
THURSDAY, 27 JULY 2017

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: Good afternoon, hon members, our guests in the gallery. I would like to welcome you to the sitting of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. I would like to just provide guidance to our guests in the gallery that you are not allowed to participate in the proceedings by any form of hand claps, interjections or interrupting the proceedings of Parliament in any way. Do feel free and be welcome today. Thank you. I now recognise the Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I am a little bit flummoxed because the sponsor of the subject for discussion is not in the House, so I am

at a loss to actually ask you to give precedence. So at some stage or the other I am going to stand because programming has agreed that the subject for decision will take precedence, so can I suggest we continue with the Interpellations. However, should the missing member be missing for much longer, help is at hand. We have the head of the Pink Ladies here, an organisation that looks for missing people and we can always call on her to activate the organisation should our member not arrive shortly. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip.

Mr P UYS: I would propose that we proceed with the subject for discussion and that we slot the hon member in when he does arrive. It is really turning things around a bit and I would really urge that we continue. The EFF knows the time to start and it is even their subject for discussion.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Uys. I must admit – sorry, Chief Whip – I am a little concerned because we do start at quarter past two and the hon member Joseph actually presented the subject for debate, so I am going to recognise the Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: If the House so wishes that we continue, I have no problem with that.

The SPEAKER: All right, can I accept that the House is in agreement as the hon member Uys has recommended, that we proceed in the absence of the hon

Bernard Joseph of the EFF?

The PREMIER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Right, we will then move to the Order Paper and the subject for debate and in the absence of hon member Joseph I would then have to recognise hon member Botha from the DA.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

(SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION)

Women and children are constantly at the receiving end of abuse
caused by societal challenges and badly managed economic,
natural and socio-political disasters

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

†En dit is nou so ironies dat my eerste paragraaf so lyk. Agb Speaker, dit is verblydend dat hierdie agb lid dit belangrik geag het om vandag teenwoordig te wees in hierdie Huis vir sy debat. [Gelag.] [Tussenwerpsels.] So wat 'n ironie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[And that is now so ironic that my first paragraph looks like this. Madam Speaker, it is encouraging that this hon member deemed it important to be present in this House today for his debate. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] So what an irony.]

By the same token I want to urge this hon member and he is not here to hear it, not to play politics with this sad, sincere and life-changing subject in the lives of many people or many families. [Interjection.] And there he arrives. [Laughter.] The space and machinery for this member to utilise is in Standing Committees but, Madam Speaker, I allude you to the fact that this member has not been in any Standing Committee meeting that he is assigned to during this week. It is important to note this because it is in these platforms where he can advocate on behalf of vulnerable communities.

†Agb Speaker, ek sidder ook om te vra wanneer laas hierdie agb lid wel komiteeveraderings bygewoon het. It is no use to grandstand – omdat daar televisiekameras op jou gerig is nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Madam Speaker, I shudder to have to ask when last this hon member did indeed attend committee meetings. It is no use to grandstand – because there are TV cameras aimed at you.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Don't push it. Don't push it.

†Me L J BOTHA: Agb Speaker, daarby sê ek ook, een swaeltjie maak nie 'n somer nie.

[Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, along with that I also say, one swallow does not make a summer.]

In saying that, the protection of our nation's children and women is the responsibility of each and every one of us. As the African proverb states, it takes a village to raise a child and in this case I would like to add that it takes the same village to ensure that our women are also protected.

Madam Speaker, we have seen all the reports so far this year about the number of children and women that have been brutally raped and murdered in this province. No rape or murder can in any way be justified. In fact, let us get back to this notion of it takes a village. As residents of this province we need to ask ourselves: why are we allowing all of this to happen? This question should be asked because it is not some alien species that is raping or murdering our women and children. [Interjection.] It is the very men – can you not interject? It is my turn to speak.

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members! Excuse me, hon member Botha, kindly address the Chair.

Ms L J BOTHA: I am addressing the Speaker and it is still my turn to speak.

The SPEAKER: I will allow interjections but I just need to manage this

conversation. [Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, can you then address that member and tell him it is my time to speak.

The SPEAKER: You have the protection of the Chair, hon member Botha, you may proceed.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you. It is the very men – brothers, nephews, cousins, uncles and grandfathers – that are doing this. Unfortunately at times we also find that women are complicit in these heinous activities, either as an active participant or allowing it to happen. It is completely unacceptable and tells us about the moral fibre of our society. It tells us that our communities, our neighbourhoods, our society just do not care about each other's wellbeing anymore.

Protecting our women and children is on all of us, each and every person in this House and beyond. It is called a societal approach. I would like to commend the community of Elsie's River who, after the disappearance of three year old Courtney Pieters, came together as a community and attempted to find her. Unfortunately, it was too late. It subsequently came to light that she was sexually abused and then killed.

When I refer to the societal approach that is needed, it is examples like these where community members come together to help and support one another.

Charity begins at home, so if we, as immediate family members in the house, immediate neighbours, neighbours down the street, the wider neighbourhood and broader community are aware and awake to what transpires in our areas, we will go a long way in safeguarding our children and women.

Madam Speaker, protecting our women and children is on all of us; our faith-based, non-governmental, non-profit organisations or any other community-based entities also have a vital role to play. At times we find that there is a blame game, there is finger-pointing, and we forget that some of the solutions are actually within our own communities. We need to also acknowledge those within our immediate structures to assist instead of wanting to play the blame game.

I need to, however, expand on this. A societal approach does not in any shape, way or form exclude government. In fact, there is this assumption or possible belief that when you refer to government, it is either Provincial or National Government. They do play a vital role but, Madam Speaker, our local ward councillors, where government starts, play an even bigger role – so much so that they are able to direct residents to the very organisations referred to earlier. It is the very same councillor that is also able to direct our residents to a specific Government department who might also be able to assist and provide the relevant required service at that particular moment.

The protection of our women and children is on all of us. The “my child is your child” phrase should at all times be seen and not just heard. Ubuntu

ought to be a daily occurrence in our communities. Let us not shift the responsibility but take ownership and ensure that our women and children are protected.

Madam Speaker, to the member who brought this motion, your own commander-in-chief ripped into Kwezi in 2009 when he said Kwezi had a nice time and enjoyed it, “when a woman did not enjoy it she leaves early in the morning; those who had a nice time will wait until the sun comes out, request breakfast and ask for taxi money.” Let us not be hypocrites but let us endeavour to address this critical issue. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, as agreed, the hon member Joseph has arrived; we will revert back to our sequence and I will now afford the hon member Joseph an opportunity.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjection.] My apologies that I arrived late but I have done what is important in the interests of the community. [Interjections.] However, I need to raise my disappointment with the member, especially the fact that she is a woman and that she is trying not to focus on the issue of the day but rather to play the ball. That is why the DA Government is not able to deliver on issues. However, let me start. Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr B D JOSEPH: Hon members of the Legislature as well as the esteemed guests, ladies and gentlemen in the gallery as well as the press. Madam Speaker, our nation is looking forward to yet another celebration of women on Women's Day on 9 August. The EFF will also celebrate the Sarah Baartman Day on 10 August. As we have witnessed, it has been particularly difficult here on this front with a number of cases having been reported by the media, highlighting the crisis South Africa faces in this regard.

The Economic Freedom Fighters do not believe that these and related matters have been tackled with the vigour that they should have. If anything, our eyes were opened to the lack of political will by the powers that be to tackle the barbaric scourge head on. Our women continue to suffer and as we celebrate them, we dare not sit on the pain and the fear that this section of society continues to endure. The EFF says no to violence against women.

Which then brings me to the motion we have tabled today, Madam Speaker. Closely related to this matter, over and above the violence that we have talked about, the causes of which we believe could be a subject for another day - and which we must thoroughly engage on as a legislature - women and children have borne the worst of the brunt of the many challenges society continues to face as a member of the developing nation. We have all been in agreement that women and children are the most vulnerable members of society and we need to pay attention as to how they are affected by our actions as leaders, indeed as Government.

I argue, through some familiar case studies, this very province, the Western Cape, is also a culprit in this regard. Recent events call for us to break the silence in seeking to protect the women and children in the province. It is not so much the events in most cases, as per our tabled motion today, it is how they are managed. It is a fact that the province, especially the City of Cape Town, harbours more inequality than any other in the country. The economic opportunities are skewed along a distinct racial profile. The previously disadvantaged grow even more disadvantaged.

According to the latest State of South African Cities Report, Cape Town is the only city in South Africa where the proportion of people living in informal areas has increased over the past five years. We note here that Cape Town is the only metro which does not belong to the South African cities network ...

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yoh!

Mr B D JOSEPH: ... which sounds to us like a strategy to avoid scrutiny and accountability. The revelation of this particular report is not surprising or new. Over the years the City has known this and has had to deal with many natural disasters.

In these informal settlements, the profiling of which is a direct failure by both the ANC National Government and the DA-led Metro Council to deal with the issue of social housing – whether it has been the annual fires of

Khayelitsha or, as we witnessed, the shambolic manner in which another fire disaster has been handled in Imizamo Yethu, in correlation to what has happened in Knysna and the response of Government. The Government in the city and province are to blame for lacking foresight and not providing strategic leadership.

It is the women who are the housekeepers and nurturers of our homes. It is the children who are in the care of their mothers at most times and these two groups are as vulnerable as ever in the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape. The analogy presented herein points to yet another fact that we have always known but are discouraged to speak of.

So as we save the leaders here some blushes and embarrassment, it is clear that the most vulnerable of these sections are those who are classified as previously disadvantaged, meaning mostly black, Coloured, Africans and Indians. [Interjection.] Structural racism is more palpable here than everywhere else. It is also the skewed economic opportunities in the province which has seen more and more people lose jobs and those who suffer the most at the lack of opportunity, the most vulnerable society – women and children.

As the EFF we call on the Legislature to take the opportunity this year to do more ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph ...

Mr B D JOSEPH: ... than pay lip service to the suffering of women and their children. As we celebrate their strength, warmth ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph, excuse me hon member. Your time has expired. I will allow you to finish your sentence. Thank you.

Mr B D JOSEPH: As we celebrate their warmth and resilience, let us open up this people's Legislature to more women and the young who express their views on what their needs are and what they think the solutions to the issues could be.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Order please, hon members. I now see the hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. As a mother and a woman let me echo the following statements:

The DA-led Government has since 2009 failed to establish the much needed Children's Commissioner in terms of the Western Cape Constitution. It has been since 2014 that the ANC in this Legislature has been calling for the establishment of the Children's Commissioner following Premier Zille's promise ... [Interjection]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P MAKELENI: ... to do so in her State of the Province Address, but such calls fell on deaf ears.

As if that was not enough, most recently a group of 150 people from 60 organisations, including civil society and NGO's, met and discussed ways to respond to the ongoing high levels of child abuse and killings in the province. They are worried about the plight of women and children who have been constant victims of sporadic kidnappings, rape and killings at the hands men - including known relatives and close family friends.

The victims are usually not effectively supported by the public services due to insufficient budgetary allocation for women and children who are victims. Absence of professional services is one of the reasons for lack of support. It has been widely reported that almost 33 if not more young girls have been killed since the beginning of the year.

The research indicates that every 1 out of 3 women will be raped and killed in their lifetime.

Baby Lindokuhle Kota was 14 months old when she was raped and murdered in Khayelitsha. Baby Jeremiah Ruiters of Kensington was 18 months when she was raped. Somewhere else, young Ebie Smal, 15 years, was shot dead in Mitchells Plain; Nathaniel Davids, a 12 year old boy, was found hanged in Bonteheuwel; Iyaphi Yamile, 4 years, raped and murdered in Khayelitsha; Minentle Lekhatha, 5 years, eyes gouged out and murdered; Cleo Skippers, 3

years, raped and murdered in Atlantis, and many others.

In their deliberations with the Provincial Government, Premier Zille rejected a very sensible proposal to establish a commission of inquiry into the kidnapping, rape and killings of young women and girls. It is said her reasoning is that such an exercise will be too expensive. It is clear to me that Premier Zille and the DA do not comprehend the gravity of these barbaric actions meted against the most vulnerable sections of our communities, children and women. The true colours of an uncaring Premier Helen Zille will be exposed.

In fact, the Director of the Trauma Centre, Valdi van Reenen-Le Roux, has this to say:

“We found out that our children are not a priority to the Western Cape Government, that our children’s lives are cheap and the commission of inquiry is a luxury and we take exception to that.”

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: [Inaudible.] know what to do!

Ms P MAKELENI: We applaud the Community Chest who spearheaded the putting together of the 20 member steering committee which was to be handed to the Provincial Government, whilst continuing to lobby for the commission of inquiry.

It is not surprising that on 3 June this year there was a march to the Legislature in the City of Cape Town calling for this Government to action against children's abuse, rape and killings.

It is even worrisome to learn that on Mandela Day, Premier Helen Zille and MEC Albert Fritz failed to attend a youth conference that addressed and shared experiences of young people of crime and gang violence on the Cape Flats. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, order! Hon members, there is a speaker on the floor. Thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. It would have been a perfect opportunity for Premier Zille and her colleagues to have first-hand comprehension of the plight of young people affected by violent crime and gangsterism on the Cape Flats and the need for a commission of inquiry into the killing of young people on the Cape Flats. But again I understand the meaning of an "uncaring" DA under the stewardship of ineffective Premier Helen Zille.

The flimsy excuse remains unacceptable. If Premier Zille valued the issues that were to be discussed at the gathering, she should have sent one of her senior Cabinet colleagues to represent her Government, not a staff member.

In conclusion, it shows clearly that the DA-led Government has no political

will to take women and children of this province out of this quagmire. I thank you

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Is that the sum total of your contribution?

The SPEAKER: Order, please. I now see the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, before we can speak about societal challenges, we need to bring this important issue home. [Interjection.]

A man with the name of Robert Millet said, and I paraphrase, he said: success in business, success in education or even success in the church do not cover the sin of omitting to care properly for the family. He further says there is no calling that supersedes that of being a father and a mother.

There is no calling higher than that. So sometimes we want to search around and walk around and look for the solution to the problem and sometimes that solution is at home. As the ACDP, since the beginning of our existence we have been calling for strong family values. It starts at home where the father is the role model. Some of our children go out and look for role models. They

find the gangster, they find the drug lord because we have absent fathers at home and that is the cornerstone of our problem. That is the problem that we have, absent fathers. Government has a role to play but the role is for the parent to play, the role as parent at home.

So thank you for mothers who are taking care of our children because of fathers who are not present at home. So that is the sad part, Madam Speaker, that is the saddest part of it all.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Dyantyi.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: You see, Madam Speaker, it is how we treat our wives, it is how we treat our children, that is where the child goes out and ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians ...

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I don't have much time and this guy wants to mess my time up. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, the clock has stopped when you take your seat. Are you rising on a point of order?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is his time over because I wanted to ask a question?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want to ask, can the member take a question?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, will you take a question?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No, he won't take a question. Thank you, kindly take your seat. You may proceed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, oh, typical, typical, but I will leave it there. What I want to say to you, Madam Speaker, it hurts ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: It hurts. But what I want to say and I am sure that Minister Fritz will say the same, that is his Department ... [Interjections.] that absent fathers are the root cause of our problem and as fathers we must take responsibility to be at home and be an example so that our children can treat women and girls properly in public. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, please. Hon member Dyantyi, may I ask you to compose yourself? Hon members, before the next speaker can we get some order please? Thank you. I now see the hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. Premier, Madam Speaker, members of the Provincial Parliament, †indwendwe zethu ezisi-ndwendweleyo siyabulisa. [Greetings to our visitors.] I want to acknowledge and also congratulate the member for raising this topic because I am standing here today not only as a Minister or as a Member of Parliament, but as member Makeleni also alluded to, as a woman and also as a concerned mother of girls and therefore for me it is not a political debate but it is something personal.

Whilst as women we might have lost the fight in the street in terms of advancing the women's agenda, at least we are standing here. We have got an opportunity to see to it that it happens.

Indeed, women and children are always on the receiving end of societal challenges but we also have to look at what are the predisposing factors and also what creates this vulnerability because we do know that children who are orphans, specifically paternal orphans, women who have families, rural women, sex workers and young girls are always at the receiving end. And also what is most important, it is about the issue of patriarchy that is indoctrinated into most of the men.

In the Western Cape alone, for example, we have seen 21 young girls who

have been killed this year ... [Interjection.] and the reports also say that most of these young girls are killed by people known to their families. [Interjections.]

In South Africa 900 children ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, please hon members! Sorry, hon Minister, there is just too much noise and you are being drowned out. Can I request both sides of the House, there is a speaker on the floor. Minister Fritz, thank you. You may proceed, hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In South Africa 900 children have been murdered and we are talking about innocent lives. It might sound as if it is quite a large number, which it is, but in comparison to 2009 when we had 1 018, one might argue that we have done a lot. But, 900 lives, where you find that the perpetrators are known to the families, is not well-received.

Madam Speaker, our society is very dysfunctional. You cannot sugar-coat what is happening. Also substance abuse amongst the youth remains our major challenge and one of the contributing factors. We have a wide range of issues that I already have addressed where we find gang violence, behavioural problems due to peer pressure and also the issue of the abandonment and neglect of young children by parents themselves, young men who act out when their mothers are being abused.

So therefore the solutions cannot be left in the hands of the Government

alone. It needs the whole of society to roll up their sleeves and fight these social ills, starting with the families, community leaders, religious organisations, NPOs and so on, but most importantly, men themselves need to lead. They need to lead, to heed the call for these social ills, because the question was: what has the Western Cape Government been doing as part of Strategic Goal 3 where the aim is to improve safety, wellness and tackle social ills. [Interjection.]

We have looked in terms of tackling the root causes. For example in health, instead of focusing only on what we are doing in the health services, because we cannot stand here and still keep on bragging about our health outcomes because we do know when it comes to women's health and children's health we are leading when it comes to the outcomes, but we are talking about the social issues.

So we have taken the services to communities beyond the health services. One of those, the Young Women and Girls Project, we call it the Zimele Project which is our priority project and we have put R80 million around that project where we have split into eight categories: one is Masibambisane Madoda, which is a men's dialogue, because we strongly believe that engaging men will assist to get to the bottom of the problem. We cannot focus on women only, but we must also understand that men themselves, although they are the perpetrators, they also have vulnerabilities. Some of them are the victims of patriarchy. For example, this Saturday there is a Masibambisane Madoda dialogue in Gugulethu, in Bongoletu, for those who

are available who want to go there.

Then the other issue is about where we have to unpack gender norms and stereotypes in relation to what men's role is in a society and also promote ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please! Sorry, Minister Mbombo. There is just too much talking and it is drowning you out. Could I appeal to members? You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... and most importantly to discourage inter-generational relationships, the issue of the blesser and the blessees because the reason why we have high HIV infections among the young girls is around these issues. So we have sessions that we hold in different settings at different times.

The other part of the Zimele Project is the soul buddies where we focus on the age group 10 to 14 years old and we were targeting 50 primary schools and the focus is around the issue of safety. Also for other categories, keeping girls at school, targeting the high school girls, 15 to 19, where they are helped with not only their homework but we are also targeting about 5 000 girls and we have started a project already in Mitchells Plain and the Klipfontein area.

The Child Protection Programme is another part of this activity where we are

targeting learners together with their parents, where we conduct workshops that are being held by the social workers and our partners. And thus far we have reached these areas that I have mentioned and it is a six day residential programme.

Another programme is Teen Parenting where we help teen parents navigate parenthood while at school because we keep them there at school and we have had many sessions. For example, currently there are 48 participants. We have just started this one. We have had 20 sessions.

Another programme targeting young girls – because as I indicated the issue is about the vulnerability – Rise Young Women's and Girls' Clubs where we focus on life skills for them to be economically viable so that they will be able to present themselves for job opportunities and we have targeted 1 000 women and we already have 15 clubs around that.

And the last one, which is my third one, Women at Work Project where we empower young girls to value themselves and learn to be independent. We have already had 10 000 girls in this project and it comes with a cash incentive around that.

Then there is the Parenting Programme as well for the parents of teens, which is the grandparents, where they get empowered on how to deal with teenagers, especially when they fall pregnant. We already have 625 within the programme.

I am mentioning these so that we can see that we do not only focus on when a woman is a patient but also in terms of closing the tap, so that we prevent mopping the floor. I have mentioned rural women who are also exposed to vulnerability in terms of the access to services. Currently we have expanded the pickup points, especially in the rural areas because it becomes too far to walk and then the women get exposed to crime. So now women do not have to go far, they can be picked up from home when they have an appointment at hospitals and we have even approached the hotels, like in Matjiesfontein, where women no longer have to wait outside under the trees but can also wait there in the reception areas.

In addition to that, especially focusing on young rural women and girls, we have with regard to reproductive rights introduced long term effective family planning, which is the IUCD – 5 years' contraceptives, meaning that a girl starting school from grade 6 until probably grade 12 is safe for five years if she uses the IUCD. And now we have expanded medical termination of pregnancies, abortion services, because it used to be only in the hospitals, but now medical termination of pregnancy services are available in all the clinics.

In the case of those women who have been sexually abused, our Thuthuzela Care Centres in all six provincial hospitals mean they don't have to wait for so long and we work closely with the National Prosecuting Authority so that it expedites all these services.

So I can list many things that we are busy doing but what is crucial is that women should take priority because they are the majority of the voters and if you cannot invest in women, especially young girls, we might not be able to achieve what we achieve. [Interjections.]

And as you can now see we have done a lot and in terms of the issues about the Child Commissioner, I think my colleague will talk about this but as I have said we have done [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Order, order please! Thank you, hon Minister. Just before we proceed, hon member Dyantyi, interjections are allowed but a running commentary is proving to be disruptive. If I could just ask you to co-operate please. [Interjections.] Order please, hon members. I trust by now you would have had an opportunity to greet each other because it is already three o'clock in the afternoon, so if you haven't had a chance, do that after the sitting, please. I now recognise the hon member Lekker, thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I am ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order please, members. Sorry, you have a member on the floor, please. Hon member Lekker, you may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to take this opportunity to welcome Rev Chris Nissen from the Human Rights

Commission. As I am sitting here I would have felt that the debate from hon Dr Nomafrench Mbombo would be of a high note. I expected her to give us details as to what it is that ourselves, as mothers, must be doing in order to alleviate all of these problems that we are seeing. However, I am very disappointed in the level she has reduced this debate to. Thank you.

The Western Cape is not spared from the triple challenges facing the historically disadvantaged communities, mainly women and children. The province remains what is widely referred as “A Tale of Two Cities”, where the rich get richer and the poor remains poor. The DA-led Government has failed to improve the lives of many citizens who continue to live in abject conditions in this province. It has dismally failed to eradicate apartheid style spatial development.

What is common in these areas is poor service delivery of basic services such as clean water, sanitation, street lighting, and road infrastructure including schools, clinics and hospitals and work opportunities for job seekers. The resultant situation is increase of crime levels, alcohol abuse, drug trafficking, gangster fights and general lawlessness. There have been calls for a while now for integrated and affordable social housing to be built in the proximity of the economic hub, the inner city of Cape Town.

The DA-led Provincial Government has rejected the idea, although it made a lot of sense and was supported by a well-researched proposal by Ndifuna Ukwazi Project on the Tafelberg property in Sea Point. Instead, they

preferred to sell the land to a Jewish school which will benefit the few.

It is reported that Cape Town faces the worst urban housing affordability crisis in South Africa, one of the worst in the world. The DA can no longer be trusted.

According to Statistics South Africa, the Western Cape had the highest proportion of deaths due to unnatural causes at 13,2%. The Central Karoo and City of Cape Town were the highest at 14,3% respectively. It is further reported that whereas there was a marginal decrease in other provinces such as Northern Cape, Limpopo, Free State and North West, the Western Cape increased by 0,7. The gang violence and killings were found to be more prominent in the Eastern and Western Cape. Premier Zille's administration has failed the people of the Western Cape in this regard.

Clearly this illustrates that this DA-led Government is irrational when it comes to bringing the basic needs to the people, it discriminates against the poor, black communities in favour of the rich communities. A case in point would be during the Council term of 2011-2016, when the DA ward councillor erected a community park at Samora Machel in a water pond where there was and still is an overflowing ablution drain. Flies are all over this space, not to mention that on a daily basis children walk through the mess on their way to school and going to play in the park.

The Department of Parks and Recreation under the City of Cape Town clearly

does not care. Indeed the place is erected in an environmentally unfriendly area.

It was in the same Samora Machel where a 14 year old was allegedly kidnapped by 11 youths and this area was literally dark, no-one was there, she was raped over a night. Three kilometres away from Samora Machel an 18 month old baby was killed by a step-dad. She was hit against the wall several times and she died on the scene.

Is this the kind of society that J P Smith, who is responsible for Safety, Security and Social Development, wants to see? Bongiwe Ninini was murdered; her naked body was dumped in a drain near Thembokwezi.

Sinoxolo Mafevuka's lifeless body was found in an open toilet in Town 2, Khayelitsha. Sulnita Manho and Anene Booysen were both brutally killed in Bredasdorp. Stacha's body was found in the bushes in Tafelsig.

We see this every day, we live with it; but this Government does not have the know-how on how to effectively eradicate these social ills, including reducing the rate of crime and gang killings in the province. And as long as you don't put your money where your mouth is and when you don't walk the talk, the future of the vulnerable people is bleak.

All these social ills point to the DA-led Government and its municipalities' failure to integrate socio-economic development for all by including vulnerable communities into the inner city and suburbs, or its willingness to

reverse South Africa's spatial plan design.

Therefore, Madam Speaker, as the African National Congress, we are going to put the blame squarely in the hands of the DA-led Provincial Government for its refusal to integrate communities, eradicate poverty, bring in economic and employment opportunities into the communities and improve the lives, well-being and standing of society.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Therefore all of this is as a result of the DA. I thank you.
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, please. I now see the hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Let me from the outset say that I am humbled to take part in this debate. I think that we are at a situation where we are past the party political blame game because this is actually a very crucial, very important debate.

Madam Speaker, in his biography *The Long Walk to Freedom*, Nelson Mandela made the following statement on women:

“For every woman and girl violently attacked, we reduce our humanity.”

