

**No 7**

**REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA**

**DEBATES OF THE  
PARLIAMENT OF THE  
PROVINCE OF THE  
WESTERN CAPE**

**(HANSARD)**

**FOURTH SESSION – SIXTH PARLIAMENT  
OF THE PROVINCE OF THE WESTERN CAPE**

**10 & 24 NOVEMBER 2022 and 1,2,5 &12  
DECEMBER 2022**

## CABINET

The Premier.....	Mr A R Winde
Minister of Agriculture.....	Dr I H Meyer
Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	Ms A J Du Toit Marais
Minister of Education.....	Mr D J Maynier
Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	Ms M M Wenger
Minister of Health and Wellness .....	Ms N Mbombo
Minister of Infrastructure.....	Mr T A Simmers
Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.....	Mr A W Bredell
Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety.....	Mr R I Allen
Minister of Social Development.....	Ms S Fernandez
Minister of Mobility.....	Mr D G Mitchell

## OFFICE-BEARERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

Speaker.....	Mr M Mnqasela
Leader of Government Business.....	Dr I H Meyer
Deputy Speaker.....	Ms B A Schäfer
Leader of the Opposition .....	Mr C M Dugmore
Chief Whip : DA.....	Ms L J Botha
Chief Whip : Opposition.....	Ms P Z Lekker
Secretary.....	Mr R Adams

## MEMBERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT PARTIES

Democratic Alliance = DA  
 African National Congress = ANC  
 African Christian Democratic Party = ACDP  
 Economic Freedom Fighters = EFF  
 AL JAMA-AH = AL JAMA-AH  
 Freedom Front Plus = FF PLUS

Allen, Reagan Ivan .....	DA
America, Derrick.....	DA
August, Shaun Nigel.....	GOOD
Baartman, Deidre Maudelene.....	DA
Bakubaku-Vos, Ntombezanele Gladys.....	ANC
Bans, Anyanda Precious .....	ANC
Bosman, Gillion .....	DA
Botha, Ms Lorraine Juliette.....	DA
Bredell, Anton Wilhelm .....	DA
Brinkhuis, Galil .....	AL JAMA-AH
Christians, Ferlon Charles .....	ACDP
Dugmore, Cameron Muir.....	ANC
Fernandez, Ms Sharna Gail.....	DA
Fry, Christopher Mario.....	DA
Kaizer-Philander, Ms Wendy Felecia .....	DA
Kama, Mesuli .....	ANC
Lekker, Ms Patronella Zingisa .....	ANC
Lili, Andile .....	ANC
Mackenzie, Ricardo Denver .....	DA
Makamba-Botya, Ms Nosipho.....	EFF
Marais, Petrus Jacobus.....	FF PLUS
Marran, Patrick .....	ANC
Marais, Ms Anroux Johanna Du Toit .....	DA
Maseko, Ms Letta Matlhodi.....	DA
Maynier, David John .....	DA
Mbombo, Ms Nomafrench .....	DA
Meyer, Ivan Henry .....	DA
Mitchell, Daylin Gary.....	DA
Mnqasela, Masizole.....	DA
Murray, Ms Cayla Ann Tomšs .....	DA
Mvimbi, Lulama Lennox .....	ANC
Nkondlo, Ms Nobulumko Degracia.....	ANC
Plato, Daniel .....	DA
Sayed, Muhammad Khalid .....	ANC
Schäfer, Ms Beverley Ann.....	DA
Simmers, Tertuis Alfred.....	DA
Smith, Danville .....	ANC
Van der Westhuizen, Andricus Pieter .....	DA
Wenger, Ms Mireille Mary.....	DA
Winde, Alan Richard .....	DA
Windvogel, Rachel .....	ANC
Xego, Melikhaya .....	EFF

**PERMANENT DELEGATES TO  
NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

Arnolds, Andrew .....	EFF
Gillion, Ms Maurencia Natalie.....	ANC
Labuschagne, Ms Cathlene.....	ANC
Londt, Johan Jaco .....	DA
Labuschagne, Ms Cathlene.....	ANC
Njadu, Edward Zoyisile.....	ANC
Sileku, Isaac Mbulelo .....	DA

**INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS**

Aarto system: readiness to implement – Motion .....	4082
Abalone and marine poaching: successes by SAPS – Motion .....	1386
Absa Run Your City and Langa Run for Freedom Races – Motion .....	5779
Accommodation sector jobs: loss of – Motion.....	1582
Accountability: measures taken to promote – Motion .....	3958
Ad-Hoc Committee: Tuberculosis-related matters – Motion .....	6134
Affordable housing in the city centre – Motion .....	258
Africa Day – Motion .....	5793
Africa, Kenny: retirement – Motion .....	1776
African Union Commission: observer status granted to Israel – Motion .....	4179
Agricultural economy: transformation of – Motion.....	311
Albanie Farm: Lambertsbaai, evictions – Motion .....	2085
Alcohol and cigarettes – Motion.....	2428
Alcohol-related offences – Motion .....	2189
Alcohol restrictions: demands by traders – Motion .....	4043
Alcohol: safe consumption of – Motion .....	1586
Body of young girl found in wheelie bin – Motion.....	6097
Chrysalis Academy: graduates – Motion .....	6018
Chrysalis Academy: new intake – Motion .....	1714
Al-Maamana: Lenteguur, Mitchells Plain – Motion.....	1396
Alpine Primary School: multiple burglaries – Motion.....	193
Amazon Headquarters: halt on construction – Motion .....	5462
ANC interim Provincial Committee – Motion.....	323
ANC: internal machinations – Motion .....	3803
ANC: lifestyle audits – Motion.....	2153
ANC: nepotism and cronyism – Motion.....	2366
ANC Youth League: 75th Anniversary – Motion .....	418
ANC: 6th National Policy Conference – Motion .....	6010
Andile Mbenyane inaugural Pre-season tournament – Motion .....	321
Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports	10, 13, 56, 132, 149
.....	196, 260, 326, 358, 433, 508, 518, 589, 685, 781, 824, 941, 1047,
.....	1129, 1221, 1241, 1269, 1296, 1326, 1355, 1427, 1489, 1556, 1597, 1723,
.....	1787, .1843, 1941, 2034, 2115, 2160, 2230, 2333, 2390, 2451, 2517, 2539,
.....	2608, .2671, 2867, 3048, 3149, 3274, 3378, 3578, 3698, 3816, 3875, 3922,
.....	3967, .4003, 4050, 4093, 4184, 4217, 4257, 4281, 4332, 4352, 4404, 4499,
.....	4693, 4772, 4970, 5002, 5060, 5137, 5300, 5436, 5475, 5606, 5747
.....	5801, 5855, 5891, 5962, 6019, 6057, 6106, 6180, 6198
Annual National Crime Statistics – Motion.....	410
Annual Provincial Sports Awards – Motion .....	499
Annual Report contributions – Motion.....	662
Anti-farm-attack demonstration – Motion.....	2324
Apartheid criminals: prosecution – Motion .....	4090
Apartheid-era school names – Motion .....	406
Apartheid legacy of spatial development and structural racism – Motion .....	2298
Apartheid Place and street names: renaming – Motion .....	579
Apartheid spatial legacy – Motion.....	4001
Apartheid spatial planning – Motion.....	3792
Arcadia Place evictions – Motion.....	575
Arcelormittal: loss of jobs	

Archbishop Desmond Tutu Library – Motion .....	5841
Arendse, Colin: slander case dismissed – Motion.....	682
Army: deployment of – Motion .....	174
Ascension Day – Motion .....	1390
Ashgar, Shanawaaz: kidnapping – Motion .....	6104
Athlone fires – Motion .....	679
Atlantis: Primary Healthcare clinics – Motion .....	5949
Atoli, Nomvuso: arrest of murder suspect – Motion.....	2326
Attack on ANC ward councillor: Old Crossroads – Motion .....	1400
Attack on Muslim woman – Motion.....	2432
Attacks on trucks – Motion .....	423
Audit report: Department of Agriculture – Motion .....	1577
BBBEE advisory council: appointment – Motion .....	5852
BBBEE status level of suppliers - Department of Health – Motion .....	167
Baby Kaiisha Meniers: kidnapping – Motion .....	5846
Baartman, Deidre: member – withdrawal of mistruth – Motion.....	5471
Baden Powell Way: Khayelitsha – bodies dumped – Motion .....	2449
Backyard dwellers – Motion .....	406
Bargaining Council agreements – Motion .....	561
Barrydale: gender-based violence – Motion.....	1781
Beaufort West Municipality: financial recovery plan – Motion .....	4324
Bergvriervier Municipality: eviction of homeless from temporary shelter.....	3808
Bester, Nicole: murdered UWC student – Motion.....	4043
Better Living Challenge project – Motion.....	4178
Big banks planned shutdown – Motion.....	576
Biko, Stephen – Motion .....	428
Biko, Steve: commemoration – Motion.....	2359
<b>Bills:</b>	
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2020]	
Introduction and first reading .....	1241
Consideration of principle .....	1255
Consideration of votes and schedules.....	1257
Finalisation .....	1259
Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill (2021/22 Financial Year) [B1 – 2022]	
Introduction and first reading .....	5001
Consideration of principle .....	5058
Consideration of Vote and Schedule .....	5059
Finalisation .....	5060
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Introduction and first reading .....	767
Consideration .....	785
Vote 1: Premier .....	829
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	847
Vote 6: Health .....	866
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	878
Vote 5: Education .....	894
Vote 14: Local Government.....	905
Vote 7: Social Development .....	917
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.....	927
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	953

Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism.....	968
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	968
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports.....	983
Vote 8: Human Settlements.....	995
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	1026
Consideration of votes and schedules.....	1033
Finalisation.....	1039
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Introduction and first reading.....	4403
Consideration of principle.....	4439
Vote 1: Premier.....	4505
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	4519
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	4528
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.....	4539
Vote 14: Local Government.....	4545
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	4553
Vote 7: Social Development.....	4561
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	4572
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	4615
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	4623
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism.....	4631
Vote 5: Education.....	4641
Vote 6: Health.....	4654
Vote 8: Human Settlements.....	4672
Consideration and schedules.....	4687
Finalisation.....	4688
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2020]	
Introduction and first reading.....	1224
Consideration of principle.....	1260
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	1260
Vote 1: Premier.....	1263
Vote 6: Health.....	1263
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	1263
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.....	1264
Vote 7: Social Development.....	1264
Vote 8: Human Settlements.....	1264
Vote 5: Education.....	1265
Vote 14: Local Government.....	1265
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	1265
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism.....	1266
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports.....	1266
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	1266
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	1267
Consideration of votes and schedules.....	1267
Finalisation.....	1268
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020].....	1740
Consideration of principle.....	1807
Vote 1: Premier.....	1844
Vote 6: Health.....	1863
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	1876

Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	1888
Vote 14: Local Government.....	1900
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	1914
Vote 5: Education .....	1928
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	1947
Vote 7: Social Development.....	1969
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism .....	1983
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports .....	1994
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	2006
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	2016
Consideration of votes and schedules.....	2031
Finalisation .....	2033
<b>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]</b>	
Introduction and first reading.....	3368
Consideration of principle.....	3429
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	3466
Vote 6: Health .....	3479
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	3493
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	3512
Vote 14: Local Government.....	3521
Vote 1: Premier .....	3532
Vote 7: Social Development.....	3549
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	3562
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	3579
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	3595
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	3607
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	3624
Vote 5: Education.....	3642
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3662
Consideration of votes and schedules.....	3679
Finalisation .....	3691
Executive statement.....	3692
<b>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]</b>	
Introduction and first reading.....	4986
Consideration of principle.....	5022
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	5062
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	5079
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	5096
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	5116
Vote 6: Health .....	5171
Vote 1: Premier .....	5201
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	5230
Vote 14: Local Government.....	5252
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	5276
Vote 7: Social Development.....	5301
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	5324
Vote 5: Education.....	5353
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	5385
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	5414
Consideration of votes and schedule .....	5432
Finalisation .....	5435

Western Cape Biodiversity Bill [B2B – 2021]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	4477
Western Cape Land Use Planning Amendment Bill [B6 – 2020]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	3873
Western Cape Laws Repeal Bill [B5 – 2019]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	2107
Western Cape Museums Ordinance Amendment Bill [B5 – 2020]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	3574
Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B1-2020]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	3870
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	2818
Introduction and first reading .....	2664
Vote 1: Premier.....	2871
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	2887
Vote 6: Health.....	2900
Vote 5: Education .....	2913
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	2926
Vote 14: Local Government .....	2935
Vote 7: Social Development.....	2943
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	2952
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	2964
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism.....	2975
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	2985
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	2997
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3010
Vote 8: Human Settlements.....	3020
Consideration of votes and schedules .....	3031
Finalisation.....	3032
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021] .....	
Introduction and first reading .....	3368
Consideration of principle .....	3397
Consideration of votes and schedule.....	3408
Finalisation.....	3428
Bitou Municipal Council: court ruling – Motion.....	247
Black farmers: challenges faced by – Motion .....	2300
Black farmers support – Motion .....	2193
Black wine producers – Motion.....	2225
Blended learning and the digital economy – Motion .....	5447
Blessings Educare Centre, Delft: fire – Motion .....	5888
Blockhouse Kitchen and Jonkershuis Feeding Scheme – Motion .....	1346
Bloekombos High School Principal – Motion .....	4330
Bloekombos violence – Motion .....	2067
Bloekombos High School: vandalism – Motion.....	1591
Body discovered in wheelie bin – Motion.....	6017
Bo-Kaap: gentrification – Motion.....	2064
Bo-Kaap: Nuisance by-laws – Motion.....	2216
Bonteheuwel car shooting – Motion.....	2383
Border protection – Motion .....	407
Botha’s Halte Primary school: opening – Motion .....	567

Boucher, Mark: call for removal as head coach – Motion.....	4254
Bread price: increase in – Motion.....	5880
Bredell, Anton: allegations against – Motion .....	2132
Bredell, Anton: breach of Executive Members Ethics Code – Motion .....	3452
Bredell, Anton MEC: gamesmanship by Local Government – Motion.....	1779
Bredell, Anton: Minister – abandoning the DA – Motion.....	2434
Bredell, Anton Minister: ill treatment of Cederberg and Matzikama Mayors – Motion .....	2422
Bredell, MEC and officials: call for investigation – Motion .....	1779
Bredell, Anton: Minister – investigation into complaints – Motion.....	2190
Breede Valley Municipality: tarring of roads – Motion .....	2071
Brooklands Primary School: Northpine – Motion.....	2071, 2445
Buffelsjags: shooting of bystander – Motion.....	675
Bullying in schools – Motion.....	346, 5594
Bus accident: George – Motion.....	5791
By-elections: Knysna and Beaufort West – Motion .....	3800
Call to open the economy and lift the ban on the sale of alcohol – Motion....	2046
Calls to prayers: bylaws on noise pollution – Motion.....	5783
Cape Access Centre: Laingsburg – Motion.....	350
Cape Flats: economic situation – Motion .....	347
Cape Flats violence – Motion .....	3857
Cape Muslim and slave museum – Motion .....	5449
CapeNature Cubs Club – Motion .....	5889
Cape Town City FC – Motion .....	239
Cape Town informal settlements: lack of basic infrastructure – Motion.....	4276
Cape Town official: tender scam – Motion .....	2385
Cape Town parking charge system – Motion .....	681
Capexit – Motion .....	3962
Care Company – Motion .....	1345
Carte Blanche Making a Difference Trust – Motion.....	6053
Case for sport report – Motion .....	5784
Casidra: sustainability and efficacy of – Motion .....	1385
CCTV at rail stations – Motion.....	504
CCTV installations: not working – Motion.....	5739
Cecil John Rhodes statue: beheading of – Motion.....	1768
Cederberg: illegal election of Speaker – Motion.....	238
Cederberg Municipality: clean audit – Motion .....	2424
Cederberg Municipality: SIU interference – Motion .....	563
Cederberg Municipality: unlawful motion of no confidence – Motion.....	170
Cell phone pylons: theft of batteries and equipment – Motion.....	4044
Central Karoo District Municipality: virtual meetings – Motion.....	1395
Central Karoo: Local government and service delivery – Motion .....	5446
Ceres: struggles of the people of Nduli – Motion.....	2213
Ceres: tensions in – Motion.....	2319
Cessation plans: DA – Motion .....	2133
Challenges to equality in education – Motion.....	2601
Child hunger and food poverty – Motion .....	5446
Child support services to vulnerable children – Motion .....	3957
Children: DA endangering lives – Motion .....	1530
Chronic and other medicines: outsourcing of – Motion .....	2425
Chrysalis Academy: new intake – Motion.....	1714

City Nature Challenge competition – Motion.....	5779
City of Cape Town: Capital Projects – Motion .....	5883
City of Cape Town Councillors – Alderman Titles – Motion.....	188
City of Cape Town: evictions .....	4246
City of Cape Town: high-priced utilities - Motion.....	4170
City of Cape Town: irregularities – Motion .....	250
City of Cape Town: property rates – Motion .....	352
City of Cape Town: security structures – Motion .....	4172
City of Cape Town: selling off inner city land – Motion .....	506
City of Cape Town: tariffs increase – Motion .....	6015
City of Cape Town: Unlawful Occupation By-Law .....	4180
City of Cape Town: water and sanitation budget – Motion .....	582
Claassen, Jacob: sentencing for fraud – Motion.....	2384
Clanwilliam Dam wall: raising of – Motion.....	310
Clicks: demonstration by rogue EFF sympathisers – Motion.....	2382
Clicks Group: Tresemme controversy – Motion.....	2361
Climate Change 2021: United Nations Report – Motion .....	4245
Cloetesville and Kylemore High Schools: disciplinary punishments – Motion .....	6157
Cloetesville Primary: Solar Panel System – Motion.....	6100
Closing: First session, Sixth Parliament.....	1043
Closing: Second session, Sixth Parliament .....	3044
Closing: Third session, Sixth Parliament .....	4689
Code of Conduct: Finding - Hon Member S N August .....	6060
Colonial and apartheid statues: removal of – Motion.....	2299
Communicare Housing Agency – Motion.....	503
Condolence – motions	
Abrahams, Winston (L J Botha) .....	4272
Adam, Faizel (M K Sayed) .....	1595
Adams, Jonathan (L J Botha).....	5597
Adams, Romeo (M M Wenger).....	565
Africa, Keanno (F C Christians).....	3863
Ajam, Shahied (L M Maseko) (M K Sayed) .....	1570, 1577
April, Jakobus (L J Botha) .....	3795
April, Wayne Donovan (L M Maseko).....	172
Arendse, Sheval (R D Mackenzie) .....	245
Arries, Nehemiah (M Kama).....	2366
Barden, Suraya (F C Christians) .....	5598
Barry, Magdalene (C M Dugmore) .....	1785
Barlett, Jamie (R D Mackenzie).....	5841
Benjamin, Petronella (L J Botha).....	1321
Bizos, George (R D Mackenzie) (C M Dugmore) .....	2363, 2380
Bloch, Graeme (L L Mvimbi).....	3796
Blom, Freddie (R Windvogel) .....	2214
Botha, Lorraine (D M Baartman) .....	6127
Botha, Roelof Dr (W F Philander).....	1533
Boyes, Carrol (R D Mackenzie).....	251
Buys family (F C Christians).....	6150
Cannoo, Brenden (L L Mvimbi) .....	2091
Canterbury, Giovanni (F C Christians) .....	2423
Claasen, Stewart (W F Philander).....	195

Cogill, Winston (R I Allen)	4176
Cloete, Rykie (P Z Lekker)	5952
Cupido, Gaylin (R I Allen)	1704
Dangor, Achmat (C M Dugmore)	2388
Dauids, Duncan (*P Marran)	2050
De Vries, Dameon and Kaylie (D M Baartman)	1767
Delpont, Neville (D Smith)	195
Dowie, Dexter (R Windvogel)	5597
Dukani, Jeannie (N D Nkondlo)	195
Dunn, Jane Dowie (A P van der Westhuizen)	2200
Duarte, Yasmin "Jessie" (P Z Lekker)	5951
Dyasi, Nontsikelelo (L M Maseko)	1573
Erasmus, Aseeqah (F C Christians)	6011
Fagan, Gawie (G Bosman)	2433
Faku, Zemeka (R D Mackenzie)	1471
Faro, Daffidol (F C Christians)	6011
Finger, Leyden (M Kama)	426
Fortuin, Cedric (F C Christians)	3863
Fraser, Deborah (R D Mackenzie) (P Z Lekker)	5778
Fritz, Marie (A P van der Westhuizen)	1706
Fritz, Theodora (M Kama) (L J Botha)	1314
Gaag, James (G Bosman)	5952
Gabada, Sibongiseni (P Z Lekker)	1589
Gabier, Abdulhamied: Sheikh (R Windvogel)	5453
Goetham, Nadia (W F Philander)	3795
Goldberg, Denis (C M Dugmore)	1316
Gonono, Peter Makhaya (R Windvogel)	175
Grendon, Paul (G Bosman)	413
Grobler, Cobus (P Z Lekker)	4434
Gugushe, Kwanele "Kwaito" (N G Bakubaku-Vos)	1553
Haron, Galiema (M K Sayed)	585
Hartley, Lincoln (G Bosman)	425
Hector, Jaydene (F C Christians)	3863
Hendricks, Runaldo (W F Kaizer-Philander)	5729
Hendricks, Shaik Seraj (N G Bakubaku-Vos)	1704
Hleza, Wonderboy (P Z Lekker)	5729
Hope, Tyrone (F C Christians)	3959
Informal Settlements Upgrading Partnership Grant (L M Maseko)	4323
Ismail, Shumeez (G Bosman)	4437
Jack, Lonwabo (P Z Lekker)	3802
Jacobs, Chriszelda (G Bosman)	3997
Jakoet, Ismael Dr (A P Bans)	3958
Jansen, Henry (D America)	1701
Jansen, Mark (L L Mvimbi)	1710
Januari, Layona: Brigadier (M Kama)	2369
Johnson, Lameez (M Kama)	5457
Jooste, Lizzy (P Marran)	5780
Jordaan, Theuns (R I Allen)	4434
Joseph, Hilton (M Kama)	426
Julies, Magdalena (R Windvogel)	1478
Kay, Lieutenant-Colonel André (R Allen)	667

Kambi, Nandipha (R Windvogel) .....	1478
Kebe, Nompaphelo (R I Allen).....	2303
Kebe, Wendy (R I Allen).....	2303
Kebe, Sive (R I Allen).....	2303
Kepskey, Anncha (R Windvogel).....	1391
Khan, Ibrahim Dr (A P Bans).....	1698
Kinnear, Charl (R I Allen) .....	2590
Khoba, Desmond (F C Christians) .....	2423
Kiriboto, Yusuf (G Bosman).....	1767
Koertzen, Rudi (G Bosman) .....	6096
Koloane, David (C M Dugmore) .....	192
Kriel, Alexander “Boetie” (P Marran) .....	2052
Langdown, Dawn (G Bosman) .....	6105
Levendal, Glen (F C Christians).....	2136
Levendal, John (P Marran) (W F Philander).....	2423
Lindoor, Clarissa (N G Bakubaku-Vos) .....	581
Lintvelt, Bert (G Bosman) .....	3997
Lottering, Cornelius (Neels) (L J Botha) .....	5450
Lukas, Agnes (M* K Sayed) .....	5780
Machana, Bangikhaya (D America).....	5728
Mafalala, Abongile (P Z Lekker) .....	5883
Mafuneka, Cwenga (N Makamba-Botya) .....	2308
Malgas, Charles (M K Sayed) .....	1592
Mandela, Zindzi (N Makamba-Botya) (M M Wenger) .....	
(P Z Lekker).....	1696, 1697, 1712
Mangenene, Henrietta Sylvester (W F Philander) .....	2198
Maritz, Bradley (D G Mitchell) .....	175
Matthews, Chantelle (L M Maseko).....	1764
Maya, Sive (M K Sayed).....	1592
Mabena, Bob (R I Allen) (N Makamba-Botya).....	2055, 2081
Mabuza, Jabu (C M Dugmore) .....	4088
MacCollen, Jack (M K Sayed).....	2082
Makaleni, Philip (P Marran) .....	5778
Maphatsoe, Kebby (M K Sayed) .....	4320
Matiwane, Buyile Sangolekhaya Bernard (P Z Lekker) .....	5952
Mattera, Don (G Bosman) .....	5954
Mazembe, Kungawa (L J Botha).....	189
Mbolekwa, Mncedisi (M Kama) .....	1769
Mello, Janika (R D Mackenzie).....	412
Mentor, Mabel Patronella “Vytjie” (N G Bakubaku-Vos) .....	6151
Mercuur, Neil (L M Maseko).....	4320
Meyer, Jannie (L J Botha) .....	3794
Meyer, Piet (D America) (C M Dugmore) .....	2194
Meyer, Rukeya (D M Baartman) .....	2051
Mini, Clarence: Dr (M K Sayed).....	1347
Mkhlali, Ms (M K Sayed) .....	1592
Mlangeni, Isitwalandwe Andrew (M Xego) .....	1764
Moerane, Mpho (M K Sayed) .....	5780
Mohala, Emily (N Makamba-Botya).....	3864
Mohamed, Hishaam (R I Allen) (C M Dugmore).....	2221
Mouton, Estelle (A P Bans) .....	1708

Mowzer, Mohamed Shukoor (M K Sayed) .....	5884
Mpambo-Sibhukwana, Thandi (G Bosman) .....	1699
Mpiko, Thulani (D Smith) .....	313
Mseleku, Sbusiso (M Xego) .....	2144
Mtwisha, Zola (M K Sayed) .....	1592
Mugabe, Robert Gabrie, (C M Dugmore) .....	432
Muller, Gershwin (L J Botha) .....	2139
Mzimba, Anton (P Marran) .....	6010
Nagia, Anwah Dr (L J Botha) .....	2595
Naughton, Pat (C M Dugmore) .....	5454
Ncedani, Zanele (M Kama) .....	6011
Ncithi, Philiswa (F C Christians) .....	2302
Ngidi, Ntombizakithi (W F Philander) .....	1341
Nicklo, Pedro (C M Dugmore) .....	3861
Nieuwenhuys, Jan (R I Allen) .....	426
Nkabinde, Jabu (M M Wenger) .....	199
Nkomiyahlaba, Sibusiso (P Z Lekker) .....	2446
Nomdo, Christina (A P Bans) .....	1321
Nomzazi, Phumeza (P Z Lekker) .....	4320
Ntamo, Thembisile Gladstone (C M Dugmore) .....	6151
Ntjuna, Kaunda (N Makamba-Botya) .....	1762
Nyalasa, Lelethu (N G Bakubaku-Vos) .....	5728
Nyangiwe, Simtembile (R I Allen) .....	426
Oliver, Monty (D G Mitchell) .....	3796
Opperman, Moira (L M Maseko) .....	176
Padayachee, Vishnu (P Z Lekker) .....	3997
Paulse, Abedah (G Bosman) .....	1767
Pecci, Marcelo (M Kama) .....	5741
Pedro, Thomas (W F Philander) .....	1576
Phangindawo, Naledi (W F Philander) .....	1572
Phillips, Johan (F C Christians) .....	4084
Pietersen, Mark (F C Christians) .....	4084
Pistorius, Hendrik (A P van der Westhuizen) .....	6013
Plaatjies, Allison (L J Botha) .....	668
Plaatjies, Daniel (D M Baartman) .....	2596
Plaatjies-van Huffel, Mary-Ann (W F Philander) (P Z Lekker)....	1388, 1399
Potgieter, Kobus (N G Bakubaku-Vos) .....	2144
Pretorius, Estienne (D G Mitchell) .....	193
Pule, Tshegofatso (W F Philander) .....	1572
Rauss Sue Ann (F C Christians) .....	3863
Richter, Abraham Jacobus Stephanus (L J Botha) .....	1769
Ritchie, Victor: 90 <sup>th</sup> birthday (L J Botha) .....	2605
Ronge, Barry (G Bosman) .....	5955
Rossouw, Stefanus (P Marran) .....	2426
Rwexama, Kiki (P Z Lekker) .....	3794
Saunders, David (W F Philander) .....	500
Sampson Deon (F C Christians) (M K Sayed) (L L Mvimbi) .....	2050, 2052, 2065
Schilder, Cederic (M M Wenger) .....	2428
Schrikker, Flori (A Bans) .....	2444
Schüssler, Mike (G Bosman) .....	5784

Scotsman, Ernest (L J Botha) .....	4320
September, Marshall (P Marran) .....	5778
Sigcawu, King Mpendulo Zwelonke (M Kama).....	667
Sigcau, Zanozuko Tyelovuyo: King (C M Dugmore) .....	5884
Sirunu, Andile (M Kama) .....	4322
Siswana, Siyabulela (C M Dugmore) .....	1719
Siyoki, Asanda (P Z Lekker).....	1593
Smith, Willis (D G Mitchell).....	2598
Snyman, Tamar (F C Christians).....	3997
Spannenberg, Izak Wilhelm Abraham (L J Botha) .....	1471
Strydom, Miemie (A P van der Westhuizen).....	1770
Surtie-Richards, Shaleen (M Kama).....	4044
Swartland, Maxwell (D G Mitchell) .....	182
Tempelhoff, Peter (G Bosman) .....	5952
Thopps, Anthea (A Bans).....	172
Titus, Chad-Lee Titus (D Smith).....	195
Titus, Charis (D Smith).....	195
Titus, Miguel (D Smith).....	195
Tom, Lungile (R I Allen).....	1340
Treu, Paul (L L Mvimbi).....	2089
Vahed, Phaldiel (G Brinkhuis) .....	3998
Van der Merwe, Kobus (G Bosman) .....	5952
Van Wyk, Chris (P Marran) .....	320
Veldman, Sazi (C M Dugmore) .....	430
Wanza, Geraldo (F C Christians) .....	3863
Wewers, Maria (L J Botha).....	4271
Willemse, Johannes (D America) .....	1575
Willemse, Juanita (L M Maseko) .....	2365
Williams, Chester (B N Herron) .....	364, 415
Williams, Leo (L J Botha) (R Windvogel) (Makamba-Botya) .....	2137
.....	2142, 2157
Wilsnach, Maryam Ali (W F Philander).....	187
Winde, William David (M M Wenger) .....	151, 188
Wingrove, Abraham (N Makamba-Botya).....	5458
Xaba, Khaya (R Windvogel).....	4088
Zenani, Osiphayo (N Makamba-Botya) .....	2056
Congratulatory / Wishes – Motions:	
Adams, Clara (F C Christians) .....	6040
Ahlul-Bat Foundation and Gift of the Givers (M K Sayed) .....	2374
Akter, Shadia (G Brinkhuis).....	4433
Allen, Reagen (L J Botha) .....	5777
Ameeroedien, Rayana (F C Christians) .....	416
Amon, Megan (L J Botha) .....	1774
ANC - Ward 95 By-election victory (D Smith).....	322
Archbishop Emeritus Desmond Tutu and Leah Tutu (L L Mvimbi) .....	2382
Arendse, Norman (A P Bans) .....	4087
Bakubaku-Vos, Ntombezanele (R Windvogel) .....	1317, 1393
Banton, Gallie (M K Sayed).....	1575
Bantom, Ronald (M K Sayed).....	1575
Banyana Banyana (A P Bans).....	5957
Barnes Prince Foundation (D M Baartman) .....	6155

Bauer, Leah-Angel (F C Christians)	5950
Beaufort West Municipality (L J Botha)	5452
Berman, Janneke (L L Mvimbi)	2068
Best fine dining restaurants: rankings (D M Baartman)	4173
Bianchi, Julio (G Brinkhuis)	4172
Blaauw, Heidi (W F Philander)	2148
Boks, Christo "Kito" (L J Botha)	5951
Booyesen, Lee-Shane (R D Mackenzie)	257
Breda, Charles (L J Botha)	4319
Brink, Clint (W F Philander)	4084
Calitzdorp Cellars: Awards (M G Bosman)	353
Cameron, Edward (M K Sayed)	581
Cape of Good Hope SPCA (F C Christians)	5778
Cape Muslim and Slave Museum (F C Christians)	5727
Cape Peninsula University of Technology Rugby Team (M Xego)	3862
Cape Town All Stars (M Kama)	5785
Cape Town Cycle Tour (D America)	5450
Cassiem, Dayaan (G Brinkhuis)	4086
Cassiem, Mustapha (G Brinkhuis)	4086
Central Karoo resident – Covid-19 (A P Bans)	1397
City of Cape Town (R I Allen)	173
City of Cape Town (D America)	5596
City of Cape Town (D M Baartman)	3799
City of Cape Town (A P van der Westhuizen)	3912
Cloete, Ivan (A P van der Westhuizen)	3798
Coetzee, Mervyn (G Brinkhuis)	3913
Cottee, Delmaine (R Windvogel)	6151
Department of Agriculture (A P van der Westhuizen)	4046
Department of Community Safety: K9 Unit (R I Allen)	4087
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport (R I Allen)	3796, 3958, 4045
Department of Human Settlements (L M Maseko)	417
Department of Local Government and Treasury (L J Botha)	5452
Department of Social Development (G Bosman)	4436
Daniels, Patrick (W F Kaizer-Philander)	5729
De Kock, Nora (P Z Lekker)	1350
De Wet, Martus (F C Christians)	356
D F Malan High School (M K Sayed)	3960
Domingo (B N Herron)	2588
Dube-Ncube, Nomusa (P Z Lekker)	6097
Dudley, Karen (L J Botha)	2307
Dunn, Riyad (B N Herron)	2588
Du Toit: Brigadier (A Bans)	2448
Du Toit, Ciska (P Marran)	3804
Du Toit, Gawie (L J Botha)	2209
Du Toit, Gerhard: Dr (P Marran)	3804
Ellis, Desiree (G Bosman)	5955
Erasmus, Gideon (D G Mitchell)	1316
Erlich, Pippa (M M Wenger)	3794
Fernandez, Austin (F C Christians)	320
Fester, Gertrude: Professor (P Z Lekker)	5842
Foster, Craig (M M Wenger)	3794

Fourie, Caitlin (L L Mvimbi) .....	4321
Fritz, Albert: Hon (W F Philander) .....	3914
Garden Route International Film Festival (L L Mvimbi) .....	5953
Gauteng Provincial Government (N D Nkondlo).....	5459
Geqiwe, Anele (W F Philander).....	4085
Gift of the Givers (D America) .....	3862
Gili, Andile (M K Sayed) .....	6017
Groenvlei Secondary School (L J Botha) .....	1773
Habana, Bryan (F C Christians) .....	1570
Harris, Washiela (R D Mackenzie) .....	666
Hart, Ulvard (M M Wenger) .....	420
Jacobs, Faez (R D Mackenzie) .....	253
Jacobs, Kelly-Marie (A P van der Westhuizen) .....	316
Johannes, Jean-Marc (R I Allen) (G Brinkhuis).....	4086, 5595
Joon, Susanna (M G Bosman) .....	349)
Kirsten, Gary (F C Christians) .....	1570
Kolisi, Siya (F C Christians) (M Kama).....	1570, 1762
Koopman, Codie (F C Christians) .....	4045
Kuhn, Jerry and Pat (L J Botha) .....	574
Kwinana, Xolisa (R I Allen).....	2664, 4437
Ladles of love (G Bosman).....	1773
Le Roux, Marlene (A P Bans) (R I Allen).....	2212, 4270
Maarman, Leah (D M Bartman) .....	6150
Mabuso, Mancha (L L Mvimbi) .....	4321
Mackenzie, Tayden (R Windvogel) .....	5727
Magabotha, Sade (L L Mvimbi) .....	4321
Mahoko, Mosadi Dr (G Bosman).....	1546
Mallick, Azraa (F C Christians).....	502
Mapisa-Nqakula, Nosiviwe (P Z Lekker) .....	4256
Maritz, Herman (G Bosman) .....	5596
Maponopono, Naledi (M K Sayed) .....	6011
Maritz, Margaret “Aunty Griet” – 113th birthday (P Marran) .....	566
Marthinus: Lieutenant-Colonel (G Bosman) .....	671
Masemola, Sehlahle Fannie: Lieutenant-General (M Kama).....	5454
Mathee, Keith ( F C Christians) .....	356
Matthews, James David (F C Christians) .....	672
Matsaluka, Chuma (A P Bans) .....	176
McCarthy, Benni (A P Bans) .....	6042
Members and officials of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament (L M Maseko).....	4434
Mkhangel, Themba (G Brinkhuis).....	4319
Mkhefa, Asiphe (F C Christians) .....	2358
Modise, Khotso ( F C Christians).....	356
Montsi, Kholo (R Allen) .....	673
Mossel Bay and the Western Cape Government Joint Operation Centre (G Bosman) .....	6103
Mvimbi, Samkelo “Sam” (A P Bans).....	3999
Ndlovu Youth Choir (R I Allen) .....	502
Nel, Cecilia (D M Baartman).....	566
Newman, Catherine Dorothy (N Makamba-Boyta).....	1766
Nogcinisa, Noluthando (M K Sayed) .....	1390

Nonyana, Lucas (D M Baartman) .....	566
Ntombana, Mr: head nurse of Beaufort West Hospital (D G Mitchell)...	2214
Oaklands Secondary School (L J Botha) .....	1773
Oktober, Jason (G Brinkhuis) .....	5777
Oliver Tambo and Yusuf Dadoo Trust (M K Sayed).....	5794
Oosthuizen, Louis (C M Dugmore) .....	5954
Paarl Girls High School (D M Baartman) .....	6150
Petersen, Keegan (W F Philander) (G Brinkhuis) .....	4085, 5449
Pokwas, Michael (D America).....	190
Powell, Braedon (F C Christians) (M M Wenger).....	2195, 2207
Premier Alan Winde (L J Botha) .....	5733
Prince Albert D R Church (A P Bans) .....	6097
Princess Charlene of Monaco (C M Dugmore) .....	5954
Prins, Gladys (F C Christians) .....	6040
Proteas Women's Team: Cricket World Cup (P Z Lekker).....	5453
Provincial Department of Transport and Public Works (R D Mackenzie).....	4272
Public healthcare facilities: decreasing budgets (W Kaizer-Philander) .	6104
Purchase, Felicity (M M Wenger).....	4322
Ramaphosa Cyril: President (M Kama) .....	5454
Ramaphosa Cyril: President and his Cabinet .....	5455
Rasool, Ebrahim (A P Bans).....	2325
Ratsmina, Franchinah (L L Mvimbi) .....	4321
Reed, James (M M Wenger).....	3794
Rice, Kenny (M M Wenger) .....	420
Rice, Sean (M M Wenger) .....	420
Rugby World Cup Sevens 2022 waste collection initiative (M Xego)....	6157
Safe Travels Stamp (D M Baartman).....	2314
Santaco Executive Committee (D America).....	3996
Sass, Chevellee (M K Sayed) .....	6054
Schäfer, Debbie (L J Botha) .....	5734
Schreuder, Brian (M K Sayed).....	2091
Scott, Kiara (L M Maseko) .....	5882
Seale, Diane: Sister (N Makamba-Botya) .....	5732
Selfe, James MP (M M Wenger).....	4436
Shah, Nuha (G Brinkhuis).....	6149
Smith, Barry Dr (W F Kaizer-Philander).....	5452
Social Development and Early Childhood Development Department...	4271
Solani, Asisipho (M Kama) .....	5455
Sophi, Siyabulela (N D Nkdondlo) .....	6098
South African Commonwealth Games Team.....	6101
South African Homeless Street Soccer Team (R I Allen).....	191
South African Rooibos Council (A P van der Westhuizen) .....	4319
South African Women Lawyers Association's Western Cape Branch (N D Nkdondlo).....	5884
Springbok National Rugby Team (N Makamba-Botya) .....	670
Springboks: Castle Lager Incoming Series (L L Mvimbi) .....	5953
Springboks: victory (A P Bans) .....	4273
Steyn, Antoinette (L M Maseko).....	4321
Suliman, Tasnim (R Windvogel) .....	1345
Sykes, Lulu Lena (L M Maseko) .....	1322
The Rooibos Council (A P van der Westhuizen).....	4046

Thomas, Heathcliff (D America) .....	5450
Thumbadoo, Zeni (L J Botha).....	3959
TP Nala Pisce (N D Nkondlo).....	6154
TSU Private Security Firm (M Kama) .....	432
Tunzi, Zozibini (A Bans) .....	244
University of the Western Cape: renaming of main hall (P Z Lekker) ...	5956
Van As, Poppie “Aunty” (D M Baartman).....	185
Van Rooyen, Rene (W F Philander).....	4084
Van Staden, Roelof Erasmus (D G Mitchell) .....	314
Viljoen: Bessie (L M Maseko).....	3861
Vredendal firefighters (R Windvogel) .....	5885
Wann, Mike (R Windvogel).....	2447
Wells, Dan (G Bosman).....	5596
Wenger, Mireille (L J Botha).....	5777
Western Cape Department of Agriculture (A P van der Westhuizen) ...	5728
Western Cape Department of Infrastructure (R D Mackenzie) .....	5955
Western Cape Disaster Management Centre (D America).....	3996
Western Cape Education Department (L J Botha) .....	5956
Western Cape Provincial Disaster Management Centre (L J Botha)....	5451
Williams, Dr Athol (R D Mackenzie) .....	352
Witzenberg Municipality (W F Kaizer-Philander) .....	5730
World Children’s Prize Ceremony (M K Sayed) .....	5842
Yisa, Nduli Khanyiso (M K Sayed) .....	6017
4 x 100 metre men’s U20 relay team (F C Christians) .....	4270
CTICC Field Hospital – nurses – Motion.....	1544
CTICC: temporary Covid-19 Hospital – Motion.....	1779
Comprehensive Safety Plan – Motion .....	498
Comprehensive Sexuality education curriculum for 2020 – Motion .....	665
Council of the City of Cape Town – Motion.....	6041
Councillors: appointment of – illegal practices – Motion .....	5725
Councillors: threats against – Motion.....	2074
Courts: stance on sexual harassment in the workplace – Motion.....	4085
Coronavirus: labour inspectors, interference with – Motion .....	1338
Covid 19: alcohol restrictions – Motion .....	1715
Covid-19: Agricultural sector – food relief – Motion .....	1353
Covid-19 acquisitions: probe into – Motion .....	2318
Covid 19: cases – Motion .....	1579
Covid 19: cases in schools – Motion .....	1567
Covid-19: challenges faced by health facilities – Motion .....	1759
Covid 19: cleaners and porters – Motion .....	1694
Covid 1-9: closure of hospitals – Motion.....	1480
Covid 19: closure of schools due to – Motion .....	1704
Covid-19: cluster transmissions in the retail and agriculture sector – Motion	1540
Covid-19: community-based NGO’s, food donations – Motion .....	1555
Covid 19: contributions by communities – Motion.....	1533
Covid-19: Cuban medical professionals – Motion.....	1346
Covid-19: curb of infections in work spaces – Motion.....	1574
Covid 19: deaths – Motion .....	2381
Covid-19: deaths of healthcare workers – Motion.....	1387, 1703
Covid-19: deaths of teachers and staff members – Motion.....	1702
Covid-19: decontamination of school buildings – Motion .....	1593, 1757, 1783

Covid-19: delay by Premier to meet with opposition leaders – Motion .....	1312
Covid-19: devastation at Panorama Palms Retirement Resort – Motion .....	1550
Covid-19: disruption and shutdown of schools – Motion .....	1709
Covid-19: donation from MTN Foundation – Motion.....	1546
Covid-19: donation of masks and protection of frontline workers – Motion ...	1549
Covid-19: draconian measures – Motion.....	2047
Covid-19: economic recovery – Motion .....	1573, 2229
Covid-19: educational facilities: health safety measures – Motion .....	1352
Covid-19: educators – Motion .....	1700
Covid-19: Fairmont High School – Motion.....	1591
Covid-19: field hospital: CTICC – Motion .....	1582
Covid-19: fifth wave – Motion .....	5738
Covid-19: flare up areas – Motion .....	4091
Covid-19: Food distribution: draft regulations – Motion .....	1349
Covid-19: frontline workers – Motion.....	1337
Covid-19: frontline and essential workers – Motion.....	1337, 1695
Covid-19: gradual reopening of schools – Motion .....	1483
Covid-19: Groote Schuur testing and triage centre – Motion .....	1587
Covid-19: health officers and emergency staff – Motion .....	2072
Covid-19: health workers and their families – Motion.....	4173
Covid-19: herd immunity – Motion.....	2583
Covid-19: high electricity and water bills – Motion.....	1569
Covid-19: homeless people – Motion .....	2143
Covid-19: impact on food security – Motion .....	1382
Covid-19: impact on local and regional economies – Motion .....	1569, 1768
Covid-19: impact: Western Cape Economy – Motion.....	1381
Covid-19: impact on ECD's and social and economic livelihoods – Motion .	1528
Covid-19: impact on personal care services industry – Motion .....	1529
Covid-19: impact on SMME's and informal traders – Motion .....	3791
Covid-19: impact on the hotel industry – Motion .....	2148
Covid-19: infection rates in the retail sector – Motion.....	1314
Covid-19: infections and mortalities – Motion.....	1451
Covid-19: infections and spread – Motion .....	4083
Covid-19: infections in factories and on farms – Motion.....	1452
Covid-19 infections: youths – Motion .....	1581
Covid-19 infections: schools – Motion.....	1590
Covid-19 initiatives: financial management of – Motion .....	2357
Covid-19: Khayelitsha sub-district – Motion .....	2227
Covid-19: last minute deliveries to schools – Motion.....	1451
Covid 19: learners without face masks – Motion.....	1703
Covid-19: liquor ban impact on the wine industry – Motion .....	1382
Covid-19: local response teams – Motion .....	1474
Covid-19 lockdown: ANC official visit to Zimbabwe – Motion.....	2431
Covid-19: mismanagement of the pandemic by the ANC – Motion.....	1336
Covid-19: mobile testing units – Motion .....	1775
Covid-19: National day of prayer – Motion .....	1470
Covid-19: Nomzamo Primary School – decontamination – Motion .....	1538
Covid-19: Northpine Technical High School – Motion .....	2081
Covid-19: overload of hospitals – Motion .....	1399
Covid-19 pandemic emergency lockdown rules: flaunting of – Motion.....	1308
Covid-19 pandemic: National Government – Motion.....	4089

Covid-19 pandemic: provincial command centre – Motion .....	1309
Covid-19: patients appearing before Ad Hoc Committee – Motion .....	1785
Covid-19: political abuse by DA office bearers – Motion.....	1531
Covid-19: population immunity – Motion.....	3858
Covid-19: PPE procurement – Motion .....	2048
Covid-19: PPE procurement: price hikes – Motion .....	1452
Covid-19: preserving life and preserving livelihoods – Motion .....	1449
Covid-19: preventative actions – Motion.....	2151
Covid-19: preparedness – Motion.....	3911
Covid-19: principal of Settlers High School – Motion .....	1534
Covid-19: procurement fraud – Motion .....	2355
Covid-19: Proposed advertisement .....	4269
Covid-19: Provincial Government: wearing DA colours on face masks – Motion .....	1531
Covid-19: psychosocial support services – Motion .....	1481
Covid-19: public representatives testing positive – Motion .....	1708
Covid-19: quarantine centres – Motion.....	1309
Covid-19: readiness of hospitals – Motion.....	1568
Covid-19: readiness of schools – Motion.....	1450
Covid-19: readiness of the Western Cape – Motion .....	1580
Covid-19 regulations: SMME’s – Motion.....	1342
Covid-19: religious gatherings – Motion.....	1547
Covid-19: reopening of schools, readiness – Motion .....	1539, 1550
Covid-19 resurgence – Motion.....	2600
Covid-19: return of grade 7 and 12 learners – Motion .....	1482
Covid-19: rise of infections in the Western Cape – Motion .....	1482
Covid-19: safety of learners and teachers using bus transport – Motion .....	1554
Covid-19: safety of workers – Motion .....	1477
Covid-19: school feeding scheme – Motion .....	1772
Covid-19: schools and the third wave – Motion .....	3920
Covid-19: schools, calls for closure of – Motion.....	1693
Covid-19: schools, prolonged closure of – Motion .....	1758
Covid-19: shelters for the poor and homeless – Motion .....	1341
Covid-19: shortage of sanitation and protective gear – Motion.....	1545
Covid-19: sterling work by Western Cape Government – Motion .....	1480
Covid-19: social development interventions – Motion.....	1756
Covid-19: socio-economic conditions in hotspots – Motion .....	1530
Covid-19: socio-economic impact of – Motion .....	1400
Covid-19: statistics – Motion.....	2057
Covid-19: tender looting – Motion.....	2090
Covid-19: TERS payments – Motion .....	2086
Covid-19: testing for diabetes – Motion .....	1697
Covid-19: third wave – Motion .....	3911, 3917
Covid-19: third wave readiness – Motion.....	3909
Covid-19: third wave response plan – Motion.....	3792
Covid-19: UIF benefits – Motion .....	1387
Covid-19: Vaccine registration – Motion .....	3912
Covid-19: vaccinations – Motion.....	3863
Covid-19 vaccinations: choice of vaccine – Motion .....	1342
Covid-19: victims – Motion.....	1396
Covid-19: victims in the Western Cape – Motion .....	1315

Covid-19: Vodacom donation – Motion .....	1315
Covid-19: vulnerable workers – Motion .....	1571
Covid-19: Wesgro – Motion.....	1479
Covid-19: Western Cape death rate – Motion .....	1381
Covid-19: Western Cape Education Department – Motion.....	1469
Covid-19: Western Cape handling of outbreak – Motion.....	1381
Covid-19: Western Cape: highest numbers – Motion.....	1585
Covid-19: Western Cape Provincial Parliament: virtual proceedings– Motion	1348
Covid-19: Witzenberg Area – Motion .....	2064
Covid-19: Witzenberg Municipal Area – successes – Motion.....	1543
Crawford: new cell phone tower – Motion .....	2443
Cricket SA: review of match-fixing saga – Motion .....	2156
Crime and safety – Motion .....	165
Crime: fighting – Motion .....	3792
Crime, fighting of: community participation – Motion.....	3792
Crime in the province- – Motion .....	585
Crime: rising level in townships – Motion .....	2580
Crime: scourge of – Motion .....	494
Crime statistics – Motion .....	408
Crime statistics: increase – Motion.....	408
Crime: successes against – Motion.....	1325
Crops: profits on export – Motion .....	3802
Cuban doctors: medical assistance – Motion.....	1325
Cuban medical group: untested allegations of remuneration – Motion.....	1781
Cupido, Gaylin: murder – suspect arrested – Motion .....	1774
Curro Private School Hermanus: bullying – Motion.....	2438
DA: decline in the province – Motion.....	668
DA: double standards – Motion.....	2299
DA: double standards – Motion.....	2415
DA: double standards: Cuban Professionals – Motion.....	1760
DA: double standards in disciplinary matters – Motion.....	3801
DA: evictions of the poor – Motion .....	4268
DA: funding for the coming elections – Motion .....	1551
DA: implosion of – Motion .....	495
DA: infighting and factionalism – Motion .....	5776
DA leaders jumping ship – Motion.....	2301
DA Leadership – Motion.....	4268
DA-led City of Cape Town – Motion .....	3797
DA: Local Government – leaders of colour – Motion.....	2315
DA: maladministration and improper conduct by – Motion .....	6147
DA national leader: lifestyle – Motion .....	564
DA national leader: Mmusi Maimane – Motion.....	584
DA national leadership: withdrawal of Bonginkosi Madikizela – Motion .....	676
DA Policy conference – Motion .....	2386
DA Provincial leader: race – Motion .....	2328
DA: qualification scandals – Motion .....	3791
DA: retrenchments – Motion .....	424
DA: senior members: arrests – Motion.....	3999
DA: Southern Cape – Motion .....	1343
DA: Steinhoff donations – Motion.....	587
DA: undermining of accountability and transparency – Motion .....	3798

DA ward councillor: Pastor Melvin Roelfztra – Motion .....	4049
Dam levels: high price of water – Motion .....	412
Dam levels, increase in – Motion .....	177
Dams: good rainfall – Motion .....	2383
Day of Pentecost – Motion .....	1474
Day hospital: incorrect prescription, consequence of – Motion .....	180
De Doorns: looting of freight trucks – Motion .....	679
De Doorns: seasonal farm workers – Motion .....	6051
Deciduous fruit farmers – Motion .....	4433
Delft: girl shot dead on Women’s Day – Motion .....	6052
Democratic Alliance – capture by private property developers – Motion .....	5740
Department of Community Safety interventions – Motion .....	2604
Department of Labour: UIF-TERS investigations – Motion .....	3865
Department of Social Development: residential facilities for Older persons – Motion .....	1579
Department of Social Development: social distancing failure – Motion .....	1386
Deployment of medical professionals from Gauteng to assist the Western Cape – Motion .....	1597
Departmental circulation letters: Western Cape Schools – Motion .....	1784
Deputy Speaker:	
Acceptance speech by .....	8
Election of .....	7
Guidance:	
Virtual sittings .....	1683, 1737, 2267, 2342, 2392
Rulings of, .....	324, 1496, 2342, 2449, 3020, 4605, 4953, 5474, 6087
Deputy Speaker: investigation into allegations .....	1453
Devolution of powers: multi-party task team – Motion .....	6146
DHL Stormers: Vodacom United Rugby Championships – Motion .....	5954
Diaz Primary School: replacement school – Motion .....	312
Disadvantaged youth: economic opportunities – Motion .....	2297
Disaster season: readiness – Motion .....	3921
District Six: restitution projects – Motion .....	3859
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker .....	2092
Ad-hoc Committee – WCPP seating allocation .....	5743
Drakenstein: annual sports derby – Motion .....	6041
Drakenstein Municipality: borehole and BMX track – Motion .....	5881
Drakenstein Municipality: Municipal Manager – Motion .....	5887
Drakenstein Municipality: state of financial affairs – Motion .....	242
Drakenstein: social relief initiatives – Motion .....	1394
Drought: ongoing impact of – Motion .....	2417
Drug-related convictions – Motion .....	6148
Drug trafficking: female bus passenger – Motion .....	2367
Dustbins: absence of – Motion .....	4048
Dutch consulate: donation of food parcels – Motion .....	1720
Easter celebration – Motion .....	5452
ECD Centres: safe opening – Motion .....	1588
Economic transformation: policy paper on – Motion .....	408
Education Department head: contract – Motion .....	2385
Education Disaster warning – Motion .....	4043
Education: Head of Department: extension of employment – Motion .....	2421

Education HOD: Public Service Commission finding – Motion.....	2440
Education: inequality – Motion .....	2421
Education Minister: Debbie Schäfer: victimisation of whistle-blower.....	4278
Education: structural challenges – Motion.....	5447
Eid-Al-Fitr – Motion .....	1472, 3861
Eid Mubarak – Motion .....	1389, 5596
Electric vehicles: potential use and manufacture of – Motion.....	3957
Electricity: procurement of from IPP's – Motion .....	2058
Electricity tariff increases – Motion.....	4247
Elfindale land – restoration back to Brickles family – Motion.....	5730
Elim Primary School learners: transport – Motion .....	3916
Elsies River drug bust – Motion.....	2448
Elsies River shooting – Motion.....	1389
Emil Weder Secondary School: transport – Motion.....	1706
Emergency medical services: attacks on – Motion.....	1706
Emergency medical services: continued attacks on – Motion .....	5465
Emergency staff: ongoing attacks on – Motion .....	2584
Emergency workers: body cameras – Motion .....	2446
EMS, attacks on – Motion .....	2204
Energy security – Motion.....	3790
Energy security and Eskom's failures – Motion.....	237
Energy security in the Western Cape – Motion .....	1306
Entrenched and institutionalised racist culture – Motion .....	2131
Equal Education Law Centre – Motion.....	5736
Eerste River: attempted cash in transit heist – Motion .....	5605
Eskom bailout: impact on unemployment rate – Motion.....	168
Eskom: Security points – Motion.....	349
Etzebeth, Eben: alleged racial incident – Motion.....	354
Eviction prevention: Bromwell Street, Woodstock – Motion .....	4327
Evictions – Motion.....	2317
Evictions despite restrictions – Motion .....	2606
Executive Mayor of George: election – Motion.....	2212
Expanded unemployment rate: lowest – Motion.....	180
Extended contracts: rules and policies – Motion .....	2131
Familicide shooting – Motion.....	565
Faith-Based Organisation Network – Motion.....	3868
Farm attacks: Elandsberg, Clanwilliam and Redelingshys – Motion .....	246
Farmworker: living conditions and evictions – Motion .....	6147
Farmworkers: plight of – Motion.....	3789
Femicide and abuse against women and children – Motion.....	5786
Festive lights event: performing artists – Motion .....	678
Fia's Formula-E 2021/22 Season – Motion .....	4176
Fire fighters: exploitation of – Motion .....	586
Fire fighters protest – Motion .....	501
Fires: Tygerberg Hospital and Mitchells Plain Day Hospital – Motion .....	499
Fires in the Western Cape – Motion.....	4083
Flora and fauna poaching – Motion .....	5725
Floyd, George: murder – Motion .....	1532
Foetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorder Day – Motion.....	2368
Food Angels: Westlake – Motion.....	1347
Forest Village: disruption of housing handover – Motion.....	1718

Forest Village: handover of houses – Motion.....	1478
Former Premier: colonialism tweets – Motion.....	664
Fortune, Steven: double life sentence – Motion.....	4047
Franklin United Reformed Church Primary School – Motion .....	2322
Fransman, Marius – Motion .....	507
Fritz, Albert: Minister - investigation – Motion.....	5467
G F Jooste Hospital: rebuilding of – Motion .....	6095
Gang violence: condolences to victims – Motion .....	5841
Gangsterism, drugs and crime: Cape Flats – Motion.....	3996
Gangsterism: SAPS failure to combat – Motion.....	3790
Garden Route: multiple gender-based violence and femicide – Motion.....	6047
Gaza Strip: bombardment by the State of Israel – Motion .....	6046
GDP Quarter 2: Stats SA – Motion .....	2388
Gender-based and domestic violence – Motion.....	1757
Gender-based violence – Motion .....	4183
Gender-based violence and femicide: curbing of – Motion .....	2300
Gender-based violence and sexual assaults: DA double standards–Motion	5466
Gender-based violence: employee vetting – Motion .....	663
Gender-based violence: multi-party committee meeting – Motion .....	411
Gender-based violence: perpetrators .....	3789
Gender-based violence: Provincial Government employees, vetting of – Motion .....	419
Gender-based violence: inability to deal with – Motion.....	2151
Gender-based violence: men’s dialogue – Motion.....	2327
Gender-based violence: schools speaking out – Motion.....	1594
Gender-based violence: victims – Motion .....	424
Gender budgeting – Motion .....	5593
Gentrification and legacy of apartheid spatial planning – Motion.....	242
German International School: alleged racist remarks by teacher – Motion...	4046
George Municipal Manager – Motion.....	497
George Municipality: Covid-19 related expenditure – Motion .....	405
George Municipality: investigation – Motion .....	405
Gift of the Givers: 38 <sup>th</sup> birthday celebration – Motion.....	2066
Gift of the Givers: contribution to Mitchells Plain Hospital – Motion.....	2370
Global conflicts: irresponsible handling of – Motion .....	5448
Go George and MyCiti Projects: challenges – Motion .....	169
Golden Arrow buses: burning of – Motion.....	2155
Golden Arrow buses: ongoing torching of – Motion .....	2130
Goosen, Leon: snubbing of – Motion.....	2601
Governance: accountability and transparency – Motion .....	3790
Grabouw: arrest of rapist – Motion .....	2152
Grade 9: exit point – schooling – Motion.....	560
Grand Parade: informal traders – Motion.....	1542
Grassy Park community health care facility – Motion .....	568
Grassy Park shooting – Motion.....	2378
Guga S’Thebe Theatre – Motion .....	2311
Gugulethu murders: manhunt – Motion .....	4090
Gunfight between police and robbers – Motion .....	5600
Hague Primary School: rape of learners – Motion .....	684
Hangberg evictions – Motion .....	2386
Haron, Imam Abdullah – Motion .....	428

Hawks drug bus on the N1 – Motion .....	1397
Head of Provincial Traffic: court appearance – Motion.....	3914
Head of WECD: unlawful extension of contract – Motion.....	2211
Health: state of – Motion .....	170
Healthcare: international best practice – Motion .....	5838
Healthcare workers: in memoriam – Motion.....	5451
Heathfield High School: Principal – Motion .....	5848
Helen Zille: investigation into lie – Motion .....	2152
Heritage Day – Motion .....	2437
High school admissions: entrance exams – Motion .....	5725
Homeless people: fines – Motion .....	684, 5731
Homeless People shelters – Motion.....	5468
Homeless rain shelter: removal of – Motion.....	1584
Hoogland Farm: liquidation – Motion.....	677
Hospitals: severe shortage of beds.....	6048
Hospitals: plans to change to day clinics – Motion .....	562
House, Business of – Motions.....	199, 268, 364 438, 523, 649, 767, 785
..... 1128, 1253, 1255, 1285, 1286, 1375, 1500, 1806, 2165, 2268, 2392,	
..... 2518, 2519, 2518, 3396, 3828, 3927, 3971, 4054, 4220, 4291, 4292	
..... 4396, 4505, 4884, 5022, 5568, 5695, 5760, 5810, 5942, 5943, 5979,	
.....	6061, 6139
Household food basket: rising costs – Motion.....	5604
Housing crisis and backlog – Motion.....	2191
Housing crisis for the poor – Motion.....	1756
Housing projects: delays – Motion .....	6146
Housing provision for farm dwellers – Motion .....	2133
Human Settlements Department: failure of – Motion.....	2427
Human Settlements: expenditure on safeguarding property – Motion.....	2088
Illegal evictions – Motion .....	1759
Illegal firearms: recovery of – Motion .....	351
Illegal land invasions – Motion .....	1755, 3860
Inequality in the Western Cape – Motion .....	5447
Imam Abdullah Haron: reopening of inquest into death – Motion.....	5849
Imbalances of the past: women – Motion.....	2055
IMF: John Steenhuisen: letter to – Motions.....	1354
Income equality in the Western Cape – Motions.....	1468
Inequality between poor and wealthy schools – Motions .....	1529
*Informal settlements: fire hazards – Motions .....	2323
Informal settlement fires: increase in deaths – Motion .....	255
Informal settlement improvements – Motion .....	4274
Informal settlement upgrade: roll-over of unspent funds – Motion.....	580
Informal settlements: water and sanitation – Motions .....	1760
Informal traders in townships – Motions.....	1401
Inkanini Primary School: Khayelitsha – Motion .....	2441
Institute of Race Relations: appointment of Helen Zille – Motion .....	194
Institutional racism – Motion.....	4171
Institutionalised racism in schools – Motion .....	2189
Integrated Resource Plan: 2019 – Motion.....	664
Intercape drivers' shootings – Motion.....	6101
International Day against Homophobia, Transphobia and Biphobia – Motion.....	1398

International Literacy Day – Motion .....	6153
International Nurses Day – Motion .....	1343, 1348, 3863, 5734, 5741
International Sports Events.....	6042
Investment Readiness Accelerator Programme .....	6152
IPID: findings against 15 SAPS stations – Motion .....	6148
Iris Qwela Primary School: learner transport – Motion .....	4247
Israel and the Western Cape Government – ties – Motion .....	5735
Issel, John James (Late): commemoration – Motion .....	2086
Jewellery store robberies – Motion .....	257
Job Creation and economic growth – Motion.....	3956
Joe Slovo: evictions – Motion .....	1543
Jozi to Stellenbosch March: hire of private security companies – Motion .....	2137
June: Pride Month – Motion.....	5847
Kannaland Officials: NPA action against – Motion.....	2591
Khaylithsha Art School and Rehabilitation Centre armed robbery– Motion ..	2083
Karoo Outreach Project – Motion .....	2157
Khayelitsha: current spate of killings – Motion.....	3866
Khayelitsha, Kraaifontein and Mfuleni: violence – Motion.....	3856
Khayelitsha Police: conduct of – Motion .....	3804
Khayelitsha: recent murders – Motion .....	2083
Kidnapping for ransom: increasing incidents – Motion .....	6146
King Mowbray Golf Club: lease – Motion.....	2199
Kiriboto, Yusuf: rescue attempt by – Motion .....	1709
Kirstenbosch National Botanical Garden – Motion .....	6055
Kleine Akker farm evictions – Motion.....	319
Knysna Mayor: Mark Willemse – Motion.....	569
Knysna Municipality: resignation of officials – Motion.....	1536
Knysna: vegetable garden for the poor – Motion .....	2146
Koena Art Institute: re-opening – Motion .....	5888
Kosovo informal settlement: fire – Motion.....	4328
Kraaifontein Informal Settlement: disaster relief – Motion.....	3915
Krotoa: commemoration – Motion.....	583
Krugersdorp rapes – Motion .....	6014
Kwafaku School: experimental building – Motion .....	348
Labour Force Survey – Quarter 2 results – Motion.....	249
Labuschagne, Cathy, interests in the tobacco industry – Motion.....	1485
Land: need for – Motion.....	3859
Land and housing: protests – Motion.....	2084
Land invasions – Motion.....	2351
Land invasions in the Western Cape – Motion .....	3790
Land invasions: police brutality – Motion .....	1707
Land occupation: decline in – Motion .....	4251
Land occupation and informal settlements development – Motion .....	5726
Land ownership and spatial legacy: skewed patterns of – Motion .....	166
Langeberg Councillor: Nicklaas Beginsel – Motion.....	1548
Lasithi, Unathi: sexual assault case – Motion .....	6049
Law enforcement officers: competency certificates – Motion.....	1548, 2375
Learner numbers: increase in – Motion .....	165
Learner placement: 2023 academic year – Motion.....	5469
Learners: alcohol and substance abuse – Motion .....	178
Learners: rape and sexual harassment of – Motion.....	178

Learner suicides – Motion .....	3996
Learners transferring from other schools – Motion.....	4169
Learner transport challenges – Motion.....	5601
Learners: unplaced – Motion.....	178, 5602
LGBTQIA+ communities – Motion.....	3856
Lion cubs: smuggling of – Motion.....	357
Lifestyle audits – Motion.....	2581
Lifestyle audits: executive councils – Motion.....	2059
Lifestyle audits: outcomes – Motion .....	2048
Lifestyle audits report – Motion .....	2049
Lifestyle audits: Western Cape Government – Motion .....	2068
Liquor ban: effect on the wine and agriculture industry – Motion .....	2046
Loadshedding: impact on economy – Motion.....	3957
Lobster catches for small scale fisheries – Motion.....	674
Local governments: destabilising of – Motion .....	674
Local governments: inconsistencies and inequalities – Motion .....	4170
Local governments: instability caused by DA leaders – Motion .....	3791
Local municipalities: status of – Motion.....	3789
Lockdown: burglary and vandalism at schools – Motion .....	1481
Lockdown: crime rate – Motion .....	1567
Lockdown: demolishing of properties – Motion .....	1716
Lockdown: distribution of food – Motion .....	1477
Lockdown period: illegal land invasions – Motion.....	1336
Lockdown: police and army brutality – Motion .....	1528
Lockdown regulations: alcohol-related crime and injuries – Motion .....	2417
Lockdown regulations: court finding – Motion .....	1541
Lockdown regulations: police brutality – Motion.....	1382
Lockdown restrictions – Motion.....	1319
Lockdown: social housing projects – Motion.....	1392
Lockdown: South African Police Service – Motion .....	1487
Louw, Quintin, Deputy Mayor: Beaufort West Municipality – Motion.....	1351
Luluamandla, Lena: missing child – Motion .....	1714
Luleka Primary School – closure due to Covid-19 – Motion.....	1595
Madiba Supermarket: mass shooting – Motion.....	5886
Madikizela, Minister: unscientific utterances – Motion.....	1383
Maimani, Mmusi: house – Motion.....	505
Malibu High School: policy on African hair – Motion .....	409
Mandela Day – Motion .....	1711
Manenberg: gang violence – Motion .....	1537
Manenberg: murders and arrests – Motion .....	2150
March on the Union Buildings: 1956 – Motion.....	2084
Marconi Beam Primary School and Sinenjongo High School, burning of – Motion.....	1778
Masiphumelele fire – Motion .....	179
Masiphumelele fire: displaced residents – Motion.....	192
Mass murder: Khayelitsha – Motion.....	5788
Mass shooting: Khayelitsha Site C – Motion .....	5732, 5739
Mass shootings in Khayelitsha – Motion .....	5885
Matieland Post Office: refusing collection of social assistance grants – Motion.....	2589
Matie medical student: sexual assault of fellow student – Motion .....	1772

Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our citizens and their families.....	4582
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger.....	5810
Matric exams – Motion.....	2443
Matric pass rates – Motion.....	345
Matric results: decline – Motion .....	494
Matriculants: shortage of teachers – Motion .....	2088
Matzikama Municipality: maladministration – Motion .....	3806
Matzikama Municipality residents – Motion .....	2369
Mayor of George – Motion .....	1473
Mayors and councillors, newly elected – Motion .....	4432
Médecins Sans Frontieres .....	1548
Members Lounge refreshments – Motion .....	6043
Members, new:	
Election of Deputy Speaker of Western Cape Provincial Parliament .....	7
Election of Premier and Speaker of Western Cape Provincial Parliament .	3
Oath or Solemn Affirmation .....	2
Member's statements, by.....	153, 230, 295, 338, 397, 484, 551, 649, 1288
1299, 1329 ,1375, 1439, 1523, 1559, 1684, 1749, 2038, 2123, 2183, 2343	
2408, 2573, 3783, 3851, 3903, 3949, 3989, 4031, 4072, 4162, 4237, 4261	
4312, 5440, 5585, 5718, 5760, 5832, 5875, 5943, 6000, 6030, 6087, 6139	
Menier, Kai-ish – kidnapping – Motion.....	5600
Metro area: destruction of property – Motion .....	1771
Metro Police: drug-related arrests – Motion.....	2141
Metro Rail: derailment – Motion.....	506
Metro Rail services: takeover – Motion.....	5594
Meyer, Ivan (Junior): appointment – Motion .....	2219
Mhlanga, Elijah, DBE spokesperson: condemnation of – Motion .....	256
Mid-term budget estimates – Motion .....	2224
Minister Daylin Mitchell – ill advised remarks – Motion.....	4330
Missing 3-year old boy: Hout Bay – Motion .....	2140
Missing women and children – Motion.....	2071
Mitchells Plain: bus robberies – Motion .....	2579
Mitchells Plain: non governmental organisations – Motion .....	1318
Mitchells Plain security structures – Motion .....	4174
Mod Program: cultural production – Motion .....	572
Model C schools: culture of racism – Motion .....	5598
Molosi, Victor: anniversary of death – Motion .....	1770
Mondale High School – Motion.....	171, 5602
Monkeypox outbreak – Motion.....	5776, 6095
Money bills amendment procedure – Motion .....	2357
Moorreesburg: learner transport challenges – Motion .....	5737
Motion of no confidence: DA Deputy Mayor and Speaker, Matzikama – Motion .....	182
Mrewetyana, Uyinene – Motion .....	353
Mrewetyana, Uyinene: anniversary of murder – MotionHi .....	4250
Mrewetyana, Uyinene: in memoriam – Motion.....	2196

Mrewetyana, Uyinene: memorial wellness centre – Motion .....	4268
Mufti Taha Karaan – Motion .....	4000
Municipal account deductions from electricity purchases – Motion .....	4277
Municipal Councils: evictions – Motion.....	1780
Municipal Economic Review and Outlook .....	511, 2510, 4397
Municipal infrastructure: poor maintenance – Motion.....	4269
Municipal Land: leasing of – Motion .....	2030
Municipal Systems Amendment Bill – Motion .....	4318
Municipalities: budgetary processes – Motion.....	5843
Municipalities: clean audits – Motion.....	1715
Municipalities: Eskom debts – Motion .....	6147
Municipalities in the Western Cape: status of – Motion.....	6039
Municipalities: ongoing instability – Motion .....	5838
Municipalities: sustainability of – Motion .....	1335
Murders of Amorei Vermaak and Stephen Fleck – Motion.....	1721
Murder of pregnant mother of two – Motion .....	246
Murder rate: underlying factors – Motion.....	5881
Murders in the province – Motion .....	190
Murders: women and children – Motion .....	181
Museums, heritage sites and cultural icons – Motion.....	3858
Muslim community: desecration of graveyards – Motion.....	682
Muslim Judicial Council: gender equality guidelines – Motion.....	2134
MyCiti N2 Express Service – Motion .....	429
Nantes farm eviction case – Motion .....	6044
National Assembly Portfolio Committee – Motion .....	4002
National Child Protection Week – Motion .....	5844, 5883
National Coronavirus Command Council – Motion.....	1476
National Department of Social Development: violation of human rights – Motion.....	1391
National health insurance – Motion.....	5726
National Minimum Wage Act – Motion .....	259
National Prosecuting Authority – Motion .....	410
National public procurement legislation – Motion.....	3791
National Senior Certificate examinations – Motion.....	2602
National Thusong Service Excellence Awards – Motion .....	496
National Transport Minister: extension of grace period for renewal of driver's and car licences – Motion.....	4272
National Women's Day – Motion .....	167, 2062, 2073
National Women's Day celebrations – Motion.....	4169
National Women's Month – Motion .....	6043
NCOP:	
Authority of delegation to vote .....	8
Permanent delegates, Appointment of.....	9
Neighbourhood Watch member: assault by – Motion.....	2208
Neighbourhood Watch Safety Improvement Project – Motion.....	1763
Neighbourhood Watches: rogue vigilante groups – Motion.....	1765
Nersa energy projects – Motion .....	2439
Neumann, Wesley, Principal – Motion .....	5790
Newlands Rugby Stadium – Motion .....	2607
NHI Bill – Motion .....	249

Nomdo, Christina: Children’s Commissioner – Motion .....	1580
Northpine School Karaoke event – Motion .....	681
Nurse training: private hospitals – Motion.....	6012
Nurses hired on short term contracts: COVID-19 – Motion.....	5603
Nyanga: ongoing tax unrest – Motion .....	6148
Nyanga: taxi drivers – unrest – Motion .....	6147
O’Grady, Raymond and Betty: attack on – Motion.....	2201
Olympic Games: Tokyo – Motion.....	4173
Omicron variant: identification of – Motion.....	4438
Ongoing drought – Motion .....	346
Ongoing gang violence – Motion .....	2045
Operation Dudula – Motion.....	5775
Past injustices: redress of – Motion .....	2063, 2149
Payne, Farrell: sexual harassment charges – Motion.....	5849
Phaphu, Azola: 6th birthday celebration – Motion .....	2053
Philippi East and Nyanga: violent protests – Motion.....	3998
Philippi East attacks: arrest of suspects – Motion.....	1717
Pie Act amendment – Motion.....	6094
Places of safety for abused women and their children – Motion.....	4170
Plato, Dan: Mayor–eviction of informal residents during lockdown – Motion	2217
Plettenberg Bay Worker: attempted murder charge – Motion.....	2200
Police brutality – Motion.....	2297
Police brutality against black people – Motion .....	2296
Police functions: devolving of – Motion.....	252
Police resources: crime in hotspot areas – Motion .....	3859
Police resources: scarcity of – Motion .....	3857
Police stations: investigation task team – Motion .....	2353
Police sergeant: drunk driving accident – Motion .....	6158
Poor service delivery: regular protests – Motion.....	3857
Portrait of former Premier: Worcester EMS Building – Motion.....	2317
Potchefstroom by-election: Freedom Front victory – Motion.....	495
Poverty eradication and alleviation – Motion .....	3805
PPE for burial undertakers – Motion.....	2138
PPE: pre-approved contracts – Motion.....	2356
PPE procurement – Motion.....	2310
PPE procurement: call for SIU probe – Motion .....	2135
Premier:	
Acceptance speech by .....	4
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2541
Election of .....	3
State of the Province Address.....	39, 1107, 3118, 4745
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	59, 1136, 3195, 4884
State of the Province Address – Reply to Debate ....	132, 1207, 3260, 4956
President Ramaphosa: joint sitting address – Motion.....	2597
Primary school learner drop-outs – Motion.....	4268
Primary schools: readiness to return – Motion.....	3957
Prince Harry and Duchess Meghan Markle – Motion .....	573
Prinsloo, Chris: former SAPS Colonel – Motion.....	2607
Print newspapers and magazines – Motion .....	1322

Prisoners: rehabilitative services – Motion .....	409
Property and lives: crime and destruction – Motion.....	1782
Protests: Dunoon and Darling – Motion .....	574
Provincial Cabinet: shortage of women – Motion .....	4002
Provincial Executive: capture by property developers – Motion .....	5839
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook.....	511, 2510, 4348, 6190
Provincial Government departments: insourcing – Motion .....	1758
Provincial Government official: alleged rape of a minor – Motion .....	2360
Provincial housing projects in Eerste River destruction of property – Motion	1583
Provincial Police Commissioner: appointment of – Motion.....	680
Psychosocial disability awareness month – Motion.....	1711
Public Healthcare: ongoing challenges – Motion.....	6040
Public money: abuse of – Motion .....	3857
Public procurement regulations – Motion .....	5593
Public service workers: protest – Motion.....	4255
Qhina, Andiswa: missing person – Motion .....	3793
Qolani, Bulelani: legal victory – Motion .....	2222
Qolani, Bulelani: undignified eviction – Motion .....	2218
Qualification scandals – Motion .....	3807
Qualification screening: provincial executive – Motion.....	3806
Quarantine facility i-n Mossel Bay: rape – Motion .....	2447
Quintas, Roberto: incorrect statement – Motion .....	1402
Quintile system: impact on performance of schools – Motion .....	2190
Racism at De Bron Primary School: Stanford – Motion.....	665
Racism, upsurge of during the Covid-19 pandemic – Motion.....	1307
Racist vacancy advert – Motion .....	2304
Rail services: devolution of – Motion.....	5725
Rail transport commuter safety – Motion.....	345
Rail transport system – Motion.....	345
Rainfall: full dams – Motion .....	2322
Ramadan Holy Month – Motion.....	5453, 5463, 5466
Ramadan: support to vulnerable residents – Motion .....	3864
Ramadan and Eid Al-Fitr – Motion .....	3805
Rampant crime in the Western Cape – Motion .....	6093
Rape in Hanover Pa-rk: arrest of alleged suspect – Motion .....	675
Rapist: arrest and court appearance – Motion .....	2149
Ratings Afrika report: financially sustainable municipalities – Motion.....	3793
Ratings Afrika survey results – Motion .....	2061
Red Cross War Memorial Children’s Hospital – Motion .....	2441
Red Dot Taxi transport service – Motion .....	2372
Redelingshuys community – amalgamation of schools – Motion .....	567
Redelingshuys Farm and Neighbourhood Watch – Motion .....	1778
Registrar of Members’ Interests, Appointment of .....	11
Regulations during Covid-19 pandemic – Motion.....	1307
Reports:	
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 dated 6 May 2022 .....	5746
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 on its oversight and public participation activities undertaken during the period 14 April to 24 November 2020.....	2849
Report of the Budget Committee on The Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B15-2019](NCOP) ( Ratification of Final Mandate) ...	938

Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B3 – 2020] (NCOP).....	1487
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B9 – 2020] (NCOP).....	1836
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B3 – 2021] (NCOP).....	3964
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B19 – 202-1 (NCOP) .....	4606
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B6 – 2022] (NCOP).....	5795
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Second Amendment Bill [B24-2020] (NCOP) .....	3033
Report of the Conduct Committee dated 25 November 2020.....	3042
Report of the Conduct Committee on a complaint against an Honourable Member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in accordance with the code of conduct for Members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament dated 7 May 2001 .....	4279
Report of the Conduct Committee on the failure of hon member S N August to submit disclosure forms timeously (2020.....	5958
Report of the Conduct Committee on the failure of hon member G Brinkhuis to submit disclosure forms timeously.....	2389
Report of the Conduct Committee on the failure of hon members N Makamba-Botya and M Xego to submit disclosure forms timeously .....	1040
Report of the Public Accounts Committee, having considered the 2020/21 Annual Reports of the 13 departments, including their Entities, of the Western Cape Government as part of its Oversight role .....	5471
Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the 2019/20 Annual Reports of the 12 departments of the Western Cape Government including their public entities .....	3814
Report of the Rules Committee on the parental leave for Parliamentarians, dated 2 December 2019 .....	1042
Report of the Rules Committee on the Presiding Officers' Manual .....	3578
.....	4612
Report of the Rules Committee on the review of rules .....	3575
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the National Environmental Management Laws.....	4609
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Enviro Affairs and Development Planning on the National Forests Amendment Bill.....	4494
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Upgrading of the Land Tenure Rights Amendment Bill [B6B-2020] .....	3810
Report of the Standing Committee on Agricutlure, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the withdrawal of the declaration of the Driftsands Nature Reserve in terms of Section 24(1)(B) of the National Environmental Management: Protected Areas Act, 2003 (Act 57 of 2003)	

Dated 23 June 2022 .....	5960
Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on the Customary Initiation Bill [B7B-2018] (NCOP).....	3036
Report on the Standing Committee on Education on an oversight visit to the Jakes Gerwel Technical High School conducted on 15 November 2019.....	2158
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism and the COVID-19 Temporary Employer/Employee Relief Scheme (TERS), funding process undertaken by the Unemployment Insurance Fund, and the Response/views of the public in the Western Cape on this Process .....	5298
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the National Gambling Amendment Bill [B 27B – 2018] (NCOP).....	2110
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing- Board .....	507
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill.....	3808
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (9 September 2021).....	4497
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local Government Municipal Structures Amendment Bill [B19D 2018] (NCOP).....	3040
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local Government: Municipal Systems Amendment Bill [B2D – 2019]..	4492
Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the appointment of the Western Cape Commissioner for Children .....	1268
Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Social Assistance Amendment Bill [B8B-2018] (NCOP).....	2571
Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on the Traditional Courts Bill [B1D-2017] .....	3038
Residents of the Western Cape – Motion.....	4175
Rheinmetall Denel Munitions Plant: explosion – Motion.....	2229
Rising food prices: impact on the poor – Motion .....	5594
Rlabs holiday bootcamp – Motion .....	564
Road Accidents: provincial strategy– Motion .....	2599
Road fatalities and accidents – Motion.....	582
Road fatalities: long weekend – Motion.....	2069
Road safety: festive season – Motion .....	4435
Road users: annual carnage – Motion .....	2582
Rocklands Civic Centre: provincial heritage site – Motion.....	319
Rogue neighbourhood watch member – Motion .....	2197
Rogue neighbourhood watches – Motion.....	2192

Rules: Operating Rules for sixth Provincial Parliament .....	11
Rules Committee: Representation of parties .....	12
Rural Development Strategy – Motion .....	347
Rural towns: improved mobility – Motion .....	5839
Russia: ban on provincial exports to – Motion .....	5446
R44 and R101 crossing: probe into safety of – Motion .....	2362
Safety: effects on tourism and the economy – Motion .....	238
Safety issues and murders – Motion .....	173
Safety officers in the Western Cape – Motion.....	1320
Safety Plan – Motion .....	6094
Safety Plan and high levels of crime – Motion .....	3911
Safety Plan: focus on causative factors of crime – Motion.....	1590
Safety Plan: gender-based violence – Motion .....	1588
Safety Plan: impact against escalating crime – Motion.....	2581
Safety Plan Leap Officers: invasions and evictions – Motion.....	2418
Saldanha Bay Municipality: disappearance of confiscated	
Saldanha Bay: vehicle accident – Motion .....	2206
Sampson, Courtney: Reverend – Motion.....	3776
SANDF: Deployment of in the Cape Flats – Motion.....	504
SAPS and emergency services: attacks on – Motion .....	166
SAPS and Hawks arrest- of fraud suspect – Motion.....	588
SAPS: arrest of courier truck robbery suspects – Motion .....	2379
SAPS arrests and successes – Motion.....	2603
SAPS arrests: unlicensed guns and ammunition – Motion .....	2087
SAPS: car hijacking syndicate arrests – Motion .....	5599
SAPS: Failure to assist – Motion .....	3919
SAPS Harare: members suspected of extortion – Motion .....	3914
SAPS members: attacks on – Motion .....	2325
SAPS members: murders – Motion .....	3863
SAPS Mitchells Plain and Lenteguur: recent unrest – Motion.....	4174
SAPS: seizure of illegal firearms – Motion.....	1589
SAPS: services – Motion .....	2364
SAPS: successes – Motion.....	4321
SAPS: successful operation – Motion.....	4087
SAPS successes: Laingsburg – Motion.....	355
SASSA: Khayelitsha branch – Motion .....	6102
SASSA: social relief of distress grant – Motion.....	6050
Schools: bullying – Motion .....	4175, 5470
Schools: dealing with positive COVID-19 cases .....	4275
School examinations – Motion.....	419
School infrastructure and backlog – Motion.....	310
Schools and effects of crime – Motion .....	407
Schools built with inappropriate material – Motion.....	1482
Schools: bullying – Motion .....	4245
Schools: bullying - efforts to address – Motion .....	3859
Schools: conferences and workshops requiring payment – Motion .....	4248
Schools in the Cape Winelands: security – Motion .....	2228
Schools: mismanagement of school funds – Motion.....	4253
Schools: overcrowding – Motion.....	4049
Schools: protective supplies – Motion .....	1484
Schools: protective supplies and equipment – Motion.....	1486

Schools: racism and racial profiling – Motion .....	2070
Schools: racism incidents profiling – Motion .....	5775
Schools: racial and class exclusion – Motion .....	561
Schools: reopening of – Motion.....	2354
Schools: return to – Motion .....	2319
Schools: security fences – Motion.....	5786
Schools: spread of coronavirus – Motion .....	1568
Schools: storm damage – Motion.....	1701
Schools: unplaced learners – Motion .....	674
Schools: violence at – Motion .....	350
Schreuder, Brian: appointment – Motion.....	6094
Schreuder, Brian: extension of appointment – Motion.....	2135, 2226
Schreuder, Brian: reappointment – Motion.....	2316
Secessionist-minded right wingers – Motion .....	2306
Security groups: extortion – Motion.....	2324
Security structures: work of – Motion .....	4171
Sekhokho, Seth – Councillor – Motion .....	503
Self-quarantine of elderly resident – Motion.....	1392
Senekal: role of Helen Zille – Motion.....	2582
Senior official: alleged rapist – Motion.....	2303
Service delivery: poor working class communities – Motion .....	5594
Service delivery: slow pace of – Motion .....	3910
Service delivery state of – Motion .....	3858
Sexual assault and violence against women – Motion.....	5448
Sexual misconduct: disparities in treatment of victims and perpetrators – Motion.....	5789
Sexual offences: increase in – Motion.....	5881
Shack fire: death of 2-year old – Motion.....	2207
Shavuot: Feast of Weeks – Motion .....	1473
Shelters for abused women – Motion.....	6148
Shelters for abused women and children – Motion .....	2192
Shootings and killings: high risk areas – Motion .....	5840
Simmers, Hon Minister: electricity bill – Motion.....	186, 240
Simons, Ray Alexander – Motion.....	431
Sithonga, Lunamandla: missing child – Motion .....	1761
Slingers, Bridgenay: murder of – Motion .....	1720
Small bus operators: strike – Motion.....	355
Small business development – Motion.....	348
Small towns: marketing to investors – Motion .....	4083
Smallholder Farmer Development Programme participants – Motion.....	4271
Smith, Danville: allegation of fraud against – Motion.....	2418
Solar photovoltaic qualification – Motion .....	6055
Solidarity Fund – Motion.....	1713
Spanking of children at home – Motion.....	498
South Africa: unravelling of – Motion.....	237
South African College High School: disbandment of SGB – Motion.....	2203
South African Citizen Satisfaction Index Report: The City of Cape Town Heritage Day – Motion .....	2437
South African Police Services: arrests – Motion.....	5464
South African sports people: successes – Motion.....	669
Speaker:	

Acceptance speech by .....	6
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic.	2268
Commemorating National Women’s Month .....	200
Women’s Day, dignity and rights .....	4195
Election of .....	5
Guidance:	
Rule 65 .....	337
Virtual sittings .....	1373, 1437, 1494, 1558, 1683, 1804
Rulings of 325, 483, 1438, 3782, 3926, 6027	
Speaker of the Western Cape Legislature – Motion .....	5853
Special Economic Zones; impact of – Motion .....	493
SRC campus elections – Motion.....	578
Stallholder permits – Motion .....	5949
State Capture: Commission – Motion .....	318
State Capture Inquiry: revelations – Motion.....	3856
State or public land: audit – Motion .....	4181
State security staff – Motion .....	4714
State-subsidised social development support – Motion.....	3857
Statutory rape incident – Motion .....	5742
Stellenbosch Hospital teen rape incident – Motion .....	6094
Stellenbosch: Safe Travels stamp – Motion.....	1721
Stephen Road Primary School: Grassy Park – Motion .....	4249
Steyn-Dowie, Tania – Motion.....	579
Storm victims – Motion .....	3860
Strand Community Safety Forum – Motion.....	317
Strong wind: destruction of homes – Motion.....	2140
Struggle heroes and heroines homes – Motion .....	5456
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect .....	1403
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	439
Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a world-class health system.....	4292
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers.....	5979
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape.....	369
The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape.....	524
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa.....	5696
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods.....	3927
The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape .....	2392
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs south africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses .....	2166
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities .....	5568
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government’s	

Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs	3972
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape	.4054
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy	1500
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future	4220
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	268
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape	3828
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape	6061
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty	6159
Suicide of learners – Motion	3959
Summer initiation season – Motion	5451
Sustainable Bo-Kaap – Motion	2431
Swellendam Railton Project – Motion	6042
Tafelberg case: reserved judgment – Motion	2205
Tafelberg School site: judgment – Motion	2305
Tafelberg site: Helen Zille influence – Motion	2309
Taxi industry: killings – Motion	4043
Taxi murders and violence – Motion	1777
Taxi related murders – Motion	2416
Taxi violence – Motion	1693
Taxi violence: escalation of – Motion	2132
Taxi wars – Motion	2352, 4182
T C Newman Community Day Centre – Motion	2373
Thusong Emergency Field Hospital – Motion	2073
Title deeds: impact of – Motion	3910
Temporary Chairpersons:	
Appointment of	11
Top ten teachers: awards for excellence – Motion	676
Tourism recovery strategy – Motion	5775
Tourism sector: job losses – Motion	2435
Touwsrante: shooting of Malawian national shop owner – Motion	2384
Township economy – Motion	4246
Township fires: deaths – Motion	1471
Traditional initiation ceremonies – Motion	2605
Traffic officers: attacks on – Motion	577
Traffic police: innovative use of technology – Motion	178
Train operations and rail infrastructure – Motion	4169

Trains, rail infrastructure and safety of commuters – Motion .....	2416
Trains: violence and crime – Motion .....	562
Tramways Football Club: soccer stars – Motion .....	6096
Transport crisis: De Doorns Primary School – Motion .....	4273
Transport hostilities: role players – Motion .....	4174
Transport National Port Authority – Motion.....	562
Transnet Ports Authority: dispute hearing – Motion.....	2306
Truck attacks: impact of – Motion .....	427
Truck drivers: violent attacks on – Motion.....	404
Truworths: new distribution centre – Motion .....	6153
Tshamese, Peter: sentencing – Motion .....	2301
Tuberculosis awareness – Motion .....	3858
Twigg, Grant: Metro Chairperson – motion of no confidence – Motion.....	588
Tygerberg Hospital: dismissal of three doctors – Motion .....	312
Tygerberg Hospital: drowning – Motion .....	501
UCT Geological Sciences translation project – Motion.....	2142
UIF-TERS: abuse of – Motion.....	3914
UIF-TERS: non-cooperating companies – Motion .....	3869
Unaffordable utility costs – Motion.....	4326
Unemployment rate: decrease in – Motion .....	425
Unemployment statistics – Motion .....	4252
Uniform rules, bullies and delinquents – Motion .....	5846
United Democratic Front – 36th anniversary – Motion.....	315
Universal health care award: President Cyril Ramaphosa – Motion .....	580
University of Cape Town: suspension of professor – Motion .....	5787
University of the Western Cape: new hostel – Motion .....	2445
University of the Western Cape: renaming of main hall – Motion .....	5996
Unplaced learners – Motion.....	3792
Unplaced learners: 2023 academic year – Motion.....	5854
Unnatural deaths and violence in the Western Cape – Motion .....	4325
Urbanisation process: strategies – Motion.....	2580
USDG Grant: under expenditure – Motion.....	2154
Vaccine manufacturing: confidence in South Africa – Motion.....	4082
Vaccine production: South Africa – Motion .....	4092
Vaccine sites: Gauteng – Motion .....	4048
Valhalla Park accident – Motion .....	2223
Van der Rheede, Antonio: Councillor: disciplinary action against – Motion ..	5460
Veary, Major General: dismissal – Motion .....	3963
Violence: condemnation of – Motion.....	2150
Vrededal Hospital – Motion.....	5844
Vrygrond taxi shooting – Motion .....	2225
Vulnerable citizens – Motion.....	4177
Wallacedene: attempted murder of sergeant – Motion .....	2220
Ward 5 By-election – Motion.....	322
Waste-to-energy plans – Motion.....	494
Water and electricity – high cost of – Motion .....	311
Water-infrastructure theft and vandalism – Motion .....	5882
Water saving – Motion .....	6015
Water systems: poor state of – Motion .....	168
Water tariffs: reviewing of – Motion .....	2379
WCED Safe Schools Call Centre – Motion .....	6038

WCED: Smart classrooms – Motion.....	1712
WCPP Presiding Officers: allegations against – Motion.....	6039
WCPP Presiding Officers: suitability of – Motion.....	6039
Weekend arrests by SAPS – Motion.....	2066
Wesgro: resignation of Chairperson – Motion.....	1786
Westerford School: sanction against prefect – Motion.....	358
Western Cape Commissioner of Children – Motion.....	3918
Western Cape: Epicentre of the Covid-19 pandemic – Motion.....	1308
Western Cape High Court: turmoil – Motion.....	2426
Western Cape Liquor authority – lockdown transgressors suspended – Motion.....	1308
Western Cape: ongoing corruption – Motion.....	5840
Western Cape: post Covid-19 – Motion.....	1306
Western Cape Department of Education: budget cut – Motion.....	662
Western Cape Department of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries – Female Entrepreneurship Awards – Motion.....	254
Western Cape Education Department: lack of ability to enrol learners – Motion.....	1337
Western Cape Department of Education: unplaced learners– Motion.....	1353
Western Cape Department of Health: diligent management of the Covid-19 pandemic – Motion.....	2215
Western Cape municipalities: auditor-general and Ratings Afrika reports – Motion.....	5890
Western Cape municipalities: audit outcomes – Motion.....	1694
Western Cape Province: attempt to segregate – Motion.....	3998
Western Cape Safety Plan: impact on – Motion.....	2193
Western Cape Safety Strategy – Motion.....	1586
Western Cape schools: service levels – Motion.....	1450
Western Cape schools: state of – Motion.....	3910
Western Cape Tourism Produce Development Fund – Motion.....	1717
Western Cape Youth Parliament – Motion.....	183
Wheatfield Estate Foundation Trust: funding – Motion.....	5727
Whitehead, Melissa: guilty finding – Motion.....	316
Willemse Juanita: murderer in court – Motion.....	2373
Williams, Chester: memorial at Newlands Stadium.....	364, 414
Winde, Alan: Premier: call to lift lockdown measures – Motion.....	2584
Winde, Alan: Premier – self quarantining – Motion.....	1344
Windsor High School: spirit of ubuntu – Motion.....	2387
Wine sales ban: impact of – Motion.....	1758
Winter Readiness – Motion.....	4083, 5839
Witsand: Temporary School – Motion.....	2436
Witzenberg Community: Violent Crime – Motion.....	6041
Woman in Islamic dress attacked – Motion.....	2585
Women: empowerment of – Motion.....	2047
Women in Humanity Arts Festival – Motion.....	183
Women’s Day – Motion.....	2065, 6052
Women’s Day celebrations – Motion.....	4176
“Women’s” Desk – Motion.....	587
Women’s Month – Motion.....	184, 6016
Women’s month and gender-based violence – Motion.....	6013
Women-owned businesses – Motion.....	6099

Worcester: drive-by shooting – Motion .....	2326
World Foster Day – Motion .....	1538
World Health Day – Motion.....	5461
World Oceans Day – Motion.....	1578
World Pride Month – Motion .....	1536
World Robot Olympiad South Africa – Motion .....	252
Yomelela Primary School: shooting of principal – Motion .....	430
Youth unemployment – Motion .....	5447
Youth Hub: Kwamandlenkosi Project – Motion.....	583
Youth Month – Motion.....	1534
Youth Rehabilitation Boot Camp – Motion.....	422
Youth Safety Ambassador Programme – Motion.....	3795
Zama-Zamas: ongoing protests against – Motion.....	6039
Zeitz Museum – Motion .....	2606
Zietsman, Reagan: conviction – Motion.....	2201
Zwaanswyk High School: charges of gross mismanagement – Motion .....	4328
#BlackLivesMatter Global Campaign – Motion .....	1584
16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children .....	4434
16 June: 45th anniversary .....	5839
2021 Fishing Rights Allocation Process .....	5839



## INDEX TO SPEECHES

### ALLEN, R I

Annual Provincial Sports Awards .....	499
Annual National Crime Statistics .....	410
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	958
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports .....	990
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	4468
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	4523
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	4619
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020] .....	
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	1876
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	1955
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports .....	2001
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	3589
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3634
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	5108
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	5128
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	2833
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	2971
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3017
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3426
Western Cape Museums Ordinance Amendment Bill [B5 – 2020]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	3575
Chrysalis Academy: new intake .....	1714
Condolence - motions	
Cogill, Winston .....	4176
Cupido, Gaylin .....	1704
Jordaan, Theuns .....	4434
Kay, Lieutenant-Colonel André .....	667
Kebe Nomaphelo .....	2303
Kebe Wendy .....	2303
Kebe Sive .....	2303
Kinnear, Charl .....	2590
Mabena, Bob .....	2055
Mohamed, Hishaam .....	2202
Niewenhuys, Jan .....	426
Nyangiwe, Simtembile .....	426
Surtie-Richards, Shaleen .....	4044
Tom, Lungile .....	1340
Congratulations / Wishes:	
City of CapeTown .....	173
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3796, 3958, 4045



The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government's Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs .....	3972
Summer initiation season .....	5451
World Pride Month .....	1536
Youth Safety Ambassador Programme .....	3795

**AMERICA, D**

ANC: nepotism and cronyism.....	2366
Archbishop Desmond Tutu Library.....	5841
Bargaining Council agreements .....	561
<b>Bills:</b>	
Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill (2021/22 Financial Year) [B1 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle.....	5058
Consideration of Vote and Schedule .....	5059
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 14: Local Government.....	906
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	1013
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle.....	4458
Vote 14: Local Government.....	4549
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle.....	1823
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	1887
Vote 14: Local Government.....	1904
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	3527
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	5291
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 14: Local Government.....	2939
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	3400
Vote 14: Local Government.....	3428
Cape Town Cycle Tour .....	5450
Cederberg Municipality: SIU interference.....	2424
City of Cape Town: Capital Projects.....	5882
<b>Condolences, Motions of:</b>	
Jansen, Henry (D America).....	1701
Machana, Bangikhaya .....	5728
Meyer, Piet (D America) .....	2194
<b>Congratulations / Wishes:</b>	
City of Cape Town .....	5596
Gift of the Givers .....	3862
Pokwas, Michael.....	190
Santaco Executive Committee.....	5597
Western Cape Disaster Management Centre .....	3996

Willemse, Johannes .....	1575
City of Cape Town Councillors – Alderman Titles.....	188
Dam levels, increase in.....	177
Executive Mayor of George: election.....	2212
George Municipality: Covid-19 related expenditure .....	405
Local municipalities: status of .....	3789
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation	
on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger.....	5820
Matzikama Municipality residents .....	2369
Mayors and councillors, newly elected .....	4432
Municipalities: budgetary processes .....	5843
Municipalities: clean audits .....	1715
Municipalities in the Western Cape: status of .....	6039
Municipalities: sustainability of.....	1335
National Thusong Service Excellence Awards .....	496
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Rail services: devolution of .....	5725
Ratings Afrika report: financially sustainable municipalities.....	3793
Ratings Afrika survey results .....	2061
Report of the Public Accounts Committee, having considered the	
2020/21 Annual Reports of the 13 departments, including their	
Entities, of the Western Cape Government as part of its	
Oversight role.....	5472
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local	
Government Municipal Structures Amendment Bill	
[B19D 2018] (NCOP).....	3041
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local	
Government: Municipal Systems Amendment Bill [B2D – 2019]..	4493
South African Citizen Satisfaction Index Report:	
The City of Cape Town Heritage Day .....	2437
Statements .....	159, 491, 1300, 1376, 1523, 1751, 2043, 2409, 3907
.....	3993, 4076, 4263, 5585, 5767, 5945, 6034
Storm victims .....	3860
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred	
municipalities .....	439
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape .....	3828
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape .....	6061, 6084

## AUGUST, S N

Ad-Hoc Committee: Tuberculosis-related matters .....	6135
Atlantis: Primary Healthcare clinics.....	5949
Bills:	
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5031
Vote 6: Health .....	5188
Vote 1: Premier.....	5215
Vote 7: Social Development.....	5314
Vote 5: Education .....	5366

Botha, Lorraine – motion of condolence.....	6128
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5819
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	4919
Statements .....	5768, 5945, 6002, 6032. 6089
Subject for discussion:	
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	5987
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa .....	5696
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities .....	5574
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape.....	6072

### **BAARTMAN, D M**

Accommodation sector jobs: loss of.....	1582
Beaufort West Municipality: financial recovery plan .....	4324
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	972
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	979
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle.....	4444
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	4627
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism .....	4631
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism .....	1987
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	2011
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle.....	3434
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	3601
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	3615
Consideration of votes and schedules.....	3684
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	5338
Vote 5: Education.....	5367
Consideration of votes and schedule .....	5434
Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B1-2020]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	3871
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle.....	2828
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism .....	2980
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	2989
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	3411
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	3425
Blended learning and the digital economy .....	5447
Cape Access Centre: Laingsburg .....	350

Botha, Lorraine – motion of condolence .....	6127
Clicks Group: Tresemme controversy.....	2361
Condolences, Motions of:	
De Vries, Dameon and Kaylie .....	1767
Meyer, Rukeya .....	2051
Plaatjies, Daniel .....	2596
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Barnes Prince Foundation.....	6155
Best fine dining restaurants: rankings .....	4173
City of Cape Town.....	3799
Maarman, Leah .....	6150
Nel, Cecilia .....	566
Nonyana, Lucas .....	566
Paarl Girls High School .....	6150
Van As, Poppie “Aunty” .....	185
Covid-19: donation from MTN Foundation.....	1546
Covid-19: impact on personal care services industry.....	1529
Covid-19: impact on SMME’s and informal traders.....	3791
Covid-19 impact: Western Cape Economy .....	1381
Covid-19: Wesgro .....	1479
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker .....	2101
Economic transformation: policy paper on.....	408
Electricity: procurement of from IPP’s.....	2058
Energy security .....	3790
Energy security and Eskom’s failures .....	237
Energy security in the Western Cape .....	1306
Eskom bailout: impact on unemployment rate .....	168
House, Business of – Motions .....	6138
IMF: John Steenhuisen: letter to.....	1354
Integrated Resource Plan: 2019 .....	664
International Literacy Day .....	6153
Job Creation and economic growth .....	3956
Loadshedding: impact on economy .....	3957
National public procurement legislation .....	3791
Nersa energy projects.....	2439
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
PPE procurement .....	2310
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	1187
Public procurement regulations .....	5593
Report of the Budget Committee on The Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B15-2019](NCOP) ( Ratification of Final Mandate) 939	
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B3 – 2020] (NCOP) .....	1488
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B9 – 2020] (NCOP) .....	1838
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B3 – 2021] (NCOP) .....	3965
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill	

[B19 – 2021 (NCOP).....	4607
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Second Amendment Bill [B24-2020] (NCOP) Consideration.....	3034
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the National Gambling Amendment Bill [B 27B – 2018] (NCOP) .....	2111
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities And Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board.....	507
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board .....	2331
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (9 September 2021) .....	4498
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill Consideration.....	3808
Safe Travels Stamp.....	2314
SAPS successes: Laingsburg .....	355
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women’s Month.....	227
Special Economic Zones – impact of .....	493
Statements .....	161, 399, 649, 1332, 1524, 1689, 2042, 2293, 2414 .....3855, 3956, 4266, 5440, 5835, 6139
Stellenbosch: Safe Travels stamp.....	1721
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect.....	1409
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	449
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods.....	3946
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape.....	3839
Tourism sector: job losses.....	2435
Transport National Port Authority .....	562
Transnet Ports Authority: dispute hearing .....	2306
Waste-to-energy plans .....	494
WCED: Smart classrooms.....	1712
Western Cape Department of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries – Female Entrepreneurship Awards .....	254
Western Cape Tourism Produce Development Fund.....	1717
World Robot Olympiad South Africa.....	252
Youth Month.....	1534
Youth Rehabilitation Boot Camp .....	422

**BAKUBAKU-VOS, N G**

Arendse, Colin: slander case dismissed .....	682
Atoli, Nomvuso: arrest of murder suspect.....	2326
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 7: Social Development.....	921
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 7: Social Development.....	4563
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Vote 7: Social Development.....	1971
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 7: Social Development.....	3552
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5036
Vote 7: Social Development .....	5306
Western Cape Laws Repeal Bill [B5 – 2019]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	2108
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 7: Social Development.....	2946
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 7: Social Development.....	3416
Child hunger and food poverty.....	5446
Cessation plans: DA .....	2133
Condolences, Motions of:	
Gugushe, Kwanele “Kwaito” .....	1553
Hendricks, Shaik Seraj.....	1704
Lindoor, Clarissa .....	581
Mentor, Mabel Patronella “Vytjie” .....	6151
Nyalasa, Lelethu .....	5728
Potgieter, Kobus.....	2144
Councillors: appointment of – illegal practices.....	5725
DA national leadership: withdrawal of Bonginkosi Madikizela .....	676
Familicide shooting .....	565
Fires in the Western Cape .....	4083
Garden Route: multiple gender-based violence and femicide .....	6047
Gender-based violence: Provincial Government employees, vetting of..	419
Grabouw: arrest of rapist .....	2152
Kiriboto, Yusuf: rescue attempt by.....	1709
Luluamandla, Lena: missing child.....	1714
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation	
on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger.....	5812
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation	
on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger.....	5835
Menier, Kai-ish – kidnapping .....	5600
Mrewetyana, Uyinene: memorial wellness centre.....	4268
National Women’s Day celebrations .....	4169
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2

Prince Harry and Duchess Meghan Markle.....	573
Quarantine facility in Mossel Bay: rape .....	2447
Residents of the Western Cape .....	4175
SAPS and Hawks arrest of fraud suspect .....	588
Sexual offences: increase in .....	5881
Slingers, Bridgenay: murder of.....	1720
Spanking of children at home.....	498
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic.....	2277
Commemorating National Women's Month.....	204
Women's Day, dignity and rights.....	4202
Statements.....	1563, 2042, 2183, 2409, 5834
Subject for discussion:	
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	369
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses.....	2167
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities .....	5575
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness oOf South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future .....	4222
University of the Western Cape: new hostel.....	2445
Vulnerable citizens .....	4177
Women: empowerment of .....	2047
16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children .....	4434

## **BANS, A P**

Advocate Norman Arendse .....	4087
Apartheid Place and street names: renaming .....	579
Attacks on trucks.....	423
Beach exclusion by-law.....	357
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019] Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports .....	987
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021] Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	4520
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020].....	1740
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports .....	1999
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021] Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	3631

Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3425
Cape Town City .....	239
Central Karoo District Municipality: virtual meetings .....	1395
Condolences, Motions of:	
Jakoet, Ismael Dr .....	3958
Khan, Ibrahim Dr .....	1698
Mouton, Estelle .....	1708
Schrikker, Flori .....	2444
Thopps, Anthea .....	172
Williams, Chester .....	366
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Banyana Banyana .....	5957
Du Toit: Brigadier .....	2448
Le Roux, Marlene .....	2212
Matsaluka, Chuma .....	176
McCarthy, Benni .....	6042
Mvimbi, Samkelo "Sam" .....	3999
Nomdo, Christina .....	1321
Prince Albert D R Church .....	6097
Rasool, Ebrahim .....	2325
Springboks: victory .....	4273
Tunzi, Zozibini .....	244
Covid 19: alcohol restrictions .....	1715
Covid-19: Provincial Government: wearing DA colours on face masks .....	
Covid-19: religious gatherings .....	1547
Cricket SA: review of match-fixing saga .....	2156
Cricket SA: transformation .....	2321
DA national leader: lifestyle .....	564
Dams: good rainfall .....	2383
Department of Social Development: social distancing failure .....	1386
DHL Stormers: Vodacom United Rugby Championships .....	5954
Eskom: Security points .....	349
Etzebeth, Eben: alleged racial incident .....	354
Festive lights event: performing artists .....	678
Gender-based violence: employee vetting .....	663
Guga S'Thebe Theatre .....	2311
Institutional racism .....	4171
International Sports Events .....	6042
Karoo Outreach Project .....	2157
Local governments: instability caused by DA leaders .....	3791
Murders: women and children .....	181
Newlands Rugby Stadium .....	2607
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	59, 1166
Print newspapers and magazines .....	1322
South African sports people: successes .....	669
Speaker:	
Debates of:	

Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic.....	2281
Commemorating National Women's Month.....	220
Statements.....	342, 1689, 4264, 6087
Subject for discussion:	
Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a world-class health system .....	4300
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty .....	6171
Traditional initiation ceremonies.....	2605
Tygerberg Hospital: drowning .....	501
Women's Month .....	184
Yomelela Primary School: shooting of principal .....	430
Youth Hub: Kwamandlenkosi Project .....	583

## **BOSMAN, G**

### **Bills:**

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 7: Social Development .....	919
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Vote 7: Social Development .....	1973
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 7: Social Development .....	4568
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 7: Social Development .....	3555
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	5072
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism.....	5089
Western Cape Laws Repeal Bill [B5 – 2019]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	2109
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 7: Social Development .....	2948
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 7: Social Development .....	3417
Alcohol: safe consumption of .....	1586
Child support services to vulnerable children .....	3957
Chrysalis Academy: graduates.....	6018
Condolence - motions	
Fagan, Gawie .....	2433
Grendon, Paul.....	413
Hartley, Lincoln .....	425
Ismail, Shumeez .....	4437
Jacobs, Chriszelda .....	3997
Kiriboto, Yusuf .....	1767
Koertzen, Rudi.....	6096
Langdown, Dawn .....	6105
Lintvelt, Bert.....	3997
Mattera, Don .....	5954
Mpambo-Sibhukwana, Thandi .....	1699

Paulse, Abedah .....	1767
Ronge, Barry .....	5955
Schüssler, Mike .....	5784
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Calitzdorp Cellars: Awards .....	353
Ellis, Desiree .....	5955
Gaag, James .....	5952
Joon, Susanna .....	349
Ladles of love .....	1773
Mahoko, Mosadi Dr .....	1546
Maritz, Herman .....	5596
Marthinus: Lieutenant-Colonel .....	671
Social Development and Early Childhood Development Department .....	4271
South African Commonwealth Games Team .....	6101
Tempelhoff, Peter .....	5952
Van der Merwe, Kobus .....	5952
Wells, Dan .....	5596
Western Cape Department of Social Development .....	4436
Covid-19: homeless people .....	2143
Covid-19: psychosocial support services .....	1481
Covid-19: social development interventions .....	1756
Department of Social Development: residential facilities for Older persons .....	1579
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker .....	2099
ECD Centres: safe opening .....	1588
Fransman, Marius .....	507
Gender-based and domestic violence .....	1757
Heritage Day .....	2437
Lockdown: distribution of food .....	1477
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143): The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5810
Mossel Bay and the Western Cape Government Joint Operation Centre .....	6103
National Department of Social Development: violation of human rights	1391
Nomdo, Christina: Children's Commissioner .....	1580
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	3245, 4898
Psychosocial disability awareness month .....	1711
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism and the COVID-19 Temporary Employer/Employee Relief Scheme (TERS), funding process undertaken by the Unemployment Insurance Fund, and the Response/views of the public in the Western Cape on this process 5298	
Statements ..... 230, 397, 551, 1330, 1527, 1686, 2125, 2188, 2348, 2578 ..... 3788, 3989, 4167, 4317, 5441, 5769, 5875, 6004, 6091	
State-subsidised social development support .....	3857

## Subject for discussion:

Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	375
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government's Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs 3979	
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future.....	4220
Tourism recovery strategy.....	5775
Western Cape Youth Parliament.....	183
Women in Humanity Arts Festival .....	183
World Foster Day .....	1538

**BOTHA, L J**

## Bills:

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019] Vote 5: Education .....	896
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021] Vote 5: Education .....	4648
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020] Vote 5: Education .....	1933
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021] Vote 5: Education .....	3655
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020] Vote 5: Education .....	2920
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022] Vote 1: Premier .....	5217
Vote 14: Local Government.....	5267
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021] Consideration of principle.....	3402
Consideration of votes and schedule Vote 5: Education .....	3413
Botha's Halte Primary school: openingA .....	567
Cederberg Municipality: clean audit .....	563
Cederberg Municipality: unlawful motion of no confidence .....	170
Central Karoo: Local government and service delivery .....	5446
Condolence - motions	
Abrahams, Winston .....	4272
Adams, Jonathan.....	5597
April, Jakobus .....	3795
Benjamin, Petronella.....	1321
Fritz, Theodora .....	1323
Lottering, Cornelius (Neels) .....	5450
Mazembe, Kungawa .....	189
Meyer, Jannie .....	3794

Muller, Gershwin .....	2139
Plaatjies, Allison .....	668
Richter, Abraham Jacobus Stephanus .....	1769
Scotsman, Ernest .....	4320
Spannenberg, Izak Wilhelm Abraham .....	1470
Wewers, Maria .....	4271
Williams, Leo .....	2137
Congratulatory / Wishes:	
Allen, Reagen .....	5777
Amon, Megan .....	1774
Beaufort West Municipality .....	5452
Boks, Christo "Kito" .....	5951
Department of Local Government and Treasury .....	5452
Dudley, Karen .....	2307
Du Toit, Gawie .....	2209
Groenvlei Secondary School .....	1773
Kuhn, Jerry and Pat .....	574
Oaklands Secondary School .....	1773
Premier Alan Winde .....	5733
Ritchie, Victor: 90 <sup>th</sup> birthday .....	2605
Schäfer, Debbie .....	5734
Thumbadoo, Zeni .....	3959
Wenger, Mireille .....	5777
Western Cape Education Department .....	5956
Covid-19: deaths of teachers and staff members .....	1702
Covid-19: disruption and shutdown of schools .....	1709
Covid-19: impact on ECD's and social and economic livelihoods .....	1528
Covid-19: reopening of schools .....	1539
Covid-19: return of grade 7 and 12 learners .....	1482
Covid-19: school feeding scheme .....	1772
Covid-19: schools, prolonged closure of .....	1758
Farm attacks: Elandsberg, Clanwilliam and Redelingshys .....	246
Grade 9: exit point – schooling .....	560
House, Business of – Motions .....	5760, 5809, 5942, 5943, 5979, 6060
Learner numbers: increase in .....	165
Marconi Beam Primary School and Sinenjongo High School, burning of .....	1778
Mhlanga, Elijah, DBE spokesperson: condemnation of .....	256
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2547
National Senior Certificate examinations .....	2602
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	4928
Quintile system: impact on performance of schools .....	2190
Rape in Hanover Park: arrest of alleged suspect .....	675
Report on the Standing Committee on Education on an oversight visit to the Jakes Gerwel Technical High School conducted on 15 November 2019 .....	2159

Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Social Assistance Amendment Bill [B8B-2018] (NCOP)	
- (Consideration).....	2573
School examinations .....	419
Schools: bullying - efforts to address .....	3859
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic.....	2270
Women's Day, dignity and rights .....	4204
Statements.....	231, 340, 401, 658, 1288, 1375, 1526, 1753, 2187
.....	2573, 3785, 4032, 4162, 4243, 5443, 5721, 5832, 6001
Steyn-Dowie, Tania .....	579
Suicide of learners .....	3959
Top ten teachers: awards for excellence.....	676
University of the Western Cape: renaming of main hall .....	5956
Western Cape Department of Education: budget cut .....	662
Western Cape municipalities: auditor-general and Ratings Afrika reports .....	5890
Western Cape Provincial Disaster Management Centre .....	5451

## **BREDELL, A W**

### **Bills:**

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 14: Local Government.....	905, 914
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	927, 936
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	4539
Vote 14: Local Government .....	4544
Vote 14: Local Government .....	4545, 4552
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020].....	1740
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	1888, 1897
Vote 14: Local Government.....	1900, 1909
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	3512, 3519
Vote 14: Local Government.....	3521, 3531
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	5230, 5248
Vote 14: Local Government.....	5252, 5271
Western Cape Biodiversity Bill [B2B – 2021]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	4477
Western Cape Land Use Planning Amendment Bill [B6 – 2020]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	3873
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	2926
.....	2931

Vote 14: Local Government .....	2935, 2942
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	1153, 4920
Statements, response to .....	153, 492, 3994, 4040, 4244, 5591, 5772
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect .....	1416
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities .....	478
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	5996
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape .....	3847
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape .....	6073
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty .....	6167

**BRINKHUIS, G**

Ad-Hoc Committee: Tuberculosis-related matters .....	6137
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	4461
Vote 1: Premier .....	4505
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	4523
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	4541
Vote 14: Local Government .....	4549
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	4557
Vote 7: Social Development.....	4568
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	4577
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	4618
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism.....	4635
Vote 5: Education .....	4647
Vote 6: Health .....	4661
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	4682
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Consideration of principle .....	4512
Vote 1: Premier .....	1856
Vote 6: Health .....	1872
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	1884
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	1897
Vote 5: Education .....	1937
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	3439
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	3473
Vote 6: Health .....	3489
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	3505
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	3517
Vote 14: Local Government .....	3527
Vote 7: Social Development.....	3554
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	3601

Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	3614
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3635
Vote 5: Education .....	3654
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3673
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5042
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	5107
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	5128
Vote 1: Premier .....	5217
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	5242
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	5291
Vote 7: Social Development .....	5314
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	5339
Vote 5: Education .....	5367
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	5401
Consideration of votes and schedule .....	5434
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	3404
Western Cape Biodiversity Bill [B2B – 2021]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	4484
Biko, Steve: commemoration .....	2359
Botha, Lorraine – motion of condolence .....	6127
Bredell, Anton: breach of Executive Members Ethics Code .....	3460
Calls to prayers: bylaws on noise pollution .....	5783
Closing: Third session, Sixth Parliament .....	4691
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Akter, Shadia .....	4433
Bianchi, Julio .....	4172
Cassiem, Dayaan .....	4086
Cassiem, Mustapha .....	4086
Coetzee, Mervyn .....	3913
Johannes, Jean-Marc .....	5595
Mkhangeli, Themba .....	4319
Oktober, Jason .....	5777
Shah, Nuha .....	6149
Condolences:	
Vahed, Phaldiel .....	3998
Covid-19: frontline and essential workers .....	1337
Covid-19: third wave .....	3911
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee – WCPP seating allocation .....	5745
Farmworkers: plight of .....	3789
Gangsterism, drugs and crime: Cape Flats .....	3996
Learners transferring from other schools .....	4169
Madiba Supermarket: mass shooting .....	5886
Mass shootings in Khayelitsha .....	5885
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our citizens and their families .....	4593
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	

The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger.....	5824
Mufti Taha Karaan .....	4000
Nantes farm eviction case .....	6044
National Child Protection Week .....	5883
National Women’s Month.....	6043
Petersen, Keegan.....	5449
Places of safety for abused women and their children.....	4170
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2557, 3244
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	1195, 4941
Ramadan and Eid Al-Fitr .....	3805
Ramadan Holy Month.....	5453, 5463
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B9 – 2020] (NCOP) .....	1838
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B19 – 2021 (NCOP) .....	4607
Report on the Standing Committee on Education on an oversight visit to the Jakes Gerwel Technical High School conducted on 15 November 2019fma.....	2159
Russia: ban on provincial exports to.....	5446
Sampson, Courtney: Reverend .....	3776
Schools: bullying.....	4245
Schools: reopening of .....	2354
Shelters for abused women.....	6148
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Women’s Day, dignity and rights .....	4209
Stallholder permits .....	5949
Statements .....	1306, 1692, 2128, 2188, 2578, 3788, 3855, 3906
.....	3955, 3993, 4036, 4077, 4167, 4265, 4316, 5444, 5722, 5770, 5837
.....	5879, 5948, 6035, 6092, 6143
Subject for discussion:	
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	5991
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa.....	5707
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods.....	3927
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses .....	2176
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities.....	5579
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government’s Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs.....	3983
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful	

these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape.....	4066
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future .....	4222
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty .....	6168
Woman in Islamic dress attacked.....	2585

## **CHRISTIANS, F C**

Aarto system: readiness to implement .....	4082
Alcohol-related offences.....	2189
Bester, Nicole: murdered UWC student .....	4043
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration .....	804
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	962
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	892
Vote 5: Education.....	903
Vote 14: Local Government.....	913
Vote 7: Social Development .....	923
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports .....	991
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	1031
Consideration of votes and schedules.....	1037
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	4439
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	4618
Vote 5: Education.....	4647
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	1822
Vote 1: Premier .....	1856
Vote 6: Health .....	1871
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	1884
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	1896
Vote 14: Local Government.....	1909
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	1923
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	1961
Vote 7: Social Development .....	1977
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism .....	1992
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports .....	2004
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	2014
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	2028
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle.....	3438
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	3473
Vote 6: Health .....	3488

Vote 11: Agriculture .....	3503
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	3516
Vote 14: Local Government .....	3526
Vote 1: Premier .....	3540
Vote 7: Social Development.....	3554
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	3568
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	3588
Vote 5: Education .....	3653
Consideration of votes and schedules .....	3682
Executive statement – response to.....	3696
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5034
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	5128
Vote 5: Education .....	5366
Consideration of votes and schedule.....	5434
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	2832
Vote 5: Education .....	2919
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	2971
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	3402
Blessings Educare Centre, Delft: fire .....	5888
Botha, Lorraine – motion of condolence .....	6128
Bread price: increase in .....	5880
Bredell, Anton: breach of Executive Members Ethics Code.....	3460
Bullying in schools .....	346, 5594
Cape of Good Hope SPCA .....	5778
Cape Muslim and slave museum.....	5449
CapeNature Cubs Club.....	5889
Closing: First session, Sixth Parliament.....	1045
Closing: Second session, Sixth Parliament .....	3046
Closing: Third session, Sixth Parliament .....	4690
Comprehensive Sexuality education curriculum for 2020 .....	665
Condolence - motions	
Africa, Keanno.....	3863
Barden, Suraya .....	5598
Buys family.....	6150
Canterbury, Giovanni .....	2423
Erasmus, Aseeqah .....	6011
Faro, Daffidol.....	6011
Fortuin, Cedric.....	3863
Hector, Jaydene .....	3863
Hope, Thyrone .....	3959
Khoba, Desmond .....	2423
Levendal, Glen .....	2136
Ncithi, Philiswa .....	2302
Phillips, Johan .....	4084
Pietersen, Mark .....	4084
Rauss, Sue Ann .....	3863
Sampson, Deon .....	2050
Snyman, Tamar.....	3997

Wanza, Geraldo.....	3863
Williams, Chester.....	366
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Adams, Clara.....	6040
Ameeroedien, Rayana.....	416
Bauer, Leah-Angel.....	5950
Cape Muslim and slave museum.....	5727
De Wet, Martus.....	356
Fernandez, Austin.....	320
Habana, Bryan.....	1570
Kirsten, Gary.....	1570
Kolisa, Siya.....	1570
Koopman, Codie.....	4045
Mallick, Azraa.....	502
Matthee, Keith.....	356
Matthews, James David.....	672
Mkhefa, Asiphe.....	2358
Modise, Khotso.....	356
Powell, Braedon.....	2195
Prins, Gladys.....	6040
4 x 100 metre men's U20 relay team.....	4270
Covid 19: cases in schools.....	1567
Covid 19: cleaners and porters.....	1694
Covid 19: contributions by communities.....	1533
Covid-19: frontline and essential workers.....	1695
Covid-19: readiness of hospitals.....	1568
Covid-19: schools, calls for closure of.....	1693
Covid-19: third wave readiness.....	3909
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker.....	2101
Ad-hoc Committee – WCPP seating allocation.....	5744
Emergency medical services: attacks on.....	1706
Golden Arrow buses: ongoing torching of.....	2130
High school admissions: entrance exams.....	5725
Illegal land invasions.....	1755
Justice Desk: Mbokodo Club.....	2587
Khayelitsha: current spate of killings.....	3856
Kidnapping for ransom: increasing incidents.....	6146
Land invasions in the Western Cape.....	3790
Learner suicides.....	3996
Lockdown: crime rate.....	1567
Lockdown: police and army brutality.....	1528
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our citizens and their families.....	4592
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger.....	5821
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation	

on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger.....	5835
Matric results: decline .....	494
Mitchells Plain: bus robberies .....	2579
Mondale High School.....	171
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Ongoing gang violence .....	2045
Police brutality .....	2297
PPE for burial undertakers.....	2138
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2553, 3238
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	108, 1188, 4932
Primary school learner drop-outs.....	4268
Primary schools: readiness to return .....	3957
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 dated 6 May 2022 .....	5746
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 on its oversight and public participation activities undertaken during the period 14 April to 24 November 2020.....	2857
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B9 – 2020] (NCOP) .....	1838
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B6 – 2022] (NCOP) .....	5798
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Second Amendment Bill [B24-2020] (NCOP) Consideration .....	3034
Report of the Conduct Committee dated 25 November 2020 .....	3043
Report of the Conduct Committee on a complaint against an Honourable Member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in accordance with the code of conduct for Members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament dated 7 May 2001 .....	4279
Report of the Conduct Committee on the failure of hon member G Brinkhuis to submit disclosure forms timeously .....	2389
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Upgrading of the Land Tenure Rights Amendment Bill [B6B-2020] Consideration .....	3811
Report on the Standing Committee on Education on an oversight visit to the Jakes Gerwel Technical High School conducted on 15 November 2019.....	2159
Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on the Customary Initiation Bill [B7B-2018] (NCOP) Consideration .....	3036
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the National Gambling Amendment Bill [B 27B – 2018] (NCOP).....	2111
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling	

and Racing Board (Consideration).....	2330
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local Government Municipal Structures Amendment Bill [B19D 2018] (NCOP) Consideration.....	3041
Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on the Traditional Courts Bill [B1D-2017] Consideration.....	3038
Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Social Assistance Amendment Bill [B8B-2018] (NCOP) - (Consideration).....	2572
Sampson, Courtney: Reverend .....	3776
Schools and effects of crime .....	407
Schreuder, Brian: appointment of.....	6095
Shootings and killings: high risk areas .....	5840
Sithonga, Lunamandla: missing child.....	1761
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic.....	2279
Women's Day, dignity and rights.....	4206
Statements..... 160, 232, 342, 400, 488, 655, 1292, 1303, 1333, 1378 ..... 1447, 1526, 1563, 1688, 1752, 2041, 2126, 2186, 2288, 2346 ..... 2411, 2576, 3786, 3853, 3905, 3952, 3991, 4034, 4075, 4165 ..... 4240, 4263, 4314, 5442, 5588, 5720, 5768, 5835, 5877, 5946 ..... 6003, 6033, 6089, 6141	
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect.....	1410
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	448
Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a world-class health system .....	4300
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	5989
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	378
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa .....	5696
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods .....	3937
The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape .....	2392
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses.....	2172
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities .....	5574
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government's Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs .....	3980
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the	

introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape .....	4060
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy.....	1508
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future.....	4227
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province .....	281
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape .....	3844
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape .....	6077
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty .....	6166
Taxi related murders .....	2416
Taxi violence.....	1693
Taxi wars .....	2352
Tramways Football Club: soccer stars.....	6096
WCED Safe Schools Call Centre.....	6038

**DE JAGER, I**

Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	115
Subject for discussion:	
The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape.....	537
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province .....	285

**DUGMORE, C M**

ANC: 6th National Policy Conference .....	6010
Apartheid criminals: prosecution.....	4090
BBBEE advisory council: appointment.....	5852
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration.....	813
Vote 1: Premier.....	834
Consideration of votes and schedules .....	1034
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	4463
Vote 1: Premier.....	4510

Vote 14: Local Government.....	4548
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle.....	1813
Vote 1: Premier .....	1850
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 1: Premier .....	3537
Consideration of votes and schedules.....	3684
Executive statement – response to .....	3694
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle.....	5024
Vote 1: Premier .....	5208
Vote 14: Local Government.....	5258
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle.....	2823
Vote 1: Premier .....	2875
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle.....	3398
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 1: Premier .....	3408
Bredell, Anton: allegations against.....	2132
Bredell, Anton: breach of Executive Members Ethics Code .....	3455
Bredell, MEC and officials: call for investigation.....	1779
Bredell, Anton: Minister – investigation into complaints .....	2190
Call to open the economy and lift the ban on the sale of alcohol .....	2046
Closing: Third session, Sixth Parliament.....	4689
Condolence – motions	
Bizos, George.....	2380
Dangor, Achmat.....	2388
Goldberg, Denis.....	1316
Koloane, David .....	192
Mabuza, Jabu .....	4088
Mohamed, Hishaam.....	2221
Mugabe, Robert Gabriel .....	432
Naughton, Pat.....	5454
Ntamo, Thembisile Gladstone.....	6151
Pedro, Nicklo .....	3861
Sigcau, Zanozuko Tyelovuyo: King.....	5884
Siswana, Siyabulela.....	1719
Veldman, Sazi.....	430
Winde, William David.....	188
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Barry, Magdalene .....	1785
Oosthuizen Louis.....	5954
Princess Charlene of Monaco.....	5954
Ramaphosa Cyril: President and his Cabinet .....	5455
Coronavirus: labour inspectors, interference with .....	1338
Covid-19: delay by Premier to meet with opposition leaders.....	1312
Covid-19: patients appearing before Ad Hoc Committee .....	1785
Covid-19: provincial command centre .....	1309
Covid-19: shelters for the poor and homeless.....	1341

Cuban doctors: medical assistance .....	1325
DA: double standards in disciplinary matters .....	3801
DA: maladministration and improper conduct by .....	6147
DA national leader: Mmusi Maimane .....	584
DA: Steinhoff donations .....	587
DA ward councillor: Pastor Melvin Roelfztra .....	4049
Deputy Speaker: investigation into allegations .....	1453
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker .....	2092, 2103
Eid-ul-Fitr .....	3861
Farrel Payne: sexual harassment charges .....	5849
Fritz, Albert: Minister - investigation .....	5467
Former Premier: colonialism tweets .....	664
Gender-based violence: multi-party committee meeting .....	411
Gentrification and legacy of apartheid spatial planning .....	242
Global conflicts: irresponsible handling of .....	5448
Goosen, Leon: snubbing of .....	2601
Head of Provincial Traffic: court appearance .....	3914
Institute of Race Relations: appointment of Helen Zille .....	194
Knysna: vegetable garden for the poor .....	2146
Land: need for .....	3859
Land and housing: protests .....	2084
Lifestyle audits .....	2581
Lifestyle audits: executive councils .....	2059
Lifestyle audits: outcomes .....	2048
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5826
Mayor of George .....	1473
Municipal Land: leasing of .....	2030
National Assembly Portfolio Committee .....	4002
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Olympic Games: Tokyo .....	4173
Payne, Farrell: sexual harassment charges .....	5849
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	59, 1137, 3196, 4884
President Ramaphosa: joint sitting address .....	2597
Provincial Liquor Act: amendment of .....	4091
Racism, upsurge of during the Covid-19 pandemic .....	1307
Report of the Rules Committee* on the parental leave for Parliamentarians, dated 2 December 2019 .....	1042
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local Government Municipal Structures Amendment Bill [B19D 2018] (NCOP) Consideration .....	3041
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local Government: Municipal Systems Amendment Bill [B2D – 2019] ..	4493
Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on the Traditional Courts Bill [B1D-2017] Consideration .....	3038
Sampson, Courtney: Reverend .....	3776

Schools: bullying - efforts to address .....	3859
Service delivery: state of .....	3858
Solidarity Fund .....	1713
Statements.....552, 1333, 1440, 1560, 1750, 2344, 2576, 3784, 3903 .....3952, 4034, 4073, 4241, 4261, 4315, 5586, 5832, 6030, 6139	
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect.....	1414
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	474
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	394
Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a world-class health system .....	4304
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa .....	5696
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods .....	3928
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities .....	5570
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape.....	4054
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape.....	3830
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future .....	4233
Twigg, Grant: Metro Chairperson – motion of no confidence .....	588
WCPP Presiding Officers: suitability of .....	6039
Western Cape Province: attempt to segregate.....	3998
“Women’s” Desk.....	587

## **DU TOIT MARAIS, A J**

### **Bills:**

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019] Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports .....	983, 993
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021] Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	4519, 4526
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020].....	1740
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports .....	1994, 2005
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021] Consideration of principle.....	3436
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	3624, 3639
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022] Consideration of principle.....	5032
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	5096, 5113

Vote 4: Community Safety .....	5116, 5135
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration .....	2818
Introduction and first reading .....	2664
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3010, 3019
Condolence - motions	
Williams, Chester .....	364
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on the Traditional Courts Bill [B1D-2017]	
Consideration .....	3039
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic .....	2274
Women's Day, dignity and rights .....	4198
Subject for discussion:	
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	385
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa.....	5696
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses .....	2172
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future.....	4230

**FERNANDEZ, S G**

## Bills:

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration.....	800
Vote 7: Social Development.....	917, 924
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 7: Social Development.....	4561, 4570
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	1819
Vote 7: Social Development.....	1969, 1978
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 7: Social Development.....	3549, 3558
Western Cape Laws Repeal Bill [B5 – 2019]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	2107, 2109
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	2836
Vote 14: Local Government .....	2937
Vote 7: Social Development.....	2943, 2950
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	

Vote 7: Social Development .....	5301, 5318
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5818
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	91, 4938
Statements, response to .....	235, 558, 1566, 4267
Subject for discussion:	
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	380
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods.....	3940
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses .....	2168
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy .....	1512
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future .....	4223

**FRITZ, A T**

Bills:	
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	3579, 3592
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration .....	789
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	953, 963
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle.....	4452
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	4615, 4622
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020] .....	1740
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	1947, 1962
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	2964, 2974
Closing: Third session, Sixth Parliament .....	4692
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done.....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2550
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	86, 1199, 3208
Statements, response to .....	659, 2414, 3908, 4081
Subject for discussion:	
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in	

