CABINET

The Premier ......................................................... Ms O H Maree (Zille)
Minister of Health ...................................................... Mr T L Botha
Minister of Agriculture ............................................. Mr H G van Rensburg
Minister of Transport and Public Works ......................... Mr R V Carlisle
Minister of Community Safety ............................... Mr D Plato
Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism . ................................................................. Mr A R Winde
Minister of Social Development .................................. Mr A T Fritz
Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....................... Mr A W Bredell
Minister of Housing ................................................. Mr B S Madikizela
Minister of Education ................................................. Mr D A C Grant
Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport .......................... Mr I H Meyer

OFFICE-BEARERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

Speaker ................................................................. Mr T R Majola
Leader of Government Business .................................. Mr T L Botha
Deputy Speaker ....................................................... Mr P J C P Pretorius
Leader of the Opposition .......................................... Ms L Brown
Chief Whip: DA ......................................................... Ms A Rossouw
Chief Whip: Opposition ............................................... Mr P Uys
Secretary ............................................................... Mr P G Williams
MEMBERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

PARTIES:
Democratic Alliance = DA
African National Congress = ANC
Congress of the People = COPE
Independent Democrats = ID
African Christian Democratic Party = ACDP

Beerwinkel, Ms Carol Frances .................................................. ANC
Bevu, Ms Tozama Nomza ......................................................... COPE
Botha, Theunis Louis .................................................................. DA
Bredell, Anton Wilhelm ............................................................. DA
Brown, Ms Lynette ....................................................................... ANC
Carlisle, Robin Vincent ............................................................. DA
Cupido, Ms Pauline Wilhemina ..................................................... ACDP
De Lille, Ms Patricia ..................................................................... ID
Eloff, Ernst Hendrik ...................................................................... DA
Figlan, Archibald Mzuvukile ....................................................... DA
Fritz, Albert Theo ........................................................................ DA
Geyer, Helmar Phillip ................................................................... DA
Grant, Donald Arthur Cardross .................................................. DA
Hani, Ms Vuyiwe .......................................................................... ANC
Haskin, Grant Christopher Ronald ............................................. ACDP
Jacobs, Phillip Mziwonke ........................................................... ANC
Labuschagne, Ms Cathlene ........................................................ DA
Madikizela, Bonginkosi Success ................................................ DA
Magwaza, Ms Ntombizodwa Pauline ........................................... ANC
Majola, Themebekile Richard ..................................................... DA
Marais, Ms Anroux Johanna Du Toit ............................................. DA
Maree, Ms Otta Helen (Zille) ....................................................... DA
Max, Lennit Hendry ................................................................. DA
McKenzie, Patrick Cecil ............................................................ ANC
Meyer, Ivan Henry ....................................................................... DA
Mqulwana, Ms Koleka Anita ....................................................... ANC
Ncedana, Mbulelo ................................................................. COPE
Ozinsky, Max ........................................................................... ANC
Plato, Daniel .............................................................................. ID
Prins, Ms Ellen ........................................................................... ANC
Rossouw, Ms Aletta ................................................................... DA
Skwatsha, Mcebisi ..................................................................... ANC
Stali, Zandisile Christopher ..................................................... ANC
Tingwe, Ms Milicent .................................................................. ANC
Uys, Pierré ................................................................................... ANC
Van Rensburg, Hendrik Gerhardus ............................................. DA
Van Zyl, Johanna Aletta ............................................................ COPE
Visser, Johannes Jacobus .......................................................... DA
Von Brandis, Eugene Jeffrey .................................................... DA
Walters, Michael Charles ........................................................ DA
Wiley, Mark Geoffrey Edington ................................................ DA
Winde, Alan Richard ............................................................. DA
Witbooi, Ms Joselene ............................................................. ANC
PERMANENT DELEGATES TO
NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

Adams, Freddie ................................................................. ANC
Bekker, Jacobus Marthinus Geyser ........................................ DA
De Beer, Onel .................................................................... COPE
De Villiers, Michael Jacobus Roland .................................... DA
Harris, Tomothy Duncan .................................................... DA
Ntwanambi, Ms Nosipho Dorothy ........................................ ANC
INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS

Abused Women and Children in Western Cape – Motion ........................................ 687
Abuse against the Elderly – Motion ........................................................................ 6492
Acknowledgement to Supt Nolan, Capt Dicks and Const Abrahams, Atlantis - Motion ................................................................. 1597
Actions by DA Councillor of Elsies River, Bertha Esbach – Motion ..................... 1010
Ad hoc Committee:
  Investigation into possible misleading of House by Minister ................................ 103
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner – Debate ...911, ................................................................................. 4797, 4808, 4815
Ad Hoc Committee, replacement of Mr E J von Brandis on – Motion ............ 832
Africa Day – Motion ................................................................................................. 2260, 5870
Afrikaans writers receive Honorary Award – Motion ............................................... 6210
Agri World Africa Established – Motion .................................................................. 5866
Agricultural Areas, Failure of Standing Committee to make intervention in Uprising in – Motion ......................................................................................... 6629
Alcohol and Drug abuse on Family system, Impact of – Motion ......................... 362
Alternative approaches to BEE and development SMMEs – Motion .................. 2174
Alcohol syndrome Campaign, SANCA Fetal – Motion ........................................ 6203
Amakhaya Ngoku Housing initiatives – Motion .................................................... 785
Ambulance Services and Response time, State of – Motion ................................ 749
Ammunition seized by police in Athlone – Motion ............................................... 933
ANC’s Conduct in Provincial Parliament – Motion ................................................. 6200
ANC Government on Service Delivery, Negative impact of – Motion ............. 15
ANC Honoured, Sixth President of – Motion ......................................................... 5865
ANC’s Misperceptions with regards to Education in Cape – Motion .................. 5903
Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports .................... 7, 8, 9, 17, 36, 70, 205, 239, 263, 354, 434, 526, 559, 595, 644, 677, 701, 715, 728, 746, 760, 858, 923, 963, 1003, 1025, 1066, 1082, 1126, 1193, 1240, 1279, 1349, 1394, 1463, 1580, 1601, 1646, 1729, 1795, 1885, 1968, 2159, 2196, 2248, 2279, 2324, 2360, 2389, 2393, 2430, 2468, 2504, 2511, 2541, 2549, 2599, 3755, 3815, 3755, 3918, 3919, 3922, 3933, 3975, 3979, 4032, 4117, 4118, 4124, 4216, 4203, 4204, 4204, 4327, 4582, 4636, 4640, 4653, 4655, 4670, 4684, 4733, 4928, 4976, 4997, 5093, 5115, 5136, 5174, 5276, 5574, 5638, 5695, 5758, 5801, ...., 5850, 5846, 5889, 5937, 6185, 6219, 6250, 6269, 6293, 6356, 6396, 6437, 6443, 6477, 6521, 6613, 6742, 6794, 687, 7, 8, 9, 17, 36, 70, 205, 239, 263, 354, 434, 526, 559, 595, 644, 677, 701, 715, 728, 746, 760, 858, 923, 963, 1003, 1025, 1066, 1082, 1126, 1193, 1240, 1279, 1349, 1394, 1463, 1580, 1601, 1646, 1729, 1795, 1885, 1968, 2159, 2196, 2248, 2279, 2324, 2360, 2389, 2393, 2430, 2468, 2504, 2511, 2541, 2549, 2599, 3755, 3815, 3755, 3918, 3919, 3922, 3933, 3975, 3979, 4032, 4117, 4118, 4124, 4216, 4203, 4204, 4204, 4327, 4582, 4636, 4640, 4653, 4655, 4670, 4684, 4733, 4928, 4976, 4997, 5093, 5115, 5136, 5174, 5276, 5574, 5638, 5695, 5758, 5801, ...., 5850, 5846, 5889, 5937, 6185, 6219, 6250, 6269, 6293, 6356, 6396, 6437, 6443, 6477, 6521, 6613, 6742, 6794, 687, 7, 8, 9, 17, 36, 70, 205, 239, 263, 354, 434, 526, 559, 595, 644, 677, 701, 715, 728, 746, 760, 858, 923, 963, 1003, 1025, 1066, 1082, 1126, 1193, 1240, 1279, 1349, 1394, 1463, 1580, 1601, 1646, 1729, 1795, 1885, 1968, 2159, 2196, 2248, 2279, 2324, 2360, 2389, 2393, 2430, 2468, 2504, 2511, 2541, 2549, 2599, 3755, 3815, 3755, 3918, 3919, 3922, 3933, 3975, 3979, 4032, 4117, 4118, 4124, 4216, 4203, 4204, 4204, 4327, 4582, 4636, 4640, 4653, 4655, 4670, 4684, 4733, 4928, 4976, 4997, 5093, 5115, 5136, 5174, 5276, 5574, 5638, 5695, 5758, 5801, ...., 5850, 5846, 5889, 5937, 6185, 6219, 6250, 6269, 6293, 6356, 6396, 6437, 6443, 6477, 6521, 6613, 6742, 6794
Absence of Speaker, leave of – Motion ................................................................. 4593
Adult Education, Award to 79-Year-Old Du Noon Resident – Motion ............... 5157
AD Hoc Committee, Appointment of - Motion ...................................................... 4007
Activist Anton Frans, Anniversary of Death of – Motion .................................... 4701
Affordable Housing – Motion .................................................................................. 4140
Agricultural Industry, Game Farming declared – Motion .................................... 4098
Ambassador, Singer/Actress Cape Town Routes Unlimited – Motion ............... 5157
Anti-poverty strategy – Motion .............................................................................. 2258
ANC in Municipal Election – Motion .................................................................... 3952
ANC Centenary Celebrations to Mark 100 years of Selfless Struggle By people of South Africa – Motion ......................................................... 4605
ANC Centenary Celebrations, Spending Taxpayers’ money on – Motion .......... 4606
ANC Centenary – Motion ....................................................................................... 4936
ANC, Veterans Honoured by – Motion ................................................................. 5155
ANC Youth League Congress, Failed – Motion ................................................... 4942
Annual National Assessment Papers – Motion .................................................. 6263
Appointment of Jan-Jan Joubert – Motion ........................................................ 4175
Appointment of Ad Hoc Committee – Motion .................................................... 4593
Astronomy Society, Hermanus – Motion ............................................................. 4149
Apology (P C McKenzie) ..................................................................................... 968
Apology to Member Brown – Motion .................................................................. 2570
Archbishop Desmond Tutu: Medal of Freedom Award – Motion ....................... 616
Atlantis integrated transport system – Motion ..................................................... 2559
ATM Bomings – Motion ...................................................................................... 5907
Attitude of Speaker in staff meeting – Motion ..................................................... 935
Audit reports not yet considered by SCOPA: debate – Motion ......................... 1594
Baboon Management Contract – Motion ............................................................ 537
Bafana Bafana, Support for – Motion .................................................................. 307
Battle of Braamfontein, 14 May 2012 – Motion .................................................. 5842
Beaufort West and Ceres farm murders – Motion ............................................... 1293
Behaviour Modification Programmes – Motion ................................................... 6367
Behaviour of ANC in Swellendam – Motion ....................................................... 6569
Berg River Municipality, Sale of Land – Motion ................................................ 4317
Bills:
Rescinding of EFT Bill - Motion ......................................................................... 4941

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Introduction and First Reading ........................................................................ 1070
  Consideration of principle ............................................................................... 1146
  Vote 6 – Health ................................................................................................. 1180
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ....................................................................................... 1202
  Vote 5 – Education .......................................................................................... 1215
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 1228
  Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ....................................................... 1242
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................................ 1256
  Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................................................... 1294
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................................. 1305
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................................ 1317
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ......................... 1335
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................................... 1350
  Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................................. 1358
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ........................................................................ 1371
  Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................................................. 1388
  Finalisation ....................................................................................................... 1391

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle .............................................................................. 112
  Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................................. 145
  Vote 8 – Local Government ............................................................................ 166
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 187
  Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................................. 211
  Vote 5 – Education .......................................................................................... 240
  Vote 6 – Health ................................................................................................. 266
  Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................................................... 307
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................................ 329
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ......................... 365
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................................ 392
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................................... 422
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................. 443
Vote 11 – Agriculture ..................................................... 482
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................. 509
Consideration of Votes and Schedules .................................. 526
Finalisation ...................................................................... 526

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ............................................. 4797
(Debate on Vote 5 – Education) ......................................... 4809
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ............ 4815
(Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ......................... 4829
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ........................... 4839
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .............................................. 4856
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ......................................................... 4866
(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ............................ 4875
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ......................... 4951
(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ......................................................... 4881
(Debate on Vote 8 - Human Settlements) ......................... 4893
(Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ............................. 4960
(Finalisation) ................................................................. 4974
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................... 4904
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bill</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 - 2011]</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>4919</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 - 2011]</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>4919</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Principle)</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>4786</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Biosphere Reserves Bill [B5 - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation)</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>4942</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1-2011] (Consideration and Finalisation)</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>4165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2010]</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>4014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill [B2-2011]</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3982</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 14 – Local Government</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 11 – Agriculture</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 7 – Social Development</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3636</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 6 – Health</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 4 – Community Safety</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3703</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 1 – Premier</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3797</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 8 – Housing</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3852</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of Vote and Schedules</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3917</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finalisation</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Introduction and First Reading)</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>5118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011]</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>3990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] - (Resumption of Consideration and Finalisation)</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>4032</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill [B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation)</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>4943</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6-2009]</td>
<td></td>
<td>1041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction and First Reading</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>1081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of principle</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>1081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finalisation</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>1081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Irregular Expenditure Bill [B4 – 2009]</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finalisation</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B3 – 2009]</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finalisation</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2009]</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>2467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction and First Reading</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>2502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>2503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finalisation</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>2503</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(v)

Western Cape Parliamentary Service and Finance Management Bill
Introduction.............................................................................................................1347

Western Cape Problem Animal Control Ordinance Repeal Bill
[B9 – 2008] Finalisation..........................................................................................643

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Introduction and First Reading)..............................................................................4671

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2012]
(Introduction and First Reading)..............................................................................5118

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4 -2012] (2011/12 Financial Year) (Introduction and First Reading).........................5160

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4- 2012](2011/2012 Financial Year) (Consideration of Principle).........................5274

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4 - 2012] (2011/2012 Financial Year) (Finalisation).................................................5276

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle)...................5303

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2-2012]
(Introduction and First Reading)..............................................................................5337

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier).................................................................................5339

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education).................................................................................5378

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development)........................................................................................................5401

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works)........................................................................................................5427

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety)........................................................................................................5462

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Spot)........................................................................................................5485

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 9 – Health)................5519

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament)........................................................................................................5552

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements)........................................................................................................5575

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning)......................................................5614

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury)........................................................................................................5630

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture)........................................................................................................5642

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government)........................................................................................................5695

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule)........................................................................................................5731

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Finalisation)........................................5736

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle)......................................................................................5736

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Finalisation)............................................................................................................5742
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]</td>
<td>5783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11-2012]</td>
<td>6579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]</td>
<td>6673</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill [B7-2012]</td>
<td>6677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6686</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6694</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6699</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]</td>
<td>6707</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6713</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6727</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6760</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6773</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6788</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biko, Steve Bantu Bonke, Commemoration of – Motion</td>
<td>6205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bitou Municipality, Service Hikes in – Motion</td>
<td>5916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birthday wishes to Ms C F Beerwinkel – Motion</td>
<td>1598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birthday wishes to Premier – Motion</td>
<td>1598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birthday in the House, Marais, Du Toit A - Motion</td>
<td>4936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birthday Wishes to Minister Madikizela – Motion</td>
<td>5272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119</td>
<td>2571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bitou Municipality, Problems at – Motion</td>
<td>591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boland Summer Festival – Motion</td>
<td>5729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boston USA, World Floral Art Show in – Motion</td>
<td>4146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botrivier, Service Delivery in - Motion</td>
<td>5914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget for 2010/2011, Fifth Financial Year not Spent for – Motion</td>
<td>4101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brutal and deadly attacks on policemen and women – Motion</td>
<td>833</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burglary and vandalism of state-owned property – Motion</td>
<td>2175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bus accident in Kloofnek Road, Senior Citizens in – Motion</td>
<td>750</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cableway, Table Mountain Aerial – Motion .................................................. 4148
Call on Premier Zille, Replace of MEC for Community Safety –
   Motion ........................................................................................................... 5845
Cavellereia Primary School (C F Beerwinkel) ................................................ 5153
Celebrations of Life, Third Centenary of Adam Kok – Motion ..................... 4115
Census 2011 on the Western Cape, Impact of – Motion .................................. 6403
Central Karoo District municipality, Disaster Risk Management and
   Emergency Service in – Motion .................................................................. 4100
Climate Change, Cape Town Preparedness for – Motion ............................... 4693
Clinics, Shocking state of – Motion ................................................................ 4173
Closure of Schools – Motion .......................................................................... 5900
Crime Statistics relating to Western Cape – Motion ........................................ 6257
Crisis, Tourism industry in – Motion ............................................................... 4103
Cape Town Metropole, Unacceptable Conditions for poor People
   - Motion 6265
Cape Nature: public/private partnerships – Motion ....................................... 1591
Cape Nature CEO not Named – Motion ......................................................... 5777
Cape Town Doctor Resuscitates Boy After Near-Drowning – Motion .......... 6634
Cape Nature Outsources Culling to Farmers – Motion .................................. 6414
Cape Town Favourite Tourist City – Motion .................................................. 6500
Cape Town as second best destination in Africa and Middle East –
   Motion ........................................................................................................... 2372
Cape Town as South Africa’s Silicon Valley – Motion ................................... 833
Cape Town Stadium, construction of – Motion .............................................. 2351
Cape Town Motorist Hazel Souma – Motion ................................................. 5273
Cape Town Partnership, Prof Ndebele Appointed as
   Chairperson of – Motion ............................................................................... 5913
Cape Town Routs, Unlimited into Wesgro Incorporation of – Motion .......... 5147
Cape Town Tourism Board, New Chair of – Motion ...................................... 6411
Car Magazine Award for Safely Home Programme – Motion ......................... 1596
Cape Minstrels on Tweede Nuwe Jaar – Motion ........................................... 4099
Caps, Readiness for Implementation – Motion .............................................. 4135
Casino: establishment of second casino in Metropole – Motion ................... 2368
Cease-Fire Between Israel and Hamas – Motion ............................................ 6570
Celebration of Eid-Al-Adha – Motion ............................................................ 6369
Celebration of Diwali – Festival of Lights – Motion ...................................... 6369
Chapman’s Peak Rockfall – Motion ............................................................... 6316
Chairperson of Standing Committee on Community Safety:
   Incompetence – Motion................................................................................ 657
Chairperson of Standing Committee of Finance, Censuring of – Motion .... 589
   Changing of Culture of Our People – Motion ............................................ 6330
Chestnut Clinic in Belhar, situation at – Motion ............................................. 981
Child-headed households, plight of – Motion ................................................. 2299
Children and Youth Commemorations .......................................................... 5871
Children on Cape Flats, Massacre of – Motion ............................................ 6366
Children, conditions under which children grow up – Motion ..................... 2304
Children’s Act, implementation of – Motion .................................................. 2370
Chronic medication: serious shortage of – Motion ........................................ 2371
Chronic Medicine, Chaos with dispensing of – Motion .................................. 5859
Chronic Medicine, Incorrect labelling of – Motion ........................................ 5873
City council: official demoted – Motion .......................................................... 2344
City of Cape Town, Awarding of performance bonuses in – Motion ............ 2258
City of Cape Town: Health Plan on HIV and TB – Motion .................................................. 933
City of Cape Town, implications of growth of – Motion ................................................... 932
City of Cape Town, IRT System in – Motion .................................................................. 934
City of Cape Town, Mycity Vehicle operation Companies Upset –
Motion ......................................................................................................................... 6575
City of Cape Town:
Proposed transfer of Land – Motion ................................................................................. 38
Public Transport Plan – Motion ........................................................................................ 536
Spending on informal settlements – Motion .................................................................... 2347
Unauthorised payments and tender processes of – Motion .............................................. 656
Closing ................................................................................................................................ 1391, 6789
Closure of Nongovernmental Organisations – Motion ...................................................... 5858
Closure of 27 Black Schools, Interfaith Service against – Motion .................................... 6268
Closure of Ottery Youth Care Centre – Motion ................................................................. 6568
Clothing Sector, Strike in – Motion .................................................................................... 783
Court Application, Backyard Dwellers Lodge – Motion .................................................. 6410
Conflict in de Doorns, Defusing of – Motion .................................................................... 6450
Condition of Flats in Leonsdale: Terrible – Motion ......................................................... 2406
Condolence – Motions:
Albertus, Ms Ulla (A J D Marais) ..................................................................................... 938
Arendse, Donigo Family of (J L Hartnick) ........................................................................ 6317
Asmal, Kader (The Chief Whip)(DA) ................................................................................. 3977
Asmal, Kader (Z C Stali) ...................................................................................................... 3977
Asmal, Kader (T N Bevu) .................................................................................................... 3978
Asmal, Kader (A T Fritz) ...................................................................................................... 3978
Asmal, Kader (P W Cupido) ............................................................................................... 3979
Banda, Const. Xolisa (M E G Wiley) ................................................................................. 5151
Bekker, Suna (J J Visser) .................................................................................................... 4141
Beyleveldt, Theo (M C Walters) ....................................................................................... 4107
Beyleveldt, Theo (S Esau) .................................................................................................. 4107
Bignaut, Ashley (A J Du Toit Marais) ................................................................................. 4181
Bloemersus, Ashley (R B Lentit) ....................................................................................... 4697
Brady, Nazario (M C Walters) ............................................................................................ 694
Bus accident in Hex River Pass (E H Eloff) ...................................................................... 2228
Chabaku, Motlalepula (M Skwatsha) ................................................................................ 5845
Charles, Shameela in Doha mall Fire (M Tingwe) ............................................................ 5862
Charles, Shameela death in Qatar Mall fire (R B Lentit) ................................................... 5869
Cyclist killed on Main Road St James (M G E Wiley) ......................................................... 6371
Daniels, Michael (J J Visser) ............................................................................................. 6494
Davids, Mr A A (E H Eloff) ............................................................................................... 1597
Davids, Goliath (J L Hartnick) ......................................................................................... 6206
Death of People after Collision of taxi and truck (M Skwatsha) ........................................ 2480
Death of Seven Members of Family after eating Cooked Mushrooms (M Skwatsha) ....... 6269
Deaths in shack fires in Kleinmond (J L Hartnick) ............................................................. 2483
Dely, Frans (J Witbooi) ...................................................................................................... 4324
Deputy Speaker, Mother of (J J Visser) .......................................................................... 786
D’Oliveira, Basil (J Witbooi) .............................................................................................. 4699
Dryer, Charles (J J Visser) ............................................................................................... 6324
Dudley, Mr R (Y Gabru) ................................................................................................. 38
Duncan, Sheena (L Brown) ............................................................................................... 2227
Espafrika (R B Lentit) ...................................................................................................... 3765
Emeran, Umar in Doha mall Fire (M Tingwe) ................................................................. 5862

(viii)
Endly, Paul Macassar Veterans (J Witbooi) ................................................................. 5156
Family of seven and baby (C F Beerwinkel) ............................................................... 1746
Families in Western Cape and Elsewhere (M G E Wiley) ............................................... 6264
Firmans, Mr Duane (G C Haskin) .................................................................................. 6261
Francken, Lulu (E H Eloff) ............................................................................................ 2570
Ford, Kelly-Jade (M Tingwe) ......................................................................................... 6631
Gaffney, Brian (Z C Stali) ............................................................................................. 4113
Galant, Jacoba (N P Magwaza) ..................................................................................... 2177
Gerwel, Jakes (R B Lentit) ............................................................................................. 6630
Gillwald, Cheryl (M Skwatsha) ...................................................................................... 2407
Griebenouw, Susanna (J L Hartnick) ............................................................................. 4009
Gresak, Michael (C Labuschagne) ................................................................................. 6333
Guthrie, Mark (M C Walters) ......................................................................................... 6457
Hale, Corne (P W Cupido) ............................................................................................. 4777
Hayes, Carika (J L Hartnick) .......................................................................................... 6337
Isaacs, Sedick (M Ozinsky) ............................................................................................ 6371
Hörstmann, Fritz (J J Visser) .......................................................................................... 660
Hout Bay Boat Tragedy (M G E Wiley) .......................................................................... 6320
Hugo, Doreen (V Hani) .................................................................................................. 4008
Imvumelwana Primary, Wallacedene (C Labuschagne) .................................................. 5843
Level Crossing Accident, Death of two (P Mckenzie) .................................................... 5869
Linkin Park Concert Death (P Uys) .................................................................................. 6452
Lunguza, Ntombizodwa (B G Mbalo) ............................................................................ 6496
Jack, Neville Michael – (C F Beerwinkel) ....................................................................... 4558
Jacobs, Mr M (M G E Wiley) .......................................................................................... 837
Jansen, Lodewy (N P Magwaza) .................................................................................... 2177
January, Joseph (M Skwatsha) ....................................................................................... 6408
Jenner, Ms Katrina (J L Hartnick) ................................................................................... 1036
Johnson, Abe (A J Du Toit Marais) .................................................................................. 5842
Kadalie, Fener (A J Du Toit Marais) ................................................................................. 4111
Kakaza, Leslie (C F Beerwinkel) ..................................................................................... 4112
Kasrils, Eleanor (M Skwatsha) ....................................................................................... 1011
Kayamandi Fire, Children Die (V Hani) ......................................................................... 4780
Kimvango, Andy (N P Magwaza) ................................................................................... 4940
Kirkpatrick, Ian (J J Visser) ......................................................................................... 6576
Khumalo, Alfred (A J Du Toit Marais) ............................................................................ 6372
Klaasen, Clr Kevin (J J Visser) ..................................................................................... 107
Klein, Tom (P W Cupido) ............................................................................................... 2479
Komba, Sgt. Charles (H P Geyer) ................................................................................... 660
Komphela, SGT Thumelaphi (M G E Wiley) ................................................................. 4937
Kotze, Pen (M C Walters) ............................................................................................... 2408
Kotze, Thelana (C Labuschagne) ................................................................................... 6204
Koopan, Allan (J L Hartnick) .......................................................................................... 6337
Khumalo, Alf (M Skwatsha) ........................................................................................... 6374
Lithembha Loli (M Tingwe) ........................................................................................... 787
Madikwa, Nomvelo "Rayi" (M Skwatsha) ...................................................................... 617
Madigage, Thomas (J Witbooi) ...................................................................................... 6372
Madinga, Lulama (E J von Brandis) ............................................................................... 1037
Mafikeng, Mama Elizabeth “Rocky” (P M Jacobs) .......................................................... 105
Mandulo, Nokulamla – (T R Majola) .............................................................................. 4176
Malan, Ms Marie (E Prins) ............................................................................................. 2179
Malindi, Lettie (N P Magwaza) ...................................................................................... 2376
Mantashe, Madolwana and Cilliers, Messrs (T N Bevu) .................................................. 1294
Maqhetshheba, Anathi (H P Geyer) ................................................................. 937
Mbulawa, Ms Bukelwa (M Skwatsha) ............................................................ 4561
Member Nyanda, Florence (Z C Stali) .......................................................... 5779
Michaels, Loveline (J L Hartnick) ................................................................. 6578
Mntini, Thabani (C Lavuschagne) ................................................................. 6371
Sefularo, Dr (J Witbooi) ............................................................................. 2178
Sikanji: Member of Cope (M Ncedana) ....................................................... 2232
Shiceka, Former Minister Sicelo (Z C Stali) .............................................. 5779
Smith, Keenen (M Tingwe) ........................................................................ 6631
Swail, Lee-Ann (M Tingwe) ...................................................................... 6631
Marais Allister () MC Walters) .................................................................. 6207
Mark, Mr Joe (M G E Wiley) ..................................................................... 4695
Marks, Solly (Du Toit Marais) ................................................................... 6375
Maqubela, Patrick (Y Gabru) ................................................................. 106
Matthews, Joe (V Hani) ............................................................................ 2522
Maroem, Mr E C, (A Rossouw) ................................................................ 39
Maxenza, Const Daniel (M Skwatsha) ........................................................ 1893
Mbicco, Ms Neti (M Ncedana) .................................................................. 1040
Meer, Ms Fatima (M Skwatsha) ................................................................ 1643
Meiring, Hannes (H P Geyer) ................................................................... 2178
Meintjies, Frits and Berno (A Rossouw) ................................................... 6320
Minister van Rensburg, Department on Publication of
Agricultural Dictionary (M C Walters) ...................................................... 5156
Mhlanga, Lydia (N P Magwaza) ................................................................. 5272
Mjongile, Songezo (J L Hartnick) ............................................................... 6317
Mkunqana, Simphiwe (M Skatsha) ............................................................. 6324
Moses,Warrent Officer Douglas (M G E Willey) ......................................... 6368
Mother of Ms C Labuschagne, passing of (A J D Marais) ...................... 2124
Mputing, Mr W (N P Magwaza) ................................................................. 909
Myethu, Themba (M Skwatsha) ................................................................. 6406
Naidoo, Mr Vincent (P C McKenzie) ......................................................... 751
National Mens’s Hockey Team (M G E Wiley) ......................................... 5783
Ncedana, Mr V (T N Bevu) ....................................................................... 1645
Ndleni, Bongile (B G Mbalo) ................................................................. 6570
Ngcukana, Ezra (M Skwatsha) ................................................................. 2407
Ngozi, Mr M M (N P Magwaza) ................................................................. 838
Nenzwana, Ntombizone (T N Bevu) ......................................................... 908
Ntizini, Nobantu “Vicky” (E J Von Brandis) ............................................. 6634
Nxu, Xolile Death of Vice-President of SAMWU (M Skwatsha) ............ 5871
Oman, Imran death in Qatar Mall fire (R B Lentit) .................................... 5869
Olifant, Danny (L Brown) ......................................................................... 6407
Padayachee, Minister Roy (Z C Stali) ....................................................... 5779
Papenfus, Rufus (H P Geyer) .................................................................... 6416
Passing on of Mother of Nondzaliseko Makanda (V Hani) ................ 241
Peterson, Rafeeq (M Ozinsky) ............................................................... 6451
People involved in car crash (K A Mqulwana) ......................................... 983
People killed in fire in Linglelethu, Khayelitsha (M Tingwe) ............... 2463
Phieffer, John (L E Magaxa) ............................................................... 6322
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pick, Dave (V Hani)</td>
<td>3617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pienaar, Louis (J J Visser)</td>
<td>6454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pietersen, Moegamat (M Tingwe)</td>
<td>6498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price, Kevin (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>4142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raad, Rina (A J Du Toit Marias)</td>
<td>5843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residents who died in fire at Rusthof</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Road Disaster near Lainsburg Claims</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Z C Stali)</td>
<td>4702</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roxo, Ernest (M Tingwe)</td>
<td>5782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rheenenadal Area, School Bus Accident</td>
<td>4319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sigcaw, Nondwe (B Mbalo)</td>
<td>6375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schmidt, Cobus (H P Geyer)</td>
<td>1039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholtz, Maxi (P C McKenzie)</td>
<td>1891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schoolchildren and those who have died</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>playing sport (C F Beerwinkel)</td>
<td>1595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Searll, Aaron and Nyman, Lannice (M G E</td>
<td>2231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schlemmer, Prof Lawrence (M C Walters)</td>
<td>4559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott, Christina (J Witbooi)</td>
<td>4560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sisulu, Albertina (H P Geyer)</td>
<td>3945</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sisulu, Zwelakhe (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>6317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simons, Anna (A J Du Toit Marais)</td>
<td>4325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slain Police officer and Injured Policeman</td>
<td>6319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(M G E Wiley)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solomon, Imam Gassan (Y Gabrum)</td>
<td>983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steers, Mubahied (P C McKenzie)</td>
<td>6633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stemmet, Adnaan (J Witbooi)</td>
<td>2570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stewart, Gary (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>6326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tandy, Hendry Macassar Veterans (J Witbooi)</td>
<td>5156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taljaard, Francois (M C Walters)</td>
<td>6207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taljaard, Louis(M C Walters)</td>
<td>6207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Titus, Sergius (M C Walters)</td>
<td>6207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ting Ting Masanga (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobias, Dr Phillip (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>5909</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tolo, Bishop Jack (J A Van Zyl)</td>
<td>4323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tyibili, Sally (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>4698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA After Superstorm Sandy (J J Visser)</td>
<td>6414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uys, Theunis (L Brown)</td>
<td>6268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Heerden, Tim (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>4326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Niekerk, Dr Theresa (J J Visser)</td>
<td>659</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Rensburg, Erin (H P Geyer)</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Rooyen, Gert (N P Magwaza)</td>
<td>2177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims of taxi accident (T R Majola)</td>
<td>985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victims killed in Gang Violence</td>
<td>6323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vuba, Thobeka</td>
<td>4937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vollenhoven, Aunt Tatie (E Prins)</td>
<td>6260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Williams, Annie (P C McKenzie)</td>
<td>6498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Williams, Annetjie (A J Du Toit Marais)</td>
<td>6457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witbooi, Melvin (J Witbooi)</td>
<td>4607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young People die in Car Accident (A Rossouw)</td>
<td>4779</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

27th Anniversary of Treacherous Trojan Horse Tragedy: 6325

Congratulations / Wishes – Motions:
Agulhas, Tiffany (J J Visser) .................................................. 6452
All Municipalities (R B Lent) .................................................. 5841
Arabella Hotel and Spa (E J Von Brandis) ........................................ 6332
Artscape Management (R B Lentit) .................................................. 4116
Amsterdam, Sasha-Lee (J L Hartnick) ............................................. 4013
Annual Charity Toy Run, to Organisers of (G C R Haskin) ............... 6631
Bafana Bafana (P M Jacobs) ............................................................. 143
Bafana Bafana (J L Hartnick) .......................................................... 362
Bafana Bafana (M Skwatsha) ............................................................ 694, 2568, 4108
Bafana Bafana (Z V Stali) ................................................................. 3766
Bafana Bafana (E H Eloff) ............................................................... 4148
Bantjies, Benjan (E H Eloff) ............................................................. 3770
Barnard, Mr Jimmy (A Rossouw) ..................................................... 4605
Belgravia High School (Y Gabru) ..................................................... 610
Bernstein, Ann (J J Visser) .............................................................. 5730
Beukman, Erika (E H Eloff) ............................................................... 3768
Biermann, Hugo (M G E Wiley) ......................................................... 5731
Bishop Lavis Police Officers (P C McKenzie) ...................................... 4012
BPESA (E J Von Brandis) ................................................................ 6415
Brackenfell High School (A J D Marais) ............................................ 754
Brink, Mashaarn (M Tingwe) ............................................................. 4178
Burger, Schalk (J Witbooi) ............................................................... 4610
Caledon (E J Von Brandis) ............................................................... 4323
Castro, Fidel (V Hani) ..................................................................... 4183
Cape Grace Hotel (E J Von Brandis) ................................................ 6332
Cape Town Municipality (J J Visser) .................................................. 5279
Cape Town Tourism (E J Von Brandis) .............................................. 5841
Cederberg Winery (H P Geyer) .......................................................... 6337
Chaeli Campaign first Recipient of Medal for Social Activism (G C R Haskin) ................................................ 5780
Chiu Alexander (C F Beerwinkel) ..................................................... 3950
Chrysalis Academy, CEO and Staff of (M G E Wiley) ......................... 4938
of Cape Town (E J Von Brandis) ....................................................... 4008
City of Cape Town (R B Lentit) ......................................................... 4105, 5845
City of Cape Town, Executive of (R B Lentit) ..................................... 4183
City of Cape Town officials (M C Walters) ....................................... 4782
City of Cape Town, Tourism and Provincial Counterparts (E J Von Brandis) ........................................ 6334
Cloete, Mr Anthony, Top Performer at Cape Agri Academy (A Rossouw) ........................................................................ 1108
Cloetesville High School (H P Geyer) ................................................. 788
Coetzee, T (E H Eloff) ..................................................................... 3767
Commissioner Petros and SAPS (P Uys) .......................................... 787
Comrade James Ngculu (M Skwatsha) .............................................. 1070
Conduct towards women MPPS – Motion ........................................ 607
Crowster, Sharon (P W Cupido) ....................................................... 4776
Cupido, Ms, Appointment as Provincial Chairperson of ACDP (J J Visser) .......................................................... 4777
Dale-Roberts, Chef Luke and his team from La Colombe (E H Eloff) ........................................................................ 2179
Danie Steytler (H P Geyer) ............................................................... 756
DA – (M G E Wiley) ....................................................................... 4941
DA Winning, Election in Ward 88 – (J J Visser) ................................. 6262
DA on victory in Worcester (J J Visser) .............................................. 1891
De Jager, Gideon (L Brown) ............................................................. 4012
Department of Agriculture (M C Walters)........................................................................756
Department of Agriculture, Sun Space and University of
Department of Agriculture (J J Visser)........................................................................6331
Department of Community Safety and all Officials (M G E Wiley) ..........................6333
Department of Economic Development and Tourism
- (E J Von Brandis) ..................................................................................................6330
Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs
And Development Planning (M C Walters) .................................................................6330
Department of Transport and Public Works (E J Von Brandis) ............................6330
De Rust (E J Von Brandis) .........................................................................................4177
Drakenstein Municipality (J J Visser) ........................................................................4179
Drakenstein Local Municipality (J J Visser) ...............................................................5778
Deon Bruintjies (A J D Marais) .....................................................................................785
Drum Majorettes, Eight of SWD (E Prins) .................................................................2464
Duk, William (E J Von Brandis) ..................................................................................6208
Durban Tourism (E J Von Brandis) ............................................................................5841
Du Toit, Natalie (J L Hartnick) ...................................................................................1644
Du Toit, Natalie (A Rossouw) ......................................................................................6451
Dyamdeki, Nomthandazo (M Tingwe) .....................................................................5302
Eden District Municipality – Motion .........................................................................5914
Eden, Abraham (M C Walters) ....................................................................................6328
Education Centre (M G E Wiley) ..............................................................................6266
Els, Johan (E H Eloff) .................................................................................................3768
Elsenburg Agricultural College (J J Visser) ..............................................................6209
Emergency Services Staff (J Witbooi) ......................................................................1128
End Conscription Campaign (M Ozinsky) .................................................................940
Equal Education (C F Beerwinkel) ..........................................................................2411
Espafrika (R B Lentit) .................................................................................................3765
Executive Mayor of Cape Town (A M Figlan) ............................................................6460
Fancourt (E J Von Brandis) .......................................................................................6325
Farmworkers of the Year, 2009 (J L Hartnick) ..........................................................986
Farrant, Prof Jill (M C Walters) ..................................................................................4607
Ferreira, G T (H P Geyer) .........................................................................................2523
Fire-Fighters (M G E Wiley) .....................................................................................3765
Fisher, Mr Adam (M C Walters) .................................................................................363
Fish Hoek Lifesaving Club (M G E Wiley) ...............................................................3948
Fish, Liz (M Skwatsha) ...............................................................................................3948
Former President Nelson Mandela (L Brown) .........................................................5151
Fortuin, Chantel (A Rossouw) ..................................................................................2349
Fourie, Hendrik (L Brown) .......................................................................................4012
Four schools in 100 School Survey (Y Gabru) ..........................................................908
Fugard, Athol (Z C Stali) ...........................................................................................4010
Fyfer, Boy (E J Von Brandis) ...................................................................................6263
Goliath, Jackie, New Commercial Farmer of the
Year (J L Hartnick) ......................................................................................................6373
Gebenga, Anelisiwe (A J D Marais) ..........................................................................2349
Gold Medal for Surf Life Saving (M G E Wiley) ....................................................541
Goedeman, Delina (P Uys) .........................................................................................6456
Goeliemann, Annine (A J Du Toit Marias) ...............................................................4106
Gouws, Prof R H (A Rossouw) ..................................................................................6209
Gugulethu Seven, President of Benin Awards Families of
(M Skwatsha) ............................................................................................................4938
Hartnick, Jenny (P C Mckenzie) ..................................................................................6336
Hanekom, Mr A, on election (E J von Brandis) .................................................. 1892
Hanekom, Sandra (A Rossouw) ............................................................................. 4782
Heritage Cape On Tenth Anniversary (A Rossouw) ............................................ 6409
Hattingh, Adele (M C Walters) .............................................................................. 2523
Hendrick, Mikhail (P W Cupido) ............................................................................ 3946
Health Occupations, Winners of Awards for (A J Du Toit Marais) .................... 4783
Hip-Hop World Championships, Delegation Attending to (H P Geyer) ......... 6376
Hudson, Roger (G C R Haskin) .............................................................................. 5840
Hunter, Mr Tony (A Rossouw) ............................................................................... 6455
Homeless Soccer World Cup Tournament (N P Magwaza) ............................... 753
Hon, Wiley M G E (AJ Du Toit Marias) ................................................................. 5160
House, James, Houtbay (Magwaza N P) ............................................................... 5272
Human Settlement, Establishment of New Manenberg Contact
Centre (A M Figlan) ............................................................................................... 5843
Ikeys (J J Visser) .................................................................................................... 3768
I-WEC (E J Von Brandis) ...................................................................................... 4780
Laubscher, Eric Honoured – Motion .................................................................... 6412
Learners (C Labuschagne) ................................................................................... 5863
Learners of Pinelands North Primary School (M Ozinsky) ................................. 3953
Learners, Grade 12 (P W Cupido) ....................................................................... 4558
Le Roux, Marlene (J L Hartnick) ........................................................................... 2465
Luyt, Margot (A Rossouw) .................................................................................... 6209
Jenner, Minister - Department of the Premier (A J D Marais) ......................... 2351
Jewish Community (A Rossouw) .......................................................................... 753
Jewish Community (J J Visser) ............................................................................. 2570
Jim, Asenathi (G C R Haskin) ............................................................................. 5840
Johannesburg Tourism (E J Von Brandis) ............................................................. 5841
Jonkbloed, Zelda (A Rossouw) ............................................................................. 6206
Jonson, Denver (Z C Stali) .................................................................................. 4110
Junior Golfer Luca Fillipi (M G E Wiley) ............................................................. 6637

*Kaap Rapport* and Van Loveren Town of the Year Competition

(E J Von Brandis) .................................................................................................. 659
Kairos Drama Group of Heidelberg (E Prins) .................................................... 5781
Kaizer Chiefs and Orlando Pirates (M Ncedana) ............................................... 989
Kallis, Sharief (R B Lentit) .................................................................................. 4143
Kirsten, Gary (E J Von Brandis) ........................................................................... 3951
Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens (M C Walters) ............................................... 5862
Klatzow, Prof Peter (A J Du Toit Marais) ............................................................ 6202
Kotze Dewaldre (C F Beerwinkel) ..................................................................... 2377
Koster, John (A Rossouw) .................................................................................. 3771
Kraaifontein Police Station (P W Cupido) ........................................................... 2569
Kruger, Katryn (C Labuschagne) ....................................................................... 6208
Kwahattu Culture (M G E Wiley) ........................................................................ 6266
La Motte Wine Estate, (M C Walters) ................................................................. 4779
Langeberg on change of name (E H Eloff) .......................................................... 839
Lange, Malcolm (E H Eloff) ................................................................................. 1646
Liverpool (P C McKenzie) ............................................................................... 939
Martin, Prof Lorna (M Skwatsha) ................................................................. 4559
Management of South African Airways (E H Eloff) .......................................... 4007
Management: Silwerkruin Home for the Elderly, Wellington (J J Visser) ...... 1040
Mandela, Nelson: 92nd birthday (M Skwatsha) ................................................... 2375
Mandela, Nelson Rolihlahla (M Skwatsha) .................................................. 4700
Manyonga, Luvo (Z C Stali) ........................................................................... 2410
Maritz, Jan (A Rossouw) ............................................................................. 2305
Masiphumelele Young Stars Soccer Team (M G E Wiley) ...................... 5781
Mayor of Cape Town (A Rossouw) ................................................................. 6329
Mayor of Potchefstroom (A J Du Toit Marais) ............................................ 6577
Mbeki Govan, Human Settlement Awards 2012, Runners-up and
Winners (A M Figlan) .................................................................................. 5840
Mckenna, Mr Sageas (M G E Wiley) ............................................................ 4695
Mentoor, Farwa (J Witbooi) ....................................................................... 4182
Metro Rescue Workers (M G E Wiley) ......................................................... 3765
Metro Police (P W Cupido) ........................................................................ 4146
Meerendal Wine Estate on gold medal (E Prins) ...................................... 1892
Member of the House – (J J Visser) ............................................................... 4555
Minister Alan Winde: saving of drowning woman
(E J von Brandis) ....................................................................................... 2352
Minister of Economic Development (E J Von Brandis) ......................... 4179
Minister Fikile Mbalula, Cape Argus Cycle Tour (Z C Stali) ................... 5274
Minister of Health (P C McKenzie) ............................................................ 2483
Minister of Health and His Department .................................................... 6332
Minister Leonard Max (A J du T Marais) ................................................. 2262
Minister on compilation of guide (J J Visser) .......................................... 1645
Minister Winde (H P Geyer) .................................................................... 6266
Mocke, Mr Dawid (M G E Wiley) ................................................................. 1293, 4181
Mosielo High School (M G E Wiley) .......................................................... 789
Mostert, Jan (H P Geyer) .......................................................................... 6322
Mpetha, Family (Z C Stali) ....................................................................... 4104
Mpofu-Wlash, Sizwe (M Tingwe) ................................................................. 4010
MPP Jennifer Hartnick (A Rossouw) ......................................................... 2464
MPP Jennifer Hartnick (H P Geyer) ............................................................. 2482
MPPS who Graduated (M Ncedana) ......................................................... 4703
Muggels, Mr Hendrik (M C Walters) .......................................................... 104,108
Municipalities, on Blue Drop and Green Drop Status (J J Visser) .......... 4109
Municipalities, Who spent their MIG Funds before End of
Budget Year (J J Visser) ............................................................................ 4112
Muslim community (K A Mqulwana) ......................................................... 1069
Muslims on Ramadan (H P Geyer) ............................................................... 4104
Muslims on Ramadan (A Rossouw) ............................................................ 611
M5 Developments Cape and Overstrand Municipality
(M C Walters) .......................................................................................... 988
Mycroft, Michaela (P W Cupido) ............................................................... 4696
National Departments (E Prins) ................................................................. 4116
National Education Award (A J Du Toit Marais) ..................................... 5159
National Government (N P Magwaza) ...................................................... 5730
National Womens’ Hockey Squad (M G E Wiley) .................................... 5159
Ndungu, Scientist Thumbi (G C Haskin) ..................................................... 6453
Nelson, Marshall (R B Lentit) .................................................................... 4143
New Diplomats (M Ozinsky) .................................................................. 540
Nicholls, Nelson (E Prins) ........................................................................ 3949
Ntsiki Biyela (H P Geyer) ....................................................................... 613
Nymbezi, Vinoria (Du Toit Marais, A J) .................................................... 5728
Oakdale Agricultural High School (J J Visser) ......................................... 6205
Obama, President Barack (A J Du Toit Marais) ..................................... 6454
Oosthuizen, Louis (J L Hartnick) ................................................................. 2373
Organisers of Robertson Wine, Food and Tourism Festival
        (E H Eloff) .................................................................................. 909
Orlando Pirates (Z C Stali) ................................................................. 3949
Orlando Pirates (M G E Wiley) .......................................................... 3949
Orlando Pirates (T R Majola) ............................................................. 4109
Oudtshoorn Municipality (P Uys) ....................................................... 6328
Overstrand Municipality (M C Walters) ............................................. 939
Overstrand Municipality (J J Visser) ................................................... 4939
Overstrand Municipality (M C Walters) .............................................. 6573
Paralympic Team South Africa (M Ncedana) ...................................... 6203
Peggy De Villiers (C Labuschagne) ...................................................... 755
Petros, Gen (P C McKenzie) .............................................................. 2478
Phetho, Terry (E H Eloff) ................................................................. 3951
Philander, Vernon (E J Von Brandis) .................................................. 5908
Philander, Tovonron (J J Visser) ........................................................ 6456
President Jacob Zuma on taking Aids test (J Witbooi) ...................... 2176
President Zuma, being Appointed to Unsecretary’s Education first
Initiative to (L Brown) ........................................................................ 6259
Premier (A J Du Toit Marias) ............................................................... 5160
Premier and Department (J L Hartnick) ............................................ 6338
Prins, Megan-Geoffrey (J L Hartnick) ................................................ 4148
Prins, Henry (J J Visser) ................................................................. 5912
Provincial Athletic Trials (C F Beerwinkel) .......................................... 2306
Provincial Parliament (H P Geyer) ....................................................... 6336
Ramadan Kareem (H P Geyer) ........................................................... 2460
Research Institutions, Three Cape Town (P W Cupido) .................... 4609
Renaming of NY1 to Steve Biko Drive (A M Figlan) ......................... 6260
Rianie Strydom (A J D Marais) ........................................................... 757
Road Accident Fatalities - Motion ...................................................... 6413
Rugby, Kaizer Chiefs in Transformation of (R B Lentit) .................... 6407
SA Academy for Science and Arts (H P Geyer) ................................. 658
SA Cricket Team (E H Eloff) ............................................................. 790
SA Military Veterans’ Organisation (M Ozinsky) ............................... 4326
Sandes Toryan (E H Eloff) .............................................................. 4781
Saldanha Municipality (M Skwatsha) ............................................... 988
SAFA (Z C Stali) ................................................................................. 3769
SAPS (P W Cupido) ........................................................................... 4146
Scholtz, Joggie (J J Visser) ............................................................... 5912
Sdophumelela Secondary School, Learners of (C Labuschagne) ....... 5269
Sharks (J J Visser) .............................................................................. 4006
Semenya, Castor (E Prins) ................................................................. 2480
Seven Team, Maties (J J Visser) ......................................................... 6637
Shoprite/Checkers Women of the Year Award, Women for
Receiving Annual (P W Cupido) ....................................................... 4105
Silvo, Joao (E J Von Brandis) ........................................................... 4608
Smith, Graeme and Wife (P W Cupido) ............................................ 4144
Small, Adam (J L Hartnick) ............................................................ 6204
Softball Federation, Western Cape (M G E Wiley) ......................... 4942
Solomons, Boebie (C F Beerwinkel) ................................................. 2466
Soloman, Kenny (E J Von Brandis) ................................................. 6203
South Peninsula High School (C F Beerwinkel) .............................. 4325
South African Police Service (M G E Wiley) .................................... 2350
Springboks (J L Hartnick) ...............................................................540,658
Springboks (P C McKenzie) .........................................................692
Springboks (E Prins) .......................................................................754
Springbok Team (E H Eloff) .............................................................2522
Springbok Rugby Team (E H Eloff) ....................................................4143, 4178, 4324
Springfield High School (C F Beerwinkel) ........................................2348
Stellenbosch Municipality (H P Geyer) ..............................................5300
Stellenbosch University Choir (J L Hartnick) ......................................2410
Stellenbosch (M Ozinsky) ..................................................................789
Stellenbosch Municipality (J J Visser) .................................................5270
Stellenbosch University Team (V Hani) ...............................................4011
Stellenbosch and Stellenberg Girls Choir (J L Hartnick) .........................6335
Steyn Elize (A Rossovou) ...................................................................2349
Stormers (J J Visser) .......................................................................4006
Sunflower Fund Ladies (M C Walters) ..................................................2466
Square Kilometre Array (SKA) (C F Beerwinkel) .................................5872
Traffic Officials (P W Cupido) ............................................................4146
Team Zealous of Stellenbosch High School (J L Hartnick) ......................695
Transplant Sports Association Athletes (J L Hartnick) .........................3950
Tourism and Rector of UWC (E J Von Brandis) ...................................4179
Tygerberg Children’s Choir (J L Hartnick) ...........................................2410
UDF (M Skwatsha) ............................................................................4180
Van der Merwe, DR Elbie (J Witbooi) ...............................................4009
Van Gyssen Eloïse (M G E Wiley) .....................................................3948
Van Niekerk, Carla (P W Cupido) ......................................................3946
Vasco da Gama Football Club (Z C Stali) ...........................................1595
Vilander Ernest (E H Eloff) ...............................................................3947
Vergotine, Valentino (Z C Stali) .........................................................4110
Volunteers uring strike (V Hani) ........................................................2482
Wacky Wine Festival (E H Eloff) .......................................................2348
Webber, June (E H Eloff) ..................................................................4321
Weideman, Philip (A J du Toit Marais) .................................................2230
Wentzel, Shaun (C F Beerwinkel) ......................................................4011
Western Cape Liquor Authority (E J Von Brandis) ...............................5273
Western Cape Primary Schools Athletics Team (C F Beerwinkel) ..........1644
Western Cape Women Farmers of the Year (M C Walters) .....................659
Western Cape Officials (M C Walters) ................................................4782
Western Cape Municipality (J J Visser) .................................................5270
WCED ...............................................................................................6338
WCED on Higher matric Pass Rate ......................................................5780
Winners of national female farmer competition (J J Visser) ...................2461
Winners: Productivity SA (E H Eloff) .................................................986
Wishing Muslim community strength and best wishes with
Witzenberg Reel Dancers (J L Hartnick) ..............................................4940
World Cup Draw (P M Jacobs) .........................................................1108
World Transplant Games (J L Hartnick) ..............................................693
Worcester Hospital Nursing School (A J Du Toit Marais) .......................6632
WP Junior Jukskei Team at SA Championships (J A van Zyl) .................1350
WP Rugby (P C McKenzie) ...............................................................838
WP Rugby Team winning Curry Cup (M G E Wiley) ............................6408
Yende, Pretty (J L Hartnick) ..............................................................755, 2408
Yende, Pretty (H P Geyer) ...............................................................4110
Zenani, Anita (V Hani) .....................................................................4114
World War II Veteran (M E G Wiley) .......................................................... 5155
2012 Olympic Squad, Western Cape Members of ..................................... 5907
Cosatu’s Actions against National Youth wage Subsidy – Motion ............ 5837
Corruption in Swellendam Municipality – Motion .................................... 4004
Correctional Service Officer, Immoral Act Between Police Woman –
Motion ........................................................................................................ 4177
Communities, Impact of “Ale” – Motion ................................................... 5148
Committee Meetings, Hessequa Mayoral – Motion ................................. 4694
Community Safety. Minister’s Inability to Mange Department of – Motion 4102
Community Safety, Remarks by Minister – Motion .................................... 4099
Community Safety, Gang Plan, Comments by MEC of – Motion ............... 5838
COPE Member rejoin ANC – Motion ......................................................... 6500
Councillor Mattheys Koch’s Failure to Declare his Interests – Motion ........ 3616
Corruption in Provincial Department - Motion .......................................... 6405
Closing Down of Civil Society Initiatives – Motion .................................... 3764
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof – Matter
Of Public Importance .................................................................................. 5742
Closure of Du Noon Child Welfare Office – Motion ................................... 6409
Curb Gangsterism, Avenues to – Motion .................................................... 6367
DA Chairpersons and Vice-Persons Elected – Motion ............................... 6635
DA Government, Inferior service Delivery by - Motion ............................... 5860
DA’s disregard for minimum standards for sanitation and provision of toilets to poor – Motion ................................................................. 2518
DA-LED Government to Employ People living with Disabilities, Failure of – Motion ................................................................. 4604
DA-Government to Provide Equal Education, Failure of – Motion .......... 5267
DA Snubs Indigenous People – Motion ...................................................... 4135
DASO Found Guilty of Contravening Three UCT SCR Election
By Laws – Motion ...................................................................................... 6327
DA Political Appointments – Motion ......................................................... 361
DA Programme: Road to 2011 – Motion .................................................... 655
DA public representative accused of rape – Motion ..................................... 2347
DA-run municipalities: incompetence of to secure base camps for
Fifa World Cup – Motion .......................................................................... 2346
DA’s inability to mobilise young people regarding
Social Cohesion – Motion ....................................................................... 1894
Dashboard Management System, Failure of – Motion ................................ 593
DA Elective Procedures – Motion ............................................................... 6493
DA’s Xenophobia – Motion ..................................................................... 2561
Deafness – Motion ................................................................................... 2521
Death at Rail Level Crossings – Motion ..................................................... 4003
Death of psychiatric patient at Karl Bremer Hospital – Motion ................. 834
Deaths in informal areas in Cape Town, continuing – Motion ................. 2562
Decade’s child rights heroes: Nelson Mandela and Graça Machel – Motion 1039
Decisions of Executive Members of previous
De Duine Primary School, Lotus River, Dog Buried Alive at – Motion ..... 4778
Provincial Government – Motion ............................................................... 2404
Denneprag Primary School, Mossel Bay to Plead for Their School to
Remain open, March to WCED District Office by - Motion ................. 6633
Delft Resident Wayne Jaffa – Motion ........................................................ 6369
Delivery of housing, alternative technology in – Motion ......................... 936
Demolition of places of worship by City of Cape Town – Motion .......... 1642
Department of Health, 83 Cases of FIU register – Motion ...................... 6459
Deputy Minister Visits Hospital and School – Motion ................................................. 6414
  Deputy Speaker:
  Announcement ............................................................................................................ 1069
  Election of .................................................................................................................. 5
  Rulings ......................................................................................................................... 528, 1583, 2333, 5138, 5292, 5693, 5742, 5805, 5825
  Deployments by Premier in Western Cape – Motion ............................................... 2561
  Deputy Speaker on 18 August 2009, Behaviour of – Motion ............................... 691
  Dire straits of farmers and communities in Southern Cape – Motion ................. 304
  Disability Initiatives – Motion .................................................................................... 1128
  Discharged from Ad Hoc Committee, Mr E J von Brandis – Motion ................. 837
  Disarray in Legislature – Motion ............................................................................... 4005
  Divide Along Racial and Language lines – Motion .................................................. 6577
  Documentary Evidence, Manipulation and disappearance of – Motion ............. 306
  Doping in School Sport – Motion ............................................................................ 5777
  Dorp Street, Walk-in Centre – Motion ..................................................................... 6460
  Drought assistance to farmers – Motion .................................................................. 2300
  Drownings of schoolchildren – Motion .................................................................. 1590
  Drug Abuse - Motion ............................................................................................... 4137
  Drug dealers, Marches against – Motion ................................................................ 606
  Drugs Seized in Goodwood – Motion ..................................................................... 5728
  Drug-Trading Zones in Cape Town – Motion ............................................................ 6377
  Dumping of babies and control measures – Motion ................................................ 2519
  Early Childhood Development, Preschool and – Motion .................................... 5150
  Economic and environmental developments, importance of Motion ................ 2369
  Economic Empowerment and Development – Motion ............................................. 5299
  Economic growth only in open, opportunity society – Motion ............................. 1592
  Economic potential and forecast beyond 2010 – Motion ......................................... 835
  Economic Recession – Motion ............................................................................... 538
  Economy – Motion ................................................................................................. 4137
  Education .................................................................................................................. 6366
  Education System, Inequality in the ...................................................................... 5858
  Education Outcome, Progress made to Improve – Motion .................................... 4175
  Efforts of ANC Government to Restrict Media Freedom –
    Motion .................................................................................................................... 2459
  Eid: 27 November 2009 – Motion ........................................................................... 1107
  Eight lives lost in fire in Khayelitsha Town two – Motion ..................................... 2571
  Electrocuted, Two Young Girls – Motion ................................................................ 4149
  Elections, Gangsterism During – Motion ................................................................ 5726
  Environmental and Health Issues – Motion ............................................................. 1744
  Entrepreneurial Leader of the Year Award – Motion .............................................. 6502
  Equity Targets – Motion .......................................................................................... 5912
  Equity Share Land Reform Schemes – Motion .......................................................... 6379
  Eskom tariff increase and top management – Motion ............................................. 1010
  Eskom's tariff increases – Motion ............................................................................ 1642
  Eviction of Farm Workers - Motion .......................................................................... 4005
  Expenditure of City of Cape Town – Motion .............................................................. 2407
  Expenditure of ratepayers’ money – Motion ............................................................. 2561
  Executive statement by the Minister of Local Government,
  Employment Equity Report, Commission of – Motion ................................. 6201
  Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .............................................. 2334
  Failure of WCED to indicate how money was Spent, Shutting Down of
    15 Schools – Motion .............................................................................................. 6628
  Family Expo in May – Motion .................................................................................. 2232
Inquiry into Policing, Commission of
International Volunteers Day
Initiation Practices Condemned
Informal Settlements, Appalling Living Conditions
Increase in Rats
Increase in Street Children
Incorporation of municipal police in SAPS
Imvelo Responsible Tourism Award
Implementation of Planning Act, 1999: debate
Impact of HIV/AIDS and Violence
Impact of civil servant strike on service delivery and economic
development in Western Cape
Impact of HIV/AIDS and Violence
Implementation of Planning Act, 1999: debate
Implementation of Western Cape Planning and Development Act
Hon Mcebisi Skwatsha refused entry into Nomination Process
HIV Campaign, Get Tested and
Hillview Housing Development Project, Delay in
Huguenot Primary School Mitchells Plain, Opening of
Hunting Regulations
Human Settlements, Integrated and Sustainable
Housing subsidies, Approval of
Housing and serviced Sites Target
Housing development in Delft
Housing List for Eerste River and Blue Downs, City of

Beaufort West and Montagu Hospitals – Motion
Heavy rains in Western Cape – Motion
High Court Documents, Falsification of – Motion
High Levels of Learners not Reaching Matric – Motion
Hip Hop Media Lounge and Other projects: Rasool’s and
Huguenot Primary School Mitchells Plain, Opening of – Motion
Hillview Housing Development Project, Delay in – Motion
HIV Campaign, Get Tested and
Hon Mcebisi Skwatsha refused entry into Nomination Process –

---

Gugulethu Seven Massacre Anniversary – Motion
H1N1 Virus, Number of deaths as a result of – Motion
Health Care Facilities, Construction and Upgrading of - Motion
Health Care Systems in Rual Areas – Motion
Health Practitioners: Scrapping of names – Motion
Health Rights and responsibilities, Review of – Motion
Health Workers, Acknowledgement of Personnel of Nelspoort,

House, Business of – Motions
Housing Indaba – Motion
Health, International Award to Western Cape Department - Motion
Health Department, Wasteful Expenditure by - Motion
Houses, Poor quality – Motion
Housing and serviced Sites Target – Motion
Housing development in Delft – Motion
Housing List for Eerste River and Blue Downs, City of

Cape Town’s – Motion
Housing subsidies, Approval of – Motion
Housing subsidies, Failure to Allocate – Motion
Hout Bay, Building of new housing units in – Motion
Human Settlements, Integrated and Sustainable – Motion
Hunting Regulations – Motion
ID-ANC Coalition – Motion
IG Monitor Report - Motion
Illegal Advertising, Proliferation of – Motion

Impact of civil servant strike on service delivery and economic
development in Western Cape – Motion
Impact of HIV/AIDS and Violence – Motion
Implementation of Planning Act, 1999: debate – Motion
Implementation of Western Cape Planning and Development Act

Imvelo Responsible Tourism Award – Motion
Inability of City of Cape Town to spend its Capital – Motion
Incorporation of municipal police in SAPS – Motion
Increased property rates – Motion
Increase in Street Children – Motion
Increase in Rats – Motion
Informal Settlements, Appalling Living Conditions – Motion
Initiation sites – Motion
Initiation Practices Condemned – Motion
Interference with Informal Traders – Motion
International Volunteers Day – Motion
Inquiry into Policing, Commission of – Motion
Inspected Wiese and women of Drew, Bonnievale for Hospitality during
Search for bodies, Thanks to – Motion ........................................ 542
Integrated Human Settlement, Development of – Motion .................. 5838
Interference by Premier in School Visit – Motion ........................ 3941
International Children’s Day – Motion ..................................... 2303
International Exhibition, Removal of – Motion ............................. 6415
International Human Rights Day – Motion .................................. 4940
International Nurses Day – Motion .......................................... 2229
International Women’s Day – Motion ...................................... 5152
Investigation: misleading of House by Premier – Motion .............. 906
Invitation, Withdrawal of - Motion ............................................ 5727
June Examination – Motion ...................................................... 3946
Junior Rugby Championship, International under 20 – Motion ....... 5910
Kannaland – Motion .................................................................. 4141
Kasparov, Garry Grandmaster – Motion ..................................... 5302
Kenny Africa, Appointment of – Motion ..................................... 2225
Killing of Mgqontshi and Ncatana couple in Philippi East – Motion .. 752
Khayelitsha Protest, Policeman injured in – Motion .................... 612
Khayelitsha Fire, Four Children Die – Motion ............................. 4150
Khayelitsha Writing Forum – Motion .......................................... 4150
Khayelitsha Schemes, Shutting down of Feeding – Motion ........... 4173
Khayelitsha, Vigilantism – Motion ............................................. 5726
Lack of job opportunities for emerging businesses in Western Cape –
Motion ..................................................................................... 2563
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government – Motion .... 5787
Lavis Drive Primary, Furniture Inventory at – Motion ................... 6499
Land from Stellenbosch Municipality to Fifa, Transfer of – Motion .... 536
Large-Scale Fraud among Northern Cape ANC Leadership – Motion .. 6571
Learners and Educators, Safety of – Motion .................................. 4602
Learners Protest about having to pay for Textbooks – Motion ........ 5150
Local Government, Financial Situation of – Motion ....................... 5859
Maintenance of Flats in Townships – Motion ............................... 2477
Makhaza Toilets – Motion ....................................................... 6416
Management of Fisheries and Small Boat Harbours – Motion ........ 3940
Mandela Park Housing – Motion .............................................. 782
Mandela, Nelson Foundation – Motion ....................................... 5729
Manipulation of Crime Figures in Western Cape – Motion ............. 2477
Matters Pertaining to Farmworkers – Motion ................................. 6493
Matric Passes, University of Western Cape Project to Improve Number and Quality of – Motion .................................................. 4703
Measles outbreak in province – Motion ...................................... 2122
MEC for Community Safety: Role and Duties – Motion ................ 609
MEC for Education, Wasteful expenditure by – Motion .................. 592
MEC Botha’s Intimidating DA Member – Motion ........................... 6501
MEC: Leaking of SAPS information and attack on Commissioner –
Motion ................................................................................. 362
Mayoral Committee Member, Untoward Behaviour by – Motion ....... 5868
Members, Embarrassment and poor treatment of – Motion .......... 689
Members, Executive Paid to go on Hunting Trip of – Motion .......... 4554
Member of SCOPA, ANC Member Mr M Ozinsky Fitness of –
Motion ................................................................................. 4775
Members, new:
Announcement..................................................................................................................5695
Election of Premier and Speaker of Western Cape Provincial Parliament.................................................................2
Oath or Solemn Affirmation......................................................................................................................1

Members, Statements by ........................................ 9,96,298,528,582,597,648,679,739,775,825,898, ..................................................924,970,1004,1029,1101,1281,1287,1583,1635,1735,2165, ..................................................2115, 2219, 2250, 2291, 2338, 2362, 2397, 2453, 2469, 2511, 2549, ..................................................3757, 3933, 3996, 4125, 4166, 4310, 4586, 4685, 4766, 4929, 5140, 5259, 5292, 5718, 5741, 5769, 5828, 5850, 5892, 6194, 6250, 6308, 6357, 6397, 6443, 6485, 6562, 6622

Military Veterans – Motion ..........................................................................................................................4318
Military Veterans, Assistance to – Motion .....................................................................................................5727
Millennium Development Goals Youth Conference – Motion ...........................................................................6639
Mitchells Plain Hospital, Construction of – Motion .......................................................................................4137
Misleading pamphlet regarding extension of R300 – Motion .......................................................................982
Misrepresentations by ANC – Motion ............................................................................................................834
Mitchells Plain Policing and Vigilantism – Motion .........................................................................................749

Mr J J Visser: Statement on Women during debate – Motion ........................................................................610
Modernisation Programme of Provincial Government – Motion .................................................................608
Money-lenders and shebeen owners: effect and impact of – Motion ...............................................................2371
Money paid to Premier – Motion ..................................................................................................................4002
Mossel Bay Municipality Mayor, Racist Stance of – Motion ...........................................................................5912
Manipulation by EMS Staff of Triage System – Motion ..................................................................................2405

Minister Saves Saartjie Baartman Centre – Motion ......................................................................................5777
Minister of Education, Refuse to meet with Grabouw Learners – Motion .....................................................5140
Minister of Housing, No-Show of – Motion ....................................................................................................4693
Municipal Disaster Management Plans, Investigation into – Motion ............................................................783

Municipal Election, Youth Contribution – Motion ..........................................................................................3952

Municipal Hostel, in Langa – Motion ............................................................................................................4553

Municipal IQ Hotspot Monitor Findings - Motion .............................................................................................5910

Municipal Governance, status of – Motion .....................................................................................................5267

Municipal Pools, Swimming Training Programmes at – Motion .......................................................................690

Municipal rates fiasco – Motion .....................................................................................................................2259

Municipal Tenders in Province – Motion .......................................................................................................4003

Name Changes – Motion ...............................................................................................................................1745

National Competency, Making of Academic Hospitals – Motion .................................................................5266
National Competencies, Usurpation of – Motion .............................................................................................5910

National Farmer of the Year - Motion .............................................................................................................6374
National Minister of Police – Motion ..............................................................................................................2375

National Health Insurance, Green Paper on – Motion ...................................................................................4182

NCOP:

Authority of delegation to ...............................................................................................................................6
Permanent delegates, Appointment of ...........................................................................................................5
New National Youth Agency – Motion ...........................................................................................................143
NGO’s in Province, Funding Cuts to – Motion .................................................................................................6265
Night Shelters, Status – Motion ....................................................................................................................6201
No Violence Campaign, 16 Days of Activism – Motion .................................................................................4697
Non-attendance of committee clerk: no committee meeting held – Motion ..................................................1643
NSRI Rescue Operation: Crew of Seli 1 – Motion .........................................................................................752