And in one of his maiden speeches as South Africa's first democratically elected President, he stated, and I quote:

“There can be no keener revelation of a society's soul than the way in which it treats its children.”

Indeed, Tata Madiba was the figurehead of equality in South Africa's society but he was first and foremost a feminist and a champion for the protection and nurturing of the child in South Africa.

The attacks on women and children in the Western Cape are horrific and tragic. We see that often women and children are at the mercy of communities in the grips of drug use and gang-related violence where abuse and mistreatment are rife. As we approach Women's Month in August ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Mitchell – could you take your seat? Hon member Olivier, I do not know who you are having a conversation with but I can hear you and it is affecting – so if you do not mind, whoever it is you are conversing with, let us not do it aloud. Minister Plato, I see you have a look there, so could I call you too to order, please? Thank you. You may proceed, hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. As we approach Women's

Month in August we need to ask ourselves: what is the role of women in South Africa's society? Besides being mothers of our nation, South Africa's women are often also the caregivers and home-makers passing down knowledge, morals and wisdom to our children. With this in mind, we must commit to creating a society which respects women and children if we intend to prevent these crimes.

I would like to address the sensationalism in the EFF's proposed subject for discussion. Hon member Joseph makes the assumption that the Western Cape badly manages economic, natural and socio-political disasters. I would like to directly dispel these myths by mentioning just the following.

The Western Cape economy is not only the fastest growing in South Africa, but our unemployment rate is also the lowest. I do not see how these constitute an economic disaster. If anything, the Western Cape is in an economic recovery under the DA. Furthermore, the Western Cape Government cannot [Interjections.] control natural disasters in this province, Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: It is not true.

Mr D G MITCHELL: However, what we can control is how swiftly and effectively disaster management services have managed to protect and save our people [Interjection.] in the face of raging fires and winter storms. It is the socio-political aspect of this question that rings true, but let me tell you

why. Instead of tackling women and children abuse head-on, certain individuals seek to use it as an opportunity for political grandstanding.

We see that politicians use the violence in their politicking but do not actively engage with the communities in which they campaign to make any relevant change. We also see that many NGOs are selective in their efforts to assist women and children. The upliftment of our people in South Africa cannot be politically motivated, where politicians seek to use the grievances of our members of our society to their advantage.

Tackling abuse against women and children is every single person's duty, regardless of political affiliation. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, I also welcome the thorough and detailed process currently under way in the Premier's Department to appoint a Children's Commissioner in the Western Cape. Having considered the work already being carried out by the Department of Social Development, the Premier has committed to appointing a Commissioner whose mandate will be unique and focused on the protection and development of the children in this province.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

Mr D G MITCHELL: In order to combat abuse towards women and children in the Western Cape we must tackle the root of the problem instead of treating the symptoms. We see the homes where parents are unemployed and

are on drugs, are most likely to lead to violence and abuse. Therefore unemployment and crime in poorer communities are to blame for our society's problems. We already know that the Western Cape Government is committed to tackling these grass roots problems [Interjection.] as Minister Meyer has committed R9.4 billion in the 2016/2017 financial year for the development of youth in this province.

It is projects such as these which will provide opportunities for young people to get off the streets and avoid a life of despair. This is the catalyst for real change in our society that our Government provides. We are opening Youth Cafes all over the Western Cape ... [Interjection]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, ja, ja, ja.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... where young people have access to skills development, leadership training and internet access. These are the changes in the Western Cape that are making a real impact in our society. Abuse against women and children is the symptom of a society in despair. The DA, as part of our mandate of an open opportunity society for all, is making real and effective strides to tackle this issue. We do not use the plight of women and children in our country as a political tool but rather as part of a social study into the needs of our society, and the Western Cape is living proof, Madam Speaker, that where we govern, we are succeeding in uplifting and protecting our women and children. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Can I ask the ANC ladies in the back row, you

have a member standing to speak, if you could afford the member the opportunity. I recognise the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, the Republic of South Africa is one sovereign, democratic state founded on the following values: human dignity, the achievement of equality and the advancement of human rights and freedom. Everyone has inherent dignity and the right to have their dignity respected and protected. Everyone has the right to life. Our Constitution provides for these rights, yet every day women and children are victims of violence and abuse which lead to rape and murder.

We celebrate a great Constitution and Government with active policies and programmes which have bettered the lives of many South Africans. As we acknowledge our gains, we must constantly implement our programmes and face adversity with solutions. Monitoring and evaluation is critical in this regard. Through you, Madam Speaker, to the MEC Albert Fritz who referred to such an important ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals!]

Ms M N GILLION: ... Mandela Day dialogue for youth in Mitchells Plain ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... as Mickey Mouse.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He [Inaudible.]]

Ms M N GILLION: Let me give you this, Madam Speaker, yesterday ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: ... in the Portfolio Committee Meeting on Social Development, we were honoured with the presence of the Child and Family Welfare Association of Albertinia. Now if the MEC wants to talk about Mickey Mouse, go to your Department...

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is Mickey Mouse [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is Mickey Mouse [Inaudible.]]

Ms M N GILLION: ... where people – a social worker in Albertinia did not even have a telephone – are running around servicing youth, children and families †met 'n stukkende kar. [with a broken car.] That is Mickey Mouse.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is Mickey Mouse.

Ms M N GILLION: That is Mickey Mouse. Where is the monitoring and evaluation of that? The second Mickey Mouse in that Department is when senior officials run to a national body on child and family matters to liaise and a national body to assist them to get money, forgetting the suffering that the people of Albertinia on the ground are facing. That is Mickey Mouse, Madam Speaker.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy weet niks van daardie nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He knows nothing about that.]

Ms M N GILLION: Now Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy weet niks nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He knows nothing.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Dyantyi. Hon member Gillion, kindly take your seat. I think hon member Dyantyi is throwing you off course with his interjections right next to you.

Ms M N GILLION: Okay.

The SPEAKER: May I ask that you compose yourself while your member is on the floor?

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mickey Mouse ... [Onhoorbaar.].

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mickey Mouse ... [Inaudible.]]

Ms M N GILLION: Whilst the ANC, through its Secretary-General Comrade Gwede Mantashe ... [Interjection.]

†‘n AGB LID: Ai!

[An HON MEMBER: Oh!]

Ms M N GILLION: ... called to action all its structures and society at large to become actively involved in campaigns that involve communities in the prevention of femicide, rape and child molestation. On the other hand, the DA Premier of the Western Cape, Helen Zille, has rejected a call by 10 organisations for the establishment of a commission of inquiry into child murders. Her excuse? An inquiry would be too expensive – coming from a woman who spares no expense enjoying an overseas trip to Singapore and Japan recently. R1,1 million was spent on a plus one extravaganza when she took along her husband. Premier Zille promised the people of the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: ... in 2009 that she would appoint a Children’s

Commissioner. She is still doing that today. Now in contrast, Chairperson, just a few kilometres from here the community of Masiphumulele had to go to the Public Protector ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: ... and inform her how they lived without land, unfinished RDP houses, lack of development and bad living conditions in the wetland area. The DA City of Cape Town Mayor shunned the opportunity to meet with the community with the Public Protector.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle gee nie om nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: They do not care.]

Ms M N GILLION: Do you need to stay in the leafy suburbs of Knysna if you want the Mayor, the Premier and the whole Cabinet to run and come and visit and listen to your plight?

Mr M G E WILEY: And the President too!

Ms M N GILLION: Today we are discussing how badly managed economic natural and socio-political disasters contribute to the abuse of women and children. Economic crisis in our communities leads to high unemployment rates [Interjection.] and crime rates. The Western Cape is really a funny province. Here I want, through you, Madam Speaker, to answer member

Mitchell about the work force profile at the top management level by race, which has the representation of the white group at 68.9%. This level is more than six times the economically active population.

Another disparity of white representation is at the professionally qualified level of 48.1% whereas they make up 17.1% of the EAP. This is followed by the Coloured group at only 29.2% where they make up 50.2% of the economically active population in the province. With this inequality still rife and present in our province, we should look at how little the DA Government takes transformation seriously. They are indeed barriers to economic and social change with a lack of diversity. Change in our communities is urgently needed if we are going to reduce the violence and poverty that our women and children face daily. Madam Speaker, let me go back to the issue of the Premier ...

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jy is afwesig.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are absent.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... who did not see it as †'n vermorsing van geld. 'n Vermorsing van *resources*. [a waste of money. A waste of resources.] when ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion. Sorry, if I may interrupt you? Your time has expired.

Ms M N GILLION: I want to finish this one.

The SPEAKER: I will allow you to finish your sentence.

Ms M N GILLION: I want to finish this one.

The SPEAKER: You may finish your sentence. Your time has expired.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Madam Speaker. †Wat ek wil sê is ...
[Tussenwerpsel.] [What I want to say is ... [Interjection.]]

†n AGB LID: Sit.

[An HON MEMBER: Sit.]

†Me M N GILLION: Nee, ek gaan nie sit nie. Daar is een Speaker in die Huis. [Tussenwerpsels]. [No, I am not going to sit. There is one Speaker in the House. [Interjections.]] Please protect me.

The SPEAKER: Order. You are protected.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: You may finish your sentence, thank you.

†Me M N GILLION: Agbare Speaker, dit is vir die Premier van die provinsie te veel om geld uit te gee op 'n Kommissie van Ondersoek vir die beveiliging

van ons kinders en vrouens in die provinsie, maar sy het geen steen onaangerooer gelaat ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, it is too much money for the Premier of this province to spend on a Commission of Inquiry for the safeguarding of our children and women in the province, but she left no stone unturned ... [Interjection.]]

An HON MEMBER: Your time is up.

†Me M N GILLION: ... toe sy die Kommissie van Inquiry in Khayelitsha inbring nie.

[Ms M N GILLION: ... when she brought in the Commission of Inquiry in Khayelitsha.]

I thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Gillion. [Interjections.] Hon member Olivier. Hon member Olivier, may I address you? [Laughing.] You seem to be in another space and not with us here.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: May we get some order, please. I would now like to

recognise the hon Minister, Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Jô, thank you Madam Speaker. Allow me ... [Interjection.]

†‘n AGB LID: Gooi.

[An HON MEMBER: Throw.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... to also acknowledge, firstly, all the hon members. I specifically want to acknowledge Chris Nissen from the Human Rights Commission ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are okay.

An HON MEMBER: We are okay.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and I am so happy to hear the name is Human Rights Commission, because – and I will come to that point. I also would like to welcome all the people in the gallery. It is so great to have women and men sitting here, who I know are very responsible. [Laughter.]

Madam Speaker, sometimes I really think that I am still in 1974 when I

listen, and it is so pathetic when I listen to the ANC speaking, because I just heard the hon member Gillion saying, “The white race” [Interjection.] and “the Coloured race” [Interjections.] and the “black” [Interjections.] and it reminds me and it takes me back ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Really, it takes me back to the days of racial classifications, when I was placed, when I was called a Coloured ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and I had to carry a book that said [Interjection.] I am Coloured, and they reinforce that racism and part of our problem with violence ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: A part of our issue around systemic violence in our society, with our many societies, our children and women, is this notion that some people are made to believe ... [Interjection.]

†Die MINISTER VAN SOSIALE ONTWIKKELING: Hou jou bek, man. Hey!
[Gelag.][Applous.]

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Shut your mouth, man. Hey!
[Laughter.] [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, take your seat please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Huh-uh. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, may I address you? Minister Fritz, what I heard you say is absolutely unparliamentary ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes.

The SPEAKER: ... and I am going to ask you to withdraw that, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I will withdraw and apologise.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And apologise.

†Mnr P UYS: Skande!

[Mr P UYS: Disgrace!]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, I do not know who is first. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Ja, thank you, Madam Speaker. I mean, this is a classic case of provocation from the other side, repeated provocation, a lack of protection for our members, and I must ask, please ... [Interjections.]. You have raised the matter of their ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What is the point of order?

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: You have raised the matter of their behaviour ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What is the point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: ... earlier today a number of times.

Ms P MAKELENI: †Haibo! [No man!]

Mr M G E WILEY: I ask that you start to take a firm action against them, please. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Hon member Gillion? Members, in order to proceed I need you to be quiet, please, so that I can listen to a point of order. Thank you. You may ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, this is a very important debate.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely.

Ms M N GILLION: As a woman activist ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Treat it as such.

†Me M N GILLION: ... wil ek vir u vra om vir die LUR te vra, want vandat ons begin het met die debat ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Ms M N GILLION: ... I just want to ask the MEC, because since we have started with the debate... [Interjection.]]

†'n AGB LID: Asseblief.

[An HON MEMBER: Oh, please.]

†Me M N GILLION: ... is dit, lyk dit of dit 'n *joke* is. Kan ons asseblief vir die LUR vra, wat in beheer [Tussenwerpsels.] staan van hierdie debat, om dit ernstig op te neem.

[Ms M N GILLION: ... is it, it looks as if it is a joke. Can we please ask the

MEC who is in charge [Interjection.] of this debate, to take it seriously.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Gillion. Now members, if I can address you all. In order to proceed, we have had members on the floor and we have listened. Please allow the Minister to have his chance to present. I am going to ask for your cooperation.

Ms P MAKELENI: And mind his language.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please mind your language in the process.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: But I am from a township in the place that we are, we don't ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] I just want to say ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... the hon members come to this House and they distort factual issues [Interjections.] and hon member Gillion is one of those people specifically. When you really trivialise, and I will speak to it.

An HON MEMBER: Where is your speech?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: When you trivialise the issue around children and women.

The SPEAKER: Order please. Minister Fritz, kindly take your seat.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: She comes with half-baked potatoes and misleads this damn House.

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, kindly take your seat. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Ms M N GILLION: The MEC is referring to me that I lie in this House.

An HON MEMBER: He did not say so.

Ms M N GILLION: No, he did. [Interjection.] Madam Speaker, the MEC must stop pointing fingers.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Ms M N GILLION: He must stop pointing fingers. He must take his work seriously.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Does the shoe fit?

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Order. Hon member Gillion, I would need to go to Hansard on your first point of order. Unfortunately I did not pick that up directly.

Secondly, I cannot tell the Minister how to present his speech, but I am going to ask you, Minister, that you get on with your speech so that we can indeed get through what is a very ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes.

The SPEAKER: ... important matter. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I am responding to some of the things she is saying ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No man.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and the whole Albertinia

child welfare is far more complex and they know it, Madam Speaker, but before the television cameras they like to say another story. So ... [Interjections.] because that is all that they are good for. You know, they talk about children and, hon member Lekker, very respectfully, and I really like the way hon member Lekker dealt with the debate. [Interjections.] She mentioned the names ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Where is your speech?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: She mentioned the names of all the children who died. You know, what was so amazing about that, was when I visited all those houses, not one of them were there. [Inaudible.] was missing in action. [Interjections.] Not one of them were anywhere to be found.

The SPEAKER: Order please. Take your seat, hon Minister Fritz.

Ms M N GILLION: Point of order, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: The MEC must stop point fingers at us this side. [Interjections.] No, no, no. I am not obsessed.

The SPEAKER: Well, your finger is actually up at me right now, hon member

Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: No, I am not obsessed, Madam Speaker, and the MEC must come back to the relevance of the speech.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon members, may I ask you to all put your fingers in your pockets, please. Thank you. [Laughter.] It does not make sense to have finger pointing when we really are busy with a very serious debate, and I would like you to afford this debate the seriousness that it deserves.

So let us get down to the business of serving our citizens out there, rather than all this mudslinging that is currently happening here. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And I want to start by saying and concurring with hon member Christians that we have fundamentally forgotten, and I think we have lost the plot, that central to our institutions is the family. We all know that the family is the central institution.

I grew up in a place called Hanover Park. If you walk in the street they shoot through the head, and that is why, you know, †dis hierso maak enige iemand enige iets. Dis nie nog soos die mense in die *middle class* hier nie. [here anyone does anything. It is not like the people in the middle class here.] And the point I want to make about that. In that violent area, we grew up in a family where our fathers and mothers took responsibility. And the gangs were there, but they took responsibility as a family, as a strong unit with values. Let us get that back.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: This notion that Government must be in every house, and be a policeman in every room where the mother has a boyfriend. Eventually the boyfriend rapes the child, kills the child. They are suggesting that we must have a policeman in every house. Let us get our family values back, ladies and gentlemen. Let us not make Micky Mouse jokes about a serious matter. This is a serious matter. [Interjections.]

Our children are dying, and you know what, Madam Speaker? The most amazing thing about the children who died in gang violence, was that this very ANC Government, the national one, they were too pathetic to be a government, that is why they are out of government. †Hulle is *pathetic*. [They are pathetic.] They do not even mention, that is why they are still in opposition and they are so fractious that they will stay in opposition for the next 100 years.

Ms M N GILLION: Where is your speech?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And you know, Madam Speaker, we have gang violence every week in our townships. Our children are killed through crossfire. Their National Government, with the police, say they refuse to bring in specialised forces when we beg them as Social Development to do that.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: My social workers cannot always go in. They get hijacked, assaulted and one guy was stabbed recently. And then they come and sit there and bloody grandstand. They come and grandstand. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Please, kindly take your seat. Hon member Beerwinkel? Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Order, please. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like just to refer you to Rule 43. Rule 43 says:

“The presiding officer, after having called attention to the conduct of a member who persists in irrelevance or repetition of arguments, may direct the member to discontinue his or her speech.”

In this case, Madam Speaker, I am urging you to apply Rule 43.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Well done.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It has caused disruption in this House deliberately and undeservedly. Regardless of provocation, because we get provocation from that side as well. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, thank you. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Yes, it is a relevant clause. However, the Minister has been naming some of the shortcomings of the system, and that is the dysfunctionality of the families, as well as the dysfunctionality in the South African Police Service to provide ... [Interjections.] That is absolutely relevant and germane to the topic.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Hon Beerwinkel, kindly take your seat.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: On what Rule number is the Chief Whip standing?

The SPEAKER: I think it was talking to the point of order. I have listened to this conversation, and apart from the Minister using unparliamentary language, I think in his response he is dealing with the debate issues that were raised throughout the debate. Hon Minister Fritz, could I ask you to compose yourself and proceed? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Allow me to address the issue of the call for the commission of inquiry. Let me also just say up front, the Trauma Centre and Community Chest and all the other organisations, not one of them who were there, work within the child protection space. Not one.

They came to a meeting with the Premier. They asked the Premier to call for a commission of inquiry. They sat around the table with the Premier. The

Premier said, “People, let us do a bit of background research so that I have, for terms of reference, substantive evidence why we call for the ...”

[Interjection.] You were not there hon member. Madam Speaker - man!

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Please protect me!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Fritz, kindly speak through the Chair.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: But please, I am asking you to protect me.

The SPEAKER: Ja, I will – honourable members. Sorry. Minister Fritz, will you kindly direct the Chair, speak to me, thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So, they leave the meeting ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... they do not say a word at the meeting. Valdi does not say a word at the meeting. They get secondary sources in the newspapers ... [Interjections.] and then they say, and I will come to that meeting and these middle class [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, kindly address the Chair, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Where the money, where all the funding that we give, they spend it in hotels. They must go to community centres in Hanover Park and have their meetings there. That is what they must start doing. This ANC like to cut ribbons, Madam Speaker. Their little paraphernalia. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They do not deal with the issues. And that is the problem. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members – sorry.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is the problem.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Kindly take your seat, please, Minister Fritz.

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.] pointing.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, I am looking at you. Interjections are allowed, but not a running commentary, please. Everyone has had an opportunity in this debate. Kindly allow the Minister to present. Thank you.

You may proceed, Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And today I want to take the opportunity to really thank the hundreds of organisations, NGOs. Not the ones who run away like that Child Welfare. They ran away with our money by the way.

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The hundreds of organisations who work within the children's sector, that protect children, and up to 35 000 children a month we work with. Not when they feel like, "I am going to read something," and when they alert this and that. I am talking about 35 000 children in foster care, in all other sectors, in adoptions, in our ECDs, are all spaces of safety for our children.

That is not all. You know, when they come here, they come and grandstand. It is all they have. [Interjection.] That is the work they have.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible] grandstanding.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They do not work on the ground. They are nowhere to be seen. And through you, Madam Speaker, hon member Dugmore is like the main grandstander, with all his organisations. They do not even work. He is the main grandstander. Let me

address the Children's Commissioner.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me address the Children's Commissioner. Here the ANC was in government for almost 15, 16 years. [Interjections.] They did absolutely nothing to institute it – we are now on a backlog as Government – now the whole process must be followed to establish a Children's Commissioner. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Sorry, Minister Fritz.

Mr M G E WILEY: The so-called hon members on the other side there on the back row, are absolutely out of control. I ask that they be brought to order.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And the problem ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Dijana? Sorry, and if I could ask not just the ANC members, for all of you to just compose yourself. There is far too much noise at the same time. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Ms M N GILLION: I want you to rule on the Chief Whip of the majority party, who referred to the “so-called” honourables. We are not “so-called”.

An HON MEMBER: He is so-called. He is so-called.

The SPEAKER: I will explore that point in Hansard, hon member Gillion, and I will revert to the House in due course if necessary. You may proceed, hon member Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And we have said, specifically to those members who come to the committee meetings, we have said to them on numerous occasions that the whole process of the child is a constitutional issue, so it must come through Parliament. It is a process that will have to come through Parliament. These hon members, who will not have so-called hon members, they will have to appoint that commissioner. [Interjection.] You are part of the process, Madam Speaker. Let me talk about another issue ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me just talk about another issue. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Sorry. Hon members, hon member Tyatyam and Olivier. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The other issue that members are raising, and I am very worried about some of the ANC. They try sometimes to suggest that when people are poor, that poverty is equal to criminality. That is one of the themes that came out of the discussion that they had. [Interjections.]

No, they said so, and I agree with them that around where we live, there are sometimes terrible conditions. Yes, those issues can possibly happen, but to argue that criminality is equal to poverty is a very dangerous space to go into, because I can show you in this gallery, there are a number of young people sitting here, coming out of very bad conditions, but they are absolutely ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... brilliant young people in our society today.

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.] for yourself.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They are absolutely brilliant.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member Tyatyam wants me to swear again, Madam Speaker. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: No, please, please, do not, Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, I will not.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to further say that this Government specifically, in the last year alone, in the last financial year, we spent R683 million within the child protection sphere. That includes children in conflict with the law, that includes children removed from their parents into institutions by the Children's Act, it includes foster care, and in fact, again, the sister governments in the whole of the rest of the country, you must see the backlogs of foster care in the rest of the country. [Interjections.] and come to Cape Town. The backlog is 250.

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.] salaries.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So we do, we perform. We perform very well. They are also the ones who appoint and give bursaries to

students. After three years of study they give them a job for three years.
The National Government ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: What are you coming to now?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and you know what happens? [Interjection.] To protect children – yes, it is relevant to that. What happens? After three years they, the very Government, fire the children. Those social workers. So the point I am making ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, members.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... is that the ANC in this province must start taking the issue seriously.

Ms P MAKELENI: What are you doing [Inaudible.]?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They must stop going to little events where they can release little statements to newspapers, and they miss the plot completely. That is the problem that we have. I think the day has come for us all to take it seriously, specifically, honourable – I will not mention her name, but, you know, we must really do that. I thank you.
[Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Fritz. We now move to Interpellations. Sorry, if you can just pause for a minute on Interpellations. I just need to find my notes. Thank you. The first interpellation, I recognise the hon the Minister, Minister Marais.

Cultural and language heritage: promotion of

***1. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

What is her Department doing to promote cultural councils or communities that share a certain cultural and language heritage?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Madam Speaker. †Dankie, agb lid Joseph, vir hierdie interpellasie. [Thank you, hon member Joseph, for this interpellation.]

The Western Cape Culture Commission, a public entity of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, is tasked with the legislative mandate to promote and support cultural councils. Support is rendered through the funding of projects, research and conferences undertaken by the respective councils.

The Department attends the cultural events for which support is rendered and visitations are undertaken to establish the functioning and capacity of these councils within communities.

†Die programme wat ondersteun word is gemik op die bevordering en bewaring van kultuurpraktyke. Hierdie steun het ten doel om 'n waardering en respek vir die uiteenlopende kultuur in die Wes-Kaap te ontwikkel.

Die geïntegreerde inligting voorsien die programme wat aangebied word, van die nodige kennis rakende aspekte wat aandag moet verkry om die funksionering van hierdie rade te verbeter, en hulle te help met die uitvoering van hul programme.

Die Departement gee deur die Kultuurkommissie uitvoering aan die bewaring en bevordering van uiteenlopende kulture in die Wes-Kaap, deur befondsing, werksinkels en besprekings. Die Departement help om die registrasie van hierdie rade as organisasies sonder winsgewing te fasiliteer, en bied hulle die geleentheid om toegang tot befondsingsagentskappe te verkry.

Daar is tans 29 kultuurrade wat op die Wes-Kaap Kultuurkommissie se databasis geregistreer is. Die name van die rade is soos volg:

- 16 Khoisan-rade
- 11 Basoetoe-rade
- 11 Zoeloe-rade
- Mampondomise Xhosa rade, 10 van hulle
- Xhosa-rade, 10 van hulle
- En 1 Rastafaria-raad.

Die waarde van kulturele- en taaldiversiteit word erken, en daarom word kultuurrade deur verskeie inisiatiewe bemagtig met kennis, vaardighede en begrip om by te dra tot en voordeel te trek uit sulke diversiteit.

In die afgelope jaar het die Departement Erfenisdag-aktiwiteite in Clanwilliam in samewerking met kultuurrade gefasiliteer, wat bewys gelewer het van hoe dans en musiek maatskaplike samehorigheid en verdraagsaamheid op 'n inklusiewe bewyse bevorder.

Verdere inisiatiewe sluit in werkswinkels oor kwessies van bestuur, en seminare oor die sosiale en ekonomiese waarde van kultuur. Dit bevestig die idee dat uniekheid en diversiteit vir toekomstige geslagte bewaar en gekoester moet word wanneer ons die tapisserie van die kulture in die Wes-Kaap beleef en vier.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The programmes that are being supported are aimed at the promotion and preservation of cultural practices. This support has the aim of developing an appreciation and respect for the diverse culture in the Western Cape.]

The integrated information provides the programmes offered with the necessary knowledge with regard to the aspects requiring attention to improve the functioning of these councils, and to assist them in the

implementation of their programmes.

