CABINET

The Premier ................................................................. Ms O H Maree (Zille)
Minister of Health ......................................................... Mr T L Botha
Minister of Agriculture .................................................. Mr H G van Rensburg
Minister of Transport and Public Works ............................. Mr R V Carlisle
Minister of Community Safety .......................... Mr D Plato
Minister of Finance, Economic Development
and Tourism ................................................................. Mr A R Winde
Minister of Social Development ............................... Mr A Fritz
Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs
and Development Planning ............................................. Mr A W Bredell
Minister of Human Settlements ................................. Mr B S Madikizela
Minister of Education ....................................................... Mr D A C Grant
Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport ....................... Dr I Meyer

OFFICE-BEARERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

Speaker ................................................................................. Mr T R Majola
Leader of Government Business ............................... Mr T L Botha
Deputy Speaker ................................................................. Mr P J C Pretorius
Leader of the Opposition ..................................................... Ms L Brown
Chief Whip : DA ............................................................... Ms A Rossouw
Chief Whip : Opposition ..................................................... Mr P Uys
Secretary ................................................................. Mr R Hindley
### MEMBERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

**PARTIES**

Democratic Alliance = DA  
African National Congress = ANC  
Congress of the People = COPE  
Independent Democrats = ID  
African Christian Democratic Party = ACDP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Party</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beerwinkel, Ms Carol Frances</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bevu, Ms Tozama Nomsa</td>
<td>COPE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botha, Theuns Louis</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bredell, Anton Wilhelm</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown, Ms Lynette</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlisle Robin Vincent</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figlan, Archibald Mzuvukile</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fritz, Albert Theo</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geyer, Helmar</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gopie, Ms Dorothea</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant, Donald Arthur Cardross</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hani, Ms Vuyiwe</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, Ms Jennifer Lorraine</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haskin, Grant Christopher Ronald</td>
<td>ACDP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne, Ms Cathlene</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lentit, Rodney Benjamin</td>
<td>ID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madikizela, Bonginkosi Success</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magaxa Khayalethu Elvis</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magwaza, Ms Ntombizodwa Pauline</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majola, Thbekile Richard</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, Ms Anroux Johanna Du Toit</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbalo, Ms Buyelwa Glenrose</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meyer, Ivan Henry</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncedana, Mbulelo</td>
<td>COPE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ozinsky, Max</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plato, Daniel</td>
<td>ID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretorius, Petrus Johannes Christiaan</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prins, Ms Ellen</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rossouw, Ms Aletta</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skwatsha, Mcebisi</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stali, Zandisile Christopher</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tingwe, Ms Millicent</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uys, Pierrè</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Rensburg, Hendrick Gerhardus</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Zyl, Ms Johanna Aletta</td>
<td>COPE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visser, Johannes Jacobus</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Von Brandis, Eugene Jeffrey</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walters, Michael Charles</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley, Mark Geoffry Edington</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winde, Alan Richard</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witbooi, Ms Joseline</td>
<td>ANC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zille, Ms Otta Helena</td>
<td>DA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PERMANENT DELEGATES TO
NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

Adams, Freddie ....................................................................................................................... ANC
Bekker, Jacobus Marthinus Geyser .......................................................................................... DA
De Beer, Onel ............................................................................................................................ COPE
De Villiers, Michael Jacobus Roland ......................................................................................... DA
Denis, Joseph ............................................................................................................................ DA
Ntwanambi, Ms Nosipho Dorothy ............................................................................................. ANC
INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS

Absence from SCOPA – Motion .................................................... 7772
Absence of student governance structures in Western Cape schools - Motion...... 8153
Absenteism in schools, reduction of – Motion .................................. 7886
Abuse against the Elderly – Motion ............................................ 6492
Abused Women and Children in Western Cape – Motion ....................... 687
Abuse of international principle of minimum force in
Western Cape – Motion ......................................................... 2651
Absence of members of executive from legislature – Motion ..................... 2926
Absence to Speaker, leave of – Motion ....................................... 4593
Acknowledgement to Supt Nolan, Capt Dicks and Const Abrahams, Atlantis
Motion .................................................................................. 1597
Actions by DA Councillor of Elsies River, Bertha Esbach – Motion ............ 1010
Activist Anton Frans, Anniversary of Death of – Motion ......................... 4701
AD Hoc Committee, Appointment of – Motion .................................. 4007
Ad hoc Committee:
Investigation into possible misleading of House by Minister .................... 103
Ad Hoc Committee – Motion..................................................... 2857
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner
– Debate ................................................................................ 911, 4797, 4808, 4815
Ad Hoc Committee, replacement of Mr E J von Brandis on – Motion ........ 832
Adult Education, Award to 79-Year-Old Du Noon Resident – Motion ........ 5157
Affordable Housing – Motion ................................................................ 4140
Africa Day – Motion ....................................................................... 2260
Afrika, Kenny: corruption charges – Motion ....................................... 8198
Afrikaans writers receive Honorary Award – Motion ................................ 6210
Agricultural Areas, Failure of Standing Committee to make Intervention
Uprising in – Motion ................................................................. 6629
Agricultural Industry, Game Farming declared – Motion .......................... 4098
Agri World Africa Established – Motion .......................................... 5866
Agri-Mega Group flower exhibition – Motion ...................................... 8016
Aid to storm-affected people – Motion ............................................. 8011
Alcohol and Drug abuse on Family system, Impact of – Motion .................. 362
Alcohol syndrome Campaign, SANCA Foetal – Motion ......................... 6203
Allegations against Eindhoven Primary School in Delft – Motion ............... 2703
Allocation of houses in Pelican Park housing project – Motion ................. 2612
Alternative approaches to BEE and development SMMEs – Motion .......... 2174
Amakhaya Ngoku Housing initiatives – Motion .................................... 785
Ambassador, Singer/Actress Cape Town Routes Unlimited – Motion ........ 5157
Ambulance Services and Response time, State of – Motion ....................... 749
Ammunition seized by police in Athlone – Motion .................................. 933
ANC Centenary Celebrations to Mark 100 years of Selfless Struggle
By people of South Africa – Motion ............................................... 4605
ANC Centenary Celebrations, Spending Taxpayers’ money on – Motion .... 4606
ANC Centenary – Motion ............................................................. 4936
ANC’s Conduct in Provincial Parliament – Motion ................................ 6200
ANC Government on Service Delivery, Negative impact of – Motion ........ 15
ANC Honoured, Sixth President of – Motion ..................................... 5865
ANC infrastructure/foreign direct investment intelligence report – Motion .. 7614
ANC’s Misperceptions with regards to Education in Cape – Motion ............ 5903
ANC in Municipal Election – Motion .......................................................... 3952
ANC in undermining Pillars of Democracy, role of – Motion ....................... 6574
ANCYL calls for service delivery protests – Motion .................................... 2861
ANC Youth League Congress , Failed – Motion ........................................ 4942
ANC, Veterans Honoured by – Motion .................................................. 5155
ANC wins by-election – Motion .............................................................. 4353
Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports ............................. 7, 8, 9, 17, 36, 70, 205, 239, 263, 354, 434, 526, 559, 595, 644, 677, 701, 715, 728, 746, 760, 858, 923, 963, 1003, 1025, 1066, 1082, 1126, 1193, 1240, 1279, 1349, 1394, 1463, 1580, 1601, 1646, 1729, 1795, 1885, 1968, 2159, 2196, 2248, 2279, 2324, 2360, 2389, 2393, 2430, 2468, 2504, 2511, 2541, 2549, 2599, 2601, 2634, 2642, 2685, 2691, 2711, 2736, 2784, 2798, 2845, 2849, 2874, 2915, 2962, 2970, 2981, 2994, 3299, 3317, 3318, 3383, 3384, 3413, 3416, 3428, 3437, 3455, 3491, 3503, 3563, 3755, 3615, 3755, 3918, 3919, 3922, 3933, 3975, 3979, 4032, 4117, 4118, 4124, 4145, 4203, 4204, 4327, 4341, 4377, 4424, 4467, 4474, 4494, 4495, 4528, 4582, 4636, 4640, 4653, 4655, 4670, 4684, 4733, 4928, 4976, 4997, 5093, 5115, 5136, 5174, 5276, 5574, 5638, 5695, 5758, 801, 5850, 5846, 5889, 5937, 6018, 6032, 6073, 6113, 6144, 6183, 6189, 6229, 6259, 6293, 6356, 6396, 6437, 6443, 6477, 6521, 6613, 6742, 6794, 6875, 6956, 6997, 7016, 7099, 7164, 7297, 7411, 7486, 7542, 7592, 7642, 7685, 7721, 7825, 7918, 7974, 8023, 8089, 8176, 8257, 8360, 8448, 8462
Annual one to one Day Fair – Motion .................................................. 6059
Annual National Assessment Papers – Motion ........................................ 6263
Anti-poverty strategy – Motion ............................................................. 2258
Apology (P C McKenzie) ................................................................. 968
Apology to Member Brown – Motion ................................................... 2570
Appointment of Ad Hoc Committee – Motion ....................................... 4593
Appointment of Jan-Jan Joubert - Motion .............................................. 4175
Appointment of sanitation team to look into open toilet saga – Motion ........ 4351
Appointment of temporary chairpersons – Motion ................................ 105
Archbishop Desmond Tutu: Medal of Freedom Award – Motion ................. 616
Arrest of councillor and closure of democratic space of councillors – Motion 3466
Arrogance of DA government with taxi strike – Motion .......................... 3467
Arthur Brown, J: suspended sentence – Motion ...................................... 7607
Ascension Day – Motion ................................................................. 7562
Assault on former mayor – Motion ...................................................... 4435
Athlone Stadium – Motion .................................................................. 4502
Astronomy Society, Hermanus - Motion ................................................ 4149
Atlantis integrated transport system – Motion .......................................... 2559
ATM Bomings – Motion ................................................................. 5907
Attacks by Premier on Constitution and South African Human Rights
Commission – Motion ................................................................. 2651
Attacks on poor communities by Metro Police – Motion .......................... 3446
Attitude of Speaker in staff meeting – Motion ........................................ 935
Audit reports not yet considered by SCOPA: debate – Motion .................. 1594
Baboon Management Contract – Motion .............................................. 537
Bafana Bafana, Support for – Motion .................................................. 307
Battle of Braamfontein, 14 May 2012 – Motion ....................................... 5842
Beaufort West and Ceres farm murders – Motion ............................................................. 1293
Behaviour Modification Programmes – Motion ........................................................... 6367
Behaviour of ANC in Swellendam – Motion ................................................................. 6569
Berg River Municipality, Sale of Land – Motion ............................................................ 4317

Bills:

Cape Town International Convention Centre Company Amendment Bill
 [B 10B - 2012] (Finalisation) .................................................................................. 7096

Intellectual Property Laws Amendment Bill [B 8B – 2010]
Rescinding of resolution ......................................................................................... 8191

Provincial Capital Fund Ordinance Repeal Bill [B 5-2012]
(Consideration and Finalisation) ................................................................. 6092

Rescinding of EFT Bill - Motion ............................................................................. 4941

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4 -2012] (2011/12 Financial Year) (Introduction and First Reading) ....................... 5160

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B4- 2012](2011/2012 Financial Year)
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................................................... 5274

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4 - 2012] (2011/2012 Financial Year) (Finalisation) ........................................ 5276

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B5 - 2013]( Introduction and first reading) ............................................................ 7164

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B5 - 2013]
(Introduction and First Reading) ........................................................................ 7164

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B5 - 2013]
(Consideration of principle) .............................................................................. 7461

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B5 - 2013]
(Finalisation) ..................................................................................................... 7465

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Introduction and First Reading ........................................................................... 1070
Consideration of principle .................................................................................. 1146
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................................... 1180
Vote 11 – Agriculture ....................................................................................... 1202
Vote 5 – Education .......................................................................................... 1215
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 1228
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ......................................................... 1242
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................................. 1256
Vote 7 – Social Development .......................................................................... 1294
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................................. 1305
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................................. 1317
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ......................... 1335
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................................................... 1350
Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................................. 1358
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ....................................................................... 1371
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................................................ 1388
Finalisation ....................................................................................................... 1391

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B9—2010]
(Introduction and First Reading) ...................................................................... 2970

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Introduction and First Reading) .................................................................... 4671
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ................................................................. 4797
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Debate on Vote 5 – Education) ............................................................... 4809
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ......................... 4815
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [Bill 8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ........................................ 4829
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [Bill 8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ........................................ 4839
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [Bill 8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................................. 4856
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ................................................................. 4866
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .................................................. 4875
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................. 4951
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ........... 4881
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 8 - Human Settlements) ............................................. 4893
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ......................................................... 4960
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) .................................................................................. 4974
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................................ 4904
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) .............................. 4912
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ................................................... 4919
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11-2012] (Introduction and First Reading) .............................................................. 6579
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 6639
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) ..................... 6686
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ..................................................... 6694
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .................................................................................................................. 6699
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) .................................................. 6707
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) .................................. 6713
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................................. 6719
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ................................................................. 6727
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 6737
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 6760
(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 6762
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 6773
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 6780
(Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 6787
(Consideration of Votes and Schedules)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 6788
(Finalisation)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013] .............................. 8301
(Introduction and First Reading)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 8384
(Consideration of Principle)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 8440
(Consideration of Votes and Schedules)
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] .............................. 8442
(Finalisation)
Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B 7–2009] ........................................... 2797
Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B7B—2009] ......................................... 2754
(Consideration and finalisation)
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 112
Consideration of principle
Vote 8 – Housing
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 166
Vote 8 – Local Government
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 211
Vote 1 – Premier
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 240
Vote 5 – Education
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 266
Vote 6 – Health
Vote 7 – Social Development
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 329
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 392
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 422
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 443
Vote 4 – Community Safety
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 482
Vote 11 – Agriculture
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 526
Consideration of Votes and Schedules
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] ..................................................... 526
Finalisation
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1571
Introduction and First Reading
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1648
Second Reading
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1690
Vote 4 – Community Safety
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1746
Vote 1 – Premier
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1770
Vote 7 – Social Development
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1802
Vote 14 – Local Government
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1830
Vote 8 – Housing
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1858
Vote 5 – Education
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1895
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] ......................................................... 1913
Vote 6 – Health
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3] (Consideration of Principle) ........................................... 4786
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011] (Introduction and First Reading) ......................................... 3416
Consideration of principle .................................................. 3519
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .................................................. 3553
Vote 14 – Local Government .................................................. 3564
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................ 3590
Vote 11 – Agriculture .......................................................... 3618
Vote 7 – Social Development .................................................. 3636
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................ 3657
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................. 3677
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................... 3703
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ....................... 3730
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........... 3772
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................... 3797
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................... 3852
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ...................................... 3881
Consideration of Vote and Schedules ...................................... 3917
Finalisation ........................................................................... 3918
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2012] (Introduction and First Reading) ......................................... 5118
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ..................................................... 5303
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .................................................... 5339
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) .................................................. 5378
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................. 5401
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ....................... 5427
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) ................................. 5462
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 - Cultural Affairs and Spot) ......................... 5485
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 9 – Health) .................................................... 5519
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – (Provincial Parliament) ................................. 5552
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ................................. 5575
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ............................................. 5614
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ........................................................................ 5630
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .............................................................................. 5642
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ................................................................. 5695
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................. 5731
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Finalisation) ............................................................................................................. 5736
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Introduction And First Reading) .............................................................................. 7000
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) .................................................................................... 7061
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ..................................................................................... 7101
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ................................................................. 7128
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ........................................ 7143
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ................................................................. 7164
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............................................................ 7196
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ................................................................. 7223
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) .................................................... 7248
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ....................... 7279
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 6 - Health) ....................................................................................... 7299
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013 ] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 7334
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................................. 7361
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ................................................................. 7385
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 – Education) ..................................................................................... 7412
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ................................................................. 7435
Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ................................................................. 7461
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ............................................................................................................. 7464
Western Cape Biosphere Reserves Bill [B5 - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) .......................................................... 4942
Western Cape Community Safety Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ..................................................................................................... 7464
Western Cape District Health Councils Bill [B6B—2010] (Consideration and Finalisation) ........................................ 2944
Western Cape District Health Councils Bill [B6B—2013] (Finalisation) ................................................................. 7996
Western Cape Eighteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6 – 2013] (Introduction and First Reading) .......... 7015
Western Cape Eighteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B 4 – 2013] (Consideration) .................................. 7860
Western Cape Eighteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B 4 – 2013] (Finalisation) ........................................ 7862
Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill [B7-2012] (Consideration and finalisation) ......................... 6677
Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency Amendment Bill [B 1 – 2013] (Finalisation) ......................... 7856
Western Cape Irregular Expenditure Bill [B4 – 2009] Finalisation ................................................................. 643
Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill [B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) .......... 3982
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1-2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) .......................................................... 4165
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1-2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) .......................................................... 4165
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012] (Consideration and finalisation) .......................................................... 5783
Western Cape Land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] ................................................... 3990
Western Cape Land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] (Resumption of Consideration and Finalisation) .................... 4032
Western Cape Membership of the Western Cape Economic Development Partnership Bill [B8 – 2013] (Consideration and Finalisation) 8442
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill [B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) .......... 4943
Western Cape Parliamentary Service and Finance Management Bill (Consideration and Finalisation) .............. 1347
Western Cape Problem Animal Control Ordinance Repeal Bill [B9 – 2008] Finalisation ........................................ 643
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012] (Consideration and Finalisation) ............... 6673
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009] Introduction and First Reading .......... 1041
Western Cape Seventeenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B 3 – 2013] ..................................................... 7859,
       7860
Western Cape Transport Infrastructure Bill [B9 - 2012] (Finalisation) .............................................................. 7095
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B3 – 2009] Finalisation .............................................................. 643
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2009]
  Introduction and First Reading .................................................. 2467
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2-2012]
  (Introduction and First Reading) .................................................. 5337
Western Cape Use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill
  [B4-2010] – (Finalisation) ............................................................. 4014
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]
  Consideration ............................................................................ 2502
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]
  Finalisation .................................................................................. 2503
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................ 5736
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
  (Finalisation) .............................................................................. 5742
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B7 – 2013]
  (Introduction and First Reading) ..................................................... 7996
  (Consideration and Finalisation) ................................................... 8195
  (Consideration of Principle) .......................................................... 8246
Biko, Steve Bantu, Commemoration of – Motion ............................. 6205, 8058
Birthday wishes to Ms C F Beerwinkle – Motion ............................. 1598
Birthday wishes to Premier – Motion ................................................ 1598
Birthday in the House, Marais, Du Toit A (J J Visser) - Motion ........ 4936
Bishop Lavis Drug Raid by SAPS – Motion ...................................... 7521
Bishop Lavis: Evictions – Motion .................................................... 8006
Bitou Mayor Booyzen lived on golf estate at ratepayers’ expense – Motion 4486
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ............... 2571
Bitou Municipality, Problems at – Motion ....................................... 591
Bitou Municipality, Service Hikes in – Motion ................................. 5916
Blikkiesdorp described as concentration camp – Motion ................. 4487
Bo-Kaap residents: lack of tourists – Motion .................................... 8324
Boland Summer Festival – Motion ................................................... 5729
Botrivier, Service Delivery in - Motion ............................................. 5914
Boston USA, World Floral Art Show in – Motion ............................ 4146
Breakthrough in Tuberculosis Treatment ........................................ 5985
Bredasdorp: skills development project – Motion ............................ 7523
Bribery at licence testing centres – Motion ...................................... 7669
Brummer, Johan – Motion ............................................................... 6089
Brutal and deadly attacks on policemen and women – Motion .......... 833
Bucket system: statement by Mayor of Cape Town – Motion .......... 7610
Budget for 2010/2011, Fifth Financial Year not Spent for - Motion .... 4101
Bulk water supply – Motion ........................................................... 3445
Bully tactics and roguish force by Cape Town Metro Police – motion 2701
Burglary and vandalism of state-owned property – Motion ............. 2175
Bus Accident: Enyonkeni Palace – Motion ....................................... 8065
Bus accident in Kloofnek Road, Senior Citizens in – Motion .......... 750
Bus Accident victims in KwaZulu-Natal – Motion ........................... 7515
Business of House – Motion ........................................................... 2995
By-Election in Ward 7, Hessequa – Motion .................................... 7509
Cableway, Table Mountain Aerial - Motion ................................... 4148
Cadre deployment: DA and ID - Motion .......................................... 7558
Call on Premier Zille, Replace of MEC for Community Safety – Motion 5845
Cape Town as second best destination in Africa and Middle East – Motion ........................................ 2372
Cape Town as South Africa's Silicon Valley – Motion ................................................................. 833
Cape Town, child murders and sex abuse in – Motion ............................................................... 4484
Cape Town Doctor Resuscitates Boy After Near-Drowning – Motion ........................................ 6634
Cape Town Favourite Tourist City – Motion ............................................................................. 6500
Cape Town Motorist Hazel Souma – Motion ............................................................................ 5273
Cape Town Partnership, Prof Ndebele Appointed as Chairperson of – Motion ...................... 5913
Cape Town Routs, Unlimited into Wesgro Incorporation of – Motion ........................................ 5147
Cape Town Stadium – motion .................................................................................................... 2770
Cape Town Stadium, construction of – Motion ....................................................................... 2351
Cape Town Tourism Board, New Chair of – Motion ................................................................. 6411
Carlisle, R V: contribution to struggle against apartheid – Motion ........................................... 7515
Car Magazine Award for Safely Home Programme – Motion ...................................................... 1596
Casino: establishment of second casino in Metropole – Motion ............................................... 2368
Cavellereia Primary School (C F Beerwinkel) ........................................................................... 5153
Cederberg: lack of action against ANC councillors – Motion ................................................... 7704
Cekiso, Mirriam Missing – Motion ............................................................................................ 6063
Celebration of Eid-Al-Adha – Motion ....................................................................................... 6369
Celebration of Diwali – Festival of Lights – Motion .................................................................. 6369
Celebrations of Life, Third Centenary of Adam Kok (Motion) ..................................................... 4115
Celebration of Women’s Month 2012 – Motion ....................................................................... 6063
Census 2011 on the Western Cape, Impact of – Motion ........................................................... 6403
Central Karoo District municipality, Disaster Risk Management and Emergency Service in (Motion) .................................................................................................................................................. 4100
Chairperson of Standing Committee on Community Safety: Incompetence – Motion .......... 657
Chairperson of Standing Committee of Finance, Censuring of – Motion ............................ 589
Changing of Culture of Our People – Motion ............................................................................. 6330
Chapman's Peak Rockfall – Motion ........................................................................................... 6316
Chestnut Clinic in Belhar, situation at – Motion ......................................................................... 981
Child-headed households, plight of – Motion ............................................................................. 2299
Child Justice Act: Diversions and alternative sentencing – Motion ........................................... 4410
Children and Youth Commemorations ...................................................................................... 5871
Children, conditions under which children grow up – Motion ............................................. 2304
Children’s Act, implementation of – Motion ............................................................................. 2370
Children on Cape Flats, Massacre of– Motion ........................................................................... 6366
Chronic Dispensing Contractor – Motion .................................................................................... 6083
Chronic Medicine, Chaos with dispensing of – Motion ............................................................. 5859
Chronic Medicine, Incorrect labelling of – Motion ...................................................................... 5873
City by Laws – Motion ................................................................................................................ 5983
City council: official demoted – Motion ................................................................. 2344
City of Cape Town, Awarding of performance bonuses in – Motion ....................... 2258
City Of Cape Town: Crisis levels in sanitation situation – Motion .............................. 4417
City of Cape Town: Health Plan on HIV and TB – Motion ........................................ 933
City of Cape Town: housing crisis – Motion ......................................................... 8323
City of Cape Town, implications of growth of – Motion ........................................... 932
City of Cape Town, IRT System in – Motion ............................................................ 934
City of Cape Town, Mycity Vehicle operation Companies Upset – Motion .................. 6575
City of Cape Town:
Claims by DA that is Pro-Poor - Motion ................................................................. 6187
Climate Change, Cape Town Preparedness for – Motion ........................................... 4693
Clinics, Shocking state of - Motion ......................................................................... 4173
Clipper Around the World Yacht Race – Motion ...................................................... 8163
Closing ...................................................................................................................... 1391, 8446
Closing down of democratic space – Motion ............................................................ 2925
Closure of drug rehabilitation centres – Motion ....................................................... 2814
Closure of Du Noon Child Welfare Office – Motion ................................................. 6409
Closure of Nongovernmental Organisations – Motion .............................................. 5858
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apele School AND Implications thereof – Matter of Public Importance ................................................................. 5742
Closure or amalgamation of schools – Motion ....................................................... 3465
Closure of 27 Schools – Motion .............................................................................. 6181
Clothing Sector, Strike in – Motion .......................................................................... 783
Commemoration of fifty years unity in Africa – Motion .............................................. 7664
Commendation to national government for disaster alleviation – Motion ................. 2708
Committee Meetings, Hessequa Mayoral – Motion ................................................... 4694
Community housing project: political interference – Motion ................................... 7604
Computer facilities at schools in the Western Cape – Motion .................................... 7557
Condemnation of rape and murder: gay community – Motion .................................. 7885
Condition of Flats in Leonsdale: Terrible – Motion ................................................... 2406
Condolence – Motions:
Abrahams, Veronica (V Hani) .................................................................................. 8012
Adrianse, Isaiah (D Gopie) ..................................................................................... 8330
Albertus, Ms Ulla (A J D Marais) ........................................................................... 938
Alexander, Neville (B G Mbalo) ............................................................................... 6175
Amantengelo, Dala Xolo (M Tingwe) ..................................................................... 4503
Arendse, Donigo Family of (J L Hartnick) ............................................................... 6317
Asmal, Kader (T N Bevu) ....................................................................................... 3978
Asmal, Kader (P W Cupido) .................................................................................... 3979
Asmal, Kader (A T Fritz) ......................................................................................... 3978
Asmal, Kader (Z C Stali) ......................................................................................... 3977
Asmal, Kader (The Chief Whip) (DA) ...................................................................... 3977
Banda, Const. Xolisa (M E G Wiley) ........................................................................ 5151
Banisi, Phumzile (MGE Wiley) ................................................................................ 7661
Bazolo, Waya (M Tingwe) ....................................................................................... 4489
Beaufort West taxi victims (A Rossouw) .................................................................. 2705
Bekker, Suna (J J Visser) ......................................................................................... 4141
Beukes, Annamarie (J Witbooi) ................................................................................ 7609
Beyleveldt, Theo (M C Walters) ............................................................................... 4107
Beyleveldt, Theo(S Esau) ......................................................................................... 4107
Blecher, Ian (C F Beerwinkel) ................................................................. 8013
Blignaut, Ashley (A J Du Toit Marais) ................................................... 4181
Bloemers, Ashley (R B Lentit) .............................................................. 4697
Booi, Chuma (B G Mbalo) ................................................................. 8211
Boysens, Corne (J J Visser) ................................................................. 7051
Brady, Nazario (M C Walters) ............................................................... 694
Bredenhand, Jan-Frederick (E H Eloff) .................................................... 2817
Brutal Killings in SA during last 14 Days (M G E Wiley) .................................. 6084
Bus accident in Hex River Pass (E H Eloff) ............................................... 2228
Buys, Shuan (N P Magwaza) ................................................................. 7517
Cachalia, Amina (K E Magaxa) ............................................................. 7058
Carlisle, R Minister (Ms A Rossouw) ....................................................... 8154
Chabaku, Motlalepula (M Skwatsha) ....................................................... 5845
Charles, Shameega in Doha mall Fire (M Tingwe) ....................................... 5862
Charles, Shamiela death in Qatar Mall fire (R B Lentit) .................................. 5869
City of Boston, USA : bomb blast (J J Visser) ............................................. 7505
Cloete Family (RB Lentit) .............................................................. 7702
Cups and Saucers (M Tingwe) ............................................................... 6072
Cyclist killed on Main Road St James (M G E WIlley) ................................ 6371
Damon, Manie (NP Magwaza) .............................................................. 7702
Daniels, Michael (J J Visser) ................................................................. 6494
Daniels, Wendel (J Witbooi) ................................................................. 7884
Daries, A K (V Hani) ........................................................................ 8327
Dauth, Joe (A Rossouw) ...................................................................... 8210
Davids, Goliath (J L Hartnick) ............................................................... 6206
Davids, Mr A A (E H Eloff) ................................................................. 1597
Death of People after Collision of taxi and truck (M Skwatsha) ......................... 2480
Death of two boys from George gymnasium (C F Beerwinkel) ......................... 2660
Death of Western Cape learners (C F Beerwinkel) .......................................... 3449
Deaths in shack fires in Kleinmond (J L Hartnick) ........................................... 2483
Dely, Frans (J Witbooi) ....................................................................... 4324
Depha, Lungisa (M G E Wiley) ............................................................. 7879
Deputy Speaker, Mother of (J J Visser) .................................................... 786
De Villiers, Attie (A Rossouw) ............................................................... 7506
Dewani, Anni (P C McKenzie) ............................................................... 2933
Dlali, Mthetheleli David (M Skwatsha) ...................................................... 5989
D’Oliveira, Basil (J Witbooi) .................................................................. 4699
Dryer, Charles (J J Visser) ..................................................................... 6324
Dudley, Mr R (Y Gabru) ...................................................................... 38
Duncan, Sheena (L Brown) ................................................................. 2227
Du Toit, Jan (M G E Wiley) ................................................................. 2856
Ellis Rudi (M C Walters) ..................................................................... 4352
Emeran, Umar in Doha mall Fire (M Tingwe) ............................................ 5862
Endly, Paul Macassar Veterans (J Witbooi) ............................................... 5156
Espafrika (R B Lentit) ......................................................................... 3765
Family of five-year-old who drowned at a primary school
 in Kensington (V Hani) ........................................................................ 2659
Families in Western Cape and Elsewhere (M G E Wiley) ................................. 6264
Family of seven and baby (C F Beerwinkel) ............................................. 1746
Feni, Mihlali (B G Mbalo) ..................................................................... 7565
Firmani, MR Duane (G C Haskin) .......................................................... 6261
Ford, Kelly-Jade (M Tingwe) ................................................................. 6631
Florence, Brent (A J D Marais) ............................................................. 2778
Florence, Brent (Z C Stali) ................................................................. 2819
Fourie, Sorette (J J Visser) ................................................................. 2776
Francken, Lulu (E H Eloff) ................................................................. 2570
Gaffney, Brian (Z C Stali) ................................................................. 4113
Galant, Jacoba (N P Magwaza) ......................................................... 2177
Galeta, Idris (V Hani) .................................................................. 2939
Gerwel, Jakes (R B Lentit) ................................................................. 6630
Gillwald, Cheryl (M Skwatsha) ......................................................... 2407
Gogo, Ntobeko (RB Lentit) ............................................................... 7701
Gorvalla, Pat: Dr (L Brown) ............................................................. 8202
Gresak, Michael (C Labuschagne) .................................................. 6333
Griepenouw, Susanna (J L Hartnick) ............................................. 4009
Guthrie, Mark (M C Walters) ............................................................ 6457
Gxagxisa-Mpetsheni, Nozipho (C F Beerwinkel) ......................... 8329
Gxowa, Mamma Bertha (B G Mbalo) ............................................... 2938
Haas, Ashley (A J D Marais) ............................................................. 2778
Haas, Ashley (Z C Stali) ................................................................. 2819
Hale, Corne (P W Cupido) ............................................................... 4777
Hangana, Nomatyala (V Hani) ........................................................ 6067
Hendricks, Danny (A J Du Toit Marais) .......................................... 6086
Hendricks, Ann (A J Du Toit Marais) ............................................... 6086
Hendricks, Megan (J L Hartnick) ..................................................... 7565
Hex River Pass Bus Accident (E J Von Brandis) ......................... 7048
Hoop, Jeremy (M G E Wiley) .......................................................... 8010
Hoorn, Cedrico (M G E Wiley) ......................................................... 7563
Hopkins, Marianne (A Rossouw) .................................................... 2620
Hörstmann, Fritz (J J Visser) ............................................................ 660
Howa, Hassan (A M Figlan) ........................................................... 7049
Hugo, Doreen (V Hani) ................................................................. 4008
Hout Bay Boat Tragedy (M G E Wiley) .......................................... 6320
Hayes, Carika (J L Hartnick) ............................................................ 6337
Ipoyo, Aspro (M Tingwe) ............................................................... 5994
Isaacs, Sedick (M Ozinsky) ............................................................ 6371
Isaacs, Sulaiman (L Brown) ........................................................... 8326
Issel, Johnny (N P Magwaza) ......................................................... 3450
Jacobs, Arthur (M Ozinsky) ............................................................ 5990
Jacobs, Francois (M G E Wiley) ...................................................... 7051
Jack, Neville Michael – (C F Beerwinkel) ...................................... 4558
Jacobs, Harold (M C Walters) ........................................................ 3515
Jacobs, Mr M (M G E Wiley) .......................................................... 837
Jacobs, Shaquille (E H Eloff) ......................................................... 3469
Jansen, Lodewy (N P Magwaza) ..................................................... 2177
January, Joseph (M Skwatsha) ....................................................... 6408
Jenner, Ms Katrina (J L Hartnick) ................................................... 1036
Johnson, Johnny (P C McKenzie) .................................................. 2654
Jordaan, Dale (E H Eloff) .............................................................. 3469
Jordaan, Elsa Husband of (J J Visser) 3473 .................................... 4443
Jordaan, Mr Paul (J L Hartnick) .................................................... 7563
Joubert, Neil (M C Walters) ................................................................. 8014
Julies, Portia (E Prins) .................................................................... 8161
Julies, Ryan (E Prins) .................................................................... 8161
Kadalie, Fenner (A J Du Toit Marias) ........................................... 4111
Kakaza, Leslie (C F Beerwinkel) .................................................. 4112
Kanana, Themb (E Prins) .............................................................. 5992
Kasrils, Eleanor (M Skwatsha) ...................................................... 1011
Kayamandi Fire, Children Die (V Hani) ....................................... 4780
Kazi, Mohammed (A J Du Toit Marias) ........................................ 6060
Khumalo, Alfred (A J Du Toit Marias) .......................................... 6372
Kimvango, Andy (N P Magwaza) ................................................ 4940
Kirkpatrick, Ian (J J Visser) ........................................................... 6576
Klaasen, Cllr Kevin (J J Visser) ...................................................... 107
Klein, Tom (P W Cupido) ............................................................... 2479
Kolisile, N’Kosiphendule (B G Mbalo) ......................................... 7775
Komba, Sgt. Charles (H P Geyer) .................................................. 660
Komphela, SGT Thumelephi (M G E Wiley) ............................... 4937
Koopan, Allan (J L Hartnick) ......................................................... 6337
Kotze, Pen (M C Walters) .............................................................. 2408
Kotze, Thelana (C Labuschagne) .................................................. 6204
Langa Pius (H P Geyer) ................................................................. 7774
Le Fleur, Jan (H P Geyer) ............................................................... 7883
Le Roux, Dawie (A Rossouw) ....................................................... 8327
Level Crossing Accident, Death of two (P Mckenzie) ................. 5869
Lewis, Jordan (G C R Haskin) ...................................................... 7507
Linkin Park Concert Death (P Uys) .............................................. 6452
Lithemba Loli (M Tingwe) ............................................................. 787
Lott, Deon (E J von Brandis) ......................................................... 7508
Lottering, Norma (D D Gopie) ...................................................... 7880
Louw, Fadiel (D Gopie) ................................................................. 8061
Lunguza, Ntombizodwa (B G Mbalo) .......................................... 6496
Lyanga, Sis (M Tingwe) ................................................................. 7571
Mack, Novello (V Hani) ................................................................. 3515
Madikwa, Nomvelo "Rayi" (M Skwatsha) .................................... 617
Madigage, Thomas (J Witbooi) ................................................... 6372
Madinga, Lulama (E J von Brandis) ............................................. 1037
Mafikeng, Mama Elizabeth “Rocky” (P M Jacobs) ....................... 105
Mafu Linga (C Labuschagne) ....................................................... 3767
Maitie, Tebogo (L Brown) ............................................................. 8207
Makeleni, Mavis (B G Mbalo) ....................................................... 7054
Makhwelo, Anele (M G E Wiley) .................................................. 4488
Makhwenhwa, Moses (V Hani) ..................................................... 7881
Malan, Ms Marie (E Prins) ........................................................... 2179
Malindi, Lettie (N P Magwaza) .................................................... 2376
Mandulo, Nokulamla – (T R Majola) .......................................... 4176
Mantashe, Madolwana and Cilliers, Messrs (T N Bevu) .......... 1294
Manual Jarryd (J L Hartnick) ....................................................... 7565
Manuel, Ashleya (M Ozinsky) ...................................................... 7777
Manuel, Caitlyn (M Ozinsky) ....................................................... 7777
Manuel, Kegan (M Ozinsky) ....................................................... 7777
Maqhetsheba, Anathi (H P Geyer) ................................................ 937
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maqubela, Patrick (Y Gabru)</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais Allister (MC Walters)</td>
<td>6207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark, Mr Joe (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>4695</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marks, Solly (Du Toit Marais)</td>
<td>6375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maroem, Mr E C, (A Rossouw)</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Martin, Enrico (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td>7618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matthews, Joe (V Hani)</td>
<td>2522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maxenza, Const Daniel (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbethe, Malizole (M Tingwe)</td>
<td>6068</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbiko, Ms Neti (M Ncedana)</td>
<td>1040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbulawa, Ms Bukelwa (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>4561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mdilalo, Bafundi (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>7879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meer, Ms Fatima (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>1643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meintjies, Frits and Berno (A Rossouw)</td>
<td>6320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meiring, Hannes (H P Geyer)</td>
<td>2178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member Nyanda, Florence (Z C Stali)</td>
<td>5779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mfenku, Ayanda (M Tingwe)</td>
<td>7882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mgobozi, Zakhele Crosby (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>3454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mgojo, Rev(M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>6182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mhlambeni, Annie (E Prins)</td>
<td>8020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michaels, Loveline (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>6578</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mills, John Atta (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>5988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minister Madikizela’s family (J J Visser)</td>
<td>2706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minister van Rensburg, Department on Publication of Agricultural Dictionary (M C Walters)</td>
<td>5156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mjongile, Songezo (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>6317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mkhiza, Gavin (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>7055</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mkunqana, Simphiwe (M Skatsha)</td>
<td>6324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mhlanga, Lydia (N P Magwaza)</td>
<td>5272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mntini, Thabani (C Lavuschagne)</td>
<td>6371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monroe, Rhoda (J Witbooi)</td>
<td>7509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morris, Christian (B G Mbalo)</td>
<td>8011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moos, Hayley Anne (N P Magwaza)</td>
<td>7517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moos, Loretta (N P Magwaza)</td>
<td>7517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses, Warrent Officer Douglas (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>6368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother of Ms C Labuschagne, passing of (A J D Marais)</td>
<td>2124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mpolweni, Sizwe (V Hani)</td>
<td>8206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mputing, Mr W (N P Magwaza)</td>
<td>909</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mqweni, Uwiwe (M Tingwe)</td>
<td>7571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mushrooms (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>6269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Myethu, Themba (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>6406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mzingelwa, Uwiwe (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td>7054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naidoo, Mr Vincent (P C McKenzie)</td>
<td>751</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namzi, Luthando (M Tingwe)</td>
<td>7663</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Mens’s Hockey Team (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>5783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncedana, Mr V (T N Bevu)</td>
<td>1645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncube, Bernard (L Brown)</td>
<td>6174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ndayi, Mr (T N Bevu)</td>
<td>4422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ndleni, Bongile (B G Mbalo)</td>
<td>6570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ndziba, Ngconde (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Nel, F B B, Van Lill, M M E and Eloff, J M, Cycle accident victims
(E J von Brandis) ....................................... 1594
Nenzani, Councillor (M Tingwe) ........................................ 5990
Ngcongca-Mgoboz, Phumlala (M Tingwe) ............................... 7893
Ngcukana, Ezra (M Skwatsha) ........................................... 2407
 Ngozi, Mr M M (N P Magwaza) .................................... 838
 Ngwendo, Mr Eric (V Hani) ............................................ 6319
 Nkanisa, Mathsonke (J J Visser) ...................................... 4113
 Nkosi, Lewis (R V Carlilse) ............................................ 2614
 Nokhalywa, Agnes (M Skwatsha) .................................... 8203
 Nonzwana, Ntombizone (T N Bevu) ................................ 908
 November, Johan (A J Du Toit Marais) ........................... 6086
Nsenga-Banza, Esther (J L Hartnick) .................................. 7616
Ntabeni, Babalwa (M Tingwe) ........................................ 7059
Ntozini, Nobantu “Vicky” (E J Von Brandis) ....................... 6634
Ntunja, Mzuvukile (M Skwatsha) ..................................... 8208
 Nyalela, Samkelo (Z C Stali) .......................................... 8167
 Nzo, Mama Regina (V Hani) ........................................ 4439
 Olifant, Danny (L Brown) .............................................. 6407
 Oman, Imran death in Qatw Mall fire (R B Lenti) ............. 5869
Padayachee, Minister Roy (Z C Stali) ................................. 5779
 Papenfus, Rufus (H P Geyer) ........................................ 6416
 Parker, Allie (D Gopie) ................................................. 7508
 Passing on of Mother of Nondialiseko Makanda (V Hani) .... 2412
 Peterson, Vernie (Z C Stali) ............................................ 3453
 People involved in car crash (K A Mqulwana) .................. 983
 People killed in fire in Lingelethu, Khayelitsha (M Tingwe) .. 2463
 People of Japan (L Brown) ............................................. 3470
 Petersen, Colin ........................................................ 6068
 Peterson, Rafeeq (M Ozinsky) ........................................ 6451
 Pick, Dave (V Hani) ................................................... 3617
 Pienaar, Louis (J J Visser) ............................................. 6454
 Pietersen, Moegamat (M Tingwe) .................................... 6498
 Pheiffer, John (L E Magaxa) ......................................... 6322
 Pheiffer, Neville (J Witbooi) ......................................... 6084
 Police Officers killed and wounded in Philippi
(M G E Wiley) ................................................................ 8155
Portland, Monique (M G E Wiley) ...................................... 8010
Price, Kevin (M G E Wiley) ............................................. 4142
Public Killed in N2 Protest Action (H P Geyer) .................... 6061
Raad, Rina (A J Du Toit Marias) ...................................... 5843
Rape victim from darling (P C McKenzie) ......................... 2929
Residents who died in fire at Rusthof (J J Visser) ............. 217
Rhenendal Area, School Bus Accident .............................. 4319
Road Accident, Passengers death of (M Ncedana) ............ 5988
Road Disaster near Lainsburg Claims Nineteen Victims
(Z C Stali) ..................................................................... 4702
Rooi, Katriene Kassie (J Witbooi) .................................... 5301
Roux, Koos (E J von Brandis) .......................................... 7614
Schmidt, Cobus (H P Geyer) ........................................... 1039
Scholtz, Maxi (P C McKenzie) ....................................... 1891
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vuba, Thobeka</td>
<td>1595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims of taxi accident</td>
<td>4559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T R Majola)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims of recent horror</td>
<td>4560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>crashes (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims of disaster</td>
<td>2231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(K Magaxa)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims killed in Gang</td>
<td>2178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Zyl, Pearl</td>
<td>7565</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Rensburg, Erin (H P Geyer)</td>
<td>6375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Nieker, Dr Theresa (J J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visser)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Heerden, Tim (M G E</td>
<td>6317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA After Superstorm Sandy</td>
<td>2783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(J J Visser)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tyibilika, Solly (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>6319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tolo, Bishop Jack (J A Van Zyl)</td>
<td>8012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobias, Dr Phillip (M G E</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solomon, Imam Gassan (Y Gabru)</td>
<td>983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solomon, Keelan (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>7563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solomons, Naeem (E Prins)</td>
<td>8161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sono, Butana Victor (V Hani)</td>
<td>4442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stemmet, Adnaan (J Witbooi)</td>
<td>2570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stevenson, Mrs P C Mckenzie</td>
<td>5993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student, Dies after fatal</td>
<td>5984</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>stabbing in Kasselsvlei</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(R B Lentil)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swail, Lee-Ann (M Tingwe)</td>
<td>6631</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swanson-Jacobs, Jean (L Brown)</td>
<td>7774</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swart, Sandra (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>5992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taljaard, Francois (M C</td>
<td>6207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walters)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taljaard, Louis(M C Walters)</td>
<td>6207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thetani, Dumile (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>7775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tilikana, Bonelwa (A J D</td>
<td>3448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ting Ting Masanga (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Titus, Lynda (A Rossouw)</td>
<td>8013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Titus, Sergius (M C Walters)</td>
<td>6207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobias, Dr Phillip (M G E</td>
<td>5909</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tolo, Bishop Jack (J A Van Zyl)</td>
<td>4323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tragic and fatal hit-and-run</td>
<td>3471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accident in Tafelsig (E J von</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brandis)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tyibilika, Solly (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>4698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA After Superstorm Sandy</td>
<td>6414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(J J Visser)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uys, Theunis (L Brown)</td>
<td>6268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Heerden, Tim (M G E</td>
<td>4326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Niekerk, Dr Theresa (J J</td>
<td>659</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visser)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Rensburg, Erin (H P Geyer)</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Rooyen, Gert (N P Magwaza)</td>
<td>2177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Zyl, Pearl (A J Du Toit</td>
<td>8012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims killed in Gang</td>
<td>6323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims of disaster (K Magaxa)</td>
<td>7662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims of recent horror</td>
<td>2706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>crashes (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims of taxi accident</td>
<td>985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T R Majola)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vuba, Thobeka</td>
<td>4937</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

-C F Beerwinkel-
Vollenhoven, Aunt Tatie (E Prins) .......................................................... 6260
Williams, Annie (P C Mckenzie) ............................................................... 6498
Williams, Annetjie (A J Du Toit Marais) .................................................. 6457
27th Anniversary of Treacherous Trojan Horse Tragedy .............................. 6325
Witbooi, Melvin (J Witbooi) ................................................................... 4607
Woodburn, Lambert (M G E Wiley) .........................................................
Woodman, Wesley (D Gopie) .................................................................... 7513
Yengo, Landle Samuel (M G E Wiley) ....................................................... 7879
Young People die in Car Accident (A Rossouw) ........................................ 4779
Conduct towards women MPPS – Motion ..................................................... 607
Confusion caused by MEC Grant’s announcement – Motion ..................... 2612
Congratualtions / Wishes – Motions:
Abrahams, Irafaan (M Tingwe) ................................................................. 4493
ABS A Cape Epic Mountain Cycle Race (M G E Wiley) ............................ 8332
Ackerman, Raymond (E H Eloff) ............................................................ 4504
Adams, Saleigh Dr (AJ Du Toit) ............................................................... 7706
Adonis, Junain (C Labuschagne) .............................................................. 8208
Agulhas, Tiffany (J J Visser) ................................................................... 6452
Albertyn, Pierre (E H Eloff) ..................................................................... 3772
All Municipalites (R B Lentit ) .................................................................. 5841
Agenton, Dr Kelly of UCT (J Witbooi) ...................................................... 2657
Ajax (P C Mckenzie) ................................................................................. 5996
Ajax Cape Town (A J D Marais) ............................................................... 3511
Ajax Cape Town under-17 soccer team (R B Lentit) ................................... 4443
Alberts, Deon (A J D Marais) ................................................................... 2935
Amsterdam, Sasha-Lee (J L Hartnick) ...................................................... 4013
ANC (L Brown) ....................................................................................... 6179
Annual Travel and Leisure Smitty award (EJ von Brandis) ....................... 7665
Appointment of CEO to Cape Town Tourism (EJ von Brandis) ............... 7663
Appolis, Hywil (C Labuschagne) ............................................................... 8208
Arabella Hotel and Spa (E J Von Brandis) ................................................. 6332
Artscape Management (R B Lentit) .......................................................... 4116
Bafana Bafana (P M Jacobs) ................................................................... 143
Bafana Bafana (J L Hartnick) ................................................................. 362, 2856
Bafana Bafana (M Skwatsha) .................................................................. 694, 2568
Bafana Bafana (Z C Stali) ....................................................................... 2779, 3766
Bafana Bafana (E H Eloff) ..................................................................... 4148
Bam, Warren (J J Visser) ........................................................................ 8212
Bantjies, Benjan (E H Eloff) ................................................................... 3770
Barkai,Ram (M G E Wiley) (G C R Haskin) ............................................. 8020, 8164
Barnard, Mr Jimmy (A Rossouw) .............................................................. 4605
Bengu, Knowledge ( E J von Brandis) ...................................................... 7514
Belgravia High School (Y Gabru) ............................................................ 610
Bernstein, Ann (J J Visser) ..................................................................... 5730
Beukman, Erika (E H Eloff) .................................................................... 3768
Bhemgee, James (J L Hartnick) ............................................................... 2815
Biermann, Hugo (M G E Wiley) .............................................................. 5731
Bishop Lavis Police Officers (P C Mckenzie) .......................................... 4012
Blom, John (J Witbooi) ........................................................................... 2816
Boonzaaier, Ivan (J L Hartnick) ............................................................... 8206
Boqwana, Nolwazi (A Rossouw) ............................................................... 8017
Botes, Elmarie (M C Walters) ................................................................. 8218
BPESA (E J Von Brandis) ................................................................. 6415
Brackenfell High School (A J D Marais) ............................................. 754
Brandt, Koos (P Uys) ................................................................. 4424
Brink, Mashaarn (M Tingwe) ............................................................ 4178
Broodykand, Johan (E H Eloff) ......................................................... 3772
Brown, Egnall (A J D Marais) .......................................................... 2935
Brown, Lynne (A J Du Toit Marais) .................................................... 7051
Buis, Dayan (J Hartnick) ................................................................. 6172
Building project: Langa house (V Hani) ............................................. 7703
Burger, Jacques (E J Von Brandis) .................................................... 7776
Burger, Schalk (J Witbooi) ............................................................... 4610
Caledon (E J Von Brandis) ............................................................... 4323
Cape Argus Pick’n Pay Cycle Tour (Z C Stali) ....................................... 3474
Cape Cobras (E J von Brandis) ......................................................... 3513
Cape Grace Hotel (E J Von Brandis) .................................................. 6332
Cape Town: 3rd place - Lonely Planet Survey (E J Von Brandis) .......... 8219
Cape Town International Airport (E J Von Brandis) ......................... 7054
Cape Town Municipality (J J Visser) ................................................... 5279
Cape Town on becoming World Design Capital (E J von Brandis) ............ 4505
Cape Town receives lonely planet rating (E J von Brandis) ................... 3452
Cape Town top destination in Africa (E J von Brandis) ....................... 7669
Cape Town Tourism (E J Von Brandis) ............................................... 5841
Carinus, Madre, Paralympic Games (H P Geyer) ................................. 5991
Castro, Fidel (V Hani) ................................................................. 4183
Cederberg Winery (H P Geyer) .......................................................... 6337
Chaeli Campaign first Recipient of Medal for Social Chess Coach

Denise Frick (C Labuschagne) ............................................................. 6087
Chin, Andrew (M G E Wiley) (G C R Haskin) ................................... 8020, 8164
Chippan United (R B Lentit) ............................................................. 5996
Chiu Alexander (C F Beerwinkel) ...................................................... 3950
Chrysalis Academy, CEO and Staff of (M G E Wiley) ......................... 4938
Chrysalis Youth Academy, Young Women Graduating from
(A J Du Toit Marias) ................................................................. 5987
Cillie, Rossouw (J J Visser) ............................................................. 8202
City of Cape Town (A Rossouw) ....................................................... 4423
City of Cape Town (C Labuschagne) ............................................... 2780
City of Cape Town (E J Von Brandis) ............................................... 4008
City of Cape Town (R B Lentit) ........................................................ 4105, 5845
City of Cape Town : Aa3 rating (E J von Brandis) ............................... 7512
City of Cape Town, Executive of (R B Lentit) ....................................... 4183
City of Cape Town: most productive metro municipality (H P Geyer) ....... 7571
City of Cape Town officials (M C Walters) .......................................... 4782
City of Cape Town, Tourism and Provincial Counterparts
(E J Von Brandis) ................................................................. 6334
Cloete, Andre (J J Visser) ............................................................... 8202
Cloete, Mr Anthony, Top Performer at Cape Agri Academy
(A Rossouw) ........................................................................ 1108
Cloetesville High School (H P Geyer) ............................................... 788
Coetzee, T (E H Eloff) ................................................................. 3767
Cole, Peter (M G E Wiley) .............................................................. 7890
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Du Toit, Natalie (A Rossouw)</td>
<td>2707</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duminy, Jan (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>1070</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duke, Elizabeth (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>4776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duk, William (E J Von Brandis)</td>
<td>6208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drum Majorettes, Eight of SWD (E Prins)</td>
<td>2464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drakenstein Municipality (J J Visser)</td>
<td>6208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drakenstein Local Municipality (J J Visser)</td>
<td>7886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dowry, Cobus, former MEC for Agriculture (E Prins)</td>
<td>4419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domingo, Regan (A J Du Toit Marais)</td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Agriculture (M C Walters)</td>
<td>6330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Agriculture (J J Visser)</td>
<td>6331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Community Safety and all Officials (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>6333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>6330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Human Settlements Group 5 and Mollekor Cape (A M Figlan)</td>
<td>7781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Local Government (J Visser)</td>
<td>7782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs And Development Planning (M C Walters)</td>
<td>6330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Science and Technology, Sun Space and University of Stellenbosch (M Ozinsky)</td>
<td>789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Transport and Public Works (E J Von Brandis)</td>
<td>6330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deon Bruintjies (A J D Marais)</td>
<td>785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>De Rust (E J Von Brandis)</td>
<td>4177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DF Malan high school (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td>7882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dickson, Margaret (J Witbooi)</td>
<td>2709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discovery Foundation award (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>7666</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domingo, Regan (A J Du Toit Marais)</td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dowry, Cobus, former MEC for Agriculture (E Prins)</td>
<td>4419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drakenstein Local Municipality (J J Visser)</td>
<td>5778</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drakenstein Municipality (J J Visser)</td>
<td>4179, 4355, 6090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Driver, Louise (A J Du Toit Marais)</td>
<td>8209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drum Majorettes, Eight of SWD (E Prins)</td>
<td>2464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duk, William (E J Von Brandis)</td>
<td>6208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duke, Elizabeth (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>7570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duminy, Jan (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>8218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du Toit, Natalie (A Rossouw)</td>
<td>2655, 6451</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Goeieman, Annine (A J Du Toit Marias) ................................................................. 1644
Durban Tourism (E J Von Brandis) ................................................................. 5841
Durbanville Cellars (C Labuschagne) ........................................................... 3514
Dyamdeki, Nomthandazo (M Tingwe) ......................................................... 5302
Eden, Abraham (M C Walters) ................................................................. 6328
Eden District Municipality – Motion ......................................................... 5914
Educators awarded gold stars (C F Beerwinkel) .................................. 2655
Education Centre (M G E Wiley) ................................................................. 6266
Ehrenreich, Tony (P Uys) .............................................................................. 2935
Eid Mubarak (H P Geyer) .............................................................................. 2857
Ellis, Ernie (E J von Brandis) ........................................................................ 5986
Els, Johan (E H Eloff) .................................................................................... 3768
Elsenburg Agricultural College (J J Visser) .................................................. 6209
Emergency Services Staff (J Witbooi) ....................................................... 1128
End Conscription Campaign (M Ozinsky) .................................................. 940
Equal Education (C F Beerwinkel) .............................................................. 2411
Eray, Michele (M G E Wiley) ......................................................................... 7788
Ernstzen, Kelly (A J Du Toit Marais) ............................................................. 8207
Espafrika (R B Lentit) ................................................................................... 3765
Executive Mayor of Cape Town (A M Figlan) ............................................ 6460
Fancourt (E J Von Brandis) ........................................................................... 6325
Farmworkers of the Year, 2009 (J L Hartnick) ............................................ 986
Farrant, Prof Jill (M C Walters) ................................................................. 4607
February, Michael (M G E Wiley) ............................................................... 7612
Ferreira, G T (H P Geyer) ............................................................................. 2523
Fire-Fighters (M G E Wiley) .......................................................................... 3765
Fisher, Mr Adam (M C Walters) ................................................................. 363
Fish Hoek Lifesaving Club (M G E Wiley) ................................................ 3948
Fish, Liz (M Skwatsha) ................................................................................ 3948
Flanagan, Kirsten (M G E Wiley) ................................................................. 7788
Fleur du Cape Theatre Awards (E J Von Brandis) ...................................... 7058
Forbes best young entrepreneurs (EJ von Brandis) .................................. 7703
Forbes Top African Youth entrepreneurs (EJ von Brandis) ................... 7667
Former President Nelson Mandela (L Brown) .......................................... 5151
Fortuin, Chantel (A Rossouw) ................................................................. 2349
Fourie, Hendrik (L Brown) .......................................................................... 4012
Fourie, Johan (E J Von Brandis) ................................................................. 7936
Four schools in 100 School Survey (Y Gabru) .......................................... 908
Foxy5366 (C F Beerwinkel) ................................................................. 6070
Fraser-Moleketsi, Geraldine (N P Magwaza) ............................................. 7778
Fugard, Athol (J Witbooi) .......................................................... 4422
Fugard, Athol (Z C Stali) ................................................................................ 4010
Full Recovery (M Ozinsky) .......................................................................... 3517
Funda, Ndumie (J L Hartnick) ................................................................. 7513
Fyfer, Boy (E J Von Brandis) ....................................................................... 6263
Ganya twins, Wandile and Wanele (R B Lentit) .......................................... 4490
Ganya Wandile (M Tingwe) ......................................................................... 4509
Gebenga, Anelisiwe (A J D Marais) ............................................................ 2349
Giliomee, Thys (E J Von Brandis) .............................................................. 6062
Goedeman, Delina (P Uys) ........................................................................... 6456
Goetieman, Annine (A J Du Toit Marias) .................................................... 4106
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Greene, Mr Tim (A Rossouw)</td>
<td></td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luyt, Margot (A Rossouw)</td>
<td></td>
<td>7936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louw, Joseph (A J Du Toit Marais)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners of Pinelands North</td>
<td>Learners, Grade 12 (P W Cupido)</td>
<td>8155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Roux, Ziane (A J Du Toit Marais)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Groenewald, Martin (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4938</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Groenewald, Martin (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>Growsmart literacy programme (C F Beerwinkel)</td>
<td>7667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kulsen, Heinrich (M C Walters)</td>
<td>Growsmart literacy programme (C F Beerwinkel)</td>
<td>7132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ikeys (J J Visser)</td>
<td></td>
<td>7514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ikeys (J J Visser)</td>
<td>Heineken Cape to Rio 2011 (M C Walters)</td>
<td>7514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hanekom, Mr A, on election (E J von Brandis)</td>
<td>Grade 12 learners (L Brown)</td>
<td>2704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hanekom, Sandra (A Rossouw)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, Jenny (P C Mckenzie)</td>
<td></td>
<td>6336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartzenberg, Ms Anthea (R B Lentit)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hattingh, Adele (M C Walters)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hattingh, Christian (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hayward, Samantha (A J Du Toit Marais)</td>
<td></td>
<td>7787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hendrick, Mikhail (P W Cupido)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heritage Cape On Tenth Anniversary (A Rossouw)</td>
<td></td>
<td>6409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heineken Cape to Rio 2011 (M C Walters)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert, Willem (H P Geyer)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hermanus: Space Weather Monitoring system (M C Walters)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hiphop teams of Western Cape (A J D Marais)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2777</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hip-Hop World Championships, Delegation Attending to (H P Geyer)</td>
<td></td>
<td>6376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoffman, Tanika (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td></td>
<td>7612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homeless Soccer World Cup Tournament (N P Magwaza)</td>
<td></td>
<td>753</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horn, Wendy (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hon, Wiley M G E (AJ Du Toit Marias)</td>
<td></td>
<td>5160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House, James, Houtbay (Magwaza N P)</td>
<td></td>
<td>5272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hudson, Roger (G C R Haskin)</td>
<td></td>
<td>5840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunter, Mr Tony (A Rossouw)</td>
<td></td>
<td>6455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huisamen, Phillip (P Uys)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ikeys (J J Visser)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-WECC (E J Von Brandis)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kulsen, Heinrich (M C Walters)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Motte Wine Estate, (M C Walters)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laubscher, Eric Honoured – Motion</td>
<td></td>
<td>6412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Roux, Marzanne (A J Du Toit Marias)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Roux, Ziane (A J Du Toit Marias)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td></td>
<td>5863</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners, Grade 12 (P W Cupido)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4558</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners of Pinelands North Primary School (M Ozinsky)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3953</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leukes, Ingrid (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loots, Roeléne (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louw, Joseph (A J Du Toit Marias)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luyt, Margot (A Rossouw)</td>
<td></td>
<td>6209</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Jackson, Julian (A Rossouw) .......................................................... 7516
Jantjies, Wesley (A J Du Toit Marais) ........................................... 8207
Jenner, Minister - Department of the Premier (A J D Marais) .......... 2351
Jewish Community (A Rossouw) ................................................... 753
Jewish Community (J J Visser) ....................................................... 2570
Jim, Asenathi (G C R Haskin) ....................................................... 5840
Johannesburg Tourism (E J Von Brandis) ...................................... 5841
Jongile, Amahle (J L Hartnick) ..................................................... 2933
Jonkbloed, Zelda (A Rossouw) .................................................... 6206
Jonson, Denver (Z C Stali) .......................................................... 4110
Joubert, Shaun (M G E Wiley) ...................................................... 7612
Junior Golfer Luca Fillipi (M G E Wiley) ...................................... 6637
Kaap Rapport and Van Loveren Town of the Year Competition
(E J Von Brandis) ................................................................. 659
Kairos Drama Group of Heidelberg (E Prins) ................................ 5781
Kahn, Dawood (A J du Toit Marais) ............................................... 7566
Kaizer Chiefs and Orlando Pirates (M Ncedana) ......................... 989
Kallis, Sharief (R B Lentit) .......................................................... 4143
Kallis, Jacques (C F Beerwinkel) .................................................. 2936
Key Figures in Western Cape Agriculture (M C Walters) .............. 2780
Khohlokoane, Joseph (JL Hartnick) ............................................. 7706
Kirsten, Gary (E J Von Brandis) ................................................... 3951
Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens (M C Walters) ......................... 7777
Klatzow, Prof Peter (A J Du Toit Marais) ..................................... 6202
Kotana, Loyiso (V Hani) ............................................................ 2819
Koster, John (A Rossow) ........................................................... 3771
Kotze Dewaldre (C F Beerwinkel) .............................................. 2377
Kotze, SPI (M G E Wiley) ........................................................... 8065
Knysna Circuit Court (P W Cupido) ............................................ 4437
Kraaifontein Police Station (P W Cupido) .................................... 2569
Kruger, Katryn (C Labuschagne) ............................................... 6208
Kwahattu Culture (M G E Wiley) ................................................. 6266
Labuschagne, Catherine fighter pilot (C Labuschagne) ............... 2658
Langeberg on change of name (E H Eloff) ................................... 839
Lange, Malcolm (E H Eloff) ....................................................... 1646
Le Roux, Marlene (J L Hartnick) ................................................. 2465
Lilizela Tourism awards (E J Von Brandis) ................................. 8019
Liverpool (P C McKenzie) ......................................................... 939
Luhlaza High School to pupils (C F Beerwinkel) ......................... 2657
Mallum, Yusra (C Labuschagne) ............................................... 8061
Mama Albertina Sisulu (V Hani) ................................................. 2778
Management of South African Airways (E H Eloff) ..................... 4007
Management: Silwerkruiin Home for the Elderly, Wellington
(J J Visser) ........................................................................... 1040
Mandela day children’s fund celebration (M Ncedana) ............... 7941
Mandela, Nelson Rolihla (M Skwatsha) ....................................... 4700
Mandela, Nelson: 92nd birthday (M Skwatsha) ......................... 2375
Manser, Riaan (M G E Wiley) ..................................................... 3516
Manyonga, Luvo (Z C Stali) ....................................................... 2410
Marais, Scheau (M G E Wiley) ................................................... 7889
Maritz, Jan (A Rossouw) .......................................................... 2305
Martin, Prof Lorna (M Skwatsha) ................................................................. 4559
Matie Students (C F Beerwinkel) ................................................................. 2707
Matthews, James (V Hani) ........................................................................... 7056
Mayor of Cape Town (A Rossouw) ............................................................... 6329
Mayor of Potchefstroom (A J du Toit Marais) .............................................. 6577
Mbeki Govan, Human Settlement Awards 2012, Runners-up and
Winners (A M Figlan) ................................................................................... 5840
McBride, Robert (M Ozinsky) ....................................................................... 8213
McGregor, Cody (G C R Haskin) ................................................................. 8156
McKenna, Sageas (M C Walters) ................................................................. 4423
Medical Emergency Staff and School Principal (C Labuschagne) ............ 7056
Meerendal Wine Estate on gold medal (E Prins) ......................................... 1892
Member of the House – (J J Visser) ............................................................... 4555
Mesias, Ashanti (C Labuschagne) ................................................................. 8061
Metro Police (P W Cupido) .......................................................................... 4442
Metro Rescue Workers (M G E Wiley) ......................................................... 3765
Meyer, Heyneke: Springbok rugby team (M C Walters) ............................. 7939
Milligan, Jesse (J L Hartnick) ........................................................................ 8206
Minister Alan Winde: saving of drowning woman (E J von Brandis) ....... 2352
Minister Leonard Max (A J du T Marais) ...................................................... 2262
Minister of Agriculture (M C Walters) ......................................................... 2856, 7052, 8204
Minister of Education: Presidential hotline (C Labuschagne) .................. 7937
Minister of Education: Pro-poor plan-No fee schools (A J du Toit Marais) 8158
Minister of Education: provision of books (C Labuschagne) .................... 8215
Minister of Health (P C McKenzie) .............................................................. 2483
Minister of Health and His Department ....................................................... 6332
Minister of Health: Mitchells Plein Hospital (A J du Toit Marais) ............... 8216
Minister of Human Settlements: Title Deeds (A M Figlan) ......................... 8161
Minister Madikizela (A Rossouw) ............................................................... 3473
Minister Patricia De Lille (H P Geyer) ......................................................... 3473
Minister on compilation of guide (J J Visser) ............................................... 1645
Minister Winde (H P Geyer) ........................................................................ 6266
Mlambo-Ngcuka, Phumzile (N P Magwaza) ............................................... 7778
Mntungwa, Vezokuhle (M Tingwe) ............................................................... 7518
Mocke, Mr Dawid (M G E Wiley) ................................................................. 1293
Mokoena, Aaron (V Hani) .......................................................................... 2938
Mokoena, Kgotso (J J Visser) ..................................................................... 8059
Mosiela High School (M G E Wiley) ............................................................ 789
Mostert, Jan (H P Geyer) ............................................................................. 6322
Mountain View Stonemason housing project (A M Figlan) ....................... 7778
Mpetha, Family (Z C Stali) .......................................................................... 4104
Mpfou-Wlash, Sizwe (M Tingwe) ................................................................. 4010
MPP Jennifer Hartnick (A Rossouw) ............................................................ 2464
MPP Jennifer Hartnick (H P Geyer) .............................................................. 2482
MPPS who Graduated (M Ncedana) ............................................................ 4703
Mthethwa, Nathi: attendance at Crime Imbizo in Manenberg (M Skwatsha) 7521
Muggels, Mr Hendrik (M C Walters) ............................................................ 104,108
Municipalities of Drakenstein, George and Witzenberg (J J Visser) .......... 4489
Municipalities of Overstrand, George and Stellenbosch (H P Geyer) ........ 2703
Municipalities, on Blue Drop and Green Drop Status (J J Visser)........... 4109
Municipalities, Who spent their MIG Funds before End of
Budget Year (J J Visser)......................................................... 4112
Muslim community (K A Mqulwana).................................................. 1069
Muslims on Ramadan (H P Geyer)...................................................... 4104
Muslims on Ramadan (A Rossouw)...................................................... 611
Mxosana, Luwanda (V Hani).............................................................. 2819
Mycroft, Michaela (P W Cupido)....................................................... 4696
Mzonke “The Rose of Khayelitsha” Fana (J L Hartnick)....................... 2776
M5 Developments Cape and Overstrand Municipality (M C Walters)........ 988
National Departments (E Prins)......................................................... 4116
National Education Award (A J Du Toit Marais).................................. 5159
National Government (N P Magwaza)................................................... 5730
National Women’s’ Hockey Squad (M G E Wiley)................................. 5159
Ndungu, Scientist Thumbi (G C Haskin)............................................. 6453
Nel, Fanie (H P Geyer)................................................................................ 8215
Nelson, Marshall (R B Lentiti)............................................................... 4143
New Diplomats (M Ozinsky)................................................................. 540
New IT centres at Heideveld mosque (M Skwatsha)............................... 7668
Nicholls, Nelson (E Prins)......................................................................... 3949
Nieuwoudt, Charl (A J du T Marais)....................................................... 2935
Noolele, Phelokazi (C F Beerwinkel)...................................................... 2939
Ntetha, C: Constable (M G E Wiley)....................................................... 8062
Ntsiki Biyela (H P Geyer)........................................................................... 613
NYDA (M Tingwe).................................................................................... 4509
Nyman, Roseline (A Rossouw)............................................................... 8017
Nymbesi, Vinoria (Du Toit Marais, A J)................................................... 5728
Oakdale Agricultural High School (J J Visser)........................................ 6205
Obama, President Barack (A J Du Toit Marais)..................................... 6454
Oosthuizen, Louis (J L Hartnick)............................................................ 2373
Oudtshoorn Municipality (P Uys)............................................................ 6328
Organisers and Participants in Cape Epic Mountain Bike Race
(M G E Wiley)....................................................................................... 7059
Organisers of Robertson Wine, Food and Tourism Festival (E H Eloff).... 909
Orlando Pirates (T R Majola)................................................................. 4109
Orlando Pirates (Z C Stali)....................................................................... 3949
Orlando Pirates (M G E Wiley)............................................................... 3949
Ostrich Industry (M C Walters).............................................................. 4355
Overstrand Municipality (M C Walters).................................................. 939, 6573
Overstrand Municipality (J J Visser)....................................................... 4939
Palama Post-Graduate Studies (C Labuschagne)................................. 7888
Parker, Marlon: award (C Labuschagne)................................................. 7617
Paralympic Team South Africa (M Ncedana).......................................... 6203
Partridge, Sally-Ann (A Rossouw).......................................................... 7516
Patel, Bhavna Dr (N P Magwaza)........................................................... 7892
Paulse, Cornelius (H P Geyer)............................................................... 8203
Paulse, Ethan (M G E Wiley)................................................................. 8066
Paulse, Karools (H P Geyer)................................................................. 8021
Peace and reconciliation to people of LIBYA (M G E Wiley)................. 4493
Peggy De Villiers (C Labuschagne)....................................................... 755
Petros, Gen (P C McKenzie)................................................................... 2478
Phetho, Terry (E H Eloff) .......................................................... 3951
Philander, Tovern (J J Visser) .................................................. 6456
Philander, Vernon (EJ Von Brandis) ......................................... 5908
Premier (A J Du Toit Marias) ................................................... 5160
Premier (H P Geyer) ............................................................... 4418
Premier (M C Walters) ........................................................... 2856
Premier and Department (J L Hartnick) ................................... 6338
President Jacob Zuma on taking Aids test (J Witbooi) ............... 2176
President Zuma, being appointed to Unsecretary’s Education first
Initiative to (L Brown) ............................................................ 6259
Principal of Gardens Commercial High School (C F Beerwinkel) ... 2782
Prins, Henry (J J Visser) ......................................................... 5912
Prins, Megan-Geoffrey (J L Hartnick) ....................................... 4148
Professor: Cumming, Graeme (J L Hartnick) ........................... 7784
Professor: De Jager, Gerhard (J L Hartnick) ............................ 7784
Professor: Dlodlo, Mqhele (J L Hartnick) ............................... 7784
Professor: Millar, Robert (J L Hartnick) .................................. 7784
Professor Morris, Allan (C Labuschagne) ............................... 8063
Professor: Sliwa-Hahnle, Karen (J L Hartnick) ......................... 7784
Professor: Stein, Dan (J L Hartnick) ....................................... 7784
Professor: Van Zyl, Kobus (J L Hartnick) ............................... 7784
Proteas (Z C Stali) ............................................................... 3472
Provincial Athletic Trials (C F Beerwinkel) ................................ 2306
Provincial Parliament (H P Geyer) .......................................... 6336
Receiving Annual (P W Cupido) ............................................. 4105
Repair of air conditioning in house (A J du T Marais) ............... 2658
Rescue team from SA (M G E Wiley) ...................................... 3470
Research Institutions, Three Cape Town (P W Cupido) .............. 4609
Rianie Strydom (A J D Marais) .............................................. 757
Rice, Kenny (M G E Wiley) .................................................... 7788
Rice, Sean (M G E Wiley) ..................................................... 7788
Road Accident Fatalities - Motion .......................................... 6413
Rosh Hashanah (H P Geyer) ................................................... 4440, 8021
Rouch, Avril (C Labuschagne) .............................................. 8208
Rudner, Bronson (A J du Toit Marais) .................................... 8164
Rugby, Kaizer Chiefs in Transformation of (R B Lentit) ............ 6407
SA Academy for Science and Arts (H P Geyer) ......................... 658
SA Commonwealth team (Z C Stali) ....................................... 2710
SA Cricket Team (E H Eloff) .................................................. 790
Safari, Jamalal (A Rossouw) ............................................... 7516
SA Government (P Uys) ....................................................... 2937
Saldanha Municipality (M Skwatsha) ...................................... 988
SA Military Veterans’ Organisation (M Oszinsky) .................... 4326
Sandes Toryan (E H Eloff) .................................................... 4781
SAPS (P W Cupido) ............................................................. 4146
SAPS (M G E Wiley) ........................................................... 2855
SAFA (Z C Stali) ................................................................. 3769
Sattar, Hawa Bebe (C F Beerwinkel) ....................................... 3516
Savage, Kate (A Rossouw) .................................................. 8017
Scheepers, Lorna (V Hani) .................................................. 7938
Scholtz, Jeanne-Mari (M G E Wiley) ....................................... 7786
Scholtz, Joggie (J J Visser) .............................................................. 5912
Scholtz, Marius (A Rossouw) .......................................................... 8204
Scott, Ashley (V Hani) ..................................................................... 4492
Sdophumelela Secondary School, Learners of (C Labuschagne) ....... 5269
Semenyana, Castor (E Prins) ............................................................ 2480
September, Charmaine (V Hani) ..................................................... 7938
September, Connie (N P Magwaza) ............................................... 7778
September, Jezane (C Labuschagne) ............................................. 8061
Seven Team, Maties (J J Visser) ...................................................... 6637
Sexwale, Tokyo: launch of new solar water heating project (K E Magaxa) .... 7522
Sharks (J J Visser) .......................................................................... 4006
Shoprite/Checkers Women of the Year Award, Women for
Receiving Annual (P W Cupido) ...................................................... 4105
Sizani, Stone (P Uys) ...................................................................... 7780
Skwatsha, Mcebisa (A J Du Toit) .................................................... 7051
Small, Adam (J L Hartnick) ............................................................ 6204
Smith, Graeme and Wife (P W Cupido) ......................................... 4144
Silvo, Joao (E J Von Brandis) .......................................................... 4608
Simon, Ray Alexander (M Tingwe) ................................................ 2937
Siphiso, Nteta (D Gopie) ................................................................. 7563
Sister Crossley (A J du Toit Marais) ............................................... 4351
Sithole, Lucas (J L Hartnick) ........................................................... 8063
Skinflint, Dan (M G E Wiley) .......................................................... 3516
Softball Federation, Western Cape (M G E Wiley) ......................... 4942
Sogayise, Zamayedwa (A J du Toit Marais) .................................... 7566
Solomon, Kenny (E J Von Brandis) ................................................. 6203
Solomons, Boebie (C F Beerwinkel) ............................................... 2466
Somers, Christo (M C Walters) ....................................................... 2818
South Africa Government (L Brown) .............................................. 2816
South African Police Service (M G E Wiley) ................................. 2350
South Peninsula High School (C F Beerwinkel) ............................ 4325
Speedy recovery to Agassi Africa (C F Beerwinkel) ....................... 3472
Springbok ....................................................................................... 2855
Springboks (P W Cupido) ............................................................... 4356
Springboks (J L Hartnick) .............................................................. 540,658
Springboks (P C McKenzie) ........................................................... 692
Springboks (E Prins) ...................................................................... 754
Springbok Team (E H Eloff) ........................................................... 2522, 4440
Springbok Rugby Team (E H Eloff) ................................................. 4143, 4178, 4324
Springfield High School (C F Beerwinkel) .................................... 2348
Square Kilometre Array (SKA) (C F Beerwinkel) ......................... 5872
Stamrood, Ryan (M G E Wiley) (G C R Haskin) ............................. 8020, 8164
Stellenbosch and Stellenberg Girls Choir (J L Hartnick) ................ 6335
Stellenbosch Municipality (J J Visser) ............................................. 5270
Stellenbosch Municipality (H P Geyer) ......................................... 5300
Stellenbosch University Choir (J L Hartnick) ............................... 2410
Stellenbosch University Team (V Hani) ........................................ 4011
Stellenbosch Wine Route (E J von Brandis) ................................. 8064
Steyn Elize (A Rossouw) ............................................................... 2349
Stormers (J J Visser) .................................................................... 3512
Stormers (J J Visser) .................................................................... 4006
Students and Institutions (J Witbooi) .................................................. 2782
Such, Lorna (C Labuschagne) ............................................................... 8208
Sunflower Fund Ladies (M C Walters) ................................................... 2466
Swart, Anke (E J Von Brandis) ............................................................ 7776
SWD Rugby Union on victory over Griffins (J L Hartnick) ................. 2659
Team Zealous of Stellenbosch High School (J L Hartnick) ................. 695
Temble, Hlanganisa (C Labuschagne) ................................................ 8061
Textbook delivery in the Western Cape – Motion .................................. 7616
Theewaterskloof Municipality (E J von Brandis) ................................ 2777
The Test Kitchen: best restaurant (E J Von Brandis) ......................... 8211
Tshotetsi, Thembu (V Hani) ................................................................. 8333
Tladi, Michael (K E Magaxa) ............................................................... 4508
Toraymond Koopstad (E Prins) ............................................................ 4508
Tourism and Rector of UWC (E J Von Brandis) ................................. 4179
Traffic Officials (P W Cupido) ............................................................. 4146
Transplant Sports Association Athletes (J L Hartnick) ......................... 3950
Travel and Leisure: world’s best 30 hotels (EJ von Brandis) ............ 7668
Tshibika, Sibahle (M Tingwe) .............................................................. 8216
Tygerberg Children’s Choir (J L Hartnick) ......................................... 2410
UDF (M Skwatsha) .................................................................................. 4180
University of Cape Town researchers (C Labuschagne) ................... 7507
UWC Scientists (J Witbooi) ................................................................. 3474
Uys, Ashley (C F Beerwinkel) .............................................................. 7887
Van As, Richard (E Prins) .................................................................. 7941
Van Den Velde, Dr Mark (M Skwatsha) ............................................... 4356
Van der Merwe, DR Elbie (J Witbooi) .................................................. 4009
Van Der Rheede, Mr Christo (A Rossouw) .......................................... 4439
Van der Wat, Hannetjie (A Rossouw) .................................................. 7564
Van Gyssen Eloïse (M G E Wiley) ....................................................... 3948
Van Niekerk, Carla (P W Cupido) ......................................................... 3946
Van Wyk, Annelien (H P Geyer) ........................................................... 8215
Van Zyl, Mr Henk (M C Walters) .......................................................... 4438
Vasco da Gama Football Club (Z C Stali) ............................................ 1595
Venter, Willem (E H Eloff) ................................................................. 4490
Vergotine, Valentino (Z C Stali) ........................................................... 4110
Viera, Kim (J L Hartnick) .................................................................... 8206
Vilander Ernest (E H Eloff) ................................................................ 3947
Vink, Nick: Professor (J J Visser) ........................................................ 8202
Visser, Robin (A J du Toit Marais) ....................................................... 8164
Visser, Zark (J J Visser) ...................................................................... 8059
Viviers, Toks (M G E Wiley) (G C R Haskin) ....................................... 8020, 8164
Volunteers during strike (V Hani) ....................................................... 2482
Wacky Wine Festival (E H Eloff) ......................................................... 2348
Water Affairs National Department (M Ozinsky) ............................... 3518
Watts, Andy (J J Visser) ..................................................................... 8018
WCED .................................................................................................. 6338
WCED on Higher matric Pass Rate ...................................................... 5780
Webber, June (E H Eloff) ................................................................... 4321
Weideman, Philip (A J du Toit Marais) ............................................... 2230
Wentzel, Sean (V Hani) ..................................................................... 2711
Wentzel, Shaun (C F Beerwinkel) ....................................................... 4011
Western Cape Liquor Authority (E J Von Brandis)................................. 5273
Western Cape Officials (M C Walters) .................................................. 4782
Western Cape Municipality (J J Visser) ................................................. 5270
Western Cape Primary Schools Athletics Team (C F Beerinkel) ................. 1644
Western Cape Women Farmers of the Year (M C Walters) ......................... 659
Wimble, Dr Keith (J Witbooi) .................................................................. 3517
Winners of national female farmer competition (J J Visser) ......................... 2461
Winners: Productivity SA (E H Eloff) ..................................................... 986
Wishing Muslim community strength and best wishes with
Ramadan Kareem (H P Geyer) ................................................................. 2460
Witzenberg Reel Dancers (J L Hartnick) .................................................. 4940
World Cup Draw (P M Jacobs) ................................................................ 1108
World Transplant Games (J L Hartnick) .................................................. 693
World War II Veteran (M E G Wiley) ...................................................... 5155
WP Currie Cup rugby team (Z C Stali) ...................................................... 2615
WP Junior Jukskei Team at SA Championships (J A van Zyl) ................. 1350
WP Rugby (P C McKenzie) .................................................................... 838
WP Rugby teams (Z C Stali) ................................................................. 2705
WP Rugby team on victory over sharks (J J Visser) ................................ 2656
WP Rugby Team winning Curry Cup (M G E Wiley) ............................... 6408
Yende, Pretty (J L Hartnick) ................................................................... 755, 2408
Yende, Pretty (H P Geyer) ..................................................................... 4110
Youth day event (AJ Du Toit) ................................................................. 7704
Zenani, Anita (V Hani) .......................................................................... 4114
Civil Society Initiatives, Closing Down of – Motion ................................. 3764
Commission on Service Delivery – Motion ......................................... 6182
Communication Technology Resource Centre, New information
Motion .................................................................................................... 5986
Communities, Impact of “Ale” – Motion ............................................... 5148
Community leaders, recognition of – Motion ....................................... 7779
Conflict in de Doorns, Defusing of – Motion ....................................... 6450
Consolidated annual municipal performance report – Motion .............. 7602
Controversy around SA’s Public Protector’s Appearance
at party Political DA Event – Motion ...................................................... 6058
Constitutional Relationship between NCOP and Provincial Legislatures –
Motion .................................................................................................. 7041
COPE Member rejoin ANC – Motion .................................................... 6500
Correctional Service Officer, Immoral Act between Police Woman –
Motion .................................................................................................. 4177
Corruption: DA councillors – Motion ...................................................... 8199
Corruption in Cape traffic department – Motion ................................... 2815
Corruption in municipalities – Motion .................................................. 2928
Corruption in Provincial Department - Motion ........................................ 6405
Cosatu’s Actions against National Youth wage Subsidy – Motion .......... 5837
Councillor Mattheys Koch’s Failure to Declare his Interests – Motion .......... 3616
Councillors: contravention of rules – Motion ...................................... 8200
Court Application, Backyard Dwellers Lodge – Motion .......................... 6410
Crime investigation: three spheres of government – Motion .................. 7877
Crimes, escalation in – Motion .............................................................. 4410
Crime prevention initiatives – Motion .................................................. 3467
Crime statistics for the Western Cape – Motion ................................... 8154
Crime Statistics relating to Western Cape – Motion ........................................ 6257
Crisis, Tourism industry in .................................................................................. 4103
Cultivaria’s Black Tie Dinner – Motion ............................................................... 4507
Cultural diversity – Motion ................................................................................. 346
Curb Gangsterism, Avenues to – Motion ............................................................. 6367
Cyril Ramaphosa: drugs and gangsterism in Mitchell Plain – Motion .............. 7888
DA Chairpersons and Vice-Persons Elected – Motion .................................... 6635
DA, Changing of colours by – Motion ............................................................... 4432
DA Elective Procedures – Motion ...................................................................... 6493
DA-LED Government to Employ People living with Disabilities, Failure of – Motion ............................................................ 4604
DA Government, Inferior service Delivery by - Motion ..................................... 5860
DA-Government to Provide Equal Education, Failure of – Motion ................. 5267
DA membership: King Dalindyebo – Motion ..................................................... 7770
DA, NGO funding by – Motion ......................................................................... 4434
DA’s disregard for minimum standards for sanitation and provision of toilets to poor – Motion ........................................................................... 2518
DA’s failure to bring down drug and related crimes – Motion ......................... 2611
DA’s Half-hearted commitment to release sufficient land for Greenfields development – Motion ................................................................. 2771
DA’s inability to mobilise young people regarding social cohesion – Motion 1894
Dashboard Management System, Failure of – Motion ...................................... 593
DA’s Xenophobia – Motion .............................................................................. 2561
DASO Found Guilty of Contravening Three UCT SCR Election
By Laws – Motion ............................................................................................... 6327
DA Snubs Indigenous People - Motion .............................................................. 4135
DA Political Appointments – Motion .................................................................. 361
DA Programme: Road to 2011 – Motion ........................................................... 655
DA public representative accused of rape – Motion ........................................... 2347
DA-run municipalities: incompetence of to secure base camps for
Fifa World Cup – Motion ..................................................................................... 2346
DA Students Organisation – Motion ................................................................... 8165
Day of National Reconciliation – Motion ......................................................... 8334
Deafness – Motion ............................................................................................. 2521
Deaf Awareness Month: September – Motion .................................................. 8064
Death at Rail Level Crossings – Motion .............................................................. 4003
Death of psychiatric patient at Karl Bremer Hospital – Motion ......................... 834
Deaths in informal areas in Cape Town, continuing – Motion ......................... 2562
Debate on service delivery at clinics and schools – Motion ................................ 2926
Decade’s child rights heroes: Nelson Mandela and Graça Machel – Motion 1039
Decisions of Executive Members of previous
Provincial Government – Motion ........................................................................ 2404
Deconsecration and sale of sacred burial sites – Motion .................................. 4413
Increase in level of serviced sites and building of houses – Motion .................. 4411
De Doorns, Lack of proper services to Stofland settlement – Motion .............. 4413
De Duine Primary School, Lotus River, Dog Buried Alive at – Motion .......... 4778
Delft Resident Wayne Jafta – Motion .................................................................. 6369
Deliberate funding cuts in Department of Social Development – Motion ...... 2772
Delivery of housing, alternative technology in – Motion .................................. 936
Democratic Alliance: Best performing management practices - Motion ........ 8060
Democratic Alliance: lack of transparency – Motion .......................................... 7560
Democratic Alliance’s silence on farm murders – Motion ............................................. 2930
Democratic space in House – Motion........................................................................ 3447
Demolition of places of worship by City of Cape Town – Motion.......................... 1642
Denneprag Primary School, Mossel Bay to Plead for Their School to
   Remain open, March to WCED District Office by - Motion............................. 6633
Department of Community Safety: Batho Pele Service Award - Motion .............. 8331
Departments of Education and health performance audits – Motion................... 7777
Department of Health, 83 Cases of FLU register – Motion.................................. 6459
Department of Social Development: Trauma Campaign: Manenberg – Motion..... 8157
Deployments by Premier in Western Cape – Motion............................................. 2561
Deputy Minister of international relations and cooperation: renaming – Motion,... 7940
Deputy Minister Visits Hospital and School – Motion ......................................... 6414
Deputy Speaker:
   Announcement..................................................................................................... 1069
   Election of ........................................................................................................ 5
   Rulings........................................................... 528, 1583, 2333, 5693, 5742, 5805, 5825, 7670, 8444
Deputy Speaker on 18 August 2009, Behaviour of – Motion............................ 691
Dire straits of farmers and communities in Southern Cape – Motion............... 904
Dirt in which Poor People Live – Motion............................................................. 7044
Disability Initiatives – Motion ............................................................................. 1128
Disabilities, support to people with – Motion..................................................... 4435
Disarray in Legislature – Motion ........................................................................ 4005
Disaster management: preparedness – Motion .................................................... 8006
Discharged from Ad Hoc Committee, Mr E J von Brandis – Motion................. 837
Discrimination against female employees – Motion............................................. 7773
Discussion: closing down of debate in city of Cape Town – Motion................... 7879
Discussion on gang war ....................................................................................... 7659
Disdain shown towards Chapter 9 Institutions – Motion..................................... 7696
Distortion of history by DA – Motion................................................................. 7698
District Six housing allocations – Motion............................................................ 8015
Divide along Racial and Language lines – Motion.............................................. 6577
Documentary Evidence, Manipulation and disappearance of – Motion ............... 306
Domestic violence: absence of plan – Motion...................................................... 7559
Doping in School Sport – Motion........................................................................ 5777
Dorp Street, Walk-in Centre – Motion................................................................. 6460
Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 - Litnum Results – Motion..................... 7932
Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of
department of education – Motion................................................................. 7976
Drought assistance to farmers – Motion.............................................................. 2300
Drownings of schoolchildren – Motion............................................................... 1590
Drug Abuse - Motion ......................................................................................... 4137
Drug dealers, Marches against – Motion.............................................................. 606
Drugs Seized in Goodwood – Motion................................................................ 5728
Drug-Trading Zones in Cape Town – Motion...................................................... 6377
Drunk drivers: name and shame – Motion......................................................... 7705
Dumping of babies and control measures – Motion .......................................... 2519
Each-One-Settle-One campaign – Motion........................................................... 4437
Education .......................................................................................................... 6366
ECDs in province – Motion................................................................................. 3510
Economic and environmental developments, importance of Motion................. 2369
Economic development partnership – Motion................................................... 7504
Economic growth in rural districts – Motion .......................................................... 4411
Economic growth in the Western Cape - Motion ................................................ 7555
Economic growth only in open, opportunity society – Motion ........................... 1592
Economic potential and forecast beyond 2010 – Motion .................................... 835
Economic Recession – Motion ............................................................................ 538
Economy – Motion .............................................................................................. 4137
Education Outcome, Progress made to Improve – Motion .............................. 4175
Education System, Inequality in the .................................................................. 5858
Efforts of ANC Government to Restrict Media Freedom – Motion ................. 2459
Eglin, Colin: tribute to – Motion ........................................................................ 7510
Eid: 27 November 2009 – Motion .................................................................... 1107
Eight lives lost in fire in Khayelitsha town two – Motion ................................. 2571
Election of new DA council members – Motion ................................................. 7935
Elections, Gangsterism During – Motion ............................................................ 5726
Electrocuted, Two Young Girls – Motion ............................................................ 4149
Employment Equity Amendment Bill – Motion ................................................. 8323
Employment equity report – Motion .................................................................. 7501
Employment Equity Report, Commission of – Motion ....................................... 6201
Entrepreneurial Leader of the Year Award – Motion ........................................ 6502
Entrepreneurship: red tape - Motion ................................................................. 8058
Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........................................... 2334
Environmental and Health Issues – Motion ...................................................... 1744
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes – Motion .................................................. 6379
Equity Targets – Motion ................................................................................... 5912
escalation of gangsterism, drug abuse and related criminal
activities – Motion .............................................................................................. 4482
Eskom tariff increase and top management – Motion ......................................... 1010
Eskom's tariff increases – Motion ...................................................................... 1642
Establishment of ad hoc committee – Motion ................................................... 2614
Exclusion of members from summit on baby dumping – Motion .................... 2923
Exclusion of small- scale farmers from summit – Motion .................................. 2926
Executive statement by the Minister of Local Government,
Eviction of Farm Workers (Motion) ................................................................. 4005
Exonerated, Professor Karabus - Motion ............................................................ 7055
Expenditure of City of Cape Town – Motion ...................................................... 2407
Expenditure of ratepayers’ money – Motion ..................................................... 2561
Explanation in terms of rule 63 – Motion ......................................................... 7942
Failure of WCED to indicate how money was Spent, Shutting
Down of 15 Schools – Motion .......................................................................... 6628
Failure of DA Government to address challenges – Motion ........................... 7500
Failure of the Western Cape Government to Support Youth at Risk – Motion ... 7043
Failure of Education in Western Cape – Motion .............................................. 7045
Failure to Deal with Taxi Conflict – Motion ...................................................... 7041
Fair Trade Tourism: code of conduct – Motion ............................................... 7605
Family Expo in May – Motion ........................................................................... 2232
Farewell, Hon Member P M Jacobs – Motion .................................................... 4320
Farm Attacks, Solly Tyibilika Killing – Motion ................................................... 4692
Farmers Funding Ground and Air Strike Security – Motion .......................... 6574
Farming, small-scale – economic feasibility of – Motion ................................ 2299
Farm Project, Agri Dwala Empowerment – Motion ......................................... 4700
Farm Schools: drop-out rate – Motion .............................................................. 7938
Farm workers and dwellers, conditions of – Motion ............................................... 4482
Farmworkers: challenges – Motion ............................................................................. 7558
Farm Workers, conditions of – Motion ...................................................................... 4439
Farm Worker Forum – Motion ................................................................................... 2230
Farmworkers in the Western Cape: plight of – Motion ............................................. 7572
Farmworkers’ issues: addressing of – Motion .............................................................. 7878
Farm Workers of the Year Competition – Motion ...................................................... 6497
Farm Workers, Speedy recovery involved in Bus Accident - Motion ....................... 4608
Farms: violating health and remuneration legislation – Motion .............................. 2370
Fashion Week Gala Dinner: wastage by Mayor de Lille – Motion ......................... 7933
Fatal injury of Gavin Engelke and Keenan van Wyk – Motion ............................... 2261
Fatal Shootings in Hanover Park and Ottery – Motion ............................................... 6406
Fatal taxi accident on Constantia Main Road – Motion ............................................ 2303
Fatalities in Cape Town fires – Motion ..................................................................... 4349
Fellow Learners, Rape of 16-year old boy by - Motion ............................................. 6377
Festive season: preparedness – Motion ...................................................................... 8195
Filthy areas the poor live in – Motion ....................................................................... 1593
Final Examinations in Wynland District – Motion .................................................... 6499
Financial Governance Review and Outlook, 2009 – Tabling .................................... 1599
Fire, Seven Die in – Motion ....................................................................................... 4604
Fires in Kanana informal Areas, Gugulethu – Motion ............................................. 6577
Firing of Dr Annelie Rabie, DA caucus leader in Prince Albert – Motion ............... 4486
Fish Hoek, shark attack at – Motion .......................................................................... 4441
Flooding in the Western Cape – Motion .................................................................... 7937, 8328
Focus on sanitation protestors: sanitation crisis – Motion ....................................... 7877
Food bank for excess produced food – Motion ......................................................... 2774
Football world cup: gratitude to citizens – Motion .................................................... 2372
Formation and functioning of municipal public accounts
  committees – Motion ................................................................................................. 4486
Founders Garden: upgrading and redevelopment of - Order of the Day ................. 7634
Funding of Cape Firm Commission – Motion ............................................................. 6494
Funding for Nongovernmental Organisations - Motion ............................................. 4139
Funds, Maintenance Lack of – Motion ..................................................................... 4139
Funding, Withdrawal and Reduction of – Motion ..................................................... 3764
Fransman’s – Involvement in – Motion ..................................................................... 2403
Fraudsters fired – Motion .......................................................................................... 5905
Freedom Charter: Achievement of its aims – Motion ............................................. 363
Free housing policy, rethink of – Motion ................................................................... 905
Free State University racist photos – Motion ............................................................ 2928
Free trade ports, Establishment of – Motion ............................................................... 2256
Free Trade Zone/Port in Cape Town, Establishment of – Motion ............................ 688
Frequent accidents with open or heavy-duty vehicles – Motion .............................. 4414
Full and effective interpretation service – Motion ..................................................... 1037
Funding of no-fee schools for poor: achievements of ANC – Motion .................... 8326
Funding to educare centre stopped – Motion ............................................................. 2814
Future of Somerset Hospital – Motion ....................................................................... 2173
Gangs, in Western Cape - Motion ............................................................................. 4316
Gang-Related Violence in Cape – Motion ................................................................. 4555
Gang-related violence on Cape Flats – Motion ........................................................... 2257
Gangsterism crisis – Motion ...................................................................................... 7769
Gang Violence in Townships (Motion) ...................................................................... 4138
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gang violence in the Western Cape – Motion</td>
<td>7556</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gang violence: solution – Motion</td>
<td>8006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gang warfare in Western Cape – Motion</td>
<td>7502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genetically Modified Foods, Status of – Motion</td>
<td>6405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Municipality: Nexus Report – Motion</td>
<td>2610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G F Jooste Hospital – Motion</td>
<td>7519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girl gang attack: Heideveld High School – Motion</td>
<td>7572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glaucoma week 2011 – Motion</td>
<td>3453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Earth Hour – Motion</td>
<td>7050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golden Games: cancellation of – Motion</td>
<td>7503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good leader, character of – Motion</td>
<td>4412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good Luck to Matric Learners – Motion</td>
<td>6334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good wishes for Cape Argus Pick 'n Pay Cycle Tour – Motion</td>
<td>1596</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance of Robben Island – Motion</td>
<td>2770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graaff Family, Homage to – Motion</td>
<td>5868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 12 examinations – Motion</td>
<td>8156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Nine, Failure rate - Motion</td>
<td>5904</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandmother against Poverty and Aids – Motion</td>
<td>6410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gratitude and appreciation to committee coordinators – Motion</td>
<td>2521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gratitude and well wishes to Western Cape Traffic Department – Motion</td>
<td>6572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greenfields, Impact of on Housing Demand Database – Motion</td>
<td>3615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Economic Accord, Singing of – Motion</td>
<td>4702</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green economy as an economic sector, role of – Motion</td>
<td>7500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Point Stadium, Escalating costs of – Motion</td>
<td>746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growing Baboon Problem in Cape Town – Motion</td>
<td>6629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guns during Evictions, use of – Motion</td>
<td>4693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Habitat Council: high court challenge - Motion</td>
<td>7568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hanover Park Day Hospital: closure due to gang violence – Motion</td>
<td>8197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H1N1 Virus, Number of deaths as a result of – Motion</td>
<td>784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care: effect of Eastern Cape on the Western Cape - Motion</td>
<td>8055</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care Facilities, Construction and Upgrading of - Motion</td>
<td>5836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health care, Improving delivery of – Motion</td>
<td>4432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care Systems in Rural Areas – Motion</td>
<td>4318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, International Award to Western Cape Department - Motion</td>
<td>5154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Practitioners: Scrapping of names – Motion</td>
<td>607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Rights and responsibilities, Review of – Motion</td>
<td>655</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Services Eastern Cape: impact on provincial budgets - Motion</td>
<td>8058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Workers, Acknowledgement of Personnel of Nelspoort,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beaufort West and Montagu Hospitals – Motion</td>
<td>4108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Workers in the Western Cape: Wellbeing of – Motion</td>
<td>8005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helderberg Hospital: inferior services – Motion</td>
<td>8007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hessequa By-Election – Motion</td>
<td>7519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hessequa Municipality, solution for – Motion</td>
<td>4354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heavy rains in Western Cape – Motion</td>
<td>2227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heroic action of Lubalalo Msutwana – Motion</td>
<td>2660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Court Documents, Falsification of (Motion)</td>
<td>4006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Levels of Learners not Reaching Matric – Motion</td>
<td>6257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hip Hop Media Lounge and Other projects: Rasool’s and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hillview Housing Development Project, Delay in – Motion</td>
<td>2256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV Campaign, Get Tested and – Motion</td>
<td>4774</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hon Mcebisi Skwatsha refused entry into Nomination Process</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Increasing racial divisions

 Increased property rates

 Increase in Street Children

 Increase in Rats

 Increase in housing and service delivery protests

 Incorporation of municipal police in SAPS

 Inability of PGWC to address gang violence

 Inability of City of Cape Town to spend its Capital

 Imvelo Responsible Tourism Award

 Importance of conservation of biodiversity resources

 Implementation of Western Cape Planning and Development Act

 Impact of new older persons Act

 Implementation of Planning Act, 1999: debate

 Impact of gang violence

 Illegal sale of state

 Illegal expulsion of learners

 Illegal dumping sites

 IG Monitor Report

 Impacts of violence

 Human Settlements, Integrated and Sustainable

 Human Rights Day: Abuse by ANC of taxpayers’ money

 Huguenot Primary School Mitchells Plain, Opening of

 Housing subsidies, Approval of

 Housing crisis in Western Cape

 Housing and serviced Sites Target

 Housing development in Delft

 Housing Fund’s Annual Report: late submission

 Housing Indaba

 Housing development in Delft

 Housing and serviced Sites Target

 Housing crisis in Western Cape

 Housing subsidies, Approval of

 Housing subsides, Approval of – Motion

 Houses, Poor quality

 Horizon Place of Safety: escape from

 Hours of sitting

 Hout Bay, Building of new housing units in

 Hougton: National Demographics

 Hout Bay, Building of new housing units in

 Human Rights Day: Abuse by ANC of taxpayers’ money

 Human Settlements, Integrated and Sustainable

 Hunting Regulations

 Impact of new older persons Act

 Implementation of Western Cape Planning and Development Act

 Implementation of Planning Act, 1999: debate

 Impact of gang violence

 Impact of conservation of biodiversity resources

 Imvelo Responsible Tourism Award

 Inability of City of Cape Town to spend its Capital

 Inability of PGWC to address gang violence

 Incorporation of municipal police in SAPS

 Increase in housing and service delivery protests

 Increase in Rats

 Increase in Street Children

 Increased property rates

 Increasing racial divisions
Infant deaths in Khayelitsha – Motion.................................................................3447
Inferior Service Deliver in Poor areas - Motion.............................................7043
Inferior service delivery to poor people – Motion .....................................2923
Informal Settlements, Appalling Living Conditions - Motion....................4101
Infrastructure Investment and Development – Motion ...............................7767
Initiation Practices Condemned – Motion ...................................................5867
Initiation sites – Motion.............................................................................2374
Inquiry into Policing, Commission of – Motion .........................................6404
Inspector Wiese and women of Drew, Bonnievale for Hospitality during
search for bodies, Thanks to – Motion..................................................542
Integrated Human Settlement, Development of – Motion ................................5838
Interference with Informal Traders – Motion............................................6501
International Convention Centre: irregularities in award of tender - Motion 8055
International Day for the Eradication of Poverty – Motion .......................8167
International Day of Rural Women – Motion ..............................................8166
International Volunteers Day – Motion.......................................................6632
Interference by Premier in School Visit – Motion .......................................3941
International Children’s Day – Motion.........................................................2303
International Exhibition, Removal of – Motion....................................6415
International Human Rights Day – Motion..............................................4940
International Nurses Day – Motion...............................................................2229
International Women’s Day – Motion.........................................................5152
Investigation: misleading of House by Premier – Motion...............................906
Invitation, Withdrawal of - Motion.............................................................5727
Israeli Team: Peres Peace Centre Sport Program – Motion ..........................8160
Jazz Festival, Cape Town – Motion...............................................................3511
Job losses on farms: myth – Motion.........................................................8197
Job losses: Western Cape – Motion.............................................................8162
Jobs summit – Motion...............................................................................4441
Joe Slovo, two thousand people in: Forced to share 10 toilets – Motion ......4416
Johnson, Maureen – Motion..............................................................7768
June Examination – Motion.................................................................3946
Junior Rugby Championship, International under 20 – Motion.................5910
Kannaland – Motion.............................................................................4141
Kannaland Municipality, Refusal of Department of Local Government
to support struggling – Motion..........................................................4434
Kenny Africa, Appointment of – Motion.......................................................2225
Khayelitsha denied extra policing – Motion.................................................2929
Khayelitsha Fire, Four Children Die – Motion............................................4150
Khayelitsha Protest, Policeman injured in – Motion....................................612
Khayelitsha Schemes, Shutting down of Feeding – Motion.........................4173
Khayelitsha, Vigilantism – Motion...............................................................5726
Khayelitsha Writing Forum – Motion..........................................................4150
Killing of Mgqontshi and Ncatana couple in Philippi East – Motion ..........752
Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens Centennial – Motion................................7662
Kleinmond: participation in small business training programme – Motion ..8331
Knight, Claire – speedy recovery to – Motion..........................................2616
Labourers in farming areas: dissatisfaction – Motion....................................8199
Lack of job opportunities for emerging businesses – Motion.....................2563
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government – Motion........5787
Land from Stellenbosch Municipality to Fifa, Transfer of – Motion............536
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Langa Museum – Motion</td>
<td>4436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Langa, tribute to bridge builder in – Motion</td>
<td>4421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large-Scale Fraud among Northern Cape ANC Leadership – Motion</td>
<td>6571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lavis Drive Primary, Furniture Inventory at – Motion</td>
<td>6499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lavisrylaan Primary School, lack of computers – Motion</td>
<td>8017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner abuse - Motion</td>
<td>8062</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner Transport: rural areas – Motion</td>
<td>7935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners and Educators, Safety of – Motion</td>
<td>4602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners at Athlone School of the Blind returns as Educator – Motion</td>
<td>7045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners Protest about having to pay for Textbooks – Motion</td>
<td>5150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leave of absence – Motion</td>
<td>3437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal blood alcohol level – Motion</td>
<td>7555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal right of provincial government to remove blue lights</td>
<td>2932</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- from police escorts – Motion</td>
<td>2932</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lentegeur Police Station – Motion</td>
<td>8014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lewis, Tobias – Motion</td>
<td>2656</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Financial Situation of – Motion</td>
<td>5859</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lutheran church complex – Motion</td>
<td>7940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lwazi Primary School Gugulethu: IT laboratory hand over</td>
<td>7613</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madikizela, Bonginkosi: non-attendance of meeting – Motion</td>
<td>7783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance of Flats in Townships – Motion</td>
<td>2477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management achievement assessment tool: performance report – Motion</td>
<td>7603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Fisheries and Small Boat Harbours – Motion</td>
<td>3940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management Performance Assessment Tool Report: success - Motion</td>
<td>8056</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandela, Nelson Foundation – Motion</td>
<td>5729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandela Nelson Mr– Motion</td>
<td>7701</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandela Park Housing – Motion</td>
<td>782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manipulation by EMS Staff of Triage System – Motion</td>
<td>2405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manipulation of Crime Figures in Western Cape – Motion</td>
<td>2477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal deaths, rise in – Motion</td>
<td>4414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matters Pertaining to Farmworkers – Motion</td>
<td>6493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matthews, Z J Professor – Motion</td>
<td>7618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marriage of convenience between leaders of DA and ID – Motion</td>
<td>3464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matric Passes, University of Western Cape Project to Improve</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number and Quality of – Motion</td>
<td>4703</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matrics to attend Winter Schools, Encouragement to (Motion)</td>
<td>4013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Max L: Remunerative Work – Motion</td>
<td>4935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Max, Lennit Still in Office – Motion</td>
<td>4935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayoral committee Members, Racist Tactics of – Motion</td>
<td>5900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayoral Committee Member, Untoward Behaviour by – Motion</td>
<td>5868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayor of Cape Town – Motion</td>
<td>7567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McBride, Robert: appointment – IPID</td>
<td>8201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measles outbreak in province – Motion</td>
<td>2122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC Botha’s Intimidating DA Member – Motion</td>
<td>6501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC Dan Plato: Dismissal of allegation – Motion</td>
<td>7891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC De Lille’s reluctance to provide more alternative systems</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- of facilities – Motion</td>
<td>2701</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC Donald Grant: court actions – Motion</td>
<td>8333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC Donald Grant: waste of taxpayers’ money – Motion</td>
<td>8007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC for Community Safety: Role and Duties – Motion</td>
<td>609</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC for Community Safety: Utterances on Dewani murder by – Motion</td>
<td>2931</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MEC for Education, Wasteful expenditure by – Motion ........................................ 592
MEC of community safety negotiating with gangsters – Motion ........................................ 2813
MEC: Leaking of SAPS information and attack on Commissioner – Motion ........................................ 362
MEC Madikizela, criticism of Premier Zille by – Motion ........................................ 4417
MEC Meyer, Ivan – Motion ................................................................................................. 7892
MEC’s to present their departments’ strategic objectives – Motion ........................................ 2689
MEC Winde’s decision to close down some Red Door venues – Motion ........................................ 2613
MEC’S visit to Leliefontein, Paarl – Motion ........................................................................... 4411
Medical students in Cuba – Motion ................................................................................... 7514
Members, Embarrassment and poor treatment of – Motion ........................................ 689
Members, Executive Paid to go on Hunting Trip of – Motion ........................................ 4554
Member of SCOPA, ANC Member Mr M Ozinsky Fitness of – Motion ........................................ 4775
Members, new:
  Announcement .............................................................................................................. 5695
  Election of Premier and Speaker of Western Cape Provincial Parliament .......................... 2
  Oath or Solemn Affirmation ......................................................................................... 1
Members, Statements by .................................................. 9,96,298,528,582,597,648,679,739,775,825,898,
.......................................................................................................................... 924, 970, 1004, 1029,1101,1281,1287,1583,1635,1735,
.......................................................................................................................... 2165, 2115, 2219, 2250, 2291, 2338, 2362, 2397, 2453,
.......................................................................................................................... 2469, 2511, 2549, 2601, 2642, 2691, 2763, 2806, 2850,
.......................................................................................................................... 2916, 2994, 3438, 3455, 3503, 3757, 3933, 3996, 4125,
.......................................................................................................................... 4166, 4310, 4341, 4404, 4426, 4476, 4495, 4586, 4685,
.......................................................................................................................... 4766, 4929, 5140, 5259, 5292, 5718, 5741, 5769, 5828,
.......................................................................................................................... 5850, 5892, 6194, 6250, 6308, 6357, 6397, 6443, 6485,
.......................................................................................................................... 6562, 6622, 7034, 7491, 7548, 7594, 7653, 7759, 7869,
.......................................................................................................................... 7920, 7997, 8046, 8145, 8181, 8312
Members not dealt with even-handedly – Motion ........................................................................ 2927
Memory Centre Project: Ray Alexander Simons ......................................................................... 7615
Mentally challenged: Poor quality healthcare – Motion ........................................ 7771
Metro Police: public accompaniment in certain areas – Motion ........................................ 7611
Midvaal Local Municipality, scandal in – Motion ........................................................................ 4348
Militarisation and police brutality – Motion ........................................................................... 7771
Military Veterans: absence of assistance – Motion ................................................................... 8200
Military Veterans, Assistance to – Motion ............................................................................. 5727
Military Veterans Bill – Motion ............................................................................................... 3476
Military Veterans – Motion .................................................................................................... 4318
Minister and HOD on LUPO’s Unconstitutionality – Motion ........................................ 2773
Minister Anton Bredell: attack on the office of the Auditor-General – Motion .................... 8214
Minister’s Inability to Manage Department of Community Safety. - Motion ...................... 4102
Minister of Education: educational issues – Motion .................................................. 7559
Minister of Education: fence jumping – Motion ...................................................................... 7567
Minister of Education, Refuse to meet with Grabouw Learners – Motion .......................... 5140
Minister of Housing, No-Show of – Motion ......................................................................... 4693
Minister of Human Settlements: Social housing regulatory authority award
  – Motion ......................................................................................................................... 7562
Minister Remarks by Community Safety (Motion) ................................................................. 4099
Minister Saves Saartjie Baartman Centre – Motion ............................................................... 5777
Misleading pamphlet regarding extension of R300 – Motion ............................................... 982
Misrepresentations by ANC – Motion ................................................................................... 834
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Misuse of Office by Minister for Social Development – Motion</td>
<td>2649</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchells Plain: absenteeism - school closures and gang violence – Motion</td>
<td>7933</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchell’s Plain and Role Model trust: bursaries – Motion</td>
<td>7520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchells Plain Hospital, Construction of – Motion</td>
<td>4137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchells Plain Hospital: delay in opening – Motion</td>
<td>7504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchells Plein Hospital: planning and funding – Motion</td>
<td>8196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchells Plain Policing and Vigilantism – Motion</td>
<td>749</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr J J Visser: Statement on Women during debate – Motion</td>
<td>610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modernisation Programme of Provincial Government – Motion</td>
<td>608</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Molo Songololo – Motion</td>
<td>4491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Money-lenders and shebeen owners: effect and impact of – Motion</td>
<td>2371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Money paid to Premier – Motion</td>
<td>4002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moonlight Mass Cycling event – Motion</td>
<td>8325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mossel Bay Municipality – Motion</td>
<td>8329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mossel Bay Municipality Mayor, Racist Stance of – Motion</td>
<td>5912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers Day – Motion</td>
<td>7604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motsoaledi, Aaron: introduction of single anti-retroviral pill – Motion</td>
<td>7522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPAT results – Motion</td>
<td>7700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mthethwa, Nathi: youth and dangers of drug abuse – Motion</td>
<td>7617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Disaster Management Plans, Investigation into – Motion</td>
<td>783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Election, Youth Contribution - Motion</td>
<td>3952</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Governance, status of – Motion</td>
<td>5267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Hostel, in Langa – Motion</td>
<td>4553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal IQ Hotspot Monitor Findings - Motion</td>
<td>5910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Pools, Swimming Training Programmes at – Motion</td>
<td>690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal rates fiasco – Motion</td>
<td>2259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Tenders in Province – Motion</td>
<td>4003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MyCiTi bus system – motion</td>
<td>2770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MyCiTi Public Transport West Coast Route – Motion</td>
<td>4350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name Changes – Motion</td>
<td>1745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name change of streets and public places by DA – Motion</td>
<td>2650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name change of streets and public places by DA – Motion</td>
<td>2650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National ANC-led government, misuse of power by – Motion</td>
<td>4483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National awards to educators – Motion</td>
<td>3451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Competency, Making of Academic Hospitals – Motion</td>
<td>5266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Competencies, Usurpation of – Motion</td>
<td>5910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Day against Child Labour – Motion</td>
<td>7890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Detective Convention award – Motion</td>
<td>7665</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Farmer of the Year - Motion</td>
<td>6374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Freedom Day celebrations – Motion</td>
<td>7505</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Health Insurance – Motion</td>
<td>7606</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Health Insurance, Green Paper on – Motion</td>
<td>4182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Minister of Police – Motion</td>
<td>2375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform – Motion</td>
<td>8157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Reconciliation Day Celebrations – Motion</td>
<td>4939</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nationalisation of South African mines – Motion</td>
<td>4434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Workers Day celebrations – Motion</td>
<td>7506</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NCOP:

