CABINET

The Premier .......................................................... Ms O H Maree (Zille)
Minister of Health ...................................................... Mr T L Botha
Minister of Agriculture .............................................. Mr H G van Rensburg
Minister of Transport and Public Works ...................... Mr R V Carlisle
Minister of Community Safety ................................. Mr D Plato
Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism . Mr A R Winde
Minister of Social Development ................................. Mr A T Fritz
Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...................... Mr A W Bredell
Minister of Housing .................................................. Mr B S Madikizela
Minister of Education ............................................... Mr D A C Grant
Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport ....................... Mr I H Meyer

OFFICE-BEARERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

Speaker .............................................................................. Mr T R Majola
Leader of Government Business ................................. Mr T L Botha
Deputy Speaker .......................................................... Mr P J C P Pretorius
Leader of the Opposition ............................................... Ms L Brown
Chief Whip: DA ............................................................ Ms A Rossouw
Chief Whip: Opposition ............................................... Mr P Uys
Secretary .......................................................................... Mr P G Williams

ISBN
MEMBERS OF PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

PARTIES:

Democratic Alliance = DA
African National Congress = ANC
Congress of the People = COPE
Independent Democrats = ID
African Christian Democratic Party = ACDP

Beerwinkel, Ms Carol Frances .................................................. ANC
Bevu, Ms Tozama Nomsa ............................................................ COPE
Botha, Theunis Louis ................................................................. DA
Bredell, Anton Wilhelm ............................................................. DA
Brown, Ms Lynette .................................................................. ANC
Carlisle, Robin Vincent .............................................................. DA
Cupido, Ms Pauline Wilhemina .................................................. ACDP
De Lille, Ms Patricia ................................................................. ID
Eloff, Ernst Hendrik ................................................................. DA
Figlan, Archibald Mzuukile ......................................................... DA
Fritz, Albert Theo .................................................................. DA
Geyer, Helmar Phillip ............................................................... DA
Grant, Donald Arthur Cardross ................................................ DA
Hani, Ms Vuyiwe .................................................................. ANC
Hartnick, Ms Jennifer Lorraine ................................................ DA
Haskin, Grant Christopher Ronald ........................................... ACDP
Jacobs, Phillip Mziwonke .......................................................... ANC
Labuschagne, Ms Cathlene ....................................................... DA
Madikizela, Bonginkosi Success ................................................ DA
Magwaza, Ms Ntombizodwa Pauline ......................................... ANC
Majola, Thembekile Richard ..................................................... DA
Marais, Ms Anroux Johanna Du Toit .......................................... DA
Maree, Ms Otta Helen (Zille) ..................................................... ANC
Max, Lennit Hendry .................................................................. DA
McKenzie, Patrick Cecil ............................................................ ANC
Meyer, Ivan Henry .................................................................. DA
Mqulwana, Ms Koleka Anita ................................................... ANC
Ncedana, Mbulelo ................................................................. COPE
Ozinsky, Max .................................................................. ANC
Plato, Daniel .................................................................. ID
Prins, Ms Ellen .................................................................. ANC
Rossouw, Ms Aletta ............................................................... DA
Skwatsha, Mcebisi ................................................................. ANC
Stali, Zandisile Christopher .................................................. ANC
Tingwe, Ms Millicent ............................................................. ANC
Uys, Pierré ........................................................................ ANC
Van Rensburg, Hendrik Gerhardus ......................................... DA
Van Zyl, Johanna Aletta ......................................................... COPE
Visser, Johannes Jacobus ......................................................... DA
Von Brandis, Eugene Jeffrey .................................................. DA
Walters, Michael Charles ........................................................ DA
Wiley, Mark Geoffrey Edington .............................................. DA
Winde, Alan Richard ............................................................... DA
Witbooi, Ms Joselene ............................................................. ANC
PERMANENT DELEGATES TO
NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

Adams, Freddie .......................................................... ANC
Bekker, Jacobus Marthinus Geyser ........................................ DA
De Beer, Onel ............................................................. COPE
De Villiers, Michael Jacobus Roland .................................. DA
Harris, Tomothy Duncan ................................................ DA
Ntwanambi, Ms Nosipho Dorothy ....................................... ANC
INDEX TO PROCEEDINGS

Abused Women and Children in Western Cape – Motion...............................687
Abuse against the Elderly – Motion .........................................................6492
Acknowledgement to Supt Nolan, Capt Dicks and Const Abrahams,
     Atlantis - Motion ......................................................................................1597
Actions by DA Councillor of Elsies River, Bertha Esbach – Motion............1010
Ad hoc Committee:
     Investigation into possible misleading of House by Minister ................103
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner – Debate...911,
 ...........................................4797, 4808, 4815
Ad Hoc Committee, replacement of Mr E J von Brandis on – Motion........832
Africa Day – Motion ....................................................................................2260, 5870
Afrikaans writers receive Honorary Award – Motion ....................................6210
Agri World Africa Established – Motion ........................................................5866
Agricultural Areas, Failure of Standing Committee to make Intervention in
     Uprising in – Motion .............................................................................6629
Alcohol and Drug abuse on Family system, Impact of – Motion ....................362
Alternative approaches to BEE and development SMMEs – Motion ............2174
Alcohol syndrome Campaign, SANCA Fetal – Motion ...............................6203
Amakhaya Ngoku Housing initiatives – Motion ...........................................785
Ambulance Services and Response time, State of – Motion .........................749
Ammunition seized by police in Athlone – Motion ........................................933
ANC’s Conduct in Provincial Parliament – Motion .........................................6200
ANC Government on Service Delivery, Negative impact of – Motion ..........15
ANC Honoured, Sixth President of – Motion .................................................5865
ANC’s Misperceptions with regards to Education in Cape – Motion ..............5903
Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports .............7, 8, 9, 17, 36, 70, 205, 239,
 .........................................................................................................................263, 354, 434, 526, 559, 595, 644, 677, 701, 715, 728,
 .........................................................................................................................746, 760, 858, 923, 963, 1003, 1025, 1066, 1082, 1126,
 .........................................................................................................................1193, 1240, 1279, 1349, 1394, 1463, 1580, 1601, 1646,
 .........................................................................................................................1729, 1795, 1885, 1968, 2159, 2196, 2248, 2279, 2324, 2360,
 .........................................................................................................................2389, 2393, 2430, 2468, 2504, 2511, 2541, 2549, 2599
 .........................................................................................................................3755, 3815, 3755, 3918, 3919, 3922, 3933, 3975, 3979,
 .........................................................................................................................4032, 4117, 4118, 4124, 4165, 4203, 4204, 4327, 4582,
 .........................................................................................................................4636, 4640, 4653, 4655, 4670, 4684, 4733, 4928, 4976, 4997,
 .........................................................................................................................5093, 5115, 5136, 5174, 5276, 5574, 5638, 5695, 5758, 5801,
 .........................................................................................................................5850, 5846, 5889, 5937, 6185, 6219, 6250, 6269, 6293, 6356,
 .........................................................................................................................6396, 6437, 6443, 6477, 6521, 6613
Absence to Speaker, leave of – Motion .......................................................4593
Adult Education, Award to 79-Year-Old Du Noon Resident – Motion ..........5157
AD Hoc Committee, Appointment of - Motion ..............................................4007
Activist Anton Frans, Anniversary of Death of – Motion ............................4701
Affordable Housing – Motion .....................................................................4140
Agricultural Industry, Game Farming declared – Motion ............................4098
Ambassador, Singer/Actress Cape Town Routes Unlimited – Motion ..........5157
Anti-poverty strategy – Motion ...................................................................2258
ANC in Municipal Election – Motion .........................................................3952
ANC Centenary Celebrations to Mark 100 years of Selfless Struggle
     By people of South Africa – Motion .......................................................4605
ANC Centenary Celebrations, Spending Taxpayers’ money
     on – Motion .........................................................................................4606
ANC Centenary – Motion .........................................................................4936
ANC, Veterans Honoured by – Motion........................................... 5155
ANC Youth League Congress, Failed – Motion.......................... 4942
Annual National Assessment Papers – Motion............................ 6263
Appointment of Jan-Jan Joubert – Motion .................................. 4175
Appointment of Ad Hoc Committee – Motion............................... 4593
Astronomy Society, Hermanus – Motion ....................................... 4149
Apology (P C McKenzie) .............................................................. 968
Apology to Member Brown – Motion ............................................. 2570
Archbishop Desmond Tutu: Medal of Freedom Award – Motion ...... 616
Atlantis integrated transport system – Motion ............................ 2559
ATM Bomings – Motion .............................................................. 5907
Attitude of Speaker in staff meeting – Motion ............................. 935
Audit reports not yet considered by SCOPA: debate – Motion ....... 1594
Baboon Management Contract – Motion ...................................... 537
Bafana Bafana, Support for – Motion ........................................... 307
Battle of Braamfontein, 14 May 2012 – Motion ............................ 5842
Beaufort West and Ceres farm murders – Motion ......................... 1293
Behaviour Modification Programmes – Motion .............................. 6367
Behaviour of ANC in Swellendam – Motion ................................ 6569
Berg River Municipality, Sale of Land – Motion ............................ 4317

Bills:

Rescinding of EFT Bill - Motion ................................................. 4941

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]

Introduction and First Reading ............................................... 1070
Consideration of principle ....................................................... 1146
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................. 1180
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................ 1202
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................... 1215
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................... 1228
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ................................. 1242
Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................... 1256
Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................... 1294
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ......................... 1305
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ...................................... 1317
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 1335
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ................................................... 1350
Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................. 1358
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................ 1371
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ...................................... 1388
Finalisation .............................................................................. 1391

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]

Consideration of principle ....................................................... 112
Vote 8 – Housing ................................................................. 145
Vote 8 – Local Government ..................................................... 166
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................... 187
Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................. 211
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................... 240
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................. 266
Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................... 307
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ......................... 329
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........ 365
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................... 392
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ................................................... 422
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 8 - 2010]

Introduction and First Reading ................................................................. 1571
Second Reading ......................................................................................... 1648
Vote 4 – Community Safety ..................................................................... 1690
Vote 1 – Premier ...................................................................................... 1746
Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................................. 1770
Vote 14 – Local Government ................................................................. 1802
Vote 8 – Housing .................................................................................... 1830
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................................. 1858
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ................................................................. 1895
Vote 6 – Health ....................................................................................... 1913
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................... 1944
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .................. 1999
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ...................................................... 2027
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................................. 2054
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................................ 2086
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .............................................................. 2124
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ................................................... 2157
Finalisation .............................................................................................. 2159

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 8 - 2011]

(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ................................................................. 4797
(Debate on Vote 5 – Education) .............................................................. 4809
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ............................... 4815
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) .............................................. 4839
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................................. 4856
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ...................................................................................... 4866
(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .............................................. 4875
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .............................................. 4913
(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .......... 4951
(Debate on Vote 8 - Human Settlements) .......................................... 4983
(Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................................ 4984
(Finalisation) ......................................................................................... 4974
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ....................................................... 4904
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ........................................ 4912
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ........................................ 4919
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Principle) ...................................................................................... 4786
Western Cape Biosphere Reserves Bill [B5 - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ................................................................. 4942
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1-2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) .................................................................................... 4165
Western Cape Use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2010] – (Finalisation) .............................................................. 4014
Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill [B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) ........................................ 3982

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 14 – Local Government ................................................................. 3564
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 3590
Vote 11 – Agriculture ...................................................................... 3618
Vote 7 – Social Development .............................................................. 3636
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .......................................................... 3657
Vote 6 – Health .................................................................................. 3677
Vote 4 – Community Safety .............................................................. 3703
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................. 3730
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3772
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 3797
Vote 8 – Housing ........................................................................... 3852
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................ 3881
Consideration of Vote and Schedules .............................................. 3917
Finalisation ...................................................................................... 3918

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Introduction and First Reading) ........................................................................... 5118
Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] ........................................................................ 3990

Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] (Resumption of Consideration and Finalisation) ........ 4032

Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill [B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ............................................ 4943

Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6-2009]
Introduction and First Reading .......................................................... 1041
Consideration of principle ............................................................... 1081
Finalisation ...................................................................................... 1081

Western Cape Irregular Expenditure Bill [B4 – 2009]
Finalisation ...................................................................................... 643

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B3 – 2009]
Finalisation ...................................................................................... 643

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2009]
Introduction and First Reading .......................................................... 2467

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]
Consideration .................................................................................. 2502

Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]
Finalisation ...................................................................................... 2503
Western Cape Parliamentary Service and Finance Management Bill
Introduction................................................................................................................. 1347
Western Cape Problem Animal Control Ordinance Repeal Bill
[B9 – 2008] Finalisation................................................................................................. 643
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] –
(Introduction and First Reading) ................................................................................. 4671
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2012]
(Introduction and First Reading) .................................................................................... 5118
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4 -2012] (2011/12 Financial Year) (Introduction and First Reading)......................... 5160
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4- 2012](2011/2012 Financial Year) (Consideration of Principle)......................... 5274
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill
[B4 - 2012] (2011/2012 Financial Year) (Finalisation) .................................................. 5276
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ................. 5303
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2-2012]
(Introduction and First Reading) ................................................................................. 5337
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ....................................................................................... 5339
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) .................................................................................... 5378
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development)................................................................. 5401
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ............................................................ 5427
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) ................................................................................ 5462
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 - Cultural Affairs and Spot) ................................................................................... 5485
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 9 – Health) ............. 5519
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – (Provincial Parliament). ................................................................. 5552
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ..................................................................................... 5575
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .............................................. 5614
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ...................................................................................... 5630
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ..................................................................................... 5642
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ..................................................................................... 5695
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................................ 5731
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Finalisation) ....................................... 5736
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ....................................................................................... 5736
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Finalisation) .............................................................................................................. 5742
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]  
(Consideration and finalisation) .................................................. 5783
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11-2012]  
(Introduction and First Reading) .................................................. 6579
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]  
(Consideration of Principle) ......................................................... 6639
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]  
(Consideration and finalisation) .................................................... 6673
Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill [B7-2012]  
(Consideration and finalisation) .................................................... 6677
Biko, Steve Bantu Bonke, Commemoration of – Motion ....................... 6205
Bitou Municipality, Service Hikes in – Motion .................................. 5916
Birthday wishes to Ms C F Beerwinkel – Motion ................................ 1598
Birthday wishes to Premier – Motion .............................................. 1598
Birthday in the House, Marais, Du Toit A - Motion ............................ 4936
Birthday Wishes to Minister Madikizela – Motion .............................. 5272
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .................... 2571
Bitou Municipality, Problems at – Motion ........................................ 591
Boland Summer Festival – Motion .................................................. 5729
Boston USA, World Floral Art Show in – Motion ............................... 4146
Botrivier, Service Delivery in - Motion ........................................... 5914
Budget for 2010/2011, Fifth Financial Year not Spent for – Motion ........ 4101
Brutal and deadly attacks on policemen and women – Motion ............. 833
Burglary and vandalism of state-owned property – Motion ................... 2175
Bus accident in Kloofnek Road, Senior Citizens in – Motion ................. 750
Cableway, Table Mountain Aerial – Motion ..................................... 4148
Call on Premier Zille, Replace of MEC for Community Safety – Motion ... 5845
Cavellereia Primary School (C F Beerwinkel) .................................... 5153
Celebrations of Life, Third Centenary of Adam Kok – Motion ............. 4115
Census 2011 on the Western Cape, Impact of – Motion ....................... 6403
Central Karoo District municipality, Disaster Risk Management and  
Emergency Service in – Motion .................................................... 4100
Climate Change, Cape Town Preparedness for – Motion ..................... 4693
Clinics, Shocking state of – Motion .............................................. 4173
Closure of Schools – Motion ....................................................... 5900
Crime Statistics relating to Western Cape – Motion ............................ 6257
Crisis, Tourism industry in – Motion .............................................. 4103
Cape Town Metropole, Unacceptable Conditions for poor People  
– Motion .................................................................................. 6265
Cape Nature: public/private partnerships – Motion ............................ 1591
Cape Nature CEO not Named – Motion ........................................... 5777
Cape Town Doctor Resuscitates Boy After Near-Drowning – Motion .... 6634
Cape Nature Outsources Culling to Farmers – Motion ......................... 6414
Cape Town Favourite Tourist City – Motion ..................................... 6500
Cape Town as second best destination in Africa and Middle East –  
Motion .................................................................................. 2372
Cape Town as South Africa's Silicon Valley – Motion ......................... 833
Cape Town Stadium, construction of – Motion .................................. 2351
Cape Town Motorist Hazel Souma – Motion ..................................... 5273
Cape Town Partnership, Prof Ndebele Appointed as Chairperson of – Motion ......................................................... 5913
Cape Town Routes, Unlimited into Wesgro Incorporation of – Motion ..... 5147
Cape Town Tourism Board, New Chair of – Motion ............................ 6411
Car Magazine Award for Safely Home Programme – Motion ..............................1596
Cape Minstrels on Tweede Nuwe Jaar – Motion ........................................4099
Caps, Readiness for Implementation – Motion ..............................................4135
Casino: establishment of second casino in Metropole – Motion ..................2368
Cease-Fire Between Israel and Hamas – Motion ...........................................6570
Celebration of Eid-Al-Adha – Motion .......................................................6369
Celebration of Diwali – Festival of Lights – Motion ......................................6369
Chapman’s Peak Rockfall – Motion .........................................................6316
Chairperson of Standing Committee on Community Safety:
   Incompetence – Motion ..............................................................................657
Chairperson of Standing Committee of Finance, Censuring of – Motion .........589
   Changing of Culture of Our People – Motion ...........................................6330
Chestnut Clinic in Belhar, situation at – Motion ............................................981
Child-headed households, plight of – Motion ..............................................2299
Children and Youth Commemorations ....................................................5871
   Children on Cape Flats, Massacre of – Motion ..........................................6366
   Children, conditions under which children grow up – Motion ......................2304
   Children’s Act, implementation of – Motion .............................................2370
   Chronic medication: serious shortage of – Motion .....................................2371
   Chronic Medicine, Chaos with dispensing of – Motion ..............................5859
   Chronic Medicine, Incorrect labelling of – Motion .....................................5873
   City council: official demoted – Motion ....................................................2344
City of Cape Town, Awarding of performance bonuses in – Motion ..............2258
City of Cape Town: Health Plan on HIV and TB – Motion ..............................933
City of Cape Town, implications of growth of – Motion ................................932
City of Cape Town, IRT System in – Motion ................................................934
   City of Cape Town, Mycity Vehicle operation Companies Upset –
      Motion ...................................................................................................6575
City of Cape Town:
   Proposed transfer of Land – Motion ..........................................................38
   Public Transport Plan – Motion ..................................................................536
   Spending on informal settlements – Motion ..............................................2347
   Unauthorised payments and tender processes of – Motion .........................656
Closing ..........................................................................................................1391
Closure of Nongovernmental Organisations – Motion ..................................5858
Closure of 27 Black Schools, Interfaith Service against – Motion ..................6268
Closure of Ottery Youth Care Centre – Motion ............................................6568
Clothing Sector, Strike in – Motion ...............................................................783
Court Application, Backyard Dwellers Lodge – Motion .................................6410
Conflict in de Doorns, Defusing of – Motion ................................................6450
Condition of Flats in Leonsdale: Terrible – Motion ......................................2406
Condolence – Motions:
   Albertus, Ms Ulla (A J D Marais) .............................................................938
   Arendse, Donigo Family of (J L Hartnick) ...............................................6317
   Asmal, Kader (The Chief Whip)(DA) .......................................................3977
   Asmal, Kader (Z C Stali) ..........................................................................3977
   Asmal, Kader (T N Bevu) ..........................................................................3977
   Asmal, Kader (A T Fritz) ..........................................................................3978
   Asmal, Kader (P W Cupido) .....................................................................3979
   Banda, Const. Xolisa (M E G Wiley) .........................................................5151
   Bekker, Suna (J J Visser) ..........................................................................4141
   Beylevedt, Theo (M C Walters) .................................................................4107
   Beylevedt, Theo(S Esau) ..........................................................................4107
Bignaut, Ashley (A J Du Toit Marais) ........................................... 4181
Bloemers, Ashley (R B Lentit) .................................................. 4697
Brady, Nazario (M C Walters) .................................................... 694
Bus accident in Hex River Pass (E H Eloff) ............................. 2228
Chabaku, Motlalepula (M Skwatsha) ........................................... 5845
Charles, Shameega in Doha mall Fire (M Tingwe) .................... 5862
Charles, Shamiela death in Qatar Mall fire (R B Lentit) ............. 5869
Cyclist killed on Main Road St James (M G E Willey) ................. 6371
Daniels, Michael (J J Visser) ..................................................... 6494
Davids, Mr A A (E H Eloff) ...................................................... 1597
Davids, Goliath (J L Hartnick) ................................................... 6206
Death of People after Collision of taxi and truck (M Skwatsha) ..... 2480
Death of Seven Members of Family after eating Cooked Mushrooms (M Skwatsha) ........................................... 6269
Deaths in shack fires in Kleinmond (J L Hartnick) ..................... 2483
Dely, Frans (J Witbooi) ............................................................ 4324
Deputy Speaker, Mother of (J J Visser) .................................... 786
D’Oliveira, Basil (J Witbooi) ...................................................... 4699
Dryer, Charles (J J Visser) ....................................................... 6324
Dudley, Mr R (Y Gabru) .......................................................... 38
Duncan, Sheena (L Brown) ...................................................... 2227
Espafricka (R B Lentit) ........................................................... 3765
Emeran, Umar in Doha mall Fire (M Tingwe) ............................ 5862
Endly, Paul Macassar Veterans (J Witbooi) ............................... 5156
Family of seven and baby (C F Beerwinkel) ............................ 1746
Families in Western Cape and Elsewhere (M G E Wiley) ............ 6264
Firman, MR Duane (G C Haskin) .............................................. 6261
Francken, Lulu (E H Eloff) ....................................................... 2570
Ford, Kelly-Jade (M Tingwe) .................................................... 6631
Gaffney, Brian (Z C Stali) ........................................................ 4113
Galant, Jacoba (N P Magwaza) ................................................ 2177
Gerwel, Jakes (R B Lentit) ....................................................... 6630
Gillwald, Cheryl (M Skwatsha) ............................................... 2407
Griebenouw, Susanna (J L Hartnick) ........................................ 4009
Gresak, Michael (C Labuschagne) ............................................ 6333
Guthrie, Mark (M C Walters) ................................................... 6457
Hale, Corne (P W Cupido) ...................................................... 4777
Hayes, Carika (J L Hartnick) ................................................... 6337
Isaacs, Sedick (M Ozinsky) ..................................................... 6371
Hörstmann, Fritz (J J Visser) .................................................... 660
Hout Bay Boat Tragedy (M G E Wiley) .................................... 6320
Hugo, Doreen (V Hani) ........................................................... 4008
Imvumelwana Primary, Wallacedene (C Labuschagne) ............ 5843
Level Crossing Accident, Death of two (P Mckenzie) ............... 5869
Linkin Park Concert Death (P Uys) ........................................... 6452
Lunguza, Ntombizodwa (B G Mbalo) ........................................ 6496
Jack, Neville Michael – (C F Beerwinkel) ................................. 4558
Jacobs, Mr M (M G E Wiley) ................................................... 837
Jansen, Lodewy (N P Magwaza) .............................................. 2177
January, Joseph (M Skwatsha) ................................................. 6408
Jennner, Ms Katrina (J L Hartnick) .......................................... 1036
Johnson, Abe (A J Du Toit Marias) ........................................... 5842
Kadalie, Fenner (A J Du Toit Marias) ........................................ 4111
Kakaza, Leslie (C F Beerwinkel) ................................................................. 4112
Kasrils, Eleanor (M Skwatsha) ...................................................................... 1011
Kayamandi Fire, Children Die (V Hani) ....................................................... 4780
Kimvango, Andy (N P Magwaza) .................................................................. 4940
Kirkpatrick, Ian (J J Visser) .......................................................................... 6576
Khumalo, Alfred (A J Du Toit Marais) ......................................................... 6372
Klaasen, Cfr Kevin (J J Visser) ................................................................. 107
Klein, Tom (P W Cupido) ............................................................................ 2479
Komba, Sgt. Charles (H P Geyer) ................................................................. 660
Komphela, SGT Thumelaphi (M G E Wiley) ............................................. 4937
Kotze, Pen (M C Walters) ........................................................................... 2408
Kotze, Thelana (C Labuschagne) ............................................................ 6204
Koopan, Allan (J L Hartnick) .................................................................... 6337
Khumalo, Alf (M Skwatsha) ....................................................................... 6374
Lithemba Loli (M Tingwe) ....................................................................... 787
Madikwa, Nomvelo "Rayi" (M Skwatsha) ................................................ 617
Madigage, Thomas (J Witbooi) .................................................................. 6372
Madinga, Lulama (E J von Brandis) ......................................................... 1037
Mafikeng, Mama Elizabeth "Rocky" (P M Jacobs) ..................................... 105
Mandulo, Nokulamla – (T R Majola) ......................................................... 4176
Malan, Ms Marie (E Prins) ......................................................................... 2179
Malindi, Lettie (N P Magwaza) .................................................................. 2376
Mantashe, Madolwana and Cilliers, Messrs (T N Bevu) ...................... 1294
Maqhetsheba, Anathi (H P Geyer) ............................................................... 937
Mbula, Ms Bukelwa (M Skwatsha) ............................................................ 4561
Member Nyanda, Florence (Z C Stali) ....................................................... 5779
Michaels, Loveline (J L Hartnick) .............................................................. 6578
Mntini, Thabani (C Lavuschagne) .............................................................. 6371
Sefularo, Dr (J Witbooi) ........................................................................... 2178
Sikani: Member of Cope (M Ncedana) ...................................................... 2232
Shiceka, Former Minister Sicelo (Z C Stali) ............................................... 5779
Smith, Keenen (M Tingwe) ....................................................................... 6631
Swail, Lee-Ann (M Tingwe) ...................................................................... 6631
Marais Allister () (M C Walters) ................................................................. 6207
Mark, Mr Joe (M G E Wiley) ..................................................................... 4695
Marks, Solly (Du Toit Marais) ................................................................... 6375
Maquiba, Patrick (Y Gabru) ..................................................................... 106
Matthews, Joe (V Hani) ........................................................................... 2522
Maroem, Mr E C, (A Rossouw) ................................................................. 39
Maxenza, Const Daniel (M Skwatsha) ....................................................... 1893
Mbiko, Ms Neti (M Ncedana) ................................................................... 1040
Meer, Ms Fatima (M Skwatsha) ............................................................... 1643
Meiring, Hannes (H P Geyer) ................................................................. 2178
Meintjies, Frits and Berno (A Rossouw) .................................................... 6320
Minister van Rensburg, Department on Publication of Agricultural Dictionary (M C Walters) ......................................................... 5156
Mhlanga, Lydia (N P Magwaza) ................................................................. 5272
Mjongile, Songezo (J L Hartnick) .............................................................. 6317
Mkunqana, Simphiwe (M Skatsha) ............................................................. 6324
Moses, Warren Officer Douglas (M G E Wiley) ..................................... 6368
Mother of Ms C Labuschagne, passing of (A J D Marais) ..................... 2124
Mputing, Mr W (N P Magwaza) .............................................................. 909
Myethu, Themba (M Skwatsha) ............................................................... 6406
Naidoo, Mr Vincent (P C McKenzie) .............................................................. 751
National Mens's Hockey Team (M G E Wiley) .............................................. 5783
Ncedana, Mr V (T N Bevu) ................................................................. 1645
Ndleni, Bongile (B G Mbalo) ..................................................................... 6570
Ngwenu, Mr Eric (V Hani) ........................................................................ 6319
Ndzibza, Ngcondo (M Skwatsha) ................................................................. 107
Nkanisa, Mathosonke (J J Visser) ................................................................. 4113
Nel, F B B, Van Lill, M M E and Eloff, J M, Cycle accident victims 
(E J von Brandis) .................................................................................... 1594
Ngcukana, Ezra (M Skwatsha) .................................................................... 2407
Ngozi, Mr M M (N P Magwaza) ............................................................... 838
Nonzwana, Ntombizone (T N Bevu) ............................................................. 908
Ntozini, Nobantu “Vicky” (E J Von Brandis) .............................................. 6634
Nxu, Xolile Death of Vice-President of SAMWU (M Skwatsha) ................. 5871
Oman, Imran death in Qatar Mall fire (R B Lentit) ......................................... 5869
Olifant, Danny (L Brown) ......................................................................... 6407
Padayachee, Minister Roy (Z C Stali) ............................................................ 5779
Papenfus, Rufus (H P Geyer) .................................................................... 6416
Passing on of Mother of Nondzaliseko Makanda (V Hani) ....................... 5817
Peterson, Rafeeq (M Ozinsky) ................................................................... 6451
People involved in car crash (K A Mqulwana) ............................................ 983
People killed in fire in Lingelethu, Khayelitsha (M Tingwe) ..................... 2463
Pheiffer, John (L E Magaxa) ..................................................................... 6322
Pick, Dave (V Hani) .................................................................................. 3617
Pienaar, Louis (J J Visser) ......................................................................... 6454
Pietersen, Moegamat (M Tingwe) ............................................................... 6498
Price, Kevin (M G E Wiley) ....................................................................... 4142
Raad, Rina (A J Du Toit Marais) ................................................................. 5843
Residents who died in fire at Rusthof (J J Visser) ........................................ 217
Rooi, Katriene Kassie (J Witbooi) ................................................................. 5301
Road Disaster near Lainsburg Claims Nineteen Victims 
(Z C Stali) ................................................................................................. 4702
Roxo, Ernest (M Tingwe)........................................................................... 5782
Rheenendal Area, School Bus Accident (A Rossouw) ............................... 4319
Sigcau, Nondwe (B Mbalo) ........................................................................ 6375
Schmidt, Cobus (H P Geyer) ..................................................................... 1039
Scholtz, Maxi (P C McKenzie) ................................................................. 1891
Schoolchildren and those who have died playing sport 
(C F Beerwinkel) ..................................................................................... 1595
Searll, Aaron and Snyman, Lannice (M G E Wiley) ..................................... 2231
Schlemmer, Prof Lawrence (M C Walters) ................................................. 4559
Scott, Christina (J Witbooi) ....................................................................... 4560
Sisulu, Albertina (H P Geyser) ................................................................... 3945
Sisulu, Zwelakhe (M Skwatsha) ................................................................. 6317
Simons, Anna (A J Du Toit Marais) ............................................................ 4325
Slain Police officer and Injured Policeman (M G E Wiley) ................. 6319
Solomon, Imam Gassan (Y Gabru) .............................................................. 983
Steers, Mujahied (P C Mckenzie) ............................................................... 6633
Stemmet, Adnaan (J Witbooi) ................................................................... 2570
Stewart, Gary (M G E Wiley) ..................................................................... 6326
Tandy, Hendry Macassar Veterans (J Witbooi) ........................................... 5156
Taljaard, Francois (M C Walters) ............................................................... 6207
Taljaard, Louis (M C Walters) ................................................................. 6207
Titus, Sergius (M C Walters) ................................................................. 6207
Ting Ting Masanga (M Skwatsha) .................................................. 787
Tobias, Dr Phillip (M G E Wiley) ...................................................... 5909
Tolo, Bishop Jack (J A Van Zyl) ....................................................... 4323
Tyibilika, Solly (M G E Wiley) ............................................................. 4698
USA After Superstorm Sandy (J J Visser) ....................................... 6414
Uys, Theunis (L Brown) ................................................................. 6268
Van Heerden, Tim (M G E Wiley) ..................................................... 4326
Van Niekerk, Dr Theresa (J J Visser) ............................................... 659
Van Rensburg, Erin (H P Geyer) ....................................................... 104
Van Rooyen, Gert (N P Magwaza) .................................................. 2177
Victims of taxi accident (T R Majola) ............................................. 985
Victims killed in Gang Violence ........................................................ 6323
Vuba, Thobeka ................................................................................. 4937
Vollenhoven, Aunt Tatie (E Prins) .................................................. 6260
Williams, Annie (P C Mckenzie) ..................................................... 6498
Williams, Annetiie (A J Du Toit Marais) ........................................ 6457
Witbooi, Melvin (J Witbooi) ............................................................ 4607
Young People die in Car Accident (A Rossouw) ............................. 4779
27th Anniversary of Treacherous Trojan Horse Tragedy ................. 6325

Congratulations / Wishes – Motions:

Agulhas, Tiffany (J J Visser) ............................................................. 6452
All Municipalites (R B Lentit) .......................................................... 5841
Arabella Hotel and Spa (E J Von Brandis) ..................................... 6332
Artscape Management (R B Lentit) ................................................ 4116
Amsterdam, Sasha-Lee (J L Hartnick) ............................................ 4013
Annual Charity Toy Run, to Organisers of (G C R Haskin) ............. 6631
Bafana Bafana (P M Jacobs) .......................................................... 143
Bafana Bafana (J L Hartnick) .......................................................... 362
Bafana Bafana (M Skwatsha) .......................................................... 694, 2568, 4108
Bafana Bafana (Z V Stali) ............................................................... 3766
Bafana Bafana (E H Eloff) ............................................................... 4148
Bantjies, Benjan (E H Eloff) ............................................................ 3770,
Barnard, Mr Jimmy (A Rossouw) ................................................... 4605
Belgravia High School (Y Gabru) ................................................... 610
Bernstein, Ann (J J Visser) ............................................................. 5730
Beukman, Erika (E H Eloff) ............................................................. 3768
Biermann, Hugo (M G E Wiley) ..................................................... 5731
Bishop Lavis Police Officers (P C Mckenzie) ................................. 4012
BPESA (E J Von Brandis) ............................................................... 6415
Brackenfell High School (A J D Marais) .......................................... 754
Brink, Mashaarn (M Tingwe) .......................................................... 4178
Burger, Schalk (J Witbooi) ............................................................. 4610
Caledon (E J Von Brandis) ............................................................. 4323
Castro, Fidel (V Hani) ................................................................. 4183
Cape Grace Hotel (E J Von Brandis) .............................................. 6332
Cape Town Municipality (J J Visser) ............................................... 5279
Cape Town Tourism (E J Von Brandis) ........................................... 5841
Cederberg Winery (H P Geyer) ...................................................... 6337
Chaeli Campaign first Recipient of Medal for Social Activism (G C R Haskin) ............................................................... 5780
Chiu Alexander (C F Beerwinkel) .................................................. 3950
Chrysalis Academy, CEO and Staff of (M G E Wiley) .......................... 4938  
of Cape Town (E J Von Brandis) .............................................. 4008  
City of Cape Town (R B Lentit) .............................................. 4105, 5845  
City of Cape Town, Executive of (R B Lentit) .............................. 4183  
City of Cape Town officials (M C Walters) .................................. 4782  
City of Cape Town, Tourism and Provincial Counterparts  
(E J Von Brandis) ..................................................................... 6334  
Cloete, Mr Anthony, Top Performer at Cape Agri Academy  
(A Rossouw) ........................................................................... 1108  
Cloetesville High School (H P Geyer) ......................................... 788  
Coetzee, T (E H Eloff) ................................................................ 3767  
Commissioner Petros and SAPS (P Uys) ...................................... 787  
Comrade James Ngculu (M Skwatsha) ........................................ 1070  
Conduct towards women MPPS – Motion .................................... 607  
Crowster, Sharon (P W Cupido) ............................................... 4776  
Cupido, Ms, Appointment as Provincial Chairperson of ACDP  
(J J Visser) ............................................................................... 4777  
Dale-Roberts, Chef Luke and his team from La Colombe  
(E H Eloff) ............................................................................... 2179  
Danie Steytler (H P Geyer) ....................................................... 756  
DA – (M G E Wiley) ................................................................. 4941  
DA Winning, Election in Ward 88 – (J J Visser) ......................... 6262  
DA on victory in Worcester (J J Visser) ....................................... 1891  
De Jager, Gideon (L Brown) ..................................................... 4012  
Department of Agriculture (M C Walters) .................................. 756  
Department of Science and Technology, Sun Space and University of  
Department of Agriculture (J J Visser) ...................................... 6331  
Department of Community Safety and all Officials (M G E Wiley)  
......................................................................................... 6333  
Department of Economic Development and Tourism  
- (E J Von Brandis) .................................................................. 6330  
Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs  
and Development Planning (M C Walters) .................................. 6330  
Department of Transport and Public Works (E J Von Brandis) .... 6330  
De Rust (E J Von Brandis) ....................................................... 4177  
Drakenstein Municipality (J J Visser) .......................................... 4179  
Drakenstein Local Municipality (J J Visser) ................................. 5778  
Deon Bruintjies (A J D Marais) .................................................. 785  
Drum Majorettes, Eight of SWD (E Prins) ................................. 2464  
Duk, William (E J Von Brandis) .............................................. 6208  
Durban Tourism (E J Von Brandis) ........................................... 5841  
Du Toit, Natalie (J L Hartnick) .................................................. 1644  
Du Toit, Natalie (A Rossouw) .................................................. 6451  
Dyamdeki, Nomthandazo (M Tingwe) ....................................... 5302  
Eden District Municipality – Motion ......................................... 5914  
Eden, Abraham (M C Walters) ................................................. 6328  
Education Centre (M G E Wiley) ............................................ 6266  
Els, Johan (E H Eloff) ............................................................... 3768  
Elsenburg Agricultural College (J J Visser) ................................. 6209  
Emergency Services Staff (J Witbooi) ....................................... 1128  
End Conscription Campaign (M Ozinsky) ................................... 940  
Equal Education (C F Beerwinkel) .......................................... 2411  
Espafrika (R B Lentit) .............................................................. 3765  
Executive Mayor of Cape Town (A M Figlan) ............................. 6460
(xiii)

Fancourt (E J Von Brandis) .......................................................... 6325
Farmworkers of the Year, 2009 (J L Hartnick) ................................ 986
Farrant, Prof Jill (M C Walters) .................................................. 4607
Ferreira, G T (H P Geyer) ............................................................ 2523
Fire-Fighters (M G E Wiley) ....................................................... 3765
Fisher, Mr Adam (M C Walters) .................................................. 363
Fish Hoek Lifesaving Club (M G E Wiley) .................................. 3948
Fish, Liz (M Skwatsha) ............................................................... 3948
Former President Nelson Mandela (L Brown) .............................. 5151
Fortuin, Chantel (A Rossouw) .................................................. 2349
Fourie, Hendrik (L Brown) ....................................................... 4012
Four schools in 100 School Survey (Y Gabru) .............................. 908
Fugard, Athol (Z C Stali) ............................................................ 4010
Fyfer, Boy (E J Von Brandis) ..................................................... 6263
Goliath, Jackie, New Commercial Farmer of the Year (J L Hartnick) ............................................................................. 6373
Gebenga, Anelisiwe (A J D Marais) ............................................ 2349
Gold Medal for Surf Life Saving (M G E Wiley) ............................ 541
Goedeman, Delina (P Uys) .......................................................... 6456
Goeieman, Annine (A J Du Toit Marias) ..................................... 4106
Gouws, Prof R H (A Rossouw) ..................................................... 6209
Gugulethu Seven, President of Benin Awards Families of
(M Skwatsha) .................................................................................. 4938
Hartnick, Jenny (P C Mckenzie) .................................................... 6336
Haneokom, Mr A, on election (E J von Brandis) ......................... 1892
Haneokom, Sandra (A Rossouw) ............................................... 4782
Heritage Cape On Tenth Anniversary (A Rossouw) ...................... 6409
Hattingh, Adele (M C Walters) .................................................... 2523
Hendrick, Mikhail (P W Cupido) ............................................... 3946
Health Occupations, Winners of Awards for (A J Du Toit Marias) .................................................................................. 4783
Hip-Hop World Championships, Delegation Attending to
(H P Geyer) .................................................................................. 6376
Hudson, Roger (G C R Haskin) ................................................... 5840
Hunter, Mr Tony (A Rossouw) .................................................... 6455
Homeless Soccer World Cup Tournament (N P Magwaza) .......... 753
Hon, Wiley M G E (AJ Du Toit Marias) ...................................... 5160
House, James, Houtbay (Magwaza N P) .................................... 5272
Human Settlement, Establishment of New Manenberg Contact
Centre (A M Figlan) ..................................................................... 5843
Ikeys (J J Visser) ........................................................................... 3768
I-WEC (E J Von Brandis) ............................................................. 4780
Laubsher, Eric Honoured – Motion ............................................ 6412
Learners (C Labuschagne) .......................................................... 5863
Learners of Pinelands North Primary School (M Ozinsky) ......... 3953
Learners, Grade 12 (P W Cupido) ............................................... 4558
Le Roux, Marlene (J L Hartnick) ................................................ 2465
Luyt, Margot (A Rossouw) .......................................................... 6209
Jenner, Minister - Department of the Premier (A J D Marais) ........ 2351
Jewish Community (A Rossouw) ............................................... 753
Jewish Community (J J Visser) .................................................... 2570
Jim, Asenathi (G C R Haskin) .................................................... 5840
Johannesburg Tourism (E J Von Brandis) ................................ 5841
Jonkbloed, Zelda (A Rossouw) ................................................... 6206
Jonson, Denver (Z C Stali) ......................................................... 4110
Junior Golfer Luca Fillipi (M G E Wiley) .................................. 6637

Kaap Rapport and Van Loveren Town of the Year Competition
(E J Von Brandis) ..................................................................... 659

Kairos Drama Group of Heidelberg (E Prins) .............................. 5781
Kaizer Chiefs and Orlando Pirates (M Ncedana) .......................... 989
Kallis, Sharief (R B Lentit) ....................................................... 4143
Kirsten, Gary (E J Von Brandis) ................................................. 3951
Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens (M C Walters) ......................... 5862
Klatzow, Prof Peter (A J Du Toit Marais) .................................. 6202
Kotze Dewaldre (C F Beerwinkel) ............................................. 2377
Koster, John (A Rossouw) ...................................................... 3771
Kraaifontein Police Station (P W Cupido) .................................. 2569
Kruger, Katryn (C Labuschagne) .............................................. 6208
Kwahattu Culture (M G E Wiley) ............................................. 6266
La Motte Wine Estate, (M C Walters) ...................................... 4779
Langeberg on change of name (E H Eloff) .................................. 839
Lange, Malcolm (E H Eloff) .................................................... 1646
Liverpool (P C McKenzie) ...................................................... 939
Martin, Prof Lorna (M Skwatsha) ............................................. 4559
Management of South African Airways (E H Eloff) .................... 4007
Management: Silwerkruin Home for the Elderly, Wellington
(J J Visser) ............................................................................... 1040

Mandela, Nelson: 92nd birthday (M Skwatsha) .......................... 2375
Mandela, Nelson Rollalahla (M Skwatsha) ................................. 4700
Manyonga, Luvo (Z C Stali) ................................................... 2410
Maritz, Jan (A Rossouw) ........................................................ 2305
Masiphumelele Young Stars Soccer Team (M G E Wiley) .......... 5781
Mayor of Cape Town (A Rossouw) .......................................... 6329
Mayor of Potchefstroom (A J Du Toit Marais) ............................ 6577

Mbeki Govan, Human Settlement Awards 2012, Runners-up and
Winners (A M Figlan) ................................................................ 5840
Mckenna, Mr Sageas (M G E Wiley) ......................................... 4695
Mentoor, Farwa (J Witbou) ..................................................... 4182
Metro Rescue Workers (M G E Wiley) ..................................... 3765
Metro Police (P W Cupido) ..................................................... 4146
Meerendal Wine Estate on gold medal (E Prins) ........................ 1892
Member of the House – (J J Visser) .......................................... 4555
Minister Alan Winde: saving of drowning woman
(E J von Brandis) .................................................................... 2352
Minister of Economic Development (E J Von Brandis) .............. 4179
Minister Fikile Mbalula, Cape Argus Cycle Tour (Z C Stali) ....... 5274
Minister of Health (P C McKenzie) .......................................... 2483
Minister of Health and His Department .................................... 6332
Minister Leonard Max (A J du T Marais) ................................ 2262
Minister on compilation of guide (J J Visser) ........................... 1645
Minister Winde (H P Geyer) ................................................... 6266
Mocke, Mr Dawid (M G E Wiley) ............................................ 1293, 4181
Mosiela High School (M G E Wiley) ........................................ 789
Mostert, Jan (H P Geyer) ....................................................... 6322
Mpetha, Family (Z C Stali) ..................................................... 4104
Mpofu-Wlash, Sizwe (M Tingwe) ............................................. 4010
MPP Jennifer Hartnick (A Rossouw) ......................................... 2464
MPP Jennifer Hartnick (H P Geyer) ......................................................... 2482
MPPS who Graduated (M Ncedana) .................................................... 4703
Muggels, Mr Hendrik (M C Walters) ............................................... 104,108
Municipalities, on Blue Drop and Green Drop Status (J J Visser) .... 4109
Municipalities, Who spent their MIG Funds before End of
Budget Year (J J Visser) ................................................................. 4112
Muslim community (K A Mqulwana) .............................................. 1069
Muslims on Ramadan (H P Geyer) .................................................. 4104
Muslims on Ramadan (A Rossouw) ................................................. 611
M5 Developments Cape and Overstrand Municipality
(M C Walters) ............................................................................... 988
Mycroft, Michaela (P W Cupido) ...................................................... 4696
National Departments (E Prins) ....................................................... 4116
National Education Award (A J Du Toit Marias) ......................... 5159
National Government (N P Magwaza) ............................................ 5730
National Womens’ Hockey Squad (M G E Wiley) ......................... 5159
Ndungu, Scientist Thumbi (G C Haskin) ........................................ 6453
Nelson, Marshall (R B Lentit) .......................................................... 4143
New Diplomats (M Ozinsky) ............................................................ 540
Nicholls, Nelson (E Prins) ............................................................... 3949
Ntsiki Biyela (H P Geyer) ............................................................... 613
Nymbezi, Vinoria (Du Toit Marias, A J) ......................................... 5728
Oakdale Agricultural High School (J J Visser) ............................. 6205
Obama, President Barack (A J Du Toit Marias) ......................... 6454
Oosthuizen, Louis (J L Hartnick) ..................................................... 2373
Organisers of Robertson Wine, Food and Tourism Festival
(E H Eloff) .................................................................................. 909
Orlando Pirates (Z C Stali) ............................................................... 3949
Orlando Pirates (M G E Wiley) ....................................................... 3949
Orlando Pirates (T R Majola) .......................................................... 4109
Oudtshoorn Municipality (P Uys) ................................................... 6328
Overstrand Municipality (M C Walters) ........................................... 939
Overstrand Municipality (J J Visser) ................................................. 4939
Overstrand Municipality (M C Walters) ......................................... 6573
Paralympic Team South Africa (M Ncedana) .............................. 6203
Peggy De Villiers (C Labuschagne) .................................................. 755
Petros, Gen (P C McKenzie) ........................................................... 2478
Phetho, Terry (E H Eloff) ............................................................... 3951
Philander, Vernon (EJ Von Brandis) ............................................. 5908
Philander, Tovernon (J J Visser) ..................................................... 6456
President Jacob Zuma on taking Aids test (J Witbooi) ............. 2176
President Zuma, being Appointed to Unsecretary’s Education first
Initiative to (L Brown) ................................................................. 6259
Premier (A J Du Toit Marias) .......................................................... 5160
Premier and Department (J L Hartnick) .......................................... 6338
Prins, Megan-Geoffrey (J L Hartnick) ............................................ 4148
Prins, Henry (J J Visser) ................................................................. 5912
Provincial Athletic Trials (C F Beerwinkel) ................................. 2306
Provincial Parliament (H P Geyer) .................................................. 6336
Ramadan Kareem (H P Geyer) ....................................................... 2460
Research Institutions, Three Cape Town (P W Cupido) .......... 4609
Renaming of NY1 to Steve Biko Drive (A M Figlan) ............... 6260
Rianie Strydom (A J D Marais) ...................................................... 757
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Road Accident Fatalities - Motion</td>
<td>6413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rugby, Kaizer Chiefs in Transformation of (R B Lentit)</td>
<td>6407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Academy for Science and Arts (H P Geyer)</td>
<td>658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Cricket Team (E H Eloff)</td>
<td>790</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Military Veterans’ Organisation (M Ozinsky)</td>
<td>4326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandes Toryan (E H Eloff)</td>
<td>4781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saldanha Municipality (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAFA (Z C Stali)</td>
<td>3769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPS (P W Cupido)</td>
<td>4146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholtz, Joggie (J J Visser)</td>
<td>5912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sdophumelela Secondary School, Learners of (C Labuschagne)</td>
<td>5269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharks (J J Visser)</td>
<td>4006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semenya, Castor (E Prins)</td>
<td>2480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seven Team, Maties (J J Visser)</td>
<td>6637</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shoprite/Checkersies Women of the Year Award, Women for Receiving Annual (P W Cupido)</td>
<td>4105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silvo, Joao (E J Von Brandis)</td>
<td>4608</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smith, Graeme and Wife (P W Cupido)</td>
<td>4144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small, Adam (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>6204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Softball Federation, Western Cape (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>4942</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solomons, Boebie (C F Beerwinkel)</td>
<td>2466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soloman, Kenny (E J Von Brandis)</td>
<td>6203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Peninsula High School (C F Beerwinkel)</td>
<td>4325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South African Police Service (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>2350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springboks (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>540,658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springboks (P C McKenzie)</td>
<td>692</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springboks (E Prins)</td>
<td>754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springbok Team (E H Eloff)</td>
<td>2522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springbok Rugby Team (E H Eloff)</td>
<td>4143, 4178, 4324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springfield High School (C F Beerwinkel)</td>
<td>2348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stellenbosch Municipality (H P Geyer)</td>
<td>5300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stellenbosch University Choir (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>2410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stellenbosch (M Ozinsky)</td>
<td>789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stellenbosch Municipality (J J Visser)</td>
<td>5270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stellenbosch University Team (V Hani)</td>
<td>4011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stellenbosch and Stellenberg Girls Choir (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>6335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steyn Elize (A Rossouw)</td>
<td>2349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stormers (J J Visser)</td>
<td>4006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunflower Fund Ladies (M C Walters)</td>
<td>2466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Square Kilometre Array (SKA) (C F Beerwinkel)</td>
<td>5872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Officials (P W Cupido)</td>
<td>4146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Team Zealous of Stellenbosch High School (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>695</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transplant Sports Association Athletes (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>3950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism and Rector of UWC (E J Von Brandis)</td>
<td>4179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tygerberg Children’s Choir (J L Hartnick)</td>
<td>2410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDF (M Skwatsha)</td>
<td>4180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van der Merwe, DR Elbie (J Witbooi)</td>
<td>4009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Gyssen Eloïse (M G E Wiley)</td>
<td>3948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Niekerk, Carla (P W Cupido)</td>
<td>3946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vang da Gama Football Club (Z C Stali)</td>
<td>1595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vilander Ernest (E H Eloff)</td>
<td>3947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vergotine, Valentino (Z C Stali)</td>
<td>4110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volunteers uring strike (V Hani)</td>
<td>2482</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Wacky Wine Festival (E H Eloff) .......................................................... 2348
Webber, June (E H Eloff) ................................................................. 4321
Weideman, Philip (A J du Toit Marais) ........................................ 2230
Wentzel, Shaun (C F Beerwinkel) ............................................... 4011
Western Cape Liquor Authority (E J Von Brandis) ................ 5273
Western Cape Primary Schools Athletics Team (C F Beerwinkel) 1644
Western Cape Women Farmers of the Year (M C Walters) .... 659
Western Cape Officials (M C Walters) ........................................... 4782
Western Cape Municipality (J J Visser) ........................................ 5270
WCED 6338
WCED on Higher matric Pass Rate .................................................. 5780
Winners of national female farmer competition (J J Visser) .... 2461
Winners: Productivity SA (E H Eloff) ............................................. 986
Wishing Muslim community strength and best wishes with
Witzenberg Reel Dancers (J L Hartnick) ........................................ 4940
World Cup Draw (P M Jacobs) ...................................................... 1108
World Transplant Games (J L Hartnick) ....................................... 693
Worcester Hospital Nursing School (A J Du Toit Marais) ......... 6632
WP Junior Jukskei Team at SA Championships (J A van Zyl) .... 1350
WP Rugby (P C McKenzie) ............................................................ 838
WP Rugby Team winning Curry Cup (M G E Wiley) ............... 6408
Yende, Pretty (J L Hartnick) .......................................................... 755, 2408
Yende, Pretty (H P Geyer) .............................................................. 4110
Zenani, Anita (V Hani) ................................................................. 4114
World War II Veteran (M E G Wiley) ........................................... 5155
2012 Olympic Squad, Western Cape Members of ................... 5907
Cosatu’s Actions against National Youth wage Subsidy – Motion .... 5837
Corruption in Swellendam Municipality – Motion ..................... 4004
Correctional Service Officer, Immoral Act Between Police Woman –
Motion ...................................................................................... 4177
Communities, Impact of “Ale” – Motion ....................................... 5148
Committee Meetings, Hessequa Mayoral – Motion ................... 4694
Community Safety. Minister’s Inability to Manage Department of – Motion .... 4102
Community Safety, Remarks by Minister – Motion .................... 4099
Community Safety, Gang Plan, Comments by MEC of – Motion .... 5838
COPE Member rejoin ANC – Motion .............................................. 6500
Councillor Mattheys Koch’s Failure to Declare his Interests – Motion .... 3616
Corruption in Provincial Department - Motion ......................... 6405
Closing Down of Civil Society Initiatives – Motion ...................... 3764
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof – Matter
Of Public Importance .................................................................. 5742
Closure of Du Noon Child Welfare Office – Motion .................. 6409
Curb Gangsterism, Avenues to – Motion ..................................... 6367
DA Chairpersons and Vice-Persons Elected – Motion .............. 6635
DA Government, Inferior service Delivery by - Motion ............... 5860
DA’s disregard for minimum standards for sanitation
and provision of toilets to poor – Motion .................................... 2518
DA-LED Government to Employ People living with
Disabilities, Failure of – Motion .................................................. 4604
DA-Government to Provide Equal Education, Failure of – Motion .... 5267
DA Snubs Indigenous People – Motion ........................................ 4135
DASO Found Guilty of Contravening Three UCT SCR Election
By Laws – Motion .................................................................. 6327
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>6366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education System, Inequality in the</td>
<td>5858</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Outcome, Progress made to Improve – Motion</td>
<td>4175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efforts of ANC Government to Restrict Media Freedom – Motion</td>
<td>2459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eid: 27 November 2009 – Motion</td>
<td>1107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eight lives lost in fire in Khayelitsha Town two – Motion</td>
<td>2571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrocuted, Two Young Girls – Motion</td>
<td>4149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elections, Gangsterism During – Motion</td>
<td>5726</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental and Health Issues – Motion</td>
<td>1744</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurial Leader of the Year Award – Motion</td>
<td>6502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity Targets – Motion</td>
<td>5912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity Share Land Reform Schemes – Motion</td>
<td>6379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eskom tariff increase and top management – Motion</td>
<td>1010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eskom's tariff increases – Motion</td>
<td>1642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eviction of Farm Workers - Motion</td>
<td>4005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure of City of Cape Town – Motion</td>
<td>2407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure of ratepayers' money – Motion</td>
<td>2561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive statement by the Minister of Local Government,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment Equity Report, Commission of – Motion</td>
<td>6201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>2334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Failure of WCED to indicate how money was Spent, Shutting Down of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Schools – Motion</td>
<td>6628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Expo in May – Motion</td>
<td>2232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farms: violating health and remuneration legislation – Motion</td>
<td>2370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmers Funding Ground and Air Strike Security – Motion</td>
<td>6574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farming, small-scale – economic feasibility of – Motion</td>
<td>2299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farewell, Hon Member P M Jacobs – Motion</td>
<td>4320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm Attacks, Solly Tyibilika Killing – Motion</td>
<td>4692</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm Worker Forum – Motion</td>
<td>2230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm Project, Agri Dwala Empowerment – Motion</td>
<td>4700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm Workers, Speedy recovery involved in Bus Accident</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Motion</td>
<td>4608</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm Workers of the Year Competition – Motion</td>
<td>6497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatal injury of Gavin Engelke and Keenan van Wyk – Motion</td>
<td>2261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatal Shootings in Hanover Park and Ottery – Motion</td>
<td>6406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatal taxi accident on Constantia Main Road – Motion</td>
<td>2303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fellow Learners, Rape of 16-year old boy by - Motion</td>
<td>6377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filthy areas the poor live in – Motion</td>
<td>1593</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire, Seven Die in – Motion</td>
<td>4604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fires in Kanana informal Areas, Gugulethu – Motion</td>
<td>6577</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fishing Communities, Traditional (Motion)</td>
<td>5268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final Examinations in Wynland District – Motion</td>
<td>6499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Governance Review and Outlook, 2009 – Tabling</td>
<td>1599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flights from Munich to Cape Town - Motion</td>
<td>6267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Football world cup: gratitude to citizens – Motion</td>
<td>2372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding, Withdrawal and Reduction of – Motion</td>
<td>3764</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding for Nongovernmental Organisations – Motion</td>
<td>4139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funds, Maintenance Lack of – Motion</td>
<td>4139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fransman’s – Involvement in – Motion</td>
<td>2403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fraudsters fired – Motion</td>
<td>5905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom Charter: Achievement of its aims – Motion</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free housing policy, rethink of – Motion</td>
<td>905</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Free trade ports, Establishment of – Motion ........................................... 2256
Free Trade Zone/Port in Cape Town, Establishment of – Motion ................ 688
Funding of Cape Firm Commission – Motion ........................................ 6494
Full and effective interpretation service – Motion ................................... 1037
Future of Somerset Hospital – Motion .................................................. 2173
Gangs, in Western Cape – Motion ......................................................... 4316
Gang-related violence on Cape Flats – Motion ....................................... 2257
Gang Violence in Townships – Motion .................................................. 4138
Gang-Related Violence in Cape – Motion .............................................. 4555
Genetically Modified Foods, Status of – Motion ..................................... 6405
Guns During Evictions, use of - Motion ............................................... 4693
Good wishes for Cape Argus Pick ‘n Pay Cycle Tour – Motion ............... 1596
Good Luck to Matric Learners – Motion ................................................ 6334
Graaff Family, Homage to – Motion ..................................................... 5868
Grade Nine, Failure rate - Motion ......................................................... 5904
Grandmother against Poverty and Aids – Motion .................................... 6410
Gratitude and appreciation to committee coordinators – Motion ............... 2521
Gratitude and well wishes to Western Cape Traffic Department – Motion .... 6572
Green Economic Accord, Singing of – Motion ...................................... 4702
Greenfields, Impact of on Housing Demand Database – Motion ................ 3615
Green Point Stadium, Escalating costs of – Motion ................................ 746
Green Initiative, Advantage of – Motion .............................................. 5902
Growing Baboon Problem in Cape Town – Motion .................................. 6629
Gugulethu Seven Massacre Anniversary – Motion .................................... 5268
H1N1 Virus, Number of deaths as a result of – Motion ............................. 784
Health Care Facilities, Construction and Upgrading of - Motion ............... 5836
Health Care Systems in Rural Areas – Motion ....................................... 4318
Health Practitioners: Scrapping of names – Motion ................................ 607
Health Rights and responsibilities, Review of – Motion ........................... 655
Health Workers, Acknowledgement of Personnel of Nelspoort, .................
Beaufort West and Montagu Hospitals – Motion ...................................... 4108
Heavy rains in Western Cape – Motion .................................................. 2227
High Court Documents, Falsification of – Motion ................................... 4006
High Levels of Learners not Reaching Matric – Motion ........................... 6257
Hip Hop Media Lounge and Other projects: Rasool’s and .................
Huguenot Primary School Mitchells Plain, Opening of – Motion .............. 6378
Hillview Housing Development Project, Delay in – Motion ....................... 2256
HIV Campaign, Get Tested and – Motion ............................................ 4774
Hon Mcebisi Skwatsha refused entry into Nomination Process –
Motion ................................................................................................... 6638
House, Business of – Motions ......................................................... 16, 80,110,266,443,879,1084,1281,1602,
.................................................. 1735, 2165, 2250, 4545, 4929, 5276, 3736, 5804
Housing Indaba – Motion ........................................................................ 4692
Health, International Award to Western Cape Department - Motion ........... 5154
Health Department, Wasteful Expenditure by - Motion ........................... 5299
Houses, Poor quality – Motion ............................................................... 690
Housing and serviced Sites Target – Motion ........................................... 4001
Housing development in Delft – Motion .................................................. 934
Housing List for Eerste River and Blue Downs, City of
Cape Town’s – Motion ........................................................................... 6317
Housing subsidies, Approval of – Motion .............................................. 2226
Housing subsidies, Failure to Allocate – Motion ...................................... 4004
Hout Bay, Building of new housing units in – Motion .............................. 590
Makhaza Toilets – Motion ............................................................ 6416
Management of Fisheries and Small Boat Harbours – Motion .................. 3940
Mandela Park Housing – Motion .................................................. 782
Mandela, Nelson Foundation – Motion ........................................... 5729
Manipulation of Crime Figures in Western Cape – Motion ....................... 2477
Matters Pertaining to Farmworkers – Motion ..................................... 6493
Matrics to attend Winter Schools, Encouragement to – Motion ................ 4013
Matric Passes, University of Western Cape Project to Improve – Motion .... 4703
Measles outbreak in province – Motion ........................................... 2122
MEC for Community Safety: Role and Duties – Motion ......................... 609
MEC for Education, Wasteful expenditure by – Motion ......................... 592
MEC Botha’s Intimidating DA Member – Motion .................................. 6501
MEC: Leaking of SAPS information and attack on Commissioner – Motion . 362
Mayoral Committee Member, Untoward Behaviour by – Motion ................ 5868
Members, Embarrassment and poor treatment of – Motion ..................... 689
Members, Executive Paid to go on Hunting Trip of – Motion .................... 4554
Member of SCOPA, ANC Member Mr M Ozinsky Fitness of – Motion ....... 4775
Members, new:
  Announcement ........................................................................... 5695
  Election of Premier and Speaker of Western Cape Provincial Parliament .................................................. 2
  Oath or Solemn Affirmation ........................................................ 1
Members, Statements by .......................................................... 9,96,298,528,582,597,648,679,739,775,825,898,
  924,970,1004,1029,1101,1281,1287,1583,1635,1735,2165
  2115, 2219, 2250, 2291, 2338, 2362, 2397, 2453, 2469, 2511, 2549
  3757, 3933, 3996, 4125, 4166, 4310, 4586, 4685, 4766, 4929, 5140, 5259,
  5292, 5718, 5741, 5769, 5828, 5850, 5892, 6194, 6250, 6308, 6357, 6397,
  6443, 6485, 6562, 6622 ..................................................................
Military Veterans – Motion ......................................................... 4318
Military Veterans, Assistance to – Motion .......................................... 5727
Millennium Development Goals Youth Conference – Motion ................. 6639
Mitchells Plain Hospital, Construction of – Motion ................................ 4137
Misleading pamphlet regarding extension of R300 – Motion .................... 982
Misrepresentations by ANC – Motion ............................................. 834
Mitchells Plain Policing and Vigilantism – Motion .................................. 749
Mr J J Visser: Statement on Women during debate – Motion ................. 610
Modernisation Programme of Provincial Government – Motion .............. 608
Money-lenders and shebeen owners: effect and impact of – Motion ......... 2371
Money paid to Premier – Motion .................................................... 4002
Mossel Bay Municipality Mayor, Racist Stance of – Motion ....................... 5912
Manipulation by EMS Staff of Triage System – Motion ......................... 2405
Minister Saves Saartjie Baartman Centre – Motion .................................. 5777
Minister of Education, Refuse to meet with Grabouw Learners – Motion .... 5140
Minister of Housing, No-Show of – Motion ....................................... 4693
Municipal Disaster Management Plans, Investigation into – Motion ......... 783
Municipal Election, Youth Contribution – Motion ................................... 3952
Municipal Hostel, in Langa – Motion ............................................... 4553
Municipal IQ Hotspot Monitor Findings - Motion ................................. 5910
Municipal Governance, status of – Motion ......................................... 5267
Municipal Pools, Swimming Training Programmes at – Motion ................ 690
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Municipal rates fiasco – Motion</td>
<td>2259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Tenders in Province – Motion</td>
<td>4003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name Changes – Motion</td>
<td>1745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Competency, Making of Academic Hospitals – Motion</td>
<td>5266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Competencies, Usurpation of – Motion</td>
<td>5910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Farmer of the Year - Motion</td>
<td>6374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Minister of Police – Motion</td>
<td>2375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Health Insurance, Green Paper on – Motion</td>
<td>4182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCOP:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authority of delegation to</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanent delegates, Appointment of</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New National Youth Agency – Motion</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO’s in Province, Funding Cuts to – Motion</td>
<td>6265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Night Shelters, Status – Motion</td>
<td>6201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Violence Campaign, 16 Days of Activism – Motion</td>
<td>4697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-attendance of committee clerk: no committee meeting held –</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motion</td>
<td>1643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSRI Rescue Operation: Crew of Seli 1 – Motion</td>
<td>752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N1 “Road of Death”, Ongoing Carnage on – Motion</td>
<td>4694</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office of the Speaker: Xenophobia Campaign – Motion</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Official of City Council demoted – Motion</td>
<td>2344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offloading of Corpses – Motion</td>
<td>1745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Older Persons Act, implementation of – Motion</td>
<td>2370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organ Donor Month – Motion</td>
<td>612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organ Donor Month as August – Motion</td>
<td>2409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Fields, Women Raped in</td>
<td>4603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open opportunity society – Motion</td>
<td>606</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overcrowded Trains, Danger Commuters face in – Motion</td>
<td>4603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oversight role of Provincial Parliament, Importance of – Motion</td>
<td>2259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overstrand Municipality Land Sale – Motion</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overstrand Municipality: 2009 Cleanest Town Competition – Motion</td>
<td>1109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paarl, Houses to be Built – Motion</td>
<td>4005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parliamentary Committees: Importance and Impact – Motion</td>
<td>657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parliamentary Committees, Importance of</td>
<td>2345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnering with non-profit organisations – Motion</td>
<td>1745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paulse, Ms S U, Statement of – Motion</td>
<td>656</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People Affected by Rains – Motion</td>
<td>4002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peoples’ Republic of China – Motion</td>
<td>5726</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Explanation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHP: support by Department of Human Settlements – Motion</td>
<td>2122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piracy by State of Israel – Motion</td>
<td>2300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plight of residents of Leonsdale – Motion</td>
<td>2260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police Officials, Killings and Suicides amongst – Motion</td>
<td>4136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police Officers, Cape Town Metropolitan – Motion</td>
<td>4140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Politicising appointment of secretary to parliament – motion</td>
<td>2563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pollution of Eerste River – Motion</td>
<td>935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pollution of water resources, Control of – Motion</td>
<td>2227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor Service delivery with Housing in Oudtshoorn – Motion</td>
<td>2477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor infrastructure and under spending in Poor Areas in Western</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cape – Motion</td>
<td>6258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possession of Drugs, Arrest of 27 People in Mitchells Plain for – Motion</td>
<td>6377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power between Executive and Legislature, Separation of – Motion</td>
<td>687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Public school problems and resources


Preparedness for epidemics

Premier: Undermining Stellenbosch Municipality

Premier’s SOPA announcement

Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed) Premier’s State of the Province Address

Premier, Remuneration of Premier, Consolidated Monitoring and Evaluation Report of

Premier: Night Schools

National Reconciliation Day Celebrations

Mayoral committee Members, Racist Tactics of

Minister Remarks by Community Safety

Max, Lennit Still in Office

Public Property, Civil unrest and damage to

Programming Authority’s Role, Engagement of Political Parties in Legislature with regard to

Minister’s Inability to Mange Department of Community Safety. - Motion

Minister Remarks by Community Safety - Motion

National Reconciliation Day Celebrations – Motion

Night Schools – Motion

Premier:

Election of

Opening Address of

Opening Address of – Debate

Executive Statement

President’s Support, Approval of commitment to Youth Wage Subsidy

Premier, Consolidated Monitoring and Evaluation Report of – Motion

Premier’s Appointment of Male MECS – Motion

Premier’s Calling, Labelling People from Eastern Cape Refugees –

Premier’s Department, Employee Found Guilty – Motion

Premier, Remuneration of – Motion

Premier, Secondment of staff to office of – Motion

Premier’s State of the Province Address

Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)

Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed)

Premier, SOPA announcement – Motion

Premier's SOPA announcement: debate – Motion

Premier: Undermining Stellenbosch Municipality – Motion

Preparedness for epidemics – Motion

Princess Vlei: Economic and Environmental implications of shopping mall – Motion

Project in Kuilsriver, “Adopt a Matriculant” – Motion

Provincial Development Council, Closing down of – Motion

Provincial Economic Review and Outlook – Tabling and consideration

Provincial Hospitals, Lack of Security at – Motion

Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011] (Consideration and finalisation)

Provincial Legislature, disregarding of isiXhosa language in – Motion

Province, Anti-Poverty Strategy in – Motion

Province, child abuse in – Motion

Province, Violence in Sport in – Motion

Provincial Parliament, Oversight role of – Motion

Provincial Roads, High accident rate on – Motion

Public school problems and resources – Motion
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Motion</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Racist Manager, Sacking of</td>
<td>4701</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio appearances by Premier and Mayor of city of Cape Town</td>
<td>2564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rail Commuter Action Group: Mr Leslie Van Minnen</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removal by Government of Babies from Place of Safety</td>
<td>3940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of SIU, Distribution of Interim before its Release</td>
<td>4103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removal of small business traders</td>
<td>2226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removal, Community Safety for</td>
<td>5845</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Support Service, Technical and</td>
<td>4317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service</td>
<td>1624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Auditor-General: Contracts given to Civil Servants</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Health Amendment Bill [B24d - 2011] (NCOP) (Consideration)</td>
<td>6520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committee on Education on Further Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Colleges Amendment Bill [B13D - 2011] (NCOP) (Consideration)</td>
<td>4784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4-2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(NCOP) – Consideration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report on Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Amendment Bill</td>
<td>3973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B33 - 2012] (NCOP) (Consideration)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amendment Bill [B36D-2010] (NCOP) – (Consideration)</td>
<td>3982</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amendment Bill [B36D - 2010] (Reprint)(NCOP)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Consideration)</td>
<td>4117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Sectional Titles - Schemes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management Bill [B20B-2010] (NCOP) - Consideration</td>
<td>3974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Community</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schemes Ombud Service Bill [B21B - 2011] (NCOP) – Consideration</td>
<td>3974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4—2010]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(NCOP)(Consideration)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Amendment Bill</td>
<td>1635</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B17-2011] (NCOP) (Consideration)</td>
<td>4784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook</td>
<td>1109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Consideration)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration)</td>
<td>1273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Conduct Committee on complaints lodged against current and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament – Motion</td>
<td>1011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report on Study Visit, Standing committee on – Motion</td>
<td>5868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report on role of Pieter van Dalen in shooting of two children in</td>
<td>2520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khayelitsha – Motion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committee on Education, Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on visit to Uitzig Secondary School (Consideration)</td>
<td>1012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committee on Community Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(NCOP) (Consideration) – Motion</td>
<td>3563</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
On Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010] (NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010] (NCOP) (Consideration) ................................................................. 3563
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on Social assistance Amendment bill [B5B—2010] (Consideration) ........ 2503
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ........................................ 757,790
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on National House of Traditional Leaders Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) .................. 910
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Traditional Leadership and Government Framework Amendment Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) .................................................. 910
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) ........................................................................ 4611
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health – (Consideration) ............................................................................ 4270
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) ........................................................................ 4277
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) ................................................................................. 4286
Report of Rules Committee on amendments to standing Rules (Consideration) ........................................................................ 4562
Resignations, Current Trend – Motion ........................................ 4175
Revival of Bills – Motion ........................................................ 1599
Richdiversity of Culture – Motion ............................................. 5835
Rift Valley fever in province – Motion ....................................... 2123
Roadblocks over weekend – Motion .......................................... 2567
Role of Mr Walters in encouraging Overstrand Municipality to Commission report – Motion ....................................................... 904
Role of seat of national Parliament in nation-building – Motion .... 932
Rosh Hashanah – Motion ........................................................ 6207
Rules Committee:
Representative of parties ....................................................... 7
Rural Areas Development, Opportunities for Growth – Motion ...... 4173
Rural Areas, Socio-Welfare and economic circumstances in – Motion ................................................................. 746
Rural Development: Optimisation – Motion ............................. 538
Pike, Mama Lizzie, Speedy recovery – Motion ......................... 4610
SA Junior Bodyboarding Champion – Motion ......................... 6498
SAA Cancellation of Flights – Motion ........................................ 5901
SAPS, Commendation to – Motion ........................................ 6579
SAPS, Acts against Drug Dealers – Motion .............................. 6638
Saartjie Baartman Centre – Motion ........................................ 143
Safe festive season to motorists and pedestrians – Motion ........ 1293
Safe Transportation of Learners – Motion ............................... 2518
Safety and well-being of children over festive season – Motion .... 1294
Safety Home Campaign – Motion .......................................... 6251
Safety of personnel at hospitals – Motion ................................ 2257
Safety of People, SAPS Responsible for – Motion .................... 5901
Saldanha Industrial development Region - Motion .................... 5903
Salute to Liezel Van der Westhuizen – Motion ......................... 4114
Salute to Dean Stockenstrom – Motion .................................... 4114
Salutation to Smile Foundation – Motion ........................................... 3769, 4111
Sanitation Problems in Khayelitsha – Motion .................................. 6494
Shortage of Drug and Alcohol Rehabilitation Centres – Motion ........ 3616
Salutation to Shout Foundation – Motion ........................................ 3770
SAPS: Lie detector tests – Motion ................................................. 37
SA Roadlink Bus Service: statement by MEC – Motion ....................... 2123
Seasonal Diseases, Victims of – Motion ........................................... 5154
Secretarial Allowances, Constituency and – Motion ........................ 4103
Service Delivery, Project Reclaim Disruption of – Motion ................. 5300
School buses near Botriver – Motion ............................................. 2481
School Buses, Surveillance Cameras on – Motion ................................ 4557
School libraries, state and funding of – Motion ................................ 981
Schools, Overcrowded – Motion .................................................. 4174
Schools, Violence in – Motion ..................................................... 539
SCOPA Meeting - Motion ............................................................. 5776
Season on Roads, Safe Festive – Motion ........................................ 4936
Secrecy around cabinet reshuffle – Motion ...................................... 2560
Service delivery, Derica Lambrechts in Townships on - Motion .......... 5836
Service Delivery Problems in DA-Run Municipalities – Motion .......... 3764
Service Delivery, Impact of – Motion ............................................. 5148
Service Delivery, Integrated – Motion .......................................... 5836
Service Delivery, Death of Babies due to Lack of – Motion .............. 5149
Service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Extention of MyCiti Bus,
Cape Chamber of Commerce’s View – Motion .................................. 5837
Skwatsha, Mcebisi Property Deal Allegedly involving – Motion .......... 5149
Seven Wonders of Nature, Table Mountain voted as one of – Motion ... 4696
Sexual Abuse and Rape, Complaints of Teacher Misconduct,
Including Cases of – Motion ...................................................... 4603
Shortage of flu vaccines – Motion ................................................ 2176
Shop Owners, Bad Behaviour against Poor People – Motion .......... 4174
Sign language, recognition of in communities – Motion ................. 2371
Sitting, Hours of – Motion .......................................................... 1802
Social House Project in Bothasig Gardens, Launch of R55 Million – Motion ... 6579
Social Development attend COP17, Representatives of Western Cape
Department of ........................................................................ 4783
Social Transformation Programme, Continuation of – Motion .......... 689
Social Inclusion, Principles and Concept of – Motion ...................... 4172
Somalia, Relieve Efforts in – Motion ............................................ 4142
Speaker:
Acceptance speech by .................................................................. 4
Announcements ............................................................................ 1029, 1445, 1468
Apology by Deputy Speaker .......................................................... 824
Conduct in House ......................................................................... 596
Debates of .................. 80,560,1085,1129,1602, 2352, 3953, 4743, 5241, 6274
Election of .................................................................................. 2
Interpretation .............................................................................. 969
Women Redefining Leadership ..................................................... 4069
Rulings .................. 72, 109, 329, 360, 646, 678, 968, 2219, 2573, 3980, 6364
UCC Primary School. Closure of Grootkraal – Motion ................. 4101
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ........................................ 2430
Service Increased, Local Goods Procurement of – Motion .......... 4560
Small Business – Motion ............................................................ 6267
Speaker's car accident – Motion ............................................... 747
Speaker’s Handling of Legislature and its Affairs – Motion ........................................... 3940
Special Needs Schools: Learners at – Motion ................................................................. 2405
Spending, City of Cape Town of – Motion ................................................................... 4319
Sport as unifying factor – Motion ................................................................................. 747
Sports Day, Change of date of – Motion ....................................................................... 668
Stabbing amongst Students in Schools – Motion ............................................................ 6378
Stellenbosch, Proposed soccer stadium in – Motion ....................................................... 606
St Luke’s Hospice - Motion ............................................................................................. 4557
Street people in Cape Town and rest of province, Condition and care of – Motion ............ 2174
Students, Study bursaries to – Motion ......................................................................... 750
Student Uprising, 11 August 1976 – Motion ................................................................. 4144
Subjects for discussion:
   Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in Taxi Violence in Western Cape ... 6339
   Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 .................................................................. 4704
   Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ....................................................... 2378
   Conditions in places where poor people live ............................................................ 2524
   Crime, Initiative to Prevent in Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ................................................................. 4151
   Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape .................................................. 6212
   Economic Empowerment and Development, Success
      Achieved in Respect of ............................................................................................ 5805
   Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ........................................................................ 6379
   Freedom Day: 16 Years later ..................................................................................... 2180
   Freedom of the City for Us President - Motion .......................................................... 5861
   Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of – Motion .............................. 5873
   Heritage Day ............................................................................................................. 809
   Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .............................................. 989
   High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ..................................................... 1012
   Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery .... 4614
   Housing development in Delft ................................................................................... 1047
   Illegal Advertising, Proliferation of – Motion ............................................................ 6451
   Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .................................................. 661
   Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ......................... 542
   Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ........ 695
   Integrated Human Settlement, Development of – Motion ......................................... 5838
   Lack of development for young people ..................................................................... 2262
   Lost of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ........................................................................ 6462
   National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU against Implementation of ........ 5917
   Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ............................................................ 6417
   Order of the Day, Point of Order, Programming of ................................................... 4269
   Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ...................................................................... 5161
   Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports .................................................................... 6588
   Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ..................................... 2484
   Policing in Mitchells Plain ......................................................................................... 879
   Problems in Bitou Municipality .................................................................................. 940
   Removal of small business traders .......................................................................... 2307
   Results of Census 2011 ............................................................................................. 6502
   Safety on public transport in Western Cape .............................................................. 2232
Unblocking of blocked housing projects – Motion .......................................................... 2123
Underutilisation of former Model C school buildings – Motion .................................... 1895
Unemployment, high rate of – Motion ............................................................................. 2347
Unguarded Rail Crossings – Motion ................................................................................. 2518
Unhealthy Conditions in TRAS – Motion ......................................................................... 2405
Unhealthy and Dangerous Sanitation – Motion ................................................................ 4138
Unruly conduct of Ravensmead DA councillor – Motion .................................................. 835
UN Summit on Global Warming COP 17 – Motion ............................................................ 4698
Upcoming tourism entrepreneur – Motion ........................................................................ 2229
Utilisation of Stadiums in Western Cape – Motion ............................................................. 2476
Vehicles, Farm workers Transported on back of – Motion .................................................. 5148
Victims of houses burnt down in Khayelitsha, Heideveld and Belhar – Motion ................. 2567
Victims of taxi disaster in Blackheath – Motion ................................................................. 2520
Victims of Informal Settlements fires – Motion ................................................................ 5864
Vigilantism in Khayelitsha – Motion ................................................................................ 5860
Violence Against Farm Dwellers – Motion ....................................................................... 5915
Violence in schools – Motion ......................................................................................... 2257
Violence on our trains – Motion ........................................................................................ 2175
Violence against Women and Children, Praise to Akhona Meyi for Championing ending for – Motion ................................................................................................. 4561
Visit to Britain, Premier Badmouthing our Country and Turning Investors away on – Motion ......................................................................................................................... 6326
Water, Availability and State of – Motion ......................................................................... 6366
Water Scarce Resource ..................................................................................................... 5838
Water Wastage by City of Cape Town – Motion ................................................................. 6454
Ward Committees - Motion ............................................................................................. 4318
WCED, Educator posts in – Motion .................................................................................. 784
WCED, High number of sexual abuse cases in – Motion .................................................... 591
WCED: vacant posts and supply of qualified teachers – Motion ......................................... 832
WCPP’S unqualified Audit Report – Motion ..................................................................... 2407
Western Cape Agriculture Awards .................................................................................... 5158
Western Cape Agricultural Sector, awards in – Motion .................................................... 907
Western Cape, Free pap smears for Women in – Motion ................................................... 594
Western Cape Model of Land Reform – Motion ................................................................. 2403
Western Cape, Storm damage in – Motion ....................................................................... 364
Western Cape, Traffic Department Award – Motion ........................................................... 5270
Western Cape Hospitals, Security and Safety of – Motion ................................................ 537
Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Modernisation Strategy of – Motion ...................... 592
Western Cape road infrastructure – Motion ...................................................................... 935
Western Cape Spatial Development Framework – Motion ................................................ 937
Wilberforce, William and the Abolition of Slavery – Motion ............................................. 4775
Withdrawal and Reduction of Funding - Motion ................................................................. 3764
Women in Western Cape Province, Status of – Motion .................................................... 16
Women’s Day, Premier and Commemoration of – Motion .................................................. 4136
Violence against Women and Children, 16 Days of Activism against abuse and violence of – Motion .................................................................................................................. 6575
Woodstock Police Station, Crime situation around and its proposed move – Motion .......... 2175
Xenophobia in De Doorns: investigative and disciplinary process – Motion ..................... 1036
Xenophobia, plans to deal with – Motion .......................................................................... 2346
Xenophobic violence in province – Motion ..................................................................... 2369
Young Adult Youth, Issue of – Motion ............................................................... 16
Youth, International Year of – Motion ............................................................... 4147
Youth, Strategies to Deal with Social Ills Affecting – Motion ...................... 5147
Zero-tolerance approach of WCED – Motion ............................................... 1894
2010 Soccer: involvement of structures in sports, arts and culture
   – Motion ........................................................................................................... 1592
2010 Soccer World Cup, Legacy of – Motion ............................................... 2225
2010 Soccer World Cup: Public Transport – Motion .................................... 538
2010 Soccer World Cup, Readiness of Western Cape hospitals for
   – Motion ........................................................................................................... 2258
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, disaster management readiness
   During Motion .................................................................................................. 932
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, preparations for – Motion .............. 906
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament: Sex industry and Human Trafficking
   – Motion ........................................................................................................... 748
52nd Anniversary, Langa Massacres – Motion ............................................. 5271
52nd Anniversary, Sharpville Massacres – Motion ....................................... 5271
2012 Emerging Tourism Entrepreneur Winner – Motion .......................... 5903
2012 Govan Mbeki Best Priority Project Award - Motion .......................... 5915
110% Green Campaign – Motion ................................................................... 5904
515 Suspects in Mitchells Plain, Arrest of – Motion ................................... 6457
INDEX TO SPEECHES

ADAMS, F (NCOP)
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ............................................................... 758,795
Statements ........................................................................................................ 685

BEERWINKEL, C F
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ................................................................. 915
Cape Town Routs, Unlimited into Wesgro Incorporation of ............................................................ 5147
City of Cape Town, implications of growth of ...................................................................................... 932
Cape Town International Convention Centre Company Amendment Bill [B 10B - 2012] (Finalisation) ................................................................. 7097
Celebration of Eid-Al-Adha .............................................................................................. 6369
Children, conditions under which children grow up .............................................................. 2304
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities .................................................. 4151
Crisis, Tourism industry in ............................................................................................ 4103
Condolence, Motion of:
Family of seven and baby ......................................................................................... 1746
Jack, Neville Michael ................................................................................................. 4558
Kakaza, Leslie ............................................................................................................. 4112
Schoolchildren and those who have died playing sport .................................................... 1595
Congratulations:
Cavellereia Primary School ............................................................................... 5153
Chiu Alexander .............................................................................................................. 3950
Equal Education ........................................................................................................ 2411
Kotze Dewaldre ......................................................................................................... 2377
Provincial Athletic Trials ............................................................................................ 2306
Solomons, Boebie ....................................................................................................... 2466
Springfield High School ............................................................................................. 2348
Western Cape Primary Schools Athletics Team......................................................... 1644
Dire straits of farmers and communities in Southern Cape ............................................. 904
Drowning of schoolchildren ....................................................................................... 1590
Executive statement: De Doorns ................................................................................ 2336
June Examination ....................................................................................................... 3946
Learners, Grade 12 ...................................................................................................... 4558
Misleading pamphlet regarding extension of R300 ..................................................... 982
Office of Premier, Secondment of staff ...................................................................... 37
Pregnancy, rewarding girls who don’t fall pregnant ....................................................... 2299
South Peninsula High School ..................................................................................... 4325
Square Kilometre Array (SKA) .................................................................................. 5872
Wentzel, Shaun .......................................................................................................... 4011
Education .................................................................................................................... 6366
Funding of Cape Firm Commission ............................................................................ 6494
Green Economic Accord, Singing of ........................................................................... 4702
House, Business of .................................................................................................... 6682
Interference with Informal Traders ............................................................................. 6501
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................................................... 1513
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ....................................................... 5039
Princess Vlei: Economic and Environmental implications of shopping mall ................................................................. 748
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) .................... 1628
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) ......................................................... 1118
Service Increased, Local Goods Procurement of ........................................ 4560
Shutting down of Social and Informal Economy ...................................... 7046
Speaker’s Debate:
   Economic Freedom of the Youth ....................................................... 3971
Special Needs Schools: Learners at ...................................................... 2405
Statements ....... 582,602,974,1007,2118,2165, 2294, 2364, 2454, 2472, 2513 ............................................................................ 3757, 4586, 4685, 4932, 5853, 6358
Subject for discussion:
   Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ..................................... 2379
   Conditions in places where poor people live ....................................... 2527
   Empowerment and Development, Success
   Achieved in Respect of ................................................................. 5805
   High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ................................ 1014
   Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
   prevent recession ........................................................................ 701
   Lack of development for young people ............................................. 2268
   Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape .................................... 6417
   Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ............................................ 5169
   Policing in Mitchells Plain ............................................................... 885
   Problems in Bitou Municipality ........................................................ 948
   Results of Census 2011 .................................................................. 6511
   Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .. 852
   Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
   Role of Provincial Government in .................................................. 2421
Matrics to attend Winter Schools, Encouragement to ............................. 4013
Taxis, Reckless driving of .................................................................... 306
UCC Primary School. Closure of Grootkraal ........................................ 4101
Underutilisation of former Model C school buildings ............................. 1895
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............... 1337
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
   Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................................ 347
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............ 377
   Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................ 406
   Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................................... 498
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
   Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................... 1868
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .............................................. 2047
Western Cape Spatial Development Framework .................................... 937
Xenophobia, plans to deal with ............................................................ 2346
Zero-tolerance approach of WCED ..................................................... 1894
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
   Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................... 3843
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ............................................. 4877
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]  
(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism)...........4883
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) .........................................................4972
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B4- 2012](2011/2012 Financial Year) (Consideration of Principle) ..................................................5275
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ..................................................5447
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .........................................................5681
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ..........................................................5738
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ..........................................................6649
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ........................................................................7065
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ..........................................................7135
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) .........................................................7151
Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]  (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ........................................................................7463

BEKKER, J
Premier:
  Opening Address of........................................................................1497
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ........914
Condolence, Motion of:
  Mantashe, Madolwana and Cilliers, Messrs ..................................1294
  Ncedana, Mr V ........................................................................1645
  Nonzwana, Ntomhizonke.................................................................908
Executive statement : De Doorns ..................................................2337
Houses, Poor quality ......................................................................690
Premier: ..........................................................................................58, 1518
  Opening Address of........................................................................1497
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ..........................1627
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration)................................................................................1114
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) ...1276
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ........................................759,793
Speaker's Debate:
  Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ............................86
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
Children ..................................................................................1137
Statements....................................................................................900, 2117, 2168, 2398
Subject for discussion:
  Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ..........................2382
  Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .............994
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River.......................... 1018
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system.......................... 663
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape........... 546
Problems in Bitou Municipality ................................................ 952
Removal of small business traders ............................................. 2314
Statements made by Premier .................................................. 622
Taxis, Reckless driving of ....................................................... 306
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................... 1231
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ...................... 1311
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................. 1324
  Vote 1 – Premier .......................................................... 1362
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................... 202
  Vote 1 – Premier .......................................................... 223
  Vote 6 – Health ............................................................ 283
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ...................... 345
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................. 403
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading .............................................................. 1671
  Vote 1 – Premier .......................................................... 1760
  Vote 5 – Education .......................................................... 1871
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ............................................... 1902
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ...................... 1957
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................... 2045
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................. 2069
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill
  [B6—2009] Consideration of principle .................................... 1081
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, preparations for ..................... 906

BEVU, T N –
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .................. 2582
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof ...... 5745
Closing ................................................................. 6792
Condolence, Motion of:
  Asmal, Kader ......................................................... 3978
  Farewell, Mr P M Jacobs ............................................. 4322
House, Business of ......................................................... 6682
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ................ 5793
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ............................. 6417
Premier:
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ..................... 5044
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ..................... 6905
Pike, Mama Lizzie, Speedy recovery ........................................ 4610
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
  On Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010]
    (NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010]
    (NCOP) ........................................................... 3564
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
  Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health –
    (Consideration) .................................................. 4274
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
  (Consideration) .................................................. 4294
Speaker's Debate:
Economic Freedom of the Youth .......................................................... 3964
Women Redefining Leadership ............................................................... 4079
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ............................................................... 4752
Statements .................. 2471, 4129, 4548, 4588, 4686, 5261, 5294, 6196, 6252
.......................................................... 6445, 6487
Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape .......................................................... 6342
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
Delivery .......................................................... 4614
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
against Implementation of .......................................................... 5921
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 14 – Local Government .......................................................... 3575
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .......................................................... 3604
Vote 1 – Premier .......................................................... 3811
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .......................................................... 3899
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .......................................................... 4953
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .......................................................... 5360
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 –
Agriculture) .......................................................... 5654
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 –
Economic Development and Tourism) .......................................................... 5679
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) .......................................................... 5737
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on
Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) .......................................................... 6688
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and
Development Planning) .......................................................... 6699
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) .......................................................... 6703
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) .......................................................... 6707
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) .......................................................... 6715
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .......................................................... 6729
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .......................................................... 6781
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 3 –
Provincial Treasury) .......................................................... 7132
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 –
Economic Development and Tourism) .......................................................... 7150
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .......................................................... 7268
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 6 - Health)7320
BOESAK, A A
Premier: ................................................................. 44
Statements .................................................................. 651,741,927
Subject for discussion:
Heritage Day .............................................................. 813
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .. 847
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle ........................................... 118
Vote 5 – Education .................................................. 255
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 375
Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................. 495
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .................................. 518

BOTHA, T L
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .... 916
Closing 1392, 6789
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof ...... 5750
Executive Statement ................................................................ 6189
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ............... 5797
Premier:
Opening Address of .......................................................... 41, 1533
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............................. 6926
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed) ............... 6983
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ............................ 1629
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) ... 1276
Speaker’s Debate:
International Aids Day ................................................................ 1098
Statements ........................................................................ 96, 5895
Subject for discussion:
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
Delivery ........................................................................... 4627
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ..................... 5885
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ......................... 674
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape .... 542
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ........... 2495
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .. 840
Statement by Mr Ozinsky ........................................................ 4552
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8–2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................. 1166
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................ 1180, 1189
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................ 266,291
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ................................................................... 1677
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................ 1913, 1936
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]
Vote 6 – Health ................................................................ 3677, 3698
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................ 4856
Subject for discussion:

- Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ........................................ 4706, 4711
- High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ................................ 1016
- SA Fisheries .................................................................................. 4019
- Problems in Bitou Municipality ..................................................... 950
- Results of Census 2011 ................................................................. 6504
- Removal of small business traders ................................................. 2311
- Statements made by Premier ......................................................... 624
- Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
  Role of Provincial Government in ................................................ 2425

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................... 5310
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2012] –
  (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ............................................................. 5519, 5545
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................. 5736
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................. 6639
Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill [B7-2012]
  (Consideration and finalisation) ....................................................... 6677
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ............................................................. 6719
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of
  Principle) ....................................................................................... 7061
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 6 - Health) ............................................................. 7299, 7323

BREDELL, A W

Closing ................................................................. 1391
Condolence, Motion of:
  Duncan, Sheena ................................................................. 2227
Congratulations, Motion of
  De Jager, Gideon ................................................................. 4012
  Fourie, Hendrik ................................................................. 4012
Executive statement: De Doorns ............................................. 2334
Farewell, Hon Member P M Jacobs .......................................... 4320
Former President Nelson Mandela ......................................... 5151
Modernisation Programme of Provincial Government .............. 608
Power between Executive and Legislature, Separation of .......... 687
Premier: 
  Opening Address of ................................................................. 39, 1469
  Executive Statement ................................................................. 2395
  Rejection of SAHRC ruling on Makhaza housing debacle ........ 2404
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................... 5018
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed) .... 5103
Statements ...... 10,681,924,1005, 1281,1584,2251, 2362, 2511, 2549, 3935,
  .................................................................................................. 4166, 4311

Subject for discussion:
- Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ............................ 1242, 1254
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ... 1335, 1345

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 8 – Local Government ....................................................... 166,183
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...... 365,387
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 14 – Local Government .................................................. 1802, 1822
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning... 1999, 2021
Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
  [B2-2011] –(Consideration and finalisation) ......................... 3982,3995
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 14 – Local Government .................................................. 3564, 3584
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning... 3772, 3792
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ......................... 4829, 4835
  (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .................................................. 4866, 4872, 4873
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
  B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ....................... 4943, 4950
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
  Of Principle) ............................................................................. 5328
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 –
  Environmental Affairs and Development Planning)......... 5614, 5629
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 –
  Local Government) ................................................................. 5695, 5712
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8–2009]
  Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................... 1364
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading .................................................................... 1654
  Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................... 1755
  Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................... 2157
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................. 3743
  Vote and Schedules ................................................................. 3918
Withdrawal and Reduction of Funding ..................................... 3764
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) ......................... 4898
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ......................... 6694, 6698
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and
  Development Planning) ................................................................. 6699, 6700
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ......................... 6700
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013]
  (Consideration of Principle) .................................................... 7061
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013]
  (Consideration of Principle) .................................................... 7086
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and
  Development Planning ) .................................................... 7279
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and
  Development Planning ) .................................................... 7293
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 –
  Local Government) ................................................................. 7385
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ................................................................. 7407

BROWN, L

Closing ........................................................................................................... 6790
Condolences: Motions of
   Olifant, Danny ...................................................................................... 6407
   Uys, Theunis ......................................................................................... 6268
Congratulation: Motion of
   President Zuma, being appointed to Unsecretary’s Education first
   Initiative to (L Brown)........................................................................... 6259
Small Business ............................................................................................ 6267
Premier:
   Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)................................. 6897
Speakers Debate:
   Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .......................... 6277
Subject for discussion:
   Empowerment and Development, Success
   Achieved in Respect of ........................................................................ 5808, 5817
   Results of Census 2011........................................................................ 6502, 6507
   National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
   against Implementation of....................................................................... 5919
Statements................................................................................................. 5893, 6251, 6444, 6485, 6562, 7034
Visit to Britain, Premier Badmouthing our Country and Turning
   Investors away on ................................................................................... 6326
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of
   Votes and Schedule) ................................................................................ 5731, 3733
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012] (Consideration of
   Principle) ............................................................................................... 5739
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012] (Consideration and finalisation) ................................................................. 5784
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 6641
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ................................................................. 6787
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ................................................................. 7112

