of a basket of services available to all our citizens.

And there I can also ask and call on this House when there is anybody knowing of bucket toilets, bring it to our attention, because we all in this House agree that people deserve better. We need to eradicate buckets and let us not make it a political thing in this House; let us bring the facts; let us go out there and let us fix the problem and my Department is committed to that. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, I cannot over-emphasise the need for a more pragmatic and proactive approach to manage the internal government systems to ensure alignment between responsibility and capacity.

This is possible if all spheres of government work together in a coordinated manner. This is why my Department will be launching the joint District Metro Approach, which is a geographically district and team-based citizen-focused approach to provide Government services. This approach seeks to foster co-planning, co-budgeting and co-implementation; which translate into service delivery in communities.

Chairperson, to touch on one or two for the hon members, and I want to thank all my DA colleagues for well-articulated speeches and for their preparation. I want to just make a statement on some of the issues. If you look at hon member Nkondlo saying that 20 of the richest municipalities are within the Western Cape - that is not true. It is 20 of the best financial managed municipalities is in the Western Cape [Interjections.].

If we look at clean audits, it is very important [Interjections.] - one member, I think it was the EFF member - mentioned that Bitou [Interjections.], the balance sheet, their books; I can tell you that we have implemented what they have called a Revenue Enhancement Programme in Bitou, I think that was around about 2011. Bitou was bankrupt when we took over in 2011. They owed something like R60 million. [Interjections.] They were bankrupt.

We then found a complete mess within Bitou. We ran this Revenue Enhancement Programme, it was a fantastic programme. [Inaudible.] R87 million and you must remember this year-on-year ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you need to wrap up.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:: ... so we have done that and lastly I want to thank my colleagues for participating within this debate but I also just need to end off my mentioning to colleague Marais †dat skoon oudit en ongekwalifiseerde oudit is op teiken want skoon oudit word die *target* ook altyd voor geskuif, ons het altyd gesê dit is ons groepering, dit is wanneer jy goed doen, en die skoon en ongekwalifiseerde kategorie is 25 van die 30 munisipaliteite in die Wes-Kaap. Ons is baie trots daarop, en die vyf wat nie daarin is nie, is almal ANC-beheerd. Baie dankie.[Applous.] [that clean and unqualified audit are on target, because for clean audit the target is always shifted, we have always said, this is our grouping, that is when you do well, and the clean and unqualified category applies to 25 out of the 30 municipalities in the Western Cape. We are very proud of that, and the five that are not in there are all ANC-controlled. Thank you. [Applause.]]

RULING

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Hon members, order. I would like to make a ruling on the point of order raised by hon Kama. As I make the ruling hon members must be reminded of my earlier ruling that I made on hon Gillion on the statements she made against hon Simmers. It is no strange incident because if you look at what the Rule says, which is Rule 59, I will just read the Rule so that members understand what the Rule specifics are actually detailing in so far as this point I am raising here now.

Rule 59 (1) (a)(b)(c) is that no member may impugn improper motives or reflect on the integrity or dignity of a member or verbally abuse the member.

So what this basically says is that you may not cast aspersions on the integrity of a member or impugn the dignity of the member in such a way that you border on improperly alleging that the member may or may not have committed such an incident or an act.

So in this way the same ruling that I made in so far as hon Gillion is concerned applies in this case. So I would like to request that hon Sileku, you withdraw that specific reference to hon Gillion, not your statement but the reference to the member violates this specific Rule and therefore you are out of order. Hon member Sileku?

Mr I SILEKU: Somlomo, I am not going to do what hon Minister Lindiwe Zulu did in the National Assembly yesterday. [Interjections.]. I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Alright. We do not know what she did, but thank you hon Sileku. Hon Sileku has withdrawn. Is that the case? Now if that is the case, this matter is now closed and also this concludes the debate but now we are going straight to Interpellations.

I am sure that members of the House will move. If you wish to release yourselves, you are free to do so NCOP. Thank you very much for your presence here. This is a [Inaudible.] that we need to have when participate here and we will do this more often. Thank you very much. And thank you, SALGA. You may remain, it is up to you, but thank you very much.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the biggest challenge that the Human Settlements has, has always been the issue of its database and I am so happy as a Standing Committee Chairperson to inform this House that the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements has embarked on a pilot project for housing database verification and registration drives in the George Municipality area this past weekend.

Over a period of two days, 3 290 residents participated in registering, updating and verifying their details on the housing database. Housing remains a pertinent issue, due to an ever-increasing population size and demand. It is crucial that this Government prioritise a radical and integrated approach in housing delivery.

A first step towards achieving this is through encouraging citizens of the Western Cape to take personal responsibility and to ensure the accuracy of housing waiting lists. Given the launch of the project in the George Municipality, it is important that this continues in the other areas around the province to ensure that no community is left behind.

It is particularly imperative in communities that have been affected by illegal land occupation and growing demands, without overlooking vulnerable groups and those currently on the waiting lists. The Department of Human Settlements through this pilot project has demonstrated their commitment to accelerating the delivery of housing.

In addition to this, residents of the province are encouraged to visit their local libraries and housing offices to obtain application forms, if they wish to receive housing opportunities. As such, I commend Minister Tertius Simmers and his Department for undertaking this important project in preparation for the full rollout later this year.

The DA Western Cape Government remains committed to delivering sustainable human settlements in an open opportunity society for all. I thank you.

Mr D SMITH (ANC): The DA's implosion in continuing an unspectacular and just yesterday ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down, you have said that [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: ...we have seen the DA [Interjections.] still in a tailspin spiral.

An HON MEMBER: In a what?

Mr D SMITH: In the two by-elections [Interjections.] the DA suffered severe losses and it contributes to the downward trend we have seen of late. In Cederberg Ward 3, Maxwell Heyns is the new councillor.

†'n AGB LID: Baie geluk!

[An HON MEMBER: Congratulations!]

Mr D SMITH: Where the ANC grew from 35% to 58%. [Interjections.] And the DA fell from 35% [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: The DA fell back to 35% from 57%. [Interjections.] The DA was beaten comprehensively. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: In Ward 14 of Saldanha Municipality, the DA fell from 84% support [Interjections.] to 56%, in its heartland Langebaan. The DA loses control and is no longer marketable. [Interjections.] You can fool some people [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: ...sometimes, but you cannot fool all people all of the time. To add injury to defeat ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. I cannot hear.

Mr D SMITH: To add injury to defeat, the DA also lost the ward in the North-West to the Freedom Front Plus. [Interjections.]

†'n AGB LID: Dit maak seer, nê!

[An HON MEMBER: It hurts, hey!]

Mr D SMITH: The ANC has said before that this space should be watched. [Interjections.] Keep a close watch on this issue as the DA is digging its grave even faster. [Interjections.] The Cederberg victory is big indeed. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: It is now possible for the ANC to outright govern this municipality. †Nog 'n DA-beheerde raad het geval! Nog gaan val. Hou dinge fyn dop. [Applous.] [Another DA controlled council has fallen! More are going to fall! Watch things closely. [Applause.]]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Wait, hon members, I cannot hear a thing! Can we have some order in the House?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [Inaudible.] protect you. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: The Economic Freedom Fighters – can I be protected Speaker, please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Sjoe! Thank you, on Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters condemns the unbecoming and inhumane conduct by the City of Cape Town for evicting an 80-year old Kenneth Blaine and his son Alain from their home in Woodstock, without prior notice. On Monday 16 September 2019, Mr Blaine and his family were evicted from their home in Woodstock by the sheriff of the court [Interjections.] as a result of an eviction order granted by the Court, which was initiated by the DA-run City of Cape Town.

Mr Blaine has lived in the Plein Street house for 43 years and has battled with the City since 1981 in order to get the title deed of his house to his name, which is currently in his mother's name. The actions of the City resulted in Mr Blaine and his son sleeping in the streets. This is despite the fact that Mr Blaine is recovering from a foot-injury which makes it difficult for him to walk or stand. And his son, who is still recovering from a motorcycle accident which occurred earlier this month.

The Economic Freedom Fighters would like to thank representatives from Reclaim the City, a non-governmental body fighting for the rights of the poor people, for supporting the Blaine family throughout their hardship. Reclaim the City also successfully interacted potential auction of the family's house, which took place on 17 September 2019 and helped uncle Kenneth Blaine and his family to get back into their house.

The actions of the City must be viewed with utter disgust and as an attempt to drive out the poor from suburbs such as Woodstock into the streets. So I move.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, vehicle tracking and fleet management group C-Track has estimated that the South African logistics industry is worth R480 billion and according to the University of Stellenbosch and the World Bank, South Africa's logistics sector contributes an estimated 11,8% to the GDP.

As such, the recent violent attacks on truck drivers in the Western Cape and across the country are a direct attack on our national and provincial economy, directly affecting hundreds of thousands of jobs. We must address these acts of criminality as a matter of urgency if we are going to protect our residents and the logistics sector, which is a crucial contributor to the South African economy.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I am glad to see that an inter-ministerial task team has been established to deal with these crimes, but we cannot ignore the root cause of these attacks and all other forms of crime in our country. South Africans are desperate for jobs and opportunity and this desperation manifests into violent acts of crime and frustration across the country with one of the world's highest unemployment rates.

But by attacking truck drivers and disrupting our country's logistics industry, we are only seeking to set ourselves back. Investors are reluctant to bring capital to our country and dissuaded by these acts of violent crime. We must not only make use of law enforcement to stop these attacks, but we need to ensure that the root cause of crime is addressed through opportunity and growth.

Attack on truck drivers must now involve Crime Intelligence Services, to identify hotspots and provide preventative safety measures for this industry, across the province. The South African development community is largely reliant on South African logistics infrastructure such as seaports, airports and extensive roadworks to transport goods across countries and borders.

Attacks on truck drivers not only affect our country, but the economy and wellbeing of the entire region. We must address this issue as a matter of urgency or risk threatening one of our economy's most thriving industries. The safety of truck drivers from attacks, petrol bombs and intimidation from unions ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...cannot be tolerated. It is in the interest of our country, hon Deputy Speaker, and our economy to put a stop to this crisis immediately. I thank you.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the City with a massive affordable housing crisis, the City of Cape Town's DA government, continues to demonstrate a could-not-care-less-attitude to their constitutional obligations. Section 26 of the Constitution requires the state to take reasonable measures to achieve the progressive realisation of the right to housing. Section 26 also prohibits arbitrary evictions.

The DA Government and the City are acting unconstitutionally and grossly dishonestly. Last month the DA Government cancelled 5 viable inner-city housing projects. Between the Mayor and the Mayco member for housing, they gave four different and conflicting excuses. None of them are legitimate.

The most absurd of all was the Mayor's claim that disposing of sites without development rights is unlawful. In that same week the City advertised four sites for disposal with no development rights. The cancellation of the five inner-city housing projects is unreasonable and intentionally prevents the progressive realisation of housing.

This week the same DA Government attempted a mass sell-off of public land by way of auction to the highest bidder. This included land parcels that do have development rights. For example, there were parcels in Durbanville that were zoned general residential one, which permits medium density, low rise blocks of flats, perfect for affordable housing. Included in this wholesale of sell-off the public properties was a house in Plein Street in Woodstock.

Mr Kenny Blaine as we have heard, has been a tenant in this house since 1976. He has paid his rent to the City every month for 43 years.

I visited him yesterday. He told me that he even paid his rent for the month of September. To sell off this house, the City got an eviction order against Mr Kenny Blaine and the family and the sheriff evicted him on Monday, the day before the auction.

This is an old house in Woodstock, where the tenant is an 80-year old man, in good standing for 43 years. There can be no urgent or pressing reason for the sale of this house or the eviction. The eviction is arbitrary, and the City has violated the Constitution [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Time is up [Interjection.]

Mr B N HERRON: While the DA's election manifesto [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Time is up [Interjection.]

Mr B N HERRON: ...makes promises of spatial integration [Interjections.] the DA Government consciously works to entrench apartheid ideology.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you. I see the ACDP.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It is impossible! [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Wait, members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is another side to this story. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Leader of the Opposition [Interjections.] Chief Whip of the Opposition [Interjections.] Hon Chief Whip of the Opposition [Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO: You make a mess and you run away now [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Maseko. Thank you. I see you, hon member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, it came to the fore again where there is a legal battle over the burial of an unborn child. Legislation says that a foetus up till 26 weeks and earlier is treated as medical waste. These young mothers that carry these babies up till 6 months, have no right to a burial. Deputy Speaker, in an article a young mother had a still-born baby and wanted a burial for her baby. When she got to the hospital, the baby was already given to a medical waste company.

In a separate article, another mother lost her twin girls after her pregnancy of 23 weeks, but was not allowed to bury the twins because the tiny bodies were automatically incinerated as medical waste. Speaker, the ACDP stands with these institutions that want legislation to change and the ACDP wholeheartedly believes that a foetus is a human being and should be treated with dignity and respect.

Deputy Speaker, the ACDP cannot condone that foetus younger than 26 weeks is regarded as medical waste and accordingly disposed of. This is improper and inhumane. Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is asking the provincial Minister to interact with the counterparts to have this legislation changed so that females that carry an unborn child, have closure by having a burial and say their final goodbyes. Thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the growing cause for a forensic investigation into farm worker equity schemes in the Western Cape should be supported by this House. In fact, the Legislature itself should be probed. The funding methods of the Department of Agriculture is ploughing millions into these schemes that are not serving the purpose.

Having noted that labour power was never fully compensated for in the form of wages as clearly demonstrated by the vast difference between the affluence of the farmer and the abject poverty of the farm worker, the ANC Government introduced a system of collective ownership, based on relative equity holdings to restore the dignity of the farm worker. In the Western Cape the equity schemes are not working as the majority of the beneficiaries still live in dilapidated houses.

Agriculture in the Western Cape generates R21 billion per year .. [Interjections.] and at some stage we have bragged about a R44 billion [Inaudible.] industry in the Western Cape, of which provides 70% of the total work force in the province. Workers are not getting their share of that income. Thus we believe that landowners are using them to get BEE status.

There are also gross irregularities like Crispy Voerders in the Witzenberg, where shareholders since 2003 have not received a single dividend pay-out and then they are asked now in 2017 to sell their shares back to the company for only R30 000. Let us welcome the commitment by Deputy Minister Skwatsha to investigate these complaints on equity schemes following his meeting with farm workers in that particular area. I call on this House to consider an investigation into equity schemes and the funding of it in this province. I thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): He must just apologize for what he did [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I see the DA [Interjections.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] although crime has [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mitchell. Hon members. Hon Mitchell. Too loud. I cannot hear hon Allen. There we go.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I welcome the fact that the SANDF's deployment to various communities within the Western Cape has been extended for another six months. For this deployment to be successful all the various role players ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...should play an important role. Although crime and safety has already taken centre stage today, I wish to commend the Western Cape Government under the leadership of the Premier Winde, together with the Executive and the City of Cape Town, who today unveiled the most comprehensive safety plan this country has ever seen. And when all the law enforcement officers and investigators are deployed, R1 billion will be spent towards making our province safer and the implementation of crime...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...prevention programs. This ultimately means that we put our money where it is most needed. [Interjections.] I would challenge the Minister of Police to join ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...the fight towards making our province safer by ensuring that we have more boots on the ground, where the Premier also provided additional law enforcement officers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members.

Mr R I ALLEN: I wish to call the [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What happened to the [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not need jobs to [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Continue.

Mr R I ALLEN: With regard to the announcement of the extension, the General stated that the army was nobody's wish granted [Interjections.] He possibly said this to root out all political related jargon but what I would like to say is to reiterate what the Premier said, to speak [Interjections.] to ask your colleagues within the National Assembly to help in this regard because crime ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...is affecting everyone. The conditions laid out by the Western Cape Government with the deployment of the army [Interjections.] is there to make this province safer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr R I ALLEN: Is to make this province safer, because I think we can all agree that we need clear indicators [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

Mr P MARRAN: Are you speaking to me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. I am just talking to all of you, so I can hear what he is saying. [Interjections.] Hon Allen, please continue.

Mr R I ALLEN: The conditions outlined by the Provincial Government, and I will reiterate, it is that we need clear indicators ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off. [Interjection.]

Mr R I ALLEN: ...of the successes and we need a measuring tool to be put in place in order to track the deployment of the army [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Is my time up?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is unfortunately up.

Mr R I ALLEN: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the [Interjection.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Safety is a major concern. We need to help.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape province posts a plethora of iconic attractions that appeal to millions of visitors each year, such as our mix of mountains, vineyards, oceans and nature reserves. [Interjections.] It is thus important that these features are safeguarded, not only to conserve our environment for future generations but to continue growing our economy and for the betterment of the citizens of this province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, climate change and a rise in temperature, especially as we enter the fire season, is a warning that we must heed. I therefore welcome the Department of Local Government's "Fire is everyone's fight" campaign, that seeks to alleviate fire-related incidents by rolling out awareness programs and initiatives as preventative measures.

Part of these initiatives include the installation of smoke detectors in informal dwellings where to date, more than 9 000 detectors have been installed. This is of particular importance given that the people [Interjections.] ja, this is of particular importance, hon Smith, given the analysis of ex-business week, we have warned that people and properties are more likely to be affected by hot and dry conditions this season. [Interjections.]

In addition to this, the Department of Local Government's "First Hour Saves Lives" Initiative will see 21 helicopters ...[Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Where?

Mr D AMERICA: ... and specialised aircraft deployed as rapid responses to veld fires [Interjection.]

HON MEMBERS: Where?

Mr D AMERICA: ...in order to prevent further losses of life, infrastructure, the property and the environment [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, finish off please [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA: Prevention is better than treatment. [Interjections.] We therefore urge citizens of the Western Cape to be ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon America [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA: ...cautious and vigilant during this season. The DA Western Cape Government will continue to make ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA: ...progress by taking innovative [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon America [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA: ...and decisive steps to make this province safe. Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] That is the end of Statements. Is there a Minister who wishes to respond as contemplated in Standing Rule 145.6 for not more than 5 minutes? I see the hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. First of all I want to say something on Cederberg. I want to congratulate the ANC with their win. [Applause.] But hon Deputy Speaker what is more important is that the ANC must realise ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...that the DA took a bankrupt municipality to three years of clean audit. We all watch this space, hon Deputy Speaker. In a democracy the voters get what they deserve and I really hope that the ANC do not disappoint them [Interjections.] but I can bet you the money I do not have [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...that the ANC will disappoint again [Interjections.] because we remember four years ago when the management report ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...of Cederberg Municipality was 398 pages long. [Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker, to the hon Brett, I see that there is a press release from the City of Cape Town also, saying that they negotiated with this family since 2014. I do not know if he was part of that negotiations or not [Interjections.] but I take what he is saying, and I ask the hon members of GOOD and EFF to send me their motions. I will investigate it. My Department will investigate it. If they are unconstitutional he can also go to the police station and lay a charge there, but I think, as a caring Government, we cannot stand for [Interjections.] we cannot stand and put a cold shoulder towards any elderly citizens losing their houses and we will need to look into this but get the facts on the table, and not make it an emotional ...[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: The City of Land.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...issue. We are talking to this matter now [Interjections.] and again the ANC thinks this is a joke. We will investigate that, and we will look into this and if there is any wrongdoing we need to find a way to rectify that. I thank you [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Ag, you are a very sore loser.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

SPECIAL ECONOMIC ZONES: IMPACT OF

(Notice of Motion)

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of special economic zones on the Western Cape, I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of special economic zones on the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

CRIME: SCOURGE OF

(Notice of Motion)

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the scourge of crime in Western Cape province, following the release by the National Minister of Police, hon Bheki Cele.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the scourge of crime in the Western Cape following the release of the crime statistics by the national Minister of Police, Bheki Cele.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

MATRIC RESULTS: DECLINE

(Notice of Motion)

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the decline in the matric results in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the decline in matric results in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

WASTE-TO-ENERGY PLANS

(Notice of Motion)

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates waste-to-energy plans in the Western Cape in order to secure clean and renewable energy alternatives for the province. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates waste-to-energy plans in the Western Cape in order to secure alternative clean and renewable energy sources for the province.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

DA: IMPLOSION OF

(Notice of Motion)

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the ongoing implosion of the DA at local government level. [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the ongoing implosion of the DA at local-government level.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Notice taken.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

POTCHEFSTROOM BY-ELECTION FREEDOM FRONT VICTORY

(Motion)

Mr P MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the results of yesterday's victory by the Freedom Front in Potchefstroom, recording 677 votes against the DA's 489. This resounding defeat that the DA shows, the Freedom Front Plus growth among voters to have increased since 2016 by 56% and the DA's decline by 65%. We further note that this represents the second successive by-election victory, after Stilfontein, against the DA, since May 2019. Both these seats were previously held by the DA in 2016. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr P MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the results of yesterday's victory by the Freedom Front Plus in the Potchefstroom municipal elections where it recorded 677 votes against the DA's 489; notes that this resounding defeat of the DA shows that the FF Plus support among voters has increased since 2016 by 56% and that the DA's support has declined by 65%; and further notes that this represents the second successive by-election victory against the DA since May 2019 (after Stilfontein) where both seats were previously held by the DA in 2016.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

NATIONAL THUSONG SERVICE EXCELLENCE AWARDS

(Motion)

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that:

1. The Department of Local Government in the Western Cape was the overall winner of two awards for the most outstanding province in Thusong Centre Coordination and outstanding mobile Thusong Centre at provincial level at this year's National Thusong Service Excellence Awards held on 17 September 2019;
2. We further note that Thusong Centre's Green Government Services and Information closest to the most vulnerable communities and the impact and critical role that it played in service delivery, reaching over 1,3 million people in the Western Cape this year;
3. This House further extends our congratulations to the Laingsburg, Riversdale and Mossel Bay Thusong Centres, who emerge as the big winners for their partnerships;
4. Lastly Madam Deputy Chair, we further note that the Department of Local Government under the leadership of Min Bredell is committed to continue working on improving the lives [Interjections.] of the citizens of the Western Cape and ...[Interjection.] enhancing access to services, I so move. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Too long! It is too long!

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr D AMERICA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Department of Local Government in the Western Cape was the winner of two awards – Outstanding Province in Thusong Centre Coordination and Outstanding Mobile Thusong Centre at Provincial Level – at this year's National Thusong Service Excellence Awards held on 17 September 2019; notes that Thusong centres bring government services and information closer to the most vulnerable communities and notes the impact and critical role of these centres on service delivery by reaching over 1,3 million people in the Western Cape this year; extends our congratulations to the Laingsburg, Riversdal and Mossel Bay Thusong centres that emerged as the winners for partnerships; and further notes that the Department of Local Government, under the leadership of Minister Bredell, is committed to continue working on improving the lives of the citizens of the Western Cape and enhancing access to services for all.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

GEORGE MUNICIPAL MANAGER

(Motion)

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA's plan to quickly get rid of the George municipal manager, Mr Trevor Botha, failed and that this is the umpteenth time the DA in the Southern Cape destabilised their own governance and tries to oust people put in positions of power. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the DA's plan to get rid of Trevor Botha, Municipal Manager of the George Municipality, failed quickly; and notes that this is the umpteenth time that the DA in the Southern Cape destabilises its own governance and tries to oust people it put in positions of power.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

COMPREHENSIVE SAFETY PLAN

(Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the comprehensive safety plan, valued at R1 billion, announced by Premier Winde, which aims to reduce crime and make the Western Cape safer; further notes that it is the most comprehensive plan ever produced by any province in South Africa and ask that all communities work with the Western Cape Government to ensure the effective implementation of this plan. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the comprehensive safety plan valued at R1 billion announced by Premier Winde that aims to reduce crime and make the Western Cape safer; further notes that this is the most comprehensive plan ever produced by any province in South Africa; and ask that communities work with the Western Cape Government to ensure the effective implementation of this plan.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

SPANKING OF CHILDREN AT HOME

(Motion)

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the Constitutional Court of South Africa has found that it is inconsistent with our Constitution to spank children at home and that it is now illegal to assault children in the name of discipline. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Constitutional Court of South Africa has found that it is inconsistent with our Constitution to spank children at home and that it is now illegal to assault children as a form of discipline.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

ANNUAL PROVINCIAL SPORTS AWARDS

(Motion)

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that on Saturday, 14 September 2019, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport honoured the Western Cape's top achieving sports people at the annual provincial sports awards in Pinelands; these awards are the culmination of a process of regional awards ceremonies where winners in the categories from all six regions went through to compete for the top honours as the province's best; that this House congratulates all the winners in the various categories and wish them all of the best as they compete in the National Sports Awards later this year. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that on Saturday 14 September 2019 the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport honoured the Western Cape's top achieving sportspeople at the annual Provincial Sports Awards at Old Mutual in Pinelands; notes that the winners in the categories at this awards ceremony came from all six regions and competed for the top honours as the province's best; congratulates all the nominees and winners in the various categories; and wishes them all of the best as they compete in the National Sports Awards later this year.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**FIRES: TYGERBERG HOSPITAL
AND MITCHELLS PLAIN DAY HOSPITAL**

(Motion)

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that on 13 September 2019, a fire broke out at both Tygerberg Hospital and Mitchells Plain Day Hospital. The details of what caused these fires have not been made public, even today; further notes that these incidences left patients, staff and society shocked and traumatised; members of society make use of public hospital facilities as a place of safety and to get assistance with regards to their health and not to be subjected to further trauma; the EFF further calls on the Minister of Health to investigate the cause of these fires and to take appropriate steps to measure in making sure that the public health facility remains a safe space for the people to receive assistance with regards to their health. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House:

- (a) notes that on Friday 13 September 2019 a fire broke out at both the Tygerberg Hospital and the Mitchells Plain Day Hospital;
- (b) notes that the details of what caused these fires have not been made public even to this day;
- (c) further notes that these incidents left patients, staff members and the society shocked and traumatised;
- (d) notes that members of the society make use of public hospital facilities as a place of safety and to get assistance with their health and not to be subjected to further trauma; and
- (e) further calls on the Minister of Health to investigate the cause of these fires and to take appropriate steps and measures to ensure that public health facilities remain safe spaces for people who receive assistance with regard to their health.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

LATE EMERITUS PROFESSOR DAVID SAUNDERS

(Motion)

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of the late Emeritus Professor David Saunders, founding director of the School of Public Health at UWC and the founding member and Co-Chair of the People's Health Movement; that this House shares the loss to the fraternity and expresses its utmost gratitude for the contributions of the late Prof Saunders; that this House further extends its sincere condolences and sympathy to his wife, children, family and colleagues. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of Emeritus Professor David Sanders, founding director of the School of Public Health at UWC and the founding member and co-chairperson of the People's Health Movement; shares the loss with the health fraternity and expresses its utmost gratitude for the contributions of the late Prof Sanders – a true health activists; and further extends its sincere condolences and sympathy to his wife, children, family and colleagues. May the soul of Emeritus Professor David Sanders rest in peace.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

TYGERBERG HOSPITAL: DROWNING

(Motion)

Ms A P BANS: Thank you Hon Deputy Speaker for noting me. I move without notice:

That the House notes a boy of seven years drowned in an unused swimming pool at the Tygerberg Hospital over the weekend; calls for this tragedy to be properly investigated and report submitted to the said Legislature; that the House' commiserations are conveyed to the family and friends of the victim. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that a seven-year-old boy drowned in an unused swimming pool at the Tygerberg Hospital over the weekend; calls for this tragedy to be properly investigated and a report to be submitted to this House; and conveys condolences to the family and friends of the victim.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

FIRE FIGHTERS PROTEST

(Motion)

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the Cape Town fire fighters embark on an industrial protest against the employer, who they claim is not fairly paying them proper wages, which places under suspicion claims that Cape Town is ready for the fire season. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Cape Town firefighters embarked on industrial protest action against their employer who, they claim, is not fairly paying them proper wages; and notes that this casts doubt on claims that Cape Town is ready for the fire season.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

NDLOVU YOUTH CHOIR

(Motion)

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move a motion without notice:

That the House congratulates the Ndlovu Youth Choir on their spectacular performance during season 13 of America's Got Talent; even though they were not named as overall winners they certainly made this country proud as they championed the potential of youth in our country.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move a motion without notice:

That the House congratulates the Ndlovu Youth Choir on their spectacular performance during Season 13 of America's got talent; and notes that, even though they were not named the champions, they certainly made this country proud as they championed the potential of the youth in our country.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

AZRAA MALLICK

(Motion)

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Grade 6 pupil, Azraa Mallick, age 11, of Arcadia Primary School, Bonteheuwel, that was crowned top achiever in her grade; her achievement was so significant that she was recognised by the Head of the Department and her teacher, Ms Rowena Hermans, for her work ethic and enthusiastic behaviour; according to her teacher she displays leadership skills and is always willing to assist fellow classmates. The ACDP wishes her well. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Azraa Mallick (11), a Grade 6 learner at the Arcadia Primary School in Bonteheuwel, who was crowned top achiever in her grade; notes that an article dated 9 September 2019 highlighted her as top learner who was recognised by the Head of Department and teacher Rowena Hermans for her work ethic and enthusiasm; and further wishes Azraa Mallick all of the best throughout her schooling career and in her future endeavours.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

COMMUNICARE HOUSING AGENCY

(Motion)

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice [Interjections.]:

That the House notes Cape Town based Communicare housing agency's struggle amidst concerns that it is not able to secure its property from hijacking and other forms of illegal occupation and calls on this institution to make sure it takes care of rental stock in order to be able to collect money to fund or cross-subsidise its social housing program. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the Cape Town-based Communicare housing agency is struggling because it is not able to protect its property against hijacking and other forms of illegal occupation; and calls on this House to make sure it takes care of rental stock in order to be able to collect money to fund or cross-subsidise its social housing programme properly.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

COUNCILLOR SETH SEKHOKHO

(Motion)

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with shock that while the DA claims to be committed ...[Interjections.] to the fight against crime, a DA councillor Seth Sekhokho from Rand West City Local Municipality ...[Interjections.] ... was arrested for armed robbery; calls on the authorities to ensure that this councillor receives the maximum prison sentence if found guilty. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M KAMA: Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with shock that, while the DA claims to be committed to the fight against crime, a DA councillor, Seth Sekhokho, from the Rand West City Local Municipality, was arrested for armed robbery; and call on authorities to ensure that this councillor receives the maximum prison sentence if he is found guilty.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

CCTV AT RAIL STATIONS

(Motion)

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that less than a third of CCTV cameras at rail stations work and that this does not assist properly in the war against violence and vandalism that destroy our infrastructure and services on a daily basis; therefore the House calls on Metrorail and PRASA to urgently fix and upgrade this vital protection tool. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that less than a third of the CCTV cameras at railway stations work properly; notes that this does not assist in the war against violence and vandalism that destroy our infrastructure and services daily; and therefore calls on Metrorail and Prasa to fix and upgrade this vital protection tool urgently.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

SANDF: DEPLOYMENT OF IN THE CAPE FLATS

(Motion)

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes President Cyril Ramaphosa again conceded to the DA calls for the deployment of the SANDF in the Cape Flats drugs and gangs ridden areas; that we guard against regarding this as a permanent solution; instead of complaining, encourage the Provincial Government to bring forth the inputs of the imagination they had when they called for the SANDF to come and work in the Western Cape.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Any objections to the motion itself?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Sorry, Deputy Speaker, can I just raise an issue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an ...[Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: We just want to be clear. Is that in his statement or is that something else he read?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot ask for explanation here. I see that there is an objection by the Premier.

The PREMIER: I object to a really †*swak* [poor] statement!

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that President Cyril Ramaphosa again conceded to DA calls for the deployment of the SANDF on the Cape Flats, the drugs and gangs killing field, to be extend for a further period of six months in this violence-stricken area; notes that we should guard against this becoming a permanent measure; and notes that, instead of complaining, we need the input of what they had imagined should be the work to done by these soldiers.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

MMUSI MAIMANE: HOUSE

(Motion)

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA is busy closing ranks to protect its national leader Mmusi Maimane from himself and his lies as he first claimed to have bought a house of R3,85 million in the Southern Suburbs and now he changed his story to say he leases a house; could the DA play open cards with the people of this province to tell them precisely what the real facts are and we see the safety plan of the Premier working, starting with Mmusi Maimane.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the DA is busy closing ranks to protect its national leader, Mmusi Maimane, from himself; notes that he lied when he first claimed to have bought a house of R3,85 million in the southern suburbs and has now changed his story to say that he leases the house; and requests that the DA plays open cards with the people of this province by telling them precisely what the real facts are.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

**CITY OF CAPE TOWN
SELLING OFF INNER CITY LAND**

(Motion)

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes Cape Town is again at its usual shenanigans by selling off prime inner-city land to the highest bidder under the guise of development while apartheid spatial inequality remains largely unaddressed and which angers residents like those in Green Point. [Interjections.] I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the City of Cape Town is again up to its usual shenanigans by selling off prime inner-city land to the highest bidder under the guise of development while apartheid spatial inequality remains largely unaddressed; and notes that this angers residents, like those residents in Green Point.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

Objection recorded.

METRORAIL: DERAILMENT

(Motion)

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that 27 commuters were injured when a Metrorail train derailed near Bellville recently. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that 27 commuters were injured when a Metrorail train derailed near Bellville recently.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

MARIUS FRANSMAN

(Motion)

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the ANC leader Marius Fransman has reached an agreement with his victim and it is noted that he had sexually harassed her. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Marius Fransman, ANC leader, has reached an agreement with the victim of his sexual harassment.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

**REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, ECONOMIC
OPPORTUNITIES AND TOURISM ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS
FOR THE APPOINTMENT OF CANDIDATES FOR
THE WESTERN CAPE GAMBLING AND RACING BOARD**

(Consideration)

Ms D M BAARTMAN (DA): Four vacancies occurred on the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board due to the upcoming expiry of Board Memberships at the end of March 2019 and one resignation due to an appointment of HOD to the Department of Finance. The Provincial Treasury advertised the vacant board member positions in the *Provincial Gazette*, Vukani, the *Mail & Guardian*, *Die Burger* and *Weekend Argus* on 26, 27 and 28 July 2018, as well as on the Provincial Government's job portal.

The committee was requested by a letter of referral sent on 30 July 2019, to the office of the Speaker at the WCPP to recommend candidates to fill the four vacancies and the matter was referred to the committee on the ATC on 2 August 2019.

Section 3(1) of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Act, as amended, stipulates that quotes to the board shall consist of seven members, appointed on a part time basis by the Executive Council in accordance with the prescribed procedure which shall provide for public participation in the nomination of candidates for appointment, provided that the Standing Committee of the Provincial Legislature responsible for this act, shall evaluate all candidates as to their suitability for appointment, closed on 6 August 2019. The Provincial Treasury briefed the committee on the process leading to the short-listing. The committee was provided with a list of 13 candidates to evaluate and we resolved to evaluate the candidates through an interview process.

One candidate declined the interview as she had already accepted another position on the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board.

The committee, having interviewed 12 candidates, reached consensus and recommended candidates in alphabetical order as contained in the report, to be submitted for consideration by the House and thereafter submitted to the Minister of Finance for consideration by the Executive. The Committee further resolved to review current legislation and that Provincial Treasury should review the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Regulations with specific regards to the timelines afforded to the Provincial Parliament. I so move.

[Debate concluded.]

Report adopted.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 19:11.

ANNOUNCEMENTS TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

THURSDAY, 19 SEPTEMBER 2019

TABLING

The Speaker:

Annual report of provincial entity for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 tabled in terms of section 65(1)(a) of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999), as amended:

Minister of Transport and Public Works

Annual Report of Government Motor Transport for 2018/19 (Vote 10: Transport and Public Works).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

THURSDAY, 26 SEPTEMBER 2019

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

Annual reports of provincial departments for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 tabled in terms of section 65(1)(a) of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999), as amended:

(a) Minister of Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism

- (i) Annual Report of the Provincial Treasury for 2018/19 (Vote 3: Provincial Treasury).
- (ii) Errata:
 - (a) Part B: Correction on page 48; and
 - (b) Part D: Corrections on pages 121 and 125 in the Annual Report of the Provincial Treasury for 2018/19.

Referred to the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(b) Minister of Social Development

- (i) Annual Report of the Department of Social Development for 2018/19 (Vote 7: Social Development).
- (ii) Errata:

Corrections on pages 134, 138 and 139 in the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development for 2018/19.

Referred to the Standing Committee on Social Development and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(c) Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Annual Report of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning for 2018/19 (Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(d) Minister of Transport and Public Works

Annual Report of the Department of Transport and Public Works for 2018/19 (Vote 10: Transport and Public Works).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(e) Minister of Agriculture

Annual Report of the Department of Agriculture for 2018/19 (Vote 11: Agriculture).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

FRIDAY, 27 SEPTEMBER 2019

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

Annual reports of provincial departments for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 tabled in terms of section 65(1)(a) of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999), as amended:

1. Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport

Annual Report of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport for 2018/19 (Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

2. Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Annual Report of the Department of Local Government for 2018/19 (Vote 14: Local Government).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Local Government and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 518**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: You may all take a seat. Welcome back, hon members. We are not in the business of meeting of Mondays, but it seems that Parliament is in overdrive.

Welcome, hon Premier and hon members. Today's proceedings, the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities is going to be talking to us about the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook and the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook and that is PERO and MERO. I recognise the hon Minister of Finance, Minister Maynier.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

**PROVINCIAL ECONOMIC REVIEW AND OUTLOOK AND
MUNICIPAL ECONOMIC REVIEW AND OUTLOOK**

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Speaker, hon Premier and Cabinet colleagues; hon Leader of the Opposition, hon members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

I would like to begin by thanking you for the opportunity to introduce the 2019 Provincial Review and Economic Outlook, together with the 2019 Municipal Review and Economic Outlook, today in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

The Provincial Review and Economic Outlook and its rather more thick-set "twin", the Municipal Review and Economic Outlook, are world-class research publications produced by Provincial Treasury. The "twins" contain forecasts of future trends, analysis of past trends, and serve as a "one stop research shop" to support policy, planning and budgeting processes at provincial and municipal level in the Western Cape.

For the geeks among us, and I count myself as one, the twins are an unputdownable read even on a weekend. To illustrate my point, I was so immersed in the Provincial Review and Outlook, I clean forgot about the Springboks' World Cup rugby game this weekend. [Laughter.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Speaker, the Provincial Review and Economic Outlook and the Municipal Review and Economic Outlook are filled with fascinating numbers about the Western Cape.

To whet your appetite: there are 801 hectares planted with guavas; there are 780 hectares planted with pomegranates and there are 143 hectares planted with prickly pears in the Western Cape.

The Provincial Review and Economic Outlook and the Municipal Review and Economic Outlook are also filled with fascinating facts about the Western Cape.

To whet your appetite: our top export market is Namibia; our top import market is Saudi Arabia; our fastest growing export market is China and our fastest growing import market is Ghana. We export blueberries; we export blackberries and we export raspberries. We export more blueberries than blackberries, but blackberry exports are growing faster than blueberry exports. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh my word!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We export locust beans; we export seaweed; we export algae and we export molluscs; and most fascinating of all, we export what is referred to as "other aquatic invertebrates", which intriguingly does not include molluscs.

Now, hon Speaker, on a more serious note, the Provincial Review and Economic Outlook and the Municipal Review and Economic Outlook tell a story that is not always what we want to hear, but which we must hear and which we must confront in the Western Cape.

On the economic outlook, we expect a slow recovery in economic growth in the Western Cape. We expect global economic growth to slow down to 3,2% in 2019 and recover to 3,5% in 2020. We expect national economic growth to slow down to just 0,2% in 2019 and recover to 1,1% in 2020, and we expect provincial economic growth to recover to 0,7% in 2019 and then to accelerate to 1,2% in 2020, which means that the provincial economy is expected to recover from the drought and the contraction in output from the agriculture, forestry and fisheries sector and that the provincial economy is expected to grow at a faster rate than the national economy in South Africa, which is good news.

On economic sectors: we expect private services to drive economic growth in the Western Cape. We expect private services, which include wholesale and retail trade; catering and accommodation; transport, storage and communication; finance, insurance, real estate and business services; as well as community, social and personal services to be the biggest driver - not only of economic growth but of course of fixed investment and employment in the Western Cape. And we expect agriculture and agri-processing to be the fastest growing sectors as they recover from the contraction caused by the drought in the Western Cape.

Overall, we expect the provincial economy to expand by an average of 1,6% over the next five years between 2019 and 2023.

On the labour market: we have a higher than average labour force participation rate of 66,5% in the Western Cape, which means that 66,5% of the working-age population are part of the labour force in the Western Cape.

We have a total of 2,5 million people employed, compared to 2,2 million people five years ago in the Western Cape.

The fact is, employment increased by 283 000, or at an average annual growth rate of 2,4% per year, in the Western Cape, which is higher than the national average annual growth rate of 1,6% per year in the past five years between 2014 and 2019 in South Africa, but, in the end of course, too few people have jobs in the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, we also have the lowest “narrow unemployment rate” at 19,5% in the Western Cape, compared to Gauteng, which has a narrow unemployment rate of 28,9%, and KwaZulu-Natal, which has a narrow unemployment rate of 25,1%.

We also have the lowest “expanded unemployment rate” at 22,7% in the Western Cape, compared to Gauteng, which has an expanded unemployment rate of 33,6%, and KwaZulu-Natal, which has an expanded unemployment rate of 42,4%, which means that unemployment has increased by 18 000 or at an average annual growth rate of 0,6% per year in the Western Cape, which is lower than the national annual growth rate of 4,1% per year in the five years between 2014 and 2019 in South Africa. But, in the end, there are too many people who do not have jobs in the Western Cape.

On development: we have a population of 6,8 million or 11,4% of the total population in South Africa. We have increasing income inequality, but an improving Human Development Index. The Human Development Index, which is a composite indicator of population development and which measures, *inter alia*, education, life expectancy and per-capita income, has improved steadily from 0,682 in 2009 to 0,730 in 2019, which could be the result and which is thought to be the result of more effective support to people, especially poor people, by this Government in the Western Cape.

Generally there has been an improvement in education outcomes with a 15,8% increase in the number of learners accessing education in the past six years here in the Western Cape. There has been an improvement in health outcomes, with consistent improvements in HIV testing and anti-retroviral therapy initiation rates, so that more people know their status and so that more people receive treatment in the Western Cape; and there has been an improvement in the provision of basic services, with households having the highest rate of access to tap water in the country right here in the Western Cape.

However, although overall crime rates have decreased, the murder rate has increased significantly and the leading cause of premature death among males remains interpersonal violence in the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, the Provincial Review and Economic Outlook and the Municipal Review and Economic Outlook 2019 tell us a story. It tells us a story of a slow recovery in economic growth, driven by private services in the Western Cape.

It tells the story of a rebound in employment in the Western Cape and it tells the story of improved human development in the Western Cape.

The Provincial Review and Economic Outlook and the Municipal Review and Economic Outlook also tell us a story of new and of exciting opportunities in the economy in the Western Cape. Consider the strides made developing alternative crops, which are labour intensive and have export potential, and the strides made developing the halal export market in the Western Cape. But, hon Speaker, the fact is that although the provincial economy is expected to grow at an average of 1,6% over the next five years, this is slower than the average growth of 1,7% in the five years between 2008 and 2017, which included a meltdown in the global economy.

Hon Speaker, although the Provincial Business Confidence Index is higher than the National Business Confidence Index, the National Business Confidence Index has collapsed and is at a 20-year low; and although the provincial economy increased employment at a faster annual average growth rate than the national economy, there are still too many people who do not have jobs or who have given up looking for jobs, in the Western Cape.

The downside risks to the provincial economy are considerable and include slowing global economic growth as a result of trade wars and of political developments, such as a possible no-deal Brexit.

However, the fact remains that the biggest risk to the provincial economic outlook is not slowing global growth or trade wars or a no-deal Brexit; the fact is that the national economy and the provincial economy are linked and for that reason the biggest risk to the provincial economic outlook is National Government in South Africa.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Absolutely!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We have an equivocation, prevarication and dithering, combined with summits, dialogues and conferences, rather than decisive leadership on the economy in South Africa. Just last week President Cyril Ramaphosa appointed yet another talk-shop in the form of a President's Economic Advisory Council, to advise him on how to kick-start the economy in South Africa. We have destructive wasp-in-the-jar-like infighting inside the governing party over economic policy in South Africa. Last month the Minister of Finance... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is the MEC going? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Tito Mboweni released a paper entitled Economic Transformation, Inclusive Growth [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): When is Marius coming back?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...and Competitiveness towards an Economic Strategy for South Africa, which not surprisingly, was rubbished as incoherent, confused and unreliable by COSATU. [Interjections.] We have stagnant national economic growth, with the economy forecast to grow at an average... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...of about 1,3% over the medium term in South Africa. We have collapsed in business confidence, which as I have said is at an all-time 20-year low in South Africa. Who can blame business for losing confidence when you have the Minister of Mineral Resources and Energy, Gwede Mantashe, peddling a fake mineral called “hazenile”, which he thought had been discovered in the Congo Caves; not the Congo Caves, here in the Western Cape. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Take responsibility, take responsibility! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Speaker, we have declining per capita incomes, as the population growth rate exceeds the economic growth rate, which means that the poor are getting poorer in South Africa. [Interjections.] We have staggering levels of unemployment... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, Order hon members!!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...with nearly 10 million... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you. Hon Speaker, as I was saying we have staggering levels of unemployment, with nearly 10 million people who do not have jobs or have given up looking for jobs. We have eye-watering national debt levels, with national debt that will now exceed an estimated R3,4 trillion or 59% of GDP in 2021/22 in South Africa.

We have zombie National Departments, like the Department of Home Affairs, who seem determined to keep foreign investors and highly skilled immigrants out of South Africa.

An HON MEMBER: Shocking.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We have zombie state-owned enterprises, like the Passenger Rail Agency, South African Airways, Transnet Freight Rail and the Transnet Port Authority, delivering shocking services at uncompetitive prices and consuming billions of rands in bailouts.

We have massive fiscal risks including most importantly Eskom, which has a debt mountain of about R440 billion, costing a staggering R67 billion per year in debt-service costs, which could “blow up” the national balance sheet at any time in South Africa.

We only have to turn to page 60 of the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook to understand just what a ball and chain Eskom is on the Western Cape. The cost of load-shedding to business is estimated to be R75 million per stage per day in the Western Cape, and, hon Speaker, we have sovereign credit rating agencies, like Moody's Investor Services, circling us like sharks, ready to downgrade our sovereign credit rating to "junk status" in South Africa.

We all, hon Speaker, remember the sense of renewal, of revitalisation, of progress following President Cyril Ramaphosa's first State of the Nation Address on 16 February 2018 and we all remember the announcement of a "new path" of economic growth, of employment and of transformation in South Africa. However, that sense of renewal, of revitalisation and of progress, along with the "new path" of economic growth, of employment and of transformation, is over in South Africa.

The veneer of President Cyril Ramaphosa as the "master negotiator", who plays the long game and who has everything under control, has been shattered in South Africa. When faced with tough decisions, President Cyril Ramaphosa is inclined to negotiate, to prevaricate, to equivocate, to call summits, to call conferences and to call dialogues in South Africa.

The fact is that rather than clear and decisive leadership, there is a sense of paralysis, because, in the end, President Cyril Ramaphosa will not decide, because he is too scared to divide the ANC-SACP-COSATU alliance in South Africa. [Interjections.] That is the fact, which of course, hon Speaker, has resulted in a descent into economic madness, with National Government considering reckless economic policy proposals, including land expropriation without compensation, state-owned banks, prescribed assets and the nationalisation of the Reserve Bank in South Africa.

Mr A LILI: One more thing, you are coming now... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Speaker, we have worked hard to create an enabling environment for the private sector and for the markets, to drive economic growth and job creation in the Western Cape. We cannot and we will not sit back and allow National Government to become a ball and chain holding back the economy in the Western Cape. The fact is that Premier Alan Winde has set out a bold vision and is implementing that bold vision, right here in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.] to change the ownership back to...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The Premier has announced the most comprehensive and expensive safety plan in the history of the Western Cape. The safety plan includes both a law enforcement component and a violence prevention component with 3 000 new law enforcement officers doing visible policing; 150 investigators working up dockets for prosecution... [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: They have no powers.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...and providing support to 10 000 children and their caregivers... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...during the first 1 000 days of the child's life in the Western Cape. That is leadership. The Premier has announced the establishment of an "Economic War Room" to promote economic growth in the Western Cape. The Economic War Room Pilot Project has commenced, with teams from the Province, from the City and from the private sector working together on eliminating obstacles to economic growth in the construction, manufacturing and business services sector in the Western Cape. That is leadership, which, of course, does not include many of this Government's existing programmes to drive economic growth and job creation, including red-tape reduction, air access and investment and export promotion programmes in the Western Cape.