Appointment of T B Beylleveldt ......................................................... 2654
Authority of delegation to .............................................................. 6
Permanent delegates, Appointment of .......................................................... 5
New National Youth Agency – Motion .......................................................... 143
NGO’s in Province, Funding Cuts to – Motion ............................................ 6265
Night Schools (Motion) .................................................................................. 4100
Night Shelters, Status – Motion .................................................................. 6201
Non-attendance of committee clerk: no committee meeting held – Motion .... 1643
Nomzame Primary School – Motion .............................................................. 4417
Nondzame Primary School at Pniel, installation of toilets at – Motion ........ 4433
Northpine Primary School: lack of water – Motion ...................................... 8322
Not debating motions of certain members – Motion ..................................... 2931
No Violence Campaign, 16 Days of Activism – Motion .............................. 4697
NSRI Rescue Operation: Crew of Seli 1 – Motion ...................................... 752
N1 “Road of Death”, Ongoing Carnage on – Motion ..................................... 4694
Office of the Speaker: Xenophobia Campaign – Motion ............................ 362
Official of City Council demoted – Motion .................................................. 2344
Offloading of Corpses – Motion .................................................................. 1745
Older Persons Act, implementation of – Motion .......................................... 2370
Ongoing onslaught of DA on constitution and disregard for rule
of law – Motion ......................................................................................... 3468
Open Fields, Women Raped in .................................................................... 4603
Open opportunity society – Motion ............................................................... 606
Organ Donor Month – Motion ..................................................................... 612
Organ Donor Month as August – Motion ...................................................... 2409
Overberg Municipal Council – Motion .......................................................... 2936
Overcrowded Trains, Danger Commuters face in – Motion ......................... 4603
Oversight role of Provincial Parliament, Importance of – Motion .............. 2259
Overstrand Municipality Land Sale – Motion ................................................. 539
Overstrand Municipality: top local authority – Motion ................................. 7569
Overstrand Municipality: 2009 Cleanest Town Competition – Motion ........ 1109
Paarl Hospital and Polar Park Clinic, complaints – Motion ......................... 7785
Paarl, Houses to be Built – Motion ................................................................. 4005
Paarl: town of the year – Motion .................................................................. 7517
Palama certificate: congratulations to members - Motion ............................ 7517
Parent Responsibility: youth delinquency – Motion ..................................... 7934
Parliamentary Committees: Importance and Impact – Motion ..................... 657
Parliamentary Committees, Importance of ................................................. 2345
Parliamentary privilege of freedom of speech – Motion .............................. 7698
Partnership with non-profit organisations – Motion ...................................... 1745
Paulse, Ms S U, Statement of – Motion ......................................................... 656
People Affected by Rains - Motion ............................................................... 4002
People living in low-cost homes at risk of contracting TB – Motion ............ 4485
Peoples’ Republic of China – Motion ............................................................ 5726
Personal Explanation:
(P W Cupido) .............................................................................................. 775
Philippi East: occupation of land – Motion .................................................. 7602
PHP: support by Department of Human Settlements – Motion ................... 2122
Pike, Mama Lizzie, Speedy recovery – Motion .............................................. 4610
Piracy by State of Israel – Motion ................................................................. 2300
Plight of residents of Leonsdale – Motion .................................................... 2260
Police oversight: role and scope - Motion .................................................... 8057
Policemen and policewomen killed in action – Motion .................................. 4352
Primary Health Care Services Delivery

Primary healthcare in the Western Cape

Presiding officers, interference by the Premier – Motion

President Zuma Re

President's Support, Approval of commitment to Youth Wage Subsidy

President Jacob Zuma, visits by

Preparedness for epidemics

Premier: Undermining Stellenbosch Municipality

Premier, Secondment of staff to office of

Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)

Premier, Remuneration of

Premier’s rejection of SAHRC ruling on Makhaza housing debacle

Premier’s Department, Employee Found Guilty

Premier of President of South Africa and other national leaders,

Premier:

Premier’s Appointment of Male MECS – Motion

Premier and DA’s Protection of Mr Kenny Africa – Motion

Premier, Consolidated Monitoring and Evaluation Report of – Motion

Premier Helen Zille: South African Institute for Race Relations

Premier, Misleading statements by – Motion

Premier of President of South Africa and other national leaders,

Snubbing by – Motion

Premier’s Department, Employee Found Guilty – Motion

Premier’s rejection of SAHRC ruling on Makhaza housing debacle – Motion

Premier, Remuneration of – Motion

Premier’s State of the Province Address

Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)

Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed)

Premier, Secondment of staff to office of – Motion

Premier’s SOPA announcement: debate – Motion

Premier: Undermining Stellenbosch Municipality – Motion

Preparedness for epidemics – Motion

President Jacob Zuma, visits by– Motion

President’s Support, Approval of commitment to Youth Wage Subsidy

Motion

President Zuma Re-Elected - Motion

Presiding officers – Motion

Presiding officers, interference by the Premier – Motion

Primary healthcare in the Western Cape – Motion

Primary Health Care Services Delivery – Motion
Princess Vlei: Economic and Environmental implications of shopping mall

- Motion ............................................................................................................. 748

Problems in Housing Project, our Pride, in Eerste River – Motion.......................... 2922

Processes followed by Transport Directorate – Motion ......................................... 7664

Programming Authority’s Role, Engagement of Political Parties in
Legislature with regard to – Motion ......................................................................... 6259

Project in Kuilsriver, “ Adopt a Matriculant “ – Motion .......................................... 5152

Proposed transfer of Land – Motion ........................................................................ 38

Protection of Information Bill - Motion .................................................................... 4774

Province, Anti-Poverty Strategy in – Motion ............................................................. 690

Province, child abuse in – Motion ......................................................................... 905

Province, Violence in Sport in – Motion .................................................................. 609

Provincial Development Council, Closing down of – Motion ................................. 2225

Provincial economic review and outlook .................................................................. 4444, 8117

Provincial Economic Review and Outlook – Tabling and consideration .................. 1042

Provincial Hospitals, Lack of Security at – Motion ................................................. 4102

Provincial Legislature, disregarding of isiXhosa language in – Motion .................. 982

Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]

(Consideration and finalisation) ............................................................................. 4784

Provincial Parliament, Oversight role of – Motion ................................................... 748

Provincial Roads, High accident rate on – Motion .................................................. 655

Provision of water and sanitation to the poor – Motion ........................................... 7501

Public Property, Civil unrest and damage to – Motion ............................................ 5266

Public Protector investigation into code of conduct for City Councillors – Motion ... 7523

Public Transport Plan – Motion ............................................................................. 536

Public school problems and resources – Motion ..................................................... 836

Public transport for schoolchildren – Motion .......................................................... 4349

Punishing of learners for debt and defaults of parents – Motion ............................. 4491

Racist Manager, Sacking of – Motion ...................................................................... 4701

Radio appearances by Premier and Mayor of city of Cape Town – Motion ............. 2564

Raid on House in Storms River way, Mannenberg – Motion .................................. 2699

Raids on communities of Somali origin – Motion .................................................... 2775

Rail Commuter Action Group: Mr Leslie Van Minnen – Motion ......................... 144

Rape and Abuse Crisis under Provincial Government – Motion ......................... 7044

Rape of learner by school teacher - Motion .............................................................. 8166

Rape of student at University of Stellenbosch – Motion ......................................... 3448

Rapid Transit project hits brick wall – Motion ........................................................... 2930

Recognition to First-Aid Services following Bus Accident – Motion ...................... 7054

Reduction of Red Door facilities – Motion ............................................................... 2699

Refuse in informal settlements: refusal to remove - Motion ..................................... 8153

Registrar of members’ interests, Ms R K Begg – Motion ......................................... 3509

Relationship between DA and big business – Motion ............................................. 7660

Removal by Government of Babies from Place of Safety - Motion ......................... 3940

Removal, Community Safety for – Motion ............................................................. 5845

Removal of small business traders – Motion ............................................................ 2226

Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ...................................................... 1624

Report of Auditor-General: Contracts given to Civil Servants – Motion .................. 142

Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4—2010]

(NCOP)(Consideration) ......................................................................................... 1635, 1735
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4-2011] (NCOP) – Consideration ................................................................. 3973
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B33 - 2012] (NCOP) (Consideration) .......................................................... 6520
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Amendment Bill[B17-2011] (NCOP) (Consideration) .................................................... 4784
Report of Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B2-2013] (NCOP) Consideration ................................................................. 7542
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) ................................................................. 1109
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) .... 1273
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints lodged against current and former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament – Motion ......................................................... 1011
Report on role of Pieter van Dalen in shooting of two children in Khayelitsha – Motion .................................................................................. 2520
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) ...................................................................................... 4277, 4562, 4611, 8168
Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Bill [B 14B–2012] (NCOP) (Consideration) ...................................................... 7685
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on the Mental Health Care Amendment Bill [B39B – 2012] (Consideration) ......................................................................................... 8173
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on National Health Amendment Bill [B24d - 2011] (NCOP) (Consideration) .............................................................. 6520
Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the National Health Amendment Bill [B 24F – 2011] (NCOP) Consideration ......................................................................................... 7592
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on Social assistance Amendment bill [B5B—2010] (Consideration) ......................................................................................... 2503
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010] (NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010] (Consideration) ......................................................................................... 3563
Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D-2010] (NCOP) – (Consideration) ......................................................................................... 3982
Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D - 2010] (Reprint) (NCOP) (Consideration) ......................................................................................... 4117
Report of Standing Committee on Education on Further Education and Training Colleges Amendment Bill [B13D - 2011] (NCOP) (Consideration) ................................................................. 4784

Report of Standing Committee on Education, Cultural Affairs and Sport on visit to Uitzig Secondary School (Consideration) .................................................. 1012

Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic development and 2010 world cup on Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B35—2010] (NCOP) (Consideration) .................................................. 2862

Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment Amendment Bill [B42D – 2012] (NCOP) (Consideration) ................................................................. 8175

Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill (B38 – 2013] (NCOP) (Consideration) ........................................................................... 8253


Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the Western Cape Seventeenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B 3–2013] (Consideration) ........................................................................... 7721

Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Community Schemes Ombud Service Bill [B21B - 2011] (NCOP) – Consideration..................3974

Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Sectional Titles - Schemes Management Bill [B20B-2010] (NCOP) - Consideration ................................................................. 3974

Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ................................................................. 757,790

Report of standing committee on community safety on independent Police investigative directorate Bill [b 15b— 2010] and civilian Secretariat for police service bill [B16B—2010] (Consideration)........... 2821, 2862

Report of Standing Committees meeting together regarding their Participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration)................................. 2736

Report of Standing Committee on Governance on National House of Traditional Leaders Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) ................................................................. 910

Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Traditional Leadership and Government Framework Amendment Bill (NCOP) (Consideration)........................................................................... 910


Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the proposed Constitution Eighteenth Amendment Bill (Private Members Bill (Consideration) ........................................................................... 8171

Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health – (Consideration)........................................................................... 4270
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ........................................................................................................... 4286
Report of SIU, Distribution of Interim before its Release - Motion .................................. 4103
Report on Investigation into Conversion of Toyota Quantum Panel
   Vans into Taxi – Motion ................................................................................................. 3616
Report on Study Visit, Standing committee on – Motion ................................................. 5868
Rescue Services and Fire-fighters - Motion ....................................................................... 7057
Research Support Service, Technical and – Motion ........................................................ 4317
Resignations, Current Trend – Motion ............................................................................. 4175
Resolution of ad hoc committee amended – Motion ......................................................... 2923
Results and Effect of Grade 3, 6 and 9 Testing – Motion ................................................... 7043
Results of Oudtshoorn by-elections – Motion .................................................................. 2652
Revival of Bills – Motion .................................................................................................. 1599
Rheenendal bus tragedy: anniversary – Motion ................................................................. 7936
Richdiversity of Culture – Motion .................................................................................... 5835
Rift Valley fever in province – Motion ............................................................................... 2123
Roadblocks over weekend – Motion .................................................................................. 2567
Role of Mark Wiley after Hangberg shootings – Motion .................................................... 2652
Role of Mr Walters in encouraging Overstrand Municipality to commission
   Report – Motion ........................................................................................................... 904
Role of seat of national Parliament in nation-building – Motion ........................................ 932
Rosh Hashanah – Motion .................................................................................................. 6207
Rules Committee:
   Representation of parties .............................................................................................. 7
Rural Areas Development, Opportunities for Growth – Motion ........................................ 4173
Rural Areas, Socio-Welfare and economic circumstances in – Motion ........................... 746
Rural Development: Optimisation – Motion ..................................................................... 538
Ruyterwacht: unfair evictions – Motion ............................................................................. 8324
SA Junior Bodyboarding Champion – Motion .................................................................. 6498
SAA Cancellation of Flights – Motion ............................................................................... 5901
Saartjie Baartman Centre – Motion ................................................................................. 143
Safe festive season to motorists and pedestrians – Motion .............................................. 1293
Safe Transportation of Learners – Motion ....................................................................... 2518
Safety and well-being of children over festive season – Motion ...................................... 1294
Safety at schools –
   Motion......................................................................................................................... 7661
Safety Home Campaign – Motion ...................................................................................... 6251
Safety of People, SAPS Responsible for – Motion ............................................................ 5901
Safety of personnel at hospitals – Motion ......................................................................... 2257
Saldanha Industrial development Region - Motion .............................................................. 5903
Salutation to Desmond Mutengo – Motion ....................................................................... 2710
Salutation to Samora Machel Community – Motion........................................................... 2709
Salutations to Thembisa Dondoshe – Motion .................................................................... 2820
Salute to Liezel Van der Westhuizen - Motion ................................................................. 4114
Salute to Dean Stockenstrom - Motion ............................................................................... 4114
Sanitation crisis in Western Cape: refusal to address - Motion .......................................... 8056
Sanitation: failure to provide – Motion ............................................................................. 7771
Sanitation in informal settlements – Motion ..................................................................... 7705
Sanitation in Khayelitsha: City of Cape Town contract – Motion ..................................... 7561
Sanitation Problems in Khayelitsha – Motion .................................................................... 6494
SAPS, Acts against Drug Dealers – Motion ...................................................................... 6638
Subjects for discussion:

Success of Safely Home Project

Students, Study bursaries to street people in Cape Town and rest of province, Condition and strategies on combating drug abuse and trafficking

St Luke’s Hospice Stellenbosch, Proposed soccer stadium

State of preventive services

Statement by Mr Ozinsky

Stabbing amongst Students in Schools

Sporting facilities in poor areas: failure by government

Sports Day, Change of date of

Sport as unifying factor

Spending on informal settlements

Special Needs Schools: Learners at

Speaker’s Handling of Legislature and its Affairs

Speaker: Acceptance speech by

Announcements

Apology by Deputy Speaker

Celebrating our cultural diversity

Conduct in House

Debates of

Election of

Interpretation

Rulings

Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994

Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women

Speaker’s car accident – Motion

Speaker’s Handling of Legislature and its Affairs - Motion

Special Needs Schools: Learners at

Spending on informal settlements – Motion

Sport as unifying factor – Motion

Sports Day, Change of date of – Motion

Sporting facilities in poor areas: failure by government - Motion

Stabbing amongst Students in Schools – Motion

Statement by member in terms of rule 63(2)

Statement by Mr Ozinsky – Motion

State of health care – Motion

State of preventive services – Motion

Stellenbosch, Proposed soccer stadium in – Motion

St James Church victims: tribute to – Motion

St Luke’s Hospice - Motion

Strategies on combating drug abuse and trafficking – Motion

Street people in Cape Town and rest of province, Condition and care of

Students against Women Abuse (SAWA) – Motion

Students, Study bursaries to – Motion

Success of Safely Home Project – Motion

Subjects for discussion:

Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in Taxi Violence in Western Cape

Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011

Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools

Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address

Conditions in places where poor people live

Cover-up by DA in Swellendam
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .......................................................... 4184
Crisis in Hangberg ................................................................. 2661
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery 4614
Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape .......................... 6212
Economic Empowerment and Development, Success
Acheived in Respect of ............................................................ 5805
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ............................................. 6379
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ....................................................... 2180
Freedom of the City for Us President - Motion ............................. 5861
Floods in Western Cape .......................................................... 4357
Governance of Robben Island .................................................... 2828
Growing inequalities in the Western Cape .................................... 7673
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of – Motion ..... 5873
Heritage Day ............................................................................ 809
Heavy burden on road infrastructure ........................................... 989
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ......................... 1012
Housing development in Delft .................................................... 1047
Human Rights Day ..................................................................... 3476
Illegal Advertising, Proliferation of – Motion ............................... 6451
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ...................... 661
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery .......................... 542
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
prevent recession ........................................................................ 695
Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape .... 7894
Lack of development for young people ........................................ 2262
Looming Strikes at Bus Rapid Transport System – Motion ............ 7041
Lost of Children’s Live on Cape Flats .......................................... 6462
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ............................... 6417
Order of the Day, Point of Order, Programming of ....................... 4269
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ........................................ 5161
Outcomes of 2009-10 annual reports .......................................... 2946, 2949
Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports ....................................... 6588
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ........ 2484
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
against Implementation of ......................................................... 5917
Policing in Mitchells Plain ......................................................... 879
Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the
coming festive season .................................................................. 8336
Problems in Bitou Municipality ................................................. 940
Purpose and functioning of ward committees and
successes and failures of these committees ................................. 4449
Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster
Management .............................................................................. 8124
Removal of small business traders .............................................. 2307
Report of the Commission for Employment Equity on the Western Cape
and the fact that our province still remains resistant to
change ......................................................................................... 7573
Results of Census 2011 ............................................................. 6502
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .................................. 2232
SA Fisheries ............................................................................ 4014
Shortage of Beds at Helderberg Hospital – Motion ....................... 6636
Sixteen days of activism for no violence against women and children and international aids day.........................................................2996
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas ..............................................................................................840
Social challenges with which single parents in Western Cape are Confronted on daily basis .........................................................2863
Socio-economic state since the DA has been in power .........................8221
The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the Western Cape....7525
The problem of unemployment, especially among the young people of our province and country ..................................................7708
The results of the independent testing of learners in Grades 3, 6 and 9 and of the impact of that on the aims of education in the Western Cape.............................................................................................................7620
The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor programmes and proposals that it will be benefiting the people of the Western Cape ......7945
Undermining of Women in the Western Cape ...............................................8067
Socio-Economic Impact, Protest marches becoming Violent of - Motion ....5839
South African Excels Abroad - Motion ..................................................5865
South African Police Service: state of resourcing – Motion .....................7554
Spending, City of Cape Town of – Motion ..........................................4319
Statements made by Premier ................................................................618
Strategy against Violence against Woman and Children - Motion ............7041
Strike in de Doorns, Farm workers - Motion ...........................................6450
Student Uprising, 11 August 1976 – Motion ........................................4144
Success to Grade 12 Learners with upcoming Examination – Motion ......6319
Summonses served on unemployed tenants in townships – Motion ..........2300
Sunflower Foundation – Motion ................................................................7884
Supply chain management and role of speaker and politicians in awarding of tenders and contracts – Motion ........................................2519
Support to municipalities – Motion........................................................7878
Support to WP in Currie Cup final – Motion ..........................................2783
Surprise visit by President Zuma – Motion .............................................2569
Suspension of public sector strike by Unions – Motion ..........................2568
Swellendam DA mayoral committee member : misconduct – Motion ..........8005
Swellendam Municipality – Motion .......................................................6368
Swellendam Municipality: offences, anomalies and bottlenecks – Motion ....2346
Swine Flu, Preparations for outbreak of – Motion ....................................591
Targeting of prostitutes – Motion.............................................................833
Tax, Report on Investigation into Conversion – Motion ..........................3616
Taxi crash: wishes for speedy recovery – Motion ....................................2569
Taxi crisis in Western Cape – Motion .....................................................7502
Taxi Drivers, Course on Road Etiquette for – Motion ............................688
Taxi Industry, Two-Year Peace in - Motion ...........................................5153
Taxis, Reckless driving of – Motion .......................................................306
Taxi, Report on Investigation to be referred back to Committees .............3617
Taxi Strike – Motion ..............................................................................1744
Taxi violence: Delft and Khayelitsha – Motion ........................................8196
Taxpayers’ money on court cases, wasting – Motion ...............................3510
Taxpayers’ money spent by DA bitou municipality in their failed bid to interdict former mayor – Motion ..................................................4487
TB Awareness Month – Motion ................................................................5267
UN Summit on Global Warming COP 17 – Motion ...................................................... 4698
Unwillingness of DA to supply toilets – Motion ............................................................ 2813
Upcoming tourism entrepreneur – Motion ...................................................................... 2229
Utilisation of Stadiums – Motion .................................................................................. 2476
Uys, Pierre: lack of understanding – Motion ................................................................ 8165
Vandalism and violence at schools in the Western Cape – Motion ................................. 7603
Van Dyk, Ernst: tribute to – Motion .............................................................................. 7510
Vehicles, Farm workers Transported on back of – Motion ............................................. 5148
Victim of human trafficking saved – Motion .................................................................. 2934
Victims of houses burnt down in Khayelitsha, Heideveld and Belhar – Motion ........... 2567
Victims of Informal Settlements fires – Motion ............................................................... 5864
Victims of Kayamandi Shack Fires – Motion .................................................................. 7047
Victims of taxi disaster in Blackheath – Motion ............................................................. 2520
Victory for ANC in Witzenberg – Motion ...................................................................... 7060
Vigilantism in Khayelitsha – Motion .............................................................................. 5860
Vindictive war on poor by DA-Led government – Motion ............................................. 2652
Violence Against Farm Dwellers – Motion ..................................................................... 5915
Violence against Women and Children, Praise to Akhona Meyi for Championing ending for – Motion ................................................................. 4561
Violence in schools – Motion ........................................................................................ 2257
Violence on our trains – Motion .................................................................................... 2175
Violent crime of rape – Motion ....................................................................................... 4413
Visit to Britain, Premier Badmouthing our Country and Turning Investors away on – Motion .............................................................. 6326
Ward Committees – Motion .......................................................................................... 4318
Water, Availability and State of – Motion ..................................................................... 6366
Water crisis under DA Government – Motion ............................................................... 2932
Water Scarce Resource ................................................................................................. 5838
Water Wastage by City of Cape Town – Motion ............................................................. 6454
Wastage of taxpayers’ money by DA – Motion ............................................................... 2700
WCED, Educator posts in – Motion ............................................................................... 784
WCED, High number of sexual abuse cases in – Motion ............................................... 591
WCED: vacant posts and supply of qualified teachers – Motion ...................................... 832
WCPP’S unqualified Audit Report – Motion .................................................................. 2407
Wellington, accident near – Motion ............................................................................... 4418
Weltevreeden School in Mitchells Plain: closure of – Motion ........................................ 2649
Wesgro: Nisreen Bulbulia – Motion .............................................................................. 7605
Western Cape Agricultural Sector, awards in – Motion ............................................... 907
Western Cape Agriculture Awards – Motion .................................................................. 5158
Western Cape: best province in South Africa ................................................................ 7606
Western Cape 18th Amendment Act on Gambling and Racing – Motion ...................... 7548
Western Cape Department of Agriculture – Motion ...................................................... 2615
Western Cape Department of Health: poor working conditions – Motion .................... 8010
Western Cape Department of Health: prestige of – Motion ........................................... 7520
Western Cape Department of Social Development – Motion ......................................... 4444
Western Cape, failures of DA in government in – Motion ............................................. 4482
Western Cape farming communities, fetal alcohol syndrome in – Motion .................... 4484
Western Cape, Free pap smears for Women in – Motion ............................................... 594
Western Cape Fruit Producers: crop damage – Motion ................................................. 8328
Western Cape Government Absent from Deputy President’s Speech
  At NCOP - Motion ........................................................................................................ 7042
  Western Cape government relationship: gang leaders – Motion .................................. 7878
  Western Cape Hospitals, Security and Safety of – Motion ........................................ 537
  Western Cape Model of Land Reform – Motion .......................................................... 2403
  Western Cape, Storm damage in – Motion .................................................................. 364
  Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Modernisation Strategy of – Motion ............... 592
  Western Cape remains “Drug Capital” of SA – Motion .............................................. 4415
  Western Cape road infrastructure – Motion ................................................................ 935
  Western Cape, shack fires in – Motion ........................................................................ 4349
  Western Cape Spatial Development Framework – Motion ......................................... 937
  Western Cape, successes of DA in – Motion ............................................................... 4484
  Western Cape, Twelve per cent with FAS in – Motion .............................................. 4415
  Western Cape, worsening situation with killing, abuse and poor treatment of children in – Motion ............................................................... 4483
  West Coast Deputy Municipal Manager R1 million paid to – Motion ...................... 4350
  Widening of racial divide under DA government – Motion ........................................ 2774
  Wilberforce, William and the Abolition of Slavery – Motion .................................... 4775
  Witzenberg youth: Parliamentary visit – Motion ...................................................... 8220
  Woman and Children, 16 Days of Activism against abuse and violence of – Motion .......................................................................................................................... 6575
  Women Redefining Leadership .................................................................................. 4069
  Women’s Day, Premier and Commemoration of – Motion .......................................... 4136
  Women in Western Cape Province, Status of – Motion ............................................. 16
  Woodstock Police Station, Crime situation around and its proposed move
    – Worcester hospital – Motion .............................................................................. 3446
  World Aids Day – Motion ......................................................................................... 8335
  World Food Day – Motion ......................................................................................... 8159
  Xenophobia in De Doorns: investigative and disciplinary process
    – Motion ................................................................................................................ 1036
  Xenophobia, plans to deal with – Motion .................................................................... 2346
  Xenophobic violence in province – Motion .................................................................. 2369
  Yengini, Lumka – Motion ......................................................................................... 7057
  Young Adult Youth, Issue of – Motion ...................................................................... 16
  Youth, International Year of – Motion ....................................................................... 4147
  Youth, Strategies to Deal with Social Ills Affecting – Motion .................................... 5147
  Zeekoevlei High School: Building of fence and closing of school – Motion ............ 3511
  Zero-tolerance approach of WCED – Motion .............................................................. 1894
  16 Days of Activism: No Violence Against Women and Children – Motion .......... 7447
  110% Green Campaign – Motion ............................................................................. 5904
  515 Suspects in Mitchells Plain, Arrest of – Motion ............................................... 6457
  2010 Soccer: involvement of structures in sports, arts and culture – Motion .......... 1592
  2010 Soccer World Cup, Legacy of – Motion ............................................................ 2225
  2010 Soccer World Cup: Public Transport – Motion ................................................ 538
  2010 Soccer World Cup, Readiness of Western Cape hospitals for – Motion ....... 2258
  2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, disaster management readiness during
    Motion ..................................................................................................................... 932
  2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, preparations for – Motion .......................... 906
INDEX TO SPEECHES

ADAMS, F (NCOP)
  Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .................................................. 758,795
  Report of Standing Committees meeting together regarding their Participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ................................ 2738
  Statements ........................................................................................................... 685

BEERWINKEL, C F
  Absence of student governance structures in Western Cape schools ........... 8153
  Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ............ 915
  Allegations against Eindhoven Primary School in Delft ............................... 2702
  ANC infrastructure/foreign direct investment intelligence report ................ 7614
  Bo-Kaap residents: lack of tourists ................................................................. 8324
  Bredasdorp: skills development project ......................................................... 7523
  Cape Film Commission: funding constraints .................................................. 7604
  Cape Town International Convention Centre Company Amendment Bill [B 10B - 2012] (Finalisation) .......................................................... 7097
  Celebration of Eid-Al-Adha ................................................................................ 6369
  Children, conditions under which children grow up ...................................... 2304
  City of Cape Town, implications of growth of .................................................. 932
  City of Cape Town, implications of growth of .................................................. 932
  Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ........................................................................................................... 4151
  Closure or amalgamation of schools ................................................................. 3465
  Condolence, Motion of:
    Blecher, Ian ...................................................................................................... 8013
    Death of two boys from George gymnasium ................................................... 2660
    Death of Western Cape learners ..................................................................... 3449
    Family of seven and baby ................................................................................ 1746
    Gxagxisa-Mpetsheni, Nozipho ....................................................................... 8329
    Jack, Neville Michael ...................................................................................... 4558
    Kakaza, Leslie .................................................................................................. 4112
    Schoolchildren and those who have died playing sport ................................... 1595
  Confusion caused by MEC Grant’s announcement ............................................. 2612
  Congratulations:
    Cavellereia Primary School .......................................................................... 5153
    Chiu Alexander ............................................................................................... 3950
    Educators awarded gold stars ....................................................................... 2655
    Equal Education .............................................................................................. 2411
    Gordhan, Pravin: Finance Minister of the Year .............................................. 8155
    Growsmart literacy programme ..................................................................... 3452
    Hector Peterson High School ......................................................................... 2619
    Kallis, Jacques .................................................................................................. 2936
    Kotze Dewaldre ............................................................................................... 2377
    Learners, Grade 12 ......................................................................................... 4558
    Luhlaza High School to pupils ....................................................................... 2657
    Matie Students .................................................................................................. 2707
    Noolele, Phelokazi ........................................................................................... 2939
    Principal of Gardens Commercial High School ............................................ 2782
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Athletic Trials</td>
<td>2306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sattar, Hawa Bebe</td>
<td>3516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solomons, Boebie</td>
<td>2466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Peninsula High School</td>
<td>4325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speedy recovery to Agassi Africa</td>
<td>3472</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springfield High School</td>
<td>2348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Square Kilometre Array (SKA)</td>
<td>5872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uys, Ashley</td>
<td>7887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wentzel, Shaun</td>
<td>4011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Primary Schools Athletics Team</td>
<td>1644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crisis, Tourism industry in</td>
<td>4103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dire straits of farmers and communities in Southern Cape</td>
<td>904</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of</td>
<td>7981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Education – Motion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drownings of schoolchildren</td>
<td>1590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic development partnership</td>
<td>7504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>6366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive statement: De Doorns</td>
<td>2336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fashion Week Gala Dinner: wastage by Mayor de Lille</td>
<td>7933</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding of no-fee schools for poor: achievements of ANC</td>
<td>8326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Economic Accord, Singing of</td>
<td>4702</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House, Business of</td>
<td>6682</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illegal expulsion of learners</td>
<td>3446</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Convention Centre: irregularities in award of tender</td>
<td>8055</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job losses: Western Cape</td>
<td>8162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kleinmond: participation in small business training programme</td>
<td>8331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lavisrylaan Primary School, lack of computers</td>
<td>8017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June Examination</td>
<td>3946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matrics to attend Winter Schools, Encouragement to</td>
<td>4013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC Donald Grant: court actions</td>
<td>8333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC Winde’s decision to close down some Red Door venues</td>
<td>2613</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misleading pamphlet regarding extension of R300</td>
<td>982</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moonlight Mass Cycling event</td>
<td>8325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northpine Primary School: lack of water</td>
<td>8322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office of Premier, Secondment of staff</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pregnancy, rewarding girls who don’t fall pregnant</td>
<td>2299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening Address of</td>
<td>1513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)</td>
<td>5039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOPA (debate)</td>
<td>3340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Princess Vlei: Economic and Environmental implications of shopping</td>
<td>748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mall</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rape of learner by school teacher</td>
<td>8166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship between DA and big business – Motion</td>
<td>7660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration)</td>
<td>1628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement</td>
<td>1118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Service Increased, Local Goods Procurement of ........................................... 4560

Shutting down of Social and Informal Economy .............................................. 7046

Speaker’s Debate:
Celebrating our cultural diversity .................................................................. 2623
Economic Freedom of the Youth ................................................................. 3971

Special Needs Schools: Learners at............................................................... 2405

Statements..............582,602,974,1007,2118,2165, 2294, 2364, 2454, 2472, 2513, 2604, 2694, 3440, 3757, 4344, 4586, 4685, 4932, 5853, 7498, 7596 8050, 8148

Subject for discussion:
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ............................................ 2379
Conditions in places where poor people live ................................................. 2527
Empowerment and Development, Success
Achieved in Respect of ............................................................................ 5805
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ........................................ 1014
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
prevent recession ............................................................................. 701
Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape ............. 7895
Lack of development for young people ....................................................... 2268
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ........................................... 6417
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ...................................................... 5169
Policing in Mitchells Plain ........................................................................ 885
Problems in Bitou Municipality ................................................................. 948
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural
areas ................................................................................................. 852
The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the
Western Cape .................................................................................. 7530
The results of the independent testing of learners in Grades 3, 6
and 9 and of the impact of that on the aims of education in the
Western Cape .................................................................................. 7627
The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor
programmes and proposals that it will be benefiting the
people of the Western Cape ................................................................ 7948
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in ....................................................... 2421
Taxis, Reckless driving of ......................................................................... 306
UCC Primary School. Closure of Grootkraal ............................................ 4101
Underutilisation of former Model C school buildings ................................ 1895
Weltewreden School in Mitchells Plain: closure of ................................. 2649
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..................... 1337

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ................................................ 4877
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ........................................ 4883
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .......................................................... 4972
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B4-2012](2011/2012 Financial Year)
(Consideration of Principle) ..................................................................................... 5275
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) ..................................................................................... 8397
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................................... 347
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ................................ 377
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................................................. 406
Vote 11 – Agriculture ....................................................................................... 498
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................................... 1868
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 2047
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Consideration of principle ............................................................................... 3532
Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................................... 3843
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ......................................................... 5447
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .................................................... 5681
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) .......................................................... 7065
Western Cape Spatial Development Framework ................................................. 937
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .......................................................... 7136
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .................................................... 7152
Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ........................................................................... 7461
Western Cape Eighteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B 4 – 2013] (Consideration) .......................................................... 7861
Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency Amendment Bill [B 1 – 2013] (Finalisation) .......................................................... 7857
Western Cape Seventeenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B 3 – 2013] .......................................................... 7859
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................................................... 5738
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B7 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................................................... 8247
Xenophobia, plans to deal with ..................................................................... 2346
Zero-tolerance approach of WCED .............................................................. 1894

BEKKER, J
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ............. 914
Condolence, Motion of:
Mantashe, Madolwana and Cilliers, Messrs .................................................. 1294
Ncedana, Mr V ....................................................................................... 1645
Nonzwana, Ntombizonke................................................................. 908
Executive statement: De Doorns.................................................. 2337
Houses, Poor quality........................................................................ 690
Premier: .......................................................................................... 698
  Opening Address of........................................................................ 58, 1497, 1518
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)......................... 6905
  SOPA (debate).............................................................................. 3363
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
  Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration).......................... 1627
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
  (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
  (Consideration)........................................................................... 1114
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
  Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration)...... 1276
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
  in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration)...................................... 759,793
Speaker’s Debate:
  Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship.................................. 86
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
    Children.................................................................................. 1137
Statements....................................................................................... 900, 2117, 2168, 2398
Subject for discussion:
  Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ............................ 2382
  Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape.................... 994
  High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River.......................... 1018
  Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system...................... 663
  Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape...... 546
  Problems in Bitou Municipality................................................... 952
  Removal of small business traders.............................................. 2314
  Statements made by Premier...................................................... 622
  Taxis, Reckless driving of ......................................................... 306
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport........................................... 1231
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism............................ 1311
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works........................................ 1324
  Vote 1 – Premier......................................................................... 1362
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport........................................... 202
  Vote 1 – Premier......................................................................... 223
  Vote 6 – Health.......................................................................... 283
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism............................ 345
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works........................................ 403
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading............................................................................ 1671
  Vote 1 – Premier......................................................................... 1760
  Vote 5 – Education....................................................................... 1871
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury....................................................... 1902
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism............................ 1957
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport........................................... 2045
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works........................................ 2069
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill
[B6—2009] Consideration of principle .......................................................... 1081
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, preparations for .................................. 906

BEVU, T N
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .......... 914
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .......................... 2582
Closing ............................................................................................................. 6792
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School and Implications thereof .......... 5745
Condolence, Motion of:
  Asmal, Kader .............................................................................................. 3978
  Farewell, Mr P M Jacobs ........................................................................... 4322
  Khonjiwa, Nombulelo ................................................................................. 3061
  Mantashe, Madolwana and Cilliers, Messrs ............................................. 1294
  Ncedana, Mr V .......................................................................................... 1645
  Ndayi, Mr .................................................................................................. 4422
  Nonzwana, Ntombizonke ......................................................................... 908
Executive statement: De Doorns .................................................................. 2337
House, Business of ....................................................................................... 6682
Houses, Poor quality .................................................................................... 690
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ....................... 5793
Nationalisation of South African mines ...................................................... 4434
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ............................................. 6417
Pike, Mama Lizzie, Speedy recovery ............................................................ 4610
Premier:
  Opening Address of ................................................................................... 58, 1518
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ..................................... 5044
  SOPA (debate) .......................................................................................... 3344
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ........................................ 1627
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
  Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health –
  (Consideration) .......................................................................................... 4274
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
  (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
  (Consideration) .......................................................................................... 1114
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) .......... 1276
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
  on Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010]
  (NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010]
  (NCOP)(Consideration) .............................................................................. 3564
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ................................................... 759,793
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
  (Consideration) .......................................................................................... 4294
Speaker’s Debate:
  Celebrating our cultural diversity ................................................................ 2627
  Economic Freedom of the Youth .............................................................. 3964
  Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 ..................................... 4390
  Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ......................................... 86
Women Redefining Leadership .......................................................... 4079
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ......................................................... 4752
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against
Women and Children........................................................................ 1137
Statements....................................................................................... 900, 2117, 2168, 2471, 2693, 3457, 4548, 4588, 4686
.............................................................. 5261, 52946196, 6252, 6445, 6487, 7494, 7597, 7654, 7689
.............................................................. 7999, 8147, 8315

Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape........................................................ 6342
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools............................... 2382
Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address......... 7811
Cover-up by DA in Swellendam...................................................... 5422
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape.................. 994
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River............................ 1018
Human Rights Day ......................................................................... 3481
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system....................... 663
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape.... 546
Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape...... 7900
Problems in Bitou Municipality......................................................... 952
Purpose and functioning of ward committees and
successes and failures of these committees...................................... 4458
Removal of small business traders.................................................. 2314
Socio-economic state since the DA has been in power................... 8231
Statements made by Premier......................................................... 622
Taxis, Reckless driving of ............................................................... 306
The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the
Western Cape................................................................................... 7527
The problem of unemployment, especially among the young people
of our Province and country.............................................................. 7712
Undermining of Women in the Western Cape................................. 8070

Tribute to the former President of the Republic of South Africa
- Mr Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela ...................................................... 8453

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport.................................................. 1231
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism............................. 1311
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works........................................... 1324
Vote 1 – Premier............................................................................ 1362
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works........................................... 3899

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport.................................................. 202
Vote 1 – Premier............................................................................ 223
Vote 6 – Health............................................................................... 283
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism............................. 345
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works........................................... 403

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading............................................................................... 1671
Vote 1 – Premier............................................................................ 1760
Vote 5 – Education.......................................................................... 1871
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury......................................................... 1902
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 — 2011]

Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................................. 2069

Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 — 2012]

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 — 2011]

Vote 14 – Local Government ................................................................. 3576

Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ...................................... 3142

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B9 — 2010]

Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................................. 3103

Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ................................................................. 3142

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]

Vote 8 – Housing ................................................................................ 3135

Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ...................................... 3148

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]

Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................................. 2045

(Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ............................................. 6781

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]

(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ..................................... 6715

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]

(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ................................................................. 6729

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]

(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .............................................. 4953

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]

(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ............................................. 6707

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on 
Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) ........................................ 6688

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 — 2011]

Vote 14 – Local Government ................................................................. 3576

Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................................... 3604

Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................................. 3899

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]

(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ................................................................. 5360

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – 
Agriculture) ..................................................................................... 5654

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – 
Economic Development and Tourism) .............................................. 5679

2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, preparations for ..................... 906

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 3 – 
Provincial Treasury) ........................................................................ 7133

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – 
Economic Development and Tourism) .............................................. 7151

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]

(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ) ............................ 7267

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]

(Debate on Vote 6 - Health) ................................................................. 7320

Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill

[B6 — 2009] Consideration of principle .............................................. 1081

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]

(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 5737
BEYLEVELDT, T [NCOP]
Premier:
SOPA (debate) ............................................................................. 3343

BOESAK, A A
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................. 44
Statements .................................................................................. 651,741,927
Subject for discussion:
Heritage Day ............................................................................. 813
Outcomes of 2009-10 annual reports ...................................... 2952
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .................................................................... 847
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle ......................................................... 118
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................. 255
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 375
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................ 495
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................ 518

BOTHÁ, T L
Ad Hoc Committee .................................................................... 2857
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ............................. 916
Closing ....................................................................................... 1392, 6789, 8447
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School and Implications thereof .......... 5750
Executive Statement .................................................................. 6189
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ...................... 5797
Premier:
Opening Address of ................................................................. 41, 1533
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................... 6926
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed) ........... 6983
SOPA (debate) ........................................................................... 3322
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ........................................ 1629
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) ....... 1276
Report of Standing Committees meeting together regarding their Participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ..................... 2750
Speaker’s Debate:
Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 ....................... 4400
International Aids Day ................................................................ 1098
Statements ................................................................................ 96, 5895
Subject for discussion:
Crisis in Hangberg .................................................................. 2677
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery ................................................................. 4627
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .................... 674
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape .... 542
Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape .... 7897
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ........... 2495
Outcomes of 2009-10 annual reports ........................................... 2957
Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the coming festive season.......................................................... 8340
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas........ 840
Socio-economic state since the DA has been in power......................... 8223
Statement by Mr Ozinsky .................................................................. 4552
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle.................................................................. 1166
Vote 6 – Health.................................................................................. 1180, 1189
Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill [B7-2009]
Western Cape District Health Councils Bill [B6B—2010]
Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B7B—2009]
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 6 – Health.................................................................................. 266,291
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health)................................................................. 4856
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle)................................................................. 6639
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health)................................................................. 6719
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading.................................................................................. 1677
Vote 6 – Health.................................................................................. 1913, 1936
(Consideration and Finalisation)......................................................... 2944
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Consideration of principle................................................................. 3535
Vote 6 – Health.................................................................................. 3677, 3698
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle)........................................................................ 5310
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 – Health).......................................................................... 5519, 5545
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle)........................................................................ 7061
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 6 - Health)................................................................. 7299
Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B7B—2009]
(Consideration and finalisation).......................................................... 2754, 2759
Western Cape District Health Councils Bill [B6B—2010]
(Consideration and Finalisation)......................................................... 2944, 2946
Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill [B7-2012]
(Consideration and finalisation)......................................................... 6677
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle)............................................................... 5736
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B7 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle)............................................................... 8248

BREDELL, A W
Closing .............................................................................................. 1391
Condolence, Motion of:
Duncan, Sheena .............................................................................. 2227
Congratulations, Motion of:
De Jager, Gideon .............................................................................. 4012
Farewell, Hon Member P M Jacobs.................................................... 4320
Former President Nelson Mandela ..................................................... 5151
Fourie, Hendrik ................................................................................. 4012
Executive statement: De Doorns....................................................... 2334
Modernisation Programme of Provincial Government............................................. 608
Power between Executive and Legislature, Separation of ..................................... 687
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................................................. 39, 1469
Executive Statement .................................................................................................. 2395
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate).................................................... 5018
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed)..................................... 5103
Rejection of SAHRC ruling on Makhaza housing debacle ........................................ 2404
Statements .................................................................................................................. 1281, 4166, 4311
Subject for Discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ................................................................. 4711
Cover-up by DA in Swellendam .................................................................................. 5426
Floods in Western Cape .............................................................................................. 4371
Governance of Robben Island .................................................................................... 2830
Growing inequalities in the Western Cape ................................................................. 7674
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River .................................................... 1016
Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the coming festive season ................................................................. 8345
Problems in Bitou Municipality ................................................................................... 950
Purpose and functioning of ward committees and successes and failures of these committees ................................................................. 4463
Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster Management .................................................................................................................. 8140
Results of Census 2011 .............................................................................................. 6504
Role of Provincial Government in .............................................................................. 2423
The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor programmes and proposals that it will be benefiting the people of the Western Cape ........................................................................... 7958
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ................................................................. 1242, 1254
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .................................... 1335, 1345
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ................................................................ 4829, 4835
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ................. 4866, 4872, 4873
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) .................................................................. 6694, 6698
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .................. 6699, 6700
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 6700
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Local Government ....................................................................................... 166,183
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..................................... 365,387
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 14 – Local Government ...................................................................................... 1802, 1822
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..................................... 1999, 2021
BROWN, L

ANC Centenary Celebrations to Mark 100 years of Selfless Struggle
By people of South Africa................................................................. 4605

Biko, Steve Bantu, Commemoration of ........................................... 8058

Closing .......................................................................................... 1391, 6790

Condolence, Motion of:
Duncan, Sheena ............................................................................. 2227
Gorvalla, Pat: Dr ............................................................................. 8202
Isaacs, Sulaiman ............................................................................. 8326
Maite, Tebogo ................................................................................ 8207
Olifant, Danny ............................................................................... 6407
People of Japan .............................................................................. 3470
Swanson-Jacobs, Jean ................................................................. 7774
Uys, Theunis .................................................................................. 6268

Congratulations:
Community of Hangberg, Sanparks and Western Cape High Court.... 2707
De Jager, Gideon ............................................................................ 4012
Farewell, Hon Member P M Jacobs .............................................. 4320
Former President Nelson Mandela ................................................. 5151
Fourie, Hendrik ............................................................................. 4012
Grade 12 learners........................................................................... 2703
South Africa Government ............................................................. 2816

Disdain shown towards Chapter 9 Institutions .............................. 7696

Employment Equity Amendment Bill .......................................... 8323
Employment equity report ............................................................ 7501
Marriage of convenience between leaders of DA and ID................. 3464
Matthews, Z J Professor ................................................................. 7618
Midvaal Local Municipality, scandal in ............................................................... 4348
Modernisation Programme of Provincial Government ..................................... 608
Name change of streets and public places by DA ............................................. 2650
National Freedom Day celebrations .................................................................. 7505
Power between Executive and Legislature, Separation of ................................. 687
Premier:
  Executive Statement ......................................................................................... 2395
  Opening Address of ......................................................................................... 39, 1469
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ........................................... 6897
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ........................................... 5018
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed) ........................... 5103
President Zuma, being appointed to Unsecretary’s Education first
  Initiative to (L Brown) ...................................................................................... 6259
Reduction of Red Door facilities ........................................................................ 2699
Rejection of SAHRC ruling on Makhaza housing debacle ............................. 2404
Resolution of ad hoc committee amended ...................................................... 2923
Snubbing by – Motion ...................................................................................... 3509
Small Business .................................................................................................. 6267
Speakers Debate:
  Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ..................................... 6277
Statements ........................................................................................................ 10,681,924,1005,1584,2251, 2362, 2511, 2549, 2764, .. 3455, 3935, 4166, 4311, 5893, 6251, 6444, 6485, 6562, 7034, 7492, 7760
  ......................................................................................................................... 7998, 8316
Subject for discussion:
  Achieved in Respect of .................................................................................. 5808, 5817
  Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ...................................................... 4706
  Crisis in Hangberg ......................................................................................... 2679
  Empowerment and Development, Success
  Governance of Robben Island ........................................................................ 2829
  National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
  against Implementation of ............................................................................... 5919
  Removal of small business traders .................................................................. 2311
Report of the Commission for Employment Equity on the
  Western Cape and the fact that our province still remains
  resistant to change ......................................................................................... 7573
  Results of Census 2011 .................................................................................. 6502, 6507
  SA Fisheries ..................................................................................................... 4019
  Socio-economic state since the DA has been in power .................................. 8221, 8245
  Statements made by Premier ........................................................................ 624
  Undermining of Women in the Western Cape .............................................. 8067, 8088
Tribute to the former President of the Republic of South Africa
  – Mr Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela .................................................................. 8450
Visit to Britain, Premier Badmouthing our Country and Turning
  Investors away on ......................................................................................... 6326
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
  Role of Provincial Government in .................................................................. 2425
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................................ 1364
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading ............................................................................................... 1654
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................................ 1755
Consideration of Votes and Schedules .................................................. 2157
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Consideration of principle ................................................................. 3521
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .............................................................. 3559
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism.................................. 3743
  Vote and Schedules ........................................................................... 3918
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) ............................................. 4898
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................... 6641
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ............................................ 6787
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................... 8387
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .............................................................. 7113
Western Cape, failures of DA in government in .................................. 4482
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of
  Votes and Schedule) ........................................................................... 5731, 3733
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]
  (Consideration and finalisation) .......................................................... 5784
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................... 5739
Withdrawal and Reduction of Funding .................................................. 3764

CARLISLE, R V
Ad Hoc Committee ............................................................................... 2858
Announcements .................................................................................... 4117
Premier:
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................... 5060, 6935
  SOPA (debate) .................................................................................. 3330
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
  Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of
  Health – (Consideration) ...................................................................... 4277
Speaker’s Debate:
  Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 ......................... 4391
Subject for discussion:
  Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
    Taxi Violence in Western Cape .......................................................... 6351
  Empowerment and Development, Success
    Achieved in Respect of ................................................................. 5824
  Freedom Day: 16 Years later .............................................................. 2193
  Growing inequalities in the Western Cape .................................... 7681
  Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .................. 5880
  Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .................. 1000
  Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape .... 7905
  Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government .......... 2499
  Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the
    coming festive season ..................................................................... 8356
  Problems in Bitou Municipality ......................................................... 957
  Removal of small business traders ................................................. 2321
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .............................................................. 2245
Statements made by Premier ...................................................................................... 631
The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the Western Cape .................. 7538
The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor programmes and proposals that it will be benefiting the people of the Western Cape ................................................................. 7971
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Consideration of principle .......................................................................................... 1158
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................................................... 1317, 1328
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ............................................. 4815
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ........................................................................................................... 5427, 5455
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) .................................................................................... 6666
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 6704
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ............................................. 6762
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ................................................. 6935
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ) ............................................ 7248, 7270
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
  (Consideration of Principle) .................................................................................... 8422
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle ........................................................................................ 119
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................................................. 392,415
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading ......................................................................................................... 1668
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................................................. 2054, 2076
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Consideration of principle ........................................................................................ 3544
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................................................. 3881, 3910
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]
  (Consideration and finalisation) ............................................................................. 6673, 6677

CUPIDO, P W
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ......................... 914
ANC Centenary Celebrations, Spending Taxpayers’ money
  On ............................................................................................................................. 4606
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ........................................ 2586
Closing ....................................................................................................................... 1392
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ............... 4151
Closure of drug rehabilitation centres ........................................................................ 2814
Condolence, Motion of:
  Hale, Corne .......................................................................................................... 4777
  Klein, Tom .............................................................................................................. 2479
  Nkosi, Lewis ......................................................................................................... 2614
Congratulations:
Crowster, Sharon .............................................. 4776
Hendrick Mikhail .................................................. 3946
Knyasa Circuit Court ........................................... 4437
Kraaifontein Police Station ................................... 2569
Metro Police ...................................................... 4442
Mycroft, Michaela ............................................... 4696
Niekerk, Carla ................................................... 3946
Springboks ....................................................... 4356
Economic potential and forecast beyond 2010 .................. 835
Executive statement: De Doorns ................................ 2337
Free Trade Zone/Port in Cape Town, Establishment of ....... 688
Gang-related violence on Cape Flats ................................ 2257
Health care, Improving delivery of ............................... 4432
Health Practitioners: Scrapping of names ......................... 607
Member of SCOPA, ANC Member Mr M Ozinsky Fitness of .... 4775
Metro Police ...................................................... 4146
Municipal Pools, Swimming Training Programmes at ........... 690
Municipal Tenders in Province ................................... 4003
Personal Explanation ........................................... 775
Policemen and policewomen killed in action ....................... 4352
Police Officials, Killings and Suicides amongst ................. 4136
Premier: .................................................................. 53, 1508
Opening Address of .................................................. 5037
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............... 3335
SOPA (debate) ..................................................... 4774
Protection of Information Bill ....................................... 4349
Public transport for schoolchildren .................................. 3448
Rape of student at University of Stellenbosch .................... 2226
Removal of small business traders .................................... 4126
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ................. 1626
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) ............................................. 1115
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ................. 759,799
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health – (Consideration) ........................................... 4274
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) ........................................... 4611
Research Institutions, Three Cape Town ......................... 4609
SAPS ................................................................. 4146
Schools, Violence in ................................................ 539
Shoprite/Checkers Women of the Year Award, Women for Receiving Annual ..................................................... 4105
Smith, Graeme and Wife .......................................... 4144
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .................. 848
Social challenges with which single parents in Western Cape are confronted on daily basis ........................................... 2868
Speaker’s Debate:
Crisis in Hangberg .......................................................... 2673
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ..................................... 1612
International Aids Day .......................................................... 1090
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ........ 2357
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ............................ 90
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women .................................... 2438
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and Choices .......................................................... 574
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children .................................................. 4749

Statements .................................................................. 14,535,601,653,686,744,780,830,977,1008,1105,1286,
........................................................................ 1588,2172,2224,2255,2298,2343,2458,2475,2516,2558,
........................................................................ 2609, 2648, 2768, 2812, 3444, 3938, 4097, 4134, 4431, 4501,
...................................................................................... 4551, 4591, 4690, 4772, 4934

Street people in Cape Town and rest of province, Condition and
Care of ........................................................................... 2174
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ..................................... 4716
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ......................... 2381
Conditions in places where poor people live ................................ 2534
Cover-up by DA in Swellendam ................................................. 5423
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
Delivery ........................................................................ 4614, 4635
Economic Freedom of the Youth ................................................ 3965
Floods in Western Cape .......................................................... 4364
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ..................................................... 2190
Governance of Robben Island .................................................... 2832
Heritage Day ........................................................................ 820
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ......................... 1016
Housing development in Delft ..................................................... 1048
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .................... 670
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape.. 553
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
prevent recession ................................................................ 706
Lack of development for young people ........................................ 2271
Overcrowded Trains, Danger Commuters face in ......................... 4603
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ........ 2494
Policing in Mitchells Plain ......................................................... 884
Removal of small business traders .............................................. 2307
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ................................ 2237
SA Fisheries ........................................................................ 4025
Sixteen days of activism for no violence against women and children
and international aids day ........................................................ 3002
Traffic Officials .................................................................... 4146
Traffic Police Officer, shortage of .............................................. 4100
Transnet strike, Impact of ........................................................ 2259
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ......................... 4567

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................. 1211
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................ 1222
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ................................................................. 1252
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................................................. 1268
Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................................................ 1300
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................................. 1312
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................................................. 1326
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............................... 1344
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .................................................................................. 1355
Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................................................... 1366
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .............................................................................. 1375

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ........................................................................... 4812
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ........................................... 4816
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ............................................................. 4830
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) .............................................................. 4840
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................................................ 4858
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ............................................................ 4952
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Finalisation) ......................................................................................................... 4975
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] –
Second Reading .................................................................................................. 1667
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................................................. 1709
Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................................................... 1758
Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................................................ 1785
Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................................................... 1815
Vote 8 – Housing .................................................................................................. 1844

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011] – (Debate on Vote 1 –
Premier) .............................................................................................................. 4803

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011] –
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................................. 3752
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............................... 3780
Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................................................... 3807
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................................................ 3842
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................................................. 3898

Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B7B—2009] – (Consideration and finalisation) .................................................................................................................. 2757

Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
[B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) .......................................................... 3988

Western Cape Land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill
[B4-2011].................................................................................................................. 3990

Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
[B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ....................................................... 4945

Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill
[B6—2009]Consideration of principle ...................................................................... 1081

Women in Western Cape Province, Status of ....................................................... 16

2010 Soccer World Cup: Public Transport ......................................................... 538
2010 Soccer World Cup, Readiness of Western Cape hospitals for ............................................. 2258
 Trafficking ........................................................................................................................................ 748
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament: Sex industry and Human .................................................. 2258

DE BEER, O (NCOP)
Subject for discussion:
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to .................................................. 703
prevent recession

DE LILLE, P
Subject for discussion:
Governance of Robben Island ........................................................................................................ 2842
SA Fisheries .................................................................................................................................... 4017
Social challenges with which single parents in Western Cape are ................................................. 2871
confronted on daily basis
Speaker's Debate:
Women Redefining Leadership ....................................................................................................... 4077
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ......................................................................................................... 4750
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8–2011]
(Debate on Vote 7 –Social Development) ...................................................................................... 4951, 4956
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................................................................ 3636, 3654

DE VILLIERS, M J R
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ............................................................ 2584
Premier:
Opening Address of ......................................................................................................................... 1526
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................................................................... 5042, 6938
Subject for Discussion:
SA Fisheries .................................................................................................................................... 4017

ELOFF, E H
Condolence, Motion of:
Bus accident in Hex River Pass...................................................................................................... 2228
Davids, Mr A A................................................................................................................................... 1597
Francken, Lulu ................................................................................................................................ 2570
Jacobs, Shaquille .............................................................................................................................. 3469
Jordaan, Dale .................................................................................................................................. 3469
Congratualtions:
Ackerman, Raymond ....................................................................................................................... 4504
Albertyn, Pierre ................................................................................................................................. 3772
Bantjies, Benjan ................................................................................................................................ 3770
Beukman, Erika ................................................................................................................................ 3768
Bredenhand, Jan-Frederick ............................................................................................................. 2817
Brookryk, Johan .............................................................................................................................. 3772
Coetzee, Theuns .............................................................................................................................. 3767
Dale-Roberts, Chef Luke and his team from La Colombe .............................................................. 2179
Darul Islam Islamic High School .................................................................................................... 2818
Els, John ........................................................................................................................................... 3768
Langeberg on change of name ........................................................................................................ 839
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011] 4802
ESAU, S [SPEAKER with effect from 06/05/2009]

Acceptance speech ................................................................. 4
Announcements ........................................................................ 9, 205, 239, 644, 701, 746, 1029, 1445, 1468
Apology by Deputy Speaker ....................................................... 824
Closing ...................................................................................... 1393
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ...................................................... 4151
Condolences: Motion of Beyleveldt, Theo .................................... 4107
Conduct in House ..................................................................... 596
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .................................................... 4184
Election of ................................................................................ 2
Interpretation ............................................................................ 969
Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D-2010] (NCOP) – (Consideration) ........................................ 3982
Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D-2010] (Reprint) (NCOP) (Consideration) ........................................ 4117
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) ...................................................... 4277
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .......... 757
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on National House of Traditional Leaders Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) ........................................ 910
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Traditional Leadership and Government Framework Amendment Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) ........................................ 910
Rulings ................................................................................... 72, 109, 329, 360, 646, 678, 968, 2219, 4377
Speaker's Debate:
Economic freedom of the Youth ............................................. 3953
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .......... 5241
Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 ......................... 4378, 4403
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ..................................... 1602
International Aids Day ............................................................... 1085
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently .... 2352
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ......................... 80, 95
SA Fisheries ............................................................................. 4014
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women .................................... 2430
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .......................................................... 560, 578
Women Redefining Leadership ............................................... 4069, 4079, 4091
Subject for Discussion:
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .................................................. 4184
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ..................................... 5161
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................. 1371, 1382
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2—2009]
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................. 509, 523
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................. 2124, 2144
Western Cape Land Use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2010] – (Finalisation) ................................................................. 4014
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .......................................................... 3657
  Vote and Schedules ........................................................................ 3917
Western Cape Parliamentary Service and Finance Management Bill
  Introduction ...................................................................................... 1347

FIGLAN, A M
Abuse against the Elderly ................................................................. 6492
Condolence: Motion of
  Howa, Hassan .............................................................................. 7049
Congratulations:
  Department of Human Settlements Group 5 and Motlekor cape .... 7781
  Executive Mayor of Cape Town ...................................................... 6460
  Human Settlement, Establishment of New Manenberg Contact
    Centre .......................................................................................... 5843
  Mountain View Stonemason housing project ................................ 7778
Department of Social Development: Trauma Campaign: Manenberg 8157
Housing lists: Khaya Magaxa ............................................................ 7768
Mbeki Govan, Human Settlement Awards 2012, Runners-up and
  Winner ............................................................................................. 5840
Minister of Human Settlements: Social housing regulatory authority award ... 7562
Minister of Human Settlements: Title Deeds .................................... 8161
Portable flush toilets: Cape Town City Mayor ............................... 7613
Premier:
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ....................... 5057
Renaming of NY1 to Steve Biko Drive .......................................... 6260
Statements .................................................................................... 5141
  5294, 5769, 5857, 5892, 6256, 6363, 6449, 6568, 6600, 7497, 7551, 7658
  ........................................................................... 7759, 8003, 8181
Subject for Discussion:
  Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
    Taxi Violence in Western Cape .................................................... 6343, 6356
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ..................................... 6709
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .......................................................... 5364
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 –
  Economic Development and Tourism) .......................................... 5688
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of
  Principle) ...................................................................................... 7079
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .......................................................... 7119
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ...................................... 7176
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ) .................... 7268
FRITZ, A T
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School and Implications thereof ......................... 5742
Condolence, Motion of:
   Asmal, Kader ............................................................................................................. 3978
Premier:
   Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ........................................... 5087, 6934
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
   (Consideration) .......................................................................................................... 4286
Social challenges with which single parents in Western Cape are confronted on daily basis ................................................................. 2867
Speaker’s Debate:
   Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 ............................................. 4394
   Women Redefining Leadership .............................................................................. 4077
   World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence Against Women and Children ................................................................. 4750, 4757
Subject for discussion:
   Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address .................... 7820
   Crisis in Hangberg .................................................................................................. 2669
   Growing inequalities in the Western Cape ......................................................... 7678
   Socio-economic state since the DA has been in power ........................................ 8235
   The problem of unemployment, especially among the young people of our Province and country ..................................................... 7709
   The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor programmes and proposals that it will be benefiting the people of the Western Cape ................................................................. 7961
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
   (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) .......................................................... 4839
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
   (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ......................................................... 4951, 4956
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
   (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .......................................................... 6773
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
   (Consideration of Principle) .................................................................................. 8393
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
   Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................................................. 3703, 3728
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................................. 5401, 5422
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................................. 7381

GABRU, Y
Condolence, Motion of:
   Dudley, Mr R.............................................................................................................. 38
   Maqubela, Patrick..................................................................................................... 106
   Solomon, Imam Gassan ......................................................................................... 983
Congratulations:
   Belgravia High School ......................................................................................... 610
Documentary Evidence, Manipulation and disappearance of .................................. 306
Four schools in 100 School Survey .......................................................................... 908
Freedom Charter: Achievement of its aims ............................................................. 363
Green Point Stadium, Escalating costs of ............................................................... 746
MEC for Education, Wasteful expenditure by ........................................ 592
Open opportunity society ........................................................................ 606
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................................. 49
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ..................................................... 803
SAPS: Lie detector tests ............................................................................. 37
School libraries, state and funding of .......................................................... 981
Speaker's Debate:
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
Children ........................................................................................................ 1141
Statements ................................................................................................... 649,777,902
Subject for discussion:
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .................................. 999
Human Rights Day ....................................................................................... 3476
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
prevent recession ........................................................................................ 707
Statements made by Premier ....................................................................... 636
Textile and clothing workers' struggle ............................................................ 751
Tygerberg, New Hospital at ......................................................................... 686
WCED, Educator posts in ........................................................................... 784
WCED, High number of sexual abuse cases in ............................................ 591
WCED: vacant posts and supply of qualified teachers .................................. 832
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 5 – Education ...................................................................................... 1218
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 5 – Education ...................................................................................... 248

GEYER, H P
Archbishop Desmond Tutu: Medal of Freedom Award .................................. 616
Ascension Day ............................................................................................... 7562
Birthday wishes to Premier .......................................................................... 1598
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of
Rule 119 ........................................................................................................ 2571, 2753, 2596
Cederberg: lack of action against ANC councillors .................................... 7704
Condolence, Motion of:
Komba, Sgt. Charles .................................................................................... 660
Langa, Pius ..................................................................................................... 7774
Le fleur, Jan .................................................................................................... 7883
Maqhetsheba, Anathi .................................................................................... 937
Meiring, Hannes ............................................................................................ 2178
Papenfus, Rufus ............................................................................................. 6416
Schmidt, Cobus ............................................................................................. 1039
Sisulu, Albertina ............................................................................................. 3945
Van Rensburg, Erin ....................................................................................... 104
Congratulations:
City of Cape Town: most productive metro municipality ............................ 7571
Cloetesville High School .............................................................................. 788
Combrink, Annette ......................................................................................... 7886
Danie Steytler ................................................................................................. 756
De Milander, Melinda .................................................................................... 4506
De Milander, Toerik ................................................................. 4506
Eid Mubarak ............................................................................. 2857
Ferreira, G T............................................................................. 2523
Herbert, Willem...................................................................... 2781
Hip-Hop World Championships, Delegation Attending to
(H P Geyer)............................................................................... 6376
Members of the House: Palama Certificate ............................ 7517
Minister Patricia De Lille ......................................................... 3473
Minister Winde........................................................................ 6266
Mostert, Jan ............................................................................. 6322
MPP Jennifer Hartnick .............................................................. 2482
Municipalities of Overstrand, George and Stellenbosch ......... 2703
Nel, Fanie ................................................................................. 8215
Ntsiki Biyela ............................................................................ 613
Paulse, Cornelius .................................................................... 8203
Paulse, Karools ....................................................................... 8021
Premier ...................................................................................... 4418
Provincial Parliament ................................................................ 6336
Ramadan Kareem ................................................................. 2460
Rosh Hashanah ........................................................................ 4440, 8021
SA Academy for Science and Arts ......................................... 658
Van Wyk, Annelien .................................................................. 8215
Wishing Muslim community strength and best wishes with
Yende, Pretty ............................................................................. 4110
Documentary Evidence, Manipulation and disappearance of .......................................................... 306
Efforts of ANC Government to Restrict Media Freedom ........ 2459
Eglin, Colin: tribute ................................................................. 7510
Fifa, Transfer of Land from Stellenbosch Municipality to ... 536
Governance of Robben Island .................................................. 2770
Hip Hop Media Lounge and Other projects: Rasool’s and Fransman’s
Involvement in ........................................................................... 2403
Human Rights Day: Abuse by ANC of taxpayers’ money – Motion .......................................................... 3509
Mossel Bay Municipality .......................................................... 8329
Mothers Day ............................................................................. 7604
Opening Address of ................................................................. 67
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
(Consideration and finalisation) .................................................. 478
Revival of Bills .......................................................................... 1599
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4-2011]
(NCOP) .................................................................................... 3973
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Sectional Titles
Schemes Management Bill [B20B-2010] (NCOP) ...................... 3974
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Community
Schemes Ombud Service Bill [B21B - 2011] (NCOP) .............. 3974
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of
Health (Consideration) ............................................................... 4274
Rift Valley fever in province .................................................... 2123
Statements .............................................................................. 2123
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
<th>Topics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4770, 5140, 5292, 5830, 6251, 6357, 6444, 7551, 7695, 7760</td>
<td>Stellenbosch, Proposed soccer stadium in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7924, 8149</td>
<td>........................................ 606</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5419</td>
<td>Cover-up by DA in Swellendam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2828, 2844</td>
<td>Governance of Robben Island</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1020</td>
<td>High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1049</td>
<td>Housing development in Delft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>709</td>
<td>Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2460</td>
<td>Inability of City of Cape Town to spend its Capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2495</td>
<td>Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2229</td>
<td>Purpose and functioning of ward committees and successes and failures of these committees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4454</td>
<td>Taxi Drivers, Course on Road Etiquette for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>688</td>
<td>Upcoming tourism entrepreneur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8165</td>
<td>Uys, Pierre: lack of understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2407</td>
<td>WCPP’S unqualified Audit Report</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]**
- Consideration of principle ......................................................... 1154
- Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ..................................................... 1354
- Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .................................................. 1379

**Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]**
- (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ...................................... 4852

**Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]**
- (Consideration of Principle) ...................................................... 6647

**Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]**
- (Consideration of Principle) ...................................................... 8397

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]**
- Vote 8 – Housing ................................................................. 163
- Vote 8 – Local Government ..................................................... 180
- Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .......................... 350
- Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ...................................... 408
- Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .................................................. 427
- Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................ 519

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]**
- Second Reading ........................................................................ 1666
- Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................ 2142

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]**
- Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................ 3668
- Vote 14 – Provincial Parliament .............................................. 3581

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle)** ......................................................... 5317

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – (Provincial Parliament) .................................................. 5568

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ....................................................... 5660

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]**
- (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) .................................... 7187

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) .................................................... 7403
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .......................... 7450

GOPIE, D
Bishop Lavis drug raid by SAPS .......................................................... 7521
Condolence, Motion of:
Adrianse, Isaiah .......................................................... 8330
Lottering, Norma ......................................................... 7880
Louw, Fadiel .......................................................... 8061
Parker, Allie .......................................................... 7508
Smit, Ralph .......................................................... 8210
Woodman, Wesley ................................................... 7513

Congratulations, Motion of:
National Detective Convention Award ......................................... 7665
Sphiwo, Neta .......................................................... 7563

Discussion on Gang War ......................................................... 7659
Gang violence: solution ...................................................... 8006
Gang violence in the Western Cape ........................................... 7556
Gang warfare in the Western Cape ........................................... 7502
Horizon Place of Safety: escape from ...................................... 8016
Lentegeur Police Station ....................................................... 8014
Metro Police: public accompaniment in certain areas ..................... 7611
Mthethwa, Nathi: youth and dangers of drug abuse ....................... 7617
Ramaphosa, Cyril: drugs and gangsterism in Mitchell Plain ............... 7888
Ruyterwacht: unfair evictions .................................................. 8324
SAPS drug raid in Delft ....................................................... 7570
SAPS: Undermining by government ........................................... 7934
Statements ..................................................................... 7550
Teen gangs, rise in: Cape Flats ................................................ 8325

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013 ] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) .......................... 7350
Western Cape government relationship: gang leaders ....................... 7878

GRANT, D A C
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .................... 2581
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School and Implications thereof ...... 5752
Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of Department of Education – Motion ........................................ 7991
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................. 63

Subject for discussion:
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ............................. 2387
Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address ........ 7809
The results of the independent testing of learners in Grades 3, 6 and 9 and of the impact of that on the aims of education in the Western Cape .......................................................... 7630

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................ 1215, 1226

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ............................................... 4808, 4814
HANI, V
Championing ending for Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B1 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ................................................. 6713, 6718
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 5 – Education .................................................................................. 240,260
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 – Education) ................................................................. 7412
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 5 – Education .................................................................................. 1858, 1879
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 5 – Education .................................................................................. 3830, 3849
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ................................................................. 5378, 5398

Congratulations:
Condolence, Motion of: Children and Youth Commemorations ........................................... 5871
Abrahams, Veronica .................................................................................. 8012
Daries, A K ............................................................................................... 8327
Galeta, Idris .............................................................................................. 2939
Hugo, Doreen ........................................................................................... 4008
Kulashe, Mlindi ......................................................................................... 4492
Mack, Novello ........................................................................................... 3515
Makhwenhwa, Moses ............................................................................... 7881
Matthews, Joe ........................................................................................... 2522
Mpolweni, Sizwe ....................................................................................... 8206
Nzo, Mama Regina ................................................................................... 4439
Passing on of Mother of Nondzaliseko Makanda ............................................ 2412
Pick, Dave ................................................................................................ 3617
Scott, Ashley ............................................................................................ 4492
Slingers, Riedewaan .................................................................................. 8012
Sono, Butana Victor .................................................................................. 4442

Family of five-year-old who drowned at a primary school in Kensington ..................... 2659
Khayelitsha Writing Forum ........................................................................... 4150
Kotana, Loyiso ........................................................................................... 2819
Mama Albertina Sisulu ............................................................................... 2778
Matthews, James ....................................................................................... 7056
Mokoena, Aaron ....................................................................................... 2938
Mxosana, Luwanda ..................................................................................... 2819
National Reconciliation Day Celebrations .................................................................. 4939
Scheepers, Lorna ....................................................................................... 7938
September, Charmaine ............................................................................. 7938
Stellenbosch University Team ....................................................................... 4011
Tsotetsi, Thembi ........................................................................................ 8333
Volunteers during strike ............................................................................ 2482
Wentzel, Sean ................................................................. 2711
Zenani, Anita ................................................................. 4114
COPE Member re-join ANC ............................................... 6500
Failure of DA government to address challenges .................... 7500
Failure of the Western Cape Government to Support Youth at Risk 7043
Farm workers and dwellers, conditions of ................................ 4482
Illegal sale of state-subsidised home .................................... 2773
International Day for the Eradication of Poverty ...................... 8167
International Day of Rural Women ....................................... 8166
International Exhibition, Removal of ..................................... 6415
International Peace Day ..................................................... 2620
International Women’s Day ................................................ 5153
Kayamandi Fire, Children Die ............................................. 4780
Military Veterans Bill ....................................................... 3476
Missing children: sixty during 2013 ..................................... 8059
National Day against Child Labour ....................................... 7890
No Violence Campaign, 16 Days of Activism – Motion ............... 4697
Plight of street children ..................................................... 2571
Premier’s Appointment of Male MECS ................................... 3939
Premier’s Department, Employee Found Guilty ....................... 5866
President Jacob Zuma, visits by ......................................... 3475
Selective invitations to launch ............................................. 2925
Service Increased, Local Goods Procurement of ...................... 4560
Speaker’s Debate:
Stabbing amongst Students in Schools .................................. 6378
Women Redefining Leadership ............................................ 4075
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ............................................. 4757
Statements ........................................................................ 2343, 3934, 4500, 5829, 5855, 7687, 7870, 7925
............................................................................... 8000
Subject for discussion:
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .............................................. 4191
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
Delivery ............................................................................... 4623
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ............................................... 2188
Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the
coming festive season .......................................................... 8337
Victims of Informal Settlements fires .................................... 5864
Victims of Kayamandi Shack Fires ........................................ 7047
Violence against Women and Children, Praise to Akhona Meyi for
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ............................................. 6728
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .............................. 6775
Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B7B—2009]
(Consideration and finalisation) ........................................... 2757
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ...................................................... 4960
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ............................................. 5361
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011] 
Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................. 3813
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011] – (Debate on Vote 1 – 
Premier) .................................................................................. 4804
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] 
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .................................................. 7116
Western Cape, worsening situation with killing, abuse and poor 
treatment of children in ............................................................. 4483
Women’s Day, Premier and Commemoration of ............................ 4136
World Food Day ....................................................................... 8159
Youth, International Year of ........................................................ 4147

HARRIS, T D (NCOP)

Premier:
  Opening Address of .................................................................. 1502
Subject for discussion:
  Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps 
to prevent recession ................................................................. 699

HARTNICK, J L

  Bus Accident: Enyonkeni Palace .............................................. 8065
  Bus accident victims in Kwa-Zulu Natal ................................. 7515
  Cape Town Stadium, construction of ....................................... 2351
  Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact 
on Communities ................................................................. 4151
Condolence, Motion of:
  Arendse, Donigo, Family of .................................................... 6317
  Davids, Goliath ...................................................................... 6206
  Deaths in shack fires in Kleinmond ......................................... 2483
  Griebenouw, Susanna ............................................................ 4009
  Hendricks, Megan .................................................................. 7565
  Jenner, Ms Katrina ................................................................. 1036
  Jordaan, Mr Paul .................................................................... 4443
  Manual Jarryd ........................................................................ 7565
  Michaels, Loveline ................................................................. 6578
  Mjongile, Songezo .................................................................. 6317
  Nsenga-Banze, Esther ............................................................. 7616
  Small, Adam .......................................................................... 6204
Congratulations:
  Amsterdam, Sasha-Lee ......................................................... 4013
  Bafana Bafana ....................................................................... 362, 2856
  Bhemgee, James .................................................................... 2815
  Boonzaaiwer, Ivan .................................................................. 8206
  Democratic Alliance, By-election in Ward 7 Hessequa ............ 7509
  Duke, Elizabeth ...................................................................... 7570
  Duminy, Jan .......................................................................... 8218
  Du Toit, Natalie ...................................................................... 1644
  Farmworkers of the Year, 2009 ............................................... 986
  Funda, Ndumie ...................................................................... 7513
  Goliath, Jackie, New Commercial Farmer of the Year .......... ... 6373
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jongile, Amahle</td>
<td>2933</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khohlakoane, Joseph</td>
<td>7706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kramer, David</td>
<td>2618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laubshler, Eric Honoured</td>
<td>6412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Roux, Marlene</td>
<td>2465</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milligan, Jesse</td>
<td>8206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mzonke “The Rose of Khayelitsha” Fana</td>
<td>2776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oosthuizen, Louis</td>
<td>2373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier and Department</td>
<td>6338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretty Yende</td>
<td>755, 2408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prins, Megan-Geoffrey</td>
<td>4148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor: Cumming, Graeme</td>
<td>7784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor: De Jager, Gerhard</td>
<td>7784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor: Dlodlo, Mqhele</td>
<td>7784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor: Millar, Robert</td>
<td>7784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor: Sliwa-Hahnle, Karen</td>
<td>7784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor: Stein, Dan</td>
<td>7784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor: Van Zyl, Kobus</td>
<td>7784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sithole, Lucas</td>
<td>8063</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springboks</td>
<td>540,658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stellenbosch and Stellenberg Girls Choir</td>
<td>6335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stellenbosch University Choir</td>
<td>2410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWD Rugby Union on victory over Griffins</td>
<td>2659</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Team Zealous of Stellenbosch High School</td>
<td>695</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transplant Sports Association Athletes</td>
<td>3950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tygerberg Children’s Choir</td>
<td>2410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viera, Kim</td>
<td>8206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witzenberg Reel Dancers</td>
<td>4940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Transplant Games</td>
<td>693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of Department of Education – Motion</td>
<td>7983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatal injury of Gavin Engelke and Keenan van Wyk</td>
<td>2261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hessequa Municipality, solution for</td>
<td>4354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR practices: national demographics</td>
<td>7556</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Responsibility: youth delinquency</td>
<td>7934</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening Address of</td>
<td>1511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)</td>
<td>5073, 6907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier, Consolidated Monitoring and Evaluation Report of</td>
<td>5906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOPA (debate)</td>
<td>3353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]</td>
<td>4792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Consideration and finalisation)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration)</td>
<td>4292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaker’s Debate:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrating our cultural diversity</td>
<td>2623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic freedom of the Youth</td>
<td>3956</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future</td>
<td>5243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity</td>
<td>6276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently</td>
<td>2357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(xxxii)

Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices................................................................. 560
Women Redefining Leadership ................................................................. 4073
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children .................................................. 4754
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children.......................... 1138

Statements .............................................................................. 302,586,597,652,740,779,901,929,1290,1584,1735,2115,
.................................................................................. 2250, 2344, 2398, 2456, 2469, 2511, 2549, 2645, 2809, 2919,
.................................................................................. 3438, 3504, 3934, 3997, 4092, 4166, 4347, 4408, 4479, 4549,
.................................................................................. 4691, 4933, 5146, 5296, 5773, 5893, 6254, 6361, 6489, 6564,
.................................................................................. 6604, 7040, 7549, 7654, 7762, 7926, 8046, 8187, 8317
St James Church victims: tribute to ................................................................................................. 7786

Subject for discussion:
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools .................................................. 2380
Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address ........................................................................... 7802
Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape........................................ 6215
Heritage Day .......................................................................................................................... 809
Human Rights Day ..................................................................................................................... 3480
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ............................................... 667
Lack of development for young people ............................................................................. 2271
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ................................................................. 6425
The problem of unemployment, especially among the young people
of our Province and country ...................................................................................... 7716
The results of the independent testing of learners in Grades 3, 6
and 9 and of the impact of that on the aims of education in the
Western Cape ..................................................................................................................... 7626
The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor
programmes and proposals that it will be benefiting the people
of the Western Cape ........................................................................................................ 7960
Undermining of Women in the Western Cape ............................................................. 8068
Taxi crash: wishes for speedy recovery ........................................................................... 2569
Victims of houses burnt down in Khayelitsha, Heideveld and
Belhar ............................................................................................................................... 2567
Victims of taxi disaster in Blackheath ............................................................................... 2520
Violence in schools ........................................................................................................... 2257
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................................................. 1206
Vote 5 – Education ....................................................................................................... 1217
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................................................ 1230
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ......................................................... 1312
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ......................................................................... 1325
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...................................... 1344
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ......................................................................................... 1354

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) .................................................................................. 4809
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) .......................................................................................... 4961
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ..................................................................................... 6732
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) .......................................................... 8415
(Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ........................................ 8440
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Local Government ............................................................ 177
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 198
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 225
Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................ 246
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................................ 346
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............... 376
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .......................................... 405
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................... 432
Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 493
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ............................................................................. 1673
Vote 14 – Local Government ......................................................... 1817
Vote 8 – Housing .......................................................................... 1845
Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................ 1866
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................... 1905
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................. 1956
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............ 2017
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 2037
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .......................................... 2070
Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 2103
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 3610
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 3805, 3848
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011] – (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .......................................................... 4805
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ............................................................ 5339
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4
- Community Safety) .................................................................... 5478
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13
- Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............................................................ 5509
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ........................................................................ 5544
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .......................................................... 5731
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ............................................................ 7111
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ......................... 7218
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ............................................................ 7380
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 – Education) ................................................................. 7430
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) .................. 7474
Western Cape Department of Agriculture ........................................ 2615
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) ....................................................... 5784
HASKIN, G C R

Subject for discussion:
- Statements
- Socio Service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Extension of MyCiti Bus
- School Infrastructure: Norms and standards
- SAPS response to community challenges
- Safety Home Campaign
- SAA Cancellation

Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules

Militarisation and police brutality

Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government

Increase in Street Children

Illegal Advertising, Proliferation of

House, Business of

Growing Baboon Problem in Cape Town

Crime Statistics relating to Western Cape

Doping in School Sport

Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of
- Department of Education – Motion
- Freedom of the City for Us President
- Gangsterism crisis
- Global Earth Hour
- Growing Baboon Problem in Cape Town
- House, Business of
- Illegal Advertising, Proliferation of
- Increase in Street Children
- Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government
- Militarisation and police brutality
- Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
- Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Proposed Constitution Eighteenth Amendment Bill (Private Members Bill) (Consideration)

SAA Cancellation of Flights

Safety Home Campaign

SAPS response to community challenges

School Infrastructure: Norms and standards

Service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Extension of MyCiti Bus, Cape Chamber of Commerce’s View

Socio-Economic Impact, Protest marches becoming Violent of

Statements

Service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Extension of MyCiti Bus, Cape Chamber of Commerce’s View

Socio-Economic Impact, Protest marches becoming Violent of

Statements

Subject for discussion:
- Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address
- Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape

Congratulations:
- Annual Charity Toy Run, to Organisers of
- Barkai, Ram
- Chin, Andrew
- Firmani, MR Duane
- Goodier, Maria
- Hudson, Roger
- Jim, Asenath
- McGregor, Cody
- Ndungu, Scientist Thumbi
- Stramrood, Ryan
- Viviers, Toks

Crime Statistics relating to Western Cape

Doping in School Sport

Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of
- Department of Education – Motion
- Freedom of the City for Us President
- Gangsterism crisis
- Global Earth Hour
- Growing Baboon Problem in Cape Town
- House, Business of
- Illegal Advertising, Proliferation of
- Increase in Street Children
- Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government
- Militarisation and police brutality
- Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
- Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Proposed Constitution Eighteenth Amendment Bill (Private Members Bill) (Consideration)

SAA Cancellation of Flights

Safety Home Campaign

SAPS response to community challenges

School Infrastructure: Norms and standards

Service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Extension of MyCiti Bus, Cape Chamber of Commerce’s View

Socio-Economic Impact, Protest marches becoming Violent of

Statements

Service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Extension of MyCiti Bus, Cape Chamber of Commerce’s View

Socio-Economic Impact, Protest marches becoming Violent of

Statements
(xxxv)

Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ........................................... 5879
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU against Implementation of .................. 5923
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape .......................................................... 6426
Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the coming festive season .......................................................... 8326
Princess Vlei Rezoning ............................................................................................ 5902
Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster Management .................................. 8133
Results of Census 2011 ......................................................................................... 6502
Socio-economic state since the DA has been in power ............................................. 8230
Strike in de Doorns, Farm workers ........................................................................ 6450
Temporary Relocation Areas .................................................................................. 6450
The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the Western Cape .......... 7533
The problem of unemployment, especially among the young people of our Province and country ........................................................... 7716
Vigilantism in Khayelitsha ..................................................................................... 5860
Water Scarce Resource .......................................................................................... 5838
Tribute to the former President of the Republic of South Africa
- Mr Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela ........................................................................... 8456
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ............................................................. 6706
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................................ 6663
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) ........................................................................... 6676
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) ................................................. 6688
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ................................................................. 6695
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 Community Safety) ................................................................. 6702
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ....................................................... 6715
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .................................................................................. 6721
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ................................................................................ 6728
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ..................................................... 6761
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ................................................. 6763
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................................. 6775
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .............................................................. 6781
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................................ 8395
(Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ................................................................. 8440
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) .......................................................... 7068
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013 ] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ........................................ 7353
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ........................................... 5733
Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) .................................................. 7464
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ................................................................. 7474
Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency Amendment Bill [B 1 – 2013] (Finalisation) .................... 7858
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012] (Consideration and finalisation) ......................................................... 5784
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B7 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) .................................... 8246

JACOBS, P M

Affordable Housing .................................................................................................................. 4140
Amakhaya Ngoku Housing initiatives ..................................................................................... 785
Apology to Member Brown ..................................................................................................... 2570
Central Karoo District municipality, Disaster Risk Management and Emergency Service in ................................................. 4100
Condolence, Motion of: Mafikeng, Mama Elizabeth "Rocky" ........................................................................ 105
Congratulations:
Bafana Bafana ........................................................................................................................ 143
World Cup Draw ..................................................................................................................... 1108
DA’s Half-hearted commitment to release sufficient land for Greenfields development .................. 2771
DA’s Xenophobia .................................................................................................................... 2561
Free housing policy, rethink of ............................................................................................... 905
Greenfields, Impact of on Housing Demand Database ...................................................................... 3615
Housing and Serviced Sites Target ......................................................................................... 4001
Housing subsidies, Approval of .............................................................................................. 2226
Hout Bay, Building of new housing units in ............................................................................... 590
Informal Settlements, Appalling Living Conditions ....................................................................... 4101
Initiation sites ........................................................................................................................... 2374
Investigation: misleading of House by Premier ......................................................................... 906
Khayelitsha Fire, Four Children Die .......................................................................................... 4150
Mandela Park Housing ........................................................................................................... 782
PHP: support by Department of Human Settlements .................................................................. 2122
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................................................................. 59, 1499
Premier, SOPA announcement ................................................................................................. 3615
Premier’s SOPA announcement: debate .................................................................................. 1591
Problems in Housing Project, our Pride, in Eerste River ............................................................. 2922
Radio appearances by Premier and Mayor of city of Cape Town ............................................. 2564
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) ........................................ 4289
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) ........................................ 4289
Report of Standing Committees meeting together regarding their Participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ........................................ 2745
SOPA (debate) .................................................................................. 3360

Speaker's Debate:

Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ........................................... 1619
International Aids Day .................................................................... 1096
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices ............................................................................. 569

Statements ...................................................................................... 13, 743, 1290, 2253, 2339, 2470, 2647, 2809, 2918, 4127

Subject for discussion:

Conditions in places where poor people live .................................. 2536
Heritage Day ..................................................................................... 818
Housing development in Delft ............................................................ 1051
Problems in Bitou Municipality ......................................................... 954

Unblocking of blocked housing projects .......................................... 2123
Unhealthy Conditions in TRAS ......................................................... 2405
Unwillingness of DA to supply toilets ............................................... 2813

Vindictive war on poor by DA-Led government .................................. 2652

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 1233
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing .......................................... 1253

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................ 155
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 200

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................................ 1818
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................ 1840

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................ 386

JENNER, I

Premier: ............................................................................................
Celebrating our cultural diversity ..................................................... 2629
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ........................................... 1612
International Aids Day .................................................................... 1090
Opening Address of ........................................................................ 51, 1486
Social challenges of single parents .................................................. 2815
SOPA (debate) ............................................................................... 3366
Speaker's Debate:

Statements ...................................................................................... 2602, 2646, 2695, 2767, 2810, 2853, 2919

Subject for discussion:

Crisis in Hangberg .......................................................................... 2676
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ............................................................ 2184
Governance of Robben Island ......................................................... 2838
Heritage Day ..................................................................................... 821
Outcomes of 2009-10 annual reports ............................................... 2949, 2955
Social challenges with which single parents in Western Cape are confronted on daily basis ............................................. 2863, 2873

Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in .................................................. 2434
LABUSCHAGNE, C
Absenteeism in schools, reduction of ........................................ 7886
Abused Women and Children in Western Cape ......................... 687
Behaviour Modification Programmes ...................................... 6367
Caps, Readiness for Implementation .................................... 4135
Child Justice Act: Diversions and alternative sentencing ........... 4410
Children’s Act, implementation of ......................................... 2370
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ......................................................... 4151
Condolence, Motion of:
Gresak, Michael .................................................................. 6333
Kotze, Thelana .................................................................. 6204
Mafu Linga ......................................................................... 3767
Martin, Enrico .................................................................. 7618
Mntini, Thabani .................................................................. 6371
Mzingelwa, Uviwe ............................................................... 7054

Congratulations:
Adonis, Junain .................................................................. 8208
Appolis, Hywil .................................................................. 8208
City of Cape Town .............................................................. 2780
DF Malan high school ......................................................... 7882
Durbanville Cellars ............................................................. 3514
Hattingh, Christian ........................................................... 8208
Horn, Wendy .................................................................... 8208
Imvumelwana Primary, Wallacedene .................................. 5843
Kruger, Katryn .................................................................. 6208
Labuschagne, Catherine fighter pilot .................................. 2658
Learners ............................................................................ 5863
Leukes, Ingrid .................................................................. 8208
Loots Roeléne ................................................................. 8208
Mallum, Yusra .................................................................. 8061
Medical Emergency Staff and School Principal ..................... 7056
Mesias, Ashanti .................................................................. 8061
Minister of Education: Presidential hotline ......................... 7937
Minister of Education: provision of books .......................... 8215
Morris, Allan: Professor .................................................... 8063
Palama Post-Graduate Studies ............................................. 7888

Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................... 1228, 1237
Vote 6 – Health .................................................................. 286
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................... 187,204
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................... 2027, 2051
Vote 6 – Health .................................................................. 2944
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................... 2942
Vote 6 – Health .................................................................. 2944
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................... 2944
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................... 2944
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................... 2944
Parker, Marlon ................................................................. 7617
Peggy De Villiers ............................................................ 755
Rouch, Avril ...................................................................... 8208
Sdophumelela Secondary School, Learners of .................. 5269
September, Jezane .......................................................... 8061
Such, Lorna ..................................................................... 8208
Schwartz, Marsha ............................................................ 8208
Tembile, Hlanganisa ......................................................... 8061
University of Cape Town Researchers ............................... 7507
WCED ............................................................................. 6338
WCED on Higher matric Pass Rate .................................... 5780
Cosatu’s Actions against National Youth wage Subsidy ...... 5837
Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 - Litnum Results ....... 7932
ECDs in province – Motion ............................................... 3510
Education department: delivery of text books in the Western Cape ...... 7610
Final Examinations in Wynland District ............................. 6499
Good Luck to Matric Learners ......................................... 6334
Impact of new older persons Act ....................................... 3468
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ................................................. 5792
Management achievement assessment tool: performance report ...... 7603
National ANC-led government, misuse of power by ............ 4483
New National Youth Agency ............................................. 143
Parliamentary privilege of freedom of speech ...................... 7698
Premier:
Opening Address of ......................................................... 1542
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............... 5018, 6921
SOPA (debate) .................................................................. 3376
President’s Support, Approval of commitment to Youth Wage Subsidy ............................................. 5839
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) ................................................................. 1116
Report on Study Visit, Standing committee on ..................... 5868
Rescinding of EFT Bill ......................................................... 4941
Results and Effect of Grade 3, 6 and 9 Testing ..................... 7043
Safety of People, SAPS Responsible for ............................ 5901
School Improvement Plan ................................................ 7045
Social Transformation Programme, Continuation of ............... 689
Speaker’s Debate:
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ............................ 1607
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship .................... 91
Social Development attend COP17, Representatives of Western Cape Department of ............................................ 4783
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ............................ 2435
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices ......................................................... 577
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children .......................................................... 1130
Statements ........................................................................ 14, 97, 585, 600, 684, 743, 775, 829, 902, 974, 1101, 1291, 1639, 2170, 2254, 2557, 2601, 2766, 2852, 3441, 3507, 3761, 3999, 4093, 4169, 4342, 4428, 4501, 4689, 4930, 5264, 5298, 5772, 5851, 6250, 6362,
Subject for discussion:

Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape ........... 7902
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ........... 551
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .............................. 665
Lack of development for young people ................................................. 2263
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU against Implementation of ................................................................. 5917
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ........................................ 6419
Social challenges with which single parents in Western Cape are confronted on daily basis ................................................................. 2863
The results of the independent testing of learners in Grades 3, 6 and 9 and of the impact of that on the aims of education in the Western Cape .................................................................................................................. 7620
Teaching Programmes, Winter Holiday .................................................. 4145
Teenage Pregnancies, Socio-Economic impact of .................................... 5860

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle ................................................................. 1175
Vote 6 – Health .................................................................................. 1189
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................. 1298
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................... 1361

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ......................................................... 4813
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .............................................................. 4858
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................. 4964
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................................. 6661
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ..................................... 6716

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................... 220
Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................... 255
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................... 290
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................. 325

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety .............................................................. 1713
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................... 1752
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................. 1785
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................... 1933
Vote 12 - Economic Development and Tourism ................................. 1958
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................... 2074

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Consideration of principle ................................................................. 3539
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................. 3652
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................... 3695
Vote 4 – Community Safety .............................................................. 3716
Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................... 3840
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ................................................................. 5389
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 6 - Health) ................................................................. 7321
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] ( Debate on Vote 5 – Education) ................................................................. 7421
Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Modernisation Strategy of ................................................................. 592

LENTIT, R B
Closing ........................................................................................................................................ 6793, 8446
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities .................................................. 4151
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School and implications thereof .................................................. 5750

Condolence: Motion of:
Bloemerus, Ashley ............................................................................................................................ 4697
Charles, Shamiela death in Qatar Mall fire .................................................................................... 5869
Cloete Family ................................................................................................................................... 7702
Espafrica ......................................................................................................................................... 3765
Gerwel, Jakes ..................................................................................................................................... 6630
Oman, Imran death in Qatar Mall fire .............................................................................................. 5869

Congratulations: Motion of
All Municipalities ............................................................................................................................ 5841
Artscape Management ...................................................................................................................... 4116
Boland Summer Festival ................................................................................................................... 5729
City of Cape Town .......................................................................................................................... 4105, 5845
City of Cape Town, Executive of .................................................................................................... 4183
Ganya twins, Wandle and Wanele ................................................................................................. 4490
Hartzenberg, Ms Anthea ............................................................................................................... 4494
Kallis, Sharief .................................................................................................................................... 4143
Nelson, Marshall ............................................................................................................................. 4143
Night Schools ................................................................................................................................. 4100
Taljaard, Rimona .......................................................................................................................... 4492
Van Wyk, Deon ............................................................................................................................ 3454

Curb Gangsterism, Avenues to ......................................................................................................... 6367
Deaf Awareness Month: September ................................................................................................ 8064
Delft Resident Wayne Jafta ............................................................................................................. 6369
Education Outcome, Progress made to Improve ........................................................................... 4175
Executive Statement ....................................................................................................................... 6193
Grandmother against Poverty and Aids ......................................................................................... 6410
Gratitude and well wishes to Western Cape Traffic Department .................................................. 6572
Genetically Modified Foods, Status of ............................................................................................ 6405
Health Care Facilities, Construction and Upgrading of .................................................................. 5836
Human Settlements, Integrated and Sustainable ......................................................................... 4176
International Volunteers Day ......................................................................................................... 6632
Jazz Festival, Cape Town – Motion ............................................................................................... 3511
Learners at Athlone School of the Blind returns as Educator ....................................................... 7045
Night Shelters, Status .................................................................................................................... 6201
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ........................................................................ 5078
SOPA (debate) ............................................................................................................................... 3365
Rugby, Kaizer Chiefs in Transformation of .................................................................................. 6407
Rural Areas Development, Opportunities for Growth ........................................... 4173
School Buses, Surveillance Cameras on ............................................................... 4557
Season on Roads, Safe Festive................................................................. 4936
Sexual Offences Act, Changes to ................................................................. 5861
Speaker’s Debate:
  Women Redefining Leadership .................................................................. 4084
Statements ........................................................................................................ 3442, 3459, 3506, 4095, 4133, 4170,
...................................................................................................................... 4346, 4429, 4481, 4499, 4549, 4689, 4770, 4932, 5143, 5263, 5297, 5722,
...................................................................................................................... 5832, 5854, 6198, 6361, 6400, 6489, 6565, 6594, 6624, 7038, 7496, 7599, 7691, 7873, 7927, 8051
Strategies on combating drug abuse and trafficking ....................................... 7698
Subject for Discussion:
  Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 .................................................. 4708
  Cover-up by DA in Swellendam ................................................................. 5418
  Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape .................................... 6216
  Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ......................................................... 6387
  Floods in Western Cape .......................................................................... 4367
  Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ................................ 5873
  Human Rights Day ................................................................................... 3484
  Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape .............. 7899
  Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ........................................... 6425
  Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ....................................................... 5168
  Purpose and functioning of ward committees and
    successes and failures of these committees ................................................ 4458
  Results of Census 2011 ........................................................................... 6513
  The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the
    Western Cape ......................................................................................... 7532
  The problem of unemployment, especially among the young people
    of our Province and country .................................................................. 7715
  The results of the independent testing of learners in Grades 3, 6
    and 9 and of the impact of that on the aims of education in the
    Western Cape ......................................................................................... 7624
  The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor programmes
    and proposals that it will be benefiting the people of the
    Western Cape ......................................................................................... 7945
  Top Teachers Award .................................................................................. 6495
Sunflower Foundation ...................................................................................... 7884
Tribute to the former President of the Republic of South Africa
  - Mr Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela ............................................................... 8454
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ...................................................................... 4862
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ............................................... 4920
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
  (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................ 4955
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Finalisation) ............................................................................................ 4974
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ..................................................................... 6659
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ......................................................... 6722
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ........................................ 6781
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ........................................ 8441
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011] Consideration of principle ................................................................. 3531
Vote 7 – Social Development .................................................. 3648, 3662
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................ 3692
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................. 3717
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ........................................................ 5477
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .......................................................... 5733
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ....................................................... 7446
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ............................................................... 7464
Western Cape, Traffic Department Award ................................................. 5270
Woman and Children, 16 Days of Activism against abuse and violence of .......................................................... 6575
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ........................................ 4574
Youth, Strategies to Deal with Social Ills Affecting ........................................ 5147

JOSEPH, D
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ........................................ 5058

MADIKIZELA, B S
Human Rights Day ................................................................ 3488
Outcomes of 2009-10 annual reports .................................................... 2953
Policing in Mitchells Plain ................................................................. 891
Premier:
Opening Address of ......................................................................... 1481
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ....................................... 5034
SOPA (debate) ........................................................................ 3337
Speaker’s Debate:
Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 .................................. 4395
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ........................................ 86
Subject for Discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ............................................. 4704
Crisis in Hangberg ........................................................................ 2671
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ............................................................... 2185
Housing development in Delft ............................................................. 1062
Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster Management ......................... 8134
Tribute to the former President of the Republic of South Africa
- Mr Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela .......................................................... 8459
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009] Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ........................................ 1243, 1255
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) ........................................... 4891
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) ........................................... 4901
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ......................................... 6705, 6710
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................................ 6656
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ......................................... 7164, 7190
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................................ 8409
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................. 145,165
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................. 1830, 1853
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Consideration of principle ................................................................. 3527
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................. 3852, 3874

MAGAXA, K E –
ANC Honoured, Sixth President of ................................................ 5865
Bishop Lavis: Evictions .................................................................. 8006
Bonginkosi Madikizela: non-attendance of meeting ...................... 7783
Bucket system: statement by Mayor of Cape Town ....................... 7610
Cape Town Metropole, Unacceptable Conditions for poor People .... 6265
City of Cape Town: housing crisis ................................................. 8323
Community housing project: political interference ....................... 7604
Court Application, Backyard Dwellers Lodge ............................... 6410
Condolences: Motion of
Cachalia, Amina ............................................................................. 7058
Pheiffer, John ................................................................................ 6322
Congratulations:
Sexwale Tokyo, launch of new solar water heating project .......... 7522
Tladi, Michae ............................................................................... 4508
De Doorns, Lack of proper services to Stofland settlement .......... 4413
District Six housing allocations ..................................................... 8015
Floodling in the Western Cape ....................................................... 8328
Focus on sanitation protestors: sanitation crisis ......................... 7877
Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 ......................... 4394
Housing crisis in the Western Cape .............................................. 7502
Housing Indaba ............................................................................ 4692
Housing List for Eerste River and Blue Downs, City of
Cape Town .................................................................................. 6317
Increase in Housing and Service Delivery Protests ...................... 7660
Inferior Service Deliver in Poor areas .......................................... 7043
Joe Slovo, two thousand people in: Forced to share 10 toilets ....... 4416
Makhaza Toilets ........................................................................... 6416
MEC Dan Plato: Dismissal of allegation ....................................... 7891
Minister of Housing, NO-Show of ............................................... 4693
Municipal Hostel, in Langa .......................................................... 4553
Municipal IQ Hotspot Monitor Findings .................................................. 5910
National Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform .................... 8157
National Workers Day celebrations ...................................................... 7506
Poor and working class, rendering of services to .................................. 8008
Poor infrastructure and under spending in Poor Areas in Western
Cape ................................................................................................. 6258
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ................................ 6909
Provision of water and sanitation to the poor ....................................... 7501
Refuse in informal settlements: refusal to remove .............................. 8153
Sanitation crisis in Western Cape: refusal to address ......................... 8056
Sanitation: failure to provide ......................................................... 7771
Sanitation in informal settlements ...................................................... 7705
Sanitation Problems in Khayelitsha ..................................................... 6494
Shack fires: loss of family members .................................................. 8209
Shacks: unjustified destruction of .................................................... 7561
Shortage of land: City of Cape Town ................................................ 7557
Slums, creation of in the Western Cape ............................................. 8198
Speaker’s debate:
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ....................... 6287
Statements ........................................................................... 4588, 5719, 5898, 6360, 7597, 7655, 7690, 7875
................................................................................................. 8150, 8319
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ......................................... 4717
Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address .......... 7815
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .............. 5249
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes .............................................. 6386
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
against Implementation of ......................................................... 5925
Purpose and functioning of ward committees and
successes and failures of these committees ................................... 4452
Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster
Management ................................................................................ 8136
Report of the Commission for Employment Equity on the
Western Cape and the fact that our province still remains
resistant to change ...................................................................... 7579
Socio-economic state since the DA has been in power ....................... 8238
Undermining of Women in the Western Cape ................................ 8072
Victims of Disaster ....................................................................... 7662
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) ........................................... 4894
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................ 4967
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) ......................................................... 8404
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) .......................................... 7179
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ................ 7475
52nd Anniversary, Langa Massacres ................................................ 5271
52nd Anniversary, Sharpville Massacres ......................................... 5271
2012 Govan Mbeki Best Priority Project Award ................................. 5915
| MAGWAZA, N P |
|-----------------------------------------------|-------------|
| Africa Day ................................................ | 5870        |
| Blikkiesdorp described as concentration camp  | 4487        |
| Botrivier, Service Delivery in .................. | 5914        |
| Child-headed households, plight of .............. | 2299        |
| Closure of Du Noon Child Welfare Office ....... | 6409        |
| Closure of Ottery Youth Care Centre ............ | 6568        |
| Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School and ...... | 5742        |
| Condolence, Motion of:                         |             |
| Buys, Shaun .............................................. | 7517        |
| Damon, Manie ............................................. | 7702        |
| Drug-Trading Zones in Cape Town ................. | 6377        |
| Eight lives lost in fire in Khayelitsha ....... | 2571        |
| Galant, Jacoba; Jansen, Lodewyk; and Van ...... | 2177        |
| Issel, Johnny ............................................ | 3450        |
| Kimvango, Andy .......................................... | 4940        |
| Malindi, Lettie ......................................... | 2376        |
| Mhlanga, Lydia ........................................... | 5272        |
| Moos, Haylee Anne ...................................... | 7517        |
| Moos, Loretta ........................................... | 7517        |
| Mputing, Mr W ........................................... | 909         |
| Ngozi, Mr M M ............................................ | 838         |
| 27th Anniversary of Treacherous Trojan .......... | 6325        |
| Congratulations:                             |             |
| Homeless Soccer World Cup Tournament .......... | 753         |
| Fraser-Moleketi, Geraldine ....................... | 7778        |
| Mlambo-Ngcula, Phumzile ............................. | 7778        |
| National Government .................................... | 5730        |
| Patel, Bhavna Dr ....................................... | 7892        |
| September, Connie ...................................... | 7778        |
| DA Students Organisation ............................. | 8165        |
| Disability Initiatives .............................. | 1128        |
| Domestic violence: absence of plan ............. | 7559        |
| Dumping of babies and control measures ......... | 2519        |
| Each-One-Settle-One campaign ..................... | 4437        |
| Equity Targets .......................................... | 5912        |
| Exclusion of members from summit on baby ...... | 2923        |
| Fraudsters fired ........................................ | 5905        |
| Funding for Nongovernmental Organisations ...... | 4139        |
| Funding to educare centre stopped .............. | 2814        |
| Golden Games, cancellation of .................... | 7503        |
| Helderberg Hospital: inferior services .......... | 8007        |
| Jobs summit .............................................. | 4441        |
| Johnson, Maureen ....................................... | 7768        |
| Khayelitsha Schemes, Shutting down of Feeding  | 4173        |
| Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape ... | 5791        |
| Langa, tribute to bridge builder in ........... | 4421        |
| Lewis, Tobias ............................................ | 2656        |
| MEC De Lille’s reluctance to provide more ...... | 2701        |
| Millennium Development Goals Youth Conference | 6639        |
| of facilities ........................................... |             |
Minister of Education, Refuse to meet with Grabouw Learners ................................5140
Mr J J Visser: Statement on Women during debate ................................................. 610
National Competency, Making of Academic Hospitals ........................................... 5266
NGO’s in Province, Funding Cuts to ................................................................. 6265
Partnering with non-profit organisations ............................................................. 1745
Premier: ................................................................................................................. 54
  Opening Address of ........................................................................................... 54
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ...................................................... 6932
SOPA (debate) ....................................................................................................... 3344
Province, child abuse in ....................................................................................... 905
Rape and Abuse Crisis under Provincial Government ............................................ 7044
Removal of Babies from Place of Safety ............................................................... 3940
Resignations, Current Trend .................................................................................. 4175
Saartjie Baartman Centre ...................................................................................... 143
Safety and well-being of children over festive season ........................................... 1294
Salutations to Thembisa Dondoshe ........................................................................ 2820
Shack fires: Langa, Wesbank, Gugulethu and Philippi .......................................... 7511
Speaker’s Debate:
  Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .................................. 5244
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ............................................................... 1609
  International Aids Day ......................................................................................... 1091
  Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ................................................... 93
  Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ............................................................. 2433
  Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .................. 575
  Women Redefining Leadership ............................................................................ 4081
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children ............... 1132
Statements ............................................................................................................ 5895, 6397, 6564, 6593
Students Against Women Abuse (SAWA) ......................................................... 7566
Subject for discussion:
  Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address .......................... 7806
  Conditions in places where poor people live ..................................................... 2529
  Floods in Western Cape ...................................................................................... 4369
  Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .......................................... 663
  Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ................................................................. 6463
  Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ............................. 2491
  Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster Management ............... 8131
  Sixteen days of activism for no violence against women and children ......... 2998
  and international aids day ................................................................................. 2998
  Socio-economic state since the DA has been in power ..................................... 8233
  Undermining of Women in the Western Cape ............................................... 8082
Targeting of prostitutes ....................................................................................... 833
TB Awareness Month ......................................................................................... 5267
Violent crime of rape .......................................................................................... 4413
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................................... 1297
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
  (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ......................................................... 4953
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................. 4966
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle ................................................................. 132
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................. 226
  Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................. 288
  Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................... 317
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................. 1758
  Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................... 1781
  Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................. 1931
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
  Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................... 3650
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle) ................................................................. 5315
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................................. 5417
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................................. 7375
Western Cape Department of Health: poor working conditions ......... 8010
Western Cape, shack fires in ............................................................. 4349
Western Cape remains “Drug Capital” of SA ....................................... 4415

MAJOLA, T R [DEPUTY SPEAKER with effect from 06/05/2009]
Announcement .................................................................................... 1069, 4474, 4495
Burglary and vandalism of state-owned property ............................... 2175
Condolence, Motion of:
  Mandulo, Nokulamla ................................................................... 4176
  Victims of taxi accident .................................................................. 985
Congratulation, Motion of:
  Orlando Pirates ............................................................................ 4109
Election of .......................................................................................... 5
MEC’s to present their departments’ strategic objectives ..................... 2689
Premier: .............................................................................................
  Opening Address of ......................................................................... 56, 1506
  SOPA (debate) .............................................................................. 3364
Rulings ............................................................................................. 528, 1583, 2333, 3980, 5292, 5804
Speaker’s Debate:
  Celebrating our cultural diversity .................................................... 2621
  Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .................... 6274
  World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
      Against Women and Children ....................................................... 4743
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
      Children .................................................................................. 1129
Statements ....................................................................................... 654, 899, 2252, 4407, 5259, 5804
Subject for discussion:
  Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ............................... 2378
  Lack of development for young people ........................................... 2266
  National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
      against Implementation of ......................................................... 5917
Social challenges with which single parents in Western Cape are confronted on daily basis .............................................. 2869
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .................................. 4919
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ..................................... 4960
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) ............................................................... 4974
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ............................................. 5552
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ................................ 6780
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B5 - 2013] (Finalisation) .................................................. 7461
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] Vote 6 – Health ........................................................................... 284
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011] Consideration of principle .......................................................... 3529
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .............................................. 3898
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ........................................... 7435
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009] Finalisation ................................... 1081