CARLISLE, R V

Announcements.......................................................................................... 4117
Full and effective interpretation service..................................................... 1037
Premier:
   Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)................................. 5060
   Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)................................. 6935
Statements made by Premier .................................................................... 631
Subject for discussion:
   Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
   Taxi Violence in Western Cape............................................................. 6351
   Freedom Day: 16 Years later .................................................................. 2193
   Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ....................... 5880
   Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ....................... 1000
   Empowerment and Development, Success
   Achieved in Respect of ........................................................................ 5824
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government............ 2499
Problems in Bitou Municipality........................................... 957
Removal of small business traders..................................... 2321
Safety on public transport in Western Cape................................. 2245
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health –
(Consideration) .................................................................. 4277
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................... 1158
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................. 1317, 1328
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................... 119
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................. 392,415
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading .................................................................. 1668
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .................................. 2054, 2076
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................. 3881, 3910
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ............ 4815
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) .............................. 5427, 5455
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) .............................................. 6666
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) ........................................ 6673, 6677
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................ 6704
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ............ 6762
Western Cape Transport Infrastructure Bill [B9 - 2012]
(Finalisation) .................................................................. 7095
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ) .......... 7248, 7270

CUPIDO, P W
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .... 914
ANC Centenary Celebrations, Spending Taxpayers’ money
on ................................................................................ 4606
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .......... 2586
Closing ........................................................................... 1392
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact
on Communities ............................................................... 4151
Condolence, Motion of:
Hale, Corne ........................................................................ 4777
Klein, Tom ........................................................................ 2479
Congratulations:
Crowster, Sharon ................................................................. 4776
Economic potential and forecast beyond 2010 ......................... 835
Executive statement: De Doorns ........................................ 2337
Free Trade Zone/Port in Cape Town, Establishment of .......... 688
Gang-related violence on Cape Flats .................................... 2257
Health Practitioners: Scrapping of names ............................. 607
Hendrick Mikhail ...............................................................................................................3946
Kraaifontein Police Station .......................................................................................... 2569
Member of SCOPA, ANC Member Mr M Ozinsky Fitness of ......................................... 4775
Municipal Pools, Swimming Training Programmes at .................................................... 690
Personal Explanation ..................................................................................................... 775
Metro Police .....................................................................................................................4146
Municipal Tenders in Province .......................................................................................4003
Mycroft, Michaela ..........................................................................................................4696
Niekerk, Carla ..................................................................................................................3946
Police Officials, Killings and Suicides amongst .............................................................4136
Protection of Information Bill .......................................................................................4774
Research Institutions, Three Cape Town ......................................................................4609
SAPS ...............................................................................................................................4146
Smith, Graeme and Wife ...............................................................................................4144
Traffic Officials ..............................................................................................................4146
Overcrowded Trains, Danger Commuters face in ..........................................................4603
Premier:
Opening Address of .......................................................................................................53, 1508
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................................................... 5037
Removal of small business traders ...............................................................................2226
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ..........................................................1626
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
(Consideration) .............................................................................................................4611
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) .............................................................................................................1115
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation
in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .................................................................759,799
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health –
(Consideration) ..........................................................................................................4274
Schools, Violence in ...................................................................................................... 539
Shoprite/Checkers Women of the Year Award, Women for
Receiving Annual ..........................................................................................................4105
Speaker’s Debate:
Economic Freedom of the Youth .....................................................................................3965
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking .........................................................................1612
International Aids Day .................................................................................................1090
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ..................................2357
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship .............................................................. 90
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ......................................................................24338
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and Choices 574
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children .......................................................................................4749
Statements .......... 14,535,601,653,686,744,780,830,977,1008,1105, ................ 1286, 1588,2172,2224,2255, 2298, 2343, 2458, 2475, 2516, 2558
........................................3938, 4097, 4134, 4551, 4591, 4690, 4772, 4934
Street people in Cape Town and rest of province
Condition and care of.................................................................................................. 2174
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 .................................................................4716
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ...........................................................2381
Conditions in places where poor people live: ........................................... 2534
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
Delivery .................................................................................................. 4614, 4635
Freedom Day: 16 Years later: ................................................................. 2190
Heritage Day: .......................................................................................... 820
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River: .................................. 1016
Housing development in Delft: ................................................................. 1048
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape: .......... 553
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system: ......................... 670
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
prevent recession: .................................................................................. 706
Lack of development for young people: ................................................. 2271
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government: ............... 2494
Policing in Mitchells Plain: ................................................................. 884
Removal of small business traders: ..................................................... 2307
SA Fisheries: ....................................................................................... 4025
Safety on public transport in Western Cape: ........................................ 2237
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas: ... 848
Transnet strike, Impact of: .................................................................... 2259
Traffic Police Officer, shortage of: ......................................................... 4100
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in: .................................. 4567
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture: ........................................................................... 1211
Vote 5 – Education: ............................................................................... 1222
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing: ........................................... 1252
Vote 4 – Community Safety: ................................................................. 1268
Vote 7 – Social Development: ................................................................. 1300
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism: ................................ 1312
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works: .............................................. 1326
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning: ............. 1344
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury: ................................................................. 1355
Vote 1 – Premier: ................................................................................. 1366
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament: .............................................................. 1375
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading: .................................................................................... 1667
Vote 4 – Community Safety: ................................................................. 1709
Vote 1 – Premier: .................................................................................. 1758
Vote 7 – Social Development: ................................................................. 1785
Vote 14 – Local Government: ................................................................. 1815
Vote 8 – Housing: ................................................................................. 1844
Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
[B2-2011]—(Consideration and finalisation): ........................................... 3988
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism: ................................ 3752
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning: ............. 3780
Vote 1 – Premier: .................................................................................. 3807
Vote 5 – Education: ............................................................................... 3842
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works: .............................................. 3898
Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill
[B4-2011]: ............................................................................................... 3990
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill
[B6—2009]
Consideration of principle: .................................................................. 1081
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]  
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .................................................................................................................. 4803
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –  
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) .................................................................................................................. 4812
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]  
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ................................................................................. 4816
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]  
(Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ................................................................................................. 4830
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]  
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................................................. 4840
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]  
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .................................................................................................................... 4858
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill  
[B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) .......................................................................................... 4945
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]  
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ............................................................................................... 4952
Women in Western Cape Province, Status of ............................................................................................ 4975
2010 Soccer World Cup: Public Transport ............................................................................................... 538
2010 Soccer World Cup, Readiness of Western Cape hospitals for .......................................................... 2258
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament: Sex industry and Human Trafficking ........................................ 748

DE BEER, O (NCOP)  
Statements ................................................................................................................................................. 682
Subject for discussion: Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ........................................................................................................................................ 703

DE LILLE, P  
Subject for Discussion:  
SA Fisheries ................................................................................................................................................ 4017
Speaker's Debate:  
Women Redefining Leadership ................................................................................................................ 4077
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence Against Women and Children ............................ 4750
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]  
Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................................................................................ 3636, 3654
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]  
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ............................................................................................... 4951, 4956

DE VILLIERS, M J R  
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ................................................................. 2584
Premier:  
Opening Address of ................................................................................................................................. 1526
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................................................................................. 6938
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................................................................................. 5042

ELOFF, E H  
Condolence, Motion of:  
Bus accident in Hex River Pass .............................................................................................................. 2228
Davids, Mr A A ......................................................................................................................................... 1597
Francken, Lulu .......................................................................................................................................... 2570
Congratulations:
Albertyn, Pierre .......................................................... 3772
Bafana Bafana ............................................................... 4148
Bantjies, Benjan .............................................................. 3770
Beukman, Erika ............................................................... 3768
Brookryk, Johan ............................................................. 3772
Coetzee, Theuns ............................................................. 3767
Dale-Roberts, Chef Luke and his team from La Colombe .......... 2179
Els, John ....................................................................... 3768
Langeberg on change of name ........................................... 839
Lange, Malcolm .............................................................. 1646
Management of South African Airways (E H Eloff) .................. 4007
Organisers of Robertson Wine, Food and Tourism Festival ...... 909
Phetho, Terry ................................................................. 3951
Sandes Toryan ............................................................... 4781
Springbok Team ............................................................ 2522
Springbok Rugby Team ................................................... 4143, 4178, 4324
Wacky Wine Festival ...................................................... 2348
Webber, June ................................................................. 4321
Winners: Productivity SA ................................................ 986
Wolfaardt, Hansie ........................................................... 3772
Vilander Ernest ............................................................... 3947

Decisions of Executive Members of previous
Provincial Government .................................................... 2404
Inspector Wiese and women of Drew, Bonnievale for Hospitality during
search for bodies, Thanks to .............................................. 542
Manipulation of Crime Figures in Western Cape .................... 2477
Premier: ........................................................................ 61
Opening Address of ................................................................
Speaker’s Debate:
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ...... 2355
Statements ................................................................. 101, 301, 685, 742, 926, 1034, 2224, 2339, 2459,
.................................................................................. 3757, 3937, 4097, 4098, 4172, 4686, 4934
Subject for discussion:
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ............ 993

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................. 1163
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................... 1310
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................ 1327
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .............................................. 1356
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................... 1363

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................ 162
Vote 8 – Local Government ................................................. 182
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................... 228
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................... 342
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................ 413

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
Vote 7 – Social Development .............................................. 3649
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................... 3740
Vote 1 – Premier ............................................................... 3810
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]  
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ................................................................. 4802

ESAU, S [SPEAKER with effect from 06/05/2009]
Acceptance speech ................................................................. 4
Announcements ......................................................... 9,205,239,644,701,746,1029,1445,1468, 4117
Apology by Deputy Speaker .................................................. 824
Closing .......................................................................................... 1393
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ................................................. 4151
Condolences: Motion of Beyleveldt, Theo ............................................. 4107
Conduct in House ........................................................................... 596
Election of ....................................................................................... 2
Interpretation .................................................................................. 969
Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D - 2010] (Reprint)(NCOP) (Consideration) ................................................................. 4117
Report of Standing Committee on Education on Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill [B36D-2010] (NCOP) – (Consideration) ...................................................... 3982
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ................................................................. 757
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on National House of Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) ................................................................. 4277
Traditional Leaders Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) ................................... 910
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Traditional Leadership and Government Framework Amendment Bill (NCOP) (Consideration) ...................................................... 910
Rulings ....................................................................................... 72, 109, 329, 360, 646, 678, 968, 2219, 5138
SA Fisheries .................................................................................. 4014
Speaker's Debate:
Economic freedom of the Youth ...................................................... 3953
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ................................................................. 5241
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking .............................................. 1602
International Aids Day ..................................................................... 1085
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ........................................................................ 2352
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ........................................ 80,95
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women .............................................. 2430
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices ........................................................................ 560,578
Women Redefining Leadership .......................................................... 4069
Women Redefining Leadership .......................................................... 4079, 4091
Subject for Discussion:
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .......................................................... 4184
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on .............................................. 5161
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .......................................................... 1371, 1382
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .......................................................... 509,523
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .......................................................... 2124, 2144
Western Cape Parliamentary Service and Finance Management Bill
Introduction ............................................................................................................. 1347
Western Cape Use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill
[B4-2010] – (Finalisation) .................................................................................... 4014
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ........................................................................... 3657
Vote and Schedules ........................................................................................... 3917

FIGLAN, A M
Abuse against the Elderly .................................................................................. 6492
Condolence: Motion of
Howa, Hassan ................................................................................................... 7049
Congratulations:
Executive Mayor of Cape Town ........................................................................ 6460
Human Settlement, Establishment of New Manenberg Contact
Centre ...................................................................................................................... 5843
Mbeki Govan, Human Settlement Awards 2012, Runners-up and
Renaming of NY1 to Steve Biko Drive ................................................................. 6260
Winners ................................................................................................................. 5840
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............................................ 5057
Statements .... 5141, 5294, 5769, 5857, 5892, 6256, 6363, 6449, 6568, 6600
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ................................................................................ 5364
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 –
Economic Development and Tourism) ............................................................... 5688
Subject for Discussion
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape ............................................................................ 6343, 6356
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ............................................................ 6709
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of
Principle) .................................................................................................................. 7079
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ................................................................................. 7118
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ............................................................ 7164
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ) ............................................ 7269

FRITZ, A T
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof .......... 5742
Condolence, Motion of:
Asmal, Kader ....................................................................................................... 3978
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............................................ 5087
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............................................ 6934
Speaker’s Debate:
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ........................................................................... 4757
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ..................................................................................................... 4286
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1 – 2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ........................................... 3703, 3728
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ......................... 4839
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ........................................ 5401, 5422
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ......................... 6773
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ........................................ 7361, 7381

GABRU, Y
Condomlence, Motion of:
Dudley, Mr R ................................................................. 38
Maqubela, Patrick ......................................................... 106
Solomon, Imam Gassan ................................................ 983
Congratulations:
Belgravia High School .................................................. 610
Four schools in 100 School Survey .................................. 908
Documentary Evidence, Manipulation and disappearance of .... 306
Freedom Charter: Achievement of its aims ....................... 363
Green Point Stadium, Escalating costs of ......................... 746
MEC for Education, Wasteful expenditure by .................... 592
Open opportunity society .............................................. 606
Premier:
Opening Address of ....................................................... 49
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .................... 803
SAPS: Lie detector tests .................................................. 37
School libraries, state and funding of ............................... 981
Speaker's Debate:
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children ......................................................... 1141
Statements ..................................................................... 649,777,902
Subject for discussion:
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .......... 999
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ............................................. 707
Statements made by Premier .......................................... 636
Textile and clothing workers' struggle ............................. 751
Tygerberg, New Hospital at ............................................. 686
WCED, Educator posts in ............................................... 784
WCED, High number of sexual abuse cases in .................. 591
WCED: vacant posts and supply of qualified teachers .......... 832
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 5 – Education ......................................................... 1218
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 5 – Education ......................................................... 248
GEYER, H P

Archbishop Desmond Tutu: Medal of Freedom Award ........................................ 616
Birthday wishes to Premier .................................................................................. 1598
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .......................... 2571, 2753, 2596
Condolence, Motion of:
  Komba, Sgt. Charles ......................................................................................... 660
  Maqhetsetheba, Anathi ...................................................................................... 937
  Meiring, Hannes ............................................................................................... 2178
  Papenfus, Rufus .................................................................................................. 6416
  Schmidt, Cobus ................................................................................................... 1039
  Van Rensburg, Erin ............................................................................................ 104
  Sisulu, Albertina ................................................................................................. 3945
Congratulations:
  Cederberg Winery ............................................................................................... 6337
  Cloetesville High School .................................................................................... 788
  Danie Steytler ..................................................................................................... 756
  Ferreira, G T ...................................................................................................... 2523
Hip-Hop World Championships, Delegation Attending to
  (H P Geyer) ......................................................................................................... 6376
Minister Winde ....................................................................................................... 6266
Mostert, Jan ......................................................................................................... 6322
MPP Jennifer Hartnick ......................................................................................... 2482
Ntsiki Biyela .......................................................................................................... 613
Provincial Parliament ......................................................................................... 6336
SA Academy for Science and Arts .................................................................... 658
Wishing Muslim community strength and best wishes with
  Ramadan Kareem ................................................................................................. 2460
Yende, Pretty ........................................................................................................ 4110
Documentary Evidence, Manipulation and disappearance of ......................... 306
Efforts of ANC Government to Restrict Media Freedom ................................ 2459
Fifa, Transfer of Land from Stellenbosch Municipality to .................................. 536
Hip Hop Media Lounge and Other projects: Rasool’s and Fransman’s
  Involvement in .................................................................................................... 2403
Premier:
  Opening Address of ............................................................................................ 67
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
  (Consideration and finalisation) ........................................................................ 478
Revival of Bills ....................................................................................................... 1599
Rift Valley fever in province ................................................................................ 2123
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4-2011]
  (NCOP) ............................................................................................................. 3973
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Sectional Titles
  Schemes Management Bill [B20B-2010] (NCOP) ............................................. 3974
Report of Standing Committee on Governance on Community
  Schemes Ombud Service Bill [B21B - 2011] (NCOP) ..................................... 3974
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
  Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of
    Health (Consideration) ................................................................................... 4274
Statements .......... 533,681,778,831,903,930,970,1034,1589,1637,2121,2165,
  .................... 2220, 2295, 2341, 2365, 2401, 2453, 2514,
  ........................ 4000, 4134, 4314, 4587, 4770, 5140, 5292, 5830, 6251, 6357, 6444,
  ......................................................................................................................... 6562, 7034
Stellenbosch, Proposed soccer stadium in ......................................................... 606
Subject for discussion:

Equity Share Land Reform Schemes .......................................................... 6389
High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ........................................... 1020
Housing development in Delft........................................................................ 1049
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps
to prevent recession.................................................................................. 709
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ...................... 2495
Inability of City of Cape Town to spend its Capital ................................... 2460
Taxi Drivers, Course on Road Etiquette for................................................. 688
Upcoming tourism entrepreneur .................................................................... 2229
WCPP’S unqualified Audit Report .................................................................. 2407

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle............................................................................... 1154
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................................................ 1354
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ..................................................................... 1379

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing ......................................................................................... 163
Vote 8 – Local Government .......................................................................... 180
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ........................................... 350
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .......................................................... 408
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................................................ 427
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ..................................................................... 519

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ............................................................................................. 1666
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................................... 2142

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .................................................................. 3668
Vote 14 – Provincial Parliament .................................................................. 3581

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ....................................................... 4852

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
Of Principle) .................................................................................................. 5317
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 –
(Provincial Parliament) ................................................................................ 5568
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 –
Agriculture) ................................................................................................. 5660

Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ........................................................................ 6647
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ..................................................... 7187
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 –
Local Government) ..................................................................................... 7403
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 –
Provincial Parliament) ................................................................................ 7452

GRANT, D A C
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ......................... 2581
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apilie School AND Implications thereof .......... 5752
Premier: ........................................................................................................... 63
Opening Address of......................................................................................... 63
Subject for discussion:
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ........................................... 2387
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................... 1215, 1226
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................... 240,260
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................... 1858,1879
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 5 – Education ............................................................... 3830, 3849
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ............................................. 4808, 4814
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ............................................. 5378, 5398
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ................. 6713, 6718
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 –
Education) ........................................................................ 7412

HANI, V
Children and Youth Commemorations ........................................ 5871

Condolence, Motion of:
Hugo, Doreen ........................................................................ 4008
Matthews, Joe ...................................................................... 2522
Ngwendu, Mr Eric .................................................................. 6319
Passing on of Mother of Nondzaliseko Makanda ................... 2412
Pick, Dave ............................................................................. 3617

Congratulations:
Castro, Fidel ......................................................................... 4183
Civil Society, Initiatives Closing Down of ......................... 3764
Matthews, James .................................................................. 7056
Stellenbosch University Team .............................................. 4011
Volunteers during strike ....................................................... 2482
Zenani, Anita ........................................................................ 4114

COPE Member rejoin ANC ................................................... 6500
Failure of the Western Cape Government to Support Youth at Risk .... 7043
Gugulethu Seven Massacre Anniversary ............................... 5268
Kayamandi Fire, Children Die ................................................ 4780
Khayelitsha Writing Forum ................................................... 4150
International Women’s Day .................................................... 5153
International Exhibition, Removal of ............................... 6415
National Reconciliation Day Celebrations ............................ 4939
No Violence Campaign, 16 Days of Activism ....................... 4697
Plight of street children ......................................................... 2571
Premier’s Appointment of Male MECS ................................. 3939
Premier’s Department, Employee Found Guilty ..................... 5866

Speaker’s Debate:
Women Redefining Leadership ............................................. 4075
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ............................................. 4757

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .................................................. 5361
Stabbing amongst Students in Schools ............................... 6378

Statements ........................................................................... 2343, 3934, 5829, 5855
Subject for discussion:
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ................................................................. 4191
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery .................................................................................................................. 4623
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ............................................................... 2188
Service Increased, Local Goods Procurement of .................................. 4560
Victims of Informal Settlements fires ..................................................... 5864
Victims of Kayamandi Shack Fires ......................................................... 7047
Violence against Women and Children, Praise to Akhona Meyi for Championing ending for ................................................................. 4561
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................................... 3813
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .................................................................. 4804
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
(Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ................................................... 4960
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .................................................................. 6728
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .............................................. 6775
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .................................................................. 7116
Women’s Day, Premier and Commemoration of .................................... 4136
Youth, International Year of ................................................................. 4147

HARRIS, T D (NCOP)
Premier: Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Opening Address of .................................................................................. 1502
Subject for discussion:
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ......................................................................................... 699

HARTNICK, J L
Cape Town Stadium, construction of .................................................... 2351
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ................................................................. 4151
Condolement, Motion of:
Arendse, Donigo, Family of ................................................................. 6317
Davids, Goliath .................................................................................... 6206
Deaths in shack fires in Kleinmond (J L Hartnick) ............................... 2483
Griebenouw, Susanna ........................................................................ 4009
Jenner, Ms Katrina ............................................................................. 1036
Michaels, Loveline ............................................................................. 6578
Mjongile, Songezo ............................................................................ 6317
Small, Adam ...................................................................................... 6204
Congratulations:
Amsterdam, Sasha-Lee ...................................................................... 4013
Bafana Bafana .................................................................................... 362
Du Toit, Natalie .................................................................................. 1644
Fatal injury of Gavin Engelke and Keenan van Wyk ............................ 2261
Farmworkers of the Year, 2009 ........................................................... 986
Goliath, Jackie, New Commercial Farmer of the Year ....................... 6373
Le Roux, Marlene .............................................................................. 2465
Oosthuizen, Louis ................................................................. 2373
Premier and Department .................................................... 6338
Pretty Yende ................................................................. 755, 2408
Prins, Megan-Geoffrey ...................................................... 4148
Springboks ........................................................................ 540,658.
Stellenbosch University Choir ............................................ 2410
Stellenbosch and Stellenberg Girls Choir ................................ 6335
Team Zealous of Stellenbosch High School ......................... 695
Tygerberg Children’s Choir .................................................. 2410
Transplant Sports Association Athletes ................................. 3950
Witzenberg Reel Dancers ..................................................... 4940
World Transplant Games ..................................................... 693
Laubsher, Eric Honoured ..................................................... 6412
Premier:
Opening Address of ............................................................. 1511
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................. 5073
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................. 6907
Premier, Consolidated Monitoring and Evaluation Report of .... 5906
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) .................................................. 4292
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011] (Consideration and finalisation) .............................. 4792
Speaker’s Debate:
Economic freedom of the Youth .......................................... 3956
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ........ 5243
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ............... 6276
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently .... 2357
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ......................... 83
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .............................................................. 560
Women Redefining Leadership ............................................. 4073
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ............................................. 4754
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
Children ............................................................................ 1138
Statements .......................................................... 302,586,597,652,740,779,901,929,1290,1584,1735,2115
............. 2250, 2344, 2398, 2456, 2469, 2511, 2549, 3934, 3997, 4092, 4166
.... 4549, 4691, 4933, 5146, 5296, 5773, 5893, 6254, 6361, 6489, 6564, 6604
................................................................. 7040
Subject for discussion:
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ....................... 2380
Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape ................. 6215
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ................. 667
Heritage Day ....................................................................... 809
Lack of development for young people .................................. 2271
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ......................... 6425
Taxi crash: wishes for speedy recovery .................................. 2569
Victims of houses burnt down in Khayelitsha, Heideveld and
Belhar .............................................................................. 2567
Victims of taxi disaster in Blackheath ..................................... 2520
Violence in schools ......................................................... 2257
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ....................................................... 1206
Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................................................1217
Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................................................1230
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .........................................................1312
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .......................................................................1325
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......................................1344
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .......................................................................................1354
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
   Vote 8 – Local Government .....................................................................................177
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................................................198
   Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................................................225
   Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................................................246
   Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .......................................................346
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ...................................376
   Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .....................................................................405
   Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .....................................................................................432
   Vote 11 – Agriculture ..................................................................................................493
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
   Second Reading .........................................................................................................1673
   Vote 14 – Local Government ....................................................................................1817
   Vote 8 – Housing .........................................................................................................1845
   Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................................................1866
   Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .....................................................................................1905
   Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ......................................................1956
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....................................2017
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..........................................................................2037
   Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .....................................................................2070
   Vote 11 – Agriculture ..................................................................................................2103
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................................................3610
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
   Vote 1 – Premier .........................................................................................................3805, 3848
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]
   – (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ...............................................................................4805
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
   (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ...............................................................................4809
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
   of Votes and Schedule) ..............................................................................................4961
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill3 - 2012]
   (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ....................................................................................5339
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4
   - Community Safety) ................................................................................................5478
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13
   - Cultural Affairs and Sport) ....................................................................................5509
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 –
   Health) .......................................................................................................................5544
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of
   Votes and Schedule) ................................................................................................5731
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B 1 - 2012]
   (Consideration and finalisation) ................................................................................5784
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
   (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ....................................................................................6732
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
   (Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) ....................................................................................7111
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
   (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport)................................. 7218
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 7 –
   Social Development)........................................................................... 7380
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 –
   Education)......................................................................................... 7430
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ...................... 7474
Young Adult Youth, Issue of................................................................. 16

HASKIN, G C R
Census 2011 on the Western Cape, Impact of........................................ 6403
Crime Statistics relating to Western Cape............................................... 6257
Closing ................................................................................................. 6791
Congratulations:
   Annual Charity Toy Run, to Organisers of .......................................... 6631
   Chaeli Campaign first Recipient of Medal for Social Activism ............ 5780
   Firmani, MR Duane.............................................................................. 6261
   Hudson, Roger.................................................................................... 5840
   Jim, Asenathi ...................................................................................... 5840
   Ndungu, Scientist Thumbi................................................................... 6453
Doping in School Sport........................................................................... 5777
Executive Statement............................................................................. 6194
Freedom of the City for Us President .................................................... 5861
Global Earth Hour ............................................................................... 7050
Growing Baboon Problem in Cape Town............................................... 6629
House, Business of ............................................................................. 6682
Illegal Advertising, Proliferation of...................................................... 6451
Increase in Street Children................................................................... 6628
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government .................... 5795
Safety Home Campaign........................................................................ 6251
SAA Cancellation of Flights................................................................. 5901
Service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Extension of MyCiti Bus,
   Cape Chamber of Commerce’s View.................................................... 5837
Socio-Economic Impact, Protest marches becoming Violent of ............. 5839
Statement ...................... 5725, 5775, 5834, 5856, 6199, 6315, 6402, 6448, 6490
................................................ 6599, 6626,
Speakers Debate:
   Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ....................... 6278
Subject for discussion:
   Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape............................ 6214
   Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ....................... 5879
   National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
      against Implementation of ............................................................... 5923
Results of Census 2011......................................................................... 6502
Strike in de Doorns, Farm workers......................................................... 6450
Temporary Relocation Areas................................................................... 6450
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ....................................... 6426
Princess Vlei Rezoning.......................................................................... 5902
Vigilantism in Khayelitsha................................................................. 5860
Water Scarce Resource...................................................................... 5838
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of
   Votes and Schedule)........................................................................ 5733
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012] (Consideration and finalisation) .......................................................... 5784
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) .................................................. 6663
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012] (Consideration and finalisation) .................. 6676
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) .......................................................... 6688
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ................ 6695
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ......................... 6702
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ......................... 6706
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ........ 6715
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) .................................................. 6721
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ........................................... 6728
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) .... 6761
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) .... 6763
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .................. 6775
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .................. 6781
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) .......................................................... 7068
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) .......................................... 7353
Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) .......................................................... 7464
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ......................................................................................... 7474

JACOBS, P M
Affordable Housing ........................................................................................................................................... 4140
Apology to Member Brown ................................................................................................................................. 2570
Amakhaya Ngoku Housing initiatives .................................................................................................................. 785
Central Karoo District municipality, Disaster Risk Management and Emergency Service in ................................... 4100
Condolence, Motion of:
  Mafikeng, Mama Elizabeth "Rocky" .................................................................................................................. 105
Congratulations:
  Bafana Bafana ................................................................................................................................................. 143
  World Cup Draw ............................................................................................................................................. 1108
DA’s Xenophobia ............................................................................................................................................ 2561
  Free housing policy, rethink of ......................................................................................................................... 905
Greenfields, Impact of on Housing Demand Database .......................................................................................... 3615
Housing and Serviced Sites Target ...................................................................................................................... 4001
Housing subsidies, Approval of .......................................................................................................................... 2226
Housing Subsidies, Failure to Allocate .................................................................................................................. 4004
Hout Bay, Building of new housing units in ........................................ 590
Initiation sites ....................................................................................... 2374
Informal Settlements, Appalling Living Conditions ............................... 4101
Investigation: misleading of House by Premier .................................... 906
Khayelitsha Fire, Four Children Die .................................................... 4150
Mandela Park Housing ......................................................................... 782
PHP: support by Department of Human Settlements ............................. 2122
Premier: ............................................................................................... 59, 1499
  Opening Address of ............................................................................. 59, 1499
  Premier, SOPA announcement ............................................................ 3615
  Premier’s SOPA announcement: debate .............................................. 1591
Radio appearances by Premier and Mayor of city of Cape Town .......... 2564
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ................................................................................... 4289
Speaker’s Debate:
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking........................................... 1619
  International Aids Day .................................................................... 1096
  Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and
  choices .................................................................................................. 569
Statements ......................................................................................... 13, 743, 1290, 2253, 2339, 2470, 4127
Subject for discussion:
  Conditions in places where poor people live .................................... 2536
  Heritage Day ...................................................................................... 818
  Housing development in Delft ............................................................... 1051
  Problems in Bitou Municipality .......................................................... 954
Unblocking of blocked housing projects .............................................. 2123
Unhealthy Conditions in TRAS ............................................................ 2405
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 1233
  Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ......................................... 1253
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................... 155
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 200
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................................... 1818
  Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................... 1840
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................... 3866

JENNER, I E
Premier: ............................................................................................... 51,1486
Speaker’s Debate:
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking........................................... 1612
  International Aids Day .................................................................... 1090
Subject for discussion:
  Freedom Day: 16 Years later ............................................................... 2184
  Heritage Day ...................................................................................... 821
  Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
  Role of Provincial Government in .................................................. 2434
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 1228,1237
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport.............................................187,204
  Vote 6 – Health............................................................................286
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport.............................................2027,2051

LABUSCHAGNE, C
Abused Women and Children in Western Cape .................................687
Behaviour Modification Programmes..............................................6367
Children’s Act, implementation of ...............................................2370
Cosatu’s Actions against National Youth wage Subsidy ....................5837
Condolence, Motion of:
  Gresak, Michael ........................................................................6333
  Kotze, Thelana ...........................................................................6204
  Mafu Linga ..................................................................................3767
  Mntini, Thabani ...........................................................................6371
  Mzingelwa, Uviwe .......................................................................7054

Congratulations:
  Imvumelwana Primary, Wallacedene ...........................................5843
  Kruger, Katryn ............................................................................6208
  Learners ......................................................................................5863
  Medical Emergency Staff and School Principal ..........................7056
  Peggy De Villiers ..........................................................................755
  Sdophumelela Secondary School, Learners of .........................5269
  WCED ..........................................................................................6338
  WCED on Higher matric Pass Rate ............................................5780
Caps, Readiness for Implementation ..............................................4135
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact
  on Communities ..........................................................................4151
  Final Examinations in Wynland District .......................................6499
  Good Luck to Matric Learners ....................................................6334
  Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ..........5792
New National Youth Agency ..........................................................143
President’s Support, Approval of commitment to Youth Wage Subsidy...5839
Premier:
  Opening Address of ....................................................................1542
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................5018
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................6921
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
  (Consideration) .........................................................................1116
Report on Study Visit, Standing committee on ................................5868
Rescinding of EFT Bill ...................................................................4941
Results and Effect of Grade 3,6 and 9 Testing ..................................7043
Safety of People, SAPS Responsible for .........................................5901
School Improvement Plan ..............................................................7045
Speaker's Debate:
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking .....................................1607
  Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship .............................91
  Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ....................................2435
  Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices................................................................577
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children........................................................................... 1130
Social Transformation Programme, Continuation of ....................... 689
Social Development attend COP17, Representatives of Western Cape Department of.................................................................................. 4783

Subject for discussion:

- Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape .... 551
- Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ........................... 665
- Lack of development for young people ........................................... 2263
- National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
  against Implementation of ............................................................... 5917
- Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ................................ 6419
- Teaching Programmes, Winter Holiday ......................................... 4145
- Teenage Pregnancies, Socio-Economic impact of ............................ 5860

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Consideration of principle ................................................................. 1175
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................. 1189
  Vote 7 – Social Development .......................................................... 1298
  Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 1361

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 220
  Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................... 255
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................. 290
  Vote 7 – Social Development .......................................................... 325

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................. 1713
  Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................... 1752
  Vote 7 – Social Development .......................................................... 1785
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................. 1933
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................ 1958
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ......................................... 2074

Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Modernisation Strategy of .......... 592

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 7 – Social Development .......................................................... 3652
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................. 3695
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................. 3716
  Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................... 3840

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ...................................................... 4813
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ............................................................. 4858
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
  (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ............................................ 4964
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ...................................................... 5389
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................. 6661
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) .............................. 6716
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 6 - Health) .......................... 7321
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ............................................. 7421

LENTIT, R B
Alcohol Syndrome Campaign Sanca Fetal .................................................. 6203
Closing ............................................................................................................ 6793
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof ........... 5750
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities .................................................. 4151
Condolence: Motion of:
Bloemerus, Ashley ................................................................. 4697
Charles, Shamiela death in Qatar Mall fire ................................................. 5869
Espafrica ......................................................................................... 3765
Gerwel, Jakes ....................................................................................... 6630
Oman, Imran death in Qatar Mall fire ....................................................... 5869
Congratulations: Motion of:
All Municipalites ...................................................................................... 5841
Artscape Management ............................................................................ 4116
Boland Summer Festival ........................................................................... 5729
City of Cape Town .................................................................................... 4105, 5845
City of Cape Town, Executive of .............................................................. 4183
Kallis, Sharief .......................................................................................... 4143
Night Schools .......................................................................................... 4100
Nelson, Marshall ..................................................................................... 4143
Rural Areas Development, Opportunities for Growth ............................. 4173
Curb Gangsterism, Avenues to ................................................................. 6367
Delft Resident Wayne Jafta ........................................................................ 6369
Education Outcome, Progress made to Improve ..................................... 4175
Executive Statement .................................................................................. 6193
Grandmother against Poverty and Aids ................................................... 6410
Gratitude and well wishes to Western Cape Traffic Department .............. 6572
Genetically Modified Foods, Status of ..................................................... 6405
Human Settlements, Integrated and Sustainable ...................................... 4176
Health Care Facilities, Construction and Upgrading of ......................... 5836
International Volunteers Day ...................................................................... 6632
Learners At Athlone School of the Blind returns as Educator ................... 7045
Night Shelters, Status .............................................................................. 6201
Premier:
Premier's State of the Province Address (Debate) ..................................... 5078
Project in Kuilsriver, “Adopt a Matriculant” ............................................. 5152
Rugby, Kaizer Chiefs in Transformation of .............................................. 6407
School Buses, Surveillance Cameras on .................................................... 4557
Season on Roads, Safe Festive ................................................................. 4936
Sexual Offences Act, Changes to .............................................................. 5861
Speaker's Debate:
Women Redefining Leadership ................................................................. 4084
Statement .................................. 3936, 4095, 4133, 4170, 4549, 4689, 4770, 4932, 5143, 5263, 5297, 5722, 5832, 5854, 6198, 6361, 6400, 6489, 6565, 6594, 6624, 7038
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ........................................ 4708
Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape ......................... 6216
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ........................................... 6387
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ...................... 5873
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ................................ 6425
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ..................................... 5168
Results of Census 2011 .................................................................. 6513
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ............................... 4574

Top Teachers Award ..................................................................... 6495

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 7 – Social Development ................................................... 3648, 3662
Vote 6 – Health ........................................................................... 3692
Vote 4 – Community Safety ....................................................... 3717

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ....................................................... 4862

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ................................. 4920

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .................................... 4955

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation)... 4974
Western Cape, Traffic Department Award ..................................... 5270

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) .................................... 5477

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ......................................................... 6659
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) ....................................................... 6722

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ....................................................... 6781

Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .......................................................... 7446
Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) .................................................... 7464

Woman and Children, 16 Days of Activism against abuse and violence of 6575
Youth, Strategies to Deal with Social Ills Affecting .............................. 5147

JOSEPH, D
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ................................. 5058

MADIKIZELA, B S
Premier:
Opening Address of ................................................................. 1481
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ................................. 5034
Speaker’s Debate:
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ............................... 86

Subject for Discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ........................................ 4704
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ....................................................... 2185
Housing development in Delft ..................................................... 1062
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Policing in Mitchells Plain</td>
<td>891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing</td>
<td>1243, 1255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 8 – Housing</td>
<td>145,165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 8 – Housing</td>
<td>1830,1853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 8 – Housing</td>
<td>3852, 3874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8- 2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements)</td>
<td>4891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements)</td>
<td>4901</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Consideration of Principle)</td>
<td>6656</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements)</td>
<td>6705, 6710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements)</td>
<td>7190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAGWAZA, N P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Africa Day</strong></td>
<td>5870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Botrivier, Service Delivery in</strong></td>
<td>5914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Child-headed households, plight of</strong></td>
<td>2299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof</strong></td>
<td>5742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Closure of Du Noon Child Welfare Office</strong></td>
<td>6409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Closure of Ottery Youth Care Centre</strong></td>
<td>6568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Condolence, Motion of:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drug-Trading Zones in Cape Town</td>
<td>6377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Galant, Jacoba; Jansen, Lodewyk; and Van Rooyen, Gert</td>
<td>2177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kimvango, Andy</td>
<td>4940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malindi, Lettie</td>
<td>2376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mhlanga, Lydia</td>
<td>5272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mputing, Mr W</td>
<td>909</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ngozi, Mr M M</td>
<td>838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27th Anniversary of Treacherous Trojan Horse Tragedy</td>
<td>6325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Congratulations:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homeless Soccer World Cup Tournament</td>
<td>753</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Government</td>
<td>5730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Disability Initiatives</strong></td>
<td>1128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dumping of babies and control measures</td>
<td>2519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eight lives lost in fire in Khayelitsha town two</td>
<td>2571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity Targets</td>
<td>5912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding for Nongovernmental Organisations</td>
<td>4139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fraudsters fired</td>
<td>5905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House, James, Houtbay</td>
<td>5272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government</td>
<td>5791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khayelitsha Schemes, Shutting down of Feeding</td>
<td>4173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minister of Education, Refuse to meet with Grabouw Learners</td>
<td>5140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Millennium Development Goals Youth Conference</td>
<td>6639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr J J Visser: Statement on Women during debate</td>
<td>610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Competency, Making of Academic Hospitals</td>
<td>5266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO’s in Province, Funding Cuts to</td>
<td>6265</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Partnering with non-profit organisations ........................................ 1745
Premier: ........................................................................................................................................... 54
  Opening Address of .................................................................................................................. 54
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................................................. 6932
Province, child abuse in .............................................................................................................. 905
Rape and Abuse Crisis under Provincial Government ....................................................... 7044
Removal of Babies from Place of Safety .................................................................................. 3940
Resignations, Current Trend ..................................................................................................... 4175
Saartjie Baartman Centre ......................................................................................................... 143
Safety and well-being of children over festive season ......................................................... 1294
Speaker’s Debate:
  Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ................. 5244
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking .............................................................................. 1609
  International Aids Day ......................................................................................................... 1091
  Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ................................................................. 93
  Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ........................................................................... 2433
  Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices ........................................ 575
  Women Redefining Leadership .......................................................................................... 4081
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women
    And Children ..................................................................................................................... 1132
Statements .. 11, 683, 2121, 2397, 2516, 4171, 5770, 5774, 5895, 6397, 6564 .................................................. 6593
Subject for discussion:
  Conditions in places where poor people live ................................................................. 2529
  Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ....................................................... 663
  Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats .................................................................................. 6463
  Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ........................................ 2491
Somalia, Relief Efforts in ......................................................................................................... 4142
Targeting of prostitutes ........................................................................................................... 833
TB Awareness Month ............................................................................................................. 5267
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................................................................... 1297
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle ................................................................................................. 132
  Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................................................. 226
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................................................. 288
  Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................................................................... 317
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 1 – Premier .............................................................................................................. 1758
  Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................................................................... 1781
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................................................. 1931
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
  Vote 7 – Social Development ......................................................................................... 3650
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
  (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................................... 4953
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ............................................................... 4966
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
  Of Principle)....................................................................................................................... 5315
  Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development ) ................................................................. 5417
MAJOLA, T R [DEPUTY SPEAKER with effect from 06/05/2009]
Announcement ................................................................. 1069
Burglary and vandalism of state-owned property .................. 2175
Condolence, Motion of:
  Mandulo, Nokulamla ...................................................... 4176
  Victims of taxi accident .................................................. 985
Congratulations, Motion of:
  Orlando Pirates ............................................................ 4109
Election of ........................................................................... 5
Premier: .............................................................................
Opening Address of ............................................................ 56, 1506
Rulings .............................................................................. 528, 1583, 2333, 3980, 5292, 5804
Speaker’s Debate:
  Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .......... 6274
  World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
    Against Women and Children ......................................... 4743
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
    Children ......................................................................... 1129
Statements ......................................................................... 654, 899, 2252, 5259
Subject for discussion:
  Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ................ 2378
  Lack of development for young people ............................. 2266
  National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
    against Implementation of ............................................ 5917
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 6 – Health .................................................................. 284
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009]
  Finalisation ........................................................................ 1081
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .............................. 3898
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
  of Votes and Schedule) ....................................................... 4960
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) .. 4974
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .......................... 4919
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 –
  (Provincial Parliament) ....................................................... 5552
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) .......................... 6780
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 –
  Provincial Parliament) ....................................................... 7435
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B5 - 2013]
  (Finalisation) ..................................................................... 7461

MAGAXA, K E –
ANC Honoured, Sixth President of ........................................ 5865
Cape Town Metropole, Unacceptable Conditions for poor People .......... 6265
Court Application, Backyard Dwellers Lodge .................................. 6410
Conclusions: Motion of
Cachalia, Amina ................................................................. 7058
Pheiffer, John................................................................. 6322
Inferior Service Delivery in Poor areas ................................ 7043
Housing Indaba ............................................................... 4692
Housing List for Eerste River and Blue Downs, City of
Cape Town ................................................................. 6317
Makhaza Toilets .............................................................. 6416
Minister of Housing, NO-Show of ........................................ 4693
Municipal Hostel, in Langa ................................................. 4553
Municipal IQ Hotspot Monitor Findings .................................. 5910
Poor infrastructure and under spending in Poor Areas in Western Cape. 6258
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ..................... 6909
Sanitation Problems in Khayelitsha ....................................... 6494
Statements ..................................................................... 4588, 5719, 5898, 6360
Speakers Debate:
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ............... 6287
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 .............................. 4717
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes .................................... 6386
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ....... 5249
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
against Implementation of .................................................. 5925
Toilets in Makhaza ............................................................ 6461
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) .................................. 4894
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ...................................................... 4967
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Principle) .................................................. 6655
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ............................... 7179
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ......... 7477
52nd Anniversary, Langa Massacres .................................... 5271
52nd Anniversary, Sharpville Massacres ............................... 5271
2012 Govan Mbeki Best Priority Project Award ....................... 5915

MARAI S, A J DU TOIT
Adult Education Award to 79-Year-Old Du Noon Resident – Motion...... 5157
Acknowledgement to Supt Nolan, Capt Dicks and Const Abrahams,
Atlantis ........................................................................... 1597
Alcohol and Drug abuse on Family system, Impact of .................. 362
Alternative approaches to BEE and development SMMEs ................ 2174
Anti-poverty strategy .......................................................... 2258
ANC’s Misperceptions with regards to Education in Cape ............... 5903
ANC’s Conduct in Provincial Parliament .................................. 620
Cease-Fire Between Israel and Hamas .................................... 6570
Children on Cape Flats, Massacre of ..................................... 6366
Condolence, Motion of:
Albertus, Ms Ulla ................................................................ 938
Blignaut, Ashley .................................................................. 4181
Johnson, Abe ...................................................................... 5842
Khumalo, Alfred ................................................................. 6372
Raad, Rina ........................................................................ 5843
Simons, Anna ...................................................................... 4325
Marks, Solly ........................................................................ 6375
Mother of Ms C Labuschagne, passing of ......................... 2124
Williams, Annetjie .............................................................. 6457

Congratulations:
Brackenfell High School .................................................... 754
Brown, Lynne ........................................................................ 7051
Bruintjies, Deon .................................................................. 785
Gebenga, Anelisiwe .............................................................. 2349
Goeieman, Annine................................................................. 4106
Health Occupations, Winners of Awards for ....................... 4783
Hon Wiley, M G E ............................................................... 5160
Jenner, Minister (Department of the Premier) ...................... 2351
Kadalie, Fennner .................................................................. 4111
Klatzow, Prof Peter .............................................................. 6202
Minister Leonard Max .......................................................... 2262
Minister of Health and His Department .............................. 6332
Mayor of Potchefstroom ...................................................... 6577
National Education Award .................................................. 5159
Nymbezi, Vinoria ................................................................. 5728
Skwatsha, Mcebisa ............................................................... 7051
Ranie Strydom ..................................................................... 757
Rescue Services and Firefighters .......................................... 7057
Obama, President Barack ................................................... 6454
Premier .................................................................................. 5160
Weideman, Philip ................................................................. 2230
Worcester Hospital Nursing School ..................................... 6632

DA Chairpersons and Vice-Persons Elected ......................... 6635
Drug Abuse ......................................................................... 4137
Early Childhood Development, Preschool and .................... 5150
Economic Empowerment and Development ....................... 5299
Elections, Gangsterism During Motion ................................. 5726
Executive Statement ............................................................ 6192
Family Expo in May ............................................................. 2232

Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ........ 5874
Health Care Systems in Rural Areas ...................................... 4318
Health, International Award to Western Cape Department .... 5154
Health Workers, Acknowledgement of Personnel of
Nelspoort, Beaufort West and Montagu Hospitals .................. 4108
Impact of HIV/AIDS and Violence ...................................... 6404
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government .... 5789
Minister Saves Saartjie Baartman Centre .............................. 5777
Municipal Election, Youth Contribution ................................ 3952
NSRI Rescue Operation: Crew of Seli 1 .............................. 752
Older Persons Act, implementation of .................................. 2370
Organ Donor Month ............................................................. 612
Open Fields, Women Raped in ............................................. 4603
Oversight role of Provincial Parliament, Importance of ......... 2259
Preparedness for epidemics .................................................. 1590
Primary Health Care Services Delivery ............................... 7043
Province, Anti-Poverty Strategy in ....................................... 690
Proportional Parliament, Oversight role of .................................................. 748
Recognition to First-Aid Services following Bus Accident ....................... 7054
Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration
Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health – (Consideration) ........................................................................................................ 4270
Rich diversity of Culture ........................................................................... 5835
Rosh Hashanah ......................................................................................... 6207
Rural Areas, Socio-Welfare and economic circumstances in .................. 746
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................................. 6942
Sign language, recognition of in communities ........................................ 2371
Service Delivery, Impact of ................................................................. 5148
Speaker’s Debate:
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ............... 5248
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking................................................... 1617
International Aids Day ......................................................................... 1087
Women Redefining Leadership .......................................................... 4081
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence Against Women and Children ............................................................. 4745
Statements ...................................................................................... 11, 528, 583, 652, 776, 898, 1009, 1741, 2118, 2253, 2362, 2473, 2515, 4095, 4170, 4688, 4932, 5144, 5723, 5828, 5829, 5854, 5897, 6195, 6308, 6397, 6488, 6591, 67035
Social Inclusion, Principles and Concept of ........................................ 4172
Subject for discussion:
Conditions in places where poor people live ...................................... 2528
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ............................................................... 4189
Economic Empowerment and Development, Success Achieved in Respect of .......................................................... 5805
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery .................................................................................... 4624
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ...................... 5873
Heritage Day ......................................................................................... 817
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ............................ 661
Lack of development for young people ............................................... 2269
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats .................................................. 6462
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ..................................................... 5164
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government .......... 2454
Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports ................................................. 6592
Policing in Mitchells Plain .................................................................. 887
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas .. 846
Stragegy against Violence against Woman and Children ................. 7041
Thanks to Disaster Control Centre .......................................................... 1597

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 6 – Health ..................................................................................... 1182
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................................. 1267
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................... 1295
Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................................. 1367

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle .................................................................... 134
Vote 1 – Premier .................................................................................. 230
Vote 6 – Health ..................................................................................... 278
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................... 316
Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................................. 474
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ........................................ 1722
  Vote 1 – Premier .................................................. 1764
  Vote 7 – Social Development ...................................... 316
Social Development .................................................. 1779
  Vote 6 – Health .................................................... 1923
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ........................... 2158
Western Cape, Free pap smears for Women in ..................... 594
Western Cape Hospitals, Security and Safety of .................. 537
2010 Soccer World Cup Tournament, disaster management readiness during ........................................ 932
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 7 – Social Development ...................................... 3646
  Vote 6 – Health .................................................... 3690
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ...................................... 3718
  Vote 1 – Premier .................................................. 3815
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................. 3605
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ..................................... 4862
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011]
  (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) 4955
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4
  - Community Safety) ............................................ 5485
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13
  - Cultural Affairs and Sport) ................................... 5513
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 –
  Health) ............................................................... 5535
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 –
  Agriculture) ....................................................... 5651
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ..................................... 6724
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 6 - Health) ..................................... 7313
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013 ] (Debate on Vote 4 –
  Community Safety) ................................................ 7355
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 7 –
  Social Development) ............................................... 7373
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) .... 7481
110% Green Campaign ............................................. 5904

MAX, L H
Premier: ........................................................................ 44
Opening Address of ................................................................ 44
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
  Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) .. 1275
Speaker's Debate:
  16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
    Children ................................................................... 1135
Subject for discussion:
  Housing development in Delft ........................................ 1054
  Policing in Mitchells Plain ......................................... 895
  Safety on public transport in Western Cape ..................... 2232
  Statements made by Premier ..................................... 620
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in ........................................ 2417

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................. 1256, 1269

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................. 443,475

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................. 1690,1724

MBALO, BG
Condolences: Motion of
Lunguza, Ntombizodwa ................................................. 6496
Ndleni, Bongile ............................................................. 6570
Sigcau, Nondwe ............................................................ 6375
Berg River Municipality, Sale of Land .................................. 4317
Cape Nature Outsources Culling to Farmers ......................... 6414
Climate Change, Cape Town Preparedness for ..................... 4693
Mayoral committee members, Racist Tactics of ..................... 5900
Mossel Bay Municipality Mayor, Racist Stance of ................. 5912
Shout Foundation, Salutation to ....................................... 3770
Statement ........................................................................ 6601

Subject for discussion:
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ................................ 5167
Translation problems in Legislature ....................................... 6405
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) .................................................................. 4286
UN Summit on Global Warming COP 17 ......................... 4698

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 1 – Premier .......................................................... 3807, 3808

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development
Planning) ........................................................................ 4867

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ....................................... 6737

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development
Planning ) ........................................................................ 7286

McKENZIE, P C
Actions by DA Councillor of Elsies River, Bertha Esbach .......... 1010
Activist Anton Frans, Anniversary of Death of ..................... 4701
Ammunition seized by police in Athlone ............................... 933
Apology by ...................................................................... 968
ATM Bomings ................................................................... 5907
Attitude of Speaker in staff meeting ................................... 935
Brutal and deadly attacks on policemen and women ............ 833
Chairperson of Standing Committee on Community Safety:
Incompetence .................................................................. 657
Call on Premier Zille, Replace of MEC for Community Safety ... 5845
Celebrations of Life, Third Centenary of Adam Kok ............ 4115
City council: official demoted ........................................... 2344
City of Cape Town, Proposed Transfer of Land ................. 38
Changing of Culture of Our People .................................... 6330
Community Safety, Gang Plan, Comments by MEC of ........................................ 5838
Condition of Flats in Leonsdale: Terrible ................................................................. 2406
Condolence, Motion of:
Level Crossing Accident, Death of two (P Mckenzie) ......................................... 5869
Naidoo, Mr Vincent .................................................................................................... 751
Scholtz, Maxi .............................................................................................................. 1891
Steers, Mujahied ........................................................................................................ 6633
Road Disaster near Lainsburg Claims Nineteen Victims ........................................... 4702
Victims killed in Gang Violence ............................................................................... 6323
Williams, Annie ......................................................................................................... 6498
Congratulations:
Bishop Lavis Police Officers .................................................................................... 4012
Hartnick, Jenny ......................................................................................................... 6336
Liverpool .................................................................................................................. 939
Minister of Health ..................................................................................................... 2483
Petros, Gen ............................................................................................................... 2478
Springboks ................................................................................................................ 692
WP Rugby .................................................................................................................. 838
National Departments .............................................................................................. 4116
DA Snubs Indigenous People .................................................................................... 4135
DA Programme: Road to 2011 .................................................................................. 655
DA public representative accused of rape ............................................................... 2347
Deployments by Premier in Western Cape .............................................................. 2561
Drug dealers, Marches against ............................................................................... 606
Drugs Seized in Goodwood ....................................................................................... 5728
Electrocuted, Two Young Girls ............................................................................... 4149
Fellow Learners, Rape of 16-year old boy by ......................................................... 6377
Gang Violence in Townships .................................................................................... 4138
Gang-Related Violence in Cape ............................................................................... 4555
Incorporation of municipal police in SAPS ............................................................ 1893
Inquiry into Policing, Commission of .................................................................... 6404
Impact of HIV/AIDS and Violence – Motion ......................................................... 6404
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government .................................... 5795
Lufthansa Flights from Munich to Cape Town ....................................................... 6267
Khayelitsha Protest, Policeman injured in ................................................................ 612
Maintenance of Flats in Townships ........................................................................ 2477
Members, Executive Paid to go on Huntrign Trip of ............................................. 4554
MEC for Community Safety: Role and Duties ....................................................... 609
MEC: Leaking of SAPS information and attack on Commissioner ....................... 362
Mitchells Plain Policing and Vigilantism ................................................................. 749
Money paid to Premier ............................................................................................ 4002
National Minister of Police ....................................................................................... 2375
National Competencies, Usurpation of ................................................................. 5910
Non-attendance of committee clerk: no committee meeting held ...................... 1643
Official of City Council demoted .......................................................................... 2344
Plight of residents of Leonsdale ............................................................................. 2260
Police Officers, Cape Town Metropolitan ............................................................. 4140
Possession of Drugs, Arrest of 27 People in Mitchells Plain for .......................... 6377
Premier:
Premier Address of ................................................................................................. 1528
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............................................... 5076
Removal, Community Safety for ........................................................................... 5845
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
On Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010]
(NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010]
(NCOP)(Consideration) ........................................................................ 3563
SAPS, Commendation to .................................................................... 6579
SAPS, Acts against Drug Dealers ........................................................ 6638
Service delivery, Derica Lambrechts in Townships on ...................... 5836
Speaker’s Debate:
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women.......................................... 2442
Sports Day, Change of date of ............................................................ 688
Women Redefining Leadership ......................................................... 4089
Statements .................. 102,651, 830, 970, 2254, 2400, 3759, 4095, 4125, 5298
............................................................. 5724, 6313, 6401, 6623
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ...................................... 4715
Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools.............................. 2385
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .......................................................... 4184
Housing development in Delft ............................................................ 1060
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats .............................................. 6470
Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ..................... 672
Policing in Mitchells Plain ............................................................... 879
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .................................. 2238
Statements made by Premier ......................................................... 630
Summonses served on unemployed tenants in townships ............. 2300
Unhealthy and Dangerous Sanitation .............................................. 4138
Unruly conduct of Ravensmead DA councillor ............................. 835
Violence on our trains .................................................................... 2175
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle ............................................................... 1164
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................. 1260
Consideration of Votes and Schedules .......................................... 1389
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................. 466
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................. 1714
Woodstock Police Station, Crime situation around and its proposed
move ............................................................................................ 2175
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................. 3719, 3725
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ...................................... 4849
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ................................................................. 4962
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
Of Principle) ............................................................................. 5319
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4
- Community Safety) ................................................................. 5481
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ...................................... 6703
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................... 6741
515 Suspects in Mitchells Plain, Arrest of .................................... 6457
MEYER, I
Premier: .................................................................................................................68, 1472
   Opening Address of............................................................................................68, 1472
   Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)...........................................5069
   Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)...........................................6902
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
   (Consideration)....................................................................................................4304
Speaker’s Debate:
   Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .......................................6289
   Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking..............................................................1621
   16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and Children ............1144
Subject for discussion:
   Empowerment and Development, Success
      Achieved in Respect of .....................................................................................5805
   Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape.................555
   Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government...........................2488
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ..................................................4569
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
   Vote 7 – Social Development ...........................................................................1294, 1302
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
   Consideration of principle ..................................................................................137
   Vote 7 – Social Development ...........................................................................307
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
   Vote 7 – Social Development ...........................................................................1770, 1792
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ..................................................................3590, 3612
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
   (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............................................4912, 4918
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13
   - Cultural Affairs and Sport) ..............................................................................5485, 5514
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
   (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................................6640
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
   (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............................................6760, 6768
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of
   Principle) ...........................................................................................................7083
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
   (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............................................7197, 7219

MQULWANA, K A
Bus accident in Kloofnek Road, Senior Citizens in ..............................................750
City of Cape Town, IRT System in ........................................................................934
City of Cape Town: Public Transport Plan ..........................................................536
Congratulations:
   Muslim community ............................................................................................1069
Condolence, Motion of:
   People involved in car crash .............................................................................983
Demolition of places of worship by City of Cape Town ......................................1642
Eid: 27 November 2009 .........................................................................................1107
Football world cup: gratitude to citizens .............................................................2372
International Children’s Day ...............................................................................2303
Parliamentary Committees: Importance and impact ............................................657
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject for discussion:</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conditions in places where poor people live</td>
<td>2538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape</td>
<td>991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety on public transport in Western Cape</td>
<td>2234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas</td>
<td>849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tik dealers receiving grants</td>
<td>784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport crisis: Government's response</td>
<td>607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of principle</td>
<td>1155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>1322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Reading</td>
<td>1664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury</td>
<td>1903</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>1959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>2066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of Votes and Schedules</td>
<td>2158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of principle</td>
<td>1081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCEDANA, M</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biko, Steve Bantu Bonke, Commemoration of</td>
<td>6205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing</td>
<td>1391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condolence, Motion of:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbiko, Ms Neti</td>
<td>1040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sikani: Member of Cope</td>
<td>2232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vuba, Thobeka</td>
<td>4937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congratulations:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaizer Chiefs and Orlando Pirates</td>
<td>989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPPS who Graduated</td>
<td>4703</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paralympic Team South Africa</td>
<td>6203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dirt in which Poor People Live</td>
<td>7044</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Recession</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filthy areas the poor live in</td>
<td>1593</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guns During Evictions, use of</td>
<td>4693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heavy rains in Western Cape</td>
<td>2227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of job opportunities for emerging businesses in Western Cape</td>
<td>2563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offloading of Corpses</td>
<td>1745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paarl, Houses to be Built</td>
<td>4005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People Affected by Rains</td>
<td>4002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening Address of</td>
<td>1495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements made by Premier</td>
<td>2396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate)</td>
<td>6919</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Consideration and finalisation)</td>
<td>4785</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Public school problems and resources ................................................................. 836
Speaker's Debate:
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future ......................... 5246
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ................................. 6279
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .............. 564
Statements ........................................................................................................... 531,777, 828, 973, 1006, 1104,1285,1289,1739
.......................................................................................................................... 2294, 2340, 2551, 3998, 4094, 4168, 4768
.......................................................................................................................... 4931, 5771, 5852, 6359, 6398
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 .......................................................... 4722
Conditions in places where poor people live ..................................................... 2524
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in ............................................................................ 4192
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ................................................................ 6382
Housing development in Delft ........................................................................... 1057
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession 695
Policing in Mitchells Plain ................................................................................... 888
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ......................................................... 2240
Statements made by Premier ............................................................................ 628
Unemployment, high rate of ............................................................................... 2347
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape – Role of Provincial Government in ........ 2418
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in ................................................. 4568
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle ................................................................................... 1161
Vote 5 – Education ................................................................................................ 1223
Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ............................................................. 1248
Vote 7 – Social Development ............................................................................. 1300
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................................................ 1374
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................................................... 1388,1390
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 8 – Housing .................................................................................................. 159
Vote 8 – Local Government .................................................................................. 179
Vote 7 – Social Development .............................................................................. 319
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ............................................................................... 427
Vote 4 – Community Safety ............................................................................... 464
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 14 – Local Government .............................................................................. 1816
Vote 8 – Housing .................................................................................................. 1847
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ............................................................................ 2136
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................................................... 2157
Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] ..................................................................................................................... 3990
Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill [B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ................................................................. 4945
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ......................................................................................... 4961
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ......................................................................................... 4968
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) .4974
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle) ........ 5312
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ................................................................. 5413
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 - Community Safety) ................................................................. 5479
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 - Cultural Affairs and Sport) ......................................................... 5507
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ................................................................................. 5538
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 – (Provincial Parliament) ................................................................. 5562
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ................................................................. 5588
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ................................................................. 5704
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) .................................................................................... 7072
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ................................................................. 7185
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ......................................................... 7216
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 7354, 7356
Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ........................................................................... 7463
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) .............................................................................................................. 7475

NTWANAMBI, N D
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................................. 1488
Subject for discussion:
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession .......................................................... 705

OZINSKY, M
Ad hoc Committee:
Appointment .......................................................................................... 4593
Investigation into possible misleading of House by Minister ............... 103
Agricultural Areas, Failure of Standing Committee to make Intervention in Uprising in ................................................................. 6629
Audit reports not yet considered by SCOPA: debate .......................... 1594
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ............... 2572, 2589
Cape Nature CEO not Named ................................................................. 5777
Cape Nature: public/private partnerships ............................................ 1591
Cape Nature Kills Leopard without Permit ........................................ 4773
Condolences: Motion of Isaacs, Sedick .................................................. 6370
Conflict in de Doorns, Defusing of ....................................................... 6450
Condolences: Motion of Msabala, Christopher ................................... 7053
Peterson, Rafeeq ................................................................................... 6451
Congratulations:
Department of Science and Technology, Sun Space and University of Stellenbosch .................................................................. 789
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject for discussion:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Premier:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening Address of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier's State of the Province Address (Debate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Province, Violence in Sport in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Auditor-General: Contracts given to Civil Servants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of Standing Committee on Public Accounts on Consideration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual Report Resolutions, 2009/2010, on Department of Health – (Consideration)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role of Mr Walters in encouraging Overstrand Municipality to commission report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOPA Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaker's car accident</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaker's Debate:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence Against Women and Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements... 598, 928, 1637,1736,2116,2168, 2292, 2551, 3762, 4548, 4771</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject for discussion:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity Share Land Reform Schemes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom Day: 16 Years later</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policing in Mitchells Plain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removal of small business traders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results of Census 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supply chain management and role of speaker and politicians in awarding of tenders and contracts – Motion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of principle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ............................................................. 1673
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............ 2009
Vote 11 – Agriculture ...................................................... 2107
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ........................................... 2138
Consideration of Votes and Schedules .................................. 2158

Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill [B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) .......................................................... 3984

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 4 – Community Safety .............................................. 3723
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning............ 3784

Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill [B4-2011] .......................................................... 3993

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) .................................................................. 4869

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
Of Principle) .................................................................. 5324

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 –
Human Settlements) ......................................................... 5590

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements) ............................... 6707

Western Cape Government Absent from Deputy President’s Speech
At NCOP ........................................................................ 7042

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration
Of Principle) .................................................................. 7082

Xenophobic violence in province ........................................... 2369
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in .................................. 2414

PAULSE, S U
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .... 913
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .................. 2580
Closing ........................................................................... 1392
Premier: ........................................................................... 63,1505
Opening Address of ................................................................ 2396
Statements made by Premier .................................................. 2396

Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) ................................................................ 1113

Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) .. 1276

Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ................................... 803

Speaker’s Debate:
Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ......................... 91
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women .................................. 2437
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and
Choices ........................................................................... 568
16 Days of Activism opposing Violence against Women and
Children ............................................................................. 1139

Statements ................................................................. 533,652,684,743,779,902,929,975,1034,1286,1291,2119,
................................................................. 2222,2254, 2296, 2365, 2456, 2474, 2515, 2556
Subject for discussion:
- Conditions in places where poor people live ............................................. 2528
- Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools ......................................... 2384
- Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .............................. 989
- Housing development in Delf .................................................................... 1051
- Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ......... 551
- Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .................................. 667
- Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ........................................... 699
- Lack of development for young people ....................................................... 2265
- Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ................. 2490
- Policing in Mitchells Plain ...................................................................... 890
- Problems in Bitou Municipality ................................................................ 950
- Removal of small business traders ............................................................ 2318
- Safety on public transport in Western Cape ............................................. 2236
- Thanks and good wishes to Dr Boesak .................................................... 987

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
- Consideration of principle ........................................................................ 1154
- Vote 6 – Health ....................................................................................... 1188
- Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................................ 1211
- Vote 5 – Education ................................................................................ 1226
- Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................................... 1236
- Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing .............................................. 1250
- Vote 4 – Community Safety ................................................................... 1267
- Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ................................................... 1325
- Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury .................................................................... 1355
- Vote 1 – Premier ..................................................................................... 1366
- Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................................. 1376

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
- Consideration of principle ........................................................................ 124
- Vote 8 – Housing .................................................................................... 161
- Vote 8 – Local Government .................................................................... 181
- Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ......................................................... 201
- Vote 5 – Education ................................................................................ 255

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
- Second Reading ....................................................................................... 1663
- Vote 4 – Community Safety .................................................................... 1711
- Vote 11 – Agriculture ............................................................................. 2105
- Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ................................................................. 2137
- Consideration of Votes and Schedules ..................................................... 2157

Western Cape road infrastructure ................................................................. 935

Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009]
- Consideration of principle .................................................................... 1081

PLATO, D
- Premier:
  - Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .............................. 6902
- Speakers Debate:
  - Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity ..................... 6286
- Subject for Discussion:
  - Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .............. 5252
  - Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats .............................................. 6469, 6471
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 5462
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 5488
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 7357
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ............ 7464, 7483

PRETORIUS, P J C
Closure of Umyezo Wama-Apile School AND Implications thereof…….. 5742
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government ................. 5787
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on
National Health Amendment Bill [B24d - 2011] (NCOP)
(Consideration) ........................................................................ 6520
Report on Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Amendment
Bill [B33 - 2012] (NCOP) (Consideration) ........................................ 6520
Ruling: .................................................................................. 5693, 5742, 5785, 5825, 6364, 6996
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration Of Principle)................................................................. 5304
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Finalisation) .......... 5736
Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) ..................................................... 5783
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ................................................. 6739
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ...................................... 6787
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Finalisation) ........................................................................... 6788
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 7081
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety) ................................................................. 7334
Western Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Consideration of Votes and Schedules) ................................................................. 7461
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ............ 7464

PRINS, E
Baboon Management Contract .......................................................... 537
Condolence, Motion of:
Malan, Ms Marie ......................................................................... 2179
Vollenhoven, Aunt Tatie ................................................................. 6260
Congratulations:
Drum Majorettes, Eight of SWD .................................................. 2464
Kairos Drama Group of Heidelberg .............................................. 5781
Meerendal Wine Estate on gold medal ........................................... 1892
Nicholls, Nelson .......................................................................... 3949
Semenya, Castor .......................................................................... 2480
Springboks .................................................................................. 754
Corruption in Swellendam Municipality ...................................... 4004
Corruption in Provincial Department ............................................ 6405
Councillor Mattheys Koch’s Failure to Declare his Interests .......... 3616
International Human Rights Day .................................................. 4940
Drought assistance to farmers ...................................................... 2300
Eviction of Farm Workers ................................................................. 4005
Farms: violating health and remuneration legislation .................... 2370
Farm Project, Agri Dwala Empowerment ......................................... 4700
Farm Workers, Speedy recovery involved in Bus Accident ............... 4608
Matters Pertaining to Farmworkers .................................................. 6493
Poor Service delivery with Housing in Oudtshoorn ......................... 2477
Premier:
Premier's State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................... 6923
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) .............................................................................. 4300
Shop Owners, Bad Behaviour against Poor People ......................... 4174
Speaker's Debate:
Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ....... 2354
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ......................................................... 4755
Statements ............... 532,1292,1585,2220, 2399, 3997, 4313, 5772, 6446, 6487
Subject for Discussion:
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ............................................... 6381
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .................. 5882
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas ......................................................... 842
Swellendam Municipality: offences, anomalies and bottlenecks ....... 2346
Vehicles, Farm workers Transported on back of ......................... 5148
Violence Against Farm Dwellers ...................................................... 5915
Water Wastage by City of Cape Town ............................................ 6454
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture..................................................................... 1207
Western Cape Agricultural Sector, awards in ................................ 907
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 382
Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................................... 491
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 2015
Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................................... 2098
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................................... 3627
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ...................................... 4834
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................. 4907
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 –
Agriculture).................................................................................. 5655

ROSSOUW, A
Absence to Speaker, leave of ......................................................... 4593
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner........ 913
Ad Hoc Committee, replacement of Mr E J von Brandis on .......... 832
ANC Government on Service Delivery, Negative impact of .......... 15
Appointment: Temporary Chairpersons ........................................ 7
Rules Committee .............................................................................. 7
Boston, USA World Floral Art Show in ............................................ 4146
Chronic medication: serious shortage of ....................................... 2371
Condolence, Motion of:
Asmal, Kader ................................................................. 3977
Maroem, Mr E C ........................................................... 39
Meintjies, Frits and Berno ............................................... 6320
Rheenenndal Area, School Bus Accident ......................... 4319
Young People die in Car Accident ................................... 4779

Congratulations:
Barnard, Mr Jimmy ....................................................... 4505
Cloete, Mr Anthony, Top Performer at Cape Agri Academy .... 1108
Du Toit, Natalie ............................................................ 6451
Fortuin, Chantel ........................................................... 2349
Jewish Community ....................................................... 753
Jonkbloed, Zelda ......................................................... 6206
Gouws, Prof R H ............................................................ 6209

Gugulethu Seven, President of Benin Awards Families of:
Hanekom, Sandra ......................................................... 4782
Heritage Cape On Tenth Anniversary .............................. 6409
Hunter, Mr Tony ............................................................. 6454
Koster John .................................................................. 3771
Luyt, Margot ................................................................. 6209
Maritz, Jan ..................................................................... 2305
Mayor of Cape Town ..................................................... 6329
MPP Jennifer Hartnick ..................................................... 2464
Muslims on Ramadan .................................................... 611
Steyn, Elize ................................................................. 2349

Discharged from Ad Hoc Committee, Mr E J von Brandis .... 837
Eskom tariff increase and top management ......................... 1010
House, Business of ....................................................... 2165, 2250, 4545, 4929, 5276, 3736, 5741, 5804, 6896, 7299
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government .... 5789
Misrepresentations by ANC .............................................. 834
Money-lenders and shebeen owners: effect and impact of ........ 2371
NCOP, Permanent delegates to ....................................... 5
NCOP, Delegates to, Authority to Vote .............................. 6
Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act ............................................. 266
Premier, Remuneration of .............................................. 1084
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ............... 758
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) .................................................. 4280
Report of Rules Committee on amendments to standing Rules (Consideration) .................................................. 4562
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) ............................................... 4613
Road Accident Fatalities .................................................. 6413
Safe Transportation of Learners ...................................... 2518
Sitting, Hours of ............................................................ 1802
Speaker's Debate:
Economic Freedom of the Youth ..................................... 3965
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .... 5252
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ............................ 2439
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and
SKWATSHA, M
Ambulance Services and Response time, State of ............................................. 749
Atlantis integrated transport system ................................................................. 2559
AD Hoc Committee, Appointment of ................................................................. 4007
Bafana Bafana, Support for .................................................................................. 307
DA Elective Procedures ........................................................................................ 6493
Casino: establishment of second casino in Metropole ........................................ 2368
Clinics, Shocking state of ..................................................................................... 4173
Chronic Medicine, Chaos with dispensing of ...................................................... 5859
Chronic Medicine, Incorrect labelling of ............................................................. 5873
Condolence, Motion of:
Cravez, Hugo ........................................................................ 7050
Death of People after Collision of taxi and truck .................... 2480
Death of Seven Members of Family after eating Cooked Mushrooms ..................................................... 6269
Gillwald, Cheryl .................................................................... 2407
January, Joseph ..................................................................... 6408
Kasrils, Eleanor ...................................................................... 1011
Khumalo, Alf ............................................................................ 6374
Madikwa, Nomvelo "Rayl" .................................................... 617
Maxenza, Const Daniel ............................................................ 1893
Meer, Ms Fatima ..................................................................... 1643
Mkunqana, Simphiwe .............................................................. 6324
Mkhiza, Gavin ....................................................................... 7055
Myethu, Themba ..................................................................... 6406
Ndziba, Ngcondo ................................................................... 107
Ngcukana, Ezra ....................................................................... 2407
Nxu, Xolile Death of Vice-President of SAMWU ..................... 5871
Sisulu, Zwelakhe .................................................................... 6317
Ting Ting Masanga ................................................................. 787
Yengeni, Mr ........................................................................... 836

Congratualtions:
Bafana Bafana ....................................................................... 694, 2568, 4108
Chabaku, Motlalepula ............................................................. 5845
Comrade James Ngculu .......................................................... 1070
DA-run municipalities: incompetence of to secure base camps for Decade's child rights heroes: Nelson Mandela and
Graça Machel ........................................................................ 1039
Deputy Speaker on 18 August 2009, Behaviour of .................... 691
Expenditure of ratepayers' money ............................................ 2561
Fifa World Cup .................................................................... 2346
Fish, Liz ............................................................................... 3948
ID-ANC Coalition .................................................................. 2403
Gugulethu Seven, President of Benin Awards Families of .......... 4938
Mandela, Nelson: 92nd birthday .............................................. 2375
Mandela, Nelson Rolihlahla .................................................... 4700
Martin, Prof Lorna ................................................................. 4559
Mayoral Committee Member, Untoward Behaviour by .......... 5868
Mbulawa, Ms Bukelwa ........................................................... 4561
Saldanha Municipality ............................................................ 988
Kenny Africa, Appointment of ............................................... 2225
Killing of Mqonqshi and Ncatana couple in Philippi East ......... 752
UDF .................................................................................... 4180
Cape Town Doctor Resuscitates Boy After Near-Drowning .......... 6634
Correctional Service Officer, Immoral Act Between Police Woman ......................................................... 4177
Deaths at Rail Level Crossings ................................................ 4003
Department of Health, 83 Cases of FIU register ......................... 6459
Fires in Kanana informal Areas, Gugulethu ............................. 6577
Health Insurance, Green Paper on ........................................ 4182
Health Department, Wasteful Expenditure by ......................... 5299
HIV Campaign, Get Tested and ............................................. 4774
Increase in Rats .................................................................... 5908
Lack of Service delivery by DA Western Cape Government .......... 5787, 5789
MEC Botha’s Intimidating DA Member .................................................. 6501
Premier: .............................................................................................. 44, 1477
Opening Address of ............................................................................ 4784
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
(Consideration and finalisation) .................................................. 1273
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ...................... 6934
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ...................... 5028
President Zuma Re-Elected .............................................................. 7048
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament (Consideration) ........ 792
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ............................................. 5154
Seasonal Diseases, Victims of .......................................................... 6636
St Luke’s Hospice .............................................................................. 4557
Statements.................................................................................. 98,742,972,1035,1636,1740, 2458, 2474, 3999, 4169, 4550
........................................................................................................ 4591, 4766, 4934, 5142, 6626
Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape .................................................. 6344
Crime, Initiative to Prevent in .................................................. 4193
Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving
Delivery .......................................................................................... 4618
Freedom Day: 16 Years later .................................................. 2182
Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of ............ 5875
Loss of Children’s Live on Cape Flats ........................................... 6466
Removal of small business traders ............................................. 2315
Safety on public transport in Western Cape .................................. 2244
Unguarded Rail Crossings ............................................................. 2518
Tygerberg Hospital ......................................................................... 4553

Speaker’s Debate:
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children .................................................. 4747
Tygerburg hospital, Gratitude to .................................................. 6573

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle ............................................................. 1151
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .................................................. 1376
Consideration of Votes and Schedules ......................................... 1389

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Consideration of principle ............................................................. 122
Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament .................................................. 520

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ............................................................. 1900
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ....................... 1954
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .......................................... 2071

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works .......................................... 3901

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ............................................................. 4860

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
of Votes and Schedule) ............................................................. 4964

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] – (Debate on Vote 6 –
Health) ...................................................................................... 5539
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Consideration of Principle) ........................................... 6664
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 6 – Health) ........................................ 6722
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 6 - Health) ......................................................... 7315
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament) ..................................... 7442

STALI, Z C
ANC, Veterans Honoured by ........................................................ 5155
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ........ 2577
Cape Town Motorist Hazel Souma ........................................... 5273
Chapman’s Peak Rockfall ....................................................... 6316
City of Cape Town, Mycity Vehicle operation Companies Upset ... 6575
Community Safety, Remarks by Minister ................................. 4099
Condolence, Motion of:
Asmal, Kader ........................................................................... 3977
Shiceka, Former Minister Sicelo ............................................. 5779
Member Nyanda, Florence ....................................................... 5779
Congratulations: Motion of:
Bafana Bafana ........................................................................ 3766
Fugard, Athol .......................................................................... 4010
Jonson, Denver ........................................................................ 4110
Manyonga, Luvo ..................................................................... 2410
Mpetha, Family ....................................................................... 4104
Minister Fikile Mbalula, Cape Argus Cycle Tour .................... 5274
Orlando Pirates ....................................................................... 3949
SAFA ......................................................................................... 3769
Vasco da Gama Football Club ................................................ 1595
Vergotine, Valentino ............................................................... 4110
Failure to Deal with Taxi Conflict ........................................... 7041
Funds, Maintenance Lack of ................................................... 4139
Looming Strikes at Bus Rapid Transport System ..................... 7041
Mitchells Plain Hospital, Construction of ................................. 4137
Name Changes ........................................................................ 1745
N1 “Road of Death”, Ongoing Carnage on ............................... 4694
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) ............................................................... 4306
Premier:
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) .................... 5055
Speaker’s Debate:
Economic Freedom of the Youth ............................................. 3967
Statements ...... 2171, 2340, 4093, 4130, 4687, 4930, 5260, 6253, 6399, 6566, 6597, 7036
Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in ........... 6339
Taxi Violence in Western Cape ............................................. 6339
Empowerment and Development, Success
Achieved in Respect of ......................................................... 5805
Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in .................. 4571
Transport System, Bus Rapid ................................................ 4555
Utilisation of Stadiums in Western Cape ................................. 2476

(liv)
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 5 – Education ................................................................. 1872
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................... 2038
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................... 3607
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ....................... 4817
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) . 4974
  2010 Soccer: involvement of structures in sports, arts and culture ........ 1592
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]
  (Consideration and finalisation) .............................................. 6674
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ................................................................. 7078
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ) ....................... 7263

STRACHAN, G R
Cape Town as South Africa's Silicon Valley ..................................... 833
Chairperson of Standing Committee of Finance, Censuring of ............. 589
Clothing Sector, Strike in ............................................................. 783
Paulse, Ms S U, Statement of ...................................................... 656
Premier, Misleading statements by .............................................. 15
Premier: ....................................................................................... 65
  Opening Address of .................................................................... 65
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
  (Consideration) ........................................................................ 1110
Statements .................................................................................. 300, 585, 828, 1033, 1105, 2455
Subject for discussion:
  Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape .... 554
  Statements made by Premier ...................................................... 618
  Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ...................................................... 698
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Consideration of principle ............................................................ 1170
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................ 1308
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ....................................................... 1352
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle ............................................................. 117
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................ 338
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ........................................ 409
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ........................................................ 429
Xenophobia in De Doorns: investigative and disciplinary process ....... 1036

TINGWE, M
Deputy Minister Visits Hospital and School ........................................ 6414
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities .................................................. 4151
Closure of Schools ........................................................................ 5900
Closure of Nongovernmental Organisations ..................................... 5858
Condolence, Motion of:
  Charles, Shameega in Doha mall Fire ................................. 5862
  Emeran, Umar ................................................................. 6631
  Ford, Kelly-Jade .............................................................. 6631
  Lithemba Loki ................................................................. 787
  People killed in fire in Lingelethu, Khayelitsha .................. 2463
  Pietersen, Moegamat ...................................................... 6498
  Roxo, Ernest in Doha mall Fire ........................................ 5782
  Smith, Keen ................................................................. 6631
  Swail, Lee-Ann ............................................................... 6631
  Ntabeni, Babalwa ........................................................... 7059

Congratulations, Motion of
  Brink, Mashaarn ............................................................ 4178
  DA's inability to mobilise young people regarding social cohesion .. 1894
  DA-Government to Provide Equal Education, Failure of ........... 5267
  Deafness ........................................................................ 2521
  Dyamdeki, Nomthandazo .................................................. 5302
  Farewell to Tata Mpio Tutu ............................................... 2412
  Grade Nine, Failure rate .................................................. 5904
  Hillview Housing Development Project, Delay in ................ 2256
  Housing development in Delft ............................................ 934
  Provincial Legislature, disregarding of isiXhosa language in .... 982
  Salute to Liezel Van der Westhuizen .................................. 4114
  Salute to Dean Stockenstrom ........................................... 4114
  Schools, Overcrowded ..................................................... 4174
  Mpofu-Wlash, Sizwe ....................................................... 4010

DA-LED Government to Employ People living with disabilities, Failure of 4604
DASO Found Guilty of Contravening Three UCT SCR Election

By Laws .............................................................................. 6327

De Duine Primary School, Lotus River, Dog Buried Alive at .......... 4778
Dennenprag Primary School, Mossel Bay to Plead for Their School to
  Remain open, March to WCED District Office by ............... 6633

Divide Along Racial and Language lines ............................... 6577
Education System, Inequality in the .................................... 5858

Failure of WCED to indicate how money was Spent, Shutting Down of
  15 Schools .................................................................... 6628

Failure of Education in Western Cape .................................... 7045
Lavis Drive Primary, Furniture Inventory at .......................... 6499
Initiation Practices Condemned ........................................... 5867
Learners and Educators, Safety of ....................................... 4602
Learners Protest about having to pay for Textbooks ................ 5150

Matric Passes, University of Western Cape Project to Improve
  Number and Quality of .................................................... 4703

Premier:
  Premier's State of the Province Address (Debate) ............... 5065

Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
  (Consideration) ............................................................... 4277

Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
  (Consideration) ............................................................. 4611

Sexual Abuse and Rape, Complaints of Teacher Misconduct,
  Including Cases of ......................................................... 4603

Speaker's Debate:
  Role of Youth in Governance and Citizenship ..................... 85
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .......................................................... 560
Economic freedom of the Youth ............................................................. 3958
Statements .......................... 2557, 4128, 4769, 5141, 5262, 5295, 5831, 5851, 6310, 6490
Student Uprising, 11 August 1976 ........................................................... 4144
Sport as unifying factor .......................................................... 747
Subject for discussion:
- Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .................. 996
- Housing development in Delf.......................................................... 1047
- Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system ..................... 668
- Heritage Day ........................................................................... 810
- Lack of development for young people ...................................... 2262
- Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ........................... 6425
Teenage pregnancies .......................................................... 2560
Teaching Award, Top National .......................................................... 4556
Textbooks, Questioned, Delivery of ................................................. 5901
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................ 222
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................ 1763
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] –
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ........................................................ 4810
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ........................................................ 5394
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 2 –
  (Provincial Parliament) ............................................................... 5560
Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................... 6660
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) ...................... 6763
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 –
  Education) ........................................................................... 7426
Yengini, Lumka .......................................................... 7057

UYSP, P
Appointment of Jan-Jan Joubert .......................................................... 4175
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner ... 912
Africa Day ............................................................................. 2260
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 ............. 2571, 2597
Bitou Municipality, Service Hikes in ................................................. 5916
Budget for 2010/2011, Fifth Financial Year not Spent for ............. 4101
City of Cape Town, Awarding of performance bonuses in ........... 2258
City of Cape Town, Unauthorised payments and tender processes of ...... 656
City of Cape Town’s spending on informal settlements ................. 2347
Committee Meetings, Hessequa Mayoral ........................................ 4694
Condolences: Motion of
  Linkin Park Concert Death .......................................................... 6452
Congratulations:
  Commissioner Petros and SAPS .................................................... 787
  DA Government, Inferior service Delivery by ..................................... 5860
  Goedeman, Delina ................................................................. 6456
DA’s disregard for minimum standards for sanitation
  and provision of toilets to poor ................................................. 2518
Death of psychiatric patient at Karl Bremer Hospital ...................................................... 834
Deaths in informal areas in Cape Town, continuing ......................................................... 2562
Disarray in Legislature ........................................................................................................ 4005
Eden District Municipality .................................................................................................... 5914
Expenditure of City of Cape Town ....................................................................................... 2407
Handling of Legislature and its Affairs ............................................................................... 3940
High Court Documents, Falsification of ............................................................................ 4006
Kanneland ............................................................................................................................. 4141
Municipal rates fiasco ............................................................................................................ 2259
Oudtshoorn Municipality ..................................................................................................... 6328
Politicising appointment of secretary to parliament ............................................................ 2563
Premier:
  Opening Address of .............................................................................................................. 1543
  Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ............................................................ 5084
Premier: Undermining Stellenbosch Municipality ............................................................... 750
Programming Authority’s Role, Engagement of Political Parties in Legislature with regard to ......................................................................................................................................................................................... 6259
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) ................................................................. 1625
Report of SIU, Distribution of Interim before its Release .................................................. 4103
Secretarial Allowances, Constituency and ........................................................................... 4103
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules (Consideration) ............ 4282
Report of Rules Committee on amendments to standing Rules (Consideration) .............. 4562
Service Delivery Problems in DA-Run Municipalities ....................................................... 3764
Speaker’s Debate:
  Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently........................................ 2358
  Spending, City of Cape Town of ....................................................................................... 4319
Statements ............................................................................................................................. 4000
  301, 304, 529, 584, 653, 740, 780, 976, 1284, 2223, 2297, 2366, 3937, 4000, 4096, 4690, 5264, 5833, 6255, 6255, 6363, 6448
  ........................................................................................................................................... 6448
Subject for discussion:
  Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ................................................................. 4709
  High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River .......................................................... 1021
  Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ............................ 544
  Order of the Day, Point of Order, Programming of ................................................... 4269
Suspension of public sector strike by Union ...................................................................... 2569
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government .......................................... 2486
  Problems in Bitou Municipalities .................................................................................. 942
Victory for ANC in Witzenberg ............................................................................................ 7060
Western Cape, Storm damage in ....................................................................................... 364
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ..................................................................... 1247
  Consideration of Votes and Schedules ......................................................................... 1390
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle .............................................................................................. 127
  Vote 8 – Local Government ......................................................................................... 173
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 14 – Local Government ......................................................................................... 1811
  Vote 8 – Housing ........................................................................................................... 1849
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ...................................................................................... 2133
VAN RENSBERG, H G

Premier:
Opening Address of ........................................................................................................... 1491
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................................................... 5051

Subject for discussion:
- Equity Share Land Reform Schemes ............................................................................. 6392
- High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ......................................................... 1023
- Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to Prevent recession ....... 703
- Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ........................................................................ 5161
- Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas........................... 855

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ......................................................................................................... 1202, 1213

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ......................................................................................................... 482,502

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ......................................................................................................... 2086, 2113

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 11 – Agriculture ......................................................................................................... 3618, 3634

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ..................................................................................... 4904, 4912

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .......... 5642

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ..................................................................................... 6778

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) ................. 7069

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .......... 7223, 7244
VAN ZYL, J A

Congratulations:
  WP Junior Jukskei Team at SA Championships .......................... 1350
  School buses near Botriver .................................................. 2481
Executive Statement ........................................................................ 6193
Report of Rules Committee on Amendments to Standing Rules
  (Consideration) ........................................................................ 4282
Speaker's Debate:
  Human Rights Day; Human Trafficking ....................................... 1615
  International Aids Day .................................................................. 1093
  Petitions, means to serve needs of community more efficiently ....... 2357
  Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ...................................... 2441

Subject for discussion:
  Freedom Day: 16 Years later ......................................................... 2189
  Health Care Facilities, Construction and upgrading of .................. 5878
  Lack of development for young people ........................................ 2267
  Loss of Children's Live on Cape Flats ......................................... 6465
  Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ....................................... 5165
  Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports ...................................... 6590
  SA Fisheries ................................................................................ 4021
Success to Grade 12 Learners with upcoming Examination ................. 6319

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 6 – Health ........................................................................... 1186
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 1206
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ....................................................... 1266
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 1343
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ...................................................... 1354

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 4 – Community Safety ....................................................... 1712
  Vote 7 – Social Development ..................................................... 1787
  Vote 6 – Health ........................................................................... 1930
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 2014
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 2104

Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
  [B2-2011] .................................................................................... 3987

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3783
  Vote 5 – Education ..................................................................... 3842

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011] –
  (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ....................................................... 4803

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ........................................................................ 4868

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................... 4906

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
  of Votes and Schedule) ............................................................... 4963

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 5 - Education) ..................................................... 5393

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ............................................... 7239
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ................................................................. 7290
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development) ........................................................................................................ 7379
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 – Education) ....................................................................................................................... 7430

VISser, J J

Agricultural Industry, Game Farming declared .......................................................... 4098
Agri World Africa Established .................................................................................. 5866
ANC in Municipal Election ....................................................................................... 3952
ANC Centenary ........................................................................................................ 4936
ANC Youth League Congress, Failed – Motion ....................................................... 4942
Ad Hoc Committee on nomination of Public Service Commissioner .......... 911
Battle of Braamfontein, 14 May 2012 ...................................................................... 5842
Behaviour of ANC in Swellendam ........................................................................... 6569
Birthday in the House, Marais, Du Toit A ............................................................... 4936
Birthday Wishes to Minister Madikizela ................................................................. 5272
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119 .............................. 2586
Bitou Municipality, Problems at .......................................................................... 591
Cape Minstrels on Tweede Nuwe Jaar ................................................................. 4099

Condolence, Motion of:
Bekker, Suna ......................................................................................................... 4141
Daniels, Michael .................................................................................................... 6494
Deputy Speaker, Mother of .................................................................................. 786
Dryer, Charles ....................................................................................................... 6324
Kirkpatrick, Ian ..................................................................................................... 6576
Klaasen, Clr Kevin ................................................................................................. 107
Hörstmann, Fritz .................................................................................................. 660
Nkanisa, Mathosonke ............................................................................................ 4113
Residents who died in fire at Rusthof ............................................................... 2176
USA After Superstorm Sandy .............................................................................. 6414
Van Niekerk, Dr Theresa ....................................................................................... 659

Congratulations:
Agulhas, Tiffany .................................................................................................. 6452
Bernstein, Ann ....................................................................................................... 5730
Cape Town Municipality ....................................................................................... 5270
Cupido, Ms, Appointment as Provincial Chairperson of ACDP .................... 4777
DA on victory in Worcester .................................................................................. 1891
DA Winning, Election in Ward 88 ....................................................................... 6262
Department of Agriculture ................................................................................... 6331
Drakenstein Municipality ...................................................................................... 4179
Drakenstein Local Municipality .......................................................................... 5778
Elsenburg Agricultural College ............................................................................. 6209
Ikeys ...................................................................................................................... 3768
Hon Mcebisi Skwatsha refused entry into Nomination Process .................... 6638
Jewish Community ............................................................................................... 2570
Management: Silwerkruin Home for the Elderly, Wellington ....................... 1040
Member of the House ............................................................................................ 4555
Minister on compilation of guide ...................................................................... 1645
Municipalities, on Blue Drop and Green Drop Status .................................. 4109
Municipal Governance, status of ................................................................. 5267
Municipalities, Who spent their MIG Funds before End of Budget Year .............................................................. 4112
Oakdale Agricultural High School ........................................... 6205
Overstrand Municipality .......................................................... 4939
Pienaar, Louis ................................................................. 6454
Philander, Tovernon ............................................................. 6456
Prins, Henry .................................................................. 5912
Scholtz, Joggie ................................................................. 5912
Seven Team, Maties ............................................................. 6637
Sharks ........................................................................ 4006
Stellenbosch Municipality .................................................... 5270
Stormers ........................................................................ 4006
Western Cape Municipality .................................................... 5270
Winners of national female farmer competition .................... 2461
Constitutional Relationship between NCOP and Provincial Legislatures ... 7041
Delivery of housing, alternative technology in .............................. 936
Farming, small-scale – economic feasibility of ............................ 2299
Graaff Family, Homage to ..................................................... 5868
Good wishes for Cape Argus Pick 'n Pay Cycle Tour .................. 1596
Increased property rates .......................................................... 1592
Integrated Human Settlement, Development of ......................... 5838
Large-Scale Fraud among Northern Cape ANC Leadership .......... 6571
Local Government, Financial Situation of .................................... 5859
Municipal Disaster Management Plans, Investigation into .......... 783
Premier: ........................................................................ 52,1520
Opening Address of ....................................................................
Report of Ad Hoc Committee on appointment of Public Service
Commissioner for Western Cape (Consideration) .................... 1624,1633
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) ................................................................ 1113
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ...................................... 796
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ................................................................ 4286
Service Delivery, Integrated ..................................................... 5836
Speaker's Debate:
Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and
choices ............................................................................. 565
Statements ................................................................. 12,103,603,679,739,931,972,1106,1287,1583,1640,1738,
.................. 2116, 2223, 2291, 2368, 2397, 2457, 2471, 3763, 3996, 4125, 4314,
.................. 4551, 4592, 4771, 5265, 5833, 6198, 6314, 6398, 6448, 6565, 6595
Subject for discussion:
Conditions in places where poor people live .............................. 2534
Equity Share Land Reform Schemes .......................................... 6384
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape .................. 995
Impact of ANC Government on Service delivery in Western Cape ... 548
Oversight role and responsibility of Provincial Government ....... 2493
Problems in Bitou Municipality ................................................. 940
Removal of small business traders ........................................... 2316
Results of Census 2011 .......................................................... 6509
South African Excels Abroad ................................................... 5865
Swellendam Municipality ......................................................... 6368
Technical Programmes, Structural Collapse ........................................... 4698
Water, Availability and State of ......................................................... 6366
Ward Committees ............................................................................. 4318

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ....................................................................... 1210
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 1236
  Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ........................................ 1249
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning............ 1345
  Consideration of Votes and Schedules ............................................. 1390

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 8 – Housing ............................................................................ 152
  Vote 8 – Local Government .............................................................. 172
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................ 203
  Vote 5 – Education ......................................................................... 253
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............ 380
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ..................................................................... 501
  Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament ....................................................... 522

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................................ 1809
  Vote 8 – Housing ........................................................................... 1839
  Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................ 1877
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ......................... 1961
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............ 2013
  Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................... 2043
  Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................... 2111

Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
  [B2-2011] ....................................................................................... 3983

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 14 – Local Government ............................................................ 3572
  Vote 11 – Agriculture .................................................................... 3631
  Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............ 3790
  Vote 8 – Housing .......................................................................... 3862

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ...................................... 4834

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 8 Human Settlements) ........................................ 4898

Western Cape Privileges and Immunities of Councillors Bill
  [B7B - 2011] (Consideration and Finalisation) ................................. 4949

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
  of Votes and Schedule) .................................................................. 4968

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
  Of Principle) .................................................................................. 5324

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 – 2012] (Debate on Vote 8 –
  Human Settlements) ...................................................................... 5600

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 –
  Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ....................... 5614

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 –
  Local Government) ...................................................................... 5704

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 4 – Local Government) ...................................... 6697

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................. 7241
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ................................................................. 7392