(xxx)

the Western Cape .....	390
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province .....	275

**FRY, C M**

Statements .....	6032, 6140
------------------	------------

**GILLION, M N**

Subject for discussion: Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities .....	458
---	-----

**HERRON, B N**

Bills:

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration.....	802
Vote 1: Premier.....	838
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	860
Vote 11: AgriFrculture .....	892
Vote 5: Education .....	902
Vote 7: Social Development.....	923
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....	936
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	961
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports.....	991
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	1019
Consideration of votes and schedules .....	1035
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	4452
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	1856
Vote 1: Premier.....	1856
Vote 6: Health .....	1871
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	1892
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	1895
Vote 14: Local Government .....	1909
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	1923
Vote 5: Education .....	1936
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	1961
Vote 7: Social Development.....	1977
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism.....	1992
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports.....	2004
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	2014
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	2028
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Introduction and first reading .....	3368
Consideration of principle .....	3435
Consideration of votes and schedules .....	3681

Executive statement – response to .....	3696
Western Cape Land Use Planning Amendment Bill [B6 – 2020]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	3873
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	2831
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	2893
Vote 6: Health .....	2907
Vote 5: Education .....	2919
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	2930
Vote 14: Local Government.....	2939
Vote 7: Social Development .....	2946
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	2957
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle.....	3402
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 5: Education .....	3412
Bredell, Anton: breach of Executive Members Ethics Code .....	3458
Closing: First session, Sixth Parliament .....	1044
Closing: Second session, Sixth Parliament .....	3046
Condolence - motions	
Williams, Chester .....	364
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Domingo, Cherise .....	2588
Dunn, Riyad .....	2588
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker.....	2098
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done.....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2549, 3223
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	93, 1158
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 on its oversight and public participation activities undertaken during the period 14 April to 24 November 2020 .....	2855
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B9 – 2020] (NCOP).....	1837
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Second Amendment Bill [B24-2020] (NCOP) Consideration.....	3034
Report of the Conduct Committee dated 25 November 2020.....	3043
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Upgrading of the Land Tenure Rights Amendment Bill [B6B-2020] Consideration.....	3811
Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on the Customary Initiation Bill [B7B-2018] (NCOP) Consideration.....	3036
Report on the Standing Committee on Education on an oversight visit to the Jakes Gerwel Technical High School conducted	

on 15 November 2019.....	2159
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the National Gambling Amendment Bill [B 27B – 2018] (NCOP).....	2111
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (Consideration) .....	2331
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local Government Municipal Structures Amendment Bill [B19D 2018] (NCOP) Consideration .....	3041
Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on the Traditional Courts Bill [B1D-2017] Consideration .....	3038
Sampson, Courtney: Reverend .....	3776
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic .....	2276
Commemorating National Women’s Month .....	212
Statements .....	159, 300, 341, 487, 654, 1291, 1303, 1332, 1377
.....	1446, 1525, 1562, 1687, 2040, 2125, 2185, 2288, 2345, 2410
.....	2576, 3951, 4033, 4074
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect .....	1403, 1426
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities .....	447
Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a world-class health system.....	4297
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	377
The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape .....	528
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods .....	3935
The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape .....	2399
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses .....	2170
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government’s Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs .....	3978
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape .....	4059

The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time Preserving livelihoods in the economy .....	1504
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future .....	4225
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province .....	280
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape.....	3838

**KAIZER-PHILANDER, W F**

Ad-Hoc Committee: Tuberculosis-related matters.....	6134
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019] Vote 6: Health .....	869
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021] Consideration of principle.....	4462
Vote 6: Health .....	4659
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020] Vote 6: Health .....	1868
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021] Consideration of principle.....	3439
Vote 6: Health .....	3489
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020] Vote 6: Health .....	2907
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021] Consideration of votes and schedule Vote 6: Health .....	3415
Carte Blanche Making a Difference Trust .....	6053
Condolences, Motions of:	
Botha, Roelof Dr .....	1534
Claasen, Stewart .....	195
Goetham, Nadia.....	3795
Hendricks, Runaldo .....	5729
Levendal, John .....	2429
Mangenene, Henrietta Sylvester.....	2198
Ngidi, Ntombizakithi .....	1341
Pedro, Thomas .....	1576
Phangindawo, Naledi.....	1572
Plaatjies-van Huffel, Mary-Ann .....	1388
Pule, Tshegofatso.....	1572
Titus, Chad-Lee Titus .....	195
Titus, Charis.....	195
Titus, Miguel .....	195
Wilsnach, Maryam Ali .....	187
Williams, Chester.....	415

Congratulations / Wishes:

Blaauw, Heidi .....	2148
Brink, Clint.....	4084
Daniels, Patrick .....	5729
Fritz, Albert: Hon .....	3914
Geqiwe, Anele .....	4085
Petersen, Keegan .....	4085
Smith, Barry Dr.....	5452
Van Rooyen, Rene .....	4084
Witzenberg Municipality .....	5730
Covid-19: deaths of healthcare workers .....	1387, 1703
Covid-19 field hospital: CTICC .....	1582
Covid-19: Food distribution: draft regulations .....	1349
Covid-19: Groote Schuur testing and triage centre.....	1587
Covid-19: mobile testing units.....	1775
Covid-19: population immunity .....	3858
Covid-19 resurgence .....	2600
Covid-19: Vaccine registration.....	3912
CTICC Field Hospital – nurses .....	1544
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker .....	2096
Drakenstein: annual sports derby .....	6041
Drakenstein: social relief initiatives .....	1394
EMS, attacks on.....	2204
Foetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorder Day.....	2368
Gift of the Givers: 38 <sup>th</sup> birthday celebration.....	2066
Grassy Park community health care facility.....	568
Healthcare workers: in memoriam .....	5451
International Nurses Day .....	1343, 3862
Médecins Sans Frontières .....	1548
Nurse training: private hospitals .....	6012
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
National Women’s Day .....	167
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	59, 1161, 3195
Public healthcare facilities: decreasing budgets .....	6104
Report of the Conduct Committee on a complaint against an Honourable Member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in accordance with the code of conduct for Members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament dated 7 May 2001 .....	4280
Report of the Conduct Committee on the failure of hon member S N August to submit disclosure forms timeously (2020) .....	5958
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic .....	2283
Commemorating National Women’s Month .....	200
Women’s Day, dignity and rights .....	4207
Statements .....	234, 402, 557, 1302, 1443, 1565, 1684, 2123, 2347 ..... 3906, 3992, 4073, 4239, 4313, 5590, 5877, 5949, 6036, 6142

## Subject for discussion:

Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a world-class health system .....	4297
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	5989
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods .....	3935
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future .....	4227
T C Newman Community Day Centre .....	2373
The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape.....	535
Tuberculosis awareness.....	3858
Tygerberg Hospital: dismissal of three doctors .....	312
Violence: condemnation of .....	2150
Western Cape Department of Health: diligent management of the Covid=19 pandemic .....	2215
Witzenberg Community: Violent Crime .....	6041
Women's Day.....	2065
Women's Day celebrations.....	4176

**KAMA, M**

Andile Mbenyane inaugural Pre-season tournament .....	321
Baden Powell Way: Khayelitsha – bodies dumped .....	2449
Barrydale: gender-based violence.....	561
Bills:	
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	3585
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	956
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020].....	1740
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	1953
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	5100
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	5116
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	2968
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	3014
Bloekombos violence .....	2067
Body of young girl found in wheelie bin .....	6097
Bonteheuwel car shooting .....	2383
Boucher, Mark: call for removal as head coach .....	4254
Cape Flats violence.....	3857
Case for sport report .....	5784
CCTV installations: not working .....	5739

Cell phone pylons: theft of batteries and equipment .....	4044
Ceres: struggles of the people of Nduli.....	2213
Children: DA endangering lives .....	1530
Clicks: demonstration by rogue EFF sympathisers.....	2382
Condolence - motions	
Arries, Nehemiah .....	2366
Finger, Leyden .....	426
Fritz, Theodora .....	1314
Januari, Layona: Brigadier .....	2369
Johnson, Lameez .....	5457
Joseph, Hilton .....	426
Mbolekwa, Mncedisi .....	1769
Ncedani, Zanele .....	6011
Pecci, Marcelo.....	5741
Sigcawu, King Mpendulo Zwelonke .....	667
Sirunu, Andile .....	4322
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Cape Town All Stars.....	5785
Kolisa, Siya .....	1762
Masemola, Sehlahle Fannie: Lieutenant-General .....	5454
Ramaphosa Cyril: President (M Kama) .....	5454
Solani, Asisipho.....	5455
Courts: stance on sexual harassment in the workplace.....	4085
Covid-19 pandemic emergency lockdown rules: flaunting of .....	1308
Crime and safety.....	165
Crime, fighting of: community participation .....	3792
Crime statistics .....	408
Crime statistics: increase .....	408
Crime: successes against.....	1325
Cupido, Gaylin: murder – suspect arrested .....	1774
DA Provincial leader: race .....	2328
DA: senior members: arrests .....	3999
Drug-related convictions .....	6148
Education HOD: Public Service Commission finding .....	2440
Elsies River drug bust.....	2448
Elsies River shooting .....	1389
Evictions .....	2317
Fortune, Steven: double life sentence .....	4047
Gender-based violence: inability to deal with.....	2151
Gender-based violence: men’s dialogue.....	2327
Grassy Park shooting .....	2378
Gunfight between police and robbers .....	5600
Illegal firearms: recovery of.....	351
Imbalances of the past: women .....	2055
IPID: findings against 15 SAPS stations .....	6148
Jewellery store robberies .....	257
Khayelitsha: recent murders .....	2083
Law enforcement officers: competency certificates .....	1548, 2375
Learners: alcohol and substance abuse .....	178
Learners: unplaced .....	178
Lion cubs: smuggling of .....	357

Lockdown: South African Police Service .....	1487
Lockdown regulations: alcohol-related crime and injuries .....	2417
Manenberg: gang violence .....	1537
Manenberg: murders and arrests .....	2150
Mass murder: Khayelitsha .....	5788
Mass shooting: Khayelitsha Site C .....	5732, 5739
Matie medical student: sexual assault of fellow student .....	1772
Missing women and children .....	2071
Municipal Councils: evictions .....	1780
Murder of pregnant mother of two .....	246
Murder rate: underlying factors .....	5881
Murders of Amorei Vermaak and Stephen Fleck .....	1721
Neighbourhood Watch member: assault by .....	2208
Neighbourhood Watches: rogue vigilante groups .....	1765
Operation Dudula .....	5775
Phaphu, Azola: 6th birthday celebration .....	2053
Police functions: devolving of .....	252
Police resources: crime in hotspot areas .....	3859
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	1151, 3229
Prinsloo, Chris: former SAPS Colonel .....	2607
Provincial Government official: alleged rape of a minor .....	2360
Provincial Police Commissioner: appointment of .....	680
Qolani, Bulelani: undignified eviction .....	2218
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Rapist: arrest and court appearance .....	2149
Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on the Customary Initiation Bill [B7B-2018] (NCOP)	
Consideration .....	3036
Rheinmetall Denel Munitions Plant: explosion .....	2229
Rogue neighbourhood watches .....	2192
Safety: effects on tourism and the economy .....	238
Safety issues and murders .....	173
Safety Plan .....	6094
Safety Plan: focus on causative factors of crime .....	1590
Safety Plan: gender-based violence .....	1588
Safety Plan Leap Officers: invasions and evictions .....	2418
SAPS: arrest of courier truck robbery suspects .....	2379
SAPS arrests and successes .....	2603
SAPS arrests: unlicensed guns and ammunition .....	2087
SAPS Harare: members suspected of extortion .....	3914
SAPS: car hijacking syndicate arrests .....	5599
SAPS: seizure of illegal firearms .....	1589
SAPS: services .....	2364
SAPS: successes .....	4321
SAPS: successful operation .....	4087
Schreuder, Brian: appointment .....	6094
Security groups: extortion .....	2324
Sekhokho, Seth - Councillor .....	503
Senior official: alleged rapist .....	2303

Smith, Danville: allegation of fraud against.....	2418
South African Police Services: arrests.....	5464
State security staff .....	4714
Statements .....	655, 2126, 3851, 3950, 4312, 5718
Statutory rape incident.....	5742
Subject for discussion:	
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	383
Taxi murders and violence .....	1777
The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape .....	544
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities.....	5582
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government's Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs.....	3973
Touwsrante: shooting of Malawian national shop owner .....	2384
TSU Private Security Firm .....	432
UIF-TERS: abuse of.....	3914
Unnatural deaths and violence in the Western Cape.....	4325
Valhalla Park accident .....	2223
Vrygrond taxi shooting.....	2225
Wallacedene: attempted murder of sergeant.....	2220
Weekend arrests by SAPS .....	2066
Western Cape Liquor authority – lockdown transgressors suspended...	1308
Western Cape Safety Strategy .....	1586
Willemse Juanita: murderer in court .....	2373
Worcester: drive-by shooting .....	2326
16 June: 45 <sup>th</sup> anniversary .....	5839
2021 Fishing Rights Allocation Process.....	6156

**LABUSCHAGNE, C**

Subject for discussion:

Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities .....	446
---	-----

**LEKKER, P Z**

Abalone and marine poaching: successes by SAPS .....	1386
Affordable housing in the city centre.....	258
Attack on ANC ward councillor: Old Crossroads .....	1400
Baartman, Deidre: member – withdrawal of mistruth.....	5471
Bills:	

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2020] Consideration of principle .....	1255
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019] Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	1027
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021] Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	4575
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	4616

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	3568
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	5420
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	2954
Botha, Lorraine – motion of condolence .....	6130
Condolences, Motions of:	
Cloete, Rykie .....	5952
Duarte, Yasmin “Jessie” .....	5951
Gabada, Sibongiseni .....	1589
Grobler, Cobus .....	4434
Fraser, Deborah.....	5778
Hleza, Wonderboy .....	5729
Jack, Lonwabo.....	3802
Mafalala, Abongile .....	5883
Mandela, Zindzi .....	1712
Matiwane, Buyile Sangolekhaya Bernard .....	5952
Nkomiyahlaba, Sibusiso .....	2446
Nomzazi, Phumeza.....	4320
Padayachee, Vishnu.....	3997
Plaatjies-van Huffel, Mary-Ann .....	1399
Rwexama, Kiki.....	3794
Siyoki, Asanda.....	1593
Congratulations / Wishes:	
De Kock, Nora .....	1350
Dube-Ncube, Nomusa: appointment as KwaZulu-Natal Premier .....	6097
Fester, Gertrude Professor .....	5842
Mapisa-Nqakula: Nosiviwe.....	4256
Proteas Women’s Team: Cricket World Cup .....	5453
Covid-19: educators .....	1381
Covid-19: gradual reopening of schools.....	1483
Covid-19: Western Cape: highest numbers.....	1585
Covid-19: National day of prayer.....	1470
Covid-19: political abuse by DA office bearers .....	1531
CTICC: temporary Covid-19 Hospital.....	1779
DA-led City of Cape Town.....	3797
DA Policy conference.....	2386
Deployment of medical professionals from Gauteng to assist the Western Cape .....	1597
Education: structural challenge .....	5447
Eid Mubarak.....	5596
Gender budgeting .....	5593
Gugulethu murders: manhunt.....	4090
Homeless rain shelter: removal of.....	1584
House, Business of – Motions.....	1254
Inequality in the Western Cape .....	5447
Informal settlement fires: increase in deaths.....	255
June: Pride Month .....	5847
Labuschagne, Cathy, interests in the tobacco industry .....	1485
Learner placement: 2023 academic year .....	5469

Lasithi, Unathi: sexual assault case .....	6049
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143): The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our citizens and their families .....	4593
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Philippi East and Nyanga: violent protests.....	3998
Philippi East attacks: arrest of suspects .....	1717
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2555
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	123
Property and lives: crime and destruction.....	1782
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Second Amendment Bill [B24-2020] (NCOP) Consideration .....	3033
Report of the Conduct Committee dated 25 November 2020 .....	3042
Report of the Conduct Committee on a complaint against an Honourable Member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in accordance with the code of conduct for Members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament dated 7 May 2001 .....	4279
Report of the Conduct Committee on the failure of hon member S N August to submit disclosure forms timeously (2020) .....	5958
Report of the Rules Committee on the review of rules.....	3576
Schools: racism incidents .....	5775
Self-quarantine of elderly resident .....	1392
Senekal: role of Helen Zille .....	2582
Simmers, MEC: allegations of electricity theft.....	240
Statements ..... 1426, 1753, 2347, 3786, 3905, 3992, 5443, 5769, 5946 .....	6003
Struggle heroes and heroines.....	5456
Subject for discussion:	
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	5993
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa.....	5696
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy.....	1518
Township fires: deaths.....	1471
Uniform rules, bullies and delinquents.....	5846
Van der Rhee, Antonio: Councillor: disciplinary action against.....	5460
Wesgro: resignation of Chairperson – Motion.....	1786
#BlackLivesMatter Global Campaign.....	1584

**LILI, A**

Biko, Stephen 428

**Bills:**

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019] Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	1004
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021] Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	4679

Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	2026
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3670
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	5335
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3025
City of Cape Town: high-priced utilities .....	4170
Land occupation and informal settlements development .....	5726
Lockdown: demolishing of properties .....	1716
Municipal infrastructure: poor maintenance.....	4269
Simmers, Hon Minister: electricity bill.....	186
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Ramadan Holy Month .....	5453
Statements .....	154, 6090
Tafelberg School site: judgment.....	2305
Tafelberg site: Helen Zille influence .....	2309
Winter readiness .....	5839

**MACKENZIE, R D**

Absa Run Your City and Langa Run for Freedom Races.....	5779
Accountability: measures taken to promote.....	3958
Al-Maamana: Lenteguur, Mitchells Plain .....	1396
Alpine Primary School: multiple burglaries.....	193
ANC: internal machinations.....	3803
Army: deployment of .....	174
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 1: Premier.....	831
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Vote 1: Premier .....	1853
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 1: Premier .....	3541
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 4: Community Safety.....	5124
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	5287
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle.....	2842
Vote 1: Premier .....	2879
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 1: Premier .....	3409
Border protection.....	407
Bredell, Anton: breach of Executive Members Ethics Code .....	3452
City of Cape Town: security structures.....	4172
Comprehensive Safety Plan.....	498
Condolences, Motions of:	
Arendse, Sheval .....	245
Barlett, Jamie.....	5841

Bizos, George .....	2363
Boyes, Carrol .....	251
Faku, Zemeka .....	1471
Fraser, Deborah .....	5778
Mello, Janika .....	412
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Booyesen, Lee-Shane .....	257
Harris, Washiela .....	666
Jacobs, Faez .....	253
Provincial Department of Transport and Public Works .....	4272
Williams, Dr Athol .....	352
Covid-19: draconian measures .....	2047
Covid-19: preserving life and preserving livelihoods .....	1449
Covid-19: public representatives testing positive .....	1708
Covid-19: reopening of schools, readiness .....	1550
Covid-19: sterling work by Western Cape Government .....	1480
Covid-19: Vodacom donation .....	1315
Dutch consulate: donation of food parcels .....	1720
Expanded unemployment rate: lowest .....	180
Gang violence: condolences to victims .....	5841
Gangsterism: SAPS failure to combat .....	3790
Gender-based violence: perpetrators .....	3789
International Nurses Day .....	5734
Lifestyle audits: Western Cape Government .....	2068
Lockdown regulations: court finding .....	1541
Mitchells Plain: non governmental organisations .....	1318
Mitchells Plain security structure .....	4174
National Coronavirus Command Council .....	1476
National Prosecuting Authority .....	410
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2557
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	70, 1145, 3256
Prisoners: rehabilitative services .....	409
Rail transport system .....	345
Ramadan: support to vulnerable residents .....	3864
Regulations during Covid-19 pandemic .....	1307
Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on the Traditional Courts Bill [B1D-2017]	
Consideration .....	3039
Rocklands Civic Centre: provincial heritage site .....	319
Rural Development Strategy .....	347
SAPS Mitchells Plain and Lentegour: recent unrest .....	4174
Security structures: work of .....	4171
Small business development .....	348
State Capture Inquiry: revelations .....	3856
Statements .....	233, 343, 656, 1329, 1439, 2038, 2184, 2287, 2345, 2575 ..... 3842, 3954, 4072, 4264, 4305, 5589, 5771, 5878, 6005, 6143
Subject for discussion:	

The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa .....	5696
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses .....	2166, 2181
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government's Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs.....	3986
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy .....	1500, 1520
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty .....	6175
Train operations and rail infrastructure.....	4169
Western Cape Department of Infrastructure.....	5955
Western Cape High Court: turmoil .....	2426
Wheatfield Estate Foundation Trust: funding .....	5727
Winde, Alan: Premier – self quarantining .....	1344

## **MADIKIZELA, B S**

### **Bills:**

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration .....	815
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	847, 861
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	1827
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	1923
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	3443
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	3466, 3476
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	2818
Vote 1: Premier .....	2871
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	2887, 2896
Closing: First session, Sixth Parliament .....	1046
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	66, 1142, 3204
Statements, response to .....	403, 1293, 2295
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect.....	1404
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	467
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	372

## **MAKAMBA-BOTYA, N**

Apartheid spatial legacy .....	4001
Apartheid spatial planning .....	3792

Baby Kaiisha Meniers: kidnapping.....	5846
Bergrivier Municipality: eviction of homeless from temporary shelter ...	3808
Better Living Challenge project.....	4178
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration.....	798
Vote 14: Local Government .....	912
Vote 7: Social Development.....	922
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....	935
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	1018
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	1030
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	4446
Vote 1: Premier.....	4511
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	4522
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	4532
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	4541
Vote 14: Local Government .....	4548
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	4557
Vote 7: Social Development.....	4568
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	4577
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	1818
Vote 6: Health .....	1870
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	1891
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	1895
Vote 14: Local Government .....	1908
Vote 5: Education .....	1936
Vote 7: Social Development.....	1976
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism.....	1991
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	2014
Vote 5: Education .....	3653
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	3516
Vote 14: Local Government .....	3525
Vote 7: Social Development.....	3553
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	3601
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3633
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3672
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	5071
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism.....	5087
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	5241
Vote 14: Local Government .....	5266
Vote 7: Social Development.....	5313
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	5337
Vote 5: Education .....	5365
Western Cape Laws Repeal Bill [B5 – 2019]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	2109

Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works.....	2893
Vote 6: Health .....	2906
Vote 14: Local Government.....	2938
Vote 7: Social Development .....	2948
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism .....	2975
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	2988
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3027
Capexit.....	3962
Cape Town informal settlements: lack of basic infrastructure .....	4276
City of Cape Town: tariffs increase .....	6015
Closing: First session, Sixth Parliament .....	1043
Closing: Second session, Sixth Parliament.....	3045
Condolence - motions	
Mabena, Bob .....	2081
Mafuneka, Cwenga.....	2308
Mandela, Zindzi .....	1696
Mohala, Emily .....	3864
Ntjuna, Kaunda .....	1762
Zenani, Osiphayo.....	2056
Williams, Leo .....	2157
Wingrove, Abraham .....	5458
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Newman, Catherine Dorothy.....	1766
Seale, Diane: Sister .....	5732
Springbok National Rugby Team .....	670
Covid-19: challenges faced by health facilities.....	1759
Covid-19: third wave response plan .....	3792
Crime: fighting .....	3792
Crime: rising level in townships .....	2580
Crime: scourge of.....	494
Delft: girl shot dead on Women’s Day .....	6052
Electricity tariff increases.....	4247
Entrenched and institutionalised racist culture .....	2131
Eerste River: attempted cash in transit heist.....	5605
Extended contracts: rules and policies.....	2131
Femicide and abuse against women and children .....	5786
Fires: Tygerberg Hospital and Mitchells Plain Day Hospital.....	499
Gender-based violence .....	4183
Gender-based violence and femicide: curbing of .....	2300
Gender-based violence and sexual assaults: DA double standards ....	5466
Gender-based violence: institutions of higher learning.....	5845
Homeless People shelters.....	5468
Household food basket: rising costs.....	5604
Housing crisis for the poor.....	1756
Informal settlement improvements .....	4274
Institutionalised racism in schools.....	2189
Jozi to Stellenbosch March: hire of private security companies .....	2137
Khaylithsha Art School and Rehabilitation Centre armed robbery.....	2083
Khayelitsha Police: conduct of .....	3804
Kraaifontein Informal Settlement: disaster relief .....	3915

Malibu High School: policy on African hair.....	421
Mass shooting: Khayelitsha Site C .....	5732
Matieland Post Office: refusing collection of social assistance grants ..	2589
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance	
of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our	
citizens and their families .....	4590
Matzikama Municipality: maladministration.....	3806
Minister Daylin Mitchell – ill advised remarks .....	4330
Mrewetyana, Uyinene: anniversary of murder .....	4250
Mrewetyana, Uyinene: in memoriam .....	2196
Nurses hired on short term contracts: COVID-19 .....	5603
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Police brutality against black people.....	2296
Public service workers: protest .....	4255
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2546
Qhina, Andiswa: missing person .....	3793
Qualification scandals.....	3807
Qualification screening: provincial executive .....	3806
Racist vacancy advert.....	2304
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 on its oversight and	
public participation activities undertaken during the period	
14 April to 24 November 2020.....	2854
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill	
[B6 – 2022] (NCOP) .....	5795
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue	
Second Amendment Bill [B24-2020] (NCOP)	
Consideration .....	3033
Report of the Conduct Committee dated 25 November 2020 .....	3043
Report of the Rules Committee on the parental leave for	
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental	
Affairs and Development Planning on the National	
Forests Amendment Bill .....	4495
Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural	
Affairs and Sport on the Customary Initiation Bill	
[B7B-2018] (NCOP)	
Consideration .....	3036
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic	
Opportunities and Tourism on the National Gambling	
Amendment Bill [B 27B – 2018] (NCOP).....	2111
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic	
Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations	
for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling	
and Racing Board (Consideration) .....	2330
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local	
Government Municipal Structures Amendment Bill	
[B19D 2018] (NCOP)	
Consideration .....	3041

Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Local Government: Municipal Systems Amendment Bill [B2D – 2019] Consideration .....	4493
Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on the Traditional Courts Bill [B1D-2017] Consideration.....	3038
Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Social Assistance Amendment Bill [B8B-2018] (NCOP) - (Consideration).....	2571
Safety Plan and high levels of crime .....	3911
Safety Plan: impact against escalating crime .....	2581
Sampson, Courtney: Reverend .....	3778
SAPS: Failure to assist .....	3919
Schools: mismanagement of school funds .....	4253
Schools: security fences .....	5786
Shelters for abused women and children .....	2192
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic.....	2273
Commemorating National Women’s Month.....	225
Statements .....	398, 486, 567, 651, 1290, 1301, 1331, 1686, 2039
.....	2124, 2184, 2287, 2574, 3784, 3904, 3950, 3990, 4164, 4263
.....	4313, 5442, 5587, 5719, 5762, 5833, 6031, 6088
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities.....	444
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	374
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods .....	3932
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities .....	5581
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government’s Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs .....	3977
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape.....	6071
Tafelberg case: reserved judgment.....	2205
Tshamese, Peter: sentencing.....	2301
UCT Geological Sciences translation project .....	2142
University of Cape Town: suspension of professor .....	5787
Unplaced learners .....	3792
Western Cape municipalities: audit outcomes.....	1694
Western Cape Safety Plan: impact on .....	2193
Western Cape schools: state of .....	3910
Women’s Day	6052
Women’s Month .....	6016
Zietsman, Reagan: conviction .....	2201

**MARAIS, P J**

Ad-Hoc Committee: Tuberculosis-related matters.....	6134
---	------

## Bills:

Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill  
(2021/22 Financial Year) [B1 – 2022]

Consideration of principle ..... 5058

## Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]

Consideration..... 812

Vote 5: Education ..... 903

Vote 14: Local Government ..... 913

Vote 4: Community Safety ..... 962

Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism..... 974

Vote 3: Provincial Treasury..... 981

Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports..... 992

Vote 8: Human Settlements ..... 1019

Consideration of votes and schedules ..... 1036

## Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]

Consideration of principle ..... 4460

Vote 1: Premier ..... 4512

Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport ..... 4522

Vote 11: Agriculture ..... 4532

Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development  
Planning ..... 4541

Vote 14: Local Government ..... 4548

Vote 10: Transport and Public Works ..... 4557

Vote 2: Provincial Parliament..... 4577

Vote 6: Health ..... 4661

Vote 8: Human Settlements ..... 4681

Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)  
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]

Consideration of principle ..... 1824

Vote 1: Premier ..... 1856

Vote 6: Health ..... 1871

Vote 11: Agriculture ..... 1884

Vote 4: Community Safety ..... 1961

Vote 7: Social Development..... 1978

Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism..... 1992

Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports..... 2004

Vote 3: Provincial Treasury..... 2013

Vote 8: Human Settlements ..... 2028

## Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]

Vote 10: Transport and Public Works ..... 3473

Vote 6: Health ..... 3488

Vote 11: Agriculture ..... 3504

Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .. 3517

Vote 14: Local Government ..... 3526

Vote 1: Premier ..... 3540

Vote 7: Social Development..... 3554

Vote 2: Provincial Parliament..... 3568

Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport ..... 3634

Vote 8: Human Settlements ..... 3673

Consideration of votes and schedules ..... 3683

Executive statement – response to ..... 3696

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5040
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	5070
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	5088
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	5106
Vote 6: Health .....	5188
Vote 1: Premier .....	5216
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	5400
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	5423
Consideration of votes and schedule .....	5434
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	2835
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	3001
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3016
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3027
Western Cape Biodiversity Bill [B2B – 2021]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	4483
Botha, Lorraine – motion of condolence .....	6129
Casidra: sustainability and efficacy of .....	1385
Chronic and other medicines: outsourcing of .....	2425
Closing: First session, Sixth Parliament .....	1044
Closing: Third session, Sixth Parliament .....	4690
Condolence - motions	
Williams, Chester .....	367, 414
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Covid-19 regulations: SMME's .....	1342
Covid-19: testing for diabetes .....	1697
Covid-19: third wave .....	3911, 3917
Covid-19 vaccinations: choice of vaccine .....	1342
Devolution of powers: multi-party task team .....	6146
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee – WCPPP seating allocation .....	5744
Dustbins: absence of .....	4048
Land invasions .....	2351
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our citizens and their families .....	4592
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5810
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5836
Members Lounge refreshments .....	6043
Metro Rail services: takeover .....	5594
Municipal Systems Amendment Bill .....	4318
Pie Act amendment .....	6094
Police stations: investigation task team .....	2353
Potchefstroom by-election: Freedom Front victory .....	495
Poverty eradication and alleviation .....	3805

## Premier:

Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2554
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	102, 1179, 3241, 4937
Rampant crime in the Western Cape .....	6093
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 on its oversight and public participation activities undertaken during the period 14 April to 24 November 2020 .....	2858
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B9 – 2020] (NCOP) .....	1838
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B3 – 2021] (NCOP) .....	3965
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B19 – 2021] (NCOP) .....	4607
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B6 – 2022] (NCOP) .....	5799
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Second Amendment Bill [B24-2020] (NCOP) Consideration .....	3034
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Upgrading of the Land Tenure Rights Amendment Bill [B6B-2020] Consideration .....	3811
Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on the Customary Initiation Bill [B7B-2018] (NCOP) Consideration .....	3036
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (Consideration) .....	2331
Sampson, Courtney: Reverend .....	3776

## Speaker:

Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic .....	2280
Commemorating National Women's Month .....	214
Women's Day, dignity and rights .....	4206
Statements .....	1293, 1305, 1335, 1379, 1565, 1691, 1754, 2043
.....	2128, 2187, 2291, 2348, 2413, 2578, 3787, 3854, 3955, 4036
.....	4077, 4265, 4316, 5444, 5590, 5721, 5770, 5836, 5879, 5948
.....	6005, 6035, 6091
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect .....	1412
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities .....	451
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	5979, 5995
Taking action against gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape .....	379

(li)

The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape .....	535
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa .....	5707
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods.....	3943
The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape .....	2400
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses .....	2176
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities .....	5578
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape.....	4064
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy .....	1514
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province .....	282
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape.....	3844
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape .....	6078
Urbanisation process: strategies .....	2580
Veary, Major General: dismissal .....	3963

## **MARRAN, P**

Africa Day.....	5793
Agricultural economy: transformation of.....	311
Albanie Farm: Lambertsbaai, evictions .....	2085
Anti-farm-attack demonstration .....	2324
Apartheid legacy of spatial development and structural racism.....	2298
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	889
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....	934
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	4529
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020].....	
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	1878
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	1891
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	3501
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	3514
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	5230
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	

Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	2928
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	2997
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	3420
Western Cape Biodiversity Bill [B2B – 2021]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	4482
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	5236
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	5396
Ceres: tensions in .....	2319
Colonial and apartheid statues: removal of.....	2299
Communicare Housing Agency .....	503
Condolences, Motions of:	
Africa, Keanno.....	3912
Davids, Duncan.....	2050
Fortuin, Cedric.....	3912
Hector, Jaydene .....	3912
Jooste, Lizzy .....	5780
Kriel, Alexander “Boetie” .....	2052
Levendal, John .....	2423
Makaleni, Philip .....	5778
Mzimba, Anton .....	6010
Rauss, Sue Ann .....	3912
Rossouw, Stefanus .....	2426
September, Marshall .....	5778
Van Wyk, Chris .....	172
Wanza, Geraldo .....	3912
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Du Toit, Ciska.....	3804
Du Toit, Gerhard: Dr .....	3804
Maritz, Margaret “Aunty Griet” – 113th birthday .....	566
Covid-19 acquisitions: probe into.....	2318
Covid-19: infections in factories and on farms .....	1452
Covid-19: procurement fraud .....	2355
Covid-19: TERS payments .....	2086
Covid-19: Witzenberg Area.....	2064
Crops: profits on export .....	3802
DA: evictions of the poor.....	4268
De Doorns: looting of freight trucks.....	679
Draft Resolutions:	
Human Settlements Department: failure of .....	2427
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker .....	2092
Easter celebration.....	5452
Evictions despite restrictions .....	2606
Farmworker: living conditions and evictions .....	6147
Hoogland Farm: liquidation.....	677
Joe Slovo: evictions .....	1543
Kleine Akker farm evictions .....	319
Land ownership and spatial legacy: skewed patterns of.....	166
Lobster catches for small scale fisheries .....	674

Local governments: inconsistencies and inequalities.....	4170
Molosi, Victor: anniversary of death .....	1770
Municipal account deductions from electricity purchases.....	4277
Municipalities: Eskom debts.....	6147
Municipalities: ongoing instability .....	5838
Nantes farm eviction case.....	6044
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
O'Grady, Raymond and Betty: attack on.....	2201
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	4923
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the National Environmental Management Laws.....	4609
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the National Forests Amendment Bill.....	4494
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Upgrading of the Land Tenure Rights Amendment Bill [B6B-2020] .....	3810
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the withdrawal of the declaration of the Driftsands Nature Reserve in terms of Section 24(1)(B) of the National Environmental Management: Protected Areas Act, 2003 (Act 57 of 2003) Dated 23 June 2022 .....	5960
Rising food prices: impact on the poor .....	5594
Rogue neighbourhood watch member .....	2197
Saldanha Bay Municipality: disappearance of confiscated Alcohol and cigarettes .....	2428
SAPS members: attacks on .....	2325
Secessionist-minded right wingers.....	2306
Service delivery: poor working class communities .....	5594
Statements     231, 489, 1378, 2574, 5944	
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect.....	1406
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa .....	5696
The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape .....	2400
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape.....	4067
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape.....	3846
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape .....	6080
Transport crisis: De Doorns Primary School .....	4273
Zama-Zamas: ongoing protests against.....	6039
Zeitz Museum: reopening.....	2606
<b>MASEKO, L M</b>	
Backyard dwellers .....	406

## Bills:

Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year [B4 – 2020] Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	2021
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021] Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	4557
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	4682
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021] Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3674
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020] Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3028
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021] Consideration of votes and schedule Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3419
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022] Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	5339

## Condolences, Motions of:

Ajam, Shahied .....	1570
April, Wayne Donovan .....	172
Dyasi, Nontsikelelo .....	1573
Matthews, Chantelle .....	1764
Mercur, Neil .....	4320
Nagia, Anwah, Dr .....	2595
Opperman, Moira .....	176
Willemse, Juanita .....	2365

## Congratulations / Wishes:

Department of Human Settlements .....	417
Members and officials of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament .....	4434
Scott, Kiara .....	5882
Steyn, Antoinette .....	4321
Sykes, Lulu Lena .....	1322
Viljoen: Bessie .....	3861
Council of the City of Cape Town .....	6041
District Six: restitution projects .....	3859
Drakenstein Municipality: borehole and BMX track .....	5881
Forest Village: disruption of housing handover .....	1718
Forest Village: handover of houses .....	1478
Housing projects: delays .....	6146
Illegal land invasions .....	3860
Informal Settlements Upgrading Partnership Grant .....	4323
Lockdown period: illegal land invasions .....	1336
Lockdown: social housing projects .....	1392
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143): The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5834
Past injustices: redress of .....	2063, 2149
Premier: State of the Province Address - Debate .....	3243
Provincial housing projects in Eerste River: destruction of property .....	1583

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the 2019/20 Annual Reports of the 12 departments of the Western Cape Government including their public entities .....	3815
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic.....	2278
Commemorating National Women's Month.....	217
Statements.....297, 484, 567, 651, 1299, 1446, 1559, 1754, 2128, 2343 .....	3904, 3991, 4164, 4312, 5445, 5723, 5834, 5947. 6088
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect.....	1413
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa .....	5696
The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape .....	2398
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape.....	4060
Swellendam Railton Project .....	6042
Title deeds: impact of .....	3910

## **MAYNIER, D J**

### **Bills:**

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2020]	
Introduction and first reading.....	1241
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill (2021/22 Financial Year) [B1 – 2022]	
Introduction and first reading.....	5001
Finalisation .....	5060
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Introduction and first reading.....	767
Consideration .....	785, 819
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	968, 974
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	976, 982
Finalisation .....	1039
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle.....	4439, 4471
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	4623, 4629
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism .....	4631, 4639
Finalisation .....	4688
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2020]	
Introduction and first reading.....	1224
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Introduction and first reading.....	1740
Consideration of principle.....	1807, 1831
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism .....	1983, 1993
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	2006, 2015

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Introduction and first reading .....	3368
Consideration of principle .....	3429, 3447
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	3595, 3605
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism.....	3607, 3622
Finalisation.....	3691
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Introduction and first reading .....	4986
Consideration of principle .....	5022,
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	5063, 5078
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism.....	5079, 5095
Finalisation.....	5435
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Introduction and first reading .....	2664
Consideration of principle .....	2818, 2846
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism.....	2975, 2983
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	2985, 2996
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021] .....	
Introduction and first reading .....	3368
Consideration of principle .....	3397, 3406
Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B1-2020]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	3870
Municipal Economic Review and Outlook.....	511, 2510, 4397
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	77
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook .....	511, 2510, 4348
Statements, response to.....	4081, 5592, 6005, 6036
Subject for discussion:	
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers.....	5991
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods.....	3933
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses.....	2177
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy.....	1509
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province .....	289
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty.....	6164

**MBOMBO, N**

## Bills:

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]

Vote 6: Health .....	866, 875
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 6: Health .....	4654, 4667
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	1807
Vote 6: Health .....	1863, 1872
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 6: Health .....	3479, 3491
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 6: Health .....	5171, 5192
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 6: Health .....	2900, 2910
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance	
of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our	
citizens and their families.....	4585
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation	
on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5822
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	1190, 3219, 4915
Statements, response to .....	1380, 5880
Subject for discussion:	
Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a	
world-class health system.....	4293
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure	
Livelihoods.....	3927
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the	
safety, health and wellbeing of communities.....	5579
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time	
Preserving livelihoods in the economy.....	1502
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the	
front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy	
uncertainty and political positioning at a national level	
on the Western Cape Province .....	283

**MEYER, I H****Bills:**

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	878, 892
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	4528, 4538
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020] .....	
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	1876, 1884
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	3492, 3508
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 11: Agriculture.....	5385, 5407
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	

Vote 11: Agriculture .....	2997, 3007
Bredell, Anton: breach of Executive Members Ethics Code.....	3461
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger.....	5830
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2543, 3225
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	111, 1171, 4893
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 on its oversight and public participation activities undertaken during the period 14 April to 24 November 2020.....	2961
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Women's Day, dignity and rights .....	4211
Subject for discussion:	
The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape .....	530
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government's Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs 3980	
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape.....	4057

**MITCHELL, D G**

Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration.....	808
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	851
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	4553, 4560
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	1919
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	3473
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	5276, 5294
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	2894
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	3423
Africa, Kenny: retirement .....	1776
Condolences, Motions of:	

Maritz, Bradley .....	175
Oliver, Monty .....	3796
Pretorius, Estienne .....	193
Smith, Willis .....	2598
Swartland, Maxwell .....	182
Congratulatory / Wishes:	
Erasmus, Gideon .....	1316
Ntombana, Mr: head nurse of Beaufort West Hospital .....	2214
Van Staden, Roelof Erasmus .....	314
Covid-19: Western Cape Provincial Parliament: virtual proceedings ...	1348
Louw, Quintin, Deputy Mayor: Beaufort West Municipality .....	1351
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Public Rail Transportation, state of .....	239
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	105, 3239, 4942
Report of the Conduct Committee dated 25 November 2020 .....	3043
Report of the Conduct Committee on the failure of hon member G Brinkhuis to submit disclosure forms timeously .....	2389
Report of the Conduct Committee on the failure of hon members N Makamba-Botya and M F to submit disclosure forms timeously .....	1040
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the National Environmental Management Laws .....	4609
Report of the Rules Committee on the review of rules .....	3577
Statements .....	225, 295, 1291, 1377, 1749, 3783, 3851, 4042, 6144
Statements, response to .....	5592
Subject for discussion:	
Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a world-class health system .....	4302
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses .....	2183
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities .....	5576
Trains, rail infrastructure and safety of commuters .....	2416
Truck drivers: violent attacks on .....	404

### **MNQASELA, M [SPEAKER with effect from 22/05/2019]**

Acceptance speech .....	6
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019] Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	1026, 1031
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021] Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	4572, 4579
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020] Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	2952, 2961
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021] Vote 2: Provincial Parliament .....	3562, 3572

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	5414, 5425
Code of Conduct: Finding - Hon Member S N August .....	6060
Speaker:	
Debates of.....	214
Commemorating National Women’s Month .....	200
Women’s Day, dignity and rights .....	4195
Election of Speaker.....	5
Guidance:	
Rule 65.....	337
Virtual sittings.....	1373, 1437, 1494, 1558, 1683, 1804
Rulings of 325, 483, 1438, 1496, 3782, 3926, 6027	

**MURRAY, C A T**

Investment Readiness Accelerator Programme .....	6152
Kirstenbosch National Botanical Garden .....	6055
Statements .....	6093
Subject for discussion:	
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape .....	6068
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty .....	6164
Truworthis: new distribution centre .....	6153

**MVIMBI, L L**

Annual Report contributions .....	662
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration.....	793
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	854
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	4555
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill) (2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	1917
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	3470
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	5283
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	2891
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism.....	2978
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury.....	2987
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	3422
Breede Valley Municipality: tarring of roads.....	2071
Bus accident: George .....	5791
Condolences, Motions of:	
Bloch, Graeme .....	3796

Cannoo, Brenden.....	2091
Jansen, Mark .....	1710
Sampson, Deon .....	2065
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Archbishop Emeritus Desmond Tutu and Leah Tutu .....	2382
Berman, Janneke.....	2068
Fourie, Caitlin.....	4321
Garden Route International Film Festival .....	5953
Mancha Mabuso .....	4321
Sade Magabotha .....	4321
Treu, Paul .....	2089
Franchinah Ratsmina.....	4321
Springboks: Castle Lager Incoming Series.....	5953
Cape Town parking charge system.....	681
CCTV at rail stations .....	504
Covid-19: high electricity and water bills .....	1569
Crime i-n the province .....	585
Drug trafficking: female bus passenger.....	2367
Go George and MyCiti Projects: challenges.....	169
Golden Arrow buses: burning of.....	2155
Human Settlements: expenditure on safeguarding property .....	2088
Intercape drivers' shootings .....	6101
Madikizela, Minister: unscientific utterances .....	1383
Metrorail: derailment .....	506
MyCiti N2 Express Service.....	429
National Transport Minister: extension of grace period for renewal of driver's and car licences .....	4272
Nyanga: ongoing tax unrest .....	6148
Nyanga: taxi drivers – unrest .....	6147
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
PPE: pre-approved contracts .....	2356
Plettenberg Bay Worker: attempted murder charge .....	2200
Provincial Executive: capture by property developers.....	5839
Rail transport commuter safety .....	345
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B3 – 2020] (NCOP).....	1487
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B9 – 2020] (NCOP).....	1836
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B6 – 2022] (NCOP).....	5795
Report of the Public Accounts Committee, having considered the 2020/21 Annual Reports of the 13 departments, including their Entities, of the Western Cape Government as part of its Oversight role .....	5471
Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the 2019/20 Annual Reports of the 12 departments of the Western Cape Government including their public entities .....	3814
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism and the COVID-19 Temporary Employer/Employee Relief Scheme (TERS), funding process undertaken by the Unemployment Insurance Fund, and the	

Response/views of the public in the Western Cape on this Process	5298
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the National Gambling Amendment Bill [B 27B – 2018] (NCOP)	2110
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (Consideration)	2329
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill Consideration	3808
Road Accidents: provincial strategy	2599
Road fatalities and accidents	582
Road fatalities: long weekend	2069
Road safety: festive season	4435
Road users: annual carnage	2582
Rural towns: improved mobility	5839
R44 and R101 crossing: probe into safety of	2362
SANDF: Deployment of in the Cape Flats	504
State Capture: Commission	318
State or public land: audit	4181
Statements	232, 650, 2124, 2286, 4165, 5589, 6142
Subject for discussion:	
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers	5979
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses	2174
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape	4062
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province	270
The status of municipalities in the Western Cape	6062
Taxi industry: killings	4043
Traffic officers: attacks on	577
Transport hostilities: role players	4174
Ward 5 By-election	322
Western Cape: ongoing corruption	5840
Youth unemployment	5447
<b>NKONDLO, N D</b>	
Alcohol restrictions: demands by traders	4043
Arcelormittal: loss of jobs	1475

## Bills:

Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill (2021/22 Financial Year) [B1 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5058
Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration .....	805
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	969
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	977
Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	4441
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	4625
Vote 12: Economic Opportunities and Tourism .....	4633
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	2009
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	3598
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	3612
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5046
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	5062
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	5083
Consideration of votes and schedule .....	5432
Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B1-2020]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	3870
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	2839
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 3: Provincial Treasury .....	3410
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism .....	3424
Black wine producers .....	2225
Condolences, Motions of:	
Dukani, Jeannie .....	195
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Gauteng Provincial Government .....	5459
Sophi, Siyabulela .....	6098
South African Women Lawyers Association's Western Cape Branch .....	5884
TP Nala Pisce .....	6154
Covid-19: budget adjustments .....	1314
Covid-19: cluster transmissions in the retail and agriculture sector .....	1540
Covid-19: curb of infections in work spaces .....	1574
Covid-19: economic recovery .....	1573, 2229
Covid-19: impact on the hotel industry .....	2148
Covid-19 initiatives: financial management of .....	2357
Covid-19: UIF benefits .....	1387
Covid-19: impact on local and regional economies .....	1569, 1768
Covid-19: infection rates in the retail sector .....	1314
Covid-19: Khayelitsha sub-district .....	2227

Covid-19: local response teams .....	1474
Covid-19: PPE procurement: price hikes .....	1452
Covid-19: safety of workers .....	1477
Covid-19: socio-economic conditions in hotspots .....	1530
Covid-19: socio-economic impact of .....	1400
Covid-19: vulnerable workers .....	1571
BBBEE status level of suppliers - Department of Health .....	167
Big banks planned shutdown .....	576
Cape Flats: economic situation .....	347
Department of Labour: UIF-TERS investigations .....	3865
Fire fighters: exploitation of .....	586
GDP Quarter 2: Stats SA .....	2388
Grand Parade: informal traders .....	1542
Income equality in the Western Cape .....	1468
Informal traders in townships .....	1401
Krotoa: commemoration .....	583
Labour Force Survey – Quarter 2 results .....	249
Maimani, Mmusi - house .....	505
Mid-term budget estimates .....	2224
Money bills amendment procedure .....	2357
National Minimum Wage Act .....	259
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2561
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	81, 1196, 4945
Provincial Cabinet: shortage of women .....	4002
Report of the Budget Committee on The Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B15-2019](NCOP) ( Ratification of Final Mandate) .....	938
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B3 – 2021] (NCOP) .....	3964
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B19 – 2021 (NCOP) .....	4606
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (9 September 2021) .....	4497
Simons, Ray Alexander .....	431
Small towns: marketing to investors .....	4083
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Women’s Day, dignity and rights .....	4209
Statements .....	339, 397, 1288, 3990, 4163, 6000
Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities .....	442
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will	

result in many more job losses .....	2179
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government's Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs .....	3983
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy .....	1501, 1505
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty .....	6159
Township economy .....	4246
Truck attacks: impact of .....	427
UIF-TERS: non-cooperating companies .....	3869
Unaffordable utility costs .....	4326
USDG Grant: under expenditure .....	2154
Water tariffs: reviewing of .....	2379
Women-owned businesses .....	6099
<b>PLATO, D</b>	
Ashgar, Shanawaaz: kidnapping .....	6104
Bills:	
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5040
Vote 7: Social Development .....	5315
Statements .....	5587, 5760, 5879, 6000, 6087
SASSA: Khayelitsha branch .....	6102
Subject for discussion:	
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	6000
The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities .....	5568, 5584
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty .....	6169
Women's month and gender-based violence .....	6013
<b>SAYED, M K</b>	
Africa, Kenny: retirement .....	311
African Union Commission: observer status granted to Israel .....	4179
ANC: lifestyle audits .....	2153
ANC Youth League: 75th Anniversary .....	418
Apartheid-era school names .....	406
Attack on Muslim woman .....	2432
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 5: Education .....	899
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 5: Education .....	4645
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Vote 5: Education .....	1931
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	3440

Vote 5: Education .....	3650
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 5: Education .....	5360
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 5: Education .....	2916
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 5: Education .....	3412
Bloekombos High School Principal .....	4330
Bloekombos High School: vandalism.....	1591
Body discovered in wheelie bin .....	6017
Bo-Kaap: gentrification .....	2064
Bo-Kaap: Nuisance by-laws.....	2216
Brooklands Primary School: Northpine .....	2445
Challenges to equality in education .....	2601
Cloetesville and Kylemore High Schools: disciplinary punishments .....	6157
Closing: First session, Sixth Parliament.....	1043
Closing: Second session, Sixth Parliament .....	3044
Condolences, Motions of:	
Adam, Faizel .....	1595
Ajam, Shahied .....	1577
Haron, Galiema .....	585
Lukas, Agnes .....	5780
MacCollen, Jack.....	2082
Malgas, Charles .....	1592
Maphatsoe, Kebby .....	4320
Maya, Sive .....	1592
Mkhalali, Ms .....	1592
Moerane, Mpho .....	5780
Mowzer, Mohamed Shukoor .....	5884
Mtwisha, Zola .....	1592
Mini, Clarence: Dr.....	1347
Sampson, Deon .....	2052
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Ahlul-Bat Foundation and Gift of the Givers .....	2374
Banton, Gallie.....	1575
Bantom, Ronald .....	1575
Cameron, Edward .....	581
D F Malan High School .....	3960
Gili, Andile .....	6017
Maponopono, Naledi .....	6011
Nogcinisa, Noluthando .....	1390
Oliver Tambo and Yusuf Dadoo Trust.....	5794
Sass, Chevellee .....	6054
Schreuder, Brian .....	2091
World Children's Prize Ceremony .....	5842
Yisa, Nduli Khanyiso .....	6017
Covid 19: closure of schools due to .....	1705
Covid-19: community-based NGO's, food donations .....	1555
Covid-19: educational facilities: health safety measures .....	1352
Covid-19: decontamination of school buildings.....	1593, 1757, 1783

Covid-19: educators .....	1700
Covid-19: Fairmont High School .....	1591
Covid-19: gradual reopening of schools .....	1483
Covid-19 infections: schools.....	1590
Covid-19: last minute deliveries to schools .....	1451
Covid-19: Nomzamo Primary School – decontamination .....	1538
Covid-19: Northpine Technical High School.....	2081
Covid-19: principal of Settlers High School .....	1534
Covid-19: quarantine centres .....	1355
Covid-19: safety of learners and teachers using bus transport .....	1554
Covid-19: shortage of sanitation and protective gear .....	1545
Covid-19: tender looting .....	2090
Covid-19: Western Cape Education Department .....	1469
Crawford: new cell phone tower .....	2443
Curro Private School Hermanus: bullying .....	2438
DA: double standards.....	2299
DA Leadership .....	4268
DA: qualification scandals .....	3791
Democratic Alliance – capture by private property developers.....	5740
Departmental circulation letters: Western Cape Schools .....	1784
Diaz Primary School: replacement school.....	312
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee – WCPP seating allocation.....	5743
Education Department head: contract.....	2385
Education Disaster warning.....	4043
Education: Head of Department: extension of employment .....	2421
Education: inequality .....	2421
Education Minister: Debbie Schäfer: victimisation of whistle-blower ....	4278
Elim Primary School learners: transport.....	3916
Emil Weder Secondary School: transport .....	1706
Equal Education Law Centre.....	5736
Franklin United Reformed Church Primary School.....	2322
Gaza Strip: bombardment by the State of Israel .....	6046
Gender-based violence: schools speaking out.....	1594
German International School: alleged racist remarks by teacher .....	4046
Hague Primary School: rape of learners .....	684
Hangberg evictions .....	2386
Haron, Imam Abdullah .....	428
Heathfield High School: Principal .....	5848
Imam Abdullah Haron: reopening of inquest into death .....	5849
Inequality between poor and wealthy schools .....	1529
Inkanini Primary School: Khayelitsha .....	2441
Iris Qwela Primary School: learner transport.....	4247
Israel and the Western Cape Government – ties .....	5735
Issel, John James (Late): commemoration.....	2086
Kwafaku School: experimental building.....	348
Learner transport challenges.....	5601
Learners: rape and sexual harassment of .....	178
Learners: unplaced .....	178, 5602
Lockdown: burglary and vandalism at schools .....	1481
Luleka Primary School – closure due to Covid-19.....	1595

Malibu High School: policy on African hair.....	409
March on the Union Buildings: 1956.....	2084
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation	
on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger.....	5835
Matriculants: shortage of teachers.....	2088
Matric exams .....	2443
Matric pass rates .....	345
Missing 3-year old boy: Hout Bay .....	2140
Model C schools: culture of racism .....	5598
Mondale High School: Mitchells Plain.....	5602
Moorreesburg: learner transport challenges .....	5737
Muslim Judicial Council: gender equality guidelines.....	2134
National Women's Day .....	2062
Neumann, Wesley, Principal.....	5790
Northpine School Karaoke event .....	681
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Oliver Tambo and Yusuf Dadoo Trust .....	5794
Philippi East attacks: arrest of suspects .....	1717
PPE procurement: call for SIU probe.....	2135
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	116, 3247
Quintas, Roberto: incorrect statement.....	1402
Racism at De Bron Primary School: Stanford.....	665
Red Cross War Memorial Children's Hospital.....	2441
Red Dot Taxi transport service .....	2372
Redelingshuys community – amalgamation of schools .....	567
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill	
[B6 – 2022] (NCOP) .....	5799
Schools built with inappropriate material .....	1482
Schools: bullying.....	4175, 5470
Schools: dealing with positive COVID-19 cases .....	4275
School infrastructure and backlog .....	310
Schools in the Cape Winelands: security.....	2228
Schools: conferences and workshops requiring payment.....	4248
Schools: overcrowding.....	4049
Schools: protective supplies .....	1484
Schools: protective supplies and equipment.....	1486
Schools: racism and racial profiling .....	2070
Schools: racial and class exclusion .....	561
Schools: return to.....	2319
Schools: spread of coronavirus .....	1568
Schools: storm damage .....	1701
Schools: unplaced learners .....	674
Schools: violence at.....	350
Schreuder, Brian: extension of appointment.....	2135, 2226
Schreuder, Brian: reappointment.....	2316
Small bus operators: strike .....	355
Smallholder Farmer Development Programme participants .....	4271
Speaker of the Western Cape Legislature .....	5853
SRC campus elections .....	578

Statements .....	304, 555, 1376, 1523, 1685, 2039, 2186, 2408, 4037
.....	4075, 4238, 5720, 5761, 6034
Stephen Road Primary School: Grassy Park .....	4249
Sustainable Bo-Kaap .....	2431
Uniform rules, bullies and delinquents – Western Cape Schools .....	4170
Unplaced learners: 2023 academic year .....	5854
WCPP Presiding Officers: allegations against.....	6039
Wesgro: resignation of Chairperson.....	1786
Wesgro trade missions.....	4175
Westerford School: sanction against prefect.....	358
Western Cape Commissioner of Children .....	3918
Western Cape Education Department: lack of ability to enrol learners	1337
Western Cape Department of Education: unplaced learners .....	1353
Western Cape Schools: service levels .....	1450
Windsor High School: spirit of ubuntu .....	2387
Witsand: Temporary School.....	2436
Zwaanswyk High School: charges of gross mismanagement .....	4328

### **SCHÄFER, B A [DEPUTY SPEAKER WITH EFFECT FROM 22/05/2019]**

Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Acceptance speech.....	8
Election of Deputy Speaker.....	7
Guidance:	
Virtual sittings .....	1683, 1737, 2267, 2342, 2392
Rulings of .....	324, 1496, 2342, 2449, 3019, 4605, 4953, 5474, 6086
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic.....	2268
Commemorating National Women's Month.....	210
Women's Day, dignity and rights.....	4195

### **SCHÄFER, D A**

Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 5: Education .....	894, 903
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle.....	4448
Vote 5: Education .....	4641, 4650
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle.....	1825
Vote 5: Education .....	1928, 1937
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 5: Education .....	3642, 3658
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle.....	5029
Vote 5: Education .....	5353, 5376
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 5: Education .....	2913, 2922
Bredell, Anton: breach of Executive Members Ethics Code .....	3458

Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	119, 3251
Statements, response to .....	306, 1692, 2129, 3994, 4078, 4168
.....	4243, 5723
Subject for discussion:	
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy .....	1515

**SILEKU, I M**

Subject for discussion:	
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities .....	464

**SIMMERS, T A**

Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	995, 1019
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	4672, 4685
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020] .....	1740
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	2016, 2029
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3661, 3677
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5043
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	5324, 5346
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	3020, 3030
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of principle .....	3404
Closing: Second session, Sixth Parliament .....	3046
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	97
Statements, response to .....	153, 492, 2044, 2349
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect .....	1407
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa .....	5696
The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape .....	2403
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape .....	4068
The status of local municipalities in the Western Cape .....	3834

**SMITH, D**

Athlone fires .....	679
---------------------	-----

Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 14: Local Government.....	910
By-elections: Knysna and Beaufort West .....	3800
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020] .....	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	1896
Vote 14: Local Government.....	1902
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 14: Local Government.....	3524
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 14: Local Government.....	2937
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 14: Local Government.....	3427
Bredell, Anton: Minister – abandoning the DA.....	2434
Bredell, Anton MEC: gamesmanship by Local Government.....	1779
Bredell, Anton Minister: ill treatment of Cederberg and Matzikama	
Mayors .....	2422
Cape Town official: tender scam .....	2385
Cederberg: illegal election of Speaker .....	238
City of Cape Town: irregularities .....	250
City of Cape Town: selling off inner city land.....	506
City of Cape Town: water and sanitation budget.....	582
Condolences, Motions of:	
Delpont, Neville .....	195
Meyer, Piet.....	2223
Mpiko, Thulani .....	313
Congratulations / Wishes – Motions:	
ANC - Ward 95 By-election victory .....	322
Councillors: threats against.....	2074
Covid-19: learners without face masks .....	1703
DA: decline in the province.....	668
DA: double standards.....	2415
DA: funding for the coming elections.....	1551
DA: implosion of .....	495
DA leaders jumping ship .....	2301
DA: Local Government – leaders of colour .....	2315
DA: retrenchments .....	424
DA: Southern Cape .....	1343
Dam levels: high price of water .....	412
Drakenstein Municipality: state of financial affairs.....	242
Emergency staff: ongoing attacks on .....	2584
Fire fighters protest .....	501
George Municipal Manager .....	497
George Municipality: investigation.....	405
Homeless people: fines.....	684
Informal settlements: fire hazards .....	2323
Informal settlement upgrades: roll-over of unspent funds .....	580
Kannaland Officials: NPA action against.....	2083
Knysna Mayor: Mark Willemse.....	569

Knysna Municipality: resignation of officials.....	1536
Langeberg Councillor: Nicklaas Beginsel .....	1548
Local governments: destabilising of.....	1775
Masiphumelele fire: displaced residents .....	192
Meyer, Ivan (Junior): appointment .....	2219
Motion of no confidence: DA Deputy Mayor and Speaker, Matzikama ...	182
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Plato, Dan: Mayor–eviction of informal residents during lockdown .....	2217
Poor service delivery: regular protests.....	563
Premier:	
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	1181, 3229
Protests: Dunoon and Darling.....	574
Qolani, Bulelani: legal victory.....	2222
Rainfall: full dams .....	2322
Saldanha Bay: vehicle accident.....	2206
Statements .....	160, 296, 484, 1300, 2289
Subject for discussion:	
The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape .....	524
The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape.....	2392
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province .....	286
Water and electricity – high cost of .....	311
Water systems: poor state of .....	168
Whitehead, Melissa: guilty finding.....	316

## **VAN DER WESTHUIZEN, A P**

Audit report: Department of Agriculture .....	1577
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	883
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....	929
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	4533
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	4541
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21) Financial Year) [B4 – 2020].....	
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	1880
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	1892
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	3517
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5038
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	5242
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	5401
Western Cape Land Use Planning Amendment Bill [B6 – 2020]	
Consideration and finalisation.....	3873
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	

Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	2931
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	3002
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	3421
Western Cape Biodiversity Bill [B2B – 2021]	
Consideration and finalisation .....	4484
Bitou Municipal Council: court ruling .....	247
City Nature Challenge Competition .....	5779
Condolences, Motions of:	
Dunn, Jane Dowie .....	2200
Fritz, Marie .....	1706
Pistorius, Hendrik .....	6013
Strydom, Miemie .....	1770
Congratulations / Wishes:	
City of Cape Town .....	3912
Cloete, Ivan .....	3798
Department of Agriculture .....	4046
Jacobs, Kelly-Marie .....	316
The Rooibos Council .....	4046
Western Cape Department of Agriculture .....	5728
South African Rooibos Council .....	4319
CapeNature Cubs Club .....	5889
Clanwilliam Dam wall: raising of .....	310
Climate Change 2021: United Nations Report .....	4245
Covid-19: Agricultural sector – food relief .....	1353
Covid-19: impact on food security .....	1382
Covid-19: liquor ban impact on the wine industry .....	1382
Covid-19: Witzenberg Municipal Area – successes .....	1543
Deciduous fruit farmers .....	4433
Drought: ongoing impact of .....	2417
Flora and fauna poaching .....	5725
Liquor ban: effect on the wine and agriculture industry .....	2046
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Ongoing drought .....	346
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5824
Redelingshuys Farm and Neighbourhood Watch .....	1778
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 on its oversight and public participation activities undertaken during the period 14 April to 24 November 2020 .....	2859
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the National Environmental Management Laws .....	4609
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the National Forests Amendment Bill .....	4494
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Upgrading of the Land Tenure Rights Amendment Bill [B6B-2020]	

Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the withdrawal of the declaration of the Driftsands Nature Reserve in terms of Section 24(1)(B) of the National Environmental Management: Protected Areas Act, 2003 (Act 57 of 2003) Dated 23 June 2022 .....	5961
Statements ..... 162, 344, 554, 1304, 1379, 1564, 2040, 2289, 2413, ..... 3854, 3949, 4036, 4166, 4315, 5718, 5837, 5943, 6030	
Subject for discussion:	
Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice and three democratic decades of neglect .....	1411
Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities .....	453
Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	5985
The importance of the amendment to Section 25 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the introduction of the Expropriation Bill and how helpful these will be in addressing the patterns of land ownership in the Western Cape .....	4064
Traffic police: innovative use of technology .....	178
Water-infrastructure theft and vandalism .....	5882
Wine sales ban: impact of.....	1758
World Oceans Day.....	1578

**WENGER, M M**

ANC interim Provincial Committee.....	323
Ascension Day 1390	
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Consideration.....	808
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	1029
Consideration of votes and schedules .....	1038
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 1: Premier .....	4513
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	4577
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	3569
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5049
Vote 6: Health .....	5189
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	5423
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	2957
Food Angels: Westlake .....	1347
Governance: accountability and transparency .....	3790
House, Business of – Motions .....	199, 268, 364, 438, 523, 649, 767, 785
..... 1128, 1253, 1255, 1285, 1286, 1375, 1500, 1806, 2160, 2268	
..... 2392, 2518, 2519, 2663, 3396, 3828, 3927, 3971, 4054, 4220	
..... 4291, 4292, 4396, 4505, 4884, 5022, 5568, 5695	
Condolences, Motions of:	
Adams, Romeo .....	565

Nkabinde, Jabu .....	199
Mandela, Zindzi .....	1697
Schilder, Cederic .....	2428
Winde, William David .....	121
Congratulatory / Wishes:	
Blockhouse Kitchen and Jonkershuis Feeding Scheme .....	1346
Breda, Charles .....	4319
Erich, Pippa .....	
Foster, Craig .....	3794
Hart, Ulvard .....	420
Purchase, Felicity .....	4322
Reed, James	
Rice, Kenny .....	420
Selfe, James MP .....	4436
Rice, Sean .....	420
Covid-19 lockdown: ANC official visit to Zimbabwe .....	2431
Covid-19: mismanagement of the pandemic by the ANC .....	1336
Covid-19: victims in the Western Cape .....	1315
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker .....	2094
Ad-hoc Committee – WCPP seating allocation .....	5743
Fia’s Formula-E 2021/22 Season .....	4176
Masiphumelele fire .....	179
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our citizens and their families .....	4582
Murders in the province .....	190
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2545
State of the Province Address - Debate .....	128, 4934
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook .....	6190
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 dated 6 May 2022 .....	5746
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 on its oversight and public participation activities undertaken during the period 14 April to 24 November 2020 .....	2849, 2864
Report of the Rules Committee on the parental leave for Parliamentarians, dated 2 December 2019 .....	1042
Report of the Rules Committee on the Presiding Officers’ Manual .....	4612
Sampson, Courtney: Reverend .....	3776
South Africa: unravelling of .....	237
Statements .....	305, 486, 555, 4077
Subject for discussion:	
The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses .....	2170
The impact on the Western Cape of the National Government’s	

Failure to keep the lights on, to keep us safe and to keep us in jobs.....	3975
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy.....	1507
The rapid unravelling of South Africa, as published on the front page of the Financial Mail; and the effect of policy uncertainty and political positioning at a national level on the Western Cape Province.....	268
Wesgro trade missions .....	4175
Western Cape: post Covid-19.....	1306

**WINDE, A R [PREMIER with effect from 22/05/2019]**

Acceptance speech .....	4
Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done .....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2564
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 1: Premier.....	829, 839
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 1: Premier.....	4505, 4515
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Vote 1: Premier.....	1844
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 1: Premier.....	3532, 3543
Executive statement .....	3692
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 1: Premier.....	5201, 5221
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 1: Premier.....	2871, 2882
Election of Premier .....	4
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our citizens and their families .....	4599
Sampson, Courtney: Reverend .....	3776
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Commemorating National Women’s Month .....	207
State of the Province Address .....	39, 1107, 3118, 4745
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	59, 4884
State of the Province Address - Reply to Debate .....	132, 1207, 3260, 4956
Statements, response to.....	235, 558, 4038, 5591
Subject for discussion:	
The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape.....	2392
The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape.....	537
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and	

to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future ..... 4233

**WINDVOGEL, R**

Ad-Hoc Committee: Tuberculosis-related matters.....	6135
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019]	
Vote 6: Health .....	871
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2021]	
Vote 6: Health .....	4659
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020].....	
Vote 6: Health .....	1866
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 6: Health .....	3486
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Vote 6: Health .....	5183
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Vote 6: Health .....	2904
Western Cape Third Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2021]	
Consideration of votes and schedule	
Vote 6: Health .....	3414
Bakubaku-Vos, Ntombezanele.....	1317, 1393
Barrydale: gender-based violence.....	1781
Buffelsjags: shooting of bystander .....	675
Care Company.....	1345
City of Cape Town: property rates.....	352
Claassen, Jacob: sentencing for fraud .....	2384
Cloetesville Primary: Solar Panel System .....	6100
Condolences, Motions of:	
Blom, Freddie .....	2214
Dowie, Dexter .....	5597
Gabier, Abdulhamied: Sheikh .....	5453
Julies, Magdalena.....	1478
Kambi, Nandipha .....	1478
Kepskey, Anncha.....	1391
Maritz, Bradley.....	175
Williams, Leo .....	2142
Xaba, Khaya .....	4088
Congratulations / Wishes:	
Cottee, Delmaine .....	6151
Mackenzie, Tayden.....	5727
Suliman, Tasnim .....	1345
Vredendal firefighters.....	5885
Wann, Mike.....	2447
Covid 19: cases.....	1579
Covid 19: deaths .....	2381
Covid-19 infections: youths .....	1581
Covid 19: closure of hospitals .....	1480

Covid-19: Cuban medical professionals .....	1346
Covid-19: devastation at Panorama Palms Retirement Resort.....	1550
Covid-19: fifth wave .....	5738
Covid-19: flare up areas .....	4091
Covid-19: frontline workers .....	1337
Covid-19: health officers and emergency staff.....	2072
Covid-19: health workers and their families .....	4173
Covid-19: herd immunity.....	2583
Covid-19: infections and mortalities .....	1451
Covid-19: infections and spread .....	4083
Covid-19: overload of hospitals .....	1399
Covid-19 pandemic: National Government.....	4089
Covid-19: preventative actions .....	2151
Covid-19: Proposed advertisement – motion.....	4269
Covid-19: readiness of the Western Cape .....	1580
Covid-19: rise of infections in the Western Cape.....	1482
Covid-19: schools and the third wave .....	3920
Covid-19: statistics.....	2057
Covid-19: vaccinations.....	3863
Covid-19: victims .....	1396
Covid-19: Western Cape death rate .....	1381
Covid-19: Western Cape handling of outbreak .....	1381
Cuban medical group: untested allegations of remuneration.....	1781
DA: double standards: Cuban Professionals .....	1760
DA: infighting and factionalism .....	5776
Day hospital: incorrect prescription, consequence of.....	180
Disaster season: readiness .....	3921
Draft Resolutions:	
Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker .....	2095
Emergency workers: body cameras.....	1706
G F Jooste Hospital: rebuilding of.....	6095
Gender-based violence: victims.....	424
Gift of the Givers: contribution to Mitchells Plain Hospital.....	2370
Health: state of .....	170
Helen Zille: investigation into lie .....	2152
Hospitals: plans to change to day clinics .....	562
Hospitals: severe shortage of beds.....	6048
International Nurses Day .....	1348, 5741
Lockdown restrictions .....	1319
Mandela Day Celebrations .....	5953
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The development of the Covid-19 pandemic and the importance of vaccinations in the fourth wave of Covid-19 to protect our citizens and their families .....	4583
Monkeypox outbreak .....	5776, 6095
Muslim community: desecration of graveyards.....	682
National health insurance .....	5726
NHI Bill.....	249
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Omicron variant: identification of.....	4438
Portrait of former Premier: Worcester EMS Building.....	2317

Premier:	
Address	
The courage needed to get the job done.....	2519
Debate on the address .....	2541, 3214
State of the Province Address - Debate.....	4904
Public Healthcare: ongoing challenges .....	6040
Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Covid-19 on its oversight and public participation activities undertaken during the period 14 April to 24 November 2020 .....	2853
Sexual assault and violence against women.....	5448
Sexual misconduct: disparities in treatment of victims And perpetrators .....	5789
Slingers, Bridgenay: murder of.....	
Speaker:	
Debates of:	
Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic .....	2272
Commemorating National Women's Month.....	222
Women's Day, dignity and rights.....	4200
Statements    1304, 1330, 1447, 2412, 4032, 5440	
Stellenbosch Hospital teen rape incident .....	6094
Subject for discussion:	
Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a world-class health system .....	4295
The Covid-19 third wave as the priority to save lives and secure Livelihoods .....	3944
The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy .....	1510
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future .....	4222
Thusong Emergency Field Hospital .....	2073
United Democratic Front – 36th anniversary.....	315
Universal health care award: President Cyril Ramaphosa .....	580
Vaccine manufacturing: confidence in South Africa .....	4082
Vaccine production: South Africa .....	4092
Vaccine sites: Gauteng .....	4048
Western Cape: Epicentre of the Covid-19 pandemic .....	1308
Winde, Premier: call to lift lockdown measures .....	2584
Winter Readiness.....	4083
World Health Day .....	5461
<b>XEGO, M</b>	
Amazon Headquarters: halt on construction .....	5462
Arcadia Place evictions .....	575
Bills:	
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019] Vote 1: Premier .....	837

Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	860
Vote 6: Health .....	874
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	891
Western Cape Appropriation Bill (Covid-19 Bill)(2020/21)	
Financial Year) [B4 – 2020] .....	
Vote 1: Premier .....	1855
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	1883
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	1922
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	1959
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports.....	2003
Vote 8: Human Settlements .....	2024
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B4 – 2021]	
Vote 10: Transport and Public Works .....	3472
Vote 6: Health .....	3488
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	3503
Vote 1: Premier .....	3540
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	3587
Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism.....	3614
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2022]	
Consideration of principle .....	5045
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	5105
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	5127
Vote 6: Health .....	5187
Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7 – 2020]	
Consideration of principle .....	2827
Vote 1: Premier .....	2878
Vote 5: Education .....	2918
Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..	2930
Vote 2: Provincial Parliament.....	2957
Vote 4: Community Safety .....	2964
Vote 11: Agriculture .....	3001
Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3015
Black farmers: challenges faced by .....	2300
Black farmers support.....	2193
Botha, Lorraine – motion of condolence .....	6127
Cecil John Rhodes statue: beheading of .....	1768
City of Cape Town: evictions .....	4246
City of Cape Town: Unlawful Occupation By-Law .....	4180
Condolence - motions	
Mlangeni, Isitwalandwe Andrew .....	1764
Mseleku, Sbusiso .....	2144
Williams, Chester .....	367
Congratulations – motions	
Cape Peninsula University of Technology Rugby Team .....	3862
Rugby World Cup Sevens 2022 waste collection initiative .....	6157
Covid-19: PPE procurement .....	2048
Covid-19: preparedness .....	3911
Covid-19: readiness of schools.....	1450
De Doorns: Seasonal farm workers .....	6051
Disadvantaged youth: economic opportunities .....	2297
Draft Resolutions:	

Ad-hoc Committee investigation into Deputy Speaker.....	2098
Ad-hoc Committee – WCPP seating allocation.....	5744
Drakenstein Municipality: Municipal Manager .....	5887
Elfindale land – restoration back to Brickles family .....	5730
Emergency medical services: continued attacks on.....	5465
Eviction prevention: Bromwell Street, Woodstock.....	4327
Head of WECD: unlawful extension of contract.....	2211
Homeless people: issuing of fines to.....	5731
Housing crisis and backlog.....	2191
Housing provision for farm dwellers .....	2133
Illegal evictions .....	1759
Informal settlements: water and sanitation .....	1760
King Mowbray Golf Club: lease .....	2199
Koena Art Institute: re-opening.....	5888
Kosovo informal settlement: fire .....	4328
Krugersdorp rapes .....	6014
Land evictions .....	2194
Land occupation: decline in.....	4251
Lifestyle audits report .....	2049
Matter of Public Importance (in accordance with standing rule 143):	
The impact of increasing fuel prices and the rate of inflation	
on the Western Cape economy, poverty and hunger .....	5817
Mrwetyana, Uyinene .....	353
National Child Protection Week.....	5884
National Women’s Day.....	167, 2062
Oath or solemn affirmation .....	2
Police sergeant: drunk driving accident.....	6158
Premier:	
State of the Province Address – Debate.....	115, 1148, 3212, 4901
Private sector businesses: entrenched racism .....	2299
Provincial Government departments: insourcing.....	1758
Ramadan Holy Month .....	5453, 5463, 5466
Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill	
[B9 – 2020] (NCOP).....	1837
Report of the Public Accounts Committee, having considered the	
2020/21 Annual Reports of the 13 departments, including their	
Entities, of the Western Cape Government as part of its	
Oversight role .....	5472
Report on the Standing Committee on Education on an oversight	
visit to the Jakes Gerwel Technical High School conducted	
on 15 November 2019 .....	2158
SASSA: social relief of distress grant.....	6050
Service delivery: slow pace of .....	3910
Shack fire: death of 2-year old .....	2207
South African College High School: disbandment of SGB .....	2203
Statements .....	339, 554, 1445, 1524, 1561, 1750, 4239, 5876, 6001
.....	6140
Strong wind: destruction of homes .....	2140
Subject for discussion:	
Strengthening Western Cape health facilities for building a	
world-class health system .....	4292, 4311

Subsidiarity and devolution of powers .....	5984
The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape .....	527
The commitment to a non-racial and united South Africa.....	5699
The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future.....	4223
The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty .....	6164
Taxi violence: escalation of.....	2132
Taxi wars .....	4182
Trains: violence and crime .....	56
Unemployment statistics .....	4252
Vredendal Hospital .....	5844
Water saving .....	6015

**REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA**

---

**DEBATES**

**OF THE**

**PARLIAMENT OF THE**

**PROVINCE OF THE**

**WESTERN CAPE**

**(HANSARD)**

---

**FOURTH SESSION – SIXTH PARLIAMENT  
OF THE PROVINCE OF THE WESTERN CAPE**

---

The sign\* indicates a translation. The sign †, used subsequently in the same speech, indicates the original language

---

---

THURSDAY 10 NOVEMBER 2022

6315

---

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT**

---

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 6317**

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Thank you, hon members, distinguished guests, our visitors here, the people of the Western Cape. You are reminded that we are in a hybrid session of this Parliament and of course it is important for those who are visitors to understand that if you are a guest you are either here in the Chamber or you are in the virtual platform and you do not participate in the proceedings of this Parliament. You are an observer and therefore as an important visitor we appreciate you as a guest. Also important is the conduct of visitors, do not press your microphone online and do not activate your camera. For the hon members that are here with me in the Chamber, I would like to indicate to you, hon members, that do not join the virtual session because you are in this hybrid venue. So because you are here, you do not have to necessarily be on the other platform, and that is in terms of Rule 40 to avoid disruptions which could hinder the ability for members, who are in the

virtual platform, to engage in a much more productive way.

Finally, I would like to request that if you are here with us in the Chamber in the gallery, I know it can be at times exciting and you might be tempted to † 'n handeklap, asseblief, [a clapping of hands,] but please do not, because if you want to clap hands, you are not allowed to because this is the House of Parliament.

Let me, before we begin with our programme, which is with our Order of the Day, indicate to the hon members that in the gallery, as you look up there, we have special guests and these are the guests from a school that I visited recently and it is the Breede Valley School of Skills, and those who live in the Breede River Valley Municipality will say they know that school in the Cape Winelands. I visited them recently and I invited them to come see us here today as the hon members. What is so special about them being here today is that this is a school that focuses on learners with special needs and it sends a message, it sends a strong message that this Parliament is a Parliament that is inclusive, a Parliament of all people, but a Parliament, of course, because they are in the platteland, that does not see itself as a Parliament of only for those people who live in Cape Town, because the platteland equally deserves to be in this Parliament. That is why we are all from all the corners of this province.

Hon members, these are learners with special needs and they live with some form or more of disabilities and one of the most important things is, a disability is not something that shows that you are unable, you are incapable; it shows that there are some limitations but they, as part of an inclusive society, belong here equally like any other child in this province and in this country.

Can you please, hon members, kindly join me in welcoming Mr Syce, the principal of the school and the teachers that are up there, together with all the learners that are here, to this Provincial Parliament. Thank you. [Applause.]

Some of them said to me they have never been into an elevator. Ja. They said they have never – 2022. Some, they have never been on the sixth floor in an elevated building, let alone being in Cape Town. We really have a lot to do, but that is why we are here.

Thank you, hon members, the Order of the Day is the Interpellations followed by the Questions to the Premier without Notice and then there is Members' Statements. May I then at this point, with the first interpellation by hon Makamba-Botya to the Leader of Government Business, the Minister of Agriculture, Dr Ivan Meyer, and request the hon Minister to take the stand. Hon Minister.

---

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS**

TUESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2022

**TABLING**

The Speaker:

Submission of the in-year amendments to the Western Cape Liquor Authority's Annual Performance Plan for 2022/23:

Annexure A and B: Six (6) amendments to performance indicators, inclusive of the technical indicator descriptions: Two (2) indicators for the Liquor Licensing Tribunal (LLT) and one (1) indicator for Compliance and Enforcement (CE) were added; two (2) indicators were removed from CE; and one (1) indicator target was increased for CE.

Copy attached.

FRIDAY, 4 NOVEMBER 2022

**COMMITTEE REPORT****Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development for the 2021/22 financial year**

The Standing Committee on Social Development, having deliberated on the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development for the year ended 31 March 2022, reports as follows:

**1. Introduction**

The Standing Committee's Annual Report meeting was published in newspapers inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions.

The Standing Committee on Social Development (the Committee) deliberated on the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development (the Department) on 18 October 2022, as part of its oversight function. The Minister and the Head of Department were allowed to make opening remarks.

The Department was examined on:  
Part A: General Information;  
Part B: Departmental Performance Information; and  
Part D: Human Resources Management  
of the Department's Annual Report.

Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions and to make input during the discussions.

## **2. Overview**

The Head of the Department of Social Development, Dr Macdonald provided an overview of the performance of the Department during the 2021/22 financial year.

Dr Macdonald reported that despite the challenges associated with the COVID-19 pandemic, the Department remained focused on its strategic priorities which include child protection services; providing services to persons living with disabilities; addressing gender-based violence; strengthening families and supporting individuals and families with substance use disorders. The outcomes of the Department for the period under review were guided by the Western Cape Recovery Plan and were aimed at addressing the plight of vulnerable families and individuals seeking social welfare services and support for women and children who have become victims of interpersonal violence, especially gender-based violence. The economic impact of the COVID-19 disaster has seen substantial growth in demand for social development services, alongside budget cuts experienced by the Department, with a 0,4 percent reduction for DSD in the 2022/23 financial year, before taking inflation into account. The HOD reported that this has meant that the Department had to make extremely difficult trade-offs to maintain, and where necessary, expand the most critically needed areas of service delivery to the people of the Western Cape.

The HOD reported that slow economic growth has hampered households recovery from the pandemic. Unemployment continued to grow, which has worsened food insecurity in the province.

The Department ensured cooked meals and food parcels reached 270 802 people during the financial year under review. This included cooked meals at community kitchens, supported by the Department through food vouchers, dry goods, and food parcels, which reached 96 500 qualifying beneficiaries. Further efforts to assist vulnerable households during the period under review included the provision of temporary work opportunities to over 2 000 people through the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP). The Department allocated resources towards humanitarian relief to alleviate some of the pressure many of poorer households were facing due to the loss of income brought forth by job losses.

## **3. Key points from the discussion on the Annual Report of the Department**

- 3.1. The Department reported that it remains committed to its statutory obligation to ensure the protection and care of vulnerable children. Through community-based child and youth care prevention and early intervention services, 8 834 children were provided access to developmental support during the 2021/22 financial year.
- 3.2. During the financial year under review, the Department strengthened diversion services in the province by facilitating the training of 26 probation officers in the areas of self-image, sexual education, personal violence, coping mechanisms, and life skills.
- 3.3. In addition, school-based crime prevention programmes were prioritised and reached 5 806 learners with behaviour conduct disorders.

- 3.4. During the period under review, a total of 35 616 foster care cases were loaded into the webbased Foster Care Management System. The capture of all remaining foster care cases is envisaged to be completed by the first quarter of 2022/23.
- 3.5. The Department continued to support the Early Childhood Development (ECD) sector while working through the year under review towards the full shift of the function to the Western Cape Education Department from 1 April 2022.
- 3.6. The Department has provided integrated family strengthening and reunification programmes that focused on building resilient families. These programmes include support for homeless adults, with the number of bed spaces in shelters for homeless adults increasing from 2 031 in 2020/21 to 2 208 by the end of the 2021/22 financial year.
- 3.7. It was reported that 37 shelters for homeless adults were funded across the province.
- 3.8. During the financial year under review, regular engagements and training sessions were held with the sector and funded non-profit organisations (NPOs) to enhance practitioner care and support to persons with disabilities and parental support structures in the province.
- 3.9. In addition, two specially adapted 16-seater vehicles for the transportation of children with intellectual disabilities were handed over to Nomaxabiso Day Care Centre and Beaufort West Association for the physically disabled, respectively, during the 2021/22 financial year.
- 3.10. Furthermore, a third vehicle was handed over to the Vrolike Vinkies in April of the 2022/23 financial year and the fourth vehicle will be handed over during the 2022/23 financial year.
- 3.11. During the term under review, six additional fully operational GBV shelters were opened in the province in response to an increase in gender-based violence (GBV) during the COVID19 pandemic.
- 3.12. The Department has established a Western Cape Government Transversal Gender-based Violence Forum, which meets monthly and contributed to the Western Cape Government Gender-based Violence Implementation Plan, which was adopted by the Cabinet in September 2021.
- 3.13. The Department reported that the rights, safety and well-being of the older persons were supported through the provision of community-based support services.
- 3.14. The Department strived to improve access to services for persons with SUDs, which threaten the health, safety and well-being of communities in the province by expanding its community-based treatment services to rural areas in Beaufort-West, Stilbaai, Ceres and Villiersdorp.
- 3.15. During the financial year under review, 12 615 youth accessed skills development programmes at community-based organisations and Youth Cafés across the province.
- 3.16. The Department reported that over 999 000 packs of sanitary pads were distributed to 223 schools across the province to preserve the dignity, well-being and health of young girls and women in schools through the Sanitary Dignity Project.
- 3.17. The sustainability of the NPOs, continued to receive attention as many NPOs face diminishing revenue streams. Interventions focused on enhancing governance processes and practices for improved

- sustainability included 37 training sessions facilitated with 887 NPO leaders from 584 NPOs.
- 3.18. The Department reported that it will continue to prioritise community-based and residential care services to children and adults in conflict with the law.
  - 3.19. In response to the increased food insecurity, the high demand for food relief and increased homelessness, the Department will continue to implement COVID-19 relief programmes aligned with the Western Cape Recovery Plan.
  - 3.20. It was reported that youth in conflict with the law remains a concern for the province, specifically youth involved in violent crime.
  - 3.21. The Department will continue to redress interventions in support of persons living with disabilities including mainstreaming, supporting, and promoting the rights, well-being and socio-economic empowerment of persons with disabilities, their families and caregivers so that they have an equal opportunity to participate in all spheres of life.
  - 3.22. During the 2020/21 financial year, sexual offenses related to GBV counted for 6,9 percent, and 6 456 of these were contact crimes.
  - 3.23. It was reported that violence against women and children was fuelled by substance abuse. The Department provided a range of Substance Use Disorder (SUD) services during the financial year under review, including prevention, early intervention, treatment and aftercare services to ensure the effective reintegration of clients into their communities of origin and the society at large.
  - 3.24. The Department managed to fill various positions in the approved departmental organisational structure and has appointed 145 social work graduates, on contract, who were holders of the national Department of Social Development (NDSD) social work bursaries.
  - 3.25. The Department allocated 52 staff bursaries in specialised fields, where a shortage of skills exists, namely, addiction care, child and family studies, clinical social work, probation services, and forensic social work. Furthermore, 18 addiction care bursaries were awarded to people who are nonemployees of the Department to increase the availability of qualified professionals in this area.
  - 3.26. The Department reported that it will continue to engage and strengthen the relationship with the courts to improve referrals of children and adults in conflict with the law to appropriate diversion services and programme.
  - 3.27. The Department also reported that there was no legislation that provides for residential facilities for people living with disabilities. People living with disabilities that need residential facilities end up in old age homes and the Older Persons Act, 2006 (Act 13 of 2006), prohibits any person younger than the age of 60 from being accommodated in an oldage home.
  - 3.28. The Department further reported a growing number of unregistered treatment facilities for substances abuse in the province as a challenge. It was reported that no legislation guides and regulates the Department to close down the illegal treatment facilities. The Department can only ask the Municipalities to enforce their By-Laws.

#### **4. Public input**

The Committee proceeded to the public hearing on the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development. Ms Florence from Women to Women NGO and Ms Lisipho Daniels from Mayihambe NGO in Langa gave oral submissions. The Head of the Department and departmental officials duly responded to the input made by the members of the public.

#### **5. Resolutions**

The Committee RESOLVED to:

- 5.1. Invite the Department of Community Safety, the South African Police Service and the Department of Social Development to brief the Committee on the holistic approach or programmes in place to address the challenge of gang violence and gender-based violence in the province.
- 5.2. Conduct an oversight visit to the DSD service offices and funded NGOs in Langa and other Cape Flats communities.

#### **6. Recommendations**

The Committee recommended that:

- 6.1. The Department should consider allocating additional specially adapted 16-seater vehicles in Beaufort West and other rural areas for the transportation of children living with disabilities.
- 6.2. The Department should thoroughly investigate if there are any victims of sexual harassment within the Department.
- 6.3. The Department should develop a plan for the placement of social work graduates.

#### **7. Information requested**

The Committee requested the Department of Social Development to provide the following information by Wednesday 31 November 2022:

- 7.1. Detailed information on the number of children that were murdered in the province during the 2021/22 financial year.
  - 7.2. Detailed information on the children and women who were abused and assisted by the Department during the financial year under review.
  - 7.3. Detailed information on the total number of NPOs in the province that are registered, unregistered and funded. The information should include the geographic area and region.
  - 7.4. A consolidated report on the service provided by the funded NPOs in the province.
8. Conclusion

The Chairperson thanked the Members of the Committee, the Head of the Department, departmental officials, and guests for their preparation, input, and responses to the questions posed by the Committee.

MONDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2022

## **COMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements on the annual reports of the Department of Human Settlements and its entity, the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal, for the 2021/22 financial year**

The Standing Committee on Human Settlements, having deliberated on the annual reports of the Department of Human Settlements (the Department) and its entity, the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal (the Tribunal), for the year ended March 2022, referred to it, reports as follows:

#### **1. Introduction**

As part of its oversight function, the Standing Committee on Human Settlements (the Committee) considered the Annual Reports of the Department and the Tribunal on 17 October 2022. Annual reports are the key instruments for departments to report on performance measured against their performance targets and budgets as outlined in their strategic plans and annual performance plans. In addition hereto, it accounts for the success of each programme that was implemented.

Standing Rule 111(1)(a) of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament provides the standing committees with the mandate to consider departmental annual reports submitted in accordance with the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999).

The Annual Report Programme for the 2021/22 financial year was advertised in newspapers to invite stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions.

The Committee deliberated on Part A: General Information, Part B: Performance Information, and Part D: Human Resource Management.

The Minister of Human Settlements was afforded the opportunity to provide an overview of the key issues contained in the reports.

#### **2. Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal**

##### **2.1 Overview**

Mr L Cloete, Chairperson of the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal, informed the Committee that there were many challenges during the year under review. This was attributed to the country being subjected to various stages of the COVID-19 lockdown in terms of the regulations issued under the Disaster Management Act, 2002 (Act 57 of 2002). He advised that although the Tribunal was able to deliver on its mandated services, its operations were still affected in various ways.

The Tribunal received new improved office space. The Customer Relations Management (CRM) System, which came into operation on 1 April 2021, allowed the public to lodge complaints remotely via the Western Cape Government eService Portal. The main objective of the CRM was to improve the efficiency with which complaints were processed and finalised. In addition, it could also be used as a mechanism to reduce the use of paper in the processing and management of complaints. The implementation of the Tribunal's Strategic Plan during February 2022 allowed the Tribunal to improve its public awareness and pursue the sections major goals.

The Committee proceeded to discuss the Report.

## **2.2 Key issues discussed**

The Committee afforded the Tribunal the opportunity to provide input on its Annual Report by briefing the Committee on the following:

- 2.2.1 The Tribunal recorded 2 544 cases for the year under review, which was reported to be considerably less than the average number of cases recorded over the past six years.
- 2.2.2 A grand total of approximately 760 Communicare group related complaints were received by the Tribunal. Only 30 Communicare related complaints remained, all of which were maintenance related. All the other complaints were finalised. Communicare has not raised its rentals in the past two to three financial years. The Western Cape government only owns 20% of the Communicare stock.
- 2.2.3 Due to the concerted efforts by members of the Tribunal and staff, the number of open cases were reduced to 817 from the 1 325 open cases recorded in the 2020/21 financial year.
- 2.2.4 The backlog of cases was reduced to 391 from 898. This was attributed to officials being delegated the authority to close case files.
- 2.2.5 Members raised concern regarding the 565 hearings that did not equal the number of postponed and settled cases. Approximately 21 settled cases and 154 postponed cases were reported, which calculated to 434 cases that were heard. The Department advised that the Tribunal would provide the Committee with a response regarding the missing 31 cases as indicated on page 14 of Table 7 of the Tribunal's Annual Report.
- 2.2.6 The sheriff of the court was requested to assist with retrieving tenants' possessions. Spoliation orders were drafted for landlords who dispossessed tenants' possessions.

The Committee commended the Tribunal for its good work throughout the financial year. The Minister thanked the Tribunal and requested that members inform their constituencies about the online services of the Tribunal.

### **3. Department of Human Settlements**

#### **3.1 Overview**

Minister Simmers and Ms K August the Acting Head of Department were afforded the opportunity to provide introductory remarks on the key issues contained in the Department's Annual Report.

In his overview, Minister Simmers advised the Committee that the Department received a budget of R2 410 259 000. He advised that R2 361 929 000 of the budget was spent in the 2021/22 financial year. The budget was spent on improving efficiencies under Liveable Neighbourhoods, access to adequate housing and empowerment opportunities for citizens in the Western Cape, as well as for the security of tenure through home ownership.

Approximately 68,67% of the Department's Human Settlement Development Grant was awarded to contractors in designated groups. A total of 14,50% of the appointed contractors had women's representation and 6,18% of the appointed contractors had youth representation.

As part of the Department's improved efficiencies, it implemented two information and communications technology interventions. Approximately 99% of the invoices that were received by the Department were paid within 30 days. A total of 20 municipal engagements were held to improve efficiency at the municipal level, and a total of two knowledge management projects were implemented.

Under the Liveable Neighbourhood initiative, the Department completed two integrated implementation plans within the priority housing development areas. A total of 13 projects were approved that were aligned to the national and provincial priorities. The Department approved two policies and two policy implementation guidelines. Only two research papers were developed during the period under review.

After listing the key activities that were achieved by the Department during the 2021/22 financial year, Minister Simmers advised that the Department had received an unqualified audit with findings.

#### **3.2 Key issues discussed**

3.2.1 Land purchased by the government under the Medium-term Strategic Framework was rezoned for human settlement. The Saldanha Bay and the Theewaterskloof municipalities received 13,7 hectares of land for human settlement development. A total of four township establishment processes that were identified as priority housing development areas in the City of Cape Town were completed. The aim of the project was to restructure and revitalize towns and cities, to strengthen the livelihoods of households and to integrate communities.

3.2.2 Approximately 11 495 housing opportunities were provided by the

Department, and a total of 8 164 title deeds were transferred to the relevant beneficiaries. Approximately 110 of the pre-1994 beneficiaries received title deeds, 2 073 of the pre-2014 beneficiaries received their title deeds, and 5 981 post-2014 beneficiaries received title deeds for their respective housing units.

3.2.3 The Department coordinated the completion of two integrated implementation plans as part of its project readiness plans. One of the projects was planned for the Breede Valley and the other for the Saldanha Bay Municipality's Special Economic Zone.

3.2.4 Technical support was provided to municipalities to enable municipalities to produce integrated development plans for human settlements projects.

3.2.5 The Department developed a general policy on the management of rental properties owned by the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements. The policy, it was reported, will deal with the procedural and management compliance framework for the letting of immovable properties belonging to the Western Cape Government in terms of the Housing Act, 1997 (Act 107 of 1997).

To ensure that beneficiary selection in the Western Cape remained sound, the Department embarked on a process to revise the framework policy for beneficiary selection. The aim of the policy was to determine the norms and standards for beneficiary selection for human settlement projects in municipalities, in the form of rules and principles.

In a bid to make affordable housing accessible to potential clients, the Department initiated and led discussions with its provincial and national counterparts, namely the Ministers and Members of the Executive Council, to obtain a means of enable potential beneficiaries to access a housing opportunity. To this end, a policy on "Help me Buy a Home" was approved by the national Department of Human Settlements.

The Department also revised its Enhanced Serviced Sites (ESS) policy guidelines to cater for various options to allow for the capture of a different range of potential beneficiaries in all the markets.

In his closing remarks Minister Simmers thanked departmental officials for their hard work during the year and members for their continuous oversight. He informed the Committee that the Department was gearing up to merge with the new Department of Infrastructure and would therefore have to finalise all outstanding matters prior to the merger.

### **3.3 Documents requested**

The Committee requested that the Department provide it with the following documents:

3.3.1 The amended policy for the selection of housing beneficiaries;

3.3.2 The Department of Human Settlements' Policy on the Management of Rental Properties;

- 3.3.3 The research paper on new mechanisms for increasing densities in social housing projects; and
- 3.3.4 A report on the remuneration allocated to the members of the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal for the past financial year.

#### **4. Conclusion**

The Chairperson allowed Minister Simmers and the Head of Department to provide a word of thanks, after which she thanked the members of the Committee, the Minister, the Head of Department and all the officials of the Department for their preparation and responses to the questions raised by the Committee.

THURSDAY, 17 NOVEMBER 2022

### **COMMITTEE REPORT**

**Report of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works on its oversight visit to the George Integrated Transport Network (Go George) and the Government Motor Transport Regional Hub on Wednesday 18 May 2022 as follows:**

#### **Delegation**

The delegation consisted of the following Members:

America, D (Chairperson) (DA)  
Van der Westhuizen, AP (DA)  
Mvimbi, LL (ANC)

The Procedural Officer, Mr J Coetzee, and Ms N Mshumpela, Committee Assistant, accompanied the delegation.

#### **1. George Integrated Transport Network (Go George)**

##### **1.1 Introduction and background**

Section 114(2)(b)(i) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, mandates provincial legislatures to provide for mechanisms to maintain oversight over the provincial executive authority in the province. Flowing from a resolution of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works, the Committee undertook an oversight visit to the George Integrated Public Transport Network (GIPTN), also referred as the Go George Project.

Go George is a scheduled public bus service in the City of George that aims to provide a first-class public transport service that is reliable, affordable, safe, convenient, accessible, and that contributes to a better quality of life for all.

The GIPTN focused on full inclusion and transformation of the local minibus-taxi industry in George with a Vehicle Operating Company (VOC) wholly owned and operated by local operators to deliver the new scheduled bus service in terms of

a contract.

Through an intergovernmental initiative between the Municipality of George, the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works, the national Department of Transport and the local taxi and bus operators from the George area, this project came about and is funded through the Western Cape Public Transport Operations Grant, as well as the national government through the Public Transport Network Grant.

The Go George bus service celebrated six years of service to the George community in December 2020.

## **1.2 Overview of the visit**

The Committee visited the Go George depot and was briefed on the status of the rollout of Phase 4A to the community of Thembalethu after which the Committee was taken on a tour of the Phase 4A route.

## **1.3 Key issues discussed**

The project commenced during 2007 and was initially initiated by the Western Cape Government and the Municipality of George later joined as a partner. There were four stakeholders involved, which were identified as affected parties by the government, ie Uncedo, George Huurmotor Vereniging (GHV), George Taxi Owners Front (GTOF) and Louis Bus Services.

The actual negotiation process started in 2011 during which all aspects regarding the long-term contract (12 years) were negotiated and, during this period, the company George Link (Pty) Ltd was formed. Some of the aspects included compensation, formation of the company, bus ownership, funding of pre-operational cost, contract rates, service to be operated, including phased rollout, training of staff and the presence of full-time advisors etc.

The successful implementation of phases 1, 2, 3 and 4B has allowed the Go George bus service to transport over four million residents in George and currently covers 70% of the households in George. Services are expected to be rolled out to the additional areas around George. The current focus is on the expansion and rollout of Phase 4A of the Go George service to Thembalethu.

This expanded service is expected to increase the average weekday passenger trips from 15 600 to almost 24 000, with more than 80% of households estimated to be within 500 metres of a Go George bus stop. It was agreed that the rollout of Phase 4A must be achieved before the end of 2022.

## **1.4 Concerns**

It was highlighted that there are still a number of illegal taxis on the GIPTN route and a number of attacks on the busses were aimed at the bus drivers, which could have very bad consequences if a driver were injured. Safety and security remain a major concern for the successful rollout of Phase 4A.

Vandalism of the Go George infrastructure is a serious concern as it affects the

quality of the service experience of the passengers and detracts from the mission of delivering a dignified and safe public transport service and associated amenities.

The repair of damaged bus windows has cost the George Public Transport Network (GIPTN) an estimated R965 000 in 2021 and the cost of replacing infrastructure and branding damaged by vandals is astronomical.

### **1.5 Resolution**

The Committee RESOLVED that it would monitor the rollout of Phase 4A, as well as the operations of GIPTN regularly.

### **1.6 Acknowledgements**

The Chairperson thanked the Department, the George Municipality and the directors of George Link for availing themselves to address the Committee.

## **2. Government Motor Transport Regional Hub**

### **2.1 Introduction and background**

The Government Motor Transport (GMT) Regional Hub in George was opened on Monday 10 August 2020. GMT is a trading entity operating under the auspices of the Department of Transport and Public Works (DTPW). One of the reasons why George was chosen is because, together with other neighbouring municipalities, it is poised to be the next metropolitan area in the Western Cape.

It will service both the provincial and national departments and will also increase the response time for the Department of Health as some of their vehicles are kept there.

### **2.2 Overview of the visit**

The Committee visited the GMT Depot and was briefed on its purpose, which is to provide a cost-effective fleet management service to provincial and national departments, as well as other government entities in the Western Cape. One of GMT's key strategic thrusts is to establish strategically located regional vehicle pools that will best enable client departments and entities to provide services to the public. The George Regional Hub will facilitate the provision of public services to people living in the Southern Cape and surrounding areas of the province.

At present, the Regional Hub in George has a fleet of 102 vehicles and provides vehicles to seven of the fourteen departments in the province. The new facility can accommodate 157 vehicles and the office block will accommodate six GMT officials. The budget of the building maintenance of all depots are managed by the DTPW.

The depot in George is also a parking facility and the GMT Technical Inspectorate operates from the site, covering the Southern Cape and Karoo

regions.

GMT Rental in Cape Town is a vehicle rental service and clients are billed by GMT Fleet Finance. All repairs and servicing of vehicles are managed by GMT Fleet Services team and the service provider, Nedfleet, that is based in Maitland.

### **2.3 Key issues discussed**

During the tour of the facility it was highlighted that GMT is required to deliver specially equipped vehicles, all of which are offered to client departments. Conversions for specialised vehicles, such as ambulances, rescue and forensic pathology services vehicles, as well as mobile clinics, are contracted to merchants to promote empowerment and economic growth.

These specially equipped vehicles are delivered to client specifications. The number of requests for specialised vehicles and even for fully equipped trailers is increasing because of client departments taking their core business activities to the doorstep of communities to further improve service delivery. GMT intends to explore ways to increase this capacity and the provision of training to drivers who operate these specialised vehicles.

### **2.4 Concerns**

It was highlighted that the misuse of government vehicles and losses remained a major concern for the Department and they were constantly striving to find innovative ways to minimise the losses. Thus far, during the 2022/23 financial year, 242 incidents of losses were reported at a cost of R1 449 000. During the 2021/22 financial year, 2 275 incidents of losses were recorded at a cost of R19 190 000.

### **2.5 Resolution**

The Committee RESOLVED that it would visit the GMT Maitland Depot at a future date.

### **2.6 Acknowledgements**

The Chairperson thanked the Department and the staff of the GMT George Regional Hub for availing themselves to address the Committee.

THURSDAY, 17 NOVEMBER 2022

## **COMMITTEE REPORT**

Report of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works on its oversight visit to the George Integrated Transport Network (Go George) and the Government Motor Transport Regional Hub on Wednesday 18 May 2022 as follows:

## **Delegation**

The delegation consisted of the following Members:

America, D (Chairperson) (DA)  
Van der Westhuizen, AP (DA)  
Mvimbi, LL (ANC)

The Procedural Officer, Mr J Coetzee, and Ms N Mshumpela, Committee Assistant, accompanied the delegation.

### **1. George Integrated Transport Network (Go George)**

#### **1.1 Introduction and background**

Section 114(2)(b)(i) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, mandates provincial legislatures to provide for mechanisms to maintain oversight over the provincial executive authority in the province. Flowing from a resolution of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works, the Committee undertook an oversight visit to the George Integrated Public Transport Network (GIPTN), also referred as the Go George Project.

Go George is a scheduled public bus service in the City of George that aims to provide a first-class public transport service that is reliable, affordable, safe, convenient, accessible, and that contributes to a better quality of life for all.

The GIPTN focused on full inclusion and transformation of the local minibus-taxi industry in George with a Vehicle Operating Company (VOC) wholly owned and operated by local operators to deliver the new scheduled bus service in terms of a contract.

Through an intergovernmental initiative between the Municipality of George, the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works, the national Department of Transport and the local taxi and bus operators from the George area, this project came about and is funded through the Western Cape Public Transport Operations Grant, as well as the national government through the Public Transport Network Grant.

The Go George bus service celebrated six years of service to the George community in December 2020.

#### **1.2 Overview of the visit**

The Committee visited the Go George depot and was briefed on the status of the rollout of Phase 4A to the community of Thembaletu after which the Committee was taken on a tour of the Phase 4A route.

#### **1.3 Key issues discussed**

The project commenced during 2007 and was initially initiated by the Western Cape Government and the Municipality of George later joined as a partner.

There were four stakeholders involved, which were identified as affected parties by the government, ie Uncedo, George Huurmotor Vereniging (GHV), George Taxi Owners' Front (GTOF) and Louis Bus Services.

The actual negotiation process started in 2011 during which all aspects regarding the long-term contract (12 years) were negotiated and, during this period, the company George Link (Pty) Ltd was formed. Some of the aspects included compensation, formation of the company, bus ownership, funding of pre-operational cost, contract rates, service to be operated, including phased rollout, training of staff and the presence of full-time advisors etc.

The successful implementation of phases 1, 2, 3 and 4B has allowed the Go George bus service to transport over four million residents in George and currently covers 70% of the households in George. Services are expected to be rolled out to the additional areas around George. The current focus is on the expansion and rollout of Phase 4A of the Go George service to Thembaletu.

This expanded service is expected to increase the average weekday passenger trips from 15 600 to almost 24 000, with more than 80% of households estimated to be within 500 metres of a Go George bus stop. It was agreed that the rollout of Phase 4A must be achieved before the end of 2022.

#### **1.4 Concerns**

It was highlighted that there are still a number of illegal taxis on the GIPTN route and a number of attacks on the busses were aimed at the bus drivers, which could have very bad consequences if a driver were injured. Safety and security remain a major concern for the successful rollout of Phase 4A.

Vandalism of the Go George infrastructure is a serious concern as it affects the quality of the service experience of the passengers and detracts from the mission of delivering a dignified and safe public transport service and associated amenities.

The repair of damaged bus windows has cost the George Public Transport Network (GIPTN) an estimated R965 000 in 2021 and the cost of replacing infrastructure and branding damaged by vandals is astronomical.

#### **1.5 Resolution**

The Committee RESOLVED that it would monitor the rollout of Phase 4A, as well as the operations of GIPTN regularly.

#### **1.6 Acknowledgements**

The Chairperson thanked the Department, the George Municipality and the directors of George

Link for availing themselves to address the Committee.

## **2. Government Motor Transport Regional Hub**

## **2.1 Introduction and background**

The Government Motor Transport (GMT) Regional Hub in George was opened on Monday 10 August 2020. GMT is a trading entity operating under the auspices of the Department of Transport and Public Works (DTPW). One of the reasons why George was chosen is because, together with other neighbouring municipalities, it is poised to be the next metropolitan area in the Western Cape. It will service both the provincial and national departments and will also increase the response time for the Department of Health as some of their vehicles are kept there.

## **2.2 Overview of the visit**

The Committee visited the GMT Depot and was briefed on its purpose, which is to provide a costeffective fleet management service to provincial and national departments, as well as other government entities in the Western Cape. One of GMT's key strategic thrusts is to establish strategically located regional vehicle pools that will best enable client departments and entities to provide services to the public. The George Regional Hub will facilitate the provision of public services to people living in the Southern Cape and surrounding areas of the province.

At present, the Regional Hub in George has a fleet of 102 vehicles and provides vehicles to seven of the fourteen departments in the province. The new facility can accommodate 157 vehicles and the office block will accommodate six GMT officials. The budget of the building maintenance of all depots are managed by the DTPW.

The depot in George is also a parking facility and the GMT Technical Inspectorate operates from the site, covering the Southern Cape and Karoo regions.

GMT Rental in Cape Town is a vehicle rental service and clients are billed by GMT Fleet Finance. All repairs and servicing of vehicles are managed by GMT Fleet Services team and the service provider, Nedfleet, that is based in Maitland.

## **2.3 Key issues discussed**

During the tour of the facility it was highlighted that GMT is required to deliver specially equipped vehicles, all of which are offered to client departments. Conversions for specialised vehicles, such as ambulances, rescue and forensic pathology services vehicles, as well as mobile clinics, are contracted to merchants to promote empowerment and economic growth.

These specially equipped vehicles are delivered to client specifications. The number of requests for specialised vehicles and even for fully equipped trailers is increasing because of client departments taking their core business activities to the doorstep of communities to further improve service delivery. GMT intends to explore ways to increase this capacity and the provision of training to drivers

who operate these specialised vehicles.

## **2.4 Concerns**

It was highlighted that the misuse of government vehicles and losses remained a major concern for the Department and they were constantly striving to find innovative ways to minimise the losses. Thus far, during the 2022/23 financial year, 242 incidents of losses were reported at a cost of R1 449 000. During the 2021/22 financial year, 2 275 incidents of losses were recorded at a cost of R19 190 000.

## **2.5 Resolution**

The Committee RESOLVED that it would visit the GMT Maitland Depot at a future date.

## **2.6 Acknowledgements**

The Chairperson thanked the Department and the staff of the GMT George Regional Hub for availing themselves to address the Committee.

THURSDAY, 17 NOVEMBER 2022

## **COMMITTEE REPORT**

Report of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works on its oversight visit to the Gene Louw Traffic College on Wednesday 31 May 2022 as follows:

### **Delegation**

The delegation consisted of the following Members:

America, D (Chairperson) (DA)  
Van der Westhuizen, AP (DA)  
Maseko, M (DA)  
August, S (GOOD)

The Procedural Officer, Mr J Coetzee, and Ms N Mshumpela, Committee Assistant, accompanied the delegation.

### **Gene Louw Traffic College**

#### **1. Introduction and background**

The Gene Louw Traffic College (the College) was officially opened on 15 September 1989 and since then the College has excelled by training many traffic officers, municipal police officers, Examiner of Vehicle (EOV) and Examiner for Driving Licences (EDL) officers throughout the Western Cape and in South Africa. The training period for the traffic officer course was initially three months, after which it was extended to six months, and at present it is 12

months.

The Safety & Security Sector Education and Training Authority and the South African Police Service formally accredited the College as a training service provider for the Further Education and Training Certificate: Road Traffic Law Enforcement.

The College met all applicable South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA) requirements and was also registered by the Road Traffic Management Corporation (RTMC) to facilitate EOV and EDL training. The College is also an accredited official institution under the Firearms Control Act, 2000 (Act 60 of 2000).

## **2. Overview of the visit**

The Directorate: Traffic Training and Development consists of two subdirectorates, namely Gene Louw Traffic College and Quality Management and Evaluation.

Training was divided into four programmes, as well as a training coordination division. Traffic Officer Training, Examiner of Vehicles Training and Examiner of Driver Licence Training forms part of the formal training, while Continuous Professional Development forms part of Informal Training.

Currently 101 traffic officers are being trained. The 101 traffic officers consisted of 87 provincial officers and 14 municipal officers. The duration of the training programme was 12 months and consisted of 30 unit standards, continuous assessments, practical application, portfolios of evidence and operational deployment to develop practical skills.

The Committee also did a tour of the College.

## **3. Key issues discussed**

One of the main aims is the development of a Centre for Learning Excellence. Through the Chief Directorate: Strategy, e-learning currently creates the opportunity to incorporate a blended approach to training without compromising the quality and standard of training delivered.

Learners can access learning material and assessment documents through the internet or intranet at the Traffic Centre or any location, which would not impede on operational time. This initiative not only created monumental savings in terms of travelling, but also in accommodation in line with Cost Containment Prescripts.

Monitoring and evaluation was conducted objectively to assess and evaluate the output as performed by the Chief Directorate: Traffic Management to ensure quality of the performance was measured, best practices were observed and that shortcomings were identified.

The Chief Directorate also ensured the strengthening of operational planning for

---

intelligencedriven enforcement and road-safety initiatives. It further identified and communicated innovative programme developments that drove performance-management activities and ensured technologybased M&E processes were linked to respective dashboards.

Desktop evaluation ensured the strengthening of operational planning that added to intelligencedriven traffic law enforcement, while business intelligence included the process of technology and methodology, which transformed data systems, and provided reports for strategic, tactical and operational use by management.

The implementation and evaluation of information assisted with transversal projects, such as prefestive, festive season, Easter and operational planning and the continuous real-time electronic assessments of operational activities per traffic centre.

The impact of these operational activities also ensured stakeholders' participation and was fundamental in the upskilling and ongoing training and development of officials as part of development. This included the utilisation as mentors for newly appointed traffic officials and to increase the competencies of existing traffic officials.

The Transport Management Internet Approach is a cloud-based central repository of traffic information gathered from a province-wide network of Automatic Number Plate Recognition (ANPR) cameras, DTPW information digitalised at source and other data that gave real-time information of traffic movement, accidents, law enforcement activity and so forth.

The up-to-date data allowed the effective employment of law enforcement (patrol vehicles, roadblocks and driving-under-the-influence enforcement) and identified demographic areas to target with education outreaches. It also identified accident hotspots for possible enforcement and engineering interventions identified vehicles engaged in criminal activities or the tracking of stolen vehicles and cloned plates, and the monitoring of driver fatigue in long-distance public transport. The DTPW has accepted an expanded mandate and worked closely with the Department of Community Safety.

Traffic officers fed the data directly to the Transport Hub through a handheld device, a computer system and ANPR cameras that were mounted in patrol vehicles. The handheld device also assisted with the real-time monitoring of officers to simplify performance management, enhance officer safety and track the achievement of Annual Performance Plan targets related to law enforcement in real time for municipalities and the province to identify and address problem areas.

The Transport Management Internet Approach has resulted in great operational efficiency gains and improved road-safety planning. This should result in fewer road traffic crashed and fatalities. It is envisaged to roll it out to municipalities and other stakeholders.

**4. Resolution**

The Committee RESOLVED to have follow-up briefings on the rollout of the Transport Management Internet Approach to municipalities.

The Committee REQUESTED that the Department provide it with a complete cost analysis of the Transport Management Internet Approach Programme and future envisaged expenditure as it is rolled out.

**5. Acknowledgements**

The Chairperson thanked the Department and expressed its appreciation to the Department for the initiatives and technological advanced integrated systems to ensure better and safer roads and a public transport system.

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT**

---

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams.]

The House met at 10:00

The Deputy Sepaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 6399****BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

Business of the House was temporarily suspended due to IT problems.

Business of the House resumed.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! We are now back in the House, and I just want to establish if we are all sorted? Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Speaker, I have given, and I have received an indication from one of the people that raised the issue that it has been sorted, yes, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Welcome again, hon members. We are now set to proceed. Apologies once more, hon Minister Wenger. May I now call upon you, hon Minister, to address the House, and thank you very much. Over to you.

**MUNICIPAL ECONOMIC REVIEW AND OUTLOOK – MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES**

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Speaker, hon Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet Ministers, hon Leader of the Opposition, hon members of the Provincial Parliament, special guests and people of the Western Cape. In September I had the privilege of tabling the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook here in this Parliament, which detailed the impact of national and international developments on our provincial economy and important data on various trends in the province, with the specific focus on our key priorities of Growth for Jobs, Safety and Wellbeing.

Today, I have the honour of tabling its sister publication, the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook, which is an equally impressive and even deeper-dive research report comprising of six documents such as these, covering over a thousand pages. The MERO is a veritable treasure trove of invaluable insights, providing new data and analyses for each of our five district municipalities, 24 local municipalities, and the City of Cape Town. Making this information easily accessible has been an overarching goal in its compilation and design, because it is the intention of this rich data to inform municipal planning and budgeting through municipal integrated development plans, local

economic development strategies, and the budget processes of municipalities. This will enable evidence-based decision making as well as the implementation of the Joint District and Metro Approach to socio-economic development across the province. Equally, this information is freely available to businesses, local communities, NGOs, and anyone else who will benefit from its invaluable insights.

Together the MERO and PERO form the foundation on which we base critical decisions, strategies as well as the next steps of our budget process, which I will speak to when I table the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (MTBPS) before you later today.

Speaker, the MERO provides our citizens with a wealth of information for a better understanding of the various dynamics in the province. The data contained in the MERO also supports private sector development by providing succinct analysis on the investment potential, comparative advantage and economic specialisation of each region. The MERO continuously sources new data to expand the socio-economic intelligence available to its users. Innovations in this year's MERO include an analysis of COVID-19 vaccinations, the number and average income of taxpayers, local mobile location data for tourism profiles, new investment data, and housing market studies within the Garden Route and Cape Winelands Districts as well as public expenditure trends.

This data guides us in our quest to build a better future for residents, providing a spatial lens to strategic decisions and shining a light on new opportunities and challenges in each municipality. It empowers us to identify what plans are working and where, so we can replicate them to spread success across the province. It also allows us to measure the impact of the challenges that we face and furnishes us with the evidence we need to formulate responses. Ultimately, the MERO empowers us with the information that we and our municipalities need to govern for growth in the Western Cape.

It shares with us, for example, that between 2011 and 2021 the Western Cape was one of only three provinces that increased its contribution to the National Gross Domestic Product (GDP). Additionally, between 2012 and 2021, the average estimated economic expansion of the Western Cape of 1,2% was marginally higher than South Africa's growth rate over this time at 1%. The Cape Town Metro with the largest population and economy, valued at R502 billion made the largest economic contribution and was the most service-oriented regional economy in the Western Cape in 2021. The West Coast District is expected to have had the largest GDP expansion at 6,2% in 2021, largely owing to significant growth in the agriculture and manufacturing sectors. In the same year, the Cape Winelands district had the third highest GDP growth rate in the province at 5,3% and accounted for the second largest share of Provincial GDP in 2021, with a contribution of 11,1%. In 2021 the Overberg's GDP is estimated to have grown by 5,5%, with contributions from trade, finance and manufacturing sectors, all at 1,2 percentage points. In the same year, the Garden Route's economy is expected to be the third largest contributor to the Western Cape GDP, given the strength of the financial sector.

In 2020, the trade sector had the greatest share of employment in the Western Cape, contributing 22,7%, closely followed by the finance and community services sectors, which contributed 20% respectively. However, we know that we must do much more to shrug off low levels of economic growth, which currently characterises our national economy by enabling breakout economic growth that creates jobs and improves the lives of residents in all districts in the province, and I will elaborate a bit more on this in my next address.

Speaker, as I am sure Minister Ivan Meyer will celebrate, this MERO also sets out how the agriculture, forestry and fishing sector in the Western Cape expanded, with this sector in the Cape Metro increasing by 8,9%, followed by the West Coast at 8,6% and, overall, the expected growth in the sector was 8,3% in 2021. I was particularly impressed with the fascinating information included on overall trade for each of the district municipalities, especially that four out of the five district municipalities, namely the Cape Winelands, Central Karoo, Overberg, and West Coast are net exporters, with the Central Karoo exporting goods to the value of R114 billion, almost three times as much as their import.

Going forward, Governing for Growth will mean that we need to build on this success and further enhance trade opportunities with international partners, so we can share more proudly Western Cape goods and services with the world.

It will also require that the Western Cape ports, especially the Port of Cape Town, have sufficient capacity with high levels of investment and infrastructure. This is why the Western Cape Government is working closely with stakeholders across the ports logistics chain, all levels of government and the private sector in order to unlock the port's full potential. This remains a top strategic priority and we will continue to govern for growth by advocating strongly for private sector participation at the Port of Cape Town, as is currently the case for the Port of Durban and Ngqura.

Speaker, one port of entry where we are certainly making progress in increasing connections, is Cape Town International Airport, as a result of our successful Cape Town Air Access Initiative. On Thursday evening last week, Premier Winde welcomed the United Airlines direct route from Washington DC to Cape Town, which will not only bring in visitors but also goods in the belly of the aircraft, with a potential of 648 metric tons of cargo between November and March of next year. This is very welcome news given how hard the tourism and hospitality sector was hit during the COVID-19 pandemic and with the new addition of detailed tourism data for each district, using mobile data to provide key insight into tourism trends in the province, the MERO shows us that the green shoots of recovery were evident in the Western Cape in 2021. What I found particularly heartening is the strong rebound in our domestic visitors, which is reflected by growth in bed nights.

In 2021 the Central Karoo, Cape Winelands and the Garden Route in City of Cape Town experienced an increase of approximately 12% compared to the previous year, and the West Coast 13,5%. To ensure that we govern for growth by boosting these numbers further, we must remove the barriers that stand in the way of our tourism and hospitality sector, which is why we will continue to lobby for a remote working visa, ensure that national visa backlogs are

addressed, and that the e-Visa system is running efficiently.

Speaker, as was the case with this year's PERO, the MERO also provides data insights into our priorities of wellbeing and safety. For example, it provides valuable information on access to formal housing, basic services, water, sanitation, and solid waste removal across all districts. Within the Western Cape in 2021, the MERO tells us that 96,6% of residents had access to electricity; 99,4% had access to basic levels of water; 95,2% to basic levels of sanitation and 87% to refuse removal at least once a week. Overall, the Western Cape had the highest Human Development Index (HDI) score in the country at 0,71 out of a possible 1,0, which is also above the global average. This, as we forecast population growth to increase in 2022, as it has over the last decade. With that said, we do also take note of concerning trends identified in the MERO. The first I want to share with you today is the increase in teenage pregnancies. These increased across all districts except for the Overberg district.

The second, which is an ongoing focus of this Government, is the year-on-year increase in multiple categories of crime, following the lifting of the COVID-19 restrictions during 2020 and 2021. These demonstrate the importance of our safety and wellbeing budget priorities in the Western Cape Government and we will be leveraging this data to respond with targeted strategies in our communities.

Speaker, we are also concerned about the impact that deteriorating economic conditions and the budget crunch nationally will have on municipal budgets, especially capital budgets. This is only worsened by the impact of loadshedding, which further erodes revenue streams for municipalities. Municipalities will need to strengthen their own revenue-generating capacity to proactively seek alternative funding for infrastructure developments that will stimulate growth and improve service delivery at a local level.

I can give them mine and Minister Bredell's continued assurance that they will have the support of our Provincial Treasury and our Department of Local Government. We will support vulnerable municipalities to stabilise and we will focus on assisting our Local Government to leverage their services to enable growth in our province.

Speaker, with over a thousand pages of information, it is difficult to do these documents justice in such a short period of time. I certainly encourage members of this House to engage with the content so that we can come up together with innovative solutions to the challenges faced in our communities.

For our part, the Western Cape Government will be taking this information to every district through the District Coordination Forums. I am also pleased to announce that I will be establishing a Provincial Budget and Governance Forum with all Finance Mayco members across the province, with the first meeting taking place next month. The MERO will be unpacked in this forum, so that we can land responses to municipal budget processes.

Speaker, in my travels across the province... [Interjection.] [inaudible, speaking

simultaneously causing audio distortion.] ...wonderful, strong, resilient and innovative people. I feel so lucky not only to call this province home, but also to have the honour of serving its citizens. It is indeed a privilege to work with the Legislature and my Western Cape Government colleagues to ensure that this beautiful and unique place reaches its full potential. At the end of the day, the MERO empowers us with the data and evidence we need to do just this so that we govern for growth, and so that we enable opportunity, and so that we deliver the safety and wellbeing that our communities need to thrive.

It is therefore my pleasure to table the 2020/2023 Municipal Economic Review and outlook for consideration and deliberation in this Parliament.

I would like to thank the Local Government Budget Office within the Provincial Treasury for their immense effort in putting together this remarkable research report and especially their commitment to making the information easily accessible through creative design layout and especially the superb infographics will be shared with all of you shortly.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the entire Team Finance under the leadership of the Head Official, David Savage, and the immeasurable contribution made to supporting municipalities with both the PERO and the MERO so that they can govern for growth, and, of course, to all our Mayors, Deputy Mayors and Mayco members as well as Municipal Officials who are on the frontline of service delivery in the Western Cape, thank you for all that you do for the people of this province. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Do not take that away yet. Thank you, sir. We want to make sure the Minister gives us more money! [Laughter] Thank you, hon Minister.

### ORDERS OF THE DAY

**The Municipal Economic Review and Outlook, which is MERO, will now be referred to the relevant Standing Committee for consideration.**

**WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION [BILL, B – 2022] AND MEDIUM-TERM BUDGET POLICY STATEMENT (MTBPS).**

(Introduction and First Reading)

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. Hon members, I now recognise the hon Minister of Finance. Minister, over to you.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker. When I tabled the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook in this House in September, I made it clear that we had challenging times ahead of

us. The headwinds that confront us are indeed powerful. Our country is experiencing sluggish economic growth, high levels of unemployment and poverty, significant debt-service costs, a rising cost of living and a debilitating energy crisis.

In that speech, however, I also made it clear that there are promising opportunities that present themselves with a clear pathway ahead for us, from recovery to growth. This is a pathway that will deliver hope and confidence for our citizens. As the renowned author Helen Keller so aptly said:

“Optimism is the faith that leads to achievement. Nothing can be done without hope, and confidence.”

This “sober hope”, as I call it, is also evident in the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook, which I have just tabled, as we look to identify new opportunities to leverage in every corner of our province so that no person is left behind.

Armed with the rich data and analyses from these two reviews, and fully aware of the powerful headwinds that we face, it is now for us to navigate this journey from recovery to growth so that we reach our destination, and as with any difficult journey, we will need to adjust in the face of challenges so that we stay on course and keep our eyes firmly on the horizon and the future we hope to realize.

The Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement which I table before you today, is our opportunity to determine that course as we set sail to deliver a better tomorrow. The adjustment budget, which I also table before you today, is our opportunity to adjust the sails, resolute in remaining on that course and towards our shared goal, and what is that goal? To realise a better, more prosperous future for our citizens; a future with economic growth that leads to opportunity and job creation; a future which is safe and nurturing, no matter where you live; a future where your life journey is filled with care.

As Premier Alan Winde said to this Parliament, these priorities of Growth for Jobs, Safety and Wellbeing are the North Stars of this Government. Together they are the ingredients for real change. They are our reason for hope.

Speaker, as we pursue this difficult journey, we must do so in the context of an ongoing budget crunch in South Africa that continues to affect provincial budgets in particular. Slow to no growth, high levels of Government debt, bail-outs to failed State-owned Enterprises and state capture have meant that South Africa has less money to spend, precisely at the time when the demand is the greatest.

Over the 2023 Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) as a result of changes to how the equitable share formula is calculated, the Western Cape's percentage of the provincial pie is reduced. This equates to R1,9 billion less over the period for the horizontal division, and may be reduced even further as these changes are phased in.

Fortunately, over this period, additional allocations for service delivery pressures as well as conditional grants allocated to provinces will off-set this

decline marginally, allowing for a narrow 2,2% increase in funding for the Province over the MTEF. However, when considering our growing population and the high rate of inflation, which is not being factored into the allocation, it is obvious that we will have to do more with less. This trend is very worrying, and we need to have a frank conversation about this in this House. The consequences of not doing so, especially for poor residents across the country, will be severe.

Through our Fiscal Futures Project in the Provincial Treasury, we are now able to forecast our budget into the future using modelling. According to this modelling and after adjusting for inflation, by expressing the Budget in 2021/22 rands, we estimate that the Provincial Equitable Share for the Western Cape will effectively decline from R54,6 billion in 2021/22 to R49,6 billion in 2030/2031. Over the same period it is estimated that the City of Cape Town will grow by 882 000 people, equivalent to the population of Mangaung, while the Western Cape will grow by 1,25 million people or the equivalent of the population of the Nelson Mandela Bay Metro. To put it simply, we will likely be receiving less money to respond to what will be significant pressures on frontline services. The consequences of this gap could be catastrophic. The hard truth is that the National Government is trying to clean up the mess created by years of state capture, corruption and mismanagement, by squeezing provinces on the front line. It is a dangerous exercise, and so, it makes me very angry to hear that the National Government's Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, that some R30 billion will be provided to stabilise State-owned Enterprises. If that amount had instead been distributed to provinces to deliver frontline services using the Provincial Equitable Share the Western Cape would have received R3 billion more this year – almost equal to our Health Department's infrastructure budget for the next three years. It is, quite frankly, unjustifiable.

Speaker, another area of concern regarding our Provincial Equitable Share has been the decline in our share of funds distributed by the health component of the formula. Instead of acknowledging and incentivising the innovation which our Department of Health has championed, such as through tele-medicine and home medicine deliveries, we are effectively being penalised for it because the data is excluded in the calculation. Our citizen-centric approach means that we are working hard to prevent the sick from having to wait in long all-day queues at clinics, and instead, where possible, take healthcare to them, but this aspect of the formula only counts visits at clinics and therefore incentivises the wrong outcomes in our view.

If you, for example, include our additional data, it is clear that the demand on the health platform is at least equal to what it was in 2019 and our budget should reflect that. The reality is that healthcare does not just take place in brick-and-mortar buildings, and this is going to be the reality into the future as new technology emerges.

The PEAR's analysis of health services pressures is therefore outdated and must change, and we will certainly be making this point wherever we can.

Speaker, while we will be putting more pressure on National Government than

ever before to change this trajectory, we must ensure that we face up to this challenge. We must as George Washington said, “consult our means rather than our wishes.” Making these tough choices and difficult trade-offs will require us to be guided by sound budget principles, so that we can remain on course from recovery to growth.

These principles, in effect, are the compass that we will use to navigate the stormy seas that await us. We will do so firstly by acting to protect our core mandates so that we deliver life-saving and life-changing services such as healthcare, basic education and social services.

Secondly, this Government will focus on programmes that maximise impact in our priorities of jobs for growth, safety and wellbeing. Within the Western Cape Government this also includes a focus on innovation, organisational culture and effective governance.

Thirdly, we will act to enhance our Government's productivity by relentlessly focusing on doing more with less, delivering value for money projects. We will also continue to review and propose measures to streamline functions and activities across departments, and with municipalities through improved coordination and functional reassignment and, lastly, this Government will act to protect the long-term fiscal sustainability of the Province by ensuring that we rebuild reserves over the medium term, so that we remain resilient to shocks and by continuing with our cost of employment strategy to manage to manage headcount in our administration.

Steered by these principles and guided by our North Star priorities, we have a framework for hope, a plan to prepare for the future that we want to realise, so that every person can live a life that they truly value. To give effect to this framework for hope, the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement adds a total of R1,28 billion to spending over the next three years, bringing the total estimated expenditure for the Western Cape over the 2023 MTEF to R230,82 billion.

Firstly, to deliver on our priority of growth for jobs, we will add R466,5 million to the new Infrastructure and Mobility Departments over the MTEF, while R257,3 million will be added to our Education and Health Departments to expand critical infrastructure.

Over the 2023 MTEF, we are planning to spend R31,17 billion on infrastructure in the Western Cape. With low levels of economic growth in South Africa, worsened now by loadshedding, it is critical that we help unlock much higher levels of economic growth in the Western Cape, so that we can create opportunity. It is for this reason that we are currently formulating a new Growth for Jobs Strategy for the Province that will be finalised before the end of the financial year. At its core will be the understanding that governments do not create jobs, but rather create the enabling environment for entrepreneurs, business people and citizens to succeed. Through the strategy we want to achieve breakout economic growth and realise a provincial economy that is jobs rich and inclusive, so that citizens across the province, no matter where they live, can benefit, and we want to do this through enablement by providing the foundations for growth, by investing in infrastructure, energy and water,

transitioning to carbon zero, unlocking housing opportunities, and building reliable safe roadways, as well as delivering skills for the economy, all the while making it easier for businesses, big and small, to trade in the Western Cape. As we shift to this new strategy over the MTEF, we will look to adjust our sails so that we can achieve this objective and I look forward to making further announcements in the main budget in March next year.

Speaker, I was informed this morning that according to Eskom se Push App, which I am sure you all follow as closely as I do, that South Africa has now experienced 2 932 hours of load shedding or the equivalent of 122 days of interrupted power supply. Let me repeat that.

We have been deprived, we have deprived our country's economy of the energy it needs to grow for 1/3 of this year, and the year is not over yet. As we entered Stage-5 loadshedding this week it is clearer than ever before that we face a national emergency on the same level as the COVID-19 pandemic and, like the COVID-19 emergency, it requires urgent response. We therefore welcome Premier Alan Winde's establishment of a Cabinet Level Energy Council to coordinate immediate action over the next year as the energy crisis worsens. This Council brings together Government, citizens, businesses and civil society, leveraging the lessons that we learnt during the pandemic.

This coordination with interventions over the short term will be key, while we continue to put the foundations in place over the medium term for an energy resilient future, through the Municipal Energy Resilience (MER) Initiative. This programme is making important strides in unlocking energy opportunities by enabling municipalities, businesses and households to generate, procure and sell power. I would like to use the opportunity to share some of the updates with you this morning.