Through the Cultural Commission, the Department preserves and promotes the diverse cultures in the Western Cape, through funding, workshops and discussions. The Department assists to facilitate the registration of these councils as non-profit organisations, and offers them the opportunity to gain access to funding agencies.

There are currently 29 cultural councils registered on the Western Cape Cultural Commission data base. The names of the councils are as follows:

- 16 Khoisan councils
- 11 Basotho councils
- 11 Zulu councils
- Mampondomise Xhosa councils, 10 of them
- Xhosa councils, 10 of them
- And 1 Rastafaria council.

The value of cultural and language diversity is acknowledged, and therefore cultural councils are empowered with knowledge, skills and understanding to contribute to and benefit from such diversity.

During the past year the Department has facilitated Heritage Day activities in Clanwilliam in cooperation with cultural councils, which demonstrated how dance and music promote social cohesion and tolerance in an inclusive

manner.

Further initiatives include workshops on matters of management, and seminars on the social and economic value of culture. It confirms the concept that uniqueness and diversity should be preserved and cherished when we experience and celebrate the tapestry of the cultures of the Western Cape.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Die agb lid Max.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Max.]

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to say the absence of the Leader of the Opposition sends out a very clear message. [Interjection.] that he himself does not have confidence in his own motion of no confidence. [Interjection.] Mr Deputy Speaker, culture is defined as:

“The arts and other manifestations of human intellectual achievement regarded collectively.

The ideas, customs and social behaviour of a particular people of a society.”

Now there are ways to create an inclusive society, and it starts with cultures - to share languages as well, and this is extremely vital because it helps to integrate residents, while also fostering peaceful relations between the people

of this province, and to achieve this we have to acknowledge the very unique cultural practices and languages that people in this Western Cape speak.

I would like to commend the Democratic Alliance led Western Cape Government and the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, because they have ensured that bodies are in place to promote various cultures and languages.

One of these bodies in the Western Cape is the Western Cape Cultural Commission, whose function is to advise, amongst others, the Minister on the preservation, promotion and the development of arts and culture in the communities which this Parliament represents, and what pleases me most about this commission is the fact that it comprises of members who were nominated by the public, not by us as politicians.

We also have the Heritage Resource Authority, commonly known as Heritage Western Cape. Now this body assures that the Western Cape's rich and diverse heritage is identified, protected and preserved.

Now Tata Madiba taught us how to embrace culture. Now, Mr Deputy Speaker, and as you are aware, it is only the Democratic Alliance who emulates and promotes the principles of our former and late president Madiba.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Are you serious?

Mr L H MAX: So, Mr Deputy Speaker, as the Democratic Alliance, we believe that our unity lies in our diversity, and by acknowledging each other's differences, and when we make an effort to understand and appreciate these differences [Interjection.] it will definitely help us to achieve that inclusive society. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Exclude my department, please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In terms of the Cultural Affairs and Sports' Annual Performance Plan 2017/18, the main purpose is to provide arts and culture, museum, heritage and language related services to the inhabitants of this province. In so doing, the Department must support and assist to identify, conserve, manage and promote resources to achieve the stated goals.

With regards to the list of the councils that the Minister was reading, there is still a persistent cry from the Xhosa and Sotho people from the initiation culture that is perpetually undermined in this province. There are no preserved sites or cultural villages across the province for them to practice their culture with dignity and respect. The Provincial Government and municipality continue to turn a blind eye when it comes to securing cultural villages and sites for this purpose.

In many cases, due to scarcity of available land for housing, community members occupy open spaces and put up shelters to stay. These open spaces are usually used as cultural sites for initiation purposes. This contradicts needs and causes conflict amongst community members, and may, at times, lead to physical fights and possible loss of lives.

We call on the Provincial Government to immediately put a strategic plan in place, in collaboration with municipalities, to facilitate the establishment of cultural villages and comprehensive training of Amakhankatha Nengcibi on safety and related insecurities, in and around the cultural villages.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Denis Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. †Hoofstuk 9 van die Provinsiale Grondwet spreek die behoefte aan dat die Regering aandag gee aan kulturele rade. Die rade onderskryf die Grondwet van Suid-Afrika, wat meld dat Suid-Afrika aan almal behoort, en dat ons verenig moet wees in ons diversiteit.

Kulturele rade en die befondsing van kulturele praktyke dra beslis by tot nasiebou, en om ons verdeelde verlede te ontgroeï, terwyl gelyke geleenthede geskep word vir almal wat 'n passie het vir die kultuur- en erfenisaangeleenthede.

Ek het gehoor by die Minister van die programme, maar ek wil 'n beroep doen op gereelde bewusmaking van registrasies en programme wat befonds kan word, van die kulturele besoekpunte van die Regering, met die inligting wat geleenthede moet skep, en dit sal bydra tot die bevordering van intellektuele-, geskiedkundige- en spirituele inligting.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Chapter 9 of the Provincial Constitution addresses the need for the Government to attend to cultural councils. The councils underwrite the Constitution of South Africa, that says that South Africa belongs to all, and that we should be united in our diversity.

Cultural councils and the funding of cultural practices definitely contribute to nation building, and to outgrow our divided past, while equal opportunities are created for all who have a passion for the cultural and heritage matters.

I have heard from the Minister about the programmes, but I want to call for a regular awareness of registrations and programmes that can be funded, of the cultural points of visit of the Government, with the information that has to create opportunities, and it will contribute to the promotion of intellectual, historical and spiritual information.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier initiated a summit a few years ago, and I

think it is time that there must be a follow-up summit, and it will give the Western Cape Government the opportunity to strengthen the cultural warmness, and give recognition to the freedom of existence and association in society, as well as the opportunity to engage directly with these cultural leaders.

An HON MEMBER: With some of them.

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Na die reg om te lewe, kom die reg om in jou eie taal te kommunikeer. Dit is dus belangrik, in belang van die Grondwet en die Wes-Kaapse Regering onder die DA-beheer, om meertaligheid te bevorder. In hierdie opsig kan die Departement, die Taalraad, die privaatsektor, die nie-regeringsorganisasies en al die kultuurorganisasies en -leiers 'n groter rol speel. Ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr D JOSEPH: After the right to live, comes the right to communicate in your own language. It is therefore important, in the interest of the Constitution and the Western Cape Government under DA control, to promote multi-language proficiency. In this regard the Department, the Language Council, the private sector, the non-government organisations and all the cultural organisations and leaders can play a greater role. I thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. [The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.]

The hon member Makeleni again.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The funding that members are talking about, it is a pity that most of the organisations do not benefit from this, and in fact, it is the very same organisations that are benefiting year-in and year-out. The Minister, at some point, put a moratorium on the very same funding, which left many organisations unfunded and unable to continue doing what is necessary for the cultural community.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Die agb lid Denis Joseph.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Denis Joseph.]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dankie vir die geleentheid. Ek dink ek het die interpellasie spesifiek op die program gesit om te verneem by die Minister wat eintlik in die program aangaan. Daar is, soos agb lid Makeleni gesê het, 'n jaarprogram, maar ek wil 'n versoek rig aan die Minister dat die geleentheid vir registrasie van die organisasies baie meer en sterker bemark moet word. Ek neem kennis van agb lid Makeleni se punt op finansies, en ek is seker daar is net soveel geld in die begroting, maar in beginsel stem ons saam. Dat hoe meer geld toegeken kan word aan die Departement, hoe meer kan die Departement doen vir die kulturele organisasies. Ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the opportunity. I think I specifically put the interpellation on the programme to learn from the Minister what is actually going on in the program. As hon member Makeleni said, there is an annual program, but I want to put a request to the Minister to promote the opportunity for registration of the organisations more frequently and stronger. I take note of hon member Makeleni's point on finances, and I am sure there is only so much money in the budget, but in principle we agree. That the more money that can be allocated, the more the Department can do for the cultural organisations. I thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Marais?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Department is committed to the development, promotion and preserving of cultural and linguistic diversity, because they possess creative and innovative means of self-actualisation and capacities of social transformation based on social practices, values, traditions and histories of cultural communities, and as such are fundamental to human society.

†En dan wil ek net aan agb lid Joseph sê, ek neem kennis dat u vra dat daar meer bewusmaking gedoen moet word van wanneer rade kan registreer. Dit word wel gedoen, en ons het werklikwaar baie groot stappe al geneem om dit meer bekend te stel.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[And then I just want to say to hon member Joseph, I take note that you are asking that there should be greater creation of awareness when councils can register. It is indeed being done, and we have really already taken very big steps to promote it more.]

Then, hon member Makeleni, there are sites in each district for our initiations, and I will provide ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: They are sold out.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ... you with all the information.

Ms P MAKELENI: Not anymore, they are sold out.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: So ...
[Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Because you have money.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: That is true, so I think you have got a wrong perception of these sites. There are forums in

each district that look at these sites as well. So I will, as I have said, provide you with this information. I thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the first interpellation. Order. We move onto the second interpellation. Hon member Lekker to Minister Schäfer. I see Minister Schäfer.

Happy Valley, Eerste River: plans to build primary school

2. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Education:

Whether there are any plans to build a primary school in Happy Valley, Eerste River; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you to hon member Lekker. The answer to the question is that there are no plans to build another new primary school in Happy Valley or Eerste River areas. The reasons are as follows:

The WCED completed and opened two brand new primary schools in the area last year; the new Forest Village Leadership Academy in Eerste River, and Happy Valley Primary School. The WCED is currently busy constructing a new high school in Eerste River.

There is currently a greater and more immediate need for new schools in the Mfuleni area near Eerste River and Happy Valley, and the WCED has identified the need to provide a new primary and high school within Mfuleni in the next three to four years. Planning on the primary school and high school will, however, only commence in the outer of the MTEF, as the acquisition of the site has not yet been concluded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I believe that 4.9 kilometres away from Happy Valley, a primary school was erected in an area called Silver Sands, and this is on the outskirts of Happy Valley. Therefore, Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to bring this to the attention of the MEC, that consultations were done between the Department of Education, as well as the community of Happy Valley, and serious concerns were raised, and those concerns included the walking distance from Happy Valley to the neighbourhood areas, like your Klein Vlei, as well as Blue Downs itself.

However, these calls fell on deaf ears. It therefore raises serious concerns that the Department has again, listening to what the MEC has put here, taken serious considerations to cater for the area of Mfuleni, whilst the area of Happy Valley was left out. I actually wanted to bring this to the House, because during my visit to the area of Happy Valley, I happened to receive a list of plus-minus 200 learners who were turned away from schools in the neighbouring Klein Vlei, as well as Blue Downs.

At some point Erf 5590 was identified and agreed upon between members of the community and the Department of Education, and therefore it leads me to question what led to the Department identifying a particular piece of land in Silver Sands, and not the one that was agreed upon by members of the community, as well as the officials from the Department, which is in Happy Valley, and bring the school amenities to the area where people are staying. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. †Die agb lid Basil Kivedo. [The hon member Basil Kivedo.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon members, members of the media and distinguished guests. In particular our Human Rights Commissioner, Mr Chris Nissen.

I am exceptionally pleased to hear that Minister Schäfer and her Department have already completed the building of two new schools in the Eerste River area. Please correct me if I am wrong, but surely we should be prioritising areas that are still in desperate need of schools, instead of going on to build a third school in the same area.

It is exceptionally important that the Provincial Department of Education localises the construction of schools in order to give residents from all corners of the province an equal opportunity, rather than concentrating the

limited resources and funding available in a single area.

It has also come to my attention that all learners in Eerste River have already been placed. This I would like to commend the Department for, ensuring that the youth in Eerste River and surrounding areas have access to the necessary educational infrastructure for their academic development.

†Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, in hierdie DA-beheerde Regering sal toegang tot voldoende skoolfasiliteite 'n prioriteitsaak bly. Verder sal ons op konstruktiewe en pro-aktiewe wyse omgewings skep wat bevorderlik is vir leer, onderrig en ontwikkeling. Sodoende sal ons denkende leiers daarstel, wie in staat sal wees om 'n meer vooruitstrewende Suid-Afrika te skep. Ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr Deputy Speaker, in this DA-controlled Government, access to sufficient school facilities will remain a matter of priority. Furthermore we will create environments in a constructive and pro-active manner that will promote learning, teaching and development. In this manner we will create thinking leaders who will be able to create a more prosperous South Africa. I thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. If I may read from the

booklet of the Department. It says here that:

“The district is divided into six circuits, covering the areas of Khayelitsha, Blackheath, Kuils River.”

Nowhere, Mr Deputy Speaker, does it say that a school will be erected, or there is a plan to erect a school in Happy Valley, and that is the question here today, that a school be erected in Happy Valley and not in other areas that have been identified.

Moreover, the area of Happy Valley has been there for the past plus-minus 20 years, and there is not even a single school erected in that area. It can never be an issue that only two schools have been built in the area of Eerste River, and you include Happy Valley in that pool of residential areas that are in Eerste River.

When you are talking of Happy Valley, you are talking of a former kind of farm place, where 70% of communities that are residing are unemployed, and you find a situation where you have got learners that have to walk from Happy Valley into Blackheath or Eerste Rivier and Klein Vlei for that matter, including the 4.6 kilometre distance that is in Silver Sands.

Therefore I am urging the MEC, including her Chairperson, that the issue of Happy Valley be taken into account. Whilst we have got learners that are being transported in other areas there is no such transport in Happy Valley.

You can go there tomorrow, you will find no learner transport, you will find no other amenities, except for a dilapidated community hall.

I am bringing this to the attention of the MEC, to say they must review only having built two schools in Eerste Rivier and that no other provisions have been made. Therefore, Mr Deputy Speaker, in representing the people of that community, I am making this appeal. Those communities must be given schools where they reside, and not outside their area. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: We agree.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Earlier this year Minister Schäfer highlighted that R1,6 billion has been dedicated to infrastructure, R380 million on the learner transport initiative, and a further R1,2 billion on special needs education.

When doing a comparative analysis with the WCED to other educational departments across the country, in light of budgetary constraints faced by the WCED, I must commend them on their success.

Furthermore, the Department's track record over the years speaks for itself, and thus I have reason to believe that the Minister and her Department are

allocating their resources to the best of their ability. I thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That was not an interpellation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, when you are speaking of learner transport, you are speaking of a 5 kilometre radius.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And this is 4.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Many times we have heard that there is Department deliberations on considering those learners who are within less than that 5 kilometre radius, but that is neither here nor there, because it has not been implemented. I am raising this, Mr Deputy Speaker, because whenever there is a learner transport issue that must be dealt with, people must take into consideration the transport route in general, and investigate the expenditure of the learner transport and simultaneously the effectiveness of the utilisation of the existing school transport accommodation.

Now in this case I am once again saying that the learners of Happy Valley, the 200 that were not placed at the beginning of the year, are still at home, because they were not accommodated in other areas and moreover, if we are taking into consideration the issue of transport, as well as the weather conditions, it takes us back to our commitment as this Government that is

supposed to care of the learners, or care for the people; that we have a responsibility of making sure that learners are at school during school hours, and not sitting at home, and this is where most of the crime is taking place, because learners do not have anything else to do. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon member Lekker, I am not aware of any learners who are not placed in that area. My information is that every school going aged child has been placed. So if you have the names of people who are not, please, will you send them to my office, and we will certainly look into that.

Our Department has to build in areas of greatest need, and that is what we do. When one area gets two schools in one year and other areas are bursting at the seams, we have to look at other areas as well. We cannot build more and more schools in one particular place. We also cannot build schools in every single little community, it is just not possible. We have huge constraints in our budget, as you well know ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is nonsense.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... which means we cannot change the learner transport policy, as much as I would love to do so. She is not listening. Perhaps if the hon member would like to listen to the response.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Huh-uh, no, do not talk like that.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The learner transport policy is 5 kilometres ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Schäfer, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, if she is not interested in the response, perhaps I do not need to bother.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: She is talking nonsense.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Minister Schäfer, just one second.
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, arrogance.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Hon member Mackenzie, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. The hon member said the Minister must not talk crap. Is that parliamentary? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is nonsense.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I did not hear that. Did the hon member say that?

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I did.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: She did.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If she did not, then it is fine. If she had said it, it would have been unparliamentary. She denies having said it?

An HON MEMBER: No, she said she did.

An HON MEMBER: She did.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: She admitted it?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then it is unparliamentary, the member must withdraw that. Please withdraw that.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I withdraw, but the member ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... is talking nonsense.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, member, please rise. Please stand up. You will withdraw unconditionally.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Withdraw that remark unconditionally.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I withdraw the crap part.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat then. Thank you. Minister Schäfer, please continue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are almost done.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The learner transport policy of the Western Cape, which happens to be the same as the national policy, is that

we transport learners who are 5 kilometres or more away from school in rural areas where there is no other public transport.

Ms P Z LEKKER: We know that story. Give us something new.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Well, if you want me to give you something new, then you must give me more money and instead of sitting with ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Then you must use the money.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Instead of sitting with R40 billion in Dubai, thanks to your President, perhaps we could have been using it for learner transport ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... and teaching posts that we desperately need ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible.] back home.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] jealous!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Excuse me?

Ms P Z LEKKER: I am saying come back home instead of [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Lekker, allow the Minister to respond to your contribution.

Ms P Z LEKKER: No, but the response [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The Minister can respond to the way she feels, she deems fit. So that is her decision to respond.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much. I would love to change... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, just one second. There is – is it a point of order hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker. Is that the Minister, Deputy Minister should address you and not have a two-way conversation with the member who has just raised a point.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I agree totally with that. The Minister will

speak through the Chair. Minister Schäfer, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. As I was saying, we would love to increase the learner transport system if we had more money. R20 billion is my annual budget. R40 billion is sitting in Dubai. That could provide for two times my entire Department for ... [Interjection.] One year is R20 billion, one year. So if I had that money I would be very happy to expand the learner transport scheme, but unfortunately we are trying to desperately try and provide for the extra 20 000 children that come here every year, because we have such a much better education system ... [Interjection.] than any other province in the country. [Interjection.] So I would unfortunately I would love to – Mr Deputy Speaker, perhaps the hon member could also speak through Chair, not directly to me.

Mr C F BEERWINKEL: That is [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: But the fact of the matter is, I would very, very much like that R40 billion to provide more teaching posts for my teachers also. As I said, if there are people who are not in school and you have names, please give them to my office, we will certainly look at it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Schäfer, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Sit down with your nonsensical [Inaudible.].

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes that interpellation. We move onto the third one. Hon member Beerwinkel to Minister Meyer. I see Minister Meyer.

Money Bill amendments

3. Ms C F Beerwinkel asked the Minister of Finance:

Given the fact that both the National and Provincial Constitutions instruct this Province to put legislation in place to amend a Money Bill, what is he doing to initiate this process?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank for the opportunity to take part in this interpellation.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Section 29 of the Western Cape Constitution stipulates that if a bill is a money bill, then only the provincial Minister responsible for financial matters may introduce it in the Provincial Parliament. It is acknowledged that in terms of Section 30(2) of the Western Cape Constitution:

“A provincial act must provide for a procedure by which the Provincial Parliament may amend a Money Bill.”

It is the considered view of the Provincial and the National Treasuries that the introduction of a Bill to provide for the procedure to amend a Money Bill, should be done by a Provincial Parliament in terms of its oversight responsibility.

Such an Amendment Bill is not a Money Bill in itself. My Department has, on an earlier opportunity in this House, provided a comprehensive reply and a presentation on the process. However, a process was undertaken to solicit inputs and guidance from the National Treasury on the views of this subject matter.

Since the matter was raised during the debates on the main Appropriation Bill earlier this year in March, in this House, I have subsequently taken the following steps to initiate the process of putting such legislation in place:

- Firstly, I have directed the Provincial Treasury to engage with the National Treasury to provide guidance on this matter. This was done and we have received a reply on 12 July 2017.
- In addition, I have approached the National Treasury to also put this matter on the agenda of the Budget Council, with the National Minister of Finance.
- Furthermore, my office has approached the office of the Speaker

of the Western Cape Parliament, with a view to raise this matter at the Speakers National Forum. I was informed that this was done at their meeting that took place last week. This was done specifically to identify whether the executive or the legislative arm of this Government should take responsibility for such legislation.

We have consulted our own legal services, as well as the National Parliamentary legal advisors, who have provided advice to guide us on the process to be adhered to.

What has emerged, Mr Deputy Speaker, from the various consultations on this process, is that legislation to amend the Money Bill resorts under the brick of what is referred to as legislation in terms of the accountability and oversight role entrusted to Parliament. As such, the sponsor of the legislation should be the relevant legislative arm of government, and not the executive. This was the case of the National Money Bills amendment procedure and related matters. It was initiated by Parliament and the National Minister of Finance.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister Meyer, your first slot has expired.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me first of all also welcome Mr Chris Nissen here from the Human Rights Department, and the reason why I am specifically doing that is because even though this interpellation has to do with finance and amendments to a Money Bill, it emanated from the fact that communities and even us as oversight members, have no mechanism to amend a thick book budget that is presented to us. That is where it emanated from.

So we must not create the impression that everything was fine, and we are setting up a process. It emanated from the fact that we are rubberstamping a thick book like that. Communities need to know how, where and why finances are being spent, and that they are being deprived of an opportunity to make input into the amendment of what is in that book.

However, Mr Deputy Speaker, let me make this point categorically. At no stage did we suggest that the amendments to the Money Bill legislation that we want in place, would be a Money Bill, because a Money Bill is about finance and numbers. We were asking for legislation to be able to amend what is in that Money Bill. So let us not create confusion here about it not being a Money Bill. We never said that.

Having said all I have just said, let me also say then thank you to the MEC for the background work that he has done subsequently, so that this process can be put in place, and I trust that going forward and with haste, we will see

meetings taking place, where we will be able to put out heads together to see how this process will be rolled out, but I am glad that there at least is a proactive approach at whichever level. That there in future will not be a big book dumped in front of us, to which we will just have to rubberstamp. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Denis Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. A Money Bill appropriates money. It relates to imposing taxes and levies. The ANC have placed this interpellation in front of the Minister trying to get an explanation about the Money Bill. Clearly it also demonstrates that the ANC ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... needs to understand ... [Interjections.] what the bill is about, what the mandate is about, and what the process is about. [Interjections.] The ANC will do better if they request their own Government to investigate Money Bills, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You must listen to what was [Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The money is spent in a particular way, in particular the national level State owned entities [Interjections.] and organisations. The ANC must go back to the drawing board and understand Money Bills

themselves. [Interjection.] It is the Minister's responsibility here to educate the ANC.

Ms M N GILLION: †Haibo! [No man!]

Mr D JOSEPH: The Western Cape Government is open ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Why do you have to educate us [Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The Western Cape Government is open, it is transparent. The Budget Committee is open, it is transparent. The Treasury Department is open, it is transparent and regular meetings are included ...

Ms P MAKELENI: Charity begins at home.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... in the processes when this Western Cape Government deals with money matters.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC at the national level shows no leadership in managing the finances of this country. So they have no opportunity to talk about money here in this province. [Interjections.] They do not know what it is.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D JOSEPH: If they want to change Money Bills, they must win elections.

[Interjection.] Win elections then you can change Money Bills. And we will do that after 2019. We will introduce new legislation in effect of Money Bills. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Mr R T OLIVIER: You guys must try to listen.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No amount of shouting and grandstanding ...

[Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... from the members on the other side, will change the core of this interpellation.

Mr R T OLIVIER: You must just listen.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It has nothing to do with a Money Bill as such.

An HON MEMBER: Jô.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It has to do with the amendment to a Money Bill. That is what it is about.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Just repeat it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: How do you change what is in here?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Please repeat it, repeat it slowly.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: How do you make changes to the figures that get dumped on our desk. It is nothing about a Money Bill. We know what Money Bills are.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Slowly. Repeat it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We know what Money Bills are. We will give you a workshop, Chairperson Denis, if you do not understand. We are asking for the MEC ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Free lecture.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... to put processes in place so that we can change what is in here, Mr Deputy Speaker. As you heard from his own MEC he is putting processes in place so that we can amend it. [Interjection.] He is not teaching us about Money Bills. We know what it is.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Repeat.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We will teach them, Mr Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Jô!

Mr R T OLIVIER: Repeat.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, I will not have a confusion arise out of my request in this interpellation, because it says:

“Instruct the Province to put legislation in place to amend a Money Bill.”

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Not teach me or us about what ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: We know.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... a Money Bill is, please, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order. The hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We know exactly what the interpellation asked for. [Interjection.] Let me remind the member of her own interpellation. It says:

“Given the fact that both the National and Provincial Constitution instruct this Province to put legislation in place to amend a Money Bill, what is he doing to initiate the process?”

Now what we do know, for example, what the hon member has indicated. They want the Western Cape budget to be influenced by themselves. Now you cannot govern through the backdoor.

Ms M N GILLION: †Haibo! [No man!]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Now we know the interest of the Money Bill, what the member wants ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Is the interest to nationalise our Provincial Budget? Now if the member was that serious, they would have done it in National Government many years ago. [Interjection] They have not done it in National Government, because they know the impact of this. [Interjections.]

So now the hon member is trying to do it in the Western Cape, and obviously in the future where we govern. So we will not allow that to happen.

So for the National Government to try to control how we manage our budget,

and to change our budget in the Western Cape, is not going to happen. That is why there is public meetings, there is public participation ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... and there is input where several members of the public can give input into the Bill if they want the same [Inaudible.][Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please come to order. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, at the expense of repeating myself this has nothing to do with National Government.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It has everything to do with the legislation that you as a province are compelled to put in place, by your own constitution, as well as the National Constitution.

I have an Act, Government Gazette number 8, 16 April 2009, which spells out, and I am not going to repeat it, because I have done it before. The norms and standards for provincial legislations to amend Money Bills. There it is. That is all we are asking for. Put that in place, and the MEC has already said he is doing it. So what are these other members standing up and making a noise about?

Teaching me about national. It has got nothing to do with national. This is the Western Cape, you govern here, you are compelled to put it in place in the Western Cape, because yes, Mr Deputy Speaker, we do want input into what goes into that book. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Beerwinkel. Hon Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, it has everything to do with the national political and financial landscape, because this Act that the hon member has just mentioned now, is a National Act that describes the procedure that she explained, but as you now know, there is a draft that was published – well, in fact the draft Act on that one, the new Act, will be published – I have a copy –tomorrow in the *Government Gazette*.