VON BRANDIS, E J
Afrikaans writers receive Honorary Award ........................................ 6210
Ambassador, Singer/Actress Cape Town Routes ................................ 5157
Car Magazine Award for Safely Home Programme .......................... 1596
Cape Town as second best destination in Africa and Middle East ......... 2372
Cape Town International Convention Centre Company Amendment Bill
[B 10B - 2012] (Finalisation) .......................................................... 7096
Cape Town Partnership, Prof Ndebele Appointed as Chairperson of
Cape Town Tourism Board, New Chair of .................................... 6411
Cape Town Favourite Tourist City ................................................... 6500
Cableway, Table Mountain Aerial .................................................. 4148
Communities, Impact of “Ale” ......................................................... 5148
Condolence, Motion of:
Hex River Pass Bus Accident ......................................................... 7048
Madinga, Lulama ........................................................................... 1037
Nel, F B B, Van Lill, M M E and Eloff, J M, Cycle accident victims ... 1594
Ntozini, Nobantu “Vicky” ............................................................... 6634
Congratulations:
Arabella Hotel and Spa ............................................................... 6332
BPESA ......................................................................................... 6415
Caledon ....................................................................................... 4323
Cape Grace Hotel ......................................................................... 6332
Cape Town Tourism ...................................................................... 5841
Cape Town International Airport .................................................... 7054
City of Cape Town ....................................................................... 4008
City of Cape Town, Tourism and Provincial Counterparts.............. 6334
Coetzee, Theuns ................................................................. 3767
De Rust ....................................................................................... 4177
Department of Transport and Public Works .................................... 6330
Department of Economic Development and Tourism .................... 6330
Duk, William .............................................................................. 6208
Durban Tourism .......................................................................... 5841
Economic and environmental developments, importance of .......... 2369
Fancourt ...................................................................................... 6325
Fatal taxi accident on Constantia Main Road ................................ 2303
Fleur du Cape Theatre Awards ...................................................... 7058
Free trade ports, Establishment of .................................................. 2256
Fyfer, Boy .................................................................................... 6263
Gratitude and appreciation to committee coordinators .................. 2521
Hanekom, Mr A, on election ......................................................... 1892
Ikeys ......................................................................................... 3768
I-WEC ......................................................................................... 4780
Johannesburg Tourism ................................................................. 5841
Kaap Rapport and Van Loveren Town of the Year Competition ...... 659
Kirsten, Gary ............................................................................... 3951
Minister Alan Winde: saving of drowning woman ......................... 2352
Minister of Economic Development .............................................. 4179
Philander, Vernon ....................................................................... 5908
Silvo, Joao ................................................................................. 4608
Solomon, Kenny ........................................................................ 6203
Tourism and Rector of UWC .................................................... 4179
Western Cape Liquor Authority ................................................. 5273
Court Application, Backyard Dwellers Lodge ........................................ 6410
Dorp Street, Walk-in Centre ..................................................... 6460
Entrepreneurial Leader of the Year Award ...................................... 6502
Fire, Seven Die in ...................................................................... 4604
Green Initiative, Advantage of ................................................ 5902
House, Business of ............................................................... 6684
Imvelo Responsible Tourism Award ........................................... 6458
Junior Rugby Championship, International under 20 .................... 5910
Premier:
Opening Address of .................................................................. 1512
Provincial Development Council, Closing down of ....................... 2225
Roadblocks over weekend ....................................................... 2567
Report of Budget Committee on Division of Revenue Bill [B4—2010]
(NCOP) (Consideration) ............................................................ 1635, 1735
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
(2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook
(Consideration) ....................................................................... 1109
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints against current and former
Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament
(Consideration) ........................................................................ 1273, 1278
Report of Conduct Committee on complaints lodged against current and
former Members of Western Cape Provincial Parliament ................ 1011
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ........................................... 801
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ........................................................................ 4294
Saldanha Industrial development Region ....................................... 5903
Seven Wonders of Nature, Table Mountain voted as one of ............. 4696
Speaker's Debate:
Economic Freedom of the Youth ................................................ 3969
Statements .................................................. 13,300,530,584,601,781,924,977,1005,1032,1103,1292,
....... 1586, 2119,2173,2219,2255, 2298, 2342, 2400, 2475, 2517, 2555
.... 3999, 4129, 4316, 4589, 4766, 5261, 5773, 5850, 6194, 6311,
................................................................. 6401, 6491, 6625
Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape ................................................ 6340
Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ..................... 900
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to
prevent recession .................................................................. 696
Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ........................................... 5166
Outcome of 2011-2012 Annual Reports ........................................ 6588
Removal of small business traders .............................................. 2309
Results of Census 2011 ............................................................ 6513
Safety on public transport in Western Cape ................................... 2236
Social and economic circumstances of those in remote rural areas... 851
Taxi Industry, Two-Year Peach in - Motion .................................. 5153
Ten Best Restaurants in South Africa ........................................... 6635
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................. 1307
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................ 1320
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ...................................................... 1352
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Consideration of principle ............................................................ 116
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................. 337
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................ 402
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ...................................................... 426
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Second Reading ............................................................................. 1653
  Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ...................................................... 1899
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................. 1952
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................ 2065
  Consideration of Votes and Schedules ........................................... 2159
Western Cape Sixteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B6—2009]
  Consideration of principle ............................................................ 1081
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
  Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism .................................. 3730
  Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ............................................ 3896
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) .......................... 4820
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) ........................................ 4879
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ............ 4885
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration
  of Votes and Schedule) .................................................................. 4971
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation
  Bill [B4- 2012](2011/2012 Financial Year)
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................. 5275
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Consideration
  Of Principle) ............................................................................. 5314
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 3 –
  Provincial Treasury) ..................................................................... 5636
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 12 –
  Economic Development and Tourism) ........................................... 5677
Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]
  (Consideration of Principle) ............................................................. 5737
Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B6B - 2012]
  (Consideration and finalisation) ....................................................... 6676
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on
  Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism) ................................... 6690
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) .......................... 6765
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of
  Principle) ................................................................................... 7063
Western Cape Transport Infrastructure Bill [B9 - 2012]
  (Finalisation) ................................................................................ 7095
2012 Emerging Tourism Entrepreneur Winner – Motion ..................... 5903
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 3 –
  Provincial Treasury) ..................................................................... 7127
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ......................................................... 7148
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works ) .............................. 7261

WALTERS, M C–
Astronomy Society, Hermanus .......................................................... 4149
Beaufort West and Ceres farm murders ................................................. 1293
Condolence, Motion of:
Beylveeldt, Theo.............................................................................. 4107
Brady, Nazario .................................................................................. 694
Kotzé, Pen ......................................................................................... 2408
Marais, Allister .................................................................................. 6207
Schlemmer, Prof Lawrence .............................................................. 4559

Congratulations:
City of Cape Town officials ............................................................... 4782
Department of Agriculture .................................................................. 756
Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs
And Development Planning .................................................................. 6330
Eden, Abraham .................................................................................. 6328
Fisher, Mr Adam ............................................................................... 363
Guthrie, Mark.................................................................................... 6457
Hattingh, Adele ................................................................................ 2523
La Motte Wine Estate, ....................................................................... 4779
Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens (M C Walters) ...................................... 5862
Minister of Agriculture ....................................................................... 7052
Minister van Rensburg, Department on Publication of
Agricultural Dictionary ........................................................................ 5156
Muggels, Mr Hendrik .......................................................................... 104,108
M5 Developments Cape and Overstrand Municipality .......................... 988
Overstrand Municipality ..................................................................... 939, 6573
Stellenbosch Municipality ................................................................... 5300
Sunflower Fund Ladies ........................................................................ 2466
Western Cape Officials ....................................................................... 4782
Western Cape Women Farmers of the Year ......................................... 659
Eskom’s tariff increases ....................................................................... 1642
Farm Worker Forum ........................................................................... 2230
Farrant, Prof Jill ................................................................................ 4607
Farm Workers of the Year Competition ............................................... 6497
Fishing Communities, Traditional ...................................................... 5268

Impact of civil servant strike on service delivery and economic
development in Western Cape ............................................................ 2478
National Farmer of the Year ................................................................ 6374
Overstrand Municipality: 2009 Cleanest Town Competition ................. 1109
Pollution of Eerste River ................................................................... 935
Pollution of water resources, Control of ............................................. 2227
Research Support Service, Technical and ......................................... 4317
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) .............................................. 790
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ................................................................................ 4301
Rural Development: Optimisation ..................................................... 538
Service Delivery, Death of Babies due to Lack of .................................. 5149
Service Delivery, Project Reclaim Disruption of ........................................ 5300
Skwatsha, Mcebisi Property Deal Allegedly involving ............................. 5149
Statements ....................................... 305, 582, 599, 648, 828, 1587, 1638, 1742, 2167, 2366,
........................................... 2512, 2250, 3760, 3936, 4133, 4310, 4550, 4590, 5262, 5722, 5835,
........................................... 6198, 6315, 6403, 6446, 6602, 6627

Subject for discussion:
   Equity Share Land Reform Schemes.................................................. 6379
   Heavy burden on road infrastructure in Western Cape ...................... 997
   Heritage Day .................................................................................. 820
   High levels of pollution in water of Eerste River ................................. 1012
   Housing development in Delft ....................................................... 1058
   Ostrich Industry, Effect of Bird Flu on ........................................... 5161, 5173
   Removal of small business traders .................................................. 2313
   SA Fisheries .................................................................................. 4014
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
   Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................. 1204
   Vote 5 – Education ...................................................................... 1222
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 1232
   Vote 8 – Local Government and Housing ..................................... 1251
   Vote 4 – Community Safety ......................................................... 1268
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 1336
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
   Vote 8 – Housing .......................................................................... 158
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 201
   Vote 5 – Education ...................................................................... 207
   Vote 7 – Social Development ....................................................... 323
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 373
   Vote 4 – Community Safety ......................................................... 462
   Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................... 488
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
   Vote 4 – Community Safety .......................................................... 1710
   Vote 14 – Local Government .......................................................... 1820
   Vote 8 – Housing .......................................................................... 1851
   Vote 5 – Education ...................................................................... 1874
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 2007
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 2049
   Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................... 2095
   Consideration of Votes and Schedules ......................................... 2158
Western Cape Model of Land Reform ............................................... 2403
Western Cape, Land Use Planning Ordinance Amendment Bill
   [B2-2011] – (Consideration and finalisation) ..................................... 3983
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2011]
   Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 3603
   Vote 11 – Agriculture ................................................................... 3625
   Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ............................. 3741
   Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3781
   Vote 8 – Housing .......................................................................... 3872
Western Cape land use Planning Ordinance Second Amendment Bill
   [B4-2011] ...................................................................................... 3991, 3992
Wilberforce, William and the Abolition of Slavery ................................. 4775
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
   (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development
Planning) .................................................................................... 4871
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) .................................................. 4909
Western Cape Agriculture Awards .............................................................................................................................................. 5158
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works) .............................................. 5452
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government) ................................................................. 5695
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ........................................................................................................ 6699
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ................................................ 6738
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ................................. 7153
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture) ................................................................. 7232
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning) ..................... 7291

**WILEY, M G E**

Condolence, Motion of:
- Banda, Const. Xolisa .......................................................................................................................................................... 5151
- Conduct towards women MPPS ........................................................................................................................................... 607
- Cyclist killed on Main Road St James ................................................................................................................................. 6371
- Families in Western Cape and Elsewhere ............................................................................................................................. 6264
- Jacobs, Mr M ..................................................................................................................................................................... 837
- Jacobs, Francois ................................................................................................................................................................. 7051
- Komphela, SGT Thumelephi ............................................................................................................................................... 4937
- Hout Bay Boat Tragedy ....................................................................................................................................................... 6320
- Marks, Mr Joe ........................................................................................................................................................................ 4695
- Moses, Warrent Officer Douglas ........................................................................................................................................ 6368
- Searrll, Aaron and Snyman, Lannice ................................................................................................................................. 2231
- Slain Police officer and Injured Policeman ......................................................................................................................... 6319
- Stewart, Gary ....................................................................................................................................................................... 6326
- Tobias, Dr Phillip ................................................................................................................................................................. 5909
- Tyibilika, Solly ...................................................................................................................................................................... 4698
- Van Heerden, Tim (M G E Wiley) ..................................................................................................................................... 4326

Congratualtions:
- Biermann, Hugo ................................................................................................................................................................. 5731
- Chrysalis Academy, CEO and Staff of ................................................................................................................................ 4938
- DA ...................................................................................................................................................................................... 4941
- Department of Community Safety and all Officials ........................................................................................................ 6333
- Education Centre ............................................................................................................................................................... 6266
- Fire-Fighters ......................................................................................................................................................................... 3765
- Fish Hoek Lifesaving Club ................................................................................................................................................ 3948
- Gold Medal for Surf Life Saving ....................................................................................................................................... 541
- Halkett, Rhett ....................................................................................................................................................................... 7060
- Junior Golfer Luca Fillipi .................................................................................................................................................. 6637
- Kwahattu Culture .............................................................................................................................................................. 6266
- Mocke, Mr Dawid ............................................................................................................................................................... 1293
- Masiphumelele Young Stars Soccer Team .................................................................................................................... 5781
- Mosiela High School ......................................................................................................................................................... 789
National Mens’s Hockey Team .......................................................... 5783
Price, Kevin ................................................................................. 4142
Softball Federation, Western Cape .................................................. 4942
South African Police Service ......................................................... 2350
Executive statement: De Doorns ...................................................... 2337
Management of Fisheries and Small Boat Harbours ....................... 3940
Mckenna, Mr Sageas ................................................................. 4695
Metro Rescue Workers ................................................................ 3765
Mocke, Dawid ............................................................................. 4181
National Womens’ Hockey Squad .................................................... 5159
Orlando Pirates ............................................................................ 3949
Organisers and Participants in Cape Epic Mountain Bike Race ....... 7059
Van Gyssen Eloïse ..................................................................... 3948
World War II Veteran .................................................................. 5155
2012 Olympic Squad, Western Cape Members of ......................... 5907
Farm Attacks, Solly Tyibilika Killing ............................................. 4692
Gangs, in Western Cape .............................................................. 4316
Increase in Rats ........................................................................... 5908
WP Rugby Team winning Curry Cup ............................................. 6408
Exonerated, Professor Karabus ...................................................... 7055
Fatal Shootings in Hanover Park and Ottery ................................. 6406
IG Monitor Report ....................................................................... 5914
Kasparov, Garry Grandmaster ...................................................... 5302
Khayelitsha, Vigilantism ............................................................... 5726
Public Property, Civil unrest and damage to ................................. 5266
Premier:
Opening Address of ...................................................................... 1539
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate) ......................... 5084
Rail Commuter Action Group: Mr Leslie Van Minnen .................. 144
Role of seat of national Parliament in nation-building .................. 932
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development
On Independent Police Investigative Directorate Bill [B15F—2010]
(NCOP) and Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Bill [B16F—2010]
(NCOP)(Consideration)................................................................. 3564
Report of Standing Committee on Education, Cultural Affairs and Sport
on visit to Uitzig Secondary School (Consideration) ..................... 1012
Report of Standing Committees meeting jointly on their participation in
NCOP Provincial Week (Consideration) ........................................ 759,805
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
(Consideration) ........................................................................ 4286
SA Junior Bodyboarding Champion ............................................. 6498
Speaker’s Debate:
Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .......... 5241
Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .................. 6281
Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ....................................... 1613
International Aids Day ................................................................ 1094
Statements .................. 9, 98,532,650,745,827,975,1004,1289,2169, 2296, 2338
... 2363, 2454, 2558, 3938, 4096, 4167, 4586, 5143, 5297, 5775, 5829, 5855,
................................................................. 5899, 6200, 6254, 6358, 6485, 6624, 7038
Subject for discussion:
Absence of Minister of Transport and Public Works in
Taxi Violence in Western Cape ................................................. 6347
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burglaries, vandalism and theft at state schools</td>
<td>2383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crime, Initiative to Prevent in</td>
<td>4202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery</td>
<td>4616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of Paralympic Sport in Western Cape</td>
<td>6212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system</td>
<td>670</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heritage Day</td>
<td>812</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape</td>
<td>6425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policing in Mitchells Plain</td>
<td>882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Fisheries</td>
<td>4014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety on public transport in Western Cape</td>
<td>2241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements made by Premier</td>
<td>626</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape, Successes of DA Government in</td>
<td>4563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 5 - Education)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape – Role of Provincial Government in</td>
<td>2420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxi Strike</td>
<td>1744</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxis, Report on Investigation into Conversion Vans into Taxi</td>
<td>3616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thanks to SAPS, Metro Police, Premier and Mr J P Smith</td>
<td>938</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 6 – Health</td>
<td>1187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 11 – Agriculture</td>
<td>1211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 5 – Education</td>
<td>1224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 4 – Community Safety</td>
<td>1258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 7 – Social Development</td>
<td>1301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>1341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of Votes and Schedules</td>
<td>1389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration of principle</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 5 – Education</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 6 – Health</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 7 – Social Development</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 4 – Community Safety</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 11 – Agriculture</td>
<td>496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 4 – Community Safety</td>
<td>1705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 7 – Social Development</td>
<td>1789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 6 – Health</td>
<td>1927</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>2050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 11 – Agriculture</td>
<td>2106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 4 – Community Safety</td>
<td>3712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>3600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety)</td>
<td>4841</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule)</td>
<td>4963</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 4 – 1Community Safety) ........................................... 6704
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ...................................... 6761
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2013] (Consideration of Principle) .......................................................................................... 7075
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) .......................................................... 7208
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 5 – Education) ...................................................................................... 7432
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2013] (Finalisation) ........................................................................................................... 7468

WINDE, A R
Bitou Municipality: Draft Resolution in terms of Rule 119............. 2573, 2593
Condolence, Motion of:
Asmal, Kader .................................................................................. 3977
Cape Town International Convention Centre Company Amendment Bill [B 10B - 2012] (Finalisation) ............................................................ 7096, 7098
Financial Governance Review and Outlook, 2009 – Tabling............ 1599
House, Business of ............................................................................ 6684
Premier:
Opening Address of ........................................................................... 1546
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook – Tabling and consideration .. 1042
Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011] (Consideration and finalisation) .............................................................. 4794
Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (PERO) – (Tabling) ........ 6269
Report of Budget Committee on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (2010-2013) and Provincial Economic Review and Outlook (Consideration) ........................................................................... 1120
Report of Standing Committee on Community Development on Social assistance Amendment bill [B5B—2010] (Consideration) .......................................................................................... 2503
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits (Consideration) ...................................................................................... 4308
Statements .......................................................................................... 6610
Subject for discussion:
Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ........................................ 4721
Impact of Economic Recession on Western Cape and steps to prevent recession ................................................................. 710
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU against Implementation of ......................................................... 5928
Problems in Bitou Municipality .......................................................... 945
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009] Introduction and First Reading ................................................................. 1070
Consideration of principle ................................................................ 1146,1176
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................................. 1305,1313
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ............................................................... 1350,1357
Finalisation ......................................................................................... 1391
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009] Consideration of principle .................................................................................. 112,139
Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism ................................. 329,352
Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury ............................................................... 422,432
Finalisation ......................................................................................... 526
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bill</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction and First Reading</td>
<td>1571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Second Reading</td>
<td>1648, 1681</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury</td>
<td>1895, 1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>1944, 1962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finalisation</td>
<td>2159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B3 – 2009]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction and First Reading</td>
<td>4786</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2009]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finalisation</td>
<td>2502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B5 – 2010]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finalisation</td>
<td>2503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finalisation</td>
<td>3918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Introduction and First Reading)</td>
<td>4671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury)</td>
<td>4875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism)</td>
<td>4881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Introduction and First Reading)</td>
<td>5118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B4 -2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(2011/12 Financial Year) (Introduction and First Reading)</td>
<td>5160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Consideration of Principle)</td>
<td>5274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Consideration of Principle)</td>
<td>5303, 5329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2-2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Introduction and First Reading)</td>
<td>5337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury)</td>
<td>5630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury)</td>
<td>5637</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism)</td>
<td>5666</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Consideration of Principle)</td>
<td>5736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill [B2 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Consideration of Principle)</td>
<td>5741</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11-2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Introduction and First Reading)</td>
<td>6579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Consideration of Principle)</td>
<td>6639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development Tourism)</td>
<td>6686</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Introduction and First Reading) ................................................................. 7000
Western Cape Eighteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill [B4 – 2013] (Introduction and First Reading) ........................................... 7015
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury) .......................................................... 7127, 7137
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013] (Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism) ........................................ 7142
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B5 - 2013] (Introduction and First Reading) .............................................. 7164
Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B5 - 2013] (Consideration of principle) ....................................................... 7461

WITBOOI, J
Annual National Assessment Papers ................................................................. 6263
Celebration of Diwali – Festival of Lights ..................................................... 6369
Chestnut Clinic in Belhar, situation at ............................................................ 981
City of Cape Town: Health Plan on HIV and TB ........................................... 933
Closure and Amalgamation of Schools, Criteria and Impact on Communities ......................................................................................... 4151
Closure of 27 Black Schools, Interfaith Service against .................................. 6268
Condolence, Motion of:
  Dely, Frans ......................................................................................... 4324
  D’Oliveira, Basil ............................................................................... 4699
  Endly, Paul Macassar Veterans .......................................................... 5156
  Madigage, Thomas ............................................................................ 6372
  Sefularo, Dr ..................................................................................... 2178
  Stemmet, Adnaan ............................................................................... 2570
  Scott, Christina ................................................................................ 4560
  Tandy, Hendry Macassar Veterans ..................................................... 5156
  Rooi, Katriene Kassie ....................................................................... 5301
  Witbooi, Melvin ............................................................................... 4607

Congratulations:
Burger, Schalk ..................................................................................... 4610
Emergency Services Staff ...................................................................... 1128
President Jacob Zuma on taking Aids test ............................................. 2176
Van der Merwe, DR Elbie ..................................................................... 4009
DA Political Appointments .................................................................... 361
Environmental and Health Issues .......................................................... 1744
Future of Somerset Hospital .................................................................... 2173
H1N1 Virus, Number of deaths as a result of ........................................ 784
Health Rights and responsibilities, Review of ....................................... 655
International Nurses Day ........................................................................ 2229
Manipulation by EMS Staff of Triage System ....................................... 2405
Measles outbreak in province ............................................................... 2122
Mentoor, Farwa .................................................................................... 4182
Organ Donor Month as August ............................................................ 2409
Provincial Hospitals, Lack of Security at .............................................. 4102
Racist manager, Sacking of ................................................................. 4701
Safety of personnel at hospital ............................................................... 2257
Smile Foundation, Salutation to ............................................................ 3769, 4111
Shortage of Drug and Alcohol Rehabilitation Centres ...................... 3616
Shortage of flu vaccines ...................................................................... 2176
Speaker's Debate:
  Fostering Culture that Values and Supports Diversity .............................................. 6284
  Human Rights Day: Human Trafficking ........................................................................ 1616
  International Aids Day .................................................................................................. 1089
  Mandela, Nelson Foundation ......................................................................................... 5729
  Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ......................................................................... 2437
  Women of Western Cape – Employment, opportunities and choices .................................. 573
High Levels of Learners not Reaching Matric ..................................................................... 6257
Huguenot Primary School Mitchells Plain, Opening of ......................................................... 6378
Ongoing Crisis in Education in Western Cape ..................................................................... 6423
Racist Manager, Sacking of ............................................................................................... 4701
Reports on Standing Committees on Oversight Visits
  (Consideration) .................................................................................................................. 4303
Statements ........................................................................................................................... 99,534,776,899,1031,1102,1588,1640
Subject for discussion:
  Annual Reports, Outcomes of 2010-2011 ........................................................................ 4728
  Conditions in places where poor people live .................................................................... 2532
  Department of Health, Quality of Health Care by Improving Delivery .............................. 4625
  Entrenching Human Rights for Children for a better Future .............................................. 5255
  Impact of alcohol and drug abuse on family system .......................................................... 666
  Heritage Day ..................................................................................................................... 815
  Lack of development for young people .......................................................................... 2272
  SA Fisheries ..................................................................................................................... 4024
Surprise visit by President Zuma ........................................................................................ 2569
Swine Flu, Preparations for outbreak of ............................................................................. 591
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................................................. 1183
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................................................. 280
  Vote 7 – Social Development ....................................................................................... 324
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
  Vote 7 – Social Development ....................................................................................... 1788
  Vote 5 – Education ........................................................................................................ 1876
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................................................. 1925
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
  Vote 6 – Health .............................................................................................................. 3693
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011]
  (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............................................................ 4914
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8-2011] (Consideration of Votes and Schedule) ......................................................................................................................... 4973
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2012] (Debate on Vote 13 - Cultural Affairs and Sport) ......................................................................................................................... 5510
Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
  (Debate on Vote 5 – Department of Education) ................................................................. 6715
Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2013]
  (Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport) ............................................................ 7213
ZILLE, H [PREMIER with effect from 06/05/2009]

Birthday wishes to Ms C F Beerwinkel ................................................................. 1598

Provincial Development Council Act, Repeal Bill [B 6 - 2011]
(Consideration and finalisation) ................................................................. 4784, 4790

Speaker’s Debate:
Using ICT to Advance Rights of Women ............................................... 2447
Women Redefining Leadership ............................................................... 4085
World Aids Day/16 Days of Activism for no Violence
Against Women and Children ............................................................. 4761

Subject for discussion:
Freedom Day: 16 Years later ................................................................. 2180
Lack of development for young people ........................................... 2274
National Youth Wage Subsidy, Actions of COSATU
against Implementation of ............................................................... 5923
Statements made by Premier ............................................................. 639
Xenophobic Violence in Western Cape –
Role of Provincial Government in .................................................. 2426

Premier:
Opening Address of ................................................................. 22, 72, 1445, 1551
Executive Statement ................................................................ 2393
Premier’s Calling, Labelling People from Eastern Cape Refugees –
Motion ................................................................................. 5300
Premier’s State of the Province Address ........................................ 4997
Premier's State of the Province Address (Debate) ................... 5018
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed) ...... 5095
Premier State of the Province Address ........................................ 6876
Premier State of the Province Address (Debate) ...................... 6897
Premier’s State of the Province Address (Debate resumed) . 6958, 6995

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8—2009]
Consideration of principle ................................................................. 1148
Vote 1 – Premier ................................................................. 1358, 1368

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 – 2009]
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................ 211, 230

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1—2010]
Second Reading ........................................................................... 1660
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................ 1746, 1765

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3—2011]
Vote 1 – Premier ........................................................................ 3797, 3817

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3-2011]
– (Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) ........................................................ 4797

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B8 - 2011] (Finalisation) .. 4975

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [Bill 3 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .......................................................... 5339,

Western Cape Law Repeal Bill [B1 - 2012]
(Consideration and finalisation) .................................................. 5783

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B11 - 2012]
(Debate on Vote 1 – Premier) .................................................. 6727

Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 2 - 2013]
(Debate on Vote 1 - Premier) .................................................. 7100, 7121
The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS—see p. 6477

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

*Ms A ROSSOUW (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, the economic backbone of the Western Cape is tourism and agriculture. Table grapes are our biggest export product and also the most labour intensive product in the fruit industry. It’s rather bigger production that will boost the economy and create around 9 000 permanent jobs as well as 13 000 job opportunities in related industries.

It is unacceptable that law-abiding citizens are so intimidated that they fear for their safety and have to stay at home because they cannot go to work. The mechanism for peaceful demonstration is enshrined in the South African Constitution. Issues should not be driven in illegal ways. Illegal actions have legal consequences.

The DA therefore welcomes the entry of the Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration to act as mediator in the De Doorns case.

The Farm worker of the Year competition originated in this area and was built up to the star success programme it is today with many benefits for workers all over the Western Cape.
There will be no winners in this current protest situation. All role-players are suffering a tremendous setback – the workers, the producers, the suppliers and the Western Cape’s economy.

The DA asks everyone to act with the utmost caution and thanks each individual and group who acted with self-control in this explosive situation to sit around the negotiating table calmly and with a reasoned exposition.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, Hangberg, Kapteinsklop, Makhaza, Hawston and De Doorns – just too many places are covered in smoke and blood as the Western Cape lurches from crises to chaos.

Poor schools are closed down; too many people are mowed down, evicted, abused, robbed, raped and children abused. This province even has the highest number of violent protests in the country.

The peaceful protests in the province are met with such an uncaring attitude from this DA government that people just turn to violence. The DA government does not respond to the cries of our people. Their stock responses to protests and cries for help from the poor have been met with spin and just blaming others – national Government, the ANC Youth League, the President and soon they are going to be blaming the sunshine or the rain.

But where in the world is the Western Cape Premier? Like a modern day Marco Polo she takes reporters on many disingenuously disguised excursions, and she pops up for the next media circus with more reporters than supporters.

Failed attention-seeking stunts like the battle of Braamfontein are veiled by deception, tweets and spin, while the self-appointed inspector is playing opposition politics in Nkandla, Limpopo, the Free State and everywhere else except here – where her day-job actually is.

She and her party opportunistically call for investigations into Nkandla, but then stoop to cheap political point-scoring to attack our democracy and usurp, pre-empt and undermine the very constitutional watchdog probes that exist.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Brown should finish off.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Don’t worry, the national Minister has asked for an investigation by the ... [Time expired.]

†Mr H P GEYER (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, I put the following scenario before the House and the ANC: If the Premier or a Minister would stand up in the House today and announce that they would be spending R248 million on improving and developing their own personal property, what would your reaction be? I can assure you, no one, no one in the House would allow something like that to happen. That is the fundamental difference between the leaders of the DA and the leaders in the ANC.

The DA will never waste taxpayers’ money on self-enrichment, especially when one takes into account that South Africa is a poor country and the suffering poor in desperate need of help and opportunity.
President Zuma is spending R248 million of taxpayers’ money to develop his own private patch, yet we find that whilst performing their constitutionally protected right of oversight, the DA’s visit to Nkandla was met with open hostility and threats of violence by the ANC. Mr Deputy Speaker, not one person in the ANC condemned the extreme aggressiveness the DA was met with. [Interjections.]

These are not actions of a president or a party that cares; it is the actions of ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr H P GEYER: ... morally bankrupt, greed-driven individuals milking South Africans for every penny. Deputy Speaker, with that amount we could build 2 255 houses. Just think of the huge dent we could kick into unemployment. But alas, the ANC has no values to guide their actions. They will continue to oppress people to enrich themselves.

The DA will not be silent on this matter. We will continue to expose the ANC’s corruption, greed and oppression. A party who allows their leaders to squander money in such a way does not care for the people. Nkandla is no longer a private residence when taxpayers’ money is used to turn it into a luxury bunkered palace for the President.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member must finish off.

†Mr H P GEYER: The DA urges the rest of the country not to be silent on this waste of money that should be channelled into bettering the country, and not pampering the President. [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! There is too much running commentary. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members McKenzie and Walters!

†Ms T N BEVU (COPE): Mr Deputy Speaker, while the Premier was busy poking her nose into other people’s provincial private residences ... [Interjections.] ... chaos was brewing in the little town of Hawston in the Overberg. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms T N BEVU: Police violently clashed ... [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms T N BEVU: ... with the denizens who say the police are members of the notorious hit squads designed to persecute them. In the last weekend of drama in Hawston shots and teargas were fired at residents in running pitched battles. In one incident an innocent 13-year-old boy was shot in both legs. Community members set fire to several police vehicles and the Overberg K9 Dog Unit in the town. Almost the entire town, young and old, rose up against the police. These tensions have not yet subsided.

When the farm workers at De Doorns rise up to demand a just wage, the DA says they are being instigated by a politically motivated third force. The rest of the world knows that this is just a labour issue of farm workers earning R69 per month who are now demanding only R150 per month. Do you want to tell me that they are instigated when they demand their rights? I cannot believe that you are saying that.
I really cannot believe it. Their living conditions, as shown by the survey conducted by the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform last year, are the worst in the Western Cape.

You see a lot of service delivery protests in the Western Cape because the contrast between the rich and the poor is too vast.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member! Just finish off, please.

†Ms T N BEVU: In conclusion, the Taylor Report by Prof Vivien Taylor from UCT indicated that it is not only poverty that causes violence but where it exists next and in contrast with plenty. This is why this province has so many service delivery protests. [Time expired.]

*Ms E PRINS (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, when the DA doesn’t have answers on protests, they claim it’s politically motivated. This is the latest in the on-going saga in the Hex River Valley where farm workers in De Doorns have been complaining for months that they are being exploited.

People are being paid a pittance by unscrupulous labour consultants and some farmers, while they export the nice, profitable grapes to the tables of the rich of the earth. Workers claim they are being abused, assaulted and treated badly. We saw these images on television, how people were shot and others were assaulted on camera.

The glaring contrast between thousands of poor black and coloured farm workers and farm owners in this industry is obvious.

The fact that this DA government until now have only met with farmers to further their interests, says a lot. Even when three MECs rushed to De Doorns, the first thing they did was consult with farmers and not the resentful workers. It is actually the workers who have been striking for weeks and not the employers.

No wonder the workers rejected the MECs’ and their Premier’s intervention if they only wanted to convey the farmers’ message to the workers!

Is it strange that farm workers all over the Western Cape feel alienated from this government – like refugees? The DA doesn’t care about poor and vulnerable people, only about the rich in big houses surrounded by vegetation!

Once again it is the ANC who has to support these workers to see to it that they are protected from exploitation. [Interjections.]

†Mr M C WALTERS (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, national bio security with regard to animal diseases is threatened with collapse due to deteriorating capacities at the Onderstepoort Veterinary Institute, the Onderstepoort Biological Products Organisation and related services of Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (DAFF), regarding the production of effective vaccines and the broader ability to prevent devastating diseases entering the country. The latest identification of anthrax in the Kruger National Park which caused the death of 30 hippos further underscores this problem. Anthrax is lethal to both humans and animals.
Although effective vaccines against anthrax exist, one needs to ask how available these treatments are in South Africa. Recent incidents of foot-and-mouth disease and rabies emphasise South Africa’s vulnerability.

The Western Cape’s agricultural sector has increasingly been subject to various preventable diseases: Rift Valley Fever, African Horse Sickness, West Nile Fever and the Avian Influenza H5N2.

Preventable diseases have cost the Western Cape agricultural industry billions in revenue and contributed to increased pressure on producers to ensure food security, resulting in the loss of job opportunities for thousands of people in the rural areas.

Lucrative European markets are closed to our exports such as our fine racing horses, ostrich meat and leather products, wool exports to Egypt and the red meat industry.

In the past few years, the national department has been ineffective in the execution of its constitutional mandate to secure the agricultural industry.

Although the Western Cape has a veterinary capacity, it currently lacks the mandate to produce vaccines or assume the phyto-sanitary duties of the national department. It would be advisable for the department to obtain the necessary mandate and take the initiative to produce vaccines.

South Africa’s vulnerability to infectious diseases and resultant boycotts by trading partners could destroy our export industry, …

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member! Just finish off, please.

†Mr M C WALTERS: … but also pose dangers of health and food security to our local population if the necessary precautions are not adhered to. [Time expired.]

*Mr J J VISSER (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, since the 2011 by-elections the top management structures of municipalities were often dismissed because of political reasons. Many new regimes appoint their own cadres in management posts with catastrophic results for healthy management and service delivery.[Interjections.]

The Auditor-General points out that poor service delivery and poor management performance, amongst others, should be blamed on the high turnover of the top management. The statistics released by the Minister of Local Government and Traditional Affairs correlates with this statement by the Auditor-General.

The national turnover rate of 7% for municipal officials is not that high, but the problem lies with the many vacancies in top structure posts which are 47% in Limpopo, 40% in KwaZulu-Natal, 37% in the Eastern Cape and in the Western Cape only 14%.

It is noteworthy that this turnover happens mainly outside the Western Cape. This is a clear picture of how the regime-change under the ANC benefits cadre deployment. This for instance leads to skills and expertise levels constantly being destabilised within municipalities. With the DA’s policy of “fit for purpose” appointments, people are not dismissed unnecessarily, whatever their political affiliation.
*Mr P UYS: That’s not true!

*Mr J J VISSER: People are only removed from their posts if they do not meet the “fit for purpose” standards. [Interjections.]

More than 100 municipal managers and directors countrywide have been dismissed since May 2011 because of financial misconduct. Sixty two officials resigned before they could formally be charged and could therefore be deployed again as cadres in other places. In the Western Cape only three officials were dismissed ...

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Complete your sentence, hon member.

*Mr J J VISSER: ... and they did not resign beforehand.

I have to say that the DA’s good management practices are shown in the nine Western Cape departments that are included in the national list of 20 top performing departments. [Time expired.]

†Mr P UYS (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, the poor subsidises the rich in the Witzenberg Municipality as it loses more than R1 million a year as people from outside of Ceres go there for holidays at ridiculously low prices. We saw DA Western Cape Leader Dr Ivan Meyer is one of them and at least Cape Town DA Councillor Carol Bew also benefited.

The MEC first pressurised Witzenberg councillors to change decisions and wanted to be compensated. The MFMA does not allow a municipality to compensate leaseholders, as their signed agreements states. MEC Meyer knows that he has no legal standing as he is a lease holder and not an owner. The agreement does not make any mention of compensation at the termination thereof.

MEC Meyer knew full well that he was investing in the Dennebos oord at Ceres to have a holiday and break-away home at below the operating cost. He wants the terms of the agreement to be waived.

When it came into the public domain after he laid a complaint at the Public Protector, he wants to run away from it and tries to wash his hands in innocence as if he did not for a long period enjoy the rewards thereof – not of one, but two cabins!

DA people, and especially councillors of Witzenberg, should be vigilant as this is the time to move away from such a leader.

†Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Mr Deputy Speaker, the South African people are bearing witness to the further emergence of a government and a country different to that envisaged by President Nelson Mandela and those who fought for and celebrated its liberation.

The Marikana tragedy, the appalling Nkandlagate scandal, the failure of government to delivery textbooks and work books in Limpopo and the Eastern Cape, the downgrading of South Africa’s credit-rating by two major rating agencies, the rising tide of corruption and unemployment, all of these collectively point to the reality that ours is a country which lacks decisive leadership and vision.
Today, in the National Assembly, the leadership of the following political parties – the ACDP, Cope, DA, FF+, UCDP and the UDM – have all mandated the Leader of the Opposition in Parliament, Lindiwe Mazibuko, to move a motion of no confidence in the President, Jacob Zuma, the President of the country of South Africa.

President Zuma no longer has the confidence of our political parties to serve as president on the grounds that under his leadership the justice system has been weakened and politicised; corruption in the public service has spiralled out of control; unemployment levels continue to rise and so the problems continue. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G C R HASKIN: It is not only opposition parties that have lost confidence in the leadership of President Jacob Zuma. Many South Africans have to, including members of the ANC, including members who are calling for anything but Zuma, including members of the ANC who have formed the South African National Congress – including those members in our midst who don’t even know that.

The ACDP welcomes the formation of the South African National Congress and wishes them well, and hopes that they will help sink the ANC who have failed to deliver services across South Africa. [Interjections.]

†Mr A M FIGLAN (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, the 2011 national census results show that the Western Cape is clearly on the right track when it comes to service delivery. A total of 99,1% of people have access to piped water and 96,9% have access to toilet facilities. Considering that around 1,3 million people have moved to the Western Cape between 2001 and 2011, it means that the majority of those who have moved to the Western Cape have gained access to the basic services of water and sanitation.

However, the budget allocation for the Department of Human Settlements has been based on the 2001 population figures. In the meantime the population of the Western Cape has grown by 29% in 10 years, whereas the Human Settlements grant has not kept pace with the growing population and the increasing demand.

It is trusted that the grant to the Western Cape will be increased in accordance with the population growth of the province. This will ensure that the people who most need the services will be able to get the services they deserve. An increase of 29% in the Human Settlements budget for Province will increase the grant from R1,725 billion to R2,225 billion. The extra R500 million could build an extra 5 000 houses per year. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon McKenzie, order! Order!

†Mr A M FIGLAN: It is almost R100 000 per house, or an extra 21 121 serviced sites at a cost of R23 673 each.

So far the Western Cape has managed to deliver a high level of quality service to the residents, with less than the budget rightfully due to them. Imagine what can happen with the rightful allocation. I thank you.
DEFUSING OF CONFLICT IN DE DOORNS

(Notice of motion)

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the untrue statement by the hon Meyer on Tuesday, 6 November, that he and the hon Plato had defused the conflict in De Doorns.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the untrue statement by the hon Minister Meyer on Tuesday, 6 November 2012, that the hon Mr Plato and the Minister himself had defused the conflict in De Doorns.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

TEMPORARY RELOCATION AREAS

(Notice of motion)

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the city’s continued use of, and reliance on, temporary relocation areas.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the continued use of and reliance on temporary relocation areas by the City of Cape Town.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

FARM WORKERS’ STRIKE IN DE DOORNS

(Notice of motion)

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the farm workers’ strike in De Doorns and elsewhere.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the strikes of farm workers in De Doorns and elsewhere in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]
PROLIFERATION OF ILLEGAL ADVERTISING

(Notice of motion)

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the City’s response to the proliferation of illegal advertising.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the inadequate and inappropriate response of the City of Cape Town to the proliferation of illegal advertising.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

CONGRATULATIONS TO NATALIE DU TOIT

(Motion)

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Natalie du Toit who received the South African Sports Woman with a Disability of the Year Award on 4 November 2012.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Natalie du Toit, who was nominated as South Africa’s Sportswoman of the Year with a Disability at the South African Sports Awards ceremony that took place on 4 November 2012 in Sandton.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE RAFEEQ PETERSON

(Motion of condolence)

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sends its condolences to the families and friends of 17-year-old Rafeeq Peterson, a learner at Grassdal High School, who was shot and killed by gangsters in Ottery on Thursday, 1 November 2012.

[Motion as moved by member.]
Mr M Ozinsky: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sends its condolences to the family and friends of Rafeeq Peterson, a 17-year old learner at Grassdale High School, who was shot and killed by gangsters in Ottery on Thursday, 1 November 2012.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LINKIN PARK CONCERT DEATH

(Motion of condolence)

†Mr P Uys: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sends its heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of the woman who tragically died at the Linkin Park Concert and wish all injured well after the incident last night at the Cape Town Stadium.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P Uys: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) sends its heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of the woman who tragically died at the Linkin Park concert last night, 7 November 2012, at the Cape Town Stadium; and

(2) wishes all those who were injured in this tragic accident a speedy recovery.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO TIFFANY AGULHAS

(Motion)

*Mr J J Visser: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates 17 year old Tiffany Agulhas on her award as Western Province Sports Personality of the Year; she is also a member of the team currently competing at the Youth Games in Slovenia; she is also the proud holder of the Women’s Candidate Masters WCM title. This is the first step in becoming a Grand Master chess player.

[Motion as moved by member.]
Mr J J VISSE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates the 17-year-old Tiffany Agulhas on being selected as the Western Province Sports Personality of the Year;

(2) notes that she is also a member of the South African team currently taking part in the youth games in Slovenia; and

(3) also notes that she can boast with the title of Women’s Candidate Master, which is the first step to becoming a grandmaster chess player.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO SCIENTIST THUMBI NDUNGU

(Motion)

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates KZN scientist, Thumbi Ndungu, and his team who have worked out how an immune protein can protect against HIV by alerting the immune system and incapacitating the virus; and

(2) thanks him for contributing to undoing the damage done to South Africa and all those in South Africa infected, and affected, by HIV/AIDS during the Mbeki and Msimang denial era.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates KwaZulu-Natal scientist Thumi Ndungu and his team, who have worked out how an immune protein can provide protection against HIV by alerting the immune system and incapacitating the virus; and

(2) extends its gratitude to him and his team for the contribution made by them to the undoing of the damage done to South Africa and all the people in our country infected or affected by HIV/AIDS during the denial era of Mbeki and Tshabalala-Msimang.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to the motion. [Objection.]
CONGRATULATIONS TO PRESIDENT BARACK OBAMA

(Motion)
†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates President Barack Obama on being re-elected as President of the United States of America for a second term.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates President Barack Obama on being re-elected as President of the United States of America for a second term.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE LOUIS PIENAAR

(Motion of condolence)

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the family of Louis Pienaar who died. He was an Administrator of the former South West Africa and also a Minister in the National Parliament.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family and friends of the late Mr Louis Pienaar, an Administrator-General of the then South-West Africa in the 1980s and a Minister in the national Parliament two decades ago in the early 1990s.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

WATER WASTAGE BY CITY OF CAPE TOWN

(Motion)

†Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes—

(1) that the residents and environmentalists are extremely concerned that the City of Cape Town is violating its own water bylaw by irrigating dunes at Bloubergstrand during the middle of the day; and
(2) that it is wasting water by not keeping a proper check on the damage to the irrigation system.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that residents and environmentalists are extremely concerned that the City of Cape Town is violating its own water by-law, by irrigating dunes at Bloubergstrand during the middle of the day and wasting water by not keeping a proper check on the damaged irrigation system.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO MR TONY HUNTER

(Motion)

†Ms A ROSSUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates Mr Tony Hunter aged 75 of Piketberg for participating in the 45 km cycling tour on Saturday 3 November 2012 in Vredenburg; and

(2) congratulates Mr Hunter for his contribution in establishing the West Coast Cycling Federation and setting the perfect example for a healthy lifestyle.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A ROSSUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates Mr Tony Hunter, aged 75, of Piketberg on participating in the 45 km cycling tour in Vredenburg on Saturday, 3 November 2012; and

(2) expresses its gratitude to him for the contribution made by him in the establishment of the West Coast Cycling Federation.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO DELINA GOEDEMAN

(Motion)

†Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates former DA Mayor of Matzikama Delina Goedeman, who yesterday convincingly won the by-election in Ward 2 for the ANC, a ward previously held by the DA.

[Motion as moved by member.]
Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates former Democratic Alliance mayor of the Matzikama Municipality, Delina Goedeman, who yesterday, on 7 November 2012, convincingly won a by-election in ward 2 in Vredendal; and

(2) notes that the by-election was in a ward previously held by DA, and that Ms Goedeman stood as a candidate for the African National Congress.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion without notice? [Objection.]This will be printed on the Order Paper.

CONGRATULATIONS TO VERNON PHILANDER

(Motion)

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates Vernon Philander who just received the South African Sportsman of the Year Award at the South African Sports Awards; and

(2) takes note of the fact that he is only the second person who could reach the fastest 50 runs and he achieved this milestone within only seven test matches.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates Vernon Philander, the Western Cape cricketer who was nominated as South Africa’s Sportsman of the Year for 2012 at the South African Sports Awards ceremony in Johannesburg on 4 November 2012; and

(2) notes with pride that –

(a) Philander, who plays for the Cape Cobras, has become the second fastest bowler in the history of test cricket in the world to reach the goal of bagging 50 wickets; and

(b) he reached this exceptional milestone and achievement in only seven tests, the first player to do so since 1896.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
LATE ANNETJIE WILLIAMS
(Motion of condolence)

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House shows empathy to the family of Mrs Annetjie Williams who was murdered yesterday, 7 November 2012, in her house in Bonteheuwel.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its empathy to the family and friends of Mrs Annetjie Williams, who was murdered in her home in Bonteheuwel yesterday, 7 November 2012.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

ARREST OF 515 SUSpects IN MITCHELLS PLAIN
(Motion)

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the South African Police Service for arresting 515 suspects at the weekend in Mitchells Plain on charges ranging from rape to attempted murder and possession of drugs.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the South African Police Service for arresting 515 suspects during the past weekend in Mitchells Plain on charges ranging from rape to attempted murder and possession of drugs.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE MARK GUTHRIE
(Motion of condolence)

*Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) commiserates with the mayor of the Overstrand, Nicolette Botha-Guthrie and her family with the loss of her husband, Mark Guthrie; and
(2) take note of the fact that Mark Guthrie’s selfless service to his fellow citizens in Soweto, and other parts of South Africa over more than 50 years, earned him the special nickname, Ndlovu, which means elephant bull.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) expresses its sympathy with the mayor of the Overstrand Municipality, Nicolette Botha-Guthrie and her family, with the big loss at the passing of her husband, Mark Guthrie; and

(2) notes the selfless service of Mark Guthrie to his fellow citizens in Soweto and other areas in South Africa over a period of more than 50 years, which earned him the special nickname of Ndlovu, which means “elephant bull”.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

IMVELO RESPONSIBLE TOURISM AWARDS

(Motion)

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House–

(1) congratulates the finalists and winners for 2012 of the Imvelo Responsible Tourism Awards; and

(2) notes that these awards recognise tourism and hospitality businesses that make a real measurable and continual contribution to responsible tourism; and

(3) further notes that the following awards were made:

(a) best practice – Economic Impact: Cape Town International Convention Centre: Finalist;

(b) best single resource management programme – Waste Management: The Vineyard Hotel and Spa in Newlands: Winner;

(c) most empowered tourism business – White Shark Adventures: Independent Winner; and

(d) Investing in People – Cape Grace Hotel: Independent winner.

[Motion as moved by member.]
Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates the 2012 finalists and winners of the Imvelo Responsible Tourism Awards;

(2) notes that these awards recognise businesses in the tourism and hospitality industry that make a real, measurable and sustained contribution to responsible tourism; and

(3) further notes that the following awards were made to local businesses:

- Best Practice – Economic Impact: Cape Town International Convention Centre: Finalist
- Best Single Resource Management Programme – Waste Management: The Vineyard Hotel and Spa in Newlands: Winner
- Most Empowered Tourism Business – White Shark Adventures: Independent Winner
- Investing in People – Cape Grace Hotel: Independent Winner

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH: 83 CASES ON FIU REGISTER

(Motion)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with dismay that there was an increase in cases of corruption, nepotism, fraud, financial and human resources irregularities in the provincial Department of Health, with 83 cases relating to the department appearing on the Forensic Investigating Unit’s register for the year 2011/12.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with dismay the increase in cases of corruption, nepotism, fraud and financial and human resources irregularities in the Department of Health of the Western Cape, with 83 cases relating to the Department appearing on the register of the forensic investigating unit for the year 2011/2012.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? [Objection.] It will be printed on the Order Paper.
CONGRATULATIONS TO EXECUTIVE
MAYOR OF CAPE TOWN

(Motion)

†Mr A M FIGLAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Executive Mayor of the City of Cape Town for offering to help church leaders with land.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr A M FIGLAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Executive Mayor of the City of Cape Town for offering to help church leaders with land.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

DORP STREET WALK-IN CENTRE

(Motion)

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates the Department of Transport and Public Works on the new walk-in centre opened in Dorp Street, Cape Town on 8 November 2012 aimed at eliminating the red tape in tender applications; and

(2) further notes that the centre is another giant step in replacing red tapes with red carpets and providing the public with quality service.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works on the new walk-in centre opened in Dorp Street, Cape Town, on 8 November 2012; and

(2) notes that –
   (a) the centre is aimed at eliminating the red tape often associated with tender applications; and
   (b) it is another giant step in replacing red carpets and instead providing the public with service of a high quality.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]
†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion without notice? [Objection.] It will be printed on the Order Paper.

**TOILETS IN MAKHAZA**

(Motion)

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the dismay by residents about the many toilets built by the City of Cape Town in Makhaza that are not connected to water or sewer pipes despite the order of the Western Cape High Court in May 2011.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the disappointment experienced by residents about many toilets built by the City of Cape Town in Makhaza that are not connected to water or sewer pipes despite the order in this regard of the Western Cape High Court in May 2011.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion without notice? [Objection.] It will be printed on the Order Paper.

**LOSS OF CHILDREN’S LIVES ON CAPE FLATS**

(Subject for discussion)

†The SPEAKER: Order! The next item is the subject for discussion as it appears on the Order Paper in the name of Ms A J du Toit Marais, as follows:

The loss of children’s lives on the Cape Flats.

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, on Facebook a young guy wrote:

Just because I am from the Cape Flats, does not make me a toothless gangster.

We are living in a society in which children cannot play outside due to gang violence; receiving an education requires safety precautions; babies are being raped; mentally and physically challenged children are being sexually assaulted; defenceless babies are being dumped by their parents; and children are sold as sex slaves by the very people who are to care for and protect them.

Obviously more has to be done to protect our children and it starts with us as individuals. Our Constitution prescribes the measures put in place for the protection of our children, but we have to create and raise awareness thereof and be made accountable in our communities.
Not only are the lives of children on the Cape Flats being lost through vicious killings due to gang violence, but childhoods are ruined by the number of children being sexually violated, abused, neglected and forced into adult responsibility.

Mr Deputy Speaker, why would a mother willingly sell her daughter as a sex slave, or consume alcohol purposefully in order to receive an additional grant if the child is born with a disability? Why are babies being dumped? Why are children scared to go to school? The underlying reasons to these why’s rests in the turmoil in which the Cape Flats finds itself.

The lack of stable family life, lack of positive role models, poverty and social ills all contribute to this turmoil which reduces self-dignity and a sense of caring.

The Western Cape Government has worked, and continues to work, towards creating opportunities through community development services and also creating a caring society through developmental social welfare and improved governance through the modernisation of service delivery, all of which attempts to alleviate poverty and promote social inclusion in the Western Cape.

The following are but a few of the services delivered: The Food for Work programme piloted in Nyanga and Atlantis on 1 July 2012; the Programme for the Advancement of Youth; the promotion of the Youth Wage Subsidy; and the Premier’s Teenage Pregnancy Prevention Project which awarded bursaries to teenage girls who had not fallen pregnant while at school.

The Premier’s Priority Projects which directly aims to address the turmoil experienced on the Cape Flats, includes: Child Maintenance; Policy on the Prevention of Sexual Harassment; Teenage Pregnancy Prevention; Anti-Substance Abuse; and the Empowerment of People with Disabilities.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the first phase of the child maintenance project was successfully implemented as part of the 2011 16 Days of Activism for no Violence Campaign. Defaulters of child maintenance were traced and beneficiaries could access benefits due to them as part of various roadblocks. Various community information workshops were held where communities were informed on child maintenance.

Mr Deputy Speaker, an integrated prevention of teenage pregnancy plan was implemented to increase knowledge, education and awareness about teenage pregnancy and to empower individuals and communities to effect behaviour change; provide holistic integrated services to young mothers and their families; educate teenage girls to prevent them from falling pregnant; and to develop teenage girls who are in full control of their destiny, thereby reducing the burden of poverty.

We made progress with dialogues with learners and parents to create awareness and advocacy initiatives in support of departmental programmes, did research on prevention strategies and impact and behaviour change monitoring and evaluation mechanisms. Fourteen Grade 12 learners of 2010 enrolled at higher education institutions, were awarded a R10 000 bursaries so as to affirm positive behaviour and hunger for excellence and act as ambassadors.

The Dreamfields Project is a soccer tournament with about 750 young girls, aimed at building self-esteem and equipping them to deal with challenges around sexuality and gender relations including teenage pregnancy.
Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA’s policy on Social Development is to avail a range of interventions so that individuals can overcome challenges they are faced with in order to take advantage of the open opportunity society for all.

With this in mind, we commend the Departments of Social Development and Cultural Affairs and Sport for their collaboration in expanding the Mass Participation, Opportunity and Access, Development and Growth Programme, an after-school programme used as an avenue of safety and social development in communities. The programme is intended not only to promote positive behaviour change and provide a diversion from antisocial behaviour. It also offers parents the peace of mind that their children are safe.

The DA is especially encouraged by these innovative initiatives as they create opportunities in communities as well as a caring society. These projects will support and strengthen families and community interventions from the department and foster social cohesion. These initiatives will also restore the dignity of our people and that of our communities and will address the issue of the loss of children’s’ lives on the Cape Flats.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me start by saying our children are the future. I also want to say that the loss of life, especially that of our children, on the Cape Flats is a matter of great concern and a painful reminder of the disregard for human life and the rights of children.

Even more chilling is the rising trend where children with disabilities are targeted for abuse. The recent exposure of indicants of child-on-child violence and the rape of young children must compel all of us to pose serious questions about the moral state of our nation. The sad reality is that our society has people who prey on the innocent, the weak and the vulnerable. They derive pleasure from harming those who cannot defend themselves.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in my mind I have a question to put to the MEC for Social Development, who is a board member of the Chrysalis Academy that is supposed to be looking after the youth: Are they really getting to the bottom of this scourge and doing something about? To the Premier, who has taken responsibility for the children, I must say I hear nothing about children in the intervention strategies and programmes that were cited by the committee chairperson.

You know, it makes me feel worried that the Minister, who is a board member of an NGO that receives funding ...

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: What!

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: ... from his department, and four other MEC’s whom he knows, cannot put their heads together to get to the bottom of these things. After all, it’s five heads together, plus the Premier of the province so why do they not do anything?

I want to say that the DA has failed the youth of Hanover Park. I want to specifically talk about Hanover Park where the MEC resided. The youth of Hanover Park, the area where the MEC resided, are bearing much of the brunt of gang violence and drug abuse. This year Hanover Park experienced exceedingly high levels of drug abuse and gang activity amongst the youth.
The MEC’s inability to provide fully functional social development institutions and mechanisms has contributed to the children falling prey to drug abuse and gang activity. Drug abuse and gang activity is the reason for the carnage we see in Hanover Park. Seventy percent of Hanover Park’s youth are addicted to drugs. [Interjections.]

You can laugh about it, but you know it’s a serious thing. I’m saying most of the youth are addicted and it’s you, the MEC for Social Development who’s supposed to be assisting the community and the children in particular.

In an area with such a high rate of drug abuse amongst young people it is unacceptable that Hanover Park only has one drug rehabilitation centre. In an area where most of the youth go hungry it is shocking to note that the Department of Social Development, headed by MEC Fritz, does not run a single nutrition centre to assist the unemployed with daily meals. Instead, the three NGO’s, who feed the unemployed and children of Hanover Park, are provided with a measly R1 500 a month’s worth of ingredients for food by the department. This means they are only able to feed people for two days a week. This is unacceptable.

In an area where the youth are abusing drugs MEC Fritz and Premier Helen Zille have failed to take youth off the streets. They have failed to put a single youth programme in place in Hanover Park. Instead, the churches and mosques are forced to run their own youth programmes with very little, if any, support from the provincial government.

The children who fall prey to gangsterism and drugs do not even have social workers to come to their rescue. The Department of Social Development has not provided the youth with a single social worker to address these social ills. The only social workers in the area are those attached to Child Welfare, whose sole mandate is to see to the needs of abused children.

Were there attempts to provide parents with the necessary parenting skills to deal with the potential antisocial behaviour of children? It is sadly not sufficient. There is only one centre in Hanover Park which trains people in parenting skills. This takes place at the library in Hanover Park, which is not enough because Hanover Park is huge and the parenting centre has only one activity a week.

The Department of Social Development has also failed to provide safe houses for the protection of the children of Hanover Park from gang warfare. There are currently no safe houses in Hanover Park. The only safe house that existed previously is in the area which belonged to an elderly widow, who passed away, and now there is none whatsoever.

It is disgusting that the MEC has not even been able to go to Hanover Park to try to address some of these things because he knows the area. [Interjections.] I’m just next to you in Manenberg and I know Hanover Park as well as you do.

I ask myself if there can be a commission to investigate crime in Khayelitsha, why not have a commission to look at the plight of children? I think all of us as parents will support you if you do have something like this and it will not be fruitless expenditure.
If you think about the young children who are used to sell drugs on schools premises and to break into houses, we, as the ANC, will welcome a commission that will dig deeper into the scourge so that we can do something about it instead of reading about these incidents in the papers everyday. [Time expired.]

*Ms J A VAN ZYL: Mr Deputy Speaker, the subject – and I would have liked to add the words “unnatural death”— of the debate today, must on the one hand be treated with gravity and a quest for possible solutions to problems, but on the other hand also with the necessary empathy with parents whose children had died. It should, however, by no means become a political football where the goal posts are constantly shifted.

The moral and social decline in communities, together with the abuse of alcohol and drugs, became a breeding ground for domestic violence, violent activities as a result of peer pressure and the ruthlessness of gang violence.

†The subculture of gang violence has become deeply entrenched in the Western Cape, particularly in areas such as Elsies River, Manenberg, Bonteheuwel, Parkwood and Lavender Hill, to mention just a few.

It is important to put the reasons for and the causes of gang violence into historical perspective. A study done in 2005 revealed that the rise of gangs on the Cape Flats came about mainly after the large scale removal of people under the Group Areas Act from places such as District Six in the 1970’s. As a result of people being removed, often further away from the city and job opportunities, family structures were broken down.

The number of drug-related crimes in the Western Cape exceeded 70 000 between April 2010 and March 2011, which makes it by far the most drug-prone province in South Africa.

*Mr Deputy Speaker, the deployment of the armed forces is not a solution because they were trained to defend our country in times of war. It is the job of the SAPF to keep order and safety. Visible and more police will make an impact, as well as more severe penalties for perpetrators. It’s a shame that there is a hint of dishonesty among members of the SAPF. On average, however, the police are doing a good job under extremely difficult and dangerous conditions.

What happened to President Zuma’s call that children should be in schools, behind their books, studying? Moral and social decay, disrespect towards other people and their property and the struggle to survive to be able to eat became part of daily life. The hard fact is that without scholastic or tertiary training this way of living will become a vicious circle with no end.

We have legislation that compels parents to keep their children in school from the age of seven to the age of 15. Mr Deputy Speaker, one can drive any day at any time during school hours through these aforementioned residential areas and one will find children as young as nine years old sitting in shebeens or taking part in gangster activities.

The problem starts with parents who are not disciplined enough to see to it that their children go to school.
Tougher action to get children off the streets, is to make sure they attend school, and tougher actions against parents who do not see to it that their children go to school should also take place. Mr Deputy Speaker, we, in our capacity as decision makers, must save the youth.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank the chairperson for initiating such a profound discussion today. The former president of the ANC, Oliver Tambo, while addressing an international conference on children in 1987 in Harare, Zimbabwe, quoted from a profound poem of the acclaimed poet, Ingrid Jonker, and as we all know the poem reads:

The child is not dead
The child lifts his fist against his mother
Who shouts Africa! ...

The child is not dead
Not at Langa nor at Nyanga
Nor at Orlando nor at Sharpeville...
Nor at the police station at Philippi ...

The child grown into a giant journeys over the whole world ...

I am quoting from this poem because it is profound and it goes directly to what hon Magwaza was saying. No-one can underestimate the importance of looking at violence anywhere, but we, as the ANC, would have appreciated it that we put our ducks in a row and ensure that our priorities are in place.

If you speak about the slaughter of our children it relates to a lot of things, the violence by gangsters that leads to schoolchildren being killed, the malnutrition, the fact that in our communities people use children as drug mules, the drugs that are sold that destroy the future of our children, and many other things. I think all of us in the House would agree that our children are the inheritors of our future.

It would be very important to me if I were in the government in the Western Cape to prioritise the future of our nation. Therefore, I want to join the hon Magwaza by saying that we would have strongly supported a commission to investigate the plight of our children and how we could make sure that their future is brighter.

A nation that does not look after its youth does not deserve its future. This government has been in place for three years now and the City local government led by the DA has been in place for six years, but what has it done to alleviate the plight of our children, these precious little souls that are our future and the heartbeat of our nation? We would have liked to have seen a situation where this was made a priority.

Malnutrition in the Western Cape and the occurrence of undernourishment means our children are being deprived of a basic right, namely that of the right to nutrition. Malnutrition leads to illness and the death of our children. In the context of social deviance relating to gang violence on the Cape Flats, malnutrition at a tender age more often than not leads young people to drug abuse when they grow up.

In 2011, according to reported cases alone, 1 386 children under the age of five years suffered from malnutrition in the Western Cape.
The vast majority of these children are from poor black areas in the province, that is, African, coloured, etc. In Khayelitsha 207 children were reportedly undernourished, 41 children were reportedly undernourished in Manenberg and Hanover Park, whilst Mitchells Plain reported 91 cases of undernourished children. It must be emphasised that these are merely reported cases only and the problem might be bigger.

Only an insignificant decrease was reported by the provincial department in 2012. According to the provincial Department of Health’s annual report the DA-led provincial government did not achieve its very modest target of ensuring that only 54% of children between 12 and 59 months receive vitamin A coverage. A meagre 36% of children in the province currently receive vitamin A coverage.

When the ANC ran the province we witnessed a significant reduction in the amount of children suffering from malnutrition, for example, in 2001, 5.9% per 1 000 children in the province suffered from malnutrition, but by 2006 ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That’s your last sentence, please.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, it is. I can see she’s uncomfortable. Two years into the ANC’s term of office, malnutrition was reduced to 3.2% per 1 000 children.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: I want to end off by saying ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, honSkwatsha! You’ve already concluded your speech. I’ve given you injury time.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, just between January and September 2012, 94 cases of gang violence, 278 cases of crime, 485 cases of theft and vandalism, as well as 239 assault cases were reported at schools on the Cape Flats. The problem of violence among our youth has a real impact on our children.

The utmost form of violence, namely the deaths of children, is not limited to the Cape Flats. Since January there were 42 instances of stabbing among learners all over the province.

I quote:

One of our greatest challenges is the high incidence of crime and violence which is exacerbated by high unemployment, poverty and social deprivation together with the ready availability of drugs and alcohol leading to widespread substance abuse.

Daily reports appear in the written and electronic media about high levels of violence, physical and sexual abuse and gang activities.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the problem of violence on the Cape Flats and the threat it poses to children’s lives was already identified by the National Portfolio Committee in 2002 by the then Minister of Education, Adv André Gaum, and the Minister of Community Safety, Mr Ramatlakane.
In 2007 the former Minister of Education, Mr Dugmore, also launched an investigation into the causes of the increased cases of violence at schools on the Cape Flats.

I mention both as a plea that today’s debate must not be politicized. Today’s debate is not for us to blame each other, but to reflect together on the safety and protection of our province’s young people, and today specifically those on the Cape Flats.

Thus, today I’m going to use the school environment to contextualise the loss of children’s lives and the loss of possibilities. We should also take into consideration what is being done to address the causes and see where there is room for improvement.

Mr Deputy Speaker, a study done by the South African Council of Educators (SACE) in November 2011 showed serious concern within South Africa that both primary and secondary schools are degenerating into zones of violence. The report also warned that the kind of violence is becoming more serious. It is important to study violence in schools because this doesn’t happen in a vacuum, but is influenced by surrounding factors. What is playing out within the school context is usually a reflection of what is happening in the broader social context where the schools are located.

The breaking down of various relationship levels – individuals, families, friends, communities and social levels – is mentioned in the report as contributing factors for the increase in levels of violence. The report also found that:

South Africa’s young people live in an environment where they learn violent behaviour, where they learn that it is rewarded and where they feel that violence is likely to solve their problems and make them feel powerful and worthy.

Mr Deputy Speaker, quality education and the improvement of educational outcomes can only happen in safe environments where learning can take place. There is increasing pressure on the educational system to address violence within the school context, as well as violence which is brought into the school environment because of outside factors. The Western Cape Government has a zero tolerance policy regarding any form of violence in our schools.

The Western Cape Education Department is striving to protect the school environment as a safe learning environment. The Safe Schools Programme protects schools using a threefold approach. Firstly there is the provision of key security measures such as infrastructure like alarm systems, motorised gates, security gates, burglar bars, metal detectors, fences and even closed-circuit television.

Secondly, the approach provides programmes to change behaviour through sport, art, drama and career guidance, as well as creative and constructive approaches to conflict resolution;

Thirdly, there is a network and systems approach where the school is approached in a holistic way to bring about a safer school environment. This includes 109 security fieldworkers deployed at high-risk schools in the Western Cape.
Mr Deputy Speaker, all schools are included in the Safe Schools Programme, but schools receive support according to the risks they carry. The Safe Schools Call Centre number is 0800 45 46 47, and they are ready to deal with any issue regarding school-based violence and crime, as well as trauma counselling and the provision of relevant information. We must make sure that all our learners know about this.

On 13 September 2012 the new School Resource Official pilot project was launched. This will provide targeted support at six schools which were identified on the Cape Flats. The Metro Police officials who’ll serve as School Resource officials –will amongst other things develop school-based crime prevention strategies, improve schools’ preparedness regarding emergency situations, as well as give general support and advice to the schools.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the loss of children’s lives falls outside the reach of the education department alone. The symptoms, as well as the causes, are already being addressed by the education system, but to guarantee the safety and protection of our children’s lives, greater cooperation and responsibility are necessary.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the transversal way of addressing also requires from us to admit that the loss of children’s lives does not only mean the physical death of children. The loss of children’s lives is also the loss of opportunity for our youth to just be a child. A child’s life is also lost when sexual abuse, assault and rape takes place and destroys the child’s life.

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, the army has been deployed in the Western Cape before. Then it was okay, so what is wrong with doing so today? We can have as many rehabilitation centres and preventative programmes as we like, but the root cause of the problem is drugs. It is also the root cause of gang fights.

Drugs enter this province on a daily basis. Therefore the question is: Why can’t our intelligence services, the SAPS intelligence and military intelligence, stop the influx of drugs into the Western Cape? Also, Mr Deputy Speaker, what happened as a result of President Zuma’s message to the people of Hanover Park and Lavender Hill about the deployment of much more resources for those areas and his call for this?

Where are these resources? Was it just big talk at the time? Nothing is happening in regard to that. These are serious questions we also need to ask so as to alleviate the problems in those areas and other areas as well.

We know that the SAPS is the first port of call when it comes to crime and safety concerns, but it is not SAPS’s responsibility alone. It is also a national competency and we, as a provincial government, have no operational control over SAPS; and the members on that side of the House need to understand that. [Interjections.] We have an oversight function and provide support SAPS. [Interjections.]

That is why each and every one of us, as well as businesses, neighbourhood watches, security companies and religious leaders, have a role to play to ensure that our communities are safer. That’s a message those members don’t want to hear.
I cannot emphasise enough how important faith-based structures are in our communities. Churches, mosques, synagogues, temples, community halls and every place of worship are places where good morals and values can be learnt. I believe that it is of the utmost importance to instil a good set of moral values in our youth from an early age and, besides the parents, I believe that these structures are best positioned to do this.

Yesterday the Department of Community Safety invited more than 300 members of the religious fraternity to discuss ideas and proposals that are targeted at implementing crime prevention initiatives with our youth. These initiatives will be focused on the youth and on education, cultural activities and the community, with the aim of building self-esteem and confidence. These initiatives will encourage the youth to seek a positive direction in life and assist them with acquiring knowledge and developing positive life skills.

To conclude, Mr Deputy Speaker, the department will support these activities at the rate of R50 per youth participant, on condition that these activities run for the duration of eight hours or more, include a minimum of 10 youths with a maximum of 150 and focus on youths aged between 14 years and 20 years. The department will monitor the implementation of these initiatives with dedicated facilitation teams, ensuring that they add value to the lives of young people. Thank you. [Time expired.]

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, what is really needed is that we must create a culture of putting a value on our children. We have to create a culture that we as grown-ups and parents have of caring for our children. It’s actually terrible that more and more of our children are used as drug mules and to break into people’s houses. In fact, children are even used to carry weapons into some functions.

I think it is terrible if we begin to use children as fodder for those kinds of activities. Our children are not safe anywhere. The MEC for Education will tell you that our children are not safe at schools. They are raped and killed at schools. In fact, I’m told that the easiest place for a young girl to get pregnant is at school, and the results are there for all to see. We are concerned about that.

Minister, you and your government have been given this task – and you can defend yourself however much you want to – but the facts on what is happening are there in the townships. The other day I was called to one of the squatter camps where a young girl of three years had been raped.

Whatever we’re doing, we are not caring for our children in the way that we ought to. Go and take a look at how many street children we have outside the House. I ask myself: Has the DA failed to address the growing culture of gangsterism among the children of the Cape Flats? Why is it a normal thing?

It is a pity that the hon Minister has walked out, because he has, in fact, legitimised the culture of gangsterism. He has, in fact, done that. [Interjections.] He creates children who want to see role models. You all stand up here and talk about role models. What the Minister of Community Safety does is he wines and dines with gangsters. He talks with the gangsters, who are raping our children and are using our children, and then you call that community-based gangsterism.
Mr Deputy Speaker, a mother came to my constituency office not so long ago and her four-year-old son was with her, and after I helped the mother she said to her child, “Tell Mr McKenzie what you want to be when you grow up one day. Tell Mr McKenzie.”

I didn’t know if he wanted to become a politician or something. I’m a politician and I wondered if he was going to say he wants “to become a politician like Mr McKenzie”. That’s what I thought – you know what we are like! The child was shy and she prompted the child to tell me what he wanted to be. [Interjections.] He said, “Mr McKenzie, I want to be a gangster.”

†Mr M SKWATSHA: It’s because Minister Dan Plato …

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Ha isoeka! It was under the ANC ...

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, he’s creating that because in the township what role models do we have? Minister? In the township what role models do we have? You know, it’s the guy who drives in his 750 BMW and is one of the top gangsters and drug smugglers in the area. They see it.

In Valhalla Park we had the situation where the gangster who drives down the street throws R10 notes out of the car and children fall for it. We had that situation. The facts are that these are some of the people the MEC talks to and wines and dines.

What you are creating as a government is not right. Minister, you know Hanover Park, the area where you go into every day, the area in which you reside. So, the 21 young people including children were killed there were killed in your backyard, and I have yet to see a planned strategy tabled here in the House to say, this is the strategy, this is how we are going to solve the problem, and not by every Minister working in his own silo. We are missing the mark, Minister. Children are bearing the brunt of what we, as leaders, are doing.

I checked it, and what the member said was correct – 70% of young children in Hanover Park alone have joined an armed gang. What are you creating; what is Hanover Park going to be like tomorrow? Earlier this year an 11-year-old boy – listen to this – joined a gang in Hanover Park. And this 11-year-old boy, what did he do? He shot and killed a 19-year-old boy.

I thank you for putting this on the table, because if we really don’t care what we, as a government, will do to the rest of our society, by god, can we do something for our children, please. Do you know what it means for a child to grow up in a township? There is no future for a child who grows up in a township. You have been given the responsibility of ensuring that a child in our townships can be given hope. The call is very clear, please do something. [Time expired.]

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, it was with incredible interest that I have been listening to the debate today. And it was with incredible interest that I have been listening to the hon Magwaza today.
The reason why I say this is specifically because we have agreed that when we talk about the plight of our children, about the vulnerability of our children in the townships, the way in which they are murdered and the scale on which it is happening, that we won’t politicise it; that we don’t play political games with the lives of our children.

The hon member started off beautifully and I really thought she was going to come here today and say that we are going to use the approach that this is a problem where all of society must join hands and assist with solving the problem.

Let me start of, Mr Deputy Speaker, with the essence of the problem in our townships and I ask today that we specifically look at what I want to call the Cape Flats belt. It starts in Gugulethu, where knifing is the main problem. Then when you go over the bridge and you have Heideveld on the right and Manenberg on the left, you start seeing the shootings. You then go down the Klipfontien Corridor and in Kewtown you find 15-year-olds shooting right opposite the police station. Then you have Bokmakierie with more shooting. You go up to Hanover Park and in spite of all the resources focused on that area, the shooting continues. The member said so herself.

Yet Hanover Park is the only place with a drug rehabilitation centre; none of the other places have one. Then you get to the skruwe flats in Grassy Park and Lotus River where there is also shooting. Then you get Parkwood and then Lavender Hill. Now the point is that if this sharp national government’s police force has the political will to solve the gang problem on the Cape Flats, they will solve it. But you know what it is? This the Western Cape. It’s the coloureds … [Interjections.] … who die. It’s okay for them to die like bleddie flies. [Interjections.]

And this is the problem. There is no political will on the part of national government to solve the problem. Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to put it to the House that if our government is serious I want to join hands with them. Time and time again I hear from the Provincial Commissioner who is constantly talking about the fact that Social Development must come to the party.

We are coming to the party, Mr Deputy Speaker, and I’ll show you how we are coming to the party. The government of the Western Cape is the only government, who, long before you even dreamt about preventative issues, started building drug rehabilitation centres and stopped children from taking drugs in the first place.

Long before they started – and she was the MEC – we started with a preventative programme and I have invited the hon Skwatsha to be part of it for the Gugulethu and Langa part and, In fact, for a number of the children because we don’t ask for your ANC card or your DA card before you can come into a programme. Everyone can join.

This is what I want to say: We have an extensive programme – and we are going to roll it out for the coming holidays – where we are going to engage our young children in sports and culture. This includes singing and dancing and we are going to keep them busy over the whole period. Through that we are going to impart a number of life skills. We aren’t going to sit in a classroom, as Ms Magwaza was suggesting, and say “You must not take drugs. Drugs are bad.” No, let’s engage them in the things that they like and enjoy, and give them life skills through those activities.
The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, is the hon Minister prepared to take a question?

†The MINISTER: No, Mr Deputy Speaker, not at this stage of my life. [Laughter.] I want to give her some lessons.

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: How long will your life be?

†The MINISTER: Very long – my mother is 84 years old.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I also want to say that it is this government in the Western Cape, this DA government – and Ms Magwaza will attest to this and support me when I say so – that has greatly extended the budget for substance abuse because of the drug problem in the province massively from what it used to be.

It was something like R18 million and I think it’s now something like R74 million, and that is phenomenal. We have to concentrate on this, and it’s so wonderful to see that some international organisations see our drug intervention programmes as being best practice, in fact, out of many parts of the world. So we are very proud of our programmes.

This programme will continue in some of our schools where we have identified the issue as being a very big issue. I know a number of people spoke about the MOD centres. The hon Marais spoke about the after-school programme.

Hon Magwaza, I come from Hanover Park and I don’t romanticise it, but do you know that some priests in Hanover Park – and the hon Minister Plato was talking about the role of religious leaders – invited me to a camp once in my life and it changed my life. I think this is part of the holiday programme, to get our youngsters involved specifically through an after-school programme to keep them busy and safe.

However, ladies and gentlemen and hon members, this must be an all-of-society effort. It cannot be only the police. I blame them for not enforcing the law, but they can’t do it alone. It can’t be Minister Plato alone. It can’t be the Departments of Education or social Development alone, it must be all of society.

All august members – or as someone once said, “August” members – must take part in the all-of-society approach. I am happy to see that the hon Beerwinkel is agreeing with us on this matter.

I want to come to the subject of the Chrysalis Academy, Mr Deputy Speaker. This academy is one of our most successful programmes today. In our term alone, in the 2009 term, we have turned out more than 1 500 great young leaders.

We are constantly working to improve the youth development initiative so that we can produce true leaders. The change that students undergo from the day they enter is remarkable, Ms Magwaza, and I want to invite the hon members to the graduation on 1 December2012. Please, I beg you, let us not only talk and ...

Mr P C MCKENZIE: [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]
The MINISTER: No, let us not only talk in this House. Let us also show our support by attending the graduation, because you'll see the difference, hon members. It is here where students come to the programme angry, confused and discouraged, as the hon McKenzie was saying—all these factors. However, Mr Deputy Speaker, through discipline ...

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Your own NGO. It’s your own. [Inaudible.]

†The MINISTER: I wish I could have my own NGO! [Interjections.] Through discipline, hard work, skills development, career development, personal development and lots of patience and support we have managed to turn them into productive and useful young citizens, of whom any parent can be proud.

And do you know, the companies are now also grabbing the Chrysalis graduates. The hon Minister Winde will tell you that they are now grabbing these graduates. [Interjections.]

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: It's your own NGO ...

†The MINISTER: Ah!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: May I just make a point about this. Let me address it immediately. When I came into government I was told that I was one of the Chrysalis trustees. Now there are four MECs on it: myself, the Ministers of Cultural Affairs and Sport, Education, and ...[Interjections.] It’s a great programme. What is your problem with it? You are the former MEC. You couldn’t do a thing. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon Minister! Hon Magwaza and hon McKenzie, you’ve had your turn to speak; give the hon Minister a fair chance to reply.

†The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, they also had the chance to be MECs and they didn’t do what we are now doing.

Let me go on about the Chrysalis programme. We are also looking at rolling out the programme to many other parts such as the hon Prins’s area of Oudtshoorn and the Eden area. We want to roll it out, because other provinces are now coming to us.

Ten of KwaZulu-Natal’s young leaders are now in our programme to go and roll it out in their province. It’s an incredible best-practice programme and we are very proud of this, hon Magwaza. Also, hon Magwaza, we will not change this situation on the Cape Flats – and I’m happy that you raised it – unless we work transversally in government. We work with the Department of Economic Development and with the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. As MECs we have to work transversally so that we don’t just work in our own isolated silos.

We also do this so that we can make a greater impact with the taxpayers’ money and so that we can see the difference and we can see the change. If we can save one person, that person will be a great person.
Seventy percent of young people are on drugs and I would like you to go and tell them that and if you go there again they would probably ...[Interjections.]

I believe people must be very tolerant so please give me imperical information. Don’t come to me with stuff that you’ve sucked out of your thumb. When you say 70% of the people are on drugs in Hanover Park it is an insult to the whole area. The pathologies are very few and very small in our areas.

I want to continue by talking about these high levels. The hon Magwaza was the MEC and she has an incredible knowledge of the portfolio of social development. She knows that the statutory responsibilities of the Department of Social Development are huge in those areas. She knows this. She knows that in that area in every second house there is a foster care parent. It is one of the statutory responsibilities. We don’t have a choice in that, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The point I want to make here today is that people have to begin to understand these portfolios, because they sit on these portfolio committees. Please begin to understand the issues. Let me use one issue as an example. I have heard people talking time and time again about children being used in crime.

Do you know what the fundamental problem is? The police don’t understand the Child Justice Act. They think that when a child breaks into a house he can’t be arrested. I heard a policeman say that. They don’t know that there is an entire programme and an entire system in the Child Justice Act. The only thing that the Act prescribes is that children are treated differently in the criminal justice system.

It does not mean that children are not dealt with; they are arrested. They say they can’t arrest children anymore. I really want tell the hon Mr McKenzie, who made that point about children who are also being used as gun carriers, that they carry the guns past adults because the police don’t understand how to implement the Act. I get this complaint from magistrates many times every day.

I want to continue by saying to the hon Skwatsha that it is very interesting that when our hon colleagues ask for a commission – you are having a problem with the commission of inquiry in Khayelitsha ... [Interjections.] ... where the police are not doing their work. They are going to find the same problem. They are going to have the same problem ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Do you have a question?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, please.

†The MINISTER: You can ask your question.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Hon Minister don’t you think it was necessary for the Premier to make a commission on children a priority, before the one on Khayelitsha?

†The MINISTER: In fact, I was the MEC for Community Safety at the time when civil society organisations were so desperate and the situation in Khayelitsha was so desperate; I have experienced it. People were being robbed, killed and raped there and nothing happened. That is why the Premier, through civil society requesting it, asked for that.
Let us address the issue of a commission for Hanover Park. Why should it be Hanover Park? Let us look at ...

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: He never said Hanover Park. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER: He said Hanover Park.

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: He spoke about the children.

†The MINISTER: They are qualifying it now.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: No, no, I was speaking about the children; which one is more important?

†The MINISTER: Everyone is important. Children are as important as anyone else. In fact, it was very interesting …

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Children are vulnerable. They are far more important.

†The MINISTER: I agree. It is very interesting that recently the University of the Western Cape and the Community Law Centre at the university had very serious questions that they were asking around the implementation of the Children’s Act. Again, we helped and talked to them about it.

However, I want to ask people in this House today, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we join hands to solve the problem. I must say, to a certain extent I was surprised by the hon McKenzie’s approach and actually saying that they want to assist us. This is great and I would welcome that.

However, I was a little surprised by the hon Magwaza attacking more than she was assisting. [Interjections.] No, I welcome the help that you offered and that we look at the problem as a society, as a province, as a government and as an opposition. Please, Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to say that we don’t ask people for their card when they come to us. We don’t say, “Are you ANC? Then you go that way, and you, you go that way.”

Let us help everyone and let this be a province for all, with service delivery for all. On that note, I think I’ve said enough. Better together.

Debate concluded.

The House adjourned at 16:32.
THURSDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2012

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

MONDAY, 12 NOVEMBER 2012

COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:

1. *(Final mandate stage)* Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the *National Health Amendment Bill* [B 24D–2011](NCOP), dated 7 November 2012, as follows:

   The Standing Committee on Community Development, having considered the subject of the *National Health Amendment Bill* [B 24D–2011](NCOP), referred to the Provincial Parliament in terms of the rules of the National Council of Provinces (NCOP), begs to report that it confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill.

2. *(Final mandate stage)* Report of the Budget Committee on the *Division of Revenue Amendment Bill* [B 33–2012] (NCOP), dated 8 November 2012, as follows:

   The Budget Committee, having considered the subject of the *Division of Revenue Amendment Bill* [B 33–2012] (NCOP) referred to the Provincial Parliament in terms of the rules of the National Council of Provinces (NCOP), begs to report that it confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill without amendment.

WEDNESDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2012

COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:


   The Rules Committee, having considered the Annual Report referred to it, begs to report as follows:

   **A. Introduction**

   The discussion of the Annual Report of the Provincial Parliament is a key mechanism established by the Provincial Parliament to achieve its constitutional oversight role over its administration. The objectives of the Rules Committee are therefore to look at the shortcomings, ways to improve on challenges and to ensure that service delivery takes place to the broader community.
B. Overview report on the Provincial Parliament

(a) Overview report

The Secretary gave a brief overview of the Annual Report of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, emphasising the improvements, challenges and thanked the officials for their dedication and hard work during the year under review. The Secretary, however, acknowledged that there was room for further improvement with regards to recruitment, selection and ICT as being the major areas of underspending.

(b) Findings/Concerns

The Committee raised the following concerns:

(i) the under spending of R10m;
(ii) the non-filling of vacant posts;
(iii) the absence of post designations on the original organogram in the Annual Report;
(iv) the slow progress with regards to procuring the services for the re-design of the website, e-filling and document management systems;
(v) the lack of clear guidelines pertaining to access and security of the WCPP as a National Key Point; and no clear identification of the precincts of the legislature;
(vi) the absence of an overview by the Executive Authority;
(vii) the real value of the artworks;
(viii) the absence of information pertaining to committee meetings and House sittings; and
(ix) the delay of the publication of the updated Members Guide and the amended Standing Rules.

(c) Recommendations

That the –

(i) Research capacity within the institution be expanded;
(ii) WCPP report on all its activities;
(iii) The Administration –
   (aa) provides a performance report on a quarterly basis to the Committee;
   (bb) considers that electronic screens be placed on all sides of the House to facilitate better viewing of presentations in the Chamber;
   (cc) formalise the upgrade of the web-site and make progress of the e-filling and document management;
   (dd) provides an up to date Asset Register;
   (ee) provides a updated Member’s Guide; and
   (ff) reports back on the National Key Points and the demarcation thereof.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

(i) A detailed updated organogram outlining all current positions in the WCPP;
The annual Public Participation and Education and Outreach Programme;

Copies of all Public Education material;

Detailed information on the implications of the National Key Point Act for the WCPP;

A copy of the Sector Oversight Model as adopted by the Speakers’ Forum;

Analysis of other Legislatures annual reports with reference to committee activities to establish a benchmark for Standing Committees;

A copy of the National Assembly resolution pertaining to the proposed amendment of the Financial Management of Parliament Act, Act 10 of 2009;

Records of all considered Rulings by Presiding Officers;

A database and valuations of artworks as well as where the artworks are presently located;

An evacuation plan;

A register of all petitions received and processed in the period under review; and

The Register of legal opinions provided to Members and committees.

C. Conclusion

The Chairperson thanked all Members and officials for their input regarding the discussion of the Annual Report.


The Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth, having considered the Annual Reports referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

The objectives of the Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth as part of its oversight role over the Department of the Premier, monitors whether the Department of the Premier fulfils its mandate as prescribed in the Strategic Plan, and the Annual Performance Plan of the Department.

B. Oversight reports on department and entity

1. Department of the Premier

(a) Oversight report

The Premier of the Western Cape gave a brief overview of the achievements of the Department focusing on the highlights and challenges for the 2011/2012 financial year. The Department received an unqualified report and the Public Service in the Western Cape was nominated for various awards.
The Premier emphasised that the Province has taken a zero tolerance approach on instances of corruption and fraud.

The Premier indicated that the achievements of the Department and improvement for the 2011/2012 financial year are due to the hard work and dedication of the officials of the Department under the guidance of the Director General, Advocate Brent Gerber and thanked the Department for its dedication.

The Director-General further briefed the Committee on the strategies of the Department to address the challenges experienced during this financial year and the achievements of the Department.

(b) Concerns/Findings

The following concerns were identified:
(i) The Department attained an unqualified audit report but three misstatements were found in the report. The Department confirmed that they have intervention strategies in place to monitor these tendencies for coming years;
(ii) The status of the Human Rights Unit in the Department with reference to different projects, specifically human rights projects being mainstreamed into other Departments or the Department of the Premier; and
(iii) The indicators on the establishment of Cape Access e-Community Centres as indicated on page 38 of the Annual Report should reflect the actual number of centres established for the year under review.

(c) Recommendations

That the Department brief the Committee on –

(i) the cooperation with stakeholders associated with the Department and the names of these stakeholders as mentioned on page 15 of the Annual Report, with specific reference to initiatives and projects within the Department;
(ii) details of the ad hoc projects executed by the Department;
(iii) the six projects conducted in the Department linked to the six reports that were submitted to Cabinet on delivery against international agreements as indicated on page 22 of the Annual Report;
(iv) the strategy for the Human Rights Unit in the Department and that this item be prioritised in the Committee programme; and
(v) the retention strategy of the Department.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

(i) A copy of the Transfer Payment policy since numerous transfers are done by the Department as listed on page 112 of the Annual Report;
(ii) A detailed list of all furniture classified as assets as mentioned on page 2 of the Annual Report;
(iii) A list of the international agreements or statements of intent to establish international agreements;
(iv) A report on the strategy for the Human Rights Unit;
(v) A list the assets in the Department as listed under sub-programme 1.5, Departmental Finance and Administration, on page 25 of the Annual Report 2011/2012;
(vi) The list of Departments not responding effectively with regards to reporting on the audit outcomes of the respective Departments as mentioned in Table 2.2.5.1 on page 41 of the Annual Report;
(vii) A list detailing a breakdown of reasons for employees on sick leave and the common trends in reasons for sick leave;
(viii) A detailed list of all employees on contract, where they work, the nature of their job responsibilities, payment totals to each of the contract employees as well as the length of their contracts;
(ix) A report on the reasons why the contract employees are not offered permanent appointments; and
(x) The strategy on the scarce skills initiative in the Department which aids in uplifting the skills of employees in a specific age range.

2. The Western Cape Provincial Development Council

(a) Oversight report

The Provincial Development Council (PDC) has been disestablished following a review on the mandates, performance and effectiveness of all public entities in the Province. After considering the review report and a public consultation process, the Cabinet resolved to disestablish the PDC on 5 December 2011.

C. Conclusion

The Chairperson thanked all the Members, the Department and members of the public for attending the hearing and for their inputs on the discussion of the Annual Report. The Committee wishes to express its appreciation for the information provided by the Premier of the Western Cape and officials from the Department of the Premier.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this Report.

WEDNESDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2012

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. Introduction of Bill

Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism

Cape Town International Convention Centre Company Amendment Bill [B 10–2012].
2. Referral of bill to committee in terms of Rule 171:

Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development

*Cape Town International Convention Centre Company Amendment Bill* [B 10–2012].

**TABLEING**

The Speaker:

**Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:**


**COMMITTEE REPORT**

The Speaker:

Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on an Oversight Visit to the Elsies River Community Clinic–Elsies River 22 August 2012.

The Standing Committee on Community Development, having undertaken on an oversight visit to the Elsies River Community Clinic on 22 August 2012, begs to report as follows:

1. **Introduction**

As resolved by the Committee the purpose of the site visit was to observe the challenges facing the Community Clinic.

2. **The Delegation**

The delegation consisted of the following Members:

- Ms A J D Marias, (DA), Chairperson
- Ms J L Hartnick, (DA)
- Ms C Labuschagne, (DA)
- Mr R B Lentit, (COPE)

The delegation was also accompanied by Ms M Burgess, the Acting Committee Co-ordinator.

The Department of Health was represented by the Primary Care Manager, Mr A Patientia and Dr L Bitalo.

Elsies River Community Clinic was represented by Ms RM Kasker, Facility Manager, Ms RC Bantam, Operational Manager, Ms AF Robertson, Operational Manager, and Ms P McPherson, Operational Manager: Primary Health Care.
3. **Account of visit**

The delegation arrived at the Clinic and was met by Mr A Patientia who provides the Committee with a brief overview of the day to day business at the Clinic. The Committee then proceeded with a tour of the Clinic.

4. **Findings**

(a) Currently there is a comprehensive Primary Health Care Unit that renders extended hour services, till 21h00 daily;
(b) There is a 24-hour Midwife Obstetric Unit that renders a service to surrounding areas of Ravensmead, Parow, Uitsig, Leonsdale; Matroosfontein, Goodwood, Bellville, and Kasselsvlei as well as a 24-hour Trauma and Emergency Unit;
(c) The current infrastructure is not able to accommodate the current requirement in the community and serves a population of approximately 120 000 persons;
(d) At present there are six Medical Officers, of which three are fulltime employees, two dentists, two dental assistants, fourteen midwives, thirteen professional nurses, two radiographers and three pharmacists.;
(e) An appointment system for patients is in place, a club system for respective chronic illness and a daily triage for patients without an appointment to reduce waiting times. Extended hours of service apply for non-trauma patients as well as a chronic support group within the community;
(f) The Labour Ward delivers a monthly average of 130 births. The facility has established a partnership with surrounding factories where cervical smears are offered to working women who are unable to visit the Clinic;
(g) A daily service is rendered to chronic disease patients by clinical nurse, practitioners and medical officers on an appointment basis;
(h) The Mental Health service is rendered by two mental health practitioners on a daily basis with the support from a psychiatrist and a Clinical psychologist;
(i) Currently there are approximately 6000 people who get tested for HIV annually. The ARV service operates on a daily basis and is currently rendered by a clinical nurse practitioner, a dedicated pharmacist and counsellors;
(j) HIV counselling and testing and rehabilitation services are offered on a daily basis;
(k) A Radiography service is rendered daily by two radiographers between 08h00 and 17h00, including weekends;
(l) The dental Clinic operates daily from 07h30 to 18h00;
(m) The pharmaceutical service operates daily from 07h30 to 16h00 with two pharmacists and four pharmacy assistants. The pharmacy is responsible for issuing stable patients with Chronic Dispensing Unit (CDU) packages in addition to medication for acute and chronic patients. The average number of CDU packages issued are 300 to 400 per day;
(n) School Health Services are rendered at schools by a clinical nurse practitioner;
(o) Health Promotion services are provided on a daily basis by the Health Promotion Officer; and
(p) Nutrition services are rendered twice on a weekly basis by a dietician and nutrition advisor.
5. Challenges

The Committee identified the following—

(a) The building is old and defective but is currently being upgraded;
(b) Staff are faced daily with abuse and threats by patients;
(c) Suppliers are not keeping up with the provision of stock; and
(d) Vandalism to the property.

6. Acknowledgements

The Chairperson thanked Mr Patientia and the staff for the tour of the Clinic and for allowing the Committee to perform its oversight responsibilities.
The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS – see p. 6521

STATMENTS BY MEMBERS

†Mr M G E WILEY (DA): Over the last 10 days of increasing unrest in the farming areas, we have seen enormous damage and disruption caused by riotous mobs affecting dozens of communities and individuals.

What has been less obvious has been the impact on those agencies tasked with the difficult task of upholding and enforcing the law. The SAPS, in particular, has carried the greatest burden here and they have to be applauded for their dedication.

This unrest situation comes at a particularly difficult time for the SAPS, following a year which has seen eight officers killed in the line of duty in the Western Cape, and over 300 injured in the last few months alone. Two have suffered injuries in the current riots.

With these riots, however, they have risen to the task and dutifully dealt with the challenges. The sporadic and widespread nature of the riots and the unpredictability of the mobs have meant that control has been difficult and the ability to prevent damage almost impossible at times.

As stated by The Burger this morning:

The polisie staan vroegdag bont.

Officers have had to be brought in from many areas and commanders from head office have left their desks to stand in the lines with their men and women. Officers have worked long hours and double shifts, and under constant threat of injury from the rain of stones and burning debris. They are constantly threatened, taunted and abused, but they have done their duty; and for this the law-abiding citizens, those who simply want to get on with their daily lives, must be grateful.

Obviously, this has meant that policing in other areas, already suffering from limited resources, has suffered even more as more officers have to be sourced to relieve the exhausted ones. All this puts greater responsibility on the intelligence community to indentify the instigators of this inexcusable, national disgrace and to have them arrested. Failure to do so will put their own colleagues under threat and continue to place the law-abiding residents in harm’s way.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Mr Speaker, the DA propaganda machine spits out lies, deception, spin and smoke and mirrors. [Interjections.]
In fact, a very popular refrain in the DA’s three-year rule has been: Somebody’s told us that the ANC is going to do a, b or c; somebody’s told us that there’s corruption and that people are going to go to jail. [Interjections.]

It is three years down the line and we’ve seen none of it. We just hear these bits of gossip that happen – smokescreens – while the DA leader engages in her favourite pastime of shadow-boxing, blaming the ANCYL, Cosatu, some national Minister, anybody. Like Mark Wiley, who blamed us when the crayfish walked out of the sea, she spread a number of shaky untruths to the whole world yesterday.