N1 “Road of Death”, Ongoing Carnage on – Motion .......................................................................................4694
Office of the Speaker: Xenophobia Campaign – Motion .............................................................................362
Official of City Council demoted – Motion ...................................................................................................2344
Offloading of Corpses – Motion ........................................... 1745
Older Persons Act, implementation of – Motion ..................... 2370
Organ Donor Month – Motion ........................................... 612
Organ Donor Month as August – Motion ................................. 2409
Open Fields, Women Raped in ........................................... 4603
Open opportunity society – Motion ..................................... 606
Overcrowded Trains, Danger Commuters face in – Motion .... 4603
Oversight role of Provincial Parliament, Importance of – Motion . 2259
Overstrand Municipality Land Sale – Motion ............................ 539
Overstrand Municipality: 2009 Cleanest Town Competition – Motion 1109
Paarl, Houses to be Built – Motion ....................................... 4005
Parliamentary Committees: Importance and Impact – Motion . 657
Parliamentary Committees, Importance of ............................. 2345
Partnering with non-profit organisations – Motion .................. 1745
Paulse, Ms S U, Statement of – Motion .................................. 656
People Affected by Rains – Motion ..................................... 4002
Peoples’ Republic of China – Motion ..................................... 5726
Personal Explanation:
PHP: support by Department of Human Settlements – Motion .... 2122
Piracy by State of Israel – Motion ........................................ 2300
Plight of residents of Leonsdale – Motion ............................... 2260
Police Officials, Killings and Suicides amongst – Motion ....... 4136
Police Officers, Cape Town Metropolitan – Motion .................. 4140
Politicising appointment of secretary to parliament – motion .. 2563
Pollution of Eerste River – Motion ......................................... 935
Pollution of water resources, Control of – Motion .................... 2227
Poor Service delivery with Housing in Oudtshoorn – Motion .... 2477
Poor infrastructure and under spending in Poor Areas in Western
Cape – Motion .................................................................... 6258
Possession of Drugs, Arrest of 27 People in Mitchells Plain for – Motion........ 6377
Power between Executive and Legislature, Separation of – Motion . 687
Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures
Act – Motion .................................................................... 266
Pregnancy, rewarding girls who don’t fall pregnant – Motion .......... 2299
Premier, Misleading statements by – Motion ........................... 15
Premier’s rejection of SAHRC ruling on Makhaza housing debacle –
Motion ........................................................................... 2404
Protection of Information Bill – Motion .................................... 4774
Princess Vlei Rezoning – Motion .......................................... 5902
Programming Authority’s Role, Engagement of Political Parties in
Legislature with regard to – Motion ....................................... 6259
Public Property, Civil unrest and damage to – Motion ................ 5266
Max L: Remunerative Work – Motion ..................................... 4935
Max, Lennit Still in Office – Motion ........................................ 4935
Minister’s Inability to Mange Department of Community Safety. - Motion .. 4102
Minister Remarks by Community Safety -Motion ....................... 4099
Mayoral committee Members, Racist Tactics of – Motion ............. 5900
National Reconciliation Day Celebrations – Motion .................. 4939
Night Schools – Motion .................................................... 4100
Premier:
Election of .................................................................. ........................ 2
Opening Address of......................................................... 22, 1445
Opening Address of – Debate .............................................. 39,72,1468
Executive Statement.................................................................2393, 6189
President’s Support, Approval of commitment to Youth Wage Subsidy
  Motion ...................................................................................5839
Premier, Consolidated Monitoring and Evaluation Report of – Motion ........5906
Premier’s Appointment of Male MECS – Motion ..........................3939
Premier’s Calling, Labelling People from Eastern Cape Refugees –
  Motion ...................................................................................5300
Premier’s Department, Employee Found Guilty – Motion ............5866
Premier, Remuneration of – Motion ........................................1084
Premier, Secondment of staff to office of – Motion .......................15
Premier’s State of the Province Address .....................................4997
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .........................5018
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed) ..........5095
Premier, SOPA announcement – Motion ....................................3615
Premier’s SOPA announcement: debate – Motion .......................1591
Premier: Undermining Stellenbosch Municipality – Motion ............750
Preparedness for epidemics – Motion ........................................1590
Princess Vlei: Economic and Environmental implications of shopping mall
  – Motion .................................................................................748
Project in Kuilsriver, “Adopt a Matriculant” – Motion .................5152
Provincial Development Council, Closing down of – Motion .........2225
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook – Tabling and consideration .1042
Provincial Hospitals, Lack of Security at – Motion .......................4102
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
  (Consideration and finalisation) ...............................................4784
Provincial Legislature, disregarding of isiXhosa language in – Motion 982
Province, Anti-Poverty Strategy in – Motion ...............................690
Province, child abuse in – Motion .............................................905
Province, Violence in Sport in – Motion .....................................609
Provincial Parliament, Oversight role of – Motion .........................748
Provincial Roads, High accident rate on – Motion .......................655
Public school problems and resources – Motion ...........................836
Racist Manager, Sacking of – Motion ........................................4701
Radio appearances by Premier and Mayor of city of Cape Town – Motion .2564
Rail Commuter Action Group: Mr Leslie Van Minnen – Motion .........144
Removal by Government of Babies from Place of Safety – Motion ........3940
Report of SIU, Distribution of Interim before its Release – Motion ....4103
Removal of small business traders – Motion ................................2226
Removal, Community Safety for – Motion ..................................5845
Research Support Service, Technical and – Motion ......................4317
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
  Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) .................1624
Report of Auditor-General: Contracts given to Civil Servants – Motion 142
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on
  National Health Amendment Bill [B24d - 2011] (NCOP)
  (Consideration) ......................................................................6520
Report of Standing Committee on Education on Further
  Education and Training Colleges Amendment Bill
  [B13D - 2011] (NCOP) (Consideration) ..................................4784
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4-2011]
  (NCOP) – Consideration .........................................................3973
Report on Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Amendment
  Bill [B33 - 2012] (NCOP) (Consideration) ..............................6520
Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D-2010] (NCOP) – (Consideration) .................. 3982

Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D - 2010] (Reprint)(NCOP) (Consideration) .......................................................... 4117

Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Sectional Titles - Schemes ........... Management Bill [B20B-2010] (NCOP) - Consideration .................. 3974

Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Community Sections Ombud Service Bill [B21B - 2011] (NCOP) – Consideration .... 3974

Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4—2010] (NCOP)(Consideration) .......................................................... 1635, 1735

Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B17-2011] (NCOP) (Consideration) ......................... 4784

Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) .......................................................... 1109

Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) ............... 1273

Report of Conduct Committee on complaints lodged against current and former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament – Motion ..................... 1011

Report on Study Visit, Standing committee on – Motion ........................................ 5868

Report on role of Pieter van Dalen in shooting of two children in Khayelitsha – Motion .............................................................................. 2520

Report of Standing Committee on Education, Cultural Affairs and Sport on visit to Uitzig Secondary School (Consideration) ................................................. 1012

Report of Standing Committee on Community Development On Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010] (NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010] (NCOP) (Consideration) – Motion .......................................................... 3563


Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on Social assistance Amendment bill [B5B—2010] (Consideration) ............. 2503

Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .......................................................... 757,790

Report of Standing Committee on Governance on National House of Traditional Leaders Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) .......................................................... 910

Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Traditional Leadership and Government Framework Amendment Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) .......................................................... 910

Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) .............................................................................. 4611

Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration of Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health – (Consideration) .............................................................................. 4270

Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) .............................................................................. 4277

Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) .............................................................................. 4286

Report of Rules Committee on amendments to standing Rules (Consideration) .............................................................................. 4562
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resignations, Current Trend – Motion</td>
<td>4175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revival of Bills – Motion</td>
<td>1599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richdiversity of Culture – Motion</td>
<td>5835</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rift Valley fever in province – Motion</td>
<td>2123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roadblocks over weekend – Motion</td>
<td>2567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role of Mr Walters in encouraging Overstrand Municipality to</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commission report – Motion</td>
<td>904</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role of seat of national Parliament in nation-building – Motion</td>
<td>932</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosh Hashanah – Motion</td>
<td>6207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rules Committee:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representation of parties</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Areas Development, Opportunities for Growth – Motion</td>
<td>4173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Areas, Socio-Welfare and economic circumstances in – Motion</td>
<td>746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Development: Optimisation – Motion</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pike, Mama Lizzie, Speedy recovery – Motion</td>
<td>4610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Junior Bodyboarding Champion – Motion</td>
<td>6498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Cancellation of Flights – Motion</td>
<td>5901</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPS, Commendation to – Motion</td>
<td>6579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPS, Acts against Drug Dealers – Motion</td>
<td>6638</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saartjie Baartman Centre – Motion</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe festive season to motorists and pedestrians – Motion</td>
<td>1293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe Transportation of Learners – Motion</td>
<td>2518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety and well-being of children over festive season – Motion</td>
<td>1294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety Home Campaign – Motion</td>
<td>6251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety of personnel at hospitals – Motion</td>
<td>2257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety of People, SAPS Responsible for – Motion</td>
<td>5901</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saldanha Industrial development Region - Motion</td>
<td>5903</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salute to Liezel Van der Westhuizen – Motion</td>
<td>4114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salute to Dean Stockenstrom – Motion</td>
<td>4114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salutation to Smile Foundation – Motion</td>
<td>3769, 4111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation Problems in Khayelitsha – Motion</td>
<td>6494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shortage of Drug and Alcohol Rehabilitation Centres – Motion</td>
<td>3616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salutation to Shout Foundation – Motion</td>
<td>3770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPS: Lie detector tests – Motion</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Roadlink Bus Service: statement by MEC – Motion</td>
<td>2123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seasonal Diseases, Victims of – Motion</td>
<td>5154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretarial Allowances, Constituency and – Motion</td>
<td>4103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery, Project Reclaim Disruption of – Motion</td>
<td>5300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School buses near Botriver – Motion</td>
<td>2481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Buses, Surveillance Cameras on – Motion</td>
<td>4557</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School libraries, state and funding of – Motion</td>
<td>981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schools, Overcrowded – Motion</td>
<td>4174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schools, Violence in – Motion</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOPA Meeting - Motion</td>
<td>5776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Season on Roads, Safe Festive – Motion</td>
<td>4936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secrecy around cabinet reshuffle – Motion</td>
<td>2560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service delivery, Derica Lambrechts in Townships on - Motion</td>
<td>5836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery Problems in DA-Run Municipalities – Motion</td>
<td>3764</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery, Impact of – Motion</td>
<td>5148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery, Integrated – Motion</td>
<td>5836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery, Death of Babies due to Lack of – Motion</td>
<td>5149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Extention of MyCiti Bus,</td>
<td>5837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cape Chamber of Commerce’s View – Motion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Subjects for discussion:
Student Uprising, 11 August 1976
Students, Study bursaries to Street people in Cape Town and rest of province, Condition and care of Stellenbosch, Proposed soccer stadium in Stabbing amongst Students in Schools
Sports Day, Change of date of Sport as unifying factor
Spending, City of Cape Town of
Special Needs Schools: Learners ...
Speaker's Handling of Legislature and its Affairs
Speaker's car accident
Social House Project in Bothasig Gardens, Launch of R55 Million – Motion
Social Development attend COP17, Representatives of Western Cape
Department of
Social Transformation Programme, Continuation of – Motion
Social Inclusion, Principles and Concept of – Motion
Somalia, Relieve Efforts in – Motion
Speaker:
Acceptance speech by ........................................................................ 4
Announcements .................................................................................. 1029, 1445, 1468
Apology by Deputy Speaker .................................................................. 824
Conduct in House .............................................................................. 596
Debates of ........................................................................ 80,560,1085,1129,1602, 2352, 3953, 4743, 5241, 6274
Election of ......................................................................................... 2
Interpretation ....................................................................................... 969
Women Redefining Leadership ................................................................ 4069
Rulings ..................................................................................... 72, 109, 329, 360, 646, 678, 968, 2219, 2573, 3980, 6364
UCC Primary School. Closure of Grootkraal – Motion .......................... 4101
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women .................................................. 2430
Service Increased, Local Goods Procurement of – Motion ....................... 4560
Small Business – Motion ...................................................................... 6267
Speaker's car accident – Motion .............................................................. 747
Speaker’s Handling of Legislature and its Affairs – Motion ......................... 3940
Special Needs Schools: Learners at – Motion .............................................. 2405
Spending, City of Cape Town of – Motion ................................................. 4319
Sport as unifying factor – Motion ............................................................. 747
Sports Day, Change of date of – Motion .................................................. 688
Stabbing amongst Students in Schools – Motion ......................................... 6378
Stellenbosch, Proposed soccer stadium in – Motion .................................. 606
St Luke’s Hospice - Motion .................................................................... 4557
Street people in Cape Town and rest of province, Condition and care of – Motion ................................................................. 2174
Students, Study bursaries to – Motion ...................................................... 750
Student Uprising, 11 August 1976 – Motion ............................................. 4144
Subjects for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape .............................................................. 6339
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ............................................... 4704
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ....................................... 2378
Conditions in places where poor people live ......................................... 2524
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .................................................................. 4184
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities .......................................................................................... 4151
Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape .................................. 6212
Economic Empowerment and Development, Success
Achieved in Respect of ........................................................................ 5805
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Equity Share Land Reform Schemes</td>
<td>6379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom Day: 16 Years later</td>
<td>2180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heritage Day</td>
<td>809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape</td>
<td>989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River</td>
<td>1012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery</td>
<td>4614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing development in Delft</td>
<td>1047</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system</td>
<td>661</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape</td>
<td>542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession</td>
<td>695</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of development for young people</td>
<td>2262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lost of Children’s Live on Cape Flats</td>
<td>6462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU against Implementation of</td>
<td>5917</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape</td>
<td>6417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Order of the Day, Point of Order, Programming of</td>
<td>4269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on</td>
<td>5161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports</td>
<td>6588</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government</td>
<td>2484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policing in Mitchells Plain</td>
<td>879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems in Bitou Municipality</td>
<td>940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removal of small business traders</td>
<td>2307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results of Census 2011</td>
<td>6502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety on public transport in Western Cape</td>
<td>2232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Fisheries</td>
<td>4014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual Offences Act, Changes to – Motion</td>
<td>5861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shortage of Beds at Helderberg Hospital – Motion</td>
<td>6636</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas</td>
<td>840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-Economic Impact, Protest marches becoming Violent of - Motion</td>
<td>5839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South African Excels Abroad - Motion</td>
<td>5865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement by Mr Ozinsky – Motion</td>
<td>4552</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements made by Premier</td>
<td>618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summons served on unemployed tenants in townships – Motion</td>
<td>2300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supply chain management and role of speaker and politicians in awarding of tenders and contracts – Motion</td>
<td>2519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surprise visit by President Zuma – Motion</td>
<td>2569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suspension of public sector strike by Unions – Motion</td>
<td>2568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success to Grade 12 Learners with upcoming Examination – Motion</td>
<td>6319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swellendam Municipality: offences, anomalies and bottlenecks – Motion</td>
<td>2346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swellendam Municipality – Motion</td>
<td>6368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swine Flu, Preparations for outbreak of – Motion</td>
<td>591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Targeting of prostitutes – Motion</td>
<td>833</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB Awareness Month – Motion</td>
<td>5267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxi crash: wishes for speedy recovery – Motion</td>
<td>2569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxi Drivers, Course on Road Etiquette for – Motion</td>
<td>688</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxi Industry, Two-Year Peach in - Motion</td>
<td>5153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxis, Reckless driving of – Motion</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax, Report on Investigation into Conversion – Motion</td>
<td>3616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxi, Report on Investigation to be referred back to Committees</td>
<td>3617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxi Strike – Motion</td>
<td>1744</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ten Best Restaurants in South Africa – Motion</td>
<td>6635</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Textbooks, Questioned, Delivery of – Motion .................................................. 5901
Teaching Programmes, Winter Holiday .............................................................. 4145
Teaching Award, Top National – Motion ............................................................ 4556
Teenage pregnancies – Motion ......................................................................... 2560
Teenage Pregnancy, Socio-Economic impact of – Motion ................................. 5860
Technical Programmes, Structural Collapse – Motion ......................................... 4698
Temporary Chairpersons:
  Appointment of ................................................................................................. 7
Strike in de Doorns, Farm workers - Motion ....................................................... 6450
Temporary Relocation Areas - Motion ................................................................ 6450
Textile and clothing workers’ struggle – Motion ............................................... 751
Thanks and good wishes to Dr Boesak – Motion .............................................. 987
Thanks to Disaster Control Centre – Motion ..................................................... 1597
Thanks to SAPS, Metro Police, Premier and Mr J P Smith – Motion .................. 938
Tik dealers receiving grants – Motion ................................................................ 784
Toilets in Makhaza – Motion ............................................................................ 6461
Top Teachers Award – Motion ......................................................................... 6495
Tourism Industry in Crisis – Motion ................................................................... 4103
Traffic Police Officer, shortage of – Motion ...................................................... 4100
Translation problems in Legislature – Motion .................................................... 6405
Transnet strike, Impact of – Motion ................................................................... 2259
Transport crisis: Government’s response – Motion ........................................... 607
Transport System, Bus Rapid – Motion .............................................................. 4555
Tygerberg Hospital – Motion ........................................................................... 4553
Tygerburg hospital, Gratitude to – Motion ......................................................... 6573
Tygerberg, New Hospital at – Motion ................................................................. 686
Unblocking of blocked housing projects – Motion ............................................. 2123
Underutilisation of former Model C school buildings – Motion ......................... 1895
Unemployment, high rate of – Motion ............................................................... 2347
Unguarded Rail Crossings – Motion .................................................................. 2518
Unhealthy Conditions in TRAS – Motion ........................................................... 2405
Unhealthy and Dangerous Sanitation – Motion ................................................. 4138
Unruly conduct of Ravensmead DA councillor – Motion ................................... 835
UN Summit on Global Warming COP 17 – Motion ........................................... 4698
Upcoming tourism entrepreneur – Motion ......................................................... 2229
Utilisation of Stadiums in Western Cape – Motion ............................................ 2476
Vehicles, Farm workers Transported on back of – Motion ................................. 5148
Victims of houses burnt down in Khayelitsha, Heideveld and
  Belhar – Motion ............................................................................................... 2567
Victims of taxi disaster in Blackheath – Motion ............................................... 2520
Victims of Informal Settlements fires – Motion ................................................. 5864
Vigilantism in Khayelitsha – Motion ................................................................. 5860
Violence Against Farm Dwellers – Motion ......................................................... 5915
Violence in schools – Motion ............................................................................ 2257
Violence on our trains – Motion ......................................................................... 2175
Violence against Women and Children, Praise to Akhona Meyi for
  Championing ending for – Motion ................................................................... 4561
Visit to Britain, Premier Badmouthing our Country and Turning
  Investors away on – Motion ............................................................................ 6326
Water, Availability and State of – Motion .......................................................... 6366
Water Scarce Resource .................................................................................... 5838
Water Wastage by City of Cape Town – Motion .............................................. 6454
Ward Committees - Motion ................................................................................ 4318
WCED, Educator posts in – Motion .............................................................. 784
WCED, High number of sexual abuse cases in – Motion .......................... 591
WCED: vacant posts and supply of qualified teachers – Motion .................. 832
WCPP’S unqualified Audit Report – Motion .............................................. 2407
Western Cape Agriculture Awards .......................................................... 5158
Western Cape Agricultural Sector, awards in – Motion ........................... 907
Western Cape, Free pap smears for Women in – Motion ........................... 594
Western Cape Model of Land Reform – Motion ........................................ 2403
Western Cape, Storm damage in – Motion ............................................... 364
Western Cape, Traffic Department Award – Motion ................................... 5270
Western Cape Hospitals, Security and Safety of – Motion ......................... 537
Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Modernisation Strategy of – Motion ...... 592
Western Cape road infrastructure – Motion .............................................. 935
Western Cape Spatial Development Framework – Motion ........................ 937
Wilberforce, William and the Abolition of Slavery – Motion ....................... 4775
Withdrawal and Reduction of Funding - Motion ......................................... 3764
Women in Western Cape Province, Status of – Motion ............................. 16
Women’s Day, Premier and Commemoration of – Motion .......................... 4136
Xenophobia in De Doorns: investigative and disciplinary process
  – Motion .................................................................................................. 1036
Xenophobia, plans to deal with – Motion ................................................. 2346
Xenophobic violence in province – Motion .............................................. 2369
Youth, International Year of – Motion ...................................................... 4147
Youth, Strategies to Deal with Social Ills Affecting – Motion ....................... 5147
Zero-tolerance approach of WCED – Motion .......................................... 1894
2010 Soccer: involvement of structures in sports, arts and culture
  – Motion .................................................................................................. 1592
2010 Soccer World Cup, Legacy of – Motion ............................................ 2225
2010 Soccer World Cup: Public Transport – Motion .................................. 538
2010 Soccer World Cup, Readiness of Western Cape hospitals for
  – Motion .................................................................................................. 2258
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, disaster management readiness
  During Motion .......................................................................................... 932
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, preparations for – Motion ................. 906
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament: Sex industry and Human Trafficking
  – Motion .................................................................................................. 748
52nd Anniversary, Langa Massacres – Motion ........................................... 5271
52nd Anniversary, Sharpeville Massacres – Motion ................................... 5271
2012 Emerging Tourism Entrepreneur Winner – Motion ............................. 5903
2012 Govan Mbeki Best Priority Project Award – Motion ........................ 5915
110% Green Campaign – Motion ............................................................ 5904
515 Suspects in Mitchells Plain, Arrest of – Motion .................................... 6457
INDEX TO SPEECHES

ADAMS, F (NCOP)
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ............................................... 758,795
Statements .................................................................................... 685

BEERWINKEL, C F
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service
Commissioner .............................................................................. 915
Cape Town Routs, Unlimited into Wesgro Incorporation of .......... 5147
City of Cape Town, implications of growth of ......................... 932
Celebration of Eid-Al-Adha .......................................................... 6369
Children, conditions under which children grow up .............. 2304
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact
on Communities ........................................................................... 4151
Crisis, Tourism industry in ........................................................... 4103
Condolence, Motion of:
Family of seven and baby ............................................................ 1746
Jack, Neville Michael .................................................................. 4558
Kakaza, Leslie .............................................................................. 4112
Schoolchildren and those who have died playing sport ........... 1595
Congratulations:
Cavellereia Primary School ......................................................... 5153
Chiu Alexander .......................................................................... 3950
Equal Education ........................................................................ 2411
Kotze Dewaldre ........................................................................ 2377
Provincial Athletic Trials ............................................................. 2306
Solomons, Boebie ...................................................................... 2466
Springfield High School .............................................................. 2348
Western Cape Primary Schools Athletics Team ...................... 1644
Dire straits of farmers and communities in Southern Cape ...... 904
Drowning of schoolchildren ....................................................... 1590
Executive statement: De Doorns ................................................. 2336
June Examination ...................................................................... 3946
Learners, Grade 12 ..................................................................... 4558
Misleading pamphlet regarding extension of R300 ................. 982
Office of Premier, Secondment of staff ..................................... 37
Pregnancy, rewarding girls who don’t fall pregnant ............... 2299
South Peninsula High School ..................................................... 4325
Square Kilometre Array (SKA) .................................................... 5872
Wentzel, Shaun ........................................................................ 4011
Education ..................................................................................... 6366
Funding of Cape Firm Commission .................................. 6494
Green Economic Accord, Singing of .................................... 4702
House, Business of .................................................................... 6682
Interference with Informal Traders ........................................... 6501
Matrics to attend Winter Schools, Encouragement to ......... 4013
Premier:
Opening Address of ................................................................... 1513
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................... 5039
Princess Vlei: Economic and Environmental implications of shopping mall .............................................. 748
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) .................................. 1628
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) ................................................................. 1118
Service Increased, Local Goods Procurement of .................................. 4560
Speaker's Debate:
   Economic Freedom of the Youth .................................................. 3971
Special Needs Schools: Learners at .................................................. 2405
Statements ...... 582,602,974,1007,2118,2165, 2294, 2364, 2454, 2472, 2513 ................................................................. 3757, 4586, 4685, 4932, 5853, 6358
Subject for discussion:
   Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ............................. 2379
   Conditions in places where poor people live ................................. 2527
   Empowerment and Development, Success Achieved in Respect of ............................................................. 5805
   High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ................................................. 1014
   Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ......................................................... 701
   Lack of development for young people ........................................... 2268
   Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ................................... 6417
   Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on .......................................... 5169
   Policing in Mitchells Plain ............................................................ 885
   Problems in Bitou Municipality ..................................................... 948
   Results of Census 2011 ................................................................. 6511
   Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .. 852
   Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
   Role of Provincial Government in ................................................. 2421
   Taxis, Reckless driving of ............................................................... 306
   UCC Primary School. Closure of Grootkraal .................................. 4101
   Underutilisation of former Model C school buildings ...................... 1895
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............ 1337
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
   Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................................ 347
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ................ 377
   Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .......................................... 406
   Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 498
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
   Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................ 1868
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 2047
Western Cape Spatial Development Framework .................................. 937
Xenophobia, plans to deal with ......................................................... 2346
Zero-tolerance approach of WCED .................................................... 1894
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
   Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................ 3843
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
   (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ........................................ 4877
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
   (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .......... 4883
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ......................................................... 4972
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation
Bill [B4- 2012](2011/2012 Financial Year)
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 5275
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ................................................... 5447
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 –
Economic Development and Tourism) ...................................................... 5681
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 5738
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 6649

BEKKER, J
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................................. 1497
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .......... 914
Condolence, Motion of:
Mantashe, Madolwana and Cilliers, Messrs ........................................ 1294
Ncedana, Mr V ....................................................................................... 1645
Nonzwana, Ntombizonke ........................................................................ 908
Executive Houses, Poor quality .............................................................. 690
Premier: .................................................................................................. 58, 1518
Opening Address of .................................................................................. 58, 1518
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ..................................... 1627
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) ....................................................................................... 1114
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration)... 1276
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ............................................... 759,793
Speaker's Debate:
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship .................................... 86
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
Children .................................................................................................. 1137
Statements ............................................................................................. 900, 2117, 2168, 2398
Subject for discussion:
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools .................................. 2382
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ......................... 994
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ................................. 1018
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ............................. 663
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape .... 546
Problems in Bitou Municipality ............................................................... 952
Removal of small business traders ....................................................... 2314
Statements made by Premier ................................................................. 622
Taxis, Reckless driving of ....................................................................... 306
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................................... 1231
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................... 1311
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................................. 1324
Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................................... 1362
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................... 202
   Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................. 223
   Vote 6 – Health ................................................................. 283
   Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................. 345
   Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ...................................... 403
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
   Second Reading ........................................................................... 1671
   Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................ 1760
   Vote 5 – Education ...................................................................... 1871
   Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ....................................................... 1902
   Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................. 1957
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .......................................... 2045
   Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ........................................ 2069
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill
   [B6—2009] Consideration of principle ............................................. 1081
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, preparations for ..................... 906

BEVU, T N –
   Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ............... 2582
   Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apilé School AND Implications thereof .... 5745
   Closing ...................................................................................... 6792
   Condolence, Motion of:
      Asmal, Kader ............................................................................ 3978
      Farewell, Mr P M Jacobs ......................................................... 4322
   House, Business of .................................................................... 6682
   Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government .............. 5793
   Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ................................ 6417
   Premier:
      Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ....................... 5044
   Pike, Mama Lizzie, Speedy recovery ............................................ 4610
   Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
      On Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010]
         (NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010]
         (NCOP) (Consideration) ......................................................... 3564
   Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
      Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health –
         (Consideration) ..................................................................... 4274
   Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
      (Consideration) ....................................................................... 4294
   Speaker’s Debate:
      Economic Freedom of the Youth ............................................... 3964
      Women Redefining Leadership .................................................. 4079
      World AIDS Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
         Against Women and Children ................................................. 4752
   Statements .... 2471, 4129, 4548, 4588, 4686, 5261, 5294, 6196, 6252, 6445,
                  ................................................................. 6487
Subject for discussion:
   Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
   Taxi Violence in Western Cape .................................................... 6342
   Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
   Delivery ..................................................................................... 4614
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU against Implementation of ........................................ 5921
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 14 – Local Government ........................................ 3575
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................. 3604
Vote 1 – Premier .................................................. 3811
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................ 3899
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ............................ 4953
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ........................................ 5360
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................. 5654
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ......................... 5679
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ........................................... 5737
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) ........... 6688
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .......................................................... 6699
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................ 6703
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ............................. 6707
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ......................... 6715
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .......................................... 6729
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ............................ 6781

BOESAK, A A
Premier: ........................................................................... 44
Opening Address of .......................................................... 651,741,927
Statements .........................................................................
Subject for discussion:
Heritage Day ......................................................................... 813
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas . 847
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................... 118
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................ 255
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 375
Vote 11 – Agriculture .......................................................... 495
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................. 518

BOTHSA, T L
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .... 916
Closing ........................................................................... 1392, 6789
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof .... 5750
Executive Statement ......................................................... 6189
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ............... 5797
Premier:
Opening Address of .............................................................. 41, 1533

Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ................. 1629

Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration)...1276

Speaker's Debate:
International Aids Day .......................................................... 1098

Statements ................................................................................. 96, 5895

Subject for discussion:
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
Delivery .................................................................................. 4627
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .......... 5885
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ............. 674
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ... 542
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government....... 2495
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas..... 840

Statement by Mr Ozinsky ......................................................... 4552

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................... 1166
Vote 6 – Health ...................................................................... 1180, 1189

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 6 – Health ..................................................................... 266,291

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ...................................................................... 1677
Vote 6 – Health ..................................................................... 1913, 1936

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]
Vote 6 – Health ..................................................................... 3677, 3698

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .................................................. 4856

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
of Principle) ......................................................................... 5310

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 –
Health) .................................................................................. 5519, 5545

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle). .................................................. 5736

Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) .................................................. 6639

Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill [B7-2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) ............................................ 6677

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .................................................. 6719

BREDELL, A W
Closing ...................................................................................... 1391

Condolence, Motion of:
Duncan, Sheena ..................................................................... 2227

Congratulations, Motion of
De Jager, Gideon ................................................................... 4012
Fourie, Hendrik ...................................................................... 4012

Executive statement: De Doorns ........................................... 2334

Farewell, Hon Member P M Jacobs ..................................... 4320

Former President Nelson Mandela ........................................ 5151
Modernisation Programme of Provincial Government .......................... 608
Power between Executive and Legislature, Separation of ....................... 687
Premier: ......................................................................................... 39, 1469
Opening Address of........................................................................... 3982, 3995
Executive Statement ........................................................................... 2395
Rejection of SAHRC ruling on Makhaza housing debacle ....................... 2404
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ................................ 5018
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed) ..................... 5103
Statements...... 10,681,924,1005, 1281,1584,2251, 2362, 2511, 2549, 3935, ................................. 4166, 4311

Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ........................................ 4706, 4711
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ................................. 1016
SA Fisheries...................................................................................... 4019
Problems in Bitou Municipality ....................................................... 950
Results of Census 2011 ..................................................................... 6504
Removal of small business traders ................................................... 2311
Statements made by Premier ............................................................ 624
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in .................................................... 2425
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ........................................... 1242, 1254
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 1335, 1345
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Local Government ............................................................... 166,183
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 365,387
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................................. 1802, 1822
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .. 1999, 2021
Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
[B2-2011] –(Consideration and finalisation) ................................. 3982,3995
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................................. 3564, 3584
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .. 3772, 3792
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ........................................ 4829, 4835
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ......................................................... 4866, 4872, 4873
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) .............................. 4943, 4950
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
Of Principle) .................................................................................. 5328
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 –
Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ...................... 5614, 5629
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 –
Local Government) ....................................................................... 5695, 5712
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................. 1364
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading .................................................................................. 1654
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................. 1755
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................................. 2157
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ........................................... 3743
Vote and Schedules .................................................................................. 3918
Withdrawal and Reduction of Funding ...................................................... 3764

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) .................................................... 4898

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ................................................. 6694, 6698

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .......... 6699, 6700

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................... 6700

BROWN, L
Closing ........................................................................................................... 6790
Condolences: Motions of
Olifant, Danny .......................................................................................... 6407
Uys, Theunis ............................................................................................... 6268

Congratulations: Motion of
President Zuma, being appointed to Unsecretary’s Education first
Initiative to (L Brown) .............................................................................. 6259

Small Business ........................................................................................... 6267

Speakers Debate:
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ............................. 6277

Subject for discussion:
Empowerment and Development, Success
Achieved in Respect of .............................................................. 5808, 5817
Results of Census 2011 ............................................................................. 6502, 6507
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
against Implementation of ......................................................................... 5919

Statements ................................................. 5893, 6251, 6444, 6485, 6562

Visit to Britain, Premier Badmouthing our Country and Turning
Investors away on ...................................................................................... 6326

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of
Votes and Schedules) .............................................................................. 5731, 3733

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 5739

Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) ............................................................... 5784

Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 6641

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ................................................. 6787

CARLISLE, R V
Announcements ........................................................................................ 4117
Full and effective interpretation service ................................................. 1037

Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape .............................................................. 6351
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ...................................................... 2193
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .................. 5880
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ................. 1000
Empowerment and Development, Success
  Achieved in Respect of ............................................. 5824
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ........... 2499
Problems in Bitou Municipality ....................................... 957
Removal of small business traders ................................... 2321
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ................................ 2245

Premier:
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................... 5060
Statements made by Premier ............................................ 631
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
  Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health –
    (Consideration) ..................................................... 4277
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Consideration of principle ............................................ 1158
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................ 1317, 1328
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle ............................................ 119
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................ 392,415
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading ........................................................... 1668
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................ 2054, 2076
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................ 3881, 3910
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ................... 4815
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ................................ 5427, 5455
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ........................................... 6666
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]
  (Consideration and finalisation) ....................................... 6673, 6677
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................ 6704
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ................. 6762

CUPIDO, P W
  Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .... 914
ANC Centenary Celebrations, Spending Taxpayers’ money
  on ................................................................................. 4606
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ............ 2586
Closing ............................................................................. 1392
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact
  on Communities ............................................................. 4151
Condolence, Motion of:
  Hale, Corne .................................................................... 4777
  Klein, Tom ...................................................................... 2479
Congratulations:
  Crowster, Sharon ........................................................... 4776
Economic potential and forecast beyond 2010 ............................ 835
Executive statement: De Doorns ............................................. 2337
Free Trade Zone/Port in Cape Town, Establishment of ............... 688
Gang-related violence on Cape Flats .................................................. 2257
Health Practitioners: Scrapping of names ........................................ 607
Hendrick Mikhail ............................................................................. 3946
Kraaifontein Police Station ............................................................ 2569
Member of SCOPA, ANC Member Mr M Ozinsky Fitness of .............. 4775
Municipal Pools, Swimming Training Programmes at ....................... 690
Personal Explanation ....................................................................... 775
Metro Police .................................................................................. 4146
Municipal Tenders in Province ......................................................... 4003
Mycroft, Michaela .......................................................................... 4696
Niekerk, Carla .................................................................................. 3946
Police Officials, Killings and Suicides amongst ............................... 4136
Protection of Information Bill .......................................................... 4774
Research Institutions, Three Cape Town ........................................... 4609
SAPS ............................................................................................... 4146
Smith, Graeme and Wife ................................................................. 4144
Traffic Officials ................................................................................ 4146
Overcrowded Trains, Danger Commuters face in ............................ 4603
Premier:
  Opening Address of ........................................................................ 53, 1508
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............................. 5037
Removal of small business traders .................................................... 2226
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
  Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ............................... 1626
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
  (Consideration) ............................................................................. 4611
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
  (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
  (Consideration) ............................................................................ 1115
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
  in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ........................................ 759,799
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
  Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health –
  (Consideration) ............................................................................ 4274
Schools, Violence in ........................................................................ 539
Shoprite/Checkers Women of the Year Award, Women for Receiving
  Annual ............................................................................................. 4105
Speaker’s Debate:
  Economic Freedom of the Youth .................................................... 3965
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ........................................... 1612
  International Aids Day .................................................................... 1090
  Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ....... 2357
  Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ................................. 90
  Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ........................................... 24338
  Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities
    and Choices ................................................................................ 574
  World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
    Against Women and Children ...................................................... 4749
Statements ...................................................................................... 4134, 4551, 4591, 4690, 4772, 4934
Street people in Cape Town and rest of province
  Condition and care of ..................................................................... 2174
Subject for discussion:

- Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ........................................ 4716
- Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ................................ 2381
- Conditions in places where poor people live ..................................... 2534
- Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery ................................................................. 4614, 4635
- Freedom Day: 16 Years later ............................................................ 2190
- Heritage Day .................................................................................... 820
- High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River .................................. 1016
- Housing development in Delft ............................................................ 1048
- Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ..... 553
- Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ................................ 670
- Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ................................................................. 706
- Lack of development for young people ................................................ 2271
- Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ................ 2494
- Policing in Mitchells Plain ................................................................. 884
- Removal of small business traders .................................................... 2307
- SA Fisheries .................................................................................... 4025
- Safety on public transport in Western Cape ........................................ 2237
- Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas ... 848
- Transnet strike, Impact of .................................................................. 2259
- Traffic Police Officer, shortage of ...................................................... 4100
- Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in .................................. 4567

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]

- Vote 11 – Agriculture ....................................................................... 1211
- Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................... 1222
- Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing .......................................... 1252
- Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................... 1268
- Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................. 1300
- Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................................ 1312
- Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .............................................. 1326
- Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .............. 1344
- Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ............................................................... 1355
- Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................. 1366
- Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ........................................................... 1375

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]

- Second Reading ................................................................................ 1667
- Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................... 1709
- Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................. 1758
- Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................. 1785
- Vote 14 – Local Government .............................................................. 1815
- Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................. 1844

Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
[B2-2011] –(Consideration and finalisation) ........................................ 3988

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]

- Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................... 3752
- Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .............. 3780
- Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................. 3807
- Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................... 3842
- Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .............................................. 3898
Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] ................................................................. 3990
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009]
  Consideration of principle .................................................... 1081
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]
  (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .................................................. 4803
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) .............................................. 4812
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) .................. 4816
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ............................... 4830
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ............................... 4840
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .................................................. 4858
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
  [B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ......................... 4945
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
  (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .............................. 4952
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) 4951, 4956
Women in Western Cape Province, Status of ................. 16
2010 Soccer World Cup: Public Transport .................................. 538
2010 Soccer World Cup, Readiness of Western Cape hospitals for ...... 2258
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament: Sex industry and Human
  Trafficking........................................................................ 748

DE BEER, O (NCOP)
  Statements........................................................................ 682
  Subject for discussion:
  Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
  prevent recession................................................................... 703

DE LILLE, P
  Subject for Discussion:
  SA Fisheries ........................................................................ 4017
  Speaker’s Debate:
  Women Redefining Leadership .............................................. 4077
    World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
    Against Women and Children ............................................ 4750
  Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
    (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ......................... 4951, 4956
  Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
    Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................ 3636, 3654

DE VILLIERS, M J R
  Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119............... 2584
  Premier:
    Opening Address of .......................................................... 1526
    Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............... 5042
ELOFF, E H

Condolence, Motion of:
  Bus accident in Hex River Pass .............................................. 2228
  Davids, Mr A A ................................................................. 1597
  Francken, Lulu ........................................................................ 2570

Congratulations:
  Albertyn, Pierre ................................................................. 3772
  Bafana Bafana ................................................................. 4148
  Bantjies, Benjan ............................................................... 3770
  Beukman, Erika ................................................................. 3768
  Brookryk, Johan ............................................................... 3772
  Coetzee, Theuns ............................................................... 3767
  Dale-Roberts, Chef Luke and his team from La Colombe .......... 2179
  Els, John ........................................................................... 3768
  Langeberg on change of name .............................................. 839
  Lange, Malcolm ................................................................. 1646
  Management of South African Airways (E H Eloff) ............ 4007
  Organisers of Robertson Wine, Food and Tourism Festival ... 909
  Phetho, Terry .................................................................. 3951
  Sandes Toryan ................................................................. 4781
  Springbok Team .............................................................. 2522
  Springbok Rugby Team ..................................................... 4143, 4178, 4324
  Wacky Wine Festival ....................................................... 2348
  Webber, June ................................................................. 4321
  Winners: Productivity SA .................................................. 986
  Wolfaardt, Hansie ............................................................ 3772
  Vilander Ernest ................................................................. 3947

Decisions of Executive Members of previous
  Provincial Government ...................................................... 2404
Inspector Wiese and women of Drew, Bonnievale for Hospitality during
  search for bodies, Thanks to ................................................ 542
Manipulation of Crime Figures in Western Cape .................... 2477
Premier: ...................................................................................... 61

Speaker's Debate:
  Opening Address of ............................................................ 61

Statements .............................................................. 101, 301, 685, 742, 926, 1034, 2224, 2339, 2459,
  ....................................................................................... 3757, 3937, 4097, 4098, 4172, 4686, 4934

Subject for discussion:
  Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .......... 993

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Consideration of principle .................................................. 1163
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................. 1310
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................... 1327
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .............................................. 1356
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................... 1363

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................. 162
  Vote 8 – Local Government ............................................... 182
  Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................... 228
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................. 342
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................... 413
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
  Vote 7 – Social Development .............................................. 3649
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .......................... 3740
  Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................. 3810

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]
  – (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ............................................. 4802

ESAU, S [SPEAKER with effect from 06/05/2009]
  Acceptance speech .............................................................. 4
  Announcements .................................................................... 924
  Apology by Deputy Speaker .................................................. 824
  Closing ................................................................................ 1393
  Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities .................................................. 4151
  Condolences: Motion of Beyleveland, Theo ............................... 4107
  Conduct in House ................................................................. 596
  Election of ........................................................................... 2
  Interpretation ...................................................................... 969
  Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D - 2010] (Reprint)(NCOP) (Consideration) .................................................. 4117
  Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D-2010] (NCOP) – (Consideration) .................. 3982
  Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ........................................... 757
  Report of Standing Committee on Governance on National House of
  Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) .................................................. 4277
  Traditional Leaders Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) ....................... 910
  Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Traditional Leadership and Government Framework Amendment Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) ........................................... 910
  Rulings ................................................................................ 72, 109, 329, 360, 646, 678, 968, 2219, 5138
  SA Fisheries ........................................................................... 4014
  Speaker’s Debate:
     Economic freedom of the Youth ........................................... 3953
     Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .... 5241
     Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ............................... 1602
     International Aids Day ....................................................... 1085
     Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently .... 2352
     Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ...................... 8095
     Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women .............................. 2430
     Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices ........................................... 560578
     Women Redefining Leadership ............................................ 4069
     Women Redefining Leadership ............................................ 4079, 4091
  Subject for Discussion:
     Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ............................................ 4184
     Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ................................. 5161

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................ 1371, 1382
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ...................................................... 509,523
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ...................................................... 2124, 2144
Western Cape Parliamentary Service and Finance Management Bill
Introduction............................................................................... 1347
Western Cape Use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill
[B4-2010] – (Finalisation) ............................................................... 4014
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ...................................................... 3657
Vote and Schedules ................................................................... 3917

FIGLAN, A M
Abuse against the Elderly .............................................................. 6492
Congratulations:
Executive Mayor of Cape Town.................................................. 6460
Human Settlement, Establishment of New Manenberg Contact
Centre ........................................................................................... 5843
Mbeki Govan, Human Settlement Awards 2012, Runners-up and
Renaming of NY1 to Steve Biko Drive......................................... 6260
Winners....................................................................................... 5840
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)......................... 5057
Statements.................................................................................. 5141, 5294, 5769, 5857, 5892, 6256, 6363, 6449, 6568, 6600
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ......................................................... 5364
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 –
Economic Development and Tourism) ....................................... 5688
Subject for Discussion
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape .................................................... 6343, 6356
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) .................................... 6709

FRITZ, A T
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof .... 5742
Condolence, Motion of:
Asmal, Kader ............................................................................. 3978
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)......................... 5087
Speaker’s Debate:
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children...................................................... 4757
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration).......................................................................... 4286
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ......................................................... 3703, 3728
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) .................................... 4839
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 –
Social Development) ................................................................ 5401, 5422
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development)........................................... 6773

GABRU, Y
Condolence, Motion of:
  Dudley, Mr R................................................................. 38
  Maqubela, Patrick ...................................................... 106
  Solomon, Imam Gassan ............................................. 983
Congratulations:
  Belgravia High School ................................................. 610
Four schools in 100 School Survey ........................................ 908
Documentary Evidence, Manipulation and disappearance of ....... 306
Freedom Charter: Achievement of its aims ................................ 363
Green Point Stadium, Escalating costs of ........................... 746
MEC for Education, Wasteful expenditure by ......................... 592
Open opportunity society .................................................. 606
Premier:
  Opening Address of .................................................... 49
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
  in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .......................... 803
SAPS: Lie detector tests .................................................... 37
School libraries, state and funding of .................................... 981
Speaker’s Debate:
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
  Children ........................................................................ 1141
Statements ........................................................................... 649,777,902
Subject for discussion:
  Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .......... 999
  Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
  prevent recession ......................................................... 707
  Statements made by Premier ........................................... 636
Textile and clothing workers’ struggle .................................... 751
Tygerberg, New Hospital at ................................................. 686
WCED, Educator posts in .................................................. 784
WCED, High number of sexual abuse cases in ...................... 591
WCED: vacant posts and supply of qualified teachers ............ 832
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 5 – Education ....................................................... 1218
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 5 – Education ....................................................... 248

GEYER, H P
Archbishop Desmond Tutu: Medal of Freedom Award ............. 616
Birthday wishes to Premier .................................................. 1598
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ...... 2571, 2753, 2596
Condolence, Motion of:
  Komba, Sgt. Charles ..................................................... 660
  Maqhetshaba, Anathi .................................................... 937
  Meiring, Hannes ........................................................... 2178
  Papenfus, Rufus ............................................................... 6416
  Schmidt, Cobus ............................................................. 1039
  Van Rensburg, Erin ....................................................... 104
  Sisulu, Albertina ............................................................. 3945
Congratulations:
Cederberg Winery ................................................................. 6337
Cloetesville High School ......................................................... 788
Danie Steytler ................................................................... 756
Ferreira, G T ...................................................................... 2523
Hip-Hop World Championships, Delegation Attending to (H P Geyer) 6376
Minister Winde .................................................................. 6266
Mostert, Jan ...................................................................... 6322
MPP Jennifer Hartnick ......................................................... 2482
Ntsiki Biyela ...................................................................... 613
Provincial Parliament ............................................................. 6336
SA Academy for Science and Arts ......................................... 658
Wishing Muslim community strength and best wishes with Ramadan Kareem ................................................. 2460
Yende, Pretty .................................................................... 4110
Documentary Evidence, Manipulation and disappearance of Efforts of ANC Government to Restrict Media Freedom ......................................................... 2459
Fifa, Transfer of Land from Stellenbosch Municipality to Hip Hop Media Lounge and Other projects: Rasool’s and Fransman’s Involvement in ........................................... 2403
Premier: ........................................................................... 67
Opening Address of ................................................................ 67
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011] (Consideration and finalisation) ................................................................. 478
Revival of Bills .................................................................... 1599
Rift Valley fever in province ................................................. 2123
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4-2011] (NCOP) ................................................................ 3973
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Sectional Titles Schemes Management Bill [B20B-2010] (NCOP) .............................................. 3974
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Community Schemes Ombud Service Bill [B21B - 2011] (NCOP) .............................................. 3974
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health (Consideration) ......................................................... 4274
Statements ....................................................................... 533, 681, 778, 831, 903, 930, 970, 1034, 1589, 1637, 2121, 2165, ............... 2220, 2295, 2341, 2365, 2401, 2453, 2514, 4000, 4134, 4314, 4587, .......................................................... 4770, 5140, 5292, 5830, 6251, 6357, 6444, 6562
Stellenbosch, Proposed soccer stadium in ................................. 606
Subject for discussion:
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ....................................... 6389
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ....................... 1020
Housing development in Delf ................................................... 1049
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ......................................................... 709
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ....... 2495
Inability of City of Cape Town to spend its Capital ..................... 2460
Taxi Drivers, Course on Road Etiquette for ................................ 688
Upcoming tourism entrepreneur ............................................. 2229
WCPP’S unqualified Audit Report .......................................... 2407
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle .......................................................... 1154
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................... 1354
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ....................................................... 1379
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing ........................................................................ 163
Vote 8 – Local Government ............................................................ 180
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................. 350
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ......................................... 408
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ......................................................... 427
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ...................................................... 519
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ............................................................................ 1666
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ....................................................... 2142
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ....................................................... 3668
Vote 14 – Provincial Parliament ..................................................... 3581
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ....................................... 4852
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle) .......................................................... 5317
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – (Provincial Parliament) ......................................................... 5568
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .......................................................... 5660
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) .......................................................... 6647

GRANT, D A C
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119.............. 2581
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof ... 5752
Premier: .......................................................................................... 63
Subject for discussion:
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools .......................... 2387
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................. 1215, 1226
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................. 240, 260
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................. 1858, 1879
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................. 3830, 3849
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ................................................. 4808, 4814
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ................................................. 5378, 5398
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ........................ 6713, 6718
### HANI, V

**Children and Youth Comemorations** .......................................................... 5871

**Condolence, Motion of:**

- Hugo, Doreen ................................................................. 4008
- Matthews, Joe ................................................................. 2522
- Ngwenu, Mr Eric ............................................................. 6319
- Passing on of Mother of Nondzaliseko Makanda .......................... 2412
- Pick, Dave ..................................................................... 3617

**Congratulations:**

- Castro, Fidel ................................................................. 4183
- Civil Society, Initiatives Closong Down of ................................. 3764
- Stellenbosch University Team ............................................. 4011
- Volunteers during strike .................................................. 2482
- Zenani, Anita ................................................................. 4114

**COPE Member rejoin ANC** ................................................................. 6500

**Gugulethu Seven Massacre Anniversary** ............................................. 5268

**Khayamandi Fire, Children Die** ......................................................... 4780

**Khayelitsha Writing Forum** ................................................................. 4150

**International Women’s Day** ................................................................. 5153

**International Exhibition, Removal of** ................................................. 6415

**National Reconciliation Day Celebrations** ........................................... 4939

**No Violence Campaign, 16 Days of Activism** ....................................... 4697

**Plight of street children** ................................................................. 2571

**Premier's Appointment of Male MECS** ................................................ 3939

**Premier’s Department, Employee Found Guilty** ..................................... 5866

**Speaker’s Debate:**

- Women Redefining Leadership .................................................... 4075
- World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
- Against Women and Children .................................................... 4757

**Stabbing amongst Students in Schools** ................................................ 6378

**Statements** ......................................................................................... 2343, 3934, 5829, 5855

**Subject for discussion:**

- Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ...................................................... 4191
- Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
  Delivery ..................................................................................... 4623
- Freedom Day: 16 Years later ........................................................ 2188
- Service Increased, Local Goods Procurement of ................................ 4560

**Victims of Informal Settlements fires** ................................................ 5864

**Violence against Women and Children, Praise to Akhona Meyi for**

Championing ending for ........................................................................ 4561

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]**

- Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 3813

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]**

- (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ....................................................... 4804

**Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule)** .................................................. 4960

**Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]**

- (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ....................................................... 6728

**Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]**

- (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ...................................... 6775

**Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]**

- (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ....................................................... 5361
Women’s Day, Premier and Commemoration of ................................. 4136
Youth, International Year of ............................................................ 4147

HARRIS, T D (NCOP)
Premier: Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Opening Address of ........................................................................... 1502
Subject for discussion:
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps
to prevent recession ........................................................................ 699

HARTNICK, J L
Cape Town Stadium, construction of ................................................. 2351
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact
on Communities ................................................................................ 4151
Condolence, Motion of:
Arendse, Donigo, Family of .............................................................. 6317
Davids, Goliath .................................................................................. 6206
Deaths in shack fires in Kleinmond (J L Hartnick) ......................... 2483
Griebenouw, Susanna ...................................................................... 4009
Jenner, Ms Katrina ............................................................................ 1036
Michaels, Loveline ............................................................................ 6578
Mjongile, Songezo ............................................................................ 6317
Small, Adam ..................................................................................... 6204
Congratulations:
Amsterdam, Sasha-Lee .................................................................. 4013
Bafana Bafana .................................................................................. 362
Du Toit, Natalie ................................................................................ 1644
Fatal injury of Gavin Engelke and Keenan van Wyk ..................... 2261
Farmworkers of the Year, 2009 ......................................................... 986
Goliath, Jackie, New Commercial Farmer of the Year ................. 6373
Le Roux, Marlene ............................................................................. 2465
Oosthuizen, Louis ............................................................................ 2373
Premier and Department .................................................................. 6338
Pretty Yende .................................................................................... 755, 2408
Prins, Megan-Geoffrey ................................................................... 4148
Springboks ....................................................................................... 540,658.
Stellenbosch University Choir ......................................................... 2410
Stellenbosch and Stellenberg Girls Choir ....................................... 6335
Team Zealous of Stellenbosch High School ..................................... 695
Tygerberg Children’s Choir ............................................................... 2410
Transplant Sports Association Athletes .......................................... 3950
Witzenberg Reel Dancers ................................................................. 4940
World Transplant Games .................................................................. 693
Laubsher, Eric Honoured ................................................................. 6412

Premier:
Opening Address of .......................................................................... 1511
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................... 5073
Premier, Consolidated Monitoring and Evaluation Report of ........ 5906
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ................................................................................. 4292
(xxi)

Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011] (Consideration and finalisation) ................................................................. 4792

Speaker's Debate:
- Economic freedom of the Youth .......................................................... 3956
- Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .................. 5243
- Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .......................... 6276
- Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ............. 2357
- Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ..................................... 83
- Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .................. 560
- Women Redefining Leadership ............................................................... 4073
- World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence Against Women and Children ......................................................... 4754
- 16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children .......... 1138

Statements .................. 302,586,597,652,740,779,901,929,1290,1584,1735,2115,2250,2344,2398,2456,2469,2511,2549,3934,3997,4092,4166,4549,4691,4933,5146,5296,5773,5893,6254,6361,6489,6564,6604

Subject for discussion:
- Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools .................................. 2380
- Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape ............................... 6215
- Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .............................. 667
- Heritage Day ......................................................................................... 809
- Lack of development for young people................................................. 2271
- Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ..................................... 6425
- Taxi crash: wishes for speedy recovery .............................................. 2569
- Victims of houses burnt down in Khayelitsha, Heideveld and Belhar ........ 2567
- Victims of taxi disaster in Blackheath ................................................. 2520
- Violence in schools .............................................................................. 2257

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ........................................................................ 1206
  Vote 5 – Education ............................................................................ 1217
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 1230
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................. 1312
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................. 1325
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ................ 1344
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ................................................................ 1354

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 8 – Local Government .............................................................. 177
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 198
  Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................. 225
  Vote 5 – Education ............................................................................ 246
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................. 346
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ................ 376
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................. 405
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ................................................................ 432
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ........................................................................ 493

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading .................................................................................. 1673
  Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................................ 1817
  Vote 8 – Housing .............................................................................. 1845
  Vote 5 – Education ............................................................................ 1866
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................... 1905
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................ 1956
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........... 2017
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................ 2037
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ........................................ 2070
Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 2103
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................ 3610
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
   Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................... 3805, 3848
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]
   (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ................................................... 4805
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
   (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ................................................ 4809
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
   (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .................................... 4961
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
   (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .................................................... 5339
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
   (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) ................................... 5478
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13
   - Cultural Affairs and Sport) .................................................... 5509
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 –
   Health) .................................................................................. 5544
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of
   Votes and Schedule) ............................................................... 5731
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]
   (Consideration and finalisation) ................................................ 5784
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
   (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .................................................... 6732
Young Adult Youth, Issue of .................................................................................. 16

HASKIN, G C R
Census 2011 on the Western Cape, Impact of .................................. 6403
Crime Statistics relating to Western Cape ........................................ 6257
Closing ......................................................................................... 6791
Congratulations:
   Annual Charity Toy Run, to Organisers of ............................... 6631
   Chaeli Campaign first Recipient of Medal for Social Activism ..... 5780
   Firmani, MR Duane ................................................................. 6261
   Hudson, Roger ....................................................................... 5840
   Jim, Asenathi ......................................................................... 5840
   Ndungu, Scientist Thumbi ....................................................... 6453
Doping in School Sport ..................................................................... 6777
Executive Statement ....................................................................... 6194
Freedom of the City for Us President ............................................. 5861
Growing Baboon Problem in Cape Town ....................................... 6529
House, Business of ....................................................................... 6622
Illegal Advertising, Proliferation of .............................................. 6451
Increase in Street Children ............................................................. 6628
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ............ 5795
Safety Home Campaign .................................................................. 6251
SAA Cancellation of Flights ............................................................ 5901
Service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Extension of MyCiti Bus,
Cape Chamber of Commerce’s View ........................................... 5837
Socio-Economic Impact, Protest marches becoming Violent of .............. 5839
Statement .................. 5725, 5775, 5834, 5856, 6199, 6315, 6402, 6448, 6490
........................................................................................................ 6599, 6626
Speakers Debate:
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ....................... 6278
Subject for discussion:
Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape .......................... 6214
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ...................... 5879
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU against Implementation of ....................................................... 5923
Results of Census 2011 .................................................................. 6502
Strike in de Doorns, Farm workers ................................................. 6450
Temporary Relocation Areas ............................................................. 6450
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ................................. 6426
Princess Vlei Rezoning ..................................................................... 5902
Vigilantism in Khayelitsha ............................................................... 5860
Water Scarce Resource ................................................................. 5838
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of
Votes and Schedule) ................................................................. 5733
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) ..................................................... 5784
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ....................................................... 6663
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) .................................................... 6676
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on
Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) .................................. 6688
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ....................................... 6695
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ...................................... 6702
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ...................................... 6706
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ................................ 6715
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ........................................................... 6721
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ......................................................... 6728
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............................. 6761
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ......................... 6763
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ......................................... 6775
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ...................................... 6781
JACOBS, P M
Affordable Housing ................................................................. 4140
Apology to Member Brown ..................................................... 2570
Amakhaya Ngoku Housing initiatives ....................................... 785
Central Karoo District municipality, Disaster Risk Management and
Emergency Service in ............................................................... 4100
Condolence, Motion of:
Mafikeng, Mama Elizabeth "Rocky" ........................................ 105
Congratulations:
Bafana Bafana ..................................................................... 143
World Cup Draw .................................................................. 1108
DA's Xenophobia ................................................................. 2561
Free housing policy, rethink of ............................................... 905
Greenfields, Impact of on Housing Demand Database ............... 3615
Housing and Serviced Sites Target ........................................... 4001
Housing subsidies, Approval of ............................................. 2226
Housing Subsidies, Failure to Allocate ................................... 4004
Hout Bay, Building of new housing units in ................................ 590
Initiation sites ...................................................................... 2374
Informal Settlements, Appalling Living Conditions .................. 4101
Investigation: misleading of House by Premier ....................... 906
Khayelitsha Fire, Four Children Die ....................................... 4150
Mandela Park Housing ........................................................... 782
PHP: support by Department of Human Settlements .............. 2122
Premier: ............................................................................ 59, 1499
Opening Address of .............................................................. 59, 1499
Premier, SOPA announcement .............................................. 3615
Premier's SOPA announcement: debate ................................ 1591
Radio appearances by Premier and Mayor of city of Cape Town ... 2564
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) .................................................................. 4289
Speaker's Debate:
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking .................................. 1619
International Aids Day ......................................................... 1096
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and
choices ............................................................................. 569
Statements ........................................................................ 13, 743, 1290, 2253, 2339, 2470, 4127
Subject for discussion:
Conditions in places where poor people live ......................... 2536
Heritage Day .................................................................... 818
Housing development in Delft ............................................... 1051
Problems in Bitou Municipality ............................................. 954
Unblocking of blocked housing projects ................................ 2123
Unhealthy Conditions in TRAS ............................................. 2405
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................... 1233
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ............................. 1253
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing ................................................................ 155
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................... 200
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................... 1818
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................... 1840
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 8 – Housing.................................................................3866

JENNER, I E
Premier: .............................................................................51,1486
Speaker’s Debate:
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking............................1612
  International Aids Day ......................................................1090
Subject for discussion:
  Freedom Day: 16 Years later ..............................................2184
  Heritage Day .......................................................................821
  Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
    Role of Provincial Government in....................................2434
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport.................................1228,1237
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................187,204
  Vote 6 – Health...................................................................286
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................2027,2051

LABUSCHAGNE, C
Abused Women and Children in Western Cape ....................687
Behaviour Modification Programmes ..................................6367
Children’s Act, implementation of .....................................2370
Cosatu’s Actions against National Youth wage Subsidy ............5837
Condolence, Motion of:
  Gresak, Michael ..................................................................6333
  Mafu Linga .........................................................................3767
  Mntini, Thabani ..................................................................6371
  Kotze, Thelana ...................................................................6204
Congratulations:
  Imvumelwana Primary, Wallacedene ................................5843
  Kruger, Katryn......................................................................6208
  Learners ............................................................................5863
  Peggy De Villiers ..................................................................755
  Sdophumelela Secondary School, Learners of .................5269
  WCED ................................................................................5780
  WCED on Higher matric Pass Rate ...................................4135
Caps, Readiness for Implementation ....................................4151
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact
  on Communities ...................................................................4151
Final Examinations in Wynland District ..............................6499
Good Luck to Matric Learners ............................................6334
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ....5792
New National Youth Agency ..............................................143
President’s Support, Approval of commitment to Youth Wage Subsidy...5839
Premier:
  Opening Address of..........................................................1542
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)..............5018
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) ................................................. 1116
Report on Study Visit, Standing committee on ........................................... 5868
Rescinding of EFT Bill .................................................................................. 4941
Safety of People, SAPS Responsible for ..................................................... 5901
Speaker’s Debate:
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ...................................................... 1607
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship .......................................... 91
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ................................................... 2435
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices ................. 577
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children ............... 1130
Social Development attend COP17, Representatives of Western Cape Department of ................................................................. 4783
Statements ........................................ 14,97,585,600,684,743,775,829,902,974,1101, 1291, .......... 1639, 2170, 2254, 2557, 3761, 3999, 4093, 4169, 4689, 4930, 5772
........................................ 5264, 5298, 5851, 6250, 6362, 6486, 6622
Subject for discussion:
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape .... 551
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ............................. 665
Lack of development for young people ................................................. 2263
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU against Implementation of ......................................................... 5917
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ..................................... 6419
Teaching Programmes, Winter Holiday .................................................. 4145
Teenage Pregnancies, Socio-Economic impact of .................. 5860
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle ................................................................. 1175
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................. 1189
Vote 7 – Social Development .......................................................... 1298
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 1361
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 220
Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................... 255
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................. 290
Vote 7 – Social Development .......................................................... 325
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................... 1713
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 1752
Vote 7 – Social Development .......................................................... 1785
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................. 1933
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................................ 1958
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................. 2074
Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Modernisation Strategy of ............. 592
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................ 3652
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................. 3695
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................. 3716
Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................... 3840
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ........................................ 4813
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................. 4858
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) .................................................. 4964
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ............................................. 5389
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) .................................................. 6661
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ...................... 6716

LENTIT, R B
Alcohol Syndrome Campaign Sanca Fetal ................................ 6203
Closing .................................................. 6793
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof .... 5750
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact
on Communities ............................................................ 4151
Condolence: Motion of:
Bloemers, Ashley .......................................................... 4697
Charles, Shamiela death in Qatar Mall fire .................. 5869
Espafrica ................................................................. 3765
Gerwel, Jakes ............................................................ 6630
Oman, Imran death in Qatar Mall fire .................. 5869
Congratulations: Motion of
All Municipalites .................................................. 5841
Artscape Management .................................................. 4116
Boland Summer Festival ................................................. 5729
City of Cape Town .................................................. 4105, 5845
City of Cape Town, Executive of .......................... 4183
Kallis, Sharief ............................................................. 4143
Night Schools .................................................. 4100
Nelson, Marshall .................................................. 4143
Curb Gangsterism, Avenues to ........................................ 6367
Delft Resident Wayne Jafta ........................................ 6369
Education Outcome, Progress made to Improve .............. 4175
Executive Statement .................................................. 6193
Grandmother against Poverty and Aids ......................... 6410
Gratitude and well wishes to Western Cape Traffic Department ... 6572
Genetically Modified Foods, Status of ......................... 6405
Human Settlements, Integrated and Sustainable .................. 4176
Health Care Facilities, Construction and Upgrading of ........ 5836
International Volunteers Day .......................................... 6632
Night Shelters, Status ................................................. 6201
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............ 5078
Project in Kuilsriver, “Adopt a Matriculant” .................... 5152
Rugby, Kaizer Chiefs in Transformation of ..................... 6407
Rural Areas Development, Opportunities for Growth .......... 4173
School Buses, Surveillance Cameras on ........................ 4557
Season on Roads, Safe Festive ........................................ 4936
Sexual Offences Act, Changes to .................................... 5861
Speaker’s Debate:
Women Redefining Leadership .......................................................... 4084
Statement ...... 3936, 4095, 4133, 4170, 4549, 4689, 4770, 4932, 5143, 5263, ............5297, 5722, 5832, 5854, 6198, 6361, 6400, 6489, 6565, 6594, 6624
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ................................. 4708
Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape ...................... 6216
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes .............................................. 6387
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .................. 5873
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ......................... 6425
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ................................ 5168
Results of Census 2011 ............................................................... 6513
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ......................... 4574
Top Teachers Award ................................................................. 6495
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 7 – Social Development......................................................... 3648, 3662
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................ 3692
Vote 4 – Community Safety ......................................................... 3717
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ....................................................... 4862
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .................................. 4920
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .................................... 4955
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) 4974
Western Cape, Traffic Department Award ...................................... 5270
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .................................... 5477
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .................................................... 5733
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ......................................................... 6659
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ....................................................... 6722
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .................................. 6781
Woman and Children, 16 Days of Activism against abuse and violence of................................................................. 6575
Youth, Strategies to Deal with Social Ills Affecting ....................... 5147

JOSEPH, D
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ....................... 5058

MADIKIZELA, B S
Premier:
Opening Address of ................................................................. 1481
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ....................... 5034
Speaker’s Debate:
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship .............................. 86
Subject for Discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ................................. 4704
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ....................................................... 2185
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Housing development in Delft</td>
<td>1062</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policing in Mitchells Plain</td>
<td>891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]</td>
<td>1243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing</td>
<td>1255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 8 – Housing</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]</td>
<td>1843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 8 – Housing</td>
<td>1853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]</td>
<td>3852</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 8 – Housing</td>
<td>3874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]</td>
<td>4891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]</td>
<td>4901</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td>6656</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Consideration of Principle)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]</td>
<td>6705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements)</td>
<td>6710</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**MAGWAZA, N P**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africa Day</td>
<td>5870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botrivier, Service Delivery in</td>
<td>5914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child-headed households, plight of</td>
<td>2299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof</td>
<td>5742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closure of Du Noon Child Welfare Office</td>
<td>6409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closure of Ottery Youth Care Centre</td>
<td>6568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condolence, Motion of:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drug-Trading Zones in Cape Town</td>
<td>6377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Galant, Jacoba; Jansen, Lodewyk; and Van Rooyen, Gert</td>
<td>2177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kimvango, Andy</td>
<td>4940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malindi, Lettie</td>
<td>2376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mhlanga, Lydia</td>
<td>5272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mputing, Mr W</td>
<td>909</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ngozi, Mr M M</td>
<td>838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27th Anniversary of Treacherous Trojan Horse Tragedy</td>
<td>6325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congratulations:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homeless Soccer World Cup Tournament</td>
<td>753</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Government</td>
<td>5730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability Initiatives</td>
<td>1128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dumping of babies and control measures</td>
<td>2519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eight lives lost in fire in Khayelitsha town two</td>
<td>2571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity Targets</td>
<td>5912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding for Nongovernmental Organisations</td>
<td>4139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fraudsters fired</td>
<td>5905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House, James, Houtbay</td>
<td>5272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government</td>
<td>5791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khayelitsha Schemes, Shutting down of Feeding</td>
<td>4173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minister of Education, Refuse to meet with Grabouw Learners</td>
<td>5140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Millennium Development Goals Youth Conference</td>
<td>6639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr J J Visser: Statement on Women during debate</td>
<td>610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Competency, Making of Academic Hospitals</td>
<td>5266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO’s in Province, Funding Cuts to</td>
<td>6265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnering with non-profit organisations</td>
<td>1745</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Premier: Opening Address of ............................................................. 54
Province, child abuse in ................................................................. 905
Removal of Babies from Place of Safety ............................................. 3940
Resignations, Current Trend ............................................................ 4175
Saartjie Baartman Centre ................................................................. 143
Safety and well-being of children over festive season ......................... 1294
Speaker’s Debate:
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .......... 5244
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ............................................ 1609
International Aids Day .................................................................... 1091
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ................................. 93
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women .......................................... 2433
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices ................................................................. 575
Women Redefining Leadership ......................................................... 4081
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children ......................................................................................... 1132
Statements .11, 683, 2121, 2397, 2516, 4171, 5770, 5774, 5895, 6397, 6564, 6593
Subject for discussion:
Conditions in places where poor people live .................................... 2529
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .......................... 663
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ................................................. 6463
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ............ 2491
Somalia, Relieve Efforts in ............................................................... 4142
Targeting of prostitutes .................................................................. 833
TB Awareness Month .................................................................... 5267
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................ 1297
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle ................................................................ 132
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................. 226
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................................ 288
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................ 317
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................................. 1758
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................ 1781
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................................ 1931
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................ 3650
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ....................................... 4953
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .................................................... 4966
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
Of Principle) .................................................................................... 5315
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development ) ....................................... 5417

(xxx)
MAJOLA, T R [DEPUTY SPEAKER with effect from 06/05/2009]
Announcement...........................................................................................................1069
Burglary and vandalism of state-owned property ..................................................2175
Condolence, Motion of:
  Mandulo, Nokulamla.........................................................................................4176
  Victims of taxi accident ......................................................................................985
Congratulations, Motion of:
  Orlando Pirates ..................................................................................................4109
Election of..................................................................................................................5
Premier: ...................................................................................................................56, 1506
Rulings......................................................................................................................528, 1583, 2333, 3980, 5292, 5804
Speaker's Debate:
  Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .......................................6274
  Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
    (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ......................................................4919
  World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
  Against Women and Children ..........................................................................4743
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
  Children ..............................................................................................................1129
Statements..............................................................................................................654,899, 2252, 5259
Subject for discussion:
  Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ..................................................2378
  Lack of development for young people..............................................................2266
  National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
  against Implementation of .............................................................................5917
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 6 – Health ..................................................................................................284
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009]
  Finalisation .........................................................................................................1081
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ..............................................................3898
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of
  Votes and Schedule) .........................................................................................4960
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) .4974
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 –
  (Provincial Parliament) ......................................................................................5552
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament).......................................................6780

MAGAXA, K E –
ANC Honoured, Sixth President of .................................................................5865
Cape Town Metropole, Unacceptable Conditions for poor People ..............6265
Court Application, Backyard Dwellers Lodge .....................................................6410
Condolences: Motion of
  Pheliffer, John ..................................................................................................6322
Housing Indaba ......................................................................................................4692
Housing List for Eerste River and Blue Downs, City of
  Cape Town’s ....................................................................................................6317
Makhaza Toilets.....................................................................................................6416
Minister of Housing, NO-Show of .................................................................4693
Municipal Hostel, in Langa ................................................................. 4553
Municipal IQ Hotspot Monitor Findings ........................................... 5910
Poor infrastructure and under spending in Poor Areas in Western Cape. 6258
Sanitation Problems in Khayelitsha .................................................. 6494
Statements ................................................................................. 4588, 5719, 5898, 6360
Speakers Debate:
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ..................... 6287
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ...................................... 4717
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes .............................................. 6386
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ............ 5249
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
against Implementation of ......................................................... 5925
Toilets in Makhaza ....................................................................... 6461
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) ......................................... 4894
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................. 4967
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ........................................................... 6655
52nd Anniversary, Langa Massacres .............................................. 5271
52nd Anniversary, Sharpeville Massacres ..................................... 5271
2012 Govan Mbeki Best Priority Project Award .............................. 5915

