

---

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please be seated. I see the hon Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the subject for discussion. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to that. No objection? Agreed to. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do you know where the Speaker is?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, what is that, a point or order or what is that?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, I am just checking whether there is an apology.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Speaker will be in attendance later on.

[Interjections.] Ja, there is no objection to the motion being given precedence. We will then start with the motion in the name of the hon member Kivedo and I see the hon member Kivedo.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

(Subject for Discussion)

**THE INCREASING RACIAL INTOLERANCE AND RELATED ACTIONS  
AMONG ALL GROUPS IN SOUTH AFRICA**

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, fellow colleagues, support staff and also distinguished guests, if there are any present. [Interjections.]

I welcome that this House debates the increasing racial intolerance and actions amongst all groups in South Africa.

Mr Deputy Speaker, while our beloved country has made progress in uniting people behind the new national symbols, such as the new Anthem; the new Constitution; expanding political freedoms and improving access to the social wage, the country is a long way from achieving social cohesion.

Mr Deputy Speaker, further progress will require mobilising South Africans behind the common vision that is mutually beneficial but which will require mutual sacrifice. The country must continue with measures to heal the wounds of the past while reducing economic exclusion, inequality of opportunity and outcomes. We must remain committed to one nation with one future, built on freedom, fairness, opportunity and diversity for all, living together under the Constitution in peace, security and prosperity with opportunity and recognition for all the peoples.

It has been a long time now since the Bill of Rights was drawn up and agreed upon. Since then the TRC was celebrated, the 1995 Rugby World Cup served as a pillar of hope. We remember the cries of “Amabokoboko” and the ambience, the vibe and the atmosphere that had been created amongst the different groups of this nation. We were *Simunye*. We were one.

That was what happened after the 1995 World Cup, not even to mention the 2010 World Cup that brought us even closer as a nation. It served as a pillar of hope and, remember, hope springs eternal. According to the Bible hope springs eternal... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Amen brother!

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...to the unity that could be achieved in the nation.

Mr Deputy Speaker, what was envisaged? I quote:

“That no-one would be judged by the colour of his or her skin but by the contents of his or her character.” [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jy praat soos 'n regte comrade. [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You speak like a true comrade. [Inaudible.]]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, unfortunately, in the loose scrum - to use rugby terms - and during the maul, searching for the ball, the ball was knocked on and the try was never scored. [Interjections.] At least perhaps a penalty try. [Interjections.]

Since those times, Mr Deputy Speaker, we have seen the national project being left to a situation of what we can describe now as unfinished business... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die Blou Bulle is nog altyd daar... [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Blue Bulls are still there... [Inaudible.]]

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...as a challenge to go back to and complete and that is what our main task is. †Dit is onse kern kritieke besigheid om die

onvoltooide sake te loop voltooi. [It is our core critical business to go and complete the unfinished tasks.] We are still in desperate need of nation building and social cohesion.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daai is reg.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is right.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, entitlement, party political animosity, †somtyds knor ons vir mekaar soos Rottweilers, aan die kele en daar is wrywing [sometimes we growl at each other like Rottweilers, at each other's throats, and there is friction] exclusivity rather than inclusivity, and sometimes, most of the times - let us be honest today also, it is unnecessary that people in one country as a nation gets so divisive in terms of ideology or party political allegiance or whatever the case may be, that we are driven apart instead of go easy. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die probleem is die DA. Kom nou by die punt!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: The problem is the DA. Now come to the point!]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not the DA.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis hulle!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is them!]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Instead of “we” the jargon became “us” and “them”.

[Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daai blou span. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That blue team. [Interjections.]]

Mr B D KIVEDO: It is not in my dictionary. [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Sê hom.

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Tell him.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: “Us and them”, instead of “we”. Race has become the framework of reference and we have had to revert to ticking the boxes again.

†Ai, en dit is so moeisaam, die aftik van die boksies. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Oh, and it is so tiresome, the ticking off of the little boxes. [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Praat met die DA asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Talk to the DA please!]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Mooi, mooi!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good, good!]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am speaking to all of us as...

[Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Oukei, begin daar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, start there.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: We are part of one nation as we are sitting here or standing here or whatever. The DA continues to fight. Now I am getting to the DA. Listen carefully.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Oukei ons luister.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay we are listening.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Hon member Dyantyi!

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons luister!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are listening!

Mr B D KIVEDO: The DA continues to fight for a non-racialised society...

[Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...guided by a clear vision.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! †Agbare lid, jou tyd is amper verstreke, maak net klaar. [Hon member, your time has almost expired, just finish off.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, we remain committed to one nation with one future built on freedom, fairness, opportunity and diversity for all, living together under the Constitution in peace, security and prosperity with opportunity and recognition for all the people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member.

Mr B D KIVEDO: We invite - a last sentence.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: We invite all other parties to take hands in this noble cause for the common good of this nation... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...as builders as custodians of this democracy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I thank you. [Time expired.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are taking a little bit too much liberty there, but that was a long sentence. I see the hon member Gillion.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek dink u behoort die kant. Gaan uit daar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I think you belong on this side. Get out there.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Dyantyi, asseblief!

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please!]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me take the opportunity to thank the hon member Kivedo for this debate, †maar ek dink agb Kivedo, die DA het die *knock-on*, die aanslaan gedoen in die debat. [but I think hon Kivedo, the DA did the knock-on in the debate.]

Now Mr Deputy Speaker, 2 May 2018 became a shamed and a very painful incident for our young democracy when a person lost his life and many others got injured following a week of violence that played itself out between communities of Siqalo and Mitchells Plain.

These scenes reminded us about the black-on-black violence of the 1980s that was fuelled and funded by the apartheid government which AfriForum today, working with this DA, denies were crimes against humanity.

Shortly after the Siqalo and Mitchells Plain incident we were shocked to learn of the passing on of eight family members who perished in the shack

fires in Taiwan and a week later it was taxi violence in Delft. All these communities share the same socio-economic conditions of abject poverty and unemployment. They are also evidence of the damage that apartheid caused to this province. Today's debate presented an opportunity to make sense and understand the effects of structural racism. We live within the Western Cape. Instead of addressing the real issues the DA has once again fallen into the trap of denying the real crisis using blacks to defend the party's racism while the bosses are overseas. The party ought to learn that being dismissive does not change the burning issues people face in communities. The same issues, when they rise again, get labelled as being racist. The DA is always quick to condemn the people's actions while it ignores the daily challenges and suffering (*suffrage - sic*) of our people.

Race is described by sociologists as the social constructions with a hierarchy where white people are at the top and superior, and black and indigenous people at the bottom of the system as inferior. This system was a key feature of the apartheid government policies, which the DA are hell-bent to preserve. Racial segregation and white supremacy became an important feature of the Western Cape society from 1875. As it was during apartheid black and coloured people are still found swamped in shacks and other not so well built structures on the outskirts of the city. These are located outside areas of white settlements. For many black South Africans the Western Cape represents the last bastion of white rule. This is because quality services are reserved for white affluent areas while the Cape Flats are subjected to subhuman living conditions. [Interjections.]

A debate from the 17<sup>th</sup> Century, †en luister asseblief, [and please listen,] member Fritz, listen to this one: a debate from the 17<sup>th</sup> century between two Dutchmen, Jan van Riebeeck and Matthew (*sic*) Proot regarding the humanity of the people of the Cape centred on the following question... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: And I quote:

“What are the people of the Cape, bastards or human? Are they godless savages or are they humans just like Europeans?”

[Interjections.] Van Riebeeck believed they were godless savages and Proot argued they were human. Racism is rife in this Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is nothing new.

Ms M N GILLION: Precisely because black and coloured people in the Western Cape are not considered or treated as human beings on the same level as whites, just like Van Riebeeck has said hundreds of years ago. The Durban Declaration on Racism and Related Intolerance in 2001 draws the link between living conditions... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P UYS: Minister Fritz is really giving running commentary from his side, and I really would ask... [Interjection.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ja, ek gee die agbare lid toe, ek het ook gesien die agb Fritz is oor die vloer besig met iemand. Ek kan nie sien wie nie. Waarskynlik agb Tyatyam.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I agree with the hon member, I also saw how hon member Fritz is busy with someone across the floor. I cannot see whom. Hon member, Tyatyam, probably.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, Tyatyam.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, Tyatyam.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please contain yourselves! Hon member Gillion, you may continue.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Intolerance in 2001 draws the link between living conditions and racial intolerance. It is stated and I quote:

“We emphasise that poverty, underdevelopment, marginalisation, social exclusion and economic disparities are closely associated with racism; racial discrimination, xenophobia, and related intolerance, and contributes to the persistence of racist attitudes and practices, which in turn generate more poverty.”

That means as long as the Western Cape remains the most unequal society, cases of racial intolerance will always increase. I say the Western Cape is the most racist province and the DA is the reason for that. [Interjections.]

The DA created the environment conducive for racism to thrive. The Stats SA Living Conditions of Households in South Africa Survey indicated that whites earn five times more average annual income than blacks. The Employment Equity Report shows that the Western Cape has the most representation of whites, 76.6% at the top management level with white males taking almost two-thirds of the positions.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Sjoe!

Ms M N GILLION: This is the picture that we also see in the DA-caucuses from National Parliament right down to municipalities. It is a white-male dominated party that is intolerant of any views from black people, especially women. [Interjections.] Look what they did to Lindiwe Mazibuko, Mbali Ntuli... [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Not here!

Ms M N GILLION: And now Patricia de Lille. [Interjections.] Tony Leon agrees that the DA is in turmoil as black leaders are coming out openly calling for transformation. The party's national spokeswoman Refiloe Ntsekhe lamented on media that although about 70% of the party membership was black, its parliamentary caucus was relatively untransformed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Gillion, your time is almost expired. Finish off please. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Even DA leader Mmusi Maimane is scolded by his FedEx for saying the party needed to fight black poverty and white privilege. This DA remains true to its categorisation of white bosses and black stooges.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Gillion, your time has expired now.