The key component of the MER Initiative is to enable and unlock municipal independent power producer procurement in candidate municipalities. Following a pre-feasibility analysis, Stellenbosch Municipality, as one of those candidates, will soon be supported with transaction advisory services to take the work from pre-feasibility through to feasibility procurement and contract finalisation.

In parallel to this process, a business case for a pooled buying mechanism is being developed, aimed at providing a lower risk and lower cost for municipal IPP procurement to multiple Western Cape municipalities. This was a key finding that emerged from our energy workshop, which I hosted shortly after being appointed in this position. To enable the private sector, work is also underway to map out large private sector energy users' current energy use and demand growth projections, as well as the alternative energy supply interventions and plans.

During 2023, the intention is to map this information against municipal grid capacity to enable and fast-track private sector implementation of small-scale embedded generation and electricity-wheeling solutions, where possible, and to support municipal readiness. In the last year, the Western Cape Government has provided funding to 10 municipalities for 16 foundational energy studies,

including the development and updating of electricity master plans, and cost of supply studies. We are now also in the process of having standardised legal agreements drafted for the use of municipal grids in wheeling transactions.

Day-by-day these efforts by our MER team are helping to ensure that we have systems in place to generate an additional 500 megawatts of power for the Western Cape by 2025 and we will constantly be looking at ways to focus, innovate and scale up so that this moves quicker.

Speaker, secondly to deliver on our safety priority, we will allocate an additional R200 million over the MTEF to continue the Law Enforcement Advancement Programme, ensuring that boots on the ground in crime hotspots continue to save lives. This brings the full allocation for LEAP over the 2023 MTEF to R900 million. This is because areas where LEAP officers were deployed showed an overall 3% reduction in the murder rate for the first half of this year, when compared with 2019. In the context of chronic police under-resourcing and high levels of policing and efficiencies, this data-led intervention remains a strategic priority for this Province. We however, know that law enforcement is only one side of the equation, and that we need to address both the causes and the consequences of crime. That is why we will also focus on the violence-prevention pillar of us of our safety response by strengthening relationships between caregivers, better support for youth at risk, reducing alcohol-related harms and preventing gender-based violence. We will do this by using our rich health data so that we can develop targeted responses that work in communities. I am also pleased to note that another critical element of our safety response, which is to leverage our constitutionally mandated police oversight role, is being ramped up with an organisational redesign underway in the Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety to enable this new emphasis, because we know that if the SAPS have the resources they need to do their job properly, many more lives will be saved in the Western Cape.

Speaker, lastly, to give effect to this framework of hope we will add R246,54 million to the wellbeing priority over the MTEF to support a comprehensive response to the very real social distress being experienced in our communities. This includes funding for an additional 170 social workers in the Western Cape. Overall, Health and Education will receive the lion's share of the Western Cape's Budget with a combined allocation of R168,9 billion or 73% of the total budget over the period. Our approach to this priority is to ensure the wellbeing of every citizen throughout their life journey so that they have dignity, so that they are cared for when they are ill or in distress, and so that they have the opportunity to pursue a better future.

We will do this by ensuring strong foundations, building social cohesion, meeting basic needs and protecting human rights. We will also improve access to ECD facilities, respond to learning losses in our education system, while protecting and nurturing psychosocial wellbeing in our communities.

A key focus area will also be to re-establish comprehensive healthcare in the context of the normalisation of our COVID-19 response with a new emphasis on non-communicable diseases such as mental health.

I am particularly excited to note the progress made in the preparation of a new

tertiary hospital on the Tygerberg Hospital site, with the first National Treasury approval granted in terms of the Private Public Partnership Regulations under the Public Finance Management Act (PFMA). To prepare for this multi-billion-rand partnership we have ring-fenced R995 million in the asset finance reserve over the MTEF so that we are prepared to deliver on our financial commitments.

Speaker, as we set course, to realise this better future and face the powerful headwinds ahead of us, we also need to ensure that our vessel, our vehicle for delivery can rise above the swells and sail through the storms. This is precisely why Premier Winde has put a strong emphasis on a fourth guiding priority for the Western Cape Government, and that is to ensure innovation, a thriving organisational culture and effective governance in our public service. By leveraging technology through encouraging a citizen-centric approach to our work, and by finding new and better ways to solve problems, we want to empower our employees in the Provincial Government to make an even bigger difference, and, in doing so, we want to ensure that our systems and processes help and not hinder the growth we have set out to achieve. With an exemplary clean audit record in this Province again demonstrated in the audit results of the last financial year, we now also need to step up a gear by ensuring that we move with speed and scale in improving the quality-of-service delivery in the Western Cape. The Province's procurement planning toolkits and in-house developed e-procurement solution will play a critical role in achieving this objective and is a demonstration of how we are embracing technology to improve supply-chain management.

Speaker, as the damning Zondo Commission reports on state capture proved, corruption is the enemy of progress. Corruption, as Pope Francis so powerfully put it, is paid by the poor. While the Western Cape's clean governance record is excellent, we know that we must continually find ways to strengthen our governance platform, ensuring strong oversight mechanisms and transparency.

Corruption must never be allowed to rear its ugly head in this Government and, to this end, we have and will continue to consider the Zondo Commission recommendations emanating from these reports, finding new ways to implement them where they are applicable, so that we strengthen our institutional processes, remain ahead of the curve and continue to be the best-run government in South Africa.

Speaker, as I mentioned in the start of my address, staying on our course from recovery to growth will require that we adjust our sails in the face of challenges. In the budget process, this is enabled through the tabling of the Western Cape Adjustment Budget, which is before you today. This is a budget that cares, making provision for a net addition of R490,6 million in expenditure for the 2022/23 financial year. In the face of high levels of unemployment brought on by the pandemic, there are many citizens who are battling across our province. They do not know where their next meal will come from. They are unable to find work and to provide for their children.

As a mother, the thought that a malnutrition-induced death of a child is now a real risk in our country, absolutely horrifies me, and it must motivate all of us to act. To ensure that we respond to these pressures and provide the care our

citizens deserve, R43,92 million will be allocated to fund additional social workers and alleviate pressure on case loads. A further R25 million has been allocated in the short term to fund food relief initiatives.

Another key focus area covered by this Adjustment Budget, is our Infrastructure and Mobility Priorities, which are critical for job creation. R96 million is allocated to the Department of Transport and Public Works to, amongst others, improve transport safety, and to cover the operational costs of GoGeorge. A further R128 million will be included for infrastructure programmes, including for the upgrading of road infrastructure.

Overall, in 2022/23, to keep us on our course from recovery to growth, we will have allocated R54,75 billion to our wellbeing priority, R15,87 billion to our growth for jobs priority, and R2,65 billion to our safety priority.

Speaker, embarking on this difficult journey will also require that we prepare to respond to the storms that we had not foreseen emerging, and by making sure that our vessel is robust and can weather any challenge. After experiencing a once-in-a-century drought, and then a once-in-a-century global pandemic we know too well that being prepared is essential. It is for this reason that we will recharge our Provincial Reserves with R1,46 billion being allocated for unforeseen and unavoidable expenses, which includes a contingency for unforeseen disasters, enabling a rapid and decisive response, should they occur.

One of the risks that we will need to manage is the uncertainty created by the ongoing wage negotiations with public sector unions led by the National Government. While we welcome the commitment by the National Government to cover the cost of any wage agreement reached and to not pass the cost on to provinces, the current allocation for the wage increase is only for the 2022/23 financial year. This means in effect that we have been forced into one year budgeting, unable to plan for spending over the MTEF. This creates high levels of uncertainty for our departments. We are closely monitoring developments and will continue through the Budget Council to engage with the National Government to ensure more certainty can be provided into the future.

For our part, we are also ensuring that we manage our cost of employment spending, which is our largest spending item. If left unchecked, it will result in less money going towards programmes that will make a difference in the lives of our citizens. So far prudent COE management has resulted in the Western Cape Government having the lowest number of employees per capita in comparison with other provinces yet offering undoubtedly the best service packages. We will continue to implement our COE Strategy with care, by taking a differential approach across departments so that they can manage their own headcounts and effectively deliver on our key service delivery priorities.

Speaker, I have today shared how this Government will set out on a pathway from recovery to growth so that we realise a better future for our citizens. There is no doubt that the course ahead of us will have many challenges, and that the headwinds will be strong, but there is every reason to have hope and confidence.

We have to guide us, our North Star priorities of delivering opportunity, safety and wellbeing for our citizens. We have to steer us, our budget principles, so that we stay on course during challenging times ahead. We have a vessel that is being strengthened to do more with less, so that we provide the quality services our citizens deserve. We can adjust our sails, as we have done now, so that we respond to the needs of our communities and we are ensuring that we can withstand storms that have yet to come so that we will, in the end, reach our goals. This is our framework for hope, a plan to realise a better, more prosperous future for our citizens.

In closing, I would like to recite one of my favourite poems by Emily Dickinson to inspire us on the journey ahead:

“Hope is the thing with feathers that perches in the soul  
and sings the tune without words and never stops at all.”

Speaker, it is my immense pleasure to table before the Provincial Parliament today, the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill 2022, the Western Cape Adjustments Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure, the Western Cape 2022 Draft Notice Additional and Amended Allocations to Municipalities, the Overview of Adjusted and Municipal Infrastructure Investment 2022, and the 2022 Western Cape Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, all of these for discussion and deliberation in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and its Committees.

I would like to thank our captain, Premier Alan Winde, for his wisdom and leadership and to extend my heartfelt gratitude to my fellow Cabinet colleagues for their support during this budget process. I would especially like to extend a big thank you to our world-class Treasury team who have burned the midnight oil to ensure that we present such excellent documents for your consideration. We applaud their efforts today.

I would also like to thank the Ministry, the A-Team under the leadership of Mr Russel Brueton for the tremendous work they have done in support of these important milestones, and finally, I would like to thank and acknowledge the wonderful support that I received from my family, who are indeed my inspiration. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, the Secretary will now read the Bill a first time.

†Die SEKRETARIS: Wes-Kaapse Aansuiweringsbegrotingswetsontwerp  
[W – 2022]

**[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]**

[The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B – 2022]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. The Bill, together with the papers tabled, will be referred to the relevant Standing Committee for consideration and report.

Hon members, we now move to the Question Paper. Thank you, hon Minister, once more. I know we overworked you this morning but, you know, it comes with the purse. [Laughter.] Thank you.

I see the hand of the hon Deputy-Chief Whip of the ANC.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, a quick one, can I just get a sense, because we have not received this yet in terms of our emails. I just wanted to get a sense whether we will be receiving these documents also online as well as soft copies, and when will that happen?

The SPEAKER: Okay. Alright, thank you, hon the Deputy Chief Whip. Yes, it will be shared with the hon members, if it has not been done so just yet, but it will be shared immediately. Is that all, hon member? Thank you. Oh, the hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, do you want to address the Presiding Officer?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, thank you very much, hon Speaker. I am rising in terms of Rule 66, which is a point of order, but also in terms of Rule 201 but also, hon Speaker, I take it that now we are going to go to Questions for Oral Reply?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. Rule 66 and Rule – ja, I like it now that we quote the Rules because at times I have to say, “What rule?” And the member scratches the head. Now I hear that the hon members are quoting the Rules, it is encouraging. So what is the point of order, hon Mvimbi, because we are getting to the questions, that is the next order here before us, hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Okay, let me wait then, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Oh, you are happy now that we go to the Questions?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Minister Meyer, you may address the Presiding Officer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I have the Rule Book in front of me. I think we can proceed.

The SPEAKER: [Laughs.] Order, hon Minister, thank you very much, hon members. May I draw the attention of the hon members that the Question Paper before us, there are questions from 1 to 4, we will not be dealing with those questions. The hon Premier asked to be excused. He has got other commitments.

**[Questions 1 to 4 for Oral Reply by the Premier, as printed on the Oral Question Paper of 10 November 2022, to stand over.]**

The SPEAKER: From Question Number 8, which is the Questions that stood over from the Sitting of 8 September 2022, as agreed to by the House, is where we will begin, and the first question as it reflects on the Question Paper is by hon Christians. I see hon member, is that a point [Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: On a point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Let the Speaker finish and then you will be given the opportunity. The question is by the hon Christians to the hon Minister Allen, who is the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety. Before I recognise the hon Minister, there is a point of order that is raised by hon member Mvimbi. What is your point of order, hon member Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. As we are dealing with Questions for Oral Reply and as you have indicated that it was a continuation of the meeting that was abruptly aborted in the previous Sitting of 10 November, firstly, as we are actually going to continue, we will actually have expected maybe there was going to be a report as to the outcomes of the reasons for the abortion of that previous session, but also, hon Speaker, noting further that there were the Questions for Oral Reply, there were questions that were going to be raised to the hon Premier, and the hon Premier has chosen not to be present at the meeting for the reason that you have actually expected, but also, hon Speaker, this is a show of disrespect for this august House for the Premier not to be present, and you know also, hon Premier, that there is a practice – although it is not written – that if an hon member, especially the member of the Executive, is not going to be present, he or she sometimes makes a courtesy call or a report or requests the particular members that have asked those questions, if those questions can actually be referred to. So, then I would like, hon Speaker, to put it on record that I... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Yes, you may proceed, to conclude?

Mr L L MVIMBI: I said that myself as one of the people who are on the list in terms of asking questions, there has been no communication that has been sent to me, either formally or informally, either in writing, because normally some of these are done in a courteous manner. I have asked Questions for Oral Reply in the past to quite a number of Executive members. Those Executive members will either make a courtesy call to me and say that “please, can we refer this”, and in most instances I have always actually complied with their request that they said, because I think it was just in the manner in which you all want to be cooperative. But then, hon Speaker, it is very disappointing that the Number 1 of the Province, when he is supposed to actually answer in this House, he chooses first to be absent... [Interjection.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...and he also makes no contact with the people that have asked questions.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. Order, hon Chief Whip, will you please take your seat, I will recognise you now. Firstly the hon member is correct, to say that ordinarily a member that will not be present will give the questions if that is so, if he or so deems fit, to a member of the Executive to deal with them, but there was a message by the hon Premier to that he will not be able to join us here this morning, which I then noted as a request made to me formally, but also if I could just say I was not the Presiding Officer on the Sitting of 10 November. That then places the responsibility on the Presiding Officer of that day to deal with whatever else that might be necessary emanating from that Sitting. I have, however, as the Chief Presiding Officer and as the Speaker of this House, and this Parliament, convened a meeting with the respective Whips, the Chief Whips of the political parties and the leaders of minority parties, where we deliberated on how this House should conduct its business, and that is in keeping with the statutes, but of course our Standing Rules that are here should guide this session, and I think that engagement brought some light into how this House should not allow itself to degenerate into what may have been the unfortunate situation of the 10th.

Now we did not deal with the specificity of what transpired on the 10th because that was not a tribunal, nor some kind of an inquiry, but I have a responsibility as the Speaker, and of course when I preside, it is the responsibility like any other Presiding Officer to ensure that there is a spirit of collegiality, the spirit of this Parliament, being a democratic Parliament, a multi-party Parliament of all of us as the respective members coming from all the different seven parties here. I would not want to be drawn into why the Premier cannot answer here. The Acting Chief Whip is now going to address the Speaker.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. My point of order was on Rule 66(3) since member Mvimbi was perhaps still reading the whole of Rule 66 in the book, and it relates to a matter that relates to Procedure, Practice and Operations of this House and other matters and three Ministers did indicate to this House that they are asking for the Oral Questions to stand over. That was because the questions on the Order Paper for today, are from a previous Order Paper. As is the general practice in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, should a Minister not be able to be in the House, they ask for the respective questions to be stood over. Therefore, the previous point of order is actually not a point of order. Interpellations as well as the Questions to the Premier and two other Ministers are standing over for today and the sequence of proceedings was earlier today adopted in this House, and no-one objected to that. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Acting Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. I see all the hands virtually and here. There was a hand by the hon, the Leader of the Opposition and then there is another hand from the hon, the Deputy Chief Whip of the Opposition. I recognise the hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, thank you, and

greetings to members. Speaker, thank you, and greetings to members. Speaker, just to address you on this point, I would like to thank you for explaining your attempts to convene a meeting so that we maintain order in the House. I think all of us have an interest in making sure that what happened at the last session is not repeated and that we establish order and decorum, but that we also look at the issues which lead to these situations, but I think your efforts are appreciated in terms of that particular intervention responding to the letter, which we wrote to you.

The second point is that as hon Mvimbi has indicated, there is a precedent in the House, which I think is covered by Rule 66(3) in the sense that there is communication from the member of the Executive, including the Premier, to the member concerned. In this particular instance – and I speak here for myself as well – there was no communication from the Premier to myself making that request. We all know that the President never misses questions in the House, and I think that we need to raise our concern that the Premier is accountable to this House. He was elected by this House and needs to follow the convention which has been set in this House. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon, the Leader of the Opposition. Just to address that point, hon, the Acting Chief Whip, ordinarily Ministers would talk to the members asking questions. I also want to ask now, as the Speaker, the Leader of Government Business to address this House.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker and thank you to the members who asked these particular questions. There is a convention in this Cabinet but also in this House, that whenever a member of the Executive is not available, that that member makes contact through the office of the various members. That convention still stands. That convention is the practice, and it is a practice of good governance. There are some specific circumstances that has led to this situation of the Premier having another commitment, and that commitment he has made towards meeting people, but if the situation was under control in the previous session, it would not have been happening what is currently happening, so we have to collectively, and as the Leader of Government Business, I take collective responsibility for what has happened and the Presiding Officer for what has happened, and all members in this House were jointly responsible for what has happened in this House, and so that situation has led to the current situation where the Premier is not here today. But unlike what is happening in some other parts of the country, this is the only Premier that receives Questions to the Premier Without Notice and he is committed, as per the values of this Government, to accountability. He will come back to this House. He is not avoiding accountability. The principle of this Cabinet is accountability and integrity, and the Premier will come back to the House at an appropriate stage. If there was any misunderstanding in some communication as Leader of the Government Business, I apologise, and I ask us to proceed.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon, the Leader of Government Business. There is an apology, hon, the Leader of the Opposition, and the rest of the hon members in the House.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Apology accepted, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, that is leadership, and I really appreciate the collective wisdom that the leaders of this House are able to showcase so that we are able to have a Parliament those functions, without us being seen as one of the worst examples we have seen elsewhere in the world.

May I now at this point proceed. Thank you.

### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape has experienced an average growth rate of 17 901 learners entering our education system over the past five years. This means as of this year there were 1 117 080 being taught in our schools.

With more learners seeking quality education, the demand for capacity naturally increases. Owing to this demand the Western Cape Education Department has announced that it would be constructing an additional 842 classrooms in the current financial year, which far exceeds the construction of 212 classrooms last year. In doing so it will provide at least 26 000 places for learners.

It also means that the Western Cape's ground-breaking initiative will be almost 70% larger than the 499 classrooms which Gauteng announced it will construct at the beginning of the year.

Thanks to the R830 million increase in the WCED's infrastructure budget this year, it means that 164 classrooms have already been built. A further 510 classrooms are planned for completion by January 2023, with the remaining 168 by March 2023.

Coupled to the extra 1 143 teachers being appointed to start in the new academic year, the construction of these classrooms is crucial to sustaining our learning efforts.

The DA in the Western Cape welcomes and congratulates the hard work which the Department does on a daily basis, and we look forward to this infrastructure allowing the province to continue to provide quality education to all learners. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Member

I now recognise the African National Congress.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... hon member Nkondlo is now on the floor.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. You may proceed, hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The ANC wishes once again to note the qualified audit report received by Wesgro for the 2021/2022 financial year. The ANC is not surprised with the slow demise of this engine room of economic growth opportunities and tourism in our province.

The slow demise of Wesgro started with the appointment of Tim Harris as CEO of the agency, an appointment with all the characteristics and covered in DA cadre deployment. When this DA political appointee wanted an exorbitant salary contrary to the realities of COVID-19 when millions were losing their jobs, the DA was more comfortable with seeing board members resign than resist DA indulgence in a state entity.

When the ANC was governing the Western Cape, one of our focus areas for Wesgro was that we used the entity to promote trade, tourism and to access the West Coast of Africa region in particular. [Inaudible.] remains one of the most strategic economic regions in our continent. Only recently has Wesgro redirected their attention to the African market.

While we continue to welcome visitors from North America and Europe, we must note the myopic view that this Provincial Government has had in only focusing on these markets. Since the ANC-governing days we have urged that we start focusing on the African, Middle East and Asian markets.

The qualified audit report follows this long list of unfortunate mishaps and failure in governance at Wesgro. Even more so Wesgro has come to concentrate on strengthening, empowering old money in our province rather than ensuring the benefit and empowerment of black SMMEs.

We urge the Western Cape Provincial Government to ensure good governance in Wesgro and refrain from everything what really amounts to a racist approach to tourism. In fact, maybe it is time that Wesgro and its board in particular receive a session in diversity training. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The Economic Freedom Fighters condemns the Western Cape-led Democratic Alliance Government's useless Safety Plan that continues to waste taxpayers' money whilst crime in the province continues to be on the rise.

In the financial year alone, this Government availed more than R400 million for purposes of the Law Enforcement Advancement Plan, which is LEAP, which was intended to fight crime in the province. The purpose of this plan was to utilise Law Enforcement as a machinery to combat crime. However, reality shows that this plan is nothing but a pipedream which unluckily achieves the

opposite.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the second quarter crime statistics for the 2022/2023 financial year placed the Western Cape in the second position when it comes to 17 community-reported serious crimes trends over the three months period, July to September 2022 however, with the Cape Town Central Police Station leading the pack in the number one spot. The Western Cape continues to experience a high number of contact crimes in the country, with Nyanga leading the rest as the number one spot, followed by Mfuleni in third place and Harare, wrapping up to the top ten of townships in the country with a high level on contact crime.

Another concerning issue is the rise of sexual crime incidents in the province, which include sexual offences, sexual assault, and rape. There is a shocking increase in these crimes when one compares this to the previous financial year in the same period of July to September, with sexual offences increasing from more than 1,400 incidents to more than 1,800 incidents. Similarly, hon Deputy Speaker, cases of rape also increased with most incidents experienced in townships such as Delft and Harare, whilst Mitchells Plain and Manenberg lead the whole country when it comes to sexual assault cases. This is evident, hon Deputy Speaker, that Law Enforcement remains useless and instead of tackling and combatting crime, they are busy focusing on evictions of poor people in informal settlements and terrorising homeless people within the city. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon members, the two-day taxi minibus shutdown at the beginning of this week, came as the Western Cape Department of Mobility had to make the difficult decision to suspend the Blue Dot taxi programme. Although the Department would prefer to continue with the programme, it is unfortunate that this must come to an end, as the hon Minister Daylin Mitchell has stated, due to the lack of funding. Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA supports Santaco's right to protest, but we strongly condemn the kind of strike action that is violent and that is an impediment to economic activity. The Western Cape taxi bus service suffers the daily loss of R9 million due to the shutdown, but the local economy and the direct impact on the commuters of this province is far worse and immeasurable.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the people of this province cannot be held to ransom by criminal elements within the taxi industry. These elements continue to commit all these horrendous crimes and as yet, we have seen few prosecutions. These criminal actions are designed solely to sabotage the economy and intimidate the people of this province and may no longer be tolerated. ...[Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker? Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...and SAPS must make sure that those involved

must be found and must be apprehended. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): But here, this House ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...has now called on the National Prosecuting Authority and the Minister of Justice, Ronald Lamola, to take into consideration the establishment of a specialised prosecuting unit that will be responsible for prosecuting acts of violence and destruction of public infrastructure. The Standing Committee of Transport of all political parties were also united in the condemnation of these violent crimes committed by individuals in the taxi industry. To ensure those are accountable for lawlessness, they must be brought to justice, and we will work together to achieve this. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mackenzie, but I am sure you are going to be devastated to see that we actually did not see you because your phone was in front of your face. So, we heard you clearly, but unfortunately on record, you were behind a telephone. But no problem, I know that hon Maseko wanted to alert you in time, but it is on record. So, not a problem. Thank you very much. We now recognise GOOD.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second, one minute, hon member. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Well, hon Deputy Speaker, can the technical team just assist hon member Bakubaku-Vos. I know she has been having troubles to log in. Can the team please just assist her? Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. If the IT can assist, thank you. Over to you, to the GOOD party.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Deputy Speaker, the funding for the Western Cape Government made available to combat the increase of crime in rural communities, is a complete joke. While the City of Cape Town enjoys a R1.3 billion cash injection delivered over a five-year period to fund the Law Enforcement Advancement Plan (LEAP), district municipalities in the rural Western Cape got a mere R730 000 towards anti-crime initiatives. We need to ask ourselves how is this possible?

Practically, the Provincial Department of Community Safety and Police Oversight held safety summits as the all-in-all to strengthen rural security. But considering that they are planning on having their third summit so far and we are almost in the final stretch of this political term, it can well be established that this Department and the Provincial Government do not care about the protection of our rural communities.

The hon MEC confirmed in this House that there has been a constant shift in crime operations moving to rural communities and they have noted a 28% escalation to this effect. We ask ourselves what this Government is doing to counter the opportunistic escalations? The answer: a menial budget of R730 000 to save lives and livelihoods. In comparison to the City of Cape Town where the DA's glorified sheriff gets shiny new toys when he barks loudly enough, the answer to rural safety is a talk shop.

Hon Deputy Speaker, if one should read the hon MEC's response to yesterday's crime stats, it is revolting. The focus again is solely placed on the city, whereas murder increased in the province by 3,9% in comparison to last year. No solutions for our rural counterparts, no plan, no resources. Instead, we use taxpayers' money to fund crime reduction in the crown jewel of the DA, the City. This, at the expense of people who are suffering just as much from murder, rape, robberies, brutality, and community unrest. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Before we proceed to the ACDP, I would just like to interject, it is my right as Presiding Officer, to welcome the new hon member, hon Isaac Mbulelo. Hon member Mbulelo ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Sileku.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sileku, my apologies there. I wrote it wrong. Hon Sileku, a very warm welcome to this House and I wish you all the best in your job and your mandate as an hon member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. Wishing you all the best. [Applause.] I will now call on the hon ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, as the ACDP, we are opposed and I stress again, we did it before and we are doing it again, against the draft guidelines on gender identity and sexual orientation. Today, in front of this Legislature, almost 200 members of the ACDP came to protest against these unisex toilets that they want to introduce and now, the Department of Basic Education has also now jumped on the bandwagon with the same policy.

The other problem at our schools, and I am so grateful for hon Minister David Maynier, with these ungodly blasphemous workshops, diversity workshops that happened at Fish Hoek and it would have been rolled out to Rondebosch. These things are unacceptable. You know, what is happening in our schools, our learners are already confused and then they get indoctrinated with wrong things. I mean, if we look: already the crimes are up of by 18,5%, contact crime in the Western Cape is up by 21%, and then we want to have ungodly diversity workshops and we want to have unisex toilets at our schools.

We believe with these workshops are confusing our learners and remember, 800 learners were affected at the Fish Hoek High School, they have to go for trauma counselling after that. And I have said it before, and I have written to the hon Minister. The hon Minister said these workshops are terminated.

These diversity workshops are terminated, but our children must go through this. There were 800 children in those workshops and no teachers were allowed in those workshops. I cannot understand because the hon Minister was forewarned on 4 July and again in July, not to continue and this person came in and produced those workshops.

So, the ACDP are against the introduction of these ungodly laws, these blasphemous laws. I mean, it hurts me as a Christian at the poem that was read in this workshop. It hurts me, it irks me. My blood boils. So, that is why we protested today and say no, no, to unisex toilets and no, no, to blasphemous diversity workshops. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the ANC. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Bakubaku-Vos does not seem to be in the House. Can I ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, can I just check if hon Bakubaku-Vos is able to hear us? Can I just ask, while I move on, that the IT please make contact with her. We will move on to the Democratic Alliance, thank you.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. As is often the case with technological advancements, governments are usually slow to keep up with and adopt new developments. As more South African citizens and businesses explore the possibilities of Web3 Integration and Innovations, the Government will have to become increasingly adaptive. It is not a choice. Of course, the Western Cape Government is already paving its way in this front. In July, Wesgro launched a game on the popular online gaming platform, Roblox metaverse, allowing users to experience Table Mountain virtually. The game has already been a massive success with 88,000 views, 30,000 clicks, an 84% approval rating and an average game time of ten minutes, which is ten times that of the Roblox average.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the pioneer of change, particularly in the tech industry, is of the private sector as it should be and our role in Government should always be to support and enable this. Testament to this is that Pick n Pay recently announced that it would be adopting Bitcoin Lightning payments at 29 of its stores. This is historic. This further took place during the same week that Cape Town hosted the two-day Africa Fintech Summit for the very first time, which was touted as being the most successful summit that the Fintech Summit has had to date.

I further want to note that I am very glad that some of our Standing Committee members from Finance and Economic Opportunities joined us as we attended this summit, helping to ensure that we do keep apace with innovation.

Web Integration is making inroads in our province, and we must enable our province, in the hon Premier's words, to create a crypto Cape. That is why national and subnational governments, as well as their entities, must move quickly to support this and be adaptive. There is immense potential in this

sector for Government business. Blockchain, for example, has the potential to disrupt and improve SCM processes, recording title deeds through its decentralised and transparent leisuers.

The fact of the matter is that we are already in the fourth wave, the Fourth Industrial Revolution, and we cannot ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): ...be seen to be left behind. It is no longer a buzzword. That is why I am extremely encouraged by the work already underway by the Western Cape Government, as well as this province's private sector. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, are you on yet? I am still going to give her a bit of time. I will then move over to the Freedom Front Plus. Hon Marais, are you doing a Statement today?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Yes, certainly, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you very much for the opportunity.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): The Freedom Front Plus wishes to announce with great elation, the result of a by-election yesterday in Groot Drakenstein Ward 17. Our candidate, Pierre Du Toit, polled 41% of the votes against the DA's 49%, remembering that the DA had taken the seat with an overwhelming majority in 2021. This shows tremendous growth for the Freedom Front Plus from 13% in 2021 of the votes to 41% yesterday.

This follows closely on our great victory in Limpopo a few weeks ago, where the Freedom Front Plus won Bela-Bela's seat, which was considered a safe DA seat, by polling 58,3% of the votes against the DA's mere 35%. This is extraordinary if you keep in mind that the DA won this seat with 85% of the votes in 2021. It could only get 35% now.

We therefore wish to thank the voters for their continued support for the Freedom Front Plus and look with great expectations to 2024 when a new co-government scenario might present itself and emerge because the era of majority rule is fading rapidly. Thank you, voters, for your confidence in the Freedom Front Plus ...[Interjection.]

Mr D PLATO: Ah, shame!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, thank you very much. Hon member, what is your point of order?

Mr D PLATO: I just want to ...[Interjection.]

†The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Die DA gaan huil. Die DA gaan huil.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The DA is going to cry. The DA is going to cry].

Mr D PLATO: ...hon Marais. The Democratic Alliance: he does not mention all the other wards across the country won by the Democratic Alliance. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Plato, that is not a point of order.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Die DA huil nou, hulle huil.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The DA is crying now, they are crying.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjection.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die ANC kan nie eers 'n konferensie hou nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The ANC is not even able to hold a conference.]

†Me N D NKONDLO: Jy moet ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms N D NKONDLO: You must ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: Congratulations, hon member Marais.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, are you online? I do not know if you ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, who am I referring to?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): It is hon Lulama Mvimbi.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, yes.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes, I will be reading the Statement by the African National Congress.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, one minute, hon Mvimbi. I will allow it, but in terms of Rule 145(3), usually we do not, but as a Presiding Officer, I will give you that permission to read it on behalf of hon Bakubaku-Vos. You may proceed.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, for your discretion. Hon Deputy Speaker, the month of November marks the beginning of the 16 Days of Activism against Gender-Based Violence under the theme of 'UNITE! Activism to end violence against women and girls.'

†Xa singena kule nyanga, ndifuna sithatha eli thuba sukhumbule onke amaxhoba akhe adlwenuglwa abulawa ngamadoda, kuquka uBam Tshirayi Madzimo, Dimpho Skelenge, Nomaphelo Sifuba, Oyinene Mkrwetyana, nabanye abaninzi. Iinkcukaca manani ebezikhutshwe ngamapolisa zibonisa ukuba amaxhoba athe adlungulwa phakathi kukaAprili noJuni 2022 ame ku1115 babantu. Loo ngumcelimngeni odinga ubambiswano kurhulumente kazwelonke namaphondo kwakunye noomaspala basebenzisane noluntu. Ukusukela ngo2019, oko bendisenza isimemo kulo rhulumente wepondo ukuba makunywuswe amanani we-trauma centres kwakunye ne-safe houses for women and children. Endaweni yoko, loo rhulumente weNtshona Koloni, ubonisa ukungakhathali ngokuba usuke wavala amaziko afana neKhayamnandi Women and Children's Safehouse awayekuthembisile ngaphambili ukuba bancedisa ukuze bafumane inkxaso kaRhulumente.

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[As we start this month, I would like us to take the opportunity to remember all rape victims who have been raped and killed by men. These victims include uBam Tshirayi Madzimo, Dimpho Skelenge, Nomaphelo Sifuba, and Oyinene Mkrwetyana. Reports provided by the police show a figure of 1,115 cases between April to June 2022. The national government and all the provincial governments need to work together to fight this problem. Since 2019, an invitation has been sent to this province to increase the number of trauma and safe houses for women and children. Instead of doing that, this Western Cape government showed disregard by closing houses like the Khayamnandi Women and Children's Safehouse, after the safehouse had been assured that it would receive help and support from the government.]

I wish to take this opportunity to commend President Cyril Ramaphosa and his Government for successfully hosting the Second Presidential Summit on Gender-Based Violence and Femicide. National Government has made steady progress in the fight against GBV since the last summit, including the upgrading of 83 courts into sexual offence courts, establishing GBV shelters in 45 out of 52 districts across the country, mainstreaming gender issues to be included in the budget.

In January, three key pieces of legislation were signed into law, namely the Criminal Law (Sexual Offences and Related Matters) Amendment Act, the Criminal and Related Matters Amendment Bill ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): ...and The Domestic Violence Amendment Bill. †URhulumente wethu kudingeka enza kakhulu...lukhulu ukulwa naloo celimngeni we GBV ukuquka ukumamela zonke izikhalazo beziveliswe kule ndibano yokugqibela ibibizwe nguMongameli.  
[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Our government needs to work hard in fighting with GBV problem, this means they have to listen to all complaints that have been raised in the last assembly that was called by the President.]

Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise not on a point of order, but to thank you for your indulgence, hon Deputy Speaker, for letting hon member Mvimbi do the Statement. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Much appreciated. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now ...[Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The crime rate in the Western Cape is not decreasing, it is not decreasing as the DA-led Province wants the people to believe. The latest quarterly crime stats are no different to that of August 2022, as reported in the stats report on the crime in the province. This Province must stop fooling the people that it is managing crime effectively. The Western Cape is the second province with the highest number of recorded murders. Delft and Nyanga are amongst the top four stations with the highest reported rape and murder cases.

Earlier this week, a kidnapping of a teenage girl took place from her father's tuckshop. We have hardly recovered from the eight-year-old Abirah's kidnapping. Thank God for her safe return. We need this Provincial Government to be focused on the crisis in our communities and how to solve it, and not waste resources on measures to have the Province's policing powers devolved. These calls are nothing more than a political tool by the DA or is this DA-run Province playing with the lives of people in the Cape Flats and in the townships?

The areas previously identified as hotspots remain the same – Nyanga, Delft, Kraaifontein, Philippi East, Harare, Khayelitsha, Mfuleni, Gugulethu, Samora Machel – where the high crime rates remain unchanged. These are places where one is most likely to get murdered. I am not even including some areas as Mitchells Plain, Hanover Park, Manenberg and others, which are riddled with gangsterism and crime. Interpersonal arguments and gang violence have been identified as the major contributors to murders. Shebeens, which are so notoriously prominent in our townships and on the Cape Flats, are springboards

for murders and criminal activities.

Where are the LEAP officers? Where are the LEAP officers at these hotspots for crime? The Department boasts that crime has dropped ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...in areas where LEAP officers have been deployed. If that is the case, surely the deployment of ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...LEAP officers should be in the areas ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...identified as high risks? The police and LEAP officers know who...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...the gangsters ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Apologies, your time is up.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr C Fry (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, on Tuesday, 8 November, the South African National Space Agency and the United States' National Aeronautics and Space Administration signed a groundbreaking agreement to commence the building of a Deep Space ground station right here in the heart of the Western Cape in the town of Matjiesfontein. This agreement means that our province of the Western Cape will play a significant role in once again, putting man and the first women on the moon. The Matjiesfontein site will be one of three lunar exploration ground sites around the world. This project's 18 to 24 metre communication antennae will ensure near continuous connectivity between astronauts on NASA's Artemis spacecraft and those who will walk around the lunar surface.

The DA in the Western Cape is over the moon with this agreement and the investment into the province's space technology economy. This venture will not only make massive leaps in expanding space science in the province but will also foster interest in this field within the local Central Karoo region. In addition to this, the programme is expected to be a valuable boost into the Matjiesfontein and Central Karoo economy by attracting new visitors and contributing to job creation efforts. Hon Premier Alan Winde said that the project has the potential to launch the Western Cape Government's skills development drive beyond the

limits of earth.

The location of the lunar exploration ground-site in the province is therefore, further proof that our Province is open for business not just locally, not just internationally, but to infinity and beyond. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] Thank you very much, hon members. In accordance with Rule 145(6), I now allow one or more hon members of the Executive to respond to the Member Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. I recognise hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would like to respond to the Member Statement by hon Nkondlo. I think she will be absolutely delighted to learn that Wesgro has so far this year participated in the ICCA chapter and knowledge exchange focused on business development in Africa.

The Wesgro Convention Bureau attended the Spotlight to Africa roadshow in Kenya, focusing on B2B markets, followed by the Business Event Workshop and Lead Development in Kenya for business events. Wesgro exhibited at Magical Kenya. Wesgro participated in the fifth African Tourism Leadership Forum in Botswana. It led the SA Chef Campaign which targeted food and wine audience aimed at the African market.

Wesgro participated at the On Show Africa Showcase and the Wesgro lead in Air Access. As a result of the good work done by the Air Access team, we now have new flights from Air Mauritius into Cape Town and a direct flight into Maputo. Air Rwanda has doubled its flights at the start of this month and TAAG Angola have doubled their frequency for the summer season as well. And one of the strategic priorities for Air Access is working very hard to make sure that we can increase connectivity to West Africa, and Nigeria and Ghana in particular. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Minister. Please stop the clocks. Hon member, do you have a point of order, hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, I have a point of order. Hon Deputy Speaker, I think in terms of the Rules that you quoted where you allow hon Executive members to respond, there is only one hon Executive member that is allowed, and I think hon Wenger has already responded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, so I will read the Rule to you. In

accordance with Rule 145(6) I now allow:

“...one or more members of the Executive.”

So, we are in line with the Rules. I trust that is okay. We can proceed. Over to hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, if I can be as clear as possible. Hon Deputy Speaker, in our country during the last quarter, we have seen that murders increased by 13,6% across our country. We will never want to mince the stats because we have seen that yes, there was an increase in murders here in the Western Cape of 3,9%. However, where LEAP officers are deployed, we have seen a reduction across our priority areas. We would want to ensure that we continue doing everything in our power to make sure that our communities are safer.

Hon Deputy Speaker, if we consider where would our Province have been if it was not for LEAP and that is the question that I would want residents together with members of this House, to realise that where would we have been in terms of our crime categories if it was not for LEAP. We have now over 151 SAPS stations. In 2018, we had a figure, a granted establishment. We are now in 70% of those stations, less members. Our stations have 70% less members than what they had five years ago, hon Deputy Speaker. Where would we have been if it was not for LEAP officers contributing towards reducing crime?

The AGU that plays a huge role towards combatting gangsterism, has a 38% vacancy rate in their granted establishment. Where would we have been, hon Deputy Speaker, if it was not for the extra boots on the ground? We have seen the K9 Units in the South African Police Service being reduced by 27%. If it was not for LEAP officers, where would we have been? The murder rate would have been so much worse here in our Province because even though there are increases in eight of the provinces, the Western Cape had the lowest increase.

But that is nothing to boast about. We will never boast about a figure like that. We would want to be as real with residents, hence we are asking for stakeholders, CPFs, Neighbourhood Watch to continue to work with us as we want to reduce crime. But we are seeing crimes being made. So, when crime is used as a political tool, it upsets me, it upsets residents and it upsets many people in this House, hon Deputy Speaker, because we know we can never want to play politics with the lives of our young people, with our women, with our men that are dying as a result of gangsterism and of crime activities.

So, we want to be real, but we are saying: where would we have been, hon Deputy Speaker, if those extra deployments, LEAP officers, were not on the ground? Would we have been on the level of the Eastern Cape that had a 31,3% increase in the murder rate? Would we have been on the level of the Northern Cape that had a 27,2% increase in the murder rate. Would we have been on the Gauteng level of seeing a 19,6% increase in the murder rate? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Unfortunately, hon Minister Maynier ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...the time has come to an end for five minutes. Unfortunately ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Mvimbi, a point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I do not know which Rule 145 you were reading because if we go to Rule 145(6), it says:

“At the conclusion of Statements by members, one Minister present may be given an opportunity to respond for not more than five minutes, to any Statement or Statements.”

So, that is why I just did not want it to look as if I am going to be disruptive to the process, but I thought that I needed to allow the hon Minister to finish so that I can alert you to this Rule.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I will respond, but I see the hon Acting Chief Whip. Over to you.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I also have my Rule Book in front of me and perhaps, hon member Mvimbi has a previous Rule Book in front of him before the Rules were amended. But in terms of the latest amendment, Rule 145 subsection 6 clearly it is written:

“At the conclusion of Statements by Members, one or more members of the Executive may be given an opportunity to respond for more than five minutes to any Statement or Statements.”

Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Mvimbi and you might just want to check and throw those old Rule Books away because they can easily get mixed up with the one of March 2021, which is the latest Rule Book. I trust that is in order with you, hon Mvimbi. That brings us to the end of Member Statements ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: No, I am saying thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are most welcome. I would just like to quickly consult with the Whips of both, of all the parties. Would you like to suspend the

House for a lunch break, or would you like to push through to Motions? I am happy to take direction from the ANC or the other members. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I think we can push through. That is my suggestion because we have only got Motions and the Declaration. So, I think we can push through. I am sure we are not that hungry and starving.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Baartman ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Deputy Speaker?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Since none of us here in this House are fat cat politicians, my suggestion from the Majority Party is that we get through the Order Paper.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am happy to proceed. We will continue. Thank you very much, hon members. That is the end of Member Statements. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Deputy Speaker?

## **MOTIONS**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move over to Notices of Motion. In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motions by hon members must be delivered to the Secretary for placement on the Order Paper. Accordingly, these Motions have been submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

## **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

### **PREGNANT LEARNER WAS PREVENTED FROM WRITING THE ENGLISH**

(Motion)

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the incident where a pregnant learner was prevented from writing the English FAL P1 examination paper in the National Senior Certificate 2022.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

---

**IMPLEMENTING THE OBJECTIVES OF EDUCATION WHITE PAPER 6**

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the progress the Western Cape has made in delivering inclusive education for learners, with emphasis on implementing the objectives of Education White Paper 6.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

**CHANGING OF BY-LAWS**

(Motion)

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the changing of by-laws from permits to registration for informal traders to remove the unnecessary red tape required for permits and thereby opening the informal trading sector to more indigent people who are struggling to survive.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

**PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES**

(Motion)

Mr S N AUGUST: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates a Provincial Government assessment on the barriers of entry that keep persons with disabilities unemployed in Western Cape government departments; that the Western Cape Government considers employing a greater percentage of persons with disabilities in the various departments and provincial state-owned enterprises; and that measures of accessibility be adopted to ensure disabled people can access public transport, public buildings and public services.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

**DISRUPTION THAT AFFECTS SOME GRADE 12 LEARNERS**

(Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the disruption that affects some Grade 12 learners and prohibits them from writing examinations, including the pregnant learner who was denied writing her final examination and another learner who could not write the first paper because of outstanding school fees.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

### **CONSTRUCTION PROJECT: THE MANENBERG SCHOOL OF SKILLS**

(Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates yet another delay to the R84 million construction project of the Manenberg School of Skills.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

### **ONGOING TAXI VIOLENCE: VRYGROND, RETREAT**

(Motion)

Ms A P BANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing taxi violence between gang members and taxi drivers in Vrygrond, Retreat, that is now affecting commuters.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

### **AUDIT OPINION FOR WESGRO**

(Motion)

Mr L L MVIMBI: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the qualified audit opinion for Wesgro.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

### **CRIME AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE**

(Motion)

Mr M KAMA: I give notice that I shall move:

---

That the House debates the prevalence of crime and substance abuse in the province.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move to Motions without Notice. Hon members, please note that in terms of the Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 8 November 2022. Hon members would further remember that the Motions without Notice on congratulatory and condolence matters will not be allowed in this sitting if the Programming Authority has not processed them.

In this regard, the Tabling Staff informs me that in the Programming Authority meeting of 8 November 2022, political parties submitted the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and indicated their respective members with the desire to move a Motion without Notice in this sitting of the House.

I will therefore, just for noting and for the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved. The Programming Authority approved the following members' motions as follows: hon Murray, hon Van der Westhuizen, hon America, hon Kaizer-Philander, hon Bosman, hon Bosman, hon Bosman, hon Lekker, hon Kama, hon Dugmore, hon Kama, and hon Brinkhuis.

### **PICK N PAY ADOPTING BITCOIN PAYMENTS**

(Motion)

Ms C MURRAY: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Pick n Pay for adopting bitcoin payments at its retail stores; notes that this follows a recent trial that occurred at 29 of its stores in the Western Cape; notes that, not only is this an innovative step towards ensuring financial inclusion, but it is also an important development in achieving a cashless society; and we look forward to them pioneering in this regard.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

**TENTH ANNIVERSARY OF THE FARM WORKER STRIKES**

(Motion)

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I move without notice:

That the House commends the efforts by the agricultural sector and related role players in the Western Cape for maintaining peace and calm on farms across the province, despite the worrying attempts by certain individuals to incite discord on Wednesday, 2 November 2022 in commemoration of the tenth anniversary of the farm worker strikes of November 2012.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]***CONGRATULATES FIREFIGHTERS FROM THE CITY OF CAPE TOWN**

(Motion)

Mr D AMERICA: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates firefighters from the City of Cape Town, the Cape Winelands District Municipality and CapeNature for extinguishing two potentially disastrous veld fires in the Du Toitskloof Pass and on Table Mountain over the last month; notes that their rapid and efficient responses demonstrate that the Western Cape is prepared for the summer fire season; and they should be commended.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]***CONGRATULATES THE GROOTE SCHUUR HOSPITAL**

(Motion)

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Groote Schuur Hospital for prioritising the mental health of its staff; notes that on 1 November, Minister Mbombo officially opened their Wellness Centre which houses several facilities such as a gym, a yoga class and a meditation room; notes that all-in-all, this centre will be accessible to more than 4 000 staff members; and notes that by taking care of our healthcare workers, we take care of our patients.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

**CAPE TOWN NETBALL FEDERATION PRESIDENT. MARSHA WAGENAAR**

(Motion)

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House sends its condolences to the family of the retired Cape Town Netball Federation President. Marsha Wagenaar, who passed away after a short illness on 29 October; notes that, with dedication and professionalism, Wagenaar worked to promote netball in the Western Cape for many years and inspired countless young athletes to excel in their disciplines; and acknowledges her loss and will hold her memory in mind as Cape Town hosts netball's premier event next year.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

**MR ERNEST MNYAKA**

(Motion)

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Ernest Mnyaka, a petrol attendant and poet from Malmesbury, who recently published his first volume of Xhosa poetry, Waphela Umda kaLoyal (The end of the road for a thug); notes that Mnyaka's poetry reflects on his experiences in prison and his previous life of crime, and acts as a commitment to build a new life; notes that Mnyaka acts as a true example of the restorative power of the written word; and wishes him great success in his future endeavours.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

**WESTERN CAPE CULTURAL AFFAIRS AWARDS AND WESTERN CAPE SPORTS AWARDS**

(Motion)

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the winners of the recent Western Cape Cultural Affairs Awards and Western Cape Sports Awards, which were held in October this year; notes that the winners of these awards are living examples of the incredible dedication and talent present in the Western Cape's cultural and sporting sectors; notes the sectors' heartening progress in recovering from COVID-19; and commends all the winners.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

**PASSING OF MR MUSTAPHA ISAACS**

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the untimely passing away of comrade Mustapha Isaacs from Ward 116 in Mitchells Plain; notes that the comrade passed away peacefully in his sleep; notes that he will be remembered for his selfless service and dedication to the ANC and to the community; may his soul rest in peace and may his friends find comfort.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

**PASSING OF MARSHA WAGENAAR**

(Motion)

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the passing away of legendary netball veteran, Marsha Wagenaar, who died recently after suffering a severe stroke; and notes that 'Tannie' Marsha was a retired Cape Town Netball Federation President and a former Acting Principal at the Cavalleria Primary School in Kraaifontein.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

**BRAZIL'S NEWLY ELECTED PRESIDENT, LUIZ INÁCIO LULA DA SILVA**

(Motion)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Brazil's newly elected President, Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva; notes that Da Silva won Brazil's election with 50,9% of the vote; and South Africa is looking forward to working with the Government of Brazil under his leadership.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

**KING MISUZULU KAZWELITHINI**

(Motion)

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates King Misuzulu kaZwelithini on his coronation; and notes that he was officially made King of the AmaZulu after a long battle for the throne.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

**MS ZUBEIDA JAFFER**

(Motion)

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I move without notice:

That the House notes that the University of Stellenbosch will award the degree Doctor of Philosophy (DPhil) honoris causa to Ms Zubeida Jaffer; further notes that this award-winning journalist is from Wynberg; recognises that she is one of five distinguished individuals to receive this highest accolade from the Stellenbosch University at the 2022 graduation ceremony; further recognises that she started her career at the Cape Times daily newspaper in 1980; acknowledges her role as a black journalist, often arrested and tortured for writing about the brutality of the apartheid system; further acknowledges that, despite the security risks, she assisted in developing local community newspapers, such as Grassroots, during the anti-apartheid struggle; recognises that she was also the founding editor of Independent Newspapers' Parliamentary Bureau, serving 14 newspapers across South Africa; further recognises that she was the first woman in Africa to have won the coveted Foreign Journalist Award from the National Association of Black Journalists in the United States; acknowledges that her work has earned her several local and international awards, including the Achiever Award from a leading Cape Town community newspaper, Muslim Views; further acknowledges that she is also an author of several books and her own memoirs; and congratulates Ms Zubeida Jaffer.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the Motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The Motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in the hon members' names as if that hon member had read them out aloud.

I will now allow hon members move Motions without Notice as per the Standing Rule of 152(d). This also will include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority Meeting. Hon members are reminded that 30 minutes, as per the Standing Rule of 152(d) will start now. According to my list, I now recognise hon Xego.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Xego. Hon Dugmore, do you have a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, no. Hon Deputy Speaker, I was just trying to get your attention. It is just a small point. I think Rule 66 would cover it. I noticed when the issue of the Rules was raised that the Acting Chief Whip for the DA, stood up with a copy of the Rules that was kind of in a ring binder. Now, I think many of us have actually been trying to get

printed copies. Obviously, there is an electronic version, but there is a serious problem, hon Deputy Speaker, in that when we have requested printed copies of the Rule Book as amended, they simply do not seem to be available in the Legislature.

So, I just wanted to use this opportunity to raise that because we should not have a situation where the Acting Chief Whip is standing up without a proper Rule Book and I think all of us would like that. So, if you would not mind, hon Deputy Speaker, for just raising this matter in your discussions as the Speaker and so on, so that we could actually have a hard copy set of Rules. That would really be appreciated. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Over to you, hon Baartman.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of Rule 66 that is not a point of order. These Rule Books we got via email. I printed my own with my own paper and I bound it. If hon member Dugmore does not have a book and if he does not want to print his own or bind his own, that is his problem, but that is not a point of order in terms of Rule 66. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not a point of order. Hon Maseko, did you?

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think Acting Chief Whip covered me. I just wanted to inform the hon member to check in his emails. The one that he did not read is the one of this. [Laugh.] Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well, hon Dugmore, what I am happy to do is make you a copy if that will alleviate some of the stress or I will check with the Administration if it is possible to get you printed copies so that everyone has a copy ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: What is the score energy of the Acting Chief Whip of the DA?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: The hearing, the hearing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, I see your hand is up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja, no, thanks. Hon Deputy Speaker, it was just simply that we had got used to it. I did receive the emails, they are available on email, but we had got used to it and it is useful to have it properly printed. I do not think it is up to one hon member just to say they had printed it out or not. I think people ask for copies of the Rule Book when they come to this Legislature, and I think it is just important to have a printed copy. It costs less if you do it in bulk, et cetera. I know there is a reference to amending the Rules again, but all I am asking for and it is not just for me, is a limited print by the Legislature of new copies of the Rule Book because there are none available. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. I now recognise hon

Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I do want to warn hon members of both sides of the House, but especially the ruling party. If we had to find each other in a gentlemanly manner, we must not nit-pick little things to deny access to information. Now, you do not know the circumstances of all hon members here and I support Cameron Dugmore, the hon Cameron Dugmore. If we ask for a printed copy, then let me get a printed copy. We waste millions on each department's copies of reports by Ministers, but now we do not want to give one copy of a set of Rules. I object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais, thank you very much. Hon Sayed? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no, thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can I suggest that we continue with the Sitting. I do not think this is an issue that we really want to fight about at this point. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. What I will commit to is at the beginning of the new year in February, that we have printed copies for you. That will make it easier. We will not print them now. I am sure they will get lost over the recess period. I would like to now move over to hon Xego to continue with his Motion without Notice.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, sorry to interject. Hon member has put in an apology. So, he is not part and parcel of this Sitting. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, thank you very much. I am going to move over to hon Makamba-Botya. Over to you.

## **EXTENSION OF SANITARY DIGNITY PROGRAMME**

(Motion)

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House calls on the Western Cape Department of Social Development to extend its Sanitary Dignity Programme project beyond only school learners. The Department can achieve this through sponsoring and working with non-governmental organisations that are already involved in such projects. The current programme for learners by the Department should be applauded, but it can be expanded so as to reach even more needy women out there, especially in townships, informal settlements and rural areas. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to

the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. I recognise hon Makamba-Botya, you, again.

### **CONDITIONAL GRANTS AND TRANSFERS**

(Motion)

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. I move without notice:

That the House calls on the Western Cape Department of Local Government to make conditional grants and transfers available to municipalities so that they can provide free water, electricity and sanitation to indigent households which rely only on social grants. Whilst we are aware that the City of Cape Town provides rebates to indigent households headed by pensioners from the age of 60 years and above, we call for more funds to be made available so that all these rates become free of charge and to also include child-headed households who survive on social grants. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

Mr D AMERICA: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Makamba-Botya, you are again on the list.

### **REMOVAL OF ALL PROVINCIAL STATUTES REPRESENTING APARTHEID**

(Motion)

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House calls on the Western Cape Provincial Legislature to embark on a mission of reviewing and removal of all provincial statutes that are representative of apartheid and remain offensive to the majority our people. The review must make a deep analysis in searching for all these statutes or provisions that might be offensive and fall foul of the principle of constitutional validity when tested against the South African supreme Constitution. Hon Deputy Speaker, our people cannot continue remain living in fear just because they are scared to infringe certain

apartheid provisions in statutes which might end up leaving them with fines or potential imprisonment upon their infringement. Hon Deputy Speaker, we must strive to be a proactive and responsive Legislature that eradicates everything bad before they deeply manifest themselves in society. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Oh, oh my God!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Bosman.

### **EXCEPTIONAL ACHIEVEMENTS: CALEB PAYNE AND KIM ENGELBRECHT**

(Motion)

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the exceptional achievements of two of the Western Cape's finest actors, who have exemplified the highest standards of our province's cultural sector and demonstrated their talent on the world stage. 11-year-old Caleb Payne was recently honoured with a Youth Artist Academy Award in the category of Feature Film Leading Youth Artist for his role in the 2021 film Good Life. This is the first time any South African has won this award, and places Caleb in the auspicious company of previous winners such as Julia Roberts, Leonardo DiCaprio, and Zendaya. At the same time, renowned actress Kim Engelbrecht has been nominated for an international Emmy award for her work on the locally produced series Reyka, for which she has already won a SAFTA award. We commend these artists from our province on their achievements and their representation of our country on the world stage and wish them well on their future endeavours. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I now recognise hon Baartman.

**WESTERN CAPE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT'S INFRASTRUCTURE  
BUDGET**

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House welcomes the Western Cape Education Department's outstanding achievement of spending 100% of its infrastructure budget during the 2021/22 financial year. In total, this equated to more than R1,7 billion. Every year, the Western Cape is a top destination for emigration as South Africans seek a better life of dignity, wellbeing, and safety. We know that this proves that our learners are in safe hands and that it further contributes towards their quality education taught in our province. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

**VREDENDAL REGIONAL COURT FINING THREE SAUDI NATIONALS**

(Motion)

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the Vredendal Regional Court fining three Saudi nationals R2 million for illegally harvesting a large quantity of flora without documentation. The trio, who were also found guilty of money laundering and ordered to leave South Africa, admitted in court that they had travelled to the country with the sole purpose of acquiring the flora and exporting it to their home country and recognises that this recent incident highlights the fact that plant poaching is not simply a petty crime, but forms part of an intricate international web of syndicates dedicated to the theft of our natural heritage. I also move that Minister Barbara Creecy and the National Department of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries provide support in the form of funding and to engage with her counterparts in Law Enforcement to provide urgent support to stamp out this criminality.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Van der Westhuizen, over to you again.

---

**ANNUAL PRESTIGE AGRI-WORKER AWARDS**

(Motion)

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I move without notice:

That the House notes the category winners of the annual Prestige Agri-Worker Awards that were announced at a gala ceremony at Grand West on Saturday, 5 November 2022, and particularly Mr Nigel Klaasen who was announced as the overall winner of 2022; and that the House commends the Western Cape Department of Agriculture for being the only provincial department in the country where the contributions of the agri-workforce to the agriculture economy are celebrated and recognised. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Baartman.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, can I just get the name ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...of the person that objected?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can you just repeat?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I heard there was an objection. I would like the name of the person that objected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The person that objected: I would have to check on my Hansard.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Dugmore.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Maybe the Table staff can help. Over to you, hon Sayed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker? Hon Deputy Speaker, is that a point of order? [Interjection.] I do not think that is a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. Hon Dugmore, I am just ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: In terms of which Rule?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...hon Sayed on the floor. One minute. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, could you maybe probably suggest to the hon Minister to wait until the Hansard comes out. Then, he can look at it. We all get the Hansard in our emails, and he can look at it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 60, it is not a point of order, hon Minister, but you are welcome to consult the Hansard. I did not see who that was, unfortunately.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: If a person objects, that person must have the conviction of his heart to state his name because I want ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Which Rule, which Rule?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...to engage with him afterwards. ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Which Rule asks that?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, is that you?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja. Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order. You see, I think this is one of the examples, with the greatest of respect, that I want to raise in regard to bias because it is clear that the Leader of Government Business, that was not a point of order, but he was entertained twice where it is clearly not a point of order at all.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Like the printing of Rules.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...when you entertain that, hon Deputy Speaker, it creates ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...the wrong impression. I appeal to you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, anybody that rises can raise a point of

order. If it is not a point of order, the hon Minister has been told, it is not a point of order. Alright, we will move on. We now move over to hon Baartman.

### **HARMONY PROJECT**

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to say welcome to the new leader of the Opposition in the House as well. She is looking quite beautiful today. I hereby move without notice:

That the House welcomes the great impact and progress made by the Harmony Project with their work in the Plettenberg Bay community. The Harmony Project is a UK-based organisation that attempts to make teaching practices more practical so that learners are already connected with nature. Already, Grade 3 learners at the Bahia Formosa Primary School have had significant increases in their Maths and Language results. We look forward to even more developments in this regard. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Mackenzie.

### **PASSING OF GRAHAM POWER**

(Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of Graham Power who was the founder and chairperson of the Power Group. Throughout his life, Mr Power made great strides as a formidable business leader in the fields of civil engineering and construction. He has also won many awards and had received various honours from the City of Cape Town in his efforts to help transform our society. His family and loved ones will remain in our thoughts. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie. Just before I ask the

question, your audio was not good. Probably, people would not have been able to know that unless they were reading the words, but are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Mackenzie, over to your next one. I hope that we can hear you clearly.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me clearly now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not great at all. Hansard might find it difficult, but you can try.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Can you hear me better now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Perfect, perfect! Continue.

### **HUMAN SETTLEMENTS PROJECT IN WOODLANDS, MITCHELLS PLAIN**

(Motion)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. My Wi-Fi. Unfortunately, loadshedding is messing with all of us. I hereby move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Government and City of Cape Town in the jointly developed Human Settlements project in Woodlands, Mitchells Plain. That the House recognises the Western Cape Government's ongoing commitment to accelerate housing delivery in Mitchells Plain, while fostering social inclusion by creating integrated and sustainable human settlements in an open-opportunity society. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Baartman.

### **BEAUFORT WEST DISTRICT LIBRARY**

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I hereby move without notice:

That the House notes two weeks ago the Beaufort West district library burned down, which contained the historical archives of many families within the municipality. Many children in the area relied on these books not only for their academic ambitions or to remember their history, but to escape into different worlds and adventures, to meet new people and

explore places we only ever see on the big cinematic screen. It is still unclear what the cause of the fire was, and we call upon the local municipality and relevant law enforcement agencies to investigate this matter speedily. Our deepest sympathies are with the people of Beaufort West and despite this set-back, we must rebuild Beaufort West. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Baartman, over to your next one.

### **BERGSIG MENTAL HEALTH WARD AT NELSPOORT HOSPITAL**

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Minister of Health and Wellness for opening the new Bergsig Mental Health Ward at Nelspoort Hospital, in Beaufort West, on Monday, 7 November. Nelspoort is located approximately 50 kilometres north-east of Beaufort West. The Nelspoort Hospital is classified as an Intermediate Care Facility and has both TB and psychiatric beds. The total project cost was estimated at R18,6 million. This allowed for the renovation of existing wards, Bergsig, Omega, and Lusthof, and to improve the environment of care for current mental health care operational requirements. The total area renovated is +/- 3,740 square metres. The Bergsig ward has been completed and the estimated date of completion for Omega and Lusthof wards is January 2023. We thank the Department of Health for investing in infrastructure for the people in our rural constituencies and for caring deeply for Nelspoort. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Maseko.

### **BAVARIA STATE**

(Motion)

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House welcomes the signing of a Memorandum of Intention between the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and the Bavaria

Statement State? Parliament. This document will allow for greater exchange on parliamentary best practices so that we both can enhance our roles as legislators and oversight work. By building partnerships with different stakeholders, this move builds on our efforts to further whole-of-society approaches going forward. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Sayed. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern the Provincial Government's poor handling of the racial tensions ...[Interjection.]

†Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Khangе kutshiwe ekugqibeleni...[indistinct]

**[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]**

[Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Wasn't that said in the end...[indistinct]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...at Fish Hoek High School which started in May 2022 when a teacher allegedly used racial slurs during a lesson, a matter which we as the ANC raised sharply in this House; notes further that a ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [Indistinct]

## **DIVERSITY WORKSHOP**

(Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...diversity workshop at the school was abruptly halted by the Education MEC David Maynier after demands from the white right-wing who argued that the diversity workshop intervention by the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) traumatized the learners; and that we acknowledge that the reaction by the right-wing elements proves that some of our schools remain racist enclaves – why else would young children be traumatized by antiracism interventions? And the House condemns in the strongest possible terms the DA's MEC Maynier for cowering to white right-wing demands at the expense of driving non-racialism and protecting black learners who are continuously targeted and discriminated against in many former Model C schools; and calls on the MEC to provide this House with all details as to why the intervention was

suspended, to desist from caving in to race denialists for the sake of building a right-wing coalition in the Western Cape, and to instead roll out more of these diversity workshops to tackle racism at a fundamental level in our schools. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] There are ...[Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No objection. No objection.

Mr G BOSMAN: Vehement objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Vehement objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise hon Bans. Hon Bans? No? Hon Sayed, over to you again and you can always come back to hon Bans.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Over to me again?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

### **BULLYING OF LEARNERS AT CASCADE PRIMARY SCHOOL IN MITCHELLS PLAIN**

(Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the bullying of learners at Cascade Primary School in Mitchells Plain, after an eight-year-old pupil was peed on, spat on, and even threatened with sexual violence, which resulted in the child fearing to go back to school anymore, as the bullying is not only from other learners but teachers as well, allegedly; notes further that the mother of the child laid complaints to the Western Cape Education Department, as well as the Mitchells Plain SAPS, but the police told her that the child needs to have visible injuries in order for them to open a case; notes that the House strongly condemns these horrific acts and calls on the WCED to accelerate its interventions for inclusive education and to eradicate all forms of discrimination and abuse in our schools. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion

being moved without notice? No objections ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: No objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...on the Order Paper. I now recognise ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Haibo. What objections?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Who is objecting ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise, hon members, hon Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Ai, people are sick.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Over to you, hon Bakubaku-Vos.

### **ANC MPL RACHEL WINDVOGEL**

(Motion)

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates ANC MPL Rachel Windvogel for her sterling work and dedication to solving a labour crisis, where about 100 workers became violent against each other after the employer agreed to only take some of them to work; she and her PCO administrators worked as a team with the Human Rights Commission Office, Police, Law Enforcement, Councilor Libazi and the Municipality to restore calm and order in the community; and that the labour issues will be dealt with at the headquarters of the employer and the Chief Director of Inspectors of the Department of Labour in the province and the Human Rights team with the MPL; and the team will continue to work together to resolve the issues. I so move, thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr D AMERICA: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No objection.

Mr L L MVIMBI: No objection.

Mr G BOSMAN: Object!

An HON MEMBER: We object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Mvimbi. [Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Some people ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you; you may proceed.

### **OUTDSHOORN MUNICIPALITY TO EVICT A LOCAL MUSEUM**

(Motion)

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the ongoing attempts by the DA Mayor at the Oudtshoorn Municipality to evict a local museum from a Council-owned building despite a lease agreement which is for an indefinite period; notes further that it is clear that the DA-led administration is unhappy with the transformation that has taken place at the museum and also, given proximity of the building to the Mall, want to give access to white business interests. I would like to make a call to the Premier and MEC Marais to urgently intervene to halt the planned eviction. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: I object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections.

Mr G BOSMAN: Yes, objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

**DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT'S PLAN TO CLOSE CERTAIN NPOS**

(Motion)

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the Department of Social Development's plan to close off certain NPOs assisting women and children and providing help to Gender-Base Violence victims. We have been sent letters alerting them to a possible discontinuation of funding in the 2023 financial year; and warns the Provincial Government against this, as it will have adverse effects on the vulnerable people in the province. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I move without notice:

An HON MEMBER: I object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections in the House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Mvimbi, you may proceed to your next motion.

**BLUE DOT TAXI PILOT PROGRAMME**

(Motion)

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns in the strongest possible terms the termination of the Department of Transport and Public Works' Blue Dot taxi pilot programme at the end of this month and is disappointed at the Department for wanting to cut this programme; notes further that the Blue Dot programme, which was run in collaboration with the minibus taxi ...*[Interjection.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, one minute. That is not the – that is not your motion. Can you just check that you are reading the right one? I need to have that removed off Hansard. It is the one regarding the DA Mayor.

Mr L L MVIMBI: I finished that one. I am done with that one. That was the previous one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Have you got it right?

Mr L L MVIMBI: I have done that one. That was the previous one I did before

with hon ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, okay, one minute. I have two from you. I have regarding the one that has just been rejected, which was the Blue Dot taxi pilot programme ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And I have this one, with regards to the Mayor at Oudtshoorn Municipality. I cannot, unfortunately, allow any ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Can I explain, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, the first one I read was about the DA Mayor of Oudtshoorn, which I have finished. That was the one that was objected to. Thereafter, hon Windvogel read one. Then, this is now the second one of the Blue Dot I have not as yet read.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I know that when we started off with citing Rule 66, but not knowing the respective subsection, I am going to ask that we allow hon member Mvimbi to do his second motion, since it was number 22 and 24. The fact that he swapped it around, perhaps it just has been a long day. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I have been covered by the Acting Chief Whip on that. I think it is just a swap around. That tends to happen.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is fine.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, you may proceed, hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much for all your indulgence, hon members ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks.

*(Motion continues)*

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...and the hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns in the strongest possible terms the termination of the Department of Transport and Public Works' Blue Dot

taxi pilot programme at the end of this month and is disappointed at the Department for wanting to cut this programme; notes further that the Blue Dot programme, which was run in collaboration with the minibus taxi industry, was aimed at improving taxi services and to improve passenger service quality and safety, as well as to empower and transform the industry and to address illegal operations and violent conflict; accepts that the Government's decision once more proves the disregard and undermining of the taxi industry by the uncaring DA-led Provincial Government which now say they do not have funding, which in turn forced them to cease the operation. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you for your indulgence, hon Mvimbi. [Interjections.] There are objections in House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Dugmore. I see your hand is up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker. No, the hon Deputy Chief Whip covered me. I am just still waiting for my opportunity to move a motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your opportunity, hon Dugmore, your opportunity is now. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

### **ALLEGATIONS OF RACISM AT THE STELLENBOSCH UNIVERSITY**

(Motion)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House welcomes the report of Judge Kamphephe into allegations of racism at the Stellenbosch University as well as the current institutional culture and calls for engagements on its recommendations; and noting that the DA MP, Schreiber, has called on University funders to withdraw their support given the comments in the report about language and its potential to limit access to non-Afrikaans speakers; therefore resolves to condemn the DA for once again resisting transformation at Stellenbosch University and advocating language policies which limit, rather than broaden access to the institution. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Are there any objections? [Interjections.] There are objections, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed, I do not think hon Bans is online? No. We will proceed. That brings us to the end of Motions without Notice. The Secretary will now read the Second Order of the Day.

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

**2. Consideration of report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill [B 31B– 2020] (NCOP), dated 9 September 2022 (see Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, no 100, dated 9 September 2022, p 411) (Ratification of final mandate).**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. Order! The House received the report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the National Council of Provinces. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish, for three minutes each. I recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I am actually standing in for hon member Marran, who has taken ill, unfortunately, and is physically not able to be part of this. But I think it is a rare occasion that we have a situation where the Legislature discusses a Bill which has impact on the Province and then, actually mandates the Province to support the Bill. I think this is a reflection of the participation of hon members, the manner in which hon member Van der Westhuizen has chaired the session which discussed this particular Bill.

We do think it is important for our Province and for the country, and from the side of the ANC, we believe this will bring greater certainty to this sector in terms of the property industry. With those few words, hon Deputy Speaker, we welcome, we support the mandate, and we trust that this spirit of actually looking at the merits of legislation and not at times, and this applies to everyone, adopting narrow party-political positions, but taking decisions which actually take our country forward; that there would be more of this in the Legislature. So, it is a privilege and pleasure to talk in support of the Bill and the mandate that has been given. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjection.] thank you very much, hon Dugmore. It is within Rule 182.1 for a recommendation to be made, but I understand your point about mandate. I suppose that is a matter of interpretation. We will now move over to the EFF. Hon Makamba-Botya, are you online?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker, my apologies. The EFF is not making any declaration. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you. I will move over to GOOD. Hon August? No? I then move over to the ACDP. Hon Christians? No. I will then move over to the Freedom Front Plus. Hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): No. I do not have a comment on this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you. I then move over to Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Al Jama-

ah supports this Bill. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now call on the Democratic Alliance. Hon Van der Westhuizen, over to you.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In 1971, the Sectional Titles Act ushered in a new era in homeownership in South Africa. The Act provided for the division of buildings into sections and common property, and for the acquisition of separate ownership in sections, coupled with joint ownership in common property. That also provided for the establishment of bodies corporate to control common property and for that purpose, to apply rules unique to the property.

This Act was later replaced by the 1986 Sectional Titles Act that inter alia, provided for a Sectional Titles Regulations Board. Ownership of units in well-run sectional title schemes have often seen excellent capital growth. This points to the desirability of living in such schemes. It also allowed and supported the identification of particularly, residential areas, allowing more people to stay closer to places of work such as inner cities.

In 2011, the Sectional Title Schemes Management Act, Act 8 of 2011, was added. This Act gave recognition to the important role that body corporates play in effectively organising and managing the common property. Yet, despite sectional title developments being popular and despite the Act having been amended more than once, certain important needs were not provided for in the existing legislation. The Sectional Titles Regulations Board therefore proposed a number of amendments to the existing Sectional Titles Act. These range from improvements in the definitions of certain terminology, such as exclusive use areas to situations where a body corporate has not yet been established and where the developer intends to consolidate or subdivide certain sections.

The amendments include provisions to change the size of the original scheme. An example of such an amendment is found in the new clause 26, that provides for the purchase of additional land to extend the common property. While it is generally accepted that the amendments are non-controversial, it did come as a surprise to me that the Standing Committee did not receive one single input in response to our public participation initiatives. Not a response from developers, not from any of the many body corporates in the Western Cape. Neither from estate agents nor anyone else.

I am raising it here as I am concerned that our current public participation model may not have been kept up with the times. As members will see in the report, the Standing Committee recommended that the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill be supported, despite our initial small amendments not being accepted by the NCOP. We have since learned that none of the proposed amendments by provinces were supported and that the Amendment Bill was adopted as is. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to this motion? No objections, agreed to. I have to announce that there are currently 29 hon members present and entitled to vote and the House is,

therefore, quorate. The question put before the House is that the report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill, be ratified and adopted. No objections? Agreed to.

No objections, agreed to. The question is therefore approved. The report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill has therefore been adopted. I here so move.

The Secretary will now read the Third Order of the Day.

**3. Consideration of report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on its oversight visit to Wi-Fi sites at the Centre for E-Innovation (CE-1) office (4 Dorp Street) and Groote Schuur Hospital on 27 July 2022 (see Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, no 102, dated 13 September 2022, p 415).**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there will be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded that opportunity to make a declaration of the Vote, for a maximum of three minutes. I now recognise the ANC. The ANC, no?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, over to you, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, yes, I think one would – hon members would notice from the report that a number of hon members, including myself, were not able to physically participate in this visit, but from the side of the ANC, we have no objection to the report as tabled being supported. I just want to make two points.

I think all of us are very keen that the original commitments in regard to access to Wi-Fi are actually delivered on and I think one of the critical issues is that there had been a commitment by this Provincial Government, to make sure that there would be a Wi-Fi hotspot in every single ward. Now, the reality is that as we speak, that particular objective has not yet been met. We also, secondly, note the fact, and you will often see it when you drive around in our communities, young people standing close to a school, standing close to a library, linking up to the Wi-Fi. One of the limitations of that is that in many cases, it does not have a 24-hour access to that Wi-Fi.

So, the visit, as I have indicated, we have no objection to the report, but we want the House and in particular, the Constituency MPs from the different areas, to really take a clear look as to where in the particular wards spread out, the 406 wards across our province, with the focus on those which cover historically disadvantaged communities, actually have 24-hour access to a

dedicated Wi-Fi hotspot, not necessarily having to rely on access to the Wi-Fi at a school or a library or a clinic.

But in regard to the report itself, we have no objection and support that report. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Dugmore. I now recognise the EFF. Hon Makamba-Botya?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker, we have no declaration from the EFF. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I am just checking if GOOD is in the House.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Yes, hon Deputy Speaker. No declarations from GOOD, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ACDP. [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is good, that is good. [Laugh.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I reckon no ACDP. The Freedom Front Plus, hon Marais? [Interjection.]

†Ms N D NKONDLO: Batyi, kunjani? Ndiyaphila akho nto.

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Batyi, how are you? I'm fine thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, thank you very much. [Interjection.]

†Ms N D NKONDLO: Heyi ndiyithumelelwa nguCameron.

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Cameron sent this to me.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjection.]

†Ms N D NKONDLO: because ebeyibuza kum ukuba if it is true...

**[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]**

[Ms N D NKONDLO: because he was asking me if it is true...]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we just mute it? ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: And is said there's nothing that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we just mute the hon member ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...who is speaking at the moment? I just want to go back to Al Jama-ah. No?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, I was actually on that oversight with the Committee and yes, from the Al Jama-ah, we support that report on the initiatives there of the Western Cape installing the Wi-Fi hotspots all over the Western Cape. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr C Fry (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I intend to make sure that my speech is lively enough, so hon member Bakubaku-Vos does not feel the need to stretch again. [Laugh.]

On 27 July this year, the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters visited the Wi-Fi sites at the Centre for E-Innovations in Groote Schuur here in Observatory. The objective of these oversight visits was to access the facilities and gain a general sense of how well services were being delivered, including any issues with the Wi-Fi at 4 Dorp Street and Groote Schuur Hospital.

Hon Premier Alan Winde joined the Committee during the oversight visit to the E-Centres. Together with the hon Premier, the Committee gained first-hand experience on how the systems operated from a health, education and environmental viewpoint as well as the capabilities made possible for citizens through public Wi-Fi access.

As has been the case over the years, the Western Cape Government's efforts to guarantee that residents have sufficient access to the internet, were once again demonstrated. During the visit, it was also communicated that the State Information Technology Agency is implementing a 10-year broadband programme on behalf of the Western Cape Government, along with its partner, Liquid Intelligent Technologies. I applaud these transformative partnerships that will improve access to the Western Cape residents.

In the previous financial period alone, the Western Cape Government had spent over R1 billion on centres for E-Innovation. The Department of the Premier has played an important role in digitally empowering residents by ensuring the availability of digital services, providing facilities through which these services can be accessed. The Department provides residents with free internet access at 1,286 Wi-Fi hotspots and 75 Cape Access E-Centres located around the province. The Committee will make further visits throughout the Western Cape in upcoming year. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I have to announce that there are currently 30 hon members present and entitled to vote and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is the Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted? No objections.

Mr D AMERICA: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. The report now of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters has therefore been adopted. Hon members, we have come to the end of our programme. Before we adjourn, hon Sayed, over to you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and I think the Sitting went off quite well. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Just one more thing. I have raised it at the beginning, earlier in the morning when the hon Speaker was in the chair. To date, hon members have yet to receive the soft copies of the Budget Speech and of the MERO. I just wanted that to be made known to the Table staff. We were told that it would be sent earlier on, but it still has not come through to the emails. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I will certainly follow that up with the Secretary and the Table staff here, and make sure that you get those copies. And thank you to all the hon members for cooperation today, to get through a busy programme. We do understand you are under a tremendous amount of stress.

So, I would just like to remind hon members that the Budget Committee meeting will commence after the adjournment of this Sitting and that concludes the business of the day. The Secretary will now end – oh, is it tomorrow? Hon Deputy Chief Whip, over to you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Because we went through lunch, the Procedural Officer for the Budget Committee has sent out the amended link for the meeting, that we are starting at half past 3. [Interjections.] Those who are here in person, we are hybrid here in the Chamber and those who are online can join on the online link. [Interjections.] But half past 3, we will commence so the hon members have time for lunch. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I had almost forgotten that there was still food for our hon members. So, hon members, the Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited. The House is adjourned.

---

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS**

MONDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2022

**ANNOUNCEMENT**

The Speaker:

**Document referred to committee in accordance with Standing Rule 227:**

**Request to interview and form a Selection Panel for the Western Cape Consumer Affairs Tribunal in terms of section 15(7) of the Western Cape Consumer Affairs (Unfair Business Practices) Act, 2002 (Act 10 of 2022).**

Referred to the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism.

THURSDAY, 24 NOVEMBER 2022

**ANNOUNCEMENT**

The Speaker:

**Publication of reviewed list of candidates**

**Provincial Notice 133 of 2022:** Publication of the reviewed list of candidates of the Democratic Alliance political party, published in the Provincial Gazette Extraordinary 8687, dated 23 November 2022.

Copy attached.

TUESDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2022

**ANNOUNCEMENT**

The Speaker:

**Referral of document to committee in terms of section 54(1) and (2) of the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, 2009 (Act 10 of 2009), as amended:**

**Parliamentary Oversight Committee**

Western Cape Provincial Parliament – In-year Monitoring Report as at 31 October 2022.

**TABLING**

The Speaker:

**Tabling of document in terms of section 54(1) and (2) of the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, 2009 (Act 10 of 2009), as amended:**

**Western Cape Provincial Parliament – In-year Monitoring Report as at 31 October 2022.**

Copies attached.

THURSDAY, 24 NOVEMBER 2022

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Speaker:

The Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities

**1. Referral of document to committee in accordance with Standing Rule 92**

**Budget Committee**

Western Cape Government: Municipal Economic Review and Outlook 2022 [PR303/2022]

**2. Introduction of money bill in accordance with Rule 185:**

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].

**3. Referral of money bill to committees in accordance with Rule 188:**

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].  
Bill referred to relevant committees.

**TABLINGS**

The Speaker:

**1. Western Cape Government: Municipal Economic Review and Outlook 2022 [PR303/2022].**

**2. Papers tabled with the Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022]:**

(a) Budget: Western Cape Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure, 2022 [PR289/2022].

(b) Budget. Western Cape Overview of Adjusted Provincial and Municipal Infrastructure Investment, 2022 [PR291/2022].

(c) Budget: Western Cape Medium-term Budget Policy Statement, 2022 [PR313/2022].

Papers referred to relevant committees.

FRIDAY, 25 NOVEMBER 2022

## COMMITTEE REPORT

**Report of the Budget Committee, having considered the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook, 2022 [PR303/2022], dated 24 November 2022, as follows:**

The Budget Committee reports that it convened on 24 November 2022 and has concluded its deliberations on the Western Cape Government: Municipal Economic Review and Outlook, 2022 [PR303/2022], referred to it.

Copy attached.

FRIDAY, 25 NOVEMBER 2022

## ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

### 1. Filling of vacancy and swearing in of new Member

The vacancy, which occurred in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament owing to the passing away of Ms L J Botha, has been filled by the nomination of Mr I Sileku with effect from 24 November 2022. The Member took the oath in the Speaker's office on 24 November 2022.

### 2. Change in membership of committee with effect from 25 November 2022 (\* denotes a change):

#### Programme Authority

**Members: 10**

<b>DA (6)</b>	<b>ANC (2)</b>	<b>EFF (1)</b>	<b>AL JAMA-AH (1)</b>
Baartman, DM Van der Westhuizen, AP Kaizer-Philander, WF Maseko LM Bosman, G Mackenzie, RD	Lekker, P Sayed, MK	Xego, M	N Brinkhuis, K
<b>Alternate Members</b> America, D Schäfer, BA Fry, C	<b>Alternate Member</b> Dugmore, CM	<b>Alternate Member</b> Makamba-Botya,	

Murray, C Plato, D Sileku, I			
------------------------------------	--	--	--

FRIDAY, 25 NOVEMBER 2022

## COMMITTEE REPORT

### **Report of the Conduct Committee on a possible breach of the Code of Conduct for Members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, dated 15 November 2022, as follows:**

The following Members were in attendance, namely Members W F Kaizer-Philander, D America, D M Baartman, P Z Lekker and N Makamba-Botya.

After the Registrar had presented his report, the Committee deliberated on the matter and resolved to accept the report by the Registrar and the conclusion that there was no breach of the Code by the Honourable Member.

In brief, Honourable Member Sayed of WCPP had alerted the Registrar on 14 June 2022 of the possible breach and intimated that he had possibly received funds that could be regarded as a sponsorship during January 2022 in the amount of R39 500. This amount, although destined for the party caucus, was thought to be attributable to him.

He had failed to disclose this amount in his Declaration of Members' Interests Form for 2022, which had to be filed by 30 April 2022. In his correspondence to the Registrar, he acknowledged that he had failed to disclose the "sponsorship" in his declaration and added that it was not a deliberate error.

The Registrar proceeded with a preliminary investigation by requesting further information from the venue that had hosted the function on 23 June 2022 and for copies of all the relevant documentation.

Upon receiving the requested documentation, the Registrar made the following conclusion:

- There was no direct link to the WCPP or to the Hon Member in any of the financial documents provided. In fact, all the documentation referred only to the management of the venue;
- Although the Hon Member has acknowledged that he was the instigator of the "sponsorship", the Registrar could not, based on the documentation, find that the Hon Member directly received any sponsorship;
- He also could not conclude that the Hon Member received hospitality in his personal and private capacity, given that 60 persons attended the function;

- He, therefore, concluded that no breach of the Code of Conduct for Members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament had occurred.

Copy attached.

MONDAY, 28 NOVEMBER 2022

## **COMMITTEE REPORT**

**Report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements, 24 February 2022 to 23 September 2022, Theme: Dignity oversight activities undertaken by the Committee**

### **Purpose of the report**

The purpose of this report is to report to the House, in compliance with Standing Rule 89(4) and (6), on the oversight visits embarked on by the Committee as part of its oversight mandate.

The report includes details of the meetings conducted with the district municipalities and category B municipalities and the recommendations and resolutions that were taken during the meetings that were held from 24 February 2022 to 23 September 2022.

Copy attached.

MONDAY, 28 NOVEMBER 2022

## **COMMITTEE REPORT**

***(Final mandate stage)* Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B 22–2022] (NCOP), dated 22 November 2022, as follows:**

The Budget Committee, having considered the subject of the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B 22–2022] (NCOP) referred to it in accordance with Standing Rule 217, recommends that the House confers on the Western Cape's delegation in the National Council of Provinces the authority not to support the Bill.

### **Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress expressed its minority view that it supports the Bill.

TUESDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2022

**COMMITTEE REPORTS****1. Report of the Budget Committee on the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 29 November 2022, as follows:**

The Budget Committee reports that it has concluded its deliberations on the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to it in accordance with Standing Rule 188.

Having considered the various standing committee reports on the votes in the Schedule to the Bill, the Committee reports that it supports the Bill.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress and Al Jama-ah expressed their minority view not to support the Bill.

**2. Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on Vote 1: Premier in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 1: Premier in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress expressed its minority view not to support the Vote.

**3. Parliamentary Oversight Committee on Vote 2: Western Cape Provincial Parliament in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Parliamentary Oversight Committee reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 2: Western Cape Provincial Parliament in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress expressed its minority view not to support the Vote.

**4. Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on Vote 3: Provincial Treasury in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 3: Provincial Treasury in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress and Al Jama-ah expressed their minority view not to support the Vote.

**5. Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on Vote 4: Community Safety in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 4: Community Safety in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress expresses its minority view not to support the Vote.

**6. Report of the Standing Committee on Education on Vote 5: Education in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Education, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 5: Education in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress expressed its minority view not to support the Vote.

**7. Report of the Standing Committee on Health on Vote 6: Health in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Health, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 6: Health in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments

Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to it in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress and the Economic Freedom Fighters expressed their minority view not to support the Vote.

**8. Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on Vote 7: Social Development in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Social Development, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 7: Social Development in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to it in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress and the Economic Freedom Fighters expressed their minority view not to support the Vote.

**9. Report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements on Vote 8: Human Settlements in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Human Settlements, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 8: Human Settlements in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**10. Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to it in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress

---

expressed its minority view that it does not support the Vote.

**11. Report of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works on Vote 10: Transport and Public Works in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 10: Transport and Public Works in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress expressed its minority view that it does not support the Vote.

**12. Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on Vote 11: Agriculture in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 11: Agriculture in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to it in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress expressed its minority view that it does not support the Vote.

**13. Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress and Al Jama-ah expressed its minority view to not support the Vote.

**14. Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress expressed its minority view to not support the Vote.

**15. Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on Vote 14: Local Government in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], dated 28 November 2022, as follows:**

The Standing Committee on Local Government, having deliberated on the subject of Vote 14: Local Government in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022], referred to the Committee in accordance with Standing Rule 188, reports that it supports the Vote.

**Minority view**

In accordance with Standing Rule 90, the African National Congress and the Economic Freedom Fighters expressed their minority view that they do not support the Vote.

WEDNESDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2022

**ANNOUNCEMENT**

The Speaker:

**Change in Democratic Alliance membership of committees with effect from 1 December 2022 (\* denotes a change):**

**1. Standing Committee on Human Settlements**

Members: 5

<b>DA (3)</b>	<b>ANC (1)</b>	<b>EFF (1)</b>	<b>GOOD (1)</b>
Maseko, LM (C) Sileku, I* Plato, D	Lili, A <b>Alternate Members</b> Marran, P Kama, M	<b>Alternate Member</b> Makamba-Botya, N	August, SN

<b>Alternate Member</b> Mackenzie, RD Murray, C * Van der Westhuizen, AP Schäfer, BA	Smith, D		
---	----------	--	--

## 2. Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works (Transport and Public Works)

Members: 5

DA (3)	ANC (1)	GOOD (1)
Mackenzie, RD* (C) Van der Westhuizen, AP Sileku, I *	Mvimbi, LL	August, SN
<b>Alternate Member</b> Maseko, LM America, D * Murray, C	<b>Alternate Members</b> Nkondlo, ND Dugmore, CM	

## 3. Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport (Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport)

Members: 5

DA (3)	ANC (1)	EFF	FF PLUS (1)	ACDP (1)	AL JAMAAH
Bosman, G (C) Baartman, DM Sileku, I *	Community Safety Bans, AP Cultural Affairs and Sport Kama, M		Cultural Affairs and Sport Marais, PJ	Community Safety Christians, FC	
<b>Alternate Members</b> Fry, C KaizerPhilander, WF Schäfer, BA Plato, D	<b>Alternate Members</b> Community Safety Kama, M Lekker, PZ Windvogel, R Cultural Affairs and Sport Bans, AP Windvogel, R Lekker, PZ	<b>Alternate Member</b> Xego, M			<b>Alternate Member</b> Brinkhuis, K

#### 4. Standing Committee on Parliamentary Oversight Committee

Members: 5

<b>DA (3)</b>	<b>ANC (1)</b>	<b>EFF (1)</b>
Maseko, M (C) Bosman, G Plato, D*	Sayed, MK	Xego, M
<b>Alternate Members</b> Mackenzie, RD Baartman, DM Sileku, I *	<b>Alternate Members</b> Lekker, PZ	<b>Alternate Member</b> Makamba-Botya, N

#### 5. Rules Committee

Members: 10

<b>DA (6)</b>	<b>ANC (2)</b>	<b>EFF (1)</b>	<b>GOOD (1)</b>
Speaker (C) Schäfer, BA Maseko, LM Mackenzie, RD Baartman, DM Sileku, I *	Lekker, PZ Sayed, K	Xego, M	August, SN
<b>Alternate Member</b> America, D Kaizer-Philander, WF	<b>Alternate Members</b> Lili, A Bakubaku-Vos, NG Dugmore, CM	<b>Alternate Member</b> Makamba-Botya, N	

#### 6. Standing Committee on Local Government Committees:

Members: 5

<b>DA (3)</b>	<b>ANC (1)</b>	<b>EFF (1)</b>
America, D (C) Maseko, LM Murray, C	Dugmore, CM	Makamba-Botya, N
<b>Alternate Members</b> Schäfer, BA Sileku, I * Mackenzie, RD Van der Westhuizen, AP	<b>Alternate Members</b> Marran, P Lili, A	<b>Alternate Member</b> Xego, M

## 7. Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Members: 5

<b>DA (3)</b>	<b>ANC (1)</b>	<b>GOOD (1)</b>	<b>FF PLUS (1)</b>
Van der Westhuizen, AP (C) Murray, C America, D  <b>Alternate Member</b> Schäfer, BA Sileku, I * Mackenzie, RD Maseko, LM	Marran, P   <b>Alternate Members</b> Lili, A Smith, D	Environmental Affairs August, SN	Agriculture Marais, PJ

## 8. Budget Committee:

Members: 5

<b>DA (3)</b>	<b>ANC (1)</b>	<b>AL JAMA-AH (1)</b>
Baartman, DM (C) Murray, C Mackenzie, RD Alternate Member Van der Westhuizen, AP Schäfer, BA America, D Bosman, G Plato, D Maseko, LM Sileku, I * Fry, C	Mvimbi, LL  <b>Alternate Members</b> Nkondlo, ND	Brinkhuis, K

## 9. SCOPA:

Members: 5

<b>DA (3)</b>	<b>ANC (1)</b>	<b>EFF (1)</b>
America, D Van der Westhuizen, AP Maseko, LM  <b>Alternate Member</b> Murray, C Kaizer-Philander, WF Baartman, DM Bosman, G Plato, D Mackenzie, RD Sileku, I * Fry, C	Mvimbi, LL (C)	Xego, M

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT**

---

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams.]

The House met at 14:15

The Temporary Chairperson took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 6498****BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Good afternoon, hon members. We will be starting our business in a slightly different manner today. Today, 1 December, is a day of significance. During this period we mark the 16 Days of Activism of No Violence against Women and Children, and let us not forget the LGBTQIA+ community. We stand in solidarity with communities, all civil societies, organisations, Government and stakeholders to end this pandemic, and not just for 16 days, but 365 days of the year.

Today also marks World AIDS Day and all of us should encourage every citizen to get tested and know their status. Let us spend time recognising that despite the impact this disease has on one's life, one can still live a happy and a fruitful life and stop stigmatisation.

Hon members, can I ask that members of this House unite today and direct your thoughts and prayers and observe a moment of silence to those that are affected and those that conquer and for all of us to remain hopeful during this time.

Hon members, let us observe a moment of silence.

[Moment of silence observed.]

Thank you, hon members, you may be seated. Hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you House Chair. House Chair, just when you opened when you referred to 1 December, did you not forget that this is also the day that slavery was abolished? Maybe it was an oversight, or the DA does not really think that that is something to celebrate, but I would appreciate if you also mentioned that. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Your comment is noted. I see hon Christians and then member Sayed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Acting Chairperson. The question is, are we now doing away with opening with prayer, and a minute of silence? It is custom for this House to open in prayer and not a minute of silence. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Christians. Definitely not,

today we just made the exception, but we are not doing away with prayer. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Acting Chairperson, I also just also want to support the point made by member Christians, but also very strangely, I do not know whether it is an oversight on the part of the administration but there are no Order Papers in front of us. They were emailed, but I do not know, not unless other tables or benches have Order Papers but there are only Speakers' Lists. It makes it very difficult to follow the proceedings of the House and to intervene or not intervene if there is no Order Paper. Could we please have that before we go any further? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. We will have that sorted. In the meantime, let us proceed. Hon member Nkondlo?

†Ms N D NKONDLO: Molo Mhlalingaphambili. Ndinombuzo endingathanda ukuwubhekisa apha kuwe. Ndifuna ukuqonda into yokuba uSomlomo wale ndlu yowisomthetho uphi? Njengokuba sowitshilo into yokuba siqala le mini kukho izinto esingazaziyo esizibonayo. Uphi ke uSomlomo walapha wendlu yowisomthetho? Sifunda kumaphepha into yokuba ungumntu ubulungu bakhe bale DA akuyo, ithe yabe iyabuthatha ubulungu bayo. Ngoko ke lo nto leyo ithi kuzokuba bekuphakanyiswa nalapha kwindlu yowisomthetho ukuba into yokuba uyasuswa. Zonke ezi zinto zingamahemhem. Sifuna ukuqonda into yokuba ikhona into yokuba ikhona na into ebhaliweyo yena uNobhala wale ndlu yowisomthetho athe wayifumana angayibonisa kuthi apha ukuba ikhona into enjalo. Ndicela ukuzibuzela net lo nto leyo apha kuwe njengomtu ophethe le nqubo yanamhlanje.

**[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]**

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Good day, Chairperson. As you have already said, we are beginning this day not having the complete information about situations. Where is the Speaker of the House? We are reading in these documents that the DA is wanting to revoke their membership. We thought that their removal will be something to be raised in this sitting. We have been hearing rumours. We want to know whether there is anything written down that the Secretary of this House has received that will show there is such a thing. I just want to ask that question from you since you are chairing this sitting today.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much for rising, hon member Nkondlo. That is not a point of order. Hon members, we will proceed with the business of today. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Can I address you, Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Chair, I rose on a matter which I was asking for clarity. I am not sure whether you want me to speak in English for you to understand. I rose on a matter, which I expected you to provide clarity for.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo, I note your point made and your question asked. At this stage my only answer will be and for the remainder of this session will be that hon members, we became aware of possible litigation that might impact processes of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and all members will be kept abreast accordingly. I hope that should answer your question, member. We will proceed. [Interjections.]

Hon members, hon Kama, please put your hand down, member Bans, as well as member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, Chair, you cannot do that.  
[Inaudible, microphone muted]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, order members! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They are not in the House.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They are not in the House, and you do not even know what we are talking about. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is the evidence that ...  
[inaudible, microphone muted]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We still do not have the Order Paper, but you want to continue with the Sitting. [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): A point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, can I ask for you to please contain yourselves. [Interjections.] Can we please go through the before-proceedings of the House and I will address member Nkondlo accordingly. [Interjections, shouting simultaneously.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): There is no Order Paper. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Sayed, hon members, order! Members, members on my left as well as members on my right, please, can we maintain order in this House. I have asked the Administration to sort out the matter of the Order Papers. Can we proceed in terms of not the business, starting with the business of the day, but the before-process of, before we get to the business, please. In the meantime, I am sure you will get the Order Papers and then I will address member Nkondlo. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We cannot proceed with the Sitting  
[Interjections, speaking simultaneously]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Acting Chairperson, can I suggest that we

proceed once the Order Papers have arrived. We need Order Papers, it is completely unprofessional that we do not have Order Papers, but that we are expected to continue a sitting.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, the Order Papers are being distributed.

An HON MEMBER: Full House. [Interjections.] [Members shouting.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, members, members on both sides of the House. [Interjections.] Members, can I just get an indication as to who must still receive their Order Papers? We have noted the members that are still to receive Order Papers. I just ask a bit of patience, members.

Members, at this stage can we deal with the opening remarks in the meantime? That does not necessitate for you to have Order Papers. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon House Chair, members Kama and Bans had their hands up and they were not recognised. Can you please recognise them? Can they be given an opportunity to raise what they wanted to raise? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, I indicated that first the Administration will be dealing with the Order Papers that will be handed out to members. Secondly, we will deal with the opening remarks and then I will take members that do want to or wish to indicate a point of order. That is how we will proceed. Members, in the meantime we are going to deal with the opening remarks. [Interjections.]

Members, in the meantime we are going to deal with the opening remarks. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House, which is the WCPP, both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House. The hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to this Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges. Hon members, suppose a member of this House, of this Provincial Parliament, elects to participate virtually and not from the Chamber, in that case such a member's responsibility is to ensure that he or she has good quality data connectivity, good quality audio and video and that there are no disturbances where they are. Members would note that the hybrid system has been functioning well, poor audio and/or video are not attributed to the system, but rather to the quality of data connectivity.

Hon members, please take note, the media has also been granted access to this MS Teams meeting, as guests of WCPP. However, members of the press may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual, who is not a member of this House, activates their mic and video camera such an individual will be exited from the Sitting immediately. I request that those here today who are not members of this

House to please observe the decorum of this House. Hon members, you are reminded that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings. To this end I draw the attention of the hon members to Rule 40 of the Standing Rules. Hon members, there are Rules to this august House.

Let me repeat myself, hon members, there are Rules to this august House. This Parliament is a respected place and in this place where the people of the Western Cape elected their representatives, which are us, hon members, in order for us as hon members of this House to enact laws and conduct our business to the betterment and the welfare of all our people. I wish to call on all members, members to my right as well as members to my left, to adhere today to the order in meetings and to the rules of debate as per Chapter 7 in our Standing Rules. Now members, before we continue, can I just have an indication if all members have received their Order Papers? Hon Marais is still in need of an Order Paper.

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes. [Laughter.] I just had to say something.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Marais. Are you covered? Thank you very much. Hon members, on... [Interjection.]  
Hon Sayed, I did not recognise you, please contain yourself. I have indicated that I will address the matter that hon Nkondlo has raised. Can you please provide me with an opportunity to respond?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, I will not be able...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I had my hand up, Chair. I am not some child here who is unstable that you can say "please contain yourself." Give us some respect.

†n AGBARE LID: Ja.  
[An HON MEMBER: Yes.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, are you done?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We do not want the House to descend into chaos.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are you done? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What is this? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Bans?

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, thank you, Chairperson. Chairperson, in your opening remarks you said today is an exception, and I think as the House we have accepted not praying, but in your exception as well we are not actually taken into confidence by being told, where is the Speaker? What is the exception? Why is the situation like this today? Can we start there so that we

can cooperate in having the House continuing as normal? I do not know why the Deputy Chief Whip is standing up... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why are you standing up? [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: Why is she standing up, because I am still on the floor? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members!

Ms A P BANS: We are not in a circus here. [Interjections.] We are not in a circus.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip...

Ms A P BANS: You are not acknowledged, you must sit down.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip, I will recognise you. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: I am still on the floor. You must sit down! You must sit down!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

Ms A P BANS: You must sit down and wait to be recognised. I also... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Bans, hon Bans, please speak to the Chair.

Ms A P BANS: Chair, you must protect me. I was still on the floor. I am still on the floor, while she stood standing. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I have indicated to her to take her seat. [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: She stood while I was on the floor! She stood up while I was on the floor!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, you may continue, hon Bans, thank you.

Ms A P BANS: Chair, I just needed that clarity because we want to cooperate and continue with the meeting, but can you take us into confidence, because we do not know what is happening?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Hon members, I will repeat myself. We became aware of possible litigation that might impact on WCPP processes and hon members will be kept abreast. Hon members, also note that this matter is not part of the business of today.

Therefore I will not entertain any further discussion on this matter. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: A point of order, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, members. Hon Acting Chief Whip. Please proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, no! Chairperson, no, you are unfair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are being unfair. Member Kama had his hand up first, and hon Baartman stands up and you recognise her before that. That is totally unfair! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama, please take your seat. [Interjections] Please take your seat, member Kama!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You must recognise him first. You are completely out of order! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The Leader of Government Business as well as, please take your seat. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, why are other people just standing up and you tell them to continue. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, the Leader of Government Business, can I just ask you to take your seat.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Hon Chair, hello... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No Chair, no Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can I please ask you to take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No Chair, we cannot allow that. [interjections]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members! Hon members, member Kama, please put your hand down. I will recognise you, but please put your hand down. It is quite clear, members, it is quite clear for everyone that has got eyes to see what the agenda is today. [interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

And it is quite... [Interjections.] It is quite... [Interjections.] It is quite... [Interjections.] It is quite embarrassing that you use this situation to disrupt the House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are not impartial. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You are impartial!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: No, you must excuse yourself, Chair!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: It is your statement... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Kama had his hand up.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member, why are you shouting?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Because you are not listening!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No! You cannot do that! Member Kama... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You are also shouting, Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Windvogel, member Windvogel!

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Chair. I think, Chair, one thing that has to be accepted is that we are not in a DA caucus. We are in the Legislature, so what you know... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] a caucus DA.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.] Members on my right, please. Member Kama, please finish your point of order.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: In the DA we do not shout like that. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down! [Interjections.]

†n AGBARE LID: Sies man! [Tussenwerpsels.]  
[An HON MEMBER: Siss man! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ...hon Van der Westhuizen...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, will you please allow member Kama to finish.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Chief Whip...

An HON MEMBER: Did you not see member Van der Westhuizen standing up?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I did not see.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Ja, because you do not look at this side. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Chief Whip of the Opposition, will you please contain your members in order for us to provide member Kama the opportunity to finish what he started.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much. Thank you very much, Chair. Chair, the point that I am making is that we are definitely not in a DA caucus. We are in the Provincial Parliament. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members on my right. Members, members. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): But why do you not want to listen to the...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, you cannot just shout as you please. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.] Hon members on the right! [Interjections.] Members on the right, will you please afford hon Kama to finish.

Mr M KAMA: Yes, the point, hon Speaker, is that we are definitely not in a DA caucus. We are in a Provincial Parliament. Now a question is asked as to where is the Speaker, and you have confused me further, because you are now speaking about litigation and all those things that I do not even know what they are about. This House does not know what you are talking about. You might be talking about communications that went somewhere else, hence we are asking where is the Speaker of the House, so that as members of the House, guided by the Rules of the House, we are able to advise in terms of how we should move as per the Rules and the Constitution of the Western Cape. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Kama. I recognise the Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. Chair, as you may know, on the Order Paper today under the line, Motion Number 1, deals with matters such as litigation. This motion was brought in terms of Rule 151 by myself yesterday. I consulted the Chief Whips of political parties and where there is no Chief Whip, the leader of the respective Minority Parties, and we are thus waiting so that I am able to move the motion above the line in terms of Rule 20(2) of the Rules of Parliament and the motion is written there for us to see on page 45 of the Order Paper and page 46 of the Order Paper, which is Motion

Number 1, dealing with the matter that you have also indicated. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip. I recognise hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker, the Opposition has the right to ask questions. An obligation is on the ruling party to answer to the satisfaction of the person who asked the question. Now I ask you in terms of the question where the Speaker is and media reports, can you confirm or are you prepared to confirm or deny that the Speaker of this House has resigned from the DA and that would explain why he is not here?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Did he resign, can you confirm it or not?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Marais. Hon members, I refer you to the Rule Book. I am not recognising you. I am busy speaking, hon Sayed. [Interjections.] In terms of Rule 26: “Whenever the Speaker is absent or otherwise unable to perform the functions of the office of the Speaker or whenever the office is vacant:  
(a) The Deputy Speaker or...” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): My hand is up, you do not recognise me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: (b)  
“If there is no Deputy Speaker, a temporary Presiding Officer designated by a resolution of the House, acts as the Presiding Officer.”

Now hon members, I will not dwell into any party matters. I cannot give you an answer as to where the Speaker is, hon Marais made mention of media reports, hon members, this is not the business in front of the House today. I am going to give the last opportunity to hon Mackenzie. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, House Chairperson. I had my hand up earlier on but you did not recognise me. House Chairperson, may I...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are not fair! Chair...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, you are out of order. Please take your seat.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: House Chairperson, may I? I call on a point of order... [Interjections.] House Chairperson... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed, hon.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Chairperson, can you protect me from the members because I want to raise a point of order? Chairperson, I had my hand up earlier on, and the House – this is not the first time the House was started by a House Chair, by the way. So in terms of – let me read the Rule. Anyone can start a

House Sitting. On page 26 and this is emailed, if they do not have it I can print it, because it seems there is a problem with you to print the documents. On page 26 of the House Rules, approved by members in this House, not outside of this Chamber, it says here, page 26:

“Absence of the Speaker: whenever the Speaker is absent or otherwise unable to perform the functions...” [Interjections.]

Can you... [Interjections.] Speaker, House Chairperson, can you allow me... ... [interjections, speaking simultaneously]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Members do not want to listen to the truth.

“Whenever the Speaker is unable to perform the functions of the office of the Speaker, or whether the office is vacant:

- (a) The Deputy Speaker or
- (b) if there is no Deputy Speaker

a temporary Presiding Officer – which is yourself – may preside over the House.”

So, if people want to know where the Speaker is, the DA, they must go to the DA’s Head Office. By the Rules of this Parliament, you are allowed to preside the House and anyone who does not like the Rules of the House, you must act accordingly. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Mackenzie. Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, members! [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.] Members, we will proceed with the business of today.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No Chair, Chairperson... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The Motion without Notice in terms of Rule 150. [interjections]

An HON MEMBER: House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise the Acting Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBER: House Chair, House Chairperson?

An HON MEMBER: It is the ruling faction...

An HON MEMBER: House Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip, please proceed.

An HON MEMBER: House Chair.

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, House Chairperson, I move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(12) [Inaudible – 00:30:23] the motion below the line as printed on the Order Paper. I so move. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: On a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Dugmore, you are not recognised. Please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: House Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order, member?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Member Mackenzie, we are waiting!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: House Chair, the point of order and I would like to refer you to Rule 20(1) of the Provincial Constitution. ... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: The powers.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It says:

“...that the Provincial Parliament must elect a Speaker from amongst its members at the first Sitting after election, or, where necessary, to fill a vacancy.”

Now it is clear, House Chair, that from this motion below the line here, there is at one level information given to us that there has been some or other process and there is reference to a former Speaker so that is the clearest indication that we do not have a Speaker and the clearest indication that in fact his membership of his party has been removed and he is no longer a member of that House. So, when a vacancy arises, we, and then you go on:

“...that a Judge designated by the President of the ConCourt must preside over the election of the Speaker.”

That is the crisis that we have. We have a vacancy so to go and quote, as one of the hon members do, Rule 26, which says “that whenever the Speaker is absent...” The Speaker is not absent.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: He is not absent.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: He does not – there is no Speaker, “...and/or otherwise unable to perform his function.” [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: He is not there. We do not have a Speaker! [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Chair, we want you to provide this House with evidence, because there is confusion now. Where are the correspondences from the political party that indicates that he is no longer a member? We want to see that. So once we establish that there is a vacancy we want to adjourn this House to contact the Constitutional Court and elect a Speaker. There are many things that we are going to decide here. We do not have a Speaker of this House. We need to elect a Speaker. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, order, members! Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Sorry, maybe because I am short you cannot necessarily see my hand. I am so used in the House we have to rise when you raise a point of order, but House Chairperson, in terms of Section ... [Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO: But when are we being recognised, Chair?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...of the Constitution, when someone has lost their membership, there cannot then be the Speaker, first of all. Second of all... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Second of all, House Chairperson. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.] Chair, please protect me. [Interjections.] Please protect me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, hon members, member Marran.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chairperson, I would like to continue.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Marran. [Interjections.] You do not know your name now, member Marran?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): May I continue?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can you please provide the Acting Chief Whip an opportunity.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. I would like to continue. As the Opposition will see, for example, in subsection C after the “resolves” of the motion, it reads, a motion that we still need to move:

“...that for as long as the position of Speaker remains vacant the Secretary of the Legislature may perform the functions pertaining to the

receipt and communication of statutory and relevant information and documentation.”

In terms of the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act (FMPPLA), with all due respect, Temporary House Chair, you cannot communicate that to us. The Secretary is unable to communicate information to us until we move this resolution, which is on the Paper today in order for us to deal with it so that the Secretary is able to send out the respective information. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No ways! Where are you getting that?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, members!

An HON MEMBER: Calm down!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip. Thank you, members. We need to get to the motion and more clarity with indeed be provided. In terms of Motion without Notice, I recognise the Acting Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, Chair... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip.

Mr M KAMA: Chair, on a point of order. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, no ways!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, members!

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, on a point of order, on a point of order. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members! Members, I am not recognising you.

Mr M KAMA: House Chair, you do not have a choice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama.

Mr M XEGO: House Chairperson.

Mr M KAMA: You do not have a choice.

Mr M XEGO: House Chairperson.

Mr M KAMA: You do not have a choice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama.

An HON MEMBER: House Chairperson.

Mr M KAMA: You do not have a choice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama, member Sayed.

Mr M KAMA: No, it is not a choice!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am not recognising you.

Mr M KAMA: It is not a choice!

Mr M XEGO: But House Chairperson...

Mr M KAMA: It is not a choice!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, the Acting Chief Whip must just provide an explanation ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There are also hands online, House Chairperson, that are online.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...and in term of the motion that is currently on the Order Paper. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: No man, no, you cannot ... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please continue, Acting Chief Whip.

Mr M XEGO: We are here online. We wanted to speak, man, and we have been having our hands up and you are not recognising us.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, can you give me some protection.

An HON MEMBER: Can we be recognised?

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members... [Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: We are rising on a point of order, Chair.  
(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): I give notice that I shall move the motion as printed in my name on the Order Paper for today. I thank you.

Mr M XEGO: We are also members of this House. We want to be recognised.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip.

Mr M XEGO: Chairperson, on a point of order, Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are there any objections to the motion?

Mr M XEGO: A point of order!

HON MEMBERS: No, no, no. [Simultaneous shouting.]

Mr M XEGO: A point of order, Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Motion agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: A point of order, Chair.

Mr M KAMA: Chair, there is no motion agreed.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise the Acting Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBER: The arrogance of members!

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, on a point of order. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: No way, what is happening?

Ms A P BANS: On a point of order, Chair. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Where, where was the motion read?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, members. Member Kama, unless you are... [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: On a point of order, Chair!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Nkondlo! Member Nkondlo!

Ms A P BANS: No, Chair. Chair, on a point of order.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: On a point of order.

Ms A P BANS: On a point of order, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Bans, please take your seat. You have not been recognised.

Ms A P BANS: No Chair, but this side... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat.

Ms A P BANS: No, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member, please take your seat.

Ms A P BANS: No Chair. You cannot, we are raising hands online.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Bans.

Ms A P BANS: And then you are saying we must take a seat... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Bans!

Ms A P BANS: No, Chair, no, it does not work that way.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Bans, please take your seat.

Ms A P BANS: No Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Sayed, I have not recognised you.

Mr M KAMA: Have you recognised the Leader of the Opposition?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: LOGB, can I please ask you...

Mr M KAMA: Have you recognised the leader [Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO: Can you recognise us online?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Can you recognise me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No-no-no, do not speak.

Mr M XEGO: Can you recognise us, we are online.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat.

Ms A P BANS: On a point...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama, turn off your mic and put your hand down. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: No, I want to speak, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am addressing you member Kama.

Mr M XEGO: So he must stand up. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama, there are Rules to this House and all hon members, because you do not like what you hear, does not give you a reason to disrupt the proceedings of this House. So unless you are not rising on a point of order, as per the Rules of this House, I will not recognise you. I recognise the Acting Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, you also cannot choose to listen to what you like. It

is not possible.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair.

Mr M KAMA: You cannot choose to listen to what you want to, you like, a point of order, Chair.

**(Notice of Motion)**

1. The Acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party (Ms D M Baartman): That the House, in circumstances where:

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

- (i) the former Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament (“the legislature”) lost his membership of the legislature on 28 November 2022 in accordance with section 106(3)(c) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996; and
- (ii) section 29 of the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, 2004, together with the State Liability Act, 1957, provides that the Speaker of the legislature is the nominal defendant or respondent in litigation against the legislature; and
- (iii) at this moment, the legislature does not have a Speaker,

Therefore resolves:

- (a) that the Secretary of the legislature is hereby authorised to act on behalf of the legislature in respect of any litigation in which the legislature is cited or may become cited until such a time as the legislature again has a Speaker; and
- (b) for the Secretary to report regularly to the House in respect of the Secretary’s performance of the obligations in paragraph (a) above; and
- (c) that, for as long as the position of Speaker remains vacant, the Secretary of the legislature may perform the functions pertaining to the receipt and communication of statutory and relevant information and documentation.

Mr M KAMA: A point of order, Chairperson, we are not listening to that. That is just... [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: Can we be recognised online, House Chair, we are also here as part of this House. Can we be recognised?

Mr M XEGO: Mama Philander, can we be recognised?

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, a point of order.

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, on a point of order. Order, Chairperson.

Mr M KAMA: Order!

An HON MEMBER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Is that what we are doing now?

Mr M KAMA: Order, Chairperson.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is she reading, what is she reading?

Mr M KAMA: Order Chair, on a point of order, on a point of order, Chairperson.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is she reading?

Mr M KAMA: We are rising on a point of order.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is that there, what is that?

Mr M KAMA: A point of order, Chair.

An HON MEMBER: What is happening?

Mr M KAMA: Order, Chair. [Laughter]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is she reading? What is happening?

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, a point of order.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is she reading, a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: We are not even hearing what she is saying.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: A point of order, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: A point of order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: This is what happens when [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections, simultaneous shouting]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: A point of order, Chair, a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No objections? The motion is agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: No! [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise the hon Kama. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is that? Why are they clapping hands?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No members.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please members, on the left and the right. I recognise the hon Kama online or rather member Xego.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, may I address you?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego, member Xego, online.

An HON MEMBER: You must sit down.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): May I raise a point of order, Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: She is having a meeting with them. You are having a meeting with the DA members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: Yes, yes, yes.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: It is a DA caucus, it is a DA caucus now. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mesuli!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Kama.

Mr M XEGO: I would love to proceed.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Kama, put your mic off. Unless you are rising on a point of order, I will not recognise you.

Mr M KAMA: When you say a point of order, what do you mean, Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order, member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: So it means nothing has happened so far, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, members, on this side, please. What is your point of order, member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: No thank you very much. Thank you very much, Chairperson. Chair. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, hon members, hon members on the left and the right.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hey, the Leader of Government Business.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Nkondlo, member Windvogel, are you even now disrupting your own member for the sake of disrupting. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson.

Ms N D NKONDLO: We have Parliament here, we do not have to think about our own members. [Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members on the left as well as hon members on the right.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, may I address you?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Sayed, I am not recognising you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I raised a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama is on the floor.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Okay, but I raised a point of order before member Kama. In fact after the first motion you made a ruling, I raised a point. You did not recognise me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed, hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Chairperson. Chairperson, I would want to bring your attention to the fact that when the first motion was moved by the Acting Deputy Chief Whip, you then put it to a vote and everybody that side said

yes, and I said here: "No!" You did not even bother to look on this side. You only concentrated on that side and as a matter of procedure, Chairperson, you were supposed to have seen that there was or heard that there was an objection, and you were supposed to follow the proper processes that are to be followed. Now you have gone further to a second motion. Now that again, Chair, I stood here and decided to sit back again. You allowed member Mesuli to speak on whatever point of order that he was going to raise and I am pleading with you, Chairperson, to be procedural when dealing with these issues in order to avoid havoc, because clearly you did not even look at this side. You did not even bother to listen. I did raise an objection and in accordance to that Rule specifically, Rule 50, Rule 150, you were supposed to have used what is necessary or at your disposal to make sure that you proceed with the process of the motion properly. Now you have gone further to the second motion, and you approved the second motion without due consideration of other people. Now I am pleading with you, Chairperson, to be procedural. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Lekker, and please let me enlighten you on the fact that I am aware in terms of the procedure. Now how am I supposed to even hear your objection if your members cannot contain themselves? It is unacceptable member...

An HON MEMBER: They are not listening.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...to even hear anything during this noise. Hon Sayed, are you raising on a point of order and on which Rule are you rising?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon House Chair, thank you very much. I am rising on Rule 132. I am calling for a division of the motion that was just passed because you did not even give us a chance. This is why, hon House Chair, you need to recognise everyone when we put our hands up. It is not that we are trying to be funny... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you so much.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, we need a division, I am calling in terms of Rule 132 for a division on the motion that was just passed, because, I mean, the House is descending into a circus because of the manner in which you are chairing the Sitting, the manner in which you are chairing this particular Sitting.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not allow DA internal politics to descend this House into chaos.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Thank you very much, hon members. I recognise the hon Acting Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are embarrassing...

An HON MEMBER: You are!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ...making a mockery.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, would you like me to repeat the motion? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, please. [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, I move Motion 1 on the Order Paper. ... [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: But before the Motion... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Mackenzie, please take your seat, hon Acting Chief Whip.

Mr M XEGO: Before the motion, no, Chair, you recognised me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Mackenzie, can I please ask for you to cooperate in this regard.

Mr M XEGO: But before hon Mackenzie you did recognise me, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The Acting Chief Whip will be repeating the second motion, but before we proceed, hon Xego's hand has been up for a while. Hon Xego, please proceed.

Mr M XEGO: Hon Xego, please proceed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But what about the division? What about that?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is on the second motion, member, which the Acting Chief Whip... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, the very first one, you did not allow.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, Chair.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is the point.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, no, I could not hear anything from this side, member Dugmore. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is what we pointed out to you that we did not agree on... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, on a point of order, Chair.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego, are you there?

Mr M XEGO: Yes, I am here, House Chair. Can you hear me? Am I audible?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are being told that you did not follow 132.

Mr M XEGO: Am I audible, House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Yes, House Chair, am I audible?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is he responding?

An HON MEMBER: You made an excuse, but in a way... [Inaudible.]

Mr M XEGO: Am I audible?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Yes, House Chair, am I audible?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, order, please. Members.

Mr M XEGO: Am I audible, House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Ministers Mitchell and Simmers!

Mr M XEGO: Am I audible, House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego, please proceed.

†n AGBARE LID: Jy het gelieg!  
[An HON MEMBER: You lied!]

Mr M XEGO: Yes, thanks, House Chair. To be honest, it is a worrying matter how motions were seriously moved without us here. We are part and parcel of this House. We are online, we have not heard a single word that was said there. There is a thing that you have raised earlier on, on the issue of litigations

that this House might be facing, and here we are having moved things that we did not hear a single thing of. Is it possible that we can go back to the first because we did not hear anything; you might have heard each other there in the House from the first motion, the second motion, and whatever, but here where we are seated, we did not hear anything. So we do not know what you are moving and who has managed to move in what direction, but can we be able to be taken into the entire process that is supposed to be, because in most instances when we are calling point of orders, you would say as people that are presiding over these meetings, you could not be able to hear because of the heckling that is happening in the House. But we see today the bulldozing and the steamrolling of the process with all the heckling that is happening in the House with us not having heard a single word what is going on there. It is a circus that is going on there. Can we be taken through the proper process, please?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Xego. I recognise the Acting Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no-no. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, are you rising on a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, Chair, yes, again I am continuing to raise on the point of order that the first Motion, Chair, and it is also unfair, my sound has been put off.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Secretary, are we allowed to go back?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Please proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, unfortunately not being able to listen to this side of the House is not an excuse for not adhering to the Rules. I raised the point of order in terms of Rule 132 that the first motion should have gone through a division. That division was not called for. I am asking that a division takes place. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, there was not an issue in doing so. The issue is not allowing the Acting Chief Whip to continue.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, we are suspending the proceedings for five minutes. [Interjections.] Five minutes, thank you.

Business of the House was suspended for 12 minutes and resumed at ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon members, please do take your seats. Hon members, in order for us to proceed with our business for today, may I please ask members on both sides to please keep your interjections, please keep the noise levels down. It is extremely difficult when a motion is moved to hear members and that is not intentionally. This is the situation that you cannot hear if someone objects.

Members in terms of the first motion, which was agreed to, the second motion will deal with that of precedence, and I will now recognise the Acting Chief Whip.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Can we just get clarity, Speaker, I mean, Chairperson, on what you have conveyed to the House. Are you saying that Motion Number 1 about the Acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party, that that motion has been adopted by the House, even though it has been brought to your attention by our Deputy Chief Whip that there should be a division and you said you could not hear it. So, I do not see how it is possible to pass something when your attention has been drawn to the fact according to a Rule that we want a division on that matter, so we are requesting you, can you please call a division on that one?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Dugmore. I have made a ruling that in terms of the situation at current there were no objections recorded that could not have been heard... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Uh-uh, no ways, no ways, no.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, No-no-no, no.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Not a division?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, I have made a ruling in that regard. I recognise the Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you, thank you very much, House Chair. I think in the interests of proceeding in this House, and I know you have made a ruling, but could I request that perhaps we actually go back to item 1, and we actually go through it again and if there is an objection, we can note the objection.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will that satisfy you, members?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: As long as we know that, so you take instructions from the Executive?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, we... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, yes, that is what we ask for. That is what we are asking for.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is what we are asking for, but if it takes an instruction from the Executive, it is fine. We just want a division, thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon members, order! I recognise now the Motion without Notice in terms of Rule 150, the Acting Chief Whip on the first Motion. Order, members.

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, I move Motion Number 1 under the line, in my name.

That the House, in circumstances where:

- (i) the former Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament (“the Legislature”) lost his membership of the Legislature on 28 November 2022 in accordance with Section 106(3)(c) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996; and
- (ii) Section 29 of the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, 2004, together with the State Liability Act, 1957, provides that the Speaker of the Legislature is the nominal defendant or respondent in litigation against the Legislature; and
- (iii) at this moment, the Legislature does not have a Speaker,

Therefore resolves:

- (a) That the Secretary of the Legislature is hereby authorised to act on behalf of the Legislature in respect of any litigation in which the Legislature is cited or may become cited until such a time as the Legislature again has a Speaker; and
- (b) for the Secretary to report regularly to the House in respect of the Secretary’s performance of the obligations in paragraph (a) above; and
- (c) that, for as long as the position of Speaker remains vacant, the Secretary of the Legislature may perform the functions pertaining to the receipt and communication of statutory and relevant information and documentation.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip. Are there any objections, members?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, yes.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: There is a hand.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): There is a hand up.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Objections will be so recorded.

Mr M KAMA: Chair, on a point of order. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Kama, why are you on your feet?

Mr M KAMA: I am rising on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order and on what Rule, member?

Mr M KAMA: I do not know if I heard correctly, Chairperson, I heard the Acting Chief Whip talking about a motion that is below the line and my understanding – can you protect me from the Acting Chief Whip, please Chair, and my understanding is that a notice has not been given for this Motion. I heard her saying “the motion under the line.” That is why I am raising, I heard her saying “the motion under the line.”

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you very much, member Kama. Please take your seat. I am just taking advice from the Secretary. [Pause.] Thank you very much, Secretary. Order, members.

Members, the first motion that was passed dealt with precedence, and that is exactly what the Acting Chief Whip will now be addressing, as member Kama indicated, of the motion below the line, once we afford her the opportunity to rise for the next motion. Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. I moved this motion as a Notice of Motion yesterday in terms of Rule 151 in terms of how you move a Notice of Motion. Earlier in this sitting I asked for precedence which was approved and now I am moving because of the precedence, the Notice of Motion Number 1, which we have given precedence to in this House. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Acting Chief Whip. Members, are there any objections to the motion?

HON MEMBERS: No, no.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, yes. Chairperson?

An HON MEMBER: What is the question?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are you rising on a point of order, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, hon Chairperson. In terms of firstly a couple of issues here. Rule 132, again, Chair, I called for a division. I called for a division before we broke so that we can have a division on the first motion. You then adjourned. You then left. I want to also understand what that adjournment was for, because in terms of Rule 134, which states:

“If the required number of members support the demand for a division, the division bells must be rung...”

There were no division bells rung:

“...and the doors locked as soon as, after the lapse of three minutes as the Presiding Officer may direct.”

None of that happened. It is almost as if it was just a leg-stretch that took place. Can we please adhere to the Rules and procedures and be procedural and not descend us into chaos? [Interjections.] Because it clearly seems as if the hon House Chairperson is being managed by the Executive. Maybe the Executive, the Head of the Executive must tell us whether the hon Speaker resigned, or he was pushed to resign, like the DA did with the hon Marais when he was the Mayor. Thank you. [Interjections.]

[Pause.] [Interjections, speaking simultaneously.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, members! Members, hon Dugmore, thank you very much. Hon members, the first motion in terms of precedence were dealt with. That Motion was dealt with. We now need to afford the Acting Chief Whip... [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Says who?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Marran...

Mr P MARRAN: Yes?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You need to raise a point of order if you want to speak. Do you have a point of order, hon Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: No, I do not have, none. Myself and member Dugmore... do object... – Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, I recognise the Acting Chief Whip.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, Chair, again, on another point of order... [Interjections, simultaneous shouting]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed, Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, I move the Motion number 1 that we moved in terms of precedence above the line that is in my name. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, you are... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: On a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Dugmore, hon Dugmore. Hon

members, we cannot continue like this. You do not – no!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible – microphone muted.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, you do not listen! Now you keep on asking the same questions.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, I am not.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, hon Sayed, hon Sayed, as Acting Chairperson, I will not be bullied by you. [Interjections.] I will not be bullied by you.

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson, member Khalid... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are bullying everybody here.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, I am asking for a suspension... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: There was no process.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, I am asking for a five-minute suspension... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Chairperson, there was no process...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...to deliberate with the Chief Whips of the parties. Thank you.

[Business of the House was suspended for 45 minutes]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, we have had quite an afternoon, but we did have a very fruitful discussion with the various Whips of the parties and members, it is quite unfortunate that during our first session of our proceedings that we unfortunately were unable to conduct our business in an orderly way. Members, I do want to apologise from my side in terms of, as the members indicated, not hearing the various objectives (verbatim) coming from this side. It was extraordinary circumstances which made it very difficult to do so. Hon members, on the way forward, the first motion has been passed, and therefore we have agreed to continue with the business of today and I will be recognising the Acting Chief Whip.

Thank you.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, House Chair. I hereby give notice that I shall move:

That, in terms of Section 62(5) of the National Constitution, read with Section 2(3) of the National Council of Provinces (Permanent Delegates Vacancies) Act, 1997 (Act 17 of 1997), Mr Frederik Jacobus Badenhorst be appointed as a permanent delegate to the National Council of Provinces. I so move.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objection to the motion? No objection? Motion agreed to. Thank you very much, members.

### ORDERS OF THE DAY

**1. Consideration of principle of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3– 2022] (Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities).**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Secretary. I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Chairperson, hon members of the House. Two days ago, we welcomed the good news that 85 000 jobs were created in the Western Cape in Quarter 3 according to the latest quarterly Labour Force Survey. This means that more than 203 000 jobs were created in the Western Cape year-on-year. We also welcomed the news that not only had more jobs been created in this province, but that the Western Cape's expanded unemployment rate decreased by 1,8 percentage points quarter-on-quarter and by 0.8 percentage points year-on-year, and while the unemployment rate is still far too high, the Western Cape's unemployment rate is 13,6% lower than the national unemployment rate.

While we are making progress, the headwinds remain powerful. Our country grapples with sluggish economic growth, high levels of unemployment and poverty, significant debt service costs, a rising cost of living, and especially a debilitating energy crisis. We also face a budget squeeze provincially as a direct consequence of years of corruption and state capture.

In the face of this and to set out our plan towards a better future, on Thursday last week, I had the honour of tabling before this House, the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, and the Adjustment Budget for the 2022/23 financial year, which sets out a framework for hope and this Government's path from recovery to growth, which we are debating in this House today, eventually.

While I share the framework and the scaffolding, the departmental details per vote have been deliberated upon in the Standing Committees and will be further debated in coming days. To keep us on course, and to respond to immediate pressure in the 2022/23 financial year, we will use the Budget Adjustment to adjust our sails so that citizens are cared for. We will do this by making provision for a net addition of R490,6 million in expenditure for the 2022/23 financial year. Although we have welcomed 85 000 more jobs in quarter three, there are still too many people across this province who remain unemployed and who are unable to put food on the table for their families and so through this Adjustment Budget, we will allocate R25 million in the short term to fund food relief initiatives. On the frontlines and our communities responding to the very real distress that families face, which includes the scourge of gender-based violence, our social workers are struggling with overwhelming case loads. To help alleviate their burden so that they can continue to make inroads in helping and providing care for citizens, R43,9 million will be allocated to fund additional

social workers and alleviate pressure on case loads.

Overall, in 2022/23, to keep us on our course from recovery to growth and to give full effect to our framework for hope, we will have allocated R54,7 billion to our Wellbeing Priority, R15,8 billion to our Growth for Jobs Priority, and R2,65 billion to our Safety Priority. We do, however, face significant uncertainty in our ability to plan spending over the MTEF due to the ongoing public sector wage negotiations. Over the past few years, we focused on maintaining fiscal sustainability through prudent cost of employment expenditure and headcount management.

During the Adjustment Budget process, a differentiated funding approach was applied after considering the current financial position and headcount levels of each department. Going forward, the uncertainty caused by the ongoing wage negotiations continue. While we have welcomed assurance by National Government to not pass the cost on of agreements reached to provinces, this commitment only extends to the 2022/23 financial year, meaning we are not adequately able to plan over the medium term. We will however, continue to engage with the National Government in a bid to gain more certainty and we will of course, monitor the situation closely.

While we do face uncertainty, this framework for hope guides us towards a future with economic growth that leads to opportunity and job creation, a future which is safe and nurturing, no matter where you live; a future where your life journey is full of care. In this relentless pursuit, as ever, we are guided by our North Star Priorities of Jobs, Safety and Wellbeing, which are the key components for real change and our reason for hope.

Chairperson, over the 2023 Medium Term Expenditure Framework, as a result of changes and how the Provincial Equitable Share is calculated, as I set out previously, we will be receiving R1,92 billion rand less for the horizontal division. Fortunately, over this period, additional allocations for service delivery pressures as well as conditional grants allocated to provinces from the National Government will offset this decline marginally allowing for a narrow 2,2% increase in funding for the Province over the MTEF. The fact remains we are going to have to do more with much less, and we will do so. We will face these challenges head on, guided by sound budget principles, which have stood us in good stead and which were pointed out by the Auditor-General in the Consolidated General Report on National and Provincial Audit Outcomes for 2021/22. When she said that, and I quote:

“In 2021/22 the consistent positive pattern of prior years continued, reflecting an overall robust control environment with a solid and consistent pattern of good financial governance. This positive reflection highlighted the tone set by the accounting officers and authorities, instilling a culture of doing the right thing, being accountable and improving controls as key elements in achieving and sustaining clean audit outcomes...”

And our framework for hope will be guided by these principles as we:

- (1) act to protect our core mandates to deliver life-saving and life-changing services, such as healthcare, basic education and social services;
- (2) as we embrace innovative solutions and focus on programmes that maximise impact in our priorities of growth for jobs, safety and wellbeing;
- (3) as we act to enhance our Government's productivity by ruthlessly focusing on doing more with less to deliver value for money projects.

Overall to give effect to this framework for hope, the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement has a total of R1,28 billion to spending over the next three years, bringing the total estimated expenditure for the Western Cape over the 23 MTEF to R230,82 billion. To give effect to this framework for hope and deliver on our priority of growth for jobs, we will add R466,5 million to the new Infrastructure and Mobility Departments over the MTEF, while R257,3 million will be added to our Education and Health Departments to expand critical infrastructure.

Over the MTEF we are planning to spend R31,17 billion on infrastructure in the Western Cape. The importance of infrastructure in facilitating economic growth cannot be understated. In fact, adequate and cost-effective infrastructure is a prerequisite for growth, with the National Development Plan targeting a 30% gross fixed capital formation contribution to GDP to ensure accelerated economic growth, and we, as Government, are responsible for a significant portion of this gross fixed capital formation with a third needing to come from the public sector. In the Western Cape, we are working hard to reach that third and pushing to reach 30% because according to estimates, this investment in infrastructure could contribute an additional R88,8 billion to GDP, which is why after this adjustment the Western Cape Government's infrastructure budget for 2022/23 allocates R3,5 billion to economic infrastructure; R3,9 billion to social infrastructure, and R2,4 billion for various cross district infrastructure allocations. This means that in 2022/23 financial year, we have allocated R1 billion for education infrastructure, R823 million for health infrastructure, and R2,144 million for human settlements and this infrastructure investment is spread across the Western Cape with R3,6 billion allocated in the City of Cape Town; R637 million allocated in the West Coast district; R958 million allocated in the Overberg district; R935 million allocated in the Cape Winelands District, R1 billion allocated in the Garden Route district, and R325 million allocated in the Central Karoo district.