MAR AIS, A J DU TOIT
Adult Education Award to 79-Year-Old Du Noon Resident – Motion..... 5157
Acknowledgement to Supt Nolan, Capt Dicks and Const Abrahams,
Atlantis .......................................................................................... 1597
Alcohol and Drug abuse on Family system, Impact of ....................... 362
Alternative approaches to BEE and development SMMEs .............. 2174
Anti-poverty strategy .................................................................... 2258
ANC’s Misperceptions with regards to Education in Cape ............... 5903
ANC’s Conduct in Provincial Parliament ........................................ 620
Cease-Fire Between Israel and Hamas .......................................... 6570
Children on Cape Flats, Massacre of ............................................. 6366
Condolence, Motion of:
Albertus, Ms Ulla ......................................................................... 938
Blignaut, Ashley .......................................................................... 4181
Johnson, Abe ............................................................................ 5842
Khumalo, Alfred ........................................................................... 6372
Raad, Rina ................................................................................... 5843
Simons, Anna .............................................................................. 4325
Marks, Solly ................................................................................. 6375
Mother of Ms C Labuschagne, passing of ................................. 2124
Williams, Annetjie ....................................................................... 6457
Congratulations:
Brackenfell High School ............................................................ 754
Bruintjies, Deon ........................................................................... 785
Gebenga, Anelisiwe ....................................................................... 2349
Goëiemann, Annine .................................................................... 4106
Health Occupations, Winners of Awards for ................................... 4783
Hon Wiley, M G E ........................................................................ 5160
Jenner, Minister (Department of the Premier) ................................. 2351
Kadalie, Fenner ................................................................. 4111
Klatzow, Prof Peter .......................................................... 6202
Rianie Strydom ................................................................. 757
Minister Leonard Max ....................................................... 2262
Minister of Health and His Department ............................. 6332
Mayor of Potchefstroom .................................................... 6577
National Education Award ............................................... 5159
Nymbezi, Vinoria ............................................................. 5728
Obama, President Barack ............................................... 6454
Premier .......................................................... .......................... 5160
Weideman, Philip ............................................................. 2230
Worcester Hospital Nursing School .................................. 6632
DA Chairpersons and Vice-Persons Elected ....................... 6635
Drug Abuse ........................................................... .......................... 4137
Early Childhood Development, Preschool and ................. 5150
Economic Empowerment and Development ..................... 5299
Elections, Gangsterism During Motion ............................. 5726
Executive Statement .................................................... .......................... 6192
Family Expo in May .................................................. .......................... 2232
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .......... 5874
Health Care Systems in Rural Areas ................................. 4318
Health, International Award to Western Cape Department ..... 5154
Health Workers, Acknowledgement of Personnel of........... 4108
Nelspoort, Beaufort West and Montagu Hospitals ............... 4108
Impact of HIV/Aids and Violence ........................................ 6404
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ..... 5789
Minister Saves Saartjie Baartman Centre ............................. 5777
Municipal Election, Youth Contribution ............................. 3952
NSRI Rescue Operation: Crew of Seli 1 ......................... .......................... 752
Older Persons Act, implementation of ............................. 2370
Organ Donor Month ........................................................ 612
Open Fields, Women Raped in ......................................... 4603
Oversight role of Provincial Parliament, Importance of .......... 2259
Preparedness for epidemics ............................................. 1590
Province, Anti-Poverty Strategy in .................................... 690
Provincial Parliament, Oversight role of ......................... .......................... 748
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health – (Consideration) ................................................................. 4270
Rich diversity of Culture ................................................... 5835
Rosh Hashanah .............................................................. 6207
Rural Areas, Socio-Welfare and economic circumstances in .... 746
Sign language, recognition of in communities ...................... 2371
Service Delivery, Impact of ................................................... 5148
Speaker’s Debate:
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .... 5248
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ............................. 1617
International Aids Day ..................................................... 1087
Women Redefining Leadership ......................................... 4083
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence ......... .......................... 4745
Against Women and Children ...................................... 4745
Statements .......... 11, 528, 583, 652, 776, 898, 1009, 1741, 2118, 2253, 2362, 2473, 2515, 4095, 4170, 4688, 4932, 5144, 5723, 5828, 5829, 5854, 5897,
Social Inclusion, Principles and Concept of .......................................................... 4172
Subject for discussion:
Conditions in places where poor people live .................................................. 2526
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ........................................................................... 4189
Economic Empowerment and Development, Success Achieved in Respect of .......................................................... 5805
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery .......................................................... 4624
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .................................... 5873
Heritage Day ........................................................................................................ 817
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ........................................... 661
Lack of development for young people ............................................................... 2269
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ................................................................. 6462
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ............................................................ 5164
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ................................ 2484
Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports ............................................................ 6592
Policing in Mitchells Plain ................................................................................ 887
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .. 846
Thanks to Disaster Control Centre .................................................................... 1597
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 6 – Health .................................................................................................... 1182
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................................. 1267
Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................................... 1295
Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................................................ 1367
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................................................. 134
Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................................................ 230
Vote 6 – Health .................................................................................................. 278
Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................................... 316
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................................. 474
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................................. 1722
Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................................................ 1764
Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................................... 316
Social Development .......................................................................................... 1779
Vote 6 – Health .................................................................................................. 1923
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................................................ 2158
Western Cape, Free pap smears for Women in ............................................... 594
Western Cape Hospitals, Security and Safety of ............................................. 537
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, disaster management readiness during .......................................................... 932
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 7 – Social Development ........................................................................... 3646
Vote 6 – Health .................................................................................................. 3690
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................................. 3718
Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................................................ 3815
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................ 3605
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ........................................................................... 4862
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................. 4955
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) .................................................. 5485
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 - Cultural Affairs and Sport) ........................................ 5513
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................................. 5535
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................................. 5651
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .................................................... 6724
110% Green Campaign ................................................................. 5904

MAX, L H
Premier: ......................................................................................... 44
Opening Address of........................................................................ 44
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) ... 1275
Speaker's Debate:
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children ............................................................. 1135
Subject for discussion:
Housing development in Delft........................................................... 1054
Policing in Mitchells Plain ................................................................. 895
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ...................................... 2232
Statements made by Premier ........................................................ 620
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape – Role of Provincial Government in ..................................................... 2417
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 4 – Community Safety .............................................................. 1256, 1269
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 4 – Community Safety .............................................................. 443, 475
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety .............................................................. 1690, 1724

MBALO, BG
Condolences: Motion of
Lunguza, Ntombizodwa ................................................................. 6496
Ndleni, Bongile ............................................................................. 6570
Sigcau, Nondwe ........................................................................... 6375
Berg River Municipality, Sale of Land ........................................... 4317
Cape Nature Outsources Culling to Farmers .................................... 6414
Climate Change, Cape Town Preparedness for ................................ 4693
Mayoral committee members, Racist Tactics of ................................ 5900
Mossel Bay Municipality Mayor, Racist Stance of .............................. 5912
Shout Foundation, Salutation to ..................................................... 3770
Statement ..................................................................................... 6601
Subject for discussion:
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on .......................................... 5167
Translation problems in Legislature ............................................. 6405
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ............................................................................ 4286
UN Summit on Global Warming COP 17 ....................................... 4698
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................. 3807, 3808
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ................................................................. 4867
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ........................................ 6737

McKENZIE, P C

Actions by DA Councillor of Elsies River, Bertha Esbach .................... 1010
Activist Anton Frans, Anniversary of Death of .............................. 4701
Ammunition seized by police in Athlone .......................................... 933
Apology by ............................................................................. 968
ATM Bomings ........................................................................ 5907
Attitude of Speaker in staff meeting ..................................................... 935
Brutal and deadly attacks on policemen and women .............................. 833
Chairperson of Standing Committee on Community Safety:
  Incompetence ....................................................................... 657
Call on Premier Zille, Replace of MEC for Community Safety .............. 5845
Celebrations of Life, Third Centenary of Adam Kok .......................... 4115
City council: official demoted ............................................................ 2344
City of Cape Town, Proposed Transfer of Land ..................................... 38
Changing of Culture of Our People ..................................................... 6330
Community Safety, Gang Plan, Comments by MEC of ......................... 5838
Condition of Flats in Leonsdale: Terrible ........................................... 2406
Condolence, Motion of:
  Level Crossing Accident, Death of two (P Mckenzie).......................... 5869
  Naidoo, Mr Vincent .................................................................. 751
  Scholtz, Maxi ......................................................................... 1891
  Steers, Mujahied ...................................................................... 6633
  Road Disaster near Lainsburg Claims Nineteen Victims ..................... 4702
  Victims killed in Gang Violence ................................................... 6323
  Williams, Annie ...................................................................... 6498

Congratulations:
  Bishop Lavis Police Officers ...................................................... 4012
  Hartnick, Jenny ...................................................................... 6336
  Liverpool ................................................................................. 939
  Minister of Health .................................................................. 2483
  Petros, Gen. .......................................................................... 2478
  Springboks .......................................................................... 692
  WP Rugby ............................................................................. 838
  National Departments ............................................................... 4116
DA Snubs Indigenous People ............................................................. 4135
DA Programme: Road to 2011 ............................................................. 655
DA public representative accused of rape .............................................. 2347
Deployments by Premier in Western Cape ............................................ 2561
Drug dealers, Marches against ............................................................ 606
Drugs Seized in Goodwood ............................................................... 5728
Electrocuted, Two Young Girls ........................................................... 4149
Fellow Learners, Rape of 16-year old boy by ........................................ 6377
Gang Violence in Townships ............................................................. 4138
Gang-Related Violence in Cape ......................................................... 4555
Incorporation of municipal police in SAPS ........................................... 1893
Inquiry into Policing, Commission of ........................................ 6404
Impact of HIV/AIDS and Violence – Motion .................................. 6404
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government .............. 5795
Lufthansa Flights from Munich to Cape Town ............................ 6267
Khayelitsha Protest, Policeman injured in .................................. 612
Maintenance of Flats in Townships ........................................... 2477
Members, Executive Paid to go on Hunting Trip of ................. 4554
MEC for Community Safety: Role and Duties ......................... 609
MEC: Leaking of SAPS information and attack on Commissioner .......... 362
Mitchells Plain Policing and Vigilantism ................................ 749
Money paid to Premier .................................................. 4002
National Minister of Police ............................................. 2375
National Competencies, Usurpation of .................................... 5910
Non-attendance of committee clerk: no committee meeting held .......... 1643
Official of City Council demoted ........................................... 2344
Plight of residents of Leonsdale ........................................... 2260
Police Officers, Cape Town Metropolitan ............................... 4140
Possession of Drugs, Arrest of 27 People in Mitchells Plain for .......... 6377
Premier:
Opening Address of .......................................................... 1528
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................... 5076
Removal, Community Safety for ........................................... 5845
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
SAPS, Commendation to .................................................. 6579
SAPS, Acts against Drug Dealers ........................................ 6638
Service delivery, Derica Lambrechts in Townships on .................. 5836
Speaker’s Debate:
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ................................ 2442
Sports Day, Change of date of ............................................. 688
Women Redefining Leadership ............................................. 4089
Statements..... 102,651, 830, 970, 2254, 2400, 3759, 4095, 4125, 5298, 5724 .................................................. 6313,6401, 6623
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ............................... 4715
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ....................... 2385
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .............................................. 4184
Housing development in Delft ............................................... 1060
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ................................... 6470
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .................. 672
Policing in Mitchells Plain .................................................. 879
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ............................ 2238
Statements made by Premier ............................................... 630
Summons served on unemployed tenants in townships ............. 2300
Unhealthy and Dangerous Sanitation ................................... 4138
Unruly conduct of Ravensmead DA councillor ....................... 835
Violence on our trains ...................................................... 2175
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................. 1164
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................. 1260
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ................................. 1389
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................. 466

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................. 1714

Woodstock Police Station, Crime situation around and its proposed move .................................................. 2175

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................. 3719, 3725

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................ 4849

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................. 4962

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle) .................................................. 5319

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) .................................. 5481

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................ 6703

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .......................................... 6741

515 Suspects in Mitchells Plain, Arrest of ................................. 6457

MEYER, I
Premier:
Opening Address of .............................................................. 68, 1472
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ................. 5069

Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ...................................................................... 4304

Speaker’s Debate:
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ............ 6289
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ................................ 1621
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children .............................................................. 1144

Subject for discussion:
Empowerment and Development, Success
Achieved in Respect of .......................................................... 5805
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ... 555
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government .... 2488
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ..................... 4569

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 7 – Social Development .................................................. 1294, 1302

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle ...................................................... 137
Vote 7 – Social Development .................................................. 307

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 7 – Social Development .................................................. 1770, 1792

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ....................................... 3590, 3612

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) .................. 4912, 4918

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 - Cultural Affairs and Sport) ................. 5485, 5514
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]  
(Consideration of Principle) .................................................. 6640
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]  
(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............... 6760, 6768

MQULWANA, K A
Bus accident in Kloofnek Road, Senior Citizens in .................... 750
City of Cape Town, IRT System in ........................................... 934
City of Cape Town: Public Transport Plan ............................... 536
Congratulations:
  Muslim community ............................................................ 1069
Condolence, Motion of:
  People involved in car crash ................................................ 983
Demolition of places of worship by City of Cape Town ............... 1642
Eid: 27 November 2009 .......................................................... 1107
Football world cup: gratitude to citizens .................................. 2372
International Children’s Day .................................................. 2303
Parliamentary Committees: Importance and impact .................. 657
Parliamentary committees, importance of .............................. 2345
Provincial Roads, High accident rate on ................................. 655
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .................... 758,800
Safe festive season to motorists and pedestrians ....................... 1293
SA Roadlink Bus Service: statement by MEC .......................... 2123
Statements ........................................................................... 599,826,901,930,1008,1288,1742,2221
Subject for discussion:
  Conditions in places where poor people live ......................... 2538
  Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ............. 991
  Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape 549
  Safety on public transport in Western Cape ........................... 2234
  Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas ...... 849
  Tik dealers receiving grants ................................................. 784
  Transport crisis: Government’s response .............................. 607
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Consideration of principle ..................................................... 1155
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................. 1322
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading .................................................................... 1664
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ............................................... 1903
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ..................... 1959
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................. 2066
  Consideration of Votes and Schedules .................................. 2158
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009]
  Consideration of principle ..................................................... 1081

NCEDANA, M
Biko, Steve Bantu Bonke, Commemoration of ......................... 6205
Closing ................................................................................. 1391
Condolence, Motion of:
  Mbiko, Ms Neti ................................................................. 1040
  Sikani: Member of Cope ...................................................... 2232
  Vuba, Thobeka ................................................................... 4937
Congratulations: ................................................................. 989
Kaizer Chiefs and Orlando Pirates ........................................ 989
MPPS who Graduated .......................................................... 4703
Paralympic Team South Africa ............................................... 6203
Economic Recession ................................................................ 538
Filthy areas the poor live in .................................................... 1593
Guns During Evictions, use of ................................................ 4693
Heavy rains in Western Cape .................................................. 2227
Lack of job opportunities for emerging businesses in Western Cape .................................................. 2563
Offloading of Corpses ............................................................ 1745
Paarl, Houses to be Built ......................................................... 4005
People Affected by Rains ........................................................ 4002
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................. 1495
Statements made by Premier .................................................. 2396
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
(Consideration and finalisation) ................................................. 4785
Public school problems and resources ...................................... 836
Subject for discussion:
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ........................................ 6382
Speaker's Debate:
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ........ 5246
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ............... 6279
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .................................................. 564
Statements ............................................................................. 531, 777, 828, 973, 1006, 1104, 1285, 1289, 1739
............................................................................................. 2294, 2340, 2551, 3998, 4094, 4168, 4768
............................................................................................. 4931, 5771, 5852, 6359, 6398
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 .................................. 4722
Conditions in places where poor people live ............................... 2524
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .................................................. 4192
Housing development in Delft ................................................... 1057
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ........................................ 695
Policing in Mitchells Plain ........................................................ 888
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ................................ 2240
Statements made by Premier .................................................. 628
Unemployment, high rate of ..................................................... 2347
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in ........................................... 2418
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ......................... 4568
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle ....................................................... 1161
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................... 1223
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ................................. 1248
Vote 7 – Social Development .................................................... 1300
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .................................................. 1374
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ....................................... 1388, 1390
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing ..................................................................... 159
Vote 8 – Local Government ...................................................... 179
Vote 7 – Social Development ..................................................... 319
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ................................................................. 427
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................... 464

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................................... 1816
Vote 8 – Housing .............................................................................. 1847
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................................ 2136
Consideration of Votes and Schedules .............................................. 2157

Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill
............................................................................................................. 3990

Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
[B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ..................................... 4945

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ....................................................................... 4961

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ....................................................................... 4968

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) .. 4974

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
Of Principle) ....................................................................................... 5312

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ........................................... 5413

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4
- Community Safety) ........................................................................... 5479

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13
- Cultural Affairs and Sport) ................................................................. 5507

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 –
Health) .................................................................................................. 5538

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 –
(Provincial Parliament) ........................................................................... 5562

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 –
Human Settlements) ............................................................................ 5588

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 –
Local Government) ............................................................................. 5704


NTWANAMBI, N D
Premier:
Opening Address of ............................................................................ 1488
Subject for discussion:
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps
to prevent recession ........................................................................... 705

OZINSKY, M
Ad hoc Committee:
Appointment ...................................................................................... 4593
Investigation into possible misleading of House by Minister .............. 103

Agricultural Areas, Failure of Standing Committee to make Intervention in
Uprising in ........................................................................................... 6629

Audit reports not yet considered by SCOPA: debate ....................... 1594
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ............. 2572, 2589
Cape Nature CEO not Named ........................................................... 5777
Cape Nature: public/private partnerships ........................................... 1591
Cape Nature Kills Leopard without Permit ......................................... 4773
Condolences: Motion of
Isaacs, Sedick ................................................................. 6370
Peterson, Rafeeq ............................................................ 6451
Conflict in de Doorns, Defusing of .................................. 6450
Congratulations:
Department of Science and Technology, Sun Space and University
of Stellenbosch ................................................................. 789
End Conscription Campaign ............................................ 940
New Diplomats ............................................................... 540
Learners of Pinelands North Primary School ...................... 3953
SA Military Veterans’ Organisation ..................................... 4326
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apale School AND Implications thereof ...... 5752
Dashboard Management System, Failure of ......................... 593
Economic growth only in open, opportunity society ................ 1592
Hunting Regulations .......................................................... 4774
Implementation of Planning Act, 1999: debate ....................... 1593
Implementation of Western Cape Planning and Development Act .... 1895
Interference by Premier in School Visit ............................... 3941
Invitation, Withdrawal of .................................................. 5727
Max L: Remunerative Work ............................................... 4935
Max, Lennit - Still in Office ................................................ 4935
Military Veterans ............................................................. 4318
Military Veterans, Assistance to ......................................... 5727
Office of the Speaker: Xenophibia Campaign ....................... 362
Overstrand Municipality Land Sale ...................................... 539
 Piracy by State of Israel ...................................................... 2300
Premier:
Opening Address of ......................................................... 1523
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............... 5063, 5087
Province, Violence in Sport in ............................................ 609
Report of Auditor-General: Contracts given to Civil Servants .......... 142
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .......................... 757
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health –
(Consideration) ............................................................... 4273
Role of Mr Walters in encouraging Overstrand Municipality to commission
report .................................................................................. 904
SCOPA Meeting ................................................................. 5776
Speaker’s car accident ......................................................... 747
Speaker’s Debate:
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ............................................. 4748
Statements ... 598, 928, 1637, 1736, 2116, 2168, 2292, 2551, 3762, 4548, 4771
................................ ............................................................. 6605
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 .......................... 4723
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes .................................. 6390
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ............................................ 2190
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ....... 2496
Policing in Mitchells Plain .................................................. 893
Removal of small business traders ..................................... 2319
Results of Census 2011 ....................................................... 6515
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in .......................... 4575
Supply chain management and role of speaker and politicians in awarding of tenders and contracts – Motion .......................... 2519
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle .......................................................... 135
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .................................................. 515
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ........................................................................ 1673
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 2009
Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 2107
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .................................................. 2138
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ....................................... 2158
Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill [B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) .................................. 3984
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ......................................................... 3723
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 3784
Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] ................................................................. 3993
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ................................................................. 4869
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle) ................................................................. 5324
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ................................................................. 5590
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) .................................... 6707
Xenophobic violence in province .................................................. 2369
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape – Role of Provincial Government in ........................................................................ 2414

PAULSE, S U
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .... 913
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ............ 2580
Closing ..................................................................................... 1392
Premier: .................................................................................. 63,1505
Opening Address of ..................................................................... 2396
Statements made by Premier .................................................... 2396
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) ................................................................. 1113
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) ..................................................... 1276
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .................................................. 803
Speaker's Debate: Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship .......... 91
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ................................... 2437
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and Choices ................................................................. 568
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children ................................................................. 1139
Statements ............ 533,652,684,743,779,902,929,975,1034,1286,1291,2119, ................................. 2222,2254, 2296, 2365, 2456, 2474, 2515, 2556
Subject for discussion:
Condition in places where poor people live ........................................ 2528
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ................................. 2384
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ....................... 989
Housing development in Delf .......................................................... 1051
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape .... 551
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ............................ 667
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession .................................................. 699
Lack of development for young people ............................................. 2265
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government .......... 2490
Policing in Mitchells Plain ............................................................. 890
Problems in Bitou Municipality ....................................................... 950
Removal of small business traders .................................................. 2318
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ...................................... 2236
Thanks and good wishes to Dr Boesak ............................................ 987
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle ............................................................. 1154
Vote 6 – Health ............................................................................ 1188
Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................................... 1211
Vote 5 – Education ....................................................................... 1226
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .............................................. 1236
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ...................................... 1250
Vote 4 – Community Safety .......................................................... 1267
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ........................................... 1325
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ......................................................... 1355
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 1366
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ....................................................... 1376
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle ............................................................. 124
Vote 8 – Housing .......................................................................... 161
Vote 8 – Local Government .......................................................... 181
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .............................................. 201
Vote 5 – Education ....................................................................... 255
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ........................................................................... 1663
Vote 4 – Community Safety .......................................................... 1711
Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................................... 2105
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ....................................................... 2137
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................................. 2157
Western Cape road infrastructure .................................................... 935
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009]
Consideration of principle ............................................................. 1081

PLATO, D
Speakers Debate:
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ................. 6286
Subject for Discussion:
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ....... 5252
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ......................................... 6469, 6471
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety).......................... 5462
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety).......................... 5488

PRETORIUS, P J C
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof .......... 5742
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government..................... 5787
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on National Health Amendment Bill [B24d - 2011] (NCOP) (Consideration) .......................................................... 6520
Report on Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B33 - 2012] (NCOP) (Consideration) ......................... 6520
Ruling: ............................................................................. 5693, 5742, 5785, 5825, 6364
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle) . .......................................................... 5304
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012] (Consideration and finalisation) ......................................................... 5783
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................. 6739
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ..................... 6787
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Finalisation) ............................................................... 6788

PRINS, E
Baboon Management Contract .................................................................. 537
Condolence, Motion of:
Malan, Ms Marie .............................................................................. 2179
Vollenhoven, Aunt Tatie ....................................................................... 6260
Congratulations:
Drum Majorettes, Eight of SWD .......................................................... 2464
Kairos Drama Group of Heidelberg ......................................................... 5781
Meerendal Wine Estate on gold medal ................................................... 1892
Nicholls, Nelson .................................................................................. 3949
Semenya, Castor .................................................................................. 2480
Springboks ............................................................................................ 754
Corruption in Swellendam Municipality ............................................... 4004
Corruption in Provincial Department ..................................................... 6405
Councillor Mattheys Koch’s Failure to Declare his Interests .................. 3616
International Human Rights Day ............................................................ 4940
Drought assistance to farmers ............................................................... 2300
Eviction of Farm Workers ..................................................................... 4005
Farms: violating health and remuneration legislation .......................... 2370
Farm Project, Agri Dwala Empowerment ............................................. 4700
Farm Workers, Speedy recovery involved in Bus Accident .................. 4608
Matters Pertaining to Farmworkers ....................................................... 6493
Poor Service delivery with Housing in Oudtshoorn ......................... 2477
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) ................................................................. 4300
Shop Owners, Bad Behaviour against Poor People ........................... 4174
Speaker's Debate:
(xlvi)

Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently...... 2354
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children.................................................. 4755
Statements ...........532,1292,1585,2220, 2399, 3997, 4313, 5772, 6446, 6487
Subject for Discussion:
  Equity Share Land Reform Schemes................................. 6381
  Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .......... 5882
  Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural
areas ...................................................................................... 842
Swellendam Municipality: offences, anomalies and bottlenecks .... 2346
Vehicles, Farm workers Transported on back of .......................... 5148
Violence Against Farm Dwellers ............................................. 5915
Water Wastage by City of Cape Town .................................... 6454
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................ 1207
Western Cape Agricultural Sector, awards in ............................ 907
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning........ 382
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................ 491
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning........ 2015
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................ 2098
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................ 3627
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) .............................. 4834
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ........................................ 4907
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 –
  Agriculture) ................................................................. 5655

ROSSOUW, A

Absence to Speaker, leave of ................................................. 4593
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner 913
Ad Hoc Committee, replacement of Mr E J von Brandis on ......... 832
ANC Government on Service Delivery, Negative impact of .......... 15
Appointment: Temporary Chairpersons.................................. 7
Rules Committee ................................................................. 7
Boston, USA World Floral Art Show in .................................... 4146
  Chronic medication: serious shortage of ................................. 2371
Condolence, Motion of:
  Asmal, Kader .................................................................. 3977
  Maroem, Mr E C ............................................................ 39
  Meintjies, Frits and Berno .................................................... 6320
  Rheenenadal Area, School Bus Accident ............................... 4319
  Young People die in Car Accident ....................................... 4779
Congratualtions:
  Barnard, Mr Jimmy ....................................................... 4505
  Cloote, Mr Anthony, Top Performer at Cape Agri Academy .... 1108
  Du Toit, Natalie ............................................................. 6451
  Fortuin, Chantel ............................................................. 2349
  Jewish Community ......................................................... 753
  Jonkbloed, Zelda ............................................................ 6206
Gouws, Prof R H ................................................................. 6209
Gugulethu Seven, President of Benin Awards Families of .......................... 4782
Hanekom, Sandra .............................................................. 4782
Heritage Cape On Tenth Anniversary ........................................... 6409
Hunter, Mr Tony ................................................................ 6454
Koster John ........................................................................ 3771
Luyt, Margot ........................................................................ 6209
Maritz, Jan .......................................................................... 2305
Mayor of Cape Town .............................................................. 6329
MPP Jennifer Hartnick .............................................................. 2464
Muslims on Ramadan .............................................................. 611
Steyn, Elize ........................................................................... 2349
Discharged from Ad Hoc Committee, Mr E J von Brandis................... 837
Eskom tariff increase and top management ........................................ 1010
House, Business of ............................................................... 16,80,110,266,443,879,1084,1281,1602,1735,2165, ................................. 2250, 4545, 4929, 5276, 3736, 5741, 5804
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ................. 5789
Misrepresentations by ANC ...................................................... 834
Money-lenders and shebeen owners: effect and impact of .................... 2371
NCOP, Permanent delegates to .................................................. 5
NCOP, Delegates to, Authority to Vote ......................................... 6
Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial
Legislatures Act .................................................................... 266
Premier, Remuneration of ......................................................... 1084
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in  
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ....................................... 758
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules  
(Consideration) .................................................................. 4280
Report of Rules Committee on amendments to standing  
Rules (Consideration) ............................................................. 4562
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules  
(Consideration) .................................................................. 4613
Road Accident Fatalities ............................................................ 6413
Safe Transportation of Learners ................................................. 2518
Sitting, Hours of ..................................................................... 1802
Speaker's Debate: 
Economic Freedom of the Youth ................................................. 3965
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ............... 5252
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ....................................... 2439
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and  
choices .................................................................................. 571
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and  
Children ............................................................................. 1139
Statements ............................................................................ 101, 535, 825, 1007, 1029,1635,1743,2222
2293, 2474, 2515, 3758, 3933, 4169, 4312, 4546, 4685, 4929, 5259, ................................. 5718, 5832, 5898M 6313, 6400, 6443
Students, Study bursaries to ....................................................... 750
Subject for discussion: 
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ..................... 5884
Heritage Day ......................................................................... 814
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ............................................ 6467
Order of the Day, Point of Order, Programming of ........................... 4269
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in .............................. 4563
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................................. 1372
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle ........................................................................ 130
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .................................................................. 512
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................................. 2129
2010 Soccer World Cup, Legacy of ............................................................ 2225
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................................. 3662
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................. 4923
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................. 4962
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4
  - Community Safety) .................................................................................. 5485
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – (Provincial Parliament) ................................................................. 5565
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ........................................................................ 6651
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .................................................. 6783

SKWATSHA, M
Ambulance Services and Response time, State of ....................................... 749
Atlantis integrated transport system ............................................................... 2559
AD Hoc Committee, Appointment of .......................................................... 4007
Bafana Bafana, Support for ........................................................................ 307
DA Elective Procedures .................................................................................. 6493
Casino: establishment of second casino in Metropole ................................ 2368
Clinics, Shocking state of ............................................................................ 4173
Chronic Medicine, Chaos with dispensing of ............................................. 5859
Chronic Medicine, Incorrect labelling of .................................................... 5873
Condolence, Motion of:
  Death of People after Collision of taxi and truck .................................... 2480
  Death of Seven Members of Family after eating Cooked Mushrooms ........ 6269
Gillwald, Cheryl ............................................................................................ 2407
January, Joseph ............................................................................................ 6408
Kasrils, Eleanor ............................................................................................. 1011
Khumalo, Alf ................................................................................................. 6374
Madikwa, Nomvelo "Rayi" .......................................................................... 617
Maxenza, Const Daniel .................................................................................. 1893
Meer, Ms Fatima ............................................................................................ 1643
Mkunqana, Simphiwe .................................................................................... 6324
Myethu, Themba ........................................................................................... 6406
Ndziba, Ngcondo ........................................................................................... 107
Ngcukana, Ezra ............................................................................................. 2407
Nxu, Xolile Death of Vice-President of SAMWU ....................................... 5871
Sisulu, Zwelakhe ............................................................................................ 6317
Ting Ting Masanga ........................................................................................ 787
Yengeni, Mr ................................................................................................. 836
Subject for discussion:

**St Luke’s Hospice**

**Shortage of Beds at Helderberg Hospital**

**Seasonal Diseases, Victims of**

**Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their partici**

**Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former**

**Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)**

**Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]**

(Consideration and finalisation)

**Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)**

**Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former**

**Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration)**

**Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in**

**NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration)**

**Seasonal Diseases, Victims of**

**Shortage of Beds at Helderberg Hospital**

**St Luke’s Hospice**

**Statements**

**Subject for discussion:**

Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in

Taxi Violence in Western Cape

Crime, Initiative to Prevent in

Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery
Freedom Day: 16 Years later.................................................. 2182
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .................. 5875
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats .................................... 6466
Removal of small business traders ........................................ 2315
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .............................. 2244
Unguarded Rail Crossings ..................................................... 2518
Tygerberg Hospital .............................................................. 4553

Speaker’s Debate:
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children.................................................. 4747
Tygerburg hospital, Gratitude to .............................................. 6573

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle ..................................................... 1151
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................. 1376
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ..................................... 1389

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle ..................................................... 122
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................. 520

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .................................................... 1900
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ........................ 1954
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................... 2071

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ..................................... 3901

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .................................................... 4860

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................. 4964

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ..................................................... 5539

Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ..................................................... 6664

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .................................................... 6722

STALI, Z C

ANC, Veterans Honoured by ................................................... 5155
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ............. 2577
Cape Town Motorist Hazel Souma .......................................... 5273
Chapman’s Peak Rockfall ....................................................... 6316
City of Cape Town, Mycity Vehicle operation Companies Upset ......... 6575
Community Safety, Remarks by Minister .................................. 4099

Condolence, Motion of:
Asmal, Kader ........................................................................ 3977
Gaffney, Brian ...................................................................... 4113
Padayachee, Minister Roy ..................................................... 5779
Shiceka, Former Minister Sicelo ............................................ 5779
Member Nyanda, Florence .................................................... 5779

Congratualtions: Motion of:
Bafana Bafana ...................................................................... 3766
Fugard, Athol ........................................................................ 4010
Jonson, Denver ...................................................................... 4110
Manyonga, Luvo .................................................................... 2410
STRACHAN, G R

Cape Town as South Africa's Silicon Valley ........................................ 833
Chairperson of Standing Committee of Finance, Censuring of .............. 589
Clothing Sector, Strike in ............................................................... 783
Paulse, Ms S U, Statement of ........................................................ 656
Premier, Misleading statements by .................................................. 15
Premier: ......................................................................................... 65
Opening Address of ........................................................................ 65
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) ........................................................................ 1110
Statements ..................................................................................... 300, 585, 828, 1033, 1105, 2455
Subject for discussion:
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape.......... 554
Statements made by Premier ......................................................... 618
TINGWE, M

Education System, Inequality in the

Deputy Minister Visits Hospital and School ........................................ 6414
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact
  on Communities ........................................................................... 4151
Closure of Schools .......................................................................... 5900
Closure of Nongovernmental Organisations ........................................ 5858
Condolence, Motion of:
  Charles, Shameega in Doha mall Fire ........................................... 5862
  Emeran, Umar ............................................................................ 6631
  Ford, Kelly-Jade .......................................................................... 6631
  Lithemba Loli ............................................................................ 787
  People killed in fire in Lingelethu, Khayelitsha ......................... 2463
  Pietersen, Moegamat ................................................................. 6498
  Roxo, Ernest in Doha mall Fire ................................................... 5782
  Smith, Keenen ........................................................................... 6631
  Swail, Lee-Ann .......................................................................... 6631
Congratualtions, Motion of
  Brink, Mashaarn .......................................................................... 4178
  DA's inability to mobilise young people regarding social cohesion .. 1894
  DA-Government to Provide Equal Education, Failure of ............. 5267
  Deafness ................................................................................... 2521
  Dyamdeki, Nomthandazo ............................................................ 5302
  Farewell to Tata Mpilo Tutu ....................................................... 2412
  Grade Nine, Failure rate, ............................................................ 5904
  Hillview Housing Development Project, Delay in ...................... 2256
  Housing development in Delft ..................................................... 934
  Provincial Legislature, disregarding of isiXhosa language in .... 982
  Salute to Liezel Van der Westhuizen ........................................ 4114
  Salute to Dean Stockenstrom .................................................... 4114
  Schools, Overcrowded ............................................................. 4174
  Mpofu-Wlash, Sizwe ................................................................. 4010

DA-LED Government to Employ People living with disabilities, Failure of 4604
DASO Found Guilty of Contravening Three UCT SCR Election
  By Laws ................................................................................... 6327
De Duine Primary School, Lotus River, Dog Buried Alive at ........... 4778
Denneprag Primary School, Mossel Bay to Plead for Their School to
  Remain open, March to WCED District Office by ......................... 6633
Divide Along Racial and Language lines ......................................... 6577

Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ........................................ 698
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Consideration of principle .......................................................... 1170
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ....................... 1308
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ..................................................... 1352
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle .......................................................... 117
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ....................... 338
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ..................................... 409
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ..................................................... 429
Xenophobia in De Doorns: investigative and disciplinary process .... 1036

Consideration of principle ............................................................. 1170
Consideration of principle ............................................................. 117
Consideration of principle ............................................................. 117
Consideration of principle ............................................................. 117
Failure of WCED to indicate how money was spent, shutting down of 15 schools……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………6628
Lavis Drive Primary, furniture inventory at …………………………………………………………………………………………………6499
Initiation practices condemned ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………5867
Learners and educators, safety of ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………4602
Learners protest about having to pay for textbooks ……………………………………………………………………………………………5150
Matric passes, university of Western Cape project to improve number and quality of ……………………………………………………4703

Premier:
Premier’s state of the province address (debate) …………………………………………………………………………………………………5065
Report of rules committee on amendments to standing rules (consideration) ………………………………………………………………………4277
Report of rules committee on amendments to standing rules (consideration) ……………………………………………………………………………4611
Sexual abuse and rape, complaints of teacher misconduct, including cases of ………………………………………………………………………4603

Speaker’s debate:
Role of youth in governance and citizenship ………………………………………………………………………………………………………85
Women of Western Cape – employment, opportunities and choices ………………………………………………………………………………………560
Economic freedom of the youth ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………3958

Statements ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………2557, 4128, 4769, 5141, 5262, 5295, 5831, 5851, 6310, 6490
Student uprising, 11 August 1976 …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………4144
Sport as unifying factor ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………747

Subject for discussion:
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape …………………………………………………………………………………………………996
Housing development in Delft ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………1047
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ……………………………………………………………………………………………………668
Heritage day ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………810
Lack of development for young people …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………2262
Ongoing crisis in education in Western Cape …………………………………………………………………………………………………………6425
Teenage pregnancies ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………2560
Teaching award, Top National ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………4556
Textbooks, questioned, delivery of ………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………5901
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 1 – Premier …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………222
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1 – 2010]
Vote 1 – Premier …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………1763
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] – ………………………………………………………………………………………………………4810
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education)
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………5394
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – ……………………………………………………………………………………………………5560
(Provincial Parliament)
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………6660
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ………………………………………………………………………………………………………6763

UYS, P
Appointment of Jan-Jan Joubert ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………4175
Ad hoc committee on nomination of public service commissioner …………………………………………………………………………………912
Africa Day ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………2260
Bitou municipality: draft resolution in terms of Rule 119 ………………………………………………………………………………………………2571, 2597
Bitou Municipality, Service Hikes in ................................................................. 5916
Budget for 2010/2011, Fifth Financial Year not Spent for .................................. 4101
City of Cape Town, Awarding of performance bonuses in .................................. 2258
City of Cape Town, Unauthorised payments and tender processes of ..................... 656
City of Cape Town’s spending on informal settlements ........................................ 2347
Committee Meetings, Hessequa Mayoral ......................................................... 4694
Condolences: Motion of
Linkin Park Concert Death .................................................................................. 6452
Congratulations:
Commissioner Petros and SAPS ................................................................. 787
DA Government, Inferior service Delivery by ............................................... 5860
Goedeman, Delina ......................................................................................... 6456
DA’s disregard for minimum standards for sanitation
and provision of toilets to poor ........................................................................... 2518
Death of psychiatric patient at Karl Bremer Hospital ........................................... 834
Deaths in informal areas in Cape Town, continuing .......................................... 2562
Disarray in Legislature ..................................................................................... 4005
Eden District Municipality .................................................................................. 5914
Expenditure of City of Cape Town ....................................................................... 2407
Handling of Legislature and its Affairs ............................................................ 3940
High Court Documents, Falsification of ......................................................... 4006
Kannaland .......................................................................................................... 4141
Municipal rates fiasco ...................................................................................... 2259
Oudtshoorn Municipality .................................................................................... 6328
Politicising appointment of secretary to parliament ......................................... 2563
Premier:
Opening Address of .......................................................................................... 1543
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .............................................. 5084
Premier: Undermining Stellenbosch Municipality .............................................. 750
Programming Authority’s Role, Engagement of Political Parties in
Legislature with regard to .................................................................................... 6259
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ............................................. 1625
Report of SIU, Distribution of Interim before its Release ................................... 4103
Secretarial Allowances, Constituency and ......................................................... 4103
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
(Consideration) .................................................................................................... 4282
Report of Rules Committee on amendments to standing
Rules (Consideration) .......................................................................................... 4562
Service Delivery Problems in DA-Run Municipalities ........................................ 3764
Speaker’s Debate:
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ...................... 2358
Spending, City of Cape Town of ....................................................................... 4319
Statements .................. 301, 304, 529, 584, 653, 740, 780, 976, 1284, 2223, 2297
................................ 2366, 3937, 4000, 4096, 4690, 5264, 5833, 6255, 6255, 6363, 6448
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ..................................................... 4709
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ............................................. 1021
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ............... 544
Order of the Day, Point of Order, Programming of ...................................... 4269
Suspension of public sector strike by Union ..................................................... 2569
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ...................... 2486
Problems in Bitou Municipality ....................................................................... 942
Western Cape, Storm damage in.................................................................................. 364
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing................................................................. 1247
  Consideration of Votes and Schedules..................................................................... 1390
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle......................................................................................... 127
  Vote 8 – Local Government...................................................................................... 173
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 14 – Local Government.................................................................................. 1811
  Vote 8 – Housing.................................................................................................... 1849
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament................................................................................ 2133
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 14 – Local Government.................................................................................. 3576
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament................................................................................ 3663
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government).............................................................. 4831
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament).............................................................. 4921
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
  [B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation)......................................................... 4947
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
  of Votes and Schedule)........................................................................................... 4961, 4873
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier).................................................................................. 5357
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 –
  Local Government)................................................................................................. 5706
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government)................................................................ 6695

VAN RENSBURG, H G

Premier:
  Opening Address of................................................................................................. 1491
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)................................................. 5051
Subject for discussion:
  Equity Share Land Reform Schemes .................................................................... 6392
  High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River............................................... 1023
  Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
    Prevent recession................................................................................................... 703
  Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on................................................................. 5161
  Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas...855
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture............................................................................................. 1202, 1213
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture............................................................................................. 482,502
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture............................................................................................. 2086, 2113
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture............................................................................................. 3618, 3634
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture)........................................................................ 4904, 4912
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .......................................................... 5642
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .............................................. 67378

VAN ZYL, J A

Congratulations:

WP Junior Jukskei Team at SA Championships ........................................ 1350
School buses near Botriver ................................................................. 2481

Executive Statement ................................................................................. 6193

Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
(Consideration) ......................................................................................... 4282

Speaker's Debate:

Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking .................................................. 1615
International Aids Day ............................................................................ 1093
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently .... 2357
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ................................................. 2441

Statements .......... 1033,1585,2221,2252, 2364, 2455, 2513, 3758, 3935, 4312, ................................................................. 5894, 6311

Subject for discussion:

Freedom Day: 16 Years later ................................................................. 2189
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .................... 5878
Lack of development for young people .............................................. 2267
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ................................................. 6465
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ................................................. 5165
Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports .............................................. 6590
SA Fisheries .......................................................................................... 4021

Success to Grade 12 Learners with upcoming Examination ............. 6319

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]

Vote 6 – Health ..................................................................................... 1186
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................................ 1206
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................... 1266
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............. 1343
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ............................................................... 1354

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]

Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................... 1712
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................. 1787
Vote 6 – Health ..................................................................................... 1930
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............. 2014
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................................ 2104

Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
[B2-2011] ............................................................................................... 3987

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]

Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............. 3783
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................................... 3842

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]

– (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ....................................................... 4803

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ......................................................... 4868

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ....................................................... 4906
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ........................................ 4963
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) .................................................. 5393

VISser, J J
Agricultural Industry, Game Farming declared ........................................ 4098
Agri World Africa Established ................................................................. 5866
ANC in Municipal Election ................................................................. 3952
ANC Centenary ............................................................................. 4936
ANC Youth League Congress, Failed – Motion ................................. 4942
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .... 911
Battle of Braamfontein, 14 May 2012 ............................................ 5842
Behaviour of ANC in Swellendam ..................................................... 6569
Birthday in the House, Marais, Du Toit A ........................................ 4936
Birthday Wishes to Minister Madikizela ........................................ 5272
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .............. 2586
Bitou Municipality, Problems at ......................................................... 591
Cape Minstrels on Tweede Nuwe Jaar .............................................. 4099

Condolence, Motion of:
   Bekker, Suna ............................................................................. 4114
   Daniels, Michael ...................................................................... 6494
   Deputy Speaker, Mother of ...................................................... 786
   Dryer, Charles ........................................................................... 6324
   Kirkpatrick, Ian ........................................................................ 6576
   Klaasen, Clr Kevin .................................................................... 107
   Hörmann, Fritz ........................................................................... 660
   Nkanisa, Mathesonke ................................................................. 4113
   Residents who died in fire at Rusthof ...................................... 2176
   USA After Superstorm Sandy .................................................... 6414
   Van Niekerk, Dr Theresa ............................................................ 659

Congratulations:
   Agulhas, Tiffany .......................................................................... 6452
   Bernstein, Ann ........................................................................... 5730
   Cape Town Municipality .............................................................. 5270
   Cupido, Ms, Appointment as Provincial Chairperson of ACDP ....... 4777
   DA on victory in Worcester ......................................................... 1891
   DA Winning, Election in Ward 88 ............................................ 6262
   Department of Agriculture ......................................................... 6331
   Drakenstein Municipality ............................................................. 4179
   Drakenstein Local Municipality ................................................... 5778
   Elsendrug Agricultural College .................................................. 6209
   Ikeys ........................................................................................... 3768
   Hon Mcebisi Skwatsha refused entry into Nomination Process ... 6638
   Jewish Community ..................................................................... 2570
   Management: Silwerkruiin Home for the Elderly, Wellington ...... 1040
   Member of the House ................................................................ 4555
   Minister on compilation of guide ............................................... 1645
   Municipalities, on Blue Drop and Green Drop Status .............. 4109
   Municipal Governance, status of ............................................. 5267
   Municipalities, Who spent their MIG Funds before End of
   Budget Year ................................................................. 4112
   Oakdale Agricultural High School ............................................. 6205
Overstrand Municipality ................................................................. 4939
Pienaar, Louis ............................................................................. 6454
Philander, Tovernon ................................................................. 6456
Prins, Henry ............................................................................... 5912
Scholtz, Joggie ........................................................................... 5912
Seven Team, Maties ................................................................. 6637
Sharks ......................................................................................... 4006
Stellenbosch Municipality ......................................................... 5270
Stormers .................................................................................... 4006
Western Cape Municipality ....................................................... 5270
Winners of national female farmer competition ....................... 2461
Delivery of housing, alternative technology in ......................... 936
Farming, small-scale – economic feasibility of ......................... 2299
Graaff Family, Homage to ......................................................... 5868
Good wishes for Cape Argus Pick ‘n Pay Cycle Tour ............... 1596
Increased property rates ............................................................ 1592
Integrated Human Settlement, Development of ..................... 5838
Large-Scale Fraud among Northern Cape ANC Leadership ....... 6571
Local Government, Financial Situation of ............................... 5859
Municipal Disaster Management Plans, Investigation into ...... 783
Premier:
Opening Address of ..................................................................... 52,1520
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ....................... 1624,1633
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) ......................................................................... 1113
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ...................................... 796
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ......................................................................... 4286
Service Delivery, Integrated ........................................................ 5836
Speaker’s Debate:
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and
choices ....................................................................................... 565
Statements .......................................................... 12,103,603,679,739,931,972,1106,1287,1583,1640,1738,
.................................................... 2116, 2223, 2291, 2368, 2397, 2457, 2471, 3763, 3996, 4125,
.................................................. 4314, 4551, 4592, 4771, 5265, 5833, 6198, 6314, 6398, 6448, 6565,
.................................................. 6571, 6595
Subject for discussion:
Conditions in places where poor people live .......................... 2534
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ........................................... 6384
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ............ 995
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape .. 548
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ........ 2493
Problems in Bitou Municipality .................................................. 940
Removal of small business traders .......................................... 2316
Results of Census 2011 .............................................................. 6509
South African Excels Abroad ...................................................... 5865
Swellendam Municipality .......................................................... 6368
Technical Programmes, Structural Collapse .......................... 4698
Water, Availability and State of ................................................ 6366
Ward Committees ..................................................................... 4318
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................. 1210
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................. 1236
  Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing .......................... 1249
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 1345
  Consideration of Votes and Schedules ................................ 1390

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 8 – Housing .......................................................... 152
  Vote 8 – Local Government ............................................... 172
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................. 203
  Vote 5 – Education ...................................................... 253
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...... 380
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................... 501
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ......................................... 522

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 14 – Local Government ........................................... 1809
  Vote 8 – Housing .......................................................... 1839
  Vote 5 – Education ...................................................... 1877
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................... 1961
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 2013
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................. 2043
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................... 2111

Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
[B2-2011] ................................................................. 3983

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 14 – Local Government ........................................... 3572
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................... 3631
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 3790
  Vote 8 – Housing .......................................................... 3862

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ............................. 4834

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) ............................... 4898

Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
[B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ........................ 4949

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) .................................................... 4968

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
Of Principle) ............................................................... 5324

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 –
Human Settlements) ....................................................... 5600

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 –
(Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .............. 5614

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 –
Local Government) ....................................................... 5704

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ............................. 6697

VON BRANDIS, E J
  Afrikaans writers receive Honorary Award .......................... 6210
  Ambassador, Singer/Actress Cape Town Routes .................. 5157
  Car Magazine Award for Safely Home Programme ................. 1596
  Cape Town as second best destination in Africa and Middle East .. 2372
Cape Town Partnership, Prof Ndebele Appointed as Chairperson of ........................................... 5913
Cape Town Tourism Board, New Chair of .......................................................... 6411
Cape Town Favourite Tourist City ........................................................................ 6500
Cableway, Table Mountain Aerial ..................................................................... 4148
Communities, Impact of “Ale” ............................................................................ 5148
Condolence, Motion of: Madinga, Lulama ...................................................................... 1037
Nel, F B B, Van Lill, M M E and Eloff, J M, Cycle accident victims . 1594
Ntozini, Nobantu “Vicky” ...................................................................................... 6634
Congratulations: Arabella Hotel and Spa .............................................................. 6332
BPESA .................................................................................................................. 6415
Caledon .................................................................................................................. 4323
Cape Grace Hotel ................................................................................................ 6332
Cape Town Tourism ............................................................................................. 5841
City of Cape Town ............................................................................................... 4008
City of Cape Town, Tourism and Provincial Counterparts ............................. 6334
Coetzez, Theuns .................................................................................................. 3767
De Rust ................................................................................................................. 4177
Department of Transport and Public Works ...................................................... 6330
Department of Economic Development and Tourism ...................................... 6330
Duk, William ......................................................................................................... 6208
Durban Tourism .................................................................................................. 5841
Economic and environmental developments, importance of .................. 2369
Fancourt ................................................................................................................. 6325
Fatal taxi accident on Constantia Main Road .................................................... 2303
Free trade ports, Establishment of .................................................................... 2256
Fyfer, Boy .............................................................................................................. 6263
Gratitude and appreciation to committee coordinators .................................. 2521
Hanekom, Mr A, on election ................................................................................ 1892
Ikeys ......................................................................................................................... 3768
I-WEC .................................................................................................................. 4780
Johannesburg Tourism ......................................................................................... 5841
Kaap Rapport and Van Loveren Town of the Year Competition ............... 659
Kirsten, Gary ......................................................................................................... 3951
Minister Alan Winde: saving of drowning woman ........................................ 2352
Minister of Economic Development ................................................................. 4179
Philander, Vernon ............................................................................................... 5908
Silvo, Joao .............................................................................................................. 4608
Solomon, Kenny .................................................................................................... 6203
Tourism and Rector of UWC ............................................................................... 4179
Western Cape Liquor Authority ......................................................................... 5273
Court Application, Backyard Dwellers Lodge .................................................. 6410
Dorp Street, Walk-in Centre ............................................................................... 6460
Entrepreneurial Leader of the Year Award ....................................................... 6502
Fire, Seven Die in ............................................................................................... 4604
Green Initiative, Advantage of ......................................................................... 5902
House, Business of ............................................................................................. 6684
Imvelo Responsible Tourism Award ................................................................. 6458
Junior Rugby Championship, International under 20 .............................. 5910
Premier: Opening Address of .............................................................................. 1512
Provincial Development Council, Closing down of .................................................. 2225
Roadblocks over weekend .................................................................................. 2567
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4—2010]
(NCOP) (Consideration) .................................................................................. 1635, 1735
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) ............................................................................................... 1109
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament
(Consideration) .................................................................................................. 1273, 1278
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints lodged against current and
former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament ................................ 1011
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ............................................................. 801
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) .................................................................................................. 4294
Saldanha Industrial development Region .............................................................. 5903
Seven Wonders of Nature, Table Mountain voted as one of ............................... 4696
Speaker's Debate:
Economic Freedom of the Youth ....................................................................... 3969
Statements .................. 13,300,530,584,601,781,924,977,1005,1032,1103,1292,
......................... 1586, 2119,2173,2219,2255, 2298, 2342, 2400, 2475, 2517, 2555
......................... 3999, 4129, 4316, 4589, 4766, 5261, 5720, 5773, 5850, 6194, 6311,
................................................................. 6401, 6491, 6625
Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape ........................................................................ 6340
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .................................... 990
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
prevent recession .............................................................................................. 696
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ............................................................... 5166
Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports ............................................................. 6588
Removal of small business traders ................................................................. 2309
Results of Census 2011 ..................................................................................... 6513
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .................................................... 2236
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas ... 851
Taxi Industry, Two-Year Peach in - Motion ..................................................... 5153
Ten Best Restaurants in South Africa ............................................................... 6635
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................................. 1307
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................................. 1320
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................................... 1352
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................................................. 116
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................................. 337
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................................. 402
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................................... 426
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ................................................................................................. 1653
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................................... 1899
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .............................................. 1952
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................................. 2065
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................................................. 2159

WALTERS, M C –
Astronomy Society, Hermanus ................................................. 4149
Beaufort West and Ceres farm murders ..................................... 1293
Condolence, Motion of:
Beyleveld, Theo ......................................................................... 4107
Brady, Nazario ........................................................................... 694
Kotzé, Pen .................................................................................. 2408
Marais, Alister ............................................................................ 6207
Schlemmer, Prof Lawrence ....................................................... 4559

Congratulations:
City of Cape Town officials ...................................................... 4782
Department of Agriculture ....................................................... 756
Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..................................................... 6330
Eden, Abraham ......................................................................... 6328
Fisher, Mr Adam ........................................................................ 363
Guthrie, Mark ............................................................................ 6457
Hattingh, Adele .......................................................................... 2523
La Motte Wine Estate .............................................................. 4779
Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens (M C Walters).......................... 5862
Minister van Rensburg, Department on Publication of

(lxii)
Subject for discussion:

Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ........................................ 6379
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .............. 997
Heritage Day ........................................................................ 820
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ..................... 1012
Housing development in Delft ................................................ 1058
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on .................................. 5161, 5173
Removal of small business traders ......................................... 2313
SA Fisheries ........................................................................ 4014

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]

Vote 11 – Agriculture ......................................................... 1204
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................ 1222
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................... 1232
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing .............................. 1251
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................ 1268
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 1336

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]

Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................... 158
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................... 201
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................ 257
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................... 323
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 373
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................. 462
Vote 11 – Agriculture ....................................................... 488

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................ 1710
Vote 14 – Local Government .............................................. 1820
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................ 1851
Vote 5 – Education .......................................................... 1874
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...... 2007
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................... 2049
Vote 11 – Agriculture ....................................................... 2095
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ................................ 2158

Western Cape Model of Land Reform .................................... 2403

Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
[B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) ......................... 3983
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................... 3603
Vote 11 – Agriculture ....................................................... 3625
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ..................... 3741
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...... 3781
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................ 3872

Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill
[B4-2011] ........................................................................... 3991, 3992

Wilberforce, William and the Abolition of Slavery .................. 4775

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .................................................. 4871
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ........................................ 4909

Western Cape Agriculture Awards ........................................... 5158

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ......................... 5452
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) .......................................... 5695

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 9)– Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .................................................. 6699
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ........................................ 6738

WILEY, M G E
Condolence, Motion of:
Banda, Const. Xolisa .......................................................... 5151
Conduct towards women MPPS ............................................. 607
Cyclist killed on Main Road St James .................................... 6371
Families in Western Cape and Elsewhere ................................. 6264
Jacobs, Mr M .................................................................. 837
Komphela, SGT Thumelephi ............................................... 4937
Hout Bay Boat Tragedy ........................................................ 6320
Marks, Mr Joe .................................................................. 4695
Moses, Warrent Officer Douglas .......................................... 6368
Searll, Aaron and Snyman, Lannice ..................................... 2231
Slain Police officer and Injured Policeman ............................. 6319
Stewart, Gary .................................................................. 6326
Tobias, Dr Phillip .......................................................... 5909
Tyibilika, Solly .......................................................... 4698
Van Heerden, Tim (M G E Wiley) ................................. 4326

Congratulations:
Biermann, Hugo .......................................................... 5731
Chrysalis Academy, CEO and Staff of ................................ 4938
DA ............................................................................. 4941
Department of Community Safety and all Officials .......... 6333
Education Centre .......................................................... 6266
Fire-Fighters .................................................................. 3765
Fish Hoek Lifesaving Club .............................................. 3948
Gold Medal for Surf Life Saving ...................................... 541
Junior Golfer Luca Fillipi ............................................... 6637
Kwahattu Culture ......................................................... 6266
Mocke, Mr Dawid .......................................................... 1293
Masiphumelele Young Stars Soccer Team ..................... 5781
Mosiela High School ...................................................... 789
National Mens’s Hockey Team ....................................... 5783
Price, Kevin ................................................................. 4142
Softball Federation, Western Cape .................................. 4942
South African Police Service ......................................... 2350
Executive statement: De Doorns ................................... 2337
Management of Fisheries and Small Boat Harbours ......... 3940
Mckenna, Mr Sageas ..................................................... 4695
Metro Rescue Workers .................................................. 3765
Mocke, Dawid ............................................................... 4181
National Womens’ Hockey Squad ................................... 5159
Orlando Pirates ............................................................ 3949
Van Gyssen Eloïse .......................................................... 3948
World War II Veteran ...................................................... 5155
2012 Olympic Squad, Western Cape Members ............... 5907
Farm Attacks, Solly Tyibilika Killing .............................. 4692
Gangs, in Western Cape .................................................. 4316
Increase in Rats .............................................................. 5908
WP Rugby Team winning Curry Cup .............................. 6408
Fatal Shootings in Hanover Park and Ottery ................. 6406
IG Monitor Report .......................................................... 5914
Kasparov, Garry Grandmaster ......................................... 5302
Khayelitsha, Vigilantism .................................................. 5726
Public Property, Civil unrest and damage to .................. 5266

Premier:
Opening Address of ........................................................ 1539
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............ 5084
Rail Commuter Action Group: Mr Leslie Van Minnen .......... 144
Role of seat of national Parliament in nation-building .... 932
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
  On Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010]
  (NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010]
  (NCOP)(Consideration) .............................................. 3564
Report of Standing Committee on Education, Cultural Affairs and Sport
  on visit to Uitzig Secondary School (Consideration) ......... 1012
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
  NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .......................... 759,805
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ................................................................. 4286
SA Junior Bodyboarding Champion ..................................... 6498
Speaker's Debate:
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .......... 5241
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ................. 6281
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking .................................. 1613
International Aids Day .......................................................... 1094
Statements ........... 9, 98,532,650,745,827,975,1004,1289,2169, 2296, 2338
......... 2363, 2454, 2558, 3938, 4096, 4167, 4586, 5143, 5297, 5775, 5829,
.................. 5855, 5899, 6200, 6254, 6358, 6485, 6624
Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape ............................................. 6347
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ....................... 2383
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ................................................. 4202
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
Delivery .................................................................................. 4616
Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape .................. 6212
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ................ 670
Heritage Day ........................................................................... 812
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ......................... 6425
Policing in Mitchells Plain ...................................................... 882
SA Fisheries ........................................................................... 4014
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ..................... 2241
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in ........................................... 2420
Statements made by Premier .................................................. 626
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ...................... 4563
Taxi Strike ................................................................................ 1744
Taxis, Report on Investigation into Conversion Vans into Taxi .... 3616
Thanks to SAPS, Metro Police, Premier and Mr J P Smith ........ 938
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................. 1187
Vote 11 – Agriculture .......................................................... 1211
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................... 1224
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................ 1258
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................... 1301
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 1341
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ................................ 1389
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................... 125
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................... 258
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................. 287
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................... 321
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 384
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................ 454
Vote 11 – Agriculture .......................................................... 496
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................ 1705
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................... 1789
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................. 1927
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 2017
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................... 2050
Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................ 2106
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................... 3712
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ....................................... 3600
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ......................... 4841
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ............................................. 4963
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ............................................ 5396
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ......................... 6704
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ................. 6761

WINDE, A R
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .......... 2573, 2593
Condolence, Motion of:
  Asmal, Kader ........................................................................ 3977
Financial Governance Review and Outlook, 2009 – Tabling .......... 1599
House, Business of .................................................................. 6684
Premier:
  Opening Address of ............................................................. 1546
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook – Tabling and consideration .... 1042
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
  (Consideration and finalisation) ............................................ 4794
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (PERO) – (Tabling) ........ 6269
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
  (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
  (Consideration) ................................................................... 1120
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
  on Social assistance Amendment bill [B5B—2010]
  (Consideration) .................................................................. 2503
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
  (Consideration) .................................................................... 4308
Statements ............................................................................. 6610
Subject for discussion:
  Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ................................ 4721
  Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
  prevent recession ................................................................. 710
  National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
  against Implementation of .................................................. 5928
  Problems in Bitou Municipality .............................................. 945
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Introduction and First Reading ............................................. 1070
  Consideration of principle .................................................... 1146,1176
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................. 1305,1313
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ................................................ 1350,1357
  Finalisation .......................................................................... 1391
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
- Consideration of principle ........................................ 112,139
- Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................. 329,352
- Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................ 422,432
- Finalisation .................................................................. 526

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1 — 2010]
- Introduction and First Reading ........................................ 1571
- Second Reading ................................................................ 1648,1681
- Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................... 1895,1906
- Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................. 1944,1962
- Finalisation .................................................................. 2159

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B8 -2011] (Consideration of Principle) .. 4786

Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009]
- Introduction and First Reading ........................................ 1041
- Consideration of principle ............................................. 1081

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2009]
- Introduction and First Reading ........................................ 2467

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]
- Consideration .............................................................. 2502

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]
- Finalisation .................................................................. 2503

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
- Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................. 3730, 3747
- Finalisation .................................................................. 3918

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Introduction and First Reading) ....................................... 4671

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
- (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ) ......................... 4875

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
- (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .... 4881

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2012] (Introduction and
First Reading) ................................................................ 5118

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4 -2012] (2011/12 Financial Year) (Introduction and
First Reading) ................................................................. 5160

Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation
Bill [B4- 2012](2011/2012 Financial Year)
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................. 5274

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
of Principle) ................................................................. 5303, 5329

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2-2012]
(Introduction and First Reading) ........................................ 5337

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 3 –
Provincial Treasury) .......................................................... 5630

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 3 –
Provincial Treasury) .......................................................... 5637

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 –
Economic Development and Tourism) ................................ 5666

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................. 5736

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ............................................. 5741
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11-2012] (Introduction and First Reading) .................................................. 6579
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ......................................................... 6639
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) ......................... 6686

WITBOOI, J
Annual National Assessment Papers .................................................................. 6263
Celebration of Diwali – Festival of Lights ....................................................... 6369
Chestnut Clinic in Belhar, situation at ............................................................ 981
City of Cape Town: Health Plan on HIV and TB ............................................. 933
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities .............................................................................. 4151
Closure of 27 Black Schools, Interfaith Service against .................................. 6268
Condolence, Motion of:
  Dely, Frans ......................................................................................... 4324
  D'Oliveira, Basil ................................................................................ 4699
  Endly, Paul Macassar Veterans .............................................................. 5156
  Madigage, Thomas .......................................................................... 6372
  Sefularo, Dr ...................................................................................... 2178
  Stemmet, Adnaan ............................................................................ 2570
  Scott, Christina ............................................................................... 4560
  Tandy, Hendry Macassar Veterans ....................................................... 5156
  Rooi, Katriene Kassie ..................................................................... 5301
  Witbooi, Melvin .............................................................................. 4607

Congratulations:
  Burger, Schalk .............................................................................. 4610
  Emergency Services Staff .................................................................... 1128
  President Jacob Zuma on taking Aids test ............................................ 2176
  Van der Merwe, DR Elbie ................................................................ 4009
  DA Political Appointments .................................................................. 361
  Environmental and Health Issues ......................................................... 1744
  Future of Somerset Hospital .................................................................. 2173
  H1N1 Virus, Number of deaths as a result of ....................................... 784
  Health Rights and responsibilities, Review of ....................................... 655
  International Nurses Day .................................................................... 2229
  Manipulation by EMS Staff of Triage System ....................................... 2405
  Measles outbreak in province .............................................................. 2122
  Mentoor, Farwa ............................................................................... 4182
  Organ Donor Month as August ............................................................ 2409
  Provincial Hospitals, Lack of Security at .............................................. 4102
  Racist manager, Sacking of ................................................................ 4701
  Safety of personnel at hospital ............................................................. 2257
  Smile Foundation, Salutation to ......................................................... 3769, 4111
Shortage of Drug and Alcohol Rehabilitation Centres .................................... 3616
Shortage of flu vaccines ........................................................................... 2176
Speaker's Debate:
  Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ............................ 6284
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ............................................... 1616
  International Aids Day ....................................................................... 1089
  Mandela, Nelson Foundation ............................................................ 5729
  Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women .............................................. 2437
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .................................................. 573
High Levels of Learners not Reaching Matric ................................................................. 6257
Huguenot Primary School Mitchells Plain, Opening of .................................................. 6378
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ................................................................. 6423
Racist Manager, Sacking of ......................................................................................... 4701
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ........................................................................................................... 4303
Statements .................................................................................................................. 99,534,776,899,1031,1102,1588,1640
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ................................................................. 4728
Against Women and Children .............................................................................. 4761
Conditions in places where poor people live ...................................................... 2532
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery ...................... 4625
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .................................. 5255
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ............................................. 666
Heritage Day .............................................................................................................. 815
Lack of development for young people .................................................................. 2272
SA Fisheries .............................................................................................................. 4024
Surprise visit by President Zuma ............................................................................. 2569
Swine Flu, Preparations for outbreak of ................................................................... 591
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 6 – Health .......................................................................................................... 1183
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 6 – Health .......................................................................................................... 280
Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................................................... 324
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................................................... 1788
Vote 5 – Education .................................................................................................... 1876
Vote 6 – Health .......................................................................................................... 1925
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 6 – Health .......................................................................................................... 3693
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ....................................................... 4914
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................. 4973
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13
- Cultural Affairs and Sport) ..................................................................................... 5510
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ....................................................... 6715

ZILLE, H [PREMIER with effect from 06/05/2009]
Birthday wishes to Ms C F Beerwinkel ................................................................. 1598
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
(Consideration and finalisation) .............................................................................. 4784, 4790
Speaker’s Debate:
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ............................................................... 2447
Women Redefining Leadership ............................................................................. 4085
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children .............................................................................. 4761
Subject for discussion:
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ................................................................................. 2180
Lack of development for young people ................................................................. 2274
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU</td>
<td>5923</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>against Implementation of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements made by Premier</td>
<td>639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –</td>
<td>2426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role of Provincial Government in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening Address of</td>
<td>22, 72, 1445, 1551</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive Statement</td>
<td>2393</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier’s Calling, Labelling People from Eastern Cape Refugees –</td>
<td>5300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier’s State of the Province Address</td>
<td>4997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)</td>
<td>5018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed)</td>
<td>5095</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of principle</td>
<td>1148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 1 – Premier</td>
<td>1358, 1368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 1 – Premier</td>
<td>211, 230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Reading</td>
<td>1660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 1 – Premier</td>
<td>1746, 1765</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 1 – Premier</td>
<td>3797, 3817</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier)</td>
<td>4797</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation)</td>
<td>4975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill 3 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier)</td>
<td>5339, 5344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Consideration and finalisation)</td>
<td>5783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier)</td>
<td>6727</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS—see p. 6742

†The SPEAKER: Order! Before we proceed with the business of the day, the House will be suspended for a few minutes to allow the photographer to take photos. Thank you very much.

BUSINESS SUSPENDED AT 10:06 AND RESUMED AT 10:14.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Let us start with the business of the day.

BUSINESS OF HOUSE

(Motion)

†The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That, notwithstanding the provision of Rule 18, the hours of sitting on Tuesday, 4 December 2012, shall be: 10:00 to adjournment.

Agreed to.
BUSINESS OF HOUSE

(Motion)

†The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That, notwithstanding Rule 161, the House deals with the finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill on Tuesday, 4 December 2012.

Agreed to.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury)

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, it is with great pleasure that I stand before you today to debate the 2012 Adjusted Estimates of Expenditure for Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury, and with great pride that I congratulate this department for achieving several noteworthy successes in the past financial year.

Chief amongst these is that in 2011-12, this department received a completely clean audit report card from the Auditor-General of South Africa. In line with its mandate, Provincial Treasury also gave guidance to its fellow departments, aiding three of them to achieve clean audits and nine of them to achieve unqualified audits with minor findings.

Mr Speaker, as well as being able to account fully for the money we’ve spent, we’ve also ensured that we’ve spent wisely and in the interests of residents of the Western Cape.

In 2011-12, the Provincial Treasury guided Western Cape departments to spend a cumulative 99,4% of the entire budget, a feat unmatched by any other provincial government.

Because we know that infrastructure inspires investment, which in turn creates growth and jobs, we ensured that 98,5% of our infrastructure budget was spent. This was once again an improvement on the previous financial year, in which we achieved infrastructure spend of 97,3%.

Mr Speaker, the above achievements are a testament to the strength of Provincial Treasury’s programmes. I would like to say well done to team Treasury.

In the 2012 Adjusted Estimates, this department was allocated an additional R10,676 million, raising its budget from R154,286 million to R164,962 million.

This year, Programme 1: Administration, received an additional R2,987 million which was shifted from Programmes 2 and 3 to secure the implementation and maintenance of a security system amounting to R500 000 within the department and to provide for resettlement costs amounting to R350 000 for new staff in the department. These funds will also be used for a second round of demand management goods amounting to R700 000 that could not be catered for in the Main Estimates.
Programme 2: Sustainable Resource Management receives an additional amount of R1,8 million which was shifted from Vote 10 – Department of Transport and Public Works to Provincial Treasury to co-fund three revenue enhancement and efficiency research projects affecting both departments. A further R2,411 million from increased own revenue surplus has been set aside for the Western Cape Racing and Gambling Board to be employed for exclusivity replacement financing of the Board.

Within Programme 3: Asset and Liabilities Management, provincial revenue funds amounting to R6,465 million were made available so that they may be utilised by Provincial Treasury for the monthly maintenance of the electronic purchasing system and to maintain other financial systems for all departments.

Programme 4: Financial Governance received an internal shift from Programme 3 of R239 000 to accommodate the training interventions relating to the minimum competency requirements for staff members that are responsible for providing support to municipalities.

In all four programmes, an additional R2,307 million will be used for 35 interns whose contracts have been extended.

Mr Speaker, these shifts, which will mainly serve to further enhance our systems, were made in support of our objective of becoming the best-run regional government in the world.

This is an innovative department that is constantly striving to provide a better service to the growing list of those it assists to achieve exemplary financial governance. I would like to thank each and every Treasury staff member for working hard to maintain the high standards that they have set for themselves and others. In the years ahead, I look forward to this department playing an integral role in leading South Africa towards becoming a place where service delivery meets the expectations of its people, where integrity receives due consideration and where corruption becomes a distant memory.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, the ACDP is in support of the adjustment appropriations for Provincial Treasury and we are particularly pleased about the intention with these adjustments to increase the visits to municipalities.

We believe that municipalities need a lot more support, and we welcome that, hoping that much of that attention is going to be paid, of course, with the Department of Local Government to Swellendam now that certain developments have taken place there. We hope that the ANC colleagues are going to stick to their public undertakings in that regard. Should that work, we would hope that the Swellendam Municipality is going to surge ahead in terms of its service delivery programme.

We also welcome the intention to conclude research on casinos. We have already congratulated Provincial Treasury on their clean audit.

†Ms T N BEVU: Mr Speaker, let me first thank the Minister for presenting his Adjustments Appropriation Bill and also the department for their hard work.

As Cope, we support the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill for the 2011-12 financial year, but we have concerns.
Minister Winde failed to mention in his speech that in the 45.1% unemployed youth in the province, almost 93% resides in the disadvantaged areas. They are not the previously disadvantaged, they are still disadvantaged. I want you to note that.

I know that the DA likes to pretend that this is due to the laziness of black people who, by the way, populate these disadvantaged areas and not the systemic cruel policies of the apartheid system. Always remember where we come from.

With this high unemployment rate and economic frustrations, this province, year after year, still spends the bulk of its budget in the city centre or in the affluent suburbs. If that is not at least promoting the apartheid status quo, then nothing is.

We understand that about R112 million is being earmarked for youth employment initiatives through various means. That includes the Development Bank of South Africa. If we may ask: Are there offices or branches for these initiatives – the Work and Skills Programme and the ICT and artisan programme in the disadvantaged areas? Can I find one in Mitchells Plain, Khayelitsha, Imizamo Yethu and Hangberg in Hout Bay? If not, is that creating an enabling environment for the economic growth of the poor in particular?

You do not have the potential for economic growth in these areas. You are missing by being caught up in the apartheid mentality.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, …[Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Carlisle and hon Ozinsky, order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle, order!