I think what is mistaken here, Mr Deputy Speaker, I have written to the National Treasury and asked is it my job as a member of the Executive to

table a procedure for a Money Amendment Bill. I have received a letter from the National Treasury, and the letter says explicitly:

“It is not the responsibility of the MEC for Finance to table amendment procedures, legislative proposals. It is indeed the responsibility of the Legislature.” [Interjections.]

So that is your responsibility, and that is what you must put before the Parliament ... [Interjections.] It is not the responsibility as the member of the Executive, to table such proposals.

So I would propose that this draft Bill, that will be published tomorrow, that will define a new landscape countrywide, having implications on this Legislature, that the hon members of this Parliament and the Standing Committee use this process that they asked for, through this particular process, because there is now a process that is made available.

But National Treasury is absolutely clear that this is a function that belongs to the committees of Parliament, and not to the member of the Executive Council. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That disposes of this interpellation.

Order. Order. We have reached the end of Interpellations, hon member Beerwinkel. We have reached the end of Interpellations now. We now proceed to Questions for Oral Reply. The first question, hon member Uys to the Premier. I see the Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Vetus Schola Boland

***1. Mr P Uys asked the Premier:**

(a) Why was Vetus Schola Boland used by her Department, (b) which specific services were delivered, (c) for which period and (d) at what cost?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The management of security risks at the Provincial Planning Institute consists of:

- Identifying risks;
- Assessing the effectiveness of existing controls to face those risks or threats;
- Prioritising the risks by rating their likelihood and impact;
- Classifying the types of risks and selecting an appropriate risk option or risk response.

The PTI required a security service solution which was cost effective and

tailored to the specific needs of the institution in order to minimise risks and prevent a recurrence of burglaries and theft that had taken place at the institution. A large part of the Kromme Rhee area is used by the Western Cape Department of Agriculture as a research farm for ostrich and sheep grazing and feeding experimentation. The PTI and Department of Agriculture share a single entry point to Kromme Rhee and our risks are similar.

The Western Cape Department of Agriculture followed an open bidding process to appoint Vetus Schola and it was therefore decided that the Department of the Premier should “piggy-back” on the existing security service contract of the Western Cape Department of Agriculture, in terms of Treasury Regulation 16A6.6.

The services include:

1. Secure the business premises specifically but not limited to access control, parking areas, perimeter borders, pump stations, sewage and water plants, incident response teams, electronic visitor recording systems, control room operators, consolidated alarm system and monitoring.
2. Protect the assets of the Provincial Training Institute, safeguard staff and manage visitors, course participants, contractors, contractor’s staff and external clients on the site.

3. Implement procedures to manage unauthorised entry, taking into consideration that service delivery must be efficient and on-going.
4. Identify major long term safety and security improvement opportunities as well as short term.
5. Use updated technological systems in conjunction with physical security measures.
6. Lastly, manage contingency initiatives including, but not limited to, evacuations, power disruptions and seasonal activities.

The contract was concluded for a period of 20 months commencing on 1 August 2016 till 31 March 2018 and the answer to (d) was R1 434 120 for the contract period.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys is there a follow-up?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the Premier. Hon Premier you referred in your report that they rendered integrated and holistic support to the Office of the Premier or the Department of the Premier. I think what they did for Agriculture that is another tender, that is another issue. Can you give us some detail what the private company did in securing and making an assessment in the Department of the Premier where we have the South African Police Service and other state organs to do that?

The PREMIER: I think the hon member Uys misunderstood the answer because the Provincial Training Institute is a place in a facility primarily occupied by the Department of Agriculture. So what we are looking at is to prevent thefts, prevent intrusions, prevent car thefts and thefts out of cars and things like that. And because the Provincial Training Institute is at Kromme Rhee a large part of which comprises farms and other activities attached to the Department of Agriculture, if a specific company is providing security for that section it is allowed in terms of the Treasury Rules and I quoted the specific rule to 'piggy-back' a security contract for the same broad area, even though another Government department uses that space and that is what we did.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. So Premier exactly what did they do? Did they patrol the space? What did they do for the Department of the Premier?

The PREMIER: Well, I can tell you what the contract required them to do, whether they actually did that, I cannot say because I did not go and check up. But they were required to:

1. Secure the business premises specifically but not limited to access control, parking areas, perimeter borders, pump stations, sewage and

water plants, incident response teams, electronic visitor recording systems, control room operators, consolidated alarm systems and monitoring.

2. Protect the assets of the Provincial Training Institute, safeguard staff and manage visitors, course participants, contractors, contractor's staff and external clients on the site.
3. Implement procedures to manage unauthorised entry taking into consideration that service delivery must be efficient and on-going.
4. Identify major long-term safety and security improvement opportunities as well as short-term and then use up-dated technological systems in conjunction with physical security matters and finally manage contingency initiatives including but not limited to evacuations, power disruptions and seasonal activities.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your third opportunity?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, where did they exercise this, only at Kromme Rhee?

The PREMIER: Well, the question refers to why was Vetus Schola Boland used by her Department, which specific services were delivered. This is the information that I received so it is the only information that I have at my

disposal. If the member wants to ask that question, for which I would need to ensure that the answer is absolutely accurate, he will need to table a further question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your last opportunity.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. That is the whole issue, this was a service rendered to the Department of the Premier to the extent of R1,4 million, if I am correct Premier, you said till 2018. Now, the first thing you ask is where is this security service rendered and the question that I ask is where is it rendered? Is it in your office, is it at Leeuwenhof, is it in your parking area, where did they render this specific security service?
[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: The question that was asked, Mr Deputy Speaker, is this: why was Vetus Schola Boland used by her Department and I have explained, which specific services were delivered and I have explained very specifically, for which period and at what cost. He does not say where, but I told him where, at Kromme Rhee.

Mr P UYS: I did ask was it only Kromme Rhee?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order member Uys, your four opportunities have been used.

Mr P UYS: Well, I will get her next month.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move onto the next question, Question 2 again, hon Uys to the Premier. Premier, the second question.

Delivery Support Unit

2. Mr P Uys asked the Premier:

(a) Who were all the delivery associates with whom your Delivery Support Unit entered into partnerships, (b) for what objective, (c) for how long and (d) at what cost?

The PREMIER: The answer to the question is as follows, Mr Deputy Speaker.

a) Delivery Associates is the name of a consulting firm with whom the Delivery Support Unit, the DSU worked. Delivery Associates worked with the DSU, assisting with the design and implementation of the game-changers, as well as equipping the Delivery Support Unit with the necessary skills to introduce a new method of delivery which is known in the literature as “deliverology”.

This work was undertaken in 4 phases:

Phase 1: Delivery Associates conducted an expert review of the high-level action plans which resulted in High Level action plans that are realistic, action-orientated and robust enough to ensure delivery and we just did a presentation on some of the game-changers yesterday before the Portfolio Committee.

Phase 2: Delivery Associates briefed Cabinet members in August 2015 and provided expertise and insight into the implementation of the game-changers to assist in effective delivery. Delivery Associates assisted the DSU to set up the key elements of “deliverology”.

Phase 3: Delivery Associates provided training in delivery culture and delivery skills for key civil servants, resulting in the DSU being adequately set up to implement the game-changers.

Phase 4: Together with the DSU, Delivery Associates helped establish and enhance performance tracking for the game-changers. This included the development of a detailed roadmap for each game-changer.

(c) the time period was August 2015 to January 2016 so that is about an 18-month period and the cost to the Department was R2 781 427.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys your follow-up question?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is very unfortunate that the Premier did not answer the question. Premier, the question was who were all the delivery associates, that was the question I have asked and you did not answer that question hon Premier. For how long did it and the cost? So please give us an answer to the first part of that, who were the delivery associates?

The PREMIER: The delivery associates were Professor Michael Barber and three or four other people from his company who came at different times.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys your second opportunity?

Mr P UYS: I am concerned, Mr Deputy Speaker, because it seems like the Premier was now thinking who was it and the question was very clear that I asked her that question. May I ask the Premier then, Mr Deputy Speaker, who paid for these delivery associates?

The PREMIER: Part was paid by Government and part was paid by donors.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Third opportunity?

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier said that the total amount was R2,7 million but previously in the question she said that the total amount was R3,7 million and everything came from donations. Now how come she said now the Department paid part of it?

An HON MEMBER: How much?

The PREMIER: We have to see precisely what the other question was because I certainly am not going to try and guess what specific questions I was asked previously, but this is the amount that I have in answer to this question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your last opportunity?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Premier how did you go about in canvassing and approaching donors to donate for this specific program and who were those donors?

The PREMIER: That is an entirely new question but that is fine. We are very keen to implement best practice internationally, and my attention was first drawn to this methodology actually by a previous Minister in the Presidency, Trevor Manuel, who speaking at one lekgotla spoke about it and drew all of our attentions to books of Sir Michael Barber. I read those books with much interest and when I went abroad I asked to meet Sir Michael Barber and I was lucky enough to be able to meet him and I was together with a range of people who were very interested in good governance in South Africa, and one of those people offered to make a contribution to the work of Delivery Associates in South Africa, specifically in our province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move onto the next question, Question 3, hon

member Mnqasela to Minister Bredell.

Plans to use grey water by municipalities

3. Mr M Mnqasela asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Whether there are any innovative plans by municipalities to use their Municipal Infrastructure Grant to install water tanks to catch grey water for reuse for flushing in ablution facilities; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you to the member for the question. Grey water re-use at household's level has seen a steady increase since the awareness of the impact of the prolonged drought and requests for water conservation measures became evident. Many households opted to install their own homemade systems or purchased ready-made units freely available on the market. The grey water coming from the shower, bath, washing basins and washing machines is redirected to containers from where it is either pumped for the irrigation of gardens or used manually for watering of gardens, flushing of toilets and washing of cars.

Although the current Municipal Infrastructure Grant policy does not

allow the use of the grant on private stands or erven, such as the installation of grey water systems, the MIG Programme has contributed significantly to water conservation and demand management throughout the province. Several projects focused specifically on reducing water losses through the replacement of ageing water pipes, faulty water meters or the repair of leaking reservoirs.

My Department is however funding a pilot project in the Saldanha Bay Municipality where community ablution facilities in Informal Settlements will be using grey water for the flushing of toilets. Based on the outcome of this pilot, my Department will investigate the roll-out of the technology to other municipalities.

The Department is appointing hydrogeologists to look at various water sources and to develop a medium to long to term strategy for water provision, management and conservation in the province which amongst others includes the provision of water tanks to harvest rain water. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The other day I spoke about Mthuthuzeli Zebukwane from Makhaza who has an intervention that is one of the few that one can actually practically go and see of saving water, using grey water and using no water at all from the fresh water supply to

flush waste and that administers waste from the site.

Ms M N GILLION: Where is the question?

Mr M MNQASELA: There is only one speaker here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I am listening very carefully get to your question.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, my question to the Minister is: to what extent will the MIG grant and other related grants be utilised to save water in this province in the manner that will address this drought that we are facing in a more significant and practical way?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The MIG grant specifically, as I stated cannot be used on private stands. They are revisiting and re-looking at that but I cannot see that that provision will change. But the MIG grant has done a lot of good work within or through the MIG grant within all of our municipalities to reduce specifically water losses, the replacement of the old pipes, the faulty meters and the repairing of reservoirs.

The Department itself is looking into different systems. I can tell you also

that CapeNature has played a huge role in supporting industry to develop waterless toilets and a waterless toilet is also something that we need to manage very carefully.

Also we are discussing this with the National Minister because the first ones did not work as they should have but we have done it in two of our schemes already where we have designed off-grid housing and obviously as the Department, and myself, personally, we are also very much for rain water harvesting.

We are busy now investigating the whole issue of tanks, talking to municipalities, making it part of their planning approvals that people need to put in tanks. We will also interact with our Minister of Housing to see if there is provision for and if it is possible to also with the low-cost housing, make tanks available when we build new schemes. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie. [Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.] You see besides that failed attempt to fish for his friends tender, let us ask the real question to the MEC. Besides the Saldanha Municipality you have mentioned, in terms of innovation around MIG, can you tell us which other municipalities have started or have shared with you innovative ways around this particular issue given the extent of the drought that we have? That is my first follow-up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Most of our municipalities focus to get their water losses within international and national accepted standards, often hitting a huge problem within our networks. We focus on that part of it because a lot of municipalities, as you know, previously in this House have stated that they will apply for a dam or a big reservoir but actually their water losses is 30% to 40%.

That is their first step to get that out of order and then obviously to look at their building plans, especially the middle and upper class market to get them, by approval states, to implement tanks because it is not only buying the tank and putting the tank down. You need to have a pump, you need to have a plumber, you need to have a system, otherwise you cannot use that water to get it back into the system.

So there is a lot of work being done, there is a water study group currently working very closely with all our municipalities, sharing ideas, looking how we can pull through. As I stand here I can compliment our community working with us. Most of our people do realize that we are in a crisis. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give the original questioner another

opportunity and then I will come back to this side. Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon member Dyantyi must ask his question directly to the Minister. Mr Deputy Speaker, what I need to establish from the Minister, as I am encouraged by the opportunity now in the West Coast where they are using available resources within the municipality; I would like to hear whether the Minister has invested some energy around the space in encouraging municipalities, throughout the province, to investigate means and ways that are creative, that will then give us a sustainable water resource because water is not going to get any better? It is a serious problem and ANC, your Minister is not making it any better for us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Stick to your question. Order. [Interjections.] Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. Thank you for all the follow-ups. All the municipalities are looking into innovatively managing their water resources, to stretch their water resources. I think currently through Disaster Management we had a three-day session within each municipality to determine their needs and what will pull them through this crisis as well as how to secure the resource in the future.

So, how can we secure a three month buffer for each municipality, and we are

busy working on that plan. We have costed it already and all the municipalities will be part of the planning long term. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last opportunity will go to the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would be interested to hear because I do not hear it in the Minister's answer; how did the Minister and his Department decide that the pilot will be in Saldanha, what is the research that they used to identify Saldanha, it is very strange?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The Municipality contacted us and they wanted to start a pilot and we thought it was a very good idea especially if you look at the economic potential within Saldanha Bay with the IDZ and so forth, we know water is going to be one of the big issues there so it is from that perspective. We work with a lot of municipalities, all thirty municipalities on different projects and when a municipality puts its hand up and asks us to pilot and we are in a position to do that, we will. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We have used all four opportunities unfortunately. We move on to the next question, Question 4. [Interjections.] Order. Question 4, hon Gillion to Minister Mbombo. Minister Mbombo.

Junior doctors: placement of

4. Ms M N Gillion asked the Minister of Health:

Whether there are any junior doctors waiting for placement in the province; if so, (a) how many and (b) what are the reasons for the delay?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. This information is within the National Health Department as they are the facilitators and adjudicators for the placement of junior doctors. However, according to their online system for internship and community service placement, for mid-July, for us the allocation was five interns which have been filled.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up for that question hon member Gillion? [Interjections.] Order. Hon member Gillion you may proceed.

Ms M N GILLION: If the MEC's can control themselves first. Mr Deputy Speaker, did I hear the Minister correctly when she said there were only five young doctors sent to the Western Cape and that they are five interns? Where are the others?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: According to the national online system for

internship and community service placement, the allocation for mid-year, which is July, was five for the Western Cape which have been filled. All placements and allocations are done at a national level.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there further follow-up, again hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like the Minister to give us an indication of where these five young doctors were placed?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I would not know because [Inaudible.] but generally junior doctors, interns are only placed at central and tertiary hospitals and then for community service they are placed outside. So, I do not know exactly where. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion? [Interjections.] Order. Order. Allow the member to ask her question. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker for the protection. Although it is a national placement I think the MEC of Health in the Western Cape and the Department must be able to inform this House where those five young doctors were placed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. MEC, you have already responded to that but you may respond again if you want to. No response. Are there any

further follow-ups? Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, just in light of the question, may I ask the MEC what is the shortage of doctors in the Western Cape in terms of your assessment?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is a new question, but I can say that it is below 5%.

Mr P UYS: Sorry?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Below 5% [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Can we get numbers please? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. We have reached the fourth supplementary question but the Minister heard the question for later reply. We move onto Question number 5. Hon member Olivier to Minister Schäfer. Minister Schäfer?

Learners in Joe Slovo, recovery plans

5. Mr R T Olivier asked the Minister of Education:

What is her Department's recovery plans for almost 400 young learners

in Joe Slovo near Milnerton who lost months of learning due to their school being closed?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, hon member Olivier. It is not quite correct to say that their school was closed as the so-called school that they were attending was never open in the first place. People in the community occupied mobile classrooms that were vacated when we completed new Sinenjongo High School and purported to start their own school.

Clearly we cannot allow this to happen as the WCED is responsible for opening new schools in areas identified by us and within our available budget. Unfortunately as a result of this action there were learners that did miss out on schooling as a result of the fact that their parents did not enrol them in schools that they were recommended to enrol them in, which the WCED now has to address. The District has developed a plan to address curriculum backlog by having afternoon classes, weekend classes and extra classes during the holidays. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, for your first follow-up.

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, for those learners who are placed now at other schools, the question is whether there is a recovery plan in place to bring them up to speed with whatever they lost for this time frame?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon member Olivier, I did answer that. I

said that yes there is, the District has developed a plan to address the backlog by afternoon classes, weekend classes and extra classes in the holidays.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a second follow-up hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes, thank you. MEC, are there any investigations to determine why those almost 400 learners were at that school until this time, because if I hear you correctly you are saying unfortunately there are learners that were at this school who are not yet placed or whom parents did not apply for. I take it that those are school going aged learners who must be at school. So, can you just indicate whether there is any process of investigating what happened there and who must be held responsible or accountable for the loss of learning time for those learners?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It is not correct to say there are 400. I think initially mention might have been made of 400. They were not all of compulsory school going age. There were 262 who have been enrolled in the different schools in the area. Who must be responsible, well the Department made ...[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is not in that book. It is not there.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The Department had various meetings with parents to inform them that they could enrol their children at Marconi Beam and Tygerhof Primary School. The parents chose not to do so, so I guess if

you want to look for someone to hold accountable it must be the parents who did not enrol their children in schools that are registered with WCED. We did make it quite clear to them what options were available.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Obviously if there were more than 400 learners at this school, whether it was legal or illegal or whatever, it then indicates there is a need. Is there any other mechanism in terms of providing for that need because you have indicated that there is a recovery plan, but unfortunately did not go into detail with what that plan entails. But are you or the Department considering providing this facility given the fact that there are so many learners that were at this particular school?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: There were not 400 learners. There were 262 learners who have been accommodated predominantly at Marconi Beam by means of putting additional classrooms there, mobile classrooms. Of course the mobiles that they were occupying at the original site were actually desperately needed in other areas where we also have overcrowding.

After this whole incident happened though I have had meetings with members of the community and we have agreed to set up a task team between us, the City as well as community representatives. They have had a first meeting with our officials and they are scheduled to have another one in August to decide on terms of reference. So we have set up a process whereby we will

investigate the need for a further school in the area and what we can do about it, if it is necessary, but it is not clearly obvious to us and the site that they were on is totally and utterly unsuitable because it was actually leased by us from the City of Cape Town and it is far too small for a school.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we move on? We move onto the 6th question, number 6, the hon member Maseko to Minister Madikizela.

Title Deeds: handing over of

6. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether his Department has any plans to make sure that title deeds are handed over simultaneously with houses; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you very much to the member for the question. It is the intention of this Department to simultaneously hand over the houses with title deeds. However the transfers do not occur at the time of occupation, mainly due to breakdown in the flow of town planning processes. In order to address the problem the Department has developed a policy to improve the title deeds transfer in our Green Field subsidy housing projects.

This policy is in part aimed at supporting departmental regional planners,

project managers and municipalities to achieve the sequence of legal processes required for transfer. The new policy has yielded some success stories in projects like the Haarlem Farm Housing Project in Delft, in Friemersheim, to mention but a few. We are working on making sure that in all our new Green Field projects we are able to hand over a house together with a title deed. Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko to follow up?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, acknowledging that the title deeds also allow beneficiaries to be included in the economic mainstream, is there a pre-empt for the Department to stop the quick sales of these houses which can lead to increased numbers in the informal settlement because what actually happens is that they will sell and go back to the informal settlements after being beneficiaries for housing?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, the selling of these houses is a major issue but I think there are two ways in which we can look at it hon member. We can either use the pre-emptive right clause in the Housing Policy, Sections 10A and B or we can really look at how we empower our people so that when they do decide to sell they sell these houses at the market rate so that they are able to improve their living conditions.

So, the discussion currently is how do you strike the balance between the two

rather than coming up with measures that say that you may not sell because on the other hand we want to make sure that previously disadvantaged people become part of the players in the property market which is worth trillions. So, this is the discussion that we are currently having.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a second follow-up? Again hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Hon Minister for the houses that have already been given to the beneficiaries, is there a deadline by which house recipients are going to receive their title deeds from the Department?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, there are two types of title deeds that we are busy with now at the Department. These are title deeds that were given during the term of office of this administration and the term of office of the previous administration. One of the challenges that we are facing, in fact in both terms, is that on the one hand while we are dealing with the backlog, you find that there are a number of houses where the original beneficiaries are no longer there.

Now again there is a discussion here, nationally, as to how do we then regularise people who are already there because if a person has been there for five years you cannot then evict that person because that person is not the original beneficiary.

Mr C M DUGMORE: What about Steenberg?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, you are comparing bananas with mangos. [Interjections.] Now, what we are doing is to look at how do we make sure that people who have been living there are regularised so that they are given title deeds, because it is a fact that some of the houses that were built a couple of years ago, people are no longer living there so that is the problem that we are dealing with. But in terms of the projects that have the original beneficiaries, I think we have done almost all the houses in terms of giving the title deeds to those projects. Where we have this major problem is where people are residing there who are not the original beneficiaries.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we then proceed to the next question, Question 7, hon member Joseph to Minister Marais. I see Minister Marais.

Protection and conservation of heritage in the Western Cape

***7. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

What progress has been made with the protection and conservation of the cultural-historical, archaeological and architectural heritage of the Western Cape for the benefit of our generation and our descendants?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Die uitvaardiging van die Wet op Nasionale Erfenishulpbronne, nr. 25 van 1999, het die weg gebaan vir 'n geïntegreerde

en interaktiewe bestuursbenadering van alle betekenisvolle erfenishulpbronne. Die klem op die diversiteit van die tipes erfenishulpbronne wat die erfeniswetgewing dek, was veral belangrik. Dit sluit tasbare erfenishulpbronne en aspekte van ontasbare erfenis in wat van belang is. Daar word erken dat alle erfenishulpbronne uniek en nie-hernubaar is en bydra tot die ryk erfenis van die Wes-Kaap. Sulke erfenishulpbronne sluit onder andere argeologiese-, paleontologiese hulpbronne, plekke, geboue, kultuurlandskappe en plekke van belang in.

Na die vestiging van die Provinsiale Erfenishulpbron-owerheid, Erfenis Wes-Kaap in 2002, het die Wes-Kaap beduidende vordering gemaak met die identifisering, beskerming, bewaring en bevordering van erfenishulpbronne. Die Erfenis Wes-Kaap het beleide en riglyne opgestel om die geïntegreerde benadering wat hy wil volg uit te voer. Van die Provinsiale Erfenisterreine wat onlangs tot erfenisterreine verklaar is sluit in argeologiese terreine soos Blombosgrotte, Pinnacle Point en Diepkloof, paleontologiese terreine soos die Weskus Fossilpark, histories-bebode omgewing die Graanskuur Kompleks in Kaapstad se stadskom, Gemeenskapshuis in Soutrivier en ander plekke wat verband hou met die geskiedenis van Suid-Afrika se bevrydingstryd, byvoorbeeld die Hoërskool Harold Cressy, St. George-katedraal. Ander terreine wat geïdentifiseer is om as erfenisterreine verklaar te word, is terreine van die Rocklands Burgersentrum in Mitchells Plain wat geassosieer word met die nasionale bekendstelling van die UDF in 1983 en die Auwal Masjid.

Daarbenewens het die Departement van Kultuursake en Sport in vennootskap

met Erfenis Wes-Kaap, die Oorsprong van die Moderne Mens, the “Origins of Modern Humans” gevoeg by UNESCO se lys van Tentatiewe Wêrelderfenisterreine om te verseker dat die Wes-Kaapse argeologiese terreine internasionale beskerming geniet. Hierdie potensiële wêrelderfenisterreine sluit drie argeologiese terreine in soos ek genoem het: Diepkloof-rotsskuiling, Pinnacle Point en Blombosgrotte as ankerterreine. Die Departement is tans besig om 'n Nominasie-dossier op te stel, ingevolge die Wêrelderfeniskonvensie, wat ter goedkeuring aan die Wêrelderfeniskomitee voorgelê sal word. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The promulgation of the National Heritage Resources Act, no. 25 of 1999, paved the way for an integrated and interactive management approach of all significant heritage resources. The accent on the diversity of the types of heritage resources covering the heritage legislation, especially, was important. It includes tangible heritage resources and aspects of intangible heritage of special importance. It is acknowledged that all heritage resources are unique and non-renewable and contribute to the rich heritage of the Western Cape. Such heritage resources include amongst others archeological, paleontological resources, places, buildings, cultural landscapes and places of importance.

After the establishment of the Provincial Heritage Resource Agency,

Heritage Western Cape in 2002, the Western Cape has made significant progress in the identification, protection, conservation and promotion of heritage resources. Heritage Western Cape established policies and guidelines to execute the integrated approach it wants to follow. Provincial Heritage sites that have recently been declared include archaeological sites such as Blombos Caves, Pinnacle Point and Diepkloof, paleontological sites such as the West Coast Fossil Park, historical built environment the Granary Complex in Cape Town's City Bowl, Community House in Salt River and other places linked to the history of South Africa's freedom struggle, for example the High School Harold Cressy, St. George's Cathedral. Other sites that have been identified to be declared as heritage sites are the sites of the Rocklands Civic Centre in Mitchells Plain that is associated with the introduction of the UDF in 1983 and the Auwal Masjid.