One, Cosatu wants people to die, and stokes chaos, while Cosatu engaged in democratic negotiations and even moved to announce the suspension of the strike. Two, people are being bussed in from Cape Town to stoke the strike ... [Interjections.] ... while farmers illegally blocked access roads yesterday and no busses could be found. Three, the labour Minister must return from abroad for wage negotiations to start. The matter received due attention from the acting Minister and this morning Tina Joemat-Petterssen met with the President to discuss that. Four, Matrics were prevented from writing exams. Guess what? They started on time. Five, she said she sent many messages to the ANC provincial leader. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: None of this could be found.

An HON MEMBER: Yoh, yoh, yoh!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Six, a farmer from Wellington was murdered by strikers. Only a protestors was killed by the police and then she trumpets in a tweet from a DA function, “I’m having great fun”. [Time expired.]

†Ms C LABUSCHAGNE (DA): Mr Speaker, this week, 11 to 17 November 2012, is international Fraud Awareness Week. This week, recognised by various entities worldwide, shines the spotlight on fraud to help promote awareness, detection and prevention. It is estimated that organisations around the world lose an estimated 5% of their annual revenue to fraud.

Ironically, international Fraud Awareness Week also coincides with the Northern Cape MEC for Finance, Economic Affairs and Tourism, John Block, calling for a crackdown on officials implicated ... [Interjections.]

†Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: ... in fraudulent or corrupt activities, while he himself is facing corruption and fraud charges.

In the Western Cape we have a zero-tolerance approach towards fraud and corruption. Minister Fritz has lead by example in 2011 by suspending four officials and laying criminal charges against them for embezzling over R80 000. Overall, in the social security system, fraud and corruption is said to have cost the government R1,5 billion each year.

People should be vigilant in order to identify fraudulent and corrupt activities and should report them to the appropriate mechanisms.
The Office of the Public Protector, the Independent Complaints Directorate (ICD), the South African Human Rights Commission, the forensic audit component of the Provincial Government of the Western Cape, the government motor transport component of the Department of Transport and Public Works, the Safer Schools Call Centre, the City of Cape Town Public Complaints Commission, and even the Consumer Protector all provide the necessary assistance with addressing various forms of fraud and corruption.

Mr Speaker, I implore the people of the Western Cape to familiarise themselves with these bodies and to report fraud and corruption every time.

†Ms T N BEVU (COPE): Mr Speaker, this has been a year of big events; a window on the dire future that awaits us so long as we continue on this path of disregarding the poor.

Since Cope came into the provincial Parliament, we have been warning about the rising tide of anger on the ground. We told the provincial government, as we also did the national one, that if you don’t take the poor seriously they will take things into their own hands. Some of you accused us of being alarmists.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Ms T N BEVU: Now the province and the country, in general, are in flames. Farms are burning and all hell may soon break loose if this government treats the poor as they are doormats. It is easy to be holier than thou when you have a full stomach and pretend that you support the grievances of workers, but not the ensuing violence.

You say that everyone must respect the Constitution and the rule of law while, with the same breath, you deny the poor the basic rights that are guaranteed in the same Constitution that you are talking about. You only see them violating the Constitution, but not yourself as a government raping the same Constitution and murdering its spirit.

Cope does not condone violence during protests, but we understand the level of frustration of our people. The poor have learnt through experience that the only language your kind of government listens to is violence. For far too long they have been ignored and oppressed, with the boot of the system, which you refuse to transform, on their necks.

We all know about the results of a Human Rights Watch study released in March 2011. It was found that there were only 107 labour inspectors who were responsible for 6 000 farms in the Western Cape. Those inspectors also complained that some farmers refused them permission to enter their premises.

As usual, the Premier, when asked about the conditions of the farm workers in the Western Cape, showed her callous and insensitive disregard for the plight of the workers and the poor by saying she does not make the laws, but the ANC government does and her duty is only to enforce them. [Time expired.]

*Ms E PRINS (ANC): Mr Speaker, the ANC has repeatedly warned this government about the unjust exploitation of farm workers.
Every time these transgressions were discussed, one heard choral singing from the other side of the House: bring the proof, bring the proof, you don't know what you are talking about.

The DA government ignored all warnings and today the province is plunged into a mess. The Census of 2011 shows that there are grape farmers who are taking in R200 000, while their workers are getting starvation wages.

The Premier, Helen Zille, admitted yesterday that she had been warned about the threat, but she first allows all hell to break loose, and now the church leaders, the defence force and even the President, have to jump in to save the Western Cape. And this goes on while the Premier and the DA are enjoying nice parties.

While the Western Cape is boiling over and farm workers are being shot dead, and farmers and rioters are blocking roads, and landowners are calling upon the assistance of armed right- wingers in revenge, and while racial feelings are soaring, the DA pretends to be innocent.

More than a year ago, MECW indusial that he was going to introduce an action plan to address farm workers' problems, while MEC Van Rensburg is still mute- lynegative about numerous reports that have highlighted the problems.

Yesterday, Twitter messages from the Premier proved once again that the DA only joins the ranks of the rich farmers. The Premier's obsession about a farmer that had possibly been shot has overshadowed the discussions, while the farm worker who had been killed had not once been referred to.

Mr Speaker, calls have come from everywhere that people spreading these kinds of untruths are making themselves guilty of provoking racial tension in this already tense zone.

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS (DA): Mr Speaker, it is with great pleasure that I congratulate the Desmond Tutu TB Centre on receiving an international award for its ground-breaking research into childhood TB and for its pioneering, community-based approaches to TB and HIV care.

In conjunction with the Centre for Childhood Infectious Diseases at the Red Cross Children's hospital and the newly opened Infectious Disease Clinic at Heideveld Community Health Centre, the research conducted by the Desmond Tutu Centre will make a significant contribution to reducing the burden of the disease of tuberculosis. What makes this research especially significant, is its focus on combating childhood TB as well as the fact that it highlights the importance of this, which has been neglected for many years.

Mr Speaker, TB is a curable disease yet still causes the deaths of three people every minute. Tuberculosis can only be cured if the full course of treatment, which can be from six to eight months, is completed.

The Minister of Health officially opened the Heideveld Infectious Disease Clinic on 12 November 2012. This new unit will handle TB patients and offer counselling and treatment at the facility. Counselling is especially important in the Western Cape as we have a high number of defaulters in the province.
I commend the Minister and his department on once again delivering a state-of-the-art service to the vulnerable groups in the communities and in so doing increasing wellness in the Western Cape. I thank you.

†Mr R B LENTIT (ID): Mr Speaker, we find ourselves in challenging economic times and circumstances. This kind of economic climate means that more and more people can scarcely meet the expenses of their basic needs. It is a reality that many parents cannot afford to pay school fees. Fortunately the Western Cape government is constantly exploring avenues to better the lives of residents in this province. May I, therefore, highlight the efforts and initiatives of the provincial Department of Education, under the leadership of Minister Grant, which ensured a pay-out of more than R20 million for fee exemptions for parents who came forward and applied for these exemptions.

This year a total of 650 schools applied for fee-exemption compensation for the current school year. An amount of R30 million was deposited into schools’ accounts last week. May it be noted that the DA-led government is redistributing funds to poor communities to assist schools that have granted fee exemptions. This redress in action and is proof that the Ministry has the wellbeing of poor learners at heart. Now parents can focus on being breadwinners and children can focus on receiving quality education. No matter what their circumstances.

Speaker, instead of a brickbat, I’d like to extend a bouquet of appreciation to the Western Cape Department of Education for the realistic approach to its mandate. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Ms J L HARTNICK (DA): On Friday night, 9 November 2012, 19-year-old Sihle-Sikoji and a friend were attacked in Samora Machel by a gang of men. SihleSikoji was stabbed with a mini spear in her chest and later died of her injuries.

Her grandmother openly said that Samora Machel men don’t like lesbians and that is why she was murdered. This, Mr Speaker, infuriated me as this attack comes two weeks after two lesbian friends were attacked in Gugulethu.

What I find frustrating and am even appalled by, is the silence and disregard of our national government as this is a growing problem everywhere and not only in the Western Cape. The silence from the ANC is deafening and it appears as if it is completely ignoring the issue of homophobic violence.

This is especially of concern after different organisations have called on the ANC to reassure South Africans that their rights will not be infringed upon. Adding salt to this very open wound, rather than rejecting the submission made to the Constitutional Review Committee by the National House of Traditional Leaders (NHTL) which seeks the removal of sexual orientation as listed grounds for equality in the equality clause of our Constitution, the chairperson of both the NHTL and the Constitutional Review Committee, referred the matter to parliamentary party caucuses. What has happened to the supremacy of our constitution?
If Lulu Xingwana is not going to take responsibility as the Minister for Women, Children and People with Disabilities, I challenge President Zuma, and I say “challenge” because “calling upon” has fallen on deaf ears,...[Interjections.] ... to follow the example of the great Nelson Mandela, who pioneered gay rights in South Africa’s Constitution on the counsel of respected persons such as the late Simon Nkoli. Andiwuthanditu! Kwanele Kwanele![I do not like it at all! Enough is enough!]

†Ms M TINGWE (ANC): Mr Speaker, the ANC condemns ... [Interjections.] Can you protect me, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: Carry on, hon member.

†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, the ANC condemns the utterly callous way in which MEC Donald Grant and his department swooped on schools that have been condemned to being closed at the end of the year. Adding to their trauma, disorientation and unnecessary alienation, young children had to witness how officials came to the school this week at the start of the final exams of the year to take stock of all equipment, like desks and chairs in every classroom, insensitively unsettling young learners.

As to why they could not wait until after the exams is unclear. In some cases people with boxes came to remove documents and other articles from safekeeping at schools. Many officials ran around when the learners had to concentrate on their scripts.

The schools remain open until at least the last bell has rung this year and the report cards are distributed. Why are the good teachers and innocent children intimidated? Perhaps the schools could stay open longer if parents, school governing bodies and committees are successful in their application to the Cape High Court for the schools to remain open until the disputes concerning the official closure of schools are amicably settled.

Shame on the DA for treating school-going children, teachers, parents and committees in such a cold uncaring way.

†Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Mr Speaker, the ACDP welcomes the Cape High Court decision made this past Tuesday, which has the effect of declaring the illegal council meetings in Swellendam, ...[Interjections.] ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Prins!

†Mr G C R HASKIN: ... the so-called council meetings in the Swellendam council, held on the 8th and the 15th, as invalid. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Prins!

†Mr G C R HASKIN: We welcome this decision taken by a competent court and we look forward to a return to stable governance led by the co-governing agreement of the ACDP and the DA. However, sad to say, this has not been the case. [Interjections.]

Last night violence and aggression erupted in Swellendam and across Swellendam primarily in Railton with people being threatened with their life.
This is not the first time that this has happened with assaults, people being attacked, bins being set alight and the burning of tyres in and around town and on the main roads leading into and out of Swellendam.

Today shops have been vandalised, the Aroma bottle store has apparently been burnt down and a Checkers truck that was driving down the main road was attacked and looted. All this apparently – and interestingly – began shortly after the ANC meeting that took place in the Railton town hall last night. [Interjections.] One can't help wondering whether there is a direct link between last night's violence and aggression in Swellendam and the violence that is taking place today and an ANC decision that was taken last night in Swellendam.

Even the hospital confirms that they have ordered blood for the casualties that they are expecting from the gunshots that have been going off in Swellendam in the last two hours. The hospital further confirms that in the past few weeks, senior citizens, who have been attacked and manhandled and intimidated, are being treated for wounds in the hospital in Swellendam.

Speaker, this is an unacceptable situation that needs a political intervention. We cannot any longer allow it that democratic processes and the democratic will are undermined through violence and intimidation. [Interjections.]

We must have a political intervention in this situation and we are calling for an end to the violence. To the extent that the ANC are involved in this violence, they must admit it and call for an end to their members burning down buildings and attacking people and property in and around Swellendam. They have cut off Swellendam from the rest of South Africa. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, that statement could not have been a surprise. They are supposed to be the organisers.

Mr Speaker, the Cape Town Entrepreneurship Week will take place between 12 and 18 November 2012. The city-wide festival of entrepreneurship events, conferences, workshops and programmes is striving to nurture awareness, and also to exhibit entrepreneurship in the city.

Government Hack South Africa (Gov Hack SA) took place on Saturday 10 November 2012. This community of computer software developers, coders and government officials are endeavouring to find practical solutions to collective problems in a combined way. The Red Tape Team was declared the winners with their Red Tape computer application, which is endeavouring to assist in addressing red tape in the public sector.

The phone-in centre of the Red Tape to Red Carpet programme of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism reflects the commitment of the government in the Western Cape to create an empowerment environment and to maintain it in which businesses can flourish.
One of the most important elements of an empowering business environment is the absence of unnecessary, complex and time-consuming, regulations, procedures and corruption that serve to increase expenditure.

The commitment to eradicate red tape was exhibited again last week with the opening of the walk-in centre of the Department of Transport and Public Works. The walk-in centre serves as a portal to the administration of tender contracts and offers the client comprehensive support through the entire process – everything in one place and easily accessible.

Mr Speaker, I welcome the existing attempts to address red tape in the province, as well as the innovative practices that are being developed ahead. An additional way to ensure accessibility to clients, ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Von Brandis!

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: ... is to provide sufficient name boards, route indications, as well as the availability of GPS coordinates ...

*The SPEAKER: Hon Von Brandis, thank you.

UXHATSHAZO LWABADALA
(Isaziso sesiphakamiso)

Mnu A M FIGLAN: SekelaSomlomo, ndenza isiphakamiso:

Sokuba le Ndlu ixoxebanzi malunga nokuxhatshazwa kwabantu abadala kwaye kubekho imiqathango yokuthi ijonganenalemeko.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.]

[ABUSE AGAINST THE ELDERLY]
(Notice of motion)

Mr A M FIGLAN: Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses extensively the abuse against the elderly so that measures be put in place in order to address this.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr A M FIGLAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the abuse of and violence against the elderly and discusses the measures that can be taken to address this totally unacceptable behaviour.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]
MATTERS PERTAINING TO FARMWORKERS
(Notice of motion)

†Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House urgently debates the DA’s inaction to timeously deal with the plight of farm workers in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House urgently debates the inaction of the Democratic Alliance to timeously deal with the plight of farm workers in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

DA ELECTIVE PROCEDURES
(Notice of motion)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the fact that MEC Theuns Botha is giving politicians a bad name by interfering and manipulating elective procedures in his own party.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the fact that Minister Theuns Botha is giving politicians a bad name by interfering with and manipulating elective procedures in his own party, the Democratic Alliance.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

FUNDING OF CAPE FILM COMMISSION
(Notice of motion)

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the funding crisis faced by the Cape Film Commission.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the funding crisis faced by the Cape Film Commission.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]
SANITATION PROBLEMS IN KHAYELITSHA  
(Notice of motion)

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the continued sanitation problems experienced by the residents of Khayelitsha.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the continued sanitation problems experienced by the residents of Khayelitsha.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

LATE MICHAEL DANIELS  
(Motion of condolence)

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) extends its condolences with the household and family of the farm worker, Michael Daniels, of the Wolseley area who lost his life so unnecessarily on 14 November 2012 during labour demonstrations; and

(2) also wishes all the best to Tienie Crous and five workers who were also injured during the actions.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) expresses its condolences to the family and friends of the farm worker Michael Daniels of the Wolseley area, who yesterday, on 14 November 2012, lost his life unnecessarily during the labour protests; and

(2) wishes Tienie Crous and the five workers who were all injured during the protests all the best and a speedy recovery.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
TOP TEACHERS AWARDS
(Motion)

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the eight teachers in the province who won in the various categories of the Top Teacher Awards ceremony held last week. They are: Ms Susanna Pietersen of Hawston Primary School; Mr Francios Jones of De Villiers Primary School; Mr Edward Fritz of Buffeljagsrivier Primary School; Mr Ismail Teladia of Spine Road High School; Mr Derick Petersen of ImizamoYethu Secondary School; Mr Warren Sparrow of Rondebosch Boys Preparatory School; Mr Hendrik Weideman of Swartland Primary School.

[Motion as moved by member.]
(3) also notes that the awards give recognition to our educators for excellence in teaching and in leadership in education.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

ONGASEKHOYO UYVONNE NTOMBIZODWA LUNGUZA

(Isiphamakiso sovelwano)

Nksz B G MBALO: Sekela Somlomo, ndiphakamisa ndingazisanga:

Ukuba le Ndlu idlulise amazwi ovelwano kusaphol wakwaLunguza ngokushiywa kwalo yintombi, umama nosomashishin iuYvonne Ntombizodwa Lunguza. Wanga umphefumlo wakhe ungaphumla ngoxolo.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.]

[LATE YVONNE NTOMBIZODWA LUNGUZA]

(Motion of condolence)

Ms B G MBALO: Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the Lunguza family for the passing of their daughter, a mother and a business woman, Yvonne Ntombizodwa Lunguza. May her soul rest in peace.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

FARM WORKER OF THE YEAR COMPETITION

(Motion)

*Mr M C WALTERS Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its congratulations to the winners of the 2012 Farm Worker of the Year Competition, who were nominated in Cape Town on Friday, 9 November 2012. The overall winner was George Bell of Agr Klein Karoo, as well as winner of the Senior Management category.

Other category winners were –
Mr M C WALTERS Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –
(1) congratulates the winners of the Western Cape 2012 Farm worker of the Year competition who received their awards on Friday, 9 November 2012, in Cape Town;

(2) notes that the overall winner was Willem Paulse of the farm Rietfontein in die Ceres area; and

(3) also notes that the following persons were declared winners in the various categories mentioned below:

- General Worker: Hazel Booysen (J S Jordaan-boerdery, Hex River);
- Administrative Worker: Salomie April (Klein Karoo);
- Irrigations Specialist: Patrick Ndwane (Elim Boerdery, Hex River);
- Technical Operator: Thomas Syster (J S Jordaan-boerdery, Hex River);
- Tractor Driver: Barend Joseph (Bronaar, Witzenberg);
- Animal Production: Llewellyn Hans (Kleí Karoo);
- Junior Management: Johannes Kees (Nonna Estate, Hex River);
- Middle Management: Pieter Plaatjies (EGVV region – Elgin, Grabouw, Vyeboom and Villiersdorp);
- Senior Management: Willem Paulse (Rietfontein, Witzenberg); and
- Special Merit award: Pieter Plaatjies (EGVV region – Elgin, Grabouw, Vyeboom en Villiersdorp).

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE MOEGAMAT PIETERSEN

(Motion of condolence)

†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolence to the family and friends of the 17-year-old Grade 11 pupil, Mogamat Pietersen, who died of a heart attack whilst exercising at his MOD Centre’s school gym.

[Motion as moved by member.]
Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of the 17-year-old Grade 11 pupil Mogamat Pietersen of Lavender Hill Secondary School, who died of a heart attack whilst exercising in the gym of the MOD centre (mass participation, opportunity and development centre) of his school.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

SA JUNIOR BODYBOARDING CHAMPION

(Motion)

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 16 year-old Camps Bay High learner, Luke Kitchin, on winning the junior division at the South African Bodyboarding Championships in October 2012.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 16-year-old learner from Camps Bay High School, Luke Kitchin, on winning the junior division at the South African Bodyboarding Championships in KwaZulu-Natal in October 2012.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE ANNIE WILLIAMS

(Motion of condolence)

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its heartfelt condolences to family and friends of the 95-year-old Annie Williams, who was beaten and stabbed to death at her home in Bonteheuwel last week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of the 95-year-old Annie Williams, who was beaten and stabbed to death at her home in Bonteheuwel last week.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
FINAL EXAMINATIONS IN WYNLAND DISTRICT

(Motion)

*Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates and thanks the Western Cape Minister of Education for his leadership, speedy action and ongoing support to ensure that Grade 12 learners sitting for the examinations in the Wynland District does take place.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape Minister of Education and expresses its gratitude to him for his leadership and that of his department, in that they acted swiftly and provided support on a continual basis to ensure that the Grade 12 learners in the Winelands district could carry on writing their matric examinations.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

FURNITURE INVENTORY AT LAVIS DRIVE PRIMARY

(Motion)

†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that the Western Cape Education Department is demanding the furniture inventory and other things from the Lavis Drive Primary, weeks before its scheduled closure.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that the Western Cape Education Department is demanding the furniture inventory and other things from the Lavis Drive Primary School a few weeks before its scheduled closure.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
CAPE TOWN FAVOURITE TOURIST CITY

(Motion)

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the City of Cape Town, the Provincial Department of Economic Development and Tourism, as well as the relevant tourism offices, on the achievement that Cape Town has been designated the favourite city among the readers of the British newspaper, *The Telegraph*.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –
(1) congratulates the City of Cape Town, the provincial Department of Economic Development and Tourism, as well as the relevant tourism offices on the achievement that Cape Town was voted by the readers of the British newspaper, *The Telegraph*, as their favourite city in the world; and
(2) notes with pride that the Mother City beat Vancouver in Canada and New York in the USA in the process.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

COPE MEMBERS REJOIN ANC

(Motion)

†Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that many Cope members of the Western Cape, including the Provincial Secretary, rejoined the ANC on Saturday in Langa.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that many members of the Congress of the People in the Western Cape, including the Provincial Secretary of Cope, rejoined the African National Congress on Saturday in Langa.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
MEC BOTHA’S INTIMIDATING DA MEMBERS

(Motion)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that MEC Theuns Botha is accused by DA MP of intimidating DA members to elect Dr Wilmot James as Federal Chairperson of the DA.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that there have been accusations by an MP of the Democratic Alliance that Minister Theuns Botha is intimidating DA members to encourage them to elect Dr Wilmot James as Federal Chairperson of the DA.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? [Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

INTERFERENCE WITH INFORMAL TRADERS BY CITY OF CAPE TOWN

(Motion)

†Ms C F BEERWINNEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the persistent interference by the DA-led City of Cape Town leading to ongoing chaos and uncertainty for informal traders across the city.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms C F BEERWINNEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the persistent interference by the City of Cape Town, led by the Democratic Alliance, that has resulted in on-going chaos and uncertainty for informal traders right across the City of Cape Town.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? [Objection.] It will be printed on the Order Paper.
ENTREPRENEURIAL LEADER OF THE YEAR AWARD

(Motion)

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Graham Power, the founder and chairperson of the Power Group in South Africa, responsible for the Unashamedly Ethica campaign and the Global Day of Prayer, with his selection as the winner of the first international Entrepreneurial Leader of the Year award this week in Canada.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the founder and chairperson of the “Power Group” in South Africa responsible for the “Unashamedly Ethical” campaign and the “Global Day of Prayer”, Graham Power, on his nomination the past weekend as the winner of the first international “Entrepreneurial Leader of the Year” award by the Entrepreneurial Leaders Organisation (ELO) and the World Evangelical Alliance (WEA) in Canada.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

RESULTS OF CENSUS 2011

(Subject for discussion)

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The next item on the Order Paper is the Subject for Discussion printed in the name of the hon Haskin, which reads as follows:

The results of Census 2011 and the implications of these results for the Western Cape.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank you for the opportunity to sponsor this debate. Hopefully it is a debate that will rise above the petty politics that we have seen in recent weeks. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr G C R HASKIN: Census 2011 confirms for us what we already know about demographic dynamics, population movement and the many service delivery challenges that we still face. Importantly, it also confirms that the apartheid legacy continues in the Western Cape, and in Cape Town in particular.

The census confirms, furthermore, that the Western Cape is outperforming other provinces in several important areas, primarily ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Mr Haskin, please! Can I get some more peace and quiet in the front bench there, hon Witbooi. Please give the hon member a fair chance to make his speech. Thank you. Please continue, hon member.
Mr G C R HASKIN: The census also confirms that the Western Cape is outperforming other provinces in several important areas, including better access to potable water; better access to local refuse removal services; the lowest unemployment rate in the country; and that our people are most likely to have received some form of education during the course of their lives.

However, Mr Deputy Speaker, there is caution in all of this. Whilst we should celebrate, and whilst the government should celebrate the short term service delivery improvements, we must remember that this is on the back of the Western Cape having had the most developed infrastructure and the best educated population in South Africa for several generations.

The census also confirms that the population has grown from 4.5 million to 5.8 million, and that 170 000 of these come from the Eastern Cape, 75 000 from Gauteng and 113 000 from outside South Africa. A total of 894 000 Western Cape people were born in the Eastern Cape and moved to the Western Cape at some point in their lives.

It is important for our future to understand this and why it is happening. To do so we mustn’t just read the census, but we should look at it in the context of migration studies that have already been done. A study in 2010 by the Fort Hare Institute of Social and Economic Research investigated this phenomenon, and found that of all the people who have left the Eastern Cape, those who predominantly lived on the eastern side in the O R Tambo and Alfred Nzo municipalities, typically moved to Johannesburg to look for work, but those who lived in the western municipalities of Chris Hani and Amatole, typically moved to the Western Cape, and that those who lived around Port Elizabeth typically moved straight into the centre of Port Elizabeth without leaving the province.

We need to accept that these patterns of migration are a worldwide phenomena and that it is not because they are fleeing service delivery problems in their own province. That is an over-simplification that we simply need to step away from. We also need to understand this as not being a movement from east to west, but rather being a movement of rural to urban.

After all, while almost 900 000 people born in the Eastern Cape now live in the Western Cape, Gauteng is also home to 535 000 people and KwaZulu-Natal to some 300 000 people.

The study also found when the researchers looked into living arrangements of the Eastern Cape migrants into Cape Town, that they had moved here for employment and economic-driven reasons, but that these had been largely met since they had arrived.

These trends not only define a South African labour and economic history, but that of the whole continent of Africa. The census confirms that too many of these cross-country job-seekers only reach Cape Town to find disappointment and less-than-ideal living conditions. The Western Cape contains the second largest percentage of shack dwellers in all of South Africa and the second largest in number.

It also confirms that they are extremely limited in their economic options and opportunities and that they are being relegated to the periphery of our urban space.
During the Cultural Affairs and Sport public participation engagement with regard to the annual reporting process earlier, one person living in Hout Bay who is from Scotland, I think, confirmed that isiXhosa-speaking people in the Western Cape are largely ignored, they are not provided for in terms of signage, in terms of language and even in the private sector they are ignored. This is a legacy that we need to replace with something that makes them feel as much welcome in the Western Cape as if they had been born here.

The Western Cape Government's obligations must be taken up. We must take seriously our privilege and responsibility of hosting Cape Town, one of the most important and attractive hubs of South Africa, and perhaps even of the entire continent.

People migrate to the Mother City to find new possibilities and forge new lives. This government must remove the obstacles so that they can take up meaningful opportunities throughout the whole Western Cape, but there are glaring difficulties that continue.

We should also read the census in terms of the National Development Plan by the National Planning Commission. The National Planning Commission confirms that little progress has been made in reversing apartheid geography, and in some cases the divides have been exacerbated. This does not exclude the Western Cape.

We need renewed emphasis on renewal of our urban spaces that break down spatial race barriers. We need to create economic opportunities with emphasis on marginalised communities. We need to pursue transport’s role in linking and enabling accessibility throughout the whole Western Cape, particularly in the city and specifically between the centre and the periphery, for those who live on the periphery. We need sustained transversal action to reduce the educational and employment gaps between our still divided communities, and unemployment, inequality and poverty needs to be prioritised in the Western Cape.

While changes need to be ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish your last sentence hon member.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, in conclusion, while changes need to be made to Chapter 13 provisions which relate to equitable division of revenue formulas, we must be careful that we don’t do it in such a way that the Eastern Cape ends up with zero development opportunities. [Time expired.]

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, once again the Western Cape has been proven to be the top province in providing services, notwithstanding the fact that we have grown by 28,7% , which of course also puts pressure on our services.

†What is, however, becoming more and more certain is that our biggest challenge is, and will remain, poverty alleviation, and in particular focusing more and more on the poverty trap so regularly referred to. We need the private sector to come on board as partners in terms of our drive to bridge this gap as well as individuals to take responsibility for their own lives.
The alleviation of poverty is not only an issue that the government should be dealing with. All South Africans, together with the private sector, must now share the responsibility in addressing this challenge.

With the development of our strategic objectives in the Western Cape we already laid down certain guidelines two years ago, especially in determining our social objectives. We said in those documents that poverty is coupled with high levels of inequality in the conditions of living and access to resources and intense vulnerability within households and communities. The inequalities are defined along racial, gender, age and space dimensions. Women- and female-headed households, the young, mostly consisting of orphans and child-headed households and older people are among the poorest. The plan includes an income poverty plan; a human poverty plan; access to services poverty; asset-based poverty; and resource-based poverty plans.

In per capita terms, South Africa is an upper-middle-income country, but despite this relative wealth the experience of most South African households after 18 years of ANC rule, is one of outright poverty or of continuing vulnerability to being poor.

In addition, the distribution of income and wealth in South Africa is amongst the most unequal in the world, and many households still have unsatisfactory access to education, health care, energy and clean water. In the Western Cape you will find the opposite. Why would this be? It is because the DA has a passion for the people and we drive this agenda to serve the people of the Western Cape.

While economic growth contributes to poverty reduction, it may not necessarily reduce inequality. Furthermore, there is evidence that countries starting off with significant inequality experience lower growth rates than others because lack of access to physical, financial and human assets constrain poor people from participating effectively and efficiently in the economy. The biggest problem that South Africa faces is an ANC government who wants to keep the people dependent. Poverty is characterised by the inability of individuals, households or communities to command sufficient resources to satisfy the social acceptable minimum standards of living.

“Inequality” can be defined in terms of being the opposite of equality, a state of social organisation that enables or gives equal access to resources and opportunities to its members – and therefore the drive for the open opportunity society agenda of the DA.

Poverty is not a static condition. Individuals, households or communities may be vulnerable to poverty as a result of shocks or crises, uncontrollable events which harm livelihoods and food security, and long-term trends such as racial and gender discrimination, environmental degradation and macroeconomic trends.

If we look at Census 2011 the population in the Western Cape has increased by 28,7%. The Western Cape population represents 5,88 million or 11,2% of the total population of South Africa.

In relation to the household distribution by province, the number of households in the Western Cape has increased by 39,26%.
In addition, the picture at a grass-roots level regarding household goods and services in the Western Cape is even more impressive.

If you look at the list of household goods and services, from refrigerators to vacuum cleaners, washing machines, computers, cell phones, radios and mail boxes, the Western Cape is above the average in South Africa, spelling out that life and service delivery in the Western Cape is better, and of a higher standard, than the rest of South Africa.

If we look at access to water Census 2011 revealed that 99,1% of the households in the Western Cape has access to piped water. This is the highest percentage of households compared to the rest of the country. A total of 70% of households in the Western Cape have access to piped water inside their dwellings.

*The challenge is now actually to supply the rest of our households that do not yet have water in their houses and on their erven, hence my colleague’s plan, Minister Madikizela, to promote serviced erven.

Census 2011 revealed that 89,66% of the households in the Western Cape have access to toilet facilities. This is the highest percentage of households with access to toilets compared to other provinces. The challenge once again is to provide the rest of the house holds with flushing toilets. About 3,7% of our house holds must still put up with bucket latrines, and it is important that we first have to determine where we will still find the so-called bucket latrines in the province and then join hands with the municipalities to eradicate that system.

†The Department of Local Government supports and monitors the Municipal Infrastructure Grant to the value of R455 million for the 2012-13 financial year. Historically, the largest portion of this funding is used for bulk water and sanitation infrastructure which supports the provision of basic water and sanitation. The spending over the last three years was 100%, 99,85% and 99,35%, also the highest in the country.

The Department of Human Settlements allocated funds to municipalities for the provision of basic water and sanitation services based on a study of service levels in informal settlements.

If we look at access to electricity, the Western Cape again has the highest number of households who have access to electricity, namely 93,4%, using electricity as a source of energy for lighting, while the lowest was recorded in the Eastern Cape province.

*Mr Deputy Speaker, it is shocking that today in a modern era, we are still sitting with a large number of households whose source of energy is wood, coal and paraffin. In the Western Cape, 86,9% of the house holds use electricity to prepare food. It is the highest percentage of all the provinces in the country. The lowest once again is the ANC controlled Eastern Cape with 31,2%. Once again we will do our best also to provide the outstanding house holds with the remaining 14% of the necessary energy sources.

When we look at refuse removal, 91,1% of the house holds in the Western Cape have access to refuse removal – once again no surprise, the best in South Africa. The Western Cape government is working hard at ensuring that this province is a place of good opportunities and excellent service delivery.
The results of this attempt are shown clearly in the Census data. Both the populations and households have grown increasingly between 2001 and 2011.

I am convinced that the migration from other provinces to the Western Cape has contributed to the increasing numbers of residents and households in the Western Cape searching for job opportunities and access to basic services.

It is a difficult challenge to keep ahead, with the increased infrastructure development and provision of basic services to our households.

†Notwithstanding budget constraints we are working hard ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The Minister must please conclude.

†The MINISTER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Saying all of this we can only come to the conclusion that there is a better quality of life and services in the Western Cape. [Time expired.]

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Deputy Speaker, it was Amilcar Cabral who said, “Tell no stories, tell no lies and claim no easy victories”. It is shameful actually that the DA comes here and continues a terrible propaganda, a terrible set of lies, deception, spin, smoke and mirrors.

You now say that the DA sits in the province and governs the province with the best services; you only increased those services by 2% in three years.

Progressively every province, every year, has shown an increase of basic services. Progressively every year has shown an increase of better health services and education services – whether Hernus Kriel was in power, whether the ANC was in power, or whether Helen Zille is in power. [Interjections.] No. In fact, the census tells us that it is not getting much quicker.

It says that the figures for attendance at public institutions are 2% down in the Western Cape, while poor indicators also dropped off, with pre-school learners down from 5,4% to 1,5% and adult education was cut by half. This is where the poor sits. The formative years for any child are probably the most important. [Interjections.] No, no, stop that refugee stuff that you raise. [Interjections.] Stop the refugee stuff that you raise. South Africa is a unitary state, it belongs to all of us.

The census is our trophy for 18 years of a new South Africa. [Interjections.] Shame on you. For many years in this country we fought for a new South Africa and Census 2011 tells us: You are doing very well. More can be done, but you are doing very well. So shame on you.

Despite your worry Mr Fritz about in-migration, you only actually received a fraction of people who migrate. Why are you telling lies? 1,4 million people moved to Gauteng. The Western Cape only received 433 000 people. A total of 1,4 people moved to Gauteng because people move where there are opportunities; they move to Gauteng and they move to the Western Cape. They don’t move because they are black, they don’t move because they are refugees, they move because they are people – like you and I, by the way.
Water provision is a basic service, but it has slowed down in the Western Cape. If any of you turn your tap on you will be surprised if you don’t have water and you will be really upset. Still too many people are without potable water. In fact, Free State and Gauteng did far better in providing people with piped and available water. [Interjections.] There are no people living in the Eastern Cape, but those are the lies you tell. Shame! [Interjections.]

In fact, the DA is telling people that ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... the Eastern Cape is not delivering and that is why people come to the Western Cape. Housing in the Eastern Cape has increased from 47,6% in 1996 to 61,8% in 2011. Higher education generally in this country, and especially for black students, increased from 7,1% to 12,3%. So we can go on. More than half of our people have increased basic services in the last five years. This is a hard fought battle against very vicious apartheid machinery that created the Bantustans that the Eastern Cape inherited. The Eastern Cape didn’t create the Bantustans; it’s the South African government pre-1994, and then you come and sit here and you say the Eastern Cape come to us because they are underdeveloped – incredible actually.

In fact, in this province household incomes fell back further compared to Gauteng. In the 2001 census the compared annual average income figures only differed by R400, but now the gap grew to R13 000 a year in favour of those in Gauteng. And, of course, it was racially divided. This means Gauteng outstrips the Western Cape. Mr Deputy Speaker, but that’s actually not the point of the census. The point of the census is to give us a road map, and this is where I think the DA, the Premier and the MEC for Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning get it very wrong. It gives us an opportunity to look back and see how far we’ve come, to look at who we are in the province and in this country, to look at what we can do, what would be better for our people and how do we get there. That’s actually the point of a census. It’s not all this bragging rubbish; it’s not all this stuff about lies and lies and more lies. It is about how we create a better quality of life for all people. It is about how we move from ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Brown! Is that a question, Minister Madikizela?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is a point of order. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Mr McKenzie!

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Can I just ask ...  

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a question to the Speaker?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is hon member Brown prepared to take a question?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Is it parliamentary ... [Interjections.]
The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry. Is it a point of order?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes. Is it parliamentary for a member to call other hon members liars?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, it’s not parliamentary to do that. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You can’t even hear properly; that’s your problem.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I didn’t say so, Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you did say that then it was unparliamentary, but I didn’t hear that, so please continue.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think we have an opportunity as government, as the opposition and as people of this country to be able to create and to work towards a better life for our people so that all our children, African, coloured and white children, can live as real South Africans. It might not happen today, it is in the years to come that it will happen, but it can’t happen if you don’t increase early childhood development spend because it means that children won’t have access to ...

[Time expired.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the question is: How do the new Census figures affect the operational functioning of local government in the Western Cape?

The 21,6% in the Western Cape is the lowest unemployment rate of all nine provinces. Even if the extended definition of unemployment is used, which increases the figure to 29,3%, it is still the lowest in South Africa. That unemployment figure means that fewer people need to apply for compassionate grants such as for water, electricity, and sewage and refuse removal. This immediately puts less pressure on the Western Cape's municipalities as far as the composition of their budgets is concerned.

The Western Cape welcomes all the people who put so much trust in the province and its DA-led government management. That trust is shown in the fact that it is the province with the highest influx of about 432 000 persons. The largest group of persons that will take part in the success of the Western Cape, such as excellent education, health care and housing, comes from the Eastern Cape, with 170 829 persons, followed by Gauteng with 74 000 persons.

Most of the people come and establish themselves and their families in the City of Cape Town. About 64% of the province's 5,8 million residents live within the city's boundaries, and this therefore puts enormous pressure on the city's authorities for service delivery.

Geographically, the City of Cape Town is squeezed between the sea at the southwestern and south-eastern boundaries, and the Cape sandstone mountains on the northern and north-eastern sides. Basically, no room for extension is available.

One of these days, towns such as Stellenbosch, Franschhoek, Paarl, Darling and Malmesbury with be integrated with Cape Town, forming one city. Fresh water within these boundaries is extremely limited, and sources are very scarce, except if the sea is looked at as a source of water, but it will be a very expensive option.
A problem requiring increasing attention is to find sufficient refuse dumping sites that comply with the necessary environmental specifications. Because increasingly more refuse is generated, there is increasing competition between the growing population and the refuse generated by the population. Alternative methods will have to be developed to get rid of refuse. One could, for example, consider combustion of refuse to generate electricity, which then will effectively address two problems at the same time.

To ensure that everyone has access to electricity poses a big challenge to the authorities, and especially the distribution of electricity. The problem is aggravated by the fact that local governments no longer have a say in the cost of electricity and have to rely on the mercy of Nersa. As I have already said before, Mr Speaker, it is time that local governments again begin to generate their own electricity by utilising modern technology, as well as by utilising renewable energy sources.

The other big monster to bear in mind is sewage. One can provide people with sewage systems, or it can run down the streets as it does in the rest of the country. The processing and storing of sewage increases together with the population. Space, and especially suitable space within the boundaries of the City of Cape Town poses a real problem. A distinction must be drawn between grey and black water and the reutilisation of grey water for irrigation and sewage by home owners and users, and it must be put into operation. Sewage water also creates an opportunity to serve as renewable alternative electricity.

The need for housing increases together with the growth of population and the influx of people. The province currently has a backlog of 500 000 houses, and with the present growth of the population by more than 29%, that backlog is growing yearly – it does not shrink. The question is whether we can still afford putting single units on stands.

As far as housing is concerned, much more innovation will have to be displayed. Knowledge, technology and resources are available, and with Cape Town that has been selected as the World Design Capital 2014, this can be one of the challenges that should be addressed.

The current Western Cape’s budget allocation for Human Settlements is based on the population figures of 2001, while the actual population figures are 29% more. The Western Cape subsidies must therefore be adapted pro rata, so that the people who need them most can get the services they deserve. An increase of 29% in the housing budget will result in an increase of R1725 billion. This means 5 000 houses at R100 000 per house or 21 000 serviced premises at a cost of R23 000 each.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I have only referred here to the increased pressure on Local Government. Other sectors such as Agriculture, Education, Health, social-welfare matters, policing and traffic infrastructure are not even referred to here. Councillors and senior officials of local governments will have to change over to another gear if they want to improve the momentum with service delivery, or just want to maintain it.

To function optimally and fulfil the needs of residents, it is therefore essential that the various Western Cape budgets be adapted pro rata to relieve the pressure that increasing growth puts on the available finances of the province.
Local governments must be much more disciplined and act precisely with limited resources. All of us will have to be much more innovative and definitely also more effective in the field in which we are equipped.

There is a saying that the wheel keeps turning and that chaos lies only a hairbreadth from success. The Western Cape therefore cannot afford to rest on its laurels. The challenges of today will have to be tackled innovatively if we want to be assured of a sustainable future. With the limited funds available, the Western Cape government is doing more for its people than other provinces are doing.

These excellent Census 2011 statistics bear testimony that the DA’s sustained good governance and administration are to the advantage of the residents of the Western Cape.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, much boasting and posturing have been on show here today, but in spite of that one asks oneself: Why are there so many service delivery protests springing up across the province while this is happening?

Mr Deputy Speaker, the question today is not about what you have done; it is about what you will be doing with the information contained in the Census. It is about what your plan is going forward to improve the lives of others.

Earlier today we had an interpellation about workers’ dissatisfaction with their meagre remuneration. Anyone who boasts about being the best at anything will draw those less fortunate to come and find out what the fuss is all about and try to benefit as well. But what a rude awakening meets them when they get here! This boasting about huge percentages that have access to water, sanitation, refuse removal and toilets means nothing when so many don’t have those benefits. Let’s speak about those who don’t have these benefits and where they live. It is the poor and they are black, and by that I mean anybody who is not white. How can we forget the Makhaza toilet saga and court order which still is not adhered to? [Interjections.] Don’t speak about huge percentages and statistics that prove what people have. Equate those percentages to numbers of people then the picture will emerge, because for every 1% that goes without anything it is 50,000 people who suffer. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: If the core function is to provide services, create an enabling environment for business and economic growth, why are businesses not encouraged to decentralise?

Of the six main infrastructure projects of economic development only one is rural, and it’s the presidential IDP. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, member! There is too much talking across the floor between Minister Madikizela, Minister Winde and Mr McKenzie. Please continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The inequalities remain, Mr Deputy Speaker, and they remain stark. Poverty levels grow. People are not seeing the benefits. This Census has proven what we’ve always been saying: The population of the Western Cape is the most divided of all in South Africa.
Mr Deputy Speaker, if the DA wants to contest or argue about the information that’s in the Census, I’m not the one that should be heading it. I’m repeating what I’ve seen written in the Census, as they had used that same information. The information in the Census is meant for cool heads to plan for where the needs are most dire, for the rich to accept that they have to share, that they have to get up and sometimes step down, that there are still too huge disparities between rich and poor, black and white, urban and rural and the socio-economic conditions under which the poor live.

The Western Cape is not the largest or fastest growing province. The Census has proved that Gauteng has overtaken them and that whites from this province are leaving for a better life there. [Interjections.] Minister Trevor Manuel from the National Planning Commission has a plan and he has proven that he has his finger on the pulse. He knows the core of the problem, but he has also shown that there are solutions. However, “together” is the operative word here. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, what is the implication? Together is only good for the DA; it’s not good when the ANC says it. What is the implication for Treasury of the Western Cape in all of this? We are often told that 80% of the budget is spent on the poor. The question is: How much of the 80% is statutory conditional grants which you are supposed to spend for the intended purpose anyway?

A minuscule amount of the total budget is equitable share. [Interjections.] Don't plough with another man's heifer. A total of 450 000 coming from the Eastern Cape are not people who are just migrating. They are not necessarily just refugees. Does the DA even remember that many of those people could be those who are coming home to their places of birth to come and settle because of the homeland policy? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: A minuscule amount of the equitable share is spent on own revenue. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, that actually means that it is 80% of the 20% of own revenue and equitable share that is spent on the poor.

Regarding the increase in the population and the socioeconomic conditions under which people live, there is not a single department that can escape rethinking how and where the biggest spend and priority should focus. Municipalities will have to change the way of doing things and getting information from the public – a plan for the future based on the information in the Census.

The bulge in age distribution sends a serious warning, especially to Education, to be very sensitive and proactive about where it builds or closes schools or redefines the use of a school building – a plan for the future based on the information in the Census.

Health facilities will have to improve. Social services now have an even greater responsibility to support the elderly and the vulnerable.
†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please conclude.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, we have just finished the annual reports, and the picture was dismal. With the Census information available, the challenge to the province is to improve its bad record of employment equity and also to control the situation where the whites are still the people who own the biggest share of the wealth and earn the highest salaries. [Time expired.]

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank you for allowing me to participate in this important debate.

Census data is a vital tool in determining the needs of our population. These statistics are helpful in making informed strategic decisions to allocate scarce resources where they are needed most.

The statistics are very clear that the Western Cape, which is governed by the DA, has been the best performer in addressing and delivering on social issues that are close to the hearts and minds of all who live here. This province still faces many challenges, but we are on the right track. This is redress in action.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the census data does not address safety concerns directly. The safety of the people of the Western Cape is vital in ensuring an environment that can limit crime opportunities.

Earlier this year, Minister Plato released the 2011/2012 Policing Needs and Priorities Report. This report identifies what our communities feel are the highest priorities when it comes to addressing crime. I want to encourage safety and security entities and management to consider this report when determining their strategies to fight crime and social injustice.

What we can determine from the census data is that there has been a growth in population from other provinces, to experience better opportunities. I interpret this as a vote of confidence in the DA’s service delivery ability in the Western Cape.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is important that both provincial and national trends must be looked at. Both must be taken into consideration to determine current readiness, as well as to endorse policies and budgets in the future.

According to Pali Lehohla, the Western Cape is the fastest growing province in South Africa. Hard work helps to ensure that the province is and remains a home for growing opportunities and excellent service delivery. In spite of the sharp increase in population figures, the province was able to remain up to date with service delivery.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the reality in education and the provision of health care shows that the Western Cape takes important trends into consideration right up to now.

The 2011 Census shows a tremendous increase in the percentage of 5- to 7-year-olds that receive education. It grew from 45,6% in 2001 to 81,2% in 2011. The Western Cape government sets the improvement of education outcomes as a strategic objective. Improvement of literacy and numerical skill in grades 1 to 6 is important, and the foundation phase of education is receiving special focus.
This year, during his budget speech, Minister Grant announced that grade 1 and 2 learners are going to receive their own mathematics textbooks – unlike Limpopo. [Interjections.] This forms part of the additional R144 million spent over and above standard funding for textbooks in the Western Cape this year.

The new infrastructure plan announced on 4 September 2012 follows on the success of the 2010 plan. The new plan makes provision for 26 new schools, 46 replacement schools, 5 classroom replacement projects, as well as 124 Grade R classrooms in the medium term.

Mr Deputy Speaker, R24 million was made available in 2013-14 and R26 million in 2014-15 for more than 300 schools in quintiles 4 and 5, that serve the poorer communities. Furthermore, the successes of the DA government are already known. They bring a turnaround in the six-year long decline of the Matric pass rate; obtain the highest Matric pass rate in the country in 2011 – 84,7%; and reduce the under-achieving schools from 85 in 2009 to only 30 towards the end of 2011. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Yes.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you may continue. I'm asking for some order in the House, please.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you. With regard to service delivery in Health, the aim of health infrastructure in the province is to have a health facility within easy travelling distance for every resident in the province, whether near a railway station or a taxi rank. Health infrastructure contributes directly to the strategic objective “Increasing Wellness” by making facilities available that are centrally situated to improve accessibility.

Currently the Western Cape Department of Health is managing R8 billion to 160 upgrade projects over the next four years. There cent opening of the Khayelitsha Hospital and the progress of the Mitchells Plain Hospital shows the government's commitment to reduce the burden of diseases and at the same time addresses the tension between limited resources and growing health needs.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the rapid urbanisation, especially in the Western Cape, shows that South Africans are moving away from areas where service delivery is poor and job opportunities are scarce.

In spite of the successes up to now, the impact of the 2011 Census must be addressed to avoid future problems. Seventy percent of the population are of working age, but the unemployment rates of 22% in general and 29% among the youth is a big challenge for the province and for the national government. It is more important than before to offer opportunities to our youth – to empower themselves through education to be able to obtain jobs after leaving school.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape government offers quality education to empower the youth to become skilled and be prepared.
Good governance as a principle in the Western Cape means that our leadership under Premier Zille spends the available budget responsibly, and not like President Zuma who spends R238 million on his personal property. Shame on you! It does mean that the province is in a position to bring about the best service delivery in South Africa, given the tremendous pressure on the limited funds.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, what the Census shows me is the massive work the ANC has done since it came into power in 1994. [Interjections.]

They say that there is none so blind as those who will not see. So take your glasses off and look at the statistics. The longer you don’t see this, the more you don’t understand your own country.

Household income has doubled in 10 years, and there is a lot of talk about the gap between the rich and the poor. However, what is significant about that doubling is that the CPI only went up 78% in the time when the household income went up 113%. In fact, under the ANC, South Africans have grown richer, which is not what happened under apartheid. It is not what happened under the government you were prepared to give your lives to defend. [Interjections.] Not one of you mentioned it. You can agree, but you don’t put the honest truth across.

Using any indicator in the Census, the strides made by the ANC are incredible. Let me give you some examples. The number of people who have Grade 12 education in the country went up from 16% to 28% from 1996 – all under ANC rule.

Look at the number of people who live in formal dwellings. It went up from 65% to 77% – all under the ANC. Look at the number of people who don’t have schooling. It went down from 18% to 8% – a magnificent achievement! Let us remind you that the province with the largest number of people who are not in schools is the Western Cape. The population group with the lowest participation in education is coloureds, which is the majority of the population in this province. That says a lot about your schooling system. I can go on about electricity, flush toilets and every indicator of poverty. The ANC government has made a significant difference on those matters. [Interjections.] The same is not true about the Western Cape.

Given those massive achievements by the ANC government, the question then comes: Is it true that the Western Cape is the top performer? [Interjections.] Even if it was, did it have something to do with the DA?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

Mr M OZINSKY: The DA has only been in power for three years, and for two of those three years the DA MEC and the DA Premier were saying: “This is not our budget. This is not our plan. We are only starting.” [Interjections.] The DA has only had one year of any significant difference on these issues. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: In fact, the issues that are used by the DA to show how good they are – migration, for instance – are blown away by the figures, because far more people migrate to Gauteng than they migrate to the Western Cape. For instance, in the Western Cape, there was a net migration of 303 000 people. In Gauteng, the net migration was over 1 million, three times the number that came to the Western Cape. [Interjections.]
If your poll was on the basis of people going to the provinces they support, where there is service delivery, then there would be three times the number of people going to ANC provinces in comparison to DA provinces.

Even the Western Cape had people going to the Eastern Cape. Even the Western Cape had more than 500 000 people leaving the province to go to Gauteng.

The simple nonsense that is spoken on that side of the House that the migration shows some achievement by the DA is blown away by the actual migration figures. [Interjections.] The migration figures show that a greater proportion of people go to ANC provinces. One hundred and seventeen thousand people came from the Eastern Cape to the Western Cape in 10 years, but 265 000 people went from the Eastern Cape to other provinces besides the Western Cape – ANC provinces. [Interjections.] No, they are not running; they are going to ANC provinces. The number that is going from the Eastern Cape to ANC provinces is twice the number that come to the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: With the view of this government expressed in the tweet by the hon Premier that these people are refugees who come here, I can tell you it is not going to continue in that direction. In fact, I must say about the Premier’s tweet that she has only apologised for the damage the tweet did to the DA and its election campaign. [Interjections.] She has never apologised for the content of the tweet. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: She was only worried about the damage she did to the DA. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just get back to the topic of the Census.

†Mr M OZINSKY: How that relates to the Census is because those members, including the Premier in her tweet, said that the reason why people are migrating from the Eastern Cape to the Western Cape is because of something the DA did. That is the relevance. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, I note that I’m not being protected from these members. I sat very quietly while they were speaking. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: I wonder when the Premier ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, please! There is far too much communication among members and the Chair is being ignored. Please allow the hon member to have his turn. Please continue.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I’ve wondered many times, since the Premier tweeted that, what she felt, for instance, in 1983 while KTC and Netreg were being destroyed by their government they were fighting for at the time. They were officers in that army at the time. [Interjections.] I wondered what she felt.
Did she say in 1983 that these people are streaming from the Eastern Cape because of the ANC? They were streaming from the Eastern Cape to the Western Cape. She must have thought that they were running from the ANC policy in those days. She’s never answered that question. Honestly, it shows us that what she thought in 1983 was not what we thought, those of us who were fighting the system. What she thought then was something else, and we see it today in the support that the DA gives to the migrant labour system.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member, your time has expired. Your last sentence, if you like.

†Mr M OZINSKY: What the Census shows is the magnificent delivery by the ANC government, and the Census destroys the DA’s arguments about what they have achieved. [Time expired.]

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, after that magnificent speech and the magnificent delivery from the ANC I can, first of all, say that no one has ever said that the people leave the Eastern Cape and only come to the Western Cape. Who has ever said that? [Interjections.] Not at all. The people do leave the Eastern Cape because of the shocking ANC government there.

That’s why they leave, and they go wherever else they can go to try and find opportunity. No one ever disputed the fact that the household incomes go up, so I don’t know where Mr Ozinsky gets all these from.

We welcome the Census, and people can pick numbers and go all over the place. We welcome the Census, because the Census is a barometer. The Census is a tool that we will use tomorrow – and I’ll speak about that just now – when we have our Budget Council meeting.

Mr Deputy Speaker, although this is not a budget speech, I must just say a couple of things to some of the speakers ... [Interjections.] ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Brown, please! There is too much noise.

†The MINISTER: ... before I get on to what I actually wanted to say. [Interjections.] You cannot. [Laughter.] Not me? You can’t listen to them? That’s more understandable.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, Minister.

†The MINISTER: It is about a tool that we have to use to have a look at our policies and where we need to intensify delivery to make a difference to the people of this province. I can assure you that we will take those figures, adjust our systems and go and discuss it at National Treasury level to try and change our allocation of funding because of what we have been saying for so many years about the pressure on our system. We will get that changed so that we can start to make those differences and fill those gaps, and continue to use this barometer.

That’s exactly what the hon Haskin was talking about when he spoke to specifically one of those glaring points in the Census that talks about the bucket system.
The bucket system is definitely an area where we have to make those changes. It is also interesting to note the following. If you take those numbers on the bucket system and look at the kind of allocation we receive financially and the pressure of people coming here to look for opportunity, you will see how those numbers have actually remained stagnant. They remained stagnant despite those pressures, which means that there is delivery in that space, but we have to now take this barometer and ramp up that delivery so that we can remove that kind of indignity that people have to live with altogether.

Minister Bredell spoke about poverty traps and how we really have to focus on changing the poverty space. Those talk to specifically the programmes in this government, and I wanted to highlight just two of them which really go into focus on what we are seeing in the Census as to where our pressures lie. Our biggest pressure lies – just as it lies in other provinces, and specifically in Gauteng – amongst our youth, our young people who need those opportunities. It is the two areas in our young people’s space where we are seeing great number changes, and that is in the BPO space, where in the last five years we’ve gone from 7 000 young people employed in the BPO sector to 36 000 people. In that space we’ve just won two weeks ago – and this is not the Western Cape; this is South Africa, but the Western Cape attracts predominantly the most of that investment – the Off shoring Destination of the Year award globally when it comes to BPO.

When it comes to work and skills which, of course, is another area where the ANC have been blocking youth development and helping the youth get going, we’ve continued to push with our work and skills programme amongst the youth. It’s really good news that from the jobs front we now have clarity and confirmation of R116 million to put into this programme, while we wait for Cosatu, who holds up that R5 billion tax claim back, but we could be helping so many more young people.

The hon Brown, who is no longer here, talks about the lies, but it’s not lies that people come to this province for education. [Interjections.] It’s not lies that people come to this province for help and it’s not lies that people come to this province for...

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: The hon Minister is misleading the House. The hon Brown is right here. [Interjections.] No, but this is here. He said she’s not here. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please take your seat. You can continue, Minister.

†The MINISTER: I apologise for lying that the hon Brown wasn’t in the House. She wasn’t in her seat. I’m glad to see that she’s back in her seat so that she can listen to what I’ve got to say.

People come here from the Eastern Cape to come for our education system because of the 300 or more schools that have been closed in the Eastern Cape in the last year. They come here for our health facilities and our hospitals, and they come here for economic opportunity. We have to work harder and harder to make sure that when they do come here they can play meaningful roles in our economy and meaningful roles in using those opportunities to change their own lives.

I perhaps also want to just say one thing about the hon Beerwinkel. The hon Beerwinkel talks about the Western Cape poverty levels that are growing and
growing. This was a debate on these documents, called the Census. When she makes that statement she obviously hasn’t read anything in these documents. [Interjections.]

However, let’s talk about two other documents that you should also read. The one looks at the LSM levels in South Africa, and that goes to what the hon Ozinsky was talking about, how people have actually managed to become wealthier in the LSM levels.

We have all climbed those LSM levels over the last few years. [Interjections.] Go and have a look at that document. [Interjections.]

The second thing is the Gini coefficient, and specifically the Gini coefficient for this region. Go and have a look at the difference in the Gini coefficient over the last five years. It was the widest gap in South Africa. The gap has narrowed and of all cities, Cape Town is by far the lowest or the closest gap in South Africa. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, what are the real implications for us in this province of this Census, which talks to the 47.2% increase between the 1996 Census and the 2011 Census of our population, from 3,956 million to 5,822 million? What are the real implications? Obviously, the pressures on our budget have been enormous, and tomorrow, as I’ve said, at 08:00 we will start the Budget Council meeting with this Census for the first time. We will be able to start to talk about the changes that are going to happen to our budget over time.

Mr P C MCKENZIE: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: They are not going to happen immediately. It’s a slow process, but that discussion will start and so we can start to see the increase in funding that will come to the Western Cape and the increase in funding that will go to Gauteng. We can then use that money in this province, like we have shown, as opposed to the other provinces in this country.

We will spend all of that money as close to 100% as possible. We will spend it responsibly and in the right places to make a difference for the people of this province. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, that’s why in this province, once we have that budget, we will be able to ramp up the delivery that we are already that’s already happening. That is why you see in this province the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa but, more importantly, the difference between the narrow unemployment rate and the expanded unemployment rate also being the lowest in South Africa. People who are here continue to have hope and they continue to look for jobs, not like in other provinces where they give up hope. [Interjections.] I’m talking about the expanded and the narrow unemployment rate. Listen to what I’m saying. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon Von Brandis mentioned Entrepreneurship Week that’s happening in the city at the moment. Let’s talk about another report, called the Gems Report, the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor.
That report that has just come out now says that Cape Town’s entrepreneurship levels are 65% above that of the national norm, where Gauteng’s economic participation rate and levels of entrepreneurship are only 24% above the national norm. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, Minister! Please conclude. Your time has almost expired.

†The MINISTER: At the same time, an even dramatic figure that hints at one of the reasons for Cape Town’s lead, the City’s concentration of opportunity entrepreneurs – those who want to start businesses rather than those who have no choice – is a whopping 190% above the South African average. [Time expired.]

Debate concluded.

REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT ON NATIONAL HEALTH AMENDMENT BILL [B24D—2011] (NCOP)

(Consideration)

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The legislature has received the Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the National Health Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill without amendments. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. There was no debate.

The mandate conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill was ratified.

REPORT OF BUDGET COMMITTEE ON DIVISION OF REVENUE AMENDMENT BILL [B33—2012] (NCOP)

(Consideration)

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Similarly, the legislature has received the Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill without amendments. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP.

There was no debate.

The mandate conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill was ratified.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Before we adjourn, I just want to remind hon members that the Auditor-General is waiting outside to give a presentation to us. Please don’t go away too far. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:12.
The Speaker:

1. **Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the Annual Reports of the Department of Agriculture and Casidra for the year ended 31 March 2012, dated 14 November 2012.**

The Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Planning, having considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Agriculture and Casidra for the year ended 31 March 2012 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

**C. Introduction**

As part of its oversight function the Committee considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Agriculture and Casidra. Annual reports are the key instruments to report performance measured against their performance targets and budgets outlined by the Department of Agriculture in its strategic plans. The role of standing committees in overseeing annual reports is crucial in closing the accountability loop of planning, budgeting, implementation, reporting, auditing and oversight. In essence, the standing committees should exercise oversight as to whether departments and public entities delivered on the service delivery promises they made in their strategic plans.

The annual report programme for the 2011/2012 financial year was advertised in newspapers, inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions. Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Minister and the Head of Department were given an opportunity to make opening remarks.

Members of the Committee interrogated the department on Part 1: General Information, Part 2: Departmental Programme Performance and Part 4: Human Resources Management of the department’s annual report. Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions or to make an input during the discussions.

**D. Oversight reports on department and entity**

3. **Department of Agriculture**

(c) **Overview**

Strategic goals of the Department of Agriculture are as follows:

(i) To support the Provincial Agricultural Sector to at least maintain its export position for the next 5 years by growing its value added from R14.014 billion in 2009;
(ii) To ensure that at least 60% of all agricultural land reform projects in the Province are successful over the next 5 years;
(iii) To support the sector (farmers and industries) to increase agricultural production (primary Provincial commodities) by at least 10% over the next 10 years;
(iv) To optimise the sustainable utilisation of our natural resources through conservation methodologies to increase agricultural production;
(v) To increase agricultural economic opportunities in selected rural areas based on socio-economic needs over a 10-year period.

The annual report highlighted that 23 wine companies participated in the Yantai International Wine Festival in China, resulting in four export deals for South African companies. In addition, 61 Market Information reports have been produced and disseminated to farmers.

The Department of Agriculture engineering services provided support to 86 land reform beneficiaries. Farmer Support and Development facilitated 105 farm assessments, contributed to the development of 80 land use plans, and veterinary assistance and advice were rendered. R12million was accessed by beneficiaries through the Market Access Program. Production increase by new and adapted technology was generated from cutting-edge research efforts.

Sustainable Resource Management provided 162 irrigation farmers with information to assist them to increase production whilst using the same water allocation.

An increase of agricultural economic opportunities to R82million worth of investment occurred in projects in rural areas. Two additional nodes were implemented to bring the total number of Rural Development Nodes in the Province to eight.

(d) Concerns/Findings

(i) The ostrich sector experienced major problems as a result of the impact of Avian Influenza. The outbreak caused a complete standstill of this R1.2billion a year industry, which employs more than 20 000 people in rural Western Cape.

The Minister initiated discussions with the National Minister of the Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry (DAFF) and DAFF subsequently approved compensation to farmers for culled birds to the amount of more than R50million;

(ii) Two disaster aid projects were implemented, i.e. the 2008 Floods and 2010 Eden drought project. In total R27million were paid out for drought assistance since the inception of the scheme, with R24.9million paid in the 2011/12 financial year;

(iii) The Fencing Project, which is a partnership between the Department of Agriculture and the Department of Transport and Public Works incorporates more than 50 farms will protect the farmer’s assets from increasing loss by problem animals and allow the farmers to farm sustainably;
(iv) There has been a shortage of veterinary services;

(v) The Smart Pen (Digital pen) has improved the business process and efficiency of the Programme: FSD in the Department of Agriculture;

(vi) It has become apparent that red meat abattoirs, especially sheep abattoirs, are struggling to maintain effective daily slaughter throughput. This problem could be due to various reasons. Many complaints were received relating to the negative influence of illegal slaughter on slaughter throughput registered abattoirs; and


(e) Recommendations

The standing committee wishes to recommend that--

(i) The Department present to the Committee the full evaluation report which will be done on the Market Access programme which is planned to be completed in 2013/14 financial year;

(ii) The Committee undertake an oversight visit to the Department to familiarise itself with the Smart Pen technology;

(iii) The Committee undertake an oversight visit to rural development nodes;

(iv) The Department should look at the veterinary services/staff and find new ways to fill these gaps. This could include enhancement of diagnostic services;

(v) The Department to find funding for research as part of the sub-programme 5.1; and

(vi) The Committee undertake an oversight visit to Elandskloof in Citrusdal.

(f) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Department of Agriculture to furnish the committee with:

(xi) Report on the Survey done on the 202 Agricultural land reform farms;

(xii) The lessons learnt from the World Foods Day survey to assess progress made on the projects funded since 2007 conducted by the Farmer support and development programme;

(xiii) A detailed report on each of the eight rural development nodes;

(xiv) A report on the extension services, including the budget;

(xv) The report on the impact study with regards to students skills-based training and fulltime study in higher education training programmes;
(xvi) The report on the monitoring and evaluation of the Market Access Programme once it has been completed;

(xvii) The Zero Hunger Programme and what co-ordination structures are in place between Provincial Departments and farmers to facilitate access to government markets by smallholder farmers; and

(xviii) The costs and the details of the quarterly talks conducted on radio for 2011/12.

4. Casidra

(b) Background

The period under review is one of transition for Casidra as they are in the process of moving from being an implementing agent for the Department of Economic Development and Tourism (DEDAT) and the Department of Agriculture (DOA) to being focused solely on implementing programs for the Department.

Closure of RED Door centres – and the termination of other programmes that were part of DEDAT – caused high levels of uncertainty during the year, but Casidra managed to stay focused on its area of competency – project management.

The focus has been moved to ‘comprehensive rural development’ – combining farmer support and development with poverty alleviation efforts in rural areas. Casidra as an implementing organisation is at the coal-face of rural inequality and sees their role as optimising opportunities for farmers and communities.

The Auditor-General noted that 25% of the planned targets were not achieved in the year under review. This was mainly due to the fact that the RED Door programme came to an end earlier than planned.

The loss of the DEDAT as a client remains a big challenge for the company and has resulted in a scaling down on staff capacity and operational requirements. Casidra functioned during this period with an Interim CEO and experienced loss of Board Members.

For several reasons, Amalienstein and Waaikraal farms were not self-sustainable during the reporting period and Anhalt farm registered its lowest income since 2005. Casidra continues to work on turn-around strategies for these entities and to manage them on behalf of the Department of Agriculture.

(c) Concerns/Findings

(i) 3827 jobs were created and 2187 new businesses established through the RED Initiative programmes;

(ii) Casidra supplies implementation support to 6 Rural Development projects as part of the Comprehensive Rural Development Plan;

(iii) Capital improvements, including the planting of new orchards, were made to Anhalt farm and these were financed by the farms own reserves;
(iv) Corporate Social Responsibility initiative coordinated the donations of blankets, cloths, food parcels and second hand computers to NGOs in the Province;

(v) A new funding arrangement has been put into place, whereby the Department of Agriculture became the sole institutional funder of Casidra; and

(vi) The emphasis in Casidra’s mandate on the economic side has therefore shifted to Local Economic Development facilitation in rural areas within the agricultural sphere.

(d) Recommendations

The standing committee wishes to recommend that the Committee undertake an oversight visit to Community and Household Food Gardens.

(e) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

Casidra and the Department of Agriculture to furnish the committee with the assessment which was done since 2008 on the Community and Household Food Garden successes.

E. Conclusion

The Committee wishes to express its appreciation for the information provided by the Minister and the Head of the Department of Agriculture and Casidra and officials from the Department of Agriculture and Casidra.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this Report.


The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning, having considered the Annual Reports for the year ended 31 March 2012 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function, the Committee considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and Cape Nature. Annual reports are the key instruments for departments to report performance measured against their performance targets and budgets outlined by the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning in its strategic plans. The role of standing committees in overseeing annual reports is crucial in closing the accountability loop of planning, budgeting, implementation, reporting, auditing and oversight. In essence, the standing committees should exercise oversight as to whether departments and public entities delivered on the service delivery promises they made in their strategic plans.
The annual report programme for the 2011/2012 financial year was advertised in newspapers inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions. Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Minister and the Head of Department were given an opportunity to make opening remarks.

Members of the Committee interrogated the department on Part 1: General Information, Part 2: Departmental Programme Performance and Part 4: Human Resources Management of the department's annual report. Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions or to make an input during the discussions.

B. Oversight reports on department and entity

1. Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

(a) Overview

The focus of this Department is planning for the future and ensuring that those plans are implemented in an efficient and effective manner. A key focus by the Department, in this period, has been to contribute to an enabling environment (policies, laws and regulations) for the achievement of its strategic objectives.

The Department must balance the needs of the citizens of the Western Cape for short term growth, housing and job opportunities with the long term aims for sustainability.

The Department’s mandate also extends beyond the Department itself, and includes supporting the rest of Provincial Government to mainstream issues of sustainability and resource efficiency.

Capacity building, public awareness campaigns, competitions and public participation are focus areas for the Department in order to educate the public, other Departments and Departmental stakeholders in their quest for a sustainable society.

Although the Department received an unqualified audit for the period under review, there are some issues related to finance that require attention such as the high risk areas highlighted in the report.

(b) Concerns/Findings

(i) Number of Provincial Biodiversity policies to be develop had not been completed due to capacity constraints; and

(ii) The concern was raised that many of the targets and actual achievements did not match which could be interpreted by the uninformed reader as demonstrating deficient planning.
(c) Recommendations

The standing Committee wishes to recommend that—

(i) The Department engage further with the Committee on the matter of the Environmental Commissioner;

(ii) The Department present the guidelines for the EIA report to the Committee together with the EIA blueprints;

(iii) The Department present the Green Procurement Policy (GPP) to the Committee;

(iv) The Department brief the Committee on the Mercury Management awareness and pollution prevention in the 2Precious2Pollute programme;

(v) The Committee resolved to invite pertinent stakeholders with regards to the management of fire breaks including provincial, private and national entities;

(vi) The Committee desires a briefing on the Western Cape Water Plan. For this purpose the Department should forward the plan to the Committee by the end of November 2012;

(vii) The Committee would like a briefing on the pollution aspects of our rivers with emphasis on biological entities, chemical substances and heavy metals;

(viii) The Committee is extremely concerned at the level of vacancies of essential services expertise and encourages the Minister to do everything possible to address these shortcomings;

(ix) Far more attention should be paid to the editing of the Annual Report with the understanding that this is a public document that is read by the public; and

(x) That errata in the Annual Reports’ of Department and Entity should be made available at least one week before the meeting, so as to allow members to accommodate these in the evaluation of the report.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning to furnish the committee with:

(i) the annual monitoring and evaluation reports, which were drafted on the implementation of municipal integrated waste management plans;

(ii) The Sustainable Water Management Plan for the Province;

(iii) The reports on assessing contaminated land for remediation; and
(iv) The DVD and five factsheets on Mercury Management that were developed.

2. Cape Nature

(a) Overview

The Oudebosch Mountain Cabins at the Kogelberg Nature Reserve won an Acknowledgement Award at the 3rd Annual Holcim Foundation Competition for Sustainable Construction.

Both the Oudebosch Mountain Cabins and the Goukamma Nature Reserve tourism development were launched in 2011.

Cape Nature is an organisation and needs to focus its efforts on institution building and organisation development in order to meet the demands placed on it by its various stakeholders and funders as well as the public itself. Key priorities are human resources, accounting practices and strategy.

The organisation’s mandate is a critical one for the Province – but it has not necessarily received the requisite resources needed to pursue the comprehensive nature of the mandate of conservation, job creation, human resource development and ultimately, the development of the economy of the Western Cape.

There is room for the organisation to explore models that would allow it to fully capitalize on its resources – and perhaps bridge some of the funding gaps. The expectation to be 100% funded by Treasury is not realistic in the long-term.

The funded positions identified as necessary by a work volume analysis cannot be funded by Provincial Treasury at this time.

The organisation is very aware of the levels of unemployment in the province and actively seeks to fulfil its mandate of job creation through job training and raising awareness of conservation as a potential career path for the Youth.

Cape Nature also seeks to engage with the public and especially young people, raising awareness about conservation and Biodiversity in the Western Cape.

(b) Concerns/Findings

(i) The organisation is experiencing higher work volume than is optimal and as a result its employees (and board members) have been overloaded in the 2011/2012 year;

(ii) Cape Nature’s Integrated Catchments Management system that manages rivers from ‘catchments to coast’ continues to bear fruit, protecting the Province’s fresh water systems and providing job creation;
(iii) Management of 112 Provincial Nature Reserves (including islands), State Forests, Marine Protected Areas (MPA) and Mountain Catchment Areas (MCA) represents a major concentration of resources;

(iv) Visitor numbers increased by 47% during the year of the report;

(v) Job Creation - 193,081 working days were contributed by Cape Nature;

(vi) Invasive Alien Vegetation - 114,512 hectares cleared;

(vii) 26,000 young people and schoolchildren were involved through outreach, education and awareness programs; and

(viii) Cape Nature’s Integrated Catchments Management system that manages rivers from ‘catchments to coast’ continues to bear fruit, protecting the Province’s fresh water systems and providing job creation.

(c) Recommendations

The Standing Committee wishes to recommend that–

(i) The Department provide the committee with the written response to the following questions asked on the “Continued funding to Cape Nature

(aa) How does Cape Nature monitor and evaluate the impact of the Estuary Management Forums?

(bb) What are other possibilities of funding for this service?

(cc) How does Cape Nature expect this impact to change if the funding situation were changed and the forums no-longer operated on a contractual basis?

(ii) As Cape Nature’s nature reserves are a showpiece for the province it is disappointing, that the roads have deteriorated substantially and the Department of Transport and Public Works and Treasury should pay serious attention to increasing the budget for maintenance of roads;

(iii) Cape Nature brief the Committee on the progress with regards to the management of damage-causing animals and the monitoring systems in place; and

(iv) The Committee revisit the Kogelberg Nature Reserve to investigate the completed Oudebosch site.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

Cape Nature to furnish the committee with the State of Biodiversity Report for 2012.
C. Conclusion

The Committee wishes to express its appreciation for the information provided by the Minister and the Head of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and Cape Nature and officials from the Department and the entity.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this Report.


The Standing Committee on Local Government, having considered the Annual Report of the Department of Local Government for the year ended 31 March 2012 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

The annual report programme for the 2011/2012 financial year was advertised in newspapers inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions. Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Minister and the Head of Department were given an opportunity to make opening remarks.

Members of the Committee deliberated on Part 1: General Information, Part 2: Departmental Programme Performance and Part 4: Human Resources Management of the Department’s Annual Report. Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions or to make an input during the discussions.

B. Oversight report on the Department

1. Department of Local Government

(a) Overview

In serving municipalities, Department is supporting them in areas ranging from legislative support to capacity building; with the aim of ensuring that municipalities deliver on their legislative mandates. The Annual Report highlighted what the Department was able to achieve and the challenges it faced in the 2011/12 financial year.

The Department was amongst other things able to provide training to new Councillors, assist municipalities to establish ward committees and train ward committee members on their roles and responsibilities support 20 municipal officials through the second IDP learnership; and assess the property rates policies in municipalities.

During 2011/12 the Department had a positive impact on communities through strengthening its planning and coordination role.
Some of these achievements include:

(i) Taking services closer to the people;
(ii) Improving planning to ensure budget alignment;
(iii) Supporting Municipalities to deliver on their mandate; and
(iv) Proactively minimising the impact of possible disasters.

(b) Findings/Concerns

(i) Cape Winelands District Municipality did not comply with the provisions of the Disaster Management Act, 2002 (Act 57 of 2002). Its Disaster Management Centre will only be operational from 1 April 2013;
(ii) Support initiatives to provincial departments, municipalities and state owned enterprises in developing a disaster preparedness plan, were implemented;
(iii) The Integrated Development Plan (IDP) analysis framework was developed;
(iv) Only Kannaland Municipality did not comply with the Remuneration of Public Office Bearers Act, 1978 (Act 20 of 1978);
(v) The Department is not monitoring compliance with the Consumer Protection Act, 2008 (Act 68 of 2008);
(vi) With regards to the Thusong Centre funding, funds were taken from Cederberg Municipality and re-allocated to Bergrivier Municipality for the establishment of a Thusong Centre;
(vii) With regards to Disaster Management (specifically incidents at sea), the Department does not have mechanisms to assess risks posed by the petro-chemical industry in the harbour;
(viii) The department introduced and implemented the Neighbourhood Development Planning (NDP) in four municipalities namely: Beaufort West, Witzenberg, Cederberg and Mossel Bay Municipalities;
(ix) The Municipal Compliance Model has not been finalised;
(x) The Integrated Development Plans (IDP) of Bergrivier and Saldanha Bay Municipalities were not considered to be credible;
(xi) The implementation of the simplified IDP framework was found to be in contravention of Chapter 5 of the Municipal Systems Act, 2000 (Act 32 of 2000);
(xii) Swellendam, Oudtshoorn and Kannaland Municipalities did not table their Annual Reports within the legislated timeframe; and
(xiii) The Committee raised its serious concern regarding the high vacancy rate amongst the critical positions within the Department.

(c) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that the–

(i) Department monitors the compliance regarding the Consumer Protection Act, as the community needs to understand their rights and local government needs to educate communities about their rights;

(ii) Department must ensure that the Cape Winelands District Municipality Disaster Managements Centre is operational by 1 April 2013;

(iii) Department report to the Committee on the findings of the Citizen Satisfaction Survey;

(iv) The Department with the Provincial Treasury report to the committee on the interventions they have made to ensure that the IDPs of Bergrivier and Saldanha Bay Municipalities are credible and are aligned to the budget;

(v) The Department with the Provincial Treasury must assist Swellendam, Oudtshoorn and Kannaland Municipalities through Operation Clean Audit to finalise and submit their Annual Reports within the legislative timeframe;

(vi) Department report to the committee on the criteria they use to define basic services;

(xiv) Department takes steps to fill the vacant critical positions;

(xv) The department report back to the committee on the progress made with regards to the promulgation of Liquor Trading Hours and Credit Control and Debt Collection by-laws; and

(vii) Department must obtain a legal opinion on the implementation of the simplified IDP framework and report back to the committee on this matter.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

That the Department provides the Committee with:

(i) A plan to address service delivery protests;

(ii) A study of the criteria and standards to determine the provision of basic services;

(iii) A detailed organogram including funded and unfunded positions;

(iv) Feedback on training on the Consumer Protection Act;

(v) The amount the City of Cape Town has budgeted for ward committees;
(vi) A report on the Neighbourhood Development Plan;

(vii) A report on the Citizen Satisfaction Survey (committee agreed to hold a meeting on this issue to unpack details of this survey);

(viii) A breakdown of a number of staff members who could not progress to another notch for each salary level;

(ix) A breakdown of the consultants utilised by the Department;

(x) The number of consultants utilised from Historically Disadvantaged Individuals (HDI) and the value of these contracts; and

(xi) The total value of the assistance the Department received from donors in the year under review.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this Report.

MONDAY, 19 NOVEMBER 2012

ANNOUNCEMENT

The Speaker:

Provincial Notice


TABLING

The Speaker:

Minister of Transport and Public Works

Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B 6A–2012]

Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B 6B–2012].

COMMITTEE REPORT

The Speaker:


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development having considered the subject of the Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill [B 6–2012] referred to it, begs to report the Bill with amendments ([B 6A–2012] and [B 6B–2012]).
COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:


The Standing Committee on Human Settlements, having considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Human Settlements and the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal for the year ended 31 March 2012 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

The discussions on the annual reports of departments are key mechanisms established by the Provincial Parliament to achieve its constitutional oversight mandate over the executive authority. The process is carried out through the standing committees so as to continuously keep abreast with service delivery issues within the departments. The objective of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements is thus to monitor whether the Department of Human Settlements fulfils its mandate as set out in its Annual Performance Plan and Strategic Plan.

The annual report programme for the 2011/2012 financial year was advertised in newspapers inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions.

Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Minister and the Head of Department were given an opportunity to make opening remarks. Members of the Committee interrogated the department on Part 1: General Information, Part 2: Departmental Programme Performance and Part 4: Human Resource Management of the department’s annual report. Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions or to make an input during the discussions.

Oversight report on Department and entity

1. Department of Human Settlements

(a) Overview

The Minister of Human Settlements gave a brief overview of the Annual Report of the Department, stating that the Department received an unqualified audit; he mentioned that the Department has been dealing with a number of challenges. He mentioned that the Department has been looking at the delivery model they are using, because in terms of the model, the municipalities are their implementing agency.
They had to put a number of measures in place to close the gap that existed between them and municipalities, which resulted in the number of discrepancies, particularly the issue of meeting the targets. They have done a lot of work to improve the capacity in the office and to make sure that the link between the department and the municipalities is tightened up in order for them to deal with the challenges of the past. He mentioned that they will be reporting on the number of measures they put in place to make sure that they improve their performance. He also mentioned the department knew that they are expected to account for the money they are using, but there is still a lot of work to be done to deal with all the challenges.

The Head of Department mentioned that the Department kept the Standing Committee informed throughout the year, about the developments in the Department and in the housing sector. He said that they came to account for the good performance in some areas and poor performance in some areas.

(b) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

(i) A copy of the Provincial Framework Policy and City’s Housing Allocation Policy;
(ii) List of properties that the Housing Development Agency (HDA) investigated for procurement, for Human Settlements;
(iii) List of number of hectares of land released for Department of Human Settlements;
(iv) Pipeline report of the Professional Resource Teams (PRTs );
(v) Information on how far the process is for appointing a service provider for the Housing Subsidy System;
(vi) Detailed information on the funds which were transferred to the University of Cape Town and the process used to choose the academic forum;
(vii) List of the performances of all municipalities;
(viii) Information on the specific projects that are linked to the individuals who are getting performance bonuses;
(ix) Types of grievances lodged, that are not resolved and how they are planning to resolve them;
(x) List of consultants appointed and the services they provided; and
(xi) Copy of the breakdown of the Independent Counselling and Advisory Services (ICAS) (Employment Assistance Programme).

(c) Findings/Concerns

(i) The Department has a massive housing backlog of 500 000;
(ii) The Department is not accessible to some of the communities; and
(iii) The Department did not inform the committee on time about the challenge they had regarding the late submission of the Western Cape Housing Development Fund Annual Report.
(d) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that the Department—

(i) inform the Committee of any achievements it has receive in terms of awards;
(ii) report to the Committee about all the challenges they experience;
(iii) brief the Committee on the process of Housing Subsidy System;
(iv) keeps the Committee informed about the report of the Western Cape Housing Development Fund; and
(v) be congratulated for its improvement on its Annual Report.

2. Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal

(a) Overview

(i) Tribunal submitted comments on the Rental Housing Amendment Bill.
(ii) About 2442 dispute cases were recorded for the Tribunal.
(iii) 310 cases were heard before the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal in Cape Town, George, Knysna and Hermanus.
(iv) A call centre and a walk-in Help Desk were available to the public through the efforts of the Tribunal. 14 215 calls were responded to this year and 4698 rental housing related walk-in queries were attended to.

(b) Findings/Concerns

(i) There are a large number of cases that remain unresolved in contravention of the 90-day rule laid down in the Rental Housing Act (Act No. 50 of 1999); and
(ii) The issue of non-compliance of tribunal rulings presents a challenge to the tribunal’s effectiveness.

In conclusion the Chairperson thanked all the Members, the department and the members of the public for attending the hearing and for their input in the discussion of the report.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Education, having considered the Annual Reports of the Western Cape Education Department for the year ended 31 March 2012 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight, function the Committee considered the Annual Reports of the Western Cape Education Department.
Annual reports are the key instruments to report performance measured against their performance targets and budgets outlined by the Western Cape Education Department in its strategic plans. The role of standing committees in overseeing annual reports is crucial in closing the accountability loop of planning, budgeting, implementation, reporting, auditing and oversight. In essence, the standing committees should exercise oversight as to whether departments and public entities delivered on the service delivery promises they made in their strategic plans.

The annual report programme for the 2011/2012 financial year was advertised in newspapers, inviting stakeholders and members of the public to attend and participate in the discussions. Before proceeding to the consideration of the report, the Minister and the Head of Department were given an opportunity to make opening remarks.

Members of the Committee interrogated the department on Part 1: General Information, Part 2: Departmental Programme Performance and Part 4: Human Resources Management of the department’s annual report. Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions or to make an input during the discussions.

B. Oversight reports on department

1. Department of Education

(a) Overview

During the 2011/2012 financial year, the Department of Education made provision for resources and supported schools serving poorer communities, and the Foundation Phase.

The Department has completed the building of 23 new schools and has replaced 8 schools. In 2012, the Department expects to complete the building of 3 new schools and 13 replacement schools.

The Western Cape Government is committed to directing the majority of its resources to improving the education outcomes of the schools that serve the province’s poorest communities and ensuring that our most vulnerable learners are catered for.

The poorer 60% of the school population therefore receive the greater allocations in terms of important indicators such as norms and standards funding, school feeding, new infrastructure and learner transport. The number of underperforming public high schools dropped from 78 in 2010 to 30 in 2011.

The South African Institute of Government Auditors recognized the WCED as the “most consistently high performing in financial management of any government department in the country over the last three years”.

The following statistics were indicated in the Annual Report which provides the number of bursaries awarded to teachers and principals as follows: “Pre-service bursaries were awarded to aspiring teachers, focusing on the scarce subject areas of Mathematics, Science, Technology and the Foundation Phase. An amount of R8, 145 million was made available for this year and 114 students received bursaries. 31 students completed their studies in 2011 and 83 continue in 2012. 83 new bursaries were awarded in 2012. 230 new bursaries were awarded to aspirant and existing school principals to improve their qualifications through the ACE in School Management and Leadership. 124 completed their studies in 2011 and 248 continue in 2012.”

(b) Concerns/Findings

(i) Enrolment numbers are increasing, however, maintenance and upgrading of existing schools appear to be an ongoing challenge for the Department;

(ii) Education is the key to achieving the ‘open opportunity society’ envisioned by the province. With this in mind, it is critical that the Department balance the quantitative and qualitative outcomes, especially in rural areas, to ensure that those learners exiting the education system are able to effectively and/or functionally become members of a society;

(iii) The process of achieving quality and equal education has to take into account the socio-economic environment. Thus, the Department’s work is not limited to teaching alone – but includes nutrition, HIV/AIDS programmes, and food gardens. These also contribute to community development;

(iv) Issues of safety in schools continue to act as an inhibitor to ensuring that all have access to the quality education and thus opportunities in society;

(v) The Department’s focus on academic and technical development is an important one recognizing the importance of both for a society of diverse competencies;

(vi) ICT is another trend and issue where considerable effort and resources have gone into – however issues of security, maintenance and skills are key considerations;

(vii) The Department is commended for its user-friendly Annual Report document;

(viii) The importance of teachers and support to teachers is another key aspect of the Department; that they are rewarded appropriately, valued and celebrated to ensure a motivated profession that would be to the benefit of each learner; and

(ix) Reporting on the School Governing Body (SGB) in the Annual Report, as indicated on page 58, needs to be expanded for following years since the SGB’s play a critical role in the Department.

(c) Recommendations

The Committee wishes to recommend that the Department–

(i) briefs the Committee on the Draft Regulations Relating to the Minimum Teaching Hours Per School Week and School Day in Public Schools, 2012;
(ii) briefs the Committee on the status of the i-SAMS system;
(iii) brief the Committee on the Grade R teaching and the progress made to assist learners not to repeat Grade 1 and 9;
(iv) brief the Committee on the infrastructure plan which focuses on new schools;
(v) briefs the Committee on the improvement plans for learners performance in literacy and numeracy;
(vi) indicates the number of SGB’s in the Province and the total number of meetings held by the SGB’s in the Annual Report;
(vii) briefs the Committee on the status and training offered to SGB’s;
(viii) reports on home schooling in its Annual Report;
(ix) to enhance their i-SAMS system to real time and provide a status reports of attendance for both learners and teachers;
(x) define the information on the nature of injury on duty, to classify the type of basic medical attention required and the nature of the temporary Total Disablement as indicated on page 205 of the Annual Report; and
(xi) amend Table 4.5.3 on page 185 of the Annual Report in stating reasons why staff resigned, distinguishing between resignations due to the end of temporary contracts and/or resignations of permanent employees.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Western Cape Education Department to furnish the committee with—

(i) the numbers of educators who are members of various unions;
(ii) the results on the annual review and the research done on the Safer Schools Programme;
(iii) list of the 30 underperforming schools and the specific measures taken to address the underperformance;
(iv) a list of the numbers of learners using Learner Transport; and
(v) a complete list of the Safety Fieldworkers employed by the Department, in which areas and their contact numbers.

C. Conclusion

The Committee wishes to express its appreciation for the information provided by the Minister and the Head of the Department of Education and officials from the Department of Education.

The Committee further requests that the House considers this Report.


The Standing Committee on Community Development, having considered the Annual Reports referred to it, begs to report as follows:
A. Introduction

One of the objectives of the Standing Committee on Community Development is to monitor whether the Department of Health fulfils its mandate as set out in its Annual Performance and Strategic Plans. The Annual Report of the Cape Medical Depot was included in the Annual Report of the Department of Health.

B. Oversight reports on Department and entity

1. Department of Health

(a) Oversight report

The Minister gave a brief overview of the Annual Report of the Department and stated that the Department’s primary focus was to ensure that every person has access to health care in the Western Cape. He also commented that the completion of Khayelitsha Hospital was an important milestone that demonstrated the government’s commitment to health care. He also applauded the primary health care services in the province for its all round success and thanked his Department for its achievements. The Head of Department continued to brief the Committee on the Annual Report of the Department and acknowledged that there were successes and challenges experienced during the financial year.

(b) Findings/Concerns

The Committee—

(i) raised a concern regarding the vacancies in the Department and how it affects the functioning of the Department;
(ii) raised a concern regarding the availability of land and the lengthy land acquisition process for new facilities;
(iii) questioned the monitoring of the decrease in incidences of injuries applicable to road traffic accidents as indicated on page 23 of the Annual Report;
(iv) questioned the manner in which specialised nurses are monitored at specialised schools and who is responsible for uplifting their skills;
(v) raised a concern regarding the reduction of beds at Lentegeur Hospital which were reduced from 760 to 740 beds;
(vi) noted that during the reconstruction phase of GF Jooste Hospital, arrangements will be put in place to relocate patients elsewhere while the hospital is being revamped;
(vii) raised a concern regarding the number of pharmacists in the Western Cape and the mechanisms in place to retain them;
(viii) questioned the notion of employment equity at Top Management level; and
(ix) raised a concern that there are high percentages of employees on sick leave on all levels in the Department.
(c) Recommendations

That the Department—

(i) places more focus on reporting on the Chronic Dispensing Unit (CDU) in its Annual Report for the following years;
(ii) reports on the effect the vacancies in the Department has on the overall functioning of the Department;
(iii) provides report on the functioning of the CDU and indicate what mechanisms are in place to improve the situation in Human Resources;
(iv) briefs the Committee on the National Health Insurance (NHI) pilot in Eden District and the implementation thereof;
(v) submits a report on the mechanisms in place to retain pharmacists in the Western Cape; and
(vi) provides feedback on the manner in which specialised nurses are monitored at specialised schools and who is responsible for the quality control of services.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requests that the Department provide it with the following—

(i) a full report on the status of the CDU’s;
(ii) a presentation on the Universal Health for Strategies in the Western Cape;
(iii) a list of specialised nurses at specialised schools; and
(iv) a detailed report and breakdown of the age, gender and numbers of the unidentified deceased persons as indicated on page 180 of the Annual Report.

2. Cape Medical Depot

Oversight Report

The Head of Department gave a brief overview on the Annual Report of the Cape Medical Depot, which was included in the Annual Report of the Department of Health.

C. Conclusion

The Chairperson thanked all Members, the Minister, Department and the members of the public, for attending the meeting and for their input in the discussions of the Annual Reports.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport, having considered the Annual Report referred to it, begs to report as follows:
A. Introduction

The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport, as part of its oversight role over the Department of Community Safety, monitors whether the Department of Community Safety fulfils its mandate as prescribed in the Strategic Plan and the Annual Performance Plan of the Department. The Committee seeks to verify whether the Department reached its targets as outlined in the Annual Performance Plan for the 2011/2012 financial year, and utilised its budget to address the targets of the 2011/2012 financial year.

B. Oversight report on the Department of Community Safety

The Minister of Community Safety gave a brief overview of the Annual Report, focusing on the highlights and challenges for the 2011/2012 financial year in implementing the objectives of Strategic Objective 5 (SO5) in performing oversight functions such as civilian oversight. The Minister congratulated the Department on receiving extraordinary accolades for this 2011/2012 financial year on its overall financial management.

The Head of Department continued to brief the Committee on the roll out strategy for SO5, which is “Increasing Safety”. The Department received clean audits for the past two financial years. The plans for fiscal governance are currently included in Civilian Secretariat for Police Service Act, 2011 and are contained in the proposed legislation for the Province, the Western Cape Community Safety Bill [B 8–2012].

C. Findings/Concerns

The Committee–

(a) raised its concern that the Annual Report of the Department does not reflect the reports on oversight of the Swartland Municipal Police Service and the Cape Town Metro police Service as was requested in the discussions of the Annual Report of previous year;
(b) informed the Department that the theft or loss of registered items such as weapons and radios must be specifically reflected in the Annual Report of the year under review under the Asset Management section; and
(c) requested that the Department ensures effective traffic management by traffic officers at weighbridges.

D. Recommendations

The Committee recommends that the Department–

(i) reports on the Swartland Municipal Police Service and the City of Cape Town Metro police Service in its Annual Report, since these entities form part of the oversight of the Department;
(ii) categorises complaints by rank as received from civilians relating to the conduct of Police Officers;
(iii) includes a category in the Annual Report which indicates the total number of traffic officers sent for fire arm training;
(iv) includes learner transport inspections as a target to be achieved in their Annual Report;
(v) reports on instances of stolen radios and weapons under the Asset Management section of the Annual Report as well as of those responsible;
(vi) suggested that the Department should have a monitoring mechanism in place to ensure that shebeens which have been closed down by the South African Police Service (SAPS), stay closed;
(vii) verifies whether it is in possession of any heritage assets belonging to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament; and
(viii) makes use of various social networks to publicise the findings and updates of monitoring instruments like the Community Safety Barometer.

E. Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requests that the Department provide it with the following—

(i) the individual Annual Reports of the Swartland Municipal Police Service and the Cape Town Metro police Service and the Department should include the terms of reference;
(ii) a report drafted on a survey done in Mexico which rates South Africa as the 34th country in terms of instances of crime;
(iii) a detailed report on the total number of learner transport vehicles that were stopped, inspected and arrests relating to these inspections as indicated on pages 20 and 40 of the Annual Report;
(iv) a statistical report on learner transport vehicles and identifying those that are legal and illegal;
(v) a detailed list of the assets recorded during stocktaking, relating to the inventory of fire arms and ammunition, indicating any loss of fire arms and related items;
(vi) the number of radios stolen from the Department;
(vii) a copy of the updated Community Police Forum constitution;
(viii) Provincial Police Board to brief the Committee on its mandate as well as any concerns with the Department of Community Safety and SAPS;
(ix) Provincial Police Board to submit the minutes of the Community Police Forum meeting which was held in Paarl on 29 September 2012;
(x) the Provincial Rolling Enforcement Plan as mentioned on page 39 of the Annual Report; and
(xi) a copy of the Security Standards documents with specific reference to adhering to security standards on the precincts of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

F. Conclusion

The Chairperson congratulated the Department on receiving a clean audit for the 2011/2012 financial year and thanked all Members, the Department, SAPS, and the members of the public, including the Community Police Fora and the Neighbourhood Watch representatives for attending the hearing and for their input in the discussion of the Annual Report.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.
5. Report of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on the Annual Reports of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and the following entities: Western Cape Language Committee, Western Cape Cultural Commission and the Heritage Western Cape, for the year ended 31 March 2012, dated 20 November 2012.

The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport, having considered the Annual Reports referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

The objectives of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport, as part of its oversight role over the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, monitors whether the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport fulfils its mandate as prescribed in its Annual Performance Plan and Strategic Plan. The Department and its entities set certain targets to be accomplished for the 2011/2012 financial year and the Standing Committee needs to ascertain whether the targets were reached.

B. Oversight report

1. Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport

The Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport and the Head of Department (HOD) of Cultural Affairs and Sport, presented an overview of the Annual Report, focusing on the highlights and challenges for the 2011/2012 financial year. The Department indicated that it re-aligned its vision statement and shifted the concept of “social cohesion” to “social inclusion” in the focus of the overall vision of the Department.