With low levels of economic growth in South Africa worsened now by loadshedding, it is critical that we help unlock much higher levels of economic growth in the Western Cape, so that we can create opportunity. To give effect to this framework of hope and to deliver on our safety priority we will allocate an additional R200 million over the MTEF to continue the Law Enforcement Advancement Program, ensuring that Boots on the Ground in crime hotspots continue to save lives. This means that over the MTEF, we will allocate just under a billion rand to LEAP. We do this firstly, because we know that our citizens are not safe and do not feel safe and they will not be able to live a life they value unless they feel safe and are safe.

Secondly, we are investing in significant funds because the National Government is not investing enough in safety. In fact, we now have fewer SAPS members per 100 000 residents than we did a decade ago and as we continue to leverage our constitutionally mandated police oversight role to ensure that SAPS has the resources that it needs to do its job properly, the safety of our residents will continue to be an apex priority for this Government.

Prevention is another key focus in increasing safety. Using our rich health data we will continue to implement targeted responses that work in our communities, such as strengthening relationships between caregivers, better support for youth at risk, reducing alcohol-related harms and preventing gender-based violence.

To give effect to this framework of hope we will add R246.5 million to the well-being priority over the MTF to support a comprehensive response to the very real social distress being experienced in our communities. This includes funding for an additional 170 social workers in the Western Cape.

Overall Health and Education will receive the lion's share of the Western Cape's budget with a combined allocation of R168.69 billion, or 73,1% of the total budget over this period and to make sure that we are prepared to respond to unforeseen events, we will also recharge our provincial reserves with R1.46 billion so that if the unexpected occurs we will be able to respond rapidly and decisively.

I look forward to debating this budget and hope to hear constructive feedback and viable proposals on how we can collectively work even harder to ensure residents have access to opportunities to live a life they value.

In conclusion, hon Chairperson, we have a clear view of where we are going, our destination of a better future for our citizens. We have a framework of hope guided by our North Star priorities of delivering opportunity, safety and wellbeing for our citizens. We have adjusted our sails in the face of significant challenges so that we remain on course and so that we are able to respond to the needs of our communities and we will remain relentless in our pursuit of a future characterized by economic growth, opportunity, safety and care, thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, we note from the Order Paper that the MEC for Finance will also be speaking at the end and therefore I would like to ask you at the beginning of my speech to please respond to two issues in particular.

Number one, there has been a lot of fanfare about allocations to Education in regard to extra infrastructure. What would I like to ask is will that infrastructure be ready by the beginning of the new school year? We cannot leave a single child behind. We need to make sure that every child has a place in school.

So it is one thing to make announcements, but can you give this House that guarantee that the infrastructure will be ready for the 2023 school year?

Secondly, I would request the MEC to respond as to why, given that in so many of the adjustment votes there have been costs of employment returned back to the Treasury, given commitments around job creation and also looking at the initiatives that our President has taken in regard to public employment, what were the reasons why the Provincial Treasury and the Cabinet did not decide to use those savings from not having made appointments, to actually embark on short-term public employment schemes which clearly would bring relief to those in our province who are unemployed? What were the reasons that you did not do that? Because it is clear that the only public employment that this province talks about are the national ones, expanded public works, etcetera, which are nationally funded.

This Province does not allocate its own resources from provincial reserves to public employment, but, hon House Chair, when our hon Minister of Finance, Enoch Gondwana, tabled the 2022 medium-term budget policy statement, he quoted our former President Nelson Mandela and I would like to quote again what our former President said, and I quote:

"Democracy will have low content and indeed will be short-lived if we cannot address our socio-economic problems within an expanding and growing economy."

The quality of democracy in the Western Cape depends on the quality of the life lived by the people of this province. While we may seriously question the understanding of democracy and democratic practices by the governing party in this province, despite having the word "democratic" in their name, that is a debate for another day.

So clearly the focus of today's debate should be on the socio-economic problems within an expanding and growing economy as pointed out by former President Mandela.

At a principled level our country needs a serious debate about what our economy needs right now to ensure growth, employment and reducing inequality. In this respect I agree with the hon MEC when she said we need to have a frank conversation about it in this House. "It" being the cuts, but I would think that she would encourage a broader discussion as well.

In fact, the MEC goes so far as to say that the consequences of not doing so, i.e., not having this frank discussion, will be severe, especially for the poor hopefully and she will agree that the African, Coloured and Indian population [Inaudible.] of our province and country, need the urgent attention.

We have always maintained that the blaming and pointing of fingers in any direction will not help and blame is not going to help our people. The MEC in her input just made the point, for instance, about the low unemployment levels in the Western Cape, but I think we should be honest with each other that whichever party has governed the Western Cape post 1994, the lowest

unemployment rates have always been in the Western Cape.

In fact when the ANC was governing the unemployment rate was in fact lower than it currently is, but then I must not take cheap shots and be populace either because we have at this period just emerged out of a COVID period, we are trying to grow the economy, but when one does not acknowledge those realities one falls into a trap of populism and not actually focusing on what this Province in particular needs to do, because blaming will not expand our economy.

What we need to do is to reflect on the discussion, on our Government, I would argue, needing to spend more now to stimulate growth and employment and to put measures in place to reduce the cost of living and the massive impact that the interest rate hikes are having on everyone, especially the middle class. That is a serious issue.

So, this whole debate about whether we spend more now to grow the economy or whether we simply fall into a fiscal austerity mindset without even debating what the impact would be of spending more to stimulate growth, we simply close that debate down. I do not think we are going to be finding solutions because often that debate gets dominated by so-called orthodoxies and they do not actually provide solutions. One can only cite the classical austerity and the disastrous effect that it has in fact had on the UK economy recently.

On a very practical level though our President has been leading from the front in ensuring [Interjections.] – we have a President in this country. He respects the Constitution, he is driving a renewal process, [Interjections.] he respects the laws of our country ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF OPPOSITION: ... the Rules of Parliament and that is what guides us and that is the difference that President Ramaphosa has bring. A commitment that all of us, whoever we are, are bound by the Constitution, the rules of this country.

So let us have confidence in our democracy and how that particular matter will play itself out.

On a very practical level, our President, in the wake of COVID-19 and the sluggish recovery of the global economy, he was emphatic that the growth and recovery plan must have certain critical elements. As reminder these are firstly to achieve sufficient, secure and reliable energy supply.

Now before laughter starts again on the other side, the issue is what do we do as a country when there is serious sabotage of the national grid? You know, do we celebrate that because this is a sign of a so-called ANC failure, or do we actually realise that as a country if we have sabotage, if we have treason and we do not deal with it, and I think all of us must acknowledge that the President has assisted greatly in ensuring that we have a more active and focused NPA, that the SIU is beginning to do its work; that SARS is in a much better situation than it was and in a context such as Eskom we need to understand how

important it is to support the attainment of this reliable energy supply and that is going to mean a just transition.

There is no way that we can have the kind of coal resources that we have in the ground, which are now being exported to European countries, without a transition to renewables that is sustainable and based on a proper baseload and that is why our energy plan includes mixed forms of energy supply.

We have to secondly create, I am talking now about the critical elements, and this is what the President has already delivered on, create and support over 800 000 work opportunities in the immediate term to respond to job losses. It has been our President that has ensured over 900 000 people in fact have been attached to public employment schemes linked to schools.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may wrap up, hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Our argument is that this province has not done that. Has not utilised those savings in a time of a lack of growth, to boost public employment to help our people. That is what we need. †Ixesha lam liphelile. [My time is up.] Ma'am? [Interjections.]

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Ixesha liphelile.  
[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Can we not ask you to clarify the position of the Speaker? [Interjections.] Whether the Speaker is still the Speaker of the House? [Interjections.] I am sure you can make a very good ruling on that right away.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Dugmore.

I now recognise hon Marais. [Interjections.]

Ms C A T MURRAY: Murray.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Usisi Iowa.  
[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The lady over there.]

Ms C A T MURRAY: The Scottish one. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Madam Chair.

Our country is a sleeping giant, and she is unable to wake up. She cannot open her eyes because her very cells, the citizens and residents of this country, cannot provide her with the will that she needs to stand up and stand tall among her fellow continental giants – the USA, Britain, China, Brazil and Australia.

Her cells, which are the very building blocks of her body, are not able to perform their functions to the best of their ability because her organs are constantly being attacked by the cancers of violence, corruption, gangsterism, poor service delivery, criminality and even indifference.

Day by day she edges closer to her dying day. As she sleeps, she takes solace from the cloak of deep blue that she wears. The colour of the shoreline surrounding our coast, the colour of hope and the colour of the Democratic Alliance, but hon Madam Chair, there is something that is keeping this beautiful creature that we call South Africa alive and that is her most vibrant and vital organ, her heart.

Her heart, or the DA-led Western Cape, is punching well above its weight and helping to prevent these cancers from killing her entirely. Her heart, this heart of the giant, has most recently been provided with invaluable life support when the Provincial Minister of Finance, Mirelle Wenger, tabled the very welcome medium-term budget policy statement.

Minister Wenger explained that the cells of this organ or the people of this province will be enabled to find meaningful work opportunities as almost R16 billion has been allocated towards the growth of the jobs priority for the 2022/23 financial year.

What is more, over R324 million has been additionally allocated to the Provincial Department of Transport and Public Works, of which R196 million will be allocated towards improving transport safety and the Go George public transport system overall. This will ensure that each person can be transported to work and back safely.

As I have previously said, the giant's heart punches well above its weight. This was evidenced by the release of the quarterly Labour Force Survey's report this week. The report highlighted that according to the expanded definition of unemployment, which includes both job seekers and those who are discouraged, that the province has the lowest unemployment rate in the country.

Nationally the average expanded unemployment rate sits at an alarming 43,1%, whereas it stands at 29,5% in the Western Cape. This is 13 percentage points lower than the national average.

The Western Cape has further seen a welcomed quarter on quarter decline in unemployment under the DA. In a statement earlier this week I highlighted that there is certainly more that needs to be done to combat unemployment in this province. [Interjections.] Without jobs our residents are increasingly at risk of social, economic and psychological harm. [Interjections.]

My question, hon Madam Chair ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon member.

Ms C A T MURRAY: My question, hon Madam Chair, is if these cells are not able to work how can we hope that our giant will ever wake up and stand tall?

Having said that, if we look at the official unemployment rate, which considers those actively looking for work, the Western Cape once again has the lowest unemployment rate in the country at 24,5%, which is 8,4 percentage points less

than the national average. [Interjections.]

Again, there is hope and the heart of the giant is a testament to that ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit, hon member. There is a point of order. What is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: No-no-no, hon – welcome, hon [Interjections.] House Chairperson, Mama Bakubaku-Vos.

I just want to know whether the hon member is willing to answer a question. It is quite an interesting speech. Is she willing to answer a question there?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITIONS: [Inaudible.] let her [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: She knows you cannot ask [Inaudible.]. [Interjections]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may continue, hon member.

Ms C A T MURRAY: I am not willing to take a question, hon Madam Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are you willing to take a question as [Interjections.]

Ms C A T MURRAY: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, you may continue. [Interjections.]

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you. Again, hon Madam Chair, there is hope and the heart of the giant is testament to it.

The DA-led Western Cape Government has further allocated an additional R128 million towards infrastructure projects, including roads. Infrastructure enables growth as it supports entrepreneurs to grow their businesses. It helps workers to get to their jobs and back, and it ensures that our learners arrive at school safely. That is why this organ is prioritising, building its very own chambers, its valves and its vessels, ensuring that the cells of this heart are not left without purpose.

The heart also understands that a job for a sake of a job is not enough. Each cell must be engaged in meaningful work opportunities, motivating them to continue their important functions. The heart knows that each cell, no matter where they are located, must be supported to achieve their utmost potential.

We see this in the SMME booster fund which prioritises, among others, women. Last year alone 54% of the programme's beneficiaries were women-owned businesses. I also had the privilege of engaging with one of these beneficiaries first-hand when visiting a hair salon and Lesedi Square, Bredasdorp, during a cluster visit this year.

What is more, almost R96 million was allocated this year to the Provincial Department of Economic Opportunities, Skills Development and Innovation Programme. Among other achievements the programme supported 2 429 beneficiaries with skills development, each of whom receives paid experiential learning opportunities, increasing their employability.

These are very important drivers of growth and job creation, ensuring that the heart of the giant maintains its strong pulse. That is why R74,8 million has further been allocated to trade and sector development. This will be supported by the R2,5 million increase from the Main Budget and it includes efforts to increase exports through developing relationships with businesses and international markets and increasing foreign investment into the province.

Wesgro has further secured R5,9 billion which was committed last year, creating 4 445 jobs in the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, jobs are critically important in creating a strong economy and ensuring that our comatose giant can finally wake up and be taken off of life support. We need jobs so that she can take her place as the economic hegemony of Africa. However, this is being impeded by the energy crisis.

The giant's nervous system, Eskom, which is responsible for managing each electrical impulse in her body, is failing her. As Minister Wenger explained this year, we have lost a total of 2 932 hours of electricity, which could have been used productively, but we have lost it due to loadshedding, which is not likely to end anytime soon.

That is why this Province or heart is pioneering the Municipal Energy Resilience Initiative, ensuring that our economy and its ability to create jobs are not hampered any further by Eskom.

The Independent Power Producer Programme in the Western Cape, which includes Excelsior Wind Energy Facility and Perdekraal East Wind Farm, was further operationalised in 2022 and it has since seen a total of 139,7 megawatts brought online, considerably reducing dependence on Eskom.

The Western Cape is further finalising its Independent Power Producers Programme's preferred bidder project which will bring 785 megawatts online. We are ...[Intervenens.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Murray, you may sit, there is a point of order. What is your point of order, hon member?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon House Chair, I rise on the point of order that the hon member is reading the speech. [Interjections.]

She is not supposed to be reading the speech. The Rules do not allow to read the speech. You must – it is a speech. [Interjections.] It is not a reading. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Workshop! Workshop! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is really not a point of order. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! Hon members! [Interjections.] There is only one Chair, there is only Chair in this House, hon member Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.] There is only Chair ...[Intervenues.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Chairperson. [Laughs.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is only one Chair, hon members. [Interjections.] Thank you very much.

Hon member, you may continue.

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you, hon Madam Chair.

The Western Cape is advancing into the implementation phase with Stellenbosch Municipality being the first municipality to be provided with the transaction advisory support for municipal procurement of up to 50 megawatts by 2025.

The City of Cape Town is also well underway with their procurement programme, bringing online 200 megawatts by the end of 2025.

We have also seen small scale embedded generation programmes produce 120 megawatts across the Western Cape municipalities since December 2020. Municipalities' own renewable energy generation has since availed an additional one megawatt to Stellenbosch, Hessequa and George.

All of this means that our giant's heart will continue to be strong, even if the ANC-led National Government is trying their very best to clog our heart's arteries with corruption, maladministration, poor service delivery and much more.

We see this particularly in that President Ramaphosa himself faces possible impeachment due to the scandal he tried to conceal on his Phala Phala farm.

In conclusion, hon Madam Chair, while this beautiful giant remains unconscious, she dreams of the day when she will wake up. She knows that on that day she will be draped in a cloak of DA blue. She will be able to muster the energy to finally stand up and be seen as the strong and formidable creature that she is, by her fellow continental giants. She will draw from the strength of the wealth of her resources, which include her natural beauty, her plethora of fauna, flora and minerals, her vast array of expertise and infrastructure and the sheer diversity that defines her.

The day will come when she will stand tall among fellow giants, knowing that her cells will be able to help her to recover from her diseases and her body will help and have enough energy to finally awaken her. This day is inevitable and it will happen when the DA takes over the Union Buildings in 2024. I thank you,

hon Madam Chair. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.]

There is a hand. Hon member Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Interesting thing happened now. We are all very precise when it comes to observing Rules and I have noticed here that the Whips on both sides frequently refer the speakers to Rules.

Now hon member Sayed referred to reading your whole speech, not occasionally looking at the paper, but just reading the whole speech, which is not in terms of the Rules and we laughed. Are we saying some Rules are no more valid? Are you prepared to say we scrap some Rules when it suits us? Or can we get the Speaker, the acting Speaker, to please tell us, by not addressing the issue with the member, I did not interfere, but by not addressing it and telling the member, "You are not supposed to read your speech," are you saying this House is scrapping that clause in the Rules?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you [Interjections.], thank you hon member Marais for addressing the acting Chairperson.

I may recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much ... House Chair.

Hon House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are audible, you may continue.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Okay. Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

I just want to make a quick comment at the last member, hon member Marais [Inaudible.] ... the financial year to change the inequalities of Western Cape.

Hon House Chairperson, on behalf of the EFF, the reason why the EFF will never welcome any budget tabled by the DA-led Provincial Government is because of this entrenched trend of passing a budget only for the same budget to end up being underspent and we normally see it on annual reports every year.

Their aim is to appear as if they are doing something whereas in actual fact there is nothing that is even being achieved as the target, they set for themselves.

Hon Madam Chair, following the devastating effect of COVID-19, where thousands of people lost their jobs and various sources of income, this province is still [Inaudible.] environment for entrepreneurs to thrive and create job

opportunities in this province.

However, hon Madam Chair, the reality is that most of these entrepreneurs offer our people salaries [Inaudible.] where waiters and waitresses are paid from their daily gratuity or tips from customers, meaning that if that waiter or waitress did not make enough tips on that day, then he or she is as good as being a slave, since they would not even have transport money to go home or to come back to work the following day. This is just one example of how desperate job seekers are subjected in this province.

A report produced by the Department of Labour found that majority, which is 55% of employers in Western Cape, do not declare their employees to the Department of Labour. These employers deduct UIF money from the meagre salaries of employees, only to keep the money for themselves. This illegal practice leaves employees in a destitute situation later when their employment is terminated, as they cannot claim UIF.

Hon Madam Chair, we are told that Health and Education received the lion's share of the budget, totalling over R168 billion. However, we know by now that the situation in Khayelitsha Hospital and Mitchells Plain Hospital will never change as they will continue to remain underfunded.

Hon Madam Chair, a government that cannot guarantee a patient a bed, a doctor, a nurse and medication in what should be a hospital facility, is a failed government.

To show that DA is running a failed government, come 2023 we still continue to have unplaced learners in schools despite the Provincial Education Department being granted additional billions, but we will see the giant, as hon member Murray has alluded.

Hon Chairperson, by now everyone knows that the Safety Plan is nothing but a pipe dream as we have said before. One does not have to look further than the recent crime stats released for the second [Inaudible.] where the Western Cape, especially in Nyanga, Mitchells Plain [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ... if original allocated budget of R400 million could not assist in eradicating crime in the province, hon Chairperson, I need not [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up, hon member, thank you very much.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I now recognise hon Minister Mbombo.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Enkosi kakhulu, Sihlalo. Molweni bethunana.

[The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, Chairperson. Good day, everyone.]

The theme identified by hon Minister Wenger in her Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement Adjustment, it talks about a framework of hope, which follows the challenges South Africa is facing.

†Sihlalo, [Chairperson,] as we deliberate on this debate, it is part of 16 Days of Activism that talks about the elimination of all forms of violence against women and children and others who are vulnerable. Under the theme socio-economic rights and empowerment to build women's resilience against gender-based violence and femicide, connect, collaborate and contract.

Just to remind the House that unlike all other pandemics, South Africa had an AIDS pandemic, South Africa had a COVID pandemic. Out of those two you will find that there has been progress, but if you look in terms of the GBVF it is the only pandemic that has worsened and also the tools [Interjections.] to eradicate it are so weak that we are even being dubbed that South Africa is one of the most violent countries in the world, where women and children are raped and murdered because they are women. Shame on us.

So, hon Chair, whilst we are here, business as usual, we need to be reminded that one in three women every day they lose their lives at the hands of men, which are the sons we used to love. Now they are men we hate because they are perpetrators.

Second thing, †Sihlalo. [Chairperson] today is also world AIDS DAY. Under the theme:

"Equalize and integrate to end AIDS."

Again, South Africa has the highest number of people living with HIV. All these above epidemics that I have just mentioned, †Sihlalo, [Chairperon,] there is a common thread. Economic factors as the major underlying contributor to these social ills that get actually absorbed by us, Health, and they end up becoming as a health problem.

Thanks, hon Minister Wenger, for bringing hope through this budget to tackle some of these underlying factors, but I will leave the details to my colleague, Minister of Social Development, where it will demonstrate that we have prioritised the socio-economic factors through this budget. We cannot keep mopping the floor only, we have to make sure that we close the tap as well.

The high levels of unemployment, the poverty, the rising cost of living, the energy crisis, all of these cripples our economy and all of these impact on overall well-being and also the health status of all citizens, rich or poor.

Hon Chair, economy and health are twins. There are no binaries between saving lives and/or improving our livelihoods. When our livelihoods are better

through the healthy economy, as manifested in employment, food availability, diminished poverty, our lives are saved. When economy goes down, as it is currently, so is the health of the population, the health of the individuals and those that are being hit hardest are the most vulnerable, †ooTannie Sara and nabantwana babo. [You are typical Tannie Sara's and their children.]

Hon Chair, healthy economy, healthy population and healthy profit. All those three go together and also it is also vice versa. Job losses mean people are unable to feed their families. It means that even for those who could be able to feed their families, they do not have sound choices and options in order for them to bring healthy, nutritious meals when the food prices are skyrocketing. As I always say health is wealth.

Being healthy unfortunately is not only an individual's choice, but it also means that something needs to happen. It means that it also has got a political underpinning, a political choice because it is at a political level that the socio-economic factors are influenced. That is what we call social determinants of health. It is about when you choose what type of economic model, when you choose at a political level, at a national level, the investments and all of those, whether the economy should grow or not, you must know that it does actually have an impact on health.

As I indicated, hon Chair, Health absorbs all of these, and we are expected to address these inequalities that are perpetrated outside the Health system but originated by political choice. Health is political. People go to bed hungry with no meals because of our national political choices.

People for the first time, hon Chair, in more than a decade see malnutrition in children. It is not because these are the children of the families that do not feed their kids, it is because of political choices that impact on the economy that we have.

So, the issue of the mental health state and total well-being of people, that has deteriorated, it has even surpassed all of the pre-pandemic levels. Crime, hon Chair, which has increased. As I have mentioned, with more women and children being killed every day.

The other part, Chair, I mentioned that is HIV/AIDS, we have seen that the gains and the progress that we saw pre-pandemic when it comes to HIV, TB, STIs, now you will find that during the pandemic more than 50% of the HIV testing has gone down. Almost 50% of the people initiating [Inaudible.] have gone down under the circumstances where people are also hungry.

Also, hon Chair, we have seen, we have heard what the United Nations has indicated that in sub-Saharan Africa every two minutes, actually in 2021, every two minutes there was an adolescent and a young girl who was getting infected, which makes it about 4 900 per week of the adolescents and the young girls that get infected.

Without going into details on that, the Health system is experiencing a marked increase in non-COVID service demands as I alluded to. So it cannot be

business as usual. It means that we have to [Inaudible.] whatever it must in order to be able to render these services. Unfortunately, hon Chair, as I alluded to, Health absorbs all these inequalities. They are perpetrated outside the Health system or they might not be prioritised by other sectors, but we still have to absorb them.

So that is why we have adopted a research strategy that talks Health is everybody's business, which sets out the Department's policy agenda and highlights our aspirations as we build back stronger. The rationale underpinning the strategy becomes, actually provides the key motivation. So that is why the Department was renamed as a Department of Health and Wellness in order to accommodate these social ills that I have already mentioned, but, hon Chair, these require collaboration with other sectors. We cannot do it alone. We need all other departments. We need all of the private sector and even individuals themselves.

The post-COVID, I mean COVID made us to be bounded. We are wounded. We are a fragile health system. Actually, even exposed more of these inequalities because sitting of now, †sithi ngoku kufuneka bacholachole zonke ngoku ezi zinto zenzekayo. [so, we are the ones that need to fix these broken situations.]

So, with our strategic approach in this health is everybody's business, when we rebuild our system it talks about service platform reform, where we have to redesign our service model based on evidence and data, learning from COVID.

So, in order to focus on this quadruple burden of disease, for example, the issue of fast-tracking the surgical backlogs, it was never part of the whole system, but we have to do it because they have been left behind.

The governance reform that talks about local geographic and overall policy alignment, gone are the days where things are only happening probably at the district or a sub-district level. It has to go ward by ward so that we leave no one behind and also to apply the principles of the [Inaudible.] and the worker because with COVID it taught us the hotspot strategy.

The public policy reform, as I indicated, hon Chair, that we have to mitigate these socio-social determinants of health. That is why we said Department of Social Development, give them the money because there is no way that we will be able to resolve all other issues.

So, something needs to be happening. That is why we engage, we embark on a campaign. Nothing about us, without us, which is a driebeenpotjie that has to talk in terms of the strength in the pillar, the Government, the political societies, which is through the Mayors, MPs and all of those, so that you participate, so that you know in this House some of you are what the constituency has in these areas, you have been part where we brought our Government and then engage and talk about what are the programmes and whatever that is happening, and also what are the challenges in some of these areas so that we do not leave anyone behind?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Ja. So having said that, hon Chair, I am really disappointed with the Provincial Equitable Share formula, that we will find that for Western Cape Department of Health it is one that will be hugely impacted in the next MTEF because of what we have been doing.

Where we are trying to deescalate the services to be in the communities ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit now.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Yes, in the communities, but now we are being penalised for that. Thank you, hon Chair. See you on Monday [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you very much, Minister Mbombo.

I now recognise hon member August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon House Chair, the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bills greatly disappoints on the basic principles of delivering services to the Western Cape and communities in which so much more can be done.

The Government continues singing its own praises that it is better than its national counterparts. The sad reality is that whilst it is blowing its own horn, it is failing people of this province daily by supporting dysfunctional policies and fuelling priorities that do not speak or seems to address the needs of the people.

Our people are poor, jobless, hopeless, futureless and have surrendered to the challenges. This Government manages billions of public funds, but the very people who sacrifice so much to keep its coffers oiled are the ones who lose hope.

Homelessness is on the rise. Where is the Department of Social Development? Crime is on the rise. Where is the Department of Safety and Security? Unemployment on the rise. Where is the Department of Economic Opportunities? Communities are broken and falling apart. Where is the Department of Arts, Culture and Sport. Sickness and health are on the rise. Where is the Department of Health?

Where are all these departments that should invest in making a real-life impact on the people of this province? What are they doing as the statistics are speaking for themselves? This Bill should champion the people's causes and should make funds available in accordance with their needs. The need is clearly an alleviation of socio-economic challenges, address crime, health, wellbeing, safety and security as well as the future of our people.

There are young men and women who will never own their own home, own a car or have a family. Why? Because their lives revolve around drugs. They

survive on the economy of crime, they will never know or have access to a different life because the decision taken in this House is failing them. Let us not play house with the lives of millions of destitute, desperate and hopeless people.

The Bill disappoints severely and could have been more impactful with tangible data focused solutions. Instead, it creates an airy framework of guessing and we will do more harm than good in the lives of our people. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member August.

I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon House Chair.

It is very concerning for the ACDP that the Western Cape is allocated less money with more people coming to the Western Cape. This is not sustainable, but this is a stark reality. Shockingly the National Government in the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement indicated that R30 billion will be provided to stabilise SOEs.

Hon Chair, the question must be asked is this money going to bail out a failing SOE, or is it going to disappear? For the past 20 years these bailouts have proven to go down a big black hole, which amounted to R187,4 billion. According to the Zondo Commission most of this money was looted and stolen, for example, R41 billion to bail out Transnet, 70% was on irregular contracts.

In other words, hon Chair, money was stolen from the most vulnerable, from the poor and the most destitute. Hon Chair, the ACDP welcomes the establishment of the Cabinet Level Energy Council to coordinate the immediate action over the next year. This province cannot rely on the National Government or Eskom to resolve the energy crisis. The question is when will this province be off the Eskom energy grid away from loadshedding.

It is sad to see the number of small businesses that have closed down. Just take a walk in the Golden Acre and see businesses, small business closing down.

Let us come to safety. Initially the ACDP was opposed to the LEAP officers programme, but it is working at the moment, but at the moment we believe it is only a stopgap. It is not sustainable to roll out money. We always believe that the communities should empower Neighbourhood Watches and they will help assist because they stay in the community, they are there. When LEAP officers leave crime then escalates. So, we believe that Neighbourhood Watches are the way to go.

It was a pleasure being at the Chrysalis Academy on Saturday to see what a pleasant experience it is, to see that young men and women turn their lives around. What a three-month programme will do transforming lives of our youth and that is youth at risk, and we believe there were 208 graduates. Speaking to

them, the way they speak, the way they present themselves were mindboggling and this should be duplicated to other areas so that not 208 graduates' benefit, but more and more benefit. We saw and I believe a duplication of this will assist us ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may wrap up, hon member.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Okay. [Interjections.] Okay, thank you, hon Chair, I will stop there. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.]

Thank you very much, hon members. I now recognise hon member Nkondlo.

†Ms N D NKONDLO: Enkosi, Sihlalo.

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Chairperson.]

The ANC rejects this Adjusted Estimate Appropriation Bill [B3 2022]. We believe that it is laden with contradictions and in some instances downright hypocrisy.

The MEC of this DA-led Provincial Government must be reminded that the challenges of this country and its economy started long before state capture post 1994, as the colonial and apartheid legacies responsible for the path dependence that set the SA economic fate, and actually the colonial inheritance of the Cape Colony that set the Western Cape ahead of others. Nothing about the scary DA that actually has demonstrated in this House how it is willing to moot injustice to a Speaker of this House and render this House toothless.

How is it that only in the Adjustment Budget of 2022/23 the MEC announces the Jobs For Growth Strategy at the tail end of this administration, whilst the Premier in his first State of the Province Address promised a job for each household. Is this another DA drumming up its election campaign for 2024?

Same with the Municipal Resilience Project, we are still waiting to see an ounce of the megawatts as we were told.

If this Provincial Government is data driven it will realise or emphasise that 75% of public transport trips done per day in this province are done by our taxis. Our provincial economy needs a strong public transport system and the DA in this province has been in denial about the taxi industry. In fact, when they do engage the industry, they approach it in a patronising manner. [Interjections.]

The MSC announces R196 million for GoGeorge, but nothing in place of the Blue Dot Project. Their own DA blue pet project. Instead, they point to the National Government to intervene [Interjections.] as after the show has ended, the curtains have been drawn, reality kicks in. Put your money where your mouth is.

An HON MEMBER: It is true!

Ms N D NKONDLO: The DA demands powers to be devolved on functions like

public transport, yet they fail to be responsive to the growing demand of Metros like City of Cape Town, George, to ensure their municipalities are agile in their integrated transport plans, MEC, issue permits timeously and declare new routes expeditiously so as not to clog our roads and rather slow productivity of many who must sit hours in reaching their destinations during peak times.

Please protect me. I am not sure whether I have touched the MEC in his [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]

What they do instead is to unleash a trigger [Interjections.] happy ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... J P Smith ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... Nkondlo, you may sit down.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members on my right-hand side, you can heckle, but do not drown the speaker and I think we have been doing well so far. Let us continue with the business of the day. [Interjections.] Hon member, continue.

Ms N D NKONDLO: What they do instead is to unleash a trigger-happy J P Smith who is loaded with taxpayers' money from the Safety Plan, to harass, intimidate and impound taxis off the road as his way to show force. Talk about a spoiled brat with a new toy in his hands.

Writing about this, Vanessa Farr, member of Women's International League for Peace and Freedom Network, and Leslie Green, a professor of Anthropology in UCT, ask how has it come about that the City's traffic services now operate as a heavily armed municipal militia whose purpose appears to be to target those who have remained poor because the City has yet to address apartheid spatial planning and its entrenchment of poverty.

In characterising the J P Smith phenomenon, the article they wrote points to the plenty of parallels of decision-making in other parts of the world where the militarisation of city policing is closely linked to the defence of white privilege and where political parties, like the Republicans in the US or DA in Cape Town, allow powerful individuals to continue tenure, even when they risk the failure of democracy.

In his 2017 book "Straight Talk on Trade", Harvard economist, Dani Rodrik, though not a defender of market-based economies, suggests and I quote:

"Markets depend on non-market institutions because they are not self-creating, self-regulating or self-legitimizing."

Some of these non-market institutions for Rodrik includes investment in

transportation, communications and logistics, enforcement of contracts and arrangements to being distributional outcomes into conformity with social norms.

Hon Speaker, the ANC does not object to investment in GoGeorge or even MyCiti, although these two are limping under the DA in the City of Cape Town. What we do object to is the systematic targeting of the taxi industry and what amounts to be choking the industry.

We further ask that this budget is redirected to fund the continuation of the Blue Dot from the provincial reserves. We wish to highlight this glaring budget anomalies from this adjustment, a total of R639 451 000, that is over half a billion rand in under expenditure. R40,65 million returned by the Department of Transport and Public Works [Interjections.] initially identified for infrastructure, and 122 and R155 million transversely returned, and which was initially budgeted for compensation of employees.

Furthermore, in the Main Appropriation above R856 million, that is nearly R1 billion, was transversely budgeted for consultants, whilst R45,6 million was budgeted for training in Programme 1, that is in the leadership and administration programme, a non-core function of each department.

However, this Adjustment Budget does nothing to take focus of these non-essential services. While the ANC does realise that if we are to reduce consultants drastically the services provided by consultants must be insourced as part of building capacity of the state and responding to the growing service delivery needs due to population growth in this province.

We are concerned by the sluggish pace in which vacancies in the Provincial Government are filled, funds returned initially identified for SOC as burden is left to the current staff to carry the workload.

In my count the MEC used the word "opportunities" at least twice in her speech last week. She spoke of promising opportunities and new opportunities, yet we believe that she and this DA-led Provincial Administration are in denial about major opportunities related to the expansion and growth of our provincial economy in an inclusive way.

There are opportunities in agriculture, township and rural small dorpieties economies. We say denial because insofar as agriculture is concerned the skewed broad DA data produced by their own Provincial Government highlights the vast potential for new and promising opportunities these sectors of our economy possess.

In her MERO speech earlier in the morning before presenting this Adjustment Budget the MEC said, and I quote:

"As I am sure Minister Ivan Mayer will celebrate, the merrow MERO also sets out how the agriculture, forestry and fishing sector in the Western Cape expanded. With this sector in the Cape Metro increasing by 8,9%, followed by West Coast at 8,6%, overall, the expected growth in this sector was 8,3% in

2021."

Less than an hour later, in presenting this Adjustment Budget, the MEC said absolutely nothing about the same agricultural sector she has just praised and recognised for its growth.

However, the ANC believes that recognition must be given by this Provincial Government that the sustainability of the agricultural sector in the Western Cape rests on the shoulders of farm workers as the significant input to the productivity of the sector. Yet these are the people living in deplorable conditions, are landless, whilst they work and cultivate land for a meagre salary. This DA Government is deaf on the plight of these farm workers regarding minimum wage and their basic living conditions, but will run and allocate funds for rural safety to protect commercial farmers and landowners that are predominantly white.

We have been here, even in the last administration, making a call for township and rural economies to be given recognition in the growth plans of this province. All this fell on arrogance of whiteness, hellbent to offer our black communities and their consumption currency for donation to the big retail friends; the Pick n Pays under some charade of market store owners, where to date such has been stopped abruptly with no close-off report brought to the Standing Committee of yet another failed DA gimmick to the plight of the poor.

As policymakers we must recognise that when we speak of expanding the economy, we mean expanding the formal economy because the informal economy exists and we continue to deny it and ignore it at our own peril as policymakers, especially here in the province. The expansion of the formal economy to include the township economy to rural economy, even the taxi industry, allows for the growth in the tax base.

We know why before PERO and MERO were scientific driven exercises, today the research is according to the DA's political agenda. However, when we read between the lines, even these politically driven research exercises, we note that, for example, the informal employment accounts for nearly 19% of employment in the province. Private households account for the highest contributor of informal employment, accounting for nearly 56% of total employment, while not surprisingly transport services and trade as informal employment account for nearly 25%, a quarter each to total employment.

These statistics alone make a case for the township and rural economies, but without a focus by this Administration on these, we will never know the true extent of the potential held by these to expand and grow our formal economy. The ANC cannot ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... support [Interjections.] this Budget Vote. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much [Interjections.] – hon members! Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chairperson, to all the hon members in the House and on the virtual platform, good afternoon.

As we recognise 16 Days of Activism, I am appealing to this August House to reflect on the significance not only of 16 days, but our nation's response to gender-based violence and femicide 365 days a year.

On 11 December 2019 the Ministry within the Department of Social Development launched a gender-based violence and femicide multi-sectoral working session to declare 365 days of action and not only 16 days of activism, for no violence against women and children.

We have steadfastly stuck to this commitment for the last three years and will continue to do so given the high levels of violence still prevalent in South Africa, but it is during this period of 16 days of activism for no violence against women and children, that the spotlight on the scourge of GBVF is even brighter.

During this period, I urge us all to look at interventions with the public and private sector, along with communities and civil society which we can and must implement to protect and support the most vulnerable members in our society.

The latest crime stats presented by the National Police Minister reveals that GBVF is spiralling out of control. Between July and September this year sexual offense incidents increased by 11% nationwide.

Hon House Chairperson, on 20 October 2022 the Western Cape Government held its first provincial summit on gender-based violence and femicide. The summit was convened with the aim of taking stock of progress made in implemented commitments made through the National Strategic Plan on GBV to address the scourge in the country and to provide input to the presidential GBV summit that was held early in November 2022.

The hybrid summit was attended by 1 485 delegates online, along with participants at in person satellite venues in George and Robertson. Attendees discussed the different pillars of the NSP as reflected on and the extent to which the Western Cape had progressed in implementing the related commitments on the various pillars.

So much progress has the Province made, the Western Cape Government has proactively put in place measures to localise the NSP by developing a Western Cape Government GBV implementation plan for all our departments. The core objective of the plan is to assist Province with its planning, implementing, coordinating and monitoring of essential actions and services for the prevention and mitigation of GBV across the Western Cape.

The Province established a GBV transversal group consisting of GBV

champions from each department. This transversal group includes all departments and reports monthly on high level matters relating to GBV.

At a Local Government level, Swartland Municipality is an example of best practice as it has mobilised one ward committee member of each of the 12 ward committees to become GBV ambassadors to conduct education, awareness and community support on gender-based violence and femicide. Ambassadors work with ward councillors and relevant stakeholders. They also coordinate activities with the gender focal person within the municipality.

The Swartland area-based team forms part of the Western Cape Government's Safety Plan which allows communities to be actively involved in addressing violence against women and children, working hand-in-hand with Government and key stakeholders. At the same time, we are hoping that other municipalities will take their cue from Swartland and replicate this best practice.

Various other multisectoral bodies and structures have been put in place to ensure coordination and to strengthen accountability. These include, but are not limited to, a Western Cape Government GBV technical workgroup, the Provincial Gender Justice Forum, the Provincial Victim Empowerment Programme Forum, which meets quarterly, is another useful platform, and then we also just opened an additional six GBV shelters. Sadly, our colleagues in Gauteng had to return the six shelters because the Department of Social Development could not come to an agreement with Provincial Public Works in that province.

So, this is just a snapshot of some of the bodies and structures that we have put in place to ensure that we do not just talk the talk, but actually walk it. Unlike National Government that promised to set up a National Council to tackle GBV, yet four years later it is still not up and running and is mired in contention.

It would be remiss of me to say that at the Free State GBV summit a male beat up a female official at an actual summit and a similar incident happened at the national GBV summit.

I will ask us to beg the hon [Interjections.] House Chairperson – I am speaking the truth because gender-based violence cuts across all provinces and the country. [Interjections.] We have come a far way and it has helped identify gaps in systems on a provincial and national level, which requires urgent addressing.

The Western Cape Women's Shelter Movement highlighted a security risk relating to their work, stating that loadshedding, another failure of the ANC-led National Government, is increasing the risk faced by its shelters and many facilities housing vulnerable individuals.

A shelter in Fish Hoek had to fork out an extra R25 000 this year to keep its security system up [Interjections.] and running to ensure – would you stop interjecting, please?

Hon Chairperson, protect me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, can you sit down. Can you sit down.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And this is ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Kama, please make sure that you do not have a conversation with the member that is on the podium so that we can continue.

Mr M KAMA: I was not having [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. Hon Minister, you can continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: This is just one of many as most of the shelters are plagued by the same or similar problems.

Other challenges that are hampering intervention efforts include services provided by SAPS that are not the standard. Victims often complained of insensitive and uninformed officials. Collaboration and building of relationships too require resourcing, hon House Chair, and there are too few resources.

Civil society organisations do not have additional resources to allocate to interventions to aid their participation in national platforms and processes to address GBV. The private sector thus has an important role to play and support and resource collaboration between CSOs and Government.

The Department of Social Development has support and prevention programmes in place for boys and men, but it has been woefully inadequate. Often the voices of men are silent when it comes to gender issues. [Interjections.] Prevention needs to focus on boys, especially boys who are victims of violence. Research suggests that the analysis that 65% of adult cases of GBV are physical violence, but this increases to 85% amongst teenagers. Yet, despite these challenges, we remain resolute in continuing the fight.

The framework of hope requires us to have more courageous conversations, like the ones I got to be a witness to at FAMSA's office in Khayelitsha last month. Men who participated in FAMSA's Fatherhood Programme shared how they were able to deal with multifaceted challenges such as depression, patriarchy, violence meted out on them by the partners in their homes and all of this in a safe space by speaking to other men and receiving counselling from social workers.

I was moved when one man spoke about how these sessions motivated him to start his own NPO in Mfuleni, where he helps other men and young boys in schools to steer clear of violence. We need more of these interventions, we need more men like him.

Programmes like these including our parenting programmes in which DSD and NPO staff train and equip parents with the necessary skills needed to navigate the important parenting roles, are imperative to promoting healthy homes and healthy communities.

Hon House Chair, post COVID the key drivers of interpersonal violence can be attributed to poverty, unemployment and mental health challenges, amongst others. However, the Government's Recovery Plan focuses on jobs, safety and well-being. As part of the framework of hope, DSD has been allocated R25 million, which the Sustainable Livelihoods Programme will be utilising for food relief for social relief of distress. The Department has also subsidised an additional 90 shelter beds just this quarter, bringing the total number of subsidised shelter beds to 2 298.

Hon House Chair, I am pleased to announce that we are now in the process of filling vacant posts, many of which are for social work professionals, which will be placed in safety hotspot areas where crimes against women, children and interpersonal violence is rife.

In closing, House Chairperson, I wish to extend my thanks to the Minister of Finance and Provincial Treasury for providing a framework of hope to DSD which will in turn benefit the most vulnerable in communities across this province. I thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

I now recognise hon member Marais. I do not know if he is online. Okay, hon member Marais, have left the House. I am going to continue with the list.

Hon member Mackenzie, I recognise you, sir.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, House Chairperson.

Today, hon members, we debate the Western Cape Adjustment Budget against the backdrop of massive political uncertainty in this country and hon member Dugmore asked a very important question [Inaudible.] start the debate, and I am going to quote him, hon House Chair. He said:

"On a principles level we need an honest debate about what is needed to identify ..."

I missed that word, hon member Dugmore, but what he basically meant what is needed to fix the country right now on a principles level, to paraphrase hon member Dugmore and I can honestly say, hon Deputy House Chairperson, during the Adjustment Budget Vote what is needed to fix the challenges as hon member Dugmore asked this House earlier on, is an early election.

An HON MEMBER: Is a what?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: An early election. Hon House Chairperson, [Interjections.] despite the uncertainty facing this country, the DA-led Western Cape Government has consistently remained the best performing and the most stable government in this country for years [Interjections.] and this budget adjustment framework for work is no different.

As the hon Minister said, infrastructure is a key driver for growth and I am

extremely proud that the Western Cape Government has taken this framework for hope, for infrastructure seriously, unlike other governments in this country.

As we have seen recently the Government infrastructure investment can be visibly seen in the quality of our roads and the quality of our infrastructure that are being built. We saw the new housing development in Mitchells Plain that Minister Tertius Simmers opened the other day and just yesterday I took a walk around the streets of Mitchells Plain where our Government is busy building new roads. The quality of the roads that are being built in Mitchells Plain is far more than the quality that is being built in other provinces. That is the partnership [Interjections.] between the City and the Western Cape Government.

The problem is ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, just sit down.

Hon members, starting with the Leader of the Opposition, can we not drown the speaker so that we can hear, all of us. Thank you very much.

Hon member, you can continue.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Chairperson.

A road that starts with a "R" is a regional road, in case the hon members did not know, but the quality of the roads that are being upgraded and built in the Western Cape is far better than the quality of the roads that are being built in other provinces. That is the difference between us and the ANC.

Hon members, there are some in this House who would like to take us backward rather than forward. It would be remiss of me not to talk on the matters of what happened in the taxi industry strike two weeks ago. It was one of the worst strikes we have seen in a long time. In fact, this House must condemn it, and I am proud of the members of the Standing Committee [Interjections.] of Transport and Public Works that actually condemned this blatant attack on our economy. It is completely unacceptable and should never happen again in this province.

It is a sad day that the ANC in the Western Cape did not condemn this blatant attack on our economy. [Interjections.] It is sad that we now know what we always knew that the ANC do not care for the people of the province. [Interjections.]

Hon House Chairperson, these actions over the last week were the most [Interjections.] undefendable things that we have not seen in a long time. In fact, the Blue Dot Taxi Programme is the best programme ever created by any government [Interjections.] since 1994.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, hon member, just sit down. I think – hon member Dugmore, we listened to you. Hon member Nkondlo, we listened. Hon members, let us give each other a chance to debate so that we

can continue with the business of the day. [Interjections.]

Do not drown, heckle, do not drown the speaker so that we can all listen and those communities that are online also can hear what the member is saying. Like they listened to you when you were on the podium.

Over to you, hon member. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, House Chairperson.

The Blue Dot Programme is the best Government programme ever created since 1994 to professionalise the taxi industry, by the DA-led Government. [Interjections.] It is the first attempt created by the Government to bring the taxi industry into a fold. [Interjections.]

I want to thank our colleagues in the Western Cape Government, Minister Mitchell, for this ground-breaking initiative. Unfortunately ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Madikizela [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... unfortunately – and the predecessor, Madikizela, yes, it is true, hon member Dugmore.

Unfortunately, the National Government and the ANC Government, despite numerous attempts by our colleague, hon Minister Mitchell, to get funding for this programme, they blatantly refused to assist us in funding this programme. [Interjections.] This blueprint called the Blue Dot should be a programme and a blueprint for National Government to finally fix the taxi industry that has been in chaos for the last 100 years [Interjections.], but instead of our hon members in this House supporting us, writing to the National Minister to ask them to fund it, they have been quiet about it. Like we said, the ANC does not care about the people of this province.

If the National Government has the political will, they would have funded the Blue Dot Programme, but they do not have the political will, hon members. [Interjections.]

Hon members, you know our economy cannot function without a functioning rail system. Just this morning I took a walk to Cape Town Station. It is truly sad to see our trains not running effectively. The great Shosholoza Meyl has not been running for months. Our long-distance transport workers who work in long distance trains, a total of 450 overall staff with 100 dedicated specifically for Shosholoza Meyl, idling and not doing any work.

Today is 1 December, hon members, the start of a festive season, the busiest period of the month, but people cannot get to the Eastern Cape because the trains are not running. That is the reality. Despite that the Western Cape Government continues to invest in infrastructure and what did we hear about the silence of the union-driven ANC colleagues? Nothing. That is why we say the ANC does not care about the people of this province. Not one of them have condemned the fact that a hundred people are sitting at Cape Town Station,

employed to work on the trains, but they are not working. The ANC does not care about the people of this province.

As the DA, we take this very seriously. [Interjections.] We take this very seriously – now we have taken matters into our own hands. Our Western Cape Government conjunctly with the City of Cape Town are making progress with a feasibility study to devolve rail.

The study that began in July this year has now reached critical inception in one of the milestones that they reported. The devolution of rail to the City and functioning governments will happen whether the National Government likes it or not.

In completely expected news I have just heard from my colleague, hon member Gillion Bosman, the Transnet freight rail, they entice the private sector to come and help them to fix the rail. Out of 19 bidders [Interjections.] – this is under Ramaphosa – I am not sure if he is President or not yet – under 19 companies only one has been shortlisted on – it is crazy how every project the Government has in relation to the economy, investment or jobs, ended up like this.

Hon members, coming to the third biggest mode of transport, the buses. A terrible and horrible attack on Intercap the last few months, 150 attacks, and to this day we have not seen the action plan of National Minister Mbalula on how to fix this. He defied court orders in a row. The ANC Western Cape has been silent on this matter. That is why we say they do not care for the people of this province.

Hon members, infrastructure is key for this province and attacks on infrastructure are unacceptable, but I want to thank hon Minister David Maynier on his new Rapid Build Programme that he launched, in fact in Afrikaans it is called †"die vinnige bouprogram" [the fast-building programme]. So, I will describe hon Minister David Maynier as †"Vinnige Fanie" [Fast Fanie.] [Applause.]

In this †"Vinnige Fanie" ["Fast Fanie"] programme, over 842 new schools were built, providing 26 000 classrooms, and I always have to say and I must say I appreciate the intent endorsement by hon member Dugmore, because they are happy about this, but they want it to happen fastly, including our deputy, †"Vinnige Fanie", ["Fast Fanie"], hon member Sayed, and they are saying, and I quote from Minister [Inaudible.] Twitter page, he said that: "Hon Minister David Maynier aka †"Vinnige Fanie", ["Fast Fanie"], must speed it up" and I would like hon Minister, ag, Salie to, who is now, I refer to as Adjunk †"Vinnige Fanie", ["Fast Fanie"], to run faster because hon Minister Maynier already used his spade, and he has toiled the soil in two schools already. So, †Adjunk [Deputy] Minister Fanie must run faster to keep up with hon Minister Fanie. So, the Western Cape Government has shown that here, that we can contribute greatly ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, may you take your seat? I recognise you, hon member. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Does he say he is the hon Minister?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I do not know whether the new Minister Fanie or Salie ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you are better...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Who is hon member Mackenzie referring to?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is that a point of order or not, hon member?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Ja, it is a point of order because such a member does not exist. Maybe, he can ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is no a point of order like that ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...say who is referring to, but just be clear ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You know better, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...so we know, then we can see there ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, take your seat! Take your seat! Hon member, continue.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Sorry, I was just making the point, hon Deputy Speaker that he is saying that the programme must be sped up, but hon Minister David Maynier has already sped up the programme. He already used a spade the other day and dug the ground. So, the †Adjunk [Deputy] Minister Fanie must speed up and meet hon Minister Fanie where he is busy with.

The DA applauds the Western Cape Government for their continued investment in infrastructure. Infrastructure creates jobs and this is what the DA National Government continues to do, as opposed to hiding the money in the couches in National Government. The DA fully supports the Budget Adjustment and anyone voting against this Budget, is voting against the people living in the province. I thank you. [Applause]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Mackenzie. I now recognise hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Western Cape Government's Adjustment Appropriation Bill is a clear indication that the Province is ... [Audio distorted.] the budget ... [Audio distorted.] effectively, especially in areas where most needed. It has become

the usual practice of the DA Government when it fails to deliver, to put the blame on National Government. This Province is only delivering superfluous statements on its performance. The talks about reviving the economy and to create viable opportunities for economic growth in areas where needed, such as the development of tourism in townships and in the rural areas, are not happening.

The plight of overcrowded schools is not being dealt with effectively. Money is spent on unnecessary court cases against progressive teachers like Mr Wesley Neumann and educators who are supporting him. Instead, we see no drop in the high crime rates and do not blame National Government. There is a clear lack of an effective plan on how to deal with crime effectively. There is only a plan in the budget to how effectively welcome and protect tourists to the province, the formation of the Western Cape Government's tourism unit. Yes, we do need to provide safety to tourists, but there are some discrepancies when it comes to the safety of our people in townships like Nyanga, Hanover Park and Delft.

The Western Cape's Appropriation Bill is not prioritising the needs in crucial areas such as health, education, crime, housing, and economic growth on the Cape Flats. Al Jama-ah does not support this anti-poor Bill. Instead, the Western Cape must look at giving each and every ward in the Western Cape Province a proper budget of R500 million. I thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Thank you very much. Hon members, you do not have to be excited. I now recognise hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Let me start off my address by noting the absence of the hon Premier of the Province in the House. As the ANC, we raise serious concern about the absence of the hon Premier in last week's Sitting, when this Province's Adjustment Appropriation Bill, Estimated Appropriation Bill was tabled. This continues the trend that the hon Premier consistently undermines this House and refuses to take accountability and oversight in this House seriously. The hon Premier chooses a breakfast with EU diplomats over fulfilling his constitutional duties in this House. As the hon Meyer continuously reminds this House – I see he is also absent – and maybe, he should remind his hon Premier that you can have a plan and a policy, but if you have no budget to back up that plan or policy ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: On a point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...then it becomes meaningless. The hon Premier exposed his lack of understanding. The political importance of the ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, hon member Lekker. May you take a seat? Thank you. Hon Minister Meyer, is there a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I hear that the hon Chief Whip of the ANC says I am absent. I am in this meeting. I am on a virtual platform. I am listening, I am taking part in this debate. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is that a point order?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Deputy, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Ja, hon Temporary Chairperson. No, thank you very much for the intervention by the possible incoming Premier on that one. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: hon Temporary Chairperson, I have got higher ambitions than that. Since there is no President in South Africa ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is just a frivolous interjection. Hon members, come on! [Interjections.] Hon members. Hon member Bosman! Hon member Sayed! Member Lekker, may you see them?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Bosman, hon member Sayed. Like I said, and really a continuous interjection is allowed, but do not drown the speaker. And your Chief Whip is addressing us. At least give her that due respect.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Must it be that?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Lekker, ...[Laughter] over to you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I see hon Meyer has logged in from wherever he is logging in from. I do not know where he is.

The hon Premier exposes lack of understanding, the political importance of tabling of the MERO and the Adjustment Appropriation Bill when he chose a breakfast over coming to this House for the First Reading. The reality which hon MEC Wenger must face is that Captain Winde has abandoned his ship as he makes his way for his successor. It is hard to point out any instance where the Head of an ANC Executive chose to stay away from the tabling of a budget in Parliament or a Provincial Legislature.

The hon MEC and her fans complain about astute data when determining the Provincial Equitable Share, yet she and the rest of her caucus cannot link other instances of this astute data to their federal agenda and devolution drive. Only recently, did the hon Premier realise that the Western Cape will suffer if the people of the province did not participate in the census. This is what happens when you encourage federalism and Western Cape independence. So, while

the hon MEC may well complain about astute data in clinics, the ANC thinks she should have bigger worries when the results of Census 2022 are released. [Interjection.]

The hon MEC then goes on to mention a new growth for job strategy. Well, this is because the old one which was two years old, did not work. In October 2020, the hon Premier stood up in this House and announced his Economic Recovery Plan. At SOPA again this year, the hon Premier mentioned his October 2020 Address to this House, setting out his Government's priorities for recovery. Let us remind ourselves of what the hon Premier promised. On that day, he promised to create, and I quote:

"20 000 jobs through rapid interventions, including 26 private sector investments ...[Then.] currently in the pipeline."

I end quote. A mere four months later in February 2021, reading his SOPA again, we heard nothing about 26 rapid interventions and by then, only 7 500 jobs were created, far from the 20 000. At SOPA this year, even though he was proud to announce his administrations failed recovery, we heard neither of the 26 000 rapid interventions nor about how many of the actual 20 000 jobs were actually created. But one supposes that in October 2020, the hon Premier believed that the State does play a role in creating jobs. That is why he made the promise, but today, the DA uses the excuse: the private sector creates jobs to recover their broken promises.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC wishes to remind the DA, its hon Premier and the hon MEC that more boots on the ground will not address the challenge of crime. That is apartheid thinking. Even worse still, throwing R200 million to LEAP, which existed long before this hon Premier and his Safety Plan existed, will not help. If they had allocated R200 million to strengthening and supporting Community Policing Forums, then maybe the ANC would have said Provincial Government is making progress.

The same can be said about Health and Education. While the hon MEC recognises that Health and Education receive the lion's share of the budget, it comes as a surprise to her that it is the trend in all provinces. That is because Education and Health are core competencies of a provincial government: politics 101. Yet, take Education at the beginning of this year, 17 000 Grade 1 and Grade 8 learners were not placed in schools. 8 500 Grade 2s and 7s and 9s to 12s that requested transfers, were not placed. This disaster eventually led to the resignation of the hon MEC. Although you did not tell us, we know. The same train smash is waiting to happen at the beginning of next year, but the DA is incompetent of listening to proposals and solving this challenge. Why? We must not fool ourselves ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, conclude. Your time is up.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is politics. The ANC rejects this Adjustment Budget. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I

now recognise hon member Baartman. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hallo, Western Cape residents. Today, hon Temporary Chairperson, I would like to actually speak about the art of doing mundane tasks. There are chores in our lives that we simply need to do, it needs to get done whether you like it or not. We make our beds, we do the dishes, we take out the rubbish. Because you see, hon Temporary Chairperson, if you are not able to do the small things in life, how will you be able to do the big things? It is because over the years, the Western Cape has systematically been making its bed, doing its dishes and taking out the rubbish, that it has been able to focus on the big issues: infrastructure, growth and fighting for our fair share of the National Budget.

Today, I would like to actually reflect on the terminology of the word 'mundane', which stems from the Latin word mundas, meaning ordinary and worldly, essentially an everyday matter. What is interesting is this word comes from the translation of the Greek word cosmos which while in mathematics it refers to the physical universe, but originally actually meant 'orderly arrangement'.

So, when the Western Cape tells you that all departments in the Western Cape Government received unqualified audits for the 2021/2022 financial year, it is not an achievement to ignore [Interjections.] because if you make your bed, if you do the dishes and take out the rubbish, you can focus on attending the netball games and piano recitals. You can focus on reading to your children before bed and you can focus on the things that matter. Because if you do not deal with the mundane tasks in your life, your space will become cluttered. You will not have an orderly arrangement.

It was Victoria Moran that said, quote:

"A simple life is not seeing how little we can get by with – that is poverty – but how efficiently we can put first things first. When you are clear about your purpose and your priorities, you can painlessly discard whatever does not support these, whether it is clutter in your cabinets or commitments on your calendar."

Quote closed. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape did not just wake up and suddenly have 100% of unqualified audits in its departments. The Province was clear about its purpose and its priorities, and we then painlessly discarded whatever does not support these. An unqualified audit outcome does not happen overnight. You need strong and ethical leadership and the culture of accountability that the DA has instilled in the Western Cape Government.

The reasons for this are because we are dealing with the people's money. It is not President Ramaphosa's money, it is not hon Minister Godongwana's money [Interjections.], it is not even hon Premier Wende's or hon Minister Wenger's money, it is the people's money. The State is funded by the taxpayer through income tax, [Interjections.] through VAT, through fuel levies and the like, and the beneficiaries of this money are the people of South Africa because it is the people's money. So, when National Government allocates us Provincial Equitable Share, they are not doing us a favour. It is the people's money. We

need to make sure that we have a level of financial responsibility so that we can deliver services efficiently in the Western Cape.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, we saw in the Zondo Commission report, ANC politicians love seeing money go down the drain, but money needs to come from somewhere and it does not grow under mattresses. And if you want more money to do the big things, you first need to get the small things right. You need to do the mundane tasks. Because we have become so good at making our beds, cleaning our dishes and taking out the rubbish that we have indeed been able to focus on the big things like adding an additional R1,28 billion to the Provincial Government spending over the next three years, bringing total expenditure of the 2023 MTF to R230,82 billion. This includes R31 billion on infrastructure projects, an additional R200 million to continue the Law Enforcement Advance Plan, also known as the LEAP project, an additional R168 billion over the MTF for Health and Education, with these two departments controlling 73% of the budget for this period.

The Western Cape Education Department will be constructing an additional 842 classrooms in the current financial year, far exceeding the construction of 212 classrooms last year, also known as the Rapid Build Project. And hon Temporary Chairperson, for those who do not know, this is like building the equivalent of almost 70% more than what Gauteng announced. And by the way, on 27 November, hon Temporary Chairperson, the ENCA News Channel published that 35 000 Grade 1s and Grade 8s in Gauteng, still need to be placed.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, when you are clear about your purpose and your priorities, you can painlessly discard whatever does not support your priorities. Hon Minister Wenger has tabled a framework for hope because she has clear purpose and clear priorities.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, sometimes, when you do as well as the Western Cape Government, you become a victim of your success. The population growth in the Western Cape is progressing at a rapid rate with Stats SA projecting an increase of more than 460 000 people for the period 2021/2026, which will increase service delivery pressures in the province, and it is important for us to remain resolute in our clarity of purpose and priorities. It is difficult, however, when despite being financially responsible, you are facing budgetary cuts and cost of living increases. While we received an additional increase for public wages as part of national contingencies, in the actual Division of Revenue Adjustment Bill on page 4, when you go and look at the actual Bill, the Western Cape did not receive a cent ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Calm down!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...in terms of the Provincial Equitable Share for service delivery. The revision to the Provincial Equitable Share Formula will also see the Western Cape over the MTF period lose over R500 million in their Health Vote and we are in this dire situation because the ANC-run National Government is not clear about its purpose or its priorities. Those who make their beds, clean their dishes, and take out their rubbish are now being

punished for cleaning their house too well. Those who are good at cleaning must not be punished, hon Temporary Chairperson, because what the ANC also fails to learn and continually fails to understand is that we are not good at the mundane. [Interjections.] If you are not good at the ordinary, you will fail at being extraordinary. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I thank you. [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Before you get a heart attack, thank you, ja.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon member Lekker? [Interjections.] Hon member Lekker? Hon member Marran.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Would you like me to speak to you more?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lekker, can you please switch off your mic there?

†The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Oh, uxolo.

[The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Oh, sorry.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson and thanks very much to the hon members for their contributions to this debate. I have taken note of the comments and in response to some of them, to hon Dugmore: we have a careful compensation of employee strategy which allows departments in a differentiated way to mobilise their human resources as they need for service delivery, that also provides a fiscal buffer from uncertainties year-on-year which I had already spoken about.

On the school infrastructure, I know my colleague, hon Mackenzie, has already mentioned it, but it is very important to reiterate that hon Minister Maynier has announced last week, a very ambitious school building programme ...[Interjection.] which aims to deliver 842 additional classrooms, which is space for 26 000 learners at least. And this, again, emphasises the importance of infrastructure, especially social infrastructure. For this, we have provisioned R1 billion for Education infrastructure and R2,14 billion for Human Settlements. [Interjections.]

I would like to thank hon Murray for sharing information on the Public Employment Programme through our Skills Development Programme, which has been hugely successful. Hon Minister Mbombo, thanks very much for sharing your concerns which I share with you, about the Health component of the Provincial Equitable Share and that is something that we do need to tackle head on.

I think hon August missed the jobs numbers that came out yesterday, so let me repeat: 85 000 jobs created in Quarter 3 [Interjections.] and 203 000 jobs created year-on-year. Hon Christians, I agree with his inputs as well. Instead of spending money on SOEs to bail them out, give that money to provinces for

service delivery. And I note his comments on Neighbourhood Watches. I would like to thank hon Minister Fernandez, hon Mackenzie and hon Baartman for their contributions to the debate.

To hon Brinkhuis: I am not quite sure how he could say that we are not prioritising safety. We are spending R1 billion over the MTF to put more boots on the ground in crime hotspots. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Applause.]

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: If that is not prioritising safety, I do not know what is and it is precisely to subsidise National Government failures. And yes, we are continuing funding a very small unit for the tourism, the Tourism Unit, but that is R2 million, which is in addition to the R1 billion for crime hotspots and we do that in those areas where tourists, both local, domestic and international, go to visit because tourism is a job creator. It supported 175 000 jobs in 2019 and so we need to make sure that we can grow our tourism sector so that we can create jobs.

In response to hon Lekker, I think she also missed the jobs numbers. So, let me repeat: 85 000 created in Quarter 3 and 203 000 created year-on-year. And I would like to also then reemphasise the point that tax collected does not belong to the National Government. It belongs to the citizens of this country. It is their hard-earned blood, sweat and tears and that includes citizens of this province. And us as public representatives of the people of the Western Cape, ought to fight, we have to fight for our fair share of that funding in order to make sure that the citizens of the Western Cape can equally be cared for.

Then, in response to hon Nkondlo. She is quite right. Hon Premier Winde, in his Maiden State of the Province Address, did promise job creation and the Western Cape Government has continued to have this as a priority. That has not changed. But we did have a once in a lifetime pandemic and so the Government embarked on a Recovery Plan to make sure that our job creation priority could stay on track. We are now transitioning from recovery to growth, through the Growth for Jobs Strategy, so we can move from immediate recovery of jobs lost to jobs through growth. That shows the agility of this Government, and it reminds me of a quote from J F Kennedy who said that:

“Change is the law of life. And those who look only to the past or the present are certain to miss the future.”

And that is why we have set out a clear framework for hope, detailing how we will continue on our path from recovery to growth ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members.

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ...by allocating funds across the departments of this Government, guided by our priorities of jobs, safety, and wellbeing towards a better future for the people of the Western Cape. Thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Order, hon members. Hon members, that concludes the Debate on the Consideration [Interjections.] Order, hon members. That concludes the Debate on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the Approval of the Principle of the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, yes!

An HON MEMBER: The principle?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja.

An HON MEMBER: Is that the name of the Bill? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members [Interjections.] Hon member, order! Hon members, order please. We do not want the same situation as earlier today, so please pay attention. Are there any objections to the Approval of the Principle of the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No!

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Objections noted. [Interjections.] Order hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members standing, are you coming or are you going? [Laughter.] Thank you very much, hon members. [Interjections.] Thank you very much. Order, hon members, can we move along. The Secretary will now read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3–2022]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Secretary. The House will then now further deal with the separate Votes onwards. The Secretary will now read the Second Order of the Day.

**2. Consideration of report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Children’s Amendment Bill [B 18D–2020] (NCOP), dated 11 November 2022 (see Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, no 130, dated 15 November 2022, p 544) (Ratification of final mandate).**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Secretary. Order, hon members. The House received the Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Children’s Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish and it will be a three-minute declaration per party. I now recognise the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Incoming Speaker.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Incoming Speaker. [Interjections.] Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC supports the Children's Amendment Bill. The Bill seeks to strengthen protection of vulnerable children through coordinated provision of Care and Protection Services [Interjections.], address gaps and challenges in the Child Care and Protection system ...[Interjection.]

Ms C MURRAY (DA): A point of order, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, apologies.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Yes?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is a point of order. Please take your seat.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I would just like to raise that the hon member is reading, once again. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Hon members. Order hon members. Can we please let hon Bakubaku-Vos continue ...[Interjection.] Hon Sayed, a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, this is declaration, not a speech, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Rules speak about not reading the speech, not about not reading the declaration. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Sayed. [Interjections.] Hon Bakubaku-Vos, you may continue. [Interjections.] Do you have a point of order, hon Minister? Hon Minister Fernandez and hon Bakubaku-Vos, why are you conversing across the floor? [Interjections.] Did you want a point of order, hon Minister? Order, hon members. Order, hon members! Hon member Bakubaku-Vos. Thank you very much, for the clarity, hon Minister. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, please continue.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Bill seeks strengthening and protection of vulnerable children through coordinated provision of Care and Protection Services, address gaps and challenges in the Child Care and Protection system and identify strategies to address these challenges, and to respond to a High Court order relating to the foster care challenges and provide for a comprehensive legislative system.

We recognise that Bill was in response to the 2017 North Gauteng High Court order, which instructed the hon Social Development Minister to come up with a comprehensive legal solution to the challenges facing the foster care system. In accordance with the ruling, the Minister introduced a Bill in Parliament on 31 August 2020. The process has not been an easy one. It had its ups and downs and, in many areas, disagreements among political parties and stakeholders,

but we appreciate the progress made to get to this point.

We must also note and commend the sterling job done by the hon member, and especially, the hon Chairperson of the Select Committee on Health and Social Services, comrade Maurencia Gillion. Together with her team, they led a well-coordinated public participation process and gave a number of key-stakeholders opportunities to give their input and consulted Provincial Legislatures. However, we remain alarmed by the current foster care backlog and hope that the finalisation of the Bill brings lasting solutions to the current challenges.

The Bill, through its objective, also provides for: children's right to privacy and protection of information, funding of any Childhood Development programmes, the designation and function for a Registrar of the National Child Protection Register, extension of the children's code jurisdiction, the hearing of child abduction matters, the care of abandoned or orphaned children and additional matters that may be regulated. Additional matters related to children is ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, your time.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): ...alternative care and other related matters. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. [Applause.] The EFF [Laughter.] Order, hon members. EFF? I do not get any indication from the EFF. The GOOD party? GOOD?

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): I am here, I am here. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. All legislation that looks to strengthen society's defence against the misuse, abuse and violence against children is greatly welcomed. GOOD launched a campaign to address Gender-Based Violence and we know domestic violence often gives way to endangering the lives of our children, and it is on this that we should develop stronger measures to protect them.

This Bill in question looks to address spiralling challenges which will serve the children of this province and the country at large. In equal measure, the act of deregistering children after continued absence from school, as well as the absence of social programmes and extra curriculum activities in communities, do more damage to our collective efforts than what it does any good. GOOD calls on the continued development of legislation to protect children's basic rights from being eroded on and that there is greater investment in our youth: their education, their participation in society and their future.

Social Development and Education should form the cornerstone for these programmes to be implemented and should become foundation institutions to protect children and build them to become valued citizens of this Republic. This Bill advances a great deal of the rights of children to be active members of society, to have access to a safe, loving, and caring home and to address challenges such as children's abductions.

Good welcomes this Bill, its development and what it seeks to achieve in the

lives and development of the future of our province. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member August. ACDP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The ACDP is not making a declaration now. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Christians. The Freedom Front Plus? [Interjections.] Freedom Front Plus? [Interjections.] Not responding. Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Al Jama-ah?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, Al Jama-ah supports this ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Bosman. Order, hon members. Hon member Brinkhuis, is that you?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Yes, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, yes, thank you very much. Al Jama-ah supports this Bill.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Proceed, hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Am I audible, hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Indeed, you are, hon member. You may proceed.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much. Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, Al Jama-ah supports this Bill. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Brinkhuis. That was short and sweet. The Democratic Alliance?

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much for the opportunity. During 2017, the North Gauteng High Court ruled that the foster care system in its current form is unconstitutional, unlawful, and invalid. [Interjection.] The Court also found that the delay in putting in place the necessary mechanism, structures, and resources to ensure that the foster care system operates in a sustainable and effective manner is also unconstitutional, unlawful, and invalid.

“The first respondent is directed within 15 months of this order to prepare and introduce before Parliament the necessary amendments to the Children’s Act 38 of 2000 and” ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Plato, please take your seat. Can I ask the two hon members on my righthand side – they know who they are, hon members Maseko and hon Bosman – can I please ask you not to converse aloud as you are interfering with the speaker on the floor. Thank you

very much. [Interjections.] You may continue [Interjections.] You may continue, hon member Plato.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

“The first respondent is directed within 15 months of this order to prepare and introduce before Parliament the necessary amendments to the Children’s Act 38 of 2005 or the Social Assistance Act 13 of 2014, to produce a comprehensive legal solution regarding the foster care system.”

Therefore, the main thrust of the Bill is to bring the Bill in line with the decision of the North Gauteng High Court. Our Standing Committee focused on clauses that relate to care, as well as to deal with the challenges and solutions relating to foster care. This Government’s Standing Committee on Social Development has played its meaningful role by embarking on an extensive public participation process to debate and getting input from stakeholders as far as possible.

On that note, hon Temporary Chairperson, I am very pleased to recommend, like others in this House today, acceptance of the final mandate as it stands. I thank all our hon members of the Standing Committee on Social Development for their support during this process. Thank you so much.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, hear, hear!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon member Plato. [Applause.] Thank you. Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, hon members, I am putting the question to you. Are there any objections to the motion?

HON MEMBERS: No! No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No objections, agreed to. Thank you very much, hon members. I have to announce that there are currently – the number of hon members in the House? [Laughter.] Order! Order, hon members. Thank you very much, hon members. Therefore, the Report on the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Children’s Amendment Bill has therefore been adopted.

Hon members, the Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

**3. Consideration of report of the Ad Hoc Committee on WCPP Seats, (see Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, no 135, dated 21 November 2022, 554)**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I have been informed by the hon Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration of the Vote for a maximum of three minutes. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. I now recognise the ANC.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The ANC

realising that as members of this House, we are all held liable, and our actions must speak what we preach. In the ANC, we therefore have read the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee Rule in terms of Rule 119 of the Standing Committee, the Rules for the increase of the seats in the Western Cape Provincial Legislature.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the ANC to support the adoption of this report today. When the Ad Hoc Committee was established earlier this year, the ANC mentioned that 28 years into our democracy, it would be fair to evaluate the number of representatives of our people in this House. Again, the ANC wishes to reiterate that amidst the economic challenges of our time, the ANC does not make this decision to adopt this report today recommending the increase in the number of seats in the House, lightly.

The Ad Hoc Committee established to investigate the feasibility of the increase in seats heard from the WCPP Research Unit presenting both qualitative and quantitative arguments for the increase in numbers. The Committee has also engaged the IEC and these discussions too, were helpful in the Committee making the recommendations that it does.

The demographics of our province, having changed over the last 20 years, and specifically, the increase in population. We cannot help though, but to mention those who criticise the migration of people in the Western Cape are also the ones supporting the increase of seats and therefore benefit from this increase in population. There should be little doubt that the ANC would want to go as far as scrapping the Provincial Constitution of the Western Cape altogether, yet as long as this Provincial Constitution remains in place, we will insist that at times, it be amended appropriately and that provisions as they stand in the implementation, are implemented.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC wishes to repeat that efforts must be made to ensure that our democracy is strengthened, and we therefore support any means which seek to strengthen the state and efficiency of our people's representation and therefore, democracy. The ANC supports the adoption of the report. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Lekker. [Applause.] I now recognise the EFF.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please continue, hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Yes, thanks. As the EFF, we take note of the recommendations that were made in the report in terms of the number of seats in the Western Cape Provincial Legislature. The understanding is that this will assist members in terms of effectiveness, as far as executing their duties in the House such as holding the Provincial Executive to account, as well as attending the party deployments, amongst other things; especially taking note that the last termination of seats was done in 1999 and since then, nothing has been made in that particular regard, which directly impacted on the constituency serving in

the Western Cape.

It is indeed true that hon members of House have a duty to hold the Provincial Executive to account. However, currently, as things stand, hon members of the DA in this House always defend their fellow DA members who serve in the Provincial Executive, rather than holding their members accountable. We have seen this happening in this House, in committees, as well as in SCOPA. So, having additional members will not change this attitude. Hon members of the DA will not suddenly say they have no additional members and therefore, take this House seriously. No, it is not going to happen. This is just an exercise that will seriously impact on the increase of membership and constituency serving, but it will not impact directly on the hon members of the House holding the Executive to account. Perhaps the model can be developed more effectively and successfully in developed countries with vast resources, and not just here in South Africa and other areas. But we do accept and support this Bill that let there be changes in terms of the seat numbers. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Xego. The GOOD party?

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Temporary Chairperson, the cost of living is at an all time high. The cost of rates, taxes, food, water, and electricity is crippling citizens and they simply do not have more financial rope left to honour living expenses. While the people are suffering, this Government adopts a position to increase the seat capacity of the Legislature to pay more politicians, dish out millions more to secretarial and constituency allowances and all this, to whose cost? The already overburdened taxpayer who simply cannot carry it.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, we are living in a time of digital wonder, technological advancements, and greater strides with innovation. This House prides itself that it could continue its work at the onslaught of the COVID-19 pandemic as it incorporated virtual sittings. Considering this and ensuring that politicians should ...[Interjection.] technology ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member August? Hon member August, my apologies for interrupting you. Please take your seat. There is a point of order in the House. Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, is hon member August willing to take a question about what he did in the Committee when it sat? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Sayed. That is not a point of order. Please continue, hon member August.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I have not made any comments in the House or in the Committee at all. While I have attended, I was there only to listen, but let me proceed, hon Temporary Chairperson. Considering this [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order hon members! [Interjections.] Order,

hon members. Hon member August, please proceed.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Considering this and ensuring that politicians should incorporate technology in the advancement of political work, the same DA is now asking the people of the Western Cape to look the other way as they want to give more of their friends millions, whilst some people in the province go hungry daily.

GOOD opposes the call for the Government to increase the seat capacity of this Legislature. It is a waste of limited public resources that could have been better utilised elsewhere. Whilst the DA is looking to enlarge the gravy train, there are children going to bed hungry who have not had a meal in days; a young man slaughtering cats for consumption just to be able to survive; women, children and youth being raped, murdered, abducted and trafficked; large scale joblessness, zero opportunities, unemployed graduates, broken families and communities, and many more social challenges.

In the face of all of this, the DA-led Provincial Government is of the opinion that more politicians are the answer and taxpayers should just be okay with carrying these costs at a time where our people have so little trust in politicians and little apathy for politics itself. Not only is this wrong, but it is also insensitive and out of touch with the plight of the people who could benefit more from that money should it be reprioritised into a working and functional social package. This is plainly opportunistic and should be condemned in the strongest sense. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member August. ACDP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ACDP supports the adoption of this report of the Ad Hoc Committee concerning the Western Cape Provincial Parliament seats. It is a fact that the current number of seats is not sufficient to represent the people of the Western Cape optimally. Only 31 members serving on committees have oversight, engage in public and constituency-based work, while 11 of the members serve on the Executive. So, an increase is critical to serve the people of the Western Cape. We know that the numbers, the population growth, have increased to almost 7 million people and it does not do justice to 31 members doing oversight.

I must also say that well done to the Chair, hon Van der Westhuizen, and the hon members of the Committee who held and contributed to the compilation of the report. It was well done. Hon members worked well together, and we can achieve much more working together in order to ensure that our residents in the Western Cape are heard and their needs are addressed. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. Freedom Front Plus? Freedom Front Plus? No indication. Al Jama-ah?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Yes, hon Temporary Chairperson, on behalf of the Al Jama-ah we support the adoption of the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on seats, to increase the seats of the Western Cape Legislature. I thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Brinkhuis. [Interjections.] The Democratic Alliance? [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, until the hon August spoke, all parties in this House supported this report. Between the passing of the Western Cape Constitution in 1996 and 2021, the population of the Western Cape grew by more than 44%. This means that instead of the target of 1 for every 100 000 citizens, we are currently each serving almost 170 000 citizens.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Zondo Commission confirmed the importance of good governance. It goes without saying that if the people of this province feel divorced from the democratic processes that take place in this House, the very purpose of the democracy that we have worked so hard to establish and to build in this province and the country, is defeated. [Interjections.] For this reason, ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...this House unanimously decided earlier this year to form an Ad Hoc Committee, representing all parties in the House to investigate whether the current size of the Legislature is still appropriate. [Interjections.]

The Committee benefitted tremendously from studies done by the research section, the support of the Committee section, as well as information provided by our legal advisors. Our attention was drawn, inter alia, to the finding of the Constitutional Court in 1999 that provinces with their own constitutions have the right to determine the number of seats in the Legislature and (b) that the Electoral Act was amended last year requiring of the IEC to now determine, redetermine the number of seats before every national election. This formula of 1:100 000 residents has remained in that amended Electoral Act.

So, I am pleased to report that this multi-party body has unanimously decided to recommend that the Western Cape Constitution be amended to allow for the growth in population figures and at the time, it did include the vote from hon August as well. Given that we all agree that such a change is necessary, on paper at least, I would urge all hon members of this House to work together to ensure that the process of revising Section 13 of the Western Cape Constitution is completed in time for the 2024 elections – that is, if we do not go for an early election – which again, will give our people the representation in the Legislature which they so deserve. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): I thank all hon members in this House, especially those on the Ad Hoc Committee for their willingness ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Van der Westhuizen, please wrap up.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...to work together on this matter and look forward to seeing a more representative Western Cape Provincial Parliament in future. Therefore, I urge all hon members to support the report on the Ad Hoc Committee ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...on the number of Western Cape Provincial Parliament seats ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. What is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the point of order relates to creating precedent in this House. As we all know, we were just hearing declarations regarding a multi-party Committee and I think we must just, and I would like you as an hon Temporary Chairperson possibly to rule on this at a later point when you discuss, but when a Chair of a multi-party committee then addresses the House, that Chair should avoid making party political statements because he is actually reflecting a report on a committee.

So, it is not something that, you know, we are going to crucify hon Van der Westhuizen for, but it is not good practice when he brings in this ridiculous notion of an early election when he is not. He is representing his party there, whereas actually, he was representing the multi-party Committee. I think it is just a lesson for the hon member to learn. [Interjections.] He is still young in this House.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. ...[Interjection.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Van der Westhuizen, are you ...[Interjection.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): On a point of order? On a point of order?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Threatening a member with crucifixion, is that ...[Laughter.] is that parliamentary? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very ...[Laughter.] [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Order, hon members. Hon Dugmore, we will ...[Interjection.] Hon Dugmore, do you wish the Chair to make a ruling? Was that your request or did you just give the lesson? [Laughter.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is, thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. It is an issue of precedent and possibly, you know [Interjections.]. Once we have a new Speaker ...[Interjections.] once we have a new Speaker elected, we can just ask that Speaker to investigate. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Ask the Speaker to investigate a convention in regard to multi-party committees and how they report. Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I do note your comment, hon Dugmore. Unfortunately, the Temporary Chairperson cannot influence members' speeches.

Hon members, I put the question before or rather, I have to announce that there are currently 36 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Western Cape Provincial Parliament Seats be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted, hon members?

HON MEMBERS: No. None.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No objections ...[Interjection.]

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Agreed to. [Interjections.]

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Temporary Chairperson, please note GOOD's objection. [Laughter.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your objection is recorded, hon August. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! We are getting there. [Interjections.]. Order, hon members! The Secretary will now read the Fourth Order of the Day.

**4. Consideration of report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements. Theme: Dignity Oversight activities undertaken by the Committee (see Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, no 142, dated 28 November 2022, p 568).**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration of the Vote for a maximum of three minutes per party. I will now afford you to do so. I recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC notes and welcomes the tabling of this report. The Dignity Oversight report is a culmination of various interactions and engagements with district and category B municipalities between February and September 2022.

The Oversight visit enabled the Committee to witness housing delivery challenges in the Province and across municipalities. There needs to be an urgent intervention to address the challenges related to the Housing Demand Database in all municipalities and the Province. The hon MEC must lead the process of upgrading and aligning this Database, as it is a mess in all municipalities and in the Province. This, together with the rapid spread of informal settlements was raised starkly as a concern in many municipalities. The municipalities also highlighted the poor living conditions of our people in informal settlements where they are living with minimal basic services at their disposal, due to insufficient resources. There must be concerted efforts to address these challenges. The MEC and Mayors must be seen to be championing these.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the report is welcome as a fair reflection of the housing situation in the province and municipalities. The Western Cape and its municipalities are performing so badly on housing development that if they were to be rated, many will get 1 out of 10. The pace of housing delivery in the province is worryingly low.

Take, for example, the Trans Hex housing projects which were started in 2019/2020 with the aim to deliver 3 226 mixed houses in the first phase. The first 44 houses were supposed to be handed over in December 2020, which was later moved to March 2021 and again, to March 2022. In December 2022, this December – this December 2022 – not a single house had been handed over. The National Home Builders Registration Council (NHBRC) refused to sign off on the 33 houses due to structural problems. This report is therefore welcome as it exposes DA complacency. It shows how the hon MEC remains clueless in this space.

The ANC also continues to make calls on the hon MEC to prioritise providing housing for Ms Bless and her physically challenged son in Witzenberg, who continue to live in squalor. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Marran. I recognise the EFF. The EFF? I recognise the GOOD party.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Dignity Report 2022 is this Government's presentation to the people of the province to showcase what it has been doing to address decades of human settlements backlogs in various districts and local municipalities in the Western Cape. GOOD stands resolute that we cannot maintain the apartheid spatial architecture where a railway-line, a road or field opening separates different groupings of people and communities.

GOOD calls and will continue to ring the call that this Government and the rest of the country should expediently ensure that the building of affordable housing units in city business and town centres for people to be closer to their place of work, institutions of education, health services and markets, allow for communities of all races, backgrounds, religions, creeds and origins, to bring together those ideals of a true Rainbow Nation; build and develop integrated mixed-use building complexes, such as developments in Bredasdorp and Cape Town, that will ensure all people of this province can access a dignified place of living. How people live matters, where people live matters, how people access public transport matters and how they make an income, matters. At the heart of all this, this is the Human Settlements factor.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, giving people a dignified home should be the core focus of this Government. The Dignity Report gives some evidence to that, but we must go much further than this. We must do more to address the dire need of housing and the backlog of their delivery. We need to advance Government subsidies, services and support the fast-track mechanisms such as Finance Linked Individual Subsidy Programme (FLISP) so that young people, South Africans, can buy into housing markets of their choice, whether it is in Camps Bay, Platteklouf, Bellville or in our rural communities.

In addition, GOOD calls on greater inclusion of environmentally friendly build techniques and materials, to include greater forestry projects into Human Settlements developments and ensure that we do our utmost best to protect the environment as much as we need to protect the dignity in destitute people in search of a home. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon August. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson, the ACDP supports the Dignity Oversight Report. Just a concern that was highlighted in the report is the increase in the number of Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) houses that are being rented out to migrants by beneficiaries. So, that was one of the major concerns. Another major concern was also the farm evictions in areas that were adding to the housing demand in the Theewaterskloof Municipality. Another major concern, and this is where municipalities had to get security guards, employ security guards, to protect the illegal occupation of erven.

So, the ACDP notes that there are major concerns and hopes that these concerns and challenges will be addressed. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Christians. The Freedom Front Plus? Vryheidsfront Plus? No response. Al Jama-ah? [Interjections.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, Al Jama-ah welcomes this report. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. The Democratic Alliance?

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, hon Premier, hon Cabinet members, and hon members. The Standing Committee on Human Settlements has conducted numerous oversight visits under the theme Dignity across the Western Cape this year. The purpose of these visits was to determine whether the commitments made by hon Minister Tertius Simmers earlier in the year, have materialised, giving our communities hope and most importantly, to ensure that residents of the Western Cape know the dignity of home ownership.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, in April of this year, the Standing Committee visited the Garden Route District Municipalities as part of its oversight role to interact with the municipalities, which are B municipalities. The local governments highlighted to the Standing Committee members the challenges they had in providing housing, including the issuing of historical title deeds for the years 1994 to 2014. The Provincial Department of Human Settlements sought to address this issue by making available a grant for title deed restoration to help Garden Route municipalities clear their backlogs. It was clear from the visits that the Western Cape Government remains committed to the eradication of title deeds backlog in the province.

Members of the Committee also ensured that the Provincial Department continues to be aware of challenges through various oral and parliamentary questions to the hon Minister throughout the year. The Standing Committee also embarked on oversight visits to the Cape Winelands where the projects of the Provincial Department of Human Settlements were observed in May this year. The Cape Winelands District Municipalities also revealed details to the Committee about their project on urbanisation challenges, in which the municipality is trying to determine how rapidly the populations from both formal and informal settlements are growing in the area. The Committee commended the Cape Winelands Districts for committing to prepare itself for substantial population growth, in light of the Western Cape's expanding population, and the impact this will have on housing delivery.

Furthermore, the Standing Committee, hon Temporary Chairperson, also visited the Mill Park housing development project in the Cape Agulhas Municipality. In this initiative, the Western Cape Government observed a rise in the Bredasdorp

community's interests in buying homes for the first time. It was quite clear that people in the Western Cape have a strong desire to own their own homes and the Provincial Department of Human Settlements continues to support these needs through initiatives like the Help Me Buy a Home programme.

In order to ensure that the Provincial Department fulfils its commitment to offer more people with access to affordable housing opportunities across the province, the Standing Committee will continue to make significant efforts in performing oversight and meeting with the communities and municipalities. With the numbers increasing on the Housing Demand Database, we need to be innovative if we are to tackle ever increasing backlog ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Maseko, you need to wrap up, please.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you. I would like to close by thanking the members of the Human Settlements Standing Committee who crossed the province in a fact-finding mission, for their dedication as seeking transparency from all spheres of Government and making sure that their oversight responsibilities are carried out with diligence.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I have to announce that there are currently 32 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the Report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements with the theme Dignity Oversight activities undertaken by the Committee, be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted?

HON MEMBERS: No! No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No objections, agreed to. Hon members, the Secretary will now read the Fifth Order of the Day. Or rather, my apologies, which is permitted. The Report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements with the theme Dignity Oversight activities undertaken by the Committee, has therefore been adopted. The Secretary will now read the Fifth Order of the Day.

**5. Consideration of report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B 22–2022] (NCOP), dated 22 November 2022 (see Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, no 143, dated 28 November 2022, p 569) (Ratification of final mandate.)**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Order, hon members. The House received the Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP, not to support the Bill. This mandate has been sent to

the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration of three minutes each if they so wish. I recognise the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The African National Congress supports the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill. The ANC acknowledged the R290 million Municipal Disaster Recovery Grant allocated towards the reconstruction and rehabilitation of municipal infrastructure damaged by flash floods in the Western Cape Province between November and December 2021. This grant comes after the Overberg District, Garden Route District, and the Cape Winelands District Municipalities experienced flooding towards the end of last year, destroying over 80 homes along with public infrastructure. We believe that this grant will provide these municipalities with the necessary relief that they require and prevention against future catastrophes.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC also notes from the Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure Budget, the increase of the Provincial Equitable Share in several Votes. Notably, the Department of Social Development and the Department of Transport and Public Works. The Department of Social Development with this budget increase could create more employment of unemployed social worker graduates, as well as increase the budgets for victim empowerment and food relief programmes.

While notorious for underspending, this Provincial Government will never not shut up about restricted funding from National. They piloted the Blue Dot project and even though it yielded good results, they discontinued it complaining about the budget. Surely, there were reserves where they had secured funding from, so what is stopping them from doing it again? But because this project is for the mini-bus taxi industry which caters for the black population, it will never take precedence in the eyes of the DA.

As stated at the beginning of the year, the Equitable Share Formula is a work-in-progress, and we will still maintain hope that the Provincial Government can cooperate with the National Government by supplying a constructive proposal in the development of the Formula. The ANC supports the Bill. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hear, hear!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I recognise the EFF. The EFF? No response. The GOOD party?

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. No declarations in support.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon August. The ACDP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ACDP does not support the Bill. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Christians. The Freedom Front Plus? The Freedom Front Plus? No response. Al Jama-ah?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, Al Jama-ah supports the Division of Revenue Bill. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I will be short because quite frankly, this Bill does not say much. In fact, it says almost next to nothing. In terms of this Bill, if one can go look at page 4, the Western Cape received R0 in terms of the Provincial Equitable Share Formula. There is also R0 adjustment in conditional grants for the Western Cape municipalities, specifically receiving R289 million for the Municipal Disaster Recovery Grant [Interjections.] and we welcome that we are receiving, these municipalities are receiving this Municipal ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...Disaster Recovery Grant. But because the ANC house is falling apart so much, the National Treasury tabled the money to the wrong municipalities, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape opposes the recent revisions, revised allocations for the health component in the Provincial Equitable Share Formula as it means the Western Cape will lose over R500 million in the healthcare funding over the medium term. Our calls to include Inclusive Education, formally known as Special Needs Education and Gender-Based Violence as practiced ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Baartman, my apologies. Please take your seat. Hon Marran and hon Kama, we have now provided the previous speakers the opportunity to deliver their declarations. Can we please afford the same courtesy to the hon member on the floor, please? [Interjections.] Thank you very much. Hon member, please proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Western Cape schools plea to include inclusive education, formally known as Special Needs Education and Gender-Based Violence as factors in the Provincial Equitable Share Formula, continues to also fall upon deaf ears. The Budget Committee considered thus the subject of the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill referred to in accordance with Standing Rule 217 and recommended that the House confers on the Western Cape's delegation in the National Council of Provinces, the authority to not support the Bill. We had a minority view in terms of Standing Rule 19 as the National African Congress expressed its minority view that it supports the Bill. Ironically enough, I do not see in this report a view from Al Jama-ah, which is a permanent member on the Committee.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, before I conclude, I just want to say: the Western Cape will unashamedly continue to fight for its fair share in terms of the Provincial Equitable Share. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): We support this report to object to the Bill.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. [Interjections.] I have to announce that there are currently 31 – order, hon members! Hon member Marran, we are almost there. [Interjections.] Because I only see you speaking. Hon members, order! Hon members, I have to announce that there are currently 31 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question before the House that the Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill, be ratified and adopted.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No!

An HON MEMBER: Agree!

An HON MEMBER: No.

HON MEMBERS: Agree! Agree!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I have put the question to the House. Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: No!

HON MEMBERS: No!

HON MEMBERS: Yes! Yes! Object, object!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Objection recorded. The report ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Al Jama-ah objects. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Al Jama-ah objects.

An HON MEMBER: Al Jama-ah objects.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Noted, hon Brinkhuis. The report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill has therefore been adopted. Hon members, that concludes the business for the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited from the sitting. The House is adjourned.

---

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS**

THURSDAY, 1 DECEMBER 2022

**ANNOUNCEMENT**

The Secretary:

1. In terms of section 62(5) of the national Constitution, read with section 2(3) of the National Council of Provinces (Permanent Delegates Vacancies) Act, 1997 (Act 17 of 1997), Mr Frederik Jacobus Badenhorst was appointed as Permanent Delegate of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament to the National Council of Provinces.
2. On Monday 28 November 2022 the Secretary to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament informed the (former) Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Mr Masizole Mngqasela, that the office of the Secretary received correspondence from the Democratic Alliance regarding the cessation of his membership of that political party.

Mr Mngqasela was further informed that, in terms of section 106(3)(c) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, his membership of the WCPP has ceased.

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT**

---

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams.]

The House met at 10:00

The Temporary Chairperson took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 6631****BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Good morning to all our hon members and to guests and those that are currently online. As we proceed today with our Order Paper, before we proceed, I would like to just remind the members about some of the logistical arrangements with regard to participating virtually and ensuring that you please have good audio and that there are no disturbances when you are online. I have also granted media access or access to the media, but just to remind all our guests that they may not interrupt or switch on their microphones or their video cameras during the Sitting and hon members are reminded that no interjections are permitted during the hybrid Sittings, and to this end I draw the hon members' attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules. Hon members, we will then now proceed to the first Order of the Day. Hon Sayed, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The first issue before I go into the issues relating to the debate and time allocations – we received an ATC yesterday indicating that the Speaker or former Speaker is no longer a member of the House. Could we please get clarity from the Secretary possibly or by yourself as to whether a vacancy has been declared, because, if that is indeed the case, then the necessary processes ought to take place for the election of a Speaker in this particular House. We cannot continue with so much of business, important business, without having an elected Speaker as a matter of urgency.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Deputy Whip Sayed. I would like to just remind the House that yesterday's Sitting we had a Temporary Chair that dealt with the matter according to the Rules, so that is firstly the most important. I would also like to just take the opportunity, if I may – give me a second please, sorry, I am not using a mouse, – alright, that in terms of the ATC on 1 December in terms of Section 62(5) of the National Constitution read with Section 2.3 of the National Council of Provinces, alright, that was dealt with as a motion. Then with regard to the Secretary's matter on Monday, 28 November 2022, the Secretary to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament informed the former Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Mr Masizole Mngqasela, that the Office of the Secretary received correspondence from the Democratic Alliance regarding the cessation of his membership of that political party.

“Mr Mngqasela was further informed that in terms of Section 106 (3)(c) of the

Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, his membership of the WCPP has ceased..." I quote, according to the ATC.

I also note that yesterday's motion, which was supported in this House, the Secretary had used his formal mandate, as per the Parliamentary motion, to communicate that ATC as well as communicate directly to the former Speaker. I trust that that will answer your question, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, partially, but at the stage when we raised the issue and when clarity was given there was no ATC. Now the matter has been ATC'd, so post the matter being ATC'd, it is only correct then that we are given clarity as to whether a vacancy has been declared and actually a vacancy ought to be declared and we ought to then be having a Speaker, because at that stage the matter was not ATC'd.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, so in terms of my position as Deputy Speaker, hon Sayed, I do not have the mandate to declare anything of such a nature. It would have to come through the Secretary in his new powers. Alright, thank you very much. Over to you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, no indeed, we are not expecting you as the Deputy Speaker, to, in any way, declare a vacancy. The mere fact that the Secretary has that powers the Secretary ought to be and the Secretary is in the House. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, ja, but the Secretary does not have that opportunity to make that decision now in the House, according to the Order Paper, so what I am asking... [Interjections.] May I finish? What I would like to suggest is we have given the power to the Secretary, allow the Secretary to take up that mandate in his right. I cannot ask him to make that decision here in the House as the Presiding Officer. Hon members, can I also just state that I am here as the Deputy Speaker in terms of Rule 26 and that the House can continue, as I am able to carry out, according to the Rules, my job to finish the Order Paper for today. I do not have any other mandate other than that in this Sitting. Yes, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Mr Dugmore had his hand up for quite a while. He was not recognised.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, sorry, I was focussing on you. Hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, and good morning hon members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Good morning.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I think in terms of the motion my understanding is that, which was carried, that the Secretary was given the powers to take necessary actions in regard to any legal challenge or where the Legislature is summonsed to appear or to defend any action and that he is asked to then, and secondly the power then to give reports, and thirdly, that for

as long as the Speaker's position remains vacant, that he would take over the functions of receiving statutory and other information. But, I think we have a challenge, which, I think, we must address in the best possible way, and that is that, as you have indicated, Deputy Speaker, you do not have the power to now act. Alright, the Secretary's functions here do not include the issue that member Sayed has raised. So it is very clear and member Nkondlo dealt with that yesterday about Section 20 of our Constitution, which says that the Provincial Parliament must elect a Speaker from amongst its members at its first Sitting or when necessary to fill a vacancy. So, I think the clarity that we require, what is the process that we need to follow. Obviously, we have to contact the President of the Constitutional Court to designate a Judge, but it seems that there is no direction coming now, so surely this House – because it says here that the House must elect. We are sitting here as this House and we should deal with this matter and then possibly specifically pass a resolution to instruct the Secretary to contact the President of the Constitutional Court to designate a Judge. So surely, you know, we can ask the Whips that are here today, they have an opportunity to go and sit, and then to come to this House while we are sitting to pass such a resolution, because where else, given that we do not have a Speaker and you do not have those powers. So I would suggest that we need to ask the Whips to confer and to come back to this session so we can pass such a resolution, giving the mandate to the Secretary to actually do that. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Firstly, Deputy Speaker, because any such matter is not on the Order Paper for today, this House in terms of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, is only able to deal with matters that are on the Order Paper. Given that the resolution has passed, and we have given the Secretary the powers... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order members!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): We need to allow the Secretary to do his respective job and the reason that we cannot suspend for the Whippers to meet in order for something like that to be considered today in terms of Rule 151 subsection (3), is that there needs to be unanimous – I repeat:

“...unanimous concurrence of all the members present, no motion may be moved on the day on which the notice is given thereof...”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, hon Nkondlo!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): And I do acknowledge no motion has been given to date. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, one minute. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] So, hon members, hon members, before I – can I respond? Hon members... [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo, I would like to respond, hon Nkondlo. So, hon members, I think, firstly... [Interjections.] Hon Dugmore, give me a second.

Hon Dugmore is correct that I have no powers to do so, but just remember that that motion was only passed yesterday, and if I remember you finished at 7:30 p. m. [Interjections.] Hon members, you finished at 7:30 p.m. last night. I trust that the Secretary will communicate all relevant information as he is mandated to do in front of this House and that he will communicate or take up the processes, which is only less than 24 hours after the motion was passed. So we do need to give him the space to be able to act in his mandate. He only got that yesterday, firstly.

Secondly, I would like to just remind the House and many of you have been here for many years, that the Acting Chief Whip is quite correct that the Order Paper is the Order Paper, and that 151.3, hon Sayed or hon Lekker, as the Whips, are very clear about motions. So I am not able to make such a ruling, and nor can anybody else, because we have an Order Paper that has been approved and has to carry through the business of today. I have also, just to say, availed myself and I would perhaps advise all of you, I have availed myself till 10 p.m. tonight. We will get through this Order Paper.

It is a Friday evening. I am free to be here in the House till 10 p.m. – maybe later if we need to, but we need... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Speaker... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I am fully mandated, as the Deputy Speaker, to run the House today in a Sitting and I will certainly do so. So I would ask that you all make arrangements, because we have to get through the Order of the Day. Hon Dugmore, but I did see hon Kama, your hand was up, and then hon Dugmore. First to hon Dugmore – give me a second. Hon Kama, sit for one second. Hon Dugmore can take...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I think there was an initial confusion which we have later established that in fact whether that below-the-line motion of yesterday was adopted but we are told that it was adopted, so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I am moving from that base. Now, the issue is, the Chief Whip of the Majority Party just read out a particular Rule there, which says that on the day of the Sitting, if there is a unanimous support for that resolution, it can be tabled. So I am not suggesting that we interrupt this program. What I am suggesting is that we bring such a motion during the course of the day and that we ask that that motion be discussed, because surely there is no-one in this House... [Interjection.] There is no-one in this House that would object to this House resolving to give the mandate to the Secretary to actually enact 20.1 and 2, which is to contact the court-designated Judge and he elects a Speaker. My worry is that in terms of the limited powers that were given... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: In terms of the limited powers

that were given to the Secretary, the Speaker is kind of the Executive Authority of the House. There are going to be many issues that need to be dealt with and the House cannot proceed without a Speaker for a very long time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And I think it is in our interest to pass such a resolution, give that power, and then elect a Speaker next week.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So hon Dugmore, before I take anybody else's hands, you have in your right in terms of Rules 150.1.1, 150.1.2 and 150.1.3 to bring a motion on the day. You may certainly act within your rights of the Rules and I cannot object to you doing so. [Interjections.] But just, hon Kama, and then hon Sayed and then I have seen Minister Meyer. So hon Kama, first to you. Have you been covered?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, I think I am covered, Deputy Speaker, the point really that one wanted to make is that we cannot run the House like this, that we cannot be surprised, because we were surprised here yesterday in the House, as members of this House, that we do not have a Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is correct.

Mr M KAMA: As it was then later ATC'd.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr M KAMA: And now we are led to just sit in this House and not know what is happening with the position of the Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, okay.

Mr M KAMA: And I think overall the point we are making is that all of us need to understand that we are not in a DA caucus here. We are in a Provincial Parliament and we need to give it that respect so that we are able to run this House and give it the decorum it deserves. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, have you – are you covered or can I move over?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am covered.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are covered, thank you. Hon Baartman, and then hon Minister Meyer. Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I think and extraordinary circumstances require bold leadership. We are sitting with a crisis. We do not have a Speaker. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A crisis, it is a crisis!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We do not have a Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We also know the process around removal, that is fine, but we do not have a Speaker. As hon Kama says, this is not a DA caucus. To argue, because there is an argument now that was presented that the motion must come through the Programming Authority. There was a motion passed yesterday that did not come through the Programming Authority so that point becomes moot, but I think what is important for us to do, is given the crisis, given the fact that we are not finding each other, I do not see the harm in the House taking a decision and agreeing that as a matter of urgency, before we go any further, the Whips must meet, and then let the House then agree to mandate the Secretary to immediately declare a vacancy, and make sure ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And make sure that we elect...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The process must start for the election of the Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And the DA must tell us, they are standing up here on a whole lot of frivolous technicalities... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama. [Interjections.] Hon Marran.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They must tell us that they are not ready because the internal factionalism is saying that they are not ready, they do not know whom they want as the Speaker. We have a Deputy Speaker. You have the choices to make. Make up your mind and do not hold the people of the Western Cape to ransom.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Baartman.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Firstly, Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.] Firstly, Deputy Speaker, yesterday's motion was submitted in terms of Notice of Motion proceedings in terms of Rule 151 subsection (2). The request in terms of precedence was given yesterday in the House in terms of Rule 20 subsection (2) in order to bring it above the line, which does not require Programming Authority if in terms of precedence the House then agrees to give the respective motion which was moved duly above the line. In terms of Notice of Motion proceedings you have to bring a Notice of Motion in terms of the Rules. That is 151 subsection (2). Should the ANC wish to bring a Notice of Motion for matters to be dealt with today... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... in terms of Rule 151 subsection (3) we are more than happy for them to exercise their respective rights... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... in terms of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament Rules. However, Deputy Speaker, in terms of the Order Paper today this is the Order Paper at 10 o'clock today and we have not seen a Notice of Motion and we have not been asked to move that respective Notice of Motion above the line, and therefore we need to continue with the Order Paper of the Day. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister Meyer. [Interjections.] Attention, order members! Just give everybody the opportunity, please. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bans!

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Hon Deputy Speaker, it is quite clear what is happening here now. This is a pretext of what has happened yesterday. So let us be clear about what the Rules say and what governs these Rules in terms of this matter before the House. I think the hon Deputy Chief Whip is correct, that except with a unanimous concurrence, and this is Rule 151 subsection (3), that except with a unanimous concurrence and she has read it and I am re-reading it to all the members present:  
“No motion may be moved on the day on which the notice thereof is given...”

The Rules are clear, it cannot be, but as the Deputy Chief Whip has indicated, it can happen at a later stage, but not now, and so therefore we cannot and should not – and should not – continue to disrupt the House... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran!

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Because then we disrupt the Rules of the House. We have to act in terms of the Rules, but above the Rules is the Constitution... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: And the Constitution is very clear, subsection / Section 20 of the Constitution:

“The Provincial Parliament must elect a Speaker from amongst its members...”

As the hon Leader of the Official Opposition indicated:

“... members at the first Sitting, after its election, or when necessary, to fill a vacancy...”

Filling a vacancy is a process, it cannot be this engagement. So I ask you, the Deputy Chair, to proceed because of the Rules that is clear and of the process that is described on which the Secretary will have to apply his mind and come back to the House, but it cannot be today. It is not on the Order Paper.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is correct.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: So may I, with due respect, hon Deputy Speaker, as the Leader of Government Business, propose that we continue with the order of business.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, I am not going to entertain further. You know your Rules. You may act well within the Rules of the House. If you want to bring a motion, there is a Sitting on Monday, and you may certainly do that within whatever Rules it is allowed... [Interjections.] But, it is very clear.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Order, Deputy Speaker, order, order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, you do not have to shout, you know I always recognise you. Hon Sayed, you may stand up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order, we cannot conclude the matter just after the Leader of Government Business, we are not being run here by the Executive. There are members here, hon Lekker, and hon Dugmore have got their hands up. I think it is only fair that their hands be entertained.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But we can also continue to raise the same frivolous points of order. We have to work within the Rules, so hon Dugmore, I will recognise you, but I have to start the Order of the Day.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, we have no intention not to proceed with this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We have no intention, Deputy Speaker, not to proceed with this, but... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But please may I ask your members to keep quiet.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Okay, sorry. But, it is a problem when the Leader of Government Business and the Chief Whip of the Majority Party selectively read from Rules, because they did not read out 151(1)(a), which says:

“... that when giving notice of a motion, a member must read it aloud and deliver at the table a signed copy of the notice, deliver to the Secretary..”

Who is sitting with us here:

“... on any working day for placing on the Order Paper.”

Now that means that technically there is nothing stopping us, except obviously if, and then I go onto 3:

“... except with the unanimous concurrence of all the members no motion may be moved on the day...”

So in practical terms, what we would like to suggest is that if we submit such a motion to the Secretary now... [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: It can happen.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It can happen, and then if, if it is unanimous. Obviously if you vote – no-no, through the Deputy Speaker, if you vote against it, then it is not unanimous... [Interjections.] But we are trying to make an argument that the motion... [Interjection.]

The motion that we are trying to submit would then give a specific... [Interjections.] Sorry, Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I cannot, it is your own side that is creating too much noise.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That that would then give a specific mandate to the Secretary because the mandate that the Secretary was given yesterday was a limited mandate, and surely if we formulate a motion in a way, and we want to bring that motion here in the course of this morning, which indicates that that specific power, because we have a gap in our Rules... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, sure.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... so this is like a precedented situation. So what I would like to request is that we proceed with the proceedings and in the course of the morning we will submit a motion to the Secretary in front of everyone. We can then, as a House, entertain that. If it is not unanimous, then clearly it is not unanimous.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, ja. So hon Dugmore, and I would just like to respond. I just, firstly, hon Dugmore, can you check that you... [Interjections.] Hon members! Can you just check that you have March of 2021 Rules, just, you have the right ones? Okay. So I just want to – you are welcome to do hon Dugmore, Rule 1 says:

“When giving notice of a motion the member must deliver to the Secretary a signed copy of the notice on any working day for placing on the Order Paper.”

The Order Paper is already pre-populated. However, however, hon Dugmore, are you with me?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is reading. Hon Dugmore, however, you can, you may exercise your right as an Opposition and do and go and put something on paper. Whether it is within the Rules is another story, but it will have to be decided upon. In fact, you also may seek legal advice on the matter in terms of the interpretation of the Rule. [Interjections.] Alright, so can we now proceed? I am now going to move, hon Baartman. Hon Baartman, okay.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. I just want to make it clear and on the record from the Democratic Alliance's side. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Marran.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): If the ANC wishes to bring a Notice of Motion in terms of Rule 151 subsection (1) and subsection (2), it is their right. If they wish to ask a question in this House in terms of Rule 151 subsection (3) it is their right and we will deal with the matter at that time. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct, thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, can I ask...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No-no, I think we...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: These are the last two questions and then we can proceed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Chair, sorry, Chairperson.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot hear. [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo! [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo, your own Leader of the Opposition cannot be heard. Alright.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I just must indicate that although it does not make material difference, I do not want to give this House the wrong impression that what the first thing – it was actually March... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I was wondering.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is very clear from the... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that the March Rules?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...the March '21 Rules.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Exactly the same, that except with the unanimous concurrence, when giving a notice, a signed copy must be delivered to the Secretary, etcetera. [Interjections.] So the contents are exactly the same, but I just wanted to correct that. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Lekker, the last point that I am going to do, yes, over to you, your hand is up.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I would want to rise on a point of order in reference to how the Deputy or the Acting Chief Whip has actually identified herself in this House, which is unprecedented and tomorrow we will be then having a House that has a Chief Whip, a Deputy Chief Whip of the House, a Speaker and a Deputy Speaker of the House, who are no longer referred to as members of the House but rather as members belonging to a particular political party in this House. Now I... [Interjection.] Shut up!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Uh-uh, no-no-no, hon Lekker, no! [Interjections.] Hon Lekker, no! [Interjections.] No-no, hon Lekker, one minute. Hon Nkondlo, no! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But why are you [Inaudible.]. Why are you stopping ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a point of order? Premier?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You must sit down until you are recognised! [Microphone muted.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon Lekker, just one minute. [Interjections.] Hon minute, hon Sayed. I am talking to her. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Why is there... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, just one minute.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: A point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. I would like you to withdraw that. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise on a point of order on the statement made now by the Chief Whip of the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: To shut-up. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: She said, to use the word, that is not parliamentary.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Can you also rule that what she said now is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order, how do you... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, Chair, a point of order! [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Yes, Speaker, you are biased. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, I am speaking to hon Lekker... [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Why are you allowing him, but they were shouting at our Chief Whip... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, hon Meyer and the DA do not have free privilege in the House. He cannot just stand up when he is not being recognised and speak.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, but I recognised him.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He should have first sat down, put up his hand. He has been in this House for long. I mean, I remember him 2009 already he has been here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He is supposed to sit down...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos! [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: You allow the DA members to speak as they wish to our Chief Whip and our members. You allow them!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members, order members! Hon Bakubaku-Vos, you have not been recognised. Please put your microphone off. [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Deputy Speaker, our Chief Whip, when she responds, she is wrong. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, please!

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: You are biased!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, hon Lekker, would you mind rising, please? Hon Lekker. Hon Lekker, would you mind rising, please? So can I just have

order in the House, please? Before anybody stood up, hon Lekker knows, I am just asking to withdraw. That is all. We know that the word “shut up” is unparliamentary. It does not matter who says it, and it does not matter who rises on it. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Uyagula.

[An HON MEMBER: You are mad.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, hon Lekker. Hon Lekker, you would not appreciate that either. If I can ask...

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I withdraw, Chair, but those two must keep quiet.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, will you withdraw, thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): When someone is speaking they must keep quiet.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much. Can we proceed to the first Order of the Day?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now call on... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Still my point of order... [Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: My hand is up, my hand is up, Deputy Speaker, my hand is up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos! Can you please mute hon Bakubaku-Vos, she is not recognised.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, you asked me to withdraw the word “shut-up”.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, yes, yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And not my point of order, that I was raising in this House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, what is your point of order? So I just asked you to withdraw the word.

†The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Kutheni wena?

[The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): What’s wrong with you?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon Lekker, focus on me, please.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, that one must just be ordered.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon Lekker, I cannot entertain that if there is a

point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker, I think it is going to be important that members of the Executive behave as members of the Executive and in an honourable way.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Or otherwise I will match that particular [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker, we do not need any more rulings on this matter. I trust that we can now begin. Hon Dugmore, you are well within your rights as the Leader of the Opposition, or as Whips to exercise your request as per what you stated in the House. Can I proceed, hon Lekker, or do you want to... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, yourself or me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I said if yourself as Whips, as Whip of the Opposition or hon Dugmore with regard to his request around a motion. Okay.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No thank you, Chair. I was actually not going to speak on what Cameron has spoken to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am speaking with regard to an unprecedented way that members of the Democratic Alliance have started. It is a trend since 2019 up until today still. Members are elected to be a Chief Whip of the House and not a Chief Whip of a particular political party in the House. It is very unprecedented, and it leaves a bitter taste. Thank you, Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now would like to proceed to the debate on Vote 1 with the Premier. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day. Hon Sayed, can we end?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Ja, no-no, this is not on this particular topic.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, perfect.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and it is relating to what the Secretary is about to read out. Now I am not sure whether, as the ANC, we got the wrong end of the stick, but my query is regarding what I see here on the Orders of the Day, with regards to the speaking times and in the particular Programming Committee or Programming Authority meeting, I asked and double-checked, like I asked with the Second Reading Debate:

“Does the ANC get 24 minutes?”

“Yes.”

Does the ANC get 8 minutes?”

“Yes.”

But now I see the ANC is given 16 minutes. I would like to query that, I think that, because that now gives that we would have been able to prepare much more, had we known that we are given the 16 minutes. In the Programming Authority we were given eight minutes and we communicated that to our team, so that, I think, needs to change. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Chair. Chair, after the Programming Authority meeting, I received the procedural advice that it actually does need to be 16 minutes. Yesterday when the communication went out regarding the Speakers' List I did check and the minutes for every party were correct yesterday when the Speakers' List went out before today's Sitting, to make sure that that is specifically on there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, and remember that I cannot preside, I cannot... That was decided in the Programming Authority. That is totally a programmable process. Members, can I begin Programme 1. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to, firstly I want to pre-empt and indicate that we are not being difficult...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And it is not – we saw last week we cooperated with yourself.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is not that one is questioning the manner in which you are Chairing and that we want things to be done properly. Obviously what we see here, this has never... This did not happen earlier in the year, this type of mess-up or other years, so it is not that we are being partisan, and it is not a particular blame being placed on the Acting Chief Whip. It is a reflection of the instability of the Democratic Alliance, and it is now impacting on a simple thing like speaking times.

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, according to the admission here of the hon Deputy Chief Whip or Acting Chief, the Programming Authority, the idea from the Programming Authority is that the speaking times were different to what we have here now. There was a consultation made, of course, but we were not consulted. We were not informed, as political parties who are part of the Programming Authority, that the speaking times have been changed, so I am proposing that we go back to the original speaking times that were agreed upon in the Programming Authority. It is not going to make a big difference. In fact, there were already members, member Van der Westhuizen, I think member Mackenzie, it is a pity member Mackenzie is not here, who were actually arguing for even less time than the original that was put there. So I do not see how, on the Democratic Alliance's side, it is going to be a problem. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Chairperson. Ag, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, because I in general do not want to go against procedural advice, which is why we corrected it. However, if the members wish to speak less, the Democratic Alliance is amenable to making the speaking time less.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, so can I – can we agree on that, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, two things. Firstly, before I respond to that, the hon Bakubaku-Vos has had her hand up and she is not being recognised. I just want to put that it is important that she be recognised and be given an opportunity. She is online. Number 2, yes, it must not be viewed as a favour, but, if, and I think this is how we do in a sense also resolve matters, after we have debated that then we will then reduce it, if the Democratic Alliance is amenable, as the Deputy Chief Whip has indicated, we reduce the speaking times going back to the original format. Thank you very much, but please do recognise the hon Bakubaku-Vos. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I do not see any further hands up. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, is your hand up?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Yes, my hand was up, Deputy Speaker, then, while the members of the other side were shouting at our Chief Whip, and you pointed at our Chief Whip not to speak like that in Parliament, but you let the Democratic Alliance members of Parliament to speak as they wish to us and our Chief Whip. You must stop being biased. You will not control Parliament, if you are doing that. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, what is your point of order?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: That is what I wanted to say.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, what is your point of order?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: [No audible reply.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, we will now proceed. I will ask the Secretary to read the First Order of the Day.

**ORDERS OF THE DAY****1. Debate on Vote 1 – Premier – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. I recognise the hon Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Can I say to the hon members of this House, Cabinet, the Leader of the Opposition and members, it is a great opportunity to be able to address you on the Adjustment Appropriation Vote 1 for the 2022/23 year.

Can I say that I think that this has been a challenging year; it has been a challenging year, obviously for the citizens of our province, as well as the citizens of our country, but globally, I think it has been a challenging year. If I think back to the Adjustments Appropriation just one year ago, we would have all been online, or very few of us in the House. We were just about to be red-listed and, once again, our economy taking further pounding, and of course, since then, we have had various knocks to our economy, to jobs, to citizens ability to put food on their table, reaching far and wide. We have seen the Russian invasion of the Ukraine, and the impact that that has had on citizens here in our province. The price of food has gone up in this province, because of a war happening on the other side of the world.

We have also seen the impact of excessive and more and more loadshedding across our country. What that does to our economy has been devastating, and of course, at the end of the day, when it affects our economy, it affects every single citizen's ability to live a life that they value, just looking at food inflation, and what that has done to families here in our province, let alone our country. Just having a look at how many businesses are unable to operate when you go above loadshedding level four, and the outlook – I am sorry to say – for the next year, is even more bleak.

If you look at the report from Eskom, which saw double the loadshedding in South Africa this year, as to last year, and they are all saying that next year is going to be worse and that does not bode well for the citizens of this province. It really, really is putting so much pressure on every single person.

I think that our job here is to understand those pressures, and to make sure that while understanding those pressures on our citizens, that we make decisions both in the province, as well as in South Africa, to find hope, to find hope within this environment, and this Department and this Department's budget needs to make sure that we deliver tangible results, to demonstrate and show residents that we are capable of governing and of making that difference. We continue to put our citizens at the centre of all of the work that we do, whether it be here in Parliament, or whether it be in our respective day-to-day jobs as Government and as Opposition.

In our Government, we will continue to focus on our three main areas of

recovery going into this new difficult economic environment. We will continue to focus on safety, and I must say that there I, and I know that this will be discussed in the Safety Vote, but I want to say to Minister Reagan Allen and to his team, thank you, and well done. You know that the Safety Plan is a 10-year plan. It is interesting to see quarter after quarter after quarter when the crime results come out that we can see a reduction in murder numbers in those targeted areas.

When I look at the latest numbers, and I see that in our targeted areas like Atlantis, a 25% reduction, compared to the 2021 results. If I look at Bishop Lavis 6,7%; Gugulethu, 16,3%; Harare, 3,6%; Khayelitsha, 9,4%, on top of the 14% that we saw in the last quarter. Kraaifontein 15,6%, on top of the 16%, we saw in the last quarter, and Mfuleni, a 32,4% reduction. Obviously, this is the start of the Safety Plan, and the real focus has got to come now on prevention. We have got to the prevention space, but of course, those will be discussed in those budgets of the various Ministers and departments that are focusing on prevention as part of the Safety Plan.

Jobs as well, I think inflation and the effect that that is having on our citizens, as I have already outlined, is massive, but in this place of hope, if I look at the double-digit growth figures that we have seen in agriculture, and I noticed Minister Meyer has just slipped out, but also thank you to that team on what they have achieved. How they have aided and helped this double-digit growth numbers in this environment is unbelievable.

If I think about other sectors in our economy, the tech sector, and I think about the growth and opportunity that comes out, that is in our jobs environment, and I think as the Minister said yesterday, you can see those signs of growth and the promise of a really good festive season, holiday season, tourism industry coming back. The 192 direct flights this season per week to our airport. If I think about the tech sector and the fin-tech sector and the growth, I think about FinTech, I think about the Stellenbosch fibres companies, I think about – I think about Marlon Parker and building a head office of a global company now in the midst of Mitchells Plain, which really is amazing to see. So those signs of growth and jobs, that is about hope, and that really does give me hope, and of course then as a government, dignity and wellbeing and what does this Department mean to enabling our various departments so that we can deliver dignity and wellbeing to our citizens.

This is where the most money is spent in our Government and within this Department, making sure that we are supporting through DOTP from data, from ICT, Tech, across the board making sure that we are supporting all of our priorities. We will remain under significant pressure going forward and we must take a sober look at our budgetary priorities to ensure that they speak to addressing the harsh realities that many of our people face every single day.

Exacerbating our economic position are the ongoing and worsening energy crisis that I have spoken about, and that is why I have put together what we call an Energy Council, how we bring each and every one of those departments or role players together so we can put more urgency into the system.

I must also say that for me it was really an interesting week this week, where Premier Zamani Saul and I managed to sign our MOU and agreement between the Northern Cape and the Western Cape as part of the Green Hydrogen Conference that took place, but I must give recognition to the Administration, to the Director General in DOTP, the team from the Western Cape Government as administrators, the time that they have spent in Kimberley in the Northern Cape working on this, on this agreement. I must say to the Premier in the Northern Cape, thank you very much to your officials who have spent time with our officials making sure that we are creating an enabling environment so that the two provinces and Namibia can start to work together on this massive challenge that the world has, which are targets for 2030 and 2050; green decarbonising targets that we are setting, making sure that we are focusing now on the grid system, or perhaps taking the agreement that we have just managed to put together between ArcelorMittal, Sasol and the Free Port of Saldanha, enabling an economic future. So, gratitude to the role that DOTP have played and all of our officials, but also to every single one of those officials across our Department, and specifically in Economic Development so they have really spent a lot of time trying to enable this energy security for our future, and the role that that is going to play, which is a long term play, but on enabling the grid system now so that we can actually bring in the new energy players that are being procured or are tendering at the moment.

I want to say that at the same time, this Department DOTP, I had a meeting with the top management yesterday, and it was really great to have that meeting at the Desmond and Leah Tutu Foundation's building down at the Old Granary here in town, and in the discussion that we had there talking about the decisions that we make, I was thinking about the Arch, and what the Arch would be saying, had he been sitting in our meeting, in our deliberations. At the end of the day, I am confident that the track that we are on in this Department and in this Government, when we are looking inwardly at our own value system and how we behave as a Government, because if you do not get your culture right within your Government, how do you expect to be improving the delivery of your service to your clients; that we base all of our decisions on our values of innovation, caring and competence, accountability, integrity, and responsiveness; that we do this every single day and so that was really, I think, something that had good meaning for our top management team. I also want to say thank you to them for continually receiving a clean audit and that brings me, Madam Deputy Speaker, to the Adjustment Budget.

This is an Adjustment Budget which is a downward budget of R19,998 million. It is around 1% of our total budget R1,8 billion, and it is a downward adjustment, because, as I said in the beginning, we have to make responsible judgment calls on how we spend our money in this Department and as a Government that is in the best interests of our citizens.

I heard yesterday in the political debate on the adjustments, where people are saying we need to actually take every cent that we have and spend it right now. Well, quite frankly, that would be the wrong thing. We have learnt over the years in this Government, we must always put some money away, we call it for a rainy day in our families or in our households. In this Government, we do exactly the same thing. I have just said or spoken about the loadshedding impact on the

citizens of this province in the year to come, what it is going to do to our economy. What we are seeing with the pressure on just the cost of employment and increasing salaries and wages and our inflation rate is going to be continually climbing over the next while.

We must prepare for those extra expenses that are coming so that we can be a responsible government delivering services to our citizens going into the future.

You will see in these adjustments that we are putting money into the Safety Plan. We will be transferring money across to departments where we are making sure that this apex priority is delivered and putting money towards the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and this goes to what I spoke about, the violence-prevention side of the Safety Plan. We have to make sure that we are getting to those young boys and girls in our family, in our communities that are being attracted by gangs that are being pulled out of school time that are truant, and we have to them back into those systems. We have to bolster our after-schools programmes. We have to make sure that we do that. [Interjection.]

Madam Speaker, does one of the members want to ask me a question? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, hon Kama, stand up if you wanted to raise a point of order, did you?

Mr M KAMA: No, I do not, Madam Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, are you just heckling?

The PREMIER: Oh, he is just heckling.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is just heckling, Premier.

The PREMIER: People need to heckle with a bit more clarity, otherwise I cannot answer them. Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. Funds are also being rolled over from the 2021/22 year to enable the citizen-centric culture journey that I have just spoken about, making sure that we are enabling our own staff, you know, they always say you have to start with yourselves, if you really want to go to the next level of service and that is the process that we are busy with.

We are building a modern province, so must keep pace with the demands and expectations that come with it. Funds are being rolled over for ICT related services in the Department of Health to further modernise and improve the healthcare system and there I must say to the Health Department, congratulations on winning the South African Innovation Award for the HECTIS Programme that is now rolled out to 27 of our hospitals that monitors violence; the only province in South Africa that can do it, and well done to every single one of those officials, those doctors, those scientists and those data people who have given us that ability. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Yes, absolutely, I think it is valuable to give them that applause and a

programme that we developed and used so extensively during the pandemic, and when I say “we”, not only in this province, South Africa. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: South Africa used that system to determine waves and impact of the COVID 19 pandemic. I also want to say that there will be funds to continue with the refresh process, making sure that by the first of April, the new Departments of Public Works and Transport are modernised into the Department of Infrastructure and the Department of Mobility and that we continue to support this space, because obviously, in South Africa, we know that infrastructure is what is letting us down as a country, whether it be energy infrastructure, whether it be rail infrastructure, whether it be ports infrastructure, it is infrastructure and I hasten to say or hesitate to say, water infrastructure. People are going to ask us when the next day zero comes, what have you done between then and now? Where is the Clanwilliam Dam? We really have to start focusing on infrastructure over and above what we do at the moment and pushing boundaries far more than we have ever pushed before.

The same thing with mobility, how do people get to work? We know the poorest of the poor spend 40% of their salary, if they have a job, on transport. That has to change. We have to get mobility right. So, Madam Deputy Speaker, I want to say that, for me this adjustment is a small adjustment. We really work hard at making sure that we manage the funds in this Government responsibly in the best interests of the citizens of this province.

I want to say to the Director General and to the full team in DOTP, thank you for the role that you play and the hours that you put in. I can assure you that officials in this Government go far away and beyond their normal expected time that they put in, in the interests of this Government and of the citizens of this province. It does not go unnoticed, and I want to thank them for that energy for what they do every single day when they come to work, and so this, I want to submit, is an adjustment, that is an adjustment that is responsible and an adjustment that is in the best interests of the citizens of this province. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Premier. I now recognise hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, Vote 1 and the Adjustment Budget is not just about a set of numbers. The Premier has started off his speech reflecting on the kind of year that we have had and the challenges and we need to note that the Vote is there and the adjustment is there, but actually this adjustment is also a reflection on the leadership or the lack of leadership that has been provided by the Premier to this province. It is interesting that the Premier mentions the issue of loadshedding and the

initiatives such as the Energy Council to develop an integrated approach, but I think if we are honest, Deputy Speaker, up to now all that we have seen is the investment of millions of public funds into consultants who have been doing work at a local government level, but if we are honest, those initiatives of this Province have not produced one megawatt of power. So we would like you when you respond, Premier, can you tell us from the money that the Provincial Government has allocated to all these municipalities, and that is what I am talking about specifically, as the Stellenbosch Municipality, how much have they received and how many megawatts have they produced?

I think that is what we need, you know, I am not saying that in a sense that we want to dismiss the notion of we need to develop energy resilience, but let us not spin things, let us not create a perception, which is not based on reality.

Then Premier, you also spoke about the issue of the reduction of crime, but what is always strange to me is that when the Premier and also MEC Allen mentioned this issue, they do not tell the House and tell the public about the deployment of extra SAPS resources to those very areas that they mentioned, because the reality is we can argue about the impact of the LEAP officers and what has been attached and the integrated, holistic approach, but it is just not honest when you do not mention that the South African Police have specifically also allocated additional resources to those. So I think we need to start moving beyond this petty notion of sort of claiming victories but not being honest about the fact that despite the problems in the SAPS there has been a genuine effort, which has resulted in the real deployment of extra resources, and to be honest, the Safety Plan, still this House has not been provided with actually what constitutes a plan. In other words, who is doing what by when. We have who is doing what. We have a list of what the different MECs are supposed to do but there is no information about how much resource is attached to that, where the infrastructure improvement is going, what a tangible Safety Plan and an Operational Plan would involve. I hope that our members, and I am not sure if this House has noticed, that because of our specific interest also in rural safety, Deputy Speaker, we have actually decided to ask member Bans to specifically deal with the Safety portfolio and we have many reasons why we are asking our young lion, hon member Kama, to deal specifically with sport and recreation and the whole area of youth. So that Committee actually needs to engage in an operational plan. I welcome through you, Deputy Speaker, hon, the Premier's reference to Marlon Parker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I welcome that reference because I do think what someone like Marlon Parker has done initiating the R Labs in Athlone and where he has taken that to, is a very important example to raise and I think that the province really needs to celebrate that but at the same time, we would love it if the Premier, in his role as leading this Province, would also be vocal and active about issues that member Nkondlo has been raising around the township economy, in particular the problems which emerged regarding the Pick n Pay investment into the townships. These are the issues that we must look at, what are the successes, what are the failures. But, I think I was disappointed, Deputy Speaker, that in his introductory words here today, the Premier did not go into more detail around the COE issues, not only as they

affect the Department of the Premier, but many other departments who have failed to fill posts.

Now, clearly we are not going to utilise those funds for the rest of the financial year, and given the critical importance of public employment to bring relief, I would like the Premier to respond and I asked the same issue through to the MEC for Finance yesterday. Why did the Premier, as the Leader of this Province, not utilise the savings on costs of employment to actually push into public employment schemes, because the reality is that the only public employment schemes that are working in this province are those which are funded and provided by the National Government. EPWP, the CWP, the initiative that the President took to support schools, so we do not see, we see an investment in LEAP officers, but we do not actually see provincial money from the Equitable Share being used to advance public employment.

We are also happy that there has been an agreement between the Northern Cape and the Western Cape, and when the ANC was governing this particular province, which was up until 2009. [Interjections.] It was a while ago. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, it was the ANC, Deputy Speaker, actually got 46% of the vote, you would recall, and we worked with the new National Party in a coalition which actually delivered in this Western Cape, we had lower unemployment than we currently have now, which is the truth. So what I am trying to say, in those days we had what we refer to as the Cape Corridor, actually working with the Provincial Governments of both the Eastern Cape as well as the Northern Cape, because we would all recall that this very building where we are standing in used to be the Centre of the old CPA, and there are many, many connections between the people of the Northern Cape, the Western Cape, the Eastern Cape, and, for instance, we are not hearing enough, Premier, when you talk about mobility, what are the strategies to ensure that people of our province would be able to be mobile and to move via train to the Eastern Cape on a Friday and be able to then come back, for instance. We know that there are people coming to our province from Gauteng. They are coming from the Northern Cape and so on, and we should actually welcome that, so we want to ask the Premier to take seriously what the ANC had started, which was actually to build the Cape Corridor. [Interjections.] Yes, it was a very important initiative.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: 10 seconds, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What is that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: 10 seconds.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I beg your pardon?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: 10 seconds left.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But I thought, aren't...  
[Laughter]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Laughter] No, he did not, he was pointing out. He was pointing out the realities of a decision that was made and not communicated properly. So I will then, so are you actually ruling that my time has expired?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am, because...

†Die ADJUNK HOOFSWEEP (ANC): Ja.  
[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There we go, hon Sayed is correct.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No problem, so my time has expired.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So these are the things that we need to look at, and that is why, in conclusion... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just finish off.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, we cannot support this Vote, because it is not actually utilising those savings made to actually ensure that the Khayelitsha Hospital, for instance, gets money over and above investment into a technology which is not meeting the needs of the people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The full speech will be provided. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Laughter.] Thank you. I now recognise hon Xego. Are you online?

Mr M XEGO: Yes, Deputy Speaker, I am here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, sir.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the EFF welcomes the Adjusted Appropriation to the Department of the Premier and the reduction of more than R19 million. This is the second Premier, who, during the State of the Province Address, promised people in this province that poverty and unemployment will be a thing of the past. Since then, the opposite has become an entrenched status quo. Deputy Speaker, under the Premier's leadership, we

are still witnessing a provincial economy that is battling to recover from the effects of COVID-19. The so-called Recovery Plan that was preached about is still a plan, which cannot be fulfilled because the Premier is running a failed Provincial Government, which cannot provide people with meaningful decent jobs that will change their lives and lift them out of the poverty line. Just last week, during the two-day taxi protest, a foreign telecommunications company operating in this town, which is called Capita, made its employees to sleep on the floors of the company just to make sure that it does not lose profits. This is the kind of treatment that is akin to slavery, and of which we expect that the Premier would speak a volume for such kind of treatment of workers in the province that he is presiding over. This is the kind of entrepreneurs that the DA-led Government attracts when it says its job is to create an enabling environment for job opportunities, as it is not the duty of Government to create jobs. Once you outsource the responsibility of job creation to white monopoly capital, we see such kind of treatment of our people. This Government attracts this kind of entrepreneurs, Premiers who have no regard for employees' wellbeing, and they have no respect for employment rules of this country and, yet, the Premier would stand up and say nothing about such kind of treatment.

Deputy Speaker, contact crime and sexual-related crimes are forever increasing in this province under the Premier's leadership. Our health facilities cannot provide patience... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Xego, your time is up.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you. I now recognise hon member Fry.

Mr T FRY: Hon Deputy Speaker, the budget for the Department of the Premier has been adjusted to R1,085 billion. The mission of the Department is to enable and lead a capable Western Cape Government by institutionalising a culture of innovation and collaboration for improved services for the people of the Western Cape. This budget, although adjusted downwards from R1,825 billion, seeks to support that mission, especially in advancing the cause of providing access to broadband facilities to the people of the Western Cape, thereby creating opportunities for employment and small business development. Deputy Speaker, the following should be noted: R2,5 million was rolled over from the 2021/22 financial year for enabling a citizen-centric culture. This empowers the Western Cape Government to ensure that all available resources are placed to foster an environment where citizens are at the centre of governance.