MARAIS, A J DU TOIT
Acknowledgement to Supt Nolan, Capt Dicks and Const Abrahams, Atlantis .......................................................... 1597
Adult Education Award to 79-Year-Old Du Noon Resident – Motion ............................................................ 5157
Alcohol and Drug abuse on Family system, Impact of .............................................. 362
Alternative approaches to BEE and development SMMEs .................................................. 2174
ANC’s Conduct in Provincial Parliament .............................................. 620
ANC’s Misperceptions with regards to Education in Cape .............................................. 5903
Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health – (Consideration) .................................................. 4270
Anti-poverty strategy ........................................................................... 2258
Bulk water supply ............................................................................. 3445
Cease-Fire between Israel and Hamas .................................................. 6570
Children on Cape Flats, Massacre of .................................................. 6366
Community Leaders, recognition of .................................................. 7779
Condolence, Motion of:
  Albertus, Ms Ulla ........................................................................... 938
  Blignaut, Ashley ............................................................................ 4181
  Florence, Brent .............................................................................. 2778
  Haas, Ashley ................................................................................. 2778
  Johnson, Abe ................................................................................ 5842
  Khumalo, Alfred .......................................................................... 6372
  Marks, Solly .................................................................................. 6375
  Mother of Ms C Labuschagne, passing of ................................... 2124
  Raad, Rina ...................................................................................... 5843
  Simons, Anna ................................................................................ 4325
  Tilikana, Bonelwa ........................................................................ 3448
  Van Zyl, Pearl ............................................................................. 8012
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Williams, Annetjie</td>
<td>6457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congratulations:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adams, Saleigh Dr.</td>
<td>7706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ajax Cape Town (A J D Marais)</td>
<td>3511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberts, Deon</td>
<td>2935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brackenfell High School</td>
<td>754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown, Egnall</td>
<td>2935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown, Lynne</td>
<td>7051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daries, Eric</td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deon Bruintjies</td>
<td>785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domingo, Regan</td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Driver, Louise</td>
<td>8209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ernstzen, Kelly</td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gebenga, Anelisiwe</td>
<td>2349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goeieman, Annine</td>
<td>4106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hayward, Samantha</td>
<td>7787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Occupations, Winners of Awards for</td>
<td>4783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hip Hop teams of Western Cape</td>
<td>2777</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hon Wiley, M G E</td>
<td>5160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jantjies, Wesley</td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jenner, Minister (Department of the Premier)</td>
<td>2351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kadalie, Fenner</td>
<td>4111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kahn, Dawood</td>
<td>7566</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Klatzow, Prof Peter</td>
<td>6202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Roux, Marzanne</td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Roux, Ziane</td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louw, Joseph</td>
<td>8207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayor of Potchefstroom</td>
<td>6577</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mazibuko, Lindiwe</td>
<td>4503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minister Leonard Max</td>
<td>2262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minister of Education: Pro-poor plan-No fee schools</td>
<td>8158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minister of Health and His Department</td>
<td>6332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minister of Health: Mitchells Plein Hospital</td>
<td>8216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Education Award</td>
<td>5159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nieuwoudt, Charl</td>
<td>2935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nymbezi, Vinoria</td>
<td>5728</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obama, President Barack</td>
<td>6454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repair of air conditioning in house</td>
<td>2658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rescue Services and Firefighters</td>
<td>7057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rianie Strydom</td>
<td>757</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rudner, Bronson</td>
<td>8164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sister Crossley</td>
<td>4351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skwatsha, Mcebisa</td>
<td>7051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sogayise Zamayedwa</td>
<td>7566</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visser, Robin</td>
<td>8164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weideman, Philip</td>
<td>2230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth day event</td>
<td>7704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural diversity</td>
<td>3468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DA Chairpersons and Vice-Persons Elected</td>
<td>6635</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debate on service delivery at clinics and schools</td>
<td>2926</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disabilities, support to people with</td>
<td>4435</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Subject for discussion:

- Conditions in places where poor people live ........................................... 2526
- Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ................................................................. 4189
- Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery ........... 4624
- Economic Empowerment and Development, Success Achieved in Respect of ................................................................. 5805
- Floods in Western Cape ............................................................................. 4368
- Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .............................. 5873
- Heritage Day ............................................................................................... 817
- Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ................................... 661
- Lack of development for young people ...................................................... 2269
- Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ......................................................... 6462
- Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ...................................................... 5164
- Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports ..................................................... 6592
- Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ...................... 2484
- Policing in Mitchells Plain .......................................................................... 887
- Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the coming festive season .......................................................... 8336
- Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster Management ......... 8124
- Sixteen days of activism for no violence against women and children and international aids day .................................................. 3000
- Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .......... 846
- Strategy against Violence against Woman and Children .......................... 7041
- Undermining of Women in the Western Cape ............................................ 8075
- Thanks to Disaster Control Centre ............................................................ 1597
- Victim of human trafficking saved – Motion .............................................. 2934

Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B7B—2009]
(Consideration and finalisation) ................................................................... 2755

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
- Vote 6 – Health .......................................................................................... 1182
- Vote 4 – Community Safety ....................................................................... 1267
- Vote 7 – Social Development .................................................................... 1295
- Vote 1 – Premier ......................................................................................... 1367

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .......................................................................... 4862

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ...................................................... 4955

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .......................................................................... 6724

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
- Consideration of principle ......................................................................... 134
- Vote 1 – Premier ......................................................................................... 230
- Vote 6 – Health .......................................................................................... 278
- Vote 7 – Social Development .................................................................... 316
- Vote 4 – Community Safety ....................................................................... 474
MAX, L H

Premier: ................................................................. 44
Opening Address of ................................................... 44
SOPA (debate) ....................................................... 3357

Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and
Former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament
(Consideration) ....................................................... 1275

Sixteen days of activism for no violence against women and children
and international aids day ........................................ 2996

Speaker's Debate:
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children ........ 1135
Statements made by Premier ..................................... 620

Subject for discussion:
Housing development in Delft ....................................... 1054
Policing in Mitchells Plain ......................................... 895
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ........................................... 2232
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ....................................................... 1256, 1269
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ....................................................... 443,475
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ....................................................... 1690, 1724
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in ............................................ 2417

MBALO, B G
Assault on former mayor .......................................................... 4435
Berg River Municipality, Sale of Land .......................................... 4317
CapeNature: culling of Jackal and Caracal ................................. 8217
CapeNature Outsources Culling to Farmers ............................... 6414
Climate Change, Cape Town Preparedness for ......................... 4693
Condemnation of rape and murder: gay community............... 7885
Condonence, Motion of:
Booi, Chuma ........................................................................ 8211
Feni, Mihlali ........................................................................... 7565
Gxowa, Mamma Bertha .......................................................... 2938
Kolisile, N’kosiphendule ......................................................... 7775
Lunguza, Ntombizodwa ......................................................... 6496
Morris, Christian .................................................................. 8011
Ndleni, Bongile ..................................................................... 6570
Sidumo, Luzuko7565
Sigcau, Nondwe ................................................................... 6375
Deconsecration and sale of sacred burial sites ......................... 4413
Farm Workers, conditions of .................................................... 4439
Farmworkers’ issues: addressing of ............................................ 7878
Fatalities in Cape Town fires .................................................... 4349
Habitat Council: high court challenge ..................................... 7568
Heroic action of Lubalalo Msutwana ..................................... 2660
Human Settlements Policy – Philippi ...................................... 7773
Mayoral committee members, Racist Tactics of ....................... 5900
Minister Anton Bredell: attack on the office of the Auditor-General ...... 8214
Mossel Bay Municipality Mayor, Racist Stance of ...................... 5912
Pregnancies at Albertinia High School ................................... 8019
Rapid Transit project hits brick wall ......................................... 2930
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ..................................................................... 4286
Salutation to Samora Machel Community ............................... 2709
Salutation to Shout Foundation ................................................ 3770
Statement .............................................................................. 6601
Subject for discussion:
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on .................................... 5167
Speaker’s Debate:
Celebrating our cultural diversity ........................................... 2626
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on .................................... 5167
Translation problems in Legislature ......................................... 6405
UN Summit on Global Warming COP 17 ................................. 4698
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .......................................................... 4867
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................. 6737
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 3807, 3808
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ................................................... 7287

McKENZIE, P C

Abuse of international principle of minimum force in Western Cape .......................................................... 2651
Actions by DA Councillor of Elsies River, Bertha Esbach ................................................................. 1010
Activist Anton Frans, Anniversary of Death of .................................................................................. 4701
Ammunition seized by police in Athlone ............................................................................................ 933
Apology by .................................................................................................................. 968
ATM Bombings ................................................................................................................. 5907
Attacks on poor communities by Metro Police ............................................................................. 3446
Attitude of Speaker in staff meeting ............................................................................................. 935
Brutal and deadly attacks on policemen and women ............................................................. 833
Bully tactics and roguish force by Cape Town Metro Police .................................................. 2701
Call on Premier Zille, Replace of MEC for Community Safety ........................................... 5845
Cape Town, child murders and sex abuse in ............................................................................ 4484
Cape Minstrels, funding for ....................................................................................................... 4502
Celebrations of Life, Third Centenary of Adam Kok ................................................................. 4115
Chairperson of Standing Committee on Community Safety:
Incompetence .................................................................................................................. 657
Changing of Culture of Our People ...................................................................................... 6330
City council: official demoted ............................................................................................... 2344
City of Cape Town, Proposed Transfer of Land .................................................................. 38
Community Safety, Gang Plan, Comments by MEC of .................................................... 5838
Condition of Flats in Leonsdale: Terrible ............................................................................. 2406
Condolence, Motion of:
Dewani, Anni ..................................................................................................................... 2933
Johnson, Johnny .................................................................................................................. 2654
Naidoo, Mr Vincent ............................................................................................................. 751
Rape victim from darling ..................................................................................................... 2929
Road Disaster near Lainsburg Claims Nineteen Victims ............................................... 4702
Scholtz, Maxi ..................................................................................................................... 1891
Steers, Mujahied ................................................................................................................. 6633
Victims killed in Gang Violence ............................................................................................ 6323
Williams, Annie .................................................................................................................. 6498

Congratulations:
Bishop Lavis Police Officers ............................................................................................... 4012
Hartnick, Jenny .................................................................................................................... 6336
Liverpool ............................................................................................................................. 939
Minister of Health ................................................................................................................. 2483
National Departments ........................................................................................................... 4116
Petros, Gen ......................................................................................................................... 2478
Removal, Community Safety for Raid on House in Storms River way, Manenberg

Premier:
Possession of Drugs, Arrest of 27 People
Police Officers, Cape Town Metropolitan

Plight of residents of Leonsdale
Non National Minister of Police
National Competencies, Usurpation of Money paid to Premier
Mitchells Plain Policing and Vigilantism
MEC of community safety negotiating with gangsters

MEC: Leaking of SAPS information and attack on Commissioner
MEC for Community Safety: Utterances on Dewani murder by
MEC for Community Safety: Role and Duties

Incorporation of municipal police in SAPS
Inability of PGWC to address gang violence

Inquiry into Policing, Commission of
Khayelitsha Protest, Policeman injured in
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government
Legal right of provincial government to remove blue lights
from police escorts

Lufthansa Flights from Munich to Cape Town

Maintenance of Flats in Townships

DA Programme: Road to 2011
DA public representative accused of rape
DA’s failure to bring down drug and related crimes
DA Snubs Indigenous People

Fellow Learners, Rape of 16-year old boy by
Firing of Dr Annelie Rabie, DA caucus leader in Prince Albert
Free State University racist photos

Gang-Related Violence in Cape

Impact of HIV/Aids and Violence

Incorporation of municipal police in SAPS

WP Rugby
Springboks

DA: Failure to bring down drug and related crimes

DA Programme: Road to 2011
DA public representative accused of rape
DA’s failure to bring down drug and related crimes
DA Snubs Indigenous People

Drug dealers, Marches against
Drugs Seized in Goodwood

Electrocuted, Two Young Girls

Escalation of gangsterism, drug abuse and related criminal activities

Firing of Dr Annelie Rabie, DA caucus leader in Prince Albert
Free State University racist photos

Drug dealers, Marches against
Drugs Seized in Goodwood

DA: Failure to bring down drug and related crimes

Firing of Dr Annelie Rabie, DA caucus leader in Prince Albert
Free State University racist photos

DA Programme: Road to 2011
DA public representative accused of rape
DA’s failure to bring down drug and related crimes
DA Snubs Indigenous People

Drug dealers, Marches against
Drugs Seized in Goodwood

Electrocuted, Two Young Girls

Escalation of gangsterism, drug abuse and related criminal activities
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
On Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010]
(NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010]
(NCOP)(Consideration) ..............................................................3563
Report of Standing Committee on Community Safety on Independent
Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B 15B—2010] and Civilian
Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16B—2010] (Consideration) ........2821
Role of Mark Wiley after Hangberg shootings ................................2652
SAPS, Commendation to .............................................................6579
SAPS, Acts against Drug Dealers ...............................................6638
Service delivery, Derica Lambrechts in Townships on ....................5836
Silence of MEC for community safety about gang-related deaths ......2653
Speaker's Debate:
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ....................................2442
Women Redefining Leadership ....................................................4089
Sports Day, Change of date of ....................................................688
Women Redefining Leadership ....................................................4089
Statements..........................102,651, 830, 970, 2254, 2400, 2608, 3759, 4095, 4125,
..........................................................5298, 5724
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ....................................4715
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ............................2385
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .....................................................4184
Crisis in Hangberg .....................................................................2664, 2684
Housing development in Delft ......................................................1060
Human Rights Day ....................................................................3487
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .....................672
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ...........................................6470
Policing in Mitchells Plain .........................................................879
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .................................2238
Statements made by Premier ......................................................630
Summonses served on unemployed tenants in townships ............2300
Undermining of Constitution of Republic of South Africa ............2771
Unhealthy and Dangerous Sanitation .........................................4138
Unruly conduct of Ravensmead DA councillor ............................835
Violence on our trains ...............................................................2175
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle .........................................................1164
Vote 4 – Community Safety ......................................................1260
Consideration of Votes and Schedules .......................................1389
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ......................................................466
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ....................................4849
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ..............................................................4962
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ....................................6703
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................6741
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................................. 1714
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................................. 3719, 3725
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle) ................................................................. 5319
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) ................................................................. 5481
Woodstock Police Station, Crime situation around and its proposed move ................................................................. 2175
515 Suspects in Mitchells Plain, Arrest of ................................................................. 6457

**MEYER, I**

Premier: ............................................................................................................ 68, 1472
  Opening Address of ................................................................................................. 68, 1472
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ................................................. 5069, 6902
  SOPA (debate) ......................................................................................................... 3352

Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
  (Consideration) ......................................................................................................... 4304

Speaker’s Debate:
  Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .................................... 6289
  Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 .............................................. 4378
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ................................................................. 1621
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children .................. 1144

Subject for discussion:
  Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address ............ 7813
  Empowerment and Development, Success
    Achieved in Respect of ......................................................................................... 5805
  Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ........... 555
  Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ....................... 2488

Report of the Commission for Employment Equity on the Western Cape and the fact that our province still remains resistant to change ......................................................................................................................... 7574
  The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the Western Cape .... 7529

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................................................. 1294, 1302
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ................................................. 4912, 4918
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ......................................................................................... 6640
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ................................................. 6760, 6768
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 7083
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ................................................. 7197, 7219
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle ......................................................................................... 137
  Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................................................. 307
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................................... 1770, 1792
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 3590, 3612
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13
- Cultural Affairs and Sport) ................................................... 5485, 5514
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in .................................. 4569

MQULWANA, K A
Bus accident in Kloofnek Road, Senior Citizens in ............................... 750
City of Cape Town, IRT System in .................................................. 934
City of Cape Town: Public Transport Plan ....................................... 536
Condolence, Motion of:
People involved in car crash ........................................................ 983

Congratulations:
Muslim community .................................................................... 1069
Demolition of places of worship by City of Cape Town ........................ 1642
Eid: 27 November 2009 ................................................................. 1107
Football world cup: gratitude to citizens ......................................... 2372
International Children’s Day .......................................................... 2303
Parliamentary Committees: Importance and impact ......................... 657
Parliamentary committees, importance of ....................................... 2345
Provincial Roads, High accident rate on ........................................... 655
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ....................................... 758,800
Safe festive season to motorists and pedestrians ............................ 1293
SA Roadlink Bus Service: statement by MEC ................................. 2123
Statements .............................................................................. 599, 826, 901, 930, 1008,1288,1742,2221

Subject for discussion:
Conditions in places where poor people live .................................. 2538
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .................... 991
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ...... 549
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .................................... 2234
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .. 849
Tik dealers receiving grants ......................................................... 784
Transport crisis: Government's response ........................................ 607

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle .............................................................. 1155
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .......................................... 1322

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ............................................................................ 1664
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ......................................................... 1903
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................ 1959
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ........................................ 2066
Consideration of Votes and Schedules .......................................... 2158

Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment
Bill [B6—2009] Consideration of principle ....................................... 1081

NCEDANA, M
Biko, Steve Bantu Bonke, Commemoration of ................................. 6205
Closing ...................................................................................... 1391
Subject for discussion:

Statements

Speaker's Debate:

Premier:

Opening Address of ....................................................... 1495
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................. 6919
Statements made by Premier ............................................ 2396

Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
(Consideration and finalisation) .................................... 4785

Public school problems and resources ............................. 836

Speaker's Debate:

Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ........ 5246
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ............. 6279
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices ......................................................... 564

Statements........................................................................ 531, 777, 828, 973, 1006, 1104, 1285, 1289, 1739
...................................................................................... 2294, 2340, 2551, 2917, 2994, 3998, 4094, 4168
...................................................................................... 4343, 4405, 4768, 4931, 5771, 5852, 6359, 6398
...................................................................................... 7656, 7761, 7872, 8184

Subject for discussion:

Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ........................... 4722
Conditions in places where poor people live ..................... 2524
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ........................................... 4192
Crisis in Hangberg ............................................................ 2670
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ................................ 6382
Floods in Western Cape .................................................... 4357, 4375
Growing Inequalities in the Western Cape ......................... 7673
Housing development in Delft .......................................... 1057
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession................................................................................................................. 695
Policing in Mitchells Plain ..................................................................................................................................................................................... 888
Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the coming festive season ...................................................................................... 8342
Report of the Commission for Employment Equity on the Western Cape and the fact that our province still remains resistant to change ............................................................................................................. 7578
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .................................................................................................................................................. 2240
Statements made by Premier................................................................................................................................................................................. 628
The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor programmes and proposals that it will be benefiting the people of the Western Cape ................................................................................................. 7955
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in .............................................................................................................................................. 4568
Unemployment, high rate of .................................................................................................................................................................................. 2347
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................................................................................................................................................. 1161
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................................................................................................................................................. 1223
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing .................................................................................................................................................... 1248
Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................................................................................................................................ 1300
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .......................................................................................................................................................................... 1374
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ....................................................................................................................................................... 1388, 1390
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .................................................................. 4961
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .................................................................. 4968
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) ....................................................................................................... 4974
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................................................................................................................................ 159
Vote 8 – Local Government ............................................................................................................................................................................. 179
Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................................................................................................................................ 319
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................................................................................................................................................... 427
Vote 4 – Community Safety ........................................................................................................................................................................... 464
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 14 – Local Government ........................................................................................................................................................................ 1816
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................................................................................................................................ 1847
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ...................................................................................................................................................................... 2136
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ....................................................................................................................................................... 2157
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle) ..................................................................................................... 5312
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .................................................................................. 5413
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) ..................................................................................... 5479
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 - Cultural Affairs and Sport) ........................................................................... 5507
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 - Health) .................................................................................................... 5538
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – (Provincial Parliament) .................................................................................. 5562
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) .................................................. 5588
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) .......................................................... 5704
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ........................................................................... 7072
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) .................................................. 7185
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............................................ 7216
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................ 7354
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) .................................................. 7392
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) .................................................. 7401
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .................................................. 7444
Western Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) .............................................................. 7463
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2013] (Finalisation) ................................................................................................. 7475
Western Cape District Health Councils Bill [B6B—2010] (Consideration and Finalisation) .................................................. 2945
Western Cape Land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] ......................................................................... 3990
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill [B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ..................... 4945

Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape – Role of Provincial Government in ................................................................. 2418

NTWANAMBI, N D
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................................................................................................. 1488
Subject for discussion:
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession .................................................. 705

OZINSKY, M
Absence from SCOPA .................................................................................................................................................. 7772
Ad hoc Committee:
Appointment .................................................................................................................................................. 4593
Agricultural Areas, Failure of Standing Committee to make Intervention in ................................................................. 6629
Uprising in .................................................................................................................................................. 2612
Allocation of houses in Pelican Park housing project .............................................................................................. 2612
Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health – (Consideration) ................................................ 4273
Audit reports not yet considered by SCOPA: debate ......................................................................................... 1594
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .......................... 2572, 2589
Cape Nature CEO not Named ........................................................................... 5777
Cape Nature Kills Leopard without Permit ....................................................... 4773
Cape Nature: policy on predators ....................................................................... 7503
Cape Nature: public/private partnerships ............................................................ 1591
Carlisle, R V: contribution to struggle against apartheid ...................................... 7515
Closing down of democratic space ...................................................................... 2925
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof ........................ 5752
Condolences: Motion of
Isaacs, Sedick ....................................................................................................... 6370
Manuel, Ashleya .................................................................................................... 7777
Manuel, Caitlyn ..................................................................................................... 7777
Manuel, Kegan ..................................................................................................... 7777
Msabala, Christopher .......................................................................................... 7053
Peterson, Rafeeq .................................................................................................. 6451
Congratulations:
Department of Science and Technology, Sun Space and University of Stellenbosch .......................................................... 789
End Conscription Campaign .................................................................................. 940
Full Recovery ......................................................................................................... 3517
Learners of Pinelands North Primary School ......................................................... 3953
McBride, Robert ..................................................................................................... 8213
New Diplomats ....................................................................................................... 540
SA Military Veterans’ Organisation ....................................................................... 4326
Water Affairs National Department ...................................................................... 3518
Conflict in de Doorns, Defusing of ........................................................................ 6450
DA membership: King Dalindyebo ...................................................................... 7770
Dashboard Management System, Failure of ......................................................... 593
Departments of Education and health performance audits ..................................... 7772
Distortion of History by DA .................................................................................. 7698
Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of
Department of Education – Motion ...................................................................... 7987
Economic growth only in open, opportunity society .............................................. 1592
Establishment of ad hoc committee ..................................................................... 2614
George Municipality: ............................................................................................. 2610
Housing Fund’s Annual Report: late submission .................................................... 8201
Hunting Regulations .............................................................................................. 4774
Hypocrisy of Provincial Government .................................................................... 2772
Implementation of Planning Act, 1999: debate ...................................................... 1593
Implementation of Western Cape Planning and Development Act ...................... 1895
Interference by Premier in School Visit ................................................................. 3941
Investigation into possible misleading of House by Minister ................................ 103
Invitation, Withdrawal of ...................................................................................... 5727
Max, Lennit - Still in Office .................................................................................... 4935
Max L: Remunerative Work .................................................................................. 4935
MEC Botha instruction by, to Prof Househam not to answer a question ................ 4485
MEC Madikizela, criticism of Premier Zille by ...................................................... 4417
Military Veterans ................................................................................................. 4318
Military Veterans: absence of assistance ............................................................... 8200
Military Veterans, Assistance to........................................................................5727
Minister and HOD on LUPO’s Unconstitutionality........................................2773
Office of the Speaker: Xenophobia Campaign..............................................362
Overstrand Municipality Land Sale ................................................................539
Peoples’ Republic of China ..............................................................................
Piracy by State of Israel ...................................................................................2300
Policing in Mitchells Plain................................................................................893
Premier:
  Opening Address of .....................................................................................1523
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ........................................5063, 5087
  SOPA (debate) ...........................................................................................3369
Province, Violence in Sport in ........................................................................609
Removal of small business traders .................................................................2319
Report of Auditor-General: Contracts given to Civil Servants ......................142
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
  in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ....................................................757
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
Results of Census 2011 ...................................................................................6515
Role of Mr Walters in encouraging Overstrand Municipality to commission
  report .............................................................................................................904
SCOPA mandate: undermining of by DA and ACDP ....................................8008
SCOPA Meeting .............................................................................................5776
Speaker’s car accident ....................................................................................747
Speaker’s Debate:
  World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
    Against Women and Children ..................................................................4748
Statement by member in terms of rule 63(2) ..................................................7863
Statements ........................................................................................................
  .....................................................................................................................2768, 3438, 3762, 4430, 4771, 7764, 8002, 8189
Subject for discussion:
  Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ...................................................4723
  Cover-up by DA in Swellendam ...................................................................5415
  Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ............................................................6390
  Freedom Day: 16 Years later ........................................................................2190
  Governance of Robben Island .....................................................................2840
  Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape .............7908
  Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ......................2496
Report of the Commission for Employment Equity on the
  Western Cape and the fact that our province still remains
    resistant to change ...................................................................................7580
  The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the
    Western Cape ..........................................................................................7536
Supply chain management and role of speaker and politicians
  in awarding of tenders and contracts – Motion ..........................................2519
TV Screens in the House ................................................................................7666
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in .........................................4575
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development
    Planning) ...................................................................................................4869
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) .....................................................6707
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 8417
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................. 515
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010] Second Reading ........................................................................ 1673
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .................. 2009
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................. 2107
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................ 2138
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ....................................... 2158
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011] Consideration of principle ............................................................. 3541
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................... 3723
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3784
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ...................................................... 5324
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ................................................. 5590
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ...................................................... 7082
Western Cape Government Absent from Deputy President’s Speech at NCOP ......................................................... 7042
Western Cape Land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] ................................................................. 3993
Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill [B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) ............... 3984
Xenophobic violence in province ......................................... 2369
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape – Role of Provincial Government in ..................................................... 2414
Zeeekoevlei High School: Building of fence and closing of school – Motion .................................................... 3511

**PAULSE, S U**
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ........ 913
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .................... 2580
Closing ............................................................................. 1392
Premier: Opening Address of .................................................. 63, 1505
Statements made by Premier .................................................. 2396
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) .................................................................................. 1113
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) ...... 1276
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ........................................ 803
Speaker's Debate: Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ........... 91
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ..................................... 2437
Women of Western Cape — Employment, opportunities and choices................................................................. 568
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children........................................................................ 1139
Statements.................................................................. 533,652,684,743,779,902,929,975,1034,1286,1291,2119, 2222, 2254, 2296, 2365, 2456, 2474, 2515, 2556
Subject for discussion:
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ......................... 2384
Conditions in places where poor people live ............................. 2528
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape.............. 989
Housing development in Delft............................................. 1051
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ................ 667
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape 551
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession................................................. 699
Lack of development for young people................................... 2265
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ....... 2490
Policing in Mitchells Plain............................................... 890
Problems in Bitou Municipality........................................... 950
Removal of small business traders........................................ 2318
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .......................... 2236
Thanks and good wishes to Dr Boesak................................... 987
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle.................................................... 1154
Vote 6 – Health.................................................................. 1188
Vote 11 – Agriculture............................................................ 1211
Vote 5 – Education................................................................. 1226
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................... 1236
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing............................... 1250
Vote 4 – Community Safety.................................................. 1267
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works................................... 1325
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury................................................... 1355
Vote 1 – Premier................................................................. 1366
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament............................................... 1376
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle..................................................... 124
Vote 8 – Housing................................................................ 161
Vote 8 – Local Government.................................................. 181
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport...................................... 201
Vote 5 – Education............................................................... 255
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading.................................................................. 1663
Vote 4 – Community Safety.................................................. 1711
Vote 11 – Agriculture........................................................... 2105
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament.............................................. 2137
Consideration of Votes and Schedules.................................... 2157
Western Cape road infrastructure........................................ 935
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill
[B6—2009]Consideration of principle..................................... 1081
PLATO, D
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School and Implications thereof ........................................ 5742
Explanation in terms of rule 63 ................................................................. 7942
Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 ........................................ 4394
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ................................. 5087, 6902
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) .......... 4286
Speaker’s Debate:
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .......................... 6286
Subject for Discussion:
Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address ........ 7804
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .................. 5252
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ...................................................... 6469
Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the coming festive season ......................... 8352
Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster Management ........ 8136
Report of the Commission for Employment Equity on the Western Cape and the fact that our province still remains resistant to change .................................................. 7583
The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor programmes and proposals that it will be benefiting the people of the Western Cape .................................................. 7954
Undermining of Women in the Western Cape ........................................ 8074
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 4839
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 8403
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) ................................................................. 5462
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) ................................................................. 5488
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................................. 5401, 5422
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013 ] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 7334
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ..................... 7464, 7483
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence Against Women and Children ................................................................. 4757

PRETORIUS, P J C
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School and Implications thereof .................. 5742
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ........................ 5787
National Health Amendment Bill [B24d - 2011] (NCOP) (Consideration) .... 6520
Report on Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B33 - 2012] (NCOP) (Consideration) ................................................................. 6520
Ruling: .................................................................................. 5693, 5742, 5785, 5825, 6364, 6996, 8444
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................. 6739
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ........................................ 6787
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Finalisation) .............................................................................. 6788
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 5304
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Finalisation) ................................................................. 5736
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) ............................................................. 5783
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 7081

PRINS, E

Baboon Management Contract ......................................................... 537
Commendation to national government for disaster alleviation .......... 2708
Condolence, Motion of:
  Julies, Portia ........................................................................ 8161
  Julies, Ryan ........................................................................ 8161
  Malan, Ms Marie ................................................................. 2179
  Mhlambeni, Annie ............................................................... 8020
  Solomons, Naeem ............................................................... 8161
  Vollenhoven, Aunt Tatie ......................................................... 6260
Congratulation:
  Community Corrections and Medium A Correctional Centre ......... 3513
  Dowry, Cobus, former MEC for Agriculture ......................... 4419
  Drum Majorettes, Eight of SWD ............................................ 2464
  Kairos Drama Group of Heidelberg ......................................... 5781
  Meerendal Wine Estate on gold medal .................................... 1892
 Nicholls, Nelson ................................................................. 3949
  Semenya, Castor ............................................................... 2480
  Springboks ..................................................................... 754
  Toraymond Koopstad ......................................................... 4508
  Van As, Richard ................................................................ 7941
Corruption in Provincial Department .............................................. 6405
Corruption in Swellendam Municipality .......................................... 4004
Councillor Mattheys Koch’s Failure to Declare his Interests .............. 3616
Drought assistance to farmers ....................................................... 2300
Eviction of Farm Workers ........................................................... 4005
Exclusion of small- scale farmers from summit ............................... 2926
Farm Project, Agri Dwala Empowerment ....................................... 4700
Farms: violating health and remuneration legislation ....................... 2370
Farmworkers: challenges ........................................................... 7558
Farmworkers in the Western Cape: plight of ................................. 7572
Farm Workers, Speedy recovery involved in Bus Accident .............. 4608
Food bank for excess produced food ............................................. 2774
Frequent accidents with open or heavy-duty vehicles .................... 4414
International Human Rights Day .................................................. 4940
Job losses on farms: myth .......................................................... 8197
Labourers in farming areas: dissatisfaction ....................................... 8199

(lxviii)
Lutheran church complex

Matters Pertaining to Farmworkers

MEC’S visit to Leifiefontein, Paarl

Poor Service delivery with Housing in Oudtshoorn

Premier:

Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)

Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits

(Consideration)

Shop Owners, Bad Behaviour against Poor People

Speaker’s Debate:

Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently

World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence

Against Women and Children

Statements

532,1292,1585,2220, 2399, 2766, 2930, 3504,
3997, 4313, 4347, 4406, 5772, 6446, 6487

Subject for Discussion:

Cover-up by DA in Swellendam

Equity Share Land Reform Schemes

Floods in Western Cape

Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the coming festive season

Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas

Swellendam DA mayoral committee member : misconduct

Swellendam Municipality: offences, anomalies and bottlenecks

Three Life Sentences for Farm Murderer

Vehicles, Farm workers Transported on back of

Violence Against Farm Dwellers

Water crisis under DA Government

Water Wastage by City of Cape Town

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B2—2009]

Vote 11 – Agriculture

Western Cape Agricultural Sector, awards in

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]

(Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government)

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]

(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture)

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]

Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Vote 11 – Agriculture

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]

Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Vote 11 – Agriculture

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]

Vote 11 – Agriculture

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture)

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]

(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture)

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013 ] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety)
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .............................................................. 7437
Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ........................................................................ 7464
Worcester hospital ........................................................................ 3446

ROSSOUW, A

Absence to Speaker, leave of ........................................................................................................ 4593
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ........................................ 913
Ad Hoc Committee, replacement of Mr E J von Brandis on ..................................................... 832
ANC Government on Service Delivery, Negative impact of ....................................................... 15
Appointment of temporary chairpersons .................................................................................. 7594
Appointment: Temporary Chairpersons .................................................................................... 7
Boston, USA World Floral Art Show in ...................................................................................... 4146
Chronic medication: serious shortage of .................................................................................... 2371
Condolence, Motion of:
Asmal, Kader ............................................................................................................................... 3977
Beaufort West taxi victims .......................................................................................................... 2705
Carlisle, R Minister .................................................................................................................... 8154
Dauth, Joe .................................................................................................................................... 8210
De Villiers, Attie ........................................................................................................................ 7506
Hopkins, Marianne .................................................................................................................... 2620
Le Roux, Dawie .......................................................................................................................... 8327
Maroem, Mr E C ........................................................................................................................ 39
Meintjies, Frits and Berno .......................................................................................................... 6320
Rheenenadal Area, School Bus Accident .................................................................................. 4319
Titus, Lynda ................................................................................................................................... 8013
Young People die in Car Accident ............................................................................................ 4779

Congratulations:
Barnard, Mr Jimmy ...................................................................................................................... 4505
Boqwana, Nolwazi ...................................................................................................................... 8017
City of Cape Town ...................................................................................................................... 4423
Cloete, Mr Anthony, Top Performer at Cape Agri Academy ....................................................... 1108
Diane Davis .................................................................................................................................. 8017
Du Toit, Natalie ........................................................................................................................... 2655, 6451
Election of new DA council members ....................................................................................... 7935
Fortuin, Chantel .......................................................................................................................... 2349
Greene, Mr Tim ........................................................................................................................... 4507
Gouws, Prof R H ........................................................................................................................ 6209
Hanekom, Sandra ...................................................................................................................... 4782
Heritage Cape On Tenth Anniversary ...................................................................................... 6409
Hunter, Mr Tony .......................................................................................................................... 6454
Jackson, Julian ............................................................................................................................ 7516
Jewish Community ...................................................................................................................... 753
Jonkbloed, Zelda ......................................................................................................................... 6206
Koster John ................................................................................................................................... 3771
Luyt, Margot .................................................................................................................................. 6209
Maritz, Jan ..................................................................................................................................... 2305
Mayor of Cape Town ................................................................................................................... 6329
Minister Madikizela ..................................................................................................................... 3473
MPP Jennifer Hartnick ................................................................................................................ 2464
Muslims on Ramadan ................................................................. 611
Nyman, Roseline ................................................................. 8017
Partridge, Sally-Ann ............................................................. 7516
Safari, Jamala ........................................................................ 7516
Savage, Kate ........................................................................... 8017
Scholtz, Marius ...................................................................... 8204
Steyn, Elize .............................................................................. 2349
Van der Rheede, Mr Christo ................................................... 4439
Van der Wat, Hannatjie .......................................................... 7564
Discharged from Ad Hoc Committee, Mr E J von Brandis ...... 837
Eskom tariff increase and top management .............................. 1010
Fair Trade Tourism: code of conduct ...................................... 7605
House, Business of ............................................................... 16,80,110,266,443,879,1084,1281,1602,1735,
..............................2165, 2250, 4545, 4929, 5276, 3736, 5741, 5804, 6896, 7299, 7861, 7975
..............................8117, 8300, 8301, 8384
Intellectual Property Laws Amendment Bill [B8B – 2010]
Recinding of resolution ............................................................ 8191
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government .... 5789
Misrepresentations by ANC ..................................................... 834
Money-lenders and shebeen owners: effect and impact of ...... 2371
National awards to educators .................................................. 3451
NCOP, Appointment of T B Beylevelandt ......................... 2654
NCOP, Delegates to, Authority to Vote ................................... 6
NCOP, Permanent delegates to ............................................... 5, 4475
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ............................... 758
Order of the Day, Point of Order, Programming of ......... 4269
Outcomes of 2009-10 annual reports ...................................... 2946
Postponement of discussion of 2009-10 annual report .... 2947
Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial
Legislatures Act ....................................................................... 266
Premier, Remuneration of ...................................................... 1084
Registrar of members’ interests, Ms R K Begg ....................... 3509
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
(Consideration) ..................................................................... 4280
Report of Rules Committee on amendments to standing
Rules (Consideration) ............................................................... 4562
............................................................................................ 8170
Road Accident Fatalities ......................................................... 6413
Rules Committee ..................................................................... 7
Safe Transportation of Learners .............................................. 2518
Sitting, Hours of ..................................................................... 1802
Speaker’s Debate:
Celebrating our cultural diversity ............................................ 2628
Economic Freedom of the Youth ............................................. 3965
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ...... 5252
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ................................. 2439
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and
choices ................................................................................... 571
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
Children .................................................................................. 1139
SKWATSHA, M
AD Hoc Committee, Appointment of .................................................. 4007
Ambulance Services and Response time, State of ................................ 749
Arrogance of DA government with taxi strike – Motion .......................... 3467
Atlantis integrated transport system ...................................................... 2559
Attacks by Premier on Constitution and South African Human Rights Commission ................................................................. 2651
Bafana Bafana, Support for .................................................................. 307
Casino: establishment of second casino in Metropole ............................ 2368
Chronic Medicine, Chaos with dispensing of .................................................. 5859
Chronic Medicine, Incorrect labelling of .......................................................... 5873
Clinics, Shocking state of .................................................................................. 4173
Condolence, Motion of:
  Cravez, Hugo ..................................................................................................... 7050
  Death of People after Collision of taxi and truck ....................................... 2480
  Gillwald, Cheryl ............................................................................................... 2407
  January, Joseph ................................................................................................. 6408
  Kasrils, Eleanor ................................................................................................. 1011
  Khumalo, Alf ....................................................................................................... 6374
  Madikwa, Nomvelo "Rayi" ................................................................................ 617
  Maxenza, Const Daniel ..................................................................................... 1893
  Meer, Ms Fatima ............................................................................................... 1643
  Mgobozi, Zakhele Crosby ............................................................................... 3454
  Mkhiza, Gavin .................................................................................................... 7055
  Mkunqana, Simphiwe ...................................................................................... 6324
  Myethu, Themba ............................................................................................... 6406
  Ndiziba, Ngcondo ............................................................................................. 107
  Ncukana, Ezra .................................................................................................... 2407
  Nokhatywa, Agnes ........................................................................................... 8203
  Ntunja, Mzuvukile ........................................................................................... 8208
  Nxu, Xolile Death of Vice-President of SAMWU ......................................... 5871
  Sisulu, Zwelakhe .............................................................................................. 6317
  Ting Ting Masanga .......................................................................................... 787
  Van Den Velde, Dr Mark .................................................................................. 4356
  Victims of recent horror crashes ..................................................................... 2706
  Yengeni, Mr ........................................................................................................ 836

Congratulations:
  Bafana Bafana ................................................................................................. 694, 2568, 4108
  Chabaku, Motlaelope ...................................................................................... 5845
  Comrade James Ngculu ................................................................................... 1070
  Discovery Foundation Award ......................................................................... 7666
  Fish, Liz ............................................................................................................. 3948
  Mandela, Nelson Rolihlahla ........................................................................... 4700
  Mandela, Nelson: 92nd birthday ..................................................................... 2375
  Martin, Prof Lorna ........................................................................................... 4559
  Mbulawa, Ms Bukelwa ................................................................................... 4561
  New IT Centre at Heideveld Mosque ................................................................. 7668
  Saldanha Municipality ..................................................................................... 988

Cape Town Doctor Resuscitates Boy After Near-Drowning ............................... 6634
Correctional Service Officer, Immoral Act between Police Woman .................. 4177
DA Elective Procedures ....................................................................................... 6493
DA, NGO funding by ........................................................................................... 4434
DA-run municipalities: incompetence of to secure base camps for
  Fifa World Cup .................................................................................................. 2346
Death of Seven Members of Family after eating Cooked Mushrooms .............. 6269
Deaths at Rail Level Crossings ......................................................................... 4003
Decade’s child rights heroes: Nelson Mandela and Graça Machel ..................... 1039
Department of Health, 83 Cases of FIU register ............................................... 6459
Deputy Speaker on 18 August 2009, Behaviour of ......................................... 691
Expenditure of ratepayers’ money ..................................................................... 2561
Fires in Kanana informal Areas, Gugulethu ........................................................................ 6577
G F Jooste Hospital ........................................................................................................... 7519
Gugulethu Seven, President of Benin Awards Families of .............................................. 4938
Hanover Park Day Hospital: closure due to gang violence ............................................ 8197
Health Insurance, Green Paper on ................................................................................. 4182
HIV Campaign, Get Tested and ..................................................................................... 4774
ID-ANC Coalition ............................................................................................................. 2403
Increase in Rats ................................................................................................................. 5908
Kenny Africa, Appointment of ....................................................................................... 2225
Killing of Mqgontshi and Ncatana couple in Philippi East ............................................. 752
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ........................................... 5787, 5789
Lwazi Primary School Gugulethu: IT laboratory hand over ........................................... 7613
Maternal deaths, rise in .................................................................................................... 4414
Mayoral Committee Member, Untoward Behaviour by .................................................. 5868
MEC Botha’s Intimidating DA Member ........................................................................... 6501
Medical students in Cuba ............................................................................................... 7514
Mentally challenged: Poor quality healthcare .................................................................. 7771
Mitchells Plain Hospital: delay in opening ..................................................................... 7504
Mitchells Plein Hospital: planning and funding .............................................................. 8196
Motsaaledi, Aaron - single anti-retroviral pill, introduction of ..................................... 7522
Mthethwa, Nathi: attendance at crime imbizo in Manenberg ........................................ 7521
MyCiTibus system ............................................................................................................ 2770
National Health Insurance ............................................................................................... 7606
Paarl Hospital and Polar Park clinic, complaints ........................................................... 7785
People living in low-cost homes at risk of contracting TB ............................................. 4485
Premier:
  Opening Address of ....................................................................................................... 44, 1477
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................................................... 5028, 6934
  Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
    (Consideration and finalisation) .................................................................................... 4784
  SOPA (debate) .............................................................................................................. 3327
Premier and DA’s Protection of Mr Kenny Africa ............................................................ 2698
President Zuma Re-Elected ........................................................................................... 7048
Raid on communities of Somali origin ............................................................................ 2775
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
  Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) ......................... 1273
Report of standing committee on community safety on independent
  Police investigative directorate Bill [b 15b—2010] and civilian
  Secretariat for police service bill [B16B—2010] (Consideration) ............................... 2825
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
  NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ........................................................................ 792
Seasonal Diseases, Victims of ....................................................................................... 5154
Shortage of Beds at Helderberg Hospital ....................................................................... 6636
Shortage of clinics in poor and working class areas ......................................................... 7769
Speaker’s Debate:
  World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
    Against Women and Children ................................................................................... 4747
  St Luke’s Hospice .......................................................................................................... 4557
Statements ......................................................................................................................... 98,742,972,1035,1636,1740, 2458, 2474, 2645, .......................................................................................... 2696, 2807, 3458, 3999, 4550, 4591, 4766, 4934,
  ................................................................................................................................. 5142, 6626, 7692, 7762, 7929
Subject for discussion:

- Cover-up by DA in Swellendam ................................................................. 5422
- Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ................................................................. 4193
- Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
  Delivery ......................................................................................................... 4618
- Freedom Day: 16 Years later ................................................................. 2182
- Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats .................................................. 6466
- Removal of small business traders ....................................................... 2315
- Safety on public transport in Western Cape ....................................... 2244
- The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s
  pro-poor programmes .......... and proposals that it will be benefiting
  the people of the Western Cape .......................................................... 7967
- Tygerberg Hospital ................................................................................. 4553
- Tygerburg hospital, Gratitude to.......................................................... 6573
- UDF .......................................................................................................... 4180
- Unguarded Rail Crossings ..................................................................... 2518
- Unsafe and unguarded rail level crossings ......................................... 2775
- Unsanitary waste canal in Khayelitsha ............................................... 4433

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
- Consideration of principle .................................................................... 1151
- Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .............................................................. 1376
- Consideration of Votes and Schedules ................................................ 1389

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
- (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................................. 4860
- Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
  of Votes and Schedule) ......................................................................... 4964
- Western Cape farming communities, foetal alcohol syndrome in ........ 4484
- Western Cape, Twelve per cent with FAS in ...................................... 4415
- Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 6664
- Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................................. 6722
- Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  - Consideration of principle ................................................................. 122
  - Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .......................................................... 520
- Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  - Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .............................................................. 1900
  - Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................ 1954
  - Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................ 2071
- Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  - Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ........................................... 3901
- Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 –
  Health) .................................................................................................... 5539
- Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 6 - Health) .................................................................. 7315
- Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 –
  Provincial Parliament) ........................................................................... 7442
STALI, Z C

Afrika, Kenny: corruption charges .......................................................... 8198
ANC, Veterans Honoured by ................................................................. 5155
ANC wins by-election ............................................................................ 4353
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ..................... 2577
Bribery at Licence Testing Centres ........................................................ 7669
Cape Town Motorist Hazel Souma ........................................................ 5273
Cape Town Stadium ............................................................................. 2770
City of Cape Town, MyCiTi Vehicle operation Companies Upset .......... 6575
Community Safety, Remarks by Minister .............................................. 4099
Condolence, Motion of:
Asmal, Kader ......................................................................................... 3977
Florence, Brent ...................................................................................... 2819
Haas, Ashley ........................................................................................ 2819
Member Nyanda, Florence .................................................................. 5779
Nyalela, Samkelo ................................................................................. 8167
Peterson, Vernie .................................................................................. 3453
Shiceka, Former Minister Sicelo ........................................................... 5779
Congratualtions
Bafana Bafana .................................................................................... 2779, 3766
Cape Argus Pick 'n Pay Cycle Tour ...................................................... 3474
Fugard, Athol ....................................................................................... 4010
Jonson, Denver .................................................................................... 4110
Manyonga, Luvo ................................................................................ 2410
Minister Fikile Mbalula, Cape Argus Cycle Tour .................................. 527
Mpetha, Family ................................................................................... 4104
Orlando Pirates .................................................................................... 3949
Proteas .................................................................................................. 3472
SA Commonwealth team ................................................................... 2710
SAFA .................................................................................................... 3769
Vasco da Gama Football Club .............................................................. 1595
Vergotine, Valentino ........................................................................... 4110
WP Currie Cup rugby team .................................................................. 2615
WP Rugby teams .................................................................................. 2704
Economic Freedom of the Youth .......................................................... 3967
Failure to Deal with Taxi Conflict ....................................................... 7041
Funds, Maintenance Lack of ............................................................... 4139
Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 ................................ 4398
Legal blood alcohol level ................................................................... 7555
Looming Strikes at Bus Rapid Transport System .................................. 7041
Mitchells Plain Hospital, Construction of ........................................... 4137
MyCiTi Public Transport West Coast Route ......................................... 4350
Name Changes .................................................................................... 1745
N1 “Road of Death”, Ongoing Carnage on .......................................... 4694
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .............................. 5055
Processes followed by Transport Directorate ...................................... 7664
Report of Standing Committees meeting together regarding their
Participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ....................... 2748
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) .................................................................................... 4306
SAPS Priority Committee: Delft and Khayelitsha taxi violence .................. 8332
Speaker's Debate:
   Celebrating our cultural diversity .......................................................... 2631
Statements.................................................. 2171, 2340, 4093, 4130, 4496, 4687, 4930, 5260,
 .................................................. 6253, 6399, 6566, 6566, 6597, 7036, 8047, 8145
 .................................................. 8185
Subject for discussion:
   Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
   Empowerment and Development, Success
   Achieved in Respect of ................................................................. 5805
   Governance of Robben Island .......................................................... 2835
   Preparedness of the Western Cape Government with regard to the
   coming festive season ................................................................. 8353
   Taxi Violence in Western Cape ...................................................... 6339
   The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the
   Western Cape ................................................................. 7526
   Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ............................. 4571
   Taxi crisis in the Western Cape ...................................................... 7502
   Taxi violence: Delft and Khayelitsha .............................................. 8196
   Transport System, Bus Rapid ......................................................... 4555
   Utilisation of Stadiums in Western Cape ........................................ 2476
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
   (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ......................... 4817
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
   (Finalisation) .............................................................................. 4974
Widening of racial divide under DA government .................................. 2774
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]
   (Consideration and finalisation) ..................................................... 6674
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
   Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................ 1872
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................ 2038
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................ 3607
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of
   Principle) ...................................................................................... 7078
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
   (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ) ....................... 7263
2010 Soccer: involvement of structures in sports, arts and culture .......... 1592

STRACHAN, G R
Cape Town as South Africa’s Silicon Valley ........................................... 833
Chairperson of Standing Committee of Finance, Censuring of .............. 589
Clothing Sector, Strike in .................................................................. 783
Paulse, Ms S U, Statement of .............................................................. 656
Premier, Misleading statements by ...................................................... 15
Premier:
   Opening Address of ........................................................................ 65
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
   (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
   (Consideration) ............................................................................ 1110
Statements......................................................................................... 300, 585, 828, 1033, 1105, 2455
TINGWE, M

Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ........................................... 4151
Closure of Nongovernmental Organisations ......................................................... 5858
Closure of Schools ............................................................................. 5900
Commemoration of Fifty Years Unity in Africa ........................................ 7664
Computer facilities at schools in the Western Cape ................................ 7557

Condolence, Motion of:
Abrahams, Irafaan .............................................................................. 4493
Amantengelo, Dala Xolo ................................................................. 4503
Bazolo, Waya ..................................................................................... 4489
Charles, Shamee in Doha mall Fire .................................................... 5862
Ford, Kelly-Jade .............................................................................. 6631
Gogo, Ntobeko .................................................................................. 7701
Lithemba Loli .................................................................................. 787
Lyanga, Sis ....................................................................................... 7571
Mfenku, Ayanda .............................................................................. 7882
Mqweni, Uwive ................................................................................ 7571
Namzi, Lutando ................................................................................ 7663
Ngcongca-Mgobozi, Phumla ............................................................. 7893
Ntabeni, Babalwa ............................................................................ 7059
People killed in fire in Lingelethu, Khayelitsha ................................ 2463
Pietersen, Moegamat ....................................................................... 6498
Smith, Keenen .................................................................................. 6631
Swail, Lee-Ann ................................................................................ 6631

Congratulations:
Brink, Mashaarn .............................................................................. 4178
Ganya Wandile .............................................................................. 4509
Mntungwa, Vezokuhle .................................................................. 7518
Mpofu-Wlash, Sizwe ..................................................................... 4010
NYDA ................................................................................................. 4509
Salute to Dean Stockenstrom ........................................................... 4114
Salute to Liezel Van der Westhuizen .............................................. 4114
Schools, Overcrowded .................................................................. 4174
Simon, Ray Alexander .................................................................. 2937
Tshibika, Sibahle .................................................. 8216
DA-Government to Provide Equal Education, Failure of ........................................... 5267
DA's inability to mobilise young people regarding social cohesion .................................. 1894
DA-LED Government to Employ People living with disabilities, Failure of .................. 4604
DASO Found Guilty of Contravening Three UCT SCR Election by Laws ........................................... 6327
Deafness ............................................................. 2521
De Duine Primary School, Lotus River, Dog Buried Alive at ........................................ 4778
Denneprag Primary School, Mossel Bay to Plead for Their School to Remain open, March to WCED District Office by .................................................. 6633
Deputy Minister Visits Hospital and School ........................................................................ 6414
Divide along racial and language lines .............................................................................. 6577
Education System, Inequality in the ................................................................................. 5858
Failure of Education in Western Cape .............................................................................. 7045
Failure of WCED to indicate how money was Spent, Shutting Down of 15 Schools ........... 6628
Farewell to Tata Mpilo Tutu .................................................................................................. 2412
Farm Schools: drop-out rate ............................................................................................... 7938
Girl gang attack: Heideveld High School .......................................................................... 7572
Grade Nine, Failure rate, .................................................................................................... 5904
Hillview Housing Development Project, Delay in .................................................................. 2256
Housing development in Delft ............................................................................................ 934
Increasing Racial Divisions ................................................................................................. 7659
Initiation Practices Condemned .......................................................................................... 5867
Lavis Drive Primary, Furniture Inventory at ....................................................................... 6499
Learner abuse ........................................................................................................................ 8062
Learners and Educators, Safety of ..................................................................................... 4602
Learners Protest about having to pay for Textbooks ............................................................ 5150
Learner Transport: rural areas ............................................................................................. 7935
Matric Passes, University of Western Cape Project to Improve ........................................ 5065
Minister of Education: educational issues ........................................................................... 7559
Minister of Education: fence jumping .................................................................................. 7567
Mitchells Plain: absenteeism - school closures and gang violence .................................. 7933
Mitchells Plain bursary and Role Model Trust bursary ..................................................... 7520
Number and Quality of ....................................................................................................... 4703
Premier:
       Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................................................... 5065
Provincial Legislature, disregarding of isiXhosa language in ............................................. 982
Punishing of learners for debt and defaults of parents .......................................................... 4491
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) ..................... 4277, 4611
Rheenendal bus tragedy: anniversary ............................................................................... 7936
Safety at Schools .................................................................................................................. 7661
Sexual Abuse and Rape, Complaints of Teacher Misconduct, Including Cases of ............... 4603
School Placements: waiting lists .......................................................................................... 7785
Shortage of Public Schools ................................................................................................... 7659
Speaker's Debate:
       Economic freedom of the Youth .................................................................................... 3958
       Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ............................................................... 85
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .................................................. 560
Sport as unifying factor .................................................................................................................. 747
Statements. 2557, 4128, 4769, 5141, 5262, 5295, 5831, 5851, 7495, 7549, 7653, 7872, 7903, 7921
Student Uprising, 11 August 1976 ............................................................................................ 4144
Subject for discussion:
  Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address .................. 7789
  Crisis in Hangberg ................................................................. 2674
  Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ............................... 996
  Heritage Day ............................................................................ 810
  Housing development in Delft .......................................................... 1047
  Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ................................... 668
  Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape .............. 7789
  Lack of development for young people ..................................................... 2262
  Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape .......................................... 6425
The results of the independent testing of learners in Grades 3, 6 and 9 and of the impact of that on the aims of education in the Western Cape ................................................................. 7622
TB exposure: nursery school children ............................................................... 8212
Teaching Award, Top National ........................................................................ 4556
Teenage pregnancies ................................................................................................. 2560
Textbook delivery in Western Cape ........................................................................... 7616
Textbooks, Questioned, Delivery of ....................................................................... 5901
Underperformance of Schools in the Western Cape ........................................ 7699
UNESCO’s International Interpreters day .............................................................. 2617
Vandalism and violence at schools in the Western Cape ....................................... 7603
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ............................................................................. 4810
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11-2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ....................................................................................... 6660
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11-2012]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ............................................. 6763
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 – Education) .................................................. 7427
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 1 – Premier ....................................................................................... 222
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 1 – Premier ....................................................................................... 1763
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ............................................................................... 5394
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 –
  (Provincial Parliament)) ....................................................................................... 5560
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 –
  Provincial Parliament) ....................................................................................... 7441

**UYS, P**
Absence of members of executive from legislature .............................................. 2926
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .................. 912
Africa Day ............................................................................................................. 2260
Appointment of Jan-Jan Joubert ............................................................................ 4175
Appointment of sanitation team to look into open toilet saga ..................................... 4351
Bitou Mayor BooySENs lived on golf estate at ratepayers’ expense ............................... 4486
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ........................................ 2571, 2597
Bitou Municipality, Service Hikes in ............................................................................. 5916
Budget for 2010/2011, Fifth Financial Year not Spent for .............................................. 4101
Cadre deployment: DA and ID ......................................................................................... 7558
City of Cape Town, Awarding of performance bonuses in .............................................. 2258
City of Cape Town, Unauthorised payments and tender processes of ............................ 656
City of Cape Town’s spending on informal settlements .................................................. 2347
Committee Meetings, Hessequa Mayoral ..................................................................... 4694
Condolences: Motion of Linkin Park Concert Death ......................................................... 6452
Congratulations: Brandt, Koos ...................................................................................... 4424
Commissioner Petros and SAPS ..................................................................................... 787
Ehrenreich, Tony ............................................................................................................. 2935
Goedeman, Delina ........................................................................................................... 6456
Huisamen, Phillip ............................................................................................................ 8219
SA Government .............................................................................................................. 2937
Corruption: DA councillors ............................................................................................. 8199
Councillors: contravention of rules .................................................................................. 8200
DA Government, Inferior service Delivery by .................................................................. 5860
DA’s disregard for minimum standards for sanitation and provision of toilets to poor .......................................................................................................................... 2518
Day of National Reconciliation ........................................................................................ 8334
Death of psychiatric patient at Karl Bremer Hospital ......................................................... 834
Deaths in informal areas in Cape Town, continuing ........................................................ 2562
Democratic Alliance: lack of transparency ...................................................................... 7560
Democratic Alliance’s silence on farm murders ................................................................. 2930
Democratic space in House ............................................................................................. 3447
Disarray in Legislature ..................................................................................................... 4005
Discrimination against female employees ....................................................................... 7773
Discussion: closing down of debate in city of Cape Town ................................................. 7879
Eden District Municipality .............................................................................................. 5914
Expenditure of City of Cape Town .................................................................................... 2407
Handling of Legislature and its Affairs ............................................................................ 3940
Hessequa By-Election ...................................................................................................... 7519
High Court Documents, Falsification of ........................................................................ 4006
Illegal dumping sites ......................................................................................................... 7518
Kannaland ......................................................................................................................... 4141
Kannaland Municipality, Refusal of Department of Local Government to support struggling .................................................................................................................... 4434
Khayelitsha denied extra policing ...................................................................................... 2929
Leave of absence ............................................................................................................... 3437
Members not dealt with even-handedly ............................................................................ 2927
Municipal rates fiasco ........................................................................................................ 2259
Ongoing onslaught of DA on constitution and disregard for rule of law .............................. 3468
Oudtshoorn Municipality .................................................................................................. 6328
Overberg Municipal Council................................................................. 2936
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government............... 2486
Problems in Bitou Municipality....................................................... 942
Politicising appointment of secretary to parliament........................... 2563
Premier:
Opening Address of........................................................................ 1543
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate).............................. 5084
SOPA (debate).................................................................................. 3318
Undermining Stellenbosch Municipality............................................. 750
Premier Helen Zille: South African Institute for Race Relations............. 8168
Presiding Officers............................................................................. 7696
Presiding Officers, interference by the Premier.................................... 7699
Programming Authority’s Role, Engagement of Political Parties in
Legislature with regard to ............................................................... 6259
Public protector investigation into code of conduct for city councillors..... 7523
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration)................................ 1625
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
(Consideration)............................................................................... 4282, 4562
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the
Proposed Constitution Eighteenth Amendment Bill
(Private Members Bill)
(Consideration)............................................................................... 8171
Report of SIU, Distribution of Interim before its Release..................... 4103
Results of Oudtshoorn by-elections.................................................... 2652
Sanitation in Khayelitsha: City of Cape Town contract......................... 7561
Secretarial Allowances, Constituency and Service Delivery Problems in DA-Run Municipalities .................................................. 3764
Speaker’s Debate:
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently .......... 2358
Statements.................. 301, 304, 529, 584, 653, 740, 780, 976, 1284, 2223, 2297
.......................................................... 2366, 2643, 2811, 2916, 3443, 3463, 3507, 3937, 4000,
.......................................................... 4096, 4690, 5264, 5833, 6255, 6255, 6363, 6448, 7553
.......................................................... 8053, 8182, 8313
Subject for discussion:.....................................................................
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011....................................... 4709
Cover-up by DA in Swellendam....................................................... 5424
Crisis in Hangberg............................................................................. 2661
Floods in Western Cape .................................................................... 4361
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River............................... 1021
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in
Western Cape................................................................................... 544
Order of the Day, Point of Order, Programming of ......................... 4269
Purpose and functioning of ward committees and
successes and failures of these committees.................................... 4460
Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster
Management..................................................................................... 8125
Suspension of public sector strike by Union ..................................... 2569
Taxpayers’ money on court cases, wasting – Motion.......................... 3510
Taxpayers’ money spent by DA bitou municipality in their failed bid to
interdict former mayor..................................................................... 4487
Unconstitutional interference in Overberg municipality ........................................ 2653
Victory for ANC in Witzenberg ................................................................. 7060
Wastage of taxpayers’ money by DA ......................................................... 2700
Western Cape, Storm damage in ............................................................... 364
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ............................................... 1247
  Consideration of Votes and Schedules ................................................... 1390
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ........................................... 4831
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ........................................... 4921
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
  of Votes and Schedule) ........................................................................ 4961, 4873
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ................................................. 6695
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle ...................................................................... 127
  Vote 8 – Local Government ................................................................... 173
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 14 – Local Government .................................................................. 1811
  Vote 8 – Housing .................................................................................. 1849
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................................... 2133
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 14 – Local Government .................................................................. 3576
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................................... 3663
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ................................................................. 5357
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 –
  Local Government) ................................................................................. 5706
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of
  Principle) .................................................................................................. 7075
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 –
  Local Government) ................................................................................ 7394
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 –
  Provincial Parliament) ............................................................................ 7447
Western Cape Local Government Laws
  Rationalisation Bill [B2B—2010]
  (Consideration and Finalisation) .............................................................. 2942
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
  [B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ........................................ 4947
West Coast Deputy Municipal Manager R1 million paid to ...................... 4350
World Aids Day ........................................................................................... 8335
16 Days of Activism: No Violence Against Women and Children ............ 7447

VAN RENSBURG, H G

Premier:
  Opening Address of ................................................................................. 1491
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................................... 5051
Subject for discussion:
  Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ...................................................... 6392
  High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ................................... 1023
Human Rights Day ............................................................................................................. 3483
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ............................................................. 703
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ............................................................................. 5161
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas ................................................................. 855
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ........................................................................................................ 1202, 1213
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................................................. 4904, 4912
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ................................................................. 5642
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................................................. 6737
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ........................................................................................................ 482,502
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ........................................................................................................ 2086, 2113
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ........................................................................................................ 3618, 3634
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle)
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................................................. 7223, 7244

VAN ZYL, J A
Closing ........................................................................................................................................ 8446
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ................................................................. 4151
Congratulations:
School buses near Botriver ................................................................................................... 2481
WP Junior Jukskei Team at SA Championships ...................................................................... 1350
Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of Department of Education – Motion ......................................................... 7984
Executive Statement ............................................................................................................. 6193
Grade 12 examinations ......................................................................................................... 8156
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
(Consideration) .................................................................................................................... 4282
........................................................................................................................................ 8168
Speaker’s Debate:
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ............................................................................. 1615
International Aids Day ......................................................................................................... 1093
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ........................................ 2357
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ........................................................................... 2441
Statements .......................................................................................................................
1033,1585,2221,2252, 2364, 2455, 2513, 2603, 2644
2808, 3340, 3758, 4312, 4428, 5894, 6311, 7036, 7550, 7924, 8049
Subject for discussion:
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ............................................................................................. 2189
Governance of Robben Island .............................................................. 2832
Lack of development for young people ............................................... 2267
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats .................................................. 6465
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ................................................... 5165
Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports .................................................. 6590
Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster Management .................................................. 8130
SA Fisheries ................................................................................................ 4021
Sixteen days of activism for no violence against women and children and international aids day .......................................................... 2999
Social challenges with which single parents in Western Cape are confronted on daily basis .............................................................. 2866
The results of the independent testing of learners in Grades 3, 6 and 9 and of the impact of that on the aims of education in the Western Cape .......................................................... 7623
Success to Grade 12 Learners with upcoming Examination ..................... 6319
Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B7B—2009] (Consideration and finalisation) .............................................................. 2756
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 6 – Health ....................................................................................... 1186
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................................ 1206
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................................... 1266
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .................... 1343
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ................................................................... 1354
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .............................................................. 4868
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ........................................................... 4906
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .............................................................. 4963
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
(Consideration of Votes and Schedules) .................................................. 8441
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................................... 1712
Vote 7 – Social Development .................................................................. 1787
Vote 6 – Health ....................................................................................... 1930
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .................... 2014
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................................ 2104
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .................... 3783
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................................. 3842
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011] – (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .............................................................. 4803
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) .............................................................. 5393
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ........................................................... 7239
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ) .............................................................. 7290
VISser, J J

Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ................................................. 911
Agricultural Industry, Game Farming declared ............................................................................. 4098
Agri World Africa Established ........................................................................................................ 5866
Aid to storm-affected people ........................................................................................................ 8011
ANC Centenary ............................................................................................................................. 4936
ANC in Municipal Election ............................................................................................................ 3952
ANC Youth League Congress, Failed – Motion ............................................................................... 4942
Arrest of councillor and closure of democratic space of councillors ................................................ 3466
Battle of Braamfontein, 14 May 2012 ............................................................................................. 5842
Behaviour of ANC in Swellendam .................................................................................................. 6569
Birthday in the House, Marais, Du Toit A ....................................................................................... 4936
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .......................................................... 2586
Bitou Municipality, Problems at .................................................................................................... 591
Cape Minstrels on Tweede Nuwe Jaar ......................................................................................... 4099
Condolence, Motion of:
Bekker, Suna ................................................................................................................................. 4141
City of Boston, U.S.A. .................................................................................................................... 7505
Daniels, Michael ............................................................................................................................ 6494
Deputy Speaker, Mother of ........................................................................................................ 786
Dryer, Charles ............................................................................................................................... 6324
Fourie, Sorette ............................................................................................................................... 2776
Hörstmann, Fritz ............................................................................................................................ 660
Jordaan, Elsa Husband of ............................................................................................................ 3473
Klaasen, Clr Kevin ........................................................................................................................ 107
Minister Madikizela’s family .......................................................................................................... 2706
Nkanisa, Mathosonke .................................................................................................................... 4113
Residents who died in fire at Rusthof .......................................................................................... 2176
USA after Superstorm Sandy ........................................................................................................ 6414
Van Niekerk, Dr Theresa ............................................................................................................. 659

Congratulations:
Agulhas, Tiffany ............................................................................................................................. 6452
Bam, Warren .................................................................................................................................... 8212
Bernstein, Ann ............................................................................................................................... 5730
Cape Town Municipality ................................................................................................................ 5270
Cillie, Rossouw ................................................................................................................................ 8202
Cloete, Andre ................................................................................................................................... 8202
Cupido, Ms, Appointment as Provincial Chairperson of ACDP .................................................... 4777
DA on victory in Worcester ........................................................................................................... 1891
DA Winning, Election in Ward 88 ................................................................................................. 6262
Department of Agriculture ............................................................................................................ 6331
Department of Local Government ................................................................................................ 7782
Drakenstein Local Municipality ................................................................................................... 5778
Drakenstein Municipality ............................................................................................................. 4179, 4355
Elsenberg Agricultural College ................................................................. 6209
Formation and functioning of municipal public accounts committees .................................................. 4486
Hon Mcebisi Skwatsha refused entry into Nomination Process ................................................ 6638
Ikeys ........................................................................................................ 3768
Jewish Community .................................................................................. 2570
Labuschagne, Ms Cathy .......................................................................... 4357
Management: Silwerkruin Home for the Elderly, Wellington ..................................................... 1040
Member of the House ............................................................................. 4555
Minister on compilation of guide ................................................................ 1645
Mokoena, Kgotsos .................................................................................... 8059
Municipalities of Drakenstein, George and Witzenberg ......................................................... 4489
Municipal Governance, status of ................................................................ 5267
Oakdale Agricultural High School .............................................................. 6205
Paarl: town of the year ........................................................................... 7881
Pienaar, Louis .......................................................................................... 6454
Philander, Tovernon ................................................................................ 6456
Prins, Henry .............................................................................................. 5912
Scholtz, Joggie ........................................................................................ 5912
Seven Team, Maties ................................................................................. 6637
Sharks ....................................................................................................... 4006
Stellenbosch Municipality ......................................................................... 5270
Stormers ................................................................................................... 3512, 4006
Vink, Nick Professor ............................................................................... 8202
Visser, Zark .............................................................................................. 8059
Watts, Andy .............................................................................................. 8018
Western Cape Municipality ........................................................................ 5270
Winners of national female farmer competition ........................................... 2461
WP Rugby team on victory over sharks ....................................................... 2656
Consolidated annual municipal performance report ........................................ 7602
Constitutional Relationship between NCOP and Provincial Legislatures ................................................. 7041
Cultivaria’s Black Tie Dinner ..................................................................... 4507
Delivery of housing, alternative technology in .............................................. 936
Farming, small-scale – economic feasibility of .............................................. 2299
Good wishes for Cape Argus Pick 'n Pay Cycle Tour .................................... 1596
Graaff Family, Homage to ....................................................................... 5868
Increased property rates ........................................................................... 1592
Integrated Human Settlement, Development of .......................................... 5838
Large-Scale Fraud among Northern Cape ANC Leadership ......................... 6571
Local Government, Financial Situation of .................................................. 5859
Mayor of Cape Town .................................................................................. 7567
MPAT results ............................................................................................ 7700
Municipal Disaster Management Plans, Investigation into ........................................ 783
Municipalities, on Blue Drop and Green Drop Status .................................... 4109
Municipalities, Who spent their MIG Funds before End of Budget Year .......................................... 4112
Overstrand Municipality ............................................................................. 4939
Premier: ..................................................................................................... 52, 1520
Opening Address of......................................................................................
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) .................. 1624, 1633
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) ........................................................................ 1113
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ................................. 796
Report of Standing Committees meeting together regarding their
Participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ................ 2736
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ......................................................................... 4286
Speaker’s Debate:
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and
choices ....................................................................................... 565
Service Delivery, Integrated ....................................................... 5836
South African Excels Abroad ...................................................... 5865
Statements ...... 12, 103, 603, 679, 739, 931, 972, 1106, 1287, 1583, 1640, 1738,
.................................................. 2116, 2223, 2291, 2368, 2397, 2457, 2471, 2642, 2695,
.................................................. 2767, 2920, 3464, 3763, 3996, 4125, 4314, 4341, 4551,
.................................................. 4592, 4771, 5265, 5833, 6198, 6314, 6398, 6448, 6565,
.................................................. 6595, 7493, 7598, 7690, 7873, 8000, 8054, 8183
Subject for discussion:
Conditions in places where poor people live ................................ 2534
Cover-up by DA in Swellendam ................................................. 5411
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ............................................ 6384
Floods in Western Cape ............................................................. 4365
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ................. 995
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape .... 548
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government .......... 2493
Problems in Bitou Municipality ................................................... 940
Purpose and functioning of ward committees and
successes and failures of these committees .......................... 4449, 4466
Removal of small business traders ............................................. 2316
Results of Census 2011 ......................................................... 6509
Support to municipalities .......................................................... 7878
Swellendam Municipality .......................................................... 6368
Technical Programmes, Structural Collapse ............................. 4698
Water, Availability and State of ............................................... 6366
Ward Committees ................................................................. 4318
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................ 1210
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................... 1236
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ................................. 1249
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 1345
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ...................................... 1390
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ................................. 4834
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) .................................. 4898
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .................................................. 4968
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ......................................................... 6697
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 8413
(Consideration of Votes and Schedules) .............................................. 8442
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing ................................................................. 152
Vote 8 – Local Government .............................................................. 172
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 203
Vote 5 – Education .............................................................. 253
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .............. 380
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................. 501
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ..................................................... 522
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 14 – Local Government ......................................................... 1809
Vote 8 – Housing ................................................................. 1839
Vote 5 – Education .............................................................. 1877
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................................ 1961
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .............. 2013
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 2043
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................. 2111
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 14 – Local Government ......................................................... 3572
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................. 3631
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .............. 3790
Vote 8 – Housing ................................................................. 3862
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
of Principle) .............................................................................. 5324
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 –
Human Settlements) ................................................................. 5600
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 –
(Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ......................... 5614
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 –
Local Government) ................................................................ 5704
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................. 7241
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 –
Local Government) ................................................................ 7392
Western Cape: best province in South Africa .................................. 7606
Western Cape Department of Social Development ......................... 4444
Western Cape Local Government Laws
Rationalisation Bill [B2B—2010]
(Consideration and Finalisation) ...................................................... 2943
Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
[B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) ........................................ 3983
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
[B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ............................... 4949
VON BRANDIS, E J
Afrikaans writers receive Honorary Award ................................................................. 6210
Ambassador, Singer/Actress Cape Town Routes ..................................................... 5157
Arthur Brown, J: suspended sentence ................................................................ 7607
Cableway, Table Mountain Aerial ........................................................................ 4148
Cape Town: 3rd place - Lonely Planet Survey ...................................................... 8219
Cape Town as second best destination in Africa and Middle East ......................... 2372
Cape Town Favourite Tourist City ......................................................................... 6500
Cape Town International Convention Centre Company Amendment Bill
[B 10B - 2012] (Finalisation) .................................................................................. 7096
Cape Town Partnership, Prof Ndebele Appointed as Chairperson of .................. 5913
Cape Town Tourism Board, New Chair of ............................................................. 6411
Car Magazine Award for Safely Home Programme ............................................. 1596
Communities, Impact of “Ale” ................................................................................ 5148
Condolence, Motion of:
Hex River Pass Bus Accident ................................................................................. 7048
Lott, Deon ............................................................................................................... 7508
Madinga, Lulama ..................................................................................................... 1037
Nel, F B B, Van Lili, M M E and Eloff, J M, Cycle accident victims ................. 1594
Ntozini, Nobantu “Vicky” ...................................................................................... 6634
Roux, Koos ............................................................................................................. 7614
Congratulations:
Annual Travel and Leisure Smitty Award .............................................................. 7665
Appointment of CEO to Cape Town Tourism ....................................................... 7663
Arabella Hotel and Spa .......................................................................................... 6332
Bengu, Knowledge .................................................................................................. 7514
BPESA ..................................................................................................................... 6415
Burger, Jacques ....................................................................................................... 7776
Caledon .................................................................................................................... 4323
City of Cape Town .................................................................................................. 4008
City of Cape Town .................................................................................................. 7512
Cape Town International Airport ......................................................................... 7054
Cape Town on becoming World Design Capital ................................................. 4505
Cape Town receives lonely planet rating .............................................................. 3452
Cape Town Top Destination in Africa .................................................................. 7669
Cape Town Tourism ............................................................................................... 5841
City of Cape Town, Tourism and Provincial Counterparts ................................. 6334
Coetzee, Theuns .................................................................................................... 3767
Court Application, Backyard Dwellers Lodge ..................................................... 6410
Department of Economic Development and Tourism ......................................... 6330
Department of Transport and Public Works ....................................................... 6330
De Rust .................................................................................................................... 4177
Dorp Street, Walk-in Centre ................................................................................... 6460
Duk, William .......................................................................................................... 6208
Durban Tourism ....................................................................................................... 5841
Economic and environmental developments, importance of ......................... 2369
Entrepreneurial Leader of the Year Award ......................................................... 6502
Fancourt .................................................................................................................... 6325
Fatal taxi accident on Constantia Main Road ...................................................... 2303
Fire, Seven Die in .................................................................................................... 4604
Fleur du Cape Theatre Awards .......................................................... 7058
Forbes Best Young Entrepreneurs .................................................. 7703
Forbes Top African Youth Entrepreneurs ....................................... 7667
Fourie, Johan .................................................................................. 7936
Free trade ports, Establishment of................................................. 2256
Fyfer, Boy ..................................................................................... 6263
Gooch, Jacqui ................................................................................ 7936
Gouws, Hanlie ................................................................................ 7514
Grapow, Okke ................................................................................ 7514
Gratitude and appreciation to committee coordinators ................ 2521
Green economy as an economic sector, role of ......................... 7500
Green Initiative, Advantage of ...................................................... 5902
Hanekom, Mr A, on election ............................................................ 1892
House, Business of ....................................................................... 6684
I-keys ............................................................................................... 3768
I-WEC .............................................................................................. 4780
Johannesburg Tourism ................................................................. 5841
Junior Rugby Championship, International under 20 ............ 5910
KaapRapport and Van Loveren Town of the Year Competition .... 659
Kirsten, Gary ................................................................................. 3951
Lilizela Tourism awards ............................................................... 8019
Minister Alan Winde: saving of drowning woman ..................... 2352
Minister of Economic Development .............................................. 4179
Solomon, Kenny ............................................................................ 6203
Stellenbosch Wine Route ............................................................. 8064
Swart, Anke ................................................................................... 7776
The Test Kitchen: best restaurant ............................................... 8211
Theewaterskloof Municipality ...................................................... 2777
Travel & Leisure: World’s 30 Best Hotels ................................... 7668
Drunk Drivers: name and shame ................................................. 7705
Entrepreneurship: red tape ......................................................... 8058
Health Services Eastern Cape: impact on provincial budgets .... 8058
Infrastructure development and investment ............................. 7767
Management Performance Assessment Tool Report: success ..... 8056
Premier:
   Opening Address of .................................................................. 1512
Provincial Development Council, Closing down of ..................... 2225
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4—2010]
   (NCOP) (Consideration) .............................................................. 1635, 1735
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy
   Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and
   Outlook (Consideration) ............................................................. 1109
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and
   former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament
   (Consideration) ........................................................................ 1273, 1278
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints lodged against current and
   former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament .......... 1011
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
   NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ....................................... 801
Report of Standing Committees meeting together regarding their
   Participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .......... 2747
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ........................................................................................................ 4294
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic
Development ......................................................... on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill
[B38 – 2013] (NCOP)
(Consideration) ........................................................................................................ 8253
Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic
Development on the Tourism Bill [B 44D–2012]
(NCOP) (Consideration) ................................................................................................. 7858
Roadblocks over weekend .......................................................................................... 2567
Saldanha Industrial development Region ................................................................. 5903
Seven Wonders of Nature, Table Mountain voted as one of ......................... 4696
Speaker’s Debate:
Economic Freedom of the Youth .................................................................................. 3969
Statements.................................................................................................................. 13, 300, 530, 584, 601, 781, 924, 977, 1005, 1032, 1103, ...
................................................................................................................................. 1292, 1586, 2119, 2173, 2219, 2255, 2298, 2342, 2400, ...
................................................................................................................................. 2475, 2517, 2555, 2610, 2810, 2917, 3463, 3999, ...
................................................................................................................................. 4129, 4316, 4498, 4589, 4766, 5261, 5720, 5773, ...
................................................................................................................................. 5850, 6194, 6311, 6401, 6491, 6625, 7491, 7599, 7691, 7874, 8001
Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape ............................................................................. 6340
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ...................................... 990
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
prevent recession ........................................................................................................... 696
Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape ....................... 7894
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on .................................................................... 5166
Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports ................................................................. 6588
Removal of small business traders ........................................................................ 2309
Results of Census 2011 ............................................................................................. 6513
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .......................................................... 2236
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote
rural areas ...................................................................................................................... 851
The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the
Western Cape ............................................................................................................... 7525
The problem of unemployment, especially among the young people
of our Province and country ...................................................................................... 7708
The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape’s pro-poor
programmes and proposals that it will be benefitting the
people of the Western Cape ...................................................................................... 7946
Success of Safely Home Project ............................................................................ 2700
Taxi Industry, Two-Year Peach in – Motion ......................................................... 5153
Ten Best Restaurants in South Africa ...................................................................... 6635
Theewaterskloof: wind energy plant – Motion ...................................................... 7569
Tourism and Rector of UWC ................................................................................... 4179
Tragic and fatal hit-and-run accident in Tafelsig .................................................... 3471
Unemployment amongst the youth ......................................................................... 7557
Wesgro : Nisreen Bulbilla ......................................................................................... 7605
Western Cape Liquor Authority ............................................................................... 5273
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B4-2012] (2011/2012 Financial Year) (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 5275

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................................... 1307
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................................ 1320
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................................................... 1352

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ........................................ 4820

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .......................................................... 4879

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ....................... 4885

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ............................................................................ 4971

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) ........................................ 6690

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ........................................ 6765

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................................................ 8385

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................................................. 116
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................................. 337
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .............................................................. 402
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................................................... 426

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading .................................................................................................. 1653
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................................................... 1899
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................................. 1952
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .............................................................. 2065
Consideration of Votes and Schedules .............................................................. 2159

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Consideration of principle .................................................................................. 3525
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................................................... 3556

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................................. 3730
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .............................................................. 3896

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) .................................................................................................................. 5314

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .............................................................................................. 5636

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .............................................................. 5677

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) .................................................................................................................. 7063

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .............................................................................................. 7131

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .............................................................. 7149
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ) .......................... 7261
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development
Planning ) .................................................................................................. 7285
Western Cape Eighteenth Gambling and Racing
Amendment Bill [B 4 – 2013] (Consideration).................................... 7863
Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency
Amendment Bill [B 1 – 2013] (Finalisation) ........................................... 7858
Western Cape Membership of the Western Cape Economic
Development Partnership Bill [B8 – 2013]
(Consideration and Finalisation).............................................................. 8442
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) ............................................................. 6676
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment
Bill [B6—2009] Consideration of principle ............................................. 1081
Western Cape Seventeenth Gambling and Racing
Amendment Bill [B 3 – 2013] ................................................................ 7860
Western Cape Transport Infrastructure Bill [B9 - 2012] (Finalisation) .... 7095
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 5737
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B7 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 8246
2012 Emerging Tourism Entrepreneur Winner – Motion ....................... 5903

WALTERS, M C
Agri-Mega Group flower exhibition – Motion .................................... 8016
Astronomy Society, Hermanus .............................................................. 4149
Beaufort West and Ceres farm murders ............................................ 1293
Condolence, Motion of:
Beyleveldt, Theo .................................................................................. 4107
Brady, Nazario .................................................................................... 694
Ellis Rudi ............................................................................................ 4352
Jacobs, Harold .................................................................................. 3515
Joubert, Neil ....................................................................................... 8014
Kotzé, Pen ......................................................................................... 2408
Marais, Allister ................................................................................... 6207
Schlemmer, Prof Lawrence ............................................................... 4559

Congratulations:
Agricultural Dictionary ....................................................................... 5156
Botes, Elmarie .................................................................................... 8218
City of Cape Town officials ............................................................... 4782
Corruption in municipalities .............................................................. 2928
Department of Agriculture ............................................................... 756
Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs
And Development Planning ................................................................. 6330
Eden, Abraham .................................................................................. 6328
Eskom’s tariff increases ..................................................................... 1642
Farm Worker Forum .......................................................................... 2230
Farm Workers of the Year Competition ............................................ 6497
Farrant, Prof Jill ................................................................................ 4607
Fisher, Mr Adam ........................................................................................................363
Fishing Communities, Traditional ........................................................................5268
Guthrie, Mark ...........................................................................................................6457
Hattingh, Adele ........................................................................................................2523
Heineken Cape to Rio 2011 ...................................................................................3518
Key Figures in Western Cape Agriculture .................................................................2780
Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens .............................................................................5862
Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens .............................................................................7777
Kulsen, Heinrich .......................................................................................................8218
La Motte Wine Estate .............................................................................................4779
Mckenna, Sageas .....................................................................................................4423
Meyer, Heyneke – Springbok Rugby Team ...............................................................7939
Minister of Agriculture .........................................................................................2856, 7052, 8204
Minister van Rensburg, Department on Publication of ........................................104,108
Muggels, Mr Hendrik ..............................................................................................4355
M5 Developments Cape and Overstrand Municipality .........................................988
Ostrich Industry .......................................................................................................939
Overstrand Municipality ...............................................................................2856, 7052, 8204
Premier .................................................................................................................2856
Premier .................................................................................................................2856
Somers, Christo .......................................................................................................2818
Sunflower Fund Ladies .........................................................................................2466
Van Zyl, Mr Henk ..................................................................................................4438
Western Cape Officials .........................................................................................4782
Western Cape Women Farmers of the Year .........................................................659
Winners’ who are part of Western Cape fruit Industry ...........................................2617
Department of Agriculture: Improvement in performance .....................................8158
Hermanus: Space Weather Monitoring system ......................................................8162
Impact of civil servant strike on service delivery and economic development in Western Cape .................................................................2478
Importance of conservation of biodiversity resources .........................................2698
Invasive alien species .........................................................................................4503
Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens Centennial ..........................................................7662
Mr Nelson Mandela ...............................................................................................7701
Overstrand municipality: top local authority ......................................................7569
Overstrand Municipality: 2009 Cleanest Town Competition ..................................1109
Pollution of Eerste River ......................................................................................935
Pollution of water resources, Control of ..............................................................2227
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .................................................................790
Report of Standing Committees meeting together regarding their Participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ...................................................2740
Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Proposed Constitution Eighteenth Amendment Bill (Private Members Bill) (Consideration) .......................................................................................8172
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) ..................4301
Research Support Service, Technical and .............................................................4317
Rural Development: Optimisation ........................................................................538
Service Delivery, Death of Babies due to Lack of ..................................................5149
Service Delivery, Project Reclaim Disruption of ..................................................5300
Skwatsha, Mcebisi Property Deal Allegedly involving ........................................6379
Statements.................................. 305, 582, 599, 648, 828, 1587,1638,1742,2167, 2366, 2512
..............................................2250, 2603, 2648, 2692, 2852, 2921, 3439, 3505, 3760, 3936,
.............................................. 4133, 4310, 4405, 4427, 4481, 4550, 4590, 5262, 5722, 5835
..............................................7495, 7596, 7656, 7876, 7920, 8152, 8318

Subject for discussion:
  Equity Share Land Reform Schemes .......................................................... 6379
  Floods in Western Cape ............................................................................. 4358
  Governance of Robben Island .................................................................. 2837
  Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape............................ 997
  Heritage Day .............................................................................................. 820
  High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ...................................... 1012
  Housing development in Delft .................................................................. 1058
  Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ...................................................... 5161, 5173
  Purpose and functioning of ward committees and successes and failures of
these committees ..................................................................................... 4456
  Readiness of the Western Cape in Respect of Disaster
    Management ............................................................................................. 8126
  Removal of small business traders ........................................................... 2313
  SA Fisheries ............................................................................................... 4014
  Support to WP in Currie Cup final ............................................................. 2783
  Threat of invasive alien species ............................................................... 3469
  Wellington, accident near ......................................................................... 4418

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture .............................................................................. 1204
  Vote 5 – Education ................................................................................... 1222
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................................ 1232
  Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ................................................. 1251
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ...................................................................... 1268
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .................. 1336

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development
Planning) ................................................................................................. 4871

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................................. 4909

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development
Planning) ................................................................................................. 6699

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................................. 6738

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
  (Consideration of Principle) ..................................................................... 8402

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 8 – Housing ..................................................................................... 158
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................................... 201
  Vote 5 – Education .................................................................................. 257
  Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................................... 323
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .................. 373
  Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................................... 462
  Vote 11 – Agriculture .............................................................................. 488
## Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]

- Vote 4 – Community Safety .......................................................... 1710
- Vote 14 – Local Government ...................................................... 1820
- Vote 8 – Housing ........................................................................... 1851
- Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................... 1874
- Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............ 2007
- Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 2049
- Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 2095
- Consideration of Votes and Schedules ......................................... 2158

## Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]

- Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ......................................................... 3558
- Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 3603
- Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 3625
- Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................ 3741
- Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........... 3781
- Vote 8 – Housing ........................................................................... 3872

## Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ......................................................... 5452

## Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ......................................................... 5695

## Western Cape Agriculture Awards ................................................... 5158

## Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ........................................ 7155

## Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................................ 7231

## Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ........................................ 7291

## Western Capeland Land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment

Bill [B4-2011] .................................................................................. 3991, 3992

## Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill

[B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) ........................................ 3983

## Western Cape Model of Land Reform ............................................ 2403

## Western Cape Fruit Producers: crop damage .................................. 8328

## Wilberforce, William and the Abolition of Slavery ........................ 4775

## Witzenberg youth: Parliamentary visit ........................................... 8220

### WILEY, M G E

- Clipper Around the World Yacht Race .......................................... 8163
- Condolence, Motion of:
  - Banda, Const. Xolisa ................................................................. 5151
  - Banisi, Phumzile ................................................................. 7661
  - Conduct towards women MPPS ............................................... 607
  - Cyclist killed on Main Road St James ...................................... 6371
  - Depha, Lungisa ........................................................................ 7879
  - Du Toit, Jan ............................................................................. 2856
  - Families in Western Cape and Elsewhere ................................. 6264
  - Hoop, Jeremy ......................................................................... 8010
  - Hoorn, Cedrico ................................................................. 7563
  - Hout Bay Boat Tragedy ........................................................... 6320
  - Jacobs, Francois ..................................................................... 7051
Jacobs, Mr M ................................................................. 837
Joubert, Mortima ........................................................... 7563
Komphela, SGT Thumelephi ........................................... 4937
Makhwelo, Anele .......................................................... 4488
Marks, Mr Joe .............................................................. 4695
Mdlalo, Bafundi ............................................................. 7879
Moses, Warrent Officer Douglas ....................................... 6368
Portland, Monique ......................................................... 8010
Searll, Aaron and Snyman, Lannice ................................. 2231
Slain Police officer and Injured Policeman ......................... 6319
Snyman, Charles .......................................................... 7563
Solomons, Keelan ........................................................ 7563
Stewart, Gary .................................................................. 6326
Thethani, Dumile ............................................................ 7775
Tobias, Dr Phillip ........................................................... 5909
Tyibilika, Solly ............................................................... 4698
Van Heerden, Tim ......................................................... 4326
Woodburn, Lambert ....................................................... 7780
Yengo, Landle Samuel .................................................. 7879

Congratulations:
ABSA Cape Epic Mountain Cycle Race ................................ 8332
Barkai, Ram........................................................................ 8020
Biermann, Hugo ............................................................ 5731
Chin, Andrew ................................................................ 8020
Chrysalis Academy, CEO and Staff of ............................. 4938
Cole, Peter ..................................................................... 7890
Crime prevention initiatives ............................................ 3467
DA .................................................................................. 4941
Eray, Michele ................................................................ 7788
Executive statement: De Doorns ......................................... 2337
February, Michael .......................................................... 7612
Fire-Fighters .................................................................. 3765
Fish Hoek Lifesaving Club ................................................. 3948
Flanagan, Kirsten ............................................................ 7788
Gangs, in Western Cape ................................................ 4316
Gold Medal for Surf Life Saving ........................................ 541
Groenewald, Martin ......................................................... 8066
Halkett, Rhett ................................................................ 7060
Hoffman, Tanika ............................................................. 7612
Joubert, Shaun ................................................................ 7612
Kotze, S P I ..................................................................... 8065
Manser, Riaan ................................................................ 3516
Marais, Schean ............................................................... 7889
Masiphumelele Young Stars Soccer Team ......................... 5781
Mocke, Mr Dawid ........................................................... 1293, 4181
Mosiela High School ....................................................... 789
National Women’s Hockey Squad ...................................... 5159
Ntetha, C: Constable ....................................................... 8062
Organisers and Participants in Cape Epic mountain bike race 7059
Orlando Pirates ............................................................... 3949
Paulse, Ethan ................................................................. 8066
Peace and reconciliation to people of LIBYA ......................... 4493
Police Officers killed and wounded in Philippi .................. 8155
Price, Kevin ...................................................................... 4142
Rescue team from SA ....................................................... 3470
Rice, Kenny ...................................................................... 7788
Rice, Sean ........................................................................ 7788
SAPS .................................................................................. 2855
Scholtz, Jeanne-Mari ......................................................... 7786
Skinstad, Dan ..................................................................... 3516
Softball Federation, Western Cape .................................... 4942
South African Police Service ............................................. 2350
Stamrood, Ryan .................................................................. 8020
Van Gyssen Eloise ............................................................. 3948
Viviers, Toks ...................................................................... 8020
World War II Veteran ....................................................... 5155
Crime investigation: three spheres of government .......... 7877
Crime prevention initiatives ............................................. 3467
Democratic Alliance: Best performing management practices 8060
Department of Community Safety and all Officials ........ 6333
Department of Community Safety: Batho Pele Service Award ... 8331
Deputy Minister of international relations and cooperation: renaming 7940
Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of 7976

Department of Education – Motion .................................. 7976
Education Centre .............................................................. 6266
Executive statement: De Doorns ....................................... 2337
Exonerated, Professor Karabus ......................................... 7055
Fatal Shootings in Hanover Park and Ottery ..................... 6406
Farm Attacks, Solly Tyibilika Killing ................................. 4692
Fish Hoek, shark attack at ............................................... 4441
Impact of gang violence ................................................... 2699
IG Monitor Report ............................................................ 5914
Increase in Rats .................................................................. 5908
Israeli Team: Peres Peace Centre Sport Program ............... 8160
Junior Golfer Luca Fillipi .................................................. 6637
Kasparov, Garry Grandmaster ........................................... 5302
Khayelitsha, Vigilantism ..................................................... 5726
Kwahattu Culture ............................................................. 6266
Management of Fisheries and Small Boat Harbours ........ 3940
McBride, Robert: appointment – IPID .............................. 8201
Molo Songololo ................................................................. 4491
Police oversight: role and scope ....................................... 8057

Premier:

Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ...... 5241
Opening Address of ........................................................... 1539
SOPA (debate) .................................................................. 3349
Public Property, Civil unrest and damage to ....................... 5266
Rail Commuter Action Group: Mr Leslie Van Minnen .......... 144
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development

Report of Standing Committee on Education, Cultural Affairs and Sport on visit to Uitzig Secondary School (Consideration) ........................................ 1012
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Committees Week (Consideration) ........................................ 759,805
Report of Standing Committees meeting together regarding their Participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ..................... 2743
Report on Investigation into Conversion of Toyota Quantum Panel Vans into Taxi ..................................................................................... 3616
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) ......................................................................................... 4286
Role of seat of national Parliament in nation-building .................. 932
SA Junior Bodyboarding Champion .............................................. 6498
SAPS: centenary anniversary ...................................................... 8300
South African Police Service: state of resourcing ....................... 7554
Speaker's Debate:
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ............. 6281
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking .................................... 1613
International Aids Day ............................................................... 1094
Statements .......................................................... 9, 98,532,650,745,827,975,1004,1289,2169, 2296, 2338
.......................................................... 2363, 2454, 2558, 2607, 2696, 2764, 2807, 2850, 3442,
.......................................................... 3508, 4096, 4167, 4346, 4431, 4499, 4586, 5143, 5297,
.......................................................... 5775, 5829, 5855, 5899, 6200, 6254, 6358, 6485, 6624
.......................................................... 7038, 7548, 7766, 7931, 8052, 8149, 8321
Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape ................................................. 6347
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ....................... 2383
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ................................................. 4202
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
Delivery ................................................................. 4616
Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape ................. 6212
Governance of Robben Island .................................................. 2833
Heritage Day ........................................................................... 812
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .............. 670
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ....................... 6425
Policing in Mitchells Plain ....................................................... 882
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ......................... 2241
SA Fisheries ........................................................................... 4014
Statements made by Premier ................................................. 626
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in .................. 4563
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in ....................................... 2420
Taxi Strike ............................................................................ 1744
Thanks to SAPS, Metro Police, Premier and Mr J P Smith ....... 938
Van Dyk, Ernst: tribute ......................................................... 7510
Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B7B—2009]
(Consideration and finalisation) .............................................. 2758
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 6 – Health................................................................. 1187
  Vote 11 – Agriculture..................................................... 1211
  Vote 5 – Education ....................................................... 1224
  Vote 4 – Community Safety............................................. 1258
  Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................... 1301
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...... 1341
  Consideration of Votes and Schedule.................................. 1389

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ............................. 4841

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ........................................ 4963

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ............................. 6704

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) .................. 6761

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................. 8390

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle .............................................. 125
  Vote 5 – Education ....................................................... 258
  Vote 6 – Health ........................................................... 287
  Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................... 321
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...... 384
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ........................................... 454
  Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................. 496

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 4 – Community Safety............................................. 1705
  Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................... 1789
  Vote 6 – Health ........................................................... 1927
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...... 2017
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................ 2050
  Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................. 2106

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Consideration of principle .............................................. 3537
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ........................................... 3712
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................ 3600

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ....................................... 5396

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) .......................................................... 7075

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) .................. 7208

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013 ] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ....................................................... 7346

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 – Education) .......................................................... 7431

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) .................. 7468

Western Cape, successes of DA in ...................................... 4484

WP Rugby Team winning Curry Cup ...................................... 6408

2012 Olympic Squad, Western Cape Members of ........................ 5907
WINDE, A R

Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .............................. 2573, 2593
Cape Town International Convention Centre Company Amendment Bill [B 10B - 2012] (Finalisation) ................................. 7096, 7098

Condolence, Motion of:
Asmal, Kader ................................................................. 3977
Financial Governance Review and Outlook, 2009 – Tabling .............................. 1599
House, Business of .......................................................... 6684

Premier:
Opening Address of ................................................................ 1546
SOPA (debate) ........................................................................ 3378

Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
(Consideration and finalisation) .................................................. 4794
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (PERO) – (Tabling) .................... 6269
Provincial economic review and outlook ........................................... 4444, 8117
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook – Tabling and consideration ................................................................. 1042

Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) ....................................................................... 1120

Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
on Social assistance Amendment bill [B5B—2010]
(Consideration) ..................................................................... 2503

Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic
development on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill
[B38 – 2013] (NCOP)
(Consideration) ........................................................................ 8255

Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ........................................................................ 4308

Statements ................................................................................. 6610

Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ........................................ 4721
Challenges facing Western Cape Youth: DA failure to address .......... 7795
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
prevent recession ..................................................................... 710
Infrastructure investment and development in the Western Cape ....... 7913
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
against Implementation of ....................................................... 5928
Outcomes of 2009-10 annual reports ........................................... 2959
Problems in Bitou Municipality .................................................. 945
Socio-economic state since the DA has been in power .................. 8240
The desirability and impact/implications of toll roads in the
Western Cape ............................................................................ 7534
The problem of unemployment, especially among the young people
of our Province and country ..................................................... 7717

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4 -2012] (2011/12 Financial Year) (Introduction and
First Reading) ......................................................................... 5160

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation
Bill [B4- 2012] (2011/2012 Financial Year)
(Consideration of Principle) ..................................................... 5274
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B5 - 2013]
(Introduction and First Reading) ................................................. 7164
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B5 - 2013]
(Consideration of principle) ...................................................... 7461
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Introduction and First Reading ................................................ 1070
Consideration of principle ....................................................... 1146, 1176
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .......................... 1305, 1313
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .................................................... 1350, 1357
Finalisation ............................................................................ 1391
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B9—2010]
(Introduction and First Reading) ................................................ 2970
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ................................. 4875
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .... 4881
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11-2012]
(Introduction and First Reading) ................................................ 6579
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ....................................................... 6639
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on
Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) .............................. 6686
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013]
(Introduction and First Reading) ................................................ 8301
(Consideration of Principle) ...................................................... 8384
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle ....................................................... 112,139
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ....................... 329,352
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .................................................... 422,432
Finalisation ............................................................................ 526
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Introduction and First Reading ................................................ 1571
Second Reading ................................................................... 1648, 1681
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .................................................... 1895, 1906
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ....................... 1944, 1962
Finalisation ............................................................................ 2159
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
(Introduction and First Reading) ................................................ 3416
Consideration of principle ....................................................... 3546
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .................................................... 3553, 3561
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Principle) ........................................................................... 4786
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ........................ 3730, 3747
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Introduction and First Reading) ................................................ 4671
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2012] (Introduction and
First Reading) ........................................................................ 5118
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
of Principle) ........................................................................... 5303, 5329
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .................................................. 5630
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .................................................. 5637
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ....................... 5666
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Introduction and First Reading) .......................................................... 7000
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .................................................. 7128, 7138
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ....................... 7143, 7157
Western Cape Eighteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B4 – 2013] (Introduction and First Reading) ....................... 7015
Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency Amendment Bill [B 1 – 2013] (Finalisation) ................................. 7858
Western Cape Membership of the Western Cape Economic Development Partnership Bill [B8 – 2013] (Consideration and Finalisation) .................................................. 8442
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6 – 2009]
Introduction and First Reading .............................................. 1041
Consideration of principle .................................................... 1081
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2009]
Introduction and First Reading .............................................. 2467
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]
Consideration ................................................................. 2502
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]
Finalisation .................................................................... 2503
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2-2012]
(Introduction and First Reading) ............................................ 5337
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................... 5736
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B7 – 2013]
(Introduction and First Reading) ............................................ 7996
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B7 – 2013]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................... 8248

WITBOOI, J

Annual National Assessment Papers ........................................ 6263
Athlone Stadium ................................................................ 4502
Celebration of Diwali – Festival of Lights ............................. 6369
Chestnut Clinic in Belhar, situation at ..................................... 981
City of Cape Town: Health Plan on HIV and TB ...................... 933
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ......................................................... 4151
Closure of 27 Black Schools, Interfaith Service against .......... 6268
Condolence, Motion of:
Beukes, Annamarie .......................................................... 7609
Daniels, Wendel ............................................................... 7884
Dely, Frans ..................................................................... 4324
D'Oliveira, Basil
Endly, Paul Macassar Veterans
Madigage, Thomas
Rhoda, Monroe
Rooi, Katriene Kassie
Sefularo, Dr
Slade, Deon
Scott, Christina
Stemmet, Adnaan
Tandy, Hendry Macassar Veterans
Witbooi, Melvin

Congratulations:
Agenton, Dr Kelly of UCT
Blom, John
Burger, Schalk
Deepavali
Emergency Services Staff
Fugard, Athol
Gym and Sports Equipment handed over
Mentoor, Farwa
President Jacob Zuma on taking Aids test
Students and Institutions
UWC Scientists
Van der Merwe, DR Elbie
Wimble, Dr Keith

DA Political Appointments
Deliberate funding cuts in Department of Social Development
Draft Resolution: in terms of rule 144 – Ongoing achievement of
    Department of Education – Motion
Environmental and Health Issues
Flooding in the Western Cape
Future of Somerset Hospital
H1N1 Virus, Number of deaths as a result of
Health Rights and responsibilities, Review of
High Levels of Learners not Reaching Matric
Huguenot Primary School Mitchells Plain, Opening of
Infant deaths in Khayelitsha
Inferior service delivery to poor people
International Nurses Day
Langa Museum
Mandela, Nelson Foundation
Manipulation by EMS Staff of Triage System
Measles outbreak in province
MEC Donald Grant: waste of taxpayers' money
MEC Meyer, Ivan
Memory Centre Project: Ray Alexander Simons
Nondzame Primary School at Pniel, installation of toilets at
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape
Organ Donor Month as August
Provincial Hospitals, Lack of Security at
Racist manager, Sacking of

(cv)

4699
5156
6372
7609
5301
2178
2783
4560
2570
5156
4607
2657
2816
4610
4505
1128
4422
7667
4182
2176
2782
3474
4009
3517
361
2772
7985
1744
7937
2173
784
655
6257
6378
3447
2923
2229
4436
5729
2405
2122
8007
7892
7615
4433
6423
4102
4701
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ................................................................. 4303
Safety of personnel at hospitals ............................................. 2257
Shortage of Drug and Alcohol Rehabilitation Centres .................. 3616
Shortage of flu vaccines .......................................................... 2176
Smile Foundation, Salutation to ................................................. 3769
Speaker's Debate:
  Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .......... 6284
  Heritage: The legacy of N R Mandela post 1994 ................. 4386
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ............................ 1616
  International Aids Day ..................................................... 1089
  Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women .................. 2437
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and
choices ........................................................................... 573
Sporting facilities in poor areas: failure by government ............. 8057
Statements .............................................................. 99, 534,776, 899, 1031,1102,1588,1640, 3505, 7599
Subject for discussion:
  Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ......................... 4728
  Conditions in places where poor people live ...................... 2532
  Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
    Delivery ................................................................. 4625
  Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .. 5255
  Heritage Day ................................................................. 815
  Human Rights Day .......................................................... 3478
  Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ............ 666
  Lack of development for young people .............................. 2272
  SA Fisheries .................................................................. 4024
Sixteen days of activism for no violence against women and children and international aids day .................................. 3002
  The results of the independent testing of learners in Grades 3, 6
  and 9 and of the impact of that on the aims of education in the
  Western Cape ................................................................. 7624
Surprise visit by President Zuma ............................................ 2569
Swine Flu, Preparations for outbreak of ................................. 591
Transport, learner school ...................................................... 4435
Uncertainty with and possible absence of asset registers in
department of health ......................................................... 3466
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................. 1183
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) .................... 4914
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ...................................................... 4973
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ...................... 6715
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................. 280
  Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................. 324
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................. 1788
  Vote 5 – Education ......................................................... 1876
Vote 6 – Health................................................................................................................1925
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 6 – Health................................................................................................................3693
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13
- Cultural Affairs and Sport) .......................................................................................... 5510
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ....................................................... 7212
Western Cape Ambulance Services Bill [B7B—2009]
(Consideration and finalisation) .............................................................................. 2755
Western Cape District Health Councils Bill [B6B—2010]
(Consideration and Finalisation) ............................................................................. 2945

ZILLE, H [PREMIER with effect from 06/05/2009]
Ad Hoc Committee .................................................................................................... 2860
ANCYL calls for service delivery protests ............................................................... 2861
Birthday wishes to Ms C F Beerwinkel ..................................................................... 1598
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU                             against Implementation of ................................................................. 5928
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
(Consideration and finalisation) ................................................................................ 4784, 4790
Speaker's Debate:
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ................................................................ 2447
Women Redefining Leadership ................................................................................ 4085
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children .................................................................................. 4761
Subject for discussion:
Crisis in Hangberg ...................................................................................................... 2681
Freedom Day: 16 Years later .................................................................................... 2180
Lack of development for young people ................................................................. 2274
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
against Implementation of ........................................................................................ 5928
Report of the Commission for Employment Equity on the
Western Cape and the fact that our province still remains
resistant to change...................................................................................................... 7586
Social challenges with which single parents in Western Cape are
confronted on daily basis ......................................................................................... 2871
Statements made by Premier .................................................................................. 639
Undermining of Women in the Western Cape ...................................................... 8084
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in ......................................................................... 2426
Premier:
Opening Address of ................................................................................................. 22, 72, 1445, 1551
Executive Statement ................................................................................................. 2393
Premier's Calling, Labelling People from Eastern Cape Refugees –
Motion ......................................................................................................................... 5300
Premier’s State of the Province Address ................................................................. 4997, 6876
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................................................. 5018, 6897
Premier’s State of the Province Address
(Debate resumed) .................................................................................................... 5095, 6958, 6995
SOPA ......................................................................................................................... 3300
SOPA (Debate resumed) .......................................................................................... 3384
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Consideration of principle ................................................................. 1148
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................. 1358, 1368
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
  (Finalisation) .................................................................................. 4975
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ......................................................... 6727
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................. 211,230
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading ............................................................................ 1660
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................. 1746, 1765
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................. 3797, 3817
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011] – (Debate on
  Vote 1 – Premier) ........................................................................... 4797
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill 3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ......................................................... 5339
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ......................................................... 7101, 7122
The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 8257

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

†Mr A M FIGLAN (DA): Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Re-blocking has been successfully employed in the Mtshini Wam settlement, and other communities throughout the Western Cape should follow the example set by the City of Cape Town’s informal settlement and pro-actively participate in the re-blocking of areas to ensure disaster-free living conditions for all.

*“my Machine” that you do not know of is at Mfuleni ... [Laughter.]

†I am sure ... I think they are going to change it to the President’s name. The re-blocking of informal settlement is an important and urgent reorganisational measure to decrease the negative impact brought about by overly dense areas.
It must be ensured that re-blocking is not used as a political ploy to destabilise communities, but rather used to strengthen them through constructive restructuring.

Communities must re-align themselves in order to make use of the financial assistance and project structures established to facilitate the constructive relocation of communities and where individuals have to be relocated that it is done in the least disruptive manner. It is important that an informal settlement community is able to utilise service deliveries offered to them and make it easier for the City to perform regular service delivery tasks which are essential for healthy, organised living conditions.

The fact that the houses would be further apart would stem the spread of communicable diseases like measles, easy accessibility for an ambulance to reach a patient as soon as possible, minimise human suffering and save lives. It is imperative that fire engines timeously contain potential devastating fires. The regular removal of waste material and the services of water, sewerage linkages make for healthier everyday living.

Most important is the bigger open spaces re-blocking would allow where children can play under the watchful eye of a caregiver. Mr Speaker, the re-blocking ...

†The SPEAKER: Order!

†Mr A M FIGLAN: ... of informal settlements is strategically focused to make the City of Cape Town an open opportunity city ...

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Figlan, your time has expired. Thank you very much.

†Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

†The SPEAKER: ANC over to you.

†Mr P UYS (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, is there a captain steering the DA machine?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes.

†Mr P UYS: Over the past weeks we saw the real DA unmasked due to the erratic outbursts, inconsistency and the psychopathic DA left without policy or principle. [Interjections.] The turncoat DA cannot decide on whether it supports the realities of this country or not.

It somersaulted on employment equity after it voted in support of an amendment bill. After this controversial flip-flop the DA caucus was shouted at, threatened and shifted around. The same schizophrenic DA ...

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members!
Mr P UYS: ... under the same leadership in the Western Cape provincial legislature in the last sitting supported an amendment bill to Black Economic Empowerment yet it voted against the very same bill in the National Assembly on Tuesday. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Uh uh, not true! [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Can the real DA please rise, and that is true. The directionless DA is like a beached whale that goes from bad to worse. The few survivors after the DA plane crash are now shipwrecked and on the rocks. [Interjections.] The split personality ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, the split personality DA is in shameful disarray. It publicly bleeds on its own inflicted wounds. The DA is not good for governance or oversight. The personality disorder DA takes instructions from the team leader, namely absent Premier Helen Zille. With her the silly DA cannot even get a simple thing right such as to support or oppose a bill. Clearly the head is not in control of its divided members. Is it any wonder so many abandon the doomed DA ship? [Interjections.]

The DA’s double standards are fast catching up with it. Instead of getting out of the ditch, Mr Speaker, it digs in deeper. Will the DA show any leadership or shall we see it do another frantic about turn on legislation today?

The SPEAKER: Order! hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! DA over to you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You bring shame upon them.

Mr J J VISSER (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. Good is slowly to starting to reign over evil. We all know that people have a right to voice their unhappiness by means of demonstration. We all however also know that you cannot infringe on other people’s rights while doing so. The ANC, and more particularly the union partners, apparently do not understand this very well.

It is embedded in the ANC’s philosophy to disregard other peoples’ rights, safety and property. They never take responsibility for their actions as well. The DA has set an example on how you take responsibility for your actions. Maybe hon member Mr Uys, the ANC should learn from this.

The farm protests which started in November 2012 and which were funded by the ANC and mainly driven by the labour unions, especially Nosey Pietersen’s Bawusa, resulted in one person dead and millions of rands worth of damage to property, but had another unintended result for the ANC, however. It led to the formation of farm worker forums which expressed its dismay of this type of action by the ANC [Interjections.]
Mr M OZINSKY: And rejected the work of the police.

Mr J VISSER: Recently we saw a march by more than 3000 real farm workers where they peacefully protested against the ANC anarchists who threaten and assault them and deliberately infringe on their rights to decent work and a living, making their own decisions and a peaceful life.

When the court case started in Wolseley where a policeman was brought before the court for the shooting of a farm worker, Michael Daniels, Nosey Pietersen held a meeting trying to convince people to go on a march and burn down the court. [Interjections.] Real farm workers also attended that meeting and asked the other meeting members not to adhere to this plan of anarchy [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr J VISSER: ... but instead to send Nosey Pietersen alone to do his own dirty work and to be there personally, not to be misused and abused by him any further. There was no march or burning down of the court or any other anarchy on the day of the court sitting.

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Visser, please conclude.

Mr J VISSER: As I said, Mr Speaker, the ANC will not take responsibility for these anarchistic actions and condemn it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Visser.

Mr J VISSER: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. COPE over to you.

Mr M NCEDANA (COPE): Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. A government that cares for all people is a government that shows this by clear action. This then means that the government should ensure that people have access to clean water; that they have access to proper sanitation, and have access to houses [Interjection]... Now what we have experienced in the Western Cape is contrary to that, in particular in the area of provision for sanitation ... where our people are still using the bucket system to relieve themselves and where our people are still using the N2 to relieve themselves. This is what is witnessed whilst on our way to work in the mornings. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Skwatsha. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha, hon member Mr Ncedana is on the floor.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member!

Mr M NCEDANA: As if it was not an embarrassment or an insult enough to use a bucket system, now they have been forced to stay in the house, to sleep in the house and eat in the house, and the toilet is in this house.
†An HON MEMBER: Yes, just like in my house.

†Mr M NCEDANA: This is a clear indication of a Democratic Alliance that does not care, has no regard for black people.

*It is clear to any fool that a black person will always remain a baboon in the DA lead government, because if we had a caring government we would not have a government that spends R4-5 million in support of sustaining the use of porta-potties

†It is most expensive compared to the installation of infrastructure which would be decent and everybody would have access to. Shame on you.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Minister Madikizela! Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Ncedana, hon Minister Madikizela. Order! [Interjections.] Member, can you please cool down? Order, hon member Mr Ncedana! Hon Minister Madikizela, order please. Order hon Minister, order. Hon member Mr Skwatsha, is it a point of order?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

†The SPEAKER: Order to you.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Is it in order for the hon Minister Carlisle to be embarrassed? [Laughter.][Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: ANC over to you, statements, ANC.

†Mr Z C STALI (ANC): How many more blacks must die and be buried before this DA led Western Cape provincial government regularise and assist ... [Interjections.]

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Are you accusing us of murder?

†Mr Z C STALI: ... to defuse the growing taxi war in this province? Five people died so far in less than a week after they were shot in the Delft area. During October ten people lost their lives. The uncaring DA was warned repeatedly in this House about the problem dragging ... [Interjections.]

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Give us the national police ... [Inaudible.]