Ms M N GILLION: No wonder! Controversy engulfed the Tweets of the hon Premier... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: Helen Zille praising the legacy of colonialism.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, order!

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow members to finish their last sentence. It is not the last paragraph, so when I ask order for the second time I expect the member to finish off.

An HON MEMBER: We get it from there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I was hoping that this debate will assist us to come up with suggestions to deal with this problem.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will help you. †Wag 'n bietjie! [Tussenwerpsels.]  
[Wait a minute! [Interjections.]]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Not to perpetuate it.

Ms L M MASEKO: Be quiet, listen guys, keep quiet! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now unfortunately what I have heard from this side, from that side, will not assist us to deal with this problem. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What happened this side? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Uh-huh, you do not know that! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There is this notion from that side that perpetuating racism in South Africa will assist us to get more votes. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not the truth.

Ms M N GILLION: It is not about votes, it is the truth.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The evidence points to the contrary. Now the sad reality in South Africa is that the poorest people who are mainly black are under exclusively black governments and that is the reality in South Africa.

Now let me start by thanking my mentor, Basil Kivedo, hon member Kivedo, for allowing us to debate this matter, which is a very serious one and again



with the hope of really coming up with suggestions to deal with the problem instead of perpetuating it.

I certainly hope that we will be mature enough as the members of this House to deal with this problem and not perpetuate it as I said. For us to do that, Mr Deputy Speaker, we need to be honest about the cause of this problem, acknowledge our shortcomings and make sound suggestions on how to deal with it.

It is an undeniable fact that racial intolerance in South Africa is perpetuated by widening gaps of inequalities and I want to agree with some of the points especially when it comes to inequalities that were made by the member on that side, because the realities in South Africa currently is that in South Africa we have 30.4 million South Africans who are living below poverty lines.

Ms P MAKELENI: Who is the Mayor now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second, Minister Madikizela. Hon member Gillion, you have made your point. You can continue now, leaving it now. Minister Madikizela, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The unemployment rate, if you include those who have lost hope in looking for a job, is almost 40% in South Africa. The economy is not growing because many investors have lost

confidence in South Africa. Now if the economy is not growing it means those people have no prospects of finding a job...

Mr R D MACKENZIE: In the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now these are realities that we are facing in South Africa and if you have those realities it is very, very difficult then to talk about race relations because it is a fact that the majority of people who are affected by these realities are mainly black. Most of those affected by these realities, as I said, are predominantly black, coloured and Indian because of our history.

An HON MEMBER: So what is new that you are telling us now?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It would therefore be disingenuous for anyone to deny that we have racial and structural inequality in South Africa because of our history. That is why you have Mamelodi and Mandolin. That is why you have Umhlanga and Umlazi. That is why you have Bonteheuwel and Bantry Bay. [Interjections.]

These areas were designed for different race groups by a system that deliberately advantaged one race over another, but it is equally true, Mr Deputy Speaker, that our current government has done very little to transform our economy in order to change this situation.

Ms M N GILLION: Excuse me!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Instead the situation is becoming worse so the picture I have just painted is a result of Government failures both present and the past. We must take responsibility for all these failures and own up. Instead of doing that we have seen some political opportunists playing the race-card in order to divert the attention of the current Government failures.

For South Africa to truly reconcile and live in harmony all of us, black and white must put shoulder to the wheel and address these challenges. Blaming each other and playing the race-card is not going to solve these problems. Instead we will soon wake up in a country in ruins and all of us here will be losers.

Ms M N GILLION: FedEx is disagreeing with your statement.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: When we adopted our Constitution in 1996 we acknowledged this fact as clearly articulated by our preamble and I want to quote:

“We, the people of South Africa, recognise the injustices of our past; we honour those who suffered for justice and freedom in our land; we respect those who have worked to build and develop our country and believe that South Africa belongs to all who live in it,

united in our diversity.”

Subsequent to that, Mr Deputy Speaker, we set up a Truth and Reconciliation Commission, in order to come clean about what happened in the past...  
[Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Where were you?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...in order to move forward.

An HON MEMBER: Where was the DA at that time?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There is currently a call from many South Africans who want to see justice after forgiveness and for us to serve that justice must be ensuring that our Constitution works for everyone, not just for those who have deep pockets.

Freedom Day, Workers Day, Youth Day, Women’s Day, Reconciliation Day means nothing to many South Africans because their economic situation is still the same as it was before 1994.

Ms M N GILLION: What did you do to try and solve that?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Our political differences must be about fighting for these marginalised South Africans. It must be about

seeking solution to their plight rather than our own personal and petty political agendas. In this Parliament, as we have witnessed now, I have seen many debates, scuffles and fights that have nothing to do with this bigger picture. That is why it is very, very important that all of us here must understand these realities and debate instead the things that we need to do to address them.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I just want to tell this short story: yesterday I took my son to watch Barcelona and Sundowns to celebrate his 18<sup>th</sup> Birthday.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now on the plane I had a lot of noise from a number of young girls, mainly white. I did not pay much attention. When we were disembarking I saw them gathered outside screaming. When I looked around I discovered that this excitement was because they were seeing their hip-hop idol and the name of that idol is Kwesta. You know what that said to me, Mr Deputy Speaker, it actually reminded me of the quote that is in Mandela's book *Long Walk to Freedom*, when Mandela said in that book, and I quote:

“No-one is born hating another person because of the colour of his skin or his background or his religion. People must learn to hate and if they can learn to hate they can be taught to love, for love comes more

naturally to the human heart than its opposite.”

So therefore, as the members of this House, we have spoken on a number of occasions about the challenges that are confronting this country and it is very sad that some of us want to reduce these challenges and make them a party-political football, because the reality here is that we have a National Government. [Laughter.]

Ms M N GILLION: Oh!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This is no laughing matter!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Actually it is no laughing matter.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just finish off, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The real issues in this country is that we have a National Government under the ANC and that is why it is important that all of us as members of the Opposition must work together with that particular Government as different provinces and different parties to come with a response to deal with these challenges that we facing in this country... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Madikizela, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...and not to politicise them. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired.

†n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good, good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, today the topic for discussion is extremely sensitive and serious, but today I choose to speak peace and not war.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Absolutely!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I choose to be a lover and not a fighter, in honour of my brother from another mother, hon Basil Kivedo who sponsored this debate today. [Interjection.]

I hope today, Mr Deputy Speaker, we can rise to the occasion and unite in our diversity. If I can just quote from the Word of God in Revelation 7 verse 9 it

says:

“After this I looked and before me was a great multitude that no-one could count, from every nation, tribe, people and language, standing before the throne and before the Lamb. They were wearing white robes and were holding palm branches in their hands...”

The important lesson here is that we are all equal in the sight of God.

I also want to honour my late mother, Lavodia Christians who has gone to be with the Lord and one of her favourite songs were, a song titled *Ebony and Ivory*, sang by Paul McCartney and Stevie Wonder, and it goes as follows:

“Ebony and ivory live together in perfect harmony  
Side by side on my piano keyboard, oh Lord, why don't we?  
We all know that people are the same wherever we go  
There is good and bad in everyone  
We learn to live, when we learn to give  
Each other what we need to survive, together alive...”

Mr Deputy Speaker, South Africa has the potential to produce a perfect harmony to the rest of the world. We cannot remove black keys. We cannot remove white keys. We need each other in order to produce a perfect harmony. I thank you. [Applause.]



An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, the hon member Wiley. [Interjections.]

Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We live in total harmony! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. One definition of intolerance states that it is an unwillingness to accept views, beliefs or behaviour that differs from one's own. [Interjections.]

Racism is defined as prejudice, discrimination or antagonism directed against someone of a different race, based on a belief that one's own race is superior. Racial intolerance is an acquired disease. Racists learn to hate from other racists. Their brains have created short-circuits and shortcuts or schemes that reduce people to simple sentences and images. A perfect example of this climate setting was given today here by hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Uh-uh! I am just reminding you [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: The drivers of racial intolerance are often to be found in political nationalism where in the absence of any solid argument these nationalists simply default to racism rhetoric or slang... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: Mechanisms of ostracisation and stigmatisation and the creation of a pariah state will often follow. In order to gain political power they have to reduce their opponents to a base level.

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is what you did with apartheid. That is what you did.

Mr M G E WILEY: In Rwanda the Belgian colonisers made the fatal error of formalising tribal divisions in every citizen's identity document...

An HON MEMBER: It takes one to see another.

Mr M G E WILEY: ...this stigmatisation against the minority Tutsis in particular due to their prominent place in society, so between 1990 and 1994 racial intolerance in Rwanda was so extreme... [Interjection.]

†Me M N GILLION: Kyk wie praat.

[Ms M N GILLION: Look who is talking.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...that almost overnight 800 000 individuals mainly Tutsis were butchered.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sharpeville, you were part of Sharpeville.

Mr M G E WILEY: After the war... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: I would like to object to that interjection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, did you refer to the hon member as being part of Sharpeville?

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, no.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja, she said... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: She is talking to the DA, to the party.

Mr D JOSEPH: No, no!

An HON MEMBER: Those that were there will know it. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sit down! You do not need to speak to me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, I am listening. Please speak to the Chair.

Ms S W DAVIDS: What are you asking, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Whether your reference referred to an individual of this House? [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No!