Examples of this culture is the first Thursdays' Initiative, where the entire Government is placed at the disposal of the citizens here in Wale Street in order to attend to any issues that they may have. Further developments on this model include taking First Thursdays to the people, which will be shared in due course. It is also important to note that, through the Western Cape Government the Department has done the following:

1. It has provided a highly capable workforce, creating an enabling

workplace and developed leadership that has enabled employee engagement and optimal service delivery, primarily through embarking on a culture journey with all employees, including introducing all new staff to the senior management team.

2. It has optimised service delivery in the Western Cape Government through the coordinated implementation of innovative information and communication technologies.
3. It has transformed governance resulting in improved service delivery.
4. It has improved public service perception by promoting and protecting the Western Cape Government brand and coordinating communication messaging to ensure that the vision inspired priorities of the Western Cape Government are communicated effectively to the people of the Western Cape.

Deputy Speaker, the WiFi sites and the Centres for e-Innovation across the province have facilitated internet access to countless citizens of the Western Cape. Expenditure for the first six months of this financial year amounted to R617 million. The adjusted budget for this initiative is R1,2 billion which is a decrease from the main budget of R1,245 billion or 1,1%. R548 million has been allocated towards Connected Government and Infrastructure Services. There were oversight visits to the WiFi Centres, WiFi sites, and the Centre of e-Innovation in Groote Schuur and Observatory. In order to ascertain the functionality of these sites, this Committee gained firsthand experience on how systems operate from a health, education and environmental viewpoint, as well as the capabilities made possible for citizens through public WiFi access. It was also communicated that the State Information Technology Agency (SITA) is implementing a 10-year Broadband Programme on behalf of the Western Cape Government along with its partner, Liquid Intelligent Technologies. Further to this, during a parliamentary oversight visit to the Bitou Municipality, the Committee visited the KwaNokutula and New Horizons e-Centres, which are part of the Cape Access Programme. These centres offers services such as typing and printing, job and business research information, school and job applications and basic e-skills training.

The facilities currently have an average of 60-user sessions per day, and really boasts many success stories of people who have used the centre to study and find work opportunities. The offerings to the community include soft skills, computer training, assistance with research for school projects, setting up email accounts, cyber renewals for security officers and SARS registrations for job seekers.

In a previous media release, I have stated that the partnership between various actors, including the Bitou Municipality, the Expanded Public Works Programme and Youth for Change has made these facilities a ray of hope for the people of KwaNokutula and New Horizons, who have taken advantage of their valuable resources and upskilled themselves. These e-centres continue to demonstrate the Western Cape Government's and the Local Municipality's commitment to educating residents in essential ICT skills so that they may become self-reliant and compete in the employment market. I wish to reiterate that these centres

are shining lights in the Bitou area and catalysts for growth and opportunity in their respective communities as they provide access to information and services that stimulate growth and opportunity.

Deputy Speaker, we live in an uncertain time where the prospect of growth sits at an all-time low and national leadership in the Executive is at an unprecedented state of flux. The focus of the Western Cape Recovery Plan, however, is putting the province on track for growth and opportunity. The three pillars of the plan, namely safety, jobs, and dignity and wellbeing, are constantly being worked on to realise the mission of institutionalising a culture of innovation and collaboration for improved services to the people of the Western Cape. As per the latest statistics in the Quarterly Labour Force Survey, published a few days ago, the Western Cape's expanded unemployment figures are 13,6 percentage points lower than the national average, with nearly 85,000 jobs created.

To further gear the Government for growth and job creation, the Departments of Infrastructure and Mobility will be established on 1 April 2023. That being said, we still have a long way to go to ensure that everyone has opportunity to better themselves.

With regard to safety, the introduction of the LEAP Programme in the City of Cape Town has helped realise the goal of halving the murder rate in the next 10 years. The question that must be asked though is why do we need the LEAP programme? The answer is very simple: the constant failings of SAPS in this province. I am sure member Bosman will further elaborate on this in his speech.

At this time, I wish to thank the members of the Committee for the cordial manner in which we conducted our business. I would also like to thank the Procedural Officer, Ms Waseemah Kamish-Achmat for her expert guidance, as well as Dr Malila and his team in the Department.

In closing, hon Deputy Speaker, the Department's efforts in fostering growth by creating access to information and communication must be applauded and I look forward to seeing the Department continue on its current course. The DA supports this Vote. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Fry. I now recognise hon Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to all of the members of this House that took part in this debate. I will start off with the hon Chairperson, first of all, thank you, Chair, thank you for those words. Thank you for the way in which you Chair the Committee and for the support through this process. It is appreciated and valued. Thank you.

Just to highlight one or two areas that you spoke about, and maybe add to it. I think the Cape Access Centres agreed they offer massive opportunity to people who ordinarily would not be able to have access to look for a job to increase their ability to do research for homework, to run their small businesses and every one of those Cape Access Centres that you visit, you come across

unbelievable South Africans who are making use of this rollout. Of course, for me, you want to roll it out faster, quicker, and we also have to be nimble in understanding what the next phase of broadband is going to be like. Is it going to be broadband cables that are laid under the ground or is it going to come from satellites or, and we have to be nimble and there again, I really want to recognise the USA and the USAID and how they helped this Province in so many various ways, but specifically in the R20 million that they have given us to do that study on enabling and checking what we are doing, and are we getting ready for the next change or leap into the future.

You also mentioned First Thursdays and perhaps there I must also thank, first of all, all of the officials and the Ministers who give up their time on a Thursday, a first Thursday of every month. This is not overtime or anything like this. This is extra that they give to citizens, and still, as far as I know, there is no other Government in the world that does that, and it is unique and it is amazing to be able to engage with citizens, enable them to bring their ideas, enable them to bring their problems, because that shows us that we, in that engagement, are checking on what we are doing. Is it giving the relevant results that our citizens need?

The hon Xego, I am sorry that you did not have that much time, but again, speaking about crime, speaking about strike, strike action, the impact thereof, and of course, I am always the proponent to say why do we not rather sit around the table, have discussions before we end up by blocking the economy, causing further job delays, and then of course, on crime, I think it is evident that safety is something that I am really passionate about, because I know it is so damaging to so many of our citizens.

Then to the hon Dugmore, thank you very much. You raised many, many issues and I am going to see I can give you as much as possible but let us start with what we want to call is EPWP. Well, you are incorrect, so this Province added another R316 million for 2022 to the money that we do get from National, so you are incorrect. We add extra funding to it.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Which Vote?

The PREMIER: We can give it all to you if you want it, it is across the board. Then, when it comes to Energy. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier, if you could just take your seat please, there is a point of order. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, with respect, the hon Premier cannot say to the hon Dugmore, "I will give it to you." I will give it to him. Thank you. [Interjection.] [Laughter.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Well, it is essential English language now.

An HON MEMBER: Shame!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, okay. Premier, you may proceed.

[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I do not know how that English works but to the hon Leader of the Opposition, I assure you, I will give it to him. I mean, I really do not get that, but anyway. [Laughter] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! [Laughter]

The PREMIER: So the hon Leader of the Opposition is incorrect, and we will send him – him – the detail of the programmes across all of our departments. He also spoke about mobility, and it is critical that we get mobility right. I agree with him, because of the absolute failure, specifically, of the backbone of any mobility system anywhere in the world which should be the train system, and where the bulk of citizens live in the City of Cape Town, who should be relying on a cost effective, safe, reliable transport system, the ANC have destroyed that. It is damaged beyond repair, not only in the Western Cape, but across our whole country – across our whole country, and not only people moving, because that is mobility of people, but mobility of goods, mobility of goods and services. Do you know that how they have wrecked the system in trade? The Durban Port should be shipping to the hub of the economy of our country, which is Gauteng, should be shipping in excess of 20 trains a day. We are lucky if three or four work, at the moment, per day.

In actual fact, this Government run by the ANC in South Africa, are putting more energy into creating a border post between South Africa and Mozambique so goods and services can travel by road and truck through to the port in Namibia, I mean, in Mozambique, more than getting our own ports fixed. It is unbelievable. So of course, we need to be focusing on mobility. That is why we are creating a Mobility Department. That is why the Minister of Mobility needs to have a look at what can we do within the constrained environment of the ANC, what can we do to help the citizens find better mobility, find more efficient or cost effective and safe mobility.

Then when it comes to policing, and the policing numbers, in actual fact, in the policing numbers in the Western Cape, we have less SAPS at 70% of the stations then we had 10 years ago, those glorious days of the ANC National Party Coalition in this province.

Today SAPS and the ANC are delivering to the citizens of this province 70% less manpower, 70%, can you believe it? So in accordance to SAPS themselves the ideal number of SAPS members at station level should be 195 000 members. However, the actual amount is 105 000. Do you know that every time the Minister of Police stands up and he says: “Look, we are giving you another 1000 members.” But he forgets that 1200 retired, resigned, were murdered – all sorts of other, because we are going backwards at a rate of knots under the ANC management, when it comes to policing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier, just take your seat, please. Hon Dugmore, I recognise you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, I just

would like to ask whether the Premier would accept a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Premier will accept a question, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Premier, my question is the following, that in the targeted areas where there are so-called crime hotspots, do you concede that additional police resources in the last 12 months have been allocated to some of those targeted areas where crime levels have reduced?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, Premier.

The PREMIER: I will concede that to some areas, some policing officers have been added, because absolutely, that is exactly what we are doing. We are taking provincial resources and adding it to the SAPS numbers in these target areas to make that difference, but I promise you, those numbers, those population ratio numbers are not being corrected. They are not being corrected the way that they should be corrected. The police stations are not being built in those hot spot areas where they should be built.

Do you even know that – I do not know how many times they have made a promise of a police station in Philippi – you know, it was supposed to have started I think three times in the last three years, they should have started construction. I had a one-on-one meeting with the Police Commissioner yesterday, and, I mean, you cannot believe how frustrated he is, but of course, we want to really work with the police. We have to work with the police to find these solutions. Unfortunately, what is happening is the political management of the police is non-existent, and the resourcing from Pretoria does not resource adequately to deal with the crime levels. So I can say to the hon Dugmore, yes, I concede in some areas a few more police officers may have been deployed, but overall, when you look at the crime hotspot areas, which I am holding up here, and the 30 top police murder hotspots, it is not just in the Western Cape, across South Africa it is the same picture, which shows that at a national level policing and the police management are what is unacceptable. That is why we need devolution of power of policing, decision making, because I promise you, already what we have seen makes a difference.

It is not making any difference anywhere else in any other province in South Africa. Every time they put the crime statistics out, it gets worse. Every single province, murder rate, gender-based violence, violence, just general crime just gets worse, province by province, and statistics do not lie. At the end of the day, there is only one province where we are seeing some change, a start to get to a change. It never gets recognised by this side of the House. [Interjections.] They turn a blind eye to it because they are too afraid to own up to their own massive failure as a National Government, and following on from the policing numbers and what the hon Dugmore was saying, the police report and the report that comes to the Standing Committee deals with all of these queries. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, members!

The PREMIER: With murder in LEAP areas, LEAP operation and deployment

by quarter, it talks about the searches on every single area... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... of those hotspot areas where this extra policing is being made. The number of liquor-related actions, the number of hotspot patrols and operations, the firearms and domestic violence visits, the homicides per week, and what the types of homicides are.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is not about...  
[Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: The top homicide precincts year-to-date, the priority areas week 47 and 48, this is just the high-level report, and it goes page after page. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: You do not get anything near this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo. [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo. [Interjections.] Hon members, please, thank you. You may proceed, Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and then so that is policing. So then the honourable member spoke about energy, and of course, just as important as safety is...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon Premier, please. Thank you. What is your point of order, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is the hon Premier, as he did with the Leader of the Opposition, is he willing to take a question?

The PREMIER: Yes, of course.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, and thank you very much to the hon Premier for accepting to take it. Is the hon Premier in support, given what he has said about the liquor sales and the dangers, does the hon Premier not view it as problematic that the Western Cape Government, and particularly the Department of Education, is permitting the sale of alcohol at our schools, particularly schools in the most vulnerable of communities?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that question. I would ask the hon Sayed to bring me every single school that he is talking about that does sell alcohol and the reason why it happened because I guarantee you that those governing bodies in those schools have not given the permission. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: You cannot ask a question and then not accept the answer, hon member. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We can disagree with the answer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The PREMIER: Well, both of you ask silly questions and then you...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Focus on me, Premier, you may proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We are leaving the question for written reply. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: I wait for that question, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, so then when it comes to energy, and of course, aside from crime and what crime does to us citizens, energy is the next biggest crippling activity that takes place in our country, which is again, just as policing, an absolute show of ANC failure. I mean, under the ANC's rule in the last 28 years, you can just about take almost everything that they have to do as a government and you can tick every single box as a failure. It is just unbelievable, and the impact of energy is now really taking us right down to the bottom of the doldrums when it comes to any chance of jobs and economic growth into the future. So then he asks questions about what the plan has delivered and what we have done so far. So first of all, it is very interesting to note from a report from UCT showing, and you will know that this Government has worked on what we initially called the Energy Game-Changer, because we were only able to operate in the SSEG space, which we did, and in South Africa it is unbelievable to see the effect on SSEG across the board and specifically noting that we are now the sixth biggest economy in the world when it comes to solar inverter and battery markets, as this little country called South Africa, the sixth biggest in the world.

Now, we are busy with the programme, the same programme that he speaks about, so in the City of Cape Town we have over 3000 independent power producers already. What is the result? I do not know if he is listening at the moment, but we have over 3000 independent power producers already, and, of course, those independent power producers are still within the one-megawatt boundaries. That has changed in the last year and the programme that he speaks about is now engaging in how do we make sure that we connect all 3000 of those producers to our grid system, because that has been the problem. How do we connect them to the grid system, and, I must say that in South Africa we have given the wrong message to independent power producers, because they always see the threat of power tax, a threat of extra charges if they register and let it be known that they are producing their own power or going off the grid. We have always said please remain on the grid and remain a power producer for our system.

The next stage that we have to enter into is where we actually look at how do we get time-of-tariff charges in for energy in our region. Now, these are difficult

choices that you need to make with time-of-tariff, but it allows you to pay more during peak times of usage to those providing power.

Then let us get to our municipalities that we are enabling. I do not need to say too much more about Cape Town other than already people who are in the city feel the difference. They have already closed their first round of tenders and they are evaluating them. The second round is almost ready to go out. It is going to go out, it was supposed to go out now in December. They will probably put it out in January. This round is even going beyond the 100 megawatts. They are actually saying agnostic and no limit and they will investigate each and every one of those that come in. So it is not going to say you have to only supply solar or wind, you can supply battery power, you can supply any form of power and it will be evaluated, considering the crisis that we find ourselves in.

Then, of course, George, that municipality is ahead of all of our other municipalities when it comes to wheeling of power, which is quite nice, because it is good to see when municipalities are actually getting ahead of other ones because it starts to put pressure on them, and they start to increase their speed to market because of the challenges. Stellenbosch, which the honourable member mentioned, is also in the process of almost ready for tender and by the sounds of things, the race is on to see which municipality will be loadshedding free, and they are trying very hard to be that municipality. Then Saldanha Bay, because of what is happening there at the moment with the free port with Sasol and with ArcelorMittal, are also in a position where they are getting lots of interest into bigger power supplies.

Mossel Bay is in the same way, they are in extensive discussions specifically with the current Saldanha gas system, and whether they can be using flaring for energy provision, but there has also been the recognition now that three gigawatts of gas can be made available in that region for the Garden Route. So the energy team already...and that is only the energy team that sits within the economic development portfolio. There is also energy workstreams within our infrastructure team. There is an energy workstream within our environmental team, because, of course, we need to make sure we have EIAs, enabling the environment. So across the board there is a lot of work being done, and I want you to then commend lastly on energy, Green Cape. So Green Cape is an organisation that when I was in the position that Minister Wenger is at the moment, we put some funding aside, and we set up an organisation called Green Cape knowing that in those days already in loadshedding environments, and knowing that the green economy was what is going to be the saviour of our energy system going forward, and I want to commend every single person that operates in the Green Cape environment and how they have grown from those days. They are key in advising now at a national level in South Africa, and in actual fact, they are also involved in a number of countries, internationally known as Green Cape, and even have offices now set up, funded by the EU and based in Europe. So it is actually really commendable that that team has enabled not only us here in the Western Cape, but is actually playing a role in South Africa, and also playing a role internationally, because that is what we have to be doing to be nimble, and to be ahead of the curve so that we can mitigate this massive risk, beyond just crime, but also energy provision, so that we can have an economy going forward. At loadshedding level six or seven or

eight, which is predicted for next year, that really puts our economy under huge stress. But thank you very much to the hon members that have taken part and I know that we have gone into a lot of discussion around the outside areas that DOTP supports, but at the end of the day, this is a Budget Vote for a R19 million reduction of a R1,8 billion budget, which is about good governance and making sure that we are preparing for next year. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Dugmore, what is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. I rise in regard, into a point of order, and I refer you and the House to Rule and I just want to give everyone the insurance that I am dealing with the March 2021 Rules.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Which Rule, hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is 151(1) and also referred, 151(3).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So am I understanding you... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I would like to read...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can only deliver.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, so I am going to deliver.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Perfect.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But I am supposed to – you do not want me to read it out?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no-no-no, there is no Rule.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I am just going to deliver and then I am also going to refer you to 151(3) which says that if there is unanimous concurrence then this motion can be dealt with.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So could I deliver to the Secretary?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. You may deliver it to the Secretary and the Secretary may proceed or he may decide what he wants to do with that. Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. That concludes Vote 1.  
[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary, if he is ready, will read the Second Order of the Day.

## 2. Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. I now recognise the hon Minister Simmers.

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!]

†Die MINISTER VAN MENS LIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Baie dankie.

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you.] Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, hon colleagues of the Cabinet, present and online, hon members of the House, both sides of the House, present and online, our honoured guests who are following today's Sitting as well.

Deputy Speaker, we began this year with a budget themed "A Budget with an Opportunity for You." Indeed, in the first half of this year, we made concerted efforts to ensure that we create housing opportunities and to ensure that tangible economic and job opportunities are created at the same time. In the 2020 to 2025 Strategic Planning Forecast, we set key targets and deliverables aligned with creating citizen-centric opportunities.

To date we have delivered 24 477 housing opportunities. It is often said that the proof is in the pudding, and the Department's commitment is demonstrated in the achievement of its targets as I have just highlighted, so, Deputy Speaker, as you can see, we do not only talk about a budget with an opportunity for you, but we live by it, and it is there for all to see through our work for our citizens. That is why we say it is for you.

Today, we are here to discuss the adjustments of our budget as we reach the halfway mark of our financial year for 2022/23, and the halfway mark is usually signalled with a recess and efforts that affords one with an opportunity to review tactics, actions and plans. †En ons was darem 'n bietjie doenig, moet ek sê, vir die helfte van hierdie jaar in daai verband. [And we have been fairly busy, I must say, for half of the year in that regard.]

It is also accompanied with realignment, where deemed necessary to ensure that the overall objective is achieved. It is therefore, at this time that we acknowledge the misinterpretation of the Help Me Buy a Home, or, as it was formerly called, Finance Linked Individual Subsidy Programme (FLISP) Policy and Regulations during the period from 2012 till 2019, which led to erroneous payments in the processing of transactions, but not to beneficiaries, but to financial institutions and I will love the Opposition to get their facts straight in that regard, hon Deputy Speaker, because some would have you believe that it was a misappropriation of funds, which it clearly was not in this case, and upon recognition of this misinterpretation in 2019, I can confirm that the Department has implemented the following corrective measures...

†Want ons vat aksie. Ons weet nie net van 'n probleem en doen niks soos die Opposisie in hierdie Huis nie. [Because we take action. We do not know about a problem and do nothing about it like the Opposition in this House.]

We firstly engage the financial institutions rigorously on the matter. Secondly,

we formulated built-in mechanisms to ensure that the beneficiaries are subsidised in accordance with a sliding scale, which is ultimately the crux of this matter. [Interjection.]

Deputy Speaker, at our midway mark we have reviewed our budget and targets while taking into consideration the landscape of our sector. I am therefore pleased to announce that our budget has received an upward adjustment of R63,169 million. This resulted in the budget shifting from R2,415 billion to R2,478 billion.

As part of the Adjustment Budget R667 000 for planning, fees were allocated to the Vredenburg Urban Revitalisation Project. This project will see the completion of 162 housing opportunities. In further assisting our municipalities with opportunities, my Department has shifted R7,7 million. Swellendam Municipality will receive R5,5 million and Hessequa Municipality will receive R2,2 million for electrical connections to unlock affordable housing opportunities at the Railton and Melkhoutfontein Projects. Through this social infrastructure investment we will yield 350 housing opportunities by the end of our 2022/23 financial year. Both projects will be completed and delivered, hon Deputy Speaker, within a record time of 18 months.

†Ek dink nie die Oposisie in hierdie Huis gaan enige iets daarvan sê nie want hulle kan dit nie eers in 30 maande doen nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] [I don't think the Opposition in this House is going to say anything about it, because they cannot even do it in 30 months.]

An HON MEMBER: We have done this.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In our Adjustment Budget we allocated an additional R15 million for the Deferred Ownership Pilot Project called Mill Park or Cape Agulhas, as I formally informed this august House. This project was launched in June 2022 with seed funding of R10 million in the 2021/22 financial year. The R15 million in the 2022/23 financial year will provide capital to build deferred ownership houses that will be sold in two years' time, in terms of our Rent-to-Own Agreement with our beneficiaries. To date and since we turned the sod in June 2022, I am pleased to report to this House that, despite the increased interest rate and market price increases, this project has seen the completion of 12 successful transactions and individuals are paying their rent, which is required. Ten of the Help me Buy a Home houses have also been sold, and they have not even been built yet, to be quite honest. It shows the success of this drive.

This, once again, is proof of the effectiveness of our Government's innovative efforts to restore the dignity and pride of our citizens by creating programmes that unlock economic opportunities through our social infrastructure projects, and, as I could see for myself, yesterday, when I handed over the homes in the Blue Rise Village, we do not simply build houses away from work and economic opportunities, which is sadly a narrative so many a times repeated by that side of the House. The Blue Rise Village housing project is in Blue Downs. It is a stone's throw away from the Blackheath Industrial Area and main transport routes along that route as well. So through social infrastructure, we leverage

our existing fixed asset base as an offset incentive mechanism for partnering with the private sector to see a hybrid financial partnership that allows each party to co-fund and procure elements of the project directly. We also ensure that our projects are completed within optimal timeframes, incorporates good governance principles, and that all partners achieve their objectives. Once again, the Blue Rise Village Project is such an example.

Deputy Speaker, in the Blue Rise Village Project, together with the private sector, we were able to unlock 423 Help Me Buy a Home housing opportunities. Yesterday, we handed over the first 10 beneficiaries and what I found quite heart-warming, and the bulk of us here fall under this age category. All the beneficiaries were younger than 39 years old. [Interjections.]

Thanks to this initiative, and I am going to use some examples now, the young couple, Mr and Ms Bonn, would still be out there struggling to get a foot into the home-ownership market, but upon receiving the keys yesterday, and the husband said, I quote him:

“We had many sleepless nights worried about being approved for a bond. However, that was until we learnt about the Affordable Housing programme at the Department and the Help Me Buy a Home option.

We would like to encourage our peers out there earning an income to make use of this great opportunity that Government has created for us.”

This is what we mean by looking after the wellbeing of our citizens, as the Bonns went to bed last night, knowing that they are well on their way to providing a secure financial legacy for their children, which they are also planning in their new home.

The same can be said for the upstanding 30-year-old South African Police Service Constable, Constable Sandile Ngomane, who now also owns a proud home in the same development. We are also integrating people from different backgrounds. Guided by a Medium-Term Strategic Framework (MTSF) and the Western Cape Government's Growth for Job Strategy, the Department, as of September 2022, facilitated 730 job opportunities against an annual target of 1 000 for the year under review. †Ons is goed op pad om ons teiken te bereik. [Tussenwerpsels.] [We are well on our way to achieve our target. [Interjections.]

Statistics South Africa's recent Residential Building Statistics for Quarter 3 indicated that, and I quote them:

“The Western Cape's relatively strong performance in new home building planning and activity is reflective of its economy outperforming in terms of growth, creating new jobs at a faster pace and fuelling stronger demand for housing.”

It is also worth noting that in the last job statistics, the construction sector created 46 000 jobs and is one of the highest job contributors for the quarter in South Africa. It is as a result of such economic activity that 68,7% of the Department's Human Settlements Development Grant (HSDG) was paid to contractors in the designated groups. 14,5% and 6,8% of the HSDG Grant was paid to contractors, which are women or youth presentation respectively,

outperforming our said targets again, but during this first half of the financial year under review, we also facilitated training to 180 youth.

Deputy Speaker, so you see, we cannot mention safety and wellbeing as priorities without the inclusion of women and youth in our programmes. I therefore call on all women and youth entrepreneurs following us now virtually, and also job seekers in the built environment to come forward and seize the opportunities afforded to them by this caring Department, by this caring DA-led Provincial Government. [Interjections.]

For the remainder of the MTSF, the Department will continue to contribute towards empowerment opportunities, by awarding contracts to contactors within the targeted groups and by facilitating job opportunities and training for young people in the built environment, but Deputy Speaker it is one thing to build homes. It is one thing to create job opportunities. The people of the Western Cape need to be assured of the security of tenure, something the ANC failed up until 2009 before this DA Government took over.

†Die WAARNEMENDE HOOF SWEEP (DA): Sê vir hulle.  
[The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Tell them.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The Department continues to make strides in eradicating the backlog of historical title deeds, with concerted collaborative efforts between the Department and the State Attorney to resolve that which was deemed difficult cases by an incompetent ANC, I should add. A total delivery of 17 485 title deeds have been transferred to qualifying beneficiaries during this MTSF period, which allowed for the security of tenure through home ownership.

Earlier this year when I delivered the 2022/23 budget speech, we were joined in the gallery by a beneficiary who had received his title deeds in December 2021, and it is a pity the ANC member has left the Chamber, who said “Mr Title Deeds”, and she will see now why I am so passionate about title deeds. [Interjections.]

Mr Kooste from Vredenburg in Saldanha Bay waited 50 years to get this title deed so I was quite sad when I heard, hon Deputy Speaker, that a few months...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order members! Hon Marran, I cannot hear. Over to you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:...that a few months after he got this life-changing document in his hand, after waiting 50 years, he sadly passed away, but I believe that he passed away a very happy man because he finally owned something in the country of his birth, something which was denied to him by the ANC prior to 2009, because they failed at everything that they did up until 2009. [Interjections.]

But this further confirms the importance of and the reason why I use Mr Kooste as an example, of why this Provincial Department and this Provincial

Government need to ensure that we deliver title deeds to beneficiaries such as Mr Kooste, and the only way that we can do that is to empower our municipalities as our partners in ensuring they get their title deeds and it is on this basis that we have reallocated R11,378 million as a rollover to seven municipalities in respect of the Title Deed Restoration Programme, †want ons wil ons mense se lewens daadwerklik verander deur eienaarskap [because we want to change our people's lives for real through ownership.]

In November my heart once again was touched, when, together with the Langeberg Municipality, and I must say in record time again, we delivered 172 Breaking New Ground (BNG) Unites to the Nkqubela Housing Project, but the good work did not stop there of this Provincial Department and its staff and this Provincial Government. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It continued.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker, we handed over title deeds within 60 days to the same beneficiaries, something the ANC could never do before 2009 and they are still struggling in the other eight provinces, by the way, and I think this House will agree with me and I think this House will agree with me...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That was R27 million well spent by this Provincial Government to ensure we change all our people's lives. It is a pity we cannot just get Eskom on board for the rest. One of the beneficiaries, once again it is a pity the member of the Opposition is not in the House, and I hope her colleagues conveys this to her, is Ms Dikasi Luwalala, and this is the oldest beneficiary I have given a house and a title deed to in the last three years. She is 92 years old. She never owned a house. She worked on a farm in the Langeberg area. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: I was still that side.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And she said and I quote her – it is not my words. [Interjections.]

“It is with the highest gratitude that I stand here today and receive this title deed.” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: “At some point in my life, I thought this dream will never be realised, and today, here we are. I would like to thank our caring Provincial Government for making this possible.”

And the irony is, Deputy Speaker, her grandchild is an ANC Councillor in the same municipality. [Interjections.] Deputy Speaker, in conclusion... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I would like to end with this quote... [Interjection.]

“We cannot always choose the music life plays for us, but we can choose how we dance to it.”

HON MEMBERS: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This Provincial Department and this Provincial Government are choosing the restoration of hope and the dignity of all of our citizens. I think that is the beat we all want to dance to. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor! [Tussenwerpsels.]  
[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear! [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Kama. The floor is yours. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Remember the focus is on [Inaudible.]

Mr M KAMA: No, we did say, we did say that... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.] Order on my left side. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. We did say that... ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Remember to read speech. [Unclear.]

Mr M KAMA: There are people who are thinking that we are running a pub here, hence why we are told about beats, that we must dance to... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon Kama, you have the floor now, so you must focus, yes.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, hon members, incoming Premier Ivan Meyer, outgoing Premier Winde. [Laughter] Leader of the Official Opposition. [Interjections.] [Laughter] The ANC declines to support this Budget Vote.

An HON MEMBER: Declines, ah no! Why? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are supposed to listen!

Mr M KAMA: I think what is important... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Order, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: I think what is important, Deputy Speaker, is that the DA must stop the act.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, take your seat for a moment. Hon Bosman, what is your point of order?

Mr G BOSMAN: Speaker, I rise to ask if the hon member is prepared to take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: No, I am not, Chair. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sit down, hon Bosman. You may proceed, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Deputy Speaker, the DA must stop the act. No amount of fundraised statistics will change the realities of this Government that it is comfortable with the privileges of the rich and white and disparities of the poor and black. While noting that the Department's budget has increased by over R62 million, including rollovers of about R6,5 million, and R56,6 million from other adjustments, the ANC does not believe that this increase will bring a positive change for the people.

Yesterday, comrade Pat Marran, in welcoming the Report of Human Settlements on Dignity Oversight, said:

“If the Department’s performance of housing development will be rated, it would get one out of 10 due to its poor performance and slow pace of housing delivery.”

I concur with comrade Pat’s assessment, this is one of the most – it is one of the worst performing departments in the Province, with a weak MEC that is more preoccupied with DA internal factional politics than delivery of houses. We are called upon to pass a budget that will once more lead to material findings by the Auditor-General as the clueless MEC continues to lead the Department astray. We want the MEC to present his plans to address the consistent serious findings against his Department, which always gets the worst audit findings. Recently a media headline read, and I quote:

“The Western Cape Department of Human Settlements has been rapped over the knuckles for weak controls that led to financial losses of R22 million. This was based on the Auditor-General’s finding that the Department provided housing subsidies to people who were not entitled to one and overpaid valid applicants, which resulted in a loss of R22 million.”

And in this, Deputy Speaker we were reminded of Cynthia Bless, which even member Marran spoke about here yesterday, whose subsidy was approved in April 2020. She is currently staying with her disabled son in a dilapidated house. Up until now she does not have a house built for her. It will be very remiss of me

not to congratulate, however, the MEC, on his promotion to the new Department of Infrastructure. I also have to note that with the kind of legacy as gained in the Department of Human Settlements, we have to be very worried and very worried about the future of infrastructure in the province. With this promotion, it is clear that Premier Alan Winde and the DA reward mediocrity. The Housing Demand Database of nearly 600 000 people worsened under his watch and there seems to be no plan from the Provincial Government to help the rapid increase of this database. The insignificant R63 million increase in the Department's budget will not make any positive change. Instead, it will contribute toward the Department's poor performance.

The Dignity Oversight Report that was alluded to above painted a grim picture of dwindling housing targets that are never achieved. It highlighted the challenge of a messed-up Housing Demand Database across municipalities and all of the above point to the need of an urgent intervention from the MEC. The City's annual delivery targets dwindled from over 17 000 homes and service sites between 2013 and 2020 to a mere 8 000. Like COVID-19, which has been the most used excuse by this Government for underperformance, the MEC is using extortion as a fig leaf to hide from his poor performance. The MEC must stop being a cry-baby. He must use his powers to act. We want to know how he is responding to this challenge of extortion in the Housing Development Project, and how this budget is providing for it.

The ANC has continuously called for accelerated housing provision for low-income earners especially in the areas with high demand. We continue to make calls for Government to address the legacy of apartheid spatial development by building affordable housing near places of opportunities and we continue to make calls for funding upgrades of informal settlements. None of these have been prioritised in this budget. The proposed budget does not come near addressing the housing challenges in the province. Despite all of the abovementioned challenges only R23,4 million additional budget will go towards Programme 3, which is Housing Development.

However, that is not the main challenge. The Department must strengthen its internal measures and come up with strategies to deal with shoddy workmanship, which has led to the collapse of the Trans Hex Housing Project where the first 44 houses which were supposed to be handed over in December 2020 have not yet been handed over to date, due to structural problems, and the MEC deliberately does not talk about this.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Department received R8,5 million in its own revenue collection. Ordinarily, an increase in own revenue collection for a Department is a welcome development. However, for this Department, it is a matter of grave concern, while black people live in squalor, being crammed in informal settlements with no basic services, white people continue to live lavishly in Government owned properties across a number of leafy suburbs at a rental fee of only R100 rand per month. This is far less than the market-related value. The Committee and the House need to pay a closer look at this anomaly. It is either people pay market-related values for these properties, or access is given to everyone, not only white people.

It is for those reasons that the ANC declines to support this budget. It is disappointing that funds for goods and services and compensation of employees have been reprioritised for provision for higher than budgeted legal costs, travelling costs and security costs.

Deputy Speaker, the reality is that we have a weak MEC in this Department and we want to warn the MEC that in the DA, like we warn all other members of the DA who are non-white, in the DA if you are not white, you are kept in a position for as long as you are weak. A political heist is being committed in this House. We sleep and wake up with no Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA: The institution of this Parliament is being led into chaos by Helen Zille and the white bosses of the DA.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Kama, your time is up.

Mr M KAMA: The MEC is just clueless and allowing all this chaos to unfold.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

Mr M KAMA: Zille decided to fire Mngqasela and now we must wait for Zille to decide who is going to be the Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, your time is up. Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: And this MEC is a leader of the DA in this province. He is weak. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. [Interjections.] Order, members. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya. I think you are online?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. The MEC has actually listed of number of success stories done by his Department that we do not even see on the ground.

Deputy Speaker, there is a list with personal details of residents from Kanana Informal Settlement, who were promised houses by the very same Department and the Department promised to move these residents to the Forest Village by July 2022.

Deputy Speaker, two weeks back someone knocked on my office door and to hand over a list containing private personal details of these applicants. This individual then told us that he found the list in the trash bin and that upon inquiry he also found that the same people in that list are still without houses. Deputy Speaker, this conduct from the Department is inhuman and infringes almost all the values of our Constitution. Not only did the Department deceive them about getting houses but it also disposed of the personnel information in an undignified manner.

Deputy Speaker, today we have what we call a POPI Act which aims to protect the personal information of people of this country, but for the Department to throw people's personal information in a trash bin and on top of that do not provide them with promised houses, is despicable. Deputy Speaker, it is not only these individuals who are battling to get decent houses from the Department, people of Dunoon and Kosovo were promised houses during the height of COVID-19 pandemic by this very same Department, and to date not much has been done by the Department.

Deputy Speaker, a budget increase of more than R63 million will not assist a Department that is unwilling to provide people with houses.

The political head of this Department must just admit that he has failed and must do an honourable thing and resign, because our people cannot continue to suffer as a result of this poor leadership. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon member. I now recognise hon August. Are you online?

Mr S AUGUST: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Yesterday the Dignity Oversight Report was accepted in this House. As I mentioned in my declaration remarks, the report alludes to some developments. However, we still have a very, very long way to go to achieve our ideals of giving the people of this province a house they can call a home.

The Western Cape's housing backlog is running into hundreds of thousands of applicants in waiting. This Government simply will not be able to meet these targets, not in this term and certainly not in the possible next one as their policies are centralised on upholding the status quo.

We need robust reforms on addressing spatial injustices. We need robust policy redress that tackles how we view the development of human habitats aligned with decent delivery of services. We need to better understand the ever-changing needs of people from human settlements and how this fuses with the ability of any Government to deliver a decent quality need-fulfilling home. I will repeat this again, where people live, matters; how people live, matters; and how they engage with the environment, matters; how they access public transport, matters, and how they make an income, matters. Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. You may finish your sentence.

Mr S AUGUST: You cannot simply just deliver housing units and assume that answers the need. These exercises end up too closely to bear to the Government ends of taking two steps forward and five steps back. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much hon member. I now recognise hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy

Speaker, Premier, Cabinet members, and hon members of the House. I just want to say I thank the Opposition from ANC and the members of the Standing Committee for supporting Vote 8 of this adjustment. I really appreciate that, and I know why they did that because they acknowledge the work that they have seen as they criss-crossed this province, in seeing what this Department is doing, and I know that member Marran, as we criss-crossed, he learned the way to Trans Hex. He will mention it again and again and I appreciate that that project is close to his heart and he will say Trans Hex until I finish doing my debate, which I appreciate, and another one is, Deputy Speaker, I just want to highlight one thing that member Kama said when he stood up in saying that no, they do not support the adjustment. I understand he is not in the Standing Committee, so he did not get their report maybe from their contribution, 20% contribution from member Lili in attending the Standing Committee, and I want to thank member Marran for his 80% contribution of attending the Standing Committee for Human Settlements. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

I expected member Marran to be the one who was going to contribute as he has been the voice of the Western Cape communities that voted for ANC, even though he is not a permanent member in the Standing Committee. So member Marran, thank you very much, you were just short-changed for not debating this adjustment.

Deputy Speaker, Minister Mireille Wenger presented to us the Provincial Government's framework of hope last week. The Adjustment Budget is set to further restore dignity to Western Cape residents, highlight the Provincial Government's concern for our most vulnerable communities, prioritise infrastructure development, create jobs and inspire hope.

I rise confidently in support of Vote 8, Human Settlements. The Western Cape Department of Human Settlements has been allocated an additional R63 million in the Adjusted Appropriation Budget. This allocation represents an ongoing process of development and delivery of the people of the Western Cape. This budget aims to provide Human Settlements projects with a range of rental and ownership options that cater to the diverse needs and incomes of households, as well as basic and social economic services. It also aims to continuously improve human settlements through citizen and Government efforts supported by contributions from the private sector. The housing crisis in South Africa is a troubling issue that must be addressed in conjunction with the country's unemployment and economic challenges. When people lack adequate access to stable employment opportunities, they are more likely to turn to the Government for housing as well. The Western Cape Provincial Government's decision to increase the Human Settlements budget by R63 million exemplifies the type of Government that is honest and knowledgeable about the South African housing backlog crisis that dates back decades.

The total additional appropriation for Programme 3, Housing Development, has seen an increase of over R30 million. R15 million of this was spent in respect of the Deferred Ownership Project in Mill Park. R7,7 million was spent on electrical connections for Breaking New Ground units in Railton and Melkhoutfontein Projects. Over the last year, the Provincial Department of Human Settlements has done more than just build houses. It has built homes and given dignity to

thousands of households and communities.

In the last financial year, hon Deputy Speaker, the Provincial Department of Human Settlements played a significant role in job creation as well as in providing skills training opportunities to young people, this despite the country being in the middle of an economic and employment crisis.

The Department contributed in enabling the recovery of the Western Cape economy. Many locals in various communities of the Western Cape can attest to the job opportunities they were given as a result of Human Settlements projects. Approximately 68% of the Human Settlement Development Grant in the 2021/22 financial period was spent on Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises with 14,5% and 6,18% of that amount going to contractors who represent women and youth respectively, and I know member Marran is passionate about this because he supports me as the Chairperson. This amplifies how the Department has followed through on its promise to actively support ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: ...support the growth of small businesses in the Western Cape. During Women's Month in August, I joined Minister Simmers at a Women-in-Construction event where the Minister announced the development of an app that will make tender processes and information easier to access. The development of such an app, once again, will highlight the innovation and responsiveness of the Western Cape Government to inputs of the public. Hon Deputy Speaker, despite the Department's tireless efforts to ensure that Western Cape housing beneficiaries receive their homes on time and in good condition, the Department has faced significant difficulties due to the gangs that intimidate and extort contractors by demanding what they refer to as protection money that can reach R200 000 per month, and through you, Deputy Speaker, member Kama needs to understand this.

There have been numerous housing projects in the Western Cape that had to be postponed or prolonged as a result of these brazen criminal incidences. It is not a cry-baby; it is a reality. [Interjection.]

Minister Simmers recently disclosed in a parliamentary question that was shared with all of us that R5 billion in housing projects have been put on hold due to criminal activity and other issues. That is around 40 000 beneficiaries. It is about 47 housing projects. I am not counting one house. It is 47 housing projects that are affected. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat, hon member. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, would the hon Maseko be as gracious enough as the Premier to take a question, please, particularly on who is getting... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Maseko. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: To be as gracious. [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: Like the hon member mentioned that the Premier is gracious, I am not gracious. [Laughter] So, hon Deputy Speaker, I am pleased to inform this House...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, honourable.

Ms L M MASEKO: ...to inform this House that the Human Settlements Standing Committee will convene a meeting with the relevant stakeholders in January 2023 to discuss the best approaches to tackle this issue of extortion in Human Settlements projects. We cannot continue to watch while criminals dominate our society and interrupt crucial service delivery projects. I also want to commend the Provincial Department of Human Settlements for its partnership-based and people-centred approach to the delivery of homes and improving the quality of living conditions of people living in informal settlements across the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is said that, and now I would also like to take this moment to commend the Western Cape Government and City of Cape Town for their continued commitment to building social houses, but we need to acknowledge that that is just not enough because the more this Government delivers, the more we are creating the demand for the housing. There is a ripple effect that the movement will come to this Government because there are opportunities. People, they do not come to the Western Cape just for the housing. [Interjections.] They come for job opportunities. People, they do not eat houses, they need to have the jobs to take care of their families. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Now the Western Cape province has the highest number of social houses in the country where affordable decent rental accommodations in convenient locations throughout the City are provided. The recent announcement of the historic Salt River Project that will see the development of 216 units of social houses is one of the many projects in Cape Town that brings affordable rental units to the heart of the City. Again, the sad part, where National is involved, you know I would also like just to take this moment to express, and I know my colleagues also they will join me in this one...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms L M MASEKO: You know, the District Six community, for decades the National Department of Agriculture Land Reform and Rural Development has denied the displaced beneficiaries the dignity of moving back to their community. Minister Thoko Didiza continues to close the doors of transparency. We even deployed member Marran to try to talk to his colleague in making sure that he comes and talk to us. Member Marran was there... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: ...when the communities were here in the public hearing, telling us to try and gather information on their behalf to find out after more than 30 years when are they going to move back? They just want answers. [Interjections.] Member Marran promised with this Committee we will try, but unfortunately, they are hiding behind the POPI Act, so it is still difficult for member Marran, but member Marran said he will check how we can do that when they go for the Congress, if it can happen.

So in closing, Deputy Speaker, we must be honest and in acknowledging that housing delivery in South Africa will continue to be a challenging task.

I therefore commend the Western Cape Government's continued hard work in ensuring that in this province, at least this crisis is mitigated as much as possible and in closing I just want to also thank again, my 80% member Marran for the contributions for this financial year, my 20% member in absentia, or maybe online, and his contribution, when he is available. To the Standing Committee, and also for today, member Kama, for representing the 20% which I have to subtract one, now 19%, you have 1% for the contribution. [Laughter.] The Human Settlements family and Minister for really being there as the members always, they ask for reaction within

30 days. This Standing Committee is the one that always has the deadlines, as we go throughout the municipality, so we appreciate all their assistance you are giving, the dignity you are giving to their communities, and with that, Deputy Speaker, this Standing Committee is the only one who supported the Adjustment Budget Vote unanimously. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Minister Simmers. Hon members, we have to push through. Hon Minister Simmers, over to you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker, and firstly I welcome all the responses ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... of the different parties.

†Ek wil amper hê die Voorsitter van die Komitee moet aanpraat. Nou ja, sy het beperkte tyd. [I almost want the Chairman of the Committee to continue speaking. Well, she has limited time.]

And I will respond to some of the inputs by Mr 20/20, seeing that Mr 80 is not here. Now member Kama, it shows why you are part of the 20/20-gang, so let me just put the facts straight to you so you can become part of the 80/80-group, when you are there.

First and foremost, member Kama, you referred to matters which was highlighted by the AG and I do welcome that, but I am not a †tjankbalie [cry baby]. In Afrikaans there is a saying:

† "As die sweep klap en jy moet die houe kry dan moet jy die houe vat." ["If the whip snaps and you have to receive the lashes, then you have to take the

lashes.”]

And I am man enough to take the shots and the punches when I get it, but you must also be willing to accept it when you will get it. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So let me start correcting you on some of the misinformation...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, Minister Simmers, just take your seat for a moment. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I know the colleagues ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, one moment.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):...on the opposite side of the House are now going to say... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, one minute.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... that I am being like a stuck record, but I will continue. The hon MEC must speak through you... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Speak to me, I understand.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and the reason why it is happening all the time is because when I do raise it, they treat it like a joke. [Laughter] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister, you may proceed, please focus on me.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Okay, through you, Deputy Speaker, to member Kama. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, yes, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me now correct some of the incorrect information contained in your input, so I cannot take you for granted, I cannot blame you because you are part of the 20/20 gang, so I fully understand why you relied on somebody else, possibly through you, Deputy Speaker, writing and giving that speech. †Ek verstaan heeltemal, dis eintlik betreuenswaardig, die insette wat gegee was. [Tussenwerpsels.] [I understand perfectly, it is actually lamentable, the inputs that were given. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, Minister. Can you take your seat? Hon Kama, what is your point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape is a province of gangs...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, what is your point?

Mr M KAMA: And the MEC says I am part of the... He is saying I am part of the 20/20-gang... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh No-no-no, no, hon Kama, do not make assumptions. I heard very clearly, just 20/20 is a perfect word.

Mr M KAMA: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Nothing associated, hon Kama. [Interjection.] No, hon Kama, I cannot. You cannot. We cannot do that, and that is a blanket definition in the dictionary. [Interjection.] Hon Sayed, do you have a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, the point of order, hon Deputy Speaker, is, we are not having a problem with the word, with the term 20/20, it is when it is accompanied with the word gang.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That has serious implications. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure. I will listen very carefully if the Minister accuses any of you of any... hon member. [Interjections.] Over to you Minister Simmers, focus on me, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, to come back to the 20/20-component, which the hon member is part of.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja, that is better, the component.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is better, ja.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Component.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But he must listen to TKZee, which also had a song called... [Indistinct] that is co-independent, so, your R22 million comment. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Ek is jonk. Ek is nie oud nie, [I am young. I'm not old,] by the way, the R22 million, once again, and, Deputy Speaker through you, there is a tendency of the Opposition to use the newspapers as their main source of information. Once again, the misinformation in terms of the R22 million again has now been – I said when I did my speech, I acknowledged what was the real issue and what the corrective steps are, so I

would really encourage the member as part of the 20% to actually read my real reason and not depend on a newspaper article as his main source of intelligence, when it comes to this august House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Then, Deputy Speaker, Cynthia Bless, once again the fact there, if I am going to give the facts again because I did respond to the hon Lili on this matter, in writing. It is a pity that the other part of the 20/20-group did not give it to this member through you, Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: She did.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Ms Bless has a disabled son. On her application at municipal level, when she applied she indicated that there is a disability. That is correct, but when we started the project, and then you go to the next stage of filling in your required information, the municipality failed to process her application properly because units for persons with disability get additional funding and they are retrofitted so we cannot give them duplex units. We need to give them single-storey units, and the problem is, the third problem is that by the time that we became aware of Ms Bless' situation, all the single units were already handed out and I believe this House will agree with me, I cannot give a duplex unit, which is not fitted for persons with disability, to Ms Bless. [Interjections.] But now we go, the issue is then exaggerated, it is taken further because you cannot continue building houses in the municipality because Eskom cannot actually give additional capacity, so it is a very awkward situation to resolve. Perhaps if Eskom can ensure there is energy ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...and they can actually give additional capacity to the line, then we can actually build Ms Bless the house, which she rightfully deserves. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In terms of the growing backlog, I am happy that the hon Maseko ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, one minute. I cannot hear. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I touched on that, hon Deputy Speaker, because you cannot expect this Provincial Government to address a backlog it inherited, nor can you expect this Provincial Government and this Provincial Department to deal effectively and efficiently when we have for more than a decade asked for additional funding to ensure that we effectively deal with the housing need in this province. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But you can answer about the project also.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In terms of the Trans Hex Project, which is the 80% contributor's main theme since last year, and I really applaud that, Deputy Speaker. That is a site where new technology was being used to build those units. We had certain responsibilities. The Municipality had certain responsibilities, and there is trial and error when you do test new technologies, Deputy Speaker. So I had to acknowledge that technology seemed okay to use, but the contractor was the wrong contractor for the right technology...[Interjections.] But now, where are we currently and...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Through you, Deputy Speaker...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:...to mister, to the hon member with the 80% attendance to the Committee, I am proud to say that where we could not in 2020 hand over those units, and I asked my Department, I do not want to hand over the 44 units – through you, Deputy Speaker, the hon member talks about; I want to hand over all 190 units, because those people have been waiting for a very long time. I acknowledge that, and I am proud to say that we will be making an announcement... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...through the Municipality, when all 190 units will be handed over, not just the 44 that the hon member, through you, Deputy Speaker, is talking about the whole time. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker, once again through you, I find it quite ironic, but actually not that the Opposition party keeps on hammering regarding rental stock owned by this Provincial Government...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The NHBRC [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And the problem that we have now, hon Deputy Speaker, is that we have commenced and implemented a rental strategy to ensure that tenants firstly are legal, which means they have a rental agreement with my Department. We have applied a scale basis where we also do open market related pricing for our rental stock, so people paying R100 will not be paying R100, but the irony for me, Deputy Speaker, why is it always about race for the African National Congress. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Yes, because they have nothing else.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: When some of the members or people who have been renting for many years, living in those units, are people of different colours, not just the one colour the African National Congress keeps on hammering about, and it is time for them to look into the mirror, Deputy Speaker, to start reflecting internally, why they are failing in the Western Cape. Why they are failing, they could not even have a Congress. They had to postpone it again, because they are a failing and dying party in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

†Hou op fokus op ras, fokus op dinge wat saak maak. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Stop focusing on race, focus on things that matter. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of the EFF, once again, I so hope that the EFF actually attends the Standing Committee on Human Settlements. [Interjections.] Then, Deputy Speaker, they would be aware ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...the proportion of people who were earmarked to move to Forest Village, were moved to Forest Village in 2021 already, with names which we, as the Department together with the City of Cape Town, in isiXhosa put up, the names of people who were going to move so the community could tell us are these the right people or the wrong people, and when the movement started the correct people were moved, so if there are any other people now alleging they were supposed to move. †Ek is jammer, die bus het beweeg, die mense het getrek. [I'm sorry, the bus had departed, the people had moved.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Deputy Speaker, I still have my hand up.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In terms of Dunoon...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can you take your seat. I see there is a hand up. Hon Makamba-Botya, do you have a point of order?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Deputy Speaker, I just want to know if... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ...if the MEC is able to take a question because now he is watering down the information that I have at my disposal.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Simmers?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker, through you, I will not take a question, but the member can send me a question in writing for

written response so that the EFF can be empowered with the correct information in black and white.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Over to you, Minister.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: We cannot dismiss information on that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker through you, the matter of Dunoon, once again, as we are speaking, the bulk infrastructure is being installed, but I need to respect the City of Cape Town and their due processes in terms of approval for the rezoning application, which we did. That took up more than a year of our time in that project, but we are a Provincial Government that respects the rule of law and builds good inter-governmental relations with the relevant sphere of Government, so that is why no unit has been build but the bulk infrastructure or installation has commenced earlier this year.

Deputy Speaker, at this juncture I would love to thank our Standing Committee Chairperson and the members of our Committee for the role that they played in holding us to account. They are doing it effectively and efficiently, irrespective which party members are part of that Standing Committee. †En ek wil baie dankie sê, [And I want to say thank you,] whether you are part of the 80% or the 20%, you are at least holding me 100% accountable, and I really, really thank you for that, but, I would also, Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker, at this stage I would really like to thank our new Head of Department, Labeeqah Schuurman, who is present in the House today, who commenced on 1 November. She has hit the ground running. She has taken charge of the Department, but also together with her team are ensuring that we are focused on the task that lies ahead of us, which is to deliver and continue delivering to qualifying beneficiaries of the Western Cape their much-needed housing opportunities ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Kama.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...and at the same time, being part of the process of Refresh as we wind up this Department to form part of the new Department of Infrastructure. But also the entire Senior Management Team and all 457 employees of Human Settlements, because to us each one plays a part, no matter your small component within our Department. Additionally, I also want to thank my Ministry staff, it is not easy to deal with two Departments at the same time, but they have done it, they have ensured I reply to oral questions, to written questions, to this House in time with very few requests for extensions during a very, very difficult year, but also the way that they are embracing Refresh, which prepares for the new Department. But, last but not least, also to the Head of my Ministry, Ms Vuyolwethu Njalo, who is always by my side to play a crucial role, and then to all the members of this House from

the Department of Human Settlements, I do wish you all a safe, festive season. Travel safely if you are travelling, and indeed have a blessed, blessed New Year, as 2023 is the year where you will see real DA change happening in the Western Cape at a more accelerated pace. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, hon Sayed and hon Baartman, if you could just concur with me for a minute. I really want to push the next Vote through. We are supposed to break at one, but we might just be 10 minutes late. We have a very long afternoon programme. Is that okay? I am taking [Inaudible.] It is Friday, prayer day. Okay, thank you very much.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will ask that Mr Stemele to read the next Order of the Day. Sorry, just, that concludes this Vote and I ask Mr Stemele to read the next Order of the Day.

### **3. Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Stemele. I now recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you for this opportunity to present before lunch. I want to greet all the members of the Legislature. Hon Deputy Speaker, I arise today to table the Western Cape Department of Agriculture Adjustment Budget 2022. Hon Deputy Speaker, on 30 March this year I tabled the Main Budget of R969,218 million, confirming the Western Cape Department of Agriculture through the budget and the theme under the budget, We Are Pushing Forward. Today, I return to this House to place before you an Adjusted Budget of R992,695 million and to confirm that Agriculture is still on the theme.

Now the details of the Adjustment Budgets and the estimates of expenditure before us, and that is the same figures that I have tabled before the Standing Committee, is R2,428 million towards the appointment of a service provider to conduct a pre-feasibility study, broadcasting services, the design layout of the printing, publications maintenance and repairs, as well as procurement of furniture, equipment and laptops; R109 million towards the economic impact evaluation of FruitLook. As you know, FruitLook is a digital satellite platform to assist people with effective water resource management, management of the water resources through a digital satellite. Also R2,210 million towards the fly-over expenditure maintenance and the repairs of machinery and the procurement of printers and laptops. I think this House will know that every three years we fly over the whole province to get the right data at different levels, and also in the different spatial contexts in the Western Cape. Also R3,7 million towards the procurement of groceries for students, meals at the College, maintenance and the repairs and the machinery and the procurement of laptops

and office equipment. R746 000 are also allocated to the capacitation of the Garden Route's Farms Dialogue to engage with farmers, farmworkers in particular in terms of our social capital investment there.

Other adjustments totalling R11 million, include R1,7 million towards the procurement for diesel for generators due to excessive load shedding and price hikes, R553 000 towards installing and configuring of backup storage systems for the Department; R1,3 million is assigned for the implementation of the Disaster Recovery Plan; R400 000 to ensure service delivery continuation by funding official telephones, and R3 million towards the support for logistics for operating the South African National Accreditation System for our facilities of the Veterinary Laboratory Services.

I think, hon Deputy Speaker, you will know that the Western Cape Government is the host of a very effective Provincial Veterinary Laboratory System, and we are doing testing not only for pharmacies in the Western Cape but for the whole country, and that system is now being upgraded to also maintain our accreditation status.

R3 million towards feed and fodder for the herds and flocks on the Agricultural Research Farm. Hon Deputy Speaker, you will also know that the Western Cape has seven well run efficient, effective research farms and those are the allocations in that regard.

Hon Deputy Speaker, R1 million is also allocated to the procurement of groceries for the Elsenburg College hostel procurement, maintenance and upgrades of the Moodle operating system. Hon Deputy Speaker, you know during COVID-19 the learners were unable to come to the College, so we have created an electronic learning, eLearning platform, called Moodle, so that students can have interactive engagements with the lecturers while they were not able to attend the classes, and so we have made that adjustments there.

So hon Deputy Speaker, I now table the Department of Agriculture 2022 Adjusted Budget of R992,695 million for consideration in this House. I thank you. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, Deputy Speaker. In this budget, Speaker, from the MEC, not a word about farmworkers – not a single word, and in the Committee meeting that we had at the end, the MEC said he is a MEC that cares for both farmers and farmworkers. That was his words. A budget, Deputy Speaker, of R992 million, only R567 000 budgeted for farmworkers, the Prestige Farmworker Event; not even 0,1% of the total budget, not even 0.1% of that budget. [Interjections.]

Now the MEC says that he cares for workers, but in the DA's 2019 Manifesto and as a national leader of the DA, they propose that farmworkers should only receive a wage that is equal to the Old Age Pension Grant, and at that time R1 800 – a slave wage!

This MEC says that he cares for farmworkers, and many times we have seen when a farmer being assaulted or killed, this MEC will go to the Court and oppose bail. Many farmworkers have been killed over the last couple of years. Not once have you seen this MEC in Court in defence of farmworkers, none. Now, and I have spoken, Chair, to the MEC about the issue of farmworkers...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Chair, on a point of order!

Mr P MARRAN: And about the issue of land... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Apologies, hon member Marran. Please take your seat. There is a point of order.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Chair, I have a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Apologies, hon member Marran, please take your seat, there is as a point of order. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Chair, my point of order, my point of order is hon Marran is speaking to Minister Simmers and can he please speak to you as per the Rules, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, face me, it is much easier than being distracted. Hon Marran, just take your seat. We have, there is another point of order. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, on a point of order also, the hon Mitchell, I noticed, he stood up first before he was recognised. I do not have a problem that he did the point of order, it is in order, but he stood up first, the process behind it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, hon members, we have to push through till lunch, I recognise the hon Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP: Hon Chair, in terms of Rule 66 subsection (3) regarding Procedure Practices and Operations of this House, when we raise our hands for points of order it is for the virtual platform because in COVID we had to get a virtual platform, but when you rise on a point of order, the word rise means that you must stand up, so when we rise on points of order I would like this House to continue with traditional precedents and practices that you must rise on a point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon Premier, what is your point of order?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker, I rise on a point of order because I think I have served in this House longer than any other member in this House, and it has always been the tradition, as you want to rise on a point of order you stand up, and you stay standing until the Speaker recognises you. [Interjections.] Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Honourable...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, one minute, hon Sayed is speaking. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Speaker, on this issue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, firstly, number one...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We do recognise, hon Premier, hon Peter Marais as well as having been in the House for a long time. Member Dugmore actually started in 1994, for information purposes, and so we do take their wisdom. So on the basis of that wisdom of the hon Premier, and then the learning from that wisdom from the hon Acting Chief Whip, can we then indicate, because there was a ruling that we cannot stand up if we are not being recognised? Can we then indicate then that there is an amendment; there is a change now so that we can just stand up if we want to be recognised? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members. Yes, hon members. I am reluctant to do this now because it is going to become a debate and hon Marran is now in, ja, he is on. You are on the hot seat now because your speech is not being heard so I wonder if I could come back and make a ruling on this. So for the interest of time and lunch, and hon Marran, face me, I am looking at you. Thank you very much.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, thanks, Deputy Speaker. This MEC is saying that he cares so much for farmworkers, and when we spoke about farmworkers and this Prestige Farmworker event and spoke about how we can assist them to acquire land and not only to remain farmworkers, the response was bad, but one of the Prestige Agri Workers have won, and through that an opportunity that she took up in Australasia. So this MEC is fine when we lose expertise and not creating those opportunities for those farmworkers to become farmers, the MEC's response is saying: "I am happy that she left to another country." That is actually what the MEC is saying.

Deputy Speaker, the ANC does not support his Budget Vote, let me start with this, after the tabling of the Adjusted Budget, we sat in our respective Committees, which left us with more unanswered questions ...[Interjection.] ...and for this reason we must reject this budget. [Interjections.] The Adjusted Budget has virements that amounts to R5.5 million, but in this Committee we were presented with a figure ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P MARRAN: ...of R300 000 unaccounted for, and we are not sure where that money goes. [Interjection.] Where is the money trail and evidence? Is this not an evidence-led Government continuously set by the Premier? We need that evidence, and we need it soon. You cannot unspent... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P MARRAN: ...and also have money that goes missing. How are the books balancing? [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P MARRAN: With the compensation of employees diminishing year after year, this is also a concern for the ANC. Various departments have witnessed this ongoing trend, and it is worrisome, yet this Provincial Government seeks outside labour while sourcing services instead of employing citizens of this Province.

Deputy Speaker, this Provincial Government is willing to outsource R2,2 million worth of labour instead of working towards elevating the high unemployment rate that we are currently faced with. The decrease in unemployment that was announced a few days ago for the province does not go unnoticed, but we cannot praise a fish for swimming. You have promised one job for every household a few years back. The Department needs to prioritise filling those vacant posts and stop using money appropriated for the compensation of employees, for other programs and projects. Yes, the DA will try and retaliate by saying what about National Government? This has become an old and boring song and they need to account for the province that they are governing. They are continuously keeping to hide behind National Government while they have enough funds, for example, the provision of safe transportation for farmworkers. This is a programme of the Department of Agriculture. Obviously they are suffering the blame and say, no, it is the responsibility of Public Works and Transport, and yet in 2019, when a certain farmer was killed in Stellenbosch, this Department could manage to get R5 million and distribute it to the different district municipalities to put up cameras across all major roads within the province, and yet they are saying it is the responsibility of Public Works.

Deputy Speaker, it does not stop, but this does not stop them from funding LEAP officers, even though policing is supposedly a national mandate, and earlier this morning we heard the Premier speak about the devolution of powers; they want more powers, admitting actually that policing is not their responsibility, and in the Budget Speech that we heard from the MEC of Finance, billions of rands budgeted for LEAP officers and try to establish this police force that the Premier promised in his Manifesto.

In reality, this Provincial Government refuses to address the challenges faced by agricultural workers. These workers continue to be transported like animals at the back of trucks and this poses a huge risk of safety. It is a food security crisis / threat, when farmworkers are killed at the back of trucks. These are humans, people with homes, people who are held in high regard in the

communities, that are being treated and degraded like this. Another issue that we have with this DA-led Government is the Land Reform issue that has been ongoing since we came into this Administration in 2019. To go back to this Government being able to fund programmes, even though they are a national mandate, the Premier said that he was not going to wait for National Government to fund the R20 million Brandvlei Dam Project, they could find R20 million and put it in the 2019 budget for the rise of the Loopsloot at the Brandvlei Dam. Now Speaker, which brings me to ask this: why are there projects that they can do, even though it is not their mandate, but also projects that they are adamant on not taking on because they are national mandates. This proves that there is nothing stopping them from carrying on these duties. The land ownership of black farmers in this province has decreased...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

Mr P MARRAN: ...and black farmers were forced to sell their land to their previous white land owners... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran, your time is up.

Mr P MARRAN: ...due to insufficient funds to run farms, that is one of the reasons why this MEC is in denial about ownership in the Western Cape, and when the hon Dugmore proposed the written question... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: ...the MEC referred him to the Deeds Office.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, I cannot accept this budget and therefore the ANC declines to support this Budget Vote.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Mr P MARRAN: I thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now call on hon Xego, I think you are online hon Xego?

Mr M XEGO: Yes, that is correct, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr M XEGO: Deputy Speaker, increasing the Department of Agriculture budget by more than R23 million is uncalled for. This is the same Department that is unwilling to transform the agricultural sector of the province by making it more inclusive. Every year, millions of rands are pumped into this Department in order to assist the already rich white farmers who can survive without state assistance. The millions of rands were supposed to have been used by the Department to acquire agricultural land to be able to assist emerging black

farmers.

When the booming of the agricultural sector is celebrated in this province, it is the white people who continue to get richer. This leads to the increase in inequalities that are happening in this province. More than 20 years into Democracy we are still battling with the issue of inequality because those who govern do not want to assist the poor to be financially independent and become equal participants in the formal economy. The successful farming in this province relies on farmworkers who continue to be underpaid and abused at the hands of the white farmers. Farmworkers can stay in farm dwellings for almost the rest of their lives, but when they reach the retirement age, they are kicked out of those farms, and they have nowhere else to go.

Most municipalities in this province do not have budget for the provision of emergency houses. So it is the duty of this Department with the Department of Housing to make sure that elderly people, who are no longer farmworkers, get houses when they reach the retirement age or before that. When it comes to social welfare, farmworkers are mostly neglected because most of them are in remote areas and do not have access to the necessities of life.

This Department must make it its duty to assist these farmworkers. The plight of farmworkers and emerging black farmers must be attended to, but until then the EFF will not support this Vote. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Xego. I now recognise hon August.

Mr S AUGUST: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. When you look at the first quarter performance of the agricultural sector, I believe it is safe to say that there is a great potential to contribute much more positively to our provincial economy, and to job creation and income security. In comparison to other sectors we have experienced a large percentage of growth ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon member.

Mr S AUGUST: In comparison to other sectors who has experienced large percentage of growth, the agricultural sector growth rate for the first quarter 2022 was 0,5%, but this menial percentage growth created thousands of jobs. We realise that the sector can contribute a great deal to the national and provincial unemployment crisis. Instead of giving people a fish let us teach them how to fish.

This budget should explore a subsistence farming model that would serve poor destitute communities and create an economy around a sustainability mechanism. Empower young people by creating agricultural internship for those in the further education and training phases with the possibility of a support package to smart-start a small holding start-up. Build and establish buffers to withstand the fast-changing effects climate change has on the sector and the dire effects of the economy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr S AUGUST: We need to rediscover the importance of agriculture and this budget needs to provide an enabling environment for that discovery. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much for your indulgence. I now recognise hon Marais. Hon Baartman?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I forwarded an email to yourself, the Secretary, and Mr Poggenpoel. Member Marais, just before he was now recognised, has asked that he does not participate in Vote 11. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much for letting me know. I now recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members. I am grateful for this opportunity to speak on the Adjustments Budget but let me first just respond to some of what was said here earlier today. Recently, I moved in this House that the House congratulates the category winners of the Annual Prestige Agri Worker Awards that were announced at the Gala Ceremony at Grand West on Saturday, 5 November 2022...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order members!

Mr S N AUGUST: And that is where it stops.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... and particularly Mr Nigel Klaasen was announced as the overall winner of 2022. Unfortunately, this motion was opposed by the Leader of the Official Opposition, and therefore today I would like to convey to those category winners and to the overall winner, Mr Nigel Klaasen... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat hon member. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, if I am looking at the Provincial Constitution, there is no reference to a Leader of an Official Opposition in the Western Cape, I just want to know which leader of which official, there is a leader of an opposition. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not a point of order, but you can answer, hon Van der Westhuizen. [Interjections.] Order.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: My apologies, my apologies. The unofficial leader of the Opposition. [Laughter] Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I therefore want to put on record today that the Democratic Alliance congratulates the category winners, that the

Democratic Alliance also want to congratulate, particularly the overall winner, Mr Nigel Klaasen, and, Deputy, I find it very, very sorry, that the hon Marran, who has on numerous occasions been witness to enjoy the hospitality of the Department of Agriculture... [Applause.] ...including at that function, where he particularly enjoyed the lamb shank, that he unfortunately is opposing any adjustments and any budgets for the Department of Agriculture ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... and I do hope that in future he will act with his conscience when it comes to these things. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, we are just prolonging our lunch opportunity.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Under the Western Cape's Department of Agriculture...[interjection]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Van der Westhuizen, take your seat. Hon Marran, you may rise.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, ja. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, one minute. Hon members, I cannot hear a thing and we are just prolonging our lunch break. Over to you.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, Deputy Speaker. Speaker is it parliamentary to try and bribe a Member of Parliament with a lamb shank, with a lamb shank? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is a tough one, hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Is it parliamentary?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, let us proceed, that is not a point of order. Please proceed, hon Van der Westhuizen. [Interjections.]

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: May I, thank you, and I do trust that the clock was stopped every time, Deputy?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hope so. Yes, it was.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Under this Department, the Western Cape has become the biggest exporter of agricultural products...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... of all South African provinces, and food security, and I think the hon Marran would be grateful for this, which is understood to be the ability to feed one citizen ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... has become a very important topic over the last few decades, a consequence of widespread poverty and unemployment. South Africa, thanks to our farmers is a net producer of food. Internationally, and also domestically, there is a fast-rising demand for food due to growing populations and South Africa unfortunately is not getting bigger. The land available for agricultural purposes is not getting bigger and due to climate change it seems as if our water resources are also not great. On an international rank list of driest countries, South Africa was ranked 39 out of 182 countries by the United Nations Food and Organisational Data. While these rankings must be seen in context, it does illustrate the need in South Africa to manage all arable land and our water resources carefully. Predictions are that South Africa together with our neighbours, Botswana and Namibia will be falling in the highest category of water stress by 2040, that is only 18 years from now. That is if we continue with business as usual, which emphasises the need for land reform, not to kill off productive farms, not to decrease production on these farms, but rather to unlock the full potential of all farmlands using water as sparingly as possible. Unfortunately, the track record of our National Government in this regard is dismal, and we are not getting the prompt return on our investments in land reform.

R12-billion was spent by the National Government since 2006, acquiring farms for land reform purposes under their Proactive Land Acquisition Strategy (PLAS), yet the heartless lack of post settlement support by the National Government for these farmers mean that 75% of land reform farms are not commercially viable. I have seen in Europe, particularly in high density cities and towns, how small pieces of land next to railway lines, next to highways, wherever an open piece of land can be found, are used for small scale family gardens.

I am grateful for the work that this Department has done to encourage and support family, but also community food gardens. While some, also in this House, are sceptical about this initiative, we should never forget the benefits of this programme in a country with some of the highest unemployment figures in the world. Despite our climate, that unlike many other countries and even parts of South Africa require water for irrigation of vegetable gardens, this initiative has made a difference to the lives of many of our citizens. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: It is not only [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Marran, hon members, I cannot hear hon Van der Westhuizen. He is quite far back so please, let us get through this. Over to you.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: This initiative ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no-no, no-no, no, no please, can I not have crossing over of conversation. Over to you hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, Chair, and I trust that this will be added to my time?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja. [Interjections.] Please proceed.

An HON MEMBER: There is that election. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Chair, please protect me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, please hon members, it is just making our lunch opportunity shorter. Over to you.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: No lunch for those that oppose farming. Chair, it has not only given these people dignity in being able to produce products for their own families, and often surpluses for others, it has given them focus. Working with the soil and caring for plants also have psychological benefits. It is therefore with sadness and disbelief that members of this House on a recent oversight visit learnt that even these worthwhile initiatives are prone to theft and vandalism.

We have recently learnt that the Western Cape is by far the province that created the biggest number of new jobs in agriculture over the past 10 years. Where the Western Cape has been able to create an additional 67 000 permanent jobs in agriculture, the next best province was Gauteng with only 10 000 jobs. This, while the National Development Plan actually envisaged that agriculture should grow by a million jobs in the period under discussion. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: This achievement by the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Nkondlo. Hon Premier.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Deputy Speaker, do you want me to continue despite? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I would like – Hon Marran, I will have to hold off until we have some opportunity to hear hon Van der Westhuizen. You may proceed. Hon Marran, please!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you. This achievement by the Western Cape should be celebrated, particularly when seen against the enormous unemployment levels in our country.

Unfortunately, the ANC's labour policy seems set to kill jobs, rather than create jobs. The National Government has often referred to the term infrastructure-led growth, and yes, we are currently benefiting from infrastructure projects by our predecessors. My question to you today is, will our children one day be proud of us? Will our children be able to celebrate and say these capital projects were built in my parent's name, in my parent's time. These projects arise from the increase in the wall height of the Clanwilliam Dam, to the Buffeljags Dam outside of Swellendam, and the work on the canal feeding the Brandvlei Dam. None of these have started or are being completed on time.

I am sorry to report that the National Government is not even keeping up with the maintenance of existing infrastructure, and it is again this Province that is stepping in to fund what is essentially the mandate of central Government. Various water canals are far beyond their design capacity and lifespan, yet there is no funding for new and bigger canals. We may one day end up with water in an enlarged Clanwilliam Dam, should that project eventually come to fruition, but then lack the infrastructure to bring the water in adequate quantities to land reform projects, with enormous job creation potential and the ability to produce food, such as Ebenhaeser. The Western Cape also has the oldest and best performing Agricultural Training Institute at Elsenburg.

Unfortunately, many of the comparable Agricultural Colleges in other provinces have fallen into disrepair and have become an embarrassment to those provinces, an embarrassment which they would gladly hand over to anyone willing to accept a failed training institution. Can you imagine an Agricultural College where students should be trained to care for livestock but where animals are dying of thirst and hunger? So, despite the National Minister of Agriculture, Rural Development and Land Reform, not even being able to deal with what is primarily the responsibility of the Central Government, she is planning to take over Provincial Agricultural Colleges.

In our view, the training needs in the various provinces, showed different needs. Viticulture, for example, is mostly concentrated in the Western Cape, and Elsenburg has been producing some of the best trained winemakers internationally, winemakers with skills that are now being demanded worldwide. It is therefore clear that these Colleges are best run by the various provinces where the provinces still function.

Now turning to the adjustments in the budget, this Department would be receiving a well deserved additional R23,477 million. This amounts to 2,4% of the original budget. Almost all programmes see a slight increase in the budget, which allows them to continue with their good work. The sources of additional funding can be traced to rollovers as well as provincial and retained revenue funding.

Extension and advisory services would be able to continue and even expand their world-class scientific support and advice to farmers, helping to ensure the success and the growth of these farmers, particularly emerging farmers. This support is vital to them, and they cannot be expected to be immediate experts in their fields after being handed a title deed or lease agreement, but the National Minister recently admitted that the almost 1 700 beneficiaries of the PLAS

programme, in which farmers are forced to only lease this land back from the Government, should be replaced. We have argued that this should be replaced by full ownership of these farms. This will allow them to have access to the credit that is such an important factor due to the seasonal nature of farming.

There has been a R5,5 million additional allocation to the Veterinary Diagnostic Services budget. This shows that the danger of animal diseases that has been seen this year with foot and mouth, and other diseases, is being taken seriously by this Western Cape Department. The foot and mouth disease, with Onderstepoort not being able to produce vaccines anymore, has wreaked havoc under livestock farmers and we can be grateful for the work of this Department that has kept foot-and-mouth disease away from the Western Cape.

The importance of modern technology and advanced information systems in agriculture has grown tremendously over the last few years. The face of agriculture, that for many centuries was seen as a simple slow-moving environment, has changed completely.

I therefore welcome the additional R2 million allocation to the Research Infrastructure Support Services Budget. This programme helps to ensure that the Western Cape is able to keep pace with the evolving nature of agricultural technology with the facilities needed to ensure we can conduct vital research.

Knowledge gained must be shared, and I therefore also welcome the R4,7 million additional allocation to Programme 7, Agricultural Education and Training. As stated earlier, one of the shining lights of Agricultural Higher Education, not only in South Africa, but also the continent. Furthermore, there is an increased allocation of R1,6 million to the Agricultural Skills Development Subprogrammes Budget, ensuring our workforce stay up to date with the latest techniques, and this province is the only one with a Farmworker Development Program. We really care for our farmworkers. [Interjection.]

I therefore I have no hesitation in asking this House to support the adjustments to the budget of the Department of Agriculture. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen. I now recognise Minister Meyer. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I will be brief. We are the only province in South Africa that has an Agri Worker Competition. We are the only province where 1 000 Agri Workers took part in the competition. We are the only province in South Africa that have allocated R10,9 million for Agri Workers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: We are the only province that allocates money and a programme for worker engagement. We are the only Government

in South Africa where the funding for Brandvlei was motivated from the perspective of water for rural development, which is the mandate of this Government, and also, hon Deputy Speaker, land reform is a national mandate, but we are not abandoning it, we work with organisations like Partners in Agri Land Solutions (PALS). Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to thank the Chairperson of the Committee for an outstanding debate and outstanding contribution throughout the year, also in his capacity there, and I want to thank all the members of the Committee and my staff, Dr Sebopetsa, Dr Ilse Trautmann, as well as Darryl Jacobs and the Senior Management, the only functional Agricultural Department in South Africa.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, to conclude... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: To conclude, hon Deputy Speaker, I was now informed that the ANC is planning to bring on Monday a nomination to the House to nominate a Speaker, as the ANC's candidate. I have now been informed that the candidate for Speaker for the ANC on Monday will be President Ramaphosa. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! Hon members, if I can just have your indulgence, a few seconds please. Hon Sayed? Okay, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, can I have your attention please? [Interjections.] Hon Marran. [Interjections.] Hon Marran. [Interjections.]

Hon members, before we suspend the House, hon Marran, have a seat. Before we suspend the House, that concludes the Vote on Agriculture.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will suspend the House until 2 o'clock where we will proceed then with Environmental Affairs. That is Vote 9. Members, we have a very full afternoon program, so please enjoy your lunch and the break. The House is suspended till 2 p.m.

**[Business of the House was suspended and resumed at 14:00.]**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. You may be seated. If I can ask hon Dugmore to come to the House. If the hon members can just bear with me. Hon members, just before we start the debate on Vote 9, if you can just bear, have an indulgence with me. I am just waiting for the hon Dugmore to get back into the House, thank you. It technically has started. I am just giving hon Dugmore just a quick minute just to get back into the House. He is on his way. If you could just bear with me. Apologies, he should have been given notice and I think there [Interjections.] thank you. Hon Sayed, you will give me a second. Hon Sayed? You will deal with it?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, you may be seated. Thank you. Hon members, thank you for your indulgence. I would like to deal with the Notice of Motion by the hon Dugmore, Leader of the – I will not say Official Opposition – Leader of the Opposition. So, order.

I have received confirmation from the Secretary that the hon Leader of the Official Opposition has submitted a Notice of Motion in terms of Rule 151(1) of the Standing Rules at 11:35 this morning. [Audio distorted.] Can I ask the hon members online to put off their devices so that we do not have an echo. In terms of the Rules, the Notices of Motion must be placed on the Order Paper for Monday, 5 December 2022. It is a bit unprecedented to have you, hon Sayed, to rise in terms of this motion because it is not in your name. Can I assume that hon Dugmore is online? We cannot move. ...[Interjection.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): We cannot move.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Baartman. Hon Sayed, what I will do is we will proceed with the next Order of the Day, and I will then deliver my ruling or deliver a further notice on this motion afterwards. If you could ensure that hon Dugmore be then ... Hon Baartman? Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you. Thank you so much for your indulgence. The hon Dugmore had an emergency that he was running late from, in terms of his car. If I could then suggest that we move it. He is on his way to the House. If I could suggest that we get to it when he is here, so we start with the Budget Vote now and then, thank you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is absolutely fine. Hon Baartman?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you so much. I note the information that hon member Dugmore has moved a Notice of Motion in terms then of Rule 151, but I also do note that the person who moved the motion, if they wished for us to deal with it in this Sitting today, that they must rise on that particular matter ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): And since hon member Dugmore is not here, I do not believe the Rules allow for that. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: They do not, but in the interest of collegiality, I will give it – I will deliver the motion at the end of the Environmental Affairs Vote 9. And please ensure that hon Dugmore is then in the House for that reason so that there is no further opportunity for an objection, which is rightly so, by any of the hon members or the Acting Chief Whip.

Hon Maseko, okay. Hon Maseko, would you be so kind as to be part of the Presiding Officer's chair and take my place. Thank you very much. Thank you, hon Sayed. I am going to open then while the hon member makes her way

through. We will now begin with the debate on Vote 9. I will ask the Secretary to read the Order of the Day.

**4. Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary, I recognise hon Minister Bredell.

[Ms L M Maseko takes the Chair.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, hon members of the Executive, hon members of the House. Climate change and the world's inability to respond appropriately to it, was identified as the number one risk to humanity for the next decade and beyond, by Global Risk Report 2022.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, we are already experiencing climate change in South Africa and especially, in the Western Cape. Our weather patterns are changing. It is getting hotter. We are experiencing more intense droughts and floods. Compounding these challenges is a migration to the Western Cape by more than 100 000 people per year. This population growth is challenging the ability of our cities and towns to provide basic services, which is adding more pressure on our environment. Hon Temporary Chairperson, water security, sewerage, waste, and air pollution are all aspects of modern civilisation. We need to address these and many other environmental and planning issues if we are to keep the planet in a healthy state for future generations.

The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning knows these challenges first hand. Good work has been done during the past year. Our Berg River Improvement Plan project contributes directly to the Berg River estuary receiving Ramsar status this year as a wetland of international importance. Together with CapeNature, the Department has already cleared 55 300 hectares of alien vegetation. In 2021/2022, a total of 4 975 hectares of CapeNature's land was cleared of aliens. This is an important work as it will increase the future resilience for climate change.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape Biodiversity Act was signed into law earlier in November 2021 and will come into effect in a phased manner. Certain Sections of the Western Cape Biodiversity Act have come into effect on 15 November 2022. This is an important step towards having a modern environmental management framework that is in step with current realities in the Western Cape, South Africa and globally.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, in the context of the 16 Days of Activism against Gender-Based Violence, I want to congratulate the Waste Directorate for its Gift Dignity Project that is supporting female waste entrepreneurs with hygiene

products to recognise the important role they play in the waste economy. Our inclusionary Housing Policy Framework was published in November. This will greatly assist local governments and commercial developments in shaping our towns and cities for the future. We want to enable people to live closer to their places of work, education, and cultural activities.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Appropriation Bill for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, sees the original 2022 Budget of R568 586 000 being adjusted to R575 592 000. The adjustments reflect R2,7 million for salary increases, R2,312 million for rollover projects, R2,214 million for environmental retention projects or revenue retention projects, a saving of R220 000 due to the realignment of projects to the next financial year. Hon Temporary Chairperson, this adds up to adjustments of R7 006 000. This Adjustment Budget reflects a Department that is under severe financial pressure, but still manages to produce and to deliver on its mandate.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I want to remind this House of my opening statement: climate change is the number one global risk facing humanity. The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning is working at the coalface of this crisis. Let us support them with this important work. And I want to close by thanking the HOD, Gerhard Gerber and the whole team, for long hours and the commitment to this Province. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks. Thanks, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to decline support for this Budget Vote. Before we provide reasons for the rejection of this Budget Vote, we wish to commend the Department in the decrease in expenditure in Programme 1, especially in cutting foreign travel. We also note the increase in compensation of employment, though we will come to the concern of the slower than planned filling of posts in a moment.

The increase in Programme 3 which is compliance, enforcement and especially, litigation, must also be noted though the ANC believes that these funds of R3 million could have been used to establish the Office of the Environmental Commissioner. And it is on that basis, hon Temporary Chairperson, that the ANC cannot support this budget. We cannot support this budget of the Department that does not support the call to uphold, defend and respect the Provincial Constitution, which calls for the establishment of the Environmental Commissioner's Office.

The ANC has raised this serious concern before, but it would seem that the leadership of the Department of the Premier is not listening. Even the hon Van der Westhuizen pointed out that the filling of posts in the Department remains an issue on the agenda. Every year, the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning complains about the sluggish pace in which critical positions in the Department are filled because of understaffing and staff exits in the Department of the Premier.

Over R2 million will be shifted from funds initially budgeted for compensation of employees because according to the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, the Corporate Services Centre in the Department of the Premier is slow to appoint. As we have heard from the hon Dugmore earlier, there are certainly serious staffing issues in the Department of the Premier and we see this impacting on other departments in the Provincial Government. This Department being an example.

The ANC must also raise serious concerns about the decrease in Sustainable Water Programme projects because of nonresponsive and noncompliant bid processes. In Programme 6, there was also a comparative spending which was lower, due to less cost on the Water [Inaudible.] Project as a result of noncomplying bids received. The Sustainable Water Programme and the Waste Entrepreneur's Project, Harare, are important projects, but they seem to be challenged with either nonresponsive or noncompliant bids. Bidding processes are difficult processes for disadvantaged communities and no indication is given as to what the Department is doing to ensure that no one is left behind out of these bidding processes, especially given that both these programmes will be receiving increases in the Adjustment Budget.

The ANC must also raise its concern and objection to the decrease and shifting of funds from Climate Change Management. As we have heard from the hon MEC of Agriculture himself, climate change remains one of the generation's biggest challenges. Even now, when the hon MEC basically has to address us in terms of his budget, he also agrees that climate change is the number one global risk and yet, we have moved R301 000 meant for climate change to other programmes.

While we understand there is no climate change law, funds were budgeted for this sub-programme and should have been spent on this critical area. Again, the absence of a climate change law and the easy shifting of funds from Climate Change Management, lends to the ageless argument for a call to appoint an Environmental Commissioner. Adequate appropriation should have been made for the statutory obligations in the main Appropriation. It is devastating the Climate Change Management has to suffer now because of lack of adequate budgeting.

On this note of climate change which this Provincial Government seems to pay lip service to, because they literally do not put their money where their mouth is, I wish to quote President Cyril Ramaphosa at the recent COP 27 Health in Egypt when he said, and I quote:

"For the sake of our continent and the world, we need a dramatic increase in global mitigation ambition to keep the world on the 1.5-degree pathway. Like other vulnerable regions, Africa needs to build adaptive capacity, foster resilience and address loss and damage, as we all agreed at Paris COP 21. To achieve this, our continent will need a predictable, appropriate and at-scale funding stream and technological support."

Hon Temporary Chairperson, funding for Climate Change Management cannot be depended on, whether it is a statutory obligation or not. All of us must do our

bit to take climate change seriously and we will expect the Department constitutionally endowed within Environmental Affairs and Development Planning in the Province, to take the lead to taking it seriously. As President Ramaphosa pointed out, we need predictable, appropriate, and at-scale funding streams and technological support to achieve the 1.5-degree pathway.

Again, hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to decline support for this Budget Vote. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, a mere increase of just more than R7 million into this Department is not enough. This is the Department that should make sure that we have a sustainable resilient quality and inclusive living environment. Hon Temporary Chairperson, most people in townships experience sewerage spills almost on a daily basis because of poor infrastructure and are made to remain in such conditions for days, if not weeks. Most municipalities in the province are still battling with old infrastructure which is not helpful to the people of this province, especially in the townships and rural areas.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, collection of waste is still a problem in townships and remains a health hazard for people of this province. The DA-led Government does not take poor people of this province seriously. This situation is quite the opposite when it comes to the CBD and leafy suburbs as that is where one experiences good and sustainable infrastructure, and not the substandard infrastructure found in the townships. There reality, hon Temporary Chairperson, is that the bulk of the budget of this province is mostly spent in rich areas where white people reside. The issue of spatial planning and development is only documented in Government documents, and it is never implemented or even fulfilled. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Our country and more specifically, our province, our economy and growth potential is challenged due to climate change. Our environment is changing. Landscapes are changing and habitats are changing. All these changes will impact and influence how residents of this province engage with their surroundings, development, and growth.

With all this in mind, a conversation around climate change and our changing environment is not being had at an accelerated rate. Most communities do not understand this all-important topic as some of its words do not even exist in their mother tongue. This Department and the responsibility that they carry, are not doing enough to ensure that our province is prepared for the dangers that are ahead and how it will impact our daily lives. The adjusted resources and budgets of this Department should be devoted to accelerating our preparedness

to withstand the effects of climate change and invest heavily in environmental instruments to assist various communities with their changing environments. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise to address the House on the proposed adjustments in the Budget Vote 9, the budget for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. The Standing Committee studied the adjustments and by majority vote, decided to recommend to the House that the adjustments be supported.

I want to put on record, and I am glad to hear from the other parties as well, that we are unanimous in our verdict that this Department has been suffering from a lack of budget for a number of years now. What is more, this budget has not kept up with inflation, nor with the growth in our population and particularly, the growth in the recognition of the important role that the environment and the fast-growing pressures being put on the environment. Many of these are caused by our lifestyles: driving and flying with fossil fuel driven engines, heating and cooling of homes and offices, et cetera.

I am also glad to see that all hon members in this Parliament seem to agree that climate change is real. The causes and the effects have been studied, yet we should be paying even more attention to this challenge. The icecaps are melting, it is getting hotter and drier than ever before, and some studies indicate the tipping point beyond which the earth will continue to heat up regardless of what us humans do. This will be reached in a matter of years, not centuries, and attention is not all that climate change needs. It needs money to implement measures to address this threat, not only for our future, but more so, for the future of our children.

This Department has developed a strong climate change strategy through the Vision 2050 strategy that is supported by the more detail orientated implementation plan and the 2050 carbon emissions mitigation pathway, both in development during 2022/2023. This shows that climate change and the effects on this province are being taken seriously. As a Provincial Government, we can however, only do so much, particularly in the absence of a coordinated and committed effort from National Government.

I expected the ANC's whining regarding the Environmental Commissioner and as with any other ANC-run province or has any other ANC-run province appointed an Environmental Commissioner? [Interjections.] When will the ANC put action to words? When will the ANC start to live according to the principles that they are so quick to proclaim, but then clearly, principled ANC members are hard to find, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.] Their actions show that they are rotten from the top right down to local level.

I invite the hon Marran to exchange his continuous moaning for a constructive input. What exactly would the hon Marran like such a Commissioner to do? I invite him to start drafting a job description for an Environmental Commissioner

so that we can see whether the millions that an office for a Commissioner will cost, will bring a higher yield than the numerous positions of departmental officials that we will have to cut to provide for these millions.

I invite the hon Marran to indicate which departmental programmes should be cut. Must we scale down on our uphill battle against alien vegetation in our water catchment areas? Do we need to cut back on firefighting in our nature reserves? Must we cut back on the limited number of Law Enforcement officers and their desperate fight against poaching, in trying to protect our natural resources? Please, honourable, through you, hon Temporary Chairperson, honourable must step up and indicate from which programme the money for such a Commissioner must be found. [Interjections.] Unfortunately, probably from the bank in Phala Phala. Unfortunately ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...provinces are not receiving the share of national income that we deserve ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): It is highly frustrating to see the serious shortages and needs in the province ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you please sit down. Hon member Marran, you cannot talk directly. If it is a point of order, you have to rise on a point of order, but you cannot request that I respond when you did not put any point of order. [Interjections.] And hon Marran, like I said yesterday, still the same principle: you can heckle, but do not drown the speaker. Just keep it that way. Over to you, hon member.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson, and he must now stop moaning about being fried. [Interjections.]

Unfortunately, provinces are not receiving the share of national income that we deserve. It is highly frustrating to see the serious shortages and needs in this province and then also, to witness how monies from that same precious pool of taxes are being squandered at national level. The net effect of the adjustments is an increase of just over R7 million in the total budget, bringing that to R575 582 000. This represents a small increase of 1,23% on the Main Budget. The adjustments are therefore small and limited to only a few line items. R2,7 million of the increase is due to the 3% salary increases for public service staff as instructed by National Treasury, R2,3 million is for approved rollovers for multi-year programmes and the balance of R2,2 million is mostly for approved revenue retention.

We also see an increase in funding for compliance and enforcement which deals with monitoring licencing and complaints relating to environmental protection. This strengthens the capacity of the Department to hold transgressors to account and ensure that the environment is not an afterthought for business and developments. If we are to make any progress in protecting

the environment, it is of the utmost importance that every factory that leaks runoff into a river or releases harmful gases into the air or even sly contractors dumping their rubble in the veld, must be held to account.

The slight increase in allocation for Programme 2 also points to the prioritisation of spatial planning and a focus on integrated development planning between the different levels of Government. I am worried that more and more self-respecting companies are no longer willing to bid for the procurement needs of the public sector. This is due to the ANC's multiple agendas for a company public sector procurement. This Department has also suffered from non-responsive and non-compliant bid responses.

Salaries and subsidies increased with R357 000 as provision for unpaid leave credits for officials who left the employ of the Department. Other increases were caused by the higher-than-expected increases in fuel costs, which just shows why it is so important to bring an end to the war that Russia has launched against the people of the Ukraine, a war that the ANC implicitly supports through its cowardly inability to take a strong moral stance.

This Department, similarly to other departments, also experienced delays in the procurement of computer equipment, partly due to the nonavailability of certain parts caused by the COVID-19 pandemic. Money will also be directed to equipment related to water quality. Air quality and water quality are highly important issues when it comes to our health and wellbeing, and we need to genuinely protect these resources in the Western Cape. This Department is doing exceptional work with a limited budget. This is something that my colleagues across the aisle will find strange as national departments often seem to have too much money, money that just as often disappears into the pockets of criminals.

In light of all of the above, I call on hon members to support the Adjustment Budget for Vote 9 so the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning can continue to serve as an example to the rest of South Africa. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Ja! [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Minister Bredell [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, to the hon Marran through you, I am very glad that the ANC does not support this Adjustment Budget because if they will support it, I would have been very worried. So, ja, I have expected it.

On his comment on water. The threat to water is ANC Government. We are keeping the water sources running. Just the other day, the Department of Water and Sanitation put out a press release to tell the public that there are no

worries about the water, our dams are fine and sending out a very dangerous message. [Interjections.] So, you can expect that from an ANC government.

To the hon Makamba-Botya, infrastructure is a headache and therefore, the hon Premier has recognised that headache and therefore, started a department to focus on infrastructure. It has got nothing to do with race or colour or language or anything [Interjections.]. It has got very much to do with about 100 000-plus people running away from ANC governments in other provinces and coming to us and we welcome them. But obviously, that puts huge strain on our infrastructure [Interjections.], hon Temporary Chairperson, and therefore, we need to get our plans and our house in order. All our municipalities recognise this and put in a huge effort to try and get ahead of this curve.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, to the hon August. I thank you. Growth, all these challenges, we deal with it, and you are correct that in our communities to land the message, it is very difficult. As they say, hon August, there is a Chinese saying that:

† “In ryk areas, ryk mense het baie om oor bekommerd te wees. Arm mense is bekommerd oor hulle volgende maaltyd.”

[“In rich areas, rich people have a lot to worry about. Poor people worry about their next meal.”]

And it is difficult to sell to poor people the message of climate change because their worry is about getting food on the table for their children. So, it is a challenge, and we work with our communities.

To the hon Chair of the Committee, Andricus, thank you very much hon member for your leadership, for keeping us on our toes, for asking the hard and difficult questions and also for the leadership within the Committee. I want to thank you and with that, we can table the Adjustment Budget. Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That concludes – hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Thank you very much for your indulgence. Welcome back, hon Dugmore. Thank you for making the time to get back. Hon members, I would like to deal with the motion on hand that was submitted today, so I am going to repeat for the record.

I have received confirmation from the Secretary that the hon Leader of the Opposition has submitted a Notice of Motion in terms of Rule 151(1) of the Standing Rules at 11:35 this morning. In terms of the Rules, the Notice of Motion must be placed on the Order Paper for Monday, 5 December 2022. Hon Dugmore, are you going to rise on the point of 151? Not yet?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright. So, you have submitted your motion. Are you rising in terms today? Will you rise or do you want to first respond and then, I can proceed?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Apologies. I was timing to hear for the Local Government Vote ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...to fetch a vehicle in Athlone. But as I understand your ruling, you have then agreed that this motion will be placed on the Order Paper for Monday, but my understanding is that there is no reason that the House cannot deal with it now and ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Fair enough.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and that is what I want to ask. Because if there is unanimous support and I do believe that if the content of the motion was read out to the Legislature, there would be unanimous support because it is simply a constitutional matter and asking for the election of the Speaker to be convened by a designated Judge. So, I would like to ask why we cannot deal with that motion now, thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, I will. I will respond. Hon Baartman?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I rise on Rule 151(3). If the House was asked to deal with the motion, then the House can object or not object, but the House today does not ...[Audio distorted.] to do any Notices of Motions for today. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, just give me a second. So, hon Dugmore, there is a process involved here. You need to cite the Rule in terms of for that request. You may rise.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for that ruling and I believe that if the House does have the opportunity to debate the motion on Monday – it is Friday today. The main purpose behind this is to deal with a situation where the House does not have a Speaker. So, if we can deal with it on Monday then hopefully, all the parties would have the time to consider the matter and then hopefully resolve it. So, I accept your ruling. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can give me a second. Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. The matter has now been dispensed of and we move onto the rest of the Order of the Day. Thank you very much, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

[Ms L M Maseko takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon Deputy Whip of the Opposition. Hon member Mackenzie. Thank you very much ...[Interjections.] we are now on the – Okay. The Secretary will read the Sixth Order of the Day. Oh, the Fifth Order of the Day.

**5. Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, I recognise hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. To the hon Premier, hon members of the Executive, the hon members of the House, thank you for the opportunity. The Department of Local Government is one of the smallest departments in this Government but is making a huge impact in the quality of life of our citizens.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, this is not my opinion. This is according to the Auditor-General, the Department of Water and Sanitation Blue Drop Report, the Department of Water and Sanitation Green Drop Report, Stats South Africa General Household Survey Report. All these reports found that in 2022, local governments in the Western Cape stand head and shoulders above all the other provinces in South Africa. Allow me to thank the HOD, Graham Paulse and his officials for the hard work behind the scenes which played a big part in these successes.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, a lot of hard work has been done in 2022. We grapple with unsustainable and unstable coalitions that are distracting people from focusing on services to their communities. We have four municipalities with outstanding debt to Eskom. This is an embarrassment for me, and we will keep on working to find solutions ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Who are they?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Temporary Chairperson, the hon Marran does not want to ask that question. [Interjections.] I can promise you. So, hon Temporary Chairperson, there is no reason for a municipality to fall behind on Eskom payments. Loadshedding reached new heights in 2022. We saw that the long loadshedding above Stage 4 is crippling even the best run municipalities. Water, sewerage pumps simply cannot keep up and systems become unstable. I want to thank the Disaster Management Team for their excellent coordination work they have been doing this past year regarding loadshedding. Also, thank you to the technical support our engineers have been providing to our municipalities during this time.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I also want to give special recognition to our Disaster Management Staff who responded to the dire needs in KwaZulu-Natal after the devastating floods earlier this year. Your selfless and brave actions

are recognised by this Parliament and by the KZN Government. Hon Temporary Chairperson, one thing that became very clear during the KZN rescue mission was that successful disaster management requires well-trained and well-equipped staff. There is no sense in having a huge Disaster Fund if you do not have the capacity and skills to act during such events.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, during the Adjustment Estimate of 2022/2023 financial year, the original Budget of R309 301 000 decreased with R9 204 000 to R300 097 000. This was the result of, amongst others, the following: a saving of R8 440 000 due to the reduction in employee compensation. This is reallocated towards additional contract appointments during the 2023/2024 financial year. Due to the delays with the recruitment process to appoint capacity within the Department, earmarked funds are allocated to support the fire strategy of the Department and strengthen the capacity of Fire and Rescue Services. These funds are to be reallocated in the 2023/2024 financial year to fund the replacement of the Disaster Management Centre audio-visual infrastructure and the maintenance and support requirements relating to the audio-visual infrastructure. Savings under Goods and Services will see R5,4 million shifted to provide support to municipalities through the Joint District and Metro Approach (JDMA) and to fund water resilience projects.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the past year has seen the staff in the Department under severe pressure as challenges in our Local Government seem to grow daily. With finances being under pressure, it is now critical for us to allocate resources where we will see the strategic impact most desired. Again, I want to thank our HOD and the team for doing this important work under difficult circumstances. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister Bredell. I now recognise hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, we want to put it on record that we reject this Budget Vote today. As my colleagues and I go through this Adjustment Budget and in fact, the others as we have done in previous years, but particularly in this Department we are noticing a trend, a trend in the very serious failure of the Department of the Premier to fill and in particular, this Department of Local Government, to fill certain posts.

Now for me, it is not exactly surprising, hon Temporary Chairperson, because hon MEC Bredell has not only been found guilty once, but actually twice by the Public Protector and what has he been found guilty of, hon members? He has been found guilty of attempting to implement cadre deployment within the municipalities. So, now what is happening here, they do headhunting, they do this, but they find that there are no DA-cadres good enough to appoint. So then, they do not fill those posts. This is we have a hon MEC who is the mastermind behind DA cadre deployment. So, it is not surprising that this Department every year says ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you take your seat? There is a point of order.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise in terms of Rule 59 regarding

“No member may –  
(a) impute improper motives on;  
(b) reflect on the integrity or dignity of; or  
(c) verbally abuse, another member.”

Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, the Deputy of the [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): hon Temporary Chairperson, with respect, I think this is frivolous. The hon Baartman should know better because when she imputed, when she did a similar thing with the matter that was not really in the public domain ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and was not even a fact about the hon Bakubaku-Vos ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member! ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...when it was SOPA ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...it was dismissed. This is a political matter, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is a political matter; it is a frivolous point of order ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The hon member is not imputing anything.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member! You rise on a point of order. You do not make a speech. [Interjections.] So, if you raise a point of order you have to say on which Rule. [Interjections.] You do not do this speech so that we can continue with the Business of the Day.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Responding to that particular point of order.

An HON MEMBER: Eish, ja!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We are not going to have the

conversation, hon member, and you are sitting down, hon member Marran. You are not going to address me. We are going to continue with the Order of the Day.

An HON MEMBER: Malema's point of order speech.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip, I will come back to you. We can continue. Hon member, continue. You are disturbing your own hon member from the Opposition ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a matter of ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Let him finish with the ...[Interjection.] Let him finish with his debate.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. So, it is clear to me from your ruling that you have actually regarded the Acting Chief Whip's comments as frivolous because you have not ruled, you have not upheld her ruling. So, I can repeat what I said.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I said, hon member, I will come back with the ruling. That means I said something. So, continue with your debate. You do not have to say something after I have ruled. Continue with your debate, hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I thank you very much because when we look at this carefully, we find that it is astonishing that millions, in fact R122 million were surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund over this period due to unspent compensation of employees. No, let us check back over the last couple of years. That is the amount of money that has been surrendered and our argument is that so, we all know that this Department is understaffed. This Adjustment and the Annual Report process shows that, but the continued failure to appoint people to this Department makes it clear that because they cannot find DA-cadres competent enough or loyal enough to them, they then say they cannot fill these posts and give the money back. That is a trend that we have picked up very clearly and it is a huge concern that we need to look at.

Earlier, we heard from the hon Marran that the bottleneck in appointing staff to critical posts in Environmental Affairs and Development Planning lies with the Department of the Premier. So, is it now all the fault of the mastermind of cadre deployment in the DA, hon MEC Bredell, or is it the fault of the mastermind's boss, i.e., the hon Premier? But clearly, there is a process here to make sure that only DA loyalists are appointed to particular positions. I do not even want to go into family members because we all know the story about family members in your Department through the ... but we can get to that.

In this Adjustment Budget, more than R8 million was again shifted because of critical posts in the Local Government Department not being filled. So, the R122 million is a broad figure; the R8 million specifically in this adjustment is the Local Government figures. So, where is actually the problem we ask, hon

Temporary Chairperson? According to the figures of the Local Government, they say it lies with the Department of the Premier. Where does it actually lie?

We know that Local Government is a critical sphere, and it lacks capacity, was the continuous refrain that we heard from the officials themselves. And we all know that after having emerged from the most disastrous drought our province has faced in generations and knowing the potential that the agricultural sector has in our provincial economy, as well as the lack of access to water that our people suffer from, it is inexplicable how there have been delays with the filling of the drought capacity support in the Department to the tune of R3 million. When you do not have capacity, that also means that commercial and small black farmers do not get the drought support that they should.

This must really come to an end, and I appeal to the hon MEC just to be honest with us in the House today about this. We can send you qualified people who are actually able to do this. I take the point around the engineering services where no one is denying it. That is a difficult issue. Often, they get paid more in Local Government, but there are possibilities of contracts, of negotiating with people and getting them on board.

So, it is very clear that the Budget does not provide hardly any support for training capacity at Local Government, which is one of the core functions. Once again, R1,1 million has been surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund initially earmarked for Fire Services capacity for the same reason: delays in the recruitment process. Again, more than half a million rand was surrendered to the PRF due to delays with the recruitment process relating to the appointment of capacity to be utilised for research policy and legislation.

I do not even want to get to the fact that not a cent has been spent on the process towards setting up the House of Traditional Leaders. Not one cent! And that begs the question how important is that House of Traditional Leaders to this Government and this Department in particular because we know during Helen Zille's reign of terror in this Legislature, she made absolutely no effort to get a House of Traditional Leaders. Now that provinces are forced to do it, we still have no political will and I think the Khoi and the San communities of the Western Cape must take notice. Not only did the DA vote against this Bill in the National Assembly, but now in the Province when they actually are required to implement it, they are not spending a cent. In total, nearly R3,5 million was surrendered back to the PRF due to these delays.

And what we also see is that R1 million was taken from Awareness related projects, and machinery and equipment for Community Development Workers to fund IT equipment in Programme 1, which is administration and that for comms and social media campaigns. It is just totally unacceptable, hon Temporary Chairperson. CDWs are critical and the machinery and equipment they employ are indispensable, yet this Department takes funds initially identified for all this machinery of CDWs and equipment for them, and then funds IT in a non-core programme of its administration.

We also note hon Temporary Chairperson, that funds for further awareness raising were shifted to Programme 1 and there should be little doubt that the

hon MEC wanted this under his sight so that this communication and social media can be used for party political purposes because you must remember, his poor Department have to communicate unacceptable and biased decisions that he makes on an almost weekly basis. He is going to defend that Councillor; he is not going to defend that Councillor, or he will defend, for party political reasons. So now, his poor Department must communicate that.

Then, †vir die arme MEC wat nou die waarnemende leier van die DA is, mnr Simmers, wat vir die MEC nou wil opdrag gee om vir Keith Jordaan aan te stel. [for the poor MEC who is now the acting leader of the DA, Mr Simmers, who now wants to instruct the MEC to appoint Keith Jordaan.] And I am sure the hon MEC told him straight: you cannot expect me to do that. And now, he because he has got some – hon MEC Simmers – because he has got some debt to pay to Keith Jordaan, he is now telling this hon MEC to allow the appointment of Keith Jordaan. And that is why we have taken that hon MEC to the Public Protector †en hy gaan huil. Hy gaan huil wanneer die uitkoms want die feite daar is. [and he is going to cry. He's going to cry when the outcome of the facts are there.] Voice recordings, WhatsApp recordings are there ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you sit down? Hon member, can you sit down? Hon member Bosman?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I do not want to take Vinnige Fanie's job, but the hon member is speaking past you. He is speaking through other hon members, and he is pointing fingers, hon Temporary Chairperson. It is quite disturbing. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member and I know hon member Sayed does not like that behaviour. So, hon member, if you can address the hon member through the Chair, we will appreciate that. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, but hon Temporary Chairperson, only you would know how good the eye contact between the two of us is. It has been very solid. I do sometimes look this way, but you and I have maintained very good eye contact and we will continue to do so. [Interjections.]

There is a total lack of detail when it comes to municipal infrastructure. For example, we see a decrease of R894 000 in the Goods and Services budget of Municipal Infrastructure, but we are not told what these funds were initially identified for in the Main Appropriation. It is therefore difficult, hon Temporary Chairperson, for us to understand what or which Municipal Infrastructure projects or support will not happen.

Now, I want to ask is that because the hon Acting Leader of the DA ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you will have to conclude now.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...is giving instructions to this hon MEC about what to do with Infrastructure and I am particularly concerned. I want to warn the hon MEC for Local Government, not to be influenced by his hon Acting Leader because he is going to get him into trouble, big, big trouble. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.] I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya of EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): It is very concerning and worrying that the Budget of the Department of Local Government is reduced by more than R9 million. This is the Department with a mandate to monitor and support municipalities in order to be able to fulfil their own mandate. Hon Temporary Chairperson, municipalities are a first point of call for residents when it comes to service delivery issues. The majority of municipalities in the province do not have provisions for emergency housing. So, instead of reducing the budget of the Department, why are these funds not transferred to these municipalities which struggle to carry out this mandate of providing for emergency housing for residents?

Hon Temporary Chairperson, municipalities such as Drakenstein have been taken to court in the recent past for this very same issue of not making provision for emergency housing. It is also shocking that most of these municipalities point to a lack of resources, but at the same time, spend millions of rands in litigation defending why they are not executing their mandate.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, beyond the issue of emergency housing, smaller municipalities in the province do not have a budget to provide residents with houses. Lack of services in delivery by municipalities in townships, is a major issue. People from informal settlements still need to relieve themselves in bushes as they are not provided with temporary toilets, at the very least. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the poor people of this province are not taken seriously by this DA-led Government.

On that note, hon Temporary Chairperson, the EFF will not support this Vote. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Actually, before I start, and I do not know. I am the Chairperson of the Standing Committee and hon Dugmore and hon Makamba-Botya are all members of the Committee. I do not know whether we are in the same Committee because the figures mentioned by hon Dugmore are not those figures that are contained in the Adjustment Budget. But more of that, perhaps the hon Minister will respond to that.

But let me continue, hon Temporary Chairperson. Last week, the Provincial Minister of Finance, hon Minister Wenger, tabled the results contained in the 2020 Municipal Economic Review Outlook, commonly referred to as the MERO.

This Outlook proved beyond any doubt that the Western Cape is fast becoming the preferred destination for manufacturing, financial and agricultural businesses across South Africa. The 2020 MERO shows that the Western Cape has expanded its Gross Domestic Product or GDP, one of the only three provinces in the country to do so. This growth has been driven by all our municipalities, including the City of Cape Town, which have experienced a year of strong and consistent growth post the devastating years of COVID-19.

Additionally, the recently released unemployment statistics of Stats South Africa, the Western Cape boasts with the lowest unemployment figures in the country. And I would like to remind our matriculants in the gallery that you are more likely to find a job in the Western Cape than in any other province in the country. This is incredibly good news, given that jobs remain at the top of the agenda of the DA. In the words of hon Minister Wenger, I quote:

“A job provides dignity and self-agency, breaking the cycle of poverty. Employment creates opportunity (hon Nkondlo) and hope for many families across the province.”

These results are not abstract figures which will delight some economist sitting in an airconditioned office somewhere. They represent real, meaningful change in the lives of our citizens. The results include GDP expansion of 6,2% in the West Coast District Municipality, 5,3% in the Cape Winelands Municipality and consistent growth across our province. Judging objectively from all indices, our growth has outstripped the rest of the country, providing for the umpteenth time something which we all already know, that the DA gets things done.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, it is no secret that our municipalities have put the Western Cape municipalities so far ahead from the rest of the country. The Western Cape Government has consistently maintained an unwavering focus on clean and responsible municipal and provincial governance. Over the last year, the DA-run Western Cape achieved great success in the fields of municipal audits, poverty reduction, unemployment, clean and corruption-free governance. By ensuring service delivery and financial health in the province's municipalities, the Department of Local Government has in turn ensured the necessary conditions for growth in the Western Cape.

The Western Cape Government has also doubled down on infrastructure necessary for growth, with significant investments made into ensuring the security of our municipal water supplies. We know that water is a scarce resource in our province and one which is becoming ever scarcer as the result of climate change. Even now, our dam levels are at their lowest in three years and the lowest since the end of the drought in 2018.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, this is something which keeps me awake at night as it should every citizen of the Western Cape, but I am comforted by the fact that this Government is doing what it does best and taking steps to fix the problem. Since 2018, R67 million has been spent to ensure the future of the Western Cape's water supply and to prevent any crisis in the future. In this Adjustment Budget, the Western Cape Government continues this trend by making an additional R3 million directly available to municipalities and a further

R5,4 million transfer through the Joint District and Metro Approach (JDMA) for water resilience projects in the various districts.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, through innovative techniques and intelligent investments, the City of Cape Town is also able to offer businesses a vastly higher degree of energy security than the rest of the country. It is therefore absolutely no surprise that both businesses and ordinary citizens are fleeing the collapsing ANC Government's disastrous administration, to move and come and live in the province, which has the Government it needs to grow, prosper and move forward. In fact, I believe that it will not be long before the economic centre of the country moves from Gauteng to the Western Cape. After all, hon Temporary Chairperson, how can you manufacture without electricity? How can you start a business under a government which only knows bribery and corruption? How can you live without water?

As the Western Cape's governing party, our Opposition often criticises us for drawing too much attention to economic indicators, rather than people. We are told that it is commendable that we have received clean audit outcomes and high GDP growth. We are also told that we failed to clarify the impact these have on the lives of the people whom we represent. So, let me be clear. Good governance results in economic growth, which in turn results in more jobs; enhances safety and a higher standard of wellbeing for the people of the Western Cape. Continuous and sustained economic growth in the Western Cape brings with it jobs, prosperity and wellbeing for the citizens and ensures that the Western Cape remains on a positive trajectory towards a better future and provides yet another example of the DA's proven ability to guarantee growth where it governs.

Above all else, the Western Cape Government does the one thing which seemingly no other government in this country can do. It gives people hope. It gives our citizens, the people of this province that put us in this House, the confidence that we as representatives care for them and that this Government is planning for the future. And this is not even accounting for the work that our Government does on the ground.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, it gives me great pride to state that during our oversight visit in the Overberg region, the Department of Local Government initiated a catalytic project through the JDMA by establishing a network of safe houses for women and children suffering from social ills, including Gender-Based Violence and femicide and poverty across the district.

So, after moving to Bredasdorp in 2012, community worker Ms Lana O'Neill immediately realised the lack of a safe shelter for abused women in the area. Through her non-profit organisation, HeavenlyPromise48, and supported by the Cape Agulhas Municipality, she offered preventative programmes, crisis intervention and shelter to abused women. With the help of the Department of Local Government, a network of these NGO-driven safehouses will be established across our province with strong support from the respective municipalities, private sector, and departments from various spheres of government, to ensure that the safety net where women and children can be moved to according to their needs.

Once again, this Western Cape Government is taking policy that works and rolling it out as quickly as possible. Once again, the Western Cape Government is creating meaningful change in people's lives. Therefore, I would like to express my heartfelt gratitude and appreciation to Ms Lana O'Neill for the selfless work she does with abused women and vulnerable women in Bredasdorp.

So, hon Temporary Chairperson, as we know our country is in a time of political uncertainty, turmoil, and change. I know that hon members opposite, may have a new party leader in the few hours' time. [Interjections.] But what is more important is that South African citizens, the people who still do have the ultimate authority over this country, will soon head to the polls and when they do, I believe they will look to this province, to our municipalities and to this Government and they will see that there is only once choice to be made at the ballot box: forwards or backwards; DA or ANC.

So, hon Temporary Chairperson, I congratulate the Department, hon Minister Bredell on their work over the last year. I support this Adjustment Budget and I look forward to seeing the success of this province replicated on a national scale following our next election: forwards or backwards; DA or ANC. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is this going forward or what? Who would be a part of ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.] Hon member, I now recognise hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, ja, I feel very sorry for my colleagues on the other side, for the ANC. They are in turmoil. They have got a very difficult situation to deal with, so I understand their tension. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I want to say through to the hon Dugmore: at least I have got a leader, an elected leader. The ANC, hon Temporary Chairperson, in this province must be so ashamed. They cannot even hold a congress. I have got more branches in my constituency than they have got in this province. [Interjections.]

Hon Temporary Chairperson, so ja, [Interjections.] to stand up and talk today about [Interjections.] this Vote, it must be very difficult for the ANC. Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjections.], hon Temporary Chairperson, I want to say to the hon Dugmore through you that ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...at least, if you look at where they currently stand with the situation with the President, if you look back on the Zondo Commission [Interjections.] where we spent more than R1 billion of this taxpayer's money for the ANC to determine which cadres stole more than the

other one because nobody has ended up in jail currently [Interjections.] more than a billion rand, more than a billion rand.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, they have asked about the four municipalities who do not pay Eskom. Well, surprise, surprise, all four are ANC. [Interjections.] All four are ANC problems. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, Matzikama. We took over Matzikama, but it is an ANC governed municipality which ends up in that. We took it over from the ANC. [Interjections.] That is why the voters threw the ANC under the bus there because they cannot even pay Eskom. Matzikama, Cederberg, Kannaland, Beaufort West: there, you have got it, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.] But hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...if you cannot put your party together and have a congress, it is no wonder the country is where it is.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, can you sit down for a second? Hon member, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: No, I needed to calm him down. I saw that ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, sit down ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I am very calm.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: It is not a point of order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I am calm, hon Temporary Chairperson, I am just so ashamed for the ANC. This mighty organisation who drops to nothing, where we should, in this House, talk about the future of the young people in the audience, we sit here today and do not know if we are going to have a President tonight. [Interjections.]

Hon Temporary Chairperson, they have managed, the ANC has managed to bankrupt Eskom. They have managed to bankrupt our rail system. They have managed to bankrupt our water system. They have managed to bankrupt Telkom. But do you know what is very worrying, hon Temporary Chairperson, poor people, when they need to go and stand in a queue for UIF, they cannot get their money because the ANC do not have the system to pay them.

†Die WAARNEMENDE HOOFSWEEP (DA): Daar is nie geld nie.  
[The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): There is no money.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And they dare to stand up in this House and try to grandstand. What a shame! What a shame!

Hon Temporary Chairperson, to the hon Standing Committee, I want to thank the hon Chairperson, to the hon members for the hard work, for asking the difficult questions, for keeping us sharp, keeping us on our toes. I want to end off, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Through you to the hon Dugmore: you must never misuse freedom of speech. I think it is a disgrace when we start to call people by their name who cannot defend themselves and he must explain how one hon member, because the DA has got one hon member in Kannaland, how does one member employ a person? [Interjections.] You cannot. You cannot. There can be 100 voice clips. That is illegal in any case, but they do not have any regard for the law because according to the law, you are not allowed to tape anybody. Do you know that honourable? But they do not care. [Interjections.] They do not have any regard for the law. That is why the ANC will be voted out in 2024, but now in 2023 because we need an urgent election [Interjections.] because of the failures of the ANC, hon Temporary Chairperson. So, hon Temporary Chairperson, I am looking forward to the next election. So, thank you very much and thank you to the Standing Committee. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. [Interjections.] Hon member? Is there a point of order?

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I am sadly – I was rising on a point of order, but I was ignored. The hon MEC was allowed to say what he wanted to say, many things around casting aspersions, but it is fine. I did not have an opportunity because you chose to ignore me. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Sayed, that is really not honest of what you are saying, and you know it. [Interjections.] But anyway, we are going to continue with the Order of the Day ...[Interjections.] Hon member Marran! Hon Leader of the Opposition who really has to lead, that ...[Interjections.] The Secretary will read the Sixth Order of the Day. Hon members, we do have guests in the House. [Interjections.] Hon member. [Interjections.] Hon Leader of the Opposition, may I address you? [Interjections.]

Hon member Nkondlo, hon member Sayed, hon member Marran and then all the hon members on my right. We do have guests here that really are looking forward to listening to your debates, not your heckling. I am definitely sure when I interacted with them, they said they are looking forward to listening to your debates. They ...[Interjections.] Let us give them a chance of listening to those debates. [Interjections.] I do thank you for your cooperation. [Interjections.] The Secretary will read the Sixth Order of the Day.

**6. Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise hon Simmers.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Temporary Chairperson, hon Premier, hon colleagues in the Cabinet physically present and logged in virtually, hon members of the House present, but also logged in virtually, our learners in the gallery and also, our guests logged in via the virtual medium. I was really humbled and honoured when the hon Premier appointed me as the Executive Authority of the new Infrastructure Portfolio, comprising of elements from the Department of Transport and Public Works, which is the Vote I am speaking on now, and the Department of Human Settlements, which I spoke on earlier.

I stand here today to report on the Department of Transport and Public Works' Adjustment Budget which with its budget allocation for the 2023/2024 financial year, will form part of the new Department of Infrastructure on 1 April 2023. But this is a budget that goes beyond excellence and why do I say a budget beyond excellence, hon Temporary Chairperson? ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, can you take your seat. Hon member?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, ja, I mean really. These smart Alec remarks when we want to rise on issues of clarity is really not assisting. I hope the guests in the gallery can see.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, just say your ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Ja, no, no.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Allow us to also pre-empt. Just a matter of clarity. We are busy with Transport and Public Works. I see hon member Simmers speaking. I do not see hon member Mitchell yet. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip, I recognise you.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. As the hon Minister actually indicated in the beginning of his speech, he is the Executive Authority with the respective assigned powers by the hon Premier and therefore, he is part of this debate because of his Executive powers ...[Interjections.] as previously tabled in this House. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I think that is the clarity to you, hon Deputy. I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, you see, this shows how the hon Premier has plunged Provincial Government ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...into a state of confusion and disarray.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is just some idea they thought of: Infrastructure. Now, hon Mitchell ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...does not even have any Executive ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...Authority.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They have an MEC with no Executive Authority, but I will sit.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, you are not going to raise frivolous points of order [Interjections.] so we are going to continue with the Business of the Day. Continue, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: As I was saying, hon Temporary Chairperson, the Department of Transport and Public Works received a clean audit from the A-G not for the first, nor for the second, nor for the third year, but for the tenth consecutive year in a row. [Interjections.] This, indeed, is an achievement beyond the most ambitious of dreams for our counterparts with memberships from Luthuli House who are oddly making a noise. †Maar leë blikke maak die meeste geraas, in elk geval, waarnemende Voorsitter, sê die gesegde. [Tussenwerpsels.] [But empty vessels make the most noise, in any case, Madam Chair, the saying goes. [Interjections.]

Hon Temporary Chairperson, if it were any other government ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, may you sit down, please? [Interjections.] Chief Whip of the Opposition. [Interjections.] Chief Whip of the Opposition, please try to get your house in order also, on this side. On the Opposition side. [Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo! Hon member Simmers, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Okay. Thank you, hon Temporary

Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, as I was saying if this were any other government like the other provinces where the Opposition never governed, I am sure we would have seen an R18 million flag that glows in the dark and that would have been erected at 9 Dorp Street. [Interjections.] But this is the Western Cape. †Ons is nie 'n sirkus nie, ons is 'n regering. [We are not a circus; we are a government.] However, because excellence is what we and the public have come to expect from the Western Cape Government, this is just another tick in the box of excellent service delivery. For us, it is not about doing things right at the tenth attempt, but others doing the right thing for the first time. Here is a good example why I say that, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Earlier in the year, the National Minister of Transport decided to launch what he called the Vala Zonke Project or 'Close Them All' campaign, to fix potholes on South Africa's roads. Now, we had to remind the hon National Minister and I actually had to call him to explain to him that in the Western Cape we do not wait for the month of September to repair potholes and reseal potholes or even, maintain our roads in the Western Cape [Interjections.] because we have a scheduled maintenance plan throughout the year that does this. We do not do one-hit wonders, like the hon Minister attempted to do.

One of the projects I can use to substantiate this, which we also showcased to the hon Minister, was a road that is called the Old Fort Road or the DR101 in the City of Cape Town, where we showcased that not only could we create 317 job opportunities as part of our maintenance routine, but that 176 of those job opportunities were for youth and 87 were for women, hon Temporary Chairperson. But we went beyond that because we could also prove to the hon Minister that we do not have one-hit wonder projects, this is a good example also where 12 of the subcontractors appointed by the Department were 100% women-owned enterprises doing our job for us. So, this project indeed, is aligned to the Growth for Jobs strategy of which this DA-led Government of the Western Cape is the initiator.

However, hon Temporary Chairperson, let me get to the Business of the Day to end the confusion of our hon members on the other side of the aisle. The Main Appropriation of Vote 10 increases by R324,56 million or 3,56% from R9,106 billion to R9 430 958 000. The biggest gain of this upward adjustment is on Programme 4, which is in terms of Transport Operations which from 1 April will be called Mobility, for those of you that have not been following what is happening this year. Which will once again see the promotion of strategic collaborations between the two spheres of government, while empowering the local municipality.

This time, it is to ensure that successful implementation of the George Integrated Public Transport Network (GIPTN) Project in the George Municipality can occur because they are the joint contracting authority. The rollout of GIPTN to Thembalethu commenced in November 2022 and this will see an increase in the service to double the current reach of the system since its initial launch in December 2014 in George.

Additional funding of R25,553 million was allocated to Public Works Infrastructure for the acquisition or properties for Health and Educational

purposes. In recent months, we have seen the successful delivery of these educational and health facilities under what we call, the Social Infrastructure Pillar. The completion, among others, of the R17,1 million project at Bothasig High School supplied and installed no less than six mobile classrooms, two general science labs, one double classroom, three administration facilities, two ablutions facilities of 9 square metres each, one feeding kitchen, three storage containers, paved walkways, a parking area, a play area, fencing, benches, and water fountains. Well worth the R17,1 million.

But similarly, we have seen the completion of the construction of the Moorreesburg High School in Swartland in August 2022 this year, for an amount of R65,7 million. This will provide a much-needed educational facility for this part of the West Coast area. The building of this school commenced on 8 January 2021, hon members and it is completed, but during the process we managed to create 211 job opportunities. The Department also completed a R34 million project to build the new Klapmuts Primary School and then, the Klapmuts High School on one erf by using mobile classrooms. Construction of this project began on 3 May 2022 and was completed ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...on 8 August 2022.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: May you please take your seat?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I would like to ask whether the hon MEC for Human Settlements is prepared to answer a question. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is the hon MEC [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Well, the hon MEC is talking now.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, will you take the ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Because the hon Premier [Interjections.] the hon Premier answers questions.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member. Hon member!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So, if he wants to be the Premier, he must get used to it.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you may sit down. I heard you. [Interjections.] We have the hon Minister. I think we do know there is a Minister of Infrastructure. Are you talking about the same hon Minister, the hon Minister of Infrastructure? You talk to me and now, you are ignoring me.

[Interjections.] Hon member Sayed, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, is the hon Minister willing to tell us whether this means now that hon MEC Mitchell [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Does hon MEC Mitchell hold the budget

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Does hon MEC Mitchell have a department?

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Because this is serious. You have a ceremonial MEC ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member! Hon member!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...MEC Mitchell.

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no! That is not how you ask the [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is an insult to the people of the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They are paying through the Office of the hon Premier ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...for the ceremonial MEC. This is an insult to hon MEC Mitchell.

An HON MEMBER: That is not how you ask the question, no.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is an insult to the people of the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They are paying through the Office of the Premier ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...for a ceremonial MEC.

An HON MEMBER: Hon Temporary Chairperson, it was the method how you asked the question.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, I think we know the Rule 66. Hon members, I recognised hon Dugmore and hon Dugmore asked the question. So, I have to respond to that. So, I am seeing the Opposition, you are raising a hand. Is there any other point of order on this point of order or why are you raising your hand or is it a question that I am not going to allow you to ask? I am going to ask the Minister if you [Interjections.] as you are the one on the podium, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Temporary Chairperson, no because [Interjections.] this is another Vote. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Are you the next Minister, the next?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise you, you can continue, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, you may take your seat. Hon member Nkondlo, I recognise you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Temporary Chairperson, we are debating here and that is what the Secretary read. Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works. The last time our hon MEC for Transport and Public Works is a Mr Mitchell. Where is he? [Interjections.] Hey, no guys, man. [Interjections.] No, guys. [Interjections.] He is not here, here!

An HON MEMBER: But there is no ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Here!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

Ms N D NKONDLO: You are not the hon Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Why do you like to extend? Hon Premier! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier! [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Just ...[Interjections.] Just ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Because he [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier!

Ms N D NKONDLO: Do you have a hand? ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo addressed me. [Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo addressed me, and I am going to ask the Acting Chief Whip. I recognise you.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, unlike the ANC, the DA actually reads the Provincial Gazette and ...[intervenes]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your ...[Interjection.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...and tablings.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...point of order, hon Acting Chief Whip? [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): He is a Minister. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): I rise in terms of the Rules of ATC and Provincial Gazettes. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, I will in the meantime ...[Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo, hon member Nkondlo! I recognise you, hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much ...[Interjections.] Thank you very much [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members! Order, hon Premier! Order, hon member Nkondlo.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. I think, hon Temporary Chairperson, this is, this is, this is very ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Why are you not patient? [Interjections.] You did not do that to [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order? I want to find out. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: But why am I abused?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You have to rise on a point of order.

Mr M KAMA: Yes, yes!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: So, we do have Rule 66. Look at it, tell me what is your point of order.

Mr M KAMA: Hon Temporary Chairperson, can you be patient? You are going to get an opportunity to rule whether it is a point of order or not.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Which Rule are you rising on ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: I will tell you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...so that I can look at it.

Mr M KAMA: I will tell you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Continue.

Mr M KAMA: Can I make the point? The issue, hon Temporary Chairperson, is that we hear that there is – and this is important for this House, this is very important for this House – we hear that hon Minister Simmers is an Executive Authority on Transport and Public Works. But in the public, like the B97 Route ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you know that ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: ...Executive Authority is hon Mitchell.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is not a point of order.

Mr M KAMA: And here, we are here to approve a budget. It is not important this process that we are dealing with. We are not just raising it for fun. We are approving a budget here and we are told here is an Executive Authority. But in the public in terms of the work that is going to be done with this budget, it is going to be done and hon Minister Daylin ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Kama!

Mr M KAMA: ...is the one who is going to be an Executive Authority. Hon Temporary Chairperson, we must not accept to be confused by these pronouncements of the hon Premier. You know, what ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Kama!

Mr M KAMA: Let us not allow this confusion to come to the House and stick to what we know here in the House, and the wishful thinking up until the hon President is informed, I think we must wait for that particular point, you know.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: ...and have someone. Because now it means the House must be concerned that we have ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, sit down.

Mr M KAMA: ...a Minister of Mobility that does not have a budget ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

Mr M KAMA: ...and no engagement with us.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sit down!

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sit down, hon member! Hon members, I am happy that hon member Kama is refusing to be confused ...[Interjections.] and I am going to really plead with you. We already did the Budgets. We are debating the Budgets. You never questioned in your respective Standing Committees. So, like I said we do have guests and I understand, today is the debating day, we are debating, but if you are going to do frivolous points of orders, you distract the floor of the debate. So, I request this: we have got the clarity from the Acting Chief Whip ...[Interjections.] about the [Interjections.]. It was ATC. [Interjections.] I am going to ask that we continue with the debate. [Interjections.] Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Now, moving beyond excellence. In line with the growth for the job strategy, the Department created 8 677 Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) work opportunities. We completed 85 roads and public works construction projects ...[Interjections.] and we maintained 337 road maintenance projects. So, hon Temporary Chairperson, I think the House would agree with me, how can this not be a budget beyond excellence. When the Department received accolade showcasing its innovation and solutions-driven ...[Audio distorted.] efforts.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I would like to close with the following and this is a quote from Michael Jordan. Really, I think the confusion on that side will be clarified with this ...[Interjections.] and he said:

“Obstacles do not have to stop you. If you run into a wall [which clearly, the Opposition are], do not turn around and give up [which they have]. Figure out

how to climb it, go through it and work around it.”

And that is what drives this Department and the Western Cape DA-led Government. Our drive is to find solutions to ensure work opportunities, safety and the wellbeing of our citizens. Thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.] I now recognise the ANC. Hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Can you hear me, hon Temporary Chairperson? Hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Can you hear me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, hon member, you are audible.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC does not support this Budget Vote. Below, I will be expanding on the reason given in the Committee for our reason to reject this Budget. From the onset, I must state categorically that we can feel the impact of the juniorisation of this Department by the hon Premier. This is not intended at casting aspersions or disrespect towards the hon MEC.

One example is the fact that former hon MEC Madikizela with his experience and seniority in the DA found it easy to approach the hon Premier and Finance MEC to provide funding for the Blue Dot and ...[Audio distorted.]. A decision by this hon MEC and Provincial Government to terminate the Blue Dot initiative is a clear indication that this Department does not take the taxi industry seriously and that it has owned the Blue Dot initiative as Madikizela's own project.

The juniorisation of the Department is also showing itself in the failure of the hon MEC to deal with the allegations of a serious nature against Mr Farrel Payne, a senior official in the Department. Perhaps the hon Premier has finalised his mistake which resulted in him reducing the mandate of his Department to only focus on mobility. On behalf of the ANC, I want to advise the hon Premier to consider placing this function of Mobility under the Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety and use the saving to fund other government priorities.

Today, my colleagues who preceded me, raised the issue of compensation of employees. This cannot be a lament of every department because just about every department is raising this issue. The Department has cut R70,585 million that was allocated for this specific programme due to slower unexpected filling of vacancies and staff [Inaudible.]

In the 2021 Annual Report, reference is made of the Vision Inspired Priorities, in other words the VIP 4, which is Mobility and Spatial Transformation. I hope this is not going to be just a theoretical policy framework cliché, there must be a practical realisation of this notion through the subsidisation of the mini-bus taxi

industry and the identification of suitable land in and around the CBD. This must be done throughout the province district areas, as well as local municipalities in the notion of cooperative government. The Department should not look for land that is in isolation and that is far removed from the Central Business District. The residential areas of non-white people are strategically placed far from the centre of the CBD, and I think that is actually indicative of the apartheid spatial geography.

Spatial transformation can be pursued through the identification of land and buildings of the Provincial Government throughout the province in district municipalities, as well as in local municipalities for purposes of socioeconomic development and transformation. When we had our Adjustment Budget at the Committee on Monday, the HOD did mention that there is money for spatial transformation, but unfortunately, there seemed to be no adjustment for this programme. If there are funds available, we then need to see a result of economic transformation and integration throughout the programme.

On the Mobility side of the vision-inspired priorities, the subsidisation of the mini-bus taxi industry can be pursued through the continuation of the Blue Dot taxi service. We recently saw how the industry was impacted upon by the discontinuation of this project. To show their frustration, the taxi industry had called for a two-day shutdown that resulted in more damage than good. The Government portrays this industry, especially the Provincial Government, as a violent, barbaric industry, but the main cause of the violence and barbaric behaviour is the action of the Provincial Government that is led by the Democratic Alliance.

The issue of operating licences not being issued in time is the main reason for the fights between these associations. The Government can expedite permits and issue temporary operating licences to the Golden Arrow Bus Services within a day, but it failed to do so for the mini-bus taxi industry. We saw this with the B97 Route. These taxis are being impounded day in, day out, because the Provincial Government knows that they do not possess operating licences.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, maybe this is a strategy of the Provincial Government to not issue these licences and rather make money through the tickets of these confiscations. Every other day, there are roadblocks targeting taxis which prove that this is a deliberate strategy orchestrated by the Provincial Government to oppress this industry. We need this Department to start taking this industry seriously.

The subsidisation of the mini-bus taxi industry is possible, and the Blue Dot pilot programme has proven that very successfully. The Province has R2,658 billion in its provincial reserve fund and it can take from this reserve to fund the subsidisation of this industry. The Safely Home Fund could also assist towards the taxi subsidisation. We call for the Provincial Government to not dent the already built relationship with the mini-bus taxi industry and extend the pilot programme of the Blue Dot project through subsidisation.