We will work hard to ensure that the provincial economy grows at a faster rate than the national economy; that the provincial business confidence is greater than national business confidence; and that provincial employment grows at a faster rate than the national economy in the Western Cape, and we will do it so that more people, especially young people, have jobs and live with dignity and with independence and with hope in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Speaker, I hereby table the Provincial Review and Economic Outlook 2019 and the Municipal Review and Economic Outlook 2019 for consideration and deliberation by the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. I can assure hon members that the Provincial Review and Economic Outlook and the Municipal Review and Economic Outlook are world-class research publications that will assist them in their duties in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Finally, I would like to thank everybody who made contributions and who worked so hard to produce the Provincial Review and Economic Outlook and the Municipal Review and Economic Outlook here in the Western Cape. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Maynier. Order hon members! I would like to inform the House that the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook and the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook will now be referred to the relevant committee for consideration, and upon adjournment now, as we adjourn the House, the members of the Budget Committee are requested to stay behind for a meeting of the Budget Committee.

Hon members, guests, we are now concluding the meeting. I would like the members to remain standing whilst the procession is in motion. Thank you very much. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 14:40.

ANNOUNCEMENTS TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

MONDAY, 30 SEPTEMBER 2019

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. Introduction

Minister of Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism

- (a) Western Cape Government: Provincial Economic Review and Outlook 2019. [PR397/2019].
- (b) Western Cape Government: Municipal Economic Review and Outlook 2019. [PR398/2019].

2. Referral of documents to committee in accordance with Standing Rule 92 Budget Committee

- (a) Western Cape Government: Provincial Economic Review and Outlook 2019 [PR397/2019].
- (b) Western Cape Government: Municipal Economic Review and Outlook 2019 [PR398/2019].

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

- 1. Western Cape Government: Provincial Economic Review and Outlook 2019 [PR397/2019].
- 2. Western Cape Government: Municipal Economic Review and Outlook 2019 [PR398/2019].

MONDAY, 30 SEPTEMBER 2019

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

1. Annual reports of provincial departments for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 tabled in terms of section 65(1)(a) of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999), as amended:**(a) The Premier**

Annual Report of the Department of the Premier for 2018/19 (Vote 1: Premier).

Referred to the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(b) Minister of Human Settlements

Annual Report of the Department of Human Settlements for 2018/19 (Vote 8: Human Settlements).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Human Settlements and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

2. Annual reports of provincial entities for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 tabled in terms of section 65(1)(a) of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999), as amended:

(a) Minister of Human Settlements

Annual Report of the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal for 2018/19 (Vote 8: Human Settlements).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Human Settlements.

(b) Minister of Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism

Annual Report of the Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone Licencing Company (SOC) Limited (SIDZ) for 2018/19 (Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

(c) Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport

(i) Annual Report of the Western Cape Cultural Commission for 2018/19 (Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport);

(ii) Annual Report of the Western Cape Language Committee for 2018/19 (Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport); and

(iii) Annual Report of Heritage Western Cape for 2018/19 (Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport).

Referred to the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport and also referred to the Public Accounts Committee.

TUESDAY, 1 OCTOBER 2019

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. Annual reports for 2018/19 that were tabled prior to or on the deadline of 30 September 2019:

Western Cape Provincial Parliament

2. Provincial departments

- (a) Department of the Premier
- (b) Provincial Treasury
- (c) Department of Community Safety
- (d) Department of Education
- (e) Department of Health
- (f) Department of Social Development
- (g) Department of Human Settlements
- (h) Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning
- (i) Department of Transport and Public Works
- (j) Department of Agriculture
- (k) Department of Economic Development and Tourism
- (l) Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport
- (m) Department of Local Government

3. Provincial public entities

- (a) Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board
- (b) Western Cape Liquor Authority
- (c) Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal
- (d) CapeNature (Western Cape Nature Conservation Board)
- (e) Government Motor Transport

-
- (f) Cape Agency for Sustainable Integrated Development in Rural Areas (Casidra)
 - (g) Western Cape Tourism, Trade and Investment Promotion Agency (Wesgro)
 - (h) Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone Licencing Company (SOC) Limited
 - (i) Western Cape Language Committee
 - (j) Western Cape Cultural Commission
 - (k) Heritage Western Cape

TABLING

The Speaker:

Errata:

Corrections on pages 44, 64, 65, 66, 71 and 79 in the Annual Report for 2018/19 of the Department of Education.

**INTERPELLATIONS,
QUESTIONS AND REPLIES**

INTERPELLATIONS:

Khayelitsha: safety of the people

1. Mr Kama asked the Minister of Community Safety:

What progress has the Provincial Government made in enhancing the safety of the people of Khayelitsha as recommended by the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Enkosi, hon Speaker.

HON MEMBERS: Somlomo! [Speaker!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Somlomo! Somlomo!

The SPEAKER: Ndiyabulela. [I thank you.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I want to thank hon member Kama for the question because remember this was indeed quite an important commission and so following the Commission of Inquiry a task team was established consisting of representatives of the South African Police Services, the Department of Community Safety as well as civil society. This task team worked through all 20 Commission recommendations. This included monitoring progress by the SAPS and provincial role players. Reports on progress were submitted to the Office of the Premier as well as the Standing Committee on Community Safety. The most recent report compiled as part of the task team was the monitoring and oversight report compiled in October 2018 in terms of specifically Recommendation 3. The work of the task team has now been subsumed by the whole-of-society approach.

This initiative is led by Khayelitsha jointly by the Director-General of the Western Cape Department of Health and the Head of Department of Community Safety. A design team has been established to coordinate the work of different provincial departments, the City of Cape Town and SAPS to enhance service delivery in the area. There are four interconnected aspects to the WOS-approach in Khayelitsha:

- (1) A social cluster themed to address the social ills or challenges.
- (2) A spatial cluster focusing on how communities are structured and organised including intra-structural planning and development;
- (3) An economic cluster to address economic opportunities;
- (4) Safety, drawing from the Khayelitsha Commission and the key concerns in the area.

It was clear that the other three themes would be clustered around safety in order to improve safety in Khayelitsha. The initiative will be analysed, it will analyse crime statistics and trends and spatial development trends in the area to decide where geographic intervention should be based.

Focus areas will include safety in schools and around the school environment, building trust in the community and the Alcohol Harms Reduction Project. The approach seeks to work with the community and business community.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the MEC for the response. Hon Speaker, there is no doubt that millions were spent on this Commission to paint the National Government and SAPS in a negative light. This is why after so many years, hon Speaker, the Provincial Government has failed dismally to implement some of the recommendations that were assigned to it.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Decided by you.

Mr M KAMA: On page 383 the Commission's report stated clearly that evidence that emerged during the commission inquiry made it clear that there was an emerging young gang culture in Khayelitsha that required an immediate response. Recommendation 12 was clear that DOCS should establish and lead a multi-sectoral task team on youth gangs.

This never happened and as a result young boys that led gangs like the Vuras, the Vatos and the Italians in 2013 have now graduated into big gangs like the Guptas and your Boko Harams, which are terrorising the Cape Flats on a daily basis.

An excuse that has been made, hon Speaker, has been used often in the House, is that the Department is one of the stakeholders responsible for the implementation of the National Anti-Gang Strategy and that it would be duplication if they implemented the Multi-Sectoral Task Team on Youth Gangs. This is a blatant lie, because the anti-gang strategy does not have a focus on youth gangs. The ongoing gang wars taking place in Khayelitsha and surroundings, the high number of young people that are armed and terrorising our communities are partly due to the failure of the Department to act on the recommendations of the Commission.

Hon Speaker, the recommendations of the Commission are binding and therefore the Provincial Government cannot be selective on implementing these recommendations and ignore others when it feels like it. The Commission was supposed to be a blueprint to enhance safety in the province. The failure to implement its recommendation contributed immensely to the province being the murder capital and the Provincial Government should accept this. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Hear-hear!

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Speaker, three days ago I have noted an article in the *Daily Maverick* where the author noticeably questions why the National Minister of Police and the National Department of Police are not implementing the solutions by the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry. Allow me to expand.

SAPS under the leadership of the National Government failed women in Khayelitsha in their unwillingness to implement the Domestic Violence Act.

To date no FSC Unit has been created in any of the precincts in Khayelitsha; also a report by the Western Cape Department of Community Safety in March revealed that training courses for officers had not yet been provided or attended. The human resource requirement of police stations and the urgent reallocation of human resources are yet to be met. These are arguably four of the most vital recommendations of the 13 directed to SAPS, but no implementation.

The Commission noted that it is clear that policing in Khayelitsha is particularly challenging; like anyone in this entire province, even in Khayelitsha, we all deserve to be safe and secure and with that our fundamental rights for the residents of Khayelitsha have been hampered due to the ineffectiveness of SAPS.

The Western Cape Government has made progress and remains committed, as discussed by the Minister, to all the recommendations directed to the Western Cape Government along with the Premier's countless commitments to fighting crime in this province. I would urgently ask, I would even go as far as say friends in the Opposition benches, to speak to the National Minister, so that he can put his weight behind the recommendations and see how it can truly bring safety to Khayelitsha and the surrounding areas. Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I think the Provincial Government, the DA Government in the Western Cape, needs to realise that it has been given an opportunity to lead in the province and it must stop that every time when there is an issue they have to address, the excuse is that National is not doing that and that. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: But they are not doing it.

Mr M KAMA: Hon Speaker, what is clear is that DOCS and Provincial Government were assigned recommendations to implement, which they ignored. We also have to accept that crime is not a responsibility of police only. Fortunately MEC Fritz understands this battle. He acknowledges that things like poor service delivery, poverty, unemployment and inequality contribute to the crime situation.

The Commission itself noted this anomaly when it alerted inadequate sanitation; insufficient public lighting; informal housing and poor road infrastructure as factors contributing to high levels of violent crimes in the area and this limiting police's ability to fight crime. In police precincts, hon Speaker, with many informal settlements the crime and murder rate are always high and nothing is done to address this. While the City of Cape Town refuses to use the USDG Fund to develop informal settlements, the DoCS is happy to just point fingers at National Government and SAPS. This must end, hon Speaker, stop the blame-and-complain game. Do the actual work.

Recommendation 8, hon Speaker, highlighted some challenges with regard to functioning of CPFs. It recommended that an investigation was needed on what the appropriate role of CPFs could be and what constraints there may be on CPFs in order for them to perform such role including resource constraints.

Just last week, Hon Speaker, MEC Fritz told the House that there are about five CPFs that his Department is not working with or they are not working with the Department, because they do not want to account to the Department. On top of that CPFs are not participating on anything at the current moment until they have elected new elected leadership as reported to the Committee by the Department last week. This is wrong and totally unacceptable. The ill-treatment of CPFs must be condemned.

As if that was not enough, Recommendation 8 was on the use of CCTV cameras, it stated that consideration should be given to relocating the cameras for maximum effect... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kama, you need to wrap up, your time is up.

Mr M KAMA: Are we working on three minutes?

The SPEAKER: Yes, three minutes.

Mr M KAMA: Oh! Okay, thank you, Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Policy.

Mr M KAMA: In wrapping up, hon Speaker, what I want to say, hon Speaker, I use this opportunity also to applaud the KPF in Khayelitsha for trying because of the cries of the community, recently they have launched their, I think, Project Uyabona where they will install 45 cameras and the question would be what is the Department doing to address this recommendation. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Kama. Thank you, your time is up.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you hon Speaker. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you hon Speaker. Sometimes, hon member, and I am saying this with absolute respect, hon Speaker, when I answer and you just have a ready-made script you do not - you have not listened to what I said, because you just continue to read from your ready-made script and it does not sometimes make logical sense, but the hon member is a good man, so I think we have some good understanding. [Interjections.]

So hon Speaker, through you to the hon member Kama, the one fundamental issue that you as the ANC has control over, that the National Minister has to just sign the National MOU regarding the Khayelitsha Commission. Up to today it is still not signed. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): How many years later, how many years?

An HON MEMBER: It is shocking!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is still not signed and then, you know, then this party comes here and they lecture us about cooperation. All the other stuff, hon member, and I must say to you... [Interjection.]

†n AGBARE LID: Swak!
[An HON MEMBER: Poor!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That was exactly what I was talking about, the whole-of-society approach. You will remember, as I said that multi-party, the task team, was to deal with exactly what you said. But I also want to say, the provincial approach to the National Anti-Gang Strategy has also been concluded and we are waiting and of course you are correct that you can have a National Anti-Gang Strategy. What is it called, the National / Provincial Anti-Gang Strategy and if we do not have it in the province, it is absurd, because there is a new form of gangs as you indicated in our townships and I think Boko Haram is far more than youth gangs. They actually border now on syndicates and they are very, very dangerous. I mean there are now shebeens, illegal shebeens closed; not because of law enforcement, they are closing because they cannot pay the extortion money that these gangs - powerful gangs - are operating. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Oh, so you know about that. What are you doing; what are you doing about that?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, you run *mos* behind them, with some of them, so the point I am making hon member Kama, is that kind of thing. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.] Boko Haram existing in townships.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And so I am saying we are still waiting on the Provincial Commissioner but there is a new Commissioner with a great will to make stuff happen. So I am sure we are going to have that, do you remember the provincial response to the National Anti-Gang Strategy? I am sure that will go in now.

I also want to just say that even the Social Justice Coalition took National to Court on the Khayelitsha Report, and the Equality Court ruled in favour of and how to engage the National Minister and we are just looking at, the one thing the Court must just conclude is still the remedies involved because they agreed with us and with the Social Justice Coalition on the under-resourcing, which is like the fundamental issue in the Western Cape. There is also a very interesting point, another point that, and I must say this and I really want to say it very constructively, I am not really pointing fingers, but really the National Minister and the ANC Government must stop hiding behind the veil of environmental

design and social issues, and I agree that those are contributing but they must just get their basics right. They must get policing right. You know, you can go with me now to any police station, go with me to Belhar, or go with me even to one of the areas in Nyanga, the police station. The level of service delivery is just absolutely pathetic. So the point I am making is they must really honestly stop hiding behind the veil. We must pierce the veil and shut them up and say "Hello, stop hiding behind this nonsense."

The last thing I want to just say hon member and I see hon member Dugmore is applauding you very loudly - but the Community Police Forums, their time has expired. You know there is a Constitution that is five years. The five years had passed. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is the ANC [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hello! Get it into your head that they must get out and bring back new people to be elected.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, you are marginalising them; even before the end of the term. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No, get them to be elected, but they want to use the forum for their own source. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, you need to wrap up.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, they want to use it for their own political purpose. That is the problem. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Shocking!

An HON MEMBER: Yes, the same way you use the Walking Buses.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But I want to say thank you for your contribution. Thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

Disciplinary action against members facing charges

2. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Premier:

Whether he will take disciplinary action against any member of his Cabinet who faces pending crime and/or corruption charges?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the Provincial Leader of the Opposition for the question. Hon Speaker, the answer to this question depends on what the hon member Dugmore means by the term "pending crime and/or corruption charges", and I say this because if he means charges in the sense of being allegations that he or his party may conjure up against members of my Cabinet from time to time but which have no substance in terms of any *bona fide* investigation by an appropriate organ of state, then the answer is no.

If however, he means circumstances when a member of my Cabinet is the subject of a *bona fide* investigation by SAPS or the NPA in relation to an alleged crime, which includes corruption, then I will obviously consider the facts at my disposal and then determine what action can or should be taken in respect of such Minister. An independent consideration of the correct facts will of course always be relevant, never more so than in this era of fake news. Captured organs of state or social media comments are too often mistaken for the full and complete truth in a matter.

Hon member Dugmore will of course hopefully also be aware that his use of the term “disciplinary action” in relation to me and my Ministers is incorrect, given that our Cabinet Ministers are not my employees but rather serve at my discretion, as was explained recently by none other than the President himself, President Ramaphosa, when pointing this out to the Public Protector in response to her suggestion that he was capable and indeed obligated to discipline Minister Gordhan just recently.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you very much hon Speaker. For the past decade we have been made to believe that the DA is a corrupt-free organisation, which would take every step possible to ensure that those who are found guilty of corruption are brought to book.

Now besides the clear bias of MEC Bredell when he deals with councillors, and it is a matter of record he is biased, the manifesto of the party urged people to use their votes to ensure a strong DA because in their words the DA was serious about fighting corruption.

The SPEAKER: I recognise the Chief Whip. Hon member Dugmore, will you please take your seat. There is a point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, on a point of order, is it parliamentary for one hon member to call another hon member biased?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I would argue it is not. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Speaker will make a decision, you are not the Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Let me say the following, hon members, Rule 59 is clear on what we can or cannot do as hon members and one is that you may not cast aspersions on the sitting member of the House and that especially on the integrity of the Minister who is sitting here, so on that point then I will request hon member Dugmore to withdraw that part because it is out of order in terms of Rule 59.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, I do withdraw and give notice that we will bring a substantive motion to demonstrate and prove the bias which we are alleging.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): He also made a bold statement that he would ensure the Western Cape had a government of integrity to honour Madiba and each and every citizen, but it appears that this administration led by Premier Winde has more than one of its members of the Executive Council under a dark cloud. An example to prove this would be MEC Madikizela, his lavish birthday celebration... [Interjection.]

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Daai is ou stories.
[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Those are old stories.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): ...which is clear was sponsored by certain suppliers in the building industry. [Interjections.] That is beyond the dispute. If you read the Public Protector's report it is beyond dispute that donations were made.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Bring it to me straight. [Inaudible.] SASSA.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): We would like to ask the Premier, will he make public the report that the former Premier indicated she had compiled through an internal investigation; will he make it public? Was MEC Madikizela, given this questionable ethical conduct, was he in fact shifted because the Premier fears further revelations in regard to that particular MEC, but it is clear that the Premier does not need to wait for criminal charges to actually look at this particular issue which remains unresolved. A substantive motion, Speaker, was brought before this House last week, calling for an investigation against MEC Simmers for the alleged theft of electricity at his residence in George. This is also a matter of public record that a criminal case, CAS 355/1/2016 interfering with the electric apparatus was withdrawn by the Municipality for reasons that had very little to do with the merits of the case. I therefore want the Premier to give his commitment that if indeed a criminal case is reopened against MEC Simmers or any other MEC, that he would then take the particular action that he has now committed to in his initial response to this interpellation. [Applause.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you hon Speaker. I am sure the hon member can tweet to former Premier Helen Zille and ask for a copy of that report but, hon Speaker, the short answer to the hon member's question, whether the Premier will take action against any member of his Cabinet, the short answer where the DA Government governs, the DA will take action against any member who faces pending criminal or corruption... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, that is nonsense.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Can you protect me, hon Speaker. The DA-led Government believes in open transparent and accountable government in the service of the people, but, hon Speaker, there is not one member of the Cabinet who faces criminal charges or corruption charges. This is not how the DA does things. This is how the ANC does things.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Think of Nomvula - the “braai pack” - Mokonyane and Bathabile Dlamini who were retained by President Ramaphosa in his Cabinet throughout 2018, and even made it back on the ANC’s parliamentary list despite criticism. Currently the Mayor of Durban even withdrew her resignation letter. [Interjection.] That is the quality of people the ANC has got. The toothless ANC’s Integrity Commission, hon Speaker, there is no new dawn in the ANC. They reward the implicated Minister in State capture with short-landings, even in this Provincial Legislature there were members of the Brown Envelope Brigade who applied to be here... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are a hater!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...who were on their list and now still sitting on the task team to re-change the ANC. How does a party with that low level of credibility still ask such a question?

The DA believes in the rule of law and although one is considered to be innocent until proven guilty we hold all these members to the highest standard, not by the lowest common denominator, which is corruption. I thank you. [Applause.]

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Mooi!
[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Good!]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you hon Speaker. It is clear from the question that we... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon member Dugmore, I have not recognised you yet. Thank you, hon member Mackenzie, I now recognise the Leader of the Opposition, hon member Dugmore. [Laughter.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you hon Speaker. Let us be clear that our question is that in terms of charges that are pending or will be brought, what will the Premier do, will he commit himself? That is the issue for debate here because it is clear that the ANC has shown leadership in KwaZulu Natal. [Laughter.] It has dealt with the situation where there are particular charges that have been laid and it is following a process. [Interjections.] We are a constitutional democracy. [Interjections.]

†’n AGBARE LID: In die Noord-Kaap.
[An HON MEMBER: In the Northern Cape.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): But it is clear that this Premier has not been accountable and we also need to hear from the Premier and from his MEC that they are serious about conducting an investigation as to why the Municipality withdrew the charges against MEC Simmers.

Recently even more information on the alleged corruption of MEC Simmers has surfaced, for example when he was a councillor at the Eden District Municipality he allegedly unjustifiably claimed from the subsistence and transport allowance... [Interjections.]

†Die ADJUNKHOOFSWEEP (DA): Dit is dieselfde geval.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is the same case.]

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Sê vir Bessie hy moet die ding... [Onduidelik]

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Tell Bessie he should ...
[Inaudible.]]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): The invitation was sent from NSchilder@DA Westerncapegov.za between 2011 and 2013. [Interjections.] He also claimed thousands from the Municipality for subsistence and transport while he did not have a driver's licence and was driving a car that was not roadworthy. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): It has been brought to our attention that between 2011 and 2012 the member claimed tax from SARS for his travelling and received over R8 000 refund. Why must the Premier wait for charges to be laid before he does the right thing of actually considering members... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Tell Bessie to send you the
[Inaudible.]

†Me P Z LEKKER: Is dit seer?

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Does it hurt?]

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Hou jou mond man!

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Be quiet man!]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): ...and their removal who will jeopardise his mission on putting this Government on a path of integrity. In closing the Premier... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order. Would you please take your seat, hon member Dugmore? I recognise hon Chief Whip of the Opposition.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you hon Speaker. I would like to [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Ask about Zuma's tax affairs. [Laughter.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I would like to ask from the hon Speaker whether it is parliamentary for hon member Simmers when I ask, "Is dit seer", and he responds by saying: "Hou jou mond." Is it parliamentary?

An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you hon, the Chief Whip of the Opposition. It is a difficult one. I did not hear what the member was saying, but if he did say so “Hou jou mond”, it is similar to say “shut up”, is that correct?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

The SPEAKER: And I ruled that “shut up” is unparliamentary and it was withdrawn.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes. [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Hou jou mond is “bly stil.”
[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: *Hou jou mond* means “Be quiet.”]

The SPEAKER: Now let me - can I please chair this meeting? Can I be the Speaker, I am presiding, so please, hon members. Minister Simmers, did you utter those words?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Speaker I did say “hou jou mond” but the English translation is “please keep quiet.” Thank you.

Mrs P BANS: No it is not “Please keep quiet.” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Agbare Speaker, Speaker [Tussenwerpsels.]
[Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, Speaker [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Alright, Order hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Hon member Marais, what is your point of order?

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Meneer, “hou jou mond” is nie “bly stil” nie. Dit is ’n aggressiewe manier om te sê “Hou jou smoel. *Shut up*. So dit is dieselfde as “shut up.” Ek is Afrikaans en ’n Engelse man kan nie vir my sê wat dit beteken nie. [Applous.] [Gelag.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: Sir, “hou jou mond” is not “bly stil”. It is an aggressive manner to say *Hou jou smoel*. *Shut up*. So it is the same as “shut up.” I am Afrikaans and an Englishman cannot tell me what it means. [Applause.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you. Thank you hon Marais. †Ek het mos nou Afrikaans om te leer. [I now have Afrikaans to learn.]

†n AGBARE LID: Ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes!]

The SPEAKER: May I request if there is a contestation that we - because the member said it without pressing the mic so it is difficult to refer, but if the member indeed said so, that is unparliamentary and I wish that members monitor the use of language we use, but let us proceed now. I hope we are all happy. The member, I have asked the hon member, hon member Lekker, I asked the hon Minister Simmers to confirm whether he in fact said so or not and when he stood up he had a different view. Hon Minister Simmers, did you say “hou jou mond”?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Speaker, I did indeed say “hou jou mond”, yes.

The SPEAKER: Will you please withdraw that, Sir?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I will withdraw it, but then I will give the member an Afrikaans dictionary. Thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Simmers, do you withdraw unconditionally?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I withdraw unconditionally; †sonder voorwaardes. [without conditions.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Simmers. I learnt something from hon member Marais, what else I could say if I was sitting that side. May I please request the hon, the Leader of the Opposition to proceed. He was on the floor.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Hon Speaker, just on a point of order, could the Table or yourself please indicate how many more seconds I have, because I need to structure my last comment.

The SPEAKER: We kept the time. It is exactly one minute 12 seconds that is left, yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Chairperson, this is not a witch-hunt by the Opposition. We have committed ourselves to being united, to being effective, to being vigilant, to being responsible but also to being constructive. The concern that we have is that there is email evidence which indicates conduct unbecoming of an MEC, a Provincial Minister of this Government. What we expect from the Premier and from the MEC is to come clean on this particular issue of the travel allowances. It is our responsibility to bring to the attention of this House what are allegations. That is why we are doing it, not because we have anything personal about hon Minister Simmers or any other member of this House. This is not personal. [Interjections.]

This relates to conduct, ethical conduct that we are expecting from MECs so what we would like to ask the Premier, in regard to the email correspondence which we will provide to you in regard to all of these allegations of travel claims, would you give this House a commitment that you would investigate those ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): ... and actually provide this House with the information about these very serious allegations about the abuse of the taxpayers' money in regard to unwarranted claims.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I think first of all I will reiterate and it was said by the Leader of the Opposition that we stand for good governance and I did speak about integrity and doing things properly. I can also say that I believe that I have done that ever since coming to this House, specifically dealing with corruption; specifically dealing with these kinds of issues. I think way back to dealing with David Malatsi; I remember raising it under member's privilege in this very House, taking it to the Public Protector and processes ended up with that very member or Minister then ending up serving prison time.

I think I have shown it with officials in the departments that I have been the Minister of in the last few years and we could actually draw the detail of those officials who have also been arrested and processes have been followed. I think exactly the same when I was in the position of the hon member there, I think back to bringing issues to this House of the then Mayor Wildeman and Municipal Manager Seitisho and even getting them in this House and I think the hon member Mvimbi will know this, but getting them in this very House in our Standing Committee admitting to double-dipping in trips to Paris, in using municipal credit cards for Friday afternoon shopping sprees, etcetera. So I want to say that I absolutely am committed to making sure that we have clean ethical government in this province.

So you have asked actually a few questions besides your last points. I think the first questions you raised were around the issues that were raised in the previous Parliament of this House, around Minister Madikizela, investigations of the then Premier, the Public Protector process; the challenges to the Public Protector process and I give an undertaking to go and see if I can find those documents and make them available to the hon member.

I also will say as in the issues that he has raised about the hon member Simmers in this House, Minister Simmers, I have actually received written correspondence to this effect from another political party in this House, I think everybody is aware of it because it was sent to me but also sent to the media. That has been a subject of an investigation and I am told that I should have the report on my desk within the next few days. Obviously then what I will do is send it back to where it was raised from and I will do exactly the same if you give me those details as you have said, I will give the undertaking that we will

follow process, investigate and deal with it appropriately, because as I said in the beginning that we believe in good clean government and when these issues are raised they must be investigated, and then of course there are different paths to follow once that investigation has been completed. I will give it back to the hon member and then either I or he are able to follow different paths, but I said as well, while we uphold the rule and law and our Constitution we also believe in innocence until proven guilty. We also believe that when you have these kinds of charges that you obviously lay them outside of this House with certain consequences, if you lay those charges and make them public outside of the House and are seen to be untrue, obviously you must deal with it and that is why we have in our parliamentary democracy the opportunity for members to raise issues within the confines of this Parliament, you have protection in which to do that so that we can ensure that we have proper clean and effective government. So my answer is in closing that that is exactly what I will do. If I can ask you to formally submit to me it will be easier than drawing it from Hansard and then it is a formal document to me and we will follow that process. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Premier. Your time is up. Thank you very much. That concludes this interpellation. Now the next interpellation is by hon Van der Westhuizen to the hon Minister of Local Government, Environment Affairs and Development Planning. I now recognise the Minister, Minister Bredell.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, can I before the Minister speaks, on a point of order ask the relevance of this question because on Local Government we have - anybody can stay... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon member! Hon member, that cannot be a point of order.

Mr P J MARAIS: It is a sweetheart question.

The SPEAKER: No, but that is a frivolous point of order. I am sorry. I recognise the Minister.

[Debate concluded.]

Local government public representatives

3. Mr A P van der Westhuizen asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

What actions can his Department and local governments take to make it more attractive and easier for a wider range of voters to become candidates who are willing to serve as public representatives at local government level?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, thank you very much. It is not a sweetheart question, it is an interpellation.

Section 158 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa provides for certain criteria, which makes citizens who qualify to vote for a municipal council eligible or non-eligible to be a member of that council. Thus, any member of the community who qualifies in terms of the criteria referred to in the Constitution and has the conviction as leaders to serve the community in an effective accountable transparent manner, whilst facilitating public participation, should be encouraged to serve as the public representative at local government level. My Department's mandate is to focus on the development of those serving within the municipal landscape and enable the creation of local government that people would want to serve in, in collaboration with other stakeholders.

Actions my Department has taken to build the capacity of councillors that have and are currently serving in local government space, are mostly based on identified developmental needs. These needs are based on concerns, reported to the Department's audit outcomes, matters reporting in the media and information shared by citizens. The Department has previously rolled out a customised skills programme with the Nelson Mandela Bay University, as implementing agent. The skills programme could translate into a qualification and contained, amongst others, the following modules:

- The Role of the Speaker and Mayor in Local Government;
- Oversight in Local Government;
- Guidelines for councillors;
- The Law governing decisions and decision-making in Local Government;
- Code of Conduct for councillors;
- Procedures for disciplinary hearings and investigations;
- Rules of procedures;
- Conduct at meetings of the Municipal Council;
- The Role of Councillors in Supply Chain Management;
- Delegations of Powers in Local Government;
- The Constitutional Mandate of Local Government;
- The Roles and responsibilities of Municipal Councillors in terms of the MFMA.

My Department also realised that despite rolling out this modular programme, additional focus was needed on soft skills, personal attributes that enable someone to interact effectively with their community and thus made provision for such including providing hands-on support and advisory services where requested, to assist in setting an ethical tone and enable good governance through support to councillors to fulfil their oversight role. In terms of the Local Government Integrity Management Framework councillors have the responsibility for setting an ethical tone for the municipality and ensuring good governance through fulfilling their oversight role. Their work also requires them to make use of substantive discretion in decisions that will be based on their personal moral values and integrity. They thus have significant ethical responsibilities and frequently work in challenging ethical environments.

The SPEAKER: Minister, you need to wrap up.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Bredell, I now recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, will you just stop the clock so that the translation services can come online as I would like to speak Afrikaans.

The SPEAKER: I am sure we are ready all the time. Are we ready?

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb lid Mvimbi, kan u my hoor in die taal van u keuse?

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon member Mvimbi, can you hear me in the language of your choice?]

The SPEAKER: Can you confirm, hon members, whether the translation is live?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, hon Speaker.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Is daar vertaling?

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Is there translation?]

The SPEAKER: It is. It is live.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Is it live?

The SPEAKER: Now you may proceed, hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Baie dankie, agbare Speaker. Deur u aan die Minister, ek dink ons besef dat uiteindelik is plaaslike regering verantwoordelik vir 'n geweldige belangrike deel van dienslewering in Suid-Afrika en dit is my indruk dat baie van ons diensleweringsoffisiere hou ook direk verband met klagtes van inwoners oor gebrek aan dienslewering op plaaslike vlak en ek dink daarom sal almal in hierdie Huis met my saamstem as ek sê ons sal graag wil sien dat die beste mense moontlik hulle as raadslede of kandidate vir raadslidskap beskikbaar sal stel. Maar Minister, soos wat u weet, is die posisie van 'n raadslid baie onseker. Daar is geen arbeidsbeskerming nie. Jy word maar vir 'n termyn van vyf jaar verkies en soos wat ons nou vroeër vandag in hierdie Huis gehoor het, stel jy jou hele lewe voor dat daar uiteindelik vir jou swartgesmeer kan word, dat daar karaktermoord op jou gepleeg kan word en so meer. Dit is nie alle mense wat kans sien om dit aan hulself te laat doen nie, maar soos wat u ook weet, Minister, is daar 'n groot verskil in die vergoeding tussen die sogenaamde voltydse en deeltydse raadslede op plaaslike vlak maar die publiek verwag nie van jou om net 'n deeltydse raadslid te wees nie. Baie van u was waarskynlik self voorheen raadslede gewees. U weet, jy mag 'n deeltydse raadslid op papier wees maar uiteindelik verwag die publiek van jou om 24-uur, sewe dae van die week aan diens te wees en om na hulle behoeftes om te sien. Wat meer is, in sommige gemeenskappe word daar selfs van raadslede verwag om hulp te verleen met elektrisiteitsaankope, die kostes van begrafnisse, vervoer na hospitale en so meer en ons het al baie keer gesien dat dit eenvoudig vir raadslede onhoudbaar word om daar hul eie gemeenskappe wat tog die ideaal is waar hulle moet bly, om daar te kan voortbestaan, en dan, agb Speaker... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. Through you to the Minister, I think we realise that in the end local government is responsible for a very important part of service delivery in South Africa and it is my impression that many of our service delivery protests are also directly related to complaints of inhabitants about lack of service delivery at local level, and I think therefore all in this House will agree with me that we would like to see the best people possible make themselves available as councillors or candidates for council membership. But Minister, as you know the position of councillor is very uncertain. There is no labour protection. One is elected for a term of only five years and as we have heard here earlier in this House, you imagine your whole life that you can be defamed, one's character assassinated and so on. It is not many people who see fit to let this be done to themselves, but as you also know, Minister, there is big difference in the remuneration between the so-called full-time and part-time councillors at local level, but the public does not expect of you to only be a part-time councillor. Many of you probably had been councillors previously. You know, you may be a part-time councillor on paper but in the end the public expects you to be on duty 24 hours, seven days of the week to look after their needs. What is more, in some communities it is expected of councillors to be of assistance with electricity purchases, the cost of funerals, transport to hospitals and so on, and we have often seen that it simply becomes unbearable for councillors to stay there within their own communities as is after all the ideal, to carry on living there, and then hon Speaker... [Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: You need to wrap up, hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Dit is daarom 'n kommer vir my en daarom sal ek graag van die Minister wil vra om nog meer aandag te gee hoe kan ons die sterkste kandidate werf om uiteindelik hulle beskikbaar te stel vir byvoorbeeld die 2021 Verkiesing en daarna. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: It is therefore a worry to me and therefore I would like to ask the Minister to pay more attention to how we can recruit the strongest candidates to eventually make themselves available for example the 2021 Election and thereafter. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Van der Westhuizen. I now recognise hon Bans.

†Me A P BANS: Dankie agb Speaker. Hierdie vraag is in geheel misplaas omdat die LUR vir Plaaslike Regering nie 'n indiensnemingburo is nie. Die LUR se taak is om raadslede op te lei, te ondersteun en ook daardie raadslede te verwyder wat hulle wangedra. Hy werf doodeenvoudig nie enige raadslede nie. Hulle word mos demokraties verkies. Die agbare lid Van der Westhuizen is nog nie lank met ons nie en hy ly aan verskeie illusies, soos toe hy gister beswaar gemaak het dat lede van die publiek in hierdie Wetgewer ook vrae aan departemente mag stel.

Verder word plaaslike regeringsverkiesings nie dieselfde tyd as provinsiale verkiesings gehou nie. Hoe hierdie LUR nou oor plaaslike regerings praat, is vreemd, aangesien hy geen mandaat het om dit te doen nie. Hy het nie 'n toesigrol nie en mag nie inmeng nie. Bo alles is dit 'n ou liefingsvragie met soentjies en drukkies wat uitgedeel word. [Gelag.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms A P BANS: Thank you hon Speaker. This question is wholly misplaced as the MEC for Local Government is not a recruitment agency. The MEC's task is to train councillors, to support them, and also to remove those councillors who misbehave. He simply does not recruit any councillors. They have been elected democratically after all. The hon member Van der Westhuizen has not been with us for very long and he suffers from all kinds of illusions, like when yesterday he objected to members of the public in this Legislature putting questions to departments.]

Furthermore local government elections are not held at the same time as provincial elections. How this MEC now talks about local governments is weird, as he has no mandate to do so. He has no oversight role and may not interfere. Above all it is a sweetheart question with kisses and squeezes being dished out. [Laughter.]]

An HON MEMBER: Uh-huh.

†Me A P BANS: Knipoog maar gerus! Die agbare vraagsteller is duidelik nie tevrede met die omvang en gehalte van sy verteenwoordigers as kandidate nie. Miskien moet hy eerder by die DA se eie aansoekproses gaan beswaar maak teen die hordes kandidate wat daar aanklop bloot om 'n pos te kry. Dankie agb Speaker. [Applous.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Ms A P BANS: Wink if you like! The hon questioner is clearly not satisfied with the extent and quality of his representatives as candidates. Perhaps he should go and complain with the DA's own application process against the hordes of candidates who come knocking there simply to get a post. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]]

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Pragtige Afrikaans!

[Mr P J MARAIS: Beautiful Afrikaans!]

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Mnr die Speaker, nee, nee, ek is dankbaar om te sien dat ons kreunende *sweetheart*-lid is terug in die Huis. [Gelag.] Ek dink dit is vir my jammer dat alle partye nie die erns van hierdie vraag besef nie, dat hulle nie besef hoe belangrik dit is dat ons die beste mense moet werf om uiteindelik in ons rade te dien nie, en ek glo daar is baie ook wat ons van hierdie kant af kan doen om uiteindelik te verseker dat meer mense hulle beskikbaar stel deur nie byvoorbeeld die karaktermoord op ou raadslede te pleeg wat ons vandag hier gesien het nie.

Ons kan verder ook baie doen om te verseker dat raadslede en hul gesinne nie bedreig word in hulle gemeenskappe nie, en die ironie is baie keer word daardie kwaad en verset teen stadsraadslede deur lede van ander politieke partye gestook. Dit is onbillik dat die kinders en die vrouens van raadslede geïntimideer word, dat kinders onveilig is wanneer hulle na hul skole toe wil gaan en so meer en dit is alles aspekte waar nie net die Minister nie, maar ook u as ons medeledede in hierdie Huis 'n groot bydrae kan lewer om die lewe vir ons plaaslike regerings se verteenwoordigers makliker te maak. Ons wil uiteindelik die beste span in die veld kan stoot sodat die beste diens aan ons gemeenskappe gelewer kan word en dit is vir my jammer dat dit nie deur die Opposisie erken word nie. Dankie agb Speaker.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Mr Speaker, no, no, I am grateful to see that our groaning sweetheart member is back in the House. [Laughter.] I think it is a pity that all parties do not realise the seriousness of this question, that they do not realise how important it is that we recruit the best people to eventually serve in our councils, and I believe there is also much we can do from our side to ensure that more people make themselves available by for instance not commit character assassination on old councillors as we have seen here today. We can further do a lot to ensure that councillors and their families are not threatened in their communities, and the irony is often that evil and opposition to councillors are stoked by members of other political parties. It is unfair that the children and wives of councillors are intimidated, that children are unsafe when want to go to school and so on, and these are all aspects where not only the Minister but also you as our fellow members in this House can make a big contribution to make the lives of our local government representatives easier. In the end we want to field the best team so that the best service can be delivered to our communities, and it is sad for me that it is not acknowledged by the Opposition. Thank you, hon Speaker.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, hon member Van der Westhuizen. [The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Van der Westhuizen.] I now recognise the Premier, the hon, the Minister. You see, I want to give you again, hon Premier!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie agb Speaker en die agbare lede baie dankie vir u deelname aan die interpellasie. Die agbare lid Bans moet ek eers om verskoning vra, my interpretasie vir “hou jou mond” was sagter as “shut up”, maar sy was korrek gewees, dit is op Google Translate so.

Agb Speaker, dit is 'n belangrike vraag, ek dink as ons die vraag 'n bietjie anders kan stel is dat... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you hon Speaker and the hon members for your participation in the interpellation. I have to first apologise to hon member Bans, my interpretation for “hou jou mond” was softer than “shut up”, but she was correct, it is like that on Google Translate.

Hon Speaker, it is an important question, I think if we can put the question somewhat differently it is ... [Interjection.]]

†Me P Z LEKKER: Belangrike vrae!

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Important questions]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ...aan die einde van 25 jaar van demokrasie het ons nog nie aan die voorkant gekom van die grootste ewels van die samelewing nie, onder andere armoede, en die vraag vir my is eintlik die politieke dispensasie waaronder ons werk, wat moet daarin verander om vir ons beter leierskap te gee aan die einde van die dag. As Departement doen ons geweldig baie saam met ander departemente in opleiding, ons investeer geweldig baie in opleiding maar dit is ook moeilik vir raadslede om raadslid te wees en deel te neem aan die opleiding. Ons het ook die risiko van 'n vyf-jaar termyn besef en daarom noem ons die opleiding eintlik 'n sirkel van ontwikkeling, met ander woorde ons erken dat enige iemand wat die politieke veld betree kan van geen skoolopleiding hê tot doktorsgrade hê, so dit is 'n sirkel van ontwikkeling. Jy kan by enige plek by die sirkel inkom en jy kan na vier jaar as jy deur alles gaan kan jy uitloop met 'n graad so ons berei jou ook voor om 'n lewe buite die politiek te kan lei. Maar daar is geweldig druk en ek dink in 'n demokrasie het ons altyd gesê die kieser kry wat hulle verdien, so dit is 'n totale kopskuif dat ons moet stem vir mense wat werklik omgee en wat werklik 'n verskil kan maak in ons samelewing. Ek dink elke politieke party het hulle eie stelsel en sal hulle eie reëls moet ontwikkel sodat ons geskikte mense kry om die publiek daar buite te dien. Baie dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... at the end of 25 years of democracy we are still not at the front of the greatest evils of our society, amongst others poverty, and the question for me is actually what should change within the political dispensation in which we work for us to provide better leadership at the end of the day. As Department we do a great deal with other departments in training, we invest a lot in training but it is also difficult for councillors to be councillors and participate in the training. We have also realised the risk of a five year term and therefore we call the training actually a circle of development, in other words we acknowledge that anyone who enters the political field can have from no school training to doctors degrees, so it is a circle of development. One can enter at any place in the circle and after four years, if you go through everything, one can walk out with a degree, so we also prepare you to live a life outside politics. But there is enormous pressure and I think in a democracy we have always said that the voters get what they deserve, so it is a total mindshift that we have to vote for people who really care and who can really make a difference in our society. I think every political party has its own system and will have to develop their own rules so that we can get suitable people to serve the public out there. Thank you.]

[Debate concluded.]

Questions for oral reply

*Minister Cele: intergovernmental dispute***1. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Premier:**

- (a) What are the reasons for the intergovernmental dispute with Minister Cele, (b) how much is budgeted for the court action and (c) how will this action improve safety in the province?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker and thank you very much to the hon Chief Whip for the question. The reply is as follows:

1. (a) The reason for the intergovernmental dispute is the historic irrational resourcing methodology and model applied by SAPS which has resulted in chronic under resourcing of SAPS in the Western Cape, as was confirmed by, *inter alia*, the Public Service Commission's report too, and coupled with the comprehensive failure of Minister Bheki Cele to engage with us on these issues once they were raised with him, and as set out in my office's letters to Mr Cele, dated 10 October 2018 and 25 April 2019 – copies of which can gladly be made available to the hon member should she want to read them.
- (b) The parties are currently engaged in an engagement and mediation process to see if the issue can be resolved, i.e. in a manner that does not involve court appearances, and it is only if this process fails to produce a result, that court action can and will be pursued. Our official at DoCS, along with Legal Services and the State Attorney, are now engaged in that process, and as such no budget allocation for litigation purposes has been necessary as yet.
- (c) The outcome we seek, either via mediation or engagement alternatively via a court of law, is that SAPS will produce and be held to the application of the National Resource Allocation Plan and Methodology for resourcing in this province; which model takes into account the current crime we face and the effects of the historical under resourcing and adopts a more holistic approach going forward, which will result in a more visible better resourced police force in this province and as a consequence a reduction in crime.

*CPF elections***2. Mr R I Allen asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

- (a) What is the current level of readiness for the election of Community Policing Forums (CPFs) in September and (b) what support will his Department provide?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: †*Enkosi*. [Thank you.] The reply is as follows:

2. Mr Speaker, the Annual General Meeting directives will be issued by me, the Minister of Community Safety, after concurrence by the Western Cape Provincial Commissioner of SAPS. The Minister – me – is required to do so in terms of Sections 19, 20 and 21 of the South African Police Act, Act 68 of 1995; read with Section 3(f) and 5 of the Western Cape Community Safety Act of 2013.

The directives and guidelines set out in the said document have been developed to guide the election process and to ensure that it is transparent and free and fair.

The Department consulted with the National Civilian Secretariat for the Police Service, the Independent Electoral Commission, the Provincial CPF Board and the Board Executive, and the SAPS Provincial Office, when drafting the directives.

Furthermore advertisements have been placed in 80 community newspapers, to announce the AGM process and to afford organisations the opportunity to register for the upcoming elective AGM's, as per the directives. A task team comprising members of the Western Cape SAPS Provincial Office, the Department of Community Safety – that is DoCS – has been established to oversee the election process and to see to it that all AGM's are compliant with the directives and a uniform Constitution for CPF's; the 2010 and general elections practices.

The DoCS officials that will assist with the meetings have been trained and are currently engaged with the local SAPS station commanders on suitable dates of the election.

The (b) part of the question: Yes, the Department will facilitate CPF board elections to minimise disputes that arise as a result of flawed procedures before and at these elections. There are [Inaudible.] DoCS officials who have been allocated to all local CPF areas in the Province. DoCS will facilitate the compilation and finalisation of the list of organisations and the voters roll and this will be provided to the SAPS station commanders in order for them to invite all these organisations to the AGM. And I want to add, we will also have a kind of quality assurance process around those invitations, because we do not want station commanders to invite selectively who they wish to, so we will have some kind of thing. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise any member who has a supplementary question. Thank you. Hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, which Marais, sorry?

The SPEAKER: Oh, hon member P Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: P? [Interjections.] Sorry, ... family member. [Laughter.]

Hon Minister, the question I want to ask you, the police forum what have you got in mind to make them more relevant?

An HON MEMBER: Relevant?

Mr P J MARAIS: People are struggling at police stations to compile affidavits to bring cases for women abuse, etcetera. They do not get a sympathetic ear sometimes. How can the police forums be trained to do that function; help with the compilation of an affidavit, or help with advice for rape victims and then accompany these people who have complaints to the police station to make sure they get the proper attention?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, will you please take your seat? There is a point of order. Is that a point of order, hon member Mitchell?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is just that I need to understand, Mr Speaker, what the channel is for Afrikaans, because I would really like to hear the contribution in Afrikaans.

Mr P J MARAIS: There is no answer for stupidity, Mr Speaker. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker, that is unparliamentary ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon members.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... and I have a right to listen to the contribution in the language of my choice, and I want to hear it in Afrikaans. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Afrikaans is Channel number 2. [Interjections.] Channel number 2, and English is Channel number 6 and isiXhosa is Channel number 4.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Are you picking it up, hon member? Unless they changed it last night.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, I am now picking it up.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Sir, I think we also need to make sure of the calibre of the MP's, not only Local Government, to prepare them for the elections next year. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, can I continue ...

The SPEAKER: I recognise you, hon member Peter Marais to continue.

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes. I just want to know what is the Minister doing – and I know you are very energetic in completing your tasks – and what can we do to empower police forums; that they can play a more substantial role in assisting the communities?

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Minister; thank you, hon member Marais.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and I think thank you to the hon member Marais for that question, because I think it's a very-very good question in my opinion, and I think one of the issues is exactly that, that we are busy empowering. I just want to make this comment that 98% of CPF's at police station level get that kind of support; get all sorts of funding for that. I think it is the higher levels, Board level, where there is a bit of a breakdown in the kind of cooperation, but I want to say remember it is very clear in terms of the law, clear functions for CPF's.