In addition, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport in partnership with Heritage Western Cape, added the "Origins of Modern Humans" to UNESCO's list of Tentative World Heritage Sites to ensure that the Western Cape archaeological sites enjoy international protection. These potential World Heritage sites include three archaeological sites as I have mentioned: Diepkloof Rock Shelter, Pinnacle Point and Blombos Caves, as anchor sites. The Department is currently drawing up a Nomination Dossier in terms of the World Heritage Convention, that will be submitted for approval to the World Heritage Committee. Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can we proceed, is there a follow-up

hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. †Dankie, agb Minister. Ek wil net weet of daar onafhanklike organisasies is wat almal hierdie verskillende afdelings bestuur en of die Wes-Kaap Regering van hulle weet en of hulle befonds word, tot voordeel van ons toekomstige pligte? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Thank you, hon Minister. I just want to know if there are independent organisations that are all managing these various divisions and whether the Western Cape Government is aware of them and whether they are being funded to the the benefit of our future obligations? Thank you.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie, agbare lid Joseph. In Pinnacle Point is daar onafhanklike organisasies wat in samewerking met die Wes-Kaap Regering werk. Ons befonds hulle nie. Hulle het hulle eie befondsing en daarom is ons besig om die vennootskap verder uit te brei, veral in die Blombosgrotte so wel as die ander een in Robberg.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Joseph. In Pinnacle Point there are independent organisations working in cooperation with the Western Cape Government. We are not

funding them. They have their own funding and therefore we are expanding the partnership, especially in the Blombos Caves, as well as the other one in Robberg.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we then proceed to the next question, Question 8, hon member Botha to Minister Mbombo.

Safety of emergency medical services

8. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Health:

How has her Department ensured that the safety of Emergency Medical Services personnel is improved?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Staff firstly are not allowed to use their own discretion to respond to a situation in red-zoned areas but they must first go to the police station in order to be escorted by the police.

Also, they are advised, on a daily basis, not to use their cell phones when responding to the scenes. A load-and-go policy has been adopted where patients in a red zone are loaded into the ambulance, stabilised and transported. Of course with the issues of assaults and all of that, staff members will need counselling which we provide for, even unlimited trauma counselling and out-going support sessions.

Community interface is very crucial because safety is everybody's business.

We have initiated “Operation Khuseleka” to raise awareness and so receive community support for staff safety. We are co-operating with the neighbourhood watches together with the Department of Community Safety, especially in the high risk areas where we have already started.

Of course we will need the support of SAPS and there is now direct communication links and early warning systems with SAPS and now we are able to access those and we get first-hand information in terms of red-zoned areas and also through the call centres. Also SAPS are informed timeously in cases where we have picked up that there is an assault somewhere. Together with the police we form part of the clusters throughout so that we can discuss the issues and also know in advance issues related to the safety.

What we have started now, which was part of my budget speech where we said now we have to have another plan as well, we have signed a memorandum with the City of Cape Town because we cannot only rely on SAPS but also we need assistance through the Metro Police and also through the existing CCTV cameras that have been installed throughout, that are being monitored at the traffic management centre in Tygerberg, Goodwood.

At least now you can see what is happening, where the ambulances are despatched in those areas and we also share intelligence to improve communication among all our stake-holders and we have started operating procedures to ensure better collaboration between the parties.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, is there a follow-up hon member

Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Minister. I just want to know what have been the challenges in ensuring the safety of the emergency medical services staff?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: One of the challenges is that we are trying to rescue the situation and protect staff members from the people who need them most. Because in most instances, especially in the current cases where the perpetrators were found and they were brought to court, you find that it is the people who were helping, they are being helped by the same people, so it becomes quite a challenge.

That is why it needs a lot of community buy-in, hence we have had meetings with [Inaudible.], we have even had meetings with some district committees, for example, in Browns Farm where the communities showed an interest in terms of helping us. So it is an on-going process where we have to keep on raising awareness to show the communities that EMS are not the enemies, they are there on their side. So, in terms of creating that, we are doing that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Gillion for a second follow-up.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Arising from the Minister's answer, I need to know what has the Minister from her side done

to ensure that CCTV cameras will be installed in all red zone areas? The other issue is the safety of the neighbourhood watches because ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member, you must ask one question at a time. Was that a second question that you are asking now?

Ms M N GILLION: It is part of the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Part of the same question, okay.

Ms M N GILLION: It is part of the same question arising from the answer of the Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, please proceed. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The grading of areas in terms of being red zones is done by the police and the red zones are not permanent in terms of the allocations. For example, you will find sometimes Manenberg is a red zone area but other times it is not red zoned. It depends on the fighting.

That is why we are working together with the City of Cape Town where they already have CCTV cameras and they monitor what is happening. For example, I think from September there will be an extension of the CCTV cameras in Site C, Khayelitsha where there are some that will be installed in the town. I am not sure about other areas but I am aware that they will be

worth about R8 million - working together with the Minister of Community Safety and the Department of the Premier. So, we are on that.

I think the members, as part of oversight, must go some time to the Goodwood area so that we can see all of this, what is happening because it is something that is so interactive and we can see, live, there is an ambulance or there it is in whatever street and we are able to immediately alert the police to suspicious activity coming from somewhere.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I just enquire from the hon member Botha, do you want to follow-up, your last opportunity then and then I will go to hon Mackenzie who indicated he wanted to follow-up as well. Hon member Botha first.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, can you tell us in terms of the EMS personnel, those that were attacked in the red zones, with regard to the ICAS programme, how many of them are still on the ICAS programme?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Staff volunteer and we also refer them. Usually there are about five to six sessions and for any staff member but in the case of EMS staff there is an extension and unlimited counselling that happens as long as the person needs. At this stage I do not have the figures in front of me in terms of how many.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie, the last opportunity on

this question?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to find out from the Minister, when they did the safety plan did they find out if by attacking EMS personnel they were just after their phones or the specialised equipment in the ambulances ? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The areas where there are attacks ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, just one second. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, can you ask hon member Mackenzie to withdraw as he told the member next to me to shut up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I did not hear that but that is not parliamentary. If the member said that, he must please withdraw that.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I withdraw, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In these areas there are not only specifically attacks on EMS staff. There are also attacks on delivery vans. In some cases even the police themselves are attacked while they are sitting in their vehicles. So it is a general crime but with the EMS it is because of their vulnerability, because they are aware that they do not have any weapons. In some instances substance abuse is the issue because the assumption is that there are drugs inside the ambulances. We have seen and heard of many cases where people mix the tablets with whatever

The ambulance is standardised inside so it is mostly cell phones. We say they must not expose their cell phones because the equipment in terms of the immobilisers and all of that is nothing fancy. In one case in Khayelitsha when they attacked them they looked around and looked for whatever they needed but the only things they took away were the cell phones of the staff members, nothing else.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we proceed to the last question, Question 9, again hon member Botha to Minister Mbombo.

Observatory Forensic Pathology Laboratory: construction of

9. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Health:

Whether the construction of the new Observatory Forensic Pathology

Laboratory has commenced; if not; why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. The site has been handed over and the Department of Public Works has already commenced with the construction costing R200 million which is going to actually take 23 months, expected by completion in 2019.

It is going to be a large facility which will be replacing the existing forensic pathology services in Salt River. Let me just brag whilst there is time for this because it is going to be the first of its kind in the whole of South Africa. It will provide a full package of level four forensic pathology services: post mortem, lab and teaching activities.

Again, I encourage members, especially the oversight, the Standing Committee, to go to Salt River Mortuary now before it is moved so you see the comparison when we have got the new one, so that you can understand why I am so excited. I have been there twice. If you go there you will [Interjection.] be happy with the [Inaudible.]. So it is a three storey institute. It will have about 26 autopsy tables, [Interjections.] four dissection tables ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Welcome back.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Please manage yourself hon member Dyantyi. Thank you. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It will have about 360 refrigerated body spaces, 180 admission fridges and 180 despatch fridges. There will also be place to accommodate undertakers place for about 100 visitors per day in terms of the families who are buried. And most importantly, the natural light that will come in and then even if you have load shedding, you still can continue dissecting the bodies.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, a follow-up question hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I just want to know hon Minister, how will you and your Department ensure that the Department of Public Works will be completing this project in the time line projected? [Interjections].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is probably premature to brag until I appear before the Standing Committee but for the mere fact that for this year we completed 101% expenditure of our health infrastructure budget for the very first time. Therefore it means that we will continue with the mechanisms that we have put in place to make sure that there is delivery. That is why I even put in a time-line of 23 months. It is going to be 23 months, completion 2019. So we will apply the same mechanisms.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms L J BOTHA: I just want to know hon Minister, in terms of this project, who are your other partners in completing this project?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Sorry?

Ms L J BOTHA: Who are the Department's other partners in completing this project?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Partners? The Department of Public Works and [Inaudible.]. It is a health facility infrastructure with the Department of Public Works as an implanting agent. I am not sure I understood your question.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Minister, in the projected time-lines for completion, what is your Department doing differently in terms of monitoring that this project will be completed in the 23 months with the Department of Public Works?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Generally the default position for any health

infrastructure is to follow the Western Cape Government delivery system according to phases. What happens now currently with the new mechanisms that I have just mentioned is that during those times that there is an expectation of completion of certain output according to the various stages, we always meet, officials meet, but not only do we meet when we are supposed to meet but now we have got inter-ministerial task teams which are chaired by the MEC for Treasury and together with the Public Works Minister, myself, Education - if it involves Education and Housing, if it involves that. So we meet constantly.

It is also part of the Cabinet's services to ensure that priority infrastructures are taken care of. Also what is crucial to us, as a client of Public Works, is we identify crucial priority projects. For example from last year to now there have been 17. So those are guaranteed and they are at their various stages. You will know that this one is nearer to completion in terms of being handed over and we will make it a point that we follow that. This one is still at the concept stage so there is still an issue about the planning and all of that but what is the progress? So we have got those mechanisms that they have put in place. That is why I was bragging that for the first time we have 101% expenditure in terms of health infrastructure.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any other follow-up questions? Okay, that is the last one. That then is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. We now move to Member's Statements. I recognise the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker, on the eve of Women's Month we have to ask ourselves what a woman is worth? This is a critical question because if you look at the high number of women that are being violently attacked, mutilated, raped and murdered, then one would say that we as women are worth absolutely nothing. The United Nations Report of 1980 reported that:

“Women constitute half of the world's population, perform nearly two-thirds of its work hours, receive one-tenth of the world's income and own less than one-hundredth of the world's property.”

We are regarded as a piece of meat, a thing, because it seems that society as a whole is okay with us being violated. There cannot be any other way because in the Western Cape alone, between the 2015/16 and 2016/17 financial years, over 7 500 rapes occurred. Between April and December 2016 there were more than 30 000 reported cases of rape throughout the country. Statisticians suggest that a woman is raped every 13 minutes in this country. So what about the many other cases we are not aware of, because they are not being reported?

This year we saw brutal murders in this province, just to name a few: 28-year old Paarl resident Nicola Pienaar was found in a shallow grave, 23-year old Octavia de Bruyn, along with her 2-year old daughter, was murdered in Atlantis and 21-year old student Hannah Cornelius was raped and murdered in Stellenbosh. What were these women worth? Sometimes those who inflict

pain on us are the ones we have given birth to. When a woman takes a decision to have a child, it's momentous, it is like having your heart taken out and watching it growing outside your body. In conclusion, Madam Speaker, our worth is not to be abused, raped and murdered. We ought to be celebrated at every turn.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko, finish please.

Ms L M MASEKO: We have to be identified as the Domestic Goddess's that we are. I thank you.

†AGB LEDE: Mooi!

[HON MEMBERS: Well said!]

The SPEAKER: I see the ANC.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, this Government failed the Hout Bay people of Imizamu Yethu due to DA internal fractions and conflicts. Premier Zille and Mayor de Lille cannot work together in this disastrous area. Five months after massive fires, hundreds of people have no basics like housing, electricity, water and proper sanitation. In this cold they are forbidden to make fire for heating or build a floor on the wet ground.

This is in glaring contrast to the swift DA dealings with the Knysna fires where the Premier and MEC's rushed to be in front of cameras and promised

solutions like speeding up planning permission waiting periods while the people in Hout Bay wait.

The DA wasted time and is slow in implementing solutions. Some started rebuilding dwellings and the people took to the streets last week. One person died, local leaders are threatened, nine people were arrested, four houses torched and my parliamentary constituency office burned down. Violence escalated when the Cape Town Metro Police were withdrawn. The DA's Shadow Mayor, J P Smith, wanted more arrests while MEC Madikizela wanted people removed from their families, work, schools and churches where they have lived for up to twenty seven years. People have lost faith in the DA and its leaders are seen as sell-outs. Now more people suffer worse hardships. Shame on the DA. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. I now see the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, commemorating and solidifying Nelson Mandela's legacy in South Africa is of vital importance since his passing. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: As the father of our nation, the figurehead of our democracy and a global humanitarian giant, we need to make sure that Tata Madiba's vision for South Africa is not forgotten. That is why International

Mandela Day is such an important occasion to remind ourselves of this tremendous man's contribution to our country, South Africa.

In commemorating his sacrifices he made for our freedom, we must keep his legacy alive and part of that legacy is service. International Mandela Day is so important because it brings and binds all of us together to service our people and to make South Africa a better place. International Mandela Day is the embodiment of a South African man who saw that a sense of service and hope in others is the only way to bring South Africa and the world together.

In going out and helping those in need in our communities, we not only connect with South Africans from all walks of life but we instil a bit of hope into our society. The sharing of service is what Madiba's vision was for us and that is what will make us true South Africans. The fact that we are able to serve South Africa and bring hope into our communities is of vital importance and for this reason all of us must ensure we continue to keep Madiba's vision alive, not only on Nelson Mandela Day but as I say, make every day Mandela Day.

The importance of Mandela's legacy is in the simple choices that we make that we see good and better in every person. On Mandela Day we act on his wishes and come together and put our differences aside to help each other regardless of our political or any other affiliation. It is these small acts of kindness that break down the walls that divide us and remind us of what Madiba wanted us to be, a free and united nation. Let us never forget what

Tata Madiba did for our country and may International Mandela Day continue to be a living commemoration of his life and vision for South Africa.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the EFF. Okay. EFF is foregoing. I see the DA.

Mr M MNQASELA (DA): Madam Speaker, the forensic investigation into the financial mismanagement and supply chain irregularities into the Beaufort West Municipality is welcome.

We hope that PricewaterhouseCoopers auditors following status assessment in the municipality by the Provincial Department of Local Government will do a great job, with the necessary speed required and with a high degree of efficiency. Measures such as these provide for the best opportunity to weed out the entrenched culture of corruption and financial mismanagement.

Now, the business of Government can finally commence at the municipality. Beaufort West Municipality is part of the 10 municipalities in the province that were identified as in need of assistance through the Back to Basics Programme.

The following are the pillars of the Back to Basics Programme:

1. Putting people first;
2. Good governance;

3. Basic services;
4. Capacity building;
5. Sound financial management.

The ANC's Truman Prince ignored and resisted all rules of good governance. Under his leadership the ANC ignored every rule under the sun. Councillors often confused separation of powers between administration and politicians.

Public trust in Government had eroded, but thanks to the DA-KDF coalition Government, we are fixing the mess that the ANC has left there. Furthermore, I am pleased by the role and interest taken by the DA Constituency Head, hon Daylin Mitchell, in supporting the DA councillors in the municipality.

Madam Speaker, we are elated that in the end the residents of Beaufort West, Merweville, Murraysburg, Nelspoort and surrounding areas will finally reap the fruits of good governance and taste the real tastes of democracy.

As the DA, along with our coalition partner, the Karoo Democratic Force, we remain committed to our mandate given by the electorate of ensuring that Beaufort West Municipality is free from corruption and that effective governance takes centre stage.

We wish Mayor Japie van der Linde and his team the very best as he takes Beaufort West to new heights. †Siyabaqinisekisa ukuba sizobaxhasa ... As

this Parliament [we pledge to support them.] †Hamba ANC, hamba. [Go ANC, go.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mnqasela. Thank you. I recognise the ANC. Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: This DA does not care for the poor and ordinary people. This is evident in the skewed handling of the Western Cape housing crisis. Do not be cheap, Premier ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms T M DIJANA (DA): The DA-run municipalities regularly do not meet targets, give back millions of rands, meant for poor beneficiaries and Cape Town again did not fully utilise the Urban Settlement Development Grant from National Government.

The DA does not even apologise to the hundreds of thousands of people in need of housing. The DA just does not care. The Tafelberg school site was given to rich people of Cape Town while the poor, working and living in Sea Point, do not have available, affordable or social housing.

Now we see the recent decision to give the Somerset Hospital to wealthy developers to benefit mostly the Green Point rich. This is done while this site was promised to poor people serving the very rich of the Waterfront. When

asked about the Tafelberg school and Somerset Hospital land, the DA Government of the Western Cape, led by hon Premier Helen Zille, deflects attention to the Conradie Hospital site, which still has to get off the ground. Shame on the DA for lying to the poor and not breaking down the apartheid spatial planning divisions. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA. Order please, members. There is a member - order please! Ministers Winde and Grant. Hon members, there is a speaker on the floor. Hon Dijana, can I ... [Interjection.] Ja, no-no, I am talking to the members over there too. I see the hon member Simmers, you may proceed.

Mr T A SIMMERS (DA): Madam Speaker, perhaps the Minister can take her for coffee and they can sort it out. I believe for all in our province, contrary to what the Opposition is saying, the month of July not only commemorates the proud legacy of our caring former president, Nelson Mandela, this month also celebrates the awareness of psychosocial disabilities ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members!

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... and their impact on society. Hon member, I will take you for coffee. Do not worry. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, in South Africa only 25% of people who suffer from any form of mental disability, receive treatment. This is mainly due to people not seeking help, disorders not being adequately identified ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Simmers ...

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... and limited resources available ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I need to just ask you to take your seat. There is too much noise and it is actually difficult for the Table staff to even monitor what's happening. Can I please ask you to compose yourself and allow the member to complete his statement? You may proceed.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. This is mainly due to people not seeking help, disorders not being adequately identified and limited resources available to deal with such disabilities.

Madam Speaker, in the Western Cape a third of our population suffers from common mental disorders, namely anxiety, depression and substance abuse. Current mental illness statistics further indicate that the Eden District area in our province has the highest suicide rate in South Africa. Most of these cases are youth and the second highest rate of drug related crimes provincially.

Keeping the above in mind, I am pleased that the Western Cape Department of Health recently made a decision to improve the treatment of mental illness and counselling services to primary health care institutions where it is needed the most.

I am also pleased that the Department has been making concerted efforts to inform the public of the availability of their improved services, should anyone in the province have mental illness. As a caring Government we now need to call on all sectors of society to support these efforts by educating themselves about psychosocial disabilities. Thank you, Madam Speaker, and perhaps hon member Dugmore can pay the ANC [Inaudible.] because he still owes money. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ACDP. Sorry hon member Olivier, it is the ACDP next.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): So, sit down. Madam Speaker, the overcrowding in our schools put a huge setback on our pupils academically. A newspaper article, on Monday 24 July 2017, highlighted overcrowding in our Western Cape public schools that is affecting the quality of teaching.

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is the MEC next to you ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon Olivier!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Overcrowded classrooms affect not only the learning but also the enjoyment of school and setting them up for failure. So, as we know the Minister and Department cannot control the influx of pupils annually and the budget does not follow them, but we ask that surely something needs to be done to address this ongoing problem that we face

annually. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the ANC.

Mr R T OLIVIER: †Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you, Madam Speaker.] What more can we expect from the DA Government, after the Cabinet met, I am not sure when, and approved the concept Western Cape Provincial School Education Amendment Bill to allow liquor sales and consumption at schools for so-called fundraising.

Will we next find Tik, dagga and buttons on demand at our school tuckshops as a result of this DA misrule? Amidst many social challenges in poor areas and on top of ill-discipline, violence against children or growing killings of children in gang wars our teachers and parents will now have to also deal with this bad model where alcohol will be available on school grounds in the areas where substance abuse already abounds.

The DA just do not care for poor ordinary people as it pressed ahead with its ill-considered alcohol plan despite the many outcries of our communities and experts. Instead of removing shebeens near schools, this DA wants to bring shebeens into the schools and liquor sales on school premises.

Where is the so-called provincial priority: the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-Changer? Is that now out of the window? Young children will soon be shown that alcohol is cool. Children should learn a lot of other things at

school rather than learn to drink alcohol. We call on this DA Government to withdraw and scrap this ill-conceived plan to sell alcohol and consume alcohol on school premises.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. A recent news media revelation ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D JOSEPH... that the National Department of Human Settlements allegedly spent R10 million on flowers and gifts during the 2014/5 financial year is deeply concerning. The fact that the usual expenditure of R400 000 spiked to R10 million, raises questions as to whether this money was used during the ANC to fund the campaign as part of the South Africa's elections.

If so, it was illegal and wasteful expenditure by a Government department at the taxpayers' expense. Political parties do receive money from Government but the funding of political parties cannot come from State departments. When the Department was required to give information, the spokesman indicated that the money was spent on gifts for the Govan Mbeki Awards in the provinces.

We have become accustomed to the ANC's looting of the National Treasury

under president Zuma's leadership and it is clear that the Ministry of Human Settlements is yet another Government department which has been captured by greed and corruption. When R10 million can disappear from a Government department for flowers and gifts you know that the political party in power has a questionable moral compass.

Ms P Z LEKKER You mean the DA!

Mr D JOSPEH: The liberation movement's current leaders are undoing the rainbow nation's dream for a prosperous South Africa. Shame on you, ANC! I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of Members' Statements. We now move to Notices of Motion. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon member Olivier is running ahead of me. You may proceed.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the high teacher-pupil ratio in the DA-run province and the negative impact it has on learning in the poor areas.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of corruption on service delivery in South Africa.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Simmers.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Provincial Youth Development Strategy. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. I see the hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates factors contributing to the steep rates increases in the province, especially in Cape Town's Woodstock and Salt River, which forces owners to sell.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the continuous bail-out of State owned enterprises with guarantees and the impact these bail-outs have on capacity for service delivery.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the spate of evictions in the province as well as the influence of property developers in these evictions as 14 families in Albert Street, Woodstock, were evicted from their homes and an eviction in Joostenbergvlakte was halted last night by the intervention of the SA Human Rights Commissioner, Chris Nissen. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the high number of disabled children on the waiting list to be placed in special schools in the province and the reasons why these vulnerable learners are failed by this DA Government.
I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: †Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you, Madam Speaker.] I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ineffectiveness of the DA preferred neighbourhood watches in the fight against gangs and drug related crimes in the province.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any further notices of motion? I see the hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the failure to fully utilise the Urban Settlement Development Grant by municipalities in the province, especially the City of Cape Town, which never fully took up the budget since its inception, to build the much-needed houses and the effects thereof on communities. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. That concludes Notices of Motion. So, are you – hon member Joseph, do you wish to ... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debate the closure of Wolwekloof in Ceres.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other notices of motion? That concludes Notices of Motion. Sorry, hon member Mitchell, are you for the next one,

Motion without Notice? I see the hon member Mitchell. I need the Table staff to guide me. I see hon member Hinana, hon member Joseph and then hon member Gillion. If the Table staff could assist me. Hon member Mitchell?

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Dankie. Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye aan die familie, vriende en breë gemeenskap van Beaufort-Wes oordra met die tragiese heengaan van Faith Abrahams, Michaela Abrahams, Tracey-Lee Richardson, Wayde Richardson. Die oorledenes het tragies gesterf op Woensdag 19 Julie 2017 op die N1 tussen Laingsburg en Prins Albertweg in 'n kop-aan-kop botsing. Mag hul siele in vrede rus. Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family, friends and wider community of Beaufort West on the tragic death of Faith Abrahams, Michaela Abrahams, Tracey-Lee Richardson, Wayde Richardson. The

deceased died tragically on Wednesday, 19 July 2017 on the N1 between Laingsburg and Prince Albert Road in a head-on collision. May their souls rest in peace. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. I see the hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to Getrude Makhanda (70) who lost her son Lukhangele Makhanda (35), her daughter-in-law Nosimanye Masitha (35) and their four children, Sinovuyo (9), Sisipho (6), Yamkela (4) and Isivile Masitha (2). Her beloved family members lost their lives in a shack fire that started early Saturday in Xhlanga Street in Philippi East. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? I see the hon member Joseph and then I will go to hon member Gillion. Thank you.

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Dankie, agb Speaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis meegevoel betoon aan die familie by name die Draai-familie, met die heengaan van mev Draai wat 29 jaar in diens was van die Departement Gesondheid, waarvan die laaste twee jaar Mev Draai die pos beklee het as matrone in die Riversdal Hospitaal. As lid van die Hospitaalraad is ek terdeë bewus dat die gemeenskap, die hospitaal, sowel as die familie die heengaan vorentoe gaan mis. Ek stel so voor, dankie.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family, namely the Draai family, on the death of Ms Draai who had been in the service of the Department of Health for 29 years, the last two years of which Ms Draai occupied the post of matron in the Riversdal Hospital. As member of the Hospital Board I am thoroughly aware that the community, the hospital, as well as the family will miss her in future. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. I see the hon

member Gillion and then I see hon member Lekker and I will move around.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sends its condolences to the Deputy President Cyril Ramaphosa, family, friends and comrades of our struggle hero and legendary Government communicator, Ronnie Mamoepa who passed away last week.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are none. I see the hon member Lekker. Hon member Lekker, did you have your hand up?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the family and friends of all informal settlement fire victims as the carnage of poor people continues, especially the Phola Park family as well as the Philippi East grandmother who tragically lost a family of six that were killed in yesterday's inferno which razed many dwellings.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No? I see the hon member Gopie and then I see hon member Kivedo and then hon member Mitchell, and I will get to the rest of you. Thank you.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family of veteran jazz guitarist and composer, Errol Dyers who passed on after a long battle with a lung condition.