†Mr Z C STALI: ... on for months whilst MEC Minister Carlisle laughed and mocked people about this serious matter. On whose head is the blood of all these victims?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is a good question.

†Mr Z C STALI: Transport services are disrupted in affected areas and many commuters left stranded. They are too scared to go in the streets where bullets fly.
†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Speak to Mthethwa.

†Mr Z C STALI: Where this DA government interfered and intervened  [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... police, if they are not busy corrupting ... [Interjections.]

†Mr Z C STALI: It added more tensions ... [Interjections.] Only a few individuals are preventing a settlement to be reached. [Interjections.] The big associations are ready. The department must work out a new dispensation for that area ... [Interjections.] ... to regularise the operators and issue permits. The department’s refusal to talk to operators who do not at this stage have permits ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order Minister Carlisle, Order!

†Mr Z C STALI: ... will have an even heavier cost ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You must be mad.

†Mr Z C STALI: ... with more people dying.

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle, if you carry on, you will definitely also leave this Chamber. [Interjections.]

†Mr Z C STALI: The only reason why ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, over to you. Order, take your seat, hon member Mr Stali.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, is it parliamentary for Minister Carlisle to say to the hon member Mr Stali he must be mad?

†The SPEAKER: Minister?

†An HON MEMBER: It is a question.

†The SPEAKER: Did you say that to hon member Mr Stali?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, I say it out of honour to him because only a mad person can ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon Minister! Can you withdraw that statement please?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: All I can say is he is sane ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle can you withdraw without ... hon Minister Carlisle.
†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I withdraw.

†The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I can apologise, but I will not do it. [Interjections.]

†Mr Z C STALI: It is very unfortunate that the people who are dying happen to be black and that is why he does not care ... [Interjections.] ... and that is why he keeps on laughing. It is so unfortunate that the people who are involved in the taxi wars happen to be black and are in the black communities.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They want to come and talk ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle.

†Mr Z C STALI: ... and that is the reason why he does not care. You do not care! [Interjections.] That is the reason why you do not want to talk to them. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle! [Interjections.]

†Mr Z C STALI: You are laughing. It is a laughing matter to you. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Minister Carlisle, I have warned you and that is the last warning to you. [Interjections.]

*An HON MEMBER: Calm down now.

†The SPEAKER: DA over to you. [Interjections.]

†Ms J L HARTNICK (DA): Mr Speaker, November commemorates Diabetes Awareness Month and yesterday signified World Diabetes Day. Mr Speaker, 3,5 million South Africans suffer from diabetes of whom some are present in this House today, and there are many more who are undiagnosed.

More often than not the main focus in Africa is on infectious diseases such as HIV Aids, TB and malaria. There is little awareness around diabetes and its complications and many patients go undiagnosed or do not receive treatment in time. According to Dr Anil Kapur, managing director of the World Diabetes Foundation, few people realise that in Africa more than in any other continent, there are interactions between these three conditions and their various treatments.

Patients who receive anti-retroviral drugs are at a higher risk of developing diabetes as some of the drugs cause glucose intolerance as one of the side-effects. People with diabetes have a greater risk to develop TB as diabetes reduces the body’s immunity. In addition, the interaction between drugs to treat diabetes and TB reduces the effectiveness of both the TB drugs and the diabetes drugs, so it is difficult to control both diseases.
Mr Speaker, the fact that many diabetic patients only get help when they already have complications also places a great burden on the healthcare system, whereas 80% of type-2 diabetes could have been avoided through following a healthy eating plan and regular exercise. With this I commend Minister Botha and his department in their efforts for primary prevention, raising awareness.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Thank you hon member Ms Hartnick. ID over to you. Chance not taken, DA.

†Ms C LABUSCHAGNE (DA): Mr Speaker, I believe that education is the best investment any person or institution can make. Look at the fabric of our past and you will see that education was one of the primary targets of race-based disenfranchisement. However, this fabric I speak of has over the past 19 years been monopolised to frame a narrow political agenda of success, an agenda which has begun to tank.

We are currently at the point in our democracy that can only be described as a “turn to lowest common denominator governance.” Performance is instead being shunted for personal benefit, prestige and power. Our opponents love to beat their chests when they succeed, yet our successes are often either rejected or simply hijacked.

Mr Speaker, I refer here to two research reports that have provided solid evidence that this government is taking structural, strategic, managerial, scholastic and financial tasks in our education very seriously. Yes, we have a long way to go, but every year we are closing that gap.

The Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation in the presidency recently released their report on the education sector for 2012/13, and its findings are very clear: the Western Cape Education Department is the best performing education department in the country, evidenced by the best overall MPAT key performance area score.

The second report is the report on the national school monitoring survey recently released by the Department of Basic Education at national level on 2000 selected schools. Out of the 15 indicators used in that survey study the Western Cape Education Department was the top performer in all ... [Interjections.]

*Mr H P GEYER: Hear, hear!

†Me C LABUSCHAGNE: ... and is the only province to score a “1”, the highest extent of meeting each indicator. Mr Speaker, this government does not aspire to mediocrity and these results are proof of that. Thank you.

*Mr H P GEYER: Hear, hear!

†The SPEAKER: ANC over to you.
†Mr M OZINSKY (ANC): The DA provincial government continues to make the constitutional oversight role of the Western Cape Provincial Legislature a joke in the eyes of the public. Last week the Western Cape Education Department leaked the audit report on learner transport to selected journalists, whilst it has refused to allow Scopa to discuss the report in public for more than two years.

†Mr M G E WILEY: It is deemed classified.

†Mr M OZINSKY: The spurious arguments MEC Minister Grant and HOD Vinjevolt gave to Scopa in the House have now been shown to be false. [Interjections.] Worse still must be the embarrassment of the DA members of Scope, hon members Wiley, Labuschagne and Geyer, now and then supported by Walters … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Mr M OZINSKY: … who vehemently supported the false reasons the department gave to Scopa in order to cover up this matter. Now that the department has let them down, their kowtowing approach to oversight has yet again been exposed.

Even the Chairperson of Scopa, the ACDP’s hon member Mr Haskin, is squirming in his seat for allowing, in the face of legal opinion by senior counsel to the contrary, the department to make presentations on the audit report without it being made public. Instead of arguing the reasons they gave Scopa in the House in front of a Court, the Western Cape Education Department simply gave the report to the press when confronted with the Protection of Promotion of Access to Information Act request. This shows the department knew the reasons they gave Scopa and the House were false and would not stand up in court. This should be a lesson to my colleagues in Scopa. I warned them the report would be made public. The only question was whether they were prepared to stand for principle or not and make it public. Yet again they have failed the test and have egg on their faces.

Even today after the WCED has leaked the report, I as a Scopa member am unable to discuss or share the contents of the report with members of the public … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order.

†Mr M OZINSKY: … because I received the report on a confidential basis in Scopa from the department. The ANC sees this as an attempt by the department and its political leadership to silence Scopa members in the public debate on this matter … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Ozinsky.

†Mr M OZINSKY: May I just finish my last sentence?

†The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.
†An HON MEMBER: No.

†An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†The SPEAKER: Order. You may finish, hon member Mr Ozinsky.

†Mr M OZINSKY: The ANC sees this as an attempt by the department and the political leadership to silence Scopa members. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Ozinsky.

†Mr M OZINSKY: I am still finishing the sentence.

†The SPEAKER: No. Thank you, your time has expired. [Interjections.] Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon member Mr Ozinsky. ACDP over to you. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Hon members, order! ACDP.

†Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Thank you, Mr Speaker. The ACDP is pleased that the Khayelitsha commission of enquiry has begun its work, recognising that this is a significant step towards understanding the reasons for and the extent of the breakdown in relations between the community and the police, and why the community have resorted to unconstitutional and illegal actions including mock-justice and necklacing rather than trusting the police and criminal justice system.

The ACDP appeals to community members, organisations, institutions and businesses in Khayelitsha to monitor and even participate in the commission’s work and to make their voices heard to ensure that the commission is best able to fulfil its role for the benefit of the Khayelitsha community, SAPS and all in the Western Cape. The outcomes must effect community police relations throughout the Western Cape and improve police responsiveness and accountability.

On a second note, the government cannot allow Bawusa and its reckless self-serving officials to again threaten the Boland farming region’s harvest season by intimidating farmers and farm workers, causing damage to property and crops. Instead of protecting and working for farm workers and the sustainability of the agri-sector in the Boland, Bawusa is threatening to plunge the region into further turmoil. Immediate action must be taken against all Bawusa officials and others who are inciting violence and further wildcat strikes and to destabilise the region, socially and economically.

Finally, the ACDP calls on the Western Cape Education Department to ensure the removal of ANC party political billboards from public school properties around the province if they have not already done so, and to bring to book those in the education department and in the ANC who made this happen.

In the lead-up to next year’s elections the ACDP calls on all political parties to uphold all aspects of the law including the Electoral Act and those acts relating to the use of public infrastructure for party-political purposes. To adapt the words of president Reagan: “Minister, take down those billboards.”
THURSDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2013

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Haskin. [Interjections.] Order! That is the end of the statements by members. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! We proceed to motions. The first motion, the Chief Whip.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move the motion printed in my name on the Order Paper, as follows:

That the House rescinds the resolution adopted on 17 October 2013 with regard to the Intellectual Property Laws Amendment Bill [B 8 B - 2010] and confers the authority on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP not to support this bill.

†The SPEAKER: We are on the speaker’s list. I see the hon member Mr Uys.

†Mr P UYS: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker. On 17 October 2013 this House took a decision with regard to the Intellectual Property Laws Amendment Bill to support this bill with no objections - all members. Today, Mr Deputy Speaker, the 14th of November, we have a motion from the DA to rescind that resolution. From the 17th of October to the 14th of November they changed their minds.

The first issue I want to address, Mr Deputy Speaker, is a ruling that you must make in terms of Rule 145 (2) (a) that no draft resolution may be moved in the House which is the same in substance as a draft resolution which was approved or rejected by it during the preceding period of six months.

Paragraph (b) refers to a situation where the six months is not applicable. All documentation that you read applies to this - six months, Mr Deputy Speaker, but in case you do not rule in this regard and I get the impression that that might be, let us try and understand why the DA is now all of a sudden opposing this piece of legislation? Why?

Mr Deputy Speaker, the object of this legislation is to amend the Copyright Act, the Trademark Act, the Design Act and the Performance Protection Act. But what is the objective here?

The objective is that the wealth of indigenous knowledge held by indigenous people of South Africa be recognised, preserved, protected and promoted and made accessible to the public. That is what the DA is now voting against, again voting that those poor people not be included in this.

Secondly, Mr Deputy Speaker, indigenous knowledge is a valuable economic as well as a cultural resource. By not voting for this we are keeping it away from the indigenous people, people sitting here in the gallery; people even in the House here. Mr Deputy Speaker, and its objective will benefit the country and ensure that fair financial benefits will also be received by indigenous communities and persons.
The principles have been agreed upon by international bodies like the following: the World Trade Organisation and the United Nations, confirming that indigenous knowledge shall be recognised and protected. Why must certain performers be protected in South Africa, whether it is a record, whether it is art, whether it is poetry, whether it is anything they are protected, but indigenous people are not protected? Again, it is the line that we see, Mr Deputy Speaker, employment equity - that problem there.

†An HON MEMBER: Ah come on!

†Mr P UYS: Broadbased economic empowerment - a problem there; indigenous people - a problem there. Why not protect them? We say here we reject this. What the DA wants to do here today and we will oppose it, not only here but also nationally.

†Ms L BROWN: Hear, hear.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Haskin.

†Ms L BROWN: Why bother with indigenous people, as long as indigenous people vote. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Rossouw.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, as expected the ANC are now trying to politicised this administrative correction and just to put it mildly, economic ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

*Ms A ROSSOUW: ... to manipulated this incident to fit in with sewerage politics which that are continually pushing these days. What are the facts really? On 17 September and this is the committee report, on 17 September the committee approved it [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You were in the committee.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Yes. On the 17th September the Standing Committee on Finances and Economic Development recommended that the Western Cape delegation to the National Council be granted authority to not support the Intellectual Property Laws Amendment Bill. That is the way it was approved in the committee [Interjections.] The committee report was documented in the Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports on 18 September 2013 and was published and the committee decision was sent as such to the Provincial Council of Provinces at that stage.

*Mr P UYS: Incorrectly.
*Ms A ROSSOUW: No, it was not incorrect, because at that stage it was a committee decision. [Interjections.] The committee report in which it is clearly explained that the bill will not be supported was presented to the House for ratification of the mandate. Unfortunately the administrative staff that prepared the guide for the presiding officer erred in that the guide reflected the opposite … [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

*Ms A ROSSOUW: ... position.

†Mr P UYS: But they voted ... [Interjections.]

*Ms A ROSSOUW: It was presented as such to the House and accepted … [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

*Ms A ROSSOUW: ... it is corrected with this. [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

†Mr P UYS: On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think it is totally wrong for any person to attack the Table and the administrative staff when everybody voted for that.

†An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†Mr P UYS: It is wrong. It is wrong. It is like attacking you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. I did not read it as an attack, but … [Interjections.]

†Mr P UYS: Of course, they blame them.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we please tone it down.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You are fighting a sole battle from where you are sitting.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are you done? [Interjections.] Thank you.

*Ms L BROWN: You fell asleep. I am saying you are all sleeping.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Have you made a decision, Mr Deputy Speaker?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is it a point of order?

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes, I wanted to, but have you made a decision yet?
†Mr P UYS: No.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry?

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I want to just add if I may. The Chairperson … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It is a point of order, yes it is.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A point of order.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It is a point of order.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, please continue.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The reason why they voted was because the Chairperson was not here and they were sleeping. That is why it happened.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I have heard the point. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon member Mr Uys, order!

†An HON MEMBER: Wake up!

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have had the opportunity – Order, please. I have had the opportunity to listen to the point of order. I will now put the question … [Interjections.]

Hon member Mr Uys, I am busy putting the question and before I do that, your point of order is not a valid point of order. This is definitely not something envisaged by Rule 145 of the same substance. The House at any time has the power to rescind any decision.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Whenever the DA suits itself … [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And this is what is happening here. [Interjections.] Can we then put the question? I put the question. Those … [Interjections.] Order! Those in favour of the question will say “aye”.

†HON MEMBERS: Aye.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against will say “no”.

†HON MEMBERS: No.

Agreed to.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it, and so they have. We move on to motion number 2. [Interjections.] Order! Motion number 2. The Chief Whip.
Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move the motion as printed in my name on the Order Paper, as follows:

That notwithstanding Rule 161(3) the House considers the finalisation of the Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B 7 - 2013] should the principle of the Bill be approved.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Motion number 2 on the Order Paper in the name of the Chief Whip has been put. I put the motion, those in favour will say “aye”.

†HON MEMBERS: Aye.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against “no”.

†HON MEMBERS: No.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it. I think the ayes have it, and so they have. The motion is carried. [Interjections.] We then proceed to the other motions.

Agreed to.

*An HON MEMBER: You are sleeping again, sleeping again.

FESTIVE SEASON: PREPAREDNESS

(Notice of Motion)

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the preparedness of the Western Cape government in respect of the coming festive season.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

[Motion selected as subject for discussion for 21 November 2013 as printed on the Order Paper]
TAXI VIOLENCE: DELFT AND KHAYELITSHA
(Notice of Motion)

†Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the spike in the taxi violence relating to the Delft and Khayelitsha taxi road conflict.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the spike in taxi violence that is linked to the Delft and Khayelitsha taxi route conflict.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

MITCHELLS PLEIN HOSPITAL: PLANNING AND FUNDING
(Notice of Motion)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the DA’s lies around the funding and planning of the Mitchells Plain Hospital.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the lies of the Democratic Alliance with regard to the funding and planning of Mitchells Plain Hospital.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Oh nonsense.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.
THURSDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2013

JOB LOSSES ON FARMS: MYTH
(Notice of Motion)

†Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the myths around job losses on farms since the announcement of the 52% increase in the minimum wage.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the myths around job losses on farms since the announcement of the 52% increase in the minimum wage.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

HANOVER PARK DAY HOSPITAL: CLOSURE DUE TO GANG VIOLENCE
(Notice of Motion)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the arbitrary closure of the Hanover Park Day Hospital arising from the provincial government’s failure to address gang violence in the area.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the arbitrary closure of the Hanover Park Day Hospital arising from the Provincial Government’s failure to address gang violence in the area.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.
SLUMS, CREATION OF IN THE WESTERN CAPE
(Notice of Motion)

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the DA’s creation of slums in the Western Cape.
[Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the creation of slums in the western Cape by the Democratic Alliance

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Stali.

MR KENNY AFRICA: CORRUPTION CHARGES
(Notice of Motion)

†Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the fact that more corruption charges are levelled against Provincial Traffic Head Mr Kenny Africa.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the fact that more corruptive charges have now been levelled against Provincial Traffic Head, Mr Kenny Africa.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†Ms L BROWN: And we warned you [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.
THURSDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2013

CORRUPTION: DA COUNCILLORS

(Notice of Motion)

†Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the blatant corruption on the part of DA councillors.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the blatant corruption on the part of councillors of the Democratic Alliance.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

LABOURERS IN FARMING AREAS: DISSATISFACTION

(Notice of Motion)

†Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the growing dissatisfaction on the part of labourers in the Western Cape farming areas.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the growing dissatisfaction on the part of labourers in the western Cape farming areas.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.
MILITARY VETERANS: ABSENCE OF ASSISTANCE
(Notice of Motion)

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the absence of any assistance by the provincial government to military veterans.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the absence of any assistance by the provincial government to military veterans.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

COUNCILLORS: CONTRAVENTION OF RULES
(Notice of Motion)

†Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the DA’s failure to discipline their councillors who contravened the rules of council.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the failure of the Democratic Alliance to discipline their councillors who contravene the rules of councils.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.
HOUSING FUND’S ANNUAL REPORT: LATE SUBMISSION

(Notice of Motion)

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the statement by the hon Minister Madikizela to Scopa that the Auditor General agreed that the Housing Fund submit its annual report of 2011/12 late.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the statement by the hon Minister Madikizela to Scopa that the Auditor-General agreed that the Housing Fund submit its annual report 2011/12 late.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

MR MCBRIDE APPOINTMENT: IPID

(Notice of Motion)

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discuss the appointment of Mr McBride to the position of IPID. [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the nomination of Mr Robert McBride to the position of Chief Executive of the Independent Police Investigative Directorate (IPID).

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there further; any further? [Interjections.] Okay, nothing further. Then we continue. Are there any motions without notice?
LATE DR PAT GORVALLA
(Motion of Condolence)

†Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends its condolences to the family and friends of Dr Pat Gorvalla, a leading businesswoman, a former member of the UWC Council and former President of the Anglican Women’s Fellowship, who passed away this week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of Dr Pat Gorvalla, a leading business woman, a former member of the Council of the University of the Western Cape and President of the Anglican Women’s Fellowship (AWF), who passed away during the past week.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

ROSSOUW CILLIE, ANDRE CLOETE AND PROF NICK VINK
(Motion)

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House takes note that the category winners in the Farmer of the Year competition all hail from the Western Cape and also conveys its congratulations to Rossouw Cillie of Ceres, Wizenberg, who won the category of National Farmer of the Year, to Andre Cloete, a farmer from the Overberg as winner in the category of Newcomer to Commercial Agriculture and also to Professor Nick Vink of the University of Stellenbosch who received the award for Agriculturalist of the Year.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that all three of the category winners of the Farmer of the Year competition hail from the Western Cape and thus congratulates Rossouw Cillie of Ceres, Witzenberg, who won the category of National Farmer of the Year, André Cloete, a farmer from the Overberg, who was crowned as winner in the category New Entrant to the Commercial Agriculture and Prof Nick Vink of the University of Stellenbosch, who has received the award of Agriculturalist of the Year.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
CORNELIUS PAULSE

(Motion)

*Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate Mr Cornelius Paulse on his naming as Western Cape Farm Worker of the Year at a grand event held on 25 October in Stellenbosch. Mr Paulse is also present here today as our guest up in the gallery. [Applause.]

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Cornelius Paulse on being nominated as the Western Cape Farmworker of the Year at a prestigious event at Stellenbosch on 25 October 2013.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE AGNES NOKHATYWA

(Motion of Condolence)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of former MK operative Agnes Nokhatywa who passed away in KTC.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of former MK operative, Agnes Nokhatywa, who passed away in KTC.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
MARIUS SCHOLTZ

(Motion)

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate Mr Marius Scholtz, the principal of Piketberg High School, on being named as one of the top ten teachers and also as winner of the category of Excellence in High School Leadership, which was announced by the Western Cape Department of Education on 9 November 2013. Mr Scholtz’s career spans 33 years and under his leadership the creation of a work and learn culture has become the main focus. He serves as an inspiration to our other educators and learners. We wish him good luck in his national participation.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Marius Scholtz, school principal of Piketberg High School, on being nominated as one of the top ten teachers, and on the fact that he was crowned as the winner in the Excellence in High School Leadership category by the Western Cape Education Department on 9 November 2013. The House notes that Mr Scholtz’s career spans more than 33 years. Under his leadership it has become the main focus of Piketberg High School to create a working and learning culture. He serves as an inspiration to fellow educators and to learners. We wish him well for his participation in the national competition.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

GERRIT VAN RENSBURG, MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE

(Motion)

†Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to the Western Cape Minister of Agriculture, Gerrit van Rensburg, who was recently inducted into the Confrérie des Chevaliers du Tastevin in Burgundy, France, in acknowledgement of his contribution towards the promotion of food and wine in the Burgundy region of France. This is Minister Van Rensburg’s second accolade. He was also inducted into the Commanderie du Bordeaux in 2012 for his contribution to the South African Wine Industry and his work to promote South African Wine in France. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]
Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to the Western Cape’s Minister of Agriculture, Gerrit van Rensburg, who was recently inducted to the Confrérie des Chevaliers du Tastevin in Burgundy, France, in acknowledgment for his contribution towards the promotion of food and wine in the Burgundy region in France and further notes that this is Minister Van Rensburg’s second accolade. He was also inducted to the Commanderie du Bordeaux in 2012 for his contribution to the South African wine industry and his work to promote South African wine in France.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

*An HON MEMBER: Nice! Nice!

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

MARIA GOODIER

(Motion)

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Sister Maria Goodier of Ruyterwacht on receiving the annual Cecilia Makiwane Nursing Award and applauds her lifetime of dedication and selfless service to the people of the Cape wherever she has served.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Sister Maria Goodier of Ruyterwacht, on receiving the annual Cecilia Makiwane Nursing Award, and applauds her lifetime of dedication and selfless service to the people of the Cape, wherever she has served.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
LATE SIZWE MPOLWENI

(Motion of Condolence)

†Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of the former MK operative who also served the Military Intelligence of Sundown, Sizwe Mpolweni, also known as Dlayani Sithole, who died after a long illness.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of the former MK operative who served in the military intelligence of the South African National Defence Force, Sizwe Mpolweni, also known as Dlayani Sithole, who died after a long illness.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

KIM VIERA, JESSE MILLIGAN & IVAN BOONZAAIER

(Motion)

*Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extend its congratulations to the ballet dancers Kim Viera, Jesse Milligan and Ivan Boonzaaier on their naming as the best dancers of the year by the Cape Town City Ballet Dancers. Laura Bosenberg also received a special award. She receives the Geoffrey Nieman and Brian van Rheede award, and Rosamund Ford receives the award for most promising Upcoming Dancer of the Year.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the ballet dancers Kim Viera (female award) and Jesse Milligan and Ivan Boonzaaier (male award) on being nominated as the best dancers of the year by the Cape Town City Ballet. Ballet dancers that have also been honoured with special acknowledgements are Laura Bösenberg, who received the Geoffrey Nieman and Brian van Rheede Award for Most Outstanding Performance of the Year, and Rosamund Ford, who received recognition for the Most Promising Newcomer of the Year.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
THURSDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2013

LATE TEOBOGO MAITE

(Motion of Condolence)

†Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of former Gender Commissioner Tebogo Maite, who also served the Anti-Apartheid Movement as an MK operative.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of former Gender Commissioner Tebogo Maite, who also served the anti-apartheid movement as an MK operative.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

MARZANNE LE ROUX, WESLEY JANTJIES, REGAN DOMINGO, ZIANÉ LE ROUX, KELLY ERNSTZEN, JOSEPH LOUW AND ERIC DARIES

(Motion)

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the senior hip-hop team Vuelta of the Western Cape on their third place and gold medal which they won during the 2013 FISAF International Fitness and Hip-Hop Unite World Championships held in Belgrade, Serbia. The team comprises of Marzanne le Roux, Wesley Jantjies, Regan Domingo, Ziané le Roux, Kelly Ernstzen, Joseph Louw and Eric Daries.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the senior Hip Hop team, Vuelta, of the Western Cape on their third place and the bronze medal received by them in the 2013 FISAF International Fitness and Hip Hop Unite World Championships in Belgrade in Serbia. The members of the team are: Marzanne le Roux (coach and choreographer), Wesley Jantjies, Regan Domingo, Ziané le Roux, Kelly Ernstzen, Joseph Louw and Eric Daries.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
LATE MZUVUKILE NTUNJA
(Motion of Condolence)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of Youth Activist and ANC member Mzuvukile Ntunja who was buried last week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of youth activist in the anti-apartheid struggle and later member of the African National Congress, Mzuvukile Ntunja, who was buried last week.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]
Agreed to.

AVRIL ROUCH, WENDY HORN, LORNA SUCH, ROELÉNE LOOTS, INGRID LEUKES, JUNAIN ADONIS, MARSHA SCHWARTZ, HYWIL APPOLIS AND CHRISTIAN HATTINGH
(Motion)

†Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the following persons: Avril Crouch, Wendy Horn, Lorna Such, Roeléne Loots, Ingrid Leukes, Junain Adonis, Marsha Schwartz, Hywil Appolis en Christian Hattingh, all of whom were honoured in their respective categories for their dedication and service to education in the province at the Western Cape Teachers Awards held on 8 November 2013.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the following persons: Avril Crouch, Wendy Horn, Lorna Such, Roeléne Loots, Ingrid Leukes, Junain Adonis, Marsha Schwartz, Hywil Appolis and Christian Hattingh. We note that all of them were honoured in their respective categories for their dedication and service to education in the Province at the Western Cape Teachers’ Awards, a function that was held on 8 November 2013.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]
Agreed to.
SHACK FIRES: LOSS OF FAMILY MEMBERS

(Motion)

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sympathises with those who have lost family members and have been displaced as a result of shack fires over the past few weeks.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its sympathy with those who have lost family members and have been displaced as a result of shack fires over the past few weeks.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LOUISE DRIVER

(Motion)

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate Louise Driver on her award as the Global Fundraiser of the Year which she received at the International Fundraising awards evening in the Netherlands. Louise Driver is the head of the Children’s Hospital Trust.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Louise Driver on the award ‘Global Fundraiser of the Year’, which she received at the International Fundraising Evening in the Netherlands. The House also notes that Louise Driver is the head of the ‘Children’s Hospital Trust’.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
LATE RALPH SMIT

(Motion of Condolence)

†Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of 51 year old Ralph Smit who was shot and killed in Lotus River.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of 51-year-old Ralph Smit, who was shot and killed in Lotus River.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE JOE DAUTH

(Motion of Condolence)

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extend its condolences to the family and friends of Joe Dauth, poet, writer and biographer of the legendary “Troebadoer van die Tankwas, Dirk Ligter”. He passed away on the 6 November this year at the age of 76.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of Joe Dauth, poet, author and biographer of the legendary troubadour of the Tankwas, Dirk Ligter. He died on 6 November 2013 at the age of 76 years.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
LATE CHUMA BOOI

(Motion of Condolence)

†Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of 15 year old Chuma Booi who was stabbed on a bus by eight gang members in Khayelitsha.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of 15-year-old Chuma Booi, who was stabbed on a bus by eight gang members in Khayelitsha.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

THE TEST KITCHEN: BEST RESTAURANT

(Motion)

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends its congratulations to The Test Kitchen in Woodstock and head chef Luke Dale-Roberts for being named the Best Restaurant in the Country for the second year in a row at the Annual Eat-Out Awards held over the weekend.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to The Test Kitchen in Woodstock and head chef Luke Dale-Roberts on being named the best restaurant in the country for the second year in a row at the annual Eat Out Awards held over the past weekend.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
TB EXPOSURE: NURSERY SCHOOL CHILDREN
(Motion)

†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:
That the House notes with concern that 40 nursery school children have tested positive for TB after being exposed to their teacher’s infection in Hermanus after doctors treated her for a chest infection but failed to test for diseases.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:
That the House notes with concern that 14 nursery school children in Hermanus have tested positive for TB after being exposed to their teacher’s infection after doctors treated her for a chest infection but failed to test for other diseases.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

WARREN BAM
(Motion)

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:
That the House congratulates Warren Bam on his award as the most promising young farmer from a previously disadvantaged background. This competition is hosted annually by Agri SA and the award ceremony was held at Nasrec Expo Centre in Johannesburg. Bam also hails from the Western Cape and he comes from the farm Lushof in the Tulbagh area. That is in Witzenberg. Two of the other finalists are also from Cape Town, namely Andre Cloete and Nicolaas Slinger.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:
That the House congratulates Warren Bam on receiving an award as the most promising young farmer coming from a previously disadvantaged background. This competition is held by Agri SA and the award was received by him at the NASREC Expo Centre in Johannesburg. The House also notes that Bam is from the Western Cape and comes from the farm Lushof in the Tulbagh area of Witzenberg and that two of the other five finalists were also from the Western Cape, namely André Cloete from Caledon and Nicolaas Slinger from Clanwilliam.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
ROBERT McBRIDE

(Motion)

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates freedom fighter and military veteran Robert McBride on his nomination as the next head of the Independent Police Investigative Directorate as we are convinced that his academic qualifications, his work experience and his history as a victim of the abuse of power by apartheid forces, some of whom are here ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Mr M OZINSKY: ... make him well qualified for the task.

[Motion as moved by member.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Hear, hear!

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates freedom fighter and military veteran Robert McBride on his nomination as the next head of the Independent Police Investigative Directorate as we are convinced that his academic qualifications, his work experience and his history as a victim of the abuse of power by apartheid forces, make him well qualified for the job.

[Notice of motion as printed in Order Paper.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

†An HON MEMBER: Shame on you ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†Ms M TINGWE: Shame on you, shame on you.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Hear, hear.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I see the hon member Ms Mbalo.
MINISTER ANTON BREDELL

(Motion)

†Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns MEC Anton Bredell’s unwarranted and illegal attack on the office of the Auditor General and discrediting the credentials of employees in the office.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns Minister Anton Bredell’s unwarranted and illegal attack on the office of the Auditor-General and his discrediting the credentials of employees in the office.

[Notice of motion as printed in Order Paper.]

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection? There is an objection. It will be printed in the Order Paper. It will be printed in the Order Paper. Anybody on this side, hon member Ms Labuschagne? Sorry?

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Is it parliamentary for a member to say “gat” to us?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear that. What did this member say? [Interjections.]

*An HON MEMBER: Oh yes, you said that he is a “dronkgat”.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Von Brandis

*An HON MEMBER: You are a dronkgat.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I did not say that – I did not say that.

*An HON MEMBER: He did.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: I said ... [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I don’t know what you said but did you say the words that he mentioned?

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: I withdraw and apologise.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You withdraw, thank you. [Interjections.]
*An HON MEMBER: He did not say that, man. [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, I see – order – who is next, hon member Mr Geyer.

FANIE NEL AND ANNELIEN VAN WYK

(Motion)

*Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House convey its congratulations to Mr Fanie Nel, the principal of the Augsburg Gymnasium School and chairman of the Western-Cape Youth Show who won the trophy for the provincial team acquiring the highest marks, at the Youth Show held at Kroonstad, as well as Ms Annelien Van Wyk, also from Augsburg in the Western Cape team who won the trophy for the best administration. The Western Cape learners received 12 bronze, 13 silver and 13 gold medals.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Fanie Nel, Principal of Augsburg Gymnasium and Chairperson of the Western Cape Youth Show, who won the trophy at the Youth Show at Kroonstad for the provincial team who scored most points, as well as Ms Annelien van Wyk, also from Augsburg, of the Western Cape team, who received the trophy for the team with the best administration, and further notes that the learners of the Western Cape received 12 bronze, 13 silver and 13 golden awards.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

MINISTER D GRANT : PROVISION OF BOOKS

(Motion)

*Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate and thank Mr Donald Grant, Minister of Education, the Western Cape Department of Education and all management teams on district and school level for the manner in which they have ensured the provision of books for each core subject for each grade for every learner for 2014. This is a first in the province and it commendable.

[Motion as moved by member.]
Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its gratitude to and congratulates Mr Donald Grant, the Minister of Education, the Department of Education of the Western Cape as well as all management teams at district and school level for the way in which the provision of books to each learner for each core subject in each grade has been ensured for 2014. This is the first in the province and it is commendable.

[Notice of motion as printed in Order Paper.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? [Interjections.] Order. Is there an objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Ms Tingwe.

SIBAHLE TSHIBIKA

(Motion)

†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates 23 year old Sibahle Tshibika from Khayelitsha who won the “So You Think You Can Dance Competition” on SABC3 and is now able to build a home for her mother and pay for her grandmother's funeral.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates 23-year-old Sibahle Tshibika of Khayelitsha, who won the “So You Think You Can Dance” competition on SABC3 and is now able to help build a home for her mother and pay for her grandmother's funeral.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

MINISTER T BOTHA: MITCHELLELS PLEIN HOSPITAL

(Motion)

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate all the role players in particular Minister Botha on the opening of the Mitchells Plain hospital. It is tangible and visible proof of outstanding service delivery. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by member.]
Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates all role-players and in particular Minister Botha on the opening of the Mitchells Plain Hospital. This is a visible and tangible proof of the excellent service delivery by the Democratic Alliance in the Cape.

[Motion as printed in Order Paper.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member, your last words faded. Can you repeat please? Excuse me. [Interjections.] Order!

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: It is tangible and visible proof of outstanding service delivery by the DA controlled government.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion? [Interjections.] Order. There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Ms Mbalo.

†Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Mbalo, please continue.

CAPENATURE: CULLING OF JACKAL & CARACAL

(Motion)

†Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that CapeNature has signed another agreement with farmers allowing them to cull jackal and caracal.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that CapeNature has signed another agreement with farmers allowing them to cull jackal and caracal.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
*Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to Jan Duminy of Ou Meule old age home in Riversdal who celebrated his 109th birthday on Wednesday 13 November.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Jan Duminy of the Ou Meule Home in Riversdale, who celebrated his 109th birthday on Wednesday, 13 November 2013.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sjoe! Thank you for the motion. Any objection to the motion of the hon member? Any objection to the motion without notice?

Agreed to.

HEINRICH KULSEN & ELMARIE BOTES

(Motion)

*Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extend its congratulations to Heinrich Kulsen and Elmarie Botes, two participants of the Cape Town Wine Makers Guild Protégé program. They have recently returned from France as part of the Western Cape and Burgundy exchange program.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Heinrich Kulsen and Elmarie Botes, two participants from the Cape Winemakers Guild Protégé Programme. The House notes that they have just arrived back from France after taking part in the exchange programme between the Western Cape and Burgundy.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
CAPE TOWN: 3RD PLACE - LONELY PLANET SURVEY

(Motion)

†Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

    That this House congratulates Cape Town for placing third in the Lonely Planet Survey of the best travel destinations in the world.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

    That the House congratulates Cape Town on being placed third in a Lonely Planet survey of the best travel destinations in the world for 2014.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

*An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

PHILLIP HUISAMEN

(Motion)

*Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

    That the House congratulate Phillip Huisamen from the farm Gifberg outside Vanrhynsdorp on his award as Rooibos Farmer of the Year.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

    That the House congratulates Phillip Huisamen of the farm Gifberg near Vanrhynsdorp on being nominated as the Rooibos Farmer of the Year.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
WITZENBERG YOUTH: PARLIAMENTARY VISIT

(Motion)

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice that:

That the House welcomes the youth from Witzenberg and make them feel at home while they are on an educational visit here in Parliament today.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice that:

That the House welcomes the young people from Witzenberg who are bringing an educational visit to Parliament today, and expresses the hope that they will feel at home here in our midst.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We proceed. The next item on the Order Paper is the subject for discussion in the name of the Leader of the Opposition as printed on the Order Paper. I see the leader of the Opposition.
THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC STATE SINCE THE DA HAS BEEN IN POWER

(Subject for Discussion)

†Ms L BROWN: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The DA’s open opportunity society policy ignores the current glaring economic and therefore social inequalities brought about by a long legacy of apartheid, exploitation and oppression, and as much as you whinge about it, it happened apparently.

The DA’s flip-flopping around the Employment Equity Bill says: Let us keep the employment in the country essentially white and male and let African and coloured people deal with the legacy of apartheid as if all is equal.

The DA’s position around Black Economic Empowerment tells us very clearly that they desperately want to keep the economy in white hands. How do you change the socio-economic conditions of the past if you do not want to share and you do not make any efforts as government to share the fruits of the present economy and if the state will not use our tax money to improve the quality of all our people’s lives?

In fact, it is those who are most vulnerable who are the first casualties of the DA government. One of the first things the DA government did when it came into power was to take away the free trade from seniors at the cost of R3,000 per month.

†An HON MEMBER: Where do you come from?

†Ms L BROWN: And I thank God for Tony Ehrenreich and Cosatu who picked it up. In fact, let me tell you, you are paying today R17,500 per day to Vusi Pikoli and R7,000 to Kate O’Regan. The case against the police or the Commissioner of Police … [Interjections.]

†Mr M G E WILEY: And R18 million is … [Inaudible.]

†Ms L BROWN: … has not even started. I am here in the Western Cape. I have been elected in the Western Cape. I am interested in what happens in the Western Cape … [Interjections.] … and for months and months and months they have been doing nothing but getting R17,500 per day to work per day.

†Mr M C WALTERS: Unprincipled.

†Ms L BROWN: Very unprincipled, very, very unprincipled [Interjections.] In fact, the DA has a wonderful mantra that they pay almost R14 million for. Well, they do not pay, they pay TBWA R14 million. It spends R14 million to create perceived wisdom amongst commentators, but does it hold up to the facts? The mantra is that the Western Cape is governed and there is better service delivery because it is run by the DA.

†An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]
**Ms L BROWN:** Well, I do not know. [Interjections.] I do not think any of you live in Imizamo Yethu. I do not think any of you live in Parkwood Estate. I do not think any of you live in Mitchells Plain. I lived there. I grew up there. I was born in Parkwood Estate.

**An HON MEMBER:** You did not count Khayelitsha.

**Ms L BROWN:** In fact, few who make this point … [Interjections.]

**Ms E PRINS:** Do not laugh. It is a serious matter.

**Ms L BROWN:** … actually looked - they laugh at poverty in this province. That is the problem.

**Ms M TINGWE:** Yes.

**Ms L BROWN:** They laugh at the fact that they have taken away resources from poor communities. Shame on you!

**Mr H P GEYER:** That is an assumption!

**Ms L BROWN:** Shame on you! You laugh because you have taken resources away from the poor. Let me tell you … [Interjections.]

**The MINISTER OF HEALTH:** We will get to the truth.

**Ms L BROWN:** As we have come to this province, you know hon Minister Botha, we have had a decision taken to build two hospitals; one in Khayelitsha and one in Mitchells Plain.

**The MINISTER OF HEALTH:** [Inaudible.] Mitchells Plain.

**Ms L BROWN:** You know … [Interjections.]

**The MINISTER OF HEALTH:** You stopped it!

**Ms L BROWN:** You know that we ran a programme for SMME’s. You stopped that programme in 2009/10 at a time when Casidra told us that SMME development through the red door came to - made R20 million. You stopped it.

**The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:** We have a way better programme. We proved it.

**Ms L BROWN:** But you cannot prove anything. You cannot prove anything. Take housing - I am sorry Minister Madikizela is not here.

**The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:** We do not steal the ... [Inaudible.]
†Ms L BROWN: According to Census 2011 - well, I mean, those who steal should please stand up and say who steal, and I am now talking to the Leader of Government Business. [Interjections.] In 1996, 82% of the population already lived in formal housing in the Western Cape. By 2011 this declined to 80.2%. By comparison to Gauteng percentages are not 1.1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, just as a lesson to you hon member Mr Walters. Do you understand, percentages; do you know percentages; by comparison to Gauteng which experienced a 10% higher immigration over the same period, they increased access to formal housing from 74.8% to 79.8%. The actual number of houses in Gauteng is far higher given that the population is more than double that of the Western Cape.

During ANC governance housing delivery increased year-on-year. In fact, in 2009/10 with an ANC budget the DA delivered 16 500 houses [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Ms Brown, please finish off.

†Ms L BROWN: And since then it has declined year-on-year, 2010/11 you only delivered - you delivered 2000 houses less year-on-year.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired.

†Ms L BROWN: Thank you. [Time expired.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Botha.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity and to the hon Leader of the Opposition for actually being so brave to put this point on the agenda for discussion in debate.

I want to start with an opening statement by saying that I think the biggest honour and response that government can do and responsibility a government has towards its citizens is to govern properly, because when you govern properly everything else falls into place. That is something that we have changed in this government. What we inherited was not a good government and everyone knows that. That is why you changed your Premier. That is why you, the hon Leader of the Opposition, had to try your very best in the last few months to save what was left of what was once a government. We inherited that and we have in a very short period, Mr Deputy Speaker, been awarded by the national government’s measurement tools, the MPATs. We have been awarded for strategic management as the best province in South Africa with 95%, while the Eastern Cape for instance got 49%. [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: The ANC government also won that award! The ANC government also … [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: We also won that award.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Governance and accountability: we have been awarded by the national government as the best province with 70%, while the Eastern Cape - listen to this - had 16%. 
*An HON MEMBER: Ah! Jo!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In HR management, Mr Deputy Speaker, we got the award as the best with 55%, while a province like Gauteng got 14%.

†An HON MEMBER: Sjoe! Wow!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In accordance with financial management, you know, you cannot do socio-economic development if you cannot get these things in place and have them in place. With financial management … [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: That is why we build fewer houses year-by-year. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: With financial management we obtained the first position in the country within four years, from a bad government we inherited at 81%, while the Northwest got 10%. It is as if it does not exist when you have that type of percentage. As if that was not enough, in the Stats South Africa we obtained some other very unique achievements. I want the hon member Mr Ncedana to listen to this because he got a little bit lost in his message or in his statement which he made today. We have the lowest unemployment in South Africa. If you have the lowest unemployment then surely you must be successful in socio-economic development, but when you have a 99% - and this is the best performance in South Africa. 99,1% of the people of this province has access to piped water. We are the best in South Africa with 91,1% with refuse removal. We are the best in South Africa with 93,4% for electricity provision. We are the best in South Africa with 96,9% with toilet facilities. [Interjections.]

*An HON MEMBER: Aikona!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Toilet facilities! So I do not know what you use. I do not know what you use. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, those are only a few general statistics which I am giving this House … [Interjections.] … or reporting in this House on what was given or awarded to us by independent adjudication. Year-on-year we achieved an average of 78% of our budget spend on the poor community in the Western Cape [Interjections.] So if you have spent 78% year-on-year you have spent by far the most, but the difference is we spend the money. [Interjections.] If you look at the performance of the other provinces they do not spend it.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, you spend the money to feed the rich.

†Ms L BROWN: Yes, you close the clinics where the poor are.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No clinic has closed. Let me tell you what. Beds declined … [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: Where the poor are!
†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hospital beds declined under Pierre Uys, hon member Pierre Uys [Interjections.] and staff declined under the hon Pierre Uys. The opposite happened with us. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: Your nose is growing.

†An HON MEMBER: That is not true. You know it is not true.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon Leader of the Opposition is very - she is very restricted with the information she gives about housing, for instance. Why does she not say that R400 million of the housing budget was without their notice top-sliced to do other development, urban upgrade, and that was finance granted from the national department, so we could not perform ... [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: You could not perform ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But we did, we did deliver 111 500 housing opportunities, and that is better than what you delivered in your term of office. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: What? [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Pinocchio!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: Your nose is growing!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We are the only Department of Health in the country with an unqualified audit year-on-year, the only department.

†Ms L BROWN: Yes, and ... [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, no.

†Ms L BROWN: Yes.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Year-on-year, year-on-year. Mr Deputy Speaker, when we took office we had 26 000 staff members in health, because it has been reduced by my predecessor.

†Ms L BROWN: No, no.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Now we have 32 000. [Interjections.] We employed 6 000 more people in the Department of Health.

†Ms L BROWN: Your nose is growing!
The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We deliver services to 5,3 million of the 5,8 population in the Western Cape, which is the highest percentage in the country. We have the highest TB cure rate in the country. We tested a million people during the past four years. It is more than double what you tested in your era. We have increased the number of people on ARVs. What we inherited from you, 16 000. We increased that to over 120 000; 120 000 people.

Mr M C WALTERS: Give! Nice!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We improved the immunisation. We reduced many diseases and I cannot go into the detail of all of this because there are too many to mention, but for instance the mother-to-child transmission rate of HIV ...

Ms L BROWN: We started that, we started that.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You had it at 8% ...

Ms L BROWN: We started that.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We are at 1% ...

Mr P UYS: You know it is not true.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The best in the country, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms L BROWN: We started that!

Mr P UYS: It was not 8%

Ms L BROWN: We started that.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We transport 92% of all ambulance cases within 30 minutes. When I took office it was more than 45 minutes.

An HON MEMBER: That is not true.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the CDU project ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The CDU project, Mr Deputy Speaker ...

Mr P UYS: Yes I started that ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: When we took it over you had dealt with 120 000 prescriptions. Mr Deputy Speaker, we currently do 220 000 prescriptions per month. We more than doubled it.
We have changed and improved the patient experience with the hotline SMS which we have implemented, which gives real time solutions to patient problems within 15 to 20 minutes. We have the best triaging system in the world as I have mentioned during question time. We have employed Ernst & Young to do behavioural modification for us amongst our staff to improve the treatment that our patients have and that they should experience. Mr Deputy Speaker, but there was specific mention by the hon member - what is his name? - Mr Stali, about the public facilities. We have opened more than a 100 new facilities. You did 35 in your era. We have already opened … [Interjections.]

†Mr P UYS: That is not true. You know it is not true.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We have already opened more than 100 facilities over the past four years. You spent R1,1 billion. I have already spent 2,7 billion.

†Mr P UYS: That is not government's money.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You planned R4 billion; you planned R4 billion. I am planning R10 billion. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: The money was … [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We inherited a dysfunctional government. [Interjections.]

†Ms M TINGWE: Oh please!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And a dysfunctional government cannot create economic development and uplift the social economic standards of the people of our province.

†Mr P UYS: And this is what we are going to inherit next year.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: There is, however, one department of which we have a dual responsibility in this province in as far as we have oversight in that regard, and that is in community safety and the SAPS. But, Mr Deputy Speaker, the real responsibility of that department lies with the national government, and if you analyse this government and the activity in this province, that is the only department that is dismally failing the people of the Western Cape. We have improved on everything except on community safety, because SAPS has never ever, and yesterday was the last blow I must say, with Robert McBride that was really the last blow. I must tell you, Mr Deputy Speaker, SAPS cannot sink … [Interjections.]

†Mr P H GEYER: Shame on you!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: SAPS cannot sink any lower.
†Mr H P Geyer: Shame on you!

†The Minister of Health: It cannot sink any lower and what are you doing to socio-economic development if you cannot even guarantee people’s safety ... [Interjections.] ... if you cannot even guarantee people’s safety? [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, what we have done in our government is we have not only - we have not only improved socio-economic standards in this province by outperforming everything as I have mentioned here, we have also redressed the legacy of apartheid, our best and most important objective to rectify. We build our facilities, we are changing the ratio of teachers to pupils. We are changing the ratio of doctors to community. We are improving all those things by redressing. Mitchells Plain Hospital, Mr Deputy Speaker, through you to the Leader of the Opposition, was a hospital that her government stopped. They stopped it. Why? Was it for political reasons? [Interjections.]

†The Deputy Speaker: Order.

†The Minister of Health: My department - it is under my leadership that that hospital project was revived and approved and built in our era and is one of four new hospitals ... [Interjections.]

†Mr P Uys: It is not true.

†The Minister of Health: ... with which you had nothing to do. [Interjections.]

†Ms L Brown: Show me where?

†The Deputy Speaker: Order! Minister Botha, your time has expired. [Interjections.] Order! Is there a point of order?

†Mr M G E Wiley: It is a point of order. Mr Deputy Speaker, the Leader of the Opposition says that the hon Minister Botha lied, and it is on top of the fact that constantly from the other side there is an allusion to lying by saying he is a Pinocchio, which is totally unacceptable in parliamentary rules.

†The Deputy Speaker: Yes, the second one I had my own doubts about, but I let it go, but the reference to lying, I did not hear. Did the hon member say that?

†Hon Members: Yes.

†The Deputy Speaker: That must be withdrawn please.

†An Hon Member: Absolutely!

†Ms L Brown: Mr Deputy Speaker, I said ... [Interjections.]

†An Hon Member: Just withdraw. [Interjections.]

†An Hon Member: Hey, do not shout.
†Ms L BROWN: If you are rude to me one more time… [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order please. Get to the point. I was asking whether you used … [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: If you are rude to me one more time! Shut up, you!

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon leader. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: Sit down! And I did say shut up, you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, Mr Speaker.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you say that? Did you say you withdraw?

†Ms L BROWN: Sorry?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you withdraw that?

†Ms L BROWN: Did I withdraw what, Sir?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The fact that you said “lie”.

†Ms L BROWN: I did say he is lying.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then that must be withdrawn.

†Ms L BROWN: And I withdraw it.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We can continue. Hon member Mr Wiley.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, a direct threat has been made against me. That is also unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: I would like to address you on the matter. A direct threat for a black woman living in South Africa is when a white man screams at her and says: “Speak.”

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†Ms L BROWN: That is a direct threat. So I am asking you to ask him not to threaten me!

†An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Order! [Interjections.] Order! Order! Please calm down. Please calm down. Hon member Mr Wiley, I did not see that. I did not hear that, but please tone down. [Interjections.]
I was actually on the point of giving the floor to the new speaker, hon member Mr Haskin. I am not going to rule on that one.

†Mr M G E Wiley: I do not want you to rule on it. I would like to defend myself. You have just … [Interjections.]

†An Hon Member: No you cannot … [Interjections.]

†Mr M G E Wiley: You have just … [Interjections.] With all due respect, Mr Deputy Speaker, you just accepted that what she said is the truth. It is not the truth.

†The Deputy Speaker: I did not say that. I asked the House to calm down, because I am not going to allow these accusations across the floor while we had a decent debate up to now. Please tone down the personal reflections upon one another and concentrate on the very important topic before us.

†Mr M G E Wiley: Yes. [Interjections.]

†The Deputy Speaker: And please, hon member Mr Haskin, you can have the floor.

†Mr G C R Haskin: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is easy and tempting to spew out statistics to demonstrate that socio-economic conditions in the Western Cape have either improved or not since the DA has been in power. The ACDP does not want to participate in this, primarily when it denies the plight of the majority of our people who find themselves languishing in poverty due mainly to unemployment and inequality and the lingering affects of apartheid. The reality is that the Western Cape and Cape Town in particular has been the beneficiary of government development for multiple generations. Socio-economic conditions in the Western Cape are always clearly better than the rest of South Africa. They have been for generations and they will be for generations; pre-1994 and since, and in particular whether the ANC or the DA has been in power or not.

†Ms M Tingwe: Yes.

†Mr G C R Haskin: Therefore it is disingenuous for parties to now take credit for this beneficiation, although of course we do recognise the successes of governance and delivery by both the ANC and the DA whilst they have been in government. Undeniably we all know that this beneficiation has had a significant impact on generations of citizens … [Interjections.] … whose access to and reliance on public infrastructure and increased economic and lifestyle opportunities and whose ability to springboard these for a better life have exceeded those in the other provinces, but much more still needs to be done. The apartheid legacy continues to exist in and to affect all of life. Few people can escape its impact, but too many people choose to ignore the reality.
I wish to raise two concerns in this debate. The Blikkiesdorp temporary relocation area was set up well over five years ago and was meant to be temporary, but it has become permanent. Instead of emptying and closing it, it has been further populated. Conditions started off mild to okay but they are now appalling and worsening. For them - for the thousands of people who live in Blikkiesdorp temporary relocation area - their socio-economic conditions and outlook have worsened significantly. We continue to call for the relocation of all those families and for the closure of Blikkiesdorp. It should be an embarrassment to any government. The ACDP remains concerned at the City of Cape Town’s concerted efforts to continually raise municipal rates and tariffs to near unaffordable levels … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please finish off.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: The ACDP has repeatedly called for a 0% rate increase and further rates rebates to help secure our people’s dwellings, but these fall on deaf ears. [Time expired.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. Thank you hon member Mr Haskin. [Interjections.] I see the hon member Ms Bevu.

†Ms T N BEVU: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Botha, you cannot compare Buffalo City with the City of Cape Town; you really cannot.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I beg your pardon?

†Ms L BROWN: No!

†Ms T N BEVU: You cannot compare Buffalo City of the Eastern Cape with the City of Cape Town in the Western Cape, you cannot.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I did not.

†Ms T N BEVU: You did, you did.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I did not.

†Ms T N BEVU: You did!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I did not.

†Ms T N BEVU: We have in the past demonstrated that poor people’s living conditions in the Western Cape are worse than the national average. Poor people since 2010 have experienced a lessening growth spending income in this province. As a result, there is a larger increase in the poverty gap in the Western Cape than at national level. [Interjections.]

We said this leaves us with only one conclusion. That is that the trajectory of economic growth in this province is against the poor majority, which is why inequalities are growing at an alarming rate.
Worse, there is evidence to show that the current economic trajectory is not just a random consequence of market forces; it is the deliberate actions of DA government to defend and continue the apartheid generational advantages in the Western Cape.

To demonstrate what we meant we used data from Census 2011 for Cape Town’s 132 suburbs. Take a working age population greater than 5000 and you will discover that even though the Western Cape prides itself for having the lowest unemployment rate, which is still too high in global rates in the country, it also has the highest unemployment rate in poor areas. The deceptive low average is reached because of Cape Town’s highly affluent areas that virtually have no unemployment rate. For example in Sonstraal Heights and Rondebosch the unemployment percentage is around 3%, whilst in places like New Crossroads and Kosovo it is around 51%, which is the highest unemployment rate in the country.

We believe this status quo is deliberately being kept in this manner by the DA government that does everything in its power to develop the CBDs and affluent areas of the province, but turns its back on the poor areas that are predominantly black.

The DA refuses to meaningfully invest in informal sector business, to start public sector initiatives that are run by and for the benefit of people living in these areas. Even the EDP has become just another club for old white boys with brown window dressing here and there. It does nothing for the poor areas. In fact, it marginalises them further. Instead the DA government chooses to downplay our socio-economic realities that are the major legacy of apartheid in order to “cosy-up” to white big business.

This was demonstrated by the recent U turn they made in supporting the Employment Equity Act Amendment Bill.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Ah, come on!

†Ms T N BEVU: Also, the DA deliberately chooses not to fulfil its constitutional mandate of providing people with decent human settlement. Its record of housing delivery is pathetic. For what? To satisfy elitist tendencies that are ultimately designed to exclude the poor from any meaningful participation in the economic life of this country. You can come with all sorts of sophisticated arguments about how the Department of Human Settlements is not just about providing houses to people. The truth of the matter is that it has failed in its core responsibility, which is providing decent living space for our people, which includes serviced sites that the DA was talking about when we started in this legislature.

The department lowered its target to a ridiculous number of 5000 units per year for the whole province and still failed to deliver even that. Meantime the MEC himself has said the backlog was around 500 000 for the province, and you are going to tell us this is not deliberate sabotage and neglect of black poor people in this province?
All the social cluster departments are failing. Why? Because they are chiefly responsible for servicing the poor and the DA could not be bothered. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Ms Magwaza.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, whilst the DA claims to govern a Western Cape where opportunities are open to all, we have seen that since they came into power the vulnerable have been shut out of this so-called “open opportunity society”. Our vulnerable youth are victims of crime in the townships, the ill have no access to private healthcare, the homeless and women in poor communities are disempowered by the DA-led provincial government. Their social conditions have regressed since the DA came to power.

In one of the most violent provinces in the country where gangsterism reigns supreme, where 68 women are sexually violated per day and in which one in five children are addicted to tik, MEC Plato reduces CPFs to oversight committees. MEC Fritz oversees the taking away of funds from NGOs like Nicro and many others. The amount of drugs and alcohol being peddled from council property across the Cape Flats is further proof of the incompetence of the DA. Drug lords dictate their own terms and our people are innocent victims of the DA’s inability to effectively deal with the social ills of the communities.

It is ridiculous that the DA-led provincial government chooses to close down the Ottery Youth Centre. Instead they keep the Horizon Youth Centre open.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is still open. It is still open.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Shut up! Sorry, sorry, sorry. I am sorry. I am sorry.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just withdraw that.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Yes, I withdraw. Sorry.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, carry on.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: But you shout at me, man! Recently! [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, you will get your chance.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Yes!

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, the hon Minister Fritz will get his chance.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Recently residents of Cape Town were shocked following revelations of torture at Horizon Youth Centre. The DA’s public denial of these facts was laid bare when a senior magistrate removed the two boys from the Horizon Youth Centre and placed them in the Ottery Youth Centre and education centre for their own safety.
The irony of this sordid affair is that the DA intends closing down the 67 hectare Ottery Centre at the end of 2013 while propping up the Horizon Youth Centre with millions of rands of wasted taxpayers’ money.

Why close down the Ottery Centre if this state asset already exists with infrastructure, grounds and staff? Who are the new owners of the prime piece of the state land in Ottery? What is their connection to the DA-led provincial government and why is this sale taking place before the 2014 elections? I am asking.

Instead of assisting the NGOs with adhering to financial reporting criteria, which the ANC will do when it governs the Western Cape, this DA government takes away funding from those, from them, because in their view they feign intent of financial reporting. Instead Minister Fritz wastes his department’s money on paying the salary of the head of department, who is Enoch Richardson, whilst he is not playing the role of HOD and playing the acting HOD.

The black majority in this province are forced to utilise public healthcare, which is not on the level of private healthcare, which the white minority are accustomed to. The DA is not radically transforming this tardy balance. The elderly continue to experience medicine dispensing chaos at the Hanover Park day hospital as has been exposed in the media, with long waiting times. When the hon member Mr Skwatsha raised these issues around Hanover Park in this House, MEC Botha dismissed the claims. Now due to gang violence the DA wants to relocate the hospital away from Hanover Park. There is no concrete plan to address the high rate of teenage pregnancies. Instead Zille focuses on lottery prizes for girls who do not fall pregnant. The DA has turned back the clock on the ANC’s healthcare gains in the Western Cape. When the ANC led national government sought to ensure equal quality healthcare through their introduction of the NHI, emphasising a publicly funded medical aid, the DA opposed it. They tell us that the private medical aid companies and private hospitals will suffer. For the homeless people of the province life has become a constant nightmare under the DA. No less than 42 homeless people have died on the streets of Wynberg alone. Has the DA investigated this tragedy? No!

Instead Minister Fritz has the audacity to say that the people of the Western Cape must make life uncontrollable for people living on the streets by not giving money to beggars. This heartless approach fails to recognise that homelessness requires a multi-pronged approach.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Finish your last sentence please. Your time has expired.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: The DA has lurched from one failure to the next with regard to the most vulnerable in our province and it is time for them to be removed from political power. I thank you. [Time expired.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has now expired. Hon MEC Fritz.
I want to start off by saying that the ANC is always accusing the DA of neglecting the needs of especially poor people in the Western Cape. This is the usual banter and propaganda which they repeat over and over again, and we know in history Joseph Goebbels, Hitler’s propaganda Minister in Nazi Germany, said: “If you repeat a lie often enough people will believe it and you will even come to believe it yourself”, and so I can only assume that this is what the ANC is trying to do by repeating the blatant lie. Like Ottery is a blatant lie, Mr Deputy Speaker. We are not - who said we are closing Ottery and who is getting Ottery? That is a blatant lie and they start to believe it. That is the problem with my hon colleague.

How ironic is it, and it is even more ironic when these allegations are tested by official structures that publish scorecards and yardsticks with which to measure progress in various provinces because we must compare with something. We cannot compare with Robben Island. We must compare with another province, and when we do the comparisons, Mr Deputy Speaker, let us give you some of the examples.

The financial and fiscal commission in the submission for the division of revenue in 2014/15 found that the Western Cape Department of Social Development spends the biggest portion of its budget, which is 68%, on transport payment to NGOs, more than any other province in this country. And then the hon member comes to this House and blatantly tells a lie about it. The department also ensures exceptional value for money. I want to repeat that, they ensure exceptional value for money, as no-one can run away and steal money.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Order! Order! You cannot say that she told a blatant lie.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I withdraw. I withdraw.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: These NGOs are rendering services in our most vulnerable communities and most poor communities, not in Constantia, and this is the other myth that they continue to tell here in this House.

Childcare and protection is a major focus in this department. We fund over 1060 ECD centres across the province and are currently also working on 800 unregistered facilities to help them to comply with norms and standards as directed by the Children’s Act. These facilities are in our poorer communities. Mainly, and because we understand the consequences of limited resources, we are going out of our way to assist and upgrade these facilities. We also train over 800 ECD practitioners to actually get quality education into our ECDs.
Nearly 100 000 children across the Western Cape benefit from safety nets created by these ECDs, but it does not stop there. This is also job creation to more than a thousand people. This is job creation. It is an income for people in the poorer areas, and this is the point that we want to emphasise.

We also place between 2200 and 2500 children in foster care every year, and not only does this result in better living conditions for many children but it adds to the household income in many of those foster care homes. The foster care grant helps with the income and the impact in that house. Since 2010 we have diverted nearly 10 000 children and over 16 000 adults away from the criminal justice system to alternative sentencing and through our diversion programmes.

It is so interesting, Mr Deputy Speaker - the former MEC that gave Bosasa the Horizon contract that we now have to manage because it is their buddies, it is their friends who get the contracts. Bosasa is one of their very, very best friends, and therefore we now have to manage it. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order! Order! There is a point of order.

†Ms L BROWN: I mean he accuses the previous MEC hon member Ms Magwaza of giving contracts to her buddies. I do not think that is right. You cannot make an accusation like that here because then I can make accusations about you too, which I want to.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, are you going to help us?

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I withdraw that.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Victim empowerment, the hon member was talking about it earlier. Victim empowerment has also seen a major boost under the DA run Western Cape government. This year's budget alone of R18 million is literally double from last year and it is massively triple from when we came into this province, where they did nothing about it, and then they point fingers and this is the joke about this debate.

We have increased the youth development budget from R2 million to R30 million in this province. We have written ... [Interjections.] ... and we have just finalised a phenomenal programme on youth development, specifically as it pertains to the needs of those young people not in employment, education or training. This year alone we have absorbed nearly 700 young people in extended public works programmes in our programme.

These young people are now able to contribute financially to their households, which in turn has a direct positive result on the entire family. These are some of the practical points. It is not mythical issues. It is not assumptions. These are factual issues that I am raising here.
The other programme - our favourite programme which I know my hon friend and comrade hon member Ms Magwaza- the Chrysalis Academy, have now placed over 600 young people into work opportunities. These are practical things.

*We don't talk – we act!

†Facta non verba - in Latin for you!

Let us also look at a matter that is close to the heart of this province and to most and every parent sitting here. The children of this side, they do not go to private schools, they go to the school nearest to them. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: Which is in Gugulethu.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The state of our education system, a system that attracts over 15 000 learners from other areas: I do not even want to mention it, but people are fleeing those areas because of poor education. They come to the Western Cape where there is good quality education, and so let us unpack that. We have reduced the number of underperforming schools from 85 to 26, but to them it was okay. Teachers could just do what they wanted to. They strike, forgetting about the teaching. That is what they have been doing. The average national senior certificate pass rate in our poorest schools in Quintile 1 to 3 increased, Mr Deputy Speaker, it increased from 56,9% in 2009 while they were in government to 70,9% in 2012. Those are tangible measurable results, and this is what they cannot get away from.

The national senior certificate pass rate has increased from 75% in 2009 to 82,9% in 2012. There has been an increase in a number of candidates writing the national senior certificate. Over 430 000 learners receive lunch every day at school, every single day, and she is saying we have taken away. So hon member Ms Magwaza with respect, please listen to this, please pay attention to what we are saying.

In last three years the DA-run Western Cape government have allocated the highest amount in the country for provision of fee compensation to cover some of the cost of poorer learners - the highest in the whole country, and the hon member is saying: “We do not care for the poor.” What a dismal refrain. We perform better than any other province in the annual national assessments and they know it. That is why people are deserting schools in the Eastern Cape to come here. The Western Cape Education Department is well ahead of any other province in terms of textbook provisions.

*We know Limpopo. We heard what happened.

†Limpopo collapsed. That is the point. They stole the money of the books and this does not happen in this province [Interjections.] Telematics - since the success of the telematics pilot in 2009 the programme has continued to expand year-on-year in the Western Cape, and today a total of 146 schools across the province receive broadcasts. We are now even broadcasting to the Free State and to the Northern Cape.
Even they are using the telematics programme, and this is the point. Let us help. Let us produce. Let us assist, hon member Mr Skwatsha. Let us give to everyone. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to finally say, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we need to - everyone spoke about the open opportunity - practically illustrate today that it is an open opportunity society where - and for all, not for any colour, for all that will make and save this country. Everyone spoke so eloquently about the EE but they do not say that part of the provision says that national demographics will be applied in the Western Cape. They do not say that, because they know. No-one will vote for them if they say that. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] I see the hon Minister Plato.

°The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Oh my goodness! Mr Speaker neglected to keep my eye on the debate now.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato, going, going, gone.
°Then I see the hon member Mr Magaxa.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Skewed development patterns are inherent to the DA racist and liberal ideology. The contradictions of this ideology are currently playing themselves out in the DA’s embarrassing internal fallout around the Broad-Based Black Economic and Employment Empowerment Equity Bill.

In its attempt to maintain their traditionally white racist support base they attract naïve Africans like Minister Madikizela. The DA seems not to know if it must support transformation on the surface or remain stuck in its reactionary approach that insists on maintaining the racism status quo. When the ANC governed the Western Cape the number of houses built increased every year. However the number of houses built has actually decreased every year since the DA took over in 2009. It is a shame that a province that has always been advantaged even before 1994 has a major housing backlog.

In the Western Cape in 1996, 82% of the population already lived in formal housing. This declined to 80,2% by 2011. By comparison, Gauteng which experienced a 10% greater increase in population than the Western Cape in the same period, increased access to formal housing from 74,8% to 79,8% The actual number of houses built in Gauteng is far higher given that their population is more than double of the Western Cape. Instead of building houses for our people, making land available for building of houses, the DA wastes hundreds of thousands of taxpayers’ money to take people to court who wish to make their land available to homeless people.
The uncaring DA dragged Sheikh Abdulla Parker before Judge Desai in the High Court as he had provided accommodation for about 500 homeless people on his own land, dubbed “Jim se Bos” in Philippi. According to court papers the DA claimed that property was being used as an illegal dump and was a fire hazard. Judge Desai ruled that Parker was the sort of gentleman that should never appear before a court, and accused the provincial government of choosing to deal with the dispute in a very illegal way. The taxpayers’ money was illegally squandered by MEC Bredell on this court case.

Why are our people not being accommodated on the open urban spaces lying unused all over the Peninsula? In June 2006, when Mayor Helen Zille promised to accommodate backyard dwellers from Parkwood in Pelican Park whilst standing on an open piece of state land in the leafy suburb of Fairways. The truth is that those people are still waiting on Zille to make good on her promise. The land in Fairways, the size of about eight rugby fields, remains barren. In February this year the houses of fourteen black families were damaged by fire that destroyed most of their belongings. Despite residents having proved that a faulty cable from electric poles caused the fire the DA led City of Cape Town has still not compensated them. According to the 2011 census the Western Cape is not the province with the highest percentage of household with access to flush toilets. That is the fact. Under the DA we are also amongst the provinces with the highest percentage of bucket toilets.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Then which province has the highest?

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, it smacks of hypocrisy for the City of Cape Town to speedily roll out eight new MyCiTi routes in predominantly white and upper class areas whilst continuing to delay the MyCiTi service to the Cape Flats. The MyCiTi N2 express route link to Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha with the City Centre was meant to be rolled out in December this year. Unfortunately the City says it will only be rolled out in July. No delays are experienced when MyCiTi is rolled out in white areas. These excuses were not made for the Milnerton roll-out. Millions are being spent to subsidise routes where most home owners have cars. It is in this context of a DA imposed unequal society that the Western Cape, which is one of South Africa’s richest provinces, dominates the headlines for public unrest. Even today there were marches. There were two marches here. Whilst we condemn the looting that took place in the city centre last month we are clear that the DA-led Western Cape government treats our people with utter contempt.

The DA’s refusal to accept the memorandum with thousands of protestors’ service delivery demands, is an insult to the poor of this province. The DA failed to send a senior elected public representative to receive a memorandum from the people. They have instead tainted a known partisan civil servant, the legislative secretary, Royston Hindley, by sending him to accept the memorandum on behalf of the DA government. The people’s memorandum was addressed to the government and not to the legislature. Zille must tell us when she ever had the decency to receive a memorandum from the poor protestors. Instead even today she has treated public representatives with disdain by not being present in this important debate.
Unfortunately, Mr Deputy Speaker, the people of the Western Cape are beginning to see who this unprincipled DA really is. The DA support days has been dropping during bi-elections since 2011 across the province. Our people are … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Your last sentence please.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Can I finish, Mr Deputy Speaker? Our people are heralding in the ANC-led government in the Western Cape that listens to our people’s demands and seriously engage them, as it was. The ANC will always subsidise houses for people who do not qualify … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Let me finish the sentence. [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have given you time. Order! No! Your time has expired. I see the Minister of Finance, Minister Winde.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think first of all the question on the Order Paper asked by the hon member Ms Brown, the socio-economic state of the province since the DA took over, I think in short – is in a much better state. But let us get into this discussion and this debate and I think first of all I want to start off by asking can we trust and believe what we have been told from that side of the House. I will get back to that just now - can we trust and believe?

Before I get there I think there has been much said about investment, specifically in poor areas. You know that we have upped the infrastructure spend by three times in this province from what we inherited when we took over from this ANC.

It was interesting when we opened the Mitchells Plain Hospital just the other day. There was a row of empty seats, but cleverly those people that had RSVPd and said they are coming, their names were written on the seats. It was interesting that it was … [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: We were not invited.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It was the hon member Mr Skwatsha’s name that was sitting on the seat. [Interjections.] It was the ANC members who did not pitch to the launch of this infrastructure built in the middle of the area. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order! Is that a point of order?

*Mr M NCEDANA: Yes, Mr Speaker. It is a point of order. Referring to the statement made regarding empty chairs, were we invited?

†Ms M TINGWE: Yes. Yes.
†An HON MEMBER: That is true. We were not invited.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I cannot answer that question. The Minister must please continue. That is a question of invitations.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I trust, Mr Deputy Speaker, that this is going to obviously not count into my time.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Of course it is. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The next thing is, let us talk about infrastructure. I remind this House again of that hospital. You can go to any private hospital in the city in this country and in the world and then go and visit the Mitchells Plain Hospital. It is better than any private hospital - and they laugh. It is obviously because he has not been there. [Interjections.] I dare him to go and have a look. It is better than any private sector hospital I have ever been to across the world. [Interjections.] Then let us have a look at, and perhaps while I am talking about infrastructure spend, when last - you have not been to that hospital. I dare you to go. When last have you been to Harare in Khayelitsha and had a look at the nearly R1 billion that has been spent there and seeing the difference that it has made? Go and have a look at the police stats on the 11% decrease in crime that is happening in Harare in Khayelitsha, because of the investment of money that is being put into that space. What this side of the House is saying, nothing happens in those areas, in that infrastructure spend … [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: And what about the … [Inaudible.] … in Khayelitsha?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: … and the whole time this side of the House - we heard from the hon member Mr Magaxa that he was talking about the service delivery protest. Have a look at every single time there is a service delivery protest whether there is an elected ANC public representative or if there is an ANC head of a branch or a structure that is standing in the front of that service delivery strike, every single time. [Interjections.]

At the same time have a look at the R4 million that the Minister of Agriculture gave to Nosey Pietersen to ramp up the strikes in that space. Look at what happened at the IDZ and the 3 000 food parcels that were handed out. Those same ANC leaders of those branches were trucked in from across the province again ... [Interjections.] Look at the cuts in the flights. Every time they do these things to try and slow down economic growth in this province, we will show them we will turn it around. [Interjections.]

But let us have a look at - I am not going to repeat the stats that the hon Minister Botha spoke about, the 99%, the 91% and all of those kind of high percentages that this province gets rated at - the 1% that he left out. You have to look at some of the service delivery in some of the parts of this province, especially in conjunction with infrastructure spend. There is a town in this country that has had huge infrastructure spend, huge, and it looks like it is going to get billions more.
But the service delivery level provided to the residents of that town is only 32%. That is Nkandla - 32% is the service delivery to the people that live in that town, except this huge infrastructure spend was only spent in one space.

When the hon Leader of the Opposition talks about the ... [Interjections.] ... how it has changed in the province ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... what we should look at ... [Interjections.] ... is the key measurement. It is called the Gini coefficient. Have a look at the Gini coefficient. Have a look at the Gini coefficient of Johannesburg - the worst, then followed by East London, then followed by the East Rand, then followed by Pretoria, then followed by Port Elizabeth [Interjections.], then followed by Durban, and the best in South Africa, Cape Town. It shifted over the years, and you go and have a look at that and that is the best measurement to go and check. But perhaps what you should also go and have a look at over time is the graph that shows South Africa - do you see this one rising up here, that is South Africa. Go and have a look. Go and have a look at this one. This is Brazil and benchmark yourselves against these countries. South Africa has progressively since 1999 just got worse and worse and worse every single year - the worst in the world. Unacceptable!

The hon Minister Fritz spoke about pupils fleeing under-par Eastern Cape schools. [Interjections.] So obviously there are things that are being done in this province that are making a difference, and that is why people are coming here. In the last four years since this government has taken over 309 000 people - the hon member started talking about economic development and where we are intervening - 309 000 people in the last four years in this province have received some skill training, 309 000. Seven times more than when you were in government, seven times more than when you were in government. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†Ms L BROWN: As long as you ... [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: If you have a look at foreign direct investment, which is a really interesting indicator, the FDI South Africa has decreased. In 2008 it was R100,291 billion. Then Jacob Zuma took over. Last year it was R1,673 billion. Look at that drop. Go and have a look at what happened there and then ask yourselves those same questions about what you are doing. I am not going to talk about the MPATs and the Saica measurements - all of those things are measurements across the board that are showing what is happening.

But let me come back to whether we can trust what is being said on this side of the House and whether we can believe what is being said from this side of the House. You would have all seen of late that there are some billboards being put up illegally, against the law, in schools. This party is putting up things against the law. I mean that is just totally unacceptable.
How can you trust a party that breaks the law? [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Minister, order. [Interjections.] Order! Order! There are too many conversations going on quite apart from what the hon Minister is saying. I am looking at the hon member Ms Hani and the hon member Ms Bevu. Please calm down, and there are others as well. Give the Minister a chance to speak in silence.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But then let us have a look at what they are saying on these posters, and it is very interesting. I have just seen an article that is being released by Africa Check and Africa Check says: “Question the detail.” So first of all you break the law by putting up a poster.

The second thing you do is you do not tell the truth about what is on the poster. So you say on this one - 1994, 5 million people had access to sanitation. Your speech had a lot to do with sanitation. Here you say 2013, 41 million people have access to sanitation.

Africa Check asks the question: “how on earth since census 2011 have you delivered 12,7 million accesses to sanitation between census 2011 and when you put up this poster?” Impossible! So where is the truth and how can we believe what you are saying on your posters that you are erecting? How can we believe what you are saying in the debate today? [Interjections.] You need to clarify and put your facts in place before you go and do things like that.

You also talk about household electricity provision. [Interjections.] It is quite interesting that electricity is being delivered to 20 000 households. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... electricity is being delivered to 20 000 households at this moment. Specifically in Philippi, Khayelitsha, Blue Downs, Mfuleni, Dunoon and Atlantis from Eskom that are being facilitated by the City. We had a discussion with Eskom the other day and they actually wanted to understand this process of how we do it, the only place in the whole of South Africa where Eskom and the municipality are actually working together to deliver electricity connections to households. In other parts, in other informal settlements across the country it does not happen anywhere. 20 000 happening right here in the City in the space that this whole debate on this side of the House says nothing happens where this government is involved in specifically poorer areas. That is informal settlements.

Then if you look at the same poster that I am talking about, let us have a look at what the Western Cape census says happened between 2001 and 2011 in respect of electricity: 93,4% of households now have electricity, the highest in South Africa; the highest in South Africa coming from 88% to 93,4%.
Let us also perhaps talk about this - the honesty, etc around this billboard and perhaps one other point that I have raised in the House. I know that the hon member Ms Brown is going to be speaking after me, so perhaps she can clarify the ANC’s position on the detail on these posters and whether it is true or not, or why it is being checked. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Please!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Perhaps she can also clarify to this House the question that I have asked of this House before. The infrastructure that we are investing in with taxpayers’ money in this space, that private sector invest was still not paid for when the election of that party’s leader in this province took place. How many years ago did Fransman get elected? Three years ago? Three years ago, R1,5 million was still owed to the CTICC.

*An HON MEMBER: That is scandalous!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Something that belongs to the people of this province, something that your party also invested in that sat on the chair of that organisation … [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Pay your things man!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You still have not paid that account. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: Why do you not do something about it!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We have gone to court already and had a court order against you and you still have not paid that account. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What about Golden Arrow? R300,000, and you have not paid that account either. What about the hotels? [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister, order, your time has expired. Your last sentence please.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Will you please answer us on when you are going to pay the accounts for the infrastructure and whether you are telling the truth on these boards or not? [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: I am not listening. I am not listening. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Order! The hon Leader of the Opposition to reply.
†Ms L BROWN: You must know I stopped doing what you have requested me to do now a long time ago and I have not - I do not really take your orders at all. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Maybe you do not have the answer.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, you do not have the answer.

†Ms L BROWN: Let me speak about the facts. I am going to ask the hon Minister Fritz to do himself a favour and read the trial gauge. The trial gauge speaks differently to what you do. We do not spend so much money on the poor children in this province. The facts are that the provincial equitable share grows year-on-year and that is why the budget grows. The budget does not grow because you think it is a good idea for it to grow. The most important thing, Mr Deputy Speaker, is the fact that we live in two worlds. You do not need to go to Nkandla to know that there are poor people. You do not need to go to Nkandla to do it. You can do it right here in your own province. [Interjections.]

Go to Imizamo Yethu on a weekend, any weekend on any day; they do not even collect the rubbish.

†An HON MEMBER: What did you do?

†Ms L BROWN: But go to Hout Bay, which is what the whole area is called, but the Africans live in Imizamo Yethu and the coloureds live in Hangberg. There is nothing happening in those areas. It is not in another province. This is your province. It is in my province. We live in two provinces.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Ms L BROWN: Where you live is different … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Hani.

†Ms L BROWN: ... to where poor people live in this province and that is the difference. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: There are nine provinces.

†Ms L BROWN: Because you think that every class in the school in this province has a 35 to 1 ratio. It is not true. There are children who are more than 50 children in a class. You think that every person has a roof over their heads and every House has a toilet. It is not true. Where people are poor it is not true. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Ms L BROWN: It is not true. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!
†Ms L BROWN: So what I think is more important is the fact that you have only built on basic services year-on-year.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Ms Brown. Your time has expired.

†Ms L BROWN: You have not done 93% of basic services. [Time expired.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. We have come to the end of this debate. That concludes the debate on this subject.

†Ms L BROWN: That is why you never asked us. You know that is not true. [Interjections.]

Debate concluded.

†The SPEAKER: Order hon members. The Orders of the Day. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

ORDERS OF THE DAY


†The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon member Mr Von Brandis.

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I just want to read the report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill, dated 4 September 2013, and it reads as follows:

“That the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill referred to the committee in terms of the Standing Rule 187, reports that the committee supports the principle of the bill.”

I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Haskin, over to you.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The bill before us gives effect to the recommendation of Scopa based on the resolutions of the committee. The reasons for the unauthorised expenditure amounting to R53 million are listed in the bill. Scopa engaged thoroughly with the department on at least two occasions regarding the request for authorisation, looking into the veracity and the desirability of the request, and have acceded to it. The perspective that one should bring to this, to the consideration of this bill, is that the audit outcomes track record of this department is that they have been financially unqualified with findings since 2006/7.
To spend upwards of R14 billion per year it requires the department to spend around R60 million a day of every working day in the year. This unauthorised expenditure bill is R53 million, so what we are talking about here is less than one day’s expenditure of the Department of Health. It should be approved. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, over to you.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Mr Speaker, unauthorised expenditure is expenditure incurred but not budgeted for or it is expenditure incurred contrary to the conditions of a grant from another sphere or organ of state. It is also expenditure not permitted in terms of the Public Finance Management Act, No 1 of 1999.

If unauthorised expenditure for a previous year 2011/12 is only been dealt with now there must have been many problems, but as you have heard Scopa has adequately dealt with that, and we will now discuss what the bill contains.

Against the background that I have just given you now we are now expected to condone and agree to a department that did not do proper planning and forward thinking and was found spending without proper procedures followed and permissions granted. This happened in 2011/12 already and will now be funded via a direct charge to the Provincial Revenue Fund. I am going to stop at two things, but I first want to mention one. What needs to be mentioned is that a standing committee’s duty is to question and interrogate, because that is its oversight role. We are not expected to just rubber-stamp when requests come our way. What was very disconcerting in our standing committee was the arrogance with which the officials came to explain the reasons to Scopa when questioned as to why they needed this money to be condoned. The reason given for unauthorised expenditure would not have been condoned by the DA had the shoe been on the other foot. Health, by its very nature needs to do emergency services and the people who render that service mostly work overtime and at night. Disasters do not ask for a time to happen, but by now the department should know how to plan adequately for the remuneration of these employees.

Another reason given was that machinery that was delivered earlier in that specific year had to be paid for. We still did not get the full reason for the urgency to pay it in that year as opposed to the year in which it was budgeted for. [Interjections.] Instead they caused ... [Interjections.] ... Mr Speaker, is the hon Mr Wiley a speaker on this topic? If not, let him be quiet.

†The SPEAKER: Order, order, order, hon member Mr Wiley, order. [Interjections.]

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes, he thinks so. Instead they caused unauthorised expenditure. Mr Speaker, there was also a long drawn out debate between the province, the Department of Public Works and the City regarding sewerage and utility charges that needed to be paid. That one understands, but I am going to stand still at two reasons and I am going to refer to page 209 of the report of Health for 2011/12.
The one speaks about equipment but the other one speaks about accruals that had to be carried forward to the 2012/13 year that they chose to pay in the 2011/12 year. Then worse, in a further effort to reduce accruals commitments, orders were followed up and paid during March 2012. Now March 2012 was the end of the financial year which then speaks to fiscal dumping. There was money left which they did not know what to do with and that is how they covered it.

This over-expenditure is couched against the fact that there was an over-collection in the Health Department and the over-expenditure would be covered by that. Health is an essential service to the community. One trusts that this kind of fiscal dumping, as is the case with some of these accruals, will not happen again and that those people who sacrifice their lives to work in EMS are properly budgeted for in the future. Thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Minister Botha, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity to speak on this. Firstly, let me say in real terms the shortage or the unauthorised expenditure is actually R32 million not R53 million, because of the savings on other divisions within the department. It reflects 0,3% of the budget of R16 billion. It was mentioned by some of the members that there was no proper planning and that staff were, and the officials were, arrogant. I must say it is for me an indication of a lack of understanding of the department.

The operations of a department the size of the Department of Health is an education. Just to give you an indication, Mr Speaker, on the last Monday of the financial year, we had R190 million in the bank, on the next day R168 million was paid out. Just to give you an indication that was in the last week, so the hon member Ms Beerwinkel is also a bit lost. She says we must budget better, well she is actually meaning we should plan better. There is a difference between a budget and planning, but coming from her I accept that. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, there is another reason why, and the hon member Mr Wiley mentioned it here, from the back. We have a track record in the Department of Health in the Western Cape to pay our invoices in 32 days. I think the average in South Africa is probably 32 months. We pay within in 32 days. We have the minimum accruals and the accruals are a natural consequence, not an unnatural consequence. We do not overspend as with some of the provinces with R3 billion. We also do not run out of medicine in the third month of a new financial year. [Interjections.]

We also do not pay - we are also not a province where doctors and nurses have to wait sometimes six months for salaries, so our planning is actually very good and the execution is very good. The officials were certainly not arrogant. For them it is a very serious matter and our audit outcome indicates that. [Interjections.]
†Ms L BROWN: You were not there.

†The SPEAKER: Order hon member Ms Brown, order.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I want to apologise on behalf of this Parliament to the remark made to the officials, the senior officials of the Department of Health. I am sorry that that was said by a member of this House. I apologise on her behalf. But, Mr Speaker, what is perhaps more interesting to say and to recognise is that in 2003/4, 2004/5, 2005/6, 2006/7, 2007/8 and 2008/9, this was when it was a much smaller budget, much smaller. Our budget is currently R16 billion. That was probably a budget of about R10 billion. R266 million was overspent by the former colleague across the floor. Maybe that is the reason why they have not given him an opportunity to speak on this topic. What is more interesting - it was explained to us and we accepted their explanations at the time as the Opposition because we realised ...

[Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: You were not ... [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, we did not.

†Ms L BROWN: You did!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We realised how important it is and how difficult it is with a department like this. I want to say that the budget, the planning and the execution of the Department of Health in the Western Cape are examples to any Department of Health in South Africa, and I ask you to please approve this. Thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Thank you. Mr Speaker, first of all this is the introduction of unauthorised expenditure. It is not fruitless and it is not wasteful expenditure. It is also, as has been said, the kind of percentage that we are looking at in spend here of R53,741,946.9 million is 0.436% of the total Health budget. It is a very, very small percentage; it was used for the payment of overtime to meet minimum response times of emergency medical services; it was used for the payment of outstanding sewerage and utility charges which were paid after the protracted interaction with the Department of Transport and Public Works, the City of Cape Town, and myself in trying to fix something that we inherited that was a real, real mess of non-payment of rates and taxes to local authorities. It was for the payment of equipment scheduled for payment in 2012/13 that was delivered early. We could not just let these people wait. They delivered it early; we took it, we paid for it, but it was such a very, very small percentage and I am sure that this House can very easily condone this kind of over- expenditure or unauthorised expenditure. It was not foreseen.
You could not budget for it. But I hear what the hon member Ms Beerwinkel says, and she says we have got to plan better, but I ask her in contemplating whether they should vote for this or not and considering that the amount of R50 million is a little bit different from the previous two years when we took office of nearly R90 million which was the … [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: That was forward buying and you know that. That was forward buying.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: … the nearly R90 million was actually … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Brown, order.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: … was actually R89,179 million that this House condoned in exactly the same space under the leadership then of Mr Fransman and the R114,2 million under the leadership the previous year of the hon member Mr Uys, more than double … [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: It was forward buying.

†An HON MEMBER: Can you believe it!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But we are asking this House to condone this. It is not wasteful and fruitless as I said, and I am pretty sure that if I had to say to the hon member that if it was not 0,74%, if it was 25%, then I would have no problem jumping up and down with you and screaming and shouting, because quite frankly on 13 October 2011 for the 2010/11 financial year, 25% in the national Department of Health on irregular expenditure had to be agreed to by the National Assembly, amounting to R5,7 billion. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Brown, order!

†An HON MEMBER: 5,7?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Now, you are talking about how you can vote against this kind of thing, but I think in this space the hon member Ms Beerwinkel must concede that at 0,4%, the kind of money where this was going to, not fruitless, not wasteful, this is the kind of thing that this House can definitely condone. The Health Department runs their systems incredibly well. We make in this government 7 000 payments every day and of course we are going to be put under pressure when three years before you are starting with your budget planning, there are things that are going creep up, but at 0,4%, I have no doubt that this House cannot but support this piece of legislation. Thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order hon member?
*Mr M NCEDANA: Yes, Mr Speaker. I am not sure whether this is point of order but I have a question to ask the hon Minister who mentioned the amount is R32 million not R53 million while we are busy with the bill. [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member.

*I will not speak for hon Minister Botha here ...

†Order.

*The SPEAKER: Sit.

†If there is something ... Order! Can you please put it in black and white to the Minister and then Minister will answer you.

†Mr M NCEDANA: No, no. Mr Speaker, I am clear. We are about to pass the Bill or approve the Bill. Now there are two amounts provided to this House.

†Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

†The SPEAKER: Order. Order!

†Mr M NCEDANA: And that is where the House needs to resolve itself.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member Mr Ncedana. Hon Minister Botha's time has already expired. Do you suppose to pose that question during the ... [Interjections.] Order, during ... [Interjections.] I am not going to be able to answer on behalf of the hon Minister Botha now, or Minister Botha do you want to, order now, order, order.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, may I address you on this?

†The SPEAKER: Order, order, let us start with the hon member Mr Skwatsha.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you. Mr Speaker, I think hon member Mr Ncedana says he might want to support the Bill. He wants to be clear what we are supposed to support because we thought it was a particular amount until hon Minister Botha said no it is not this amount; that is all.

†The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Minister Botha, do you want to give us a ... [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I want to address you on this, but may I just say in addressing you on this that I am experiencing here today something which I have never seen in this Parliament, because what the hon member did, there is no rule that gives him the permission to do what he did, ...

[Interjections.]

†Mr P UYS: But what did you say?

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But what I said and maybe the hon member
Mr Uys will also understand this now. I said that the unauthorised expenditure is this, as in the Bill, but in real terms the net amount of money relates to savings we had in other departments. That does not change the amount that we ask to be approved today.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But the member must at least act as if he knows something.

†The SPEAKER: Order, order, Thank you hon members. I am not going to allow any member now on this subject please. [Interjections.] Hon members! Take your seat, hon member Mr Skwatsha. [Interjections.] Order, hon Minister Botha! Ministers order, members!

That concludes the debate on this Order. On this order hon member Mr Uys, are there any objections to the principle of the Bill being approved?

†HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes. Yes.

†An HON MEMBER: No.

†The SPEAKER: Is it yes? If there is an objection, order. [Interjections.] Order hon members! I put the question, those in favour of the principle of the bill being approved will say “aye”.

†HON MEMBERS: Aye.

†The SPEAKER: And those who are against will say “no”.

†HON MEMBERS: No.

†The SPEAKER: It seems that the ayes have it. We now proceed, hon members. Now for the finalisation of the Bill; are there any objections to the Bill being finalised?

†An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†HON MEMBERS: No!

†The SPEAKER: Is it yes?

†An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†The SPEAKER: Is it yes, hon member Mr Uys?

†An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†The SPEAKER: If that is a yes, I put the question: those in favour of the bill being finalised say “aye”.
†HON MEMBERS: Aye.

†The SPEAKER: And those against will say "no".

†HON MEMBERS: No.

†The SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it. Thank you very much. We now proceed. The secretary will read the Bill.

†The SECRETARY: The *Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill*. Bill finalised.

†The SPEAKER: The Bill will be sent to the Premier for assent. Thank you. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day. Order!

2. Consideration of the report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the *Sectional Titles Amendment Bill [B 11B - 2013] (NCOP)* dated 7 November 2013 (Ratification of final mandate).

†The SPEAKER: The House received a report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the *Sectional Titles Amendment Bill*, conferring the authority of the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification to confirm the authority of the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill?

†HON MEMBERS: No.

†The SPEAKER: No. Thank you. The Secretary will read the third Order of the Day.


†The SPEAKER: I see a speakers list in front of me hon members, I recognise the hon member Mr Von Brandis.

†Mr P UYS: One sentence.

†An HON MEMBER: Please. You must not go and start now.

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you. Mr Speaker, I just want to read the committee report, we must just ensure ourselves, because this is a money bill. Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Development on the *Division of Revenue Amendment Bill*, dated 7 November 2013, as follows: - and it was approved by all members - The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the subject of *Division of Revenue Amendment Bill*, [B 38 - 2013] referred to the committee in terms of Standing Rule 220, recommends that the House confers on the Western Cape delegation (NCOP) the authority to support the bill. Report to be considered.
Hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Say aye.

What is wrong with you?

Thank you, Robin. Mr Speaker, once again the national government has seen it fit to assist provinces to be able to carry out their mandate by allocating additional funding for different purposes. This DA-controlled province which always claims to be this self-sufficient secessionist province was also a recipient but also one that was punished for not spending their allocated funding. The adjusted allocation to this province is as follows … [Interjections.] R52,1 million for improvement of conditions of services.

Ms L Brown: Be careful what you say about the youth.

Ms C F Beerwinkel: 93 … [Interjections.]

Order hon members.

R963,000 for provincial equitable share to assist with the costing related to the improvement of clerical positions and that total was R53,06 million. An increase to the FET colleges of R1,66 million. Disaster allocations to the Western Cape for the repair and maintenance and flood damage amount to the following and these are conditional grants: Agricultural support programme R1,5 million; Provincial road maintenance grant R17,17 million; human settlements grant R1,16 million. However, a new municipal disaster recovery grant was introduced for reconstruction and repair of municipal infrastructure damaged by flood, and even there this province benefited to the tune of R6,688 million divided between Langeberg and Eden, each receiving R0,104 million and R6,5 million respectively. Two very important departments, health and transport and public works were punished for not spending. National Treasury took R15,2 million from health for not spending on their health facility revitalisation programme and R70,2 million from the Department of Public Works for not utilising on their provincial roads maintenance grant.

Ms L Brown: Oh, shocking!

Now, Mr Speaker, if one unpacks these final two departments … [Interjections.] The one where complaints are continuously reported about conditions at facilities and worker conditions then you wonder and you understand why there is this inability to utilise the funds at their disposal for the services to the people who need it most. Road maintenance on the other hand is a job creator. EPWP programmes could have been rolled out, and if you see the conditions of some of the roads in the rural areas then it is a shame that National Treasury needs to take back and rethink the allocation to provinces.
We do, however, thank National Treasury that in spite of the poor delivery here in the Western Cape in certain areas, they still consider the people of this province important enough to allocate more funding for better services and we support them. This is the Western Cape Province, the Western Cape Province.

†The SPEAKER: Order. Hon members order. Hon member Mr Haskin, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Winde, Minister Winde?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Thank you very much. Mr Speaker, this is the kind of Bill that normally this House would not say anything on, but it is quite interesting that the hon member Ms Beerwinkel decides to pick this up. First of all, does she realise that the taxation that gets distributed via the national government comes from this province, the people of this province, all of the people of this province. [Interjections.] They actually pay. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: We know. We know.

†An HON MEMBER: You do not know.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: There is not an ANC ATM machine that Pravin Gordhan takes the money out of.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But you do not know how to spend it.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: I will get to the spending now.

†An HON MEMBER: No.

†An HON MEMBER: Nonsense!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I will get to the spending now, but … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members order. Hon member Mr Skwatsha! Order Hon member Mr Skwatsha!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: I know the hon member Ms Beerwinkel’s colleagues do not want to actually let her hear the truth, but the hon member Ms Beerwinkel needs to hear the truth. 15% of the GDP, 15% of the taxation raised in this country comes from this province, and 9% comes back. [Interjections.] So the people of this province actually subsidise other provinces.
†An HON MEMBER: Yes, subsidising.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The taxpayers of this province. But then let us talk about the over-expenditure or the non-expenditure that is taken back. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order hon members order.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: When 0,2% of our budget is not spent, and this is a policy I absolutely agreed on with the hon Minister Gordhan when I first got into office and we had long debates on it and said that when governments cannot spend then take the money back, but I did not notice the hon member Ms Beerwinkel speaking to us with a loud voice last year when we got R600 million back to this province to build the Asidi Schools that was taken away from other provinces who were not building their schools. She had no word to say about that at all. She only has a word when money gets taken back from this province. Surely her allegiance is to this province, and she should be saying you know this is where my support lies. [Interjections.] But, Mr Speaker, I think that in the Division of Revenue Bill, the money that is going to the support for those areas that has suffered damage for floods, the money that we have heard about and where all the money is going to, we support this division of revenue. We thank you very much that this is on the table and I think that it has been heard from the committee report that even the hon member Ms Beerwinkel supported it in the committee.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Of course it is a great ... [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, hon members order, order. Hon member Ms Brown, order! The House has received a report from the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill conferring the authority of the Western Cape conferring the authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of the authority of the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill?

†HON MEMBERS: No.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon members. That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:03.
The Speaker:


The Standing Committee on Local Government, having considered the Annual Report of the Department of Local Government for the year ended 31 March 2013 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

**A. Introduction**

The annual report programme for the 2012/2013 financial year was advertised in newspapers, inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions. Invitations were also extended to all municipalities in the Province.

Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Minister and the Head of Department were given an opportunity to make opening remarks.

Members of the Committee deliberated on Part A: General Information, Part B: Departmental Programme Performance and Part D: Human Resource Management of the Department’s Annual Report. Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions or to make inputs during the discussions.

**B. Oversight Report on the Department**

(a) **Overview**

There is currently a memorandum of understanding (MOU) in place between the Department and Provincial Treasury that specifies their respective responsibilities with regards to supporting and monitoring municipalities in relation to the prescriptions of the Municipal Finance Management Act, 2003 (Act 56 of 2003).

Municipalities who do not spend their Municipal Infrastructure Grant (MIG) funding for a particular financial year have to apply to National Treasury for a roll-over. The Department has put in place a number of support measures to ensure that municipalities are able to effectively utilise their MIG funding. These measures include:
(i) assistance with the development of detailed implementation plans;
(ii) assistance with the appraisal and registration of projects; and
(iii) advice on compliance to the conditions of the grant.

To assist municipalities with prescriptions of the Municipal Structures Act, 1998 (Act 11 of 1998), the Department is undertaking a codification project that will allow municipalities to code its by-laws as promulgated. The Department also provides municipalities with draft repeal by-laws where this is necessary.

The Department has placed the process of repealing redundant provincial ordinances in its draft Annual Performance Plan (APP) for 2014/2015.

The Department becomes involved in court cases where a municipality is the respondent and the outcomes of the court case could potentially affect other municipalities. One such example is the Bergriver Municipality case, where if the applicants had been successful, the outcomes would mean that rate-payers could withhold their property rates. This would have far reaching implications for all municipalities across the Province.

The Disaster Management Act, 2002 (Act 57 of 2002) mandates the Department to coordinate responses to disaster incidents when there is the risk of disruption to services. It is under this mandate that the Department was involved in the farm worker protests in the Cape Winelands as it was responsible for coordinating the responses of provincial departments.

The Department has developed a Ward Committee Accountability and Communication Model that outlines guidelines for ensuring that discussions at ward committees are communicated to the Municipal Council and that the ward committees are subsequently provided with feedback on matters discussed.

(b) Findings/Concerns

(i) In the event that the Provincial Disaster Management Centre (PDMC) is inoperable, the Province is able to utilise the City of Cape Town disaster management resources located at the Goodwood Disaster Management Centre, and the civic centre as well as the provincial mobile unit. Even in various remote locations, the Department is still able to access all the information linked to the PDMC as the information is network based;
(ii) The PDMC is able to provide all information which it generates to all District Disaster Management Centres, even though the City of Cape Town is using a different information management system;

(iii) Theewaterskloof Municipality could not spend its allocated MIG during the year under review as the contractor used in the construction of the Grabouw Treatment Works could not complete the project on schedule as a result of bankruptcy. The funding was consequently rolled over to the next financial year and utilised. All of the MIG funding allocated to municipalities have therefore been utilised;

(iii) The City of Cape Town Council has passed the Community Development Worker (CDW) implementation protocol;

(v) There are shared services projects underway in two districts namely the West Coast District (legal services) and Central Karoo District (legal services and internal auditing and risk management). These shared services are provided following the conclusion of service level agreements between the participating municipalities and the service provider;

(vi) The Department facilitated the completion of a MOU between Cape Winelands District Municipality and the Department of Transport and Public Works with regards to renovations required at the Worcester Regional Hospital before the Cape Winelands Disaster Management Centre can become functional. The Municipality is in the process of procuring furniture and ICT equipment and the centre anticipates accessing their allocated area within the hospital in mid-November, 2013;

(vii) Less than 16% of the 26 107 Community Development Worker (CDW) case referrals have been resolved and the Department has undertaken to put measures in place to improve the turn-around time for the conclusion of these cases;

(viii) The vacancy rate of 9% is in fact 7.5%, as contract workers have been appointed in the vacant posts until such a time that the process of appointing permanent staff have been concluded;

(ix) The Department has not yet been able to implement the LOGIS system for assets and is utilising a manual system that has undergone verification by the Auditor General. The delay in moving to the LOGIS system is as a result of the fact that when the departments split, duplicate assets were captured on the asset register. The Department is ready to migrate from the the manual system to LOGIS but is awaiting confirmation from National Treasury that they may proceed;
(x) The Department was only able to provide financial support to four municipalities for the implementation of the compliance model as a result of the fact that the lowest tender bid for the completion of the project was R2million, an amount substantially more than the Department had budgeted for;

(xi) The Department is assisting with the transfer of the Uilenkraalsmond Resort from the National Department of Public Works to the Overberg District Municipality. The Department held engagements with residents in the resort and the Overstrand municipality that provides services to the resort. The transfer might however have a negative impact on the assets to liabilities ratio for the District Municipality as it is unlikely that they will generate an income from the resort;

(xii) The Department did not have the capacity to assess municipalities on the state of ICT as required by the national indicator. The Department subsequently applied to Provincial Treasury for additional funding to enable it to develop the necessary capacity. A Provincial ICT support Committee for municipalities, consisting of municipal ICT managers and department officials, was consequently established. This committee meets on a quarterly basis to discuss ICT related matters;

(xiii) Donors appoint service providers directly based on specifications from the Department. Donor funds are therefore transferred directly to the service provider and not via the Department. In this manner the funds utilised do not go through a proper auditing process by the Auditor-General; and

(xiv) The Department does not have access to the national PERSAL database that would allow it to assist municipalities to verify that potential service providers are not government employees.

(c) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that the Department brief the Committee in February 2014 on the progress:

(i) of the Provincial ICT Support Committee for municipalities; and

(ii) regarding the migration from the manual assets management system to the LOGIS system.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

1. That the Department of Local Government provides the Committee with the following documents by 30 November 2013:
(i) The Ward Committee Accountability and Communication Model;
(ii) The total number of posts considered to be critical at a municipal level to allow the Committee to make a comparison with the actual achievement of 17 for indicator 2: Number of municipalities with all critical posts under sub programme 2.1: Municipal Administration;
(iii) Reports on the seven support initiatives for indicator 1: To coordinate effective preparedness and rapid response to any potential incidents/disasters under sub programme 3.2: Disaster management and fire brigade services;
(iv) The updated information, including the amount spent by the entity and reasons for the funds underspent by the entity, for the Thusong Centre and CDW programmes, under table 6.3: Transfer of Payments;
(v) A report outlining the posts included in the vacancy rate of 9.3%, and the progress with regards to the filling of these posts;
(vi) A report on the rand value of support provided to municipalities via the deployment of funds from donors, given that the Department is not a direct recipient of donor funding;
(vii) A report on the distribution of performance rewards across the salary bands;
(viii) A list of training providing to staff in the Department not included in Table 3.13.2 as well as an analysis of the difference between training needs identified (Table 3.13.1) and the actual training that was provided (Table 3.13.2);
(ix) A report on the basis on which staff (per staff level) were granted permission to do remunerative work outside of the public service (RWOP) and the nature of the RWOP; and
(x) A breakdown of the various other consultancy services and projects which account for the R1 246 420 in the table “Report of consultant appointments using appropriated funds 2012/13”; and

2. That by 30 November 2013, the Department of the Premier provides the Committee with a report on the reasons why Department of Local Government personnel have taken sick leave.

The Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth, having considered the Annual Report of the Department of the Premier for the year ended 31 March 2013 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function the Committee considered the Annual Report of the Department of the Premier. The Annual Report is the key instrument to report departmental performance measured against the performance targets outlined by the Department of the Premier in its strategic plan, Annual Performance Plan and its budget. The role of standing committees in overseeing Annual Reports of departments is crucial in closing the accountability loop of planning, budgeting, implementation, reporting, auditing and oversight.

The Annual Report programme for the 2012/2013 financial year was advertised in newspapers, inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions.

Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Provincial Premier, Helen Zille and the Director General, Advocate Brent Gerber were given an opportunity to make opening remarks. Members of the Committee deliberated on Part A: General Information, Part B: Performance Information, Part C: Governance and Part D: Human Resources Management. The members of the public and invited stakeholders were also given an opportunity to pose questions to the Department or provide input after the Standing Committee deliberations on the Annual Report.

B. Oversight report

(a) Concerns/Findings

(i) The Department did not attain a clean audit due to material misstatements; and

(ii) The Committee should prioritise defining its oversight role over the Department of the Premier.

(b) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that the Department of the Premier presents briefings within the current financial year on the following matters:-

(i) The findings of the Supply Chain Management (SCM) Unit in the Department for the 2012/2013 financial year, the manner in which these findings have impacted on the procurement procedures in the Department, including the steps put into place to address these findings;

(ii) The Retention strategy to retain staff members; and
(iii) Feedback on audit matters raised by the Auditor-General and the measures put into place to address the matters raised by the Auditor-General.

(c) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Department of the Premier should provide the Committee with the following:

(i) The revised information as mentioned on page 29 of the Annual Report, on the Service Delivery Access Strategy with the correct statistics;
(ii) A detailed report on the production and launch of the Better Together magazine, including all costs as mentioned on page 85 of the Annual Report;
(iii) A detailed report on the outstanding court cases of the Internal Control unit where irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure has been identified as mentioned on page 113 of the Annual Report;
(iv) A report on incidents of sick leave should it reflect an increase, the report should reflect the plans to address the general non-attendance of employees; and
(v) A list of external service providers appointed to train the Human Resource Development Unit, as mentioned on page 68 of the Annual Report.

C. Conclusion

The Committee wishes to express its appreciation to the Premier, the officials of the Department of the Premier and the Members for their participation during the session.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Community Development, having considered the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development for the year ended 31 March 2013 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function the Committee considered the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development.
The Annual Report is the key instrument to report departmental performance measured against the performance targets outlined by the Department of Social Development in its strategic plan, Annual Performance Plan and its budget. The role of standing committees in overseeing Annual Reports of departments is crucial in closing the accountability loop of planning, budgeting, implementation, reporting, auditing and oversight.

Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, Minister Albert Fritz and the Acting Head of Department, Mr Robert Macdonald were given an opportunity to make opening remarks. Members of the Committee deliberated on Part A: General Information, Part B: Performance Information, Part C: Governance and Part D: Human Resources Management. The members of the public and invited stakeholders were also given an opportunity to pose questions to the Department or provide input after the Standing Committee deliberations on the Annual Report.

B. Oversight report

(a) Concerns/Findings

(i) A capacity programme should be introduced to help Non-Government Organisations (NGO’s) to comply with the performance indicators as set out in the Departments Annual Performance Plan;
(ii) Inconsistency were found in the English and Afrikaans versions of the respective Annual Reports; and
(iii) Officials are appointed in acting positions for several months.

(b) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that the Department of Social Development briefs the Committee within the current financial year 2012/2013 on the following matters:-

(i) The NGO cluster training model;
(ii) The Management of NGO’s, measures in place to ensure that NGO’s are rendering services to the public and the supervision programme of NGO’s;
(iii) The outcome of the “Tenderten process” as identified by the Auditor-General as mentioned on page 12 of the Annual Report;
(iv) The number of therapeutic programmes rolled out in secure care facilities as indicated on page 35 of the Annual Report;
(v) The reasons for the backlog on the number of children placed in foster care as indicated on page 37 of the Annual Report;
(vi) The design and implementation of a pilot project launched in Mfuleni and Vredenburg, on the Referral Path Way model where 532 disability cases were identified;

(vii) Number of individuals who participated in the Population Capacity Development centres and the reason for stating the inadequacy of services for training as mentioned on page 54 of the Annual Report;

(viii) A report on the filling of all posts indicated as acting posts; and

(ix) Feedback on the investigation conducted by the Internal Audit unit on the deviation on the targets and indicators, under-reporting and the measures put in place to address these matters.

(c) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The report done by the Internal Audit unit, listing the deviations on the targets and indicators.

C. Acknowledgments

The Committee commended the Department on the improvements of the internal control unit reflected on page 66 and 67 as well as on skills development as reflected on page 96.

D. Conclusion

The Committee wishes to express its appreciation to the Minister, the officials of the Department of Social Development and the Members for their participation during the session.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning, having considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and its entity, CapeNature for the year ended 31 March 2013 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function, the Committee considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and its entity, CapeNature on 29 October 2013.
Annual reports are the key instruments for departments to report on performance measured against their performance targets and budgets as outlined in their Strategic Plans and Annual Performance Plans.

The annual report programme for the 2012/2013 financial year was advertised in various newspaper publications, inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions.

Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Minister, the Head of Department and the Chairperson of the CapeNature Board were given an opportunity to make opening remarks.

Members of the Committee deliberated on Part A: General Information, Part B: Departmental Programme Performance and Part D: Human Resource Management of the Department and Cape Nature’s Annual Report. Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions or make inputs during the discussions.

B. Oversight Reports on the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and its entity, CapeNature

1. Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

(a) Overview

The Department presented an unqualified audit report for the year under review. Significant successes achieved include the completion of the Draft Land Use Planning Bill and the finalisation of the technical chapters of the State of the Environment Outlook Report.

A flagship achievement was the completion of the Western Cape Sustainable Water Management Plan. The Berg River Improvement Plan was endorsed by Cabinet for implementation. This plan is part of the Western Cape Sustainable Water Management Plan and will ensure that the Department addresses the issues of water quality and river rehabilitation in the Berg River.

The Department has made significant progress in the area of municipal collaboration in respect to Sustainable Energy Plans and also in the field of Climate Change Adaptation Plans. The ability of the Department to work with key stakeholders is evident in the report.
(b) Findings/Concerns

(i) The target of 50% set for gender equity within the Department was not met. Females make up 20% of the senior management team. The statistics look better for middle management but in terms of racial composition, the Department is not fully representative.

(ii) The Department, in collaboration with Disaster Management in Local Government, was actively engaged in research projects that were aligned to academic institutions that monitor climate change response.

(iii) A number of organisational investigations were conducted and approved. These include the new Directorate: Development Facilitation, Supply Chain Management and Coastal Management. The filling of funded vacant posts remains a challenge. The resignations of scarcer, professional and technical skills as well as intergovernmental transfers exacerbated this problem.

(iv) A strategic environmental assessment for the placement of wind farms in the Western Cape was concluded. A similar strategic environmental assessment for solar farms was initiated to ascertain what the skills requirements were. The National Department of Environmental Affairs also initiated its national processes which was a joint wind energy and solar energy assessment. After discussion at the Environmental Sector Working Groups and at the National Department of Environmental Affairs, it was decided that, rather than have the Provincial Department proceed on their own with a solar energy assessment, they would collaborate with their sister National Department so that processes are not duplicated.

(v) A major shortcoming within the waste management strategic outcome orientated goal is the large percentage of landfill sites that remain unlicensed. In order to improve this, municipal councils will be required to provide funding to license their unlicensed waste disposal facilities. Funding is now available and the appointment of environmental assessment practitioners to assist is underway.

(vi) The Berg River Improvement Plan is a multi-year programme that was approved by Cabinet to improve water quality in the Berg River through implementing river and riparian zone rehabilitation in the catchment.
The Department is working closely with the National Department of Water Affairs and also engaging with the municipalities of Stellenbosch, Drakenstein and Breede Valley in this regard to ensure an upgraded programme for the waste water treatment works.

(vii) The Spatial Development Framework Plans for Kannaland, Beaufort West, Swellendam and Matzikama were not completed. However, they have reached an advanced stage and it is envisaged for them to be completed in the second quarter of the 2013/2014 municipal financial year. The delays experienced were mostly related to extended public participation processes in collaboration with the municipalities and supply chain processes.

(viii) The drafting of Bioregional Plans and Biodiversity Sector Plans is a performance indicator that the Department and CapeNature are not responsible for. The Bioregional plans should be drafted by the relevant municipality and should inform the sector plan and eventually the Spatial Development Plan. This has been endorsed by the National Department and the advisory agent, the South African National Biodiversity Institute (SANBI).