The ANC, therefore, cannot support this Budget. Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise the EFF, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much. As part of its Public Works or the Public Works function, this Department must use this adjusted increase of more than R324 million to build more schools in this province. Hon Temporary Chairperson, as things stand, the province cannot accommodate learners in schools due to the lack of facilities. It is high time we must do away with temporary classrooms as they have proved to be unsafe, as they can be easily swept away by winds during the winter season. This then becomes a danger to learners and staff in schools, as well as members in the surrounding communities.

When it comes to transport, there is an existing crisis regarding the issue of taxi permits. Our people spend a lot of time and money applying for operational taxi permits only to be granted by this Department. This Department continues to frustrate those who want to operate in the taxi industry, by deliberately delaying in issuing them operating taxi permits. Hon Temporary Chairperson, every day taxis are impounded by the Government for operating without taxi permits, but it is the very same Government that is causing them not to have those permits. The impounding of taxis by Government is creating instability and chaos in our townships. When taxi operators retaliate in order to get their taxis back, this puts the lives of ordinary citizens and commuters at a serious risk.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the fines to release taxis when they are impounded by the DA-led Government, are shockingly high when compared to other provinces and the reason behind this is just to make black people remain poor. Hon Temporary Chairperson, we do not know why services similar to GoGeorge and MyCiTi are not made available in other municipalities.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, for this reason the EFF will not support this Vote. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the GOOD. Hon August?

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Public transport systems in the Western Cape are heavily challenged. From the recent taxi strikes, destruction to public transport vehicles and the City of Cape Town's decision to decrease routes on the MyCiTi Bus Service proves that we are moving backwards with developing a system that could compete with private vehicle use. The constraint of this sector is borrowed over from an era that we are still suffering from: inadequate provisions made for public transport systems in new infrastructure developments.

The Blue Dot taxi programme is but one example of a hasty political decision that was taken to win over the loyalty of taxi drivers by this DA-led Government, and it backfired sourly, with lives and livelihoods suffering the most because of a party that cannot plan to see past the next election. The taxi industry is responsible for 75% of our provincial haulage with millions of commuters making use of their services. Instead of considering the calls for modernisation

in this industry, this Government tried to pass the buck onto the National Department of Transport and hell broke loose.

I welcome the installation of cameras and ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you have to conclude ...[Interjection.]

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): ...Golden Arrow busses in support in creating a safe transport environment for people in the province. As well as ask this Government to investigate ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): ...school children and look into the legal way farm workers are transported ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Thank you, hon members. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the hon Premier, Cabinet members and hon members of the House. Today, we are debating the Western Cape Transport and Public Works Adjustment Budget against a backdrop of massive political uncertainty in this country. Hon members, notwithstanding this uncertainty, particularly in the public transportation sector, there remains hope for the future. The budget of hope. A budget that will revive the transport infrastructure industry in the Western Cape, while creating thousands of jobs.

What is hope, hon members? Today, we have hope in the House. We have students, matriculants from Mitchells Plain ...[Interjections.] and then hon Temporary Chairperson, can you protect me, please? Today, we have students ...[Interjections.] Hon Temporary Chairperson, can you protect me? I am happy the students can see for themselves what is happening. [Interjections.] Hon Temporary Chairperson, these students here today are hope. They are hope today in this House. [Interjections.] Next year, some of these students will be attending university, working or pursuing other opportunities. Some of them will run their own leadership positions in this country and sit in this House and will learn from us how to behave.

What they are seeing today, is the conduct of hon members in our House and I hope they take away from them how they must behave when they go home, how they must behave in Mitchells Plain and Langa because they one day, will be the future. [Interjections.] I appreciate that you are here today, and I want to thank you that they are here today, hon Temporary Chairperson, because these matriculants are indeed our future. So, welcome hon matriculants.

Hon member, one of the problems is, hon members, people do not read. It is a serious problem in this country. On 17 May, the hon Premier published in the ATC including in emails, in written documents, the assigning of powers to Executive Authorities. We are now on 2 December, seven months later ...[Interjection.]

†Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct]... ngoku, bendithi ndizayi-atthenda le ...  
[Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct]... I was saying I was going to attend to...]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...members question why hon Minister Simmers is delivering this. ...[Interjection.]

†Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct] Isendleni yakhe  
[Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct] It is at his house.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Secondly, hon Temporary Chairperson, in this book – it was delivered to all hon members of the House [Interjections.]

†Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct] Isendleni yakhe...  
[Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct] It is his house...]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...published on 31 August. Three months later, we are now in December. If they read this book, it says here:

“Signed here by Minister Simmers as the Executive Authority.”

The second book, hon Temporary Chairperson, also signed by hon Minister Simmers, the Executive Authority. [Interjections.] It is in this book, written, emailed ...[Interjections.] and published in the ATC. It is a problem we have in this country that people do not want to read. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Hon Simmers ...[Interjection.] was in the House, delivering his ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Mackenzie, take your ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Is this a part of the debate now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, I recognise you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, are you raising a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I am raising a point where it is convention ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are you raising on a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, I am raising to ask you, as our hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...whether you can ask the – the hon MEC almost got a promotion – hon Mackenzie, if he is prepared to take a question.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit down ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I am asking ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit down. I will ask him. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Hon member, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): No, not, thank you. I do not want to take ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, you may continue.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Who is ...[Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, the hon members who were in the Budget Committee. That is why hon Mvimbi who is online, he was in the Transport Committee when the Executive Authority delivered the Budget Vote. He delivered this thing. [Interjections.] That is why the hon Mvimbi did not raise what his hon members were raising because he knows what it is happening. [Interjections.] He must brief his hon members in his caucus.

Hon members, as we approach the festive season and while ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): No, no, Hon Chairperson there were two Ministers.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Can we now stick to the debate?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...in the Western Cape to enjoy our lovely vacation attractions. We want them to experience our exquisite wine estates, our gatsbies, our koeksisters, our Cape Malay curry. We appreciate their attendance, but we ask them to enjoy and drive responsibly. So, we welcome the R20 million as allocated and rolled over by our colleague hon Minister Tertius Simmers, for the next financial year to assist with the Red Dot transformation initiative which by the way, current President Cyril Ramaphosa promised to fund more than three years ago. Just like the Blue Dot programme, they have not funded it.

Hon members, the Blue Dot programme, and indeed, we agree with hon Mvimbi. The Blue Dot taxi programme is, indeed, one of the best programmes in this country. But as the hon member Mvimbi would know, the National Taxi Lekgotla in 2020, attended by hon President Ramaphosa himself and he addressed that National Lekgotla himself, and I quote the hon President, the current hon President – we do not know where he going to be tomorrow – but he said the following. He said:

“To provide subsidy to the taxi industry is an integral part of the economic model aimed at ensuring long-term stability for the industry.”

This is hon President Ramaphosa. [Interjections.] This is part of the commitment included from the National Taxi Lekgotla, number 20, which is also hon Dugmore, via you, hon Temporary Chairperson, this is enshrined in Vision 2030, the National Planning Commission document of which hon member Dugmore, via you, was a key provider in. So, he should be disappointed, hon Temporary Chairperson, that hon Minister Mbalula is not doing his job. We are, and I quote again:

“We are committed to putting measures and interventions aimed at influencing the economic variables within the industry value chain, including those aimed at alleviating the impact of high cost of finance.”

Commitment 21:

“To the introduction of an electronic fare collection system to reduce the handling of cash.”

This was a commitment made two years ago, hon Temporary Chairperson, at the National Taxi Lekgotla addressed by hon President Ramaphosa. Where are they today? Nowhere. We had to take more than R200 million of our own money to fund the Blue Dot programme. Where is the money? Where were our hon members on the righthand side? They were nowhere. Where are they asking hon President Ramaphosa, ‘give us the money?’ [Interjections.] They are nowhere. Where are they asking them to fund the Blue Dot programme? They are nowhere. We know the hon President hides money in the couch. They can give us the money. If the ANC had the political will and the true intention to professionalise the taxi industry, they would have done so, but they do not.

Hon members, if I take you further back to 1995. 1995, the National Task Team on Taxis was established in 1995. That was the last time they considered issues affecting the taxi violence. Where are they today? Nowhere, nothing, niks! Not one of the hon members on the right said anything about this. But the only programme that is running very well in this country and we have to give credit to the officials in the Department of Public Works, they deserve a hand of applause, hon members [Applause.] for coming up with the Blue Dot programme [Applause.] because while the rest of the country was stealing, buying donkey carts, we developed a programme called the Blue Dot programme. That is the DA difference, hon members of the House.

Hon members, we have seen recently the attacks on public infrastructure and

what I find quite sad is that an hon member of this House accused the Government for ignoring barbarism. What is barbaric is the silence of the ANC. A taxi was caught with thirteen petrol bombs. Thirteen! Not one, not two, not three, thirteen petrol bombs! Not once have the hon members of the righthand side said anything about it. Not once did the ANC release a statement because thirteen petrol bombs are domestic terrorism against people of this province, and we will not tolerate it. So, the City of Cape Town has an absolute right to arrest individuals with petrol bombs in their car, but the ANC for some bizarre reason, hon members, was extremely quiet on this matter. [Interjections.]

With regards to permits. [Interjections.] It is surprising. The hon members were in the Standing Committee. In the Standing Committee there was not one outstanding permit for the taxi industry. Not one! There was a meeting with the taxi industry held in Nyanga two months ago. Not one outstanding taxi permit by this Government because the Western Cape Government delivers. [Interjections.]

And the second point the hon member raised which is shocking, I must say, the hon member of the EFF. She said the fines are higher in the Western Cape than in any other province. Imagine that you commit a crime and then we said, 'okay, sorry, brother. Let us give you a lower sentence.' It is bizarre. ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...coming from a woman knowing the terrible crimes committed in this country. You cannot say to someone we are giving you a lower sentence because you are living in another province. If you commit a crime, you must be punished. That is the law. Finished and klaar. ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): That is not the debate.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): It is shocking that during the days of 16 Days of Activism, hon members complain about a fine being too high ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): That was not a debate! The hon member must listen.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Do not commit a crime. It is that simple. Be honest. Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, hon Temporary Chairperson?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): [Interjections.]... listening, thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): [Interjections.]... like yesterday. He alluded to something ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): He said in the Eastern Cape and the Northern Cape, people could travel. Brilliant point, well done! Thank you for raising that, but what the hon Dugmore failed to inform this House, why can people not travel between the Eastern Cape and the Northern Cape on the trains, in the Eastern Cape? Why can they not, hon House members? They cannot because the trains are not working. They cannot because of attacks on 150 Intercape busses. So, the reason they cannot is because the ANC collapsed the trains. The ANC collapsed the security cluster, allowing 150 attacks on busses. It is terrible, it is unacceptable, it will never be okay in this province.

The DA in this House fully supports the Budget Vote of R9,4 billion. It is the right thing to do. We will continue to invest in this province. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Mackenzie. [Interjections.] Hon members, can we settle down? [Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] I now recognise hon Minister Simmers. [Interjections.] Hon member Marran? [Interjections.] Hon member Marran! ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Mackenzie, Hon member Marran! You can move out and have that conversation as we continue with the business of the House. I recognise hon Minister Simmers.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Temporary Chairperson, there is a hand online.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson? Hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes, hon Temporary Chairperson, my hand has been up actually even by the time hon Mackenzie was making his statement.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you are not audible, we cannot hear you. [Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): And he mentioned ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We cannot hear you.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Can you hear me now, hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Try again.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Can you hear me now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I hear you. You can continue, hon member ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, there is a statement that hon Mackenzie has raised that seems to be casting aspersions on the hon Makamba-Botya, saying that she is actually, hon Makamba-Botya being a woman. and I do not know whether he is raising it to her because she is a woman or if it is actually ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, hon member Makamba-Botya, I recognise you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): No, hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much. I think this House has actually been degenerating lately. Why are we always subjected to this kind of treatment by the DA? However, we have been raising our hands on the hybrid and no one is recognising it, and the House is continuing as normal as if we do not exist. So, my point of order does not even – it is actually null and void because the person who was on the podium is no longer speaking.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon members do not make it difficult for the Temporary Chairperson because this is a political debate. So, try to work with the Temporary Chairperson not to give a template of what to be said, what not to be said because it is not up to the Temporary Chairperson to give direction of what is it that needs to be said when there is a political debate. So, help me ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): All hands, hon Temporary Chairperson, must be recognised. When we raise our hand on the hybrid, we must be recognised ...[Interjection.] with the people in the Sitting.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you cannot interject. That is why you have got an option of being in the House so that we can continue having that point of order. But while I am still talking to your point of order, there is no point of order of the point of order. So, you are going to allow the Temporary Chairperson to continue and there are some hands that are raised in the House. I recognise you. You had your chance. Hon Chief Whip of the Opposition, I recognise you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, an order was raised by hon Mvimbi saying hon Mackenzie has cast an aspersion on hon Makamba-Botya. And I am wanting to implore you to rule on that matter because it is a serious one. We are a non-sexist society and as such, we should be accepting the LGBTQ2I if it exists. Now, such a statement is insulting, and it cannot be said in this democratic House, hon Temporary Chairperson. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, I heard hon member Mvimbi, and I did not pick that up. So, I am going to – I will come back. I am going to ask the Table staff to assist me because I did not hear when that was said and then I will come back to the House on that after I got the response if

Table staff heard that. So, hon member Mackenzie, I hope after I ruled on that – like I said we are not going to talk now to what I have just ruled on. Thank you very much. Hon Minister, I recognise you.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, first and foremost, I welcome all the comments by all the political parties. I take note. I also note that the two key issues which the majority of the parties flagged pertain to matters that I believe my colleague, hon Minister Mitchell, has actually answered in this House or in written format ...[Interjection.] So, as such I will not regurgitate what my hon colleague has responded over the last few weeks.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I think give that the Standing Committee Chairperson has invited matriculants from Mitchells Plain, I think it is quite eloquent that I believe they impart from this House with some words as to put them on their life's journey which they are about to begin. Through you, hon Temporary Chairperson, to the members in the gallery. I would love to just close off with a quote of Michael Jordan which you earlier could not hear due to the noise in the House [Interjections.] but it is quite – I think it is quite fitting for your life journey, which is about to begin post Grade 12, and he said:

“Obstacles do not have to stop you. If you run into a wall, do not turn around and give up. Figure out how to climb it, go through it or work around it.”

Because you come from an area which is faced with so many social challenges, yet out of despair, through you hon Temporary Chairperson, one can find hope, hope through a Government that creates opportunities for all its people.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, at this junction I would really like to thank in his absence, the Standing Committee Chairperson, and the members of the Standing Committee for a sterling job that they have done in the oversight over myself, but also over my colleague, hon Minister Mitchell. But I would also like to thank each and every official in the Department of Transport and Public Works for the hard work that they have put in this year, to ensure that we continue to deliver quality and reliable infrastructure to our citizens.

But, as I stated in my speech, hon Temporary Chairperson, this Department also received a tenth consecutive clean audit status, which is no easy feat given that they are the only provincial department of its nature to have done this. It speaks to proper and sound collective leadership. But it is very seldom I single out a member of a group that is part of that leadership. However, I really have to convey a special thank you to our CFO who is present here, Adv Smit, who ensured that even while she was going through difficult health challenges, she stayed committed to ensure that this Department received a clean bill of health for the tenth consecutive time, and I want this House to note that she did that. [Applause.]

So, hon Temporary Chairperson, in conclusion to all the hon members in the House, on behalf of Vote 10, on behalf of the Department, I want to wish you all the time to rest well and spend time with your loved ones. But also, to the HOD and the team because 2023 is going to be a very interesting year, as we now

migrate from Transport and Public Works to the Department of Infrastructure, to ensure that the Department which was based on excellence, goes beyond that and even more because they have a sound history of doing that. Thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on this Vote. The Secretary will read the Seventh Order of the Day.

[Debate concluded.]

## **7. Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise hon Minister Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Hon Temporary Chairperson, ...[Inaudible.] I will start again. Hon Temporary Chairperson, as we near the end of 2022, we can see the positive signs of recovery after the devastating effects of the COVID-19 pandemic. Over the past year, we have seen the return of live audiences in our theatres and spectators at our sporting events. This has brought a much-needed boost not only to the economy, but to the mental and physical wellbeing of the people of the Western Cape.

As I now present the Adjusted Estimates Budget for the 2022/2023 financial year, I wholeheartedly thank each and every one of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport team for the spirit in which we tackled this year. It was a year of rebuilding and recovery, and we did this by rolling out our programmes, many of which were suspended during the pandemic. Led by our Head of Department, Mr Guy Redman, we continued meeting our mandates. With a budget increase of R554 000 from approximately R937,9 million to R938,4 million, we take our leading role in wellbeing seriously and we are committed to working innovatively to ensure that we can continue to deliver our important services to our communities.

We are very excited to see the increase of sporting events happening in our province and we are grateful to have received R3 million from the Department of Economic Development and Tourism and R2 million from provincial funding, to be able to support a Formula E World Championship which will take place in Cape Town for the first time, in February 2023.

We have been focusing on keeping our youth safe and positively engaged in a period after formal school hours. We have received R950 000 from the Department of the Premier for the Shukuma YearBeyond programme, a high school programme to enhance wellbeing and safety at schools, using unemployed youth as facilitators. The programme is offered in the Cape Metro and Cape Winelands in 46 schools. It provides a first work opportunity to 189 youth.

An amount of R2,7 million was received from the Department of Education for

the purpose of furthering the rollout of the Western Cape education at home learning YearBeyond programme. This programme works in 18 community hubs with 51 schools, providing support for 3 000 at risk learners, homework support, parental workshops and fun afterschool activities in parks and community facilities in targeted communities. At the same time, it has provided a first work opportunity to 322 youth.

We have sadly seen that the Philippi Stadium has been vandalised to such an extent that it cannot be used to host any football matches or other events. To this end, R3,9 million has been realigned in the Provincial Revenue Fund to contribute towards the repairs required at the stadium.

The Department received R4,5 million in lieu of a rollover application of committed funds for goods not delivered by end of the 2021/2022 financial year. The rollover mainly related to the impact of COVID-19 on global supply chains in the related industries which affected the delivery of the goods procured.

I now take this opportunity to thank all our stakeholders, partners, and Cabinet colleagues for helping us improve Sport and Cultural Affairs in the Western Cape by sharing experiences and new ways of thinking and ...[Audio distorted.] service of all those who call the province home. We express our gratitude for the collaborative efforts to enable a safer sporting environment, creating a culture more representative of our population with policies developed to safeguard, protect, and uplift the often marginalised. We appreciate the Standing Committee and our Chairperson, hon member Gillion Bosman, for holding us accountable in the oversight role as together we work towards a socially inclusive, active, and connected Western Cape. I thank you. [Applause.]

[Mr A P Van der Westhuizen takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. The next speaker is hon Kama. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is the best of all the ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, no. No! No conversing aloud. There is a new Temporary Chairperson. [Laughter.] Thank you. [Interjections.] No. Thank you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, if the kids or the school kids that were in the gallery were not brought here to just watch hon Mackenzie debating, they would have been very shocked at the claims that the hon MEC is making. In actual fact, they would have felt well represented when I debate.

I think, hon Temporary Chairperson, let me start by noting and congratulating Stephanie Frappart from France, Neuza Back and Karen Diaz, who were the first women to be match officials of a Men's Soccer World Cup yesterday. The ANC rejects this Budget Vote because we are realising that this Government does not realise the importance of this Department in fighting many social ills

and advocating for many programmes like that of the emancipation of women through sports and if that was the case, it would have been reflected in this Budget.

The people of the Western Cape are misled to believe that the Department's budget has been adjusted and increased by over R554 000, whereas in reality R3,9 million of the much-needed funds have been shifted out of the Department. Such decisions impede the Department from realising its full potential in fulfilling the vision inspired priorities VIP 1 of inclusive communities and VIP 3 of empowering people. The HOD and senior management are on record saying that they would love this Department's budget to be increased to at least over R1 billion. The hon MEC herself, vowed to go to the Treasury to request additional funding for the case for sport and to our disappointment, not only has the hon MEC failed to act on this commitment, but her Department continues to show disregard, disrespect and disdain for sport as proved by the budget cuts in this Budget.

The Budget for Sport is reduced from R69 million to R67 million. Over and above this, the Budget for school sport and the MOD programme has also been reduced. This disregard for sports does not only end with the reduced budgets. Sports federations in the province and especially, the South African Football Association (SAFA) continue to be undermined by the hon MEC and this Department.

A case in point in this Department is the Department's meeting with the United Coalition of Sport and Community Based Organisations yesterday, which was meant to discuss the capture of sport by the Department. It is highly disappointing that the Department sent junior officials to the meeting. The highest ranking official in Sport was a Deputy Director. There was no HOD, no Chief Director and no Directors at all. The constituency of SAFA alone, hon Temporary Chairperson, has 86 000 members in the Metro which are young people and have about 150 000 members provincially, and yet, it is treated with such disrespect.

Hon Bans before me, was so passionate about the issue of Sport Infrastructure that is falling apart across municipalities. We will continue to drive this issue until the hon MEC, and the Department start to take it seriously. It is disappointing that the R3,9 million for the repairs of the Philippi Stadium is still not spent and sent to the Provincial Revenue Fund.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, along with sport, youth development is another casualty. Every time we pose questions in this Parliament about the challenge of social ills in the province and how the Safety Plan will address these challenges, whether we ask Social Development about drugs and substance abuse or Community Safety about youth gangs, all fingers always point to the hon MEC Marais' Department. Having gone through this Department's budget it is highly disappointing that youth development is not prioritised.

The ANC raised its concerns about this in the Committee and we were shocked to learn that the Transversal Youth Development initiatives are handled by a junior Youth Services Director in the Department. Youth unemployment

initiatives should go far beyond the YearBeyond programme and Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) jobs. As the ANC, we are advocating for the Department's Youth Services office to be expanded into a full directorate for youth, with a sufficient budget and for every department in the province to have at least a Director for Youth Development Projects.

The challenge of social ills including high youth participating in gangs, drugs and violent crimes is as a result of this Province's lack of prioritisation of Youth Development, not the Police. Hon MEC, in March, when you acted in the position of former hon MEC Fritz, you promised to create opportunities for the 1 000 Safety Ambassadors that were fired from the Department of Community Safety. To this day, only 50 of those were recruited and over 900 are roaming in the streets and maybe recruited into gangs.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, it is gravely concerning that the Department's Compensation of Employee's Budget has been reduced by over R1 million, while there are over 900 youth that the Department knows about that are jobless because of the DA Government in the province. The fallacy of a Government for Jobs is getting exposed and crumbling. This Provincial Government, through these unsustainable projects, is killing jobs.

As expected, the budget for Cultural Services is reduced. We suspect that the Department does not take the programme seriously, hence its budget is always cut. However, we welcome the budget increase for the overall budget increases for Library Services. Our demands are clear: no library must be closed down in the province. Should the hon MEC fail to stop municipalities, like the City of Cape Town, from closing down libraries, we will take this as a declaration of war, and we will be more than happy and prepared to meet her in the battlefield. We note the R8,6 million shifted to the Premier's Department. The same Premier's Department has failed to ensure that all rural libraries are connected to the internet through the provincial broadband rollout. This amount must ensure that all rural libraries have internet access and are fully furnished.

In closing, hon Temporary Chairperson, I must thank my organisation for deploying me into this portfolio. We would like to state upfront that I look forward to a cordial relationship with the hon MEC. This is not to be construed, however, as asking for a friendship. I will not be friends with an MEC when her Department has failed to ensure the respect, for example, of ulwaluko, the cultural rite of passage practiced by several cultures in the province, including AmaXhosa, AmaHlubi and Sothos. What the Stellenbosch Municipality and that organisation of white people and what they are doing there, is serious provocation. The hon MEC must ensure that this does not happen again.

I also want to call on you to put pressure on hon MEC Bredell, to accelerate the implementation of the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Act in the Province. Hon MEC, many young people do not believe that or do not have confidence that you are going to be able to lead them in this portfolio. They believe that you are too old for the portfolio. To a certain degree I agree with them and hope that you can prove them wrong [Interjections.] through showing more passion for sports, arts and culture.

For the above reasons, hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC finds it quite impossible to support this Budget. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Kama. Next up, is the hon Makamba-Botya, who is joining us online.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much. The EFF is very disappointed to see that the Budget of the Department is only increased by a mere R554 000. This is the Department that should strive for inclusivity in sport, however the reality on the ground is quite the opposite.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, There are no sporting facilities in most townships in the province. This is also the case when it comes to township schools. Without these facilities, it is impossible to participate in different sporting codes. This kind of social exclusion must be condemned. Hon Temporary Chairperson, every year when these issues are raised in the House, we are often told about the lack of available spaces in townships to build the required infrastructure.

The structural landscape of colonialism still persists to this day. Black and poor people are allocated far away from areas with good sporting facility resources. The very same Provincial Government is not doing much when it comes to responding to issues of spatial planning and making sure that new developments do include sporting facilities adjacent to them. On that note, hon Temporary Chairperson, the EFF does not support this Vote. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. The next on the list is the hon Marais, but I do not see you online, sir. Hon Marais? Pass, which brings us to the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson and good afternoon to you, good afternoon to our hon colleagues on the righthand side and a very warm welcome to hon Kama, the new shadow MEC for Cultural Affairs and Sports. We sincerely hope you enjoy your time with us. We know you have not been able to make it to that many meetings, but we do understand there is a World Cup on, and you are very passionate about sports.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Bosman? Hon Marran ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Bosman or hon Baartman?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Bosman, just please take your seat. Hon Marran, according to the Rules there is no conversing aloud in this House.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Okay, sir.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No conversation, thank you.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): It was not ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I heard you, hon Marran. Do not disrespect the Temporary Chairperson. I do not want to invoke that Rule. [Interjections.] Thank you, thank you. Last warning and hon Lekker, please respect the Temporary Chairperson in terms of Rule 45. Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Are you naming me? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Not yet. Last warning.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Last warning?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Correct. [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, do not threaten me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not threaten me, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not threaten me. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not threaten me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Lekker ...[Interjection.] Please. Hon Lekker? Hon Makamba-Botya, hon Nosipho, please. [Interjections.] Can I ...[Interjection.] I ...[Interjection.] You are not supposed to.

“If a member is found in contempt of or is disregarding the authority of the Chair, or that a member’s conduct is grossly disorderly, the Presiding Officer may order the member to withdraw immediately from the precincts of the Provincial Parliament for the remainder of that day.”

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): How could you arrive ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...[Interjection.] that hon Temporary Chairperson!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Lekker? [Interjections.] Hon Lekker, your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I would like to raise an order on you, hon Temporary

Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: A point of order, honourable? ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you. Hon Lekker ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are recognised.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I would like to bring to your attention ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...that intimidating hon members ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and threatening hon members, reading the Rules incorrectly and applying those Rules incorrectly so, is also a treacherous crime.

An HON MEMBER: Treacherous?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): So, if you do so, hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...we will meet you wherever you want us to meet.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We will go to the Conduct Committee with you as well.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Lekker, I believe that you are at this time grossly disorderly ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Haibo!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...and I therefore order you to withdraw ...[Interjections.] to withdraw from the House. [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): What is this now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members, the House suspended for a minute to allow the hon member just to withdraw. [Interjections.] Table staff, please assist the hon member to withdraw. The House is suspended.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, this is not your House! We are not in a dictatorship.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can we please ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...[Inaudible.] our hands!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can we please just ask that the video feed be cut off. The House is suspended for a minute to allow the hon member.

**[Business of the House was suspended at 16:15 and resumed at 16:27.]**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon members. Business will resume. Hon Lekker, in terms of Rule 45, I have ordered you to withdraw as you were challenging and disregarding the authority of the Temporary Chairperson, before we suspended the proceedings. Will you please withdraw?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I ask a question, hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will you please withdraw?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]... a question, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will you – only answer ‘yes’ or ‘no’. It is not a debate ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I have a question. Did you or did you not get advice from the Tabling staff not to take the position that you have taken right now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am not going to be drawn, but the answer is no ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I did not get that ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Did you get the advice from the Tabling staff ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Point of order, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...not to rule on [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...what you have ruled on.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am now invoking ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are the hon Temporary Chairperson of the House ...[intervenes]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...the Rule 46(1).

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And there is a Tabling staff that must advise you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, on a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am busy with the first point of order here. [Interjections.]

“If a Presiding Officer is of the opinion that a Member’s conduct is of such a serious nature that an order to withdraw from the Sitting, either from the Chamber or electronic platform, for the remainder of the day’s Sitting is inadequate, the Presiding Officer may name that Member.”

Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...Lekker, I am naming you ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can we first deal just with this point? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no, no, no, on a point of order, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed? Hon Sayed, I am warning you as well. [Interjections.] I have made my ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]... warnings.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I have made [Interjections.] I have made ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]... warnings.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, honourable.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed [Interjections.] please withdraw? [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Point of order, Hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please. Please, withdraw. [Interjections.] Hon Sayed, please withdraw. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): On a point of order, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): This is a peaceful meeting ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, please hon members, I have made a ruling. We must first deal with this point of order and then, we will go to the next. Hon Lekker ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, is not ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...Rule 46 has been invoked. Please. Thank you, hon Lekker. I am waiting for you.

An HON MEMBER: Ah, this is not serious. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon Sayed, please? [Interjections.] Thank you. Hon members, please obey and respect the Temporary Chairperson as per our Rules. [Interjections.] No. [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. The House will be suspended again just to allow [Interjections.] for these hon members the opportunity to withdraw from the House. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Lekker. [Interjections.]

**[Business of the House was suspended at 16:32 and resumed at 16:49.]**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, you may be seated. Thank you, hon members. Before we proceed with the debate, I want to say that as you may have observed, we have had a discussion amongst the Whips and myself, and we have come to a very collegial agreement.

I am retracting my decisions on Rules 45 and 46, and we have an undertaking that we will all be concentrating on the Business of the House; that we will be maintaining the decorum for the House for the remainder of the day. We all realise that it has been a very long and tiring day and year and therefore, hon

members, we are to proceed with the business of today and therefore, also, the last Order of the Day. Thank you very much for your patience and I am really glad that we were able to come to this agreement. Thank you very much. Hon Bosman, you were on the floor. You are welcome to proceed with your speech.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Inaudible.] [Interjections.] for 24 seconds. [Laughter.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You still have 15 minutes and 15 seconds. You are quite right.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): So, you have taken one minute away. I am being punished. Hon Temporary Chairperson, as I was saying before I was interrupted ...[Audio distorted.] The technology has also decided that we need to end. We have been here too long.

The hon Kama is a new addition to Cultural Affairs and Sport, so we want to also inform him that today is Friday and Fridays in the Cultural Affairs and Sport Committee and across the Western Cape, is netball Friday. And we look forward to the hon Temporary Chairperson allowing us at our next sitting on a Friday, to wear those netball T-shirts. I was scared to wear mine because the hon Leader of the Opposition normally calls us out when we are not wearing ties or buttoned up shirts. Hon member Dugmore is very particular about that. So, I decided it is best to dress appropriately for the hon Leader of the Opposition. [Laughter.]

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape is fortunate to be hosting the Netball World Cup 2023 and that event is testimony to the work done by this Department because the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport plays a critical role in the wellbeing of the people of this province. They encourage excellence and inclusivity. They safeguard the interests of our talented artists and sports people, and their work unites people through sport and culture, to ensure a creative, active, and prosperous Western Cape.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the funds appropriated in this Budget will go a long way in binding our communities together and building a strong and unified nation. And I want to thank hon Minister Marais for launching the first Rule Book of the boxing sport in isiXhosa this last Wednesday because that goes a long way in binding our communities together.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, this week as well provides a perfect example of this Department in action. This week, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport in partnership with international organisations, such as the British Council, hosted the 8th ArtsAbility Festival at the Artscape Theatre. The African continent's premier festival led by differently abled performers. ArtsAbility seeks to not only provide an inclusive space for artists experiencing disability to express themselves, but also to mobilise their work towards greater inclusion and transformation in the arts sector. Bringing to life the work of this Department in a ...[Audio distorted.] amazing performances that we saw last Tuesday.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can we just get all the microphones muted? There seems to be an echo.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): It seems to happen when I speak. I tend to disrupt the House without even saying anything. [Laughter.] As I said, hon Temporary Chairperson, this performance that we saw on Wednesday night at the Artscape theatre, launching the ArtsAbility Festival, brought together the work of this amazing Department through the performance, showcasing the joint collaborative performance of an opera written by internationally renowned composer, Paola Prestini. It incorporated not just dance and opera, but it had a partnership that saw the Artscape associated Unmute Dance Company working in collaboration with international partners, Sensorium Ex from New York and Diversity in Dance from the United Kingdom, to create what was truly a magical experience.

I encourage all hon members, like I invited all hon members in Monday's meeting, to attend the ArtsAbility Festival which closes today. Hopefully, if we get out of here in time, hon member Kama can still catch some of those performances because the member acting for him on Monday probably did not mention that that invitation was extended.

This Adjustment Budget lends further support to projects like this one, by providing an increase of more than R554 000 or a 0,6% increase to the Main Budget. I believe that this Department should receive more funding, but we must acknowledge the stark reality that we face in this country with the Equitable Share continually decreasing and in this budget decreasing by over R574 million in the Main Budget. This is in line with what we already know. The Western Cape always gets far too little of the National Provincial Equitable Share. But, hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape has once again come to the rescue to fill the gaps left by our flailing National Government. This Province has provided additional funding through financing from the Provincial Revenue Fund to supplement some of the gaps left by our failing and flailing National Government.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, with all this doom and gloom, I am still encouraged by this Department because they continually demonstrate the ability to innovate and to do more with less. Despite a decline in funding to Library Services and Archives, this Department continues to deliver these vital resources to our people wherever they find themselves. As the Cluster A Committee member who are present will attest, we saw a beautiful, functionally built library at the New Horizons Library in Plettenberg Bay. That being one of six libraries in the Bitou Municipality. It is a library that is led by not just innovative staff members, but also a library that shows collaboration by working with the Municipality and working with the Department of the Premier. I am sorry, hon Temporary Chairperson, is that question from hon Dugmore?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Dugmore, please? Hon Dugmore.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I know that you will deal with the Leader of the Opposition quite firmly, so [Laughter.] I do ask for your protection. [Laughter.] As I was saying, hon Temporary Chairperson, the New Horizons Library showcases a

partnership between the Department of the Premier through the Cape Access Centre being integrated into the main function of the library. When we were there, we were shown around the library, the Access Centre, but we were also told about the support that staff at that library gets from the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. And we know that they will now be launching a robotics lab with further support from this Department.

What they also told us is that they have appointed 13 YeBoneers and I was very delighted to hear that YeBoneers are young people who form part of the YearBeyond programme, that affords youth aged 18 to 25 employment and learning opportunities. Collectively, our libraries have 19 701 active members in the Plettenberg Bay area, a number that is rapidly growing as people return to libraries after COVID-19.

When we vote on this Budget today, I would encourage all hon members present here to think about the nearly 20 000 people who now have access to a world of knowledge through the efforts of this Department. Think of the performance on stage at the Artscape, at the EON, at the Fugard Theatre, at the Baxter Theatre, at theatres in our communities like the KKNK Festival, like the Riel Dance Festival and think about how these people are working hard towards inclusivity and accessibility and ask yourself what more can we do to support their work, to create an accessible and an inclusive province in the Western Cape.

I encourage all hon members to think about the heritage, which is being preserved by this Department, that is being protected to ensure that our young people are able to access that, like we saw in how this Department is trying to assist Robben Island as well. This is a good example of how this Department has an integrated approach to Youth Development. The Integrated Youth Development Strategy that is housed in this Department gives young people a seat at the table and it does not set a separate table for young people like you want us to do, hon member Kama, through you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, as a fairly new Chairperson to this portfolio, I want to say a very special thank you to the members of this Committee for welcoming me back to the Cluster A because they have shown me that we can work collaboratively, and we can refocus our oversight model to ensure that Cultural Affairs and Sport's successes are highlighted as we do oversight. I want to thank all the members not just for their support in the Committee meetings, but also for engaging and bringing issues and I hope, through you, hon Temporary Chairperson, that the hon Kama will be as excited as hon member Bans when she sent through her list of what the Committee is going to do. I hope that there will be some space for your ideas as well because we are very busy up until the end of the year. [Laughter.]

I want to thank, hon Temporary Chairperson, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport because it is one department where every time through the hon Minister, we get immediate feedback on issues that were raised. This Department is ably led by a young, energetic, vibrant Minister who can take anybody on whether it is in a boxing ring or whether it is on a stage. Thank you, hon Minister Marais, for your active leadership in this vital portfolio.

A very special thank you, hon Chairperson, goes to Mr Wasi Matthews and Mr Ben Daza for their commitment to excellence and for ensuring that we are always able to do our work, even when we do not get lamb shanks. [Interjections.] We are grateful, we are very grateful for their work.

Hon House Chairperson, like I said earlier we welcome hon Kama as the new shadow MEC for Cultural Affairs and Sports. [Interjections.] We know that he will use not just his knowledge of soccer, but also he will use some of his community safety experience to ensure that the young people in this province, that the old people in this province and that the in-betweeners receive cultural affairs and sports facilities that are fit for them.

We know that when he joins us for the Provincial Parliamentary Netball Tournament at Leeuwenhof he will go up against our Minister or he will send the Leader of the Official Opposition to participate in that game. [Interjections.]

Hon House Chairperson, it goes without saying that I support Vote 13 in its entirety, and I hope that all members of this House will join us as members of the Committee in thanking not just to the Department, but in thanking all the civil servants for their hard work throughout this year ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... because it is the officials in the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports that revived Cultural Affairs and Sport after we came back from COVID.

With that said, the Democratic Alliance fully supports this Vote, and we fully support the hard working men and women in the arts, culture, sports and heritage sector. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Bosman, which brings us back to Minister Marais. [Applause.]

Your microphone, hon Minister Marais. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. Hon member Kama, I just want to say at least you will be able to understand the boxing rules when we get into the ring. [Laughter.]

†Ek wil net sê baie dankie vir elkeen se bydrae, vir julle passie vir die Sport en Kultuur-sektor. [I just want to say thank you for everybody's contribution, for your passion for the Sport and Culture sector.]

I take note of all the comments, even though some are negative, but we take note – the big thing for our departments, we really do not have all the money, but we do what we can with what we have [Interjections.] and I must say thank you to the Standing Committee for your role [Interjections.], for our Chairperson, your passion. †Dis rêrig 'n riem onder die hart. Dankie vir wat jy self doen en die

nuwe dimensie wat jy bring aan die Komitee. [It's really very encouraging. Thank you for what you do yourself and the new dimension you bring to the Committee.]

Then I also want to say our Department or in the Western Cape we work very hard and diligently to ensure a safe rite of passage to all our initiates and we did give a report back to hon member Pat Lekker, maybe she can just hand it over to you as well or you can have a discussion and we are very proud that we do not have any deaths in the province and that we speak regularly to our initiation forums. We had a national initiation forum here yesterday afternoon for a fact-finding mission and at this moment they are very happy, and I really wish everyone well for the rest of this initiation season. Thank you so much. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Well done, hon Minister!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon members, thank you, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on this Vote.

The Secretary will now read the Eighth and last Order of the Day.

## **8. Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon House Chair, Ministers, members and guests, and to my Opposition on the benches as well as online.

It is my pleasure to participate in the debate on Vote 2: Provincial Parliament. I stand here today as the Deputy Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in terms of Rule 26 and not as the Executive Authority of this Vote.

The Western Cape's Main Budget of R176 502 000 was supplemented with rollovers of R10 323 000 and a revenue retention of R350 000 from the previous financial year, leaving the Western Cape Provincial Parliament with an adjusted appropriation of R187 175 000.

The rollover of the 2021/22 financial year was mainly allocated as follows:

- Programme 1: Governance leadership and administration of R5,129 million rollover from the previous financial year to cover for committed projects, which were not completed in the 2021/22 and priority projects identified.
- Programme 2: R1,847 million to supplement the Standing Committee budget.
- Programme 3: Public engagement of R3,237 million rolled over from the previous financial year to cover for committed projects which were not yet

completed in 2021/22 and priority projects identified.

- Programme 4: Members support of R110 000 rolled over from the previous financial year to provide for members' travel to WCPP events.

Major shifts include the provision of R2,559 million for:

- Basement shelving and partitioning fourth and sixth floor;
- Legal fees;
- Life insurance;
- Online subscriptions;
- Computer services;
- PEO workshops; and
- Members' second dwelling.

R268 000, provision for early retirement due to ill health of a staff member and leave gratuity pay-outs, and R2,412 million for closed circuit television, wave readers and laptop refreshing.

I would like to take this opportunity, hon House Chair, to thank the POC for their thorough engagements during the year and the frankness in which we could conduct our business.

A special word of thanks is also extended to hon Minister Wenger and her team of finance specialists for our fruitful engagements and their appreciation for the peculiar needs of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

I would also like to place on record my appreciation for the work done by the Secretary to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Mr Romeo Adams and his administration, for the exceptional support given to us not only as at a Speaker's level and Speaker's office level, but really to the entire administration. They have really had to pivot, adjust and be resilient with all the constant changes.

On a special note I would like to publicly thank the staff in the Office of the Speaker for the work that they have done diligently over the three years and for their dedication to the Speaker's Office. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The next speaker is the hon member Lekker. Hon member Sayed, point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Yes, yes. Hon Chair, just for noting, I do not want to be, I just want to place on record on behalf of the African National Congress that Rule 26, we do not want disruptions, we can continue. Rule 26 quoted by the hon Deputy Speaker does not apply because there is no Speaker currently. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, noted. Hon member Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Hon Chairperson, I would like to point out that the African National Congress has really with pain endured a process where there has been instability in the House and going forward we would like to place on record that as members of this House we all had a responsibility of ensuring that the decorum of the House stays as it is. However, as and when we tend to ignore the Rules that govern this House, we are bound to have instability.

Now, hon Chairperson, allow me to say that the ANC must rise today and reject this Budget Vote, while also stating what is supposed to be the obvious. We have a Provincial Parliament with no Speaker. It is therefore an anomaly that this budget is introduced by the Deputy Speaker.

The Deputy Speaker in terms of Section 13 of the Financial Management of Parliament Act is not the Executive Authority of Parliament and should not be sponsoring this budget.

Knowing full well that the DA thinks nothing of using taxpayers' money to fund their legal battles and defend corrupt DA councillors, like the one in the City of Cape Town, the ANC wishes to place on record the maladministration that is currently taking place in this Parliament.

We are voting on a Budget Vote of an institution that has no Executive Authority. This is against the law, but so much for the DA respecting the rule of law.

As the hon member Dugmore pointed out yesterday, the Provincial Constitution is clear, the Provincial Parliament must elect a Speaker from amongst its members and at the first sitting after its election or when necessary, to fill a vacancy.

In terms of the Financial Management of Parliament Act, Section 6(2) is clear that the Secretary of Parliament is accountable to the Executive Authority. It would therefore be appropriate to ask who is the Secretary now accountable to if he is running the shop? We find it completely unacceptable that the accounting officer himself would agree to such maladministration.

Be that as it may, hon Chairperson, the ANC wishes to take this opportunity to state emphatically and express our thanks to the loyal and committed non-partisan members of staff of this Legislature. We acknowledge the men and women who work tirelessly to ensure the proper functioning of this Parliament.

However, we are not blind to the DA cadres who are also deployed to the membership of staff of this Legislature. We know people like Unathi [Inaudible.] are appointed here as staff while still be DA operatives in this Legislature. Yet the staff of this Parliament must also know that the DA, whose members are falsely nicely to them, underspend over R4 million in compensation of employment. The staff of this institution must know that the DA-led Parliament refuses to fill vacancies. The ANC has been consistent in complaining about the amount of funds received by the Governance and Administration Programme.

While we note the R10 million in the budget of WCPP, more than half of that increase goes again into the Governance and Administration Programme. Notwithstanding that ICT is covered in this programme, but as with most budgets the devil is lost in the detail.

If we remember one of the main criticisms of the Main Appropriation in March/April this year, was the fact that this Budget Vote hardly allocates any funding or lack of funding in particular to committee support. It seems our complaints and pleas have fallen on deaf ears. In fact the ANC would want to venture to suggest the reason why the current MEC for Finance appropriated over R10 million in this Adjusted Appropriation to this Legislature was because she was the Chief Whip of the DA then and she knew the plight of this Legislature in fighting for more funds for committees.

Instead over half of that Adjusted Appropriation is now falling into the black pit called Programme 1 and no additional funds have been allocated to committees in this Adjusted Appropriation. The committees are the engine room of this Legislature.

R31 000 is simply carried over to anticipated travel costs. R77 000 is taken from underspending in COE to compensate staff accompanying us, yet nothing towards ensuring more oversight visits for committee activities.

The ANC must also express its dissatisfaction of the use of taxpayers' money. R402 000 in total for the CCMA pay-out due to the lack of planning on the part of the Parliamentary Administration. Again I wish to appeal to members of the DA, do not allow factional fights in your party to compromise the running of this House.

DA factional fights have prevented you from appointing a new Chief Whip. DA factional fights have seen you get rid of the Speaker of this House. DA factional fights have impacted on the business of this Legislature. Protect democracy, it is fragile. The ANC cannot support this budget. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Lekker.

The next speaker is the hon member Makamba-Botya who will be joining online.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, hon House Chair †andazi sifeke nini kule-vouto ngoba asinayo i-Speaker]  
[I do not know how we arrived to this Vote, because we do not have a speaker.]

Hon House Chair, I find it very strange that we are dealing with this Vote, but then we do not have a Speaker. The Section 111 of South African Constitution makes it clear that at the first sitting of the House, members elected in this House must elect a Speaker. The Speaker must remain until he or she is removed from the House by the resolution of the House. Hon House Chair, the Rules envisage that there should always be a Speaker. When one is removed then another one must be elected.

Hon House Chair, Rule 22.1 states that whenever necessary to elect a Speaker, the Secretary must inform the House accordingly.

So now since the DA did not have what it takes to remove the Speaker through proper constitutional channels, we find ourselves in a situation where necessity has kicked in for the Secretary to inform the House regarding the election of the Speaker. However, what is shocking is that the Secretary is not doing that.

Hon House Chair, it is now clear that no one follows the Rules of this House anymore. People take instructions from the kitchen of Madam Helen Zille. Hon House Chair, the Constitution of this country and the Rules of this House do not permit for us to go this long way without the Speaker. We are currently in a train which we do not know where it is heading as no one can detect where this train must go.

So on that note, hon House Chair, we are actually operating in an illegal Sitting that is leaderless. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya.

The next speaker is the hon member Maseko.

Ms M L MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon House Chair. [Interjections.]

Hon House Chair, I just want to assist a little bit before I start with my debate for informing the hon members from the Opposition that the Secretary has always been accountable to the House. It is not the DA thing, it is the Rules, and the second one that was mentioned on the Standing Rules 26, it says:

"Whenever the Speaker is absent or otherwise unable to perform the functions of the Office of the Speaker, or whenever that office is vacant:

(a) The Deputy Speaker or if there is no Deputy Speaker, a temporary presiding officer designated by resolution of the House act as presiding officer."

I just said I will contribute to give for free that info, but, hon House Chair, I would like to start this speech today for this House to remember and celebrate the life and contributions of our DA late Chief Whip, Lorraine Botha.

Lorraine was a phenomenal force within this Chamber. She was quite dignified and strong in her leadership. Her dedication to serving the people of this province and her non-partisan approach, continues to set an example for all of us. Lorraine's unwavering advocacy for the amplification of issues that impact the most vulnerable within this province, will always serve as a source of inspiration to me and to all of us. This is because she demonstrated through her actions every day that our roles as members of this House went beyond day-to-day and that our responsibilities are to ensure that oversight leads to real tangible change in people's lives.

Hon members, I call on you today to remember that legacy of Lorraine as we debated this Vote and to engage and bring inputs that are ultimately for the

betterment of this province and his people.

Hon House Chair, this evening we debate Vote 2 of the Adjustment Appropriation Budget. The Provincial Parliament received an additional allocation of more than R10,5 million over the medium-term budget period. This is a 6,5% increase in the R176,5 million Main Budget for the 2022/2023 financial year.

While this adjusted allocation is welcomed, we must ensure that these funds are utilised in a manner that will maximise this House's ability to perform effective oversight in the interests of the residents and ensures maximum public participation and its processes. The Provincial Parliament's vision is to be regarded as a leading and exemplary Legislature in South Africa and South African region.

In order to achieve this more still needs to be done to ensure that this Parliament works at its most efficient and effective to serve the best interest of the people of Western Cape.

It is also at this point, hon House Chair, that I want to thank the staff of WCPP for their hard work and contributions as we labour to take this Legislature from strength to strength. We acknowledge your support, guidance and dedication.

The Adjusted Allocations per programme will see approximately R5 million towards Governance and Administration. R2,12 million towards Parliamentary Support Services; R3,23 million towards Public Engagement and R285 000 towards Members' Support. [Interjections.]

I want to focus particularly on the Parliamentary Support and Public Engagement Programmes. As members of this House we have an important role as elected public representatives [Interjections.] to ensure that we duly perform oversight of Western Cape Provincial Government and to represent our constituents in the workings of the Provincial Parliament and legislation tabled before it.

So too does the WCPP have an important role in enabling an environment where the nuts and bolts of its operations run effectively to empower this Legislature to become a true Parliament of the people. [Interjections.] Collectively we must ensure that the voice of the people is heard here [Interjections.] in this House.

I am going to repeat that. Collectively we must ensure that the voice of the people is heard in this House [Interjections.], especially when we deal with critical legislation which has a direct impact on their lives. This Provincial Parliament must simply do better in bringing Western Cape communities along during the deliberation and amendment of legislations. There has to be a concerted effort to ensure that as many residents as possible have an opportunity to give their input into the legislative process, be it in person, in writing or via digital representations.

I therefore note the efforts of the WCPP administration to get the ball rolling on

the oversight and public participation front. [Interjections.] Having already spent 46,17% of their R25,958 million adjusted budget for Programme 2, Parliamentary Support Services with the WCPP's projected expenditure in the last two quarters of the 2022/2023 financial year will include, among others, public hearings and oversight visits, provision of Standing Committee meetings, the continuation of the Hansard translation and transcription services, filling of vacant posts and payments for interpreting and sign language services. [Interjections.]

In terms of Programme 3 public engagement, 41,42% of the R17,459 million adjusted budget for this programme has been spent. During the second half of the 2022/2023 financial year the projected expenditure for this programme will, include among others, filling of vacant posts, provision of public education and outreach programmes, and the finalisation of the WCPP's digital online platform. [Interjections.]

The Parliamentary Oversight Committee has throughout this Sixth Parliament deliberated at length the need for greater community outreach and oversight via committees, the need for greater public participation within legislative processes and the necessity of a full staff complement to boost efficiency. This expenditure can therefore go a long way in addressing this contents as the WCPP prepares for the new parliamentary year in 2023.

During the various international study tours undertaken by the members this year, a number of crucial lessons were taken away in regard to strengthening parliamentary oversight and public engagement, for example, in an effort to optimise public participation, the Welsh Parliament established a body called "The Citizens Assembly". This body seeks to encourage engagement with the Legislature through a strategically selected microcosm of their diverse constituencies.

There were also important take-aways from the Scottish Parliament regarding the management of petitions via its digital programme and during the Australian study tour we were once again reminded about the importance of Parliament engaging the public in decision-making [Interjections], as well as practical guidance in understanding one's audience when engaging in their public participation. [Interjections.]

Now it is time to implement some of these lessons in order to create a more efficient Provincial Parliament. This will require buy-in not just from the Provincial Parliament that is Administration, but also from us as members from across the political divide.

Hon members, I think we can all agree that when we are divided, chaos and disruptions are the order of the day [Interjections.], but when we work together and cooperate the work of this Provincial Parliament continues without interruption.

In that breath I would like to take this moment to commend the members of this Committee for their cooperation and input. While we do not always agree, we should always endeavour to strive above petty political point scoring and for the

most part this Committee has always remained consistent in wanting the WCPP to be a world class Legislature with bite and who acts without fear or favour. [Interjections.]

Effective oversight requires political will from both Government and all the political parties represented in this Legislature. I want again to thank the staff of WCPP, those that we see and those who are in the offices that we do not see their faces [Interjections.], the leadership in the WCPP and Secretary that always, always is there to advise when needed and also to thank the Deputy Speaker for being here with us.

It is with this in mind that I urge my colleagues from across the House to support the Vote 2 of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. [Interjections.] I thank you, hon House Chair. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you! [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon ... you have had your opportunity.

Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] No-no ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjections.] ... thank you, hon House Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Just a moment. Please, hon members. Is that a point of order? What is your point of order, hon member Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Chair, is it parliamentary to say that the Speaker, the previous Speaker was a tati-nati? [Interjections.] A tati-nati. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon member Bosman ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is it parliamentary language, is that your question?

Mr P MARRAN: Yes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: It is, thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: It is parliamentary to ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Huh?

Mr P MARRAN: Huh?

An HON MEMBER: Huh? What [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Please take your seat. Tati-

nati, thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you.

Thank you, hon member, please, we have done well. We are at the last speaker. [Interjections.] Hon member Marran? Thank you, hon member Marran. Please. Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson.

I wish to thank all members who have participated in this debate. I note all your contributions made by each and every one of you as members, your criticisms, your praise and the oversight work that you do for this Parliament and for the people of this province. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon members, that concludes the business for the day. [Interjections.] The Secretary will end the meeting and all members will be exited from this Sitting. The House is adjourned. Thank you. See you on Monday.

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS**

FRIDAY, 2 DECEMBER 2022

### **TABLINGS**

The Secretary:

#### **1. Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety**

##### **Western Cape Liquor Authority: Submission of the in-year amendments to the Annual Performance Plan for 2022/23:**

Annexure A and B: Six (6) amendments to performance indicators, inclusive of the technical indicator descriptions: Two (2) indicators for the Liquor Licensing Tribunal (LLT) and one (1) indicator for Compliance and Enforcement (CE) were added; two (2) indicators were removed from CE; and one (1) indicator target was increased for CE.

#### **2. Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities**

##### **(a) Saldanha Bay IDZ Licencing Company SOC Ltd (SBIDZ-LC) trading as Freeport Saldanha: Submission of the in-year amendments to the Corporate Plan for 2022/23:**

Annexure A: Changes have been made to the following indicators: 1.1, 1.2 and 1.3 (p 59) and 12 (p 75).

##### **(b) Western Cape Tourism, Trade and Investment Promotion Agency (Wesgro): Submission of the in-year changes to the Strategic Plan for 2020–2025:**

Changes have been made in Part A: 1.1 Vision (p 11) and 1.2

Mission (p 11); Part C: 3.1 Institutional performance information (p 33), List of outcome indicators (p 34) and Strategic outcomes table (p 35 and p 37); and Part D: 4.1–4.8.

**3. Minister of Infrastructure**

**Department of Human Settlements: Submission of the in-year changes to the Annual Performance Plan for 2022/23:**

Changes have been made to the following indicators: 2.5 (p 47), 2.9 (p 48), 3.1 (p 59), 3.3, 3.5 and 3.6 (p 60), 3.8 (p 61), 4.2, 4.3, 4.4 and 4.5 (p 70).

Copies attached.

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT**

---

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams.]

The House met at 10:00

The Temporary Chairperson took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 6730**

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

MONDAY, 5 DECEMBER 2022

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated.

Hon members, I would just like to, for nothing, thank Mr Charles Breda today, who has been here for 36 years and will be retiring this year, so thank you Mr Charles Breda for all the work you did. [Applause.]

Thank you very much. Order, members. Let me – just give me a second.

Before we proceed I would just like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. Good morning, to everybody here, to all our members online and to our guests out in the gallery. I am not going to go through too much of the logistics. You do know that your audio and visual needs to be clear if you are online, and this is a hybrid sitting. We also know that the media had been granted access and that any members of the public or the media, please to not interject or have any comments or switch on your microphones or video cameras during this Sitting, and hon members are reminded that no interjections are permitted during the hybrid Sittings in terms of Rule 40 of the Standing Rules.

I now recognise the hon Baartman.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 18 the hours of Sitting for Monday, 5 December 2022, today, shall be ten o'clock until adjournment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any objections? No objections? Agreed to.

I recognise the hon Baartman.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 163, the House considers the Principle and Finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3–2022] on Monday, 5 December 2022, today.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to.

Thank you very much. I now recognise the Leader of the Opposition, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker, also good morning to all the hon members.

Deputy Speaker, I just seek your guidance. You would be aware that the motion that was moved on Friday now appears below the line. What I would like to ask just in terms of proceeding with this particular motion, is whether the Secretary of the Legislature – we understand from the ATC that the membership of the former Speaker has ended, but firstly, can we just clarify to the House whether a vacancy has in fact been declared, number one, and secondly, given the resolution that was passed last week around the Secretary dealing with all matters which may potentially involve of litigation, whether there has been any further update, any further information received by the Secretary? I think those are all important things to clarify before we consider how to process this motion, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. So first, remember, this motion is below the line. First in terms of process, you need to request precedence. We cannot discuss anything while it is below the line. So if you want this above the line, you need to request that to me now on the record.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, I understand that, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot answer.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, Deputy Speaker, I understand that, but what I am saying is that this particular motion is based on certain information that we had on Friday. So what I am seeking clarity on is whether a vacancy has in fact been declared or not, and whether, as per our resolution on Friday, there is any new information that this House needs to be made aware of. So I would like clarity on those questions, before moving that this motion is lifted to above the line.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, so as the Presiding Officer I can only deal with

two matters. I am sure you could get that answer once you have moved it above the line, but I can only approve or disapprove above the line, and then I can only approve or disapprove of it then moving towards a potential vote. It is correct procedure, and I can only focus on those two, unfortunately, hon Dugmore, I cannot make any assumptions of information, which is not in my mandate as a Presiding Officer.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, Speaker, I do want to move in terms of our Rules that this motion is placed above the line, but I would like to request that if the Table, as constituted today, can provide that information or, if not, then the Secretary of the Legislature briefs this House before we proceed with the motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, we can only do two things, until then nothing can happen. There are hundreds of motions below the line. You have to follow that process, if you want to get to the point you want to get to.

(Motion)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, I move in terms of our Rules that this motion is lifted above the line.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved above the line?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are no objections. Agreed to.

I now recognise the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, in terms of discussing this particular motion, which, as you know, clearly resolves to mandate the Secretary of the Legislature to make contact with the President of the Constitutional Court and ask the Constitutional Court President to delegate a Judge. Sorry?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Dugmore. Can I ask you to read the motion into the Paper, please?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja, I will do that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before any comments, so that for the record it is there.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Okay, I think it is all on the hon members' Order Paper.

(Motion)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, noting the ATC published on 1 December 2022, stating the former Speaker, Mr Masizole Mngqasela is no longer a member of his political party, and thus no longer a member of this House, resulting in a vacancy in the position of Speaker, and further noting that Section 20 of the Provincial Constitution requires that the Provincial Legislature must fill a vacancy, and believing that the Legislature cannot operate without a Speaker, that this House resolves to mandate the Secretary of the Legislature to make contact with the President of the Constitutional Court, as per Section 20(2) of the Provincial Constitution, to designate a Judge to oversee the election of a new Speaker by no later than next week.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. So you are moving that in your name?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, that is correct.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, and you may address.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But, as I am saying, Speaker, for the purposes of the debate on this motion, we need to be empowered as this House. We have passed a resolution, which delegated the authority to deal with matters of litigation to the Secretary. I think it is not practical; it is not possible or desirable for us to proceed and deal with a motion like this unless this House is provided with full information.

I think it would be a serious dereliction of duty if we proceeded with a motion like this and yet certain information is withheld from this particular House, so that is the request that I would like to make.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. So in terms of the process again, the motion has now been moved on the Order Paper above the line. We have to now afford parties declaration of three minutes and a vote. That has to come through. I cannot stop it for some information that might be or might not be here. We are voting on the fact that you have brought the motion above the line, and that has to go to the vote. Thereafter you can proceed with further information, but I cannot stop the process in terms of the motion itself, because remember, it is a vote.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, I would like to have to express a view on this, I think it is against the Code of Conduct of members of this Legislature and staff, who have access to certain information to not share it with this House, and I think that it is not acceptable that members are asked to speak on a matter, and which we have now agreed to do, without this House being provided with the information, and, if that information is not provided, you are aware that there is a Rule which allows the mover of that motion to withdraw the motion?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I would like to ask if you could indicate to this House, and, even if we have to have an adjournment and you can engage with the Speaker or the Legal Adviser, anyone who may or

may not have received correspondence, so that we can go into this discussion with full information. So, I am asking you, Deputy Speaker, to consider that request and also consider an adjournment if you need to consult about whether or not there is information, I have asked, has a vacancy formally been declared? I have asked, is there any other correspondence which has been provided?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, could I? It is not a point of order. Could I then just request that we have at least a five-minute adjournment before we resume with the Sitting also just for parties to consult each other. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let me just check. Hon Baartman, Acting Chief Whip?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, in terms of Rule 20 of this House, we have brought a Notice of Motion above the line as moved in the name of the Leader of the Opposition in terms of Notice of Motion Rules, in terms of Rule 151.

The motion has thus been moved after that when the Leader of the Opposition read it into the record. The Rules of the House now dictates that we actually need to decide on this motion. Should political parties wish to make a declaration on this motion, obviously that is for the House, but we actually need to now vote in terms of the Rules of this House on this particular motion. To my knowledge, the information was in the tabling, as is indicated in this Notice of Motion on 1 December 2022, and if there was any new information, I have not seen it in a subsequent tabling, but legally, the House has already moved the motion and now this House must decide upon that matter. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, can I just – if you could indulge with me for a second. Do you want the five-minute break to consult with your party on the process? I cannot entertain on knowledge, if that is okay. I will grant you that five-minute break and if we can then come back and vote. Thank you. The House is suspended for five minutes.

Business of the House is suspended at 10:15 and resumed at 10:23.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If we can make our way. You may be seated. Hon members, am I able to proceed with the three-minute declarations, hon Dugmore, in order to follow the process?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja, thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, it is clear that we are here today discussing this motion because of deep and serious factional divisions within the DA. That is why we are here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We have an unprecedented situation where the Leader of the Executive, the Premier of this Province, has given an instruction to the former Speaker to actually vacate his position. In the first place that is a classic breach of the separation of powers. So we have a Premier who, in fact, we believe, has breached his Code of Ethics because he has interfered directly in a matter of the Legislature. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Secondly, we notice the trend in the DA that if you do not happen to be white, if you are African or Coloured you tend to be dealt with in a certain way, and we have many examples of that... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...where Mayors of Saldanha, Mayco members... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members, can we allow everyone... [Interjection.] One minute, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Mayco members of the City of Cape Town... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Dugmore, just have a seat, I just need to retain order. Hon members, everyone is going to have... [Interjections.] Hon members, please can I have our attention, hon Kama! [Interjections.] If I can just please get through this. It is three minutes, everyone is afforded three minutes, so let us allow hon Dugmore his three-minute right, as everybody else will. Hon Dugmore, you may proceed.

Mr P MARRAN: How many minutes left?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [microphone off] ...interest of justice and that is why the DA is perceived out there as a party of the elite and a party that actually undermines the interest of the rule being that ... [Inaudible.] ...so that is a matter of record. Interference by the Premier, breach of trust, racism, kangaroo courts within the DA, and these are the issues which have actually affected this Legislature.

That is why we believe it is absolutely critical for a formal vacancy to be declared, and then the election of the Speaker to proceed. The problem, however, is and I want to place it on record... [Microphone on] ...that we have asked, through you, Deputy Speaker, and the Table, to provide us with information. If it should emerge that information was withheld from this House, then there is going to be serious consequences, because that questions the very integrity of the Deputy Speaker and of the staff of this Legislature, if they –

because we know we passed a resolution mandating the Secretary to inform us.

The Secretary is not here today, he is not here in front of us, which is a serious problem, because then party matters are being placed above the interests of this Legislature, so from our point of view, for the sake of stability in this House, for the sake of actually making sure that we follow our Constitution, and that we follow the provisions thereof that we need to move towards the election of a Speaker to fill the vacancy that exists, but, what is happening here, the chaos that has been caused in this Legislature without any due process, in regard to the Speaker, lies at the door of the Democratic Alliance. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. I now recognise – I am just going to say, Al Jama-ah, would you like to make a declaration?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, all parties? [Inaudible discussion aside.] Yes, would you like to make a declaration?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, thank you for the opportunity. Hon Deputy Speaker, yes, it is very important for the business of this House that when we continue or if we continue with any business from today, from this morning, that it is – first of all it is very difficult for us to proceed with any business without a Speaker, and when it comes to the powers of the Speaker, those powers are so decisive and so important that it is virtually impossible for us to continue with any business of the House.

When it comes to yourself, hon Deputy Speaker, you are the Deputy Speaker, and whenever the Speaker is not in the House, then you are fulfilling that role, but that does not give you the same powers, the exact same powers as the Speaker itself, so on behalf of the Al Jama-ah, we also want to make a plea to the House on this beautiful Monday morning that, before we proceed with any of the business of the WCPP going forward, that if we can by all means complete the process of electing a Speaker. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise GOOD. Are you online?

Mr S N AUGUST: Morning, Deputy Speaker, and everybody else. No declarations. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I note by written correspondence that the EFF is not online today. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I do not want to play political games with this. This is an important debate, but for the ACDP it is important to bring back some stability and also bring back what is best for the Provincial Parliament, and it is a new for us, the first time that we are sitting without a Speaker, and, of course, you know, like Al Jama-ah said now, that there are certain roles and responsibilities that are done

by the Speaker that cannot be done by the Deputy Speaker, so I would also ask that we look at how soon can we get the election of a Speaker or what is the interim measure in order to bring stability?

I see what we see, we see in the media, and what we saw the other day in the House, that we do not have a Speaker and the problems that we have, but I do not think, just from my side, I do not think there is – I think business can continue, but the uncertainty without a Speaker is problematic and I would want us to make from the ACDP's side a decision what is best for Provincial Parliament and not make a political game out of this. So that is my request, Deputy Speaker, that we think rationally, and that we think of the people of the Western Cape. They look to this Legislature to give guidance and direction and if we can assure that there is stability, that there is progress in electing a Speaker, then I think we have done well, because remember also now we are going in recess, and I do not think it is good thing to have a recess and come back next year with not a Speaker elected. So that is all from the ACDP's side. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Makamba-Botya, I see even though that I have received correspondence, you are online. Would you like to make a declaration?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, my apologies for that. In fact with the EFF, we are actually in support with the sentiments of the Leader of the Opposition Party. It is clear, Deputy Speaker, that the DA is actually botching the processes and dragging us into their squabbles without following the due processes of the Parliament. So, with that being said, with the EFF, we are also in support of what the ANC is saying, that we need this House to follow the processes and take us into confidence pertaining to this issue. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much to you, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Can you tell us... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What happened to the Leader of Government Business?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, remember, declarations can be done by any member of the House. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...even the Premier, interfering in the... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is a democratic member, hon members, remember we gave everybody an opportunity of three minutes. Sorry, Premier.

Mr P MARRAN: The same person who asked the Speaker to resign.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no-no, no, can we just – remember we are following due process. The Democratic Alliance has the right to select anybody to speak on their behalf. I now recognise... [Interjections.] No-no!

Mr P MARRAN: I am just saying.

Mr A LILI: Even the Premier?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, he is a member of this House, so I would like to proceed. Hon Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. First of all, I rise specifically to counter a point made by the Leader of Opposition saying that “the Premier in this case”, and in actual fact, I did receive the whistleblowers’ accounts... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is it? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.] Order, members!

The PREMIER: I did receive the whistleblowers’ accounts and I did receive the request for protected disclosure. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can sit, Premier. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is the hon – I am not sure whether he is speaking as the Premier or the Leader of the DA caucus. Is he willing to take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This is a declaration, hon Sayed, this is not a debate. [Interjections.] Hon members, can I just remind you about the Rules, this is a declaration. [Interjections.]

Hon Nkondlo! This is a declaration, not a debate, so remember there are no opportunities for questions. The DA can do their three-minute declaration and there cannot be interjections around what he is saying. You may stand up, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. The ANC must know, they brought the motion, they need to at least listen. So, first of all, I received a protected disclosure with allegations of serious corruption and misconduct. I informed the whistleblowers that as the Premier, I could not act. [Interjections.] If they would only just listen! As the Premier I could not act because there is a separation of power. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: What I did do, was, I said to them that I will, as the caucus leader, engage with the Speaker, which I did do, I gave him the detail. [Interjections.] But, I also said to the Speaker that I am obliged to hand this information to the police, which the DA did do, number 1. Number 2, it is impossible for whistleblowers within an organisation to ask for a protected disclosure and then for me to hand those very documents to the organisation of which the person that they are accusing sits at the head. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Please listen to what I have just said. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.] Members, hon Sayed, can you just please, we have to allow the three-minute declarations, right?

The PREMIER: This is absolutely not a joke!

Mr P MARRAN: Premier, did you ask the Speaker to resign? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, members!

The PREMIER: Our country is dealing with very serious issues at all levels, and we have to follow due process. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You did not follow due process.

The PREMIER: I did follow exactly due process.

Mr P MARRAN: Leave the country and speak about the Province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The PREMIER: And so, I want to say, Madam Deputy Speaker, that it was handed to the Hawks and they are busy with their investigation. [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Now allow the Hawks to finish their investigation.

The PREMIER: But I will also say to this House...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Is that the whistleblowers will agree or have agreed that we can hand the documents now... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Order, members!

The PREMIER: I wish they would listen!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! I think this is in your interest, if you are just listening, so if we can just hear this member of this House. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The whistleblowers have now agreed that I can actually hand the documents to the Secretary. The record will show that the Secretary has asked me on a number of occasions whether the whistleblowers will provide this Parliament with those documents. They have said no, but now there was a change, and so therefore, Madam Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank the hon Dugmore for bringing this motion to the House. I would like to thank the Al Jama-ah, ACDP and EFF for supporting this motion, and we will also support the motion. We will ask that, in actual fact it will be wonderful if it could happen today. Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, and just, hon members, before we go into any further deliberations on this, the Premier is quite correct, he has handed the information to the Secretary and the Secretary must deal with that. It is not for this Sitting, for us to deliberate on any of those reports. I now understand that there were no objections and that this motion has been agreed to formally in the House and this motion now belongs to the House and the process regarding this motion will continue and will follow through the Administration.

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move over to the Orders of the day. Mr Stemele, would you like to please read the first Order of the Day?

### **1. Debate on Vote 6 – Health – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Stemele. I now recognise the hon Minister Mbombo.

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!  
[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, Premier, the members of the House, thank you very much for this opportunity. Deputy Speaker, I rise tabling the Appropriation Adjustment of R29,095 billion from the R29,094 billion that was the Main Appropriation, which is the additional of R702 000. That makes it 0,002% of the total Budget. It is the first time that I even appropriate something of less than not only one million even, such less. Therefore, Deputy Speaker, I just want to be brief in regard to that.

Last week I did show how health, a healthy economy and a healthy population impacts on health. I also did show how unemployment, how poverty, how the inequalities, which are affecting the country, do impact on the socio-economic ills that ended up being absorbed by Health and become health problems. I did mention that our response is, when we say health is everybody's business, we

have to fight against all of these as part of the whole-of-the-society approach, because social determinants of Health are what what we actually see in our health facilities. People go to the facilities, because they have been impacted economically, not necessarily in terms of their behaviour. That is the research that is there. Almost more than 50% of the environment related to social economic and lesser physical aspects, and also as the individual impacts on health.

Now, Deputy Speaker, what is the response, that is what I am presenting today. The National response is that they dropped, they reduced our Equitable Share in response to what I just alluded to. In the next MTEF we have a reduction of more than a billion rand. Actually, it takes us even back to pre-pandemic, if you look at what is going to happen even from the following year. The response from National, it is about they have not resolved the wage bill, which they made a promise for three years ago, and now we are sitting in a situation of where the provinces, including us, have to do whatever we could do in order to be able to pay the monies related to the salary increase, which is for fairness and also for the justification about the healthcare workers specifically, even including other public services. They are the ones who have been at the forefront during the pandemic. So it is unfair that they cannot be able to get the raise, but unfortunately it means that that money must come from the provinces. There is no new money.

Also, Deputy Speaker, in terms of the National response, the Province is also penalised for trying to de-escalate some of the services and to create a wellness hub, so that people could be able to have what we call Health on Wheels, where we take Vaxi Taxis at the taxi rank, and we bring services anywhere in the community halls, where people reside, like there are not only the packages of medicines, but also some other services under one roof anywhere, but now they want to give us money per headcount at the facilities. That is the response that we are getting, and what I said.

Now, what is our response at the provincial level? At the provincial level, the research is on revisiting the whole of the service redesign to make sure that we are still responsive, where we are saying that we need to provide the right care at the right time in the right place, also at the right price.

Also, we aspire to become a health system that is people-centric, trusted, equitable toward a healthy society and also to do it at a local level to enable our local managers also to be an enabler, and also that we have reached out because we want to strengthen the partnership with academics, with the private sector, with the traditional practitioners, with everyone, so that we could be able to fulfil the approach that health is everybody's business. It is part of that, and, Deputy Speaker, you may recall that at the beginning of the year we made a promise, which we did fulfil in trying to fast-track the surgical backlogs, mental health, and also we even undertook the Violence Prevention Unit as part of the wellness health agenda, and also the journey.

In response to the Wage Bill, Deputy Speaker, the monies that were provided for this year, which includes the monies for COVID, we made sure we take that R385 million to put it there, because remember, the 3% that you have to make

sure we pay the Wage Bill, there is no new money. So what I am appropriating, there is no new money that is coming from anywhere. It means that we have to dala whatever we must within our own Budget. So we have put now that 385 there so that when now there is a finalisation of the increase in terms of the 3% Wage Bill, we could be able to pay our workers.

Also, we took some of the money and added more to other hospitals like Khayelitsha and Paarl, because they have a high level of pressure. Remember, Deputy Speaker, people are unemployed; socio-economic ills and everything else contribute to the health problem. Also, Deputy Speaker, the infrastructure money specifically for the Catalytic Project, like Tygerberg, we have ring-fenced it and put it there in a

ring-fenced fund so that we do have a commitment that by, whether 2028 or 2030, we could be able - especially for the one that has to do with the PPP - to have that money when actually it is required out there. Deputy Speaker, in regard to our staff, we have made sure that the Occupational Health and everything related to the wellness are there, so, Deputy Speaker, having said that, with a 0,002% of the Appropriation that I am tabling, that money covers the rollovers of about R97 million and also the internal shifts going to the various departments, specifically the Department of the Premier and related to the IT infrastructure, because we have to continue with IT, as we have seen, especially in regard to the Dashboard, the Unique Patient Identifier and so forth, and then also the other one to the public works, and also other adjustments are related to the realignment of our Provincial Budget, and also the shifting of the other funds and the rollovers in regard to that, so, Deputy Speaker, having said that, I have tabled, as I indicated, that with a 0,00,2% of the Adjustment, I have to speak 0,00,2. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the ANC I rise to reject this budget. Today is day 11 of the 16 Days of Activism for Non-violence against Women and Children. Let us join efforts to end the scourge of GBV and femicide, both in the province and nation at large.

The Police Minister, Bheki Cele, recently stated that between July and September 2022 over 13 000 women fell victim of assault, 1 277 women were victims of attempted murder, 989 women were murdered, and over 10 000... [Interjection.] Listen! Ja, 10 000 rape cases were opened with SAPS. The Western Cape has increased by 23,6% for sexual offences, including 1 233 rape cases and 432 sexual assault cases.

Deputy Speaker, in response to this crisis the Premier, with much fanfare, announced the establishment of a first for South Africa, a Violence Prevention Unit, to be established in the Western Cape Department of Health.

In a written reply to my question about the core function and budget of this Programme, the Minister answered:

“The Unit was intended to have three main roles, and that R10 million was allocated to it for this financial year.”

Through these Adjustments Budget Estimates, R7,4 million of the Violence Prevention Unit was not spent as a result of the job evaluation process; not finalised and, I suppose, it will be sent back to the Revenue Fund. Remember, Deputy Speaker, the social ills, but the money was not spent. Why was the money not spent, and when will this unit start functioning? This level of complacency is completely unacceptable.

Deputy Speaker, DA complacency in the Western Cape is also exposing the failure of the Department to spend funds allocated for rebuilding of the G F Jooste Hospital. At this rate it is clear that the most needed Regional Hospital to cater for the Klipfontein Region will be completed after 2050.

One question on my mind, Deputy Speaker, is for how long will our Public Healthcare Centres, such as the Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain District Hospitals, be able to cope with the added service pressures due to the closure of the G F Jooste Hospital?

Deputy Speaker, the Standing Committee embarked on an unannounced visit to the two hospitals a few months ago and we saw for ourselves the horrible conditions at these hospitals. While I do not want to belabour this point, so I will focus on the central themes that came out of the visit.

Firstly, there is a persistent challenge with the referral system as patients who are supposed to be referred to Lenteguur, Valkenberg and the Tygerberg Hospitals, end up staying for longer at these hospitals due to shortages of beds in the referral hospitals.

Secondly, there are severe bed shortages as both hospitals operate at about their bed capacity. Mitchells Plain has 260 beds, but frequently accommodates 395 patients. Khayelitsha has 350 beds, and frequently accommodates close to 450 patients. Both hospitals are Level 1 and, yet, they are forced to take up Level 2 functions that are not funded.

Thirdly, there are severe staff shortages. Khayelitsha has 300 unfunded positions and another complaint that was raised sharply by the KDH management was for the two hospitals to be treated equally. KDH only has 650 staff members while Mitchells Plain District Hospital has 800 staff. Perhaps when the MEC replies she can shed some light on how the staff complements are determined.

Deputy Speaker, the Mitchells Plain District Hospital management said it needed R300 million to address its challenges, while KDH requested R150 million. There was also a request for the Department to review the levels of Mitchells Plain Hospital to a Regional Hospital.

In a written reply to my question how the Adjustment Budget will respond to these challenges, the Minister said: "KDH would only be allocated an additional R26,6 million while Mitchells Plain will only receive R2,4 million. Ceres Hospital, despite all its challenges, will only receive R1,5 million. It is evident from the above that this Provincial Government does not care. Its refusal to address these challenges further exposed the DA's complacency and because of that

we should correctly call it the Budget of Complacency.

The same complacency can be found at the Paarl Hospital. We recently visited the Paarl Hospital where a patient has to wait 11 hours to be assisted. The hospital is supposed to have three porters, but they are never there, and instead the security personnel are doing the work of porters.

I picked up a similar challenge during my visit to Willa Clinic in Villiersdorp where the community is very happy for the new clinic, but they raised their concern. The concern that they raised to me was about the two doctors who only come twice a week for eight-hour shifts, and there is a huge backlog of files that have to be signed off by doctors before patients can be prescribed medication. Many patients do not have medication as we speak now, due to this challenge. One sister at the Clinic said:

† “As dinge nie dringend gaan verander nie, gaan ons baie pasiënte verloor, dit wil sê pasiënte kan sterf.” [If things are not going to change urgently, we are going to lose many patients, in other words, patients can die.]

Because they are without medication.

†n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: In closing, I wish to commend health stakeholders, including the TAC residents in Mitchells Plain and other communities for successfully blocking the closure of the Metro Clinics. The decision was a victory to the people of the Metro. It is, however, disappointing that the R56,8 million Infrastructure Budget for Community Health Facilities has been cut from this budget. This money should have been used to build waiting areas for patients that start queuing in the wee hours of the morning outside these facilities. The ANC therefore correctly rejects this budget for complacency. We reject the reduction in the Tygerberg Hospital, capital and maintenance infrastructure funding. The ANC rejects the DA complacency, and we are disappointed, yet again. No allocation is made towards building the Wall of Remembrance for all the departed healthcare workers as a result of COVID-19. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I note that hon Xego is not in the House. I will then move over to the Democratic Alliance, hon Kaizer-Philander.

Me W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: †Goeie more, baie dankie, agbare Adjunkspeaker. [Good morning, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.] Premier, Leader of the Opposition, hon members, and most of all the residents of the Western Cape.

Before I begin with my debate speech, I would like to categorically state that the DA supports the adjusted allocation of R29,095 billion to Vote 6, which represents an increase of R702 000 from the 2022/23 Main Budget. While this is a marginal addition, we know that the Department continues to provide quality healthcare to all living in our beautiful province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this is a budget that upholds the Constitution. In Section 27(1) it states that:

- (a) Everyone has the right to have access to healthcare services, including reproductive healthcare;
- (b) Sufficient food and water; and
- (c) Social security, including if they are unable to support themselves and their dependents with the appropriate assistance.

Deputy Speaker, however, given the current crisis in South Africa, we have seen high and rising levels of unemployment, causing our residents to become poorer by the day, which has been completely aggravated by a constrained fiscal climate. We see families are finding it increasingly difficult, more and more to sustain themselves due to the rising cost of living. We see graduates standing on the street corners because they are unable to find a job.

Hon Deputy Speaker, these are some of the factors that hugely impact on the overall wellbeing and health of our citizens. It is this situation that we should view and debate this Budget in. Despite these worsening economic conditions, we see a Department that is doing its absolute best to ensure that services continue unhindered. The fact that members on the other side of the House have chosen to turn a blind eye to this, speaks volumes.

Hon Deputy Speaker, through you, all that we have heard since last Thursday, is cheap politicking against the Western Cape Government, when in actual fact, this is the only province in South Africa that continues to outperform expectations, and the only province that truly gets things done.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: That does mean not everything is perfect, but we need to be honest, in that respect. At the National Health Department's briefing where the budgetary cuts were outlined, it was made apparent that there would be an impact on the delivery of infrastructure projects, due to the limited funding, through you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I fail to understand why member Windvogel did not take up these budget cuts with her national comrades, instead of insinuating that the Provincial Department is unable to deliver, which of course is not true. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It shows that... [Interjections.]

Ms W KAIZER-PHILANDER: May I be protected, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order, members!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Instead of insinuating that the Provincial Department is unable to deliver, which, of course, is not true. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a fact.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Healthcare funding concerns are increasing, but what does the ANC care, and while our focus is that of the Western Cape, one cannot deny the truth that the worsening budgetary constraints are a result of the corrupt ANC National Government.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC really has no shame. They sit here while their comrades in Pretoria have changed the Provincial Equitable Share formula for health. As a result, it means that there will be even less money going forward. This while failed SOEs get perpetual bailouts.

Hon Deputy Speaker, maybe we would have received more money if the Department's name ended in Soc Limited. [Laughter.] Despite the ANC's wilful ignorance, the Provincial Equitable Share for Vote 6 has been reduced by R63 430 000 and this was due to R7,4 million from in-year saving in the Violence Prevention Unit with an additional R28,5 million in infrastructure funding and 27,4 from Tygerberg Hospital's capital and infrastructure funding being redirected for the co-payment obligation in respect of the building of the new Tygerberg Central Hospital.

In spite of this, our fiscal prudence and responsiveness have meant that we have mitigated the financial pressures being placed on the Western Cape as far as possible. This is because the Department has been able to use its rollovers from the previous financial year to smooth the expenditure before next year's Main Budget.

Throughout this year, the Department has successfully protected our healthcare facilities against loadshedding by procuring extra diesel and collaborating with Eskom and the City of Cape Town. Additionally, extra capacity has been sought through procuring inverters and UPSes at smaller facilities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, let me remind the House that irrespective of how bad the Opposition wants to portray this Department, this is the only Health Department in South Africa to have ever achieved a fourth consecutive clean audit outcome. [Interjections.] [Applause]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, we are hopeful for all our people, no matter where you reside, political will needs to exist in order to realise the change. This is why the Western Cape Department of Health and Wellness has adopted a reset strategy where health is everybody's business. The Minister on Thursday spoke to the reform occurring in three main categories to further this ideal, namely that in the service platform governance and public policy, we saw an example of this approach being successful. Recently the Hospital and Emergency Centre, Tracking Innovation Information System (HECTIS), has won the overall Innovation Award at the Innovative Award Ceremony for 2022.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in the Western Cape the political will to change people's lives for the better exists and the Standing Committee has seen it. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is a fallacy.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: You have not been that often, hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, at the Khayelitsha District Hospital, despite pressures, it delivers more... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Order, members! You may proceed.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. At the Khayelitsha District Hospital, despite pressures, it delivers more, more than what is mandated. A hospital that was originally established 10 years ago, has more than doubled the number of its specialists. [Interjections.]

In the coming year, we look forward to the 30-bed extension to be completed for its psychiatric ward which will significantly relieve the current pressures. We need to be honest and bold when we say that Khayelitsha District Hospital will be able to cope.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as part of our oversight mandate, we also visited the Ceres Hospital, where the population is more than 146 000 and is supplemented by the migration of seasonal workers. The community also has a burden of diseases relating to trauma, violence, HIV/Aids, TB, chronic diseases, as well as mental health issues stemming from substance abuse due to Tik and alcohol. Yet, as a proactive Department, the following interventions were implemented:

- A second family physician and assistant primary healthcare manager were appointed with TB nursing staff at clinics and a sessional doctor to support chronic care patients.
- NGO support is provided to the TB and HIV patients.
- Community oriented healthcare was furthered with the Du Toit Public / Private Partnership;
- And we saw the revision of the relevant mobile services routes.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we acknowledge that in the light of the challenges, that the Department has indeed taken welcome steps to ensure quality healthcare. It is clear that our hospitals are the frontline responses to all societal ills in our communities.

During our Standing Committee briefing with the Department, as well as the Department of Social Development, we want you to understand the roles that each stakeholder plays and the collaboration between different departments in providing mental health services. We have also scheduled to meet with the Department of Justice, with SAPS and other stakeholder departments so that we can further determine how National Government functions also impact mental health and psychiatric services within the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, one in ten people are in emergency centres due to interpersonal violence. This furthers the fact that there are immense pressures on our facilities, including the impact of crime. Our facilities in the Western Cape absorb cases of violence, substance abuse, criminality, and other societal ills, whose root causes are beyond the control of the healthcare system. This means we truly need to expand our whole-of-society and whole-of-government approach to service delivery.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC has got no political will or no plan whatsoever to fix this country. [Interjections.] When the ANC finally leaves the Union Buildings and ceases to exist as an organisation... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: We will be left with the most unequal country in the world – a far cry from the promises that was made in 1994 before the public purse was purged. Hon Deputy Speaker, this Department is doing the best with what they have under the circumstances. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, members, order! [Interjections.] Order, members! The Leader of the Opposition and the Premier, one minute. [Interjections.] Can we just allow member Philander to finish? Please stop the clock. You may proceed.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. This Department is doing the best with what they have under the circumstances. What is certainly clear is that this is a Department and a Government that care about every citizen in every community. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: The ANC has failed us. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. It is clear. The ANC has failed us and they will be punished through the power of the ballot because South Africans simply had enough. As our communities look forward to reconnect with families and friends at the end of the year, we are assured that the Department will be ready to ensure that we all enjoy a safe and a healthy festive season. Of course, Deputy Speaker we also have the responsibility to behave and to abide by traffic and other safety rules.

In conclusion, Deputy Speaker, I would like to express much appreciation towards the Minister, Dr Keith Cloete, and departmental officials and to each and every staffer in every facility in the Western Cape for their selfless service towards the residents in the Western Cape. Your efforts do not go unnoticed and we are truly blessed with the best.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I move to support

this budget. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Minister Mbombo.

†n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, at the beginning of when I started, I said I do not want to speak more, not only because it is a small budget, but it is because I am really sad. I am sad, Deputy Speaker, because when we have so many challenges, where you have so many patients that are coming to us, and then you get a National Government that reduces your budget, what does it say? [Interjections.] What it says, because I just said, through you, Deputy Speaker, I just said... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: The Western Cape Equitable Share is being reduced for the next three years for over a billion. That is what I just said. The Equitable Share has just being reduced by over a billion. That part of it, is not me. It is coming from the National Treasury. Over a billion, for next year, for next year we have almost around about R400 million ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is the money? [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: You are saying you are doing this but you do not... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members. Hon member, the Minister sat down because she cannot actually hear herself think. Please, can we allow her to finish? Over to you, Minister. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: That is one, and then number 2, Speaker, I have just said because of the increase, not only the population, but also even the patients, which the members have already indicated. What we do, we are becoming smart, where you just like during COVID take other services, you take them outside, creating Hospitals with Wheels, creating Hospitals without Walls, where people are, you bring the services. I just said that we are being penalised for that because the headcount must be at the health facility. So all the efforts that we are trying to decongest the facility, mean that it is in vain, because we are being penalised for that. So that is number two, and then, Deputy Speaker, the other part is about the possible burden of disease: it is mental health, the evidence shows that with mental health the

major contributor is substance abuse and alcohol, specifically among the young persons.

For mental health is also due to COVID, with the whole issue that there is, especially with the older persons, specifically women who have got anxiety and depression, taking care of the families is another contributor with the mental health. All those contributors that we have just mentioned, they are outside the health system, but we have to absorb them. So when you have so many of these patients, some of them ended up actually having a substance disorder, abuse disorder, meaning now when the addiction continues, they have to stay longer at a hospital and they have to go to a mental hospital, but the mental hospital is full. That is what we are saying. The whole thing happens outside the health system.

The other part of the burden of disease is maternal health. For maternal health we are doing far better than the whole country. It has been like that when it comes to maternal mortality and morbidity, but the issue of teenage pregnancies, these teenagers do not get pregnant at the hospital. They are getting pregnant outside in communities, under the noses of the parents. That is what happens, the sector who ends up bearing all this burden is the health system.

The other burden of disease is child health, Within child health we are doing much better than any other province when it comes to child health outcomes, but the issue of what we see, although it might be in a few numbers, the malnutrition and also starvation among the children, it is not us who are supposed to feed. They are being not fed outside as a result of unemployment, but we have to absorb those problems.

HIV/Aids, because of COVID, we reduced the HIV testing, and also there are those who have to start IRVs for the first time, because of the access, but you are beefing up working with civil society. The Premier is chairing the Provincial Council of AIDS and TB around that, but sex is happening outside the health system in terms of unprotected sex.

The issue of interpersonal violence, you see the whole of accidents that are happening, trauma that is happening, there is an emergency, there is medical aid where Auntie Sarah might come with a stroke or fit, and then you have mental health, and then we have all these accidents, so all the crime is happening outside the health system. We absorb all of those, but we do not have a budget to respond to that.

It means for us we have to do on our own, how we respond to that. So when we took over the Violence Prevention Unit, which is not actually a health function, because we are data-driven we borrowed a model from the Wales Cardiff Model, where actually people will be the first priority when they have been beaten up or wherever they will go to the hospital, and not necessarily going to the police to report the case. Therefore, it made us to be easier accessible, immediately, within 24 hours our data can show there have been so many pedestrian injuries or people who have been beaten up, whether by gunshots and whatever, and we send that message to the relevant authorities, like law

enforcement officers.

Member Windvogel spoke about the R10 million. Yes, indeed, we received the R10 million from the Provincial Treasury. What we have done around the post, with our unit or anywhere, you cannot just do things like that. We have to do things according to the DPSA, which is we submit it to the DPSA in terms of the ODI, which was to-and-fro. I actually confirm that they approved it, now we will have a structure to have those people, but you cannot pay people in advance without having a structure and also we do not want to be a VPU of the Dorp Street. It has also to do with all the districts and all the municipalities, so there is that part and also remember the Safety Plan for the Western Cape has got two arms. It has to do prevention and then also law enforcement. So for us we are in prevention in regard to the data, but the violence is happening outside the health system.

In regard to the Jooste Hospital, already the professional services, I think I did mention that those people have been appointed, and remember we are the client of the Department of Public Works, who is the implementing agent. So in as much as that we may want things to move faster, there are the processes in terms of the infrastructure, the code, the contracting, the tendering system, and all of those, it is happening. But where I am sitting, the catalyst projects that we say have to be prioritised, and it has been confirmed, are the Helderberg Hospital, the Tygerberg Central Hospital, the Tygerberg / Belhar Regional Hospital, the Jooste Hospital which is the Klipfontein Regional Hospital. Those hospitals, they have to be staggered. The other one, 2028's, the other one was 2030, so it is there because we would be dropping the similar kind of plan when they are building. So it is already there.

In regard to the beds and all that member Windvogel has mentioned, I did actually indicate what I have just responded to about Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha. Mitchells Plain, the feeder areas, it includes the whole of Philippi. They are part of the Mitchells Plain substructure, the referrals pathway. It also includes Nyanga and Crossroads. It is part of Mitchells Plain.

Khayelitsha, it has always been Khayelitsha, but we added Mfuleni, which was going to Retreat, so we need to understand the referral pathways. The referral pathways, it is an international norm; it is a national norm, because the patient must be able to be exposed to all levels. It becomes easier because the files and the folders go to that level up to the specialist. So you must not think Mitchells Plain Hospital is only for Mitchells Plain.

On the medication again, please, I agree with member Philander that some of these issues you have to take it at the other level. We have got a National tender for pharmaceuticals for the medication. National tender, it is National for chronic medication for a three-year period that does the tender for the whole of the provinces, there was even a time when I went to Paarl Hospital, and one of the medications for mental health was not there. Because what normally happens, what they do is they will have added some other units or other medications as part of the tender, and unfortunately, those [Inaudible] companies, they cannot go back now and have to manufacture a bulk system. So when you have chronic medication, you must know first thing who is at fault,

it is national, because you all have under “national tender”. But what we do, Deputy Speaker, because you do not want to have the out-of-stock throughout, within that sub-district or that municipality, we have to find out if it is about medication that can also be available at a primary care level. If we know Clinic A, you do not have it, you can get from Clinic B, but in most instances it is those chronic ones that are prescribed by the doctor for chronic medication because of the National tender. So it means that you have to borrow within the district. And then what we normally do, you end up taking out of our own pocket money that was not even budgeted for and then you have to go over the counter and buy at the manufacturer, probably at double the price, so that is the whole issue about that. Then in regard to the waiting areas, yes, we did make a commitment of the afdak. We are busy with, we have identified the areas, clinics where they need the afdak for the waiting areas and the psychiatry units as well in these District Hospitals, because as I indicated, some patients, mental health for 72 hours, they have to sit also at the emergency centre, plus also the trauma and the chronic patients. Now we are taking those patients who might sit longer than 72 hours but are not yet qualifying, or there is no place at a specialised psychiatry hospital, so that rather they should be in the psychiatry unit in that small hospital.

We are already doing all parts of those, and then in addition to that, Bracken Gate for example, because we do not have many cases of COVID, it is a transitional hospital. We still have got those 300 plus beds that are there but what we do, transitional means that it becomes a step-down, or it becomes a step-up, which is in between, specifically for Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha. Some patients might be done at that hospital, but they are not ready yet to be going home. Therefore, in waiting, they could still be there at the Bracken Gate, before they go home, because you need those beds. So we are already doing all those parts, and then, lastly, Deputy Speaker. I did indicate that the expenses related to groceries, because there is a high-level increase, even in security, in the catering. When you see all these prices at the shops you must know that these are the same things that we are using the hospital.

†Ingxowa yeetapile, [A bag of potatoes] which used to be R45.00, which is the aartappels potatoes, for five or seven kilograms, just count how many patients we have to use those potatoes. That money that we have to buy all the groceries, for us it has been more, the more patients, the more we are spending, so there is no new money, but we have to absorb all costs.

Thank you very much, member Windvogel and member Philander for that, and then in closing, Deputy Speaker, I just want to thank the team, Dr Cloete and his team. Yes, indeed, I think we are tired of bragging of having the four consecutive audit outcomes, but I think for me what stands out at the time that I checked the data, are the 16 000 plus of those who were infected with COVID, and also the 158 health workers who died during this period,

We might do as much of Wellness, because you can see now we are doing Wellness at the local level, we opened Wellness at Groote Schuur. There are also Wellness Champion positions everywhere, and people can go for counselling, but you will never be able to replace those.

The long-COVID that we are talking about to the patients are also happening

around us. We are still fractured, we are still not where we were before, but the resilience that has come out among the staff, we want to thank the staff there. There are no health services without health workers. All health workers, psychologically, I am not even talking about the physical that have been impacted, it means that our services would not be there. We will want to have more, yes, there is a staff shortage but we do not have money. We will want to have more, but there is no money, and the only thing to do so that South Africa will be able to have money is to review its economic policies, and we invest more, because when we invest more there will be more employment. There will be more taxpayers and then we could be able to build more hospitals and everything, but we have got nothing, but whatever we could, we manage to be able to do. So thank you very much, Dr Cloete, and your team, and also to the Standing Committee for making us accountable. So do not take them like they are fighting, they are not fighting, they are helping us. Behind the scenes, member Windvogel says, "Can you please, I think he lay in Swellendam Hospital, if you could, whatever." Something like that, so I said, "Can you please go for yourself and have a conversation." Something like that. Outside these walls we are all at one as the MPPs of the Western Cape Government in different portfolios, but we are all doing it for the people of the Western Cape.

Thank you very much, Standing Committee, and also to my colleagues and then lastly, for my office, I just hope that because at least now we do not have so much COVID, they could be able to relax. We cannot be working 24-hours throughout. We are also drained, but at least because we know that it is a good cause, you are doing it. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. That brings us to the end of Vote 6.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will ask Mr Stemele to read the second Order of the Day.

## **2. Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, Madam Deputy Speaker. When I tabled the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and Adjustments Budget with the House nearly two weeks ago, I talked about tough choices and difficult trade-offs. With provincial budgets and depression and demand for our services greater than ever, the Western Cape will need to do more with less, prioritising, innovating and ensuring value for money. Doing so requires courage, leadership, and clear principles to guide us so that we deliver on the social contract that we have with our citizens to deliver jobs, to deliver safety and to deliver wellbeing. This, Deputy Speaker, is why this Vote is so important. Our Provincial Treasury as part of South Africa's Team Finance is essential in ensuring that we realise good governance and

sound financial management, always treating the public's money with the greatest of care.

I would like to upfront thank the officials from the Provincial Treasury for their unwavering commitment to realising this objective, as well as for their hard work in running the budget process so professionally. They give effect clearly to what Thomas Paine said, and I quote:

“Public money ought to be touched with the most scrupulous conscientiousness of honour.”

Hon Deputy Speaker, there are many important projects underway that enable the important choices that we need to make in the Western Cape, while helping to build on the strong foundations that we and our municipalities need to govern for growth, and to stay on course.

One such initiative is the introduction of the Expenditure Reviews by the Provincial Treasury, enabling the Department to work with others to review both expenditure and programme performance, and constructively identify areas for improvement in the implementation of strategic priorities. This is an internationally recognised tool for improving cost effectiveness. In the 2021/22 financial year, 21 officials completed the Government Technical Advisory Centre (GTAC) Spending Review Training, and five expenditure reviews were produced by this Government. In September of this year, a second round of GTAC training commenced, aimed at institutionalising the expenditure review process, with five new expenditure reviews underway.

We are now incorporating the reviews into the budget process, and we are working with departments to land their recommendations. This project has received R924 000 for the 22/23 financial year. With a budget of R1,36 million in the 2022/23 financial year, another innovative intervention is our Public Entity Review, which will help us to further strengthen our monitoring of public entities, ensuring that we exercise effective oversight over them. We are also developing a financial monitoring and evaluation template to supplement existing oversight processes, as well as identifying possible legislative amendments to strengthen board governance and ensure alignment to the Public Finance Management Act.

In line with the recently released Zondo Commission recommendations, we need to constantly find ways to strengthen oversight so that we stay ahead of the curve to governance risks and remain the best run government in South Africa, and this review will be critical for us doing so.

Hon Deputy Speaker, ensuring that we remain the best run government in South Africa will require that we embrace innovation and technology in our supply chain management. To achieve this the Provincial Treasury's Supply Chain Reform Project is fast tracking governance efficiencies in procurement processes and procedures, as well as embracing technology to enable and assist the Provincial Treasury in executing its core mandate. We expect this important component of the Reform Project, which has a R2 million budget, to be completed by the end of this financial year.

As we continue to embrace technology, we have also rolled out the eProcurement Solution (ePS), facilitating the procurement of goods and services by the Western Cape Government. For our departments, this makes it easier to comply with legislation, improve productivity and reduce paperwork. It also strengthens transparency and curbs opportunities for irregularities, fraud and collusion between suppliers and officials, providing a clear audit trail. For our suppliers this provides procurement opportunities to more businesses, stimulating competition. It also gives effect to our core growth for jobs priority by making it easier to do business with the Western Cape Government, by making it easier to do business with Provincial Government through this project. Overall, R6,36 million has been made available in the 2022/23 financial year, including for solution architecture, hosting and tenancy.

Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government fully appreciates the very real challenges our municipal leaders and officials face as they try to govern for growth in a difficult resource constrained environment. We also know that they are at the coalface of service delivery, and, without them, we cannot achieve our North Star Priorities of Growth for Jobs, Safety and Wellbeing. That is why we are constantly looking for ways to support them to succeed and this year has been no different. With the introduction of the Asset Management System Governance and Capability Project, with a budget of R2,29 million, this project will help municipalities to benchmark the maturity of their Asset Management Systems and to quantify the strategic processes that inform their Asset Management Plans.

The aim is to establish and complete a fully fledged asset register at each municipality to enable them to have a full view of the state of their assets. This will allow municipalities to direct resources where they are most needed and to ensure that they deal with the direct challenge of aging infrastructure to maintain and improve basic services to our citizens.

Another way in which we are supporting our local governments is by ensuring that vulnerable municipalities are given the right support to stabilise and to move forward. Good governance is the foundation for growth and every citizen, no matter where they live in the province, deserves to live in a well-run municipality. In this respect, we will continue to work closely with Beaufort West Municipality to ensure the effective implementation of their mandatory Financial Recovery Plan.

We will also continue to closely monitor and support other municipalities facing financial challenges and will not hesitate to take all steps that are necessary to address financial distress. Deputy Speaker, through this Adjustment Budget we have also allocated R17 million from the Western Cape Municipal Capability Building Grant to be transferred to municipalities. Of this total, R10,18 million is for a range of projects that will help municipalities to strengthen good financial governance, including setting more cost reflective tariffs, improving revenue collection and strengthening their financial systems.

The further R6,9 million will fund bursaries that municipalities can allocate to local learners so that they can develop a pipeline of future talent from their own areas that one day will work in their municipality. Through these transfers the

Provincial Treasury is investing in further strengthening the financial management capability of our municipalities so that they remain financially sustainable and can sustain the platform for growth and job creation in local economies across the province.

Deputy Speaker, in my Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement speech before this Parliament, I shared how through modelling the Provincial Treasury was able to project our Provincial Equitable Share allocation in 2030, noting a reduction after factoring in inflation. This innovative use of data is the first of more to come as we roll out our exciting Fiscal Futures Project. With a budget of R1,6 million in this financial year, the project will enable us to be more vigilant in monitoring and extrapolating our data over the longer term, thereby allowing us to anticipate and respond dynamically to changes.

It will also equip our Government with the information it needs to ensure that the Western Cape gets its fair share of the Provincial Equitable Share in our engagements with National Government. I certainly look forward to sharing more of its insights with you in the future.

To adjust our sails and table a budget that cares and prepares in the Western Cape, we have released R2,79 million of this Vote to the Provincial Revenue Fund, therefore bringing the total Adjusted Budget of the Provincial Treasury to R318,32 million for the 2022/23 financial year. Of the R2,79 million, R1,7 million is in respect of the infrastructure earmarked allocation. The organisational design investigation regarding the establishment of a Chief Directorate for infrastructure in the Provincial Treasury is envisaged to be completed in the 2023/24 financial year.

R781,000 is in respect of the municipal intervention earmarked allocation; R381,000 of which will be reallocated in the 2023/24 financial year, and R274,000 is in respect of the Financial Management Capability Grant, as the total amounts requested by municipalities for support were less than the allocation. This means our Administration Programme now receives R62,13 million; our Sustainable Resource Management Programme now receives R127,9 million; our Asset Management Programme now receives R76,9 million; and our Financial Governance Programme now receives R51,7 million.

In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, after hearing just some of the Treasury's pioneering projects, I think we can all agree that they are doing an outstanding job in steering this Province's public finances. I am so proud of the way that they embrace innovation, always strive for excellence, and how responsibly they manage the public purse. We must not for a second underestimate how important this is for the course that we have set out to achieve in the Western Cape. Indeed sound financial management, well run corruption-free provincial departments and local governments, value for money projects and a robust, transparent and professional budget process are the foundation that we need to deliver the better future that our citizens deserve. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Nkondlo.

MS N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, perhaps as the Minister speaks about doing more with less, the Minister must actually listen to the voice of the likes of the MEC of Health, who is crying about the budget cuts into social spending, Health in particular, and I am sure in other areas. As I think we must concede to the challenges of austerity policy, which the DA actually supports and is implementing here in this province, and as such, such austerity policies should not be accepted with a blanket check because already in 2014, I think writings have been done by academics about some of the challenges of austerity during recession, as a policy posture that does not necessarily, has not proven with data, that it actually helps to revive economies and in particular developing economies of our nature. So I am raising this that maybe MEC Mbombo, you must join the left in the ANC who also have been calling that the challenge of a blanket austerity remains a challenge for a developing economy like ours, and actually hoping that the Minister in your Department, that the fiscal futures that were established by the Premier, would actually help us to really indicate whether after this whole process, when we have done all of these budget cuts from COE and everything else, we are seeing any improvements, or the social problems actually are going to derive or realise even worse economic challenges for our communities. I stand here today on behalf of the ANC to object to this budget.

Firstly, we must decry what is currently happening in this House due to DA escapades, as a serious threat to governance and sound financial management in this province. Let me share a few of these.

We are here with no Speaker of this Parliament as the DA chose to circumvent justice by trialling the Speaker using the draconian and unjust process, especially towards its Black members on allegations claimed to emanate from him as its public representative in the House. Actually the Premier was here trying at pains to explain himself as a member of this House, but a Premier in the Executive, a travesty of justice, as this Parliament is rendered toothless and unstable, where clear system and process to trial any misconducts, are available. Then we have a Conduct Committee, when that information of the whistle-blower arrived at the Premier, he had the responsibility to hand over through the systems of this Parliament, unless he already says "vote of no confidence" to this Parliament. This kind of encroachment has direct impact on the financial governance, as the same DA was on record about this, and you rarely mention it now, MEC, about the situation in Beaufort West Municipality to a point that a budget could not be discussed and approved within the stipulated times. Your HOD was lamenting this in the Committee that politics have got a serious way to collapse public administration, and here we see this Adjustment Budget here being concluded under a stewardship of House Chairs, a Deputy Speaker's office marred by controversy and allegations of misconduct, a Secretary whom the House must be pushed to give executive powers, as the party saw it proper to paralyse this House only for party politics. Another of these DA theatrics that this House plays and is subjected to, is we have two MEC's, one for Human Settlements and another for Transport and Public Works, and yet by decree of the handler, this House was plunged into an oversight quagmire where there is only one MEC in this Budget Adjustment accounting for two Votes, whilst the other was here presenting a budget during the Main Appropriation, and today he must sit and watch.

An HON MEMBER: Who is the handler?

Ms N D NKONDLO: We cautioned the Premier about these abrupt announcements and their implications to order of the Administration, let alone this governance confusion he created. His announcement came after his DA booted out another Black person in the former MEC Madikizela, and now the new sheriff tells us in the Committee there has been a culture of non-accountability in that Department, painting a bleak picture of his predecessor. Now a young MEC is shoved off on the side as long as he earns the perks, as we are told the executive powers are given to his party leader and he is just to sit there and smile.

Lastly, an instrument to give teeth to and enable this House to make meaningful interventions to budget proposals by the Executive, in the form of the procedure on money bills for this House, has been delayed since ANC called for this in the last Administration, and yet the learned advocate in the Acting Chief Whip, Chairperson of the Budget Committee, treats us in a theatre of spectacle of workshop after workshop, as a delaying tactic to get this done, so again, here ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

MS N D NKONDLO: ... the WCPP, is toothless, and arrogance of numbers is used by the DA-mob as logic to engage and bully those with less numbers into the budget choices of the Executive, where all this is a show, a charade for the DA-led to show who jumps and make the fanciest noises, jokes, ridicule and obfuscation effects to satisfy the master who holds the keys to their upward mobility in the party. The more noise one makes, the higher the chances of the best performers to be called in the main office for getting more perks, elevated to what is seen as powerful positions, even a chance of joining the handler's main dinner table. [Interjections.]

How do you realise good governance and prudent financial management in such a political climate? What happened to separation of powers as a tenet of liberal democrats?

Deputy Speaker, given this Adjustment Budget was presented simultaneously with the PERO and MERO with the MEC herself in her speech that stated that MERO empowers us with the information that we and our municipalities need to govern for growth in the Western Cape, yet, the MEC must explain a surrender of the R1,735 funds to the Provincial Reserve Fund that was meant for Infrastructure Development Improvement Programme. This happens whilst this Government argues for fixed investment as a way to deal with what in the PERO says, stopping job crisis not to be a social crisis.

Provincial Treasury has surrendered COE funds as delays to fill vacancies has become the order of the day, bursary funds also unspent in an environment of youth unemployment, a trend to shift this money to EPWP projects. Further we see in this budget that funds are shifted to make provision for the impact of 2022, 3% wage increase, and this happens whilst National Treasury was here a few days ago to allocate money for the wage increment, and even on 21

November in the Select Committee on Appropriations, they considered that if there is any changes and there is a shortfall, such provinces will then be allocated. Now, what is this money put aside for provision of wage increment? We do not understand.

Similarly, the DA made some theatrics during COVID and put money aside to buy vaccines whilst there was allocation provided.

†Sidiniwe kule midlalo yenu yoonopopi.  
[We are sick and tired of these childish theatrics.]

As this Provincial Government at this point continues to place austerity as leaner strategy on COE, we must remember what the same Provincial Treasury argued during the Quarter 1 performance. They said:  
“Service delivery has increased need for staff...” [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

MS N D NKONDLO: “...need for staff and leading to pockets of burnout.”  
This is the reality of many of the public servants that are placed into modern day slavery ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish up, member.

MS N D NKONDLO: ...and their dedication is undermined by this Government. The ANC does not support this budget. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

MS N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters is not happy about all these adjusted estimates of the Provincial Revenue in all the Votes across the board. The Department of Treasury has failed in its mandate and thereby failing the people of the Western Cape. Their endeavour to build capacity in the public sector has failed dismally. This is the Department with the Minister who spends 99% of her time blaming National Government for all the failures in this Province and takes credit for all smaller successes this Province achieves. With the mandate, Deputy Speaker, to build integrated partnerships to enable quality service delivery in a sustainable manner. The bulk of failures by all the Western Cape Departments should also be blamed on the Provincial Treasury.

This is a province, Deputy Speaker, where municipalities are failing to deliver services to the people and the only thing celebrated is clean audits.

Clean audits, Deputy Speaker, do not constitute service delivery or improve the lives of poor people. We cannot have a Government that spends all its time making sure that it acquires clean audits in the books but then at the same time people do not have services.

Deputy Speaker, this is a Government that awards big contracts to the companies associated and affiliated with those running the white monopoly

capital. Its handlers have given in it a task which is to keep granting them these big Government contracts and making sure that the books remain clean.

Deputy Speaker, the EFF will not vote for any budget that fails to promote cohesion and take the poor people of the Western Cape seriously.  
I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Just note that we were not, you were not always audible, so I am not sure that the Hansard would be able to capture your speech correctly, perhaps you could send that in just to assist them. Thank you very much.

MS N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Noted.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise hon member Murray.

Ms C A MURRAY: Thank you Deputy Speaker. The Provincial Treasury has an extraordinarily difficult task, considering our country's history. It aims to promote cohesion, and citizen centricity, and it aims to do so by building capacity in the public sector by being adaptive, innovative, and supportive.  
It does so through integrated management and partnerships that enable delivery of quality services done sustainably.

As a Born Free, I have no comprehension of what many of my colleagues in this House have had to endure during the cruel apartheid regime. I have only heard the horror stories and I have seen the aftermath of deep inequality. Like many other Born Frees, seeing these injustices is extremely painful and we are left with the great burden of trying to fix what was broken by generations before us. But, Deputy Speaker, I am angry. My generation was told that we would live in a better society, but in my 28 years I have only seen crime, corruption and inequality get worse.

Our so-called liberators, the ANC, have only promoted division and focused on filling their coffers rather than helping those most vulnerable. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Hon Sayed, what is the point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: It is a request, is the hon Murray able to take a question on the history of South Africa?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Murray, would you like to take a question?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] I did not ask a question. I said...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon members. Sorry.

MS C A MURRAY: Thank you, the question was implied. I am not willing to take a question. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members. I cannot hear, hon Murray.

MS C MURRAY: The question was implied, I am not willing to take a question. I want to finish my speech. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr P MARRAN: She does not know the history.

MS C MURRAY: I will continue. Our so-called liberators, the ANC, have only promoted division and focused on filling their coffers since coming into government, rather than helping those most vulnerable. That is why I want to commend the DA-led Western Cape Government and particularly this Department ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

MS C MURRAY: ... on what they are doing to ensure that no person is left behind.

Mr P MARRAN: So the ANC liberated this member from what?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, hon Marran, no, no, no. You cannot do that. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Who liberated this country?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Sayed. Hon Marran, no interjections in terms of Rule 40, please allow hon Cayla Murray to continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: The liberals who sat in apartheid Parliament liberated us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed!

MS C MURRAY: ...fighting from the inside, on what we are doing to ensure that no person is left behind through the vision of cohesion and citizen-centricity. They are doing this with an Adjusted Budget of nearly R319 million for the 2022/23 financial year. The Budget, however, is constrained by the Provincial Equitable Share or lack thereof, a key source of the Budget for this Department. It has been reduced by R2,79 million, thanks to the ANC-led National Government, which is a decrease of 0,88%, and I think this is a laughable point by the ANC to talk about austerity measures being ineffective, particularly as they have a skewed PES allocation towards our Province. But, Deputy Speaker, this adjustment had to be made by the Provincial Government in the face of spending pressures and failure of the National Government to add additional PES funding to service delivery. The ANC unsurprisingly are once again making it more difficult to promote cohesion and a citizen-centric approach to governance. Despite this, the Department will continue to strengthen its financial record keeping and reporting while contributing to clean audit outcomes.

Testament to this is that R62,1 million, an increase of 4,85% has been allocated

to the Administrative Programme. Its Financial Management sub-programme has further received an increase of R4,44 million or 16,42%, bringing its Adjustment Budget to a total of R35,5 million, helping to achieve its mandate.

The DA-led Western Cape Government guided by its Recovery Plan has further redirected funding from the Sustainable Resource Management Programme to the tune of R2,8 million to support infrastructure project implementation and movable asset plans and provides reports to the Cabinet on the implementation of infrastructure projects. This will ensure that the Western Cape continues to create an enabling environment for job creation and promoting the values of freedom, fairness, opportunity and diversity for all. This Department is further bolstering service delivery and promoting cohesion through its Asset Management Programme, which has been allocated R76,9 million in the Adjusted Budget, an increase of 0,7% from the Main Budget. Its Local Government Supply Chain subprogramme will also receive an increase of R1,58 million helping to streamline and improve services rendered to municipalities. A key function of this Department is ensuring that those services rendered by Municipalities are delivered in line with auditing practices, sufficient risk management and legal frameworks. This is done while maintaining the Department's status as an accredited member of the South African Institute of Chartered Accountants (SAICA). This is South Africa's pre-eminent accounting body and chartered accounting training office.

The subprogramme Corporate Governance will receive a welcome R7,96 million, or 56,6% increase, ultimately improving municipal service delivery.

The Chartered Accountant Academy has been permanently established within the Provincial Treasury and graduates have been absorbed in the public and private sectors. Demand remains robust and the programme is constantly or continuously replenished with new trainees. Discussions are further underway, which is incredibly welcomed with municipalities to latch on to the successes of the programme and add to the talent pool of professionals in the public sector. The increase will come from the Financial Governance Programme, which will receive nearly a 51,8%, or a welcomed 24,04% increase.

I also want to welcome Minister Wenger's announcement that this Department is continuing in its commitment to use Tech in its SCM processes to ensure that Government is not left behind and keeps up with the demands of an increasingly digitised economy and digitised Government.

What underpins this Department's ability to drive cohesion and its citizen-centric approach is its unrelenting commitment to clean audits. Clean audits are not miraculously achieved as other parties might allude to. Rather, systems and frameworks are put in place and rigorously adhered to by the Department, which has a tangible effect on fiscal responsibility throughout the Provincial Government. This directly contributes to less money being wasted and more being available to deliver key services to our residents.

This is evidenced by the Provincial Government receiving unqualified audits for all its departments in the last year.

It is clear that this Adjustment Budget takes its aim of promoting cohesion and

citizen-centricity very seriously. That is why, as a Born Free, living in the very best run province in this country, that I am pleased to support this bill. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, very much, hon member. I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. I will say I definitely agree with hon Nkondlo, it is not right that the budget has been cut. In fact, the National Government cut the budget by R2 billion. That is not right, and one can see how this affects key service delivery in departments such as Health and Education, and we do not have a blanket austerity approach. We in fact have a differentiated approach and departments manage their own cost of employment, and in fact this Province has buffered frontline services precisely to protect them from the cuts that we are getting from the National Government. I wonder if the hon member supports the SoE bailout, which took money away from provinces to burn at failing SoEs that are actively hindering our economy.

For the hon Makamba-Botya to say that the Department has failed on its mandate ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: I think I should use this opportunity to quote the Auditor-General, who said in her most recent report that:

“The consistent positive pattern of prior years continued reflecting an overall robust control environment with a solid and consistent pattern of good financial governance. This positive reflection highlighted the tone set by the accounting officers and authorities, instilling a culture of doing the right thing, being accountable and improving controls, key elements in achieving and sustaining clean audit outcomes.”

Now, I do not know if any other province could boast such a wonderful note from the Auditor-General, but certainly it is something that we take very seriously and are very proud of and work very hard towards. [Interjections.] In addition we recognise that clean audits are a milestone in our pathway to a destination... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: Clean audits are... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Meanwhile disclaimers and adverse opinions are not, and on that note I would like to thank the Standing Committee under the loadshedding of hon Murray for the very important role that they play in conducting robust oversight over the two departments, and we really appreciate their inputs, the critiques and they help us to do better. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That brings us to the end of the Vote 3.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will ask – hon Dugmore, do you have a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: A point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That brings us to the end of Vote 3. I recognise the hon Dugmore. (01:46:07)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I just seek your advice in terms of a motion in terms of 150(1), (2) and (3). As you know that motions need to be delivered to the Secretary before 12. I have established that the Secretary does not appear to be physically around. So I have actually sent him a copy of this motion. So I want to be within the Rules. Would it be possible that I can hand the motion to the Table, but I have sent the Secretary a copy of this motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may, within your rights deliver any motion before 12 o'clock in terms of 151(2) and (3). I am not going to make a big thing of it, you can put it to Mr Stimela. Just to let you know, for the record, that the Secretary is the Chair of SoCATT and so today he is officially on SoCATT duty.

So you may give it to Mr Stimela.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. So did he appoint Mr Stimela as the acting ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Stimela is the director and senior management.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Okay, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He assists us. I am sure he can receive it if you have put it in writing. I am going to not interfere with due process.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, thank you very much.

I will ask, Mr Stimela, if you may, just to move and to read the Third Order of the Day. Hon members, I would like to get through that one before lunch. Thank you, over to you.

**3. Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Opportunities and Tourism – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Stimela.

I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

There can be no greater priority than rapidly growing the economy so that we enable opportunity and job creation for our citizens. After years of state capture, anti-private sector, anti-growth policies and devastating loadshedding, the State has hindered and not helped the private sector to create jobs in this country.

While the Western Cape has taken a very different road, the impact of the approach nationally coupled with the global COVID-19 pandemic, has meant that we have much, much more to do to deliver the opportunity our citizens need to succeed. This is why our Framework of Hope, which I tabled before this Parliament, has at its heart the requirement that we realise private sector-led breakout economic growth in the Western Cape by landing a new economic growth strategy in the province.

Following our COVID-19 pandemic economic response through our jobs now and recovery plans, it is important that we move forward on our pathway from recovery to growth. This is precisely why this Vote is so critical for our Government and its objectives. Indeed achieving an ambitious target will require the coordination of a data-led all of government approach, as well as partnership with the private sector. The Department of Economic Development and Tourism will be key to achieving this.

In my medium-term budget policy statement I set out how we will need to adjust our sales as we finalise and adopt this new strategy, which we aim to do before the end of this financial year and I certainly look forward to sharing more with you in our Main Budget for 23/24 as we begin to align to this new approach, which seeks to leverage horizontal enablers to unlock higher levels of growth in our province.

To [Inaudible.] strategy by then we have in this Adjustment shifted a million rand to enable the purchase of additional data subscriptions so that we have the necessary economic intelligence to finalise the work. A key requirement of this strategy is that we leverage economic data to inform our decision-making and so this intelligence is crucial.

We are also shifting R400 000 to this project to enable an intensified stakeholder consultation process. We ensure that it is an informed piece of work which all of society can unite behind.

Hon Deputy Speaker, a key horizontal enabler for economic growth is ensuring that our citizens have the right skills to access the job market. To support the creation of this talent pool we are investing in our citizens to ensure that they

have the right qualifications, the right skills and the right experiences for the jobs available now and in the future so that we can take full advantage of the immense potential of our economy. This is why the Department of Economic Development and Tourism works hard with various partners and stakeholders across all levels of government, as well as international partners, to create more opportunities to upskill young people.

To enable this work further, nearly a million rand, R990 000, has been shifted in the Adjustment Budget to help deliver various digital skills and youth entrepreneurship programmes, as well as for upgrade and maintenance of IT infrastructure at the I-CAN Centre in Elsies River. This I-CAN Centre is a pioneering community-based centre developed in partnership with the City of Cape Town and which provides digital skills programmes to residents.

To date it has had more than 94 000 visitors, with 13 627 training opportunities being provided. We, however, know that we must do more with less in the difficult fiscal environment we face. I therefore also want to congratulate the DEDAT team for working hard to leverage external funding to boost skills in the province so that we can multiply this effect. I think it is worth noting that the Department leveraged more than R150 million last year alone to support our skills programme.

Another critical way to unlock economic growth in the Western Cape is through enabling small and micro enterprises to grow, succeed and employ more people. To do this the Western Cape Government runs the SMME Booster Fund which distributes funding to selected organisations to deliver training programmes on business development support and access to markets.

To enable the funding of multi-year projects by beneficiaries of this fund, R4,6 million has been [Inaudible.] to the 23/24 financial year.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it brings me great joy and lots of relief to see full flights of tourists landing in the Western Cape again. Every tourist contributes to job creation. So the fact that between January and October of 2022 Cape Town International Airport recorded 4,9 million two-way domestic passengers and 1,4 million two-way international passengers, this really is very good news.

One of our destination's core offerings for both domestic and international visitors is the fact that we are a global capital for events. From the International Jazz Festival to major medical conferences at our convention centres, we are a place where people come together to gather, to meet, to learn and to have fun. Next year, I am pleased to note, our visitors will have enough reason to come to Cape Town in the Western Cape with the City of Cape Town being announced as the host city for the E-Grand Prix World Championship for the next five years. This electric motorsport event is held across 12 destinations on five continents and is expected to result in an economic impact worth hundreds of millions of rands, including major global [Inaudible.] for our country.

It also brings with it important conferences such as the Green Economy Summit and the E-Fest, which will help catalyse e-mobility and the take-up of green energy solutions in South Africa. To contribute to enabling this important event

over the MTF, R3 million has been allocated from our budget to the lead department, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I nearly fell off my chair when I received in my inbox a request to comment on the [Inaudible.] South African Shipping Company Bill, which aims to establish a state-owned shipping company in South Africa. Yes, you heard correctly. [Interjections.] The country just spent R30 billion bailing out struggling SOEs. Instead of a water-based zombie SOE, we rather need world-class working ports with excellent turnaround times for private shipping lines.

If we get the ports right, these shipping lines will call again and we, according to our own research, will significantly boost growth and job creation and the best way to do this is through ensuring private sector participation at our ports and most certainly the Port of Cape Town, which has surprisingly been excluded by Operation Vulindlela. This is something we will continue to push to have changed because the Port of Cape Town is an excellent candidate for this initiative.

Hon Deputy Speaker, to continue our important work in unblocking the inefficiencies of the Port of Cape Town and to better align this work to our focus on exports and logistics, R1,37 million has shifted from Programme 2 to Programme 3 and additional human resource capacity will be added to the team to strengthen its work further.

Hon Deputy Speaker, together this means the Department of Economic Development and Tourism budget for the 22/23 financial year is adjusted to R510 million, which is tabled before you for debate today.

I would like to use the opportunity to thank the new Head of Department, Mr Velile Dube, for his leadership and hard work and to the officials within DEDAT for their commitment to realising the better future we hope to achieve. No matter how big the challenge, this team wakes up every day to help get our economy growing and I am so grateful for their passion. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. [Applause.]

I now recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC does not support this budget. The MEC of Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism introduced a growth for jobs strategy, which is still transitioning between existing strategies at the moment. We must actually call and caution this Department's role that it is [Inaudible.] ensure economic development and opportunities for all in this particular province.

That actually the efforts of PERO and MERO remain an opportunity for this Department to actually play that leading role and deal with a racialised past and a fiscal policy that actually make choices to keep the structural inequality in this particular province.

The strategy for jobs that the MEC spoke about in the tail end of this particular administration is actually laughable because we are sitting here almost with a year to end and close books for this particular administration and yet we are told of a strategy for jobs that is going to be concluded by the end of this financial year and the question is where are the jobs that the Premier spoke about early in his first State of the Province Address?

He promised the citizens of this province that in each household he shall ensure that there is a job. Where are we in [Inaudible.] as the MEC speaks about putting together this particular jobs strategy?

Again we have been seeing reports and quarter one is once again more evidence, MEC, that on the jobs front the Department of Public Works, through the EPWP, registered more than 100 000 EPWP job opportunities. Are those the jobs that this Province is able to deliver to the citizens of this country? And as part of that we are also told that 60 jobs out of R100 million investment by Wesgro, such jobs are very expensive I think to secure in this Provincial Government. Only 60 out of an investment of R100 million and others are marketing in vans and other things. The question is where are those particular jobs that we are talking about at this point?

We all know that when we talk about these new strategies that are always called upon, that we would like to caution once again about political posturing because we are going to another election in 2024, that new promises, new things gets to be promised to the citizens so that they are lured into being voting fodder, we want results and at this point, MEC, when there is once again a surrender of Compensation of Employees' funding, we ask the question: what is informed or what is behind these delays of filling up of vacancies? This has been happening year in and year out and at this point what we want to see is vacancies being filled from this particular Provincial Government and Department, particularly that has a responsibility to activate economic development.

We take note also of the R10.037 million for the SMME Booster Fund that was shifted from the Public Corporations and Public Enterprises, to Non-Profit Institutions in sub-programme 2.1 on Enterprise Development, and we shall always as the ANC, as we have done, support monies towards the SMME Booster Fund because we have all agreed that an economy of this nature of ours must allow SMMEs to actually pioneer new grounds of ensuring economic activities, and therefore that becomes very important and amongst others is to look at the point of infrastructure. I am sure MEC Simmers have been raising the issue of extortion and criminality in the construction space and for me it is very challenging that this particular Department is silent on what are the fights in as far as safety is concerned around Business Against Crime, because also crime must be viewed as an economic act, an economic sabotage because those emerging contractors that are actually deprived an opportunity to participate in the construction industry and help us to reboot that industry, that has got a serious potential of employment and at this point we are not seeing much robust intervention in those communities where such infrastructure is required, and this is a concern, MEC, that for me I do not see the role of the Economic Development Department actually in that space.

Amongst others are the township economies which we shall not deter to actually raise with you the informal economy because once again as you claim that the PERO and MERO are information at your disposal and you shall always utilise it in good faith to decide on the proper policy choices to make, that here is the PERO providing in another financial year. I think MEC Maynier, as your colleague and your predecessor, can actually also tell you that this happened where jobs were registered, positive growth in this informal sector and once again it has done that, and amongst others, what it does it has shown employment of the sector or the designated groups that are not found in the main economy, particularly in terms of job creation because of structural problems in the labour market where black people, Africans in particular, and women are not necessarily absorbed and we are told [Inaudible.] because of education attainment, a low educational attainment levels, but the informal sector has demonstrated and the PERO is actually speaking about that. That it has demonstrated employment opportunities for those sectors of economy. So what is it that should be done for you, MEC, and your HOD and the team in Economic Development to start taking informal economy serious and elevating it into the space it desires, to sit next to the formal economy and be attended to in the same vigour that you are doing as you now speak about the ports, and you seem to be very interested in the Port of Cape Town where you had poached the HOD and †iyahlebisa lo nto leyo...[And that is what makes people complain.]

... because there are other ports here in the province, there is the Saldanha Port, there is also Mossel Bay and there are also small harbours that I think could all be integrated so that if we talk about transportation of goods and services and processing towards a leveraged economy, such is integrated.

This one of this particular port of Cape Town †iyahlebisa [makes people complain.]

I must say because it seems that the only interest that you have is only on the Port of Cape Town and we actually commend the improvements that have been seen as we approach the season now, of the fruit growers in that particular space, that indeed there has been, out of the engagements that have been held, improvements in terms of capacity to ensure that the delays in the ports are things of the past.

As we conclude, hon Deputy ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish your sentence off, the time is up, hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The ANC, as we continue to say, we shall focus and we want this particular Department to focus on the structural inequality in this particular province and the ANC will never stop making this particular call, and the ANC does not support and therefore rejects this Budget. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Nkondlo. [Applause.]

I now recognise the hon member Mkamba-Botya.

Ms N MKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

I take note of what you have [Inaudible.] earlier on that I am having problems with network so I will send my speech to the guy for Hansard purposes.

Hon Deputy Speaker, an adjusted budget decrease of more than R4.7 million by Government that fails to create an enabling environment for meaningful job opportunities, is disappointing. Whilst the hourly national minimum wage rate of R23,19 is very low, the Department of Economic Opportunities also has a duty to encourage prospective employers with interest to invest in the provincial economy.

This whole issue, hon Deputy Speaker, of minimum wage rate [Inaudible.] has been taken [Inaudible.] mean that employers must always stick to even in situations where they can offer more.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is shocking, for example, that the Provincial Government would announce that the agricultural sector of this province is booming and whilst farmers make billions in profits from [Inaudible.] the hourly minimum wage rate of farm workers does not increase, even though they also played a big role in making sure that there is an increase in production and profit.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the same thing is also true in other sectors of the economy. One cannot celebrate more revenue and economic boom, but [Inaudible.] the lives of poor people do not change. In essence, hon Deputy Speaker, what is being celebrated is that inequality is widening. The owners of means of production continue to fill their pockets with billions of rands and a worker remains alienated with their situations not getting better [Inaudible.] salaries.

On that note, hon Deputy Speaker, the EFF does not support this Vote, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member, will you also send that speech? I think you had a few moments also with your connectivity.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I now recognise hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, informal trading and street trading are not being recognised for their contribution to the province's economic growth. In Athlone's Gatesville, for example, informal traders who are mostly women that make efforts to sell their homemade products to uplift their families out of poverty, continue to be deprived of their right to trade in open available competitive spaces.

The current system is scuttling their trading and livelihoods instead of creating healthy environments for small informal traders. It is harming and restricting them from addressing their basic needs.

We question the Province and City of Cape Town's joint initiative of the Tourism Safety Units which will be unequally deployed to safeguard only certain tourist destinations. Again tourist destination on the Cape Flats ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: ... are not protected. The Al Jama-ah does not support this unequal Budget. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise the hon member Murray.

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

In considering whether or not to support this budget, I have measured its success against the objectives set out in the Western Cape Government's Provincial Recovery Plan.

The plan is guided by its three North Stars of Well-Being, Safety and Jobs and it is this Department's specific responsibility to look out for the priority of jobs. The success of this plan is measured through evidence and data and this Adjustment Appropriation Bill offers us as a House – please listen – as a House the opportunity to use this data and evidence before us to determine whether the Department is on track.

In doing so it will guide us all in terms of whether this Vote should indeed be supported or not, but, hon Deputy Speaker, before I outline why it is that this Department is indeed on track, it is important to interrogate why the Provincial Government should be guided by a recovery plan at all.

The COVID-19 pandemic had a destabilising impact on both lives and livelihoods of residents. It exacerbated socio-economic inequalities in our communities and the road to recovery has since been tumultuous. Fast-forward one year since the establishment of the Recovery Plan and we see that across the country residents are struggling with sky high unemployment rates, the astronomical cost of living, loadshedding and crime. We even face the looming risk of being grey listed. It is extremely concerning.

What is more, the very value of a sovereign currency has taken a hit as the President is fighting to keep his job amid destabilising factional battles within the ANC. [Interjections.] Within the ANC. You have an impact on our entire country.

By implementing the Recovery Plan, the DA-led Western Cape Government was not only responding to the crisis at the time, but anticipating further issues so that it could respond to the best of its ability. This is indeed a data-based and evidence-led approach.

This Department is prioritising job creation as it is responsible for providing qualitative leadership to the Provincial Government through its intense focus on the ease of doing business, boosting investment and exports, enterprise development, work placement and skills development, as well as energy resilience. The importance of the job priority in the work that this Department is doing, is highlighted by the fact that the Western Cape Government has allocated an outstanding R16 billion to it this year.

It aims to achieve this through its Adjusted Budget of just R510 million for the 2022/23 financial year and it is doing so despite a key source of the budget for this Department being constrained, namely the Provincial Equitable Share, which has declined by R5,619 million or 1,14%, which means, as the Minister has said, the Department has to do more with much less.

Despite this, hon Deputy Speaker, the Department is continuing to accelerate the ease of doing business through initiatives, including the Red Tape Reduction Unit. It is important to note that while it is not Government's job to create jobs, the DA-led Government is creating an enabling environment for the private sector to ensure job creation. This is essential if we are to reduce the country's exorbitant burden of debt thanks to the ANC-led National Government and ensure that more money is spent on empowering those most vulnerable in our society.

The commitment to the ease of doing business is situated under the important programme of Integrated Economic Development Services, which has been allocated R47,8 million for the adjustment period and taking an evidence-led and data-based approach, this programme has realigned its funding to the tune of R4,6 million for 2023/24 financial year, to fund future financial years for the SMME Booster Fund Project. This will ensure that funds are spent on supporting SMMEs across the province to flourish and to create more jobs. It will further enhance the governance standards within the Department by preventing advance payments for the delivery that will only be affected by the following year.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the SMME project is a flagship project and I have had the privilege of seeing its successes first-hand. It is tackling the job priority head-on by supporting SMMEs that are owned by women, that are owned by youth, that are owned by differently-abled persons, as well as those who are based in townships and those who are based in rural communities. Of course there is always more that needs to be done to empower the informal sector, but while the ANC argues that this Department does little to support township economies, the Adjustment Bill shows that this is blatantly untrue.