The SPEAKER: Order please. Are there any objections to the motion? No, I see the – order please, members. Can we just manage ourselves? Member Kivedo, you may proceed.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House mourns the passing on of the music legend, Raymond Phiri, affectionately known as “Bra Ray”. The late Ray captured the imagination, attention and soul of the whole of South Africa as lead singer of his band Stimela, and sends condolences to his loved ones and may his dear soul rest in peace while we cherish his fond memories. Hamba kahle, Bhuti Ray.[Go well, Bra Ray.] [Applause.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections. I see the hon member Mitchell and then I see hon member Max and then hon member Beerwinkel. I am sorry hon member Mackenzie. I will get to you.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the EFF leader, Julius Malema's blatantly racist remarks that the Deputy President does not qualify for South African tenders because he is not black enough and he has done everything in his life to please white people. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections.]
Sorry.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: They support it! [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Order please, hon members. There is an objection. Sorry, there is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Alright. Hold on ... [Interjections.] Could we get some order please? Order please, hon members. Can you compose yourselves? Thank you. I see hon member Beerwinkel and hon member Mackenzie and hon member Max, I will get to you. Thank you. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family of the late Western Cape unionist, Ronald Bernikow, who is hailed by his comrades as the hardworking, selfless and modest leader who was passionate about the cause of the workers. Notes further he died on 26 June 2017 following a long battle with cancer and was laid to rest on Saturday 8 July 2017.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? Can I proceed? I then see, I think it is hon member Mackenzie in fairness and then I will get to hon member Max and hon member Botha and then we will start the next round.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the recent rains in the Western Cape, but we call on the province's residents to continue saving water and we call on the City of Cape Town to continue with its water saving campaign. I move so.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion? I see the

hon member Max.

Mr L H Max: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates 17-year old Breyton Poole for winning the gold medal in the men's high jump competition at the IAAF u/18 World Championship, which recently concluded in Nairobi, Kenya. Poole, who is only 1.72m tall, cleared the bar at an astonishing height of 2.24m. Yes, this young man from Strand, who is currently a grade 11 learner at Paul Roos Gymnasium in Stellenbosch should be greatly lauded for this achievement. Breyton is an inspiration and complete proof of what can be achieved if you work towards your goals.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There – just before I get to hon member Gillion, I do not know if it is hon member Schäfer or hon member Botha, Beverley Schäfer, did you have your hand up too? Okay. Hon member Botha if you could, I know that you are waiting. There is a queuing system So, we will go with hon Schäfer. You may proceed.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Isak Janse from the Department of Agriculture who retires on Monday after 49 years and 10 months of dedicated service. He started his career at the Oudtshoorn research farm as a general farm aid in 1967 at the age of 15 years and ended his career as a Senior Auxiliary Officer for the Research and Technology Development Services Department. Throughout his career Mr Isak Janse has established himself as a dedicated worker with a very high work ethic. His work has always been meticulous, making him a huge asset to the Research team. We thank him for his dedication and wish him well in his retirement. I hereby move. [Applause.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? I see the hon member Botha and then I will proceed to the left of the House.

†Me L J BOTHA: Dankie, agb Speaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye uitspreek teenoor die kinders en ma van Jo-Anne Stevens, 'n gemeenskapsaktivis van Wittewater, wat Sondag oorlede is na 'n kort siekbed. Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the children and mother of Jo-Anne Stevens, a community activist of Wittewater, who died on Sunday after a short illness. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the good deeds of the Smile Foundation, working with Clicks Helping Hands Trust and the Avela Foundation, who assisted 40 young burn victims during this months' Smile Week with reconstruction surgery.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? No? I see the hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the role of Police Minister, Fikile Mbalula in

restoring calm as well as law and order in Imizamo Yethu following days of unrest in Hout Bay, and further notes that after his visit and interaction with community leaders, that a peace deal was made.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is ...
[Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Gopie.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is only because [Inaudible.] burnt plot [Inaudible.] there.

An HON MEMBER: What?

Mr M G E WILEY: They burnt it down!

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, order please, members.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, can I address you please?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Ms D GOPIE: This is the second comment. First it was the Premier. Now it is the Chief Whip of the governing party making a remark as if they love it

when community members burn down a PCO office in Hout Bay. I am very, very upset about that remark.

The SPEAKER: Your point is noted. Sorry, Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: I tell you that, Madam Speaker, the residents of Imizamo Yethu are desperately upset that the Minister could only have to come after an ANC office was burnt.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Order, members! I am not going to entertain a debate. There was a point of order regarding a comment that was made. Chief Whip, you substantiated and responded to the comment, which in terms of a point of order is inappropriate and now I see the hon member Lekker. I really do not want to entertain, but I will afford you the opportunity to raise your point of order. Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In the spirit of ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon members, please do not pre-empt the member's point of order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, in the spirit of uniting the people of the Western Cape, ours, as law-makers is to call for calm. Now, I must say that I find it highly disturbing that a comment of that kind was made by both the

Premier and the Chief Whip of the ANC and does not ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No, it is the DA, hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... by the Chief Whip of the DA as well as the Premier of the House, leaves a lot to be desired. You really do not expect them to make a comment that says, "By the way, they burnt your office". You would expect them to be reasonable and responsible with the statements that they are making.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, thank you. I am not going to entertain.

The Chief Whip responded and hon member Lekker, on your point of order you substantiated. I am going to ask that we leave that and proceed with motions without notice. The hon member Gopie is waiting to render her bit. You may proceed, hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Elsie's River singer Craig Lucas for winning the second season of the competition Voice South Africa. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? I see

the hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deepest condolences to our colleague and fellow member, Maurencia Gillion, who lost her mother as well as three close relatives, the latter passing away on the same day. May she and her loved ones find God's eternal comfort, and those passed on rest in peace while we treasure all their fond memories. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There are no objections. Hon member Dugmore, your hand was up, but if I could address you. Hon member Dijana behind you is first and then I will take you and then I will move to the right of the House.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern and investigates allegations that tenants at De Waal Drive flats are forced to sign new lease agreements that are only valid for three years, and that they were threatened with evictions by the DA Government if they did not sign those agreements. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Dugmore and then I will get to the other side.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the family of slain anti-apartheid activist, comrade Ahmed Timol, who was honoured posthumously at the SACP's 14th Congress by conferring a special recognition award, more than 45 years after his death in detention. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections? I see the hon member Schäfer. There are three hands. Hon member Max and hon member Maseko and then I will get to the other side.

Ms B SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I have another milestone. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr André Roux who our committee often deals with. He is the director of Sustainable Resource Management for the Department of Agriculture, who also retires on Monday after 46

years and 7 months of dedicated service. We commend Mr Roux for the tremendous work and dedication to agriculture in general and the many people he has supported in the Western Cape over the years. We wish Mr Roux all the best in his future endeavours.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? I see the hon member Max and then hon member Maseko. And then I will get to this other side.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Chad le Clos who won the ...
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is your ... [Interjection.]

Mr L H MAX: Le Clos, ja, Le Clos ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, hon member Max ... [Interjection.]

Mr L H MAX: ...who won the men's 200 butterfly gold ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Order, Max!

Mr L H MAX: ... medal at the World Championships ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry. Order, hon member Max ... [Interjection.]

Mr L H MAX: ... on Wednesday, after defeating ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ... could you kindly take your seat please? Sorry. There is only one Speaker, so I appreciate the support. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I rise to teach hon member Max that it must be in writing, not on the phone.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makeleni. The point is taken. Hon member Max, will you indeed continue? [Interjections.] Order please. Hon member Max, will you kindly take your seat please? Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, I would like to alert you to the fact that hon member Max is holding his phone behind the paper and he is going to read it from the phone.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: He needs to write it down.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, I am visually impaired as you will see and I cannot attest to what is happening behind that piece of paper, but you may proceed hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX: But Madam Speaker, technology has increased and we have to make use of technology.

The SPEAKER: The idea though is that you should submit your motion in writing, thank you ... [Interjection.]

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, I have to start again. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Chad le Clos who won the men's 200 m butterfly gold medal at the World Championships on Wednesday, after defeating the home-crowd favourite, Laszlo Cseh, the defending champion, in Budapest. South Africa's Le Clos, the 2012 Olympic Champion clocked 1.53.33 seconds with Hungary's Czech on 0.39 seconds behind, taking the silver and Japan's Daiya Seto earning bronze in 0.88 seconds. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? I see the hon member Maseko and then the hon member Dyantyi, I will get to you. And hon member Dugmore. Guys, I am really having

difficulty with all these hands. Thank you. I do. You may proceed hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sends condolences to the family and friends of Mr Thuli Mathiya, our colleague at the Department of Human Settlements in the Western Cape. May his soul rest in peace. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? I now see the hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the National Treasury has placed the cleaning company, Top Notch, that is contracted by the City of Cape Town on a list of restricted suppliers; notes further that the blacklisted company is still contracted by the City; calls for an investigation into this matter and calls for the immediate termination of this company's contract.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Is that not an objection?

Hon MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: Okay. There are no objections. Hon member Gillion, I – so do you want member Makeleni? Okay. Hon member Makeleni and then the hon member Nkondlo and then I will get back to this side. Thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the allegations that the reason that led to unrest in Imizamo Yethu, and why residents are reluctant to move for the upgrade to continue, is because of MED Madikizela's reckless statement that residents would be moved to Wolwerivier, 30 km away from Cape Town; calls for an investigation into these allegations and condemns the MEC's irresponsible utterances.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon ... [Interjections.] Hon members, you have a speaker on the floor. Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: †Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you, Madam Speaker.] I

move without notice:

That the House welcomes the court ruling on the matter between Viking Inshore Fishing (Pty) Ltd vs the Department of Fisheries and Others, which confirms as correct the programme of State intervention to address market failures, and reverse apartheid structural economy that excludes historically disadvantaged individuals and fishing communities, by confirming as legitimate the decision by DAFF to ensure new entrants in the Hake Inshore Trawl sector are able to utilise their fishing rights granted to them in terms of Section 18 of the MLRA. This is part of the ANC radical socio-economic transformation. Siyaqoba! [Victory!]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is no objection. I now see the hon member Mitchell first and then hon member Maseko.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Bowtime Archery Club for winning the Edna Trimmer Archery competition for the second time in a row...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections? Sorry, hon member Maseko, I see you and then I saw the hon member Dijana. Hon member Olivier, you will be next after hon member Dijana.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates the Robertson based Graham Beck Wine Cellars for winning four awards at the recently held Decanter World Wine Awards. The Cellars, Brut Zero 2011 received a silver award, while the Blanc de Blancs, Cuvee Clive and Brute Rosé, all 2011 wines, received bronze awards. The House further congratulates the cellar for also being awarded the gold trophy at the Vinordic Wine Challenge for its Brut Non-Vintage Champagne. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that wheelchair bound ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Sorry, hon member Beerwinkel and Minister Winde, there is a speaker on the floor. Thank you.

Ms T M DIJANA:

That the House notes with concern that wheelchair bound Margaret van Rooyen (89) has been living in a house with a hole in the roof at Kaneels Court in Ottery since 2014; notes further that Cape Town Municipality has failed to fix her house despite knowing about her ordeal since 2014 and calls for an urgent intervention from the Provincial Government. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No. I see the hon member Olivier and then I will get to hon member Kivedo. Thank you. Hon member Olivier.

†UMnu R T OLIVIER: Enkosi Somlomo. Somlomo, ndiphakamisa ngaphandle kwesaziso:

Ukuba le Ndlu icele uMphathiswa uAngie Motshega ukuba angenelele kulo mbhodamo weli phondo oza kuzisa umthetho wokuthengiswa kotywala ezikolweni, nokuba oku uza ku kwenza ngokuthi aguqule umthetho welizwe wezikolo.

[Isiphakamiso njengoko siphakanyiswe lilungu.]

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House asks Minister Angie Motshega to intervene in the chaos of this province that will introduce a law to sell alcohol in schools, even if she does that by amending the National Schools Act. I so move

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Deputy – thank you, Madam Speaker. I am terribly sorry. My mistake. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its condolences to the family and loved ones of our colleague, Christopher Ferndale, Manager: Public Education and Outreach, whose mother passed on last week. May her dear soul rest in peace.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? Okay, I see the hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the Western Cape High Court ruling which found the Provincial Department of Social Development and local Aunty Dawn Day Care Centre in Pinelands were jointly responsible for the death of 5-month-old baby, Ava Barley, who rolled off a bed and died when she was left unsupervised in 2010; condemns MEC Fritz's appeal to the ruling as another form of delay tactics by this Provincial Government and conveys condolences to the parents.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon members, please, we have had a long day. I see the hon member Dugmore and

then I will get to hon member Mitchell and hon member Gillion.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that more than 560 road deaths, including more than 268 pedestrians, have been reported on Western Cape roads since January this year, and calls once again for urgent measures, including employing more traffic enforcement officials to be deployed to curb this carnage.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Now I need guidance from the House. Who is next? Hon member Gillion and hon member Mitchell, I will get to you directly after hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, hon Max, †ek het ‘n blad in my hand. [I have a page in my hand.]

†Die SPEAKER: Ek sien daardie blad.

[The SPEAKER: I see that page.]

Ms M N GILLION: Yes. I move without notice:

†Dat die Huis die Suid-Afrikaanse span wat aan die IAAF Wêreldkampioenskappe in Londen sal deelneem vanaf 3 tot 14 Augustus 2017, sterkte toewens.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.]

[That the House wishes the South African team that will compete in the IAAF World Championships in London from 3 to 14 August 2017 all the best.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? I see the hon member Mitchell and then I will get to you, hon member Makeleni.

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Dankie Agb Speaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy gelukwensing aan Brian van der Schyff, Arno Barnard en Rynard van der Schyff oordra met hul oorwinning toe hul in die Newbie-afdeling van die Youth Festival Trips Rolbaltoernooi te Oudtshoorn deelgeneem het. Baie geluk aan die Junior Rolbalspan van

Beaufort-Wes Rolbalkklub. Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.]

[Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Brian van der Schyff, Arno Barnard and Rynard van der Schyff on their victory when they participated in the Newbie Division of the Youth Festival Trips Bowls Tournament in Oudtshoorn. Congratulations to the Junior Bowls team of the Beaufort West Bowls Club. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? I see, is it the hon member Maseko and then I will get to hon member Makeleni. No. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls for an urgent intervention to NGO's assisting the poor and vulnerable who have been evicted from community centres in Hanover Park and Bonteheuwel, and condemns the DA for allowing its

factional battles to undermine the work of community organisations as the elderly and youth living with disabilities have been stranded and cannot do their work.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. There is an objection. I have seen hands, hon member Dugmore. So, I am guided by the hands that I see. Anyone else for motions without notice? No-one else. If there are, if we do not have any more then – hon member Schäfer, you are looking at me? No? That then concludes the Motions without Notice.

We now move to the next item on the Order Paper and it is the Draft Resolution in the name of member K E Magaxa.

DRAFT RESOLUTION

That the House has no confidence in the Premier

The SPEAKER: I have been informed that the Leader of the Opposition would not be present today and that hon member Dugmore would take charge of the debate on his behalf. Thank you.

I would just want to get to my speakers' list and first on the speakers' list,

Chief Whip are you – no, you are not.

Mr M G E WILEY: [Inaudible.] waiting with bated breath, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Okay. I see the hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In an open letter to hon Helen Zille, Dr Lucy Graham, a resident of Sea Point, describes the living conditions of three workers from the area. A security guard, a domestic worker and a nursing assistant. Given what has happened in Tafelberg with the DA, under the leadership of hon Zille, it was decided to reject a proposal from their own Department that the former special needs school be used for social housing and instead sell it to the highest bidder.

Dr Graham makes an impassionate plea. She writes, referring to the Premier,

“You, on the other hand, have the power to confront systemic problems. What I cannot understand is why you are not using that power to make things right and I cannot believe that your sense of ethics has really degenerated to such an extent that you do not know what is right anymore. Please do the right thing. Get on board with social housing on the Tafelberg site and seek to maximise the amount of affordable housing that will be built on the Somerset Hospital precinct. In another life, you could have been the low-income worker, living precariously in a basement in a room with your children in Sea Point.”

What is expected of a Premier of any province is to serve its people, to unite them and to do everything in their power to right the injustices of the past and in this case to make every effort to reverse the legacy of apartheid spatial planning.

In essence, the DA under the leadership of hon Zille have trampled on the very victims of colonialism, right here where colonialism started, in Cape Town. And what has now become obvious is that the real deeply held views of the hon Zille have become clear for all of us to see.

In fact, these views have been embraced and entrenched in the way this province is governed. In essence, we have a classic case of conservatism, hiding behind the fig leaf of liberalism. It is a deeply entrenched view that denies structural and systemic poverty, which manifests in race, class and gender oppression.

Instead, we have a patronising, racist and patriarchal mindset, an attitude which pays lip service to our Constitution and its obligation to effect redress and transformation.

On 20 October 1999 hon Zille said in this House, and I quote from Hansard,

“I have been in some portfolio committees and I can see what a drain token representatives are on the public purse. Which women are there because they add real value and which are there to fill ANC quotas?

They take up space here, earn a salary, eat a big lunch and pack in some *padkos* and drive off in a C-class Mercedes Benz.”

Hon Zille has become the very bulwark against transformation. The poster person for allowing racist, sexist and colonialist views to go unchallenged. The result is not only to protect and preserve white privilege and domination of the economy, but to create an environment in which racist acts are not dealt with but rather explained and justified. An environment in which the benefits of colonialism are actually praised, while denying the hurt and brutal oppression that has impacted the lives of millions of Coloured and African people in our province.

It is this toxic environment that hon Zille has fuelled and in truth, encouraged. An alternative to this view is the unifying and transformative vision of the Western Cape as a home for all, as per the wisdom of former ANC president, Albert Luthuli.

The vision of the Freedom Charter, where South Africa belongs to all who live in it – black and white. If we are honest, it served hon Zille and the DA’s narrow, electoral interest to break down this vision and act in ways which promoted the polarisation between historically oppressed communities in our province, between Coloured and African and instilling fear and cynicism into the hearts of many from the white community. If truth be told, Madam Speaker, hon Zille actually did that job for the DA. That is actually her legacy. Not a very proud one, but now for the DA, she has served her

purpose.

We have an untenable situation where the talk on the fifth floor, which for the benefit of the members of the media, is where most of the DA MPL's hang out, is that hon Zille has now become a liability to the DA. It is only the hon Zille herself, who is too thick-skinned to accept that she no longer has supporters, admirers or even friends in the DA [Interjections.] because as much as it is that the ANC is moving this motion of no confidence today and we will get to the reasons, it is an open secret that Mmusi Maimane wants Helen Zille out.

He knows that her apology was not genuine and he knows the damage she is causing to the party he leads, but we have hypocrisy from the DA. They call for members in the National Assembly to vote with their conscience, yet the DA constitution states categorically that any DA public rep who votes against the DA position, faces disciplinary action including expulsion [Interjections.] and here in this legislation ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, kindly address the Chair, please. You are focusing somewhere else. Could you address the Chair? Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And here in this House, Madam Speaker, DA MPL's have had to personally sign a contract with the DA which embeds loyalty to the DA caucus leadership.

As we sit here today the DA itself has lost confidence in hon Zille. She may not participate in party structures, yet she is good enough to remain Premier. The question is, who really is in control of the DA? It is definitely not Mr Maimane or the Acting Provincial Leader, hon Madikizela. As the ANC, we have 10 reasons for believing that the Premier has lost confidence in the people. Here are 6 of those reasons. [Interjections.] Number one ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members.

Mr C M DUGMORE: She has failed to uphold the Constitution of the Western Cape, and by implication the Constitution of the Republic. In fact, she has defied its obligatory provisions to appoint a Children's and an Environmental Commissioner. These are equivalent to Chapter 9 Institutions at a National level.

Secondly, she has failed to uphold a number of laws of our country. To use but one example, I would like to cite the Government Immovable Asset Management Act, which states that when a government disposes of property, it must, not may, consider whether such asset can be used in relation to social development objectives of government and in relation to government socio-economic objectives, including land reform, black economic empowerment, alleviation of poverty, job creation and redistribution of wealth. It is clear that she is in breach and no wonder Minister Sisulu has taken this Government to court.

Thirdly, under the leadership of hon Zille, since 2009 our province has seen an increase in crime, substance abuse and gangsterism. There is hard evidence to this effect, because the DA closed down the Bambinani School Safety Project.

Fourthly, she has broken a promise made in 2009 to appoint this Children's Commissioner. So not only has she defied the Constitution, she has broken the promise to appoint one.

Fifthly, she has abused her office and benefited a family member unduly [Interjections.] in a clear breach of the code of ethics for members of the Provincial Executive Council. She is guilty of nepotism. Evidence provided to the Public Protector by whistle blowers, which we have had sight of, proves this beyond reasonable doubt. The Premier clearly gave preferential treatment to a company, Paper Video, which is co-owned by her son. The Public Protector has formally decided to implement this.

Number 6. Employment equity and transformation have been pushed back in this province since 2009. This has been clouded in the language of "fit for purpose". In reality, the representivity of Coloured and African senior managers in this province has declined under the DA and hon Helen Zille. One cannot have a situation where the Premier has lost support of her own party, but as we have argued here today, more importantly, the Premier has failed to address the fundamental pathologies affecting the people of our province. Take some advice, DA. Hold your conference, [Interjections.]

elect a new provincial leader, because Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order please, members. Order. I need to protect the speaker in fairness. Order ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: The advice is, Madam Speaker, hold your conference, elect a new provincial leader because clearly your acting leader is not an option. In the meantime, give the hon Premier a deadline to resign and exit quietly.

As the ANC, Madam Speaker, we want to work as hard as we can as this Opposition, both with National and Provincial Government to transform and develop our province, but we cannot work with someone who does not even have the confidence of her own party. We cannot work with someone who clearly has lost interest and passion in actually dealing with poverty inequality. There is more information that is coming to light and this will continue to gather momentum for as long as the Premier remains. Not from us, but from within the ranks of the DA. Hon Zille, you need to allow your party and this province to elect another Premier. Please resign and exit with dignity. We need a Premier who feels the cry of the majority and has the will, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... and has the will, Madam Speaker, and I am finishing

off here ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We need a Premier who has the will to confront privilege and the lack of transformation ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, your time has expired.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... boldly, without fear or favour. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Okay. I see, yes you may.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I am sitting here, very disturbed. The DA-caucus has been making a lot of noise and you only once said they must be quiet. If it was the ANC you would have named us.

The SPEAKER: Hon Makeleni ... [Interjection.]

Mr P MAKELENI: I am really disappointed where I am sitting ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I acknowledge your point. I have tried to protect hon member Dugmore by calling the House to order. So, we need to cooperate. I see the Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I follow on the contribution of a blinded, bitter white man, desperate to resuscitate his political career. [Interjections.] Once again this House is being abused by the official Opposition ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley, if you could take your seat. Is it a point of order, hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: It is a point of order. I think the way the Chief Whip, the attitude for the whole day, to refer to a member now as a “bitter, blinded white man”. This is an hon member, just as anyone of us. Madam Speaker, please, please use your powers.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, I have heard your point of order. I cannot respond to the member’s speech, unfortunately. I have noted your comment. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Once again, this House has been abused by the official Opposition for the sake of trying to salvage its tattered reputation and declining fortunes.

The sole reason that they are pulling this stunt is because they feel that certain media will give them airtime and space, no matter ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Mr M G E WILEY: I would like my time protected please.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, this is becoming untenable. I need to, as I protected the hon member Dugmore, I need to protect the speaker on the floor. I require your cooperation please. Chief Whip, you may proceed.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. They feel that certain media will give them airtime and space, no matter their incompetence, incapacity, corruption and worthlessness. The sheer hypocrisy and cynicism of the ANC is summed up by the absence of the sponsor of this debate, the hon Leader of the Opposition.

This is not totally unexpected, as he had nothing to say, as the motion is not only baseless but also absurd given the facts that will be presented by my colleagues in this debate. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: In fact, the ANC's handling of this simple matter has been characterised by ignorance, incompetence and malice. In terms of Rule 153, Madam Speaker, I wish to table an amendment to the motion, which will be debated here today, and it better reflects the truth and excellence of Premier Zille and her Government.

I move that all the words after "that" in the Order Paper be omitted, and

substituted by:

The House has full confidence in the Premier, noting that following achievements of the Provincial Administration under her leadership as Premier since 2009:

1. The continued improvements in governance and financial management evidenced by the dramatic increase in clean audits by all departments and entities, as assessed by the Auditor-General, the Presidential Monitoring Directorate and the CSIR and which places this province head and shoulders above other provinces as well as all national departments.
2. That this province has the lowest unemployment and the highest job creation statistics and best economic growth and investment rates.
3. That this province has the best educational results. Most importantly, the highest university exemption pass rate.
4. Every municipality in the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Chief Whip Wiley, please take your seat. Hon member Tyatyam, and I hear calls around time. The Table staff are recording the time and they have a timer and they would alert me to the time. When hon member Dugmore spoke I allowed him to finish, but the time has not yet expired

according to the Table. Thank you. I do not take the time here. I take my queue from the Table staff. 20 seconds left, Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, very much.

4. Every municipality in the Western Cape has significantly improved their audit reports to the extent that virtually everyone now enjoys a clean bill of health and consequent improved service delivery – the only exceptions being ANC-run municipalities.
5. That the Democratic Alliance continues to increase its political market share at the expense of the ANC routinely winning municipal wards. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, your time has expired.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I so move this amendment. [Time expired.][Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, I would like to caution, we have a speakers' list. There are times allocated on your speakers' list. I am trying to ensure fairness. I cannot cut someone off in the middle of a sentence and I would like to allow the speaker on the floor to complete. So, can we cooperate and the next speaker is the hon Minister Madikizela, who will now be speaking for 10 minutes. The clock starts now, thank you. I see the hon,

the Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, this motion is brought by the ANC on the assumption that our Premier does no longer enjoy the support of this caucus and the citizens of this province - a clear indication of how out of touch with reality the ANC is. [Interjections.]

In fact the advice by the ANC is a clear indication that the Premier of this province continues to play a very important role in the DA and they must use their own advice. [Interjections.]

All indications from various entities and departments have shown that the Western Cape under Helen Zille's leadership has outperformed all other provinces under the ANC in almost all indicators. My colleagues will deal with the specifics in this regard, but I do want to quote the statement that was made by the AG, Kimi Makwetu, who said, and I quote:

“Western Cape Premier Helen Zille's office was the only Premier's office that gave the required level of assurance, which includes management, leadership and oversight.”