They are the link between communities and the police, and I think we really need to make that channel of communication far more open, work through training – I think it is an excellent idea. Remember we have our civil servants doing affidavits at police stations on a voluntary basis. They can really empower some of the Community Police Forum people to start training them so the police can go do policing outside; boots on the ground type of thing, and I really would like to take that up and see how we can implement that in a very practical way to what you suggested. Thank you, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Minister.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Is there a point of order, Chief Whip?

An HON MEMBER: A question.

The SPEAKER: Alright, I have got a number of follow-ups. Initially there was none. [Laughs.] Maybe the Minister said something that made members want to follow up – and obviously hon member Peter Marais. I have got hon member Kama, hon member Christians and then the Chief Whip. I am sure the Chief Whip can negotiate with hon member Allen; but let me recognise now the hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker, and thank you MEC for the reply. What I want to understand, Mr Speaker, is, are there any measures, for the lack of a better word, to ensure that there is an election when the term lapses, so that there is not a period like now of three months where we are told that CPF's cannot participate in there? Because I think the idea of having this, and us agreeing that the component of community participating in safety, in fighting crime is very important.

So are there measures in place to ensure that continuously, when the term is about to end, an election is held? Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kama. I recognise ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: [Inaudible.] must answer.

The SPEAKER: Ja, my apologies. [Laughter.] Remember, hon Minister, there was none earlier. [Laughter.] I recognise the Minister, thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and you hon member Kama, for that. The whole issue around elections – remember it expires now September. But the period September, October, November, because of the many kind of station level Community Police Forums, therefore it is spread, we are trying to finish it, we will try hard to finish it by end of September and October, end of October, and if needs be, we will go into November, but I think that is a very good point. They are still functioning, but their term will end and by law, not by my design, by law; I just carry out the law as it is, you know, Mr Kama, hon member Kama. Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Just a question. We heard over a period of time that there is a lot of fights within Police Community Forums.

Now their job is to ensure the effectiveness of the police, the accountability, but also to look at safety problems. What is the Minister ensuring, his Department ensuring, that we have people there that will serve in the interests of the community to solve crime? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Again a very-very constructive question. I think one of the issues that we've built in now is also the issue of vetting and therefore people must get onto the voters roll so that – because we have found, hon member Christians, that there were a number of people with criminal records, serious criminal records in many of the CPF's - that will now help to get people really vetted; also people instead of working with the police they work with the gangs; so just to get that out.

So I must say we have a unit that is really working very-very hard and making sure of that, and making sure that the stuff is accredited, and I am talking about even the processes, through the IEC, with SAPS, that everyone is on board, so thank you very much for the question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you. Hon Minister, the CPF's have been operating under interim regulations for the last approximately 15 years. Has the Minister, the National Minister made any formal regulations regarding the functioning of CPF's?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. We are still constantly talking around it and I must say there is a whole lot of progress. I think in 2010, remember we did not have one committee that the DoCS chaired in this province on the priority, and remember CPF's and all of that forms part of that, the priority committees. We now chair three of those committees.

So I think that is part of that, all the time good cooperation, and getting cooperation, working cooperation with the police, with the provincial police services, but also the national police services. So thank you for that question again.

Netball World Cup: 2023

3. Mr R I Allen asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

Whether her Department will play a key role in the Netball World Cup in 2023; if not, why not; if so, what is currently being done in preparation for this role?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie agb lid Allen vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

3. Die Netbalwêreldbeker in 2023 gaan die grootste vrouesportbyeenkoms ter wêreld wees wat op Afrika-bodem aangebied word, en is ook die eerste vir Afrika.

Kaapstad gaan as die gasheerstad optree vir die geleentheid. Die poging om die Netbalwêreldbeker aan te bied was 'n samewerkingspoging van die Stad Kaapstad, Netbal Suid-Afrika, die Nasionale- en Provinsiale Regering en in hierdie geval die Wes-Kaap Regering.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Allen for the question. The reply is as follows:

3. The Netball World Cup in 2023 will be the largest womens sports event to be hosted in Africa, and is also a first for Africa.

Cape Town will be the host city for the event. The effort to host the Netball World Cup was a joint effort of the City of Cape Town, Netball South Africa, the National and Provincial Governments and in this case the Western Cape Government.]

†n AGB LID: Mooi ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Good, yes!]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Die Departement van Kultuursake en Sport het 'n instrumentele rol gespeel in die voorbereiding van die bod wat ingedien is vir die aanbidding van die netbalskouspel in Singapoer in November 2018. Die bod het baie toewyding van al die regeringsdepartemente behels om dit wat Kaapstad aan die wêreld kan lewer aan te bied.

Die bod het ons wêreldklasfasiliteite, infrastruktuur en kundigheid in die aanbied van groot internasionale byeenkomste op dieselfde manier ten toon gestel as wat ons die Sokker Wêreldbeker in 2010 suksesvol aangebied het.

Die Departement van Kultuursake en Sport gaan 'n sleutelrol speel in die aanbidding van die Netbalwêreldbeker. Die Departement gaan die geleentheid gebruik om onder meer vrouesport te bevorder en om die profiel van netbal te verhoog. Sy gaan ook help met die operasionele en logistieke vereistes van die Wêreldbeker. Die finale verduideliking van die spesifieke rol wat die Departement moet vervul gaan in die volgende periode voor die Netbalwêreldbeker in 2023 uitgespel en bepaal word. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport has played an instrumental role in the preparation of the bid that was submitted for the hosting of the netball spectacle in Singapore in November 2018. The bid required a lot of commitment of all the Government departments to host that which Cape Town can offer to the world.

The bid showcased our world class facilities, infrastructure and expertise in hosting large international events in the same manner as we successfully hosted the Soccer World Cup in 2010.

The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport will be playing a key role in the hosting of the Netball World Cup. The Department is going to use the opportunity to promote womens sports amongst other things and to increase the profile of netball. It is also going to assist in the operational and logistical requirements of the World Cup. The final explanation of the specific role that the Department has to fulfil will be spelt out and determined in the next period before the Netball World Cup in 2023. Thank you.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you. Thank you to the hon Minister. If you can briefly give your view with regard to the three spheres of government working together in order to secure this, and how you see that, the benefit of Government working together across all three spheres of government?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie. In hierdie geval het die Stad Kaapstad, nasionaal en provinsiale regerings baie goed saamgewerk om die Wêreldbeker vir ons te verseker; soos ons nou gesê het in 2023, en ek dink die voordeel daarvan is dat ons, as ons op verskillende vlakke van regering of sfere van regering kan saamwerk, kan ons nasiebou verseker; ons kan definitief alle diverse kulture byeenbring en dan ook wys dat ons, al verskil ons in politiek en kultuur, kan saamwerk om iets groots vir Suid-Afrika en spesifiek vir die Stad Kaapstad teweeg te bring.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. In this instance the City of Cape Town, national and provincial governments have cooperated very well to secure the World Cup for us; as we have said just now in 2023, and I think the benefit of that is that we, if we can cooperate at different levels of government or spheres of government, that we can ensure nation

building; we can surely bring together all people even if we differ in politics and culture, can work together to create something magnificent for South Africa and specifically for the City of Cape Town.]

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. What will the Department do to ensure that the legacy of this World Cup will not only be seen through business people who will make profits, but actually through the eyes of the netball players themselves? Even in different communities, because we have heard I think even the Netball Federation in the Western Cape complaining about facilities and that there already is a proposal that they are going to have temporary courts for the World Cup.

So it means that that is not a permanent thing, but we would love to see where there are new courts that are built so that we see young people in Mitchells Plain playing netball, having facilities to play after the World Cup. Thank you.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie. Ons het reeds van die wêreldklasfasiliteite in die Stad Kaapstad gevestig, en ons brei dit uit en ons het ook reeds netbalbane – en dit is nie tydelike netbalbane nie - in Bredasdorp, Mosselbaai, Hartenbos en Malmesbury gebou en gevestig, en ons beplan om dit verder uit te rol sodat ons vrouesport, veral ons netbalsport, uitgebrei word tot in die verste uithoeke van die Wes-Kaap.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. We have already established some of the world class facilities in Cape Town and we are expanding it and we have already built and established netball courts – and these are not temporary netball courts - in Bredasdorp, Mossel Bay, Hartenbos and Malmesbury, and we are planning to roll it out further so that our womens sports, especially our netball sport, can be expanded to the furthest corners of the Western Cape.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians and then hon member Marais; hon member Peter Marais. He will be the last one.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Speaker, I am next. You said I am next, so Kama ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No, you are on the platform now.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No problem. Mr Speaker, it is a major event. Did the Minister and the Department draw up a projected budget and also are they speaking to the safety issues? Because we want an influx of people, but people want to come if they know there are safety plans.

So, did the Department communicate about the projected budget and also the safety of the tourists that will come to the country?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie. In ons aanbod het ons spesifiek die begroting aangespreek, sowel as die veiligheidskwessies, en toe ons nou onlangs in Liverpool was vir die Wêreldbeker-toernooi daar, was daar spesifiek gevra oor die veiligheidsaspekte.

Ons het dit aangespreek en het ons ook 'n plan uitgelê vir hoe ons dit gaan benader na 2023 toe, en ook tydens die Wêreldbeker.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. In our bid we have specifically addressed the budget, as well as the safety issues, and when recently we were in Liverpool for the World Cup tournament, they were specifically asked about the safety aspects. We have addressed it and we have also laid out a plan on how we are going to approach it up to 2023, and also during the World Cup.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I want to just plant an idea with you on the netball issue. We have very changing weather patterns and I have had requests. Our municipal halls stand there as white elephants; people do not use it anymore because we watch television.

Can you assist in helping, through the municipalities, to create indoor netball facilities? The halls are big enough and the girls want to play inside under cover, so even if it rains they can practice inside these halls. You do not need a big court. I want you to consider it. I have told them I will bring it to Parliament. Indoor netball, indoor 5's a-side soccer, for the municipal halls in Black and Coloured areas that stand there as white elephants, nobody uses them anymore.

Sorry for the term "white" sir, but I have heard of black-listed so I do not think it is a problem. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: [Laughs.] Thank you, hon member. [Interjections.] I recognise the hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, agb lid Marais. Dit is in ons gesprek met die Stad Kaapstad en met die verskillende munisipaliteite, maar soos u weet fasiliteite is 'n primêre munisipale verantwoordelikheid, maar ons is in gesprek om dit aan te spreek. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Marais. We are in discussion with the City of Cape Town and with the various municipalities, but as you know facilities are a primary municipal responsibility, but we are in discussion to address that. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes this question. We will now go to Question number 5. Hon member Mvimbi is aware of number 4; we dealt with this. The Chief Whip dealt with that earlier. The Chief Whip of the Opposition. I recognise you, madam.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I am rising, Maybe I want to put it as a point of privilege. During the members' induction in 2014 we were told that in the House we may not wear party political regalia. I am bringing this to your attention because hon member Maseko is wearing either a dress or a skirt, but she has got a party political regalia. Can you rule on it, Mr Speaker? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon the Chief Whip of the Opposition. I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker, you will be well aware that hon member Maseko was representing the DA at the NCOP, in which members were asked to wear party regalia as part of the event, and she has come directly from there, and as you can see she has made an attempt by wearing her WCPP jacket to rectify the situation, but given that that event from the other side was delayed, I think that we should be understanding in this regard. [Interjections.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: She cannot take it off!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip for that explanation. What I want to state here for the hon members for the record, in response to the point of order raised by ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon members, order.

I will make this exception given this explanation, but I would like to ask the hon members to help the Presiding Officers to preside in an environment where we do not make it difficult to have a smooth operation of the House. It is correct that hon members should not wear party regalia in here, and because of the sitting which I agreed to the NCOP because they said to us it is the same day today as we sit here. The other members have submitted apologies, because they could not be here on time, and therefore they are not present here today. If another member were to arrive here in the same environment, I would give the same ruling.

So I would like the House to accept my plea and my humble request that it is an exception to the rule, given the circumstances that have been raised by the Chief Whip. Am I getting the House approval in that regard? Hon Chief Whip of the Opposition?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. May I address you precisely on this point? I am worried that your request will lead us into unprecedented behaviour by members of this House.

If I go to any event, party-political or Parliament, I must have a spare set of clothing, because when I come here I know what is expected of me as a member.

Now I really want to accept your ruling, but I find it difficult because we all know that when we come here we just cannot wear party-political outfits. There is the EFF, they wear red. Some of the members of the DA were blue, I wear green sometimes, but it just cannot be acceptable, Mr Speaker. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Chief Whip of the Opposition. I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker, is it even visible?

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is the lower part of her outfit that is behind the bench that is not visible.

So I do not really understand what the issue is, and then is the Chief Whip of the Opposition asking that our member be removed from the Chamber ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... as a result? Is that the request? [Interjections.] Just to get clarity, because, if that is so then that is your decision to make then. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: May I request – remember [Interjections.] I am really at pains to say this: when rules are made they are made to be adhered to, and if there is something that we all agree upon and there is something that makes us believe that there is – by any means, wilfully or otherwise, one of the rules is being infringed upon.

So I am going to request that determination be done by the Chief Whip of the Official Opposition and the Chief Whip, and if you want to discuss this further, because it is a dicey one for the Presiding Officer here. Please, Chief Whip, allow me to conclude this.

The situation now is as is and you have asked the question to the Chief Whip of the Opposition; whether she would like the member to leave, whether the Speaker must make that ruling. Hon the Chief Whip, what is your expression?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, I would have a different proposal and that is for hon member Maseko to cover or get a ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Or take it off.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... or to get a *lappie* or something to cover the skirt. I cannot really say she must leave the House, but she must find something to cover everything that is partly political. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Chief Whip of the Opposition. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): If I may? Exactly which Rule says that this is not permissible? [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is it not about Rules, we were told here during the induction.

The SPEAKER: Now you are making it difficult.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): What we are debating now.

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, there is a convention. Can I please be allowed to preside? There is a convention and I am now not allowing any further debate on this matter. There is a convention and the convention is that we must come here in a way that respects the decorum of the House, and that our dress code must be consistent with that understanding, that there is a particular decorum. I cannot point to a particular Rule and say this Rule says you must dress in white, this Rule you must dress in red – but I think in this case your question is clear, hon Chief Whip. The request is not for hon member to leave. It is just for the hon member to cover what she can. Are we happy that the hon member has covered?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: It seems the hon member she is now fine. May we now proceed? Hon Minister Fernandez?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker. In terms of reflection, the hon member Lekker is indeed correct about the convention because there was a day when she came in with an ANC logo and she covered it up very quickly and we continued and proceeded.

So I think you are being fair with the cover up [Inaudible.] then. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Fernandez. [Interjections.] Hon members, thank you. Order! [Interjections.] We now move on to Question 5 asked by hon P Marran to the Minister of Transport and Public Works. Am I correct?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes

The SPEAKER: Yes, and I recognise the Minister.

[Question 4 stands over.]

Rural safety plan

5. Mr P Marran asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether there is a Rural Safety Plan for the province; if not, when will it be developed; if so, why was R5 million disbursed to district municipalities to develop such a plan?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. In the absence of the hon member Marran, the reply is as follows:

5. Yes, there is a national rural safety plan which was drafted by the South African Police Services, as well as a provincial response to the national rural safety plan.

The provincial response plan is being updated due to the nature and escalation of the frequency of attacks on rural communities. I want to emphasise it is attacks on everyone. No, this is not just a response to farmers being attacked; everyone. Ordinary workers on farms and in rural communities also. And it is also mindful of the devastating effect that such attacks have on food security and the Western Cape economy.

Under the leadership of Mr Ivan Meyer we have agreed with the key role-players on the establishment of an Inter-Ministerial Committee on Rural Safety as well as a Technical Committee on Rural Safety, which will be linked to the existing structures of the joint operations and intelligence forums within the criminal justice cluster departments; most noticeably SAPS, the NPA, Correctional Services and the State Security Agency.

R5 million was transferred to the district municipalities as part of an envisaged safety improvement plan, including but not exclusively rural safety, because it also deals with those towns as rural towns. The money is transferred in support of specific deliverables and are aligned to the safety strategy of the Province, and in particular for each district municipality to develop, through a prescribed process of broad consultations on policing needs and priorities, a safety plan at municipal level to establish a district safety forum inclusive of the criminal justice cluster departments, and that includes the NPA, Correctional Services, Home Affairs, Justice and SAPS; and lastly to create capacity at district level to deal with the evolving crime patterns and risk.

Rural safety is an integral part of safety within all our districts, with specific focus on those most vulnerable, such as unemployed youth, farmworkers, people living in areas which are far remote for emergency services, often with little or no reliable channels of communication.

The funds which were transferred to the district municipalities last year are going forward and are guided by specific conditions and requirements.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Hon Minister, in the light of the fact that we have not yet appointed a Provincial Police Commissioner, how effective is your plan? Because your plan must go via the Provincial Commissioner to the National Commissioner, to the National Police Minister, and you have not, you broke the chain of command by not appointing a Provincial Police Commissioner. How is this affecting the finalisation of your strategy?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am so happy to announce and to inform the hon member, Mr P Marais, that we have systems in place. So systems do not evolve around individuals, and what is very good, I must say, hon member P Marais, the acting General Mfazi is really ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please talk to the Speaker?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Excuse me, Mr Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Will you please talk through the Speaker.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Oh.

An HON MEMBER: Address the Speaker.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But ja, but I am just looking at him, I am speaking to you ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Do not do that. [Laughter.] I do not want a fist fight here. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Okay, no, thanks, Mr Speaker.

Ja, let me look at the Speaker, but, hon member Marais, I am speaking to you. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Provincial Commissioner, General Mfazi, is really a person with a lot of energy and wanting to get things done, and he is working very well with us, so we are very happy that that chain, the chain of command has not broken, it is there, and we hope to appoint the Provincial Commissioner for the Province very soon.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): You? We?

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja, "we", hon member, you heard right, "we".

An HON MEMBER: In concurrence.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, thank you for doing that. I recognise hon member Kama, followed by hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. In the Committee last week we got a briefing from the Department on its programme on PMP's. One of the challenges that the Department listed was that in developing the safety plans, the lack of mechanisms to ensure that the PMP's find expression in those safety plans that are created in the municipalities.

Now the question would be what is the Department or the Minister doing to ensure that we develop these mechanisms? Because I fear a situation where we put in money and we realise that in turn it does not address what we have identified in our PMP's. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I want to give the hon member the assurance that in fact we are, from where we stand the PMP's are the most important kind of consultative programme with people on the ground, to inform our safety plans.

So I want to give you that assurance that we will get those mechanisms right. Unfortunately, as you know, sometimes in departments people work for 100 years in a department; they sometimes cannot think beyond some certain level. So we will get it right. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Speaker, deur u aan die Minister. Minister, die Staande Komitee op Landbou, Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning het twee weke gelede verneem dat daar 'n konsep landelike veiligheidsplan is wat opgestel is deur die Suid-Afrikaanse Polisiediens, maar dat hierdie plan so gebrekkig is, so swak is dat dit eintlik 'n genade is dat dit nog nie op nasionale vlak deur die polisiebestuur goedgekeur is nie.

Het u al insae in hierdie plan kon kry? En deel u daardie sentiment dat daardie plan aansienlike hersiening nodig het voordat dit hopelik later deur die polisiebestuur aanvaar sal word?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, through you to the Minister. Minister, the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning heard two weeks ago that there is a draft rural safety plan that was drawn up by the South African Police Services, but that this plan is so deficient, so poor that it is only a blessing that it has not yet been approved at national level by the police management.

Have you managed to get insight into this plan? And do you share that sentiment that that plan requires considerable revision before it is hopefully approved by the police management later?]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see you, hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ja, ek wil net vir die agb lid Andricus sê dat dit is presies die doel van die Tegniese Komitee wat gedryf word deur die Landboudepartement, en ook met die Veiligheidsdepartement, die Departement van Gemeenskapsveiligheid, om juis te kyk na daardie tekortkominge in daardie nasionale plan, maar ook om iets te ontwikkel wat uniek is in hierdie provinsie, en ek dink dit is inderdaad een van die hoofdoele van hulle punt van die program.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, yes, I just want to say to the hon member Andricus that that is precisely the goal of the Technical Committee that is driven by the Department of Agriculture, and also with the Safety Department, the Department of Community Safety, to look at specifically those shortcomings in the national plan, but also to develop something that is unique in this province, and I think it is indeed one of the main goals of their point of the programme.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I think we have one more question relating to the Minister? No? Okay, thank you. Then – sorry, hon member?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I would just like to ask the MEC: in regard to the recent tragic murder that happened in Stellenbosch, which has to do with the issue of rural safety, is he aware of correspondence sent by the deceased to both Premier Zille as well as MEC Bredell, requesting that fencing be provided at that particular property?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No, I am not aware.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we are moving on to the next question. I think we are moving on to Question 7. Question? Sorry, I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I neglected to inform the House that the question to Minister Meyer will stand over with the concurrence of hon member Marran.

[Question 6 stands over.]

Marikana informal settlement: service delivery

7. Mr A Lili asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether any progress has been made in improving service delivery in the Marikana informal settlement by installing high-mast lights, by providing water and sanitation and by opening up roads; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and Mr Lili. The reply is as follows:

7. The landowner has instituted legal proceedings for the eviction of the illegal occupants.

In terms of the Court's ruling the City of Cape Town was required to provide basic services. The City is appealing the Court's decision and the matter is currently with the Supreme Court under litigation, but meanwhile the City has provided the settlement with the following services:

- 376 container toilets;
- 840 portable flush toilets; and
- 146 taps.
- The City has also installed one mast light.

Delays in the installation of the remaining four lights has occurred due to the willingness of the occupants to relocate from the road reserve to elsewhere within the settlement in order for the lighting to be installed.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I want to ask the Minister if this is now going to be the standard for all informal settlements, or whether every week we will have to bring a different informal settlement that needs lights? Is this going to be a general policy, or is he just putting ointment on one sore and not on the rash? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, hon member Marais. Although the question was actually supposed to be answered by the City of Cape Town, I saw it fit to actually answer the hon member and give him the proper details, so I do not believe this will be a norm. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any follow-ups? No? Hon member Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, we expect to have a Cabinet, and a Cabinet takes decisions as a Cabinet, and they come here fully prepared because they get direction from the Leader of the Cabinet. I do not know why he cannot answer the question.

An HON MEMBER: Is that a point of order or ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: What is the policy? Are you going to put these high masts at all informal settlements to protect people? Or is it only this one that you would consider? That is the question.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Agb lid Marais, ek gaan maar in Afrikaans verduidelik en antwoord, dan verstaan jy my dalk 'n bietjie beter.

Eerstens die konteks van hierdie vraag is vir die Stad Kaapstad. Ek het hierdie informasie by die Stad Kaapstad verkry, so ek beantwoord die vraag eintlik, want hierdie is 'n plaaslike regeringsfeer saak, want die area waarna die lid verwys, Marikana, val onder die Stad Kaapstad.

Wat die tendens is in die Stad Kaapstad is waar hulle kan, doen hulle dit; so ek gee vir u 'n antwoord gebaseer op wat die Stad Kaapstad doen. Ek dink dit is meer opsigtelik wat ek nou tans gedoen het. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon member Marais, I think I am going to explain and reply in Afrikaans, then perhaps you will understand me better.

Firstly, the context for this question is for the City of Cape Town. I received this information from the City of Cape Town, so I am actually answering the question, because this a local government sphere matter, because the area to which the member refers to, Marikana, falls under the City of Cape Town.

What the trend is in the City of Cape Town is that where they can, they do it; so I am giving you an answer based on what the City of Cape Town is doing. I think it is more obvious what I have just done. Thank you.]

Mr M XEGO: Thank you. hon Deputy Speaker. I do not think the question of hon member Marais has been answered. It is very simple. [Interjection.] The Minister was asked if it is going to be done in all the municipalities in the province, and he is side-stepping it and telling us about the City of Cape Town. Is the plan going to be done in the whole province? The province is not the City of Cape Town.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. It is not for me to make sure that Ministers answer questions to the degree you think you want to hear, but I am going to give an opportunity again for the Minister to respond to the question asked again.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I cannot tell Local Government spheres how to handle the informal settlements. There are informal settlements across the province which deal with their informal settlements differently. It depends on the policy that they have in place. I will encourage the hon member to actually empower himself and get a copy of all 30 bylaws and policies of councils. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is another opportunity. I see you, hon member Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you. Can the Provincial Minister then please tell us what is his role in terms of oversight ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mmm.

Mr M K SAYED: ... because it seems as if the manner in which he is answering that particular question, he is saying municipalities must do as they please, and he is not going to have anything to say about that. Surely Human Settlements informs and gives guidance to municipalities in terms of how to handle housing issues?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I will advise the hon member to familiarise himself with the norms and standards, and then he can ask that question again, because I believe he needs to equip himself with how Local Government works. Thank you.

*Safety Partnerships, Court Watching Briefs
and Safety Promotion programmes*

8. Mr M Kama asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether the following subprogrammes: Safety Partnerships, Court Watching Briefs and Safety Promotion have had any impact on the prevention of crime and the improvement of the safety of the residents in communities where gangs are active; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and ... [Interjections.] If we can get some attention in the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: May I continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you to the hon Kama for the question, and I think it is one of those very interesting questions, because I think Watching Briefs must be used far more and can really be effective. The reply is as follows:

8. The sub-programme, Safety Partnership, contributed significantly to the prevention of crime and the improvement of safety in communities through the creation of more than 1,000 temporary work opportunities to youth in communities through the Extended Public Works Programme.

In addition, a total of 581 youth from vulnerable communities graduated from the Chrysalis Academy last year alone. All these graduates were placed in a work opportunity for 12 months.

The Department partnered with 225 religious organisations to keep young children off the streets during the June and December school holidays. A total of 25 526 youth and young children were reached in 41 areas in the province. The sub-programme also manages the agreement with the City of Cape Town to improve safety at 52 priority schools.

So you will see a question to the Minister of Education later where we will see those totals, the total number of School Resource Officers. We give 52 of those to the Department.

The Department funds 16 priority schools, and through this agreement, two School Resource Officers are placed at schools to improve safety for learners. I can also say right now we have in a number of schools about 150 young unemployed youth that were just hanging around at home. They are now safety ambassadors to augment and to support teachers in overcrowded classes in schools in Manenberg, in Mitchells Plain, in Nyanga and in Khayelitsha.

The sub-programme is responsible for community engagements through which the Department engages and partners with communities on issues of safety. Some of the recent events held were, amongst others, a workshop in Athlone for the Extended Public Youth workers; meeting with Neighbourhood Watch structures and religious organisations, and Women's Month events we had in Tulbagh and in Mitchells Plain, where hon member Allen really entertained the women in a very-very proactive way. [Laughter.]

The Court Watching Briefs aim to contribute to the monitoring of police conduct as well as overseeing the effectiveness and efficiency of police services as per Section 206(3)(a) and (b) of the Constitution. The outcome is to contribute to a more professional police service. The methodology is to report on serious criminal cases that have been scrapped from the court roll as a result of SAPS inefficiencies. The courts observed include areas where gangs are active. Having a more professional police will lead to more effective and efficient investigations in gang areas which will result in more gang members and criminals being removed from streets and thereby creating safer communities.

I just want to say there is a case this morning, we read all in the papers, of the 57-year old man who allegedly raped a baby of, I think, 14 months. Now on that case we are going to take out a Watching Brief, because that man was released on – sorry, the case was withdrawn owing to a lack of evidence. Now that is one of those typical cases that we need to take out a Watching Brief, to make sure that there are no other issues around in that case.

In the previous financial year the Court Watching Brief Programme dealt with 3,269 matters in 37 courts across the province. The reports are submitted to SAPS on a quarterly basis and corrective action is taken by SAPS management and I must say to you the NPA really works very-very well with us, because they can see the problems around investigations and the quality of the information in the docket. So it is a very-very good programme. Thank you, hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the MEC for the answer. From the onset, hon Deputy Speaker, I want to also agree in terms of the Court Watching Briefs. What I want to understand then, hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of the other safety partnerships that we have, what mechanisms are in place – because I do not want the Department to be viewed now as an employment agency. We cannot claim that we have recruited so many people and therefore we are making an impact on crime.

want to check what mechanisms are there, because our impact should be measured on the change in the crime scene. Now what impacts are there to ensure, to measure the partnerships and the impact they have on the crime scene? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I hate to always give this hon member a compliment, but that is an excellent question. I think when we talk about the type of the questions, we also want to see how does what the hon member is asking feed into the broader issue around the crime and the safety narrative. I want to say, hon member Kama, remember our point of departure is the Provincial Safety Plan; then we break into regions, into districts, and then from district even right down to the ward.

So when a councillor phones me to say something happened, what is your safety plan, now in that ward and in the region we have all these different mechanisms feeding into making it a safe environment, and now let me give you a practical example.

I am going to give two practical examples. The one was – remember the long weekend of the 9th when all these middle-class people came back from their holiday homes and they drove over Sir Lowry's Pass and as they came down there was huge congestion of the traffic and cars were stoned. There was a dispute over a piece of land. We then had a meeting and we tried to find out why were people's cars stoned? We were assisted by a group of ordinary mediators, ordinary men and women on that day, like the CPF Chairperson on the other side, in Grabouw. They came over the mountain to assist and we set up a mediation group.

We also looked at the policing part of that and I think that is the question the hon member is asking, and I can tell you since those interventions – but I want to emphasise we had to go to the community that was throwing the stones, we came, spoke to them - it stopped right up to today, since the weekend of the 9th.

So that is one, it is called the N2. We are now going to try and extend that right to the airport; working with those communities along the N2. At the moment it is right up to Macassar; we want to take it right down to Borchers Quarry. I think someone asked something about Borchers Quarry last week – right to the bottom.

The second example I just want to use, about four weeks ago we had very-very big issues at Malibu High. Now I just want to show the way we work in a collaborative way with our partners, the hon member Debbie Schäfer next to me. When we went in with the SGB, with the surrounding community's Neighbourhood Watches; with the CPF, all of them, going into the school, because there were people running around with knives and we discovered that the systems were not in; the Department got it, but it was not implemented.

There is also a safety officer appointed at that school. I can tell you my colleague, Wade Seal, went in, did a whole lot of the mediation and the way that whole programme was turned around, it is just very-very interesting.

So I want to, hon member Kama, just say, hon Deputy Speaker, it is all those pockets of interventions that I cannot mention here, that we are not even aware of; where communities really become part of the solution. It is not us doing anything for the community but us, with the community, trying to get to solutions. I just want to make that point, thank you very much.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Minister mentioned there are 37 Court Watching Briefs. I want to know is there going to be extension rollout to other communities where it is needed, and when do the Court Watching Briefs leave the case? Do they follow it to conviction? Do they get conviction rates? How does that work? Because you put in resources, you want some results. How do they work when it comes to convictions and those type of things? Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you. I think again a very good question, and I hate to say to the Opposition these are good questions [Laughter.], but I think that is your point.

Mr P J MARAIS: The [Inaudible.] guys are on this side.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon member Marais. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So I just want to say that is almost the purpose of the briefs – where you are not capable of getting a conviction, but the success rate of the Watching Briefs is something like 85%. It is a very high success rate, and if I say “success rate”, I do not think one wants to crucify and convict people who are not guilty.

It is already throughout. Some of those advocates drive right down to Beaufort West – hon member Mitchell would really appreciate that – to deal with that case of that rape and murder of that young woman in Beaufort West, so that will happen.

We must extend and expand but we do not want to create a parallel justice system, but I want to say at this point we are working well with the NPA. Thank you, hon member Christians.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Nkondlo, and then I see the DA after that.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The Minister must first answer my question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Just first – because the Minister did not get the first part of the question. 37 Watching Briefs, the extension, where is it going to extend to needy communities where it is needed?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes. I want to say we really want to make sure that every community gets that assistance. It is not certain communities. Let me give you a practical example. There was a murder in Kensington, in Factreton, about three, four years ago. The mother is really still very-very traumatised about it, and these are working class people who cannot afford lawyers. They have gone to the police station and they did not get the kind of support that they are supposed to get. Yesterday we took out a Watching Brief on that case.

We want to extend to all our communities, and specifically where people cannot afford legal representation, to see that justice is served, and that parents can get closure for children who are killed in crime. So thank you very much for the question.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. MEC, you are on fire today, I can see. [Interjections.]

With regard to the three programmes that the MEC is referring to and the positive success rate, how do communities get into the programmes, because I see you are saying here the programme is in communities where gangs are active? How do you identify those communities and how do they get into the programme?

I am specifically asking this, hon Deputy Speaker, because this morning I saw on e.tv, two women from Bonteheuwel speaking on the effects, whether the impact of the army has worked in that community. One of the things they were raising was the fact that they are running programmes on their own which Government does not support. Secondly, politicians are not even there, in the programme. Part of what is realising change in those communities are activities that are done by communities themselves.

So if you talk about safety partnerships, I am not sure this is happening in Bonteheuwel and if so why are such communities not feeling it? Lastly, MEC, in Gugulethu, for example, there is a serious problem of school kids between the ages of 8 till 15 that are smoking dagga and fighting amongst themselves.

So I am trying to understand where is this programme or how do people access the programme? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you, hon member Nkondlo, for the question. Bonteheuwel is a very contested area. But I will just give you some stats. Remember since the deployment of those unemployed young men and women who were trained into law enforcement, since that deployment into the area and I think it is about – it is now about almost two months – there was only one death. Now to say only one death sounds so horrible but genuinely it used to be 46 for the preceding months, one death. Now we must also, as the Department of Community Safety, start with ourselves, our own structures and have faith, as the hon Kama will inform you that the Neighbourhood Watches are our first priority to work with in those programmes.

And I have recently launched a uniform kind of approach of Neighbourhood Watch where they all wear the same kind of uniform – so when you are in Beaufort West and you see a guy walk down the road with that type of regalia, you know it is a Neighbourhood Watch guy. When you go into Worcester, you will see three people walking with those regalia – they are Neighbourhood Watch guys. It was successfully launched.

That is our first group of own people that we need to work with and we urge other people who work in the safety space to join up. I know the two ladies very well, as Cameron Dugmore will tell you, they are former comrades of mine ... [Interjections.] but now they have their own contestation, they have their own contestation around the space in Bonteheuwel. But we would still urge to work with everyone who is working in that space.

The second one is now CPFs, to work with our CPFs and again, that is our problem, it is our own – and I am saying to extend that even to work with some of our ratepayers and civic associations.

Remember in the 80's in the height of times when we were resisting the apartheid government, that you had strong civic organisations and gangsters were gone because they are cowards. When we are organised and strongly organised in civic formations, gangsters are cowards, they disappear. And I think what we are trying to do here, again is to use the kind of statutory legitimate structures to work through. Unfortunately we cannot fund, we are not other departments like the Social Development who fund NPOs. We can only fund those organisations that are in terms of the law that we have to work with. But we will, all the time, work with everyone as long as we have a safety kind of objective, a safety point of departure to make sure every single person safe, from the old lady in the home who is 82 years old to the young child of 6 years old, to the youth who have unfortunately been becoming a gangster, and we must save him from becoming a gangster and we must really give him an opportunity so that he can become just an amazing young person with his APP and developing a new APP in Bonteheuwel or in Hanover Park. Because it is not just in Constantia where people have brains, everywhere people have brains. So I think that is the point I want to make, but thanks for that question.

Just to clarify, statutory organisations are our first priority and unfortunately we have a very small budget. I have come to ask for some, what they call in Afrikaans “kanala” money’, you know *kanala* money, a little bit extra. The hon member at the back will tell you, but we have not received anything from the hon member there at the back. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks hon Minister. Hon member Mackenzie, final question.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you, hon Minister for the feedback on the Watching Briefs Programme. Hon Minister, if you can just share with us the process, and I know that member Christians talked about the expansion of the programme. For example, we were in Laingsburg the last two days and there was a very heart-breaking case of a member of the public that raised the matter on a case that just seemed to be

going nowhere and I think the members of the committee and the members in that cluster have raised that this matter should have been part of the Watching Briefs.

What is the process and how do we inform communities, particularly in the outlying areas like Laingsburg, and I am sure if we go further there are many more of these cases that are going to come up, on the Watching Briefs so that they can get closure and feedback with what is happening with their cases? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Mackenzie. I am also heartened to say we have very young dynamic constituency heads on all sides of the House and I really want to urge constitutional heads in small places like Beaufort West, like Laingsburg, like Kannaland, †God-verlate plek, [God-forsaken place,] Kannaland, to ask them, when they pick up these cases, hon Deputy Speaker, that they really become the channel and a voice in a way, not from a soup kitchen type of mentality, but from an empowering mentality to us, so that we can act on it. I have had a case already from – and we did not take out a Watching Brief on it but it was another type of case - the hon Deidre Baartman in a place called Laingsburg, where we drive when we go to Johannesburg.

So I want to say, I want to urge all members of all sides of the House, where we also find young people who are just about to go off the track, refer them to us. I know Social Development also helps but refer them also to us to see whether one cannot take them and put them into programmes. I want to say Minister Lindiwe Zulu said she could not make it to the Chrysalis graduation, so she sent a very senior DDG, Deputy Director General, and they were so blown away with the Chrysalis Programme that they are now looking at how they can work with us for the end of the year youth camps because normally it is a waste of money but how it can be used to get ALL our children, and I want to emphasise this, ALL our children. Not this side, blue or green or red or I do not know what colour, orange ... [Laughter.] but all our children because Government must work for everyone. And when we work for everyone and respect everyone's dignity, I think we are going to move forward and stop this crime. Thank you.

Peace and law-enforcement officers at schools under threat

9. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:

With regard to the Premier's announcement in the State of the Province Address (SOPA) that the Government has deployed, in collaboration with the City, peace officers and law-enforcement officers at schools in communities under threat:

- (a) How many officers have been deployed and (b) at which affected schools?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you, hon member Sayed for the question. The reply is as follows:

9. The only law enforcement officers at schools that we have permanently stationed are the School Resource Officers which is in conjunction with the Department of Community Safety and the City of Cape Town and we have 108 of these resource officers at 52 schools. Owing to security reasons we do not divulge the names of the schools.

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for the response, hon MEC. Just for clarity, these peace officers which you mentioned now, are these the same peace officers which the Department failed to deploy in the last few years? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I did not say peace officers, I think I said law enforcement officers which are trained by the City of Cape Town, specifically to work in schools. So I am not aware of peace officers that we have not used.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I just want to know these School Resource Officers, basically in the Metro – yesterday or the day before we were in Laingsburg. Laingsburg High School has been broken into on numerous occasions. We went to the police station yesterday, they also have a shortage of police stations. So how can we assist the schools in the rural areas with safety because this is, I think in partnership with the City of Cape Town, but I am talking about municipalities outside where they are struggling and Laingsburg, they are vandalised on a regular basis and you know it is not conducive for our learners to be taught there. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you for that question. Yes, it is one I ask constantly within my Department and within the Department of Community Safety. Unfortunately the DoCS role is only to pay for some of the SROs. But the only way we are able to do this is because of the City of Cape Town's pro-active approach in ensuring that these law enforcement officers are trained specifically to work in our schools. Now obviously because Laingsburg is not a metro, they do not have Metro Police and the same kind of law enforcement capacity as the City of Cape Town has. So the only way we could do it, is if other municipalities did something similar. But my understanding is, after having asked that question many times, is that they are not able to, they do not have that kind of capacity or budget.

So it is a concern for me but because of the Metro Police, the City of Cape Town having that approach and having that really pro-active drive and a pretty big budget, they are able to assist us in that regard. So we have to look for other solutions for the rural communities and any ideas in that regard will be much appreciated because I am kind of running out of them. We are talking about the possibilities of Neighbourhood Watches maybe being involved in that space and I think that is something we can look at. We are going to be piloting in Khayelitsha shortly, a Neighbourhood Watch model that DoCS has developed and if that works, it may well be something we could roll out to rural communities.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I have a problem with the schools which you are closing, hon Minister. They have become headquarters for gangs. They are being occupied by gangsters, they are vandalised, there is no security there. I can take you to Elsie's River and show you some schools. This is a threat to the community also and I think if Mr Mackenzie listens he might one day become a politician ... [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: We are ... [Interjection.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais, if you could just take your seat. I see the Chief Whip.

Mr P J MARAIS: She is always on her feet.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But that is her job. [Interjections.]. It is her job hon Marais.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would just like to ask your guidance, this sounds very much like a new question to me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It certainly does. Hon member Marais, you are not actually asking any follow-ups to the question printed on the Question Paper.

Mr P J MARAIS: I refer you to the question itself. It says 'peace officers and law enforcement officers at schools in communities under threat'. These empty schools are situated amongst communities under threat. [Interjections.]. Right! So it is a valid question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well you know what, hon Marais, thank you very much for the question. I am going to leave it up to the Minister if she chooses to answer that, because it is really cleverly, politically put and I am not going to comment on whether she sees that as a new question or not. Thank you hon Marais, Hon Minister I see you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Can I ask my question then?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you have asked your question. [Interjections.].

Mr P J MARAIS: No, they objected to it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, but I am ... [Interjections.]. – hon Marais I heard your question – I am going to pose it to the Minister. [Interjections.].

Mr P J MARAIS: Okay. Hon Minister, if you cannot answer I am sure the media will tell the people ... [Laughter.] [Interjections.].

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. May I answer?

Whether I should answer or may answer is a different story but I am actually happy to answer because your statement as usual is incorrect. I have only closed one school in the Metro and that is Uitsig which has taken four years in court, which we had to spend a lot of money for and the reason why we closed it had largely to do with the issues of gangsterism in that area in the community who completely and utterly vandalised the school.

So they are not schools under threat and we certainly would not put SROs at empty schools because we are there to try and protect our learners and our teachers. So I am not constantly closing schools. I have closed, as I said one in the Metro in my entire term of office and ... [Interjections.] – well my predecessor is not me so – and those schools are certainly not schools where we would put SROs. Because it is a school property it must be looked after by Public Works but we are not going to put human beings there because they are needed for protecting our teachers and our learners at the schools.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you hon Minister for the responses and thank you to our good friend, the former Premier, for shedding some more light, particularly with regard to the communities that we have been visiting in terms of the schools. What was the criteria for selecting the affected communities and schools, seeing that well after the announcement was made, we still witnessed many learners being attacked and weapons being brought onto the school premises? So what was the criteria for selecting the schools in the particular communities for these safety officers to be deployed? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. They were actually done quite some time ago and it was done in consultation with DoCS taking into account the figures of incidents that had been reported by the different schools. So we look at the statistics from Safe Schools and I think they also worked on the police statistics and as a result of that they determined which were the highest risk schools and at the time, and that is where we deployed them. We would like to deploy more at other places because there are others that need it but we have not been able to with the relevant budget.

[Question time expired.]

[Replies to questions 10 to 14 to be printed in Hansard]

Questions and replies as received from departments

ORAL QUESTIONS

For written reply:

*Swellendam Hospital : Death of patient***10. Ms R Windvogel asked the Minister of Health:**

Whether her Department has conducted an investigation into the incident of a patient who died at the gate of Swellendam Hospital minutes after he was discharged on 19 June 2019; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

10. We know about the incident. An autopsy has been received and the due processes are being followed.

*Khayamandi Clinic: Stellenbosch***11. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:**

With reference to the unannounced visit by the Standing Committee to the Khayamandi Clinic at Stellenbosch:

- (1) Whether there are any plans to expand the Clinic; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) what is the (a) budgeted staff complement and (b) actual staff complement;
- (3) whether or not her Department has received any requests for maintenance according to the Clinic's maintenance list; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

11. (1) Plans to expand the clinic

A new clinic will be built in Kayamnandi. In 2018 land adjacent to the clinic was identified and now we are in the process of acquiring that land from Stellenbosch Municipality.

R25 million has been budgted to the project and once the land is obtained the project will start and it is expected to be complete by 2024.

(2) The budgeted staff complement includes:

- Operational Manager x 1
- Medical Officer x 1
- Clinical Nurse Practitioners x 7
- Professional Nurse x 1

- Post Basic Pharmacy Assistant x 2
- Staff nurse 2 x
- Nursing Assistant x 1
- Admin Clerks x 3
- Cleaners x 3

In addition, outreach and support is provided by:

- Dietician
- Occupational Therapist
- Mental Health Professional Nurse
- Clinic Psychologist
- Pharmacist
- Senior Family Physician

(2) Maintenance

Recent maintenance work carried out in the 2018/19 financial year included the refurbishment of the prefab building and covering for the patio.

Current maintenance work includes the revamping of the sluice room/waste management area and the extension of the Admission/Registry area in order to add additional space for folder management.

Project 1068, Caterville: Drakenstein

12. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether any progress has been made with project 1068 at Caterville in Drakenstein; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details and when will this project be finalised?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:

12. Progress has been made with project 1068 at Carterville in Drakenstein. The municipality has submitted an application for the approval of the rephasing and revised financial details for the construction of the remaining 50 houses as phase 2.

The application is currently being assessed by my department.

The Carteville project was originally initiated by the former Wellington Municipality between 1995 and 1999 for the delivery of 1068 units that was subsequently reduced to 930 units.

The project became blocked due to inability of the beneficiaries to make the full financial contribution of R2479.00 which was the requirement at that time, prior to the commencement of the project. It should be noted that financial contributions by beneficiaries is no longer a requirement.

As part of the unblocking process, my department appointed a Consultant to assist the municipality. They are to ensure that Geotechnical Site Investigation Reports are submitted in order to comply with the National Home Builders Registration Council's (NHBRC) requirements for home enrolment of the 50 houses as well as to produce proof that the properties were transferred to the qualifying beneficiaries.

Geotechnical Site Investigation Reports were not a requirement for projects undertaken prior to the establishment of the NHBRC warranty scheme in 2002.

Approval is therefore subject to the municipality producing the relevant reports and confirming that the properties were transferred to the qualifying beneficiaries.

Classroom-teacher ratio

13. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:

(a) What is the current classroom–teacher ratio in our Western Cape schools and (b) does this ratio affect the quality of the education of our learners?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

13. (a) Assuming the Honourable Christians means the teacher: learner ratio, the average teacher/learner ratio for the Western Cape Province is 1:35.53.

The average teacher/learner ratio for Secondary Schools is 1:33,83
The average teacher /learner ratio for Primary Schools is 1: 36,46.

(b) The Western Cape is seeing year on year growth.

We are seeing mass movement into the Western Cape from other provinces, mainly the Eastern Cape. This movement has placed exponential pressure on schools in the Western Cape and the growth is placing huge demands on all resources, including the provision of teachers.

Last year we saw over 25 000 learners enter the province. This year we have seen over 16 000 learners enter the Province.

To keep up with growth in the province we are building new schools and classrooms. However, every new classroom requires a new teacher.

The funding that we receive for the increase in learners is based on out-dated information. The information used to calculate our equitable share is the previous year's SNAP survey, as well as information from the General Household survey. This benefits provinces with negative population growth rates, but comes at the expense of provinces with immigration. So in the Western Cape our funding continues to play catch-up to the number of learners entering our system.

Bigger class sizes do restrict physical movement in the classroom. In the Foundation Phase, we like to promote "mat time" – which uses the mat to reinforce complex concepts.

Having an overfull class therefore would limit the execution of "mat time", for example, due to lack of space in the classroom.

The bigger the class size, the less individual attention is given to learners. While many educators successfully teach and manage big class sizes, others find that it can be disruptive and harder to manage.

The WCED is, however, exploring alternate means to deal better with larger classes by for example using the e-learning capability to reach more learners. The WCED is working with British Council to develop a support package for all educators to manage large classes. The package will be a blend of online, print and face-to-face materials and offerings.

Given that it is a reality; we need to also equip educators on best practice. The WCED has discussed this with our Higher Education Institutions that are involved in teaching qualifications and training so that they include this in their own curriculum in preparing future teachers on how best to teach and manage large classes.

Just last Friday, the Provincial Teacher Education Development Committee (PTEDC) agreed to appoint a Steering Committee consisting of appropriately identified persons from the Faculties of Education and the WCED to secure the development of an on-line course on large classes by December 2020 ready for 2021.

We welcome any other ideas given that we are facing further budget cuts over at least the next three years.

Status of learner and teacher absenteeism

14. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:

What is the current status of learner and teacher absenteeism in our Western Cape schools?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

14. Learner Absenteeism

The WCED reported an official learner absenteeism rate of 7.03% for the second term of 2019.

The first term reports indicate an absenteeism rate of 4.14 %.