Ms S W DAVIDS: No-no, I am saying they were part of Sharpeville. I am not speaking to anyone. I am just speaking in general.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will have to take your word for that, but that is not the way that I thought it came out. Hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja, thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, the exact words, “you were part of Sharpeville.” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! No, I have dealt with. [Interjection.] Order! I have dealt with that point and hon member Wiley can continue. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why are we not happy? We were born in harmony. [Laughter.]

Mr M G E WILEY: In Germany in the early 1930's the country was ripe for political exploitation. The country was crippled by reparations following the First World War and the world economic depression drove it down further. Enter Hitler with his nationalistic hysteria. By 1936 he had captured power from the Reichstag and the first thing he did was to lock up his political opponents, communists and objecting clergy. In the minds of many this was acceptable because the Nazi party had created the climate just like they have on the other side there, that these opponents were the ones preventing Germany from getting to its feet again. [Interjections.] Shortly thereafter the Nazi's targeted the Jews and the policy of extermination began. Six million perished. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Just like the other  
[Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: In South Africa we too have every reason to expect a similar path of destruction. The system of codified apartheid and separate development are all the hallmarks of a potential repeat of what happened in Rwanda and Germany.

However, the powers that be at the time followed a different route - one of reality and pragmatism. We were blessed with leaders of exceptional ability and vision... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you to the ANC.

Mr M G E WILEY: ...led in main by the magnetism and charisma of Mr Nelson Mandela.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] Nelson Mandela.

Mr D MITCHELL: Except Jacob Zuma.

Mr M G E WILEY: Following our democratic election in 1994 the Constitution was born in 1997. Human rights formed the cornerstone of this document, which was equality, human dignity, life, protection from slavery, servitude and the like. We all know the Constitution well... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you ANC, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: ...the right to citizenship, property, housing and education. Mr Mandela used symbols like the 1995 World Cup as my colleague has already... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Leave Nelson! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! Just like the hon member Gillion had the benefit of silence in the House when she spoke, I will afford the member the same silence. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is there no talk about Vorster?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, hon member Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is this sort of attitude of trying to shut up another point of view. When I say that Mr Mandela used symbols like the 1995 World Rugby Cup - and it gets an outcry from the other side, it is indicative of their intolerance of the other side - hosted and won by South Africa to unify the country. In beating New Zealand we had an undoubtedly unifying effect in our country because for the first time in our country neighbours of all colours celebrated and danced in the streets. Since Madiba, however, the Mandela-era, the ANC promises have gone unfulfilled and I could list a whole host of examples...

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie, ek is op pad!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute, I am on my way!]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...from where no youth subsidy, job creation, no adequate teachers in classrooms, pit toilets, inadequate hospitalisation, a whole host of things. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The ANC was not here.

Mr M G E WILEY: What has replaced, it has been a constant stream of racist rhetoric mainly aimed at the DA and whites in general. I am being a white.

The theme of that is that the DA is a white racist party and all its members are either racists and its black members are either stooges or sell-outs and here is an example of what it is that the ANC says.

The hon member Sharon Davids on the other side says that the DA is - you made an anti-Semitic remark that the DA was convoluting with Jewish Mafia. An ANC councillor by the name of Nkosi said, posted on Facebook that the first people that need to fok-of are whites!

Lindiwe Sisulu called Mmusi Maimane a hired native. Lulu Xingwana, who was also an ANC Minister at the time, said: “Young Afrikaner men are brought up in a Calvinist religion believing that they own women, they own the child and they own everything and therefore they can take life if they want.” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: Velaphi Khumalo, the ANC supporter and Gauteng DCAS member, said that “I want to cleanse this country. [Inaudible.] I want to clean this country of all white people. We must act as Hitler did to the Jews...” and I could go on about the sort of utterances that they did.

Mr P UYS: It is all negative!

Mr M G E WILEY: The problem is it breeds radicalism so we have the



ultimate perversion coming from Julius Malema. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon!

Mr M G E WILEY: “We are not calling for the slaughter of white people - at least for now!” On several occasions he also referred to white people as cockroaches, which is the same rhetoric that was used in Rwanda before the genocide.

An HON MEMBER: Yebo.

Mr M G E WILEY: Floyd Shivambu has referred to Helen Zille as a racist girl, who appointed boyfriends and concubines. Should a person of colour have said that in this country, should a person - a white person - have said that to a person of colour there would have been court cases a long time ago. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: Project reclaim: it is significant that following the DA win in the Western Cape in 2009 the former Premier Rasool stated that he did not recognise the DA-win... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are spoiling the whole thing...

Mr M G E WILEY: ...and that this province must be made ungovernable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, your time has almost expired. Just finish off.

Mr M G E WILEY: Out of this was born Project Reclaim. It is significant that in the election campaign to come they brought back Ebrahim Rasool and Project Reclaim. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member, your time has expired. [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy Speaker, it is clear that hon member Wiley possibly should follow the advice of MEC Madikizela and ask hon member Kivedo to be his mentor... [Interjections.] ...because what we have seen here is actually the epitome of that crass racist intolerant attitude from that grouping within the DA that actually still controls the economic power and continues... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Where do you place yourself?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Nothing in the speech talks about the factors that contribute to intolerance. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Where do you place yourself?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Nothing talks to it, but simply it is that clutching and that defence of white privilege. That is essentially what hon member Wiley was talking about. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is your knowledge, your knowledge.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is clear Mr Deputy Speaker, that inequality and wealth take on a racial form in South Africa and acutely here in the Western Cape, and often the intolerance that we see is rooted in very real material conditions, economic exploitation, hunger and poverty and these indicators, unless we are blind and do not want to see, are directly linked to race and to deny the link between economic and racial inequality does not take us anywhere.

As the ANC we are guided by the Freedom Charter, which talks about the South Africa that belongs to all who live in it, a South Africa in which the wealth of the country and the land shall be shared by those who work it. We are also guided very clearly by the Constitution, both of the country, but we from the ANC under our aims and objectives in our Constitution as amended and adopted at our NASREC Conference, is that the objectives of the ANC are to unite all the people of South Africa to end apartheid in all its forms and transform South Africa as rapidly as possible into a united non-racial

non-sexist and democratic society, based on the principles of the Freedom Charter and to fight for social justice and to eliminate the vast inequalities created by apartheid and the system of national oppression. So our goal as the ANC is to actually continue the unfinished business of actually building a national democracy society which is united, non-sexist, non-racial, but also particularly important a prosperous country. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And one successful.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And what is particularly important is that in this situation we do not only need to mouth a platitude of non-racial but in our conduct and in our actions and in our policies we need to act in an antiracist fashion, to actually call out racism where we see it and actually make the point in our argument that dealing with this intolerance is going to be about building an equal society. So unless we focus on the issue of class and race where those inequalities come from and have practical measures and that is why it is disappointing that the Democratic Alliance under the leadership of Helen Zille instructed Lindiwe Mazibuko and others not to vote for employment equity and we see the results in our province, where for instance there is direct political intervention in the George Municipality, when there is a perfectly qualified black candidate to actually deny that, because they are getting the message from the top from Helen Zille herself that actually we do not support employment equity...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You talk nonsense. That is

nonsense you are talking.

Mr C M DUGMORE: So it is one thing for MEC Madikizela to come here and say what he says, but his party and the leadership of his party is actually undermining a basic provision of our Constitution... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon member Dugmore, just one second...

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...which is redress.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is not [Inaudible.]

HON MEMBERS: No, sit down.

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members, order. I could not hear the member. Is it a point of order?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Ja, he is lying. He is deliberately misinterpreting the position. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, speak to the mic. I cannot hear you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: He is deliberately misinterpreting the position, saying something that is untrue. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I take your point. I cannot comment whether it is true or not. It is not a point of order. Hon member Dugmore you may continue. [Interjections.]

†Me M N GILLION: Waarvoor raak jy kwaad?

[Ms M N GILLION: What are you getting angry about?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, you may continue.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, when you have a Premier of the province who in 1999 as per Hansard made a comment to say that “I have been in some of the Portfolio Committees and I can see what a drain token representatives are on the public purse, which women are there because they add read value and which are there to fill the ANC quotas. They take up space there, earn a salary, eat a big lunch, pack in some *padkos* and drive off in a C-Class Mercedes.”

Now it is clear that this was referring to mostly black ANC women MPs. It is a shocking disgrace that the Premier of this province who actually fuels intolerance by her quotes in support of aspects of colonialism, her insulting

essentially of black women MPs that she is not here to actually participate in this debate and I think that is a major problem, and the fact that from the top she is not leading a constitutional imperative for redress, that in regard to redress black people generally, African, Coloureds and Indians disabled people and women, should be the beneficiaries, but when the leader - and let us face it, she is effectively the leader, not only of the Western Cape but still the DA nationally - when she sends a message out... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Because she is white.

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, not because she is white. She is controlling things. It has got nothing to do with... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no-no. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: But that is the reality so when she as a first citizen... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: When she as the first citizen of the Western Cape...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, just one second. Hon member Gillion.

Mr C M DUGMORE: When she is the first citizen of... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, behind you there is somebody on the floor.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Oh sorry.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is really unacceptable if a Chief Whip and an MEC, †hulle hou nie op nie, terwyl iemand op die vloer is. [they do not stop while someone is on the floor.] The highest order from that side!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, the Chair will keep the order and there was no difference or my actions against the two parties are exactly the same, so hon member Dugmore may continue and I appeal to members to please contain themselves.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, so to begin to deal with this intolerance we have to look at the root causes and what we expect is leadership from the top. Why is it that Patricia de Lille is hauled over the coals whereas we have a situation where the Premier is actually allowed to



get away with making statements that clearly cause offence? That is the problem within the DA... [Interjection.]