(ix) The implementation of the generic Accounting Officer system was postponed by Provincial Treasury as they are awaiting the outcome of the new National Treasury Regulations.

(x) A request was made to Provincial Cabinet to suspend the drafting of the Sustainable Energy Bill as changes in national legislation superceded the Department's processes.

(xi) The Draft Land Use Planning Bill will be endorsed by Cabinet at the end of November 2013. The Draft Bill will be submitted to the Provincial Parliament in January 2014.

(xii) The environmental norms and standards relating to aquaculture trout and abalone were delayed due to the time-consuming consultative process with the industry stakeholders as well as certain legal complexities.

(xiii) Municipal sustainable energy plans have been developed in collaboration with the Saldanha Bay, Mossel Bay, George and Cape Agulhas Municipalities. The support provided to the municipalities by the Department is to prioritise actions within these plans, getting them integrated into the Integrated Development Plans and finding capacity and funding for the implementation of the activities.
(xiv) The Department collected R2.495 million in revenue in spite of a moderate departmental revenue budget of R0.318 million. Major revenue collections are in respect of fines imposed by the National Environmental Management Act, 1998 (Act 107 of 1998); Section 24G which deals with environmental transgressions. The Department is now in a better position to identify trends and will budget accordingly in 2013/2014 financial year.

(xv) The average time to fill a vacant position with the Department is six months and is a concern to the Committee. One of the biggest issues that relate to the extended period is the process of vetting and verification, both of qualifications and referencing. This was a key issue across all departments in the Auditor-General’s report and does not promote the efficiency of service delivery.

(xvi) The vacancy rate, time taken to fill vacancies, retention of staff and the high percentage of sick leave is of grave concern to the Committee.

(xvii) The Department is congratulated on its achievement in Sub Programme 2.1 pertaining to intergovernmental coordination, spatial and development planning, as the actual versus planned targets were all met and in some cases exceeded.

(c) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that:

(i) the riparian zone of the Berg River be maintained as it could create an opportunity for alien vegetation to again take over and that the Department must take cognisance of this and report regularly on progress made;

(ii) the development of norms and standards for aquaculture in respect of trout and abalone is often hindered by tedious processes which act as an impediment to economic development and that this process must be driven by the Provincial Cabinet as a priority;

(iii) in terms of Programme 3, Compliance and Enforcement, issues relating to compliance and enforcement must be included in the strategic objectives pertaining to environmental quality management; and

(iv) the Environmental Impact Assessment system is complex and often seen as an impediment to development and that the Department brief the Committee in this regard.
(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requested that the Department provides it with the following:

(i) One of the climate change adaptation plans compiled for municipalities; and

2. CapeNature

(a) Overview

The year under review had its own excitement and challenges. Even though some of the set targets were met and some even exceeded, there remain instances in which some targets were not achieved at all.

Key highlights of the year under review include the increase in tourism income generated during a difficult economic period, an 11% growth in tourism revenue and the publication of the 2012 CapeNature Western Cape State of Biodiversity Report.

The period under review saw CapeNature achieve qualified audit opinions on performance information and conditional grants. The risk posed to the organisation as a result of this type of outcome was acknowledged and mitigation measures are already in the process of implementation to address it.

CapeNature is reliant on the support of many partners in conservation to keep the biodiversity, ecosystems and ecosystem services in the Western Cape functioning, clean, healthy and beautiful. During the financial year partnerships contributed a great deal in achieving the set targets.

(b) Findings/Concerns

(i) The instability of top management is a concern as the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) and Executive Director: Human Resources posts remain vacant. In the absence of a CEO, the Board had to meet more regularly to ensure that the responsibilities that had to be executed by the CEO are delegated to the correct individual. The Board then appointed Dr Kas Hamman as Acting CEO.
(ii) The previous CEO resigned but the reason for her resignation was not disclosed to the Committee as a confidential agreement was entered into between the parties on the insistence of the CEO at the time.

(iii) In the absence of a Foundation Manager, CapeNature generated income through various partnership agreements to the value of R22.2 million for which the bulk have multiple-year implementation plans.

(iv) The CapeNature Western Cape State of Biodiversity report was published. This report summarised the state of knowledge of protected areas, fresh water and terrestrial ecosystems and included all plants and animals. This information feeds into the provincial and national state of the environment reporting system and makes a significant contribution in this regard.

(v) During the period under review the Western Cape experienced one of the worst fire seasons over the December/January period. Due to the large number of fires throughout the province the Provincial Disaster Management Centre was utilised to establish a Province-wide Incident Command Post.

(vi) The Biodiversity Bill was not promulgated as the National Alien Invasive Plant Regulations have not been published. It is necessary to align the provincial and national Biodiversity legislation as far as threatened species and alien invasive species are concerned and in so doing broaden the scope of the Bill.

(vii) The tender process for the Virtual Private Network was cancelled due to specification shortcomings and the lack of a completed feasibility study.

(viii) Underperformance of staff is related to lack of training and lack of skills. The implementation of the Human Capital Development Strategy would enable the implementation of key initiatives to address the needs as identified in the individual development plans.

(c) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that:

(i) a concerted effort is made to clear invasive alien vegetation which encourages criminality in urban areas. This could be incorporated as part of the various job creation projects executed by CapeNature; and
(ii) the reasons for staff leaving be illustrated as a separate table in the Annual Report to avoid confusion.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requested that the Entity provides it with the document that describes the nature of a conservation economy clearly outlining the inputs and outputs thereof.

C. Conclusion

The Committee was satisfied by the response of the Department and CapeNature to the interrogation of the Annual Reports and wishes to thank the Minister, Head of Department, the Acting Chief Executive Officer of CapeNature and Chairperson of the Board for their contributions and efforts in this regard.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning, having considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Agriculture and its entity, Casidra for the year ended 31 March 2013 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function, the Committee considered the Annual Reports of Department of Agriculture and its entity, Casidra on 1 November 2013. Annual reports are the key instruments for departments to report on performance measured against their performance targets and budgets as outlined in their Strategic Plans and Annual Performance Plans.

The annual report programme for the 2012/2013 financial year was advertised in various newspaper publications, inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions.

Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Minister, the Head of Department, Acting Chief Executive Officer of Casidra and the Chairperson of the Casidra Board were given an opportunity to make opening remarks.
Members of the Committee deliberated on Part A: General Information, Part B: Departmental Programme Performance and Part D: Human Resource Management of the Department and Entity’s Annual Report. Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions or make inputs during the discussions.

B. Oversight Reports on Department of Agriculture and Casidra

1. Department of Agriculture

(a) Overview

The Department of Agriculture had a clean audit awarded by the Auditor-General for the third successive year.

The Western Cape agricultural sector experienced several challenges during the financial year under review. The continuing problems of Avian Influenza and the socio-economic challenges pertaining to the rural protest action are some examples.

The farm worker protest action and the upheavals in the agricultural sector have been a clear indication of the numerous challenges faced by farm workers and rural communities. The two main areas affected by the protest action were the Overberg and Cape Winelands.

The Western Cape is responsible for 20.8% of the value of agricultural production in South Africa. The Province houses 24% of the farm workers in the country. It can therefore be concluded that the Western Cape farming is more labour intensive than farming in the rest of the country. It is imperative that the Department consult widely within the sector in order to develop support programmes and initiatives which will contribute to the success of the agricultural community in the Western Cape.

(b) Findings/Concerns

(i) New and adapted technology will ensure that producers are sustainable and competitive with limited natural resources, especially water, and this will secure the base to increase agricultural production by 10%. By optimising the soil conditions, a 10% growth could be easily achieved.

(ii) The Department supports job creation. According to Statistics South Africa, there were 129 000 jobs in the Western Cape agricultural sector in the last quarter of 2012. The recent release from Statistics South Africa indicated that there were 139 0000 jobs in the first quarter.
This means an increase of 10,000 jobs since December 2012 and in turn illustrates that 20% of agricultural employment in the country is in the Western Cape. The Western Cape Province created the most jobs in the agricultural sector.

(iii) Short to medium term interventions in response to farm worker unrest included a helpline where limited calls were received as people were uncertain as to whether they would remain anonymous or not. Farm worker surveys have been completed for Theewaterskloof and Overstrand and a service provider has been appointed to complete surveys for the Overberg and Cape Winelands districts. Fifteen case studies were documented and the service provider has been appointed to deal with the editing and compilation of the publication. There has been engagement with the Berg River Municipality regarding housing and farm worker platforms have been established. They are responsible for articulating the needs of farm worker groups on an ad-hoc basis.

(iv) The misalignment between the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform’s (DRDLR’s) land delivery processes and the agricultural support programme is a challenge. The DRDLR is responsible for land delivery. The Department is responsible for providing farmer support. Farmers recruited by the DRDLR will receive financial support to procure certain items for their farms. The same farmer then approaches the Department of Agriculture and asks for the same items. This disjuncture and duplication has created tension between the two Departments. The DRDLR has a national mandate and the province a provincial mandate. The national department does not have to divulge any information to the province. Therefore, there exists no unified reporting and this is a major challenge.

(v) The ongoing threat of avian influenza is putting the research resources at severe risk. Due to European Union Regulations, no birds could be moved or sold and this resulted in the cancellation of the annual ostrich auction for 2012/2013. A decision was taken not to slaughter the superior genetic material in the knowledge that these birds would form the basis for the regeneration of the industry once the export ban has been lifted.
(vi) In order to counter the ongoing threat of avian influenza to ostrich genetic resources, the Research Unit has decided to move part of the ostrich genetic material from Oudtshoorn to Nortier and KrommeRhee. They deserve praise for this strategic decision.

(vii) The Department is to be congratulated on the pass rate of the Cellar Technology students who successfully completed the wine evaluation course at the University of Stellenbosch. Congratulations are also extended for the accreditation that the cellar laboratory received from the South African Wine Laboratory Association.

(viii) South Africa has a relationship with Brazil who is its main competitor in terms of the Southern hemisphere. Brazil has excellent resources against which South Africa cannot compete. Instead, the Department is focusing on China because their growth in terms of middle class demand for South African exports has been phenomenal. Brazil perceives South Africa as a market and this is why poultry is imported from Brazil. The province does not have control over tariffs. It is cheaper to import chicken from Brazil and other countries than to produce it in South Africa. The South African industry has lost its competitiveness and needs support if it is to be maintained.

(ix) An intergovernmental steering committee has been established to focus on the specific development nodes and to encourage collaboration. The committee meets every second month. Departments involved include all the provincial departments and the DRDLR as the driver. It has been a challenge to try to get everyone together because this is a new process focusing on the development of the rural nodes and has not gained momentum as yet.

(x) The Black Farmer Association is supported by the Department but financial transfer to the association is via Agri-Mega.

(xi) There was one case of dismissal where the court ruled in favour of the official. The Department was then obligated to reinstate the official or pay damages. Due to the breakdown in the relationship, the Department decided to dismiss the official and pay the compensation amount.

(xii) The high vacancy rate in the Agricultural Scientist and Technician and Agricultural Economist disciplines is alarming. These are critical positions that must assist the Department in achieving its targets.
(c) **Recommendations**

The Committee wishes to recommend that:

(i) the Department brief the Committee on the coordination of the comprehensive rural development programme with specific reference to progress made with regard to the 15 rural developmental nodes; and

(ii) the Department (Mr Andre Roux) prepares a paper on underdeveloped sources of water in the province that can be used as a basis to invite the Department of Water Affairs who is the custodian of water rights to address the Committee.

(d) **Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee**

The Committee requested that the Department provides it with the following:

(i) A statistical report on the short to medium term interventions planned in response to the farm worker unrest;

(ii) A written report on the SimFini project and its relation to financial record keeping;

(iii) The number of cellar technology students from previously disadvantaged groups;

(iv) A copy of publication titled “Annual Report to Citizens”;

(v) A written report on the job losses in the Oudtshoorn area due to the occurrences in the ostrich industry; and

(vi) A list of the various commodity projects linked to the Department.

2. **Casidra**

(a) **Overview**

The year under review has been marked with stability and the appointment of a new Chief Executive Officer. Stability has further been strengthened by the fact that Casidra will now be the dedicated implementation agent for the Western Cape Department of Agriculture. The recent labour unrest in the Western Cape agricultural sector also impacted on Casidra’s operations in the past financial year. Casidra focused on three areas in the year under review namely the organisational structure, organisational culture and advanced technology.
(b) Findings/Concerns

(i) Amalienstein and Waaikraal are farms owned by the Department of Transport and Public Works that are managed by Casidra. Historical buildings occur on both farms. The dismal financial prospects for Amalienstein were exacerbated by the high overhead costs of the maintenance of the historic buildings and infrastructure. This places an impediment against the profitability of the farm. Historical buildings should be the responsibility of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport or the Department of Transport and Public Works.

(ii) In the new policy for the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform’s (DRDLR) recapitalisation programme, it is stated that most of the 6 million hectares of agricultural land transferred through the land reform programme is now out of production and have failed. This is due to the large number of beneficiaries that often results in fighting and also the fact that beneficiaries have limited agricultural and management skills.

(iii) The farm Anhalt must be conveyed to the Haarlem community. The farm funds itself and does not get funding from government. The packshed on the farm also generates income which makes the farm sustainable. Labour is 45% of the production cost. Casidra is trying to combat the high labour cost by increasing productivity. The Haarlem community has the choice to appoint an implementing agent and they are not obligated to choose Casidra. The farm belongs to the Haarlem community but the packshed belongs to the province. This may cause conflict with the community. The communal land around Haarlem is also a subject of dispute as the community is claiming that this is part of the land to be transferred. R11 816 million was spent on Anhalt during the period under review and this emphasises the importance of bringing things to conclusion.

(iv) The Departments of Social Services, Health and Education are also involved in the establishment of food gardens as part of food security. Casidra ensures that the efforts of the various Departments are coordinated. A committee has been established to manage the process. The fact that municipalities do not form a part of this committee is a concern as commonage land and the availability of water fall within the municipality’s mandate.
(c) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that:

(i) the Department and the Minister pursue the matter of the maintenance of historic buildings with the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and Cape Heritage as this impacts on the profitability of the farm Amalienstein; and

(ii) the efforts to resolve the problems impeding transfer of Anhalt farm to the Haarlem community should energetically be brought to conclusion.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

(i) A list of the land reform projects of the DRDLR in the Western Cape involving the Department of Agriculture; and

(ii) A report on the council of stakeholder’s community structures that have been formalised and are ready to start operating outlining the various active nodes and their functions.

C. Conclusion

The Committee was satisfied with the responses of the Department and Casidra to the discussion on the annual reports and wishes to thank the Minister, Head of Department, the Acting Chief Executive Officer of Casidra and Chairperson of the Board for their contributions and efforts in this regard.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.

MONDAY, 18 NOVEMBER 2013

COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:


The Standing Committee on Community Development, having considered the Annual Report of the Department of Health, for the year ending 31 March 2013, reports as follows:
A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function, the Standing Committee on Community Development considered the 2012/13 Annual Report of the Department of Health. Annual reports are the key instrument to report departmental performance measured against the performance targets outlined by the Department of Health in its Strategic Plan, Annual Performance Plan and its budget.

B. Department of Health

The Standing Committee on Community Development assessed the performance indicators of the Department of Health in line with the Department’s strategic goal statements, which set out to address the burden of disease; improve the quality of health services and patient experiences; ensure and maintain organisational strategic management capacity and synergy; develop and maintain a capacitated workforce to deliver the required health services; develop and maintain appropriate health technology, infrastructure and ICT; and optimize financial management to maximise health outcomes.

The Cape Medical Depot (CMD), which previously functioned as a trading entity, was incorporated into the Department’s programmes and is indicated as such through an expenditure budget under Sub-programme 7.5. The purpose of this sub-programme is to manage the supply of medicine and medical supplies to health facilities. To this extent, the Committee considered the performance of the Cape Medical Depot as part of the Annual Report of the Department of Health.

1. Findings

The Committee noted with concern:

(a) that the actual immunisation target of children under the age of 1 was not achieved;
(b) that professional nursing staff at Special Needs schools are excluded from professional accountability, development and training due to the lack of a formal agreement between the Department of Health and the Western Cape Education Department; and
(c) the continuous challenges associated with the Infrastructure Demand Management System service level agreements between the Departments of Health and Transport and Public Works.
2. **Recommendations**

The Committee agreed:

(a) that the Department should finalise a formal agreement with the Western Cape Education Department to ensure that professional nursing staff at Special Needs schools benefit from professional accountability, development and training;

(b) that the Department should in future be invited to brief the Committee on the reasons why the actual immunisation target of children under the age of 1 was not achieved; and

(c) to undertake an oversight visit to the specialised burns unit at the Red Cross War Memorial Children’s Hospital.

3. **Papers, reports and information requested by the Standing Committee**

The Committee requested that the Department of Health provide it with the following:

(a) a list of the Primary Health Care infrastructure sites that will be fast tracked for the implementation of anti-retroviral treatment (ART) service points; and

(b) the reasons for the anticipated target for the provision of professional nurses per 100 000 people in rural districts set at 87.1% in 2012/13, when the actual achievement in 2011/12 was 90%.

C. **Concluding Remarks**

The Committee would not only like to express its appreciation to the Minister, Head of Department and the staff of the Department of Health for their efforts in compiling a professional annual report document, but would like to thank the Department for its oversight compliance in submitting and presenting the Annual Report to the Committee.

In particular, the Committee would like to extend a special word of appreciation to Prof Househam, for his selfless service to the Department of Health and the people of the Western Cape. The Committee conveyed its well wishes and success in all his future endeavours and hopes that he enjoys a well-deserved retirement.

2. **Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development**

On the 2012/13 Annual Reports of Provincial Treasury and its entity Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, for the year ended 31 March 2013, dated 15 November 2013.
The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the 2012/13 Annual Reports of Provincial Treasury and its entity Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, for the year ended 31 March 2013, reports as follows:

1. **Introduction**

   Annual Reports are the key instruments that are used by departments and entities to report about the performance targets and budgets outlined in their Strategic Plans and Annual Performance Plans.

   The Committee therefore considered the abovementioned Annual Reports by overseeing and scrutinizing whether predetermined objectives line up with reported performance.

2. **Provincial Treasury**

   The mandate of the Western Cape Provincial Treasury is to control and oversee the financial affairs of the Western Cape Government. It provides efficient supporting and sustainable public financial management to promote economic development, good governance, social progress and a rising standard of the people of the Western Cape.

   In line with its mission to obtain financial supportive means and foster the optimal utilisation of resources by means of sound governance practices, Provincial Treasury strives towards the following Strategic Outcome Orientated Goals:

   (a) Assist the member of the Executive Council and the Head of Department with the delivery of the assigned functions to them.
   (b) Effective financial management of the Department up to a 3+ financial capability rating.
   (c) Revenue adequacy, optimisation and efficiency of revenue collection for departments and municipalities to achieve a level 3+ financial capability rating.
   (d) Monitor and evaluate cash flow and investment management so that it is sustainable and credible and will enhance service delivery and improve liquidity in departments and municipalities.
   (e) Responsive budgets for all provincial departments, municipalities and entities to achieve a level 3+ financial capability rating.
   (f) Credible budgets within departments, municipalities and entities to achieve a level 3+ financial capability rating.
   (g) Increase the level of infrastructure delivery to achieve a level 3+ financial capability rating (departments of Education, Health, Transport and Public Works and selected municipalities) and the sound management of PPP projects.
(h) Enhance departmental and municipal capacity and performance to achieve a level 3+ financial capability rating for SCM and moveable asset management.

(i) Management, utilisation and implementation of financial systems to achieve a level 3+ financial capability rating within provincial departments and selected entities.

(j) Ensure the development of accounting practices within provincial and local government that will promote effective and efficient capturing of REAL movements/accountability and contribute towards attaining level 3 and higher auditable organisations.

(k) Enable departments and municipalities to achieve a level 3+ financial management capability over the next 5 years.

2.1 Recommendations

The Committee agreed that–

(a) future Annual Reports should contain a detailed account of the employees who received performance bonuses;

(b) future Annual Reports should be better formatted and structured, taking into consideration that the relevant oversight committee and/or audience is not familiar with the processes and or terminology used by Provincial Treasury, and items within different columns within the same tables should be more easily readable;

(c) strategic objectives and performance indicators should be presented in a more readable format to enable the reader to easily compare the respective objectives with the correlating performance indicators; and

(d) explanations for items in tables, when presented as footnotes in the tables, should be indicated by asterisks and/or numbering within the body of the table.

3. Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board (WCGRB)

It is the intention of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board to control and regulate gambling and racing within the Western Cape in a manner that will provide a stable, just, consistent and effective regulatory environment that will inspire public confidence and trust to ensure that the industry contributes to the economy of the Western Cape in a socially responsible manner.

The Strategic Outcome Orientated Goal of the entity is to ensure that all gambling, racing and activities incidental thereto are effectively regulated in the Western Cape in such a manner that maximizes intended benefits while minimizing the unintended negative social consequences.
3.1 Recommendations

The Committee agreed that transformation of the gambling industry in terms of the distribution of wealth should focus not only on economic factors, but address social responsibilities as well.

4. Concluding Remarks

The Committee would like to express its appreciation to the Minister, Head of Department and the staff of Provincial Treasury and the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board for their efforts in compiling professional annual report documents.

In addition, the Committee would like to thank the Department for their oversight compliance in submitting and presenting its Annual Report, and that of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board to the Committee for consideration.


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Transport and Public Works and its entity Government Motor Transport, for the year ended 31 March 2013, reports as follows:

1. Introduction

Annual Reports are the key instruments that are used by departments and entities to report about the performance targets and budgets outlined in their Strategic Plans and Annual Performance Plans.

The Committee therefore considered the abovementioned Annual Reports by overseeing and scrutinizing whether predetermined objectives line up with reported performance.

2. Department of Transport and Public Works

In line with the Provincial Strategic Objective 3 of increased access to safe and efficient transport, the Department of Transport and Public Works aims to develop and maintain appropriate infrastructure and related services for sustainable economic development which generates growth in jobs and facilities empowerment and opportunity.
To measure the Department’s success in this regard, the Committee considered the Department’s performance in line with the following Strategic Outcome Orientated Goals:

(a) Promote good governance and an effective and efficient department.
(b) Lead the implementation and facilitation of the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) in the Western Cape.
(c) Lead the development and implementation of Integrated Transport systems in the Western Cape.
(d) Lead the development and implementation of provincial infrastructure and property management in the Western Cape.

2.1 Recommendations

That Committee agreed–

(a) that the Department should improve the integration of the medium-term and long-term needs of client departments into the Department’s programmes so as to improve the relevance of targets in relation to achievements;
(b) that the Department should, in collaboration with other departments in other provinces, pursue on national level the amendment of constraining laws which impede the access to high quality gravel pits and ultimately delay the maintenance of the road networks underpinning rural economic development;
(c) to visit the Department’s Walk-in-Centre in Cape Town; and
(d) to support the Minister of Transport and Public Works’ request to reinstate funding from the National Department of Transport and Public Works for the Dial-a-Ride initiative.

2.2 Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee agreed that the Department should provide the Committee with–

(a) a detailed list of all new and current locations that were leased by the Department during the period under review, including the location of lease agreements that were cancelled during this period;
(b) a detailed list of the 9 new and replacement schools that were constructed during the period under review, as well as the details of the 35 new and replacement schools currently under construction;
(c) the minimum requirements/criteria to be met by prospective candidates in order to become eligible for the diesel mechanic apprenticeship program;
(d) with the Placement Policy of Masakh’ iSizwe Bursars as well as the Policy for the appointment of Masakh’ iSizwe graduates;
(e) a map indicating the location of all gravel roads under the responsibility of the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works;

(f) a table indicating the number of registered public transport vehicles, per category, at the start and end of the period under review;

(g) a list of all weighbridge stations in the Western Cape, indicating how many heavy vehicles were weighed and, passed without being weighed at each respective station for the duration of the period under review; and

(h) a comprehensive list of all consultant entities used by the Department during the period under review, as well as a description of the services rendered by each entity.

3. Government Motor Transport

The purpose of Government Motor Transport is to provide quality, integrated and cost-effective motor transport to state departments and affiliated entities.

Although the operations and general administration of the Government Motor Transport Trading Entity is located in a single programme within the Department of Transport and Public Works, its performance for the period under review is captured in a separate Annual Report.

To this extent, the progress of Government Motor Transport has been measured in line with the following Strategic Outcome Oriented Goals:

(a) Access to a unique vehicle fleet.
(b) Improved vehicle management and control.
(c) Improved client service.
(d) Improved financial reporting.
(e) A healthy operational environment.
(f) Effective operational system.

3.1 Findings

The Committee noted with concern the anomaly between the annual target of 25% under paragraph 3.1 and the planned target of 320, as specified for 2012/13 in table 5.1.

3.2 Recommendations

The Committee agreed to congratulate Government Motor Transport on its overall good performance.
2. Concluding Remarks

The Committee would like to express its appreciation to the Minister, Head of Department and the staff of the Department of Transport and Public Works and Government Motor Transport for their efforts in compiling a professional annual report document.

In addition, the Committee would like to thank the Department for their oversight compliance in submitting and presenting its Annual Report, and that of Government Motor Transport, to the Committee for consideration.

The Committee would like to thank Mr Johan Fourie in abstentia retired for his selfless service to the Department of Transport and Public Works whilst serving in his capacity as Head of Department. The Committee wish him the best of luck in all his future endeavours and hopes that he enjoys a well-deserved retirement.

In conclusion, the Committee would like to congratulate Ms Jacqui Gooch on her appointment as new Head of Department: Transport and Public Works. The Committee trust that she will succeed in her new position and look forward to continue its sound working relationship with her and the Department.


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the 2012/13 Annual Reports of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism and its entities the Western Cape Destination Marketing, Investment and Trade Promotion Agency, Cape Town Routes Unlimited and Western Cape Liquor Authority, for the year ended 31 March 2013, reports as follows:

1. Introduction

Annual Reports are the key instruments that are used by departments and entities to report about the performance targets and budgets outlined in their Strategic Plans and Annual Performance Plans.

The Committee therefore considered the abovementioned Annual Reports by overseeing and scrutinizing whether predetermined objectives line up with reported performance.
2. Department of Economic Development and Tourism

The Department of Economic Development and Tourism has a vision of a Western Cape that has a vibrant, innovative and sustainable economy, characterised by growth, employment and increasing equity, based on the principle of allowing all citizens to reach their full potential.

In striving towards this vision, the Department transformed its role of predominantly overseeing the economy of the Western Cape and intervening when matters of concern arises, to take up a central leadership position in facilitating economic growth by engaging all economic stakeholders to ultimately establish and influence a predictable, competitive, equitable and responsible environment for investment, enterprise and trade.

To create opportunities for businesses and private citizens that will stimulate economic growth and job creation, the Department has set itself the following Strategic Outcome Orientated Goals:

(a) To develop and implement the economic strategic plan and policies in support of achieving opportunities for jobs and growth.
(b) To create an enabling environment through improvement in the regional business confidence index and growth in the employment rate.
(c) To facilitate demand-led, private sector driven government support for growth sectors, industries and business by increasing the value of exports.
(d) To improve the competitiveness of the region through infrastructure-led economic growth.
(e) To facilitate through the Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP) 204 770 “100-day work opportunities” and 111 859 “full-time equivalents” between 2009 and 2014.

2.1 Findings

The Committee noted with concern that actual achievements regularly far over-exceed expected targets. Projected targets should therefore be adjusted to more realistically relate to actual future achievements.

2.2 Recommendations

The Committee agreed that–

(a) the organisational structure diagram should in future contain individual photographs of senior management;
(b) the consideration of the Annual Report of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism should in future be separate from its affiliated entities, as to allow sufficient time to scrutinize the respective reports;

(c) the Department should ensure that training initiatives should align with specific skills shortages;

(d) the Department should liaise with tertiary training institutions as to address the shortages of graduates in the affected fields of study; and

(e) the Department should be congratulated on their overall good performance.

2.3 Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee agreed that the Department of Economic Development and Tourism should–

(a) brief the Committee on the OneCape 2040 strategy;
(b) provide a summary of all municipal support interventions, detailing the extent of these programs as well as the location thereof;
(c) provide more information on the chocolate support facility investment;
(d) brief the Committee on the nature and objectives of the Regional Innovation Forum and elaborate as to the involvement of the Finnish Embassy in implementing the Regional Innovation System in the Western Cape;
(e) report on how funds transferred to the Business Place and the West Coast Business Development Centre initiatives were spent; and
(f) provide an explanatory summary, detailing the address of each of the identified consultancies, and specifying in each case, the type of service rendered.

3. Western Cape Destination Marketing, Investment and Trade Promotion Agency (WESGRO)

The Western Cape Destination Marketing, Investment and Trade Promotion Agency strives to lead the creation and promotion of a global destination for tourism, trade and investment, for the ultimate benefit of all people in the Western Cape.

The Agency’s strategic plan focuses on trade and investment promotion by deepening services and capacity in the core business areas, focussing on priority sectors, targeting markets and aiming for international best practices in trade and investment promotion.

To this extent, the Agency’s high-level organisational priorities are to–
(a) become a global leader in Tourism, Trade and Investment Promotion;
(b) provide a cutting-edge service offering;
(c) diversify sources of funding;
(d) develop a high-performance culture;
(e) build the business image of the Agency; and
(f) improve the quality of its systems and infrastructure.

3.1 Recommendations

The Committee agreed that–

(a) the Annual Report should in future be edited more thoroughly in order to improve clarity and correctness;
(b) Wesgro should acknowledge their partners and stakeholders on national level;
(c) representatives of the Wesgro Board of Directors should at all times be present at the meeting when the Annual Report is considered;
(d) the organisational structure diagram should include individual photographs of all senior management officials;
(e) Wesgro should provide the Committee with a report on the methodology used to determine economic impact estimates;
(f) Wesgro should provide more details on the various roll-out phases of the Broadband Initiative; and
(g) Wesgro should be congratulated on their overall good performance.

4. Cape Town Routes Unlimited (CTRU)

In striving towards a vision of being recognised as one of the most dynamic and professionally managed Destination Marketing Organisations in the world, Cape Town Routes Unlimited set the following strategic goals:

(a) To position Cape Town and the Western Cape as the premier leisure, events and business tourism destination in Africa.
(b) To contribute to the distribution of the benefits of a thriving tourism industry to all the citizens of the Western Cape.
(c) To contribute towards the attainment of high levels of competitiveness in the industry.
(d) To promote an environmentally and socially responsible tourism industry that will enjoy the benefits of sustained growth.

As a result of a gradual decline of grant funding, the Western Cape Government embarked on a strategy in the 2012/13 financial year to transfer the destination marketing functions of the Western Cape to the Western Cape Destination Marketing, Investment and Trade Promotion Agency.
As of 1 April 2012, the operations, staff and functions of CTRU were subsequently transferred to Wesgro.

CTRU’s achievements for the 2012/13 financial year, albeit under the management of Wesgro, measured against above mentioned strategic goals, have been captured in a separate Annual Report and its performance was subsequently considered independently from that of Wesgro.

5. **Western Cape Liquor Authority**

The mission of the Western Cape Liquor Authority is to regulate the retail sale and micro-manufacturing of liquor in the province.

The entity’s Strategic Outcome Orientated Goals are as follows:

(a) A regulatory environment that reflects high levels of participation by the public.
(b) A maximising of the benefits of the industry for the Province and its people.
(c) A minimising of its negative effects through increased awareness.
(d) Reduced availability of liquor and better law enforcement.

5.1 **Recommendations**

The Committee agreed that–

(a) the organisational structure diagram should include individual photographs of all senior management officials; and
(b) the Western Cape Liquor Authority should be congratulated on their overall good performance.

6. **Concluding Remarks**

The Committee would like to express its appreciation to the Minister, Head of Department and the staff of the Department of Economic Development and its affiliated entities for their efforts in compiling professional Annual Report documents.

In addition, the Committee would like to thank the Department for their oversight compliance in submitting and presenting its Annual Report, and that of its entities the Western Cape Destination Marketing, Investment and Trade Promotion Agency, Cape Town Routes Unlimited and the Western Cape Liquor Authority, to the Committee for consideration.

In particular, the Committee would like to commend the performance of the Western Cape Liquor Authority who, in its first full financial year of operation, managed to achieve a clean audit performance.
ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

Referral of draft Bills to committees in terms of Rule 220

1. Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth:
   Draft Women Empowerment and Gender Equality (WEGE) Bill, 2013 (NCOP) (proposed section 75 Bill).

2. Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development:
   Draft Infrastructure Development Bill, 2013 (NCOP) (proposed section 75 Bill).

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

Bills received from National Council of Provinces and tabled in terms of Rule 219

COMMITTEE REPORT

The Speaker:

Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the *Western Cape Membership of the Western Cape Economic Development Partnership Bill* [B 8–2013], dated 15 November 2013, as follows:

The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the subject of the *Western Cape Membership of the Western Cape Economic Development Partnership Bill* [B 8–2013], referred to it in terms of Standing Rule 171, reports the Bill without amendments.

WEDNESDAY, 20 NOVEMBER 2013

COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:

1. **REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON PREMIER, GENDER, DISABLED AND YOUTH ON THE OVERSIGHT VISIT TO THE OUDTSHOORN ASSOCIATION FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITY (APD) ON 29 MAY 2013**

The Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth having undertaken an oversight visit to the Oudtshoorn Association for Persons with Disability on 29 May 2013 wishes to report as follows:

1. **Introduction**

   In 2010, the Cluster A Standing Committees undertook a Joint Oversight Visit to the Southern Cape to the above mentioned centre. A resolution was taken in 2010 following the aforementioned visit and it was proposed that the Oudtshoorn Association for Persons with Disability needed substantial improvements at their facilities as the environment was not fit for any person with a disability.

   The facility consists of community members with disabilities in the Oudtshoorn, De Rust, Dysselsdorp, Calitzdorf, Zoar and surrounding farm areas.

   The facility offers the following:

   (a) Prevention and Care;
   (b) Training and Empowerment;
   (c) Accessibility;
   (d) Sport and Recreation and
(e) Awareness of Services

The facility has developmental social work services and the Sonskyn Special Daycare centre which serves 30 children. The protective workshops held in Dysselsdorp and Oudtshoorn provide skills and train persons with disabilities in different areas such as making ostrich eggs, beading, needlework, any types of arts and crafts, wheelchair repairs, sport and recreational activities, roll-in shop (devices for persons with disabilities and other persons) and marketing and promotion. APD has a contract with the Department of Health where persons with disabilities are trained to fix wheelchairs. Before a person is placed in a workshop or any other service environment within the organisation, an assessment is conducted. After the assessment process an individual client development plan with specific goals is drawn up with the client to monitor the client’s development.

The persons with disabilities manufacturer products and sell them to generate an income. APD provides the facilities, machinery and tools. APD secures suitable contract work with various companies and organisations and concludes agreements with the companies involved. Each client signs an employment agreement with APD and copies are kept in the client’s folder. A client working in these sections receives commission upon production.

APD is not necessarily the training provider, but will identify suitable training providers and assists trainees to apply for contract work as well as find placements for the trainees to practice their newly acquired skills.

Trainees do not receive a wage for participating in training programmes. Trainees will receive a stipend to cover costs for transport and meal if funding to pay a stipend is available. APD receives global funding for job creation. Funding is available for 6 months which started on April until September 2013. More disabled persons receive social services support. APD have funding available for the project costs and a facilitator for each month for the duration of the 6 months. Life skills are offered for intellectual disabled persons at the centre. New skills are acquired and self-confidence is an element that is built within the training.

APD offers learnerships, computer training, ABET, the services of the Department of Labour, accredited training courses, basic skills training such as cleaning skills, child care, in-service training and office assistance. Some of the training such as life skills training and on-the-job coaching is done by APD staff.

2. Purpose

The purpose of the visit was to follow up on progress since the Joint Visit week in 2010.
3. **The delegation**

The delegation consisted of the following Members of the Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth:

Ms JL Hartnick (DA) (Chairperson);
Mr AM Figlan (DA);
Ms AJD Marais (DA);
Ms V Hani (ANC); and
Ms TN Bevu (COPE).

Ms W Kamish Achmat, Committee Co-ordinator accompanied the delegation.

The following persons were present at the visit:

B Engelbrecht: Fundraiser
L Raal: Admin and Finance
JC Engelbrecht: Committee Member
D Nglonyana: Social Worker
E May: Admin

4. **Account of the visit**

The Committee was welcomed by the Centre Manager, Ms C L Roux. Ms JL Hartnick introduced members of the Committee present and allowed the Departments to introduce themselves. She gave a brief overview to the purpose of the visit.

Ms Eshida briefed the committee on the background of the facility and the activities.

5. **Findings/Challenges**

(a) APD offer services to persons with disabilities between the ages of 16 – 34 years old.

(b) The centre consists of 4 work and employment units which is business, skills and training units, with contract work and support groups.

(c) A high requirement is needed for skilled volunteers to train but there is no training offered to develop and empower the trainees.

(d) The Department of Health funds the “How to fix a wheelchair” workshop but funding will be cease in September 2013.

(e) There is a shortage of facilitators and they have one facilitator for 6 months.
(f) There are more persons with disabilities and no transport services are available, especially to those persons from the rural areas.

(g) There are no carpets in the centre, but concrete flooring which is extremely cold in winter.

(h) Rogues burgled and vandalised the facilities, equipment and furniture.

(i) There are only 3 staff members that have been seconded by the Department of Social Development to the facility and payment of the salaries is partially funded by the Department of Social Development. The rest is paid from fundraising.

(j) APD will be moving to the Bongeluthu Centre but there is no funding for maintenance.

(k) The facility has limited electricity available for usage.

(l) The centre offers services to the rest of the community and the one vehicle is insufficient to allow them to offer value services to the community.

(m) The 14 seater vehicle has to transport 33 persons with disabilities and therefore obliged to do a few trips resulting in arriving late for training.

(n) The persons with disabilities visit the Bongeluthu clinic for their check-ups and the clinic does not have any toilet facilities for them.

(o) During rainy conditions it proves to be very difficult for persons with disabilities to travel.

(p) They have limited project funds to facilitate all there projects.

6. Recommendations

(a) That the Committee raises the challenges experienced by the centre to the Department of Social Development and Premier since the situation has deteriorated since the committee visited the centre two years ago.

(b) That the APD centre forwards its business plans to the Committee in order for the Committee to make informed recommendations on

7. Acknowledgements

The Chairperson thanked the Committee and respective officials who attended the Oversight visit.
2. REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON PREMIER, GENDER, DISABLED AND YOUTH ON THE OVERSIGHT VISIT TO ZOLANI THUSONG SERVICE CENTRE AND EMASITHANDANE CHILDRENS HOME ON 21 AUGUST 2013

The Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth having undertaken an oversight visit to the Zolani Thusong Service Centre and Emasithandane Children’s Home on 21 August 2013 wishes to report as follows:

1. Introduction

The Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth conducted an oversight visit on 13 February 2013, to the Zolani Thusong Service Centre as part of its oversight function.

This visit emanated from a briefing by the Department of the Premier on International Agreements on 6 February 2013. During the briefing the department informed the committee that it has projects linked to International Agreements under the Strategic Programmes Branch of the Directorate: International and Priority Programmes. One such agreement is the bilateral agreement with the State of Bavaria situated in the southeast of Germany.

Focusing on the film and media, Two Oceans Productions and Ikho Production offered to present a month of film screenings at the Zolani Thusong Service Centre. The film equipment for this project was bought with funding from the Bavarian Staatskanzlei and is used in the Zolani Thusong Service Centre for public screenings of popular television shows and sport.

2. Purpose

The purpose of the visit was to conduct a preliminary assessment of the film equipment and to conduct oversight over the Zolani Thusong Service Centre in terms of activities and effectiveness. The Committee visited the centre on 13 February 2013, where the facility manager could not access the room in which the film equipment was housed. The Committee therefore decided to revisit the centre on 21 August 2013. The Committee thereafter resolved to undertake an oversight visit to the Emasithandane Children’s Home in the same area.

3. The delegation

The delegation consisted of the following Members:

Ms JL Hartnick (DA) (Chairperson);
Ms L Brown (ANC); and
Ms AJD Marais (DA).
Apologies were rendered by the following Members:

Ms V Hani (ANC);
Ms TN Bevu (COPE); and
Mr AM Figlan (DA)

Ms W Kamish Achmat, Committee Co-ordinator accompanied the delegation.

The following persons were present at the Zolani Thusong Service Centre:

Mr M Gontsana: Centre Manager; and
Ms N Sesiu: Director of Service Delivery Integration: Dept. of Local Government

The following persons were present at the Emasithandane Children’s Home:
1
Mama Zelphina Maposela (Founder & Director); and
Mr Mbuyisi (Managing Coordinator)

4. **Account of the visit**

Oversight visit to the Zolani Thusong Service Centre

The Committee was welcomed by the Centre Manager; Mr M Gontsana. Ms JL Hartnick introduced members of the standing committee present and allowed the Departments to introduce themselves. She gave a brief overview on the purpose of the visit.

Mr Gontsana gave a brief overview of the Thusong Service Centres film equipment and activities and further stated that the film equipment donated by the Bavarian Staatskanzlei had benefited the community.

The Committee continued their oversight visit to the Emasithandane Children’s Home where they were welcomed by Ms Maposela, Director and founder of the home.

The Committee was briefed by Ms Maposela and Mr Mbuyisi and was taken on a tour around the home.

5. **Findings:**

Zolani Thusong Centre

(a) Mr Gontsana has been the manager since 1995 and has been improving the sports and art programmes.
The Zolani Thusong Centre operates from Monday to Thursday. It has been declassified as a Thusong Service Centre to a satellite centre and is currently managed by the City Sport and Recreation Directorate as a sport and community centre.

In 2011, the Department of Local Government conducted a Thusong Accessibility Analysis, measuring the access of citizens to Thusong related government services and information. The study indicated geographically the presence of Thusong Zones in the City of Cape Town such as Khayelitsha, Tygerberg and other areas. A Thusong zone is an area where the Thusong anchor departments are clustered together within a 5 km radius from each other.

All sports fixtures are screened at the centre. Film screenings take place on Fridays, Saturdays and Sundays. Screening takes place from 4pm – 6pm for persons under 16 and adult screening takes place from 6pm – 10pm.

The Zolani Thusong Centre has partnerships with Ster Kinekor. There are 150 seats in the theatre but it can accommodate up to 250 – 300 people.

Home affairs and SASSA render scheduled services at Zolani Thusong Centre.

Emasithandane Children’s Home

It is a home/shelter that provides education, food and extra mural programmes for orphans; abandoned, abused and vulnerable children; including those affected by HIV/AIDS in South Africa.

Currently there are 39 children living at Emasithandane, and the home provides a community feeding kitchen for an additional 25 children in the community.

They work closely with Social Workers to assist in placing children.

Emasithandane became an officially registered safe home with the South African government on 19 October 2004.

Emasithandane offers sport training and programmes for 80 children in the community.

Eight staff members work in two shifts respectively, during the day and night, cooking meals and monitoring the well-being of the children to ensure that they are under supervision at all times. The staff members perform voluntary work at Emasithandane. They take care of the babies, monitor sicknesses, accompany children to the clinics, cook, ensure nutritious diets are provided to the children, maintain the kitchen, clean the facility and maintain the yard.

Emasithandane works with CHOSA (Children of South Africa) volunteers twice a week to present after-school programmes to the children. The programme teaches general English classes that focus on all four skills which is listening, reading, writing and speaking as well as the study of vocabulary and grammar.
They assist the children to better understand their school work and assignments. These classes are held at the Zolani Thusong Centre.

(h) They offer a performing arts programmes, facilitate training workshops, soccer tournaments and run short programmes. These programmes, activities, training, and events raise awareness on the work of Emasithandane and teach the basic skills to children. The activities serve as fundraisers as well.

(i) The Emasithandane Centre’s sole source of income is derived from private funding and the hosting of fundraising events.

4. Concerns:

(a) The Zolani Thusong Centre does not have internet access and this makes it difficult for the Centre Manager to perform his daily tasks.

(b) With regards to the Emasithandane Children’s Home the concerns is as follows:

(i) There is no financial assistance from the Government;
(ii) 6 beds in one room are shared by 12 girls;
(iii) The children ranging from the ages of 4 to 8 years old are in one room. There are 15 children sharing a room;
(iv) The roofs are leaking and they don’t have sufficient funds to fix or maintain the house;
(v) There are 3 toilets for 39 children and 8 staff members; and
(vi) Mama Zelphina Maposela also shares rooms with a few girls.

5. Recommendations

(a) That the Department of the Premier assists the Centre with provisioning of internet access especially for the manager at the Zolani Thusong Centre; and
(b) That the Department of Social Development intervenes at the Emasithandane Children’s Home to assist or guide the home where possible.

6. Acknowledgements

The Chairperson thanked the Committee and respective officials who attended the Oversight visits.
The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 8360

BUSINESS OF HOUSE

(Motion)

†Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I move the motion standing in my name on the Order Paper, as follows:

That, notwithstanding Rule 198, precedence be given to the Order of the Day.

†The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections.

Agreed to.

†Ms L BROWN: I am not sure. [Laughter.]

†The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, over to you.

(Motion)

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I move the motion standing in my name on the Order Paper, as follows:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 18, the session on 4 December 2013 to read as follows: 10:00 to adjournment.

†The SPEAKER: Any objection?

†An HON MEMBER: No.

†The SPEAKER: No objection.

Agreed to.

†The SPEAKER: Your last chance Chief Whip.
(Motion)

†Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I move the motion standing in my name on the Order Paper, as follows:

That, notwithstanding Rule 161, the House considers the principle and finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 – 2013] on Wednesday, 4 December 2013.

†The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections.

Agreed to.

ORDER OF THE DAY

†The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Chief Whip. We now proceed to the Order of the day. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.


†The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Minister Winde. Over to you.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker, Leader of the Opposition, my hon colleagues here on this side of the House and members of this legislature, the Director-General and heads of department, the special guests that are here today, my fellow colleagues in government who are committed to building a better future on behalf of all of the people of our province, and the citizens of the Western Cape.

I am honoured to address you in this House today on the DA-led Western Cape government’s policy priorities and on the adjustments estimates for 2013. This year’s medium term budget policy statement gives direction to the departments of this government as to how they should set their budgets in the years to come.

When we sat down to craft it we began by asking ourselves two fundamental questions: what and why. What do we hope to achieve and why do we seek to achieve it. The first question is defined by the mandate upon which the voters elected us to power in 2009. Our number one priority is and will remain to build an open opportunity society for all. By open we mean a society which promotes accountability and transparency in government, security of person and property, tolerance towards differences and an economy that is led by the free choices of individuals. In this society the State’s powers are limited and the individuals are free to pursue their own ends within the rule of law. By opportunity, Mr Speaker, we mean a society in which all citizens have the wherewithal to take advantage of their freedoms.

The key tools to achieve this are a good education, access to basic health care and the prospect of gainful employment.
In an open opportunity society one’s future is determined by one’s talent and efforts and the economy works for every person who is determined to contribute. We also believe wholeheartedly, as Nelson Mandela once said, that South Africa belongs to all who live in it, both black and white. Our desire is to build a country in which all South Africans enjoy full equality. It is this society...

†The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon mem Mr Magaxa.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Discrimination on the grounds of race and other characteristics of birth are rejected. We clearly acknowledge the wrongs of the past and put positive steps in place to make them right. The second question why, why are we striving to achieve an open opportunity society for all, is arguably far more important. In answering it I would like to share with you the stories of two young men of our time.

The first was born in Soweto on 28 January 1962, the very same year that a fellow resident Mr Nelson Mandela was arrested, tried and sentenced to jail. As a small boy of 8 years old he worked 14 hour shifts in his father’s spaza shop serving mine workers returning home from a life underground. It was during this time that he learnt the basics of business, developed an ability to work hard and an appetite for success. His ambition drove him to finish school and move to Swaziland to further his education. After completing a BA degree there he came back to South Africa to study law, as this was a long time passion of his. He studied this at the University of the Witwatersrand. On the dawn of democracy in 1994 he was ready to take up a position as one of three of South Africa’s first black lawyers.

Understanding that he had choices and confident in his ability, soon afterwards he left a steady job to start his own business. During his first 8 months as an entrepreneur he worked from his briefcase, unable to secure a bank loan. Today, Mr Speaker, that same young boy from Soweto has become South Africa’s best entrepreneur, its first black billionaire. Perhaps not realising the significance of their choice at the time, the young boy’s parents named their son after one of Africa’s most prominent leaders, a man who also fought for freedom, Mr Patrice Lumumba. Yes, this story is of Mr Patrice Motsepe.

This leads me to my next story. 18 years after Mr Motsepe was born, another son destined to make a profound mark on our country came into the world. He was also born in Soweto, in a small suburb called Dobsonville, to a mom from the Eastern Cape and a dad from the North West province. His parents recognised early on that a good education would be key to a better life for him and his siblings and they made sacrifices to send their children to the best school that they could afford. In this way they ensured that they gave their children the opportunities which they themselves were never able to have.

Unhindered by the bad start, which so many others experienced, the young man went on to study psychology and complete two masters degrees in theology and public and development management. Today he is standing to become the next premier of Gauteng.
*Mr H P GEYER: Hear, hear!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is his hope that he can deliver the opportunities he received to other South Africans both black and white. Like Patrice, Mmusi Maimane’s name is just as fit. Translated from SeTswana, Mmusi means ruler or governor. Mr Speaker, I would like to take this opportunity to wish him and his caucus well as they work to bring the open opportunity society to all the residents of Gauteng.

†An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

*An HON MEMBER: Well done!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, the life stories of these two gentlemen prove that ours is a country in which a boy who spends his days behind the counter of a spaza shop and another from less privileged circumstances in Dobsonville can defy the odds and become the very best that they can be. Unfortunately these cases are all too rare. The reality for most is that the hope of leading a life of dignity is a long forgotten dream. For many South Africans each and every day represents a new struggle to put food on the table or to afford the bus fare to look for work.

Mr Speaker, colleagues and residents of our province, this is a reality we must change. That is why we are seeking to build a more open society, one in which opportunities to become the next big entrepreneur or the next leader of a province are available to all. For our part we have and will continue to push back against bad service delivery that for too long has served to make our poor people poorer. Over the past four and a half years we have used all the powers at our disposal to lay the foundation for an economy that works. We are confident that we are in a better position today than we were when we took power and that in the near future residents who are willing to work hard will begin to feel the difference in their everyday lives.

Despite being on a good track, Mr Speaker, the public and private sector still have a lot of work to do to get our economy working for everybody. We need more jobs, more investment, faster and higher growth rates and we need our economy to become more inclusive. Next year and beyond the Western Cape government’s policies will be focused on those areas which will make the biggest impact in getting us there.

We are guided by the National Development Plan, which we have translated into six transitions as outlined in our One Cape 2040 strategy document. We believe that put together the six transitions, namely Educating Cape, Enterprising Cape, Green Cape, Connecting Cape, Living Cape and Leading Cape [Interjections.] will encourage a resilient, inclusive and competitive Western Cape with higher rates of employment, growing income and greater equality and an improved greater equality and quality of life.

For five years in a row we have cut expenditure on programmes and projects that were not achieving tangible results.
We have also noted the change Minister Pravin Gordhan made in his medium term budget policy statement regarding extravagant expenditure by politicians and senior officials. Almost to a ‘T’, Mr Speaker, these are our policies which we implemented through changes to our ministerial handbook in 2010. Through the changes that we made back then we have already saved the people of this province R100 million [Interjections.] Our efforts have been intensified by the global economic downturn which has placed pressure on government’s fiscus and demanded of us to tighten our own belts.

Even though we are due to see a slight improvement in the global economy in the year ahead, we remain mindful of the downside risks of our own making which is likely to create volatility in South Africa’s economy and therefore our own here in the Western Cape. These include local supply side disruptions and diminished foreign investment as a consequence of increased and violent strike action. If we can work together to ease these tensions, especially in the light of the elections next year, we have a better chance of capitalising on stronger demand for our key trade partners as the global economy recovers.

In the meantime, we will continue to support those policies that are most crucial in making our economy work, attracting investment and skilling our citizens for the jobs of today and of tomorrow. This pertains especially to those who have been left out of the economy. While in the Western Cape we have started to make some gains in addressing joblessness, around a quarter of our working age population remain unemployed. This figure doubles for youths between the ages of 15 and 24. If we cannot create an environment in which meaningful incomes become a reality for the majority of citizens, our people’s ability to escape poverty and grasp opportunities will be dashed. We share Mmusi Maimane’s parents’ belief that the key to a better life starts with a good education, which is why the very first transition is One Cape 2040 and our most important policy priority.

Mr Speaker, in the medium term expenditure framework period ahead we will invest the largest proportion of our budget in the education system so that each and every child has the wherewithal to shape himself or herself for a productive and successful future, because we know that education is the key to the open opportunity society for over one million learners in our province. We have worked tirelessly to return the ailing system we inherited in 2009 to a healthier state.

This required of us to apply direct pressure to key points of concern including underperformance on the part of some of our principals and teachers, a lack of parent and learner commitment, inadequate resources and outdated school environments. Through our clear and focused plan to improve education in the Western Cape we have managed to reduce the number of underperforming high schools, that is schools with a pass rate of less than 50%, from 85 in 2009 to 26 in 2012. We have increased the national senior certificate pass rate in our poorer schools from 56,9% to 70,9%, and overall we have improved the matric pass rate from 75,7% to 82,9%. I sincerely trust that those matrics that are finishing off their exams now are going to show further improvement to these statistics.
In addition to this, we have seen a steady increase in the number of students writing and passing the matric examinations as well as the number of learners who have achieved access to study further. We will relentlessly pursue further improvements in our education system. Our future plans in this regard include the provision of daily meals to more learners, the continued roll out of more text books across particular grades, competency tests for aspirant principals, and an ambitious infrastructure spending programme to build new and replacement schools. We will also roll out mobile health clinics so that we are able to measure the wellness of our children at key development milestones. This is another South African first.

While changing an education system is a lengthy and arduous task, our results show that we are turning the corner.

†Mr H P GEYER: Hear, hear.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: In the near future we are confident that our children’s chances in life will not be affected by whether they come from Hout Bay, Hanover Park or Hotagterklip or whether they attend public or private school. Our plan is to ensure that no matter which school our children attend and no matter where it is in our province they will receive equally good education. Of course this will put the ball in their court. Our initiatives will work best when matched with an ambition on the part of our learners to lead better lives by giving of their very best during their school years. If our young people are afforded good education, the possibility of them transitioning successfully into adulthood becomes much more likely. The major difference of course is that the door to employment swings wide open.

Mr Speaker, that moves me onto Enterprising Cape. Our job is to create an environment that attracts investment and encourages job creating growth. The second transition of One Cape 2040 is Enterprising Cape, our plan to create a Western Cape which is globally recognised as a destination where it is easy to do business.

In this version of the Western Cape every person who is willing to work hard has a chance to do so. Early on in this term we undertook research into the factors hindering economic growth and job creation. Business told us that the biggest obstacle they face in expanding their companies and in employing more staff was red tape. In order to address these concerns we set up a red tape hot line and unit staffed by a professional team with transversal links to all levels of government which acts on behalf of the public to troubleshoot particular bureaucratic pitfalls. We also completed several high level studies into common areas of concern and are working behind the scenes to ensure that they are alleviated. In the near future we will also roll out regular impact assessments through which we will test whether new legislation will help or hurt business before we put it in place.

Mr Speaker, making our economy work also involves making it attractive for foreign investors. If international companies come here it creates jobs for our people.
Our most recent figures show that despite the economic downturn, we continue to draw strong levels of investment. Wesgro estimated that in the last year, the 2012/13 financial year, 1783 new jobs were created through investment projects. Since coming to power in this province, we have attracted 80 investment projects into this province to the value of R30.1 billion. To further strengthen our trade ties with nations across the world, we are in the process of developing an international relations strategy focused on economic diplomacy. We will generate investment by building bridges between the Western Cape and key economies around the world. We must also make sure that our residents have the necessary skills to take advantage of new economic opportunities. This is why we are supporting strategies to match our skills demand and supply. Through various platforms, including the Provincial Skills Forum, we are working with the private sector and academia to respond to our changing job market.

As mentioned earlier, youth unemployment remains a serious problem, and the majority of our skills development initiatives target young people. Both the national development plan and One Cape 2040 cite increasing employment for young job seekers as a core priority. Over the next three years we will continue to invest in our plan to get young people onto the first rung of the economic ladder. Through two flagship initiatives, the Work and Skills Programme and the PAY Project, we have given over five thousand unemployed youths the opportunity to enter the job market.

Mr Speaker, in the years ahead, we will use the lessons we have learnt in the roll out of these programmes in conjunction with the new tax legislation announced on the youth wage subsidy due to start in April 2014, to set up a facilitation unit that will work with the private sector to make it easy for business to access this scheme. I would like business to commit by utilising this programme to increase their staff establishment by 10%. This will generate over 100 000 jobs for unemployed youth in our province, and this will be a partnership and we will do this together, and this will create hope for young people in that risk sector in our province.

We also recognise the need to develop specialised skills in the emerging sectors of our economy, including oil and gas, renewable energy and ship-building. The launch of the Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone earlier this month will usher in a boom for our oil and gas vessel repair industry, and we must have skilled employees to meet its need. At present the average age of an artisan in our province is 55 years old. Our ground breaking Artisan Development Programme offers young unemployed residents the in-service training they need to obtain their official qualification in that artisan space.

Mr Speaker, small businesses have also been identified as a key job creator. The Western Cape is fast becoming known as a hub for entrepreneurial excellence. We are dedicated to supporting new and emerging SMME’s through amongst others, 21 economic development centres located across the province which we co-fund in partnership with the national government. This is South Africa’s largest network of one-stop shops assigned to help entrepreneurs.
Mr Speaker, because we believe that a job is the way out of poverty, we will also be investigating how to use the Expanded Public Works Programme as a tool to lift people from unemployment. While EPWP has been designed as a temporary relief for poverty-stricken households, we believe it holds the potential to become a key driver of skill for our people. Since 2009 the Western Cape Expanded Public Works Programme has generated 382 072 employment opportunities. This means that these 382 000 residents were given an opportunity to improve their life circumstances.

Our drive to create economic growth and jobs unfolds against the background of the changing landscape of our province. The functional metro region generates 85% of our provincial GDP and the majority of jobs. This has resulted in an influx of residents from our rural areas and other provinces to our urban nodes. In recognition of the pressure that this has placed on our physical assets, we have embarked on a comprehensive capital investment plan focused on improving our education and healthcare facilities and our roads.

Another part of our infrastructure plan involved generating service delivery revenue for the state by releasing government property into the open market. The successful lease of the Sea Point school property marks an important milestone in the profitable management of our property assets and in terms of this programme we will see far more coming in during the next year or two.

Mr Speaker, I now move on to the next stage or the next theme which is Connecting Cape. To ensure that we are not left out of the digital revolution sweeping the world, we will invest in the roll out of broadband infrastructure to every town and village of our province. The hard work in making this a reality has already begun. The first stream of this project is to connect all government buildings, including schools, by the end of 2015. The second stream strives to connect communities, businesses, households and municipalities.

Our R3 million Wi-Fi Project, which aims to take free wireless internet into poor communities - this is a pilot project in the lead-up to the delivery of the bigger broadband project - has already commenced. I also include in this stream the development of additional ICT incubators. Our first ICT incubator, the Bandwidth Barn, has generated international attention due to its success in growing entrepreneurship in our province. While broadband links our people to economic opportunities around the world, it is our network of roads which link them to the economy at home.

That is why we will focus on keeping our busy roads in good condition and on improving roads that are in poor condition but have socio-economic significance. In 2009 we set ourselves the target of reducing our road maintenance backlog by 16%. I am pleased to inform that 93% of all vehicle kilometres in our province are now travelled on fair to very good roads. To overturn apartheid spatial segregation we will roll out regional social economic or socio-economic projects and further Violence Prevention through Urban Upgrade spaces across other municipalities in the province. The success of our first VPUU in Harare reduced the murder rate by up to 14% and lowered crime rates, creating a climate for increased economic opportunity, social cohesion and prosperity.
Mr Speaker, because we understand that the world cannot continue to place a burden on its natural assets, the Western Cape is committed to going green. Our goal in this respect is to position the province as Africa’s leading green economic hub. To achieve this we have devised a green economic strategic framework which outlines how we will move away from resource-intense fossil fuels towards renewable energy resources and natural gas. Going green need not be a burden. We plan to use green growth as a leading catalyst for investment and job creation.

Then we move to Living Cape, the fifth transition of the One Cape 2040 plan. Our plan is to ensure that no matter where they are from, residents of the Western Cape enjoy good living standards and equal access to basic and essential services. The Western Cape must become a good place for business and a great place to live. To further improve the livelihoods of more Western Cape residents, we are investing in projects which inspire healthy, safe and inclusive communities. This requires investing more in areas which were traditionally starved of state capital.

In under-resourced areas of our province, the burden of disease resulting from preventable diseases remains a serious concern. In addition, in-migration is placing pressure on our health services, and because the wellness of our residents is key to the functioning of our economy, we have redoubled our efforts to improve our healthcare system. I am pleased to note that our approach has already begun to yield results. In our province, anti-retroviral treatment is readily available to people living with HIV and Aids, and in the last financial year, over 134 000 residents received this life-prolonging treatment from government. This has resulted in the Western Cape having the lowest HIV prevalence rate. We have also made significant advances in lowering mother-to-child transmission and in lowering maternal mortality. Our dream is for all residents of our province - regardless of race or status - to receive equally good medical care. To ensure this, we will invest in the expansion of our services in areas where they are needed most, including in Dunoon and Delft. We will be upgrading the emergency centres across the province and we will see the replacement of the GF Jooste Hospital and the redevelopment of the Tygerberg Hospital.

Living Cape also outlines our objective of fostering a society which provides a safety net for its most vulnerable residents, including children, older persons and those afflicted by substance abuse, so that they, too, can live lives of dignity. We will deliver the majority of our social services through non-governmental organisations which are located within our communities and best understand their unique needs. To help those who are addicted to drugs we will continue to expand access to drug rehabilitation services, outpatient care and early intervention services. When we came to power in 2009, the province had only 8 drug treatment centres. We have increased this to 25.

To address the alcohol abuse problem placing a strain on so many of our communities, the Western Cape Liquor Authority has embarked on a major campaign to educate residents and traders on responsible liquor behaviour.
We believe that these interventions, together with others in our Safely Home project, are resulting in a change of attitudes towards drinking and driving and excessive consumption. In the previous financial year, the Western Cape Liquor Authority held 2306 inspections to ensure licensed outlets were following the province's liquor laws. Just yesterday this authority shut down an establishment that had evaded these laws, and this happened as a result of complaints from the public. The power through this law has been put in their hands.

Mr Speaker, as we know, the youth are at the heart and future of our economy. However, the youth also face several, well-documented challenges, some of which I have mentioned in this speech. We are currently in the process of devising a strategy which suggests mechanisms to improve the life chances of young people. The further roll out of our MOD Centre programme - through which we offer a range of sporting and cultural activities to children and unemployed youth to divert them from negative activities - is likely to form a big part of this strategy. The Western Cape government recognises that our living spaces contribute directly to our ability to lead lives of dignity and of opportunity. This is why we will invest in the delivery of integrated human settlements over the next three years, to create sustainable, thriving communities which are committed to doing more than simply just building structures. To overcome the legacy of apartheid spatial planning, we are reviewing the Provincial Spatial Development Framework. Once approved, this will be the key instrument in guiding the planning and expenditure of provincial departments. The policy priorities spelt out in the Living Cape transition will seek to strengthen our economic resilience and ensure that every single one of the Western Cape's six million residents are included in this region's growth.

Mr Speaker, then I move to Leading Cape. A critical factor for the success of all of the above transitions is the improvement of our systems of government. We have committed ourselves to a programme of action that will allow us to become one of the best-run regional governments in the world. In recent years, South Africa's public sector has not kept pace with the latest technological advancements. This means that we have begun to hold back opportunities for the individuals that we serve in the private sector and those who access our basic and social services. Holes in our procurement methods have also allowed corruption to creep in. In the coming years, we will undertake to completely refresh our systems. We are already in the process of developing new systems to oversee our strategic information and data, annual performance planning and reporting, and project management. We also aim to adopt biometric fingerprinting technology which will leave no room for crooked officials to cheat the procurement system through which we buy around R9 billion worth of goods and services on an annual basis. Our efforts to improve the quality of service delivery by our departments and municipalities within the province will be augmented by our programme to boost our corporate governance. Through the CGRO endeavour, we will continue to provide hands on support to our staff to assist them in closing the gaps identified by the Auditor-General in their management processes. This service incorporates a dedicated helpdesk which offers advice on best practice accounting methods and a data analyst service to enhance the accuracy and competency of financial information.
We recognise that the biggest determinant of whether we will be able to play our part in delivering an open opportunity society, is our staff. We are dedicated to making this administration a caring, competent, accountable and responsive place of work that operates at all times with the highest level of integrity. Above all, it should become driven to deliver outcomes that make a real difference in people’s lives. I am confident that through our focus on getting the basics right, our dedication in supporting the continuous development of our staff so that each employee can play an impactful role in our great project, we will achieve our goal of becoming a world class organisation.

Mr Speaker, over the medium term, this government will spend just shy of R150 billion to deliver equitable services to its people. This will be financed primarily through national transfers, including the provincial equitable share and conditional grants, which is likely to account for 95.87% of our budget. Own receipts of which motor licences or motor vehicle licence fees and casino taxes make up the majority share, contribute a further 4.13%. According to our calculations, national transfers to our province are expected to increase by R2,101 billion in 2014/15; R3,555 billion in 2015/16 and R3,574 billion in 2016/17. Conditional grants are forecast to reduce by R707,996 million in 2014/15, before increasing by R497,499 million in 2015/16 and a further R513,060 million in 2016/17. Over the 2014 MTEF or Medium Term Expenditure Framework, this amounts to an average annual increase in our overall equitable share of 8.37%, a rise which reflects the adjustments made to account for the increase in our population as determined by Census 2011.

Mr Speaker, I then move on to the adjustments, this Adjustments Budget that I will be tabling. The Adjustments Budget provides for an additional expenditure of R340,971 million. In the main it provides for infrastructure related expenditure, of which R69,814 million is provided for hospital revitalisation and other infrastructure related issues; R19,856 million is provided for the repair and replacement of infrastructure damaged by floods, and I must say that these are not floods that have just happened over the weekend, that is a process that is going to still come. These are the floods that happened a year ago. R86,311 million is provided for Provincial Regeneration Projects; R89,400 million for roads infrastructure projects and R54,035 million for property acquisitions. R92,17 million is provided for the infrastructure related projects from the 2012/13 provincial rollover and revenue over-collection, of which R4 million is dedicated to the refurbishment of parliament; R9 million is dedicated for Social Development facilities; R19 million is dedicated to the acceleration of housing delivery and a further R59 million to roads infrastructure.

Further allocations are made from 2012/13 provincial rollovers, shifts between ... [inaudible] ... reserves from unavoidable or unforeseeable allocations of which R40,135 million will be allocated for diverse education requirements; R42,785 million will be shifted for ICT services including broadband connectivity and system enhancement. R8,348 million will be allocated for the Khayelitsha Police Commission of Inquiry and a further R3 million for a security strategy. Then, R4 million will be allocated to the green economy; R2,259 million for aerial fire fighting and finally R1,2 million rand for the 2014 African Nations Championship soccer tournament.
Mr Speaker, in the 2013 main budget, funding for transversal projects such as ICT and Broadband, skills development, the green economy and the Regional Socio-economic Development Programme was appropriated and provisionally reserved in the dedicated programme in Vote 3 - Provincial Treasury. These funds were accessible to departments subject to due costing, roll-out prioritisation and credible implementation plans. R47,082 million of the Special Project funding is now allocated in the 2013 Adjustments Estimate. A further R204,716 million will be allocated over the 2014 medium term. The details of all of the above projects will be expanded upon by the Ministers of each of the departments during the parliamentary processes and debates that will take place in this House over the next two weeks. All the policies I have mentioned today contribute to the transitions encapsulated in our vision, One Cape 2040.

In summary, Mr Speaker, Educating Cape outlines the plan to provide our children with an education that will open doors. Enterprising Cape sets out our programmes to drive an enabling economy that attracts investment and creates jobs. Green Cape lays bare our commitment to reducing the resource intensity of our economy in favour of renewable energy. Connecting Cape speaks to our broadband plan and our pledge to put infrastructure in place that brings residents closer to the economy. Living Cape outlines how we will build our province into a place in which citizens are able to lead lives of dignity, and Leading Cape puts forward our plan to get our basic systems of government right so that we can become the best-run regional government in the world.

Put together, these transitions will help us to achieve our goal of creating an open opportunity society for all, in which it is possible for any resident, no matter where he or she is from, to become the next Patrice Motsepe or Mmusi Maimane. Over the past five years we have laid the foundation and have started to put our vision into action. While some benefits are already beginning to accrue, we are confident that over the next three years and beyond, the lives of the Western Cape's residents, especially our most vulnerable, will begin to improve. Before I conclude, Mr Speaker, I would like to thank the entire Western Cape team, but most specifically Dr Stegmann and the provincial treasury, as well as my cabinet colleagues for their continued support and hard work in driving our vision forward. I would also like to make special thanks to my wife Tracy and my children Jason and Lauren, for whom I am intent on building a better Western Cape.

†An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I would also like to pass dedication to my team in the Ministry who back me up day and night, who make sure that they give not only the Ministry and the departments the service that is needed but more importantly, the service to those members of the public, to the people who interact with us as a government, the best Ministry in the world. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

We must remain mindful. Mr Speaker, of the challenges we face ... [Interjections.] ... and are committed to playing our part in helping all residents of our province live better lives.
Mr Speaker, I hereby table the Western Cape Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, the speech I have delivered today, the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill 2013, and the Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure 2013 for deliberation of this House. I thank you. [Applause.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Order, hon members. Order. Order hon mem Ms Brown. Hon mem Ms Brown, order. The Secretary will read the Bill for the first time.

Bill read a first time.

†The SPEAKER: The Bill together with the papers tabled will be referred to the relevant committees for consideration and report. Thank you very much, hon Minister Winde.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

*Ms A ROSSOUW (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker the WKOD should be praised for the pilot program in offering an African language at schools. This initiative once again proves the commitment of the Western Cape Government to strive for excellence with the promotion of the official languages of the Western Cape. Last week the department announced that 11 schools in the metro area have been identified to participate in the pilot program which will offer isiXhosa, one of the Western Cape official languages, from Grade 1. So far the Western Cape Department of Education put forward the most practical and carefully considered plan to accommodate isiXhosa as an additional subject in schools. The department’s implementation has been carefully considered and shows the necessary insight to address the problems that may arise effectively. The schools identified to participate are spread across the metro. It includes previously disadvantaged schools as well as schools whose language medium is monolingual as well as bilingual. The schools were selected in such a way to ensure that they are close to resources and to accommodate teachers who may have to commute between schools. This will ensure that once implementation of the national program commences in 2015 the Western Cape, under the leadership of the DA, will ensure that concerns are identified and addressed and what the practical resources of this curriculum will be. The promotion of our official languages is of cardinal importance to the DA and therefore it is important that language education from day 1 occurs correctly, else it will be a waste of resources and time. It is for this reason that the DA would like to congratulate Minister Grant and wish him … [Interjections.]

*Mr P UYS: Where is he?

*Ms A ROSSOUW: … on this pilot program and the wonderful degree of insight … [Interjections.]

*Mr H P GEYER: He is working.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: … which his department showed with the implementation thereof. … [Interjections.]
*Mr P UYS: Where is he working?

*Ms A ROSSOUW: ... we look forward to seeing the results. I thank you.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ANC – hon member Mr Uys.

†Mr P UYS (ANC): Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA is today again without its distant and absent Premier Helen Zille, who still prefers to be elsewhere, but of course MEC Meyer and MEC Grant are here so we can carry on. It is clear that governance is not a priority of the DA led by the hon Zille. Instead she is in Britain to seek direction from her policy strategist Ryan Coetzee. How is her going there assisting poor residents of the Cape? [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No the poor …

†Mr P UYS: She is not here seized by her responsibilities as Premier. There is a disaster with flooding in the province, sanitation and housing but she goes everywhere but to stay here with the people in need, knocking on her door in the Western Cape where she refuses to help them. [Interjections.]

*Mr H P GEYER: I can see now …[Interjections.]

*Mr P UYS: She has a distorted way to react to the request of people by flying off to the UK. Why not send her national parliamentary leader to attend to such minor DA matters? [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier refuses to meet and speak with people here in Wale Street where her office is. Not even women are met, but she is very quickly on a plane to run off to the UK.

The Western Cape government is not a priority for the DA and its leader, Zille. For long periods - in fact this time for three months - Zille does not answer our questions in this legislature. Not even her acting Premier, and we see the acting Premier there … [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: She is going to answer your question. [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mr P UYS: … may answer questions on her behalf. Mr Deputy Speaker, is it any wonder … [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: They cannot. That is the problem.

†Mr P UYS: … then that even experts on national media question the governance of Zille and her party? [Interjections.] The DA poses as a national party … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order, hon member Mr Uys. [Interjections.] Order. Is there a question?
†Mr M G E WILEY: The hon member Mr Uys once again overreaches himself. Other members of this House are all “honourable”.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Please continue, hon member Mr Uys.

†Ms L BROWN: And the point is?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

†Mr M G E WILEY: We abide by the rules of the House. You should know that better than anybody else.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†Ms L BROWN: And the point is? Stop pointing at me! [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Ms Brown! Please continue, hon member Mr Uys. [Interjections.] Order! Order!

†Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am very sorry. You know, I am threatened ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you raising a point of order?

†Ms L BROWN: I want to raise a point of order that I am constantly threatened by that hon member over there and I really, really want you to rule on this matter. You know it is a very difficult position for me to tolerate a man who does that to me. So I would like you to rule on that one.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! I am not aware of any threat. I have not seen any threats, so please continue, hon member Mr Uys.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA poses as a national party, while it is mostly regional in character. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mr P UYS: Or is it just ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is a national party.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Uys, your time has almost expired. You have one more ... [Interjections.]

†Mr P UYS: Yes, but there were major interruptions.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give you one more sentence, please.
†Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Or is it just the payment, package and perks here that counts, why a national leader will be in a regional Parliament? [Time expired.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Order!

†An HON MEMBER: Look at how Zille ... [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: She must do her day job.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. I see the DA. [Interjections.] I see the DA. [Interjections.]

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS (DA): Mr Speaker, 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children will commence on Monday, 25 November 2013. The importance of this period is significantly pivotal in South Africa, especially with its increasing cases of violence against women and children.

The most broadcasted case of violence in 2013 was the gruesome rape and murder of Anene Booysen. Mr Deputy Speaker, increasing at a rapid pace is that of child-on-child violence. Each day we hear about child-on-child violence, many of which end up fatally; seven-year-olds drilling a piece of metal into a five-year-old’s head, pupils stabbing and shooting each other, children raping children - this is a reality, not only in the Western Cape but South Africa as a whole.

I urge all role-players, especially all the Ministers and their departments, to make concerted efforts to reduce these horrific incidents, which are taking the lives of children whose right to life is violated. I call on all members to not only hear what I am saying but to acknowledge the severity of the issue, follow through with your oversight role and let us redress the loss of young lives in the Western Cape.

I also encourage all stakeholders to speak out on these disconcerting cases and call hon Minister Lulu Xingwana to duty as the champion of women and children, as she has been silent on so many issues impeding on their basic human rights.

Child-on-child violence does not lie with one department or sphere of government. It requires the cooperation of all departments and all three spheres of government working together to counter these acts of violence. I thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see COPE. Hon member Ms Bevu.

†Ms T N BEVU (COPE): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As Cope we regard the new regulations on the safety of cyclists a step in the right direction. We welcome also that motorists must leave at least one metre between the car and the cyclist when passing. We commend the MEC of Transport and Public Works for allowing common sense to prevail over emotions on this Traffic Administration Act. [Interjections.]
†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is kind of you!

†Ms T N BEVU: Experience shows that in countries where the strict liability law is applied, abuses ensue from the cyclists’ side also. We are glad that in the Western Cape the onus of proof for the one metre distance falls on the motorist without necessarily making the motorist at fault in all accidents that involve cyclists. We would also like to encourage cyclists, where they can, to wear helmets with cameras. The truth of the matter is that some cyclists are an example of the problematic “aggressive minority” syndrome and are serious flouters of traffic rules too like riding abreast, jumping robots, weaving in and out of traffic, not signalling, failing to stop for pedestrians at zebra-crossings, and cycling the wrong way down one-way roads.

Cyclist regulations need to be tightened also to curb this dangerous behaviour among cyclists. Something also needs to be done with the influx of novice cyclists on the roads, especially during cycle tour competitions. Perhaps we should be looking at licensing cyclists who want to be on public roads.

Of course we know this might be politically incorrect, but we cannot allow a situation whereby cyclists take over the roads and do as they please. There is certainly bad behaviour from both sides - cyclists and motorists, but cyclists are not protected by the metal body of a car, so it is only fair that the traffic laws be biased towards their safety. This does not mean they must be given carte blanche to do as they please. The Western Cape Traffic Administration Act does aim at striking the right balance.

On another note, we would like the MEC to provide us with statistics ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired, just finish off please.

†Ms T N BEVU: Thank you. We would like the MEC to provide us with statistics of how much cyclist traffic goes through the built cyclist lanes in Adderley Street. I certainly have not seen any; hence I wonder if building those lanes was a waste of taxpayer's money done without conducting proper feasibility studies?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has now finally expired.

†Ms T N BEVU: Thank you. [Time expired.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the ANC.

†Ms L BROWN (ANC): Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is a pity that the MEC for Finance is not here today, but I must tell him that a child growing up in Manenberg and a child growing up in Knysna overlooking the bay has a very different life, so when you want to do an open opportunity society you must remember that the circumstances are different for children, and it is that that the DA has found itself courting today.
That is why it flip-flopped like that on empowerment, on redress and the media tries to write it off as the liberals and the conservatives and so on, but it is not that. The issue that we are confronted with is an issue of race. It is an issue of the acknowledgement of our apartheid past that for decades have ensured whites benefit from an enablement that ensured they remained in power, whether it is economically, socially and politically. [Interjections.] I know that it is very hard to hear this.

*An HON MEMBER: Oh dear!

†Ms L BROWN: But you must remember, you cannot ignore; you must not try to ignore the Manenberg experience, the Bonteheuwel experience, the Gugulethu experience. In fact even in Hout Bay, in Hout Bay you speak about the Republic of Hout Bay, but the black people live in Imizamo Yethu, the coloured people live in Hangberg. and the wealthy ...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

†Ms L BROWN: ... the wealthy, rich and white live in Hout Bay itself, so opportunistically the DA has to woo black voters and in doing so it appointed a few young black leaders and - hey presto! The DA now has a black caucus who lived the debilitating experience of apartheid and understand that they have to transform the economy, employment and our society, because they lived the experience. [Interjections.] Do not try to ignore the experience of black people and poor people. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Ms L BROWN: And I am shocked that even the hon Minister Madikizela laughs at this. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Brown, your time has expired. I will allow you a sentence.

Ms L BROWN: [Inaudible.] [Time expired.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you done? Thank you. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: Even you are laughing! Even you [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I see the DA.

†Ms L BROWN: It is shocking!

†Ms J L HARTNICK (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to welcome my guests from Paarl here today. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker yesterday, 20 November 2013, signified Universal Children’s Day. The DA acknowledges the commemoration of Universal Children’s Day as important to promote international togetherness, awareness among children worldwide and improving the life chances of children.
This year I would like to focus on the holistic approach governmental departments ought to adopt in improving children’s welfare in South Africa. I refer to governmental departments of all three spheres of government and not only one department specifically, because building healthy families and safeguarding children’s futures require the collaboration of all structures of government.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the crucial developmental phase in every child’s life is commonly considered to be from conception to age six. At pregnancy, health departments should deliver quality services in early antenatal booking, nutritional support and maternal mental health screening. In the infancy stage, which is from birth to two years old, home affairs and health departments should deliver the services of birth registration, social grant access, health and nutritional support, immunisations, developmental screening and caregiver support.

In the pre-school phase from three to four years old, quality early learning programmes, parenting education, health and nutritional support is required to improve children’s welfare. In the foundation phase, five to nine years old, it is important for the development of a child to receive quality education services, healthcare support, positive developmental programmes as well as socially cohesive family.

I urge all ministers and their departments to continue to work toward delivering these services to the children of the Western Cape so that they can live lives they value. I thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Ms Hartnick. Your time has also expired. I do not see the ID. Then I will see the DA again. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Walters.

†Mr M C WALTERS (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA welcomes the binding decision by the Constitutional Court to confirm the Minister of Local Government and Environmental Affairs, Mr Anton Bredell, correct in his application of existing legislation in the Lagoon Bay saga and that the Minister has the final say over the rezoning of the municipal areas under the Land Use Planning Ordinance. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We remember it.

†Mr M C WALTERS: The court also remitted the subdivision application to the George Municipality for reconsideration. It should be noted that the municipality cannot conclude a subdivision if the necessary rezoning approval has not been obtained.

The Constitutional Court said it accepted zoning was generally a municipal competence. However, it found that there was a category of cases where land-use planning decisions exceeded the bounds of municipal planning because of the scope of the interests they affected, and therefore required oversight. Lagoon Bay fell into that category.
In sum, the provincial Minister refused the rezoning application because he considered the proposed development to have many adverse and uncertain consequences, and therefore to be undesirable. This determination was based on his consideration of information provided by all relevant functionaries as well as Lagoon Bay.

The Constitutional Court confirmed that there were good reasons and relevant considerations supporting his concerns about the socio-economic impact of the proposed development, including its likely adverse effects on the unique and cultural historical resources of the area, with related implications for the region’s tourism potential, its lack of support for policies of integration, densification or the improvement of living conditions in the area, and its potential for resulting in an urban sprawl.

The court thus found that the Minister’s reasoning that the proposed development would have many adverse and uncertain consequences as well as being undesirable, to be valid.

The Constitutional Court agreed with the High Court that Lagoon Bay has failed to set out a proper basis on which it could set the Minister’s decision aside. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Walters. Your time has also expired. The ANC.

†Mr K E MAGAXA (ANC): The ANC calls for an urgent investigation into the floods and fires that too frequently ravage and damage poor communities. If this province has money for the hon Premier Helen Zille to appoint a commission of inquiry into policing that was quickly awarded, then it would be easy to find the money and speedily institute a full blown examination of the fires that kill about 200 people a year in informal settlements, floods that bring hardship and suffering as well as the other seasonal and preventative deaths like diarrhoea.

But the uncaring DA with its absent Premier will surely dismiss this as it does not fit its petty party political agenda to score cheap political points. She is all over the place trying to rescue the dwindling credibility of her political party. Questions are raised about buildings in flood plains and lines. It is also to establish whether rivers and waterways are properly kept and cleaned to prevent flooding. The ANC commends all for assistance and response to the weekend’s flooding.

What is strange is that Ground’s Up and other NGOs report that many flood victims are still waiting for promised relief. This follows only weeks after this DA-run Western Cape government bragged about how ready it is to deal with disasters and eventualities.

†Mr H P GEYER: It was ready.

†An HON MEMBER: We are ready.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: The blind spots the ANC pointed out ... [Interjections.]
†Mr M C WALTERS: We are still ready!

†Mr K E MAGAXA: ... are visible after poor people were neglected, but all attention shifted to a hospital for the rich that had been evacuated. [Interjections.] Many of the affected people stay in areas where this DA government tells us pipes and pumps will not be put in to remove storm water and sewerage for a safer living environment.

This fallacy needs to be debunked! Let us get the investigation started! Thank you. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] The ACDP - Order! The ACDP. The ACDP first.

†Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ACDP welcomes this week’s announcements that 216 more schools from quintiles 4 and 5 have accepted the Education Department’s offer to become no-fee schools. Recognising that this is a welcome investment in the future of our youth and that it is in line with the ACDP’s vision that none of the Western Cape’s almost one million learners should be discriminated against for financial and race-related socio-economic reasons, to the extent that the quality of their education is compromised and their futures are limited or predetermined.

The ACDP is concerned that many thousands of our learners and their families remain unsure about their 2014 enrolment, even at this late stage. We appeal to the Education Department to increase support to schools with slow and/or low enrolment statistics, to urgently address the numerous enrolment challenges parents are experiencing at many schools across the province; to reintroduce the enrolment toll-free number facility for parents to use and to work with schools to speed up the confirmation of enrolment. It remains urgent that all current Western Cape learners be enrolled soonest. We encourage parents and guardians to finalise applications and to heed the Education Department’s call for early enrolment.

Last weekend’s hailstorm and floods that caused havoc in the biggest fruit-growing areas in the Western Cape and wiping out almost all of our fruit crops are of great concern to the ACDP. The ACDP calls on provincial and national departments of agriculture to ensure that the farmer support interventions that they have proudly trumpeted are realised urgently and tangibly in the affected areas, especially given that the impending European Union ban decision on South Africa’s citrus imports has caused great concerns in our citrus industry, especially amongst emerging farmers. The ACDP shares their concerns and appeals to both Ministers to act urgently and decisively in this regard. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The last one, the DA. Hon member Mr Wiley.
†Mr M G E WILEY (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In 2011 this House debated and voted against the Independent Police Investigative Directorate and the Police Secretariat Bills on the grounds that the positioning of these institutions would compromise their independence.

We argued that these vital police oversight institutions should be located either outside the police department and answerable to parliament, not the Minister of Police. We were ignored.

Already the Premier has had to lodge a formal complaint against the Secretary of Police for directly interfering or trying to influence the passage of the Western Cape Community Safety Bill - in contravention of the very law that underpins her position. But the secretary took the ANC party line - subsequently shown to be incorrect by our still independent courts.

But now we are faced with an even greater threat. IPID, by its very definition, investigates with considerable power, police criminality which, tragically, is extremely high in South Africa, occurring all the way to the upper echelons of its structures, people appointed directly by the Minister.

But now the Minister is cynically appointing as head of IPID, not just another ANC-party hack, but one with such a tainted past that belief is beggared.

Robert McBride is a convicted terrorist who either organised or personally placed bombs in public restaurants which led to the deaths of three women and horrendous injuries to 69. Since his release from death row and jail under amnesty agreement, he has been gifted plum government jobs by the ruling ANC. Each one has ended in massive controversy following either criminal intent or gross judgement lapses.

The Minister has stated that McBride is well suited for the post because he was the head of Metro Police. The facts will show that the Ekurhuleni Metro Police had serious corruption and criminal issues, directly under McBride’s nose.

If the public protector can show what a truly independent appointment can achieve: respect, integrity, impartiality, courage and honesty, which brings honour to this country, then why, oh why do we have to appoint a recidivist criminal ANC thug to investigate our police? Surely we can do better.

†An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That disposes of statements. We move on to notices of motion. Are there any motions?

†Ms L BROWN: The real terrorists are sitting on the other side of the House.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any motions where notice is given, hon member Ms Beerwinkel? Sorry. Sorry, hon member Mr Wiley?

†Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like a ruling on that statement that was made by the hon Leader of the Opposition, Ms Brown, that the real terrorists are sitting on this side of the House.
†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Leader of the Opposition, Ms Brown?

†Ms L BROWN: Can I address you on the matter, Mr Deputy Speaker?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Very briefly.

†Ms L BROWN: Yes. The hon member Mr Wiley called Robert McBride a terrorist. Now we fought, we fought in a war against - maybe where the hon member Mr Wiley has found himself in the SADF and so forth that was an honourable war. It is an honourable war from our side as people who represent the liberation movement in this province.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is the point then, hon member Mr Wiley, what is the actual point?

†Mr M G E WILEY: The point is that McBride was found guilty in a court of law!

†Ms L BROWN: Pre-1994.

†Mr M G E WILEY: As a terrorist. It is not the point. The point is that McBride was found guilty in a court - an independent court of law. [Interjections.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: All of a sudden the people are ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I am not going to rule on the fact whether the use of the word “terrorist” in the current circumstances is allowed or not ... [Interjections.] I will look at the Hansard and if there is a feeling that I have to come back I will do so. Please continue, hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

NORTHPINE PRIMARY SCHOOL: LACK OF WATER

(Notice of Motion)

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the reasons for the infrastructure problems which resulted in the Northpine Primary School repeatedly being without water for three days and two days consecutively within the space of a month, and whether there are possibly any other schools experiencing the same problems.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]
Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the reasons for the infrastructural problems which resulted in the Northpine Primary School repeatedly being without water for three- and two days consecutively within the space of a month and the question as to whether there are possibly any other schools experiencing the same problems.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

CITY OF CAPE TOWN: HOUSING CRISIS

(Notice of Motion)

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing housing crisis in the City of Cape Town which the City continues to deny.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the on-going housing crisis in the City of Cape Town which the City continues to deny.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

EMPLOYMENT EQUITY AMENDMENT BILL

(Notice of Motion)

†Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the dismissal by organised business of Premier Zille’s nonsensical claim that the Employment Equity Amendment Bill will enforce rigid racial quotas.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]
Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the dismissal by organised business of the nonsensical claim of Premier Helen Zille that the Employment Equity Amendment Bill will enforce rigid racial quotas.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

BO-KAAP RESIDENTS: LACK OF TOURISTS

(Notice of Motion)

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the fact that Bo-Kaap residents are not benefiting from the supposed tourist boom.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the fact that the residents from the Bo-Kaap are not benefiting from the supposed tourist boom.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

RUYTERWACHT: UNFAIR EVICTIONS

(Notice of Motion)

†Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the unfair evictions of people in Ruyterwacht.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the unfair evictions of people in Ruyterwacht.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.
MOONLIGHT MASS CYCLING EVENT
(Notice of Motion)

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the fallout between the DA’s Grant Pascoe and MEC Winde over the Moonlight Mass Cycling event in Cape Town.

[Laughter.]

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the fallout between Mr Grant Pascoe and Minister Winde of the Democratic Alliance over the Moonlight Mass cycling event in Cape Town.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

RISE IN TEEN GANGS: CAPE FLATS
(Notice of Motion)

†Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the rise in teen gangs on the Cape Flats.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the rise in teen gangs on the Cape Flats.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.
FUNDING FOR NO-FEE SCHOOLS FOR POOR: ACHIEVEMENTS OF ANC

(Notice of Motion)

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the achievements of the ANC-led National Government with regards to the provision of funds for no-fee schools for poor learners.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the achievements of the national Government led by the African National Congress with regard to the provision of funds for no-fee schools for poor learners.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

LATE SULAIMAN ISAACS:

(Motion of Condolence)

†Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the house extends its condolences to the family, friends, colleagues and comrades of anti-apartheid activist and official in the Western Cape Community Safety Department, Sulaiman Isaacs, who passed away last week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends, colleagues and comrades of anti-apartheid activist and official in the Department of Community Safety in the Western Cape, Sulaiman Isaacs, who passed away the past weekend.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
LATE DAWIE LE ROUX

(Motion of Condolence)

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family and relatives of Dawie Le Roux. He was the Provincial Councillor in Cape Town from 1973 and later a member of the Executive Committee in charge of land affairs and health matters. He was also a special advisor to the Western Cape Premier, Hernus Kriel. He had a special passion for Afrikaans, Afrikaans culture and wildlife. We wish his family the best.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family of Dawie le Roux, who passed away in the past week. He was a member of the Provincial Council of the then Cape Province since 1973 and later on he became a member of the Executive Committee responsible for land affairs and health. He was also a special advisor of the former Premier of the Western Cape, Hernus Kriel. He had a special passion for Afrikaans, the Afrikaans culture, nature and wildlife.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE A K DARIES

(Motion of Condolence)

†Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of ANC member and Hessequa community activist, A K Daries, who passed away last week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of member of the African National Congress and Hessequa community activist A K Daries, who passed away last week.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
WESTERN CAPE FRUIT PRODUCERS: CROP DAMAGE

(Motion)

*Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker I move without notice:

That the House offers its condolences with the astronomical crop damage suffered by the Western Cape fruit producers as a result of the recent hail storm. It is however not only the producers affected but also full time personnel and seasonal workers who will suffer economic hardship as a result of this disaster. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker I move without notice:

That the House conveys its sympathy to all the fruit producers of the Western Cape who suffered damage of astronomical proportions to their harvests as a result of the recent hail storms. The House notes that it is not only the producers that are affected, but that all permanent staff members and seasonal workers will suffer as a result of the very serious economic consequences of this disaster.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

FLOODING, WESTERN CAPE

(Motion)

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the friends and families of all those who lost their lives in the recent flooding in the Western Cape and sympathise with those who lost their homes and belongings.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the friends and families of all those who lost their lives in the recent flooding in the Western Cape and sympathises with those who lost their homes and belongings.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
MOSSEL BAY MUNICIPALITY

(Motion)

*Mr H P Geyer: Mr Deputy Speaker I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Mossel Bay Municipality, the mayor, the staff and inhabitants of Mossel Bay on being selected as the greenest municipality in the Western Cape.

[Motion as moved by member.]
SAPS: CENTENARY ANNIVERSARY

(Motion)

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African Police Service on the attainment of its centenary anniversary; that the House further wish all members of the service well and thank them for their service to South Africa and the Western Cape.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African Police Service on the attainment of its Centenary Anniversary; and wishes all members of this service well and thanks them for their service to South Africa and to the Western Cape.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE ISAIAH ADRIANSE

(Motion of Condolence)

†Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of two-year old Isaiah Adrianse, who died in a shack fire in Lavender Hill.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of 2-year old Isaiah Adrianse, who died in a shack fire in Lavender Hill.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
DEPT. OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: BATHO PELE SERVICE AWARD
(Motion)

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Department of Community Safety on being awarded the Batho Pele Service Award for being the best provincial department in the country.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Department of Community Safety of the Western Cape on being awarded the Batho Pele service award for being the best provincial department in the country.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

†An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

*An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Agreed to.

KLEINMOND: PARTICIPATION IN SMALL BUSINESS TRAINING PROGRAMME
(Motion)

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the 15 fledgling entrepreneurs in the Kleinmond area ranging from upholsterers and furniture makers to caterers and an electronics company who are participating in a small business training programme designed to help them establish or expand their businesses.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the 15 fledgling entrepreneurs in the Kleinmond area ranging from upholsterers, furniture-makers, caterers and an electronics company, who are all participating in a small business training programme designed to help them establish or expand their businesses.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the organisers of the ABSA Cape Epic Mountain Cycle Race for increasing the women’s prize money for the event to some R690,000, thereby making it the richest event of its kind in the world.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the organisers of the ABSA Cape Epic mountain cycle race for increasing the women’s prize money for the event to an amount of R690 000 and notes that it has therefore become the richest event of its kind in the world.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

†Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends SAPS for setting up a priority committee to deal with the continuing taxi violence in Delft and Khayelitsha.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the South African Police Service for setting up a priority committee to deal with continuing taxi violence in Delft and Khayelitsha.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
THURSDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2013

THEMBI TSOTETSI

(Motion)

†Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Khayelitsha businesswomen Thembi Tsotetsi who finished top of her class at Stellenbosch University’s first batch of small business academic graduates.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Khayelitsha businesswoman, Thembi Tsotetsi, who finished top of her class in the first batch of Small Business Academy graduates of the University of Stellenbosch.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

MEC DONALD GRANT: COURT ACTIONS

(Motion)

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that various school principals in the Western Cape are taking MEC Donald Grant to court again.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that various school principals in the Western Cape are taking the Minister of Education Donald Grant to court again.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] I hear objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Uys.
16 DAYS OF ACTIVISM: NO VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND CHILDREN

(Motion)

†Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House supports the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children which starts on 25 November to 10 December by making people aware of the negative impact of violence on woman and children and acts against abuse.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House supports the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children, which will start on 25 November and will continue until 10 December and notes that the aim of this event is to make people aware of the negative impact of violence on women and children and to encourage them to act against abuse.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

DAY OF NATIONAL RECONCILIATION

(Motion)

†Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House joins all South Africans in celebrating the Day of National Reconciliation on 16 December as we recognise the immense strides we have made in building our nation.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House joins all South Africans in celebrating the day of National Reconciliation on 16 December as we recognise the immense strides that we have made in building our rainbow nation.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
THURSDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2013

WORLD AIDS DAY

(Motion)

†Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House supports World Aids Day which will be celebrated on 1 December by encouraging prevention and awareness and expressing solidarity with all victims of HIV and Aids.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House supports World Aids Day, which will be celebrated on 1 December by encouraging the prevention and awareness of HIV/Aids and by expressing solidarity with all the victims of this disease.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
THE PREPAREDNESS OF THE WESTERN CAPE GOVERNMENT WITH REGARD TO THE COMING FESTIVE SEASON

(Subject for discussion)

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Every festive season comes with much joy and festivities but also so many adversities with which many families are faced. Many of us have the privilege of spending the festive season with our families. Not everyone is that fortunate owing to death of family members as a result of government not being prepared with regards to disaster management, healthcare provisions, community safety initiatives and road safety implementation.

This is why I feel it is important to debate the preparedness of the Western Cape government for the upcoming festive season. This way we are aware of how the Western Cape government is creating and maintaining social cohesion so that the very significant foundation of family life is restored in the Western Cape.

Natural and man-made disasters can strike at any time. Even with advanced warning any disaster can catch you off-guard and put you in grave danger.

*Events such as these are very traumatic. The recent events is a typical example of this. What was really wonderful was to see how the people of the Western Cape stood together to assist, comfort and cheer one another. The photos and newspaper articles and stories told by the communities showed that our people in the Western Cape are still able to embrace one another regardless of the differences in our diverse society. It’s so easy to just accept the presence of ambulance personnel, our rescue workers during a flood, a fire or bus accident as well as our health workers who work long and tense hours. For that reason it is so important that we have a healthy and stable society where the mentioned personnel will be welcomed with gratitude.

†I commend the Department of Social Development in its efforts to provide children and family programmes which are aimed at promoting the well-being of children and building resilient families and communities.

*Stable families and communities provide a caring environment to which a rescue worker can return knowing that his or her family will be supportive, patient and caring. The Western Cape Government places a high premium on the inhabitants of the Western Cape. This culture of caring has been absorbed by the inhabitants of the Western Cape and was clearly visible during the recent floods.

Serviceability and the concept of serviceable leadership lies close to the heart of the Western Cape Government. To be able to lead one first needs to learn how to follow and we must service the inhabitants of this province to the best of our ability.
To achieve this goal the Department of Social Development is paving the way for a society rooted in a culture of selfless serviceability towards our fellow humans. Mr Mandela said “the onus is on us to by way of hard work, honesty and integrity reach for the stars.” That is exactly what the Western Cape Government is achieving here. I thank you.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. The hon member Ms Hani.

†Ms V HANI (ANC): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. From hon member Ms Du Toit Marais I thought I would hear the plan, the preparedness of this Western Cape government, but to my amazement I did not hear anything that this government has prepared for over this festive season.

For me this is not a happy season for all people in the Western Cape, especially for the poor. To many it is the season of fires, disease and burials of those killed by gangs, in taxi wars or pedestrians that die on our roads.

It is a season of neglect for far too many children, old people, those living with disabilities and single parents struggling to make ends meet. Today we hear bragging and see little, if any real plans, by this provincial government. Sweetheart DA topics like this one does not serve the majority of people in this province, but it is aimed at comforting a few in the leafy suburbs.

If we really want to debate the preparedness of this provincial government for the festive season lasting past Easter we have to ask where the plan of this government is - if it has a real plan at all.

Was it drawn up after consultation with all people of the province? [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: All sectors.

†Ms V HANI: ... in a transparent public participation process?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: All sectors.

†Ms V HANI: Did poor people have a chance to say what their needs are? Did you go to Khayelitsha?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Absolutely!

†Ms V HANI: Mitchells Plain, Kayamandi.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Absolutely!

†Mr P H GEYER: We represent the whole province.

†Ms V HANI: Cloetesville ... because I would have known. [Interjections.] I am from those areas [Interjections.] Or was it once more merely a back-office job by distant bureaucrats?
This province is not only a holiday destination. Millions of real people live here too. If there is no real plan to assist, the poverty trap for them during this time of cheer and laughter will be no joke. They will continue to suffer amidst the opulence and excesses of a few rich.

This government and its leader are absent more often than not. This Premier prefers having tea in London over dealing with real government issues here where the DA governs. She will do better than to concentrate on some English borough. Is it any wonder that the DA plane crashes; its ship is wrecked and its train derails? [Interjections.]

I see the hon member Bertie Fritz, my friend, now acts as a Premier. Interesting that he as a latecomer to this DA Government ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Let me tell you what you have done. I will tell you what you have done.

†Ms V HANI: ... is preferred as a safer or sterile choice above more senior stalwarts and heavyweights like the Leader of Government Business.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I will tell you what you have ... [Inaudible.]

†Ms V HANI: Theunsie Botha or even the provincial DA leader Ivantjie Meyer! [Interjections.] Not even the hon keeper of the purse, Alantjie Winde, is entrusted with the keys to her lofty parlour in the ivory tower! [Interjections.] Removed from reality the DA does not care for the poor as they must bite the bullet. Too little is done about safety. [Interjections.]

Family violence is up in this period, as alcohol and substance abuse increases especially in the poor areas. Where are the social workers, the nurses and teachers to assist the families and children affected? Most are on leave! Does this government put in place a plan to deal with that?

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Of course!

†Ms V HANI: This government - show me. Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais did not say anything to me. This government speaks about teenage pregnancies, but does it put in place programmes to prevent and deal with such issues over this period? Does it have tangible plans to have recreational activities or are children left to their own devices? [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: The next page! The next page.

†Ms V HANI: No, no do not worry. Do not worry. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Come guys.

†An HON MEMBER: What now?
†Ms V HANI: This government speaks about teenage pregnancies.

†An HON MEMBER: Yes. Yes. Next.

†Ms V HANI: Okay. It is the season for various diseases and disorders to spike. Diarrhoea claims many babies every year in poor areas. Where is the plan and support for this, or should we accept that clinics would be run on skeleton staff only? This is the season for rat, vermin and other pests to multiply in poor areas. Is it part of this DA government’s plan to clean poor townships and informal settlements for the so called festive season too or is that function a preserve for beaches and leafy suburbs only? Will libraries and schools also serve the poor with special extended times, holiday learning activities and programmes to keep the young occupied during the holidays? Where is the budget for this or will staff go to rest while people must entertain themselves? Where is the province’s plan to create opportunities, have open days in the many nature reserves and picnic areas ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Are you deaf? We spoke about it for an hour.

†Ms V HANI: ... have alternatives in place for the poor to also enjoy this period with excursions. I think, Mr Deputy Speaker, there is no real plan to involve all the people and the poor in a meaningful way during the upcoming season of festivities.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Ms Hani, your time has almost expired. The hon member Mr Haskin.

†Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Recent events indicate that theoretical preparedness and glossy plans published by the government ignore the fact that government directorates and services charged with festive season management and coordination continue in our view to be under-resourced, suffering capacity and training challenges, with the result that response times are slow, severe capacity challenges in managing road traffic increases and gridlocks and appalling communication with those affected. The recent N1 city accident that shut the city down for three-and-a-half hours is just one example. It cost millions to business and the Western Cape's economy and was a major embarrassment to those involved in traffic management and disaster management.

The recent service delivery protest that caused millions of rand of damage to traders in the City of Cape Town is another example. The city admits today that it failed to prepare and that none of the two arrests - the two arrests that it made on that day - have been prosecuted. Its refusal now to grant the organisers permission to march in December is obvious because of their behaviour but it is a further aggravator. What has been done in the festive season plan to curb service delivery protests that we believe the city has aggravated and not resolved?
Victoria Road, Bakoven, which is a major road and an arterial and a tourist destination in the City of Cape Town, is gridlocked 24-hours a day, during the day for the last week and will be for the next three weeks, because services offered by the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape government have not coordinated and communicated their approvals. So what you have is two construction sites and road tarring that is going on. Now we have three stop-and-goes in the space of 200 metres in Bakoven, meaning that we have gridlock just before summer season. This is not the way to plan for a festive season when we are going to be inundated with vehicles and tourists around our city.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Haskin, your time has unfortunately expired. You just had two minutes. Sorry for that. Hon Minister Botha.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. I want to before I start just mention to the hon member Ms Hani that it is obvious to me that she has done no homework and knows nothing about any plan in this province, because if she did she would know; she can only Google and she would find out what is done, but she has done nothing. She just took a piece of paper and wrote everything that is negative on it ... [Interjections.] ... and you will hear it now through different speakers.

I want to start by saying that we have implemented in health a new EMS data system. It is called the EMS. It is from Dimension Data, the EMS Evolution Project. It is entering a critical stage in its implementation schedule, the transitioning in of the new solution. This needs to be done using a responsible and considered approach to ensure that no single patient suffers from a drop in service delivery during this process.

Our fleet is in an excellent state of health. The fleet currently consists of 265 ambulance vehicles, 34 response vehicles and 41 specialised response vehicles or rescue vehicles but in the last 24 months we have replaced 148 ambulances as part of the rejuvenation cycle. In addition, our ambulances have covered nearly 18.5 million kilometres in rendering the service. The implementation of the Bed Bureau is nearly complete. It is also something new, with more than 50 health facilities listed on the website. Training has successfully been rolled out across the provincial health districts with only the West Coast remaining. It is hoped that this training will be complete before the commencement of the festive season. The Bed Bureau monitors bed availability of all health institutions, public and private, to ensure that emergency patients are transferred to facilities where beds are available. It is a very valuable system.

We need to look at risks. Briefly, Mr Deputy Speaker, they are road traffic injury, drowning, interpersonal violence, wilderness search and rescue incidents, and liquor laws promulgation, in other words the later times that venues may be open. There are two long weekends during this festive season, which is I think an unfortunate coincidence, and those are the most important issues at risk for us.
Road traffic injury - EMS will on the dates related to high traffic volume provide extended resources on all the major roads, and to save time I do not want to mention them all. We will also improve visibility by standing vehicles out on the main routes in order to raise awareness. We will stand out on all main routes throughout the province, also with rescue vehicles. We will have rescue vehicles and ambulance responses available in Beaufort West, Laingsburg and all those difficult areas where high incidents are expected.

In order to ensure an adequate personnel component, the following strategies have been implemented. It is part of the plan. The granting of annual leave during this period has been strictly controlled. Absenteeism is being monitored very closely and very properly. Training courses are not scheduled over this period. Overtime is utilised to improve crew mandates. Volunteer deployment will be increased and no approved remuneration work-outs over the public service will be undertaken from 30 November until 1 February. Vehicles will be strategically placed. Rescue technicians on fully equipped rescue vehicles, with the jaws-of-life, will be strategically placed. Major medical incidents will be managed through the Major Incident Medical Management System, the so-called MIMS, and mass casualty resources will be mobilised to deal with incidents from surrounding districts and Cape Town.

Two other mass casualty resources will respond from Cape Town. The first will be the MIMS medical response team of emergency medical specialists to support medical staff at scenes or rural hospitals. We will send these specialists out to rural hospitals and place them there over the season so that they are there on the scene when emergency medical assistance is needed. This is also the first time we are doing this.

The second will be the mobile mass casualty unit and mass casualty vehicles from the Metro rescue base in Cape Town. The MIMS teams will be flown to the districts by the Red Cross Air Emergency Service if necessary to ensure that they are present where we expect problems to occur.

The daytime crew mandates will be increased to 70 to prevent drowning. Interpersonal violence utilising overtime and volunteers: volunteer crew mandates will be increased to 60 for the nightshift of 31 December 2013 [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Botha, your time has expired. Just finish off quickly.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The Red Cross Air Emergency Service is contracted to EMS for the provision of aero-medical operations and consists of different helicopters and fixed wing aircraft which are distributed throughout the province. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Your time has expired. Hon member Mr Ncedana.
Mr M NCEDANA (COPE): Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. After receiving the topic for debate I took time to ask some people in the province how they would respond to the question posed by the member. The first is that for the government to be ready for the festive season it must have planned and budgeted for it during the APP time and it must be implemented efficiently and effectively - full stop.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Which has been done.

Mr M NCEDANA: Now if you have not done that you cannot pose such questions. In fact, the fact that you are posing that question means you did not plan for it ... [Interjections.] ... because it does not arise. If you planned for it the question does not arise. [Interjections.] Now the answer from the affluent rich communities is that the government is relatively ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The white rich [Inaudible.]

Mr M NCEDANA: ... okay in terms of its readiness. Now that is Constantia. Groot Constantia ... [Interjections.] ... Claremont, Camps Bay. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Near Fransman.

Mr M NCEDANA: In fact, if you were to ask the question in the poor communities, the answer would be as follows: we are mostly worried about the festive season because it means we are going to suffer from fires. If it was not enough - the fact that they suffered from storms and the heavy rains, which clearly indicated that the Democratic Alliance had no plans for such ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Like before ... [Inaudible.]

Mr M NCEDANA: Because every year-in-year-out, rains are very heavy in the Western Cape. Go to eNyhunyhwini. They are still trapped in this very same area where they were trapped when you took power. Nothing has been done. Proposals ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Nothing has been done!

Mr M NCEDANA: Proposals were made in this House by the hon member Mr Wiley – No, no, no, it cannot be him. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] Proposals were made in this House ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: By someone.

Mr M NCEDANA: These proposals included sandbags which are cheap in cost. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh come on.
†Mr M NCEDANA: But the Democratic Alliance did not see it as important because it was in eNyhunyhwini in Philippi where you had no interest. They are also worried about †impuku, ukuba abantwana babo baza kutyiwa ziimpuku ngeli xesha. *They are also worried that their children will be bitten by rats during this time.

While you are busy planning nice holidays, where you are going to go, they are worried about that. The most important thing they are worried about is the high rate of unemployment, the responsibility of feeding their children breakfast, lunch and supper.

†Mr H P GEYER: Do not worry. We will handle that.

†Mr M NCEDANA: It is a problem. Yes, you are right. We must not worry because you have no knowledge about it. You do not know how it feels. You cannot talk about it. This is a clear indication that the Democratic Alliance does not care. In Harare during the rains the streets were broken up, there were potholes. To date they have not been fixed. In Camps Bay the street was ... [Inaudible.] There were potholes. Those potholes have been fixed. This is how you operate. [Interjections.] This is how the Democratic Alliance operates. [Interjections.] The Mayor of the City of Cape Town has indicated that they have a master plan, like Madam Helen Zille said in 2006. Has that master plan impacted on the lives of the poor? No! It has not. [Interjections.]

†HON MEMBERS: It has. It has.

†Mr M NCEDANA: It is clear today and tomorrow that you have no will and you never have the will to improve the lives of the poor.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Even the worst ... [Inaudible.] ... carries will.

*MR M NCEDANA: Because of the way you operate and the way you hate a black person, born in this land. The way you operate shows that if we are under your control, we will never enjoy freedom. That is why even today the Democratic Alliance has a problem in that ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Ms Rossouw.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker the hon member Mr Ncedana is pointing in this direction and saying we hate black people. I object to that. That is how the translation - how the translator is putting it.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You must assist me, was that what you were saying, that you were referring to members on this side of the House hating black people?

*Mr M NCEDANA: What did I say, by the way? Please repeat. What is she saying I said? I was speaking in isiXhosa. What does she say I said? I did not hear her, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]
†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am sorry. I could not hear the translation of that one?

†Mr M NCEDANA: No, I am asking you a question, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, ask me.

†Mr M NCEDANA: What is the objection or what is the point of order? [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am asking you first of all whether you were referring to members on this side of being absolutely racists, because that is a racist remark. [Interjections.]

*Mr M NCEDANA: I said these people of the Democratic Alliance should not enter the holy home because they do not want black people living in poor communities. That is my statement.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ncedana, you have not replied to my question. My question was straight. Did you refer to members on this side of the House as being racist?

*Mr M NCEDANA: I said the people of the Democratic Alliance. I did not say that side of the House. I said the people of the Democratic Alliance.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, I am satisfied that you are referring to the DA in general. Then you can continue. [Interjections.]

*Mr M NCEDANA: Of course, it is no mistake that within the Democratic Alliance there is a black caucus and a white caucus, because they can see that their people are being oppressed, now they must fight for the freedom of a black person because they are also black. And you say you are an open society.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Minister Carlisle? [Interjection.] Please take your seat. This is a point of order.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The hon member Mr Ncedana’s voice is so loud that he is actually drowning out the translator, and we cannot actually hear the translator; if he can just bring his volume down a little. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, that is ... [Interjections.] Order! Before you speak, your time has expired, but I want to give the Chief Whip a chance to raise a point of order.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker what was translated was ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!
Ms A ROSSOUW: The word used in the translation was: “that the DA hates black people” and the word “hate” is for me a problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes I heard that.