The average for 2019 is 5.85%

Teacher Absenteeism:

The absenteeism rate for the period 1 January 2019 to 31 March 2019 was 2.92%.

The projected absenteeism rate for the period 1 April 2019 to 30 June 2019 was 2.05%. This is expected to increase as at the time of extraction not all leave has been captured.

There are various types of reasons for being absent. Sick leave is the most common. The most recent data shows that only 1% (328) of the educator population has utilised more than 30 days of sick leave since the new leave cycle started in January 2019.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. At the Premier's reply to the State of the Province debate, he made a commitment to unblock Tafelberg for affordable housing and that is obviously something that we welcome, but I would like to ask the hon Premier, through you Deputy Speaker, what actions or steps he has taken to implement this commitment? Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and thank you to the hon member for the question. Yes, I did commit to it and Cabinet has had a briefing as you are well aware. It is involved in litigation and of course what I do not want to see is litigation stretched out for the next ten years or so. So our legal team is busy working with the legal teams on it at the moment and I have not got any finality on it but we are working to try and find a solution and not ten years' worth of extended litigation.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you hon Premier for that reply. It is very encouraging, but it does not really tell me much. Are you suggesting that you are seeking a settlement of the litigation?

The PREMIER: I am not saying I want to seek a settlement but I want to try and find a solution and obviously we have to weigh up all possibilities when that gets brought before Cabinet to make that decision.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The matter is in litigation and the solution is either that the matter is settled and the review is agreed – the Province cedes its decision and reviews and sets aside the previous Cabinet decision. So, the Premier is not really assisting us in taking this matter forward.

If you say you are going to unblock Tafelberg, the expectation is that will be made for affordable housing because it was within that context, so you have your legal team speaking to their legal team about what?

The PREMIER: I think as the hon member knows, and he is of legal training as well, that it is actually probably very unfortunate for me to stand here and make some predicament on it. I need those teams to be able to talk to each other and come back with something that we can have a discussion in Cabinet on, that is how Government needs to work and once that has been – and I have said I am seeking a solution. We will look for a solution but we have to also apply our minds to whatever comes back to us, so you know I have to wait for that report to come back to us so I can take it to Cabinet for that discussion, to find a solution, because as I said, right in the beginning, I do not want to have protracted, long legal battles when we actually have an asset that is deteriorating while this is happening. We need to find a solution as quickly as possible and we will have to apply our minds when those legal teams come back with whatever they can come up with.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you. To the Premier, I would like to ask, what has his main achievements been in the first 100 days of him being in office? Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that question hon member. Obviously in your first 100 days and one in politics always has this thing called ‘a hundred days’ and so I suppose it is there purposely to try and get you to exercise your mind, put pressure on the system, make sure that you get those processes and those promises and those manifesto items imbedded in government.

So I think first of all, post being elected we have held the *Bosberaad*, we have taken the manifesto to the teams, we have got the lead Ministers with those various themes as announced here from jobs to human empowerment to safety, to cultural, to culture of the organisation etc etc and those plans are almost at finality. In actual fact tomorrow we have reporting back of the lead Ministers for those plans, which then become imbedded into the plans of this Government for the next five years with the targets that we need to meet. So, a lot of work has happened between the manifesto and the *Bosberaad* and now.

I think one thing, specifically, that is very encouraging is to see the kind of new thinking that is coming in, really pushing the boundaries so that we come up with something that really takes us to the next level. Of course in these first 100 days we have also done many other things. I have attended three day lagotlas at a national level, we have had PCCs and PCFs. We have had MINMAYs, we have had speed dating sessions where the Cabinet has met every single one of these municipalities, a Local Government initiative that really has been amazing, where we can say that each Cabinet member and head of department has had an engagement with every single municipality. When I reported that to the President at the PCC he was very, very interested in it and we have just put a report together to send to him to say, this is how we did it and what we did.

And then of course there are the other things like landing or getting agreement with the Cabinet that we have finalised the idea of having the audit of setting a benchmark of where we are financially, as individuals, that lifestyle audit and very happy that that has been agreed to. It is actually out on tender at the moment, and hopefully that service provider is put in place very, very soon so that we can be – I see there is some competition we have got in this province, from another province, Premier Sauls, but I think we are ahead of him at the moment and will be the first province to have lifestyle audits in place. We have signed off on our own Provincial Handbook. I see the President has withdrawn the National Handbook for review again, which I think is good. So our Handbook is signed off.

Then perhaps let's talk about things like next week, when we will have the second 'First Thursdays', where we really are pushing hard to have open transparent government, available government, people can just walk in. At the last 'First Thursdays', 800 issues, ideas and questions were lodged and are being processed and dealt with through all of the departments, and we will hopefully have that again this Thursday coming, next week, which is going to be a themed Thursday on 'film', but obviously anything from red tape to whatever issues, anybody from the public can raise their issues.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Mr Premier, considering that next month is Tourism Month, and the contribution that tourism currently makes in the Western Cape to the economy and to jobs, what have you done in your first 100 days, in terms of these initial achievements that you have mentioned, to help ensure the sustained increase in the tourism figures in our province, and what would your predictions be for the tourism season coming up?

The PREMIER: I think obviously the tourism sector, you are right it is a very important sector in our economy, 300 000 jobs and it has been put under pressure of late, specifically I think with regard to the drought. We just managed to get out of that crisis, not totally in our province, obviously there are parts of our province that are still very, very seriously under pressure with the drought. But I think the main tourism areas are now out of the woods there, but now we have got the safety issue, which is front and centre. It is front and centre because of two reasons. I think anytime something happens in the tourism space, and the very unfortunate incident that happened on the mountain not so long ago gets amplified around the world.

But also I think because this Government is focusing on safety, we are putting out the murder numbers on a Monday. That has a big impact because it gets taken up in the news bulletins, in our newspapers, on our televisions and then gets replicated in international media. That also runs at a risk, so we have had two engagements with the consul generals and the ambassadors. One general engagement, where safety was spoken about but yesterday we actually had a focused engagement with the consul generals. We invited them to come along and we spoke about the safety plans that we are putting in place.

We spoke about our specific focus on providing services when tourists, specifically, or business tourists, are mugged and lose their passports, right down to accidents and worst tragedies, and how our teams step in. These were teams we put in place during the World Cup and they are still operating. They step in immediately to help because of course, as I said in the beginning, this is a very important sector and then I think the last part of your question was around the projections.

If I have a look at the projections and obviously if you need more detail, you actually need to focus this in with the Minister of Economic Opportunities, but we think we are looking at 2,5 to 5% potential growth in tourism. I think the sort of project that I was most proud of in the last five years was the Airlift project and we are still seeing unbelievable growth in that space. We have got the 15th flight coming in now at the end of the year, New York-Cape Town.

I was in a meeting today with the Italian Ambassador Consul General and a visiting Minister and again, the question was brought up, what about connectivity from Italy, looking at tourism and what about a direct flight to Cape Town? So it obviously is one of those things that keeps the momentum and those are exciting parts about this key component of growth and jobs in our province. And I suppose the two big job creators which we have been focusing on for the last while are tourism on the one side, 300 000 jobs, and agriculture and agri-processing on the other side, with another 300 000 jobs.

The one thing about tourism is you can ramp it up way quicker. Agriculture is a much longer term investment, it takes a while to get crops in, it takes a while to get orchards in, whereas with tourism, if you get the numbers you can jump them very, very quickly and of course I think we need to. I welcome the change in some of the visa regimes that we have now seen from the National Government's side. A number of countries are now able to come without visas which really, really does help, and also the commitment to follow-on with making it easier to get here from a visa point of view. All of those bode well I think for tourism growth into the future for the region.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Premier mentioned his next 'First Thursdays' theme is going to be 'film' and he also spoke about the risk of the drought and the risk of security in the Western Cape to tourism. I just want to find out, what message would you have for the youth, especially in rural communities where they are struggling with the drought, where they are struggling with the issue of safety.

For example, we were in Laingsburg recently with an oversight visit in Matjiesfontein and I walked past youth who were busy making a film there in the area and they were getting funding and doing fundraising for that as well. So what message would you have to encourage others, that despite the drought and despite the safety, please help us increase the tourism sector? Thank you.

The PREMIER: Absolutely and of course, the reason that those sectors are chosen and supported is because they are the job absorbing sectors and so my advice to any young person is, understanding your own talents, understanding your own abilities, make sure that you are looking to the future, to an area that is going to be easier to get a job. And then of course add, if you can, tech.

I actually had the opportunity to see a short video clip that the colleague next to you, Ms Gillion showed me earlier today which was a video clip of a young guy that you interviewed in one of our Access Centres. When you listen to a young guy like that, it is really encouraging, someone who gives up his Saturdays to help young people with a future, that is really exciting.

I mentioned to him, when I was in Klaarstroom the other day and I saw the Access Centre, walked in and a similar young person was there busy helping two young ladies do applications online to be part of the Premier Pay Project, because they had completed their matric and were looking for an opportunity open to them and they were busy filling in their forms and that was really, really great to see.

So those kinds of centres really offer real opportunities for young people. Make use of those centres and also talk to us if there is not one in your area. Make sure that you are speaking to anybody in this House to say, please can we be next on the list for one of those centres or other opportunities. The one thing I think in South Africa, we have to be dynamic, we have to be able to change quickly and we have to do things that create opportunity. If we keep things that do not work, well let us cut them down and let us put that money to something else. We cannot carry on doing the same thing that we have just kept on doing year after year. We are now into the sixth term of over 25 years into our new democracy, the highest youth unemployment rate in the world. We cannot accept that. We have got to bring in new opportunities and change and so that would be my message to young people, make sure that you use those opportunities that are given to you.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you to the Premier. Mr Premier, given (a) that the Constitution of South Africa enshrines in Chapter 3, Section 41, the three spheres of government, and I am quoting:

“In the Republic government is constituted as national, provincial and local spheres of government which are distinctive, interdependent and inter-related.”

and (b) given that the power stipulated as per Chapter 6, dealing with the legislative authority of provinces – taking that into account, are the powers of provinces being curtailed or eroded? Thank you.

The PREMIER: Okay. Thank you very much for that question. When you ask, “are the powers being curtailed?” I straight away think about policing and we are trying to push the boundaries on policing. Our job is oversight.

I will never forget, in the debate the hon Marais saying, “provinces have just about no powers; we can do abattoirs and...” well, quite frankly we cannot accept that. We have got to push boundaries and go even further. I think about our own mandate and what we have done in the last while. We have put our own legislation in place around education, to improve education outcomes and to make sure that we follow through with that mandate.

We have done exactly the same thing with Community Safety. We are the only province with an Act in Community Safety, which actually outlines new areas, but I think we need to go further than that. But I think your question about curtailing, at the same time as we want to push the boundaries on policing, there is policing legislation that definitely is trying to curtail policing in this country. They are talking about one single force – it is called the Blue Police Force. One single police force.

Now, if we cannot get resources allocated to us in this province; if we have high crime levels in this province and we have an ineffective police force; it is something that I just cannot get in my mind to say well, actually what we must do is, we must stop the law enforcement at local government level. We must take control of the Metro policing; we must actually manage everything to do with policing from a national level.

Quite frankly I think that is definitely going in the wrong direction and that is trying to curtail our provincial powers. We need to fight that as hard as we can. It is definitely not going to make this country safer.

I cannot believe we are the only province that is freaking out, screaming and shouting and I am only going to talk about the murder rate – I mean the rape rate is even worse, but the murder rate – and we are screaming and shouting about it. Last year, 2018, in the Western Cape we had 3 600 murders.

I mean that is unbelievable. It is unacceptable. It cannot be. But in Gauteng they had 4 300; in KZN, they had 4 600. Huh!? These are murders in South Africa. This policing force that is supposed to be dealing with the most serious of crimes and now they want to curtail our powers in our province. I am not sure why the other provinces are not freaking out as well, because they should be, because we cannot curtail these powers.

So, I also think about one other thing which is not about curtailing our powers, but something that is having a huge effect on us and we have got a slow-growth economy, bordering on recession, year after year, because of policies and management and SOE's and all the rest of the National Government's woes and now what is happening is, we are actually curtailing our services because it is having massive budgetary implications for us as a province.

The Minister of Finance here, is having to come up with all sorts of fancy footwork to try and get us as much as we can, so that we can actually minimise those cuts, but at the moment as we stand here, we have got some very severe cuts that every single one of these departments are going to have to be faced with. And what happens when you cut? You cut frontline services. That is just what happens, and it puts huge pressure on us.

So, ja, I think legislatively, curtailment within the constitutional framework, but actually also from a policy point of view we are being curtailed because those bad policy decisions are having a massive effect on the economy of our country which is really knocking onto every single facet of society.

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Taking into account what the Premier has just said, how can we counter that? How can the powers of provinces, and specifically the Western Cape, then be bolstered and ensuring that also this Parliament plays a far more significant role? Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Go and get votes!

The PREMIER: We have already won the votes and we have already won the power in this province, but I think – and it is a very interesting question. So I think, first of all, my first part of the answer will be that is exactly why I am building a relationship with Premier David Makhura. That is exactly why I am doing it, because we need provinces to start working together.

We need provinces – and I mean specifically Gauteng, they are facing exactly the same problem that we have. Sometimes even exacerbated, if you think about pressure on Education and Health in those provinces. So, we find commonality immediately in ... [Interjections.] public transport. Does the hon member want to ask me something?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon Premier. You can continue.

The PREMIER: So, we can immediately see that when it comes to train systems, public transport and devolution of public transport from a national level, so that PRASA, whether it be in Gauteng or PRASA being in the Western Cape, actually gets devolved down to provincial and local governments. So, that is really, really important. So the first thing is, how do we work together with other provinces?

Perhaps, further to your question, how do we in this House, and our Standing Committees utilise, not only the Standing Committees differently in how we get out to highlight these issues, but also I think we have got to actually have a look at how we even use the National Council of Provinces differently.

The NCOP is a real critical part of our system and actually gets the National Council of Provinces to also be much more aggressive in how they are helping us change people's lives in this region. I think that is also really important.

So yes, definitely, what the Executive can do, and I also think, maybe the last point is, how we use our amendments and how we build relationships through those platforms; how we build partnerships with like-minded MEC's in other provinces, and with our Ministers, and you know, get people to move beyond the politics to making a difference to the people.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Mr Premier, a number of years ago the responsibility for our technical colleges, now called TVET colleges, was for example, transferred from provincial competency to that now of the National Department for Higher Education and Training – recently the word “science” has been added there as well.

So it seems to me as if there is a definite agenda from the National Central Government to try and erode this position. Now you have shared with us some of your ideas in terms of how to counter that. My question is just, what more can we do to try and use, within the existing legislation, to try and see how provinces can take what I believe would be their rightful role? Thank you.

The PREMIER: So, I think first of all, not all FET colleges were transferred and that is why we specifically, when I held the portfolio and now, Minister Meyer, we did not want Elsenburg to go to National. Of course there is always that pressure to actually take it away, but we really resisted, and I think we did it well.

Exactly in answer to the previous question, working in partnership in other provinces, convincing the Minister of Agriculture that this was not a good idea, and in the best interests of agriculture, moving the agricultural colleges to higher education and we managed to sort of stave that off and I think it was the right thing to do, because it does help us create the competition. That also helps create the excellence.

I think further on, when you decide what you want to challenge, you cannot challenge everything. So if I think about the FET colleges, I think about artisanal skills, I think about our universities. I think first of all we need to continue with good relationships with our universities.

Yesterday I had a short interview with a student from Stellenbosch who actually wrote a scathing letter against myself and Minister Albert Fritz, on what we are doing around safety, because she is a student studying political science and criminology and so instead of writing an answer to her letter, I said, well, come and have a cup of coffee. And it was really interesting. I mean we picked up some really good stuff and we need to say, well how do we engage more with our universities?

We have got a specific platform that Government engages and universities in this region come together. Check. We use them. We use them in research capabilities, etcetera, but I think we also need to up that engagement a bit more because there are really great skills and knowledge and I think sometimes those two are too far apart. But lastly, and I think something that we really are working on – we have been working on artisanal skills; on making sure of the relationship between business and Government or should we say skills; FET colleges and businesses in the practical space actually drifted apart in the last 25 years.

I think one big mistake we made was where we would say that the apprenticeship system would go away. Now, we have been actively re-encouraging that apprenticeship system. 35 000 is the target which should be coming up quite soon, of young apprentices actually going into businesses as part of their training.

We need to push that a lot more and what the Minister of Education is looking at now is how we start that earlier, that dual system.

So that at school level you are already getting to make that decision, where you split, and I think that maybe even link to the previous question about how do young people see a future; that we actually start making those decisions earlier on. We compete around the world with some of these real leading nations in the economy and in innovation and that is what they are doing. The percentage of young people that end up going to university versus going into vocational training is totally skewed.

They have very sort of small levels going initially into universities. Most people go through some kind of vocational training that starts at school level. We need to learn from those processes and our Minister of Education is busy with that. I think it links to STEMA but it really is about how we change things. As I said earlier, we have the highest youth unemployment rate in the world in our country.

We have to do things differently and we have got to start with young people at schools and if they can start learning a trade in a vocational pathway at 13 and 14 rather than waiting for matric and then going in that direction, I think that is exactly the way to go. I think hopefully we will be able to showcase that in our systems very shortly.

.

Questions and replies as received from departments

QUESTIONS

For written reply

Swellendam: Title-deed restoration project

1. Mr D America asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

(a) How much money was transferred to the Swellendam Municipality for the title-deed restoration project per year since 2014 and (b) how many title deeds have been transferred per year since 2014?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:

1. (a) R30 286.26

(a) Transfers in Swellendam Municipality since 2014

2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019 (Jan-Jul)
13	114	264	18	11	7

Housing opportunities: red tape

2. Mr D America asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether the Department experiences any red tape that has an impact on the delivery of housing opportunities; if so, how can it be reduced to accelerate the delivery of houses in (a) category B municipalities and (b) the City of Cape Town?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:

2. The process of providing a house to a beneficiary remains entangled in bureaucratic systems that require various regulations and procedures to be observed, resulting in undue delays and time loss.

Similar bureaucratic processes are experienced by both B municipalities and the City of Cape Town.

Red tape and the effects on the housing process:

- o The time frames and alignment with municipal standards and guidelines for the testing of the quality and pressure of water connections to households;
- o The time frames and alignment with Eskom for certification;
- o Power of Attorney to Provincial Government where land is owned by the City of Cape Town but province is the implementer;

- o Delays in the approval of applications to the City of Cape Town for funding from the Urban Settlement Development Grant for the development of critical provincial and catalytic projects;
- o Long delays in processing and acquiring development rites which includes feasibility studies, bulk services, water use licenses, land use planning ordinances;
- o Individual approval of building plans by municipalities;
- o Delays in the installation of water and electrical devices and connections – differences between devices provided for by municipality and what the housing subsidy provides for.

The following interventions could potentially reduce the red tape:

- o Quicker decision making processes by Eskom and departments providing the planning approval;
- o It is crucial to urgently review the time frames for pre-construction activities such as Feasibility studies and Environmental Impact Assessments; (It should be noted that the Minister of Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning recently gave an undertaking to the Minister to FastTrack all approvals);
- o Municipalities to consider bulk approval of building plans for individual houses. They should bolster capacity to cater for large numbers of approvals – administrative and rigorous Council oversight needed to make it happen; and
- o Municipalities to request for installation of water and electrical devices and connections from provinces or developers in order to avert delays.

Housing allocations: corruption

3. Mr D America asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether his Department has measures in place to minimise the possibility of acts of corruption occurring in the allocation of houses; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:

3. My department has put the following measures in place to minimise instances of corruption occurring in the allocation of houses:

The development of a web-based platform for municipalities to capture and record applicant information on the Western Cape Housing Demand

Database – (WCHDDB). Through this platform, each of the 24 non-metro municipalities has essentially been provided with access to a web-based system for electronically managing their own housing demand data. The system has the following access controls:

- Limited user access with unique usernames and password to prevent unauthorised updating of data. This measure prevents any official from accessing the database. User access to municipal officials is managed by my department.
- Separation of roles and responsibilities of duties in the WCHDDB by means of different user profiles to ensure:
 - quality control by housing managers
 - limited access to update critical fields i.e. Date of registration and ID numbers.

This measure ensures that only senior municipal officials can change registration dates or ID numbers. The official must indicate in the notes field the reason for the changes. This is to ensure that an audit trail on user activity is recorded for each action on the database.

Through this measure my department is able to monitor any activity on the database.

The City of Cape Town has similar measures in place for its housing demand data base.

Stellenbosch: western bypass

4. Mr A P van der Westhuizen asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

- (1) Whether any work has already been done regarding the proposed Western Bypass for Stellenbosch; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) (a) what is the estimated cost of the project and (b) how will the proposed budget cuts by the central fiscus influence the project;
- (3) whether the project can proceed with less costly preparatory work during this period of forced budget cuts; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

4. (1) The Department of Transport and Public Works has not done any work regarding the proposed Western Bypass for Stellenbosch as upgrading of the existing provincial routes to and from Stellenbosch has a higher priority.

(2) Not applicable.

(3) Not applicable.

Franschhoek Pass: rock and mud slides

5. Mr A P van der Westhuizen asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

- (1) (a) How many major rock and/or mud slides occurred in the Franschhoek Pass in the (i) 2016/17, (ii) 2017/18, (iii) 2018/19 and (v) 2019/20 to date financial years and (b) what is the risk level of more rock slides as determined by the recent geotechnical study;
- (2) whether it is a priority for his Department to reopen the Franschhoek Pass following the closure as a result of the rock and mud slide in June 2019; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (3) whether the Franschhoek Pass can temporarily be opened to traffic on days when the risks for rock or mud slides are deemed lower due to favourable weather conditions; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

5. (1) (a) (i) None, (ii) None, (iii) None and (v) Two consecutive events at the same location.
(b) The geotechnical report only deals with the specific location in (v) above. The risk level of more rock slides at this location is high.
- (2) Yes, it was a high priority.
- (3) Yes, the Pass can be opened when the risks for rock or mud slides are deemed to be acceptable.

AARTO Act

6. Mr D G Mitchell asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

- (a) What are the ramifications of the Administrative Adjudication of Road Traffic Offences Act (also known as the Aarto Act) on traffic law enforcement in the province with regard to the administration of traffic fines and the newly introduced point system, (b) what changes will traffic law enforcement undergo in the province, (c) what is his Department doing to prepare for the new legislation and (d) what negative impact will the Aarto Act have on the province?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

6. (a) The Administrative Adjudication of Road Traffic Offences Act, 1998 (AARTO, Act No. 46 of 1998) is an Act that introduces a points demerit system for traffic violations. It is managed by the Road Traffic Management Corporation (RTMC), a public entity under the National Department of Transport. Although the Act was enacted in 1998, it has not yet been fully implemented because of certain shortcomings with the legislation and difficulties experienced when implementing it in the pilot areas of Johannesburg and Tshwane. The reason AARTO has suddenly become topical is because an Amendment Act was promulgated which attempts to fix the Legislative shortcomings of the original Act.

Just because the Amendment Act was signed into law, does not mean that the Act will be implemented immediately. It will only be implemented in the Western Cape, if the President, through proclamation, proclaims that it will be implemented in the Western Cape.

Therefore, there is no immediate implication for Traffic Law Enforcement in the Province.

- (b) AARTO changes the entire law enforcement system. Once implemented some of the fundamental changes within the traffic law enforcement environment will be:
- (i) A demerit system will be introduced whereby traffic violations will be categorised according to seriousness and given a point value. On the commission of any violation, the point value of that violation will be deducted from an infringer's driver's licence which could eventually lead to the suspension or cancellation of a driver's license.
 - (ii) Fine revenue will be collected by the Road Traffic Infringement Agency (*RTIA*) and, after the deduction of a fee, distributed to the authority that issued the fine. This means that fines issued by Provincial Traffic Officials will no longer accrue to the municipality in which the fine was issued but to the Province potentially resulting in a loss of revenue for municipalities, but an increase in revenue for the Province.
 - (iii) There will be a central Appeal Authority to which infringers must apply if they dispute fines issued against them.
- (c) There is a National AARTO steering committee that is responsible for AARTO rollout preparation. All Provinces including the Western Cape are part of this committee. We are working within this Committee to continually assess readiness within the Province and to address shortcomings where necessary.

- (d) My department, having aligned itself to the UN's Sustainable Development Goals and the Brasilia Declaration to reduce fatalities by 50% by 2020, supports any sensible initiative aimed at achieving this goal. I therefore support the strategic intent behind the development of the AARTO Act. Despite working together with the RTMC to ensure proper rollout, I have serious concerns regarding the readiness of the Road Traffic Infringement Authority ("RTIA") to implement the AARTO Act. The lack of readiness was apparent when the AARTO Act was piloted in Johannesburg and Tshwane. While I understand that a proclamation still has to be signed by the President before it is implemented in the Western Cape, I am concerned that the premature implementation of the AARTO Act will have an effect contrary to what is intended. If the RTIA and municipalities are not ready to implement the AARTO Act, it is more likely to lead to a break down of law on our roads.

We have additional concerns with the legislation itself. They include:

- (i) the ludicrous and unworkable idea of creating a central Appeals Tribunal to deal with all appeals relating to fines. The City of Cape Town alone issued more than two million fines in 2016. If a small proportion of fines issued around the country are taken on appeal, it would paralyse the system and provide lawless road users with means to escape accountability;
- (ii) The potential loss of revenue that will be suffered by municipalities;
- (iii) Foreign Drivers are not taken into consideration in the AARTO legislation.

Learner transport

7. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Education:

- (1) (a) How many busses are contracted to transport learners on the West Coast on gravel roads and (b) what monitoring system does his Department use to ensure learners on these routes are collected;
- (2) whether cases of learners who have not been collected by contracted service providers have been reported; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

- 7. (1) (a) 77 vehicles are used on gravel roads to transport learners in the West Coast.

- (b) Contractors are not paid unless the principal verifies on the WCE 063 that the learners were indeed transported on the days as claimed for by the contractor. Regular spot checks are executed by the district office and the school keeps an attendance register (WCE 062) that accompanies the contractor's monthly claim.
- (2) We had two cases where the contractors failed to collect the learners, both in the Citrusdal area - the Warmbad route and the Elandskloof route - at the beginning of the third quarter 2019.

In both cases the contractor did not inform the school nor the district office that he was experiencing trouble with his vehicles.

Case 1

Route: WCE 368 /Warmbadroete Area: Citrusdal
Schools: Cederberg Academy; Citrusdal Primary School Contractor:
Mr Rezandt
Total learners: 97

As soon as it was reported, the contractor was contacted telephonically to ascertain why he had not transported the learners. He informed us that he had had mechanical problems with his vehicles.

The contractor was reminded of his contract with the WCED. Article 5 subsection 5.6 states that:

If it is found at any time during the contract period that any of the buses are not licensed, roadworthy, and/or unsuitable, the Contractor shall immediately at his own expense arrange for alternative licensed and roadworthy buses to transport the learners and inform the Principal/s accordingly.

The contractor indicated that he was not able to adhere to the prescripts of his contract.

He was also reminded of Article 5 subsection 5.7 that explains that:

"in the event of failure by the contractor to provide licensed and roadworthy vehicles the WCED reserves the right to itself to arrange immediately for alternative transport and to recover the cost thereof from the contractor."

The procurement procedures were followed and a new contractor was appointed to transport the learners.

The original contractor has, in the meantime, fixed his vehicles and is back on the road transporting the learners.

Case2

Route: WCE 389 /Elandskloofroete Area: Citrusdal
 Schools: Cederberg Academy; Citrusdal Primary School Contractor:
 Mr Rezandt
 Total learners: 108

As soon as it was reported, the contractor was contacted telephonically to ascertain why he had not transported the learners. He informed us that he had had mechanical problems with his vehicles.

The contractor was similarly reminded of his contract with the WCED and article 5 subsection 5.6 and 5.7.

The contractor indicated that he was not able to adhere to the prescripts of his contract.

The procurement procedures were followed and a new contractor was appointed to transport the learners. The original contractor has, since then, indicated that he is not able to transport the learner for the rest of his term.

R364, tarring of

8. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

Whether there are plans to tar the R364 in the current financial year or over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

8. There are no plans to tar the R364 in the current financial year or over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework as the road section does not meet the warrants for surfacing.

Kannaland Municipality: recovery

9. Mr G Bosman asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

- (1) (a) What is the state of recovery at the Kannaland Municipality after the Municipality had been placed under administration, (b) how many people have been employed since the Municipality had been placed under administration and (c) which positions have been filled;
- (2) whether the correct processes were followed with the appointment of people in 1(c); if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;

- (3) whether the appointment of the Director of Strategic Planning was supported by him and the local council; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

9. 1 (a) The Provincial Executive resolved on 5 December 2018 to assume responsibility for the implementation, in its entirety, of the approved financial recovery plan, given that the Municipality cannot take the executive measures necessary to ensure the proper implementation of the said plan.

An Administrator (Financial Recovery) was appointed from 1 March 2019 with all powers and functions reasonably necessary to ensure the proper implementation of the approved financial recovery plan. Arrangements were made to second an official from another Municipality to be appointed as the Administrator (Financial Recovery) but such appointment has now been completed.

The Municipality recently achieved an unqualified audit outcome. The Provincial Minister is of the view that the unqualified audit outcome is a result of the hard work undertaken by certain Municipal officials working together with the Provincial Government.

While the Provincial intervention to date has achieved some positive results, the envisaged further work is required in order to turn around the Municipality and achieve financial stability and sustainably.

Mr Wessel Rabbets has now been appointed as the Administrator (Financial Recovery) with effect from 6 September 2019. The abovementioned appointment shall be till 29 February 2020.

- (b) Forty-six (46) people have been employed since the Provincial Executive assumed responsibility, in terms of section 139(5)(c) of the Constitution, for the implementation of the financial recovery plan, three of which are permanent appointments, two are section 56 appointments, three learner/intern appointments and the remainder are contract appointments in order to deal with temporary capacity requirements.
- (c) The following positions were filled:

Section 56 appointments

- Chief Financial Officer
- Director: Infrastructure Services

Permanent:

- Superintendent: Mechanical
- Traffic Officer
- Cashier

1-3-year contracts:

- Learners x 3 (contract end date 31/08/2020)

Contracts under 12 months:

- Twenty-seven (27) temporary workers (General Worker) were reinstated for a period of 9 months following a settlement agreement which was concluded prior to the Provincial Executive assuming responsibility, in terms of section 139(5)(c) of the Constitution for the implementation of the financial recovery plan. (contract end dates 30/09/2019)
- Fire fighter x 3 (3 months) (contract end date 30/09/2019)
- Senior Clerk: Credit Control (3 months) (contract end date 30/09/2019)
- Clerk: Credit Control (3 months) (contract end date 30/09/2019)
- Secretarial (3 months) (contract end date 31/05/2019)
- EPWP general worker (4 months) (contract ending date 30/06/2019)
- General worker (1 month) (contract ending date 30/04/2019)
- General worker (1 month) (contract ending date 31/07/2019)
- General worker (4 months) (contract ending date 31/07/2019)
- General worker (4 months) (contract ending date 30/06/2019)

- (2) The Provincial Minister, in accordance with statutory provisions, must be informed by the Municipal Council of the appointment process and outcome for section 56 appointments. The Municipal Council provided the required information in terms of the applicable regulations. My Department assessed the appointments and advised that correct processes were not followed with the appointment of the section 56 appointments. In these instances, I am advised that there was non-adherence to the provisions of the Regulations. My Department is considering legal opinions in determining these matters.

In relation to the remaining 44 appointments, the Municipality is required to apply its Human Resources policy as to the recruitment and selection, however, it is not a legislative requirement for the Municipality to have submitted a report on the recruitment and selection for these posts to my Office.

- (3) The Municipality does not have a post of Director of Strategic Planning.

Laingsburg advertisement billboard

10. Ms D M Baartman asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

(a) What are the details of the contract between the Laingsburg Municipality and the service provider of the Laingsburg advertisement billboard and (b) how much money has been generated by the Municipality from advertisements on the billboard?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

10. (a) The advertisement billboard was constructed during July 2017, in the term of the previous Municipal Manager, Mr S Pieterse; however, no Supply Chain Management processes were followed.

The Municipal Manager, Mr P Williams, deemed the appointment of 12 Star Media (Pty) Ltd to be irregular. Hence council was approached on 29 May 2019 to regularise the appointment of 12 Star Media, effective 01 March 2019.

- (b) The contract will generate R12 000 per month income for the Municipality, effective 1 March 2019.

Laingsburg landfill site

11. Ms D M Baartman asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

- (1) What are the details of the Laingsburg Municipality's tender for the Laingsburg landfill site as financed by the national Department of Environmental Affairs;
- (2) whether the landfill site is currently operational; if not, why not;
- (3) by what date will the national Department of Environmental Affairs hand over the landfill site to the Municipality?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

11. (1) The Laingsburg landfill project financed by the Department of Environmental Affairs consists of the following:

- A new recycling facility;
- A new compost facility; and
- A guard house at the entrance for access control.

The buildings were constructed, but not completed due to problems experienced with the Implementer, subsequently, a new Implementer has been appointed to complete these facilities.

The national Department of Environmental Affairs which is now called the Department of Environment Forestry and Fisheries, is in the process of finalising the Bill of Quantities, between themselves and the Implementer so that it can be within the available budget which came from savings amounting to R1.7 Million.

- (2) Yes, the landfill site is still operational.
- (3) The Implementer will be on site the first week of October 2019 to complete the project. The estimated construction period will be approximately one month so the proposed completion is by December 2019.

Karoo Marathon and Laingsburg Golf Day

12. **Ms D M Baartman asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

For the (a) Karoo Marathon and (b) Laingsburg Golf Day, what was the (i) expenditure, (ii) income and (iii) generated profit in the (aa) 2014/15, (bb) 2015/16, (cc) 2016/17, (dd) 2017/18, (ee) 2018/19 and (ff) 2019/20 to date financial years?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

12. The expenditure, income and profit of Karoo Marathon and Laingsburg Golf Day is combined into one account for the financial years as depicted in the table below.

Karoo Marathon & Golf Day (Accounted for in one account)				
	Financial Year	(i) income	(ii) Expenditure	(iii) Profit
(aa)	2014/15	R371,328.01	R128,123.53	R243,204.48
(bb)	2015/16	R364,907.10	R115,095.00	R249,812.10
(cc)	2016/17	R340,866.16	R96,186.00	R244,680.16
(dd)	2017/18	R21,081.96	R10,428.00	R10,653.96
(ee)	2018/19	R42,100.00	R42,100.00	R0
(ff)	2019/20	-	-	-
		R1,140,283.23	R391,932.53	R748,350.70

- (dd) During the 2017/18 financial year, the Laingsburg Municipality held a Marathon that was organised by the Laingsburg Athletic Club. During this financial year, no Golf Day was held.
- (ee) During the 2018/19 financial year, the Laingsburg Municipality held a Golf Day in Worcester, but no Marathon took place.
- (ff) During the 2019/20 financial year, no Golf Day will be held by the Laingsburg Municipality, but a Marathon will be organised by the Laingsburg Athletic Club.

Flouride levels in water: municipalities

13. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Health:

- (1) Whether any municipalities in the province add fluoride to drinking water; if so, (a) which municipalities and (b) what is the fluoride level in the water of each municipality;
- (2) whether her Department monitors or gives advice on the appropriate fluoride levels for human consumption; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

13. (1) (a) None.
- (b) There might be natural fluoride found in the water in the rural parts of the province. However, the amounts may not be of any significant and oral health benefit/value. The City of Cape Town monitors all its drinking water (water sampled at the various Water Treatment Plants and within the Distribution System) as per the guidelines published in the South African National Drinking Water Standard (SANS 241). The average fluoride concentration in the City's drinking water never exceeded 0.1 mg/l the past year. The standard limit for fluoride published in SANS 241 related to a chronic health risk is 1.5 mg/l over a lifetime of consumption (2 liters of water per day for 70 years by a person that weighs 60 kg)

2. The Department of Water and Sanitation monitors the levels. The recommended maximum fluoride concentration is 1 part per million which is the appropriate fluoride level for human consumption. In the Metropole, the City of Cape Town uses the standard limit for fluoride as published in the South African National Drinking Water Standards (SANS 241) to assess and understand if all water tested pose a chronic health risk – in terms of fluoride concentration present in the drinking water – or not. No such risk has been identified.

Children: laws for transporting in vehicles

14. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

- (1) Which law governs how children should be transported in vehicles and (b) up until what age or height should children be transported in car or booster seats;
- (2) whether his Department enforces these regulations; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

14. (1) The law which governs how children should be transported in vehicles is the National Road Traffic Act 93 of 1996.
 - (b) Unfortunately, there is no requirement for the use of booster seats in our law.
- (2) While there may not be a requirement for the use of booster seats in our law, the Department has identified safety belt compliance as one of its priority operational mandates. Provincial Law enforcement operations that focus on safety belt compliance are a feature across the Province.

Questions and replies as received from departments

QUESTIONS

For written reply

Laingsburg farmer and farmworker attacks

1. Ms D M Baartman asked the Minister of Community Safety:

How many attacks have there been on farmers and farmworker on farms in the Laingsburg municipal area in (a) 2016, (b) 2017, (c) 2018 and (d) 2019 to date?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

1. The South African Police Service informed me as follows:

- (a) 0
- (b) 0
- (c) 0
- (d) 0

Laingsburg police precinct cases

2. Ms D M Baartman asked the Minister of Community Safety:

How many cases have been before each detective in the Laingsburg police precinct per month for the calendar year (a) 2016, (b) 2017, (c) 2018 and (d) 2019 to date?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

2. The South African Police Service informed me as follow:

(a)

Month	Detective	Total Cases
January	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	79
	Detective 2	100
	Detective 3	81
	Detective 4	128
February	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	11
	Detective 2	83
	Detective 3	96
	Detective 4	127
March	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	90
	Detective 2	99
	Detective 3	86
	Detective 4	127

April	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	99
	Detective 2	88
	Detective 3	80
	Detective 4	136
May	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	96
	Detective 2	81
	Detective 3	84
	Detective 4	123
June	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	101
	Detective 2	81
	Detective 3	93
	Detective 4	98
July	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	103
	Detective 2	86
	Detective 3	100
	Detective 4	104
August	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	106
	Detective 2	85
	Detective 3	99
	Detective 4	98
September	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	111
	Detective 2	83
	Detective 3	100
	Detective 4	114
October	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	111
	Detective 2	76
	Detective 3	103
	Detective 4	117
November	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	97
	Detective 2	74
	Detective 3	84
	Detective 4	108
December	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	100
	Detective 2	100
	Detective 3	80
	Detective 4	113

(b)

Month	Detective	Total Cases
January	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	96
	Detective 2	98
	Detective 3	68
	Detective 4	122
February	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	117
	Detective 2	96
	Detective 3	90
	Detective 4	102
March	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	88
	Detective 2	101
	Detective 3	86
	Detective 4	97
April	Branch Commander	5
	Detective 1	83
	Detective 2	105
	Detective 3	79
	Detective 4	87
May	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	74
	Detective 2	107
	Detective 3	80
	Detective 4	85
June	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	84
	Detective 2	98
	Detective 3	77
	Detective 4	103
July	Branch Commander	1
	Detective 1	3
	Detective 2	85
	Detective 3	103
	Detective 4	83
	Detective 5	106
August	Branch Commander	1
	Detective 1	3
	Detective 2	102
	Detective 3	108
	Detective 4	88
	Detective 5	99
September	Branch Commander	1
	Detective 1	3
	Detective 2	115
	Detective 3	104
	Detective 4	101
	Detective 5	94

October	Branch Commander	1
	Detective 1	3
	Detective 2	105
	Detective 3	93
	Detective 4	103
	Detective 5	112
November	Branch Commander	1
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	104
	Detective 3	88
	Detective 4	109
	Detective 5	126
December	Branch Commander	1
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	108
	Detective 3	94
	Detective 4	110
	Detective 5	22
	Detective 6	125

(c)

Month	Detective	Total Cases
January	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	109
	Detective 3	88
	Detective 4	102
	Detective 5	33
	Detective 6	122
February	Branch Commander	4
	Detective 1	107
	Detective 2	103
	Detective 3	114
	Detective 4	46
	Detective 5	114
March	Branch Commander	1
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	84
	Detective 3	102
	Detective 4	141
	Detective 5	55
	Detective 6	109
April	Branch Commander	2
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	126
	Detective 3	100

	Detective 4	127
	Detective 5	45
	Detective 6	124
May	Branch Commander	2
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	111
	Detective 3	94
	Detective 4	122
	Detective 5	47
	Detective 6	137
June	Branch Commander	2
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	102
	Detective 3	108
	Detective 4	130
	Detective 5	45
	Detective 6	129
July	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	112
	Detective 3	114
	Detective 4	137
	Detective 5	55
	Detective 6	123
August	Branch Commander	2
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	107
	Detective 3	118
	Detective 4	151
	Detective 5	66
	Detective 6	138
September	Branch Commander	3
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	105
	Detective 3	118
	Detective 4	121
	Detective 5	48
	Detective 6	126
October	Branch Commander	15
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	90
	Detective 3	119
	Detective 4	117
	Detective 5	53
	Detective 6	128
November	Branch Commander	15
	Detective 1	2
	Detective 2	96
	Detective 3	105

	Detective 4	131
	Detective 5	50
	Detective 6	137
December	Branch Commander	15
	Detective 1	2
	Detective 2	92
	Detective 3	125
	Detective 4	138
	Detective 5	71
	Detective 6	153

(d)

Month	Detective	Total Cases
January	Branch Commander	22
	Detective 1	4
	Detective 2	106
	Detective 3	133
	Detective 4	146
	Detective 5	78
	Detective 6	150
February	Branch Commander	20
	Detective 1	2
	Detective 2	105
	Detective 3	125
	Detective 4	145
	Detective 5	84
	Detective 6	133
March	Branch Commander	20
	Detective 1	2
	Detective 2	95
	Detective 3	138
	Detective 4	160
	Detective 5	84
	Detective 6	139
April	Branch Commander	20
	Detective 1	2
	Detective 2	96
	Detective 3	142
	Detective 4	146
	Detective 5	88
	Detective 6	152
May	Branch Commander	20
	Detective 1	2
	Detective 2	94
	Detective 3	141
	Detective 4	138
	Detective 5	91

	Detective 6	149
June	Branch Commander	19
	Detective 1	3
	Detective 2	88
	Detective 3	141
	Detective 4	148
	Detective 5	94
	Detective 6	140
July	Branch Commander	18
	Detective 1	2
	Detective 2	76
	Detective 3	136
	Detective 4	128
	Detective 5	93
	Detective 6	132
August	Branch Commander	17
	Detective 1	2
	Detective 2	88
	Detective 3	129
	Detective 4	137
	Detective 5	99
	Detective 6	124

Wards 61, 64, 69 and 71: new schools

3. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Education:

Whether any new schools have recently been built or are planned to be built in the area covered by the City of Cape Town's wards 61, 64, 69 and 71; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

3. No new schools have been constructed in Wards 64, 69 and 71, recently.

A mobile school was erected in Ocean View (Ward 61) in the 2018/19 financial year, to address the demand for a primary school in the broader Ocean View/Masiphumelele area (Ward 61 & 69).

Based on departmental needs analysis, Masiphumelele (in Ward 69) has been identified for a new primary school, which is reflected in our User Asset Management Plan (2019/20). The construction of the proposed school is dependent on land availability and we are currently investigating the acquisition of a suitable site. Support in this regard would be welcomed.

SCHOOL PROJECTS (new, replacements and expansion projects)

Ward 61:

School projects in the pipeline, include:

Kleinberg Primary School – replacement school (2024/25)

Ocean View LSEN – replacement school (2023/24)

Ocean View High School – school expansion (2019/20)
 School projects completed recently, include:
 Jupiter Street Primary School - mobile school (2018/19)

Ward 64:

School projects in the pipeline, include:
 None
 School projects completed recently, include:
 None

Ward 69:

School projects in the pipeline, include:
 Masiphumelele Primary School – new school (2025/26)
 School projects completed recently, include:
 None

Ward 71:

School projects in the pipeline, include:
 None
 School projects completed recently, include:
 None

Please note that the school projects in the pipeline are subject to implementation readiness which is highly dependent on factors such as land availability.

Wards 61, 64, 69 and 71: new hospitals and clinics

4. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Health:

Whether any new hospitals or clinics have recently been built or are planned to be built in the area covered by the City of Cape Town's wards 61, 64, 69 and 71; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

4. When looking at City of Cape Town Wards 61, 64, 69 and 71 it falls within the Southern/Western sub-structures of the Western Cape Government Health of which no new hospitals or Primary Healthcare Facilities have been built recently.

In terms of planning of new facilities for the areas provided, we envisage replacing Victoria Hospital and Retreat Community Health Centre however the construction of the new Victoria Hospital Emergency Centre is currently underway. We are also awaiting confirmation from the City of Cape Town on the availability of the Bowling Green (and their agreement to sell the site to the Western Cape Government) for the planned new Community Day Centre for Hout Bay. We have provided the Project Brief to the Department of Transport and Public Works, but they await the availability of the site in order to start the official IGS 4 (concept design) planning.

*Wards 61, 64, 69 and 71: housing opportunities***5. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether any housing opportunities have recently been created or are planned to be created in the area covered by the City of Cape Town's wards 61, 64, 69 and 71; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:

Ward Number	Areas	Housing Opportunities Created?
61	Ocean View Glencairn Kommetjie Scarborough Simon's Town Smithswinkel	Dido Valley housing project. Total of 600 BNG units. Civil infrastructure completed, top structures construction commencing October 2019 Ocean View Infill project – 388 sites spread over 8 land parcels. Development rights are in place but project is not yet scheduled for implementation. May be considered for GAP/FLISP.
64	False Bay Clovelly Kalk Bay Lakeside Muizenberg St. James	No current or recent projects
69	Masiphumelele Capri Fish Hoek Noordhoek Sunvalley	Masiphumelele Phase 4 – 227 units, top structures under construction (the first approx. 90 to be completed and handed over during Oct 2019)
71	Constantia Bergvliet Heathfield Kirstenhof Lakeside Retreat Westlake Tokai	No land identified at the moment, however, waiting list applicants living in this ward will most likely be considered for upcoming projects in wards 67 & 68 (<u>Vrygrond, Pelican Park Phase 2, Strandfontein and Retreat Crestway</u>) A social housing project had been earmarked for Retreat Station, comprising of 176 units for financial year 2023/24. The project is in the early planning phase.

*Illegal firearms: destruction of***6. Mr R I Allen asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

- (a) When last did the SAPS in the province destroy illegal firearms that it confiscated and (b) how many illegal firearms were destroyed?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

6. The South African Police Service informed me as follow:

- (a) 17 April 2019
(b) 1 073 firearms

*Firearms: missing or lost from storage***7. Mr R I Allen asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

How many firearms have gone missing from storage or have been lost after recovery in (a) 2013, (b) 2014, (c) 2015, (d) 2016, (e) 2017, (f) 2018 and (g) 2019 to date?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

The South African Police Service informed me as follow:

7. (a) 0
(b) 0
(c) 0
(d) 0
(e) 21 (De Doorns SAPS = 3; Bellville South SAPS = 18)
(f) 0
(g) 0

*Gang-related social development cases***8. Mr R I Allen asked the Minister of Social Development:**

Of the cases finalised by social workers at her Department, how many were deemed to be gang-related in (a) 2014, (b) 2015, (c) 2016, (d) 2017, (e) 2018 and (f) 2019 to date?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT:

8. Of the cases finalised by social workers at her Department, how many were deemed to be gang-related in (a) 2014, (b) 2015, (c) 2016, (d) 2017, (e) 2018 and (f) 2019 to date?

Accurate reporting is compromised by the fact that many children and adults in conflict with the law are aware of the legal implications of acknowledging gang affiliation in terms of the Prevention of Organised Crime Act (POCA) and would therefore deny gang involvement /affiliation. Also, our Performance Information does not disaggregate gang-related crimes from other crimes.