Mr D MITCHELL: What happened with Marius?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...and I want to appeal to the Provincial Leader, because you are the Provincial Leader, MEC Madikizela, you are. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: And I want to appeal to all members of the DA that we have to at the end of the day, yes, speak out against intolerance and we must call it out whether it is from the Freedom Front or Julius Malema, wherever it comes from... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Or from Helen Zille, why is there not courage within the DA to call out Helen Zille and to actually expose the differentiated discrimination in terms of how someone like Patricia de Lille is dealt with compared to the fact that essentially Helen Zille can say what she wants... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Oh really!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...but she is not dealt with. That is the root core of racism, but more importantly we have to focus on these inequalities as you have said, MEC. These inequalities, the issues of delivery, we actually have to be serious about this and when I was in Oudtshoorn yesterday you could hear what people on the ground were saying. They see the DA in Oudtshoorn as actually preserving the economic power, not doing that, and that is the economic exploitation which actually those privileged people in the DA thrive on. [Interjections.]

Mr D MITCHELL: That is what you told them...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Dugmore, your time has expired. [Interjections.] Order, I see the †agb lid Minister Plato [hon member Minister Plato.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Stay here!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, racism posters during Tuesday's march to Parliament, the Verulam mosque attack in Durban last week, the burning of 32 trucks near Mooi River Toll Plaza in KwaZulu Natal ... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The Western Cape...

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... at the end of April

apparently because the trucks were driven by foreigners, the slurs insults and boiling tensions during the Siqalo protests - all are the most recent incidents of increasing racial intolerance and intolerance in general, which more often than not is leading to violent and even deadly consequences. The Siqalo protests, which based on the demands made were largely service delivery related - housing, sanitation, electricity, and so on - were those in racial intolerance and incitement on the ground; groupings not willing to tolerate the other groupings, South Africans intolerant of South Africans and even more so, of non-South Africans. This growing intolerance is evident further in the violence experienced in communities across the country, not evident to the Western Cape alone. One of the apartheid legacies remains deep rooted with distrust in one another in South Africa.

I agree with Chief Justice Mogoeng Mogoeng who recently stated that the foundation of the injustices of the past is racism. What we require is constant unification in South Africa building a unified nation through all our daily tasks. This is especially true for any sphere of government when the demands of our people remain too high for the scarce resources of Government to assist everyone immediately and communities want assistance right now today and not tomorrow.

We have to be cognisant of our segregated and different pasts. We have to understand the inequality that many people living in this country especially non-white South Africans, have been subjected to in the past. We have to plot our future, *Better Together*, knowing that for many black South Africans in

our country the ANC-post democratic Government has failed to change or improve their quality of life enough for the festering inequality to not spill over into intolerance.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this is a talk the DA-led Government has never shied away from. We on this side of the House face intolerance head-on.  
[Interjections.]

Racial intolerance and the violent actions which accompany them, Government addressed through the various programmes and opportunities available to the people living in this province. The programmes, the projects and initiatives my Department and other departments have on offer to help increase safety through targeted interventions or strategic partnerships are done through a whole of society approach, inclusive of everyone within the society, a community affected by an issue.

This is done to help improve intolerance and to build bridges between communities often at odds with one another. We also need to build that bridges over the racial lines and we need not have to wait for tomorrow. We need to start with all of those processes right now.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We focus our attention on reaching out to especially the youth in the province to provide opportunities

to them where they can unshackle themselves from our intolerant past and use their freedom to build a future they want. We need to offer them alternatives on a day-to-day basis, alternatives to develop themselves. Also we need to say to them stay away from racial slurs and racial intolerance. We focus our attention on standing with the vulnerable in our communities during commemorative months including youth months, women's months and the annual 16 Days of Activism Campaign in support of safer environments and safer communities for individuals and communities still facing the brunt of violence. The South African Police is the mandated authority to uphold the Constitution, to uphold law and order, to uphold our human rights in the process and to protect all within the Republic. We need an effective and efficient police service who serves our communities diligently without fear or favour and with sufficient resources to go about their duties.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I have said it before that it was a mistake and I want to repeat myself, a mistake to take away the specialised police units. It was a mistake to stop using police reservists. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It sounds like a broken record. Let us say it was a mistake. It was a mistake.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This for instance has caused a situation where crime is spiralling out of control in our communities, gangs, drugs and guns becoming part of the daily lives of even our youth.

An HON MEMBER: Thinking about Patricia de Lille.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The failing of the police through mismanagement has created a scenario where we are failing our youth and we are busy failing our country's future.

Ms P MAKELENI: Uh-huh all the time you are doing that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We have to be cognisant of the segregated and differing past. We have to understand the inequality that many people living in this country... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You forgot where you are. It is a mistake. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: My apologies, Mr Deputy Speaker. The adequate resourcing of SAPS... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...would allow the police to adequately deal with service delivery protest as and when it arises, without it escalating due to bubbling intolerance and violence under the guise of service delivery. [Interjections.]

This level of lawlessness and accompanying violence is not an anomaly.

What is fuelling the intolerance and violence is the ANC Government's failure to turn the tide on corruption and criminality within its own ranks.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute.] †I am speaking after you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Intolerance is bred through inequality. [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Ja, I know you favour the mistake, to say that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It does not have to take a racial undertone but it suits the ANC's fear-mongering narrative that a minority within the country is to blame for its own failures as a government.

Ms M N GILLION: Ag please!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Just like it suits the ANC that a war is raged in our communities on a daily basis at the hands of gangsters, druglords, and through the rampant availability of guns. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: So is the Tshwane problem also the ANC?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yet, former President Zuma meets with gangsters and promises them tax exemptions to keep the province

ungovernable. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Haibo, haibo!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It suits the ANC that police guns are being sold to these gangsters and smuggled through the Cape underworld under their watch. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Must we remind you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It suits the ANC that top police generals and brigadiers are in cahoots... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I see the report of you, nè.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...with organised crime even found guilty of corruption. It suits the ANC that an almost collapsed police service cannot arrest the top druglords and top gang bosses because these are the very same people who gets VIP invitations to the ANC's parties in the province. [Interjections.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister, your time is almost expired; your last sentence.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And they are in bed with them. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Amandla! [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: But you [Inaudible.] with gangsters at night.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Lekker! [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Have you forgotten... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Pictures do not lie!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Plato, please do not incite them. Hon member Lekker, hon member Makeleni, hon Nkondlo! I see the hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†n AGBARE LID: Gooi kole!

[An HON MEMBER: Throw coals!]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon members, this debate has to be about injustice of the past.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The hon member Kivedo is concerned and he is of the view that racial intolerance is on the increase. It is a historical concern, devoid of context, devoid of historical conditions and I am going to demonstrate that. Let me first invite the members to the recollection of historical facts and current challenges and I am going to invite him to be with me. Do you remember the triple challenges of race, of class, of gender in this country? [Interjections.] Our struggle was always informed by that.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Surely that is not... [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In 1998 twenty years ago, President Thabo Mbeki spoke of and introduced what he then called “existence of two nations within one”. [Interjections.] You spoke of a wish for the one nation. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen and learn.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He said this notion of two nations is as old as the arrival of the European colonies in our country over 350 years ago. One nation is white, relatively prosperous, regardless of gender or geographic dispersal. It has access to developed infrastructure. The other is black and poor with the worst affected being women in rural areas. This nation lives under conditions that are grossly underdeveloped. This remains our problem today as it was twenty years ago.

In the NDP very recently we have continued the theme of triple challenges. When we spoke of poverty, of inequality, of unemployment, if you take all of those three, the issue of race is integral in all of those and therefore your concern that it is increasing today is a historical one, you misplaced... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because of the ANC, because of the ANC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is not a discussion that we must have.

Ms P MAKELENI: We fought for that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Our mission is guided by the national democratic revolution. It has always been the building of a national democratic society. That is the project that goes beyond reconciliation. For 28 years, and this is where you speak about your *Simunye*, for 28 years we are a rainbow nation in

form and not in content and practice.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: All we are doing is we have coloureds, whites, blacks, a rainbow nation in form, not in content and practice. [Interjections.] Society's challenge is challenging us to do something about that. You know when students start a struggle of Rhodes must fall, it is not racial intolerance. They are dealing with historical facts in this country that have been there for over 350 years. So I really want to invite you that I think we must go on the same slate on this particular issue because if you continue in that debate of yours we then are going to be missing the major issues. Some have had hidden racial prejudice for 28 years. [Interjection.]

We have made progress in 28 years, yes, but not much. And Thabo Mbeki continues ..."

“Our country continues to be distinguished by the racial divisions and gender discrimination we inherited in the past. The perpetration of the apartheid legacy of racial and gender inequality, division and oppression constitutes the greatest threat to the democratic order.”

It is not some individual who is raising racial issues, it is the system, because our struggle was never about the whiteness of somebody. Our struggle was about this system, which creates these kinds of issues. It is a pity he is gone,

because I wanted to answer what he wanted to hear – Madikizela, as well as hon member Wiley – as to what is that you are offering?

Let me start in Germany, hon member Wiley. West Germany helped East Germany in the unification and they introduced what is called solidarity tax, because West Germany was very rich, in order to uplift East Germany.

So you went to Germany, but what you quoted about Germany was very convenient. You needed to conclude and say this is where we failed because 20 years ago Thabo Mbeki put that on the table, what you are doing as the rich people of this country, as West Germany did for East Germany in the unification. [Interjections.]

Secondly ... [Interjections.] He is absent. Tell him – Madikizela. I want to know what must be done. We are saying you need to end the poverty that dehumanises millions in our province.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: For as long as you do not do that, for as long as you have Siqalo, Marikana, you are not going to be solving racial intolerance. That is what you must do. You must build, as he correctly said. We must build a shared future and destiny for us to deal with these issues. We must create material conditions that lift the poor out of the trappings of abject poverty. [Interjections.]