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, as the proverbial Big Brother of financial services for the province, Treasury has the important but difficult role of not only distributing but also monitoring that the important fiscal policies and principles are adhered to across all departments but also within their own ranks. This is to ensure that the Auditor-General’s visit ends in a report that is more green than red on graphs and presentations.

For themselves, they show an adjusted appropriation of R10,6 million. However, the matter of concern here and across most departments is the underspend on filling of posts. The adjusted amount is made up of …

†The SPEAKER: Order! Minister Carlisle, I didn’t allow you to read any newspaper. [Interjections.] Thank you very much. You may proceed, hon member.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The adjusted amount is made up of R8,8 million from the provincial reserve fund. Part of this increase relates to funds surrendered by the Gambling and Racing Board but which will be utilised by the same entity for exclusivity replacement funding. Another R1,8 million from Vote 10 makes up the adjusted amount. The other issue that will be monitored here is which casino will be recommended for closure, the loss of employment and the location of the new concessionaire.
Mr Speaker, we hope that serious rethinking went into the decision of where to utilise the total adjusted amount, because if spending was realised against projected targets, as set out in the APPs, shifts would not have been necessary. On the other hand, sometimes priority shift and realigning of the spend then becomes necessary.

In all of this, as Opposition, we are always mindful that the shifts are made in the best interests of the poor in this province, who still do not enjoy very basic items taken for granted by the greater part of this starkly divided province of haves and have-nots. For every 1% of the 5 million and more citizens in this province who don’t have, it relates to approximately 50 000 people who do without.

The adjusted funds are mostly used to cover goods and services in Programmes 1, 2 and 3 within the Vote to cover for a shortfall, amongst others, in the MEC’s travel compensation of employees, to cover for higher than expected improved conditions of service percentage, to improve financial services and to take on more interns.

The other adjustment was made for increase in visits to municipalities, and one hopes that targets set and assistance given will result in better outcomes, timeous submissions of financial statements and good and clean governance that adheres to predetermined objectives, as this is the area that the Auditor-General mostly raises concerns about.

Mr Speaker, it is imperative that these extra visits to municipalities result in better services to every citizen, and processes of communication with and inclusion of citizens in shaping their own future was part of the need to increase the funding for more frequent visits.

A matter of concern, though, is the slow spend on transfers and subsidies, which is recorded at only 6,6% for the period under review, but the assurance is given that the tranches due to external burses, the Gambling and Racing Board and Local Government will pick up in the latter part of the year and increase that expenditure.

Mr Speaker, I want to take this opportunity to thank the department for the assistance given at all times, but never to forget that my role is one of oversight and monitoring and, as such, I will always dig for extra answers. Also accept my congratulations on your movement up to a clean audit.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, the additional budget of approximately R10 million is welcomed.

In short, most of the available funds are being reprioritised for goods and services. It is heartening to see that funding is applied mainly for the increase in municipal visits, advertising available bursaries and funding of the available internship programmes.

An amount of R2,4 million has also become available to Treasury thanks to an increase in own revenue collected by the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board. The possible exclusivity levy on casino licences in the Metro is a decision that should not be taken lightly. Consequently, the additional funding made available for the important research concerning casinos is essential.
In the same breath, the R1.8 million from the Department of Transport and Public Works is welcomed with a view to investigating the valuable research projects concerning the improvement and efficiency of provincial own revenue.

Mr Speaker, the first step in becoming the best regional government in the world is to apply sound financial management. This also implies that municipalities should be supported to promote capacity in financial management. The Municipal Financial Stability Index (MFSI) investigated the financial statements of 102 municipalities for operational performance, debt and liquidity. The conclusion was that Stellenbosch was found to be the second best municipality and the City of Cape Town the best performing Metro. The City of Cape Town has also received unqualified audit opinions from the Auditor-General for the past eight years.

This is remarkable, bearing in mind that not a single municipality in Gauteng, North West, the Free State, the Northern Cape or the Eastern Cape received a clean audit opinion from the Auditor-General for the 2010-2011 financial year.

According to the South African Institute of Government Auditors (SAIGA), two of the Western Cape departments were in the top three slots and nine departments in the top 20 slots for financial reporting. Furthermore, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture was designated the overall winner and the Western Cape Department of Education was the department with the highest sustained score.

The Western Cape every year is proving itself to be the most competent government in South Africa in financial management, as witnessed by the audit opinions. This is measured against provinces such as the Eastern Cape, where there was not a single provincial department or public entity with a clean audit opinion.

Mr Speaker, the measures as prescribed and implemented by the Provincial Treasury are the backbone of the financial competence in the Western Cape.

For the successes mentioned, and also the positive shifts, I support the Adjustment Budget and I wish to thank the hon Minister Winde, together with his dedicated officials, for their hard work and commitment to achieve more with less. Thank you very much.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, I want to thank each and every one of you from the committee who has taken part in the debate today.

Just highlighting a couple of points that have been raised, the hon Haskin spoke about Swellendam and, in general, our municipalities. Obviously, that’s a role that this department takes very seriously. I, too, concur with you – I look forward to seeing some good strides in Swellendam now. Thank you very much for your support and for the role that you are playing in the standing committee.

Much of what the hon Bevu has said is actually going to be taken up in the next Budget Vote regarding the shifts in economic development. She spoke about how our budget is spent. However, I want to reiterate that you keep on telling me the same thing but you need to show me. I will say to you that 83% of our budget is spent directly on services and support for the poor. If you want to say something else, you need to show me how you see this not being so.
You spoke about ICT and the Work and Skills Programme. As I have said to you, in the next Vote is really where the money is spent, but not necessarily only in the adjustments process. It is also, obviously, in their baselines and in their main budget.

You are absolutely correct – the main objective is to create the enabling environment. We have to create that environment in every single department. Treasury’s role as well is to create an enabling environment so that we can make changes specifically to those in our province who are disadvantaged.

I want to say to the hon Beerwinkel that I prefer not to see Treasury as the Big Brother. Treasury also doesn’t want to be seen as the Big Brother. Specifically in the M-GROW and C-GROW process it is more to be seen as a partner and not as a Big Brother. That is how things will be achieved, not where you come down from the top and jump on top of people. You actually need to be co-creating the excellence, working together to improve, and that’s exactly the whole reason behind the change in specifically looking to better governance across this province and Treasury obviously playing a key and pivotal role.

You mentioned the filling of posts. Yes, I agree with you, we need to make sure we fill these posts. If you have a look over there, you will see a number of new faces that have appeared in the last while. I can assure you that we fill posts, but we will fill posts with the right people. I am sure you will agree with me that those people that you see in front of you are extremely competent and the right people that we’ve put in place.

You spoke about the casino – I think the chairperson also spoke about it – and the changes that are coming. We are busy in that process of legislative change. Regarding the moving of casinos, I can assure you that that is a process that we are working with. It’s not going to happen to the detriment of jobs. We are going to have to make sure that we do it properly and as it rolls out over the next year or two, we will make sure that everybody is brought along in that process.

You also spoke about travelling. I think the chairperson did as well. A key part of that is making sure that we are visiting all the municipalities. In visiting those municipalities, we should make sure that we are being seen as that partner to increase the governance and better outcomes.

I thank the Chair for his support. Thank you for the role that you play in pulling this team together. I also thank you for the oversight role of making sure we stay on the straight and narrow. I can assure you that from myself and from this team we will continue to strive to increase the outputs to make sure that we deliver better and better to the people of our province. I thank you for the support and I also thank the department again for what they do.

Debate concluded.
†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, I’m not sure if some of the officials of the department are going to be joining us as I deliver the short speech. However, I do notice that there are a large number of officials of the department sitting up at the top there. We are represented. I see some of the officials coming in now.

Mr Speaker, I am pleased today to table the Adjusted Estimates for Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism. Over the past year, the Department of Economic Development and Tourism (DEDAT) has become the key player in improving the lives of all the citizens of this province.

As the chief drivers of Strategic Objective 1, the staff members of this department are progressively, innovatively and steadfastly tackling the challenges of growing the economy and creating jobs for our people. We know that if we meet these goals, we can drastically reduce poverty in our province within one generation. We are focusing more resources and more energy on achieving them.

We recognise that as a government we will not succeed if we attempt our goals alone. Indeed, it is business rather than government that has the ability to grow the economy and create jobs. We believe that our role is to unlock opportunities for our people to become employed by facilitating an environment that attracts business to the Western Cape, attracts investment and helps Western Cape businesses and entrepreneurship grow and people to make use of this platform or the opportunities that we create. That is why we are continuing to commit a significant portion of our budget towards making it easier, quicker and cheaper to conduct business in our province.

Mr Speaker, in this department’s Budget Vote speech earlier this year, I announced that an amount of R291,117 million has been set aside for the 2012-13 financial year. At mid-year we are adding a net amount of R24,498 million. With this additional funding, we will bolster several key growth and job creation projects.

I’m very pleased to announce today that we have allocated an additional R7,5 million towards our Broadband Initiative. We know that every 10% increase in high-speed Internet connections in developing countries results in 1,3% increase in economic growth or GDP growth. We are ramping up our efforts to bring broadband access to every school, every provincial and municipal government facility in the Western Cape and, ultimately, to every citizen while driving down the costs of broadband access for business.

In order to strengthen our partnerships with business organisations and labour, we have allocated an additional R3,6 million to the Economic Development Partnership, a cross-sector body that we launched last year to drive, lead and coordinate economic growth in our region.

By saving in other areas, we have allocated an amount of R3,77 million to assist us in the delivery of a full suite of services to aspiring and young SMMEs through a partnership network of 20 support centres in communities across this province.
Mr Speaker, the department also receives R9,738 million from the Provincial Revenue Fund for the Western Cape Liquor Authority. This young entity is playing a vital role in regulating liquor outlets in the province, a fete we must achieve if we are to reduce the harms associated with alcohol abuse.

In the first half of this year, DEDAT shifted R125 000 to the Department of Transport and Public Works to conduct renovations to the department’s work space which arose as a result of flood damage.

As a consequence of the revision of DEDAT’s strategy, there have also been several shifts between programmes within this department. In the main, these shifts see funds move towards strategic initiatives that will grow the economy and create jobs.

Through Programme 2: Integrated Economic Development Services, an additional amount of R1 million was allocated to partnerships with the Development Bank of South Africa (DBSA). A total amount of R7,817 million was transferred from Programme 4: Trade and Sector Development to the Office of the Consumer Protector to account for the additional call centre fees and from a liquor regulation sub programme to support the new liquor authority. With Programme 5: Economic Planning, R526 000 was shifted from Monitoring and Evaluation to support the Livelink Project and a study on artisanship that will inform the Provincial Skills Forum Strategy.

Finally, an amount of R2 million was shifted from Programme 6: Tourism, Arts and Entertainment to Programme 7: Skills Development and Innovation towards the Works and Skills for 100 000 Project. To date, we have provided at work skills training opportunities for around 3 000 young people through this project, the majority of whom go on to attain full-time employment. In the years to come, this figure will grow substantially due to an allocation from the Jobs Fund that we have just received notification of to the value of a further R63 million.

Mr Speaker, through this department, we are building an economic environment that is not only conducive to economic growth but actively attracts it.

I would like to thank each and every staff member in this department for the hard work they put into developing and executing plans that will give the Western Cape residents the wherewithal to escape poverty and live lives they value.

As I said earlier today, we have the senior officials of this department sitting here. I want to thank them personally for the dedication that they give to all of the sectors in our economy to creating that environment for entrepreneurship. We see some of those numbers that are proving that people are able to, and want to, open small businesses, get involved in the economy at a far better and faster rate than we see in other parts of the country. I thank you very much for the dedication and time that you spend on making this environment what it is.

I see the rest of the team all sitting up there. To them as well, thank you very much. I know the late hours and the time you put in to making the difference for our economy. I really do appreciate it. Thank you very much. I know that you are all dressed fairly casually because this is not exactly how you want to spend the day when you want to celebrate your end of year, which you are going to do a bit later. I wish you well with those celebrations.
At the same time, I want to say to you – and I’m sure Minister Carlisle will agree – that wherever you do go when you do take a break, make sure you get there safely and that you also get back safely afterwards.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, the ACDP supports the adjustment appropriations for the Department of Economic Development and Tourism. I am particularly pleased about the filling of posts for the Red Tape Unit, noting that that is going to certainly drive some efficiencies and remove some of the red tape in future.

We are also pleased about the transfers to Cape Town Partnership with regard to the French Project. That is an area of Cape Town CBD that has great potential. On the east side to the mountain side of the Castle there is a lot of opportunity there and it can be harnessed through the efficient use of this R1 million and whatever else has been spent in this regard with a view of driving that sector.

We welcome the newly established Western Cape Liquor Authority. We all understand the destructive effects of alcohol on our communities, noting that much of our crime is caused through the consumption of alcohol and drugs. We want to certainly see the reduction of those harms on our community and the economy. All that is going towards the establishment and the posts being filled with regard to the liquor authorities are to be welcomed.

We have some concerns. One is with regard to the transfers to CTRU and Wesgro for the promotion of the film industry. An amount of R2 million is going towards that. If it’s not going to address the problems that are continuing to exist in the Cape Film Commission and the Cape Film Studios, then how do we promote a film industry in Cape Town that is so beset with problems continually and there is no end in sight? The R2 million, I believe, should be going towards establishing a credible film industry in Cape Town. You don’t establish a credible film industry in Cape Town without resolving the problems that are very much in the public eye and that are undermining the work of the Film Commission and the Film Studios. We are noticing that a lot of the adjustments are made available because of the delay in filling posts.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Please conclude, hon member.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: We notice that a lot of funds are available because there has been a delay in filling of posts. However, in the last financial year, the department breached Public Service Regulations in this regard. Let’s hope that that doesn’t happen again.

†Ms T N BEVU: Mr Speaker, in his 2012 Western Cape Provincial Economic Review and Outlook in September, and earlier on in March in his Provincial Treasury Budget Speech of 2012, Minister Winde said that the economic growth in the Western Cape is forecast to average 3,9% between 2012 and 2017.

As Cope, we told him that he was dreaming. We are glad that he has now at last acknowledged the reality that economic growth in the Western Cape has slowed down to 2,9% and predicted to accelerate to 3,6% in 2013. We think this prediction is still too optimistic, and so we would urge him to plan around 3% or less.

We agree with the Minister that an expansion of export production remains an important growth engine for the Western Cape economy.
We urge him to make good on his promise of expanding to Africa instead of the traditional European countries currently in economic crises.

Nigeria, for instance, is showing a healthy appetite for South African wines. What has the Western Cape government done to promote and encourage this? Make no mistake, the world is changing, and changing fast.

Ghana, at 13.5% growth, is one of the fastest growing economies in the world. Has the PGWC established relations with that country? Papua New Guinea is at 9%, Ethiopia at 7.5%, Equatorial Guinea at 7.1%, Rwanda at 7%, and Liberia and Nigeria at 6.9%. What has this government done to establish strong economic ties with these countries?

The Minister says that while the Western Cape’s dominant export markets remain the EU and SADC, we are penetrating non-traditional markets such as the Commonwealth of Independent States, other Asia, the ASEAN bloc and BRIC economies on an increasing scale. This is all well and good, but why start that far when there are readily available opportunities close by?

The launch of the …

†The SPEAKER: Order! Please finish your sentence, hon member.

†Ms T N BEVU: The launch of the EDP was hailed as a major development in 2012. I wish that we had more time to speak on this issue but, never mind, we support the Adjustment Budget.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, Vote 12 should be the bread-basket of opportunities for economic empowerment and the changing of people’s lives for the better.

This Vote shows an adjusted amount of R24.4 million across the departments, with the biggest adjustment in Programmes 3: Trade and Sector Development and Programme 4: Business Regulation and Governance, respectively.

A large tranche was shifted to Vote 10 to accommodate the Liquor Authority refurbishment and existing accommodation, also a portion for establishing the Liquor Authority as an independent entity to report to this department.

However, Mr Speaker, the spending trends in this department compared to the same period in the previous year show a marked decline across all programmes. One big event that occurred in this period was the incorporation of CTRU into Wesgro on the pretext that it should curtail the duplication of services. Wesgro is now portrayed as the panacea for all economic initiatives, be it trade, investment, tourism or the film industry, and R2 million was allocated to them for the promotion of the film industry in this province. I won’t read my paragraph in that regard. I think the hon Haskin has adequately covered the concerns regarding that specific issue. This is a space that will especially be carefully monitored, because the legislation to deal with this move of CTRU into Wesgro has not yet been finalised.

Another big event last year was the launch of the EDP, and this year they received R3.6 million from the adjusted amount to be able to function more effectively.
While the core function of the EDP sounds and looks right, the proof and the success of the transfer of economic development growth lessons will be seen later in the diversity of its members and growth opportunities they can initiate.

Of the R7,5 million allocated to the roll-out of the Broadband Initiative, one hopes that this will be taken into the areas of most need to open the doors of opportunity to the less privileged as well.

Mr Speaker, what must be mentioned here, as in other departments, is the non-filling of posts, which again resulted in funds having to be reallocated to other programmes. What also needs to be monitored as well is the Auditor-General’s instruction on how the GG usage should be dealt with under another programme of financial lease, making it an asset. This department, however, has shown the initiative in centralising this under Programme 1 for financial management.

A new initiative is the transfer of R1 million to the Development Bank of South Africa to assist with cooperatives and competitiveness in enterprise development. It will be interesting to see the practical roll-out and implementation, who will be taken on board in these cooperatives, what kind of enterprise development initiatives they come with and how it benefits those that need it most.

As this is also the department which should be doing so much more to communicate their message of economic growth and assistance, a very small amount of R215 000 and R150 000 was given to raise SMME awareness and informal sector study, respectively. Other transfers were made to the intake of interns, gratuity payments, extra fleet vehicles and furniture. An amount of R2,1 million was also allocated to fund posts in the Broadband project office.

Mr Speaker, I want to read a part of the aims of Vote 12 and specifically the second part that says: What this Vote is supposed to do is to act as a catalyst for the transformation of the economy and respond to the challenges and opportunities of the economic citizens in order to support the government’s goal of creation of opportunities for businesses and citizens to grow the economy and employment. Taking that part into account, I do not believe that this department is really living up to what it purports to want to do yet.

While one acknowledges that this department is trying to do much, the stark divide between the rich and poor in this province still remains too wide.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, the Medium Term Policy Framework rightly observes that in spite of the sustained successes of the DA government in the Western Cape, there are still critical challenges. Among those are inequalities, poverty and unemployment, but these are challenges this government is tackling in all earnestness.

The objective of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism is to react to the economic challenges and opportunities and to serve as a catalyst for economic transformation. The additional budget of about R24,5 million is welcomed.

Job creation is important in addressing unemployment. The amount of about R2 million that has been made available additionally for the Work and Skills programme will result in further successes.
Success for the programme itself, but also for the individuals who are granted the opportunity to enter the economy and help build a better future for themselves. Similarly, the additional R480 000 allocated for trade studies will help with informing the Provincial Skills Forum Strategy about skill shortages.

Mr Speaker, to curb unemployment, sustained economic growth is required. The Western Cape is endeavouring to create an empowering environment where businesses can flourish. Reducing red tape is an important contributing factor to achieving this goal. The success of the red tape programme, in particular the success of the red tape call centre, is an example of the commitment of the DA government to support businesses.

Small and medium traders are constantly under pressure in South Africa. A recent report indicates that only 12% of businesses that existed in 1994 are still doing business. Small businesses and entrepreneurship are of cardinal importance to help grow our economy and to create jobs. The Partnership Network initiated by the department offers a wide variety of services that are readily available to business owners.

The additional funding made available in the Adjustment Budget for raising awareness of the SMME database, as well as for the study on the informal sector, will contribute to supporting the small business sector.

Mr Speaker, government recently came under fire because of funding complaints by the Cape Film Commission. The additional R2 million being made available to the Western Cape Destination, Marketing, Investment and Trade Promotion Agency (Wesgro) – and not to the Cape Film Commission – for the promotion of the film industry in the Western Cape, is welcomed.

Other important partnerships encouraging economic development are the Economic Development Partnership, the Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone that potentially can create 25 000 jobs, the Broadband Strategy and Green Cape. I also support the additional R11 million allocated to the Broadband Initiative Project and the EDP by the Provincial Revenue Fund.

Mr Speaker, the important role of the Western Cape Liquor Authority is of cardinal importance to curb alcohol abuse in the province. My best wishes to Mr ThysGiliomee, Chief Executive Officer of the Entity, with the challenging task. I support the additional R6.7 million allocated to you.

Minister Winde, together with Wesgro, yesterday launched the summer campaign for tourism: “Adventurously Yours, Naturally Ours”. This campaign is aimed at marketing the Western Cape’s natural beauty, adventure activities and sights and at the same time encouraging people to explore the various possibilities in the Western Cape. With the summer holiday just around the corner, I wish the campaign all of the best and I am calling on every member of the House to assist in marketing tourism in the Western Cape.

Mr Speaker, for all the above reasons I support the Adjustment Budget and I want to thank the hon Minister and his department for their continued and hard work.
†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, I thank all those who have taken part in this debate. I will answer a couple of the questions, as raised.

First of all, thank you to the speakers who support this Adjustment. Obviously, the debate goes a bit wider than just the Adjustment, because it also talks to specifically some of the sectors or some of the key areas that the department is involved in and interventions that need to take place to stimulate or facilitate or to grow the economy at the end of the day.

Many speakers spoke about red tape. I, too, must say that every politician around the world, and I think every government around the world, talks about red tape. The innovation that is coming out of the red tape team really does excite me. I think that we are going to see more and more exciting things coming out of this process, as we are already starting to see. Whether it be the interesting thing that is happening now in the Department of Transport and Public Works – the one-stop shop – there are so many of these things. I think of the benchmarking different municipalities and how they start competing with each other on turnaround times. So many of these interventions are going to become more and more things that this government is going to be able to brag about, because it all leads to better efficiency, leading to a better place to do business.

There has been much speak about the Liquor Authority. We have all been part of the legislative change and we all agree that we need to tackle specifically liquor abuse in our province and the massive cost that it has to our families, our citizens, our budget, our purse and to so many lives. Specifically now going into the festive season, we need to make sure that liquor abuse is curtailed as far as possible, because it causes so much damage. What I must say is that this is a process as well with the Liquor Authority. They are busy setting themselves up. It's not as if you just switch a switch and the thing happens and it's starting to do what it needs to do; it's a process appointing people. It's about getting the new team together. We will obviously keep pushing that so that we start getting the authority into the space so that it can really deliver efficiently.

A lot has also been said about the film industry, and not necessarily just the money and where it's going to. It is obviously going to marketing. We need to go and sell this place as a great place, as a cost-effective place, as an efficient place to come and use this area, use the people of this area and use the industries in this region to make films, advertisements and so on. Obviously, what have been seen in the public domain are spats between different role-players in the film industry. I, too, use this opportunity to say: Please, guys, as an industry you need to sort yourselves out. You need to come together. It's not government's job to sort you out, but we have called a meeting – it will take place on 5 December – to say: Role-players come together. Let's talk about. What is government's role? What is your role? Is there any way that we can help if you guys are not happy with each other?

We will obviously invest into this industry. It's a key industry. It creates lots of jobs in this area, and we need to make sure that it continues to create jobs in this region and grows in this region. We obviously need to spend that money wisely on marketing this region.
I want to say to the hon Bevu that we must perhaps consult her rather than the Bureau of Economic Research on advising us on what our growth numbers are but, as you know and as we all know, this is something that’s very fluid and it’s dependent on so many things. I think specifically at the moment that what is happening in our country is putting huge pressure on our ability to sell our country as a place to invest and to sell our products to the market. Investors and buyers are sceptical and we need to make sure that we consolidate this, because it’s about this growth in our economy that’s going to change the poverty levels that you speak about.

You speak about Africa, and I absolutely agree with you, it has been a focus for the last few years. It’s about the numbers and the delivery at the end of the day. If you looked at the amount of trade out of this region going into Africa three odd years ago, you would have seen that it was negligible. It is now one container, and every four goes into Africa. It is a big focus. You will notice that I have been to many of these trading countries around South Africa. You will also know that Wesgro hosts from Presidents of Mozambique to trade missions into Angola and Ghana. That team is very proactive about using specifically the growth in Africa as an engine and a driver to increase our trade.

The hon Beerwinkel spoke about a few things. I think I have already mentioned one or two of them. You spoke about the EDP and Broadband. You were talking about the informal sector study. I think that really goes to the nub of what we are trying to achieve, where we ask: Where do we as a government intervene? We have an informal sector, which is a very vibrant sector, but do we know enough about it?

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Give them more.

†The MINISTER: Well, the question is: How do you give them more if you don’t know enough about it? We have to make sure that we understand that informal sector. Then you allow that informal sector to decide whether they want to employ someone, whether they want to grow and how do you do that. Obviously, the informal sector is below the radar, that is why it is the informal sector, and that’s why we need to make sure that we understand it so that we can use it as a lever to get specifically those entrepreneurs into the main economy.

What I must also say, specifically when you talk about Wesgro and marketing, is that if you have a look at our percentage investment to our GDP in South Africa and in the region at the moment, you will see that we are way too low. We have to lift that investment if we want to grow the economy. There’s a great deal of debate – and it normally comes from the hon Bevu – about the fact that we don’t need to grow; we just need to create more jobs. It’s not possible. We have to get more growth to allow us to create more jobs.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I never heard her say that.

†The MINISTER: I see the hon Brown doesn’t understand that.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: No, no, I never heard hon member Bevu saying that we must create jobs … [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon member!
†The MINISTER: No, she has. I will draw the Hansard for you, if you would really like. [Interjections.]

Then I would like to say to the chairperson: Thank you very much for the role that you play. You mentioned all of our sectors. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: They are obviously key – from local economic development to red tape, to the Green Economy, to the IDZ, to the Broadband Initiative, to BPO, you name them. They are all key components of what this department does every single day to try to change that platform in which we create jobs and allow growth in our region, and we change that unemployment rate which is a very key driver and obviously a measurement that we are going to be measured against over time. It’s one of those tough ones that you put out there, and we have to make sure that we drive and do what we do.

In conclusion, you spoke quite a lot about the tourism sector. Specifically now at the start of the season I said to everybody to drive safely and to get safely home, but it is also about the message out there. We all know that this weekend is the big move, specifically in this region, of all our young people who have just finished writing Matric. They are all kind of heading up the coast to Plettenberg Bay and various other places around our province. Let’s make sure that we all look after them, because many of our children who are going out there need to make sure that this is their first step into the big wide world and that they are responsible. However, we also have a role to play, whoever we are and wherever we are – citizens in this province – to look after them. We should also look after the tourists who are going to be coming here to our region from other parts of South Africa and other parts of the world. Let’s look after them and give them good value. Let’s give them a great experience so that they keep on coming back and keep on growing our economy.

With that, I would like to thank all of those who have taken part in this debate. I thank them for the support of this adjustment.

Debate concluded.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government)

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, our role in Local Government is to support and to monitor.

In everything we do, we focus on keeping our municipalities on the right road. This isn’t always easy. It has been a long year, a difficult year. To some extent we have achieved major successes, for which I am truly grateful.

My main concern in this Adjustment Budget is the cut in our budget for fire brigade services. This is something we will have to discuss at a later stage. I am deeply worried about this. We cannot simply overlook it.
I hope we will get more money for our Disaster Management Centre next time. The quality of equipment and access to information we have there will play a major role in serving our residents and ensuring their safety in the future.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, the ACDP is in support of this Adjustment.

Let me use this opportunity to thank the Minister and the department for the support that has been offered in the Swellendam Municipality. I'm sure that that support is going to continue. We particularly welcome the prioritisation of all the adjustments that are made here with regard to the prioritisation of IDP and the budgeting process.

However, the concern that I have is that the department should leave it to the municipalities to finalise their own IDPs. It must remain a bottom-up process. It cannot become a bottom-down process, because the municipalities feel that that they need ... [Interjections.] It cannot be a top-down process – thank you – because the municipalities feel that because the department is present they need to do whatever the department says. Let's keep the IDP and the budgeting process a bottom-up process that is informed by the needs of the communities that are expressed through the councillors and ward forums to the municipalities, even though it's coordinated at a provincial level by the department's work. [Interjections.] Thank you very much for the assistance that the department gives the municipalities in finalising their IDPs.

†Ms T N BEVU: Mr Speaker, we support the Adjustment Budget.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, we see an increase in R5,8 million, with R3,7 million being shifted from Human Settlements for administrative services in the department.

The ANC expresses the hope that this split between the two departments will be finalised when we get to March 2013. It has been coming on for three years and I think it is hampering service delivery.

Mr Speaker, the vacancy rate is 10%, which is still high, specifically where critical financial posts must still be filled. That must be seriously addressed.

In March this year in the Main Budget, the MEC and the department made the commitment that in the 2012-13 financial year they will intensify and increase the capacity of their Municipal Infrastructure Unit to support and help build municipal infrastructure. They made and gave this commitment that they will assist municipalities to develop and implement programmes to upgrade and finance municipal infrastructure.

However, the 2012-13 municipal infrastructure spending for the first four months of this financial year for the municipalities is only 15%, and they are facing massive underspending and service delivery backlog increases. We see in this adjusted budget that the amount of R525 000 and R2,5 million are being moved away from the Municipal Infrastructure Programme. In the first four months, the Langeberg Municipality, for example, only spent 8,7%, the Overberg District Municipality 0,25% and the Laingsburg Municipality 1,76% on their capital expenditure. This is really reason for concern, but while this is happening we see the cut of R3 million by the department. By doing this, they are really failing municipalities and contributing to service delivery failures.
Mr Speaker, the CDW Programme was designed to address the institutional gaps in service delivery and investment programmes of government, with the specific focus on poor and vulnerable communities. Although the City of Cape Town signed an intergovernmental implementation protocol in respect of the CDW Programme last year, it was stopped by the City of Cape Town this year. There was no agreement, no funding and no CDWs in the City of Cape Town. The communities in the city suffer because of this. We see this directly being inflicted in terms of the non-functioning of ward committees and the lack of proper communication to the communities and we see this with regard to service delivery.

Mr Speaker, I’m also very concerned about Swellendam. After many years, there is still no CDW in Swellendam. This is, of course, something that can very easily be implemented. Even if it cannot happen on a governmental level, I think the DA can just give their DA municipality instruction to appoint CDWs in that area. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members!

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, the Thusong Service Centres must help to extend access to integrated services. In the Main Budget, R4,37 million was not allocated. We got a commitment from the MEC and the department that it will be allocated as part of the adjustment process. We are in that process now, but see that only R2,3 million was allocated. Apart from the R1,9 million not allocated, the funding to Witzenberg, Cederberg, Swellendam and Breede Valley was stopped. This is a major concern. This means that no proper services will be delivered by these facilities.

As part of our oversight responsibility to some of the municipalities that we visited, we could see the crisis in the Breede Valley Municipality, especially at the Thusong Centre. With the stopping of the operational funding going there, we will see this crisis deepening within the Breede Valley area.

I must say that the Swellendam Thusong Centre was functioning extremely well, but with the cut in funding – and the funding is R218 000 per annum – the Thusong Centre will become degraded and not render the services to the community that they are supposed to.

Looking at the Thusong Service Centres and the capital budget, there was an allocation of R2 million to the Cederberg Municipality. Consequently, that was taken away from Cederberg and given to the Berg River Municipality. That was taken away in this financial year and shifted to Kannaland. There must be something wrong that at least two municipalities could not use the infrastructure there. The department must seriously look at their own criteria, their own planning and the support they give municipalities in putting Thusong Service Centres in place.

Mr Speaker, I do welcome the allocation of funding to strengthen and prove the quality of IDPs, positively impacting service delivery and service a pilot project …

†The SPEAKER: Order! Please finish your sentence, hon member.

†Mr P UYS: … for municipalities to learn from. The Central Karoo and Cederberg are indeed municipalities that can benefit from this allocation.
*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, all of us sitting in this House are dependent upon receiving services. These services are delivered to us by Local Government. Local Government plays a cardinal role in delivering basic primary services to the residents of the country. It is very important to support Local Government and to support it very strongly.

I agree with the hon Haskin that the IDP is a very important process, but the Auditor-General has pointed out that some of these IDPs are not credible. Local Government therefore has to play a very strong role in ensuring that these integrated development plans are compiled very well so as to enable service delivery accordingly.

There is much pressure on this department. It is a small department. It has a small staff and a small budget. It is sad to see that the department’s funds have been cut a little. One would rather like to see the department getting some more money, as has been indicated by the speakers. It is very important that the pressure being exerted on the department this time of the year with the increase in “disasters” taking place can be managed and tackled.

Especially with the unrest now taking place in rural areas, there is much more pressure on this department. In fact, it would be good if the Department of Finance or Treasury could consider channelling some more money back to this department. I don’t know if this is possible. We have calculated that approximately R4 million would be required to deal with this increased pressure and costs with regard to the unrest in the rural areas.

I want to congratulate the Minister and his department. They are doing a good job. One can find shortcomings if you look for them, but I do not think that is what it is about here. The important thing is to see that municipalities get the support they need.

I also want to thank my standing committee for the very good work they are doing, specifically the hon Uys, for making a very good input in our standing committee. He is a man with knowledge and experience. I also thank the other members of the standing committee.

I ask the House to support this adjusted budget. If we could get just a little bit more money from hon Minister Winde it would be of great use to get through the last part of the year.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, thank you to the members. With their permission, I am not going to reply to every member individually.

Of course, the IDP is a cardinal programme and we definitively have to manage it from the ground up. This is exactly what we are doing. I think we are doing it differently from other provinces. A good IDP in fact means nothing to the community if it is not implemented. If it does not feature in the budget and is not followed by a service delivery and budget implementation plan, everything is in fact a futile exercise.
We realised very quickly that it is no use to come and stand here in the House and say we have 28 or 29 credible IDPs, because at grassroots level they mean nothing. This means that the IDP process starts with a draft IDP we receive from the local authorities. This is the point of departure. What we have done very successfully is to get every provincial department to comment on the IDP. This year, we have received the type of feedback for the first time where municipalities tell us: at least you are now reading our IDPs.

However, I can tell you that about 240 officials of the province were involved in the evaluation of the IDPs, when we went back to the municipalities. I think it was about 46 officials, if my memory serves me right, from national and 128 from local government. We also pointed out a couple of municipalities that did not take part in the process and did not send officials. We did some naming and shaming. There are a few big municipalities that did not send their officials, and then it is a void in the process. If something does not figure in the IDP, it cannot figure in a budget.

The Thusong project is a brilliant one. We are doing very well there. The whole idea is for the Thusong Centre to function on its own. We are the only province, I think, that is doing this. The R218 000 is also going to disappear from other Thusong centres as they start functioning on their own, but we are not pulling away. Up to 10 government departments have signed contracts and are currently tenants at that Thusong Centre. The whole idea is to take government to the people at a centralised spot so they do not pay transport costs and are not sent from pillar to post. They can go from one room to another and be attended to.

Spending is a concern, but we also have to be honest with one another that spending has several phases. It is true that maybe 8% of municipalities are in arrears, but in certain stages big cheques or payments are received and they will catch up and we are monitoring the situation.

We are very successful with our MIG programme. We have shown that we can indeed spend money. We are supporting the municipalities to do so. Over the past three years we have succeeded at more than 99%.

I want to use this opportunity to thank the standing committee and the Opposition. In a democracy an opposition plays a cardinal role and for this reason I have been very open and I will always produce all possible documents I think the Opposition need in order to do their job as Opposition.

I thank my colleagues, the chairperson of the standing committee and the rest. The role you are playing is of cardinal importance to keep me and my department on our toes, and we see it in this light. We see it as positive criticism, since at the end of the day our focus is on the poor people and to take services to the people, especially those people who do not have services. You are a very good team and we thank you for this.

I thank my staff for their hard work and sacrifices during the year. I highly appreciate it and I think the people of the Western Cape also appreciate it.

We have 22 municipalities that I think are doing very well at this stage. The remaining eight are a challenge, but it is a good challenge. We will get them too at a level where we are satisfied with the services they render to the public.

Debate concluded.
WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning)

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the opportunity. Environmental Affairs is a very interesting portfolio where we have to maintain the correct balance between economic growth and the protection of our environment. It is a portfolio with huge challenges and much emotion and we are very proud of the successes we have achieved there over the past couple of years.

It is a privilege to table this Adjustment Budget. Thank you.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports the Adjustments Appropriation. Thank you.

†Ms T N BEVU: Mr Deputy Speaker, we support the Adjustments Appropriation Bill. Thank you.

†Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is one of the only departments whose budget was decreased over this adjustment period. There have been decreases in all programmes, except Programme 3: Compliance and enforcement and Environmental Empowerment Services.

There is a disappointing trend, however, on the underspending and filling of posts, resulting in funds becoming available to spend elsewhere. This has been coming for a long time. The department needs to work on this to ensure that we don’t get a similar trend next year.

Another point I would like to raise with the department is that it needs to have a clear plan regarding the DCAs and the farmers to ensure that even though they are catering for the farmers’ interest, they should also ensure that their animals are protected.

Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

†Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, first of all the standing committee was privileged to be involved with a department which was judged in second place in the South African Institute of Government Auditors Assessment of financial management and reporting. It’s really something the department must be proud of.

There is a concern regarding capacity. This department plays a very important role in ensuring sustainability within the province, and there is a shortfall in critical staff and I am sure that that will have priority treatment from the Minister.

The issues regarding sustainability revolve around many issues, but one of the important ones are the spatial development plans which must guide sustainable development, and the department’s monitoring of pollution in various situations in rivers and with regard to air quality.

With regard to the sea level rise as a result of climate change, the department has been very involved in set-back lines along the coast and these are very important as well.
Another very important aspect for the Western Cape is that the department has an entity called Cape Nature which takes the larger part of the budget of the department. Cape Nature is responsible for the wonderful biodiversity we have in the province. There are concerns though. They have 112 properties which they look after and they are also dependent on generating income from public-private partnerships which they have. One of the things we must recognise is that the development in the Kogelberg Biosphere – the Kogelberg Nature Reserve – has received an award for its ecologically compatible design properties.

Something which really raised the concern of the standing committee was the fact that due to budgetary constraints, the condition of roads in our nature reserves is poor. At some stage there has to be some budgetary allowance made to bring those roads up into better condition. We must recognise the fact that biodiversity in our nature reserves should receive major emphasis in any tourism developments in the Western Cape. That is a concern that was generally felt by members of the standing committee.

We recommend that this Adjustments Budget be accepted and we are satisfied that the department is doing its best, and will continue to do so.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, the department has done very well and I want to congratulate them. There have been shortcomings, there is always a need for more funds, but – if I may support my colleague, the Minister of Finance – there are checks and balances and tough decisions are taken in any budget year. At the end of the day it boils down to a list of priorities and we have to prioritise.

There will always be shortcomings and one will always have to prioritise. It is always a difficult process and we will always work to do as much as possible to conserve our environment and to look at sustainability principles.

All that remains for me is to thank my department led by the Head of Department, Mr Piet van Zyl, and our financial team. They have done exceedingly well in getting financial management to where we received the award. This was thanks to a very competent team and we appreciate the hard work they have been doing as well as the long hours.

I also want to thank the standing committee for their inputs and for keeping us on our toes. It has been a privilege to work with you this year as well. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Debate concluded.

**WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]**

(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety)

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity to address you.
While our budgets are allocated on an annual basis, it is important to reassess the needs of the department as the year progresses to address any shortfalls, or important matters that may arise, during the course of the year but were not budgeted for.

The purpose of the budget allocated to my department is in order for us to achieve our objectives of increasing safety for all the people in the Western Cape by: improving the performance of the policing through effective oversight; enhancing active citizenship in the field of community safety; promoting road safety; and optimising safety and security risk management.

I am happy to say that the Western Cape Department of Community Safety has done well to utilise its budget effectively up to this point in the year with only minor adjustments needed, where necessary.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we have held more safety summits than in any other year, with summits being held on the West Coast, Nyanga, Oudtshoorn, Mossel Bay and also Khayelitsha. These summits are structured to provide the community with an opportunity to interact with various state security and justice departments to raise their concerns and propose solutions that can be adopted as part of our approach to improving safety.

In addition to these summits I have visited numerous police stations as part of my oversight role and dozens of communities around the Western Cape. The aim of these meetings is to take government to the people, to hear their concerns and to return better equipped to address them.

We have also the Community Safety Bill, a pioneering piece of legislation, and launched a much-needed commission of inquiry into the policing in Khayelitsha with the purpose of improving the relationship between the community and police, to ensure a more effective police service.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we also produced a shadow crime report for the first time and plan on releasing one every six months going forward. This is another report that is the first of its kind in South Africa and will, no doubt, assist in equipping the police and the public with vital safety information.

In terms of our budget the department’s original budget estimate for 2012-13 was R358 414 000. This amount was adjusted to R364 626 000. This adjustment represents a nominal increase of 1,73%, or R6 212 000.

This increase has been allocated for the Commission of Inquiry into Policing in Khayelitsha. In addition to this, the department also contributed an amount of R375 000 to Vote 1: Department of the Premier for a specific project relating to behaviour change.

There have also been a number of minor adjustments within the department, which I would like to highly very briefly. The main adjustment is our Programme 5: Security Risk Management. The budget for this programme was originally R56 425 000, and this was increased to R63 878 000. The funding of R7,5 million was reprioritised for the security diagnostic project to maximise the safety contribution of the Western Cape Government’s institutions, assets and people.
It must be noted that the department received clean audit outcomes for two consecutive years, thanks to the professional and efficient work of our staff. For the first six months of the financial year this programme spent 45% of its budget, and this compares favourably with the same period for the 2010-11 financial year.

I am pleased to say that traffic management has made full use of their budget, not to say that they have spent it all just yet, and we are well on our way to achieving the target of halving the death rate on the Western Cape roads by 2014. For the first six months of the financial year this programme spent 44.95% of its budget. Again, this compares favourably with the same period the 2010-11 financial year, where it stood at 44.10%.

To ensure we remain focused and equipped to achieve our goal, additional traffic staff, vehicles and staff will be appointed to the value of R1 660 000.

Mr Deputy Speaker, tools of the trade such as radio equipment and speeding equipment will also be purchased, and this amounts to R1,473 000. A total of 32 vacant posts will be filled in traffic law enforcement by the end of this financial year.

An HON MEMBER: That’s enough now.

The MINISTER: Security risk management … [Interjections.] I am nearly done. Just give me one minute, I am nearly there; my apologies, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Security risk management received funding of R7,453 000 during the adjustment process. The bulk of the funding is for the security diagnostic project. For the first six months of the financial year this programme spent 46.55% of its budget, and is on track to receive its targeted budget spent by the end of the financial year.

This department’s own revenue budget will remain the same, at R2,783 million, and thus far at 30 September 2012 revenue of R1,73 million, or 64.08%, was allocated.

Mr Deputy Speaker, to cut it short, I think I’ve said the basics. [Laughter.] Let me say, finally, at the request of my colleagues … [Interjections.] There are another two pages, but I am not going to do that. I would rather like, after I’ve dealt with the financial issues of the budget, to thank the HOD and staff, the directors as well as everyone in the department for an excellent job done so far and ask them to continue working in such a professional and very efficient manner.

Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and hon members.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP rises in support of the Adjustments Appropriation. We are particularly pleased about the allocation of R6.5 million to the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry, noting that the interdict argument will be heard on 13 December this year. We believe that this is an important commission and that it must be able to conclude, it must be able to start and conclude its work in the best interests of identifying the problems …

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: This matter is before the High Court.
†Mr G C R HASKIN: This matter is in the budget.

†Mr M OZINSKY: No, it is before the High Court. It’s not parliamentary to comment on matters that are before the High Court.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I’ve heard your point. Mr Haskin, are you almost finished now? Try and refrain from doing that. *Sub judice* is always in the discretion of the Chair, and I am ruling that he can briefly refer to that, but please conclude then.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Chair, the important thing to note is that there were 78 vigilante murders in Khayelitsha in 14 months. If that doesn’t speak to the importance of the need for this commission, then what does?

The ACDP supports this Adjustments Appropriation.

†Ms T N BEVU: Mr Deputy Speaker, we congratulate the department on its efforts that resulted in a clean audit. However, this now needs to move beyond administration into actual results of community safety.

Our communities, especially in the townships, don’t feel safe at all. The need for working with neighbourhood watches has been highlighted several times and we feel somehow that the current model designed to fit all, does not work. Even neighbourhood watches have different needs and require different training, and different models need to be found for different communities.

We therefore support the Adjustments budget. Thank you.

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think this has definitely been the longest Appropriation speech for a Bill like this that I’ve ever heard in the House. Thank you for allowing me to go out on a record-breaking speech like that – especially as it is on a Friday!

I want to say that this is definitely my last speech on community safety. [Interjections.] It is nice ... [Interjections.] I must say, Deputy Speaker, that I thoroughly enjoyed working with the department. I did not write the Minister’s speech – and I am glad I did not.

I remember when I first came into parliament we were not allowed to have speeches in front of us and we were only allowed to look at notes. I want to say thank you to the department. I want to say thank you to every single one, and I want to thank you for the direction that it’s taking. It is not an easy job as an MEC. I know a lot about this job. It could be about the smallest budget, but I think it’s got the most responsibility, especially in marketing. You will always be attacked from all sides, but continue to do your best because all of us want a safe community; all of us want to see crime going down; and all of us want to see our people getting a better quality of life, especially with regard to crime that is taking place outside there.

As far as that is concerned, we will all support you in that. Your fight is to get crime down, and we believe that you can do that with the support of everyone. Thank you very much. [Applause.]
†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I just want to say that the vast majority of this particular Adjustments Appropriation is going towards the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry. This week we had the tabling of the Western Cape Community Safety Bill in front of the standing committee. The community approached the Premier in a legitimate way to call for this commission of inquiry. If the community's attitude and the opposition that has been shown to this legitimate act is any indication, then the Western Cape Community Safety Bill's going to have an interesting path.

Mr Deputy Speaker, but be that as it may, I also want to add my congratulations to the department on once again obtaining a clean audit. The outstanding results in the reduction in traffic deaths are critically important.

In conclusion I want to take a bit of time to thank and wish well the hon former Member of Parliament for Bonteheuwel. He and I have come many years down the road. We served on the other side of the Gardens in the same caucus for some years, so he has been in parliament for a long time. But the difference between he and I is, firstly, he is the most unlikely Scotman you will ever come across! [Laughter.] But be that as it may he has another attribute that I certainly don't have: Like his tie, he is an evergreen personality. What his secret of longevity is to have such youthful features, the Lord alone knows, but maybe the Lord helped a lot there! [Laughter.] On behalf of the standing committee I'd like to thank hon member McKenzie for his contribution. Although he and I had some rocky discussions in the past, he did have a thorough knowledge of policing and the Department of Community Safety and he made a very position contribution in that regard.

I'd like to wish him and his wife well for the future. I am not quite sure what they are going to be doing; maybe he is going to become an ambassador in Gazania, or some place like that, but we wish him well and we thank him for his contribution and service to the country. Thank you.

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I note the input of hon member Bevu. We have said it all the time, we would welcome other ideas and input. We are not saying that the manner in which we are doing things is the only ultimate, correct way. Regarding your issue about neighbourhood watches, I have made a note of it and I will engage with you on that level to see how best you can assist us. As hon McKenzie has said, jointly we can bring crime down.

*Mr Deputy Speaker, I am going to say the following in Afrikaans because I will express myself much better. I want to take the same lead as my colleague Wiley with regard to colleague McKenzie. We have known each other for years. No matter on what side of the fence one is sitting, when a person is going away or is retiring there is always some nostalgia, even if it is on the side of the opposition, for whatever reason.

I want to tell him I have always noted his inputs, even though his inputs at times have been rather robust; I want to say to you that we appreciate it. Whatever you are going to do, we will be thinking of you. Enjoy your rounds of golf on the golf course. At the end of the day I know you are not someone who can be idle.
The Deputy Speaker should not take offence at what I am going to say now. I remember Patrick McKenzie as someone with ants in his pants; he will always find something to keep himself occupied.

An HON MEMBER: He has already found it.

The MINISTER: He has already found it. Thank you very much, and best wishes to you.

Debate concluded.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements)

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to appeal to members and say that this perhaps will be one of the longest Adjustments Budget speeches!

Once again the Department of Human Settlements received an unqualified audit, with some matters, because it is a very complicated department. Maybe one of the biggest achievements for the department was taking the fund from the disclaimer to an unqualified audit. I am very proud of the team that did this sterling work and they will be receiving the report from the Auditor-General this afternoon.

One of the achievements for the department is that it received the award for the best department in the country for administering the Promotion of Access to Information Act by the South African Human Rights Commission. We are, as a department, very proud to have been awarded this award.

The Department of Human Settlements has an operational budget of R1,257 billion, and by the end of November R1,023 billion, or 60%, has been spent. I am quite confident, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we will spend the entire grant by 31 March 2013.

As mentioned before there have been some adjustments and changes. One of those adjustments is that an amount of R3,7 million was shifted to the Department of Local Government for administrative purposes to manage the split. Some of the adjustments are as a result of the challenges we are facing in a number of municipalities. I think it is one of the points I made regarding bulk infrastructure. We have taken a decision to shift the funds to those municipalities who are performing and this decision was made by the Allocation Advisory Committee.

These are some of the reasons why we had to shift the funds to different municipalities: Complex community dynamics as people contest housing opportunities; the relocation of informal settlement residents to make way for construction; contractors not performing to acceptable quality standards such as in Drakenstein; and bulk infrastructure constraints. Ongoing community conflicts in Boystown and Crossroads are also hampering service delivery.

Mr Deputy Speaker, there are challenges. The obsession to chase numbers is fast catching up with us because in most municipalities investment in bulk infrastructure was never made.
As a department we have taken a decision to use our Discretionary Fund to assist some of the municipalities who are struggling because of bulk infrastructure.

Out of R60 million that we have in our Discretionary Fund, we gave the following municipalities some funding to deal with this problem: Langeberg was given R5 million; Cape Agulhas, R2.5 million; Bitou, R3.8 million; George, 14 million; Kannaland, R5 million; Mossel Bay, R1.5 million; Oudtshoorn, R5 million; Cederberg, R5 million; and Saldanha, R18 million.

The following municipalities had allocations increased. It is important to make the point that due to strategic focus in supporting municipalities in developing project pipelines ready to go, we were able to shift funding, where necessary, to municipalities which projects were ready to go. The Breede River Municipality grant was increased from R35,9 million to R54,6 million; Langeberg’s allocation from R14,3 million to R18,3 million; Stellenbosch from R36,7 million to R48,7 million; Witzenberg from R17,9 to R34,4 million; Cape Agulhas from R22,3 million to R33,7 million; Overstrand from R10,6 to R20,9; Swellendam from R6,8 million to R8 million; and in Central Karoo, Beaufort West, from R5,9 million to R31,3 million; and in Eden, Bitou Municipality, R15,6 million was increased by R10,6 million to R26,2 million; George from R44,8 million to R52,8 million; Hessequa from R16,9 million to R20,9 million; Kannaland from R5 million to R13,9 million; Knysna from R42,1 million to R48,3 million; Mossel Bay from R40,7 million to R51,8 million; Matzikama from R8,5 million to R19,1 million; Cederberg from R7,2 million to R21,4 million.

With respect to other programmes the allocation of R36,1 million for individual subsidies has been increased by R5,9 million to R42 million, providing an extra 600 subsidies. The allocation of R30 million for the Enhanced Extended Discount Benefit Scheme (EEDBS) for operational capital remains unchanged at R85,6 million. The amount paid to NHBRC to guarantee the structural integrity of the houses has been increased by R13,4 million, from R4 million to R17,4 million.

I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports the Adjustments Appropriation, but we do have concerns. What we do notice is that there is a write-off of irrecoverable debt; that occurred in the previous year as well. That was raised by Scopa in the annual reporting process; fraudulent receipt of funds by staff and it goes to SIU. There are lots of costs in that regard and it seems to be continuing. So part of the adjustment here is going to fund the write-off of irrecoverable debt.

There are also higher audit costs and higher S&T, subsistence and travel. While we see almost all the other departments showing savings in terms of S&T, and austerity measures in whichever way they want to mention it, this department is showing an increase; that is a concern, specifically since in the previous year there was a 25% increase in S&T usage. These are concerns that the ACDP has in terms of Human Settlements.

We also note that the standing committee raised a concern in the ATC report about the linkages between the department and the municipalities. We welcome the increase in funding to the municipalities as the agencies.
The question to the department is: Have the communication and the oversight linkages been sufficiently corrected so that targets will be met by the department when it’s the municipalities that are the implementing agents? Has that been addressed sufficiently so that the increased adjustments that are going to the municipalities are going to result in the meeting of the targets that have been set? Thank you.

Nksz T N BEVU: Sekela Somlomo, ndifuna ukuthi kohlonihekileyo uMphathiswa ndiyavelana naye kuba ndiyalazi elsebe ukuba uyakuze ucwangcise ukuba uzakwenza into ethile uze ungakwazi ukyuenza ngenxa yabahlali kuba befuna ezinye izinto okanye bekhalazela ezinye izinto. Ndifuna ukuthi kuye ndiyaluXhasa oluhlengahlengiso lolwabibi-mali kwaye ndiyavelana naye ohlonihekileyo uMphathiswa. Abantu ngelinye ixesha baye bangafuni ukusuka kulondawo kuza-kusetyenzwa kuyo kodwa ke kubalulekile ukubazame ngakumbi kubantu abahlala apha emigxobhozweni.


[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.]

[Ms T N BEVU: Deputy Speaker, I want to tell the hon Minister that I sympathise with him because I know this department that one will plan for something and not be able to achieve that because the residents will want or complain about something else. I want to tell him that I support this budget and I also sympathise with the hon Minister. People sometimes do not want to move from the place which work is going to be done but it is important that he tries by all means to convince people living in floods.

At least we must see working being done so that we can see that something is going on, not things staying as they were before although there were plans. I know it is difficult but he must try by all means. I support this budget.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I congratulate my colleague and comrade, Comrade Patrick McKenzie for the outstanding service he has performed in the House. I think the best way to see that is to see how the other side of the House quakes when he stands up to speak without any notes in his hand! We are really going to miss you in the House, but we know you will continue to serve the people of the province. Thanks very much, Patrick.

Let me say hon Deputy Speaker that we face a serious problem in the department, and it is really not in the way that the MEC has tried to spin it. In fact, in Scopa the Auditor-General was clear that part of the problem lies directly with the MEC. The problem is this: We take people who have no track record, who have no experience in serving the community, we put them in very serious positions and we expect them to perform in very complex situations dealing with very serious issues.

The MEC himself was crying now about the complexities of communities, but if you take people who don’t have any experience over a long period of time in dealing with those complexities and you put them where the MEC is, then you face serious problems.[Interjections.] Yes, and I’ll come to why in a moment; it relates directly to this budget.
We raise this issue because that side of the House raised the issue of Fit for Purpose. Clearly we are failing deeply in the department and we want to put a spin on it all the time. [Interjections.] This is made worse by the fact that this is the only African member of this Cabinet. When one person must represent 30% plus of the population of the province in that Cabinet, and when he fails it also then unfortunately becomes a question of how did he serve that community? That’s where the biggest failure is.

We have to be very worried about this. Let me quote to you what the Auditor-General told Scopa in the briefing:

This department went backwards on the usefulness of reported information. The key target was to build top structures, but the department decided to do serviced sites. Sufficient information was not presented for auditing purposes. The department considerably underperformed, but spent its entire budget.

The department considerably underperformed but it still spent its entire budget, because what happened last year is that in the adjustments process the money was shifted in the same way it’s being shifted now, away from building houses, away from servicing sites to other things. Then the excuse that is raised here is that the municipalities, most of which are DA by the way, are not spending their money and not providing the services there so we must now pay for them.

Let me repeat: The department considerably underperformed, but it spent its entire budget. Then when it came to predetermined objectives, the Auditor-General says:

There were findings on accuracy of the information presented. The evidence did not correlate to what was submitted.

The department said they built 14 000 houses, and when the Auditor-General went to count the number of houses it was considerably less.

Then finally, and that’s why I started my speech the way I started it, the Auditor-General told Scopa that, and I quote:

The problem was that the way the indicators were approved by the Minister was not set out on time; they were just yearly targets …

In other words, the Minister said that he was going to build 12 640 houses, but he did not break that down in any way that showed any competency to actually build those houses. So there was one target for the whole year, and when June came they hadn’t met any target because there was no target for June. When July came, there was no target for July, so no target was met, until November last year came and the money had to be shifted away from building houses to buying land in the City of Cape Town, when the city sits on huge plots of land, including developments that were started in 2004-05 in Pelican Park, where not one house has been built yet.

This hon MEC, when he popped out of the ground from nowhere, he popped straight into the Mayor’s Office, and there he continually waged an attack on the ANC about housing delivery. The years of 2006, 2007 and 2008 were the golden years of housing delivery in this province, and then the hon MEC came in and we sit with this disaster.
Let me quote to you again, hon Winde, if you are doing your oversight job: The Auditor-General said:

This department did not set predetermined objectives and the MEC was personally responsible for that problem.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just finish off your last sentence.

†Mr M OZINSKY: If we talk about Fit for Purpose we must ask the questions that I asked at the beginning of my speech. Thank you. [Time expired.]

†Mr A M FIGLAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am a little worried about the comments because I see some of the people are rushing numbers instead of quality. [Interjections.] This government is looking after quality.

Nevertheless, Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government is committed to make use of all the resources available to encourage and develop high density and mixed residential units. As Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements, I welcome the fact that the department has received R66 million in order to facilitate the financial assistance to municipalities to provide bulk infrastructure to unlock housing delivery.

Mr Deputy Speaker, there can be no sustainable and viable human settlements and development thereof, without the urgent rollout of large-scale bulk infrastructure projects. One cannot continue to develop top structures without providing bulk services below the ground.

The provision of infrastructural projects only after the top structures have already been built brings about even more additional costs. This is why the additional funding to assist municipalities with the provision of bulk infrastructure is so important.

Apart from the importance of providing bulk infrastructure, other programmes are also in place to ensure the change in the delivery of housing to the people of the Western Cape.

The department has approved the provincial policy to enhance a serviced site so that beneficiaries will have access to basic services. This is in line with the strategy to upscale and increase the provision of services, while down-scaling on top structures. It will be a major improvement in service delivery if all municipalities can be encouraged to implement the policy of providing enhanced serviced sites.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this department also received much criticism from the public, but the public is not always aware of the regulatory environment that makes it so difficult to deliver low-cost housing on any site in less than 6 years. Some of this has to change. That is why we say you have to look at the quality, because if you go around the country, even in this province, there are many houses that need to be rectified; it is also a waste of money.

It is a well-known fact that the demand for housing is greater than the supply, and we must explore possibilities to address this problem. The serviced site approach is one way of addressing this problem. On-site upgrading of informal settlements, by way of increasing the provision of serviced sites, can help to enhance the living conditions of people in the Western Cape.
The department is involved in the optimal and sustainable use of resources, and the most energy-efficient, water wise and cost-effective developments must always be considered. However, this should not be at the expense of providing quality housing. There are currently too many developments around the country where poor workmanship has made the houses uninhabitable. Some of these houses have to be demolished and rebuilt. The department must ensure that municipalities and contractors are held accountable for the delivery of houses that do not meet the required standards.

There is a backlog of about 500 000 houses in the Western Cape and the backlog cannot continue to grow. Problems such as shoddy building practices, patronage and corruption must be dismantled in order to enhance the delivery of houses. The consolidation of 14 municipal housing demand databases into the provincial housing demand database to ensure more accurate housing backlog detains another step in the right direction. This will help with the planning of projects, especially in municipalities with the roll-out of the bulk infrastructure programmes.

This is why municipalities must understand the importance of providing bulk infrastructure when housing development projects are started. To provide top structures without bulk infrastructure is like putting the cart before the horse. The department’s commitment to the upgrading of informal settlements is also instrumental in addressing the housing problem.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in conclusion, the additional funds received by the department have been allocated to the right projects that will increase the provision of housing opportunities to more people in the Western Cape. We support the Adjustments Bill.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon member Haskin is quite correct, and I think it is an issue that we raised up front as a department. You raised the issue of the increase on the audit costs. I think that is one of the reasons why we had to spend so much money, precisely because of the fund. We did explain the amount of money we had to spend to turn the fund around from the disclaimer to where it is now. We are very happy because we believe that it is money well spent, given the fact that this fund was dormant. It was very difficult for some of these properties to be traced. We are dealing here with the legacy of the mess that was left by that side of the House. That is why we had to do what we did, and we acknowledge that.

The issue of the adjustment in terms of shifting the funds was raised. Obviously, as I said, people must understand that the allocation of funds to municipalities is governed by legislation, which is the Division of Revenue Act. You allocate monies to municipalities on the basis of the information they give you when they say that these are the projects that are ready and this is what they are going to do in this financial year. But then you do the assessment to see whether those projects are ready to deliver in that particular financial year, and then you take a decision during this time, after assessing and seeing whether those projects are ready to move and shift the money to projects that are ready to move. So I want to assure you that that decision, to shift the money to other municipalities, was taken because we could see that those business plans from those municipalities were wish lists and they will not be able to achieve what we want to achieve as a department.
I also want to thank hon Bevu for her contribution. It is very clear to me that hon member Ozinsky has no understanding of what is happening on the ground. In fact, he is casting aspersions on me and giving the impression that I am the one who doesn’t understand what is happening there. I can assure you that I understand this space much better than you do.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Then why don’t you set targets?

†The MINISTER: Let me also tell you how the targets are set. [Interjections.] Let me also tell you how the targets are set, because clearly you don’t understand what you are talking about.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Stop spinning it.

†The MINISTER: It is not a spin; just listen. All the planning processes are done by municipalities; this Minister is not building houses. There are different responsibilities between the national department, provincial department and municipalities.

The targets that you see here are based on the business plans that come from municipalities where the planning takes place. The municipalities plan and then submit plans to us and tell us that in this financial year this is the number of houses we are going to build, based on the planning processes that we’ve completed.

As I said, when we do the assessment in some of these municipalities we realise that some of these business plans are just a wish list; that is why we take a decision. You cannot just take a decision before the Adjustments Budget to shift the money. You must remember that the financial years of municipalities and ours are different, so you’ve got to give those municipalities some time and assess whether those plans will deliver what the municipality said they will deliver. [Interjections.]

The issue of PDOs was mentioned. This is one of the issues that we raised with the A-G. Again, you must understand what evidence you are talking about here, because I am not sure whether you understand that.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Listen, I’ve sat in Scopa longer than you’ve been in politics.

†The MINISTER: But still, you have no clue what you are talking about when it comes to housing.

In terms of the portfolio of evidence that the hon member is talking about, we have a number of processes that we need to follow from planning processes. When it comes to the proof as to whether the house is there, the last part that needs to be done is you need to rely on the inspector’s report which says that the house is there, which for us is a process that has been followed all along, even during the time when this party was in power. [Interjections.]

I am coming to that, because even the houses that you are bragging about are the houses that we are fixing now. We are actually spending a lot of money rectifying the houses that you are bragging about.

Even now, Mr Deputy Speaker, the Auditor-General has not been able to tell us. They say that the report in terms of the evidence that we are submitting is not enough, but they are not telling us what it is that is not enough.

†Mr M OZINSKY: This is serious; why didn’t you raise it in Scopa?
†The MINISTER: I did. [Interjections.] No, no, I did. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER: We are saying this is the process that we follow … [Interjections.] Yes. This is the process that we follow … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! There are far too many …

†The MINISTER: This is an issue that I have been raising consistently.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister! Just give me a second. You needn’t react to every interjection. Please continue with your speech. Members must please contain your interjections.

†The MINISTER: We are saying to the Auditor-General this is the process that has always been followed. If you say that you are not happy with this particular proof that we are providing that the houses have been built, what is it that you need? And the Auditor-General cannot tell us. That’s the point I want to make here. We are following the very same processes that have been followed in the past, but now we find ourselves in a situation where the information that we are submitting is not acceptable, but we are not told what is the acceptable information in terms of the evidence.

Lastly, Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC members must really be ashamed … [Interjections.] … because they keep on bragging …

†Mr M OZINSKY: It’s time to sit down.

†The MINISTER: … about the number of houses that they built. In fact, I would really love to take you to those projects where you are bragging that you have built houses when, in fact, Mr Deputy Speaker, … [Interjections.] … we are spending a lot of money actually going back to where the ANC built houses and rectifying those houses. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: [Inaudible.] … and this is the report that was tabled by the national department to the national portfolio committee, that we are looking at spending more than R50 billion to rectify the houses because the ANC was so obsessed with chasing numbers that they compromised …

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Skwatsha! Order!

†The MINISTER: … the quality of the houses that they built over the years. I don’t think that’s something to be proud of. [Interjections.]

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Sit down man, you’re talking nonsense.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! That concludes the speech and the debate on this Vote. [Interjections.] Is that a point of order? We’ll take the point of order before we read the next Order.
†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: Is it par-
lliamentary to say the member must sit, he’s talking nonsense?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is parliamentary to say “you must sit”, but it is not parliamentary to say “you are talking nonsense”. So that part must be withdrawn.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The hon member McKenzie …

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: I’ll withdraw that one.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please withdraw that. [Interjections.]

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: On my last day I want my withdrawal to be against him, so I withdraw it.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Order! Thank you, Minister Botha, for pointing that out to us.

Debate concluded.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education)

†The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, in my budget speech pre-
sented earlier this year I told the House how the Western Cape Education De-
partment planned to work better and smarter in the 2012-13 financial year.

Since then I can confidently say that we have worked better by prioritising the im-
provement of learner outcomes in the province through implementing a number of initiatives and programmes to improve the literacy and numeracy levels of our learners, and to increase the number and improve the quality of passes achieved by our learners in the National Senior Certificate examinations.

For instance, we have adopted a Mathematics and Physical Science strategy; hosted a number of teacher development and training workshops; set targets for the Grades 3, 6 and 9 literacy and numeracy tests; and launched an incentive pro-
gramme that financially rewards primary and high schools that have improved the number and quality of passes achieved in literacy and numeracy testing and the National Senior Certificate.

We’ve also worked smarter by developing a number of key initiatives to unlock ef-
ficiencies within the system. For example, we have created a school improvement plan that better positions the department to monitor and respond to the needs of our schools; introduced a new online e-recruitment system for educators applying for posts; and developed a new electronic tool for improving infrastructure planning for education in the Western Cape. These are just some of the ways in which we are working better and smarter in order to improve the quality of education we have in the province.
I am therefore pleased that we are fulfilling the commitments we have made in our 2012-13 budget and are on track and even succeeding our spending in most areas.

However, as plans are rolled out it is inevitable that certain adjustments to the Education budget. We will vote on this today in line with normal budgeting procedures.

In terms of this Vote the budget of the WCED has increased by R131,186 million, to bring the adjusted budget for the year to R14,36 billion. The majority of the R131,186 million, R96,127 million, is for the higher than anticipated cost of living adjustments and the improvement in other conditions of service such as housing allowance.

The housing allowance increased by R100 per month, to R900 per month, resulting in additional costs of R27,24 million.

The R13,376 million has become available to the province from national Government. This provision has been made for the improvement of conditions of service at the FET colleges to cover the costs of inflation.

Another significant adjustment has been made for outstanding municipal accounts. Section 21 schools manage and pay their municipal accounts, but this year we have had to make available R28,449 million for outstanding municipal services charges. We do, however, intend to recover these funds from the schools whose municipal accounts are outstanding.

A total of R10,01 million has been rolled over into the 2012-13 budget. An amount of R6,914 million has been rolled over for the restructuring of the Metro Central Education District Office at the Alexandria Hospital site; R804 000 has been rolled over from 2011-12 for outstanding and late invoices in respect of the national school nutrition programme; and R2,292 million has been rolled over for learning and teaching support materials for outstanding invoices in 2011-12.

The Western Cape Education Department has shifted R7 million to the Department of the Premier for services rendered for ICT and the integrated school administration management system functions.

I am also very pleased to announce that internal savings of R5,85 million have been allocated to fund the Premier’s Advanced Youth Programme.

In conclusion I would like to thank the department for making every effort to effect savings and efficiencies which have enabled us to do extraordinary things with limited resources. The fact that this Adjustments Budget is so straightforward reflects the commitment of the WCED to doing as much as possible with the financial resources allocated to it and the ability of our financial managers.

I would like to thank Treasury and my colleagues in provincial government for working with us as we strive to improve the quality of education in the Western Cape.
Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ACDP is in support of these Adjustments, but again we have concerns. One is in relation to the R5,5 million that is being transferred to school governing bodies for the purchase of mobile classrooms. The mobile units and the way in which the department was unable to account for them in terms of the asset register, was cause for the audit finding in the previous year as we all know. The question here is: While the department is now adding to that, has the department concluded the service level agreement with the Department of Public Works with regard to accounting for them? Have definitions been finalised in terms of what these mobile units are? Are they going to remain mobile? Where will they be stored? What is their value, and on whose asset register do they appear?

In this particular instance this is departmental money that is being transferred to a school governing body, but we know that school governing bodies themselves buy their own mobile units for the schools. So whose asset register are these mobile units going to appear on? I would imagine on the department’s asset register. We can’t have these problems arising again next year in terms of the audit findings and the Scopa processes.

However, we do welcome the appropriations of R8,6 million for the Maths and Science strategy. It is a centralised procurement process; we welcome that. We believe it is very necessary to highlight Maths and Science in the way that is being proposed here. We also welcome the R1,2 million that has been set aside for Internet connectivity in terms of transfers to schools. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.


[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Ms T N BEVU: Deputy Speaker, we also say that we rise and welcome the appropriation adjustment. We would like to request that the hon Minister sees to it that during the next quarter we are not going to be faced with the same problems we encountered this year, especially those of finding out that learners have not yet got the books. I have seen from this appropriation adjustment that there is money for the procurement of books and workbooks. We hope that we are not going to appear in newspapers for wrong reasons as the provincial government. The provincial government will not appear in newspapers for wrong reasons but only for good things during the next quarter.]

†Ms J WITBOOI: Mr Deputy Speaker, for the ANC it is important that the department’s budget increase is utilised to get education in the Western Cape out of the crisis.

These moneys must be directed to improving the quality of education at poor schools, especially those which the department deems to be underperforming.
Instead of closing down schools for so-called underperformance, these additional funds should be used to improve and assist these schools and to keep them running.

We hope that with this additional allocation MEC Grant will not plan to close any more schools in the financial year ahead. [Interjections.] I hear you say “watch me”.

†The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: [Inaudible.] … other provinces want to do the same thing.

†Ms J WITBOOI: The additional funds shifted to the department must be utilised to improve maintenance and infrastructure at our schools.

The budget must address overcrowding at the schools attended by the poorest of the poor. The funds must also be utilised to enhance ICT in poor schools, especially those in the rural areas of our province.

The increased funds must be directed to increasing and improving the quality of learner transport to pupils who cannot afford transport, especially those in the rural areas, and service providers of learner transport must be paid on time.