Of course supporting SMMEs is not a silver bullet and ensuring that we are supporting the growth of businesses requires that we are also developing a sustainable skills pipeline. This Department does exactly that through its Skills Development and Innovation Programme, which will receive nearly R95.9 million this year.

I would like to commend the Department on their foresight as they further increase the revenue to the tune of R851 million for the manufacturing,

engineering and related service sector educational training authority [Inaudible.] skills development programme.

In essence this project is supporting the creation of a skills pipeline for the tech intensive jobs of the future [Inaudible.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, among the ways in which this Department is taking a database and evidence-led approach to ensuring that it prioritises jobs is through its focus on research. It is continuously looking for new and better ways to inform policy that will enable growth. The Department has received an increase of R2 million or 17,67% for its knowledge management and R1,59 million for its research development sub-programmes.

This will focus on engaging with the private sector to ensure that Government is responsive to their needs and provides economic policy research and strategy development to the Provincial Government.

This budget has been made available through the Economic Planning Programme which will receive approximately R150,4 million through this adjustment, which is a considerable increase from the Main Budget, but, hon Deputy Speaker, creating jobs requires that we not only focus on the local economy, but also on the global economy, ensuring that we leverage every opportunity for growth.

That is why approximately R74,8 million has been allocated through this adjustment to the Trade and Sector Development Programme. This is a marked increase from the Main Budget and it will see additional funding allocated towards prioritising key job creating sectors in our province, including agri-processing, manufacturing and services to increase exports and investment in those sectors. The programme provides the support by addressing trade barriers, sector specific research and facilitating cooperation between stakeholders at different levels.

In an ongoing effort to prioritise job creation, the Department has further shifted R3 million from Tourism, Arts and Entertainment Programme to the Provincial Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports. This programme will consequently be allocated R71,5 million.

The shift will put our province on the map and further market us as a global tourist destination as it will be used to support the Cape Town E-Prix which will take place in February 2023. This event is momentous and even historical as it is the very first time that the FIA has held a race in South Africa since 1993, pre-democracy. While generations before my time have never had the privilege, we are of course all looking forward to it and it is a massive vote of confidence, so to speak, in the DA-led Western Cape Government.

I want to commend hon Minister Wenger, HOD Dube and the officials of this Department for their hard work and ensuring qualitative leadership to the provincial economy. They are helping to identify economic opportunities and contributing to the administration's economic priority of jobs.

In the last year alone 203 000 jobs were created in the Western Cape. Unemployment, according to the QLFS, has also declined if you look at the expanded and official unemployment stats and I think this is noteworthy for hon member Nkondlo who has alluded that unemployment is not being sufficiently addressed, as we specifically see that there is quarter-on-quarter decline in unemployment, but of course this is a clear indication as well that the Department is taking an evidence-led and data-based approach to its priority job creation.

I would also like to commend the members of the Standing Committee for their cordiality, professionalism and unwavering commitment to uplifting the people of this province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it gives me great pleasure to support this Bill today. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

I now recognise the hon the Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

I will attempt to amalgamate the inputs in the debate. Thank you very much hon members for your contributions.

The PERO and the MERO are indeed early guiding documents that we certainly use in our work and, yes, the Premier promised job creation in his maiden SOPA, that has not changed, but we cannot continue on the same trajectory when the world around us has changed fundamentally. We had a once in 100-year pandemic which devastated jobs.

So that [Interjections.] means we have to adjust our sails and that is exactly what the Department did. It had a jobs now strategy and then a recovery plan and now we are moving from recovery to growth and therefore the growth for jobs strategy because Government needs to be agile and responsive to how the world changes to be able to tailor its responses.

We do not have a one size fits all because that is how we are going to reach our objectives of job creation in this province and just recently last week we heard in the quarter three jobs results that 85 000 jobs were created in the Western Cape in quarter three. That is 203 000 jobs year-on-year, and when we talk about the growth for job strategy we definitely include townships, an informal economy, because those are essential parts of our economy. So those are definitely an important part of the strategy that has been developed [Interjections.].

In terms of trading permits and tourism, the Safety Unit, I think the hon member is in the wrong Vote, in the wrong Legislature, but let me just say this, we have [Interjections.] allocated R1 billion for safety, for boots on the ground in communities that need it the most [Interjections.]. Those communities that are

---

most affected by crime, R1 billion, okay? [Interjections.]

So ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: And in addition to that the hon member and myself had a conversation on the floor here in the suspension of proceedings, about how important tourism is for jobs, especially for women in tourism and how we both enjoyed the local tourism offerings.

So the fact that 0,2% of the amount of the Safety Plan's budget has been put towards a collaboration with the City of Cape Town to ensure that tourists can enjoy tourism experiences in the province, really, I do not know how that could be criticised because it is to ensure safe experience for you and for you and for you, as well as visitors that come and enjoy our tourism offerings from Gauteng, from the Eastern Cape, from KZN and so on, and those visitors who come from outside our borders.

We know that tourism creates jobs and a part of that is having an enjoyable experience so that people come back [Interjections.] and they enjoy our destination and when they come back, they explore even further into the province and so that is an important part of ensuring our recovery to growth in the tourism sector as well.

Then I think that responds then to most of the issues raised in the debate. I would like to thank the members for their inputs. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. [Applause.]

Hon members, I am going to suspend the House for lunch right now because we will have an afternoon programme that we have to get through. The proceedings will be suspended and will resume at 2 o'clock. Thank you very much.

**[The House adjourns at 12:30]**

**[The House resumes at 14:00]**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am now going to ask the Secretary to read the Fourth Order of the Day, Vote 5 on Education.

**4. Debate on Vote 5 – Education – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise [Interjections.] – okay. Thank you very much, hon member, I recognise you.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, you may be aware that before 12 this morning I tabled a motion and I would just like to ask whether you as the House Chair could inform the House about how you intend to deal with the motion, particularly in terms of the Rule which says that if the motion is unanimously supported then it can be dealt with on the same day.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

Hon member, the Deputy Speaker will be joining us to deal with that. I think she is still busy with that. Immediately when she comes to take a seat, she will deal with that, if it is okay with you, is that right? Thank you very much.

I now recognise hon Minister David Maynier. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Our budget is indeed a Framework for Hope; hope for parents, hope for our teachers and most crucially hope for our children, and so it gives me great pleasure to introduce the 2022/23 Adjustment Budget for the Western Cape Education Department, which increases our Main Budget by R17,85 million, from R28,03 billion to R28,5 billion.

Hon Chairperson, when I was appointed in this role I decided to take a slightly different approach to establishing my priorities. I embarked on a listening and learning programme to hear about existing and new ideas that will help us deliver quality education for our learners and hope for our province.

One fact that became immediately clear is that the principals, teachers, practitioners and officials that make up our Education sector, are the greatest asset we have. We entrust our children to their care, to nurture and to guide throughout their schooling career and as I said during my speech at the Provincial Teaching Awards, where I was joined by some members of this House, the one thing that the pandemic taught us is that schools matter and teachers matter.

It came as no surprise to us that our provincial winners went on to shine at the national awards, with no less than four of our teachers winning their categories and a further two placing second. I would like to thank all our teachers across the province for their innovation, for their dedication, for their integrity, for their commitment, for their courage, for their caring and most importantly for their love of our children here in the Western Cape. With such care and dedication in our classrooms, there is surely no limit to what we can achieve.

It is clear that we have great public schools in our province delivering excellent results across our province. We should be proud of their achievement and the work that our schools are doing, but we must not forget the challenges.

A few school visits really stood out for me during my listening and learning programme. At Gordon High School I experienced the reality of overcrowding in classrooms. Every available space in the school had been converted into a classroom, be it a storeroom or a staff room.

At Kalkfontein Primary School I learned that out of a full class of Grade R learners, only a handful had lunchboxes, bringing home the striking reality of our learners' home circumstances.

At Bardale Primary School, which is one of our oldest mobile schools in the province, it was clear that we have a great need for upgrading schools across the board, even as we build new schools.

At Manenberg High School the teacher relayed her traumatic experience of having a bullet fly through the window of the staff room showing just how difficult it can be to educate our children in areas plagued by violent crime.

One thing of course that these schools had in common was excellent leadership and profoundly committed and hardworking teachers. Every one of them was positive and proactive with a common sense and common purpose to uplift our children and I am truly inspired by their work. These schools all have great potential, we just need to help them get, but we cannot say, hon Chairperson, we cannot say that every child is receiving a quality education if they are too many learners in a class, if there are too few teachers in a school and if there are too few schools in our province.

I want us to have more beautiful, safe, inspiring schools that deliver great results in poor communities so that we deliver better opportunities and brighter futures and indeed hope for all our children here in the Western Cape, which is why we are setting a bold new education agenda to do just that. We are employing up to 1 143 additional teachers to staff new classrooms and bring down class sizes. We are offering permanent posts to up to 500 qualified Grade R teachers already employed in our schools in subsidised posts, to retain their skills in the system and expand our provision of Grade R arm.

We are aiming to deliver up to 26 000 new places in our schools next year through our Unprecedented School Infrastructure Delivery Programme, and of course we are taking decisive steps to reverse the learning losses that have knock-on effects throughout our learners' schooling careers.

Hon Chairperson, we have just announced the biggest, fastest and most ambitious school infrastructure delivery programme in years, which aims to deliver 842 new classrooms for the 2023 school year. We are in a position to do so as a result of our budget increase, along with having greater flexibility in implementing our infrastructure programme.

The number of learners in our province's schools has grown by an average of about 17 900 learners every year for the past five years. Accommodating these

new entrants alone would require the construction of 20 new schools each year, but there are a number of other factors affecting school infrastructure, such as the backlog in provision from past years, which has led to crowded classrooms.

We also have a very old portfolio of infrastructure, having inherited many buildings from the apartheid era that need maintenance and replacement. These needs must of course be weighed against the need for new infrastructure, despite the current projections that the average increase in learner numbers will continue.

Our province continues to draw new entrants to our school system as parents seek out better economic opportunities and higher quality education and we must of course make provision for this pattern to continue.

The 842 classrooms planned would provide 26 000 extra places in our schools, now spread over a number of different types of projects. Three brick and mortar new and replacement schools; five new mobile schools; 645 additional classrooms at existing schools and seven Rapid School Build Programme Projects.

As we outlined to the Standing Committee on Education, we have already completed 164 classrooms planned for next year and a further 510 are scheduled for completion by January 2023 and the final 168 are due to be completed by March 2023. The Rapid School Build Programme is an exciting new infrastructure programme that seeks to bring together various stakeholders with the aim of developing and building seven schools within six months to accommodate 3 200 learners.

The management, speed and cooperation of the Rapid School Build Programme differentiates it from typical projects. We are using new building technology like the Moladi technology which uses frames to mould permanent concrete walls. Our contractors have been very receptive to the programme and we will be working through the traditional builders holidays to help us deliver more places for our learners.

All of these new classrooms will of course need teachers to teach them and so earlier this year, as I have said, we announced one of the largest increases in the basket of posts in quite some time, allowing us to appoint up to 1 143 extra teachers for the 2023 school year.

Now some hon members have already started criticising us for the scale of the school building saying that the programme is over ambitious. I am reminded of a great quote by Franklin D Roosevelt, when he said:

"The country demands bold, persistent experimentation. It is common sense to take a method and try it. If it fails admit it frankly and try another, but above all try something."

If there was ever a time to be ambitious, to lean in, a time to be bold and a time to try something, that time is now, and so yes, we are being ambitious, providing 26 000 new places for the 2023 school year. Yes, we have already

had some challenges at some of our sites, which is extremely disappointing and any disruption or delay will deprive learners of places next year.

We have briefed the Standing Committee on Education openly on the considerable risks and yes, it is possible that some of the 842 classrooms may well be delayed, but that is not a reason not to try.

When I saw the speed at which the Moladi classrooms were going up at the Hindle High School last week and how beautiful the completed ones were at Westridge Secondary School, I was filled with a sense of optimism and indeed of purpose.

So while we are indeed aware that this is not an easy task and that there are many risks, I hope that we can all work together to prioritise the delivery of school infrastructure for our children.

Hon Chairperson, at the same time we must not lose sight of the fact that the COVID-19 pandemic had on learners already in our schools. Earlier this year we announced that the results of the 2021 systemic tests revealed severe learning losses associated with the pandemic. While we had previously made great progress with a steady increase in performance in years preceding 2020, these gains were unfortunately reversed by the pandemic.

The greatest learning losses of course were seen in the Foundation Phase. These learning losses will have serious knock-on effects as those learners progress through their school careers.

It was for this reason that we implemented a back on track intervention to reverse learning losses in the Foundation Phase. We took a decisive step of adding an extra two hours per week allocated to reading and one hour extra per week for Mathematics for all Grade 1 to 3 learners in this province, amounting to an increase of at least 60 additional learning hours per learner in these subjects, and I am pleased to report that in a recent survey of our schools, 94% of teachers indicated that they would like the additional time allocation to continue in 2023.

The majority of teachers indicated that the additional time allocation was beneficial for the learners and 96% of teachers indicated that they could integrate life skills into languages with ease. Moreover, the early grade reading assessment results, which are measured twice a year, also show improvement across all eight education districts.

We have taken this information to the National Department and have already had a number of very positive conversations about implementing the additional time allocations across the country so that the unequal impact of learning losses can be addressed for learners in all provinces, not just here in the Western Cape.

Hon Chairperson, in the end what we want to see is schools that deliver hope for our children. The fact is that the vast majority of us in our country want to live together in harmony and want to improve the quality of life for all who live in our

country. What we do not need in our country is division. What we do need is unity and compassion towards one another. Yes, we will face challenges and there are no doubt more difficult times ahead, but we will overcome those challenges if we keep in mind the central goal, the unity, quality and well-being of our children, and we will overcome those challenges if we all work together to achieve the vision of quality education for every child in every classroom in every school in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

I now recognise hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson.

We also thank hon Van der Westhuizen for the lamb shank, it is [Laughs.] – thank you very much, hon Chairperson.

Hon Chairperson, as articulated in our Standing Committee last week on behalf of the African National Congress, I rise to reject this budget. Hon MEC David Maynier speaks of a budget to bring hope, but unfortunately this budget represents the antithesis of that, notwithstanding the fact, and we thank the MEC that he does speak about the socio-economic conditions that our people are facing. We thank the MEC for that, but the budget does not speak to that particular reality.

While it is claimed that the Western Cape Education Department's budget increased over R17 million, the reality is that if it was not for the roll-overs of over R24 million, the budget could have decreased by R6,9 million. The budgets for early Childhood Development and Infrastructure Development are decreased by R104 million and R130 million respectively. Such a move shows the DA's nonchalant attitude [Interjections.] towards access to quality education for all.

This budget is considered at the time when MEC Maynier promised to build 800 additional classrooms and seven new schools for 26 000 learners, as he articulated, in response to the DA's self-orchestrated crisis of unplaced learners year after year, and that will also see January 2023, and in response to us exposing these numbers and to us demanding that action be taken.

So oversight has worked to an extent. The budget cuts in the Infrastructure Development Programme show that the MEC's ambitious plan is merely DA spin. When MEC Maynier and his Department appeared before our Education Standing Committee last month, the public were told that as at 3 November 2022, over 25 000 learners were still in need of placement at schools across our province.

The budget cuts prove that the target to build 26 000 additional classroom seats will not be achieved and we know all too well the crisis that we will be faced with come January 2023.

We continue not to accept, however, any excuses for unplaced learners. A plan must take place. The ANC will fight that no child must be left behind in January 2023. That remains our motto. [Applause.]

It is extremely concerning that the WCED spending on its Infrastructure Development Budget is slow compared to last year. There is a high probability that MEC Maynier's Department will underspend on this budget.

Under the Democratic Alliance since 2009, when they took office in this province, this Department has built a reputation for underspending on infrastructure development in particular. This Department's performance on infrastructure development can best be described as shambolic. This includes its dismal performance on maintenance and renovations at ailing schools in poor communities, both in the Metro and in rural areas.

One example is the delay, the long delay to renovate Portland Primary School in Mitchells Plain. The ANC first made calls for the renovations at the school during the Medium-Term Budget debate on 10 December 2021. Working closely with parents, community members and local ANC structures in the area, we continue to apply pressure on the Department. The school is now a construction site until 2023. That is a positive gain from active oversight.

We commend unsung heroes like the dedicated activist Mr Munir Hendricks, who is present in the gallery today. Sadly he was purged and suffered victimisation for reporting infrastructure challenges at the school while he was on the SGB and making demands for WCED to address the dangerous structural defects. Defects that impacted on his own children and other children.

Hon Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the over R10 million budget allocation for Public Special School Education. However, we are concerned by the shift of R12,9 million for buildings and other fixed structures in special needs schools that will now be used in public ordinary schools. This is unacceptable as there are serious infrastructure needs across many special needs schools. We will continue to work with NGOs, some of whose representatives, like Terry Stevens from Autism SA, are present as our guest today, to stand up for our learners with special needs. Equally concerning is the fact that funds for Grade R in ECD Centres and public schools are being utilised for programmes such as Information Communication Technology.

In January 2023 we will sadly again, hon Chair, see learners from poor families being turned away from schools if they do not have money to contribute towards the compulsory donations set by certain schools in poor communities for Grade R classes. We witnessed this practice first-hand in Mfuleni and Elsie's River last – not last year, this year January.

The ANC, hon Chair, is on record to have called on MEC Maynier to consider expanding the project of learner application pop-up banners to more shopping

centres, beyond shopping centres and over a longer period to assist more of our parents. This was a programme which we called for initially in the time of MEC Schäfer and even actively went out to these pop-up banners to support the staff of WCED in doing their work.

We thus welcome the Department's commitment to provide more budget to expand this project. This programme should be fully funded and be implemented every year beyond shopping centres, to spaces such as taxi ranks, for example. The moratorium blocking school closures announced by MEC Maynier in the Sitting of 8 September this year, will have an impact on the budget, which must be considered. This moratorium, however, is a victory for all progressive forces in the province. It is, however, disheartening that the Education Department has recently attempted to close Vleiplaas NGK Primary School near Barrydale in the constituency of the hon member Windvogel, despite this moratorium.

On 24 October this year I wrote to MEC Maynier, seeking clarity on whether the moratorium covered the planned closure of Vleiplaas. The MEC replied as follows:

"In the case of Vleiplaas the owners of the school building have indicated that they are not prepared to enter into a new contract with the Department."  
[Interjections.]

This response by the MEC indicated the Department's resolve to still close the school and to use the owners as a scapegoat.

I need to therefore acknowledge the efforts of dedicated education activists Ms Vanessa le Roux of the Parents for Equal Education in South Africa, for her fundamental role in collaborative efforts to now keep the school open. Ms Le Roux did the job that officials in the Department was supposed to do by engaging the owners towards reaching a workable solution so that the school does not close.

Hon Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you can conclude.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... I want to raise concerns with regards to WCED's inconsistent treatment of school principals. The MEC has protected the principal of Zwaanswyk High School in Tokai, who faced serious maladministration allegations and bullying ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up, you can conclude.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: I am concluding, hon Chairperson.

Hon Chairperson, the African National Congress will not support this particular debate. We will not support a Vote of a Democratic Alliance that is based on neoliberal [Inaudible.] measures, that has got a Premier [Interjections.] that

plunges this House ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... into disorder because he interferes with the running of this House ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... by interfering on who must lead this House. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up, hon member.

Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, through to you, I want the Minister of Education to take note of what we are saying as EFF, that we are not impressed with the manner in which the Western Cape Department of Education handles matters that involves racial tensions in our schools.

The latest incident, hon Chair, is one from Fish Hoek High School which involves the Race Diversity Intervention Programme. The recent racial tensions in that school begun when a white teacher uttered slurs against non-white learners during an Afrikaans lesson. Instead of taking this white teacher to task, hon Chair, the Department and the school tried to sweep the matter under the carpet.

Now when aggrieved learners and parents raised their concerns, the Department now wants to be seen to be doing something by introducing the so-called Race Diversity Intervention Programme, which in essence had to be carried out in a manner that will nurse the egos of the same racists.

After realising that, hon Chair, the programme is not being taught according to their own wishes, the Department now wants to kill a career and a company owned by a black woman who tried to contribute to the discourse of racism in a robust manner, by reading a certain poem.

Hon Chair, the Department is now in partnerships with organisations such as AfriForum in an endeavour to shift focus from the white racist teacher to an innocent black woman whose only sin in their eyes was to read an existing poem which speaks on the issues of racism.

We all know, Madam Chair, by now that this Department is failing dismally to carry out its duties of placing learners [Inaudible.] going forward because of its [Inaudible.] DNA.

Moreover, hon House Chair, the Department should also note that the period of

colonialism and racism is over and white people will not dictate on how we should address issues of racism. We are not going to address issues of racism ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ... in a manner that will make them happy.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up ...[Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTHA: On that note, hon Chairperson, the EFF will not support this Vote, thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson, and the ACDP as we said, supports the Budget Vote, but I want to bring a couple of concerns again to the Minister and the concerns are (1) the Department has increased the no-fee paying schools, but communities still struggling must pay something like R1 000 or more for stationery. They do not have money, but they are still burdened to pay stationery money and if they do not do that they are in trouble because they are burdened with those amounts.

Then another question to the Minister, we heard now again in the last time, report cards are held back by schools for people not paying school fees again. So if the Minister can give us a clear indication what is the policy of his Department.

Another big concern and I have mentioned it so many times, a child in Manenberg that applies to Wynberg does not get accepted because, as the Minister indicated, when we look at the traumatic experiences by a bullet ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, [Inaudible.] may conclude, your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Or the overcrowding of schools, that is why people want to give their children better education, quality education and they are not receiving. We are not on par when it comes to quality education. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, the Al Jama-ah Party cannot support this budget on

Education as it is evident that the budget is not effectively aimed to solve crucial issues negatively impacting on the education of the poor.

We have seen how this DA-run province wastes money on court cases against the progressive principal of Heathfield High School, Mr Wesley Newman. This Department is even harassing educators who are supporting Mr Newman, not only wasting money on trumped up charges against Mr Newman, but also denying our children on the Cape Flats good teachers. We will not support this budget to build your unisex toilets in schools. We will not support this budget as it is not effectively addressing the need for safe and secure school environments. I thank you, hon House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise hon member Baartman.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, at the end of last week hon member Ricardo Mackenzie actually dubbed our Minister of Education as "Vinnige Fanie" and I just want us to note that it is quite ironic because in Afrikaans netball slang the "Vinnige Fanie" actually refers to the "VV" position in Afrikaans, or "verdedigende vleuel", and I would like to testify to the fact that in this particular year the Department of Education has truly been at the forefront of defending quality education for every child in every school in this province.

Together, the Health and Education budgets make up to over R168 billion over the MTF period or approximately 73% of the total budget and I would firstly like to congratulate the previous Minister of Education, Ms Debbie Schäfer, for achieving the unqualified audit for the Department for the past financial year [Interjections.], as well as achieving 100% expenditure on infrastructure for the Department, which is contained in the Annual Report of the Department on page 12, which was tabled at this particular House. [Interjections.]

Hon House Chair, Minister Maynier announced recently also that it would be constructing an additional 842 classrooms in the current financial year, which far exceeds the construction of 212 classrooms last year and as such will provide for at least 26 000 places for learners. This Western Cape ground-breaking initiative will almost be 70% larger than the building of 499 classrooms, which Gauteng announced in the beginning of this year in comparison and thus the construction of these classrooms is crucial in sustaining our teaching capacity, and the WCED has indicated its commitment to working through the holiday season to make this happen.

You see, hon Chairperson, †verdedigende vleuel het visie en sy prioriteite is reg [defending wing has vision and his priorities are right.]

Hon House Chair, our educators are ... May I continue? Hon House Chair, educators are our frontline workers and without them we cannot achieve quality education. The WCED announced the appointment of up to 1 143 additional educators in 2023 and the estimated cost of the additional educator posts will

amount to approximately R503,4 million. This will bring the amount of the teachers posts to over 36 000 for the 2023 year and will contribute to quality education in the province and the WCED will also be permanently employing 500 qualified Grade R teachers in the beginning of 2023.

I would like to take this moment also to congratulate Pinelands North Primary and Westend Primary for making it to the top three and top 10 in the World's Best Schools competition for overcoming adversity, hon House Chair.

Further, as the House may be aware, earlier this year the WCED took on the responsibility of the Early Childhood Development Centres from the Provincial Department of Social Development. There are now 1 613 certified ECD Centres in the Western Cape that are financially supported by the WCED in order for them to carry out the operations. For those ECDs who have still not submitted their respective documents or submitted incorrect documents, we encourage them to contact the Department in this regard as they may know that they can only receive their funding if their documents are in order as per conditional grant criteria.

Additionally the WCED has spent more than R9,5 million on the Blocks For Growth and Step-Up programmes, which will provide 4- and 5-year-olds and 5- to 6-year-olds respectively with the opportunity to progress developmentally so that they can meet the demands of the learning environments. These funds are managed by social service organisations, namely the Learning Initiative and Knysna Education Trust.

Hon House Chair, during the course of this year the WCED also updated the Committee on the 2023 admissions process for Grade 1 and Grade 8 learners, after receiving over 117 000 applications for the 2023 school year. At that time 89,1% had already been placed as at 3 November this year, with the remainder in the process of being placed and of the total applications submitted, approximately 22 113 were received late.

This figure excludes the expected late applications which the WCED expects to receive towards the end of the year. We note that the WCED is working around the clock to still place approximately 12 000 Grade 1 and 8 learners for the next year. Hon House Chair, page 3 of that report, it is 12 000, not 25.

In comparison the ENCA reported on 27 November this year that Gauteng had over 35 000 Grade 1 and Grade 8 learners still to place for the new year, almost triple that of what the Western Cape is facing, and this is largely due to semi-migration across provinces to particularly urban centres.

If there are any parents who have yet to submit their children's applications they must do so urgently and contact the respective district offices and if there are any appeals in the respect to their child's placement, we recommend that they contact the Minister's office in this regard.

Honourable House Chair, March this year it was also revealed that the current growth rate of students taking at least one technical agricultural subject, is 3,26%, which exceeds the annual target of 2% this year. This is further proof of

the essential role the industry plays in our province and economy, as well as the need to continue supporting education in this regard.

Agriculture as well as computational skills and the arts form part of the WCED's Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts, Mathematics, Agriculture and Coding or STEAMAC strategy, which aims to directly prepare learners for the career in these respective fields.

Last year the Department spent R2,6 million incorporating the disciplines of it arts subjects, consumer studies, agricultural technology, and agriculture management practices to STEAMAC. However, these developments further build on the progress that have been made over the years and since 2015 the WCED has then added 25 more schools which offer agricultural subjects.

Infrastructure allocations were initially made in 2020 to allow seven schools to accommodate agricultural technology, which was further expanded by 11 schools during the last financial year. It is clear that agriculture and coding will become more crucial in the education packages for our province has to offer and in August this year the WCED also revealed that it planned to establish 500 robotic encodings clubs in primary and high schools by 2024.

The Fourth Industrial Revolution is playing a significant role in transforming the economy and society. In South Africa alone there are thousands of jobs in the sector, where there are not enough candidates to apply and it is therefore crucial for our learners to easily integrate into an increasingly digitalised world.

Already the WCED has 211 robotic and coding pilot schools in place and has achieved 500 cost-effective robotics kits for schools, several coding and robotic committees, teacher orientation and training, as well as teacher professional development, the appointment of Deputy Chief Education Specialist in the WCED, which is a first in South Africa and greater collaboration between directorates to ensure efficiency in this regard.

While there is still a lot of work to be done, the Western Cape is laying the foundation for education to stay current, impactful and useful for our children. Vinnige Fanie se prioriteite is reg, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, the long-term well-being of delivering inclusive education, previously known as special needs education, for learners still remains a funding concern and is currently not included in the National Treasury calculations for the Provincial Equitable Share formula. Without proper resources the Western Cape's progress will continue to be undermined, despite the budgetary ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you take your seat. Minister Sharna, I recognise you.

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chair, is it appropriate for a member to call the speaker a blue liar? [Interjections.] Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon [Interjections.] – hon member, you are not [Interjections.] ... hon member Sayed, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Can I [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you, hon House Chair.

My understanding, hon House Chair, is that we just had the motion which was now passed for the ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... for the vacancy of the Speaker to be filled ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: I do not know which Speaker the hon Fernandez [Interjections.] is referring to ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Deputy Whip of the Opposition ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... we do not have a Speaker as yet, thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... that is not the point of order. [Interjections.] and hon member Windvogel [Interjections.] ... hon member Windvogel ... hon members ... hon member Windvogel, you are not even on your seat. Can you really go to your seat so that I can be able to talk to you.

Hon member Windvogel, may I address you? [Interjections.] When you said, "The blue liars there," did you say that to any member in the House?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: She is a blue liar.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon member, you continue.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon House Chair.

I will deal with learning losses in our education system soon because there is a difference between a small "s" in a sentence and a big "S" in a sentence as well.

Hon House Chair, despite the budgetary pressures experienced in inclusive education even the National Department of Education has welcomed the advances the Western Cape Province had made. The Western Cape is the first province to have established inclusive education outreach teams who work in our eight districts of which there are 22 already in operation. These teams also join 64 circuit support teams wherein each has a psychologist, social worker and learning support advisor. [Interjections.]

The WCED has also launched a pilot with the Red Cross Memorial Hospital in relation to the policy of screening identification, assessment and support. This policy forms part of the framework as to how one determines whether a child needs to be placed in a special school and with the cooperation of six doctors at this hospital the WCED has automated this process, which will allow greater efficiency in this regard. This process will also be reviewed with the hope that it will be rolled out to other large hospitals in the province.

Further the WCED has also recognised the need for staff to be able to accommodate [Interjections.] all learners and has begun the Teaching For All modules.

Thank you, hon House Chair. This project, which entails four modules, aims to provide teachers with the skills needed for inclusive education and while current teachers are being trained in cohorts, these modules will eventually become mandatory for teachers still undergoing the respective training.

All newly built schools in this category are also being built for accessibility for students with mobility difficulties and at least two current schools per district are being upgraded every year.

In terms of literacy and numeracy learning losses, hon House Chair, as we all know the pandemic has had profound consequences on our learning outcomes following the loss of face-to-face teaching and this translated into continual and steady progress which the WC had made during the years preceding COVID-19, being undone.

We saw this in the Western Cape systemic tests last year, the only province with such tests, where both pass rates and averages in Mathematics and Languages decreased since 2019 and, hon House Chair, this is something that was experienced throughout our country, but here in the Western Cape we did not sit and wait around. This is why the WCED instituted its Back On Track Recovery Plan by allocating an additional two hours of group guided reading and one hour of Mathematics every week. It is expected that every Foundation Phase learner will gain an extra 60 hours of learning over the course of the third and fourth term and it is encouraging to hear from the Minister that 94% of teachers want this to continue in 2023 and the WCED has thus made the recommendation to National to also implement this across the country.

Further, hon House Chair, the WCED has facilitated the establishment of 571 food gardens at schools and has appointed 146 gardeners to ensure that these are sustained.

Further in the current financial year more than R451 million has been allocated to the National Schools Nutrition Programme, which is a conditional grant, which includes 1 024 schools and feeds over 500 000 learners. While there is no doubt that this programme ensures that many children do not go hungry, we are concerned about how the national quintiles system is excluding learners in need.

The system does not speak to the socio-economic status of the student and therefore results in insufficient funding allocated to the provincial departments and thus the respective schools. Thankfully, through savings that have been made in this programme, the WCED was able to fund selected quintile 4 to 5 schools for 190 days of the year and we encourage the Department to expedite its expenditure on the programme for the rest of the financial year.

Hon House Chair, this budget further makes provision for the development of competency-based assessments of schools as it will be implemented by the Department of the Premier, as well as making R2,7 million available for the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport for the At Home Learning Programme.

The R16 million of rollovers from National is for committed expenditure, which will be for Math, Science and Technology expenditure conditional grant on page 69 of the budget, as well as for learners with profound intellectual disabilities conditional grant, also on page 69 of the respective budget, and the rest of the rollovers will be for the courier fees for June and November 2021 national senior exams.

Hon House Chair, I would like to conclude by thanking the members of the Education Committee, our procedural administrative staff of the Committee, the Minister of Education, the HOD, the departmental team, for their hard work during this past year and we hope to welcome them back in the new year, refreshed.

Hon House Chair, I would also like to take a moment to pay tribute to the late Chief Whip, Lorraine Botha, who was also the previous Education Committee Chairperson and who worked hard every single day to ensure that everything we do is in the best interest of the child. †Ons hoop dat ons braaf genoeg is om aan haar nalatenskap te kan voldoen. [We hope we will be brave enough to live up to her legacy.] We still have a lot to improve on in education, but we will continue working towards quality education for every child in every school in this province.

Hon House Chair, the Democratic Alliance supports this Vote. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise hon Minister David Maynier. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Chairperson. [Interjections.]

As I stated during the debate, I want us to have more beautiful, safe, inspiring schools in poor communities to deliver better opportunities and brighter futures and hope for all our children. [Interjections.]

We are taking bold steps to expand the number of places for learners in our schools [Interjections.] by building schools and classrooms at an unprecedented rate and significantly increasing the number of teaching posts in our schools. In our interventions to reverse learning losses caused by the COVID-19 pandemic are bearing fruit, with the potential to be adopted across the country.

I would like to thank hon members of the House for their contributions to this debate and I would like to address a couple of the issues raised.

First on the whole question of ECD. The shifting of these funds, as the hon member must know, will have no impact on ECD provision as of course the funds come from the Grade R sub-programme and this of course is due to the relatively lower cost requirements than projected at the start of the financial year because the programme, as the hon member knows, will now be implemented only from January 2023.

When it comes to learner placements we have briefed the Committee in detail and what the hon member appears not to have heard is that by 3 November 2022 the Department had placed 100 302 or 89,1% of Grade 1 and Grade 8 learners for the 2023 school year here in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

On the whole question of Fish Hoek High School. We have been absolutely clear that what happened at Fish Hoek High School [Interjections.] should never have happened and a full investigation is underway. That investigation is currently ongoing and of course to the extent that there may need to be interventions, they should always be aimed at building unity and deepening understanding rather than causing division and hurt at our schools, as appears to have been the case at Fish Hoek High School.

On the whole question of the Vleiplaas Primary School. The hon member is correct. The owners of the school building have indicated that they are not prepared to enter into a new contract with the Department and I can assure the hon member that we are negotiating with the owner and I expect such discussions to reach finality soon. [Interjections.]

I am concerned to hear about schools withholding reports and indeed schools where parents cannot afford stationery. We do provide assistance and I would be delighted if the hon member Ferlon Christians would provide me with particulars of the matters which he raised so that we can deal with those schools.

The whole question of Wesley Newman and Heathfield High School. The hon member knows that the ELRC Commissioner has conducted a pre-arbitration

meeting with the agreement of all parties present and dates have now been agreed to. I think we should not forget that Wesley Newman was found guilty of a number of a serious charges. He was nonetheless offered a second chance. He was offered a second chance, which he rejected and he was thus dismissed. We of course, hon member, are now focused on ensuring the teaching and learning at Heathfield High School continues in the best interest of the learners in a safe environment without disruption. I want to make it clear that we will not tolerate any attempts to disrupt and undermine teaching and learning at Heathfield High School.

Now the hon member Khalid Sayed, if hon members recall, made a lot of noise about not receiving the budget books during the debate, but the real question, hon Chairperson, is well, to what end? Because it does not appear that the hon member reads the Budget books. He claims that spending on infrastructure is slow, but indeed if he paid attention to page 78 of the Budget book, it says very clearly that spending, and I quote:

"Spending is higher."

And if he took the time to calculate the difference between spending on Table 5.3 compared to Table 5.4, he would find in fact that we have spent R260 million more on infrastructure this year compared to the same time last year.

An HON MEMBER: Comprehension. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Shame!

An HON MEMBER: Comprehension is very important.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Perhaps I could call on the hon Minister of Finance to convene a workshop for the hon member. [Interjections.]

Now the hon ...

An HON MEMBER: Special class.

An HON MEMBER: That is [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The hon member Khalid Sayed also makes ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, we cannot hear the speaker, please settle down. [Interjections.] Go on, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Chairperson, the hon member Khalid Sayed makes another extraordinary claim [Interjections.] and that is that this is an austerity budget. Well, how do we explain the R6 billion increase to the

Education baseline? The R2,5 billion infrastructure budget which has increased by R830 million. [Interjections.] The 1 143 additional posts.

Now I ask hon members [Interjections.] does this sound like an austerity budget? No.

An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No! This is a massive expansion in the budget.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And a massive increase in access to education in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Chairperson, in closing, this budget is indeed a framework for hope, hope for our parents, hope for our teachers and hope for our children.

We know that we will face challenges as we seek to implement our bold new agenda for Education and we have been frank with this House about the nature of the risks involved, but as I said earlier, this is not a reason not to try. We will overcome those challenges if we keep in mind the central goal, the unity, the equality and the well-being of our children and we will overcome those challenges indeed if we all work together to achieve the vision of quality education for every child in every classroom, in every school in the Western Cape ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, may you take your seat.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Is the hon MEC able to take a question? Given that he does not respond, [Interjections.] he takes long to respond ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit down ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... is he able to respond ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister – sit down ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... to a question on the spending?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... I heard you. Hon Minister, do you want to take a question?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Chairperson, I mean this once again raises the question of whether it is not a requirement for another workshop because in fact I had completed my speech and cannot answer a question. Thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

That concludes the debate on this Vote. The Secretary will read the Fifth Order of the Day.

**5. Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon members, I now recognise Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chairperson, hon Premier and Cabinet colleagues, hon members of the Provincial Legislature in the House and on the virtual platform, members of the media, citizens of the Western Cape, good afternoon, goeie middag, molweni nonke, As-salamu alaykum.

I rise to table the Adjustment Budget for Vote 7 as South Africa continues with its economic recovery following the devastating impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. Good afternoon.

We are still feeling the global effects of the Russia-Ukraine war and as a country we are battered by rolling blackouts which have a disproportionate impact on the lives and livelihoods of the most vulnerable in society.

The Department of Social Development has not been immune to the economic challenges and constraints imposed on the rest of the world and South Africa, over the last few turbulent years, but we remain resolute in our commitment to serving the most vulnerable with the limited resources and budgetary constraints so prevalent in all governments across our country.

One glimmer of hope is the R79,7 million increase in additional funding in our Adjustment Budget. This allocation increased our initial R2,2 billion budget to R2,3 billion. This increase will allow us to expand our current services in some areas such as food relief.

Hon House Chairperson, with this increase we will be able to allocate R25 million towards food relief for social relief of distress. The food relief programme will be extended to all municipal districts through the support the Department gives to community nutrition and development centres and community kitchens.

R7,5 million of the additional funding will address food shortages in areas without Department funded food relief programmes, as well as at existing sites where current food resources have not been sufficient to assist all beneficiaries in need.

We are looking to extend the feeding days in vulnerable communities from two to five days a week and R6,8 million has been allocated for community-based organisations to provide meals in rural areas five days a week, while R6,7 million will go towards those kitchens in urban areas for feeding four days a week.

Over R2,7 million has been allocated to these community-based organisations to cushion them against rising food costs, transport and gas prices. The Department will also utilise R959 000 to procure food parcels for immediate relief as and when required.

In this way we will continue to address the dire need in areas across the Western Cape where the COVID-19 pandemic has impacted communities who are experiencing poverty, unemployment and socio-economic distress, which has in many cases plunged households below the bread line.

It is important, hon House Chair, to note that disaster relief is not this Department's mandate, but it is that of the South African Social Security Agency. We have to time and time again stand in the gap where and when this national agency falls short. We have to do this while still meeting our core priorities, often with staff and resources stretched to the limit.

However, we do so for the people of this province. We do so to remind citizens that we are a caring Government and that we will do all we can to ensure that the knock-on effects of poverty, such as limited access to job opportunities, substance use disorder, crime and interpersonal violence and abuse, GBV especially, are addressed.

We have also heard the pleas from our social workers who tirelessly work to ensure that the needs of communities are met, often at great personal cost to themselves. In the wake of the COVID disaster and the current economic crisis the need for psychosocial support to citizens has increased, making it more important than ever before for us to increase resources in these areas and these services.

R43,9 million has been allocated to ensure the Department can sustain its need for social service professional capacity. This will cover the shortfall attributable to the implementation of the 3% wage increase, grade progress pay-outs to social work professionals and provision for leave gratuity and early retirement pension pay-outs.

It has allowed us, hon House Chair, to immediately fill 54 vacant posts of which 39 are social work professionals. In doing so we also aim to strengthen the Department's contribution to the Provincial Safety Plan, especially by addressing gender-based violence and child protection in communities. Many of these social workers and social auxiliary workers are being placed in safety hotspot areas where crimes against women and children are rife. These critical posts will not support child protection services and gender-based violence interventions.

They will also offer relief to those social work professionals who are spread thin

on the ground, especially in these areas with high rates of violence against women, children and members of the LGBTQIA plus community.

Hon House Chair, R6,3 million was approved for rollover from the previous year and has been allocated for the modification, customisation and operations of vehicles for the transport of intellectually disabled children. Thus far we have handed over four vehicles to NGOs assisting children with severe to profound intellectual disabilities. The Department has placed an order for another two vehicles to ensure we fulfil our legal obligation of making provision for children with severe to profound intellectual disabilities to attend schools.

The Department wants to ensure that no girl stays out of school due to a lack of access to sanitary products. We have accordingly allocated R1,5 million toward the Province's Sanitary Dignity Project as mandated by National Government. This rollover of funds is to settle our prior year's commitment to deliver it in the current financial year.

The Department, hon House Chair, is targeting 300 schools across the province because there are certain conditions attached, with the possibility of more schools being accommodated should the Education Department identify further need.

R2,2 million has been approved for rollover funding towards substance abuse, non-profit institutions. This funding is aimed at mitigating the impact of budget cuts in the substance abuse programme. The Department has had to make significant reduction in services in both community-based treatment and residential centres due to funding shortages in the current year's budget.

Hon House Chair, substance abuse is a contributing factor to many social ills, like gender-based violence, domestic violence, child abuse, unemployment and crime. The interventions we were able to introduce to reduce these problems were detrimentally impacted due to the slashing of funds earlier in the year.

Hon House Chair, we have been able to reallocate a significant amount of funds towards necessary expenses for the good of our communities. Funds were reclassified towards the transport project to operationalise the modified specialised vehicles. This will enable us to support NGOs that provide services to persons with disabilities.

Within person interactions picking up post COVID, the Department has seen the increased need for social workers to travel to the people who require their services most. Travel and subsistence funds have been replaced or prioritised towards fleet travel costs for social workers who need to travel extensively in Government Garage vehicles in order to ensure the psychosocial needs of communities are met. It will also be allocated for subsistence programmes like parenting workshops where the provision of food is needed for parent attendees from impoverished households.

The COVID-19 pandemic, the global economic turmoil caused by warring nations and subsequent rising cost of living, have thrown us into choppy waters, which has been exacerbated by the plundering of the public purse,

maladministration and corruption on an unprecedented level by a corrupt ANC Government. It has not been easy to steer the ship, but we will keep hope alive.

As a Department and as a Government we have tried to the best of our ability to make miracles happen with the limited funding allocated to the Province by National Treasury. Although we have been able to fill vacant social work posts, much more is needed. [Interjections.]

We have social work professionals close to burning out and facing harassment [Interjections.] when assisting clients and an increasing need for services, yet the funding required to alleviate the burden is inadequate.

The people of the Western Cape are placing their hope in our hands, yet it is being tied by a National Government far removed from the reality [Interjections.] of the lived experiences of those on the ground. Although we are near the end of 16 Days of Activism for no violence against women and children, we are committed to continuing the fight against the scourge 365 days a year. I believe if we stand united with one voice 365 days of the year, the second silent pandemic of gender-based violence can be drastically reduced.

I am therefore appealing to members of this august House to collaborate and actively champion GBV awareness in education in your respective constituencies.

Hon House Chairperson, I wish to thank my Cabinet colleagues at the Executive Council, led by Premier Alan Winde, for their continued support and motivation. I am also grateful to the Department of Social Development led by HOD, Dr Robert MacDonald, for their tireless efforts and commitment to serving the most vulnerable citizens of this province on a daily basis.

Every staff member in team DSD is making a contribution and for that I wish to say I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

I recognise the hon member Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: [Inaudible.] Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The ANC rejects this budget. While the R79 million in the budget is noted we, however, concede that this budget does not get near addressing some of the most pressing challenges in the province.

R43 million on this budget comes from the National Government to make provision for the impact of the 2022 3% wage increase. This means the increase is mainly towards the Compensation of Employees. We are very disturbed with the Department's cut of R5,3 million for Compensation of Employees, when we have been making calls on the Department to create opportunities for unemployment social workers graduate.

Yes, we take note of the fact that the Minister mentioned that they have

employed social workers, but still we believe that this amount could have been spent to create more employment opportunities for these much-needed social workers. There is a great demand for social work graduates in schools and we do have sufficient supply of this. Only thing that is lacking is the budget.

We have advised the MEC and the Department to engage the Western Cape Education Department to form a partnership that will see this graduates deployed in schools. To this date this has not happened and we do not know why.

Hon Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the additional R25 million allocation for the provisions for food relief for social distress. Even during the COVID-19 pandemic the ANC was among the first to call for this food relief programme to be continued. Our people are hungry and suffering from the increased cost of living. Many have lost their jobs as the economy is recovering slowly from the impact of COVID-19 and has been impacted by the ongoing global conflict.

It is for this reason that we believe this food relief must be a core mandate of this Department with an annual budget. This should not be a once-off allocation that can be discontinued next year.

Hon Chairperson, we are on day 11 of the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children. We continue to remember all those victims of GBV and femicide.

This Department is taking the lead in coordinating this Government's response to Gender-Based Violence and Femicide. We are having this debate a week after the release of the Second Quarter Crime Statistics, which showed a 23,6% in sexual offences. I wonder where the Safety Plan is.

It is highly disappointing that no provision is made in this Budget to respond to such a high increase. Hence, the hon Premier will always say we have a Safety Plan. Even the members of the blue overalls or bakkies will say we have a Safety Plan, which serves in another country or other provinces that we do not know of, but not here in the Western Cape. This budget is allocating R68 million for the Victim Empowerment Programme. This small amount is too little to address the 23,6% rise in sexual offences. Clearly, the Department has failed to prioritise the safety of women and children.

As the ANC, we want the Department and Provincial Government to increase the budget for Victim Empowerment. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the budget for service to the persons with disabilities programme has been increased by R7,2 million to R198,9 million. While this increase is welcomed, we have to ask if this is enough to ensure the protection of persons with disabilities. More NPOs in the rural communities must be prioritised for funding in order to ensure that the Department has a footprint in areas where these services are needed. If there were not enough NPOs in Nduli for instance, the Department would not rely on us as the ANC to give them information about Ms Cynthia Bles who continues to live in an abandoned building with her physically challenged son.

I welcome the Acting HOD's commitment to follow up on the matter of Ms Bles. Ms Bles, an elderly woman and her son, must be prioritised for a house and this

Department must take the lead in ensuring that no other elderly person nor disabled person suffer the same fate as Ms Bles. I hope the hon Minister of Human Settlements is listening.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, we note with concern that funds for the Child Care and Protection Services programme have shifted to another sub-programme as a result of closure of NPOs. A closure of NPOs will have devastating impacts on children in the province. This also means that those people will lose jobs. We do not know the reason for the closure of NPOs, but we hope it is not because of noncompliance. We have been calling on the Department to assist NPOs with compliance.

The reduced budget for Compensation of Employees could have gone a long way to employ more staff members to assist NPOs to be compliant. Many NPOs working with children have received warnings of possible reduced budget allocation for the next financial year. This will have a negative impact on these organisations and on children. This decision by the Department will lead to job losses and to a closure of more NPOs. The ANC is opposed to this planned reduced budget for NPOs working with children. We want the hon MEC to tell us the reason for these planned cuts. The ANC rejects this budget. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon member Makamba-Botya, I recognise you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, early this year during his State of Province Address, the hon Premier of this Province made an empty promise that shelters will be made available for homeless people. However, hon Temporary Chairperson, if one is to take a simple walk from the CPUT campus in District Six and walk along the outskirts of the Castle of Good Hope, then one would realise that the plight of homeless poor people does not matter to the Democratic Alliance Provincial Government.

This situation, hon Temporary Chairperson, of homeless people who are sleeping inside plastic shelters and eating from the bins at the time of that speech earlier this year, is very much the same, if not even worse. As I stand before you now, we see billions of rands being appropriated to the Provincial Department of Social Development and they now are to receive another extra R79,7 million, but homeless people continue to suffer more.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, homeless people ... [Audio distorted.] whose rights continue to be violated on a daily basis, they remain ... [Audio distorted.] coupled with ...[Audio distorted.] include mental health. Therefore, hon Temporary Chairperson, it becomes difficult if not impossible, for most of them to know their rights and exercise them. It is then this reason that a pro-rich Provincial Government such as this one, neglects them.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, it can never be right to say you have a budget for homeless people in your coffers and then, not spend the budget on them. The DA-led Government must understand that taxpayers' money does not belong to

them. In this country, we have laws governing socio-economic rights which are entrenched in the South African Constitution. Hon Temporary Chairperson, making shelters, food, and other necessities available to homeless people is a constitutional obligation required from the Government by the Constitution. It can never be that in every financial year, money is being surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund and under-expenditure, but then people remain poor and homeless.

On that note, hon Temporary Chairperson, the EFF does not support this Vote. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Dan Plato.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much for the opportunity. The past two years have been very hard. We have suffered through two years of COVID-19. We have seen the cost-of-living skyrocket with basic necessities, such as fuel and bread, becoming unaffordable for far too many of our citizens. In part, this is the result of circumstances out of many South Africans' control and in part, it is due to the endemic corruption and maladministration which has infested this country for many years.

But, hon Temporary Chairperson, the only reason I make these statements is to have them on record. Our people do not need to be told these things because they are aware of them already. They know the price of bread and that of fuel. They know how much they are owed in grants, and they know the grants that they are given ...[Audio distorted.] in comparison to massive inflation and the ever-rising cost of living. They know these things because they experience them every day. They do not need me or anyone else to remind them.

What our people are crying out for is leadership, credible leadership. Leadership to take charge of the country, to take charge of situations and issues, and it is on us as elected representatives to give it to them. We can no longer sit back and accept the situation we are in. Yes, COVID-19 and the war in Ukraine have damaged our economy and even economies across the world. Yes, National Government is constantly corrupt. The only question is: what are we going to do about it?

The issues around the head of President Ramaphosa is not helping. It is just corruption from the top to the lowest level and as a result, not enough budget for service delivery. In any other country from the west to the east, the President would have resigned already. Only in South Africa, the action around the President gets seen as common practice. Even the ANC's own poor suffer as a result.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, spending tens of millions more on Social Services is a good place to start. [Interjections.] In tabling this budget, hon Minister Wenger told us that there is reason for us to be cautiously optimistic of our economy's future. Our Provincial GDP is growing, our tourism sector is recovering, and the newly released employment figures show that we are fixing unemployment in the Western Cape, but we still have a long, long way to go.

This Adjustment allocation of almost R80 million to the Department of Social Development will ensure that the poorest of the poor are not left behind, as the province's economy grows. In fact, this spending decision demonstrates in clear terms the ultimate goal of this Government to leverage economic growth to help the underprivileged and to eradicate poverty, unemployment and inequality. But if we can deal with corruption in this country, we can do much, much more.

Corruption is hampering budgets around the country. Not only in this province, in the Eastern Cape, in North-West, in the Northern Cape, all over. It is a free for all to take from the poorest of the poor. That is why we do not have enough budget available for our services in this province. [Interjections.] But we welcome the increase in budget. This increase is important, and I do thank National Government for taking enough responsibility [Interjections.] to ensure that we have the funding we need to support that increase in our province. But the stark truth is that National Government's funding does nothing to move us forward [Interjections.] and to fix the social ills whose ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you sit down, please? Hon members from the Opposition, can you please just not drown the hon speaker. [Interjections.] Let ...[Interjections.] Honourable ... hon members, let us allow hon member to speak. I think the other speakers are listening to him, so it will be adding value for you to also listen, from both sides. Also, hon members, from my righthand side, just give the hon member a chance for you to listen to his debate. You have been doing well throughout the day, continue that way. Hon member Plato, over to you, sir.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, that is why I am so pleased to see that the Western Cape Government have seen an increase in the budget for the Department of Social Development. This is the money that will make meaningful change in the lives of those who rely on the work of the Department of Social Development. This is the money that will pay for more social workers, as we have heard; more feeding schemes, as we have heard; more substance abuse treatment facilities, as we have heard. It is money that will fund initiatives such as Sanitary Dignity Projects, and also to fight Gender-Based Violence and for the support of this 16 Days of Activism drive countrywide. It is important for us to be seen focusing on that issue as well.

This budget is one which inspires hope, something which is so desperately needed in our country today. A wise man once said that we make a living by what we get, but we make life by what we give.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, this Government has demonstrated and continues to demonstrate that it will give. It will stand by the poor and the hungry against whatever adversity may come. With this budget, we begin the process of rebuilding and of moving our province forward. This Adjustment will allow the Department of Social Development to continue with its important task of providing vital services for the poor and the vulnerable in our province and empowering them so that all of us in this province can move forward and grow into the future together.

But I have to repeat, and I will continue to repeat this: if corruption by the ANC Government was being dealt with appropriately and if they stop stealing from the purse, more budget will be available for the poorest of the poor, to deal with the poorest of the poor's issues. [Interjections.] There will be hard times ahead, hon Temporary Chairperson, especially for as long as the ANC continues to rule, but that will not stop us. [Interjections.] This Government and this hon Minister care deeply about the people of the Western Cape, even when our Opposition does not. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, really!

Mr D PLATO (DA): This Government will continue to do everything it can ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Plato? Hon member Plato, may you take your seat. Hon members, the more the hon speaker is trying to make sure that you hear him, you also raise your voices. [Laughter.] Hon members please, just keep the decorum of the House so that we continue with the debate. [Interjections.]

Mr D PLATO (DA): This Government will continue to do everything it can to improve the lives of our citizens, even when it is not seen and when it does not result in votes. For these reasons, hon Temporary Chairperson, I will support Vote 7 and I urge every other hon member of this House to vote with me for a budget that puts our people first. Thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Amandla! Power!

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): And ...[Audio distorted.] belongs to the ANC ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Plato. I now recognise [Interjections.] hon Minister Fernandez.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Laughing]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Temporary Chairperson, allow me to thank the hon members for their contribution to the debate. To the hon Bakubaku-Vos, your inputs are legitimate, and I echo your sentiments. However, the fiscal constraints are real and unfortunately, as much as I would want to expand the VP Programme or Substance Use Disorder Programme, we have to cut our cloth according to what it is we have.

To the hon member Makamba-Botya, I would want to say that you, too, raise – the hon member raises legitimate inputs on homelessness, but in this regard, I wish to advise that DSD has increased the number of funded bed spaces for homeless shelters by over 800 in the past 15 months. We have now moved from 1 500 funded bed spaces to 2 298 in the last little while. We have also made provision of R18 million to build a homeless shelter in the CBD. The Memorandum of Understanding is well underway between DSD and Public Works, and we have in the last quarter increased our subsidised beds to

shelters in Elsie's River, Fish Hoek, Philippi, and Wellington. So, we are, despite the challenges, making huge efforts to try and address the gaps, the immediate gaps that affect the most vulnerable.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, in closing, I would want to thank the Committee Chairperson, the Committee members, especially the hon Bakubaku-Vos who often provides – and I am not singling out, but I do have to say hon Bakubaku-Vos engages in a positive manner. She will follow up with me after any Sitting or session and say, 'hon Minister, can you assist?' and I would try my best to ensure that we assist with the immediate needs. So, hon Bakubaku-Vos, thank you to you, the hon Makamba-Botya and my DSD colleagues for their input. Thank you for holding the Department to account in a very robust manner, but yet, in a very dignified and respectful manner. I appreciate the engagement.

I also wish to thank the Committee Coordinator for her support and the professional manner in which she conducts herself. I would then like to say thank you to my hon Cabinet colleagues, to the hon Premier in absentia, and then, to the team from the Department of Social Development, Dr Robert Macdonald our HOD, the senior management team, some of which are present here today and the entire Team DSD. They have really led and steered the ship through difficult waters and real choppy waters and yet, we have managed to come through. I think the Department also needs to be credited for a ninth clean audit. So, to the individuals sitting in the box: thank you, from the bottom of my heart.

And then finally in closing, I need to acknowledge the Ministry staff under the very capable leadership of Ms Ananda Nel, our Head of Ministry. The Ministry staff are, indeed, the wind beneath my wings. They provide me with constant motivation and support, and their dedication in resolving issues, especially those raised by hon members of this august House, as swiftly as possible. It makes me very proud to lead Team DSD. Hon Temporary Chairperson, on that note I wish to thank every single hon member and ask them in closing: will you please assist us in becoming ambassadors for Gender-Based Violence and Femicide by spreading the message of hope and keeping it alive for 365 days, not just 16 days. I thank you. [Applause.]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes the Vote. [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, order please. That concludes the Vote on Vote 7. Hon members, I am – thank you very much – I am now just going to deal with the side motion. Is that a point of order, hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: It is a point of exigency in my other life. I just want to clap for my hon MEC Maynier. I did not clap for him. [Applause.] [Laughter.]

**MOTIONS**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I would like to proceed. [Interjections.] Hon members, if I can have your indulgence – order! I have received confirmation from the Secretary that the hon Leader of the Opposition has submitted a Notice of Motion in terms of Rule 151(1) of the Standing Rules at 11:50 this morning. In terms of the Rules, the Notice of Motion must be placed on the Order Paper and cannot be dealt with today, except with the unanimous concurrence of all hon members present.

Does the hon Dugmore wish that the concurrence of all hon members be obtained in terms of Rule 151(3)?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: If I may address you, hon Deputy Speaker, yes. That is what I would like to request. You would recall, hon Deputy Speaker, that this morning, the House supported a motion that the vacancy be filled, that the Secretary contacts the President of the Constitutional Court to approach a Judge to oversee that and we supported that.

In this particular motion which I am sure we need to circulate to test the unanimity of the House, it is simply a motion which requests, as we did previously when the other motion was tabled, that all hon members of this House are provided with information regarding any possible litigation, any other correspondence. So, I cannot, from my own point of view, see any reason why hon members of this House would not agree to such a motion and possibly, I do not know if the Table has the motion, but if not, I could actually read it out. What is the procedure?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, you have risen in terms of Rule 151(3) to obtain unanimous ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...concurrence to move the motion. If you allow me then to proceed.

**MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Dugmore has requested that I determine if there is a unanimous concurrence to allow him to move his motion. Before I ask for concurrence from the hon members of the House to allow the motion to be moved, I shall read out the Notice of Motion for the benefit of hon members and for correct procedure, if I may, hon Dugmore.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

I move in terms of Rule 151(1), 151(2) and 151(3) of the Provincial Legislature that this House, noting the resolution adopted by the House, that the Secretary be mandated to deal with all matters regarding possible litigation involving the Legislature thus resolves that all information received by the Secretary regarding possible litigation, is provided to all hon members before the

conclusion of business today.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

I now put the question to the House. Is there any objection to the motion giving notice by Mr Dugmore, hon member Dugmore, at 11:50 this morning, be moved today?

HON MEMBERS: Yes! No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you could just put it, read it into record, hon Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In terms of Rule 151(3) I hereby object, also noting that the motion you have read out in terms of Rule 60 that:

No member may reflect upon any decision of the House taken less than six months previously, except for the purpose of moving that the decision be amended or rescinded.

The motion that you have read out is exactly the powers you have given to the Secretary, but in terms of Rule 151(3), I hereby object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, as there – is there a point of order, hon Sayed? You may rise on a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise on a point of order. The hon Acting Chief Whip: is she reading out Rules just to say, 'I quoted this and quoted that?' It does not necessarily mean ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...that you are speaking to the Rule. [Interjections.] The Rule 151 ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...subsection (3), which the hon Acting Chief Whip quoted, does not speak to anything that she just said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): So, I mean, I really – I do not see the basis for objection, but ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. So, I do not want an explanation, but I am going to do the following and follow strict procedure. And the strict procedure was I asked the question. As there is an objection and that is for any motion, hon member, as there is an objection [Interjections.] to the motion – may I finish? [Interjections.] May I finish? As there is any objection

to the motion being moved today, the Notice of Motion will be placed on the Order Paper below the line for consideration of a future date. [Interjections.] I hereby rule. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Alright, thank you. Can we move onto the Order of the Day, please. Much appreciated. [Interjections.] I will now ask Ms Ngqaleni please to read the Sixth Order of the Day.

**6. Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022].**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. We now move over to the hon Minister Allen. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I would like to ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. We have lots of guests in the House.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.], I pre-empted that we will not be having a silent debate. I have pre-empted like we have pre-empted so often [Laughter.] how the Opposition will act. However, there was one particular matter where I did not pre-empt what the Opposition will say and that was when the hon Dugmore indicated to the hon Premier: make Reagan the MEC. I do want to say, hon member Dugmore, †baie dankie [thank you.] Thank you so much for your support towards this particular role because I have often said we will not be able to do it alone as a Department. We will not be able to do it alone as Government and we need communities, we need NGOs [Interjections.] and if I consider [Interjections.] and if I consider the Order Paper of this entire day, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: If I consider the Order Paper of the entire day, it is actually in alignment because the Western Cape Safety Plan [Laughter.] and the only province that has a comprehensive Safety Plan that would have a Violence Prevention leg, but also the Law Enforcement component. And that whole of government approach with regard to the role that the Department of Health plays and this morning, they have echoed the sentiments and the support in that regard. The role that Treasury plays. Earlier on, the role that Finance and Economic Opportunities play, the role that Education plays and the role that Social Development plays, and the role that I will currently discuss is that of Community Safety.

On that particular note, I do want to say I am thinking of our permanent member on the Standing Committee that is currently not present here today and I wish a speedy recovery with regard to matters that the permanent member that is not present is dealing with. Because, hon Deputy Speaker, I want to echo again: I do not think that this entire four pages will be silent, but here we go.

I want to first and foremost say [Interjections.] I want to first and foremost say that we have dedicated officials [Interjections.] we have dedicated officials and instead of echoing a sentiment at the end of this particular speech, I want to first go to the Department. †Ek wil sê baie dankie, [I want to say thank you,] thank you so much. The last seven and a half months have been a rollercoaster and I do appreciate the support and the dedication that we have seen from officials. I appreciate the reviews and the sentiment that we often hear from the Standing Committee after we have been held accountable in the Standing Committee. So, thank you so much. If I am only able to confidently echo sentiments in this speech, it is because of your work and because of your dedication. So, under the leadership of Adv Pillay, †baie, baie dankie, [thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Because ensuring [Interjections.] [Applause.] the reports ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Laughter.] Just note, hon members, I have to really listen carefully because the hon Minister is quite far away from my table.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ensuring safety and security for those who live in South Africa is the responsibility of the South African Police Service as the lead agency. The SAPS which are managed by the National Government can only effectively fulfil their mandate if they have the required and needed resources. It is a fact that the dedicated and committed men and women in blue have literally been left to fend for themselves. I think from the Standing Committee's side as well, hon Deputy Speaker, we often hear from senior management in our Province, how they are also relaying messages and correspondence to National Government with regard to the under-resourcing.

If I am allowed to demonstrate this particular point it is that in 2011/2012 financial year, the South African Police Service at a national level should have had 157 000 members – 157 000 members. During this period, there was a shortfall of 31 200 members. [Interjections.] Fast forward to 2015/2016. There should have been 176 000 SAPS members. They only had 119 000. Today, there should be 193 000 SAPS members. They are sitting on 105 000 members.

There needs to be no need to get someone – †wat wiskunde doen om vir ons hier te kom verduidelik nie – [who does arithmetic to come and explain to us] – because it is very clear. Our SAPS officers on the ground are doing the job of not only one, two, nor three, but of actually four people. They are overburdened, overstretched and we are doing everything in our power to ultimately help and assist them.

Before I go on, I was recently – and I want to thank the hon Deputy Speaker that we had an adjournment of an hour and a half, in that I could visit Manenberg. Over the last week, there have been multiple [Interjections.] there have been multiple shootings in Manenberg [Laughter.] and I was engaging SAPS, Metro Police, Traffic together with our Law Enforcement Advancement

Plan (LEAP) deployment, together with the Community Police Forum (CPF) and Neighbourhood Watches in the Manenberg area in this regard, to see the collaboration, to see that we are working together.

Hon members in this House are fully aware that we have echoed sentiments of how gangsters and criminals are working together. We are seeing over the last seven months a steady show towards working together, ultimately, holding each other accountable, being real, being open because I am going to play open cards and say that yes, we have a long way to go, but we are making strides. In the last quarter we have seen where other provinces are going up in terms of the murder rate by 29%, 31%. Here in the Western Cape, it could have been so different if it was not for Provincial Government, the City of Cape Town and National Government playing a role – everyone playing a role – and we want to be real in that regard.

But let me bring it back to the Western Cape. The province was due to receive, hon Deputy Speaker, 1 939 new recruits during the current financial year. Now only 1 118 will arrive. This is 821 fewer officers. We have not been told why we are not receiving the full allocation, but it is a fact. Just last week, during our visit to the SAPS forensic lab, a very senior police officer had to remind a Deputy Minister in the Presidency about them being under-resourced and the need for urgent intervention. That we are getting 800 fewer officers is very significant, hon Deputy Speaker, as already this province is grossly under-resourced, and we are sitting with a 10% vacancy rate. A 10% vacancy rate!

Since I arrived here, I wanted to make sure that in the Department, we address any particular concerns with vacancy rates so that we can up it. We have a very, very low vacancy rate in terms of the Department. Maybe one day, if I am able to echo those sentiments that we have a very low vacancy rate when it comes to SAPS, I am hopeful. I am hopeful because when we are not going to spread hope that is built on a solid foundation that is real, then where will we be?

But adequate resourcing – let me first say, we are constantly hearing that this province is, in fact, the most resourced. We hear it often that we are the most resourced, as amongst others. There is an Anti-Gang Unit which other provinces do not have. †Dit is die waarheid, agb Adjunkspeaker. [It is the truth, hon Deputy Speaker.] These are not new members that came into the Service or the Unit. These are members taken from other sectors and stations, but they have not been replaced at those sectors and stations.

Let us take it a step further. During the current financial year, 363 vehicles have been ordered for the Western Cape – 363 vehicles have been ordered for the Western Cape. To date, 54 have been delivered. That is a delivery rate of 14,8%. In four months [Interjections.] I am bugging and I am doing everything in my power to ensure that we hold SAPS accountable in this regard, that over the next five months leading to the end of this financial year, that we will not have a 14,8% delivery rate with regard to vehicles that were actually ordered and that should actually be on our roads creating visibility that ultimately leads to crime being reduced.

Adequate resourcing and capacitation are clearly not prioritised, which means that the National Government is not concerned whether SAPS is empowered to do their jobs. I think when we consider a man and a woman that wake up in the morning not knowing if they will return home, they are committed. They are feeling that the National Government, which they are under currently, are not supporting them. But this Western Cape Government, hon Deputy Speaker, is the opposite of what is transpiring in the country and in other provinces. We care for our people because they matter to us. Whenever we are accused of being biased, please, accuse me of being biased because I am biased towards people, and we will remain biased towards people because we want our people of the Western Cape to be the best that they possibly can be.

This is part of the reason why we have our Law Enforcement Advancement Plan officers which stems from the Western Cape Safety Plan because the National Government is failing to support SAPS and failing to protect our residents. We, as the Western Cape Government, had to step in because when a sphere of government fails to step in, we have had to step up and we have stepped up. We have stepped up to such a point that we are seeing those successes because a function and the responsibility of the National Government, which they have not been fulfilling, that had to be addressed. Hence, we stood up.

The irony is that SAPS members will tell you how grateful they are for these extra boots on the ground, the extra resources that are now working side-by-side with them. I was in Manenberg now ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I was in Khayelitsha, in Gugulethu, in Philippi East. [Interjections.] Those are the priority areas that we have identified ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Talk to me, hon Minister, talk to me.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and they are there. [Interjections.] †Die 13 gemeenskappe [The 13 communities [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...where the LEAP officers ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The maintenance of Nyanga.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I

wrote a note here that as soon as I get to the last two pages, the silence will start to evaporate. [Interjections.] So, it has been pre-empted. Like we have had to pre-empt, hon Deputy Speaker. We have had to use data; we have had to use an evidence-based approach in order to make sure that we seek the successes. We have always had to pre-empt. This Government has always been at the forefront, the only Government that has a Provincial Police Ombudsman, the only Government that would have Court Watching Briefs, the only Government in our entire country that has stepped up and we will continue to pre-empt. So, as the silence quiets down, it will pick up again. I can guarantee you that.

So, where these 1 257 LEAP officers are deployed will tell you that they are making a real difference in their areas. Their mere presence brings about a feeling of safety. We are putting our citizens first because we care about our people. I almost want to shout 'amandla' 'power' [Laughter.] because I am thinking amandla means power and if I shout amandla I will hear?

An HON MEMBER: Awethu! [power to the people]

An HON MEMBER: Awethu! [power to the people]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I will word that to the people because even if we are talking about devolution [Interjections.] if we are talking about devolution, we are ultimately saying let us give power to the people. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Amandla! [Strength!]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Let us give power to the people ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and when policing is closer to the people, we will see the results, but I will not go there. So, let me first say. This is a R400 million investment ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...for the current financial year that is being optimally utilised in spaces and places where it is most needed, and which is backed by data and evidence. So, the deployment occurs in a strategic, yet deliberate manner. [Laughter.] Between 7 and 20 November 2022, these officers effected 412 arrests for various offences with 35 of these relating to firearms. I can further state that since LEAP's inception up to 20 November 2022, 274 firearms have been confiscated.

Hon Deputy Speaker, documents and research have shown that for every one potential firearm that is on our streets, an illegal firearm, it could contribute towards 14 to 25 murders. Here, we have removed 274 firearms off our streets. I indicated I was in Manenberg. Just last night, two firearms were removed in

Manenberg as well.

So, the reality is that the National Government is mismanaging everything in our country, and this places a squeeze on the fiscal environment ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I do feel that this particular line, [Interjections.] I will repeat, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Just one minute, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: This line ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Two our three hon members here. Hon Makamba-Botya – I mean, apology. Hon Bakubaku-Vos? Hon Bakubaku-Vos. Hon Nkondlo, can we allow the hon Minister to finish? Thank you. [Interjections.] You can proceed. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I will [Interjections.] I will wrap up. [Interjections.] I will wrap up, hon Deputy Speaker. Our budget has been adjusted downward by 0,03% or R304 000, which means it is a decrease from the R776 million to R775 million. It must however be noted that the Department's Budget increased with 29,2% from the 2018/2019 financial year when the allocation was R335 million.

There has been a significant injection in the Safety space, and this is what you do when you are serious about keeping citizens safe. So, thank you to the hon Premier that since his arrival as the hon Premier of the Western Cape, we have seen a budget increase in our Department from R335 million to R775 million. And this is what you do, like I have said, when you are serious about keeping our citizens safe. It is also important to mention that the R304 000 is being transferred to the Department of the Premier for the development of a software system for Safety projects. We are enhancing the Safety spaces with the incorporation of further technology. [Interjections.]

The SAPS Budget, hon Deputy Speaker, has consistently decreased and during the 2020 Midterm Budget Policy Statement, I was listening to it online and it was probably one of the bleakest days in my life, [Interjections.] because on that particular day ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...on that particular day [Interjections.], 2020, there was a mass shooting ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...in the Khayelitsha area and I listened to the Midterm Budget Policy Statement where R11,7 billion was taken from Police, from Education, from Social Development at a national level and it was given to a failing State Owned Enterprise, in SAA. [Interjections.] So, that was one of the [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...the bleakest days and to confirm [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...that the SAPS budget has been decreasing. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I cannot hear the hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.], hon Deputy Speaker, in my notes have pre-empted that [Interjections.] I have pre-empted once again, that once I get to the last paragraph, this will happen. [Laughter.]

So, for the financial year, our Neighbourhood Watch Programme has an allocation of R600,15 million which will ensure that we are well resourced and capacitated and they are a critical cog in the local crime fighting scene. Since my appointment, I am delighted that I have been able to have so many engagements across our province from the City of Cape Town to the West Coast to other districts, working with these Neighbourhood Watches, patrolling with them and with CPFs. I have consistently sent that particular invitation to hon members of the Opposition that you are more than welcome to join me on those particular patrols in order to get a first-hand indication of what we are doing.

The CPFs budget is also something that I am pretty sure is contributing effectively to the CPFs, which is R660 000 for Safety projects and training. The Reaction Unit is allocated R6,9 million and just last week we had the official launch of the Unit at the Moorreesburg weighbridge. Ensuring that our K9 Units are well resourced, there is an allocation of R8,8 million, while our district funding for Safety projects, as we do not treat our rural areas as stepchildren, is R6 million.

Hon Deputy Speaker as I conclude, it was quite upsetting a couple of months ago to identify that the SAPS †Honde-eeheid [Dog Unit] was reduced by 27% since 2018. [Interjections.] was reduced by 27%. We have had to step in, we have had to step up by allocating money for our K9 Units in order to do a job that is ultimately the lead agency's main priority which is SAPS. We have had to step up. We consistently step up because we know that we need to do everything in our power to help and assist.

But this is commonly known as we are putting money where our mouth is, which is not under a mattress or a couch and is also not in a foreign currency. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Because I think [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is actually very ...[Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker, I know this is the end of the day and that I apparently have now unlimited time. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: But I want to say ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, just take your seat for a second. Take your seat. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I want to say ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, just take your seat for a second. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...money [Interjection]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, take your seat for a second. Hon members, we are just prolonging a very long day. [Interjections.] If we can just allow the hon Minister to complete his speech, please? I appreciate that. Over to you, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much. [Interjections.] I do want to say, hon Deputy Speaker, that I ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, I am not part of that conversation. Thank you. Over to you. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I do want to say, hon Deputy Speaker, that I sense, and I feel for hon members of this House. I know it is extremely difficult to defend the indefensible. I know it is extremely difficult to speak and to echo a sentiment that one ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Come and join ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to speak and to echo a sentiment of something that you do not believe in. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: And I do know that is extremely difficult. [Interjections.] So, I do have sympathy for that because we have fostered in this House ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...valuable relationships and I do know that to reject this Adjustments Budget, would be to reject the people of the Western Cape ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Ah! ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: It will be to reject their safety. It would be to reject those from Manenberg, those from Kayamandi, those from Swellendam, those from Paarl, those from Nyanga, and those from George. And those from Athlone and from Strand. [Interjections.] It will be to reject ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...all those where hon members of this House that are present, that are serving us. So, as I conclude ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...I can clearly state that the people of the Western Cape and particularly, their safety matters to us. We will continue being resolute in achieving greater safety across the province while working our socks off to reduce the murder rate by 50% by 2029. We have to, hon Deputy Speaker, as the National Government has been wholly unreliable. And I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] Hon Acting Chief Whip. Do you want to stand on a point of order?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I was standing up earlier even though the hon Minister was still busy with his speech, in terms of Rule 42, in terms of maintenance of order. It is very difficult for me to be able to hear what the hon Minister is saying with all the noise in the House and perhaps, if he could repeat some of the last paragraphs so that I can just make sure exactly what is occurring in this particular budget that we will be voting on today in this House. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, it seems that every time hon Minister Allen stands up, there is a need to just shout him down. I think we need to have decorum in the House and [Interjections.] and he. It is a common occurrence, it seems. I am not so sure why, but maybe, I can – no! No, hon Minister Allen, we are not starting that. I am now going to move over to hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, you are going to have to ask your hon colleagues to quiet down, thank you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): No, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would have earlier appealed to the hon Chairperson of the Standing Committee that there is no need to audition because the handler was only here today to finish what he had started with the hon Speaker. But I see the handler is back, so I will leave it up to him. Hon Deputy ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, before you start. I just want to caution you. Remember, we cannot cast aspersions, so do not mention any names. At the moment, it is on a fine line. Okay, we do not – we always have decorum in the House for all our hon colleagues. [Interjections.] One minute, hon Kama. [Interjections.] Hon Bosman ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...what is your point of order?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to know if the hon Shadow MEC for Cultural Affairs and Sport is prepared to take a question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I do not have time to waste.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, you may begin, hon Kama. You are on your – your time is now ticking.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): No, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I just had to make that point because it looks like our responsibilities in terms of Safety are getting more and more by day, and now we have to protect black hon members from the DA who are continuously being victimised by the handler. Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. You see, hon Kama what happens when you make statements, it becomes a furore. So, your time is ticking. Can I please ask you to continue with your speech.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Let me also say, hon Deputy Speaker, it is true that we

supported hon member Allen when he was still the Chairperson to become an MEC. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): We supported him because as a Chairperson then, he used to share the same frustrations that we have around the issue of making sure that communities play part of fighting crime. We supported him because he, also like us, was frustrated by the continuous politicking by this Government when it comes to crime. But hon Deputy Speaker, today marks exactly nine years since the day we were informed about the passing of our great Nelson Mandela, who throughout his life fought for peace in our land. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): He fought for peace in our land. Hon Deputy Speaker, in the legacy of Comrade Nelson Mandela ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I cannot hear the hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...we stand here today to reject this budget. The hon Premier changed the name of this Department to Police Oversight and Community Safety. We thought there will be more funding allocation for the Police Oversight function, but instead, there are budget cuts for the Office of the Police Ombudsman. This was just a desperate measure and posturing from the hon Premier. They wanted to escape scrutiny on the part of this Government. The notion of Community Safety and we want this Government to understand, that the notion of Community Safety does not start and end with policing. It has everything to do with creating an environment where people will feel safe, whether they are in their houses, whether they are in the streets or whether it is black hon members in the DA, but they must feel safe and that is Community Safety. [Interjections.] This Government prides itself ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Order!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): This Government prides itself of ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...on being evidence-driven on its decisions and key interventions, yet, during a period in which the 17 community ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...reported serious crimes, it increased by 19,9% to 760 873 cases, the DA-led Government responded by cutting the budget. This level of recklessness by the Department is highly deplorable. What is the justification for decreasing the budget of this Department when the murder rate has increased by 3,9%? When sexual offences and rape increased by 23,6% and 22,2% respectively, and when car hijacking increased by 38,6%? This is a clear indication that this Government does not care, and that crime will always

remain a political ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Also, as shown by the intensification of calls on the National Government to devolve Police powers [Interjections.] as well as the investigation by the Police Ombudsman ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I cannot hear the hon members speak. Hon Kama, just take your seat. Please stop the time, Mr Poggenpoel. Hon members, it is very difficult, both with hon Minister Allen and hon Kama because they are quite far away. So, if I can just ask for your indulgence. You may proceed. Start the time, Mr Poggenpoel.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Poggenpoel.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): This politicking also includes the divisions between Neighbourhood Watches and Community Policing Forums which involve the preferential treatment of Neighbourhood Watches and the underfunding and weakening of CPFs.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the CPFs when given the necessary support and sufficient resources, can do wonders. It was through the dedicated effort of these CPFs, as well as operations by SAPS, that resulted in a drastic reduction of murders from 89 in Quarter 2 of 2018 to 40 between July and September 2019. This was before the idea of the Safety Plan was even conceived. In the second quarter of 2022, Nyanga recorded the highest increase in the country in terms of murders. This increase coincides with the period in which the DA-led Government deliberately destabilised, underfunded, and weakened CPFs in the province.

Through the proposed Adjusted Budget Estimates, the location of Community Police relations is cut by R5,1 million. This clearly shows that this Government does not see value in community participation in the fight against crime. The increase in the murder rate in Nyanga and the province, should be placed squarely on the DA's doorstep. When crime is reduced, the DA claims all the victories and praises the Safety Plan, but when it increases then it is SAPS and National Government that must be blamed. The DA hypocrisy knows no bounds.

Through these Adjusted Budget Estimates, the allocation for Safety Partnership is increased by R7,3 million to over R474 million. The amount includes the transfer to the City of Cape Town for the LEAP officers. Once more, I wish to reiterate the ANC demands for increased oversight over the City of Cape Town. We continue to throw funds to the City, and they do not account to the Committee for it. We continue to fund the so-called Safety Plan and yet, none of us have actually seen the Plan. Yes, we are presented with the concept document. We were presented with the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...the concept document, but there is no Plan. There is no Safety Plan. [Interjections.] We want the hon Premier ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...to present us with a ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...plan and we want J P Smit and the senior management in his Department to prepare ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...an Annual Report for the LEAP programme and appear before the Committee to account for the funds that we give them. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, we reiterate our calls for increased funding for Rural Safety ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): This Department transfers R418 million in transfers to provinces and municipalities. A large percentage goes to the City of Cape Town, while rural municipalities are not prioritised. While we do acknowledge that strides are being made at establishing rural safety plans in municipalities, we are, however, not satisfied with the amounts given to rural regions for this purpose. This Provincial Government must stop thinking that rural safety is about farms and small holdings. It is far bigger than that.

We have always maintained that the Safety Plan will not yield any positive results for as long as it continues to ignore the needs to address the causative factors. Earlier, we were hearing here the hon MEC ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...of Health complaining [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Oh! [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I promise you your time is up. And you know what, Mr Poggenpoel even forgot for a little time, to even put the clock back so you got extra time. Thank you very much, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It gave you extra time. Thank you, I now recognise

hon Makamba-Botya. Are you online?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Yes, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, can I have some order, please? [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker, I am not sure if I should proceed?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. What kind of government celebrates achievements and success against crime, but then Stats shows that the situation has worsened. This Department, hon Deputy Speaker, has pronounced winning a war against crime whilst the top 17 community reported crimes are all in the same province. The DA-led Government, hon Deputy Speaker, likes to brag about leading other provinces when it comes to service delivery and clean audits. This obsession about leading has now gotten into their heads to a ... [Audio distorted.] standard they now celebrate being a leading province when it comes to contact crime and sexual offences, which is a shame.

Hon Deputy Speaker, millions of taxpayers' money is being wasted in an adventurous exercise called the Safety Plan, which no one even dares to explain what it stands for. Is it ... [Audio distorted.] seeks to achieve. Hon Deputy Speaker, small businesses in townships which are just operating so that households can make ends meet are often being exposed to marauding gangs who constantly demand protection fees.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the children in townships are being kidnapped each and every day. Women in townships, such as Mitchells Plain, hon Deputy Speaker, and Manenberg experience a higher risk of being sexually violated than in any other place in this province. Hon Deputy Speaker, everyone is just not safe in this province, but then there is a decrease of more than R300 000 in the Budget of the Department of Community Safety.

On that note, hon Deputy Speaker, the EFF will not support this Vote. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports this Budget Vote and I want to say that with the Western Cape SAPS being so under resourced, we as the ACDP want to state it on record again that we are calling for the devolution of powers of the Police to the Province. A major reason for this is ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...that the shocking report by a Western Cape

High Court Judge that there is evidence that gang members infiltrated top management of SAPS and now, today we heard after the investigation from the Western Cape Ombudsman that there is substance to these allegations. Hon Deputy Speaker, it is clear that crime will be a problem if gangsters are controlling the Police. There is no proper control when it comes to SAPS, and we will only resolve that problem when powers are devolved to the provinces that will do a better job to make sure that our people are safe.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I now recognise hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Bismillah Hir Rahman Nir Rahim The DA Province's calls to devolve the Police powers will not solve the high crime rate in the province. That call to devolve Police powers remains sinister. The Community Safety Department lacks the will to effectively deal with crime. The Province knows the crime hotspots; the Province knows the crime hotspots. It knows that the thousands of shebeens on the Cape Flats are springboards for criminal activities, rape, and murder. The Province and the City of Cape Town jointly launched the Tourist Safety Units to protect a particular important sector. So, too, can it deploy more Metro officers in hotspot areas, in townships and on the Cape Flats.

The Al Jama-ah does not support this Budget. [Interjections.] I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Good afternoon, hon Deputy Speaker, hon members of the House, hon Premier. I know the hon Premier is here today as both the Leader of the Executive, as well as my caucus leader. [Interjections.] But hon member Kama, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, I know your handler, hon member Sayed and hon member Pat Lekker have already left, and I see the incoming Chief Whip has now also abandoned you. So, I do hope you are taking notes. Good afternoon as well to the people of the Western Cape whom we are here to represent. [Interjections.]

Today, hon Deputy Speaker, we are here to pass a budget that will further work to expand the successes of the work done by the Department of Community Safety, a department that strives to cocreate safe and cohesive communities. Especially as we observe 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children and especially since the Commander-in-Chief of the Republic of South Africa has been silent and missing in action for the last few days, as we look at 16 Days of Activism. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, this Adjustment Budget sees the Department of Community Safety being allocated ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon Windvogel, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Someone has ...[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, we are – there is an hon member delivering his speech. If I can ask for you indulgence. Hon Dugmore, please? Over to you, hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): This Department, hon Deputy Speaker, is getting almost R776 million to help its needs of coordinating its vision of cocreating safe and cohesive communities across this province. Hon Deputy Speaker, we know this Department has a lot of work to do and we know that it has acted with more enthusiasm and innovation than the national agency, the very agency who is responsible for the constitutional mandate of protecting and servicing our communities. A national agency that has a Minister in the form of a talking hat who constantly forgets that he is no longer the National Police Commissioner, but the Cabinet Minister assigned to exercise political oversight and provide political direction. This talking hat has not been able to adequately provide for the protection of the people of this Western Cape.

The South African Police Service has confirmed to our Standing Committee that their Western Cape Anti-Gang Unit has a vacancy rate of 38%. This means that out of the 232 granted positions, only 144 police officers are currently deployed to operate in this Unit. And I want us to stop and think of the family of Constable Ashwin Pedro who was shot earlier last week in Parkwood by gangsters. If that Unit was fully capacitated, we could have had those 232 officers respond to that incident. Even though the vacancy rate has decreased from 76% to 38% in the last financial year, it has remained the constant for the past three financial years with this Unit also experiencing a decrease in its operational budget.

We are still waiting for more details on the Crime Intelligence budgets and we have had to resort to a Promotion of Access to Information Act (PAIA) application to get that, through you to hon member Windvogel, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] It is concerning that given the recent flair-ups and murders in our province and the crime-stricken communities across Cape Town and the rest of the Western Cape, that the current capacitation of the Anti-Gang Unit remains unchanged. For us to be able to fight crime effectively as the hon Acting Shadow MEC for Police Oversight, hon member Kama has asked us to do, we need to fight crime efficiently and strategically and every structure needs to have the necessary resources ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...and personnel in order to operate ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...as effectively as possible.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat please. Hon Kama, do you have a point of order?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would want to check if the hon Deputy Provincial Minister of Police is prepared to take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think you better name who that Deputy is.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Yes, certainly. [Interjections.] Certainly, hon Deputy Speaker. I am happy to take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There you go. Over to you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): No, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. We do know that out of the 205, now in terms of the current stats, out of the 202 gang-related murders, 175 are from the Western Cape. And Nyanga, Harare, Philippi, Mfuleni, are part of the top ten car hijackings. Delft, Harare, and Strandfontein ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...are part of the top ten in terms of rape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your question?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Now, the question ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: On minute, question. Your question, hon Kama? [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Now, the question to the hon Deputy Minister is: asides from the boots on the ground, what amount is this Government spending to address the causative factors in these areas that I have counted and what are the targeted programmes ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...to ensure that we address these [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, honourable [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member is a Chair, but he may continue to answer the question. [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] No, no. [Interjections.] Hon member, hon Bosman speak to me, please? [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I would love to lead a workshop on how to read the Blue Book [Laughter.] but I am not as clever as hon Baartman and ...[Audio distorted.] So, I am just going to respond to hon member Kama by saying that he earlier reminded us that the notion of safety is something. And I want to remind hon member Kama that notion is a conception of belief in something, and the people of the Western Cape do not have the belief that your National Government and the Police Service by your Minister can protect them. So, of the more than R1,5 billion that has already been spent on our comprehensive Safety Plan in this province, that is where you need to go look for that money, hon member Kama. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bosman. Hon members, order please!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please focus on me!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, as I said it is concerning given the recent flair-ups in murders in crime-stricken communities that we are standing here, and I am being heckled when we talk about Safety. [Interjections.] It is concerning that during 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children, hon members of this House cannot listen to a speech or a debate contribution without raising points of order that are frivolous. [Interjections.]

But it is for this reason, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...that the Western Cape Provincial Government introduced its own Reaction Unit in February last year ... this year. The Unit operating within the LEAP programme acts as a force multiplier to assist SAPS because we work collaboratively. This Unit goes out when flair-ups in crime take place and as the DA, we look forward to this Reaction Unit being expanded to further boost and keep up the efforts of keeping our communities safe.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in the recent SAPS Annual Report, Minister Cele quoted former President Nelson Mandela, when he wrote in the foreword:

“If you want cooperation of humans around you, you must make them feel that they are important, and you do that by being genuine and humbler.”

It is such a pity the Minister is not able to provide political and policy direction or even use his words to echo what former President Nelson Mandela wanted us to do. The Minister is in charge of creating a Police Service that is caring and a Police Service that serves and looks to its people, but he cannot do that. A Police Service that acts with integrity when he addresses our hardworking men and women in blue, but this Minister cannot do that because he insults them, and he screams at them. [Interjections.]

We want a Minister that is able to take responsibility for his words, his actions and his portfolio, but he cannot even do that. It is really time for Minister Bheki Cele to resign and finally show that at least he is competent at one thing, except for playing fast and loose with the lives of victims of Gender-Based Violence and crime. Hon Deputy Speaker, we wish that our National Minister with the budget and political authority over policing, can use those considerable resources to properly resource police stations in a way that is innovative and create a safe workplace for the men and women in blue, as well as for victims of crime.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in some of our oversight visits since I have joined this portfolio, we have identified the concerning state of police stations and how it is affecting their general operations. Particularly those in Kwanokuthula Kleinvlei, Elands Bay and Kwanonqaba in Mossel Bay. The responsibility for maintaining police stations does not lie with this Government, but it lies with SAPS and the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure nationally. SAPS also leases police stations from municipalities, and they work with DPWI to maintain these buildings, but what we saw were not buildings that were maintained.

As such, due to this complex system, there are delays in certain procedures that prevent projects from coming online timeously. For example, as the hon members of the Opposition and the hon members on this side witnessed at the Kwanokuthula Police Station, a leased station, there are literal holes in the floor. The construction of a new station is only anticipated to be completed in March 2028. At the Kleinvlei Police Station in the Metro, at the Elands Bay Police Station the planning and the design for new stations are only expected to start in 2024/2026. Let us not even talk about Mossel Bay.

I was shocked, hon Deputy Speaker, that during our Standing Committee meeting the Provincial Minister, hon Reagan Allen, revealed to us that letters to the National Minister of Public Works and Infrastructure regarding this important issue, have gone unanswered. [Interjections.] Even the National Police Commissioner, Commissioner Masemola said he is struggling to engage with them. This not only highlights the inability of National Government to support our men and women in blue, it shows that while SAPS has a long road ahead before it meets any of its infrastructure and assets at a proper standard, SAPS is still trying very hard, but they are being failed. But, hon Deputy Speaker, there is hope. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel. [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel! [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel! [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel, can we just have order, please? That is a running commentary. Over to you, hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape has once again shown not only to be a pillar of good governance, but also just to be doing the basics and doing it well. It remains the only province to provide a Policing Needs and Priorities report to the National Government every year and it outlines in the PNP, areas of intervention. Through that, we have seen that they have complimented SAPS resources with LEAP officers, something which the new Premier in Gauteng is rapidly adopting and rolling out.

As members of the Legislature, we look forward to doing more oversight on this work and hopefully, when we engage with our counterparts in Gauteng, we can see how they are copying from the Western Cape. Hon Deputy Speaker, as always, the Western Cape through our hon Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety has come to the rescue of the people of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): During the last financial year, the Department has prioritised the following to support the Provincial Safety mandate. [Interjections.] More accreditation of Neighbourhood Watches has taken place, there has been an expansion of the K9 Dog Units across municipalities, continued support to LEAP officers and Reaction Units in municipalities. We have had Rural Safety summits. There has been a complete focus on Occupational Health and Safety within the Western Cape Government, as well as at police stations through the reports we have provided. There is also a firearms harms reduction strategy in place to make sure we get guns off the street. While the ANC sends guns back to gangs, we get them off the streets.

Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, these objectives and the objectives that have been outlined, shine through in the Department's delivery. While crime has shown to increase in the recent crime stats, the successes of the Safety Plan has once again proven that the murder rate was lowered in Mfuleni, Kraaifontein, Gugulethu, Khayelitsha, and Harare ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...compared to the same period last year. In closing, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...with the festive season upon us, I would like to wish the Tourism Safety Unit and our officers on the ground working hard, all the best as they are keeping our streets across the Western Cape safe. Additionally, I want to appreciate the efforts of all of our safety structures, including our CPFs and our street committees in the form of our Neighbourhood Watches. I want to commend them for the hard work that they are doing so that we can sleep with at least one eye closed at night. It all goes without saying, hon Deputy Speaker, that the DA supports this Adjustment Budget.

I want to extend a further thank you to Mr Waseem Matthews, our Procedural Officer in the Standing Committee, who not only supports the Committee with procedural advice and logistical support, but very often is able to get information to members at breakneck speed because we know our members are constantly learning, even though they are not always comprehending, hon Deputy Speaker, through you.

A very big thank you to hon Minister Reagan Allen for your commitment to Safety and for always being able to assist members of the Committee and

members of the public. Thank you to the HOD, Advocate Pillay, and your team sitting in the box, for your continued support and for enabling the people of the Western Cape to at least feel the notion of safety in this province through your intervention.

I want to thank the members of our Standing Committee for their hard work and I want to wish them well over the festive season because I know when they walk past a LEAP officer, when they walk past a Reaction Unit officer, when they walk past a Chrysalis graduate, they will say thank you because we know that they will feel safe in this Western Cape. As I said earlier ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): As I said earlier, hon Deputy Speaker, we know who are the hon members on the Opposite side. Their handler is Vinnige Fanie and hon Lekker who were not here earlier, but I know hon Sayed is back and we hope ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Honourable [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...we hope that [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...the concept.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please take your seat. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I think between hon member Bosman [Interjections.] between hon member Bosman and hon member Baartman there is a confusion [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! Is that a point of [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...as to the former player of the South African cricket team.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Which one is Vinnige Fanie? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member! Hon Sayed [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Ja, and [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is not, that is not [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And the last I saw Vinnige Fanie was a fast bowler, not a spinner [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, that is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...like the hon MEC's pointless stories. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, that is not a point of order. Please, hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I am always amazed by the responses I am able to elicit, and I thought that after the lamb shanks hon members would be fast asleep by now. [Laughter.] But ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I understand it is ...[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, through you. We know the lamb shank redemption is a slow process, [Laughter.] but I want to say to the hon members ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...that this Province leads in getting clean audits, it leads in good governance. It does not compete with provinces who cannot even make it to the start line. This Province focuses on delivering to the people of the Western Cape and once again, I want to thank the members ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...I want to thank the members of the Standing Committee for knowing that sometimes we are not friends because we are here to defend the people of the Western Cape and for as long as the ANC National Government ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...fails the people of the Western Cape, hon Deputy Speaker, we will continue to robustly engage even with our friends. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] Thank you. Hon members [Interjections.] hon members can I continue with the Vote, please. I just cannot understand why Community Safety creates such a furore. Hon Minister [Interjections.] Hon Minister, over to you. I am going to try and control the last part of this Vote before we actually vote on our Vote. So, please can I have your indulgence. Over to you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Please, hon members, it is the last part of the sitting. Thank you.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, I will not be long. We do know that time is running out and that we need to do everything in our power to work together. When the hon Premier approached me a little over seven months ago, he said, 'Reagan, Safety is now' after hon member Dugmore advocated [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...after hon member Dugmore advocated [Interjections.] and hon member Brinkhuis advocated. [Laughter.] The last seven and a half months, I want to say to hon members of this House through you, hon Deputy Speaker, it has not been easy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: It has been very difficult in our province, but we have seen the strides being made. Hon member Kama, through you, hon Deputy Speaker to hon member Kama. I know hon member Kama's time ran out. I will make it my mission to get the last four pages of his speech because I would want to interrogate that. I remain open to engaging. I would read each and every single word [Interjections.] [Laughter.] I will read each and every single word that is echoed because we are wanting ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to foster the working relationships. [Interjections.] I want to say ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to each and every hon member ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, Bakubaku-Vos. Hon members, please, I cannot hear the hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: He is still an alternate on the Committee and I do want to say thank you for his input. He indicated that I was frustrated as the Chairperson. I wish to place again on record: I am still frustrated. Everyone on this side of the rope, of the aisle remains frustrated about Safety and what we need to do and how National Government needs to step up. [Interjections.] We will remain frustrated in that regard. We will continue to expand our oversight role whenever funding has been allocated. In the Ombudsman's office, hon Deputy Speaker, it is with regard to ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...a post that was not filled as anticipated and then, we had to act in order to make sure that we are actually spending finances. So, the additional funding that is being taken from the Ombudsman's office has been allocated towards EPWP stipends.

I have indicated that I am going to obtain hon member Kama's speech, but I will

also make the Safety Plan available to hon member Kama again ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...so that he is able to interrogate the Safety Plan [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I cannot hear the hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...so that he is able to interrogate the Safety Plan because it is a whole of government approach, each and every department playing a role. I also want to thank hon member Christians on his firm view on devolution. [Interjections.] I think everyone in our province that is working in the Safety space, is deeply frustrated that choices are made regarding SAPS, 1 500 kilometres away from where we are, all the way in Pretoria. We would want SAPS to be closer to the people. Hon member Brinkhuis, thank you so much for your input. I highly appreciate [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I highly appreciate your input. I just wanted to state for the record that in terms of the Safety Plan, over R2 billion is allocated towards looking at Violence Prevention, looking at the socioeconomic circumstances, but also stepping up in the Violence Prevention and in the Law Enforcement. Of that amount, 0,02% has gone to the Tourism Safety officers: 0.02%. And in our engagements with the Tourism sector, over 90% of them answered [Interjections.] over 90% of them answered ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...over 90% of the Tourism sector answered one question, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: What will contribute to making sure that the Tourism sector can boom again and they said safety. We even want to do so much more, hon member Brinkhuis, in that particular space because when we grow the economy, when we make sure that people are employed, we will be able to create safer spaces. So, from the work that Health does, Social Development, Education, all our departments, Cultural Affairs and Sport, together with Community Safety. Holding that space is creating safer spaces. [Interjections.]

But we want to say R660 000 given to CPFs. I was at the CPF Board [Laughter.] I was at the CPF ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I was at the CPF Board meeting most recently, the last two weeks ago [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! This is a serious topic. Please, hon members.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I was with the Provincial [Interjections.] I was with the Provincial Board CPF. [Interjections.] I am [Interjections.] I was ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Focus on me, hon Minister, please. Hon Dugmore. [Interjections.] Hon Dugmore, one minute. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: As a [Interjections.] As light reading [Interjections.] and as engagement, I do want to say in my engagements [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, we cannot get through today's Votes. [Interjections.] Hon Bakubaku-Vos, it is a consistent commentary coming from you. If I can please ask so that the hon Minister can finish his Vote. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: May I, hon Deputy Speaker, through you, hon Deputy Speaker. May I request if there is any hon member in this House that is engaging the Safety structures, to please provide me with information on the sentiments on CPFs. I came from Manenberg now. The CPF was present. I have engaged the Provincial Board and we are doing amazing work together with our Neighbourhood Watches. [Interjections.] So, if you have one particular CPF that is not happy or not showing that we are making the right strides, please share that. I am open to that engagement.

I do want to once again say, hon Deputy Speaker, as I conclude. I look to those in the box, I look to the Standing Committee as well, but *†vir hulle in box wil ek sê baie dankie. Een en elk, die rol wat julle speel, dit beteken so baie.* [for those in the box I want to say thank you. Each and everyone, the role that you play, it means so much.] I would not have been able to stand here fully aware that we have a daunting task, but fully aware that we are capable and that we are making the strides. And that we will work with SAPS as we hold them accountable, as we press for devolution because it is for each and every hon member in this House, for each and every person in our community that we are fighting. So, thank you so much for the support and thank you, also, for the help. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I also want to say hon member – I also want to say, hon Deputy Speaker, as I conclude. I could name hon members here over this last seven and a half

months that have helped me. I want to say thank you. Your words of encouragement, your input. Agbare Premier, baie dankie. Hon Minister Maynier, baie dankie. Almal hier. [Interjections.] [Hon Premier thank you. Hon Minister Maynier, thank you. Everyone here.] I also want to look aside, this side, and I want to say thank you. [Interjections.] Ek wil sê dankie. Dit help. [I want to say thank you. It helps.] [Interjections.] And I am going to break the Rules now. [Interjections.] Ek wil sê baie dankie my broer, baie dankie. [I want to say thank you my brother, thank you.] [Interjections.] And I conclude, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Minister. [Applause.]. That concludes the debate on this Vote.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give a minute if you would like to leave the Chamber. Thank you very much to the Administration. Thank you, hon members. Can I have your indulgence, please. We will now proceed, and I will now ask the Secretary to read the Seventh Order of the Day.

## **7. Consideration of Votes and Schedules – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3–2022] (Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities).**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. Order! I have to announce that there are currently 36 hon members present and entitled to vote and the House is therefore quorate. Parties now have an option of making a general [Interjection]

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...declaration. Is there a point of order? Hon Marran, what is your point of order?

Mr P MARRAN: Yes, thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. My hand ...[Audio distorted.] for clarity. I just wanted to check with you, hon Deputy Speaker. I have ...[Audio distorted.] the hon Daylin Mitchell ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, that is not a point of order ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Is he an MEC or not?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am on the next Order of the Day. Please mute the hon Minister ... the hon member. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]... interrupt.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member. I am going to proceed with the Votes. So, parties have an option of making a declaration now to cover all the Votes, hon members, or decide on a specific Vote that you may want to make a declaration on individually. Is there anybody, are there any of the parties that

would like to make declarations on any of the Votes at this stage? A general declaration? None? Okay. Are there any objections to Votes 1 to Vote 14 and the Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No! Yes, yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. There are objections, I will proceed. Those in favour of the Votes and Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill being adopted, please say 'yes'.

An HON MEMBER: Aye!

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the Votes and Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill being adopted, please say 'no'.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P MARRAN: No!

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then I have it that the ayes have it. Votes and Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill has therefore been adopted. Thank you. I will now ask the Secretary to read the Eighth Order of the Day.

## **8. Finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3–2022] (Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities).**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. I recognise the hon Minister of Finance.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you very much to the hon members for their inputs on this framework for hope and a budget that cares and prepares, and we ask that the Bill, Clauses and Short Title be finalised. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. There are being no lists of speakers as far as I understand. Are there any objections to the Bill, Clauses and Short Title being finalised?

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. I have to announce that there are currently – if I can just confirm, Mr Secretary – 36 again, hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. Those in favour of the Bill, Clauses and Short Title being finalised, please say ‘yes’.

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the Bill, Clauses and Short Title being finalised, please say ‘no’.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ayes have it. The finalisation including Clauses and Short Title of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3-2022], is therefore approved. The names of the individual hon members present and their support or otherwise for the question before the House, will be recorded in the Minutes of Proceedings to ensure a full record of the voting on the Bill. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. The Bill will be sent to the hon Premier for assent. I would now like to move over to the parties addressing the House at the end of this session. As a tradition, hon members, I will now afford representatives of parties an opportunity to address the House on the occasion of the end of the year and the end of this session. I recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Colleagues, Charles Dickens opens the novel *A Tale of Two Cities* with a sentence that has become famous, and I quote:

“It was the best of times, it was the worst of times, it was the age of wisdom, it was the age of foolishness, it was the epoch of belief, it was the epoch of incredulity, it was the season of Light, it was the season of Darkness, it was the spring of hope, it was the winter of despair, we had everything before us, we had nothing before us, we were all going direct to Heaven, we were all going direct the other way – in short, the period was so far like the present period, that some of its noisiest authorities insisted on its being received, for good or for evil, in the superlative degree of comparison only.”

2022 may be described as one such year. *The Tale of Two Cities* is a novel. We live in the real world. This is not a year that any of us, I believe, will easily forget. Having lost lives during COVID-19 and after, people having lost jobs and the GBV, crime, gangsterism, extortion continuing to be a blot on our society and serious pathologies, we need now to rise to the occasion. Our job, hon Deputy Speaker, is to provide leadership, hope and transformation in the lives of our people. Nelson Mandela said, and I quote:

“To be a great leader, one must never give up, try to bring people together and be selfless. Leadership is about working with and for others to achieve a common goal that benefits everyone.”

The ANC wants to thank everyone in the House, irrespective of political affiliation, for the collegial and actually, the cordial manner mostly, in which we conducted our business as a collective. As colleagues serving on committees holding the Executive to account, we really got to know each other better on our oversight visits, and learned the one truth that, I think, all of us hold dear, that each one of us loves our province and country dearly and wishes to improve the situation facing our people.

We laughed sometimes at the hon former Premier Marais jokes. We appreciate his wisdom. Sometimes, we mock each other across the floor and we sometimes, hon Deputy Speaker, only sometimes have loud shouting matches. But we do all of this in serving the people of the Western Cape and South Africa. When we differ robustly from vantage points of our political homes, we do so to ensure that the citizens are served.

We thank the hon members of the Executive who have been available to the committees and to answer our questions. We remember with deep, deep sadness the passing of the hon Chief Whip Lorraine Botha and may her soul rest in eternal peace. We thank our hon colleagues in the Ruling Party in this Province, our fellow Opposition parties especially EFF, GOOD, Al Jama-ah, who keep us on our toes and appreciate the commitment of the ACDP and the Freedom Front Plus to taking up, especially, community issues. It would be wrong of me not to say thank you to the hon former Speaker, hon Masizole Mngqasela. Who knows, hon members of this House, we may see him back soon. That is now a matter for the Courts to decide should that avenue be pursued.

Thank you to the Secretary of the Legislature who is here and all the staff for their hard work. We cannot afford a situation where ongoing battles amongst hon members of this House place staff members in an invidious position. Despite the difficult year, the staff of this Legislature have simply been incredible. We thank the staff of our respective political parties, the South African Police for your service to the province here in this building. In particular thanks to my comrades in the ANC caucus for their hard work in serving their constituencies and holding the Executive to account.

Our spending time with our families to reflect – I am asking that we reflect on our role, the actual honour and the privilege that we have been given and come back determined to serve the people of our province better. It is at times like this in our country that we should appreciate the immense value of our Constitution and the need for us to defend it and to also implement its redress positions.

In conclusion, a quote from one of those who helped liberate our country, Chris Hani and he said:

“Socialism is not about big concepts and heavy theory. Socialism is about

decent shelter for those who are homeless. It is about water for those who have no safe drinking water. It is about healthcare, it is about a life of dignity for the old. It is about overcoming the huge divide between urban and rural areas. It is about a decent education for all our people. Socialism is about rolling back the tyranny of the market. As long as the economy is dominated by an unelected, privileged few, the case for socialism will exist.”

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, whether we define ourselves as socialists, social democrats, liberals, whatever the definition is that we might describe ourselves ideologically, the challenge posed by Chris Hani remains: to achieve a better life for all. A life without oppression and exploitation and a life where the basic needs are met; where wealth is shared and where the land belongs to those who work it. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. [Applause.] I purposely did not put a time constraint on that because I felt that you deserved to have an end of your words. I now recognise the EFF, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The EFF wishes to send our best wishes to the hon members of Parliament and staff over the festive season. We must all be safe, and we must come back to this Parliament and restore hope to the Western Cape community, more especially, those who are previously disadvantaged and also strive to bring an end to inequalities of this province. I thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise GOOD.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. GOOD would like to say that it is our first year or my first year in this House. I came in in February. I would like to say thank you to all the hon members that welcomed me, the good relationships that we could build and finding each other in our oversight visits, both on Cluster and also, Standing Committees. The love and caring, a part of the members towards me, always advising and assisting. I would also like to say thank you to the staff and that we all have a good Christmas and a good festive season. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the ACDP, I wish every hon member and the officials Godspeed over the festive season and safe travelling mercies. Hon Deputy Speaker, the legacy that this Parliament must leave behind, must be a legacy of a safer, prosperous and healthy province. With robust discussions and debates, we will achieve a better life for all of the people of the Western Cape. I want to bless hon members and the officials by reading from the Word of God Number 6 verses 24 to 26:

“The Lord bless you, the Lord keep you; the Lord make his face shine upon you and be gracious to you; the Lord turn his face toward you and give you peace.”

Shalom.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I know the Freedom Front Plus is not in the House. I recognise – over to you, hon Brinkhuis, Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker for this opportunity. First of all, I want to say that all praise to Allah [2:50:36] and salutations on the Prophet Muhammad [2:50:41] and we will never be able to thank Allah [2:50:44] that he has carried us through the year with all our work that we have done here in the Western Cape Government. And I also would like to take the opportunity to thank the hon Premier and to thank all my colleagues and hon members of Parliament, and especially the hon Deputy Speaker and the hon Speaker that is not currently with us. I would like to end off with a prayer for myself and for everybody. [2:51:09 – 2:51:30] Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It is known as the Season of Goodwill in most Western countries, but the December festive season is, of course, not a universal one. Here in South Africa, Christmas is a public holiday and most South Africans celebrate the day for very many different reasons, ranging from religion to culture to custom to tradition or to simply just have holiday fun; or even only because of our children, many too young still to consider ideology. They want gifts and treats like all the other children they see around them.

†Tradisioneel is die Desember-vakansie die groot Suid-Afrikaanse wegbreek. Sommige van ons gaan see toe, Bosveld toe, of huis toe waar ons grootgeword het. Ons onthou die dinge wat ons in ons gelukkigste tye met vriende en familie saamgebind het en ons raak aan ons beste herinneringe in hierdie dae. [Traditionally the December holiday is the big South African breakaway. Some of us go to the sea, to the Bushveld, or home where we grew up. We remember the things that bound us together in our happiest times with our friends and families and we touch on our best memories in these days.]

Perhaps, we should focus on the fact that all may wish for happiness and joy and goodwill to all. †As die feesseisoene 'n impak kan maak op ons begrip van geregtigheid en gelyke geleenthede, dan kan ons maar feesvier, ongeag die rede vir die viering. [If the festive season can make an impact on our perception of justice and equal opportunities, then we may celebrate, irrespective of the reason for celebration.]

So, hon colleagues on both sides of the House and logged online, let us be happy and let us relax. We all have worked hard this year. I believe we all deserve a break, but let us not forget, indeed, let us not forget that the people

we were elected and appointed to serve do not all have the same privileges and opportunities and certainly, not the means we have to make and to relive happy memories.

Let us reflect during our celebrations and our fun that we need to redouble our efforts to make possible an equal opportunity for jobs, for houses, for food, for electricity, for water, for health, for education, for recreation. The basic services, sadly people in our province are taking for granted, but so many in the other eight provinces are yearning for as we speak.

Let 2023 be notable year of good governance to the benefit of all. That the spirit of goodwill guides us not only during Christmas, but always as we discharge our duties, as we do the all-important work to make better lives possible and real for our citizens in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, [Applause.] hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the business for the day. I wish you all a very safe and festive season. The Secretary will now end the meeting and the hon members will be exited. The House is adjourned.

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS**

MONDAY, 5 DECEMBER 2022

### **TABLINGS**

The Secretary:

#### **1. Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport**

##### **(a) Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport: Submission of in-year amendments to the Annual Performance Plan for 2022/23:**

Annexure A: Indicator 2.2.2 (p 61 and Technical Indicator Description (TID) on p 94), indicator 3.2.1 (p 69 and TID on pp 108–109), indicator 4.2.1 (p 78 and TID on pp 130–131), indicator 4.2.7 (p 78 and TID on pp 134–135), indicator 1.6 (pp 78–80), indicator 1.3 (pp 78–80), indicator 1.1 (p 164), TID 4.2.12 and TID 4.4.5.

##### **(b) Western Cape Cultural Commission: Submission of in-year amendments to the Annual Performance Plan for 2022/23:**

Annexure A: Indicator 1.3 (p 21).

**2. Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities****(a) Department of Economic Development and Tourism: Submission of in-year amendments to the Annual Performance Plan for 2022/23:**

Annexure A: Indicator 3.4 (p 52), indicator 5.4 (p 69), Table 9.5.2 (p 69), Table 9.5.3 (p 69), indicator 9.5.4 (p 69), indicator 5.6 (p 70), indicator 5.9 (p 70), indicator 2.1 (pp 111–114), Technical Indicator Description (TID) 5.4.1, TID 5.4.2 and TID 2.1.

**(b) Provincial Treasury: Submission of in-year amendments to the Annual Performance Plan for 2022/23:**

Annexure A: Output 3.2.1.6 (p 57) and indicator 3.2.1.6 (p 133).

**3. Auditor-General****2021/22 Public Finance Management Act (PFMA) Audit Outcomes Report:**

(a) Consolidated general report on national and provincial audit outcomes.

(b) Material irregularities report in national and provincial government.

**4. Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety****Western Cape Policing Needs and Priorities Report 2021/22**

Report submitted in terms of section 23 of the Western Cape Community Safety Act, 2013 (Act 3 of 2013), for referral to the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport in accordance with Standing Rule 110(2).

Copies attached.

MONDAY, 5 DECEMBER 2022

**ANNOUNCEMENT**

The Secretary:

In accordance with Rule 22(1) of the Standing Rules of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, read together with section 111(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, the House is informed that it is necessary to elect a Speaker.

The Chief Justice will be engaged to:

(a) designate a judge to preside over the election of a Speaker; and

- (b) confirm the rules applicable to the election of a Speaker.

The date and time for the election of a Speaker shall be communicated by the Secretary to the House at an appropriate time.

WEDNESDAY, 7 DECEMBER 2022

### **TABLING**

The Secretary:

#### **Minister of Education**

#### **Department of Education: Submission of in-year amendments to the Annual Performance Plan for 2022/23:**

Annexure A: POI 709 (p 87), POI 201 (p 60), POI 302 (TID) (p 129), TIDs of POIs (pp 110–155), SOI 103 (p 52), POI 101 (TID) (p 110), POI 201 (TID) (p 122), POI 202 (TID) (p 123), POI 204 (TID) (p 125), POI 205 (p 126), POI 206 (TID) (p 127).

Copies attached.

WEDNESDAY, 7 DECEMBER 2022

### **TABLING**

The Secretary:

#### **Auditor-General of South Africa:**

Special Report of the Auditor-General on the delay in the submission of the auditors' reports on the financial statements of Municipal Finance Management Act (MFMA) auditees for the financial year ended 30 June 2022:

- (a) Kannaland Local Municipality
- (b) Laingsburg Local Municipality
- (c) George Local Municipality
- (d) Cape Winelands District Municipality
- (e) Bitou Local Municipality
- (f) Breede Valley Local Municipality
- (g) Cape Agulhas Local Municipality
- (h) Cederberg Local Municipality
- (i) West Coast District Municipality

Copies attached.

THURSDAY, 8 DECEMBER 2022

## **ANNOUNCEMENT**

The Secretary:

In accordance with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament (WCPP) Standing Rule 22(2):

“The time for the election of a Speaker in terms of section 20(1) and (2), read with Schedule 2, of the Constitution of the Western Cape, must be announced by the Secretary.”

Given the above-mentioned, the House is hereby informed of a sitting of the House as follows:

Date: Monday 12 December 2022 (as determined in conjunction with the Designated Judge)

Time: 09:00 until adjournment (as determined in conjunction with the Designated Judge) Presiding Officer: In terms of section 111(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, the Judge President of the Western Cape Division of the High Court, Judge President MJ Hlophe, has been designated by the Chief Justice of the Republic of South Africa to preside over the election of the Speaker of the WCPP.

Business of the House: The only business of the House on the day shall be the election of the Speaker of the WCPP.

Format of the sitting: Since the election of the Speaker of the WCPP shall be conducted by a secret ballot (see the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, Schedule 3, Part A, Item 6(a), read together with the Constitution of the Western Cape, 1997, Schedule 2, Item 6(a)), all Members of the WCPP shall attend the aforementioned sitting of the House (WCPP) in person in the Chamber on the 6th floor, 7 Wale Street, Cape Town.

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT**

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams.]

Members assembled in the Chamber at 09:00.

The Judge President took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 6750****BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The Serjeant-at-Arms announced the Honourable the Judge President of the High Court, Western Cape Division, Mr J M Hlophe, who was received by members standing.

The Honourable the Judge President allowed an opportunity for silent prayer or meditation.

**CALLING OF MEETING OF WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT**

The SECRETARY: The Division of the High Court.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Please be seated. There will now be an opportunity for a silent prayer or meditation. Alright, thank you very much. I now request the Retaining Officer, Mr Adams, to read the notice whereby this meeting has been called. The Returning Officer, thank you.

The RETURNING OFFICER: In accordance with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament Standing Rule 22(2), the time for the election of a Speaker in terms of Section 20(1) and (2) read with Schedule 2 of the Constitution of the Western Cape must be announced by the Secretary. Given the above mentioned, the House is hereby informed of the sitting of the House as follows.

The date, Monday, 12 December 2022 as determined in conjunction with the designated Honourable the Judge President. The time 09:00 until adjournment, as determined in conjunction with the designated Honourable the Judge President.

Presiding Officer: in terms of Section 111(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, the Honourable the Judge President of the Western Cape Division of the High Court, Judge President M J Hlophe, has been designated by the Chief Justice of the Republic of South Africa to preside over the election of the Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Business of the House: the only business of the House on the day shall be the election of the Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. Since the election of the Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament shall be

conducted by a secret ballot, see the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996 Schedule 3 Part A 6(a), read together with the Constitution of the Western Cape 1997 Schedule 2 Item 6(a).

“All members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament shall attend the aforementioned sitting of the House in person in the Chamber on the 6th Floor, 7 Wale Street, Cape Town.”

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: There is a hand up there and now I will deal with that. Mr Adams, there is a hand up there and I want to deal with that. Alright, okay. There is a hand over there. You will pardon me; I am not familiar with these processes. We do not raise hands in court. Kindly, [Laughter.] I want to acknowledge you and then you can tell me what it is that you would like to talk about.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Honourable Presiding Judge. I rise in terms of Rule 66 which relates to the ATC of the announcement for today that all hon members for today's election must be here in person.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Yes.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): I do see an hon member of the Provincial Parliament online on the MS Teams setting and I would just like some guidance in this regard because the ATC did say we must be here in person for today's sitting. Thank you.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Okay. To facilitate voting, you are right. I do not have an answer to that. You should know better than I. Are you able to offer any assistance? I do not know. I am reliably advised that the hon member who is not physically present here in the Chamber can sit as an observer from home, but will not participate, which means that hon member will not be allowed to vote. Does that carry the day?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Thank you, that is the ruling. Thank you so much. Let us carry on then. Alright. Presiding Officer, alright we have done that. This is me now. Alright. May I make the following announcement.

I have to announce that in terms of Rule 2 of the Rules for the Election of a Speaker of a Provincial Legislature, Mr Romeo Adams shall act as a Returning Officer while Mr Lubabalo Stemele, Ms Zukisa Nduneni, Ms Lynne Saayman, Alvin Poggenpoel, and Mr J Cleopas have been appointed as assistant Returning Officers. I have to announce further that the oath or affirmation has already been administered to the Returning Officer and the Assistant Returning Officers as required by the Rules.

Alright, we shall now proceed to deal with the appointment itself. This meeting will now proceed to elect the Speaker and that is the Business of the Day. Before calling for nominations, I have to remind hon members that in terms of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa and that of the Western Cape

Province, as well as the Rules, each nomination must be submitted on the prescribed form.

Furthermore, I have to draw the attention of hon members specifically to Section 111 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa and Section 20 of the Western Cape Constitution, in terms of which no person may be elected as a Speaker unless he or she is qualified to take his or her seat as a member of the Provincial Parliament. I also have to inform hon members that in terms of Item 4 of Part A of Schedule 3 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa and Item 4 of Schedule 2 of the Western Cape Constitution, there may be no debate. There will now be an opportunity for nominations. May I hand over to you, Returning Officers? Thank you.

Mr I H MEYER (DA): The Honourable the Presiding Judge.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Yes, Mr Meyer, I think.

Mr I H MEYER (DA): In my capacity as Ivan Henry Meyer, hon member of this House, I fully nominate hon Daylin Mitchell as the first proposer to fill the nomination as Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Thank you, Mr Meyer. Returning Officers, please take the nomination form. [Interjections.] Any second, ma'am?

Dr T A SIMMERS (DA): Thank you, the Honourable the Judge President.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Please use the microphone, ja ...[Interjection.]

Dr T A SIMMERS (DA): Thank you, the Honourable the Judge President

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: ...to be recorded.

Dr T A SIMMERS (DA): I am Tertius Simmers and in my capacity as an hon member of the Legislature, I second the proposal of hon Daylin Mitchell for the position of the Speaker of the House. Thank you.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: You are seconding the nomination. Thank you so much. The Returning Officer will take the nomination form for the proposal, the seconder and the person nominated must also sign. Thank you. Have they all three signed? So, it was signed in anticipation. Can I have a look? [Interjections.] This was signed before the chamber even convened. Daylin Mitchell, 7 Wale Street, Cape Town, hon member of the Western Cape Provincial. Ivan Meyer has signed; Dr Simmers has signed.

"I, the abovementioned, do hereby accept the nomination."

On the face of it, this is a valid nomination. Okay. There is one nomination that I have. It has been signed by three parties. The proposer, Mr Meyer. This person was seconded, as well as the acceptance itself, by the nominee. Alright. We are done with that. And then, any other? Yes?

Mr C M DUGMORE (ANC): Good morning, the Honourable the Judge President ...[Interjection.]

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Yes, good morning, and how are you.

Mr C M DUGMORE (ANC): ...and thank you very much, for honouring us with your presence today. I would like to nominate the person on my left, comrade Nomi Nobulumko Nkondlo ...[Interjection.]

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Thank you, Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE (ANC): ...as to the position of Speaker of the Western Cape Legislature. Thank you.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Thank you very much, Mr Dugmore. Any seconder? Yes, are you seconding the appointment, the nomination?

Mr M K SAYED (ANC): Yes, Honourable Judge President. I am seconding the nomination, thank you.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Thank you very much. So, the same procedure is going to be followed. First, Mr Dugmore will nominate, the seconder and the acceptance thereof. Can I have a look at that nomination, please?

I just want to have a look at the nomination, this one, after it has been signed by Mr Dugmore and everybody else. Does it look okay?

Thank you very much. Alright, I am not going to say 'order, order'. No, not for me. [Laughter.]

I have the second nomination. It has already been duly completed. It was made by Mr Dugmore, seconded by Mr Sayed and the nominated candidate is Nobulumko Nkondlo. She has accepted that. So, this is again in order. Two nominations.

Are there any further nominations? I assume there is no other nomination because if there are just two candidates, the procedure is shorter. If it is more than that, it is a nightmare. Are there any further nominations? Any further nominations, in the absence of which there are only two nominations. May I have the names, please, for the record? Thank you so much. Thank you very much. There are two nominations. The first one is Daylin Mitchell. It has been properly signed and the acceptance as well. The second one is Nobulumko Nkondlo, properly nominated and she has accepted the nomination. We have two nominations.

Mr I H Meyer, seconded by Dr T A Simmers, nominated Mr D G Mitchell for election as Speaker.

Mr C M Dugmore, seconded by Mr M K Sayed, nominated Ms N D Nkondlo for election as Speaker.

I think now we should adjourn. Yes, we should. Yes, I am going to suspend the sitting to enable us to print the ballot papers and then, we will come back. I will do the announcement. Alright.

Business of the House suspended at 09:20 and resumed at 09:45

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: To avoid congestion, in other words? I wish to point out that hon members, I wish to point – sorry. I wish to point out to hon members to inform the Returning Officer if they inadvertently spoiled a ballot paper before the ballot paper is placed in the ballot box. Should hon members fail to do so, a spoiled ballot paper will be treated as an invalid ballot paper and will not be considered when counting the Votes. Alright, let me sit down. You take over, Mr Adams.

### **ELECTION OF THE SPEAKER OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT**

The RETURNING OFFICER:

Allen, R I; America, D.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: It will be right, left, right, left. [Interjections.] [Laughter] Why do you not split them? Do you want to split them? One can be standing this side and the other one that side, yes.

The RETURNING OFFICER:

August, S N; Baartman, D M; Bakubaku-Vos, N G; Bans, A P; Bosman, G; Bredell, A W; Brinkhuis, K; Christians, F C; Dugmore, C M; Fernandez, S G; Fry, C; Lekker, P Z; Mackenzie, R D; Marais, A J D;

An HON MEMBER: This one is spoiled.

The ASSISTANT RETURNING OFFICER: Okay, let me give you another one.

The ASSISTANT RETURNING OFFICER: Pass it to the Honourable the Judge President.

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Spoiled? Oh, thank you. This is a spoiled vote.

The RETURNING OFFICER:

Marais, P J; Marran, P; Maseko, L M; Maynier, D J; Meyer, I H; Mitchell, D G; Murray, C; Mvimbi, L L; Nkondlo, N D; Philander, W F; Plato, D; Sayed, M K; Schäfer, B A; Sileku, I; Simmers, T A; Van der Westhuizen, A P; Wenger, M M; Winde, A R; Windvogel, R.

[Interjections.]

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Yes, paragraph 9 we suspend the proceedings, but I will announce that there is order. Alright.

May I have your attention please, thank you. I have one spoiled Vote. The procedure is simply that a new ballot paper has been issued and that has been corrected, but we will keep this for record purposes. Are there any hon members who have not voted and wish to do so? It does not look like it. If not, I now suspend the proceedings to enable the Returning Officers to count the Votes and to report to me. The bells will be rung for five minutes before the resumption of the proceedings. May we then.

Business of the House suspended at 09:57 and resumed at 10:26

Mr JUSTICE J M HLOPHE: Please be seated, thank you. I know you are all anxious. You want to know the outcome. It is the next thing. Counting. Alright. We are done with the counting.

I am happy to make the following announcement. I have received a written report from the Returning Officer that the results of the ballot are as follows:

Mr Daylin Gary Mitchell – 23 Votes. [Applause.]  
Ms Nobulumko Nkondlo – 11 Votes. [Applause.]

There was one spoiled Vote. We will do our maths quickly: that 23 and 11 plus one, that gives you 35.

Before we adjourned or before I suspended this sitting, there was a spoiled Vote. So, when you go to the ballot box there is a total of 36 Votes. I am trying to explain where the other one is coming from, but in total 23, Mr Mitchell, 11 and one spoiled Vote. There you go.

Now, in terms of Item 6(c) of Part A to Schedule 3 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa and Item 6(c) of Schedule 2 of the Western Cape Constitution, I accordingly declare Mr Daylin Mitchell to be duly elected as a Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. [Applause.] Alright, I am waiting for the hon Speaker and thereafter, to be excused. I have warmed the seat for you. [Applause.]

[The Speaker takes the Chair.]

### **ACCEPTANCE SPEECH BY THE SPEAKER**

The SPEAKER: Good morning, hon members, the Honourable the Judge President, hon Premier, hon members of the Provincial Executive and hon members of this House, guests in the gallery, citizens of the Western Cape. It is, indeed, with utmost humility that I address you today as the newly elected Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

While I am immensely proud to have been elected to this Office, I am also acutely aware of the grave responsibilities bestowed upon me. Today, I commit to ensure that the Constitutional responsibilities of this august House, are fulfilled to their fullest extent and I formally pledge that I shall discharge my duties as the Speaker and Chief Presiding Officer of this House in an impartial and fair manner, upholding the dignity and the decorum of this House; that I

shall fulfil the obligations placed upon me by the Constitution, the law and the Rules, regulations and policies of the Provincial Parliament with honesty and diligence; that I shall protect the honour and dignity of the Provincial Parliament and represent the Western Cape Provincial Parliament as the Speaker, both locally and abroad; that I shall ensure that the process and procedures of the WCPP are fair to all parties represented in this House; and that I shall maintain a stable workforce, serving and supporting all hon members of the WCPP in their work; and that I shall ensure that the Constitutional responsibilities of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament of law making, oversight over the Executive and public participation in the process and work are maintained and where necessary, enhanced.

In conclusion, I wish to thank all hon members for their support and look forward to serving the Institution to the best of my ability in the interest of the people of this beautiful Province. We all serve in an Institution where hon members differ from one another almost all the time. This is the nature of the beast of Parliament. However, we can do so in a dignified and respectful manner. Our constituents expect that from us, but they also expect and demand from us a good, clean fight in the arena we call Parliament. And as Speaker, I am looking forward to this journey and to live our vision to make the Western Cape Provincial Parliament the best regional parliament in Africa.

Finally, please allow me this opportunity to wish you and your loved ones a blessed festive season. I thank you. [Applause.] Hon members, with that concludes the Business of the Day. The House is adjourned

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS**

THURSDAY, 15 DECEMBER 2022

### **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Speaker:

#### **1. Referral of the Ad-hoc Committee: WCPP Seats report**

In accordance with Standing Rule 92, the Report of the Ad-hoc Committee: WCPP Seats is hereby referred to the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters for consideration and reporting.

#### **2. Filling of vacancy and swearing-in of new Member**

The vacancy, which occurred in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament owing to the cessation of party membership of Mr M Mnqasela, have been filled by the nomination of Mr G Pretorius with effect from 15 December 2022. The oath was administered by the Speaker on 15 December 2022.

#### **3. Recess Period**

In accordance with Rule 21(2) of the Standing Rules of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament (WCPP) the recess period will commence from

15 December 2022 to 06 January 2023.

TUESDAY, 20 DECEMBER 2022

## **ANNOUNCEMENT**

The Speaker:

**Referral of document to committee in terms of section 54(1) and (2) of the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, 2009 (Act 10 of 2009), as amended:**

### **Parliamentary Oversight Committee**

**Western Cape Provincial Parliament** – In-year Monitoring Report as at 30 November 2022.

## **TABLING**

The Speaker:

**Tabling of document in terms of section 54(1) and (2) of the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, 2009 (Act 10 of 2009), as amended:**

**Western Cape Provincial Parliament** – In-year Monitoring Report as at 30 November 2022.

Copies attached.

WEDNESDAY, 21 DECEMBER 2022

## **TABLING**

The Speaker:

Progress Report on the Implementation of the Financial Recovery Plan:  
Beaufort West Municipality.

Copies attached.

FRIDAY, 30 DECEMBER 2022

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Speaker:

### **1. Assent of bill by the Premier**

The Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Act, 2022 (Act 3 of 2022), was assented to and signed by the Premier on 19 December 2022.

## 2. Publication of Regulations

**In terms of section 17 of the Interpretation Act, 1957 (Act 33 of 1957) that the following regulations have been published:**

- (a). Regulations Relating to the Consultation Process for Listing Heritage Resources in the Heritage Register and the Designation of Heritage Areas by Heritage Western Cape, 2022, were made under Provincial Notice 145/2022 in Provincial Gazette 8696 dated 15 December 2022.
- (b). Regulations Relating to the Consultation Process for Listing Places in the Heritage Register by Heritage Western Cape and the Designation of Heritage Areas by a Local Authority, 2022, were made under Provincial Notice 146/2022 in Provincial Gazette 8696 dated 15 December 2022.

### **TABLING**

The Speaker:

**Documents tabled in terms of section 19(5) of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999), as amended:**

Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities

Delayed tabling of the annual consolidated financial statements (ACFS) of the provincial departments, provincial public entities and the Provincial Revenue Fund for the 2021/22 financial year.

Copies attached.

**INTERPELLATIONS,  
QUESTIONS AND REPLIES**

**QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY***Transformation of Agricultural Sector***1. Ms N Makamba-Botya to ask Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Agriculture:**

(a) How many black people has his Department assisted in acquiring or owning farms in the province since he assumed office and (b) what has he and his Department done to transform the agricultural sector in the province in order to represent the racial demographics of South Africa at large?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and to the learners in the House and the educators and the principal, thank you for joining us in one of the best well run functional parliaments in South Africa.

†'n AGBARE LID: Sê vir haar!

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[An HON MEMBER: Tell her!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, in terms of this interpellation from hon Makamba-Botya, she is fully aware that it is the function and the responsibility of the National Government and the Minister of the Department of Land Reform and Agriculture and Rural Development to allocate land for black farmers. Hon Speaker, we also know that the Government is failing black people in this province... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Your Government, your Government!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...because they are not allocating land to black people. I have looked at the budget of the National Government for land reform in this province. Hon Speaker, you cannot buy – do proper land reform when your local National Department based in this province for land reform has only a budget of R20 million rand. You can absolutely do no land reform. [Interjections.] If you want to show me... [Interjections.]

If you want to show me your policy, if you want to show me your policy, show me your budget. No budget, no policy. It is absolutely a disgrace that this ANC Government is neglecting black people in South Africa. In fact, and when a black person gets a farm, he gets evicted by the black National ANC Government. This is what they are doing, so they have absolutely total disrespect for black farmers. They do not allocate land and if they do allocate land, hon Speaker, they do allocate the land to their own comrades, MK veterans and we have stopped it. We will not allow ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: We will not allow the ANC to abuse people in this province. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon members, there is a member on the floor, and that is hon Lili who would like to ask a question.

Mr A LILI: Thank you very much, Speaker. No, my question to the Minister is that is he going to maybe... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I thought you wanted to raise a point of order?

Mr A LILI: Oh, because of this, there are too many loud speakers. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Speaker, on a point of order!

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister. [Interjections.] Hon members, how long have we not been seeing each other? It seems we have missed each other so much. You know what you must do, nè, because I see that we have missed each other. When we arrive we must have a moment for hugs and kisses. [Interjections.] Then it is not going to be like this, because hon Lili rises on no point for support whatsoever, but, you know, he just wanted to be noticed by the hon Minister, so hon Minister, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I miss hon member Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.] I declare my love for her. [Interjections.]

†Die WAARNEMENDE HOOFSWEEP (DA): Ja, aitsa! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]  
[The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, hallo! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Speaker in this House we love each other. That is why we have this debate. You must not think there is hatred in this House. It is because of love that we differ, have different viewpoints, but we do not hate each other.

Hon Speaker, there is something fundamentally wrong in South Africa and this is that land reform has no budget. Your policies are measured against your budget and when the ruling party is allocating land to... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What about your budget, you are talking about... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: My budget is extensive. [Interjection.] My budget is extensive. In fact, we have done a study, hon Speaker. We have looked at land reform in South Africa, in the ANC National Government 90% failure, only 10% success; in the Western Cape, 72% success. That is the difference in terms of land reform and I am proud of what this Government is doing but I am not going to sit here and allow the ANC to steal the land and allocate it to MK soldiers. I am not going to sit here with ANC former Members

of Parliament being allocated land; it is not going to happen under my watch. I will stop it. I have stopped it already here in Malmesbury. [Interjections.] So the point is very clear, hon Speaker. I am getting clear.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The ANC is failing on land reform. The DA is making a big success in terms of land reform. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, thank you. †Baie dankie, agbare Minister. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Thank you, hon Minister [Interjections.]