An HON MEMBER: Well done!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now this is the statement that

was made after the Departments of the Western Cape and municipalities received clean audits. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Here in this province?

Mr S G TYATYAM: There is no such [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We are also expected, Madam Speaker, to entertain a motion from the Leader of the Opposition who decided not to attend the sitting to discuss his own motion because he has been summoned by the President of the ANC, Zuma, to talk about their factional battles in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] After the... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: After the PEC disbanded the region that the regions disbanded the PEC ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now this is the party... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, kindly take your seat. Chief Whip

Wiley, kindly take your seat. Members, we simply cannot continue with all this howling. There is a respect for the speaker on the floor. You may interject quiet conversation, but you simply cannot drown out the speaker to the extent that we cannot hear the speaker on the floor, so I am now appealing to both sides of the House. I am looking at the DA benches as well as the ANC benches. Afford the members the courtesy of silence when they present. You may interject, you may pose the question, but a running diatribe is unacceptable. I am not going to allow that and I am asking that you now cooperate and that we allow the Minister to continue. You may proceed, Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you Madam Speaker. It is very clear here that we are no longer dealing with a political party but with a circus indeed.

The PREMIER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon member Dugmore raised a number of frivolous issues that go to the heart of the ANC's political hypocrisy and bankruptcy in this province. Now in fact hon member Dugmore should be ashamed to stand up here and talk about racial divisions in the country and in this province when we as the DA are trying to bring people together across the racial lines. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And not only...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is why I am saying you are... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: You are sitting there... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members, cooperate. Hon member Olivier!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And not only about the ANC...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, may I address you. You cannot continue in that way. If you do, I am going to have to revert to invoking the Rules. You simply cannot continue running ongoing interjections. I am speaking to you hon member Olivier. [Interjections.] Thank you, please.

An HON MEMBER: Shush!

The SPEAKER: Members on this side, cooperate as well. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister Madikizela. [Interjections.]

Hon member Olivier, manage yourself and your emotions. You do not have to demean yourself in this way.

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Smyt hom uit!

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Throw him out!]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, the ANC has been driving this racist agenda and made every attempt to divide South Africans along racial lines. A clear sign of a party that has reached its sell-by date. This party is so divided and so confused that even its own members do not know who is leading it in this province. [Interjections.]

Marius Fransman, their former leader who was sacked for alleged sexual harassment; secretary Faiez Jacobs was charged for assaulting a staff member but was acquitted because he belongs to the right faction. [Interjections.] Just yesterday we read about the allegations... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

An HON MEMBER: We are called names!

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, take your seat please. Hon member Dijana, we are hon members in this House, if I may address you. The comment regarding comrades, it is unacceptable. Allow the Minister to speak. We allowed the hon member Dugmore to lead with his introduction. I think it is grossly unfair to now try and howl down the next speaker. Please members,

I need your cooperation. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you Madam Speaker. Just yesterday we read about allegations against the acting Chairperson of this party in this province, and the sponsor of this motion, Khaya Magaxa, that he tried to stab his fellow PEC colleague, Andile Lili. [Interjections.] Now what kind of an organisation is this? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Perhaps we should call it African National Criminals. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. [Interjections.] Sorry Minister Madikizela, hon member Bernard Joseph is having a laugh there. I see you, but hon member Olivier, I think you are distracting your member next to you. If you could kindly compose yourself. I am going to - members, we cannot continue in this way. I am going to have to invoke the Rules.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Can I address you Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I was quiet. I did not even say a word.

The SPEAKER: No-no you were not. I saw your fingers going crazy there.

Mr R T OLIVIER: But what did I do? No Madam Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, please cooperate.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I did not say a word. I was quiet sitting here. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: So you cannot then say I am speaking, please...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Well, then I will apologise if you say you were quiet.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Please, no Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. May we proceed?

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Now there you are talking again. You just said a minute ago you were quiet hon member Olivier, and there you continue.

Mr R T OLIVIER: But you said I must be... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Please compose yourself. Hon member Tyatyam, focus on your phone, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well Madam Speaker, as I said we are not dealing here with a political party. We are dealing with a circus and I think everyone can see that. On this party's website Marius Fransman is still the Western Cape leader, more than a year after he was replaced by the rebel rouser, Khaya Magaxa, who is absent here today.

Ms P MAKELENI: Are you calling him an hon member?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: He has done a very good job, by the way, in killing the SACP in this province and if his record there is anything to go by the ANC is destined to the grave. The truth is the ANC exists in name only in this province and that is why we are not going to take seriously the advice that the hon member is giving us. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But the Premier has already... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The only reason we are entertaining this debate is because we believe in our constitutional

democracy that promotes open debates.

As Les Crane said in his song, “You are the Child of the Universe”:

“Speak your truth quietly and clearly and listen to others, even the dull and ignorant. They too have their story.”

An HON MEMBER: Listen to you also.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I would like to take some time to remind people who Helen Zille is in order to show why this accusation is so ludicrous by the hon member who spoke about Helen here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Besides her record in Government, I would like to quote the two awards that she won last year, Madam Speaker. In the fourth National Batho Pele Excellence Awards last year, the Premier’s Department won the Best Functioning Provincial Department of the Year - a clear indication that this Premier, this province under this Premier is on the right track. [Interjections.]

The second award that she won was the Best Ethical and Professional Department last year again in the fourth National Batho Pele Excellence Awards and these awards, Madam Speaker, these awards are coming from the

National Departments.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. To the Department... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now Madam Speaker, to expose the hypocrisy of the ANC, because the lies have been said so many times, to present this picture that Helen Zille is a racist, perhaps we need to remind people who Helen Zille is because the fact is some of them do not even know who Helen Zille is. Helen Zille started her career as a journalist that fought against injustices of apartheid in the 1970s. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Her exposé of reasons behind the death of Steve Biko should be a clear testimony that she is not what people are saying she is... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. Minister Madikizela, kindly take your seat please.

Mr M G E WILEY: May I address you please, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes Chief Whip Wiley. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, this is a motion of no confidence called by the official Opposition.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: They want to have a debate on this matter but they are doing everything to suppress the debate. The basis of the debate is the character of the Premier. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But you started that, you started... [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Now when the LOGB wants to paint the proper picture of the character of the Premier his ability to do so is being suppressed. [Interjections.] This is absolutely counterproductive and completely against the Rules of this House.

Ms P Z LEKKER: We learn from you!

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip.

Ms P Z LEKKER: We learn from you!

†Mnr R T OLIVIER: Sê vir hom.

[Mr R T OLIVIER: Tell him.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel.

†Mnr R T OLIVIER: Sê vir hom.

[Mr R T OLIVIER: Tell him.]

†'n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, will you afford me the same opportunity you just allowed the Chief Whip also?

The SPEAKER: Yes, I will.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I want to address you on fairness, Deputy Speaker, with respect... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Speaker.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Speaker.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Sorry what did I say?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: You said Deputy Speaker.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I am sorry, Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: She is actually the Speaker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Ah, keep quiet. [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I did apologise. [Interjections.] Sorry Madam Speaker. If you remember, the hon member Dugmore was drowned out from that corner... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Do not talk nonsense. We never did that!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, Minister.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Could you please silence this MEC here. I will be able to tell you even who drowned him out because I sit quietly and I listen. Subsequently the Chief Whip of this House gets up and he demeans this hon member in every possible way, while the debate is about the competence or confidence of the Premier, not... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Premier - the subject for discussion.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The next speaker gets up and derides every possible leader of the ANC. This debate is not about the ANC leaders.

†'n AGB LID: Eina!

[An HON MEMBER: Ouch!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They need to prove to us why they feel that they should have confidence in the Premier... [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: You must prove that...

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...and we want to listen to that. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We are comparing leaders. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, we want to listen. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We want to listen!

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, we want to listen, but we can also not be provoked... [Interjections.]

†'n AGB LID: Sy wil nie ʼn eina... [Onduidelik.]

[An HON MEMBER: She does not want an ouch ... [Onduidelik.]]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...by our leaders being demeaned in response to the...
[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Who is doing that? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Your corrupt leaders!

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: He knows what he said, he knows what he said,
Premier.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Members, could I, there has been an amendment that the Chief Whip would forward and it leads that the House has full confidence in the Premier noting the following achievements of the Provincial Administration. That is the relevance of the debate. In fairness it is about a democratic process. So please members let us cooperate. I see the hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, no, that is not the relevance of the debate.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: The relevance of the debate is what is on the Order Paper.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: That is an amendment. We did not vote on the amendment. We did not express ourselves on the amendment. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, hon member Uys, I hear you but I... [Interjections.] No-no, there is a... [Interjections.] Members, there is relevance to this debate and as far as I can see I am going to allow the relevance in terms of the bigger picture. You made - you presented a motion for discussion. [Interjections.]

Members, order please. There is a topic on the Order Paper that is being debated. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: It is a wide - the debate is now being responded. The statement is being responded to. I cannot verify any speaker who gets up to make a presentation because I am here to guide the House procedurally, not on the merit of what a member is standing and talking to. So I need your cooperation in this regard please. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Not like the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: May I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes you may.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You are absolutely right. You need to control this House in terms of our behaviour but you do have the right Madam Speaker, to control the relevance of what these members are saying, whether it is relevant to the debate or not. That is your right, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely, so can we then agree to disagree that relevance and the freedom of speech allow people - you cannot howl and drown out the speaker if we brought a debate to the table and we want to unpack this debate so I am asking for support from both sides of the House. Please will you cooperate. You may proceed, Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. This is very relevant because we are comparing the Premier here with the leaders of the ANC to show the difference between the quality of the leadership of this Premier, quoting her achievements vis-à-vis what is happening on that side. [Interjections.]

Now Madam Speaker, many ANC leaders, in fact many sober-minded ANC leaders who know Helen, talk glowingly about her and the role that she played during difficult times of this country.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Who is not sober-minded?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: She was part of the people who built Black Sash, an organisation that was started in the 1960s among other things to help freedom fighters who were coming from exile. [Interjections.] People like... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: A number of people, Madam Speaker, who are leaders of the ANC... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! I have just requested support and cooperation from the members. Please contain yourselves. [Interjections.] Hon member Tyatyam, will you afford the Minister to speak please?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you Madam Speaker. A number of ANC leaders at the time seek refuge or were assisted by Helen one way or the other. I can mention a number of those leaders... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: [Inaudible.] did that, we know.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Some of them took refuge at her home at a huge personal risk at the time. [Interjections.] Now to call

Helen all the things that, I mean, what the hon member called her is clear hypocrisy from the side of the ANC and a clear indication that the ANC has nothing left to offer besides to drive the race agenda in this country.

[Interjections.]

Some of these people are with the DA today and some are still with the ANC and feel the great depth of gratitude and respect for Helen, so the point that we want to make here, as other speakers will be speaking after me, is that we have a Premier here who has led this province with distinction. All the indications from Government entities from a number of Government Departments are pointing to those facts.

An HON MEMBER: You had to repeat yourself. There is no... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This province has been performing far better than any other ANC controlled province ...

[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Ticking the boxes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And the indications are there for everyone to see. So this Premier walked the streets of Khayelitsha, Nyanga, Crossroads during difficult times. [Interjections.]

Well you would not know that because you were not there. She championed

the cause of the poor and marginalised more than many of the members here who are howling, who are saying all sorts of things that they are saying about her.

Now I do want to make this point very clear, Madam Speaker, that a number of accusations have been made here about who the Premier of this province is and also there is this assumption that this Premier does no longer enjoy the support of this caucus and the citizens of this province. We want to make it very clear here. We want to make it very, very clear here... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, kindly take your seat. The Chief Whip, is it a point of order Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Is the Minister prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Ah please, sweetheart!

An HON MEMBER: Ooh! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr M G E WILEY: Can he confirm that one of those activists, of the ANC activists that took refuge in Premier Zille's house at the time at great

personal risk was the hon member Cameron Dugmore. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But it is in her book... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, indeed it is true and that is why I keep on talking about the hypocrisy of the ANC and hon member Dugmore... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: People like Dugmore, people like Mcebisi Skwatsha... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...people like Mnyamezeli Booi, people like Basil Kivedo... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: These are the people who can testify to the fact that... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Kindly, kindly... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Everything that has been said about this Premier is indeed not true.

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, thank you, take your seat please. Hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Is the Minister prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Can the Minister confirm that it was the Premier next to him that said: "Colonialism was not that bad..." Can you confirm? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I never said that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The Premier explained this repeatedly in this House and you were part... [Interjections.] ...you were part of the sittings where the Premier explained repeatedly what she said. So I am not going to go into that because she did explain several times what she said in this House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you Minister. Hon member Olivier, you have posed a question, it has been answered. Thank you. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Can the Minister take a question?

The SPEAKER: Sorry Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No.

The SPEAKER: No questions, sorry, and your time has expired.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Do you know who was the mole there? [Interjection.] Do you know who was the mole at that house? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Tyatyam! Sorry. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Skwatsha junior!

The SPEAKER: Sorry, is it a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No-no, I want to - I have a question.

The SPEAKER: The Minister's time has expired and he is not prepared to take a question. Thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I thought you were going to have some time...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: He is not prepared to take a question. Thank you.

[Interjections.] I see the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, today we are debating a motion of no confidence in the Premier. The ACDP cannot support this motion tabled by this corrupt dying ANC. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, I want to ask this question... [Interjections.] I want to ask this question: who is calling this debate, is it the ANC PEC, is it the Dullah Omar region or is it the NEC of the ANC, because there is uncertainty who is in charge of this province. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, just today I heard... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...and this is true, just today I heard...

Mr R D MACKENZIE: We cannot hear a thing!

The SPEAKER: Members, hon member Christians, kindly take your seat. I now need... [Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: My time is my time... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is there. Sorry, hon member Olivier, take your seat. I now need to address the ladies in the back-bench of the ANC. That howling is totally unparliamentary and it is just not dignified for women to behave in a way like that. It is unacceptable. Members, you are drowning the speaker out.

Ms T M DIJANA: There are no women here.

The SPEAKER: Well, honourable members.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, Madam Speaker.

Ms T M DIJANA: No, there are no women here. Can I address you, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please, hon member Dijana. Hon member Gillion is on the floor.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I rise on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms M N GILLION: That please Madam Speaker, you are supposed to set the

example. Do not refer to these ladies at the back. They are also honourable members.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Ms M N GILLION: Please, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, thank you. We must, if we are honourable then we must behave in a manner that is honourable and befitting. We cannot scream and howl and expect that we are going to continue in this way. I am really appealing to every single member in this House. We do not like the answers we hear. I cannot control that. It is my duty to ensure that the dignity and decorum of this House is maintained and howling in the way you do does not lend itself to the dignity and decorum of this House. Unfortunately that is the reality, and hon member Gillion, I apologise if I said women, it is hon members. Now let us behave in a manner that is honourable and befitting of members of Parliament in this debate, please.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I take offence. I really take offence that you, Madam Speaker, refer to hon members, especially women on this side of the House, while you do not make examples of the other side. Member Mackenzie... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: He is not a woman.

Ms M N GILLION: No-no-no-no-no, I am saying I take offence, because you are directed only at women.

The SPEAKER: No.

Ms M N GILLION: While member Mackenzie was jumping up and down, you did not make reference to that.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Jumping up and down?

Ms M N GILLION: Please, Madam Speaker, do not undermine our women leaders this side of the House.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, I have apologised, and I said hon members. Hon member Mackenzie, if you are jumping up and down, kindly take your seat please, but we simply - I do not have eyes to see every single member in the House. Unfortunately, I am one Speaker focussing on where the noise is coming from and if the howling is untenable I need to address it, so I apologise, hon members, may we now proceed. You may proceed, hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, if this was an important debate for the Leader of the Opposition I cannot understand that the NEC called him in.

They could only call him in for his incompetence. That is what I believe, incompetence, but let me say this, even the ANC this side is divided on this vote of no confidence and maybe we must offer a secret ballot then we will see the further division within the ANC, I am sure, but let us come back to the point.

The point is why are we here and if we can remember correctly it was her Tweet and the Premier has in this House and publicly apologised and we as the ACDP said we must forgive and move on. I cannot understand that the ANC does not have a role to play in South African politics any more and that is why they come with frivolous motions like this. I thank you.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Christians. [Applause.] Thank you hon members. I now see the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you Madam Speaker.

I would like to thank the ANC for putting forth this motion as it gives us the exact opportunity to highlight these successes and our successes in the Western Cape, because you see, Madam Speaker, the capable state that we are building here represents hope for South Africans in a time when a corrupt ANC nationally is causing so much despair.

Under Premier Helen Zille's leadership we are modernising and reforming

governance to grow our economy, create jobs for our residents and make sure that young people especially are ready for the global digital revolution.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: We have the country's lowest unemployment rate as being stated, and also the lowest rural unemployment. This is because unlike President Zuma and his confederation of Ministries we have an economic strategy that works. Under Premier Zille we have policy certainty backed by a capable state and if we look at Premier's Government and its achievements of the past seven years it becomes very clear that the ANC's notion that she be removed is utterly laughable. In fact it is totally ludicrous. Why? Because Madam Speaker, this DA-led administration is one of a growing number that is showing the ANC up in service delivery, at local and provincial level all over South Africa.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Will she stay here until 2019... [Inaudible.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Western Cape residents have zero confidence in the ANC. Voters have been clear about this in the ballot box in Cape Town in 2011, ever since Helen Zille was elected Mayor.

In 2019 we will ask voters for two votes in the Western Cape, one in the provincial ballot so that we can continue building the capable state of the Western Cape and another vote on the national ballot so that we can fix the

absolute mess in departments under National Government control.

[Applause.]

We will start by properly resourcing the police in the Western Cape so they better combat the gangsterism and drugs in our communities. The prevalence of gangsterism and gang-related violence in the Western Cape can be directly attributed to the ANC's failure to implement a sound police force in the province and deploy specialised units to investigate these crimes. Calls for more resources continue to fall on the ANCs deaf ears.

The National Ministry of Police plans to cut our police force by 3000 officers over the next two years, despite an increase in the Ministry's national budget. Already 75% of Cape Town's police stations are operating below the average national capacity in terms of crime-fighting personnel. It is a travesty that our national justice system only convicts a pathetic 3% of gang-related murders in the Western Cape.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Skande!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Disgrace!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Adding to this, gangsterism which has now spread to our small scale fishing communities, fuelling the poaching of abalone and rock-lobster along our shores, continues unabated. This is because the National Department has zero water-wings, Madam Speaker, zero water-wings to monitor and protect our marine reserves.

We also need to fix our trains that the ANC is totally incapable of managing to the benefit of the poor and the working class in Cape Town. Metro Rail, the backbone of the City of Cape Town public transport system is a dysfunctional mess where trains are continually down and known to abandon commuters for hours on end. A direct consequence of this national service failure is that this province loses billions of rands due to the almost 700 000 daily commuters who are left destitute and unable to reach their place of work.

Our economy is damaged each and every day because National Government cannot even ensure that a train leaves the platform, never mind arrive on time.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is how pathetic they are.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Then again when PRASA wastes R3.5 billion on new trains which do not even fit our railway lines it begs the question as to how competent our National Government officials really are. Indeed they are far too busy signing cheques for the Guptas than bothering to consider the needs of our province.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: So let us ask the question: how many Gautrain systems

could have been built in Cape Town with all the money the Guptas have looted from State-owned enterprises?

Madam Speaker, at least four or more. The people of Cape Town will remember this when a train runs late yet again in this City.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: And Operation Phakisa, a complete mess on all levels. We will need to transform the small boat harbours currently in total disrepair, yet the engines of coastal town economies, to the management of our municipalities. This is where the Constitution says they belong. [Interjections.] Between dilapidated coastal infrastructure and flawed fishing quotas small scale fishermen are disempowered from relying on our oceans to make a sustainable living as a result of the ANC.

The DA will implement a fair and effective rights-process that will support small scale fishermen along our coastline, and it is no secret that this is the only Government, this Government in South Africa, that spends 100% of its housing budget and receives a clean audit, and when the DA moves into the Union Buildings we will release the underutilised National Government properties in this city. These five massive state-owned plots of land - Culemborg, Ysterplaat, Wingfield, Youngsfield and Denel can be used for the immense need for housing. Why? Because where the Premier and her Government wants to build human settlements for our people, the ANC's

National Government continues to block us, and another example of a well-run Government and effective Premier is land reform in the Western Cape.

We are closing in on a 70% success rate for land reform because of the professional support we provide to emerging farmers here in this Province. We rally both public and private sector support to give these farmers access to market and mentorship. This is what the National Development Plan says, but the Cape ANC is incapable of following it.

It is only in the Western Cape that you will find fully functioning District Plan Committees which help to transfer land to reform beneficiaries, but we will take this one step further, Madam Speaker, after 2019. We will change the national policy which disallows land reform farmers from getting land ownership. How can they invest in infrastructure when the ANC condemns emerging farmers to permanent leases of land?

The Premier has continually stated that owning land is the only incentive for farmers to invest in it and adding to the country's agricultural sector, yet national policy disallows it. Successful emerging farmers with a proven track record can and must get title to the land. This is a change the DA will bring...

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...and the DA-led Western Cape succeeds despite

National Government's failures in the Western Cape. The ANC on the one hand fails to provide us with police and protection service, fails to maintain our harbours and coastal infrastructure, fails to implement a functional train system, fails to allow the province to provide housing by releasing state-owned land, and fails to amend a draconian land reform policy which withholds land and title from our people.

If anything, Mr Deputy Speaker, this debate proves without doubt that the only motion of no confidence in this House is in the ANC and its diseased, corrupted and utterly useless national ministries. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Absolutely!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, the hon member Dyantyi. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Mnr R T OLIVIER: Gooi kole!

[Mr R T OLIVIER: Throw coals!]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Maybe just before I start... [Interjection.]

†Mnr R T OLIVIER: Ja, vertel hulle.

[Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes, tell them.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...I must make the point that no amount of amendments will clean what has been done, will brush away the legacies that we must talk about here today. You can vote today at the end... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You are wasting your time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...but no amount of that will take this away. Today is about the legacy of Helen Zille, the leader that was and the Premier that was, and I must start, because I am speaking about legacies, to give credit where it is due.

During the last ten years of apartheid, 1984 - 1994, we emerged at the head of a very broad front of political formations opposed to apartheid, tiny groups of white descendants such as the Black Sash and End Conscription Campaign. To her credit, unlike the Chairperson of her party, James Selfe and its former leader Tony Leon, both of whom bore arms as defenders of apartheid, Premier Helen Zille affiliated to the End Conscription Campaign... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: A vote of confidence!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...to save young men from becoming cannon fodders in pursuance of Vorster and Botha's brain policies.

Mr D JOSEPH: A vote of confidence!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: As a member of the Black Sash, she was also associated with the advice offices that tried to mitigate the worst aspects of apartheid.

Mr D JOSEPH: A vote of confidence!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is also a matter of record as Madikizela was raising it, that she also gave refuge to fighters from the ANC and SACP. Maybe she must also tell us in her own words how she also helped with the security branch offices. [Interjection.] Let me leave it there, but if ever there was a political judgment that betrayed where the Premier of this province stands, it was her Tweet on colonialism. From where I stand, where we stand as Africans and black South Africans, there is very little to commend colonialism and the conquest of our continent by foreign powers emanating from Europe. That is a sentiment shared by many others including thousands of Europeans from the very countries that at one time raped our continent and of course many sitting on that side except a few.

Africans, black white or brown and those from Europe and the Americas who stand and have stood in solidarity with the victims of colonialism could not discover any redeeming features in colonialism. Colonialism always entailed military aggression. It meant foreign domination sustained by racism and racial bigotry. Those who identify with and have always associated

themselves with victims of colonialism will condemn it without reservations. Attempts to discover one or other feature that mitigates the horrors visited on the colonies by foreign powers tell us that the author feels closer to the perpetrators than to the injured parties, so in this case Madam Zille, the Premier that was, you are very far from the victims of colonialism and apartheid. You are closer to oppressors of our people. You are closer to those who maimed our beloved brothers and sisters, our freedom fighters. [Interjections.] You are very, very, very close to oppressors... [Interjection.]

†'n AGB LID: Sies!

[An HON MEMBER: Sis!]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...as you sit there.

The PREMIER: Who?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can dance with them, you can sing with them, you can appoint them in Cabinet, you can recruit them to the DA. Your colonialism Tweet unmasks everything about you as you sit there. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: One trillion Tweets!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: To rub salt into the wounds of those injured by colonialism domination the white liberal often wants to convince the

oppressed majority that are indeed commendable aspects to colonialism and that those who dispute that assertion to use your phrase, are racial nationalists.

An HON MEMBER: So they do not vote for you.

Mnr S G TYATYAM: †Sies, [Sis,] and you still want to be the Premier.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: As Steve Biko and his colleagues suspected, the explanation for white liberal obsession for political foothold amongst the oppressed... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Your President has done far worse.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...was to constrain rather than advance the struggle of the oppressed. Its purpose was to challenge the struggle in directions that would not undermine the interest of the white minority. Lindiwe Mazibuko and others would by now have experienced that from the DA and from yourself, Premier.

On this side of the House we will always recognise the roll Helen Zille played in the struggle against apartheid. We will never hide that. It is a far better record than that of the active and passive supporters of that oppressive system. It is immeasurably better than that of those who refer to Africans as

monkeys. I will not talk about the refugees. You will talk about it yourself, but there will always be a crucial distinction between herself and us on this side. She fought and opposed apartheid, and listen to this, listen to this: she fought and opposed apartheid, which was but one of the many systems of white domination.

On this side our struggle was to overthrow colonialism and white colonialism and white supremacy. Maybe that is why she is able to make that Tweet, so please give it to her. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is a project went wrong... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That important difference also explains why we view April 27, 1994, so differently from her, because from her perspective 1994 represented an end of an era during which people like herself enjoyed unending rewards by virtue of their race... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: And the one behind... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: For us it was a start, it was only a start of a journey of liberation. [Interjections.] That is the difference. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But you have become the worse oppressors now. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Your Government are the worst... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Unfortunately political democracy has not seriously tampered with the architecture of privilege and disadvantages.