(a) Findings/Concerns

The Committee—

(i) indicated that the Department should be aware and involved when municipalities upgrade facilities that were handed over to municipalities from the Department;
(ii) informed the Department that it should distribute documentation, such as surveys, on its letterhead, when it is a deliverable of the Department. The matter being referred to is the recently conducted Language Survey at Western Cape Provincial Parliament (WCPP);
(iii) raised its concern regarding the rate at which Language Practitioners have been resigning in the Department, as indicated on page 140 of the Annual Report; and
(iv) request the Department to address all resolutions posed by the Committee in previous Annual Report discussions.

(b) Recommendations

That the Department—

(i) should ensure that the “Riaan Loots Trust” be renamed as such, as shown on page 21 of the Annual Report;
(ii) identifies the funds allocated to various federations and events, indicating specifically if any disabled persons are involved, such as the Western Province Blow Darts Federation, as indicated on page 22 of the Annual Report;

(iii) identifies the major events funded by the Department, as indicated on page 24 of the Annual Report, since this was requested in previous Annual Report engagements;

(iv) liaises with the Department of Social Development with the aim of ensuring that the Golden Games annual festival are held, as indicated on page 56 of the Annual Report;

(v) indicates the exact allocated funding awarded to the Western Cape Sport Academy in the Annual Report; and

(vi) plays an active role in keeping a Provincial heritage asset register and conducts research on heritage assets housed in all provincial departments.

(c) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requests that the Department provide it with a–

(i) full list of names of municipalities with whom the Department signed agreements for partnerships;

(ii) list of the transformation programmes offered by the Department, including programmes done in conjunction with federations;

(iii) calendar of events detailing projects and programmes hosted by the Department; and

(iv) report on the major events indicated on page 24 of the Annual Report.

2. Heritage Western Cape

(a) Oversight Report

Mr A Hall, the Chief Executive Officer and Accounting Authority of Heritage Western Cape, presented the Committee with an overview of the Annual Report of Heritage Western Cape.

(b) Recommendations

The Committee recommended that the–

(i) South African Heritage Resource Agency (SAHRA) briefs the Committee on its functions and operational activities in the Province; and

(ii) Department, as the guardian of Heritage in the Western Cape, monitors and audits the Heritage assets of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.
3. **Western Cape Cultural Commission**

   **Oversight Report**

   Ms J Moleleki, the Accounting Authority of the Western Cape Cultural Commission, delivered an overview of its Annual Report. Mr Akleker, the outgoing Chairperson of the Board, highlighted the importance of the work of the Western Cape Cultural Commission and thanked the Department for its role in promoting culture within the Province in the projects of the Department.

4. **Western Cape Language Committee**

   **(a) Oversight Report**

   Professor R Chetty, current Chairperson of the Western Cape Language Committee (WCLC) recognised the initiatives by the Department to show its interest in promoting the languages of the Province. Ms J Moleleki, Accounting Officer of the WCLC, provided an overview of the work of the Annual Report of the WCLC.

   **(b) Recommendations**

   The Committee recommended that the WCLC vigorously pursue the promotion of the three official languages of the Province as set out in the constitutional provision for the promotion of the three official languages of the Province, in all sectors.

C. **Conclusion**

   The Chairperson thanked all Members, the Minister, the Department the members of the public, for attending the meeting and for their input in the discussions on the Annual Reports.

   The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.


   The Standing Committee on Community Development, having considered the Annual Report referred to it, begs to report as follows:

   **A. Introduction**

   One of the objectives of the Standing Committee on Community Development is to monitor whether the Department of Social Development fulfils its mandate as set out in its Annual Performance and Strategic Plans.
**B. Oversight Report**

The Minister of the Department of Social Development gave a brief overview of the Annual Report of the Department stating key issues as one of the Department’s priorities as guided by the Provincial Strategic Objective 8 (PSO8). The Minister continued to inform the Committee of the Early Childhood Development (ECD) programme for linguistic, cognitive and personal development of young children, the reduction of drug and alcohol related harms, youth and family development, and support for vulnerable groups, especially persons with disabilities and older persons.

The Minister further stated that there were challenges for the 2011/2012 financial year and fully supported the call for a youth wage subsidy, which will see many unemployed young people entering the economic sphere and contributing towards the well-being of their families and extended families.

The Head of Department (HOD) gave a brief overview of the Annual Report of the Department and its success and challenges. He stated that the reporting on Non-financial Data (NFD) continues to be a challenge for the Department, despite improvements to the processes introduced during the past year. The HOD also mentioned that the Department continues to face challenges regarding the Non-Governmental Organisations (NGO’s) in the Western Cape.

**(a) Findings and Concerns**

The Committee raised the following concerns—

(i) the Minister did not indicate the concerns and key issues regarding the current status of the children in the Province;
(ii) the Department has an obligation to execute programmes addressing the needs of children in the Western Cape as the Annual Report does not reflect that the Department is meeting this obligation;
(iii) the lack of programmes for adults and children regarding drug-related issues in the Western Cape;
(iv) whether there are programmes and measures available to assist boys growing up without fathers;
(v) what resources were provided to Chrysalis Academy in terms of Youth Development;
(vi) regarding the high rate of female-headed households in the Province;
(vii) the difficulties facing sexual offences and social crime and the measures in place to deal effectively with this;
(viii) the date of the implementation plan of the Early Childhood Development (ECD) programme and is this initiative projected for in the budget of the Department;
(ix) the high vacancy rate in the Department, the reasons for the many acting positions in the Department and that the organogram is not reflective of the demographics of the Western Cape;
(x) the high population growth rates and the impact that it has on the Province;
(xi) the high volume of sick leave taken by employees of the Department and the support systems in place to assist employees;
(xii) the high dismissal rate and request for transfers of staff in the Department;
the manner in which Non Profit Organisations (NPO's) are informed about funding available for NPO’s by the Department;

the Committee raised a concern about Lifelink and whether it has come into operation yet, if not, what other alternative systems are in place; and

the use of the term “under reporting” by the NPO’s as reflected in the Annual Report 2012.

(b) Recommendations

The Committee recommended that the Department briefs the it on the–

(i) Norms and Standards for the Integrated Service Delivery Model as well as the generic norms and standards;

(ii) Census data and the demographic trends relating to the decrease in facilities; and

(iii) facilities strategies of the Department.

(c) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requests that the Department provide it with a–

(i) report and a presentation on the high population growth rates, particularly in the District Municipalities such as the Overberg, West Coast and Eden areas;

(ii) full report on the status of female-headed households in the Province;

(iii) list of all the Mass Opportunity Development (MOD) Centres in the Western Cape;

(iv) report on residential care and the areas they are located, as well as a list of all Old Age Homes funded by the Department;

(v) detailed report on the financial status of Chrysalis Academy;

(vi) detailed report on the Increased Capacity Building programme;

(vii) complete list of transfer payments that were made to Non Profit Organisations (NPO's) and what criteria was used when these NPO’s were assessed;

(viii) list of the twenty-one substance abuse centres as well as the three Department of Social Development (DSD) owned centres;

(ix) copy of the guide for the ECD programmes;

(x) list of Youth Focal Points (YFP) and their programmes;

(xi) report on the feeding programmes provided to the 73 Mass Opportunity Development (MOD) schools in the Province;

(xii) report on the consultants which were appointed by the Department during the annual reporting period;

(xiii) report by Human Resources on sick leave and programmes assisting employees in the Department;

(xiv) report on measures in place dealing effectively with sexual offences and social crime;

(xv) report on programmes on children living with absent fathers; and

(xvi) Feed-back on Life link.
3. Conclusion

The Chairperson thanked all the Members, the Minister, the Department and the public for attending the hearing and for their inputs in the discussion of the Annual Report.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the Annual Reports of the Provincial Treasury and its entity, Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board for the year ended 31 March 2012 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function, the Committee considered the Annual Reports of Provincial Treasury and the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board. Annual Reports are the key instruments for departments to report on performance measured against its performance targets and budgets as outlined in its Strategic Plans and Annual Performance Plans.

B. Oversight Reports on Provincial Treasury and the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board

1. Provincial Treasury

(a) Oversight report

Departments in the Province performed well during the year under review. However, the latter part of the year saw a movement towards a more strained medium term fiscal framework. Attention was focused on concerns raised in the previous year’s Annual Report resulting in a revised and risk-based approach to supply chain matters. Provincial Treasury has revised its approach to the Province’s budgeting process by encouraging the closer integration of the adjusted and main estimates.

Further engagements with National Treasury have been pursued to refine the entire regulatory regime and enhance transversal financial systems. Provincial Treasury also obtained approval to strengthen its own supply chain and municipal accounting line function capacity, enabling it to offer departments and municipalities a much improved support service.

(b) Findings

(i) The Department is finding difficulty in recruiting a suitably qualified candidate with the necessary experience, competencies and academic qualifications for the vacant Local Government Supply Chain Manager position;
(ii) A range of national enhancements were successfully implemented in respect of the financial systems. The current electronic purchasing system is being upgraded and includes the development of a new database of service providers which should lay the basis for improving the efficiency and effectiveness of Supply Chain Management in departments;

(iii) Engagements with municipalities on their draft budgets and structured visits to municipalities supported efforts to improve the alignment of priorities as portrayed in the departmental strategic plans, the provincial strategic objectives and integrated development plans of municipalities;

(iv) Transfers to municipalities were provided for in the 2011 adjustment estimates. This initiative was embarked upon to assist selected municipalities in rural areas to improve their financial management and assisted them in the delivery of more services.

The main criteria used for determining which municipalities get transfers, was based on the decision of the Local Government Medium Term Economic Committee taking into account those municipalities that portray shortcomings in governance and the ability of the municipality to deliver on what was required. The municipalities were asked to provide business plans and these then informed the allocation;

(v) Internal Standard Operational Procedures are based on the Corporate Services Centre Standard Operating Procedures;

(vi) Statistics South Africa has made available a municipal report that will be published in November 2012 where they have disaggregated the statistical information on the municipal and ward level. This information will then feed into the processes of Provincial Treasury in terms of the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook;

(vii) Documents have been compiled to assist municipalities with their procurement processes. Consultation with municipalities in this regard still needs to take place;

(viii) Performance reports are evaluated on the implementation of budgets and support provided to municipalities to improve performance information. Treasury cannot prescribe to municipalities as to what they should do and is dependent on whether municipalities submit the necessary information and table their budgets; and

(ix) A partnership has been entered into with the Business School of the University of Stellenbosch to develop a training programme for those officials who are responsible for financial management.

(c) Recommendations

The Committee recommended that—
Due to the insufficient time allocated to the Committee, it could not conduct meaningful oversight over the Provincial Treasury’s Annual Report and that the Chairperson addresses this matter at the next Programming Authority meeting; and

An honours course in municipal financial management should be considered by Provincial Treasury in partnership with the leading Tertiary Institutions.

2. Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board

(a) Oversight report

The year under review proved encouraging with a number of noteworthy achievements. Even though the economy has not fully recovered from the global economic slump, the casinos in the Western Cape showed notable increase in revenue compared to the previous financial year. Vacant positions arising on the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board were filled and the Committee was thanked for its commitment to this process.

(b) Findings

(i) All vacant posts, except the Supply Chain Manager position, have been filled. This position has just been approved and the recruitment process will start shortly;

(ii) The Province has five casino operator licenses with exclusivity in terms of geographical spacing for an initial period of ten years. No provision has been made for renewals. Provincial Treasury is in the process of drafting amendments to the present legislation that relates to casino license exclusivity;

(iii) At present, no exclusivity rights are being paid so the province is losing out on revenue to the approximate value of R10 million;

(iv) Internet based gambling is the main form of illegal gambling and R92 000 was spent on the elimination of this type of gambling. The Board, together with the relevant law enforcement agencies, continually investigate the possible links between illegal gambling and organised crime in the Western Cape;

(v) The Board plans to hold 11 meetings per annum. Extra meetings for hearings would relate to patron disputes and appeals;

(vi) There exist five casinos, each comprising ten departments that are audited. Each casino receives two on-site inspections per year; and

(vii) The Board has an excellent personnel component and must be congratulated on its personnel administration.

(c) Recommendations

The Committee recommended that–
(i) Due to the insufficient time allocated to the Committee, it could not conduct meaningful oversight over the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board’s Annual Report and that the Chairperson addresses this matter at the next Programming Authority meeting;

(ii) Photographs of key personnel be included on the organogram;

(iii) When the Board reports on the number of meetings held and the extra meetings for hearings, the Board must indicate the purpose of the hearings;

(iv) The Members of the Gambling and Racing Board is cautioned that the involvement of the Council in the procurement process should be avoided.

(v) The term target is misleading, as it is nothing more than an estimate because the entity does not have control over it. National Treasury should be engaged in this regard; and

(vi) The editing of the report needs attention and more information should be included to fully explain the reasons for the deviation from the set targets.

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requested that the Department provided it with a list of the reasons for the resignations of Staff Members.

C. Conclusion

The Committee was satisfied by the approach of the Department, and the Gambling and Racing Board to the interrogation of the annual reports and wishes to thank the Minister, Head of Department and the Chairperson of the Gambling and Racing Board for their contributions and efforts in this regard.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Transport and Public Works and its entity, Government Motor Transport for the year ended 31 March 2012 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function, the Committee considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Transport and Public Works and Government Motor Transport. Annual reports are the key instruments for departments to report on performance measured against their performance targets and budgets as outlined in their strategic plans and annual performance plans.
B. Oversight reports on the Department of Transport and Public Works and Government Motor Transport

1. Department of Transport and Public Works

(a) Oversight report

The Annual Report of the Department of Transport and Public Works is a reflection of a culture of a much improved administration. The report reflects the results of a long road of rehabilitation and the building of a sustainable department based on sound policies and good administration.

Maintenance backlogs seem to remain on the agenda of the Department but the determination to reduce the maintenance backlogs from historical unsustainable levels is evident. The provincial property portfolio was optimised where public sector assets were used to generate private sector investment. The Department has also successfully opened the Koeberg Interchange’s Ramp B to traffic ahead of schedule.

The road death toll remains high although progress has been made in this area to reduce the number of deaths. The Department has also focused on the safety of commuters on public transport carriers and has issued a stern warning to those seeking to obtain driver’s licenses fraudulently.

(b) Findings

(i) The Department is currently undergoing a restructuring process. For this reason the vacant positions as reflected on the organogram have not been filled and have been used to appoint staff in other areas. The process of restructuring and reorganising the Department is ongoing. The funding of these posts remains a challenge;

(ii) The Provincial Land Transport Framework was approved by the National Minister of Transport in February 2012. This sets the basis for the development and implementation of integrated transport systems in the Western Cape;

(iii) All contractors who tender for work from the Department are obliged to be listed on the Construction Industry Development Board database;

(iv) The shortage of bitumen is a concern and is a national problem that affected all road authorities and the construction industry;

(v) The Stellenbosch and Drakenstein Municipalities were unable to execute road maintenance projects mainly due to the bitumen shortage, resulting in these projects being delayed;

(vi) The sourcing of gravel for roads has now been declared a mining activity with tedious legal processes that must be adhered to. The maintenance of gravel roads is challenged in light of the new legislation;
(vii) The road infrastructure is essential to all forms of economic development. It is obvious that the Department does not have the funds to maintain and expand on the road network. The Department spends at least R2 billion a year in this regard and needs approximately double this amount. The road infrastructure at present is not sustainable even though the Department has tried hard to increase available funds for roads maintenance and to keep it stable. The Department is committed to finding ways of reducing the cost of road maintenance;

(viii) Outstanding motor vehicle license fees are managed by way of the automatic number plate recognition system. Because of the increased number of road blocks, as part of the safely home campaign and the use of the new technology, motorists are encouraged to settle their outstanding license fees promptly;

(ix) Delays in the vetting and signing of Memorandum of Agreements by the Department and the Municipalities led to the late transfer of funds to the municipalities for public transport infrastructure. At the start of the 2011/2012 financial year, the Province held local government elections and therefore a change of councils within the various municipalities took place. This resulted in a delay in the agreement on the projects.

Approved project plans were executed by the officials. This was delayed even further because of the capacity constraints within municipalities as well as staff turnover;

(x) Prince Albert Municipality did not claim the R62 000 for routine maintenance from the Department;

(xi) The Department purchased five Quantum vehicles specifically for learners stranded alongside the road in the event of a transport breakdown to ensure that they get to school on time. These vehicles are managed by the Government Motor Transport under the responsibility of the Safely Home team;

(xii) Tenants of state owned properties are reluctant to sign lease agreements because they do not want to pay market related rentals. The Department has taken the necessary legal action in this regard;

(xiii) Preparations for the rollout of the George Integrated Public Transport Network were advanced. Institutional arrangements between the municipal and provincial spheres of government were developed, culminating in the signing of the precedent setting out the inter-governmental agreement and finance agreement between the Department and the George Municipality; and

(xiv) The Committee is concerned that the lack of capacity is seriously impacting on the ability of the Department to function optimally and this is especially true when reflecting on the maintenance and expansion of the road infrastructure, which is essential to underpin economic development in the Western Cape.
(c) Recommendations

The Committee recommended that—

(i) The Annual Report is a public document, the designations and levels of the officials should be included in the organogram;

(ii) If proper oversight is to be maintained by the Standing Committee, the terms used in the Annual Report should be clear and unambiguous;

(iii) In relation to the funds that were transferred to municipalities for projects underway, the amount that was actually transferred compared to the actual spending does not give a true reflection of the status of these projects. The explanation for this should be provided in the Annual Report;

(iv) When reporting on the termination of staff, contract staff and permanent staff should not be grouped together and should be reported on separately;

(v) The ongoing shortage of bitumen is a concern and a strategy on how a dependable supply of bitumen can be ensured, either from local sources or by way of imports, should be urgently devised;

(vi) The problems between the municipalities and the Department with regards to the Memorandum of Association which delays implementation of projects should be brought to the attention of the Standing Committee on Local Government Oversight; and

(vii) The Department is requested to brief the Committee on the Government Immovable Asset Management Act 2007 (Act 19 of 2007).

(d) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requested that the Department provide it with the following:

(i) A summary of the Western Cape Rail Census;
(ii) The definitions for state-owned buildings;
(iii) The definitions for the condition of roads;
(iv) A list of the contractors who were assisted through the contractor development programme;
(v) The reasons for the decrease in the number of skills development beneficiaries; and
(vi) A list of the contracts that were awarded to youth.

2. Government Motor Transport

(e) Oversight report

Government Motor Transport (GMT) has faced and overcome many challenges as the Generally Accepted Accounting Practice (GAAP) was implemented. During the year under review, the team at GMT successfully mastered the new financial system that was configured specifically for the trading entity while ensuring the integration with GMT’s fleet management system. GMT has made
progress on the initial goals that were set and improved its administrative capacity by the filling of key positions.

(f) Findings

(i) Fuel expenditure represents the largest portion of operational expenditure. Fuel cards are in the process of being phased out and are only used in areas where there is no adequate coverage of the e-fuel network. This reduces the minor cases of irregular fuel patterns;

(ii) GMT’s main source of income is derived through claims for the excess payment on accidents above R10 000 and cases of gross negligence;

(iii) The Department is moving towards a 48 month retention of vehicles and is therefore able to replace older vehicles much faster and as a result many more motor vehicles go on sale;

(iv) The number of replacement vehicles acquired was considerably more than planned due to the program to expedite the renewal of the fleet;

(v) Targets are based on historical figures and information. The type of target is prescribed by National Treasury and the Department is obliged to use it;

(vi) All government motor vehicles have tracking devices installed including the older vehicles barring five that are used by the National Prosecuting Authority;

(vii) The target relating to the number of complaints for the misuse of Government Garage vehicles is based on historical trends rather than forecasting and this has decreased considerably; and

(viii) The number of traffic violations and accident and loss incidents increased.

(g) Recommendations

The Committee recommended that—

(i) The traffic and speed violations for each Department should be forwarded to the relevant Standing Committees in order for the Committees to deal with this as part of their oversight function; and

(ii) All government departments should take the appropriate action against those officials who misuse Government Garage vehicles and violate traffic laws and regulations.

(h) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requested that the Department provides it with the following:

(i) A breakdown per Department of the traffic and speed violations; and

(ii) A breakdown of the revenue that was collected per Department.
C. Conclusion

The Committee was satisfied by the approach of the Department and Government Motor Transport to the interrogation of the annual reports and wishes to thank the Minister and Head of Department for their contributions and efforts in this regard.

The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism and its entities, the Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency and Cape Town Routes Unlimited for the year ended 31 March 2012 referred to it, begs to report as follows:

A. Introduction

As part of its oversight function, the Committee considered the Annual Reports of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism and its entities, the Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency and Cape Town Routes Unlimited. Annual reports are the key instruments for departments to report on performance measured against their performance targets and budgets as outlined in their Strategic Plans and Annual Performance Plans.

B. Oversight Reports on Department of Economic Development and Tourism and its entities, the Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency (Wesgro) and Cape Town Routes Unlimited (CTRU)

3. Department of Economic Development and Tourism

(e) Oversight report

The focus areas for the year under review included the Provincial Skills Development Programme, Red Tape Reduction, Regional and Local Economic Development, Enterprise Development and Business Regulation. The focus on demand led economic growth gave rise to the Western Cape Economic Development Partnership (WCEDP), which aims to build effective partnerships to ensure growth, development and inclusion within the region’s economy.

The Department, in conjunction with CTRU, played a key role in establishing tourism in the Western Cape as a multi-dimensional international industry with strong links to the creative and cultural sectors. Bids for conferences and conventions worth an economic value of R254 million and other interventions confirmed the contribution of tourism to economic growth.
(f) Findings

(i) The sector-led approach to economic development sees the Department putting its concerted weight behind the priority sectors that it anticipates will drive the economy, thereby maximising sustainable private sector job creation;

(ii) A red tape unit was established in the Department to champion and co-ordinate all red tape related government initiatives and to improve the business regulatory environment;

(iii) The WCEDP seeks to empower local and regional government, the private and non-profit organisations and communities to work together to improve the local regional and national economy;

(iv) Casidra was an implementing agent for the Red Door projects in rural areas, co-ordinating the services offered by Red Door and implementing work skills programmes;

(v) One of the projects embarked upon was a business helpline, which handled over 380 cases and boasted an 80% resolution rate and the establishment, in partnership with the Cape Chamber of Commerce and Stellenbosch University, of Africa’s first Mediation and Arbitration Centre. This centre will enable business to settle litigation matters within a shorter period and at a fraction of the cost of pursuing matters in court;

(vi) The five municipalities that have endorsed the of Red Tape Reduction programme and became part of the business helpline are the Cape Winelands, Drakenstein, Swartland, Breede Valley and Stellenbosch municipalities; and

(vii) The Aquaculture Development Zones will be designated areas in the Western Cape and specific effort will be made to reduce the barriers to market entry and to provide a supportive environment for the existing and emerging entrepreneurs in order to take advantage of the growth and job creating potential of the industry.

(g) Recommendations

The Committee recommended that—

(i) Due to the insufficient time allocated to the Committee, it could not conduct meaningful oversight over the Department of Economic Development and Tourism’s Annual Report and that the Chairperson addresses this matter at the next Programming Authority meeting;

(ii) The Department add the names of the Committee Members to the mailing list in respect of the E-Spark application; and

(iii) The possibility of duplicating the Aquaculture practice to other areas that are rife with unemployment should be investigated.

(h) Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee

The Committee requested that the Department provides it with the following:

(i) The details of the premises which contravened liquor license conditions and were issued with warnings, fines or temporarily closed; and
(ii) A Copy of the business climate survey that was completed for Theewaterskloof Municipality.

4. Cape Town Routes Unlimited (CTRU)

(a) Oversight report

The year under review had its own exciting highlights and challenges. In the light of the funding issues, there was a strong inclination from CTRU to respond to this and to make sure that it can still deliver on its mandate.

The Western Cape, especially Cape Town, has been successful in attracting more local and international visitors. The destination enjoys a high level of awareness internationally and has benefitted from the substantial private and public sector investment in the new tourism infrastructure, facilities and services. The international market has seen a bit of strain and this is attributed to events in the global economy.

(b) Findings

(i) Due to budgetary constraints, the Victoria and Alfred Gateway Information Office, was closed, followed by the closure of information offices in Van Rhynsdorp, Beaufort West and Storms River. All Staff Members involved in these closures were contractual staff and were notified in advance that their contract would not be renewed. The strategic focus against the backdrop of a reduced budget was to place emphasis on destination marketing;

(ii) CTRU has generated an estimated R3 billion in direct return on investment for the Province against a marketing budget of R15 million; and

(iii) The movement of tourism marketing (CTRU), to the Province’s trade and investment arm (Wesgro), will require organisational leadership, strategic vision and private sector expertise and support.

(c) Recommendation

The Committee recommended that it extends a vote of thanks to Messrs Peter Bacon and Calvyn Gilfellan for their contribution to the tourism industry in the Western Cape.

5. Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency (Wesgro)

(a) Oversight report

This year marks three decades of Wesgro promoting trade and investment in the Western Cape and so contributing to the economic development of the Province. It also marks the 11th consecutive year that the provincial economy has outperformed the national economy and the 9th consecutive year that it has outshone the other eight provinces in terms of average annual growth.
(b) Findings

(i) The Western Cape’s top source of tourism, trade and foreign direct investment is in Europe. On the trade and tourism side, we find it in the United Kingdom, the Netherlands and Germany and on the foreign direct investment side in the United Kingdom and Germany;

(ii) Wesgro’s Investment Promotion Unit participated in a number of outward missions and hosted a number of inward delegations, apart from attracting and facilitating foreign investment into the regional economy;

(iii) The Agri-business Investment Unit exceeded its investment target, committing four projects to the value of R82 million against a target of R50 million, and recording 198 jobs for the financial year. The unit, through its drive to target potential investors, recruited nine quality investment projects into the pipeline, proving that the proactive approach of recruiting investments can achieve ongoing success;

(iv) Filling of vacancies is subject to the grant received from the City of Cape Town and Province. It should be noted that the Provincial Government falls under the guidance of the PFMA (year end 31 March) and the municipality falls under the MFMA (year end 30 June);

(v) A decision was made to hold back on training to get clarity on the status of the Economic Development Partnership;

(vi) Internal policies were reviewed and additional policies were developed to be King III compliant;

(vii) Discussions were held with the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality to introduce Wesgro’s services there, with an emphasis on renewable energy and building a relationship to benefit the province; and

(viii) Wesgro, in their forward planning, could have considered employing some of the contract staff from CTRU. This might have prevented the job losses that resulted from the amalgamation of CTRU into Wesgro.

(c) Recommendations

The Committee recommended that–

(i) The Board is not representative of all race and gender groups. This must be addressed;

(ii) Most of the overseas trips focused on renewable energy and the Committee would expect to see the fruit of this soon, and will be following up with the Department in this regard; and

(iv) The Committee must be informed of inward mission delegations and the purpose of such visits; and
(v) The Committee must be kept informed of the outcomes of outward missions on a regular basis.

C. Conclusion

The Committee was satisfied by the approach of the Department, CTRU and Wesgro to the interrogation of the annual reports and wishes to thank the Minister, Head of Department and the Chairpersons and Chief Executive Officers of CTRU and Wesgro for their contributions and efforts in this regard. The Committee further wishes to request that the House considers this report.
The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS – see p. 6613

STATMENTS BY MEMBERS

*Mr H P Geyer (DA): Mr Speaker, looking back at the past 14 days' events one can only shake one's head and wonder what was achieved by the actions of lawless people who are hiding behind a so-called farm worker wage strike? Who won? Nobody, and the workers are going to suffer most in the future. I want to ask Minister Fransman and Tony Ehrenreich: Are you satisfied now? Are you satisfied that 89 families now have no livelihood after your war talk and that sawmills have burnt down?

Mr Speaker, these two guys are loudmouths and, according to the newspaper, also foul-mouthed. It is a pity that Minister Tina Joemat-Petterson did not look at the full agricultural picture but rather took sides. Is she now happy that the farmer from Bonnievale, where a farm worker earns R1 000 a week and where he built a house of R1 200 000 for each of his workers and also had a school built on his farm, also suffered huge damage through this orchestrated destruction? In the community this farmer is known as a man with a heart for the people. And I don't notice any concern on the other side of the House, except for a smirk or two.

Mr Speaker, rather than express their alarm and concern about this matter, these members rather do the ridiculous thing, and that is to accuse the Premier of inciting unrest. What is the world coming to – and then they want to govern this province. I again ask Minister Joemat-Petterson, Minister Fransman and Tony Ehrenreich: Are you satisfied, especially now that farmers in the Western Cape are beginning to enquire about farming in other countries where other governments see the value of South African farmers and want to attract them to help the economies of those countries bloom? Really, the Three Musketeers – Tina, Fransman and Ehrenreich – will go down in history as people who did the citizens of the Western Cape and the RSA a great injustice. I thank you.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Mr Speaker, the ANC and the DA speak with two different tongues on this matter. It is very interesting that you represent, unfortunately, only one opinion in the war between the farmers and farm workers at the moment. [Interjections.] And it has become a war, with people dying. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The worst labour uprising ever was recorded in the Western Cape for better wages and conditions for working and living. It was marred by the death of two farm workers that were shot – the one was shot like a dog by a farmer, as averred by co-workers. Clinics were closed down, racism and tensions rose.
Heavily armed mercenaries and security personnel were brought in, while private militia started controlling areas like the Gestapo. Helicopters and machine or assault guns are now common around the province. Workers are assaulted and intimidated. They lock farm gates before dark and workers leaving their houses after that are beaten up. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: What is the DA’s response to all of this? [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister Carlisle!

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It issues statements dripping with lies. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, order! [Interjections.] Hon Minister Carlisle, order!

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: In one incident a certain man called William Campher was defamed and maliciously implicated in something he never was part of, or even knew about. The DA desperately tried to shift the blame to the ANC, but the poor conditions and treatment of workers are exposed every day. The task to diffuse the tensions was left to the ANC and the clergy, while the DA leaders wined and dined at the Waterfront and other posh places enjoying the result of labourers sweat and exploits. [Time expired.]

†Ms J L HARTNICK (DA): Mr Speaker, with the commencement of the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence against Women and Children on Sunday, 25 November ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Ozinsky, the hon Hartnick is on the floor.

†Ms J L HARTNICK: With the commencement of the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence against Women and Children on Sunday, 25 November 2012, I take this opportunity to once again acknowledge the marginalised group of women and children who are increasingly being subjected to acts of violence in the Western Cape. This group of women and children is that of the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgendered and inter sexed community in the country as a whole.

On 9 November 2012 another lesbian was killed in Samora Machel informal settlement, this time with a mini spear. This attack comes two weeks after two lesbian friends were attacked in Gugulethu. Mr Speaker, these violent acts are becoming more and more brutal and far too prevalent to throw a blind eye or deaf ear.

These women are human beings, they are someone’s daughter, they are women in their own right and their choice of sexual orientation does not make them any less of these. These brutal acts of violence against them strip them of their human rights of equality, human dignity, life, freedom of security of person, freedom of expression, freedom of association and freedom of movement.

These women and children are living in fear, which goes against the fibre of living in a democracy.
South Africa is said to have one of the most progressive constitutions in the world, but what worth is that ink on paper if its contents is not implemented to safeguard our vulnerable groups.

The DA condemns any act of violence against women and children, not only during these 16 days of activism, but all year round and we will continue to probe the national government to uphold the supremacy of the Constitution and protect our diversity by promoting more tolerance, understanding and respect.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: The Western Cape Department of Education under MEC Donald Grant lurches from crisis to chaos. In the past few days we heard that the youth care facility in Ottery now also faces the axe, together with other so-called rehabilitation centres for juvenile offenders, formerly called industry training centres.

These centres, which are the last hope for many youngsters, who come into conflict with the law, are rendering a very important service to our communities by absorbing violent and serious-crime offenders. It is said these learners will even have to be moved to juvenile prisons where gangsterism and abuse are rife.

This is another school of industry that has mysteriously been shut down by the department. It is said that the department wants to pass the buck to Social Development. The learners, parents, staff and communities are left insecure and uncertain about the future of these youngsters, but it is not surprising that the department continues with its high-handed way of dealing with youngsters and their future.

It has subsequently come to light that the department is also unsettling numerous learners, who may not use learner transport next year, like some children in Paarl who were notified that they will no longer be provided with the usual buses. Shame on the provincial government, led by the DA, for not caring for the poor and ordinary people or their children.

†Mr M C WALTERS (DA): Mr Speaker, dire predictions on the future of the abalone industry have appeared under the captions of “Cape’s abalone is well on the way to extinction” and “Abalone extinct in 25 years”. If poaching is not substantially reduced, it might be earlier.

The responsible authority, the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, has no real incentive to protect the legal abalone industry. During the 2010-11 financial year, R46 million was derived from poached abalone, which went into the department’s coffers. Drastic action by the department to place the abalone industry on a sustainable basis has now become urgent:

Commercial abalone farms, such as Abagold and Irvin & Johnson, produce millions of surplus juveniles or spats annually. They should be contracted to provide spats to be placed in suitable niches in the sea, where they can augment the natural populations. Gene diversity can be maintained by breeding stock from the wild.

The expansion of abalone farming to community members is already being undertaken. Active support by government will accelerate this endeavour and provide an alternative to poaching.
Sea ranching is a further option to expand the involvement of poachers in abalone farming. Areas of suitable seabed environments are assigned to individuals who protect the abalone placed within their ranches. This would require government support until marketable-sized abalone have been reared.

The policing of poaching and reinstitution of green courts is essential. The critical factors in saving the abalone industry will be the co-operation of major companies and a virtually unlimited lucrative export market that can absorb increased production. The crucial missing ingredient however will be the department’s willingness to be part of the process by providing financial support during the initiation of such undertakings. [Time expired.]

†Mr R B LENTIT (ID): Mr Speaker, the Western Cape government has made positive and successful inroads into creating opportunities for youth and entrepreneurial development in our province. The Premier’s Advancement of Youth project, which is planned to begin on 1 April 2013, is one such initiative which will provide a 1 000 matriculants from the class of 2012 with work and training.

Mr Speaker, many parents of the 2012 matriculants are not in a financial position to enable their children to engage in further studies. This project is therefore a chance to earn money while gaining work experience and skills. Our young people possess a wealth of intelligence, and are often curbed by low-wage jobs in retail stores, due to unfortunate domestic and financial circumstances. If you go to Woolworths, Pick ‘n Pay or Shoprite you will find intelligent young men and women behind a till point or packing groceries. It is very seldom that these cashiers and packers fulfil their dreams and do justice to the years of financial strain on their parents to provide them with a basic education.

Mr Speaker, the Premier’s Advancement of Youth project will not only reduce unemployment and poverty, it will also certainly contribute to a steady growth rate in the Western Cape economy.

*Mr J J VISSER (DA): Mr Speaker, when does a scrap become a fight? It becomes one when both opposing parties fight each other equally hard. The scrap with the DA that the ANC started in Swellendam is not really a fight because the DA is not fighting back physically. The reason for this is apparently because the people of the DA are emotionally far more intelligent than the people of the ANC.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Because they’re white?

*Mr J J VISSER: The DA also knows the difference between democracy and chaos, law and order and chaos and how to address differences and disputes. In Swellendam the ANC tried everything to take control of the Council. First they launched a months-long intimidation campaign by walking out at meetings and leaving the meetings without quorums so that decisions could not be made. They then held unlawful meetings and tried to get rid of the mayor, deputy mayor, Speaker and municipal manager in an unlawful way.

These people of the ANC are so power drunk that they cannot realise the reality and admit that legislation regulates society. They hold their own illegal kangaroo courts where reckless, dangerous decisions are made.
Even after the court has given a verdict, which determines what is right and what is wrong, the ANC still cannot accept it and now innocent people have to bear the brunt.

People’s buildings and businesses are damaged and looted. To gain what? To make a point about something! How can the ANC think that right-minded people are ever going to vote for them again after such a display of anarchy?

Mr Speaker, even in this House the ANC is tacitly approving these banal actions while they try to cast suspicion on the hon Minister Bredell and belittle him. All I can say, is “Sis, shame on you! Shame!”

*Mr R B LENTIT: What a disgrace!

†Mr Z C STALI (ANC): The DA is nowhere to be found in the war against poverty. While the national government, through grants from the Department of Trade and Industry, is handing over fishing boats to communities along the coastline, the DA is for landowners and big business.

So far small-scale fishing communities in areas such as De Doorns, Lamberts Bay, Hout Bay and Stanford have benefited from this venture to empower communities, reduce poverty, create jobs and stimulate the coastal economies.

More than forty equipped fishing vessels to make a decent living were donated to fisher folk. This is national government delivery. This is delivery by the national government led by the ANC. This is ANC delivery. Where is the DA when people need them? Nowhere – not even close! What the DA delivers is undignified sanitation like open toilets, pink letters and evictions.

We again saw this previous week how the DA says farmers cannot pay more than the minimum wage as they cannot afford it.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Who said that?

†Mr Z C STALI: We saw how people were intimidated, assaulted and killed, and many in the DA are silent about that. They keep quiet as many people are abused, exploited and subjugated. Shame on the DA for not siding with poor and oppressed people! [Interjections.]

†Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Mr Speaker, the ACDP welcomes the intervention by national Minister Baloyi; the Minister in the provincial government, Minister Bredell; and leaders of the ANC, the DA and the ACDP into Swellendam. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, should I start again? [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Continue, hon member.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: The ACDP welcomes the intervention by national Minister Baloyi, Minister Bredell and the leadership ... [Interjections.] ...

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!
†Mr G C R HASKIN: ... of the ACDP, the ANC and the DA into ending the violence, intimidation and aggression that have been taking place in Swellendam over the last few weeks.

The joint press statement that was made this afternoon confirms that the parties are now committed to working towards strengthening the municipality through good governance – let the ANC listen – and that the ANC will respect the democratically-elected government of Swellendam, which is the ACDP and the DA. This is their councillors who have committed to respecting that elected government. [Interjections.] It also confirms that all nine councillors will now present themselves as a united front to the Swellendam community and commit to addressing their needs in a sustainable manner and that the Minister and the MEC are sending officials to assist them.

Quite frankly, what we've seen in Swellendam could, and should, have been avoided if the ANC had not been so hell-bent on not accepting democratic outcomes, respecting democracy as it is and respecting the rule of law. [Interjections.]

The ACDP distances itself from the actions of its former councillor, remembering that the ACDP successfully expelled this person for the very behaviour that he has been accused of. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Skwatsha, order!

†Mr G C R HASKIN: We also condemn the actions of his brother who has been driving around Swellendam, reported to you in the last few days, inciting further violence and instigating aggression. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, order!

†Mr G C R HASKIN: We call on the ANC to end their destabilising actions, to respect the commitments that their own councillors have made in Swellendam now and to compel them to participate in council processes in a constructive manner.

†Mr A M FIGLAN (DA): Mr Speaker, the plan by the Minister of Human Settlements to establish a multiparty forum to deal with service delivery is a measure to allow the broader community to engage with the municipality in an ordered and structured way.

This multiparty forum must represent the interests of the broader community fairly and democratically to allow the forum to work better together to improve service delivery in the area.

Housing delivery is one of the key issues in the province, with a backlog of 500 000 households in need of formal housing. With such a demand, it is of vital importance that the allocation of housing opportunities must be done in a way that is fair and also prioritises those in need, such as the elderly.

This initiative by the department is welcomed, for the department has an obligation to impartially and transparently engage residents of the Western Cape who have valid concerns, and how best to meet those concerns with the resources available.
One concern is that this initiative of the department must not be politicised or be used to gain political points. It is there to represent the broader community, and the concerns of the community must not be taken on political bias or support. The Minister must have the assurance from the different role-players that this forum will not be politicised or hijacked by certain individuals or groups with ulterior motives, other than for what the forum has been set up to do and achieve.

It is hoped that the department will engage other communities around the province in establishing similar forums to engage and learn about the concerns of communities, and find ways to address these concerns.

This multiparty forum is already highly successful in Bitou, Bot River and Villiersdorp.

**CLOSURE OF OTTERY YOUTH CARE CENTRE**

(Notice of motion)

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the looming closure by the Western Cape Education Department of the Ottery Youth Care Centre, a facility that rehabilitates and houses boys between 12 and 18 years of age who were involved in criminal behaviour.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House –

(1) discusses the looming closure by the Western Cape Education Department of the Ottery Youth Care Centre; and

(2) notes with concern that this facility, which is at risk of having to close its doors, rehabilitates, houses and gives hope to boys between the ages of 12 and 18 years who have been involved in criminal behaviour.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Are there any further notices? There are none. We then proceed to motions without notice.

†Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, ...

†The SPEAKER: Where are you, hon Visser?

*Mr J J VISSER: I have another motion with notice, if I may.

†The SPEAKER: You must indicate, hon Visser. You may take the opportunity.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: You had already ruled we have moved on to the next issue.
Previously in the House you disallowed us at the same point. I would like to understand why you give that member a chance and in the past you have not given us a chance.

†The SPEAKER: I didn’t deny anyone a chance.

†Mr M OZINSKY: You have in the past – you have!

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: You have, Mr Speaker, already now announced that we move on to the next order.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon member! Take your seat. [Interjections.] Take your seat, hon Ozinsky.

†Mr M OZINSKY: I’m sitting.

†The SPEAKER: Hon member, over to you.

*Mr J J VISSER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discuss the destructive behaviour of the ANC in Swellendam.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, ...

†The SPEAKER: Order! What is the point of order, hon Skwatsha?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

†The SPEAKER: What is the point of order?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: You had already ruled that we proceed to the next item.

†The SPEAKER: No, no, no, I didn’t rule that. There was no indication, but the hon ...

†Mr M SKWATSHA: You had just announced that we are moving to the next …

†The SPEAKER: Order! As the presiding officer, I wish to give the hon member an opportunity. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! If there is another member on this side of the House who needs to take that opportunity, he or she is also welcome. Over to you, hon Visser.

BEHAVIOUR OF ANC IN SWELLENDAM

(Notice of motion)

*Mr J J VISSER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discuss the destructive behaviour of the ANC in Swellendam.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]
Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the unconstructive behaviour of the African National Congress in Swellendam.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

LATE BONGILE NDLENI

(Motion of condolence)

†Ms B G MBALO: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of the murdered seasonal farm worker, Bongile Ndleni of the Witzenberg Valley at Prince Alfred Hamlet near Ceres, who was shot in a drive-by shooting from a bakkie during the farm worker wage strike last week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) extends its condolences to the family and friends of the murdered seasonal farm worker, Bongile Ndleni of the Witzenberg Valley in the vicinity of Prince Alfred Hamlet near Ceres; and

(2) notes that he died after he had allegedly been shot in a drive-by shooting from a bakkie during the farm worker wage strike in the past week.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CEASE-FIRE BETWEEN ISRAEL AND HAMAS

(Motion)

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARIAS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

(1) welcomes the cease-fire facilitated by Egypt’s leadership between Israel and Hamas;

(2) congratulates all the role-players who contributed to the cessation of violence that has claimed 150 lives in eight days; and

(3) urges all parties to use the cease-fire to negotiate lasting peace in the Middle East.

[Motion as moved by member.]
Ms A J DU TOIT MARIAS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) welcomes the ceasefire between Israel and the Hamas movement that was facilitated by the leadership of Egypt;

(2) congratulates all the role-players who have contributed to the cessation of violence that claimed 150 lives in just eight days; and

(3) urges all the parties involved to use the ceasefire to negotiate lasting peace in the Middle East.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LARGE-SCALE FRAUD AMONG NORTHERN CAPE ANC LEADERSHIP

(Motion)

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House take note of the large-scale fraud that was uncovered among the Northern Cape ANC leadership and is being investigated.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the large-scale fraud under the leadership of the African National Congress in the Northern Cape that has been exposed and is currently being investigated.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Is there an objection to the motion being moved without notice? [Objection.] There is an objection and therefore the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: The House is not able to discuss matters that are before a court of law. This matter is before a court of law. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: People have been charged. It cannot be put on the Order Paper.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon member! That is why there is an objection.

†Mr M OZINSKY: It can't be placed on the Order Paper.

†The SPEAKER: That is why we say that there is an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.
†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, you fail to understand what I’m raising with you. It can’t be placed on the Order Paper, because that would then allow the motion to be forwarded for discussion.

†The SPEAKER: We will deal with it, hon member. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House …

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: Please indulge me, what is your ruling on the matter?

†The SPEAKER: My ruling is that I will get the facts and everything and make a ruling as the presiding officer. Over to you, hon Lentit.

**GRATITUDE AND WELL WISHES TO WESTERN CAPE TRAFFIC DEPARTMENT**

(Motion)

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

(1) conveys its gratitude to the Western Cape Traffic Department and all traffic officials for successfully implementing road safety campaigns and their visibility in an attempt to keep road users safe; and

(2) wishes them all the best with their latest Buckle-Up campaign that was launched at the Red Cross War Memorial Children’s Hospital this morning.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its gratitude to the Western Cape Traffic Department and all our traffic officials for successfully implementing road safety campaigns and increasing their visibility in an attempt to keep road users safe.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
GRATITUDE TO TYGERBERG HOSPITAL

(Motion)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its gratitude to the Tygerberg Hospital for performing reconstructive surgery that made it possible for 10-year-old Cassidy Sitella of De Doorns to be given ears after having been born without them.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its gratitude to the Tygerberg Hospital and medical staff involved for performing reconstructive surgery that has made it possible for the 10-year-old Cassidy Sitella of De Doorns to be given ears by surgically creating ears after she had been born without any visible external ears.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO OVERSTRAND MUNICIPALITY

(Motion)

†Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to the Mayor and officials of the Overstrand Municipality on winning the National Greenest Town Competition for 2010-11.

[Motion as moved by member.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

†Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

†The SPEAKER: Is there an objection to the motion itself?

†Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

†The SPEAKER: There are none. Agreed to. [Interjections.] Is it yes? What do you mean?

†Ms M TINGWE: Yes, I have an objection. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Tingwe, you are in the House. Don’t play games. What are you saying, because you say yes every time?

†Ms M TINGWE: I’m saying I’m objecting to the motion.
†The SPEAKER: Can you stand up and address the House. What are you saying?

Nksz M TINGWE: Somlomo, ndithi ndiyasikhaba isphakamiso qha.[Ms M TINGWE: Speaker, I say I object to the motion.]

†The SPEAKER: There’s an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

**FARMERS FUNDING GROUND AND AIR STRIKE SECURITY**

(Motion)

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the fact that farmers are funding ground and air strike security while refusing to pay farm workers an equitable living wage.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the fact that farmers in the Western Cape are paying security firms to ensure that security is maintained on the ground and from the air whilst they are refusing to pay farmworkers an equitable living wage.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Objection.] If there is an objection it will be printed on the Order Paper.

**16 DAYS OF ACTIVISM AGAINST ABUSE AND VIOLENCE OF WOMEN AND CHILDREN**

(Motion)

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

(1) notes the 16 Days of Activism Against the Abuse and Violence of Women and Children which starts on Sunday, 25 November 2012;

(2) gives special acknowledgement to Dopstop, a nongovernmental organisation which was founded in 1994 to deal with the impact of the dop/tot system practices on Western Cape farms; and

(3) notes that Dopstop is an organisation that is working at uprooting the dependency on alcohol and consequently alcoholism of farm workers, as violence and child neglect are some of these consequences in the community.

[Motion as moved by member.]
Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that the annual campaign of 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children starts on Sunday, 25 November 2012;

(2) expresses its support for this campaign to end violence against and the abuse of women and children; and

(3) in this regard conveys a special word of acknowledgement to Dopstop, a non-governmental organisation that was founded in 1994 to deal with the devastating impact of the “dopstelsel” or tot system, and of practices relating thereto, on Western Cape farms.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

MYCITI VEHICLE OPERATING COMPANIES UPSET WITH CITY OF CAPE TOWN

(Motion)

†Mr Z C STALI: Mr Speaker, on behalf of the ANC, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that taxi owners who formed the MyCiTi vehicle operating companies are upset with the City of Cape Town for taking a bus station management contract away from them.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Speaker, on behalf of the ANC, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that taxi owners who formed the MyCiTi vehicle operating companies are upset with the City of Cape Town for taking a bus station management contract away from them.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Is there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? [Objection.] There is an objection and therefore the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.
LATE IAN KIRKPATRICK
(Motion of condolence)

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House —

(1) Pay tribute to a person who left his mark on the South African rugby scene and who died recently; and

(2) Take note that I myself was coached by Ian Kirkpatrick and will remember him as a wonderful mentor and human being.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House —

(1) wishes to convey its condolences to the family and friends of Ian Kirkpatrick, who died on 18 November 2012 at the age of 82 years; and

(2) honours this well-known rugby coach and Springbok rugby player, who really made his mark in the South African rugby world.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO MAYOR OF POTCHEFSTROOM
(Motion)

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the newly elected Mayor of Potchefstroom, Prof Annette Combrinck.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the newly elected mayor of Potchefstroom, Professor Annette Combrinck.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Is there an objection to the motion being moved without notice? [Objection.] There is an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.
DIVIDE ALONG RACIAL AND LANGUAGE LINES
(Motion)
†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

(1) notes with great concern the divide along racial and language lines and cut-off learner transport at the Ronwe and Charleston Hill Primary Schools, without proper consultation with parents and stakeholders;

(2) further notes that this form of discrimination is not assisting our children; and

(3) calls on the DA to stop its racist act.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with great concern the divide along racial and language lines and the cutting off of learner transport at the Ronwe Primary School and Charleston Hill Primary School in Paarl, without consultation with parents and other stakeholders involved.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Is there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? [Objection.] There is an objection and therefore the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

ULMILIO KWINDAWO YAMATYOTYOMBE YASEKANANA EGUGULETHU
(Isiphakamiso)

Mnu M SKWATSHA: Somlomo, ndenza isiphakamiso ndingenzanga saziso:

Ukuba le Ndlu iqwalasele ngovelwano ukuba abangamashumi asibhozo izindlu zabo ziye zatshatyalaliswa ngumlilo othe washiya konakaliswe izindlu ezingamashumi amane kumatyotyombe aseKanana eGugulethu kule mpelaveki igqithileyo.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.]

FIRES IN KANANA INFORMAL AREAS, GUGULETHU
(Motion)

Mr M SKWATSHA: Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sends its sympathy to the 80 people who lost their 40 houses which were destroyed by fires in the informal area of Kanana in Gugulethu during the past weekend.]

[Motion as moved by member.]
Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that 80 people were left homeless after a fire destroyed 40 homes in the Kanana informal settlement in Gugulethu over the weekend of 17 November 2012.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

LATE LOVELINE MICHAELS

(Motion of condolence)

*Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserate with the family of Loveline Michaels, neighbourhood watch member of Slanghoek in Heidelberg, who died tragically on Sunday, 18 November 2012.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its condolences with the family and friends of Loveline Michaels, a member of the neighbourhood watch of Slangrivier in Heidelberg, who tragically died after a diving accident at a year-end function of the neighbourhood watch on Saturday, 17 November 2012.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

COMMENDATION TO SAPS

(Motion)

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the SAPS for seizing nine bags of abalone and arresting two suspects in Grassy Park following a car chase on Tuesday.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the South African Police Service for seizing nine bags of abalone and arresting two suspects in Grassy Park following a car chase on Tuesday, 20 November 2012.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
LAUNCH OF R55 MILLION SOCIAL HOUSING PROJECT IN BOTHASIG GARDENS

(Motion)

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the launch by the Minister of Human Settlements, Tokyo Sexwale, of a R55 million social housing project in Bothasig Gardens that will provide 120 social rental housing opportunities for families earning between R2 200 and R7 500 a month.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) welcomes the launch of a R55 million social housing project in Bothasig Gardens by the Minister of Human Settlements, Tokyo Sexwale; and

(2) notes that this project will provide 120 opportunities for social rental housing to families earning between R2 200 and R7 500 a month.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Introduction and First Reading)

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, the hon Premier, my Cabinet colleagues, the Leader of the Opposition and members of the House, special guests who have stuck around since lunch and, of course, the citizens of this province, I thank you.

Mr Speaker, 2012 will go down in South Africa’s history as a year of violent protests. This year, more violent protests were recorded in our country than in any other year since the end of apartheid.

†Mr M OZINSKY: And more in the Western Cape.

†The MINISTER: I would like to extend our sincere condolences to families that lost a mother, a father, a sister, a brother, a child, a grandparent, a friend or a loved one as a result of these violent protests. Our sympathy also goes to those who lost their means of living as a result of looting and destruction of property.

Mr Speaker, the National Treasury estimates that since the beginning of 2012, R10.1 billion worth of production value has been lost solely as a result of the disruptions in the gold and platinum mining sector.
While the Western Cape was largely unaffected by the unrest in the mining sector, the spate of protests in the agricultural sector during the past two weeks will not leave our economy unscathed. The agricultural sector is a very important component of the Western Cape economy and sustains thousands of jobs.

The sector is also, by far, the most dominant export industry in our province.

The agricultural sector exports more than 30% of its annual production, with the wine industry contributing nearly 50% of these exports. Directly, the sector contributed R13,8 billion to Western Cape GDP in 2010 and 23,2% of national agricultural GDP.

Our agricultural sector is well-positioned to capitalise on the demands that have arisen in light of a growing global food shortage. To do so, we must prove that our products are of high quality and that our supply chains are stable.

Mr Speaker, let it be clear that I have no doubt that many workers have real concerns. These should be addressed in a constructive and sustainable way. We must engage in a meaningful, peaceful and constructive manner in creating a better labour regime in our province and in our country.

Economic Outlook for the next three years

Mr Speaker, developments in our region must be considered in the context of the global and national economic environment. Despite initial optimism, global economic recovery has been slow, with high levels of sovereign debt and high unemployment in developed countries. The negative impact of the sluggish global economy on South Africa was already evident with weaker export volumes in the second quarter of 2012.

The National Treasury expects growth in the South African economy to ease from 3,1% in 2011 to 2,5% in 2012. GDP growth is expected to recover to 3% during 2013. A more meaningful increase in GDP growth is only expected from 2014 onwards.

Mr Speaker, in the Western Cape, growth is predicted to slow to 2,9% in 2012 before accelerating to 3,6% in 2013. Thereafter, growth is forecast to remain stable at just above 4% between 2014 and 2017, averaging growth of 3,9% over this forecast period.

Labour Market Trends

Mr Speaker, nationally, expanded unemployment grew by an average of 8,3% per annum between the first quarter of 2008 and the first quarter of 2012. The growth in expanded unemployment was driven primarily by a massive increase in the number of discouraged work seekers.

Mr Speaker, the number of people in South Africa as a whole who feel that they have no prospect of finding a job has grown by 25,3% per annum, and is now at 11,4%.

The Western Cape differs from the rest of the country in that it has relatively few discouraged work seekers – just 1,3%.
This means that there is a high degree of hope amongst people in our province that they are able to find a job. We will continue to work hard to meet this expectation and further drive the unemployment rate down.

The youth of our country continue to face significant employment challenges. The Western Cape unemployment rate for 15 to 24-year-olds was at 45,1% in the first quarter of 2012, twice the Western Cape average of 22,8%.

We will make a special effort to address joblessness amongst our youth. Indeed, we have already begun to tackle this task through a youth wage subsidy, called the Work and Skills Programme. The Department of Economic Development and Tourism has set aside R15 million over the medium term for the Work and Skills Programme, the ICT initiative and the Artisan Programme. These are all initiatives that are specifically targeted at creating employment opportunities for our young people.

I am extremely pleased to announce that the Jobs Fund administered by the Development Bank of South Africa (DBSA) on behalf of the National Treasury has allocated a further R65 million over three years to these youth initiatives. In addition, R32 million will be provided by Seta and host companies, bringing the amount to be spent by the Department of Economic Development and Tourism on our youth employment initiatives – the Work and Skills Programme, the ICT initiative and the Artisan Programme – to a total of R112 million over the medium term.

Medium-Term Expenditure Priorities

Mr Speaker, in light of the challenges facing our province, our government’s key objective in the medium term is to grow the economy and create employment opportunities for all. As a province functioning within the structure of the three spheres of government, we do not have the macroeconomic, trade and industrial policy instruments that the national government has at its disposal to directly influence economic outcomes. However, with the functions that we do have – basic education, health services, social welfare, Human Settlements, Public Works, Transport and Agriculture – we will utilise these fully to achieve our goal of driving economic and employment growth.

Mr Speaker, as a first step, we are creating an enabling environment for this growth. Our Red Tape to Red Carpet Campaign has, thus far, had a 90% resolution rate. We have already put in place a plan to ensure that the majority of citizens will have easy access to the low cost broadband and are suitably skilled to engage government through this channel.

We intend to ensure public ICT access within a 2 km radius of every person living in our province by 2019, and universal broadband access by 2020. We will set aside R240 million over the medium term for the broadband connectivity project.

We are building partnerships in economic development – the EDP has been established to lead, coordinate and drive economic development in the province. Together with a broad range of stakeholders, the EDP has devised an economic vision and action plan for our province up to 2040 that is focused on making our society more skilled, more connected, more innovative and more resource efficient.
One Cape 2040 will be tabled at Cabinet shortly for approval and thereafter will be debated more broadly across the province. The One Cape 2040 vision is aligned to Minister Trevor Manuel’s National Development Plan as well as the plans and visions of the City of Cape Town.

Mr Speaker, for an economy to grow and attract investors, a well-maintained, well-organised and safe transport network is necessary.

The Department of Transport and Public Works has set a target of reducing our road maintenance backlog by 16% by 2014. Close to R1,5 billion over the medium term has been directed towards this objective.

The Department of Transport and Public Works will also oversee the upgrading of a number of key roads in our province. These include the remaining section of the Divisional Road between Gans Bay and Bredasdorp, the Wingfield Interchange and the road network that will support the proposed Saldanha Bay IDZ.

Mr Speaker, the Wingfield Interchange is a node of strategic importance as its upgrading will improve the accessibility into the Cape Town CBD and the Port of Cape Town on both the N1 and N7. It is anticipated that 50% of the Wingfield design stage will be completed by the end of the 2014-15 financial year. The total cost of this mega project is estimated to amount to R1,255 billion and should be completed at the end of 2019.

The upgrading of the remaining 27,5 km of road between Gans Bay and Bredasdorp will commence in March 2013 and is planned for completion by the 2015-16 financial year. This road will be transformed from a rural to a scenic tourist route that passes through the Elim Valley, linking Gordon’s Bay to Cape Agulhas via Hermanus and Bredasdorp and the whole Whale Route. This project has been approved for implementation at an estimated cost of R292,96 million.

Mr Speaker, the regional freight links between Saldanha Bay and Vredenburg, as well as Cape Town and the N7 will be maintained and upgraded to ensure adequate access to and from Saldanha Bay to account for higher demand once the IDZ has been implemented. The total estimated cost of this project is R524,31 million.

Mr Speaker, as the Western Cape Government, we believe that we must grow our economy while taking cognizance of our natural environment. The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning intends to build and expand the sustainable resource use agenda within the province.

Within each department, we will pilot a project called the Guidelines for the Embedding of Sustainability and implement them sequentially over the medium term throughout this government.

To achieve the promotion of sustainability at local government level, municipalities will be assisted to devise sustainable development frameworks, climate change adaptation plans, sustainable energy as well as integrated waste management plans.

To further promote sustainability in our province, we have prioritised initiatives to grow the green economy.
Our ultimate aim is to identify possible private sector investment cases in support of green investment growth and to identify economic opportunities and to facilitate their realisation.

Our government’s 110% Green Initiative was launched earlier this year. This initiative demonstrates the Western Cape Government’s commitment and leadership to create connections between the green and the general economy through practical action at all levels of society.

Mr Speaker, for our economy to grow and create employment, we require an educated populace. Unemployment amongst those with incomplete secondary education has grown rapidly, with the number of unemployed matriculants growing at a similar rate. Together, these two groups account for 82% of unemployment and 95% of unemployment growth, respectively.

In order to improve educational outcomes and increase employment for our youth, the Department of Education intends to improve our Grades 1 and 9 pass rates and retain more learners in Grades 10 to 12, in other words keep them in our system.

The Education Department will dedicate all available resources to improve the quality of education offered in all our schools: In the medium term, this department will continue to focus on three goals:

- Improving language and mathematics in primary schools;
- improving the number and quality of passes in the National Senior Certificate; and
- reducing the number of underperforming schools.

Mr Speaker, over the medium term, in excess of R2,353 billion in capital spending will be invested in education. An amount of R1,318 billion will be invested in new, replacement and expanding primary and secondary schools. An amount of R376,143 million will be utilised to renovate schools in various districts around the province.

Despite having better living conditions and income levels than other provinces in South Africa, the Western Cape has a particular set of social ills. The province has one of the highest homicide rates in South Africa and therefore we will establish a Commission of Inquiry to investigate the breakdown of relations between the SAPS and the residents of Khayelitsha, where community members have taken justice into their own hands.

Mr Speaker, to increase our oversight role of the SAPS, the Community Safety Bill was tabled in the 2011-12 financial year. The Bill is expected to be promulgated early next year.

Mr Speaker, investment in health is key. While life expectancy in the Western Cape is the highest in South Africa, it remains low compared to peer developing countries. The province faces a quadruple burden of disease consisting of HIV and TB, communicable diseases associated with child and maternal health, mental health and cardiovascular diseases, and injuries.
In response to the burden of disease, the Department of Health has set the key target of achieving the overall aim of a healthier and more vibrant population by improving women’s health, mental health and promoting healthy lifestyle strategies.

The Department of Health will also invest R2,875 billion in health capital infrastructure. This investment will encompass various projects which are under construction and planned for construction over the medium term. Some of them are:

- New community health and emergency centres;
- new Observatory Forensic Pathology Laboratory;
- replacement of the G F Jooste Hospital;
- the Valkenberg Hospital upgrading;
- the Brooklyn Chest Hospital; and
- the Lentegeur Hospital laundry replacement.

Mr Speaker, the 2011 Census results indicate that the Western Cape is one of two provinces that experienced huge in-migration. The Western Cape population now stands at 5,4 million, up from 4,5 million.

The Department of Human Settlements is committed to the optimal use of resources to address the need for improved human settlements. However, the reality is that we do not have the funds or urban land to provide homes for all the people that require them.

In the medium term, via municipalities, the Department of Human Settlements will continue to deliver opportunities through the provision of serviced sites, rental units, housing finance assistance and a limited number of top structures. Through this process, it is envisioned that everyone living in informal settlements, backyards and overcrowded areas will have access to basic services.

The results of Census 2011 show that we are well on our way with achieving this goal:

- 99,1% of Western Cape residents have access to piped water both inside and outside the yard;
- 91,1% Western Cape residents have refuse removal;
- 93,4% Western Cape households have electricity; and
- 96,9% Western Cape residents have toilet facilities.

Mr Speaker, our goal is to see to it that 100% of our residents have access to these basic services.

The Western Cape has a particular set of social ills that mark its socio-economic environment. Alcohol and drug abuse trends in the province remain a concern due to the associated link with other social risk factors such as crime and violence. The Department of Social Development’s Substance Abuse Programme gives those at risk of substance abuse access to prevention, treatment and rehabilitation programmes.
In April this year, our single largest intervention to reduce alcohol abuse and its related harms, the Western Cape Liquor Act was enacted. Over the medium term, we will monitor its effect in reducing alcohol abuse in our province.

To assist in addressing the multi-faceted socio-economic challenges within our province, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport is focused on promoting social inclusion and reducing poverty.

Together with the Department of Social Development, an afterschool care Mass Opportunity and Development (MOD) centre programme has been developed as a response to expose children, communities, farm workers and senior citizens in poorer communities to a holistic development regime that contributes to the realisation of a more socially inclusive society. To date, 181 MOD centres have been established in impoverished communities. Plans are in place to continue to support these centres. We will also roll out a further 60 MOD centres over the medium term.

Mr Speaker, the Western Cape Government is committed to ensuring that at least 60% of all agricultural land reform projects in the Western Cape succeed by 2014.

Ten rural development nodes have been established in the province by the Department of Agriculture. The organisational structures required to prepare these communities for economic development has also been established. About 530 temporary jobs have been created and another 1 000 are planned.

Mr Speaker, the achievement of all these goals is hinged on efficient, responsive transparent and prudent governance. To support better governance at local level, the Department of Local Government will continue to provide support to municipalities. To achieve this, the department will provide advisors from a pool of experts to assist municipalities with projects such as organisational design, performance management systems and change management.

At provincial level, the Provincial Treasury and the Department of the Premier aim to progressively raise the bar on accounting and financial governance standards and the introduction of purposeful steps that will result in better data integrity, the reduction of irregularities and corruption towards sustainably attaining clean audits within departments, entities and municipalities.

The Resource Envelope and Financing Issues

Mr Speaker, in the medium term – and this now moves to the resource envelope and financing issues – we have reprioritised spending away from programmes that are not meeting performance requirements.

This reprioritisation has enabled funds to be reallocated to infrastructure investment and other priorities without reducing social expenditure particularly for education and health services.

Over the medium term, provincial expenditure remains mostly dependent on national transfers, including the provincial equitable share and conditional grants contributing approximately 95%, with provincial own receipts contributing around 5%.
Over the 2013 medium term, national transfers are proposed to increase with additions to the equitable share for all provinces of R6.3 billion in 2013-14, R8 billion in 2014-15 and R13.4 billion in 2015-16.

Nationally, additions to conditional grants amount to R500 million in 2013-14, R2.5 billion in 2014-15 and R7.4 billion in 2015-16. Provincial equitable share additions are to provide for the carry through cost of higher-than-anticipated wage agreements concluded in 2012-13.

Provincial Treasury’s own calculations indicate that the net estimated national transfers to the Western Cape are adjusted by R940.338 million over the medium term. The aggregate net adjustment in the equitable share baseline to the province amounts to R1,265 billion over the medium term.

The calculated new overall equitable share allocations for the Western Cape amount to R31,117 billion, R33,227 billion and R35,146 billion in 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16 respectively. The equitable share formula is largely population driven, a component that accounts for 60% of the formula.

Following the release of Census 2011 and the increase in population numbers in the Western Cape, national Cabinet, National Finance Minister’s Committee on Budget, and the Technical Committee of the Finance and Budget Council have agreed on an appropriate phasing-in approach in order to cushion and mitigate the impact on funding for our Province.

Adjusted Estimates

Mr Speaker, lastly we move to the adjusted estimates for this year.

As at the second quarter of the 2012-13 financial year, the Western Cape’s spending amounts to R18,512 billion or 46.4% of the 2012 main budget. We are well on our way to achieving the 99% budget spend milestone we achieved in the 2011-12 financial year.

The 2012 adjusted budget proposes spending of an additional R294,979 million for the 2012-13 financial year.

All departments, with the exception of Education and Health, will absorb the costs of the 2012 wage agreement which was 1.2% higher than what was budgeted for in the main budget.

The additions taken up in the 2012 adjusted budget are mainly for the following:

- R163,158 million to cover the higher than anticipated wage settlement cost at the Education and Health Departments and Further Education and Training (FET) colleges;
- R44,997 million for ICT services including broadband connectivity;
- R50 million for capital roads infrastructure projects; and
- R60,388 million as financial assistance to various municipalities to provide bulk infrastructure to unlock housing delivery.
Conclusion

Mr Speaker, it is with pleasure that I table the 2012 Adjustments Appropriation Bill, the Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure 2012, the Provincial Gazette for the Adjustments to Local Government Allocations, the Province’s 2013 to 2016 Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and my speech for discussion and consideration by the House. These documents encompass our shared vision for a Western Cape that is a better place to invest, do business, get a job and earn a living.

I look forward to engaging with the House and the public with regards to how we can Better Together achieve this vision.

I would like to express my gratitude to the Premier, to my colleagues in the provincial Cabinet, as well as heads of departments and their staff across this government for their valuable contributions in the process of drafting this Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and the 2012-13 Adjusted Estimates.

I would also like to specifically thank Dr J C Stegmann sitting over there, and his leadership team that joins him, for all the hard work that Provincial Treasury has put into this process in allowing us to receive it today and take us through the next few years of the medium term. It is through their sound management and continued efforts that have allowed us, as a province, to achieve the great records and levels that we do when it comes to our expenditure and good financial control which enables us to stand here very proudly as the Western Cape Government.

Mr Speaker, I must also thank my staff from my Ministry – and I can see a couple of them there – for the hard work that they’ve put in and the dedication over specifically this time to put the Adjusted Estimates and the Medium Term Budget Policy Statements documents together for discussion in the House. I thank you. [Applause.]

Bill read a first time.

The introductory speech, the Bill and all the papers tabled, are referred to the relevant committees for consideration and report.

OUTCOMES OF 2011-2012 ANNUAL REPORTS

(Subject for discussion)

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order! The next item on the Order Paper is the Subject for Discussion as printed on the Order Paper and which reads as follows:

The outcomes of the 2011-2012 Annual Reports.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Chairperson, 13,4% of the roads in South Africa are in the Western Cape. The value of South Africa’s total road network is estimated at R1,971 trillion.
A report from the Presidency and the Development Bank lists KwaZulu-Natal, Mpumalanga and North West as the provinces with the worst road conditions. The same report agrees that the cost of repairing and replacing roads is up to seven times more than the cost of proper maintenance while the cost for the road user is twice as high when the road is in a poor condition than when it is in a good condition.

The annual report from the Department of Transport and Public Works indicates that the provincial road network is being kept in a stable condition. The maintenance backlog in 2011 is estimated at R8 billion, for which more than R1 billion have been made available. It is gladdening to see the department’s dedication in addressing the backlog. However, the backlog is not a problem that can be addressed even within the medium term and, with the available funds, requires sustained attention and planning.

The House already knows of dedication to road safety of the Department of Transport and Public Works. The success of the Safely Home campaign as well as the good work done by the Shadow centres will be further strengthened by the breath tests for alcohol abuse that could possibly be resumed in the new year.

Mr Speaker, the principle of good government as instituted by the DA government meant that the Western Cape has had a moratorium in increases in vehicle licence fees since 2010. This can also be given as part of the reason for the increased collection of arrear licence fees.

Further principles of good government instituted by the Provincial Treasury and accordingly carried out by departments, is the efficient functioning of the creditors payment systems. Service providers are paid within the 30-day period. In comparison with Gauteng – where on average only 35% of creditors are paid in time – the DA in the Western Cape promotes an environment where businesses can flourish and service delivery can be efficient.

Mr Speaker, the Economic Development Partnership (EDP), the red-tape strategy and the functioning of Wesgro as part of the successes of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism, must not divert attention from the success with the adoption of the new Western Cape Liquor Bill. This legislation is an important aid to combat alcohol abuse and the concomitant ailments in the province. The efficient functioning of the Western Cape Liquor Board in this connection is important. The liquor board received an unqualified audit, unlike the Gauteng Liquor Board, which received a qualified audit and is accused of issuing false licences, poor management and poor leadership.

The Western Cape remains a favourite tourist destination and Cape Town already has a string of awards in its trophy case, but nevertheless the Minister made an appeal to businesses and tourism offices especially in the surrounding areas to offer visitors competitive and world-class products at all times. Tourism remains an important economic resource to the Western Cape. New opportunities must be constantly explored to promote tourism in the Western Cape.

Mr Chairperson, in closing, the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board received a clean audit. Draft amendments of the existing legislation by the Provincial Treasury should address the problem regarding the exclusivity of casino licences.
A report by Pricewaterhouse Coopers shows that South Africans earned R18.4 billion gross gambling income, which represents only 7.1% of the gambling turnover. It is therefore important to control illegal and unregulated practices. I congratulate the Minister, the HOD’s and the departments on good annual reports. Better together. Thank you.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Chairperson, during the financial year the DA really moved backwards in service delivery. We see red lights flashing from all directions indicating a big regression. This is what we see under the DA government.

A first concern, hon Chairperson, is the Education department – a qualified opinion, with findings for the first time. When we look at Agriculture it shows a significant regression. The regression of these two departments can clearly leave a scar on the community. [Interjections.]

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order, hon members!

†Mr P UYS: Firstly we see this with the closure of schools, learner transport and the resignation of staff, and we also see the bad treatment of farm workers emanating from this.

Mr Chairperson, but it is also the first time that we don’t have annual consolidated financial statements. The question in this regard is very clear: Why could the DA not achieve in doing this?

Looking at the Housing Development Fund we see no annual report, no financial statements and no audit report of this entity which holds a large housing stock, providing housing to low-income families with a property portfolio of 9,155 at a value of R2.3 billion. The question is very clear, Chairperson: Why is there no annual report after eight months? The PFMA is very clear, it must be handed in within two months – and that’s May this year – after the closing of the financial year. Mr Chairperson, I want to say that this is worse than a disclaimer for this DA government.

As we see in the Housing Development Fund we also have a big concern and worry with regard to the regression that we saw in respect of housing and the backlog that we have at this stage of 500,000 households. A very low target was set by the MEC and the department. The target set for serviced sites was 13,065, but this department only achieved 8,686. The housing unit’s target was 12,640, but it only achieved a total of 11,065. This is a major regression that is taking place.

A total of 47% of own-planned targets were not achieved. It is very clear from what the Auditor-General told us that 25% of the 53% that they so-called did achieve was not accurate when compared with source information. This is a major problem and a major issue regarding the information they give us not being accurate. The Department of Human Settlements is very clearly below 50% in reaching their targets. Nobody, and I hope not even the DA, can be satisfied with that, with the poor people suffering and not getting serviced sites and housing made available to them.

I want to turn now to the Provincial Legislature. There was no message from the Executive or the Speaker regarding a gross underspending.
That is their main function, to reflect on the activities of the House, the committees and the Legislature. It is really criminal if you underspend R11 million out of a R88 million budget, which amounts to 12% underspending, but at the same time we must hear that there is no funding. We had cuts in public participation and we had cuts in community involvement, but we know why this happened – they want cuts in public participation and they want cuts in community involvement.

We see 20 vacancies in the Provincial Legislature, and further we see the IT risk mitigation measures are not addressed. There is a major risk within IT that we experience and we still experience it up to today. The review of the ICT plan was part of the targets; it was not achieved; electronic management system, not achieved; e-filing system, not achieved; review of the website, not achieved; produce procedural manual, not achieved; oversight model, which is very important from the point of view of a provincial legislature, not achieved; and draft public participation and education strategy and the implementation on approval, of course not achieved again. Then we sit with the underspending of R11 million in Vote 2!

Looking at Local Government, 10% of the municipal IDPs were not acceptable, especially Swellendam, Oudtshoorn and Kannaland and also no annual and oversight reports were also not received. The Overberg District Municipality was put under administration by the MEC at a cost of R900 000 which could have been used in a good and decent way for local government. We also see the Swellendam Municipality in chaos under the DA/ID, and now the DA/ACDP. What is the MEC doing to support, to intervene, or to build capacity? Instead we see him running around playing petty politics and playing with the lives of people and building the capacity of our municipalities with a vacancy rate of 15.6% in that department.

At the same time I see there is an increase to the CDWs. But what happened? The laptops of the CDWs were lost.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order! The hon member must please finish his last sentence.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Chairperson, this is really a shame, and you will have to walk away from this annual report feeling very unhappy with not delivering to the poorest of the poor in the Western Cape. [Time expired.]

†Ms J A VAN ZYL: Mr Chairperson, oversight is a crucial element for keeping government accountable, but the best way to do that is supposedly through standing committees. It becomes difficult to do proper oversight when one experiences a shortage of committee co-ordinators, and currently there is only one researcher and one interim researcher to render support to the different committees. How does that strengthen our constitutional role to conduct oversight?

The departmental end of year reports slightly improved. Worse still, is the WCPP that has been hoarding funds, preventing members from properly conducting their constitutionally mandated duties only to find huge unspent amounts at the end of the year? This is unacceptable. Underspending is actually just as bad as overspending. How can an amount of R10.975 million be underspent, yet the WCPP is experiencing staff shortages?
It’s interesting though that the WCPP has not been able to achieve its objectives of the programme: Administration. As a result the WCPP only met 21% of its planned targets. This Parliament is always complaining about how it can’t compete with salaries out there because it does not have a big budget, but then it underspends the already little amount it has by not filling vacant posts or paying competitive packages to its staff.

It’s no wonder that competent staff are leaving the Legislature for the likes of the national Parliament and the Northern Cape, KwaZulu Natal and Mpumalanga Legislatures, as well as elsewhere. I am not surprised by the fact that there was a CCMA case lodged against the WCPP.

Every year during the opening speeches we hear about several information technology projects to be implemented, but at the end of the financial year it is reported that the IT projects have not been implemented and the website has not been upgraded as planned.

The population of the Western Cape is an estimated 5 million people. The youth makes up around 28.3% of this population, and unemployment in the province is estimated at 17.2% with youth representing over 80% of this total estimated figure. Unemployment, especially of the youth, is a recipe for disaster for the province.

The housing department keeps on changing its plans and reintroducing the same things, but by different names.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

†Ms J A VAN ZYL: The department has a massive housing backlog of more than 500 000 units.

The education department has done well under the circumstances, but the following concerns need to be addressed. Enrolment numbers are increasing, but maintenance and upgrading of existing schools appears to be an ongoing challenge for the department. Nutrition and HIV/Aids programmes, food gardens and issues of safety in schools need attention. The department is commended for its user-friendly annual report document.

*Chairperson, the annual report of the Department of Social Development is shocking. For a department to report to a standing committee that the figures for NWO, who receive public funds, cannot be verified, is totally unacceptable. However, what does set the red lights flickering is that certain areas in the departments did not achieve their targets. The question arises: what has happened to the department’s monitoring and evaluation systems? How efficient are these systems if such departmental shortcomings appear in an annual report?

Chairperson, it’s a pity that MEC Fritz could not attend the standing committee’s meeting to the end, but had to attend an urgent Cabinet meeting. He could have apprised himself of the absolutely critical condition of his department at the standing committee’s meeting.

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARIAS: Chairperson, on 2 November 2012 the Western Cape Department of Health discussed the 2012-13 Annual Report with the Standing Committee on Health.
As spokesperson for the DA in the Western Cape on Health, I commend Minister Botha, Prof Househam and the department of health for their dedication to service delivery, their passion to reduce the burden of disease in the Western Cape, as well as the compilation of a comprehensive and detailed annual report.

Of special significance is the continuous growth of the Chronic Dispensing Unit (CDU). Currently the CDU delivers approximately 170 000 pre-packed prescriptions to health facilities across the Metro District Health Service and the West Coast Districts.

The G F Jooste Hospital, despite the controversy surrounding its renovations, was also highlighted. It is encouraging to know that the proposed rebuilding underwent an in-depth consultation process in order for it to continue delivering health services to the community it serves for the duration of the construction.

Much more can be mentioned on what surfaced from the discussion, but it will be pointless if its objectives and plans are only ink on paper. Having said this, we wish the Western Cape Department of Health continued success in reducing the burden of disease by redressing and delivering the much-needed health services to communities in the Western Cape.

Chairperson, as the DA’s spokesperson on social development, I acknowledge the successes Minister Fritz and his department have had in achieving their goals in this financial year. As Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Community Development it is my understanding that the objective of the standing committee is to monitor whether the Department of Social Development fulfils its mandate, as set out in its Annual Performance and Strategic Plans.

On 14 November 2012, the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development was discussed in the House. The Minister and his department mentioned key issues such as the Early Childhood Development programme, the reduction of drug-related and alcohol-related harms, youth and family development and support for vulnerable groups.

In our oversight role and to monitor the Department of Social Development, we raised some serious concerns: the high vacancy rate in the department; the reason for the many acting positions; the volume of sick leave taken by employees; and the support systems in place to assist employees.

The department has an obligation to execute programmes addressing the needs of children in the Western Cape and the annual report does not reflect whether the department is meeting its obligation to deal with the difficulties it is facing concerning sexual offences and social crime; putting measures in place to deal effectively with this; and whether there are programmes and measures available to assist boys growing up without fathers.

The Department of Social Development is the department that speaks to the heart of our people and we need to create a caring society through developmental social welfare services.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Chairperson, the DA-led Government has scant regard for the needs of the most vulnerable. This is evident in the shocking performance of MEC Fritz’s Department of Social Development during the 2011-12 financial year.
In a province devastated by crime and drug abuse, the department’s inability to deliver the most basic social welfare services is a matter of grave concern.

The financial year saw a decline in the number of funded substance abuse treatment centres from last year’s 24 down to 21 this year.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That's a lie!

†Ms J WITBOOI: Keep quiet.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order!

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Is it parliamentary for the MEC to say that I’m lying?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It’s factually incorrect.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Can you withdraw, please.

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Chairperson, I just want to say that I’m informed by the annual report and I’m talking about the annual report. Not a single school received drug education training for the subject of life orientation—in the province with the highest occurrence of drug abuse, especially amongst learners.

It is shocking that the MEC and his department could not even provide the standing committee with an adequate explanation as why schools will have to wait until 2013 to receive drug education training.

There has been a decrease in the number of Department of Social Development-funded drug treatment programmes that can do drug tests on patients. It was 24 in the previous year and 13 in 2011-12. The centres did not receive their drug-testing kits on time.

MEC Fritz's department is also failing in its duty to provide for the early care and development of our children in a province in which the poor communities are riddled with social deviance. A host of NPOs that offer child care and protection services have had their funding cut considerably. The department cites noncompliance with funding requirements. Yet in line with the DA's callous pull-up-your-socks attitude towards caregivers in poor communities, the department does nothing to capacitate NPOs to be able to meet their funding requirements.

The department only funded four early childhood development programmes. It claims that only these four programmes complied with norms and standards. This is a significant decline from the 200 programmes of the previous year and the department’s promise of 600 for 2011-12. The department failed to empower the NPOs, who are running early childhood development programmes, as to how to meet compliance criteria.

The number of funded partial-care facilities has also decreased. In 2010-11 there were 1 140 funded partial-care facilities and in 2011-12 there were 1 097. Again, the department placed the blame for the noncompliance of NPOs at the door of the NPOs.
Sadly, under the DA, NPOs who serve communities are left to capacitate and empower themselves before they are provided with essential funding. The department often cites lack of compliance with funding requirements on the part of NPOs as the main reason as to why most social development programmes are not adequately rolled out. At the same time there was a rapid decline in the number of high-risk NPOs assisted by the department through capacity enhancement support services from 121 in 2010-11, down to 45 in 2011-12.

Whilst childhood development is indeed the responsibility of the Department of Social Development, the Department of Health has similarly failed to adequately address the nutritional needs of children under the age of five years. In 2010-11, according to reported cases alone, 1 386 children under the age of five years suffered from malnutrition in the Western Cape. Only an insignificant decrease was reported by the Department of Health in its 2011-12 annual report.

The department did not achieve its very modest target of ensuring that only 54% of children between 12 months and 59 months received vitamin A coverage. Thirty six percent of children in our province currently receive vitamin A coverage. When the ANC ran the province we witnessed a far more significant reduction in the amount of children suffering from malnutrition. In 2001, 5 to 9 per 1 000 children in the province suffered from malnutrition.

Chairperson, it is sad that in a department such as the Department of Social Development, which is supposed to care for the vulnerable groups you will find acting chief directors and acting directors. Almost everybody in senior management is acting, acting, acting. [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: There’s the biggest actor of them all.

†Mr R B LENTIT: You are the biggest actor in South Africa, with Zuma. [Laughter.]

The Department of Health has for many years been … [Interjections.] …

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order, hon members! Will you please give the hon member a chance to speak.

†Mr R B LENTIT: The Department of health has for many years been personified as a complex department due to its size and various challenges. Chairperson, it is with great pleasure and respect that I commend Minister Botha on his management and leadership that has since 2009 set the department on a path of work in progress that has already achieved visible successes.

Infrastructure and maintenance projects across the province will undoubtedly have a positive effect on the services provided to already 4,58 million uninsured people in the province. Two hundred and ninety-two fixed and 173 not-fixed facilities provide 78% of the total Western Cape population with a quality primary health care service.

Among the achievements deserving praise is that approximately 94 000 children under the age of 12 months were fully immunised and the completion of the Khayelitsha Hospital accommodating 230 beds in January this year.
Greater investment in human capital and a no-nonsense approach has seen nearly 30 000 training opportunities, a number of promotions and performance rewards for staff. During the previous financial year, 1 402 misconduct and disciplinary hearings were finalised. This is proof that accountability is expected of employees to ensure efficient service delivery.

The Department of Health further generated revenue of R553 million. This is an exceptional R50 million more that the set target for the financial year, despite the 0.3% overall under spending of its budget.

Chairperson, assuming that R250 million of taxpayer’s money was allegedly spent on the construction of a certain office bearer’s home, greater investment in our people’s health could have been ensured if those funds were split between the nine provinces.

*Chairperson, a leopard cannot change its spots, and the question is: are President Jacob Zuma and Julius Malema birds of a feather? [Interjections.]

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order, hon members!
†Mr R B LENTIT: In closing, under the leadership of Minister Theuns Botha …
†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order, hon Lentit!
†Mr M OZINSKY: Chairperson, on a point of order: Is it parliamentary to refer to the President of the country as a “jakkals?”
†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Why not?
†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Hon Lentit, we’ve made a decision that we will not refer to people by animal names, etc.

*Mr R B LENTIT: Chairperson, as you know, it is a saying that I used. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.
†Mr R B LENTIT: Chairperson, in closing, under the leadership of Minister Theuns Botha the provincial Department of Health is well on its way to fulfilling its vision of quality health care for all.

*Mr J J VISSER: Chairperson, the Department of Local Government and its people really worked hard and innovatively during the 2011-12 financial year. After the Parliament and Treasury it is one of the smallest departments with an equally small budget. In spite of this they delivered quality service to all 30 municipalities of the Western Cape.

This department succeeded brilliantly in working together as a team to perform better together. Through their intervention and help they are creating an open-opportunity society by granting ordinary people an opportunity to lead a dignified life through better service delivery.

The other day the hon Brown made a touching plea that we should not forget the ANC’s role in creating a better society. She is right; the ANC did play a role.
However, the difference is this: at that time the DA and its people did not burn down, break down, obstruct and violently destroy everything as the ANC is doing nowadays while the DA rules.

The present climate of anarchy and violence makes it even more difficult for the Department of Local Government to do their work diligently and with perseverance with already limited financial resources. It is also a pity that where the ANC is in control of municipalities they do not give their full cooperation to the department. The result is that better management and decision-making cannot be implemented and service delivery is sacrificed.

The standing committee is satisfied with work done by the Minister and his department and they are continuing this positive approach to their work in the 2012-2013 financial year.

It must also be appreciated that not all decisions taken by the hon Minister in terms of local authorities – as, for instance, in the case of Swellendam – would be popular. However, when the court finds in favour of the hon Minister, one realises that he often has to make very difficult choices to ensure good, sustained service delivery to all the residents of the Western Cape. For that we thank you, Minister Bredell. Keep up the good work.

Chairperson, in my report on the performance of the Western Cape government I must confirm what the Rules Committee said in their report to the House, namely that this report is a big improvement on that of the previous year. This improvement is also reflected by the fact that the Western Cape Parliament is the only legislator among the 10 legislators that is listed among the 20 best provincial and national departments for this budget year. The performance of the Western Cape Parliament is excellent when compared with the other legislators.

The Western Cape Parliament had 222 standing committee meetings as compared with the average of 188 of the other Legislators. Six National Council of Provinces (NCOP) legislations were handled as compared with five of the other Legislators. The Western Cape held nine public hearings as compared to the six of the other Legislators. The Western Cape paid 17 oversight visits as compared to the meagre four of other provinces.

The Western Cape held 34 sessions as against the average of 27 of the other Legislators. This is especially noteworthy if one bears in mind that the Western Cape Legislator has one of the smallest number of members; we only have 42 and there are some of the other Legislators that have 80 members.

Although the Rules Committee is not an oversight committee, the Speaker agreed to report to this committee regularly. It is, however, of cardinal importance that the Parliament be reconstructed and that the new model be implemented so that there can be proper oversight over the Parliament.

An aspect that should be investigated and addressed urgently, is the fact that the parliament is still not being handled like a National Key Point. The identification of the institution's borders is still vague and at the same time the security around the institution is extremely inadequate. Urgent attention should be given to managing the Western Cape Parliament as a National Key Point.
It is extremely worrying that the cultural and art treasures of the Western Cape Parliament are at present spread out over the city and are also on display or being stored at various departmental buildings. These valuable art treasures belong to the Western Cape Parliament and belong here. It is important that a curator be approached so that the real value of the art treasures can be determined and so that those that are damaged can be completely repaired.

It is part of our duties as Parliamentarians to be proud of our cumulative legacy and to handle it with respect and preserve it for future generations. Our cultural treasures should be displayed and preserved with pride. We are only the current curators and we must carry it over to the next generation.

Mr Speaker, I want to say it in plain language: the electronic system of the House is a big embarrassment. Modern technology is available, use it!

Attention should also be given to filling posts sensibly and ways should be found to ensure that personnel and continuity are retained. Both the legislative and oversight roles can only be executed efficiently if the members concerned get the necessary support. It is therefore important that functions such as legal services, research and committee coordination be adequately staffed and that competent fit for purpose personnel be appointed. The Western Cape Parliament is doing good work and so we want to say to them too: keep it up.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): The hon Stali.

Mr Z C STALI: [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Is he not here? [Laughter.]

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: He is freezing, because it’s so cold in here.

†Mr M G E WILEY: He’s looking for his speech.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Wear your glasses.

†Mr Z C STALI: The deterioration of the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works is glaringly obvious.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Oh No!

†Mr Z C STALI: In fact, if one skips the glossing over of the targets, from what the independent watchdog agency, the Auditor-General says, it is clear this department is sinking into the mud – fast.

†Mr M G E WILEY: To your level.

†Mr Z C STALI: In fact, the Auditor-General had to intervene and correct the books of the department in order for it to get an unqualified audit opinion. [Interjections.] In fact, it is clear the department is facing an imminent collapse. [Interjections.] It did not reach more than 40% of its planned targets. Almost 70% of all school buildings under this department’s care are regarded as less than good, and the condition of 35% is regarded as being poor to very poor.
An HON MEMBER: Shame!

Mr Z C STALI: Health facilities face a similar destiny, with 70% below being good. In fact, one out of 10 buildings under this department is in very bad condition. However, we do not see any plan to grow increase the maintenance budget to curb the decay. [Interjections.]

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order, members! Order, members!

†Mr Z C STALI: The same situation prevails with regard to our roads.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, worse than in Mpumalanga.

†Mr Z C STALI: The report states that there is an alarming growth in the number of roads in need of rehabilitation, as they are past their economic lifetime. The majority of the road networks of this province are fast worsening and yet there is no real plan to increase the budget in order to deal with the matter. Instead of solutions, all sorts of excuses are offered.

A grave danger exists with the number of operating licences issued for taxis. There are now more than 3 160 vehicles with permits, while the number of passengers has not grown exponentially.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The opposite is true. But we say one man, one …

†Mr Z C STALI: In fact, in just this financial year under review, 51% more licences were issued …

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What!

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order, hon Carlisle! Give the member a chance.

†Mr Z C STALI: … which is adding to the tensions, and possible conflict, when all of these operators compete for the same passengers. Then there is no proper strategy to deal with violence and conflict in the industry.

There are also concerns that no proper memorandums of understanding are in place to ensure service delivery levels. Relations, especially with municipalities, are strained and too many excuses are made as to why money is not being spent. Half a million rand of value was used for procurement and employees appointed without the proper processes.

No reasonable steps were taken to prevent irregular and fruitless expenditure and insufficient monitoring controls are in place. Too many investigations indicate serious trouble. One in four posts are not filled, with a vacancy rate of almost 25%, and no real intervention plan is presented.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Where do you get that from?
†Mr Z C STALI: With all these problems on his plate, the MEC instead plays the role of a speed cop, or traffic officer, and wants to take traffic policing under his wing, fighting communities and hunting people. On the other hand, he is busy trying to use public property to give opportunities to big business in securing cash streams.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, and they're paying big bribes.

†Mr Z C STALI: This needs more explanation as it does not fit the legal framework of empowerment or other state objectives. Amandla!

An HON MEMBER: Ywethu!

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Every word of it is true. Very good.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Chairperson, I think all of us should thank the committee co-ordinators and the interpreters for the work that they have done throughout this whole annual reporting process. I don’t recall members and the committees generally thanking them for their work.

I think we should also thank the Ministers and their departments, as well as the Attorney-General and the audit committee for their participation in the annual reporting process that has just been concluded.

At times the programme was rushed. The Provincial Treasury and the reporting on Economic Development and Tourism, last week Tuesday, was impossible. For many members it felt as if we were doing an injustice to the important work of oversight by trying to cram so much into one day.

I think next year, Chairperson, it would be more appropriate that the annual reporting process that involves Scopa is actually drafted in consultation with Scopa, so that we can have a hand in terms of deciding how we want to fulfil our roles.

In term of public participation, Chairperson, probably the biggest concern that arises out of the entire period is that R80 000 was spent on one advert in a couple of newspapers that appeared once – and that was the extent of Provincial Parliament’s public participation effort. I think we are doing an injustice to the people and we are failing in our constitutional duty of facilitating public participation in the activities of Parliament and its committees. We can’t think that spending R80 000 on public participation is facilitating it in any way.

There were a couple of transversal concerns that were raised across departments and in the time I have available I’ll mention a couple. Internal audit capacity has been raised by the audit committees as being required so that the high-risk areas, specifically, can be audited.

In my mind there are five benefits and I would hope that the responsible Minister will note these. One, it will add to and strengthen the levels of assurance. Two, it will improve the audit outcomes at the end of the period. Three, this will, therefore; improve service delivery.
Four, it will show that the government’s actions speak louder than its words. Five, it will also go a long way in proving that this province is, or isn’t, the best performing province in the country.

Therefore I don’t see any reason why the internal audit capacity across all departments cannot be improved and increased immediately. There should be no reason why that cannot happen. Obviously, it’s regrettable that the Housing Development Fund hasn’t appeared before the relevant standing committee and Scopa, and it is also regrettable that the provincial Development Council hasn’t appeared yet simply because of … [Time expired.]

†Mr A M FIGLAN: Chairperson, the role of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements is to monitor whether the Department of Human Settlements fulfils its mandate, thus ensuring the delivery of the targets set for the year, as well as addressing challenges that arise and finding solutions to problems.

It is commendable that the department received an unqualified audit report from the Auditor-General, which was much better than the 2010-11 report.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Much better.

†Mr A M FIGLAN: Many plans were put into place to address the issues raised, and this was highlighted in the 2011-12 report. One of these initiatives includes the Professional Resource Teams. Their first priority in 2012-13 is to assist municipalities with the development of feasible project pipelines and to ensure that projects are planned, packaged and approved in time and to assist with the management of challenges and risks during implementation. One of these resource teams has been assigned to the People’s Housing Process, as the acceleration of housing opportunities is one of the strategic goals of the department.

It is also good to see that the department has taken ownership of the problems of the past and has put measures in place to tighten the link between itself and the municipalities in order to deal with these issues. Of the issues that are still of concern is the housing backlog of approximately 500 000 units – and the standing committee is aware of the existing problems that impact on delivery. However, the department is urged to constantly find ways and measures to address this situation.

Another major concern that must be addressed by the department is the communication between the department and the standing committee. Here specific reference is made to the Western Cape Housing Development Fund annual report. This entity of the department did not hand in their annual report on time.

This entity was established in terms of section 13 of the Western Cape Housing Development Act, Act 6 of 1999, and currently consists of assets previously belonging to the Western Cape Development Board. The mission of this fund is to manage the primary property portfolio, which is provided as a social service and to also generate cash inflows. The Western Cape Housing Development Fund holds a large housing stock which is used for provide housing to low-income families at below-market rentals.

For the 2011-12 financial year the fund was under immense pressure following the disclaimer in respect of the 2010-11 financial year.
The disclaimer related directly to properties that could not be physically verified, accounts receivable was incorrect and accounts payable was not restated accurately and in line with Grap reporting.

Thus the fund faced huge challenges in preparing fully compliant Grap financial statements, because no entity-specific exemption was granted by the Auditor-General. The challenge was to address all the issues that resulted in the disclaimer in the 2010-11 financial year.