†Ms A ROSSOUW: And I would like to ask you to look at Hansard.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I did hear that, but I asked the member whether he was referring to members sitting on this side as members of the House. [Interjections.] Order! Order! I asked the member and he responded that he was not implying that members sitting across the passage here as DA members of the House are racist. He was talking in general and in that respect I will accept it. We cannot refer to one another across the floor as being racist. That is totally unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: He is a difficult … [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is there a further point?

Ms A ROSSOUW: For me it is not about the word racist. He used the word “hate”, the word was translated as “hate” and that to me – I have a problem with that being allowed and I … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, let us have a look in detail at what the member said because we are going to sit here for a long time talking about what he said and what he did not say. I was quite happy in terms of the translation that he did not refer to members here. If it turns out in Hansard that there was a serious reflection on members of the House I will certainly come back to the House. The member’s time has expired. Hon Minister Bredell. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Order!

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker … [Interjections.]

Ms A ROSSOUW: Minister Bredell, a moment, just a moment. Why are you standing again, hon member Mr Ncedana?

Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I was finishing off my last sentence.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ncedana. You might not have been finished on your side, but the time has expired so therefore you must sit down. Your time has expired. [Interjection.] Hon Minister Bredell.

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, to the hon member Ms Hani, I just want to tell her that the National Development Plan speaks about leadership, good governance and active citizenry, and it is in these three components that we must tackle disaster management. The ANC do not have one of them so she will not understand. I also want to point out that 76% of our budget is spent on the poorest of the poor within the Western Cape.
I also want to point out to her - to the hon member Ms Hani - what we inherited four years ago from the ANC Government. When we started in this province with the first fires there were four helicopters. We could not get one of them in the air. Two of them did not have batteries in and there was no fuel for the others. [Interjections.] But, Mr Deputy Speaker, what is more worrying, currently the ANC controlled Gauteng, which is the economic hub of South Africa, does not have a disaster management centre, but they want to tell us, who have got five disaster management centres as well as a provincial disaster management centre, that we do not care about the poor. She must do her homework, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Then she must also realise that Eskom has declared a national emergency. Do they know what that means? We are busy planning for that emergency that can happen at any time. What is going to happen if this country is out of electricity for three or four weeks and there is this weak planning from the national government? The only government sphere that will fail the poorest of the poor in this country when there is a disaster will be the national government. I can guarantee you if there is a big disaster the failure will be at national level, Mr Deputy Speaker.

To the hon member Mr Ncedana I just quickly want to point out that I think Cope as a party is such a disaster that I thought that he would have been an expert on this topic, but he does not know anything about this topic. [Interjections.]

*Mr Deputy Speaker as the DA I just want to say I think you are the only one, and we took over from an ANC government.

†We took over from an ANC government and there was no plan, no disaster management plan for the poor areas, for the Khayelitsha’s, the Langa’s. There was no plan. We as the DA government put that plan on the table. I am very proud of what we as a disaster management team managed to accomplish over the last couple of years. [Interjections.]

In a situation where natural phenomena such as the recent floods caused by a severe frontal weather system are expected to impact on our province, the Western Cape disaster management centre would react based on information provided from the South African Weather Services. The Western Cape disaster management centre will analyse the South African Weather Services’ report and identify the line departments at national and provincial level as well as the district disaster management centres affected by the phenomenon.

The primary and secondary impacts attributed to the related hazards would be identified using the disaster risk assessment, and this information will be conveyed to the relevant line departments and district disaster centres via email or SMS. As the event unfolds the South African Weather Services will send updates to the Western Cape disaster management centre for dissemination, which would result in the upscaling or downscaling of the function. The geographical information containing the disaster risk assessment data at the Western Cape disaster management centre would then be used to determine the possible extent and impact on infrastructure, people and the environment by overlaying and analysing the various layers within the system.
This information would then be used by our preparedness and response unit to ensure that the necessary resources are deployed in the possible areas of impact.

An intensive hazard awareness campaign is conducted on an annual basis which targets the high risk schools to make them aware of the risks associated with the area in which they reside. The programme reached more than 20 000 learners last year.

*Mr Deputy Speaker the Western Cape disaster management centre plays an important role in safety in preparation for the festival season. One of the biggest risks in the Western Cape during the summer months is fires, widely spread wild fires, as well as fires in our informal settlements. When one looks at what the Western Cape Disaster Management Centre has done we see that they partake in the joint planning together with the South African Police Service regarding safety and security. The Western Cape Disaster Management makes an annual award to both the National Sea Rescue Institute of R369,000 as well as to Life Savers South Africa in order to reduce the risk of disasters at sea or on the water. The Western Cape Disaster Management Centre is always ready to handle any disaster which may occur.

Mr Deputy Speaker the state of readiness includes the review and upgrading of disaster management contingency plans, the placing of staff on standby, the drawing up of a situation analysing report to ensure that all systems are in good working order, and the issuing of early warning should the need arise.

†Following the flooding that occurred in July and August 2012, the affected municipalities, Bitou and Langeberg, the provincial departments of Agriculture and Transport and Public Works submitted their unverified assessments to the Western Cape disaster management centre. A submission was subsequently forwarded to the Western Cape cabinet and we then forwarded that to the national disaster management centre. Bitou Municipality receives from that assessment an amount of ± R13 million, and Langeberg Municipality R1,5 million. The rehabilitation and reconstruction allocations to the provincial departments were approved on 19 October 2013 through the adjustments budget, which includes allocations for the June 2011 and July 2012 flooding. The provincial Department of Agriculture received an amount of ± R190 million. Transport and Public Works received ± R158 million. This is part of the allocations that were supported by the Minister of Finance in his adjustments budget speech on 19 October 2013. A total amount of R426 million was allocated to the Western Cape because of the good work of the disaster management team.

*Mr H P GEYER: Well done!

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Fire Fighting services are working together with various partners to develop strategic strategies to minimise the risk of injury and death, especially in our informal settlements. The aim of fire prevention is to protect the public against the harmful effects of a fire.
This is reached by educating the public on preventative measures against fires, and the enforcement of relevant acts and regulations on how to react to fires and emergencies. The unit highlights four achievement areas, namely prevention by reducing the local risks by prevention and awareness.

Protection is the second one: improve local planning and preparedness. The third one is reaction: improve the fire and rescue services ability to react to all dangers. Fourthly, professional status: improve the professionalism of fire fighters and rescue personnel. The integrated prevention strategies involves environmental changes, engineering, education, maintenance and evaluation. In a nutshell this integrated planning covers everything from firebreaks, improvement of fire safety, training and information, up to the enforcement of legislation and the evaluation of whether the fire prevention interventions were successful or not.

†Key primary prevention projects and programmes embarked on include “Learn not to burn.” It is a pre-school curriculum for our pre-schools, because fire related burns have a higher prevalence in the very young three- to five-year-old group. We have another programme, Public Information Offices, where we talk to the media to help us to be pro-active, to help us to spread the message during disasters and so forth. We have a fire and life safety educator programme, where we work with our fire personnel in terms of which they get the knowledge and skills of how to bring their message across to the public.

We have a fire and flood awareness campaign that we run, and through that campaign we reached over 16 000 people last year. A fire and life safety symposium was held. Then we have a community work programme.

I am proud, Mr Deputy Speaker, of the provincial disaster management and its personnel. I wish them, as well as their stakeholders, well in their efforts to keep us safe, especially over the festive season. I thank you.

*Mr H P GEYER: Well done. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. *The hon member Ms Prins. [Interjections.]

*Ms E PRINS (ANC): Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. Allow me to ask a question. In order to keep us safe in the Western Cape, with the rich that can afford to get places, what is this Western Cape governments plan for all of us?

*An HON MEMBER: But you just ... [Interjections.]

*Ms E PRINS: If there is a plan ... [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Are you deaf or what?

*Ms E PRINS: ... we must see especially what will be done with people outside the Cape metropol ... [Interjections.] ... for people in the rural areas or on farms. [Interjections.] Hon Minister Carlisle, I thin you are deaf, I am not deaf.
I can hear perfectly well. [Interjections.] Is there a plan that will take care of the interests and welfare of these people? We only see plans for a big concert in Cape Town. What benefit do people who do not have cars or cannot afford transport to come and share in these festivities? [Interjections.] Show me that plan.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Talk about spending money.

*Ms E PRINS: Regularly we have to hear how ready the Western Cape is for this and for that. Recently the DA in this legislature attempted to convince us that they are prepared for any and every disaster or event. Over the past weekend we could exactly see all the holes that the ANC had pointed out in that so-called plan. The rich man’s hospital got all the attentions whilst the people in the informal settlements … [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Ag, nonsense man.

*Ms E PRINS: ... and poor settlements are up to now still waiting for help and support.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I can see you were in Oudtshoorn!

*Ms E PRINS: The last mentioned regularly walks around and looks to see what “Ground Up” has written about it. It is those people that live in areas where this DA government has for years now been stubbornly refusing to install pipes and pumps to drain storm water and sewerage so that those people can also have a better environment in which to live. Mr Deputy Speaker, just take a look at the rotten service delivery and no or downscaled facilities with which poor people are stuck.

*Mr H P GEYER: Did you hear what the man said?

*Ms E PRINS: It is no wonder that the DA still thinks that festivities only apply to the rich, their play places and business areas. Only the bare minimum is done for people in the forgotten and neglected areas. [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Why didn’t they … [Inaudible.]

*Ms E PRINS: What is done in the rural areas and the farm lands so that they can share in these so-called festivities?

*The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLICS WORKS: You can’t [Inaudible.] ... Nkandla.

*Ms E PRINS: Where is the plan to give farm workers who are poor and oppressed access to be able to share in this? Show us that plan.

*Mr H P GEYER: It was just here.
*Ms E PRINS: What is this provincial government doing to provide access to the poor? [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIROMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: What did you do? Nothing, absolutely nothing!

*Ms E PRINS: To take picnic facilities and holiday resorts in public ownership and the many provincial properties … [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

*MS E PRINS: ... such being able to visit nature reservations during these times … [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Again you are going … [Interjections.]

*Ms E PRINS: These people cannot afford expensive holidays at exclusive resorts. [Interjections.] Are more beaches going to be earmarked and made accessible to the poor or are they just going to be turned away again … [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! There is a bit too much commentary from this side.

*Ms E PRINS: ... at a few rich man’s resorts and exclusive beaches that are being guarded [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order. I am sorry. On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker. I actually think it is out of order that all the men here sit and ‘guffaw’ all the time.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will control … [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: When the member speaks, she does not even get a chance to speak.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening to you and I hear what you say.

*Ms E PRINS: Ag don’t worry, there are people that … [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Ms Prins, you are now going to carry on in peace and we are going to ... [Interjections.]

*Ms E PRINS: This is how they treat us, Mr Deputy Speaker.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member, I am giving you a chance now and I am going to keep the House in order so that you can speak. You may continue.
*Ms E PRINS: I don't know what order this is. Mr Deputy Speaker, cultural activities get little attention. In most cases … [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Hon Chief Whip?

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, what the hon member is actually saying to you is that you cannot maintain order.

*Ms E PRINS: Ag no, ag you know ... [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, no, I had it … [Interjections.]

*Ms A ROSSOUW: And that to me is unacceptable. [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon ...

*Ms E PRINS: I don’t want to say anything now, because if I do then I am going to say something that I shouldn’t … [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Prins, when I am speaking then you must keep quiet.

*An HON MEMBER: Listen to that.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You did not translate it negatively upon the Chair. You may continue but I will keep a close eye from now on. Please continue.

*Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, cultural activities get very little attention. In most cases they just ride on the backs of communities own plans. Here and there a program may be presented at a library but that is not the general case in the poor areas. [Interjections.] No, there is very little going on and at times when it is needed the most then those libraries are closed and inaccessible.

*An HON MEMBER: Where is there very little going on?

*Ms E PRINS: Speaking of culture, the “Kaapse klopse” celebrations are already in full ...

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is that a point of order? I am listening hon member.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: I don’t think that the hon member Ms Prins read the topic under debate because this which she is discussing now has absolutely nothing to do with that. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: That is your interpretation!

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The hon member may continue. I will hear is she strays too far from the topic. I suspect she wants to say that libraries are not prepared for the season time that is ahead of us.
*Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, may I just answer … [Interjections.] … because I wrote it in terms of what the plan is there, and that is what I prepared with.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Continue. We will listen carefully.

*Ms E PRINS: Thank you. The “Kaapse klopse” celebrations are in full swing with Christmas choirs, Malay choirs and other activities which are increasing. It is now just weeks away from the parades and especially the celebration of “tweede nuwejaar”. The last mentioned is a traditional celebration of the oppression and eventual release of the slaves which took place along an old route. What is strange is that the DA government regularly interferes in an attempt to derail these celebrations by attempting to regulate the community and even in the traditional parade. Every year it leads to unhappiness. The truth is the DA doesn’t give a hoot about poor people or their cultural activities.

Mr Deputy Speaker, too many important sport centres at schools are closed during this time because teachers are away on holiday. There are no plans in place to use these schools or expensive centres to the benefit of the youth and the community. Where is the plan? What is being done to protect pedestrians? It appears as if everything is just focused around people who can afford cars but every year more people die on our roads during the festive season. These are not people who own cars or who can afford cars. Show us the plan. Show us the plan that this Western Cape government under the power of the DA has so that poor people can take part in the temporary season activities. What is being done to provide opportunities to these poor people? How much temporary work is offered to these poor people?

Oh yes, I forgot, this is the DA that we are talking about who is allergic to black empowerment and that which goes with it. Of course the DA believes in purpose, or fit for purpose and can’t even support equal job opportunities and other legislature which supports black people, Africans and coloured included – they can’t ensure their economic participation. Is this because the DA is racist to within its soul and wants to divide people along race lines?

No, the DA can change but not its “snaar”. It remains, the DA remains a white party who promotes the interests of the rich. [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. The address is finished. Minister Plato.

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY (ID): Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. The safety of all our citizens and visitors to the province and also road safety is a top priority for my department over the festive season.

As the festive season is a critical period for all road traffic law enforcement agencies, government departments and of various strategic partners in the Western Cape, we will once again be adopting an integrated approach to ensure the safety of all motorists and passengers on our roads. Our festive season plan will be launched on 5 December 2013.
This integrated safety approach consists of the South African Police Services, Metro Police Services, other law enforcement agencies of all our local municipalities including fire and disaster management teams, and also other teams with an interest in safety.

The festive season brings a significant increase in vehicles travelling on the national and provincial road network within and across the Western Cape leading to other provinces. It also brings with it the celebration of religious holidays, festivities, sporting events, concerts and school closures and the reopening of schools in 2014. This increase in volume naturally raises the increase of potential risk, especially safety risk. In promoting our whole of society approach towards improving safety and in giving meaning to our motto “better together”, our traffic officers will again be setting up roadblocks across this province, and will also hand out disposable breathalysers to motorists at roadblocks across the province. These roadblocks will move around to ensure maximum effectiveness. This will be done with the assistance of the Safety Agency, SAPS, and the South African Police. We are encouraging motorists through advertising and the media to drink responsibly and test themselves before choosing to drive.

The primary objective of our road safety campaign will be on the following: reducing road trauma and serious injuries, crashes and fatalities as well as contributing towards the reduction in crime in general. We will be focusing on road safety education through maximising communication and publicity exposure on enforcement and road safety issues, promoting good road user behaviour and encouraging motorists to comply voluntarily with our officers and the other road users. We will increase the detection and prosecution of road traffic offences by having all staff on duty and will once again run a 24/7 day a week operation to stop and check 200 000 vehicles during the 2013/14 festive season.

On top of making our roads safer this festive season, there is also a big focus on keeping our youth safe and away from gangs, away from drugs and other wrong things in the communities, and to occupy them with positive and fun youth workshops that are run by our faith based organisation and religious communities. We know that over the festive season there is a spike in crime and that many of our youth are left vulnerable while they are at home on school holidays and their parents must go to work.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Minister Plato, your time has almost expired. Just finish off please.

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, such a lot to say, Mr Speaker. The police will be out in full force with the other safety agencies to ensure and safeguard the safety of all our citizens. Thank you very much.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The hon member Mr Stali.

†Mr Z C STALI (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, you know Minister Plato is the only one who responded to questions.
*I do not know the nonsense mentioned by other members here. I do not know where they have been. [Laughter.]

†Whether there is a plan or no plan in Gauteng, it is not the business of this House. We want to know what this government of the DA in this province is doing in preparing for the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

†Ms E PRINS: There is no plan. [Inaudible.]

*An HON MEMBER: You people must listen.

†Mr Z C STALI: There are so many things that are happening when I go through all their departments. What we are looking for is a plan such as the one that was explained by that Minister sitting there, to say this is what we are going to do as the department in order to make sure that the people of the Western Cape are safe during the festive season. You know, in Philippi just two weeks ago people marched to the Lentegeur hospital. They went there to demand that there must be a speedy process in terms of appointing staff. Up until today there is no process that has taken place there in terms of appointing people that are supposed to work in that hospital.

So those are some of the problems that we are going to experience during this festive season, where you will see that beds are full and every Jack and Jill goes to that hospital. If you want to remove a body from there, the staff want money from each and every one who wants to do that. Yet the CEO who is supposed to be controlling that is out on leave for three weeks. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What? What are you talking about?

†Mr Z C STALI: During this time of the year. Now ... [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: This is the wrong province, this is the wrong province.

*Mr Z C STALI: You keep quiet, you know nothing. The problem we are going to experience now is that people in the Western Cape are going to burn in informal settlements, and will be accommodated in halls by this government, like sheep because we know sheep are kept in stables. You will never see a white person being kept in a hall because their house is flooded, you see it here in the Western Cape. And they say they are ready.

†Does that mean because we came here and we discovered problems in your previous government you must continue doing that? Is that how you are doing things? Now, Mr Deputy Speaker, the reality is that they have no plan. I do not know why they came to ask this question here if they have no plan. They should have come here and asked us: “What should we do to prepare this province?” Then we would easily have been able to tell them what they should do. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Have you got experience?
†Mr Z C STALI: Unfortunately the situation on our roads, the taxi violence and the lack of accessibility for the poor and working class to decent and affordable public transport, further confirms that this province is not prepared to ensure that all people have a safe and a meaningful festive season.

†An HON MEMBER: What plan is that?

†Mr Z C STALI: It seems there is no political will to put proper plans in place, to fill these gaps, nor implement the policies that are in place. The 2012/2013 festive season saw 236 deaths on our roads, with the earlier days of December 2012 seeing an alarming high number of lives being lost at a rate of five per day. By July this year alone the Western Cape reported 599 deaths on the road for 2013. Most of these accidents occurred at night and outside of the metro on long roads. We are yet to read a concrete plan that is in place to deal with this carnage. The causes of this carnage have not been taken head-on and may unfortunately recur this festive season.

Mr Deputy Speaker, why has the MEC not considered banning buses and taxis from using long roads late at night, as it has been proven that most accidents take place at night on long distance roads because people are tired and sleeping while driving? Because everyone knows that there is no visibility of law enforcement personnel at night on long-distance roads, overloading of vehicles becomes a norm, people speeding as if there is no tomorrow, drunken driving becomes uninhibited and people tend to take a chance of driving without a valid driver’s licence and with unregistered vehicles. We know that drunken driving is a major cause of road deaths during the festive season; unfortunately the majority of accidents occurring on our roads are alcohol related.

We see that the MEC undermines the attempts by the national government to curb drunken driving, with a zero tolerance approach … [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Tell me one thing they have done.

†Mr Z C STALI: In May this year … [Interjections.] … the then national Minister of Transport Ben Martins put forward a case for lowering the legal blood alcohol level to zero. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The biggest mistake he’s made.

†Mr Z C STALI: Minister Carlisle unfortunately opposed this. The DA’s non-committal to curbing drunken driving is further illustrated by its inaction in dealing with those drivers who spend their nights in taverns and shebeens. Unfortunately we do not see enough roadblocks around the townships where shebeens and taverns are mostly prevalent. Instead of increasing law enforcement personnel on our roads, training them to enforce legislations and adherence on the part of motorists, the province and the city focus on finance, training people through speed fines after they are captured by the numerous visible speeding cameras, which common road offenders can easily avoid.
During the festive season, the DA-led City of Cape Town is detracting from the real focus when it blames courts for unpaid traffic fines. The city has failed to properly oversee the private contractor that collects traffic fine money on the city’s behalf.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Stali, your time unfortunately has expired. We have reached the end of the speaker’s list. The last speaker, hon Minister Carlisle.

†An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. It is interesting that we do nothing for the poor, we are told. What we also did not do for the poor, we did not steal their money, so that makes a bit of a difference for a start. Secondly … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Secondly, secondly … [Interjections.] No, we did not steal their money. [Interjections.] We did not steal their money. They stole the money. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Magaxa, please. Minister Carlisle, please address the Chair. Maybe it will be quieter that way.

†An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Do not worry. They all have … [Inaudible.]

*An HON MEMBER: Take a pill brother!

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I think I made my point. Secondly - I am interested in people who come here to argue with us that we do not have a plan, do not listen to what we have to say, make their speech, walk out or do not come in until it is time to make their speech.

The third thing I want to tell you, it is good news for the ANC, good news. If it is correct what they have said here today that we only look after whites who live in Constantia, then I want to tell you, you are going to be the next government, there is no question about it.

†An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You are going to be the next government. So I hope - I hope the hon members are booking their front benches here and their portfolios and so on … [Interjections.] … because all those people that we treat so badly are going to vote against us and for you. [Interjections.] Yes, yes, so be happy, be happy.

†Ms V HANI: Yes! [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We talk about plans.
We talk about plans. The hon Minister of Health described the health plan. There was no doubt about it, it is quite clear. He described the emergency services, and I want to say to him that this is really absolutely outstanding service. He did not mention, for instance, that priority one in urban areas, fifteen minutes is the average time for an accident - for an emergency vehicle to get to that point. He talked about the various emergency services.

My other colleague here, my colleague Minister Bredell, spoke about the broad area of disaster management and what is being done. He talked about the plans and the actions in respect of floods, fires, coastal incidents, river-riding incidents, mountain rescue search, etc, so where does the hon member Ms Prins come from and say there are no plans? [Interjections.]

My other colleague, Minister Plato, spoke about road safety. I can speak more about road safety, but let me just say over this period every single day - every single day from 13 December to 6 January is categorised for its risk issues. Like for instance, 26 December is specifically a risk issue for drowning, for alcohol related incidents, etc. Every single day is listed in this respect and all the different services under the different Ministers coordinate together to deal as best they can with that risk. That never existed before.

†Ms E PRINS: Where is the plan?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: But let us now start talking about plans. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is that a question?

†Mr M G E WILEY: No. You had your chance.

*Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask if the hon Minister Carlisle can take a question?

†Mr M G E WILEY: No.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Carlisle, are you prepared to take a question?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: No, I am sorry. I used to take questions, Mr Deputy Speaker, but none of them ever take questions, so I do not take questions.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue then.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: Plan number one, the period is from 1 December to 15 January, though it actually continues during the year.

†Ms E PRINS: Where?
†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Plan number two, the targeted fatalities are 230 for that period.

Ms E PRINS: Where?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Plan number three, public transport. The first part of that is the sticker project, the checking for safety of all public transport vehicles before they leave, sticker on the windscreen and checked throughout the provinces as they go.

Plan number two, for hon member Mr Stali, fatigue management. Over 8 000 vehicles, long distance vehicles, will be stopped over this period and their drivers tested for fatigue management as we have done for two - as the hon member's traffic police has done for the last two years. Let me tell you that in that time there have been no serious long distance taxi accidents.

Plan number three, roadblocks. My hon colleague also mentioned this. There will be 400 roadblocks and between 200 000 and 260 000 vehicles will be stopped at them, that is approximately one in six. Listen to the plans and then you will be comfortable. About 30 000 people will be screened for alcohol.

†Ms V HANI: I do not think that I am going to.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Four, drunken driving. The breathalyser hopefully will be back in action. “Name and shame” will not be back in action because the ANC national ministers are messing around with it. But there are three shadow centres open and so that will be how we run the campaign on drunken driving based on the roadblocks and the three shadows and the testing of over 260 000 people.

Five, speed. We now have an average speed over distance measurement on the R61 for 70 kilometres and on the N1 from Three Sisters to Beaufort West, on the N1 from Beaufort West to Laingsburg, and the most dangerous stretch on the R27, three stretches totalling 65 kilometres. These and the ones that we have had for some time will bring down the death rate by half on those roads and remove them from the list of high risk areas.

Pedestrians - I was asked, the hon member Ms Prins asked about pedestrians. Yes, there are seven Hazloc Projects, and if you know what is going on then you will know that a key one is going on in Knysna right now, where we are making R18 million available. She shakes her head. She knows it is true.

*An HON MEMBER: You must listen.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They never did a single thing about pedestrians. Nothing! Buckling up, the ANC never did anything about buckling up. We have a massive campaign running right now, 27 major boards, R5 million of radio advertising will go on for four months.

Cyclists, we have just changed the law in respect of cyclists. Never done by that side of the House, Sir! [Interjections.]
Public participation, we have just launched our Ambassador’s Pledge in terms of which a million people will sign the pledge. We started with religious leaders in the District Six Mosque.

Emergency Services FMS, so there is some idea of the plan.

†Ms E PRINS: Where is the plan?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: There was never a plan before. I was here. When they were in power, there was no plan. There was no plan for disaster management. There were no resources for disaster management. There were no funds for disaster management. The same is true of road safety and all the others. It is the first time that there are plans. [Interjections.] The money disappeared. The money disappeared, but let me say that I do not want to say rude things about the ANC, because nobody says more rude things about the ANC than the ANC themselves. What do they say? “It is like apartheid in the Cape ANC”, say three senior members.

*Mr H P GEYER: Eina!

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And they said, they compared Marius Fransman to the apartheid government. In a statement they say “like the apartheid government did the Western Cape leadership of the ANC currently promote coloured nationalism by putting coloureds against blacks”. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle, order, order.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: If I can just finish here, Sir. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Carlisle, you can just … order, order [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Shockingly they also claim … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order Minister. I am giving you the latitude to go slightly wider but you are going too wide now. This is not much to do with the topic of discussion. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, I … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can convince me otherwise you can do that.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What I - if you allow me just to make my point you will see that it is right on the point, Sir.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please do so.
†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They say “the leadership in the Western Cape sides with criminal interests, elements”. Now the point that I want to make is that we can provide all sorts of emergency services ... [Interjections.] ... disaster management, road safety campaigns, but we cannot save terminal disintegrating parties. [Interjections.]

*An HON MEMBER: Nice!

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, order, order. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Hani, hon member Mr Plato, order! We have come to the end of the debate, but before we adjourn can I just remind the House that there will be a briefing by the Treasury for the Budget Committee immediately after adjournment and all other members are also welcome to attend. That brings us to the end of the proceedings. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:10.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS
THURSDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2013

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. **Introduction of Bill**

   Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:

   *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013].*

2. **Referral of bill to relevant committees in terms of Rule 187**

   *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013].*

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

Papers tabled with *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013].*

(a) Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure, 2013 [PR334/2013].
(b) Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, 2014 – 2017 [PR335/2013].

(c) Gazetting of Allocations to Municipalities as contained in the Western Cape Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure, 2013 and the 2013 Adjustments Appropriation Bill. (Published in Provincial Gazette Extraordinary, 7198 dated 21 November 2013).

MONDAY, 25 NOVEMBER 2013

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. **Introduction of Bill**

   **Minister of Health:**

   *Western Cape Independent Health Complaints Committee Bill* [B 9–2013].

2. **Referral of Bill to committee in terms of Rule 171**

   **Standing Committee on Community Development:**

   *Western Cape Independent Health Complaints Committee Bill* [B 9–2013].

3. **Provincial Notice**


4. **Referral of Bills to committee in terms of Rule 220**

   **Standing Committee on Local Government:**

   (a) *Legal Practice Bill* [B 20B–2012] (NCOP) (proposed section 76 Bill).

   (b) *Judicial Matters Third Amendment Bill* [B 53–2013] (NCOP) (proposed section 76 Bill).

5. **Referral of draft Bill to committee in terms of Rule 220**

   **Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning:**

   Draft *Property Valuation Bill*, 2013 (NCOP) (proposed section 75 Bill).
COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:

1. **(Negotiating mandate stage)** Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the *Special Economic Zones Bill [B 3B–2013] (NCOP)*, dated 20 November 2013, as follows:

The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the subject of the *Special Economic Zones Bill [B 3B–2013] (NCOP)* referred to the Committee in terms of Standing Rule 220, confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill.

The Committee agreed to the following—

**Proposed Amendments:**

(a) Clause 36(2)(a), in line 7, after the word “operator”, insert “and the Special Economic Zone Board”.

(b) clause 36(3), in line 11, after the second “the”, to insert “operator and the”.

**Recommendations:**

(a) There is currently a great demand for scarce skills within the South African labour market. The employee tax incentive, as envisaged in the Bill, will largely benefit lower-skilled employees earning less than R60 000 per annum. It is the Committee’s contention that the Bill should allow for greater intervention to equip individuals with high-level skills.

(b) The Committee notes the interchangeable use of the concepts “single point” and “one stop shop” in clause 35(k). It is proposed that these terms be revisited and more clearly specified throughout the Bill to prevent future ambiguity.

(c) That the concepts defined in clauses 4(3)(a) and (b), 13(5) and 24(5)(a)(d) be defined within the formal definition section of the Bill.

2. Report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements on the request for the approval of the short list for the appointment of two members to the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal dated, 20 November 2013.

The Standing Committee on Human Settlements, having considered the matter as referred to the Committee in terms of section 9 of the Rental Housing Act, Act 50 of 1999, begs to report as follows:

(a) That the Committee approves the short list as proposed by the Minister; and

(b) Further wishes to recommend that Ms MN Wotini and Ms JD Ferdenando be considered for appointment to serve on the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this Report.
The Speaker:


The Rules Committee, having considered the Annual Report referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

The discussion of the Annual Report of the Provincial Parliament is a key mechanism established by the Provincial Parliament to achieve its constitutional oversight role over its administration. The objectives of the Rules Committee are therefore to look at the shortcomings, ways to improve on challenges and to ensure that service delivery takes place to the broader community.

B. Overview report on the Provincial Parliament

(a) Overview report

The Secretary gave a brief overview of the Annual Report of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, emphasising the improvements and challenges. He thanked the officials for their dedication and hard work during the year under review. He, however, acknowledged that there was room for further improvement.

(b) Findings/Concerns

The Committee expressed concerns on the following:

(i) The Heritage Management Assets policy has not been referred to the Aesthetics Committee; and

(ii) the WCPP does not specifically target disabled people during the recruitment process.

(c) Recommendations

That the Administration–

(i) Provides a security plan of the precincts of WCPP by 30 November 2013;
(ii) Provides electronic screens in the committee rooms to facilitate better viewing of presentations; and
(iii) Conducts a needs analysis of the accommodation and facility needs of Members, staff and Parliament, with specific emphasis on office space, air-conditioning and toilet facilities.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requested the following papers, reports and information:

(i) A copy of the Heritage and Artworks Policy;
(ii) A submission on the Security plan;
(iii) A report on the revised Public Education and Outreach strategy plan;
(iv) A report on the progress on the finalization of the oversight model;
(v) An updated report on the status and progress of the finalization of the web-site;
(vi) A copy of the social media plan;
(vii) A cost analysis for the use of an Online facilities for Members and senior staff members;
(viii) Detailed information on all salary bands;
(ix) An updated report on the status of the donor funding and a full explanation of the spending thereof;
(x) A copy of the service level agreement with the Hansard contractor;
(xi) A detailed report on the 12 external skills development interventions and particulars of the service providers;
(xii) A report of the analysis of consultant appointments and reasons why in terms of the Historically Disadvantage Individuals (HDI's) framework, individuals were not appointed; and
(xiii) A report on the demarcation of the precinct and the securing thereof.

C. Conclusion

The Chairperson thanked all Members and officials for their input regarding the discussion of the Annual Report.


The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport, having considered the Annual Report of the Department of Community Safety, for the year ending 31 March 2013, reports as follows:
1. Introduction

As part of its oversight function, the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport considered the 2012/13 Annual Report of the Department of Community Safety. Annual Reports are the key instrument to report departmental performance measured against the performance targets outlined by the Department of Community Safety in its Strategic Plan, Annual Performance Plan and its budget.

2. Oversight report on the Department of Community Safety

The Minister of Community Safety, Mr Dan Plato, was afforded an opportunity to make opening remarks and he provided a brief overview of the activities of the Department in delivering a service to the Province through increasing safety in communities. The Head of Department, Dr Gilbert Lawrence briefed the Committee on the overall performance of the Department and the readiness of the Department to roll-out the objectives of Strategic Objective 5 (SO5).

Members of the Committee deliberated on Part A: General Information, Part B: Performance Information, Part C: Governance and Part D: Human Resource Management of the Annual Report on the Department of Community Safety. The members of the public and invited stakeholders were also given an opportunity to pose questions to the Department or provide input on the Department’s Annual Report after the Standing Committee deliberated on the Annual Report.

(a) Findings/Concerns

The Committee noted with concern:

(a) The late submission of an errata document provided to the Committee on its 2012/2013 Annual Report of the Department;

(b) that the information provided by the Department in the Annual Report was not very user friendly, for example, statistics of all projects conducted by the Department did not reflect the achievements of the individual projects;

(c) the omission of targets for the Service Delivery Improvement Plan on partnerships with the police and communities, as reflected on pages 24 to 31 and page 37 of the Annual Report of the Department, aimed at encouraging a peaceful and safe Province, are not measurable to track actual results since the Department should identify the objectives, targets and achievements of each of these initiatives and projects;

(d) the omission of any oversight results of the Department over the South African Police Service (SAPS);
(e) that the details of the Security Awareness Programme offered by the Department and the content of the programme are not clear;

(f) the manner in which the training and awareness of safety systems and procedures, as reflected on page 72 of the Annual Report, is monitored for the 27 Western Cape Government buildings; and

(g) motorcycle fatalities are increasing, even whilst there has been a decrease in fatality figures in all other road user groups.

(b) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that the Department:

(a) compiles a standard check list which Provincial Traffic officers or appointed staff at schools have to complete when conducting inspections and issuing fitness reports on learner transport vehicles;

(b) creates a manual or checklist for Security inspections conducted by appointed staff at Western Cape Government facilities / buildings;

(c) briefs the Committee on the Shadow Report drafted to provide information that may be used to supplement available crime statistics and thereby providing a more holistic overview of the circumstances under which murders are committed in the Western Cape, as mentioned on page 20 of the Annual Report;

(d) sets clear targets in its Annual Performance Plan for the submission of documents such as the Annual Reports and Annual Performance Plans of SAPS; and

(e) provide an analysis of, and action plan to reduce motorcycle fatalities.

(c) Papers, reports and information requested by the Standing Committee

The Committee requested that the Department of Community Safety provides it with the following:

(i) the report on the Deep Dive Research Project conducted in 2011, in analysing the state of safety and security in six different areas to determine design principles to increase safety in the Province, as reflected on page 18 of the Annual Report;

(ii) the Shadow Report, as reflected on page 20 of the Annual Report;

(iii) a list of initiatives of the Safety Lab detailing the results of these initiatives, as reflected on page 20 of the Annual Report;
(iv) the content or focus of the Security Awareness Programme, as reflected on page 25 of the Annual Report;
(v) a progress report on the "Report a Cop/Reward a Cop" programme, as reflected on page 42 of the Annual Report; and
(vi) a report on the legal opinion received and the institutionalisation of roles and responsibilities of various stakeholders in respect of protest action.

C. Conclusion

The Chairperson congratulated the Department on receiving a clean audit for the 2012/2013 financial year as well as receiving the Batho Pele Excellence Award for the best functioning provincial Department in the country. The Chairperson further thanked all Members, the Department, SAPS, and the members of the public, including the Community Police Fora for attending the hearing and for their input in the discussion on the Annual Report.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Education, having considered the Annual Report of the Western Cape Education Department for the year ended 31 March 2013 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function the Committee considered the Annual Report of the Western Cape Education Department. The Annual Report is the key instrument to report departmental performance measured against the performance targets outlined by the Western Cape Education Department in its strategic plan, Annual Performance Plan and its budget. The role of standing committees in overseeing Annual Reports of departments is crucial in closing the accountability loop of planning, budgeting, implementation, reporting, auditing and oversight.

The Annual Report programme for the 2012/2013 financial year was advertised in newspapers, inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions.

Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Provincial Minister, Mr D Grant, was given an opportunity to make opening remarks. Members of the Committee deliberated on Part A: General Information, Part B: Performance Information, Part C: Governance and Part D: Human Resources Management.
The members of the public and invited stakeholders were also given an opportunity to pose questions to the Department or provide input after the Standing Committee deliberations on the Annual Report.

B. Oversight report

1. Findings/Concerns

(i) In 2012 the WCED had 150 vacant principal posts currently; 112 posts have been permanently filled and 85 new posts are in the process of being filled;

(ii) Learners at Quintile 1-3 schools form part of the National School Nutrition Programme (NSNP), however, when these learners especially from the rural areas progress to Quintile 4 and 5 schools, their needs remain the same but these schools do not offer feeding programmes to accommodate these learners;

(iii) There might be schools which are in need of feeding schemes but due to not being classified as Quintile 1 – 3 schools, they do not have feeding schemes.

(iv) Some schools do not have hostels available for learners, while many hostels are not being fully utilised;

(v) Schools in the rural areas have a huge backlog on debts on municipal rates. R16.7 million was set aside to assist these schools in reducing its rates backlog as indicated on page 27 of the Annual Report;

(vi) Children eligible to attend school due to their age are not attending school and there are no statistics to monitor or improve this challenge;

(vii) Late registrations for Grade R remain a challenge in the Department;

(viii) The Annual National Assessments results were not satisfactory in this reporting year;

(ix) School Governing Body (SGB) members in previously disadvantaged areas are not skilled especially in the field of finance;

(x) Schools are doing credit assessments on parents as prerequisite for enrolment at some schools;

(xi) The Physical Education Programme is currently being offered with Life Orientation classes and this is inadequate to address the health needs of learners and the growing levels of obesity amongst children.

2. Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that the WCED present briefings within the current financial year on the following matters:-
(i) The management of the Quintile 1-3 school nutrition feeding schemes at primary schools in the rural areas and the manner in which the Department assists learners that progress to Quintile 4 and 5 schools that are still dependant on these feeding schemes;

(ii) The criteria and rating of schools determining the Quintile, especially for re-classification that could be done on a provincial level;

(iii) The strategy for hostels in terms of upgrading, refurbishing and utilising vacant hostels;

(iv) Feedback from The Technical task team appointed on provincial level, managing the transfer of Further Education and Training (FET) and Adult Education and Training (AET) colleges;

(v) The results on the progress of the screening process assessing the readiness of children’s visual and auditory abilities assessment conducted, to be eligible for Grade R as indicated on page 85 of the Annual Report;

(vi) The Enrolment campaign explaining the manner in which they deal with late applications and placements;

(vii) A progress report on the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statements (CAPS) system and the impact of this system on the Grades 1, 9, 10 and 12 learners;

(viii) The implementation of learning an additional language in the Foundation Phase of schooling;

(ix) The SGB’s and the results of the district based Institutional and Management Governance (IMG) managers engagement with chairpersons of SGB’s on their views on the manner in which the SGB’s supports their schools as indicated on page 47 of the Annual Report;

(x) The asset development for sport grounds in conjunction with the City of Cape Town, including the pilot projects on the 32 Mass Opportunity Development (MOD) centres. The feedback should include the criteria for identifying the MOD centres and the evaluation system of these MOD centres;

(xi) Progress on the training offered and empowerment of SGB’s at previously disadvantaged schools;

(xii) A follow up on the Safer Schools Programme, School of Skills and the availability and condition of equipment in classrooms;

(xiii) Feedback on effective scientific evaluations of the current Physical Education programme.

3. Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Western Cape Education Department should provide the Committee with the following:
(i) A report on the progress of managing the filling of vacancies in the Department to be reported to the Committee on a quarterly basis;
(ii) Progress report on addressing the backlog of municipal services debts in the rural areas;
(iii) A report on the measures put in place by the Western Cape Education Department to address the number of school-going age children not attending school;
(iv) A report on how the WCED deals with schools that conduct credit assessments on parents;
(v) The list of schools which did not apply for compensation of school fees that were not paid in the 2012/2013 financial year; and

C. Acknowledgements

The Committee recognised the Department on the implementation of regulations as mentioned on page 21 and the gift register policy as on page 23. They also congratulated the WCED on winning the four national merit awards for their newspaper. They were also commended on the on-going data clean-up programme on page 53.

D. Conclusion

The Committee wishes to express its appreciation to the Minister, the officials of the Western Cape Department of Education and the Members for their participation during the session.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Human Settlements, having considered Annual Reports of the Department of Human Settlements and its entities, the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal and the Western Cape Housing Development Fund for the year ended 31 March 2013, dated 20 November 2013, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

The annual report programme for the 2012/2013 financial year was advertised in newspapers, inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions.
The Standing Committee on Human Settlements considered the Annual Report for the Department of Human Settlements (hereinafter referred to as the Department) and its Entities, the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal and the Western Cape Housing Development Fund on Tuesday, 12 November 2013.

Annual reports are the key instruments for departments to report on performance measured against their performance targets and budgets as outlined in their Strategic Plans and Annual Performance Plans.

Members of the Committee deliberated on Part A: General Information, Part B: Departmental Programme Performance and Part D: Human Resource Management of the department and Entities’ Annual Report. Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions or make inputs during the discussions.

Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Minister, and the Chairperson for the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal were given an opportunity to make opening remarks.

B. Oversight report on the Department of Human Settlements and its Entities the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal and the Western Cape Housing Development Fund

1. Department of Human Settlements

   (a) Overview

   The Minister provided the Committee with a brief overview on the Annual Report for the Department. He proceeded to list the challenges and successes for the year under review and the factors that brought about the qualified audit during the 2012/2013 financial year.

   The Western Cape Department of Human Settlements is listed as the first Department in the country to pursue alternate building technologies at scale for the development of subsidised housing projects.

   In an attempt to improve efficiency, the Department appointed contract workers additional to the posts contained in the organogram to address the shortcomings in the current, approved establishment. The appointment of contract workers assisted the department’s service delivery model, in that; it introduced a regional approach to deliver services to the people of the Western Cape with a more hands-on planning and delivery model.
2000 houses in the Delft Symphony area were identified for implementation and construction, commencing in March 2013, utilizing alternative technology products that is more affordable.

The Department received a qualified audit from the Auditor-General, which related to the incomplete business plans submitted by municipalities, which caused delays in the commencement phase of the projects. The Department has committed to provide on-going support to municipalities whereby it aims to streamline the planning and implementation process of human settlements projects by:

(i) implementing the Housing Demand Data Improvement Programme, which will assist municipalities with the housing demand data collection process;
(ii) the adoption of the Provincial Framework Policy for the selection of the housing beneficiaries in ownership-based subsidy projects; and
(iii) the development of Human Settlements Pipelines for all municipalities with a future horizon of five years.

(b) Findings / Concerns

(i) The Department delivered a total of 8 248 serviced sites and 13 128 houses, with an additional 2 122 houses at advanced stages of construction. A total of 1 178 toilets had been delivered to a total of 5 685 houses providing access to sanitation, yet the bucket system remains and the amount of portable flush toilets provided are not sufficient for the people who reside in the provisioned area. The N2 Gateway and the Boys Town areas have been identified as areas that still utilize the bucket system;
(ii) The targeted quota for houses was not met by the Department. This was related to the community dynamics such as social unrest, community resistance, intimidation of contractors, outbreaks of violence, delays in planning approval objections, procurement objection delays and the inability to secure tenders within the subsidy amount. The Department reported that it was difficult to anticipate these unforeseen risks during the planning stages of the housing projects hence the contingency plans would often be insufficient;
(iii) The filling of funded positions remains a challenge for the Department as young professionals resign frequently to obtain better paying positions.
This resignation rate is also exacerbated by the intergovernmental transfer of professional and technically skilled staff; and

(iv) The Department in collaboration with municipalities and farmers to develop strategies for the transfer of privately owned land, to build houses for farmworkers, thereby uplifting the poor through ownership and asset creation.

(c) **Recommendations**

The Committee wishes to recommend that—

(a) the Department implement a retention strategy for staff between the ages of 20 to 30 years of age thereby retaining the skills invested by the Department for a longer period;

(b) the Department to consider installing solar heating systems or alternative products funded by private donors that will aide existing RDP housing with cost saving devices; and

(c) the Department to develop strategies that will phase out the bucket system.

(d) **Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee**

The Department of Human Settlements to furnish the Committee with:

(a) a detailed strategic plan, which indicates what contingency plans have been set in place by the Department to deal with recurring risks that hamper project progress, that resulted in a qualified audit from the Auditor-General for the financial year 2012/2013;

(b) a detailed report on the strategies implemented by the Department to develop a credible pipeline for its Peoples Housing Process (PHP) Programme targets as set out in the Overview of Departmental Performance under Service Delivery Environment;

(c) an in-depth report on all possible faults and on poor ventilation that may have related to the formulation of mould in the structures in Drommedaris; and

(d) a similar report is to be formulated for the structures in Wolwedans, which details the root cause of the mould problem and lists the contingency plans formulated by the Department to eradicate future problems of a similar nature. This is to be provided to the Committee by February 2014.
2. The Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal (WCRHT)

(a) Overview

The Chairperson of the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal listed the factors that contributed to the qualified audit received from the Auditor-General for the financial year 2012/2013.

The WCRHT had registered a backlog of 3,053 official complaints of which some of the complaints stemmed from the previous financial year. As an interim contingency plan, five additional staff members have been employed to deal with the backlog of complaints. The Committee was informed that the majority of the complaints received by the WCRHT related to:

(i) the landlords failure to refund deposits;
(ii) the lack of maintenance of property; and
(iii) the issuing of unlawful notices to vacate premises.

This was attributed to the lack of training and education of the landlords and tenants who are unaware of their rights and responsibilities. The Rental Housing Act, Act 50 of 1999 (Hereinafter referred to as the Act) makes provision for the streamlining of the above mentioned processes, which allows for the refund of deposits and the claims instituted by the landlords pertaining to the rental units maintenance and the failure by tenants to meet their monthly obligations. The WCRHT through their awareness programs provides for the education of both the landlords and tenants on their rights and responsibilities according to the prescripts of the Act.

(b) Findings / Concerns

The backlog in terms of the resolution of complaints received by the WCRHT still remains a concerning factor. The Act makes provision for a 90-day resolution rate of case files, which the WCRTH has yet to adhere to.

3. The Western Cape Housing Development Fund (WCHDF)

The Committee was informed that the WCHDF is dormant and that the financial matters will be discussed in the SCOPA meeting.
C. Conclusion

In conclusion, the chairperson thanked the Members, the Department and the members of the public for attending the meeting and for their inputs on the discussion of the reports.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this report.

5. Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on the Annual Reports of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and the following entities: Western Cape Language Committee, Western Cape Cultural Commission and Heritage Western Cape, for the year ended 31 March 2013, dated 15 November 2013.

The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport, having considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and its entities, for the year ending 31 March 2013, reports as follows:

1. Introduction

As part of its oversight function, the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport considered the 2012/13 Annual Reports of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and its entities. Annual Reports are the key instrument to report departmental performance measured against the performance targets outlined by the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and its entities in its Strategic Plans, Annual Performance Plans and its budgets.

2. Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport

The Chairperson congratulated the Department on receiving a clean audit and on the positive prospects for the Regional Sports Academy in Oudtshoorn as witnessed during an oversight visit on a Provincial Visit Week of the Social Cluster. Members of the Committee commended the Department on its improvement in achieving its targets in the 2012/2013 reporting year.

Before proceeding to the consideration of the Annual Reports, the Minister and the Head of Department were given an opportunity to make opening remarks. The Department’s Mass Opportunity Development (MOD) centre programme was awarded the Kasomo Award for the Best Innovative Project for Mass Participation initiated by a government department.

The members of the public and invited stakeholders were also given an opportunity to pose questions to the Department and to provide input on the Department’s Annual Report.

2.1 Findings/Concerns

The Committee noted with concern-

(a) that the Department experienced a constant challenge to retain professional/specialist staff in specific units in the Department such as the Library Services and the Heritage component; and
(b) that Sport Federations are not actively contributing to identify top achieving sportspersons to be nominated to receive a sports award with the Department.

2.2 Recommendations

The Committee recommended that the Department–

(a) should consider a retention strategy to assist in retaining staff with scarce skills;
(b) conducts an efficacy study on the costs related to the day-to-day running of the MOD centres; and
(c) confirms whether any employees in disagreement with the outcome of the grievances lodged as reflected on page 118 of the Annual Report, progressed to the appeals process to the office of the Public Service Commissioner.

2.3 Papers, reports and information requested by the Standing Committee

The Committee requested that the Department provides it with:

(a) A list of the 70 arts and culture organisations supported through transfer payments, as reflected on page 34 of the Annual Report.
(b) Detailed statistics on the profiles of persons visiting museum facilities including the cost per visitor and costs for the Department, as indicated under Sub-programme 2.3, Museum Services on page 35 of the Annual Report.
(c) A list of the libraries connected to the online computer systems as mentioned on page 41 of the Annual Report.
(d) The criteria to be met by prospective candidates in order to become eligible to receive an award for top performance and achievement in sport;
(e) The forms required to be nominated for a sports award, including the deadlines for submission to be considered for a sports award;
(f) A detailed expenditure report on costs incurred by the Department for the 181 Mass Opportunity Development
3. **Western Cape Cultural Commission**

The Western Cape Cultural Commission (WCCC) is legally responsible for the registration and deregistration of cultural councils. It is also responsible for overseeing the management of certain cultural facilities that the Minister of Cultural Affairs, Sport and Recreation has placed under its control.

Mr Willem Boezak, deputy chairperson for the WCCC provided a brief overview of the highlights of the WCCC and thanked the rest of the WCCC members for the excellent work rendered during the current financial year and the Department for its role in supporting the WCCC.

Ms J Moleleki, the Accounting Authority of the WCCC, delivered a brief overview of its Annual Report. Ms Moleleki further informed the Committee that 11 members of the 13 members appointed to the WCCC are currently serving on the WCCC due to two resignations received during its term.

4. **Heritage Western Cape**

The current Chairperson of Heritage Western Cape (HWC), Ms L Robinson, briefed the Committee on the overview of the previous Chairperson of the HWC, Advocate R Robinson, and was in agreement with the overview of services by the HWC.

Mr Andrew Hall, Chief Executive Officer of the HWC, further briefed the Committee on the highlights and challenges of the HWC. Mr Hall informed the Committee that the workload of HWC has increased drastically in terms of the number of heritage applications in the 2012/2013 financial year. A challenge remains in HWC with pressures to process applications efficiently and timeously, which impacts on the other responsibilities of HWC such as the promotion of heritage education awareness initiatives. The prospects of finalising the delegation of powers aspect to the City of Cape Town in dealing with heritage applications will bring some relief to the HWC to focus on other areas of service delivery of the HWC.

4.1 **Recommendations**

The Committee recommended that HWC should provide other penalty options instead of imposing a fine.
4.2 Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requested HWC to provide a report on the outcomes of the nine (9) appeal cases, as reflected on page 15 of the Annual Report 2012/2013 of Heritage Western Cape.

5. Western Cape Language Committee

Mr Hendrik Theys, member of the Western Cape Language Committee (WCLC), represented the chairperson of the WCLC and provided an overview of the activities of the Committee for the 2012/2013 financial year.

Ms Jane Moleleki, Accounting Officer for the WCLC further briefed the Committee on the highlights and challenges of the WCLC.

5.1 Recommendation

The Annual Report of the WCLC reflects that the WCLC was appointed on 1 September 2012, whilst the recommended shortlist of candidates eligible for appointment was referred to the Department on 21 March 2012. The Committee therefore recommends that the Department provide reasons for appointing the new WCLC six (6) months after the date that the recommended shortlist was sent to the Department.

6. Conclusion

The Chairperson thanked all Members, the Minister, the Department the members of the public, for attending the meeting and for their input in the discussions on the Annual Reports.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.

MONDAY, 2 DECEMBER 2013

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. Assent by the Premier in respect of Bill

   Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B 7–2013] – Act 10 of 2013 (assented to and signed by the Premier on 27 November 2013.)
2. **Publication of Act 10 of 2013**


3. **Introduction of Bill**

   **Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

   *Western Cape Monitoring and Support of Municipalities Bill* [B 10–2013].

4. **Referral of Bill to committee in terms of Rule 171**

   **Standing Committee on Local Government:**

   *Western Cape Monitoring and Support of Municipalities Bill* [B 10–2013].

5. **Referral of draft Bills to committees in terms of Rule 220**

   (a) **Standing Committee on Local Government:**

   Draft *Public Administration Management Bill*, 2013 (NCOP) (proposed section 76 Bill).

   (b) **Standing Committee on Human Settlements:**

   Draft *Rental Housing Amendment Bill*, 2013 (NCOP) (proposed section 75 Bill).

6. **Referral of Bill to committee in terms of Rule 220**

   **Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning:**

   *Marine Living Resources Amendment Bill* [B 30B–2013] (NCOP) (proposed section 76 Bill).

**TABLING**

The Speaker:

**Annual Report of the South African Police Service for financial year ended 31 March 2013** tabled in accordance with section 67(3) of the Constitution of the Western Cape Act, 1997:

TUESDAY, 3 DECEMBER 2013

COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:


The Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 1: Premier, in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013] and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

It further reports that the Department of the Premier provides the Committee with the following:

1. A list of all the posts that were advertised in the current financial year 2013/2014;
2. the list of all the new E-Centres;
3. a breakdown of the special projects and the programmes and funds allocated to each programme; and
4. a report on the initial amount that was budgeted for the transformation programme.


The Rules Committee reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 2: Provincial Parliament in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013] and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

The Committee further reports as follows:

A. That the Provincial Parliament provides the Committee with the following:

1. A detailed report on incentive rewards and of performance notch increases awarded to staff; and
2. A breakdown of the cost for the website and the upgrading of the HR management system.

B. The Committee expressed the following concerns:

1. That the needs of Members were not fully considered when finalizing the access to the Provincial Legislature Building pertaining to the upgrading of the building;
2. The lack of communication between the Provincial Parliament and the Department of Transport and Public Works pertaining to the upgrade of the Provincial Legislature Building; and

3. Access for Members entering the building be urgently reconsidered and discussed at a high level of authority.

C. The Committee recommends that–

1. The Provincial Parliament consults with the present Members regarding the support to new Members in the next parliamentary term;
2. The Provincial Parliament considers additional proposals for corporate gear for its Members; and
3. The Provincial Parliament urgently consults with the Department of Transport and Public Works on a dedicated entrance for Members of the Provincial Parliament.


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 3: Provincial Treasury in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 11–2013] and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

4. Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on Vote 4: Community Safety, in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 11–2013], dated 2 December 2013.

The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 4: Community Safety in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 11–2013] and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

It further reports that the Department of the Community Safety provides the Committee with a breakdown cost of Programme 2: Civilian Oversight in respect of the Khayelitsha Police Commission of Inquiry for the previous financial years 2012/2013 and 2013/2014.


The Standing Committee on Education reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 5: Education in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 11–2013] and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

It further reports that the Department brief the Committee on the contracts awarded to organizations to build new schools, for example Cherè Botha Special School.

The Standing Committee on Community Development reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 6: Health in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013] and that it supports the Vote referred to it.


The Standing Committee on Community Development reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 7: Social Development in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013] and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

It further reports that the Department of Social Development:

1. Provides the Committee with a list of shelters and child and youth care centres in the Western Cape; and
2. Investigate the Miglat Ministries feeding scheme, following reports of problems at the scheme.


The Standing Committee on Human Settlements reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 8: Human Settlements in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013] and that it supports the Vote referred to it.


The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 9: Environmental Affairs and Development Planning in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013] and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 10: Transport and Public Works in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013]* and that it supports the Vote referred to it.


The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 11: Agriculture in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013]* and that it supports the Vote referred to it.

It further reports that the Department of Agriculture provide the Committee with a document outlining their participation in international seminars and programmes.


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 12: Department of Economic Development and Tourism, in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013]* and that it supports the Vote referred to it.


The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sports reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sport in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013]* and that it supports the Vote referred to it.


The Standing Committee on Local Government reports that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 14: Local Government in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013]* and that it supports the Vote referred to it.
The House met at 10:00

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 8448

BUSINESS OF HOUSE

†The SPEAKER: You may be seated. Order. I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker I put the motion as printed in my name on the Order Paper.

That, notwithstanding Rule 204 (1), Questions to the Premier without notice shall be dealt with on the same day, namely Wednesday, 4 December 2013, as the discussion on the Premier’s Vote in the Schedule to the Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

†The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections.

Agreed to.

We now proceed to Orders of the Day. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

ORDERS OF THE DAY


†The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Minister Winde.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. Mr Speaker, I rise to introduce or to start this second reading debate, but the second reading debate does have a slight difference to our normal procedure where we are going to be having a second reading debate dealing with the politics of the adjustments and of course the individual adjustments at the same time. So obviously while the speakers will be raising the policy issues and policy differences, at the same time I am going to be asking the House to make sure that they are dealing with the actual adjustments and the numbers that we have to deal with so that at the end of this process we will move to voting on each and every vote across all departments for approval. I ask this House that we go through this process to support and approve the adjustments in this last and final year of this administration’s term. Perhaps I just need to remind the House of what we are dealing with the adjustments, which forms a very, very small percentage of the whole.
I think that it should become part of the yearly experience at adjustments time of
this government that, number one, there has not been lots of extra money to
divide up amongst the departments, and number two, that there has not
been huge changes or shifts between votes or between departments.

If you look at the percentage changes in the adjustments, they have all been
very small amounts as opposed to what has happened in previous years. Let
me perhaps just remind this House of the kind of money we are talking about in
these adjustments. We are talking about R340,971 million, and that is the
additional expenditure. Just to sum up: R69 million is for hospital revitalisation
and infrastructure related issues; R19 million to the replacement of
infrastructure from the flood damages from the previous year; R86 million to the
Provincial Regeneration Projects; R89 million to roads infrastructure; R54
million to property acquisition. There is R92,127 million that is provided for
infrastructure related projects from the 2012/13 provincial roll-over and revenue
over-collection, and just to divide that up – R4 million for refurbishing
parliament; R9 million for social development facilities; R19 million for the
acceleration of housing delivery; and R59 million for roads infrastructure.

There are also further allocations in 2012/13 made from provincial roll-over
shifts between departments and contingency reserves for unforeseeable and
unavoidable allocations. Obviously things change during the year – R40 million
allocated for diverse education requirements. R42 million will be shifted for ICT
services, including broadband connectivity and system enhancements. R8
million will be allocated – it is actually R8,348 million, with reference to the
question earlier in the House to the Premier - will be allocated for the
Khayelitsha Police Commission of Enquiry, and a further R3 million for a
security strategy within the Department of Community Safety; R4 million for the
green economy; R2,259 million for aerial fire fighting and R1,2 million for the
African Nations Championships soccer tournament. In the main budget in 2013
we spoke about transversal projects. R252 million for things such as ICT
Broadband Skills Development, the Green Economy, and the Regional Social
Economic Development Programme was appropriated but held within the - vote
three - Treasury until those plans came about. You would also have heard us in
this process talking about how that money is going to be spent over the next
three years, but also the R47 million of the special project funding that has now
been allocated in the first year of the next three years, and how that money will
be spent. So in context that is what we are going to be talking about in this
debate, but obviously I am pretty certain that the speakers will also bring in
policy changes, suggestions and comparisons. I look forward to this debate and
I shall rise again when I need to answer. Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr von Brandis, over to you.

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. As we debate the
Adjustments Appropriation Bill I firstly want to make a reference to section 215
of the Constitution, which states and I read:

“National, provincial and municipal budgets and budgetary processes must
promote transparency, accountability and the effective financial
management of the economy, debt and the public sector.”
Mr Speaker, it is said that nothing more clearly distinguishes a democracy from another system than its observance of a rule of law. The DA’s form of commitment to clean government and the constitution especially in matters of budgeting and expenditure is often absent in other political parties. In June of this calendar year the presidency released a monitoring and performance assessment tool, or MPAT, which gave this province the highest KPA score for financial management. The report states the Western Cape performed substantially better, substantially better than any other province in the area of financial management. ANC led provinces such as Limpopo, where some departments have been under national administration since 2011, Gauteng, the North West and the Eastern Cape achieved less than 40% in compliance levels 3 and 4 in financial management. The Western Cape scored double that, double that, Mr Speaker, at 82% on these levels. As a DA led government we champion such results that stand as testaments to our commitment to clean, accountable, and most importantly, effective and lawful government.

Responsible government spends responsibly, which is what makes budgets so important. Budgets are one of government’s primary tools in implementing economic policy. Looking at the findings presented by the Auditor General over the past financial year, they clearly show the massive financial management gulf between this and other provinces in South Africa. The Western Cape has reported the lowest wastage out of all nine provinces in this past financial year, which was furthermore an improvement on the previous financial year’s findings. With the exception of one department over the past three years, the Western Cape government has incurred no unauthorised expenditure. ANC led provincial governments and related departments and agencies, however, incurred a staggering, an embarrassing figure of some R22,6 billion in irregular, unauthorised, fruitless and wasteful expenditure in the past financial year. Such gross financial waste in these provinces according to the auditor general has become the norm not the exception. Mr Speaker, in the Cape Times today business leader Johan Rupert said he was struck by how anyone can start a business in South Africa, given the increasing levels of red tape and corruption, especially at local level. He added that the decline in the rule of law and interference in the courts and judge appointments too was worrying. Rupert went further to say that the biggest insult is that the ANC led national government does not appear concerned with what South Africans think, whether it is business people or those that live in the townships. A better life for all has been scrapped for a better life for some.

One of the critical factors which will frame the medium term budget policy objectives, which include promoting economy growth, reducing unemployment, poverty and improving health care and education, is governance. The Western Cape’s commitment to governance and accountability is clearly distinguished in the MPAT report, where it too ranked number 1 in the country. The province’s plan to continue setting up systems that will further improve governance is covered in the medium term budget. With the strides the Western Cape has made over the past few years I am confident that we can as Minister Winde said several times, become one of the best run regional governments in the world.

†Mr H P GEYER: Hear, hear!
Mr E J von Brandis: The Western Cape under this administration is a better Western Cape. An adjustments budget that we pass today will be an investment towards a stronger provincial economy. Mr Speaker, I hereby support the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill of 2013 and the reports on votes 3, 10 and 12. I thank you.

†Hon Members: Hear, hear!

†The Speaker: Hon mem Ms Brown, over to you.

Ms L Brown: Allow me, Mr Speaker, to start off commending Ace Magashule, Premier of the Free State, on his achievements in terms of education. This morning we heard and saw that more than 500 young people from the Free State will become medical doctors, pilots, agriculturists etc. The young people are on bursaries from the government, from SMMe’s in the area and from business in the communities. I am very proud of it. I am very proud of that ANC government and I commend the New Age and Morning Live for bringing the good news to us. The many young people who will be graduating from matric will know that there is hope in the Free State.

The introduction of the medium term expenditure framework … Mr Speaker, are you going to rule when hon Minister Carlisle screams while I am speaking?

†The Minister of Transport and Public Works: I did not scream.

†Ms L Brown: Are you going to rule on that?

†The Speaker: Hon mem Ms Brown, I do know my job. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

Ms L Brown: The introduction of the medium term expenditure framework in 1997 was aimed at improving the linkages between planning and budgets and to ensure that there is certainty and predictability of service delivery to our communities. Although the ANC created a budget process with timelines to assess our priorities and within the funding envelope that would allocate resources that could make a difference in the lives of poor people living in the Western Cape who should be the primary beneficiaries of the state, the 2013/2014 main budget was formulated with the priorities of the DA government and funding has been provided for programmes and projects that are ready or almost ready for implementation through the transversal projects of Broadband, Green Economy, Skills Development and the Regional Socio Economy project. In fact, an amount of R252 million was placed in the Provincial Treasury vote for allocation in the 2013/14 adjusted budget. However, only an amount of R47,8 million of these funds has been allocated in the 2013/14 adjustments budget and the rest has been reallocated to the 2014 MTEF. These funds could have been used to alleviate the plight of the poor now, given the adverse economic environment and its effect on the unemployed and business as highlighted in the many glossy documents we see, are scheduled to be spent in the future. These are not intended for the poor. The mantra that the DA government spews forth is that 80% of the budget is spent on the poor, and this is one that we have to interrogate.
That budget is spent on health and education and of course that is your and any
government’s statutory obligation. That is what you get your provincial equitable
share for. It is not used for anything else and it is nationally driven. We should
judge the DA government by what it spends its other money on, the 14% that is...
[Inaudible].

Where you can and do prioritise on the poor you do not spend it on service
delivery issues, Madam Premier [Interjections]. We know that housing is in a
危机 in this province.

†HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes.

†Ms L BROWN: Educational infrastructure, maintenance is in a crisis...
[Interjections.] Poor schools are in a crisis in this province. You do not know
because you have not been there. Healthcare to the poor, whether it is G F
Jooste or Hanover Park Clinic, is in a crisis, hon Minister Botha.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You are living on happy island.

†Ms L BROWN: You are spending R9 million on the Commission on the police -
just a fight with national, that is all. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†Ms L BROWN: You have outsourced your responsibility as the government of
the Western Cape. You should go and listen to the communities...
[Interjections.] ... and help fix the problems in the communities. You do not
have to spend R9 million on getting others to fix it...

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is the biggest
rot!

†Ms L BROWN: That is what governments do. Governments do it right here
and they do the work. Crime, Madam Premier, is everywhere. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†Ms L BROWN: Are you going to provide a commission for each community? I
think not. Now what I always wonder - is it political corruption to not get the
balance right of spending what is over in your budget after health and education
and you do not spend it on the most vulnerable amongst us, the poor?

†Mr M G E WILEY: Oh, come on!

†Mr H P GEYER: When are you going to Nkandla?

†Ms L BROWN: One of the government’s priorities ... It is not about going to
visit Nkandla. You are so ... I hope you have a holiday up there and go and visit
Nkandla, then you can stop asking me about Nkandla. [Interjections.] One of the
government’s priorities – not even your house is [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]
†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Geyer. Can you stop this running commentary please.

†Ms L BROWN: One of the government's priorities has been investment in the construction of infrastructure delivery, the broadband, Rhodes School, health and general government buildings. For this reason large amounts of funds have been put aside, and could anyone refresh my mind how much was rolled over in 2012, 2013 and the 2014 MTEFs tests? I assume it could be close to R6 billion or even more. Some of these projects have been delayed. Which one's were delayed, what did it cost and why? I should then repeat my statement that funds that could have been used to alleviate the plight of the poor now, given the adverse economic environment and its effect on the unemployed and business as highlighted in your many glossy documents have been scheduled to be spent in the future.

Who really benefits from investment into broadband? An excessive investment ... [Interjections.] ... or the holding of funds in special reserves ... [Interjections.] I assume it is going to be your party's investors and not the people who live on farms, work on farms, those unemployed young people, construction workers, the vulnerable seniors, who will benefit.

In education the budget adjustments are made to shift about R95,75 million of infrastructure funding to schools for maintenance. Will these schools be able to spend and communities get value for money? Could the shift of funding in such a matter not merely be a way of hiding an impending under expenditure on infrastructure delivery, a shift away from pre-service teacher bursaries, citing reasons of not receiving adequate applications, despite the fact that we are complaining about teacher quality? In all the documents the province make statements that about 96% of what we spend is funded from national government via national transfers, equitable share and conditional grants. These funds are aimed at advancing national priorities yet there is poor performance on delivering the required infrastructure either through poorly designed supply chain processes or service delivery processes.

I also probably need to ask the location of poor performance in infrastructure delivery. Needless to say this would also be in more poor communities. You have based your election promises on delivery to these communities and I am sure you have most certainly broken their trust. Even though the DA has now discovered race and acknowledged the role apartheid played in under-developing poor African and coloured people, the poor are African and coloured and this budget is biased against it. So paying lip service to opportunities make no sense. You can fool some people some of the time but you will definitely be unable to fool all the people all of the time.

My request to the DA is, when you have additional money when you roll over to another year, you must consider the fact that this is a province where we have huge service delivery protests. This is a province where we have huge backlogs in housing.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Very genuine!
†Ms L BROWN: This is a province where we have often only a small grouping of one race group succeeding in matric. This is a province where young black kids never have opportunities ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†Ms L BROWN: ... and therefore, Mr Speaker, I am appealing that the money spent should be spent on the poor. There is the problem where Hanover Park Clinic will be closing down and moving further away from where people are because of crime. Spend some of that R9 million in the community, improving the quality of the people’s lives in the community so that we do not have crime infestation in the community. [Interjections.].

†An HON MEMBER: Get your priest to do it.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order.

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: You cannot be the champion of the poor because of corruption.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon mem Mr Von Brandis.

†Ms L BROWN: Are you calling me corrupt?

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Ms Brown, you had your chance, please.

†Ms L BROWN: Mr Speaker, I would like to you to rule. I sit down and he speaks about the fact that we cannot deal with the poor because of corruption. Is he calling me corrupt?

†The SPEAKER: That is a question that I will have to pose to ... who ... who are you referring to?

†An HON MEMBER: Hon mem Mr Von Brandis.

†An HON MEMBER: Hon Minister Carlisle.

†The SPEAKER: That is a question that I have to ask hon Minister Carlisle? Order, hon members. Minister Carlisle, can you address the Chair please.

†An HON MEMBER: No, it is not Carlisle.

†An HON MEMBER: No, it is not him. He is innocent.

†The SPEAKER: Oh! Hon mem Mr von Brandis. Okay. [Laughter.] Have you said that, hon mem Mr von Brandis? Please address the Chair. Please address the Chair, hon mem Mr von Brandis.

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, I did not call the hon mem Ms Brown corrupt. All I said is that you cannot be a champion of the poor because of corruption ...
The SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you. Take your seat. Take your seat, hon mem Mr Von Brandis. You did not refer to hon mem Ms Brown but you spoke of corruption. We allow that in this House. Hon mem Mr Wiley, over to you. Hon members, order. Over to you.

†Mr M G E Wiley: Thank you, Mr Speaker. There are three types of people in the world: those that make things happen; those that talk about things happening; and like the hon member of the opposition, those who wonder what happened. [Laughter.] I would like to get back to the first, and that is those people who make things happen.

As far as this year is concerned in real terms it has been an extraordinary year for the Department of Community Safety. Not only did they receive numerous accolades and justifiable recognition but they, together with other departments of provincial standing, all under DA administration, together with the standing committee, significantly readjusted the boundaries of police oversight in this country. Financially the department again received a clean audit; this being the fourth year in a row that they have done so. They were also assessed as the third best department throughout South Africa, including national, provincial and parastatal organisations, by the MPAT presidential report. They have also received the remarkable distinction of being assessed as the number one provincial department in South Africa as far as service delivery is concerned, receiving the Batho Pele award for the best functioning department, awarded by the Department of Public Service Administration last month.

Last week at the Road Traffic Management Corporation Awards event held in Eastern Cape, the department won eight of the 14 awards on offer. These awards are given to ensure quality of road traffic services through safety, security, order, discipline and mobility. The awards won, and I will preface as much as I can, by the department were for, firstly the best traffic training centre, the Gene Louw Traffic College that we have been to visit. The college has positively contributed by ensuring applied competence is delivered through both formal and informal learning programmes to officials from provincial and local authorities and the South African Police Service, private testing stations from all over the country and international clients, including Botswana.

The best provincial authority in alcohol enforcement plan: the Western Cape had started a weekend alcohol blitz programme where 24 road blocks, 12 on a Friday and 12 on a Saturday evening were set up every single weekend of the year since 1 April 2010. The Western Cape Province has been awarded for being the only province in the country with such a programme. It is also the only province to have a 24 hour provincial traffic police. The best education and training development practitioner, Ms Tweedy, has proven a valuable asset to the Gene Louw Training College with her contributions to the training environment in the meticulous, professional and competent execution of her duties in the interest of the learners speaks volumes. The most promising new facilitator: Mr Cabe Pfeifer was recently appointed as the training practitioner at Gene Louw College in the driver training programme at community projects. The most innovative idea: Mr Abe Barnardo, for the upgrading at Gene Louw College. Mr Barnardo developed different concepts for a new image to add to the existing upgrade.
Going the extra mile award went to three different individuals, Mr van Oord, Mr Karelse from Somerset West and Mr J P Viviers from Beaufort West.

But it was in other areas that this department has also excelled by taking the lead and facilitating crime fighting initiatives. Many of these are now bearing fruit. The long awaited Community Safety Act was passed by this House following two years of research. Already several aspects of this Act are being implemented albeit in trial areas. This includes the EPP Project whereby direct observation interaction with the police at station level is maintained on a regular basis in terms of the Police Act. This has been complimented by the watching briefs that are tracking cases in the criminal justice process to ensure that victims’ rights are preserved.

This part appropriation further emphasises the strides that this administration has taken to protect the citizens of this province. An amount of R5,6 million has been transferred to supplement the Khayelitsha Commission of Enquiry. This has been delayed for a year now due to the inexplicable and misguided interference by the Minister of Police, who apparently is not interested in why the residents of Khayelitsha who fall into the same economic group in many respects, are so upset about policing in the area and why vigilantes have brutally murdered dozens of people in the last year alone. The Minister, not satisfied with the High Court ruling against him, then went to the constitutional court. Even a first year law student would have pointed out to him that the Premier may appoint a group commission but despite this he persisted in frustrating the tormented residents of Khayelitsha, further adding to their suffering and probably having a direct effect on their lack of safety. How many lives have been lost due to this political game being played by ANC politicians?

Similarly there is the money being transferred, R2,19 million, to pay for the safety of children in Manenberg during the gang violence earlier this year. Not content with the open warfare in the streets and on school premises, the Minister of Police refused to call in the support of the army or even form a gang unit, this while gang units were being formed in other provinces by the national commissioner. It was left up to the province and the city to safeguard schools and the community. Scores of Metro police had to be seconded full-time to the area, as were many security guards.

In addition, the city added two significant manpower multipliers to its armoury, namely the School Resource Programme and the Community Patrol Reservists. The first sees qualified Metro police officers allocated to gang infested areas. The pilot project had proved extraordinary successful. The second project which will significantly bolster the ability and confidence of neighbourhood watches will see trained units of police reservists deployed within communities. Already 400 people have volunteered for this programme, and this part appropriation allocates R430,000 towards neighbourhood watch trailers. However, these extraordinary tasks have taken their toll and volunteer programmes are being affected within the department, and a funding shortage in this small department means officials will have to double up in tasks to get the work load done.
All these proactive and dynamic initiatives must be seen in the light of the two significant crises facing the primary agency tasked with fighting crime in this province and the country, namely SAPS. By admission they have stated that they are under strength and their numbers are due to decline further. Reservist utilisation is at an all-time low, 20% of what they were a few years ago. Although the moratorium on recruitment has been lifted, there is no clear strategy to re-implement it. The other more ominous crisis is that crime is up in virtually every category, with apparently the exception of reported sexual crimes. SAPS has not indicated any significant counter strategy to date but this apparent lack of concern by police top brass and their political masters is not unique. For almost two years now the standing committee has been fighting to get a formal annual report from the provincial commissioner’s office. It took threats and unique persuasion, including the summoning of the national commissioner to this Chamber to get a commitment to fulfil what is simply a legal obligation. I am pleased to say that as of last week, the SAPS annual report for the Western Cape is now in our possession and will be formally interrogated by the standing committee and the provincial police commissioner at the end of January. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, this being the last sitting of the House for 2013, it is an opportune occasion to reflect on gains made by the DA led government in the Western Cape. The truth is that despite the ANC’s narrative that tried to paint the DA as a governing party bent on preserving and spending only on the privileged white class, the evidence shows that we have made unprecedented gains in improving the lives of all the people of the province, but especially the poor and disadvantaged. Glancing at the figures and allocations in the adjustments budget, they show that the overwhelming proportion of social development funding has been allocated to projects and programmes that assist the poor of this province. The Finance and Fiscal Commission also confirms that the Western Cape Department of Social Development transfers the greater proportion of its budget to the NGO sector than any other Social Development department in the country.

The 2013/14 adjustments budget for the Department of Social Development increases by R9,642 million from a total budget of R1,577 billion to R1,587 billion. The increase of R9,642 million is from the previous financial year roll-over and revenue retention and is primarily earmarked for infrastructure projects and upgrading of child and youth care centres. Although my department is experiencing significant budget pressure specifically in the areas of child and youth care services, it was able to reprioritise and conduct shifts within its budgets to ensure that we continue to provide the necessary funding and support to those communities that need it most.

I also want to add that the reprioritisation process includes the implementation of a number of austerity measures, including the curbing of travelling subsistence costs and cutting departmental expense on catering events and advertising.
The funds identified through the reprioritisation will be utilised primarily: one, for the expansion of the child and youth care capacity, particularly to accommodate sentenced youth and level three children referred to our care from the courts; two, covering the cost of higher than expected numbers of awaiting trial youth referred to our department; and lastly, increasing the capacity at Hanover Drug Rehabilitation Centre by appointing more staff. We have seen through the debates this morning that those are the areas primarily where the youth and the poor are affected.

There is still much to be done and there is room for improvement on many levels, but it should be clear from our budget priorities that the claims so often made by the ANC and its allies that the DA favours the rich is simply not borne out by the evidence. Increasingly we find that the only way that the ANC can counter monumental gains made by the DA in this province and in all the municipalities we control across the country, is through misinformation and dirty tricks. ANC leaders like Ramaphosa, Gigaba and Fransman have been telling the public that the DA will bring back apartheid. Is it not amazing how easily the so-called party of liberation now resorts to the same gevaar-tactics of the apartheid regime? The ANC’s dirty tricks campaign stretches to a number of so-called sites of struggle. My own department, Mr Speaker, the Department of Social Development and myself as Minister, have been a target of the strategy through the dissemination of anonymous pamphlets and open letters to the media containing blatantly false allegations. These feeble attempts reflect the resistance to the governance system that we as a party promote and the issues that we are introducing in our department to ensure accountability, transparency and improve service delivery to the poor and vulnerable.

The progress that we have made has been acknowledged by the Auditor General, but it seems to be making some interest groups very, very uncomfortable. We also note the ignorant comments made by the hon mem Ms Hani and other ANC members of this House regarding the Chrysalis programme. They did not bother to take up my invitation to attend the Chrysalis graduation last Saturday, which was a phenomenal success. If they did they would have seen for themselves how hollow their criticisms are. [Interjections.]

†Ms V HANI: You did not invite us.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I invited you in the House. I invited you. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, 179... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon mem Ms Hani order. Order, hon member.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: 179 young women and their families were present for the important milestone, but it is not in the interest of the ANC to acknowledge this, particularly given the fact that under the watch of the ANC Chrysalis almost collapsed.
We came to revive it and bring it back to life for the poor of this province. Mr Speaker, the biggest threat to the democratic health of this country lies within the ANC and the so-called alliance. The institutional corruption and I want to emphasise, the constitutional corruption, the disdain for Chapter Nine institution such as the public protector, the abuse of public services to placate the unions and reward cronies, the manipulation of people via the race-card and save Jacob Zuma from jail campaign, all of these are signs and signals that the ANC cannot be trusted with the future of this province and with the future of this country.

Mr Speaker, in spite of the ANC’s ungovernability campaign, we will continue to work and deliver the programmes aimed at improving the lives of the poor people of this province. The allocations of the adjustments budget with its focus on much needed upgrading of our child and youth care centres bears testimony to it.

One of the issues that we never speak to in this House is the legacy of ANC rule in this province. Yesterday I had the opportunity to visit Kalkfontein where a matriculant committed suicide on Sunday evening, and when I walked and drove through that area, I graphically saw poverty through the ANC’s governance – 20 years of misinformation and misrule.

I had the honour and the opportunity to see our school in that area. The new school became a haven and oasis of hope in that area. I want to say people thank the DA government for coming and for giving their children hope. We will continue to do the best and work hard for the poor in this province. Amen. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: ACDP. Order, hon members. ACDP, over to you, hon mem Mr Haskin. Order, hon members.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you. Mr Speaker, in terms of provincial treasury, the ACDP is in support of the special project fund that has been created for funding transversal projects such as ICT Broadband Services, Skills Development, the Green Economy and Regional Socio-economic Development Programmes. We are particularly pleased that these funds are only accessible to departments subject to the costing and planned detailed roll-out of prioritisation and how it is going to be implemented.

But the ACDP is concerned that the MTEF allocation of R204 million announced in the speech, is less than the R244 million that has been shifted to other votes in this adjustments process. We are concerned that this represents a reducing of the programme’s intention over the MTEF. Two further concerns are that we are unsure why special projects funds include ICT services and broadband initiatives within departments when funds are also being transferred from provincial treasury to DotP CEI for that purpose. So why funds are being shifted from PT to DotP and PT to other departments for the same purpose is unclear. It would seem that this is unnecessarily shifting funds between departments. DCAS themselves will have to either subsequently shift their funds to DotP CEI or indicate that they are not in support of CEI’s work.
The special project fund spent 34% to date, which is a mild increase of 8% over last year, but this is only due to rising personnel costs. Specifically, it is not due to increased compliance with provincial treasury’s very valid criteria or the improved roll-out of the projects within these departments. So we are concerned with regards to that as well.

What we are concerned about as the ACDP overall, Mr Speaker, is that there is little to no mention of the improved contingency plans for Eskom’s rolling blackouts which we are hearing more and more about, and in this respect Scopa in our annual reporting sessions noted that although high-risk areas are being audited in a three-year cycle, there is little to no focus on emerging risks and what departments are doing about this. In this adjustments process there is no mention of emerging risks.

Vote 2: The Western Cape provincial parliament refers to the lack of communication between the implementing agent and the client department and stakeholders. This is not new. Instead it is repeatedly raised by the Department of Health, but is dismissed by the Department of Transport and Public Works. This is another concern that Scopa has and Scopa has resolved to call a joint standing committee meeting with the Education Department, Department of Health and Transport and Public Works to get to the bottom of what is going on with the service level agreements between these departments.

The ACDP remains in support of the Khayelitsha Commission of Enquiry, but we are concerned regarding the escalating costs. The department reports that in 2013 it spent R3,9 million and that in 13/14 year to date it has already spent R3,2 million. This adjustment adds another R8,3 million, so in our calculations this is R11,5 million that is being spent on the Commission of Enquiry. Once all is said and done it appears that this Commission is going to cost over R15 million, and this excludes, or does it, a question to the Minister, the roll-over of R2,6 million of 12/13 and the contingency reserve for the Commission of Enquiry of R5,6 million.

Although the terms of the Commission are narrow, the community’s complaints are of great concern to the ACDP – three in particular. The first is that insufficient visible policing in the community continues to exist, but we believe in this respect that the Department of Community Safety can react and report to us on that. The second is that there is a routine violation of the rights of residents of Khayelitsha, and the third is the high impact of high crime rates on residents including children and people who are vulnerable to discrimination, and that the discrimination continues, notwithstanding the Commission’s work.

Finally, the ACDP is concerned that in terms of the Department of Community Safety’s plans, motorcyclist deaths have increased from 12/13 to the current year, yet there has been no mention in the annual performance plan of this… [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Order. Please finish, hon mem Mr Haskin.
†Mr G C R HASKIN: No mention in the strategy and no mention in the adjustments of what the department is going to do to reduce motorcycle deaths on the roads in the Western Cape. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you hon mem Mr Haskin. Hon mem Mr Geyer, over to you.

†Mr H GEYER: Thank you. Mr Speaker, with regard to Vote 2: Provincial Parliament, the DA is satisfied that the adjusted amount of R654,000 will be utilised in the best interest of this institution, taking into account the requirements of its members. Then on a more general note, we are nearing the end of 2013 which virtually brings us to the brink of our term. In fact, the end of a period where the provincial parliament has done exceptionally well if we consider the latest annual report tabled in this House.

With regard to HR it is gladdening to note that most of the vacant posts, especially those of committee co-ordinators have been filled. What is more, we are fortunate to have a group of dedicated officials who take pride in their work and deliver work of a very high standard. I must compliment them on a job well done. On the other hand, Mr Speaker, members are grateful for the opportunity this parliament has afforded them to do further study in order to equip them with the necessary skills needed to perform their work in the best manner.

The investment made enabling members to train through Palama is an investment where we should reap the fruits in future. We as members want to express our gratitude afforded us by the Speaker.

However, there were many other challenges of which the present construction work on the legislature would surely be considered as the biggest hampering factor. Fortunately the construction work is steadily drawing to a close and the members returning to this parliament after the 2014 elections will find themselves in a better working environment as such. We are thus anxiously awaiting the completion of the new entrance to this building early next year, which will enhance the access area underneath the arches. Ensuring the safety of members, in an environment where a parliament and a legislature are combined in one building, will not always be ideal. Yet Mr Speaker, with good planning I am convinced that a solution can be found for this unique situation we are faced with.

†Mr M OZINSKY: That is not what hon mem Mr Wiley said in Scopa. [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon mem Mr Ozinsky.

†Mr H P GEYER: This unique situation certainly calls for specialised services and therefore the contracting of a security consultant who can assess and advise parliamentary staff on the security issues of this precinct is an urgent requirement. However, if access on the fourth, fifth and sixth floors could be blocked off at the lift foyers with glass access doors as recently has been done at the entrance in 15 Wale Street, it would greatly enhance unwanted thoroughfare through these sensitive areas.
Today we live in a computerised electronic age with the world at our fingertips, yet in this House we are saddled with furniture which has great historic and cultural value but does not meet the modern demand. How do we overcome this? By replacing this little inkpot with an electrical device in which we can afford members the opportunity to change batteries or plug in their computers and iPads during these long sessions we are here. This small adaption, Mr Speaker, will prevent members virtually making a handstand to access the electronic fitting underneath our benches. I see this as a win-win situation where we do not do injustice to the rich cultural legacy of this institution.

†Mr M OZINSKY: What have you been doing under the bench?

†Mr H P GEYER: However, in doing so we accommodate the computerised electronic age of today. It is gladdening to hear that parliament is considering plans to enlarge office space in this building in order to accommodate the needs of better functioning of this parliament. I am referring to projects such as larger and better equipped committee rooms with modern flat screens. It is clear that the present facilities … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon mem Mr Ozinsky. Hon mem Mr Ozinsky, order. You may proceed, hon mem Mr Geyer.

†Mr H P GEYER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Ultimately the enlargement of this Chamber also seems unavoidable for the near future and planning thereof also needs to be addressed timeously. We appreciate the fact that this matter is receiving attention… [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Geyer. Please finish your sentence, your time has expired.

†Mr H P GEYER: Thank you. Albeit in a preliminary stage. Thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you.

†An HON MEMBER: It cannot work. It will not work.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Ms Beerwinkel, over to you.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Mr Speaker, every citizen in this province has reasonable expectations of what it wants its government to deliver on. These basic expectations are enshrined in our constitution, which is informed by the Freedom Charter. Some of these expectations include that their children can attend a school where they get good quality education; that they live in a safe and secure environment; that they have easy access to healthcare facilities; that they can have sustainable employment and decent shelter and if they live in the rural areas, the assurance that they also would experience growth and development in their areas. So, Mr Speaker, what did this government do … [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That was the case in 2009 was it not?
†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Because on paper, they put in front of us during the main appropriation, great plans and targets to which they committed funds via the Equitable Share and Conditional Grants Division of the national Treasury.

Now today, we are confronted by that fork in the road moment where the DA had to take a good hard honest look at which of these promises they have achieved, whether they have asked themselves where they can improve, but most importantly, based on the realities and the dissatisfaction in our communities, what they should reprioritise and how they should change direction. This DA government knows just the right catch phrases and popular sound bites to utter to sell themselves, but let us unpack what really happened to date and why we today are faced with an adjustments budget that looks like this and what it says about how this DA government cares for our citizens. [Interjections.]

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker the adjustments facts and figures speak for themselves.

†An HON MEMBER: Very well.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Based on the escalation of service delivery protests, the demand for decent living conditions, the increasing number of unemployed youth and the widening gap between rich and poor, let us evaluate some of these departments and their change direction strategy and give them a progress report as it is that time of the year anyway even though it is not for a full year’s work.

So let us start with Treasury then. This is the one department that wears many hats. Some of them are to distribute the provincial equitable share, conditional grants, to manage spending, to put policies in place, to ensure financial discipline, and to assist municipal budgets, but this time round Treasury themselves have dropped the ball. Treasury took it upon themselves to park in their main appropriation for this financial year, not spread across the outer years, this financial year, the amount of R252 million for transversal projects, not approved but in the hope that the different departments would comply with their request for project plans and proposals to utilise those funds.

Mr Speaker, we warned them. We even went as far as suggesting that they were creating a slush fund, which they tried to defend, and now it is time for us to say we told you so. Because the proof is there. The departments did not comply. Treasury then realised that they would not be able to spend the full amount and so they hoped against all odds that other departments might have been overzealous in their planning and need more funds. This would then afford them the opportunities to shift that under-spend to be utilised in this financial year and in that way maintain a balanced provincial budget. The result – Treasury had to cut its budget by half to accommodate the shifts. Yet the MEC earlier says that the shifts in the departments this time round were not significant – half is very bad.
When last did you see that happen, Mr Speaker? This was a perfect opportunity for the DA government to have said here we have funds, R204 million at our disposal, let us shift it to those departments that are responsible for and attend to the basic needs that our frustrated communities are clamouring for. No, instead they buy property and develop skills in other departments and concentrate on broadband initiatives that in the medium term will only benefit big business, and we know that is the DA’s constituency.

These issues do not even remotely show a care for the marginalised. I am sorry Treasury, as much as I normally see the good in what you do, this time round I am giving you a disappointing D. You should have known better.

[Interjections.]

Let us move to the chest-beater of education – MEC Grant and his department. Can I please be protected, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister Carlisle.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, is this not the same MEC who not so long ago boasted about the many schools that he would build? His recent jig and jive was about the no-fees schools in quintiles four and five that he was going to put in place. Now just a little history: a no-fees school does not generate funds from school fees paid by parents, but by the learner allocation from the department. Now if this really was a sincere initiative by the DA, why did MEC Grant not allocate those funds to this specific cause at the time of the main appropriation – why now? Because those same schools have always been poor and in the same wrong quintile. Clearly this is an election gimmick. What he did not tell those who fell for this flimsy propaganda, is that the funds came from those very new schools he was boasting about, at least 20 of them, where the projects are now put on hold and the funds diverted to fund these …

[Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What did he put on hold?

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No-fees schools, the Premier’s pet project and other lesser deliverables to the tune of a R145 million taken from the infrastructure budget of schools. It also writes off R13 million of unrecoverable debt – imagine what could have been done with that amount of money and roll-overs of – they also roll-over funds for nutrition and HIV projects due to supposed invoices that did not come in on time. So let us unpack this little election publicity stunt. Mr Speaker, once a school has accepted to become a no-fees school, the department cannot further down the line decline to fund them. The committed infrastructure projects also need to continue, but what assurance does this MEC have that the allocation from national next year will cover the funds for those no-fees schools and the committed capital projects that were stopped? So MEC Grant and his department, again you have failed the learners and the parents in this province in more ways than one.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is not true!
†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What about the numerous court battles? The proof is here, Mr Speaker, in this book. Numerous court battles and the learner transport debacle to name but a few. You have created expectations, but you have been very frugal with the truth. So to you an F for failure.

Then, Mr Speaker, MEC Winde and his departments. MEC … [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They can get a Z.
†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: While your vision and your facilitation may be in the right place… [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Is that for Zuma?

†The SPEAKER: Order.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Your department has let you down. Let us take the Economic Development department. This department, Mr Speaker, needs to facilitate economic growth, encourage tourism, not only here in the heart of the city for the rich overseas visitors but open up the wealth of experience of this province and its cultures to all. The complaints of the residents of Bo-Kaap and in the townships are a case in point. It needs to facilitate and create an enabling environment for easier processes to do business, increase work opportunities, cut red tape, market trade opportunities and develop skills. Yet, the budget cuts in this department come out of those very programmes that are supposed to facilitate those issues.

This downturn in economic development has also taken its toll in human cost as is the case with Wesgro. Let us stop for a minute at Wesgro. This human cost is evident in the fact that almost on a monthly basis people are leaving Wesgro for reasons like redundancy, downsizing, retrenchments and things like that, and who are they? Mostly the ex-staff of CTRU – Cape Town Routes Unlimited. This is also the very entity who took over the functions and responsibility of CTRU even before proper legislation was in place and gave us the assurance that these staff would be accommodated. Now they are even funded with extra money because of repeated requests to host functions and events. Seriously, how did they plan the original budget?

†The SPEAKER: Order hon mem Ms Beerwinkel, your time has expired.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: My last sentence, Mr Speaker. In short, the R20 million that the Economic Development department is adjusting downwards should have been an increase … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon mem Ms Beerwinkel. Thank you very much.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... to be able to carry out their core functions.

†The SPEAKER: We now proceed to the next speaker. I recognise the hon mem Mr Walters. Over to you.
†Mr M C WALTERS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Development Planning recommends the approval and acceptance by the House of the additional appropriation budgets of the Department of Agriculture and the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.

The Department of Agriculture stands out as the department eminently worthy of emulation by all other departments at national level and in other provinces. Identified for the third year in succession as the top department in South Africa, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture is what a department in the public service should be; delivering services to meet the present and future needs of its stakeholders regardless of fortune or creed. Its maintenance and expansion of the Elsenburg College of Agriculture to meet the training in management and skill needs of all sectors of agriculture in the Western Cape, stands in stark contrast to the failures of previously esteemed colleges in the ANC governed provinces. Glen in the Free State, Potchefstroom Agricultural College in North West, Fort Cox in Middelburg in the Eastern Cape and Cedara in Kwazulu-Natal are only shadows of their former selves. Elsenburg is also the origin of many export industries of the Western Cape, with the faculty of agriculture at the University of Stellenbosch, the agricultural council research institutes and others having their origins in the research and learning and teaching divisions of the Elsenburg complex. It is unfortunate that in needy provinces the inefficient, corrupt and exploitative rule of the ANC has allowed those institutes which should drive agricultural and rural development to fall into ineffectiveness and disuse.

In the field of land reform, effective management combined with share equity schemes have set the scene for the rest of South Africa. Billions of rands will be wasted nationally on recapitalisation of failed schemes exacerbated and administered by the same cadre infested structures. The DA has developed an effective template of success in the form of the Western Cape Department of Agriculture. In the past, stakeholders have said that in many cases the interest of the poor in the Western Cape would be better served if certain essential functions, ostensibly to be addressed by the national Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, be devolved down to provincial level, in this case the Western Cape. These functions include phytosanitary controls, vaccine production and meeting trade agreement deadlines to seal potential export markets in which the ANC has failed. The constant changing of Fisheries policies, the incompetent management of Fisheries harbours and non-functional patrol vessels represent huge fruitless expenditures and failed services to impoverished communities. Under efficient provincial management regimes, a far more effective suite of services promoting job creation and prosperity would be put in place.

The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning’s comprehensive suite of support services to municipalities is driven by its mission to ensure an environment for human development which is environmentally sustainable while supporting responsible economic development. In this pursuit we must congratulate Minister Anton Bredell for his great dedication. Air quality, renewable energy, coastal management, promotion of rational spatial development frameworks, estuary management
and aquaculture are only some of the functions that the department and its entity promote in transversal co-operation with other departments. Let the communities of the Western Cape, as diverse as they are, be the advancing face of a new South Africa where the evil ANC forces of corruption and self-aggrandizement are banished to the political landfills of the country. Let us not be destroyed … [Interjections.]

Let us not be destructed by manipulated pseudo farm worker strikes, planned and funded through the dishonest deployment of state funds or so-called service delivery demonstrations by ANC activists led by ANC office-holders. [Interjection.] It is obvious that in other provinces former ANC voters are spontaneously protesting the dishonesties and inefficiencies of the ANC. It is not for want of dissatisfaction that service protests in other provinces with Bekkersdal as a prime example, have reached a crescendo far, far exceeding the ANC manipulated protests in the Western Cape. Indeed, Gauteng and other ANC ruled provinces have emerged as major service protest areas where poor communities are spontaneously expressing their rejection of the feeble excuses … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon mem Mr Walters.

†Mr M C WALTERS: … offered by ANC politicians for the lack of dedication to the improvement of life in poor communities. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Order. Thank you, hon mem Mr Walters. Hon Minister Botha, order. Hon Minister Plato, over to you.

†The SPEAKER: Minister Plato over to you.

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, thank you very much. The Department of Community Safety had many successes over the last couple of months and thank you hon mem Mr Wiley for highlighting some. We reach out to thousands of youth across the Western Cape in a major attempt to give them hope but also to provide them with opportunities.

A major highlight is my relationship with some FET Colleges. They went with us to many rural areas, many towns to talk to the youth to further their studies concentrating on school dropouts, the gangster youth, and those involved with drugs but also the vulnerable and the poor and I am pleased to report to this House today that hundreds of youth registered with the colleges to study and they still study today. What a highlight!

Our theme during the reaching out programmes was “education is the key to empowerment.” In doing so, they stay away from crime and gangsterism and drugs. Mr Speaker, the Chrysalis Academy have done just as well this year. We have made sure that vulnerable youth and the poor make use of the opportunity to change their lives for the good. The last passing-out parade was on Saturday and to see the tears of joy of so many parents and family members - many have said their daughters went to the programme broken, but returned home a new person. That is exactly what we must do for the disadvantaged and the vulnerable out there. Where we can do more for them we will just have to.
A huge number of them received learnerships and others provided with a job opportunity at various businesses. Many doors opened for those youth - another big highlight. Again this initiative keeps them away from crime and gangsterism.

Another highlight with our policing needs and priority meetings: we held 25 consultative sessions across the province. The main idea was to bring CPFs, neighbourhood watches and the broader community and police closer together. These sessions were a huge success. Our EPWP initiative, through that initiative we managed to place many youth at various state departments and obtain valuable opportunities for them. On-the-job-training is one highlight. This initiative is once again aimed at the vulnerable and the disadvantaged and the poor.

I want to use this opportunity, Mr Speaker, to say to all the community safety staff out there, thank you so, so much for your hard work. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The accolades we received over the last couple of months, show we try our best to do something right for the communities of the Western Cape. Thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Magaxa, over to you.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, the DA led Western Cape Government has characterised this past year with constant marginalisation of the poor black majority. That is fact. [Interjections.] The DA refuses ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: But in other years we did not? Only this year.

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle, order.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: ... to grasp and internalise the fact that apartheid marginalised blacks in general and Africans in particular. [Interjections.]

†Mr R B LENTIT: What about the coloureds?

†Mr K E MAGAXA: This is racism.

†Mr R B LENTIT: No coloured people in your view ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: And the DA does not see anything wrong with it. It does not even have that lesson. [Interjections.]

†Mr R LENTIT: No coloured people are your concern? The coloureds were heard in other provinces [Interjections.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: It is because you do not even know what coloured means.
†Ms L BROWN: So what do you think I am?

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, the DA led ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: There are too many ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: To the DA black people and Africans in particular belong to Transkei and Ciskei [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I may be stupid but [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle, order!

†Mr K E MAGAXA: The Premier refers to our people as refugees from the Eastern Cape.

†An HON MEMBER: Sorry, not in [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Recently, the DA City of Cape Town Ward 46 Councillor, Junaid Hoosain, took the hon Premier Zille’s refugee racism to a more vulgar level.

*An HON MEMBER: Oh Father!

†An HON MEMBER: Nkandla!

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Hoosain had the audacity to tell a black security guard that “darkies do not belong in Robertson but in the Eastern Cape.”

†An HON MEMBER: And the DA did nothing. [Interjections.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: And that is the lesson that they got from their Premier. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Carlisle.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: We need to ask the DA one simple question; in the whole three, four, five years of their term if there was any one MEC who ever went and fetched a memorandum from the protestors, even one? [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is me, me!

†Mr K E MAGAXA: And if they want to do their comparisons they must compare with the National Parliament and how many Ministers went to that gate to fetch their memorandums. [Interjections.]
†An HON MEMBER: Nkandla! There are many [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: That is a reflection of disrespect of our people. Mr Speaker, the ANC’s position on transformation is in stark contrast with DA racism. At our 53rd national conference in Mangaung we resolved that the main content of the ANC’s National Democratic Revolution remains liberation of Africans in particular.

†Mr H P GEYER: You wish!

†Mr K E MAGAXA: And blacks in general from political and socio-economic bondage. This means uplifting the quality of life of all South African especially the poor and the majority whom are Africans and female.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You hide behind [Inaudible.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: At the same time it has the effect of liberating the white community from the false ideology of racist supremacy and insecurity attached to oppressing others. I know we are late in educating you on that other side. You are already damaged. [Interjections.] Hon Helen Zille’s DA only entertains puppet blacks [Interjections.] like MEC Madikizela who represents Matanzimas and Sebes [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order!

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Zille’s approach to blacks is that they must be absolutely loyal and obedient to her; she only recognises an African when he is obedient to her.

†Mr H P GEYER: That is your assumption. [Interjections.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: In Zille’s view blacks are inferior and she thinks she knows best what mechanism can empower black people. [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member Mr Magaxa. It is hon Zille or hon Premier.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you. Thank you, Mr Speaker. Hon Helen Zille. This is why hon Zille has had consistent problems with DA MP Masizole Mnqasela and now with Lindiwe Mazibuko. For hon Zille these Africans who develop some sense of political consciousness after their deployment in Parliament need to be demoted and replaced by the Madikizelas of this day. Hon Helen Zille’s latest African puppet, praise singer is Zakhele Mbhele these days who is employed as the Western Cape Premier’s spokesperson. This puppet abuses his position as a civil servant to promote the DA, defend hon Zille, the DA leader, and attack ANC leaders such as hon mem Ms Brown, hon mem Mr Uys, Marius Fransman and Jeremy Cronin from a party-political standpoint. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Magaxa. Take your seat please.
Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I would like to request that he remain closer to the budget debate which we are busy with at the moment. [Interjections.] He is making personal attacks now [Interjections.] which we are not in a position to defend.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Sit down. That is not a point of order. That is disruption.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms L BROWN: Mr Speaker, the agreement in the programming authority was that it is an open debate. It is an open political debate. The Chief Whip of the House does not remember that.

The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: He does this through his pathetic letters to the newspapers ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Is it a point ...? [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... where he consistently insults the leaders of the ANC. For now he is a nice Seuntjie Tom for the racist DA, but Mbele must be warned that if he begins to raise issues around transformation he will be forced to attend a DA black caucus braai at the residence of Mazibuko. [Interjections.] Affirmative action, employment equity and broad-based black economic empowerment are programmes of the ANC-led government aimed at radically redressing the effects of colonialism of a special type. Instead of building on the ANC’s definite transformation trend when it governed this province the DA has turned back the clock in the province which annually produces numerous coloured and African graduates.

Mr H P GEYER: Tell us about Nathi.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The ANC does not speak in parables when it comes to transformation about supporting targets and not quotas. We are not caught up in the quagmire of the previously advantaged who cannot come to terms with the reality of the majority of the country. The DA’s white South Africans will have to accept affirmative action and redressing policies for the foreseeable future. Unlike the DA, we have not fashioned a policy on the rebound. You either choose to affirm and redress the past and you do not. A middle way 20 years into our democracy simply is not an option.

Mr Speaker, as the ANC we believe that transformation and equity are not restricted to jobs and business transactions and the creation of a black elite. Improvement of people’s living conditions and services rendered to them is central to our ANC transformation agenda as we saw when the ANC governed this province. Unfortunately, MEC Minister Madikizela’s department has marginalised the poor black majority through his refusal to build proper houses and provide decent sanitation.
†Ms L BROWN: Yes.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: This year’s adjustment estimate make no provision for meeting the failed housing delivery target but money shifted from housing development to administration and conferences. That is all that they are doing. [Interjections.]

†Mr H P GEYER: Tell us about ... [Interjections.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: When probed as to why they told us that their priority is not to build houses. Mr Speaker, sadly ... [Interjection.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is national [Inaudible.] ANC policy.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon Minister Madikizela and hon Zille expect 53-year old Nosakho Sigwelo to continue living with her seven children in her shack in Khayelitsha Site C. There are gaps between the corrugated roof sheeting and the wall where sand blows in and there is a hole in the roof which leaks when it rains. Nosakho says that the first thing she does when waking up in the morning is to clean the undignified porta-potty because it leaves the House with a stench. She says it spills and she needs to wipe the spilled faeces with newspapers as the porta-potty is not collected regularly by the City. Nosakho is being treated for TB as a result of these appalling living conditions. The 53-year old mother says she will march to legislature with her porta-potty and sit on it and ask the Premier how she will feel if she has to use that porta-potty. In Barcelona six to eight families are using one toilet.

Mr Speaker, if you visit the clinic in Barcelona you will see a lot of people are TB patients as a result of dirty toilets and porta-potties. In winter it is even worse where the toilets are wet and roads are flooded. This is the living reality. This is the living reality of people such as Matsidiso Mtana who has two 20-litre buckets outside her two-room shack in Europe. She is pregnant and forced to fill these buckets with water because the communal toilet is too far for her. The Premier must come out of her ivory tower and answer the cries of the people and even attend to the protestors and not leave it to the ANC people. [Interjections.]

Poor communities like these are also denied proper healthcare. Instead of allocating funds to improve the situation, MEC Botha’s department plays around with numbers and shifts R350,000 to the department of the Premier and then brings the amount back for a morbidity study. The budget estimate also cut the funding for community healthcare centres and hospital transport. [Interjections.]

The DA must learn that quality healthcare is beyond just big and beautiful buildings. We are not interested in your buildings - beautiful work of the buildings. [Interjections.] All that we want is our people to be helped.

Quality healthcare to the poor of this province means that sufficient staff must be provided at those beautiful buildings.
At the new Mitchells Plain Hospital families who lost loved ones have lodged grievances with the hospital management saying it might be a beautiful hospital, but the service does not live up to the surroundings. [Time expired.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Magaxa your time has expired.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is wonderful news.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: That is what you always do to me.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Madikizela, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much. Mr Speaker, we welcome the adjustment budget by Minister Winde. Before I come to my prepared speech I just want to address a few comments that were made by both hon members Ms Brown and Mr Magaxa. You see, we are used to this ANC rhetoric because they are populist and we all know that. You know you make a lot of examples of the people who are living in Barcelona in Khayelitsha as if the situation of those people started four years ago when this Government took over. You were in power here. Let me remind you, and ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order!

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, no, no. You were in power here prior to 2009 and you did nothing to help those people. [Interjections.] Now secondly ... [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: That is not true.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Secondly, what you need to understand as well is that - because clearly you do not understand the housing code. You do not understand even your own policy. This department is not just about building top structures and you must get that through your head. We have 16 programmes within the housing code and we are required to provide services across those programmes and I think you must learn and understand that. So we do acknowledge the plight of many people who are living in informal settlements, Mr Speaker, and I think I must be upfront on that one. Again I am not sure where the hon member Mr Magaxa lives because he is talking about the fact that not one of us ever attended and accepted a memorandum of the people who are coming from informal settlements. Well, I have done that more than once.

†Mr P UYS: Where?

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Where?

†The SPEAKER: Order!
†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: For example, recently ...

[Interjection.]

†Ms L BROWN: In which region of the country?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, no. Let me respond on that, Mr Speaker. Recently, on 30 September I am the one who accepted a memorandum from the people.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Where? Where?

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: 7 Wale Street.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Where?

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Magaxa order!

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: At number 7 Wale Street. I accepted a memorandum from the people who were [Interjections.] from the people who were demonstrating ...

[Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: You are wrong [Interjection.]

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... from the people who were demonstrating. Now I accepted a memorandum from the people who were demonstrating and I have been communicating with them and there are records of those communications between myself and those people as to what is it that they need to do so that we can have a meeting that we had a couple of days ago. So you see, Mr Speaker, it is not true to say that none of us as MECs has ever accepted a memorandum from the people who are living - but of course, the ANC has found a perfect opportunity to try and win back this province by making this popular statement and pretending to care for the poor. Let me tell you what the ANC has done. The ANC has been dotting the landscape across the country chasing numbers at the expense of quality. Now those houses are falling apart. [Interjections.] Now let me tell you, let me make these examples. [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: We are saying ... [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me make these examples.

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, order. Hon member Mr Magaxa!

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now to illustrate my point, Mr Speaker, for example as I am talking to you now there is a project in Umlazi in eThekwini where the development - where the houses are falling apart.
I just want to give you a perfect picture of what the ANC has been doing over the last 17 years or so. [Interjections.] Now there is another project in Sweetwater in Tjakastad in Port Elizabeth and there is another project in Lekwa, Gavin Mbeki and Victor Khanye Municipalities in Mpumalanga. In the Eastern Cape, for example, a couple of days ago, hundreds of houses - I am coming to that. Hundreds of houses are being demolished near Mthatha, and will have to be rebuilt because of the shoddy workmanship by this ANC government that claim to care for the poor. [Interjections.]

†Hon MEMBERS: Shame! Shame! [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now ... [Interjections.]

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Useless!

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now, according to the report that was presented to the Portfolio Committee, the National Portfolio Committee last year in 2012, this country needs about R60 billion to rebuild, in fact to demolish and rebuild houses that were built by this ANC government that claim to care for the poor. [Interjections.]

Now in the last two financial years in this province I had to spend almost R22 million, R22 million on rectification and the extent of the problem is still to be fully known. [Interjections.] This is the legacy of the ANC in the provision of housing over the last 17 years which brings the three million figure of houses delivered into serious doubt, into serious doubt. If the ANC is boasting about the three million figure that it has built over the last 17 years or so then I am not sure whether you are considering the number of houses that are being demolished as we speak. We are not even sure how many houses the ANC delivered before 2009 and I will tell you why; there was no physical verification of all the houses delivered on the ground so what used to happen is that the ANC used to take the budget spend and divide it with subsidy cost per house and the figure was then reported. [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: That is a joke. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: Prove it, prove it!

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So that is - no it is not a - that is what used to happen.

†Mr M OZINSKY: That is a joke [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order, hon members! Order, hon member Mr Ozinsky. Order.

†An HON MEMBER: Shame!

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Shame!
The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now, as we see from the billboard example - I mean you saw for example the figures that were disputed by a number of people in the billboards that the ANC is busy now advertising for the elections. It is exactly the same thing that you see here. They are boasting about a number that cannot be verified and judging from the figures on those billboards it clearly shows that this ANC cannot be trusted.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: They are dishonest.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, Mr Speaker, it is true that this department has missed its targets. Now, in terms of the Auditor General’s requirement we could not report on the houses that were under construction because again we must differentiate here. The fact that we did not meet our target does not mean that houses were not being built [Interjections.] [Laughter.] It is just that those houses could not be ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, because he does not know what I am talking about. That is why he is laughing.

An HON MEMBER: No, he is fine.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It does not mean that those houses were not being built.

Mr M OZINSKY: The ANC went to all of the houses. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is just that those houses could not be reported as completed, because in terms of the requirement you can only report on houses that are completed, but it does not mean that those houses were not being built. Now so I hope you get that. Therefore it must be noted ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, then it must be noted that all the houses that were promised have been built and were completed and allocated to people whom it were intended for and I think we must make that clear distinction. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now, Mr Speaker, in order to ensure that we do not make the same mistake as the ANC and waste money on poor quality delivery we are now making sure that all the houses built in the Western Cape using Government funds are registered with the National Housing Builders Regulation Council or NHBRC. This year we have enrolled all our 159 projects with NHBRC.
Through NHBRC registration - which was not the case in the past, by the way - through NHBRC registration beneficiaries can be confident that they are receiving quality houses that will not fall down as we have seen in a number of areas. Now in the rush to deliver it was not only building quality that was disregarded by this ANC government but also the rights of beneficiaries to be legal land owners.

Now according to an urban landmark report in 2011 processes were not followed correctly and an estimated 35% of all subsidised houses delivered across South Africa since 1994 have not received title deeds and over one million have been deprived the full rights.

Over one million people, Mr Speaker, have been deprived the full rights of property ownership by this government because of this obsession of building substandard houses and chasing numbers so that they can then say to people “we are delivering.”

In the Western Cape alone a study in 2011 showed that around 36% of subsidy beneficiaries or 86 391 people since 1994 ... [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, your time has expired.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Really?! ... [Laughter.] had not received their title deeds, Mr Speaker. [Time expired.]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Madikizela. Order! Hon member Mr Visser over to you.

*Mr J J VISSER: Thank you Mr Speaker. We have basically come to the end of an era Mr Speaker and considering that this will be the last in between budget for the term I thought it would be good idea to give some oversight in respect of how the department has done in this past period of the terms in terms of how they budgeted and how those budgets were managed and so on.