It is imperative that these funds are used to ensure that all schools are provided with textbooks. We do not want to be informed later in the year of textbook shortages at schools, as was the case with schools in Kraaifontein. The parents, teachers and learners of the Western Cape do not wish to witness a repeat of the overcrowding of poor black schools, like we saw in Grabouw. We do not wish to see a repeat of the fateful crash of a school bus in Knysna in which 14 learners were killed.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC expresses this caution, cites this example and underlines our proposed funding priorities not because we wish to play political football, but we raise the issues because the House is well aware of the extent of the department’s non-delivery last year. This is despite the fact that last year, too, Education was given a large chunk of the budget allocation.

We say these things because we want to see a vast improvement in the overall provision of quality education to the disadvantaged children of this province, and we want the doors of learning to be open to all. Thank you.

*Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Education Department has received the biggest adjustment to their initial budget. A total of about R131 million has been added.

The WCED remains steadfast to offer quality education to all learners in the Western Cape and therefore all possible resources are applied effectively to achieve improved outcomes.

The priorities are and remain to improve language and mathematics skills in primary schools, an improvement in the number and quality of learners passing the National Senior Examination in grade 12 as well as to reduce the number of underachieving schools. We are trying to improve the quality of teaching that our learners receive and in so doing to offer our youth better possibilities in life.
The adjustments to the 2012-13 budget may be divided into three broad categories: Adjustments have been made as a result of the reprioritisation of education infrastructure, savings and technical reclassification of expenditure.

Mr Deputy Speaker, reprioritising of education infrastructure is putting increased emphasis on maintenance of existing infrastructure rather than simply new infrastructure. More than R12 million has been made available for upgrading grade R classrooms. An additional amount of more than R11 million has been made available for maintenance at high schools, while about R16,8 million has been made available for maintenance at primary schools to ensure that the learning environment of children will remain conducive. In addition, approximately R33,6 million has been transferred to FET colleges for maintenance and upgrading, contrary to what the hon member Brown said yesterday.

Savings have been effected by bulk purchasing of textbooks, which facilitates further investment in textbooks. An amount of R41 million in the additional budget was made available for purchasing CAPS textbooks for high schools. The additional funds will further help to achieve the medium-term goal of textbooks for every grade 4 to grade 12 learner for each of the core subjects offered.

However, today I want to emphasise frankly that there is indeed a difference between a textbook and a workbook. It appears that the ANC has not been able to grasp this concept.

The government in the Western Cape has identified broadband connection as an important factor in economic development, growth and job creation. For this purpose, R240 million was budgeted in the medium term. Information and Communication Technology (ICT) also has an important part to play in education. The additional R7 million being transferred to the Department of the Premier is welcomed, specifically because it has been made available to the Khanya and integrated school administration management system.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is sad that the funds that were made available for the implementation of the Teacher Laptop project cannot be utilised to the fullest for the third successive year because unions and different levels of government cannot reach agreement.

Poverty and crime have a real impact on education; hungry children cannot fully utilise the learning opportunities they receive. With 365 000 children in the Western Cape already benefitting from feeding schemes, the additional R6,9 million for the National School Feeding Scheme in the province is welcomed sincerely.

Further reclassification of expenditure entails the R13,7 million made available for paying Early Childhood Development practitioners.

Mr Deputy Speaker, for the above successes, the attention given to the priority areas and the continued work on the above issues, I support the Adjustment Budget. I want to thank the hon Minister Grant, the Superintendent-General, Penny Vinjevold, the officials and the department for their continued hard work throughout the year in ensuring that the funds are applied effectively and efficiently to promote quality teaching for all learners in the Western Cape.
I also want to thank the members of the standing committee for their contribution and inputs during the past year.

†The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I would like to thank all those who participated in this debate and say to hon members Haskin and Bevu that I have noted their concerns and I will certainly convey them to the department.

In terms of the mobile units, I am busy in discussion with Minister Carlisle and Minister Winde as to where that mobile asset register should rest. It is my opinion it should go back to Public Works, where it belongs, but we will certainly fix it up before we return it to them.

We are busy relooking the definitions and we’ve given the mobile asset register back to the Auditor-General and we are going on five test visits to see if we agree as to the nature of the definitions. It is very difficult to see different types of mobiles and different structures defined differently by different people, and this relates to classrooms, libraries, toilets and kitchens; it is not just a simple matter. We are looking into that very carefully.

The hon Witbooi raised the issue regarding textbooks. Let me say to her that I am very proud of my department regarding CAPS for 2013. As I stand here today, 100% of the books ordered by the schools for the CAPS for Grades 4, 5, 6 and 11, have already been delivered to the schools for next year.

In the last report which I saw, which was a week ago, we had paid for 82% of those books. With our online system we now pay for our purchases 15 days after delivery. So you are welcome to go and check Grades 4, 5, 6 and 11. If there are any books short it is going to be the responsibility of the school who ordered those books because it is an online system. In terms of accountability, we are actually raising the bar between the department, the districts and the schools themselves.

I would like to thank everyone for their participation in this debate and say that we are not going to stop in our efforts to improve the results, and I am looking forward to 2 and 3 January for the results of Grade 12. I would like to thank my department for ensuring that it happened, despite the trouble we had in some rural districts during the tenure of the Grade 12 programme. Thank you.

Debate concluded.

BUSINESS SUSPENDED AT 12:33 AND RESUMED AT 14:00.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B 11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 6 – Health)

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, the amount initially approved for health in the 2012-13 financial year was R14,632 million. After additions in the adjustment budget the total health budget increase to R14,744 and increases to R111 million or 0,8%.

The breakdown of the increase is as follows:
Additional funding

The department was awarded R67 million as additional funding for the improvement of service conditions. This was the result of the latest wage agreement whereby salaries were increased by 7% compared to the funded percentage of 5.8%. The wage agreement also increased housing subsidies by R100 per person per month, resulting in an additional annual cost of R25 million for the department.

Rollovers and revenue retention

The two other components of the increase of rollovers and revenue retention from 2011-12 total R91 million. Other expenditure on the expenditure budget was R41 million and over collection of the revenue budget was R50 million.

These rollover amounts consist of three categories: the Global Fund, conditional grants and equitable share.

The Global Fund

The largest part of the underspending on the expenditure budget was in respect of the Global Fund. This budget was underspend by R73 million. One of the reasons for this underspending was the fact that the funding from the global fund was delayed. On the revenue side the department under collected by R40 million from the Global Fund compared to the budget. It follows that part of the under expenditure was a planned under expenditure.

Other reasons for the under expenditure on the Global Fund were:

The reduction of the ARV prices

Revised laboratory protocols with the NHS: The department was prevented by the Global Fund from buying certain ARVs approved by the Medical Control Council because these ARVs were not prequalified by the World Health Organisation.

The net under expenditure on the Global Fund was R33 million, R73 million on expenditure, minus R40 million under expenditure on the revenue.

The rollovers from 2011-12 were therefore used to increase the Global Fund Budget for the current year by R33 million.

In the Adjustments budget you will note two amounts making up this amount – R27 million under expenditure rollovers and R6 million under financing, which is the revenue surplus rollover.

Conditional grants

The following conditional grants were also underspend in 2011-12:

The hospital revitalisation grant, R8,329 million; the health infrastructure grant R2,82 million; and the social sector expanded public works programme grant by R3,467 million.

The budgets for these conditional grants were therefore increased by these amounts in the adjustment budget.
The under expenditures are very small compared to the 2011-12 budgets. It’s 1.8% of these budgets compared to the under expenditure nationally in health in these conditional grants, and compared to the under expenditure by the department in the previous financial year.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Focus.

†The MINISTER: To be able to spend more than 98% of these budgets is a significant achievement, given the national and historical context, since these expenditures are planned many years in advance. The fiscal discipline indicates improved planning during the recent years and the department should be recognised for their achievements in this regard.

Equitable share portion of the rollovers

The remainder of the rollovers, R91 million minus R14 million for conditional grants and minus R33 million for the Global Fund, that is then R44 million, is the net effect of the over recovery of revenue of R90 million, the Global Fund excluded.

The over expenditure of the equitable share budget of R47 million

The over recovery of revenue is mostly with respect to patient fees, particularly with respect to the amounts claimed by the Road Accident Fund. The department instituted a very effective process to identify patients who may lodge claims against the Road Accident Fund and for the process of compiling and following up such claims.

The equitable share over expenditure is also small in relative terms. The department spends about R63 million per working day. The equitable share over expenditure is therefore less than one day’s payments.

The R44 million was allocated to Khayelitsha Hospital and related facilities, because of the faster-than-expected commissioning of this hospital due to the high demand for services and the subsequent greater-than-expected demand at the hospital to which the Khayelitsha Hospital refers its patients for more specialised treatment.

Reduction in the Global Fund budget

A third major component of the budget adjustment is the reduction of the Global Fund budget by R53 million. This is for the same reasons as listed above for the underspending in the previous year in the Global Fund.

To date the department has not received any funds from the Global Fund in the current financial year, and to date more than R30 million of the province’s funds have been used for Global Fund projects. A payment is, however, expected shortly, but the department prefers to be conservative in its revenue expectations.

Other changes to the budget

The department received a donation from the City of Cape Town of nearly R8 million and shifted R1.8 million to the Department of Education for much-needed services to individuals with intellectual disabilities.

Budget shifts
The Department also shifted funds internally. The following are some of the more important shifts: Earlier this year the Legislature approved legislation to abolish the Ordinance through which the Cape Medical Depot (CMD) was created. This resulted in the incorporation of the CMD into the department. The CMD is the department’s central store for medicines and medical supplies. It was previously managed as a training entity, separate from the department.

The operations of the CMD will continue unchanged, but the incorporation of the depot into the department requires that the depot be allocated an expenditure budget, similar to the other institution.

The revenue which the CMD received in the past in the form of levies will fall away. The Adjustments budget, therefore, provides an expenditure budget for the CMD.

In the adjusted budget the department funded the Sunflower Foundation – it’s a non-profit organisation for the enhancement of the national bone marrow register – by an amount of R3 million through a transferral payment. This important register, which will make it easier to find suitable donors for transplants, is currently not funded nationally.

In the adjusted budget funds were shifted to fund initiatives for the implementation of the National Health insurance (NHI). The purpose of this funding is to prepare facilities for the transition to the NHI, particularly to improve service delivery and managerial control.

The department strengthened its staffing responsible for regulatory control. This group of people check thousands of payments each month to ensure that all rules were adhered to and to implement the corrective steps required.

In closing, Mr Speaker, together with the other very small adjustments, the above explains the adjustments and shifts in the budget. The Western Cape Department of Health is the only health department in the country to have obtained successive clean audits from the Auditor-General. This can be ascribed to excellent management, strict control and discipline.

Mr Speaker, I want to take the opportunity to thank the standing committee, the Chairperson specifically, hon Anroux Marais, for the work they’ve done during the year. We appreciate that very much. I want to thank the staff under the very capable leadership of Dr Househam for the work that they’ve done. Thank you very much.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, I’ve heard so much about grants in the last five minutes of the Ministers speech that I don’t know if I need to say anything more.

Mr Speaker, one concern that has been raised in of annual report process that is currently in the hands of, I do believe, they the department and the Department of Transport and Public Works, is to resolve the service level agreement with regards to Infrastructure Demand Management Services.

It is a big problem and it needs to be resolved as soon as possible. It is going to affect the spending of this department, notwithstanding the adjustments that are in front of us, which are supported by the ACDP. Thank you.
Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I support the Adjustments Appropriation for the provincial department proposed by the department.

Mr Speaker, based on my experience in the health committee meetings and my analysis the annual report, I can say that this has been a productive year for the Department of Health. Throughout the Ministry various changes and accomplishments have raised the bar as a result their delivery methodology.

Mr Speaker, one of the greatest achievements to date, in my opinion, is the completion and opening of the Khayelitsha District Hospital earlier this year, as it has greatly eased the pressure of bed availability in the Cape Metropole area.

It is also reassuring that Minister Botha and his department have robustly raised awareness of and continue to promote healthy lifestyles. I’d like to encourage Minister Botha and his department to make what is good, better and to continue with his commitment to make what is now better, excellent.

The Department of Health’s performance will ensure that the Western Cape Government will be the best-run regional government in the world. I thank you.

Ms T N BEVU: Mr Speaker, we support the adjustment. Thank you.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, it was interesting to hear that the Minister is promoting healthy lifestyles. Maybe he believes in “do what I say”, rather than “do what I do”, because he’s a heavy smoker and that’s not promoting a healthy lifestyle.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Shall I talk about your cigarettes?

Mr M SKWATSHA: You may.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: May I?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes. I’ve also observed with interest the lack of response from the Premier about the dismissal of staff in her department on Christmas eve.

I would like to say that …

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Are you speaking on health or the Premier’s Department?

An HON MEMBER: Whatever.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I’m following a good act …

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You’re doing an omnibus.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M SKWATSHA: You see it’s because there are some things that come from the other side of the House that are annoying, like speaking about chasing numbers.
†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: You know we were right to chase numbers in 1994, because we realised that people needed a roof over their heads.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Which are falling apart now.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: This department has an increased rollover of R111 471 million – these are big numbers. This includes a rollover from a conditional grant of R3,467 million from EPWP given to you, Minister, by the national government to train carers, especially in poor communities.

On a more serious note, I want to concur with hon Haskin on the resolution of the perceived conflict between the Departments of Public Works and Health in relation to the infrastructure.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No problems.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: The ANC wants to take this opportunity to thank National Treasury for the Adjustments Appropriation for ICS. Now we are assured that those who work in this caring profession, like nurses and doctors, will receive their increased salaries.

This department has always been well run and used to strive to empower poor people to take care of their health and those in their communities. However, they have stopped partnerships in communities and give no funding to health forums. There’s no communication – and even fewer plans for communication – with the public. That is why we also find it bizarre when the Premier speaks about fighting disease, but instead of dealing with the community prefers to take a cycling tour with her Cabinet paid for by taxpayers.

†The PREMIER: Nonsense.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: We believe in dealing with the issues relating to the burden of disease, but with poor communities in particular, which are in the majority in the province. There are shortcomings that we have noted in engagements around the department’s 2011-12 annual report.

In terms of health, for Science and Training R3,467 has been rolled over from 2011-12 in respect of the national conditional grant … [Interjections.] … –hello – … [Interjections.] …

†The SPEAKER: Address me, hon Skwatsha.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: … due to supply chain management procurement delays; R2 million has been rolled over from 2011-12 in respect of the health infrastructure grant due to delays with the advertisement and acceptance of contracts; more than R8 million has been rolled over from 2011-12 from the Hospital Revitalisation Grant as a result of delays in the picture archive and communication system; far too many funds have been shifted between programmes and sub programmes arising from erroneous budgetary allocations made by the department in the first place, especially to municipalities. We would hope that this does not happen again.
With the background of shortages of hospitals beds, medicines and unhygienic conditions in hospitals, the inability of the department to meet the challenges of compensation for poor patients needing to travel from G F Jooste to other hospitals is extremely worrisome. Expenditure trends indicate that monies might be wasted on cost of equitable … [Time expired.]

An HON MEMBER: It’s enough now.

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, reducing the burden of disease and increasing wellness in the Western Cape is of utmost importance, because one can only live a life one values if one’s health care is in a state of wellness.

The Western Cape Department of Health has proven time and again that it is the national leader in providing quality health care services to its citizens. It delivers these services through preventative, promotive, emergency and curative services as well as rehabilitation and chronic care.

In order to be able to deliver these services and care to the Western Cape the Department of Health requires dedicated human resources. Nonetheless, it is practical that the largest sum of the Adjustment Appropriation will be allocated to Central Hospital Services, which provide central hospital specialists, tertiary and quaternary health services and creates a platform for the training of health workers and research.

The DA is especially pleased with this allocation as the Western Cape Department of Health understands that through the training of personnel and continuous research, they are creating freedom you can use by means of investing in skilled staff and access to quality health care.

We support the Bill. I thank you.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I thank to all those who took part in this short debate.

Hon Haskin, the IDMS – and I will at the same time address Hon Skwatsha’s referral to the relationship between the Departments of Health and Public Works – is a wonderful mechanism and tool which we have implemented under the stewardship of the HOD of Treasury. It has brought about enormous improvement in delivery, especially in comparison to that of the previous government.

An HON MEMBER: Oh, yes.

The MINISTER: There are always challenges, but the way in which we address challenges is very different to the way you addressed challenges. You used publicity companies, you used brown envelopes and you killed each other … [Interjections.] …

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: … to get what you want, or to avoid someone else performing. In our government we have a system; it’s the IDMS. We talk about it. We even shared it with you but now you reveal it as if it’s a secret. So what are you trying to say? Just look at the results at the end of the day.
†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: What are you trying to say?

†The MINISTER: Just look at the results of what we achieve in both Education and Health with capital projects. We’ve done the most ever in the history of these departments with the best quality, delivery time and cost effectiveness.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: We fought corruption.

†The MINISTER: You know, I think it was very brave of you to use that one!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Not “we”.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much, member Haskin, for your support, I really appreciate it.

Hon Lentit, you specifically mentioned the Khayelitsha Hospital.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Are there beds there?

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Mr M OZINSKY: You’re very brave.

†The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, order! Mr Winde.

†The MINISTER: I will say it once more: The Khayelitsha Hospital is not only a hospital, Mr Speaker, the Khayelitsha Hospital is a monument. It’s a monument to the community where for the first time ever such an excellent facility, in fact the best of its kind, has been established.

An HON MEMBER: The ANC.

The MINISTER: It doesn’t matter who did it. I was fortunate to be part of it and it was a privilege to experience it. I was emotional at the opening of that hospital. There are many others, but Khayelitsha stands out. We do this every day. We do it KwaNokuthula in Bitou, we do it in Du Noon and we do it in many places. We rectify, we redress and I don’t know why the previous government under die ANC didn’t do that. Why is it that we had to come and do this in many places – Mitchells Plain, Du Noon and in Bitou? You were not doing it.

†Mr M OZINSKY: What do you mean? This was started by …

†The MINISTER: They were not doing it and one of the reasons why they were not able to do it, Mr Speaker, is because they couldn’t work with Marius Fransman in Public Works.

†Mr H P GEYER: Yes.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Really?

†The MINISTER: Yes. He was your enemy and is still your enemy.
†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: So, would you decide for me?

†The MINISTER: So we rectified all this and now we’re delivering. Now we can redress and deliver. [Interjections.] We can redress and deliver. That is what the people of the province appreciate.

Hon Bevu, thank you very much for your support.

Mr Speaker, member Skwatsha has chosen to do something which is not actually appropriate in politics and that’s to make a personal remark. It’s fine. I will challenge the hon member …

†Mr M SKWATSHA: When did I do that?

†The MINISTER: When you referred to my social pipe-smoking, which I enjoy very much, my friend. I’m also a social drinker, I drink two beers a month.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Two beers a month? [Laughter.]

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I’m working on it, Robin, I’m working on it. [Laughter.] I will challenge – listen to this, Mr Speaker – I challenge, personally, hon Skwatsha, to go for a full medical test for fitness, blood sugar, cholesterol, blood pressure …

†Mr M SKWATSHA: We can go there now.

†The MINISTER: I will even do it on body mass index, you know. [Laughter.] In fact, Mr Speaker, what I think we should do as a government – and I want to ask the Premier to support me on this …

†Mr R B LENTIT: I will go.
†The MINISTER: Let’s take the two caucuses …

†Mr R B LENTIT: I will go.
†The MINISTER: … and we do a body mass index … [Laughter.] … if we have the equipment!

†Mr M OZINSKY: Bring hon Visser.

†The MINISTER: Really, because if we’re talking about a “growing” government I have nothing else to say.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Von Brandis and Visser.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: All about bad questions.

The SPEAKER: Order!
†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, hon Skwatsha mentioned many good things that are very valuable. Unfortunately, I just think that many of the things he mentioned are actually issues … [Interjections.] We haven’t got the Big Five on this side.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: What else is it that you do have?

†The MINISTER: What he did was to actually mention many things that we should address in the budget. I agree with hon Skwatsha on those and I invite him – because he wasn’t involved in the previous round of the main budget – to participate so that we can put our heads together in order to arrive at the best possible budget for health. Many of the things he addressed, however, are not applicable to the Appropriation, but to the main budget.

Thank you very much for the support, also from my own colleagues. Thank you.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: I’ll take you up on the challenge.

Debate concluded.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B 11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier)

†The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Speaker. I would like to thank the director-general and his colleagues in the Department of the Premier for their role in finalising our 2012-13 budget adjustments. A lot of hard work has gone into adapting this budget to the Western Cape Government’s austerity drive and increased financial commitments relating to salaries and inflation. This situation creates a very difficult balancing act for our officials and I appreciate their commitment to getting it right.

Mr Speaker, for the 2012-13 Adjustments budget the department will add R48,1 million to its baseline, taking the total adjusted appropriation to R747,9 million. The main technical shifts that were included in the adjustment estimates for Vote 1 are as follows.

An amount of R45 million has been made available to Programme 4: The centre for E-Innovation. The main reason for this shift is due to the growth in the number of service delivery sites by over 50 sites and an increased requirement for internet capacity; the mainstreaming of Khunya support to ICT labs in schools, as well as support for the ISAMS management information systems in schools; the transfer of funds to the City of Cape Town for the broadband rollout and an increase in the ICT user base from 14 500 users to 16 500 users.

Secondly, an amount of R500 000 has been made available to the Hout Bay Partnership. The national development plan, Vision 20/40, states that our future success as a nation strongly depends on a more active and engaged citizenry, acting in partnership with accountable and effective government. The Cape Town Partnership and the recently launched Economic Development Partnership exemplify the positive impacts of partnerships for a community when it comes to economic and social development, and all forms of development. We are now seeking to replicate this model in Hout Bay through the Hout Bay Partnership.

Thirdly, R1,7 million has been shifted from other departments to fund our Changing Behaviour projects.
Over 50% of the Western Cape Government’s health budget is spent each year on preventable conditions. Over half of injury-related deaths in the province are a result of domestic violence and road accidents, often fuelled by alcohol and drug abuse. This often means that citizens with unavoidable illnesses and serious disabilities are turned away from facilities, and certainly it means that they don’t get the support that they deserve or, indeed, that the Constitution requires them to get because we’re spending so much of our budget on entirely preventable conditions.

It is vital that we start changing behaviour in this province so that people start taking personal responsibility for the choices they make. In this regard our government has appointed a consortium consisting of the University of Cape Town and the Harvard-based group Ideas 42, who are change behaviour specialists, to assist in the development of pilot changing behaviour projects in province.

We are currently developing a number of pilot projects that will focus on the following areas: healthy lifestyles; increasing safety; mitigating the effects of climate change; increasing road safety; increasing learners’ attendance in after-school programmes; and encouraging people to take responsibility for knowing their HIV status.

May I just add – in case we’re not going to do this – that I absolutely insist that we do this to prevent them and others from becoming HIV-positive in the first place. Most of these pilot projects will be rolled out early next year.

There was also R907 000 revenue over collection from the 2011-12 financial year. This money has been allocated to technology refresh, such as replacing outdated and out of warranty computers in the department.

Finally, the Compensation of Employees budget of human resource management was increased by more than R3 million. This does not mean that the unit has been expanded. We remain committed to keeping our human resource component as streamlined as possible.

The amount had to be sourced from other programmes due to Provincial Treasury not finding the excess staff funding requirement in the hope that affected staff would find appropriate placement. This has not happened to such an extent that it has placed pressure on the human resource management budget.

Mr Speaker, these are the most significant developments in today’s budget. Some of the adjustments will help us to continue creating partnerships with the aim of creating an environment in the province that encourages economic growth, investment, employment and opportunity. As we look to 2013, we will continue striving for excellence in the province and, in particular, in the way in which we work in this government.

Thank you very much indeed to all the colleagues who are sitting in the professional officials’ box for making this year a very productive and very rewarding one. I thank them for all the work they did in the appropriation budgets.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, the ACDP is in support of this Adjustments budget that’s presented to us today, but we want to use this opportunity to raise a few concerns, particularly arising out of the alignment between the annual reporting process that we’ve just been through and the Adjustments budget.
There are two opportunities that are simultaneously threats. The one is ICT …

†The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I can’t hear what the speaker is saying and it’ll be a problem if I have to reply to the debate. I do have to hear what the speaker is saying. I don’t know why the acoustics are so bad from that side of the Chamber. But with people coughing and making a noise I can’t hear what the speakers are saying and I won’t be able to reply. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Premier, it is noted.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: I think hon McKenzie was interjecting for the last time, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.][Laughter.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Mr G C R HASKIN: I had to get my last dig in. Mr Speaker, in summary, I wish to raise two opportunities that are simultaneously threats: The one is ICT and the other one is human resource management. Arising out of the alignment between the annual report process that we’ve just been through and the Adjustments Appropriations – and I mentioned these last night – the Auditor-General has raised a number of ICT-related concerns in terms of the information system audit findings that need to be attended to, noting that some R48 million is going to ICT in terms of this Adjustments Appropriation, broadly speaking.

The Auditor-General has raised a number of concerns and while government is increasingly reliant on information systems and computerised models to govern and drive efficiencies – we understand that – there is a lot of scope for hiding and for fraud and corruption that needs to be prevented through management tools.

This is what the Auditor-General has raised and it can be summed up in any one of these singular findings, for example:

The state of controls can be ascribed to management not having exercised sufficient oversight to ensure that appropriate environmental controls are in place.

That is one sentence that sums up, across the departments in this government, concerns around information system audit findings. I do believe that there is the capacity to resolve and to address these concerns under the leadership of Mr Williams, but it needs to be attended to, especially since a further R48 million is going to ICT.

The other one is human resource management, because in all departments they’re raising the inability to fill vacancies. That is another concern to us, but we do believe it will be possible to attend to it. [Time expired.]

†Ms T N BEVU: Mr Speaker, we support the adjustment of Vote 1, but of course with concerns. The Department of the Premier in the Western Cape received a financial unqualified audit with emphasis of matter and other matters. This was about non-compliance with the submission of SBD 4 declaration of interest for quotations obtained via EPSI; submission of financial statements that were not prepared in all material aspects according to the PFMA; deficiencies in internal control systems; and material misstatements.
The Premier’s department incurred an amount of R22 million in irregular expenditure. 1 948 was also incurred as fruitless and wasteful expenditure on fees paid; not in line with the contract; and duplicate payments and overpayments; and assets valued at about R3,7 could not be located in the asset register and we agree with the Attorney-General that this looks suspicious even though the department explained the matter by saying it was incorrectly taken off on the wrong place.

This points to high risk in internal audits that are not effective. There’s too much cross-pollination within this department due to human resources of all departments in the Western Cape falling under the congested so-called “corporate services” in the Premier’s department. This is just a nice-sounding term for centralisation.

An amount of R3,3 million was recorded on the balance sheet as irregular expenditure with 482 incurred during the year and 675 of this amount was condoned. We understand that much of this amount was incurred by the previous administration, but if the department does not deal with this and fails to implement forensic investigative unit resolutions, how does it hope to close this matter? [Time expired.]

†Ms V HANI: Mr Speaker, this department has swelled has so much in the past years that it has become over-bloated with staff. It also has an exceptionally higher than usual budget. It has employed DA cadres and dumped black staff members in droves. Even though they say that their overall numbers meet the employment equity targets, we know that this is not the case in serious decision-making positions.

In fact, Mr Speaker, at the beginning of November two black staff members were informed that by the end of November they will be without jobs. This is so callous.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Coloureds or blacks? [Interjections.] Why only black people?

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Mr R B LENTIT: Only black people?

†The SPEAKER: Hon Lentit, order!

†Ms V HANI: This is so callous as they have been in the employ of the department for more than four years. The head of this directorate is the redeployed former employee of TBWA Hunt Lascaris, and two more agency deployees were smuggled into the department.

Also, TBWA was rewarded with a further six months extension at R6 million to continue with a monthly extension beyond that at a further R1 million per month in the battle to get the Premier’s face into the newspapers. [Interjections.] This was done without following a fresh procurement process, as was agreed upon. It creates a breeding ground for corrupt relations. A closer look needs to be taken at all the add-ons and extra remuneration regularly pumped into TBWA’s account.

It is not just those two employees who are not pale enough or “wit” for purpose. In fact, we have been told that the entire human rights directorate has been closed down and restructured under the guise of modernisation. But listen to this, Mr Speaker: The directorate only had black employees.
We’ve been informed that only 21 people have not been replaced. We hope that the next lot of black officials are not removed and replaced by white officials …

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: No, man.

†Ms V HANI: … as has become the practice, Ma’am.

*Mr R B LENTIT: This is gossip.

†Ms V HANI: This department’s Adjustments Appropriation to the Budget Vote’s increases exponentially. [Interjections.]

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You have a drink upstairs.

*Mr R B LENTIT: Gossip, yes.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You have a drink upstairs.

†Mr M C WALTER: Come on. Please!

*Mr R B LENTIT: This is gossip.

†Ms V HANI: The Premier’s budget grows by R48 000 179 only. The department has become a puffed-up department with no service delivery, but loads of officials doing something or the other.

†Mr M C WALTER: Well, at least they’re doing something.

†Mr H P GEYER: Explain that.

†Ms V HANI: The Premier’s department has received money from Community Safety and Health for some study that they are to undertake. This is money that was taken away from service delivery for the poor and given to purchase computers or present a study. This happens at a time when food insecurity for poor families has grown, when the United Nations report on TB declares that this province has the highest incidence of TB in the world – not only in SA, but the world. Service delivery protests are the highest in the country, which means that poor people are very unhappy in this province.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Oh shame.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Oh no, man.

†Ms V HANI: DA spins and lurches from crisis to chaos, while the Public Protector in the scandalous communication contract found too many counts of maladministration with, specifically, improper DA cadre deployment …

An HON MEMBER: Shame!

Ms V HANI: … as well as fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

*Mr H P GEYER: Shame on you!
*The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: What does she say about Tina?

†Ms V HANI: The amount is immaterial …

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Are you speaking about the Western Cape?

†Ms V HANI: … it is the principle of the matter.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It sounds more like the Free State.

†Ms V HANI: I’m saying the amount is immaterial …

An HON MEMBER: Oh, yes!

Ms V HANI: It is the principle of the matter.

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: The principle is R248 million. That’s the principle.

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Von Brandis, I will chase you out of the House, seriously.

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Sorry.

†Ms V HANI: This department, Mr Speaker, is no example to anybody and is a shame to the province.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hear, hear!

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Nonsense.
†The PREMIER: Go check your facts. [Interjections.]

†Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, in its effort to achieve the objective of becoming the best-run regional government in the world, the Department of the Premier’s allocated adjusted Appropriation of R747,981 million is supported by the DA.

As the DA spokesperson for the Department of the Premier in the Western Cape, I support the adjusted Appropriation as the additional funds will most certainly enable the Department to create an open opportunity society for all, so that people can live lives they value.

The adjustment will not only assist in creating opportunities, but will also expand those that already exist. The Department of the Premier aims to achieve excellent outcomes with people who are fit for purpose, an appropriate policy agenda and aligned strategies and partnerships.

The largest sum of the adjusted appropriation is allocated to the fourth programme of the department, which is the Centre for e-Innovation. The adjusted Appropriation of R419,793 million allocated to the programme will aid its four major roles. These roles include providing and supporting: the basic information and communication technology infrastructure upon which most governmental activities depend; applications that improve the efficiency of government administration, lower costs and reduce the scope for corruption; applications that enable the government to deliver better services. It will also assist with building an inclusive information society.
The programme has the potential to not only transform the working practices of government, but also the lives of the province’s people. The programme is transversal in nature, as it creates and expands opportunities for people in the Western Cape in education, cultural affairs, sport, health, social services and housing. It also avails access to provincial government and administration as well as planning and development.

Many poor and marginalised communities suffer from economic exclusion due to geographic and historic isolation, low levels of ICT knowledge and skills, the lack of economic development and infrastructure in their areas and the lack of information on job opportunities. The Centre for e-Innovation will address these issues and personifies the department’s aim to not only be the best regional government in the world, but to also create an open opportunity society for all.

Mr Speaker, in creating this society the Department of the Premier is in effect giving the people of the Western Cape freedom they can use, and I assure you, Mr Speaker, it will soon overflow to other provinces.

An HON MEMBER: Good!

†Mr M OZINSKY: There will probably be a flood of pollution.

†The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I would like to thank hon Haskin for supporting this Appropriation budget and I would also like to thank him for making some important points here.

Yes, an opportunity can also be a threat. As hon Hartnick quite rightly said, the use of technologies give inclusive information and some propulsion to the open society, and it gives people freedom they can use, so it creates some threats. The Auditor-General has identified some of those threats and looked at the very great need for oversight and checks and balances on the use of technology, because of the risk of fraud and corruption and we take that very seriously indeed.

We have to spend a lot on fixing our ICT platform, Mr Speaker, because when we took over in the province the ICT platform was literally on its deathbed, it was so outdated and so obsolete.

†Mr M C WALTERS: Stiffy discs.

†The PREMIER: Stiffy discs, yes. Mr Lance Williams has done an excellent job in modernising and advancing that. Obviously it costs something to become a connected province, but being connected is absolutely essential if we want to build a competitive economy in a connected world, but we take the Auditor-General’s point very seriously.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: A forked stick.

†The PREMIER: Then the exercise of proper oversight and the human resource management problem that the speaker got to in the very last moments of his speech and the need to fill posts timeously is a very important point as well, Mr Speaker, and we take note of that.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Can you survive without the ANC? [Interjections.]
†The PREMIER: I am absolutely sure that the Corporate Services Centre is getting into gear. The wheels are getting well oiled and we’re able to make stronger and better progress all the time.

Hon Bevu, thank you very much to Cope for supporting this Appropriation budget. I would just like to point out, yet again, where the R22 million of unauthorised and irregular expenditure comes from. It is from a contract under the previous administration known as the Hip Hop contract ... [Interjections.] ... in which there was a huge amount of irregularity, to put it mildly, and, indeed, it took our administration to unearth it.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: So, what happened to it?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It was given to the police.

†The PREMIER: It’s one of the many cases that are with the police that they are doing nothing with and we need to investigate that in its own right, because that is a big scandal.

An HON MEMBER: Where are the staff members who were involved in it? [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon Skwatsha!

†The PREMIER: Then, hon Hani – well, true to form, Mr Speaker, hon Hani could only play the race card; she had absolutely no other coherent argument to make. She said that this budget was swelled and bloated. With respect, there is something that is swelled and bloated in this Chamber, but it certainly is not this budget. [Laughter.]

About DA cadres being employed in this department, let me put it very plainly that this is the only government in South Africa that I know of, Mr Speaker, that would employ somebody in a very senior position who has put on his CV that he was a senior member of the ANC.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Are you listening? [Interjections.]

†The PREMIER: Then the issue of paying R1 million rand a month for technology – well, that pales into insignificance. One million rand for communication and for technology pales into insignificance against the budget, for example, of renovating the President’s private home at Nkandla.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: And the painting in your own house?

†The PREMIER: The painting in my own house?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

INKULUMBUSO: Imfungumfungu. [The PREMIER: Nonsense.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon member! Order! Hon Skwatsha.
†The PREMIER: Imfungumfungu is “nonsense” in isiXhosa.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: We thought you would protect us against the Premier referring directly to us.

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: So why are you smiling?

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But you’re vulnerable, hey.

Mr M SKWATSHA: [Inaudible.]

†The PREMIER: I didn’t say that. I said, “Vuka ma ulele.” [Wake up from your sleep.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! You also questioned the Premier while there wasn’t an opportunity for you. Order, hon members! Premier, you may continue.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We’ll protect you, Skwatsha, don’t worry. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, when it comes to the human rights directorate and our mainstreaming of it, human rights is something that is very, very close to my heart. It is pathetic to have had a human rights directorate that did so little to promote human rights and, in fact, left all the critical human rights issues on the backburner.

Disability has been managed in a way that can only be described as a disgrace by the previous administration. Although they had big events, big functions, lots to eat, some music and buses and transport, nothing ever happened to change the lives of disabled people, for example. [Interjections.]

What happened with the youth? The national Youth Development Agency chewed through budget after budget, wasting money and, I would say, being actually corrupt and siphoning off the money for party political purposes. Now we are mainstreaming human rights issues and I’m personally am chairing the disability working group, because I do not want those issues to be sidelined anymore. That is what is essential. You should actually be ashamed that you set up a human rights unit that did so little for the crucial issues of marginalised groups in this province.

Hon Hani also raises the issue of the Western Cape having the most service delivery protests, which she argues is a result of the fact that we are not conducive to improving the lives of poor people. Well, it’s very interesting that the latest census shows that the Western Cape grew faster in percentage terms than any other province. In fact, over the last 15 years this province, demographically, has grown by almost a third of its population.

That is unbelievable. Poor people, Mr Speaker, are not stupid. They don’t leave a place where life is good for a place where life is terrible. They are not stupid. They move because of other things that were revealed this week.
An HON MEMBER: What?

The PREMIER: That Cape Town is the most productive city in the country and that seven of the 10 of the most productive towns in the country are in the Western Cape. People come here to look for jobs.

In the middle of the farm crisis, Mr Speaker, people have overlooked the one core point: The most productive and fertile land in the whole country produces absolutely no jobs and very little food. Instead of focusing on that scandal and that crisis, where land reform, above all, should be applied to get all that incredibly lush land on the eastern seaboard of South Africa productive, working, employing people and feeding the whole of the subcontinent, the focus and the anger is directed at a handful of farmers, most of whom are paying above the minimum wage and who sit in the middle of a very complex production chain, hardly being viable and making very little profit. The anger is focused on them when the real scandal is why the most fruitful land in South Africa lies fallow.

If we need any land reform at all, which we do in South Africa, dramatically, we need to change the tenure systems …

An HON MEMBER: Correct.

The PREMIER: … to enable us to use our most fruitful land productively to feed the entire subcontinent. The eastern seaboard of South Africa can feed the entire subcontinent if the land is used properly and can create hundreds of thousands of agricultural jobs …

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: … for people who currently are poor and have nothing, and have to be desperate seasonal migrant workers to the few farms that are productive in South Africa.

That is the scandal and it’s time that the ANC got real …

†Mr H P GEYER: Yes.

†The PREMIER: … about their policies and about how it’s impoverishing the people, how it’s causing people starve to death and … [Interjections.]

[Vuka ma ulele, mhlobowam.] [Wake up when you sleeping my friend.]

An HON MEMBER: And don’t protect the chiefs, sir.

The PREMIER: … because you don’t go to sleep when I’m telling you something that you need to understand. [Interjections.]

Let me also say thank you very much to my colleague, hon Hartnick, for chairing the portfolio committee with such grace and efficiency and for understanding our vision of the open opportunity society for all, how the inclusive information society underpins it and how the Corporate Services Centre is designed to underpin that. I’ve really enjoyed working with hon Hartnick and I think we are genuinely better together. Thank you very much.

Debate concluded.
WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B 11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture)

*The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Mr Speaker, I would like to thank hon Walters and all the members of the standing committee sincerely for their hard work. I want to say that all of them are really adding value to this portfolio.

Mr Speaker, I am thankful to be able to say that it is not necessary for us to move lots of money this year. Usually it is a case of good planning, but sometimes it cannot be avoided. This year we are thankful because we are moving very little money.

The department’s animal health programme is under pressure and this is because the national department of animal health has largely terminated our Milnerton inspection service. They withdrew their veterinarians and we had to intervene to ensure that we can still export food products from the Western Cape.

For this reason I had to find R4 million for these veterinary services. I have taken R500 000 from Resource Management, R500 000 from Research and Technology and R1 million from Farmer Support and Development, and then we had R2 million extra revenue that we had obtained from selling products. This was especially because of soil analyses we had done for commercial farmers and for which we charged fees.

Mr Speaker, we also had to move R3,2 million to the Department of Transport and Public Works. We received funds for the renovation of the college buildings. This work is done by Public Works, and that is why the funds were transferred to them, and also R326 000 for our George training facilities.

In conclusion I would just like to say it seems that our veterinary services are going to be under pressure next year and we will do everything in our power to render good service with a small amount of money.

†Ms B G MBALO: Mr Speaker, the adjusted budget for Agriculture does not convince us as the department gets about a tenth more in allocation, yet its spending pace is just slightly above last year’s market at the same time. The department will have to up its performance in order to keep expenditure on track.

The ANC is disappointed at all the added donations that are extra in this adjustment. Already this department seems to be a Father Christmas to all and sundry, trying to please all who come begging and pleading for handouts. A lot of it finds its way into the pockets of organisations serving only landowners’ interests.

A sectarian interest appears on this list as money is given for Christian proselytising. This adds more cause for concern as we saw a lot of money also being given to certain church groups and other questionable causes. Too much is spent on farmers’ days and symposiums, while farm workers’ competitions and drives only aim to keep them in servitude. The names of old beneficiaries like Agri Western Cape and Agrimega still pop up too often for comfort.
The department fails on a grand scale with appointing people to improve service delivery to target groups like small-scale, upcoming and entry-level farmers. Numerous times money was reallocated to make good for losses due to theft. This raises questions about control measures.

Numerous TV and even radio licences are also cited as requiring extra money and R1.5 million is earmarked for nice-to-have corporate branded gear for staff and the printing of the annual report of the department, even though the Premier also provided money, which was not properly used – too much additional explaining and reviewing was needed about what is going on in the department.

†Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Speaker, It has been a great honour for the standing committee to be associated with a department which was ranked first in South Africa by the South African Institute of Government Auditors.

I think the Western Cape did exceptionally well there with nine of the first 20 departments. Also, of the 10 most consistent performing departments, seven of them were from the Western Cape. Therefore when we look at the fact that there are about 230 departments in South Africa, of which 44 are national, then we have certainly set the standard for South Africa.

I want to thank the Minister and his very capable staff, under the leadership of Joyene Isaacs, for the way they serve agriculture and everyone who is dependent on agriculture. They lead the country as far as agricultural education is concerned, as in other provinces agricultural education has declined drastically.

They lead as far as rural development and service to new farmers is concerned. Much of the money – and I think that hon Mbalo referred to that – goes to NGOs, for instance to Agri mega and so on, and they are very involved in this type of development.

The national government put a moratorium on Share Equity Schemes, but now the moratorium has been lifted and Gauteng already has seven such share equity farms going. So, there again, we are setting the national tone.

We are a bit concerned about the fact that money had to be taken away from research. Research underpins agricultural development, but in view of the problems with veterinary services and fact that the national veterinary services are very swiftly collapsing, it’s perhaps understandable.

The Western Cape will certainly have to think of greater investment in future in veterinary services. We should just realise how dependent our exports are on veterinary services, even the export of fruit, and should we have a foot- and-mouth disease outbreak in South Africa we can forget about exports. So these are extremely important services.

One of the things that has been a very pertinent move is that the entity Casidra has now had many of its non-agricultural functions taken away from it and, in future, it will also concentrate on development mainly aimed at formerly disadvantaged groups and rural development in poor areas.
We have had a very good association with the department. They have never re-
sented being heavily interrogated at times and as the standing committee we wish
to support this particular Vote. I thank you.

*The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Mr Speaker, I want to thank hon Walters for
his positive contribution. Thank you.

Debate concluded.

†The SPEAKER: We will now afford the representatives of the parties three
minutes’ opportunity to bid a farewell to the hon McKenzie.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Speaker, from this side of the House I wish hon
McKenzie everything of the very best for the future. Our acquaintance goes back
some 28 years to the early days of the House of Representatives, I, as a very
young official at the Table, and the hon member as a newly elected member of
that House.

*When that House in 1984 started its first session day, the then chairperson called
upon the first speaker of the House in a somewhat unconventional way. He started
with the words “Laatwaai!” [Laughter.] Hon McKenzie will recall this.

I must say during the past year here from the chair I have wondered many times
whether the hon McKenzie was not taking those words too literally, because he
often was guilty of “laatwaai-ing”.

On a more serious note, the hon member today is reaching the end of a long road.
It feels like just yesterday when that road began. Our House will be poorer after
today; we are going to miss the experience and witticisms. As a member of the
opposition in the House it has been your role and duty to keep the government on
its toes. This you have done with abandon, but always with the necessary respect
for the rules and conventions of this House – even though it often was on the
verge of what is decent and permissible.

The hon member knew how far he could go, because he respects Parliament as
institution. This is very important and it is something we sincerely appreciate. I
wish the hon member great success on the way forward. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

†The SPEAKER: Cope. Chance not taken.

An HON MEMBER: Nothing.

The SPEAKER: The ACDP. Chance not taken.[Interjections.]The ID. Chance not
taken. The ANC.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Speaker, thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: Chance not taken.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I’m sure you’d like that.
Mr Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity to wish Patrick McKenzie well with whatever he’s going to be doing. There has been a lot of speculation about what you’re going to be doing, but I’m very grateful that you have it in your heart as to what you are going to be doing.

Mr Speaker, I met Patrick McKenzie in the heady days of the beginning of this Legislature and this House has always been an incredibly robust House. I’ve always wondered about the stuff that Patrick and Peter Marais had to say. I’ve collected a set of funny quotes that we had at the beginning of the year.

I remember Patrick saying in the House at the time when Peter Marais said: “Lees die South en lieg saam” and Patrick McKenzie responded and turned to us in the ANC and said: “En julle lees die kommunistiese” … something or other … “en lieg saam”. Mr Speaker, at the time Willem Doman was ready to put the two of them out, but we came to their defence on that matter. It was robust, but very, very pleasant.

Patrick represented for us for a very long time somebody who was part of the oppressive regime. He came into the ANC and I remember that it almost felt like somebody who just wanted to turn around all that was wrong in our society. I’m very grateful for that, because I think it’s exactly that which builds a nation and gives us an opportunity to reconcile as opposites in many respects.

I served in the underground and in the MKNVA and you in another arena, but it’s we who put together this country and can make this country change. So I want to say Patrick, you’re an astute politician. I think new politicians can only learn from you. You’re clever and you are committed. You have passion for what you do and that is something we can all learn from you.

Carol and the boys, your sons and your daughter, will have you more often at home now and I think that’s the pleasure you have of just being part of that family. But you’ll always be a member of the family of the ANC and you’ll always be a member of the family of the Provincial Legislature and this provincial government. We know that you are not lost to the Western Cape and we know that you’ll just go into another realm.

So, thank you very much and we wish you well. We hope that we’ll see a book coming out of here with your memoirs of the Cape. I think it’s very different. I think the almost 20 years here have been very different to any other part or any other Legislature in this country. I think it’s this Legislature where there has been unity of purpose in doing the stuff we had to do, like fighting corruption and dealing with the issues of our people. So I hope a book comes out at some point.

While we are here, Patrick turns 60 on 8 December 2012. I also want to wish you a very happy birthday; you really look good. So, happy birthday, Patrick.[Applause.]  
†The SPEAKER: Hon McKenzie, I will also afford you three minutes to say goodbye to your colleagues.

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. It has been an honour and a privilege to be in this House. To every single member that has helped enrich my life, I want to say thank you very, very much.
I have fond memories. I won’t go down that road of what happened, but I remember I started in the management committee, the old system still, and I was there for about 14 years or so before I came to national Parliament. Right until today I’ve enjoyed every single moment of representing people. I have no regrets whatsoever and if there’s something that I can advise anyone, I think it is that there is no better calling than to serve the community. Someone said to me last night, “So you go out after all these years corruption-free.” One can say to a politician you can be free of corruption. People don’t need to pay you anything.

To my leader, Lynne Brown, I appreciate the fact that I could serve with you in Cabinet. I appreciate your style of truthfulness, not wanting to hide anything and the openness. I appreciate it. I want to thank hon Skwatsha, who was part of the negotiations to bring me into the ANC, and our caucus. It will end earlier now that I am no longer there. [Laughter.]

Even to the leading party and to the Premier: You have just been re-elected and I want to say that it’s an awesome responsibility and you are needed. More than 50% of the people of the Western Cape voted for you. Carry that responsibility with dignity.

I remember three things of the Premier: I remember her first interjection to me. Her first interjection was — in fact it caught me a little off guard, but reacted very quickly— was “You are so horizontal.” I remember that one.

The other thing I will remember, Premier, is your love for your children. I remember as parents both of us used to stand around the sports field at UCT and those places waiting on a Saturday afternoon for our children to complete their sports. We would speak about children’s value systems.

I remember, also, when our family went through a crisis when our son died, you were there and you attended the funeral too. We have never forgotten things like that. We appreciate that all of us can work together and I believe we can make the Western Cape and South Africa what it must be. I want to contribute to that and I believe every member here will contribute to that.

Thank you, Mr Speaker, it was wonderful to have been here. You’ll have less need to call for order. I noticed that today there were fewer “orders” when I was very quiet. The sessions will end earlier now. Thank you very, very much. [Applause.]

The House adjourned at 15:20.
The Speaker:


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development having undertaken a study visit to Canada from 28 September 2012 to 6 October 2012, begs to report as follows:

1. **Background**

The function of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development is primarily to play an oversight role over the Provincial Treasury, the Department of Economic Development and Tourism and the Department of Transport and Public Works in the Province. The Committee resolved to undertake a study visit to Canada to observe best practices abroad in the areas of economic development and tourism in British Columbia and Toronto.

**Canada** is a North American country consisting of ten provinces and three territories. Located in the northern part of the continent, it extends from the Atlantic to the Pacific and northward into the Arctic Ocean. Canada is the world’s second-largest country by total area, and its common border with the United States is the world’s longest land border. Canada is a federal state governed as a parliamentary democracy and a constitutional monarchy, with Queen Elizabeth II as its head of state.

The country is officially bilingual and multicultural at the federal level, with a population of approximately 33.4 million as of 2011. Canada’s advanced economy is one of the world’s largest and relies largely upon its natural resources and international trade, particularly with the United States, with which it has had a long and complex relationship. It performs favourably in international rankings of education, quality of life, government transparency, and economic freedom.

**British Columbia (BC)** is the westernmost of Canada's provinces. As well as being the westernmost province of Western Canada, British Columbia is also a component of the Pacific Northwest, along with the US states of Oregon and Washington. The capital of British Columbia is Victoria, the 15th largest metropolitan region in Canada, named for Canada's Queen at Confederation. The Province is currently governed by the BC Liberal Party, led by Premier Christy Clark, who became leader as a result of the party election on 26 February 2011.

Northern BC’s economic picture is expected to improve dramatically in the coming years as major projects get underway across a diverse range of sectors. Traditionally, northern BC has counted forestry, manufacturing, mining, fisheries and agriculture among its main economic drivers.
This picture is changing thanks to a dramatic increase in natural gas production in Northeast BC, and a global opportunity to manufacture and ship liquefied natural gas from terminals on the north coast.

BC’s mineral resources are also gaining new attention, as copper, gold, coal and other mineral projects are being explored and moved toward production throughout the region. The province’s main electricity utility, BC Hydro, is also building the Northwest transmission line, which will provide grid power to communities, mining and cleaning projects.

Traditionally rural BC communities have been responsible for more than 70% of the province’s export wealth. Nearly CAD$ 29 billion in resource exports are produced in rural BC. The amount of capital investment proposed for the region in the coming years will drive a need for thousands of new workers. There will be a great requirement for skilled workers and professionals in northern BC from other areas, which will ultimately drive indirect investment in service, supply, accommodation, real estate and tourism and entertainment sectors.

Toronto is the largest city in Canada and the provincial capital of Ontario. It is located in Southern Ontario on the northwestern shore of Lake Ontario. A relatively modern city, Toronto’s history dates back to the late 18th century. The city has 2.6 million residents, according to the 2011 Census. It is currently the fifth most populous city in North America. Toronto is at the heart of the Greater Toronto Area, and the densely populated region in Southern Ontario known as the Golden Horseshoe. Its cosmopolitan population reflects its role as an important destination for immigrants to Canada. Toronto is one of the world’s most diverse cities by percentage of non-native-born residents, with about 49% of the population born outside of Canada.

As Canada’s commercial capital, it is home to the Toronto Stock Exchange and the nation’s five largest banks. Toronto’s leading economic sectors include finance, business services, telecommunications, aerospace, transportation, media, arts, publishing, software production, medical research, education, tourism, and engineering.

2. The Delegation

Mr EJ von Brandis (DA) (Leader of the delegation)
Mr MC Walters (DA)
Mr AM Figlan (DA)
Ms T Mbalo (ANC)
Ms T Bevu (COPE)

The delegation was accompanied by Ms SA Niekerk, Committee Co-ordinator.

3. Programme

The delegation visited Victoria and Vancouver in BC and Toronto in Ontario and met with role-players in the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, Local and Provincial spheres of Government and their entities responsible for boosting economic development and tourism by the execution of various revitalization projects. The Committee also met with the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly in Ontario.
Meetings were scheduled from 1 October 2012 to 5 October 2012 as follows:

**Victoria**

**Monday, 1 October 2012**

Visit the Ministry of Community, and Rural Development - Victoria

- Mr Glen Brown, Executive Director
- Mr L Edwards, Director
- Ms Regan Purdy, Project Manager

Public Hearings: Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services – Vancouver

- Mr D Horne, Chairperson
- Ms M Elmore, Deputy Chairperson
- Mr G Coons, Member
- Mr M Dalton, Member
- Mr D Hayer, Member
- Mr J Les, Member
- Mr P Pimm, Member
- Mr B Ralston, Member
- Mr B Routley, Member
- Mr J Slater, Member

Dinner with the Members of the Select Standing Committee

**Vancouver**

**Tuesday, 2 October 2012**

Vancouver Convention Centre

- Ms Claire Smith, Vice-President Sales and Marketing
- Mr Ken Cretney, General Manager

Northern Development Trust Initiative

- Ms Janine North, Chief Executive Officer

City of Vancouver Municipality

- Mr Raymond Louis - Deputy Mayor
- Mr Peter Vaisbord – Co-ordinator Business Improvement Areas Programme
- Ms Lesley Matthews – Chief, External Relations and Protocol

**Wednesday, 3 October 2012**

Depart Vancouver to Toronto

**Toronto**
Thursday, 4 October 2012

Legislative Assembly of Ontario
- Honourable Dave Levac – Speaker
- Ms L Des Rosiers – Liaison Officer
- Members of the Standing Committee on Finance

Department of Tourism, Culture and Sport
- Mr Darryl Soshycki – Manager Tourism Policy
- Ms A Balzano – Protocol Officer

Toronto Distillery District Rejuvenation Project
- Mr Matthew Rosenblatt – Chief Executive Officer

Friday, 5 October 2012

Metro Toronto Convention Centre
- Mr Eric Chou – Sales Manager
- Mr Rahul Shah – Sales Manager

Toronto Waterfront Revitalisation Project
- Mr John Campbell – Chief Executive Officer
- Ms Gwen McIntosh – Director Toronto Waterfront Secretariat
- Mr Angus Cranston – Project Manager, Toronto and East York District
- Ms Shalin Yeboah – Development Manager

4. Visits

4.1 Ministry of Community and Rural Development- British Columbia
“Towns For Tomorrow Project”

4.1.1 Background

The Towns for tomorrow project was developed to address the unique challenges faced by smaller communities in British Columbia with respect to sustainability and meeting their infrastructure needs.

4.1.2 Findings

(a) The project aims to invest in those capital projects that will help achieve the province’s vision of vibrant, integrated, creative and prosperous communities. Projects are selected based on their contribution towards reducing community greenhouse gas emissions, their public and environmental health benefits and the creation of elderly-friendly and disability-friendly communities;

(b) While the project is focused on capital investment, capacity building investment will also be incorporated into the project in order to enhance a community’s ability to implement planning, management and governance structure. Applicants are encouraged to include capacity building in their application to ensure the ongoing sustainability of capital infrastructure;

(c) By providing small communities with funding assistance for the construction of new infrastructure, Towns for Tomorrow Project supports the Province of British Columbia’s goals of healthy living, sustainable environmental management and job creation;
(d) The project will provide funding to municipalities and regional district communities with populations up to 15,000. For communities with a population under 5,000, a cost-sharing formula applies of 80/20 – 80% provincial contribution, 20% local government contribution, with a maximum provincial contribution of CAD$400,000 for each approved project;

(e) Eligible applicants must be an incorporated municipality that has a population of 15,000 persons or less or a regional district submitting an application for a community that has a population of 15,000 persons or less. A community, for the purpose of application to the programme, is considered to be a settlement area within a regional district electoral area;

(f) Eligible projects must:
   (i) be for construction, renewal, expansion or material enhancement of community public infrastructure;
   (ii) not be started prior to application;
   (iii) be submitted by an eligible applicant who demonstrates that it will be able to own, operate and maintain the resulting infrastructure over the long term;
   (iv) stipulate a construction completion date;
   (v) be duly authorised by a resolution of the applicant’s Municipal Council or Regional District Board;
   (vi) be Consistent with the planning practices and guidelines of British Columbia; and
   (vii) meet the requirements of all applicable federal and provincial legislation;

(g) Eligible projects include, but are not limited to the following projects, water, waste water, public transit, environmental energy improvement, local roads, cultural, recreation, tourism and protective and emergency services and community development projects;

(h) The Province of British Columbia raises funding by income tax, tariffs, sales tax, liquor control board and gambling tax. There are 444 municipalities in BC and the biggest share of funding emanates from property rates and taxes bearing in mind that some municipalities are large in area but small in population;

(i) The fact that the Province raises its own funds and also receives a share of national income means that financial support to municipalities is more devolved upon the provincial government than is locally the case. It is also in control of many aspects, eg. policing, which are national competencies in South Africa; and

(j) The fact that the Province has control over the natural resources and not the Federal Government, does provide and simplify many of the development aspects. The overlapping areas of jurisdiction are that the province controls the coast line and sea bottom while the Federal Government controls the ocean. This makes the management of marine resources complex.

4.1.3 Recommendations

(a) It is standard practice to reward good governance and the Western Cape should incorporate this into its policies;

(b) The attention paid to the needs of small communities is exemplary. The Western Cape Government should encourage the even-handed attention of municipalities to the needs of villages which could sometimes be subordinated to the demands of the large towns; and
(c) At present, national control of marine resources is failing to promote the economic development which could flow from this source. The provincial Department of Agriculture should exert itself to have the responsibility for sea fisheries assigned to it.

4.2 Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services of the Legislative Assembly of British Columbia – Public Hearings

4.2.1 Background

The delegation attended public hearings on the 2013 Budget Consultation Paper. The Select Committee on Finance and Government Services consulted with British Columbians about their priorities for the forthcoming provincial budget.

4.2.2 Findings

(a) Individuals, groups and organisations were encouraged to provide input either in writing, on-line or in person;
(b) Where witnesses appear in person before the Committee, they were advised to reserve speaking time. They were provided with a 15 minute time slot that included 10 minutes to address the Committee followed by 5 minutes for questions from Committee members. These rules were strictly adhered to; and
(c) Following the presentation, a verbatim transcript of the meeting is posted on the Parliamentary website for public consumption.

4.2.3 Recommendations

(a) Such prior consultation on budgets with stakeholders has not been the practice for Standing Committees of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.
(b) The strict procedure followed in which stakeholders prepare themselves for a ten minute presentation followed by five minutes of questions is perhaps a technique which could be considered by Departments when assessing the needs of their stakeholders; and
(c) The posting of stakeholder inputs and questions asked on the Parliamentary website presents a further approach to transparency and public awareness.

4.3 Vancouver Convention Centre

4.3.1 Background

The Vancouver Convention Centre has been in operation since 1987. The executive team soon realised that they were losing much business as larger groups wanted to meet in Vancouver. A decision was then taken to expand the convention centre.

4.3.2 Findings

(a) The convention centre is 40% built over water and it is the only platinum certified convention centre in the world today;
(b) Expansion was a CAD 830 million investment shared by the Province, Federal Government and a small amount from tourism partners, primarily through the hotel tax;
(c) The convention centre is located in the downtown core Vancouver area and it borders closely on the sea wall walkway allowing pedestrians easy access;
(d) Events held throughout the year include congresses and exhibitions while weddings and community events provide further income. The convention centre was also the broadcast centre for the Olympic Games in 2010. The Olympics afforded the convention centre with an opportunity to show the world that Vancouver could host big events;
(e) The convention centre has embarked upon a campaign to involve the community in order for them to have a sense of ownership and have input on the expansion;
(f) The convention centre represents the government of BC when they bid internationally for a specific event; and
(g) Their biggest competitors are Montreal, Toronto and Seattle.

4.3.3 Recommendations

(a) The Convention Centre makes the most of its unique setting. Re-planning and extension of the Cape Town International Convention Centre (CTICC) should strive to emulate this, possibly with views of Table Mountain, the harbour and the expansion of the canal water link to the Victoria and Alfred Waterfront as well as the expanded footprint; and
(b) The CTICC is well-known to practitioners in Canada and seen as a prime competitor for international events. Every effort should be made to maximize the aesthetic aspects thereof.

4.4 Northern Development Trust Initiative

4.4.1 Background

The Northern Development Trust Initiative (Northern Development) was established in November 2004 by the government of British Columbia to provide economic development opportunities for central and northern British Columbia.

The trust partners with municipalities, regional districts, First Nations (American Tribes), non-profit organisations and businesses to develop and maintain critical grant, loan and other programmes that sustainably dispense funding to high value projects that support community and economic development.

4.4.2 Findings

(a) Northern Development works to raise the profile of central and northern BC in an effort to attract new residents, workers and investors to the region, and to facilitate the growth of manufacturers and suppliers in the region, thus enabling local economic growth associated with major resource developments and infrastructure projects;
(b) The trust has committed CAD$ 10 million to 1000 approved projects since its inception, has created 5154 jobs and has teamed up with 1778 funding partners to attract more than CAD 1 billion in new funding in the region. The trust has also invested 74% in communities with less than 5000 people;
(c) Northern Development works with 40 communities, 8 regional districts and 88 first nations. There are 13 Board Members and the Board works independently from government;
(d) The trust covers 70% of the province and a population base of 375,000 people. Money in the trust is invested in a balanced portfolio of equities and funds and the income from this is spent in the communities and in business;

(e) The largest community is 85,000 people and the smallest is 400 people and every community has different unique opportunities on how it can grow its own economy;

(h) Part of what they do is build capacity in the region. Every community gets an annual grant of CAD$ 35,000 for economic development. The trust employs writers to work with communities where they will pay 75% of the cost. This person will spend four months just writing grant applications for the community so that they can reach out to funding sources. There are many funding sources available but it is very hard to have access to these sources;

(i) The community revitalisation programme provides CAD$ 20,000 for communities to build a good business plan to attract government money in the form of infrastructure. The trust will enter into agreement with the community council, who in turn enters an agreement with the developer. The trust will give the developer a guarantee that when the building is ready for the occupancy permit, they will give an amount equal to ten years of taxes to the developer up front at that point. Because they have this written contract with the trust, developers are able to go to their bank at the beginning of the project with more equity up front;

(j) In Northern Western BC there is no power transmission and you cannot have economic development without power transmission and infrastructure. The communities, the first nations, mining companies and the suppliers got together with the trust and worked as a group to advocate for the new transmission line which is 450 km long. The federal government committed to providing CAD$ 150 million if it would reduce the number of communities that do not have power as well as stimulate a growing mining industry. The provincial government also assisted. A pool of money can mobilise a region if they feel a level of control and if the project is operated by a non-bureaucratic corporation with much integrity;

(k) The trust is governed by the Northern Development Initiative Trust Amendment Act, 2005; and

(l) The trust employs four to six university graduates (commerce) each year and teaches them, as part of a 6-month practical programme, how to work in community economic development. Interns are paid CAD$ 20,000 for the six months. The training focuses on developing a website for the community, writing grant applications, sourcing funding and promoting business.

4.4.3 Recommendations

(a) The trust is prepared to partner with South Africa in training commerce university graduates in Canada for the intern period of 6 months. This should be considered by the Department of Economic Development and Tourism; and

(b) The Minister of Economic Development and Tourism must seriously consider aspects of the Northern Development Trust Initiative for incorporation in the economic development strategy of the Province. The Independent Development Trust (IDT) in South Africa is involved in similar approaches at a national level. By interacting with the IDT the Department of Economic Development and Tourism could facilitate similar developments in our remote rural communities.
4.5 Business Improvement Area (BIA) Programme

4.5.1 Background
The BIA is a specially funded district managed and promoted by a non-profit association of commercial property owners and business tenants. The owners and businesses join together to improve the economic vitality of their business district.

4.5.2 Findings

(a) The city assists by helping interested groups to establish BIA’s. BIA funds are used to hire full or part time staff, retain services and expertise, and implement BIA activities. The city has a continuing role assisting with contacts between the BIA and city departments, facilitating the annual funding process, and monitoring BIA budgets;

(b) BIA’s play an important role in business promotion, tourism development, safety and security and street enhancement for their areas;

(c) A BIA can effectively organise and finance area maintenance and improvement programmes that are beyond the capability of individual businesses and most merchant associations. BIA’s are also important city partners in area planning and revitalisation initiatives;

(d) BIA’s obtain funding through an annual property tax levy. Only industrial or commercial properties may be assessed, and the BIA is limited to a renewable term, usually 5-7 years. Every year, the city collects the tax and remits the entire amount to the BIA to carry out projects and programmes;

(e) Annual budgets for BIAs in Vancouver range from $80 000 to over $2 million and the number of businesses represented ranges from 200 to 8 000;

(f) Each property owner’s share of the annual BIA budget is proportionate to their share of the total taxable commercial value within the BIA boundaries. The average BIA levy is about 5 percent of an owner’s commercial property taxes. In most lease agreements, property owners pass this cost proportionally to the business tenants;

(g) BIA’s are managed by registered non-profit societies similar to merchant associations. All commercial property owners and business tenants in the BIA area are eligible for membership in the BIA society. The BIA society is governed by a volunteer Board of Directors that is elected by its membership. Every year at the BIA’s Annual General Meeting, the Board proposes a business promotion plan and a budget that the members approve before the City adds the BIA levy. Most BIA’s employ a full or part-time co-ordinator to help implement and manage the association’s activities;

(h) BIA formation is initiated at the request of a BIA sponsor group representing area merchants and landlords. The sponsor group consults extensively with area property owners and businesses;

(i) The consultation process includes open meetings attended by the City’s BIA programme co-ordinator. The group identifies issues and priorities, develops a BIA proposal and budget and builds support for the proposal;

(j) To assist with outreach and budgeting planning, the City provides a list of property owners with a calculation of the likely levy on each property based on a proposed total budget. When assured of broad support, the sponsor group provides documentation of its activities and requests the City to commence a ‘council iniative’;
If the initiative is approved, the City delivers formal BIA notifications to all affected property owners and businesses, with instructions on filing objections. The City Council will generally not approve a BIA if objections are filed by more than one third of the property owners, representing one third of the commercial assessed value, or by one third of the businesses, counted separately; and

If the BIA is approved, the Council enacts by-laws to establish the BIA, boundaries and term, to set a cap on the total levy over the BIA term, and to attach conditions on the transfer of levy funds to the BIA. A registered non-profit society must be established before the City BIA by-laws can be enacted and levy funds remitted. Existing merchants associations with registered status may qualify by amending their constitution and by-laws.

### 4.5.3 Recommendations

(a) The BIA approach is successful as evidenced in the visits to such areas, formally degraded, but now evincing the character of upmarket, outwardly facing (storefronts at the periphery and not internally) malls. These are attractive to clients, security is guaranteed and businesses take pride in maintaining the appearance and quality of their premises and products;

(b) The BIA approach is recommended for investigation and implementation by the City of Cape Town in the many old and degraded business areas of the old city around the CBD and deployment in adapted form into the peripheral townships;

(c) The principles of BIA developments in which property tax levies and associations of business owners work together could also, with advantage, be deployed within some of the larger towns in the Province;

(d) The BIA concept could find effective application within the Cape Metropole as a method to rejuvenate run-down business areas and instill a renewed spirit of entrepreneurship in small business owners and pride in collaborating in making the neighbourhood attractive to clients. This could also be of special significance if linked to residential upgrading and densification in the vicinity of envisaged BIA; and

(e) The creation of a BIA unit within the City structure under the leadership of a BIA Co-ordinator tasked with assisting interested groups in identified areas to launch and effectively maintain such undertakings.

### 4.6 Ontario Legislative Assembly

#### 4.6.1 Background

The Legislative Assembly in Ontario is unicameral, having one Legislative Chamber. The federal government in Ottawa is bicameral and has two Legislative Chambers; the House of Commons, known as the Lower House, comprised of elected Members of Parliament, and the Senate, known as the Upper House. Canadian Senators are not elected, rather they are appointed by the Prime Minister. The Senate introduces legislation that is not of a monetary nature and has the right to reject or amend legislation passed by the House of Commons. The delegation met with the Speaker and briefly with members of the Standing Committee on Provincial Public Accounts, Finance and Economic Affairs to discuss the legislative process and public participation.
The delegation also visited the legislature chamber where a boisterous plenary session was in progress and received a warm welcome from the Members of the House when introduced by the Speaker.

4.6.2 Findings

(a) The Legislature has 425 employees and a budget of CAD 300 million;
(b) The impartiality of the Speaker is a deeply entrenched feature of parliamentary democracy, although at present in the Ontario Legislative Assembly, the Speaker is not required to give up his or her Party membership. The Speaker remains impartial in the Chair as a long-established principle;
(c) Outside the House, the Speaker refrains from participating in partisan activities, and does not attend Caucus meetings. Inside the Chamber, to underscore the Speaker's non-partisan position, the Speaker does not participate in debates. For similar reasons, the Speaker does not vote, except in the case of a tie. He however fulfils his duties as a constitutional head;
(d) In Ontario, a general election is held on a set date every four years. The Legislature is dissolved 28 days prior to an election day. All provinces have the system where the candidate winning the most votes in each electoral district is the winner, regardless if this is less than 50% of the votes cast;
(e) When it appears that the rights and privileges of the House may have been infringed, as guardian of these rights and privileges, the Speaker, takes steps to see these are protected;
(f) Bills are introduced during the Routine Proceeding Introduction of Bills, Monday to Thursday when the House is in Session. Members are invited to provide a brief introduction for their public bills. Private Members usually present the bill's explanatory note. Ministers introducing government bills often make their remarks later during Ministerial Statements. Following introduction, the bill is printed in English and French and made available to the public on the Assembly's Internet Site;
(g) The Second Reading gives Members an opportunity to debate and vote on the principle of the bill. Time for debate is set out in the Standing Orders. Government bills are debated during Orders of the Day, Monday to Thursday;
(h) The Committee stage is an opportunity to call witnesses, examine the bill in detail and make amendments. Committees may travel to facilitate witness testimony and learn more about the issues. After the witnesses have been heard, the bill is examined clause-by-clause, during which time any amendments are voted on;
(i) Once the parts of the bill have been considered, the committee votes on the bill as a whole, and whether to report it to the House;
(j) Third Reading is the final stage of a bill's consideration in the House, when Members decide whether the bill will be passed. Debate at this stage focuses on the final form of the bill. A Bill by the Legislature requires the assent of the Sovereign (or her representative). Royal Assent takes place in the House or in the chambers of the Lieutenant Governor. The Office of Legislative Counsel then assigns a chapter number to what has become an Act and it is posted on the Ministry of the Attorney General's website;
(k) The Delegation also observed that children, in the capacity of messengers in the House, sat at the feet of the Speaker, waiting for a Member to indicate that he needs assistance or has a message for a fellow member. It was also striking that when the Speaker stands up, so does the children. These learners serve for a specified period and are replaced by further relays of children. This introduces them to the functioning of the legislative process;
(l) The Speaker is accountable to a body called the Board of Internal Economy (BOIE), which establishes, implements and controls financial policies applicable to the Legislative Assembly of Ontario and all offices and departments of the Office of the Assembly;

(m) The Board is composed of the Speaker, a commissioner that the Lieutenant Governor in Council appoints from among the members of the Executive Council, a commissioner that the caucus of each recognized party, other than Government, appoints from among its members and a number of commissioners that the government caucus appoints from among its members;

(n) The Speaker is the Chairperson and a non-voting member of the Board;

(o) The Board operates in a non-partisan manner and each Board Member sits in his or her capacity as a Member of the Legislative Assembly of Ontario, and not as a representative of either the Executive Council or his or her party caucus;

(p) The Board, among its specific powers and duties reviews and assesses the estimates of the Office of the Assembly, reviews and approves supply requirements of the Offices of the Auditor General, the Ombudsman, the Chief Electoral Officer, the Office of the Integrity Commissioner, the Information and Privacy Commissioner, the Environmental Commissioner and the Provincial Advocate for Children and Youth, reviews and approves the budgets of each select and standing committee of the House, approves the organization, staff establishment and administrative policies of the Office of the Assembly, advises and gives direction on any matter the Board considers necessary for the operation of the Office of the Assembly, determines and provides allowances to the recognized party caucuses, establishes and reviews all matters related to allowances and services for Members of the Legislative Assembly and staff salaries; and

(q) The Board is given authority to report on any matter within its powers and duties to the Assembly. The Speaker does not have the right to vote.