The below numbers can however be reported:

(a) 2014: 306, (b) 2015: 120, (c) 2016: 150, (d) 2017: 166, (e) 2018: 235 and (f) 2019 to date: 153

Tygerberg Hospital: disciplinary committee

9. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:

- (1) What reasons were stated by the Tygerberg Hospital Disciplinary Committee for the sanctions placed on the three doctors involved in an alleged crime during January 2019;
- (2) whether a recording of the hearing will be tabled by the Hospital; if not, why not; if so, when;
- (3) (a) when will the review of the disciplinary outcome take place and (b) what were the effects of the sanctions on the Hospital's service delivery and on the doctors involved?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

9. (1) It is the responsibility of the Department to investigate all allegations, irrespective of the status and or positions of those implicated. The chairperson of the disciplinary hearing is pronouncing on the sanctions after due processes were followed.
- (2) The disciplinary records are confidential and may not be disclosed.
- (3) (a) The two doctors declared a dispute with the Public Health and Social Development Sectoral Bargaining Council (PHSDSBC). The Council will determine a date of the conciliation and arbitration and will also appoint a Commissioner to handle the dispute.
- (b) The Department regrets the negative experience that disciplinary procedures have on all involved. We try to be open and accessible but are still bound to fair and confidential disciplinary processes. The Department and Tygerberg Hospital management would welcome a fair resolution to this matter, and will give as much support as possible to the doctors to complete their specialist training. In terms of service delivery, lists that

were cancelled were as a result of other contributing factors including other vacancies, recently appointed junior doctors who are undergoing training and in addition to this the dismissal and suspension occurred at this time as well.

2020 intake: e-registration process

10. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Education:

- (1) Whether any challenges are experienced with the e-registration process for the 2020 intake; if so, (a) what are the relevant details and (b) what are the plans to curb placement challenges for upcoming years;
- (2) whether there are any learners who have yet to be placed in schools; if so, (a) how many and (b) how are they to be accommodated?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

10. (1) (a) The system exceeded the expectations of project team in terms of performance:
 - 292 624 applications have been successfully processed on the system as at 22 August with 132 638 users.
 - 60% of the applications were captured by parents themselves.

Challenges experienced:

- Parents had the option to apply on-line at the pilot schools or they could hand in applications to schools where it was then captured by the school. Contrary to instructions, some schools did not allow for hard copy applications. Some schools have had their own e-system in place for years – therefore, paper-based applications were previously done away with at the school.

The WCED plans to strengthen the message that schools must accept hard copies, via a circular and training that has been scheduled.

- The One Time Pin (OTP) sms security feature response times were very slow and clients waited too long for the sms. This was due to factors beyond the WCEDs control such as cell phone network dependencies and the service being shared with other WCG departments.

This function has been re-designed and will function without a sms dependency for the 2020 enrolment process.

- Timeframes for training of schools and users was too rushed.

Training is being scheduled for relevant school admission staff October – November 2019.

- Advocacy of the system was not widespread enough due to the fact that it was a limited pilot.

A comprehensive advocacy programme is being scheduled for the enrolment process.

- Access to the internet was a challenge in a few areas, but parents always had the option to hand in hard copies which can be captured on the system.

The WCED will be training library Staff and all WCED district and schools to improve access and opportunities for parents. A programme to get trained interns to assist parents in shopping malls during the admission period has been tabled for approval.

- Some parents did not have a cell phone number or an e-mail address which was a compulsory identifier on the system.

The cell phone number and e-mail address have been delinked as the unique identifier for the parent which will resolve this issue.

- (b) What are the plans to curb placement challenges for upcoming years;

- The WCED has a User Asset Management Plan (UAMP) to build more schools and classrooms to accommodate learners for the upcoming years – this is dependent on budget and land availability.
- WCED is verifying its current capacity to determine available places at schools.
- Additional efforts include engaging SGBs at schools with very low learner- teacher ratios in high demand areas to increase their intake.

- (2) Yes,

- (a) As per a report received on 1st October 2019, the number of unplaced learners for Gr 1 -12 for 2020 is 28 000.

- (b) The process of placement/admissions has not yet been completed. District Teams are assisting parents with placement at schools with accommodation.

The Chief Directorate: Physical Resources is also in the process to establish 109 new mobile classrooms, which will provide extra capacity to place learners. The main challenge to the department is insufficient budget to deal with the infrastructure demand.

Drop-out rate

11. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Education:

- (a) What is the current drop-out rate in the province and (b) what is being done to prevent or reduce the drop-out rate?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

11. (a) The WCED tracks learner enrolments at schools on the CEMIS system that is managed and maintained by the schools as learners enter and/or leave a school.

When a learner leaves a school, or has been absent for more than 10 consecutive days without any contact (policy), the school “exits” the learner on the CEMIS system and captures a reason, if such a reason is available.

These reasons include cases of death, transfer to another school in another province, transfer to a TVET college, or to a private school, inter alia, and therefore cannot be deemed as a “drop out” from the education system.

These figures also do not reflect learners “re-entering” the system. Learners that are “moving” would generally find placement in their new community. Similarly, a parent who makes a decision to exit a specific school, may enrol the child elsewhere.

Therefore, the WCED does not actively track or report on learner “dropouts” as there are multiple reasons which are not necessarily deemed as “dropping out” of the schooling system.

- (b) As mentioned above, learners “drop out” of school for a variety of reasons.

Therefore, the WCED works hard to retain as many learners in the system as possible.

Our whole Annual Performance Plan is based on achieving our strategic goals, and this includes ensuring as many learners go through the system and write and complete their matric.

We are particularly proud of the improvement in our rate of retention since 2009.

We take care to avoid the practice of “culling” to improve pass rates. “Culling” involves “losing” weak learners along the way so that schools and provinces can achieve a higher pass rate.

We believe that this practice defeats the purpose of education for these children and is unacceptable. It denies them the opportunity to succeed, no matter what challenges lie before them.

Focusing on retaining learners does, however, have its challenges.

It involves more attention, support and remedial action.

It involves improving the system in the Foundation Phase – the reading, writing and mathematics skills – so that learners progress comfortably and keep up with the curriculum. Learners who do not read, write and calculate at the required levels are more susceptible of dropping out at a later stage due to a lack of confidence or fear of failure.

It involves the identification of learners who would be more suited to a technical and vocational stream than an academic stream, and therefore, the expansion of these schools is vital.

It involves the support and encouragement of pregnant learners both during and after their pregnancy, so that they do not drop out as a result of being pregnant.

It involves behavioural programmes, psychological support and even the assistance of social welfare networks for learners who are in homes that are not healthy and happy environments.

More importantly, it involves creating a space where learners feel safe and motivated.

We are also focusing on expanding the school programme to provide constructive and engaging activities to encourage learners to stay in school.

There are many reasons for drop-outs and many interventions. These are just a few.

Mitchells Plain Police Station

12. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) (a) What are the (i) granted number and (ii) actual number of (aa) South African Police Service Act personnel and (bb) Public Service Act personnel at the Mitchells Plain Police Station and (b) how many vacancies are there currently;

- (2) (a) how many holding cells are there at the Mitchells Plain Police Station and (b) what is (i) the current condition of the holding cells and (ii) the holding capacity of each cell?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

12. The South African Police Service informed me as follow:

- | | | | | |
|-----|-----|------|------|-----|
| (1) | (a) | (i) | (aa) | 484 |
| | | | (bb) | 67 |
| | | (ii) | (aa) | 464 |
| | | | (bb) | 49 |
| | | | (b) | 38 |
| (2) | (a) | 10 | | |
| | (b) | (i) | Fair | |
| | | (ii) | 84 | |

It should be noted that the Department of Community Safety conducted an in loco inspection of the Mitchells Plain SAPS during May 2018 and it was found that the station has 1 holding cell and 10 detention cells with each cell having a capacity of 10 people per cell. 7 of the 10 cells were allocated for men, 1 for females and 2 for juveniles.

Laingsburg and Lentegueur Police Station cases

- 13. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

What progress has been made with case number (a) 14/7/2019 at the Laingsburg Police Station and (b) 571/07/2019 at the Lentegeur Police Station?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

13. The South African Police Service informed me as follow:

- (a) The docket was initially submitted to the SPP for a decision and nolle prosecuted. Subsequent to a complaint, the case was reopened and submitted with additional video footage to the SPP. A decision is awaited.
- (b) A warning statement has been taken from the suspect. The case is still under investigation as additional statements and post mortem reports are being awaited.

Nature conservation management

- 14. Mr A P van der Westhuizen asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

- (a) What criteria were used to determine whether specific nature areas should be managed by the provincial government or by the national government and (b) what structures are in place to ensure that the work being done by the provincial government and by the national government in the field of nature conservation is being coordinated?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

14. a) There are no formal criteria to guide decision making about whether specific nature areas should be managed by the provincial or national government. When specific nature areas are evaluated for protected area status, criteria are used to evaluate whether or not the specific nature area would qualify as protected area in the first place, and whether or not it complies with Section 7 of NEM:PAA; (National Environmental Management Protected Areas Act) that is, if it satisfies/meets the purpose of protected areas. The decision on whether it is managed by local, provincial or national government depends largely on which of these authorities initiate the process, and/or negotiations whether or not the specific nature area should be managed in the national or provincial interest. The Agulhas National Park is an example where the ultimate decision was for SANParks to manage it because of the unique setting (southern tip of Africa; where two oceans meet, etc). The Western Cape Protected Area Expansion Review Committee meets on a quarterly basis to review and make recommendations on properties that have been site assessed for a Stewardship / Protected Area status. Relevant partners (incl. SANParks & Municipalities) also present their earmarked properties to this committee where roles and responsibilities are also considered and negotiated.
- b) The National Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan (NBSAP) guides nature conservation in the country and flows from an obligation South Africa agreed to by signing and ratifying the United Nations Convention on Biological Diversity in 1995. The Western Cape Government responded to and aligned with the NBSAP by developing a Provincial Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan (PBSAP 2016) which coordinates the conservation priorities and required actions of the Department and its public entity, CapeNature. Further structures are in place in order to coordinate and align conservation actions between the national Government and the Provinces. This includes structures like DEFF's MINTECH and MINMEC (WG1/WG8), - National Outcome 10 indicators relating to protected area expansion and the governance of nature conservation (marine and terrestrial conservation). These are further bolstered by collaborative approaches like the Western Cape Protected Area Expansion Review Committee, stewardship forums (e.g. Peer Learning and the Protected Area Expansion Knowledge Exchange between Northern and Western Cape) and National biodiversity and conservation planning forums and symposia. Lastly the Provincial Biodiversity Spatial Plan (BSP) which is in alignment with the National Biodiversity Framework guides the priorities in the Province related to critical biodiversity areas (CBAs), ecological support areas, conservation/climate change corridors and threatened ecosystems. The BSP is a key informant to the Western Cape Protected Area Expansion Strategy objectives and the spatial biodiversity conservation priorities for the Province.

*U-Amp related upgrades and maintenance strategies***15. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Education:**

- (1) With regard to the User Asset Management Plan (U-AMP), what upgrades and maintenance were done at the (a) West End Primary School, (b) Merrydale Primary School, (c) Highlands Primary School, (d) Tafelsig Secondary School, (e) Aloe Secondary School and (f) AZ Berman Secondary School;
- (2) whether U-AMP-related upgrades or maintenance strategies are planned for the next two financial years for the schools in (1); if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

15. (1) & (2)

The following is based on upgrades and or maintenance which is planned for the 2020/21 & 2021/22 financial years.

Schools are included in the planned, Scheduled (Corrective), Maintenance Sub-Programme on the basis of priority. This is related to the condition of the school facility. In other words, schools in a worse condition are prioritised over schools in a better condition.

The upgrading of existing school facilities, whether to expand or to replace parts thereof, forms part of broad, long-term, planning process. This process responds to, primarily, learner enrolment pressure & compliance of the existing school facility with the statutory Norms & Standards prescripts.

- (a) West-Eind Primary School: no maintenance or upgrades planned in the 2020/21 & 2021/22 financial years.
- (b) Merrydale Primary School: no maintenance or upgrades planned in the 2020/21 & 2021/22 financial years.
- (c) Highlands Primary School: maintenance is planned for the 2020/21 financial year, no upgrades or maintenance planned for the 2021/2022 financial year.
- (d) Tafelsig Secondary School: no maintenance or upgrades planned in the 2020/21 & 2021/22 financial years.
- (e) Aloe Secondary School: no maintenance or upgrades planned in the 2020/21 & 2021/22 financial years.

AZ Berman Secondary School: Upgrades are planned. 2020/21 marks the commencement of the design process towards construction of new brick-and-mortar school to commence in the 2021/22 financial year.

*NPO Partnerships***16. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Health:**

With reference to the reply furnished for question 4 of Question Paper 6 of 2 August 2019:

- (1) What are the names of the (a) non-profit organisations (NPOs) with whom the Department has partnered to render intermediate care services at each of the 24 facilities, (b) community mental-health facilities with whom the Department has partnered and (c) NPOs with whom the Department has partnered to render home- and community-based care services;
- (2) (a) what are the names of the five funded NPOs with whom her Department has partnered at the Khayelitsha District Hospital and (b) how much did each NPO receive per year since the commencement of the partnership?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

16. 1. (a) See attached
(b) See attached
(c) See attached

2.

(a) NPO	(b) Funding
Philani	R 5 686 188.00
St. Lukes	R 4 268 572.00
TB/HIV CARE	R 14 707 163.00
Baphumelele	R 5 899 740.00
Caring Network (Intermediate care)	R 6 220 109.00
SACLA	R 6 953 478.00

List of HCBC rural non-profit organization

Cape Winelands	Breede Valley	Boland Intermediate Care
	Drakenstein	Right to Care Drakenstein Home Based Care
		Rusthof Old Age Home Based Care
		Saron Community Centre Home Based Care
		Wagon of Hope Home Based Care
	Langeberg	Bram Project Home Based Care
		Breede River Home Based Care
	Stellenbosch	Franschhoek Intermediate Care
		Right to Care Stellenbosch Home Based Care
	Witzenberg	Witzenberg Boland Hospice Home Based Care
Central Karoo	Beaufort West	<u>Merweville Right to Care</u>
		Right to Care Beaufort West Home Based Care
		Right to Care Murraysburg Home Based Care
		Right to Care Nelspoort Home Based Care
	Laingsburg	Matjiesfontein Right to Care
		Right to Care Laingsburg Home Based Care
	Prince Albert	Klaarstroom Prince Albert Home Based Care
		Leeu-Gamka Right to Care
		Prince Albert Advice Forum Home Based Care
Garden Route	Bitou	Lifeline Garden Route Home Based Care
	George	Bethesda CMSR Intermediate Care
		Famsa Outeniqua Home Based Care
		Ith emba Lobomi Community Home Based Care
	Hessequa	Droom Service Centre Home Based Care
		Jagersbosch Home Based Care
	Kannaland	Oasis Community Project Home Based Care
	Knysna	Lifeline Knysna Home Based Care
		Masithandane Wellness Centre Home Based Care
	Mossel Bay	Genesis Community Project Home Based Care
		Hartenbos Care Centre Home Based Care
		Piet Julies Aids Action Group Home Based Care
	Oudtshoorn	Oudtshoorn FAMSA Intermediate Care
Overberg	Cape Agulhas	Bredasdorp Child Welfare Home Based Care
	Overstrand	Blompark Ikamva Home Based Care
		Mthimkhulu Home Based Care
		Right to Care Overstrand Home Based Care
		Woman Action Group Overstrand Home Based Care
	Swellendam	Child Welfare CCK Home Based Care
	Theewaterskloof	Badisa (Riviersonderend) Home Based Care
		Genadendal Legal Info Desk Home Based Care
		Right to Care Theewaterskloof Home Based Care
West Coast	Bergrivier	Bergrivier Motivated Women Home Based Care
		BMW Porterville Home Based Care
		BMW Velddrif Home Based Care
	Cederberg	ACW Clanwilliam Sederhof Home Based Care
		Diakonale Dienste (Lamberts Bay) Home Based Care
		Ons Huis Home Based Care
	Matzikama	Badisa Matzi-Care Home Based Care
		Coastal Badisa Matzi-Care Home Based Care
		Diakonale Dienste (Nuwerus) Home Based Care
		Vredendal Old Age Home Intermediate Care
	Saldanha Bay	Call-to-Serve Home Based Care
		Mfesane Home Based Care
		ital Connection Home Based Care
	Swartland	inethemba (Darling) Home Based Care
		inethemba Care Home Based Care

District	Sub-program	NPO
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Cape Mental Health Imizamo Yethu
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Cenida
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Community mental Health & Psychiatry
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Little Angels
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Sive Nathi Licensed Home
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Vukani
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Zandvliet Frail Care
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Zandvliet Frail Care
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Comcare - Squibb House
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Cape Mental Health Eagles project athlone
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Cape Mental Health Eagles project Mitchell's plain
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Cape Mental Health Erika Day Care Centre
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Cape Mental Health Fountain House
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Cape Mental Health Heideveld Day Care Centre
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Joy Special Care
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Nomaxabiso Day Care Centre
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Cape Mental Health PSR Groups
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	SANCA
Klpft n/ Mpla in	2,4	Sherwood Park Special Care Centre
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Sinethemba Day Care Centre
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Woodside Special Day Care
Northern/Tygerberg	2,4	Community Mental Health & Psychiatry (Hensie Vroom)
Northern/Tygerberg	2,4	Community Mental Health & Psychiatry (Miles Bowker)
Northern/Tygerberg	2,4	Community Mental Health & Psychiatry (Sonop)
Northern/Tygerberg	2,4	Oasis (Delft)
Northern/Tygerberg	2,4	Oasis (Ravensmead)
Southern/Western	2,4	Cape Mental Health Kimber House
Southern/Western	2,4	Cape Mental Health Fountain House Support Groups
Southern/Western	2,4	Cape Mental Health Welcome Club
Southern/Western	2,4	Comcare Trust
Southern/Western	2,4	De Heide Special Care Centre
Southern/Western	2,4	Emmanuel Day Care Centre
Southern/Western	2,4	Fish Hoek/Kommetjie/Noordhoek Association
Southern/Western	2,4	Friends Day Centre
Southern/Western	2,4	Hope House Trust
Southern/Western	2,4	Sunrise Special Care Centre
Southern/Western	2,4	Wilge Orion Organisation

Khayelitsha/Eastern	6.5/2.4	Caring Network
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Masinedane
Khayelitsha/Eastern	6.5/2.4	Omega Centre
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	Philani
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	SACLA
Khayelitsha/Eastern	2,4	St Lukes
Khayelitsha/Eastern	6.5/ 2.4	Keth' Impilo
Khayelitsha/Eastern	6.5/2.4	Masinedane
Khayelitsha/Eastern	6.5/ 2.4	Philani
Khayelitsha/Eastern	6.5/2.4	SACLA
Khayelitsha/Eastern	6.5/ 2.4/2.1	TB/HIV Care Association
Khayelitsha/Eastern	6.5/2.4/ 2.1	TB/HIV Care Association
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Arisen Women
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Athlone YMCA
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Cape Flats YMCA
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	In the Public Interest
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	SACLA
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	St Johns
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	The Parents Centre
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Opportunity to Serve Ministries
Klpftn/Mplain	2,4	Philani
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/2.4	Arisen Women
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/2.4	Athlone YMCA
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/2.4	Cape Flats YMCA
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/2.4	Etafeni
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/2.4	In the Public Interest
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/2 .4	Opportunity to Serve Ministries
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/2.4	Philani
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/2.4	SACLA
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/ 2.4	St Johns
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/ 2.4	TB/HIV Care Association
Klpftn/Mplain	2.6/2.4	Wolanani
Northern/Tygerberg	2,6	Caring Network
Northern/Tygerberg	2.4/2.6	Caring Network
Northern/Tygerberg	2.4/2.6	Kheth Impilo
Northern/Tygerberg	2.4/2.6	Omega
Northern/Tygerberg	2.4/2.6	Tehillah
Northern/Tygerberg	2.4/ 2.6	Touch
Northern/Tygerberg	2.4/2.6	Touching Nations Delft
Northern/Tygerberg	2.4/2.6	Tygerberg Hospice
Northern/Tygerberg	2.4/2.6	Tygerberg Hospice

*Infrastructural improvements and maintenance of schools***17. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:**

- (a) What challenges does her Department encounter with regard to infrastructural improvements at and maintenance of schools on leased properties and (b) what is the (i) total number and (ii) names of the schools on leased properties that pose challenges with regard to infrastructural improvements and maintenance?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

17. (a) The Landlord or Owner is responsible to maintain the exterior of the premises in a good and proper condition and state of repair. The Interior remains the responsibility of the WCED/SGB. The school should use their norms and standards funding to do the necessary maintenance on the interior of the school.

All schools including leased schools make use of the CEMIS platform to report possible emergency maintenance requests. WCED: Infrastructure Planning makes contact with the Landlord(s) in order to bring any maintenance related issue to their attention. In most instances the owner is responsible to resolve the maintenance request.

The main challenge is when Landlords/Owners of leased schools neglect their duties with regards to maintenance and fail to respond timeously to maintenance requests.

Many of the schools are older than 40 years and do not meet modern standards and therefore require continuous maintenance from both the WCED and the landlord.

- (b) (i) The WCED has a leased portfolio of 258 schools.
- (ii) Listed below are 5 leased schools with maintenance issues that occur regularly:

Bloemendal NGK Primary School
Engelbrecht NGK Primary School
Riverlands Primary School
Welgemeend NGK Primary School
Weltevreden NGK Primary School

*Child-protection SMS hotline***18. Ms N G Bakubaku-Vos asked the Minister of Social Development:**

- (1) (a) How much has her Department spent on the child-protection SMS hotline, (b) how many cases were responded to and (c) how many cases were resolved successfully;
- (2) whether this service has been outsourced to NPOs or consultants; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT:

18. (1) (a) The Department has made use of an SMS service provided by the Directorate e-Government for Citizens (eG4C) in the Department of the Premier, who funds the service. Therefore, there is no charge to the Department to run the service. The SMS service is charged to the public as per their cell phone service provider. SMS's are part of a bouquet of access points that is provided to the public to enquire, submit complaints and report on any service. Other citizen tools are Please Call Me, toll free and shared call service, and walk-in centre.
- (2) (b) One case related to child protection was reported via the SMS line in September. The matter was referred to a Designated Child Protection Organisation who is dealing with the matter.
- (3) The service is managed in-house by eG4C. The Department of the Premier has insourced trained call centre staff to deal with the telephone enquiries/ reports/ complaints from citizens. When an SMS is received, the call centre agent phones the complainant back, obtains the necessary details, and reports it to the Department. The SMS service is an added platform for reporting. The others include reporting directly to DSD local offices or via the police.

*Quintile category reviews***19. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:**

- (1) Whether her Department has the discretion to review a school's quintile category; if not, (a) who does have this discretion and (b) what process is followed to get such a review; if so, where does the additional funding come from;
- (2) whether there have been any requests for the review of a school's quintile category in the province since 2014; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

19. (1) No, the Provincial Minister has the discretion to amend a school's quintile based on a recommendation from the department. The Directorate Management Accounting (DMA) is responsible for applying the amended National Norms and Standards for School Funding (NNSSF), published in the Government Gazette 29179 of 31 August 2006 to determine the quintile of schools in the province. The criteria to rank and place schools are stipulated in these Norms and Standards.

Policy guidelines indicate that the poverty of the community surrounding the school will correlate with the poverty of school community. This guideline has not worked because the dynamic nature of enrolments, specifically the fact that thousands of learners do not attend their closest public school but commute to other public schools for a variety of reasons. Data on surrounding communities is thus a poor indicator of the socio-economic status of learners in many schools.

The socio-economic status of communities has also changed over the years.

Owing to these challenges many appeals have been received from schools requesting a reclassification of their quintile and/or fee status.

A school may apply for a deviation where the school believes that it warrants special consideration. The WCED is obligated to apply a fair and transparent process for dealing with these applications.

- Schools that wish to apply must submit an appeal in writing through their relevant district office to the Member of the Executive Council of Education (MEC) to challenge the quintile allocation and/or fee status.
- WCED schools requesting a review of the school's poverty score due to exceptional circumstances is not limited to new schools only. The exceptional circumstances to be taken into account are that the learners served by the school are all from poor communities and not representative of the poverty score of the community surrounding the school.
- The WCED will perform a financial viability assessment before making a recommendation to the Member of the Executive Council of Education (MEC) for approval

The changing of a school's quintile could have a substantial financial implication for the department in terms of norms and standards and therefore is subject to availability of funding that is reprioritised for this purpose.

I have repeatedly said that the quintile system, a national policy, is failing our children.

Over 40% of Western Cape learners are to be allocated in no-fee schools according to the 2017 National Poverty Distribution Table. The WCED has complied with this policy and where possible, have out of our own allocation supported over 220 Quintile 4 schools by making them no-fee schools, given the dire circumstances they are facing.

But then in Provinces such as Limpopo, which is supposed to allocate 77% to quintiles 1-3, they are reporting as high as 96% of learners in these schools.

Similarly, the national average of Q1-3 schools is 76.8% - far exceeding the prescribed 60%.

Earlier this year I received a letter from the National Minister asking me to address the quintile allocations of schools that are suffering.

I have taken that as consent that we do not comply with the national policy, and expect that we will receive the additional funding for norms and standards. However, indications are that we will not receive additional funding in fact quite the contrary, which will limit our ability to finance additional school quintile re-allocations.

In the interim, we will continue to actively promote a pro-poor approach, specifically supporting quintile 4 and 5 schools serving poor communities. These schools could also supplement their financial resources by submitting claims for Compensation for fee exemptions, as well as top-up funding being made available where the total of their N&S per learner allocation and school fees are less than the no-fee threshold.

- (2) Statistics on requests for the review of schools' quintile categories in the province since 2014:

Expansion of the 'no fee' school programme in 2014 to include Q4 and 5 schools, and resulted in 2016 schools becoming 'no fee' schools, by applying for 'no fee' status. This number has increased to 224 schools in 2019.

The table below represents the statistics of Quintile or Fee Status applications received since 2017.

No fee status or National Quintile classification appeals		
Summary	In progress	16
	Approved	11
	Disapproved	25
		52

Inner-city projects halted by the court

20. Mr B N Herron asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

In to his speech during the State of the Province debate on 23 July 2019 he said: "I can tell you now, Mr Speaker, that almost all the projects that were initiated by member Herron in the inner-city were halted by the court, all of them."

(a) Which inner-city projects were halted by the court, (b) what is the court case number, (c) who were the applicants and (d) when did the court halt these projects?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

20. Speaker/ Deputy Speaker, in my contribution to the SOPA debate in this House on 23 July 2019, I spoke largely about safety on our roads as well as commuter safety on the poorly-functioning Metrorail rail service.

Towards the end of my input, I referred to the importance of spatial transformation and mentioned the recent advertising by the national Department of Public Works and Infrastructure of a number of pieces of land, mostly in District 6. This advertisement was subsequently withdrawn.

Finally, Speaker/Deputy Speaker, I raised concerns about the performance of the City of Cape Town under its previous Executive Mayor in relation to housing delivery, the MyCiti N2 Expressway service as well as inner city developments. These last two aspects were both at Executive Level under the control of the then Mayco Member and now Member of this House, Member Herron.

The Hansard record for that day shows that I was close to the end of my speaking time. In my haste to complete what I was saying I believe that I may have expressed myself inaccurately in describing in very broad and general terms City projects as having been halted by court action when in fact they were exposed to potential court challenges. In some of these instances, in order to avoid a court challenge, the City decided to terminate the projects themselves. The Freeway Project is an example of this.

Speaker/Deputy Speaker this was not done with any intention of misleading this House.

INTERPELLATIONS:*Women and child abuse: shelters for victims***1. Ms N G Bakubaku-Vos asked the Minister of Social Development:**

With regard to the high number of cases of women and child abuse: whether she and her Department have plans to increase the budget for and the number of shelters that house victims of violence; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. I wish to thank the hon member Bakubaku-Vos for the question.

The answer is yes, the Department has a total budget for victim empowerment services. In the current year it is R46 million which is an increase from R14 million in 2014.

The Department aims to increase the total budget for victim empowerment services to R48,7 million in the 2020/21 financial year, and R51,3 million in the 2021/22 financial year, which will enable the Department to increase the number and capacity of shelters for victims of violence.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair]

In particular the Department would like to increase the availability of shelters to key areas where there are existing gaps in services, including the Central Karoo and the Southern Cape.

The unit cost for shelters was increased by 30% to R2,174 per bed per month, and shelters received funding to assist with security upgrades and occupational health and safety requirements. This unit cost is the highest compared to other provinces.

The contribution towards the house-mother salaries were also increased to be in line with the proposed minimum wage model. Additionally women in the shelter were afforded the opportunity to attend accredited skills development courses, i.e. homebased care, culinary courses, art courses, computer training and paramedic courses, amongst others.

This financial year also saw a significant increase in additional shelter space for victims of gender-based violence. A new shelter was launched in Atlantis. The new shelter will provide safe accommodation for women and their children; therapeutic services; accredited skills development courses, and assistance with reintegration back into the community.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the introduction of emergency shelter space has alleviated the pressure on existing shelters by offering women and their children safe accommodation. However, it is still not enough. Women are assessed by a social worker and referred to the appropriate service provider. The additional 26 bed spaces are located across the province.

The victim empowerment programme has also increased its rural footprint by funding critical victim support services provided by a social worker in areas where crime and gender-based violence are rife. New services were initiated in Vredendal, Beaufort West, Knysna, Worcester and Witzenberg. The Provincial Victim Empowerment Forum is functioning well as it is a platform to share best practices, new information and address victim support service delivery challenges.

The following departments attend regularly:

- SAPS;
- The National Prosecuting Authority;
- The Department of Justice and Constitutional Development;
- The Department of Health;
- The Department of Correctional Services;
- The Department of Education;
- Civil society organisations; and
- The Commission for Gender Equality; as well as
- Academic institutions.

Nationally the Department of Social Development has conditionally accredited shelters to render services to adult human trafficking victims. This is a first in South Africa that shelters have been accredited for human trafficking victims.

In this financial year, 23 new victims of trafficking were admitted to shelters in compliance with the prevention and combating of Trafficking in Persons Act of 2013. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see the hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Earlier during the debate we made calls on the Government to avail resources to fight the scourge of gender-based violence and femicide. We made it clear that resources are needed to build more shelters, especially in poor communities like Kayamandi, Nyanga and Mitchells Plain.

The funding of shelters is very instrumental in the fight against the abuse of women and children. Many of the victims are abused by relatives and husbands, and their husbands and boyfriends. They do all the basics like applying for protection orders and laying criminal charges against perpetrators, but they are still dying because in the Western Cape there is not enough space in shelters as we have only 16 emergency shelters to cater for thousands of victims. But that is not our only problem as the Department of Social Development restricts its funding contribution per resident to a three month accommodation stay. After this stay we open the gates and send them back to their abusers.

It is for this reason that I am humbly appealing to the Premier and the MEC to allocate more resources for the shelters.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the police crime statistics that were released this morning shows that women are indeed an endangered species in our country. There was a remarkable increase in all the categories of sexual offences nationally. Sexual offences in the Western Cape may have decreased by 0.5%, but over 7,000 cases were reported in the province.

The top 30 stations where sexual offences cases were reported paint an interesting picture. In the Western Cape it is areas like Nyanga, Delft, Mfuleni, Harare, Kraaifontein, Gugulethu and Mitchells Plain. These are communities where the poor people stay. So I am really appealing to see to it that it happens, not just lip service. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I see the hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Although money is part of the problem and we can put more money around for these resources, shelters are important as a safe space for three months, but we need to recognise that some women are trapped in financial poverty and that some women sometimes cannot go back to their homes. It is with this in mind that we need to look at programmes that support enabling these women to walk out of those shelters and into employment opportunities and be financially free from their abusers, because when they find the courage to leave we need to be able to assist them, and I am happy to say that the Department of Social Development works with a range of partners that enable this to happen.

We know that although money is tight and the Western Cape is trying to spend our money as best as possible, the National Department of Women and Children has wasted a lot of money that could have gone to shelters in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Ai.

Mr G BOSMAN: The Department of Women has purged millions on trips which is money that in the Western Cape can be used to extend shelters and to provide support beyond the three months. The national dialogue and gender-based violence cost over R1,89 million when it was held in the Eastern Cape. R1,4 million was spent for a similar event in Mpumalanga.

No strategies were derived from these dialogues to combat the spate of GBV and to provide space for shelters. No support was offered to victims, let alone a well-resourced plan. Instead the departmental delegation took a R2 million trip to New York.

An HON MEMBER: Western Cape.

Mr G BOSMAN: Perhaps we really need to look at this exorbitant spending and ask, hon member Bakubaku-Vos, can Minister Maite please give us some of that money ... [Interjections.] so that we can spend it well? In fact the ANC's own Grace Tseke said ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr G BOSMAN: ... we cannot write a good story because the Department of Women in the Presidency has wasted money. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D SMITH: Stop complaining.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I encourage the hon members to listen to some of the success stories of organisations such as Dressed For Success, that work with the Department ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

Mr G BOSMAN: ... and that work with us to make this happen. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up. Thank you very much, hon member. I see hon member Makamba-Botya. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I am just going to give a few examples, hon Minister, on the issue of Overberg, specifically in the Municipality of Theewaterskloof. We had a case there of a child who was raped by a 14-year old. The child was one year old. The child had to wait for a week to get a social worker who could speak the language, the African language.

So in those cases how do you expect rape cases to actually be reduced if we have no resources, if we have nothing in place to make sure our children are being supported in such cases? There were no shelters in that area. So I appeal to you that your Department looks into those issues. There are no safety homes for children that are abused in the Overberg region, specifically in the Caledon area. So my appeal is that we need to look into those issues, we need to look into the issue of making sure we have enough social workers who can speak the language that other people can be assisted. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. I see the Minister, hon Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The points that were raised were valuable and are indeed matters that are on the table for consideration. I had the privilege of meeting with the Western Cape Women's' Shelter when they had their ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry hon Minister, if you can just take your seat. Yes, hon member, is there a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I think you might have just missed member Bakubaku-Vos.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you are absolutely right. Hon Minister, my apologies. Thank you for alerting me. Thank you very much, hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: †Uyoyika. [You are frightened.] The investigative report into the state of shelters in South Africa by the Commission for Gender Equality highlights a lot of challenges in our shelters. Allow me to use the example of the Worcester House of Hope. It is a place of safety for victims of traumatic crimes, albeit there is a big demand for their service. It can only house 10 women and five children at a time. They get most of their clients from referrals by SAPS. Another example is that of St Anne's Home, one of the oldest shelters for abused women in the City of Cape Town. We wish to appeal once more to the Premier and his Government to avail more funds as we approach Budget Adjustments. There must be more funding availed for shelters. I therefore wish to ask, hon Speaker, how much will be availed to fight the scourge of gender-base? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member. My apologies, hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, we cannot put a price to a life. Every woman killed is one too many. I had the privilege of meeting with the Western Cape Women's Shelter when they did their strategic planning session and they invited me to come along. And they gave me first-hand experience of the challenges and also the lived experiences of what happens in a shelter. I also visited St Anne's Home where I spent some time. I inspected the facility and met with some of the women there and yes, it is a challenge. Some women have to stay for three months, some shelters afford them four months and the conversation of step-down facilities and secondly housing is very real.

I have engaged the hon Minister Simmers regarding step down and a safe place after you leave the shelter, because just this week I had an issue where a mother had done her four months with the child and was then left destitute because there was no place to go to. So it is very real and I understand that.

The issue of SAPS. We need to get – and we try really hard – a closer working relationship with stations. Most of the incidences of assault, whether it is GBH, sexual assault, whatever it might be, takes place over weekends and on paydays and normally after hours when social workers would be at home. We asked SAPS to alert us to any issue so that we can get a social worker out as quickly as possible. Also with the two Thuthuzela Centres, we have people on duty. But I would want to ask the members, when we are dealing with issues of assault, let us not wait to come to the House, and I want to say that I will give you an email address, it is dsdminister@westerncapegovernment where you can actually register a concern.

It will be logged onto our C-Max system and it will be registered as a ministerial enquiry which I will track and make sure that we see the case through to fruition. I must, hon Deputy Speaker, say that I support the idea of us all working together, because there are many good ideas in this Chamber and it certainly cannot be that a Minister must find all the solutions to all the problems.

So Ms Bakubaku-Vos, I remain committed to you and your concerns that you have raised, similarly to you my sister, so we are going to have to take hands and make it work. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Minister. That comes to the end of the first interpellation. We move on the next one, I see the hon Minister Fritz.

Expungement of criminal records: possession of marijuana

2. Mr M Xego asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether his Department played a role in the review and possible expungement of criminal records of persons who were arrested for the possession of marijuana, which weighed less than 10g, before the ruling made by the Constitutional Court in September 2018?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much member, hon member Xego. The Department unfortunately, was not involved. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. We move over to hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In terms of the Constitution, Minister, the Constitution operates respectively which means therefore that in terms of its own interpretation, in terms of operating, it invalidates the previous records that are there. Now, the question that we want to understand, in terms of the high-level of unemployment that is out there, this has got a direct impact on the records and people being able to get jobs.

So, in that light how would the Department be assisting those people that are affected, to ensure that we invalidate the records that are there because this court case is a clear indication that that amount of dagga does not warrant a person to continue with that kind of thing, to try and curb the issues of unemployment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. We move over to hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I think in line with what member Xego was saying now; I think we would find from all the benches in the House agreement that unemployment is one of the contributing factors to crime. What the judgment says is that these people who have been convicted of this, were wrongly convicted – that is what it should mean because that court, in analysing the Constitution, says that having that small package, I do not know how much, is it 10 grams, is not illegal if you use it privately. I also think in the same breath, as long as it does not affect others, I want to question these people now having a criminal record and not being able to get employment. What is the Minister willing to do, using whatever avenues, to assist in making sure that these comrades at least have legal ... [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I see the hon member Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, allow me to provide some context. On the 31 March 2017, Mr Prince, Mr Acton and Mr Rubin brought a case before the Constitutional Court to lift long-standing incriminating law on the plant. The court ruling was a massive success and the rest is history, but further context would be that it is important that everyone is treated fairly.

Currently in our law that marijuana users are not yet in the clear. We understand that although private use and possession of the plant is now legal, there are still many grey areas and hurdles surrounding its exact legal status. A memorandum must be drawn up by the National Government, by September 2020 that lays out the exact laws and regulations in this regard and this must be voted on in the National Parliament once completed.

To the hon member, if a criminal record for possession of marijuana is more than 10 years old and the accused has no other offences and has not served jail time, an application can be made to the Director-General of Justice and Constitutional Development along with a police certificate that shows the offence is older than 10 years. Thereafter a certificate of expungement will be issued if the application is successful. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Allen. I move back over to hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: [Inaudible.] confused me with hon Maseko that side.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, not Maseko.

Mr M XEGO: Okay, no it is fine. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. No, what we wanted to understand, hon Minister, is your support of this proposal that we are coming with, in order to do away with these high records of unnecessary packaging and the limitation and the use of this. So we want to understand, from your Department, how would you be able to be of assistance in ensuring that – we understand the process that hon Allen has been explaining over there – but we want to understand from your side, what would be your contribution?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you. The question on the Order Paper is very clear; it asks me what my involvement in it was. Now just for the record, I said we were not involved, but I think there is a legal question which the hon Kama raised – and the hon Kama thinks that after a thing is changed in the Constitutional Court that something is not a crime anymore, that if you have committed a crime – I think hon Regan Allen explained the whole issue around expungement and I think we perhaps must stick to that.

I think that the dilemma that we have, in general for people with criminal records, is a big problem. I think that is the issue. It is not whether we agree with smoking dagga or not. The issue is around the criminal record and I think that is a nice new debate that we can enter into and look at how can we look at that specific issue because remember when a young boy was caught with one stop he was taken to prison. That has now changed. I think I would engage with you and I would like that process rather than looking as if we are condoning anything, but we can talk. Thank you, hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Fritz. That is the end of Interpellations. We now move over to Questions, in terms of Rule 202 and I recognise the hon Minister Madikizela.

Questions for oral reply

Questions standing over from Thursday, 29 August 2019, as agreed to by the House:

Hout Bay taxi route

4. Mr L L Mvimbi asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

Whether the Cape Town–Hout Bay taxi route is suspended; if so, (a) by whom, (b) since when and (c) why?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

4. No, the taxi operations on the Cape Town-Hout Bay route are not suspended. However, two route associations, namely the Central Unity Taxi Association, affiliated to CODETA, and CATA, affiliated to the Wynberg-Hout Bay Taxi Association, were administratively suspended in terms of the provisions of Section 7 (a) to (2) (b) of the Western Cape Transport Act Amended Law, Law 8 of 1996 for non-compliance with the code of conduct and standard constitution governing all municipal bus and taxi associations in the Western Cape. The administrative suspensions were imposed by the Provincial Transport Registrar. The administrative suspension of the respective registration certificate is effective from 27 March until 27 September 2019 and the two associations were administratively suspended as a result of violence and conflict between their members in the Hout Bay area. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Mr L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Now, Minister, in all of this suspension was there any communication to those affected by this suspension and also was it done in writing or was it done verbally?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Well definitely, as I said, when such a decision is taken, the Registrar informs the effected member associations in writing, with a stipulated timeframe, as I have just said now. The suspension is up until the 27 of this month. On the 27th of this month, it is going to be uplifted, it is going to be business as usual to all the taxi operators in the area.

I do just want to clarify the point of administrative suspension, hon member Mvimbi. The taxis are operating. It is not as if they are not operating but the only thing they may not do, for example, is to engage the provincial regulating entity about any responsibility of that entity, whether it is additional operating licences etcetera, etcetera, until after the 27th of September because of the violence that happened there. That is the reason why they were administratively suspended but they are operating as taxi associations. It is administration suspension that we are talking about, not necessarily the operations in terms of them doing their normal work of picking up passengers.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. We are using the word suspended but is it not true that the Cape Town-Hout Bay taxi route has actually been cancelled and this would be in terms of the roll-out of BRT because the rules of introducing a BRT system is that you engage with the operators that operated on the route previously and they exit the taxi industry and they become part of the operations and the MyCiti in this case, which is the BRT Programme.

So, I am not sure if the Minister has been given the wrong information, if we are talking about suspension instead of actually just speaking about it as it is, which is that the route is actually cancelled as a taxi route and that no new public transport operating licences would be issued on that route because of it would compete with the BRT?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, I have not been given the wrong information. I think it is correct that there are two routes here. I think we need to clarify that point, through you, hon Deputy Speaker. There is the Hout Bay-Camps Bay all the way to Cape Town route, that is the one that member Herron is referring to which is being operated by the BRT.

But the route that we are talking about is the Cape Town-Wynberg all the way to Hout Bay route, and that is the route that we are talking about which is operated in by a number of taxi associations. This is where the administrative suspension has been given to taxi associations until the 27th, hon Deputy Speaker.

Provincial Halaal Abattoir

6. Mr P Marran asked the Minister of Agriculture:

With reference to the proposed Provincial Halaal Abattoir:

What protection measures will his Department put in place regarding existing abattoirs and butcheries who might be put out of business when the Provincial Halaal Abattoir for the export market is launched?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and to the hon member who asked the question. The reply is as follows:

6. There will be no future or current abattoirs being affected because the plan was initially to establish an industrial park for Halaal exports.

The risk of such an initiative would have been that people would have to relocate to an industrial park and with no incentives. Certainly we had to rethink the strategy and so this Government has committed itself. Instead of building an Halaal agri-park in a centralised space, within the Cape Winelands area, this Government has decided to rather promote the Western Cape as an Halaal export destination than to build a specific park.

But, given the growth in terms of meat globally, there was a 1,4% growth and we foresee that it will have no effect or any negative impact on any of the current abattoirs. In fact, in terms of the global demands for Halaal food, there will be more support required, there will be more abattoirs required and I therefore see no risk for any abattoirs currently in operation. In fact there might be a need or a demand specifically for black people in the abattoir-halaal export market industry.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agbare Speaker, baie dankie. Ek sou graag as die agbare Marran hier was wou sê dankie dat hy hierdie vraag gevra het en dat hy so 'n fokus plaas op die produksie en die potensiaal van produkte van Moslem-gelowiges, maar deur u aan die Minister; Minister, kan u dalk aandui watter voordele hierdie inisiatief en hierdie fokus op die produksie van Halaal-produkte reeds vir die Wes-Kaapse ekonomie ingehou het? Ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, thank you. I would have liked to say thank you to the hon Marran, if he had been here, for asking the question, and that he is placing such a focus on the production and the potential of products of Muslim believers, but through you to the Minister; Minister, can you perhaps indicate which benefits this initiative and this focus on the production of Halaal products have had for the Western Cape economy? I thank you.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The biggest Muslim population in South Africa is based here in the Western Cape and it therefore makes sense to have a discussion on this particular matter. We have seen, and in fact one of my strategic priorities in the Department of Agriculture is to grow our export markets.

In 2017, for example, we had six international Halaal buyers to the Western Cape and I think that was just the beginning and I think the Government, through the Department of Economic Development and Opportunities, has done some great work in 2017, at the time. But last year in 2018 we had 20 international Halaal buyers for our products from the Western Cape. We also had 60 Halaal local exhibitors of Halaal products. In 2017, when we invited the six international buyers to the Western Cape, they spent some time here in the Western Cape, hon Van der Westhuizen, they spent three days here in the Western Cape and we have concluded Halaal export products of a total value of R85 million for the next five years. That was in 2017.

Last week, the officials of this Government were looking at the 2018 figures in terms of the impact on the economy of the Western Cape and it shows that we had export Halaal deals of R180 million. So up from R85 million to R180 million. My target now, together with this Government, is to get to a target of over R200 million for this year.

So, I think there are clear benefits for this and globally there is a big demand for Halaal food and I am particularly happy that this Government has put a strategic plan in place in terms of capitalising and benefiting for the people, for the industry but also in terms of the global growth that we are seeing. In fact many of the global economic growth is in the consumption economies and certainly with the Halaal export certification that is happening here, and every month in the Western Cape, we have 1600 licenced applications for exports.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Adjunkspeaker, deur u aan die Minister; Minister, kan u dalk vir ons sê watter internasionale lande, watter buitelandse lande stel belang in ons Halaal-produkte, en hoe sien u die toekoms en hoe dink u kan die Wes-Kaap homself nog verder bemark om hierdie uitvoerpotensiaal te verwesenlik? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, through you to the Minister; Minister, can you perhaps tell us which international countries, which foreign countries are interested in our Halaal products, and how do you see the future and how do you think the Western Cape can still further market itself to achieve this export potential? Thank you.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon member Van der Westhuizen. I think I have made it absolutely clear that this Government has shifted from the initial industrial park approach, to a more Western Cape Halaal export orientation approach, in terms of our destination marketing. This Government, through the work of my Cabinet colleague, Minister Maynier and Wesgro, are planning to have Africa Halaal Week, so that is part of the future plans. This Africa Halaal Week is going to take place between 7 and 9 of October 2019 at the Cape Town International Convention Centre. Halaal buyers are invited from the following countries: in particular India, as you know 1,3 billion people. I think the hon member will love that; from Malaysia, from Singapore, from Mozambique, from Oman, Saudi Arabia, United Arab Emirates, also Nigeria, Ivory Coast, Ghana and more recently, also aggressively, in the market of the United States, as well as the market of the United Kingdom.

This year, hon Van der Westhuizen, we are also targeting more aggressively Africa and the Middle East, but also the United Kingdom, the United States and also Belgium [Inaudible.]

As we have seen, hon Deputy Speaker, Halaal is a growing international market and we are positioned in the Western Cape to benefit from this market share. Also hon member Van der Westhuizen, what we are currently busy with – in fact earlier in July this year – I met some state vets from Qatar.

They came to visit us and I had some meetings with them and they also came to visit some of our Halaal certified abattoirs here in Malmesbury, in Gouda. So they are particularly interested in further engagements with us.

I would also like to announce, hon Deputy Speaker, to the hon member that from 18 to 31 October this year, the officials of this Government will have an outbound mission to the Middle East, to specifically look at the Halaal export standards and particularly the regulatory framework in the Middle East because there is some work that we need to do in terms of our regulatory framework.

To sum up, hon Deputy Speaker, I want to thank the hon member Marran for bringing this particular matter to this House. I think it is of strategic significance and importance to grow our international market share as part of the Halaal export destination. From Project Khulisa, it is reported that we want at least to grow our Halaal export market from the current 1% to 2% as part of the global Halaal export market. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see no further responses. We move over to the new questions ... Sorry, hon Van der Westhuizen. I see you.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, may I just ask the Minister, when he speaks about the Halaal meeting, is that spelt meet or meat? [Laughter.] Thank you.