I want to commend the Auditor-General for considering the problems encountered, and for obtaining all the information to ensure that the register was completed and valid, by allowing more time for the report to be submitted. The department informed the standing committee that they were experiencing delays regarding the submission of the annual report.

Measures have been suggested to address the situation in order to ensure the timeous delivery of the report to the Auditor-General. As indicated then, the department must keep the standing committee informed about the Western Cape Housing Development Fund, as well as all the challenges they experience.

The way forward for the fund would be to concentrate on the devolution of properties that formerly belonged to the various municipalities, speed up the transfer of properties to the debtors and continue to update the asset register with a change in value, if any. I hope that the measures proposed and expressed will be taken into account to ensure an even better audit report for the department and the Western Cape Housing Development Fund next year.

†Ms B G MBALO: Chairperson, before I continue with my speech, I want to say that it’s very cold in this room. We have reported it, but we were told something is not working. We can’t spend so many hours in such an environment.

†Mr M OZINSKY: It’s the Department of Public Works.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): You can always heat up the subject.

†Ms B G MBALO: No, but it’s cold. Maybe it’s a political strategy.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): I have reported it and they will attend to that. You may proceed.

†Ms B G MBALO: The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning gives us a different picture in its explanation of the report to what we find in the facts and figures. The nicely iced words seem not to be a true reflection of the real situation as figures differ. Huge adjustment cuts are not fully explained and virements are still problematic, while roll-overs do not make sense.

The biggest concern is the fact that human resources are still not dealt with properly. The fact that the department over the years could not give proper figures for vacancies is problematic. All indications show that it is about a quarter of the total staff complement.
Loaded and top-heavy management structures are still not on employment equity targets, and the Cape Nature board, after many cautions, is still unrepresentative. Huge numbers of vacancies in critical posts hamper service delivery, while too little is spent on bursaries and no plan exists to grow the staff complement or recruit technically qualified people either.

The chair of the audit committee of Cape Nature told us that the leadership changes hamper service delivery and we also saw a change of guard when the CEO was removed. The MEC does not want us to scrutinise the removal of this critical leader, as is part of our parliamentary and democratic oversight duty, because he concluded some secret agreement with the CEO.

This agency is arguably the biggest single landowner in the province. It swallows more and more money without really addressing the underutilisation of these valuable assets. The agency met only 36% of its targets while it spent its entire budget. On what did it spend the rest of the money if it did not match its set targets? We don’t know because it still has to give a good explanation for that.

The department has in many instances manipulated and reduced targets, yet it could not meet them. We don’t understand. What is actually going on here? We don’t understand it.

Animals and the eco-balance of nature are also of serious concern as there is no plan to deal with the predators and farmers’ interests. It looks as if the department has a narrow-minded vision as only one side has been favoured, which of course is the farmers and not the animals. Development must always first take cognisance of our planet and its needs.

Perpetual EIA hiccups persist and red tape with planning matters still continues. Even though the department says the backlogs are under control, the waiting periods are not of the sort one expects of a province claiming that it wishes to roll out the red carpet. This slows down and hampers development, as developers have to wait for too long to assist with growing our economy.

In general the provincial government is not focused on this province where it can do more. It is often obsessed with looking at other provinces and their issues. Mostly the leadership of the province is absent and the result of that is regression. For one, more than 60% of the province’s solid waste disposal facilities are still not licensed. When will this be done? We don’t know. Air quality is still on a slippery slope in industrial areas.

Lastly, the department should lead by example next time by using alternative, environmentally friendly ways to publish such a thick report.

†Mr M C Walters: Chairperson, It has been a pleasure to interact with the Department of Agriculture, which has for the second year running distinguished itself by being ranked first in South Africa in terms of annual reporting and financial management by the Association of State Auditors. It was also telling that of the 10 most consistent departments, seven came from the Western Cape.
The department’s strategic goals of increasing production, land reform successes and our export position should be attainable. This became obvious at the recent agricultural summit held by the department. For instance the optimising of the fertilizer programmes of crop farmers through soil analyses and surveys would immediately make a significant contribution to the early achievement of the 10% target.

The annual report highlighted many achievements including facilitation of wine export deals with China. The engineering services and the market access programme provided crucial support to land reform beneficiaries.

A R82 million worth of investment occurred in projects in rural areas while the total number of rural development nodes in the province increased to eight. A 95% success rate with share equity approaches is unique in a landscape of failed projects in other provinces.

Research co-ordination was improved by the establishment of a Western Cape Agricultural Research Forum, which includes the department, the Agricultural Research Council, universities and private entities. The department’s contribution to farmer education and skills development was exceptional with Elsenburg the only truly viable agricultural college in South Africa.

While the ostrich sector experienced major problems as a result of the impact of avian influenza, the need to expand local veterinary capacity became obvious to the committee. This is in order to address such crisis. Similarly, increasing concern has been expressed with regard to the problems of red meat abattoirs and increasing informal slaughtering, which impacts on registered abattoirs.

After a year of restructuring Casidra, an entity of the department, is now focused solely on implementing programmes for the Department of Agriculture. The emphasis in Casidra’s mandate on the economic side has therefore shifted to local economic development facilitation within the agricultural sphere.

It has also been the committee’s privilege to deal with reporting by the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning whose quality of annual reporting placed it joint second in the Saiga assessment. That’s a national assessment.

The department has exerted itself to support other provincial departments and local municipalities in mainstreaming issues of sustainability and resource-use efficiency; a level of support not found elsewhere. Areas of particular interest are those of provincial and municipal spatial development frameworks in which substantial progress has already been achieved. The department has also shown progress in the development of the Western Cape Land Use Planning Act which will be promulgated during 2013.

The issue of pollution of water, air and land also occupies the attention of the department. Pollution of our rivers, both biologically and chemically, is addressed. Pollution by mercury was a subject which received targeted attention in the interest of human health implications.
The future-oriented approach by the department was also illustrated by its interest in climate change which could affect the provincial economy, and especially the possible effect on coastal areas. The implementation of development setback lines continues apace and should mitigate detrimental effects.

It was observed that while actual performance – and this applies to other departments as well – was often demand-driven. This sometimes resulted in wide deviations between targets set in annual performance plans and the actual outputs achieved. This should be explained in footnotes to tables.

The report of Cape Nature, the nature conservation entity of the department, illustrated the progress that was made during the report year. It is to be congratulated on the expansion of its public-private partnerships, which can contribute to financial activities.

The Integrated Catchment Management System which manages rivers from “catchments to coast” is an approach which is significant, both in terms of the conservation of water and of riverine ecosystems. While 114 512 hectares of alien vegetation was cleared and 193 000 working days created in the process, I think we should all realise that cleared areas will inevitably revert to alien infestation if clearing efforts are relaxed.

On behalf of the committee I would like to express our appreciation for the productive interaction we have had, not only on the annual report but also during the year, with both Ministers, their departments and entities. Both reports are recommended for acceptance by the House. I thank you.

†Ms J L HARTNICK: Chairperson, if considering the overarching objective of the Western Cape Education Department, which is to improve learner outcomes in this province, I congratulate Minister Grant and his department on their efforts to realise this objective.

To elaborate and specifically characterise this objective, I acknowledge the success attained by the department to date. In the 2011-2012 financial year, the department provided more than two million textbooks and readers to Grades 1, 2, 3 and 10 learners across the province, which is over and above those provided according to the national norm. In 2011, the department expanded the systemic literacy and numeracy testing of Grades 3, 6 and 9 learners.

To date, 23 new schools have been built and eight schools built with inappropriate materials have been replaced. In 2012, three new schools and 13 replacement schools are expected to be completed. In effect, the Department of Education would have succeeded in building 26 new schools, which accommodates an additional 30 000 learners and 21 replacement schools, accommodating an extra 27 000 learners. This exceeds the original three year target.

This, Chairperson, shows that the Western Cape Education Department can confidently say that it has made progress in achieving the objectives of improving learner outcomes in the Western Cape. In conjunction with commending the Minister and his department on its successes, I would like to remind him of the standing committee’s oversight role and that we will continue to monitor and question the department in order to ensure that the department delivers on its objectives.
On 30 October 2012, the 2011-2012 Annual Report of the department of the Premier was discussed in this house. With the vision of creating an open opportunity society for all so that people can live lives they value, I commend the Premier and her department on characterising this vision through the projects and strategies adopted in the 2011-2012 financial year.

Six human rights projects aimed at strengthening the rights and responsibilities of citizens were pursued. These six projects included: The enforcement of payment of child maintenance; the implementation of the provincial sexual harassment policy; a teenage pregnancy intervention plan; a disability access programme; human trafficking intervention and; a campaign to encourage citizens to participate in voluntary HIV/Aids testing. All these projects redress social ills which have plagued the Western Cape and the Department of the Premier has succeeded in achieving its objective by strategically heading these projects.

Also, of significant importance is that of the centre for E-Innovation which has improved the information and communication technology governance to a level three rating, based on the five level control objectives for information technology scale.

Chairperson, success refers to the effective and efficient delivery of its mandate so that it earns the acknowledgement of being the best-run regional government in the world. With this said, the Department of the Premier has succeeded in achieving its key objectives and I encourage the department to continue in its ethos to protect and promote constitutional rights and expand opportunities.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Chairperson, I'm amazed that standing committee chair after standing committee chair has got up here to praise departments but show no real oversight over what's happened.

An HON MEMBER: Nothing.

Mr M OZINSKY: This is a year in which we've seen a serious regression in the oversight reports and it seems that the other side of the House are not concerned about this at all. When the DA took over the government in 2009 it spent two years saying that it's not responsible for the budget, the programme, the staff or the implementation. They said just wait until our budget comes. Well, now we have the annual report on the DA budget and what it shows is a serious regression. In 2009-10, the year the ANC started off, there were 13 departments and entities which were unqualified and had no findings. Now there are only eight. That is a serious regression. In 2009-10 there were no qualified audits and there were no outstanding audits. This year there are three of those. This is the regression that the DA has brought.

So it goes on. We have qualifications in education, we have movements from departments, etc. Even with the Department of Agriculture about which they want to claim the most that it won a prize, didn't win a prize for the audit outcomes.

What it won a prize for was the presentation of its report, in other words whether the boxes were ticked. The very department that won a prize had a regression in its audit outcome. So what are you telling us – that the cover of the report looked nice – …
†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Nice – that’s what they’re telling us – nice.

†Mr M OZINSKY: … that it was laid out in a nice way? It wasn’t a good result. Hon MEC, you shouldn’t be smiling about a regression under your leadership.

†The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It wasn’t a regression.

†Mr M OZINSKY: It was a regression. It went from unqualified to unqualified with findings. That is called a regression. [Interjections.] If you say here that that is not a regression it calls into question …

†The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: What were the commitments?

†Mr M OZINSKY: … the commitments you have personally made … [Interjections.] … to the Auditor-General …

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: … because you don’t know the difference between unqualified and unqualified with findings. [Interjections.] If you don’t know the difference you can’t make a commitment to clean audits. [Interjections.]

This is the second point I want to raise. This government pontificates. It spreads propaganda and talks about how it is the best government in the world. It’s a government that is leading a regression …

†Mr M C WALTERS: Oh, come on!

†Mr M OZINSKY: … and the bad part about this is that the government – the Premier, the Cabinet and the individual MECs collectively – has made commitments to the Auditor-General on the oversight that it would undertake in the departments in order to achieve a clean audit.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Confident!

†Mr M OZINSKY: This is what the Auditor-General raised here last week in this very room when he was addressing members. Terence Nombembe, the Auditor-General of South Africa, which includes the Western Cape, said that last year there was limited progress in implementing the commitments made by the political leadership.

That’s why hon Van Rensburg laughs when I raise the matter because he knows that when the honourable Nombembe said there was limited progress it was true and that his department was one of the worst performers.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Hon Ozinsky, will you please address the Chair and not the Minister.

†Mr M OZINSKY: I am. I’m talking about his department.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Hon Ozinsky, I’m not blind. Address the Chair.
More shocking was the response of the hon Premier who was sitting there. She’s not here today to listen to this debate, but the hon Premier, after responding to Mr Nombembe, said, and I quote:

I battle knowing what to do to change the situation.

Mr SKWATSHA: Wow!

Mr OZINSKY: Now I wonder what kind of leadership that is. That’s the top leader and she told the House that she battles to know what to do to get a clean order. That’s what you are talking about when you talk about leadership that is fit to govern. The phrase that the hon Premier invented is “fit to govern”, but she tells the House that she doesn’t know what to do to get a clean audit.

Now given that she doesn’t know what to do, I want to raise a few points on things that she could do. First I want to agree with the issues hon Haskin has raised. If the MECs can’t exercise oversight over their departments to ensure a clean audit and if the chairpersons of standing committees are only able to praise departments that are going backwards, then it’s left to Scopa and its chairperson to point out the issues that require to be pointed out.

The first thing I would say is stop fighting everyone. Given that you don’t know, hon Premier, it would be a good time to retreat now from you fights with National Treasury and the Auditor-General because it doesn’t help to fight. The more you fight, the more you encourage departments to do the wrong thing and the more you get the regressions.

The PREMIER: I never fight with National Treasury.

Mr OZINSKY: There’s not one battle with National Treasury that you can actually win.

Secondly, and I agree with the hon Chairperson of Scopa and I think he’s covered that, is increase the audit coverage. At the moment the coverage is about 30% to 40% of high-risk areas when it should be 50% of all areas.

The worst part is when the DG, the Head of Treasury sits here, they can’t tell us what steps are being taken to increase the audit coverage; although every HOD and every audit committee has raised with us that the audit coverage is not sufficient. The hon Premier’s department, however, refuses to budget for the increase in audit coverage, which falls under her department.

Thirdly, take action against those who break the law. Hon Carlisle ran away because he knew I was going to raise this point. He talks a lot about the leader of the ANC. However, the fact of the matter is that none of the things that he has said in his own department has been proved in any independent forum, whether it be a court of law or a Bargaining Council, because no-one has been disciplined in his department.

In the hon Premier’s department, which reports R22 million of unauthorised and irregular expenditure … [Interjections.] … one of the very people who was at the centre of the irregular expenditure sat in the hearing.
†The PREMIER: Who?

†Mr M OZINSKY: I'll give you the name afterwards, but I know you won't take action. She signed off on documents to force the expenditure in Transport and Public Works. The hon Premier knows it because it's in the dossier her department gave to the police.

However, no action is taken against that staff member and she sits here and acts as if she is doing the right things and has done it in the past. The fact is that this government failed to take action against anybody who had anything to do with this money, and lost the action against ... [Interjections.] ... those they did take action against.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: They were disappointed.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Manyati won his case. That can only mean hon Carlisle failed to do what he told the House before he was in government he would do – and even when he was in government. The whole afternoon he was sitting here making comments about what happened then. The failure, however, is him. He's now had three-and-a-bit years to do something and no action has been taken; no one has been fired. [Interjections.]

It's very easy: You pontificate, but when the chips are down you have not implemented the commitment you made to the Auditor-General and the people of the province to ensure a clean audit.

In the fourth place, the problems between Transport and Public Works and Health and Education are serious. For instance, Dr Househam told us about how he kept on ringing the bells about Worcester Hospital, but the Department of Public Works kept on paying the contractor.

When he told them the quality was not good enough, the next week a payment was made to the contractor. It went on for months and months until the hon Carlisle's department woke up. Now we sit with poor workmanship, wasteful expenditure and an unfinished contract at that hospital. There's still millions of rand outstanding on the contract and another contractor has to be appointed. [Time expired.]

†Mr P UYS: Thank you.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Chairperson, I want to say at the outset that in the Western Cape we are not perfect.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: No.

†Ms M TINGWE: You only admit that now.

An HON MEMBER: Well, that's true.

†The MINISTER: No, we are not. [Interjections.]

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order, hon members!
†The MINISTER: No, we're not and we never will be, but we will always and continually strive for improvement. That's why we set ourselves targets such as striving to be the best-run regional government in the world. We set ourselves stretch targets to really push and push the boundaries to deliver a better, more efficient and effective service to the people of the province. [Interjections.]

Chairperson, I have no doubt, and I can quite easily stand here and say it, that of all the provinces in the country we have the best record when it comes to spending. We have the best record when it comes to audit outcomes and we have the best record when it comes to delivery – the highest standard in the country. [Interjections.]

I have no problem with standing here and saying that. [Interjections.] We will, however, always have to continue to do better and better, as I've said.

I also say that this annual performance process is just a part of the oversight Parliament has over the government. We have various spaces where oversight happens. However, it is in the annual report process where a better and deeper oversight process takes place.

We do have to talk about the oversight we have in this space and perhaps I should add my voice to this, as I think I was one of the culprit MECs who was in charge of two departments that had to spend one whole day and night here. I did hear it being raised by a few people in the standing committees that perhaps there was insufficient time to delve into the reports in order to do the oversight that was necessary.

Obviously this must go back to the Legislature and hon members need to talk about that and it must be discussed by the chairpersons and in the Rules and programming committee. We need to make sure that our oversight gets better and better, because when our oversight improves it also puts more pressure on us as Ministers and on the government to deliver; which is exactly what we want to do.

We do use comparisons and we do benchmarking. Some of the speakers today have also spoken about benchmarking and comparisons and as soon as one starts adding other provinces into the benchmarking and comparisons, we get a huge noise from this side of the House, but we need to use these benchmarks and comparisons. However, I found it quite interesting this year as opposed to last year.

There has been some talk about the Auditor-General. Now when the Auditor-General gave his report on the audit outcomes of South Africa to the extended Cabinet, that's all the members of Cabinet …

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Chairperson, I thought you had not noticed that the Premier wanted to make an announcement about the court results. [Laughter.]

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Please take your seat, hon member.

†The MINISTER: Chairperson. The Auditor-General made the presentation to the full extended Cabinet, to all of us as MECs and to all the Premiers … [Interjections.]
The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order, hon members! Will you please contain yourselves.

The MINISTER: It was a very high-level report very similar to the Auditor-General’s report to this very House not so long ago with the pie charts and the bar charts on a very high level as we’ve seen. Exactly the same input that was made by the hon Beerwinkel in this very House that we need more detail and it was very interesting to see that the Auditor-General gave a lot of detail across the country last year. However, there wasn’t that much detail this year and one wonders if it is because it is about paving the road to Mangaung. [Laughter.][Interjections.]

In replying to this debate I want to say thank you very much to the chairpersons of the standing committees for dealing with each of the Votes and with each of the departments. I want to echo some of the comments made by some of the speakers today and thank the staff of the provincial Parliament for working late into the night and accommodating us in this process of oversight.

I’m not going to answer each and every one of the individuals or specific chairs who made comments, save to thank them for those comments. Obviously in this process, we, as the executive need to take cognisance of what has been said.[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order hon members! Order!

The MINISTER: Perhaps I should just highlight some of the points raised by members. First of all, member Uys raised an issue about Education and its audit outcome. I specifically want to talk about the audit outcome of the counting of mobile classrooms.

I’ve been told that the system has been rectified. We understand that this was a shortcoming and we need to make sure that we can count these kinds of assets. However, I don’t think in this process that we had to be concerned that many of these classrooms had been stolen, misappropriated, hidden away or taken home or whatever.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Or taken to someone’s farm or something.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What I do want to say – and I’ve said it to the Auditor-General, and I’ll say it to the House – is that the one thing I am concerned about is in these processes we need to be very careful of the unintended consequences.

I believe we should be beyond reproach when we need to count our assets However, when the reporting gets that stringent on counting an unintended consequence can result. This is especially the case where not all of those mobile classrooms are provided by the budge of the House. Some of those classrooms are provided by NGOs, parent bodies or organisations that collect funding such as Rotary Clubs etc to try to help with the education outcomes in this province.
I get nervous when we get so pedantic about the counting of these classrooms which then gives one qualified audits, because the next time someone comes along and says they want to donate a classroom to the school, the officials might say don’t come near the school because they might not be able to count it – if we can’t count it we get a qualified audit so don’t come near us. We need to find a balance between the two.

Remember we are putting a lot more pressure on departments to get clean audits. The programme the C Grow, the M Grow programmes are about setting ourselves clear targets to get to where we want to be. However, we have to find a balance that doesn’t cause these unintended consequences and specifically in this case I think it is a problem that could occur.

You also spoke about the Housing Fund and it is a pity that we don’t have the Housing Fund here. I think we all know that the Housing Fund completed its processes late and we all know that the Auditor-General still hasn’t managed to complete their review of it.

Obviously we take this into account and we take full responsibility for it, and so does the Auditor-General, to make sure that we need to complete this process so that we actually get it as soon as possible. The Housing Fund outcomes need to come before the House so that we can complete this process and we agree with that.

The hon Van Zyl spoke about extra funding within the Legislature for researchers. I must concur with what she said, if only for the reason that she actually does need a researcher; because she started speaking about numbers like 5 million people in the province when about half an hour earlier she had been given the exact number of people in this province, which is now 4,5 million.

She also spoke about unemployment of 17%, which in this quarter has actually gone up to 23%. She spoke about youth unemployment within that sector of 22%, when I had just mentioned that it was 45% a little earlier. So obviously we do need more research capacity, but we need to speak to that in the Vote of the Provincial Parliament to get some of those monies for research.

I also want to make the same point that I made in response to the hon Uys about NGOs and funding for NGOs. It is a matter that the hon Fritz and I have been speaking about. We spoke about it specifically the other day at a meeting with his senior officials and some of our officials. Here we are talking about the same thing again, namely the unintended consequences specifically when it comes to the stringent reporting of NGOs. When NGOs find it difficult – especially those small NGOs you were talking about – to report they obviously also find it difficult to access money.

We have to find clever mechanisms of using technology solutions to find ways in which we can actually help these NGOs to produce the reports that the Auditor-General, Treasury and the Department will be happy with and that actually allows then easy and competitive access to making application for funds. We are committed to finding those kinds of solutions.

I want to say to the hon Magwaza, who raised the issues that came up in connection with drug abuse, that I agree with her.
It is a major problem and we need to make sure that we find solutions. It is a global problem; it isn’t only a problem here although in this area of South Africa it hits us harder and seems to be far more prevalent.

We know that there has been a fight against drugs in the United States for 75 years and they still haven’t succeeded in winning the battle. We need to work together to try to find solutions to turn around this massive problem that is actually affecting so many of our young people in this province.

However, one of the points the hon Magwaza raised was about the closing of treatment centres, and then there was a bit of an altercation about “not true” or “misleading the House” or “lying”, but let’s put the facts on the table.

In 2008, under ANC government, there were seven centres. As of this year, under Minister Fritz, there are now 23 centres. I’m not sure where she gets her numbers and her facts from, but they are obviously not correct.

The hon Stali spoke about the department that is sinking and collapsing. I did not see the hon Minister Carlisle wearing a life jacket so I also don’t know where he got those numbers from. Perhaps what I should is to invite him to come along on a road trip and let’s go and do some benchmark exercises and go and look at what is happening in some of the other provinces in this country. When you talk about road infrastructure investment, we understand that we have to continue putting money into the backlogs. We are doing this and we are producing some very good and exciting outcomes.

I think I got the hon Haskin getting as far as talking about the PDC not appearing before them, but obviously they must summon those individuals if they want them to come and report. He spoke about public participation and increasing that and I have already spoken about that.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The audit coverage.

†The MINISTER: Yes, you spoke about the audit coverage and more money for it. We will definitely have a look at this in this time as we go towards budgets in January and February next year and then leading up to the period in March for budgets.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON (Mr H P Geyer): Order, hon Minister! Could you wrap up please.
†The MINISTER: But I haven’t started with the hon Ozinsky yet. [Laughter.]Thank you very much, Chair. Because the hon Ozinsky isn’t here I don’t have to deal with him.

Debate concluded.

The House adjourned at 17:35.
ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2012

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

1. Introduction of Bill

Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012].

2. Referral of bill to relevant committees in terms of Rule 187:

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012].

TABLINGS

The Speaker:

Papers tabled with Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012].

(a) Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure, 2012 [PR310/2012].


(d) Gazetting of allocations to municipalities as contained in the Western Cape Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure, 2012 and the 2012 Adjustments Appropriation Bill which were not listed in the Division of Revenue Act, 2012 (Act 5 of 2012).

FRIDAY, 23 NOVEMBER 2012

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Speaker:

Referral of bills to committees in terms of Rule 220:

1. Standing Committee on Local Government

Draft Employment Services Amendment Bill, 2012(NCOP) (proposed section 75 Bill).
2. Standing Committee on Community Development

Draft Mental Health Care Amendment Bill, 2012 (NCOP) (proposed section 75 Bill).

COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:


The Standing Committee on Community Development having considered the subject of the Western Cape Health Facility Amendment Bill [B 7–2012], referred to it begs to report the Bill without amendment.

4. ([Reprint] Final mandate stage): Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the National Health Amendment Bill [B 24B–2011] (NCOP), dated 20 November 2012, as follows:

The Standing Committee on Community Development, having considered the subject of the National Health Amendment Bill [B 24B–2011] (NCOP), referred to the Provincial Parliament in terms of the rules of the National Council of Provinces (NCOP), begs to report that it confers on the Western Cape’s delegation in the NCOP the authority to support the Bill.

MONDAY, 26 NOVEMBER 2012

COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:


The Standing Committee on Human Settlements, having undertaken an oversight visit to Drommedaris Housing Project, Drakenstein Municipality, on 4 September 2012, begs to report as follows:

Introduction

The Committee visited Drommedaris Housing Project as a part of its committee programme and overall oversight function. In organising this visit the Department of Human Settlements was requested to assist with the logistical arrangements for the visit to the housing project. The objective of the visit was to conduct oversight over the executive.

The delegation

The delegation consisted of the following Members:

Mr AM Figlan, (DA) Chairperson
Mr MC Walters, (DA)
Mr EJ Von Brandis, (DA)
The Municipality was represented by the following officials:

Ms Lulu Ntlemeza: Portfolio Holder: Environmental Affairs and Open Spaces
Ms Wendy Philander: Portfolio Holder: Human Settlements and Land Development
Mr Conrad Poole: Deputy Mayor: Drakenstein Municipality
Mr Daniel Pienaar: Head of Municipality
Mr Melvin Stoffels: Director: Finance: Department of Human Settlements
Mr Francois De Wet: Chief Financial Officer: Department of Human Settlements
Mr Anthony Hazell: Acting Director: Strategic Support and Information Management
Ms Kelly Theunis: Director: Regional Support: Department of Human Settlements
Ms PhilaMayisela: Director: Regional Support: Department of Human Settlements
Mr Gert Combrink: Portfolio: Finance: Drakenstein Municipality
Mr Johann Mettler: Municipal Manager: Drakenstein Municipality
Ms Gesie van Deventer: Executive Mayor: Drakenstein Municipality

Account of the visit

The delegation was welcomed by Ms Gesie van Deventer, the Executive Mayor of Drakenstein Municipality and Department of Human Settlements officials. She gave a brief introductory overview of Drakenstein Municipality. Ms Kefiwe Sethoabane briefed the Committee on the Drommedaris Housing Project, focusing on the background of the project, Project implementation, funding, and challenges. Ms Gesie van Deventer guided the Committee on a tour of the project.

Challenges and findings

(a) Some units were constructed without NHBRCs involvement;
(b) Mbekweni backyard dwellers were unhappy with the allocation;
(c) There was mould and moist in most of the houses because of the leaking through the roof and windows;
(d) The houses had no gutters because they don’t get funding for them;
(e) The houses had no ventilations;
(f) Some units had cracks; and
(g) The roofs were leaking because they were not properly constructed.

Recommendations

(a) The Department of Human Settlements to ensure that NHBRC gets involved in all the units;
(b) Drakenstein Municipality to request funding to buy ventilators and gutters;
(c) The contractors not to install plastic sinks and put tiles in the showers;
(d) Municipality to green the place and to build play park;
(e) Municipality to put street or house numbers on;

(f) The Department to finalise the Allocation Policy and workshop the municipalities; and

(g) Municipality to educate the community on how to maintain their houses.

Conclusion

On behalf of the delegation, the Chairperson thanked the Department of Human Settlements, Mayor and the officials of Drakenstein Municipality, Committee Members and the committee staff for their contribution in ensuring that the visit was a success.

2. Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on an oversight visit to New Life Projects in Ravensmead, Uitsig dated 26 September 2012.

The Standing Committee on Community Development, having undertaken an oversight visit to New Life Projects in Ravensmead, Uitsig, on 26 September 2012, begs to report as follows:

Introduction

The oversight visit to New Life Projects forms part of the oversight function of the Standing Committee on Community Development (Social Development).

The purpose of the oversight visit was to focus on the plight of street children in Uitsig and a brief tour of the New Life Project facility.

The delegation

The delegation consisted of the following Members:

Ms JL Hartnick
Ms CL Labuschagne
Ms AJD Marais
Ms NP Magwaza

An apology was submitted by the following Member:

Ms JA Van Zyl.

The following staff members accompanied the Members:

Ms M Burgess, Acting Committee Co-ordinator
Ms LH Cloete, Committee Co-ordinator

The New Life Projects was represented by the following:

Ms J Martcow, Co-ordinator: New Life Projects;
Ms K Mostert, Operational Co-ordinator: New Life Projects; and
Professor G Smith, Director: New Life Projects.
Account of the visit

The delegation was escorted on a tour of the complex by Ms J Martcow where she briefed the Committee on the day-to-day activities of New Life. The Container serves as a shelter for the community and young children where they receive support from the New Life staff. New Life Projects also helps to rehabilitate young children and adults from drugs and gangsterism and also has a twenty-four hour support system in conjunction with the community and the South African Police Service.

The oversight visit concluded at 11:15.

Acknowledgements

The Committee thanked the staff of New Life Projects for arranging the oversight visit and their hospitality during the visit.

TUESDAY, 27 NOVEMBER 2012

COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Speaker:

   The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] referred to it.
   It further begs to report that it expresses its unanimous appreciation to the Provincial Treasury for the report on the adjusted allocations.

   The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] referred to it.
   It further begs to report that the Department of Economic Development and Tourism provides the Committee with a briefing on the ‘Special Purpose Vehicles’ with specific reference to the funding thereof as well as Quarterly reports on the work done by the Development Bank of Southern Africa in terms of Cooperatives and Competitiveness in Enterprise Development.

The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 4 – Community Safety and Sport in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] referred to it.


The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] referred to it.


The Standing Committee on Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] referred to it.


The Standing Committee on Community Development begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 6 – Health in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] referred to it.


The Standing Committee on Human Settlements begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 8 – Human Settlements in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] referred to it. It further begs to report as follows:

**Recommendation**

The Committee recommends that –
The Department be congratulated on the effort they put into resolving the challenges they had with the Western Cape Housing Development Fund.


The Standing Committee on Community Development begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 7 – Community Development in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] referred to it.

The Standing Committee on Premier, Gender, Disabled and Youth begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 1: Premier in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 11–2012] referred to it.

10. Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on Vote 11 – Agriculture, in the schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 11–2012], dated 26 November 2012.

The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 11 – Agriculture in the Schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill* [B 11–2012] referred to it.

**Recommendation**

The Committee wishes to congratulate the Department on its financial management and recognised by the state audits.


The Standing Committee on Local Government begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 14: Local Government in the schedule to the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 11–2012] referred to it.

**1. Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee**

(a) The Department to provide the breakdown and details on the Municipality Infrastructure Grant (MIG) including savings and under spending; and
(b) the Department to provide a breakdown on revenue collection and revenue retention.

**2. Recommendation**

The Committee resolves that the –

(a) Department brief the Committee with regards to additional funds requested for disaster management;

(b) Committee undertake an oversight visit to the Video Wall; and

(c) Committee engage with the Thusong Centre in the Breede Valley Municipality with regards to their outstanding business plan.

The Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning in the schedule to the Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] referred to it.

**Recommendation**

The Committee resolves that the –

(i) Committee to bring to the attention of the Department and Provincial Treasury that the state of roads on the properties of Cape Nature requires greater investment and attention; and

(ii) Committee wishes to congratulate the Department on its financial management.


The Standing Committee on Education begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 5 – Education in the Schedule to the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012], referred to it.

It further begs to report that the Department of Education –

(i) provides the Committee with a progress report on the promotion of multilingualism in Western Cape schools; and

(ii) engages the Human Sector Development Committee on the issue of the enhancement of the isiXhosa language in Western Cape Schools.


The Rules Committee begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament. It further begs to report as follows:

**A. Papers, reports and information requested by the Committee**

The Committee requested the following papers, reports and information:

(i) A detailed report on the Secretarial allowances;

(ii) A report on the Constituency allowances; and

(iii) A report on the remuneration study and the implementation as well as the total cost implication thereof.
B. Findings/Concerns

The Committee expressed concerns on the following matter:

The research capacity in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

C. Recommendation

That the –

Research capacity within the institution, be revisited.

WEDNESDAY, 28 NOVEMBER 2012

COMMITTEE REPORT

The Speaker:


The Budget Committee begs to report that it has concluded its deliberations on the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 11–2012] and other papers referred to it. It further begs to report as follows:

The Committee requests that a further R4 000 000.00 be allocated to the Department of Local Government to be utilised by the Disaster Management Centre to defray the disaster management costs incurred during the recent rural disturbances.
The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**STATMENTS BY MEMBERS**

*Ms C LABUSCHAGNE (DA):* Mr Speaker, the tragic accident that took the lives of three of our province’s matric learners seems to be a chilling reminder to the rest of the Grade 12 class of 2012.

Yesterday’s English paper brought an end to most matric learners’ 12 years of hard work at school and also the end to an exhausting National Senior Certificate Exam.

The end of this milestone exam annually goes hand in hand with relaxation and holidays and many matric learners flock to holiday towns to celebrate their newfound freedom—the so-called “matric rage”.

Both the Minister of Education in the Western Cape, Donald Grant, and traffic authorities have warned and urged people to celebrate in a responsible way, to concentrate on safety and be aware that action will be taken against transgressors of the law—especially those drinking and driving.

†Mr Speaker, it is important that the class of 2012 realises the responsibility which accompanies their “freedom”. As graduates you are awarded the opportunity to further your education, to find employment, and the opportunity to enjoy citizenship with social responsibility. It is a freedom you can use to enable a better life for yourself and for others.

I encourage all Gr 12 learners to enjoy their well-deserved holiday but urge them to do so responsibly, with caution and within the law. You are at the start of the life you would like to choose and I implore you to choose in favour of your future. I appeal to you to make wise decisions for yourself, take your safety into regard and the safety of others. May you enjoy safe travels, a happy holiday and may you return ready to help lead the future you want to be a part of. That is the freedom you can use and the freedom you should preserve.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Mr Speaker, a giant has fallen. Prof Jakes Gerwel distinguished himself as an icon of the struggle, a leading academic that uplifted oppressed people, a cultural activist of note and an exceptional servant of the people.

As the first chief official of the first democratic government of the new dispensation under the ANC, Jakes Gerwel was the man on the side of the father of our nation, Nelson Mandela. Together with Madiba as our first democratically elected President, the renowned and much decorated Gerwel gave direction to our country at a critical stage of our fledgling democracy.
Gerwel played a huge role in government, in business and many organisations where he served to improve the lives of our people.

From his early days on a sheep farm in the Eastern Cape he graduated from the University of the Western Cape, and it was in this province where he made indelible marks. Amongst others, he lectured at Hewat Teacher Training College, taught at Grassy Park High School and then returned to UWC, where he became Vice-Chancellor and provided access for a growing number of African students.

His political participation never ceased. He was detained by police and harassed, but he never ceased to lead from the front.

He was an elected ANC leader of note and played a pivotal role in our country’s transition to democracy. The ANC dips its banner in honour of this leader of the nation and a dear comrade. HambaKahle – and thank you – Professor.

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS (DA): Mr Speaker, I have never been as proud a DA member as I was over the past weekend. The Birchwood Conference Centre in Ekurhuleni was filled with a diverse group of delegates, each from different cultural backgrounds, speaking different languages and from all over the country – each united by common values and a shared commitment to our Constitution.

Our re-elected leader reminded us that we share an unshakeable belief in non-racialism and we also understand that the best way to beat poverty and overcome the legacy of apartheid is through inclusive economic growth that creates jobs. We, the DA, are working for change in every community, and this change is now overflowing into other provinces and not only in the Western Cape.

Mr Speaker, making me exceptionally proud to be associated with, and even more honoured to be a member of the DA, is that speaker after speaker made mention of how far we have come and the way forward and the realisation that these are not only words on paper or delivering lip service to the people, as so many ANC members and followers have become accustomed to. They are implemented, tangible and actual efforts put forth by the DA to build one nation with one future through redress, reconciling, delivering and diversity.

Mr Speaker, our people have grown tired of only being rendered lip service to and the corruption of the national government. If the ANC is still oblivious to this, our Federal Congress held over the weekend should act as a wake-up call. An increasing number of South African citizens are becoming aware that with the DA a new day is dawning in South Africa, a day characterised by freedom, and freedom means nothing unless it is freedom you can use.

†The SPEAKER: Cope, over to you. Chance not taken.

†Mr P C MCKENZIE (ANC): Mr Speaker, what a complete crisis and utter failure! The DA is definitely in a crisis. Instead of taking responsibility to really deal with key issues of people’s grievances, the DA runs away and then passed the buck to big brother.
This is again evidence in how fast the desperate DA calls on President Jacob Zuma and the national Defence Force to resolve matters in the DA’s backyard with farm labourers. The ANC has to show the DA how to truly listen to ordinary people and not just respond to the needs and insecurities of their bosses.

The DA tactically blundered to side with landowners. Then, as an afterthought, it wanted to deal with the aggrieved workers on behalf of their bosses. Shame on the DA that failed dismally to unite farmers and workers at the height of the violent uprising.

The DA neglected the workers when warning signs emerged months ago, as worker wages were halved in De Doorns when farmers did not keep their word to pay a few rand more than the absolute minimum, and the continued ill-treatment of workers, or their conditions, were highlighted by eminent organisations and people.

Treating people right seems to be absent in the DA’s book. The ANC again calls for calm and recognition that farm workers are disappointed with the situation, and understanding that more work is needed to substantially change the present determination. Thank you.

†Mr M G E WILEY (DA): Mr Speaker, as public representatives we all receive correspondence from the public requesting assistance.

Last week I received a particularly distressing one and, given that it is the start of the 16 days of activism, I thought I would share it with you. The following is partially edited.

Dear Mark Wiley,

I write to you on behalf of my family as I am deeply dispirited and covered with deep shadow. With a terrifying fear I wish to ask for your support as our sister who passed away last month, left behind her daughter, 11 years old, with my family. She was raped last week.

Some village residents caught the suspects raping her and hurried to report this to the family and then they went to the village Chief.

The Chief in turn immediately phoned the police to come and arrest the suspect; however, day after day passed without any response from the police. In our village there is no police; police normally take 3 to 4 month to come if you call them.

After waiting in vain for police to come, some villagers decided to call the traditional court in the Chief’s presence. The police were called again and only came later to arrest some villagers for killing the rapist who was hanged.

The point is that the people who acted as neighbourhood watch are now arrested, but villagers are happy that the rapist had been punished and want the neighbourhood watch members released.
Their position is the following: The police made no attempt to follow up on a rape case reported earlier; there is no police station in the village or nearby; and the suspect had a long criminal record.

The principal function of the criminal justice system is to protect the safety of the individual and that of the society against crime.

Villagers in the Eastern Cape where this happened had made calls to the government to handle public institutions and the Constitution with respect and with a sense of responsibility, including that basic services and resources are allocated and actually reach the intended beneficiaries.

In the village that I am referring to there is no high school, no library, no police, no roads, and no government services, but former Minister of Social Services and Poverty Alleviation, Kholeka Mqulwana, was born there and she only built a road to her own home for her own car.

Mr Speaker, in the words of Allan Paton, “Cry the beloved country”.

†Mr R B LENTIT (ID): Mr Speaker, the announcement by the national Minister of Women, Children and people with Disabilities, that the Gender-Based Violence Act will be reviewed to bring perpetrators to book, is welcomed.

Last year, nationally, 87 000 women were assaulted and nearly 800 children and 1 300 women were reportedly killed. Since it may soon be illegal for victims to drop charges against violators, it may bring down the shocking statistics of domestic violence and the fatality rate thereof.

Mr Speaker, we cannot ignore the fact that there are men in our communities who are also victims of domestic violence. It is important that all of us do not exclude male victims from violence and abuse campaigns.

Since the international day of 16 days of activism kicked off on Sunday 25 November I encourage every member and every person who has been subjected to abuse to make use of the service and support of help lines available to them.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS (DA): Mr Speaker, the South African National Roads Agency, Sanral, was once one of only a few positive factors maintaining the South African transport infrastructure.

Sanral manages about 35 000 km of the country’s 607 000 km of roads including the N1, N2 and N3. Only one tenth of Sanral’s roads are tolled, but all are in a fair condition. In comparison, the condition of the roads not managed by Sanral has decayed to such an extent that it was announced last year that 42% of gravel roads in the country are beyond repair.

While the provincial government in Gauteng for example spent only 24% of their budget in 2011-12 maintaining provincial roads, Sanral has a history of effective spending and unqualified audit judgements.

Earlier this year more than 2 000 km of roads falling apart in the Eastern Cape was transferred to the agency.
This was done without Sanral receiving additional funds to repair those roads. With only R1,7 billion of Sanral’s R5 billion budget coming from toll roads, and in addition to that, the backlog of more than R149 billion in maintenance on South African roads, the performing of this function poses quite a challenge.

Mr Speaker, in contrast to that, 422 km of road surface were gravelled, 40 213 m² gravel roads were graded and 3,860 000 m² tarred roads were resealed in the Western Cape. Judging from the above mentioned, it is clear that the 6 653 km tarred roads and 25 559 km gravel roads in the province are maintained with limited funds, and that more that 99% of the 2011-12 budget was spent. I thank the department. [Time expired.]

†Mr M SKWATSHA (ANC): Mr Speaker, in South Africa we do not just celebrate national days of importance. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Please switch your phone off, hon member.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: We use these days to create awareness of issues, build our nation and give recognition to people who lead us in these areas. This is why celebrations like the international day in our month of HIV and Aids are so important to us. We place special emphasis for 16 days on the fight to rid our society of violence against women and children. By drives we do more than just highlight and acknowledge these scourges, we publicly speak against it to reduce it.

In this context it is a travesty that this Legislature did not make the time to dedicate time this year to tangibly address these matters of international significance. It is not strange though, as the DA does not fully share our nation’s commitment to such efforts and drives.

Here in the Western Cape we saw how the DA scaled down awareness campaigns, public participation and outreach. Even from the helm, the Premier has neglected to show her dedication as a woman and head of this government to the plight of women, youth and people with disability. That is why only games of luck are played with prize money not to get pregnant and to get people to test or re-test for HIV in order to win some jackpot.

The ANC in the House has offered to assist with TB drives without any response from this government, and we have just learnt that the prevalence of TB in this province is the worst in the world and it is not improving. Shame on you!

†Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Mr Speaker, today on the eve of 16 days of activism and Christmas, I would like to use this opportunity to highlight what took place on Sunday at Maynardville and pay tribute to the organisers and the participants of the charity Toy Run.

This event has taken place for 30 years. It started out with less than 100 people in 1982 in one centre. On Sunday it represented some 20 000 participants who have donated freely of their own time. Approximately 30 000 toys were collected for underprivileged children, children who come from abused situations, who are vulnerable and who are orphaned.
These children benefit in numerous ways through the work of these 20 000 to 30 000 people, in fact, around South Africa, with 20 centres now participating in this event. We now have some 60 000 to 70 000, perhaps 80 000, participants raising in one day around South Africa over 120 000 toys for these children.

This is significant in many ways and government can react, and should react appropriately. Government should firstly applaud and congratulate the organisers and the participants; government should make a conscious decision not to interfere and not to try and monopolise this kind of initiative for its own work. Government should also seek to remove all obstacles and hindrances for this kind of initiative to take place.

Unfortunately, this isn’t the case in the Western Cape, where all too often, this kind of organisation, this kind of imitative, faces uphill battles with the City in order to have approvals made and in order to have whatever funding is needed available to them. The government should also encourage other institutions and organisations to emulate this kind of work. One does not see enough of it.

All too often one sees the government throwing more obstacles and hurdles in the way of institutions and civil society organisations that wish to work with and for communities, and this needs to stop. It has been highlighted in the House many times before.

I would like to pay tribute to the organiser, Mr Rodney Ford, for 30 years of selfless work for the children of the Cape and of South Africa.

†Mr M C WALTERS (DA): Mr Speaker, South Africa is governed by a coalition – one might almost say an unholy alliance of ideologically disparate entities – a communist party, the trade union Cosatu and a party with an amorphous ideology characterised by ineffectiveness and corruption.

The orchestrated farm violence in our province illustrates the moral decrepitude of this alliance. The farm workers involved are seasonal workers and the original source of dissatisfaction lay in differential access to employment by nationally legitimised Zimbabwean workers and Lesotho migrants who had not received such legitimisation, in spite of previous regular seasonal job opportunities. Seeing an opportunity to exploit this situation as an extension of their “Project Reclaim” strategy, the ANC, under Marius Fransman’s leadership, using Cosatu’s Ehrenreich as a front, proceeded to destabilise the situation.

Cosatu represents only 2% of permanent farm workers in the afflicted areas. The impression has been created that permanent workers are heavily involved. Intimidation of farm workers and the bussing in and entraining of non-farm workers has been employed to create an impression of near-anarchy in some areas.

Relevant national departments offer little help. The Minister of Labour, Mildred Oliphant, who was conveniently overseas when the crisis erupted, poured oil on the fire by indicating that minimum wages could only be reviewed in April 2013.

The inept Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, who excels in the misuse of state funds and disputes with her officials, ... [Interjections.] ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky! Please refrain from running commentary.
Mr M C WALTERS: ... further promoted Project Reclaim by promising transgressors that they would not be prosecuted for strike violence on farms.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Walters!

Mr M C WALTERS: The danger of seasonal job losses due to the replacement of manual labour by mechanisation and the destruction of processing and packing infrastructure is an imminent one. Project Reclaim’s attempt to kill the “goose that lays the golden egg” could backfire on its protagonists.

SHUTTING DOWN OF 15 SCHOOLS: FAILURE OF WCED TO INDICATE HOW MONEY WAS SPENT

(Notice of motion)

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the failure of the Department of Education to indicate how they spent the money it saved after shutting down 15 schools last year.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the failure of the Department of Education of the Western Cape to indicate how the money that was saved after shutting down 15 schools in the Western Cape in 2011 has been spent.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

INCREASE IN STREET CHILDREN

(Notice of motion)

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the increase in street children in Cape Town, and the adequacy of response of government and civil society organisations.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates –

(1) the increase in the number of street children in Cape Town; and

(2) the inadequate response of government and civil society organisations to address this growing problem.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]
GROWING BABOON PROBLEM IN CAPE TOWN
(Notice of motion)

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the growing baboon problem in Cape Town and the response of civil society and government.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the growing baboon problem in Cape Town and the surrounding areas.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

FAILURE OF STANDING COMMITTEE TO MAKE ANY INTERVENTION IN UPRISING IN AGRICULTURAL AREAS
(Notice of motion)

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the failure of the standing committee, led by the hon Walters, to make any intervention in the uprising that have taken place in the agricultural areas of the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the failure of the Standing Committee under the chairpersonship of the hon member Mr Walters to initiate or make any intervention in the uprising in the rural areas of the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as printed on Order Paper.]

LATE PROF JAKES GERWEL
(Motion of condolence)

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

(1) extends its condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of the late Prof Jakes Gerwel, especially to his wife, Mrs Gerwel;

(2) notes that Prof Gerwel was a man who had great talent and served his community with dedication and unwavering service;
(3) notes that he was the first Director-General in the Presidency, serving with former President Nelson Mandela, in 1994;

(4) notes that Prof Gerwel was instrumental in establishing a professional civil service ...

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) extends its condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of the late Professor Jakes Gerwel, and especially to his wife Phoebe Gerwel; and

(2) notes that –

(a) Prof Gerwel was a talented man and served his community and country with dedication and an unwavering desire to render service; and

(b) he was a well-known academic, the Rector of the University of the Western Cape and also the first Director-General in The Presidency, serving in the Office of former President Nelson Mandela.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R B LENTIT: Can I just rectify ... [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! Hon member, we are dealing with motions, not statements. Please make it short, hon member. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

†Mr R B LENTIT: Can I just say the last part, Mr Speaker?

†The SPEAKER: Yes. [Interjections.] Order! Order! I’m the Chair. Proceed, hon member. I’m sitting here. I’m the presiding officer here.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, Prof Gerwel belonged to all of us. His role in government, academia and civil society ...

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lentit. Thank you very much.

Agreed to.
LATE KEENAN SMITH, LEE-AAN SWAIL AND KELLY-JADE FORD

(Motion of condolence)

†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its deepest sympathy to the families, friends and colleagues of Keenan Smith, Lee-Anne Swail and Kelly-Jade Ford, the matriculants of the Mondale High School who were tragically killed when their vehicle collided with a Golden Arrow bus.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its deepest sympathy to the families, friends and colleagues of Keenan Smith, Lee-Anne Swail and Kelly-Jade Ford, the matriculants of Mondale High School in Mitchells Plain who were tragically killed when their vehicle collided with a Golden Arrow bus on Saturday, 24 November 2012.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO ORGANISERS OF ANNUAL CHARITY TOY RUN

(Motion)

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the organisers of the annual Charity Toy Run, particularly Mr Rodney Ford, its founder, for organising and celebrating the 30th annual Toy Run on Sunday, 25 November 2012.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the organisers of the annual Charity Toy Run, particularly Mr Rodney Ford, its founder, for organising and celebrating the 30th annual Toy Run on Sunday, 25 November 2012.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
CONGRATULATIONS TO WORCESTER HOSPITAL NURSING SCHOOL

(Motion)

†Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Worcester Hospital Nursing School, as well as the 87 nurses, for the 100% pass rate at the school this year.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Worcester Hospital Nursing School, as well as the 87 nurses, for the 100% pass rate at the school this year.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

INTERNATIONAL VOLUNTEERS DAY

(Motion)

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that—

(1) 5 December 2012 marks International Volunteers Day;

(2) this past Saturday, the Lions Club across the Metro and volunteers from various organisations joined forces to put together hampers at the De Vrije Zee Primary School in Goodwood; and

(3) these hampers will be distributed to feed many hungry and needy people across the province.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that—

(1) 5 December marks International Volunteer Day; and

(2) this past Saturday, the Lions Clubs across the Metro and volunteers from various organisations joined forces to put together hampers at the De Vrije Zee Primary School in Goodwood, to distribute them to feed many hungry and needy people across the Western Cape.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
LATE MUJAHIED STEERS
(Motion of condolence)

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:
That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of neigh-
bourhood watch volunteer, Mujahied Steers, who died after being knocked
over by a speeding motorist in Pelican Park just hours before his first wedding
anniversary.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:
That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of neigh-
bourhood watch volunteer, Mujahied Steers, who tragically died after being
knocked over by a speeding motorist in Pelican Park just hours before his first
wedding anniversary.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

MARCH TO WCED DISTRICT OFFICE BY LEARNERS OF DENNEPRAG
PRIMARY SCHOOL, MOSSEL BAY, TO PLEAD FOR
THEIR SCHOOL TO REMAIN OPEN
(Motion)

†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:
That the House notes that learners of the Denneprag Primary School marched
to the WCED district office in Mossel Bay to plead for their school to remain
open, that there was nobody who came to receive their memorandum, as was
arranged, and that the children were very disappointed.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:
That the House –

(1) notes that learners of Denneprag Primary School in Ruitersbos near the
Robinson Pass marched to the district office of the Western Cape Educa-
tion Department in Mossel Bay to plead for their school to remain open; and

(2) further notes with dismay that there was nobody present to receive their
memorandum although arrangements had previously been made for that.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Are there any objections to the motion being moved with-
out notice? [Objection.] If it is yes, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.
THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2012

LATE NOBANTU “VICKY” NTOZINI  
(Motion of condolence)

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

(1) expresses its condolences with the family and loved ones of Nobantu “Vicky” Ntozini, owner of Vicky’s B&B in Site C, Khayelitsha, who was tragically murdered last week; and

(2) notes that Ms Ntozini was considered as one of the pioneers of Township Tourism in her community.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House—

(1) expresses its condolences with the family and loved ones of Nobantu “Vicky” Ntozini, owner of Vicky’s B&B in Site C, Khayelitsha, who was tragically murdered last week; and

(2) notes that Ms Ntozini was considered to be one of the pioneers of township tourism and a stalwart in her community.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CAPE TOWN DOCTOR RESUSCITATES BOY AFTER NEAR-DROWNING  
(Motion)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its appreciation to heroic Cape Town doctor, Dr Mohammed Slamie, for saving the life of a young boy who was lifeless for over half an hour after a near-drowning experience.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its appreciation to heroic Cape Town doctor Mohammed Slamie, for saving the life of a young boy who was lifeless for over half an hour after a near drowning experience at the Boulders in Simon’s Town.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
DA FEDERAL CHAIRPERSONS AND VICE-PERSONS ELECTED

(Motion)

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulate Wilmot James on his election as Federal Chairperson; and

(2) Mmusi Maimane, Anchen Dreyer and Makashule Ganawith their election as Federal Vice-chairpersons of the Democratic Alliance at the party’s recent federal congress held on 24 and 25 November 2012 at Boksburg; and

(3) that the foundation of this team will stay focused on creating opportunities for all South Africans, especially those still suffering from the consequences of a divided past.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Wilmot James on his election as Federal Chairperson and Mmusi Maimane, Anchen Dreyer and Makashule Ganaw on their election as Federal Deputy Chairpersons of the Democratic Alliance during the recent Federal Congress of the party that was held on 24 and 25 November 2012 in Boksburg.

[Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Objection.] If it is yes, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

TEN BEST RESTAURANTS IN SOUTH AFRICA

(Motion)

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the following Western Cape restaurants and chefs on their nominations as part of the Top 10 Restaurants in South Africa, as awarded by the annual Eat Out DSTV Food Network Restaurant Awards –

(1) According to position and additional prizes in first place: The Test Kitchen, Woodstock;

(2) In second place: The Tasting Room, Franschhoek and their chef Margot Janse, who received the award as Chef of the Year;

(3) Jordan Restaurant, Stellenbosch;

(4) Ouverture Restaurant, Stellenbosch; and
Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates the following Western Cape restaurants and chefs on being nominated in the first five positions out of the Top 10 Restaurants in South Africa, all recipients of the annual “Eat out DSTV Food Network Restaurant” awards:

The Test Kitchen in Woodstock, also crowned as the restaurant of the year;

The Tasting Room in Franschhoek and their chef Margot Janse, who was nominated as the Chef of the Year;

the Jordan Restaurant in Stellenbosch;

the Ouverture Restaurant in Stellenbosch; and

Rust en Vrede in Stellenbosch, also chosen as the winner of the award for excellent service; and

(2) notes with pride that eight of the awards to the Top 10 restaurants in the country went to restaurants in Stellenbosch, Cape Town and Franschhoek.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

SHORTAGE OF BEDS AT HELDERBERG HOSPITAL

(Motion)

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the fact that patients at the Helderberg Hospital are forced to sleep on benches and on the floor due to a shortage of beds.

[Motion as moved by member.]
CONGRATULATIONS TO MATIES’ SEvens TEAM

(Motion)

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Maties Sevens Team on their victory in the USSA Sevens Championships. This is their second consecutive victory.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Sevens rugby team of the Maties on the achievement of winning the Sevens championships of USSA (University Sport South Africa) for the second year in succession.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATIONS TO JUNIOR GOLFER LUCA FILLIPI

(Motion)

*Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Luca Fillipi of Cape Town on his second place in the Albatross International Junior Golf Tournament in New Delhi, India. He is 13 years old and is going to represent the Western Cape and South Africa in Scotland next year in an international tournament.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates the 13-year-old Luca Fillipi of Cape Town on his second place in the Albatross Golf Tournament, the international golf tournament for juniors, in New Delhi, India; and

(2) furthermore, notes that he will represent the Western Cape and South Africa in Scotland next year.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.
THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2012

SAPS ACTS AGAINST DRUG DEALERS

(Motion)

†Mr P C McKENZIE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the SAPS for arresting 1 600 suspects on charges of drug possession and drug dealing over the past week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr P C McKENZIE: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the South African Police Service for arresting 1 600 suspects on charges of drug possession and dealing in drugs over the past week.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

HON MCEBISI SKWATSHA REFUSED ENTRY INTO NOMINATION PROCESS

(Motion)

†Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) expresses its sincere sympathy with hon Mcebisi Skwatsha for not being invited to attend his ward’s nomination meeting;

(2) that the House further extends its condolences to hon Skwatsha for wanting to nominate Jacob Zuma as national chairperson of the ANC, but his branch chose Kgalema Motlanthe; and

(3) that the House wishes the hon member all the best with the lodging of the complaint with the ANC secretary general, Gwede Mantashe.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) expresses its sincere sympathy with the hon member Mr Skwatsha because he was not invited to attend the nomination meeting of his own ward;
furthermore, extends its condolences to the hon Mr Skwatsha because of the bitter disappointment experienced by him when his branch chose Kgalema Mothlanthe as their candidate for the post of national chairperson of the African National Congress while Mr Skwatsha actually wanted to nominate Jacob Zuma for that position; and

(3) wishes the hon Mr Skwatsha all the best with the lodging of a complaint in this regard with Gwede Mantashe, the Secretary-General of the ANC.

Motion as printed on Order Paper.]

†The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motions without notice? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

MILLENIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS YOUTH CONFERENCE

(Motion)

†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the national Minister of Social Development and the NGOs for organising the youth conference that started on Monday to discuss Millennium Development Goals and what they mean to them.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the national Minister of Social Development and the NGOs involved, on organising the youth conference that started on Monday, 26 November 2012 to discuss Millennium Development Goals and what those goals mean to the youth.

[Motion as printed in Minutes.]

Agreed to.

WESTERN CAPE ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B11—2012]

(Consideration of Principle)

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, it's an honour to start this debate. I will be speaking twice so for this reason I'm merely going to outline the framework that I tabled last week.

This adjustment budget brings an additional R294,979 million to our budget for this financial year, 2012-13. In a nutshell, R163 million of that goes to cover the higher-than-anticipated wage settlement agreement for Education and Health. Bearing in mind that only those departments are getting the funding; the other departments will all be absorbing this agreed, higher-than-inflation-rate salary increases.

As this is a political debate, this is the first part perhaps that can be touched on in this debate to show how these negotiations put huge pressure on our budgets in delivering services to our people.
There is R44,9 million going to ICT services, R50 million going to capital roads infrastructure projects and R60,3 million going to financial assistance to various municipalities for bulk infrastructure to unlock housing delivery.

Obviously, again in the context of what I have said about the adjusted wage increases, it is really going to free up where our money should be going to making a difference to the people in our province – specifically the people who need the funding and who need this kind of help in their lives.

I look forward to the debate, specifically in the context of where we find ourselves as a region. This is how we’re spending our money, focusing on health and education, but we are also looking at the social net and the space in which we need to increase economic growth. Because if we do not create an economic growth engine, we will not be able to employ the 22,8% of our population who are unemployed, specifically in the context of what’s happening in our economy and the farm workers’ strikes at the moment. I therefore look forward to this political discussion.

*The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Mr Deputy Speaker, first I want to express my disappointment to hon Visser, because I also undertake to visit Mangaung and I want to offer hon Skwatsha a lift. [Laughter.]

†Mr M G E WILEY: A free lift.

*The MINISTER: He doesn't have to pay.

†Hon colleagues, I would like to pay our respect as the DA in the Western Cape to the late Professor Jakes Gerwel. He has served South Africa well as an academic and as the Dean of the Faculty of Arts, as Rector and as Vice-Chancellor of the University of the Western Cape. The people of the Western Cape have lost an asset – an intellectual and a moral asset.

He served South Africa superbly over the years from 1994 until 1999, as the Director-General in the department of President Mandela and the first secretary of the Cabinet in post-apartheid South Africa. The people of the Western Cape have lost a great son, a man of the soil, but more importantly we have lost an architect of our Constitutional democracy. [Interjections.]

Hon Skwatsha, I was a student at UWC and a lecturer under his tenure as Rector and Vice-Chancellor. ... [Interjections.] ... His contribution is known worldwide and he is respected for his approach to servant-leadership and he was a man of great humility.

*Today we greet Prof Jakes Gerwel, a worthy leader.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER: Hon members, this year we had various crises: Marikana, corruption, Nkandlagate and now the crises on the farms in the Western Cape. There is a story behind each of these.

I believe there is the story of wages on farms. I believe there are some labourers in South Africa who have legal grievances and we are on their side.
Workers in South Africa suffer and we must acknowledge the problems in all sectors of the South African economy. This is not just a Western Cape phenomenon, Mr Deputy Speaker, minimum wages for farm workers are annually determined by the Minister of Labour and Cosatu is part of this process. The current minimum wage of R69 was determined by the ANC and Cosatu. [Interjections.] We should be honest, because with today’s cost of living nobody can live on R69 per day. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

*Mr P C MCKENZIE: It’s true.

*The MINISTER: That is why the Western Cape government called on the national government to start processes to negotiate new minimum wages for farm workers.

We supported these processes, but, Mr Deputy Speaker, what happened then? Minister Tina Joemat-Pettersson came to De Doorns seeking attention and announced a new minimum wage from the 4th of December 2012; and this while her colleague, the Minister of Labour, is gallivanting abroad.

Tina then declared herself the hero in this context. She made a critical error, because this was not her mandate and she contravened the territory of Ms Oliphant, the Minister of Labour.

The ANC circus, however, kept going and Ms Oliphant repudiated her colleague in Cabinet, Ms Tina Joemat-Pettersson, in public by issuing a statement that it was not possible to fix a minimum wage by 4 December 2012, because there are processes to be followed.

Meanwhile the ANC insulted the farm workers and farmers and made hostile speeches. Tina, who is supposed to be a friend of agriculture, turns her back on agriculture and her colleagues in Cabinet. Shame, Tina, shame on you! [Interjections.]

Minister Tina Joemat-Pettersson promised that there will be new minimum wages on the 4th of December 2012. She incited the workers, Mr Deputy Speaker. Because Minister Tina Joemat-Pettersson made a promise she couldn’t keep, her friends in Cosatu threatened to create violence and anarchy.

Minister Tina is going to pay a high price for her rabble-rousing and she will personally be held accountable for any damages farm workers and farmers in the Western Cape may suffer. The Public Protector has already found this week that Tinatjie has to pay back R150 000 of public funds that she mismanaged. I do hope Tinatjie has enough savings, because after the 4th of December 2012, she is going to pay for the damages on farms in the Western Cape.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I wonder if you can make a ruling on the fact that the hon MEC, in a very chauvinistic manner – I mean, it is 16 days of activism for violence against women – calls a grown woman a “tjie”. I really would like you to rule on it, because I think there’s something really not right about what he’s doing.
†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The point is taken. If the Minister Meyer said that about
the Minister I would ask him to withdraw that.

†The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I withdraw.

*Hon members, we are also aware that the wife of an ANC councillor in De Doorns
is a labour consultant and the media should know this. The ANC is supposedly
opposed to labour consultants, but take note what their own ANC comrades are
doing in De Doorns: they incite the crisis, because the higher the wages, the high-
er the commissions the labour consultants get. This ANC councillor was caught
out! Now the ANC and Cosatu are fighting among themselves. The ANC ministers
are fighting among themselves and they don’t show any leadership in this crisis.

†We now call on the SADF to perform peacekeeping duties to assist the police to
maintain law and order. Very strangely, today Cosatu is now also supporting the
DA’s call for the army to be brought in, because Cosatu realised they have created
something they cannot control. However, because of the tension between Cosatu
and the ANC, it is unlikely to happen.

While Cosatu and the ANC play politics, farm workers are living in fear and farm-
ers are losing million in terms of production. Our agricultural base is being de-
stroyed and innocent people’s lives are being threatened. Even a previously dis-
advantaged farmer lost everything and the farmers who care for their workers
safety is being threatened. The ANC is playing with fire.

The ANC of today is similar to the apartheid state and very similar to the National
Party of the 1950s and the 1980s. [Interjections.] I now want to launch in this
House the new ANC logo, because the ANC behave like this. This, Mr Deputy
Speaker, is the ANC of today. [Interjections.] This everybody must see. This is the
ANC of today and this is how they behave. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is that a point of order?

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your own members were making a noise while
you were trying to speak.

†Ms J WITBOOI: Exactly, we are not ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Witbooi, I cannot see you, but I can hear you.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Is the hon MEC allowed to make presentations using placards in
the House?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It's been done before.

†Mr M OZINSKY: It was ruled illegal.
†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I’m not sure what the symbolism of the placard is. He’s done it and it’s finished. Please continue, Minister.

†Mr M OZINSKY: It’s been ruled illegal. Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker, would you please check the previous findings, because previous Speakers ruled that out of order in the House.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will do that, but I don’t have a particular problem with if it’s within reason and it’s in good taste.

†The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I withdraw this poster in the House.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. You may proceed.

†The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give you another poster; a very, very important poster, because like Sharpeville the ANC killed black people, like the information scandal the ANC passed the secrecy Bill yesterday in the National Assembly and like Afrikaner nationalism the ANC promotes ethnic nationalism ... [Interjections.] ... and we are now honestly seeing this. This is what the hon Ozinsky wants to happen in the ANC. He wants Zuma to go, that’s why he’s behaving like this in the House. Zuma must go! This is what he says.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I now want to conclude on a high note. At the Cosatu congress in September 1994, President Mandela said the following: If the ANC does to you what the apartheid government did to you, then you must do to the ANC what you did to the apartheid government. And this is happening right now in South Africa.

The ANC’s time is up, its time has expired. That is why the headlines are now “Zuma must go”, and that’s why they don’t want hon Skwatsha to go to Mangaung. But I will give him a lift to Mangaung. [Time expired.]

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Deputy Speaker, it’s a pity that the hon Ivan Meyer is leaving the House – maybe I shouldn’t say anything.

Besides the R60 million to municipalities, the DA government has missed an opportunity in this adjustment appropriation of dealing with the issues that affect the poor in this province. We have gone in this province, and everybody here acknowledges, including hon Winde, from one crisis to the next that started with the Makhaza open toilets, farm workers' plight, the closure of schools with no prior public processes, the closure of G F Jooste Hospital, the closure of many NGOs in communities, ... [Interjections.] ... where they are sorely needed and often the only service that poor people can access when they are in trouble or have been hurt. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Can I ask hon Ozinsky to give his own leader a chance to speak freely, please?

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: All that you have done as the DA that has been painful in this province was done against the poor. You didn’t do this in Constantia ... [Interjections.] You didn’t do this anywhere else. It shows that the problems of the poor are very far off the DA’s horizon.
You only want to fulfil your obligation to the poor by spending on health and education. That is statutory. That you must do.

†The PREMIER: [Inaudible.] ... steal the money.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You are compelled to do that. [Interjections.] Is the hon Premier telling me that I steal the money? [Interjections.] Can you please rule on that?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear that.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I’m asking you, Mr Deputy Speaker; I heard it.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! I’ll rule from the Chair. Hon Brown, please take your seat. Hon Premier?

†The PREMIER: I said at least we don’t steal the money.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I’m happy with that. Please continue hon Brown.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Well, I have no proof that you don’t steal the money, and since there are no rules for what we say here I suppose that’s right.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no. Please hon Brown. Hon Brown you know very well there are Rules. We’re trying to abide by the Rules and I will rule if something is out of order. This is not out of order. It was meant as “you” meaning the party. She didn’t say you as the leader of the opposition did that. Nor did what you say mean the Premier or you are stealing.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: That’s me. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I’m talking about the party in general.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: That’s what you’re saying. [Interjections.]

You want to fulfil your obligation to the poor by only spending on health and education. You must do that. It’s obligatory. It’s part of what is statutory. [Interjections.] That is not your decision to make. [Interjections.] That is your....

†The PREMIER: [Inaudible.] Well, Premier, I’m sorry that you steal the money. Did you say that you steal the money? [Interjections.]

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Okay. The commitment of any government must be judged by how you spend the amount that’s not statutory. You are the governing party in the Western Cape and should serve the people, 5.2 million people, not only the few who are very privileged. [Interjections.]

You inherited a province with the highest number of people with access to basic services in the country, with a school system that generally runs well and health care that worked. When you came to power this province had the highest number of people on antiretrovirals. [Interjections.]
By the time the ANC left the government, 300 000 children had access to one meal per day, every day. We are now in a terrible mess. [Interjections.]

You spin so hard that you ignore the lived reality of the poor living in the province. Today we also know that Cape Town carries the tag of having the highest levels of TB in the world. [Interjections.] This is a socioeconomic disease, it is a disease that affects the poor. [Interjections.] I’ve not heard anyone speak in the Adjustment Appropriation that you are going to deal with the matter.

An HON MEMBER: It’s too late.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It has the most in the world.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We got it from the previous government.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Just looking at the way the farmworker strike was dealt with in the province. The DA government first blamed national government, Tina Joemat-Pettersson, Minister Oliphant, then blamed Cosatu, ... [Interjections.] ... then appealed to the President to intervene.

But only yesterday in your own province – you run this province, the President doesn’t run this province – you have done nothing but cause mayhem on farming issues. In your own province the Premier went to speak to the farmworkers and workers yesterday for the first time. [Interjections.]

You see, the issue is not only the salary of farmworkers. All of you want to make it just the salary of farmworkers. [Interjections.] It must also be about the hangover of an apartheid state with its exploitation of farmworkers, the dop system and the concomitant effects on children.

†Mr M C WALTERS: I was just wondering if the member shouldn’t address the Deputy Speaker.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will rule on that. Please continue.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The concomitant effects on children in this province – and this is the province that has the highest number of children who suffer from foetal alcohol syndrome – that is part of the hangover of an apartheid state, but do I hear you give a programme for that? No!

Go and speak to the people of this province, find the solution so that you don’t have to bring the army into the province. Find an amicable solution for the school closures, ensure that every child is in school at no additional cost to poor parents, listen to what the public says and help, with the public, to find those solutions.

I want to thank national government for the additional funds for FET colleges and ICFs and the negotiated salaries of our own workers, like the nurses and teachers in this province. This money is allocated for the people to improve working people’s lives and for FET colleges so that we can improve our children’s prospects in the future.
We are really sorry that the additional money we have to spare in the province is being spent on more studies into something or the other, more money for lottery games, on HIV/Aids, more money for more computers, more investigations that bring no solutions – to add injury to insult.

†Mr H P Geyer: Not on brown envelopes.

†The Leader of the Opposition: Even social development has been reduced by R1,8 million in this province, where young men and young women die because they’re caught in the crossfire in their streets. Even the Department of the Premier, a non-delivery department, receives twice the amount given to Community Safety and receives more than the amount given to Agriculture. It is a non-delivery department that is just going to do one more investigation into something or the other.

The Department of Agriculture assumed responsibility for food security. Why have we not increased food security in the province? [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

An Hon Member: You’re stealing from them.

The Leader of the Opposition: And you’re killing them.

*Mr H P Geyer: Mr Deputy Speaker, the events happening in the Western Cape this last month were shocking. [Interjections.]

*The Deputy Speaker: Order! Order, please! Hon Von Brandis and hon Brown, calm down, please. Hon Rossouw?

*Ms A Rossouw: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Leader of the Opposition said, “You are killers.” I object to that.

*The Deputy Speaker: Hon Leader of the Opposition.

†The Leader of the Opposition: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is what I want you to rule on: As I was speaking someone at the back there said “because you are burning them down.”

An Hon Member: Yes.

An Hon Member: Nobody said that.

The Leader of the Opposition: Now, I have a real issue in the House at the moment, and this issue is that anyone can shout out “you are corrupt” and they say “no, we’re not talking to anybody”.

†The Deputy Speaker: Okay, hon Brown.

†The Leader of the Opposition: So, I didn’t speak to anybody. In fact, I spoke to the back wall.

†The Deputy Speaker: I will look at the Hansard. What were the actual words? Just repeat the words that you said.
†Ms A ROSSOUW: “You are killers.”

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I said, “And you are killers.” That’s what I said.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I’ll rule on that next time. If the hon member referred to members of the House, it is clearly unparliamentary.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Deputy Speaker, but I would like you to also rule on ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will look at the ...

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... “you have burnt it down”, please.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will look at the entire context.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Please. Thank you.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I’m just making the ruling again that if you refer to members of the House it’s totally unparliamentary.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I’m so ready for this one.

†Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I made a remark in response to the hon member’s saying that we never addressed food security, and I said “because you’re burning the stuff, ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, that’s in context.

†Mr M G E WILEY: ... burning the food.”

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I’d like you to rule on that.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, that disposes of this point. We continue now.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Don’t tell me I’m burning the stuff. Murderers!

*Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I trust you’ll give me credit for this one and a quarter minute. What is more disturbing, though, is the underhanded way in which the ANC manipulated a very complicated situation and disrupted people’s lives. [Interjections.]

The problem we are confronted with in the Western Cape is much bigger than just a raise in wages. The entire problem can be blamed on the National Government.

†Mr Deputy Speaker, agriculture in the country is suffering, not due to any natural phenomenon, but due to the lack of support that is provided by the national government to farmers.
†Ms N P MAGWAZA: Yo!

†Mr H P GEYER: South African farmers are struggling to remain relevant in a growing competitive international market. [Interjections.]

†Ms A ROSSOUW: None!

†Mr H P GEYER: Despite the fact that we, as a country, are heavily dependent on our agricultural sector for food production, the National Government treats this sector poorly, creating fear and insecurity in a sector which is responsible for our daily sustenance. The contribution made by agriculture to the GDP has shrunk from 10,3% in 1967, to only 2,5% in 2010. The number of people employed in this sector has dropped from 1,1 million to 624 000 in 2011.

These declines are not only attributed to a change in our economy, but also to a decline in commercial farmers. Between 2007 and 2011, 30% of grape farmers in the Hex River Valley sold their farms. The insecurity that farmers face with the dragging land reform process – which is costing the taxpayer millions – and the rising input costs in the production process, are forcing South African farmers to look at other prospects elsewhere or to rapidly mechanise.

*The ANC’s slow action to support the county’s food producers with subsidies – as is done in the rest of the world – will one of these days force South Africa to import more. This, Mr Deputy Speaker, is in direct contrast to the fact that the past 35 years we were netto exporters of food.

†Mr Deputy Speaker, this Gauteng newspaper states:

   Emerging Farmers battle with finance as infrastructure grants are not allo
cated.

Is this how the ANC treats the people they promised “a better life for all,” or did they mean “a better life for the cadres only.”

†Mr M OZINSKY: It wasn’t a better life for ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Ozinsky, you can’t comment on every sentence in the hon member’s speech. Please continue, hon Geyer.

*Mr H P GEYER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As the Western Cape govern-
ment is taking the lead in the RSA regarding emerging farmers, why doesn’t the government give farmers the opportunity to develop the Eastern Cape, that beautiful area with probably the most fertile soil, in cooperation with its people and apply the correct farming methods? [Interjections.]

Instead they just trudge along with their poor efforts of government assistance, or as I have heard, no assistance at all to expose Black farmers to modern farming methods to increase their harvests. Or is there another reason why the people in the Eastern Cape must be kept poor and dependent?

†Or, Mr Deputy Speaker, do we have a situation of “control traditional leaders and you control the populace ” and is this constitutional? [Interjections.]
*Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC’s lust for power has become so overwhelming that they will do anything in their power to try and oust the DA. The ANC manipulates people’s needs for their own agendas and encourages violence. It is a tragedy that a party with a history of truth and justice has now sunk so low that they use the same tactics they used to fight the previous regime. Where is Joemat-Pettersson now after she put her foot in it when she promised wages; or is she hiding because she shamelessly misused taxpayers’ money to go on a gallivanting holiday?

†Nevertheless, Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC is going nowhere very fast. The DA is increasing its wins against the ANC at the polls and is growing massive support in wards where we previously had no support. The truth is the ANC is failing, as all empires do. [Interjections.]

Rome is burning and is helped along by the infighting, squabbles, corruption and cloak-and-dagger power struggles. To the Members on the other side of the House I ask: Who of you will still be here next year? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, today I want to remind the DA about the period that we are in, and that’s the 16 days of activism for no violence against women and children and that today, specifically you should refrain from shouting personal verbal abuse across the floor. Make the issue the issue and listen to us. I am appealing to the heart, especially, of these members sitting in the front for the sake of the people whom you are supposed to serve.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Adjustment budget has followed hot on the heels of the annual report; the one is looking back and the other is dealing with the now. Even here you couldn’t find where the lessons that were supposed to have been learnt were addressed.

What we did find was a whole host of targets that were not met across most departments, and mostly where the poor were affected. The thread of commonality or integratedness of a sustainable plan that speaks to how the poor are being assisted to get a better life is just not there.

To be able to understand the DA’s plan to implement the budget one needs to study the full budget, compare that with the APP and then compare the adjustments, but herein lies the problem. The time that we are allocated when we do these oversights in our committees is just not enough in order to really question and get an in-depth understanding and answers. What we need to highlight here is that the issue again closes down the public space for debate.

Now, Mr Deputy Speaker, you ask yourself, how then will the departments know what should be addressed in the programme called “Changing Behaviour”. However, the amount and movement of the Adjustment speaks volumes about the planning that departments had on paper and the targets that they achieved.

On the one hand, when we criticise the DA in our oversight role about how they have allocated and/or not implemented, they blame national government for what they give and their policies.
On the other hand, they boast about what they’ve achieved, yet it’s the same allocation from national that allows them to do these things that they boast about. This is because, as the Leader of the Opposition alluded to earlier, these are statutory things that they have to do.

How do they address the needs of the poor? Mr Deputy Speaker, let’s take the Department of Social Development. It is the social net for the poor where assistance can be given, yet it is number five in its size of budget. But the DA takes R1.8 million from both the Department of Social Development and the Department of Health, another social service programme, to give to Education for assisting teams to deal with children with disabilities.

Before the DA starts screaming across the floor at me because I’m mentioning this, Mr Deputy Speaker, let me say that I’m not taking anything away from the importance of the needs of those children. The issue I want to raise is: How could education not foresee that need? Also, what was Social Services and Health not doing on time and on target so that that money could be shifted from them to the Department of Education?

Education plods on, reeling from one crisis to another, yet they pass on R7 million to the Premier’s Department for ICT and Khanya projects – dead, inanimate things – instead of findings ways to stop learner drop-out rates and improve their safety, for instance. Why does the Premier’s Department need to deal with that anyway, if it’s related to schools? [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, Vote 6: Community Safety sets aside R6.5 million for the Khayelitsha police commission of enquiry. Where are the need and the sense of priority here? Human settlements, another very important portfolio that should supply shelter for the poor and the vulnerable, gives R3.7 million to Local Government, supposedly to fund administrative services transferred to that department. Will the lives of the poor and vulnerable really improve because of the services rendered by the different municipalities?

The Premier’s Department, a non service delivery department, gets an allocation from Vote 4: Community Safety, which is supposed to look after the safety of the residents, and mostly the poor. It also gets money from Health, an essential service, and from Vote 9 and Vote 13 for this programme, Changing Behaviour, which I previously mentioned. Who’s behaviour, Mr Deputy Speaker, that of the officials or the community? If it’s the community, which part of the community? Is it for the haves or the poor – and to do what exactly?

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Adjustment Appropriation has proved that the DA pays lip service ... [Interjections.] ... to the concept of “Better Together”. [Interjections.] Together with whom? Is it with themselves? Because the silo planning continues, hence the thread and the footprint of integratedness are so difficult to pick up. What is very clear is that in the Adjustment most departments have not met their targets and are moving savings to address conditions of employment.

So, the question is: If we’re spending on conditions of employment, is the money being spent wisely, except where the money is spent on teachers and nurses who deliver an essential service and whose remuneration is determined nationally?
Is the DA employing staff who can communicate and understand the needs of the poor and, in so doing, influence the allocations in their departments? Because that’s the service we are supposed to deliver. Can they influence and convince communities to participate and play a meaningful role in their futures?

Mr Deputy Speaker, section 120 of the Constitution stipulates that the province needs to put a procedure in place to amend a money Bill. In the absence of that we have to accept what is placed before us at the time of the budget and adjustments periods, except for conditional grants and some equitable share allocations.

The Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, specifically Chapter 2, speaks about “from vision to action”. I want to remind the DA that their role is to govern in the Western Cape and our role is to monitor whether the lives of mostly the poor and vulnerable, and more so in rural areas, change for the better in the next allocation. They’ve missed the opportunity this time. [Time expired.]

*Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, we are once again in the 16-day period of activism against violence against women and children, and once again we can only focus our attention on the fact that the national government has failed miserably in protecting women and children against violent behaviour.

The Child Protection Register that was implemented in 2007 should have the names of all sex offenders, but it is still not up to date and is poorly managed. Decisive action against violent perpetrators will help to protect our women and children against possible abuse.

The DA acknowledges the freedom of each person to make a choice regarding his or her sexual orientation. During this 16-day period of activism against violence against women and children, let us allow one another to make our own choices and respect the rights of everyone. After all, the Constitution guarantees that.

Let us give the freedom of living safely back to the children of Lavender Hill and Hanover Park. Let us condemn the gangster violence on the Cape Flats in the strongest possible way. Intimidation and tormenting take away the freedom of movement in communities.

What a privilege to take part in an adjustment budget debate where we can honestly say we are proud of our departments, of the way funds were spent until now and the minimal movement between programmes because of under spending. Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape succeeds in taking the value of the rand much further than any other province in this country.

†The DA stands for freedom you can use to unlock opportunities to better the lives of all who live in the Western Cape and South Africa. The DA stands for freedom you can use to better the education of all our children. The DA stands for freedom you can use to create a safe environment. The DA stands for freedom you can use to obtain better job opportunities; and the DA stands for freedom you can use to expand the economic future of the Western Cape and its citizens.

*The DA stands for the freedom the Constitution gives to all citizens. The DA government will make sure that everybody has access to equal opportunities and wants to make sure that everybody can make full use of these opportunities.
Via training comes the freedom to accept a good job opportunity. Job opportunities create economic growth that leads to further prosperity; not the kind of freedom that Cosatu now takes away from our farm workers. This is how freedom works.

To eliminate poverty, certain steps have to be taken: The wasting of taxpayers’ money and unnecessary spending has to stop and accountability must be brought back to increase productivity.

To reach these objectives demands strong leadership as well as highly efficient machinery of government. The DA in the Western Cape works for the people of the province: Nine of the fourteen Western Cape departments were on the list of 20 top-performing departments, and only four of the national government were listed.

The hon Minister Winde’s business plans to eliminate red tape and lead businesses to success, stands in stark contrast to Cosatu who refuses to allow a youth wage to be paid to 178 000 young people. In contrast, the Premier’s programme has seen to it that 70% of 2 000 young people who were supported by the Western Cape Jobs and Skills Programme now have permanent jobs.

The National Development Plan is trying to address unemployment, poverty and inequality, but is not successful in its endeavours. In contrast, the DA’s 8% growth plan, when applied, is more successful because it gives one the opportunity to use one’s freedom of choice. The DA-in-government puts mechanisms in place to promote good governance.

In stark contrast to the DA’s policy to use opportunities, stands Minister Joemat-Pettersson’s incompetence as Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry, who is currently blemishing the credibility of women in executive positions. After three and a half years she still doesn’t understand how her portfolio operates. She doesn’t know that she cannot exonerate criminals and she doesn’t know how long it takes for legal requirements and procedures to take effect.

The agricultural industry is an important part of the economy and provides thousands of job opportunities to our people. [Interjections.] The Western Cape exports 30% of the agricultural production, as well as 50% of our wine. The DA welcomes the fact that Minister Oliphant is the first national Minister... [Interjections.] ... who condemns the violence and destruction during protest actions and acts responsibly in a time when emotions run high. [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! There is too much noise at the back of the House, please.

*Ms A ROSSOUW: However, the biggest injustice done to South Africa by the ANC is that the credibility of the government is being questioned. Respect for the dignity and honesty of the House goes to the dogs when the president of a country has to give answers ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon Ozinsky, I can’t see who you are talking to. Somebody there is talking to you; both of you please calm down.
*Ms A ROSSOUW: ... about more than R250 million that are questioned. In five years’ time his costs amount to almost R515 million ...

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! You can’t go on like this. Hon Carlisle!

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: There’s actually a brawl going on here.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I was on the point of asking what’s going on.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I know.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I want them to calm down, please.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I feel sure if you put hon Ozinsky out we could get on with the debate. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No!

†Mr M OZINSKY: Maybe, Mr Deputy Speaker, there’s something wrong that you can’t hear what that hon member said.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I’m not sure who the member is you’re talking about.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Hon Plato has just said across the House that I took money from gangsters, which you know is a criminal offence and is not true, but no action is taken against him.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take you seat. Hon Plato ... [Interjections.] Order! Order!

*Hon Minister Plato, did you say that?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you said it, you must withdraw it.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, yes you said it. I heard you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I’m reading and he is claiming I’m sleeping. I’m reading ...

†Mr M OZINSKY: I never claimed that.

†The MINISTER: ... so I responded to what he ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! Please take your seat, hon Skwatsha. Hon Minister Plato, I ask you: Did you use the words he said you used?

*The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes, I said that.
*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Withdraw that, please.

*The MINISTER: I withdraw.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We can move on. Hon Rossouw. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER: Shut up ... [Interjections.]

†Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, at local government level it is no secret that the Western Cape ...

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no! We can’t go on like this. Hon Plato, you were provoked and you said “Shut up”. This has to be withdrawn.

*Ms E PRINS: Yes.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Prins, you keep on talking. I can see your lips move, but I can’t hear what you are saying. Hon Plato, just withdraw the words “shut up”, please.

*The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I withdraw them.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We are now going to continue in a calm atmosphere. Please, people, we can’t go on like this. Please calm down and proceed in a civilised fashion. [Interjections.]

†Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, at local government level it’s no secret that the Western Cape outperforms the other provinces. Where services are lacking ...

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister Botha.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, is it admissible for an hon member to sit in the House and read a book?

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Botha, it is admissible. Maybe he’s reading a book regarding a coming speech.[Interjections.]

†Ms A ROSSOUW: Where services are lacking local government is working nonstop to include all. According to census 2011 data, 99% of the Western Cape’s residents have access to piped water, both inside and outside their homes; 91% have refuse removal; 93% of households have electricity; and nearly 97% of Western Cape residents have toilet facilities.

With these excellent statistics the question immediately arises: Why is the Western Cape having such severe so-called service delivery protests? That makes one think –if you just can’t beat the polls, destabilise the province. Let me make it clear, we will not be removed. [Time expired.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA is only here to maintain the apartheid status quo and is only here to reverse the gains of our democracy by consistently failing to provide decent housing and living conditions for our people.
South Africa is progressing from the context of colonialism of a special type to a national democratic society through transformation. Hence, as we progress, we must always take the apartheid legacy into account and the fact that the provision of resources under apartheid was skewed in favour of the white minority.

The dignity of the majority of South Africans was trampled upon and it is therefore the constitutional mandate of the democratic state to redress the imbalances of the past that we are still living with. This is the special intent of the provision of basic services, which is central to the restoration of our people’s dignity.

A major imbalance that the democratic state has always set out to address, as its constitutional mandate, is the lack of decent housing and living conditions for the majority of South Africans.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And now we have Nkandla. [Laughter.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: However, since we operate in a democracy, the forces that are hell-bent on maintaining the apartheid status quo and blocking progress are in power in the Western Cape, led by the beneficiaries, in actual fact, of that white minority regime. [Interjections.] They use that power to undermine the transformation agenda led by the national government. [Interjections.]

It is, therefore, not strange for the DA-led Western Cape Provincial Government to cease providing decent housing and sanitation to the poor black majority in the province as a matter of priority. Instead, the DA-led Department of Human Settlement has failed to build on the solid gains made by the ANC in the province.

Since coming into power, for three years in a row...

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, will the hon member take a question? [Interjections.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: No. For three years in a row, the DA-led government could not reach its own modest target for the provision of housing in the province. For three years in succession it has, in fact, consistently lowered its target and has underspent its budget. This is because the DA’s neoliberal ideology dictates that the poor must not be provided with free housing.

In fact, the hon Madikizela told me that it’s not possible to provide free houses. The DA doesn’t believe in providing free houses to the poor, even though some of the members of the poor working class in informal settlements are able to pay for housing, due to initiatives taken by the ANC-led national government. The DA has blocked that. [Interjections.]

From April 2012, national government has ensured that people earning from R3 500,00 up to R15 000,00 per month will be able to obtain a subsidy of up to R83 000,00 from the provinces to enable them to obtain housing finance from an accredited bank. As the facilitator responsible, it is a shame on the DA-led province that people, who have been promised housing yet cannot afford the rental housing, are not even aware of the details of this opportunity.
The DA-led province is not even informing people about the subsidy. The DA-led province isn’t even assisting people with applying for and obtaining this subsidy. By not helping people the province is preventing them from accessing the subsidy and is thereby blocking them.

Furthermore, farmworkers do not even have secure tenure in this province. Instead of providing houses for the poor majority in this province, the DA prides itself on perpetrating the legacy of apartheid with the emphasis being on serviced sites. Since when is living on a serviced site dignified?

The DA has also failed to provide the poor black majority with decent sanitation. Decent sanitation is a basic component of human dignity. In Rosemead, for example, there are instances where five families share one toilet, and a hundred families share seven taps.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member! Please conclude.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Oh god! [Laughter.] Many toilets built by the City in Makaza are not even equipped with taps or sewerage connections, even despite the order of the Cape High Court in May 2011.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time has unfortunately expired – without any assistance. [Laughter.]

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think the hon member Magaxa is better suited to address a rally of 20 SACP members than being a Member of Parliament. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, let me give you the facts about what the ANC government has done over the last 17 years. The Housing department has a strategic mandate to create integrated and sustainable human settlements and not isolated and dysfunctional housing projects, as the ANC did over the years.

†Mr M OZINSKY: We built houses then.

†The MINISTER: That is your attitude. Under the ANC administration the focus was on building as many low-cost houses as possible, without considering the long-term consequences of chasing numbers and dotting the landscapes with these housing projects.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is true that my department is facing some challenges in many municipalities. This is for a number of reasons that I will outline now.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Blame the municipalities.

†The MINISTER: As I’ve said in the past, to build houses is very easy. Historically, houses were built away from urban areas ... [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Mr Ozinsky, I allowed you to read a book – and it’s quieter when you are reading a book. [Laughter.] Please continue, Minister Madikizela.
†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What are you reading? Hey! What are you reading?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Historically, houses were built away from urban areas and without effective quality control. That is why, Mr Deputy Speaker, it has been estimated that to rectify the houses that were poorly built under the ANC administration, will cost us no less than R50 billion nationally. That is what it will cost to rectify the houses that the ANC has been bragging about having built over the past 17 years. [Interjections.]

Now at around R100 000 a house that could be more than 500 000 houses, which would actually wipe out the entire housing backlog in the Western Cape. That is actually what we are doing now. We are repairing houses – and spending more than R50 billion – that the ANC is bragging about because they short-changed our people. They built houses on the outskirts and they did shoddy workmanship, because they wanted to chase the numbers.

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No dignity. No dignity for them.

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Ongoing urbanisation continues to impact on service delivery, as we all know that according to Statistics SA Census 2011, the Western Cape population increased from 4,5 million to 5,8 million. That is 29% between 2001 and 2011.

Many of these 1,3 million people are eligible for government houses and tend to move to urban areas in search of jobs. Many end up living in informal settlements. We have been attempting to meet the increased need with a budget allocation linked to the 2001 census, and with the right resources obviously we could do more.

Again, Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to emphasise that the mandate of the department has changed a lot since the last 17 years. Now we are no longer just building houses; there are a number of programmes within the housing code that this department is dealing with.

If you look closely at our APP, even though, Mr Magaxa, we have missed some of the targets in some of the programmes … [Interjections.] It means you can’t read the APP. If you look at other programmes like the Rectification programme and the EEDBS, we have actually overperformed in those programmes. [Interjections.] So you must not only look at …

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: No, no, it means that you can’t.

Mr M SKWATSHA: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: It depends on how you define education. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!
Although the DA-led Western Cape has the highest concentration of households in the country with access to piped water at 99.1%, and households with access to toilet facilities at 96.9%, we still face some challenges.

In order to formalise informal settlements, Mr Deputy Speaker, infrastructure, such as underground pipes, sewerage systems and roads, needs to be installed. This is often very difficult in areas that are flood-prone, near wetlands, mountainous or just not economically viable due to the distance from urban areas.

The lack of investment in infrastructure by the previous ANC administration has led to us facing many hold-ups ...

Stop passing the buck.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Stop passing the buck.

†The MINISTER: ... in providing services to all our people. It is true, and this is not passing the buck.

In this province alone, because of a lack of investment in infrastructure, we now have a backlog of R20 billion in infrastructure. You must understand that unlike in the past, where you were dotting the landscape with houses, chasing numbers, ... [Interjections.] ... we cannot build houses where there is no bulk infrastructure. You must simply understand that. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, we do not chase numbers; we build integrated and sustainable human settlements. That means people must have access to transport, schools, clinics and other facilities. These settlements must also be sustainable, which means they are near job opportunities or near expected economic growth nodes. If people have jobs they can pay for services, which ensures sustainability.

This is the challenge and we only do things if we can do them properly and sustainably. [Interjections.] We will not compromise these core values just to say we have delivered a lot of houses. We will not ship our people off to live in settlements in the middle of nowhere just so that we can say that we have met our targets.

We have to make sure that the fundamentals are in place before we deliver and that means everything is in place to support healthy, sustainable human settlements. [Interjections.]

One of the three outcomes to support our strategic mandate is to inculcate a sense of ownership and responsibility amongst beneficiaries. That means beneficiaries can have security of tenure and also the right of property ownership.

When we took over in 2009, Mr Deputy Speaker, there was a backlog that had been left by the ANC administration of 86 000 outstanding title deeds. Now in the race to build houses the ANC often didn’t follow the correct procedures, with the result that 86 000 people did not have the title deeds to their houses.

This meant that they did not have the right of official ownership. We currently have a problem of reducing the title deeds backlog as well as to ensure that new beneficiaries get their title deeds as quickly as possible. This is now usually from a few weeks to a few months after receiving their houses, because we follow the correct administrative processes and do things properly.
We ensure that the right people get their houses and they get the rights of ownership. Doing things correctly for fewer people rather than incorrectly for more people is fundamental to long term sustainability of this department.

Finally, something we have to look at very carefully is the tenure system of the ANC government. People currently cannot legally sell their houses for eight years after taking occupation. This encourages a situation where houses are often sold cheaply and informally and because transfer of the houses is not allowed, the buyers do not have the proper property rights. It also means that the original beneficiaries are deprived from entering the formal market and selling their houses at a market-related price, if they wish.

This helps to keep them trapped in the cycle of poverty. If we want people to improve their economic situation, Mr Deputy Speaker, we must support the poor in their right to enter the free-economy market, which is in line with the theme of the DA, “Freedom we can use.” [Time expired.]

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, one of the DA government’s main priorities is improving the quality of life through wellness. In his speech last week, Minister Winde proclaimed health to be one of the key targets of the Western Cape government and among other things there was the R2,8 billion in capital health investment.

It is therefore important that we note the positive and visible changes at our clinics, our hospitals and our community health care facilities. I further note that funds have been shifted to non-profit organisations, notably the R3 million for the Sunflower Fund for further development of the Bone Marrow register.

Deputy Speaker, allow me to talk about the benefits of the Chronic Dispensing Unit. This revolutionary service was nearly jeopardised due to the poor project-management planning when the service was first launched in 2005. However, now, under the DA leadership, ownership of the challenges has ensured that chronic medication reaches our stable chronic patients. This leadership prolonged the life of our stable chronic patients who were diagnosed with high levels of TB and asthma, and of those where the HIV/Aids burden is prevalent. It includes all chronic illnesses.

This is proof, Deputy Speaker, that the outsourcing of dispensing chronic medication to stable patients in the Cape Metro area eliminated the pressure of waiting times for medication at identified delivery and collection facilities.