4.6.3 Recommendation

(a) There are many parallels between the functioning of the legislature in Ontario and the Western Cape. The federal nature of Canada does however appear to allow greater autonomy in legislative approval although there are certain areas of exclusive national competence. The institution of a Board of Internal Economy encompasses many of the functions envisaged by management of our own Provincial Parliament. The Board of Internal Economy should be examined for aspects worthy of being emulated.

4.7 Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport - Ontario

4.7.1 Background

Ontario is Canada's leading domestic tourism region. It is the number one employer of young people in the province and the largest seasonal employer. An important community builder, tourism contributes significantly to Ontario’s economic and cultural strength.
4.7.2 Findings

(a) Resource-based tourism activities are particularly important for the Northern Ontario economy. Attractions include nature parks, fishing, hunting, boating, cultural performances, historic sites, museums, sports events, casinos and festivals;

(b) Agencies, better known as entities in South Africa, are created by legislation or regulation and perform a public function or service for the benefit of the people of Ontario. The Ministry has 19 agencies with a wide range of legislated mandates. The agencies act as economic and social catalysts as they draw local, domestic and international visitors year-round, employ full-time, part-time and seasonal staff and contribute significantly to local economies;

(c) Community leaders also participate in destination planning, joint marketing initiatives, educational programming and promoting career choices in tourism;

(d) A Tourism competitive study was undertaken in 2009 and this determined that the industry would be more competitive with a more coordinated, focused approach involving the establishment of regional tourism organisations. 13 Regions were established and funded. Each of the 13 tourism regions is headed by an incorporated independent, industry-led, non-profit Regional Tourism Organisation (RTO);

(e) The key responsibilities of the RTO include developing strategic plans, product marketing, workforce development, investment attraction and relationship building;

(f) The Ontario Tourism Marketing Partnership Corporation (OTMPC) collaborates with tourism partners locally and internationally to develop and deliver exciting, integrated, research-driven marketing programmes that reinforce Ontario as a strong tourism economy and a premier, four season travel destination; and

(g) OTMPC works strategically with the tourism industry to market Ontario’s tourism experiences and leverage multi-year marketing opportunities and investments in key markets.

4.7.3 Recommendation

(a) A better integrated resource based tourism activity basket could be designed for the Western Cape, which should include all our heritage nature conservation, scenic, marine and other resources. While funding will be a constraint, regional tourism organisations linked to our local equivalent of the OTMPC should help to expand the key role of tourism in the Western Cape. The serious examination of present structures relative to the resources in private and state entities should be a priority.

4.8 The Distillery

4.8.1 Background

Nearly 10 years ago a group of developers had a dream where they looked at a derelict collection of Victorian Industrial buildings, the Distillery, that had been pronounced a national historic site and imagined transforming it.
Not into another "historic district" or "pioneer village" but into something exciting and unique where people could experience new ideas, new foods, new designs and new ways of living and working.

They went to great lengths in the restoration process to repurpose original materials and brilliantly blend them with today's modern materials and green technologies.

4.8.2 Findings

(a) The Distillery is a dramatic fusion of old and new. An inspired blend of Victorian Industrial architecture and 21st century design and creativity;
(b) The Distillery Historic District opened in 2003 and today it is widely regarded as Canada’s premier arts, culture and entertainment destination;
(c) The delegation was very impressed by the way in which a formerly derelict industrial area has been transformed into a destination of which any City could be proud. A plethora of crafts, skills, recreational and gourmet presentations are housed in authentic feeling, traditional premises; and
(d) It is also clear that the visionary and dedicated approach of the developers was highly effective as the Distillery provided an attractive public centre for apartment buildings housing several thousand occupants which were being erected around the development.

4.8.3 Recommendations

(a) The Distillery provides an appropriate model for any city seriously considering the restoration of derelict and degraded neighbourhoods. Such areas exist in close proximity to the CBD and should be examined as to areas where derelict industrial complexes can be converted into bustling attractive commercial centres harbouring small entrepreneurs surrounded by housing developments which could make use of such centres. Once identified, developers with the necessary sensitivity should be encouraged to become involved; and
(b) Should there be a decision to investigate this possibility, the Standing Committee would like to recommend that someone such as Mr Matthew Rosenblatt be invited to Cape Town to assess the possibilities. He is the driver behind the Distillery development and surrounding residential component.

4.9 Metro Toronto Convention Centre

4.9.1 Background

The Toronto Convention Centre is a convention complex located in downtown Toronto, Ontario at 255 Front Street West. The property is owned by Oxford Properties. The Convention Centre is operated by the Metropolitan Toronto Convention Centre Corporation (MTCC), an independent agency of the Government of Ontario.
4.9.2 Findings

(a) All staff are employed by the Provincial Government and the President of the Convention Centre reports to the Chairperson of the Board who must account to the provincial authorities for the expenditure of funds;

(b) The MTCC has 56,000 m² of space, and is home to the 1330 seat John Bassett Theatre. To the east end of the complex is the 586-room InterContinental Toronto Centre hotel. At the West end of the complex is a 265,000 square foot Class-B office building.

Within the office building is the Baton Rouge restaurant, which was formerly a Planet Hollywood from 1996 to 2006. A south building containing exhibition space is located south of the rail lines, on Bremner Boulevard;

(c) The centre is connected to the Union Station railway and transit station through the Skywalk footbridge, and is also accessible via the underground PATH system. The centre is also connected by the Skywalk system to the nearby Rogers Centre and large conventions or exhibitions will sometimes also use it as an additional venue;

(d) The Convention Centre and hotel was completed in 1984, built by CN Real Estate. In 1995, ownership was transferred to Canada Lands Corporation, an agency of the Government of Canada;

(e) The Convention Centre has hosted many large scale events over the years. The G-20 summit was held at the centre in 2010. It was the same venue for the 14th G7 summit held in 1988. It has also hosted the XVI International AIDS Conference in 2006 and it played host to Toronto auditions for So You Think You Can Dance Canada and Canadian Idols;

(f) The Convention Centre has hosted 15,000 events and had 40 million visitors since opening in 1984. Direct spending by related to conventions and exhibitions is estimated at $4.7 billion since opening, and $523.7 million in the 2011–12 financial year of the centre; and

(g) The staff are very aware of the Cape Town International Convention Centre (CTICC) and mentioned that they had lost a bid to host an International Congress to Cape Town.

4.9.3 Recommendations

(a) The CTICC competes with many international convention centres and the expansion of its precinct should be expedited;

(b) The Toronto Convention Centre has vast floor space which allows it to host vast international exhibitions. When expanding the CTICC, the need for such floor space should receive serious attention; and

(c) The accessibility of the Toronto Convention Centre to public transport is a huge plus and while the CTICC has large parking areas, access from rail and bus terminals should receive attention.

4.10 Toronto Waterfront Project

4.10.1 Background

For decades, Toronto has had numerous starts and stops with redeveloping its waterfront, and it is one of the last major waterfront cities to redevelop its waterfront. Over the years, there have been many people with good intentions and ideas about what to do with Toronto’s waterfront.
Numerous studies have been published and major redevelopment has taken place. One exception is Harbour front Centre, Queen’s Quay Terminal and the area around it which were the result of one effort to redevelop the area in the early 1970s. However it took another 20 years for serious and committed action to take place to revitalize Toronto’s waterfront. Waterfront Toronto is a result of that support and commitment.

4.10.2 Findings

(a) Three orders of Government established a task force in the late 1990s to examine redeveloping Toronto’s waterfront and to make recommendations;

(b) A leading recommendation was to establish an independent agency to lead redevelopment and be the master planner for redeveloping Toronto’s waterfront;

(c) Waterfront Toronto was established in 2001 by the three spheres of Government to oversee all aspects of the planning and development of Toronto’s central waterfront;

(d) Revitalization is overseen, led and implemented by Waterfront Toronto, a tri-government entity, supported by the governments of Canada, the Province of Ontario and the city of Toronto;

(e) A primary objective of waterfront revitalization is to leverage the infrastructure project to deliver key economic and social benefits that will enable Toronto to compete aggressively with other top tier global cities for investment, jobs and people;

(f) When Waterfront Toronto was established, the three spheres of government each committed CAD 500 million in seed capital to enable the organization to begin the revitalization process;

(g) The vast majority of the waterfront land is owned by the governments and they also gave the organization control over their land;

(h) To facilitate the revitalization program, Waterfront Toronto works with public and private partners who buy the land for development. Land is tendered competitively, where development partners are chosen based on their ability to meet and deliver on a comprehensive list of criteria;

(i) Waterfront Toronto’s funding model leverages the public capital by working with private development partners who buy the land for development, and the money earned is used to further fund public infrastructure;

(j) Toronto’s waterfront revitalization is the largest urban renewal project in North America and one of the largest waterfront redevelopment efforts ever undertaken in the world;

(k) The under-utilised land is being transformed into vibrant showcase communities that will be home to 40,000 new homes, and 40,000 new jobs;

(l) It will take 25 years to build-out the waterfront at an approximate cost of CAD 34 billion;

(m) Some of the challenges that are faced include the coordination of the three levels of government, financial constraints, physical constraints, including soil contamination from previous industrial activity that needs to excavated and treated, the lack of servicing and infrastructure to the area and flood proofing as a prerequisite for any development;
The goal of the project is to reconnect people with the waterfront. We are creating vital and inclusive waterfront neighbourhoods by developing communities that include a complementary mix of residences, commercial and retail space, and public spaces for all to enjoy;

These neighbourhoods will be sought after as a place to live, work, learn and play. It’s where families can stroll to the corner store, where children have a nearby park to play in, and where people will be able to work near where they live;

Waterfront Toronto’s approach is revitalisation and not just redevelopment. They are creating a new model for smart city building;

Waterfront Toronto Develops comprehensive master plans for and includes planning the necessary infrastructure to support sustainable mixed-use communities: transit, parks and public spaces, seeks rezoning and all other required approvals, including environmental approvals;

Since inception, Waterfront Toronto has been committed to effective, open, transparent two-way communication and engagement with the public;

Consultation is a legitimate part of the decision-making process, effective consultation occurs early in the decision-making process. Those consulted have differing views and this diversity is encouraged and respected. Consultation is coordinated with the three governments to avoid duplication and where necessary to comply with legislative requirements;

Waterfront Toronto’s approach is based on smart planning principles and working in synch with market realities. It means phased development based on market absorption, public investments in strategic infrastructure, and a master plan that provides developer certainty and an equitable partnership that shares risks appropriately;

Waterfront Toronto undertakes the upfront development work to address the infrastructure issues that have been the long standing and historic obstacles to unlocking waterfront lands; and

Their model has proven to be successful on the waterfront. To date, Waterfront Toronto has concluded public and private sector development deals valued at over CAD 2 billion. Their work has unlocked more than CAD10 billion in potential development value.

4.10.3 Recommendations

While the Western Cape and Cape Town does not have a similar large underdeveloped waterfront area as Toronto, the principles involved in the development are valid and could be deployed in smaller areas along our coastline. In this respect areas of the False Bay coastline present possibilities which should be considered;

The Victoria and Alfred Waterfront is known in Toronto and considerable expertise must exist locally. An assessment thereof and how it could be further deployed locally should be conducted by the Department of Economic Development and Tourism; and

The involvement of the three spheres of government in establishing an entity to drive development provides an opportunity to concentrate three sources of funding in a single entity to drive critical undertakings. This is an aspect which could be pursued by the Department of Economic Development and Tourism, even in fields divorced from waterfront development.
5. Acknowledgements

The delegation wishes to express its gratitude to the Speaker and Parliament for permission to undertake this highly interesting visit. The contribution of Mr James Retief and Ms Shirley Lucas, who interacted with the South African Embassy in Ottawa and the Department of International Relations and Cooperation in Pretoria, was considerable. The Committee also wishes to thank Mr Maseko from the Department of International Relations and Cooperation and Ms Marga de Villiers from the mission office in Canada for their professionalism, guidance and assistance in setting up the meetings.
The House met at 10:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS—see p. 6794

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport)

†The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Mr Speaker, this government has pioneered behavioural economics and choice architecture. It is clear that if we want to significantly reduce the dependency on the state we need to invest in behavioural change.

This government is also committed to evidence-based practice. In this regard we have identified the comprehensive after-school programme as one of the pilot projects for the behavioural change project.

Expected outcomes of the comprehensive after-school programme:

To improve school discipline and learning outcomes;
Increase school attendance;
Reduce the risk of youth involvement in crime;
Reduce teenage pregnancy;
Increase mass participation;
Improve healthy lifestyles; and
Reduce substance abuse.

Mr Speaker, to facilitate the above, an amount of R400 000 was transferred to Vote 1 for the behavioural change project. During my budget speech I indicated that I cannot overemphasise the important role libraries play in contributing to a literate society, a society that can make informed decisions, participate in democracy and contribute to economic growth.

I further indicated support to the literacy drive, and in order to contribute towards improving educational outcomes the library services will continue to supply library material to 340 library centres throughout the Western Cape. The department has in the interim received an amount of R561 000 for revenue retention, which we placed against the item Purchase of Library Books, thus augmenting the purchases of new books.

Mr Speaker, the department has also received R1,5 million from the Provincial Revenue Fund towards the staging of the Eight Nations U20 Football Tournament that was held in Cape Town earlier this year. This prestigious biennial sporting event showcases emerging soccer talent from around the world by bringing together the best young soccer players from eight countries to compete against each other. Participating teams were from South Africa, Ghana, the Republic of Cameroon, Nigeria, Kenya, Brazil, Argentina and Japan.
†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, I want to confirm that the ACDP supports the Part Appropriation. We are particularly pleased about the R561 000 that has been allocated in respect of library book purchases. We welcome that and we thank the department.

†Ms J WITBOOI: Mr Speaker, the ANC considers it of utmost importance that the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport’s budget increase of R1,661 million is used to unlock the talents of and broaden the sporting opportunities for the youth of the province to make the Western Cape much more inclusive of our peoples’ diversity.

Special emphasis must be placed on improving the lives of young people from disadvantaged areas whom were dealt a severe blow by the apartheid legacy. This must be done in line with national performance measures. Following this budget increase, the people of the Western Cape should not be witnessing the department’s failure to improve the quality of sporting opportunities at disadvantaged schools.

Mr Speaker, the regression in key areas experienced in the 2011-12 financial year should not be repeated. Monies must be utilised to increase the number of schools participating in the MOD programmes. More volunteer sports administrators and technical officials must receive training.

Non profit institutions that operate on a shoestring budget, but which provide sporting and recreational opportunities to our youth outside of school, must not see their funding being cut by the department.

Mr Speaker, it is therefore sad that R2,760 million of the sport and recreation budget is being taken away from non profit institutions. The ANC cannot support this shifting of funds from the struggling community-based organisations that provide a sanctuary to our youth in areas affected by social ills.

We emphasise these recommendations because this House is well aware of the instances of regression by this department in the 2011-12 financial year. Examples of this regression are: The number of volunteer sport administrators decreased from 489 in the previous year to 126. After 196 technical officials received training in 2010-2011, the department only managed to train 128 in the 2011-12 financial year.

We hope that with this increased budget MEC Meyer will not again reduce the number of projects aimed at actively developing previously marginalised indigenous languages. It was unfortunate to discover that in the 2011-12 financial year that the department reduced the number of these projects to two from seven in the previous year.

The ANC will monitor the programme for changing behaviour that is vested in the Premier’s department and to which this department will also be contributing.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, I would like to take this opportunity to thank the members of the committee for their participation over the year and to wish them well for the festive season. The DA supports this Part Appropriation.
The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Mr Speaker, thank you to the members who took part in the debate.

Debate concluded.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works)

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me begin by thanking the chairman of the appropriate standing committee. He’s committed, he’s knowledgeable, he’s interested, he’s involved and we enjoy our interactions with him and his committee.

Also, sincere thanks to my Head of Department and my Chief Financial Officer and his staff for the outstanding – and continually outstanding – work they do.

The Adjusted Estimate is very straightforward in this department. In terms of the column, Rollovers, it is R29 000: That is, in fact, from the rates conditional grants which was billed to one of the municipalities and arrived late.

There are no unforeseeable or unavoidable items, virements or shifts within the programmes. There is a total amount of R23,5 million that was shifted between the various departments. This must be expected in a department such as this that has a very high discretionary spending and a very low staff percentage. Therefore it’s to be expected that there will be those kinds of changes.

The only really significant thing, Mr Speaker, is in respect of other adjustments and that deals, importantly, with the purchase and sale of immovable assets. This has always been a problem, because it is extremely difficult to time those purchases and sales exactly within financial years.

There are just too many things that happen and there are too many parts of the process that are outside the department’s control, so the main item in respect of other adjustments is R135 million. That was set aside for the purchase of a building for our staff accommodation. For various reasons, largely to do with the purchase of a peculiar business, actually, we were not able to carry that through in this financial year and so R135 million goes, as it were, back to Treasury.

This then leads to a second and very important development and that is that in future, money for the purchase and sale of immovable assets will, in fact, be held in the Asset Reserve in Treasury and no longer in my department, so that when we purchase a building, for instance, Treasury will pay for that out of the Asset Reserve and these situations will not arise in the future.

Out of the total amount returned, as it were, to Treasury, R50 million was held back and that will be used for roads. I am pleased to tell the House that in addition to the other goals that we have set ourselves, both in respect of maintenance and deaths on the road, public transport changes, etc, the maintenance backlog for roads is fast being reduced and our roads are in good shape.
Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP has some concerns relating to the Adjustment Appropriations of the Department of Transport and Public Works, primarily the savings that are occurring as a result of the slow filling of posts.

This is nothing new; it was also reported in last year’s annual report. This constraint was listed as there being limited in-house specialist expertise to formulate policies.

What’s happening now is that six months down the line into this financial year the challenge continues with, from what my calculation showed, R2 million reflecting as the slow filling of posts. Some R2,7 million is now going to be allocated for external specialist expertise to be drafted in to enhance a consultant register system to develop a Supply Chain Management Preferential Procurement Policy and update the immovable asset register.

The drafting of a provincial transport law is going to cost R2,2 million for external expertise and one wonders whether the department is going to be gaining from that experience in terms of a skills transfer to in-house expertise. Surely, Mr Deputy Speaker, this kind of action isn’t sustainable in the long term. It might work in the short term, but it’s not going to work for the department in the long term if there isn’t a transfer of skills to the department.

We’re also concerned about the fact that in the community-based programmes R3,4 million is being diverted in terms of the Extended Public Works Programme Co-Ordination and Compliance Monitoring. That also remains a concern for the ACDP as we move into this Adjustments Appropriation.

We’re concerned about these things, Mr Deputy Speaker, and we would like the Minister’s reassurance that skills will be transferred to grow the in-house expertise in respect of this department in the year ahead.

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, the cut of more than R110 million from the budget of this vital service delivery department is a disaster. In fact, it reflects poorly on the department which is struggling to meet its targets, has had a very poor report from the Auditor-General, who had to save it from an adverse finding, and has huge challenges with infrastructure in poor condition and in need of urgent attention.

The last annual report shows roads, clinics, hospitals and schools are fast deteriorating. The department gives away R65 million that was destined for buildings and other fixed structures, yet it is one of the first to give up money as it becomes clear that it is unable to pace and expend its budget. The department suffers due to huge staff shortages and skills, yet it gives up more than R21 million as it cannot fill positions.

The department cut community-based programmes targeting poor people by close to R1 million, but then donates a similar amount as a gift or sponsorship earmarked as a grant-in-cash to the Breede River Municipality. Perhaps the hon MEC of Finance should pay more attention to this department as it is clear the hon MEC of Transport and Public Works … [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, will you protect me?

Mr M C WALTERS: From whom?
†Ms M TINGWE: From you.

†Mr H P GEYER: From yourself.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

†Ms M TINGWE: Thank you. The MEC does not have a good grip on his portfolio. Smoke and mirrors or spin and lies cannot take away the problems of this department, but closer scrutiny and good governance can go a long way.

If the said MEC of Finance reads the reports of this department he would not have been able to run to his first refuge, which is to question facts and figures published by his own administration, or to use his favourite tactic of claiming he does not know where the information comes from.

Recently the same hon finance MEC, with regard to the terrible condition of roads, health and education facilities, questioned the ANC spokesperson on transport and public works, hon Chris Stali, and continued to make a big show of the DA’s favourite focus-shifting tactic, namely to look at other provinces and not the Western Cape.

Unfortunately for the DA, it volunteered to be the government of the Western Cape and has to deal with the shortcomings here. The DA-run government must take responsibility here first … [Interjections.] … and not pass the bucket.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Are you still on the bucket system?

†Ms M TINGWE: It is shameful that DA leader rushes to point fingers at other provinces instead of first sweeping in front of its own door.

†Mr H P GEYER: Just go to the bucket. [Laughter.]

†Ms M TINGWE: Here, in the Western Cape, it is dereliction of duty if an MEC does not take the beam from his own eye to see the splinter in the eye of another.

An HON MEMBER: Ooh!

Ms M TINGWE: To assist the hon MEC of Finance I’ve made a short list of pages in the latest Transport and Public Works Annual Report that needs his attention. He will then find that the hon Stali spoke the truth in the House. On page two and three it speaks of an alarming growth in the number of roads that are past their lifetime and will continue to deteriorate. The table on page 2, point 26, shows that 70% of the health and education buildings are below good, with more that 30% being poor to very poor.

An HON MEMBER: Poor to very poor.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Von Brandis.

An HON MEMBER: Poor Tingwe.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Von Brandis.
*Mr P UYS: He's not listening.

*Mr P MCKENZIE: He's sleeping.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works received an overall budget of R4.5billion for the 2013 financial year. The investment in infrastructure is widely regarded as one of the most important drivers of economic growth and job creation a government can use and which is mostly carried out by this department.

The Adjustment Budget shows a decline of R110,28 million in the budget of the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works. Although it has the biggest adjustment of all the departments, we understood why: it is about the purchasing of the building that has not been realised.

Mr Speaker, earlier this year the national Department of Public Works was widely criticised for their inability to apply effective management. Police officers were prevented in at least four provinces of doing their work, because they were either locked out of their offices or evicted, as rental in arrears and rental disputes came to light.

Opposed to this, in order to apply good asset control and to have effective supply-chain management in place in the Western Cape, the additional R10,3 million and R2,7 million respectively is budgeted for these purposes. It is appreciated, hon Minister.

It is, however, disturbing to what extent there appears to be a lack of internal control over how the national Department of Public Works spends its money. Minister Nxesi recently admitted that the accommodation crisis of Minister Joemat-Pettersson partly has its origin in the inability of the national Department of Public Works … [Interjections.] Listen carefully.

The Minister also admitted that the state under spends more and more and that construction is of a poor quality, which costs the state about R3,5 billion per annum. Of greater concern is that the underspending takes place in spite of the presidential home in Nkandla, where more was spent than was budgeted for, or where taxpayers money was presumably used to pay for renovation work at the homes of President Zuma's brothers.

*Mr M C WALTERS: Gee whiz!

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the additional R50 million budgeted for the road infrastructure projects is welcome.

The DA government in the Western Cape is determined to reduce the maintenance backlog to 16% in the medium term and to launch new road infrastructure projects to support economic growth, such as the district load routes of IDZ in Saldanha.
In contrast, 4 750km of the Eastern Cape's provincial road networks were transferred to the South African National Road Agency as a result of the incompetence of the ANC provincial government; and four officials of the Northern Cape Roads and Public Works face fraud charges in connection with security contracts amounting to R47 million.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: The Western Cape. Come back home.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: I will. Listen carefully, at the same time the Limpopo Public Works Department is being defamed …

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Come home.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: … because of documents of assets amounting to R2 billion for which there are no answers to the Auditor-General's questions. Listen carefully, Tingwe. [Laughter.] In contrast, the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works received an unqualified audit.

The Western Cape Department of Public Works also prides itself on the effectivity of the creditors-payment systems, where service providers are paid within the 30-day period. In Gauteng there are currently 44 000 outstanding invoices for services provided and state orders that together amount to R2.3 billion.

†Ms M MBALO: Who's he talking about?

An HON MEMBER: National.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, criticism for reduction during the adjustment budget requires us to judge what the funds are made available for. The major receivers of the adjustments are the Department of Education and the Department of Health.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Now he's back home.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: The infrastructure of schools is one of the cardinal problems in the provision of education country wide.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Come back to the Western Cape.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: The new infrastructure plan will realise 26 new schools and 46 replacement schools by 2015-16.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Listen to that.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: The national Minister of Basic Education admitted in April that 514 schools are without toilets, that 714 schools have no electricity and that more than 1 000 schools still have to be supplied with water [Interjections.] A recent parliamentary question to the Minister confirmed that there are still 344 mud schools – 343 of them are in the Eastern Cape under the ANC provincial government. [Interjections.]

The Sowetan of Thursday, 29 November 2012, shows that of the 4 015 schools in Limpopo, 1 920 are in a parlous condition …
The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: … and that the ANC provincial education department 22 years …

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member! I have listened very carefully to your speech. You are going a bit too far from home now.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: I’ll come back again, thank you.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Bring it back to the Western Cape budget. [Interjections.] Order! Order!

*Mr H P GEYER: Tell them again about the schools. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Skwatsha!

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: … going to take … to recover …

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Skwatsha, is that a point of order or a question?

*Mr M SKWATSHA: Can the hon Visser give hon Von Brandis some water? [Laughter.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Von Brandis may continue.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you very much. It is going to take the ANC provincial education department 22 years to recover it with their annual meagre budget of R1 billion. The additional R82 million that was made available to the Western Cape Department of Education is welcome.

Mr Deputy Speaker, three people were recently arrested at the private vehicle centre in Gauteng, on charges of corruption.

*Ms J WITBOOI: Again at Gauteng.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: According to the Road Traffic Management Corporation, about 35 people die on South African roads daily, and many of the deaths can be ascribed to corruption involving roadworthy licences at testing centres.

The Western Cape, however, regards the importance of effective, efficient and corruption-free testing centres – for both vehicles and licences – as essential in the fight for road safety. The additional R2.4 million that is being made available with the budget, is for a best-practice model for the management of testing centres and is therefore welcome.

Mr Deputy Speaker, for the good work already done and for the sustained dedication to improving access to safe and effective infrastructure in the province, I support the budget adjustments and wish to thank hon Minister Carlisle, Mr Fourie and the officials for their hard work and dedication.
I also just want to avail myself of the opportunity to thank some of the standing committee members for their cooperation and support and — this does not include hon Tingwe. I wish you a happy Christmas.

*Mr M C WALTERS: Don't you wish so for Tingwe as well?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you to those who took part in the debate.

First of all to hon Haskin, yes, the slow filling of posts has been a problem for a long time. It is really due to three things: One is the anomalies of the so-called OSD, where we sometimes end up with a subordinate earning more than his superior; another is the finalisation of structures, some of which still have to happen; but the greatest problem of all is the difficulty in finding the qualified people that we need.

That leads on, as the hon member points out, to the use of consultants and I would be dishonest with him if I suggested that the use of consultants is likely to disappear; there are simply not the skills in the department nor are there the skills in any transport or public works department anywhere in South-Africa to be able to do away with it.

The other point I’d like to make to the hon member, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that in many cases one uses consultants for a specific job that is not ongoing. So the consultants that we’re using, for instance — and it’s mentioned in here — to help us to put the Giama together, will transfer and are transferring those skills to specially employed people. You can’t just take run-of-the mill people; they have to have a great deal of knowledge and so on. Once Giama is put together one doesn’t need those consultants anymore and one doesn’t need to replace them because then it just becomes an ongoing kind of job.

Incidentally, I see hon Tingwe, if I understood correctly, was saying that I was dead. This has not yet been reported to me, but I don’t want to suggest that she was telling a lie and misleading the House.

†Mr M OZINSKY: You’re so dead.

†The MINISTER: I see that she has hit and run. She didn’t hit very hard and I’m not sure where she has run to. For her, as well as hon Haskin, I was discussing these problems yesterday with the national Deputy Minister of Public Works and they’re as common to the national department as they are to ours.

Hon Tingwe first of all said that I was lucky to escape an adverse finding from the Auditor-General. In fact, my department improved from an unqualified audit with matters of emphasis to an unqualified audit without matters of emphasis. Despite what the Auditor-General put about leases, which I certainly find very odd, it is in fact a very, very good annual accounts and annual report.

Then hon Tingwe picks things out here and there, and the fact is, yes, there are schools that are not in good condition, there are roads that are not in good condition, no question about it.
There are, however, very much fewer than there were in the past, for the very simple reason that a lot of the budget did not go to the building of schools or the building of clinics or the maintenance of roads. It went where it should not have gone, sir, to the tune of R500 million a year.

So, it’s really ridiculous for hon Tingwe to suggest that the situation has deteriorated. In fact, it has improved. So much so that our spending in Public Works is now in value terms four times higher than it was before 2009. Also, the ability shown in works, compared to the past, is borne out by the reaction of the national government, which is an ANC national government, Mr Deputy Speaker, in that they have made an additional R1 billion available to us for the modernisation of Valkenberg into a truly outstanding psychiatric hospital, and a further R782 million for additional schools to be built so whilst we are currently building …

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Very good.

†Mr M OZINSKY: So, it’s the ANC building the schools.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: Is the ANC building schools?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It’s the ANC, because they know where it’s properly invested, you see.

†Mr M OZINSKY: They’ve invested in our province. The ANC is building the schools.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It’s interesting that the hon member says it’s the ANC building schools, …

†Mr M OZINSKY: It’s the ANC building schools.

†The MINISTER: … but the interesting thing is it’s the ANC not giving money to ANC provinces, but its giving money to this province.

†Mr M OZINSKY: They’re building schools in the Eastern Cape as well.

†The MINISTER: But they are not giving that kind of money. [Interjections.]

†Ms V HANI: When last were you in the Eastern Cape?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, Hon Ozinsky, order! Minister Carlisle, you may continue. [Interjections.] Order!

†Ms V HANI: When last were you in the Eastern Cape?

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mr M G E WILEY: You must go on leave.
An HON MEMBER: When last were you in the Eastern Cape?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Permanently.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Carlisle, you may now continue.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. You see, I know this is very painful for the ANC …

†Mr M OZINSKY: It’s not painful …

†The MINISTER: One hears these cries of pain, sir …

†Mr M OZINSKY: It’s not painful.

†The MINISTER: … and I’m not unmoved.

†Mr M OZINSKY: I’m happy to be … [Laughter.]

†The MINISTER: I would also be in pain if I were in the ANC and watched one of the few good Ministers giving her money to the DA and not giving it to the ANC. That would also be painful for me.

†Mr M OZINSKY: No-one’s giving money to the … [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER: They’re not giving it to the ANC, because, sir, that hon member …

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They can’t even organise a gathering of branches. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Ozinsky, you can’t give a running commentary here now on every …

†Mr M OZINSKY: I’m sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker, …

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you on a point of order now?

†Mr M OZINSKY: … the hon MEC …

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you on a point of order now?

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Are you on a point of order?

†Mr M OZINSKY: Yes, on a point of order: The hon MEC was addressing my medical complaints …

An HON MEMBER: So?
Mr M OZINSKY: … saying that I was in pain … Laughter.] … and I was correcting his misconception …[Interjections.] … because he’s never examined me.

†Mr H P GEYER: It’s not a point of order.

†Mr M OZINSKY: He’s never heard my …

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. [Interjections.] Please take your seat. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It’s not happened.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You do not pay accounts to the CTICC.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I’m sure the hon member will forgive me if I defer a medical examination of him to a later date. [Laughter.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: There won’t be a …

†The MINISTER: He’s indeed in political pain, sir.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Are you a proctologist?

†The MINISTER: Yes.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The province has got so many delegates …

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I see the hon member has returned and I’m pleased about that. She asks about Breede Valley. That is simply the payment for a Shadow Centre and the hon member will surely know that Shadow Centres form part of …

†The PREMIER: She’s not listening.

†The MINISTER: No, she’s not listening at all. She didn’t understand the speech she read … [Laughter.] … so it’s not surprising that she’s not listening.

†Ms M TINGWE: Huh?

†The MINISTER: She obviously is not aware that that money is for a Shadow Centre, even though the report says it. Shadow Centres form part of the Safely Home campaign. The Safely Home campaign has reduced the death rate by 29%, and I’m pleased to announce that for the month of November – not that there were 99 deaths – there were 99 compared to last year’s 111.

I have to say to the hon member that as far as I know there has been no safety campaign in the world which has reduced fatalities as fast as this one and the Breede Valley donation, which, in fact, brings into being the Breede Valley Shadow Centre, is a part of that.
The hon member also refers to roads. I’m happy to tell her that they’ve already …

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister! May hon Skwatsha ask a question?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: I wanted to know, hon MEC, how do you separate – because you speak about the success of the Safely Home – Safely Home from Arrive Alive and therefore claim that it is not Arrive Alive, but Safely Home?

†The MINISTER: We don’t separate them and in a sense Safely Home and Arrive Alive are part of the same thing, but Arrive Alive has no activities that I’m aware of; neither here nor anywhere else. It has no activities.

An HON MEMBER: It’s just a slow …

The MINISTER: So, it is moribund, and one of the reasons that it’s moribund is that …

†Mr M C WALTERS: Explain what moribund means.

†The MINISTER: … the Roads Traffic Management Corporation, headed by my good friend, Collins Letswalo, is broke. Now, they are the main national coordinating body for road safety and, by his own admission, they have no capacity to do anything.

Their expenses exceed their budget by R100 million a year and they’re already R160 million on the wrong side. The Auditor-General says that they are no longer a going concern, and that is why the death rate is going up in the rest of South Africa and down here. I do hope that it will have the full support of the ANC.

Finally, Mr Deputy Speaker, we have reduced the maintenance backlog on roads by 17%, which is already the goal that we set ourselves for 2014. Our roads are generally in a very good condition, particularly our surfaced roads. Some of our gravel roads are in poor condition, but then the hon member must remember those roads carry less than 1% of the vehicle volumes of the province.

I think I’ve dealt with everything. I want to thank hon Von Brandis because he dealt with many of the points and drew attention to other provinces. Without, specifically, moving away from this particular Vote, let me just say this is the only province with a provincial regulating entity, which each province is supposed to have in terms of the national Land Transport Act. It is the only province in which a Giama register exists and it is so that we have been complimented on that by the respective national Ministers – ANC national Ministers – and when the one came to the opening of the PRE he said, as usual, the Western Cape is best.

Now I didn’t want to cause pain to the other side of the House, but these are facts. What’s more important, however, is the number of provinces that come down here to work with us, learn from us and take things back with them. We want to continue that; we see that as a very, very important process and there’s nothing political about it.

It’s not what happens between me and my political colleagues in the province, it’s what happens between my staff and the staff in the other provinces.
So, in a sense, the transfer of skills that are developed we do very willingly in the broader interest of South Africa.

I move that this be accepted.

Debate concluded.

**WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]**

(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development)

*The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is a great pleasure for me to submit my department's Adjustment Budget 2012-13 today.*

†There are significant shifts in funding allocations that will have major benefits for the poor and vulnerable citizens of our province.

Our savings are largely due to cut-backs in the following areas

We don't believe in once-off events that cost a fortune and events and jamborees that have little or no impact. We rather channel our resources into programmes that run throughout the year. In this way we see the impact of the work done.

We avoid T-shirts and little caps and all that nonsense

Catering and venue hire is kept to an absolute minimum, and I will speak to the savings we have made in this regard.

Not even at our management meetings do we have any catering. They eat dry biscuits and drink water.

Rental buildings – we are actively moving towards the reduction of leased buildings for service delivery. State-owned facilities are being identified and used. A recent example in this regard is the opening of our new Athlone office in the old Spes Bona Hostel. The savings on leases means more money with which to serve the community.

Goods and services – we order only what we need in order to deliver basic services in accordance with our mandate. We have also seen a drastic reduction in subsistence and travel claims and in accommodation claims. I set this tone last year and am pleased to announce that we saved nearly R25 million in this way, and I think we should be applauded for this.

Salaries – posts that had initially been put on the structure, but for which there were no clear job descriptions, have not been filled.

In this way, Mr Deputy Speaker, we are specifically looking at the community development practitioners. No one knows what they do and we see them all over. In the community they say it is to mobilise the communities. We are saying those posts must be used specifically with the allocated job description and we will not make any apology for not filling those posts. You can call it underspending, but we will not fill those jobs.
In this regard R29 million was very quickly saved. Through our savings, we will this year be in a position to channel over R35 million to the expansion of our own programmes and to NGOs in dire need.

During the 16 Days of Activism for No Abuse Against Women and Children Campaign, it is fitting that R1,3 million will go to programmes for victims of crimes against women and children. This is how we contribute to the campaign, not by keeping our social workers away from their core function to attend events or by distributing costly pamphlets and posters that simply end up in the bin. We put our money into programmes that can help and empower victims of abuse.

We are also shifting major funding specifically to our holiday programme to keep our vulnerable children safe for the holidays. A whopping R12 million will go to NGOs that offer statutory services for the care and protection of children.

An amount of R2,4 million will be set aside for NGOs operating in the disability sector. I will continue to advocate for services for persons with disabilities. Very often these people have had no say in their condition and as such this government is committed to extending as many services and opportunities to disabled persons as we can.

We are so serious about this specific programme that the Premier herself is chairing the interdepartmental and sectoral committee on this matter.

A further R2,1 million will go to services for older persons. This government takes the Older Persons Act very seriously and as such the safety, wellbeing and welfare of older persons are a priority for us.

In keeping with our commitment to reduce drug and alcohol-related harms in the province, an additional R900 000 will go to this sector. There are some members who raised some absurd statistics in connection with our substance abuse programme. I don’t see these members here and I don’t see them in the standing committees either.

Here are the facts, Mr Deputy Speaker. Bear in mind though, that we have nearly doubled our budget for this programme over the past three years.

There is also a shift to capital expenses, which will see over R6 million being invested into infrastructure and repairs, mainly at our facilities for children in conflict with the law. I want to say that the conditions and treatment of our children in detention is taken very seriously, because it must contribute to the rehabilitation of the children in those centres and the eventual reintegration into our communities as normal, valuable beings once they return to their communities.

This government is committed to ensuring that taxpayers get value for their money. We have cut away nonessential expenditure to make more funds available to serve the people of this province – and that is, nice together. [Interjections.]

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, we note the increases in payments to NPOs as listed in the Adjustments Appropriations.
Childcare and protection services are receiving R8.6 million; care and support of families, R4 million; R3.6 million to substance abuse; R1.6 million to older persons; R1.2 to crime prevention; and R3.1 to disabilities.

However, Mr Deputy Speaker, the question here is whether the NPOs that are going to be receiving this money are now firstly going to be able to properly account for the expenditure of this money, where they couldn’t in the previous year. Secondly, will the information that is provided by these NPOs be verifiable or will the department feel the need to again disclaim the information that it receives from these NPOs in its annual report as it had to do in the last annual report where, in terms of Programme 2: Social Welfare Services, where all of these are housed, 92% of the indicators listed were not verifiable?

Mr Deputy Speaker, 92% of the facts and figures provided to us in the annual report of last year, in terms of Programme 2, were not verifiable and, in fact, the department disclaimed its own reporting. Now, that is of deep concern especially since in this adjustment appropriation no allocations are being made to monitoring and evaluation.

This means – hopefully not, but it looks like it – that there will still not be sufficient visits to NPOs by the department and that there will still not be service delivery norms and standards set up and established for these NPOs, which are now going to be receiving all these additional adjusted allocations from the department.

Mr Deputy Speaker, of course this is of serious concern, you know. Adjustments are now being allocated to NPOs who couldn’t account for it effectively the last time and they will be receiving it this time. The question here is whether the department actually is well advised in terms of these adjustment appropriations, notwithstanding the fact that the work needs to continue.

Mr Deputy Speaker, here again the MOD centres are having R6.5 million moved from them to NPOs who also cannot account for their money. [Time expired.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bevu, are you taking your slot?

†Ms T N BEVU: No.

†Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, Provincial Treasury’s decision to reduce the budget of the Department of Social Development by R 1.8 million is a matter of grave concern. This reduction seriously hampers the department’s ability to deliver the most basic social welfare services in a province devastated by a consistent increase in gangsterism, drug abuse and the abuse of women and children.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They don’t understand it.

†Ms V HANI: It is even more alarming that such a reduction in the budget takes place when there was already so much regression in MEC Fritz’s department in the 2011-12 financial year. The decision to decrease the budget fails to address the challenges underlined in the 2011-12 annual report. This budget takes us further back.
In 2011-12 not a single school received drug education training in the subject of Life Orientation with learners needing to wait till 2013. Where will the money come from for this rollout?

Last year we saw a decrease in the amount of Department of Social Development’s funded drug treatment programmes that apply drug testing to patients from 24 to 13. We fear that the budget cut will mean even less drug-testing programmes being offered to patients.

A host of NPOs that offer child care and protection services have had their funding cut considerably last year. Some, like the Saartjie Baartman Centre, which provides sanctuary to abused women and their children, have in fact had their funding cut altogether.

The ANC fears that the 2012-13 financial year will see even more of these funding cuts. Mr Deputy Speaker, also, the Auditor-General visited about 10% of these NGOs, but the department did not even visit one.

In 2011-12 the department only managed to fund four childhood developmental programmes instead of the promised 600, in comparison to 200 in 2010-11. This budget decrease does not bode well for improvement in this regard.

The current budget will make it difficult for the department to at least fund a single new victim shelter as it was unable to do so in 2011-12. We fear that even the meagre 12 victim shelters that they have continued to fund may be reduced.

In a province where gang activity amongst the youth is on the rise, this budget fails to provide alternatives for our youth. There is no indication that the budget will result in an increase in the number of funded NPOs delivering youth development services. The number decreased from the previous year’s 16 to six last year.

In the annual report, MEC Fritz’s department cited NPO noncompliance with funding requirements as the main reason for funding cuts in essential areas. Surely taking away R1,8 million obstructs the department from properly assisting high-risk NPOs to comply with funding requirements.

In the light of the department’s 2011-12 regression, the budget decrease also indicates that MEC Winde does not have much confidence in MEC Fritz’s ability to channel the funds given to this department in a responsible and effective way.

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the adjusted appropriation for the Department of Social Development has not received an increase, but ways in which funds would rather be better spent were established. [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: He should have money for the poor children.

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: In anticipation of much monitoring and oversight, as spokesperson for the DA on community development in the Western Cape, I support the shifting of funds ... [Interjections.] ... within the programmes of the Department of Social Development ... [Interjections.] ... as it will be used more effectively in order to empower the poor and those with special needs. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!
†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to start with hon Haskin’s point on the NPOs and the MNE. I think hon Haskin had the opportunity to be properly briefed where it was said that before we fund any NGO a clear review will be done by MNE.

I hear him talking about 92% of indicators and want to suggest, in fact, I want to state here that we have 137 indicators. It’s all absurd nonsense from the national government. Let me just give members an idea of some of the indicators. [Interjections.] One is about self-generating income-generating … [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, can I just be protected?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Carry on, please Minister.

†The MINISTER: There is an indicator that talks about income-generating programmes. Mr Deputy Speaker, we’ve moved away from income-generating projects, because the money just disappeared. People stole the money. [Interjections.]

We gave money to the West Coast to start a snail cultivation programme, but no-one knows where the R3 million rand is that was given for that. We gave funds to a nappy programme, but no-one knows where the nappies or the machines are.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: The hon MEC is undermining a constitutional institution, the Auditor-General, because the MEC himself signed off on these indicators and the Attorney-General judges them on the basis of those indicators.

†Mr H P GEYER: Oh, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mr M OZINSKY: So when he says that they’re stupid indicators he’s undermining … [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! That is not a point of order, it’s a debating point. It’s not a point of order.

†The MINISTER: In fact I’m trying to create a context for hon Ozinsky and hon Haskin …

†Mr G C R HASKIN: What is the context?

†The MINISTER: … to understand in what context we are working.

†Mr M OZINSKY: The Auditor-General checks what he signs.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, order! Please, you’re commenting all the time. Give the Minister a fair chance.

†The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, to continue. You know, it’s the very ANC that says we must fund all our NGOs, and I’m with them on that.
We have all these small NGOs – of the 2 000 I think 1 500 or 1 700 are very small NGOs and in most instances that poor lady who runs that ECD does not have the capacity.

What we want to do is see how we can capacitate the person in Khayelitsha? What they are asking the House to do, and hon Haskin seems to support them, is to say let’s go and review all of them, then not fund the small NGOs anymore, but only the big NGOs where the directors have MBAs – and they all happen to be white, by the way – will all be getting big money, because they give good financial data.

This is the unintended consequence of this movement and the debate if it goes in this direction.

What we need to do, Mr Deputy Speaker, is to look at how we can work in a smarter and more efficient way to obtain that verification. I just want to give the House the assurance that we’re moving towards that. A lot of people talk about vacant posts. Why are we supporting bloated bureaucracies? Why can’t we have a smarter, leaner and more effective administration that can do the work?

Hon Hani, allow me to suggest – and you know how much I love you [Laughter.] – that you read the documentation. [Interjections.] The honey around the Hani! I want to propose, hon Hani, that I know that the hon Magwaza probably wrote your speech – but R1,8 million is money that we had to shift to education because of a court case.

So if one has to read the documentation you will see that, in fact, we received an extra R15 million from the finance Minister, who’s a very nice man. So we didn’t give away R1,8 million, we actually had to shift it in terms of a court finding to education. So, I would suggest I sit with you one night over coffee and I will explain it to you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that a point of order or a question, hon Skwatsha?
†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes. Is it in order for the MEC to propose in the House? [Laughter.]
†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It’s neither a question nor a point of order. Please continue, Minister.
†The MINISTER: Thank you. Another point I must also explain to hon Hani …

An HON MEMBER: Hani.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What’s wrong with “Honey”?

An HON MEMBER: It’s pronounced “Hani”, not “Honey”.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: …is that we did not stop giving attention to the issue of drugs. In fact, drug education is now incorporated into the subject Life Orientation in schools. Do you remember an NGO did some education about drugs in schools, but we found it wasn’t effective? It is now incorporated into the subject Life Orientation, so it is part of the education system at all times.
Let me just make this one point, hon Hani, about Saartjie Baartman. You know, I’ve personally visited Saartjie Baartman thrice. We’ve given them additional funds. I can stand here and say we’ve done that, specifically during the last financial year. You know, we hear the same thing over and over. With respect, I’m not saying you’re saying it, but the perception is that we haven’t given Saartjie Baartman anything.

When we tell people that we’ve given them quite a bit of additional funding over and above what we budgeted for, because they do a valuable job, people don’t believe it. In that small area there are also five other victim empowerment groups for vulnerable women and we have to be fair to all of them. We cannot favour the ones who write the best proposals. There are others who sometimes can’t write so nicely, but they do excellent work.

Lastly, I want to talk about and explain that this department itself runs four youth and child care facilities. Most of them are for children awaiting trial. We have outsourced two others, which makes six, which we are also subsidising. Then we subsidise many, many others – something like 26.

Now that individual child subsidy we have increased from 800 to 1 200, so I want to say we have, in fact, increased it, hon Hani. It’s an absolute misunderstanding when we talk about that.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to thank the hon members for the debate. Thank you to the hon Marais for chairing that standing committee and for the interactions that we have there. I want to say that it is one of the most interesting portfolios. It is a portfolio, hon members, where you either make a difference in the lives of people or not. Many members of the opposition work together here to make that difference. Many of you work with me behind the scenes to make that difference and I want to thank the members for doing that and effecting differences in the quality of life of people.

That is when we forget about petty politics and political cards and we think of those poor and vulnerable people. To the Premier, I want to say thank you for her leadership, specifically when it comes to disabilities and substance abuse. When we talk about these things, let’s stop talking about it and go and do something about it. Let us not just have debates about it, but let’s go and give execution to the things we are talking about.

I don’t see anyone from my department here, as usual. [Laughter.] Thanks to them, they are probably travelling somewhere on the SNT I’ve just spoken about. They are probably at the clinics. I want to take the opportunity, Mr Deputy Speaker, to say thank you to every social worker in my department and in NGOs, and every foot soldier – “voet soldate”, as we say in Afrikaans, hon Witbooi.

Let me say to them from the bottom of my heart, a very, very big thank you, because they are the people who most of the time make that big difference. And I want to end on that note, thank you.

Debate concluded.
†The SPEAKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, allow me to present the Western Cape Provincial Parliament’s Adjustments Budget for 2012-13.

The WCPP’s main budget increased with 2,3%, or R1,24 million, from R93,603 million to R95,727 million. The Provincial Parliament rolled over an amount of R1,974 million from the previous year’s underspending and revenue retention of R150 000 which will be utilised as follows:

- R1,301 million to implement the remuneration study at the median;
- R260 000 to implement the proposed heritage project including the valuation of paintings;
- R500 000 to increase the budget of standing committees for public hearings, oversight visits and travel arrangements; and
- R63 000 to increase the allowance for members’ constituency programmes with R500 per member per event. This will increase the allowance from R7 500 to R8 000 per member for a minimum of three events.

It was also necessary to shift funds within the budget. In this regard the budget for compensation of employees was reduced with 2,3%, from R37,573 million to R36,712 million. After determining the value of the underspending due to vacant positions, later than expected filling of positions and positions becoming unfunded, a process of reprioritisation took place and an amount of R900 000 was shifted to make provision for the following once-off projects: Skills assessment for all staff, R400 000; replacement and refurbishments of workstations, R100 000; and upgrading of the public address broadcasting exchange (PABX), as well as the replacement of modulators and monitors for the Chamber, R400 000.

An additional amount of R300 000 was shifted to supplement the budget for the audit costs for the remainder of the financial year as the audit for the 2012-13 financial year will commence earlier.

The Goods and Services budget increased with 5,8%, from R23,638 million to R25,013 million. Notwithstanding the increase of the budget of R1,960 million, an amount of R585 000 was shifted away from Goods and Services to provide for the following: R19 000 to provide for the write-off of losses; R95 000 to provide for capital expenditure on furniture for staff; and the transfer of R471 000 from operating leases to capital expenditure on motor vehicles due to reallocation of the daily tariff expenditure on government motor vehicles.

An amount of R1,025 million was obtained from the roll-over and shifts from compensation of employees and the balance of R452 000 was obtained from the surplus budget on constituency allowance as provision was made for a higher increase than what was eventually granted by National Parliament.
The WCPP will also be looking at enabling and secretarial allowances of members and political parties. Proposals in this regard will be submitted to the Rules Committee shortly. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is in support of these adjustments, noting, however that there remain missed opportunities for correcting some of the challenges that have been noted as a result of the annual reporting process, amongst others, the e-Filing system, and the implementation of the skills audit. We’ve just heard now about a skills study that is going to be implemented, but, in fact, in the annual reporting process there was mention of the lack of the implementation of a skills audit that to my mind was already completed. Further challenges are the customisation and the implementation of the sector oversight model, and in increased public participation and education programme funding there is a missed opportunity.

We’ve noted throughout this whole annual reporting process that there was basically no public participation, there was no ownership of the processes that we’ve just gone through in terms of public awareness, education and participation in what we were doing, and yet it is of such value to the broader public.

Of course we welcome the remuneration study, the heritage allocations, the standing committee allocations and the Chamber modifications, and specifically also the plenary support services and secretarial allowance increases. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament has over the past few months proven that it strives towards efficiency of operations, informed decision-making and a general professional attitude.

It is comforting to have learnt that the staff numbers of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament has grown to 89, which is lessening the vacant posts. I’d like to congratulate the Speaker and the silent support structures, which is the staff of this institution, for the tireless work to carry out the support and operational mandate.

I support the Western Cape Provincial Parliament Adjustments Appropriation.

†Ms T N BEVU: Mr Deputy Speaker, we support this Adjustments Budget, but with serious concerns to us in that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament had under-spending of, I think, R9 million for the period under review. Worse still, is the fact that the bulk of this underspending stems from compensation of employees.

There has been a delay in filling 16 vacancies. Every subsequent year now the WCPP has not been able to achieve its objective of Programme 1: Administration. This is a very worrying trend. As a result the WCPP met only 21% of its planned targets. What are the effects of the implementation of the remuneration study we were told was being implemented as far back as April? This Legislature had what I am sure is a record-breaking number of staff leaving it this year. I think we’ve all seen that.
This Parliament is always complaining about how it can’t compete with salaries out there because it does not have a big budget, and then it goes and under spends the little it already has by not filling vacant posts and paying competitive packages to its staff. Is it any wonder that competent staff are leaving this Legislature for other Legislatures in the country.

Every year during the opening speeches we hear about several information technology projects to be implemented, and at every year end it is reported that the IT projects have not yet been implemented and the website has not been upgraded as planned. What is the actual problem? The IT manager was appointed as far back as the beginning of the year. Do you mean to tell us an IT plan has still not been finalised and implemented?

We’ve also heard about the skills audit that has been put on hold. We’d like to understand what the reasons are for that.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member's time has expired. Just finish off your last sentence.

†Ms T N BEVU: In conclusion, maybe I should raise the issue of the outsourcing risk management function to the Western Cape Government Risk Management. It looks like you still fail to monitor and review the existing controls … [Time expired.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has now expired. Thank you very much.

†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, the addition of more than two million Rand to the provincial Legislature’s budget is very dubious as this institution has a history and trend of not spending its funds. In fact, the last annual report clearly indicated a final underspend of R11 million. The biggest ever!

Why is more money given to this Legislature if it cannot even spend that which is gets? It does not fill funded posts, it underpays its workers and it reduces spending on a vital function like public participation.

It will be very interesting to see whether and how it will spend its budget this financial year.

What is more alarming is that even with the poor payment for the Legislature’s workers, this Adjustments Budget takes away just under R1 million from the compensation of employees. This only means we are heading towards more vacancies and no real improvement of the wage of the workers. Worst of all, to date the staff have not yet received salary increments; this is shameful.

No spin or explanation can change the perception that this Legislature, Deputy Speaker, does not treat its entry level workers fairly.

What is further astonishing is the fact that the Legislature in this Adjustments Budget almost doubles its expenditure on machinery and equipment with an additional R570 000. Does this mean that expendable stuff like that is more important than people? Or is it simply true what many in the passages say: The management just look after their own interest and work for bonuses under a guise of so-called savings?
This institution has regressed sharply on key indicators since the DA took control. Just look at the circus it became with the previous Speaker until he was removed. Of the present arrangement, it is better to remain unsaid. Under the DA there is no regard for democracy and space to play a meaningful role here. The DA curbs, manipulates and spoils the working of the Legislature.

Rigging of debates took place, with just recently one topic being changed shortly ahead of the discussion in order to serve only the DA’s ulterior agenda. Co-existence is something that is lacking under the DA.

It hates criticism and it always wants praise-singing. Question time has been turned into sweetheart opportunities, and even members of the controlling party are now delivering speeches as if they are members of the Executive and not doing their parliamentary oversight. Critical thinking and guidance is lacking in the DA.

The biased handling of the opposition shouts to the high heavens and borders on abuse of power. It does not consult on important matters such as international delegations. Instead all sorts of friends are taken to Sri Lanka for a Commonwealth Parliamentary Association gathering.

We saw the exclusion of certain parties with important celebrations like youth and women’s events. The chaos at Chrysalis Academy proves the point. Only DA friends and supporters are welcome under the DA in this Legislature.

In fact, the DA does not lead by example of even-handedness here. If it did, it would not whine at national level! I cannot over-emphasise the … [Interjections.]

…

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms M TINGWE: … the issue of silent prayer in this Legislature. It is clear that the DA deliberately refuses to show respect to other religions who do not pray.

Is the DA interested in strengthening our democracy? I doubt it. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Tingwe, you’ve had your turn; it is hon Rossouw’s turn now.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, if we look at the directives under the new Auditor-General, and after we have received a clean audit for the third consecutive year, then I don’t know what world hon member Tingwe is living in. I think our provincial Parliament can be proud of our annual Auditor-General’s report and the clean audit we receive. There will always be improvements to be made, but it is a great pity that we as members of the House sink to this level regarding criticism, and that we do not sort out many of these things in our Rules Committee and the necessary committee meetings.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we have come to the end of a very busy calendar year during which we have experienced various highlights, but we are also clearly aware of a few places where we need improvement.
We have had 32 sittings this year. About 670 interpellations, oral questions and written questions were dealt with, which afforded an opportunity to communicate with the Executive Government in a constructive manner.

I wish to express my thanks to our Executive Government who have dealt with and handed in their questions timeously; only a few are outstanding. I appeal to our Executive Government, where questions are possibly still outstanding, that members will receive them before we finish our business in a few weeks’ time.

Mr Deputy Speaker, 241 standing committee meetings took place, excluding our visits; 11 items of legislation were dealt with, of which the programmes of three of them have already been scheduled for early next year before the opening of Parliament. Public hearings have already been arranged specifically at two of them, and the committee meetings are being scheduled.

Four items of NCOP legislation were also dealt with this year, of which the Traditional Courts Bill was probably the one that received our attention most.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the absence of members in the standing committees resulting in us not having a quorum from time to time, is a situation of great concern to me, especially seeing that we have already adapted the committees’ numbers.

I appeal to you that we must look at this and adapt our Rules accordingly. When a member has not attended a number of consecutive sittings of the House, disciplinary steps can be taken regarding that member. Our sittings are not of such a nature, but we shall have to adapt our Rules in such a way that when members are absent from standing committees without offering an apology – or arranging with an alternative member to attend meetings – that action can also be taken against them according to Rules. It is specifically the Standing Committee on Education that experiences a problem more than once, and the member who is always absent usually has the most to say about Education.

Everywhere in the Adjustment Budget there are funds that are shifted to various programmes, such as the salary adjustment scales of our staff. The funds at the disposal of the … [Interjections.] There she wakes up now. [Interjections.] She has now suddenly realised that she’s in the House. The funds available to the Aesthetic Committee are something we hope will be spent this year so that we can finally table our plan.

Extra funding is needed for our standing committees to carry out their activities. It will be very necessary, especially in the first quarter, because much is going to be issued regarding public hearings. We in the Western Cape are very grateful for the extra funding available for outreach programmes and we are very proud of the opportunity you are offering us to basically be an extension of the Parliament in our constituencies, to be able to commemorate specific days in our communities.

We are grateful for the funding to the political parties for researchers, but there is still concern that we have a need for more researchers that can handle our committees. We are glad that during the meeting with the officials of Parliament it was indicated there that they will again consider this matter and again take care of the decision.

We have officially received our new Rule books today. Thank you very much to the staff who worked on them with enthusiasm and gave us this neat handbook.
The vacancies for staff are something that is regularly brought to our attention. The level to which we sink in this House to speak about the salary scales of staff, I think, is not always within our powers to discuss.

I think there wasn't yet any budgetary year in which it did not form part of a discussion. Are the salary scales of any officials in any other departments ever discussed? We will have to tackle the way in which we handle our Rules and pass the judgements we make in the House in a much more disciplined way.

A person has actually already been appointed to upgrade our website. When we come to the Budget Speech in March next year, I hope we will all pass on our congratulations regarding the progress. I don't know if it will already be finished, but that we will at least be able to say there is progress, that we will be able to see something on the website, because our website is actually somewhat of an embarrassment to us.

To the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker, thank you very much to you and all our staff – from Mr Hindley to our most junior officials – for the way in which you support us to enable us to do our work in the House. As I said to our own staff this morning, we are sometimes a bit critical and you sometimes have to swallow things if the members are sometimes a bit unfair in their requests, but you are always there to support us so that we can do our work. Thank you very much to all and may you all experience a very pleasant festive season. The DA supports this Vote.

†The SPEAKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, ...

Mr M SKWATSHA: [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon Skwatsha! Give the Speaker a chance to respond.

†The SPEAKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me start with the question by the hon Haskin regarding the sector oversight model (SOM). The SOM is currently being customised for the provincial Parliament so that it suits it. The hon member knows that the national and provincial Constitutions make provision on how to conduct our oversight role.

What we are not going to do is take a SOM from other provinces and implement it here in the Western Cape Province. We cannot do that. We have our own beliefs of doing things and that’s why we customised the SOM. I will come back to you. I think the document is ready now. We will provide you with the SOM document next year.

I now come to the hon Bevu. You spoke about the progress with the upgrade of the website. The tender was awarded and the service provider will commence duty on 19 January 2013. We will start with the upgrading of the website in 2013.

You made mention of the underspending, especially the remaining R9 million. The remaining R9 million will be reallocated to the WCPF’s Medium-Term Expenditure Budget as follows: R3 million in the 2013-14 financial year, R3 million in the 2014-15 financial year and another R3 million in the 2015-16 financial year.

The hon Bevu also made mention of the vacancies. You are correct, but progress has been made with the filling of the vacancies.
Only two posts still need to be advertised. We anticipate that the vacancies will be filled by the end of this financial year if, of course, there is no resignation. There is progress and the vacancies will definitely be filled. However, we do not simply want to fill vacancies for the sake of filling them. We want to make sure that we get the right people for the vacancies. Hon Bevu, thank you very much for your comments.

I now come to the hon Tingwe. It seems that she is really confused, let me say that. [Interjections.] The reason why I say this is because she made mention of the fact that the staff of Parliament are underpaid while our staff are earning more than the staff at national Parliament.

†Ms T N BEVU: Is that so?

†The SPEAKER: It’s a totally confusing statement that you are making in the House. [Interjections.] I understand your reason to be confused, because you don’t attend most of the meetings of the Rules Committee. [Interjections.] You are totally confused. [Interjections.] I gave you a typical example now. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The SPEAKER: You can compare the provincial Parliament to national Parliament in terms of salaries.

Ms M TINGWE: [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Tingwe! Order!

†The SPEAKER: The statement that you made shows that you are really confused. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Tingwe, you had your time to speak. Now it is time to listen to the Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: I’m not ...

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, is the Speaker prepared to take a question?

†The SPEAKER: No, I’m not prepared to take any questions.

†Mr M SWKATSHA: Just on the issue of staff.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He’s not prepared to take a question.

†The SPEAKER: I’m not going to take any questions.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: [Inaudible.] ... something to hide.

†The SPEAKER: I’m not going to take any questions.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.
†Ms M TINGWE: He can’t answer ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M TINGWE: That’s the thing with him.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Tingwe, I’ve asked you to give the Speaker a fair chance. Speaker, please continue.

†The SPEAKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, allow me to say that I’m not going to waste my time and your time with people who are confused. She should go back and re-search and come up with informed information.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank the Rules Committee and its members for their support. I also thank the Secretary of Parliament, Mr Hindley, and the staff for the good work they have done to date.

Debate concluded.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Consideration of Votes and Schedules)

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! We will now consider the individual Votes, and I will allow one member per party to make a Declaration of Vote when we put the Vote.

On Vote 1:

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I’d like to ask you how you would like us to do a declaration, because the ANC would like to do a declaration for the whole Budget.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow you to do that under Vote 1, where we are now. If you do a declaration now, it is under Vote 1 – the Premier, but we can regard it as being for the full Budget.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ANC cannot support the 2012 adjustment budget for, in essence, very much the same reasons why we could not support the main appropriation budget.

An open society ideology does not favour the poor. You say that the poor must participate equally. Given the advantage a rich child has over a poor child it is virtually impossible.

The ANC commends the good work done in line with national programmes and specific allocations for predetermined objectives, especially in Education and most of Health. However, in this province we cannot, for example, support a Social Development department whose budget dwindles year on year and the MEC cuts support to the poor – and even bashes the A-G in the House – when it is the hon MEC who is in the wrong.
This year, this department did not spend R1,8 million. This is a province where TB, a socio-economic disease, is the highest in the world and where you find the highest incidence of sexual violence, gang war and so on. [Interjections.]

The closure of schools in poor communities, the closure of the G F Jooste Hospital in one of the poorest communities and other blunders, like the poor handling of poor communities in protests in Makhaza, Hangberg, Dunoon, Hawston and even De Doorns cannot be condoned. [Interjections.]

The DA places our country at risk by bad-mouthing it in the international domain. This has very serious repercussions for ongoing and direct foreign investment. In fact, the biggest and strongest growing department in this government for the last three years has been the non-delivery Department of the Premier.

The ANC cannot support the shenanigans with strange legislation and the usurping of powers. This DA is even assuming powers it is not specifically granted in our Constitution.

The upcoming fruitless and wasteful expenditure of millions of taxpayer money with the Zille Commission is but one example.

†Ms J HARTNICK (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, we support the Vote.

Votes 1 to 14 agreed to (ANC dissenting).

Schedules agreed to.

Clauses and Title agreed to.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Finalisation)

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! As there is no list of speakers, I take it that there is no objection to the Bill being finalised.

Order disposed of without debate.

Bill finalised.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The Bill will be sent to the Premier for assent.

CLOSING

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! We have almost reached the end of the sitting for the day and the session for the year. As is our tradition, I will now afford one representative per party to say a couple of words of farewell to one another.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for this opportunity. It is unfortunately not on a high note that we end but, nonetheless, we are ending.

I take this opportunity to mention the sad passing of the MEC for Health in the Free State, Ms Ngubentombi, who has been an outstanding woman.
She has only been in the position for a year. She died tragically in a motorcar accident in the early hours of Sunday morning, together with one of her bodyguards. He daughter was also in the car and is still in a serious condition in hospital. We hope and pray that she recovers very soon. She was a wonderful lady. I really enjoyed her conversation as a colleague. We are going to miss her in the province. She was serious about changing health care in the Free State. We had many interactions in that regard. On behalf of the House, if I may do so, I extend our condolences to her family.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is a well-deserved break. I want to take this opportunity to duly thank everyone involved. I want to start with the Premier and thank her for her contribution during the year. We really appreciate what you have done for us and for the people of the province. You've been a leader of example and you've often made most of us very proud. Thank you very much for your contribution.

I thank the members of the Cabinet. It’s been a real pleasure for us a Cabinet to work together. We are formidable team. Thank you for that.

I also thank the members serving on the standing committees in their official capacities as well as all the members of the House. Thank you very much for your contributions during the year. After this year, we can again say that it has been a very busy and fruitful year.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank the Speaker, in his absence, for the role that he plays. I also thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, for what you have done. We really appreciate it. With that, we also want to convey our gratitude towards your supporting staff that we do not always see. They are behind the scenes, doing all the work for us and preparing all the documentation.

I also want to take this opportunity to mention the spouses – those who are not here today – who often have to bear with our programmes, all the things that go with this job and all the challenges that we have to meet. On behalf of our party and the House, please convey our gratitude towards your spouses.

Mr Deputy Speaker, our best wishes also go to the people of this province. I want to take this opportunity to say that we hope that you will have a peaceful, loving and happy period over this festive season. I wish you peace during this time of unrest that we are facing in the province. I hope that this issue will be concluded in such a manner that it is to the benefit of all, because we want to have a happy and a peaceful province.

I want to convey love, as the only healing method and behaviour for real reconciliation in our country and in our province. I wish you happiness. I hope that every person in this province has had access to an opportunity to live his or her life to its full potential. If we are able to succeed in that we would have a happy province and happy people.

Let’s use the opportunity this festive season to enhance reconciliation in our province. I really want to plead for that from our side of the House. I think I’m being fair when I say that we are actually a traumatised nation. There are many things that can be resolved by reconciliation in our nation.

I’m saddened – and again I speak on behalf of everybody when we reflect on this year – by events like what happened in Marikana.
It has been the most tragic event since our new democracy. I want to caution members not to speak lightly about this. Some remarks about Marikana are made – and were made today again – in a light manner. It is truly a very, very sad event. I hope that we will never ever repeat that. Reconciliation can do much to resolve the unrest issues that we have.

We have also been traumatised. The official Opposition in the House might think it’s inappropriate to say this, but I think we are traumatised by what is happening in Nkandla. It’s unheard of in a modern democracy to have a Nkandla to deal with.

I want to ask you to please travel safely. Please be responsible over this period. Recuperate and recharge so that we can have a fruitful year in 2013.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, in this period we must be mindful of those who are vulnerable and poor in our province. As we close the year 2012 we must call on our people to be responsible.

We know that when it comes to December, it is the time when alcohol flows more freely and when people are free from going to work. They have more time at home, and many harsh things happen in this province. It is the period in which those who people know are the ones that are more harmful to them. We must call on our people to be conscious of each other, our children, our seniors within our communities and those who are less fortunate than us.

As we close this year, my prayer is, in addition to what the Leader of Government Business says, that we spread the love around. I think that we should do a little more and show our care in a very active way, especially when it comes to those who have less than us, who don’t have families like us and who don’t have people they can rely upon. For me, that must be the way in which we deal with some of the trauma we have within our province.

Yes, Marikana was very traumatic, but I think, equally, we must just try to deal with our home base sometimes. Makhaza was exceptionally traumatic for people. So, too, were the farm workers’ strikes. I can’t imagine that somebody who has nothing will still go out and fight, and have even less.

I want to speak about the House, too. This is the third year that we see us as political leaders, whether we are in the governing party or in the Opposition, taking up an opposing side. I don’t think any of us feel the stuff that the hon Fritz says. We have to do this together. We don’t, because the first time we ever hear anything is when we are in the House. As political leaders we actually represent people. Just as we bring information and knowledge here, so too, I’m hoping, in the new year we will be able to turn around some of what we do in the House. It just becomes a screaming match.

The House is, and has always been, a robust House. There has been no pleasure in the House. You don’t grow in the House or grow to become a politician based on somebody’s goodwill towards you. However, the animosity that the House has cannot continue.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to thank everybody who makes it possible for us to be in the House on a weekly basis. Mr Hindley and his full staff, thank you very much.
I want to thank the service officers who run around and make it possible for us to have water and get our papers out in time.

To those who run Hansard, thank you very much. I’m happier with the fact that it’s reflecting much more of what we are saying.

I want to thank the media. I’m not always pleased with it. I think it doesn’t cover the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, but I think we are also in the shadow of the national Parliament. I suppose we should try to work harder at it.

It is Christmas and we will have a New Year. I want to wish everybody a very blessed Christmas – those who celebrate Christmas. Those who don’t celebrate Christmas, I wish them happy holidays. It is a time for us to rejuvenate. It is a time to spend our time with our families and loved ones. I wish you well. Drive safely, and don’t drink and drive. It doesn’t matter what you think, just do not get behind the wheel.