New questions

Old J J du Pre Le Roux Clinic: Drakenstein

1. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:

Whether the building of the old J J du Pre Le Roux Clinic in Drakenstein is available to be used as a frail care facility for the patients of the Rusthof Old-Age Home; if not, why not; if so, (a) what are the relevant details and (b) how far are the negotiations pertaining to this building being utilised as a frail care facility?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

1. The Department of Public Works is the custodian of the buildings that are not utilised by Health so we handed it back in 2017.

In terms of what will happen to the building, one must ask the Department of Public Works. Thank you.

*National Department of Human Settlements: housing subsidy***2. Mr D America asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

(a) What is the current housing subsidy given by the national Department of Human Settlements and (b) what impact does this subsidy have on the delivery of decent and humane housing opportunities by his Department?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and in the member's absence I will first answer the (a) part and then the (b) part but to ensure that the member gets a comprehensive answer I will also attach a complete schedule of what I am about to say, as it is quite comprehensive, hon Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

2. The Annexure gives a complete breakdown of the subsidy quantum and also the various grant levels to this quantum, but it is also important to note that the subsidy has remained unchanged, hon Deputy Speaker. Among others, this schedule also includes the A and B Grade Engineering Services for IODPs and UISPs and although the National Government indicated that services for the upgrade of informal settlements should be B Grade, the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements in 2014 took a decision that all services will be A Grade as we believe in giving our residents the best as far as possible.

Allow me to quote from a circular which was sent out by HOD, Mr Thando Mguli, to all municipal managers in the Western Cape on 26 September 2014.

"The Western Cape Department of Human Settlements takes the A Grade level of services as the default standard for all IODP and UISP projects"

To the member's (b) part, hon Deputy Speaker. Due to current economic climate and fiscal constraints in the country, my Department's Medium Term Expenditure Framework allocations, with regard to both the equitable share and Human Settlements development grant, have been reduced.

As a result there was a reduced number of units – and I have attached a table as well for the member to give a comprehensive breakdown for the last five years. It should also be noted that in some instances contractors or developers are unable to complete a 40 square metre unit with the current housing subsidy quantum, hon Deputy Speaker.

The increase in the cost of building material and labour has also negatively impacted on the delivery of the said category but hon Deputy Speaker, despite the reduced budget my Department was still able to assist beneficiaries in acquiring properties via the Finance Linked Individual Subsidy Programme of FLISP, as well as the [Inaudible] linked individual subsidy or CLISP, who would otherwise not have been able to acquire their own homes. Because we want to improve on the delivery of

service sites to beneficiaries, which includes access to basic services over the past five years, then hon Deputy Speaker, we do seek to find solutions to our challenges even though we are, actually as a Department, a provincial department, not a stumbling block in this instance. Thank you.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I just want to find out from the Minister, how are you informing, or how are you sensitising the municipalities about this subsidy; if it is possible for them to use the subsidy for housing with other programmes within their human settlements for housing opportunities? Is that the case and if it is not the case how are you allocating any subsidy for that matter; if one person wants to buy a house that you have already built within the municipality?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you for the question, hon member Maseko. What my Department is doing, is having outreaches, across all municipalities, and as a practical example, we will be having one in the Mossel Bay constituency to inform possible beneficiaries, or those that wish to register to become beneficiaries, over this weekend regarding the various products which the Human Settlements Department offers for them.

Pertaining to your IRDPs and your UISPs, hon member, we are engaging municipalities because we ultimately fund their proposals which is in the current project pipeline but we also sensitise them to the harsh reality that is facing us and how we will need to prioritise and bring it to the future.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Hon Minister ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry hon member can you just switch your mic on and repeat the question for the record please?

Ms L M MASEKO: Oh.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, sorry apologies.

Ms L M MASEKO: Sorry. Thank you very much. I just want to find out if the National Department is giving any allocation, any funding for the development of women in the construction business within the province?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon member Maseko, in short, no. But my Department, within its own budget, the budgetary allocation that we receive, has set a specific target but I should emphasise that we have not been able to meet that target because there has not been an emphasis placed on reaching these women in construction, but once again, earlier today, I did attend a construction expo where I actually engaged these stakeholders as well because we do need more women in this sector.

*Drommedaris Housing Project***3. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

(a) How many title deeds were issued as part of the Drommedaris Housing Project in cooperation with the Drakenstein Municipality, (b) how many beneficiaries could not be located to whom these title deeds should have been issued and (c) how many of the houses linked to these title deeds are occupied by the original applicants?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon member Philander, thank you for the question. The reply is as follows:

3. Question (a) 1162 title deeds were issued. Your (b) part, we could not reach or allocate 426 beneficiaries, (c) the reason for is firstly, the Municipality does not have the capacity nor the mandate to conduct investigations to determine whether or not the original applicants are still in occupation. It should also be noted that prior to taking occupation of the dwellings, beneficiaries are required to attend a consumer education workshop. One of the key modules in this programme is that beneficiaries should not lease or sell the properties within the eight-year pre-emptive right clause, hon member.

Furthermore, it should be noted that every effort is made by the municipalities to ensure that beneficiaries collect their title deeds. This is done by way of letters to the beneficiaries, telephone calls, emails, if addresses are available, or via the ward councillors and public participation and notifications to local newspapers for their area. So we do try to reach everybody.

Mr M KAMA: Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker. I do not know if I heard the Minister correctly in terms of the (b) part of the question. I think he said about 426. Now I want to check where are these people, what is happening because I did not get any reason? I think this is quite a huge number of people that have not been located and given their title deeds.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am also worried about the high numbers but this is not just an anomaly to this specific area which the question relates to. Over the last 107 days I have visited 80% of all municipalities and this seems to be a widespread anomaly. If you go to the houses where we are supposed to find the beneficiaries, other people have either moved in, the legal owners have rented out the houses or they have totally moved out of the area before being able to attain the title deed. So this is a matter of concern because the National Minister has emphasised that we need to ensure title deed transfer, to ensure ownership but if people are not reachable what can we do? We have done everything humanly possible, so it is out of our hands if we cannot reach these people.

[Questions 4 and 5 standing over.]

*Kannaland: Human Settlements plans***6. Mr G Bosman asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether his Department has Human Settlements plans for Kannaland over the next two years; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, hon member Bosman. The reply is as follows:

6. Yes, and there is a table which I will submit to you which actually outlines the project over the next two years for this area. Now the House will also recall that my seven non priority projects are – Zoar, which is in your constituency, forms part of this hon member, because I am committed to rolling out the Small Town Regeneration Programme. One of these is the Zoar SDF Project because the development of our rural communities is very important to me, but not only our development's plan but I will also be keeping a hawk's eye on this project given the nature of the area where it will be happening, Madam Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

[Questions 7 and 8 standing over.]

*Violence and the effect on children***9. Ms N G Bakubaku-Vos asked the Minister of Social Development:**

With reference to her utterances at the African Regional Child Trauma Conference that children have become so desensitised to violence and murders in their communities that they tend to run towards violence instead of away from it:

Whether her Department has programmes in place to address this; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank Ms Bakubaku-Vos for the question. It talked about being desensitised to violence and yes, indeed violence has now crossed all boundaries in our society and become normalised. You could be killed for a cigarette or a cell phone.

9. The Department of Social Development acknowledges the role that other departments as well as service delivery departments play in addressing violence. All the departments' local offices, besides court support services, offer trauma counselling services for children or provide assessments and referrals for this purpose. These services are aimed at treating the symptoms of trauma including post-traumatic stress disorder, emotional blunting and desensitisation to violence.

In addition the Department funds certain specialised organisations to work in this field and services are rendered on different levels. Besides individuals, therapeutic counselling and training is offered to victims and families and staff working in the skilled psycho social grief support groups are also offered for children and parents exposed to trauma.

There is also a new interesting approach where community members who were often exposed to violence in their lives are informed now on how to support others. The Eye on the Child Project supports family members and communities that need support services, and Isibindi workers offer support in the life space of a family to also support children to access basic services. Various drop-in centres are available where children can be assisted. Anti-bullying programmes are available and as part of our independent living programme for children in alternative care, children are exposed on how decision making impacts on behaviour.

We also support new approaches. For example, our service partners use music and storytelling and the arts to facilitate inner healing. Other programmes that are offered by the Department and NGOs are various parenting programmes for parents in order to enable them to support their children and identify children that need early intervention when they are potentially at risk. Thank you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I just want to check with the Minister: how many trauma counsellors were trained by your Department during the last financial year to address the counselling?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: To the hon member, I do not have the figure here right now but I will certainly get the detail and provide that to the House. Thank you.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Hon Minister, is that allocated within the district or the municipalities and if that is the case, is it possible to get the information to that effect?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I cannot tell you whether it is broken down to district or municipal level because Social Development works in regions and we have six regions across the country. So it would be the East, West, Overstrand and services are rendered in that way. So there are six regional offices and 37 site offices but I will get the detail, once again, and provide that to the House.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can the Minister perhaps tell us how organisations working with art therapy can get access to some of the resources where they want to collaborate and whether those organisations need to apply as part of the Grant in Aid process or whether there is a partnership that they enter into with the Department?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon member Bosman. There is a funding cycle. We are going into the new funding cycle which starts next year, so anyone who wants to obtain funding, it is done over a three-year period but I also work very closely with Minister Marais in terms of sports, arts and culture, so there are inter-departmental referrals for funding. Where we can fund or look at partnerships, especially private public partnerships, we will support that in trying to get the arts into the healing process.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. My question would be to the Minister. Hon Minister, we have seen programmes like Isibindi that are keeping the children off the street. In rural areas it has closed down, in particular in the Karoo, Murraysburg. What is the plan moving forward? I hear there are new programmes coming in but I see also that programmes are closing. What is the reason for that?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member, the Isibindi Programme closed in Murraysburg because the service provider that used to work there, Annex, actually closed down. I have identified it, being familiar with the area, so the Central Karoo is one of my top priorities to ensure that we get those services back up and running again, especially in Murraysburg, which is the furthest part of the province.

Illegal firearms: destruction of

10. Mr R I Allen asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) (a) What efforts have been made by SAPS in the province to speed up the destruction of illegal firearms which had been confiscated and
(b) what are the processes and requirements for the mass destruction of confiscated illegal firearms;
- (2) whether there are obstacles to the destruction of confiscated illegal firearms; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I must emphasise that this information is provided by the South African Police Services and so I will start off the first part. The reply is as follows:

10. (1) (a) These efforts include weekly interventions conducted at identified stations on firearms currently held in the South African Police Services and they call it a SAPS 13 room or store. You know SAPS, everything is numbers, so that is SAPS 13, an unlucky number; monthly monitoring and tracking of the state of readiness for the destruction of firearms and; bi-annual firearm destruction.

The (b) part of the question is the process stipulated in National Instruction 8 of 27, inter alia, that a ballistic test must be done on every firearm, etching to determine serial numbers where the numbers have been erased – remember most numbers are erased, so do the etching; lifting of possible fingerprints, in fact we are doing that. That is the protocol.

Administrative processes including forfeiture to the State with the necessary documentation; provincial audits to verify details of firearms; determine heritage value if yes, then not destroyed. If it is Jan van Riebeeck's gun then they keep it; national audit to finalise a list of firearms for destruction, prior to publication in the Government Gazette.

Then (2): a lack of suitable premises for the destruction of illegal firearms in the province. Currently all Western Cape firearms are destroyed in Gauteng. That is why from here to there it disappears in the meantime. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Any further responses? No. Thank you. We move over to Question 11. I see the hon Minister Fritz again. My apologies, one minute.

Mr M KAMA: My apologies again ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, if you can just ... Sorry, hon Minister, if you could just sit for a second.

Mr M KAMA: I think the Minister indicated that this information was provided by SAPS. I wanted to check what the Department is doing to ensure, through its oversight, that this is really happening, that we are not told that guns are being destroyed but it is not happening? They are battling in the streets. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is a very good question and we have in fact started to work out our protocols. In that regard, I just want to say that there are a number of different types of stuff that are confiscated. If you have ever visited the confiscation of the liquor at the airports, now there, there is a very proper oversight because we also deal with the Liquor Board and the Liquor Tribunal. Around the firearm story we are, with experts, looking at ensuring that what we get on paper is correct, because you know what happened to all those guns landing in Johannesburg, how they were stolen and brought back here and those people are in prison now and others are now being prosecuted. So I think in that context we are just looking at our systems to get them right.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Any further? Yes hon member Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I just want to check if I heard the Minister correctly when he, in his response, said that the Western Cape does not have a destruction place, all firearms are sent to Gauteng, I wanted to double-check if that is what he actually said?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, that is what the police said to me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further responses from that question? Yes hon member, I see you.

Mr P MARAIS: Hon Minister, if you do not have the answers I will accept a written one later but there is also an issue of people who have legally acquired a firearm, but they did not meet the deadline to re-register; does the Department consider that as illegal firearms to be confiscated, or are there any court procedures that have still not been finalised?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Marais, yes unfortunately if the deadline is missed. We had many of those cases now recently again.

Unfortunately it is illegal and they must go and hand them in at the police station. What they then do in terms of getting any form of licencing with the police, is that the firearm must be handed in, even if it is just for safekeeping. And we had many, many cases where it expired, before people could renew their licences. It is unfortunate, it is in fact a backlog and there is not enough manpower. That is part of the stuff that we are doing our oversight on.

Firearm proficiency testing

11. Mr R I Allen asked the Minister of Minister of Community Safety:

(a) How many police officers could not complete the firearm proficiency test due to the lack of ammunition in the province, (b) what impact does this have on the police service in the province and (c) what are the contingency measures put in place to ensure service delivery is not compromised?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is a very similar question and this is a very worrying kind of issue – and I want to thank the hon Allen for this question – because the question basically asked how many people could do their firearm competency or proficiency test. And there was a time when there was so much ammunition. There is now a lack of ammunition in the South African Police Services, that 2,607 – let me not *gooi* a Zuma here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: 2,607 – no, no wait, wait – [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: 2,607 police officers were scheduled to complete their proficiency firearm test ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... but because of a lack of ammunition, they could not do it. So that is unfortunate. And (b) it says it had a minimal impact on the service delivery, it was just a bit heavy for me. And then (c) operational demand has altered its shifts and employment so as to ensure that operations were not negatively impacted. But I think it is a very-very important question and now that they know that we are doing all that, they are actually quite vigilant around making sure that there is enough ammunition.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, can you just assist us with the first part of the answer again. You said 2,607 officers did not complete the firearms competency test; does that mean that they cannot carry firearms or does it mean that they can still continue with firearms and then are incompetent in carrying firearms? Just assist us with that please?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I think that we must clear up. They cannot carry firearms. You are not legally competent to carry, so you will be a bobby on the beach without a firearm. A London bobby with a kerie and a knobkerie.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Minister. In saying that they have not passed the competency test, what is the window period for them to comply in order to pass those tests, and who monitors that? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Botha. The minute the ammunition arrived, they could start and many of our protectors were in a very similar position – so someone said about the protector – by the way we work with our protectors, many times. Because we could not acquire arms for them, they could not go and do the test, so we do not need them sometimes.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Minister in part (c) of your answer you indicated that the operational contingency plans are being made or something to that effect. I am trying to understand if 2,607 people do not have firearms, what contingency plans do they make, what do they carry?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you. It is spread over the province and I want to remind you hon, this is about 9% of all the staff in the province, so it was spread over the province and shift bosses and managers could change all the shifts. I must say to you, it is an unacceptable situation and I am not defending them. I am saying it just shows how unsafe we are sometimes.

I am not pointing fingers again. I think generally there were good things. These are issues that come from centralised procurement; these are the examples of systemic problems within the public service. Like Health, when we wonder why tablets run out, it is because of centralised procurement, you know, one place, because someone wants to steal everything. Rather share the stealing. †Hul wil alles steel. [Gelag.] [They want to steal everything. [Laughter.]]

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. If I hear correctly, there is a serious challenge of people who could not carry firearms – it is not like they have failed – it is that there was no ammunition, so what is the province going to do to make sure that we prevent such going forward, because the Western Cape is the murder capital of South Africa and Africa in the world. So how are you going to make sure it does not happen in the near future? [Interjections.].

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is not even what they are doing ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: You will notice the problem has been solved.

It is what we have done, insisting on getting that procurement right, so that people have enough ammunition to be able to carry out their functions. I wanted to just say to the hon member, I am sorry I almost said luckily, but I had a very near death experience in Nyanga, so we know what we are talking about and we take it very seriously. [Interjection.]

Lapland, Vredenburg: healthcare facilities

12. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Health:

- (1) Whether there are healthcare facilities available in Lapland, Vredenburg; if so, what are the relevant details; if not;
- (2) whether there are plans to build healthcare facilities in Lapland; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

12. There is the Hanna Coetzee clinic which is open five days a week, from 07:30 to 16:30. In addition, we also have Community Development workers, I think seven, for outreach. There is also one sessional doctor that works there three times a week and also there is an outreach doctor that comes to visit the clinic six times a week.

The clinic sees about 300 people a day and the community that is there – if you look at it – it is not only for Lapland, but it also considers George [Inaudible.]. Witteklip, the Veldbou in Namaqua and also Lapland, that is what we have specifically for Lapland.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. To the Minister, I just want to find out, are there any plans in place because currently that community is actually experiencing problems. There is over population and some people go there and they go back home without getting any further assistance, so it is really creating a serious problem in that area.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, Vredenburg CDC, Community Day Centre, is in the pipeline. I think we will do the ground-breaking in July 2020. Remember that the Hanna Coetzee Clinic is also considered, although it is far, even for those who are coming from Hopefield – because they have a mobile there but they do not have a stationary clinic, so that is why we are building the Vredenburg CDC. The delay came in waiting for the Municipality in terms of the land so it is now confirmed. From the Public Works side, they have appointed the contractors and whatever. That is when we can go and do the ground-breaking or the sod turning but I think it is July 2020 for that.

Gender-based violence: measures to reduce

13. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether his Department has implemented measures to reduce gender-based violence and the number of rape cases in the province; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I am having a busy day. The Department of Community Safety in line with Section 206 (3) of the Constitution of South Africa, Act 108, conducts civilian oversight over the South African Police Services. During the oversight inspections, special emphasis is placed on ensuring that the prescripts relating to the Domestic Violence Act are adhered to at all times. Further to this, the Court Watching Brief Unit observes criminal cases in court, which include gender-based violence and a number of other sexual related cases.

They report on police inefficiencies where the criminal cases are scrapped from the court roll, because of the systemic failure and I think one of the ANC speakers, hon Kama, spoke in the early debate about the President calling for all the cases that were withdrawn to be reopened. Now the Court Watching Brief follows that dossier and actually reopens the case, and actually go and look at what the shortcomings were. I promise you, there were so many cases of people walking free.

So I think the President must have been informed by the National Minister, Mr Cele, around our Court Watching Briefs, because he has given an instruction that all Community Safety Departments in the country must also implement the Court Watching Brief and they came down for training. So the President is really taking a lot of lessons.

That is why the Deputy President is now praising the Premier and so on. [Interjections.] I must not say it looks like it. They talk substantive, factual evidence.

The Department also conducts awareness campaigns to highlight the issue of gender-based violence. During Women's Month ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I cannot hear myself.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I cannot hear you speak. Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: During Women's Month the Department held two events to raise and debate issues around gender-based violence. The first one was held on 9 August in Tulbagh, where members of accredited Neighbourhood Watch structures attended the event. The second event was held in Mitchells Plain on the 16 August. During these events the issue of gender-based violence was raised and different speakers addressed the audience on how to avoid becoming victims of gender-based violence but also how to deal with it in the event that you do become a victim.

More than 600 men and women attended the two events, and of course there is always meet-eat-and-greet at these events but then we give some lessons. With the coffee we give them some lessons. Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I know the Minister might not have the exact number answer, but if it can be provided, I wanted to check if, in terms of numbers, how many gender-based violence cases has the Department put on the Court Watching Brief and the successes thereof, the cases that were influenced by the Court Watching Brief?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I can tell the member. The member has read the Annual Report and it is all in the Annual Report. But I will go and check the Annual Report and I will give it to you in the next sitting of the House or a written answer. [Interjection.] Ja, he was there.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, is it possible for the Minister to tell us what type of co-operation does the Minister get from colleagues in the Justice Cluster, especially colleagues at the NPA and SAPS when these Watching Briefs are being put together? Are they co-operative and do they help or do they feel that it is intrusive?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Bosman for that question. For the record I want to say, that I, personally, I am not talking about the Government I am talking about when I ask very specific questions to the Director of National Prosecutions, I get excellent co-operation from him. I know the Court Watching Brief Unit, in some courts, prosecutors feel a bit threatened. I know of a case now in Malmesbury when one of our senior advocates was sitting in court, the magistrate said I must do this case properly. They all know the Deputy Director of Public Prosecutions is working for us now and the magistrate says I must do this because this particular advocate is in the court. So I think it has a lot of impact.

I know in Bellville, the head of that court, I can say the name because I think they must actually become - communities must know who is not working with departments. We want transparency, we want solutions to the gender-based violence. In Bellville the Chief Prosecutor has a problem with us, but she will come to her senses. We will continue to force and pressurise her to give us access to the dockets. We are assisting them, and we are taking criminals off the streets. And I think that is the power of the Court Watching Briefs.

Berg River Municipality: housing allocation

14. Mr M Xego asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

- (1) Whether it has been brought to his attention that community members from the Berg River Municipality have reported that houses due to them have been allocated to other people; if so, what are the relevant details; if not;
- (2) whether he will investigate and report back to the House; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Member Xego, thank you for the question. The reply is as follows:

14. Your first question: no, my Department has not received any reports of houses due to beneficiaries that were allocated to other people. Your second question: the matter will be investigated if concrete evidence can be presented to my Department, but it must be mentioned that all the locations in the Berg River Municipality are done in accordance with the approved allocation policy of the said council.

In addition, the beneficiary lists are workshopped, with a local representative committee, whereafter this list gets advertised for objections from the broader community. Only after all the objections are considered is the list finalised and approved for people to move in.

Mr M XEGO: Yes, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In most instances when there is an uprising you will find it has everything to do with the community protesting the housing list. So what we want to understand is how prepared is your Department going to ensure that that a municipality does not undergo such kinds of serious challenges on housing?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Member Xego, once again thank you. I actually do appreciate your question because this is a very contentious issue, wherever I have been in the 24 municipalities. That is why I believe in working with data that is believable for me to ensure that the correct beneficiary is a recipient of the state, through all our projects in the next five years.

That is why, during the months of October and November we will be having beneficiary verification and beneficiary registration weekends across the entire province and I have actually encouraged municipalities wherever I have gone; councillors and stakeholders, ensure that you encourage beneficiaries to actually participate in the weekend to update their data and if you wish to become a beneficiary of the state, to actually come and register over this weekend. I will give an example, a classic one. I was in Bitou two weeks ago where, according to the HSS system, the beneficiary already had a house he was not even aware of.

So, I am well aware what you are talking about and the problem is for me to ultimately curtail that in the next five years, to ensure that the data I work with is believable and that is why I am cleaning out the system and I am going to work with accurate data after the October-November registration weekends. So, I encourage everybody in the House to assist me in that as well. Thank you.

†Mnr G BOSMAN: Dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker. Kan die Minister dalk vir ons meer vertel oor die Toep wat sy Departement mee besig is om die data te gebruik, asseblief?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can the Minister perhaps tell us more about the App that his Department is busy with to use the data, please?]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In English, the App. In Afrikaans you call it a *Toep*. †Ek gaan maar in Afrikaans antwoord, agb Adjunkspeaker. Ja, ons is in die proses en die verifikasie- en registrasie-naweke is 'n aanloop, want gedurende Desember sal die BETA weergawe van ons Toep beskikbaar wees en ek beoog dat ons 'n provinsiale Toep teen Maart, April volgende jaar aktief en beskikbaar sal hê as 'n gratis Toep vir alle begunstigdes in hierdie provinsie.

Ek moet benadruk, hierdie gaan die eerste provinsie wees wat 'n deursigtige aktiewe Toep besit. Stellenbosch Munisipaliteit het nou wel 'n kleiner weergawe maar ons gaan 'n omvattende weergawe loods. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[I am going to reply in Afrikaans, hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, we are in the process and the registration and the verification is a run-up, because during December the BETA provincial version of our App will be available and I intend that we have a provincial version of our APP active and available by March, April next year as a free App for all beneficiaries in this province.

I have to stress, this is going to be the first province to own a transparent, active App. Stellenbosch Municipality does have a smaller version but we are going to launch a comprehensive version. Thank you.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Hon Minister, one of the loopholes is that some of the towns receive projects and have not updated their databases. I know that you now have an action in place to really talk to that, but where a municipality already now has a project, the beneficiary list has a loophole, like some of the people have passed away and then the municipality had to make sure that they fill in people to be beneficiaries there. What do you have in place to make sure that the municipalities have a structured way of ensuring who is going to benefit from those houses where a beneficiary has passed away?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you for the question, hon member Maseko. Before we considered the implementation of my idea to have the beneficiary verification registration weekends, I actually did issue a directive that gives guidelines for the criteria for beneficiaries that will get a state chance during the next five years. So, that is number one.

Number two is, I have also asked all municipalities across the province including the City of Cape Town, when last they updated and verified the correctness of the beneficiary database. I can say that I have received the data and I was shocked to see how long it has been since some of the municipalities have actually verified or updated their databases. Hence the idea of pushing for the verification weekends in October-November.

Like I said, this will be a first for a province to do it and that is why I am bringing along councillors and community organisations, because if anything upsets communities the quickest, it is an incorrect beneficiary list and we have seen that over the last 10 years as well.

Mr D SMITH: MEC, thank you. Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, just an example to get to my question. You would find that a beneficiary receives a house number, a plot number, all of that, but when it comes to the actual handover of the house, you would see that that beneficiary who receives plot number A, suddenly gets to receive the house at plot number X. Now if that is possible, anything is possible.

My question to you, MEC is: your officials in this Department have been there for many, many years, they know exactly how the system works and we are not necessarily blaming yourself, as the MEC. We are saying the system is manipulated by the officials in your Department and at municipal level as well.

Now what guarantee do you give us in this House today that the right people receive the houses at the level of the municipality? That is the one. Secondly, ... [Interjection.] Can I? Okay. The second one is, MEC ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): No-no, that is one question. [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: No there is an (a) and a (b) *mos*. This is (b). [Laughter.][Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Originality.

Mr D SMITH: Can I continue with (b)?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give this to him for being so creative. [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: There is a possible C coming.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...hon member. You have it for creativity.

Mr D SMITH: The (b) part is ... [Interjection.]

†'n AGB LID: Jy vat 'n kans!

[An HON MEMBER: You are taking a chance!]

Mr D SMITH: MEC, we need to understand, at what level are local politicians – mayors, councillors – allowed to be involved in this selection process of who gets houses or not? Are they at all allowed or is it ... [Interjections.] is there a guarantee that you can give us that your Department ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D SMITH: ... only officials in your Department are working with the allocation of houses to beneficiaries?

An HON MEMBER: It is a nightmare!

Mr D SMITH: Can you give us that guarantee, MEC? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, hon member.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†'n AGB LID: Julle verkoop sommer die huise!

[An HON MEMBER: You are just selling the houses!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I can recall that within the first 48 hours after I became a Minister, the issue in Forest Village relating to people moving in and people having letters for the specific houses arose. And I found it quite odd. †Hoe kan twee mense dieselfde plek wil besit? [How can two people own the same place?]

But what we need to understand is, when the Provincial Human Settlements Department submits a project plan to National, the way that that template is drawn up, is that they are fictitious addresses, fictitious stand numbers, just for their purposes, so you can get your funding, so you can roll out your project. That has been the norm for many, many years, even before I became the Minister. I was quite stunned by this to be quite frank.

And that is why, at our next Minmec in October, we are actually going to ask the National Department, because this is causing unnecessary tension and friction in our communities because one person receives a letter giving a specific number and it is an odd anomaly where at some projects the house number is exactly what that letter says they are going to get, but in actual fact that house now belongs to somebody else. So it is the way that the system is currently structured. One would need to find a way to work past that, but I have been able to explain to the broader community, it is not corruption. That is just the way for the process, so that we can get the funding to roll out the project.

We need to ensure the correctness of the lists, hence the need for this registration weekend and drive because some people have passed away, some municipalities – and there is one municipality in the Western Cape that have not reviewed their database for the last seven years - people have got married, people have died, people have moved to other provinces, and so forth and so on. So I want a total flush of the system and to work with a corrected system, so the correctness of the data can be utilised.

†*Politicians* mag nie betrokke raak met die allokasie van begunstigdes nie. [Politicians may not get involved with the allocation of beneficiaries.] That is why, and once again in the Highbury and the Forest Village model, we have a project steering committee that actually looks at the lists and they finalise how the list will look and the final list I just sign off, but nowhere in there is a councillor supposed to have political input on who gets a house. [Interjections.] That is the perfect system.

[Question time expired.]

[Question 15 stands over]

Questions and replies as received from departments

QUESTIONS

For written reply

Kidnappings

1. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) (a) How many kidnappings have been recorded in (i) 2015/16, (ii) 2016/17, (iii) 2017/18, (iv) 2018/19 and (v) 2019/20 to date and (b) for each year, how many of the victims were children;
- (2) whether the Western Cape SAPS has hostage crisis and negotiating teams; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

1. The South African Police Service informed me as follows:

- 1) (a) (i) 767
(ii) 616
(iii) 662
(iv) 681
(v) Statistics not yet released
- (b) (i) 160
(ii) 117
(iii) 156
(iv) 138
(v) Statistics not yet released

- (2) Yes, the Western Cape has 15 hostage crises and negotiating teams with 47 trained hostage negotiators spread throughout the province.

Vehicles: police stations

2. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) (a) What is the average mileage of vehicles at the (i) Kirstenhof, (ii) Fish Hoek, (iii) Ocean View and (iv) Muizenberg police stations and (b) when last were new vehicles provided to these police stations;
- (2) whether any new vehicles are contemplated for these police stations; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

2. The South African Police Service informed me as follows:

- (1) (a) (i) 223 078 km
(ii) 95 120 km
(iii) 166 961 km
(iv) 191 712 km
- (b) (i) During the 2014/2015 financial year
(ii) During the 2018/2019 financial year
(iii) During the 2018/2019 financial year
(iv) During the 2018/2019 financial year
- (2) (i) No, Kirstenhof SAPS has a surplus of vehicles and will therefore not receive any new vehicles at this stage.
- (ii) No, Fish Hoek SAPS has a surplus of vehicles and will therefore not receive any new vehicles at this stage.
- (iii) Yes, Ocean View SAPS will receive new vehicles during the current financial year.
- (iv) Yes, Muizenberg SAPS will receive new vehicles during the current financial year.

Planned upgrades: police stations

3. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether there are any planned upgrades or new buildings contemplated for the (a) Kirstenhof, (b) Ocean View and (c) Muizenberg police stations; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

3. The South African Police Service informed me as follows:

- (a) Kirstenhof SAPS is a leased property. The Department of Public Works is currently negotiating with the landlord in terms of repairs.
- (b) Ocean View SAPS is on the User Asset Management Plan (UAMP) for planned maintenance.
- (c) A repair and renovation finding has been requested by Department of Public Works to address critical issues at Muizenberg SAPS cells.

Lentegeur and Mitchells Plain police stations: staffing

4. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (a) What is the current staff complement at the (i) Lentegeur and (ii) Mitchells Plain police stations and (b) how many post are vacant?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

4. The South African Police Service informed me as follows:

- (a) (i) 161
- (ii) 513
- (b) (i) 54
- (ii) 38

Premier's GAP Programme

5. **Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Premier:**

- (a) How many students have participated in the Premier's GAP programme in the 2018/19 financial year and (b) from which areas in the province were they?

The PREMIER:

5. (a) In total there were 108 volunteers in 2018.

The programme runs for 10 months, not a financial year, but a calendar/school year.

(b) The volunteers were from the following areas in the province:

AREA	NUMBER OF STUDENTS
Philippi/Gugulethu/Crossroads/Nyanga	21
Khayelitsha	27
Samora Machell	2
Heideveld	2
Mitchells Plain	12
Muizenberg/Retreat/Steenberg	5
Mfuleni	2
Langa	2
Wynberg	2
Athlone	2

Delft	8
Eerste River	1
Manenberg	3
Blue Downs	1
Bonteheuwel	1
Kuil River	1
Montagu	1
Ravensmead	1
Dunoon	3
Brackenfell/Durbanville	2
Kensington	1
Blauwberg	1
Strand	2
Rosebank	1
Hanover Park	1
Ottery	1
Grassy Park	1
Westlake	1
Number of students who participated in the GAP Programme	108

West Coast schools: closure of

6. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Education:

(a) How many schools on the West Coast will be closed permanently, (b) what are the names of these schools, (c) what are the reasons for their closure and (d) how will the learners who are affected by these closures be accommodated by her Department?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

6. (a) There is currently an application being reviewed for the closure of two schools.
- (b) Proposed Closures: Lambert's Bay Primary School and Graafwater High School.
- (c) The proposed closures must be viewed within the context of the planning for educational provisioning within the broader Clanwilliam/ Graafwater/ Lambert's Bay/Eland's Bay area.

There are currently two schools in the Graafwater area that are 800m from each other, namely:

- Graafwater Primary School (Grades R – 7) with 335 learners
- Graafwater High School – takes in both primary and high school learners. (Grades R – 12) with 596 learners of which 371 learners are in Grades 8 – 12.

In Lambert's Bay, there are currently two schools that are 700m from each other, namely:

- Lambert's Bay Primary School (Grades R – 7) with 194 learners
- PW De Bruin Primary School (Grades R – 9) with 771 learners of which 131 learners are in Grades 8 and 9.

A review of the broader area highlighted a number of priority needs which include:

- the need for a high school in Lambert's Bay since 63% of projected high school numbers (for 2020) are learners from the Lambert's Bay and Eland's Bay areas.
- the need for both a Special School and School of Skills to provide better access to education for all learners in the West Coast.

Of the 371 Grade 8 – 12 learners currently at Graafwater High School, 192 come from the Lambert's Bay/Elands Bay area while 179 are from the immediate Graafwater area. Projections of 2020 high school enrolment show that the learners who come from the immediate Graafwater area make up a maximum of 37%.

Given the scenario above, and taking into account access to education, the cost of learner transport and learner safety, it was recommended by the Department to close Graafwater High School.

It has also been recommended that the building be utilised as a School of Skills and Special Needs School (75% and 25% split)- both of which are much needed in the area.

- (d) Since Graafwater Primary School is being renovated (and currently holds the capacity to accommodate all learners from Grades R – 7, it has been recommended that the 226 Grade R – 7 learners currently enrolled at Graafwater High School could be easily accommodated at Graafwater Primary School.

In a similar vein, the 194 learners of Lambert's Bay Primary School could be accommodated at PW De Bruin Primary School – with the 131 Grade 8 and 9 learners being enrolled at a high school.

INTERPELLATIONS:*Metrorail: strategy***1. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether a strategy to ensure that Metrorail provides a safe, affordable, reliable and efficient transport service to commuters has been discussed by the relevant stakeholders?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Let me thank hon member Christian for asking the question which is a very important question. It is very important because Mr Speaker, it impacts the residents of the Western Cape and also has a huge impact in our economy as the province. In order for us to achieve this, I think it is important, Mr Speaker, just to remind this House of the mandates of the Department of Transport and Public Works as far as this is concerned and also the mandate of the National Department. And, Mr Speaker, I do want emphasise, I think it is one of the very first issues that myself and Minister Mbalula spoke about because for us to be able to fix this, hon member Christians, through you, Mr Speaker, I cannot emphasise enough the importance of inter-governmental relations and co-operative governance.

That is a commitment that we have made, myself, the leadership of PRASA and the Minister in order for us to be able to deal with the challenges here because my role really is very limited as the Provincial Minister. We all know that PRASA, as an entity, owns this infrastructure and also the rolling of the stock is also the responsibility of PRASA, which means then that we will need that working relationship between PRASA and myself.

The limited role that I can play of course, is to make sure that we work in partnership with PRASA and the Department to make sure that the safety aspect is dealt with in our trains because we do know that if you were to categorise the challenges that are faced by Metrorail, in particular, in that we are dealing with ageing infrastructure, which is again the role of the National Department and PRASA to deal with; we are grappling with the management of PRASA, which is again an issue that we raise very sharply.

We had a very constructive engagement yesterday with Dr Sishi, who is the head of PRASA. And in fact one of the very first things I said is that I do not think there is anything bad that I have not heard about PRASA so it is not going to help me to dwell on everything that is bad about PRASA. I said to the PRASA management and to the National Minister what I want us to focus on is how do we fix the challenges that are facing PRASA? How do we partner meaningfully so that we can address the challenges that are faced by our passengers in the Western Cape?

I do want to say that the positive news is that all major stakeholders have developed strategies to address at least some of the major shortcomings and in brief these are: the Department of Transport, nationally, is finalising the National Rail Strategy in conjunction with the World Bank.

This includes crucially taking a position on rail devolution because you will remember, just putting politics aside, that there was a call for rail function to be devolved and in fact that call was also amplified by the Premier of Gauteng and the Minister is applying his mind to this issue and of course we are dealing with it constructively and maturely as the leadership. The Department of Transport has also published a draft rail White Paper. PRASA is implementing a rescue plan in which it acknowledges the current low levels of service and growing customer dissatisfaction and it plans to do the following ... [Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon Minister for that. I wanted to ask the Minister: there is a promise that they will build a provincial rail service, so how far are they with that? But more seriously, people are losing their lives and people's lives are in danger when they enter the train. I have got the figures here. In 2018, 495 people lost their lives on the trains and 2079 were injured.

Now we know that the trains are a cheap way of commuting to work but people are too scared to use this train service. So the Minister has said – because I know the responsibility of the national, provincial and local – they have these rail enforcements units where they work together and I heard that they are extending the contract but it seems to me that it is not paying dividends because of all these injuries, all these fatalities that we have on the rail line.

I just heard, not so long ago, on the South rail line, four gunmen entered the carriage and people had to jump. So we must look after the safety and I think the Province can play an important role when it comes to the rail enforcement unit. So what is the Minister doing because safety is a problem when our people get on the trains and a lot of our females need to go early in the morning and late at night. So, hon Minister this is a really serious issue and I want you to really unpack for us how can we go out to our communities and say use the trains, because we also know the trains are underutilised because people are using other modes of transport so they are not even utilised.

We also know about cable theft and all of that. Metrorail is unreliable, people do not get to work on time, services are cut but I think the integral part is the safety of the commuters, hon Speaker.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to the Minister. Hon Speaker, according to a reply to a parliamentary question, only 34,4% of the PRASA-run train stations in the Western Cape have at least one CCTV camera. Now given that a Memorandum of Agreement has just been signed between the City of Cape Town, the Provincial Department of Transport and Public Works as well as PRASA, to extend the deployment of the Provincial Rail Enforcement Unit, how will the lack of CCTV cameras in train stations affect safety on the trains in the Western Cape and can the Minister provide any further details on the issue and how he would address this? Thank, you hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mitchell. Is that a point of order hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Alright because we are dealing with interpellations.

Mr P J MARAIS: Oh.

The SPEAKER: It is only for the designated speakers but on the questions later, let us pray that there is one on this subject. Alright, thank you hon member. Hon member Herron?

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Let me start by welcoming the extension of the Rail Enforcement Unit that was announced yesterday. There was a lot of time and work that went into getting that unit set up. Hon Speaker, the DA manifesto of 2016, Local Government manifesto and the 2019 Election manifesto, both advocate for the rail function to be devolved to metropolitan governments or to cities and I think this is the correct approach if we want to have one integrated public transport network for commuters to move around towns and cities easily.

But despite the content of the 2016 and 2019 DA manifestos, in the City of Cape Town during the election campaign, we had posters promising a provincial rail service. We also have the City recently announcing that it is procuring a business plan for devolution of rail to the city and we have the Western Cape Provincial Government talking about, even as recently as this morning, the rail function being devolved to the Province. So we have these conflicting positions within the DA around the future of rail. We have the Provincial Government talking directly to private companies about operating a private service on the rail network, so I would really appreciate if the Minister, who is also the leader of the DA in the province, if he could clarify what the DA's vision is for rail and why there are these contradictions and does the DA want to operate Metrorail as the operator or is it looking to have the rail network devolved to itself or to the City? I would submit to this House that seeking the devolution of the rail function in the form of Metrorail's operations would be an absolute disaster for whoever took it on. Thank you, hon Speaker.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. The topic talks about relevant stakeholders and most of the time we like to take the stakeholders to be either PRASA, the Government, Provincial Government or the City. Very rarely do we also regard the commuters as critical stakeholders and I just – because I believe strongly in public participation and in a participatory democracy and you can only do that if you involve the critical stakeholders, who are the customers.

I know the hon Speaker cut you off just as you were about to talk about customer satisfaction but I would like to know to what extent do you really involve the commuters on the issues of rail. And also then just to be specific because I know there are other organs of civil society that are actively campaigning for safer rail commuting, like the United Commuter Voice, there might be others; I just want to know to what extent are they involved in this thing?

Also, with regard to the issue of ageing infrastructure, have you got some way of quantifying this so that you know what the figures involved are? If you are saying that the infrastructure is ageing, how much is it going to cost to actually repair or to service the ageing infrastructure? Thank you, hon Speaker.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Just to carry on where I left off, I just also want to emphasise what hon Mitchell said and as we read there are 122 stations and only 42 have CCTV cameras. Is the Department looking at that, and we are talking again about safety, rolling those things out, rolling the safety of our people out?

Another problem when speaking to communities if trains do not show up, they can use alternative transport, the buses, unless there is an arrangement. Now we know that the people that use trains are poor and they have limited funds when it comes to public transport and people – and I have got a lot of reading here – but the one thing is 27 passenger trains were cancelled on one day because of cable theft, then people must look at alternative modes of transport and yet I cannot use my weekly or my monthly ticket to get on a bus unless there is a prior agreement.

So can the Minister say, what is the thinking around that and how can we assist the people because people want to get to their work on time and sometimes these things happen over the weekend. Another important thing is that we also know that the sets, the units are vandalised on a continuous basis and that talks again about, you are facing ageing infrastructure but you also have vandals when it comes to trains, arson and all of that. Does the Minister know, is there intelligence to show us who are the culprits behind these things? I heard a discussion the other day saying it could be the taxi industry because then they have more commuters and did they do an in-depth study in order to bring these perpetrators to book? I thank you, hon Speaker.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Firstly to hon member Christians, the impact of the Rail Enforcement Unit is really working. Looking at the last operation in terms of the contract that we are now renewing, it really has reduced some of the crime of cable theft significantly but I think part of what we agreed to do now is to change the modus operandi in two ways.

One, is to make sure that there is an investigative capacity, again within the REU, because as you know that is where we are facing some challenges, but also to make sure that in terms of the problematic routes and lines, we change the modus operandi and make sure that we have more law enforcement agencies on those trains, rather than them waiting somewhere. I think on the issue of CCTV cameras, which was also raised by member Mitchell, the accurate figure is actually 25% of those that are not working. Out of about 8000 CCTV cameras it is about 2000 that are not working and I think PRASA is dealing with that.

Another good thing that has been done by PRASA in line with the call by the National Minister to have a “war room” to relook at all the challenges.

There is a “war room” again that has been set right here in Cape Town and I will be visiting that “war room” on Monday so that we have closer co-operation in terms of dealing with these issues.

To hon member Herron, I think I partly agree with you member Herron, because you are quite right, there is a discussion currently as to where should the responsibility be if we are to talk about devolution, where should the responsibility be? We must appreciate that when we talk about rail transport it cuts across the province, it is not just a mode of transport that is used by Metro and we are having those discussions because it must be placed where it will service the entire province instead of just devolving it to the Municipality. So it is part of the conversations that we are continuing to have.

In terms of the stakeholders, hon member Mvimbi, a customer satisfaction survey was done to interact with the commuters. If you look at the challenges that we are facing in rail transport, in particular, most of the comments are coming from the commuters themselves and that is why the interventions that we are now coming up with are based on the views that are coming from the commuters themselves around the issues of safety, around the issues of aging infrastructure and the stock.

In fact where we are now, we should have about 88 trains. We are sitting at 57 because of the vandalism and arson that has taken place. But, there is a very clear commitment, I think before the end of this year, to increase the number of trains. We are looking at between 63 and 65 but ultimately we want to end at 88 because that is what we need to operate at full capacity.

In terms of the issue that was raised again by yourself, the impact of the REU in terms of the safety ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am afraid I will have to do the same thing. Please wrap up.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The last thing I want to say is that I was actually criticising PRASA yesterday for under-reporting on the successes because we always focus on what is bad but they were telling me yesterday that the convictions of people involved in arson is over 200 years in prison already. So it is something that I was criticising them for, that we need to improve on, to communicate. Thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

Police stations: rape kits

2. Mr M Xego asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether all the police stations in the province are equipped with sufficient rape kits?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I must just indicate that this answer was provided to me by the police and I will bring my oversight role in the answer. I just want to state that up front. Thank you for the question from the EFF.

According to the police, the majority of police stations in the Western Cape currently have rape kits available. These kits are either at police stations or at the family violence or child protection and sexual offenses units, called FCS Units, located throughout the province. These FCS units are end-users of these kits as sexual offences fall within their primary mandate. There are very specialised, trained people in those units. In Beaufort West for instance, they must travel down to the other parts or in Oudtshoorn they must come over the mountain.

The Department of Community Safety will however, during the period October 2019 to December 2019, as part of our response to the gender based violence campaign, be conducting and monitoring and embarking on a project in respect of the implementation of the Forensic Procedures Act. This will include verifying the availability of rape kits. The monitoring project was designed in collaboration with the National Secretariat of Police and will focus on a random sample of 21 police stations which were selected from those priority stations.

There is a list of the 21 police stations but I do not want to read the names because I think one wants to have an element of surprise and the whole issue of making it unannounced is so that you do not announce it before the time. But there are a whole lot of them from the Metro police stations right up the West Coast, right up the East Coast, in the Cape Winelands region, right in the Eden region. All of those regions are included in this list of 21 stations that we are going to tackle and make sure that the Act is implemented.

The overarching issue is that the women and children of our province are not safeguarded by our criminal justice system and that is what we want to make sure of – I think we need to play that role, make sure that our women and children are safeguarded by the criminal justice system. This has been highlighted time and time again by media reports and events in court and of course, it was again brought out by the recent crime stats that we have just seen. The prevalence of gender-based violence and the femicide in our country has reached preposterous levels, very bad levels and I think the President spoke about it yesterday.

It is now the new thing. I have said for years – when I was in Social Development – that we cannot have 16 Days of Activism, it must be the whole year long and I still say that and I think we must launch it again tomorrow on Table Mountain. It is unacceptable that women and children should feel unsafe, for instance, just doing a normal thing like going to the shop or going to school or going anywhere. There is now a new kind of thing – and it is a form of really targeting women – it is a form of gender based violence, they are now stealing women's hair, they grab the hair of women and it is quite a hectic situation.

Mr Speaker we believe that the Premier's safety strategy that was launched this morning will also go a long way in addressing some of the gender based violence issues, specifically as they relate to the issues of collaborative co-operation and collaborative approach with all our other departments ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Will you please wrap up hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... for instance Social Development, Sports and Culture etc. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, †Somlomo. [Speaker.] Through you, †Somlomo. [Speaker.] It is unacceptable for the Minister to tell this House that there are some police stations that do not have these rape kits, seeing that rape is the most common assault in the Western Cape. I think it is high time you give us the timelines on the process and how you intend to actually provide police stations with these kits because these are the things that actually delay the processes in handling these cases.

You highlighted a list of police stations where you have provided these devices, however, one of the police stations that has been struggling is the Kraaifontein police station. It is one of the police stations that has been affected by shortages of these rape kits in the past. Even this day, 19 September, that police station is still without these kits of its own. The police station further confirmed today that it does not even have the buccal swabs that are used to take DNA samples of the perpetrators of these rape crimes. This means even if they have rape kits available the police station will still struggle to match the DNA found on the victim of the crime against that of the alleged perpetrator of the crime, of the rape.