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is true.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: White males still dominate every facet of the South African economy. Statistics indicate that poverty in our country is still racialised and highly gendered with African women the worst affected.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Exactly!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: What are we debating now?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Every deficit, every unrealised democratic objective has its source in the colonial system. "The system..." she says "...was not that bad."

The PREMIER: I did not say that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: “The system...” she Tweeted “...was not that bad or else the system...” she said “...there were some good things in it.” [Interjections.]
Can I be protected, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I will protect you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... because I am on the floor.

The PREMIER: It is a lie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue. Order!

The PREMIER: It is a lie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Premier.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let me continue with the lie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Premier, that is not parliamentary.
You must withdraw that please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And apologise.

The PREMIER: It is absolutely not the truth. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You did ask her to withdraw. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I asked her. She did withdraw. You can continue.

Ms T M DIJANA: She did not, she did not.

Ms P Z LEKKER: She made another statement.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please continue.

Ms M N GILLION: She did not withdraw.

An HON MEMBER: Mr Deputy Speaker...

An HON MEMBER: She must withdraw that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! The Premier, Premier, can I ask you again, you did not actually withdraw?

Ms M N GILLION: She did not withdraw.

The PREMIER: I said that I withdrew, I will withdraw that it is a lie, but I will also say that what he is saying that I said about colonialism is not the truth. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Premier.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is still my time. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Premier did withdraw, but the Premier went one step further and actually motivated which is not really allowed so I want the Premier not to go further than that.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The PREMIER: It is not the truth.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue hon member Dyantyi.

An HON MEMBER: We are not asking you. We are telling you to withdraw.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: As the ANC renews and rises the DA is nearing its implosion.

An HON MEMBER: Really!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are increasingly becoming a liability to the DA.
[Interjections.] You were given a purpose to serve. Your purpose was to allow the DA to reach an electoral performance ceiling. You served that purpose.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon member Dyantyi. Your time has been taken up there. Is it a point of order or a question?

†'n AGB LID: Dankie tog!

[An HON MEMBER: Thank goodness!]

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, two hours ago...

†'n AGB LID: Sa!

[An HON MEMBER: Take him!]

†Me M N GILLION: Hier is nie honde nie man!

[Ms M N GILLION: There are no dogs here, man!]

Ms P Z LEKKER: ...I was told to withdraw unconditionally.

†Me M N GILLION: Hier is nie honde nie.

[Ms M N GILLION: There are no dogs here.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Now I find it very much disturbing that in the very same House the Premier will withdraw with a condition, Mr Deputy Speaker. I want this House to be consistent in terms of applying its rule and allow Madam Premier to withdraw unconditionally.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes thank you. You are quite correct. You remind me of that incident. Madam Premier, I did ask her to withdraw unconditionally and I will ask you the same now to withdraw that remark of the lie unconditionally.

Ms P MAKELENI: And leave the statement alone.

An HON MEMBER: Do not explain this.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, may I address you on the point?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr B D JOSEPH: You will be dismissed.

The PREMIER: The points that you are making here in this very serious debate, are based on fundamental misrepresentations and distortions... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can I address you, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The PREMIER: It is incredibly important... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! We are busy with a point of order, just one second. Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: It is incredibly important that that is established because that may not be done repeatedly. It does reflect something that is fundamentally untrue and unjust... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Is that an apology now, a withdrawal?

An HON MEMBER: It is different rules for... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ...by saying that it is not the truth, I withdraw the fact that I said it is a lie. Unconditionally.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can I address you, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I want us to continue. The Premier now withdrew.

Ms P Z LEKKER: We are going to continue, Mr Deputy Speaker, but I would like to address you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: No, that is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it the same point of order?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may now.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to request the House to be consistent that there be no special rules for certain individuals in the House and at the moment I feel that there are special rules that are created specifically to feed the purpose of what the Premier is doing, which

is unacceptable. We cannot be held at ransom.

The second part, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that of allowing an order on top of another order. I would like you to be consistent and apply the Rules of this House in a proper manner. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, on the second point, while the Premier was busy with the point of order you rose to raise another point of order and that is not allowed. You must first continue with the one point of order, finish it off and then you can see a second person for the further point of order. So the Premier has now withdrawn that statement unconditionally and I want hon member Dyantyi to continue his speech. He has got seconds left now for his speech.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] I therefore want to end by making the point that the DA is interested, and Premier Helen Zille, and wants the votes of the victims of colonialism, but rejects them once they are voted in. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, is that it from you?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Is that it?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not done. I am still finishing.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: But your time is finished.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You are so desperate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This episode casts an unflattering light on the tensions in the DA politics, a party that thinks it can represent the victims of colonialism but cannot completely dissociate itself from its perpetrators. That is who you are. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: That is totally irrelevant. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mngasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me appreciate this opportunity and thank hon member Magaxa for sponsoring this debate, in absentia. [Interjections.] What becomes a symbol of a divided ANC is when one speaker rises and says something totally different... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: To the other one.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...to the next one that follows. [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What?

Mr M MNQASELA: And they both come from what is supposed to be the same organisation... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And the same faction.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and in fact a same faction.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr M MNQASELA: So there are even factions within factions. [Interjections.] The other one says Helen Zille is racist. The other one says Helen Zille is a wonderful person. Now what I like is what hon member Dyantyi said, that Helen Zille is a wonderful person. Thank you very much for saying that.

Ms P MAKELENI: And that is why you are going to lose...

Mr M MNQASELA: No wonder you come from Khayelitsha because you know, Helen Zille worked in Khayelitsha. [Interjections.] What is important here is that you can differ with Helen Zille and call her many names and I have differed with Helen in the past and I have called her many names, but one thing that you cannot call Helen Zille is to call her a racist. It is a fundamental flaw on the part of hon member Dugmore, because I will never call hon member Dugmore a racist either... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Because he is not.

Mr M MNQASELA: Because I know his political credentials. So let us not come with cheap politicking here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, on June 22 this year *Biz News*, which is an online media platform had the following headline:

“DA-run Western Cape municipalities streak ahead with 80% clean audits.”

An HON MEMBER: We will come back to that topic.

Mr M MNQASELA: The journalist who wrote this piece, Gareth Van Zyl, goes on to say:

“When it comes to local governance, one party seems to get it more right than any other in South Africa, the DA.”

An HON MEMBER: Ja, but that is not the ANC.

Mr M MNQASELA: We all know by now that this article is referring to the Auditor-General’s report which also mentions that the next best performing province, which is KZN, the next that follows from the 80% it is a sheer

18%, 18% that comes after us.

An HON MEMBER: What?

Mr M MNQASELA: Then you tell me that a Premier that presides over such successes deserves to go and that you have no confidence in that Premier? Perhaps let me tell you something: you know in 2009 the DA received 51% of the vote. That is the first time we governed in this province.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We gave it to you, nè.

Mr M MNQASELA: The ANC to the contrary received just above 30%. [Interjections.] Now I am trying to teach you basic arithmetic. You do not need a calculator for this one. That means that time for every ten people, five of them, just above five, voted for the DA and for every ten just above three voted for the ANC.

Now let us continue. In 2014 the Western Cape voters gave a resounding support behind the Democratic Alliance, saying that the same Premier must continue to service the people of this province, the same Premier. [Interjections.] ...because unlike the ANC the DA when we go to elections we put our Premier candidates up as we do with Mayoral candidates. They knew they were voting for Helen Zille as Premier in 2014.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear.

Mr M MNQASELA: They gave the DA almost 60%. That is for every ten people that voted six of them voted for the Democratic Alliance.

An HON MEMBER: We know you were not voting for them.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hear-hear.

Mr M MNQASELA: What did they give the ANC? They gave the ANC about 20-odd percent... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: And the Guptas.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...that meant that over - for every ten people just over two people voted for the ANC. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Can you calculate? Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M MNQASELA: So the reality here - no, we are talking about the no-confidence. You are saying the people of this province have no confidence in the Premier. In fact you are wasting time. You do not have confidence in the Premier because she continues to beat you in every election and †jaag

[chases] you in every election. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: And you do not have what it takes ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Now I need to say... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just speak through the Chair please, hon member Mngqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: I need to say, Mr Deputy Speaker, †Qina Nontsapho qina! [Be strong Nontsapho, be strong!]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Siyabulela Nontsapho ngokuqinisekisa ukuba oko waphatha urhulumente wakho walapha eNtshona Koloni, iDA ekhokhelwe nguwe apha njengeNkulumbuso, ubeke abantu kuqala. Yaye iinkonzo oza nazo kukuqinisekisa ukuba siphucula ubomi babantu kuqala. Loo nto ke siyafuna ukuyibulela kakhulu ngoba siyayayzi ukuba ayikho nale nto yenziwayo phaya, ngabantu nje abafane besenza ingxolo nje njengenkonkxa engenanto, ngoba abananto iyenye ngaphandle kokugxeka nje. Kuyagxekwa nje, kuyagxekwa, ngoba kaloku ngamaqothaqikili, oosiswana sibomvana, amaqungequ izinto ezingasoze zikwazi ukuncoma, kanti kuyafuneka ukuba ukwazi ukuncoma, ungagxeki nje. Siyabulela ke. Siyabulela.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Mr M MNQASELA: We thank you Nontsapho for ensuring that ever since you led your government here in the Western Cape, the DA that is led by you here as the Premier, you have put the people first. And the services you bring are to make sure that we improve people's lives first. We want to say thank you very much for that because we know that what is being done there is just nonsense. It is just people who make noise like an empty tin, because they have nothing else, except to criticise. They only criticise and criticise, because they are hypocrites who will never learn to give credit, and you must know to give credit, not only criticise all the time. We thank you then. We thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member, your time has expired, unfortunately.

Mr M MNQASELA: †Siyabulela. [Thank you.] thank you very much. Siyabulela. [Thank you.] [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Bernard Joseph.

An HON MEMBER: Cadre leadership. [Interjections.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The EFF were not

surprised at the utterances of the Premier, Helen Zille, that colonialism was not bad.

The PREMIER: I did not say that. [Laughter.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: In fact, we respect her for finally bringing to the fore the true core beliefs of white liberals in the DA... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Repeat exactly what she said?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr B D JOSEPH: ...that we as the oppressed should thank our oppressors for the murder, rape and theft of our country and its people for the genocide against the San-people; for the wholesale theft of our land and its mineral resources; for the indignity and suffering of the Group Areas Act and the crime of apartheid for dehumanising generations of black South Africans. This is white supremacy at its best.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes.

Mr B D JOSEPH: As our very vocal leader puts it: "Ours is the only country where a revolution has taken place and nothing material has changed."

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Failures of the ANC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Well, we are not sure that we agree there. [Interjections.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: Whites kept their stolen land and wealth and it is very true of the matter, those whites with their stolen land, stolen wealth, feel superior precisely because they gained twice, first as thieves and now as protected citizens of our Constitution. Put in another way, listen, put in another way, they stole the land and its wealth and give us a Bible in return.

Now post-1994 they kept this stolen wealth and get all their rights protected, including the stolen property. Only now it is termed “private property” under the Constitution. Why should they not feel superior when the South Africa under the ANC regime legitimised their stolen wealth with the protection of the private clause in the Constitution?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Member your time has expired.

Mr B D JOSEPH: No-no-no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow you one...

Mr B D JOSEPH: No-no, check on the programme what is my time. No.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Four minutes.

HON MEMBERS: Four minutes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you have... [Interjections.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: Yes. I have not even spoken two minutes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! There is some confusion, is it two, Chief Whip? [Interjections.] Is it two minutes or four minutes?

HON MEMBERS: Four, four.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Four minutes?

Mr M G E WILEY: Two minutes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Two minutes? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Four, four minutes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I will allow the member some injury time.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is two minutes. What does it say? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please, order.

Mr B D JOSEPH: The ANC regime legitimised their stolen wealth through the protection of the private property clause in the Constitution. The Constitution of CODESA laundered trillions of rands illegitimately acquired into clean money. Imagine negotiating with an armed robber about which part of your wallet you can get back. I should imagine only your ID document and your driver's licence, not the cash, credit cards or jewellery. That in essence is what we as black South Africans received at CODESA, negotiated robbery.

†Daar sal geen sukses wees om te vra vir 'n stem van wantroue in die Premier nie. Dit sal op die Premier se gewete rus om 'n besluit te maak oor haar toekoms as Premier. Die EFF keur die tipe sêgoed in die Tweets heeltemal af.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[There will be no success to ask for a vote of no confidence in the Premier. It will be on the Premier's conscience to make a decision on the future of herself as Premier. The EFF totally disapproves of the type of opinions in the Tweets.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi, gooi kole! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw, throw coals! [Interjections.]]

†Mnr B JOSEPH: Die ANC is korrup tot die been en derhalwe kan ons hulle nie ondersteun nie.

[Mr B D JOSEPH: The ANC is corrupt to the bone and therefore we cannot support them.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! Order! Allow the member the time. [Interjections.]

†Mnr B JOSEPH: Die ANC is korrup tot die been en derhalwe kan ons hulle nie ondersteun nie. Die President, Zuma, moet val. EFF gaan buite stemming bly as dit tot so 'n punt moet kom. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr B JOSEPH: The ANC is corrupt to the bone and therefore we cannot support them. The President, Zuma, must fall. EFF will abstain from voting if it comes to that point. [Interjections.]]

The public opinion will judge the Premier and the DA. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Joseph. Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. In a constitutional democracy a vote of no confidence is a very, very serious tool that should be

taken very seriously by every single member of this House, of our other Legislatures and our National Government or our National Legislature as well, and quite frankly today has been proof that this ANC has treated the seriousness of this motion, the seriousness of our constitutional democracy as an absolute joke.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They treat this motion the same way that they treat the rest of South Africa as a joke.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They have failed dismally in running this country. They have actually run it to the edge of the precipice where this country...
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We liberated you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...is in deep, deep trouble and today they bring a motion of no confidence in this Government and I will show you why it is such a joke, but before I get to the supposed substance of this motion of no confidence, which

was brought by the Leader of the Opposition. The first joke: he is not even here. One wonders where he is. Is he in Saxonwold receiving new instructions? [Interjections.] But then of course the ANC chooses to have two powerful speakers in this debate. I will deal first with the second powerful speaker, who never gave one reason, not one around why a government should fall in this province, not one reason why there is no substantial basis of putting a motion of no confidence in this Premier; not one. He actually spent half of his speech praising the Premier and the role that she played and then he spent the rest of the time fiddling around in politics. There was not one iota of a reason that he put on the table. [Interjections.]

So let us get to the hon member Dugmore, who started off his speech saying: "I am going to bring ten reasons..." and then he got to six and about a half and then ran out of steam, but when he started with his ten reasons my colleague next to me and my bench-mate, the hon Minister Grant and I were wondering whether Bell Pottinger had written his speech. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I wanted to ask.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And he wanted to ask that question and I thought maybe not, but then in one of his reasons he started drifting down some path of polarisation of community and that really landed it in exactly where Bell Pottinger is advising the ANC on where to push this country to that absolute precipice. The ANC should hang their heads in absolute shame in even contemplating

putting that kind of discussion on the table in this House, but let us talk about the points that the hon member Dugmore raises.

The first substantive point on why there should be a motion of no confidence in the Premier and this Government is one around the Constitution. Now he has brought this point *ad nauseam* to this House and it is the Children's Commissioner.

Now he himself knows that there is a process in that regard but he never ever stands up to say that he - that member sat on this side of the House, in power in this province with the ability to implement that part of the Constitution, and he did nothing about it. Not only him, the member that spoke again in this debate said exactly the same thing.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: [Onduidelik.] Wag 'n bietjie... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] Wait a minute... [Interjections.]]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And the other member, there are three members sitting in this House that could have implemented that part of the Constitution. They did nothing. Zero. So that is very rich in bringing the Constitution as a mechanism.

In actual fact we should be having a debate on the Constitution and the abuse of the Constitution that happens at National Government where we actually

have a President going to Court to try and reverse out of him abusing the Constitution. [Applause.]

We have got the hon member Dugmore using the Constitution when in actual fact we will be bringing to this House an adjustment in the budget where we have to put money into a space that we have no constitutional mandate. As the Department of Water Affairs, we are in the midst of a drought and they are not able to do their maintenance and do their jobs so that we get sufficient water to keep the economy going in this region. They failed dismally when it comes to the Constitution. So it is absolutely rich of him bringing that as a reason here and he himself has proved that he has failed in that space.

The second one was disposal of property and he says “breaking the law.” So obviously in this case dealing with that property he first of all cannot read because the documentation that is out there in the public domain shows that the law has been followed to a T.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is Tafelberg.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: To a T at Tafelberg and he must go and read and he must listen because that question has been answered so many times in this House, he cannot read, so the second reason that he brings to this House is frivolous; got no substance.

The third one he talks about the Constitution again and he brings it around crime. He must understand that the Constitution - the very Constitution itself says that the South African Police Services which rests squarely in the ANC's ambit and they are failing dismally in that space once more.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So he comes with Bambanani. I mean, really, this is absolutely ridiculous. This is supposedly now the third point that he is bringing here in a motion of no confidence. [Interjections.]

We get to the fourth one, which he gets back to the Constitutional Court, a fourth time, again the Children's Commissioner. I will again revert to constitutional mandates, whether it is SAPS or Water or whatever else, failing dismally from the ANC.

The fifth one he talks about nepotism and I almost picked up one of these Gupta leaks documents but I have decided not to, because that does highlight massive nepotism in our country, but let us talk about the point that he is trying to raise here.

He is raising a point around someone in this province who is a maths teacher. This person works for this Government. This person has a massive passion on

trying to make a difference to specifically the poorest of the poor in this province, specifically the poorest of the poor. This math teacher elects to go - he could have done anything in his life that he wanted to but he elects to go to Khayelitsha to go and teach young people maths and does so hugely successfully. He looks at finding opportunities to take this to a new level. Not often found in poor communities in our country this very maths teacher wants to use school premises in a government that he works for; he wants to use equipment and mechanisms inside that government for which he works, free of charge. During a school holiday he takes three schools worth of pupils and puts them through maths tuition free of charge. In actual fact more so than that he takes money out of his own pocket and supplies them ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Who does not do that? We all do that.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...with stationery, with DVDs, with a whole lot of extra products ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is nothing new.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...to help them with getting to where they need to be, free of charge, and this hon member brings that as a potential reason. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You will not justify the...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: He must actually get his facts straight. [Interjections.] He must get his facts straight if he would like to bring that as a mechanism for a motion of no confidence. [Interjections.]

He talks about EE and that has been answered *ad nauseam* in this province again and we have continually won awards; the Premier's Department continually winning awards, showing best performance.

Seven, he starts talking about political issues and in actual facts starts attacking the hon Minister Madikizela as a reason why there should be a no-confidence in the Premier. He loses his track at number 7 and I am not sure what happened after that because he said he was bringing ten items to this debate. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He has got the last word...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So quite frankly the rest of the debate you have heard from speakers on this side of the House talking about Government excellence, award after award given by this National Government to this province on best performance. This province set itself a goal on being one of the best run regional governments in the world and has attained that. Absolutely. We have lots of work to do and the voters will continually support us and putting us

back into position to continually do what we do because we do it so well.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And we do it in such a way that it actually showcases this joke that this ANC Government has become.

I, today in my own very Department, had the opportunity of showcasing the tourism numbers as a mid-term report in Project Khulisa.

In a country run by the ANC with junk status or some investment status; in a country where corruption has become our brand; in a country where we really battle to get .4% growth in our system. We could stand up today in our press conference and show that in Tourism International Arrivals where we are trying to get point .4% growth we got 18.5% growth year-on-year in Tourism Arrivals International. [Applause.]

In local tourism - this is people coming from ANC-run provinces to come and spend their leisure time in our province, the growth rate, bearing in mind that we are battling to even get 1% in South Africa, the growth rate here is 21.6%. In every single one of these indicators we totally outperform any other province and in actual fact we are stating to do amazing things and the people in that industry in this space 26 618 new jobs, direct jobs in tourism. These are the kinds of differences that this Government is bringing and so we get a motion of no confidence from the joke of the ANC that comes here with zero

substance into this motion... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...and quite frankly it should be treated with the absolute contempt that it deserves. [Time expired.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is the white supremacy attitude that you have.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, your time has expired.
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, the hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Go for that. Finish them. Just finish them.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is clear that the only speaker who attempted to deal with the six substantive issues that we have raised as the ANC was MEC Winde and it was a very poor attempt and let me tell you why. [Laughter.]

Because why is it acceptable that this province has eight years to implement a constitutional provision... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: How many years did you have?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...of significant - the same significance as the Public Protector.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: How many years did you have?

Mr C M DUGMORE: And they have failed to do that. We have heard this before, the Children's Commissioner is now eventually coming. Where is it? [Laughter.] She promised... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is she?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Hon Zille did, and she broke that promise because it is not here, and whenever we ask when will it be appointed we do not get any timeframes, so they are in defiance and that is why we have gone to the Public Protector and asked for remedial action to give a deadline for both of these Commissions to be appointed so your response holds no water, unless you support defying the Constitution.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She does, Uh-huh.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The second issue is that it is clear that the reason that Minister Sisulu has taken this Provincial Government to Court is specifically because they did not consider land reform, black economic empowerment, alleviation of poverty, job creation redress, when they decided to sell Tafelberg to the highest bidder and I want MEC Madikizela to tell this House the next time we have a chance honestly, was pressure put on you by DA developers and funders to reverse the decision of your own Department? I want you to tell us, and then we go onto the third issue, which no-one responded to. [Interjections.]

The facts are that under the DA and Premier Zille gangsterism, crime and substance abuse has got worse and the reason that it has is that you disbanded an integrated approach which the ANC had come with. You disbanded the Bambanani School Safety volunteers... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...and that is the responsibility of this - that the people on the Cape Flats and in our communities of the Western Cape experience daily. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member Dugmore, just a second, Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Premier Zille was busy writing a book and for six

months never went to a single community... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Just one second. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Is hon member Dugmore prepared to take a question about the slave wages paid to the Bambananis? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore? [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I sense the answer is no, Chief Whip.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And thank you, thank you, you somehow have some intuition, Mr Deputy Speaker. The hon Premier, and it is surprising that she did not speak, must tell us whether she misled this province and the Legislature that you say that the Provincial Cabinet has taken a unanimous decision not to review the subscription to the *Cape Times*. Is this truthful? Was this the Cabinet caucus of the DA where the DG was present?

Where are the minutes of the Cabinet meeting that took a decision not to subscribe to the *Cape Times*? We are waiting for that response, and I will then go on. In point number 5... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order Minister Grant, allow the member the time to speak.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you and then there was an attempt...

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] does not subscribe to the *Cape Times*?

Mr C M DUGMORE: The reality is member Winde does not know the facts about paper [Inaudible.] because officials from your own Department are giving us information about this issue and I can tell you now, and other issues. MEC Meyer is looking very comfortable now. MEC Winde is looking very comfortable now. Just wait. So the issue here is, this is a private company, which does not give its resources away. It sells the majority of those resources and through emails and interventions and harassment of officials of this Government favouritism happened to give tablets to a family member. [Interjections.] The Public Protector... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: And the reality is...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just listen, just listen!

The PREMIER: That is not true.

An HON MEMBER: You are wrong!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...that is number 5. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Dugmore, just one second.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There was not interjection, that thing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, I am listening.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, we must always listen, when the speaker is in that seat about this running comments. Please, the person who is under discussion, the hon Premier, please call her to order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, you have made your point. Hon member Dugmore may continue.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. In regard to employment equity member Winde does not deal with the issue of that representivity of senior, African and Coloured managers, which have regressed in this province under the Premier, he simply talks about performance and this is the issue that we have. We all support getting clean audits but when the DA and the City of Cape Town fail to spend R300 million of its housing budget then that impacts on the poor and no-one is disputing... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: But why are you misleading the House?

Mr C M DUGMORE: No-one disputes and there is no difference in regard to ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...acknowledging the role in the anti-apartheid struggle. The reality is, something has gone seriously wrong.

An HON MEMBER: Tell them.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The statements made from the *padkos* to the Tweets reveal actually that this Premier who have participated, yes, in an anti-apartheid struggle, but actually her ideas have been revealed as fundamentally upholding racism, upholding the remnants of colonialism. That is the problem. It is her record in Government. [Interjections.]

It is her record in this Government. That is why Mmusi Maimane and Ivan Meyer voted to suspend her at the Federal Council and the reality is that this Premier is a liability to the DA and the honourable members on that side know, but our concern... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: No-no-no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: We want a Premier, we want a Premier, not Premier Zille, we want one of you guys or lady or comrades or friends, male, but someone will... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...someone who will come forward and challenge without fear or favour, the divisions, the inequalities in this province and what we have in Premier Zille is someone who has failed, who has essentially lost interest, prefers to write a book, and I can tell you the other four out of the ten... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member, order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The other four out of the ten ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dugmore, your time has expired.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Complete your last sentence.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: The last sentence.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The last sentence. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, his last sentence.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I address you? I was literally on my last ten words when that member jumped like a Jack-in-the-box and actually disturbed me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I will allow you to finish your last sentence. You may, hon member Dugmore. Finish your last sentence and then I am going...

Mr C M DUGMORE: We mentioned six out of ten. I want to give this House the assurance that the four are coming, especially if member Zille does not take the advice and resign as Premier. [Time expired.]

An HON MEMBER: From you!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Can we come to order please. I want you to all attend now. Order. That concludes the debate on this motion.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The question before this House is the motion as printed in the name of the hon member Magaxa and moved by the hon member Dugmore, upon which an amendment has been moved by the hon member Wiley.

I will now put the amendment first as proposed by the hon member Wiley.

An HON MEMBER: It does not matter what he thinks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those in favour will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it. [Applause.] I will record the dissention of the ANC. [Interjection.] Are you? Will do. [ANC dissenting.]

The amendment obviously is then agreed to and the motion as amended will now be put, the motion as amended with the amendment. Those in favour of the motion as amended will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it, and so they have.
[Applause.]

Order. The motion as amended is therefore agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: Yea!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before we adjourn I would just like to inform members that the CPA AGM, the Annual General Meeting will commence immediately after adjournment and the other bit of good news is that the Budget Committee will not sit after that. The Budget Committee will stand

over till a later date.

That concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 19:30.