For as long as you do not do that you are going to come back in 20 years, hon member Kivedo, and think that racial intolerance is increasing ... [Interjections.] when you are not attending to the root causes of where we are today.

That is the real issue. That is what you must be debating about. Not about what police must do, who must be jailed. It must be us attending to these issues.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] to remind everyone of the Guptas. We will tell them about the Guptas in 20 years. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Instead of you being in government in the Western Cape, as the ruling party, the DA, you have become a racially intolerant party. There are very clear examples of that. Very clear examples.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: How?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Ask Jimmy [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And I am talking you through.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Ask Jimmy.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA ... [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Ask him about the coloureds.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Tony Leon in 2000 chased Peter Marais out. That was Tony Leon and he has fought back. I just want to give you the chronological order of how racially intolerant you are as the DA. [Interjections.]

You are repeating the same thing today. J P Smith is attempting to chase Patricia de Lille out ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... in the same way as Tony Leon did to Peter Marais. It is just the DA, nobody else. And yet Helen Zille, as the posters will show you, remains. You have Mazibuko out, De Lille out but she remains.

An HON MEMBER: This one, this one. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The white woman remains in charge in the DA. [Interjections.] You are looking for their votes and when they bring their vote, it is easy for you to dispense with them. [Interjection.] You canvas for votes in Muslim areas and in turn you support apartheid Israel.

An HON MEMBER: Jôh!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is what you do.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dyantyi, your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mngqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You will never find that one again.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to thank hon member Kivedo for sponsoring this debate. This is a debate that we should all have and embrace and be able to stand up and confront racism which rears its ugly head in the midst of our developing country.

†UNksz P MAKELENI: Ewe, Mngqasela.

[Ms P MAKELENI: Yes, Mngqasela.]

Mr M MNQASELA: The definition of racism is:

“A belief that race is the primary determination of human traits and capabilities, and that racial differences produce an inherent superiority



of a particular race, a doctrine or a political programme, based on assumptions of racism, and designed to execute its principles, either social or political.”

This is something that we have seen. Hon members have spoken about this. There is nothing better than what was articulated here by the hon Chief Whip of this Parliament ... [Interjections.] and there is nothing better than what hon member Madikizela ... [Interjections.] expressed in this House; that in fact all of us must stand together, including the ANC, to defeat this crime and this venom of racism. [Interjection.]

But what has not happened ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: He deserted his [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: What has not happened, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that we have an Opposition here that has an opportunity to join us in this campaign ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Join who? [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: A campaign where we show ... [Interjections.] The Democratic Alliance ran a campaign about a year ago saying do not allow racists to speak for you. [Interjections.] And we asked everybody in the Democratic Alliance and those who sought to join us to sign an anti-racism

pledge. [Interjections.] There is no other political party that has ever done that in South Africa, only the Democratic Alliance has done that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: What the ANC in the same period did ... [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, they launched a campaign, the Bell Pottinger campaign.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr M MNQASELA: The campaign that was driven by Jacob Gedleyihlekisa Zuma ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is the only thing you can say.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... who led this campaign in his head office in Saxonwold Shebeen, ran the campaign together with the Gupta brothers on behalf of the ANC. These hon members were sitting here, nobody rejected that campaign. A campaign of racial polarisation and a campaign of hatred, and a campaign that sought nothing but to divide and destroy the very serious programme of social cohesion ... [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Why are you shouting?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... a programme of unity ... [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Why are you shouting?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and a programme to build a much better united South Africa.

Ms M N GILLION: Shame on you, *man*.

Mr M MNQASELA: Now let us come forward. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where are you doing [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon member Gillion stands up and she says Siqalo was our programme, it was designed by us, the Site C death of eight people was designed by us.

Ms P MAKELENI: Oh, you mean DA?

Mr M MNQASELA: Let me just tell you this, when these deaths in Site C occurred, what happened there, the person that ... [Interjection.] whose house was burnt, her brother was saying that day that the neighbour was fighting with his sister and the neighbour happened to be a man and ultimately they burnt that house and eight people died.

Hon member Fritz, we have got a problem in the ANC. When every woman in this country is sleeping, not knowing whether her husband is going to murder

her, whether her boyfriend will strangle her, the ANC says it is okay, [Interjections.]. It is okay, people must die at the hands of men who do not want to respect the rights of women. [Interjections.] We have got to go to Site C. We have got to go there and drive a campaign that says we will not allow men to kill women and destroy young girls. [Interjections.]

But the ANC says: “It is okay, you must do it, because the DA is doing it.”  
Where was the DA when that thing was happening there?

Ms P MAKELENI: Where were you really?

Mr M MNQASELA: You have got to be very serious ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: The DA is the Government and the ANC must be responsible as leaders.

An HON MEMBER: So you accuse people [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: Now when we had a debate here on 3 May 2018, Mr Deputy Speaker, hon member Davids said hon member Beverley Schäfer has no right to speak or move a motion here because she is white. That is the ANC that we have. [Interjections.] The ANC that believes that if you are white you must not speak here ... [Interjections.] if you are white you have

no right to stand here. [Interjections.]

According to the ANC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: According to the ANC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... hon member Dugmore ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... should not be sitting there. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member ... [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon member Uys should not be sitting there ...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mngqasela, order! Hon member  
Tyatyam. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can you rule on that ...

[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ja.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... because he knows that that was never said here.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

An HON MEMBER: No, that is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: So I am asking you ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear what you are saying ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... he is accusing a member here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I cannot vouch for the truth or not of that, it is not an unparliamentary expression, so the hon member can continue. [Interjections.] You can deal with that in a different way, as a debating point.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Tyatyam, did you hear me?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, I heard you. [Interjections.] So I want to hear from you, Mr Deputy Speaker – are you saying that it is fine that hon members can say that to ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... each other?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I did not say that. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because that ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... is the premise that you are setting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I said it is not for the Chair to determine whether something which is said in the House is true or not. The Chair is not in a position to know that. That is something that you can counter in a debating point. [Interjections.]

What he said was not unparliamentary, so he may continue with what he is saying. Hon member, you may continue. [Interjection.] Hon member Gillion.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, just one second, hon member, there is another point of order.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, on many occasions in this House points of orders are raised against members casting aspersions on other hon members in this House. According to my knowledge what the hon member was just doing was to cast aspersions on hon member Davids in implying that she, in this House, was racist.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms M N GILLION: And I am asking you, please, Mr Deputy Speaker, to rule on this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear what you are saying, hon member Gillion. I will have a look at Hansard. I did not pick it up when it was said, but I want us to continue. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, just on a point of order. This debate is about intolerance and we have just had hon member Mngqasela



making an allegation that this ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: It is not a point of order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... side of the House is not going to tolerate hon member Schäfer speaking. Does that not reflect absolute intolerance and actually go against the spirit and the conventions in this House when that party is bringing a debate about tolerance?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dugmore. I am not going to express myself on that. It is not, it is a point of order, but it is not something that I can rule on immediately. If it is necessary I will come back to that, but I want the hon member to continue. Hon member Mngqasela, you may continue.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think ... [Interjection.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, this is an attempt to derail me, but I remain focused. [Interjections.] I remain focused.

The DA is the only party in this country that preaches non-racialism, that preaches togetherness and the only party that practices this. If you look this side you see South Africa. [Interjections.] Look that side, what do you see? [Interjections.] And if it was up to the ANC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Davids, you are giving a

running commentary now.

Ms P MAKELENI: I thought you said DA is [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, the same applies to you. I am now hearing a running commentary from your side. Allow the hon member to please continue. He is almost done with his speech.

Mr M MNQASELA: On 13 September 2012, whilst responding to a question in Parliament, the former President Jacob Zuma said to the mainly white people that he was pointing to, he said: “All of you whites here,” and in fact he said this:

“We have more rights as the majority ...”

pointing to the ANC:

“... and you have less rights and in fact no rights ...”

pointing to the minority.

We have got here an ANC that preaches division. [Interjections.] Go the Hansard of 13 September ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... in Parliament. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Mr M MNQASELA: He tried to spin it the next day, because he thought it was not ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mngqasela ... [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... but it was too late, because Hansard ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just take your seat. Hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is a deliberate distortion and out of context quote of a statement that was made. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: That is a quote.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The President may have said that, but in what context did he say that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order. That is also not a point of order, but it is a point for debate if you want to counter that. Order! Hon member

Mnqasela, you may continue.

Mr M G E WILEY: It was in Hansard.

Mr M MNQASELA: That is a point for debate, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Go to the Hansard of 13 September 2012 in the National Assembly. [Interjections.] I was a member there, you were not there. [Interjections.] You were not there.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You were demoted [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... that is why you are here.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon member Dugmore ... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You were demoted.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... had an opportunity to speak here ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... but he said nothing. He said nothing and that is why,

because he was seeking relevance in Zwelihle in Hermanus they told him to go home. [Interjections.] They do not want him there, because he went to seek relevance instead of trying to speak on the issues here. He calls this one that name and that one that name, when in fact the very people that sit next to him – hon member Davids – believes that if you are white, like hon member Schäfer, you cannot speak in this House.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ag please, man.

Mr M MNQASELA: We will defend you, hon member Dugmore, we will protect your rights. [Interjections.] We will stand with you and hon member Uys and all of you ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The DA [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: ... because we believe that this Parliament is for everybody, and this country is for all people. That is why the Democratic Alliance will lead this country because in our time we can only ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... be free and safe under a Democratic Alliance Government. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! That concludes the debate on this subject. We will now move on to Interpellations. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Beerwinkel, order means for everybody.

We move on to Interpellations. The first one is hon member Hinana to Minister Grant. I see Minister Grant.