All of this continues to happen at a time where such crimes as rape and abuse against women has intensified in this country. So we appeal to you hon Minister, to give us timelines. When are you intending to provide these kits for these police stations? It is a primary need, it is needed and it is very crucial. Thank you.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. We understand that without the rape kits that evidence from rape cases cannot be collected and without evidence the ability to successfully prosecute diminishes. Rape is evil personified and it is heinous in nature and we need to understand how that is linked to under-resourcing in this province. It tells us that we do not really require boots on the ground but it also requires us to have the tools required to have effective boots on the ground who can actually tackle crime and the cases of gender based violence, coupled with rape. To bring about those convictions we need all these tools including the rape kits.

SAPS reported in August of this year that they have averted this potential crisis by signing a procurement contract to supplement evidence collection kits to use in rape cases.

But as we heard now that this is still not the case and some SAP stations are still without them. I wish to commend the Minister for the proactive steps that he is taking in this regard and I would urge him to keep this House informed but also to exercise the oversight with regard to the rape kits especially.

We are literally bleeding in terms of policing resources but like I said and to reiterate, we need the manpower, we need the HR supplementation because if you have a rape kit but you do not even have the officers in order to conduct those investigations, then we could be going down a road where we left many people who have faced heinous crimes are let down. Thank you.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Let me start by thanking the Minister for responding so promptly to my letter on Monday. I think I copied you in as well Mr Speaker but you have not responded or acknowledged my letter yet but I will wait patiently, a little more.

Mr Speaker, I wrote to the Minister about the tragic story that was reported in the *Sunday Times* on Sunday of a Khayelitsha mother who was prevented from reporting an alleged rape of her three-year-old daughter for four days after she was sent from one police station to the other, from pillar to post quite literally in trying to report this alleged rape of her daughter. Even when she ultimately got to reporting the rape, the police thought it was fit to bring the perpetrator to the mother's house and to accuse the mother of falsely accusing the perpetrator.

So last week when we debated gender based violence in this House, I asked the Minister to consider how women are treated when they approach our police stations in the province to report violence and sexual assault and whether our police stations are in fact environments in which they can do so in a dignified and proper manner. I wrote to the Minister asking him, as a follow-up to my request, that he conducts audits of the police stations in the Western Cape to understand how women are being treated when they try and report gender based violence or sexual assault and I welcome the Minister's response that he is intending or will be conducting an audit.

So over and above the presence of rape kits at police stations I would like to understand from the Minister how he intends to conduct these audits so that we get a proper understanding of the experience that women have when they approach the police stations in our province for assistance. Thank, you Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. I am glad the Minister has responded – I would have sent it to him. Thank you very much. There is only one Minister but we will talk about specifics, not just the letter itself. I recognise hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think I must from the onset say, we are always saying how we are going to respond to the challenges we have in society determined by [Inaudible.] but hon Speaker, I must say I am disappointed with the response because we have this and it happens in many cases. It might not be the Provincial Government, it might be other people at times, we only investigate after the fact.

Now the reality is that, if you listened to the President yesterday, the debate, which I do not think the Premier did listen to judging from his response. [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: He acted, the Premier acted.

Mr M KAMA: I don't think – but what I am trying to say, hon Speaker, is that if you listened to the President, there is an acknowledgement already that there are police stations that do not have rape kits and ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Of course!

Mr M KAMA: ... that is a problem.

The PREMIER: And whose job is it to make sure they get them?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, that is a problem. The attitude we are talking about. They would want to investigate while they were asking who has that responsibility. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Take responsibility.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please let us allow the hon member to proceed. You only have two minutes, so what is left now is less than a minute, so please proceed hon member.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. What I want to say is that oversight is not only meant for us to go and investigate, see if business is implemented or not, but we have a responsibility to provide solutions to the challenges that are there.

So an exercise that we must be engaged in is how do we make sure because the problem is not only rape kits being at police stations, the problem is also do we have the personnel to ensure that proper evidence is collected so that when presented in our justice system we are able to respond. So my question would be: in part of this investigation which the Minister will conduct ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please put the question hon member.

Mr M KAMA: ... what is it that we are going to do to ensure that we support the work of the police stations ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is up.

Mr M KAMA: ... and also through other departments? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kama. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Through you, hon Speaker, I just want to request that the Minister provides us with a list of the police stations that do not have these rape kits so that we are able to do an assessment on the number of cases that are pending or are delayed because of these kind of incidences. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I just want to point out to the hon Makamba-Botya that I have never mentioned any of the police stations. I said in the answer – remember I said this is an answer from the police because we do not have control, we just do oversight but their answer was that most police stations have.

But what we want to now do, we want to take it a level further and I really want to welcome the hon Herron, hon Kama, hon Botya, the whole issue around when we do these visits to police stations, remember we visit every one every year but it is no use just to go and visit police stations and tick boxes. I think we must really look at what the situation is.

It is always good to get complaints that you can see Mrs X says she was badly treated so that we can investigate that specific situation and hold some people accountable at those police stations. And I want to say to this end, the role of the Ombudsman is a very important role because what they do is investigate very specific incidences and hold some police officers accountable. And I think hon Herron, as I listened to the debate now, apart from checking on kits and stuff, it is actually important to have that kind of interaction where we can get information around where people are treated badly because I think the point that you make and that hon Kama is making is are there also qualified officials who can deal with the way they are treated.

I mean the hon Fernandez will tell you. She went to the Thuthuzela Centre and when there is a rape victim in the Thuthuzela Centre, if someone wants to go to the toilet the doctor must leave with – so that someone can use – it is unacceptable. That is at the hospital. I am saying at our police stations, we have those rooms – remember in places a Wendy house and other places a room inside and one of the other issues we want to look at – I think some people ask how or what are you actually going to look at? Do we have that victim support room and specifically as far as it pertains to children because you know children, they cannot handle the kind of roughness of a police station but that they actually get treated in that victim support room. I think we will have to do it and we have to do it properly.

Again we are even satisfied that in a cluster if you have one qualified specialist or a couple of specialist investigators with the kind of equipment in a cluster which is in close proximity, that if a rape case is reported to one of the police stations in the precinct that that group can then go there, the people do not need to wait forever but that the police station locally there knows how to deal with a person coming with a victim coming to lay the charge. And I think that should be the approach. I want to also say to – I will give you the list hon Makamba-Botya, I have the list here that we will target the 21 police stations - but I think we need to look at the broader way so that we can get a broader sense.

This is a very representative list but I think one must do it in a broader way and then one must go and target, specifically that the three-year-old and the mother the police station turned away and get answers so that we can come back to this House and report on those answers. For too long we are just complaining about the police and I do not want to point fingers because as all of us said let us get solutions. But we cannot just let people not be held accountable. I think that is the point we are making and we want to do it in a constructive way and when police officers know that there is oversight and that someone is going to come and check on them then they will respond to people in a far more responsible way, a far more humane way and then a far more accountable way in helping them.

So I want to thank those people, all the hon members who took part in the debate to say thank you so that we can move forward and again, if you have any – like the hon Herron, he wrote to us - if you have cases write to us, speak to us, engage with us so that we can solve the problem. Thank you very much.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Thank you very much hon Minister. That concludes this interpellation. At this point I would like to request the hon members to join me in welcoming Ayabulela Lihla Kanjana who is sitting up there in the gallery. She is a young lady, ten years old. She has been at Red Cross for three years. She has been battling with leukaemia. She is now in Grade 4 and has been studying up to Grade 4 now while she is in the Red Cross. [Applause.] Ayebulela is a niece to hon Ayanda Bans. Whilst she was sitting here she got cold and then she went to the fourth floor but she is back now and thank you for being strong Ayebulela. †Uqine ungavumi ukuba iLichimia okoyise uyaqonda, uyoyise sizokusebenza nathi sikuthandazise uyoyise. [Be strong. Do not allow Leukaemia to take over your strength do you understand? Be strong, be strong. We will work with you in prayer.]

†Wamkelekile, ungadinwa kumane usiza apha eParliament. [Welcome. Don't get tired of coming to this Parliament.] Thank you very much. Thank you hon members.

Race, culture and hair politics: schools

3. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Education:

Whether her Department has measures in place to sensitise employees, teachers, school management members and learners about race, culture and hair politics?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much Speaker and welcome Ayebulela. You are a hero. Keep going on with your school work. Thank you very much to hon member Makamba-Botya for the interpellation. The answer to your question is, yes, we have over the past few years. There have been various discussions, workshops, meetings and seminars on issues relating to race and culture.

This year we approached the Institute for Justice and Reconciliation to facilitate a two-day training course for circuit managers on diversity in schools. The focus of the training was to engage circuit managers in a critical conversation about the nature of diversity challenges in Western Cape schools and to equip them with the basic skills to manage these challenges as and when they arise.

The programme has been replicated to circuit managers at their circuit meetings to address the topic of diversity with principles, visual narrative exercises were taught, to train people to hear the stories of people around us and increase our understanding of one another. It enhances our empathy for them and allows us to identify commonalities that unite us and differences that make us richer as a community.

Another activity known as the 'privilege walk' forces workshop participants to confront the ways in which society privileges some individuals over others. It is designed to enable participants to reflect on the different areas in their lives where they have privilege as well as the areas where they do not. Other focus areas include stereotyping and how one simply generalises in one's mind, without engaging in actual dialogue and getting to know the person.

Diversity is addressed at meetings with principals. For example in Metro North, a director addressed issues such as race, culture, hair, uniforms, transgender issues, with 206 principals on this director's road show.

In Metro Central circuit managers had discussions with their school management teams advising how they can address issues focusing on diversity and social cohesion and engage with outside organisations, their staff and parents communities.

Another example is the Eden and Karoo District which just last month hosted a very successful seminar on diversity, in Geelhoutboom. 319 members of school management teams attended the sessions. The speakers unpacked issues such as cultural bias and how to ensure an inclusive ethos at one's school.

In 2011 the Department of Basic Education released guidelines that are intended to provide teachers, principals, subject advisers, administrators, school governors and other personnel, parameters and strategies on how to respond to learner diversity in the classrooms through the curriculum. They have also been developed to facilitate and support curriculum differentiation in the classroom.

Teachers have an important responsibility in making sure that all learners from whatever background feel included and affirmed in the classroom. The guidelines assist educators and staff who monitor our own beliefs, attitudes and behaviours when responding to our learners. Some of the ways in which we do this are recognising biases as stereotypes we may have absorbed, treating each learner as an individual and respecting each learner for who he or she is, avoiding the use of language that is biased and undermines certain groups of learners, refraining from remarks that make assumptions about our learner's experiences, considering the unique needs of learners when designing learning programmes and lessons, constantly re-evaluating our methods for teaching and assessing learners in a diverse setting, considering different approaches, methodologies and strategies when teaching in our classroom and creating opportunities for all learners to participate in activities.

Every teacher needs to understand that the most significant way to respond to learner diversity in the classroom is through the curriculum. The NCS sets the content of what is to be taught but it is up to the teachers to plan how they will teach it to different learners in the classroom. One of the key strategies for responding to diversity is curriculum differentiation. These are just some of the examples of what we have been doing in this regard and will we continue to do so. Thank you.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thanks to the Minister for the response. I just want to highlight that it has become the norm, these racial issues amongst Western Cape schools are actually rife and are happening every day in the schools. I just want to know how often are these training sessions provided to the teachers and if that is the case, is it an ongoing process or is it a once-off thing that is happening? If that is the case, what mechanisms are in place to ensure they are compliant with this training. Is there a score-card actually highlighting that these kind of racial issues are being addressed and disclosed? Thank you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. We are aware the school governing bodies in each school are responsible for the everyday management of the school and the SGBs must also decide on and carry out school policies that are suitable for the school including race, culture and hair politics.

I want to ask the Minister, in this particular case, has the code of conduct been communicated to parents and learners of the school via the SGB and at what time during the school year has that been communicated to parents and learners? Has this kind of issue happened in any other school within the WCED and how has the WCED or that school's governing body handled such a case and what was the outcome of the case, if there is another example? And how many schools ensure that parents and learners understand the code of conduct?

I heard that the Minister say that, yes, the school governing bodies need to do it and they do it and that WC officials have workshops and all of that, but how is the communication conducted so that parents and learners understand the code and how they need to adhere to the code and the influences of the code on learners during their school year? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yesterday I shared the frustration of the good Premier when he was frustrated by talk shops and the irony is that he is not acting against these talk shops when they are happening in his Executive here. The ANC in the fifth administration called on the Minister to review the code of conduct of these schools to ensure that these happenings do not happen again because when these protests happen, it de-focuses and affects schooling time. Therefore we must act on it once and for all.

Now my question would be, is the Minister not prepared to conduct these reviews because we do not want to have an assumption that it is because these happen in schools that are former Model C schools and is afraid of acting against them. Thank you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I concur with the last speaker that has just spoken that I think the Minister needs to review some of the policies and in the light of learners constitutional rights being violated in public schools, such as the Malibu High school in Blue Downs, where black learners were compared to apes and bears for having afros, which is their natural hair, and further given disciplinary hearing letters.

This follows similar past incidents in 2016 at San Souci Girls School in the province where black girls learners were told to cut off their afros. So this actually becomes a norm in the Western Cape where people of colour are being marginalised by their teachers and in addition to that, what are the additional measures that you have in place for the teachers who are non-compliant in these kind of things. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you for the comments. I think we need to interrogate the issue of the statement that has been made as a fact that these issues have become a norm in the Western Cape. It is completely untrue and a gross distortion of the reality. There have been two incidents regarding hair, now and in my last five year term, and that was the one at Malibu and the one at San Souci, so I would hardly describe that as a norm when we have 1500 schools in the province.

As far as the training is concerned, it is ongoing – I cannot give you exact, specific dates, I do not believe in the school card of the teachers. But it is not only teachers either. It is the school, it is the governing body, the governing bodies make the code of conduct. We do a lot of training of governing bodies and we have a chance to form strategy in the Department which incorporates a very strong focus on values and amongst those values are inclusivity and diversity.

Quite some time ago, I requested that the Department embark on a diversity strategy which is part of, I believe, what is happening here along with the training of our staff. So it is not in the school card but it certainly is an ongoing focus of ours and one which we will continue to do.

Member Botha, I presume the school you are referring to is Malibu. It was not specifically stated in the question. Codes of conduct are made by governing bodies and the usual process in any school is for parents when they apply to the school, for them to accept that code of conduct and agree to comply with it. If they have any issues with the code of conduct their remedies then would be to go to the SGB and ask them to change it.

Now the incident in question here, also linking with member Kama is, it is not an issue of reviewing the code of conduct because it would not have been apparent from the code of conduct what this issue would end up being because there was an issue of what was defined as outrageous hair.

So first of all I do not have the capacity in my office to review 1500 school's codes of conduct given the fact that there have only been two incidents, we have also not had reason to go and look at every single school's code of conduct but we have asked schools many times to look at their codes of conduct regularly and to review them in line with the Constitution and many schools have in fact done so.

So when there is one particular issue we will certainly intervene and look at that and work with the school to ensure that is amended appropriately and that is the case with what is happening with Malibu at the moment.

As far as disciplinary measures are concerned, has an issue like this happened before, member Makamba-Botya also did mention the issue at San Souci, which was the only other issue relating to hair that I have had and I went to the school personally. I spoke to the girls there and at the end of the day that issue was very amicably resolved. The principal in fact resigned or retired and the policy was changed. So we are completely committed to inclusivity and diversity in our schools and will do whatever we can to ensure that that happens and that everyone feels welcome and valued in our schools.

[Debate concluded.]

Questions for oral reply

New question to the Premier

Safety of the people of the province

1. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Premier:

During his election campaign and his SOPA address he promised to fight for the safety of the people of the province:

What steps has he taken, including working with local governments, to ensure the safety of the people of the province?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and also thank you to the hon Mackenzie for asking this question.

1. In actual fact I am in a better position to answer this question today than I would have been last week, because we had the opportunity to launch the Western Cape plan today.

So today I officially launched our safety plan for the province which includes both a law enforcement and a violence prevention component. This is because we know that boots on the ground are not enough, we must also work on improving the environment in which children are raised and the circumstances that our communities are faced with.

The plan will see 3000 new law enforcement officers deployed where and when crime happens. Deployment based on data led technology; 150 investigators to prepare dockets for prosecution; a world-class evidence led and integrated violence prevention programme; and a safety priority for every Cabinet Minister with accountable transparent metrics.

Hon Deputy Speaker, during my election campaign I committed to a priority committee on crime and safety, however safety is now so incredibly important to our strategic plan for the province that I have decided to incorporate that proposed committee into Cabinet meetings where it will be designated as a Safety Cabinet where Ministers will be held to account on their safety metrics and we will exercise and focus criminal justice system oversight.

Each Minister has a measurable safety priority and they are personally responsible to deliver on and the safety priorities will focus on both law enforcement as well as violence prevention while also being managed with a measureable system together with the criminal justice system.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Premier, what is the timeframe for this project to be introduced?

The PREMIER: Parts of the timeframe will be, for example, 1 000 of the 3 000 within this year, 50 of the 150 investigators within this year. But the other programmes will, as I have said, last beyond my term because these are those embedded programmes that we need to start to see changes that actually start with young boys and changes that start where we are identifying risk; the 1 000 days programme that the Minister of Health will be following through on. This is what came out of our Safety Summit, this is the kind of stuff that is spoken about in other countries around the world that have developed practices where we have seen change. It is those kind of things that are going to be embedded and you can go down – each of the Ministers here have chosen a priority project that is going to make it safer.

So those will just be ongoing and of course I think the other thing is, these are new interventions that provinces have not really overall been that engaged with. We are doing this more than any other province has ever done before and I also believe that we must be dynamic enough to say we have invested in something, we are trying this and it is not giving us a result – well, then that measurement does not show us then we must reinvent it or we must reshape it. You know we cannot just keep doing the same things over and over again and expect other outcomes.

This Government already has, and I think across the whole of South Africa we have a number – and if you think about gender-based violence at the moment – of interventions. I have asked that we measure those interventions, what is the efficacy of them, because across the country we have these high numbers. Are they not working at all? Are they working and if we did not have them we would have even higher numbers?

And so those are the kinds of questions that we have got to be asking ourselves, but that is the outline of this plan and, yes, I think specifically here in this House, the Standing Committee, that you, Chair, but also the Standing Committee that the hon Allen chairs, and then of course every Standing Committee will also have a component in this oversight to see exactly how we are measuring it and whether we actually are making a difference.

I have also said; we put a bold statement out there: let us halve the murder rate in the next 10 years. Let us see what happens and if nothing happens I will have to fall on my sword but you know, I mean we have really got to start changing things.

In our country crime is out of control. We are in a war zone. The United Nations says 1 000 murders per year in a region or a country means you have become a war zone. We had 3 600 murders in our province last year. It cannot be. So we have to, we definitely have to bring changes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I saw the hon Christians and then hon Kama and then hon Herron. Is that correct? Yes. Sorry, those are the three names that came up first.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. If the hon Premier can just tell us under which Act will these people, the law enforcement officers be employed? Because the Province does not have powers over law enforcement officers, where will they employ and what are their powers? Is it the same as municipal? Are they going to be stationed under municipalities or which powers, because we do not know. Thank you.

The PREMIER: That is a very good question and in actual fact these questions are also – and I think specifically in the oversight, this is the process between myself and hon Minister Fritz, which will be taking the lead specifically with the 3 000 deployment and the 150 investigators.

But first of all, the deployment, the training; you will see it is a partnership with the City of Cape Town for exactly that point. I still believe that provinces should have policing powers, should have policing control, should have policing management. That is a long discussion. We have also heard hon Minister Bheki Cele say: no ways.

So we cannot sit back with 3 600 murders; I do not know what is happening in Gauteng with their 4 300 murders or KZN with their 4 500 murders, but in this province where I and us, we are responsible, so now we have to find a way. And that way is that what we have done is we have got an agreement with the City of Cape Town because also the City of Cape Town's powers were devolved from the National Minister in the law enforcement officer space and that is what we are using. [Interjection.]

So we are using the training and the City of Cape Town's law enforcement space. They have created the space for the training and they will be deployed through that mechanism. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: But the management, control and command will sit in the Province. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: But of course we are developing this now. We have made the statement: this is what we are going to do. We have got the agreement, we will put the 3 000 in place; 1 000 this year. What hon Minister Fritz will be doing now is setting up the management process. Post-today, post the announcement. I then had a telecon with General Sithole ... [Interjection.] to explain what we are after. General Sithole is very happy with setting up the programme of how, because of course we cannot just do this on our own, we want to deploy in conjunction with the police and in conjunction with all of our municipalities because it is across the whole province.

But, interestingly enough, the regulation that allows the City to deploy law enforcement officers or those stabilisation unit officers, like they deployed in Bonteheuwel, that piece of legislation actually says that the City could deploy them within the bounds of South Africa. So the City could even lend some of their enforcement officers perhaps to Durban or Bloemfontein. [Interjections.] It could happen in this process but, of course, we are interested only in ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: That is the first thing. The second thing is that with regard to ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: ... the 150 investigators, hon Minister Fritz will now be engaging with the head of Public Prosecutions as well as the judiciary to secure the process of how. And it is not as if this is new because the private sector does it; I am fully aware of dockets being drawn up in Plettenberg Bay through the Neighbourhood Watch system, so we are just following through on that. But we know there is a massive shortfall on investigations, we know that our investigators have over 200 docket case-loads per person when the norm should be between 20 and 30, globally. So all we are doing is, we are now saying: well, how do we also help, and these 150 per 1 000 so that we can also add extra helping hands and we have started now with that process. I have also sent off the documentation to the Presidency today and hon Minister Fritz is busy engaging with the Provincial Commissioner and also making sure that hon Minister Bheki Cele is also apprised of what these plans are.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Maybe firstly suffice to say that we welcome any initiative to fight crime.

My question would be, I think this is the announcement that we were promised yesterday; the hon Premier made the announcement today. In the promise he mentions that he will find the money but there are going to be projects that are going to be affected.

Now I would want to get an understanding of which are these projects that are going to be affected, because our understanding is that even crime is as a result of many contributing factors. So we would not want a situation where we come and give the boots but we are opening more ground for crime to be committed. Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that question, obviously a very important question. It is an important question for this House and as well as for every single Minister sitting here, a very important question for them as well.

We have already gone through – and of course we have got a R60 billion budget – and in the budget, the boots on the ground and the 50, so that is the 1 000 and the 50 for now, Treasury has already secured that first year funding.

A number of the other smaller funding line items are in that process. We have secured a lot of them and a lot of the items are actually budget items that already exist but are going to be ramped up and of course each Minister will make those announcements as their programmes – for example, let us think about the after-school work that hon Minister Marais does.

The big question is how; we seem to miss a lot – I suppose sometimes it is not seen as cool to go to these – how do we get more of those kids attracted to the system? So that is what we are applying to it, but that budget exists already, so we are tweaking that budget.

Behavioural change budgets within the Department of the Premier, we will be using some of the behavioural change budget that already exists and looking at how we can help the Education Department with that budget so that some of those items which Education will be responsible for, is already budgeted for within the Premier's Department.

And of course when you make these kind of policy decisions and you make money available, specifically my own Department and I have to lead with this, so I am busy with a whole lot of processes on budget cuts but I will also leave the actual numbers for the hon Minister of Finance when he announces those in the Adjustment Budget which comes in a month or so's time.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. My question is similar to hon Christians. I am still not clear from the hon Premier as to who is the employer? Is it the Provincial Government or the City of Cape Town?

And what type of employment are we talking about for these law enforcement officers? Are they permanently employed or are we talking about EPWP employment?

The PREMIER: So it is exactly the same system that is being used at the moment with the Stabilisation Unit in Bonteheuwel at the moment. So we are using that exact same process, we are using that exact same piece of regulatory framework that allows for that to happen, but the command and control will then happen from the Province and the training will happen from the City.

So we will transfer the training funding to the City for them to train up those 1 000 officials or those 1 000 officers. But as I said also, there are discussions that we had today post the announcement, first of all with General Sithole as well as with the City themselves and the MOU that is being drawn up at the moment. We started the framework yesterday. And so we will complete that framework within the next couple of days, which will outline exactly how that control and command happens because obviously it has to happen not within the confines of the City, it actually happens in the confines of the Province. But that regulation which the City operates under at the moment, as I said before, when it was handed down to the City it said not within the bounds of the City, it said within the bounds of South Africa. So we are actually using that loophole as the mechanism to arrange it across the province.

And then lastly, we also have to then secure, through the MOU, for example if we were going to go into Avian Park, because the data and the statistics showed us that that is where crime was increasing and we were going to go and put enforcement and boots on the ground in Avian Park, then what would happen is the MOU would have the capability of that specific municipality also entering into that MOU so that we can actually then have the agreement to go across from one municipality to another.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Interjection.] There cannot be a follow-up, unfortunately, hon member.

Mr B N HERRON: The hon Premier has not actually answered the question. I asked who the employer was and what type of employment?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately I cannot control what the hon Premier answers, that is his prerogative as an hon member of this House. [Interjections.]

We are moving over to Question 5. I see the hon Marais.

Questions standing over from Thursday, 12 August 2019, as agreed to by the House:

*West Coast: soccer and netball teams***5. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

- (1) Whether there are soccer and netball teams on the West Coast linked to her Department; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether her Department has received any requests to support soccer and netball teams on the West Coast; if so, what are the relevant details?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker, dankie aan agb Lorraine Botha vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

5. Ja, daar is sokker- en netbalklubs in die Weskus wat deur die Klub Ontwikkelingsprogram met die Departement skakel.

[Translations of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon Lorraine Botha for the question. The reply is as follows:

5. Yes, there are soccer and netball clubs in the West Coast that liaise with the Department through the Club Development Programme.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais, if you could just take your seat for a second, there is a point of order. What is your point, hon member?

Mr L L MVIMBI: My point of order, hon Deputy Speaker, is that I want to find out whether, if a question is being asked, can the person refuse to answer a question because it is the second time that is happening in the House. If it does allow, so that we know and then we do not waste time and ask questions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately, again, I cannot judge the quality of an answer at any level. So if you want to, maybe you should suggest to write an email to the hon Premier if you want more clarity, but in this House it is the hon members' prerogative on how they want to answer, including the Executive. Thank you. Can we continue, hon Minister Marais? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. †Ja, daar is sokker-en netbalklubs aan die Weskus ... [Tussenwerpsels.] [Yes, there are soccer and netball clubs on the West Coast ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: ... wat deur die Klub Ontwikkelingsprogram met die Departement skakel en klubs word ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ... that liaise with the Department through the Club Development Programme [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Klubs word deur hul onderskeie sportfederasies benoem. Daar is 11 netbalklubs. Ek kan dit noem, dit is Darling wat in Swartland is; Velddrif Netbalklub en Bergrivier; Saldanha Netbalklub; die Villagers Netbalklub in Brakfontein, Cederberg; Good Hope, Riebeeck-Wes, Swartland; Coastal Links; Steenberg's Cove; Hopefield – dit is in Hopefield; Majestics in Citrusdal, Cederberg; Synith Eagles is in Clanwilliam, Cederberg. Dan die River Fresh Netbal is in Porterville, Bergrivier en die Young Blues in Citrusdal, Cederberg. En twee sokkerklubs, Diazville Sokkerklub in Saldanha en die Diaz Leeds Sokkerklub in Saldanha.

En dan die tweede deel van die vraag: ja, versoeke is ontvang en word steeds ontvang en hou verband met die ondersteuning wat verleen word aan klubs wat deel uitmaak van die Klub Ontwikkelingsprogram wat oor 'n periode van drie jaar geïmplementeer word.

Die meeste versoeke is gewoonlik vir vervoer, toerusting en uitrusting, kapasiteitsboukursusse, affiliasie en / of registrasiegelde.

[Translations of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Clubs are nominated by their respective sport federations. There are 11 netball clubs. I can name them, it is Darling that is in the Swartland; Velddrif Netball Club and Berg River; Saldanha Netball Club; the Villagers Netball Club in Brakfontein, Cederberg; Good Hope, Riebeeck West, Swartland; Coastal Links; Steenberg's Cove; Hopefield – it is in Hopefield; Majestics in Citrusdal, Cederberg; Synith Eagles is in Clanwilliam, Cederberg. Then the River Fresh Netball is in Porterville, Berg River and the Young Blues in Citrusdal, Cederberg. And two soccer clubs, Diazville Soccer Club in Saldanha and the Diaz Leeds Soccer Club in Saldanha.

And then the second part of the question: yes, requests were received and are still being received and relate to the support that is rendered to clubs that are part of the Club Development Programme that is implemented over a period of three years.

Most of the requests are usually for transport, equipment and outfits, capacity building courses, affiliation and / or registration fees.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Botha.

†Me L J BOTHA: Dankie agb Minister. Ek wou net vra, die lys genoem nou deur u, hoeveel van daardie spanne is van die spanne wat wel aansoek gedoen het vir ondersteuning?

[Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Minister. I just wanted to ask, the list mentioned by you now, how many of those teams are from the teams that have actually applied for support?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie. Sover my kennis strek het al die spanne aansoek gedoen vir ondersteuning.

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. As far as I know all the teams have applied for support.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow-ups? No. We move over to Question 7. I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

Quality of teaching: mechanisms to monitor

7. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:

- (1) Whether she and her Department have a mechanism in place to monitor the quality of teaching to learners who are struggling with certain subjects; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) what are the reasons for the decrease in the matric pass rate across the province?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and hon Christians. The reply is as follows:

7. Yes, we do have mechanisms in place. We track learner performance via a number of tests, firstly, including the annual systemic tests in Grades 3, 6 and 9 in language and mathematics, diagnostic testing in Grade 8 as well as quarterly testing in Grades 10 to 12.

The intention of these tests is to identify the subjects where learners are performing poorly and to provide support to teachers at schools. For example, last year using the systemic tests we were able to determine that Grade 3 learners were struggling to identify patterns and functions and are struggling with algebra and data handling, as well as that the Grade 3 learners' writing skills have declined.

So we were able to use these test results to design interventions to assist the Grade 3 learners in these areas, which we would not have been able to do without the systemic tests. They provide the most objective picture possible of learner performance in language and mathematics, giving us the opportunity to assess whether we are improving the quality of education in the province.

We have used the systemic tests over the years to design our recruitment strategies and specific interventions and training programmes for schools and teachers at the CTLI and this has led directly to some of the improvements that we see in the system.

Diagnostic and statistical analysis is also used to plan intervention and support programmes. Diagnostic tests focus on Grade 8 language, maths and science. Diagnostic tests for maths, home language and natural sciences were piloted in 2015 and implemented in 2016. The WCED is investigating the possibility of conducting these tests during the fourth term of Grade 7 as well, so that the results will be readily available as they enter high school.

Diagnostic tests assist in increasing learner participation rates in mathematics and physical sciences in FET as teachers are able to determine what a learner's abilities are and to use a differentiated method of teaching in support of enhanced learning for every learner.

Statistical analysis looks at the term results in Grades 8 to 12 and as far as matric is concerned, there is also a per question analysis of NSC results, which also include reports of moderators and examiners and a variety of teacher and learner support initiatives are implemented at head office and the eight education districts with the support of subject and curriculum advisers.

Part two of the question, the reason for the decrease in the matric pass rate: the main subject that contributed to the decline in the 2018 NSC was business studies. Since the introduction of the CAPS in 2014 there has been a significant decline in the NSC business studies results, both nationally and provincially.

There are a number of challenges experienced in business studies, including a negative attitude towards the subject, the lack of classroom management skills of certain teachers, inadequate curriculum pacing and curriculum coverage, ineffective teaching methodologies and absence of effective remedial interventions impacts negatively on the performance of learners.

There are also some challenges with the curriculum which we are trying to address with the DBE, but there are also other reasons for the decline as well. One is that the Western Cape has the highest retention rate in the country between Grades 10 and 12 at 64%. The more people who stay in the system, which is one of our strategic priorities, the higher the chance that the overall pass percentage is going to decrease because the weaker learners are kept in the system, not kicked out.

In addition, we have been saying for several years now that budget pressures that we are facing over the last number of years, which has resulted in bigger class sizes, will lead to a reduction in performance. And in addition to that, we have many learners coming from other provinces in Grade 10 with backlogs from their education systems.

So in 2018, for example, there were 731 learners who came into the Western Cape from other provinces in Grade 10 only, who failed the 2018 NSC. So the provincial pass rate would have been 82.7% if they were not included, which is obviously an improvement of 1.2% from what our reported pass rate was.

In addition, many of those learners who come in Grade 10, the ones that do pass, are also passing on average at a lower percentage which brings down the entire percentage. So people are coming here for opportunities but that is having an impact on our ultimate performance.

Lastly, our performance must also be looked at through the lens of the multiple exam opportunities. In 2018 the Western Cape had the lowest percentage of MEOs in the country. Other provinces that recorded increases, supposedly, in pass rates, had many learners who did not write the full matric exam and some up to as much as 25%.

I have heard reports of learners in other provinces also being forced to write the MEO; in the Western Cape we did not force them to write it. They had a choice as to whether to write it or not. So I am really, really pleased that that has now been scrapped from next year but it really just shows the dangers of looking simply at pass percentages without interrogating how they are calculated. Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Minister, for that comprehensive answer. Hon Minister, I have pulled the Metro East and Metro South, all those statistics here where subjects impacting on school performance, like accounting, they have identified all of that.

Just to think, we were at an oversight visit and while we were at the oversight visit teachers were sending, a principal was sending correspondence to say they are shooting again in Manenberg and bullets infiltrated the classroom against the blackboards and stuff. Is something being done about that, because when I spoke to the educators there they said that it definitely impacts on the performance of learners. So what is your Department doing? And I know it is a big thing but I am just saying now the bullets, gangsters are coming into the school with balaclavas, taking out who they need to take out and that is all trauma. So all these interventions are good and I appreciate that, but the safety aspect – it is not normal for learners to be taught in such hostile environments.

So that is happening at schools and it is going to have a detrimental effect on the outcome at the end of the year. So I do not know if you heard about it but we got an email to say that they had to lie flat on the ground and they could not teach but they had to come back tomorrow and continue as normal.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much. Yes, I mean that is completely correct. I agree with you 100%.

The incident you are referring to, as far as I recall, was not shooting inside the school, it was from outside the school premises and it came into the school. So as you know, we cannot do anything about controlling outside school premises but that is part of the hon Premier's safety plan which he announced today, which is a cross-cutting plan for everybody in every department to work with the police to try and prevent this kind of thing from happening. I completely agree, the safety of our teachers as well as our learners is constantly under threat in areas like Manenberg, Hanover Park, Lavender Hill, Elsies River and it is unnatural and we completely agree with you and that is why we are embarking on the safety strategy.

Part of the trauma issue is also that with Social Development we will be announcing part of our strategy together, as well as how we are going to address that in schools. Thank you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. My question is directed to the hon Minister. Does the Department have a process in place to deal with children who are struggling with certain subjects and who are still not coping after special interventions made by the school? If that is the case, do you have a process whereby the child must go for an assessment, because sometimes the school will declare a child not suitable for a mainstream school. So is there a process that is in schools to place that child in a special school or a skills school? Is there such process in the Department? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. Yes, there is indeed. We are, as with most things, under constant pressure for places in special schools and schools of skill. I have managed to get two extra schools of skill up and running in the last few years, but we do have a very proactive and a very responsive Special Needs Directorate in the Department and people who are battling, struggling, certainly can be sent for assessments and then we do our best to place them in a suitable facility.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the hon Minister for the responses. I think firstly, what the results have shown, which hon member Christians mentioned, is that there is a decrease in how students are performing or learners are performing. And one of the challenges, hon Minister, that was mentioned which affects the performance of the school is the issue of how currently the quintile system describes other schools.

So what I want to know is what is the hon Minister doing to consistently advocate for the review of how schools are defined in terms of the quintile they belong to? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. That is kind of a new question but I am happy to answer it because it is something I have been taking up with the National Minister since I was appointed in 2014. It is a national policy. I would welcome any support from the ANC's side to assist me at a national level because it is inequitable. It is not reflective of the true state of affairs on the ground.

I do have the power to change quintiles on application and our Department is processing a number of applications. I have made some of them but the fact is, without extra money to cover the difference in the fees, we cannot carry on – we cannot do it for every school like we would necessarily like to do.

It is also the fact, though, that some schools are not managing the money they get as well as they should and that is something that we are also trying to get our districts to check on. But I agree, the quintile school system – at the time it might have been fair, it is not fair anymore.

The other thing is, National Department is also not checking that every province is complying with the policy either. So we have Limpopo who is supposed to have 70%, for example, of the poorest learners in their schools; they have 90%. So you know it is really not fair when the Department makes a policy but other provinces do not comply. We do; we try and manage our money effectively but our learners are suffering. So I am looking very sympathetically at applications but we are obviously going to require extra funding and also that affects the school nutrition programme as well.

Waveren High School: poor state of infrastructure

8. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:

Whether she and her Department have plans to address the poor state of infrastructure at the Waveren High School; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I see hon member Sayed is not here but thank you for allowing the question to stand over from last week. The reply is as follows:

8. We do have a plan in place. The school is due to be partially replaced through the WCED replacements programme. A portion of the school is made up of *plankie* buildings, therefore next year this part of the school is due to be replaced with new classrooms and a new school hall built. Construction is due to commence next year with completion in 2022.

Public Works is currently on site addressing repair and maintenance needs at the school. However, a review of some of the buildings has led us to accelerate the demolition of some of the classrooms and mobile classrooms will be built in the interim to house learners from the demolished classrooms.

DTPW is also currently scoping what work needs to happen in the classrooms that will be retained and this will be actioned as soon as possible.

*Mitchells Plain: placement in high schools 2020***15. Mr I de Jager asked the Minister of Education:**

(a) How many learners in Mitchells Plain have not been placed in high schools for the 2020 academic year and (b) what measures are in place to ensure that these learners are placed in schools near to where they stay?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon De Jager, for the question. He is not here either. The reply is as follows:

15. Part (a) of the question is premature and I cannot answer it at this point because the process for placement for 2020 is not yet finalised. It is still in process. There are many people still double-parked in more than one school and also the schools have to look first of all at who is going to perhaps not progress to the next grade for next year. So we are not yet at final figures.

Part (b), planned measures to ensure successful placement of learners for 2020, to place learners at available places at various schools that may not be their first choice. Additional possible classes to be opened. As I say, schools are still cleaning up their enrolments and we have asked schools to finalise their admission lists and their waiting lists. This is an ongoing process that is ever-changing and evolving due to learners being admitted at multiple schools and having to finalise who is going to repeat grades next year or not.

The biggest challenge that the Department experiences is parents' schools of choice as it is not always possible to accommodate learners at schools of choice and parents will have to settle for places offered where accommodation is available.

Mr F E CHRISTIANS: Hon Minister, we had a briefing, I think last week or two weeks ago, that there are pupils this year, 2019, that were not yet placed. Is that the case?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: To my knowledge all learners were placed. I am not sure if you are referring to Grade R because Grade R is not yet compulsory. So if it is Grade R then that may be the case but there are always people coming in and out. Sometimes people are transferred during the year and there are sometimes people who are not placed at a certain point but I am not aware of people who should have been placed, who are not, and if you are aware of that please give me names and I will follow up.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I think the challenge that we have in Mitchells Plain has been the increasing population in the area. So the question therefore would be: what are the plans in place to ensure that we are able to accommodate this in the future? Already in one of the briefings we had there was an indication that we are going to have unplaced learners from the districts, that we are going to have learners that will not have a place to learn. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. Mitchells Plain is only one of many areas where we have an ongoing increase in the population. As soon as we build a new school it is already full. It is an ongoing problem which we have been highlighting every year but every year our budget gets cut and we are now being told it is going to be cut again by 5%. If that is the case we will definitely have unplaced learners. There is nothing we can do about it.

So our infrastructure grant has also been cut by R132,503 million over the last few years by National Government. We were also then given an extra R298 million but they took away R250 million of it, so which leaves us with R48 million which is not even enough to build one school. So as long as we continue in this environment where we simply are not getting the funding to provide the schools and to provide the teachers, then it is going to be a problem. But in Mitchells Plain particularly we certainly do have plans; we have plans everywhere, it is just that we simply cannot always keep up with the numbers as much as we can.

Then also we sometimes build a school, like we did in Mfuleni and then the parents did not want their children to go to that particular area, they wanted them to go somewhere else. So we need also to ask our communities to work with us so that when we do have school places available, that they help us to get their children into those schools.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, is the Department planning to build any new schools in Mitchells Plain?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Mackenzie, I anticipated that question from you, so luckily even though it is a new question I have an answer. We are building a new school in Woodlands, Weltevrede. It is a new mobile primary school. [Applause.] I am glad someone is happy. It will be called Washington Drive Primary School and it is to be erected on a property in the northern part of Mitchells Plain. It will consist of 10 classrooms, eight single, one double with stacking doors to open up and be used as an assembly area, two admin units, ablution facilities for 400 learners and 12 staff and a feeding kitchen.

New questions

Cederberg Municipality: council vehicle misuse

2. Mr D America asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

- (1) Whether it has been brought to his attention that a councillor of the Cederberg Municipality, whose name has been furnished to his Department for the purpose of his reply, is alleged to be using a municipal council vehicle permanently while receiving a car allowance from the Municipality; if so, (a) what are the relevant details and (b) was the Council's permission obtained; if not;
- (2) whether he will investigate the matter and report back to the House?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, agb *Deputy Speaker*. Dankie aan die agb lid vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

2. Ek is ingelig dat die aantygings wat teen raadslid Pretorius gemaak was, onwaar is in 'n mate wat beskryf sal word: (b) hy gebruik 'n munisipale voertuig en soos vereis word volgens Artikel 9(1)(e) van die *Staatskoerant* Nr. 42134 van 21 Desember 2018; die Raad het voorsiening gemaak vir die gebruik van raadsvoertuie deur raadslede volgens die Raad se resolusie op 29 Maart 2017; verder, soos per munisipale rekords, ontvang raadslid Pretorius geen motortoelaag nie.

Die (b) gedeelte: volgens die munisipaliteit word die gebruik van die voertuig wat in munisipale besit is, slegs gebruik in ooreenstemming met Artikel 9 van die *Staatskoerant* gedateer 21 Desember 2018, met die goedkeuring van die burgemeester en Speaker. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translations of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the hon member for the question. The reply is as follows:

2. I have been informed that the allegations made against councillor Pretorius are untrue, to the extent that will be described: (b) he uses a municipal vehicle and as required by Section 9(1)(e) of the *Government Gazette* Nr. 42134 of 21 December 2018; the Council has made provision for the use of council vehicles by councillors in terms of the Council's resolution on 29 March 2017; further, as per municipal records councillor Pretorius does not receive a vehicle allowance.

The (b) part: according to the Municipality the use of the vehicle owned by the Municipality, only occurs in terms of Section 9 of the *Government Gazette* dated 21 December 2018, with the approval of the Mayor and the Speaker. Thank you. [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then we move over to the next question, thank you, and I see the hon Minister Schäfer. She is busy today.

Bullying incidents: combatting of

3. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:

Whether she and her Department have measures in place to combat the scourge of bullying incidents occurring at schools in the province; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Christians is also busy today. The reply is as follows:

3. Yes, we do have measures in place. Obviously we are very aware that bullying is happening in many schools, in fact all over the country and internationally and now that we have internet it has also expanded to include not only verbal and physical bullying but also cyber bullying and we all know also what pain and trauma it can bring to people. It can lead to depression, anxiety, self-harming and even suicide in some cases.

Learners address the issue of bullying through the life skills orientation curriculum. It is also addressed through various District engagements. Districts hold a variety of workshops for teachers and learners on the issue and there are also after-school and holiday programmes that address it. Psycho-social support is also provided by the Districts to schools on request and intervention programmes where schools have indicated that they need support.

We have also emphasised that schools should include in their code of conduct an anti-bullying policy which outlines behaviours that are unacceptable, even out of school, where social media bullying is rife.

I have mentioned earlier the Transform to Perform Strategy and an integral part of this is a Values Programme that is currently being implemented at schools. Training of educators in values in education is underway. Schools have been asked to choose 12 values for each month of the year and to explain, talk, show and live these values. These values include respect for one another, kindness, caring and so on. Schools are to have ongoing discussions with learners on values and to undertake various initiatives that showcase them.

Early indications have shown that there has been a decline in learner bullying at some schools because of this as they are being taught how to respect and consider one another and their feelings. Two examples are: from Beaufort West Primary School where Mr Amsterdam says:

“Through the Values Programme we are experiencing less bullying and fighting. They are starting to look out for one another, especially in class. We have become one class, one school, one family.”

And another one is Mr Samsodien from Kannemeyer Primary in Grassy Park who says:

“We have seen, through our little way of introducing this at our school, how the attitudes have changed, how behaviour has changed and how attendance has increased.”

So we certainly are dealing with that. The issue of social media, as I have said, has heightened the risk of bullying and we embarked on a campaign in August 2018 to highlight the effects of bullying on learners and to draw attention to the fact that learners who film, post or distribute videos are also participating in the bullying.

The campaign has been called “Raise Your Voice, Not Your Phone”. It included the distribution of two videos on social media highlighting the implications of filming or distributing content across social media and it provided tips as well as to what one can do to help victims who are being bullied.

The second phase of this campaign is now being developed and we are very grateful for the public participation of Paxton Fielies and Carl Wastie in this campaign. I have done a number of anti-bullying road shows with Carl Wastie and hope to continue to in future.

In addition, through our E-Culture stream and our E-Learning Directorate we have distributed various policy documents and guidelines in the area of cyber wellness and dangers associated with social media, including bullying. Guidelines were issued to all schools on social media and social networking in public schools and I would encourage all officials, principals, educators and SGB's to study these.

We have also recently launched a new cyber safety programme called Web Rangers, where we train learners in schools on issues of cyber safety and they are going to go back into their schools and share that information. And we are also busy developing a cyber safety curriculum with Google, which we hope to input into the national system. Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Minister, for that answer. It is just disturbing to see almost every day in the newspaper here – last month, an Elsie River High School †*meisie* [girl] tried to kill herself after allegedly being bullied at school. And then a 13-year-old from Mitchells Plain, Parkhurst Primary, that allegedly was bullied and she tried to kill herself. Then the article goes on, a 12-year-old boy that was bullied and so on.

So this is still happening and are these interventions taken by the Department enough? I know that last term our Education Committee was briefed by people on bullying because it is an ongoing problem. Are these interventions enough, because it is sad to read, if you open the newspapers, that pupils want to take their lives because of continuous bullying.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, it is. I agree with you completely. What is enough, when is it ever enough? It is also not the Department's sole responsibility. We need to get our parents at home as well as community organisations assisting us to help us get those values back into society.

But having said that, bullying is not a new phenomenon. It has been with us for centuries actually. So I think also the fact that it is much easier to publicise nowadays maybe makes us more aware. I am not convinced that there are necessarily more of these events but one is too many, I agree with you, which is why we are doing absolutely everything we can possibly do and focusing on the values in schools to try and engender respect for each other; it does appear to be helping, just from these two anecdotes that I have mentioned which are really encouraging.

So we are doing everything we possibly can but we cannot do it alone either. We really need support from communities and from parents.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Minister, what is the remedy if a pupil goes through the necessary channels at school and nothing has been done? What is the remedy for that learner going to the principal, reporting the cases continuously and nothing has been done? What is the remedy for that pupil and also the parent?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. We have a Safe Schools Hotline which we publicise at every school, 0800454647. It can be anonymous and I would really encourage them to use that hotline. If there is a particular issue that you are aware of, again you are welcome to contact me with the details and I will try and take it up with the relevant people in as sympathetic and empathetic a way as I can.

Youth Café in Mitchells Plain

4. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Social Development:

(a) How many young people have been assisted at the Youth Café in Mitchells Plain, (b) what services are offered to young people by the Youth Café and (c) how is the effectiveness of these programmes being monitored?

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank the member for the question. It is pertinent to the Youth Café in Mitchells Plain. The reply is as follows:

4. Part (a): the Youth Café in the 2018/2019 financial year reached a total of 2 498 people at that centre. In the first quarter of 2019/2020, 372 young people were assisted.

Part (b): what are the programmes? The Youth Café offers a number of programmes and services to young people in Mitchells Plain. The after-school support and skills development courses are offered at two schools in the Mitchells Plain area for youth in transition, that is Grade 10 to 12, and this programme is in line with the After-School Game-Changer focus and is meant to make the Youth Café visible and accessible to young people after school.