Allow me to mention Mr Sizwe Nzima from Khayelitsha, a 21-year-old entrepreneur, who cofounded a business called Iyeza Express. Mr Nzima took the initiative in assisting, stable chronic patients by collecting and delivering pre-packed chronic medication by bicycle to senior citizens.

Due to circumstances these senior citizens are unable to collect their pre-packed medication from our health facilities. This is an example of a visionary young man who did not focus on the challenges experienced by the department last year in delivering chronic medication. Instead he focused on the solution and how pre-placed medication can reach our senior citizens.
This initiative is, Better together. This initiative is, “The freedom you can choose.” This is just one economic benefit of the chronic dispensing unit.

*I hope the Western Cape government will consider supporting such initiatives with subsidies when next year’s budget is discussed.

†This will be a well-deserved subsidy for those who render services to their communities that benefit the community and aspiring entrepreneurs alike. It is clear that the Department of Health has carried out its mandate and set the ball rolling to deliver on issues that are close to the hearts and minds of the people of this province. The department has met the targets that it has set for itself to accomplish the APP of 2011.

†Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I raise this topic today as it is in the interest of our children – yes, the black child, whose future is under threat, whose right to education is questioned and whose inalienable constitutional right is trampled upon by adults in the action led by Premier Helen Zille and the DA.

Out of education, inequality and poverty, education is the highest priority for the ANC, led by the administration of President Jacob Zuma. On an occasion the Deputy President of the country was asked what the top three priorities were for the Zuma presidency. Deputy President Montlanthe responded that education is President Zuma’s first, second and third priority.

It is to confirm our findings that the closing of schools, in particular the 20 earmarked by the Premier and the DA, proves an injustice is being served in an era of democracy. It is clear that the actions of the DA, led by the Premier Helen Zille, proves her insensitive to the plea of the founding fathers of our liberation, who gathered in Kliptown in 1995 to adopt the Freedom Charter as a guiding and instructive plan for our liberation as a people, in particular those reduced to a second-class citizenry.

The Freedom Charter is clear on the subject of education. It is unparalleled in the category of instructive declaration that the doors of learning shall be opened. What will those who constitute our parents and true visionaries of Africa say if they hear that in the Western Cape, almost 20 years into democracy, Zille and her DA orientation is closing the very same doors of learning for the black child? [Interjections.]

We fear no contradiction to conclude to our forebearers and those who gave their lives for the liberation of our people and South Africa, will be insulted. We are seeing the Premier chased away from communities. Two weeks ago she was chased away from De Doorns and this week she was chased away from Worcester. The people of the Western Cape are saying enough is enough.

The DA claims to be a very transparent government, but they are the first to make the loudest noise in the Protection of State Information Bill, while they deliberately refuse to make the learner audit report available to the public regardless of the proper legal advice that was given to them that they should provide proper reasons as to why it should be confidential, and up to today they have not. And now the so-called transparent, open opportunity Better Together DA is cutting down on learner transport without proper consultation. They are dividing learners along racial lines and language in the Boland.
They forcibly want the Western Cape and those currently living in particular on the Cape Flat to revisit the chambers of memory. For the presence of Casspirs and Nyalas and military equipment running up and down Klipfontein and Modderdam roads have caused so much psychological challenges. Yet the Premier, a former journalist, who knows this history of apartheid, with heavy-handed tactics deems it correct to ask the President to unleash the Army because the police are incapable of dealing with such.

It was only correct and the astuteness of mind that prevailed from the President of the ANC and the country to have rightfully rejected her apartheid-informed request. Our struggle shall be intensified; we will fight you on every front of powers; it is a legitimate case and cause. Truth always outlives a lie. We are reminded of the words of the emerging thinkers, Nicolaas, when he concluded on the truth:

Truth does not struggle; it is necessarily one-sided; it proves less ambivalent and never ambiguous, yet remains that which is the sun captured and the moon attest to …

Premier Zille and her chorus can no longer lie to the Western Cape voters. It can no longer obfuscate the truth of disrespect for black life. For the black child, for the black history and our collective black distinct. Enough is enough.[Time expired.]

*Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, The DA government in the Western Cape set a goal to be the best regional government in the world.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Go ahead, please.

*Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: To reach this goal we are focusing on a better life for all. Through political will, innovative leadership and effective cooperation several systematic changes were brought about since 2009. The success is evident in projects like the “Red-tape to Red Carpet” programme, the wide-ranging broadband strategy as well as maximum spending on infrastructure development and by focusing on improving an education system to a quality system.

The Medium Term Budget Policy bears witness of effective spending on key policy choices aimed at addressing poverty, and to put the economy on a higher growth trajectory.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the adjustments budget for the 2012-13 financial year does not show abnormally big movements. It shows thorough strategic planning to reach defined objectives. This kind of planning demands a strong political will. The principles of transparency and good government support the political will of the DA. The effective functioning of the Ministerial Handbook, as well as the Western Cape Law of Procurement (Business Interests of Employees) is, amongst others, evidence of this.

In contrast, more and more complaints regarding corruption are surfacing in the ANC. The MEC of Finances and Economic Development in the Northern Cape, John Block, is a relevant example.

As early as 2005 Kgalema Motlanthe said that the ANC is riddled with corruption; he referred to the ‘cancer of corruption’.
The ANC’s investment section, Chancellor House, has openly tendered for government contracts – an example of an ethical borderline between the separation of powers between party and government. On top of that all declarations against corruption by president Zuma are undermined because of the corruption charges against him. All this is evidence of a party rotten to the core; a governing party that has to relapse into revolutionary tactics; this is tragic.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is such an irony that today in the House the ANC is launching scathing attacks on a budget that is oriented towards service delivery, while some ANC members in the House played a key role in 2008 to get rid of the lack of ANC leadership, mismanagement and the abuse of power that was the order of the day.

Today it is clear that poor leadership in the ANC is rewarded with higher leadership positions. Marius Fransman, Ebrahim Rasool and others associated with the “brown envelope” saga – to name but a few – took key positions in the ANC while the natural leadership in the Western Cape is hampered by infighting and the inability to work together, even as far as ward levels are concerned, – is it not, hon Skwatsha?

The voters lost their trust in the ANC. What confidence could the ANC-voter have when the President had upgraded his private dwelling to the amount of R250 million– and this being a government who is standing for poor people? What confidence could an ANC-voter have when textbooks are not delivered, hon Tingwe, or when the Public Protector in the Western Cape is investigating the ANC’s provincial leader, Marius Fransman, on charges of corruption? This is why the ANC has to relapse into apartheid rhetoric.

Mr Deputy Speaker, on the other hand the voters put their trust in the DA government in 2009. The people in the Western Cape trust the DA to make real changes to people’s lives by service delivery. The DA government addresses poverty, inequality and unemployment in a direct way through transversal strategies and programmes, something the ANC clearly doesn’t understand. The importance of the planning and timely maintenance of infrastructure is already visible. The backlog in maintenance, as well as the shortage of new facilities are being eradicated and can be seen, for example, in the Departments of Health and Education.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the history books will keep the ANC accountable to the people, even if the concept of accountability towards voters does no longer exist in the ANC. The consequences of a corrupt, self-serving and leaderless organisation at the helm of a country deny people the freedom they could use.

Fortunately the ANC can no longer fool the people in the Western Cape and the rest of the country. The seeds of dissension that are sown, the decline of the ANC, the lack of leadership and the envy towards the real leaders in the ANC, are since 2010 in stark contrast to the principles of a non-racial, open opportunity-driven community under the proven leadership of the DA.

“Better Together in Freedom” you can use.
†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to start by confirming that I agree with member Beerwinkel who started off her speech by saying that there is a link between the annual reporting process that we’ve just gone through and the adjustments that we are now discussing. The opportunity is there to have addressed the challenges that were found, to have learnt from the lessons and to have grasped hold of the opportunities that have been shown to exist across all departments as a result of the annual reporting process.

Mr Deputy Speaker, but I am not finding sufficient evidence particularly in the area of IT. The area of IT is one of the province’s greatest opportunities, and I quote from the Adjustments Budget:

The increase in the number of sights and users connected to the corporate network has put severe budget pressure on the programme, and an in-year baseline adjustment was required to rectify this.

That confirms – and we know because we’ve heard a lot about it over the last couple of weeks – that IT is one of the biggest growth sectors within government in the Western Cape, and we can see what has happened with regard to CEI. Technology development has increased, there’s increased reliance across government on IT services, and there is increased efficiencies that arise out of increased reliance on IT services. There’s a lot of evidence for this across all departments, and the fact that R50 million has been reallocated to ICT is further proof of that.

However, if one looks at the A-G’s findings across all departments or, in fact, across 11 of the 14 departments, the same transversal concerns continue to arise, and I can just quote a couple of them: There was no monitoring of user and third party access to the system; that management’s commitments were not implemented; that controls to manage programme changes have been designed, but have not been adequately implemented. As a result developers have access to the production environment, and these activities are not monitored for appropriateness.

In fact, it was found in one department that there was no risk. How is it that a user can change a computer programme, change it back again, and there’s no monitoring of that throughout the system. What that does is it opens the doors to corruption and fraud that will not be picked up, because users can change the programme environment at will in some departments. Access to environmental controls have not been implemented and are not operating effectively. The state of controls can be ascribed to management not having exercised sufficient oversight to ensure that appropriate environmental controls are in place. And so the findings continue.

One wonders whether these findings across at least 11 departments out of 14 have been taken seriously. So I have concerns about the way in which IT as an opportunity is being taken, given that IT is a significant threat to the government’s statements of rooting out corruption and driving efficient government in the Western Cape. [Time expired.]

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Kukhona le nto kuthiwa ngesiXhosa abantu ngoodelihlazo. Oodelihlazo, mntaka Madikizela.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]
[There is an isiXhosa word for people who do not have morals. People without morals, son of Madikizela.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, I agree with the previous speaker, hon Haskin when he agrees with the hon Beerwinkel, but the missing link here is: Your government, hon Winde, rightfully gives Education a well-deserved amount. The incoherence that comes with that is it then delinks something that is so associated with Education – Social Development – and it further gives Health a well-deserved amount. The incoherence that comes with that is that it gives the lowest amount ever to Sport and therefore not encouraging a healthy nation. That is the incoherence that the DA is busy with.

I was speaking about ngoodelihlazo—shamelessness. Sometimes when you make these comments I am really astounded by how you, as the DA, don’t get embarrassed. I look at the 21 or 22 members over there. More than two-thirds of them voted for apartheid, which created this mess. [Interjections.] In fact, if I were a teacher I would ask those who were not members of the National Party to raise their hands; you would find not more than five members. [Interjections.] Not only did you vote for that, but you enforced apartheid, many of you enforced apartheid. That’s why I am saying that you are not even embarrassed by the fact that the ANC is cleaning that mess. [Interjections.]

I listened the other day to the honourable Achmat Kathrada. He was saying that it’s acknowledged worldwide that after 300 years of colonialism and more than 40 years of apartheid, in 18 years no government has performed the way the ANC Government has performed. [Interjections.] You even forget that, in fact, you are able today to speak about a Public Protector, a Bill of Rights and the exposition of corrupt activities even from the ranks of the ANC, those negotiations were pioneered by the ANC that you ...

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... not your Constitution.

Mr M SKWATSHA: It is not our Constitution. Those negotiations were pioneered by the ANC ... [Interjections.] Let me teach hon Wiley a thing or two. [Interjections.] You are not embarrassed that the ANC actually saved this country. [Interjections.] Yes, it saved this country from the massacres of Kasinga. [Interjections.] The ANC. What were you doing at that time? The Mandela you speak so well about as if you supported him, you wanted him wiped off this earth.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: In prison for 25 years.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Hon Meyer here spoke about Jakes Gerwel. How many of you worked to make sure that what he stands for is defeated and that you proudly speak about him today? [Interjections.]

We got this thing here today, “Western Cape Provincial Parliament that cares”. Not under the DA. Look at what happened just yesterday during the farm worker strike. In fact, many of you own farms there. One day you must tell us how much do you pay your farm workers? [Interjections.] Which one pays farm workers more than R150 a day? [Interjections.] And this Premier has the guts at the height of an unrest, to recklessly claims, without facts, that a farmer has been killed. [Interjections.] Your Premier, she claims that.
You speak so much about taxpayers’ money. You are quiet about the R6 million painting of Zille gate. [Interjections.] You are very quiet about it. [Interjections.] Very reckless. At the height of that particular unrest in De Doorns ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Skwatsha, your time has expired. Please finish off.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: At the height of that particular unrest ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Last sentence.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Just two sentences.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One sentence.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: At the height of that particular unrest you had the guts to close the clinics for four days ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has now expired.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: And that’s a caring government.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M SKWATSHA: The last sentence.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, member! Your time has expired.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is interesting to note that whenever there is one of these debates between the ANC and the DA it is complicated by the fact that most of the front row here obviously are as embarrassed, as we are angry, about Nkandla and about Chancellor ... [Interjections.] You know exactly who that is. So there isn’t an ANC any more, hon Skwatsha. There are various people who may for the time being be members of the ANC, but there is no ANC any more. [Interjections.]

The hon Leader of the Opposition has a particular way with words and she accuses us of all kinds of horrendous things, but I want to say to her, and remind her, that so appalling did she find the previous ANC regime that she and her colleagues chased them out of here.

I then find it hard to accept, Deputy Speaker, that the ANC was so wonderful and that we are so bad, which is the basic theme that she presented here today. The ANC, except for that period when she was the Premier, was appalling and nobody was more appalled by the corruption than the hon Leader of the Opposition. [Interjections.] It’s always an interesting debate.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: Yes, you did. Let me go a bit further ... [Interjections.] Yes, you did, and most of the front bench here did as well. It was an act of political courage that has very few parallels, and I have huge respect for the people.
Mr Deputy Speaker, but what will happen to these people who had the courage to do it? They will be picked off by the person who presided over the worst of the corruption.

He will pick them off one by one, as he's already picked one off, and more will follow; they know it – if that is to be the future leadership of the ANC. The hon Lynn Brown will understand that while she and many of her colleagues have my utmost respect, the party, as a whole, has no respect for me. That is not to say that what the ANC fought for and sought for, and largely achieved, was most honourable in the liberation of South Africa, and what it sought for in at least its first five years of government, the bringing about of national reconciliation, was also a goal that I could, and do, support wholeheartedly.

†Mr M OZINSKY: You opposed it.

†The MINISTER: No, I never opposed that.

†Mr M OZINSKY: You did.

†The MINISTER: No, I never opposed that. Do you want to ask me a question? [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Please continue Minister. Are you taking a question?

†Mr M OZINSKY: Why did the DA then not join the government of the time, or its predecessors, if it supported the ANC?

An HON MEMBER: It wasn’t there yet.

†The MINISTER: Well, the DA wasn’t there, but I’ll tell you why the DP and I didn’t join the ANC, it is because there were areas of ... [Interjection.] The government?[Interjections.] What government? [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, Minister.

†The MINISTER: It is not the function of multiparty democracy that everybody joins the government; it is, in fact, the opposite of that. You see, Deputy Speaker, the hon Ozinsky has a very unusual idea of democracy. He said a little earlier this afternoon that he fully supported farms being forcibly taken away.

†Mr M OZINSKY: I never said that.

†The MINISTER: You said, “I hope they take their farms away”. [Interjections.] “I hope they take their farms away”, referring to the current unrest. So when you say that ... [Interjections.] That maybe an interesting ideology, but you have no place in democracy with an ideology like that.

When the hon Skwatsha talks about Bills of Rights and so on, it cannot go hand-in-hand with what the hon Ozinsky said here earlier today. [Interjections.] That’s another reason why the ANC’s race is run. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That’s land grab.
†Mr M OZINSKY: So it's land reform without transferring land.

†The MINISTER: That's not what you said. [Interjections.] What the hon Ozinsky said, and he can turn as much as he likes, was that he approved of the forcible taking of farms, and I presume that means houses and anything else. [Interjections.] The question I would like to ask is: Is it only white farms, or is it also farms that belong to brown and black people? [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon Minister! Are you prepared to take another question?

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to ask if the Minister will give me some of his time to answer his question to me, because he's asked me a direct question …

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You must ask him a question if you want to take his time.

†The MINISTER: I've already given the hon member time to ask a question. [Interjections.] I actually offered it to him.

†Mr M OZINSKY: You never offered … [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, Minister, please continue. Mr Ozinsky, please allow the Minister time now to carry on with his speech.

†The MINISTER: I just want to touch on some of the points that have been made. One is regarding the whole area of Education. A number of speakers said this government doesn't care about black children. I want to remind hon members on that side that when Mr Gabru was the Minister of Education – he sat about here – he in a sense said let's take the matric results – I think it was for 2007 or 2008, I cannot remember … [Interjections.] Do you remember that? Okay. What came out of it was that out of 4 500 people in the province who had got a matric with Maths and Science on the higher grade, 4 000 were from the old white schools as it were, 450 were from the old coloured House of Representatives schools, and 50 were from – I forget what they were called now – the old black education. The point that Mr Gabru was making was that something was terribly wrong in black education – and something is terribly wrong in black education.

I actually have the greatest admiration for my colleague over there. We have set Education as the key priority of this government, and within that it is the malfunctioning schools that are the highest priority of that priority. Let's not be dishonest with each other. [Interjections.] Let's not be dishonest with each other.

In that same debate it so happened that Trevor Manuel was present; I don't know if you remember that. He referred to the fact that on a Friday afternoon in some schools the teachers were working, in other schools the teachers were in the shebeen. He left that there, but we all understood what he meant.

As we stand here today, on this Friday coming up there will be a 50% absenteeism of teachers throughout the country, as there will be on the Monday that follows it. Can anyone tell me how you can conduct an education system when you have those kinds of absenteeism?
I want to tell you that that side of the House, as well as our side, knows what the problem is. It is not the DA that is the enemy of black children; it is Sadtu that is the enemy of black children.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER: It is Sadtu, and they know it. [Interjections.] And they know it. [Interjections.] Until Sadtu is not the determinant of education in South Africa it will not come right. [Interjections.] It will not come right, sir, it will not come right.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I also want to refer to the closed schools issue. It is such hypocrisy that I’ve heard from the ANC. Inevitably where there is a highly fluid situation, where birth rates change, you are going to open schools and close schools.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Carlisle, your time has almost expired; just finish off.

†The MINISTER: Let me finally say that the best case I can judge from as to whether there has been a change, is in my own department. I am sure that much of that change would have happened and been the same under hon Mr Skwatsha and the hon Lynne Brown in the ANC Government. In my own department, where R500 million was flying out of the window every year, it doesn’t fly out any more; it goes on roads and it goes on making land available for land claims ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Carlisle, unfortunately your time has expired.

†The MINISTER: ... and it goes on saving people’s lives on the roads.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has now finally expired.

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to thank everybody who has been part of this debate. I will react to one or two of the comments made by the other side of the House. I am not going to react to members on this side of the House, save to say, perhaps, that the leading comments that were made by Minister Meyer at the start of the debate, was a trend that carried on through regarding what is happening in our province and which is having a major effect on our economy and on our opportunities, specifically in the agri space, to get economic growth, create jobs and get our products to markets.

Quite frankly, I want to actually call on all members of the House that we need to show strong leadership in this space. We cannot afford for our Agri businesses to lose ... [SOUND INTERRUPTED.]

BUSINESS SUSPENDED AT 16:57 AND RESUMED AT 17:03.

†The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, please continue. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.
I’ll pick up where I left off, and where I left off was talking about specifically the economy of this province and the threat that the economy of this province faces at the moment, and that was carried through, I think, in many of the speeches today.

What we need to do as the Parliament of this province is make sure that there is leadership, that there are cool and calm heads and that we manage our way through this process, because if we do not, the risk is far too high. I want to say that everybody needs to exert these leadership tendencies, and in this space I want to specifically ask the ANC to talk to some of their leaders who are not in the House.

An HON MEMBER: Why?

The MINISTER: Just go and have a look at the pamphlets that are being distributed …

†Mr H P GEYER: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: … [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order!

*Mr H P GEYER: Could you please protect the speaker over there? [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Come again, hon Geyer. What is your point of order?

Ms E PRINS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Prins! Order!

*Mr H P GEYER: Could you please protect the speaker against people who are openly having conversations over there?

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Geyer. Continue, Minister, please.

†The MINISTER: Whether it’s a pamphlet with Tony Ehrenreich’s face on it and what he is saying to incite activity in this province that is going to be detrimental to our economy or whether it’s officials who work for your provincial leader who are out on the ground in every single space, it’s exactly the same thing. Where you go, you see these individuals. There is also an activist that is pulled in via the ANC from the Northern Cape. On the 25th you find him in Hex River at 18:12, on the 21st you find the same individual in Worcester, on the 20th you find him in De Doorns and then in Ceres again, and everywhere you go you find these pamphlets. We need to make sure that there is political maturity and political leadership exercised on all points of this political terrain in this province, and we need to all make sure that that happens.

That message is to the members on that side of the House, because go and have a look at some of those officials who are paid for in Minister Fransman’s office, where they are supposed to be working with taxpayers’ money in the interests of all the people of this province. They are not in the office; they are out in the streets of these places where we are seeing these flare-ups, and these pamphlets are following wherever they go.
We need to see strong leadership in this space, and that party on that side of the House needs to take some of the leadership. [Interjeictions.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The MINISTER: No. I haven’t spoken about any individual within this space. It’s about the agricultural economy.

Mr Speaker, coming back to this actual debate, which is the political side or the policy side regarding our adjustments, the hon Brown spoke about our spending on health and education, which is statutory. Then she started to speak about other things. She started to speak about specifically the delivery of antiretroviral in the province and the history of antiretroviral in this province. I couldn’t help thinking of a time when I was actually sitting over there in the bench where the hon Uys is sitting … [Interjeictions. …

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order!

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Your time has expired.

†The MINISTER: … and the hon Carlisle said: “You should all hang your heads in shame.” I remember he even had a tear in his eye because he had just come back from the Red Cross Children’s Hospital, where the policy of this party – the ANC – was not to give those antiretroviral. [Interjeictions.] The hon Brown must be careful as to what she says and about the history.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I can’t remember.

†The MINISTER: She says that she cannot remember that. [Interjeictions.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, the hon Beerwinkel spoke about the poor, she spoke about the money that should be spent on the poor and then she spoke about the policing Commission of Inquiry, this inquiry into vigilantisms. What I can’t get is that she’s talking about the fact that it shouldn’t be spent on this inquiry but that, in actual fact, it should be spent on the poor. It’s interesting, because this inquiry goes around vigilantisms and it has been asked for by poor people. They said: Please come and investigate what is happening in and around where we live when it comes to crime and … [Interjeictions.] You should be supporting the money for this kind of project and not talking against it. [Interjeictions.]

When we talk about policy and this discussion regarding the politics we would also like to see – and I never heard of it today at all – the alternative. How else would you have spent this money? You keep on saying how things should be spent, but you don’t tell us exactly what you would have done. [Interjeictions.] Where is that alternative policy? [Interjeictions.] Show us where those alternative policies are already working in other parts of this country or the world and try to convince us to change our minds on where we are putting some of this money.

Then she speaks about changed behaviour. Let’s add that to liquor abuse and TB, which were also some of the issues that are brought up.
Changed behaviour is exactly where we have to go, because if you think about 18 years of democracy in this country, we need to make sure that we change behaviours.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Whose behaviour? Your behaviour?

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Brown! [Interjections.] Order, hon Brown! Order! Please refrain from running commentary.

†The MINISTER: We need to make sure that we change behaviours regarding taking our TB medicine, because if we don't change those behaviours we are not going to improve the lot of the poor people in this province. If we don't change behaviours regarding liquor abuse, we are not going to change the lot of poor people in this province. That is what we have to change.

However, I can assure you that we will make sure that we spend our money properly again, and that is why we are adjusting the budget. That is why we are shifting money in certain places so that we can make sure that we spend every single cent of this budget in the right place.

Coming to the hon Magaxa, let's have a look at what he says. He speaks about reversing the forces of apartheid. He speaks about bringing the change, but then he doesn't give any examples. He must actually explain in these debates when he wants to make these kinds of statements of what he wants to change, by showing us how policies of his component of the ANC are delivering outcomes and results in other provinces in this country, because that gives credibility to this kind of debate. That then starts to interact specifically on how we spend our money and where we spend our money in the best interests of the poor, whom he purports to represent.

The hon Tingwe speaks about our children and focuses specifically on education. She speaks about how education is the President's first, second and third choice. That's quite interesting, because what we need to understand in this country is how our spend in education equals outcomes on the other side. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The MINISTER: We all know, Mr Speaker, that in South Africa our spend per capita in education is one of the highest spends in Africa. However, the problem is that our outcomes are of the worst outcomes in the world, let alone in Africa. When we measure the outcome of education in this country, when we measure the quality of our education system, we sit at 140 out of 144. When we look at Maths and Science outcomes, we will see that we are 143 out of 144 in the world. When we look at Internet in schools, we will see that we are 111 out of 144 in the world. When we look at tertiary education enrolment, we are looking at 101 out of 144 in the world.

Surely those are the areas you, as the oversight in the House, should be focusing on, not on how many schools we are closing, because it's a management decision on how we are going to get a better outcome. This government is tasked with making tough decisions and tough choices on the amount of money we have and the best outcome we are going to get with that money.
Surely, instead of focusing on the poor performing schools to try to keep them open, why don’t we start focusing on those four areas – just those four – that the world rates us as the worst in the world and say: Let’s take those ones and have a look in this province to see whether we are making the right changes, the right choices and the right decisions on where we spend our money and what we do to change those outcomes. [Interjections.]

You will see that this government’s policies and this government’s spend is directly going into those spaces of making a difference for specifically the poor people in this province, so that we can give everybody that foundation of a good education that actually is the start for everything for the rest of their lives and changing it. I will not go any more into that education space, but that’s where your oversight should be focused.

The hon Haskin speaks about IT and opportunities and about the funding going into IT. Eventually we want to go specifically into broadband and we are looking at Internet in schools. We are 101 in the world out of 144. That’s what we want to achieve. That is why we are investing. We also want to achieve this internally, what the Auditor-General has been raising. That’s why the budget needs to go to these problems so that we invest in systems. We invest in the areas that need to see the change so that, hopefully, next year you will start to see a marked change and the Auditor-General will start to raise less issues in this space, and that is why we are committing this funding and why we want to see these changes.

The hon Skwatsha again speaks about health and education, and then he goes from social development to sport. Again I ask: Where is the alternative? What is the alternative you are trying to raise? If you want to see more money in sport, what would your suggestion be? Where would you like to see it taken away from? [Interjections.] Put that alternative budget on the table. Put those alternative policies on the table. Tell us where they are working well and convince us, but that’s what I don’t hear today. Those are the kinds of things that this debate is about. This debate is about your opportunity to put your policies on the table. Show us where they work.

However, what you do say is that the ANC at the moment are showing the world how they are cleaning up this place. That is what you say, but then straight away when you say, “We as the ANC are showing the world how we are changing this country and cleaning up this place”, I immediately think of – and it has been raised by my colleagues – Nkandla, Schabir Shaik, John Block, Tony Yengeni, the Arms Deal, the Malema roads contracts, the Limpopo textbooks, Chancellor House, and so we go on and on and on.

Look at our national Police Commissioner and the Interpol. Every single one of these things is embarrassing. They are embarrassments. We actually need you to take responsibility for those kinds of things. Before you start saying that you are making a big change and that you are cleaning things up, show us how you are actually cleaning those things up.

With that, I would like to, first of all, thank the team in Treasury that’s sitting here for the hard work that they have put into this process. We do know that we are going to be going into individual Votes now. I’m sure that we are going to hear in the individual Votes on how the different members of those portfolio committees take those changes.
We look forward to hearing what those changes are and whether they are all going to be accepted. So we move forward to the end of this budget process.

With that, Mr Speaker, I thank you very much.

Debate concluded.

Principle of Bill approved.

WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL ROAD TRAFFIC ADMINISTRATION BILL [B6B—2012] (Consideration and finalisation)

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, there are two reasons for this Bill. These are as follows: First of all, portions of the existing Acts – in fact, the whole of one of them – have been made redundant by various national Acts that have been passed. From an administration point of view, we need to clean that up, and I will deal with certain of the clauses that relate to that. Secondly, and more importantly, this is the beginning of a process of regulation that will touch most closely on road safety.

I would like to thank the standing committee for having considered this and for having suggested an amendment, which we have accepted, and for passing it through to the House. It’s a very short Bill. Most of the items in it are administrative in their nature and really of no great consequence, but two of the clauses are important. The one is clause 5, which deals with my right to appoint or authorise people to carry out inspections and particularly inspections of vehicle testing centres. We have sought to have this power returned to us from the national department, without much success, not that they have denied us the right. We eventually had to, in a sense, “statutorise” it ourselves. The second one is clause 8, and that’s the important one. It’s headed “Regulations”. The important part about this is that this is the beginning of a process of introducing regulations largely to do with road safety.

The first two are referred to in here and they will be regulations, first of all, on the use of the so-called blue lights prescriptions and siren prescriptions and in quite short order we will be bringing out a regulation in that regard. The second are the regulations with regard to the safety of cycles on public roads. The key to that is going to be the regulation requiring a distance of 1,5 m for any vehicle passing a bicycle. This is not without its controversial aspects, I do appreciate that. It is increasingly a fairly common regulation or law around the world. It goes hand in hand with us increasingly enforcing on cyclists the disciplines that are in the law already.

Once this Bill becomes law, as I hope it will, sir, then we will actually be bringing further amendments to the Act which will enable us to pass further regulation. One of the areas that we will be looking at is the equally controversial area of speed, about which I have no apologies, but that we are not dealing with at this stage in this Bill.
I just want to say to the House, sir, that the way that regulations come in is referred to in 8.4 of the Bill, and that is that the regulations must be published in the *Gazette*, inviting comment, for a period of four weeks and then, obviously, the framing of the regulations.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I don’t think I have anything further to add than that. I look forward to hearing the House’s views on this.

†Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA longs for separate development … [Interjections.] … and to cut the Western Cape off from the rest of South Africa. In this Bill it is clear that the Western Cape has no desire to be part of our unitary fatherland. No, it is looking for ways to be different. It wants to be better than the rest of the country.

An HON MEMBER: We are the best in the country.

Mr Z C STALI: This superiority and supremacy mindset of the DA is seen in this Bill. It is drenched in cheap political point scoring and opportunism. The DA really wants its own republic here. [Interjections.] Many of its supporters are, in fact, openly saying this on social networks. [Interjections.]

It is in this self-proclaimed territory of president supreme Zille that national and international leaders are not welcome. In fact, many of the DA supporters do not even want the national Parliament in Cape Town. They don’t want the Mother City as one of the capitals of our country.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chris Stali, I’m listening very carefully. Are you talking about the Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill?

An HON MEMBER: No!

†Mr Z C STALI: Yes. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I’m addressing the hon member. Are you on the same Bill? Please continue.

†Mr Z C STALI: They want it all for themselves and their own republic. They will be very happy if Parliament and the legislative capital disappear overnight.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: This is not a political debate. This is an important debate on a piece of legislation, and I really would ask you to ask the speaker to remain within the accepted confines of that.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. I’ve given him some latitude, that’s why I asked the question as to whether he is actually speaking on the Bill. I want to ask Mr Stali to get closer to the topic. Thank you. Please continue. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Please continue.

†Mr Z C STALI: In this right-wing republic, with many DA people still having a doompas mentality, there is no room for black leaders. [Interjections.] If the DA supporters have their way, the rules of the old Orange Free State will be put in place here. [Interjections.] Certain people … [Interjections.]
†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Mr Stali! [Interjections.] Minister Carlisle, I'll deal with that. Mr Stali, I have given you latitude and I want to ask you to get to the Bill now. Please continue. [Interjections.] Mr Stali, please continue. Hon Stali, are you done?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I think the hon speaker must be given a chance. They are not giving him a chance to speak. [Interjections.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will deal with that. I've given the hon Mr Stali the opportunity to finish his speech and to …

†Mr Z C STALI: Is there no freedom of speech in the House, Mr Deputy Speaker?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry? [Interjections.]

†Mr Z C STALI: Is there no freedom of speech here?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can say what's on your mind …

†Mr Z C STALI: So what is your problem?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: … but you must limit it to the topic under discussion. [Interjections.]

†Mr Z C STALI: In this apartheid and colonial mindset, those DA people are very glad that this Bill is before the House today. [Interjections.] They are happy and excited that the DA is putting refugees in their place. [Interjections.] They enjoy the fact that a deal is made that forgets the professional blacks. [Interjections.] It is they that cheer when it is said that blacks did not even stay …

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Mr Stali! Just give me a second. Mr Wiley, are you addressing the same point?

†Mr M G E WILEY: Yes. According to the Rules of Parliament, there has to be relevance to the debate. You've ruled on the matter and he is just showing contempt.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear your point. Mr Stali, I'll give you a last chance. I'm very lenient. Speak to the Bill, please. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Please continue. [Interjections.] Order! Mr Stali, please take the microphone and speak, otherwise take your seat. [Interjections.]

†Mr Z C STALI: Therefore the ANC cannot, and will not, support this legislation. [Applause.] It is open to challenge and cannot be taken seriously. It is strange that this party, who uses trucks with flashing blue disco lights, together with huge sound equipment on vehicles in the very same public streets, is worried about small blue lights and sirens on official vehicles. It is misleading and false to want to criminalise people in official vehicles but to condone, when it suits the DA, the fact that their own are using blaring sounds and flashing blue lights. I thank you.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, …[Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Rossouw and the hon Brown, please!
Mr E J VON BRANDIS: I'm almost speechless. The Western Cape Road Traffic Administration Bill of 2012, as amended, shows the ineffectiveness of the Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Act, 1998 (Act 12 of 1998). Twenty of 45 sections are not operational at the moment and were transferred to the National Road Traffic Act, 1996 (Act 93 of 1996).

The legislation gives the Minister of Transport and Public Works the necessary power to determine vehicle license fees, to approve inspections, as well as regulating the use of blue light sirens and the safety of cyclists.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I'm pleased to inform the House that the Bill was unanimously recommended by the proper standing committee. In other words, with the full consensus of the committee.

I thank hon Minister Carlisle and his department for their on-going commitment to improve road safety in the Western Cape. I specifically welcome the inclusion of the safety of cyclists in the legislation.

Therefore I support the Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Bill, as amended.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports this Bill.

We are particularly pleased to see the paragraph 8 provisions regarding the regulations, with specific mention about those which speak to protecting the people who are using pedal cycles. We hope that this is going to have some effect on Minister Winde, as he trains, to be sure that he is not going to get mugged again.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I must say that this is the most unusual legislative debate I've ever been in. The hon Stali, I assume, was in the standing committee which agreed unanimously that this was a good Bill. He then came here and gave us an outstanding sermon on apartheid. I have searched this piece of legislation from one end to the other to see if I could find any element of apartheid hiding away in it but I couldn't. I want to congratulate him that he was able to, sir.

I really want the ANC to have a hard think about this. Do they really want to vote against a Bill that is going to bring in protective measures for cyclists? Do they really want that, because I'm afraid that is going to go out into the wide world? Perhaps the ANC's Chief Whip may want to have a word with the ANC's transport spokesperson, because I think that it will be very unfortunate. [Interjections.]

I also want to make the point that, seeing that apartheid and all sorts of Bantustans and so on were brought in by the hon Stali, the vast bulk of people who use bicycles to get to work are black people.

An HON MEMBER: No!
The MINISTER: Yes, they are. [Interjections.] Yes, they are. If he and the ANC want to vote against their safety, so be it, sir. For the rest, I would ask the House to support this Bill. It’s important and necessary. Debate concluded.

Bill finalised (ANC dissenting).

WESTERN CAPE HEALTH FACILITY BOARDS AMENDMENT BILL [B7—2012]

(Consideration and finalisation)

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the opportunity. Maybe it will be a bit easier with this one.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Carlisle, order! Order!

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the opportunity to speak on the Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill. Health facility boards play a very important role to improve the working conditions at our health facilities.

This Bill will ease the work of members and will make the management of financial records easier. The Bill came about at the request of the Auditor-General, requesting that its office be relieved of the responsibility in respect of health facility boards.

The amendments to the Western Cape Health Facility Boards Act, 2001, will assist to regulate the matter in which the provincial Department of Health monitors the financial affairs of health facility boards and provide a procedure to ensure sound financial governance.

At present, the health facility boards are bound to compile financial statements in the form of audited financial reports, at significant cost for the facility boards, whose budgets are already under pressure.

However, the amendments will simplify the reporting framework for compliance, and at the end of the line relieve the Auditor-General of its auditing responsibility in respect of health facility boards.

To date, facility boards had to submit year-end financial statements to the Head of the Department and the Auditor-General. The amendments provide that the reporting framework of the statements is determined by the Minister, in consultation with the provincial Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism.

The proposed amendments will bring about cost savings for the facility boards and for the department. At present, 1% of the auditing costs are carried by the facility boards and the balance is paid by Treasury. However, anticipating that National Treasury is planning to withdraw their payment, the amendments will be able to appoint industry auditors and negotiate their auditing fees, which will result in more cost-effective audits.
The Minister will have the authority to exempt smaller health facility boards from being audited, under certain conditions, and to account for their finances using a simplified framework.

I'm satisfied that the provisions of the Bill fall within the legislative competence of the province. Legal Services at the Department of the Premier have been consulted, as well as the health facility boards themselves. None of the facility boards raised objections to the proposed amendments.

As for financial complications, the Department of Health will administer and carry the process costs of implementing the amendment legislation. There are no auditing cost implications for the department as all auditing costs will be paid for by the respective health facility boards.

This new legislation will take effect from 1 April 2013 in order to minimise the audit costs for the current financial year. I so move.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC supports the Bill.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank for that very lengthy speech, Mr Skwatsha. The next speaker has withdrawn.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ID supports the Western Cape Health Facility Boards Amendment Bill.

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, after due discussion and consideration in the standing ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, after due discussion and consideration in the standing committee we support this legislation.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Botha, an opportunity to reply?

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I have nothing to add. Thank you for the support.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! That concludes the debate on this order. The Bill will be sent to the Premier for assent.

Debate concluded.

Bill finalised.

The House adjourned at 17:35.
INTERPELLATIONS,

QUESTIONS AND REPLIES
INTERPELLATIONS

GIPTN: Action taken to avoid further underspending in current financial year

†1. Mr Z C Stali to ask Mr R V Carlisle, Minister of Transport and Public Works:

What action will be taken by him and his department in order to speed up the process of negotiation for the George Integrated Public Transport Network (GIPTN) to avoid further underspending in the current financial year?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank the hon Stali. I'm very impressed with the interest and enthusiasm the hon member has shown as the shadow Minister of Transport. I really am. He asked about the important area of the George Integrated Public Transport Network and asked what action will be taken to avoid further underspending in the current financial year. I'm going to deal with that, hon Stali, but I also want to deal broadly with the whole financial aspect, which is not without its challenges.

The negotiation process for the George Integrated Public Transport Network has made significant progress in this financial year. The vehicle operating contract continues to be negotiated and a preliminary agreement has been reached regarding the majority of operating costs.

Industry members have also completed site visits to Cape Town and Johannesburg to see MyCiTi and Rea Vaya to understand the scope of operations, meet with company directors, meet with taxi industry members, understand key issues in the contract negotiations and understand the relationship between government and the operating companies.

Negotiations for the implementation of the George Integrated Public Transport Network have thus been advancing. Delays in negotiations and underspending, as the hon member asked, in the current financial year have been driven by two factors, namely, firstly, there is uncertainty regarding the funding application for the George Integrated Public Transport Network by the National Treasury through the Public Transport Infrastructure and Systems Grant (PTISG). Certainly regarding the quantum of this funding is critical for progressing with negotiations, because the system’s design, the vehicles, the infrastructure, the operated business model and the industry compensation all depend on the level of funding.

Roll-out of the full system, therefore, requires this form of national funding in addition to the support provided by the province. Applications for national funding have been made and there is a meeting this week, I think, but funding has not yet been secured. The outcome of the most recent application will only be deliberated on in November 2012.

Secondly, negotiations with the minibus taxi industry continue to be complex and issues such as compensation principles and revisiting certain items in terms of the NLTA and other legislation require significant time and work.

†Mr Z C STALI: Thank you very much, MEC, for the response.
I’m very interested in the last issue that you’ve mentioned, because the Department of Transport and Public Works has taken a long time to complete the negotiations regarding the George Integrated Public Transport Network and we are not getting appropriate answers from the standing committee reports as to what the real issues are behind the delay. Given the massive underspending thus far, one is concerned that we may experience the same situation this time as we have been told the same thing for the entire year.

We feel that there are many things, MEC, that you are not informed of. As we have just said, we have a particular interest in this issue. The MEC is far removed from the issues transpiring on the ground. We want to know whether the GMS Memorandum signed by the parties was breached by the department and whether the letters that were signed by the MEC contradicted the implementation of the GMS. The role of the business advisor to the CGLU Business Entity, referring to the GMS Business Trust and registration of the CGLU directors at Cipro, needs to be explained to us. We will really appreciate it. GMS experienced financial discrepancies and irregularities. We would really appreciate it if you could also clarify that part to us. Government officials interfered ...

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, Mr Stali! Your time has expired.

†Mr Z C STALI: Can I just finish this one?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

†Mr Z C STALI: Government officials interfered in the GMS and in taxi associations. I will continue with the list, MEC.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC TRANSPORT: Yes, it’s actually a short time for quite a complex subject, Mr Deputy Speaker, but let me deal immediately with the issues raised by the hon member. I will finish the reply later on.

It has taken a very long time. There is no question about that. It would be incorrect to say that I have not been involved on the ground. I have been involved on the ground, including having to request my hon partners from the taxi industry not to kill me and that I will come back to haunt them if they do. I have been very involved on the ground. I do know the ground situation and I do know the key personalities, particularly from Uncedo. It has taken a long time, because we are dealing here with an absolutely vital aspect of public transport, not just for George but for the whole country.

I will tell the hon member that there are two things. One is that the taxi industry or elements within the taxi industry are very dubious about the whole proposal and asked many questions. The other problem is that the management in the taxi industry up there changes very often. You arrive at an agreement with these people and then the next week another executive appears and then you have to start all over again. It therefore does take a long time.

Let’s just come to the critical thing. Is the model correct? Is the national transport framework correct? Is it actually so that we should try to make taxis disappear at very high cost to the taxpayer and replace them with buses of various sizes? Is it correct that we should compel taxis to become involved in the scheme?
These are very important and very difficult questions. Let me say this to the hon member, from my point of view.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, please finish off. Your time has expired.

†The MINISTER: Yes, I'll just finish this point. I do not believe compulsion should come into this, and I'm troubled by that compulsion. I believe it should be up to the taxi owner and operator to decide whether he comes in or whether he doesn’t come in. I will come back to the other issues.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the R5 million underspending on the George Integrated Public Transport Network is a sensitive aspect that must not be dealt with lightly.

The success of the project to establish a public transport system that is safe, reliable, accessible and affordable will to a large extent depend on the buying-in of and negotiations between all the various role players. It is important to bear in mind that the specific project will be a flagship agreement between the national Department of Transport, the provincial Department of Transport and Public Works, the Municipality of George and the taxi and bus owners of George to realise the public transport system for rural areas.

The special authorisation obtained by the national government for these purposes must specifically ensure that the necessary empowerment of the present taxi and bus owners takes place because this is a deviation from the usual tender procedures.

Negotiations should therefore occur in a sensitive manner to ensure that everybody is included. Mr Speaker, the hon Minister Carlisle already said in his budget speech of 2012 that the implementation of the George Integrated Public Transport Network will be subject to negotiations. The 12-year contract period, however, is not debatable. The resulting temporary underspending the previous financial year should therefore rather be seen as a risk that is being carefully managed and not as a problem in itself.

Negotiations at all levels, including the national Department of Transport, must ensure that the George Integrated Public Transport Network does realise as an affordable, safe, reliable and accessible public transport system for the greater George area. Only the inclusion of all the interest groups will ensure that competitive taxis do not undermine the affordability or the accessibility and regular scheduling of the whole system.

The success of the project will have an impact on all rural areas, after which this approach to public transport will have to be rolled out, if feasible and successful. [Time expired.]

†Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I have a number of issues that I think are the main cause of the delay. Hon Minister, if you are not aware of these things, it is very important that you take note of them. If you are aware of these problems then something must be done to clarify this matter.
Another question that I should like to ask is whether the Minister can tell us about the alleged fraudulent conduct in the registration of the first CGLU director at Cipro and the allocation of shares. There are also various affidavits of contradictions deriving from the opposing submissions. The CGLU company is currently functioning illegitimately. Now an alarming concern has been raised regarding the shareholding in the CGLU company. Can you also tell us what the involvement of the legal firm in Cape Town was in the drafting of the CGLU company articles.

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Excuse me, the involvement of whom?

†Mr Z C STALI: What was the involvement of the legal firm in Cape Town in the drafting of the CGLU company articles? Also, what was the involvement of this company called Aurecon and its consultants in the GMS process?

Also, the GMS transport service contract was drafted unilaterally and there is a need for a forensic audit into the GMS finances, and the GMS Business Trust in particular, MEC. I am sure you will also agree with me on that. There was also a violation of the intended AGM of the CGLU directors in terms of the company articles. [Time expired.]

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I just want to finish off my reply to one of the earlier questions that the hon member asked me. The role of the business adviser is that they need somebody to advise them and we paid for that somebody. The law requires that they have a business adviser so that they can be well-informed about the complex accounting – and it is very complex accounting. I have to say to the hon Stali that the questions he is asking me sound surprisingly close to those put to me at my last meeting with these directors. Therefore, if you are going to convey this back to them, please say to them, “I’m giving you the same answers that the Minister gave me as well as you when you came to see him at his office.”

The allocation of shares, as the hon member knows, goes in terms of the operating licences and the route evaluation, which is then obviously checked by the business adviser and obviously is done in conjunction with the applying shareholder. The CGLU is not functioning illegally. It is functioning absolutely legally and regularly, and everything is done according to the law. In fact, the law is so damned complex that that in itself is one of the main causes of the hold-up.

There are no financial discrepancies. There is no money in the George mobility thing; there is money in the transport budgets, which is carried over. But as the hon member now knows, that is mainly routed through the George Municipality, because since the new Act came into being it is in effect the George Municipality, which is running this project. We assist them and we finance them.

I finally want to say that nothing was drafted unilaterally. Nothing whatsoever – my god, I wish we could! I also want to say this to the hon Stali, and I’ve said this to the honourable members of the board: I will not permit this thing to go forward – even if we have to write off the expenditure – if it is my feeling at the end of the day that the financial position of the members of the taxi industry could be jeopardised by this scheme going ahead. In that case I would actually put a stop to it. [Time expired.]
Compliance with requirements for Western Cape school closures

*2. Ms C Labuschagne to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:

Whether, in respect of the period 2002 to 2009, all the legal and administrative requirements regarding the process of the closure of schools in the Western Cape were complied with?

Interpellation 2 withdrawn.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Effect of Chapman’s Peak slip failure

*1. Mr E J von Brandis to ask Mr R V Carlisle, Minister of Transport and Public Works:

What is the impact of the recent landslides at the Chapmans Peak quarry on the (a) costs and (b) duration of the project?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon Von Brandis for asking the question. The reply is as follows:

1. (a) The cost to remedy the recent slip failure can only be determined after geotechnical investigations are complete, but the initial estimated cost is of the order of R1 million to R2 million. This is not for our account and the costs will be fully paid by the contractor; and

(b) the remedial work is not expected to delay the construction of the plaza, which is due for completion in the middle of 2013; hopefully a little bit before that.

Monitoring obligations of spheres of government regarding air pollution by fish factories

*2. Mr M C Walters to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

(a) What are the obligations of the respective spheres of government (i) nationally, (ii) provincially and (iii) locally in respect of the monitoring of air pollution by fish factories, (b) how many cases of air pollution by fish factories were identified in the Western Cape during the past two years and (c) what punitive measures have been applied by the respective spheres of government in cases where fish factories were contributing to air pollution?

†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank the hon member Walters for his question. The answer is as follows:
2. (a) (i) The National Department of Environmental Affairs

The National Department of Environmental Affairs has an obligation to ensure that provinces and local municipalities apply thorough air-quality monitoring. The National Department of Environmental Affairs had a Human Health Risk Assessment study done and completed in the St Helena Bay area.

(ii) Provincial Department of Environmental Affairs

According to the National Environmental Management: Air Quality Act (Act 39 of 2004) the National Framework should determine national standards for provinces to monitor for environment friendly air quality as well as the performance of municipalities regarding the implementation of the Act.

(iii) Local: District, Local and Metropolitan Municipalities

According to the Air Quality Act (Act 39 of 2004) the National Framework must determine national standards for municipalities to monitor:

- Environment-friendly air quality, and
- Localised, non-localised and mobile-source emissions.

In this regard the West Coast District Municipality in that area as well as the metropolitan municipality, i.e. the City of Cape Town, should issue atmospheric emission licences to fish factories that manufacture fish meal in their areas of authority.

The national Department of Environmental Affairs and the provincial Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning introduced environment-friendly air-quality monitoring in the area on 28 March 2011. An environment-friendly air-quality monitoring station was erected in the St Helena Bay area to monitor hydrogen sulphide. The environment-friendly air-quality monitoring station was erected in accordance with the requirements of the South African National Accreditation System (SANAS) TR0702. This intervention forms part of an ongoing effort to monitor environment-friendly air quality in these areas.

(b) The West Coast District Municipality received 230 complaints from the community in the St Helena Bay area and the Overberg District Municipality received three complaints from the community in the Gans Bay area.

(c) Various investigations were launched in reaction to these complaints. The West Coast Municipality: St Helena Bay introduced the following plan of action to address complaints with regard to the fishing industry in the St Helena Bay area.
I can read the activities as well as the dates out to you or I can hand it in, Mr Speaker. It will take a long time. They have the action plans and they are looking at the air quality. It’s important to us to get it right. Thank you.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is the hon member Walters satisfied that it is tabled?

*Mr M C WALTERS: I’m satisfied.

*Cycling tracks in Western Cape

*3. Ms A J du Toit Marais to ask Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

What is the situation with regard to cycling tracks in the Western Cape?

*The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank the hon member Marais for the question. The answer is as follows:

3. The Velodrome in Bellville is the only indoor cycle track in the Western Cape. The track is the property of the Cape Town Municipality and falls under the city’s jurisdiction. According to information supplied to me the track will be leased to a private developer, Devmet Property Developments (Pty) Ltd, for a period of 30 years as part of the development of the Velodrome site and surrounding area by the developer. As part of the agreement, the developer will be responsible for the upgrading, maintenance and operation of the facility.

The agreement requires Devmet to ensure that all sport clubs, schools and community groups who use the facility are ensured of reasonable and affordable access to such facilities during the term of lease.

The city has advised the sport bodies who use the Velodrome that its use will be interrupted during the construction period. The cycling body was given the required three-months’ notice required to suspend the agreement/contract.

According to information supplied to me, there are also cycling tracks in the Paarl, Worcester and Vygieskraal vicinity.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, with regard to the cycling tracks, what amount of safety is there for the cyclists?

†The MINISTER: Thank you, hon Skwatsha, I think this is a very important function, given the speed at which people cycle on these indoor cycling tracks. The speed is dramatic, but all the sport federations have their own safety standards and they comply with the safety standards within the jurisdiction of the Cape Town Municipality. However, if the hon member has any specific indications of safety requirements that are not met at these facilities that I visit personally to inspect, or any suggestions, I would be happy to look into it.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Skwatsha, do you have another follow-up question? I suspect you will refer to the cycling track on the way to Cape Town!
Mr M Skwatsha: Yes. If you don’t belong to a sporting club where there should be safety standards, what happens if even your bodyguard cannot help you? [Laughter.]

The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, there is obviously humour in the air and I appreciate the humour from hon member Skwatsha on this particular matter!

There is seriousness in this context, but there is also joy in this context. The seriousness of this matter is that we have built specific cycling lanes in the Western Cape to encourage alternative lifestyles and encouraging people to cycle to work to leave a legacy in terms of our Green Economy.

Minister Winde is obviously a leading champion in this regard and it is very unfortunate that while he was campaigning vigorously for the Green Economy that somebody thought it wise, in the presence of his bodyguard, to try to attack him.

The joyful part is that we in the House know the calibre and character and the content of hon member Winde, and we are all happy that within the space of 60 minutes, through his computer network in the office on laptop and on the cell phone of his staff in his Ministry, he was able to track the phone and within an hour he achieved what many law enforcement agencies cannot do. We recommend that Minister Winde should be considered for a senior position in the National Assembly – and we have in mind the Minister of Police in the National Assembly! [Interjections.]

Closure of 27 schools in Western Cape

Ms M Tingwe to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:

(a) (i) How many of the reasons given for the closure of the 27 schools in the Western Cape have been found to be flawed and (ii) what were these reasons in each case and (b) (i) how many of the placement plans made for the 27 schools have been found to be flawed and (ii) what were the reasons in each case?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, the reply is as follows:

4. (a) (i) Please note that 27 schools in the Western Cape were recommended to me by the Western Cape Education Department for possible closure at the end of the 2012 school year and, after complying with the relevant legislative requirements, I made a decision to close 20 of these schools. None of the reasons given for the closure of the 20 schools was found to be flawed.

(ii) Not applicable.

(b) (i) Placement plans could be finalised only after the relevant decisions were announced on 16 October 2012. None of the finalised placement plans for the 20 schools that are closing is flawed.

(ii) Not applicable.
†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: MEC Grant, if the motivation for leaving the seven schools out of the 27 that you wanted to close was correct, why then were you not consistent in the other 20 that you did not close?

†The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the answer to that is simply that I looked at the case of every school on its own merits.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, why then were the reasons for the closure of the 27 schools all the same, mostly for dwindling numbers, better education, and in the best interests of the child, but yet after that you decided that in seven of them those criteria don’t work, but in the 20 they do work?

†The MINISTER: Deputy Speaker, I looked at each school. If the hon member would like to consult the statement of 16 October she will see that there were specific reasons given for the schools that I did not close, where I felt that the department needed to review those schools. Each one was considered on its own merits.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Just as an aside, Mr Deputy Speaker, you may have noticed that I’m quite aware of what is happening with the closure of the schools from my input.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Question.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The MEC doesn’t know; that’s the problem.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It’s coming, MEC Botha.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Stick to that.

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: MEC Grant, are you not undermining the right and intelligence of parents to decide which are the best schools to send their children to, instead of you deciding to send a child to a school just across the road? This is what was reported about Elsie Zeeman in Paarl in yesterday’s Cape Argus.

†The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, we will work with the learners affected and their parents to see what can be done. Obviously we’re going to recommend to the parents what we think is in their best interest, given the quality of the receiving school. However, if the parents don’t want to send their child to that school, then, obviously, they must make alternative arrangements.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: This confuses me. The MEC said that he was closing the schools because he had better schools for these children, where they would have better education.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question? Hon Minister, did you get the question?

†The MINISTER: Yes, I understand that and I took that into account very carefully in terms of the 20 schools that I did close. As far as I’m concerned, the receiving schools nominated to me by the department are of a better quality than those schools that were closed.

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Not according to ...
*5. Mr P Uys to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

(a) Why did he stop the intervention in the Municipality of Swellendam and (b) in terms of what power did he act when he stopped the intervention?

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, the answer is as follows:

5. I accept that the question refers to the recent intervention in the Swellendam Municipality in terms of section 139(1) of the Constitution where the Provincial Executive Authority extended the appointment of the – at that stage – acting municipal manager on a month-to-month basis to a maximum of three months.

(a) The intervention was stopped by the Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs and not by me.

(b) I did not stop the intervention. The national Minister used the power bestowed on him in terms of section 139(2)(b) of the Constitution to stop the intervention.

*Mr P UYS: May I ask the MEC: Why did you not first contact the Minister before taking the section 139 route? He knows it is a very big intervention and one doesn’t use it lightly, but he nevertheless decided to ignore the Minister.

*The MINISTER: Well, Mr Deputy Speaker, to be quite honest, you don’t ignore anything because there is nothing at national level. [Interjections.]

*Mr P UYS: There are going to be court cases.

*The MINISTER: Then let them come. [Interjections.]

*Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I must object to the hon Minister, in his arrogance, insulting the national Minister. [Interjections.] May I ask, Mr Deputy Speaker ...

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: Is it correct, in terms of procedure, for the hon member to use his turn for questions to be aggrieved?

*Mr P UYS: Just sit down, man. It is now the Deputy Speaker’s turn.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, I will find out.

*Mr P UYS: It is now the Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Uys, you may ask the question. Just get to the question, please.
Mr P UYS: But I have asked the question. I was beginning to ask it when the point of order was raised. Mr Deputy Speaker, may I ask who was hon Bredell’s favourite candidate seeing that Mr Nel is being investigated by the Special Investigations Unit (SIU) and Scopa?

An HON MEMBER: Don’t stutter so much, man. Speak nicely.

Mr P UYS: You shut up.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me explain myself: I am not ashamed of what I have said and I will repeat it. We don’t have a national government, and neither at provincial government level.

There hasn’t been one Minmec meeting – and hon Uys can go and draw the minutes – at which more than three MEC’s were present. And the minutes have also been tampered with. I did on occasion object that we did not really have a quorum but then at the next meeting two names were added. I put this in writing to the national Minister that I regard this as fraud. I therefore have lists and lists of examples that I can quote to you.

I have been trying to see the national Minister for the past six months, but you can’t get an appointment with his office and you don’t know who to talk to. [Interjections.] So, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is very difficult to talk to the national Minister of Local Government in his office ... [Interjections.] ... and the ANC, who is making such a noise on the other side of the House, knows it.

And best of all is: they know it because when I go to a Minmec meeting they admit it. Mr Deputy Speaker, what is happening is that these types of things are very traumatic to the people of the Western Cape and we must focus on service delivery. [Interjections.]

†Mr M OZINSKY: And they say we’re the culprits.

*The MINISTER: This is why we go out of our way to build relationships and to make these things work.

*Mr P C MCKENZIE: But you went to court.

*The MINISTER: You see, Mr Deputy Speaker, Swellendam’s problems did not start yesterday and we’re not hiding it.

*Mr P UYS: You do, you do just what you like.

*The MINISTER: I requested the investigation, I persuaded Cabinet to ask the President ... [Interjections.] ... for the SIU investigation.

†Mr M OZINSKY: After we had made a lot of noise and pressured you on it.

*The MINISTER: No, nonsense, nonsense.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!
The MINISTER: What happened then in this process, and it’s an ongoing process, was that in the end I was saddled with a municipality where, although there was a lot of politicking among parties – and we admit it – service delivery could suffer. [Interjections.]

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Listen here, that’s what you must admit for a change.

An HON MEMBER: Precisely!

*Ms E PRINS: That is why they take it in.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon Prins and hon McKenzie!

*Mr P C MCKENZIE: No, it’s not me. It’s him.

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can’t see the rest. I only see hon Prins, so please, order!

*Mr P C MCKENZIE: It’s not me, it’s him.

*The MINISTER: What I did then, when the municipality came to a point where they no longer had an executive authority, was to take the Constitution and to say they no longer had an MM. Besides, this was after I had warned them and after I had asked all three political parties to give me two names that they would find acceptable as caretakers, but everything was ignored. Then it came to the point where the contract expired.

To me it was logical to continue on a month-to-month basis with the person who was there at the moment. This just makes logical sense until we have sorted out the politics. This is what I did.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Without advertising it.

*The MINISTER: After 28 days, after the national Minister had met with the ANC component of Swellendam, ...

*Mr P C MCKENZIE: That’s fine.

*The MINISTER: ... he decided not to allow it. It is a legal requirement, he has to submit his report after 28 days.

Then, Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon Minister was prepared to see me. I flew to Johannesburg to see him together with his legal advisers. [Interjections.]

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! There is too much talking from the floor.

*The MINISTER: It’s because they don’t have service delivery at heart, Mr Deputy Speaker.

*Mr P C MCKENZIE: Where is your heart?

An HON MEMBER: They don’t have hearts.
*The MINISTER: We then saw the national minister and agreed on the way ahead. When we were leaving he asked me if I would draw up the agreement, which we did. After waiting another four weeks, he hadn’t responded to it. In the meantime we were in and out of court.

And this is how Swellendam is plodding along. Mr Deputy Speaker, we hope to have the court’s verdict on Tuesday and I really want to appeal to the ANC: Whoever wins the court case, democracy is based on the party with the most votes in a council. Let us give that council the right to manage itself.

It is an independent spree of government, Mr Deputy speaker. Let us – after the verdict on Tuesday – nobody knows what it is going to be – give that council the right to govern through the party with the most votes. Then we can get Swellendam out the service delivery situation and the danger it which it finds itself, very quickly.

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Deputy Speaker, is it not true that the local government MEC’s arrogance and attitude is very harmful to co-operative governance in the province and in the country, which is a constitutional obligation?

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Was it addressed to the Minister?

†The MINISTER: The answer to that, Mr Deputy Speaker, is no.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Ms Brown!

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I’m sorry.

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member wants to speak.

*Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to ask a question: why is the MEC trying to create the impression that the Minister doesn’t want to talk to him? The next minute the Minister is meeting with him and they come to an agreement, and he says the Minister doesn’t want to meet.

†Mr Deputy Speaker, they appointed a municipal manager on 8 October. Why is the MEC not accepting the council decision? [Interjections.]

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: How many questions may one ask during your turn to speak? He asked three questions. [Interjections.] I know the hon member has a problem expressing himself, but can we get only one question?

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Botha! Hon Bredell, please answer the question.
*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I don’t know what the question is any more, what with this racket going on.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we also handled these issues last week during the interpellations. I don’t know what the hon Uys is trying to do, because he knows the answers. He knows that the answer is very simple. We do not recognise that first council meeting. [Interjections.] No, there is no undermining. [Interjections.] For somebody who was an MEC for Local Government, the hon Uys ought to know precisely what the process is. The best of all was that the fact that the ANC requested that meeting again, means that the ANC admits that the first one was invalid. [Interjections.] This is exactly what happened.

Swellendam Municipality: action pursuant to progress report of Special Investigating Unit

*6. Mr P Uys to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Whether he is planning to take any action pursuant to the progress report of the special investigating unit with regard to the Swellendam Municipality; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, the answer is as follows:

6. I do not intend to act in reaction to the progress report of the Special Investigations Unit regarding the Swellendam Municipality. The Special Investigations Unit – and now you must listen carefully, Mr Deputy Speaker – confirmed that the relevant report was made public unlawfully and that this disclosure is currently being investigated.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, may I ask the MEC whether he is in possession of this report?

*The MINISTER: I got hold of the report through the legal process that was served. I’m standing by my point of view. I talked to the SIU about this because I am very concerned that the ANC has dropped to a level where they want to involve independent bodies in politicking. The SIU is busy with their internal investigation. They have already charged the person about the report and it was not he who leaked it. It was on a USB stick that he gave to an official at the municipality. The official had to download specific information, but instead he downloaded everything. It was therefore obtained unlawfully. We cannot act against people who obtain information unlawfully.

I have already met with the police at the highest level. Most of the investigations have been finalised. I am now going to ask for a meeting with the SIU, but it is of critical importance that the SIU and other organisations similar to the SIU be managed independently of politics.
It is actually shocking that we have descended to a level where we want to reveal such information and trample on other people’s lives while there is no evidence so far.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, may I ask the MEC whether he trusts the reports of the Special Investigations Unit, or is he to some extent trying cast suspicion on them?

*The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, from day one I have said in this House that I prefer to work with die SIU because I see them as being independent. It is important for us to protect the independence of the SIU. I trust a final report one hundred percent but I am not going to trample on people’s lives while all the facts are not on the table, because then I am going to be sued.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, can the MEC explain to us why he calls it a preliminary report? It is a progress report of the Special Investigations Unit. If he says it is secret, what is secret about it? [Interjections.] You are closing up right here.

*The MINISTER: This is very interesting ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, what the hon Uys must realise, when the reports of the SIU on Oudtshoorn were leaked in the same way, it delayed the investigation by almost three years. [Interjections.] The whole investigation had to be repeated. I can’t afford that. We want to get the guilty people out of the system – the sooner, the better. This is why I am now asking for a meeting with the Head of the SIU. I hope we get it as soon as possible so that we can finalise these matters. We cannot start all over again. I think it is scandalous to throw unlawful and preliminary reports into the public domain as if they are factually correct.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it’s an old thing – chase the whistle-blower, not the facts. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

*Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the point is that if it says in the report that the mayor is signing cheques, why doesn’t the MEC stop it? It’s illegal.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: Is it acceptable that the hon member always first make a statement before he asks a question?

*The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Botha, the Rules stipulate that you must ask a question. I agree with you that the hon member is taking a gap, but he must ask a question. I rule that the hon minister may answer.
The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, I stand by my answer. We will act as soon as we get a complete report because according to the SIU it is at the moment scarcely worth the paper it is written on. It is more of a charge sheet that must be investigated than a progress report. I spoke to the SIU in the Western Cape and I am not prepared to act on that type of report.

Hydraulic fracturing to extract shale gas: details

7. Mr J J Visser to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

(a) How does hydraulic fracturing to extract shale gas affect the Western Cape and (b) in what areas within the boundaries of the province, is research into hydro-fracking or commercial extraction of shale gas by making use of hydro-fracking envisaged?

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, I thank the hon Visser for the question. The answer is as follows:

7. (a) There are various scientific reports and other literature that deal with the positive and negative implications of shale-gas hydraulic fracturing and gas withdrawal. This technology will, however, be new in South Africa and there is little information available that is relevant to our country.

Some of the information that specifically applies to the Western Cape includes the Environmental Management Plan programme submitted by Shell South Africa in terms of the Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act and the national report compiled by the Department of Mineral Resources and released on 12 September 2012. In the Western Cape an intra-authority task team compiled an interim report on the potential opportunities and risks for the Western Cape associated with shale gas development— including hydraulic fracturing. This report will be submitted to the Cabinet of the Western Cape government shortly.

At present there are various doubts and gaps in the information regarding certain important issues/implications –positive and/or negative – including:

- base-line information in connection with the environment that will be impacted;
- water supply and treatment of waste water;
- surface and groundwater pollution;
- air pollution;
- ecological impacts;
- socio-economic implications;
- culture-historical impacts;
- transport and infrastructure implications; and
- institutional implications.
(b) The geographical extent of the shale rock formations in the Western Cape that are regarded as suitable for gas exploration extends over the area covered by the Central Karoo District Municipality.

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask the hon Minister whether he is aware that the owners of the Kudu gas field has now decided to begin to effectively develop this gas field.

*The MINISTER: No, I am not aware of it.

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to know whether the Minister doesn’t think that the development of this gas field in the sea has as big a potential for pollution as the shale-gas development in the Karoo areas.

*The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think we can go into this subject extensively. It is a very interesting subject. It is a fact that gas is going to play a very important role in the Western Cape energy source in future. The question is: where is this gas going to come from?

Of course many studies still have to be done. Of course we don’t want to pollute the coast line, but if they find a big gas resource in Mozambique and the government there decides to develop it, who are we not to buy it? So, you can bring in gas, you can extend Mossgas in Mossel Bay, you can expand the plants and it could be very beneficial to us.

We are saying that if you look at prospecting in the Karoo, you should do it as a research project. You must have base-line studies in place and all we ask is responsible management.

*Mr J J VISSER: I want to ask if the Minister would agree with me that the Western Cape could profit much more from the development of the Kudu gas field than from shale fracking in the Karoo?

*The MINISTER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am not going to give an opinion on that before I have all the facts; we are busy collecting and collating all this information. I can assure the hon member that we have an energy task team in the Western Cape with best brains in it to help work out the best balances for us and they are looking at different options.

*Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Minister if he will do research for us to see what benefits the Kudu field development could have for us?

*The MINISTER: We will do the research.

\textit{Water sustainability and conservation}

†8. Mr R B Lentit to ask Mr H G van Rensburg, Minister of Agriculture:

What are the plans of his department with regard to water sustainability and conservation?
Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, unfortunately Mr Van Rensburg cannot be here. He asked that the question stand over.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 8 will stand over.

8. Question stands over.
Economic impact of bulk wine exports

*1. Mr E J von Brandis to ask Mr A R Winde, Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:

What is the economic impact of bulk wine exports on the economy of the Western Cape?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, in response, let me say that it would be difficult to state the impact of bulk wine exporting on the Western Cape economy. The available data relates only to the quantity of exported wine, as well as proportions of bottled and bulk wine respectively. The economic impact of job losses due to the loss of packaging – that’s bottling – demand in South Africa, the loss of media branding work and the opportunities still need to be investigated. However, the figures are unequivocal.

The share of bulk wine exports in relation to bottled wine has been on the increase for a number of years. It is important for South Africa to stay competitive, or we will also lose jobs on farms. The trend of bulk wine export is a structural change and not unique to South Africa. In 2009, 39% of exports were accounted for in bulk; in 2010 the number increased to 40%; in 2011 the number grew to 49%; and to date the increase stands at 56%.

Sue Birch of Wines of South Africa estimates that the movement in the past two years has been about 15% of total exports, which equates to about 56 million litres per annum. Wines of South Africa does not have accurate information on values, but their estimates are based on a R10 per litre rationale, therefore the loss of gross income is estimated to have been R560 million per annum for the last two years. Wines of South Africa further estimates, based on figures from the South African Wine Industry Trust, that for every 10 million litres exported in bulk rather than in bottles 107 direct jobs are lost. This translates to about 600 jobs.

The figures quoted above are based on research from the commercial and production unit and its delivery of finished products to the customer, which includes the following elements: glass manufacturing from the Cape Town region; bottling itself; the aluminium roll and pilfer-proof tops; and corrugated cartons, assuming that a new corrugated plant is to be set up to cover the necessary capacity.

In conclusion, Mr Speaker, even though bulk wine exporting may pose a threat to certain industries, such as the packaging industry, the labelling industry, etc, it has been proven that this trend is creating and sustaining direct jobs in the wine industry.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, the South African wine industry is losing 107 job opportunities for every 10 million litres of wine being exported in bulk. South Africa exported about 350 million litres of wine last year ... [Interjections.] ... of which between 20% and 30% was in bulk.
The wine industry in South Africa produces about 800 million litres of wine yearly, which constitutes 12.5% of the total alcohol market in South Africa, and of which 49% is exported and 44% is used locally. In the Western Cape the wine industry is responsible for 8.8% of employment, compared with 2.2% at national level. The wine export market dropped by 8% in 2011. In the same period until the end of August 2011, bulk export of wine increased by 26% compared with the export of packaged and bottled products, which showed a decline of 9.2%.

Mr Speaker, bulk exports are not a new trend, but may mean a real economic effect for the Western Cape. It is important that as much added value to products takes place locally as possible, to contribute to our gross domestic production and to stimulate economic growth, as well as job creation. It is, however, a matter of concern that imports by the United Kingdom, the largest importer of South African wine, showed a decline of 2.22%, in January 2012.

Although recent figures show an increase of 7.4% in exports and a 4.3% increase in local sales, one must look at the economic effect the current trends hold for the wine industry.

The SPEAKER: Order!

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The first thing it shows is that the research is coming up with the same numbers. [Interjections.] No, I can guarantee you that I didn’t. There is another major cost. I did speak about bottling, but I have received a report on what the increase of electricity costs is doing to our industry, both locally and nationally, and also the effect that it has specifically on this industry.

Consol Glass, the predominant manufacturer of glass bottles for the industry, has, as a result of energy costs going up, had an increase of 400% in their energy bill in the last 4 years. They are now paying R200 million extra at their Bellville plant as opposed to what they were paying in 2007. That shows you that that kind of increase across the country is not only affecting the competitiveness of our local industries, it is actually causing certain sectors, like the bottle manufacturers for the wine industry, to be uncompetitive globally.

To sustain 400% higher increase in costs than their international competitors is really making it very tough for them to compete, so it’s another influencing factor on the bulk exports of wine. With regard to the debate that came out about what bulk supply was doing specifically to job losses in South Africa, with the kind of quid pro quo that the national Minister put forward – that we will stop importing bottled whiskey – perhaps I should also say it is very dangerous to start playing those kinds of games.

This is because if we start interfering in the market in that space, what the purchasing market does is to go directly and buy from other regions in the world and then we will lose the market space completely.

I’m really glad to see, however, that Minister Davies has now said that we are not getting into that debate anymore. It’s really about getting our wine into the market, in bulk, and then obviously up-selling to get our better wines into those markets. Once we’ve had traction we will sell our high-value products get into that same market.
†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, specifically today, I would be failing in my
duty and I would be grossly insensitive to the poor farm workers, if all I did was to
spout statistics and talk about imports and exports. If I only focused on the growth
in this sector, I would be fiddling while Rome is burning.

The people, who do the manual labour to make this province as rich as it is and to
give it its place in the market, be it table grapes or bottled wine, are not the rich
farmers, who live in fancy, comfortable homes, drive fancy cars and eat healthy
meals. They are the parents of the small children and adolescents, who do not
know where their next meal will come from and do not have decent homes to live
in or decent recreation through which they can vent their frustrations. Somehow
the DA continually forgets about the human aspect of any industry.

To say, Mr Speaker, that the unrest is politically motivated, is to insult the poor
people by implying that they do not have enough intelligence to decide for them-
selves that what they are being paid is disgustingly low.

Raise your hands, those sitting here today, who can feed a family on less than
R50 per day, because that’s what these workers take home, and that’s their legiti-
mate grievance.

Mr Speaker, the minimum wage is exactly that – a minimum wage. It is to expect
of farmers, who are getting stinking rich at the expense of the poor, to realise that,
based on profit margins they make ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon McKenzie! Order!

†Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... on exports and the work done by these poor people,
they deserve to be better remunerated, but not less than what the law stipulates.

[Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, ironically, we watch in by-
elections how these very farmers truck in
their intimidated workers to polling stations, and then DA smiles because no one
dares to come to the ANC table.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This is my last sentence, Mr Speaker. Now we are saying
to those workers that in spite of that, we still care and will stand by them.

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, I am not going to conduct a political debate
here – I will leave that to the Minister – except to say that minimum wages are the
responsibility of the ANC.

Protection of the farm workers is the ANC’s responsibility, ...[Interjections.] ... be-
cause the SAPS is under their command. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: They create focal points and then they cannot deal with
them. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Hon members, order, please!
Mr Speaker, bulk exporting of wine and the economic impact it has are important considerations that have to be analysed regularly. However, the threats to the wine industry must not be tackled in isolation.

New markets are crucially important for the industry. In 2007, South Africa exported 1.2 million litres of wine to China. Towards the end of 2011, this had grown to 4.3 million litres of wine. Although the increase represents only 3% of China’s wine market, China has grown into one of South Africa’s top 10 wine export destinations.

So, marketing must also be done actively in the new emerging markets. Nigeria’s wine market is estimated to be about R2.5 billion a year. About a fifth of all the wine sold in Nigeria comes from South Africa, thanks to the efforts of individual wineries.

Mr Speaker, I concur with Minister Van Rensburg’s view during the Cape Wine festival this year: The modern South African wine industry has so much to offer and to be proud of. This is evidenced by the growth in export volumes, exporting to new markets, new young talented winemakers, as well as exciting new wine styles to complement the more traditional wines. It is important, however, to let South African wine grow as a brand and also to protect it.

I think, first of all, that she must get her facts straight. In February this year, the Gazette stated what the minimum wage was. That was agreed to by Minister Oliphant, Cosatu and the farmers around the table. [Interjections.] They agreed to that minimum wage together. [Interjections.]

I therefore have absolutely no doubt that all of the stuff that the hon Beerwinkel is talking about is orchestrated by the ANC. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, I therefore have absolutely no doubt that all of the stuff that the hon Beerwinkel is talking about is orchestrated by the ANC. [Interjections.]

I think the hon member say was denouncing that the ANC came out yesterday and called for a boycott of South African wines.
If this image that we're putting to the world is not bad enough for our industry and selling our products to the world, the ANC from the Eastern Cape came out and called for a boycott of our wines. That is really irresponsible leadership.

While talking about irresponsible leadership and the orchestration of what has been going on, let's think about the model of democratic leadership that they have in their party. Deputy Minister Fransman and, of course, Tony Ehrenreich are absolute models of democratic leadership. I think they should start off by asking their leaders to pay at least their bills that they owe in this province. They can't even pay their conference bills. They are a bankrupt party. They cannot pay their conference bills, ... [Interjections.] ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon Wiley!

†The MINISTER: ... and then they get involved in this kind of whipping up of the people of this province.

Development rights at Princess Vlei

†2. Mr M Ozinsky to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

What is the name of the company that (a) applied for development rights at Princess Vlei and (b) has been granted development rights at Princess Vlei?

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, firstly I would like to state that I supported the department's recommendation that the appeal against the City of Cape Town did not notify the applicant of a resolution within the seven-month's period in terms of section 16(2) of the Land Use Planning Ordinance, better known as Lupo, for the extension of a land rezoning approval—granted on 3 September 2008—from a single to an overall business zone to allow the development of a shopping centre on a portion of the property be ratified, subject to certain specific conditions.

I think it's important to note that my predecessor, hon Mr Pierre Uys, issued the initial approval of the rezoning on 28 August 2008 and not I. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: I think it will also be right if I mention to you that hon Ozinsky was part of the ANC caucus that made that decision.

Before I made my final decision, I had all the volumes of the departmental city planning and environmental files relating to the case, at my disposal. All aspects of the municipality's assessment of the application were considered, and the department's Head: City and Regional Planner also provided me with their professional inputs, as well as those of the Planning Advisory Board consisting of professional independent members and the Head: Land Use Management Regulator in this connection. You can see that we have considered this application very seriously.
The larger area that surrounds the area is partly residential, but it also contains a variety of mixed uses, and a typical long-term activity corridor in the making is also reflected. I regard the loss of a portion of the present open space resulting in the structure, and the guide-plan instructions of the metropolitan open space changing into city development, as well as the extension of the rezoning approval as acceptable, given the large open space that will remain untouched by the envisaged development.

Furthermore, it is my view that the objections of the legal objectors largely relate to the repetition of the objections of the previous round and the associated approval of the envisaged development, and that the approval of the application to extend the relevant land use rights to allow the proposed shopping centre is clearly in the interests of the local community and that it complies with the criteria of section 36 of the Ordinance.

It is also important to note that the Sasmeer Ratepayers Association, the Princess Vlei Civic Association and the ward councillor all supported the proposed development of the shopping centre, with some of the parties regarding it as a definite improvement of the present neglected condition of the property concerned.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, what is amazing is that you didn’t rule the hon MEC out of order. The question is clear: What is the name of the company that applied for development rights and what was the name of the company that was granted rights? He hasn’t answered the question. He has had three minutes. He hasn’t answered the question, and he says to me that he’s getting there.

What he is trying to do is to undermine the process of the House, because he’s meant to answer the question in the first speaking turn he has, and then I am meant to reply to his answer and then he is meant to reply to my response. However, I can’t reply to his answer because he hasn’t answered the question. That is why you should have ruled him out of order.

This is a purposeful attempt to undermine a legitimate question and the process of getting legitimate answers about public oversight. [Interjections.] However, as has been shown in this process, the hon MEC and the DA don’t care about oversight, they don’t care about public opinion; so the MEC comes to the House and shows a disdain for the Rules of the House, which address interpellations, and he doesn’t answer the question. [Interjections.] Therefore, let me tell the hon MEC that the problem he is facing ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Mr M OZINSKY: ... is that he gave the permission to the wrong company.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, that’s the point.

†Mr M OZINSKY: He can say what he likes, he told the press that the City had made a mistake by approving the development. He is now telling the House that the hon Uys made the mistake, which is not the truth, hon Bredell, because you had the opportunity to stop the development and you did not use the opportunity. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Ozinsky, will you address the Chair, please.
Mr M OZINSKY: Yes, I've addressed you, Chair, and I am asking you to tell me: Are you going to rule the hon Minister out of order?

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Ozinsky, address the Chair please.

Mr M OZINSKY: Okay. Hon Speaker, will you rule the hon Minister out of order and instruct him to answer the question so that I can reply to his answer, because until now he has still not answered the question?

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Ozinsky, may you conclude. Your time has expired. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: I am asking you on a point of order: Will you instruct him to answer my question? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Take your seat please, hon member. [Interjections.] I cannot tell the Minister how to answer. The Minister must answer the question. I am not the Minister. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! It is not my duty to tell the Minister how to answer the questions in the House. That is not my duty.

Mr M OZINSKY: May I address you on that point?

The SPEAKER: Order! Take your seat. Hon Minister, over to you.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: He's not replying to you ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Which is what we are used to in this House.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I shall continue. You see, Mr Speaker, the people out there must know what the truth is concerning the Princess Vleisaga. I will use my time to inform them of the truth, because hon Uys and hon Ozinsky and the ANC caucus are trying to twist the truth. I am going to come to my question – and it doesn't stand anywhere in the rules at what stage I must be specific in my reply, but I will be specific later.

Mr Speaker, to sum up, it is my view that the specific nature of the proposed limited business can be considered as the specific location and the extent of about 3,7 ha as environment in terms of section 36 of the Land Use Planning Ordinance. Therefore, I have decided to uphold the appeal that was submitted in terms of section 44 of Lupo.

We are speaking about Erf 82176, Retreat, to rezone it from a Single Home-use Zone and a Public Open Space to a General Business-use Zone. That is what we are talking about. It is subzone 1 to allow the proposed development of a shopping centre in the area, subject to certain conditions with regard to the environmental authorisation in terms of Nemar for which the previous Minister, Tasneem Essop, had approved the application on appeal. That was on 29 November 2005, and if I have it right, hon Ozinsky was a member of that caucus.
The authorisation was issued in the name of the land owner and applicant, the City of Cape Town, but it has expired since that time. It is, however, important to mention that as a result of the national government’s amendment of the Nema environmental impact assessment regulations in 2010, the proposed commercial development no longer comprises a listed activity and that is why it no longer requires environmental approval, since it is more than 32 m from the side of the vlei. The City of Cape Town has been notified accordingly. [Time expired.]

†Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Speaker, when will the silent majority express themselves on Princess Vlei? Despite the myths about a Khoi princess who lived in Elephant’s Eye and gave Princess Vlei its name ...

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Ozinsky, order!

†Mr M C WALTERS: ... it is clear from its being bordered by Prince George’s Drive, Windsor Park and Victoria and Windsor Roads that its name change from Diep River Vlei to Princess Vlei could have a more recent, British connection.

The previous regime in the Western Cape, through the then Minister, Pierre Uys, approved the town-planning applications. The applicant received the City’s sanctions to submit the planning applications in August 2008, and subdivision and zoning amendments were approved in April 2009.

Minister Bredell has since upheld an appeal to extend the validity of the rezoning decision and called on the City for suggestions as to how conditions of approval should be amended to accord with current conditions. The City is still the owner of the land with transfer subject to the applicant meeting the conditions of sale. Existing approvals are linked to the property and not to the prospective developer.

The development of the Princess Vlei area can only be a plus for the community. The windswept expanse is home to alien grasses and distorted trees, some of them declared to be invasive. The water is infested with undesirable alien fish.

Sensitive development will bring job opportunities and convenient shopping, and will enhance the quality of life in the area. With commitment from the developers and the City, this development has the potential to greatly enhance the larger area remaining as a public park as well as the touristic route along the M5.

Princess Vlei, lying between St George’s Drive and Victoria and Windsor Roads, in its present condition can hardly be regarded as part of the crown jewels of the City of Cape Town. However, it could occupy this position if an integrated parkland development is combined with the proposed mall.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, I see your colleagues hanging their heads in shame over the fact that you allow an hon MEC not to answer a question on purpose to subvert debate. However, if that is what you believe the democratic principles are, so be it. We are subject to your decisions whatever they may be. [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: [Inaudible.]
†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Geyer, order!

†Mr M OZINSKY: And there they speak – the butchers of the Boland. Now they are the people who are trying to destroy Princess Vlei. You see, the hon MEC says one thing in the House and he says another thing outside the House. Outside the House he says the development should not have been approved and should not go ahead. In the House, however, he and his colleagues defend the development to the hilt.

The hon member knows there is no one outside the House who will stand up to support their position. That is why he talks about a silent majority. But there is no silent majority, there is no one in the area who supports it. The fact is, these members are not from Cape Town so they don’t care about what happens in Cape Town. We can look in their home towns and see the mess that they created when they were councillors in those towns.

Now let me come to the issue that the member raises about decisions taken by the ANC government. The fact is, that when the ANC government took those decisions there was no outcry. There was no outcry, there was no opposition, there was no coalition. What happened then is that people learnt about this problem and they’ve raised it. And the ANC has listened.

But the DA has not listened, because the hon Bredell had a chance to turn the development down and instead of saying what he said outside the House, that the development should not have gone ahead, he is doing the opposite. Now he comes to the House and tells us that he did the opposite of that.

That way of behaving, saying one thing in public and saying another thing in the House, is the mark of both that MEC – note what happened with the predators – and also of that party, as we see the province burning around us. [Interjections.] The hon Meyer told us himself that he solved the problem in the Boland last week. We wonder why he isn’t here to face the music, because the problem wasn’t solved. That is how that party works; it says one thing outside and it says another thing here. [Time expired.]

*†The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, please note that the approval issued in terms of environmental legislation fundamentally differs in the city planning legislation on the one hand, and on the other hand, in Lupo. The environmental legislation grants personal rights, and the city planning legislation grants rights that are vested in the property. Land use rights conceded in terms of Lupoto develop the property are therefore vested in the property and not in the person or the company. It differs from the scenario of rights that are granted by means of Nema, which are personal rights. In other words, it is not vested in a specific property.

Therefore, to reply to the question, Insight Property Developers (Princess Vlei) (Pty) Ltd applied for the necessary rezoning application under the Land Use Planning Ordinance – for hon Ozinsky’s information – on behalf of the City of Cape Town. The land use rights in terms of Lupo are therefore vested in the property of Remainder Erf 82176 Retreat. If I had decided otherwise, I would have looked absolutely ridiculous in court.
If the property were to be sold, the owner would not have to transfer these land use rights in terms of Lupo because it is vested in the property, but hon Ozinsky perhaps wants me to change the law there also.

To sum up, Mr Speaker, if we consider this matter, the City of Cape Town is still the owner of Remainder Erf 82176 Retreat. This is the information I have at my disposal. Furthermore, I know that the City of Cape Town is also busy with other negotiations, and I respect the process. Thank you, Speaker.

**QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Question standing over from Thursday, 8 November 2012, as agreed to by the House:*

*Water sustainability and conservation*

†8. **Mr R B Lentit to ask Mr H G van Rensburg, Minister of Agriculture:**

What are the plans of his department with regard to water sustainability and conservation?

*The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Mr Speaker, thank you very much to hon Lentit for the question. The reply is as follows:

8. Managing our country's water sources is the responsibility of the Department of Water Affairs, but since agriculture is one of the major water users, we have a responsibility to make sure that water is regarded effectively and from a conservation point of view.

My department is therefore responsible for giving technical information about the water requirements of the various crops, various irrigation schedules and also various irrigation systems.

Last year we introduced the Fruit Look Project. It is a project according to which we can assist people via satellite by telling them that a certain block or vineyard or plants have been irrigated excessively during the last week, so you must irrigate less the following week. In that way we can save a large amount of water.

With our Land Care Projects we can pass the message on to children to treat water sensibly. We also do it on farmers' days, with talks on the radio, at agricultural shows, irrigation boards and wherever we have the opportunity.

*Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I would like to ask the Minister whether any purification projects are currently in place, that are specifically aimed at our farmers in the Berg River area.

*The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, we are very worried about the entire Berg River and via various Ministries and departments we are looking at how we can get the water of the Berg River as clean as possible. It is important for our exports and we must make sure that that water is clean.
In various towns and cities some of the sewage water is purified to a grey type of water where it can be used for agriculture.

*New questions:*

*Reconstruction work on Sir Lowry’s Pass*

1. **Mr E J von Brandis to ask Mr R V Carlisle, Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

   (a) What progress has been made with regard to the reconstruction work to Sir Lowry’s Pass and (b) what is the envisaged date of completion of this project?

1. Question stands over.

*Projects unblocked in Khayelitsha on 29 October 2012*

2. **Mr A M Figlan to ask Mr B S Madikizela, Minister of Human Settlements:**

   (1) How many projects did he unblock in Khayelitsha on 29 October 2012;

   (2) whether there are any other blocked projects besides the ones in Khayelitsha; if so, what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, the reply is as follows:

2. (1) Nine projects are currently being unblocked by the department through a Development Action group. A total of 2 173 units will be completed at a cost of R64 million.

   (2) Yes, there are approximately 12 other projects, all based in Khayelitsha. These projects have been investigated to identify what level of work is required to complete them and the completion of these projects have now fallen within the implementation scope of the PHP Professional Resource Teams.

I have a list of these projects and I can furnish the hon member with that list. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Mnu A M FIGLAN: Somlomo, ndifuna ukuqonda apha kohlomiphhekileyo uMphathiswa ukuba ingaba ukunjanda yonke le nto yokuvalwa kweeprowuojekthi isikhonai sisombululo anaso ukwenzela ukuba kungaphinde kubekho ukuvalwa kweeprowuojekthi?

UMPHATHISWA: Mhlekazi, ewe sesihlabele mgama kakhulu ukuqinisekisa ukuba ayiphindi yenzeke le nto kangangokuba ezinye yezinto esizenzayo wki-PPH endicinga ukuba kudala sizikhankanya kukuqinisekisa intoyokuba abantu bachongelwe ukwenza lomsebenzi batykitya isivumelwano nath isilisebe. Oku sikwenzela ukunjanda le nto ibisenzeka ngaphambili apho ibingahlali ngokwabo abatyumba ababakhi. Bebesithi bakhe bashiye izindlu phakthi babhele emehlweni singeyonxalenye yalonqkubo thina silisebe. Leyo yenye yezinto esizenzayo ngoku ukuqinisekisa ukuba isivumelwano sityikitywa phakathi kwethu nabakhi ukuze
Mr A M FIGLAN: Speaker, I want to know from the hon Minister whether, in order to prevent the blocking of the projects, he has any solution in order to ensure that projects are no longer blocked again.

The MINISTER: Sir, yes, we have gone a long way of ensuring that this does not happen again. As a result, one of the things we are doing with the PPH which I think we have been mentioning is to ensure that these people who are selected to do this job enter into contract with us as a department. We are doing this to prevent what was happening before, as it was the residents who were choosing the contractors. These contractors would build the houses and leave without completing them, disappearing without any trace, and we are not involved as a department. That is one of the things we are doing now in ensuring that a contract is entered into between us and the builders so that we can identify the culprits and follow the work they are doing.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, I want to ask the MEC whether he is aware that there is a serious outcry about his department’s intervention process? Is he also part of this DA self-empowerment in the process? That the companies that are benefitting more are DA contractors ...

The SPEAKER: Order! What is your question hon member?

Mnu K E MAGAXA: You hear me, Speaker, and I think you hear me correctly.

The MINISTER: Thank you, hon member Magaxa. I have no idea what the member is talking about – or let me put it this way – except to say that one of the reasons why we have made the kind of interventions that we have made is to avoid the current situation.

I think the member would agree with me that we cannot continue with a situation where the service providers, or the contractors, are operating in a space where they are not monitored and they are not managed. We have not made any appointment. The process is still the same, people still get involved and they recommend to us which service providers must build for them.

Our role in this space is to make sure that those service providers are credible because we have to do a background check on them, and we have to also make sure that the contractual agreement is signed between them and us so that we are able to monitor the progress in terms of the work they are doing. We are not appointing on behalf of those people, but we have to make sure that they are protected.

The issue that is being raised here is a joke really. There is no truth in it that the people who are benefitting are DA contractors.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Are you telling me MEC ...
†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Magaxa! This is an opportunity for questions. I hope that you will pose a question now and not make a statement. Over to you.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: Are you aware that currently there are companies that have been recommended by the beneficiaries, but who have been overlooked by the officials?

†The MINISTER: Yes, of course I am aware. That’s exactly the point that I was making. There are contractors, Mr Speaker, who are responsible for the mess that we find ourselves in. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER: There are a number of them. I can give you a list of them. The reason why we are intervening, for example, is that in the past the beneficiaries usually appointed these contractors on the basis of the show house that is built there. They don’t know the background of these contractors, they don’t know the financial muscle of these contractors, and they don’t know whether these contractors have enough capacity to build these houses. The reason why we are rejecting some of them is because we have compiled a database of the credible companies.

We know now, in terms of the report that we got from the Special Investigating Unit (SIU), who the companies are that have messed up in the past and we know which companies are doing a good job. When these people recommend companies that are part of the report by the SIU, which tells us that these people are responsible for the mess that we find ourselves in, we cannot do business with those companies.

In fact, we’re in the process now of making sure that we will no longer do business with them. I’m quite aware that, in some instances, when the beneficiaries recommend somebody we turn those recommendations down because we know that those people are responsible for the mess we’re in.

†Mr K E MAGAXA: MEC, do you know that your brother’s company is the most dominant company that is benefitting, especially in the Site C and Gugulethu area? [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER: I do not have a brother who has a company. [Laughter.] Mr Speaker, the Madikizela surname is a common one and there might be someone who is called Madikizela …

An HON MEMBER: Is it your sister?

The MINISTER: There might be someone who is called Madikizela, but I would like … [Interjections.] …

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The MINISTER: … the hon member to give me proof that someone was appointed because he is my brother. I can certainly deal with that. I have no knowledge of a brother of mine who is dominant in this industry because of being my brother.
Matters pertaining to Development Action Group

3. Mr A M Figlan to ask Mr B S Madikizela, Minister of Human Settlements:

With reference to the Development Action Group (DAG) situated in his department, (a) (i) when, (ii) how and (iii) by whom was this group formed, (b) who is involved in this group and (c) where are they based?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENT: Mr Speaker, the reply is as follows:

3. (a) (i)–(iii) The Development Action Group (DAG) was initiated by a group of activists in response to the destruction of and forced removals from the Crossroads informal settlement in Cape Town in 1986. This group gradually formalised into a well-established and respected nongovernmental organisation through working with various marginalised communities in the Western Cape. Over time DAG was increasingly asked to assist communities with accessing land, housing and tenure rights, among other basic rights.

A founding member of the former national Urban Sector Network (USN) in 1988, DAG continued to be involved in issues of housing, urban development and local government, working on projects located throughout the Western Cape and on advocacy issues at a national scale. By the early 1990’s DAG’s work shifted from tenure struggles to include poor peoples’ rights to participate in planning and developmental processes.

During this period DAG established itself as a facilitator of development processes. By the mid-1990’s DAG’s policy and research activities were well established, focusing on urban and regional planning studies and becoming involved in the National Housing Forum, where new housing policy was being developed. This policy work has continued. DAG’s work grew to include a variety of training programmes and the organisation continued to partner with communities, and several housing projects and informal settlement upgrading projects were implemented in the Western Cape Province.

(b) DAG’s staff team is made up of diverse, well-qualified and experienced individuals committed to making a difference in the lives of the urban poor. There are a number of people who form part of the staff. I can give you the list of those involved as it’s a very long list.

Mnu A M FIGLAN: Mandibulele kakhulu kuMphathiswa ngengcaciso yakhe. Eyonanto ndifuna ukuyiqonda kuMphathiswa kukuba ingaba ikhonana inkxaso abayifumana kwisebe? Ukuba ikhona, yeyiphi?Ukuba ayikho, kutheni?


†
[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.]

[Mr A M FIGLAN: Let me thank the hon Minister for his explanation. What I would like to know from the hon Minister is whether they are getting any support from the department. If yes, what is it? If it is not, why?

The MINISTER: Sir, DAG is one of the service providers or companies we work with when doing our work. That does not mean they are the only ones. They have a special skill especially when it comes to opening the projects because of their time working with these areas we have problems with. Really, when doing this work they have a contract with us as the department and we are paying them for doing this work; they are not doing it for free.]

**Forensic pathology services in Western Cape**

*4. Ms A J du Toit Marais to ask Mr T L Botha, Minister of Health:*

What is the current state of affairs in respect of forensic pathology in the Western Cape?

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, the reply is as follows:

4. Forensic pathology services are currently being rendered to the population of the Western Cape via 18 forensic pathology facilities.