### **INTERPELLATIONS:**

#### *Bus strike: adverse effects of*

#### **1. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

What adverse effect has the bus strike that started on Wednesday 18 April 2018 had on commuters and the economy in the province?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon member for the mini debate.

The ongoing national driver strike has had a severe and disruptive impact on both the Cape Metropolitan functional region and the George Municipality. Hon members will know that the industrial action commenced on 18 April and was successfully resolved only 27 days later on 14 May. Whilst some of the services involved were able to restart on 15 May, others took longer.

Some cases, even though delivering services from 15 May, took a few days to deliver their full timetable.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the nature of disruption during a public transport strike is immediate in terms of its impact on all the commuters involved: workers, students, learners and even those members of society needing access to transport to go about their normal lives.

However, determination of the full impact of such a withdrawal of transport facilities on the overall economy, requires time and careful analysis.

Given that working commuters are drawn from economic sectors across the board and that lateness and absenteeism have varying impacts in these different economic sectors, economists are reluctant to make estimations until more data becomes available over time. One media source, an academic transport economist, has however reported as putting the loss to the economy nationally at more than R500 million a week. The Cape Town Chamber of Commerce confirmed that the true impact will emerge only later and also expressed concern about the above inflation increases.

The Cape Town bus commuters, the broader transport network and the economy have come under great pressure. The strike added to Cape Town's existing transport challenges, which include the poor performance of Metrorail. Both the MyCiti and Golden Arrow bus services were affected by the strike. Together these services transport more than 290,000 passengers a

day, who have to find alternative modes where possible, or have been left stranded and unable to reach work, access education or services.

Meanwhile in George Municipality the Go George bus service was suspended, impacting its 13,000 daily passengers. These passengers had to find alternatives such as private cars, walking or minibus taxis in response to the strike. Government elected to extend the validity of multi-journey monthly tickets for the Go George service.

Tourism in Cape Town was also detrimentally affected by the suspension of the MyCiti airport link and the Table Mountain and Aerial Cableway shuttle service. The reported acts of violence and intimidation against tourist bus services has created a negative perception of the City ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... and the province as a tourist destination, noting the importance of tourism to our local economy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your first timeslot has expired. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. We are facing transport failures on all fronts, which affect the Western Cape's residents ability to get to work and to school, and in turn holds our economy and



[Inaudible.] to ransom.

Our bus drivers were striking over poor working conditions and low wages and many of our train services, which are governed by the state-owned enterprise Prasa, work at minimal capacity with dismally high delay and cancellation rates.

In the City of Cape Town, Mr Deputy Speaker, Metrorail passengers have dropped by roughly 50% from 675,000 in 2000, to an estimated 360,000 passengers in 2017. Train cancellations in the Western Cape have increased from 3% in 2015 to 15% in 2017.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Prasa's failure to deliver a reliable service has devastating affects ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I thought you were asking [Inaudible.].

Mr N E HINANA: ... on our economy.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Mr N E HINANA: If people do not have a reliable transport system they are being robbed of employment as they cannot move to and from their workplaces. Many commuters on the central and northern lines continue to face delays and cancellations due to there being insufficient carriages,

because of vandalism and [Inaudible.] issues, crime, stone throwing, level crossing incidents, wet waste, illegal connections and high pedestrian traffic.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr N E HINANA: All of this could be avoided if we had a reliable transport infrastructure, governed by a reliable authority. Instead we are being held to ransom by an inefficient and pathetic state-owned enterprise named Prasa and its accomplice, Metrorail.

My question to MEC, Donald Grant, is: in light of the above strikes by buses and the impending taxi strikes and [Inaudible.] in the Metrorail, what are the programmes, in future, to alleviate traffic congestion and the lack of an available transport system that is going to be convenient to the commuters at all times? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think it would be important for this House to hear from MEC Grant about what was the position of both of MyCiti in Cape Town and Go George in regard to the bus strike, essentially in the context of the reality that the employer in this particular situation. We are aware of the fact that we have these entities, we are also aware that we have an operating company in George, but was there engagement and were we not able to engage as Government – and possibly

MEC Grant would be able to talk more specifically about Go George - because we are aware that the company set up for MyCiti is not directly its own.

So I think it is very important for us to hear what was actually done and were there stumbling blocks in regard to this process, because it would have actually assisted us if we were able to deal and engage with MyCiti as well as Go George. I think what is particularly important is that we are in a situation now where our country is on the brink of a new dawn. Our President has talked about a compact between labour, between business and Government, and I think the lessons are how do we build on that vision of President Ramaphosa in building a compact, so that the workers of the bus companies actually do not only get a wage, but they actually become part of the ownership structures for cooperatives and actually benefit from the dividends and the profits which are actually made by those companies.

This is the kind of inclusivity and long-term solution, so MEC are there lessons from this and how we can plan for next year's situation? Is it time, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has just about expired, yes. Thank you. The hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you once again. We can no longer tolerate the inefficient and ineffective public transport system that we

have inherited from the dysfunctional ANC-led Government.

Not only are our commuters faced with a dilemma of not reaching their destination on time, but their safety is also at risk when travelling.

During the period of 2015 to 2017, 32 murders and 114 incidents of assault with grievous bodily harm were recorded on trains at railway stations in the Western Cape. However, in 2017, only 12 arrests were made on murder cases and only 59 arrests were made on GBH. This equates to only 37,5% of the incidents of murder reported having led to an arrest and only 51,7% of incidents of GBH have ended up in arrest.

The question is, Minister Grant, what has been done to ensure that our public transport is safe, convenient, reliable and that our commuters can feel at home and protected?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore again.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think it is critical that all of us focus on what clearly needs to be done and that is to ensure that we have safe, reliable and affordable public transport, especially with the rail, because clearly if Metrorail, which yes, does fall under Prasa, was working effectively as it should be, the impact of the bus strike would have been lessened.

I think it is absolutely critical that the Chairperson of the Standing Committee should actually try and follow what MEC Grant is trying to do in terms of this relationship, and that is to actually build a cooperative approach to solve this problem.

I think one of the lessons going forward is how do we as a Standing Committee work with our colleagues in the National Assembly to actually invite the Minister to get a report on this process, because ultimately that is going to give more affordable options. We also know we are dealing with the reality that one of the key challenges is that taxis remain the only mass transport vehicle that are not being subsidised at the moment, and we cannot discuss this issue without also looking at taxis, at rural public transport and strengthening and sorting out the issues at Metrorail.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.  
Hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I just wanted to know how much of our economy has been affected by the bus strike and, Minister, is there any alternative transport system that can be employed and used as those that are providing the services to our commuters are a dismal failure. Is there any alternative transport system that you can propose?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I wish I had half an hour to reply, because some of the questions are very relevant, but I just want to give context to this bus strike which was the original topic for this interpellation.

The strike continued for 27 days, despite the intervention of various mediation bodies, the Minister of Labour and the Minister of Transport, and no, hon member Dugmore, the handbrake did not come from either Go George bus operators or owners, or from MyCiti.

Quite clearly this time the difference was that the inability to reach a solution was found in the bargaining structures themselves. There were five unions represented and all reports indicate that the bargaining positions adopted are on occasions driven by considerations of competition for members. This makes agreement difficult. Although the agreement of three of the unions would normally constitute formal acceptance of an offer from the employers, in these negotiations the unions entered into a pact which required that all five had to agree.

On the employer's side there has to be agreement between both employer associations – the Commuter Bus Employers Association consisting of five employers and the SA Bus Employers Association consisting of 38 employers. This in itself is not straightforward as companies involved work at different contracting frameworks, some of which automatically absorb increases in costs such as remuneration and fuel, and others which do not.

For the companies which do not, the only options are ultimately fare increases and the reliance on increases in the subsidies paid to them.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in the final analysis, our responsibility has to be to the hundreds of thousands of commuters, the hardworking residents of Cape Town who have to manage their lives as workers, students, learners and people wanting to get on with their lives.

The situation also highlights the need to resolve the overall public transport challenges, starting with the rail network. I took this up with the National Minister on Tuesday and in our Minmec this morning, he has agreed to have a special Minmec on public transport before the end of June, and basically the National Minister will also address that matter in his budget debate ...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... tomorrow morning.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Grant, your time has expired. That also brings us to the end of the first interpellation. We move on to Interpellation number 3. Hon member Olivier to Minister Schäfer. I see

Minister Schäfer. [Interjections.]

*Collaboration Schools Programme*

**3. Mr R T Olivier asked the Minister of Education:**

(a) What was the cause of her and her Department initiating the Collaboration Schools Programme and (b) what the failures and successes of this programme have been?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and to hon member Olivier.

As I have stated on numerous occasions and in numerous fora, the Collaboration Schools pilot was initiated in September 2015 for the following reasons:

- Firstly, there are a number of schools that continue to underperform despite high levels of support provided to them.
- Secondly, even new schools in poorer communities often struggle as they cannot afford additional resources that are needed to address socio-economic and academic issues, which can affect their education outcomes. We want the best opportunities for all our learners.



- Thirdly, Quintile 1 and 2 schools receive higher levels of norms and standards funding. However, this is still insufficient to compete with fee-paying schools in the wealthier suburbs and within the constrained funding environment in which the Department operates.
- Fourthly, managing a Department with 1,500 schools and 32,000 teachers is a monumental task and it was felt that it would be beneficial for a new model to be tested, where operating partners are able to be more hands-on and held accountable via agreements with the Education Department and where governing bodies are enabled to appoint staff so they can better cater for the needs and manage the staff themselves.
- Fifthly, recognising these factors a consortium of national and international funders approached Provincial Government and expressed their willingness to fund education to improve learner outcomes in underperforming schools and in marginalised communities. The support was not unconditional and required accountability frameworks to be put in place in terms of governance and curriculum flexibility.