The average expenditure of the various departments during the period from beginning 2009/2010 financial year up to the end of the 2013/2014 financial year was approximately 45,4% for the mid-year which is in fact a very good expenditure figure for just half the year. The DA government purposely managed the budget in order to carry out their plans. This is indicative of the fact that the DA has always been serious about planning being focused in order to build on human capital and to add value to the governments task of relieving poverty and in light of the fact that the ANC’s reference framework consists solely of Cape Town, let us take a look at what the City of Cape Town has done:

†The City of Cape Town, through their Extended Public Works Programme, created 37 000 new work opportunities and that is from 228 projects.

*They set up WiFi ‘hotspots’ in Mitchells Plein and Khayelitsha where impoverished people have access to the internet.
More people now receive free services as the city has lowered the monthly income threshold to R3,000. A higher number of people have access to sanitation services according to the census 2011. The number of toilets in informal settlements increased by 278% since the DA came into power in 2006. Budget for services to informal settlements increased from R249 million in 2006 to R1 billion in 2013.

Eskom regards Cape Town as the only metro with adequate electrification planning for informal settlements, the only metro. In the 2012/2013 financial year the city spent a record R5.78 billion that is 92.9% of its budget and it is regarded as the best run metro since 2006, eight consecutive years.

Mr M OZINSKY: The ANC was in power.

Mr P UYS: Since 2006.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order.

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, they say that statistics are patient but if this statistic does not speak for itself then I really don’t know what will convince the ANC that there really is something happening in the City of Cape Town. If we look at the transferring of money over the last period, and the hon Minister Winde has already referred to this, there is actually very little money that is really moved every year. This is indicative of the focus and the accuracy of the planning and budgeting. It is no wonder that the Western Cape DA has more than five departments in the top ten departments in South Africa.

These departments all have to submit annual reports in case the Auditor-General does come and have a look to see what is happening. 24 Provincial departments missed the deadlines for the submissions of their annual reports in the past financial year whilst in the Western Cape all 14 departments handed their annual reports in on time.

Mr M OZINSKY: But not last year! [Interjections.]

*Mr J J VISSER: During the past year when the Auditor-General did the audits. So we can also take a look at the other provinces.

According to the reply the worst performing provincial departments were in KwaZulu Natal, 11, and the North-West 13. In the North-West not a single annual report has been tabled from the 13 departments. [Interjections.]

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Scandalous! [Interjections.]

*Mr J J VISSER: In KwaZulu Natal only five were tabled.

*An HON MEMBER: Sjoe! †That is disgusting.

†Mr J J VISSER: And so it goes on.
The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Zuma Specials.

*Mr J J VISSER: This morning when I was driving here to Parliament, Mr Speaker, I drove along the R44. The hon Minister Carlisle and his department recently retarred this road and I was struck by the impression of the excellent service that one receives from our departments here in the Western Cape. It was announced this week that the Western Cape generated seven of the top ten municipalities in the country. That bears witness to the focus of Minister Bredell and his department in order to have achieved this objective.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Visser, your time is expired, thank you.

*Mr J J VISSER: Thank you, just one last sentence. [Interjections.] Ten of the municipalities received an unqualified audit during last years audit. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Visser. We now proceed to the next speaker, hon member Ms Hartnick over to you.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, the DA welcomes the budget appropriations for 2013. We welcome it because we understand the necessity of having an open opportunity society for all, not only a select few. We understand that especially in the socio-economic climate in which South Africa finds itself governments ought to facilitate growth, social cohesion, economic development and create a space in which the people can live lives they value. With this said I commend the Western Cape government for doing more with less, which is not the case for the rest of the country. In other provinces their government is doing less with more. The DA welcomes the approximately R49 million appropriated to the Department of the Premier. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members!

Ms J L HARTNICK: The majority of this allocation will be used to further develop and expand programme 4, the centre for E-innovation, which indeed creates more opportunities for the people of the Western Cape. It is heartening that the Department of the Premier recognises that many poor and marginalised communities suffer from economic exclusion due to geographic and historic isolation, low levels of IT knowledge and skills, the lack of economic development and infrastructure in the areas and the lack of information on job opportunities. It is also reassuring to note that these issues are being redressed through Cape Access as it provides access to IT which includes fully equipped E-community centres at facilities available after hours and on Saturdays.

IC Training is also made available which offers basic ICT skills such as internet browsing, e-mailing and Microsoft Word, Excel and PowerPoint competency. Access to the internet is also offered and is free for 45 minutes per day. Communicating with local and Provincial Government, SARS and banks is made possible through the electronic transacting facilities.
The DA commends the department on their innovative methods in creating and open-opportunity society for all and encourages them to continue enabling optimal service delivery by providing strategic direction and innovative information and communication technologies in the Western Cape. Mr Speaker, as the great Nelson Mandela once said, education is the most powerful weapon which you can use to change the world.

Before I welcome the budget appropriation for the Western Cape Education Department, I sincerely commend Minister Grant for his leadership in redressing and making significant changes to a department which was in shambles pre-2009. The Western Cape Education Department has indeed made great strides in facilitating and providing quality education for the people of the Western Cape. This is why the DA welcomes the approximately R66 million appropriated to the budget of the Department of Education.

We understand that it is mostly needed for service delivery to schools, so as to ensure that education starts from day one in 2014. We understand that the Department of Education and the Western Cape government as a whole feel it pivotal that children receive all their textbooks and learning materials in a timeous manner which enhances quality education. [Interjections.]

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Except in Khayelitsha. [Inaudible.]

†Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, it is clear that Limpopo and the Eastern Cape do not share the same sentiments about the education of their children. [Interjections.]

†Mr M SKWATSHA: [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon mem Mr Skwatsha!

†Ms J L HARTNICK: And I do not think they realise ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha, order.

†Ms J L HARTNICK: That is to the detriment of the child. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: That is the last warning for you.

†Ms J L HARTNICK: And his or her opportunity to live a life they can value. [Interjections.] I commend the Western Cape Education Department for creating and maintaining freedom learners can use. There was not one ANC member present in the Standing Committee on Education meeting to discuss the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill for 2013 [Interjections.] It simply shows how serious they take education in the province and how far they will go to ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Skwatsha.
†Ms J L HARTNICK: ... to score political points. Shameful! Mr Speaker, the ANC shows how serious they are about service delivery to the people of the Western Cape.

†The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order hon mem Mr Skwatsha? Is it a point of order?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, hon Mr Speaker.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, hon Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: What is the point hon member Mr Skwatsha? [Interjections.] Take your seat hon member Mr Skwatsha. If you are not sure about the point of order - what is the point of order? [Interjections.]

†Mr M SKWATSHA: No. The hon Minister of Health is misleading the House.

†The SPEAKER: No-no-no, take your seat. That is not a point of order hon mem Mr Skwatsha. Over to you hon mem Ms Hartnick. Proceed.

†Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, the ANC shows how serious they are about service delivery to the people of the Western Cape through fulfilling their mandate as members of the Provincial Parliament. Absence from meetings is clearly indicative of this. Social Development is one of the most important portfolios for social cohesion in the Western Cape, yet the honourable ANC member for Social Development was not only late for the meeting to discuss the budget adjustments but absent from the venue for most of the meeting.

The DA values your input. We encourage your constructive input to redress issues impeding on social development for the people of the Western Cape in order to facilitate a self-reliant society through ensuring the provision of a comprehensive network of social development services that enables and empowers the poor, the vulnerable and those with special needs. The DA acknowledges that the Western Cape Department of Health undertakes to provide equitable access to quality health services to the people of the Western Cape and beyond. They also proactively have measures in place to decrease the burden of disease and have evidently increased wellness in the province. Can the other provinces say the same? Highly unlikely and again that is to the detriment of the people using public health facilities. This said, the DA welcomes the budget appropriation of R155,000,852 (One hundred fifty-five million eight-hundred-and-fifty-two rand) for health in the Western Cape as it will indeed continue to redress the burden of disease and will enhance service delivery in the public health sector. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Ms Hartnick. I recognise the hon member Mr Ozinsky.
Mr MOZINSKY: Mr Speaker, everyone knows there is a huge difference between what the DA and its leadership say in public and what actually happens. One of the most bizarre examples of this is quoted in the Cape Times today where the Hon Premier defends the appointment by MEC Plato of a close friend in his department and ...

The PREMIER: He has been appointed. What is wrong with [Inaudible.]

Mr MOZINSKY: Like she is doing now. She says what is wrong with the appointment but the very same person was referred to by her party in Court papers as follows: “Her lies and half truths shows she lacks the integrity to which the DA aspires …”

An HON MEMBER: Ag, come-on!

Mr MOZINSKY: Now the hon Premier thinks such a person should work for this hon MEC’s department? [Interjections.] That is the hypocrisy that we are well used to from that hat-wearing Premier over there. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No!

Mr MOZINSKY: And we see it in the annual [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr MOZINSKY: We see it in the annual reports. They talk all the time about jobs for pals. They just spoke about it now.

An HON MEMBER: Ag come on!

Mr MOZINSKY: The hon Minister Fritz told Scopa that the appointment of Mr Richardson as the HOD was a political appointment; that he was not qualified for the post; he messed up the post; he lied to the department and then he was not taken to a disciplinary hearing. He was just shifted to the hon Premier’s department. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And the Premier [Inaudible.]

Mr MOZINSKY: And he is still being paid at taxpayers’ expense today [Interjections.] That is the hypocrisy we are talking about. We see it also with housing delivery after four years of being attacked about statistics, suddenly the MEC now finds new facts about what happened six years ago. Why did he not raise them last year? Why did he not raise them the year before? He knows that what he is saying is not the reality on the ground.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr MOZINSKY: Let’s look at the issue of corruption and by the way let me say one of the hon members said there had been no unauthorised expenditure for years in the administration.
Very funny, because this House a few weeks ago just authorised hundreds and hundreds of million rands of unauthorised expenditure spent under the hon Minister Botha. [Interjections.]

I mean that is the hypocrisy that we are talking about. [Interjections.] Take the stadium, I have asked over and over ... [Interjection.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Carried over from the ANC!

†Mr M OZINSKY: ... in committee meetings to the Premier and her staff about corruption in awarding of the stadium tender and the fact that the stadium was the most expensive stadium built in the country. The answer was it has to do with the geology but we now know that that is not the answer.

The answer was collusive tendering and that is what I want to talk to you about today - collusive tendering in the CTICC which is taking place under the watch of this government and there has been no action taken about it [Interjections.] and this is referred to in the annual reports of last year and this year which went before the House, for instance it is reported by the AG that the accounting officer dispensed with the competitive bid process and that same accounting officer in the press last week and one of the members of the board defended it and said there was nothing wrong with the processes but there was - they dispensed with the competitive bid process and this had to do with the appointment of architects and let me tell you what happened there.

The architect - an award was made to Stauch Vorster Architects and also VDMMMA. Stauch Vorster who was awarded the final contract drew up the bid specifications.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They did not.

†Mr M OZINSKY: They did. They were directly involved in that and your department has admitted that. The convention centre has admitted it but they drew up the bid specifications and then they were appointed to that very tender. Not only that a key member of the consortium Anja van der Merwe from VDMMMA is married to Dirk Elsinger, the former CEO of the Convention Centre who is currently the MD of Convention Industry Consultants, which is currently employed today. His company is still employed by the CTICC as a consulting company by the company that manages the CTICC. Now talk about collusive tendering! One of the directors who is meant to oversee this process, his wife, is involved in the architecture company that gets a bid where there was no tender process followed and/or - sorry - where there was not a proper tender process followed and which also drew up the terms of that bid. Was it because these people are white that there is no talk about corruption?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Oh come on!

†Mr M OZINSKY: Is it because they are part of an old boys' network that that Government has taken no action about ... [Interjections.].
†The SPEAKER: Order! Order Order hon members!

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is not.

†The SPEAKER: Because of all these factors that the hon Minister Carlisle gets up here continually and says there is no corruption in this Government when he knows all these facts that I have put here before the House and he has taken no action about it. No wonder he goes on all the time about saying there is no corruption. [Interjections.] That is the smokescreen he is creating to hide the corruption of the old boys’ network that exists around here [Interjections.].

†The SPEAKER: Order! Minister order! Minister order!

†Mr M OZINSKY: And if you do not believe me ask him why he has appointed his HOD as the chair of the board of the Convention Centre because the HOD - the HOD is [Interjections.] Sorry, the chair of the board is meant to be an independent person.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You are crazy.

†Mr M OZINSKY: But we appoint a state official in order to control and manipulate these processes.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Ag come on! [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: Rather than bringing an independent person [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha order!

†Mr M OZINSKY: To chair the board. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order!

†Mr M OZINSKY: And that has happened in the last few weeks.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky order.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Let me continue with ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, hon minister, after the hon member Mr Ozinsky I just look at my speaker’s list, you are the next one and can you then clear all these questions, can you respond to the question there please. [Interjections.] Over to you. Order.

†Mr M OZINSKY: No, your time is being added. [Interjections.] Let me continue, Mr Jan van den Bosch who is the executive vice-president of Amsterdam RAI, the company that Mr Elsinger works for and he is the managing director of, Mr van den Bosch sat on the evaluation committee for that very tender.
†Mr M OZINSKY: Tell me there was no collusion; there was no corruption! [Interjections.] Mr Boraine and Mr Tofey in the last week have been making statements saying that a strict process was followed. Yes, this is a strict process, the strict process to ensure that only one company could win that tender strictly enforced by the Government against all laws and odds and it is [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha this is the House please. Do not clap hands here.

†Mr M OZINSKY: This is a case of very severe maladministration and members will remember that a few weeks ago you authorised against with the ANC voting against the sale of more land, sorry, the planning permission for some of the land involved in these issues. Yes, now remember that this land has been bought by the City at double the price that it was first valued for in 2007. [Interjections.] It has been bought by the City and when that process was brought to the council, the council was not told that there is a servitude on that land. That was hidden by the officials from the council. It was not in the council documents and as a result the council paid double the value for land that it cannot use for the purpose that it was bought for. [Interjections.]

Also let me say that this Government continues to cover up these things together with the City, for instance there are two audits, forensic audit reports in the City. The City refuses to make available to people who have requested those audit reports. We will be asking for all the agreements and contracts between Naspers, the City, the Province and the CTICC to be made public including the secret agreements.

We will be asking why hon Minister Plato when he was Mayor of Cape Town went on a trip to China which was sponsored by Naspers.

†Mr M OZINSKY: And remember it is the City that is buying this land from Naspers. [Interjections.] We want to know what was discussed on that trip and why that could not be discussed in Cape Town, why they had to go to China to discuss that. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha order.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Further he knows that no disciplinary action has been taken around these steps. [Interjections.] We note also that the board claims that no corruption or collusion by any staff member and individual involved in the tender process or by any of the bidders was found. We have concluded that this is what the board members say: “We have concluded that there are not sufficient grounds to overturn the tender award. In reaching our conclusion we took into account the pertinent legal financial social economic implications, the public interest and the legal advice we received.”
Now this is very interesting because the whole step was illegal but they justify it. [Interjections.] Secondly when it comes to the public interest why were these issues not directly raised by the Government and the Government has not said that it disagrees with it. All that they have done is taken the new head of department [Interjection.].

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky your time has expired.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Of Minister Carlisle and made him the chair of this board. [Time expired.]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you honourable. Thank you hon member Mr Ozinsky. [Interjections.] Order! Order! [Interjection.] Over to you Minister Carlisle.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you. I think if we want to take this debate and look at it ... [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha. That is the last time to request you to really stop this running comment in this House.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: To put this whole debate in context is to just take what the hon member Mr Ozinsky has said. I am just going to take four aspects here. What he has done is present a picture here of massive collusion, corruption ... [Interjection.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: Of course, I agree. [Interjection.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Everything under the sun. Let’s just take four of his alleged facts.

†An HON MEMBER: It is all what he said ... [Interjection.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Just four of these alleged facts. He said my HOD has been appointed the head of the board. That is not true. It is not true. Fact number one is wrong.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Who is going to [Inaudible.] Who is ... [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Now I am not going to say that the hon member Mr Ozinsky lied but I am going to tell you he gave the wrong information to the House.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Misleading the House yes.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Perhaps he did not know it.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Who is going to ... [Inaudible.]
The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You are wrong. He is not my HOD.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky you had your chance. Listen now. Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He is not my HOD. So he says, now he tries to say let me fix this fact that I gave you that is not a fact. It is an untruth, you say.

Mr M OZINSKY: He is an official in the department [Inaudible.]

Mr MOZINSKY: He is an official in the department.

Mr MSKWATSHA: Is the Minister allowed to point at a member?

The SPEAKER: Order! Take your seat hon ... [Interjections.]

Mr MSKWATSHA: I am asking a question.

The SPEAKER: Take your seat. I will [Interjections.]

Mr MSKWATSHA: It is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Take your seat. I have to respond to you to your question. Please address the Chair hon Minister. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you. I will not point at the hon member Mr Skwatsha. He says, he suggests that in fact the land purchased in this whole scheme went at double the value it should have. He does not know; he has not bothered to research that, in fact the Public Protector enquired into this and published her findings to say that the price of that land was perfectly in order. It was market value. So you see here you get these accusations and fact after fact is wrong. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: But you know what [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He says there was no tender process. He says there was no tender process. He said there was no tender process. [Interjections.]

Mr MSKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, on a point of order.
†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I hope I am getting...
[Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: What is the point hon member Mr Skwatsha?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: The Minister is defying you. He is pointing at the man.

†The SPEAKER: I will make that point if there is any ruling.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He says there was no tender process.

†The SPEAKER: Minister, address the Chair please.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He says there was no tender process but then afterwards he talks about the tender award. How could there be a tender award when there was no tender process?

†Mr M OZINSKY: There was not a proper tender process!

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky. I have warned you several times. [Interjections.]

*Mr H P GEYER: Throw him out! [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members order, I have warned you several times and you hon member Mr Skwatsha and that is the last time.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The hon member Mr Ozinsky comes with a whole story and it just falls to pieces when it is opposed to the facts, but one thing I will tell you, there have been - let me call them - irregularities with the tender. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, can you please leave this House?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I am saying to you.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Hon members we cannot allow this. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Ozinsky please. [Interjections.]

Hon member Mr Ozinsky please leave this House. [Interjections.] Leave this House hon member Mr Ozinsky.


†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky [Interjection.]

†Ms L BROWN: Hon Mr Speaker [Interjections.]
†The SPEAKER: Before you address me, hon. [Interjections.] Hon, hon there is a ruling. [Interjections.] leave this House please. Leave this House. [Interjections.] Take your seat. Leave this House hon member Mr Ozinsky.

†An HON MEMBER: No! No!

†The SPEAKER: Hon, hon leader of the opposition, Ms Brown, order! [Interjections.] Order! Leave this House, [Interjections.] Leave the chamber please hon member Mr Ozinsky. Leave this chamber please.

†An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky leave the chamber. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: It is not my speaking turn. The DA spoke and [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Leave the chamber, Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

†Ms L BROWN: Mr Speaker I was speaking and the DA [Inaudible.] and you did not put Minister Carlisle out! [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order hon. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Ozinsky leave the Chamber.

†An HON MEMBER: No!

†Ms L BROWN: He was not told to do that. Just sit ... [Interjections.]

*An HON MEMBER: I think we better phone somebody.

†Ms L BROWN: Or we all go.

†An HON MEMBER: Mr Speaker ... [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Uh-uh, take your seat. Take your seat hon member. There is an order on the table. Please I am not going to allow any member now. There is a ruling. [Interjection.] Hon member Mr Skwatsha take your seat.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Can I address you?

†The SPEAKER: After the ruling - no-no-no-no not now. [Interjection.]

†Ms L BROWN: There is no [Inaudible.].

†The SPEAKER: Take your seat. There is a ruling that I have made. Hon member Mr Ozinsky leave this House. [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: It is actually nonsense. Mr Speaker you do not rule on a DA-issue. [Interjection.]
‡The SPEAKER: Leave the House hon. [Interjections.] Can we ... [Interjections.] Can I, hon members, can I suggest a break of five minutes and please leave the House hon member Mr Ozinsky. [Interjections - shouting in background]

The House adjourned at 12:23

The House resumed at 12:40

‡An HON MEMBER: Mr Speaker!

‡The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. You may be seated. Hon members, there is a ruling that the hon member Mr Ozinsky, you must leave the chamber. [Interjections.] No, not now.

‡Ms L BROWN: We cannot address you?

‡The SPEAKER: No not now. [Interjections.]

‡Ms L BROWN: This is outside of the procedure, please [Interjection]

‡The SPEAKER: There is a process to be followed if you are not ... [Interjection.]

‡Ms L BROWN: Mr Speaker, remember ...[Interjection.]

‡The SPEAKER: If you are not happy about the Speaker ruling there is a process that you need to follow and I think you are supposed to know that - the process. [Interjections.]

‡Ms L BROWN: We are so [Inaudible.] over five years of your rulings. What is it?

‡An HON MEMBER: No I am just saying.

‡The SPEAKER: Please leave the Chamber. Where is the Sergeant of Arms, can you please assist me?

‡Mr M SKWATSHA: On what now?

‡Mr P UYS: On what now?

‡An HON MEMBER: What? What?

‡An HON MEMBER: Give him the mace.

‡Ms L BROWN: Bring the mace. You should carry him out with the mace. [Interjections.]

‡An HON MEMBER: Are you coming to lunch? [Interjections.]
Ms L BROWN: What? Are you paying for the lunch?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon members. Hon Minister Carlisle you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Can I just ask Mr Speaker how long I have? I have kind of lost track a little bit. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: How long do you have? You still have six minutes.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, thank you, and I was dealing with the hon member Mr Ozinsky’s allegations with regard to the CTICC and the fact is that the CTICC has been subject in what - what we are seeking to do with the CTICC is to double its size.

The CTICC is the biggest single generator of new jobs or has been since it was established. It has been a huge success and this year had its most successful year ever. It is run by a professional and passionate and enthusiastic staff starting with Mr Tofey and going down from there. It is one of the gems of Cape Town. We need to care for it. We need to look after it and in regard to this suggested problem of the appointment of architects there has been a forensic audit into that and the key point of the forensic audit Mr Speaker, is that there is no suggestion of corruption, of favouritism or anything of that nature. There is nothing to be ashamed of in there.

It is so that there are certain irregularities, but those are not dishonest irregularities and they certainly do not constitute grounds for trying to cancel the procedure which I am not sure we can do. I think only a court can do that and I am sure that my colleague will also want to add a few things on that.

Yes, it is a pity that the ANC is no longer here, because I have actually grown weary of the debate that we have here. The simple facts of the matter are this, that every member of basically the front bench of the ANC knows that except for a period of about six months towards the end of the ANC’s tenure that the ANC rule here in the province for the five years previous to that was atrocious, it was disgraceful. It was dishonest. It was corrupt and most of all it was damaging to the poor because it was the money of the poor that was stolen. It was the money of the poor that was stolen and the grounds for saying that with confidence aside from the fact that I was in opposition here and I saw much of what happened, was it was this very front bench that rose up against that evil in the ANC and stood up and that is the point, so how now can they not look at this administration which I have to say in this my first and only term in power, I have to say is something I am very proud to being part of and associated with. Everything is there to say that it has been a huge success.

Now that is not to say Mr Speaker that it does not have a long, long way to go, of course it does.
In being a huge success that does not say that there are many people who are poor and far too many are unemployed and far too many who do not have the kind of housing that they ought to have; that the public transport system is still very, very far from perfect and that various other things particularly policing, which is to some extent out of our control, as it were, leaves a great deal to be desired but putting that aside, if we just take four areas which is education, health, mobility and the economy, if we just take those four areas and we just see the difference that is being made, the hon members of the ANC and particularly my colleague over the way here who has an interesting kind of relationship that seems to say there are only black people in South Africa, there is nobody else, and all of those black people are poor including the ones who drive Ferraris and live in Constantia, but he will have to admit that five years ago in many of the schools in Khayelitsha up to 25% of the staff were not present on a Friday or a Monday. He would have to admit that. He would have to admit that many of the children in Grade 7 and 8 could not read, were not numerate. He would have to admit that in fact the ANC’s Government, the ANC’s relationship was with Cosatu and Cosatu’s relationship was with the teaching staff and in that whole process the children, the school children of this problem had been excluded.

They would have to admit those things and they would have to admit there has been an overwhelming change. They would have to admit that there was a huge under-delivery of infrastructure under the ANC and how could there not be when R500 million was unaccounted for each year, Sir, so that we have trebled the infrastructural spend per year that existed under the ANC and we will almost double that again by the end of the MTF. So the whole argument of the poor and the poorest of the poor ... well for close to 20 years Mitchells Plain has been my constituency and portions of Mitchells Plain, into Khayelitsha and into Samora Machel on the other side, and I want to tell you that in the last perhaps seven odd years at the council level, in the last four, five years at a provincial level, I have seen a huge, huge change in what has happened in the investment into Khayelitsha and into Mitchells Plain, but more than that what is the thinking and the working behind that. I have watched in a portion of Mitchells Plain, I have watched a project that is in fact ...

†The SPEAKER: Order!

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Renovated over 3 000 flat units, Sir, and that has been a remarkable achievement so it is an administration I am very proud to belong to.

†The SPEAKER: Order!

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And I would hope for the ANC it would be something for them to follow.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister Carlisle. I recognise the hon Minister Winde.

†An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!
The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker this is loads of notes that I have got for replying to this debate. It is a pity that I do not have the ANC across the board to reply to but I sincerely hope that they are listening so that they can hear what we have to say. But I rise to and first of all thank all of those who have taken part in this debate and everybody who has been on the speakers list, despite the ANC walking out who have had their chance to have their say, and I will endeavour to go through everybody’s speeches and just come back with any of the questions that they have answered to, and perhaps make one or two other statements as this is a political debate. But also as I said earlier it brings it together at the end on the adjustments that need to be made within this Province.

First of all to the Hon member Mr Von Brandis. You know he mentioned the MPATs, he mentioned unauthorised expenditure nationally of R22,6 billion. He mentioned the economy but I think aside from that I want to just thank him very much for the role that he plays as the chair of this committee.

Not only this but also in the role that he plays within the budget process, but then of course also the committees, and we have to deal with a couple of votes and in this instance votes 3, 10, 12 in the adjustment process; but thank you very much for the way in which you chair the committee; the oversight role that you play and of course the role that you play in the legislature and in leading the process around the committees.

The hon leader of the opposition Ms Brown in her absence started off by talking about the Free State, and of course so then I must come in and answer on that and this Free State that she talks about. Quite interesting that this Free State under the leadership of their Premier who has the nickname of “Telephone Premier” and who is being investigated by the National Treasury at the moment because of supply chain management, and maybe just to say to this House that he has allegedly moved the whole supply chain office in that province into the Premier’s office. [Interjections.]

Now I mean if that is true, well then you do not need to go any further, but perhaps one other statistic on that province is the noting that the unemployment rate is sitting at 41,2% [Interjections.]. But other than that she spent quite a lot of time talking about - and I must notice that across this debate - the money that has been held in treasury for the special projects. I will just now get to answering some of the others on the kind of percentage that that money makes up. But it is a very small amount of money in the overall budget of this province, first of all, and second of all you hear a lot of comments through this debate talking about this money, and why this money is put aside and then what it is doing for the poor.

Well quite frankly, first of all I think as far as putting money aside for special projects I think this is a really good way of managing money well because I promise you without proper plans for this money, if it is transferred into a department, when we get to adjustments time if they do not have their plans together what do they have to do?
They have to then bring an adjustment to that special project money and spend it on something else and at least when this money is ring-fenced for those specific special projects, they are for those projects and they will only get given that money if those projects are going to be delivered on; and then what difference are those projects going to make to the people of this province, and whether it is money that is set aside in this process that is going to ICT within the broadband framework for systems within Government, that is to make us more efficient. That is to make us able to deliver better but also at the same time have a look at where that money goes.

Broadband - what is broadband there to do? It is an initiative of this province to specifically move to an inclusive economy because broadband is being rolled out by the kilometre across our country but it ties up the main centres of economy, so the CBD to the Sandton region. There is fibre running across our country but there is no fibre and no broadband connectivity to Mitchells Plain, to Khayelitsha, to the people of Saldanha where we are going to be rolling out the IDZ. [Interjections.]

This is about inclusive economies and this is how broadband is going to be making a difference to the people of this province so there is part of one of these projects. Skills - and we look at where money goes to skills, exactly the same thing. It is where people do not have the skills to get into the economy. It is about opportunities and about broadening those opportunities and an inclusive economy.

The green economy - let’s spend a bit of time on the green economy, also where this kind of money is going and let’s have a look at how the green economy is going to make an impact and a difference to the lives of the people that live in Atlantis, a place that has been forgotten, a place with high unemployment rate, a place with high dependency on substances and alcohol. The green economy is going to bring hope; it is going to bring opportunity to the people of Atlantis, the people of this province and the people of this country. And then the last point within that space of the budget is the RCEP projects. Following on the huge success of the VPUU and what that project has done, nearly a billion rand are now being spent in the middle of Khayelitsha over time, making a huge difference to poor people giving them an opportunity, creating an inclusive economy and allowing people within the space that they live to live a life that they value. This is now being replicated through this project and we have only put seed money in place where it is going to be going into planning, into five other areas across this province.

Another one within the City, but you are going to look at other municipalities now being able to replicate this massive success and this success that makes a difference to ordinary people’s lives in this province, giving them those kind of opportunities. So quite frankly that is where this money is going and so I notice the comment that is being made, but I can assure you that this money is ring-fenced for a specific purpose and we will make sure along with the good people in Treasury that it goes to that specific purpose, and that is why it is being done that way.
The hon member Mr Wiley, thank you very much for your contribution, specifically focusing on the policing which is in your portfolio, and again you know whether it is linked to the previous comments under the hon Leader of the Opposition, Ms Brown, where is our money being spent. Here is another R8 million that is being spent on a commission of enquiry that is coming from a need from the people in Khayelitsha who are saying: “Guys there is a problem here,” who are without safety and security. Money is being put aside and hopefully at the end of this process - and if you think about the money that is being spent and the crime rate and the kind of pressure that communities are put under, it is actually not a lot of money - we are going to be able to find and track a path forward that is going to change the lives of the people in specifically Khayelitsha and the surrounds; but we can learn from those lessons and replicate that across the province. It is going to be really money well spent making a difference to the people of this province.

To the hon Minister Fritz, can I first of all start by saying, you know, I have written here: “The champion of youth at risk.” Minister, you and your programmes that you’ve put in place really do make a difference and I have said in this House before and I will say it again, what really jumped at me the last time that I visited the Chrysalis project was how big employers in this province are actually making young people who come through that project their first choice of someone to enter into a job opportunity. A massive company based in this province says to us: “We prefer young people who were young people at risk, we prefer those young people coming in and we actually make that our choice of a first person we want to employ if they have come through that programme.” Now if that is not a success I do not know what is. That really is creating opportunity for young people in our province and so well done on that.

I have got a whole lot of other points that are raised here, but I think they get covered further on. I think - yes, I will deliver those. Maybe one other point, you actually said and you mentioned to the other side of the House that you invited them to come to the Chrysalis project specifically and nobody pitched up to that project and I think that happens more and more often. I remember when I went to the opening of the Mitchells Plain Hospital it was not even just the space; there were actually members’ names on the chairs because you had RSVP’d that you were going to come and the Opposition unfortunately were very conspicuous by their absence, because the names of the members on this side of the House were actually on those empty seats. You know, we talk about oversight, that really is the first point of call, but the second point is that you do not have to be invited to any of these spaces within this Government. These members can go at any time to Chrysalis as the hon member Ms Hani was speaking at that time, but they can go at any time and have a look at any project at any space that this Government is responsible for and at any time can they go and exercise their role in oversight. But I promise you, go and have a look and see whether they have been, you will find it will be a round zero - no visits whatsoever.

I move on then to the hon member Mr Haskin. Thank you very much for your contribution.
You again also spoke about those special projects and I think I have under the hon leader of the opposition Ms Brown’s space spoken on it. You also mentioned Eskom and perhaps this is where I must say a few things. In those special projects and under the green economy you would have seen some money moving to Dedat, R4 million moving to the Economic Development Department. Some of that money is being spent on a job that an official within that department – an outstanding official called Professor Jim Petrie – is working on. We actually enticed him back from Australia to come and work for us - a specialist when it comes to energy and specifically looking at this province. The documentation and the study that he’s done into the gas space in our province is amazing. That study and that document I have handed personally from Minister Pravin Gordhan to Minister Gigaba and to all of the Ministers involved at a national level; I have personally taken it to each and every one of them, because in that document we really start to talk about the shift that we need away from nuclear, and it is interesting to see the announcement that nuclear is being shifted out, and I think that is really good news. We need to shift away from expensive nuclear to cost-effective gas. Gas coming into our economy in this province, we are already ready with two gas turbines, one in Mossel Bay and one in Atlantis, we can convert them very, very quickly, from at the moment nearly R9,00 a kilowatt hour running on diesel to around about 90 cents to a rand a kilowatt hour running on gas. It is a no-brainer. We need to make this move and that is the kind of money in those special projects in the green economy. That is the kind of money that is being appropriated for this kind of work that is really going to help us and we are working quite closely with Eskom in that space. But as I say, in this province we are pushing very hard on gas renewables and the green economy but then what are we up against on the other side of the equation - and then of course now we do not have the ANC to listen to this part – are the delays in Medupi, the extra costs in Medupi, an increase of cost by R14 billion so far.

†An HON MEMBER: Unbelievable!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: With that R14 billion we could have already established those gas plants in this province …

†An HON MEMBER: Unbelievable!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... Supplying much cheaper electricity into our systems and this is where we have just contrasted the one against the other.

You also spoke about the commission of enquiry, the costs, and again as I said earlier, obviously every rand that gets spent in this province we have to be concerned about. We have to make sure that we get value for every single rand that we spend but as I said I do agree that R8 million is R8 million. We need to make sure we get value out of it for those specific people who suffer every single day in this province due to crime that is really tough.
I look at the R8 million going to this enquiry, and I think there is an allegation that we are investigating at the moment, on the R3 million that Oudtshoorn Municipality have paid to their single legal advisor thus far in all these cases that they have lost in court around trying to hold onto power illegally. R3 million to one lawyer, so I am pretty certain that Scopa is going to have to deal with that very soon and we will make sure that once we have answers through our investigations at Treasury that we will hand that over.

Then the hon member Mr Geyer, thank you for your contribution speaking primarily about the legislature, some of the money that has been spent here, but perhaps this is where - and another member also spoke about it - oversight happens. This is where the job of democracy needs to really come down to letting the people of this province understand that democracy happens here. It was raised I think by the hon member Mr Visser, if you think about the processes that we have just gone through, the annual report processes, and you have a look at a reply given in National Parliament, the worst performing provincial departments were in KwaZulu Natal, eleven departments have not given their annual reports to the legislature. KwaZulu Natal, where the majority of Ministers that are National Cabinet come from that province.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And Nkandla. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I mean, where is the pride in your own province that you come from to make sure that your province is working well, and then so it goes on to 13 in the North-West and even in the Free State reports are not handed in, where according to the hon Leader of the Opposition, Ms Brown, amazing things are happening.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Please be considerate, you are dealing with Nkandla.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Of course I have not spoken about Nkandla. The next thing is what the hon member Ms Beerwinkel spoke about, the R 250 million in the transversal projects and she again asked the question why. I think I have answered that - good governance, but again the focus on this space is about spending money efficiently in this overall budget of adjustment, in the overall budget in all, and we are looking at less than half a percent is being spent, where I promise you Treasury is really exercising their oversight and making sure it goes to the right space. We need to also be looking a little bit wider and so that is probably my words to her. She also spoke about no-fee schools, 216 no-fee schools at the moment receiving money. This is savings which is not from CAPEX and so again let us have a look at how the money is being spent and where it is being spent. Is it being spent in the interest of the six million people that live in this province, and again I say yes.

She then went on to talk about marks and gave this department, this Treasury a “D”. Well, quite frankly I do not agree with the “D” but if that is her benchmark well, then so be it.
I would just ask her the question - now she is not here to answer - these other areas that I have just spoken about, by providing oversight in those provinces, looking at expenditure in those other provinces, if we compare apples with apples and if a “D” was given to Treasury in this province, what would that mean to Limpopo or Mpumalanga if she applied her same rules? I just ask that question. [Interjections.]

Again she spoke about the economy. She spoke about skills, red tape enabling environment - those are all exactly the things that we are doing and perhaps I must just then at this stage use this opportunity to once again thank British Airways for the confidence that they have shown in this economy.

†An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: British Airways announced yesterday that they are bringing three extra flights into this region. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Unbelievable!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Three extra flights, but they are not bringing it in, in the middle of our summer season, they are starting in May next year, the start of our winter season. Why are they doing that? They are doing that because of the economy. They can see what is happening in oil and gas. They can see what is happening in our Convention Centre and I will get to that just now - the doubling of our Convention Centre, the 40 conventions already booked until 2019.

†The PREMIER: And on SAA.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They can see what is happening there. They can see the economy in this region is moving forward and businesses only make decisions based on economic hard facts. They make decisions based on what is happening and what they can see, and they have made this decision in the winter time and so really I do thank them. I heard a little interjection now about SAA. I still do not understand it, but ... [Interjection.]

†The PREMIER: I do.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: SAA moved out of this market. It was very good in a summer market. Virgin moved in, put in extra thousands, 7 000 extra seats into that market. BA steps in as well and takes over, so that if you make a political decision that is a crazy political decision, I promise you we in this province will take that gap. We will create the opportunity that allows the private sector to come in and pull into that space.

Then the hon member Mr Walters, thank you very much for your contribution, focussing again on agriculture. You made mention of the devolution of the responsibility in Fishing and Forestry and this has been spoken about a lot.
It makes so much sense that coastal provinces actually have control of the economy within their coastal provinces. Why should a national province or even Free State, as was mentioned by the honourable Leader of the Opposition Ms Brown, have anything to do with fisheries and quota systems and harbours, etcetera, and I echo what you have said, but it was quite interesting. You heard from hon member Mr Ozinsky in an interjection “no ways, it will never happen.” He says, his words were: “Not a chance.” So I wanted to ask the hon member Mr Ozinsky or get a statement to say whether he is obviously very, very happy with the Minister Tina Joemat-Petterson who is controlling this at the moment, and everything from harbours to patrol vessels to quotas are a total disaster and effecting ... [Interjections.]

†The PREMIER: [Inaudible.] she has got that [Inaudible.].

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: For the people of this province, again it is about broadening opportunity and in this space on that side of the House it is about closing those kinds of opportunities.

†An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] the fishing quotas.
†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: If we go to the hon Minister Plato, thank you very much. You again also spoke about Chrysalis which I have spoken about. Perhaps I must also take this opportunity to thank you very much. The Minister and I went along and were involved with the South African Police in a process of destroying thousands of litres of confiscated illegal alcohol from the illegal alcohol trade. It was actually quite amazing to see the volume of alcohol that is confiscated and you see this volume being poured down the drain. But it is the perfect opportunity to give that message again to those trading illegally in liquor, and specially moving into this season, just as we are talking about how we take opportunities away from people, we have got to not abuse alcohol because that does exactly the same thing. It takes opportunities away from people in this province; it is a major focus and on which we will continue to focus. Thank you very much, and also for your point of thanking all the security people in this province at whichever space that they play. As we move into our Festive Season this is the time when we also need to be doubly vigilant so that we can start making differences and better and more differences in the people of this province’s lives.

To the Hon member Mr Magaxa I wanted to say, he started off by saying the DA is a racist party and then 99% of his speech was racist.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: 99% of all speeches!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But perhaps I will not go any further than that, except at the end of his speech he did start to move over into a couple of spaces around budget and delivery and he started to speak a little bit about hospitals. Perhaps at this point I may mention the Mitchells Plain Hospital, unbelievable space offering, offering services to 450 000 people in this province, offering a service right in the middle of a space where people did not have the opportunity that they have got now.
This follows on Khayelitsha Hospital and a number of other health facility upgrades and new upgrades in our province. Perhaps this is where we must contrast it again. Under this administration we have got, as I said, a number of replenished, revamped and new hospital spaces in this province which are world-class. Let us have a look at the hospital that is promised - I must just see where it is. There is a hospital promised/commissioned, two world class hospitals that we have delivered, Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain as opposed to a hospital to open - which was scheduled to open in 2008 in Soweto, the Jabulani Hospital. It was scheduled to open in 2008. Still today it is not open.

†The PREMIER: No.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, but they are busy with it.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They are still busy with it.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Do not be unreasonable.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It has still not opened.

†An HON MEMBER: 2008?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: In 2008 it was scheduled for opening.

†The PREMIER: No!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker I move on to the hon Minister Madikizela and the comment that he made around R60 billion to be spent on rebuilding houses that we have already built in this country, and if I think about that I think about vandalism. I think about how much money has to be re-spent over and over again in this country. I think about that last march into the City and how the private sector traders were having their livelihood ripped to pieces. We really have to think about how we deliver, first of all quality on budget on time the first time, because to spend it again is sacrilege and then of course we need to look after what we have and we need to make sure we do that. He mentioned again this case of can we trust the information that is put out there. Can we trust the details that are put out there and that reminded me again, and the Minister also spoke about those billboards, about specifically sanitation service delivery. There is a discrepancy which is being put on a broadband by a political party and what our census says on sanitation delivery, there is a shortfall of 11,7 million receiving those services and so we say it, but in actual fact the poorer people sitting outside there in our communities are actually hearing that they get the services but they do not have the services, so we need to make sure we give the correct information.
Then Mr Speaker I move on to the hon member Mr Visser, I think I have
mentioned already, and he mentioned a whole lot of stats, specifically the 278%
increase in toilets in informal settlements in the City of Cape Town since 2006. I
think infrastructure spend is sitting at 92,9% of capital. These are all really good
things. The A/G reports, he spoke about ten, I think he said ten in Local
Government. We still need to clarify whether it is either 10 or 11, but those 10 or
11 are clean Local Government. There are another 16 unqualified Local
Government audit reports in this province that really show that in the work that
both Treasury and the Department of Local Government under Minister Bredell
in the C-grow and M-grow processes do, you can see the difference. In the
work that this province is doing you can see the difference and you can see the
difference in independent reporting, so thank you very much for that.

I then Mr Speaker move on to the hon member Ms Hartnick and I think what
she said, “the ANC does less with more” really, really stood out. I think that was
what really sort of said, let us have a look at how we deliver on both sides. That
made me think of the Handbook and this Government saving in excess of
R100 million from when we first came into Government and saying: “There is
our handbook, that is how we are going to hire cars differently; that is how we
are going to stay in hotels differently; that is how we are going to fly differently;
that is how we are going to behave differently as the leadership within
Government, as the executive within Government”, and already saved more
than a R100 million in this province.

And then you have a look at what the AG says about wasted money at
R30,8 billion across this country, and you try and have a look from one to the
other, doing more or wasting more. Of course then that is not talking about how
much more the ANC does manage to spend specifically at certain national key
points.

I then move on to the hon member Mr Ozinsky. I am not going to say too much
more about it except he stood up and started off by saying something about
“this province”, because it was said that we do not have much in unauthorised
expenditure across this province, and he said - his words were: “Hundreds and
hundreds of millions of rands every single year in this province in unauthorised
expenditure.”

Well, last year’s unauthorised expenditure was not hundreds and hundreds of
millions of rands as the hon member Mr Ozinsky said. It was 0,436% of the
budget in Health it was R53,74 million. We debated it in this House. Not one
cent of it was wasted. Unauthorised expenditure is when you budget in the
beginning of the year. You have pressures during the year and you need to
spend and you have to rectify it later, and if there was a rand misspent then
obviously that would be fruitless and wasteful, but not hundreds and hundreds
of millions of rands. So the question begs then when he stands up to make
these kind of statements, just as when you put on a broadband, this is what the
percentage service delivery is and the census proves you wrong, or when you
stand up and say hundreds and hundreds of millions of rands and in actual fact
that is untrue. Then you start talking, I think the hon Minister Carlisle, he went
on and on and on about the CTICC.
The hon Minister Carlisle has spoken much about it, I will not repeat those, but the CTICC has had a full investigation by the Public Protector. That investigation came out and it said on the land issue there is not a problem around market value. In actual fact if you looked at the values of the markets, if you wanted to, it was a million here or a million there on a R100 million and a R104 million and R120 million which are the different parcels of land in the private sector that were being sold and being measured against this piece of state land purchased, so the Public Protector found nothing there.

What the Public Protector did say was: “Please go back and have a look at the process”, and that is what the hon Minister Carlisle spoke about. Then it went back to the City and they spent a long time going into very serious depth on the process. That report was then handed to the board. The board then have to deal with that report, then it is the City’s process and they have to take responsibility for that. That is how boards run. That is what they have to do. They have taken responsibility. They have had two separate legal opinions and they have then made decisions on each of those points as raised from that process coming out of the City of Cape Town. They have then made decisions based on sound legal advice and made decisions on each of those aspects, and they have all have consequences so there will be processes that follow through, whether it be a disciplinary process; whether it be a decision-making process and then they have to answer to that process. But as the hon Minister Carlisle says: “No corruption, not from the public protector’s office, not from the City’s oversight space, no corruption.

Go and have a look at one or two of these processes”, but at the end of the day we have also to judge this space on what they are delivering, and I have just spoken about the BEA decision. It is based on what comes out of the CTICC. They have just finished a clean audit. They have just finished putting up their annual report and their AGM and if you have a look at those results it is one of the top performing convention centres in the world right through a recession process, and the board has to take full responsibility of all of those processes.

Then lastly the hon Minister Carlisle, thank you very much for the part that you have played. The CTICC I think you have addressed. You made a comment about your first and only term in Government and that you were very proud of your department, and I can say as well from the role that we play at Treasury having a look at the interaction with the Auditor General and thinking about what you have done with that department and that team that you have built up and where you have taken it, what you had inherited to where it is sitting today, that is unbelievable and you can feel very proud, not only of your department but of yourself as well.

†Mr H P GEYER: Hear-hear!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And with that, looking at the spending, you have taken the department with not increasing the size of it, and trebled your expenditure in infrastructure spend.
This is exactly where we need to be going for delivering and creating opportunity for society, for the public out there, for delivering on infrastructure so that the economy can become an inclusive economy and change lives of all of the people that live in this province, and that is what the focus of this Government is. That is what the focus of this budget is. This budget, whether it is the overall budget or the adjustments budget, is there to actually make a difference to all the people’s lives in this province to give them opportunity and to create an inclusive economy that moves us to that vision “One Cape 2014”. That is where we want to be, and this budget is aligning that process of where we are going to and that space that we want to become the best run Regional Government. We will only be able to stand up and say we are anywhere near that when we get to what those One Cape 240 streams are saying to us. That is where we want to go to, and it is this budget, this adjustments budget and this team that has taken us and set us on that path. They have taken the vision, created the space where we are now moving into action and that action is happening and the results are there from that action, and we have mentioned it through this debate. From whatever measurement you can take across this country, those measurements are showing that this foundation has been created solidly, the budget is there and it is moving in that right space that will create this province that every one of us has bought into through that vision. And with that Mr Speaker, can I end off by saying again thank you very much to Treasury for the role that they have played in this adjustments process and overall. We will obviously get back early next year to the budget again but in the adjustment making sure that we run the finances of this province perfectly.

I say that it is not always - you cannot always be perfect, but I tell you what, this team really works day and night to make sure that the money runs alongside the policy platforms and the vision and the work that this Government has got to do to make that difference for every single person in this province, and with that Mr Speaker, I thank you.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hear-hear!

†The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister Winde. That concludes the debate on the consideration of the principle of the bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the principle of the bill?

†An HON MEMBER: No.

†The SPEAKER: No, agreed to. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the secretary must still read the bill, thank you.


†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before we carry on can I just make a comment about the debate we have just had on the principle of the bill.
The practice has developed over the last couple of years that this debate on the principle or the second is regarded as fully fledged and wide ranging political debate on the same basis as the main appropriate bill.

Technically - I am stressing - technically, the scope in this debate should be limited to the reasons for the increases or decreases or the reasons for the adjustments. Perhaps this is something that the next Parliament can consider again to rectify. We are going far too wide in the Adjustments Appropriation Bill. Thanks.

The secretary will read the second order.


†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The parties will now be given an opportunity. Those who wish to make use of it to make declarations of vote on the individual votes as we progress. As I say it is not obligatory but parties can indicate to me whether they wish to make a declaration.

I put vote 1, Department of the Premier, the DA.

†Ms J L HARTNICK: I support the Bill.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: DA supports. The ACDP?

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker may I make a declaration that covers all of the votes?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may if you wish, you may do so.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Then I do not have to jump up and down four times.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, that is fine.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker the process of scrutinising the adjustment appropriations, as we know it is very rushed. It is at the end of the year. There is very little time allowed in the process. Most of our Standing Committees only had an hour to discuss these adjustments, which is understandable so it is not something that the ACDP wants to complain about, but what it does do is it inhibits our ability to get into the detail of the adjustment appropriations. Some of the committees discussed and made important decisions in a very short space of time, five, ten minutes and the meeting was over, and one wonders how much value there was in that process of discussing the adjustment appropriations of a particular department in five or ten minutes. Here now in the debate that was just held, four minutes for us to raise our concerns and to express our support in various aspects of adjustment appropriations is not enough and even in this declaration we will not be able to make all of our - to raise all of our issues in a way that would explain our support or not support for the adjustment appropriations.
So notwithstanding that the ACDP are not going to withhold our support for the adjustment appropriations, we are also not going to be in a position to express our undivided support for all the appropriations, so we are reserving our support, but we are not voting against the appropriations. Thank you Mr Speaker.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any other parties, ID or COPE? The ID?

†Mr R B LENTIT: The ID supports.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, COPE.

†Ms J A VAN ZYL: COPE supports.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I then put vote 1, Department of the Premier, no objections?

†An HON MEMBER: No.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. I put vote number 2, Provincial Parliament is there support? You need not get up to say support, I am asking for people to do the declarations of vote, material declarations of vote. If there is nothing, then I will put the question. No objection? Agreed to.

†An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. I put vote number 3, Provincial Treasury, any declarations?

†An HON MEMBER: No.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection. Agreed to.

I put vote number 4, Community Safety, any declarations of vote? In that case, no objections, agreed to.

I put vote number 5, Education? No declarations of vote? No objections? Agreed to.

I put vote number 6, Health. No objections? Agreed to.

I put vote number 7, Social Development. No objections? Agreed to.

I put vote number 8, Human Settlements. No objections? Agreed to.

I put vote number 9, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. No objections? Agreed to.

I put vote number 10, Transport and Public Works. No objections? Agreed to.
I put vote number 11, Agriculture. No objections? Agreed to.

I put vote number 12, Economic Development and Tourism. No objections? Agreed to.

I put vote number 13, Cultural Affairs and Sport. No objections? Agreed to.

I put vote number 14, Local Government. Is there a declaration of vote? Hon member Mr Visser.

*Mr J J VISser: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. Please grant me the opportunity to thank the Standing Committee who worked with us this year. My Standing Committee has approved this amendment so we accept it. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I then just put the vote. No objection? Agreed to. That is vote number 14.

That completes the decisions of the votes. I now put the schedule. Are there any objections to the schedule being agreed to? No objection. Agreed to.

I put clauses 1 to 3 of the Bill. No objections? Agreed to.

I put the title. No objections? Agreed to.

The Secretary will read the third order of the day.


†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is no speaker’s list. I put the question - no objection to the finalisation of the Bill? No objection? Agreed to. The Bill will be sent to the Premier for assent. The Secretary will read the fourth order of the day.


†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Minister of Finance.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy Speaker I rise to perhaps just mention a few points and in support and ask that this House supports this piece of legislation. You know we in the previous debate spoke about good governance and how we spend our money and we have set up an organisation called the Economic Development Partnership.
From the province’s point of view the EDP is a mechanism to give practical effect to the slogan “better together”, in other words the EDP provides a platform through which the whole of society approach can be organised to address issues of inclusive and resilient growth and to better connect and align markets, plans and institutions, and Mr Deputy Speaker the EDP is based on the notion that Government on its own cannot address all socio-economic challenges in our society, especially the persistent issues of poverty, inequality and unemployment and so this Economic Development Partnership has been set up and what we are doing now is we actually have a number of organisations that we fund like special purpose vehicles etcetera, but in this space we are saying let us pass a piece of legislation that actually puts it into a legislative space so when we spend money on this organisation it officially and properly gives us that representation within that organisation. Perhaps just for this House just to highlight some of the activities that this organisation has undertaken over the last while. It is I think most prominently the fair process, following the unrest in our agricultural space and it is a very, very key important part of our economy and the role that they have played.

The One Cape Data is a project where we have to bring both private sector and public sector data together and we are already running internally our dashboards on it and we will launch that early next year so that businesses and private sector individuals and governments have got one space where they can pull data to make educated decisions. Looking at building the regional innovation system, we know we are innovative. How do we pull that together so that we can actually go to the market in a far stronger way, a far more competitive way in the innovation space, telling the common regional business story? We know we are pretty good at certain things but how do we bring it together under the economy and tell that business story, so that we have far more investments like those ones that I was talking about?

Earlier looking at partnership exchanges, we have developed partnership exchanges within the country and internationally and looking at a few research projects to name one, the Zero Hunger Economic Inclusion and Food Economy in the Western Cape and then interaction specifically with the National Planning Commission, and I think that really has brought it all together in a good way. So if I can then with that say to this House I do trust that we are going to pass this piece of legislation. It really just formalises the relationship and the process of where we spend money in this space. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Haskin.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker the ACDP rises in support of this Bill. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Von Brandis.

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Standing Committee of Finance and Economic Development considered the Western Cape Membership of the Western Cape Economic Development Partnership Bill and referred it to this House in terms of Standing Rule 71 and we supported the Bill without amendments on the 15th of November. Thank you.
†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon. Minister Winde reply?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. I am not going to spend too much time on it other than to say thank you very much to the Committee for dealing with this piece of legislation and to all the political parties for their support in this piece of legislation. It is good news for us, good news for the economy and I think it actually shows this legislature support for the work and the process that they are busy doing there. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the debate on this Order. Are there any objections to the finalisation of the Bill? No objections? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill.

Western Cape Membership of the Western Cape Economic Development Partnership Bill [B 8 - 2013] (Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism).

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Bill will now be sent to the Premier for assent. Before we conclude I have two rulings which I wanted to give in the presence of certain members but seeing that we are busy with our last sitting here I am going to proceed giving the rulings in any case for guidance at least when we start the year fresh that we know where we are standing, and if there is a need for a withdrawal of something that will be done at the next sitting.

RULINGS

During debate on 21 November hon member Mr Ncedana used the words or used words to the effect that “certain people hated black people.” These words in the translated form were “the way you hate a black person.”

A point of order was then raised by the hon member Ms Rossouw that the remark was levelled at members across the floor of the House and should therefore be ruled unparliamentarily. That remark being levelled at a member of the House, it certainly would be unparliamentarily.

The Deputy Speaker then enquired from the hon member Mr Ncedana whether his remark was indeed aimed at members of the House. He denied that it was and said it referred to the Democratic Alliance in general and as an honourable member his word was accepted and he was not required to withdraw it. That is the standard practice and we have always applied it that way and we will continue to do so but members also have a duty not to abuse the privilege of freedom of speech in this House by making statements which they themselves suspect could be unparliamentarily just to score political points.

If one reads the Hansard the deduction could very well be that his reference was indeed levelled at members across the floor and not to the political party in general as he later explained. However as indicated above I have accepted his word as an hon member that he did not refer to specific members of the House and that closes this particular matter.

Hon member Ms Rossouw also enquired whether the word “hate” as used by the Hon member Mr Ncedana was parliamentary.
Although it is a very strong word to describe relations between racial groups, its use in that context should be discouraged since it adds nothing to the good order and decorum of the House, it cannot be ruled unparliamentarily in its general use. As indicated if used in relation to members of the House it would be unparliamentarily. That disposes of the first one.

The second one relates also to an incident on the same day on 21 November. The hon member Mr Wiley made a statement to the House and he said inter alia: “Robert McBride is a convicted terrorist.”

The honourable leader of the opposition Ms Brown later interjected: “The real terrorists are sitting on the other side of the House”, which could be a reference to members of this House. The Chair was then requested to rule on the remark. I indicated at the time I would do so after considering the full Hansard. I have now had the opportunity to do so. At the time I allowed the honourable leader of the opposition Ms Brown to address the chair and she made the point that people such as Mr McBride fought in “an honourable war from our side” as part of the “liberation movement”. She also said: “Maybe where the hon member Mr Wiley has found himself in the SADF and so forth that was an honourable war.”

The hon member Mr Wiley then pointed out that Mr McBride was found guilty in a court of law. The gist of the argument of the honourable leader of the opposition Ms Brown seems to be that a person who fought in “an honourable war” in either a liberation movement or the SADF pre-1994 may not necessarily be regarded a terrorist today.

That is a different point of argument and my ruling is not about that. The word “terrorist” has a very specific meaning. The South African Concise Oxford Dictionary defines it as “a person who uses violence and intimidation in the pursuit of political aims.”

This is not the kind of behaviour that can be associated with members of the House who are all honourable members. What is at stake here is therefore not the word “terrorist” in isolation but its use to describe members as such. Therefore describing fellow members as terrorists is certainly not parliamentary. The honourable leader of the opposition Ms Brown will be asked at the next sitting to explain what she meant by that and if necessary she will be requested to withdraw the word if it refers to members.

Thank you. That disposes of that.

†Mr J J VISser: Sorry Mr Deputy Speaker can I address you on this?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not on my ruling; on the rulings or in general?

†Mr J J VISser: On one of the rulings.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not allowing it, if you want to say something quickly but in general, but on the ruling specifically. Are you done? Hon Minister Carlisle.
The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Well I just did not feel it was appropriate to discuss this with some of the members not here, seeing it affected both sides.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay fine.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly, exactly!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can we then proceed? Order! As is our tradition I will now afford representatives of parties an opportunity to address the House on the occasion of the end of the year and the end of the session. Will COPE, is COPE taking the opportunity? Thank you.

Ms J A VAN ZYL: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. On behalf of COPE I would like to wish every department, every state official who worked hard this year to make a success of this year and to serve the community, a Blessed Christmas and a Happy New Year and then also to the DA, I am not here today to polish their shoes but there is not a government in the world that does not make mistakes. Thank you for all that you have done this year. There is truly a remarkable difference and I think the ANC is still suffering from shock from the Western Cape that has undergone such a turnaround and is obviously light years ahead of the rest of the country. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ID.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker I wish all members of this House well over the Festive Season. We must keep in mind that during this happy period there are always tragedies on our roads. It does not matter what awareness and preventative measures the Western Cape Government put in place and I hope that our Government’s effort in this period will keep all road users safe, also alcohol related violence, domestic violence and gang related violence causes unnecessary backlogs at our already overburdened emergency unit at all our health facilities. Let us keep our emergency staff in our prayers over this Festive Season as it is them that have to be on duty 24/7 a day to deal with the causes of dangerous human behaviour while we enjoy family time and rest. Enjoy your family. God bless!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you the ID. The ACDP.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. The ACDP wants to wish all members of this Government and of the Legislature and all staff a peaceful Christmas and holiday season and a successful 2014. I want to thank everybody for the hard work that it has taken to get this legislature to be a very productive one in 2013. 2014 is going to be a challenging year politically, economically, socially for families, civil society organisations and individuals and also there is an election and I want to use this opportunity to appeal to all political parties for a mature and sustainable electioneering.
It is not socially or politically sustainable to sew racial division in the time of an election to destabilise communities or the economy or any sector of the economy, to threaten violence or to use coercion as a tool to garner political support, because these actions further undermine what little racial and social unity there is in the Western Cape. It negatively affects our economy thus inhibiting our development trajectory and it further damages the already negative view that the public has of political parties, politicians and the general political processes that we want all South Africans in the Western Cape to become part of. So we are appealing to all political parties to engage in sustainable and mature electioneering in 2014. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. *The DA. Hon Minister Botha.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker thank you very much for the opportunity to bring this message. I want to take the opportunity to thank all members of the House, even in their absence for their involvement in the past year and for what they have contributed. It is also important to recognise those behind the scenes and those are the officials, the secretaries, the media people, the researchers and specifically also parliamentary staff so I want to say thank you on behalf of this House for them.

A special thanks to the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker and their staff for your contributions during the past year. We cannot go without recognising and saying or conveyance of our gratitude to the committee Chairpersons and committee members. You have done again a wonderful task in your committees and I want to thank you on behalf of the House for that.

I need to acknowledge the functioning and successes of the Cabinet. I thank every member of Cabinet for your hard work through the year. It has been again a very pleasant experience. Thank you to our departments and the administration as a whole. You have ensured that we are outperforming all other provinces in South Africa.

We specifically in this time want to think of the nurses, the paramedics, the police, the traffic staff and all those who will be working while most of us will be resting, and who will keep our people safe and protect them and help them when they need help.

I believe I speak on behalf of all when I thank the Premier Ms Helen Zille for her leadership through the past year. Premier, Hon Premier, your vision, leadership and guidance had a positive effect not only on your colleagues but on the broad population of our province. Through economic development, through agriculture, through arts, culture and sport, through social development, through education, through health, through every aspect of our Government it has a positive effect on our population. Thank you very much. Your name will be engraved in the history of our country not only for your activism to liberate South Africa from apartheid to a democracy but also for liberating South Africa from a bad Government to a clean Government.
This is also a time which I think we should use to think and reflect and to do self-evaluation and the big question I think as a politician to ask ourselves is in this era and this past year what have we contributed to make South Africa a better place through the means that were available for us to do so. I think that by doing that that should determine your objectives for the new year and I want to invite every member of this House even in the absence of our Opposition to really do that self-reflection to be able to determine your contribution that you want to make in the year ahead.

Lastly may you all have a blessed and a peaceful recess and Festive Season. Enjoy the time with your family and your loved ones and return safely for the last stretch in 2014. Be moderate and responsible in your celebrations. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Botha. Before we adjourn may I just remind honourable members, those who are here but also those who perhaps may not be here, that the Speaker is hosting a lunch immediately after the adjournment in the dining room. We all are most welcome there.

*An HON MEMBER: Lovely!

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 13:45

---------------

WEDNESDAY, 4 DECEMBER 2013

COMMITTEE REPORT

The Speaker:


The Budget Committee reports that it has concluded its deliberations on the principle of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2013], referred to it in terms of Standing Rule 187.

Having considered the various Standing Committee Reports on the Votes in the Schedule to the Bill, the Committee reports that it supports the Bill.
TUESDAY, 10 DECEMBER 2013

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. Provincial Notice


2. Referral of Bills to committees in terms of Rule 220

   (a) Standing Committee on Community Development:


   (b) Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development:

      Legal Metrology Bill [B 34B–2013] (NCOP) (proposed section 76 Bill).

   (c) Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth:

The House met at 14:00

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p. 8462

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

Tribute to the former President of the Republic of South Africa
Mr Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela.

†The SPEAKER: Please hon members remain standing for the national anthem rendered by the Groote Schuur Hospital choir.

[National anthem rendered by the Groote Schuur Hospital Choir]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. You may be seated. Hon members and guests, this special sitting has been convened to pay tribute to the former President of the Republic of South Africa Mr Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela.

Before affording political parties the opportunity to pay their tributes I have to announce that I have received an apology from the Honourable Premier of the Western Cape who can unfortunately not participate - can you please switch your phones off hon members - not participate in the proceedings here today. This is due to a delay beyond her control and the Premier is also in Johannesburg. Thank you very much hon members.

Let me afford the political parties opportunity to pay their tributes. I will start with the African National Congress, ANC.

†Ms L BROWN: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Today the ANC expresses its deepest condolences to Mama Graҫa Machel, former wife Mama Winnie Mandela, Madiba’s children, his grandchildren, his great-grandchildren and the entire Mandela family. God bless a great man who passed away, Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela, touching and inspiring all of us as he walked his long road.

We have been called to pay homage to one who both encompasses and transcends all positions and statuses, spaces and places commonly regarded as meaningful - Tata Madiba, the first father and President of a democratic South Africa. He was the first and last commanding chief of the glorious people’s army, Umkhonto we Sizwe, a personification of humble greatness; a champion of the most vulnerable and an immovable standard against injustice. No wonder the world mourns his loss.

Celebrating his life we have been held in awe of his ability to unite our nation and our nation to the world in the manner that no other leader has ever done.
Who else would bring together the American President and the Cuban President like we have seen yesterday when Barack Obama and Raúl Castro paid tribute to him on the very same stage and even publicly shook hands? Who would even think that British dignitaries would sit with Zimbabwe’s Robert Mugabe at the same event? On the planes, the squares, stadiums, places of worship and even work areas people are renewed in their hope and their trust of a better South Africa. This is the greatness of Nelson Mandela. He brings together all people. No-one can ignore him or be left untouched.

Cruelly and unfairly kept away from us in prison and in isolation, Madiba, the humble President, walked this earth and we his people carried him by his own admission when he could not do so himself and while he served us. He cleansed his soul and exercised his captaincy over his own soul and taught us how to forgive, bring healing and effect repair in a South Africa divided and carrying the harsh and deep scars of apartheid. Ever polite and ethical, he never claimed sole credit for successes. He always acknowledged that he was a member of the ANC. He was a leader of the ANC and he also said he was going to start a branch of the ANC when he gets to heaven but he always acknowledged others, always acknowledged that he could not do this on his own. It was within his organisation and within his beloved South Africa and on our continent Africa and in the world.

In his own words he says: “It is better to lead from behind and to put others in front, especially when you celebrate victory when nice things occur. You take the frontline when there is danger, when people will appreciate your leadership.”

Injustice and unfairness both deemed unacceptable and worthy of resistance can according to Kulu be found even in the manner in which we interact and treat each other because “your freedom and mind cannot be separated.” Madiba, inspiring us with his message of goodness, of reconciliation, transformation, forgiveness and a commitment to a society defined by equality, transformation, human rights and consensual dialogue, has exemplified these ideals and has left us with an identifiable legacy as our beacon and we should continue to carry his legacy and his dreams into the future as we keep his memory alive and follow in the footsteps of his example.

The only way to preserve and advance the Madiba legacy is to fight for the poor and oppressed. He fought against all forms of oppression, of slavery. He battled apartheid and he suffered imprisonment for the poor and the oppressed. He was the champion who was prepared to personally offer his life to act on behalf of the poor.

There are thousands of prospective young Madiba lions and lionesses ready and rearing to walk in his footsteps, continuing that journey he took thus far. Let us remind them that Madiba said like slavery and apartheid poverty is not natural. It is manmade and it can be overcome and eradicated by the actions of human beings so we charge all our young Madibas to take up the spear of their colossus to free our people from the bondage of the yoke of poverty. But let us also remember, use these words preceded with another bit of wisdom, that overcoming poverty is not a gesture of charity; it is an act of justice. It is the protection of a fundamental human right, the right to dignity and a decent life.
While poverty persists there is no freedom and let us then repeat another famous line used at the start of his term when he said “let freedom ring”, bearing in mind that sometimes it falls on a generation to be great and we can be that generation. Let our greatness blossom.

Former President Nelson Mandela is indeed a massive tree that fell but he has not fallen in vain. He gave shade to multitudes. He has inspired all of us. He pollinated countless people with ideas and self-confidence. He has given fruit to many and soon more of this baobab tree’s seeds will grow into a forest of many strong trees that can fill that space and continue his work.

We nowadays hear all sorts of ways of people interpreting what Madiba stood for, how he inspired them and how they apply his lesson. I believe there is just one way to interpret Madiba. It is to read the policies of the ANC: inclusive, transformative, equal with humility, truth and ability to stand up tall.

Madiba’s job is not done yet as the struggle for equality continues. Yes, we have to work for our children, as he instructed us and as he did in example of his own life, as they still suffer hunger and disease with very little prospects of a better life. Yes, even here in our own province too many children still suffer malnutrition, abuse, lack of possibility into the world. There are still those that suffer imprisonment and persecution or slavery of the mind. Madiba indeed tells us to fight for justice and peace. This message resounds at memorials across the world.

American President Obama is right when he told us yesterday that “there are those that resist even modest reforms that challenge chronic poverty and growing inequality”, because Madiba also said “that reconciliation means working together to correct the legacy of past injustice.”

To selectively use the famous Madiba quote like selective usage of the notion of reconciliation is to just suit a narrow agenda and that is very dangerous. Tata indeed said he fought against domination and cherished the ideal of a democratic and free South Africa. These opportunities do not come unqualified. Madiba had specific views on redress. It is not a clean slate and free for all which benefits and perpetuates the past privileges in our present and future as a country. We have a duty to break down the divisions and level the playing fields first and not just rhetorically or superficially. He led by example and his vision lives on as we continue to live up and pledge to the constitution of the Republic of South Africa where it says that “we, the people of South Africa recognise the injustices of our past. Honour those who suffered for justice and freedom in our land; respect those who have worked to build and develop our country and believe that South Africa belongs to all who live in it; united in our diversity.”

We therefore through our freely elected representatives adopt this Constitution as the supreme law of the Republic so as to heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights; lay the foundations for a democratic and open society, improve the quality of life of all citizens and free the potential of each person and build a united and democratic South Africa able to take its rightful place as a sovereign state in the family of nations.
May God protect our people. God bless South Africa. This is Madiba’s legacy and it encourages us to restore dignity and bring true freedom after centuries of oppression and exclusion foisted upon our people through various forms of discrimination.

*Goodbye Father Madiba. However, stay well.

†In all that we are and are yet to be. I thank you. [Applause]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you honourable member Ms Brown. I now recognise the Congress of the People.

†Ms T N BEVU: Enkosi, Mr Speaker.

*We are here gathered today to cry with the Mandela family over their loss.

†Far worse things would probably have been following us had we not been led by the conciliatory personality of Mandela from 1992. Foremost amongst his political achievements was the role he played in steering South Africa from the brink of chaos to democracy. He guided us into peaceful democracy even when others would have preferred inter-tribal war. He foiled the agenda of the white ultra-nationalists who did everything in their power to stalk us into drawing blood.

As the first President of the new South Africa Tata Mandela formed a government of national unity with those who killed and oppressed us before. He compelled us to come and sit, including in the legislature, next to those we regarded as our enemies before. Even those who had done everything in their power to sow the seeds of apartheid, Government sponsored inter-tribal wars in our streets, like in Katlehong in Kwamashu in Crossroads, Umlazi, *other areas. They became part of drafting our new Constitution including a strong bill of rights that guarantees freedom for all and somehow continued to protect and extend their ill-gained privilege. To crown all of this he gave the go-ahead for Bishop Tutu to establish the Truth and Reconciliation Commission with the hope of speeding up the cathartic process for both victim and perpetrator. These things weighed heavily on us and at times were painful and difficult to swallow.

Mandela was a human. He was very aware of his shortcomings. I see no point in censoring his political background for narrow political purposes acting as if he was not the quintessential product of the ANC; we need not even brush over his failures especially as a husband and a father. A lot was achieved by the ANC through and with him since it came to government but yes, a whole lot more could have been done with the resources at hand.

Mandela like black warriors of afore showed us how to fight wars of our own liberation. When the radical emancipatory politics of our future faced its greatest challenge we looked up to Mandela’s spirit to show us how to push things into the realisation of real freedom for our people. This surely must be underpinned by economic freedom for all in our life as the clarion call was issued in the 1950’s through the Freedom Charter by the Congress of the People that was there at that time. [Interjections.]
Not Congress of the People as an organisation, and the ANC would understand and other people who understand where it came from, where the Freedom Charter came from, would understand what I am saying.

We looked to Mandela to show us how to make the next step without succumbing to the catastrophe of the totalitarian temptations. Mandela will be missed because he knew what was important in the life of the poor he represented. If we want to stand on Mandela’s shoulders we have to brave the new storm by fighting first, fighting the corrupting enemy within that prompts us into greed of profit, careless brutality of corruption. We have to look closely at those who call themselves friends of the poor to see the motives behind. We too will have to stand in the eye of the storm and never be afraid to utter truth no matter how this inconveniences us and in all that hope Mandela’s spirit of courage will carry us through once more.

May God give rest to Madiba’s soul and perpetual light shine upon him until our Lord Jesus Christ comes again. I thank you. [Applause]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Bevu. I recognise the ID.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, Mr Deputy Speaker, hon member Ms Brown, leader of the official opposition, hon members, guests, we are here this afternoon for the special parliamentary sitting to pay tribute and to celebrate the legacy of President Nelson Mandela. It is an honour to be participating in a historical occasion in this House alongside veteran freedom fighters, which are the hon Lynne Brown, the hon Madikizela and hon Bevu.

To the family of Tata Mandela, we feel how you feel and you are in our prayers. Thank you for sharing him with us.

Mr Speaker, the world has descended on the soil of our beloved country. They are here to show solidarity with us, the children of Tata Madiba. They are also here to draw strength from the positive energy that is hanging over the skies of our beautiful country. Today we pay our respect to this giant who lived a life worthy of being replicated by all. Tata Mandela was a champion of the poor and a hero to the citizens of this country. He was a hero and a beacon of hope to the poor across the African continent. He was also a hero to the poor, the rich and the famous across the globe. He was a hero and inspiration to some of the most powerful leaders of the world and Tata Mandela was my hero.

During his time as President of our country he made the Constitution of South Africa a living document to better the lives of the poor, of the people he led. Today my family and I are humbled and proud to be beneficiaries of his sacrifices and leadership.

The sad thing is not enough people, whether within the borders of South Africa or elsewhere in the world can sing the praises of their leaders. The first time I heard the name Nelson Mandela was in 1976. I was a learner at Parkdene Primary School in Scotsdene, Kraaifontein. One day during the first break interval, a Caspir full of policemen was outside the gates of our school.
A policeman screamed from a loud hailer: "Julle Mandela kindertjies moet soet wees en nie moeilikheid maak soos die ander nie." I did not know what this man was talking about. I did not know yet who Nelson Mandela was, but during my high school years I knew exactly what that policeman on the back of that Caspir was talking about.

In 1985, a year when student uprisings swept the Western Cape once more, our teachers conspired with us. They secretly advised us on resistant tactics and on ideas of awareness programmes. Mr Speaker, I was part of the Elsies River generation that stood steadfast behind the liberation vision of a man we knew by name only. Like many South Africans we fought while Mandela was in jail. We fought for the ideals of a man whom we never had seen before. At the time we did not even know what he looked like. The first time I saw an image of Nelson Mandela was a stencil print of his face. It was painted in black on nearly every hall in Ward Road, Elsies River. Between Elsies River High and the old Monaco Bioscope in Elsies River. The architects of this powerful stencil image of Tata Mandela were the Elsies River Youth Student Movement. That same image was later used all over South Africa.

I had a favourite spot where I used to go. It was like a pilgrimage. I would go to the brick wall of St Nicholas Anglican Church in Hall Road to touch the image of Madiba’s face. It was later painted over by the security forces but when they removed one image another image would appear elsewhere. They could not remove the ideals of Madiba. They could not remove the striving for freedom from our hearts.

I have memories of an energetic young woman, Francis Lambert, who was shot by police in her upper leg while sitting on the same brick wall at St Nicholas Anglican Church. A mass meeting of learners was going to be held that day. Francis was in the front line of the protest that time. Police violence, school boycotts and the smell of teargas defined our high school years. I was one of the lucky ones who were not arrested in the early hours of the morning for public violence. I was one of the lucky ones who was not branded with the word “terrorist”, a term used to criminalise a liberation fighter in their own country.

Since Friday last week the electronic and print media has reminded us of the humanitarian work of President Mandela. President Mandela gave new and real meaning to the vision of social cohesion. President Mandela knew how to break down racial barriers and how to unify our nation. President Mandela’s motivation behind the Truth and Reconciliation Commission was not to take us back to the past driven by desires for retribution. No, it was a foundation for building a bridge across the divides and to reconcile our nation. It was his practical way of demonstrating the future.

In 1995 while our other commanders in chief gave instructions from the offices to soldiers in battlefields, our commander in chief Tata Mandela was on the battlefield wearing his Number 6 Springbok jersey when our Springboks needed it most. It was the Mandela magic, the Madiba magic that gave strength to our boys and they won the Rugby World Cup Tournament. That was a defining moment in the history of our country.
His outreach and engagements with the leaders of other political parties were inspired by real reconciliation. He helped these leaders to understand the power behind the single word: "reconciliation". They identified with him. They wanted to be associated with him. As president of this country he was a perfect example of a leader with a moral compass and to honour him our moral obligations must manifest beyond the walls of this institution. As government and public servants we must keep on with the social cohesion, with the vision of a rainbow nation. We are his rainbow nation. We were valuable to Tata Mandela. I am optimistic that Madiba’s moral compass will guide our younger generation to help them steer through troubled times. This is the generation that is crucial to help us bend the tree of our young democracy so that it grows in the right direction once more.

By reminiscing on the legacy of Tata Mandela it reminds us not to take our freedom for granted. We must use this freedom to better the lives of those who must still taste the fruit of our hard-fought democracy.

Madiba we are proud to have had you as our moral compass. Long live the legacy of Madiba. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Lentit. The ACDP over to you.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. It is an honour to pay tribute this afternoon to our first democratically elected President Nelson Mandela on behalf of the ACDP. In doing so I join millions in South Africa and countless more around the world in recognising the dignified and pivotal role he played in transformation towards democracy and his unceasing fight for equality and dignity for all that cost him his freedom, his family and almost life itself.

The news of his passing was a sad moment for all of us. Few of us will ever forget where we were and what we were doing when we first heard the news and we will continue to mourn for some time to come. As the ACDP we have opened our hearts and we extend our prayers and condolences to his family knowing that our Father in heaven is there to comfort them at this time. Even while we grieve his passing as a people we also agree that there is much to recognise, celebrate and strive for about the impact of his leadership on where we were as a nation, where we have come from and our future.

For the ACDP one of the most important legacies he has left us and indeed the world was his ability and willingness to forgive his oppressors and rather to serve them and all the people of our nation with the dignity and poise that belied a lifetime of pain, trauma and sacrifice. Out of his greatness of spirit he demonstrated true selflessness by not insisting on personal justice, personal restitution and revenge even when repeatedly reminded of the injustices metered out on him and the majority of our people for so long and that lingered visibly around them.

He demonstrated that it is possible and this inspired the nation. He understood that his attitude and approach in the years after his release was pivotal for the future of our nation.
He also understood that forgiveness, grace and reconciliation need to be lived out daily, consistently in all situations and to all people, rather than expressed once or randomly and then forgotten or ignored. These could not have been applied at a more important yet volatile time in our history when not only race relations but the economic political and social future of our nation stood to either be destroyed or developed. Instead of the country sliding into chaos, violence and economic volatility at least his words and actions inspired the majority and from those early days of our democracy we all felt the same deep sense of gratitude that defied fear, that tangible excitement and anticipation that welled up in seeing that so much is possible.

After achieving political freedom for our nation not just for his own life, he lived his freedom years in service to his people striving through word and deed to make the freedom he now lived a reality for all of our people all of the time. In so doing he clearly demonstrated how freedom and responsibility go hand in hand and are prerequisites for a caring stable and prosperous nation.

He took responsibility for his and the nation’s growth and development using our nation’s love for sport, music and dance to authentically bridge racial divides knowing that the goodwill and authority given him by the people of South Africa and indeed the world was helping shape the path South Africa would follow in the future. Through this authenticity and by being a credible and accessible leader he was able to secure the trust, commitment and enduring admiration. He did not leave it as a gracious personal touch. He entrenched these in our Constitution and many laws to guide not only our social compact but our economic policies and even our foreign relations. He was a visionary leader. He foresaw the outcomes of either course he took and he consciously continually chose the right course, the best course, the Biblical course of selflessness, the ultimate measure of character and leadership.

This course saw forgiveness, grace, reconciliation and national building triumph over revenge, widespread violence and bloodshed, knowing that not doing so would inevitably cause economic turmoil followed by further widespread social upheaval for a nation already traumatised by its past and unsure of its future. His choice reflected his hopes for the nation and not his fears of the past. Yes, this was a political act borne from a spiritual principle. It compelled us to follow a sustainable political path of growth and development as one nation and it continues to inspire us to unite and strive together even within our diversity.

The principles he lived by demonstrated visibly following his release and that he challenged the entire nation to follow, are found in the term *ubuntu* derived I believe from the very principles Jesus Christ himself lived by and cause us to emulate. He surely is one of the most memorable, timely and important political contributors confirming the reality and relevance of Biblical principles being applied in all of life both politically and socially, applied even amidst great adversity for the benefit of all and as an example for other leaders and the communities to follow. If the apartheid regime and its sustained brutality against him could not crush his spirit and commitment to us as a nation then surely the challenges and adversities we currently face should not even dent ours and our commitment to future generations.
It is the ACDP’s hope for our nation that Mr Mandela’s example will, like Pope Francis has said: “inspire generations of South Africans to put justice and the common good at the forefront of their political aspirations, socio-economic responses and nation-building efforts.”

This is a political, social and economic call to action by all for the sake of all that the ACDP applauds. Protecting his legacy, entrenching it among the generations and ensuring its impacts on the most vulnerable, the marginalised and the downtrodden amongst us must become a way of life. The greatest tribute to Mr Mandela would be that our entire nation resolves to pursue the universal Biblical ideals he lived by to the same unwavering courageous extent in each of our ways for the sake of our one family, South Africa, and for the glory of God Almighty.

The ACDP does not accept the limitations others are seeking to place on us as a nation that we might achieve. Let us take what is described as most honourable and rare about the father of our nation and develop many more just like him in the future generations. More so than Martin Luther, but to echo the words of Luther Vandross: “President Mandela dreamed the impossible dream. He chose to run where the brave dared not to go, to right unrightable wrongs.”

In fact he demonstrated that it is not only possible but also that it is imperative since freedom is indivisible. If some people are not free then no-one is free. In his own words Mr Mandela said that “reconciliation requires that we join hands to eradicate the poverty spawned by a system that thrived in the deprivation of the majority.” Reconciliation requires that we end malnutrition, homelessness and ignorance and that we put shoulders to the wheel to end crime and corruption. The majority have done it before and must continue doing so. The ACDP agrees with Chief Rabbi, Dr Goldstein, who said that Madiba was the legacy who rose above personal pain to build this country and millions of South Africans were able to set aside indescribable pain to choose to forgive and to build this rainbow nation together. Millions have fought champion causes and millions reconciled, showed kindness and refused to be divided. He inspired it, he led it, but let us not forget all our nation’s heroes. Finer and truer than the purest diamonds. This is not a legacy to be protected and pursued only by a few. We must insist that we all live by it and that we give more of ourselves.

We must hold our leaders accountable to this standard and nothing less and we should expect them to hold world leaders accountable to the standard too. Only by doing so do we acknowledge President Mandela’s sacrifice and leadership legacy. Only by expecting the best from each other do we acknowledge the great blessings and mercy of God Almighty on this country.

I conclude with the words of the ACDP’s president Dr Kenneth Meshoe: “The ACDP hails Tata Madiba on a life well lived. May God comfort Tata Madiba’s family and loved ones, all South Africans and the global family as we remember Tata Madiba fondly and each honour him in our own special way.” As Tata Madiba himself said: “It always seems impossible until it is done.”

I salute the memory of Madiba and all that was good and will continue to be inspired by the dream of a shared future for all South Africans.
Hamba Kahle Tata Madiba. Thank you Mr Speaker. [Applause]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Haskin. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker, the leader of the opposition Ms Brown and members of the House.

Mr Speaker, we have all been deeply saddened by the passing of the former President Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela and would like to send our heartfelt condolences to Mama Graça Machel, Winnie Madikizela Mandela, his children, his grandchildren, his great-grandchildren.

The people of South Africa are fortunate to have had his wisdom and exemplary humanity to help us navigate the rocky road from a divided past to reconciliation and a shared nation. It is one that we are still working and on which we still have some way to go, but this example to inspire us we can fulfil our potential to be a genuine rainbow nation as envisioned at the birth of our democracy in 1994.

Madiba was the custodian of that vision in the formative years of our democracy and we remain grateful as a nation that he cemented that custodianship through sovereign leadership which put this Constitution and the interest of our country as a whole first. He showed above all else that the Constitution is a sacred covenant that is designed to protect the people from power abuse and to enable us all to enjoy the freedom and dignity we deserve. He was the embodiment of the pillars that underpin our Constitution and the spirit that infuses it. He personally led the way in advancing reconciliation and urged us to embrace this diversity that makes us a unique and resilient people. He knew that the only way our country would succeed was through being inclusive and magnanimous, an attitude that we must all learn to cultivate towards each other.

The Western Cape is proud to claim Nelson Mandela as one of its sons. It was on Robben Island that he spent most of his 27 years in prison paying the price for our freedom we enjoy today. He spent the last year of incarceration in Pollsmoor and Victor Verster, now Drakenstein Prison. It was from Cape Town City Hall that he delivered his first public speech as a free man to thousands who gathered on the Grand Parade.

While the apartheid authorities tried to break the spirits of Robben Island prisoners to reduce them to despair and hopelessness Madiba and his fellow freedom fighters were inspired by one of Cape’s iconic natural wonders to resist those attempts. In his words and I quote: “During the many years of incarceration on Robben Island we often looked across Table Bay at the magnificent silhouette of Table Mountain. To us on Robben Island, Table Mountain was a beacon of hope. It represented the mainland to which we would one day return.”

This is one of the several statements by Madiba that have been quoted in the past week and will continue to be echoed for decades if not centuries to come.
There are many other lesser known words of wisdom from him that we must always remember and keep learning from. One of his statements that showed absolute commitment to democracy was one he made on 2 May 1994 when he announced the ANC’s victory in that historic election.

Madiba said: “I hold out a hand of friendship to the leaders of all parties and their members and ask all of them to join us in working together to tackle the problems we face as a nation. An ANC Government will serve all the people of South Africa, not just ANC members. Let us build the future together and toast a better life for all South Africans. Thus I just want to say that in some areas we may not have done so as well as we have hoped, but this is how democracy functions. There should be no tensions in any region in which we have not emerged as majority party. Let us stretch out our hands to those who have beaten us and to say to them we are all South Africans. We have had a good fight but now this is the time to heal all wounds and build a new South Africa. People have voted for the party of their choice and respect that. This is democracy.”

With this sentiment Madiba prevailed against the wishes of ANC radicals to ensure that his party would admit and accept democratic defeat in the Western Cape and KwaZulu Natal. He understood that democratic choice lay at the core of our liberation.

One of the ways in which democratic choice is expanded and enabled the three sphere system of government, that is the genius of our Constitution; it is a system that provides checks and balances to prevent centralised abuse and bring government closer to people. Crucially it provides multiple sites of power where different political parties can win elections, implement their policies; ensure how they perform as parties of government. Voters can then compare between and check reports of different parties when it comes to governance and service delivery as well as the results of different policy approaches.

It is crucial that all South Africans recognise the critical function provinces play in offering an alternative choice to voters in that their powers can be implemented to the advantage of development and local empowerment.

Provinces also have an important opportunity to implement some of the recommendations made by the National Planning Commission through pilot projects and programmes. The NPC has identified the key challenges facing our country and has proposed a number of solutions to overcome them. The provinces are in an ideal position to use their budget and policy and legislation-making powers to drive some of the solutions recommended by the NPC including the development efficient ICT infrastructure, the promotion of renewable energy resources, providing reliable and affordable public transport, introducing teacher accountability and performance, reducing regulatory burdens hampering economic growth and job creation, building partnership when it comes to reducing crime.
The Western Cape has been exploring the creative opportunities available to Provincial administration and has already started demonstrating not only the potential that the provinces offer when it comes to promoting progress and prosperity in South Africa, but more importantly an alternative government with different policy approaches can offer citizens which will enable them to exercise more meaningful democratic choices in subsequent elections.

As Madiba affirmed shortly after the 1994 elections, that is how democracy functions. This lesson is a key part of Madiba’s legacy. It is a legacy of South African family feeling a sense of belonging to each other through Madiba. He exhorted us to remember that our common community is more important than our differences and that we can indeed build a united nation with a shared future. In his memory we must all, now more than ever, honour his legacy and strive to live those values daily. I for one have been greatly encouraged by the way in which the people of the Western Cape observed this period of mourning with reverence and respect for each other as we all grieve and remember him.

We thank him for all that he has been to us in ways that we already know and have yet to realise. *Ah Dalibhunga, rest in peace father Madiba. †I thank you. [Applause.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon members and guests that is the end of our speakers’ list. May I request all of us to rise and observe a moment of silence?

[Moment of silence.]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, you may be seated. That concludes the business for the day, but before we leave I would like to request the members and guests to remain seated until the choir has rendered their last item. Also, before the choir starts I would just like to invite the members and our guests to sign the book of condolence in the lobby; just outside there is a book there. You are all invited. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Can we all rise and sing with the Choir. The House is adjourned hon members.

[Tribute rendered by the Groote Schuur Hospital Choir]

The House adjourned at 14:57
TUESDAY, 17 DECEMBER 2013

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. **Publication of Act 11 of 2013**


2. **Publication of Act 12 of 2013**


TABLING

The Speaker:

**Minister of Local Government and Environmental Affairs and Development Planning**

Notification of Extension of Intervention in the Oudtshoorn Municipality by the Provincial Executive of the Western Cape Province (Section 139(4) of the Constitution).

MONDAY, 3 FEBRUARY 2014

TABLING

The Speaker:

**Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:**


COMMITTEE REPORT

*(Final Mandate stage)* Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the *Special Economic Zones Bill* [B 3D–2013] (NCOP), dated 29 January 2014, as follows:
The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the subject of the *Special Economic Zones Bill* [B 3D–2013] (NCOP), referred to the Committee in terms of Standing Rule 220, recommends that the House confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill.

WEDNESDAY, 5 FEBRUARY 2014

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. **Introduction of Bill**

   Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

   *Western Cape Land Use Planning Bill* [B 1–2014].

2. **Referral of Bill to committee in terms of Rule 171**

   Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning:

   *Western Cape Land Use Planning Bill* [B 1–2014].

3. **Provincial Notice**


TABLINGS

The Speaker:

1. **Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**


2. **Report of the Auditor-General:**

   Report of the Auditor-General of South Africa on a performance audit of the use of consultants at selected departments of the Western Cape Provincial Government [RP325/2013].
TUESDAY, 11 FEBRUARY 2014

COMMITTEE REPORT

The Speaker:

(Negotiating mandate stage) Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the Legal Metrology Bill [B 34B–2013] (NCOP), dated 5 February 2014, as follows:

The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the subject of the Legal Metrology Bill [B 34B–2013] (NCOP) referred to the Committee in terms of Standing Rule 220, confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill.

THURSDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2014

COMMITTEE REPORT

The Speaker:

(Negotiating mandate stage) Report of the Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth on the Public Administration Management Bill [B 55–2013] (NCOP), dated 10 February 2014, as follows:

The Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth, having considered the subject of the Public Administration Management Bill [B 55–2013] (NCOP), referred to the Committee in terms of Standing Rule 220, confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to not support the Bill.

Minority View:

A4 minority view was expressed by Ms V Hani (ANC) to support the Public Administration Management Bill [B 55-2013] (NCOP).

TUESDAY, 18 FEBRUARY 2014

COMMITTEE REPORTS

1. (Negotiating mandate stage) Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the Judicial Matters Third Amendment Bill [B 53–2013] (NCOP), dated 14 February 2014, as follows:

The Standing Committee on Community Development, having considered the subject of the Judicial Matters Third Amendment Bill [B 53–2013] (NCOP), referred to the Committee in terms of Standing Rule 220, confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill.
The Committee agrees to the following proposed amendment–

(a) The Standing Committee of Community Development recommends in Clause 2 that the categories of persons responsible for the assessment of the cognitive, moral, emotional, psychological and social development of the child and the timeframes for the presentation of these reports be clearly identified in the *Judicial Matters Third Amendment Bill* [B 53–2013] (NCOP).

2. **(Negotiating Mandate stage)** Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the *National Environmental Management: Integrated Coastal Management Amendment Bill* [B 8B–2013] (NCOP), dated 11 February 2014, as follows:

The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning, having considered the subject of the *National Environmental Management: Integrated Coastal Management Amendment Bill* [B 8B–2013] (NCOP), referred to the Committee in terms of the Standing Rule 220, confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill with the following amendment:

**Insertion of section 7A in Act 24 of 2008**

6. The principal Act is hereby amended by the deletion of Section 7B and Section 7C and the insertion after section 7A of the following sections.

“Reclamation of Land from Coastal Waters

7B. (1) No person may reclaim land unless authorised by the Minister.

(2) The Minister may, on application, approve reclamation, and such authorisation may be subject to any conditions or title deed restrictions that the Minister may deem necessary.

(3) When the Minister considers an application and imposes any condition or restriction referred to in subsection (2), the Minister must consider –

(a) whether the application has an authorisation in terms of Chapter 5 of the National Environmental Management Act;

(b) whether the purpose of the reclamation is for the development of state infrastructure or for purposes other than state infrastructure by an organ of state or for private commercial gain; and

(c) whether there is any alternative land available.

(4) Land reclaimed in terms of subsection 2 forms part of state-owned land which may be alienated in terms of the applicable legislation. This provision shall not apply to land which has been lawfully alienated prior to this provision coming into effect.

(5) An application for reclamation must record the purpose for which the land is to be reclaimed.
(6) Unless authorised by the Minister, land reclaimed in terms of subsection (2) may not be utilised other than in accordance with the purpose stated in the original application and conditions of authorisation.

(7) Before making a decision in terms of this section, the Minister must consult with any organ of state that may be affected by such decision.

Composition of coastal public property

7. (1) Coastal public property consists of—
   (a) coastal waters;
   (b) land submerged by coastal waters including—
      (i) land flooded by coastal waters which subsequently becomes part of the bed of coastal waters; and
      (ii) the substrata beneath such land;
   (c) any natural island within coastal waters;
   (d) the seashore, including—
      (i) the seashore of a natural or reclaimed island; and
      (ii) the seashore of reclaimed land;
   (e) subject to subsection (2)(f), any admiralty reserve owned by the State;
   (f) any land owned or controlled by the State declared under section 8 to be coastal public property; or
   (g) any natural resource on or in any coastal public property of a category mentioned in paragraphs (a) to (f).

(2) Notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (1), coastal public property does not include—
   (a) any immovable structure, or part of an immovable structure, including harbour installations and infrastructure, whether located on land or the seabed, lawfully constructed by an organ of state;
   (b) any portion of the seashore below the high-water mark, which was lawfully alienated before the Sea-shore Act, 1935 (Act No. 21 of 1935) took effect, or which was lawfully alienated in terms of that Act, and which has not subsequently been re-incorporated into the seashore;
   (c) any part of an island that was lawfully alienated before this Act commenced;
   (d) any portion of a coastal cliff that—
      (i) was lawfully alienated before this Act took effect; and
      (ii) is not owned by the State;
   (e) any land which has been lawfully alienated and which is excluded from State owned land by virtue of section 7A(4) of this Act; or
   (f) any land or structure located within an admiralty reserve that is subject to a lawful lease from the State.”

3. *(Negotiating Mandate stage)* Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the *National Environmental Management: Air Quality Amendment Bill* [B 27B–2013] (NCOP), dated 11 February 2014, as follows:
The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning, having considered the subject of the National Environmental Management: Air Quality Amendment Bill [B 27B–2013] (NCOP), referred to the Committee in terms of the Standing Rule 220, confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill with the following amendments:

**Amendment of section 1(a) of Act 39 of 2004**

By replacing the definition of “Commissioning” from “the commencement of a listed activity” to “the initiation of the testing and operation of a listed activity;”:

**Amendment of section 36 of Act 39 of 2004**

5. Section 36 of the principal Act is hereby amended-
   (c) by the addition of the following subsections:
   “(5) Notwithstanding subsections (1) to (4), the Minister is the licencing authority and must, in consultation with the relevant provincial and municipal authority where the listed activity is located, perform the functions of the licencing authority if—”

**Amendment of section 41 of Act 39 of 2004**

9. (3) “A provisional atmospheric emission licence is valid for a period of one year from the date of the commissioning of the listed activity, or for a period as may be determined by a licencing authority, and may be extended for [an additional one year] a further period on good cause shown to the licencing authority”.

4. **(Negotiating Mandate stage)** Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the Marine Living Resources Amendment Bill [B 30B–2013] (NCOP), dated 11 February 2014, as follows:

The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning, having considered the subject of the Marine Living Resources Amendment Bill [B 30B–2013] (NCOP), referred to the Committee in terms of the Standing Rule 220, confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill with the following amendment:

**Amendment of section 1 of Act 18 of 1998**

It is proposed that the fourth category, which seeks to define a “small-scale fishing community” as “…a group of persons who (iv) regard themselves as a small-scale fishing community;” be deleted in its entirety.
Clause 1 of the Bill proposes that section 1 of the principal Act be amended by the insertion of certain definitions. In particular, Clause 1 seeks to define **“small-scale fishing community”**, and proceeds to list four groups of persons that would constitute a **“small-scale fishing community”**.

It is submitted that the first three groups/categories of persons all share a common characteristic: namely a [historical](#) connection or affinity to a particular area or way of life.

It is further submitted that the fourth category would allow for a group of persons, who DO NOT have this traditional or historical connection, to, in future, due to e.g. depleting resources elsewhere, establish themselves as a new “small-scale fishing community”, and they may now legally do so, since they will now, prospectively, **“regard themselves as a small-scale fishing community”**.

It is further submitted that this may give rise to unintended consequences, as it may create the legal space, over and above the usual urbanisation, for an influx of people to sensitive areas, all vying for limited and depleting marine resources. In turn, it is submitted, this may contribute to heightening tensions within already vulnerable communities, which may create polarised and fertile grounds for intra-community strife.

It is accordingly submitted that the deletion of the provision creating this fourth category of persons, would not jeopardise or scupper the primary objective and intrinsic intention of the Bill. It is submitted that whatever may have been intended by the addition of the fourth category of persons, can, through interpretation, quite readily be subsumed in the three preceding provisions.
INTERPELLATIONS,

QUESTIONS AND REPLIES
INTERPELLATIONS:

_Provincial office properties: inefficient use of space_

1. Mr E J von Brandis asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

What is his department doing to address the inefficient use of space within provincial office properties?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Thank you also to the hon member Mr von Brandis. We house about 23 000 people and it is a major pillar of the department that we should house them in the most productive, efficient and let us say green way. This relates to our accommodation policy which is covered in this document which members are welcome to, the Property Efficiency Report, and basically it follows the following principles:

One is that we prefer to own our offices rather than to lease them and the cost savings of that are enormous. To that extent we have already started the process in the Tower Block and at number 9 Dorp Street to convert the space to more efficient use. We will also start presently with a 15 storey building on Leeuwen Street to house the Education Department, and we will be purchasing a further building, probably in Wale Street, which will mean thereafter we will not really have any significant leases in the City.

We have already done this in George where we have purchased York House and we will over time then dispose of the leases in that area and move all of our people into York House. The savings are enormous.

The second thing is how we use our space. In effect, what we find is that while our costs per person are not markedly different to the private sector, in fact, the average employee in the province uses twice as much space as in the private sector because we live here in kind of 19th century Dickensian type conditions. These will be eliminated. These will not occur in our new buildings and these will be eliminated steadily in all our old buildings at a cost of about R300 million which, will then be converted to open plan and that money will be recovered in about four years, and thereafter there will be a significant profit.

The first thing will be to then have a much more efficient usage of space per person but, more important is the quality of that space, that where people work in properly designed open-plan circumstances, they are not in little boxes, in little cells, and they in fact are able to connect with the people and the activities around themselves, and in that sense they become much more efficient.

†The SPEAKER: Order. Please finish off. Hon Mr von Brandis, over to you.
†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Notwithstanding the findings of the discussed report which illustrates the need for modernisation and better designed future use of provincial space, it is reassuring to know that the Department of Transport and Public Works is intent on maximising efficiency and plugging financial sinkholes.

The question as always is, what can this government and its departments do to better use scarce resources? One is the development of space allocation standards, something which has been done in the private and public sector around the globe. These standards are by no means complex. They simply outline the allocation of available space, but these standards should not be at the expense of functionality and management. Requirements of staff should be adequately provided for, but simply put 60 square metres for an office is unacceptable. Using prestige as a yardstick in planning, especially when public funds are being used, is often an unfortunate occurrence. Departments and the buildings within the provincial portfolio should be encouraged to plan their own space according to these set guidelines and within the framework of reducing waste. The reason behind this is that space needs to be flexible and that requirements will differ from building to building and defined by the function of those that occupy it. That is why the programmes look to set maximums for space usage with a set of codes which can be used to prevent waste in future planning. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Hon minister, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to the hon member Mr von Brandis. Quite right with everything he says, Sir. You would be interested to know, Mr Speaker, that the worst over-usage of space by staff is right here in this building, almost double what it should be, in fact more than double what it should be.

So we proceed with that and the long term savings in that respect will be by 2020 about R600 hundred million per year. Then, not after that but simultaneously, we are in involved in various measures to make our buildings more efficient in other ways. We have obtained a grant from the United States government of US$500,000 dollars to retain consultants who will use the roofs of our buildings here in the City to generate energy and that should reduce - when that system is fully implemented - our energy costs by between 9 and 19%.

We will also increasingly green the buildings. For instance, the new building in Leeuwen Street, with the exception of certain religious needs, will have water free toilets. Toilets will not require water and increasingly in all our buildings we will re-use or sell the grey water and also use natural water which lies under number 9 Dorp Street. We also will try to reduce the traffic of lifts and indeed, where we can, the incidence of lifts by ascertaining where the busiest traffic is and ensuring that that traffic is either on the ground floor or close to the ground floor [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Please finish hon Minister. Hon member Mr Stali, over to you.
Mr C STALI: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Can the hon Minister tell this House why lots of open space has not being used? Can the hon Minister tell us why many state buildings, especially schools, are being used as drug dens? Minister we are also concerned that intended buildings especially for the Department of Health and Education are not being built as budgeted for. So existing buildings are under-utilised and far too few new buildings are being rolled out. This year only 62 building projects were completed by the hon Minister's Council Department in comparison to the 140 of last year. The target of 27 was not achieved. Only 55 projects were completed within the budget compared to last year's 133, an unachieved target of 27. Even maintenance of government buildings leaves much to be desired. Only seven or nine projects are under implementation this year compared to last year's 921. Thank you.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, reducing costs and maximising efficiency should be the business of any government. Accordingly there is work to be done in reducing this waste and the department will have to ensure it gains maximum utility from leased or government office space which it appears to have made provision for in the annual report.

Reading from the Department of Transport and Public Works Annual Report of 2012/13, the report states, as the Minister also reported on, that the department is currently in the process of reducing its leased space in favour of permanent space, such as the York Park building in George, my home town. It also notes that during this process the department would provide user departments with office accommodation in accordance with approved space norms. Assuming that these space norms are adhered to, future space under the department's authority, will be benefited by better planning and modernisation.

The annual report also notes that consolidated use of space by departments will reduce inefficiencies in productivity, illustrating that reducing the waste of office space is therefore as much about the physical as it is the mental. Mr Speaker, achieving parity within the province's offices and administration spaces will reduce costs through better use of space and set precedents for future planning. New norms and standards, once implemented, will allow the province to derive full utility from its properties and related office space and in a process make better use of taxpayers' money. I thank the Minister and his department for their efforts in this regard. I thank you.

Mr M OZINSKY: Is your office big enough for you?

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you also to the hon member Mr Stali. Just to continue what I was saying. All of the areas where the public need to engage with us will be dropped down to the ground floor as has already been done at 9 Dorp Street - the walk-in centre which I hope you have all visited. This will happen with regard to all the buildings here, including the Tower Block building. Now I listened with a degree of astonishment to the hon member Mr Stali, who I think was actually addressing the Gauteng legislature and not the Western Cape legislature [Laughter.] I think he is confused, okay but let me ... [Interjections.]
†An HON MEMBER: Maybe on his way,

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Maybe he is on his way. I am told there is going to be a mass migration of hon members. Those who are not coming here are going to the Northern Cape [Laughter.] [Interjections.] But let me share ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members. Hon Minister, order. Hon members, order.

†Ms L BROWN: We can actually lease there is that what you are saying?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Steve Biko said, do not worry what other people say about you; it is what you feel about yourself.

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please address the Chair.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, just to give the hon members some figures; under the ANC for the four years ended 2008 they spent R700 million on schools. In the next four years under the DA we spent R1,7 billion. That is nearly three times more, and in the next three years we will be spending R3,3 billion [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I do not know. What more does he want us to do? [Interjections.]

But let us talk about health: in the last four years under the ANC they spent R1,1 billion on health. In the same period we have spent R2,7 billion on health [Interjections.] I want that hon member to share our pride in these achievements [Interjections.] He is part of this. He is part of the legislature that has done these wonderful things and he should not criticise. He should, like the hon member Mr von Brandis, stand up and say “well done Western Cape legislature” [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members

†Ms L BROWN: I wish you were so bold in your debate.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Ms Brown. We now proceed, hon members, to the second interpellation. I recognise the hon Minister Fritz. Over to you.

Debate concluded.
2. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Social Development:

What is the operational status of Western Cape government funded substance abuse treatment centres in the Western Cape?

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker and to the hon member Mr Lentit for the interpellation. The allocated budget for 2013/14 in terms of Vote 7 for substance abuse programmes is R81,437,000, and of this a total of 58% of the budget is earmarked for transfer payment to NGO’s and 42% earmarked and allocated to own source treatment and outsource treatment centres. The second part is the department’s subsidised six in-patient treatment centres, namely; Hesketh King Salvation Army Centre, False Bay Therapeutic Community Centre, Tehillah Community Collaborative, Namaqua Treatment Centre, Toevlug Treatment Centre and Ramot Treatment Centre.

In addition, the Department of Social Development has its own in-patient treatment centres at the De Novo and two out-source treatment centres in Kensington and the other one in Eerste River called the Western Cape Youth Rehabilitation Centre. The De Novo targets 85 clients per treatment cycle, Kensington 40 clients, and the Western Cape Youth Rehabilitation Centre also target 40 clients per treatment cycle. There are 18 community based treatment programmes. I want to emphasise, 18 community based treatment programmes which are out-patient treatment centres. They have 4 200 clients and these are all community based treatment centres which are fully utilised. I think it is an important point that they are out-patient treatment programmes because everyone thinks that anyone with the first attempt of any form of tik or anything must go to an in-patient treatment. There are phenomenal programmes that deal with out-patients.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon minister. Hon chief whip, do you want to address me?

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, the hon member Mr Lentit is currently sick in hospital and apologises. He is unable to participate in the interpellation.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you. I am also sitting with an official letter from the hon member Mr Lentit. So can we then proceed to the next interpellation? Hon member Mr Uys?

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, just to be clear, are we going to conclude this interpellation?

†The SPEAKER: Yes, of course.

†Mr P UYS: Thank you, thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Yes, we will. Definitely. Hon member Ms du Toit Marais, over to you.
Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The Western Cape government is a government that cares. We identify problems and implement solutions. Substance abuse places a high premium on our health care. Increased bed capacity in district hospitals as emphasised in the annual report has also been increased. Collaboration with NGO’s contribute to the combating, prevention and treatment of substance abuse. Further, the use of the matrix model is one of the more successful in light of the complexity of drug dependency. The community model for prevention and treatment contributes to the holistic approach of the department and government. I am certain that if I asked Minister Fritz regarding the success of substance abuse treatment in, for example, the Mitchells Plain area, Minister Fritz will also be able to tell enlighten as to how our approach compares to that prior to 2009. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, thank you to the hon member Ms Du Toit Marais. It is always said that there is only one centre in Mitchells Plain that offers treatment to people from the area, which of course is an absolute lie. We have, for example, in the Mitchells Plain the Tafelsig matrix property situated in Tafelsig which is central to where drugs are freely available, yet the national police do nothing in this regard.

The Cape Town Drug Counselling Centre is in Mitchells Plain in Woodlands, the Woolworths arcade at Symphony Walk which is the central part of the town centre in Mitchells Plain. Sultan Bahu is another one of the centres there. We have adopted a new approach with our local offices where we can provide the first step in treatment and also immediate intervention to people who bring their children. They are desperate and bring their children to us. I am pleased to announce here today that we will shortly rolling out the matrix model to virtually every other day hospital we have or clinic which is controlled by Cape Town. I think this is all wonderful, ladies and gentlemen, hon members, Mr Speaker, but this is a problem and we must tackle the problem and this is basically the point.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Certainly, the department of Minister Fritz has consistently regressed in its provision of support to those suffering from drug abuse. We have witnessed a decrease in the number of people accessing substance abuse services. [Interjections.] This decrease has happened in a province where drug abuse is increasing. Mr Speaker, we have come to discover that the majority of those affected by drugs in this province have to wait between three and four months, as the department’s centres are often full. We hope that operationalising of substance abuse centres will make provision for this. The South African National Council for Alcoholism and Drug Dependence in the Western Cape says that only a few addicts can afford in-patient facilities, even if State subsidised. The department also must invest much more in drug prevention programmes. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister, please conclude.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is not true.
†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. I want to say - yes, the numbers did come down, hon member Ms Magwaza ... [Interjection.]

†The SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister Carlisle, order.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The numbers ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon mem Ms Magwaza, order. Hon Minister, proceed.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The numbers did come down, Mr Speaker. You know why the numbers came down, because they stopped; this department stopped doing this so-called mass awareness that they chase numbers for annual report purposes – that is why the numbers came down. They had a hundred people in the room and they said, oh you must not take drugs and the woman who told the children not to take drugs is 105 years old. So how does a 15 year old listen to a 105 year old woman? This is the problem with them, and I can say to the hon member Ms Magawaza ... [Interjections.] ... one of the issues that I can say to her now, that in 2008 when they were in charge, there were eight treatment centres in this province. There are now 27 treatment centres. Very simple mathematics – very simple graphic mathematics. Eight plus eight is 16 and another eight is 24 and then you add another three and then you get 27 – these are not the type of calculations that you should have to do for them, these are basic calculations. There were so many then and there are this many now, that is the difference that we ... And I am telling you where we are going because we are giving substance and impact treatment, not little awareness programmes where you chat to 100 and no one listens. This is the point we must reach – stop chasing numbers and get impact and make a difference to the people out there. Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

Debate concluded.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Ms Brown, order. [Interjections.] Hon Minister, your time has expired. Order, please. Hon Minister Fritz, order. We now proceed to the last interpellation, the third one. I recognise the hon Minister Madikizela.

**Housing: occupation by intended beneficiaries**

3. **Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

   Why are there houses still not occupied by the intended beneficiaries whilst there is an extreme housing shortage in the Western Cape?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, there are various reasons why sometimes houses are not immediately occupied when they have been completed.
Sometimes incomplete application forms are sent by the intended beneficiaries to the department, and sometimes it is the contestation between different groups and communities who want to be prioritised first before others, and in some instances it is the policy of Eskom to only electrify projects when they are 80% completed, so some of the beneficiaries choose not to occupy those houses until they are electrified. Sometimes we identify structural defects before people can move in and we deal with those structural defects so that people can move into structurally sound houses. These are some of the reasons why certain houses are not immediately occupied after they are completed. Thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Magaxa, over to you.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, this is another living example of the DA’s negligence and corrupt tendencies when Minister Madikizela actually uses houses built to divide communities for the DA to get membership and support. These houses have been built from conditional grants delivered by the national government under the ANC. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Delivered by me! [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Minister Carlisle, order please.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: The N2 gateway in Langa, which is a national project started by the former MEC Jantjies and the former Minister Sisulu, is now falling under the same new Minister Madikizela. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, order.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: They are unoccupied; there are unoccupied houses for almost three years while there are people on the waiting list anxious to have houses. The DA is still looking for supporters like the hon Minister Madikizela who can be bought over these houses. The same problem is taking place in Eersterivier where houses were built some time ago but are still unoccupied. The DA is still looking for voter fodder. In Grabouw she is losing support; the DA has begun to use houses deemed for the community in Dennekruin in the same way, resulting in intended beneficiaries remaining on the waiting list. The land for these houses was transferred by the national government to the municipality as early as 2003. Now when the houses are built, intended beneficiaries are not getting the houses. Instead the DA councillor who happens to be African, brings Africans from other areas to move into those houses so as to divide the communities and create animosity, so that at the end of the day the DA gets supporters there.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Can you prove that?

†Mr K E MAGAXA: In Nyanga backyard dwellers are given priority for the houses where residents for whom the houses were built remain on the waiting list.
†The SPEAKER: Order, order. Your time has expired. Thank you very much. Hon member Mr Figlan, over to you.

*Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The problem I have is that there is a difference between NBA houses, RDP houses and Bank houses whereby an individual will have to work together with their bank in order to know their financial profile. The housing waiting lists are long and getting even longer as all the people from other provinces want to share in the benefits of the good governance in the Western Cape. The unfortunate fact that certain houses are still standing empty after six years, makes one realise the extent of manipulation by various role players in the allocation of houses. [Interjections.] Most importantly, beneficiaries or hopeful beneficiaries should make sure that their documentation residing ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†Mr A M FIGLAN: ... with the department are regularly updated. All people, especially the younger generation, should take special care to ensure that their financial standing with financial institutions like banks are in order. Without a clean financial record you cannot buy a house. The examples are the ones I have just mentioned, the houses in Eersterivier and N2 Gateway. We welcome rent-to-buy opportunities which also provide the potential especially to blacklisted buyers. This mechanism to rehabilitate themselves financially while renting to buy a house - more use should be made of this facility. Most young people fail to understand the importance of a clean financial record and only realise the implications of a bad credit record when they want to buy a house. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. I think the hon mem Mr Magaxa must differentiate between speaking at a rally and in Parliament because at a rally everybody believes whatever you say. You must do your homework and get your facts straight before you come with your ...

N2 Gateway houses for example; those are bank houses. We have a land availability agreement with FNB and it is the responsibility of the bank to market those houses so that the beneficiaries who qualify in terms of the criteria then occupy those houses. The same thing applies in Eersterivier. There were 821 houses built there of which 221 were affordable houses, under the program FLISP, and those houses are being sold because beneficiaries again must qualify to get a bond from the bank before they can occupy those houses. [Interjections.]

Again in Grabouw, those houses are being allocated and as I said, there were minor snags that the municipality is busy with. They will be allocated next week. The same thing applied in Nyanga.
I think I have explained this several times now that the people who ended up benefiting from those houses in Nyanga were not the people who should have benefited and that is why the backyarders contested the allocation of houses to those people living there. We are dealing with that. Even though we do not condone the vandalisation of those houses by the backyarders, they had legitimate concerns that they were overlooked and people who settled there, later after them, were given those houses. That is the correct information about what is happening with those houses. Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, over to you.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, I think the hon Minister can confuse some of his colleagues on that side of the House, not us. Those houses, even though the bank contributes, the State, our government, contributes there. Therefore it is the responsibility of the MEC also to create the conditions for those houses to be occupied. He cannot allow the waste of our money there. It is his responsibility to intervene. If the reason that these houses are unoccupied is because there is a contestation by the groups why do we have to pay an MEC if he does not see it as his role to create conditions conducive to people occupying those houses? What is his role? We pay the MEC to engage the community so that if the government spends money for people to live in those houses, we cannot build houses and spend three years with houses lying there unoccupied because there is a problem with the community. Why do we need an MEC?

Secondly, the question of structural defects: structural defects are all over. We went with your colleagues to Mossel Bay. In respect of the houses that people are living in there, there are processes to correct those problems. There are no defects in the houses in Nyanga. The reason they are demolished is because they have been standing there for more than three years now, unoccupied. All the reasons you referred to in Nyanga has nothing to do with that problem. The problem in Nyanga is precisely because the DA wants to create confusion and conflict in that community so that at the end of the day they can use those houses to buy votes. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Minister, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, this member is an embarrassment in this House. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me say this ... perhaps ... Just keep quiet. Just shut up. Let me perhaps educate this member.

†The SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister. Order. Hon Minister, please can you withdraw “shut-up”. It is unparliamentary. We cannot allow it.
†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I withdraw it, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky. Hon members, order.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me take a few seconds to educate the member about the process because he clearly does not understand how the process works when it comes to affordable housing. Now, even though the State contributes....

†An HON MEMBER: Do not give him a lecture.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I must.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He needs it.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, I did explain that we signed a land availability agreement with the banks so that the banks can then assist those people earning above R3,500. Now what happens is that we do not contribute to people if they are not approved by the banks first. That is how the process works. People must go and apply to the bank and then get approval for a bond from the bank, and we can then assist people with our subsidy in terms of the Finance Linked Individual Subsidy Programme. So, there is no state money that is wasted there. If there are no people occupying those houses it simply means that they have not received any subsidy from us. That is how the process works, so there is no state money that is wasted. I think that must be made very clear upfront.

The issue of the structural defects; again I think I must make this point very clear because this administration currently accounts for R60 billion nationally on the houses that were built in the manner in which he proposes that we must. Now, what we need to do, in fact, what we are doing currently, is that we make sure ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Please conclude Hon Minister.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We make sure that we do not allow people to move into houses that are structurally unsound as is the case currently nationally. [Interjections.]

Debate concluded.

†The SPEAKER: Order hon members. Order. We now proceed to questions as printed on the Question Paper. We will start with the questions that stand over from 17 October 2013, that is question number four to Minister Bredell.
QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Question standing over from Thursday, 17 October 2013, as agreed to by the House:

Private premises: basic services

*4. Mr J J Visser asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

(a) What is the current state of affairs in respect of the rendering of basic services to people who live on private premises where the owner does not render any services;

(b) whether this is a common occurrence in the Western Cape; and

(c) which private landowners are especially guilty of this problem?

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you also to the hon member Mr Visser for the question. The reply is as follows:

4. The City of Cape Town, in terms of the Municipal Financial Management Act, is not allowed to install or to provide basic services to people residing on private property. In respect of informal settlements situated on private property where the owners do not provide basic services the City does indeed provide basic services on the borders of that property in terms of the constitutional obligation. As a minimum level of services, the City provides access to water and refuse as well as the removal of solid waste on the property. In the case of back yard dwellings situated on municipal let properties, the City is in the process of rolling out services which include electricity, sewerage and refuse removal. As a result of the legal implications the provision of services to back yard dwellings situated on private property is not possible. Within the City there are approximately 300 hectares of private property occupied by informal settlements. This usually happens as a result of land occupation. Mr Speaker, with the permission of the member who posed the question, I arranged for each municipality to draft its breakdown, but when I stood here and read it I thought it might take up all the question time. There is also an issue around the Moravian missionaries where proper services are not available and we are currently negotiating with the Moravian Church particularly in the Bergriver and similar areas. They had a meeting for the first time last week. Myself and my colleague from Agriculture, Minister van Rensburg, are together looking for ways to enable us to give 50 free units of electricity to our farm workers. We are busy with that system and will hopefully have a business plan on the table by the end of this month. Thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Any follow up questions? None. We then move to the new questions. Question number 1, Minister van Rensburg, over to you.
New questions:

**Agriculture as a school subject**

*1. Mr J J Visser asked the Minister of Agriculture:*

(a) How many schools in the Western Cape have agriculture as a school subject;

(b) how many of these subjects as special projects are supported and/or funded by the Department of Agriculture; and

(c) how many of the special projects are supported by the private sector?

*The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The reply is as follows:

1. There are currently 20 public schools that offer agriculture as a subject. This is not financially supported by the Department of Agriculture because that responsibility lies with my colleague in Education. The finance those schools completely. We do however work together with PSO 11 and together we look for ways to promote agriculture at those schools. My department is not aware of any special projects that are being offered by the private sector. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Visser, follow up?

*Mr J J VISSER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. In terms of these schools that offer agriculture as a subject, is it only theoretical education that is presented to the learners or is there any practical aspect involved? Minister.

*The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Mr Speaker, at three of the schools that qualified as agricultural schools, and that is ... [Inaudible.] Boland and Clanwilliam, a practical aspect is also included. At the others in smaller areas where they only have school gardens like for example at Nduli in Ceres, we are trying to assist them in getting a school garden started.

*Mr J J VISSER: Thank you Mr Speaker. Hon Minister, would it be possible to come to an agreement with farmers in terms of which the learners that take agriculture as a subject could go and work on their farms as part of the practical education?

*The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Mr Speaker, I think that might be possible. There are even farmers who are willing to set up class rooms for agricultural subjects at certain schools which I am aware of. We can always conclude a partnership agreement with either the municipality where we can get a garden for the school or with one of the farmers in the area.

†The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, over to you. Question number two.
2. Mr A M Figlan asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

What is the status of the RDP homeowners in the Western Cape with regard to receiving the title deeds for their homes;

(a) how many title deeds have been handed over to the RDP homeowners and in which areas were the title deeds given;

(b) how many people have not received their title deeds and in which areas have they not received title deeds; and

(c) what are the reasons for not receiving or handing over title deeds?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The reply is as follows:

2. Up until 2009 there were more than 86 000 beneficiaries who had received RDP houses in the province who had never received their title deeds. There is a list I can provide as to which areas.

To the second part of the question, how many people have not received their title deeds and in which areas? As I said I will provide a list of those.

What are the reasons for not giving title deeds to the people? There are various reasons, Mr Speaker. They vary from the fact that in some areas the land was never properly proclaimed, which means the previous administration just built houses all over the show before planning processes were completed. As a result of that some of the people cannot get their title deeds. In some instances we find that packing was not properly done [Interjections.]. In some instances we find that packing was never properly done. In some instances we find that beneficiaries who are now occupying ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, can I be protected from the hon member Mr Ozinsky.

†The SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

†Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, order hon member Mr Ozinsky. You may proceed, hon Minister.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In some areas, Mr Speaker, people who are there are not the original beneficiaries, as we know that the selling and renting of houses is one of the big problems.
But since 2009 we have reduced that backlog by issuing almost 21000 title deeds to those people who have less complicated situations. We are dealing with those situations where there are problems, as I have just outlined.

*Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you very much hon. Minister. The question I have hon Minister is: among these people as we know there was an investigation conducted of which the findings were that those people living in those houses without title deeds were not the owners that were given those houses. What decision has been taken by the department regarding those people?

*The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you hon member Mr Figlan. Our main focus ... because by law if a person lives in a house that is not registered in their name we used to use this before. Legally the house should be advertised in order to find the registered owner of the house and if the registered house owner is then not found after a certain period we then look at the people who are currently occupying the house. Where they qualify for government houses based on the qualifying criteria, this will then lead to the protection process in registering the houses in their names.

*Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you very much hon Minister. Are there people that have been assisted among those you have found? Was it clear that they are qualifying beneficiaries?

*The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: As I have said we started this programme in Makhaza and there are people who benefited from this programme. Even then advertising was done to find the homeowners’ availability. Out of that advertising, if the findings were that those homeowners were not found, these houses were then protected to those people currently living in the houses. This was done in compliance with the investigation proceedings and proof that they had indeed been living in the houses for a long time. The same thing in other areas such as Samora. We are now looking at people who are already living in the houses. If they qualify for government houses and once that is in place we then start the process of protecting the houses in respect of name change registrations.

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ncedana. Do you have a question?

*Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Speaker, I would like to pose a question to the hon Minister’s reply stating that there is a place where houses are being built without discussions taking place to build the houses. Where are these houses in the Western Cape?

*The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I have a list of the areas hon member Mr Ncedana and there are a number of them. I would be happy to hand it to you. Khayelitsha, Phillipi and so forth and so-on. It is a long list that I will hand to you detailing the investigation that clearly states the reasons why in these areas people are not able to attain their title deeds. We can even share the investigation report with you in order for you to see the reasons why people do not get their title deeds.
Northlink FET College

*3. Ms J L Hartnick asked the Minister of Community Safety:

What progress has thus far been made in respect of the co-operation between his department and Northlink FET College?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and to the hon member Ms Hartnick for the question. The reply is as follows:

3. Very good progress has been made so far and we are looking forward to continuing with the good relationship, because jointly we have so far reached out to many communities across the Western Cape Province. The purpose of the intervention, as the hon member Ms Hartnick is aware, is to afford unemployed youth from disadvantaged and crime-affected backgrounds an opportunity to further their education and develop skills. The areas identified are predominantly affected by gang violence and high levels of crime. These communities can become a breeding ground for the recruitment of youth into gangs. This initiative aims to give alternative opportunities to the youth who cannot afford to pay for their further education. For all the above sessions the youth were mobilised by the Department of Community Safety to attend, and Northlink College made a presentation at each of the public meetings and provided all participants with the necessary application forms for completion and for submission directly to the college. Thank you very much.

Northlink Sessions were arranged in 2013 in the following areas:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AREA</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>ATTENDANCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nyanga</td>
<td>20 May 2013</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kraaifontein</td>
<td>21 May 2013</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portlands/M’Plain</td>
<td>14 June 2013</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rocklands/M’Plain</td>
<td>14 June 2013</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chrysalis Academy</td>
<td>9 July 2013</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manenberg</td>
<td>1 October 2013</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wesbank</td>
<td>1 October 2013</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robertson</td>
<td>2 October 2013</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McGregor</td>
<td>2 October 2013</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lavender Hill</td>
<td>8 October 2013</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atlantis</td>
<td>15 October 2013</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wesbank</td>
<td>16 October 2013</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lavender Hill</td>
<td>16 October 2013</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worcester</td>
<td>19 October 2013</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ebenessar</td>
<td>21 October 2013</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
<td><strong>Total: 1774</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Mr P Uys asked Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

What is the role played by him in the functioning or lack of functioning of the Oudtshoorn Municipality in the past year?

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, thank you for the questions. The reply is as follows:

4. Certain challenges exist since earlier this year in respect of the functioning of the Oudtshoorn municipality and more specifically within the municipal council. In light of the situation I most certainly played a role in the functioning of the municipality.

As part of my provincial oversight function I was obligated to intervene when it became clear that the municipality was not approving its annual budget for the 2013/14 financial year. Myself, together with the provincial Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism, took on a leadership role in terms of the relevant legislation in the management of this issue and after thorough consultation with the involved parties we recommended that the provincial legislature give approval for a temporary budget for the municipality in terms of Article 139(4) of the Constitution. The provincial legislature approved a temporary budget on 17 July 2013 and ordered that the municipality approve the 2013/14 budget not later than 30 September or earlier date upon which the council might decide. This date was later postponed to 29 November 2013. The provincial legislature by means of a temporary budget acted quickly and within the legal framework in order to ensure that the expenditure incurred by Oudtshoorn Municipality from 17 July 2013 was authorised and legal, to ensure continued service delivery. My Department of Local Government, with my knowledge and approval, drafted a detailed specification with the intention of discussing the future manager of the Kango Caves operational arrangements.

During March 2013 the department met with the then acting municipal manager and other senior officials and the road ahead was provisionally agreed upon.

Since the death of Mr Lot, the acting municipal manager, in April 2013, no further progress has been possible. The continued political and legal dead end has thus had a negative effect on the negotiations. Complaints were received from Oudtshoorn’s taxpayers about noise and safety issues which are caused by the flight school’s activities at the Oudtshoorn Municipal airport. Considering that I was very concerned about any safety regulations I requested that my department pay attention to these issues.
Although it does appear that there are further issues in respect of the use of the airport which still need to be addressed, I have however been assured that the flight activities do indeed meet with the necessary approval of the relevant aviation authorities. My Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning is currently considering an article 25(G) application in terms of Nema in respect of buildings that have been erected at the airport for flight lesson purposes.

Various other initiatives in the Oudtshoorn municipality have been carried out by my Department of Local Government. Such an example is feedback provided in January 2013 to the management team in respect of a diagnostic assessment which was carried out by a multi-discipline team under the leadership of the Department of Local Government with regard to the functioning of the municipality. The outcome of this assessment formed the basis for the support that was required but the municipality and was addressed by the local government turnaround program.

As a result of the unstable political situation is was unilaterally agreed by both the department and the municipal management to keep the turnaround strategy or the support program on the back burner for the time being. Furthermore, a municipal code was developed which will be made available to the municipality within the next week or two.

As far as my role as the fourth respondent in the matter between McPherson & Others en Mr Stoffels, the Speaker & Others is concerned, I acted in such a way as to ensure that the democratic process, which is the result of a legal outcome of a by-election held on 7 August 2013, could be realised by allowing that a motion of no confidence be voted. I believe that where the democratic process is derailed it is expected of myself as provincial Minister of Local Government to intervene, as I did in this case. As you are most likely aware, the Cape Town High Court handed down its judgment on 12 November 2013. Amongst others, the court confirmed that the recent actions of the Speaker were unlawful and mala fide. Thank you.

*An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!
†The SPEAKER: Any follow-up, hon member Mr Uys?

*Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you very much to the MEC. MEC, why did you advise the municipal council and the DA component that the council meeting held on 31 May was a lawful meeting and who advised you to make such a decision?

†The SPEAKER: Minister.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, I advise all councils. I do not in my capacity as MEC only advise the DA component of a council and the hon member Mr Uys must now once and for all please understand that my department does not differentiate between which political party is in control.
In terms of disciplinary hearings I have always ensured that any person, council member, has a fair hearing irrespective and our record proves that. He can review the books and have a look. Therefore when a council has been through a democratic process, and we can take a big step back here, we can go back to Minister Richard Baloyi. You must remember that the DA component only took over this council a month or seven weeks prior to 7 August in order to restore stability and to ensure that the residents didn’t take the law into their own hands. I negotiated with Minister Baloyi, with all the ANC council members and their legal representative – who I actually think should be struck from the roll – and that meeting … [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, is the hon MEC allowed to make statements about … [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Yes, actually [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: … officers of the court in such a way in this House without them being given a right to reply?

†An HON MEMBER: He is not talking about the court. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order!

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, hon …

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I am not on the roll.

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, Order! Order!

*An HON MEMBER: He is not an attorney.

†An HON MEMBER: He is expressing an opinion.

†The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order hon? Let us address firstly the issue of hon member Mr Ozinsky.

†An HON MEMBER: I wanted a question, who is the Speaker?

†The SPEAKER: No, no, take your seat. Take your seat. Hon member Mr Ozinsky, the hon Minister expressed himself in Afrikaans and that is not my language, so at this stage I cannot … [Interjections.]

†Mr M SKWATSHA: The translation is there. The translation is there.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Do you want me to suspend the sitting for translation?
†Ms M TINGWE: Yes. Yes.

†The SPEAKER: Order, but I will then check in Hansard, hon member Mr Ozinsky, and I will come back to the House with a ruling on that matter. [Interjections.] Order! You may proceed, hon Minister Bredell.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, come ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The money was paid to your attorney.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In the meeting with Minister Baloyi ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: R8 million rand.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And you must remember ... [Interjections.]

*An HON MEMBER: That is scandalous.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I have the whole day. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members, order!

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I have the whole day.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Minister Carlisle. Minister Carlisle and hon member Mr Ozinsky, order.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Minister, order!

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, in that meeting just to calm tempers and to – without the knowledge of my own party I negotiated and said let us forget this shortsighted view to the 7th August. The 7th August will determine who will govern Oudtshoorn and who not. There were three by elections during that time, hon member Mr Uys.

If the ANC won all three, they would have remained in control. If they lost one then the DA would take over.
That is what we said to each other, we knew that and during that meeting the ANC agreed that should they lose one of the by-elections they would then take on a constructive opposition role and I said the same on behalf of the DA.

*Mr P UYS: We are back to the 31st. [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That never happened, so Mr Speaker to come back to the court, I was busy answering. There were many opinions. There were a lot and I have the entire judgment here with me if you want it. I can read it for you because it seems to me that you cannot read.

*The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He can't read.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Let me give you a quick summary of what happened. I approached the court and I asked them – out of desperation and in order to calm the situation in Oudtshoorn – asked the court to assist me in holding a lawful council meeting. The court said that it is not the responsibility of the MEC to determine a day and date of a council meeting and I was satisfied with that and I accepted it, but the court went further Mr Speaker, and he then touched on three other issues. He declared both the meeting of 4 September as well as the meeting of 20 September unlawful. He said “the Speaker, the first respondent, to pay the costs of the application in his personal capacity.” [Interjections.]

*An HON MEMBER: Aha, ja, ja, die ANC!

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Okay, “the Speaker’s conduct was mala fide. The Speaker prevented the motion of ‘no confidence’ from being put to the vote thereby securing his own position”, so it is all about a selfish motive from the ANC coalition ... [Interjections.] ... and that is the hon member Mr Uys’ advice to them. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The fact that the Speaker refused two of the councillors to vote ... [Interjections.]

†Ms L BROWN: On a point of order, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Order!

†Ms L BROWN: I want you to make a ruling on the fact that the hon Minister Carlisle said “for stealing, to you, for stealing from the poor” and he is addressing the hon Chief Whip. I want you to make a ruling whether that is right or not. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Minister Carlisle, please will you address her.
†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No I - on this occasion - was not addressing the Chief Whip. I was explaining to the Chief Whip that the Speaker in Oudtshoorn is stealing his salary from the poor, which he is.

†Ms L BROWN: On a point of order, Mr Speaker. If that is true, Mr Speaker, then is it true when the hon Minister Madikizela for example does not build the number of houses that he is supposed to build in a year [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Take your seat.

†Ms L BROWN: Is he stealing from the poor and does that apply to every other MEC here?

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Brown, take your seat. That is not a point of order. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Order, hon members, order! Hon member Ms Brown, order. Minister, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, the judge further said that the Speaker, by refusing two of the councillors to vote without any process on the advice of the ANC provincial leadership, and the member Mr Uys is one of them, was mala fide and unlawful. Okay, to prove the point ... [Interjections.]

*Mr P UYS: I am talking about the 31st

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: But, Mr Speaker, this does not surprise me at all. This is typical of the ANC in the Western Cape. They do not accept democracy.

*An HON MEMBER: Yes listen to that.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In order for Mr Uys to come back to Parliament they simply declared Mr Skwatsha’s branches null and void, then he could garner enough votes to get back in [Interjections.] So there are no processes. [Interjections.]

So now the hon member Mr Uys is bad and the hon member Mr Skwatsha must now move to the national Parliament, but he has the support.

†An HON MEMBER: In the Northern Cape.

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: He has the support. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order!

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And we all know that.
†The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Is it a follow-up? Order!

†Mr P UYS: It is a follow-up, Mr Speaker.

*The SPEAKER: Is it a follow-up, hon member Mr Uys? [Interjections.] Order hon members!

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Do you want another hiding?

†Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Of course, Mr Speaker, the MEC never referred to the 31st of May as I asked the question, but let me follow-up.

*What action is he planning and what has in put in motion in order to discipline council member Nel who attempted to fraudulently steal R4,5million to pay his legal costs?

*An HON MEMBER: Wanted to steal? [Interjections.]

*Mr P UYS: We put a stop to that.

†The SPEAKER: Order!

*Mr P UYS: We put a stop to that.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, the hon member Mr Uys and the hon member Ms Brown stood up now and made a big noise about an allegation. We must be very careful now of abusing freedom of speech in the House.

*An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There is no evidence. [Interjections.] No, I did not do it, I did not do it. [Interjections.] You also lost the vote, together with the hon member Mr Uys and Fransman you connived, so now you are also coming to national [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, just give - Order! Order! Just give the Minister a chance to answer your question.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: You all know that is the truth.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, he will answer – his account … [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Ministers, order.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We all know what happened there. Mr Speaker, in any council there are processes.
The ANC once again made itself guilty on corrupt actions, because they unlawfully obtained a report from a DA caucus. [Interjections.] We have – we believe in … [Interjections.]

*Mr P UYS: You gave it to us.

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We believe in this country in the rule of law, Mr Speaker.

†Mr M OZINSKY: What law?

†An HON MEMBER: Yes, what law, what law? ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The hon member Mr Ozinsky is very ashamed of his own party now. I understand that.

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky!

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, the hon Nel has not been found guilty of anything. There was a discussion and a caucus and the DA put a stop to it, not me.

*Mr P UYS: Unlawful.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: A DA senior management team intervened and said it would not happen. We would never make use of tax payers money to solve an internal dispute. [Interjections.] It was not the hon member Mr Uys. It was not their legal team. He was too busy conniving with Fransman so that Skwatsha’s people could not vote. Thank you. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

†Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The MEC referred to the mandamus he tried to get. Did he in any way try to get it in any other municipality except Oudtshoorn? [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon member Mr Uys, we work with a lot of municipalities. [Interjections.]
†The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, we work with 30 municipalities. We learn according to a legal process what we may or may not do. We are currently trying to obtain a 500 page management report from the Auditor-General in Cederberg so that we can prevent corruption and so that we can implement systems there to assist in that, but again the ANC is in control there and they sweep the matter under the map because they think we want to intervene or do something.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Why do they not help you?

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We are only trying to help. He will never help me, because he is too busy securing his own position [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, we are therefore acting as a department to assist all municipalities and as a result of our support our 30 municipalities are the best municipalities in the country. Thank you.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hear, hear!

*An HON MEMBER: No man, you don’t have to be shy. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order. This is the last chance, hon member Mr Uys.

†Mr P UYS: Yes, thank you, Mr Speaker. It is just strange that the MEC did not say the report is with the MEC of Finance, but Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: What is your question?

†Mr P UYS: Did Minister Bredell now learn from this that he has got no locus standi and that he will accept what the court rules?

†The SPEAKER: Order! The question, the question?

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: What is the question?

†Mr P UYS: Will he accept that? [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Ms L BROWN: That is the question.

*An HON MEMBER: That is not a question.
†Ms L BROWN: That is the question.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, I would dearly like to answer that.

*Mr P UYS: He does not have *locus standi*.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I have said from the outset that I am satisfied with the judgment and I think it was a very good judgment. It is a judgment that protects the democracy in this country against politicians such as the hon member Mr Uys who want to manipulate everything to his own advantage.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Nice! Nice!

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is what this judgment does. If I find myself in the same situation tomorrow it is highly likely that I will follow the same route because I must also maintain calm amongst the people out there and be able to ensure that their will that they exercised on the 7th August when they voted for the DA and said to the ANC “we are sick and tired of your corrupt management of the Oudtshoorn municipality, is implemented. That was the message, Mr Speaker [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: It was only one ward. The other two wards voted ANC.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And now they want to ensure their power and cling to it … [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: It was only one ward! [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: … by means of all sorts of games and the judgment makes that very clear: unlawful *mala fide* actions of the ANC. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon order! Order! Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, hon member Mr Ozinsky, I have warned you several times in this House that your interjection is very loud and we cannot allow it in this House. [Interjections.] Order! Order, hon members. We are not going to allow that and if you carry on, keeping on doing that, definitely you will leave this Chamber. [Interjections.] Order! That is the end of the question to Minister Bredell. Take your seat, hon member Mr Visser. That was the last question. Hon Minister Madikizela, we then proceed to question number 5, over to you.
Meeting between developers and Minister of Human Settlements

5. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

(a) What was the purpose of the meeting arranged by him for 21 October 2013 with developers and (b) who are the developers who indicated that they would attend the said meeting?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The reply is as follows:

5. The purpose of the meeting with the developers, through you, Mr Speaker, to the hon member Mr Uys, was to engage the developers to unlock the challenges that exist in the affordable market. As you know, a number of people who are earning between R3,500 and R15,000 continue to be homeless because there is this huge reliance on grants, and we wanted to engage with the developers around partnerships that we can form so that we can unlock challenges that exist there so that we are able to roll out more houses in that particular space.

As regards the second part of the question, the response was overwhelming. There were a number of developers there. I have a list of the developers who signed the attendance register. There were about 45 developers who were there and I am very happy to share the list with you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Thanks, MEC. Did you consequently identify the land and make that available publicly?

The SPEAKER: Minister.

MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, the first part, I mean there is a process that we are going to follow. The first part obviously was to test the market, call the developers, engage them, share with them our challenges and hear from them.

The second part is that we have identified pieces of land where we are going to call requests for proposals from the developers, because what we want to do is to get the right institutional arrangement and the funding model so that we do not rely on the grant too much in order for us to unlock challenges there. The next step is to then call for proposals which would be a public tender where everybody will be welcome to submit his or her proposals.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you Mr Speaker. Then why did your spokesperson Bruce Oom say the availability and the information around land are not for public information?
†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, as you know we did not want to put the cart before the horse. What normally happens ... [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: You wanted to cover up!

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What normally happens ... [Interjections.] What normally happens, Mr Speaker, is that as we all know that once you start talking about the available land and where it is we have experienced a number of invasions and that is why you want to follow the correct process so that you communicate that when we are at the point where we need to be. That is why I am saying it is going to be an open tender where people will be told these are the pieces of land and they will then submit their proposals and we are coming to that process, so that is the reason. So there is no secrecy around it. We just wanted to make sure that nobody has more advantage than others and make sure that we follow the process correctly.

†The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

†Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Minister Madikizela, would you also go the route where the developers can identify the land and come forward to you with a proposal on land that is available from their side?

†The SPEAKER: Minister.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Certainly. Actually that is the process that the City has started already. In fact, the process at that particular level is that the City has already done that. The developers have come forward with the pieces of land that they own and the City is now in the process of getting the correct institutional arrangement and to also discuss the funding model with those developers, so that process has been followed by the City. We did not want to follow more or less the same process, but these processes are more or less similar. It is our land from this side, and on that side the City is engaging the developers to come forward with their own land.

†The SPEAKER: Last chance hon member Mr Uys.

†Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. This is only for Gap housing as I understood you correctly, if we define it like that. Why go this route only for that and not also for the lower income people to identify land in the same process?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What we want to do, hon member Mr Uys, is to get the right mix. It is therefore not only going to be for Gap housing. By and large we want to address Gap housing, but we want the developers to get the right mix in terms of different percentages of these income categories, which will then also include the low income earners, the affordable housing and the higher end of the market. That is what we want to achieve. The land - the pieces of land that we have identified - are not exclusively for the Gap market, but by and large that is the market that we want to address, because that is where the challenges exist. We are doing a lot in terms of the low income earners from the grant that is coming from the Government.
†Mr P UYS: Not for the poorest of people.

†The SPEAKER: Order! That was your last chance, hon member Mr Uys. We now proceed to the next question. That is question number 6, Minister Botha over to you.

_Triage system: training for medical staff_

6. **Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:**

   Whether there is any training in place for medical staff with reference to the triage system in public health facilities; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The reply is as follows:

6. In 2005 a standardised triage scale was developed by the Western Cape. It was called the Cape Triage Score. It was subsequently tested for reliability and validity in the Western Cape hospitals and in the 24-hour facilities. These studies showed high reliability and validity when used by different cadres of healthcare staff and high accuracy in identifying sick adults and children.

   The triage scale has been continuously revised and improved and its implementation has been monitored and evaluated. The Cape Triage Score was then renamed to the South African Triage Scale after it had been adopted by many hospitals throughout South Africa. Since 2006 we have been training Western Cape healthcare staff. The training is conducted by Ms Twomey who has a PhD in emergency medicine. The training included doctors, nurses and admin staff at hospitals and at the 24-hour facilities and the ambulance staff. Refresher courses are run every two years and staff trained since 2010 in all districts. 713 ambulance staff have also been trained in all the districts. 8-hour Clinics have not been receiving training as the load of patients is mostly non-urgent and a modified version is used in those facilities.

   With the recent interaction with a company from the Bandwidth Barn called Tomsa, they have developed an electronic triaging system which I found very interesting and we have undertaken a pilot project at the Khayelitsha Hospital of which I hope to get the outcome very soon, although the early indications are already that it is a very well developed programme and assisting staff much in the efficiency of the triaging system.

   I am also informed by some authority that the system that we currently use in the Western Cape is amongst the best in the world. [Interjections.]
District | Healthcare staff trained
---|---
Central Karoo | 48
Eden | 74
Overberg | 52
Winelands | 56
Metro | 868
West Coast | 58
**Total** | **1156**

Projects 8448 and Mau Mau: construction of

7. **Mr A M Figlan asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

When is the construction going to start on Projects 8448 in Gugulethu and Mau Mau in Nyanga?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to hon member Mr Figlan for the question. The reply is as follows:

7. A tender for the construction of civil engineering services was advertised by the City of Cape Town and all supply-chain processes were followed. It was anticipated that should there be no objections after the 21-days appeal period the starting date for the commencement of services construction will be the end of September, but unfortunately something was identified where the overhead high voltage of the power lines was identified as a problem. The City is now redesigning the layout plan so that they can go out to tender again.

†The SPEAKER: Any follow-up? None? Thank you very much, hon Minister Madikizela. Questions for the day have been exhausted. Order! I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Premier is unavoidably absent today, so the questions to the Premier will then stand over.

†Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. What is normal practice from all MECs in this House is to write to the members who pose the questions to apologise and say she will not be here or they will not be here and then consequently say is it fine that we let this stand over. We did not receive any apology or any letter from the Premier indicating this and I would like to ask, there is normally an apology given to say the MEC is at Minmec. Where is the MEC [Interjections.] and Mr Speaker, where is the Premier? [Interjections.] Just one sentence. Let me finish, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members! Order, just one sentence hon member Mr Uys.
Mr P UYS: Just one sentence and then ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, which rule of the House ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: If the Premier is not here why did she not appoint an acting Premier? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Take your seat, hon. It is very ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: It is one sentence!

The SPEAKER: It is very clear what you are saying, hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Where is the acting Premier then?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Do you - hon Chief Whip, there is no-one? [Interjections.] Order hon members! Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

Mr P UYS: Where is the acting Premier then?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, may I address you on this issue?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In my capacity as leader of the House.

An HON MEMBER: No!

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Who are you? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, order! [Interjections.] You have only one - hon members – you have only one minute, hon Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, the hon Chief Whip of the Opposition and other parties were well informed of this at the programme authority as you know. So, I do not know what big issue you are trying to make of this, but you were informed, and you kept your comment until now and did not use it when you had the opportunity to say so. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The rest ... [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, the Premier - this is now the second occasion that the Premier cannot reply to the questions. The previous one ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! There is a question from hon member Mr Uys and the hon Minister Botha is trying to answer you on where the Premier is.
†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And I am addressing you, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Please! Listen to him.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The Premier, Mr Speaker, on the previous occasion was at the Presidential Coordinating Council which is the Minmec for Premiers as he should know, and so she was on official business. The Premier has no reason to explain to the Chief Whip of the ANC about her whereabouts today. [Interjections.] She has not left the country and if he knew anything about the position of the Premier and the rules of this House he would have known that there cannot be an acting Premier when the Premier has not left the country. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Please conclude, hon Minister Botha.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But I want to say this, I want to conclude, Mr Speaker, by saying this: maybe what the ANC should do ... [Interjections.]

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, do not order us!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... is they should compare the questions that has been replied to by other Premiers throughout South Africa and the President ... [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Shut-up man!

†An HON MEMBER: That is nonsense!

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, there was a remark from the hon member Mr Ozinsky to say I must shut-up!

†An HON MEMBER: No, Ozinsky did not say... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon, hon order! ... [Interjections.] Minister Botha, order! You will - I just want to give the opportunity - take your seat, hon member Mr Ozinsky. Can you address me?

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, I have been sitting silently and neatly here since you admonished me earlier. I have said nothing.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: That is true. He did not say anything.

†The SPEAKER: If then - Order! - if then hon member Mr Ozinsky said: “I did not know about it”, we will refer to Hansard. Hon Minister Botha, please you have ... [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela.
The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, is it parliamentary for a member - hon member Mr Magaxa said to hon Minister Botha he must shut up? It is him who said you must shut up. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! Order, hon members. Order. Take your seat, hon member Mr Skwatsha. [Interjections.] Take your seat. Take your seat. There is a question from hon Minister Madikizela that needs to be addressed first. What are you saying? Are you saying it was not hon member Mr Ozinsky, it was hon member Mr Magaxa?

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: We will also then refer it to Hansard. We will check who is the one who said it. [Interjections.] Okay. Order! Order! Order! Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Hon order! [Interjections.] Before you - hon Minister Botha before you conclude, there is a point of order.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Is it parliamentary for the hon Minister Madikizela to point at the hon member Mr Magaxa? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Will you take your seat. [Interjections.] Will you take your seat, hon member Mr Skwatsha. No, that is not a point of order. Hon members, order! Hon Minister Botha will you please conclude?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, may I just ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: May I just say, Mr Speaker, if the remark came from him, do not worry, no-one listens to him. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, I want to conclude by saying that the Premier has a very good track record of being present in this House, much more than the Leader of the Opposition. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Order! Your time - Order! Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay, I am done.

The SPEAKER: Your time is over, hon Minister Botha. Your time has expired. Thank you very much.

Mr M SKWATSHA: How much time did you give him? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, it has expired. [Interjections.]
Questions and replies as received from departments

QUESTIONS

For written reply

SAPS recruitment of Act members

1. Mr M G E Wiley asked the Minister of Community Safety:

How many (a) SAPS Act members and (b) Public Service Act members were recruited to the South African Police Service in the Western Cape in (i) 2005/06, (ii) 2006/07, (iii) 2007/08 and (iv) 2008/09?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

1. The South African Police Service informed me that:

   (a) (i) 861
        (ii) 1366
        (iii) 1167
        (iv) 1548

   (b) (i) 65
        (ii) 229
        (iii) 331
        (iv) 43

SAPS: Act members

2. Mr M G E Wiley asked the Minister of Community Safety:

How many (a) SAPS Act members and (b) Public Service Act members left the South African Police Service in the Western Cape in each year since 2009?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

2. The South African Police Service informed me that:

   (a) 2009/2010 417
        2010/2011 336
        2011/2012 378
        2012/2013 396
        2013/2014 (Ending 31 Oct 2013) 235

   (b) 2009/2010 163
        2010/2011 118
        2011/2012 120
        2012/2013 116
        2013/2014 (Ending 31 Oct 2013) 61
3. **Mr M G E Wiley asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

How many (a) SAPS Act members and (b) Public Service Act members left the South African Police Service in the Western Cape in (i) 2005/06, (ii) 2006/07, (iii) 2007/08 and (iv) 2008/09?

**The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:**

3. The South African Police Service informed me that:

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a)</td>
<td>(i)</td>
<td>475</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(ii)</td>
<td>550</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(iii)</td>
<td>564</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(iv)</td>
<td>565</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(b)</td>
<td>(i)</td>
<td>189</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(ii)</td>
<td>249</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(iii)</td>
<td>205</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(iv)</td>
<td>225</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTERPELLATIONS

Safe houses: victims of rape

4. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Social Development:

What are the relevant details in respect of safe houses for victims of rape in the Western Cape?

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The Victim Empowerment Programme of the Department of Social Development funds shelters for victims of crime and violence and not for rape victims specifically.

The existing funded shelters, which at this point are 13 throughout the province, primarily assist victims of domestic violence and victims of human trafficking. Of these shelters, five are in rural areas and the remainder are spread throughout the respective metros. Victims are provided emergency as well as short-term accommodation and therapeutic services at these shelters – often together with their children. Shelters deliver services in accordance with their respective constitutional mandates, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Ms du Toit Marais, over to you.

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Safe houses for victims of rape in the Western Cape is pivotal, not only for 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children, but all year round, especially with the increasing rate of rape in the Western Cape. The ultimate goal is to provide a safe environment for rape and abused victims. The staff must be able and empowered to provide high quality care to survivors. I am especially concerned about how trained the personnel of these safe houses are. Without accurate knowledge, service providers may perpetuate harmful beliefs that can cause further emotional distress and prevent healing. Full and accurate knowledge about sexual abuse and rape is central to delivering services to victims of rape and violence.

†The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The first thing that we want to emphasise is that this government outsource or get service providers that are specialists in the field of victim empowerment, specifically around the issues of domestic violence, rape etcetera. So what we do in many instances is to specifically fund programmes that also provide very specific services in that regard. Allow me to just give some examples. Very often the service also requires some kind of legal intervention, like for instance an interdict or other legal issues. Often our service becomes one-stop type of centres for people and for victims of domestic violence and sexual abuse, and it is a broad spectrum of service that is provided. It is therefore an all-encompassing kind of service, but also a very specialist kind of service that specifically provides for the kind of instances of domestic violence, sexual violence, gender violence and of course rape.
†Ms V HANI: Thank you. Mr Speaker, it is not enough to merely establish safe houses for victims of rape in the metro. We need to see more safe houses in the rural areas. Even in the metro, shelters like Saartjie Baartman and Rape Crisis still suffer from a severe lack of funding from MEC Fritz's department. These shelters are forced to raise most of their own funds. According to the Shelter Shadow Report of the Heinrich Boll Foundation, there remains a severe lack of funding for such shelters in the Western Cape, with a lack of second and third stage housing. What is the MEC going to do about this? These shelters run at a deficit whilst their beds remain full. In fact, allocations to shelters vary between R28 and R35 per bed per day. Women living in rural communities are more isolated than urban women. What is being done to remedy this? Male children above the age of five are frequently turned away from a shelter which induces the mother to go back to the violent home. These too need urgent attention, Minister.

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Another concern is whether there are enough funds available for the sustainability of these safe houses, because they are a necessity in our communities across the Western Cape as well as in the rural areas. Secondly, is the quality of service provision monitored, and if so, it would be an improvement if the result could lead to the changing of criteria to include rape victims in existing safe houses. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, please conclude.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. Mr Speaker, let me say from the outset that there will never be enough funding, and so we have – I always use the example of the cake, hon member Ms Hani. What we have is a piece of cake and we cut it and slice it and slice it as fine as possible. So funding will always be a challenge and therefore we are moving more and more to asking corporates to assist government in funding these very - as the hon mem Ms Hani and hon mem Ms du Toit Marais are saying - specialist type of services. We are moving very fast in reaching that kind of level of funding from corporates and government, because there is just not enough from government.

I tell you we completely concur with you of course. 87% of the population lives in the metro so that is a reality. We have, as I have indicated, five rural shelters and we want to also get more of those out, and also hon mem Ms Hani, specifically where children are concerned. I want to say that where children are concerned, if a child is found to be specifically very vulnerable, we luckily have in most of the province very strategically located Child and Youth Care Centres that we can take the child to and safeguard that child’s safety. Luckily we have that to assist the child, as and if it is required and, as and when it is required to do that. I want to say we concur and we call on all parties, all companies, all hospitals and everyone to come together and to assist us in this regard. We will always need more and more, but Mr Speaker, we forget that we need to work and continue to build the family and build the family and build the family, to stop the violence against everyone ... [Interjections.]
†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and against children and women. I thank you.

Debate concluded.

Interpellation 2 withdrawn.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Fritz. Order, hon members. We now proceed to the next interpellation, the third interpellation. I recognise the hon Minister Fritz.

Chrysalis Academy: work opportunities for graduates

3. Mr M G E Wiley asked the Minister of Social Development:

How successful has the Chrysalis Academy youth project been in placing graduates into positions of work opportunity and community structures?

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to the hon mem Mr Wiley for the question. The placement of graduates into work opportunities and specifically Chrysalis graduates has been a tremendous success since 2011. In many cases students have opted to study full-time, in other words to get back to full-time study, while others have even gone back to school. I think that is a tremendous achievement of the programme, to get young people to get back to school and to go back into the education stream. By far the majority have been absorbed into work opportunities, both within government and private sector and in government as the hon Minister Winde indicated earlier in his speech, many, many of them in our province, as interns. I promise you it is a phenomenal programme. Hon Minister Winde, never ever stop that. Continue with that.

From December 2011 to March 2012, of the number of graduates - 287 graduates, 119 graduates were placed and 26 graduates went back to studying, so it is just phenomenal. From 1 April 2012 to 31 March 2013, 501 graduates graduated and 337 of them were placed within either government or the private sector, and 51 graduates went back to studying. From 1 April 2013 to 31 July 2013, of the 172 graduates 168 were placed in internships and different programmes. Current course graduates: we have an indication that of the current course, 179 will almost certainly be placed and of that three will be going to France on an exchange programme, so it is a very, very exciting prospect. I thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon mem Mr Wiley, over to you.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, thank you very much. The irony of this success is that the Chrysalis Academy was never designed as a job creation scheme. It is a bi-product of this particular training.
The purpose of the Chrysalis Academy was behaviour change to try and take those youngsters who are most likely to be vulnerable to potential crime, to take them and to give them an opportunity to see, to discover some of their talents and expand their opportunities. And this by-product that we have seen is that many of them have got employment. This is significant because it is about attitude, and hon Minister Winde in his Appropriation Bill just now, talked about attitude. Whether it is Mr Mandela or whether it is Mr Maimane, the fact of the matter is if you show the inclination to work from an early age and if you show the right attitude, you are going to get the opportunities made available to you. In many of the cases, probably the most beneficial bi-product of this particular attitudinal change is, as the hon Minister has already pointed out, for those youngsters to go back to complete their education – their formal education, because that increases their opportunities when they apply for jobs.

I think as far as this success is concerned, just on a rough count here, if out of the 501, 337 have job opportunities in the previous year, that is over 60% - that is quite remarkable. There is no other youth training environment in this country that has a success record of employment uptake of that kind and the department needs to be congratulated in that regard.

†An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

†The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, over to you.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to say, four departments need to be congratulated. I just want to make that point. I also want to say to the hon mem Mr Wiley, this coming week I know there is now big interest from Volvo in Sweden. Volvo Trucks in Sweden is busy with a project and looking at how they can source apprentices for Volvo Trucks from Chrysalis. The hon mem Mr Wiley is correct that there is a huge display of phenomenal behavioural change and that is the primary purpose of the course. As a spin-off the great new attitude portrayed to the outside just attracts business and people to appoint and to actually employ these young graduates. We had one case, that hon Minister Winde always talks about, a very big retail company in South Africa who have seen some of these new guys come into the shop and they could not understand why these guys are just very different. They soon discovered they are all Chrysalis graduates and so now they come directly to Chrysalis, not through a labour broker. They now come directly to Chrysalis and actually source graduates from Chrysalis for employment in this big, reputable retail shop.

So we are very, very encouraged and I want to say to all the other departments involved in this and to civil society, we forget a big part of this programme is the rebuilding and the restoration of the family unit and the family as a huge part of this programme. One can see that the notion of the family and the family structure is of fundamental importance in building any programme, and we have seen the success of that in Chrysalis.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Ms Hani, over to you.
†Ms V HANI: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The Chrysalis Academy needs some drastic reform to seriously change from a soldierly style and regimental operation into a civilian process.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Say again?

†Ms L BROWN: Listen the first time, listen the first time.

†Ms V HANI: You must at least start at grade nine to enter Chrysalis. You must carry on, and I can understand that old order, part of the apartheid style ... [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Shame, shame.

†Ms V HANI: ... conscription military service – reminiscent of the so-called good old days, and their own paratrooper trainer will sing the praises of Chrysalis as the DA’s ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, order.

†Ms V HANI: ... opposition in waiting does. Those who defended the apartheid system still sit on the benches of this legislature, blindly applauding Chrysalis. But a real hard look at the modern needs of a dynamic and fast changing world ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon minister, order.

†Ms V HANI: ... dictates that Chrysalis has to transform rapidly to keep up. The three months basic training is far too little. The fact that a lot of these youngsters are school dropouts and do not return to complete their education at some level is clearly not a remedy. More youth must be linked up with FET Colleges and more skills training also needs to be explored for life-long learning. Mere placement is not enough. Yoga and other techniques are not enough to continue in a violent world of drugs, gangs, domestic problems and the poverty trap. Our youth of all communities deserve better.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Wiley, over to you. [Interjections.]

†Ms V HANI: Yes, they do deserve better.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, in my career in this particular parliament, I have never heard such a load of drivel as that coming from the hon member Ms Hani over there. This project, the Chrysalis Academy, has international awards, it is recognised by the Presidency, it is recognised by – President Mandela gave his name to the awards given to the Academy. President Mbeki wanted to go and visit there, but he was stopped at the last minute because all of a sudden they realised that it was a DA-government initiative and there was an ANC election coming up at the time. That was just an unfortunate thing. That is the first thing. Secondly, it is the most successful job creation scheme anywhere in this country. It has been evaluated six times ... [Interjections.]
The ANC when they were in government, forced R155,000 into an academic evaluation that was 400 pages long. The end result of that evaluation was that this is the most successful youth project in South Africa and that it should be replicated in every single province in this country. That was their evaluation of this project.

So with all due respect, as far as apartheid style training is concerned, if you want to see apartheid style training, take the NARYSEC Project that the ANC started, the Rural Youth Development Project – that is mind-blowing apartheid style training, and that lasts two years and that ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, order hon mem Mr Wiley.

†Mr M G E WILEY: ... is brain-washing of the first order.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you Sir.

†Ms V HANI: Is it parliamentary for the member to pinpoint another member?

†The SPEAKER: No. That is not a point of order. She is just speaking. [Interjections.] You may ... Order, hon members. Order. Order, hon mem Mr Magaxa. Hon Minister. Hon mem Mr Wiley, are you finished? Order, Are you finished?

†Mr M G E WILEY: Do you want me to carry on, Mr Speaker?

†The SPEAKER: It was a point of order; you still have ... [Interjections.]

†Mr M G E WILEY: Was it a point – okay.

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, order. Hon mem Ms Brown, order. You still have some seconds to finish, hon mem Mr Wiley, if you ... [Interjections.]

†Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you very much. I have made my point, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you.

†Ms L BROWN: Oh, so wonderful.

†The SPEAKER: We now proceed, hon members. Minister Fritz, please conclude.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I am always fascinated by the hon – without pointing any fingers, I am always fascinated. I want to ask the hon member Ms Hani to go to the mothers and to the fathers and to the families in Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain and Hanover Park and tell those children who have been caught up in the gang-trap and tell their parents that this child is now in the military. They need some routine, hon member Ms Hani. I think the idea of some discipline and in fact getting up half past four in the morning is to get back that discipline in our society.
That has been absolutely lacking because at schools we have seen how that flew out of the window. We have seen all kinds of almost degeneration, you know, really the going down of all form of structure in families. So I think I just want to make that point.

The second point I want to make about Chrysalis, you know the ANC government in Kwazulu-Natal in fact sent 12 of their young leaders to come train here in Cape Town at Chrysalis and now they are carrying out a similar programme. [Interjections.] So the hon member Ms Hani must just please check her facts.

The last point I want to make about Chrysalis, Mr Speaker, is to invite the hon members on 30 November to graduation day. Please come and experience the emotions of parents, of mothers, fathers, aunties, grannies, grandmothers, when the children graduate and when those guys do excellent marching. You must come and experience it because then you see what it means to the families and you see the transformation of those young people. I really want to invite hon members to come and have a cup of tea with us on Saturday 30 November to experience the emotions of our community and the thankfulness from the families and communities for the transformation of their children. I really want to ask you to come and do that. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That is the end of the interpellations. We now proceed to questions. We have new questions and the first question is to Minister Botha, over to you.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

New questions:

*Long waiting times at health facilities*

1. **Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:**

   Whether his Department has put in place any measures to address the problem of long waiting times at health facilities; if not, why not; if so, what do those measures entail?

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity and to the hon mem Ms du Toit Marais for asking this question. It has become prevalent that most complaints that we receive at Health are in regard to waiting times. So the question is appropriate and I want to reply as follows:

   1. Addressing long waiting times has been identified as a key intervention to improve the patient-experience of health services, both through improving the patient-experience of waiting and to reduce the waiting times.
The department developed a comprehensive set of strategies to address waiting times in a comprehensive and co-ordinated way.

The department will develop a user-friendly method to measure waiting times to determine the baseline and provide the waiting time on a current and/or intermittent basis to patients who are waiting through electronic methods on a daily basis. This is a new system we are implementing.

Facility managers will be provided with a toolbox of interventions to reduce waiting times, of which an appointment system will be implemented at all health facilities. The significant improvement in folder retrieval in the pilot Eden Project will also be rolled out to other facilities in the province. Congestion at facilities will be reduced through implementing club systems for stable chronic patients, alternate site medication delivery through the CDU process and alternate sites to render services. The improvement of the flow of patients will also be prioritised at the reception areas and triage and prioritisation mechanisms will be looked at and investigated. Queue managers will become central to patient-flow and assist with directing patients with better signage and communication. Resource matching and utilisation will take place where staff will be allocated to pressure areas, predict volumes and schedule non-clinical duties.

The department will also improve the patient-experience while waiting. This will be done by firstly constantly communicating the estimated amount of time the patients can expect to wait and to provide entertainment, edutainment or alternative activity during the wait. We are currently exploring a partnership with a private sector organisation that will place TV screens in waiting rooms for advertising purposes, but which will also be used for important medical information. A radio communication mechanism is also being explored – radio as in broadcasting.

The Chronic Dispensing Unit (CDU) of the province has been instrumental in reducing patient waiting times. The patient medicine parcels for stable chronic patients are ready for collection when patients arrive at facilities, and therefore the patient does not have to collect a folder or wait for the pharmacy to prepare the prescription. The CDU also delivers patient medicine parcels to nominated alternative delivery sites which are closer to patients’ homes and where the group collecting is smaller than at a primary healthcare facility. This is already in process and we are already delivering 120 000 of the 220 000 prescriptions at alternative sites. There the patient travelling and waiting time is then reduced. The CDU patient medicine parcels are also alphabetically packed and are accompanied by an alphabetical list of patient names which affords easy retrievability.

In addition to this the department will also manage the systems that create an enabling environment through extending opening times where appropriate to certain facilities.

Our capital programme to construct new facilities and upgrade old facilities is designed in a manner to improve patient flow and will have an impact on waiting times, and we have already opened more than 100 new facilities.
We have experienced this in real time and in reality this improves waiting times. In the past four years we have extended our staff component from 26000 to 31000; this means an improved ratio between health worker and patient which also then contributes to less waiting time.

The sms patient hotline that we established initially as a pilot project is now being rolled out to the rest of the province and has proved to be extremely successful. The call centre provides callers within minutes with a reference number and the complaint is tracked and followed through within 15 minutes. The sms hotline has proved very successful in offering the waiting complainant some immediate relief in real time.

One of the major projects tackled by the Business Development Unit, which we have established in the department in the past year, was the call for service providers that will eventually grow smaller pharmacy businesses. We have 53 contracts with Clicks and we have now added more than 130 contracts that were signed with private pharmacists this year and more will follow suit. Eventually we hope to have 400. Essentially this provides for the gap market of patients who are willing to pay a convenience fee on certain days but will receive free service on other days, rather than waiting in a queue at one of our facilities. So that will add 400 facilities to our current infrastructure. It means that we have devised a way to take feet out of our facilities, and this will indeed improve the waiting times.

Mr Speaker, all these various initiatives will reduce numbers at our primary healthcare facilities anticipated at between 40 to 50 percent. While simultaneously doing so, we will be improving the clinical outcome and obviously improve the patient-experience. Thank you very much.

†The SPEAKER: Any supplementary or follow-up questions? Then the next question, that is question number two – Minister Botha, over to you.

Department of Health: attitude of staff

2. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:

Whether his Department has taken any steps to address the attitude of staff; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Speaker and also to the hon mem Ms du Toit Marais. The reply is as follows:

2. The attitude of staff is the second biggest problem that we have in the department according to our survey. The department has put in place a change management process to be facilitated by Ernst and Young which will address organisational culture, including staff attitudes. 38 facilities are part of a pilot programme which will run over 12 months, but eventually all facilities will be part of the programme.
This programme will focus on behavioural change to achieve a stronger focus on preventative care, proactive management of workload and burnout risk and strengthening frontline staff skills to build trust and empathy.

The department recently launched its Healthcare 2030 plan for health service transformation in the Western Cape - The Road to Wellness - for public comment. “Access to patient-centred, quality care” is the key vision of Healthcare 2030, with the first objective being to deliver a quality patient experience within a world class, public sector health service. Poor staff attitudes directly impact on the Western Cape's public health system’s ability in adopting a patient centred approach and to improve the patient experience. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Any follow up questions? None? Questions for the day have been exhausted. Thank you very much.
Questions and replies as received from departments

QUESTIONS

For written reply

Contractual agreements with SAPS

1. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Community Safety:

   (1) Whether a certain person, whose name has been furnished to the Minister’s department for the purpose of his reply, or any of such person’s companies, have entered into any contractual agreement(s) with the South African Police Service; if so, (i) for what period, (ii) what was the nature of this contractual agreement(s) and (iii) what was the value of these agreement(s);

   (2) whether a competitive bidding process was followed?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

1. The South African Police Service (SAPS) informed me that they (SAPS) did not enter into any contractual agreements with the person named or any of his companies and that as a result the response to questions (1) (i), (ii), (iii) and (2) were not applicable.

   SAPS: Sponsorships, donations and gifts received

2. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Community Safety:

   Whether the South African Police Service has received any (a) sponsorships, (b) donations or (c) gifts from a certain person, whose name has been furnished to the Minister’s department for the purpose of his reply; if so, in each case, (i) what was the nature of the sponsorships, donations or gifts and (ii) what was the value thereof?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

2. According to SAPS Western Cape, gifts, sponsorships and/or donations were received as follows:
   (i) and (ii):
   700 cups to the value of R7 000.00
   1 Flat screen TV to the value of R4 000.00
   1 Apple Tablet to the value of R6 000.00
   Tickets for trip to Robben Island to the value of R5 000.00
   10 gift vouchers to the value of R2 000 each
   1 Ipad to the value of R8 000.00
   3 Flat screen TV with unknown value
   9 Front Loaders Car Radios with unknown value
   58 Coffee mugs with unknown value
Food voucher to the value of R1 500
2 Blinds with unknown value
Shelves with unknown value
700 gift bags to the value of R50 000.00

SAPS: Sponsorships, donations and gifts received

3. Ms J L Hartnick asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether the South African Police Service in the Western Cape has received any (a) sponsorships, (b) donations or (c) gifts in the past three financial years; if so, in each case, (i) what was the nature of the sponsorships, donations or gifts and (ii) what was the value thereof?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

3. Yes. The South African Police Service informs me that gifts, sponsorships and/or donations were received in 2011, 2012 and 2013 as follows: and (ii)

2011

CCTV Camera to the value of R5 218.75
Child Friendly Room (FCS) to the value of R67 000.00
2 Trailers to the value of R19 000.00
A Horse to the value of R10 000.00
Gift bags to the value R50 000.00
Catering to the value R45 000.00

2012

Christmas Party for children to the value of R10 000.00
Name board to the value of R2 000.00
15 Accommodation Vouchers to the value of R50 000.00
72 Capitec Vouchers, Clothing, Water bottles and Lanyards to the value of R5 000.00
3 Shopping Vouchers to the value of R3 000.00
Laptop bags, speakers, cushions and pens to the value of R5 000.00
5 Shopping Vouchers to the value of R10 000.00
4 iPads to the value of R30 000.00
4 Shopping Vouchers to the value of R2 000.00
10 Shopping Vouchers to the value of R20 000.00

2013

Christmas Party for children to the value of R10 000.00
Non-perishable food hampers to the value of R10 500.00
Wall clock to the value of R160.00
4 Bicycles and Helmets to the value of R6 200.00
Upgrading of 27 Victim Support Rooms to the value of R385 328.61
Queue Pole to the value of R20 000.00
Desk and Whiteboards Queue to the value of R7 600.00
Band equipment to the value of R8 500.00
Microwave to the value of R500.00
Furniture to the value of R3 000.00
41 x Accommodation and breakfast vouchers to the value of R85 000.00
16 Capitec Vouchers, clothing, pens, lanyards and watches to the value of R7 280.00
R 5 000 towards mini iPad
Miscellaneous electronic and other items to the value of R5 000.00
5 iPads to the value of R40 000.00
20 Shopping Vouchers to the value of R10 000.00
1 iPad to the value of R8 000.00
20 Shopping Vouchers to the value of R15 000.00
4 mini iPads to the value of R20 000.00
4 Accommodation Vouchers and meal vouchers to the value of R9 000.00
16 Shopping Vouchers to the value of R8 000.00
1 Mountain Bike and 1 iPad to the value of R12 000.00

SAPS: donation/gift of motor vehicle(s), to

4. Ms J L Hartnick asked the Minister of Community Safety:

(1) Whether a certain person, whose name has been furnished to the Minister’s department for the purpose of his reply, has (a) sold, (b) donated or (c) gifted any motor vehicle(s) to the South African Police Service; if so, (i) to whom, (ii) how many vehicles are involved, (iii) what is the (aa) make and (bb) model of the vehicle in question, in each case, and (iv) what were the reason(s) for accepting these vehicles;

(2) whether, in each case, these vehicles were declared in financial interests declarations; if so, how; if not, why not?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

4. The South African Police Service informed me that:

The named person has not (a) sold, (b) donated or (c) gifted any motor vehicles to the South African Police Service. Therefore the answer to questions (i), (ii), (iii)(aa), (iii)(bb) and (iv) and (2) are not applicable.

SAPS: acquisition of goods and/or services

5. Mr M G E Wiley asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether the South African Police Service has acquired goods and/or services from Towbars King, Towbars Cape, Towbar & AutoCape; if so, (i) what is the nature of the goods and/or services provided, (ii) to what amount, (iii) which other companies submitted a bid to render these services and (iv) why were those companies unsuccessful?
5. The South African Police Service informed me that:

Yes, SAPS: Western Cape has acquired goods and/or services from Towbars King and Towbars Cape, which were procured in terms of 3.1 – 3.3 (of the National Treasury Practice Notice 8 of 2007/2008). No services were acquired from Towbar & AutoCape.

(i) Supply, fitment and repair of towbars and vehicle accessories.

(ii) Towbars Cape has been registered as a supplier on the SAPS database since 1997, with R542 172 paid to the supplier since inception.

Towbars King has been registered as a supplier on the SAPS database since 2000, with R106 089 paid to the supplier since inception.

(iii) There are also 3 other companies, which are on SAPS database since 1997, which have submitted successful quotations to render services for vehicle accessories:

Super Quick, Kuils River R354 452-06
Hi-Q, Wynberg R344 255-37
Pitstop, Mitchells Plain R334 251-63

(iv) Depending on the threshold involved companies can be unsuccessful due to price if the value is below the threshold of R30 000 per case or they can be unsuccessful for not scoring the highest points in terms of the Preferential Procurement Policy Framework Act (Act 5 of 2000) 80/20 principle in terms of HDI status (prior to December 2011) and Broad Based Economic Empowerment Act status level (post December 2011) if the value is more than R30 000 per case. Further reasons could be that the companies did not have or did not submit a valid tax clearance certificate.

SAPS: authority to install blue light or siren device onto private vehicle

6. Mr M G E Wiley asked the Minister of Community Safety:

(1) Whether the South African Police Service gave authority to a certain person, whose name has been furnished to the Minister’s department for the purpose of his reply, to install any blue light or siren device into or onto his private vehicle(s); if so, (a) what were the conditions and (b) what are the further relevant details in this regard; if not,

(2) whether SAPS is aware that such an installation has taken place?
The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

6. The South African Police Service informed me that:

   (1) The South African Police Service did not authorize the instalment of any blue light or siren into or onto the private vehicle(s) of the named person.
QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE:

†Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker and the hon Premier. Hon Premier, my question is do you or don’t you and your executives support the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment Act? [Interjections.] Yes, well you are not the Premier. Let the Premier answer. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†An HON MEMBER: Why are you laughing at her? Is she a joke?

†The PREMIER: We supported the broad framework contained in the Act but when we saw the codes that had been released under the Act we realised that it was just another trick to concentrate power in the hands of the Minister so that he could re-enrich the ANC’s cronies.

†An HON MEMBER: Yo.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Uys.

†Mr P UYS: Thank you very much, hon Premier. That is a short answer meaning you do not support the Act. Hon Premier, in this House you on 17 October supported the amendment bill and the National Assembly opposed it. Hon Premier, are you trying to mislead this House or the public? [Interjections.]

†The PREMIER: The answer is no, Mr Speaker. The answer is no. We were prepared after discussions with Minister Rob Davies to give the government the benefit of the doubt that they wanted to move away from strict racial quotas and the re-empowerment of the already wealthy. Our spokespeople had had discussions with Minister Rob Davies and we were convinced that they in good faith were trying to move to the BBBEE proposals supported by the National Development Plan. We support those proposals. We support the National Development Plan, and after discussions with Minister Davies we believed that in good faith the national government was going to move towards that kind of framework, but of course after the Bill was passed in or voted on in the National Assembly, the codes were released early in October. When we saw the codes they enabled the re-enrichment of people who had already benefited from equity share transfers up to the value of R50 million to still be regarded as disempowered and disadvantaged. That is purely a crony enrichment scheme and obviously you cannot support that and the National Development Plan opposes that. So, the real scandal of this whole issue is that the ANC passes legislation and codes that expressly undermine the National Development Plan even though the National Development Plan has unanimously been accepted by all parties in Parliament.

†An HON MEMBER: Phew!

*An HON MEMBER: Shame!

*An HON MEMBER: You are lying man.
The SPEAKER: Last chance, hon mem Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Premier, will you give this House the assurance that although the DA did not support the Act, you as Premier and the executive, your executive here, will 100% implement the Act in this province.

The PREMIER: Which Act? I do not know which Act the ...

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, it is a follow-up. It was ... [Interjections.] I am not allowed to ask a different question ...

The PREMIER: ... The BBBEE Act.

The SPEAKER: Order, order.

The PREMIER: It was the BBBEE Act. Now it is not the Employment Equity Act, it is the BBBEE Act, and those are two fundamentally different Acts. The BBBEE Act empowers and enables a code of good practice which in fact we have kept by and in fact have met very substantially in the awarding of tenders and contracts. What we fundamentally oppose is the granting of points for the re-enrichment of people who are already very wealthy and cannot be described as impoverished or disadvantaged, and the entrenchment of the ownership element that adds no value to job creation or to skills development and undermines the equity equivalence of that process. We, therefore, have a very clear position on this and we do have codes of good practice. We support codes of good practice in principle. We believe that they should be incentive driven and our procurement shows that we have achieved very good outcomes as far as that is concerned, certainly better than the ANC when they were in government.

Mr P UYS: So we implement the Act [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon mem Ms Hani, over to you.

Ms V HANI: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Can the hon Premier please inform this legislature what she has done in the Western Cape Provincial Government since the independent Auditor General identified wide-ranging regression in the province and ... Interjections.] Regression, yes ... in the province and overall stagnation [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, order.

Ms V HANI: ... and overall stagnation in her leadership?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, there was no regression in the findings for this province this year. Quite the opposite. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.
†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You have the wrong year.

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Ms Hani.

†Ms V HANI: [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, I will repeat again. Will she improve her attendance in the legislature in trying to address the stagnation in the leadership in this province?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Different question. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†An HON MEMBER: It is not.

†Ms V HANI: No. No.

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, order. Order. Order. [Interjections.] Hon mem Mr Skwatsha. [Interjections.] Minister Botha, order.

†The PREMIER: As a recall and because I anticipated this question coming up I have all the statistics here with me, and in fact, out of 23 sittings I attended all except four and several of those were because I was attending things like the President’s Co-ordinating Council and other issues relating to the work that I have to do in the national government. I looked over at the President’s question time and the President missed 25% of his question time [Interjections.] and he only ... [Interjections.] he only, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Corruption is a full time job.

†The PREMIER: Corruption is a full time job, Mr Speaker. The President missed 25% of his question time, but the truth is that while I have many question days, in fact I have 23 sittings day in the legislature and I missed four of those, the President has exactly four questions sessions during the whole year ... [Interjections.] ... four question sessions in the whole year and no questions without notice, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon mem Mr Uys. Hon members, order. Order. Hon mem Ms Hani, you will get your last chance. Order, sit down please. No, no, sit down. Take your seat please.

†The PREMIER: Yes, let me compare apples with apples, let me compare apples with apples, Mr Speaker. Let us compare this premiership with other premierships. In Mpumalanga the Premier missed 68% of the sittings ... [Interjections.] of the legislature ... [Interjection.] ... 68% of sittings of the legislature [Interjections.]. In fact, we have more sitting days, we have 23 sitting days ...

†Mr H P GEYER: That is right.
†The PREMIER: ... which is the most of any parliamentary legislature in the country ...

†Mr H P GEYER: Viva!

†Mr P UYS: You were only ...

†The PREMIER: ... and out of the much reduced number of days the Mpumalanga Premier missed 68% of the days, Limpopo 45% of the days, North West 31% of the days and I can go on [Interjections.], I can go on, Mr Speaker. So, if the hon mem Mr Skwatsha ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Order.

†The PREMIER: ... hon mem Mr Skwatsha wants to compare apples with apples, those are the ‘vrot’ apples in the ANC’s barrel. [Interjections]

†The SPEAKER: Order, last chance hon mem Ms Hani. Order.

†Ms V HANI: Mr Speaker, due to her response it shows really that there is lack of leadership from her and ...

†The SPEAKER: Order.

†Ms V HANI: ... can she, the Premier indicate ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon mem Ms Hani. These are questions to the Premier, not statements, and if you miss ... Order, order. [Interjections.]

†Ms V HANI: This is my response.

†The SPEAKER: What is your question? What is the question?

†Mr G C R HASKIN: ... This is my question. Due to the response can the Premier indicate to the people ...

†The SPEAKER: What is the question? [Interjections.] Take your seat.

†Ms V HANI: This is the question. You have to stop and listen.

†Mr P UYS: Give her a chance.

†The SPEAKER: Then put your question.

†Ms V HANI: Can the Premier indicate to the people ... [Interjections.] ... of this province when she will follow the advice of people like Moshoeshoe Monare that says she must leave quietly and please resign ... [Interjections.] ... because she cannot even answer the questions. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, order hon members. Hon mem Mr Uys. [Interjections.] Order, hon mem Mr Uys. Hon Premier, over to you.
†The PREMIER: That is an entirely new question, Mr Speaker, but I am happy to respond to it as follows: I have learnt over many years that newspaper columnists and political commentators and editors are often quite far away from the truth and they are quite a distance from reality. I can also say that it is interesting when the editor of a newspaper that is on its way out, gives us advice on when to leave. That is the most interesting part of all. [Interjections.] But let me respond to this alleged regression. The Auditor General says in his official report for our audit outcomes in the 2012/13 year which is the year under review. He says there has been an overall improvement ...

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Skwatsha, I did not allow you to speak and if you are going to carry on and undermine my authority, definitely ... Hon mem Mr Skwatsha, take your seat. You do not just jump up and speak in the House. I did not allow you to speak now. Take your seat. Take your seat, hon mem Mr Skwatsha. Proceed, hon Premier.

†The PREMIER: The Auditor General says, and we have not even held a press conference on this, there has been an overall improvement in the provincial audit outcomes, fifty per cent, 50 auditees. 50% of auditees achieved a clean audit outcome and I want to tell you, Mr Speaker, 100% of our government departments achieved an unqualified outcome, which is an extraordinary outcome, including five that sustained their clean audit outcomes of the previous year. If this is regression I do not know what progress is. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Order. Hon mem Mr Haskin, over to you. [Interjections.] Order Minister. Is it a point of order, hon mem Mr Skwatsha?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

†The SPEAKER: Okay.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, do you understand the meaning of the word impartial?

†The SPEAKER: Can you take your seat. This is not time for questions to the Speaker. Take your seat. Hon mem Mr Haskin, over to you. Hon mem Mr Wiley, over to you.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, the rules of this House are very clear about standing up on frivolous points of order. This is a frivolous point of order ...

†The SPEAKER: Yes, now ...

†Mr M G E WILEY: ... and on top it impugns the integrity of the Chair. I believe there is a motion of censorship ...

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon mem Mr Wiley. That is why I did not allow the hon mem Mr Skwatsha to carry on, because it is not a point of order at all. Hon mem Mr Haskin, over to you.
Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Thank you, hon Premier. Madam Premier, with regards to the Commission of Enquiry, what are the daily or monthly compensations fees that are being paid to advocate Pikoli and to retired judge Kate O'Regan on a daily or monthly basis whether the is sitting or not? Thank you.

The PREMIER: I am not in any way aware of people being paid on days the Commission is not sitting, but I do know that the money that has been allocated for the Khayelitsha Commission of Enquiry is R8.3 million, and we have a situation here where Mr Pikoli is paid at the rate of a junior advocate, junior counsel as I understand it, as indicated by Minister Radebe. The junior counsels are paid between R15,000 and R18,000 per day, while senior counsels are paid between R24,000 and R36,000 per day and so we have a situation where advocate Pikoli has agreed to be paid on the level of a junior counsel, so that is the level at which advocate Pikoli is being paid. Retired judge O'Regan is not being paid anything at this stage, because she is still awaiting reply to statutory permissions to serve on this Commission of Enquiry so she cannot claim any remuneration until she has done that. Let me also say that the Minister of Justice has told the National Assembly, Mr Speaker, that President Zuma’s personal lawyer Mr Michael Hulley has been paid R8.8 million of taxpayers’ money so far. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon mem Mr Haskin. Order.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Order hon members. Hon mem Ms Brown, order.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. In respect of the Premier’s answer may I then ask at what point will we get a finalisation of judge Kate O'Regan’s fees and will that be paid out of the R8.3 million that has been allocated in this financial year for the Commission or will it be over and above that?

The PREMIER: Well, we certainly do not know when national ministers or other office bearers will ever answer their letters. That is part of the challenge that we face in trying to get co-operative governance working, and we certainly cannot answer when the Minister will reply to the request regarding judge O'Regan. We are very grateful to her, in the event of not having had a reply to that letter, for working as hard as she is on the Commission in any event. So we cannot answer that question because we do not know what the national minister is going to do.

The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Ncedana, over to you. Chance not taken. Hon mem Mr Walters.

Mr M C WALTERS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I want to know whether the reported mismanagement and corruption at national level over the past 20 years has had any impact on the development of the Western Cape? Would the Premier like to comment on that?
†Mr P UYS: Only the Western Cape's corruption. [Interjections.].

†The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I think the areas where we have felt the most impact are the areas ... [Interjections.] ... that we do not really control in terms of our constitutional mandate. So we have a major problem of crime and gangsterism ... [Interjections.].

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†The PREMIER: ... and drug trading and illegal shebeens ...

†The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Skwatsha, order.

†The PREMIER: We have a major problem of crime which is largely substance abuse based, gangsterism and other problems in the Western Cape, which only the police are in a position to control and monitor. We have major problems because of the effective collapse of the police hierarchy and instability in that process. That has had very serious implications and ramifications for the Western Cape, because we only have oversight powers. Of course, that has led to the national minister contesting our exercising our oversight powers at every single turn, which has made things extremely difficult. It has therefore taken us five years to be able to even get the ball rolling as far as effective oversight is concerned. I would say it has been a very serious challenge, together with the allegations that there is a lot of corruption in the police force and because we have really battled to get oversight mechanisms in place. Because of the resistance of the national minister we are unable to probe as we should probe allegations of corruption, for example in the SAPS. So that has been a huge problem.

The other problem has been the collapse really of public works. The collapse of public works has had extraordinary ramifications for the Western Cape. I think we saw it most clearly in for example Grabouw, the problems around the school. We have been asking for many years for the transfer of a piece of land to build a new school; we have not so much as had a reply to that request and that can be multiplied across all departments whether it is Health, whether it is Human Settlements, where we depend upon the efficient and appropriate functioning of national Public Works. Part of that is due to plain inefficiency. The other part is due to alleged corruption, where deals are done that benefit certain people, and it is very difficult to disaggregate which are which. We have also had enormous problems, for example with regenerating the fishing harbours, which can really be the economic engines of many small towns in the Western Cape. That is because of the huge resistance that we are getting both from Public Works and from the Department of Agriculture of Forestry and Fisheries, which makes it impossible for us to fulfil our mandate, even though, ironically, the mandate for fishing harbours lies with local government.

So we have had enormous resistance to many developmental issues from the national government, much arising from just inefficiency and sometimes plain incompetence, but often intermeshed with profound allegations of corruption.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Any follow-up, hon mem Walters?
The PREMIER: Well there have been pleasant challenges and there have been unpleasant challenges.

An HON MEMBER: ... DA led caucus. [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: I think one of the most pleasant challenges has been transforming a manifesto into a plan and landing it in government, in the structures of government and in the budget of government. That has been an enormous challenge on which many of us have worked very much, with a lot of excellent advice. I think we have succeeded in doing that and that has been very fulfilling and very exciting, but it was an enormous challenge. I think the challenge that has been most difficult is as I have said earlier, the challenge of working with national government; it has been an enormous challenge in many areas, and I do not think because there is a deliberate sense of undermining cooperative governance; it is just that we do not get replies to letters, things are not done on time, tenders are allowed to lapse at critical moments; the red tape is absolutely impenetrable and it is very, very complex just getting things functional.

The other major challenge I would say and the major depressing challenge is to see how much of our budget we spend on things that could have been prevented, especially with respect to the health budget. Conditions arising from the choices people make in their lives: from smoking, from exercise, unhealthy living, unsafe sex. Huge amounts, billions of rands are poured into dealing with the consequence of individual choices that could have been different and could have enabled us to release the money for conditions that cannot be prevented. I am always amazed how people born with whatever disabilities that so many of our young people are born with, are often pushed to the margins of society and cannot get the treatment that they could get in many other countries because we just do not have the budget to do it. It is because we have not yet realised we have to get across to people in this country that individual choices have social consequences, and making a selfish choice for yourself can really detrimentally effect somebody else’s life. We have not reached that point in our country, which is a great, great challenge. In fact, we put oil on the squeakiest wheel, which is often the least needy wheel in terms of conditions that could not be prevented. So that is one of the negative things, Mr Speaker.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Can I ask a small question? Yes? Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Hon mem Ms Hartnick.
†Ms J L HARTNICK: A follow-up. What have you found to be the most rewarding part of your job – challenges?

†The PREMIER: Well, I must say that there are two things that I found very particularly rewarding, Mr Speaker. The one is how we have gelled as a government. I think that this cabinet is really a team and we form an extraordinary team with the caucus as well. They do not shirk their oversight duties, but there is no division or tension between the caucus and the executive. We have built a really strong team which is a great, great plus and it has brought a lot satisfaction. People have been very, very committed to this team and all brought their part, no-one is protecting their silos … No-one is protecting their turf. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order. Order. Hon members, order.

†The PREMIER: It has also been very gratifying … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

†The PREMIER: … the extent to which we formed a team with the top officials across the board who have really given of their all to seek to achieve our objective of being the best run regional government in the world. We accept that we have a way to go but we are making progress towards that goal every day and that obviously is very fulfilling.

The other big, big thing I would single out is to see the turnaround in disadvantaged schools, the gradual improvement in literacy and numeracy results and particularly the reduction in a number of what we call under-performing schools, especially those in Khayelitsha. It has been a very gratifying thing to see and I certainly hope that the trend continues. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

†Mr P UYS: Just a point of order please.

†The SPEAKER: Okay.

†Mr P UYS: I just want to point out to you that in terms of the questions to the Premier you changed the order. When the ANC previously asked to change the order because one of our members are running late you disallowed it. Now you change of the order of the DA and I want to just put that on record.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you. We will record that the hon mem Mr Uys … [Interjections.] Order, hon members, order.
Questions and replies as received from departments

QUESTIONS

For written reply

Traffic violations: 1 December 2013 – 7 January 2014

1. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Community Safety:

How many traffic violations on Western Cape roads have been recorded as (a) driving under the influence of alcohol, (b) excessive speeding, (c) dangerous overtaking and (d) reckless or negligent driving for the period 1 December 2013 to 7 January 2014?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

The following figures are only for roads policed by Provincial Traffic Services:

1. (a) 300
   (b) 30 399
   (c) 731
   (d) 13

Traffic violators: 2012/13 festive season

2. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Community Safety:

(1) (a) How many traffic violators were (i) arrested, (ii) charged, (iii) prosecuted and (iv) convicted for moving violations, (b) how many of these drivers who wanted to continue driving were subjected to and re-tested for both their learners and drivers licences for (i) competence, (ii) compliance and (iii) rehabilitation for the 2012/13 festive season?

(2) how many traffic violators were (a) arrested, and (b) charged for moving violations for the 2013/14 festive season?
The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

The following figures are only for roads policed by Provincial Traffic Services:

2. (1) (a) (i) 368 (including 16 pedestrians)
   (ii) 18 602
   (iii) Dates for Court appearances still to be finalised
   (iv) Still pending – dependant on court judgement
   (b) (i) not applicable
   (ii) not applicable
   (iii) not applicable

(2) (a) 419
   (b) 2 243

Festive season road death statistics

3. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

   (1) What are the festive season road death statistics for (a) vehicle crashes, and, (b) pedestrian accidents for the period 1 December 2013 to 13 January 2014 on the Western Capes roads and what are the relevant details;

   (2) (a) how many of the road fatalities recorded in the Western Cape between 1 December 2013 and 13 January 2014 were pedestrians; (b) what has been the leading class of fatalities and why; (c) what interventions has your department implemented; (d) how many of these fatalities are recorded as drinking and walking (jay walking), and (e) what road safety leadership strategies are in place to address human behaviour and give attention to this problem in the future?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

3. Information made available to my department by Forensic Pathology Services, indicates the following:

   (1) (a) A total of 203 vehicles were involved in fatal road crashes during this Festive Season period, and
(b) A total of 73 pedestrians were recorded as fatalities during pedestrian accidents.

2) (a) In the said period 73 pedestrian road crash fatalities were recorded.

(b) Pedestrians remain the leading class of road crash fatality. This can be attributed to higher volumes of traffic on our roads during the Festive Season period as well as higher numbers of pedestrians along residential streets and main roads. Alcohol also plays a significant role in pedestrian fatalities during this period.

The department, together with municipalities and the CSIR, launched a study in 2012 to collect data on pedestrian crashes in order to identify the top hazardous locations for pedestrians.

Funds have been budgeted for in 2013/14 and 2014/15 to implement mitigating projects, including engineering and education interventions.

(c) 65.8% of the pedestrian fatalities are recorded between the hours of 18:00 and 06:00 which indicates a trend relating to jay-walking (drinking and walking). As with all road crash fatalities the final causes of death and the results attributed thereto is within the SAPS competencies.

(d) There are constant educational interventions being carried out targeting schools and various other institutions to educate the public about road safety matters and further entrench the notion of creating safer road users, particularly pedestrians.

(e) An additional intervention which was launched in October 2013 to address human behaviour, was the Passenger Safety campaign entitled “Buckle Up – It only takes a second to save a life”. Safely Home launched the campaign based on evidence showing that passenger road crash fatalities served as the second most critical road user group.

The campaign which will continue for the rest of this year aims to change not only the behaviour of drivers but also passengers and create a culture of seatbelt compliance. Enforcement efforts have also been heightened in respect of ensuring this compliance.

On 14 November 2013, Safely Home in partnership with the Western Cape Religious Leaders Forum (WCRLF) launched the Road Safety Ambassadors’ Pledge campaign at an inter-faith event, also to which the chairman and members of the Standing Committee were also invited.
The campaign seeks to change the behaviour of all road users in the Western Cape. This will be done through having them commit to ensuring that they follow the rules of the road and respect other road users. The partnership with the WCRLF is aimed at reaching the local communities through the various religious denominations. This partnership is one of many that is to be formed. Other institutions include media houses, schools and universities, and hospitals to name but a few.

The Pledge will encourage drivers to be more cautious within the road reserve and to pay particular attention to pedestrians whilst pedestrians will be made aware of safer practices when they enter the road reserve.
Questions and replies as received from departments

QUESTIONS

For written reply

Upgrade of road between George Airport and Blanco

1. Mr E J von Brandis asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

   What is the (a) status of the upgrades of the road between George Airport and Blanco, (b) projected date of completion of this project; and (c) total cost of the upgrading?

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

1. a) The contractor has been appointed and the work should start by middle February 2014;
   b) The projected date of completion of this project is May 2015, and
   c) The total cost of the upgrading is R105 million.

Fatalities and injuries during the festive period

2. Mr E J von Brandis asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

   (1) How (a) many (i) fatalities and (ii) injuries were reported during the festive season, for the period 1 December 2013 – 15 January 2014, in the Western Cape and (b) do these numbers compare to the same period for (i) 2009, (ii) 2010, (iii) 2011 and (iv) 2012;

   (2) whether these numbers fall within the targets as set out by the Safely Home Campaign; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

2. (1) (a) (i) 192 Fatalities
   (ii) 73 Serious Injuries and 377 slight injuries.*

   *Cognizance must be taken that not all the data relating to road crash injuries for the 2013/2014 Festive Season has been captured to date and as a result the injury figures above are subject to change.
An analysis of the figures reveals the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2009/10</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Road Crash Fatality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statistics</td>
<td>229</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Upon analysis one is able to realize that the 2013/2014 Festive Season period was quite critical in the sense that it constituted the second highest amount of road crash fatalities in a consecutive four year period, standing at 192 fatalities. This feat undermines the PSO3 Objective of attaining a 50% reduction in road crash fatalities by 2014, in addition to keeping to the annual trend of a year-on-year reduction.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Road Crash Injury</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statistics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serious</td>
<td>631</td>
<td>2454</td>
<td>672</td>
<td>2297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slight</td>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>604</td>
<td>2197</td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serious</td>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>1576</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slight</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTERPELLATIONS UNDER NAME OF MEMBER
(as put to relevant Minister)

Beerwinkel, C F –
Education ........................................... 2367, 2407, 2422, 2428, 2431, 2432
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .................... 3889, 4385, 4598, 4599
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 2598

Bevu, T N –
Education ........................................................................... 3846, 3850
Health ................................................................................. 2542, 2546
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3014
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 1619, 3293, 4355

Brown, T L –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .......... 2469
Premier ........................................................................... 4364

Du Toit Marais, A J
Community Safety ......................................................... 3914, 3913, 4589
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................ 2358, 2359, 2360, 2367, 2368, 2417, 2419
Health ................................................... 17, 81, 83, 192, 515, 583, 1245, 1361, 1467, 1497, 2545, 2602, 3134
................................................... 3136, 3228, 3295, 3326, 3332, 3447, 3484, 3486, 3708, 3776, 3828, 4058
................................................... 4347, 4387, 4388, 4609
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 3258, 3259
................................................... 3261
Social Development .......... 302, 1022, 1419, 1657, 1658, 2651, 2652, 3754, 4163, 5220
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 2548, 3706

Eloff, E H –
Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 2434
Education ........................................................................... 2366

Figlan, A M –
Housing ........................................................................... 3749, 3833, 4383, 4384, 4597, 4598

Fritz, A T –
Social Development ................................................................ 3753

Geyer, H P –
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........... 4387

Hani, V –
Health ........................................................................... 2601

Hartnick, J L –
Community Safety ................................................................ 4511
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 1311, 1405, 1661, 4374
Education .................................................................................. 147, 968, 1109
Housing ...................................................................................... 2425
Premier ...................................................................................... 3358, 3703

Haskin, G C R –
Community Safety ................................................................. 3487, 3524, 3526, 3912, 3914

Jacobs, P M –
Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................................... 1464
Housing ...................................................................................... 151, 184, 679, 865, 1100

Labuschagne C –
Education .................................................................................. 2404, 2423, 2541, 3778, 3849, 4368, 4818
Social Development .................................................................. 3368, 3369, 3371
Transport and Public Works ................................................... 3446, 3873

Lentit, R B –
Community Safety ................................................................. 3915, 3919, 4603
Housing ...................................................................................... 4604
Social Development .................................................................. 3018, 5189

Madikizela, B S –
Housing ...................................................................................... 3752

Magaxa, K E –
Housing ...................................................................................... 3748, 4591, 5191

Magwaza, N P –
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 3772
Social Development .................................................................. 1658, 3370, 4517

Majola, T R –
Education .................................................................................. 356
Housing ...................................................................................... 8
Social Development .................................................................. 3019, 4183

Mbalo, B G –
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 3131

McKenzie, P C –
Community Safety ................................................................. 2422, 2548, 3487, 3526, 3842, 3846, 3913, 3916
Health ......................................................................................... 519
Housing ...................................................................................... 3751
Transport and Public Works ................................................... 2642, 2643

Ncedana, M –
Education .................................................................................. 2406, 2469, 2539, 2542
Health ......................................................................................... 3227, 3228, 3324, 3326, 3707, 4763
Housing ...................................................................................... 3747, 3748, 3750, 3831, 3834, 4371
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......................... 3403
.......................................................... 3408, 4646
Social Development .................................................................................. 3019
Transport and Public Works ........................................................................ 2597, 2599, 3363

Ozinsky, M –
Agriculture ................................................................................................. 2372, 2417
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................................................... 3919
Education ................................................................................................... 1414, 3056, 3059, 3776, 3776
Health ........................................................................................................ 2364, 2420
Housing ....................................................................................................... 3751
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 1282, 1311
.......................................................... 1357, 1410, 1547, 1549, 1620, 2400, 2403, 2645, 2650, 3013, 3017, 3022, 3025
.......................................................... 3851, 3891, 3894, 3891, 3895
Premier ...................................................................................................... 1242, 1278, 3137, 3138, 3139, 3293, 324, 3356, 3358, 4049
Transport and Public Works ......................................................................... 1617, 2416, 3365, 3705

Prins, E –
Agriculture ................................................................................................. 754, 2398
Health ........................................................................................................... 143
Housing ....................................................................................................... 1104
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 2421

Skwatsha, M –
Agriculture ................................................................................................. 2371
Community Safety ...................................................................................... 2422
Education ................................................................................................... 4365, 4607
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ............................................ 2430
Health ......................................................................................................... 2543, 3135, 3226, 3227, 3293, 3296, 3446, 3485, 4225, 4770
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 3408
Social Development ..................................................................................... 2653
Premier ....................................................................................................... 249
Transport and Public Works ......................................................................... 1628, 4158, 4605

Stali, Z C –
Cultural Affairs and Sport .......................................................................... 1361, 1407, 1659, 1661, 2355, 2356, 2358, 2360
.......................................................... 2410, 2419
Education ................................................................................................... 4366
Premier ....................................................................................................... 3703
Social Development ..................................................................................... 1242, 3752, 3755
Transport and Public Works ....................................................................... 2550, 3360, 3362, 3397, 3442, 3446, 3745, 3836
.......................................................... 3869, 3871, 3872, 4351, 4383, 4594

Strachan, G R –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .......................................... 18, 81
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 453
Premier ....................................................................................................... 3,187, 352

Tingwe, M
Education .................................................................................................... 4600
Uys, P –
Agriculture............................................................2372
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...........2369, 2371
........................................................................... 2372, 2426, 2427, 3260, 3328, 3404, 4367
Premier....................................................................4360, 4362

Van Zyl, J A –
Education ................................................................3057, 4053, 4718
Health ........................................................................3294, 4371
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........1558, 2647
............................................................................ 3130, 3771, 3774

Visser, J J
Agriculture...............................................................2417, 4370, 4373
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................2365, 3400
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.........2402
............................................................................ 2604, 2607, 2608, 3025, 3330, 3406, 3774, 4651

Von Brandis, E J –
Community Safety ....................................................3918, 3919
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ..............................................2373, 2428, 2465, 2644, 3831
............................................................................ 3887, 4513, 4595, 4766, 4815
Transport and Public Works ....1620, 2374, 2415, 2599, 3362, 3398, 3706, 3742, 3743
............................................................................ 3745, 3871, 5185

Walters, M C –
Agriculture.............................................................13, 964, 2361, 2374, 2396, 2397, 2399, 2416, 4388
Community Safety ................................................................1364
Cultural Affairs and Sport ..............................................453, 460, 2409, 2411
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .........88, 356
............................................................................ 407, 1062, 1549, 3016, 3132, 3894
Transport and Public Works .............................................2366, 3441, 3443

Wiley, M G E –
Agriculture.............................................................2368
Community Safety ................................................................2422, 3526, 3843
Cultural Affairs and Sport ..............................................2357, 4229
Education ....................................................................3058
Premier........................................................................674, 3139
Social Development ......................................................5222
Transport and Public Works .............................................410, 861, 1282, 1628

Witbooi, J –
Cultural Affairs and Sport ...........................................4155
Health........................................................................ 90, 756, 812, 1066, 2362
Social Development ................................................................588
QUESTIONS
(Oral and Written: as put to relevant Minister under name of Member)

Beerwinkel, C F –
Agriculture ................................................................. 984
Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 1667, 2626
Education .... 960, 1117, 1118, 1178, 1179, 1257, 1258, 2388, 2392, 2393, 2531, 2533
................................................................. 2577, 2578, 2611, 2613, 2657, 2658, 2659, 2672, 3877
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .......... 2635, 2683, 2705, 2706, 2707
................................................................. 3342, 3156, 3219, 3222, 3270, 3416, 3417, 3462, 3494, 3725, 3726
................................................................. 4336, 4337, 4402, 4545
Health ........................................................................ 3475
Housing ....................................................................... 1287
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 600, 690
................................................................. 691, 722, 723, 802, 803, 838, 874, 937, 960, 999, 3463
Transport and Public Works ........................................ 1072, 1081, 1117, 3304, 3393

Bevu, T N –
Agriculture .................................................................. 1560
Community Safety ......................................................... 1185, 1264, 3499
Education .................................................................... 1120, 3505, 4106
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........ 2480, 4524, 4526, 4537, 4662
Housing ....................................................................... 3268, 3725
Premier ........................................................................ 1250, 1425, 3709
Social Development ....................................................... 707, 708
Transport and Public Works ........................................ 1122, 1559, 2481, 3303

Boesak, A A –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .................. 100
Health ........................................................................ 45, 96
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 99

Brown, L –
Agriculture ..................................................................... 4580
Community Safety .......................................................... 4690, 4774
Education ..................................................................... 5136
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .... 2435, 2436, 2437, 2438, 2487, 2561
................................................................. 3720, 4581, 4664
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3881, 4745
Premier ....................................................................... 326, 367, 368, 439, 464, 469, 594, 595, 697, 1141, 1143
................................................................. 1146, 1176, 1426, 1428, 1458, 1461, 1487, 1550, 1578, 2673, 2698, 2701, 3756
................................................................. 3851, 4255, 4256, 4264, 4308, 4400, 4401, 4725, 4749, 5082
Social Development ........................................................ 4692
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 1567, 5168

Cupido, P W –
Community Safety ......................................................... 448, 449, 544, 849, 883, 1304, 2638, 3100, 3125
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................ 309
Education ..................................................................... 510, 721, 775, 776, 950, 1172, 3240, 3284
Health ................................................................. 1329, 3124, 3285
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............ 600, 689
.................................................................................. 885, 941, 1171, 1328, 2639, 3126, 3881
Social Development ................................................................................. 951
Transport and Public Works .................................................................. 502, 503, 543

Du Toit Marais, A J –
Community Safety ........................................................... 3428, 3722, 4730, 4732, 5155, 5156, 5230
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 2474, 3875, 4587
Education ..................................................................................... 360, 1641
Health ........................................................................................... 103, 108, 222, 374, 424, 426, 511, 546, 797, 806, 807
........................................................................................... 856, 997, 1135, 1136, 1209, 1221, 1255, 1256, 1292, 1293, 1320, 1373, 1404
........................................................................................... 1437, 1438, 1563, 1564, 1616, 2475, 2555, 2609, 2615, 3116, 3151, 3152
........................................................................................... 3427, 3901, 4073, 4076, 4415, 4418, 4811, 4843, 4846, 5139, 5213, 5226, 5228
Housing .......................................................................................... 3496, 3531
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3533, 3535
........................................................................................... 3728
Social Development .......................................................................... 23, 225, 226, 379, 484, 782, 820, 823, 827, 872, 1181, 1183
........................................................................................... 1222, 1321, 1372, 1431, 1470, 1630, 1664, 1666, 3117, 3473, 3491, 3496
........................................................................................... 4183, 4509, 4574, 4586, 4812

Eloff, E H –
Agriculture ..................................................................................... 211, 2672, 3246
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........................................... 876
Health ........................................................................................... 876, 1562, 1563
Transport and Public Works .................................................................. 217, 946, 1270, 1292

Figlan, A M –
Community Safety ........................................................................... 3531, 3739
Health ........................................................................................... 3471, 3930, 4187, 4188
Housing .......................................................................................... 3416, 3422, 3452, 3453, 3493, 3527, 3528, 3536, 3897, 3900, 3930
........................................................................................... 3897, 3899, 4075, 4078, 4541, 4545, 4660, 5047, 5078, 5142, 5147
........................................................................................... 5148, 5154, 5168, 5183, 5198, 5214
Social Development ........................................................................... 3471, 3490, 5181, 5182

Gabru, Y –
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 876, 938
Education ......................................................................................... 26, 73, 206, 435, 612, 797, 846, 962, 985
Health ............................................................................................. 393
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3339, 3340
Premier .......................................................................................... 1

Geyer, H P –
Agriculture ...................................................................................... 4190
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................... 5169
Education ........................................................................................ 606, 1381, 1675
Housing .......................................................................................... 4548, 5030, 5032
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 219, 545
........................................................................................... 600, 689, 3155, 3246, 3287, 3304, 3314, 3395, 3396, 3417, 3522, 3716, 3763
........................................................................................... 3784, 3799, 3803, 3838, 4077, 4296, 4780, 5034
Hani, V –
Community Safety .............................................................. 1538, 1742, 2529, 4538
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 2569
Health .................................................................................. 2694, 2696, 3037, 3127, 3128
Social Development ............................................................. 1569, 1706, 2674, 2675, 2698, 4133, 4147
Premier .................................................................................. 3378, 4132, 4146, 4167, 4170

Hartnick, J L –
Agriculture ............................................................................. 957, 4248
Community Safety ................................................................. 3479, 3722, 4210, 4526, 5200, 5231, 5232
Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................................... 122, 348, 833, 849, 859, 885, 993, 1032, 1054, 1055
......................................................................................... 1074, 1086, 1089, 1137, 1148, 1151, 1183, 1238
......................................................................................... 1271, 1272, 1379, 1435, 1642, 4139, 4154, 4339
Education ............................................................................... 181, 364, 390, 480, 712, 790, 857, 992, 1040
......................................................................................... 1073, 1294, 1296, 1495, 1568, 2621, 3478, 3739, 3937, 3938, 4138, 4153
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........................................ 3044, 4212
Health .................................................................................... 712, 4250
Housing .................................................................................. 4120, 4286, 4667
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 4247
Social Development .................................................................. 3355, 3712, 4076, 4211
Premier .................................................................................... 2501, 3118, 4137, 4152, 4233, 4698

Haskin, G C R –
Agriculture ............................................................................. 4282
Community Safety ................................................................. 3431, 3827, 3928
Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................................... 3520
Education ............................................................................... 3477
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........................................ 3520, 4284
Health .................................................................................... 3905, 3922, 3923, 3924
Housing .................................................................................. 3476
Social Development .................................................................. 3711, 3714
Transport and Public Works ..................................................... 3432, 3717, 3759, 3760, 3926

Jacobs, P M –
Community Safety ................................................................. 792, 874
Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................................... 28, 129, 162, 175, 202, 345, 371, 726, 792, 945
......................................................................................... 973, 1260, 1288, 2582, 2627
Education ............................................................................... 1081, 1632, 1633, 1686
Housing .................................................................................. 30, 35, 45, 64, 66, 67, 98, 121, 128, 152, 156, 160, 174, 447, 500
......................................................................................... 501, 714, 715, 836, 873, 1059, 1127, 1128, 1191, 1259, 1390
......................................................................................... 1392, 1440, 1443, 1446, 1447, 1469, 1646, 1647, 1671, 1672
......................................................................................... 1684, 2533, 2534, 2537, 2585, 2586, 2613, 2689
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 1391, 2622
Social Development .................................................................. 725
Transport and Public Works ..................................................... 1684
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne, C</td>
<td>Community Safety, Education</td>
<td>993, 1622, 1624, 3414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>3043, 3885, 3886, 3896</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>3096, 3244, 3347, 3421, 3929, 5244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>2487, 2553, 3029, 3080, 3241, 3426, 3477, 3509, 3938, 3941, 4685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>4686, 4735, 4826</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>3071, 3079, 3107, 3174, 3299, 3302, 3389, 3391, 3475</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3150, 3712, 3714</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>1391, 2622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>3334, 3373, 3375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>3110, 3219, 4794, 5041, 5152, 5165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>3070, 3107, 3150, 3756, 3925, 3941, 5245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magwaza, N P</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3322, 3898</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majola, T R</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1034, 1226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>1227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>2615, 4129, 4143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>696, 1027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>365, 366, 380, 388, 714, 773, 782, 817, 819, 822</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1325, 1327, 1514, 1516, 1557, 1558, 1665, 2687, 3039, 3239, 3352, 3353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3824, 3826, 3839, 4106, 4131, 4145, 4146, 4177, 4240, 4548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbalo, B G</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>3801, 3836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>3769, 3791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>3794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3376</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
McKenzie, P C –  
Community Safety .................. 102, 163, 776, 777, 778, 1081, 1127, 1190, 1614, 1623, 1674  
.......................................................................................................................... 2562, 2684, 3273, 3415, 3431, 3499, 3500, 3532  
Education ............................................................................................................. 3351  
Health ..................................................................................................................... 601, 3391  
Housing .................................................................................................................. 3147, 3530  
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........... 3265, 3534  
Premier ............................................. 98, 1028, 1312  
Transport and Public Works .......................................................... 3151, 3163  

Mqulwana, K A –  
Education ............................................................................................................. 3730  
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ................................................. 860  
Housing .................................................................................................................. 853  
Premier ............................................. 872, 900  
Transport and Public Works .......................................................... 388, 603, 694, 699, 700, 764, 1129, 1132, 1179  
.......................................................................................................................... 1180, 1251, 1252, 1255  

Ncedana, M –  
Community Safety .................. 488, 528, 1631, 3272, 3497, 3721, 3762, 4184, 5157  
Cultural Affairs and Sport ...................................................................................... 488  
Education ............................................................................................................. 3348, 3351  
Health ..................................................................................................................... 1438, 1614, 3301  
Housing .................. 1098, 1139, 1639, 3028, 3066, 3147, 3270, 3335, 3384, 3394, 3713  
.......................................................................................................................... 3723, 3763, 4684, 4733, 5151  
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........... 541, 4241  
.......................................................................................................................... 4733, 4829  
Social Development ............................................................................................. 3299, 3942  
Transport and Public Works .............................................................................. 4824  

Ozinsky, M –  
Agriculture ............................................................................................................. 3933  
Community Safety .................. 1229, 1520, 1536, 3231, 3247, 4713, 4737  
Cultural Affairs and Sport ...................................................................................... 1274, 1668  
Education ............................................................................................................. 1274, 3034, 3765, 3784, 3902, 4065, 4739  
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ................................................. 1274, 1445, 3244, 3342, 3766  
Health ..................................................................................................................... 438, 546, 1240  
Housing ............................................. 1241, 3076, 3143, 3933, 4688  
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........... 1091, 1092  
.......................................................................................................................... 1138, 1157, 1202, 1229, 1261, 1262, 1339, 1374, 1519, 1565, 1678, 2379, 2380  
.......................................................................................................................... 2394, 3036, 3322, 3791  
Premier ............................................. 23, 97, 202, 1114, 1146, 1177, 1224, 1313, 1342  
.......................................................................................................................... 1368, 1395, 1421  
Social Development ............................................................................................. 1240, 3074, 4068, 4712  
Transport and Public Works .............................................................................. 213, 1229, 1566, 1679, 3316, 3757  

Paulse, S U –  
Community Safety ................................................................................................. 176, 389, 1010  
Cultural Affairs and Sport ...................................................................................... 1454, 1456  
Education ............................................................................................................. 140, 168, 1403  
Health ..................................................................................................................... 220
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>1172, 1453, 1485, 1488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>396, 552, 803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prins, E –</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>33, 34, 35, 603, 839, 1038, 1132, 1180, 1182, 1203, 1263, 1265, 1291, 1297, 1568, 1569, 1639, 1641, 1742, 2595, 2596, 2621, 2655, 2680, 2703, 3034, 3035, 3051, 3052, 3066, 3067, 3071, 3072, 3243, 4133, 4134, 4148, 4149, 4181, 4189, 5176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>121, 155, 1321, 1325</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>205, 700</td>
<td>702, 765, 1082, 3112, 3127, 3243, 3265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rossouw, A –</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>3811, 3837, 3886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>1380, 1673</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>79, 803, 997, 998, 1207, 1380, 1399</td>
<td>1435, 1448, 1453, 1462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>164, 607, 720, 954, 955, 1336, 1401, 2478</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>843, 1449</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>41, 4182</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>57, 327, 329, 415</td>
<td>1400, 3101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>1272, 4071</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skwatsha, M –</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1259, 3384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>1288, 3073, 3110, 3230, 3231, 3432, 3479, 4523</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>3268, 3875, 3876</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1006, 2479, 2552, 3236, 3238, 3767, 3787, 4238, 4239, 4272, 4273, 4778</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>1119, 1206</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>2692, 3153, 3311, 3391, 3394, 3508, 4527</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>428, 431, 886, 2614, 3269, 3767, 3931, 3932</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>1159, 2565</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>3792, 3800</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>22, 368, 763, 1029, 1467, 1505, 1551, 3509, 4165, 4521, 4577, 4693, 890, 1194, 1259, 1284, 2667, 2669</td>
<td>492, 528, 951, 1193, 1254, 1290, 1653, 1680, 3535, 3536, 4178, 4666, 4751</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>3284, 4065</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Stali, Z C –**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1224</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>2527, 2528</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>1061,1079, 1204, 1205, 1525, 1666</td>
<td>3284, 4065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry</td>
<td>Pages</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>2525, 2567</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>2620, 3769</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>3488</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1036, 1340</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>2681, 3409, 3412, 3456, 3459, 3519, 3536, 3718, 3719, 4173, 4309, 4310</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strachan, G R</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>44</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>43, 102, 125, 213, 344, 389, 417</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>1418, 471, 473, 541, 610, 611, 841, 842, 849</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>344</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>961</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>201, 531</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tingwe, M</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1557</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>1508, 1510, 2633, 3264, 3415, 4088, 4112, 4114</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>1291, 1320, 1430, 2591</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1473, 2675, 2685, 3028, 3233, 3235, 3347, 3348, 3474</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>3876, 3939, 4087, 4115, 4127, 4141, 4299, 4301, 4308, 4318, 4335</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>4398, 4577, 4644, 4694, 4710, 4711, 4722, 4739</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>1319, 3416</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>1264, 2593, 3263</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>3144, 3145, 3148, 3388</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1249, 1554, 2629, 3063, 3064</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>1290, 2594, 3077, 3419</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Uys, P</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1456, 4213, 4559, 4786, 5175</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>976, 982, 3224, 4345, 4797, 4801, 4847, 5170</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>908, 5178</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1036, 2440, 3225, 3902, 3903, 4252, 4340, 4724, 4799</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>5138, 5171</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>1456, 4213, 4559, 4786, 5175</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>976, 1275, 1394, 1649, 1673, 2460, 2463, 2464, 2489, 3935, 4109</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>1319, 3416</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1456, 4213, 4559, 4786, 5175</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>47, 49, 59</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>47, 49, 59</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>111, 115, 135, 136, 178, 179, 209, 340, 346, 370, 371, 398, 401, 403, 411, 413</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>440, 446, 490, 492, 500, 504, 505, 542, 543, 577, 579, 620, 622, 703, 717, 769</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>770, 808, 810, 811, 820, 835, 850, 885, 886, 942, 944, 959, 1012, 1056, 1058</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1077, 1078, 1084, 1126, 1153, 1154, 1155, 1197, 1202, 1234, 1273, 1275</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>1296, 1308, 1316, 1318, 1337, 1338, 1342, 1376, 1392, 1444, 1457, 1468</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>1475, 1489, 1493, 1512, 1517, 1532, 1567, 1572, 1575, 1613, 1636, 1637, 1648</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Von Brandis, E J –
Agriculture ............................................................................................................ 1266, 1295
Community Safety ................................................................................................. 212, 423, 604, 609
Cultural Affairs and Sport ....................................................................................... 400, 1041, 3919
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .................................................... 350, 781, 823, 1021, 1322, 1324
........................................ 1521, 1522, 1633, 1635, 3119, 3161, 3222, 3341, 3414, 3452, 3482, 3489, 3537
........................................ 4083, 4084, 4101, 4103, 4104, 4175, 4338, 4405, 4411, 4412, 4543, 4544
........................................ 4575, 4660, 4661, 4682, 4772, 4784, 4830, 5158
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............. 122, 1266
........................................ 1295, 1315, 1559
Transport and Public Works ............................................................................... 219, 348, 349, 545, 705, 772, 878, 1072, 3120, 3162
........................................ 3245, 3266, 3342, 3379, 3380, 3521, 3760, 3873, 3897, 3924, 3919
........................................ 4176, 4265, 4729, 4823, 5159, 5248
Walters, M C –
Agriculture ........................................ 133, 391, 479, 547, 711, 878, 956, 957, 974, 1039, 1187
.............................. 1294, 1298, 1402, 1474, 1475, 1513, 1635, 1674, 2671, 3121, 3156, 3157, 3248
.................................................. 3266, 3382, 3495, 3496, 4076, 4178, 4574, 4659, 5045
Community Safety .......................................................... 3247
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .................... 118, 478, 789, 5042, 5164
Health ........................................................................ 1375, 3731, 3739, 3811, 3836, 3946, 4125, 5136, 5137, 5218, 5219, 5232, 5233
........................................................... 4243, 4278, 4281
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .................. 723, 788
........................................ 878, 940, 1133, 1227, 1511, 3303, 3337, 3344, 3380, 3873, 4576, 4658
Transport and Public Works ................................ 403, 706, 991, 2412, 2413, 4282, 4826, 5167

Wiley, M G E –
Agriculture ................................................................. 2414, 3762, 5162
Community Safety ......................................................... 1, 40, 163, 164, 183, 392, 405, 482, 505, 525, 713
.............................. 948, 1148, 1267, 1277, 1523, 2354, 3123, 3432, 3499, 3856, 3943, 3944
........................................ 3946, 4125, 4129, 4143, 4610, 4698, 4782, 4807, 4808, 4849, 5029, 5045
........................................................... 5136, 5137, 5218, 5219, 5232, 5233
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................ 67, 1020, 1494, 2351, 3123, 3128, 3266, 3343, 4242
........................................................... 4243, 4278, 4281
Education ........................................................................ 362, 482, 2353, 5163
Health ........................................................................... 879
Housing .......................................................................... 132, 881
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 3382, 3502, 4192, 5029
Premier ........................................................................ 717, 1031, 1536, 3710
Social Development ....................................................... 130, 1268, 1285, 3500, 4222
Transport and Public Works .................................. 2, 182, 391, 404, 450, 635, 1626, 3535, 3719
........................................................... 4064, 4725

Witbooi, J –
Agriculture .................................................................... 582
Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................. 1667, 1668, 2636, 2637, 2638, 2690, 3111, 4105
........................................................... 4120, 4121, 4123, 4128, 4142, 4179
Education .................................................................... 3430, 4399
Health ........................................................................ 31, 32, 436, 474, 724, 799, 800, 1075, 1076, 1165, 1191
........................................................... 1378, 1471, 1507, 1615, 2528, 2529, 2568, 2611, 2655, 2656
QUESTIONS TO PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Beerwinkel, C F ................................................................. 52, 613, 3288, 3289
Bevu, T N ................................................................. 54, 895, 3166, 4193, 4553
Brown, L .................................................... 170, 1384, 1525, 2622, 3164, 3318, 3319, 3811
Du Toit Marais, A J ......................................................... 1004, 1681, 2624, 3321, 4197
Eloff, E H ................................................................. 1644, 2623
Figlan, A M ................................................................. 3436, 3514
Gabru, Y ................................................................. 54, 498
Geyer, H P .................................................... 493, 786, 1531, 3288, 4550, 4551, 4553
Hartnick, J L .................................................... 787, 897, 1047, 1389, 3290, 3911, 5242
Haskin, G C R ................................................................. 3517, 3817, 5240
Hani, V ................................................................. 3861, 5236
Jacobs, P M ................................................................. 786, 1681, 1682, 2377
Labuschagne, C ................................................................. 56, 172, 498, 614, 1050, 1682, 4675
Lentit, R B ................................................................. 3513
Magaxa K E ................................................................. 3515, 4673
Magwaza, N P .................................................... 383, 783, 1198, 1387, 1642, 4554
Majola, T R ................................................................. 384
Mbalo, B G ................................................................. 3865
McKenzie, P C .................................................... 171, 1002, 1300, 1680, 2374, 2375, 2376, 3041, 3168
................................................................. 3169, 3170, 3437
Mqulwana, K A ................................................................. 494, 1048
Ncedana, M ................................................................. 3168, 3733, 3736, 3862, 4672
Ozinsky, M ................................................................. 615, 1046, 1645, 2374, 3173, 3435
Prins, E ................................................................. 1299
Rossouw, A ................................................................. 1301, 3165, 3733, 3735
Skwatsha, M ................................................................. 1529, 2361, 3906, 3910, 4549
Stali, Z C ................................................................. 3319, 4195
Tingwe, M ................................................................. 2494
Uys, P ................................................................. 1200, 3910, 5235
Van Zyl, J A ................................................................. 1199
Visser, J J ................................................................. 53, 170, 1645, 3040, 3737, 4555, 4556, 4558
Von Brandis, E J ................................................................. 1200, 1386, 2378, 3436, 3817, 4677
Walters, M C ................................................................. 1528, 3042, 5240
Wiley, M G E .................................................... 386, 617, 894, 1199, 1299, 2497, 3171, 3172, 3173, 4194
Witbooi, J ................................................................. 1001, 2491, 3039, 3512

(xiv)