As at the end of September for the 2012-13 financial year. April to September, 5 095 cases were admitted to the forensic pathology services for medico-legal investigation of death. That is an increase of 5,6 % compared to the same period in the previous financial year. Sixty five percent of the medico-legal post-mortems were performed in the Cape Town metropolitan area and the balance of 35% in the rural districts.

The post status currently is that we have 259 approved posts in forensic pathology, of which 244 are filled. There are, therefore, 15 vacancies.

A new facility was opened during October 2012 in Beaufort West. This brings the total of new fit-for-purpose constructed facilities to six. They are in Beaufort West, George, Hermanus, Paarl, Malmesbury and Worcester. Currently the planning of a new facility to replace the one in Salt River in the metro is under way.

**Matter pertaining to Olympia High School**

*5. Mr P Uys to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:*

(a) Why has an investigation been done by his department at the Olympia School in George and (b) why has the recommendation to suspend the principal and to place the school under administration not been implemented?
†The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, the reply is as follows:

5. (a) and (b) The Western Cape Education Department (WCED) conducted an investigation into allegations of misconduct on the part of employees at the school. These allegations emerged from an audit that was conducted by the Eden and Central Karoo Education District Office in 2010, and related to financial irregularities at the school and its hostel.

The WCED took the following action to address the findings of this investigation appropriately:

The WCED provided appropriate training to staff at the school to improve compliance with the applicable financial prescripts; and

The principal of the school was charged with and found guilty of misconduct. The principal received a final written warning and a fine.

Neither the suspension of the principal nor the placing of the school under administration was recommended by the WCED, following its investigation of the matter. The school co-operated fully during the investigation of this matter and with the steps taken to improve the school’s compliance with the applicable financial prescripts.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, how could the MEC say that the principal's suspension had not been requested, and that the school be placed under administration, if item 18(4) of the report says that the head, Mr Maree, is not at all in control of the situation and that the urgency of the school having to be placed under administration is emphasised?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I don't personally handle HR matters. These matters are routinely dealt with by the labour relations department. If hon Uys has further information or feels that appropriate action has not been taken, he's most welcome to write to me and I will look into it.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, I am shocked that the MEC says that he is not involved in this. It’s not administration, MEC, because I'm quoting from a report from your department; it's not my report.

†The SPEAKER: Order! What's the question?

*Mr P UYS: I want to ask you: What action must be taken then when the report says that the competence of the principal, Mr Maree, to manage the school effectively has to be investigated further and that he has to be suspended? How can you say it's an administrative issue?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, in my answer I did point to the fact that there had been support and also training. If we had to examine the capacity of all of the personnel within the WCED it would take a long time to fix things. So, if you have information for me about the school or the principal please write to me about it and I will look the situation again.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, I would like to ask the MEC why he didn’t prepare properly for it.
An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: There’s a report from his department, not my report or a report from the school, but from his department that states very clearly that the principal must be suspended and the school must be placed under administration. Why don’t you do it, hon Minister?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, because I’m told that appropriate action was taken.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, how can a warning letter be appropriate action when there’s major corruption? [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

*Mr P UYS: You are covering up, man. You know what's going on over there.[Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members!

†The MINISTER: Let me reiterate, in terms of the information at my disposal, the matter was properly investigated, remedial action...

†Mr P UYS: A warning.

†The MINISTER: ... and appropriate action was taken and a fine given to the principal.

Closure of Herold Primary School, Southern Cape

*6. Mr P Uys to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:

Whether he or his department has given consideration to the closing of the Herold Primary School in the Southern Cape?

†The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, the reply is as follows:

6. The Western Cape Education Department constantly considers how to deal with small and/or nonviable schools, taking into consideration the best interests of the learners, the needs of the community, and the particular circumstances within which any school operates. The viability of all schools is therefore being appropriately monitored and assessed by the department.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, the school I’m referring to here is the Herold Primary School. Can th MEC tell me how many pupils the school has and what other school is nearest to this school?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, if I remember correctly I think there are 27 children at the school, if this is the school in Herolds Bay. The nearest school would be probably about 10 km or 12 km away.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, I must say I'm very worried about the MEC being so poorly prepared. The Primary School Herold ... [Interjections.] ... is not in Herolds Bay.[Interjections.]
†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Uys! Can you pose a question?

†Mr P UYS: The closest school is 200 m away. Mr Speaker, I can’t ask the MEC a question because he didn’t prepare. He doesn’t even know where the school is.

†The SPEAKER: Hon Uys, put it in writing to the hon Minister that you are not happy with the answer. [Interjections.]

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, may I ask a question? [Interjections]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order!

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, are you saying that we’re not supposed to ask oral questions?

†The SPEAKER: I didn’t say that.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: What are you saying?

†The SPEAKER: I said that if the hon member is not happy with the answer of the Minister then he can follow it up in a letter.

†Ms M TINGWE: How will that resolve anything?

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Uys, over to you.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, may I then ask the MEC: How can he say this school is in Herolds Bay – there’s only one Herold Primary School in the entire Western Cape – when it is on the other side of the mountain on Oudtshoorn’s side? How can he say that? [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon McKenzie! Order, hon members!

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, the answer to that is yes, you are absolutely right. I’ve not had time to interrogate these questions, because I’ve been running around this morning making damn sure our children are writing Matric and getting into their schools. Okay? [Interjections.]

†Ms M TINGWE: How will that resolve anything?

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Uys, over to you.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Where’s the leader ...

†The SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon Uys. Hon members! Hon Ozxinsky, order! [Interjections.] Hon Uys, over to you.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, may I ask the MEC why does he regard a question put to him as not being important and serious enough to read the answer at least?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I do regard it as serious and, really, I will look into this matter when I get back to my office and also interrogate why the circuit team manager has not recommended the school for closure. We will most certainly look at it the next time round.
†Mr P UYS: MEC, is it correct to say that there is a primary school 200 m from this school that is only used 73%?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I will most certainly look into this matter. Thank you. [Interjections.]

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Your Minister’s ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Matters pertaining to the treatment of ADHD

†7. Mr G C R Haskin to ask Mr T L Botha, Minister of Health:

(a) What is the policy approach of his department with regard to the efficacy, in the (i) short, (ii) medium and (iii) long term, of methylphenidate-type psycho stimulant drugs prescribed for the treatment of Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD) and other developmental disorders of school-going children and (b) what services and advice does the department provide to (i) schools and (ii) parents relating to the assessment, prescription and use of such drugs for the treatment of ADHD, including the efficacy, long-term effects and monitoring thereof?

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, the answer is a lengthy one – it’s a few pages. [Interjections.] I ask the House permission to submit it and I’ve also asked the hon member’s permission.

†The SPEAKER: I think hon Haskin is fine with that. I’m giving permission to the hon Minister hand in the question.

Reply as tabled:

The MINISTER:

7. (a) (i)–(iii) There is no formal policy document within the Department of Health. The descriptions, provided below describe the assessment, treatment and follow up of children treated within the public sector.

(b) (i) Service provision to public schools consists of visits by paediatricians to special schools as part of a regular outreach activity. Child and Adolescent Mental Health services generally liaise regularly with schools (private and public), telephonic, written and at times, school one-on-one visits during the diagnostic phase and follow up of children with suspected ADHD.

(ii) Parents are provided with regular psycho-education about the diagnosis and treatment of ADHD as well as potential adverse effects of the medication. Information booklets are supplied when available. At follow up monitoring of the blood pressure and pulse occurs as well as height and weight. Parents are expected to attend follow up visits and are therefore kept informed of the medium and long term management as well as any adverse effects which may have occurred.
Background Information

Methylphenidate (Ritalin) is a psycho stimulant and is indicated for the management of the symptoms of Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD). There is a substantial international literature which demonstrates efficacy in up to 70% of patients, for both ‘hyperactive’ symptoms as well as the inattention/impulsive symptom cluster.

Short, medium and long term efficacy is similar on condition of medication adherence which commonly becomes problematical during teenage years. For this reason the long acting formulation is recommended as once-a-day dosing ensures greater compliance. The two formulations are equally efficacious but studies demonstrate potentially superior outcomes over time, for both core symptoms and overall functioning in those on the long acting formulation. This is attributed to poorer adherence by those prescribed short acting formulations, in the medium and long term (complicated regime of three times a day dosing becomes unsustainable for a variety of reasons). Methylphenidate is prescribed to children and adolescents in South Africa and may be initiated at community psychiatry clinics, child and adolescent psychiatry units (tertiary level), general and specialist paediatric clinics and by school doctors. In the private sector the drug commonly is prescribed by general practitioners, paediatricians, paediatric neurologists, psychiatrists and child psychiatrists. Within the public sector children under five are assessed by paediatricians at their community outreach clinics and outreach to special schools in the district. They are either initiated on medication at that level or referred to a tertiary hospital Developmental Clinic or Paediatric Neurology(Tygerberg and Red Cross Children’s Hospital), should the diagnosis be uncertain or there is a suspicion of additional pathology (such as an autism spectrum diagnosis or Epilepsy for instance). School going children with suspected ADHD may be assessed by the school doctor and Ritalin may be initiated in consultation with Paediatricians at tertiary level, or a referral may be made to the local psychiatric clinic (at the community health clinic) where the child is assessed by a psychiatric registrar. Should such an assessment reveal additional concerns, severe pathology or poor response to treatment, the child may then be referred to the Child and Adolescent Mental Health Service (CAMHS) within the catchment area (Tygerberg, Red Cross, Lentegeur Hospitals).

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Hon Premier what are you doing to bring about peace in De Doorns and other areas of the Western Cape that are engulfed in the unrest, which you were previously warned about.

†The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, together with my colleagues I have done many things. When we were tipped off several weeks ago that there were plans in certain quarters to bring Marikana to the Western Cape, we had a meeting with various MECs who then spoke in various places and prepared their sectors, such as disaster management and the agriculture sector and SAPS for this eventuality.
I, obviously, didn’t want to raise unnecessary panic, but we thought about this eventuality, which was the cause of very great concern to me. I am also, however, wary when I get anonymous tip-offs that I have to check up to see whether they are correct or not. The information I received actually mentioned De Doorns specifically. Some of the individuals who have been directly involved were also mentioned. I was surprised when that information subsequently turned out to be not only accurate, but far worse than we anticipated.

When trouble broke out I felt that I should go and speak to the workers myself to hear what the issues and concerns were. [Interjections.] It is certainly wrongly attributed that I wanted to go and speak them; the truth is I wanted to listen to them. Minister van Rensburg and the other Ministers were keeping me informed all the time of the issues, but I wanted to go myself and hear what the workers had to say.

I had a very productive interaction with workers in Stofland. I first walked from door to door with Minister van Rensburg and spoke to workers about certain problems that they had. I went to the bridge and spoke to people and at that time the discussion and the interaction was very cordial, friendly and pleasant and I learnt a lot. I learnt that most of the workers there that I spoke to were Sotho speaking, that they were seasonal workers, many of whom came from Lesotho, but many of whom were also based in De Doorns and had been for a number of years.

I learnt from them that they are no longer getting employment in the agricultural sector, because subsequent to the xenophobic outbreak in 2008 and 2010 in De Doorns, the Department of Home Affairs has cracked down very heavily and is fining farmers very significantly if they employ workers who don’t have the requisite papers. [Interjections.]

A farmer recently got fined R150 000 for employing workers from Lesotho, who did not have the requisite papers, and for this reason many, in fact all, of those workers are no longer employed. The issue is exacerbated by the fact that Zimbabwean seasonal workers are allowed to work because of the recent amnesty, for which most of them applied, and the farmers presume that their papers are in order.

Therefore this is a major issue, and the anger and the people who were primarily blocking the N2, and certainly the people who started shouting, “Malema! Malema!” came from a section of the crowd – and it was a small section of the crowd – who had been rowdy. They were predominantly the Sotho speakers who are very, very angry and alienated and marginalised. I decided to leave the area, because I didn’t want to stay for a major confrontation and then I walked out of the area and left. [Interjections.]

I came back later in the afternoon to speak to the children, because my great concern was seeing the numbers of children in the street. It was a school day and there were literally scores and scores of children in the street. So I came back and spoke to a number of children who said to me they were being prevented from going to school by the strikers, who are once again using our children and their education as a pawn in their battles. If children don’t get education they will never be able to climb out of poverty and get work by means of which they can progress up a career ladder in life.
I’ve been in very close contact, not only with Minister van Rensburg on a daily basis, but also with Minister Grant, who has had his hands full trying to keep schools open and trying to make sure, particularly, that children could write their Matric exams.

In Villiersdorp there was a specific attempt to close down schools and prevent matriculants from writing their Matric and the education officials did a brilliant job in ensuring that those children could get through the cordon lines and actually write. In Bonnievale today three schools were closed down, but the Minister and his team made sure that the matriculants in Bonnievale were, in fact, writing.

I can go from place to place and continue telling you about the extraordinary job which is currently being done by the education officials to keep the schools open and to keep the matriculants writing. [Interjections.] Minister Bredell has been running around and overseeing the brilliant operation of the Joc – the joint operation centre. I was out there yesterday. They have extraordinarily good information and they are working to bring in helicopters because the roads are blocked and they have to get to the fires, which are causing mayhem around the Ceres area.

The SAPS is doing some very important work there and I think that it’s an absolute miracle and to the credit of SAPS that there hasn’t been a loss of life. I also want to state very strongly that I urge calm in the situation. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Hon Ozinsky, if you carry on with your interruptions, and seriously, I will ask you to leave the House.

†The PREMIER: I have urged calm and really urged farmers not to respond with any violence. They also recognise as much as I do that the permanent workers are still working and by and large want to continue working; and that many of the people inciting the violence do not come from the farms, but have been bussed in with taxis and busses. [Interjections.] I can tell that it’s been confirmed with me at the very, very highest level of government. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The PREMIER: The truth is, Mr Speaker, that all the issues that are at the heart of this crisis – and it is a crisis – and all the Ministries responsible are a national competency. Policing is a national competency. We certainly have oversight over the matter and we have been there and we’ve spoken to SAPS on a regular basis. The Cabinet had a full briefing from Gen Peter Jacobs yesterday. I’ve been in constant telephonic contact with Gen Arno Lamoer and I’ve been in contact with national Commissioner Riah Phiyega.

When SAPS informed me that they were too thinly stretched and could not cope with the outbreaks of violence and arson by roving bands ... [Interjections.]– well, I don’t think they were strikers, I think many of them were people from the outside who were setting alight farms, stores, equipment, cool-rooms and crates of fruit for export across Ceres and that area yesterday – I certainly asked President Zuma to allow the army to come in.
I tried to contact Minister Joemat-Pettersson and Marius Fransman, who have been very active there, even though they didn’t have a mandate to resolve the crisis. It is Minister Mildred Oliphant who does, but she happens to be overseas and will not come back even though she’s the only person in terms of law who can initiate negotiations about wages in the farming sector. [Interjections.]

President Jacob Zuma has not yet responded to any of my letters or urgent calls – in the middle of this kind of crisis – save to say that they acknowledge receipt of the letters. [Interjections.] There is only one Minister who has responded to me, and that is Minister Siyabonga Cwele with whom I have had a very productive meeting today. The fact therefore is that we have been doing everything in our power and if it were not for the Ministries in the Western Cape, the extraordinary officials who have been doing their jobs, this could have been turned into another Marikana, as the ANC wanted. [Interjections.]

Tony Ehrenreich, who is the leader of the ANC in the City Council, sent out a statement saying Marikana comes to the farms of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon Hani! Hon Uys is on the floor.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, half the time has already been completed and the Premier is making a speech here. She must just respond to the question, please. [Interjections.]

†The PREMIER: I’m responding to the issues, Mr Speaker. The question was what we are doing about it. I’m explaining what we’re doing about it. I can’t help that there’s a lot of stuff that we’re doing. You see, if it were not for all the things that we are doing about it, Mr Speaker, we would have had a Marikana on the Western Cape farms, as the ANC wanted us to have. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The PREMIER: In fact, the ANC leader in the City of Cape Town, Tony Ehrenreich, wearing his other hat for Cosatu, which is at the root a conflict of interest, sent out a formal statement saying, “Marikana comes to Western Cape farms” – exclamation mark, exclamation mark, exclamation mark! That is what he sent out, clearly obviously supporting it and driving it at every turn.

However, Mr Speaker, this will backfire on the ANC like nothing before, because it is their national Minister that has to negotiate national wages. I didn’t hear a word from Tony Ehrenreich or Marius Fransman, or anybody else in the ANC, when Mildred Oliphant was determining those wages in February. Minister Oliphant can’t determine one set of wages for the Western Cape and another for the North West Province, Limpopo and Mpumalanga.

I can tell you the ANC has saddled a tiger from which they will not be able to dismount. They will not be able to dismount it! This is going to boomerang so badly on the ANC and the other instigators who have been on the ground, and whom I have witnessed at first hand. [Interjections.]

†Mr M SKWATSHA: A long follow-up.
†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.] ... very much.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: In the light of your answer, hon Premier, can you enlighten the people of the province as to what you were doing last night when the province was burning? [Interjections.]

†The PREMIER: Well, we certainly held meetings all day yesterday, and I spent yesterday afternoon at the Joc. I popped in for a brief length of time at the end-of-the-year function of the national DA parliamentary caucus. The national DA parliamentary caucus had a function. I went there and I left very early in order to go to take my messages and other correspondence from people in the valley and from various people on the ground.

I worked very late into the night and I began working very early this morning. The truth is, I popped in for just over an hour to be with my colleagues in the National Assembly and I don’t think there’s a crisis in that.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Where was the hon member?

†Mr M SKWATSHA: So the Premier was at a party last night. [Interjections.]

†Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Where were you? [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon von Brandis, order! [Interjections.]

†Mr M SKWATSHA: It hurts. Hon Premier, why are you calling on the President to bring order to the province while you lack confidence in his ability ...

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Yes!

†Mr M SKWATSHA: ... to lead the country? You are asking him to bring order to your province yet you were enjoying yourself at a party last night.

An HON MEMBER: Amandla!

†The PREMIER: The truth is, I have absolutely no confidence in President Zuma to lead this country – and that has been reconfirmed by this crisis. It has been reconfirmed over and over again in this crisis. [Interjections.] It is unthinkable that in such a crisis, when I seek to call President Zuma’s office after I’ve sent him two urgent letters, that he cannot respond to me except through an acknowledgement of receipt.

As poor as I think his leadership is, Mr Speaker, I think it is still not beyond his capability to simply say to Minister Mapisa-Nqukula the time has now come to send in the army to support the police. I don’t think that is beyond his capability. Certainly I don’t think it’s beyond his capability to say to Minister Oliphant, “Will you please come home, because your portfolio is in crisis.”

All I asked was for him to do these two things: Bring in Minister Mildred Oliphant to deal with the crisis in her portfolio, and send in the army through the Minister of Defence – and only the President can do that – in order to support the police. I did not think that that was beyond the President’s capability, but now I believe it probably is. [Interjections.]
†The SPEAKER: That was your last chance, hon Skwatsha.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Oh. She wants help from you.

†Ms J L HARTNICK: Hon Premier, with reference to the letter to President Zuma, what will your response be if you do not get answer and how do you suggest we solve the problem?

†The PREMIER: The only response that I read today was the one in the newspaper that came from Mac Maharaj, which that said I must liaise with the different Ministers. Now, I have been trying to liaise with the different Ministers and it’s almost impossible to get hold of any of them. The one exception was Minister Cwele, and it was a very, very important discussion.

May I say this: The only way that the issue of the complete lack of leadership from the President, and from many of the Ministers, can be resolved is through the voters. Now, what we have been doing in the National Assembly is to pilot a vote of no confidence in the President.

This morning I went to the Rules Committee in Parliament to observe what was going on there. May I tell you, Mr Speaker, it was pathetic. It was pathetic to see how desperate the ANC was to prevent a vote of no confidence being tabled and debated in the Parliament. [Interjections.] They were desperate!

The Constitution provides for a vote of no confidence and what the ANC was seriously arguing in the Rules Committee, Mr Speaker – listen to this – was that the ANC, with a majority, can overrule a proposal to bring a vote of no confidence before Parliament. Now that must be totally unconstitutional, because the Constitution makes provision for a vote of no confidence in the President. Therefore, it cannot be the intention of the Constitution that you have to get support from the President’s party upfront before you can bring it before the House.

The opposition parties can move a motion for a vote of no confidence, but the truth is: People are entitled to a secret ballot and the ANC is terrified, absolutely terrified, that if the opposition parties bring that motion of no confidence before the National Assembly on a secret ballot, Mr Zuma may well lose. And then what happens to Mangaung? [Interjections.]

There’s absolute terror, because the complete lack of leadership from President Zuma is not only recognised by the opposition, Mr Speaker, it is also common cause in the ANC. So, indeed, what we are doing, hon Hartnick, is to drive this to expose what the ANC is doing on the ground and what Cosatu is doing on the ground.

They have saddled a tiger, which they will not be able to dismount, and we will continue to expose them in every forum for their complete lack of policy, corruption, unconstitutional behaviour, racism and incitement. Thank you.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Good!

†The SPEAKER: Premier, unfortunately your 20 minutes for replying to questions has expired. With hon Hartnick’s question we exceeded the 20 minutes, so it was your last chance.
INTERPELLATIONS

Question No 15 of 18 October 2012

†1. Mr G C R Haskin to ask Mr D Plato, Minister of Community Safety:

With reference to the reply furnished to Question No 15 on 18 October 2012, (a) in what respect does the information provided by the South African Police Service in reply to the question differ from the information provided to the victims and (b) what is the reason for the difference between these two replies?

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, the South African Police Services informed me as follows: As reported in Question 15 dated 18 October 2012 the member was found guilty and sanctioned by the SAPS disciplinary regulations. The reason why the complainant was never called to testify was that the member pleaded guilty and no further witnesses were required to testify in the disciplinary hearing.

That is the answer to the question, Speaker. Thank you.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, it is very concerning when the victims of this hit-and-run crime report information to me from the SAPS that is quite different to what the SAPS are reporting to the Minister to report to the House. It would seem to me that the SAPS are either disrespecting parliament, disrespecting the victims which, unfortunately, will be nothing new, or completely fiddling the facts.

The facts of the case are that the criminal case docket was not withdrawn pending the outcome of the laboratory report, as was reported via the Minister on 15 October 2012; the laboratory report was received by the SAPS in August 2011. They have had the laboratory report for a year, but they told us last month that they are still waiting for the laboratory report; that is the first point.

The second point is that the laboratory report showed apparently that the driver, the SAPS official, was three times over the legal limit for blood/alcohol. Secondly, the sanction that was handed down was simply to move the SAPS member as a VIP unit member from Tuynhuys to Kuils River Police Station.

What kind of sanction is that to a person who is a VIP unit SAPS official, who is involved as the perpetrator in a hit-and-run accident? CCTV cameras confirm that he drove off, that he drove down the R300 and members of the public had to chase after him. Members of the public eventually apprehended him and brought him back to the scene and he was arrested. We’ve got photographs of him handcuffed and sitting in the back of the car.

Mr Speaker, but what happens to him? He gets transferred from one area in the city to another. What kind of sanction is that and what kind of message does that send to the people of Cape Town and the Western Cape about the way in which we take their concerns seriously, and the manner in which the SAPS are going to follow up on crimes, not only committed by members of the public, but committed by members in their own uniform?
This is of deep concern, I believe, to all members, and I think the Minister needs to take this up with the SAPS. [Time expired.]

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Speaker, what the hon member is saying as well as his version is a concern. I just need to say that that hon MEC sitting there cannot reply to him. This has been dealt with by the House before. On one occasion the Speaker ruled that this was a national item and the Minister himself isn’t here to answer. That MEC has got nothing to do with what took place.

The hon member that just raised this issue has been told in the House before that the SAPS issues must be raised at national Parliament where the national Minister is seated – and they’ve got members to do that. It is not this Minister’s responsibility to be brought into this. [Interjections.] The only thing ...

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Carlisle!

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: ... this Minister is going to say is he can only ... [Interjections.] No, no, don’t talk nonsense, man; you are talking nonsense.

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order!

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Behave yourself in the House.

†The SPEAKER: Hon McKenzie ... [Interjections.] Hon Minister Carlisle, order please!

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Oh, no! Someone cannot behave himself. The only thing this hon Minister can reply to is that he can only say what has been handed to him because he has no mandate to be handling the question. The officials in the House have already been told that questions like that should not come on our Order Paper because it is a question of national interest and not a question for the House or that Minister. Thank you. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, after listening to the two hon members I want to advise that due to the fact that the incident happened within the boundaries of the Western Cape that the member forward follow-up questions to me. I think this incident warrants the asking of further questions. I don’t think we must just sweep the issue under the carpet. I want to advise the member to forward more questions to me so that we can get some further answers out of the SAPS. Thank you very much, Speaker.

*Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, it is important that accountability and discipline is required especially with the SAPS members, or that it is indeed there. It is also important that in a case of misinformation, the matter should be investigated. I reiterate: A culture of accountability is essential in the delivery of especially security services in the Western Cape. Thank you.
Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, it would seem to me that member McKenzie would like us to sweep these things under the carpet ... [Interjections.] ... because it reflects negatively on SAPS, which he thinks is part of his and his party's domain and untouchable by anybody else. [Interjections.] We cannot allow this to happen in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, that the ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G C R HASKIN: ... SAPS misleads this parliament by divulging facts that are completely inadequate.

The SPEAKER: Order! Members, we cannot hear hon Haskin. Please come to order. [Interjections.] Hon McKenzie, order! Please continue, hon member.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Either the SAPS are fiddling the facts, or they are misleading this parliament – and it is not the Minister’s fault – or they are misleading the victims because the victim’s story that they have received from the SAPS is quite different to the story that we have received here through the Minister. The victim’s story has only been developed after they phoned several investigating officers some 20 or 30 times – and they have got the record of how many times they phoned to gather the facts – and they are still trying to gather the facts.

Fortunately, because of this process – which shows that the SAPS do actually take part and do consider this somewhat important – and since we’ve raised these questions here, the SAPS have suddenly started taking an interest in this case and suddenly there’s progress, but it should not be the case that the SAPS do not have a customer service bone in their body. All they are interested in, if they’re interested in that at all, is enforcement. They need to realise, and I am sure the Minister is going to take this back to the SAPS in whatever capacity he can, that they need to pay attention to customer service needs, so that when people phone in and leave a message for the investigating officer to phone back, they don’t have to do it 30 times; they should do it once and they should get a phone call back the same day; but they don’t.

Members of the public against whom these crimes were perpetrated, including by SAPS officials themselves, have to phone SAPS 30 times in order to get information that should ordinarily be freely available to them, specifically because they are the victims.

It cannot be that the CCTV footage that was provided by the Minister of Transport and Public Works’ Department is unavailable to SAPS. If should be available, so that they can follow up on this crime. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon McKenzie, order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, to conclude this debate, as I said in my earlier point, I will definitely do the necessary to put further questions to SAPS on this matter and I will bring it back to this House.

Mr P C MCKENZIE: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER: It’s our job. We will work.
Strategies to curb crime during peak period for crime

†2. Mr R B Lentit to ask Mr D Plato, Minister of Community Safety:

What strategies does his department have in place to curb crime during the peak period for crime in the Western Cape, from November to February?

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, the department will embark on several initiatives to curb crime over the upcoming festive season. This will include the following initiatives.

The department has invited faith-based organisations and NGOs to submit proposals on programmes that they can offer to the youth over this period. These organisations will then be sponsored with R50,00 per child and/or youngster, up to a maximum of 150 children, to implement programmes focusing on youth from the ages of 14 years to 25 years in high-risk areas. The department has already started with the evaluation process of applications received and a total of R1 million has been allocated for this project.

The department will continue with the Expanded Partnership Programme (EPP), a pilot project initiated by the Department of Community Safety with the objective of strengthening the role of Community Police Forums (CPF). The CPF will continue to provide the department with information of possible threats over the festive season and will also work closely with the SAPS to share information on incidents.

The department will continue to train Neighbourhood Watch (NHW) members with a specific focus on the festive season. Resources in the form of bicycles, jackets, two-way radios and other aids will continue to be issued to these NHW entities.

The department approached NGOs dealing with drug addiction and issued more than 2 000 drug-testing kits to them. The NGOs will then encourage parents, who suspect that their children have a drug problem, to have their children tested free of charge. This will assist early detection of potential addiction, and parents can then arrange for their children to be enrolled in a rehabilitation programme.

The department will further implement the Chrysalis Youth Aftercare Entrepreneurial Skills Programme in Nyanga, facilitated by the Chrysalis Academy. This programme will assist youth to implement programmes in their communities with a focus on crime prevention – gangs and drugs – but also with an element of entrepreneurship.

The Department of Community Safety Provincial Traffic Services will conduct its integrated programme with SAPS and other stakeholders over the festive season. An element of this will specifically be interventions along the transport routes, as a means of intercepting the transportation, for example, of drugs and abalone.

The department will make a public announcement on the Festive Season action plan in a few days’ time.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, it is an unfortunate reality that alcohol- and drug-related crimes tend to spike during late November to mid-January every year.
Community Police Forums are key role-players in assisting with prevention programmes. Street crimes, physical abuse and various other antisocial activities are usually at the top of the list.

At the same time as these many kinds of crime are increasing, many organisations which deal specifically with violent crimes by offering sanctuary and trauma counselling to victims scale down their operations over the festive season.

Since gang violence has once again reared its ugly head on the Cape Flats a huge burden has been placed on our health care facilities. They are put under unnecessary pressure as a result of incidents which could have been avoided. Stabbings and gunshot wounds are only but a few violence-related injuries I can mention.

Furthermore, Mr Speaker, shebeens and alcohol outlets must be monitored in terms of ensuring that they abide by the legal trading hours. We cannot ignore the contribution to the huge social problems and crime caused by illegal establishments of this nature.

A clear crime prevention strategy is needed to focus on crime syndicates and organised crime and continual training of police officials.

Restoring the moral fibre of our society and the safety of our people around this time of the year should be our government’s priority.

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Mr Speaker, we welcome the fact that the MEC says that the department has strategies to cut crime during this festive season. I’m just a little concerned, and I hope that this plan works, because all the other plans that the MEC has brought to the House did not work and were doomed to failure.

In fact, to prove this, every single area that the MEC has visited with a crime plan, immediately when he left, crime escalated there. [Interjections.] Since MEC Plato visited parts of the Western Cape and proposed a crime plan to curb crime and violence, more murders have taken place.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, Order! Hon Minister Carlisle, your running commentary is very loud. We can’t allow you to do that.

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Thank you for trying to protect me against him, Mr Speaker. I appreciate it.

The recent spike in gang-related violence in Nyanga, Hanover Park and Bonteheuwel is a case in point. How can anyone argue about that? Also, what the hon member said is correct. Earlier this month – two weeks ago – three homes were destroyed by gangs, leaving many people homeless in Bonteheuwel. What happened to your gang plan?

I just hope that this plan to curb gangsterism over the festive season has not been worked out around the table with gangsters, whom we know you do meet, Minister. All these strategies followed after you addressed a gang meeting with the community in Bonteheuwel.
The whole thing flared up again. This year 21 young people – you talk about the youth – were killed in Hanover Park because of gang-related violence.

This year alone 21 people lost their lives there. This figure will increase by the end of the year. There was another spike in gang warfare in Hanover Park and you had been there. [Time expired.]

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, after listening to the hon McKenzie, let me remind the hon member, speaking with such confidence, that when he was in this position, for two terms ... [Interjections.] Let me say to you, today we still have gangsterism and violence and issues of crime in our communities. [Interjections.]

Now my question to the former hon MEC, that if he was so smart ...

†Mr P C MCKENZIE: Did I meet with gangsters?

†The MINISTER: But your party takes their money. Your party takes the gangsters’ money. That is what the gangsters are telling us. [Interjections.] Yes, yes! [Interjections.] Your party takes their money, and you know you talk to gangsters yourself ... [Interjections.] ... and you have admitted that. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon Minister and hon McKenzie! [Interjections.]

†The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: What did he say?

†The MINISTER: Let me continue, Speaker ...

Mr P C MCKENZIE: [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon McKenzie!

†The MINISTER: If the former Minister was so smart we would not have had all these current problems of crime in our communities. [Interjections.]

Let me say it is evident from the facts that you did nothing at the time when you were in this position. Currently we are trying our best to do a lot. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister! Order, hon McKenzie! This warning is the last chance that I’m giving you.

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, thank you very much. Let me further say to the hon member ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: Is the hon MEC allowed to address the hon McKenzie directly in his speech?

†The SPEAKER: The hon Minister addressed the House, not the hon McKenzie. [Interjections.] Proceed, hon Minister.
†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, lastly on that point – and I want the hon McKenzie, through you, to listen – he lived for many years in a gangster-stricken area, Bonteheuwel. [Interjections.] He was a Member of Parliament for Bonteheuwel ... [Interjections.] ... and nothing happened in Bonteheuwel even with him present in that community. It is still a gangster-stricken area on the Cape Flats even today. [Time expired.]

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, any strategy to address and prevent crime during the festive period needs to identify the dangers in a holistic way and reduce the various risks preventatively.

The Police, in the voice of Andre Traut, already promised in October 2012 to provide security during the ... [Interjections.] Please, Mr Speaker!

†The SPEAKER: Carry on, hon Minister. Continue with your speech. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: They want to communicate more loudly than I, Mr Speaker, so I will give them the opportunity.

†The SPEAKER: Hon member, carry on with your speech. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, order!

*Mr E J VON BRANDIS: The City of Cape Town also recently announced their public safety plan for the festive season, which will aim its focus on visual policing, alcohol- and drug-related crime, and road safety. It is gladdening to see the City of Cape Town's comprehensive approach with the announcement of their public safety plan. This includes disaster management, law enforcement services, fire and rescue services, health services, transportation and general safety.

A similar approach is also required of the provincial government. Over the past two years, the Safe Home campaign has already proven to be very successful and during the festive season it is important to work together not only at an inter-departmental level, but also with different levels of government in order to ensure that safety and crime prevention services cast a wide net.

Approximately 14 000 people die on South African roads every year. During December 2011 and January 2012 alone there were 163 deaths in the Western Cape. Although the statistics show a 12% decrease against the figures of the previous year, it is still too high a mortality rate. Every life is precious.

Mr Speaker, I urge every resident and all visitors to the Western Cape to ensure their own safety and that of others at all times.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, last year, the provincial ...

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon Ozinsky!

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, last year, the provincial Traffic Department was named as the only serious performer in the Department of Community Safety to reduce opportunities for crime on our roads.
My hope is that Minister Plato’s crime prevention strategies for the fast-approaching festive season will reduce opportunities to commit crime. It is therefore imperative that a relationship between SAPS, community police forums and security entities should be strengthened and intensified as these partners react fast and in most cases are first at a crime scene.

I hereby wish Minister Plato and his department all the best with their crime prevention strategies for the festive season.

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, further to the financial contribution of the Department of Community Safety, the Department of Social Development is coming to the party as well with an amount of R2,4 million for a holiday programme for the whole of the Western Cape.

Finally, we will do our best as the Department of Community Safety, together with all the security agencies in the Western Cape, to safeguard our citizens.

WCED: Audit Report on Learner Transport

†3. Mr M Ozinsky to ask Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

(1) Given statements made by the Minister in the House that he would make information in the public interest available from the state archives, whether there is a copy of the Audit Report on Learner Transport of the Western Cape Education Department available in the archives; if not, why not; if so,

(2) whether he will make such a copy available; if not, why not?

Interpellation 3 withdrawn.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Question standing over from Thursday, 15 November 2012, as agreed to by the House:

Reconstruction work on Sir Lowry’s Pass

*1. Mr E J von Brandis to ask Mr R V Carlisle, Minister of Transport and Public Works:

(a) What progress has been made with regard to the reconstruction work to Sir Lowry’s Pass and (b) what is the envisaged date of completion of this project?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Von Brandis. The question is with regard to reconstruction work on Sir Lowry’s Pass. The reply is as follows:

1. (a) The contract to repair the slip was awarded on 1 November 2012. It is expected to have the contractor on site by mid-November 2012.

(b) The planned completion date is the end of June 2013.
New questions:

*Interpretation of latest census figures in respect of service delivery*

1. Mr J J Visser to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

   How can the latest census figures announced by Statistics South Africa be interpreted in respect of service delivery in the Western Cape?

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, with the consent of the member I would like to request that we submit this question. It is quite long. We debated on this matter last week. There is therefore not much point in repeating everything again.

I could perhaps just briefly say that it is of paramount importance for all municipalities at this stage to realise that while we are doing very well with service delivery and basic services in the Western Cape, the objective would now be to respect the dignity of the 10% of households who do not have the privilege of access to services. We must also ensure that we phase them into our IDPs and budget over the next two or three years, so that they can also receive basic services.

If it pleases you and the member agrees, I would prefer to rather submit the question.

Reply as tabled:

**POPULATION**

1. According to Census 2011, the population in the Western Cape has increased by 1,30 million or 28,7 % in 2011 compared to 2001. Second to the Gauteng Province with a population growth of 33,7 %, the Western Cape Province has recorded the second highest population growth percentage of 28,7 % in 2011.

2. The Western Cape population represents 5,88 million or 11,2 % of the total population of South Africa of 51,77 million. This percentage share of the population is up from 10,0 % in 2001 to 11,2 % in 2011.

**ACCESS TO BASIC SERVICES**

**ACCESS TO WATER**

The Census 2011 revealed that 99,1 % of households in the Western Cape have access to tap or piped water. This is the highest percentage of households compared to other provinces. Of the 99,1 % households that have access to tap or piped water in Western Cape 75,1 % have access to tap or piped water inside the dwelling, 13,3 % of households with access to tap or piped water inside the yard, 8,3 % with tap or piped water on a community stand with a distance less than 200m from the dwelling and 2,4 % with tap or piped water on a community stand with a distance greater than 200m from the dwelling. Furthermore, 0,9 % of households have no access to tap or piped water in the Province.
ACCESS TO TOILET FACILITIES

The Census 2011 revealed that 96.9% of households in the Western Cape have access to toilet facilities. This is the highest percentage of households with access to toilets compared to other provinces. Of the 96.9%, 86.2% of households have access to flush toilets. In addition, 0.9% of households in the Western Cape have access to chemical toilet facilities, 0.6% of households have access to Pit Latrine with ventilation toilet facilities, 0.6% of households with Pit Latrine without ventilation and 3.7% of households use Bucket Latrine toilet facilities. Furthermore, 3.1% of households in the Western Cape do not have access to any toilet facilities, which is down from 7.7% in 2001.

PROVINCIAL INITIATIVES IN RELATIONS TO WATER AND SANITATION

The Department of Local Government supports and monitors the Municipal Infrastructure Grant program in the Western Cape to the value of R455 million in 2012/13. Historically, the larger part of this funding is utilised on bulk water and sanitation infrastructure which supports the provision of basic water and sanitation services. The Department of Human Settlements allocated funds to municipalities for the provision of basic water and sanitation services based on a study of service levels in informal settlements. The Department of Local Government supports this programme where bulk services are required. The Department of Local Government, Human Settlements, Water Affairs and municipalities are working together to improve the access to water and sanitation.

ACCESS TO ELECTRICITY

1. In the Western Cape 93.4% of households have access to electricity. The results showed that the proportion of households using electricity as a source of energy for lighting by province increased between 1996 and 2011. The highest proportion was recorded in the Western Cape Province with 93.4% of households using electricity as a source of energy for lighting.

2. Nationally, the proportion of households using electricity for cooking increased from 47.5% in 1996 to 73.9% in 2011. The proportion of households that was using paraffin, wood and coal as sources of energy for cooking decreased over the same period. The Western Cape Province has 86.9% of households using electricity for cooking, which is the highest percentage of all provinces.

3. Nationally, the proportion of households using electricity for heating increased from 46.3% in 1996 to 58.8% in 2011. The proportion of households that was using gas, paraffin and wood as sources of energy for heating increased over the same period. The proportion of households using electricity for heating increased in all provinces with the highest proportion recorded in Gauteng province (74.3%) followed by the Western Cape province (63.1%).

PROVINCIAL INITIATIVES IN RELATIONS TO ELECTRICITY

Through the Municipal Infrastructure Grant programme the Department of Local Government supports high mast lightning and street lightning projects in poor communities. The electrification of households takes place through the Integrated National Electrification Programme.
ACCESS TO REFUSE REMOVAL

Nationally, the proportion of households whose refuse is removed by weekly increased from 52,1% in 1996 to 62,1% in 2011. In the Western Cape Province 91,1% of households have access to refuse removal.

IN CONCLUSION

1. The Western Cape government is working hard to ensure that the Province is a place of growing opportunities and excellent service delivery and the results of this effort show in the census data. The number of people has increased significantly between 2001 and 2011. In-migration from neighbouring provinces to the Western Cape has contributed to the increased population in search of job opportunities and access to basic services. It is difficult to stay ahead with the increased demands for infrastructure development and the provision of basic services against current budget constraints.

2. In future, the Western Cape can expect more in-migration from other provinces and will have to work hard to accommodate those citizens who wish to make the Western Cape Province their home in search of job opportunities and improved service delivery.

Illegal abortions: details

†2. Mr G C R Haskin to ask Mr T L Botha, Minister of Health:

Whether his department is monitoring and reporting on the existence and work of practitioners who are providing illegal abortions; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details in this regard?

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, the reply is as follows:

2. Complaints from the public about illegal operators are channelled to our Professional Support Services in the department, who then investigates and reports the cases. It is difficult to follow through, as notices usually only include phone numbers and not the physical addresses of premises.

There is no data indicating how many women access illegal abortion services. There are probably many reasons for this. However, the main reason could be the social stigma attached to it, and it appears to be a quick fix.

The Choice on Termination of Pregnancy Act, Act 92 of 1996, provides the licensing requirements to provide such services. These facilities are designated by the provincial Minister by notice in the Government Gazette. The conditions under which terminations may take place are stipulated in the Act. Members of the public can enquire from the Department of Health whether a facility is listed or not. In the Western Cape, there are 34 public facilities listed, and 20 private facilities.

The Western Cape Department of Health strongly discourages pregnant women from doing illegal abortions. The department has facilities that offer a safe and free termination of pregnancy, where they will be offered counselling before and after the procedure.
If members of the public come across a poster advertising abortions they should report it to their nearest police station and to the Department of Health.

The Western Cape government promotes legal termination of pregnancies, and encourages family planning methods to avoid unwanted pregnancies.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, a key component of the question, looking for clarity on the Minister’s answer, is the extent to which the Department of Health officials who receive this kind of information – with phone numbers, for example – reported to the SAPS for investigation and for action. Does that take place in the Department of Health with those who receive this kind of information?

†The MINISTER: Yes, Mr Speaker, whenever we get information we do report it to the SAPS, but those who bring us the information must also report it to the SAPS. It is not only our obligation to look at that. Our obligation is actually to inspect and regulate the licensed institutions and not the unlicensed institutions. We should all make an effort to address this, because it is totally unnecessary to have illegal abortions. All the facilities are available. Counselling, medication and treatment are available and we should promote that.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, is the Minister aware of any healthcare facility reporting on, or complaining of, aftercare services due to injuries related to illegal abortions by these illegal practices.

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, if I understand the question correctly we have received complaints in the past but I do not have the information handy about how many, when or by who it was, but it has been handed over to our professional support services to follow up on. It seems very difficult to locate the practitioners because there is usually only a telephone number available and they also use representatives in the community to canvass candidates. This is all done behind the scenes and from different locations, not from fixed premises.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, can we assume from the Minister’s reply that all such adverts in terms of the question are advertising an illegal service.

†The MINISTER: I don’t think we can assume that, Mr Speaker, because there might be some of the legal institutions advertising so, we can’t assume that all advertisements are related to unlicensed and illegal practices.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Hon Minister, in the light of these services being available free of charge, don’t you think that probably the department and all other related institutions need to go into overdrive because if these services are available people can use them, especially in the mostly previously deprived communities where this practice is rife?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I don’t know whether I understand the question correctly; whether we should promote more advertisements. We are trying our very best and I must tell you that we have a very high percentage of usage and how many abortions we have is actually concerning, but that is a different issue that I don’t want to deal with now.

On the one hand we have to promote it as a safe method but on the other hand you don’t want to promote it as a contraception method.
Unfortunately, I visited facilities, Mr Speaker, that are very saddening, where I spoke to patients – 17, 18 19 years old – who have been there for the second or third time and that is very concerning. We definitely promote legal termination but it’s a balancing act not to promote it as a general alternative to contraception.

*Matters pertaining to the Safely Home campaign*

3. *Mr E J von Brandis to ask Mr R V Carlisle, Minister of Transport and Public Works:*

   Whether the Safely Home campaign in the Western Cape is on track; if not, why not; if so, (a) what programmes are being planned for the approaching festive season to promote road safety and (b) what are the further relevant details in this regard?

†The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, the reply is as follows:

3. Yes, the Safely Home programme is on track. As at the end of October 2012 fatalities on the roads from 2009 had fallen by 28% on an annualised basis from 1 793 per 12-month period to 1 216 per 12-month period.

   The only road using community road where there had been an increase in fatalities are motor cyclists, which is up by 11%.

   (a) During the festive season Safely Home will be launching its one millionth signature ambassadors pledge. This is a road safety pledge which we will ask all members of the House to sign in due course. We will also be participating in key law enforcement activities, including the joint operational roadblocks planned for this period.

   An educated festive season communication plan is currently being finalised that will speak to key messages in respect of road safety including drunk driving, speeding, safety belts and child restraint and cell phone usage.

   The launch of the new average speed over distance technology for the section Three Sisters to Beaufort West and Beaufort West to Laingsburg will take place on 5 December 2012. That will mean that the main black spot accident zones on the N1 will all be covered.

   (b) Law enforcement authorities will implement an integrated enforcement plan that focusses on speed enforcement, alcohol blitz roadblocks, drunk driving enforcement, integrated SAPS traffic roadblocks, increased vehicle fitness inspections, seatbelt and child restraint enforcement.

   At Red Cross today Child Safety launched yet a further chapter in their campaign to ensure children are properly restrained in cars.

   Public transport enforcement, this is busses, taxis, etc., will be addressed through, *inter alia*, the following initiatives:
The fatigue management sticker project; this is an initiative to perform vehicle safety checks and register long-distance transport vehicles at various ranks and checkpoints across the province.

Every bus and virtually every taxi on long distance journeys will be stopped at some point on its route for a check. In addition there will be fatigue management; last year the worst accident we had at this time was one that arose from fatigue and we will stop some 6 000 long distance taxis, test them for fatigue and where there is evidence of fatigue they will be required to stay for four hours at the point at which they stopped before the driver can go on.

We have also implemented a taxi contact line – that’s a 24-hour, seven day a week, contact number that allows members of the public, as well as enforcement agencies, direct contact to report bad behaviour in addition to obtaining verification of operating licence details, etc., etc.

Whilst the enforcement plan is driven by the Western Cape Government, integration with our neighbouring provinces, the Free State, Northern Cape and Eastern Cape, is taken into consideration.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Do we have a Free State now?

†The MINISTER: Of course we have a Free State.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Where? [Laughter.]

†The MINISTER: The man has a diminished sense of geography. [Interjections.] I continue with the reply:

As a result, joint operations during the festive season have been agreed to.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I would like to ask the hon Minister a question relating to the CCTV system between Three Sisters and Beaufort West. I would like to know, since the system had been installed, what reduction was there in the speed limit in that area?

†The MINISTER: It’s not a CCTV system, it’s a smart camera system, though it does have certain CCTV viewing. The reduction in people exceeding the speed limit on the section from the Eastern Cape border to Beaufort West was 54%. So, it works very well.

†Mr M OZINSKY: I would like to ask the hon MEC in which towns on the border with the Free State will his department be active? [Laughter.]

†The MINISTER: Hon Ozinsky, is, of course, correct. We are not contiguous with them but they form part of the whole safety operation because the two key roads from Three Sisters head off, one to the Northern Cape and one to the Free State.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Speaker, did the Minister say there had been an increase in motorcycle accidents and deaths in the period under review? If so, does the Minister have an idea as to what the cause of that is?
†The MINISTER: Yes, there has been a steady increase in the number of motorcycle deaths. Let me also say that in Australia, which we use as a role model, the biggest fatality community is motorcyclists. So, they’re a community very much at risk. Two things are happening: One is that the number of people using motorcycles is growing very fast. Then there will be higher fatalities.

The second reason I think, as far as motorbikes are concerned, is that the users of our roads not only do not respect each other in many cases – particularly the different modalities, motorcyclists, motorcars, taxis and cyclists – but have a kind of antagonistic attitude towards each other in many cases, and that in the end spells death.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Would the Minister agree that road surface conditions also play a role?

†The MINISTER: If there is grease or oil on the road it creates a situation where if the cyclist is not absolutely true, or is moving in either direction across that, the likelihood that the wheels will slide away underneath him is great. Obviously I am watching this. They are not a major component yet of road fatalities, but they are climbing. So I have been watching this with great care.

It is difficult to tell, because whether the motorcyclist came into contact with a car, or a vehicle before or after a slick is almost impossible to tell. So yes, it is a factor, but I don’t know how big a factor it is.

Incident at Cape Town Stadium

**4. Mr P Uys to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

(a) What measures have been put in place by the City of Cape Town and his department with a view to ensuring that spectators at events at the Cape Town Stadium are not injured and (b) what action is envisaged to prevent an accident similar to the one that took place on 7 November 2012 at the Linkin Park concert from reoccurring?

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Uys for the question. It was a very tragic event and I extend my deepest sympathies to the families. The reply is as follows:

4. Following the recent incident at the Cape Town Stadium, the City of Cape Town is reviewing all appropriate safety measures. The city has undertaken its own internal inquiry into the city’s processes and has appointed two external service providers to investigate the specific circumstances leading to the incident in question.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, thank you very much for the answer, Minister. What is the role of the MEC’s department, and in particular the disaster management unit, with respect to the safety of people there and also at other stadiums?

*The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, disaster management offers support and we help municipalities where we can, but this type of issue is a purely municipal matter.
I am satisfied that the Unicity is doing everything in their power to get to the bottom of this problem. Hopefully we can thereby avoid similar incidents in future.

I think it was a tragic incident and I'm very happy that the Unicity is really going out of their way. They have brought in two external service providers to see exactly what had happened there. Thank you.

*Mr P UYS: Can I ask if the company GSK, which was responsible for erecting the scaffolding, has paid any compensation to anyone who was injured or killed in this incident?

*The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, this is a new question. This is a purely municipal matter and I want to request that these types of questions should be addressed to municipalities. I am increasingly coming under pressure where I am being handed issues that are purely municipal, and the municipalities are going to reach a stage where they will say that they don't respond any more, and then we will have a problem.

*Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, is the MEC in fact saying that the City of Cape Town refused to answer him in this regard?

*The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I don't know if I should actually answer; it is so ridiculous. This is a purely municipal matter, they are conducting an investigation and I'm satisfied. Thank you.

*5. Mr P Uys to ask Mr A R Winde, Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:

(1) Whether any progress has been made with the process with regard to a public private partnership (PPP) at the Dennebos holiday resort in Ceres; if not, what are the relevant details; if so, what are the details in this regard;

(2) whether the rights of any tenant are being prejudiced by this process; if so, what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, the reply to the question is as follows:

5. (1) Witzenberg Municipal Council on 29 February 2012 approved the recommendation of a feasibility study to formally start with a PPP process for the Pine Forest Resort. Currently, the tender/bid specifications have been drafted and the Witzenberg Municipality intends to advertise the said bid before the end of 2012.

(2) The feasibility study adopted by council recommended that the lease agreements of leaseholders be cancelled before the start of the PPP tender process. This recommendation was based on sound financial and legal considerations. Notices were then given to leaseholders based on the council’s approval of the recommendations of the feasibility study.
However, subsequent to the decision of council, the municipality was approached by members of the Leaseholders’ Committee to discuss the issue of termination of leases with a view to reaching an amicable solution in the interest of all parties.

Various meetings with the Leaseholders’ Committee were held and discussions are progressing well. The municipality is at the point of signing an agreement that might possibly resolve the following:

- that leaseholders stay on beyond July 2013;
- that the successful bidder who will manage the resort, must provide in its future planning how leaseholders will be secured as anchor tenants;
- that leaseholders will be required to pay market related rentals and in addition also pay for tariffs like electricity, water and sewerage.

*Mr P UYS: May I ask if he and his department support the public private partnership that has thus far walked the road in Witzenberg?*

†The MINISTER: As far as I know from this answer, and I haven’t looked at the document myself, but I presume the answer would be yes.

*Mr P UYS: What are the losses suffered by the municipality annually with regard to the operation of this resort and as a result of which they now want to privatise the resort?*

*The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, thank you for that follow-up question, but it is definitely a new question. It is not part of the question I received. I cannot give you that answer now.*

*Mr P UYS: Could I ask the MEC whether MEC Meyer has approached him at all to intervene because two of the plots are his, and severe pressure had been placed on the Municipality to compromise? [Interjections.]*

*The MINISTER: No.*

*Action by SAPS on illegal advertisements in public and private places*

†6. Mr G C R Haskin to ask Mr D Plato, Minister of Community Safety:

Whether the South African Police Service has taken, or intends taking, any action against people and organisations in the Western Cape who, in order to advertise the sale of illegal products or services, continually post illegal advertisements in public and private places that are not designated for such advertising; if not, why not; if so what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, the reply to the question is as follows:

6. The South African Police Service informed me that advertisement in public places is dealt with in terms of the relevant municipal bylaws or proclamations.
The municipal law enforcement components of the municipalities in the Western Cape are responsible for enforcing the applicable bylaws as they relate to advertising.

However, the Department of Community Safety is of the opinion that any sale, and indeed advertising, to sell illegal products or services should be investigated by the South African Police Service in order to uphold the law. It is also for the local authorities and members of the public to report any such illegal activities and bring these under the attention of the South African Police Service.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: The Minister says that the SAPS inform him that all such allegations should be investigated. Does that mean we can assume that the SAPS does investigate all such allegations?

†The MINISTER: My understanding is, if you want to advertise on advertisement boards and things like that, you need the green light from the necessary local authority. They need to tell you you can and this is how you should do it. In this case, if it is not happening, then it warrants an investigation by law enforcement sectors of the municipality, such as the Department of Planning or the Metro Police or whatever.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: Does the Minister agree with allegations from members of the public that the SAPS fob off allegations of illegal advertising that are plastered around the City of Cape Town, in particular, and in fact that they don’t investigate them because they are irrelevant and minor?

†The MINISTER: I would ask the member that if he is of the opinion that the SAPS is not doing its work in that regard to bring it under our attention. It would then mean it is a new question and we will then gladly investigate that and get the necessary answers from the SAPS.

*Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, in light of previous discussions regarding illegal abortions, where advertisements are placed and abortions take place, and since there is a by-law that regulates it, would the Minister begin talking to other departments to see how they can address the problem?

*The MINISTER: I understand that if it is illegal, it is illegal and should be investigated. I am of the opinion that in the past, when such advertising occurred, that action had in fact been taken, according to what I read in the newspapers. It is not customary for these types of illegal activities to be advertised; action should be taken against it. If it is brought to my attention, we will talk to certain departments about taking the necessary steps to remedy it.

†Mr G C R HASKIN: In terms of the Minister’s reply that municipal bylaws must be enforced by the city, is he aware that there is only one person in the city that is charged with enforcing the bylaw with regards to illegal advertising, and actually welcomes the assistance of members of the public in this regard? Further, is the Minister able to provide assistance from the SAPS in terms of enforcing this?

†The MINISTER: I did not know that there is only one person in the city that is charged with enforcing the bylaw. I hear that now for the very first time this afternoon. If he is of the opinion that that one person is not capable of dealing with the issues and addressing the number of complaints, we will definitely have to bring it under the attention of the City of Cape Town to address. Thank you.
QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Plans to extend counselling at Khayelitsha Hospital

†1. Mr A M Figlan to ask Mr T L Botha, Minister of Health:

(1) Whether there are any plans to extend the facility at the Khayelitsha Hospital for the counselling of people using drugs or having a mental illness; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;

(2) whether there are any plans to open such a facility, like the one at Khayelitsha, at other township hospitals in the Western Cape in the near future; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, the answer is as follows:

1. (1) Patients with acute mental problems are currently assessed at the emergency centre. A total of 10 beds have been made available for the management of these patients. A mental health nurse, a psychologist and a medical officer have been appointed to provide the services to such patients. There are plans to extend the service which is dependent on additional infrastructure work schedules. It will take approximately two years for the infrastructure to be fully in place.

(2) The Mitchells Plain Hospital and the new G F Jooste Hospital will have similar services as those to which I have now referred.

I can also add, Mr Speaker, that we are adhering strictly to the 72-hours observation period and, if necessary, we then refer patients from there to the psychiatric hospitals.

N2 Gateway Project in Boystown

†2. Mr A M Figlan to ask Mr B S Madikizela, Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether the growing fight in the N2 Gateway Project in Boystown, where the people involved are not satisfied with the way in which the allocation of houses has been done, has been brought to his attention; if so, what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, I thank hon Figlan for the question. The reply is as follows:

2. The department is aware of discontent in the Boystown community and is in continuous discussion with members of the community through the structures that have been established for the successful implementation of the project. Every attempt is being made to ensure that the principle of transparency underpins the allocation process.

On an ongoing basis queries from segments of the community are handled. It must be borne in mind that the allocation of houses in an in situ upgrading, such as Boystown, is a very sensitive issue and needs to be handled with extreme caution.
Notwithstanding the progress that has been made to date, there is a section of the community that is for unknown reasons still opposed to the development. The allocations criteria and procedures have been broadly approved with the community. Accordingly, the allocations are being done in terms of these broadly approved criteria and procedures.

Mnu A M FIGLAN: Eyona ntotendifuna ohloniphekileyo uMphathiswa andicacisele yona yeiyokuba abahlali baseBoys Town bayayazi na ukuba kuza kuthatyathwa abantu nakwezinye iingingqi ukwenzela ukuba baye kuhlala kula ngqingqi? Oku ndikubuziswa yinto yokuba la prowujekthi inkulu ngu-N2 Gateway. Ingaba babayazi na ukuba asiyoBoys Town yodwa eza kuxhamala kweza zindlu?

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Mr A M FIGLAN: What I want the hon Minister to explain to me is whether the residents of Boys Town know that people are going to be taken from other areas and be placed there. The reason behind my question is that the N2 Gateway is a big project. Do they know that it is only Boys Town which is going to benefit from these houses?]

†The MINISTER: With the Boystown project, in terms of the agreement that was reached at a very early stage, it was always known that there were about five areas that would benefit from the project, namely Boystown, Gqobhas, Open Space, Crossroads and some other place, I think.

They have always been aware that those were the areas that were going to benefit. The allocation has been done, taking people from these areas. The people who are there now – I think we have already allocated 427 people to those houses already and these people are coming from these different areas. It has always been an understanding, with all these areas, that these people will be coming from these areas.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, who exactly are these elements that are hell-bent on creating this atmosphere there, which has been happening over a period of years? I know in the past the Premier was backing some group in the area, but exactly who is involved now?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I’m sure the hon member would be aware that there are two groups. There is the group that is seen to be lead by Councillor Depouche and the group that is seen to be led by Mr Noludwe. One of the things I did was to engage these groups in the form of a project-steering committee and I made an attempt to ensure that both groups were represented on the steering committee. I also involved a number of people coming from these areas that I’ve mentioned.

I think, by and large, with the assistance of the mediator we have managed to deal with some of the concerns. However, as I’ve said, there are people, particularly from the group which is led by Noludwe, who have been raising a number of concerns with us.
Key to these concerns is the issue of unfair allocation and we have dealt with those concerns because we went to these houses and verified that the people who were there were, indeed, the people who deserved to be there and to have the houses allocated to them. I think we have laid those concerns to rest, but this is the situation as things stand.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Minister for the answer. I think at least the Premier and the DA have realised that Noludwe ...

†The SPEAKER: Hon member, your question please.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Don’t you think that ... [Laughter.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon member!

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Would you be ready to take action against Noludwe – the problematic group, Minister?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I am quite confident that I’ve done the right thing, because both groups have levelled accusations at me. When I took action, there was a time when I felt that the group that is perceived to be led by Debouche was causing some problems and I took action against them.

Then there were times when the group that was led by Noludwe was perceived to be causing problems and I took action against both groups to a point where I was unpopular with both sides. This gave me an indication that I was doing my job correctly. I am prepared to take action against anyone who is disrupting that project.

†Mr M SKWATSHA: Hon Minister, don’t you think that in the process of building a healthy society, it would be proper for you to initiate a process of changing this name “Gqobhas”, which literally means “bad luck”? [Laughter.]

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, the hon Skwatsha knows very well that I have no powers to change the name of any community. The power to change the name lies with the community itself. That is my answer to the question.

Contingency plans to limit and minimise incidences of unrest and protests on farms

**3. Ms J A van Zyl to ask Mr H G van Rensburg, Minister of Agriculture:**

What contingency plans does his department have in place to limit and minimise the growing number of incidences of unrest and protests on farms in the Western Cape?

*The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Mr Speaker, I thank hon Van Zyl in her absence for the very relevant question. The answer is as follows:

3. Every day my department is involved with the Provincial Joint Operations Committees (Joc), where we, in cooperation with the police, are watching the current situations. And every day it is being upgraded.
My department also works with the Department of Social Development to see where people are suffering and where we must help. We are currently doing a survey of the damage that was done on farms the past 14 days. We are also doing a survey of the damage done abroad and the markets we might have lost because of this.

Then, Mr Speaker, I liaise with the agricultural and rural community as often as possible and my objective is to urge them to act calmly and responsibly. I liaise with the police and we had conversations with them this morning and I facilitate our actions in concert where possible.

We call on the defence force to assist with visibility, support and peace actions where necessary. I urge everyone involved to take part in the legal process as laid down by Minister Oliphant to help her make well considered decisions. This process gives everyone the opportunity to talk about their problems; therefore I condemn any form of intimidation, of violence, of arson, of any illegal actions. May this never happen again.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Hon MEC, given that the question asks you what plans you’ve made to limit and minimise the growing number of incidents, do you think you’ve had any effect in reducing the number of incidents?

*The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I’m trying my best to assure that this never happens again, but it is definitely not within my control. I’m definitely not one of the instigators.

†Mr M OZINSKY: In any of the work the department has done in the last three-and-a-half years under you leadership was there any indication that such an uprising would take place?

*The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, as we are doing a lot of development work regarding the farmworkers and as we pay a whole lot more than the rest of the country, it is very, very suspicious that this protest started in the Western Cape.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Given that you’ve now answered that you didn’t know that this would happen, why do you think your department was unable to predict that such an event would happen?

†Mr M G E WILEY: Because they don’t sit in the ANC caucus. [Interjections.]

†Mr P UYS: Shut up.

†Mr M OZINSKY: You sound worse than the ... 

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

*The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, this is not within my control. I would never make such a decision and I urge those people who are involved in such decisions to never do it again.

*The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Skwatsha should take over.
Mr M OZINSKY: What steps are you going to take to ensure that your department is more in touch with the majority of people in the rural areas?

*The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Mr Speaker, I challenge any ANC provincial department who is more involved with rural and farmworker development than we are.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Hear, hear! [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! It was your last chance. Take your seat, hon member. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Order, hon Minister Plato and hon Ozinsky. Hon Minister Plato, Order!

An HON MEMBER: Put him out.

†Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, on a point of order: Is it parliamentary for the hon MEC to say that I instigated things on the farms?

An HON MEMBER: But you did. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You do that.

†The SPEAKER: Order! I didn’t hear the hon member say that. Minister Plato, do you want to address the Chair?

†Mr M OZINSKY: He said that. He pointed at me and he said you instigated this. [Interjections.]

†The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, it was a reaction to what he said. He said, “Boycotts will start on the farms”. Then I said, “If you know boycotts are to start on the farms it means you’ve got information that we don’t have.” [Interjections.] That was my reaction. [Interjections.]

†The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Take your seat, hon Skwatsha. [Interjections.] Hon Magwaza, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! I will make a ruling at a later stage on this matter, hon members.

Multiparty forum in George

*4. Mr P Uys to ask Mr B S Madikizela, Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether he has established or plans to establish a multiparty forum in George; if so, (a) what is the purpose of the forum and (b) who are the role-players who form part of the forum?

†The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, the answer is as follows:

4. I did announce an intention to establishment a multiparty forum through which community groups can engage with the George Municipality.
(a) The intention of the forum is to ensure that there is a structured means of communication through which community groups can interact with the municipality, according to a set of principles and conditions that are acceptable to all parties.

It is hoped that such a forum will help to avoid future perceived miscommunication, and ultimately ensure fair human settlements service delivery for all the residents within the greater George region. It is also hoped that the elected representatives of communities can engage government before protest action arises, which will assist in avoiding conflict.

(b) Role-players will include representatives of all political parties and non-governmental and community organisations in the George region. Municipal councillors will also have *ex officio* status in these forums or councils.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, thank you to the MEC and I welcome his announcement here. Can I just ask: What are the challenges of human settlements in the George area?

†The MINISTER: Well, from where I’m sitting, the only way from me to be able to see if there are any challenges is the report that I’m getting from the municipalities. In my opinion George is one of the best-performing municipalities when it comes to human settlements.

However, a number of people, particularly the group that I met with, are saying that the communication with the municipality is not very good in terms of various programmes that are implemented by the municipality. A number of issues that were raised in the memorandum that I received really had more to do with the mandate of the municipality about basic services. However, with human settlements the main issue really is a lack of communication and understanding of the programmes that we implement in the George municipality. That is what was raised by the group that I had a meeting with.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, yes, I think that’s a good initiative. Can the MEC tell us when he will establish this forum? Will it be soon, in January, or when will it happen?

†Mr M C WALTERS: Why? Do you want to be a member?

An HON MEMBER: Why not?

†The MINISTER: When I had a meeting with the group I did make a commitment that I would go back to the municipality in the third week of January 2013. One of the things I have to do now is to consult with all the relevant role-players so that when we meet during the third week of January we will be able to sit around the table with all of them and agree on the shape and form that the forum will take and the terms of reference, etc.

The commitment that I made is that I’m only going back in the third week of January 2013, because we will have agreed on the way forward in terms of how this forum will be formed and what shape and form it will take.
Mr P UYS: Thank you, MEC. MEC, will you be chairing this forum?

The MINISTER: Definitely not, because I could see that the relationship between the municipality and the group, which brought the grievances to me, was not very good. I did make it very clear that one of the reasons why I’m doing this is so that the group and the municipality can work together.

Therefore I have no intention of chairing the forum from this level. The intention is to ensure that all the leaders of the political parties and members of civil society organisations start a process of bridging the gap in terms of communication so that they are able to work together in the future and the municipality will be the key in this particular process.

Progress made by municipalities with regard to capital spending

5. Mr P Uys to ask Mr A R Winde, Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:

(1) What progress has been made by municipalities with regard to their capital spending in the 2012/2013 financial year;

(2) whether it is expected that there will be any underspending in municipalities in the Western Cape in the current financial year; if so, what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, the answer to Question 5 is as follows:

5. (1) The year-to-date total aggregated capital expenditure by municipalities in the Western Cape as at 31 October 2012 amounts to R1,3 billion or 15,12% of the total adjusted capital budget of R8,61 billion. The detailed spending per municipality is attached for further information and I will send you the document now, hon Uys.

(2) The Provincial Treasury monitors the spending of the capital budget through the Section 71 monthly budget statements submitted by municipalities. The current spending levels suggest underspending by most municipalities in the province. However, the impact on service delivery would differ from municipality to municipality and will have to be obtained from each individual municipality.

Provincial Treasury did request all municipalities during the budget engagements process, the LGMTEC 3, to improve the planning processes surrounding the implementing of the capital budget to avoid the underspending of the capital budgets.

So, it’s really to make sure that the municipalities have their plans in place. We always see that lag in the beginning of the year and we need to get the expenditure to come through towards the end of the year.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, do I understand it correctly that for four months it’s only 15%? Just to check, what is your department doing and is there a role for the De-
partment of Local Government to improve the capital spending because there’s already envisaged underspending?

†The MINISTER: Agreed. There is a joint committee between local government and Treasury who interact on a regular basis with local government. As I said in my answer, the LGMETEC 3 process but also even going to the PCF process, continually monitoring month on month, to make sure that where there is necessary support needed in these municipalities – where we see the laggings or the shortfalls – that they have it. The last question that you asked on this was the same position. Specifically monitoring the capital expenditure is a big concern and we need to make sure that we do spend all of our money.

†Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, to the MEC, is there a specific trend in capital expenditure, meaning specific projects, that is really taking a dip? I just need to understand what needs to be addressed.

†The MINISTER: I can’t say that there is a specific trend, because when I give you the breakdown of all the municipalities – I’ll send it to you now – you will see that certain municipalities might be a bit ahead of others. It’s not necessarily a specific trend, because if you compare the differences of last year to this year, you can see it is really about a planning issue. It is making sure that if there are blockages in the way that those blockages are removed or that the plans are put in place so that they actually get that expenditure flow to go properly.

You will see that certain projects might be EIA processes that might be slowing it down or it could be infrastructure underlying a specific capital expenditure project. There are various issues, and they change and differ from municipality to municipality.

_Upgrading of so-called “plankieskole”_

6. Ms J L Hartnick to ask Mr D A C Grant, Minister of Education:

Whether the upgrading of the so-called “plankieskole” is taking place everywhere in the rural areas; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Hartnick for the question. The reply is as follows:

6. In 2010, the Western Cape Government developed an infrastructure plan that included, amongst other things, the replacement with brick and mortar structures, over a three year period, of 20 schools that were originally built with inappropriate materials. These schools are commonly referred to as “plankieskole”. In most instances, these structures are made from wooden or chipboard materials that were built during the apartheid era. The policy of the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) is to replace “plankieskole”, where possible, rather than upgrading them.

Using our Geographic Information System (GIS) and information obtained from the districts, we were able to ascertain which school buildings were in dire need of replacement.
These schools are spread across the province in both urban and rural districts and are being replaced progressively.

Rural schools that have already benefited from this plan include the Cloetesville Primary School in Stellenbosch, the Klapmuts Primary School in Klapmuts, as well as the M M Mateza Primary School and the Thembalethu Primary School in George.

We are currently replacing the building structures of the Gansbaai Primay School in Gansbaai, the Kathleen Murray Primary School in Grabouw, the Wes-Eind Primary School in Franschoek and the Touwsranten Primary School in Worcester.

Our new infrastructure plan for the 2013-14 to 2015-16 financial years will also include the replacement of schools in various rural areas. Schools to benefit include three schools in the Cape Winelands, five schools in the Overberg, five in Eden and Central Karoo and five in the West Coast District.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, I would like to know from the Minister what the cost implications are for the next 12 months and also for the following 12 months to replace these schools.

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I'm not quite sure I understand the cost implications. We are building brick and mortar schools to replace old "plankie huisskole". Basically, each one has its own budget. If one looks at the average cost of what we are spending on schools, you will see that it is of the order of about R31 million a school.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, to be clear, can I ask what the cost implications are to replace these structures versus the other educational responsibilities?

†The SPEAKER: Do you follow the question, hon Minister?

†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, let me try to explain the matter a different way. Regarding the cost implications for schooling as a whole, we find that the infrastructure development as opposed to the operational cost works in a ratio of about 20% to 80%.

†Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you.


[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Ms M TINGWE: Speaker, I want to know from the prefab schools he says are going to be looked at in next year’s budget, which are they? He must mention places. I want to know which are these schools so that what he is saying has really happened.]
†The MINISTER: Mr Speaker, I’m happy to supply the hon Tingwe with a list of the 18 schools.

Delivery of PC tablets to principals: details

†7. Ms C Labuschagne to ask Mr D A C Grant Minister of Education:

(1) Whether each principal in the Western Cape has received his or her PC tablet, as mentioned in the budget speech of the Minister on 23 March 2012; if not, why not; if so, what are the details with regard to (a) the training provided to principals to ensure the optimal usage of these tablets and (b) the technical assistance provided in this regard;

(2) whether Internet services are provided to the principals; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

†The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, I thank the hon Labuschagne for the question. The reply is as follows:

7. (1) The Western Cape Education Department (WCED) undertook to deliver tablet computers to schools for use by their principals before the end of this school year. These have been delivered in tranches with the final tranche being delivered during the course of this week.

(a) The WCED will provide training for principals and district directors in early January 2013. The department has trained 20 officials who will support principals further. The training for principals will include how to use the tablet as a professional lifestyle tool for organising and recording meetings, communication, reading and writing, presentations and professional learning.

(b) A dedicated helpline will also provide technical assistance to principals and district directors.

(2) Yes. The WCED has provided SIM cards for the tablets that meet applicable Rica requirements, as well as a 500 MB data bundle with each SIM card. The tablets can also be connected to Wi-Fi facilities. Principals and schools can augment these data bundles using funds allocated to schools by the WCED in the ordinary course in terms of national norms and standards.
INTERPELLATIONS UNDER NAME OF MEMBER
(as put to relevant Minister)

Bevu, T N
Education.................................................................3846, 3850, 4137
Health........................................................................2542, 2546
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........3014
Transport and Public Works.............................................1619, 3293

Beerwinkel, C F –
Education........................................................................2367, 2407, 2422, 2428, 2431, 2432
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .................................3889, 3889
Transport and Public Works....................................................2598

Brandis, E J –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ..................................2373, 2428, 2465, 2644, 3831,
.........................................................................................3887, 3887
Transport and Public Works....................................................2374, 2415, 3362, 3742, 3743, 3745

Brown, T L –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ......................................2469,

Du Toit Marais, A J
Community Safety ................................................................3914, 3913, 3942
Cultural Affairs and Sport .........................................................2358, 2359, 2360, 2367, 2368, 2417, 2419
Health...1361, 1467, 1497, 2545, 2602, 3134, 3136, 3228, 3295, 3326, 3332, 3447
.........................................................................................3484, 3486, 3708, 3776, 3828, 4088
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..3258, 3259,
.........................................................................................3261
Social Development .............................................................1419, 2651, 2652, 302, 37541
Transport and Public Works.....................................................2548, 3706

Eloff, E H –
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................................2434
Education...........................................................................2366

Figlan, A M –
Housing.............................................................................3749, 3833

Fritz, A T –
Social Development ................................................................3753

Haskin, G C R –
Community Safety ............ 3487, 3524, 3526, 3912, 3914, 3912, 3914, 3914, 3940, 3942

Hani, V –
Health..................................................................................2601

Hartnick, J L –
Cultural Affairs and Sport .........................................................1311, 1405, 1661
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jacobs, P M</td>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>1464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne C</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>2404, 2423, 2541, 3778, 3849, 4086</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne C</td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>3368, 3369, 3371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne C</td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>3446, 3873</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lentit, R B</td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>3915, 3919, 3915, 3919, 3943, 3947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne C</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magwaza, N P</td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>3772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne C</td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1658, 3370, 4138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magaxa, K E</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majola, T R</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majola, T R</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, A J D</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>17, 81, 83, 192, 515, 583, 1245,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, A J D</td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>1022, 1657, 1658,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbalo, B G</td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>3131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKenzie, P C</td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>2422, 2548, 3487, 3526, 3842, 3846, 3913, 3916, 3913, 3941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKenzie, P C</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKenzie, P C</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3751</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKenzie, P C</td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>2642, 2643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>2406, 2469, 2539, 2542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>3227, 3228, 3324, 3326, 3707</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3747, 3748, 3750, 3831, 3834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>3403, 3408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>3019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 2597, 2599, 3363

Ozinsky, M –
Agriculture ........................................................................ 2372, 2417
Cultural Affairs and Sport ............................................. 3919, 3948
Education ........................................................................... 1414, 3056, 3059, 3776, 3778
Health .............................................................................. 2364, 2420
Housing ............................................................................ 3751
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ... 1282, 1311
... 1357, 1410, 1547, 1549, 1620, 2400, 2403, 2645, 2650, 3013, 3017, 3022, 3025
........................................................................... 38513891, 3894, 3891, 3895
Premier ................................................................. 1242, 1278, 3137, 3138, 3139, 3293, 3324, 3356, 3358, 4080
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 1617, 2416, 3365, 3705

Prins, E –
Agriculture ........................................................................ 754, 2398
Health .............................................................................. 143
Housing ............................................................................ 1104
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ................. 2421

Skwatsha, M –
Agriculture ........................................................................ 2371
Community Safety .......................................................... 2422
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........................................... 2430
Health .............................................................................. 2543, 3135, 3226, 3227, 3293, 3296, 3446, 3485
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............... 3408
Social Development ................................................................ 2653
Premier ........................................................................... 249
Transport and Public Works .............................................. 1628

Stali, Z C –
Cultural Affairs and Sport . 1361, 1407, 1659, 1661, 1661, 2355, 2356, 2358, 2360,
........................................................................... 2410, 2419
Premier ........................................................................... 3703
Social Development ................................................................ 1242, 3752, 3755
Transport and Public Works ...... 2550, 3360, 3362, 3397, 3442, 3446, 3745, 3836,
........................................................................... 3869, 3872, 3869, 3871

Strachan, G R –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........................................... 18, 81
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............... 453
Premier ........................................................................... 3,187,352

Tingwe, M
Education ............................................................................ 1500, 2540, 3444, 3844, 3848, 4087

Uys, P –
Agriculture ........................................................................ 2372
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ............... 2369, 2371
........................................................................... 2372, 2426, 2427, 3260, 3328, 3404

Walters, M C –
Agriculture ........................................................................ 13,964, 2361, 2374, 2396, 2397, 2399, 2416
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Members</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>Wiley, M G E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Visser, J J</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>Von Brandis, E J</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
QUESTIONS
(Oral and Written: as put to relevant Minister under name of Member)

Beerwinkel, C F –
Agriculture ................................................................. 984
Cultural Affairs and Sport .............................................. 1667, 2626
Education ... 960, 1117, 1118, 1178, 1179, 1257, 1258, 2388, 2392, 2393, 2531, 2533,
................................. 2577, 2578, 2611, 2613, 2657, 2658, 2659 , 2672, 3877, 3877
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ...... 2635, 2683, 2705, 2706, 2707, 3342
................................. 3156, 3219, 3222, 3270, 3416, 3417, 3462, 3490, 3494, 3725, 3726
Health ................................................................. 3475
Housing ....................................................................... 1287
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ......600,690,
................................................................................... 691,722,723,802,803,838,874,937,960,999, 3463
Transport and Public Works ............................................. 1072, 1081, 1117, 3304, 3393

Bevu, T N –
Agriculture ..................................................................... 1560
Community Safety .......................................................... 1185, 1264, 3499
Education ...................................................................... 1120,3505
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .............. 2480
Housing ....................................................................... 3268, 3725
Premier ......................................................................... 1250, 1425, 3709
Social Development ........................................................ 707,708
Transport and Public Works ............................................. 1122, 1559, 2481,3303

Boesak, A A –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .................. 100
Health .......................................................................... 45, 96
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 99

Brown, L –
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ...... 2435, 2436, 2437, 2438, 2487,
2561
.................................................................................. 3720
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning .......... 3881
Premier ................................................................. 326,367,368,439,464,469,594,595,697,1141,1143,
..1146, 1176, 1426, 1428, 1458, 1461, 1487, 1550, 1578, 2673, 2698, 2701, 3756,
.. 3851, 4016
Transport and Public Works .............................................. 1567

Cupido, P W –
Community Safety .......................... 448, 449, 544, 849, 883, 1304, 2638, 3100, 3125
Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 309
Education ................................................................. 510, 721, 775, 776, 950, 1172, 3240, 3284
Health ...................................................................... 1329, 3124, 3285
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ......600, 689,
................................................................................... 885, 941, 1171, 1328, 2639, 3126, 3881
Social Development ........................................................ 951
Transport and Public Works .............................................. 502,503,543
Du Toit Marais, A J –
Community Safety .......................................................... 3428, 3722
Cultural Affairs and Sport ................................................. 3875, 3875
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ..................... 3245
Health ............ 1373, 1404, 1437, 1438, 2554, 2555, 2609, 2615, 3151, 3152, 3427
.......................................................... 3901, 3901, 4104, 4107
Housing .......................................................... 3496, 3531
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning... 3533, 3535
Social Development ........................................ 1372, 1431, 1470, 1630, 3473, 3491, 3496

Eloff, E H –
Agriculture .......................................................... 211, 2672, 3246
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ......................... 876
Health .......................................................... 876, 1562, 1563, 3960
Housing .......................................................... 3960,
Transport and Public Works ............................................. 217, 946, 1270, 1292

Figlan, A M –
Community Safety .......................................................... 3531, 3739
Health .......................................................... 3471, 3930,
Housing ......... 3416, 3422, 3452, 3453, 3493, 3527, 3528, 3536, 3897, 3900, 3930,
.......................................................... 3897, 3899, 3930, 3961, 3987, 3988, 3997, 3998, 4008, 4110
Social Development .................................................. 3471, 3490

Gabru, Y –
Cultural Affairs and Sport.................................................. 876, 938
Education .......................................................... 26, 73, 206, 435, 612, 797, 846, 962, 985
Health .......................................................... 393
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning... 3339, 3340
Premier .......................................................... 1

Geyer, H P –
Education .......................................................... 606, 1381, 1675
Health .......................................................... 4012
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning...... 219, 545,
...... 600, 689, 3155, 3246, 3287, 3304, 3314, 3395, 3396, 3417, 3522, 3716, 3763,
.......................................................... 3784, 3799, 3803, 3838, 4008, 4109
Premier .......................................................... 24
Transport and Public Works ............................................. 165, 166, 203, 475

Hani, V –
Community Safety .......................................................... 1538, 1742, 2529
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning...... 2569
Health .......................................................... 2694, 2696, 3037, 3127, 3128
Social Development .................................................. 1569, 1706, 2674, 2675, 2698, 4166
Premier .......................................................... 3378, 4166

Hartnick, J L –
Agriculture .......................................................... 957
Community Safety .......................................................... 3479, 3722, 4028
Cultural Affairs and Sport........................................ 122, 348, 833, 849, 859, 885, 993, 1032, 1054, 1055,
.......................................................... 1074, 1086, 1089, 1137, 1148, 1151, 1183, 1238,
Haskin, G C R –
Community Safety .................................................. 3431, 3827, 3928, 3957, 4027
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................ 3520
Education .................................................................. 3477
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .................. 3520
Health .................................................................... 3905, 3922, 3923, 3924, 3905, 3922, 3941
Housing ................................................................... 3476
Social Development .................................................. 3711, 3714
Transport and Public Works ........................................ 3432, 3717, 3759, 3760, 3926, 4029

Jacobs, P M –
Community Safety ................................................... 28, 129, 162, 175, 202, 345, 371, 726, 792, 945
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................... 973, 1260, 1288, 2582, 2627
Education ................................................................. 1081, 1632, 1633, 1686
Housing ................................................................ 30, 35, 45, 64, 66, 67, 98, 121, 128, 152, 156, 160, 174, 447, 500,
.................................................................................. 501, 714, 715, 836, 873, 1059, 1127, 1128, 1191, 1259, 1390,
.................................................................................. 1392, 1440, 1443, 1446, 1447, 1469, 1646, 1647, 1671, 1672,
.................................................................................. 1684, 2533, 2534, 2537, 2585, 2586, 2613, 2689
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning . 1391, 2622
Social Development .................................................. 725
Transport and Public Works ........................................ 1684

Labuschagne, C –
Community Safety ................................................... 993, 1622, 1624, 3414
Education ................................................................. 1650, 3027, 3119, 3153, 3154, 3345, 3351, 3473, 3730, 3763, 3969,
.................................................................................. 3782, 3939, 3873, 3939, 4023, 4024, 4026, 4125
Health .................................................................... 451, 508, 544, 958, 1335
Premier ................................................................... 537, 1070, 1112, 1662
Social Development .................................................. 421, 422, 1373, 1433, 1675, 3419, 3478, 3492, 4124
Transport and Public Works ........................................ 3798

Lentit, R B –
Agriculture ............................................................... 3043, 3885, 3896, 3886, 3896
Community Safety ................................................... 3096, 3244, 3347, 3421, 3929, 3929, 3960
Education ................................................................. 2487, 2553, 3029, 3080, 3241, 3426, 3477, 3509, 3938, 3938, 3969
.................................................................................. 3970
Health .................................................................... 3071, 3079, 3107, 3174, 3299, 3302, 3389, 3391, 3391, 3475
.................................................................................. 3728, 3836, 3860, 3923, 3924, 3952
.................................................................................. 3150, 3712, 3714
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning . 1391, 2622,
.................................................................................. 3030, 4002, 4003
Premier ................................................................... 3334, 3373, 3375
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Ministry/Department</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Magaxa, K E</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>322, 3898, 3898, 4111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magwaza, N P</td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>1034, 1226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>2615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>696, 1027, 4162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>365, 366, 380, 388, 714, 773, 782, 817, 819, 822, 1325, 1327, 1514, 1516, 1557, 1558, 1665, 2687, 3039, 3239, 3352, 3353, 3824, 3826, 3839, 4164, 4165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majola, T R</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>828</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>1576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, A J D</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>360, 1641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>2474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>103, 108, 222, 374, 424, 426, 511, 546, 797, 806, 807, 856, 997, 1135, 1136, 1209, 1221, 1255, 1256, 1292, 1293, 1320, 1563, 1564, 1616, 2475, 3116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>23, 225, 226, 379, 484, 782, 820, 823, 827, 872, 1181, 1183, 1222, 1321, 1664, 1666, 3117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbalo, B G</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>3801, 3836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>3791, 3794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>3376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKenzie, P C</td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>102, 163, 776, 777, 778, 1081, 1127, 1190, 1614, 1623, 1674, 2562, 2684, 3273, 3415, 3431, 3499, 3500, 3532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>3351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>601, 3391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3147, 3530</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>3265, 3534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>98, 1028, 1312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>3151, 3163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mqulwana, K A</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>3730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>853</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Premier .................................................................................................................................................. 872,900
Transport and Public Works ........................................ 388,603,694,699,700,764,1129,1132,1179, 1180, 1251, 1252, 1255

Ncedana, M –
Community Safety .......................................................... 488,528, 1631, 3272, 3497, 3721,3762, 4029
Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 488
Education .................................................................................. 3348, 3351
Health .................................................................................. 1438, 1614, 3301
Housing .......... 1098, 1139, 1639, 3028, 3066, 3147, 3270, 3335, 3384, 3394, 3713 3723, 3763
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ..... 541, 3971
Premier .................................................................................. 4001
Social Development ................................................................... 3299

Ozinsky, M –
Agriculture .................................................................................. 3933, 3964
Community Safety .......................................................... 1229, 1520, 1536, 3231, 3247
Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 1274, 1668
Education .................................................................................. 1274, 3034, 3765, 3784,3902, 4096
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........... 1274, 1445, 3244, 3342, 3766
Health .................................................................................. 438, 546, 1240
Housing .................................................................................. 1241, 3076, 3143, 3933
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 1091, 1092, 1138,1157,1202,1229,1261,1262,1339, 1374, 1519, 1565, 1678, 2379, 2380, 2394, 3036, 3222, 3791
Premier .................................................................................. 23, 97,202,1114,1146,1177,1224,1313,1342, 1368, 1395, 1421
Social Development .......................................................... 1240, 3074, 4099
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 213, 1229, 1566, 1679, 3316, 3757

Paulse, S U –
Community Safety .......................................................... 176, 389, 1010
Cultural Affairs and Sport .................................................. 140, 1454, 1456
Education .................................................................................. 140, 168, 1403
Health .................................................................................. 220
Housing .................................................................................. 177, 427, 1011, 1451, 1481
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 552,576, 1172, 1453, 1485, 1488
Premier .................................................................................. 534
Social Development ................................................................... 1008
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 396,552,803

Prins, E –
Agriculture .......................................................... 33,34,35,603,839,1038,1132,1180,1182,1203,1263, 1265, 1291, 1297, 1568, 1569, 1639, 1641, 1742, 2595, 2596, 2621, 2655, 2680, 2703, 3034, 3035, 3051, 3052, 3066, 3067, 3071, 3072, 3243, 4167, 4168
Education .................................................................................. 1132
Housing .................................................................................. 121, 155, 1321, 1325
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ....... 205,700, 702, 765, 1082, 3112, 3127, 3243, 3265
Transport and Public Works ........................................... 2665
Rossouw, A –
Agriculture .......................................................... 3811, 3837, 3886
Community Safety .................................................. 1380, 1673, 3990
Cultural Affairs and Sport ....................................... 79, 803, 997, 998, 1207, 1380, 1399, 1435, 1448, 1453, 1462
Education ............................................................ 164, 607, 720, 954, 955, 1336, 1401, 2478
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism ........... 843, 1449
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........................................ 41
Premier ..................................................................... 57,327,329,415
Social Development .................................................. 1400, 3101
Transport and Public Works ....................................... 1272, 4103

Skwatsha, M –
Agriculture ............................................................. 1259, 3384
Community Safety .................................................... 1288, 3073, 3110, 3230, 3231, 3432, 3479
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................ 3268, 3875, 3876
Education ............................................................... 1006, 2479, 2552, 3236, 3238, 3767, 3787
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .......... 1119, 1206
Health ..................................................................... 2692, 3153, 3311, 3391, 3394, 3508, 3952
Housing ................................................................... 428,431,886, 2614, 3269, 3767, 3931, 3932, 3962
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ......................................... 1159, 2565, 3792, 3800,4114
Premier ..................................................................... 22, 368, 763, 1029, 1467, 1505, 1551, 3509
Social Development .................................................. 890,1194,1259,1284, 2667, 2669
Transport and Public Works 492,528,951,1193,1254,1290, 1653, 1680, 3535, 3536

Stali, Z C –
Agriculture ............................................................... 1224
Community Safety ..................................................... 2527, 2528
Cultural Affairs and Sport ........................................ 1061,1079,1204,1205, 1525, 1666
Education .................................................................. 3284, 4096
Health ...................................................................... 2525, 2567
Housing .................................................................... 2620, 3769
Premier ..................................................................... 3488
Social Development .................................................. 1036, 1340
Transport and Public Works 2681, 3409, 3412, 3456, 3459, 3519, 3536, 3718, 3719,

Strachan, G R –
Agriculture .............................................................. 44
Finance, Economic Development and Tourism .......... 43,102,125,213,344,389,417, 418,471,473,541,610,611,841,842,849
Housing .................................................................... 344
Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning ........................................... 961
Premier ..................................................................... 201,531
Social Development .................................................. 360,361
Transport and Public Works .................................... 599,687
Transport and Public Works

Social Development

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Housing

Education

Agriculture

Van Zyl, J A

Social Development

Premier

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Housing

Education

Cultural Affairs and Sport

Community Safety

Agriculture

Uys, P

Transport and Public Works

Uys, P –

Agriculture

Community Safety

Cultural Affairs and Sport

Education

Finance, Economic Development and Tourism

Health

Housing

Premier

Social Development

Transport and Public Works

Tingwe, M –

Agriculture

Community Safety

Cultural Affairs and Sport

Education

Finance, Economic Development and Tourism

Health

Housing

Premier

Social Development

Transport and Public Works

Tingwe, M –

Agriculture

Community Safety

Cultural Affairs and Sport

Education

Finance, Economic Development and Tourism

Health

Housing

Premier

Social Development

Transport and Public Works

Van Zyl, J A –

Agriculture

Education

Housing

Health

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Social Development

Transport and Public Works

Van Zyl, J A –

Agriculture

Education

Housing

Health

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Social Development

Transport and Public Works

Van Zyl, J A –

Agriculture

Education

Housing

Health

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Social Development

Transport and Public Works

Van Zyl, J A –

Agriculture

Education

Housing

Health

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Social Development

Transport and Public Works

Van Zyl, J A –

Agriculture

Education

Housing

Health

Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Social Development

Transport and Public Works
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Portfolio</th>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visser, J J</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>3417, 3423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>220, 1042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>120, 153, 605, 1033, 1089, 3122, 3338, 3740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>216,419, 451,480,854,860,913,954,996,1033,1052,1340, 1649, 3122, 3305, 3522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>3763, 3783, 3884, 3920, 3884, 3920, 3948, 4113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>3738</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>606,695,855, 3038, 3278, 3307, 3794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Von Brandis, E J</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1266, 1295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>212,423,604,609</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>400, 1041, 3919</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>350,781,823,1021,1322,1324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1521,1522,1633,1635,3119,3161,3222,3341,3414,3452,3482,3489,3537,4078,4115,4116,4132,4134,4136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>122, 1266, 1295, 1315, 1559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>3245, 3266, 3342, 3379, 3380, 3521, 3760, 3873, 3897, 3924, 3873, 3897, 3920</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walters, M C</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>133,391,479,547,711,878,956,957,974,1039,1187,4014,4015,4108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1294, 1298, 1402, 1474, 1475, 1513, 1635, 1674, 2671, 3121, 3156, 3157, 3248, 3266, 3382, 3495, 3496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>3247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>118,478,789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>1375, 3731, 3739,3836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3811</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>723,788, 878, 940, 1133, 1227, 1511, 3303, 3337, 3344, 3380, 3873, 3873, 4108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport and Public Works</td>
<td>403,706,991, 2412, 2413,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiley, M G E</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>2414, 3762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Safety</td>
<td>1,40,163,164,183,392,405,482,505,525,713,948,1148,1267,1277,1523,2354,3123,3432,3499,3856,3972,3973,3975,4159,4162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cultural Affairs and Sport</td>
<td>67, 1020, 1494, 2351, 3123, 3128, 3266, 3343, 3978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>362, 482, 2353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finance, Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>3986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>132,881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning</td>
<td>1375, 2663, 3382, 3502,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>717, 1031,1536, 3710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td>130, 1268, 1285, 3500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Transport and Public Works ... 2,182,391,404,450,635, 1626, 3535, 3719, 4095

Witbooi, J –
Agriculture ................................................................. 582
Cultural Affairs and Sport . 1667, 1668, 2636, 2637, 2638, 2690, 3111, 4137, 4152, ... 4153, 4156, 4161
Education ........................................................................ 3430
Health ................................................................. 31,32,436,474,724,799,800,1075,1076,1165,1191, ... 1378, 1471, 1507, 1615, 2528, 2529, 2568, 2611, 2655, 2656

QUESTIONS TO PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beerwinkel, C F</td>
<td>52,613, 3288, 3289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bevu, T N</td>
<td>54,895, 3166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown, L</td>
<td>170, 1384, 1525, 2622, 3164, 3318, 3319, 3811</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eloff, E H</td>
<td>1644, 2623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figlan, A M</td>
<td>3436, 3514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gabru, Y</td>
<td>54,498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geyer, H P</td>
<td>493,786, 1531, 3288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haskin, G C R</td>
<td>3517, 3817</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartnick, J L</td>
<td>787, 897, 1047, 1389, 3290, 3911</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Havi, V</td>
<td>3861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacobs, P M</td>
<td>786, 1681, 1682, 2377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuschagne, C</td>
<td>56, 172, 498, 614, 1050, 1682</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lentit, R B</td>
<td>3513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magaxa K E</td>
<td>3515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magwaza, N P</td>
<td>383, 783, 1198, 1387, 1642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majola, T R</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, A J D</td>
<td>1004, 1681, 2624, 3321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbalo, B G</td>
<td>3865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKenzie, P C</td>
<td>171, 1002, 1300, 1680, 2374, 2375, 2376, 3041, 3168, ... 3169, 3170, 3437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mqulwana, K A</td>
<td>494, 1048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ncedana, M</td>
<td>3168, 3733, 3736, 3862</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ozinsky, M</td>
<td>615, 1046, 1645, 2374, 3173, 3435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prins, E</td>
<td>1299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rossouw, A</td>
<td>1301, 3165, 3733, 3735</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skwatsha, M</td>
<td>1529, 2361, 3906, 3910, 3906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stali, Z C</td>
<td>3319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tingwe, M</td>
<td>2494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uys, P</td>
<td>1200, 3910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Zyl, J A</td>
<td>1199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visser, J J</td>
<td>53,170, 1645, 3040, 3737, 1200, 1386, 2378, 3436, 3817</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Von Brandis, E J</td>
<td>1528, 3042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walters, M C</td>
<td>386, 617, 894, 1199, 1299, 2497, 3171, 3172, 3173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witbooi, J</td>
<td>1001,2491,3039,3512</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>