Therefore the design of this project is based on greater management flexibility, coupled with outcomes-based accountability to significantly improve learner results.

Importantly the Collaboration Schools pilot programme is based on a collaboration with non-profit organisations and importantly by agreement of the entire school parent body.

If this pilot can demonstrate significant improvements in learner outcomes within the public system, it could point the way to how the most intractable problems of the education system could be overcome.

Progress thus far includes: in January 2016 five schools, three primary and two high schools, joined the pilot project. In January 2017 two additional schools were added and in January 2018 another three schools were included. As a result of the additional resources we have been able to improve the infrastructure, information technology and learner enrichment at the schools.

In the three primary schools who have participated in 2017, the average pass mark in the Western Cape systemic tests increased by 12 percentage points from 17 to 29%. The average learner scores went up from 34 to 40%.

Improvements in the Grade 3 systemic results were particularly strong, with a 33 percentage point gain in Mathematics in one school and a 13 percentage point increase in Home Language. These results show that substantive improvements can be made, especially in the foundation phase.

Unfortunately the fires that gutted Imizamo Yethu in Hout Bay seriously disrupted the lives of many learners at Silikamva High School, one of the

schools there, and there was a decline in the pass rates in that school last year unfortunately.

There are a number of lessons that emerge from the pilot. First of all it has achieved a high level of engagement with parents.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister Schäfer, your first slot has finished now. I see hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you, MEC, for the response. When we met with the Department of Education in one of our Committee meetings and we looked at this Collaboration Programme, we were told that the Department had a target in the previous year of 40 schools to take part in this Collaboration Programme, but only 20 of those schools were on the programme. I have asked what were the successes and why are we not able to reach the 40 we set ourselves as a target. That is the one issue that I just want to raise.

Secondly, on the issue of this programme, MEC, there has been an outcry with regards to collaboration of schools, particularly with your implementing agents and your funders, as to how the Department arrived at identifying those funders.

You indicated that they approached yourselves as a Department and showed keen interest in getting involved. However, those in the sector believe that the introduction of this programme is a direct contravention of the SASA Act,

indicating that Section 24 and 34 of the Act have been transgressed in this regard.

I would also like the MEC to indicate whether we are not busy with a programme which contravenes the mother act, the National Act, and whether this should be in fact introduced?

The other issue that also has been raised in your own circles is that the representation of the very people that provide funding now have a say in your own governing body, which is also a contravention, because the National Act indicates that we must have learners at school on the governing body, and here we have those who give money on the governing body, making decisions, particularly with the appointment of some of the principals at some of the schools and staff in this. Are you now introducing or semi-privatising public education so that those who have money have got a say in your own schools?

And, lastly on this issue, Langa High has been one of the first schools on this Collaboration Programme, but yet no significant improvements at this school are taking place. They still perform below 50%. I am not even going to 60, your target is 70%, but this school is poorly performing ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... yet we have got this programme in place there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.  
Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Collaboration Schools initiative presents a unique opportunity to improve the quality of education for schools that face a series of different challenges.

The policy made provision for the implementation of a pilot on 31 August 2015 in up to 50 schools over five years. The WCED briefed the Standing Committee on Education in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament earlier this year and highlighted that the pilot has commenced in five public schools since 2016.

A Collaboration School, is defined as:

“An institutional mechanism that partners underperforming schools and schools serving marginalised communities, with a non-profit school operating partner committed to increasing the quality of teaching and learning in that school in order to substantially improve the school’s education or outcomes.”

The initiative consists of a collaboration between Government, donors, no-fee schools and NGOs. This partnership has been formed in an attempt to bring additional expertise, resources, flexibility and greater accountability for all

stakeholders involved.

The ultimate aim of the collaboration serves to test new approaches to improvement and to extend access to quality education in marginalised communities.

Furthermore schools are selected and approved to participate in the Collaboration School's pilot programmes based on the following criteria: primarily it is a primary school focus, with secondary schools targeted where they have a special focus, or where the targeted primary schools are their natural surrounding schools, no-fee schools, new schools and [Inaudible.] schools. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Olivier again.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am happy the Chair of Education just reported – I said 20 schools and he gives even less schools that are on the programme. So I think the MEC will have to clarify that.

I think the main issue, MEC, is based on the report that we have received as a Standing Committee, and which the Department presented to us, they also highlight a lot of pitfalls within this programme in terms of the acceptance of the programme. But my main concern here, as much as we welcome new innovative ideas and getting our schools perform much better, we believe that the modality of this programme seems to suggest many challenges within the system, and as I have raised a few of them: the appointment of teachers and

that unelected donors and operating partners are getting now a free ride to be on the governing body and deciding what needs to be done at those schools, and also the assessment where the operating partners are now even getting access to evaluate and be a part of the evaluation of teachers at schools. Is that is not really trampling on the rights of teachers at the school?

But the last, Mr Deputy Speaker, the issue which really bothers us is that the introduction of this programme seems to not be fully legal, or it contravenes your South African Schools Act, particularly in the area where those who does not have learners at a school, who just bring money, can now donate and bring millions to the school and get an automatic seat on the governing body ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... to ensure that they manage schools and so on.

So that is one of the issues ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has expired.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... that we need to raise.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Kivedo?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo?]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.] †It is important to know there is no school that becomes a Collaboration School without voluntary participation.

The source of all funding comes from the WCED and selected donors, provided certain norms and standards are met. Funding is, however, granted on a means based system. Many of the pilot schools have shown remarkable success in their educational outcomes already, but issues with regards to limited funds have slowed the process of rolling out the pilot to more schools.

I would like to urge the WCED to keep seeking innovative ways to expand quality educational opportunities to those schools in great need to ensure that more opportunities for youth development are granted to learners in our province. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I have raised one school ...  
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just give her the last kick.



Mr R T OLIVIER: Ja. No, that ... [Interjections.] No, I – Mr Deputy Speaker, already ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a draft [Inaudible.].

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, it is not a draft, but the draft will still come. Do not worry about that.

I think, MEC, you should concede that this is one programme that does not necessarily bring about the changes you want us to see in the sector, and I have just raised one school. That are four more schools that I can give you. These are some of the schools that were the first to take part in this programme but yet are not succeeding. I think these schools are a clear indication that maybe this programme you have introduced is not the innovative programme that you thought, that you really need to maybe relook at this programme.

I do not believe, given Langa High and the schools that are not performing, and which are – I have got 29 schools and six of those schools are part of your Collaboration Schools, but instead of performing or increasing their results, they are in fact going backwards. I am asking myself what are the operating partners doing in the school? Are they assisting with governance or in class, in supporting teachers in terms of subject advice and so on? If it is governance, what is it that this programme is not doing which you believe it should be doing?

From where we are standing it seems that this programme, even with the issue of this programme being, a contravention of the Act – whether it does provide what you intend it to provide.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister Schäfer, you can respond.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think the ANC is following the philosophy that if you repeat a lie often enough it becomes the truth, and I am aware that they do not like the idea of accountability mechanisms at all, but we do and where we govern we are going to make sure that those are implemented.

As far as the target of 40 schools is concerned, the pilot's agreement with the funders was to target between 10 and 50 schools. We have got up to 10 and we have not got further simply for the reason that there are not sufficient operating partners at this stage because it is such a new project in South Africa and there are not a whole lot of people sitting around waiting. So people are being developed all along to make sure that we have more operating partners.

There is not a lot of outcry about implementing agents and funders, there has only been an outcry from certain quarters, some unions, for reasons that will become obvious, and also from one, now pretty much discredited, NGO, where ... [Interjection.] ... they also keep on saying that the funders are

sitting on the governing bodies. They are not. The funders are funding. They enter into contracts with the operating partners and the operating partners get seats on the governing body. The funders do not sit on the governing body. And I have also said before that funders are not going to plough money into a bottomless pit like they see in ANC run governments, and we as the DA Government are quite happy to give them that assurance, that their money will not be wasted and will not be stolen. That it will go towards what they are trying to achieve, which is better education.

As far as going against SASA. SASA I have explained before and, hon member Olivier, again I will say it is not ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can repeat it. We will still remember.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... the mother Act. The Constitution provides education, basic education as a concurrent competency, where Provincial Government can make our own laws that may conflict with National Legislation, except in certain circumstances which we do not believe is covered by this project. So we are allowed to go against the SASA actually. Go read your Constitution.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] to mess up.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Then as far as Langa High School is concerned. Well, I think a pass rate of 34 to 49% is quite significant. Under

the previous non-collaboration school it was a 34% matric pass rate.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I know it does not say much about my Department, but it is a huge improvement. It is nowhere near enough ...

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Your time is up.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Is it?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow you one sentence, Minister Schäfer, if you want to. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: So no, I do not concede that we should give up this project. I think it is yielding extremely good results ... [Interjections.] and where people wanted to ... [Interjections.] they were allowed to vote for it again at Oranjekloof and they unanimously agreed to continue with it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That brings us to the end of Interpellations. We move on to Questions for Oral Reply. Questions standing over from Thursday, 10 May. The first question hon member Botha to Minister Schäfer again. Question number 1.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Questions standing over from Thursday, 10 May 2018, as agreed to by the House:*

### *School placements: online applications*

**1. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Education:**

How many of the more than 3 880 learners in the Western Cape who have to date not yet been placed in schools had made online applications?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker. If I can just ...

The answer to the question, hon member Botha, through the Deputy Speaker, is that the WCED does not currently have 3,880 unplaced learners. These statistics, I think you were referring to towards the end of January. The figure is of course always a moving target, because people keep coming to the province.

At the moment the figure for learners looking for places, this does not necessarily mean that they are not in any school, some of them wanting to go to other schools of choice, is 987.