Merry Christmas, and a happy and prosperous New Year to you.

†Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Mr Deputy Speaker, let me start off by saying thank you to all the colleagues in the Chamber who have made an effort to welcome me back after a delayed exit. I’ve been back since April and it has been hard work. It’s been pretty intense, but I would like to thank all the members for assisting me in that process. It’s very much valued.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank you, the Speaker, the Premier, the Cabinet Ministers and members generally for the hard work. As a House, we’ve achieved a lot. The government obviously continues with its track record of achievement, but I think more could be done. If we all take up our responsibility of ensuring that government works for all the people all the time as we proceed into the next year, then whatever we are doing is going to have an impact on the way in which government performs.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I would not like to repeat the words of Minister Botha and the hon member Brown but to concur with them one hundred per cent. I would not want to repeat what they have said, but I agree one hundred per cent with what Minister Botha has said and what member Brown has said.

I think we need to note that as we celebrate Christmas, the New Year and the festive season we must not forget those who have far less than us. We must not forget the people who are disadvantaged. If we make a resolution to build bridges between racism in the Western Cape we are going to go a long way to healing the racial divisions and moving into a new year where race no longer plays such an active role in the way in which we share our discussions and the way in which we decide on our support or non support for particular initiatives of government.

I would like to thank my own support staff, Dustin, for his hard work over this period. I’ve expected a lot of him and I think he has achieved very well under the circumstances.

The interpreters are those who we never see. Every time when somebody in the House is speaking one of the interpreters is speaking. They speak more than we do put together, and I would like to thank them particularly.
Mr Deputy Speaker, as we move through Christmas, let us not forget that the impact of Jesus Christ has been massive and that it’s ongoing. He has impacted the whole of life, as we know it, for 2 000 years and we should not forget that as we move into Christmas and New Year.

I would like to thank the members and wish them a very happy Christmas and New Year. I look forward to seeing everybody back again next year. Be safe on the roads.


Loonto yandibonisa into yokuba ngaba xa thina sikhoko le Ntshona Koloni sinokuthi sisebenzisane ukwenzela into yokuba kubo bonke abantu bebephaya kweza zibane babe nayo into yokutya ngekrisimesi njengokuba mna ndiza kuba ndonwabile nabantwana bam ndivuyela ukuzaalwa kukaYesu nomnye umuntu aze abe naye uza konwaba ngolo hlobo. Iyafuna ke ukuba siyijonge ngolo hlobo into esiyenzayo siyile Ndlu yoWiso-mthetho ingakumbi ukuphuhlisa nokuphulisa abantu phaya ezantsi ngoba yeyona nto esingayo apha.


[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.]

[Ms T N BEVU (COPE): Speaker, I am going to speak isiXhosa. Let me first start by thanking all present here, Members of Parliament, the leader or the Premier of the Western Cape and her Cabinet. I want to thank them for the co-operation we have had. We come from different parties but what has united us is only to better the lives of the poor. On Sunday I was here for the lights when the Mayor of the City of Cape Town was putting them on. The picture I saw is that of seeing people from different races, blacks, whites, coloureds, Indians, etc being together to put the lights on.
That showed me that if we as leading this Western Cape can work together to ensure that all those who attended the lights ceremony could have something to eat for Christmas as I will be enjoying myself with my kids for the birth of Jesus Christ I wish that others would be enjoying themselves just like me. We need to look at such things as this Legislature, especially when it comes to improving and developing people down there as they are the main reason we are here.

I want to thank all the staff of this Western Cape Legislature because we would not be sitting here if there was nobody working for us. There are so many things done here and the staff have been mentioned by my colleague who has just spoken here as well as the hon member Brown and the hon Minister Botha. We would like to thank all those who play a role in this Western Cape Legislature. I hope as we are going on holiday, and we have been told that we must drive safely, we have a happy Christmas and a prosperous New Year so that we meet here again alive. I also want to tell those going to Mangaung we ask God to be with them so that they can hold a successful conference without any hinderances.]

*Mr R B LENTIT (ID): Mr Deputy Speaker, if I could speak Afrikaans it would be very clear that it comes from the bottom of my heart. Many of us have lost family members this year, who have been very close to us, and many have also expressed their condolences to others.

There are members of Parliament who are also going to be very heart sore during Christmas time. We also know that there are going to be other people out there who are also going to be heart sore. Photos and videos of the people who are no longer with us today do not lessen the pain. We must reach out to people who have lost their families.

We all have our own houses and homes. The best place to be during Christmas time, is at your own home, because if you are on the road, you can easily become part of the statistics. I pray that we do not become part of the statistics and will return to Parliament next year. No officials in the building must become part of the statistics where we then have to express our condolences with their families.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lentit. Also from the side of the Chair, I wish all members a peaceful, blessed and safe festive season.

That concludes the business of the day and the Fourth Session of the Fourth Parliament. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 12:00.
ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

FRIDAY, 7 DECEMBER 2012

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. The vacancy which occurred in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament owing to the resignation of Mr P M McKenzie has been filled with effect from 1 December 2012 by the nomination of Ms D Gopie. The member had taken the oath in the Speaker’s office on 6 December 2012.

2. Assent by Premier in respect of Bills

   (a) Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B 6–2012] – Act 6 of 2012 (assented to and signed by Premier on 5 December 2012).

   (b) Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill [B 7–2012] – Act 7 of 2012 (assented to and signed by Premier on 5 December 2012).

   (c) Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] – Act 8 of 2012 (assented to and signed by Premier on 6 December 2012).

3. Publication of Act 6 of 2012


4. Publication of Act 7 of 2012


5. Publication of Act 8 of 2012


6. Referral of draft bills to committees in terms of Rule 220:

   (a) Standing Committee on Local Government

       Draft Geomatics Profession Bill, 2012 (NCOP) (proposed section 75 Bill).

   (b) Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development

       Draft Banks Amendment Bill, 2012 (NCOP) (proposed section 75 Bill).

   (c) Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning

       Draft Fertilizers and Feeds Bill, 2012 (NCOP) (proposed section 75 Bill).
MONDAY, 10 DECEMBER 2012

COMMITTEE REPORT

The Speaker:

REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS DATED 4 December 2012

The Standing Committee on Public Accounts (the Committee) of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, having considered the financial statements included in the Annual Reports for the financial year ending 31 March 2012 of the following Provincial Departments:

1. Department of the Premier;
2. Provincial Parliament;
3. Provincial Treasury;
4. Community Safety;
5. Education;
6. Health;
7. Social Development;
8. Human Settlements;
9. Environmental Affairs and Development Planning;
10. Transport and Public Works;
11. Agriculture;
12. Economic Development and Tourism;
13. Cultural Affairs and Sport; and
14. Local Government;

having considered the financial statements included in the Annual Reports for the financial year ending 31 March 2012 of the following Public Entities:

1. Western Cape Language Committee;
2. Western Cape Cultural Commission;
3. Western Cape Nature Conservation Board (Cape Nature);
4. Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency (Wesgro);
5. Government Motor Transport;
6. Destination Marketing Organisation (Cape Town Routes Unlimited);
7. Heritage Western Cape;
8. Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board;
9. CASIDRA (Pty) Ltd; and
10. Cape Medical Depot;

and having considered the reports of the Auditor-General and the Audit Committees, and having heard evidence from the Executive Member (the Premier, Minister or Speaker), the Head of Department (Director-General or HOD), the Auditor-General, the Audit Committee, delegated representatives of Corporate Services Centre (CSC) located within the Department of the Premier, the CEO’s and Board Members of the Public Entities and members of the public in attendance at the discussions on the 2011/12 Annual Reports of the Departments and Public Entities of the Western Cape Provincial Government, the Committee wishes to report as follows:
The Committee wishes to thank the Premier and Ministers, the Director-General and Heads of Departments, the Auditor-General and the Audit Committees, and all other role players, for the information provided towards ensuring efficient and productive oversight outcomes from this process.

However, the Committee notes with disappointment that very few members of the public attended these sessions and resolved to engage with Provincial Parliament in this regard, in order to increase public interest and participation in this and other important oversight processes all Standing Committees are continuously engaged in.

In terms of audit outcomes reported by the Auditor-General, the Committee is pleased to note that, of the fourteen Provincial Government departments including Provincial Parliament, four achieved financially unqualified audit opinions with no findings (representing no change from the previous year). However, nine achieved financially unqualified audit opinions with findings (representing a regression from eleven the previous year) and one achieved a qualified audit opinion with findings (representing a regression from none overall the previous year). In terms of the twelve Public Entities, the Committee notes that six achieved financially unqualified audit opinions with no findings (representing an increase from two the previous year) and five achieved financially qualified audit opinions with findings (representing a regression from eight the previous year). The Committee congratulates those Departments and Entities that have achieved clean audit status, particularly those that retained this status from the previous financial year(s).

In respect of the Western Cape Housing Development Fund, whose audit report has not been issued by the time this Committee’s oversight process was concluded, and the Provincial Development Council, whose report was not considered during this process because its senior officials were not present, the Committee resolved to hold public meetings for the discussion of these two 2011/12 Annual Reports and to issue a supplementary report on our resolutions arising from these sessions by the end of the 2012/2013 financial year.

The Committee thanks the HOD’s for responding timeously to its request for more documentary information.

In this regard, it resolved to study these documents and issue supplementary resolutions arising from this information, in the supplementary report mentioned above. Furthermore, with regard to the table of SCOPA resolutions contained in the Annual Reports, the Committee resolved to engage National Treasury before the end of the 2012/13 financial year, with the view of standardising this template across Departments and Entities for the 2012/13 Annual Report publications. In noting Cabinet’s decision regarding Management Reports and Internal Audit Reports, the Committee resolved to engage the Auditor-General with the view of refining the level of information provided to the Committee in the briefing documents it provides and sessions it conducts. In relation to eradicating any irregularities in the Western Cape Government, including corruption, fraud, theft and misuse of government property, the Committee recommends that Departments also publish the outcomes of completed disciplinary processes along with the other deterrence mechanisms including the Forensic Investigation Unit’s (FIU) contact details.

In relation to each Department and Public Entity, the Committee further wishes to report as follows:
1. DEPARTMENT OF THE PREMIER

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that this remains unchanged for the third year.

Whilst the committee is pleased, the opportunity for regression remains as does the Department’s commitments to achieving clean audit by 2014. The Committee requests that the Department incorporates the Annual Performance Plans of its entities into its own Annual Performance Plan and Annual Report for 2012/13 and beyond.

The Committee congratulates Ms. Misrole for receiving the Runner up Risk Manager of the Year Award and Ms. Kinnes for receiving the Up and Coming Risk Manager of the Year Award, both from the Institute of Risk Management South Africa.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND/-CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Pages**: 41 and 46 of the Annual Report  
**Heading**: “5.3.1 Internal Audit”  
**Description**: The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 42.86%, compared to 29.17% for the 2010/11 financial year. | **1.1.1** The Committee requests that the Premier and Director-General continues to engage with Cabinet and PT in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives particularly in high risk areas;  
**1.1.2** It schedules a meeting with the Minister of Finance, the Director-General and Provincial Treasury with the aim of motivating for more funds to enhance the audit coverage to all departments; | To be scheduled by SCOPA. |
| **Page**: 45 of the Annual Report  
**Heading**: “Areas highlighted by Internal Audit for improvement”  
**Description**: The Committee shares the concerns raised by the Audit Committee in noting the Department’s key control deficiencies in relation to the induction training and orientation and performance management. | **1.1.3** The Department’s corrective actions should be implemented without delay and that it provides a written update to the Committee in this regard; | By 15 April 2012. |
<p>| <strong>Page</strong>: 47 of the Annual Report | <strong>1.1.4</strong> The Department briefs it on the impact | To be scheduled by |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND/CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Report.</td>
<td>and benchmarking of the Corporate Services Centre (&quot;CSC&quot;), and the results of the comparative analysis (2010/11 and 2011/12);</td>
<td>SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Significant events that have taken place during the year and major projects undertaken or completed during the year”</td>
<td>1.1.5 Corporate Services Centre (&quot;CSC&quot;) address the root causes of this concern to prevent future recurrences and that it reports to the Committee on the steps it has taken in this regard, including the impact thereof;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee notes the establishment of the Corporate Services Centre and its operation for the full financial year.</td>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 47 of the Annual Report</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Significant events that have taken place during the year and major projects undertaken or completed during the year”. <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee shares the Auditor General’s concern that there were significant delays in obtaining Human Resources Management files and records in order to clarify issues relating to the audit, such as leave forms, overtime details and various appointment documents, and that this resulted in less time being available to audit the information. This concern was raised in relation to Provincial Treasury specifically.</td>
<td><strong>Pages:</strong> 49 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Significant events that have taken place during the year and major projects undertaken or completed during the year” (Paragraph 5) <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee notes that the further development of the provincial government’s performance management system (PERMIS), namely PERMIS Version 3 is in process with an implementation date of 1 April 2012.</td>
<td>1.1.6 The Department briefs it on the Permis System, including its similarities and differences to the Dashboard system and a cost-benefit analysis of these; To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 49 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Significant events that have taken place during the year and major projects undertaken or completed during the year”. <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee notes that the further development of the provincial government’s performance management system (PERMIS), namely PERMIS Version 3 is in process with an implementation date of 1 April 2012.</td>
<td>1.1.7 The Department briefs it on the future plans of its ICT transversal services, including the challenges it is experi-</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BACKGROUND-/CONCERNS</strong></td>
<td><strong>RESOLUTIONS</strong></td>
<td><strong>ACTION DATE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>events that have taken place during the year and major projects undertaken or completed during the year‖ (Paragraph 6) <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee shares the Auditor-General's concerns that controls to ensure the effective continuity of IT services have been designed but have not been implemented for the audit. The application development managers have not exercised appropriate oversight to ensure compliance to the approved backup policy. As a result, a disaster recovery location has not been specified, backups are not regularly restored and offsite storage has not been implemented for all backups.</td>
<td><strong>1.1.8</strong> The Department briefs it on its ICT Infrastructure Investment initiative, providing an analysis of the impact of external drivers, including the current inflation rate and other economic factors, how these impact on procurement and roll out, and what the Department's response is;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages:</strong> Page 50 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Spending Trends” (Paragraph 2) <strong>Description:</strong> (Programme4) The Centre for e-Innovation accounted for a major share of the Department's expenditure accounting for 56% in 2011/12. The sub-programme GITO Management Services accounted for 48.53% of total 2011/12 expenditure.</td>
<td><strong>1.1.9</strong> The Department presents it with its plan to address the concerns raised by the Auditor-General;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 57 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “11: Asset Management”. <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee shares the concerns raised by the Auditor-General relating to the BAUD (Bioacoustical Utilisation Device) Electronic Asset Register System which has been adopted and implemented by the Department to scan and control the access of staff. These relate to user access control and the Department's reliance on the third party service provider.</td>
<td><strong>1.1.10</strong> To design a new report tem-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND/-CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>al Report</td>
<td>plate relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 63 of the Annual Report</td>
<td>1.1.11 The Department presents it with a report on the root causes of the losses, details of the items themselves and the preventative measures introduced to avoid such a recurrence;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Material Impairments” (Paragraph 9).</td>
<td>1.1.12 The Department presents its Skills Transfer Plan to the Committee;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 65 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading</strong>: “Investigations” (Paragraph 26)</td>
<td>1.1.13 The Forensic Investigation Unit briefs the Committee on the history and progress achieved in relation to the two investigations referred to in Par-</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee notes that the Department could not locate assets valued at R3,762 million.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND/CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Department high-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lighted the issue of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>three investi-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gations which were</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>undertaken by the F-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>orensic Investiga-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tion Unit includ-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ing the costs assos-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ciated with centralisation of the Corporate Services Centre and the “value for money” assessment derived from its implementation. The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s concern that the Department’s leadership does not have a documented policy or procedures to guide the operations of the department with regards to the implementation, monitoring and reporting processes emanating from reports issued by the Forensic Investigations Unit (FIU), and that the lack of a centralised electronic database where all litigation cases are registered, updated and monitored for progress thereof.</td>
<td>agraph 26 of the Annual Report (The Hip Hop matter);</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.1.14 The Audit Committee briefs the Committee on the 2007 outstanding financial irregularities pertaining to Hip-Hop Media;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.1.15 The Forensic Investigation Unit presents recommendations on the Hip-Hop Media financial irregularity matter to the Committee;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.1.16 The Forensic Investigation Unit reports to the Committee on the R20 million investigations currently underway;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.1.17 The Department addresses these concerns and prepares a report to the Committee in this regard;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 65 of the Annual Report</td>
<td>1.1.18 The Department briefs the Committee on its Performance Readiness Audit;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Performance audit” (Paragraph 27)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee notes that a performance audit was conducted on the readiness of Government to report on its performance, as well as the systems and processes which were put in place.</td>
<td>1.1.19 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that manages heritage assets and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 67 of the Annual Report</td>
<td>1.1.20 The Department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal, loss and value, and that all relevant details be included in its future annual reports;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Payment for Capital Assets”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value.</td>
<td>1.1.21 The Department drafts a clause to be included in future annual reports;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 84 of the Annual Report</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BACKGROUND/-CONCERNS</strong></td>
<td><strong>RESOLUTIONS</strong></td>
<td><strong>ACTION DATE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report. <strong>Heading</strong>: “Accounting Policies”. <strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the Department is not complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice.</td>
<td>inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages</strong>: 94 and 95 of the Annual Report <strong>Heading</strong>: “Debts written off” (Paragraph 8.2) and “Staff debt” (Paragraph 11.2). <strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned about levels of staff debt, especially those older than 3 years, and that this debt is written off in many instances, when staff fail to settle the debt after they leave the Departments of their employ.</td>
<td>1.1.22 The Department closely manages the process when staff leave its employ to ensure that staff with debt do not leave without at least re-acknowledging their debt and committing to a payment plan (only if settling the debt is impossible);</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 112 of the Annual Report <strong>Heading</strong>: “Statement of gifts, donations and sponsorships made and remissions, refunds and payments made as an act of grace for the year ended 31 March 2012” (Annexure 5) <strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made.</td>
<td>1.1.23 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the Head of Department (HOD) regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Systems Audit Findings</strong> <strong>Description</strong>: The Committee shares the various concerns raised in the Auditor-General’s report and in the briefing documents presented to the Committee, that are based on the</td>
<td>1.1.24 The Department ensures the implementation of mechanisms which address the concerns raised; and</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.25 The Department presents the Committee with its plan to address the concerns raised by the Auditor-General.</td>
<td></td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND-/CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>final management report to the Department, relating, inter alia, to the design and implementation of an IT Governance Framework, Formal control over IT systems, IT Service continuity, User access control, Programme Change Management, Security management to ensure the reliability of the systems and the availability, accuracy and protection of information.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.2 **LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED**

That the Department of the Premier provides the Committee with the following:

1.2.1 A copy of the Department’s Mid Term Review as per page 47 of the Annual report;

1.2.2 A list of activities which were initiated through the Projects Facilitation Unit (as from July 2010/2011) as per 48 of the Annual Report;

1.2.3 A detailed report evaluating the outcomes of Programmes and Projects as per page 48 of the Annual Report;

1.2.4 A detailed report of the findings of IT Systems 101 as per page 56 of the Annual Report;

1.2.5 A copy of the 20 page direct response to the Auditor-General on the Disaster Recovery Plan;

1.2.6 A detailed breakdown of the 61,1% increase relating to GG vehicles (page 52), air travel and advertising which increased from R7,2 million to R14,9 million (page 52);

1.2.7 A detailed report highlighting the comparison of the advertising and communication of the Department in relation to all other Departments of the Provincial Government;

1.2.8 A detailed breakdown of all cases (and the status of these) for the financial year 2010/2011 as per page 65 of the Annual Report;

1.2.9 A detailed report from FIU regarding the Hip-Hop investigation, including the ascertaining whether a proper needs analysis had been implemented and details regarding which departments and employees have been implicated in the investigation;
1.2.10 A detailed report of the number and current status of the excess staff of CE-I;

1.2.11 A detailed breakdown of heading 4.3 (Consultants, contractors and agency/outsources services) and 4.7 (Travel and subsistence) as per pages 92 and 93 respectively, which explains the value for money to the Province;

1.2.12 A report on the anti-corruption cases (investigations) which have been undertaken by the Special Investigation Unit as well as the Forensic Investigation Unit. This should include the successes reached by these Units in the reported cases as per page 56, under heading no “18” and “19” of the Annual Report of the Department of Local Government;

1.2.13 A register which ensures that heritage assets are located, valued and properly conserved; and that the Department publishes the heritage assets register in its 2012/13 Annual Report;

1.2.14 A detailed report as per the donations and governing policies which highlights Annexure 4 as per page 111 of the Annual Report of the Department;

1.2.15 A detailed report indicating the security compliment and grades of officers stationed at Kromme Rhee; and

1.2.16 A detailed breakdown of heading 11.1 (Claims recoverable) as per page 95 which explains the value for money to the Province.

2. PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no other matters, for the third year in a row. Whilst the Committee is pleased, the opportunity for regression remains as does the Department’s commitments to maintaining a clean audit status past 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 40 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading</strong>: “Areas highlighted by Internal Audit for improvement”. <strong>Description</strong>: Due to the broad explanation of the three areas highlighted, 1) Provincial Parliament does not provide exact reasons for the deficiencies for Legal Services, and 2) That Parliament does not have a policy in place for procure-</td>
<td>2.1.1 The Accounting Officer ensures that a service level agreement (SLA) with definable parameters is introduced, which is applicable to all committees, ensures that the services of outside legal advisers are acquired even if for protracted periods;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013. By 15 April 2013. To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 The Speaker provides guidelines to all committees pertaining to obtaining legal opinions;</td>
<td>2.1.3 The Speaker provides guidelines to all committees as to the treatment of classified documents submitted to committees;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4 The Speaker provides guidelines to all committees regarding in-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee also shares the Audit Committee's concern relating to the Key Control Deficiencies in the areas of plenary support, legal services and monitoring and evaluation.</td>
<td>committee processes vis-à-vis clause 28 (1)-(3) of Western Cape Constitution;</td>
<td>2.1.5 The Accounting Officer reports to the Committee on what corrective action has been taken in respect of these Key Control Deficiencies and the impact thereof;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 41 of the Annual Report. Heading:&quot;Internal Audit&quot;. Description: Due to Provincial Parliament not having an Internal Audit function, the Department of the Premier’s Internal Audit Directorate is contracted to provide this function. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 40,74%, compared to 75% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td>2.1.6 Provincial Parliament assesses the feasibility of establishing its own Internal Audit function, that it approaches Provincial Treasury for funding in this regard, and that it submits a report to the Committee in this regard;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 45 of the Annual Report. Heading: “Report Of The Accounting Officer: Compensation of employees”. Description: The Committee is concerned about the high turnover of staff to other Parliamentary institutions.</td>
<td>2.1.7 Provincial Parliament develops a staff retention policy and implementation plan, a copy of which is presented to this Committee and the Rules Committee.</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pages: 45 of the Annual Report. Heading: “Significant events during the year (Last Paragraph)” Description: The Committee is concerned about the under spending of R10,975 million and that no steps were taken to effectively address the matter. This is a recurring concern.</td>
<td>2.1.8 Provincial Parliament takes steps to avoid a recurrence of the underspending;</td>
<td>By 30 January 2013. To be scheduled by SCOPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 46 of the Annual Report. Heading: “Administration” Description: The Committee notes with concern that the Skills Audit that was undertaken (at a cost of R487 000-00) was not implemented.</td>
<td>2.1.10 The Accounting Officer drafts an implementation plan and presents it to the Committee, with a copy provided to the Rules Committee;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 47 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>2.1.11 The Secretary implements the e-filing system without delay;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Machinery and equipment”.</td>
<td>2.1.12 The Secretary presents a progress report to the Committee, with a copy provided to the Rules Committee;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that the e-filing system has not been implemented.</td>
<td>2.1.13 Provincial Parliament prioritises the customisation and implementation of the Sector Oversight Model;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 48 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>2.1.14 The budget for media coverage, Public Relations and Public Education and Outreach be increased generally, but specifically in the lead up to and during the consideration of the Annual Reports, the annual Appropriations and the annual Adjustment Appropriations in order to increase public awareness and participation during these vital periods;</td>
<td>By 30 Jan. 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Services rendered by the Western Cape Provincial Parliament” (Point 2.1).</td>
<td>2.1.15 The Committee resolved to design a new report template relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Provincial Parliament replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 Annual Report onwards, once received;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned about the limited amount of funds being allocated by Provincial Parliament for public participation relating to important events, such as the Annual Report period, Appropriation and the Adjustment Appropriation periods (for advertising, public participation, etc).</td>
<td>2.1.16 The Provincial Parliament drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Provincial Parliament confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 51-52 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>2.1.17 The Provincial Parliament drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Provincial Parliament confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Scopa Resolutions”.</td>
<td>2.1.18 The Committee resolved to design a new report template relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Provincial Parliament replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 Annual Report onwards, once received;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee’s resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review.</td>
<td>2.1.19 The Provincial Parliament drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Provincial Parliament confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 80 of the Annual Report</td>
<td>2.1.20 The Provincial Parliament drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Provincial Parliament confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Accounting Policy”</td>
<td>2.1.21 The Provincial Parliament drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Provincial Parliament confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 days in the year under review.</td>
<td><strong>2.1.17</strong> Provincial Parliament ensures that heritage assets are located, valued and properly conserved; <strong>2.1.18</strong> Provincial Parliament publishes the heritage assets register in its 2012/13 Annual Report; <strong>2.1.19</strong> Provincial Parliament urgently drafts a policy in this regard and presents it to this Committee, and informs the Rules Committee thereof;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 85 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Movable Assets”. <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and the office of the Speaker that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value.</td>
<td><strong>2.1.20</strong> The Provincial Parliament closely manages the process when staff leaves its employ to ensure that staff with debt do not leave without at least re-acknowledging their debt and committing to a payment plan (only if settling the debt is impossible);</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages:</strong> 95 and 97 of the Annual Report <strong>Heading:</strong> “Debts written off” (Paragraph 7.2) and “Receivables” (Paragraph 12) <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned about levels of staff debt, especially those older than 3 years, and that this debt is written off in many instances. When staff fail to settle the debt after they leave the Departments of their employ.</td>
<td><strong>2.1.21</strong> The Provincial Parliament urgently designs and implements adequate prevention and detection controls to ensure that irregular expenditure does not occur;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages:</strong> 104 and 105 of the Annual Report <strong>Heading:</strong> “23: Irregular Expenditure”. <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that irregular expenditure totalling R138 000 was incurred by the WCPP relating to the procurement of goods and services in contravention with Chapter 4 of the WCPP Accounting Officer’s supply chain management system (AO system) as well as non-compliance with procurement and contract management regulations. Included in this amount is irregular expenditure of R119 000 which was detected during the audit of procurement and contract management and which was not prevented or detected by the department’s internal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>control activities.</td>
<td>2.1.22 The Speaker engages the Department of Community Safety and other role players with the view to ensuring the safety and security of Members and Staff within the precincts of the Provincial Parliament;</td>
<td>By 30 January 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 107 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>2.1.23 The Speaker undertakes a detailed risk assessment of precincts of the Provincial Parliament as well as when Parliament and/or its committees convene outside the precinct;</td>
<td>By 28 February 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: Point 25 (c) - “Department of Community Safety in the Western Cape Province provides Security Services in the building occupied by the Provincial Parliament”.</td>
<td>2.1.24 Provincial Parliament obtains the services of a security adviser to advise Parliament with regards to these two resolutions;</td>
<td>By 28 February 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned about the overall safety of the Members and staff of Provincial Parliament within the building of 7 and 15 Wale Street.</td>
<td>2.1.25 Provincial Parliament drafts and adopts a policy that guides the Secretary regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Provincial Parliament includes more details relating to this in future annual reports;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 120 of the Annual Report</td>
<td>2.1.26 The Provincial Parliament implements mechanisms which address the concerns raised; and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Statement of Gifts, e)</td>
<td>2.1.27 The Provincial Parliament presents its plan in this regard to the Committee.</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made.</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Systems Audit Findings</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee shares the various concerns raised in the Auditor-General’s report and in the briefing documents presented to the Committee, that are based on the final management report to the Department, relating, inter alia, to the design and implementation of an IT Governance Framework, Formal control over IT systems, IT Service continuity, User access control, Programme Change Management, Security manage-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2 **LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED**

That the Provincial Parliament provides the Committee with the following:

2.2.1 The Memorandum of Understanding document between Provincial Parliament and the Enterprise Risk Management Unit;

2.2.2 The Public Participation Policy which was developed in the previous Parliament as per page 48 of the Annual Report;

2.2.3 The Acting, Transfer and Secondment Policy of Provincial Parliament as per page 49 of the Annual Report;

2.2.4 The action plans for the utilisation of the donor funds as per page 49 of the Annual Report;

2.2.5 The Disaster Recovery Plan of the Provincial Parliament as per page 52 of the Annual Report (only once finalised);

2.2.6 The Achievement of Planned Targets Document, as per page 58, item 17 of the Annual Report;

2.2.7 The travelling procedures guideline for Members and travelling policy for staff as per page 75 of the Annual Report (Subsistence and Travel Policies);

2.2.8 A list of all contracted and outsourced service providers, including a breakdown of the services which were rendered and all financial costs attached for services rendered, as per page 92, in item 5 of the Annual Report;

2.2.9 A list indicating whether the officials, by designation and directorate, received a reprimand on more than one occasion, as per page 105 (Note 23.2 “details of irregular expenditure- current year”) of the Annual Report; and

2.2.10 The Security Policy/ Act of Parliament, as per page 107, item 25 of section C of the Annual Report.

3. **PROVINCIAL TREASURY**

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Departments Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no findings. The Committee is pleased this is an improvement from the compliance findings recorded in the previous year. However, the opportunity for regression remains as does the Department’s commitments to maintaining a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 The Committee resolved that:</td>
<td>3.1.1 Provincial Treasury issues a directive to all Departments in this regard, highlighting the problem, explaining the need and the risks of this not being addressed, and di-</td>
<td>By 28 Feb 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 51 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> General review of the state of financial affairs&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rectifying the introduction of mechanisms that address this concern;</td>
<td>3.1.2 The Department briefs the Committee on the progress it has made regarding the lack of timeous communication between the departments and Provincial Treasury which resulted in the user accounts not being deactivated immediately after their employment was terminated;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 55-56 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>3.1.3 A new report template be designed relating to the Department’s actions on SCOPA resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading: “Scopa Resolutions”.</td>
<td>3.1.4 The Department prepares a presentation to the Committee on this lawsuit matter;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description: The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee’s resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review.</td>
<td>3.1.5 The Department makes provision for the liability that may result from the lawsuit;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 60 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>3.1.6 The Department drafts a plan to increase internal audit coverage to all provincial government departments and related entities, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives particularly in high risk areas, and presents it to the Committee, once scheduled;</td>
<td>By 28 Feb 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description: The Committee raised a concern that the Department is a defendant in a lawsuit and that no provision for any liability that may result has been made in the financial statements.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading: “Internal Control (Paragraph 18)”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description: The Committee shares the concern expressed by all the Ministers, Head of Departments, Audit Committee and the Internal Audit that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial to support the increased coverage of further high risk</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</strong></td>
<td><strong>RESOLUTIONS</strong></td>
<td><strong>ACTION DATE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 46.15%, compared to 26.67% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td><strong>3.1.7</strong> The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td><strong>By 15 April 2013</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 73 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Accounting Policies”. <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee congratulates the Department for complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice, noting the Auditor Generals finding that the Department achieved an average payment period of 30 days in the year under review.</td>
<td><strong>3.1.8</strong> The Department closely manages the process when staff leaves its employ to ensure that staff with debt do not leave without at least re-acknowledging their debt and committing to a payment plan (only if settling the debt is impossible);</td>
<td><strong>By 15 April 2013</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages:</strong> 84 and 86 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Debts written off” (Paragraph 6.2) and “Receivables” (Paragraph 11) <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is transversally concerned about levels of staff debt, especially those older than 3 years, and that this debt is written off in many instances. When staff fail to settle the debt after they leave the Departments of their employ.</td>
<td><strong>3.1.9</strong> The Department drafts and adopts a heritage assets policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The Committee resolved further that the Department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of heritage assets, and that all such details be included in its future annual reports;</td>
<td><strong>By 15 April 2013</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages:</strong> 85 of the Annual Report of the Department. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Expenditure for Capital Assets (Paragraph 8)”. <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value.</td>
<td><strong>3.1.10</strong> The Department designs and implements</td>
<td><strong>By 15 April 2013</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS | RESOLUTIONS | ACTION DATE
--- | --- | ---
Report. | implements adequate prevention and detection controls to ensure that irregular expenditure does not occur; and | 
**Heading:** “24 Irregular Expenditure”. |
**Description:** The Committee is concerned about the irregular expenditure of R1 801 000, as disclosed in note 24 to the financial statements. The irregular expenditure was incurred by the Department. |
**Page:** 102 of the Annual Report. |
**Heading:** “Statement of gifts, donations and sponsorships made and remissions, refunds and payments made as an act of grace” (Annexure 1E). |
**Description:** The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made. |
3.1.11 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports. | By 15 April 2013. |

### 3.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Provincial Treasury provide the Committee with the following:

3.2.1 A detailed breakdown of the number of interns and demographical status as per page 53 of the Annual Report (heading 3, paragraph 2);
3.2.2 An explanation which highlights the status of the Provincial Treasury Instructions of Provincial Treasury in relation to National Treasury, including the gaps filled in the audit process as per page 55 of the Annual Report (heading “SCOPA resolutions”);
3.2.4 The Policy which governs Annexure 1E (NATURE OF GIFT, DONATION OR SPONSORSHIP) as per page 102 of the Annual Report; and
3.2.5 A detailed breakdown of Annexure 5 (INTER-GOVERNMENT PAYABLES) as per page 104 of the Annual Report.

### 4. DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY SAFETY

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no findings. The committee is pleased this remains unchanged for the third year. However, the opportunity for regression remains as does the Department’s commitments to achieving clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Page:** 50 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** "Areas highlighted by Internal Audit for improvement".  
**Description:** The Committee shares the concerns raised by the Audit Committee in noting the Department's key control deficiencies in relation to the Provincial Security Operations, Traffic Training and Development and Social Crime Prevention. | 4.1.1 The Department implements corrective actions without delay and provides a written update to the Committee in this regard; | By 15 April 2013 |
| **Page:** 51 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** "Internal Audit".  
**Description:** The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The current audit coverage is 42.86% for the 2011/12 financial year compared to 46.15% in the 2010/11 financial year. The audit coverage target for the 2012/13 financial year is 23%. | 4.1.2 The Minister and HOD continue to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas; | |
| **Page:** 55 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “Scopa Resolutions".  
**Description:** The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee's resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review. | 4.1.3 A new report template be designed relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received; | |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 79 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>4.1.4 The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Accounting Policies”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee congratulates the Department for complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice, noting the Auditor General’s finding that the Department achieved an average payment period of 30 days in the year under review.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages</strong>: 95 and 96 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>4.1.5 The Department introduces strict controls relating to all staff salary payments with the aim of detecting and preventing errors of over-payment;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Debts written off” (Paragraph 6.2) and “Receivables” (Paragraph 11).</td>
<td>4.1.6 The Department provides the Committee with further details regarding the R209 000 reflected;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is transversally concerned about levels of staff debt, especially those older than 3 years, and that this debt is written off in many instances. When staff fail to settle the debt after they leave the Departments of their employ.</td>
<td>4.1.7 The Department closely manages the process when staff leaves its employ to ensure that staff with debt do not leave without at least re-acknowledging their debt and commitment to a payment plan (only if settling the debt is impossible);</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 112 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>4.1.8 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports; and</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Statement of gifts, donations and sponsorships made and remissions, refunds and payments made as an act of grace” (Annexure 1D).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Department of Community Safety provides the Committee with the following:

4.2.1 A register which ensures that heritage assets are located, valued and properly conserved; and that the Department publishes the heritage assets register in its 2012/13 Annual Report;

4.2.2 A detailed report as per the donations and governing policies which highlights Annexure 1C as per page 111 of the Annual Report of the Department; and

4.2.3 A detailed report highlighting the breakdown of the R20 000 as per page 103, under heading number 27- “Heritage Assets”.

5. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially qualified with findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that this is a regression from the previous year. Whilst the Committee is disappointed, the opportunity for improvement remains in line with the Department’s commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

| BACKGROUND /-CONCERNS | RESOLUTIONS: | ACTION DATE:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 97 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>5.1 The Committee resolved that:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Internal Audit” (Paragraph 6).</td>
<td>5.1.1 The Minister and HOD continues to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS:</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS:</th>
<th>ACTION DATE:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 40%, compared to 17.95% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td>5.1.2 A new report template is designed relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Page:** 102-105 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “SCOPA Resolutions” (Paragraph 14).  
**Description:** The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee’s resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review. | 5.1.3 The Department, in consultation with the Department of Transport and Public Works, briefs the Committee on the history, details and progress of the Magqwaka case; | To be scheduled by SCOPA. |
| **Page:** 106 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “Infrastructure matters: Magqwaka case” (Paragraph 19).  
**Description:** The Committee noted that the Department had ongoing discussions with the Department of Transport and Public Works concerning the Magqwaka case. The WCED is awaiting the final results of the legal process to account for any expenditure that may result from this. | 5.1.4 The Department updates the Committee on the progress of these actions being taken:  
(a) Developing criteria and definitions for mobile units and those that are not;  
(b) Devising definitions for and a system to separate mobile Grade R classrooms, kitchen units and library units;  
(c) Devising a tracking system for when units are moved;  
(d) Accounting separately for those units purchased by the Department of Transport and Public Works and treating them according to the National Treasury guidelines;  
(e) Accounting separately for those units purchased by SGBs and/or donated and ensuring they are reflected on the schools asset registers; | To be scheduled by SCOPA. |
counting policy. The AG found that the asset register relating to mobile classrooms, etc. was incomplete. Reasons for this include the variety of types of mobiles and prefabs which include mobile kitchens and donor-funded or SGB-purchased units.

(f) Agreement reached with Department of Transport and Public Works as to units considered as permanent as well as what role WCED will play, and include this in the Service Delivery Agreement with Department of Transport and Public Works; and

(g) The Department of Transport and Public Works implements mechanisms to detect and prevent a recurrence of this nature;

5.1.5 The Department urgently designs and implements adequate prevention and detection controls to ensure that such material misstatements do not re-occur;

By 15 April 2013.

5.1.6 The Department urgently implements procurement and contract controls that identifies and prevents these practices;

By 15 April 2013.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS:</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS:</th>
<th>ACTION DATE:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>that contracts and quotations were awarded to bidders who did not submit the relevant declarations.</td>
<td>5.1.7 The Department implements procurement and contract controls that identifies and prevents these practices;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Page:** 113 of the Annual Report.

**Heading:** “Procurement and contract management” (Paragraphs 31, 32 and 33).

**Description:** The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s finding that employees of the Department performed remunerative work outside their employment in the Department. Persons in service of the Department (either themselves or whose close family members, partners or associates) had private or business interests on contracts awarded by the Department failed to disclose such information.

| Page: 114 of the Annual Report. | 5.1.8 The Department identifies and implements sufficient financial and performance management controls in order to address the 2010/11 and 2011/12 audit findings; | By 15 April 2013. |

**Heading:** “Financial and Performance Management” (Paragraph 41).

**Description:** The Committee notes that the financial management improvement plan proved to be insufficient to address the internal control deficiencies identified in the 2010/11 audit findings.

| Page: 114 of the Annual Report. | 5.1.9 The Department implements monitoring controls and adequate follow-up mechanisms in order to reduce the list and extent of outstanding debtors; | By 15 April 2013. |

**Heading:** “Financial and Performance Management” (Paragraph 43).

**Description:** The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s findings that there was a lack of monitoring controls and adequate follow up over outstanding debtors.

| Page: 132 of the Annual Report. | 5.1.10 The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted credi- | By 15 April 2013. |

**Heading:** “Accounting Policies”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS:</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS:</th>
<th>ACTION DATE:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that the Department is not complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td><strong>5.1.11</strong> The Department briefs it on the full extent of the irregular expenditure and what mechanisms have been introduced to detect and prevent future irregular expenditure;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 153 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>5.1.12</strong> The Department drafts and adopts a heritage assets policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The Committee resolved further that the Department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of heritage assets and that all such details be included in its future annual reports; and</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Irregular Expenditure” (Note 24).</td>
<td><strong>5.1.13</strong> The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports.</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee notes with concern the Auditor-General’s findings that the irregular expenditure of R52,408 million disclosed is understated as the full extent of the irregularities was still in the process of being determined by the Department at the time the Auditor-General briefed the Committee.</td>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 161 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>29.4: Minor Assets”</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “29.4: Minor Assets”</td>
<td><strong>5.1.12</strong> The Department drafts and adopts a heritage assets policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The Committee resolved further that the Department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of heritage assets and that all such details be included in its future annual reports; and</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value.</td>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 169 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>Statement of gifts, donations and sponsorships made and remissions, refunds and payments made as an act of grace” (Annexure 1D).</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Statement of gifts, donations and sponsorships made and remissions, refunds and payments made as an act of grace” (Annexure 1D).</td>
<td><strong>5.1.12</strong> The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports.</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2 **LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED**

That the Department of Education provide the Committee with the following:

5.2.1 A detailed copy of the Readiness of Government to report on performance, as per page 115 of the Annual Report once it is released;

5.2.2 A detailed copy of the Performance Audit on Early Childhood Development – Grade R, as per page 115 of the Annual Report, once it is released;

5.2.3 A detailed report of Item 4 (Consultants, contractors and agency/outsource services) as per page 143 of the Annual Report;

5.2.4 A detailed report (including types of services rendered) of Item 24.2 (Details of irregular expenditure) as per pages 154-156 of the Annual Report; and

5.2.5 A register which ensures that heritage assets are located, valued and properly conserved; and that the Department publishes the heritage assets register in its 2012/13 Annual Report.

6. **DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH**

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that this is unchanged from the previous year. However, the opportunity for regression remains as does the Department’s commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014. The Committee congratulates Professor Househam and the Department on being awarded the PFMA Audit Award by the Auditor-General for a significant improvement in the 2011/12 year towards a clean administration, the operation of its self-initiated Internal Audit Units and its average supplier payment period of 13 days.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>lion in respect of irregular expenditure). This misstatement arose from inappropriate guidance given by the Provincial Treasury and could therefore not have been prevented or detected by the department’s system of internal control.</td>
<td>6.1.2 The Minister and HOD continues to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading: “Internal Audit”.</td>
<td>Description: The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The current audit coverage 40% with 30% in resource would equal a 80% in coverage.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading: “13: Events after the reporting date”.</td>
<td>Description: The Committee notes that during the 2007/08 financial year, a Consortium was appointed to assist the central hospitals with the identification, marking and recording of assets and that it was found to be difficult to distinguish between assets belonging to the hospitals, universities and privately owned assets. Since 2007/08 annual asset counts have been conducted and as a result of the above-mentioned, assets registered on the asset registers of the hospitals have been overstated as university and privately owned assets were also incorporated into the register initially. Assets that could not be traced over the last three years have been identified for write-off.</td>
<td>6.1.3 The Department prepares a detailed presentation for the Committee on these asset write-offs, including a list, origin and value of the items, and what mechanisms the Department has introduced to reduce and prevent such write-offs in the future;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>To be scheduled by</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report.</td>
<td>department of Transport and Public Works prepares a briefing to the Committee on the resolutions and enhancements made by the Service Level Agreement (SLA) and the Western Cape Infrastructure Demand Management System (WC-IDMS) that addresses all the concerns raised by both Departments;</td>
<td>SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Infrastructure Matters”</td>
<td>6.1.5 The Department designs and implements adequate prevention and detection controls to ensure that irregular expenditure does not occur;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2015.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that the Service Delivery Agreement, with the Western Cape IDMS, signed between the Department of Transport and Public Works and Department of Health, regarding the timeous and cost effective delivery of capital projects, places the client Departments (Departments of Health and Education) in an untenable position vis-à-vis accounting for any fruitless and wasteful expenditure and relating to significant time delays, cost escalations, specification changes and related project management matters.</td>
<td>6.1.6 This concern be referred to the Standing Committee on Community Development for further monitoring and evaluation;</td>
<td>6.1.7 This concern be referred to the Standing Committee on Community Development and the Directorate: CE-I (located within the Department of the Premier) for By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equipment scheduled for payment in the 2012/13 financial year was paid due to early delivery from service providers. Payments were made to reduce the number of accruals/commitments to be carried forward into the 2012/13 financial year. In a further effort to reduce accruals/commitments orders were followed-up and paid during March 2012. In order to ensure a balanced budget BAS system reports had to be drawn on a daily basis to monitor expenditure against budget. During March 2012 it was not possible to draw reports from the system which attributed to the fact that the budget could not be controlled and balanced.</td>
<td>further monitoring and evaluation;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Page:** 309 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “25: Analysis of receivables from departmental revenue”.  
**Description:** The Committee notes that the Department wrote off patient fee debts amounting to R202 576 000. | 6.1.8 The Department prepares a detailed presentation for the Committee on this matter, with particular emphasis on trends, escalation and sustainability of this policy; | To be scheduled by SCOPA |
| **Page:** 318 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “32: Movable Tangible Assets”.  
**Description:** The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value. | 6.1.9 The Department drafts and adopts a heritage assets policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The Committee resolved further that the Department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of heritage assets, and that all such details be included in its future annual reports; | By 15 April 2013. |
| **Page:** 340 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “Annexure1K: Statement of Gifts, Donations and Sponsorships made and Remissions, Refunds and | 6.1.10 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding thereceipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for delib- | By 15 April 2013. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Payments made as an act of Grace*.</td>
<td>eration; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports; and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Description:**
The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made.

**Pages:** 353-361 of the Annual Report.
**Heading:** “Scopa Resolutions”.

**Description:**
The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee’s resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review.

6.1.11 A new report template be designed relating to the Department’s actions on SCOPA resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received.

---

### 6.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Department of Health provides the Committee with a copy of the following:

6.2.1 A report on the areas of Pharmacy, Finance, HR and Supply Chain Management as highlighted under the heading “Significant areas highlighted by Internal Audit for Improvement” as per page 193 of the Annual Report, including the value for money that these areas provide for the Province;

6.2.2 A report which explains the difference in the number of FIU investigation cases as alluded by the Department and the Auditor-General and provides as to each case, as per page 194 of the Annual Report;

6.2.3 A report on the investigation that is being undertaken which alludes to the asset-write offs within the Department as per page 219 (paragraph 13) of the Annual Report;

6.2.4 A copy of the preliminary report on the project on fruitless and wasteful expenditure in consultation with / belonging to the Department of Transport and Public Works with the contractor indicating the R2 million of wasteful expenditure as per page 242 (paragraph 5) of the Annual Report;

6.2.5 A list of all the consultants (appointed by the Department of Transport and Public Works) who delivered substandard work as per page 242 (paragraph 5) of the Annual Report;

6.2.6 A report on the status of the legal claims listed under the heading (Significant Uncertainties) as per page 245 of the Annual Report;

6.2.7 A copy of the 12 page report which reflects the breakdown of FIU cases as per page 248 and 249;

6.2.8 A detailed report on all irregular expenditure as per pages 311-315 of the Annual Report;

6.2.9 A report on the status, expenditures and outcomes relating to the Expanded Public Works Programme Grant as per page 327 of the Annual Report;
6.2.10 A detailed breakdown of the services and goods procured by Indigo Holdings as per page 434 of the Annual Report;

6.2.11 A detailed list of all SDA/ WC-IDMS projects delivered by the Department of Transport and Public Works that the Department of Health raised concerns about, the nature of the concerns and other relevant details as per page 20 (paragraph 11) of the Annual Report;

6.2.12 A detailed breakdown of the legal advice on various cases provided to the Department by various advocates as per pages 435 of the Annual Report.

7. DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on predetermined objectives and compliance with laws and regulations, and regrets to note that this is a regression from the previous year where no findings on compliance with laws and regulations were recorded. Whilst the opportunity for further regression remains, the Committee notes the Departments commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /-CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 49 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Payables” (Paragraph 8). <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that the Department’s Payables exceeding the payment term of 30 days amount to R19,049 million, thus exceeding the voted funds by R16,943 million.</td>
<td>7.1.1 The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 51 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “The Effectiveness of Internal Control (Paragraph 3)”. <strong>Description:</strong> Of importance to the Committee is that M&amp;E does not only include the analysis of compliance requirements of social stakeholders, but should include the analysis of the rendering of quality services by the NPO’s it funds.</td>
<td>7.1.2 The Department ensures that the scope of responsibility of the Monitoring and Evaluation Directorate within the Department is extended and properly funded to include the evaluation of the quality of services being rendered by the stakeholders, and that it prepares a presentation to this Committee relating to this matter, to be scheduled by SCOPA;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 52 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Internal Audit” <strong>Description:</strong> The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that</td>
<td>7.1.3 The Minister and HOD continue to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 50%, compared to 26.09% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td>high risk areas;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Page:** 54 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “1.3 Major projects undertaken or completed during the year”.  
**Description:** The Department has highlighted the Major Projects that it has undertaken or completed during the 2011/12 financial year but provided no further detail. The Committee expressed great interest in the projects highlighted. | 7.1.4 The Department prepares a presentation for this Committee providing further detail on the main successes and concerns experienced with each of the major projects, with relevant details provided regarding costs, the organisation's time-frames, and the key concerns/- outcomes; | To be scheduled by SCOPA. |
| **Page:** 55 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “3. Capacity Constraints (bullet 3)”.  
**Description:** The Committee shares the Departments concerns that among the challenges currently experienced by the Department, the lack of suitable availability of government owned buildings that could be used as local offices in highly populated urban centres such as Khayelitsha, Philippi, Delft amongst others, as well as in specific rural areas such as Clanwilliam, Knysna, Ladysmith and Ceres has a negative impact on the Department's ability to render services closer to communities. (as cross referenced from page 16, Paragraph 4 of the Annual Report). | 7.1.5 The Department prepares a presentation to this Committee, in collaboration with the Department of Transport and Public Works, on the extent of lack of suitable availability of government owned buildings and by when and how it will be resolved; | To be scheduled by SCOPA. |
| **Pages:** 56 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “11: Asset Management”.  
**Description:** The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, | 7.1.6 The Department drafts and adopts such a heritage assets policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The Committee resolved further that the Department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of her- | By 15 April 2013. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>conservation and value.</td>
<td>itage assets, and that all such details be included in its future annual report;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages</strong>: 57-59 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading</strong>: “Scopa Resolutions”.</td>
<td>7.1.7 A new report template be designed relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee's resolutions in the previous year and for including these in your annual report for the period under review.</td>
<td>7.1.8 The Department ensures that it fully implements all resolutions arising from the 2012/13 financial year and the 2011/12 financial year;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 59 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading</strong>: “Scopa Resolutions (Heading No. 2)”. <strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the Department failed to conduct personal oversight to monitor compliance and quality from Non Profit Organisations and institutions which receives funding from the Department. This is a repeated concern which was raised in the previous financial year.</td>
<td>7.1.9 The Department develops and implements 1) a Service Level Agreement and 2) a mechanism that will ensure that the Department regularly communicates with all NPO’s which it funds; that it visits these NPO’s at least once per year; and that it develops a register of the concerns, challenges and/or opportunities arising out of each visit and logs its response thereto;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 64 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading</strong>: “Usefulness and reliability of information” (Paragraphs 14 and 15). <strong>Description</strong>: The Committee notes with concern the findings raised by the Auditor-General that: (i) 2% of the indicators relevant to programme social welfare services were not verifiable in that valid processes and systems that produce the information on actual performance did not exist. This was due to the lack of the implementation of key controls in the relevant systems of collection, collation and verification of actual performance, and that (ii) The Auditor-General was unable to obtain sufficient, appropriate audit evidence to satisfy my-</td>
<td>7.1.10 The Department implements comprehensive corrective action to address these concerns, and prepares a presentation to the Committee detailing this plan;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013 To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>self as to the validity, accuracy and completeness of the actual performance reported in the annual performance report. This was due to a lack of source information that is sufficiently detailed, or reconciled to reported outputs. In addition source information was not filed in a form and content that is consistent and easily retrievable. There was also no evidence to confirm that validation of performance information was performed in order to support the reported outputs. The Committee notes the Departments own “disclaimers” expressed at several indicators as reasons for variance from planned performance. The Committee notes further on the Auditor-General’s finding that Leadership did not hold staff involved in the process of reporting on performance accountability for non-compliance with requirements in respect of performance information. (Refer also to Paragraph 20 (page 13) and 21 (page 14) of the Auditor’s General Final Management Report).</td>
<td>7.1.11 The Department updates the Committee with the status of all its FIU, SAPS and HAWKS cases, including the finalisation of all old cases (some which dates back to 2006); To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 65-66 of the Annual Report. Heading: “Investigations” (Paragraphs 22 and 23). Description: The Committee thanks the Department for taking disciplinary actions against officials who have acted in ways deemed contrary to laws and regulations, etc., but notes that deterrence mechanisms can improve.</td>
<td>7.1.12 The Department implements comprehensive corrective actions to address all of these concerns, and prepares a presentation to the Committee detailing this plan; By 15 April 2013. To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 65 of the Annual Report. Heading: “Financial and Performance Management (Paragraphs 20 and 21)” . Description: The Committee shares the Auditor-General’s concerns 7.1.13 The Department develops and implements (a) a Service Level Agreement and (b) a mechanism</td>
<td></td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**BACKGROUND / CONCERNS**

regarding its findings that at some NPO's visited during the audit process:

(i) Insufficient on-site visits by the department

(ii) Service delivery norms and standards in respect of early childhood development were not uniformly adhered to

(iii) Large and unusual cash withdrawals at some NPOs

(iv) Lack of servicing of fire extinguishers at some institutions

(v) No first aid kits at some institutions

(vi) Unhygienic ablution facilities at some institutions, and

(vii) a lack of review of progress reports from the NPOs as the department does not have adequate capacity in place to manage and monitor the related NPO function.

The Committee notes the Auditor-General's findings that although policies and procedures in respect of performance information have been updated, these have not been uniformly implemented, institutionalised and monitored at Non-Profit Institutional ("NPI") level and that the assessment and effectiveness of the Department’s road shows with these NPI's had not been informed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>that will ensure that the Department regularly communicates with all NPO’s that it funds; that it visits these NPO’s at least once per year; and that it develops a register of the concerns, challenges and/or opportunities arising out of each visit and logs its response thereto;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Pages:** 78-83 of the Annual Report.
**Heading:** “Accounting Policies”.
**Description:**

The Committee is concerned that the Department is not complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice.

7.1.14 The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Page**: 86 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: “4.3 Consultants, contractors and agency/outsourced services”. | 7.1.15 The Department includes a complete list of the names of all companies utilised, a description of the nature of the work performed, the amounts spent and the HDI status of these companies, in all future annual reports; |  |
| **Description**: The Committee notes the alluding of the Consultants, contractors and agency/outsourced services which were rendered to the Department for the 2011/12 financial year. | 7.1.16 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports; and | By 15 April 2013. |
| **Page**: 100 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: “Statement of gifts, donations and sponsorships made” (Annexure 1C - Example). | 7.1.17 The Department prepares a presentation to the Committee detailing the nature, extent and impact of this challenge and its plan to address it. | To be scheduled by SCOPA. |
| **Description**: The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made. |  |  |
| **Page**: 112 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: “Table 4.3.1: Employment and vacancies by programme, as at 31 March 2012” | 7.1.17 The Department prepares a presentation to the Committee detailing the nature, extent and impact of this challenge and its plan to address it. |  |
| **Description**: The Committee is concerned that the Department has a 19% social worker vacancy rate. |  |  |

### 7.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Department of Social Development provide the Committee with the following:

7.2.1 A detailed report highlighting the nature of the key control deficiencies as per page 51 (paragraph 8) of the Annual Report and how these challenges have been/ are being met by the Department;

7.2.2 A copy of the Western Cape Government Policy on the Funding of NGOs as per page 53 (paragraph 3) of the Annual Report;

7.2.3 A progress report on all investigative cases against employees within the Department by 20 November 2012 as per page 65 ( paragraphs 22 and 23);

7.2.4 A detailed report highlighting the resettlement costs and post designations against which the resettlement costs were incurred by the Department, as per page 87 (Item 4.8) of the Annual Report;
7.2.5 A detailed report of the legal cases which are currently with the State Attorney’s Office as per page 92 of the Annual Report; and

7.2.6 A detailed list which highlights a more in-depth breakdown of Annexure 1A (“Statements of Transfers to Non Profit organisations”) as highlighted on page 99 of the Annual Report.

8. DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on predetermined objectives and compliance with laws and regulations, and that this remains unchanged for the third year. The Committee notes that the opportunity for regression remains as does the Department’s commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Page: 51 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>8.1 The Committee resolved that:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading: “Usefulness of Information” (Paragraph 15) (to be read with “Reliability of reported performance”- paragraphs 16 and 17).</td>
<td>8.1.1 The Department presents an in-depth presentation on its Predetermined Objectives to the Committee; 8.1.2 The Department documents and approves its internal policies and procedures and that this includes monitoring, review and adequate credibility assessments of information reported, and includes all other “National Treasury Framework Management Programme Performance Information”(NT-FMPP) requirements;</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA. By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pages: 41-47 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>8.1.3 The Department includes in its Annual Report more detailed depictions in the form of graphs, to assist with visual interpretation of the value for money factors which can be extracted from its programmes;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading: “Report of the Accounting Officer”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description: The Committee shares the concerns raised by the Auditor-General relating to the deficiencies found in terms of usefulness, accuracy, completeness and validity of performance information.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 38 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>8.1.4 The Minister and HOD continue to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading: “Internal Audit”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description: The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HODs of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 42,11%, compared to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44,44% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td>8.1.5 The Department commits to meeting all PFMA and audit related deadlines set for the compilation, submission and auditing of Annual Financial Statements and annual reports;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Page**: 43 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: Heading 8- “Corporate governance arrangements”- the last sentence of the first paragraph.  
**Description**: The Committee noted that in order not to obtain a qualified audit opinion, the Department, opted to submit the Annual Report of the Housing Development Fund to the Auditor-General some 6 weeks after the deadline. | 8.1.6 A new report template be designed relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received; |  |
| **Page**: 45 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: “Scopa Resolutions”.  
**Description**: The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee's resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review. | 8.1.7 The Committee requests that the Department addresses this concern without delay, and submits a report to the Committee detailing all transfer payment and transferee information, including the mechanisms introduced to address this concern; | By 15 April 2013. |
| **Page**: 52 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: “Transfer Payments” (Paragraph 20).  
**Description**: The Committee shares the Auditor-General’s concern that the Accounting Officer transferred funds to entities in relation to PHP’s without first obtaining written assurance that the entity implements effective, efficient and transparent financial management of internal control systems. | 8.1.8 The Department undertakes and logs regular M&E checks to ensure compliance with SCM and procurement processes; | To be scheduled by SOPA. |
| **Page**: 52 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: Procurement and contract management (Paragraphs 23 and 24).  
**Description**: The Committee is concerned that the Department’s senior management has not performed regular monitoring and evaluation of compliance to Supply Chain Management (“SCM”) and procurement processes. | 8.1.9 The Department prepares an in-depth presentation on its Financial and Performance Management Strategy to the Committee; |  |
| **Page**: 53 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: “Financial and performance management” (Paragraphs 28 and 29).  
**Description**: The Committee is concerned that the Department’s senior management has not performed regular monitoring and evaluation of compliance to Supply Chain Manage- |  |  |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>procurement processes.</td>
<td>8.1.10 The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53-54 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>8.1.11 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accounting Policies&quot;.</td>
<td>8.1.12 The Department drafts and adopts such a heritage assets policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The Committee resolved further that the Department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of heritage assets, and that all such details be included in its future annual reports;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 95 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>8.1.13 The Department works closely with the Department of the Premier (Directorate: CE-I) to design and ensure (and document) the implementation of mechanisms which address the concerns raised; and</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Heritage Assets&quot;.</td>
<td>8.1.14 The Department presents its plan to address the concerns raised by the Auditor-General to the Committee.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Information Systems Audit Findings**
The Committee shares the various concerns raised in the Auditor-General's report and in the briefing documents presented to the Committee, that are based on the final management report to the Department, relating, inter alia, to the design and implementation of an IT Governance Framework, Formal control over IT systems, IT Service continuity, User access control, Programme Change Management, Security management to ensure the reliability of the systems and the availability, accuracy and protection of information.
8.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Department of Human Settlements provides the Committee with the following:

8.2.1 The study on the backlogs of the title deeds as per page 40 in paragraph 3 of the Annual Report;

8.2.2 The revised Peoples Housing Programme Policy as per page 40 in paragraph 4 of the Annual Report;

8.2.3 The State of Readiness Matrix which serves as the indicator document for all projects of the Department as per pages 40-41 of the Annual Report;

8.2.4 The Pipeline Report (expected by the Department in November 2012) which is an addition to the State of Readiness Matrix as per pages 40-41 of the Annual Report;

8.2.5 A list of all housing projects which have been delayed in Municipalities as per pages 40-41 of the Annual Report;

8.2.6 The Anti-Fraud and Corruption Strategy document as per page 43 in paragraph 8 of the Annual Report;

8.2.7 A list of all employees of the Department (by designation and by directorate) who fraudulently received funds, including a progress prosecution schedule of these employees (showing progress) made by the Special Investigation Unit as per page 46 (under heading: Investigations) of the Annual Report;

8.2.8 A detailed breakdown of all monies paid and received from the Special Investigation Unit as well as all cases related thereto as per page 46 of the Annual Report;

8.2.9 Further details on the one case of conflict of interest by an employee as per page 44 of the Annual Report;

8.2.10 A breakdown of all invoices of, and reasons why the R19 million accrual cash was not paid to date to suppliers as per page 49 and highlighted by item 8 of the Annual Report;

8.2.11 The Housing Demand Database as per page 65 in programme 2 of the Annual Report;

8.2.12 The Memorandum of Understanding document between the Department and the University of Cape Town, including the services to be rendered by the University of Cape Town and the benefits and outcomes derived to the Department as per page 69 of the Annual Report;

8.2.13 A detailed breakdown of the items listed on page 82, under headings 5.7 and 5.8 (Operating Expenditure) of the Annual Report;
8.2.14 A detailed breakdown of “lost items” as per page 82, under heading 7.1 of the Annual Report, including the items description, value, circumstances and time of loss including the Department’s reaction to the loss, including how it dealt with the losses and what mechanism was/is introduced that will avoid a recurring instance;

8.2.15 A detailed report as to the status as per page 85, under heading 12.1 of the Annual Report; and

8.2.16 A register which ensures that heritage assets are located, valued and properly conserved; and that the Department publishes the heritage assets register in its 2012/13 Annual Report.

9. DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no findings, and that this is an improvement from the previous year where findings on compliance with laws and regulations were recorded. The Committee notes that the opportunity for regression remains as does the Department’s commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 53 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>9.1.1</strong> The Minister and HOD continues to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas;</td>
<td><strong>By 15 April 2013.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Internal Audit”</td>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 62,5%, compared to 31,25% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td><strong>9.1 The Committee resolved that:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 61 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>9.1.2</strong> The Department drafts and adopts such a heritage assets policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The Committee resolved further that the department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “11: Asset Management”.</td>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value.


Heading: “Scopa Resolutions”.

Description:
The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee’s resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review.


Heading: “Accounting Policies”

Description:
The Committee congratulates the Department for complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice.


Headings: “Statement of gifts, donations and sponsorships made and remissions, refunds and payments made as an act of grace” (Annexure 1G).

Description:
The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value.</td>
<td>with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of heritage assets, and that all such details be included in its future annual reports;</td>
<td>9.1.3 A new report template be designed relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Scopa Resolutions”.</td>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Accounting Policies”</td>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Statement of gifts, donations and sponsorships made and remissions, refunds and payments made as an act of grace” (Annexure 1G).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee’s resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review.</td>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee congratulates the Department for complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice; and</td>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
<td>9.1.5 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning provides the Committee with the following:

9.2.1 A detailed report on the Boat Launching Site Licensing issue as per page 4 of the Audit Committee Report; and
9.2.2 A detailed report on the investigation information and its outcomes relating to the alleged irregularity regarding the fraudulent use of the Department’s letterhead to perform an Environmental Impact Assessment at a municipality.

10. DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on predetermined objectives and compliance with laws and regulations, and that this remains unchanged from the previous year. The Committee notes that the opportunity for regression remains as does the Department’s commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>10.1</strong> The Committee resolved that:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page: 3-3 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>10.1.1 The Department prepares and implements a plan to address these concerns so as to prevent it from recurring in future years;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Significant areas highlighted by Internal Audit”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee shares the concerns regarding key control deficiencies within the Department, as highlighted by the Audit Committee.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page: 3-4 of the Annual Report.</strong></td>
<td>10.1.2 The Committee requests that the Minister and HOD continues to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Internal Audit”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 37,74%, compared to 14,81% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page: 3-15 of the Annual Report.</strong></td>
<td>10.1.3 The Department should provide a more in-depth explanation regarding all instances of unauthorised, fruitless and wasteful and irregular expenditure recorded, including the root causes</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Unauthorised, fruitless and wasteful, and irregular expenditure”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description:</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee is concerned that the department does not give a detailed breakdown of the Irregular Unauthorised Expenditure including Fruitless and Wasteful Expenditure.</td>
<td>and the steps taken to prevent recurrence;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 3-16 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Capacity Constraints”.</td>
<td>10.1.4 The Department drafts and implements a mechanism which provides for the transfer of skills to employees ensuring the retaining of specialists skills within the Department, and limiting expenditure in this regard;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: “Contracting-in specialist expertise on a needs basis to augment in-house expertise”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 3-31 to 3-34 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>10.1.5 A new report template be designed relating to the Department’s actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Scopa Resolutions”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee’s resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 3-48 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>10.1.6 The Department designs and implements effective measures and procedures to address these concerns and prevent their recurrence;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Human Resource Management” (Paragraphs 3-19 and 3-20).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned about the deficiencies highlighted by the Auditor-General in respect of employees being appointed without verification of claims made in their applications and the implementation of effective measures to ensure that employees do not abuse sick leave.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 3-48 to 3-49 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>10.1.7 The Department designs and implements corrective controls, policies and procedures that address these concerns and prevent their recurrence;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Leadership” (Paragraphs 23-28).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applicable laws and regulations and inadequate documented policies and procedures to guide the operations of the department, resulting in numerous instances of non-compliance with the PFMA.</td>
<td>10.1.8 The Department designs and implements adequate prevention and detection controls to ensure that such material misstatements do not re-occur;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that the numerous instances of material misstatements highlighted by the Auditor General in the annual report relating, inter alia, to irregular expenditure, fruitless and wasteful expenditure, understatement of amounts received, immovable assets, GMT pre-payments and lease commitments were not detected by internal controls and ongoing monitoring, that this was due to line management not taking responsibility for and reviewing the reported information, and that a non-compliance finding in the audit report was the result. The Committee notes further the Auditor-Generals assertion that such findings will negatively affect the Departments audit outcomes in future years if not adequately addressed in the short-term.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 3-72 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Accounting Policies”.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that contracting specialists will not sustainably meet the Department’s long term capacity constraints.</td>
<td>10.1.9 The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Background / Concerns

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Receipt of invoice.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 3-122 of the Annual Report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Statement of Gifts, Donations and Sponsorships made and Remissions, Refunds and Payments made as an act of Grace” Annexure 1F.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>RESOLUTIONS</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.1.10 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ACTION DATE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Information Systems Audit Findings

The Committee shares the various concerns raised in the Auditor-General's report and in the briefing documents presented to the Committee, that are based on the final management report to the Department, relating, inter alia, to the design and implementation of an IT Governance Framework, Formal control over IT systems, IT Service continuity, User access control, Programme Change Management, Security management to ensure the reliability of the systems and the availability, accuracy and protection of information.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>RESOLUTIONS</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.1.11 The Department works closely with the Department of the Premier (Directorate: CE-I) to ensure the implementation of mechanisms which address the concerns raised; and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.12 The Department presents its plan to address the concerns raised by the Auditor-General to the Committee.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ACTION DATE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To be scheduled by SCOPA.

### List of Information Required

That the Department of Transport and Public Works provides the Committee with the following:

10.2.1 A detailed breakdown of the irregular expenditure of the current year (note 24.2) as per page 3-101 of the Annual Report;

10.2.2 A detailed report indicating the nature, recommendations, departmental response and outcomes of the FIU cases highlighted as per page 3-4 of the Annual Report o;

10.2.3 A detailed report (including costs) on the issues highlighted under (Responses to legal challenges) as per page 3-6 of the Annual Report;
10.2.4 A breakdown of the recipients of the Department’s bursary awards, including the status of the bursars as per page 3-7 (Item no 1) of the Annual Report;

10.2.5 A breakdown of the penalties and/or cancellations introduced by the Department on default contractors (in the construction of facilities) as per page 3-9 of the Annual Report;

10.2.6 A detailed report on the irregular and fruitless and wasteful expenditure as per page 3-15 of the Annual Report;

10.2.7 A detailed breakdown of the contracted-in specialist expertise as per table 8 on page 3-16;

10.2.8 A status report in respect of Conradie Hospital;

10.2.9 A detailed report explaining the R12 900mil as per Programme 3 on page 3-18 of the Annual Report;

10.2.10 A monitoring and evaluation report on the services and qualities exerted by the Golden Arrow Bus Services as per Programme 4 on page 3-20 of the Annual Report;

10.2.11 A copy of the Standard Operating Procedure guiding the Treatment and Management of Forensic Investigative Unit Reports as per paragraph 5 on page 3-25 of the Annual Report;

10.2.12 A copy of the methodology of the (Financial Management Improvement Plan) FMIB and GIBS as per paragraph 6 on page 3-26 of the Annual Report;

10.2.13 A list of the 130 Planned Targets, as well as the evaluation and monitoring report thereof as per paragraph 13 on page 3-47 of the Annual Report;

10.2.14 A list of the 400 properties, leasing arrangements, contracts, etc. as per page 3-47 of the Annual Report of the Department (when available in December 2012);

10.2.15 A detailed report of the issues highlighted under sections 17 and 18 under the procurement and contract management as per page 3-47 of the Annual Report;

10.2.16 A list of the asset registers which pertains to Capital Assets, Receivable Items and Lease Commitments;

10.2.17 A detailed report of the FIU cases as indicated in paragraph 36 and 38 as per page 3-50 of the Annual Report;

10.2.18 A detailed report highlighted in paragraphs 35 and 37 as per page 3-50 of the Annual Report;

10.2.19 A detailed breakdown as per item 4.2 (“Public Transport Services”) as per page 3-60 of the Annual Report;
10.2.20 A detailed list of the contractors and agencies/ outsourced as per item number 4 as per the page 3-86 of the Annual Report;

10.2.21 A detailed report highlighting the Details of irregular expenditures under investigation as per heading 24.4 as per page 3-101 of the Annual Report;

10.2.22 A report including the reporting to Consultants. A detailed report highlighting the issues under heading 24.1 as per page 3-100 of the Annual Report;

10.2.23 A copy of the Heritage Assets Register professionally valued and compiled as per page 3-89 of the Annual Report; and

10.2.24 A detailed report as per the donations and governing policies which highlights Annexure 1F as per page 3-122 of the Annual Report.

11. DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE

The Committee notes the Auditor-General's audit opinion regarding the Department's Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that this represents a regression from the previous year. The Committee notes the Departments commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 83 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>11.1 The Committee resolved that:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Internal Audit”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD's of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 39.13%, compared to 19.23% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td>11.1.1 The Minister and HOD continues to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 99 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>11.1.2 A new report template be designed relating to the Department's actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee's resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review.

11.1.3 The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to paying creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;

By 15 April 2013.

The Committee congratulates the Department for complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice.

11.1.4 The Department drafts and adopts such a policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The committee resolved further that the department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of heritage assets, and that all such details be included in its future annual reports; and

By 15 April 2013.

The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value.

11.1.5 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports.

By 15 April 2013.

11.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Department of Agriculture provides the Committee with the following:
11.1.1 A list of the support and financial indicators contributed by the Department, including problematic Audits, of the Equity Schemes as per paragraph 1 on page 87 of the Annual Report;

11.1.2 A detailed report which highlights the expenditure of the Urban Farming Project to the City of Cape Town, including any challenges in this project and the problem-solving mechanisms utilized to ensure effective implementation of this project as per page 89, paragraph 3, of the Annual Report;

11.1.3 A breakdown of the R82 million investment attracted to the Province (by Wesgro) as per page 90 of the Annual Report;

11.1.4 A breakdown of the Land Care Grant as per paragraph 19 on page 100 of the Annual Report;

11.1.5 A breakdown of the R37 million which was received from DAFF (including the payments incurred by this amounts) as per page 100 of the Annual Report; and

11.1.6 A detailed breakdown of Annexure 2B (Statement on investments in other non-controlled entities) as per page 154 of the Annual Report.

12. DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that this remains unchanged from the previous year. The Committee notes that the opportunity for regression remains as does the Department’s commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 100 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>12.1</strong> The Committee resolved that:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> &quot;Internal Audit&quot;</td>
<td><strong>12.1.1</strong> The Minister and HOD continues to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 25%, compared to 27.78% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 104 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>12.1.2</strong> The Department prepares a presentation with details of the Western Cape Liquor Board’s activities and financial statements for the year to the Com-</td>
<td><strong>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> &quot;Western Cape Liquor Board (dormant),&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Paragraph 5).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee notes that R9,333m was spent by the Department for the activities of this in-house public entity, during the execution of its functions in the 2011/12 financial year but that the Annual Report does not provide a detailed breakdown of this expenditure.</td>
<td><strong>12.1.3</strong> A new report template be designed relating to the Department’s actions on SCOPA resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 107 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Scopa Resolutions”.</td>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee’s resolutions in the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 110 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Procurement and Contract Management” (Paragraph 20).</td>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee notes the Auditor General’s finding that goods and services with a transaction value below R500,000 were procured without obtaining the required price quotations, as required by Treasury Regulation 16A6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 111 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Financial and Performance Management” (Paragraph 28).</td>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that supply chain and human resource managers are not exercising adequate monitoring controls to ensure compliance with SCM regulations and Public Service Regulations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 111 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading</strong>: “Expenditure Management” (Paragraph 22). <strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the Accounting Officer did not take effective steps to prevent irregular expenditure of R5,49 million, as required by section 38(1)(c)(ii) of the PFMA and Treasury Regulation 9.1.1.</td>
<td>12.1.6 The Department urgently designs and implements adequate prevention and detection controls to ensure that irregular expenditure does not occur;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 111 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading</strong>: “Human Resource Management” (Paragraphs 23 and 24). <strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that appointments made without the involvement and recommendation of a selection committee, in contravention of the Public Service Regulation 1/VII/1-4; that employees were appointed without following a proper process to verify the claims made in their application, in contravention of Public Service Regulation 1/VIII/10; and that HR policies and practices have not been adequately implemented to facilitate the completeness and accuracy of employee related files and documentation.</td>
<td>12.1.7 The Department ensures that controls are developed and implemented that detect and prevent such instances from recurring in the future;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 111 of the Annual Report of the Department. <strong>Heading</strong>: “Human Resources Management” (Paragraph 23). <strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that appointments were made without the involvement and recommendation of</td>
<td>12.1.8 The Department ensures that a mechanism be developed and implemented that will ensure that a recurrence of the contravention of the Public Service Regulation 1/VII/1-4 is not repeated in the future (whereby the urgency of headhunting staff overrides the applicability to the Public Service Regulations);</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a selection committee which resulted in the contravention of the Public Service Regulation 1/VII/1-4.</td>
<td><strong>12.1.9</strong> The Department ensures that a mechanism is developed and implemented to prevent a recurrence of the contravention of the Public Service Regulation 1/VII/1-4;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Page:** 111 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “Leadership” (Paragraph 26).  
**Description:** The Committee raised a concern that the Accounting Officer did not adequately evaluate whether management has implemented effective internal controls to ensure that senior management has met its responsibilities. | **12.1.10** The Department briefs the Committee on why incorrect information was supplied to the Auditor-General for auditing purposes, what action was taken and what mechanisms were introduced to detect and prevent such recurrences; | To be scheduled by SCOPA |
| **Page:** 111 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “Investigations” (Paragraphs 29-31).  
**Description:** The Committee thanks the Department for taking disciplinary actions against officials who have acted in ways deemed contrary to laws and regulations, etc., but notes that deterrence mechanisms can improve. | **12.1.11** The Department briefs the Committee on the mechanisms it has introduced to detect and prevent SCM fraud; | To be scheduled by SCOPA |
| **Pages:** 134-141 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “Accounting Policies”.  
**Description:** The Committee congratulates the Department for complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice. | **12.1.12** The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice; | 15 April 2013. |
| **Page:** 147 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “Losses and Impairment”.  
**Description:** The Committee has noted that there is an impairment amount (R116 million) indicated in the Annual Report which relates to the Cape Town International Convention Centre in respect of the impairment; | **12.1.13** The Department conducts a more detailed follow up presentation to the Committee on the Cape Town International Convention Centre in respect of the impairment; | To be scheduled by SCOPA. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Page**: 198 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: “Utilisation of Consultants”.  
**Description**: The Committee has noted that the Department is directly responsible for its telecommunications Integration and additional strategic components which are incorporated into the master implementation plan. | 12.1.14 That the CE-I (located within the Department of the Premier) and the Department jointly present on the holistic and responsible indicators for the Department’s telecommunications Integration and additional strategic components which are incorporated into the master implementation plan; | To be scheduled by SCOPA. |
| **Page**: The Annual Report (no page number).  
**Description**: The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made. | 12.1.15 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports; and | By 15 April 2013. |
| **Page**: 156 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading**: “Movement in Minor Assets” (Note 29.4)  
**Description**: The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value. | 12.1.16 The Department drafts and adopts such a heritage assets policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The Committee resolved further that the Department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of heritage assets, and that all such details be included in its future annual reports. | By 15 April 2013. |

### 12.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Department of Economic Development and Tourism provide the Committee with the following:

12.1.1 A detailed breakdown of the number of interns and demographical status as per page 167 under heading (k: local newspaper) of the Annual Report;  
12.1.2 A detailed report regarding the vacancies which were filled through 1) headhunting and 2) normal appointment procedures during the 2011/12 financial year, as per page 111 of the Annual Report (under paragraphs 23 and 24);  
12.1.3 A detailed report of Item 4.3 (Consultants, contractors and agency/outourced services) as per page 144 of the Annual Report; and
12.1.4 A detailed report of item 4.3 (Consultants, contractors and agency/outsourced services) as per page 144 against item 4.16.1, as per page 198 of the Annual Report.

13. DEPARTMENT OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Department’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that this remains unchanged from the previous year. The Committee notes that the opportunity for regression remains as does the Departments commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>13.1 The Committee resolved that:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 63 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>13.1.1 The Minister and HOD continues to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Internal Audit”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD’s of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 40%, compared to 39.39% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 72 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>13.1.2 The Committee resolved to design a new report template relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Scopa Resolutions”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee thanks the Department for addressing the Committee’s resolution sin the previous year and for including these in the annual report for the period under review.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 72 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>13.1.3 The Department prepares a detailed presentation for the Committee on the Departments response to the challenges identified with the SLIMS system;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “SCOPA Resolutions”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> During the 2010/11 financial year, SCOPA resolved that</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### BACKGROUND / CONCERNS

Corrections had to be made to the disclosure notes. These corrections were necessary because current accounting systems in the Department were not able to ensure the completeness of amounts disclosed. Commitments and Accruals not disclosed related to the Library Services SLIMS system which was implemented in January 2011. The Committee notes that difficulty was experienced in extracting financial information from the system since the system was not developed with financial outputs in mind. Manual processes were implemented to ensure that the information is disclosed accurately.

### RESOLUTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>13.1.4</th>
<th>This concern be referred to the Standing Committee on Community Development for further monitoring and evaluation;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Page:** 75 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “Achievement of planned targets” (Paragraph 15).  
**Description:** Of the total number of planned targets, only 119 were achieved during the year under review. This represents 23.2% of the planned targets that were not achieved during the year under review. This was as a result of the institution not considering relevant systems and evidential requirements during the annual strategic planning process. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>13.1.5</th>
<th>The Department ensures that controls are developed and implemented to detect and prevent such instances from recurring in the future;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Page:** 76 of the Annual Report.  
**Heading:** “Human Resource Management” (Paragraph 17).  
**Description:** The Committee is concerned that employees were appointed without following a proper process to verify the claims made in their application, in contravention of Public Service Regulation 1/v11/D.8; and that leave records are not processed in |

<p>| <strong>ACTION DATE</strong> | By 15 April 2013. | By 15 April 2013. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a timely manner and therefore not taken into account when leave provision is determined.</td>
<td>13.1.6 The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Page:** 97 of the Annual Report.

**Heading:** “Accounting Policies”.

**Description:**
The Committee congratulates the Department for complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice.

| Page: 115 of the Annual Report. | 13.1.7 The Department designs and implements adequate prevention and detection controls to ensure that irregular expenditure does not occur; | By 15 April 2013. |

**Heading:** “23: Irregular Expenditure”.

**Description:**
The Committee notes with concern that an irregular expenditure to the value of R1 217 000 was incurred by the department during the year under review as the result of non-compliance with laws and regulations relating to procurement and contract management. No irregular expenditure was condoned by the accounting officer in the current or prior years relating to prior periods. R394 000 of the irregular expenditure incurred in 2011-12 was condoned by the accounting officer in the current year.

**Page:** 117 of the Annual Report.

**Heading:** “Movable Tangible Capital Assets” (Note 26).

**Description:**
The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identifi-
TUESDAY, 4 DECEMBER 2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>cation, promotion, protection, conservation and value.</td>
<td>assets, and that all such details be included in its future annual reports;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 130 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>13.1.9 The Committee resolved that the Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Statement of Gifts, Donations and Sponsorships Made” (Annexure 1G).</td>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that the Department does not have a policy that guides the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Systems</strong> <strong>Audit Findings</strong></td>
<td>13.1.10 The Department works closely with the Department of the Premier (Directorate: CE-I) to ensure the implementation of mechanisms which address the concerns raised; and</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee shares the various concerns raised in the Auditor-General's report and in the briefing documents presented to the Committee, that are based on the final management report to the Department, relating, inter alia, to the design and implementation of an IT Governance Framework, Formal control over IT systems, IT Service continuity, User access control, Programme Change Management, Security management to ensure the reliability of the systems and the availability, accuracy and protection of information.</td>
<td>13.1.11 The Department presents its plan to address the concerns raised by the Auditor-General to the Committee.</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 13.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport provides the Committee with the following:

13.2.1 A detailed report regarding the items highlighted under the category (Received in kind) as per page 129 of the Annual Report; and
13.2.2 A register which ensures that heritage assets are located, valued and properly conserved; and that the Department publishes the heritage assets register in its 2012/13 Annual Report.

### 14. DEPARTMENT OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT

The Committee notes the Auditor-General's audit opinion regarding the Department's Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that this remains unchanged from the
previous year. The Committee notes that the opportunity for regression remains as does the Departments commitments to achieving a clean audit by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 15 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>14.1.1</strong> If the Department is not able to replace the heading “Commission on Insurance” with a more descriptively accurate heading, it adds a footnote that provides such information;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Collection of departmental revenue”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the heading “Commission on Insurance” is misleading since it actually refers to investment practices.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 44 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>14.1.2</strong> The Minister and HOD continues to engage with Cabinet and Provincial Treasury in this regard with the view of significantly increasing audit coverage over the medium term, in order to reduce the negative impact on future audit outcomes, service delivery and on the achievement of predetermined objectives, particularly in high risk areas;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Internal Audit”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee shares the concern expressed by the Audit Committee, the Minister and HOD's of all departments that further audit coverage is required and that there is a need for additional capacity, particularly financial, to support the increased coverage of high risk areas. The audit coverage for the 2011/12 financial year is at 47.06%, compared to 40% for the 2010/11 financial year.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 50 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>14.1.3</strong> A new report template be designed relating to the Departments actions on SCOPA Resolutions and requests that the Department replaces the old report template with this for the 2012/13 annual report onwards, once received;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Scopa Resolutions”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the Department has not fully addressed the Committee’s resolutions for the previous (2010/11) financial year and that 5 high risk areas identified by the Audit Committee were not adequately addressed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong>: 54 and 56 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>14.1.4</strong> The Department develops and implements controls that detect and prevent such instances from recurring in the future;</td>
<td><strong>By 15 April 2013</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “Payables and Expenditure Management”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that the Department’s Payables exceeding the payment term of 30 days amount to R2, 674 million, thus exceeding the voted funds by R2,502 million; and that this amount would have constituted unauthorised expenditure had the amounts been paid in a timely manner.</td>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 55 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Procurement and Contract Management” (Paragraphs 14 and 15). 14.1.5 The Department introduces procedures and mechanisms to detect and prevent such instances from occurring in the future;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 62 of the Annual Report. <strong>Heading:</strong> “Accounting Policies”. 14.1.6 The Department drafts a clause to be inserted into the Accounting Policies of the Department confirming its commitment to complying with generally accepted creditor-payment periods and legislated requirements for payment of creditors within 30 days of receipt of invoice;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 80 of the Annual Report. 14.1.7 The Department prepares a presentation for the Committee on the details of this matter, in-</td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</td>
<td>RESOLUTIONS</td>
<td>ACTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Other material losses written off: Nature of losses” (Note 6.1).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee notes the investigation on the overpayment to a supplier, the outcome of which was a write off based on an opinion of the State Attorney.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 93 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>14.1.8 The Department drafts and adopts such a heritage assets policy and compiles such a register, in collaboration with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and Heritage Western Cape where necessary. The committee resolved further that the department tracks and monitors all movement relating to heritage assets including details, with costs, of acquisition, damage, disposal and loss of heritage assets, and that all such details be included in its future annual reports; and By 15 April 2013.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Minor Assets” (Note 27.3).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that no policy or register exists within the Department and the office of the Minister that manages heritage assets in terms of their identification, promotion, protection, conservation and value.</td>
<td>14.1.9 The Department drafts and adopts a policy that guides the HOD regarding the receipt, assessment and awarding or refusal of applications for gifts, donations and sponsorships to be made, and that it presents this to the Committee for deliberation; further that the Department includes more details relating to this in future annual reports. By 15 April 2013.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 14.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Department of Local Government provides the Committee with the following:

14.2.1 A report on the Anti-corruption cases (investigations) which have been undertaken by the Special Investigation Unit as well as the Forensic Investigation Unit. This should include the successes reached by these Units in the reported cases as per page 56, under headings no 18 and 19 of the Annual Report;

14.2.2 A report on the dramatic increase in expenditure under heading “Goods and Services” (Consultants, Entertainment, Inventory, Operating leases,
Property payments, Rental and hiring and Travel and Subsistence) as per page 77 of the Annual Report;

14.2.3 A detailed breakdown of the Legal costs as per page 78 under heading 4.3 (Consultants, contractors and agency/ outsourced services) of the Annual Report;

14.1.4 A detailed breakdown of all Resettlement costs as per page 79 under heading 4.8: (Other operating expenditure) of the Annual Report;

14.2.5 The report from the State Attorney on the overpayment of a supplier as per page 80 under heading 6.1 of the Annual Report;

14.2.6 A breakdown of staff debt as per page 82 under heading 11: (Receivables) of the Annual Report;

14.2.7 A breakdown and full report on the GG vehicle damages as per page 83 under heading 11.2: (Recoverable expenditure (disallowance accounts)) of the Annual Report; and

14.2.8 A detailed report on Note 19: (Commitments) as per page 86 of the Annual Report.

B REPORT OF THE FOLLOWING PUBLIC ENTITIES

1. WESTERN CAPE LANGUAGE COMMITTEE

The Committee notes the Auditor-General's audit opinion regarding the Entities Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no other matters, and that this represents an improvement over the previous year where findings on predetermined objectives and compliance with laws and regulations, were recorded. Whilst the Committee is pleased with this audit outcome, the opportunity for regression remains as does the Entities commitments to maintaining a clean audit status beyond 2014.

The Committee expresses no further views and made no further resolutions but has requested further information below:

1.1 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Western Cape Language Committee provides the Committee with the following:

A detailed report explaining the breakdown of Item 10 (Other operating expenses) as per page 41 of the Annual Report.

2. WESTERN CAPE CULTURAL COMMISSION

The Committee notes the Auditor-General's audit opinion regarding the Entities Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no findings and that this represents an improvement from the previous year where findings on compliance with laws and regulations were recorded. The Committee notes the Entities commitments to achieving a clean audit status by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 The Committee resolved that:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### BACKGROUND / CONCERNS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information Systems Audit Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Committee shares the various concerns raised in the Auditor-General’s report and in the briefing documents presented to the Committee, that are based on the final management report to the Department, relating, inter alia, to the design and implementation of an IT Governance Framework, Formal control over IT systems, IT Service continuity, User access control, Programme Change Management, Security management to ensure the reliability of the systems and the availability, accuracy and protection of information.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### RESOLUTIONS

| 2.1.1 The Entity works closely with the Department of the Premier (Directorate: CE-I) to ensure the implementation of mechanisms which address the concerns raised, and |
| 2.1.2 The Entity presents its plan to address the concerns raised by the Auditor-General to the Committee. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Western Cape Cultural Commission provides the Committee with the following:

2.1.1 A detailed report explaining the breakdown of the R80 000-00 legal fees as per page 39 of the Annual Report; and

2.2.2 The Department of the Premier to supply the Committee with a report detailing the terms and outlines of the Service Level Agreement and support between the Department of the Premier and the Western Cape Cultural Commission.
3. WESTERN CAPE NATURE CONSERVATION BOARD (CAPENATURE)

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Entities Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that this represents a regression from the previous year where a clean audit was recorded. The Committee notes the Entities commitments to achieving clean audit status by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committees are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages</strong>: 64-67 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>3.1 The Committee resolved that:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: Report of the Auditor-General.</td>
<td>3.1.1 That Cape Nature incorporates the full text of the Auditor-General’s report (and matters raised therein) into its Annual Report;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the Auditor-General Briefing document is not fully included in the Annual Report of Cape Nature.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages</strong>: 65-67 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>3.1.2 That the Department improves its financial management in line with CGRO in order to avoid a possible financial audit regression in the 2012/12 financial year;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: Paragraphs 6-24.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that the Entity may experience a regression on the issues raised by the Auditor-General.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages</strong>: 102-103 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>3.1.3 The Entity designs and implements adequate prevention and detection controls to ensure that irregular expenditure does not occur; and</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: “32: irregular Expenditure”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee is concerned that an irregular expenditure of R1,090,939 was incurred by the Entity during the 2011/12 financial year.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Systems Audit Findings</strong></td>
<td>3.1.4 The Entity implements mechanisms which address the concerns raised, and provides a report to this Committee in this regard.</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee shares the various concerns raised in the Auditor-General’s report and in the briefing documents presented to the Committee, that are based on the final management report to the Department, relating, inter alia, to the design and implementation of an IT Governance Framework, Formal control over IT systems, IT Service continuity, User access control, Pro-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That CAPENATURE provides the Committee with the following:

3.2.1 A detailed breakdown of the 77% of overall black representative staff as per page 58 of the Annual Report of the Entity;
3.2.2 A detailed report highlighting the costs which the entity injected in organisations, which organisations, the amounts and the value added through this as per page 58 of the Annual Report;
3.2.3 A detailed report of the number of meetings that was held, agenda items and outcomes of the “Employee Consultative Forum” as per page 58 of the Annual Report;
3.2.4 A detailed report on the “significant control breakdowns” as per page 62 of the Annual Report of the Entity, as well as Cape Nature’s response to each of these significant control breakdowns;
3.2.5 A detailed report highlighting the challenges and corrective actions taken, including the lessons learnt from the Migration Project as per page 62 of the Annual Report; and
3.2.6 A detailed list highlighting the disciplinary steps that were taken as per page 62 of the Annual Report of the Entity.

4. WESTERN CAPE INVESTMENT AND TRADE PROMOTION AGENCY (WESGRO)

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Entities Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that the overall audit outcome is unchanged from the previous year, whilst noting that there were no findings on predetermined objectives as recorded in that year. The Committee notes the Entities commitments to achieving a clean audit status by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Page: 103 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>4.1 The Committee resolved that:</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading: Paragraph 20: “Financial and performance management”.</td>
<td>4.1.1 WESGRO implements mechanisms to ensure adequate review of its financial statements by management; and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description: The Committee raised a concern that WESGRO’s financial statements contained numerous misstatements that were</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BACKGROUND / -
CONCERNS

This was mainly due to inadequate review by management of information included in the financial statements and incorrect application of the applicable accounting standards. The Committee shares the Auditor-General’s opinion that that the errors and misstatements could have been avoided if the Chief Financial Officer reviewed the year end journal entries for accuracy and completeness of information presented.

RESOLUTIONS

4.1.2 Wesgro briefs the Committee on the Put Option, the financial implications thereof, how it can be assessed and used as a comparative analysis on the financial health, viability and value of the Cape Town Film Studios.

ACTION DATE

To be scheduled by SCOPA.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / -CONCERNS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED**

That WESGRO provide the Committee with the following:

4.2.1 The PUT Option notes presented by the CEO to the Committee; and
4.2.2 A breakdown of the Return on Investment to the Western Cape Government and 29 000 jobs created by the Cape Town Film Studios as alluded presented by the CEO to the Committee.

6.  PROVINCIAL DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

The Committee resolved to hold a public meeting on the discussion on the 2011/12 Annual Reports of the Provincial Development Council in the first quarter of 2013 and to issue a supplementary report on its resolutions arising from these discussions, thereafter.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / -CONCERNS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1 The Committee resolved that:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.1 The Department of the Premier presents it with a Management Plan for the closure of Public Entities, which should include post-closure provisions relating to finalising and submitting Annual Financial Statements for auditing purposes, and being present at</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>By 28 February 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Act 4 of 2004) by the Provincial Development Council Repeal Act, 2011 gazette 6897, dated 5 December 2011. The Committee is concerned that the senior representatives of the Provincial Development Council (PDC) including the Management Committee, the CEO and CFO were not scheduled to appear before the Committee during the Annual Reporting process held during October/November 2012, for the Committee to review their financial and management performance, and audit outcomes. The Committee notes that the Repeal Act and relevant managerial and administrative arrangements did not include ensuring that these members were scheduled to appear before the Committee. The Committee notes further that after 05 December 2011, no Audit Committee meetings could be constituted thereafter in order for the committee to discharge their responsibilities in relation to Internal Audit, Internal Control and risk Management; In-year reporting and; Annual Financial Statements and the regulatory audit process. This had the effect that no report of the Audit Committee has been presented to this Committee. The Committee notes that these limitations placed on the work of the Audit Committee and Internal Audit, are highlighted in the Auditor-General’s report contained in the Annual Report of the PDC.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. **GOVERNMENT MOTOR TRANSPORT (“GMT”)**

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Entities Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with findings on predetermined objectives and compliance with laws and regulations, and that this represents a regression from the previous year where no findings on predetermined objectives where recorded. The Committee notes the Entities commitments to achieving a clean audit status by 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>7.1 The Committee resolved that:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages:</strong> 47 of the Annual Report of the Department.</td>
<td><strong>7.1.1 The Entity implements effective measures and procedures to address these concerns and prevent recurrence, reporting on these to the Committee;</strong></td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Human Resource Management” (Paragraphs 18 and 19).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned about the deficiencies highlighted by the Auditor-General in respect of employees being appointed without verification of claims made in their applications, in contravention of Public Service Regulation 1/V11/D.8 and the implementation of effective measures to ensure that employees do not abuse sick leave, as required by Public Service Regulation 1/V/F(c).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages:</strong> 47-48 of the Annual Report of the Department.</td>
<td><strong>7.1.2 The Department briefs the Committee on how it plans to detect and prevent a recurrence of this nature;</strong></td>
<td>To be scheduled by SCOPA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Leadership” (Paragraph 24).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that the Accounting Officer did not implement effective HR management to attract, develop and retain adequate and sufficiently skilled resources to support the finance department as the finance section is supplemented with the use of consultants for the preparation of the financial statements; the maintenance of the fixed asset register; the re-alignment of internal business processes with the new accounting system and the maintenance and operation of the Fleetman system used for fleet management which is a part of the core business and daily processing of assets and revenue management.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Systems Audit Findings</strong></td>
<td><strong>7.1.3 The Entity closely with the Department of the Premier (Directorate: CE-I) to ensure the implementation of a mechanism which addresses the concerns raised, and</strong></td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Committee shares the various concerns raised in the Auditor-General’s report and in the briefing documents presented to the Committee, that are based on the final man-</td>
<td><strong>7.1.4 The Entity presents its plan to ad-</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Government Motor Transport provides the Committee with the following:

A breakdown list (per department) of employees who are offenders of driving irregularities, including the nature of the offense, the actions taken and details of any previous offenses by the listed offenders.

8. DESTINATION MARKETING ORGANISATION (CAPE TOWN ROUTES UNLIMITED)

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Entities Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no findings and that this is unchanged from previous years.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pages: 72 of the Annual Report of the Department.</td>
<td>8.1 The Committee resolved that:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading: Paragraph 31: “Events subsequent to reporting date”.</td>
<td>8.1.1 The Department and Provincial Treasury ensures that all relevant members and senior officials are available to account for the Financial Statements and audit outcomes to the Committee and other even after CTRU’s amalgamation into WESGRO is completed.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9. HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE

The Committee notes the Auditor-General's audit opinion regarding the Entities Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no findings on compliance with laws and regulations, and that this represents and improvement over the previous year where findings on compliance with laws and regulations were recorded. The Committee notes the Entities commitments to achieving a clean audit status by 2014.

The Committee expressed no further views and made no further resolutions.

10. WESTERN CAPE GAMBLING AND RACING BOARD

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding the Entities Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no other matters, and that this represents an improvement over the previous year where findings on predetermined objectives and compliance with laws and regulations, were recorded.

Whilst the committee is pleased with this audit outcome, the opportunity for regression remains as does the Entities commitments to maintaining a clean audit status beyond 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND / CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>10.1</strong> The Committee resolved that:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages</strong>: 46 of the Annual Report of the Department.</td>
<td>10.1.1 The Entity ensures that a recurrence of this nature should not be repeated in the future, and that effective mechanisms be developed and implemented that would avoid such events;</td>
<td>By 30 Jan 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: Paragraph 18: “Investigation”.</td>
<td>10.1.2 The Entity ensures that the Board Member who is responsible for the Supply Chain Management function should be the only board member who is involved in Supply Chain Management processes; and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee notes that the Chairperson of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board has been the subject of an investigation by the Forensic Investigation Unit.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pages</strong>: 59 of the Annual Report of the Department.</td>
<td>10.1.3 The Entity provides the Committee with an update on the status of the penalties incurred to the South African Revenue Services, including details why these were incurred.</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading</strong>: Point 18: “Net surplus for the year: Other”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong>: The Committee enquired about the details of the “Penalties” incurred by the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board provide the Committee with a copy of the following:
The Standard Operation Procedure that will ensure that the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board adheres to the directives as documented in the Supply Chain Management Procedures as per page 46 of the Annual Report.

11. CASIDRA (Pty) Ltd

The Committee notes the Auditor-General’s audit opinion regarding Casidra’s Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no other matters, and that this is unchanged from the previous year. Whilst the committee is pleased with this audit outcome, the opportunity for regression remains as does Casidra’s commitments to maintaining a clean audit status beyond 2014.

The views and resolutions of the Committee are laid out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BACKGROUND /- CONCERNS</th>
<th>RESOLUTIONS</th>
<th>ACTION DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 25 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td><strong>11.1 The Committee resolved that:</strong></td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “2.1.5 Overview of the Organisational Environment for 2011/12”.</td>
<td>11.1.1 The whistle-blowers who alerted Casidra’s of the malpractice should receive recognition in the fight against corruption within the company;</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee raised a concern regarding procurement management controls, yet also congratulating the Department in uncovering corruption at the George Regional Office.</td>
<td>11.1.2 The Company informs the entire organisation regarding the corruption case being uncovered in such a way that other would-be offenders are deterred; and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page:</strong> 67 of the Annual Report.</td>
<td>11.1.3 The Committee requests that the Entity implements effective and adequate steps to detect and prevent SCM deviations, and to ensure that the financial statements are adequately reviewed against the financial reporting framework to ensure accuracy thereof.</td>
<td>By 15 April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heading:</strong> “Financial and Performance Management”.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong> The Committee is concerned that management did not perform regular monitoring, review and evaluation of compliance to Supply Chain Management (“SCM”) regulations and procurement processes; and that material misstatements highlighted by the Auditor-General were not detected by internal controls and on-going monitoring by management.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

11.2 LIST OF INFORMATION REQUIRED

That CASIDRA provides the Committee with the following:

The SAPS case number regarding the investigation of fraud of an employee as per page 26 of the Annual Report.
12. **CAPE MEDICAL DEPOT (CMD)**

The Committee notes the Auditor-General's audit opinion regarding the CMD's Annual Financial Statements, being financially unqualified with no other matters, and that this represents an improvement over the previous year where findings on compliance with laws and regulations, were recorded. Whilst the committee is pleased with this audit outcome, the opportunity for regression remains as does CMD's commitments to maintaining a clean audit status beyond 2014.

The Committee expressed no further views and made no further resolutions.

**THURSDAY, 13 DECEMBER 2012**

**ANNOUNCEMENT**

The Speaker:

Referral of draft bills to committee in terms of Rule 220:

**Standing Committee on Local Government**


**WEDNESDAY, 23 JANUARY 2013**

**TABLING**

The Speaker:

**Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**


**MONDAY, 28 JANUARY 2013**

**TABLING**

The Speaker:

**Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:**

Delayed tabling of the Annual Consolidated Financial Statements of Provincial Departments and Entities for the 2011/2012 Financial Year.
ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. **Appointment of Board members of Western Cape Nature Conservation Board**

   The following persons have been appointed by the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning to the Western Cape Nature Conservation Board in accordance with section 4(3) of Western Cape Nature Conservation Board Act, 1998 (Act 15 of 1998), with effect from 1 March 2013 for a period of five (5) years until 28 February 2018:

   Dr B McKenzie
   Ms M McOmbring-Hodges
   Mr D Nel
   Adv M Mdludlu

2. **Publication of Act 3 of 1996 (isiXhosa version)**


ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

*Updated list of changes in Standing Committees’ membership (* denotes a change):*

1. **Rules Committee**

   **Members: 11**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (6)</th>
<th>ANC (2)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID (1)</th>
<th>ACDP (1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Majola, TR (C) Pretorius, PJC Rossouw, A Geyer, HP Visser, JJ Marais, AJD</td>
<td>Uys, P Tingwe, M</td>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td>Lentit, RB</td>
<td>Haskin, GCR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Members</td>
<td>Alternate Members</td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne, C Wiley, MGE Hartnick, JL Von Brandis, EJ</td>
<td>Stali, ZC Beerwinkel, CF</td>
<td>Van Zyl, JA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Public Accounts Committee

**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP (1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geyer, HP, Labuschagne, C, Wiley, MGE</td>
<td>Ozinsky, M</td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td>Haskin, GCR (C)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Members</td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Von Brandis, EJ, Visser, JJ, Walters, MC, Rossouw, A</td>
<td>Tingwe, M</td>
<td>Lentit, RB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Von Brandis, EJ (C), Figlan, AM</td>
<td>Provincial Treasury, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>Bevu, TN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beerwinkel, CF</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stali, ZC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Members</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mbalo, BG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prins, E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Budget Committee

**Members: 13**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (8)</th>
<th>ANC (2)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID (1)</th>
<th>ACDP (1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Von Brandis, EJ (C)  
Marais, AJD  
Labuschagne, C  
Hartnick, JL  
Visser, JJ  
Wiley, MGE  
Walters, MC  
Figlan, AM  
**Alternate Member**  
Geyer, HP | Brown, L  
Beerwinkel, CF  
**Alternate Member**  
Magwaza, NP | Ncedana, M  
**Alternate Member**  
Lentit, RB | Haskin, GCR |

5. Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth *(Premier)*

**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Hartnick, JL (C)  
Marais, AJD  
Figlan, AM  
**Alternate Members**  
Labuschagne, C  
Pretorius, PJC  
Wiley, MGE  
Rossouw, A | **Premier**  
Brown, L  
**Gender, Disabled and Youth**  
Hani, V  
**Alternate Members**  
Stali, ZC  
Magwaza, NP | Bevu, TN  
**Alternate Member**  
Haskin, GCR |
6. **Standing Committee on Local Government** *(Local Government and National Council of Provinces)*

**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Visser, JJ (C)  
Geyer, HP  
Walters, MC | Uys, P | Ncedana, M | Alternate Member | Lentit, RB |
| **Alternate Members**  
Von Brandis, EJ  
Figlan, AM | Alternate Member | Skwatsha, M | | |

7. **Standing Committee on Human Settlements** *(Human Settlements)*

**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Figlan, AM (C)  
Geyer, HP  
Visser, JJ | Magaxa, KE | Ncedana, M | Alternate Member | Lentit, RB |
| **Alternate Members**  
Von Brandis, EJ  
Walters, MC | Alternate Member | Skwatsha, M | | |

8. **Standing Committee on Local Government Oversight**

**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Visser, JJ (C)  
Walters, MC  
Von Brandis, EJ | Beerwinkel, CF | Ncedana, M | Alternate Member | Lentit, RB |
| **Alternate Members**  
Figlan, AM  
Geyer, HP | Alternate Member | Uys, P | | |
9. Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning (Agriculture and Environmental Affairs and Development Planning)

**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Walters, MC (C) Visser, JJ</td>
<td>Agriculture Prins, E</td>
<td>Van Zyl, JA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture Geyer, HP</td>
<td>Environmental Affairs and Development Planning Mbalo, BG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Affairs and Development Planning Von Brandis, EJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Members Rossouw, A Figlan, AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Member Ozinsky, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. *Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport* (Community Safety and Cultural Affairs and Sport)

**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP (1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wiley, MGE (C) Marais, AJD Hartnick, JL</td>
<td>Community Safety Gopie, D*</td>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport Ncedana, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety Gopie, D*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport Witbooi, J</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Members Rossouw, A Labuschagne, C Pretorius, PJC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Member Magaxa, KE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Member for Community Safety Lentit, RB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety Haskin, GCR</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
11. Standing Committee on Education *(Education)*

**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne, C (C) Wiley, MGE Hartnick, JL</td>
<td>Tingwe, M</td>
<td>Van Zyl, JA</td>
<td>Alternate Member Witbooi, J</td>
<td>Alternate Member Lentit, RB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Members Marais, AJD Rossouw, A Pretorius, PJC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. Standing Committee on Community Development *(Health and Social Development)*

**Members: 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID (1)</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Marais, AJD (C) Hartnick, JL Labuschagne, C</td>
<td>Health Skwatsha, M Social Development Magwaza, NP</td>
<td>Social Development Van Zyl, JA</td>
<td>Health Lentit, RB</td>
<td>Alternate Member for Social Development Lentit, RB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Members Pretorius, PJC Wiley, MGE Rossouw, A</td>
<td>Alternate Member Hani, V</td>
<td>Alternate Member for Health Van Zyl, JA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13. **Petitions Committee**

*Members: 5*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geyer, HP (C)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Witbooi, J</td>
<td></td>
<td>Lentit, RB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figlan, AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne, C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Members</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, AJD</td>
<td></td>
<td>Gopie, D*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, JL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley, MGE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, AJD</td>
<td></td>
<td>Van Zyl, JA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, JL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gopie, D*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Zyl, JA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witbooi, J</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lentit, RB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

14. **Conduct Committee**

*Members: 5*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geyer, HP (C)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Uys, P</td>
<td>Bevu, TN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rossouw, A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Von Brandis, EJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Members</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, AJD</td>
<td></td>
<td>Skwatsha, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, JL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, AJD</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, JL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE (1)</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geyer, HP (C)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Uys, P</td>
<td>Bevu, TN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rossouw, A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Von Brandis, EJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Members</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, AJD</td>
<td></td>
<td>Skwatsha, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, JL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, AJD</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, JL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
15. Chairpersons’ Forum

*Members: 10*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (9)</th>
<th>ANC</th>
<th>COPE</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>ACDP (1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Von Brandis, EJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, JL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walters, MC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visser, JJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, AJD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne, C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley, MGE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geyer, HP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretorius, PJC (C)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figlan, AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haskin, GCR</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

16. Aesthetics Committee

*Members: 5*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA (3)</th>
<th>ANC (1)</th>
<th>COPE</th>
<th>ID (1)</th>
<th>ACDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rossouw, A</td>
<td>Uys, P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretorius, PJC (C)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, AJD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alternate Members</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geyer, HP</td>
<td>Alternate Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley, MGE</td>
<td>Beerwinkel, CF</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majola, TR</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lentit, RB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alternate Member</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haskin, GCR</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTERPELLATIONS,

QUESTIONS AND REPLIES
Questions and replies as received from departments.

QUESTIONS

For written reply:

Learners in Grade 12 and those repeating Grades 11 and 12

†1. Mr R B Lentit to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:

How many learners who started Grade 1 in 2001 (a) reached Grade 12 in 2012, (b) repeated Grade 11 and (c) are currently repeating Grade 12?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

1. (a) 43 111 Grade 12 learners reached Grade 12 in Public Ordinary Schools in 2012. While the majority of these would be learners who started school in Grade 1 in 2001, the figure also includes in-migration and repeaters. It excludes learners at independent schools and learners who left after Grade 9 to continue their formal education elsewhere, such as FET colleges.

(b) 8 391 Grade 11s repeated in 2012.

(c) 341 Grade 12s repeated in 2013.

Traffic violations on Western Cape roads recorded

†2. Mr R B Lentit to ask Mr R V Carlisle, Minister of Transport and Public Works

How many traffic violations on Western Cape roads have been recorded as (a) driving under the influence of alcohol, (b) excessive speeding, (c) dangerous overtaking and (d) reckless or negligent driving for the period 1 December 2012 to 31 December 2012?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS:

2. During the period 1 December 2012 to 31 December 2012 the following traffic offences were recorded:

(a) Driving under the influence of alcohol:

- 34 384 recorded drivers were screened and of which 404 arrested;

(b) Excessive speeding:

- a total of 119 722 speeding offences were recorded of which five arrests were made for excessive speed;
Dangerous overtaking and (d) reckless or negligent driving:

- A combined total of 2 881 offences were recorded of which fifteen arrests were made.

**Withholding of government subsidy: support to Swellendam and Kannaland**

*3. Mr M Ncedana to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:*

Whether his department has contingency plans to support the Swellendam and Kannaland Municipalities when the National Treasury withhold their government subsidy; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

**The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:**

3. The Department of Local Government and the Provincial Treasury through their various monitoring processes became aware of the possibility of the withholding of the Local Government Equitable Share grant to the Kannaland and Swellendam Municipalities and reported it to me.

Soon after, on 11 December 2012, the national Minister of Finance informed me in writing that he has invoked section 216(2) of the Constitution whereby the portion of the equitable share payable to the said municipalities in March 2013, would be stopped. At the time of receipt of the National Minister’s letter, action was already taken by myself in liaison with my Department and the Provincial Treasury to deal with the situation.

In the case of Swellendam, under the leadership of the province, corrective measures with regard to the finances of the municipality are currently being put in place in an effort to make this municipality financially sustainable. With due regard to the provincial support being rendered to the municipality and the corrective measures instituted in liaison with the Swellendam Municipal Council, the National Minister has been requested by both myself and the provincial Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism to reconsider the stopping of the equitable share.

In the case of Kannaland consultation between the Municipality, the provincial Treasury and the National Treasury has been on-going. Detailed conversations on the submission of required documents were raised and input obtained from the Auditor-General. The Municipalities further gave updates on progress made with their turn-around initiatives and the potential impact of this action.

A meeting has been confirmed between all parties which is scheduled to take place at the end of February 2013 and I am briefed on a regular basis.
For written reply:

**SAPS: raiding of establishments and confiscation of alcohol**

†1. Mr M G E Wiley to ask Mr D Plato, Minister of Community Safety:

(1) (a) What criteria are applied by the South African Police Service in order to determine whether an establishment that is selling alcohol should be raided, (b) what procedures are in place with regard to the confiscation of alcohol, (c) which SAPS entity is responsible for the storage of confiscated alcohol and (d) (i) how is confiscated alcohol disposed of and (ii) what are the relevant procedures with regard to the disposal of alcohol;

(2) whether confiscated alcohol is stored at station level; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;

(3) whether confiscated alcohol is disposed of; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

1. Reply furnished by Lt General Lamoer (SAPS):

   (1) (a) Complaints received from the public, non-compliance to license condition, Crime Patterns Analysis and Crime threats.

   (b) Non-compliance to the amount of liquor a person may have in his/her possession. All seizures are done in terms of the relevant Legislation.

   (c) The Section: Visible Policing at station level, SAPS13 Clerk. Large quantities of liquor are stored at the Provincial Liquor Evidence Management Centre (PLEMC) of the Western Cape.

   (d) (i) Liquor is disposed into containers. SAPS are mandated by the Criminal Procedure Act, Act 51/17.

   (ii) By order of a court, where the court determines whether the liquor should be handed back to the lawful owner or be forfeited to the state.

(2) Yes, stations can store liquor at station level.

(3) Yes, once the criminal case is finalised, the court will either determine that the confiscated liquor be handed back to the owner or that the liquor must be forfeited to the state.
Nyanga and Mitchells Plain Clusters: raids and confiscated alcohol

‡2. Mr M G E Wiley to ask Mr D Plato, Minister of Community Safety:

(1) (a) How many raids were conducted on (i) legal and (ii) illegal shebeens in each month from 1 April 2012 up to the latest specified month for which statistics are available in the (aa) Nyanga Cluster and (bb) Mitchells Plain Cluster, (b) how many litres of alcohol were confiscated by the South African Police Service per month as mentioned in the subdivisions of paragraph (a) above and (c) of the total volume of alcohol confiscated as mentioned in paragraph (b) above, how many litres had been (i) disposed of and (ii) stored as at the latest specified date for which information is available;

(2) whether any criminal case dockets have been opened in respect of the (a) Nyanga Police Cluster and (b) Mitchells Plain Police Cluster since 1 April 2012 as a result of (i) raids and (ii) confiscated alcohol; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;

(3) whether the SAPS inspects the adherence to licence conditions among the legal taverns in the Western Cape; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

2. Reply furnished by Lt General Lamoer (SAPS):

(1) (a) (i) (aa) and (bb) Raids are not conducted at licensed premises but compliance inspections are conducted. When it is found that a license holder is not complying with the condition of the license a Section 73(7)(C) report is forwarded to the Western Cape Liquor Authority to have the license suspended or revoked.

(ii) (aa) Raids at illegal shebeens: Nyanga Cluster

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MONTH</th>
<th>NUMBER OF RAIDS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APRIL 2012</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAY 2012</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JUNE 2012</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JULY 2012</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUGUST 2012</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPTEMBER 2012</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCTOBER 2012</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOVEMBER 2012</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECEMBER 2012</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(bb) Raids at illegal shebeens: Mitchells Plain Cluster

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MONTH</th>
<th>NUMBER OF RAIDS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APRIL 2012</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAY 2012</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FRIDAY 15 FEBRUARY 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MONTH</th>
<th>NUMBER OF RAIDS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JUNE 2012</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JULY 2012</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUGUST 2012</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPTEMBER 2012</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCTOBER 2012</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOVEMBER 2012</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECEMBER 2012</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(b) Liquor confiscated: Nyanga Cluster

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MONTH</th>
<th>LITRES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APRIL 2012</td>
<td>12878.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAY 2012</td>
<td>3263.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JUNE 2012</td>
<td>5074.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JULY 2012</td>
<td>2564.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUGUST 2012</td>
<td>1413.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPTEMBER 2012</td>
<td>11459.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCTOBER 2012</td>
<td>3500.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOVEMBER 2012</td>
<td>5816.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECEMBER 2012</td>
<td>634762.76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Liquor confiscated: Mitchells Plain Cluster

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MONTH</th>
<th>LITRES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APRIL 2012</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAY 2012</td>
<td>148.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JUNE 2012</td>
<td>529.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JULY 2012</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUGUST 2012</td>
<td>360.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPTEMBER 2012</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCTOBER 2012</td>
<td>276.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOVEMBER 2012</td>
<td>146.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECEMBER 2012</td>
<td>477.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(c) (i) Liquor disposed of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MONTH</th>
<th>LITRES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APRIL 2012</td>
<td>12878.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAY 2012</td>
<td>2798.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JUNE 2012</td>
<td>6925.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JULY 2012</td>
<td>23964.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUGUST 2012</td>
<td>9984.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPTEMBER 2012</td>
<td>3325.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCTOBER 2012</td>
<td>6591.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOVEMBER 2012</td>
<td>20847.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECEMBER 2012</td>
<td>16492.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(ii) At end December 2012, a total of 311 297 litres of alcohol were stored at the Provincial Liquor Evidence Management Centre. This total fluctuates due to liquor being handed back to owner and liquor confiscated.
(2) (a) and (b) (i) and (ii) This office cannot release statistics that has not been released by the national Minister of Police.

(3) Yes, compliance inspections are conducted in terms of the Western Cape Liquor Act 4 of 2008 to ensure adherence to licence conditions.

Wynberg Police Station: cases of house robbery/burglary

†3. Mr M G E Wiley to ask Mr D Plato, Minister of Community Safety:

With reference to the Wynberg Police Station, how many (a) cases were reported, (b) arrests were effected, (c) cases were taken to court and (d) successful convictions were secured for the crimes of (i) house robbery and (ii) house burglary in respect of the (aa) 2011/2012, (bb) 2010/2011, (cc) 2009/2010, (dd) 2008/2009 and (ee) 2007/2008 financial years?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

3. Reply furnished by Lt General Lamoer (SAPS):

House Robbery

(a) Cases reported

(aa) 2011/2012  21
(bb) 2010/2011  30
(cc) 2009/2010  19
(dd) 2008/2009  12
(ee) 2007/2008  1

(b) Arrest effected

(aa) 2011/2012  5
(bb) 2010/2011  12
(cc) 2009/2010  13
(dd) 2008/2009  7
(ee) 2007/2008  4

(c) Cases to court

(aa) 2011/2012  3
(bb) 2010/2011  9
(cc) 2009/2010  5
(dd) 2008/2009  3
(ee) 2007/2008  1
Burglary: Residential

(a) Cases reported

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(aa)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(bb)</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(cc)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(dd)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ee)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(b) Arrests effected

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(aa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(bb)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(cc)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(dd)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ee)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(c) Cases to court

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(aa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(bb)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(cc)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(dd)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ee)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(d) Successful conviction secured

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(aa)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(bb)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(cc)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(dd)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ee)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTERPELLATIONS UNDER NAME OF MEMBER
(as put to relevant Minister)

Bevu, T N
Education ................................................................. 3846, 3850
Health ................................................................. 2542, 2546
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........................................ 3014
Transport and Public Works ................................................................. 1619, 3293

Beerwinkel, C F –
Education ................................................................. 2367, 2407, 2422, 2428, 2431, 2432
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ................................................................. 3889, 3889
Transport and Public Works ................................................................. 2598

Brandis, E J –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ................................................................. 2373, 2428, 2465, 2644, 3831,
................................. 3887, 3887
Transport and Public Works ................................................................. 2374, 2415, 3362, 3742, 3743, 3745

Brown, T L –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ................................................................. 2469,

Du Toit Marais, A J
Community Safety ................................................................. 3914, 3913
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 2358, 2359, 2360, 2367, 2368, 2417, 2419
Health ................................................................. 1361, 1467, 1497, 2545, 2602, 3134, 3136, 3228, 3295, 3326, 3332, 3447
................................................................. 3484, 3486, 3708, 3776, 3828
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ................................................................. 3258, 3259,
................................. 3261
Social Development ................................................................. 1419, 2651, 2652, 302, 37541
Transport and Public Works ................................................................. 2548, 3706

Eloff, E H –
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 2434
Education ................................................................. 2366

Figlan, A M –
Housing ................................................................. 3749, 3833

Fritz, A T –
Social Development ................................................................. 3753

Haskin, G C R –
Community Safety ................................................................. 3487, 3524, 3526, 3912, 3914, 3912, 3914

Hani, V –
Health ................................................................. 2601

Hartnick, J L –
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................................. 1311, 1405, 1661
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td></td>
<td>3358, 3703</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacobs, P M</td>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>1464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne C</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>2404, 2423, 2541, 3778, 3849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>3368, 3369, 3371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>3446, 3873</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lentit, R B</td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>3915, 3919, 3915, 3919</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>3018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madikizela, B S</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magwaza, N P</td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>3772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1658, 3370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magaxa, K E</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majola, T R</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>3019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, A J D</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>17, 81,83,192,515,583,1245,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1022, 1657, 1658,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbalo, B G</td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>3131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKenzie, P C</td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>2422, 2548, 3487, 3526, 3842, 3846, 3913, 3916, 3913</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3751</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>2642, 2643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>2406, 2469, 2539, 2542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>3227, 3228, 3324, 3326, 3707</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3747, 3748, 3750, 3831, 3834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>3403, 3408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>3019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>2597, 2599, 3363</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ozinsky, M –
Agriculture ........................................................................ 2372, 2417
Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................................... 3919
Education ............................................................................ 1414, 3056, 3059, 3776, 37787
Health ................................................................................. 2364, 2420
Housing ................................................................................... 3751
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ... 1282, 1311
... 1357, 1410, 1547, 1549, 1620, 2400, 2403, 2645, 2650, 3013, 3017, 3022, 3025
......................................................................................... 38513891, 3894, 3891, 3895
Premier ................................................................. 1242, 1278, 3137, 3138, 3139, 3293, 3324, 3356, 3358
Transport and Public Works .............................................. 1617, 2416, 3365, 3705

Prins, E –
Agriculture ........................................................................... 754, 2398
Health .................................................................................... 143
Housing .................................................................................... 1104
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 2421

Skwatsha, M –
Agriculture ........................................................................... 2371
Community Safety .................................................................. 2422
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ................................. 2430
Health ....................................................................................... 2543, 3135, 3226, 3227, 3293, 3296, 3446, 3485
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3408
Social Development .................................................................. 2653
Premier ....................................................................................... 249
Transport and Public Works .................................................... 1628

Stali, Z C –
Cultural Affairs and Sport . 1361, 1407, 1659, 1661, 1661, 2355, 2356, 2358, 2360,
.................................................................................. 2410, 2419
Premier ...................................................................................... 3703
Social Development .................................................................... 1242, 3752, 3755
Transport and Public Works ..................................................... 2550, 3360, 3362, 3397, 3442, 3446, 3745, 3836,
.................................................................................. 3869, 3872, 3869, 3871

Strachan, G R –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........................................ 18, 81
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 453
Premier ...................................................................................... 3,187,352

Tingwe, M
Education ............................................................................. 1500, 2540, 3444, 3844, 3848

Uys, P –
Agriculture ............................................................................. 2372
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ... 2369, 2371
.................................................................................. 2372, 2426, 2427, 3260, 3328, 3404

Walters, M C –
Agriculture ............................................................................. 13,964, 2361, 2374, 2396, 2397, 2399, 2416
Community Safety ..................................................................... 1364
Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................................... 453,460, 2409, 2411
Transport and Public Works ..........................................2366, 3441, 3443

Wiley, M G E –
Agriculture ......................................................................... 2368
Community Safety .......................................................... 2422, 3526, 3843
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................... 2357
Education ........................................................................... 3058
Premier .............................................................................. 674, 3139
Transport and Public Works ............................................. 410, 861, 1282, 1628

Witbooi, J –
Health ................................................................. 90, 756, 812, 1066, 2362
Social Development ......................................................... 588

Van Zyl, J A –
Education ........................................................................... 3057
Health ................................................................................ 3294
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.. 1558, 2647, ..................................................3130, 3771, 3774

Visser, J J
Agriculture ........................................................................... 2417
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................... 2365, 3400
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning........ 2402, ................................................... 2604, 2607, 2608, 3025, 3330, 3406, 3774

Von Brandis, E J –
Community Safety .......................................................... 3918, 3919
Transport and Public Works ............................................. 1620, 2599, 3398, 3706, 3871, 3871

QUESTIONS
(Oral and Written: as put to relevant Minister under name of Member)

Beerwinkel, C F –
Agriculture ........................................................................... 984
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................... 1667, 2626
Education .... 960, 1117, 1118, 1178, 1179, 1257, 1258, 2388, 2392, 2393, 2531, 2533, ................................................... 2577, 2578, 2611, 2613, 2657, 2658, 2659, 2672, 3877, 3877
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism 2635, 2683, 2705, 2706, 2707, 3342 ................................................... 3156, 3219, 3222, 3270, 3416, 3417, 3462, 3490, 3494, 3725, 3726
Health ................................................................................ 3475
Housing .............................................................................. 1287
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning……... 600,690, ................................................... 691,722,723,802,803,838,874,937,960,999, 3463
Transport and Public Works ............................................. 1072, 1081, 1117, 3304, 3393
Bevu, T N –
Agriculture ................................................................. 1120,3505
Community Safety ......................................................... 1185, 1264, 3499
Education ........................................................................ 1120,3505
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ...................... 2480
Housing ............................................................................ 3268, 3725
Premier ............................................................................ 1250, 1425, 3709
Social Development ............................................................. 707,708
Transport and Public Works ................................................. 1122, 1559, 2481,3303

Boesak, A A –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .......................... 100
Health ............................................................................. 45, 96
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......................... 99

Brown, L –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism 2435, 2436, 2437, 2438, 2487, 2561 ................................................................. 1567
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........................... 3881
Premier ............................................................................ 326,367,368,439,464,469,594,595,697,1141,1143, 3851
1146, 1176, 1426, 1428, 1458, 1461, 1487, 1550, 1578, 2673, 2698, 2701, 3756,
3851
Transport and Public Works .................................................

Cupido, P W –
Community Safety ................................................................. 448, 449, 544, 849, 883, 1304, 2638, 3100, 3125
Cultural Affairs and Sport ....................................................... 309
Education ............................................................................ 510, 721, 775, 776, 950, 1172, 3240, 3284
Health ............................................................................. 1329, 3124, 3285
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......................... 600, 689,
885, 941, 1171, 1328, 2639, 3126, 3881
Social Development ............................................................... 951
Transport and Public Works ...................................................

Du Toit Marais, A J –
Community Safety ................................................................. 3428, 3722
Cultural Affairs and Sport ....................................................... 3875, 3875
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ......................... 3245
Health ............................................................................. 1373, 1404, 1437, 1438, 2554, 2555, 2609, 2615, 3151, 3152, 3427,
3901,3901
Housing ............................................................................. 3496, 3531
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......................... 3533, 3535, 3728,
Social Development ............................................................... 1372, 1431, 1470, 1630, 3473, 3491, 3496

Eloff, E H –
Agriculture ........................................................................... 211, 2672, 3246
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .......................... 876
Health ............................................................................. 876, 1562, 1563
Transport and Public Works ...................................................


Figlan, A M –
Community Safety ................................................................. 3531, 3739
Health ........................................................................ 3471, 3930, 3930,
Housing ........ 3416, 3422, 3452, 3453, 3493, 3527, 3528, 3536, 3897, 3900, 3930,
................................................................. 3897, 3899, 3930
Social Development ............................................................... 3471, 3490

Gabru, Y –
Cultural Affairs and Sport......................................................... 876, 938
Education ........................................................................ 26, 73, 206, 435, 612, 797, 846, 962, 985
Health ........................................................................ 393
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning... 3339, 3340
Premier ........................................................................ 1

Geyer, H P –
Education ........................................................................ 606, 1381, 1675
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning...... 219, 545,
..... 600, 689, 3155, 3246, 3287, 3304, 3314, 3395, 3396, 3417, 3522, 3716, 3763,
................................................................. 3784, 3799, 3803, 3838
Premier ........................................................................ 24
Transport and Public Works ...................................................... 165, 166, 203, 475

Hani, V –
Community Safety ................................................................. 1538, 1742, 2529
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning...... 2569
Health ........................................................................ 2694, 2696, 3037, 3127, 3128
Social Development ............................................................... 1569, 1706, 2674, 2675, 2698
Premier ........................................................................ 3378

Hartnick, J L –
Agriculture ........................................................................ 957
Community Safety ................................................................. 3479, 3722
Cultural Affairs and Sport........ 122, 348, 833, 849, 859, 885, 993, 1032, 1054, 1055,
................................................................. 1074, 1086, 1089, 1137, 1148, 1151, 1183, 1238,
................................................................. 1271, 1272, 1379, 1435, 1642
Education ........................................................................ 181, 364, 390, 480, 712, 790, 857, 992, 1040,
................................................................. 1073, 1294, 1296, 1495, 1568, 2621, 3478, 3739, 3937, 3938
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........................................... 3044
Health ........................................................................ 712
Social Development ................................................................... 3355, 3712
Premier ........................................................................ 2501, 3118

Haskin, G C R –
Community Safety ................................................................. 3431, 3827, 3928,
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................................ 3520
Education ........................................................................ 3477
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........................................... 3520
Health ........................................................................ 3905, 3922, 3923, 3924, 3905, 3922
Housing ........................................................................ 3476
Social Development ................................................................. 3711, 3714
Transport and Public Works ...................................................... 3432, 3717, 3759, 3760, 3926
Jacobs, P M –
Community Safety ................................................................. 792, 874
Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................................... 28, 129, 162, 175, 202, 345, 371, 726, 792, 945
Education .............................................................................. 973, 1260, 1288, 2582, 2627
Housing .................................................................................. 1081, 1632, 1633, 1686
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ... 1391, 2622
Social Development ................................................................. 725
Transport and Public Works ....................................................... 1684

Labuschagne, C –
Community Safety ................................................................. 993, 1622, 1624, 3414
Education ............................................................................. 1650, 3027, 3119, 3153, 3154, 3345, 3351, 3473, 3730, 3763
Health ..................................................................................... 451, 508, 544, 958, 1335
Premier ................................................................................... 537, 1070, 1112, 1662
Social Development ................................................................. 421, 422, 1373, 1433, 1675, 3419, 3478, 3492
Transport and Public Works ....................................................... 3798

Lentit, R B –
Agriculture ............................................................................. 3043, 3885, 3896, 3896, 3896
Community Safety ................................................................. 3096, 3244, 3347, 3421, 3929, 3929
Education ............................................................................... 2487, 2553, 3029, 3080, 3241, 3426, 3477, 3509, 3938, 3938, 3941
Health ...................................................................................... 3071, 3079, 3107, 3174, 3299, 3302, 3389, 3391, 3391, 3475
Housing .................................................................................. 3728, 3836, 3860, 3923, 3924
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ... 1391, 2622, 3030
Premier ................................................................................... 3334, 3373, 3375
Social Development ................................................................. 3110, 3219
Transport and Public Works ....................................................... 3070, 3107, 3150, 3756, 3925, 3925, 3941

Magaxa, K E –
Housing .................................................................................. 3322, 3898, 3898

Magwaza, N P –
Community Safety ................................................................. 1034, 1226
Education .............................................................................. 1227
Health ...................................................................................... 2615
Housing .................................................................................. 3387
Premier ................................................................................... 696, 1027
Social Development ................................................................. 365, 366, 380, 388, 714, 773, 782, 817, 819, 822, 1325, 1327, 1514, 1516, 1557, 1558, 1665, 2687, 3039, 3239, 3352, 3353, 3824, 3826, 3839

Majola, T R –
Agriculture ............................................................................... 1171
Community Safety .................................................................. 35
Housing .................................................................................. 828
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 1576
Marais, A J D –
Education .......................................................... 360, 1641
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................... 2474
Health .......................................................... 103, 108, 222, 374, 424, 426, 511, 546, 797, 806, 807, 856, 997,
.............................................................................. 1135, 1136, 1209, 1221, 1255, 1256, 1292, 1293, 1320, 1563,
.............................................................................. 1564, 1616, 2475, 3116
Social Development ........................................... 23, 225, 226, 379, 484, 782, 820, 823, 827, 872, 1181, 1183
...................................................................................... 1222, 1321, 1664, 1666, 3117

Mbalo, B G –
Health .......................................................... 3801, 3836
Housing .......................................................... 3801
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........................................... 3769, 3791
...................................................................................... 3794
Premier .......................................................... 3376

McKenzie, P C –
Community Safety ........................................... 102, 163, 776, 777, 778, 1081, 1127, 1190, 1614, 1623, 1674,
.............................................................................. 2562, 2684, 3273, 3415, 3431, 3499, 3500, 3532
Education .......................................................... 3351
Health .......................................................... 601, 3391
Housing .......................................................... 3147, 3530
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........................................... 3265, 3534
Premier .......................................................... 98, 1028, 1312
Transport and Public Works .......................................................... 3151, 3163

Mqulwana, K A –
Education .......................................................... 3730
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .......................................................... 860
Housing .......................................................... 853
Premier .......................................................... 872, 900
Transport and Public Works .......................................................... 388, 603, 694, 699, 700, 764, 1129, 1132, 1179,
...................................................................................... 1180, 1251, 1252, 1255

Ncedana, M –
Community Safety ........................................... 488, 528, 1631, 3272, 3497, 3721, 3762
Cultural Affairs and Sport .......................................................... 488
Education .......................................................... 3348, 3351
Health .......................................................... 1438, 1614, 3301
Housing .......................................................... 1098, 1139, 1639, 3028, 3066, 3147, 3270, 3335, 3384, 3394, 3713
...................................................................................... 3723, 3763
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........................................... 541
Social Development .......................................................... 3299, 3942

Ozinsky, M –
Agriculture .......................................................... 3933
Community Safety .......................................................... 1229, 1520, 1536, 3231, 3247
Cultural Affairs and Sport .......................................................... 1274, 1668
Education .......................................................... 1274, 3034, 3765, 3784, 3902
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .......................................................... 1274, 1445, 3244, 3342, 3766
Health .......................................................... 438, 546, 1240
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>23, 97, 202, 1114, 1146, 1177, 1224, 1313, 1342, 1368, 1395, 1421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1240, 3074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>213, 1229, 1566, 1679, 3316, 3757</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Paulse, S U</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>176, 389, 1010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>1454, 1456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>140, 168, 1403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>177, 427, 1011, 1451, 1481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>552, 576, 1172, 1453, 1485, 1488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>396, 552, 803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Prins, E</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>33, 34, 35, 603, 839, 1038, 1132, 1180, 1182, 1203, 1263, 1265, 1291, 1297, 1568, 1569, 1639, 1641, 1742, 2595, 2596, 2621, 2655, 2680, 2703, 3034, 3035, 3051, 3052, 3066, 3067, 3071, 3072, 3243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>1132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>205, 700, 702, 765, 1082, 3112, 3127, 3243, 3265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>2665</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rossouw, A</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>3811, 3837, 3886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>1380, 1673</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>79, 803, 997, 998, 1207, 1380, 1399, 1435, 1448, 1453, 1462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>164, 607, 720, 954, 955, 1336, 1401, 2478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>843, 1449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>57, 327, 329, 415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1400, 3101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>1272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skwatsha, M</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1259, 3384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>1288, 3073, 3110, 3230, 3231, 3432, 3479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>3268, 3875, 3876</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1006, 2479, 2552, 3236, 3238, 3767, 3787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>1119, 1206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>2692, 3153, 3311, 3391, 3394, 3508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>428, 431, 886, 2614, 3269, 3767, 3931, 3932</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>1159, 2565, 3792, 3800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Ministries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>22, 368, 763, 1029, 1467, 1505, 1551, 3509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>890, 1194, 1259, 1284, 2667, 2669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>492, 528, 951, 1193, 1254, 1290, 1653, 1680, 3535, 3536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stali, Z C</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>2527, 2528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>1061, 1079, 1204, 1205, 1525, 1666</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>3284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>2525, 2567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>2620, 3769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>3488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1036, 1340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>2681, 3409, 3412, 3456, 3459, 3519, 3536, 3718, 3719, 3720</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strachan, G R</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>43, 102, 125, 213, 344, 389, 417, 418, 471, 473, 541, 610, 611, 841, 842, 849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>201, 531</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>360, 361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>599, 687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tingwe, M</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1557</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>1508, 1510, 2633, 3264, 3415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>1291, 1320, 1430, 2591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1473, 2675, 2685, 3028, 3233, 3235, 3347, 3348, 3474, 3876, 3939, 3938</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>1319, 3416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>1264, 2593, 3263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3144, 3145, 3148, 3388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>1249, 1554, 2629, 3063, 3064</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1290, 2594, 3077, 3419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>1471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Uys, P</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>976, 982, 3224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>908</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1036, 2440, 3225, 3902, 3903, 3902, 3903</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>903, 1378, 1433, 1653, 3256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td>1654, 1655, 1677, 1689, 2352, 2385, 2704, 2705, 3430, 3455, 3482, 3927, 3936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td>3927, 3936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>1532, 2499, 2500, 2501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>976, 1275, 1394, 1649, 1673, 2460, 2463, 2464, 2489, 3935, 3935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td>440, 446, 490, 492, 500, 504, 505, 542, 543, 577, 579, 620, 622, 703, 717, 769</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
770,808,810,811,820,835, 850, 885,886,942,944,959, 1012, 1056, 1058
1077,1078,1084,1126,1153,1154,1155, 1197, 1202,1234,1273,1275
1296,1308,1316,1318,1337,1338,1342, 1376, 1392, 1444, 1457, 1468
1475, 1489, 1493, 1512, 1517, 1532, 1567, 1572, 1575, 1613, 1636, 1648
1637, 1668, 2352, 2353, 2381, 2382, 2384, 2387,2488, 2558, 2560, 2566, 2618,
2619, 2659, 2660, 2664, 2676, 2678, 3031, 3033, 3046, 3047, 3049, 3068,
3069, 3105, 3106, 3113, 3140, 3141, 3249, 3250, 3254, 3278, 3282, 3307, 3310,
3354, 3355, 3396, 3428, 3519, 3716, 3762, 3780, 3781, 3796, 3804, 3840, 3856,
3859, 3878, 3881, 3882, 3926

Premier

Social Development

Van Zyl, J A –

Agriculture ................................................................. 3272, 3277, 3297, 3933, 3932
Education ............................................................... 1184, 1561, 1706, 2556, 3298, 3481, 3730
Housing ................................................................................ 1139
Health ............................................................................. 2484, 3425, 3769
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 3482
Social Development ............................................................. 3334
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 2485, 3799

Visser, J J –

Agriculture ....................................................................... 774
Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 3417, 3423
Community Safety .......................................................... 362
Education .......................................................................... 1309
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ... 220, 1042
Housing ............................................................................. 120, 153, 605, 1033, 1089, 3122, 3338, 3740
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 216,419, 451,480,854,860,913,954,996,1033,1052,1340, 1649, 3122, 3305, 3522
Social Development ............................................................. 3763, 3783, 3884, 3920, 3884, 3920
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 606,695,855, 3038, 3278, 3307, 3794

Visser, J J –

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 3920

Von Brandis, E J –

Agriculture ....................................................................... 1266, 1295
Community Safety .......................................................... 212,423,604,609
Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 400, 1041, 3919
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ... 350,781,823,1021,1322,1324
1521, 1522, 1633, 1635, 3119, 3161, 3222, 3341, 3414, 3452, 3482, 3489, 3537
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .... 122, 1266,
1295, 1315, 1559
Transport and Public Works. 219, 348, 349, 545, 705, 772, 878, 1072, 3120, 3162,
3245, 3266, 3342, 3379, 3380, 3521, 3760, 3873, 3897, 3924, 3873, 3897, 3919
.................................................................................... 3924
QUESTIONS TO PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Beerwinkel, C F ................................................................. 52,613, 3288, 3289
Bevu, T N ................................................................. 54,895, 3166
Brown, L ............................................................. 170, 1384, 1525, 2622, 3164, 3318, 3319, 3811
Eloff, E H ........................................................        1644, 2623
Figlan, A M ................................................................. 3436, 3514
Gabru, Y ........................................................................ 54,498
Geyer, H P ..................................................................... 493,786, 1531, 3288
Haskin, G C R ................................................................. 3517, 3817
Hartnick, J L .............................................................. 787, 897, 1047, 1389, 3290, 3911
Havi, V ........................................................................ 3861
Jacobs, P M .................................................................... 786, 1681, 1682, 2377
Labuschagne, C ......................................................... 56, 172, 498, 614, 1050, 1682
Lentit, R B .................................................................... 3513
Magaxa K E .................................................................. 3515
Magwaza, N P ........................................ 383, 783, 1198, 1387, 1642
Majola, T R .......................................................... 384
Marais, A J D .......................................................... 1004, 1681, 2624, 3321
Mbalo, B G .................................................................. 3865
McKenzie, P C .... 171, 1002, 1300, 1680, 2374, 2375, 2376, 3041, 3168,
........................................................................ 3169, 3170, 3437
Mqulwana, K A ................................................................ 494, 1048
Ncedana, M ................................................................ 3168, 3733, 3736, 3862
Ozinsky, M .......................................................... 615, 1046, 1645, 2374, 3173, 3435
Prins, E ........................................................................ 1299
Rossouw, A ................................................................ 1301, 3165, 3733, 3735
Skwatsha, M ................................................................ 1529, 2361, 3906, 3910, 3906
Stali, Z C ........................................................................ 3319
Tingwe, M ...................................................................... 2494
Uys, P ........................................................................ 1200, 3910
Van Zyl, J A ................................................................ 1199
Visser, J J ...................................................................... 53, 170, 1645, 3040, 3737,
Von Brandis, E J .......................................................... 1200, 1386, 2378, 3436, 3817
Walters, M C .................................................................. 1528, 3042,
Wiley, M G E ...................................................... 386, 617, 894, 1199, 1299, 2497, 3171, 3172, 3173
Witbooi, J ...................................................................... 1001, 2491, 3039, 3512