Order, hon members! Hon members, order! I now afford the opportunity to hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: †Enkosi somlomo! [Thank you very much], Speaker, and thanks to the hon Minister. I have actually, I was prepared for the response from the Minister because every time when we ask about land transformation, we are always told that the Province has no powers and that its hands are tied and even now the Minister had just made mention that this is the function and the responsibility of the National Government. However, hon Speaker, Schedule 4 of the South African Constitution provides a functional area of concurrent national and legislative competence. Agriculture is one sector that falls under this concurrent competency of both national and provincial government. Moreover, Somlomo, Section 40 of the Constitution provides for cooperative governance, whilst Section 41 makes it mandatory that various spheres of government must assist and support one another. Furthermore, these spheres are mandated to consult and inform one another on matters of common interest.

Hon Speaker, these provisions I just mentioned above, provide avenues for the National Government and the Department of the Minister to work together in making sure that the agricultural sector in this province is transformed. So if this Department had even the slightest interest in transforming the agricultural sector in this province, to provide agricultural land to emerging black farmers, you will be engaging the National Government Minister from time to time for that purpose. This thing of thinking that Western Cape does not need the National Government and can be independent on its own should come to an end, because it is not on.

In 2018, hon Speaker, the National Government established an Agricultural State Land Allocation Project. Under this project instructions were issued for the establishment of vacant and underutilised farms. Provinces were also engaged in this project to assist in identifying vacant and underutilised funds so that provisions can be made for those funds to either be leased or acquired for purposes of redistribution or turning them into productive use. One of the reasons why the provinces were engaged in this project, hon Speaker, was because they knew their surroundings better and this was also an opportunity for them to work together with the National Government on what one would expect to be a matter of common interest. Generally, there was cooperation under this projected project by the majority of provinces. Some provinces were

not really cooperative, for example, when it came to the issue of identifying underutilised farms and to check whether there were any agricultural activities going on, some agricultural provincial departments just came back with the response that funds are occupied. The question was never whether the farms were occupied or not, it was whether they were utilised or under-utilised.

Now, because of this difficulty and lack of cooperation, this forced the National Government to initiate the Land Rights [Inaudible.] process, which now caused further delays.

Now, somlomo, lastly, I just want to know whether there was any initiative that the Minister has made an engagement with the National Government to specify specifically to make sure that there is transformation in the Western Cape agricultural sector. Thank you, somlomo.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, I now recognise hon Van der Westhuizen. †Agbare. Agbare Van der Westhuizen, is hy daar? [Honourable. Hon Van der Westhuizen, is he there?]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: [No audible reply.]

The SPEAKER: Hon, the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chairperson, my suspicion is member Van der Westhuizen is also in the NCOP at the exact same time on a debate on land reform, but I will liaise with the Table staff in this regard.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon, the Acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party. May I then at this point request hon Marran to address the House?

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Speaker, and good afternoon everyone present. [Interjections.] Speaker, it is no secret that agriculture and agri-processing sectors are part of the key economic sectors of the Western Cape with an 8% contribution towards the Province's economy as per the latest PERO, but we must also examine the details where the devil is, and inquire who dominates these sectors.

Statistics provided by the South African Institute of Race Relations in 2018 illustrates that nearly 71% of urban land belongs to whites. Nearly 11% is owned by Coloureds, while 8% is owned by Indians and Africans owning only 3.5% of land in the Western Cape.

The Western Cape Government unfortunately once again throws hands up in the air and shouts that this responsibility making land available lies with National Government. When MEC Meyer was asked the question about the racial patterns and title deeds, he and his Department referred the ANC to the National Deeds Office.

According to the 2021 Western Cape Agricultural Sector Profile, the total value of agricultural exports in 2020 was R45,8 billion and yet this MEC cannot account how much the black farmers contributed to these figures.

The MEC and his Department do not find such data important, and yet, the Premier is always insisting on data and being scientific.

Now as we have heard, the MEC does not provide such data and therefore he and his Department pay lip service to the sustainability of agriculture and aquaculture sectors. Hence, there was an instruction that the Casidra notice, it was an instruction by MEC Meyer that a Casidra notice advertising funding for African, Coloured and Indian farmers during COVID-19 and funding provided by National Government, be withdrawn, because the MEC insisted whites must be included. In some areas, though, the Provincial Government does not throw its hands up in the air, as you all know, police is not a provincial function, and yet this Government... [Interjection.]

†Die SPEAKER: Agbare Marran, ek is baie jammer, jou tyd is weg, meneer! [The Speaker: Hon Marran, I'm very sorry, your time is gone, sir!] There is no more time.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, is that two minutes?

The SPEAKER: Yes. I see you did not see that it is two; it is not three, because three minutes is for the member who asked the question.

Mr P MARRAN: It cannot be.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran. Yes. I even gave you one or two seconds extra. [Interjection.] Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon, the Acting Chief Whip?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Speaker. Due to the toggling between the NCOP and the WCPP the delegate is here. I wanted to ask if it is possible for member Van der Westhuizen to take the slot after member Marran?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, hon members!

An HON MEMBER: He is here.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Order, hon members! I now afford the opportunity to hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Speaker and my apologies for having to run between these two Houses. In 1971 the Sectional Titles Act ushered in a new era in home ownership in South Africa. The Act provided for the division of buildings into sections. [Interjections.] Is it a declaration?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Apology, my apology.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Van der Westhuizen, do you have the speech for this one?

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: My apologies, Speaker, my apologies.

The SPEAKER: Yes, okay, you may proceed. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Excuse me, hon Van der Westhuizen. Hon members, we all have those moments. There was once a member who read the motion, a different motion on a wrong motion. I forgave that member from some other side on the other side of the House, so let me give the opportunity when the hon member from the other side does the same thing. Please hon Van der Westhuizen, you may proceed.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you. Hon Speaker, the debate this afternoon in the NCOP is on land reform and I am very proud to say that in the Western Cape we have a much higher success rate in terms of land reform than in the remainder of the country. Two studies done in 2014 and in 2019 showed that the Western Cape was making good progress with our success rate in the land reform sphere, improving from 64% success to 72% success. Mr Minister, I would like to know from you, what are in your mind the reasons why the Western Cape has got this much higher success rate in this regard. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen. Order, hon members? Order, hon members! There are a couple of other interpellations and there are Questions and there is still a lot in terms of our Business for the Day, I can assure you, there will be ample time to interface. May I now give an opportunity to hon Makamba-Botya?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Somlomo! Thank you very much. I so wish I could see the report that has been declared that the Western Cape has the highest success rate in land distribution, but my follow-up question, Somlomo, it is pertaining to the session, during the question and answer session that was held in 2020/21/22 Annual Reports on Agriculture, there was a concern raised that some suitable agricultural land in the province is being utilised for other purposes other than agriculture, for example, such as for the provision of housing and other developments. Now focusing on part of this land, which might be owned by either national, provincial or local government, what has this Department done to make sure that this land is acquired by the Provincial Government and land utilised for purposes of farming that will benefit emerging black farmers or those black people who are interested to acquiring farms, either by owning them or leasing them.

In this case the role of the Provincial Department of Agriculture was not willing to buy the land using its own budget but to play a facilitating role between the Provincial Government and another sphere of government, owning that land in order to make sure that this land ends up being owned by the Province. The land can later be transferred to the Department of Agriculture by the Province for the purpose of land transformation. Now the question, somlomo, is that by now we know that the Department of Agriculture in this province spends millions of rands supporting farmers and farms through various activities such as making water available for the further support as well as through conditional grants of various natures. The Department also acknowledged that there is now a high dependence on grant funding from farmers. Now since we know that

black farmers in this province represent a tiny percentage of those who own farms in this province, then this means that the bulk of this support goes to the majority of farmers who happen to be white and since this is a government support, this means that this money assisting these white farmers comes from the taxpayers money, so the question that I have, somlomo, as the Minister of Agriculture in this province, are you happy, Minister, that the majority of resources of this country through National Conditional Grants and those allocated to this Department are spent on the rich white minority group farmers / farm owners and not on the poor majority groups? Thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: †Enkosi mancoba. [Thank you very much.] Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, for those who took part in this interpellation. I think hon member Makamba-Botya will appreciate that this Parliament respects the rule of law and that the outcomes of the judiciary, this Parliament believes in redress and transformation in agriculture is our business, it is my business. It is my agenda. We also appreciate that the previous court ruling made by the High Court indicated that the Western Cape in the case of Correctional Services, that the Western Cape demographics must be taken into consideration and not the national demographics.

Hon Speaker, in terms of grant funding, I think it is incorrect from the member to say that transformation for black farmers only is dependent on grant funding. It is incorrect, hon member. It is... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister, will you kindly take your seat? Is that a point of order, hon the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, it is a question, I would like to know if the hon MEC... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No-no-no! No-no-no.

Mr P MARRAN: It is not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat. As a matter of fact, sorry, hon Minister, please take your seat, hon Minister. Hon Minister, will you please take your seat?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I will take a question during tea-time. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, what I would like to address with the hon members, I am seeing there is a trend, but let us stop this trend so that it has not become a custom in the House. There is always an opportunity and I guess it is a temptation when you rise, you want to ask that question, but what it does is that you will be sitting here and people will do that. So let us do it differently. You rise, fortunately you are the Deputy Chief Whip, hon Sayed, so you will help me to implement the Rules. Let us make sure that when you arise, before you say anything there is an opportunity that has been granted by the other side

to ask that question, which is the member that is on the floor. I know that you do know that and all of us do, but I want to avoid us having a situation where it just becomes a custom. I think I have been noticing from time to time it happens from the House.

Hon Minister, we paused your time so you may proceed. Let me just bring it to your attention, you have used one minute, now you have three minutes to go.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think it is important to note that the honourable member is correct. We cannot simply rely on grant funding to facilitate land reform in the Western Cape but anyway in South Africa. That is why I welcome the initiative by HortFin and last week I attended a function where HortFin, supported by HortGro, the industry, as well as by FNB Bank, as well as by the National Treasury through the Jobs Fund, have made a substantive amount of money together with my Department, available to fast-track and support land reform through proper mentoring, through proper partnership, I am also very happy that the National Minister has now publicly acknowledged the role that is being played by PALS which is a very effective Partnership in Agriculture Land Solutions, it is now a national model developed in Witzenberg and we support them as well. They are doing outstanding work.

In addition to that, hon members, and to the learners in the House and those online, my Department is right now busy with a program to develop 50 black commercial farmers, because I want export farmers, I want big farmers and so for me it is important that we understand that commercial farmers are important... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister. Will you please take your seat? I am again going to pause this. †Agbare Marais, [Hon Marais,] is that a point of order, †meneer [sir] will you please face your microphone?

Mr P J MARAIS: I just want to ask, will the Minister answer a question on what he just said about black farmers?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais; I see your microphone was off. [Interjection.] Okay, thank you. Hon Minister, will you take the question? [Interjection.] You see, what I was stopping, what I was trying to achieve here, the same thing that I have just addressed, hon Marais rises, he does not want to – he does not ask whether he can ask the question, he asks the question. Now I want to assist the hon members so that we do not make this a custom, †agbare [hon] Marais. Now you have already asked the question, but ordinarily you ask whether you can ask the question, that is what the Rule says.

Now if the hon members want to change the Rules, I am happy, but then let us change the Rules to say that. I am trying to assist the House because you have elected me as your Speaker, you have not removed me yet, so let us please... [Interjection.] Do not tamper with the Rules. The Rules are clear. [Interjections.] The Rules are clear. Do not tamper with the Rules, right?

Now I am going to ask the Minister, hon Minister, would you like to respond to

that question. [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): The member was never here.

Mr P MARRAN: It is a national competency.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, out of respect for the senior member of the House I will take the question.

Mr P J MARAIS: I thank you, Minister, the gentleman you are. You said that you mentioned black farmers. Now there are some people who say: "we are all black, just because we are not white." Well, I am not black. I am a Coloured man, a Griqua. I want to know, can you tell me how much of that land that you said was given to blacks, actually were given to Coloured or whether it is Namaqua or whether it is Goringhaiqua or whether it is Khoi, he is not black, he is brown-skinned. How much of the land went to brown-skinned people? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

Mr P J MARAIS: If you do not know brown-skinned you are not from South Africa. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Marais. Thank you. †Baie dankie, agbare. [Thank you, hon.] Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, this is an interpellation. I take that as a new question. I am happy to come to the House and to the Committee to give that statistical detail, but, hon member, I am particularly happy that the programme of black commercial farmers in the Western Cape is on track. I am equally very happy, hon Speaker, that the question that was asked by hon member Makamba-Botya about the report, that report is available on the website. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: So she can study the report on the website.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister. There is another hand. Please take your seat. Hon, the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, I am rising on a point of order, just that that was not a new question; it is part and parcel of the topic of discussion from member Marais. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Please take your seat, hon Minister. Hon Minister, you may please take your seat. [Interjections.] Let me – this is so nice. [Laughter] Hon members, the point that hon Sayed is making is correct but what is also important and correct is what the Minister said, that he, as part of the question that he is responding to and prepared for, that is a new

dimension, which he will deal with post this matter as discussed today, so it is not a matter of saying “we are not dealing with Agriculture”, but it says: the specificity is what they will come back to us and it is recorded in Hansard so that the Minister, the hon Minister responds to †agbare [hon] Marais. Can we then proceed on those bases?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Yes, hon Speaker the sponsor...

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat again.

Mr M KAMA: No thank you, hon Speaker, I just want to understand you better. Are we getting a sense that you will then submit a reply to that because the understanding I am getting from him is that we will come back some other time in the House. Now there is a question that has been asked and I understand because of the detail that is required that he will come back, is what you are given that the Minister will come back and give us a written reply or perhaps refer to that question?

The SPEAKER: Yes, thank you, hon Kama. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! There is one Speaker here. Hon Lili, hon Marran, there is one Speaker here. Now what I am saying, which I have intimated upon, is that the hon Minister has made an undertaking in this House, not in a small village somewhere so what is important is that when – because Hansard is recorded, right, so the Minister has a responsibility to report to this House on what he made commitment on. So that goes without saying that the hon Minister says he will do that and he is nodding, saying yes. Now, hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, the sponsor of this debate...

The SPEAKER: You have now about 13 seconds to conclude.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The sponsor of this debate asked for the reports for these land reform success evaluations. The reports are available on the website of this Government and my Department and she can read that report that confirms the relevance of the success of our land reform. Thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Order, hon members, that concludes the first interpellation. The order is that you went over the 13 seconds. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Without any response from you.

The SPEAKER: [Laughter] Order, hon members. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, my next speech will be 13 seconds shorter.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: [Laughter] Order, hon members, we are now moving to the second interpellation by the hon Kama to the hon Minister Allen, the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair.

### ***Crime Statistics***

#### **2. Mr M Kama to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

**With regard to the police-recorded crime statistics for the first quarter of the 2022/23 financial year (April to June 2022):**

**(a) What contributed to the 7,3% increase in the serious crimes reported in the province and (b) how did the Western Cape Safety Plan influence the crime statistics for the year under review?**

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Good afternoon, Speaker, good afternoon to all the learners that are here. I feel that I want to apologise in advance that if you hear anything from the other side of the House today, that seems irrational, I want to apologise for that. Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members, order! [Interjections.] Okay, hon members, Minister, if you can just... [Interjections.] Hon members, if you can just – Minister, if you can just take your seat?

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: May I continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just take your seat. Hon members, I have just sat down, so I have not seen whose hand is up first. Can I see... [Interjections.] Hon members, one minute! [Interjections.] Order! Order! I recognise your hand, I recognise your hand. I am going to allow hon Sayed to come up first. Then I will recognise you and then I will recognise you, in that order. [Interjection.] Hon members, order, please! Can I just hear what you want to say? [Interjections.] Order, members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much, and welcome to the Sitting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just on a slight point of order to my hon friend, hon Allen, he is addressing the learners. The learners are members of the gallery. He is not supposed to speak to the members of the gallery. He speaks to them through the one who is chairing the Sitting. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: May I remind the Minister... [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: He must apologise!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Marais. Order, members.

Mr P J MARAIS: The Minister is now – he is setting a precedent. Now I know some people are very, very excited when they have an audience in this House, but to address the audience directly is going to start a train of events here, because I will bring all the Freedom Front people and allow them to answer questions. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. Hon Bosman, over to you.

Mr G BOSMAN: Good afternoon, hon Speaker. I rise on Rule 40 and I would like you to call hon Marais, hon Sayed and hon Lili to order. They may not interrupt the member while he is on the floor. I know member Lili spends more time in courtrooms, member Marais spends more time in public meetings and member Sayed is auditioning... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...but please, hon Deputy Speaker, I ask that you call them to order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, hon members, order! Hon Lili, hon Marran, if you can just sit down for a second, Minister. Hon Lili, okay. Hon members, it does seem unusually loud today. If I can ask that we allow the Minister to start this interpellation or else we are going to be here till eight o'clock at night. If you would like to speak, please raise your hand and then I will recognise you. Can I – hon Marran, are you speaking?

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, no Speaker, the Speaker asked us to turn up the volume.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not recall him saying that.

Mr P MARRAN: I am just saying, because you are saying that we are a bit loud. The Speaker asked us to turn up the volume.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, that is alright. I hear what you are saying. If I can now proceed to the formal Sitting, if I may, hon members. Over to you, Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Hon Deputy Speaker, please allow me to apologise for speaking directly to participants in the gallery. Deputy Speaker, however, I will not apologise for spewing the following facts, because this interpellation I would want the residents of the Western Cape to be fully aware of. The interpellation indicated

what contributed to the 7,3% increase in serious crimes reported in the province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Now Deputy Speaker, let me not apologise for this answer because sadly the question came from member Kama, who is no longer the permanent member on Community Safety and if the permanent member of Community Safety were to have informed member Kama with regard to an NCOP briefing, member Kama would have been aware that the 7,3% increase in crime categories that we have seen in our province is a direct result of National Government's failure to adequately resource the South African Police Services. Deputy Speaker, we live in a world where the South African Police Services have indicated two weeks ago that the ideal amount of offices what we need is 193 000. I am going to repeat again, 193 000 members are needed at station levels across our country. We currently only have 105 000. In 2010 the ideal number what we needed was 156 000, 2010. We had 126 000 members in 2010. So from 2010 up until now there has been a reduction in SAPS members but even more so the need has gone up. So this increase in crime is a direct result because SAPS is at a national level. SAPS is managed by the National Government. The problems in our country, when we consider our learners that are here today, Deputy Speaker, when they have issues with regard to Home Affairs, getting an ID, Home Affairs is a national competency. We always hear of the issues in Home Affairs.

The South African Police Services, all national competencies run by the National Government seem to be run into the ground. [Interjections.] So let me answer the question even more directly. It is a direct result, through you, Deputy Speaker to member Kama, the increase is a direct result because due to a failure of fiscal choices that were made by National Government, wide-scale corruption and looting, we are 20 years behind in the fight against crime as a result of National Government... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: But there are even more reasons for the increase so besides National Government's failure, and our country being 20 years behind in the fight against crime, and that is why people are dying. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: And that is why people are dying. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: That is easy to say.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Because our province has been cleared, Deputy Speaker, even I would beg the ANC in the Western Cape... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILLI: People are dying!

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Give the management and the powers of the South African Police Services to a capable government.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: It makes sense that SAPS is controlled closer to the people and choices are not made 1,500 kilometres away but we have seen ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Your time is unfortunately up. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: But we have seen the successes, we have seen the successes, Deputy Speaker, in that we live in a province... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: We live in a province, where ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Allen, your time is up.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: ...where we have deployed LEAP officers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon Allen.

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID EN POLISIE-OORSIG: Die waarheid maak seer, nou skree hulle en daar is 'n gesegde – laat ek maar nie die gesegde sê nie. [Tyd verstreke.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: The truth hurts, now they scream and there's a saying – let me rather not quote that saying. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time is up. Thank you very much. I now call on hon Kama. Hon Kama, I certainly hope that it will not be as noisy for you. [Interjection.] You may go, carry on.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. This is really painful. The Western Cape Government's response to the 2022/23 First Quarter Crime

Statistics is both disingenuous and misleading. While we acknowledge that great strides have been made in fighting crime and commend SAPS and its partners, including the Department itself, we must quickly point out that there is nothing in the stats that suggests the need to devolve policing powers. This is just a DA campaign that has been long coming. It has nothing to do with the stats. [Interjections.]

If anything, that these stats shine the spotlight on the Provincial Government's failure, including not implementing fully the recommendations of the multi-million-rand Zille Commission as well as the poor implementation of the Winde plan, the Winde Safety Plan. Many of the masterminds... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, if you can just take your seat. Hon Minister, what is your point of order?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am rising on... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, we have somebody standing up.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Kama is misleading the House. There is no such thing as the Zille Commission so if he can please refer to the correct name. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, I cannot rule on that here, but can I just... [Interjections.] Can I just, hon Minister... [Interjections.]

Minister, I understand, but you are welcome to mention that in your statement. Hon Kama, can I... [Interjections.] Hon members, can I just ask you to caution to what you will put here, that will be in Hansard. Okay. Please. [Interjections.] Hon members, I trust that we can move on. Hon Kama, you may proceed.

Mr M KAMA: No, there is a Zille Commission.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon Kama, please take caution. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: So, Deputy Speaker, many of the masterminds behind serious crimes like cash-in-transit and extortion-related multiple murders in the province, are graduates of the Vura and Vato gangs that terrorised the Cape Flats between 2012 and 2015 and that report that Zille commissioned, it did speak about this and it was not implemented. [Interjections.] This Provincial Government's refusal... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA: This Provincial Government's refusal to implement recommendation 12 of the Zille Commission has resulted in the 7,3 increase on the '17 community-reported serious crimes. It has resulted in murders of 994 people in the first quarter of 2022. It has resulted in a 2% increase compared to the same period last year, as well as in 1,115 rape cases. Of the total 176

gangs in the country, 161 are from the Western Cape. The Western Cape has 10 stations in the top 30 murder precincts... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat.

Mr M KAMA: More concerning is the rise in the murder rate in Nyanga and Lingeletu West Police Station.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, please take your seat. Over to you, Acting Chief Whip. What is your point of order?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, in terms of Rule 40 and 42 I know that member Lili has not necessarily been in the House and Committee meetings for a long time but ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): I am trying to listen to member Kama, I cannot hear member Kama, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! Hon members, hon Lili, hon Lili, you cannot come in here and disrupt the House. I have someone standing. We need to provide, if somebody stands from either side we have to listen to them. Now I did not hear a word that the Deputy Chief Whip is saying, so I would request that I be allowed to hear. Over to you, Deputy Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Deputy Speaker, I rise on Rule 40 and on Rule 42 dealing with both interruption and maintenance of order. I cannot hear member Kama when member Lili is also speaking in between. I would like to know what member Kama is saying. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Hon members, I am going to use Rule 50 and Rule 50 basically states that in the event of grave disorder of a meeting, now I am cautioning, please, that we are allowed to debate in the way that we know how to debate so that everyone can be heard. I am struggling to hear hon Kama myself, so if I can just ask for some, for just some caution on how to interject. Over to you, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, just as a point of order, I think, Deputy Speaker, you are aware that from our side as the ANC we have requested that both the Speaker and yourself recuse yourselves from these sessions... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. That is not a point of order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and actually appoint a panel, one of the Chairpersons as honourable ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. That is not a point of order. [Interjection.] Take your seat. It is not a point of order. This is in

the middle of an interpellation. Hon Kama is not able to complete his interpellation because he is being constantly disrupted. So it can be a choice, but we will disregard that because it has nothing to do with this interpellation. [Interjections.]

Hon members, if this continues I will have to adjourn the meeting until we have some order. Hon Kama, would you like to proceed? You may proceed.

Mr M KAMA: And lastly, just to show, Deputy Speaker, that the DA in the Western Cape is more concerned about politicking about crime.

†n AGBARE LID: Ja.

**[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]**

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M KAMA: When Nyanga decreased in terms of statistics, they said it is because of them, they put up LEAP officers.

HON MEMBERS: Jo! Ja!

Mr M KAMA: We told them it is not. There is a stabilisation intervention by SAPS that is happening in Nyanga. Now they decide that they are no longer to fund CPFs. The operation in Nyanga was disrupted and as a first time now there is an increase in the murder in Nyanga. In Lingeletu the increase is influenced by the environmental design happening there. Police complain over and over again that they do not have a conducive environment and that cannot be a responsibility of SAPS, it is a responsibility of this Government, but this Government does not care at all. What it cares about is to paint a picture that SAPS is failing so that they are given powers. The next thing they want to exit the country and be a country on their own.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

Mr M KAMA: So they are politicking and they must take it upon themselves... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: ...that the death of the people and especially the young kids in high school is in their hands as a government. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much. I now recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker as the Commission of Inquiry into the Inefficiency of SAPS in the Khayelitsha Area found, that Commission asked that the Provincial Government put together a Policing Priorities and Needs document and submit that document to SAPS. What I would like to know today from the Minister, through

you, Deputy Speaker, has there been any response from either the National Minister of Police and there has been a few National Ministers. Has there been any response from the Provincial Commissioners? There has been more Provincial Commissioners than there have been spokespersons on Community Safety in this Parliament. Has there been any response to that? Can the Minister also perhaps highlight some of the successes of the LEAP Program? The Opposition tends to argue that the LEAP Program and the Safety Plan do not work... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: But as Minister Cele heard yesterday in the NCOP... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: Minister Cele yesterday in the NCOP heard that the Western Cape actually has a Safety Plan, because the ANC nationally does not have a plan. [Interjections.] As the Minister heard yesterday... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: We know certain members do not like safety in this province because they are lawless, but we will continue through you, hon Deputy Speaker, to protect areas like Ward 39 in Nyanga, where most days the police – the first tyres to be slashed are that of the police officers. [Interjections.] So the spokesperson for Cultural Affairs and Sports of the ANC... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...comes here today and tells us that we are not serious about safety. R400 million is enough to be serious, so, Deputy Speaker, through you, I would like to know if the Minister can perhaps share some of the lessons learnt from the LEAP deployment. If the Minister can perhaps educate some of our young lions on how this program is working. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon August. Over to you, hon August. [Interjections.]

Mr S N AUGUST: Deputy Speaker, it is sad.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No wait! Just hang on one minute please. Hon Marran, are you accusing me – no, I have two Table Staff and the time is well within. Well, put your own watch on. I take advice from the Table Staff in front of me. I can see the clock right in front of me. Thank you very much, you proceed, hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Deputy Speaker, it is sad to hear how we are politicking about children's fathers being murdered, women being raped, children are being murdered and we are politicking about the ANC, the National

Government, the Provincial Government, yet people of the Western Cape are dying. Those are the facts and what I want to say is and I want to urge the Minister, although not your jurisdiction, being a warden at Pollsmoor, go to Pollsmoor and see how our children are rotting in prisons. See how the communities are affected by the crime and the increase of 7,83%. See that whether it is police, whether it is LEAP, whether it is your enforcement, it does not matter, our people are dying.

I want to ask you, your hotspots, does your Department speak to Social Development, to Education to fix the social ills and our broken families in the Western Cape? We are bragging and bragging about LEAP but we have broken families in the Western Cape where our children are deregistered because they cannot attend school, because their brothers are gangsters. That is what I want to hear. Do not educate me, Minister. I am well educated on this point. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Christians. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, Speaker, I must agree with the Minister and this is a fact that the ANC has failed the people of this country, has failed this province when it comes to safety. That is a fact and the ACDP will continue... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The ACDP will continue to call for the devolution of powers to the province. That is a fact. I repeat, the ANC has failed us, but Minister... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members, I cannot hear.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The question I want to ask you is, that is why we have the Safety Plan and the Safety Plan was introduced to mitigate the failure of the ANC Government. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no, do not shout! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, hon members, sit down, hon member.

Ms A P BANS: You are asking people to sit down but can... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order, please! [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: You are asking people to sit down!

An HON MEMBER: Hon Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Christians?

An HON MEMBER: Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members. [Interjections.] Hon Bans. [Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] Right, I am going to adjourn this House now. This running commentary that has been going on and now I am standing under the Rule, we cannot proceed any further like this. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: But why are you standing?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, will you stand up please? Stand up please.

Mr A LILI: Will you sit down, Deputy Speaker, also.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Stand up! Alright. [Interjections.] Alright, sit down hon Marran, sit down. [Interjections.] Alright, under Rule 50 I am going to adjourn the House. Hon Lili, there needs to be some... [Interjections.] Hon members, this is embarrassing. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: But why are you standing? Why are you not seated, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Under Rule 50 I am going to adjourn the House for 10 minutes. I think we need to take a real look at the way we are behaving in front of people and very much the youth, who are the future of this country, watching us carry on. [Interjections.]

Hon members, if I have to name you again, you will have to leave, so the House will be adjourned for 10 minutes, suspended for 10 minutes. Thank you very much.

Business of the House suspended at 15:15.

The House resumed at 15:24.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Okay, if we can proceed to hon Christians. One minute 21. Thank you very much, you may proceed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The hon Minister is not here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think it is fine. Is the hon Minister outside? I will just check. Alright, I have to take – thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members, just remember we are streaming live. Okay, you may proceed, hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, as I said that the Safety Plan was introduced to mitigate the failure of the ANC. Now, saying all of that, hon Minister, allow me to emphasise that the streets of Cape Town are not safe. Firearms used to shoot and kill, often are returned to those who kill further. So, according to the crime stats, when you look at it and you look at murder, for instance, that ten of the 20 stations are located in the Western Cape and that is unacceptable. So, I know.

The question, hon Minister, is knowing the failure of the ANC, we can blame them, blame them, but the Western Cape has decided to do something. So, can you give us, why is it Delft? If you look at contact crimes, Delft is number one in the entire country. If you look at Delft, it is unsafe. So, we can say Nyanga is no longer the murder capitol, but now we have Delft. It is seriously dangerous to walk in Delft and people are mugged and robbed every day.

So, hon Minister, I want to conclude by saying we can blame the ANC and blame them. They are to blame. They are failing our people, but the Western Cape Government will have to turn this around and these crime statistics are unacceptable. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] I now recognise hon Kama. [Interjections.] Hon members!

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I serve a God who wants me to be consistent with the truth. He will never allow me to come to the House and ask, 'where is the Safety Plan?' And the next week say there is a Safety Plan.

But the other point that we want to make as the ANC, hon Deputy Speaker, is that if this Government says the 7,3 increase is as a result of police, then this Government is saying the people of the Cape Flats and all these crime-ridden areas, are born criminals. If really, the situation is because there is a failure of SAPS because there are causative factors that they are supposed to address.

The crime statistics, once again, highlighted the contribution of liquor to crime. Hon Minister Cele recently said that alcohol was involved in 749 murder cases and in the commission of 1212 rape cases. Helen Zille spent millions on the Alcohol Harms Reduction White Paper, which is just sitting around collecting dust. I have to ask the hon MEC and the hon Premier: when will the Alcohol Harms Reduction White Paper be turned into an Act? What is causing the delays?

It is the conflict of this Government in the approach of addressing this issue because on the other hand, it is strangleheld by the white companies that are in charge of the liquor industry and trying to frustrate and act as if the problem is with the informal traders in the communities. Instead of usual unfair targeting and imposing of unjust fines to informal liquor traders and while suddenly, Pick 'n Pay and Shoprite are opening liquor outlets in townships and even in fuel stations in the province. A good starting point is to engage these stores and grant the groups of liquor traders in the townships franchises to take over their liquor stores in those townships.

This Government that prides itself on evidence-based decision-making, yet its implementation of the Safety Plan shows signs of a Government that is not in sync with reality. The Safety Plan must make resources available to deal with sexual offences and GBV, as more women and children continue to be targeted. It must place more emphasis on environmental design, as the lack of CCTVs, poor lighting and inaccessibility of various sections of murder hotspots, impede policing. The Legislature must get more oversight powers over the Safety Plan to be able to hold Government accountable for the millions that are

currently going to waste. The Safety Plan must find ways to deal with the disturbing trend of kidnapping in the province.

In closing, I wish to commend SAPS, its partners and other stakeholders for the sterling work they are doing. With a better implementation of the Safety Plan, we can reduce crime levels to zero. We must encourage the hon MEC to consider all these suggestions and make the necessary amends. Crime is not a police responsibility only. It is a social responsibility.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr M KAMA: In that Safety Plan they are talking about, it is written there, but they do not understand it. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: That is why it is not implemented. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now call on the hon Minister. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you so much. I am going to take my time in order to reply. I am going to be as calm as I potentially can be ...[Interjection.] because inside, hon Deputy Speaker, if I listen to those that provided input, I am saddened because the Western Cape Safety Plan is a two-pronged approach.

On the one side Law Enforcement, because that is needed, is a requirement. Every country in the world has a Law Enforcement component. On the other hand, we do know the Violence Prevention component is where we are hugely lacking because we are about 20 years behind in terms of the Law Enforcement component, together with corruption, in the South African Police Services, together with National Government entities. But let me go to the first one.

Hon member Kama spoke about a Commission of Inquiry. Now, the Commission of Inquiry made a number of recommendations and I know, hon Deputy Speaker, that hon member Kama withdrew from the race to run as the Leader in the Province for the ANC Youth League, but let me say this in a very calm way. [Interjections.] Hon member Kama ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon member Kama is my friend ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon member Kama is my friend ...[Interjection.] hon member Kama is my friend. So, I know ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...I know hon member Kama withdrew ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where are you going ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am getting there. If you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take a seat, hon Minister. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, I consider hon member Kama a friend. He has given solid input on the Committee many times ...[Interjections.] but let me read verbatim from the Matthew Goniwe Branch. Two days ago, the ANC Youth League said this ...[Interjections.]

“The ANC Youth League ...[Interjections.] The ANC Youth League notes ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Answer the questions.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am getting there!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: He made inputs. I am replying to each and every input. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, who is sitting in the Chair? Alright, now you have to – the hon Minister has not broken any Rules. He is quoting so, you have to let him quote. [Interjections.] Just one minute, hon Minister, I see that hon August's hand is up. Point of order?

Mr S N AUGUST: Yes. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, a point of order as you would want me to say. The response from the hon Minister, as I said earlier on, we are dying here. The ANC Branch is irrelevant to the response [Interjections.] he should give to us. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr S N AUGUST: So, I am asking, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr S N AUGUST: ...if you can please ask the hon MEC to respond to the questions which are affecting the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I understand that.

Mr S N AUGUST: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, hon August, I am sure the hon Minister is using his time ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...to illustrate a point, I would imagine, and I am going to let him do this so that he can actually get to his point. [Interjections.] Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon member August made input in order ...[Interjections.] in order to answer those questions and to adhere to the input that hon member August made that we need to take politics out of it. This is probably the most classic example of how we are able to ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:...highlight hypocrisy and take it out of this Chamber. [Interjections.] So, the ANC Youth League said:

“Notes with sadness, once again, the empty promises made by the National Minister of Police and the Commissioner, regarding the Makaza and Khayelitsha area.”

Because the Commission of Inquiry that hon member Kama is speaking about, one of the recommendations was that Makaza needed to have a fully fledged SAPS station.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: They go on to say:

“Maybe, and only maybe, if Makaza had a full functioning police station, maybe Thandiswa” ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That your ...[Interjection.] cannot be serious.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
“...maybe Thandiswa would have been alive.”

So, we know ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not spread gossip in the House ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...we need that ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ...and you want us to take you seriously.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...we need that. In this House, certain stuff was ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Gossip!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, do you want to still raise your point of order? ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You are putting gossip in the House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you can take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I have withdrawn. No, no, I have withdrawn.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, it is fine. You may proceed hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: You cannot even comment here even in the House.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: He is done. So ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: When does a jury start in the room.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
So, here we have a number of words that are spewed in this House and it is not factual, it is hypocrisy.

With regard to hon member Bosman, thank you so much. I can confirm on the record that each year since 2014, we have submitted our Policing Needs and Priorities Report [Interjections.], a constitutionally mandated process and up until today, we have seen little to no implementation of the Policing Needs and Priorities here in our province, which is another example on why we are calling for devolution.

In support of the comments made by hon member Christians, it makes sense because our needs and priorities are not taken into account here. Some of those successes are that when our country is seeing an increase in murder of 21% across the country. Where LEAP officers are deployed, we are seeing an 8,2% reduction. In Nyanga, and hon member Kama saw the video of where Brig Ncata went on record to say that because of LEAP and all the other interventions, that joint cooperation, we saw a reduction in Nyanga. And then, four months ago, Brig Ncata was shipped out of our province and is now in the Eastern Cape ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, we have seen when the lack of leadership and succession is in an area, it does affect crime in that particular area.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time is almost up.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: How much time do I have?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: About 10 seconds. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: All I want to say is that this debate is clear that ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...all of this. This debate is very clear that when you are trying to say something, people are still trying to speak and they are not respecting this House, but we will respect the citizens ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and we will do everything in our power to help and keep our communities safe. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Order hon members, we are moving over to Interpellation 3. I now recognise – I am just giving the hon Minister a few seconds – I now recognise hon Minister Allen.

*Rural Crime*

**3. Mr S N August to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

**(1) Whether his Department has made funding available to combat crime in the rural regions of the province;**

**(2) what plans are in place to support the rural regions? Mr C M Dugmore asked the Premier:**

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, hon member August, thank you so much for this particular interpellation with regard to funding to combat crime in rural areas and within our province.

I have visited a number of rural areas and we have already conducted three Safety Summits in rural areas. The next one is in mid-November, which is next week, and then the last one will be in the Central Karoo area, which will be in February next year. So, we have made funding available to combat crime in the rural regions of our province, as well as in the urban regions, to facilitate the capacitation and functioning of the safety partners in line with the Department's vision of safer and cohesive communities.

Furthermore, the Department has budgeted R3 million for this financial year, to integrate safety and security technology in support of rural safety. The key safety partners that the Department works with are Neighbourhood Watches, including our Farm Watches, local government, including our district municipalities and Community Safety Forums, together with our CPFs. Neighbourhood Watch structures perform important roles in community cohesion which underpins safety cohesion.

Therefore, the Department as part of its Department community-based strategy, supports Neighbourhood Watch structures, as per Section 6 of the Western Cape Community Safety Act, through the Neighbourhood Watch Accreditation and Support Programme. Accreditation provides the Neighbourhood Watches structures with a governance framework to access the free training, funding and resources. The Department supports all accredited Neighbourhood Watch structures throughout the province.

In terms of this report to Neighbourhood Watch structures in rural areas, I will provide this particular breakdown. The Garden Route R290 000; Cape Winelands R280 000, Overberg District R120 000, the West Coast District R30 000, the Central Karoo, at this stage, R10 000, which is altogether R730 000. The training we have provided is across the various districts and I am on record, hon Deputy Speaker, to state that I would never want our rural areas to be regarded as the stepchild of the Western Cape because we have seen ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Because we have seen in the last quarterly crime stats, based on our analysis, that there is a 28% shift in crime patterns towards our rural areas and we remain committed to do everything in our power to keep our rural areas safer. In terms of our oversight role, in terms of the ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order please.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: In terms of our approach, we have extended our oversight role over the South African Police Services because we have seen the lack of resourcing in our districts is chronically under pressure, because we have at times, one officer doing a VCP. A vehicle checkpoint: one officer. It is dangerous and it opens the room for corruption.

I have gone to so many SAPS stations where there is one officer in the Community Service Centre. This is also against the Standard Operating Procedure of SAPS. So, we are pushing at that end to make sure that our rural areas are fully capacitated, and we are working closely with our local district municipalities to ensure that we have the K9 Units because we have seen a 27% drop in the SAPS's K9 Units over the last four years.

We have seen the Reaction Units and we are working closely in the Swartland area, in the Overberg area and we are expanding on that particular model to ensure that our rural safety areas are prioritised. We are making a point and I will invite the hon member to also make sure that she is able to attend our District Safety Summits, because it is where all stakeholders come together and in line with the previous interpellation, in that the whole-of-government approach, whole-of-society approach in that we need Social Development, Education, Cultural Affairs and Sport. Each and every department has a role ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...in the Safety Plan and that is cemented in our District Safety Plans as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Law Enforcement LEAP officers are only in the City of Cape Town. What about Drakenstein, Saldanha, George and other municipalities? The communities are subjected to harsh realities of crime and this Government in turn focuses on hotspots only in the Metro, at the expense of the rural Western Cape where broken families exist. Crime does not just exist in Cape Town only, but everywhere in the Western Cape.

There exists a bolstering tendency from this Government and more specifically, those who occupy the position of MEC within the Department, to play a perfect role. They focus solely on public safety within the boundaries of the City of Cape Town at the expense of rural communities in other parts of the Western Cape. We have seen this tendency from the MEC's predecessor and now from him, too.

Billions are funnelled from the Government to the Metro and funds the Law Enforcement LEAP, which places young men and women with little training in harsh conditions, to stand against live ammunition in volatile crime hotspots,

placing their own lives at risk. This is due to a careless Government who is only interested in self-gratification. I note the establishment of Law Enforcement Reaction Units in the Overberg and Swartland District. The worrying factor is that these units are established not as a crime prevention solution, but more as to be activated after a crime was committed.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the billions funnelled into the programme such as LEAP has better potential to advance our provincial social net, which is a greater deterrent of crime, as opposed to just locking up people, this becoming the only known way that the DA-led Western Cape Government fights crime. Are there existing agreements between his Department and the Departments of Social Development, Health, Cultural Affairs and Sports, and Economic Opportunities, and Tourism, to support rural communities in their fight against crime? If not, why not? How is the funding being utilised effectively to address crime in rural communities?

I hear R730 000, hon Deputy Speaker, compared to the millions pumped into the City of Cape Town, so that we can have nice cars on the freeways to lock up our drivers. [Interjections.] Are there any measures in place that work against the politicisation of the Neighbourhood Watch model by ward councillors and committees, knowing our Neighbourhood Watch are DA members? All the Neighbourhood Watch and Walking Busses, DA members. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr S N AUGUST: So, how do we stop politicising this? If not, why not? If so, kindly provide the relevant details. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, many members of this House visited police stations in Kwanokuthula, in Mossel Bay and in Plettenburg Bay during our last Cluster visit. What we saw was disgusting and dismal. We called the National Police Commissioner, and he accepted our invitation, and he sat in this House and told us that SAPS police stations are managed by SAPS and by the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure nationally.

The state of these police stations, the inability of SAPS to report faults and the inability of the National Minister of Public Works to even respond to some of those requests, disgusted not just members of this Committee, but also members of the community. In Kwanokuthula, the police station is as small as a little shack where the Station Commander and the HR lady share an office. You could not even report crime because it was not a safe space.

Members of this House stand up here and grandstand after they tell us not to politicise. [Interjections.] So, through you, hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...I would like to ask ...[Interjections.] I would like to ask the hon Minister, besides the hi-tech Joint Operation Centre that operates in the Mossel Bay Municipality, what intervention, what support has come from any National Government department to protect rural communities? [Interjections.] What has the National Minister of Public Works and Infrastructure done? What has the National Minister of Police done, to make sure that the Safety Plan is complimented, noting through you, hon Deputy Speaker, that the Gauteng Premier has launched their own version of LEAP today. [Interjections.]

So, please, through you, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...hon Minister, please tell us whether the National Minister of Infrastructure has, through your Department, hon Minister, engaged either the Provincial Department of Community Safety or our Provincial Minister of Infrastructure, or whether any response to the many letters that the National Commissioner of Police has written to that DG, has been responded to? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I now recognise hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I am sure our rural communities, as they are watching us now, really feel the neglect that this Province is doing to them because the question at hand is: how much is being funded for them and how are they being accommodated? I was listening earlier to the hon Minister when he was reading out the amounts that were given to the other districts. It is actually a shame, †dit is 'n skande, [it is a shame,] but nevertheless, I am not going to go there.

In September 2019, a week after the announcement of the Safety Plan by the hon Premier, the Mail & Guardian published an article titled 'Women harvest fruits of abuse in rural Western Cape', detailing horrific stories of violence against women on farms and in farming towns. Three years down the line, women in rural Western Cape continue harvesting the fruits of abuse and violence in the province. One example is a 58-year-old farmer that was arrested and charged for allegedly kidnapping and raping a 14-year-old girl near the rural town of Klawer. Despite these horrific stories of violent crimes outside the Metro, the Safety Plan still prioritises only Cape Town in these times. Are we still serious?

This Department's resources are concentrated on the City to the detriment of rural safety. The Safety Plan must not be reduced to the City of Cape Town Plan. Public resources must be spent in a fair and equitable manner. The favouritism towards Cape Town for ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Let us go to the House!

Ms A P BANS: ...and the programmes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, please.

An HON MEMBER: They need to be relieved! They are asking us to relieve them.

An HON MEMBER: To relieve them?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is Mr Stemele ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He needs to join us. Could you join me in the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can please urgently ask Mr Ngikhethe to – ja, thank you very much. That has been muted. [Interjections.] My apologies, you may proceed. Hon Bans?

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The favouritism towards the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms A P BANS: The favouritism towards the City of Cape Town for almost all of this Department's funded programmes, including funding of accredited Neighbourhood Watches, the Chrysalis Academic recruitments and LEAP officers, is wrong and it must come to an end. I am sure that hon Minister Mitchell will agree with me that it is very bad that today in Beaufort West, trucks are not passing there to stop anymore because of crime. That must be addressed.

Of the Department's eleven conditional grants, three of these including hundreds of millions spent in recruitment, training and deployment of Law Enforcement officers, go to the City of Cape Town. It is wrong. The rural towns only get R7,2 million for K9 dogs and R8,5 million for the establishment of Reaction Units in Swartland and Overstrand municipalities. An additional of ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Ms A P BANS: ...R9,3 million is sent to four municipalities for the Safety Plan implementation. The whole-of-society approach is wrong and must be condemned.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms A P BANS: We demand more safety resources to be sent to rural regions. Hon Deputy Speaker, I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans, I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the solution is simple. The ANC must be voted out in 2024. [Interjections.] The

solution is in the people's hands. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon members, order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, 47% of known drug houses are in the rural areas. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Of the drug houses, 47% are in the rural ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Christians, if you can just carry your voice. Hon members, every time hon Christians stands up, he does not have a chance to even be heard. Can I please ask ...[Interjections.] Yes, but we have to respect all parties here. Thank you. Hon Christians? [Interjections.] Hon Kama, give him a second. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Ja, hon Deputy Speaker, as I said, 47% of the known drug houses is in the rural areas. So, it means that more drugs are going to the rural areas. If people sit in the Committee of Community Safety, they will know that I have asked for the roll-out of K9 Units because that will hamper the role of drugs in our rural areas.

So, gangsters have now seen that Greyton, Genadendal and those places are soft targets. I want to know from the hon Minister, is he talking to the police in order because according to our statistics, the police know where the drug houses are. What is done in order to get rid of these drug houses? But as I say, hon Deputy Speaker in closing, I need to say the solution is 2024 to get rid of the ANC [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...and that is the solution. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise ...[Interjections.] Hon members, order. [Interjections.] Hon Lili, you need to face me. Can I ask that hon August be allowed to respond.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, please!

Mr S N AUGUST: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The question to the hon Minister was the following, whether his Department has made funding available to combat crime in the rural regions of this province. When the white farmer is murdered, his family is crying. [Interjections.] When a child on a farm is raped, that family is crying. So, where hon Bosman comes about with infrastructure at the police station, †hulle moet lees wat ons vra. [they must read what we are asking.] [Interjections.] They must read what we are asking and respond to that. [Interjections.]

What we are also asking is that the hon Minister does not, when he responds, come and joke because this is serious. South Africa and the Western Cape are

watching us when we are going to respond and the previous question, he only had ten seconds to respond to constructive debate and he did not respond to it.

Hon Deputy Speaker, R730 000: a 28% hike in rural crime. Surely, we cannot have three summits now. You are in Government for how many years? How can we have three summits now? [Interjections.] I was not in the Province, and I do not have a ministerial budget. So, I ask that the hon Minister please responds to what plans are in place for the next three years ...[Interjections.] to combat the rural crime issues. We do not want to hear about the ANC, hon ACDP. We do not want to hear about the ANC. We do not want to hear about police stations where one member is sitting in there ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S N AUGUST: We do not want to hear about the buildings falling apart ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S N AUGUST: We want to hear what the DA's plans are for the rural crime in the Western Cape. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now ...[Interjections.] Hon members, hon members, can I allow the hon Minister to respond? [Interjections.] Hon Lili, can we have the hon Minister respond? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am going to say this once, that if any person in this House would say I am joking, hon Deputy Speaker, when I joke, they would damn know I joked because it would be something they will not be able to sit like this. That particular narrative is old ...[Interjections.] That particular narrative is old. [Interjections.] It is a narrative ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...that is being spewed and then, you keep talking ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is pointing at us that.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point your finger back at you. Hon Minister, the point ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, here we go. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you can take your seat, please?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: When we talk about the three summits ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, take your seat, please. [Interjections.] I first saw the Chief ...[Interjections.] I have first seen the Chief ...[Interjections.] Hon Lili, have you forgotten all the Rules? I can send you a copy. I am first going to allow the Assistant ...[Interjection.] I understand, and then, I am going to allow the Deputy Chief Whip. The Chief Whip, I am just going to call them the Chief Whip because it is just so complicated and then, I am going to ask hon Sayed. So, Acting Chief Whip, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I am standing again on 40 and 42, and I am tempted to stand on 50 as well, but we would like to hear the hon Minister respond to the questions and to the Interpellation matters raised by the hon members of the Opposition. And I do not recall there being a Rule that says one cannot point, but I would like to listen to the hon Minister. [Interjections.] So, in terms of 40, 42 and hopefully, not 50, I ask that we please continue with this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. [Interjections.] I think for the sake of progress as well, I think we need to ensure that the Executive as well, are also urged to respond to the questions and not be side-tracked and get into other issues. We are here to exercise oversight and at the same time, I think on both sides of the House, at least if there are elements, I know that there was a Rule quoted, Rule 40, about issues of hon members being interrupted.

Now, what I am seeing is that hon members are not necessarily being interrupted. There is heckling happening, but the heckling must not reach a point of interruption. They understand that, but there is heckling taking place. The Executive ought to also – that is why we have got mics as well – raise the voice, but also, let us stick to the topic at hand and not get side-tracked because that is going to then ensure that we are going to stand here until 9 o'clock. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. I would now like ...[Interjection.] Hon Lili. Hon Lili! [Interjections.] Hon Sayed has just outlined what he would like us to all do. So, once the hon Minister stands up, if we can just allow him to respond and I will ask the hon Minister to practice caution. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. Just how much time do I have?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am going to give you – I have got three minutes 29 seconds.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: It takes roughly two minutes to get through one particular page ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am going to make this entire reply available because not even in eight minutes, this reply will not be read out. So, I will ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon – you said immediately? Would you like the reply immediately? You may stand up, hon Sayed. Hon Minister ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I hope the hon member of the Executive realises that this explanation is also cutting into his time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I understand.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He must get to the point, thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] We cannot control everything. Remember, this is an interpellation. This is a debate. Hon Minister, you do have freedom of speech here within the Rules.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, you may proceed. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am going to say again that in terms of rural safety, our Province and the Western Cape Government are fully aware that we are taking rural safety extremely seriously.

So, I have been here a little over six months. [Interjections.] We have interacted with a number of all the districts and within these six months, I have already established solid working relationships across our districts. So, to arrange all the summits within a period of seven months is actually something that should be commended. I have come in and I have actually spent more time during these last two weeks outside of the City of Cape Town ...[Interjections.] outside of the City of Cape Town because the benefit that we are reaping from these summits are directly linked to crime prevention. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, when an hon member states that we need to be proactive and not reactive, the K9 Units are exactly that. It is proactive. It is to make sure that at the vehicle

checkpoints we are confiscating abalone, we are confiscating weapons, we are confiscating drugs, and on a monthly basis, I release that information to the public based on the successes. [Interjections.] And those particular statements are each and every month on the successes, and those are drugs that could have landed up in our areas. Those are abalone that are directly linked through organised crime. [Interjections.] So, we are seeing the successes ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...of that proactive approach.

In terms of the comments that were made, yes, we are keeping SAPS accountable with regard to the shutting down and the closing of drug houses. Over the last four months, we have seen a drop in the amount of known drug houses, now to 118, which were closed, and we are proactively making sure that the recommendations of the Police Ombudsmen are taken into account with regard to operations on closing those.

So, when it talks about the JOC and this reply goes further with regard to the R35 million that has been spent, the R35 million that has been spent and will be spent, is all towards rural safety. The work we do in the Garden Route with the JOC Centre that hon member Bosman mentioned, is a clear intervention from this Government. The work we do in the Overstrand, the work we do in the Swartland West Coast area, cross-boundary operations, is a result of a proactive Government that has taken funding from other departments, to put resources available due to the fact that there is under-resourcing in our LEAP agency. [Interjection.] So, we know that, hon Deputy Speaker.

This report and this particular answer, all five pages, will be made available and I will request that the hon members peruse and read. I will even encourage that hon member August should join the Standing Committee on Community Safety because ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...I have sent a letter and to answer hon member Bosman. I have also sent a letter to the National Minister of Public Works and a follow up, and we have not received a reply in that regard, but we are obviously holding them ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...accountable and continuing in that engagement. But as far as I know, there has been no information. The National Minister of Public Works did not even rock up to our MINMEC the last time that she was invited.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Murray. [Interjections.]

One minute. Interjections.]

Ms C MURRAY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute!

Ms C MURRAY: I rise on a point of order with regard to point 38 and 39 that relate to no conversing allowed, as well as no interruption. Hon member Lili has interrupted and been conversing aloud throughout the hon Minister's reply [Interjections.] and he has consistently reiterated the point that people are dying [Interjections.]. And the hon Minister has tried time and time again, to explain what the Western Cape Government is doing ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray.

Ms C MURRAY: ...and there has been no respect offered by the Opposition.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, that is not a point of order. That is not a point of order! What hon member Lili has been doing, he is heckling. It is not a point of order. [Interjections.] Can we continue and get to the next item, please. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, stand up. [Interjections.] Hon Lili, if you talk to me you must stand up. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no point of order.

Mr A LILI: I am saying, hon Madam Deputy Speaker, they ...[Interjections.] they speak as they wish because you happen to be biased against them and that is wrong. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, take a seat ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: That is wrong, hon Madam Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, sit down. [Interjections.]

Ms C MURRAY: Point of order. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Please, she must not speak as she wishes because she is in the ruling party ...[Interjection.]

Ms C MURRAY: A point of order.

Mr A LILI: That is out of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, hon Lili! [Interjections.] Hon Lili, are you going to listen to ...[Interjections.] Hon Lili, are you focused on the hon member

or are you focused on me? You are talking to me ...[Interjections.] Okay.

Mr A LILI: He is interrupting me whilst I am ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: ...whilst I am talking. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I respond?

Mr A LILI: He is shouting, shouting, shouting, shouting.

Ms C MURRAY: A point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili ...[Interjections.] Hon Lili, I have mentioned you three times. The fourth, you will have to leave the House. Stand up so I can talk to you. That is what I have been trying to do. So, can I, can I - no ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: I am being abused in this House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, can you just stop so I can actually, standing up, so I can respond. [Interjections.] So, if you speak and address the Chair, you must stand up according to the Rules. If you all want to, that is fine, but I would like to respond to hon Lili's question. Hon Marran ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Can I raise my hand, or can I speak? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well, clearly, we cannot respond, so you will sit down. [Interjections.] But what I am going to say, hon Lili ...[Interjections.] Ja, well you cannot control your ...[Interjections.]. Hon Lili, I am mentioning you once now. If I mention you twice more, you will have to be escorted out. So, I am saying to you now, enough is enough. Your colleagues may stand up and play silly games, but we are here according to the Rules ...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Not even a point of order, a point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, please sit down. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: What is a silly game? [Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker! Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have got all your hands up.

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you cannot shout. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, I did not recognise you and

...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sit down, hon Nkondlo. [Interjections.] When your hon members have sat down, otherwise I cannot recognise 20 people standing up ...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: But hon Deputy Speaker, why ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: When your hon members have sat down. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: This is a protest. This is a protest.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, hon Dugmore! Get over yourself. [Interjections.] Get over yourself. Hon Dugmore ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Interjections.]... Hon Madam Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, when your hon members have kept quiet, I will quite happily hear you out when your hon members have kept quiet. [Interjections.] Okay, until your hon members are quiet, I will not be able to recognise you.

Mr A LILI: We are members of the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Interjections.] When your hon members are quiet, according to the Rules, I will recognise hon Sayed. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: But you are saying your members are ...[Interjection.] or what? You are saying that his members... No, that is out of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: When he is done. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much. Hon Deputy Speaker, firstly ...[Interjection.] Firstly, hon Deputy Speaker, hon members are responding to heckling from the other side of the House as well. It is not one-way traffic. I think that needs to be made very clear.

Then also, I think hon Deputy Speaker, you ought to give us the Rule which indicates and gives provision for an hon member to be asked to stand when he or she is being addressed because I think that is really a problem here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): When hon members are being asked to stand, not to stand to speak, but to stand and rise when they are being told something by the Presiding Officer because those things are contributing to the

tension that we are having.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I think, can we get to the next item, please, because I mean, we cannot be interrupted by frivolous points of order consistently. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no. I did not recognise you.

Mr A LILI: Honourable Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Now you will sit down, hon Lili, because I am busy, or I am busy responding to your ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Okay, give me after.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...your Deputy Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Alright. Now firstly, I think many of you have been here for almost three years. Most, if not more and some have been here since 2014. We all know the Rules of this House that we rise on a point of order, correct, and that anybody could raise a point of order. If it is not a point of order, it is not a point of order.

Now, I did not because you were so busy shouting at hon Cayla Murray, that you did not even hear I had not responded to her. Hon Sayed is correct, but hon Lili, you are facing that way and constantly interjecting. So, all I am saying to everyone is I am allowing freedom of speech within the Rules. Let me finish, hon Lili, I know you are wanting to speak to me, and I will recognise you. But I would really like just a little bit of decorum amongst members.

This is a normal debate. We have been doing this for years now and this is such a serious matter. We have guests in the gallery – hon Lili, I will recognise you when I am done – but there is no harm in hon Cayla Murray raising what she thinks is her point of order. Whether I choose to decide and make a ruling on that, is not her problem. It is mine. I have not even responded. All I did was go from her over to hon Sayed. So, please, we need to be mindful of the Rules.

Also, whenever I rise during the debate, too, it does mean that hon members must sit down, alright. It is a matter of decorum for you to rise when you are speaking. You rise on a point of order. Okay. Now, hon Lili, I am going to allow you to just – we allow hon Lili to make his point of order or make his submission. Rise and I will recognise you. Over to you, hon Lili.

Mr A LILI: No, I think, hon Khalid is correct that you have been on my case to embarrass me in this House, asking me only in this House to stand as and when you are talking. But when it comes to other hon members, for instance, when I was talking, I was interjected here many times, howled at by the hon

Minister of Human Settlements or Infrastructure or whatever. But when it comes to them, you seem to be biased and that is totally wrong. And even that hon member over there, she is not consistent when it comes to people who are ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I believe that is not a point of order.

Mr A LILI: No, no, I am saying she is also not consistent when it comes to people who are interrupting. I am talking about that hon member over there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, hon Lili, you must say 'hon member' ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Look now, she is interrupting me. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is fine ...[Interjection.], but let us just have respect for everyone. That is why ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: So, I am saying hon Deputy Speaker, please be fair and please do not try to embarrass me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, you must ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: If there is no law, there is no law that allows you to ask me to stand when you speak, then please do not do that. Not unless you have a law that says ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili!

Mr A LILI: No. If you have a Rule that governs you to instruct me to stand like a little boy in a church or in a street somewhere, then I will accept that, but if there is no Rule, then please behave ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, have you got your Rule...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Do not abuse your powers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, have you got your Rule book in front of you? [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Do not, ja ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Do not abuse ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...51. In terms of Rule 51 ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Do not abuse your powers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of – sit down, please.

Mr A LILI: Please!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 51 you must rise to speak to me. You must rise in the member's place addressing the Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You are ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Rule 51. ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: But you do not ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will recognise ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: You do not even before I stand ... I talk, then you said, 'please stand up.'

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Because you are ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: '...I am talking to you.'

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes!

Mr A LILI: That is rude.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Because you are ignoring. That is correct.

Mr A LILI: That is rude. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Sayed. We are going to be here for hours. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon Sayed did way before you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.], Rule 51 speaks about the member standing when they want to say something.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Not necessarily standing when they have to be given a dressing down. I think that is what is adding to the tension here. Presiding Officers do not ask a member to rise and be given a dressing down when they are standing. It has happened to the hon Windvogel before. It has happened to the hon Bakubaku-Vos before and I think that must not happen, hon Deputy Speaker.

And I ask for the Rule to be quoted which allows for that. Can you please give us the Rule because I cannot see such a Rule existing. [Interjections.] Rule 51 does not speak to that. So, I think it is two-way. I think hon members are

getting excited, there is heckling. That happens. That is natural in the House but let us not introduce new Rules and humiliate members and let them stand up to be given a dressing down. They must stand up when they want to speak, but not to be spoken to. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will now, I would like to proceed. I think what is very important is that the House is in disarray and hon Lili, when you do – if I am speaking to you and you ignore me, then it will be very normal for me to actually call you to order. So, I do not want to hackle on this anymore. [Interjections.] That is for anybody. I would like to now proceed to Questions for Oral Reply.

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am expecting you to apologise at least. If ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: ...not unless you believe that you are right. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Apologise for what?

Mr A LILI: No, for humiliating me to say I must stand. [Interjections.] For humiliating me.

An HON MEMBER: For what now? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: For humiliating me in this House. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Huh? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, [Interjections.] I am going to have to ...[Interjections.] You are causing a disruption in the House now. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: I am saying you must apologise. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am going to have to ask you to go. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Apologise!

Mr A LILI: But you must apologise for humiliating me in this House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! [Interjections.] Hon Lili, sit down. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Apologise.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sit down. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Not unless you have a Rule. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, I am going to name you three times. I am going to ask you to be removed. You are actually causing a disruption to this House. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: No, but I am asking you to apologise to me! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, sit down! [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You must apologise to me! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will not have to do anything. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: I am demanding! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, you are named once. [Interjections.] You are named once. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of the Rules he needs to walk. The hon member must leave the House. He is being disruptive. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: I am asking for an apology.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, sit down. Otherwise, I am naming you twice.

Mr A LILI: You are abusing your powers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Can we now move over to Questions for Oral Reply. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: I am not elected by you ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili! [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You cannot abuse ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, will you please leave the House. I will ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I cannot be abused! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, will you please remove ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: I cannot be abused! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please remove the hon Lili from this House ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: I cannot be abused! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...and I will refer him to a Disciplinary Council.  
[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You must apologise, you abuse me! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A point of order! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House will be suspended for ten minutes.  
[Interjections.]

Business of the House suspended at 16:12.

The House resumed at 16:14.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, hon Lili ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Point of order! Point of order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, I have asked you to go, please.  
...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have asked you to remove ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...yourself. I am talking. Hon Lili, I have asked you  
to remove yourself. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You must apologise to me, hon Deputy Speaker!

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Will you remove yourself? [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, you must apologise in this House!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, the House ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, you must apologise to me!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House is adjourned.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

**[Questions stands over]**

New questions to the Premier:

**1. Mr C M Dugmore to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:**

Whether he will consider paying for rates, tariffs and other municipal services at the Leeuwenhof estate; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

**2. Mr L L Mvimbi to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:**

(a) What are his government's consequence-management practices to deal with incidents of irregular expenditure, qualified audits and unauthorised, fruitless and wasteful expenditure and (b) how were these applied in departments and entities that received such findings in the past two financial years?

**3. Mr C M Dugmore to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:**

With regard to the Iris House Dinner in 2022 that was organised by the Office of the Premier: What was the event's (a) purpose, (b) size, (c) nature, (d) cost and (e) impact on the property and the neighbours?

**4. Ms N Makamba-Botya to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:**

What is he doing to ensure that members of his executive adhere to the Batho Pele principles when interacting with members of society and (b) what steps would he take against members of his executive who do not adhere to these principles?

**Question standing over from Thursday, 8 September 2022, as agreed to by The House:**

8. Mr F C Christians to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety: Why were law enforcement officers called out to the Heathfield High School on 16 August 2022? (625)

**New questions:****5. Mr K Brinkhuis to ask Mr D G Mitchell, Minister of Mobility:**

(1) Whether the Province has implemented safety interventions to stop robberies on Golden Arrow busses; if so, what are the relevant details;  
(2) whether he received any feedback from Golden Arrow on the effectiveness of surveillance cameras installed on busses; if so, what are the relevant details?

**6. Ms G N Bakubaku-Vos to ask Mr T A Simmers, Minister of Infrastructure:**

With regard to the reply to question 22 of 16 April 2021:

Whether the house of a certain person, whose name has been furnished to his Department for the purpose of his reply, was completed and handed

over; if not, (a) what steps have been taken to prioritise the building of her house or finding her alternative accommodation and (b) when will the building of her house be completed; if so, what are the relevant details?

**7. Ms A P Bans to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

(a) What steps have been taken to address the high number of child murders and abductions, (b) how does the Safety Plan prioritise the safety of children and (c) what are the details of the (i) programmes and (ii) budget associated with it?

**8. Ms N Makamba-Botya to ask Dr N Mbombo, Minister of Health:**

How many of the community healthcare workers who were assisting her Department during the height of the COVID-19 pandemic did her Department appoint permanently?

**9. Mr F C Christians to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

Whether LEAP officers are a preventative or reactive measure to combat crime in the hotspots of Cape Town?

**10. Mr A P van der Westhuizen to ask Mr A Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

(a) Which nature reserves has the Province identified for acquisition from SANParks and (b)(i) which nature reserves under the provincial government have been identified as parks that may be relinquished to the care of the national government and/or SANParks in a possible land swap, (ii) what was the rationale behind determining or identifying these parks and (iii) how would the Province be able to manage and care better for these pieces of land than the national government and/or SANParks?

**11. Mr R D Mackenzie to ask Mr D G Mitchell, Minister of Mobility:**

(a) How much has the Western Cape provincial government and Government Motor Transport spent on fuel for government cars between 2019 and 2021 and (b) what has been the percentage increase in the price of fuel for government cars in (i) 2019, (ii) 2020 and (iii) 2021?

**12. Mr S N August to ask Dr N Mbombo, Minister of Health:**

(1) What is the standard operating procedure (SOP) calling for the EMS to be escorted by law enforcement personnel into communities and (b) what criteria are used to determine if a community is a red zone;  
(2) whether waiting for a law enforcement escort has had an impact on the time it takes the EMS to respond to medical emergencies; if so, what are the relevant details;

**INTERPELLATIONS****QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

**Question standing over from Thursday, 10 November 2022, as agreed to by the House:**

The SPEAKER: Then the first question by hon Christians to the hon, the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety, the hon Minister Allen. Are you able to address us, hon Minister Allen?

**8. Mr F C Christians to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

Why were law enforcement officers called out to the Heathfield High School on 16 August 2022?

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Speaker, I trust that I am audible.

†Die SPEAKER: Reg so.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The SPEAKER: [Right so.] You may proceed, hon member.

†Die MINISTER VAN POLISIEOORSIG EN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Baie, baie dankie, Speaker.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you, thank you Speaker.]

Speaker, through you, I wish to thank member Christians for this particular question with regard to why law enforcement officers were called out to Heathfield High School on 16 August.

There is a memorandum of agreement between the Western Cape Education Department and the City of Cape Town Law Enforcement Department where law enforcement is deployed via the school resource officers at schools identified by the Department. The Western Cape Education Department and the management of Heathfield School met with law enforcement management and requested law enforcement to assist with challenges where learners enter the school with dangerous weapons and drugs. What we have further noted in that there has been communication via the Minister of Education in the Western Cape and where he indicated that on 17 August, the following day after that particular happening, that parents were informed that they should keep their children at home for that particular day...

[Audio stops abruptly – problems with connectivity.] [01:02:06]

The SPEAKER: Are you load-shedding, sir?

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
I think, am I audible now, Speaker? So sorry.

The SPEAKER: May I request, for the purposes of Hansard, and also the member that has asked the question that you try and find a stable network. If you are unable to proceed, we will not be able to hear what is being shared, which creates a challenge also for the hon Christians and other members.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Just test whether you can continue smoothly. You can try again, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
Speaker, I trust that you can hear me now, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes, clearly sir, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: We sadly have a scenario where Eskom is putting many, many residents at risk due to a disruption in our electricity but let me continue.

Speaker, with regard to what has happened, I have indicated initially that there is a memorandum of agreement in place, but also that the management of the school, together with law enforcement management, requested law enforcement to assist with challenges where learners enter the school with dangerous weapons and drugs. The MEC, the Minister for Education, is also on record with regard to his appeal to parents to play a key role towards ensuring that their children take their education and safety extremely serious and that learners do not engage in such unlawful actions again, and obviously, Speaker, we must say that those that continue to disrupt the school environment should be facing disciplinary or further legal consequences in such matters. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I know that the first member to ask a question will be the member who raised the question in the first place. It is okay. You are safe here, and then afterwards I will recognise the next Speaker will be hon Sayed and I do not see other hands. So in that order, hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you to the Minister for that answer. Minister, the problem is when we look at the Heathfield High School, you know, members in this House play politics with the lives of our children and because there was a lot in the media. My question just to the Minister is, access control, you know, the school should have access control because I believe a lot of these criminal events involved people, they were residents and not students. So, the question is, if we look at the safety aspect, access control is so important. The last thing is that most probably - I hope that it is peaceful now - learners can write in peace, their Matric exams, and all the other examinations. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you so much for that particular follow-up question. I totally hear member Christians in this regard and it is for that very reason that action was taken quickly with the request for law enforcement to assist with the challenges where learners enter the school with dangerous weapons and drugs and I think the context is further, that due to the ongoing gang-related issues within that particular community, which has filtered onto the school premises, the school management team, together with law enforcement agencies and the Department implemented various safety control measures at the school in order to protect teachers and learners. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, thank you to member Christians for the question. It is deeply disappointing though, that he makes an inference about members in the House playing politics on the issue, as opposed to going to the root causes of the problem, but that is fine.

Chair, just in response to the response from the Minister, we do understand that law enforcement officers can be deployed to schools as part of the school resource officers, but, however, this particular situation does not seem normal, to see such a high deployment at one particular school. Can we get a sense from the Minister, can we expect these officers to be deployed in various other schools in the Western Cape where gangsterism and drugs are a major concern? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you so much for that additional question. I think based on the comments that were made by member Sayed now, we note that concerns over school safety and gang-related incidents at this particular school are sadly not new. It is a long-standing issue causing great concern for the community. The previous school management further also struggled with this particular challenge.

In this regard further, Speaker, a search and seizure operation which was conducted by the South African Police Service and a variety of items were confiscated from learners, which we have again seen that when those elements are infiltrating a particular school and carrying dangerous weapons, it can never be tolerated, and the steps that have been taken by school management are in line with the Department's policies and processes and were requested and welcomed by parents, teachers and learners.

The Department supports the steps taken to ensure that learners and teachers are safe. We do regular assessments with regard to ongoing violence and gangsterism within various communities and, where it affects a school, appropriate action will be taken to first and foremost make sure that we

safeguard our learners and our teachers and our communities towards ensuring that education continues. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I have the following hon members expressing interest to speak, and that is hon Bosman, followed by hon Marais, in that order.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker, and good afternoon.

Hon Speaker, through you I would like to ask the Minister whether the Department is able to assist and develop a joint programme with the Department of Education in the Western Cape to perhaps look at working with the Learner Representative Council at different schools across the province, but focusing on this school to look at how students can also address some of the safety issues that affect their peers, and instead of law enforcement coming in, to assist the school in managing the contraband that is brought into the school. Is there a way of including the leadership at the school also to avoid some of our members getting involved in schools as well?

Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bosman. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you so much, hon member Bosman, for that particular question.

Yes, indeed if we consider the whole of government approach where each and every department has a key role towards safety, that input is definitely welcomed and it will be taken on because the influence of gangsterism and substance abuse and what that is having on truant behaviour, absenteeism and fear in schools, we want to make sure that the steps are taken to support all those towards creating peaceful, productive and a stable school environment.

So, thank you so much for that particular input and question. It is definitely in line with us prioritising safety across our province, including in our schools. Thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Agbare Marais. [Hon Marais.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, this thing has been coming on a long way now about problematic schools. We need a much bigger holistic approach to this. You know if we identify schools as problematic, there must be separate solutions and not a generalised solution to crime and drugs and gangsters at certain schools. We can conclude, after identifying these schools we can conclude a contract [Inaudible.] – oh, sorry, what is happening?

†The SPEAKER: It is on your side, agbare [hon.]

Mr P J MARAIS: A rapid response unit that we can contractually employ for

rapid response to these high-risk schools. We cannot have a one shoe, one size fits all approach to law and order in this country. There are hotspots, like there were COVID hotspots there are also crime hotspots. We need a different approach. I want to suggest to the Minister to have his Department look at budgetary constraints with employing a rapid response agency that can within minutes respond to such actions at schools which they have identified. Our people, Minister, are flocking, I have seen – sorry?

†Die SPEAKER: Agbare, waar is die vraag?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The SPEAKER: Honourable, where is the question?]

Mr P J MARAIS: That is the †vraag [question.] Will you consider it, Minister, to have a rapid response unit, instead of just SAPS, that can quickly respond to such happenings with gangsterism involved at our schools?

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb lid Marais. Minister?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. Minister?]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you so much for that particular question, hon member Marais.

Yes, indeed we have seen that the events that took place at Heathfield High confirmed the need to ensure that access control and the increase of monitoring at schools should always be prioritised and the Department will continue to prioritise the safety of learners and teachers and will be continuing to liaise with law enforcement and the SAPS regarding further safety measures at school.

I do know that the one particular input that hon member Marais made now with regard to a rapid response, I am delighted to actually provide feedback that when we considered the LEAP units that were deployed in our hotspot areas, we have already established two reaction units that are available to assist when such matters arise, which could speak to the very fact that it is rapid indeed, to hon member Marais, through you, hon Speaker. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister and to the hon members.

Now we move to Question number 5. That is a new question by hon member Brinkhuis to the Hon Minister of Mobility.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Sorry, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, let me finish, if I may, and then I will recognise you. Thank you very much, hon the Leader of the Opposition.

Now this is a question by hon member Brinkhuis to the hon Minister of Mobility,

Minister Mitchell. Before I recognise the hon Minister, let me hear from the hon the Leader of the Opposition. Is that a point of order, sir?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, yes, it is one in regard to Rule 66. Hon Speaker, one notices that when you as the Presiding Officer address members of the Executive Council, the word "Minister" is used. I think as we are all aware the Provincial Constitution, which has been certified by the Constitutional Court, refers to MECs as "Provincial Ministers".

My concern is that when the terminology of "Minister" is used, there is potential for confusion because in South Africa we have National Ministers, we have MECs and we have Provincial Ministers as per the Western Cape Constitution.

So, I would just like to request that you consider this issue, not necessarily respond to it now, but to actually come back to the House in regard to the terminology used, as I think we should be consistent with the Provincial Constitution. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Leader of the Opposition. If I may just deal with this, but I think now. The same Constitution, the Provincial Constitution, which I do read quite often, I cannot quote the particular section, it then says that therefore the members of the Executive Council in the Western Cape shall then be referred to as "Ministers".

So, I do not see the conflict in terms of the Constitution of the Western Cape as it stands, with the remarks and the reference thereof to the Cabinet members in this province.

So if there is any contest I think that could be something that could be petitioned with the Constitutional Court, quite frankly, but if there is any conflict that this House could deal with it will now be up to the members of the House collectively, whether they want to amend their own Constitution to deal with those matters, but as I sit here as the Presiding Officer I may not assume the authority that I do not have. I now want to also request... the Leader of Government Business is raising his hand.

†Die LEIER VAN REGERINGSAKE: Agb Speaker, ek sit hier met die Provinsiale Grondwet van die Wes-Kaap, spesifiek Hoofstuk 4 van die Wes-Kaapse Provinsiale Grondwet en soos die agb lid van die amptelike Opposisie aandui, hy is korrek, hierdie Grondwet is gesertifiseer deur die Grondwetlike Hof, wat die hoogste hof is in Suid-Afrika, en die bepalings van die Provinsiale Grondwet waaronder hierdie Raad funksioneer in samewerking met die Grondwet van die Republiek van Suid-Afrika, en toe hierdie Grondwet gesertifiseer was deur die Grondwetlike Hof, was die bepalings van die Nasionale Grondwet die primêre oorweging om seker te maak dat daar geen konflik is tussen die Nasionale Grondwet en die Provinsiale Grondwet nie.

Die sertifisering wat gedoen was deur die Grondwetlike Hof het bepaal dat in terme van die Wes-Kaapse Regering die Uitvoerende Gesag sal bestaan uit, en

ek lees Artikel 35(1) en (2):

"Die uitvoerende gesag van die Wes-Kaap berus by die Premier."

(2): "Die Premier oefen die uitvoerende gesag gesamentlik met ander Provinsiale Ministers uit deur – “

onder andere die volgende funksies.

Maar ons is nie getroud met titels nie, maar ons is getroud met die bepalings van die Grondwet en ons eerbiedig die grondwetlike bestel in Suid-Afrika.

Daarom, vanuit 'n pragmatiese oogpunt, wanneer ons vergader – agb lid Sayed, wanneer ons vergader met ons nasionale kollegas, die Nasionale Ministers,

**[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]**

[The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Hon Speaker, I'm sitting here with the Provincial Constitution of the Western Cape, specifically Chapter 4 of the Western Cape Provincial Constitution and as the hon member of the official Opposition indicates, he is correct, this Constitution had been certified by the Constitutional Court, that is the highest court in South Africa, and the provisions of the Provincial Constitution under which this Council functions in cooperation with the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, and when this Constitution was certified by the Constitutional Court, the provisions of the National Constitution were the primary consideration to ensure that there is no conflict between the National Constitution and the Provincial Constitution.

The certification that was done by the Constitutional Court determined that in terms of the Western Cape the Executive Authority will consist of, and I'm reading Section 35 (1) and (2):

"The executive authority of the Western Cape is vested in the Premier."

(2): "The Premier exercises the executive authority together with the other Povincial Ministers by – “

amongst others the following functions.

But we are not married to titles, but we are married to the provisions of the Constitution and we honour the constitutional system in South Africa.

Therefore, from a pragmatic viewpoint, when we assemble – hon member Sayed, when we assemble with our national colleagues, the National Ministers,] when I write a letter to Minister Thoko Didisa, I will write "MEC" to create no confusion. We have no problem to recognise if they were legitimately elected. In terms of constitutional democracy, I am happy to do that.

When we write letters to anybody outside in the national domain, we are not married to titles, but we are married to two things, we have two wives, two husbands. One is constitutional democracy [Interjections.], that is the first wife,

and that wife is the senior wife.

†n AGB LID: [Lag.] Sê vir hulle.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[An HON MEMBER: [Laughs.] Tell them.]

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: The second wife is also a senior in the household of democracy [Interjections.] and that is service delivery to the people.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Laughs]

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: The wife that does not matter is the title [Interjections.]. So, this is what this Government is committed to and hon member Dugmore was a Minister in this House, he never objected during that time, but I will respectfully respect him as a former Provincial Minister in this constitutional dispensation.

So let us clear this forever. We are not married to titles, we are married to the Constitution and to service delivery. You can even call us many other names, we will proceed in respecting the Constitution, but what is paramount is that we serve the people and not walk around with our titles. I thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I just want to request – hon the Leader of the Opposition, if you could log out from one of your other devices and maintain one for the purposes of the sitting because that is why there is a bit of an echo whilst you connect. Thank you, sir, and I would like to request that.

Before I give any other hon member an opportunity, I just want to thank the Leader of Government Business. I think the reason why I have allowed you, sir, is because it responded to a question raised with the Speaker and I thought, having raised that question, hon the Leader of the Opposition, it necessitated a response and I guess that response, in fact I do not guess, I think that response suffices as a substantive response to the question that was raised.

May I then, if there is no further point of order ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Is that another [Inaudible.] – alright, your device ...[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: I see your hand, hon member Bosman, but I am still dealing with hon the Leader of the Opposition and then I will come to you immediately. Hon the Leader of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, just to inform you that I am only on one device. It might be another member who has two devices. I have actually switched off my phone completely, so I am just on the laptop.

Hon Speaker, thank you, I really do not want to be labouring the point ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, there is one by yourself, the one that you are speaking with, and then there is one that says "C Dugmore guest". [Inaudible.] you to exit that one.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Okay. Chair, as I said I joined initially on my phone, and I have now exited that ...[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: We will help you then remove the other one.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITIONS: Ja, please do. Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, yes, not to belabour the point, but I think it is important that we just clarify this. I think the Leader of Government Business stopped short of actually quoting Section 42(1) of the Provincial Constitution, which refers to the Provincial Cabinet and that section says:

"The Provincial Cabinet consists of the Premier as head and no fewer than five and no more than 10 Provincial Ministers."

And then it further goes on to say, 42(2):

"The Premier appoints the Provincial Ministers."

So I think it is important that the Leader of Government Business is familiar with the provisions, but as I said, Chair, I do not want to belabour the point, I am just, and I appreciate what the Leader of Government Business has said in regard to when they are in meetings with National and how they address correspondence, but I can assure you that I have received correspondence in which the Provincial Ministers referred to themselves as "Ministers".

So, I am just raising it, possibly we can deal with this issue at a later date, but we are part of a united South Africa which is governed by a Constitution. This Constitution has been certified ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... by the Province and that refers to "Provincial Ministers". Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, sir. Thank you, hon the Leader of the Opposition,

may I say this? It does appear that there might be an appetite from your side, hon the Leader of the Opposition, to be involved in the Rules review as we currently are dealing with a number of areas in the Rules because as the Chairperson of the Rules Committee, it is the first time that it is now raised substantively that it is actually an issue, the manner in which you have raised, but I am so happy as well that the hon the Leader of the Opposition, the Leader of Government Business, indicated that they do not mind whichever way that we want to refer to the members of the Executive, but I think in terms of the Standing Rules, hon the Acting Chief Whip and the Chief Whip of the Opposition, let us rethink about this whole matter whether is it something that we want to deal with in terms of the Standing Rules and write "Provincial" and then write "Minister".

So that if the Order Paper serves it then says, "the Provincial Minister" instead of just "Minister", but that will be something that the Rules Committee has to decide in terms of what this House might be seeking to address.

Hon member Bosman and then we proceed thereafter.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I did also want to raise, it is very difficult to hear and follow the proceedings because it sounds like the hon Leader of the Opposition is in his own echo chamber this morning.

Hon Speaker, I also rise on Rule 66, 3.A. I think we need to ask whether the point of order is pertinent to the proceedings taking place today, as the hon member Sayed reminded us earlier and hon member Mvimbi, we do observe precedents in this House and I think this matter is something that has come up before and there was a ruling made, and we need to ask that the hon Leader of the Opposition allows for the proceedings to continue, especially with the beautiful explanation given by the Leader of Government Business. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bosman.

I think that undertaking was made by the hon the Leader of the Opposition, that he is happy to proceed. The responses by the hon the Leader of Government Business is sufficient. Notwithstanding that, the matter will have to be further deliberated at a different stage, which we will do as Parliament, which is the standing matter that could be entertained by the Rules Committee, which is empowered to do so. Thank you very much for that.

I now know that we have really spent quite some time on a matter which does not form part of what the order of business is about, but I had to make that determination and obviously collectively we dealt with that matter.

**The next question, as I indicated earlier, is by the hon member Brinkhuis to hon the Minister of Mobility. I now recognise Hon Minister Mitchell.**

**5. Mr K Brinkhuis to ask Mr D G Mitchell, Minister of Mobility:**

- (1) Brinkhuis has implemented safety interventions to stop robberies on Golden Arrow busses; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether he received any feedback from Golden Arrow on the effectiveness of surveillance cameras installed on busses; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Am I audible?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are, hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

Firstly, thank you to hon member Brinkhuis for the question. Part (1) of the question. The increase in criminal acts on GABS buses cannot be tolerated and requires a coordinated response from all spheres of government, SAPS, other law enforcement agencies and Golden Arrow Bus Services itself.

The Department has taken action by installing CCTV cameras on the GABS fleet and to date 844 vehicles have been fitted with CCTV, a fleet of 1 900 buses. Gabs have taken steps to install drop safes and driver panic buttons on their fleet, which complements the CCTV camera systems.

Part (2) of the question, hon Speaker. The CCTV cameras are intended to identify suspects, provide crucial evidence for prosecution and provide law enforcement authorities with new insights into the methods used by criminals.

Records indicate that the first conviction assisted by CCTV footage was handed down on 23 June 2022. The sentence was 10 years with five years suspended and, hon Speaker, there are a further two sentences pending, and 11 suspects have been arrested using the CCTV footage to identify them. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mitchell. Hon member Brinkhuis?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Good morning to you and good morning to all the members.

Yes, thank you very much to the Minister of Mobility for that answer and for that response. Yes, we have seen in the last days that there has been considerable reduction in crime on the buses, especially the Golden Arrow buses in the mornings. So, the cameras that have been installed on these buses seems to be quite effective and we want to say thank you very much to the Department for the rapid response and, yes, I have got no follow-ups, hon Speaker. Thank you very much.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Brinkhuis.

I have the following hands: the hand of hon member Mackenzie and then I hear

hon member Mvimbi. You might, if you wish, then follow after hon member Mackenzie, in that order.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thanks, hon [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: [Inaudible.] funding for this project or are we getting funding from National Government for this project? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Was that a question, hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes [inaudible.] hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: We could not hear a word, sir. Let me just check again with the Hansard team. I do not think they heard anything. Ja, nothing. May I request that you find a better spot? We will proceed with hon member Mvimbi and then once you have comfortably found a comfortable, a better spot, then we will give you an opportunity.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I also was struggling to hear hon member Mackenzie and I hope he is also not going to raise the question I am going to raise, which is fine.

I was listening to the Minister's response where he was saying that they have actually installed these cameras. I just want to check from the hon Minister, was this at the account of the R1.2 billion that is being given to Golden Arrow, or was it over and above that amount? Thank you [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much, hon Mvimbi.

The R1.2 billion allocated to Golden Arrow gets transferred rand for rand for that subsidised commuter fares to Golden Arrow. If the hon member Mvimbi recalls last year when I tabled the budget and in the previous years, the Department has always made significant contributions to the safety of public infrastructure and in this case busses to ensure that commuters are kept safe, but the amounts I will supply to the House. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

Hon Mackenzie, are you now in a better position?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Covered, Chairperson.

The SPEAKER: You are covered?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker, covered, ja.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie.

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] we are on the same page. Alright, that is fine.

Now I wish to recognise hon member Marais, †agbare [honourable.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you very, hon Speaker.

My question is really not, I never pose catch you out questions. My question is meant to stabilise and to come with fresh ideas.

Now I wanted to ask the Minister, when we look at the whole issue of taxis, which is also transport regulations; do you think that passengers should have a bill of passenger rights? And do you think your Department can come with legislation to this House? They pass a Bill on what are the rights of a passenger getting into a taxi. Which will force taxis to conform because there is now a legal sanction? Overcrowding, smoking in taxis, rude behaviour, loud music in the taxis people do not like.

There are a lot of things that had caused discomfort to people in these taxis. Did you ever consider having a bill of rights for passengers and then that bill of rights will be pasted in each taxi, with phone numbers for any transgression where the drivers can be reported? Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Dankie, agbare.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, honourable.] Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to hon member Marais for that question and for the suggestion and comments.

I wholeheartedly agree with hon member Marais and I think that is something that as a department we can definitely look at because ultimately as a government and as the Western Cape Government, we need to ensure that we have safe, reliable public transport, and that could be one of the key contributors to that, to achieve that.

I just want to touch on the current legislation and perhaps that is also, hon member Marais, perhaps for another question or a follow-up question in the future, but I know that the legislation provides for me as the Provincial Minister, hon member Dugmore, to impose certain conditions before operating licences are issued to operators, minibuss taxi operators.

So perhaps the legislation already covers for introduction of that very, very significant, and which I think is a very good proposal, but if not that is definitely something I would be willing to look at. So, thank you very much, hon member Marais. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

I wish to establish whether there are any other hon members that wish to ask a question? We are done. Thank you?

Thank you, hon members, that concludes Question 5. Thank you, hon Minister.

I now recognise hon Minister Simmers, the Minister of Infrastructure, to a question that is asked by hon member Bakubaku-Vos. Hon the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Earlier I indicated it was three Ministers. Minister Simmers is one of those three Ministers. I do know that Minister Simmers did communicate with the respective member. Whether the respective member has had an opportunity to look at her emails or not I am not sure, but I do know about Minister Simmers's indication that he will not be in the House today and request that that question is held over. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Yes. Thank you, Madam Acting Chief Whip. That is noted and of course it was shared with the House. Duly noted.

The next question is the question by... that is Question 7. Can we just again refresh the memory of all members. The questions that have been requested to stand over vis-à-vis the questions that will proceed. We also do not have much time now, we are almost at the tail end of the question.

Table staff, please.

Madam Chief Whip, you can sit down, sir, the Chief Whip is ready to give us that list, thank you?

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon Speaker. The three was the Premier.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: It was Minister Simmers and I do also have knowledge of Minister Mbombo, who is with the Premier, with the Deputy President at the moment in the respective meeting. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Madam Acting Chief Whip. I can imagine how far can you go to tell us where they are and what they are doing. [Laughs.] But thank you very much for that detail.

So, we now know that every other Minister is expected to respond to questions if we still have the time to accommodate that.

**Now the next question is Question 7 by hon members Bans to the hon Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety. I now recognise you, hon Minister Allen again.**

**7. Ms A P Bans to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

(a) What steps have been taken to address the high number of child murders and abductions, (b) how does the Safety Plan prioritise the safety of children and (c) what are the details of the (i) programmes and (ii) budget associated with it?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you so much, hon Speaker. I wish to express my appreciation to hon member Bans for asking this particular question.

I have engaged the South African Police Service and the first part will be a direct response from the South African Police Service. Proper prosecutorial led investigations are being done on a number of cases. Continuous awareness campaigns are conducted to alert children and their parents of the dangers and preventative measures to be taken. Specific focus will also be placed on the safety of our children during the 16 days of activism, as well as the festive season operations.

Having stated that, hon Speaker, we further note that in our role in terms of our oversight mandate and where we are working with various stakeholders, we are very specific in highlighting the role and the preventative measures that should be taken, but this is part further to the question that I would appreciate if it can be directed further to the Ministers of Social Development as well as Cultural Affairs and Sport, but I want to state that the Safety Plan seeks to ensure that all residents regardless of age, gender, creed, language, culture, background and/or sexual orientation, live in a safe environment and in a dignified manner.

Hon Speaker, this plan has two components. One is the violence prevention and the other is the law enforcement. This is intended to ensure a whole of government approach is employed and the Department of Social Development, Cultural Affairs and Sport, Health, through their various programmes, play a significant role in the protection, support and nurturing of children.

Hon Speaker, just earlier on we further heard from the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities, hon Minister Mireille Wenger, with regard to the tabling of the midterm budget policy statement in which she stated that it is a budget that cares and I want to re-emphasize that the amounts that are being budgeted for R54,75 billion on our well-being priority, R15,87 billion on our growth for jobs priority and R2,65 billion on our safety priority, and as indicated various departments all have a role to play in creating safer communities so that our children are able to live and play in safe environments and grow up to ultimately be the best that they possibly can be. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

I now recognise the hon member Bans. Hon Bans, are you ready?

Mr A P BANS: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Are there other hon members who wish to participate in the question? Alright, none.

Thank you, hon Minister. We now conclude with Question 7.

**We move to Question 9 by hon member Christians, who is here with us in the House, to the hon Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety. I now recognise the hon Minister.**

**9. Mr F C Christians to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

Whether LEAP officers are a preventative or reactive measure to combat crime in the hotspots of Cape Town?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you so much for the question.

The question that was posed by hon member Christians was with regard to whether LEAP officers are a preventative or a reactive measure to combat crime in the hotspots in the City of Cape Town [Inaudible.] state categorically once again that the Western Cape Safety Plan objective is to reduce murders by 50% in 2029. The law Enforcement Advancement Plan was established as one of the Safety Plan's key interventions to combat crime.

This intervention allows for proactive deployment of LEAP officers to the predetermined crime hotspots. So, it is definitely to be taken in a proactive and not a reactionary point of view to combat crime. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker, and hon Minister, thank you for that answer.

I know that the LEAP officers do make a difference, but please explain to me the increase in crime, especially contact crimes in the Western Cape. Are the LEAP officers playing a role there because we know that the Government is talking about reducing the murder rate by 50%, but now it seems to me that other crime is out of hand. 21.5% of crime increase when it comes to contact crimes. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians.

Sorry, hon Minister, will you please hold back. Hon the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC?

The CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Speaker, just a point of order and I think maybe the Table staff may have missed it, but the hon member Mvimbi has had his hand up for quite some time. I do not think he has been recognised. Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Apologies. It is a previous hand. My sincere apologies, hon Speaker and hon member Sayed.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi for that.

I thought it was [Inaudible.] hand because it was static, but thank you for that and thanks to the hon the Deputy Chief Whip.

The hon member Bosman, you want to come in, sir?

Mr G BOSMAN: No, sir, I thought we are moving on to the next person to ask a question to the Minister after he has responded.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Alright, now, hon Minister. Thank you, hon member Bosman.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you so much, hon Speaker.

I appreciate that follow-up. It is a follow-up that actually speaks directly to what we have seen yesterday.

Hon Speaker, based on the latest crime stats we have noted on the one hand an encouraging amount of precincts where LEAP officers are deployed where we have seen a reduction in contact crime, even in murders.

So that is welcome on the one hand. Two particular stations, and the Premier has tasked me to have further engagements in the Nyanga and in the Philippi East area because it remains a concern on that end, but if I look at that approaches to address certain crime categories, it is in terms of the LEAP deployment in their vehicle checkpoints, their visible policing, their patrols in hotspot areas, but also in their engagement with communities when certain information is then shared via community structures, via Neighbourhood Watches, all contributing towards making sure that there is a flow of information.

That flow of information leads to intelligence that can be used by the South African Police Service, by law enforcement agencies, in order to eradicate various levels of contact crimes in our area.

So from the vehicle checkpoints to visible patrolling to making sure that there are targeted interventions and operations between the SAPS, Metro Police and law enforcement, it is to make sure that contact crime is continuously being reduced and yes, I do note that we should be at a point, hon Speaker, where we are being very deliberate in our approach to make sure that the various stakeholders are jointly working together towards ensuring that we see the crime being reduced in our province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

Just to remind the hon members that if you are on a virtual platform it is better

to guide the Presiding Officers by, one, using one device to connect and number two, just like now the hon the Deputy Chief Whip had to intervene. If there is a hand that is up, once you are done, once you are recognised and you have actually had the opportunity to address the House, kindly just withdraw the hand so that we do not assume that you still want to talk.

I have recognised now the hand of hon member Bosman. If you could withdraw the hand once you have done speaking, sir.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, through you. I would like to know from the Minister how LEAP officers are going to also assist with the festive season preparedness and also making sure that they complement the work being done by the South African Police Service, to ensure a safer festive season, especially in the light of the massive increase in crime at the Cape Town Police Station and also police stations around spaces where members of our communities gather. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you so much, hon member Bosman, for that particular question.

We have engaged previously with regard to the Standing Committee interactions. I want to place on record once again that the LEAP officers are being strategically placed and deployed where crime is in our priority areas.

I am delighted to at this stage further indicate that there are interventions that are going to be announced in the coming days with regard to the Safer Festive Season campaign and the launch of an initiative to ensure that we are creating those extra visibility measures during the festive season that we are currently in.

So I am looking forward to sharing that information with the Standing Committee as well in that we have had engagements across various departments with regard to all the interventions that are taking place, but LEAP is very strategic in our hotspot areas where it has been indicated, based on the data and the evidence, where those LEAP offices are needed the most. They will remain in those particular priority areas together with the two reaction units, that should there be a flare-up anywhere in our province, that particular reaction unit will be able to step in and help and assist, but on the other hand various other interventions are in place together with the South African Police Service and the City of Cape Town with a joint Safer Festive Season approach. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Hon Minister.

I do not see any further hands ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker? Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, you must raise your hand or say

something in the chatroom there, but you may proceed. Is that an interest to speak, sir?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, thank you very much, hon Speaker.

I note originally the plan, hon Minister, was developed or started about two or three years ago, with a budget of R1 billion over a period of three years, over a period of five years. I think up to now we spent about R350 million of that, and I believe that it is supposed to be for the whole province, but so far there seem to be a clear concentration and prioritisation of the Metro and I just want to check then that because I believe that the province has got six district areas, including the Metro, and there has been nothing that has been done outside of the Metro.

I just heard you mention that there are also priority areas, we deployed these people in these priority areas. Now how do you identify these priority areas? Are the areas outside of the Metro not your priority areas?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. I recognise the Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you so much for that particular question.

We have been very clear, hon Speaker, through you, with regard to the Western Cape Safety Plan.

The priority areas have been identified based on the data. That data has been visible and public across various platforms. It is in line with regard to the crime stats that are released by the South African Police Service.

So, the priority areas that have been identified as the murder hotspot areas are located in the City of Cape Town and that is where the LEAP officers are deployed in order to see a reduction in the murder rate in those particular priority areas.

We will never, hon Speaker, forget about our rural areas. We have activated K9-units because we have seen, hon Speaker, a reduction of K9-units in the South African Police Service since 2018, by 27%. We have then stepped up in order to ensure that we are able to launch K9-units outside of the City of Cape Town.

We have launched reaction units outside of the City of Cape Town. We have provided funding to various districts and each and every district, there are five districts outside of the City of Cape Town. They are receiving funding from the department based on the District Safety Plan.

The District Safety Plan will be specific to a particular district, for example, when we are in the West Coast area, in their District Safety Plan funding is allocated so that plans are implemented in that particular area.

In the Overstrand and in the Overberg area there is also a K9-unit together with the reaction unit that we have launched and most definitely it is never so that

nothing has been done. We have done amazing work and I am proud of the work that various municipalities are doing together with district municipalities in partnership with the Department of Community Safety towards making sure that the districts are never forgotten.

I have just over the last three months concluded four of the rural safety summits and the very last one will be early next year, which will happen in the Central Karoo area, and that is all towards making sure that we are working with our districts, that we are working with our B municipalities, with all municipalities outside of the City of Cape Town as well.

So we will never forget about our rural areas, we will never forget about the Swellendams, about the Bitous, because we are wanting to make sure that when we see that there is an increase in crime outside of the City of Cape Town, we would want to nip that in the bud as soon as possible and for crime not to have a foothold in our rural areas.

In the Cape Winelands, from the West Coast to the Garden Route we are playing an active role in the safety space by not only making funding available, but also making sure that we are fostering those working relationships towards reducing the murder rate together with a number of contact categories.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

Hon members, are there any further questions by the hon members? If none, that concludes Question 9.

**We now move to Question 10 by hon member Van der Westhuizen to the Hon Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. I recognise the Hon Minister Bredell.**

**10. Mr A P van der Westhuizen to ask Mr A Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

(a) Which nature reserves has the Province identified for acquisition from SANParks and (b)(i) which nature reserves under the provincial government have been identified as parks that may be relinquished to the care of the national government and/or SANParks in a possible land swap, (ii) what was the rationale behind determining or identifying these parks and (iii) how would the Province be able to manage and care better for these pieces of land than the national government and/or SANParks?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for posing the question.

The Province has not identified nature reserves for acquisition from SANParks nor has nature reserves to be relinquished under the Provincial Government to the care of the National Government or SANParks in a possible land swap, been identified.

Part (2) and (3) of the question. The National Department of Forestry, Fisheries and Environment (DEFF), has established a task team that is representative of all the provinces to investigate the rationalisation of the protected areas estate management. Despite the task team being formed more than two years ago, there has been little to no progress in this regard. I thank you.

(The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Bredell. Hon member Christians, any follow-up?

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, are we on Question 9? Oh, Van der Westhuizen, my apologies. Over to you.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agbare Adjunkspeaker, deur u aan Minister Bredell.

Minister, die moontlike ruil van natuurreserve, sover my kennis strek, is die eerste keer geopper deur die Nasionale Minister van Omgewingsake, Minister Barbara Creecy, tydens 'n debat in die Nasionale Raad vir Provinsies.

Kan u dalk sê wat sy in gedagte gehad het toe sy hierdie moontlikheid geopper het? Wat dink u sou haar doel hiermee gewees het en wat was haar of haar amptenare se reaksie sedertdien? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to Minister Bredell.

Minister, the possible exchange of nature reserves, to my knowledge, was first mentioned by the National Minister of Environmental Affairs, Minister Barbara Creecy, during a debate in the National Council of Provinces.

Can you perhaps say what she had in mind when she mentioned this possibility? What do you think would have been her aim with this and what has her and her officials' reaction been since? Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Chair, it is very difficult to debate or to discuss what other people think.

I think that the possibility is that obviously we manage a lot of land on their behalf, and we will rather have that land within our asset register, or the register of CapeNature, but the investigation is ongoing.

I also think that from a national perspective they wanted to look at the land that

is available for especially the tourism market, but obviously it is a lengthy discussion, it is a difficult discussion because we have managed in this province to increase our tourism revenue by over 30%.

So, we want to continue on that, but for that you need to have the assets to invest in. It is an ongoing debate with National Government. There is also the pressure between Forestry, Fisheries and Environment, and then the Department of Public Works, who is the custodian of the land at the end of the day, and to dismantle all of these pieces of land it is important to understand that if there is no contract between Fisheries, Forestry and Environment, then the land owner is Public Works and we must then negotiate with Minister De Lille on a couple of pieces of land.

We have presented all the vacant land, pieces of land, to Minister De Lille to try and fast-track and to try and put pressure on the task team to do their work so that we can take this forward. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Adjunkspeaker, weer deur u aan Minister Bredell.

Minister, die Suid-Afrikaans Grondwet laat provinsiale regerings toe om sekere verantwoordelikhede af te wentel na munisipaliteite. Gestel die verantwoordelikheid vir die Tafelberg Nasionale Park sou aan die Provinsie oorgedra word, sou u Departement dit dalk oorweeg om daardie verantwoordelikheid verder weer oor te dra aan die Stad Kaapstad, en indien wel waarom sou u dit dalk wou doen? Dankie.

**[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]**

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, again through you to Minister Bredell.

Minister, the South African Constitution allows provincial governments to cede certain responsibilities to municipalities. Suppose the responsibility for the Table Mountain National Park was ceded to the Province, would your Department possibly consider ceding that responsibility further to the City of Cape Town, and if so, why would you possibly do it? Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Well, at the end of the day, hon Deputy Speaker, hon member, that I think our responsibility is to our residents, at the end of the day the value for money, where will we get the most value for it?

You must remember there is also an MOU between National and City of Cape Town. My gut tells me if there is a possibility they will directly transfer to the city, we will be a role-player, but it is not that we want to claim anything. The honest

question is where will we get maximum bucks for our money? What can we do with the asset so that people can benefit? And obviously the city has got a huge interest in that and I would not have any objections if we move it to the city. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Are there any further follow-up questions? None?

That concludes Question 10 and that concludes the Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed in the Hansard.

Sorry, hon member Van der Westhuizen, do you have a third follow-up?

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Ja, dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker.

Minister Bredell, een van die kwessies wat die publiek werklik bekommer is die hele kwessie rondom veiligheid op Tafelberg en in die Tafelberg Nasionale Park.

Tot watter mate kan u Departement alreeds ondersteuning bied aan SANParke en tot watter mate het ons al sukses behaal om van Tafelberg 'n veiliger toerisme-bestemming te maak? Is u Departement betrokke en tot watter mate is daar samewerking in die verband?

**[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]**

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Yes, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Minister Bredell, one of the issues that really concerns the public is the whole matter around safety on Table Mountain and in the Table Mountain National Park.

To what extent can your Department already offer support to SANParks and to what extent have we already achieved success to make Table Mountain a safer tourist destination? Is your Department involved and to what extent is there cooperation in this regard?]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Agb Minister.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Chair, thank you.

The safety on the mountains [Inaudible.] the City of Cape Town working with SANParks. They have got a specific programme to see to how they can safeguard the tourists on Table Mountain but making it safer for fire hazards and then the Department and Disaster Management are involved.

So, we have got very close relationships working with the teams within the Table Mountain range and we will keep on building on that relationship. I think it is an important relationship, but at the end of the day again I think that we can utilise that asset better.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agb Minister.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.] Hon member Van der Westhuizen, your final question if you would like to do any further follow-ups.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, I will step down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I see no further hands.

That does conclude then the Questions for Oral Reply. Any outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard.



**INTERPELLATIONS UNDER NAME OF MEMBER  
(as put to relevant Minister)**

**Bakubaku-Vos, N G –**

Social Development..... 727, 2345

**Baartman, D M –**

Finance and Economic Opportunities ..... 4759

**Bosman, G –**

Police Oversight and Community Safety ..... 7402

Social Development..... 4182

**Christians, F C –**

Agriculture ..... 446

Community Safety ..... 2340

Education..... 971

Transport and Public Works ..... 688, 761, 4186

**Dugmore, C M –**

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 4898

Premier ..... 630, 1777

**Herron, B D –**

Community Safety ..... 1699, 4764

Human Settlements ..... 3817, 3930

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 3990

Premier ..... 2601, 3823

**Kaiser-Philander, W F –**

Health ..... 263, 1840, 3829, 6913

**Kama, M –**

Community Safety ..... 443, 625

Police Oversight and Community Safety ..... 7329

**Lili, A –**

Human Settlements ..... 4875

Health ..... 137

**Makamba-Botya, N –**

Cultural Affairs and Sport..... 1837

Education..... 771, 985, 1719

Finance and Economic Opportunities ..... 4045

Human Settlements ..... 2335

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 2426

**Marais, P J –**

Community Safety ..... 451

(ii)

**Marran, P –**

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 6927

**Maseko, L M –**

Human Settlements..... 538, 2534

**Mvimbi, L L –**

Finance and Economic Opportunities ..... 978, 4039

Mobility ..... 6761

**Nkondlo, N D –**

Finance and Economic Opportunities ..... 542, 1782, 3995

Premier ..... 7688

**Sayed, M K –**

Education ..... 821, 2421, 2831, 3937, 4245, 7408, 7680

**Smith, D –**

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 828, 2066

..... 2538

**Van der Westhuizen, A P –**

Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 638

Transport and Public Works ..... 688, 689

**Windvogel, R –**

Health..... 4755, 7571

**Xego, M –**

Community Safety..... 732, 765, 2271, 6467

Education ..... 1834

Finance and Economic Opportunities ..... 1724, 1787, 6921

Health..... 6757, 7469

Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 2109

**QUESTIONS**

**(Oral and Written: as put to relevant Minister under name of Member)**

**Allen, R I –**

Acting Minister of Community Safety ..... 5647, 5713, 5955, 6071, 6163

..... 276, 584, 585, 645, 709, 744, 746, 925, 961, 964, 1063

... 1064, 1120, 1182, 1772, 1828, 1985, 2006, 2151, 2566, 2600, 2634, 2660, 2710

... 2663, 2664, 2858, 2860, 3000, 3157, 3159, 3160, 3252, 3384, 3396, 3454, 3456

... 3457, 3517, 3518, 3659, 3660, 3789, 3851, 3889, 3890, 3891, 3973, 3974, 3975

... 4029, 4030, 4031, 4072, 4073, 4074, 4131, 4132, 4269, 4274, 4616, 4617, 4618

..... 4660, 4685, 4686, 4793, 4795, 4937, 5288, 5316, 5319, 5576, 5589, 5590

..... 6078, 6163, 6168, 6528

Community Safety..... 6539

Cultural Affairs and Sport..... 118, 650, 3235, 3518, 3800, 3801, 3813, 4014

..... 4278, 5455, 5458, 5576, 5648, 5716, 6476

Social Development.....	709
<b>America, D –</b>	
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	1697
Human Settlements .....	686, 687, 739
Infrastructure .....	7031
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	789, 1467
..... 2084, 2086, 2443, 2531, 2563, 2565, 2628, 2643, 2806, 2870, 2872, 3001	
..... 3672, 3814, 3851, 3888, 3969, 4010, 4133, 4275, 4276, 4553, 4625, 4680	
..... 4935, 5326, 5495, 5641, 5642, 5849, 7648, 7734, 7762	
Mobility .....	6811, 6897, 7645
Transport and Public Works .....	6525
<b>August, S N –</b>	
Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	6993
Education.....	5938, 5940, 6490, 6957, 7818
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	6265, 7665
Health .....	7399
Human Settlements .....	5936
Infrastructure .....	6958
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	7769
.....	7770
Mobility .....	6829
Police Oversight and Community Safety.....	7929, 7929
Premier .....	6263, 6538, 6825, 6960, 7107, 7108, 7766
Social Development.....	6068, 6830
<b>Baartman, D M –</b>	
Agriculture .....	2306, 6813
Community Safety .....	512, 536, 595, 700, 2197, 2308
Finance and Economic Opportunities.....	595, 853, 1185, 2307, 2384, 2516, 2573
.....	6585
Education.....	6145, 6146
..... 2629, 2867, 3236, 3271, 3272, 3275, 3379, 3381, 3815, 3816, 4776, 4797	
..... 5568, 5569, 5572, 6443, 6586, 6588, 6740, 6783, 6888, 7294, 7296, 7306	
.....	7422, 7635, 7662, 7746, 7789
Health .....	2201, 2570
Infrastructure .....	6742, 6744, 6789
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	319, 323
.....	514, 696, 697, 1183, 1184, 3264, 3265, 3266
Premier .....	2196
<b>Bakubaku-Vos, N G –</b>	
Acting Minister of Community Safety .....	6465
Community Safety .....	3578, 3731, 4089, 4156
Education.....	3579, 7381
Health .....	5261, 6259
Human Settlements .....	3705, 3986, 4653
Police Oversight and Community Safety .....	7041, 7675
Premier .....	1129, 3402, 5468
Social Development.....	236, 237, 293, 294, 496, 723, 742, 1135, 1136, 1291

.....1408, 1463, 1470, 1473, 1474, 2058, 2059, 2060, 2303, 2862, 2866, 3019  
.....3214, 3304, 4091, 4155, 4258, 5290, 5726, 5727, 5728, 5777, 5790, 5792  
.....5935, 6056 6109, 6131, 6464, 6504, 6753, 6788, 7045, 7177, 7178, 7339  
.....7432

**Bans, A P –**

Cultural Affairs and Sport ..... 484, 489, 495, 1086, 1420, 1564, 1566, 1569, 2367  
.....3580, 4082, 4175, 4180, 4337, 4811, 4818, 4951, 5211, 5212, 5290, 5588  
.....6130, 7585  
Health..... 1422, 1755  
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 319, 323  
.....2300, 3064  
Police Oversight and Community Safety..... 7963  
Premier .....5882  
Transport and Public Works..... 3700

**Bosman, G –**

Acting Minister of Community Safety .....5648, 5651  
Community Safety..... 2596, 2844, 4032, 4658, 4797, 5284, 5287, 5312, 5313  
.....5577, 5578, 5579, 5619, 5633, 5634, 7130  
Cultural Affairs and Sport ..... 3804, 7026, 7300, 7618  
Education ..... 2718, 3948, 6071, 7734  
Finance and Economic Opportunities ..... 6074, 6137, 6142, 6437, 6548, 6582  
.....6818, 6901, 6947, 6949, 7025, 7141, 7246, 7315, 7355  
Health.....2386, 5851  
Human Settlements.....742, 812  
Infrastructure.....6734  
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 693, 810  
.....812, 2015  
Mobility.....6734  
Police Oversight and Community Safety..... 7130, 7150, 7249, 7267, 7298  
.....7299, 7312, 7320, 7358, 7359, 7434, 7596, 7597, 7612, 7649, 7776, 7777  
.....7779, 7830, 7843  
Premier .....3385, 5500  
Social Development ..... 259, 262, 284, 857, 858, 1327, 1328, 1465, 1717, 1718  
.....1742, 1790, 1999, 2000, 2001, 2002, 2008, 2009, 2015, 2016, 2448, 2705  
.....2707, 2708, 2717, 2931, 2932, 2970, 2971, 3062, 3144, 3533, 3802, 4067  
.....4078, 4079, 4080, 4133, 4199, 4279, 5502, 5509, 5510, 5511, 5714, 5852  
Transport and Public Works..... 856, 2849

**Botha, L J –**

Community Safety..... 5631, 5632, 6482  
Cultural Affairs and Sport .....781  
Education .....466, 711, 713, 758, 963, 964, 1051, 1057, 1427, 1428, 1459  
.....1853, 2132, 2450, 2514, 2515, 2560, 2594, 2595, 2633, 2907, 2908, 2934  
.....3044, 3045, 3117, 3120, 3121, 3155, 3387, 3400, 3459, 3673, 3806, 4034  
.....4068, 4070, 4602, 4604, 4605, 4789, 4792, 5593, 5594, 5846  
Finance and Economic Opportunities ..... 6735, 6737  
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 1707, 1881  
.....3815, 5954, 6455, 6547, 6548

Police Oversight and Community Safety .....	6810
Premier .....	6076, 6581, 6810, 7028, 7291
Social Development.....	1859, 5609, 7341
Transport and Public Works .....	693

**Brinkhuis, G –**

Community Safety .....	1742, 2654, 4683
Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	781, 2529, 3161, 7902
Education.....	1124, 1126, 1127, 1903, 2468, 2501, 3162, 3972, 7169
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	1743, 2195, 3416
Health .....	2587
Human Settlements .....	3710
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	2003
Mobility .....	7959
Police Oversight and Community Safety .....	7170
Premier .....	6026
Social Development.....	2002, 2446, 2530
Transport and Public Works .....	2632

**Christians, F C –**

Community Safety .....	804, 2070, 2449, 2853, 4190
Education.....	473, 514, 587, 675, 676, 783, 790, 804, 861, 1011, 2124, 2449
.....	2578, 2856, 3929, 3976, 4060, 4203, 4954, 6537, 6733, 6777, 6785, 6831
.....	6939, 6954, 6955, 6966, 7282, 7305, 7344, 7419, 7662, 7701, 7728, 7755
.....	7829
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	861, 2287, 2292
Health .....	500, 579, 820, 860, 2105, 6537, 6882
Human Settlements .....	4066, 4266, 5584
Infrastructure .....	7304, 7663
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	2577
.....	6697
Mobility .....	6733, 7345, 7664, 7960
Police Oversight and Community Safety .....	6705, 6832, 6903, 6993, 7282
.....	7433, 7491, 7728, 7836, 7950, 7965
Premier .....	7285
Social Development.....	2638, 3976, 4263
Transport and Public Works .....	482, 819, 1982, 4195, 4897

**De Jager, I –**

Education.....	788
----------------	-----

**Dugmore, C M –**

Agriculture .....	2192
Education.....	473, 3399
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	7215, 7442
Human Settlements .....	2297
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	3415
.....	3666, 3721, 3729, 7803, 7885
Mobility .....	7752
Police Oversight and Community Safety .....	7215

Premier .....	458, 463, 517, 928, 1128, 1331, 1333, 1450, 1695, 1696, 1745
.....	2168, 2277, 2350, 2354, 2431, 2527, 2690, 2722, 2843, 2941, 3014, 3032
.....	3079, 3213, 3295, 3712, 3834, 4000, 4081, 4151, 4153, 4336, 4696, 4717
.....	4881, 4945, 5204, 5207, 5720, 5721, 5722, 5796, 5798, 6027, 6133, 6422
.....	6424, 6501, 6535, 6566, 6580, 6720, 6770, 6833, 6840, 7049, 7055, 7056
.....	7116, 7117, 7243, 7575
Social Development .....	3500
Transport and Public Works .....	1, 3017, 3398, 5270, 5442, 5445

**Fry, C M –**

Premier .....	7641, 7642, 7764, 7826
---------------	------------------------

**Herron, B N –**

Acting Minister of Community Safety .....	5640, 5659
Agriculture .....	515
Community Safety .....	513, 2102, 2194, 2635, 3028, 3058, 3450, 3712
.....	3870, 4543
Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	2640, 3461
Education .....	1039, 1041, 1095, 2389, 3025, 3267, 3280, 3447, 3499, 3708
.....	3752, 3860, 3892, 4148, 4150, 4810, 5289, 5429
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	1027, 1323, 1424, 2202, 2857, 3054
.....	3166, 3250, 3284, 3524, 4076, 4544, 4557, 4558, 4559, 4837
Health.....	1072, 1469, 1866, 1867, 1868, 2013, 2387, 3365, 3896, 4219, 4656
Human Settlements.....	466, 1046, 2490, 2658, 2823, 2909, 3050, 3069, 3127
.....	3255, 4037, 4626, 4627, 4633, 4805
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	269, 586, 817
.....	928, 1029, 1329, 1713, 2099, 2101, 2146, 2195, 2218, 2469, 2485, 2589
.....	2641, 2708, 2710, 2716, 2827, 2992, 2998, 2999, 3025, 3051, 3071, 3123
.....	3154, 3239, 3242, 3362, 3418, 3662, 3895, 3978, 3983, 4075, 4548, 4630
.....	4677, 4806, 4838, 5490
Premier .....	113, 1773, 2812, 3150, 3525, 3563, 3662, 3793, 3796, 3842, 4218
.....	5635, 5638, 5540, 5655
Social Development .....	115, 1066, 2144, 2412, 3285, 3500, 3529, 4149, 4216
.....	5497
Transport and Public Works.....	392, 726, 839, 922, 1065, 1296, 2144, 2517, 2912
.....	3053, 3211, 3256, 3366, 3799, 3864, 4629, 5327, 5328, 5658

**Kaizer-Philander, W F –**

Community Safety.....	590, 1460, 3899, 3900
Education .....	966, 1070, 1988, 2097, 2933
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	1461, 1832, 4137
Health.....	247, 257, 258, 279, 591, 673, 710, 738, 813, 926, 1010, 1058, 1063
.....	1429, 1768, 1832, 1864, 1865, 1979, 1995, 1997, 2129, 2131, 2385
.....	2508, 2514, 2593, 2606, 2612, 2632, 2907, 3046, 3121, 3389, 3391
.....	3392, 3789, 3804, 4035, 4614, 4615, 4624, 4792, 4936, 4937, 4955
.....	4956, 5323, 5591, 5592, 5614, 5616, 5715, 5955, 6444, 6446, 6455
.....	6456, 6709, 6807, 6825, 7032, 7125, 7152, 7274, 7276, 7284, 7320
.....	7352, 7354, 7473, 7560, 7561, 7721, 7750, 7763, 7765, 7785, 7844
Human Settlements.....	674, 741, 814, 967, 1074, 2654
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	1986
Premier .....	1998, 2962

Social Development.....	1072, 7870
Transport and Public Works .....	966, 1070, 5644, 5645

**Kama, M –**

Acting Minister of Community Safety .....	5730, 5877, 6269, 6414, 6419
Community Safety .....	13, 129, 291, 292, 440, 516, 663, 1007, 1084, 1089, 1354
.....	1463, 1464, 1477, 1480, 2185, 2294, 2373, 2438, 2672, 2721, 2729, 2780
.....	2786, 2993, 3018, 3220, 3222, 3225, 3296, 3299, 3348, 3404, 3406, 3539
.....	3849, 3922, 3965, 3983, 4055, 4087, 4238, 4686, 4688, 4863, 4992, 5202
.....	5274, 6090, 6111, 6494, 6495, 6521, 6551, 6565, 7913
Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	4532, 5585, 5622, 6556, 7199, 7206
Education.....	2091, 4671, 4943, 5837
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	2372, 2674
Human Settlements .....	2996
Infrastructure .....	6804
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	4088
.....	4089, 5279
Police Oversight and Community Safety .....	6748, 6751, 6787, 6854, 7056, 8316
.....	7082, 7136, 7308, 7311, 7336, 7384, 7439, 7440, 7672
Premier.....	2836, 5276, 5452, 6066, 7034, 7136, 7413
Transport and Public Works .....	2302

**Lekker, P Z –**

Community Safety .....	5, 1118, 1421, 2887, 3985, 4268
Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	6519
Education.....	246, 1093, 6132
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	246, 1074, 1744, 2187, 2215, 2674
.....	4725, 6905
Health .....	298, 718, 1421, 4549, 7491
Human Settlements .....	245, 1092, 2215, 2299, 3729, 3730, 3812
Infrastructure .....	7808
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	2214
.....	6101
Premier.....	645, 1119, 1292, 1744, 3350, 3813, 3886, 4646, 5448, 5723, 5724
.....	5936, 6050, 6051, 6053, 6423, 6536, 6854, 7040, 7047, 7100, 7209
.....	7819
Social Development.....	1844
Transport and Public Works .....	3555, 4564, 5505

**Lili, A –**

Health .....	137
Human Settlements .....	16, 140, 491, 492, 498, 660, 805, 1081, 1090, 1179, 1289
.....	1290, 1419, 1753, 2167, 2304, 2973, 2977, 2981, 3081, 3585, 3695, 3743
.....	3913, 3987, 4173, 4223, 4341, 4586, 4646, 4651, 4652, 4672, 4704, 4958
.....	5452, 5493, 5506, 5869, 5874, 6136, 6493, 6563
Infrastructure .....	6721, 6725, 6728, 6789, 6793, 6794, 7374, 7502, 7503, 7607
.....	7610, 7654, 7790, 7793
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	4865

**Mackenzie, R D –**

Acting Minister of Community Safety .....	6458, 6551
---	------------

Agriculture .....	2550
Community Safety ..592, 714, 715, 757, 1831, 2216, 2217, 2491, 2627, 2665, 3658 ..... 3139, 3383, 3397, 3451, 3453, 3516, 3707, 4716	
Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	3510, 3513, 3537, 3655, 7326, 7327
Education .....	717, 1464, 3535, 3657, 3968, 6457, 7435, 7436, 7640
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	1855, 3269, 3271, 3279, 3535
Health.....	4063
Human Settlements.....	1862, 2625
Mobility .....	7135, 7279, 7281, 7424, 7660, 7841
Police Oversight and Community Safety .....	6692, 6740, 6808, 6809, 6900, 6956 ..... 7284, 7547, 7658, 7841, 7842
Premier .....	524, 548, 757, 775, 917, 1453, 2496, 2548, 3048, 3128, 3131, 3132 ..... 3138
Social Development .....	793, 843, 844, 2104, 3305, 3306, 3307, 3382, 3708 ..... 3967, 6524
Transport and Public Works.....	1883, 2616, 4619, 4623, 4657, 4771, 4773 .....4886, 4957, 5441, 5454, 5572, 5574, 5595, 5596, 5607, 5620

### **Makamba-Botya, N –**

Agriculture .....	1026, 7903
Community Safety.....	748, 1877
Education .....	1895, 2579, 4953, 6951, 7725
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	2636, 3971, 4016
Health.....	748, 1810, 2294, 2374, 4127, 4784, 6471
Human Settlements.....	2094, 2117, 3853, 3970
Infrastructure .....	6702, 6780, 6968, 7595
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	4890
Police Oversight and Community Safety .....	7342
Premier .....	3005
Social Development .....	1425, 1730, 2466, 4207, 7425, 7492, 7595
Transport and Public Works.....	2913

### **Marais, P J –**

Cultural Affairs and Sport .....	845
Education .....	2972
Health.....	580
Human Settlements.....	1862
Premier .....	837
Transport and Public Works.....	4147

### **Marran, P –**

Agriculture .....	735, 956, 1218, 1417, 1419, 1754, 1808, 3218, 3883, 4944, 5728 ..... 6134, 6745, 7180, 7196, 7197
Community Safety.....	656, 3299
Health.....	3293
Human Settlements.....	2921, 2975, 2979, 2980, 3885, 4644
Infrastructure .....	6723, 6724, 6794, 6795
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	1287 ..... 1288, 2909, 4050, 4338, 4565, 4652, 6134, 6500, 6682, 6847, 7103, 7122 ..... 7123, 7545
Premier- .....	991

Transport and Public Works .....	3301, 4577, 4645
<b>Maseko, L M –</b>	
Health .....	1294
Human Settlements .....	409, 411, 412, 500, 588, 1044, 1432, 1435, 1456, 2060, 2087, 2097, 2135, 2136, 2138, 2141, 2292, 2466, 2576, 2645, 2876, 2916, 2917, 3066, 3067, 3116, 3140, 3142, 3143, 3152, 3369, 3370, 4713, 4714 5566, 5567, 5792, 5793, 5959, 5960, 6075, 6450, 6451, 6452, 6549, 6550
Infrastructure .....	6785, 6805, 6806, 6823, 6890, 6895, 7027, 7126, 7294, 7327, 7774 7435, 7550, 7565, 7599, 7600, 7720, 7739, 7831, 7832
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...	7644, 7749
Social Development.....	1886
Transport and Public Works .....	5565
<b>Mitchell, D G –</b>	
Community Safety .....	3, 117, 118, 968, 2140
Human Settlements .....	3
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	20, 919 920, 2646, 2714
Transport and Public Works .....	299, 689, 808, 968, 1437, 1457, 1458, 2153, 2711 2713, 2915, 2925, 2929, 3124, 3238, 3239, 3560, 3562, 3670, 3671
<b>Murray C –</b>	
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	7651, 7652, 7746, 7822, 7823, 7834 7846
Infrastructure .....	7869
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...	7735, 7764 7847, 7880
<b>Mvimbi, L L –</b>	
Education.....	1134, 1935, 6554, 6555, 6852, 7743, 7745, 7752, 7753
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	1571, 3880, 7546
Mobility .....	6729, 6904, 6906, 6907, 6953, 7380, 7440, 7567, 7568 7592, 7806, 7807
Premier .....	3016
Transport and Public Works .....	734, 814, 1012, 1085, 1148, 1293, 1409, 1749 1750, 1803, 2695, 2789, 2804, 2865, 2919, 3349, 3880, 4153, 4253, 4562 5449, 5862, 6056, 6110, 6135, 6680
<b>Nkondlo, N D –</b>	
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	616, 617, 619, 865, 867, 1076, 1137, 1208, 1300, 1309, 1314, 1355, 1357, 1358, 1480, 1746, 1869, 1870, 1889, 1892, 1893, 1950, 1953, 1980, 2159, 2165, 2375, 2703, 2863, 2905, 3007 3011, 3216, 3243, 3246, 3249, 3302, 3317, 3412, 3508, 3520, 3652, 3744 3872, 3879, 3910, 4093, 4539, 4581, 4691, 4694, 4697, 4911, 4964, 4989 5263, 5841, 5853, 6067, 6091, 6132, 6180, 6189, 6459, 6461, 6462, 6490 6496, 6907, 6909, 6912, 6963, 7604, 7605, 7656, 7715, 7718, 7741
Health .....	1869, 3966, 6669
Human Settlements .....	3900, 3901, 6661
Infrastructure .....	7612
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...	2157, 2882

Premier .....	555, 1139, 1313, 1939, 2362, 2881, 3501, 3698, 5867, 6674, 7124	7696
Transport and Public Works .....	868, 1217, 2296, 2435, 3508, 3964, 5876	6505, 6517, 6566

**Plato, D –**

Cultural Affairs and Sport .....		7274
Police Oversight and Community Safety .....		7749
Social Development .....	6072, 6073, 6163, 6480, 6583, 6584, 7024, 7135, 7301	7360, 7567, 7649, 7735, 7759, 7844

**Sayed, M K –**

Education .....	16, 17, 237, 238, 239, 669, 722, 723, 787, 815, 1087, 1088	1089, 1108, 1109, 1117, 1205, 1207, 1208, 1308, 1359, 1407, 1408, 1462
.....	1464, 1751, 1797, 1876, 1906, 2052, 2055, 2056, 2093, 2170, 2308, 2311	2333, 2366, 2371, 2417, 2519, 2520, 2524, 2624, 2668, 2720, 2730, 2860
.....	2861, 2877, 2938, 2940, 2990, 3019, 3033, 3075, 3076, 3078, 3225, 3226	3227, 3249, 3285, 3303, 3346, 3359, 3407, 3412, 3460, 3557, 3559, 3583
.....	3731, 3808, 3675, 3886, 3887, 4084, 4089, 4159, 4181, 4251, 4340, 4533	4579, 4580, 4592, 4666, 4667, 4669, 4701, 4703, 4821, 4833, 4907, 4939
.....	4941, 4942, 5269, 5284, 5295, 5296, 5300, 5428, 5451, 5587, 5597, 5599	5621, 5719, 5773, 5831, 5837, 5860, 5861, 5862, 5951, 5954, 6059, 6105
.....	6107, 6108, 6454, 6557, 6561, 6562, 6589, 6600, 6686, 6688, 6691, 6716	6717, 6719, 6792, 6961, 7097, 7098, 7110, 7114, 7115, 7163, 7165, 7167
.....	7168, 7172, 7282, 7335, 7374, 7431, 7490, 7667, 7670, 7710, 7712, 7740	7799, 7802, 7828, 7890, 7891
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....		1872
Health .....		1773
Infrastructure .....		6790, 7900
Premier .....	1004, 1307, 2878, 2936, 4002, 5842, 6578, 7802	
Social Development .....		7601, 7602
Transport and Public Works .....		3731, 5504

**Smith, D –**

Finance and Economic Opportunities .....		3502
Human Settlements .....		1178
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	492, 806	847, 929, 1094, 1148, 1175, 1302, 1303, 1352, 1353, 1904, 2080, 2082
.....	2203, 2205, 2206, 2301, 2525, 2697, 2738, 2865, 2885, 2945, 3083, 3116	3219, 3401, 3564, 3654, 3732
Premier .....		816

**Van der Westhuizen, A P –**

Agriculture .....	408, 581, 848, 1030, 1042, 1043, 1044, 1431, 1455, 1715, 2532	1757, 1762, 1863, 1984, 2451, 2532, 2554, 2665, 2852, 2853, 2873, 3023
.....	3024, 3263, 3530, 3532, 3661, 3665, 3667, 3669, 3788, 3943, 3945, 3957	4120, 4125, 4277, 4837, 4916, 5580, 5581, 5582, 5611, 5612, 5627, 5629
.....	5646, 5776, 5845, 5847, 6162, 6815, 6817, 6896, 6941, 7029, 7154, 7156	7324, 7325, 7549, 7598, 7535, 7661, 7662, 7736, 7757, 7758, 7815, 7816
.....		7820, 7838, 7877
Community Safety .....		3457

Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	594, 2202
Health .....	2218
Human Settlements .....	392, 4554
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	407, 491
..... 715, 809, 961, 1029, 1032, 1047, 1048, 1050, 1068, 1203, 1326, 1456, 1794	
..... 2642, 2735, 2808, 2865, 2990, 3157, 3258, 3278, 3416, 3417, 3521, 3898	
..... 3952, 4006, 4680, 5303, 5306, 5309, 5431, 5434, 5437, 5458, 5467, 5605	
..... 5631, 5652, 5712, 5717, 5794, 5956, 5718, 6077, 6438, 6544, 6546, 6695	
..... 6696, 6817, 6898, 7031, 7132, 7133, 7160, 7302, 7323, 7548, 7587, 7736	
..... 7814, 7839, 7840, 7878, 7879, 7969	
Mobility .....	7277, 7279, 7566, 7597, 7636, 7638, 7821
Transport and Public Works ....	471, 536, 925, 1068, 1069, 1203, 4684, 5795, 5846
.....	5943, 6695

### **Wenger, M M –**

Community Safety .....	125, 616, 755, 756, 2419, 2492, 2493, 2875, 3070, 3253
.....	3257, 3384, 3667, 5610
Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	126, 297, 706
Education.....	297, 1023, 6532, 6533
Health .....	123, 698, 707, 1425, 1427, 2505, 2623
Human Settlements .....	1023, 1024
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	407, 491
.....	1036
Social Development.....	298
Transport and Public Works .....	699, 1323, 3888, 6532

### **Windvogel, R –**

Cultural Affairs and Sport.....	7176
Health .....	127, 128, 285, 289, 556, 557, 579, 673, 1086, 1181, 1304, 1413, 1414
.....	1415, 1474, 1475, 1696, 1747, 1810, 1905, 2051, 2107, 2166, 2295, 2766
.....	2779, 2888, 2904, 2921, 2922, 3015, 3061, 3062, 3247, 3292, 3294, 3315
.....	3652, 3750, 3926, 4059, 4092, 4159, 4160, 4180, 4238, 4337, 4342, 4515
.....	4551, 4552, 4583, 4601, 4947, 5281, 5625, 5724, 5772, 5774, 5856, 5881
.....	6062, 6064, 6105, 6131, 6169, 6259, 6435, 6555, 6567, 6568, 6571, 6960
.....	7033, 7161, 7173, 7174, 7361, 7365, 7374, 7437, 7482, 7503, 7544, 7545
.....	7578, 7795, 7892, 7897
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	5329
Premier .....	3922, 5859, 6101

### **Xego, M –**

Agriculture .....	2636
Community Safety .....	2075, 4894
Education.....	1466, 2365, 2374, 7723
Finance and Economic Opportunities .....	1850, 1894
Health .....	1448, 1728, 2107, 2588, 2657, 2888, 3030, 3044, 4021, 6105
Human Settlements .....	750, 1811, 4208, 4780
Local Government Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .....	2115
.....	7428
Mobility .....	6698, 7342, 7493
Premier .....	6767, 6934
Transport and Public Works .....	2452, 2512, 3970

## QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

<b>Allen, R I</b> .....	4800
<b>America, D</b> .....	504, 1900, 4027
<b>August, S N</b> .....	6484
<b>Baartman, D M</b> .....	678
<b>Bans, A P</b> .....	795, 7493, 7499
<b>Bosman, G</b> .....	507, 796, 1445, 2380
<b>Botha, L J</b> .....	1021, 1440, 2585, 7349
<b>Brinkhuis, G</b> .....	6873
<b>Christians, F C</b> .....	1016, 2378, 2580, 4213
<b>Herron, B N</b> .....	677, 1734, 1898, 4022
<b>Kaizer-Philander, W F</b> .....	4212, 7497
<b>Kama, M</b> .....	6874
<b>Mackenzie, R D</b> .....	4024, 6880, 6990
<b>Makamba-Botya</b> .....	3854
<b>Marais, P J</b> .....	4798, 7731
<b>Marran, P</b> .....	4927, 7346
<b>Maseko L M</b> .....	1901
<b>Mitchell, D G</b> .....	1825
<b>Mvimbi, L L</b> .....	1821, 7729
<b>Nkondlo, N D</b> .....	501, 4208
<b>Sayed, M K</b> .....	1439, 1442
<b>Van der Westhuizen, A P</b> .....	681, 3856, 6486
<b>Wenger, M M</b> .....	8080
<b>Xego, M</b> .....	6986