The Youth Café also presents a compulsory life skills course to all participants. Irrespective of the course that young people attend, during the first quarter of 2019/2020 a total of 100 participants were trained in leadership and mastery as part of this compulsory life skills course for needs of youth.

Furthermore, computer basic training and job readiness programmes are offered every three months as the students require these courses for further job opportunities. Specialised courses are also offered, such as project management, hospitality, graphic design which started in August and will continue until the end of the year, and entrepreneur exposure. Four participants established their own businesses and the Media Hub.

Part 3: The effectiveness of the programme is monitored by feedback from the students. It is also monitored by each staff member who follows up on a group of assigned beneficiaries, as well as connecting some of them with possible job opportunities. A database of all participants is kept and annual follow-ups are done to monitor progress.

One of the challenges with the Mitchells Plain Youth Hub is the element of crime in the precinct that it is located. Thank you.

Ms A P BANS: I would like to ask the hon Minister, I understand that the hon Minister said that there are two more Youth Cafés that will be opening this year. Has there been a decision yet where the Youth Cafés will be opened?

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Bans, we have not committed any funding. There is one commitment that was carried over from the former Minister's period that is in place, but obviously with the cuts we will need to revisit now where it is we are going to place our cafés and once we know what the budgets are we will revisit that programme. Thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Chair, I am very impressed with the answer given by the Minister. I must say I was not aware of it. I just want to know, do you intend extending this to other areas that there seems to be, like in the case of Soweto, everything happens in Soweto. So now everything happens in Mitchells Plain and we do not ever get any other towns benefiting from this, where there is a need.

Do you intend expanding this programme to the Manenberg, to Elsies River, or is Mitchells Plain the only star project?

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Marais. There are in fact Youth Hubs established across the province. They are in George, Oudtshoorn, we have Mitchells Plain, Uniondale, I think we are going to be looking at ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Groot Brak.

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Groot Brak. So I do not have the whole list of it offhand but it will fit in, the Youth Café fits in with the focus of Government going forward in terms of keeping youth off the streets, getting youth at risk to come in, learn, get the valuable life skills and try and prepare them for employment in terms of the programmes that are offered.

It is an expensive exercise. One needs to find the best location, you need to know that there is the demand but I can tell you in our engagement with all the 30 municipal mayors, every single mayor wants a Youth Café in his or her municipality. So it is something we are going to need to revisit but of course the budget cut of 5% is going to affect some of our programmes. I cannot say if that will be one. Thank you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, I just want to know and you have alluded to the crime, the gang-affected crime. I want to know how has this affected the number of youths who visit the Youth Cafés and have the numbers decreased and how have they decreased, if they have?

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Botha, I do not have the full detail but we are actually doing an assessment of all our Youth Cafés to see, from inception, what the numbers were. But I am aware that the location in the town centre – it is in the town centre, hon Mackenzie – is quite a hot spot area and youth are discouraged from coming with laptops and cell phones for fear that they might get robbed. So we might need to revisit location but again we are busy with that exercise and once I have all the detail I can certainly provide that to the House. Thank you.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, to the MEC, I just wanted to ask whether her Department is willing to prioritise the rural areas in terms of establishing these Cafés. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Obviously scale, hon member, is important because, as I say, it is a costly exercise to set up but we would want to see the spread across both the metro and rural areas because it is in the rural areas where the need is the greatest in terms of preparation for the world of work and also the necessary life skills to equip them. So as I said, there are 11; we are revisiting, we are looking at the numbers and obviously the commitments that were made but it is sought after and every mayor wants a rehab, wants a Youth Café and wants a safe house. So I have got a shopping list that I need to work on over the next five years and we are going to all need to pull together to make it work, yes. Thank you. [Interjections.]

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

†Me A P BANS: Dankie, agb Deputy Speaker. Na die pragtige prentjie wat vir ons so pas geskets is oor die plaaslike regering, het ek die volgende vraag aan die agb Premier.

[Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. After the beautiful picture that has just been painted on the local government, I have the following question to the hon Premier.]

Whether the hon Premier is aware of allegations of corrupt practices, sedition and destabilisation in various municipalities like in George, Knysna, Swellendam. If so, what is the hon Premier doing to address these challenges?

The PREMIER: So I do know that there have been various allegations received and emails received and I know that the Minister of Local Government, when we receive them we deal with them, we put the investigations in place and allow the processes to follow their course.

Ms A BANS: The De Swardt Vogel-Myambo report found a series of corrupt practices in Knysna Municipality, including the legal adviser who backdated the municipal manager's appointment, illegally approving R4 million for Knysna Tourism to a private company that had not tendered. What I want to know, hon Premier, can you tell us what progress was made in terms of the implementation of that report? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That was your mayor. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: First of all, that report was never sent to me. I am not sure if it was sent to the local government, number 1. Number 2, I was listening to what you were saying and you indicated that the Tourism money of R4 million was paid to a private company. I know that it is not a private company because that is the tourism organisation which is not a private business. It is a non-profit organisation that is set up to market tourism as in all towns at the moment across South Africa. And that brings into question the veracity or even the quality of the report but, as I can say, I have not formally received that report and I am not sure if it has been sent to this Provincial Government.

Ms A BANS: Let me choose my question now because it is the last one. I would love to follow up on that because I just have one opportunity, hon Premier. What I would want to know now, if an MEC is found fingering somewhere into these processes, for example, hon MEC Bredell who refused the recommendation to Council to investigate corruption allegations in Knysna Municipality under the former mayor who is now the DA MP. What would the process be? How would you handle that situation?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So I think first of all if the MEC refused to investigate a corrupt case then obviously what you should formally do is write to me as the Premier and request the reason why and I will investigate it to find out.

Secondly, if you are aware of corruption I would also expect you to also go to the police station and lay a charge of corruption because of course the laws of our land say that if you are aware of that corruption you are complicit unless you do something about it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I move over to hon Bosman. [Interjection.] There are only two follow-ups.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you, I would like to ask the hon Premier, the hon Premier recently welcomed the extension of the South African National Defence Force's deployment on the Cape Flats, provided that certain changes be made to the deployment and operations.

Can the hon Premier please detail for the House what changes he hopes to see and what enhanced support he would like to see to tackling gang-related violence on the Cape Flats?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So I think it is no secret that I have supported the deployment of the military to our region, but I think it is also no secret that both myself and hon Minister Fritz have really worked hard at saying, well, how can we as a province play a much stronger role. We have an existing oversight role; can we even play an oversight role? And many is the time that we get absolutely denied that role, but I want to say that, again, in writing to the President, I requested the President that we continue with the deployment because I do believe that a two-month deployment is definitely way too short, number 1, to find any really meaningful change.

Number 2, I have actually been disappointed in this last two months' deployment because I have not seen strategies, I have not seen mechanisms of measurement. Even when we asked for the Acting Provincial Commissioner to come and report this to the Cabinet, it was quite a high-level report on lockdown and it really did not enable us to engage into what was the real strategy and how did the police use the military in making sure that we make a difference and a dent in this unbelievably high murder rate and crime rate, specifically in the initial 10 hotspot areas but also that expanded to 15 hotspot areas.

So when I wrote to the President to request that we believe that we should extend the deployment, I said in that request that I really would like to see proper strategic management, I want to see measurable objectives within that management. I want to see blitzes because at the moment when you see the deployment of the military it is sort of this big, noisy machine that comes rolling into town for two hours and then leaves again. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Tourists.

The PREMIER: I mean if you are a gangster you get warned very early of what is going on. I need to see 2 o'clock in the morning lockdowns and that is actually what they are used for. The police need them to use the military as the mechanism to lock down an area – it is Section 13(7) of the Police Act – and then the police go in and what they do is then they blitz from one area to another. There are endless anecdotes of arriving at the wrong house and getting the wrong information. I mean this kind of intelligence is not difficult to get, just go and walk the streets yourself. Everyone knows the gangster lives there or the gangster lives there, this is who they are, this is what time they operate; if you wait till 9 o'clock they will be here, they will meet these guys at 10 o'clock. I mean everybody knows, the intelligence is on the ground everywhere.

So that is a real problem and that is what I have asked the President to please have a look at doing and I have not heard a formal reply back, I have only received a letter that the President sent to the Speaker and I presume the same applies to my colleague, Minister Fritz, that we have not had any formal further engagement.

But as I also announced, that what we will do now is we will also set the questions beforehand and ask the police to report specifically on the military on a regular basis.

However, I must also say that if I think about those joint committees that have been set up, that at least the Province and the City are involved in those joint committees now, between the City, Province and police, so that we at least do have some input in that process around what is happening with the military deployment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bosman?

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much for that reply. I understand that none of the representatives from the Western Cape Government were invited to the recent Crime Summit. Would the hon Premier perhaps please elaborate more on the relationship between the National and Provincial Government in terms of policing and safety issues?

The PREMIER: Now that is a really nice follow-up question. I think that a number of us in this room were at the first Crime Summit and I remember at that first Crime Summit walking out onto that stage and pledging to the Minister that he has the full support of this Government, of every single department in this Government. I never said one negative word when I went out and neither did my colleague, hon Minister Albert Fritz.

Of course we then followed up with the Minister coming with a whole lot of blame and game and you need to do this and you do not provide that and the City hasn't got lights and you are not doing your job. But we just held back and said: We are committed to partnering to make sure that this is a project that will make this province safer. Too many people are being murdered and are dying in this province ... [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hear-hear.

The PREMIER: ... every single day. Interestingly, a second Crime Summit gets called and I was on my way to the provincial funeral of the late Chester Williams and I get a message from someone in the audience of the Crime Summit. Now I am not sure if anybody in this room was at the Crime Summit?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Kama.

The PREMIER: Aha! So maybe he can corroborate this because obviously I was not there. Apparently we are not going to start this Crime Summit because where is the Premier? He has not pitched up, where is he? Where is the MEC? Then they said no, the MEC is at Mugabe's funeral. [Laughter.] I mean what absolute nonsense and rot. But I get the call to say: where are you? So I replied to say: I am not sure what you mean, where am I? I am on my way to Chester Williams's funeral, it is a provincial state funeral. So they said but you are supposed to be at the Crime Summit? I said: what Crime Summit? They said: the Crime Summit, we are all waiting for you, you are supposed to be here.

So immediately I get hold of my PA, I get hold of hon Minister Fritz and I say: Guys, are we supposed to be at this Crime Summit? And then we start investigating as to who was invited to the Crime Summit. Well, an invitation did actually come to this Province, I will give you that. It came to some officials in this province to come to the Crime Summit. There was no invite to my office, nothing, *nada*, nothing and neither to hon Minister Fritz's office, nothing, *nada*. [Interjections.] Three of our officials did attend. Our officials did attend and I did say that our officials were invited. We were not invited.

That actually reminds me of the previous time that the Oversight Committee from the National Assembly ... [Interjections.] was here in the province, in Mitchells Plain.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: Exactly the same. This is like an ANC strategy, I think. [Interjection.] Do not invite and then we will do this big blame, ah, look at these guys, they are not serious about crime, they do not even pitch to the meetings. Invite us to these meetings then we will come along.

So again I get a message: why are you not at this meeting? So I have got to investigate because I promise you ... [Interjections.] if we get invited to one of these kind of meetings we will be there, unless there is something like a Cabinet meeting or whatever. And then we will send the right people to the meeting so that we are fully represented in this province.

So now we start investigating. Now they are making a big noise about the Premier is not there and the Minister is not there, so we interrogate. This is a Friday, this is a Friday ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Hon members, order.

The PREMIER: This is a Friday and an official National Assembly Standing Committee oversight on crime, because this is such a serious issue in our province. And guess what? An invitation was sent! And invitation was sent to attend the National Assembly's Standing Committee on oversight on crime. It was sent at 16:11. Eleven minutes past four on the Thursday afternoon, prior to this meeting [Interjections.] and it was sent to the hon Reagan Allen. The only invite to this province gets sent to the hon Reagan Allen [Interjections.] and then, and then [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order members.

The PREMIER: The Chairperson ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ... Joemat Pietersen and the teams continued to rant and rave. Now .. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...I am saying it here, answering in this question. [Interjections.] Answering this question in the House [Interjections.] but you know, quite frankly, I have said this before and I have said this to the Opposition and we have members of the Opposition who are serious about fighting crime in this province, who are serious about bringing down the murder rate. I would expect someone from the Opposition to stand up and say, listen guys, if we are serious, let us send these invites. Let us not play politics with these spaces. Let us send these invites. Let us build these partnerships. Exactly the way that I did today when I launched our plan in this province.

I sent the full plan to the President. I sent the full plan to the National Commissioner. I then phoned the National Commissioner to have a discussion with him. Min Fritz is doing exactly the same thing with the Provincial Commissioner, with the Minister of Police and with the Public Prosecutions and the Justice cluster here in this province, because we are serious about making this province safer.

We are all elected hon members of this House and we need to act honourably and stop making politics [Interjections.] specifically if we all agree that we have got to fight crime in the best interests of the people of this province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier. Hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Madam ... [Interjections.] Deputy Speaker, just on a point [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please members, I cannot hear the member [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Just a point of clarity [Interjections.] Did the Premier say [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please, hon members [Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN: ...that the hon [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please, hon members

Mr G BOSMAN: ...that the MEC was at former President Mugabe's funeral and that member Kama was at the Crime Summit? Because I remember member Kama was in Laingsburg with us. So, perhaps it was member Kama who was at Mugabe's funeral? [Laughter.][Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I mean I did, that is what I got back. [Interjections.] I got back from that meeting. That is the kind of stuff that [Interjections.] gets said in these meetings. No-no, do not worry. He has gone to Mugabe's funeral. But quite frankly, I mean again, that is shocking. We should not have to – this is a very, very serious issue and I think we spoke about this in the beginning of this term.

I agreed with the Leader of the Opposition [Interjections.] that we need to change the tone of our Government. We need to be serious about what we want to achieve and change and there are times that we can make politics and scream and shout, but I actually want to call on this House to say, when it comes to crime, when it comes to the number of people who lose loved ones every single day in this province, we cannot politicise this.

We really, really have to work together. You know, Deputy Speaker [Interjections.] I was actually, I felt ashamed to be a South African yesterday when I was at the National Assembly when the President was telling us a story around xenophobia.

An HON MEMBER: There were no mistakes.

The PREMIER: The President was telling South Africa a story about the xenophobic attacks, condemning it, and I support him 100%. And he was telling the story about us as South Africans and he tells the story that in parts of our country the litmus test, the test of whether you should be beaten up or not, or ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Killed.

The PREMIER: ...killed or not in a xenophobic attack is whether you can pronounce a word. It was not only the President. It was also a speaker from the Northern Cape saying, can you pronounce the word †“agt-en-tagtig” [eighty-eight] and as well, you heard the President say in the language of that region, can you pronounce the word for “elbow”. If you cannot pronounce the word for “elbow” well then quite frankly the South African that asked you the question would beat you up.

But guess what, when he was telling the story, and I listened to the story and I think, oh my goodness, I mean, who are we as South Africans when that is what we do? But you know what really got me? Is half the National Assembly started laughing when he tells the story about, if you cannot pronounce the word for an “elbow”, you are now seen as someone from outside of that region, you must be beaten. We have got a lot of work to do in our country [Interjections.].

We really, really have. And we all need to stand up and take responsibility and specifically on the issue of crime, I really do appeal to this House that we really do take this seriously. That in actual fact I would really expect someone from the Opposition on the two issues that I have raised about when we get invited to these meetings. Please just speak to your colleagues. Speak to your colleagues in the [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

The PREMIER: ...National Assembly. Min Bheki Cele, speak to the head, to the Chair [Interjections.] Just speak to them and say ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...let us rather just ask a question: invite. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

The PREMIER: I really, really am pleading that people in this House would take this leadership role in trying to change the crime platform in our province, in our country, very, very seriously. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We are moving over to hon Wenger.

An HON MEMBER: The MEC's official is for the Zimbabwe [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Given what the Premier said a short while ago about the deployment of the SANDF, this is a short term intervention. I would like to understand what medium and long term violence and crime prevention measures the Premier and his Government will be putting into place during their term.

The PREMIER: Okay. Thank you very much for that question. I think obviously that talks to, or first of all the military and I think we always have seen the military as a temporary stop-gap. Maybe the last thing on the military is that if you just walk the streets; if you listen to people who live in areas that the military have been deployed to; live in areas where there is a bigger focus, it is sad for me that I have not seen a drastic reduction in the murder numbers. They did dip and they are back up at around about an average of 50 per weekend in the Metro area, which is lower than the sort of 75 that it was peaking at, but at least a little bit lower, and many people are reporting, it feels a little bit safer.

I must say, I was on a late night radio show the other night, around the military deployment and the request and it was interesting to listen to the phone calls that were coming in and specifically coming in from the Metro areas that were not of the 15 hotspot areas.

Parts of Khayelitsha, parts of Nyanga. People are saying, please, please, please, we need to make sure the military come and what about getting military to some of our areas? And you can feel that desperation in people's voices. You can feel it, that people really, really want us to create an environment that we can build a safer society.

So it is a temporary measure, but we have to do whatever we can, while that temporary measure is effective or ineffective, whether it gets down to strategy and gets the measurements in place and we can see the different things that blitzes in programs and management; but whether that happens or not, what we have also got to do at the same time is put our own interventions in place. And that is what I announced today. Those 3 000 extra officers on the ground, so that we can actually help with putting the numbers right.

We have also got an indication from Minister Bheki Cele that he will redeploy a further 1 000 police officers to our region by the end of the year. Suddenly what that does is, over the next couple of months and moving into middle of next year, we start to build the numbers to what is probably getting more to even what Minister Bheki Cele's target is of population ratio to police, because we really are starting to boost those numbers at local government level. Now through this political intervention and provincial intervention of the extra 3 000 and another 1 000 coming from the Minister.

So, now you are starting to see us building part of a medium term. I think I also said, the long term is all of these other strategies that are going to be implemented, because they are starting to look at interventions at youth, etcetera. And building that value set and changing how we have rural safety and so really embedding long term programs.

But, I also want to say and maybe then in this answering the question that came earlier that the hon Herron said that I did not answer. The 3 000, it is not about a once-off. If we want to raise the money this year, we could find savings to raise the money this year. The big challenge for this Government and the big challenge for the Minister of Finance is that once we have deployed, we need to continue with the pull-through that it goes beyond the [Inaudible.] and that is where it really starts to become difficult, because we are starting to make long term commitments.

And so this is a long term commitment. So, those individuals that are going to be employed, they will then be employed as per their existing, and what I said by the City, because the legislation and regulation do not allow us to employ police officers or safety officers. And so they will be employed by the City. We will make that transfer. They will be on the books of the City, but it is a permanent pull-through and we will commit now already for the term and I think with that program in place, and obviously, I also said we are going to measure it, and those long terms commitments that are going to come from every department, this is actually a medium going right into a long term, because we have got to get behavioural change.

The change or the crime that we are dealing with in our region as a country and as a province, it is not as if it just happened overnight. There are a whole lot of reasons. It is something that has been growing over time and so we have got to reverse those, and those things are not quick fixes. And it is not a perfect science either. There are lots of clever people who have helped us devise this plan and helped us make choices to say rather choose this than that, but you know, it is a medium to long term plan, because that is actually what we have to put in place to make change.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, Premier. So we are coming to the end of Questions. I will allow one follow-up, then I would like to end because we have actually reached the 20 minutes of question-without-notice time to the Premier.

Questions and replies as received from departments

QUESTIONS

For written reply

Special Needs Schools

1. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:

- (1) What learning material does pupils receive at Special Needs Schools;
- (2) whether the development progress of learners are monitored; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

1. (1) Learners attending Public Special Schools which offer the NCS CAPS receive the same learning support materials as the learners in public ordinary schools, plus additional specialised learning and teaching support materials wherever relevant. Blind children will receive their workbooks in Braille and the Visually Impaired will receive large print and/or suitably coloured background screens dependent on the individual child's visual acuity. The Deaf child will receive theirs in South African Sign Language (SASL) both as a Language of Teaching and Learning and as a subject. Schools are also assisted to acquire specialised ICT to enable children to access the curriculum.
- (2) Learners at public special schools are not exempted from systemic evaluations and promotion requirements are monitored by the Directorates Curriculum, Assessment and Examinations, similar as for all schools.

Murders: women and children

2. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) What is the number of women and children that have been murdered in the province in the 2019/20 financial year to date;
- (2) whether there has been an increase in the murder rate compared to the (a) 2015/16, (b) 2016/17 and (c) 2018/19 financial years; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

2. The South African Police Service informed me as follows:

- (1) The crime statistics for 2019/2020 have not been released by the Minister of Police.

- (2) (a) No comparison to 2014/2015 can be made as SAPS began recorded this data from 2015/2016 onwards. Since 2015/2016, there were 518 murders of women and children.
- (b) Yes, there has been an increase. In 2016/2017, there were 526 murders of women and children (8 murders more than 2015/2016 or a 1.5% increase).
- (c) Yes, there has been an increase. In 2018/2019, there were 651 murders of women and children (2 murders more than 2017/2018 or a 0.3% increase).

Please note: The above figures include cases closed off as unfounded. The victims are also not linked to the DSSC [Daily Summary of Serious Crime], therefore not linked to charges or counts. The extraction dates and the manner of extraction from the systems also has an impact on the numbers.

Communicare complaints

3. Mr A Lilli asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

- (1) (a) What is the total number of complaints lodged by tenants in properties owned by Communicare and (b) how many complaints of Communicare tenant beneficiaries were resolved between (i) 2018 and (ii) 2019;
- (2) whether his Department allocated additional funds to the Rental Housing Tribunal in 2018 to deal with the high number of cases lodged by Communicare tenants; if not, why not; if so; what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:

3. (1) (a) 706

During June and July 2018, the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal received and registered in excess of 500 complaints against Communicare. The nature of the complaints ranges from exorbitant increase in rentals, failure to do maintenance and unilateral changes to rental agreements without consultation. All the complaints against Communicare were dealt with as a collective.

By April 2019, the number of complaints had grown to 706.

- (b) None were resolved during 2018. After investigations, facilitation, engagements with all parties and finally mediations through their representatives, the following complaints were resolved during 2019.

- Welwerdiend: 20 Settlement Agreements
- Dreyersdal: 4 Settlement Agreements
- Ruytewacht: 56 Settlement Agreements
- Lakeside: 11 Settlement Agreements

The remaining complaints are at the advanced stages of mediation.

- (2) No additional funds were allocated; however administrative staff are working overtime to expedite the complaints. The overtime approved is consistent with previous years and is not necessarily a direct result of the Communicare complaints. My department, in its commitment of service delivery, has viewed this unprecedented number of complaints as a matter of priority and sought to ensure that these matters are expedited within the available financial resources.

The overtime was not approved to deal with Communicare matters only, but to also deal with the RHT backlog, alleviating bottlenecks, improving turnaround time and quality in the Pre-screening, Administration, Complaints and Hearing Components.

Due to unprecedent volumes of Communicare group complaints and staff capacity constraints, the RHT was able to expedite the processing, investigating and mediating of these complaints in an efficient and reasonable manner. The RHT was able to engage with the parties during office and after hours based on the availability of the parties and that was to the benefit of the complainants.

The Tribunal members also sit 3-4 times per week, and during my recent meet and greet engagement with the Tribunal members, I requested that urgent attention be given to Communicare matters.

For the period 10 September 2018 to 28 February 2019, Approved overtime amount was R900 000.

For the period 7 March 2019 to 31 March 2019, Approved overtime amount was R23 000.

For the period 1 August 2019 to 31 March 2020, Approved overtime amount was R1 500 000

Community Development Workers Programme: vacancies

4. Mr D Smith asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

- (a) What is the number of vacancies that exist in the Community Development Workers Programme, (b) where to they exist and (c) when will the vacancies be advertised and filled?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

4. (a) As at 1 October 2019, there were four funded vacancies within the Community Development Worker Programme (CDWP), namely; a CDW Supervisor, two CDWs and a Personal Assistant to the Director: CDWP.
- b) The four positions are located as follows:
- CDW Supervisor in the Garden Route Region due to a relocation of the incumbent to the Overberg Region.
 - CDW in the City of Cape Town (Metro 2) due to retirement on 30 September 2019
 - CDW in the Overberg Region due to a relocation of the incumbent to City of Cape Town (Metro 2)
 - Personal Assistant to the Director: CDWP due to internal transfer.
- (c) The recruitment and selection process for the two CDWs and Personal Assistant will commence during October 2019 and should be filled during the fourth quarter of the current financial year. The recruitment and selection process of the CDW Supervisor is at an interview stage (4 October 2019) and the process (i.e. interview, approval of the nominated candidate and issuing of the appointment letter) is envisaged to be concluded by end November 2019 subject to any additional security vetting process where required.

Questions and replies as received from departments

QUESTIONS

For written reply

Attacks on truck drivers

1. Mr D G Mitchell asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

With reference to attacks on truck drivers in the province:

- (1) Whether hotspots for these attacks have been identified; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether the appropriate law-enforcement officers have been deployed to combat these attacks; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (3) what is the impact of these attacks on the economy of the province?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

1. (1) Hotspots have been identified. This category of crime is particularly prevalent on the N1 at truck stops in the Central Karoo.
- (2) A joint task team to counter this category of crime has been established in Beaufort West. The team is co-led by Colonel Braaf of Beaufort West SAPS and Petro Swanepoel, the provincial Traffic Chief for Beaufort West. Beaufort West municipal traffic services also assists. Colonel Braaf has developed a crime intelligence analysis of the situation, which has been translated into an operational plan, co-ordinated by Ms Swanepoel. The plan provides for the SAPS to be bolstered with four Provincial and two Municipal traffic officers to assist their shifts. The actions of the joint operations task team will target high risk areas and will focus on:
 - a. High visibility patrols;
 - b. Preventing any crime;
 - c. Ensuring safety and security;
 - d. Stopping and searching motor vehicles;
 - e. Stopping and searching pedestrians; and
 - f. Effecting arrests when any crime is committed.
- (3) The impact of this crime on the economy is obviously negative. I am not aware of any study that has been done that quantifies the monetary impact of this crime on the economy.

*Environmental Impact Assessment applications***2. Mr A P van der Westhuizen asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

(a) How many (i) environmental impact assessment (EIA) applications and (ii) applications for EIA exemption have been submitted to his Department for consideration in the (aa) 2016/17, (bb) 2017/18 and (cc) 2018/19 financial years, (b) how many applications were (i) approved and (ii) turned down and (c) what has been the average turnaround time for his Department to pronounce on the various EIA applications submitted?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

2. The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning received a total of 472 development applications in terms of the EIA Regulations, 2014 over the 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19 financial years, and finalized 466 applications over the same period. The Department issued 355 environmental authorizations (that is, decisions) over this period; with 350 environmental authorizations ("EA's") granted and 5 environmental authorizations refused. The competent authority issued 98% (or 348) (please note that the Annual Performance Plan target is 95%) of the 355 decisions within the regulated prescribed timeframe (which is 107 days) and took on average approximately 95 days to finalize these applications. Please note that 111 applications either lapsed or were withdrawn by the applicant/s over these three financial years. Furthermore, these statistics reflect the number of Basic Assessment and Scoping & Environmental Impact Assessment Report applications processed in terms of the EIA Regulations, 2014, but exclude amendment applications.

Find below the number of applications per financial year:

Financial Year	Applications received	Applications Finalized	Withdrawn/ lapsed applications	EA's issued	EA's granted	EA's refused	Granted/ Refused WITHIN timeframe	Granted/ Refused OUTSIDE timeframe	Avg. turn-around time for EA
2016/17	153	178	47	131	128	3	129 (98.5%)	3 (2.3%)	90 days
2017/8	140	136	25	111	111	0	109 (98.2%)	2 (1.8%)	92 days
2018/19	179	152	39	113	111	2	110 (97%)	3 (2.7%)	103 days
TOTAL	472	466	111	355	350	5	348	8	-
Average	157.3	155.3	37	118.3	116.7	1.7	116 (98%)	2.67 (2.2%)	95 days

This Department further received 16 applications in terms of the National Exemption Regulations, 2014 over the 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19 financial years and finalized 22 applications over the same period (please note that this number includes applications received during the previous financial year(s) and that was finalized during the period in question). Unfortunately, the database that captures exemption applications does not allow the Department to provide you with more detailed information as requested.

Find below a summary of the number of National Exemption Regulations, 2014 applications per financial year:

Financial Year	Applications received	Finalized application granted	Finalized applications refused
2016/17	8	20	0
2017/8	7	1	0
2018/19	1	1	0
TOTAL	16	22	0

Ladismith Municipality

3. Mr G Bosman asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

With reference to the Ladismith Municipality:

(a) What is the total amount spent on maladministration and fruitless and wasteful expenditure in the (i) 2016/17, (ii) 2017/18 and (iii) 2018/19 financial year, (b) how many disciplinary cases (i) are currently active and (ii) have been completed in 2018/19, (c) how many people have been employed since the Municipality was put under administration by his Department and (d) what is the breakdown in terms of (i) positions, (ii) salary scales and (iii) names of the employees?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

3. The town of Ladismith falls within the Kannaland Municipal area. I will therefore make reference to the Kannaland Municipality when responding to the above question.

(a) (i), (ii), (iii)

	2016/17	2017/18	2018/19
Fruitless and wasteful	R2,175,863.00	R1,748,047.00	R612,035.00

Please note that, in regard to potential maladministration matters, a number of cases have been opened with the relevant authorities which are under investigation and disclosure of which, at this stage, has the potential to prejudice the investigations.

- (b) (i) Two (2) active disciplinary cases.
(ii) Four (4) completed disciplinary cases.
- (c) Forty-six (46) people (inclusive of learner/interns) have been employed since the Provincial Executive assumed responsibility, in terms of section 139(5)(c) of the Constitution, for the implementation of the financial recovery plan, three of which are permanent appointments, two are section 56 appointments, six learner/intern appointments and the remainder are contract appointments in order to deal with temporary capacity requirements.
- (d) The following positions were filled:

Note: In accordance with Cabinet resolution of 23 April 2014, relating to the uniform approach to deal with requests for sensitive and personal information by Standing Committees of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and on the advice of Legal Services and noting that the employees in question are Municipal employees and not Provincial Government employees, the names of the below persons employed at the Municipality have been withheld.

Section 56 appointments

- Chief Financial Officer (level s56 appointment)
- Director: Infrastructure Services (level s56 appointment)

Permanent:

- Superintendent: Mechanical (level 11)
- Traffic Officer (level 10)
- Cashier (level 6)

New and Permanent appointments (since October 2019)

- Accountant reporting (level T14)
- Manager BTO (level T16)

1-3-year contracts:

- Learners x 6 (contract end date 31/08/2020 referred to in question 4)

Contracts under 12 months:

- Twenty-seven (27) temporary workers (General Workers) were reinstated for a period of 9 months following a settlement agreement which was concluded prior to the Provincial Executive assuming responsibility, in terms of section 139(5)(c) of the Constitution for the implementation of the financial recovery plan. (contract end dates 30/09/2019)

- Fire fighter x 3 (3 months) (contract end date 30/09/2019) (level R4500 stipend) (Contract extended until 30 January 2020)
- Senior Clerk: Credit Control (3 months) (contract end date 30/09/2019) (level T8)
- Clerk: Credit Control (3 months) (contract end date 30/09/2019) (level T7)
- Secretarial (3 months) (contract end date 31/05/2019) (level T6)

Kannaland Municipality: EPWP interns

4. Mr G Bosman asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

(a) How many Expanded Public Works Programme interns or volunteers does the Kannaland Municipality have and (b) what positions are they filling?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

4. (a) Six (6) interns are employed under the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) grant. This programme is however not Local Government but Public Works Programme.
- (b) Two (2) interns are in Administration, Three (3) at Human Resources and One (1) at Archives.

Ladismith Municipality: title deeds

5. Mr G Bosman asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

(a) How many title deeds have been issued by the Ladismith Municipality between 2007 and 2019 and (b) how many are expected to be issued in the coming financial year?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:

5. (a) Details of the number of Title Deeds that were issued between 2007 and 2019 is not available. However, our records indicate that since 1994, the Kannaland Municipality has issued 2090 Title Deeds of which 661 were issued between 2009 and 2019.

Details are as follows:

TOWN	1994-2019	2009-2019
Ladismith	706	35
Calitzdorp	692	578
Van Wyksdorp	84	0
Zoar	608	48
TOTAL	2090	661

- (b) The expected number of transfers in the historic projects are 50 – 100.

Grassy Park clinic

6. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:

With reference to a complaint received on 9 September 2019 that the Grassy Park Clinic did not have running water or functional ablution facilities:

What are the reasons for this service failure and what corrective measures is her Department putting in place to ensure that this does not happen again?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

6. The Grassy Park Community Day Centre had a new borehole installed at the facility a few months ago. Due to teething issues a water pipe burst in the container where the purifying system was situated. This caused a disruption in the water service and a consequent water shortage for a short period of time. A company was contacted on the same day to attend to the problem and water was restored on the same day.

Drakenstein Municipality: Latana-Kolbe Housing Project:

7. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

(a) What is the status of the Lantana-Kolbe Housing Project in the Drakenstein Municipality, (b) how many units have been allocated measured against the number of qualifying beneficiaries and (c) what is the proposed plan to accommodate the non-qualifying beneficiaries who are currently staying on the premises?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:

7. (a) Project approval was granted by my department for the construction of 76 housing units and 84 serviced sites.

- (b) To date, 51 units have been completed and allocated to approved beneficiaries.

The remaining 25 units will be constructed and completed during the current financial year and has already been provisionally allocated to the approved beneficiaries.

With regards to the serviced sites, 59 have already been serviced whilst delays in completing the remaining 25 have occurred due to structures that was in the way of construction.

The sites have subsequently been cleared and it is hoped that it will reach completion by the end of the current financial year.

- (c) The provision of serviced sites will be made available to non-qualifying beneficiaries residing on the settlement.

*Drakenstein Municipality
Grebe and Pienaar streets provincial housing units*

8. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

When is the expected transfer date of the Grebe and Pienaar streets provincial housing units and title deeds in the Drakenstein Municipality?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:

8. Approval for the subdivision of both Grebe and Pienaar Streets into individual plots have been granted by the municipality subject to the demolition and removal of the unlawful backyard structures.

The unlawful structures are mostly inhabited by extended family members of the tenants. Although the tenants have been informed that the subdivision and ultimate transfer of units cannot occur without the removal of the unlawful structures, the structures have not been removed.

Land for purposes of socio-economic integration

9. Mr L L Mvimbi asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

Whether his Department has identified any land and/or buildings in the various municipalities for the purposes of socio-economic integration and development; if not, why not; if so, what are the details of these properties?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

9. The Department has commenced with a process to identify provincial state land/or buildings to facilitate socio-economic integration and development per municipal area.

The process includes identifying land and or buildings and workshopping proposals within municipal areas after consultation to determine whether such land and or buildings are surplus to national and provincial needs. Whilst the Department's focus is on the provincial state land portfolio, the intention is to adopt a holistic approach to public land/or buildings that will include both municipalities and the national government, through the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure. This process has not been finalised yet and as such the details of properties are not yet available.

The Department has adopted a human settlements approach with land not required for other Provincial service delivery objectives, such as education and health. Aligned to this approach, the following properties have been or are in the process of being availed to the Department of Human Settlements for human settlement development:

- Erven 329 and 331 Hoekwil, at Wilderness Heights
- Portions 10 & 18 of the Farm 727 Joostenbergvlakte (De Novo), with the exception of land parcels required for continued institutional use
- Erven 6361, 6362, & 6348 Parow
- Erf 620 Ottery
- Erven 424, Portion of Remainder of 431, 440, 441, 442, 443, 444, 445, 446, 447, 448 and Portion of 2733 Oranjezicht
- Erf 109533 Cape Town, Charlesville
- Erf 47585 Mitchell's Plain
- Erven 21028 and 21029 George
- Farm 757 Cape RD, Ottery

In addition, the Department is undertaking the following projects, which are at different stages:

- 1) Conradie Park
- 2) Founders Garden/ Artscape Precinct
- 3) Two Rivers Urban Park
- 4) Vredenburg Precinct
- 5) Somerset Precinct

Witsand, Atlantis: building of school

10. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:

What progress has been made with the building of a school for the Witsand community in Atlantis?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

10. CoCT has presented an in-principle lease agreement for the Western Cape Education Department's (WCED) acceptance. During the CoCT's internal engagement period, no objections were received towards the leasing of the aforementioned site for educational purposes. However, the CoCT's Development Management Department has placed conditions on their support by notifying the WCED to conform with the following regulatory requirements:

- The current zoning of the site does not allow for a Place of Instruction (School) and therefore requires an application for a Temporary Departure to be submitted for the CoCT's consideration. Building plans may only be submitted upon approval of the Temporary Departure.
- The site is also located within the 5-16km radius of the Koeberg Nuclear Power Station. From a safety perspective, in terms of the CoCT's Traffic Evacuation Model, an additional form needs to accompany the Temporary Departure submission.

Recognising that the requirements listed above, in addition to the acceptance of the lease agreement, are separate functions within the Department of Transport and Public Work (DTPW), the WCED has submitted a request to the DTPW to further distribute the respective instructions accordingly. The WCED can only comment on timeframes once a response has been received from DTPW.

EPWP job opportunities

11. Mr D Smith asked the Premier:

- (1) How many (a) permanent job opportunities and (b) EPWP job opportunities did the provincial government create in total in (i) 2014, (ii) 2015, (iii) 2016, (iv) 2017, (v) 2018 and (vi) 2019 to date;
- (2) whether the provincial government's success in job creation is based on the creation of permanent jobs or on EPWP jobs?

The PREMIER:

11. DEDAT

(1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), (iv), (v) and (vi); and (2) It is important to note that the Provincial Government does not directly create jobs but instead influences the enabling environment in which the economic agents in the provincial economy can create jobs.

With that said, Quarterly labour Force Survey (QLFS) employment data for the Western Cape is shown Table 1 below. Table 1 shows the total employment for the Western Cape Province during 2013Q1 and 2019Q2.

Western Cape Employment, 2013Q1 – 2019Q2								
	2013Q1	2014Q1	2015Q1	2016Q1	2017Q1	2018Q1	2019Q1	2019Q2
Total	2 091 000	2 237 000	2 261 000	2 356 000	2 406 000	2 530 000	2 520 000	2 497 000
Employed								

EPWP (DTPW)

(1) (b) (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), (iv), (v) and (vi); and (2) The provincial government created the following EPWP job opportunities for the periods under review:

EPWP JOB OPPORTUNITIES CREATED BY THE WCG	
Financial Year	Achieved
2014/2015	75 458
2015/2016	46 702
2016/2017	63 076
2017/2018	74 384
2018/2019	78 358
Total	337 978
2019/2020 Current	29 549

Work Opportunity: Refers to paid work created for an individual on an EPWP project for any period of time, within the employment conditions of the Code of Good Practice for EPWP. Learnerships will also constitute work opportunities (EPWP Guideline, 2015).

*Safety Plan***12. Mr B N Herron asked Premier:**

With reference to the Premier's Safety Plan:

- (1) How is the Safety Plan's budget of R1 billion being allocated;
- (2) whether the Safety Plan includes the procurement of equipment, firearms and vehicles; if so, (a) who will procure and own the equipment, firearms and vehicles and (b) in terms of what power, legislation or policy will the equipment, firearms and vehicles be distributed to municipalities in the province;
- (3) (a) who will employ the additional 3 000 law-enforcement officers, (b) what type of employment contract (for example permanent, contract or EPWP) will be offered to these law-enforcement officers and (c) when will the first 1 000 law-enforcement officers commence their employment;
- (4) whether these law-enforcement officers will be deployed in the province in accordance with a specific declaration of powers and functions granted to the City of Cape Town or in accordance with the "Declaration of peace officers for law enforcement officers appointed by a municipality" issued by the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services in terms of the Criminal Procedure Act, 1977 (Act 51 of 1977), on 19 October 2018;

- (5) whether the City of Cape Town has a separate or unique declaration of peace officers or powers; if so, what are the details of these powers and jurisdiction;
- (6) when these law-enforcement officers are deployed in municipalities in the province in accordance with either declaration mentioned in (4), (a) how will these law-enforcement officers operate under the “command and control” of the provincial government, (b) what will be the structure of that command, (c) who will be the commanding officer or authority, (d) how will they be deployed in the province and (e) what technology will be used to determine their deployment?

The PREMIER:

- 12. (1) The budget for the Safety Plan will be allocated to the two elements of the plan: enforcement, which includes the cost of employment for 3,150 personnel once the full force is deployed and for programmes geared towards preventing violence throughout the Western Cape Government.
- (2) Yes.
 - (a) In terms of our Transfer Payment Agreement, which is still to be concluded with the City of Cape Town, the “Beneficiary” (municipality) will procure and own the equipment as long as the project runs.
 - (b) Not applicable. The funds are transferred to the “Beneficiary”.
- (3) (a) The “Beneficiary”.
- (b) The Transfer Payment Agreement stipulates that the “Beneficiary” must appoint the law enforcement officers. The “Beneficiary” will do the appointments in accordance with its own rules and regulations.
- (c) The Western Cape Government is entering into an agreement with the City of Cape Town to ensure that the first 1,000 law enforcement officers will be on boarded before the end of the financial year.
- (4) In accordance with the “Declaration of peace officers for law enforcement officers appointed by a municipality” issued by the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services in terms of the Criminal Procedure Act, 1977 (Act 51 of 1977), on 19 October 2018.
- (5) No.

- (a) The “Beneficiary” and WCG envisage entering into an “Intergovernmental Implementation Protocol” wherein the WCG will co-ordinate with the City of Cape Town the implementation and direction of the project. The WCG will further continue to exercise its oversight role.
- (b) The normal structure of command vis-à-vis the law enforcement officers within the “Beneficiary’s” safety and security structure will apply and the WCG will provide assistance in terms of the envisaged “Intergovernmental Implementation Protocol”.
- (c) See answer for Question 12(6)(b).
- (d) The deployment will be data driven and the WCG will provide assistance in terms of the envisaged “Intergovernmental Implementation Protocol”.
- (e) It is our objective to enhance the impact of these additional deployments of law enforcement officers by improving on the models and systems currently used to determine areas in which such deployments must be made, ensuring that available safety resources are deployed when and where most needed. It is envisaged that this will be achieved through the greater use of technology and evidence based models and algorithms which will be linked and interlinked to existing and new data-sources such as crime stats, emergency medical response data, mortuary data and the EPIC devices already in use in the City of Cape Town to mention only some.

Attacks on vehicles by stoning

13. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

How many incidents of thieves attacking vehicles on roads by stoning, stealing or hijacking vehicles have been reported to his Department in (a) 2017/18, (b) 2018/19 and (c) 2019/20 to date?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

13. Crimes are reported to the South African Police Services, rather than the Department of Transport & Public Works. The Department has received recent information from the SAPS per the table below. The figures indicate that truck attacks on the N1 in the Western Cape have declined considerably between 2018 and 2019. As of June 2019, there were 18 truck attacks on the “N1 Cape Town”, which is 79.5% less than the 88 attacks reported in the same period last year.

MONTH 2018	N1 CAPE TOWN	MONTH 2019	N1 CAPE TOWN
JAN 2018	5	JAN 2019	3
FEB 2018	12	FEB 2019	1
MAR 2018	13	MAR 2019	2
APR 2018	14	APR 2019	3
MAY 2018	20	MAY 2019	3
JUN 2018	24	JUN 2019	6
JUL 2018	12		
AUG 2018	15		
SEP 2018	9		
OCT 2018	11		
NOV 2018	3		
DEC 2018	1		

Mitchells Plain Hospital: fire

14. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Health:

With reference to the recent fire at the Mitchells Plain Hospital:

- (1) Whether her Department has received any reports relating to the fire; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether her Department has appointed a contractor to refurbish the Hospital; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

14. (1) For clarification, the recent fire occurred at the Mitchells Plain Community Health Centre (or day-hospital) not the district hospital. A forensic report on the fire, which should shed light on the cause of it has not yet been received. The specific timelines on when it will be available is unclear as it entails various aspects of the investigation.
- (2) Various elements of the facility have been programmed for refurbishment:
 - a. A contract for the replacement of the entire roof was nearing completion at the time of the fire,
 - b. Another contract has recently commenced for the upgrade of the records room, and
 - c. Planning for the reinstatement of the day-theatre has already begun.

(i)

INTERPELLATIONS UNDER NAME OF MEMBER

(as put to relevant Minister)

Bakubaku-Vos, N G –	
Social Development.....	727
Christians, F C –	
Agriculture	446
Transport and Public Works	688, 761
Dugmore, C M–	
Premier	630
Kama, M –	
Community Safety	443, 625
Makamba-Botya, N –	
Education.....	771
Marais, P J –	
Community Safety	451
Maseko, L M –	
Human Settlements	538
Nkondlo, N D –	
Finance and Economic Opportunities	542
Philander, W F –	
Health	263
Van der Westhuizen, A P –	
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	638
Transport and Public Works	688, 689
Xego, M –	
Community Safety	732, 765

QUESTIONS

(Oral and Written: as put to relevant Minister under name of Member)

Allen, R I –	
Community Safety	276, 584, 585, 645, 709, 744, 746
Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	118, 650
Social Development.....	709

America, D –

Human Settlements.....	686, 687, 739
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	789

Bans, A P –

Cultural Affairs and Sport	484, 489, 495
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	319, 323

Baartman, D M –

Community Safety.....	512, 536, 595, 700
Finance and Economic Opportunities	595
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	319, 323
.....	514, 696, 697

Bakubaku-Vos, N G –

Social Development	236, 237, 293, 294, 496, 723, 742
--------------------------	-----------------------------------

Bosman, G –

Human Settlements.....	742, 812
Social Development	259, 262, 284
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	693, 810
.....	812

Botha, L J –

Cultural Affairs and Sport	781
Education	466, 711, 713, 758
Transport and Public Works	693

Christians, F C –

Community Safety.....	804
Education	473, 514, 587, 675, 676, 783, 790, 804
Health.....	500, 579, 820
Transport and Public Works	482, 819

De Jager, I –

Education	788
-----------------	-----

Dugmore, C M –

Education	473
Premier	458, 463, 517
Transport and Public Works	1

Herron, B N –

Agriculture	515
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	586
Community Safety.....	513
Human Settlements.....	466
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	269, 817
Premier	113
Social Development	115
Transport and Public Works	392, 726

Kama, M –

Community Safety 13, 129, 291, 292, 440, 516, 663

Lekker, P Z –

Community Safety 5

Education..... 246

Finance and Economic Opportunities 246

Health 298, 718

Human Settlements 245

Premier 645

Lili, A –

Health 137

Human Settlements 16, 140, 491, 492, 498, 660, 805

Mackenzie, R D –

Community Safety 592, 714, 715, 757

Education..... 717

Premier 524, 548, 757, 775

Social Development..... 793

Makamba-Botya, N –

Community Safety 748

Health 748

Marais, P J –

Health 580

Marran, P –

Agriculture 735

Community Safety 656

Maseko, L M –

Human Settlements 409, 411, 412, 500, 588

Mitchell, D G –

Community Safety 3, 117, 118

Human Settlements 3

Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning 20

Transport and Public Works 299, 689, 808

Mvimbi, L L –

Transport and Public Works 734, 814

Nkondlo, N D –

Finance and Economic Opportunities 616, 617, 619

Premier 555

Philander, W F –

Community Safety.....	590
Health.....	247, 257, 258, 279, 591, 673, 710, 738, 813
Human Settlements.....	674, 741, 814

Sayed, A K –

Education	16, 17, 237, 238, 239, 669, 722, 723, 787, 815
-----------------	--

Smith, D –

Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	492, 806
Premier	816

Van der Westhuizen, A P –

Agriculture	408, 581
Finance and Economic Opportunities	594
Human Settlements.....	392
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	407, 491
.....	715, 809
Transport and Public Works	471, 536

Wenger, M M –

Community Safety.....	125, 616, 755, 756
Cultural Affairs and Sport	126, 297, 706
Education	297
Health.....	123, 698, 707
Social Development	298
Transport and Public Works	699

Windvogel, R –

Health.....	127, 128, 285, 289, 556, 557, 579, 673
-------------	--

Xego, M –

Human Settlements.....	750
------------------------	-----

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

America, D	504
Baartman, D M	678
Bans, A P	795
Bosman, G	507, 796
Herron, B N	677
Nkondlo, N D.....	501
Van der Westhuizen, A P	681
Wenger, M M	802