These are not those whose applications have been captured online by schools, but are a set of particularly difficult cases. For example:

- Late arrivals.
- Children in private schools that want to move to state schools.
- Cases where parents have not accepted places offered at schools that are not their first choice or they are geographically too far away.
- Children affected by issues of medium of instruction.
- Issues of subjects offered.
- And in some cases where the set of local schools are full.

Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Botha, no further questions on this one. Do you we move – hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, can the MEC just repeat how many learners are not at school? I hear whether they applied – I missed that point, because she was too quick for me.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You did not miss anything, she did not say anything.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: What is new, hon member Olivier?

No, the number that are looking for places is 987. We do not break down separately for in and out of school or changing from one school to another.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, your second opportunity.

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, we are getting almost into the third quarter and I have asked this question before as to whether we are going to be able to place these 987 learners and whether you have sufficient plans in place, catch-up plans to ensure that at least they are managing to have some sort of education, because I am sure it is school going aged learners that are still sitting at home?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Some of them may well be, but when they arrive at the beginning of April in the Western Cape it is very difficult for us to place learners, although we do so on an ongoing basis wherever possible.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Can the Minister tell us of that 987 are there any matriculants in that number and how many?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I am not aware of any. I have not got it, but I will have to get that figure for you specifically, hon member Botha. Sorry, I have not got that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, your last opportunity.

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, I hear what you are saying. These are some late applications, but obviously these are school going aged learners and they are now in the province. It is not their fault that are here and as an MEC and as a Department you should find all possible ways to get these learners to school. Is there a plan in place that these learners must be placed in school as soon as possible because they are now losing out and it might not be their fault that they are at home?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. As I said yes, we are placing everyone that comes here as soon as possible, but there are, we are starting to find that there are some areas where there simply is no longer any space in certain schools.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the second question. Hon member Mackenzie again to Minister Schäfer. Question 2.

*Computer laboratories: schools*

**2. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether there are any computer laboratories or whether there is access to computers at the (a) Aloe High School, (b) AZ Berman High School, (c) Cascade Primary School and (d) Tafelsig High School in Mitchells Plain; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Why are they picking on you? You are the only one answering.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I do not know. I do not know.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not okay.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I agree.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie.

Mr P UYS: You were not here the last time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The answer to the question is – 2 (a) Aloe High School. Yes, there are computer laboratories. At Aloe High School we have:

- Broadband internet connectivity connected with 100 megs per second speed.
- A slim lab with:
  - One teacher one learner venue, WiFi connected.
  - 20 learner tablets.
  - Two teacher tablet notebooks.
  - Storage cabinet.
  - Projector and a mini server, and
- A computer applications technology laboratory with 28 workstations in 2016 / 2017, and they have telematics technology.

At A Z Berman High School, also:

- Broadband connectivity with 10 megs per second.
- The slim lab with:
  - A mini PC roll-out,
  - 20 desktops with wireless access,
  - 8 smart classrooms,
  - 24 learner tablets and two teacher tablet notebooks, a storage cabinet, projector and mini server.

Cascade Primary School:

- Broadband internet connectivity with 10 megs per second.
- Slim lab:
  - Mini PC roll-out,
  - 20 desktops with wireless access,
  - 24 learner tablets,
  - Two teacher tablet notebooks ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do you believe the list you are reading?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... a storage cabinet ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I do ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do you really believe that list?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I do.

- A projector and a mini server.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Or you are just reading?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Tafelsig High School. We also have:

- Broadband connectivity with 10 megs per second.
- Full LAN.
- All instruction rooms connected to WiFi.
- ICT lab:
  - 25 desktops,
  - Computer applications technology in 2014 / 2015, and
  - 19 smart classrooms, which include:

- A teacher notebook,
- Interactive board,
- Visualizer, and
- Data projector.
- 24 learner tablets
- Two teacher tablet notebooks,
- Storage cabinet,
- Projector and a mini server ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can just submit that, you do not have to read everything.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... and a telematics technology receiver dish ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can submit it.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... and presentation technology.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] go to the schools to see this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Minister Schäfer, for the response. How does this fit in to Government's e-Learning programme? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie. The e-Learning strategy obviously is that we are wanting to phase in, technology and broadband access to every school in the Western Cape. It will obviously

be budget dependent, but the idea is that we will ensure that all our schools are connected to the internet, creating an enabling environment for them to get hold of online content to improve their education outcomes.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must just watch your back [Inaudible.].

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, and can you just tell us, Minister Schäfer, how many students are currently benefitting from this programme?

[Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Go to the school and ask them too.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: At the moment in these schools there are:

- At Aloe High School – 1,035 learners and 29 educators.
- A Z Berman – 859, 25 educators.
- Cascade – 1,066 ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: That is a new question.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... and 30 educators, and

- Tafelsig – 1,553 and 35 educators. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And can the Minister tell us will this be rolled out to all the other schools in Mitchells Plain as well?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The intention, as I said, is to roll it out to all schools in the Western Cape. Mitchells Plain is part of the Western Cape so it certainly is, yes. They are very far down the line in Mitchells Plain.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your last opportunity.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes, and does the Minister perhaps have an indication by when? I know you said they are very far down the line, but an indication by when? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Okay. At the moment we have 59 of 60 schools in the area on the initial broadband roll-out list. Four not yet active broadband schools are scoped for this year and schools with broadband that have not been served with slim labs are scoped for implementation this year. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Question number 3. Again the hon member Mackenzie to Minister Schäfer. Question 3.

*Internet access: schools*

**3. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether there is any internet access at the (a) Aloe High School, (b) AZ Berman High School, (c) Cascade Primary School and (d) Tafelsig High School in Mitchells Plain; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Which one is this now? Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 3 standing over.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I have too many questions today. Number?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Number 3 standing over from the previous week.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Three standing over?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 3.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, okay, sorry.

Mr S G TYATYAM: That same question.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It is very similar to the previous one. Yes

... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, Aloe has internet connectivity, 100 megs per second and the other three schools at 10 megs per second.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie, a follow-up?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Can the Minister tell us is this service available after hours, weekend classes etcetera?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Our intention in the Education Department is to ensure that it is available as much as possible. Obviously it is up to the school to manage that and to make arrangements, but they certainly have the intention to allow people to use it after school. Obviously it is not going to be 24 hours. There will have to be measures put in place for the safety of the school and the equipment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, will you agree that, and maybe this is an unfair question to you, our Committee meetings are open to all members to come and engage ... [Interjections.], but yes, it may – MEC, I see that this question is directed to certain schools in a circuit or in a district. Can you just confirm with us that this is a programme rolled out to all schools in the province



within your budget?

So this programme, it is not only for schools in certain circuits and so on, or is that so?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, it is, hon member Olivier. As you say Committee meetings are open for all members and we have made presentations on this to the Committee previously. [Interjections.] But yes, the intention is there. There are some schools in very rural areas where we are having to try and find a different solution which is taking longer, but the intention is yes, to do so in all schools.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We will then move on to the next question. Question 4 will stand over. Question number 9. Hon member Gillion to Minister Fritz. Minister Fritz?

*Judicial commission of inquiry into child murders*

**9. Ms M N Gillion asked the Minister of Social Development:**

What steps is he taking to ensure that a judicial commission of inquiry into child murders in the province is instituted, as has been requested by several civil-rights societies?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The question asked what am I doing? Unfortunately I do not have any legal competency to commit or to commission any judicial commission of

inquiry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can the hon Minister Fritz inform this House the outcomes of research done by his Department on this issue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Fritz?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I can, but that is a new question. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, your second opportunity.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I will ask another follow-up question, because it is not a new question, it is relevant to this question ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: So ask him [Inaudible.].

Ms M N GILLION: ... of the Commissioner. I will ask the question. Can hon Minister Fritz share with this House the team of researchers used by his Department to bring out the report presented to the Premier?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That is the question. Minister Fritz, if you

want to respond to that?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I actually can answer the question, but I really think it is a new question.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because the hon member asked me very specifically what I have done to call for a commission of inquiry and I cannot, I do not have any legal competency.

But the hon member was also – and I must say very, very honourably – part of, in attendance at the Petitions Committee with the hon member Lennit Max, hon member Kivedo and hon member Hinana, where we as a Committee and where our Department presented – that was held on 20 April ... [Interjections.]

That meeting was attended by all civil society and children were kept out of school to come to that meeting, you know, specifically the societies referenced by the hon member.

The Department made a very extensive representation and gave feedback to or on the progress, including the share presentations, which provided some insights on the view and the review of existing research and data on child murders that have been committed in the Western Cape. That research was conducted by three Western Cape universities and other experts in the field,

and the Provincial Department is meeting with those NGO petitioners to share information and will duly report back to the Petitions Committee. So, that was done. We have given an extensive – we, in fact, gave our full, thick report that the hon member was part of, so I – anyway. So, to say that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Gillion, you have another opportunity.

Ms M N GILLION: I do not think my questions must be – †dit moenie bevraagteken word deur die LUR nie, want hy moet dit met die Huis deel. [It should not be questioned by the MEC, because he has to share it with the House.] I have got the facts and I am doing follow-up out of the research and the issues that I have asked from his Department.

So, my question, my follow-up question is, I want the MEC to share with this House, the team of researchers that was used by his Department; can he give this House the reassurance that that team of researchers is representing the diversity of ideologies in this province?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, unfortunately, child murders are child murders. There are no ideologies involved. Children get killed. Mortuary reports are mortuary reports. Deaths are deaths. You find dead bodies in mortuaries. It is not “this body is like, oh

who is this”? That body is a communist, that body is a nationalist, this body is a super communist. There are no ideologies in death.

We just find ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: There are ideologies in research!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Those researchers are all from specifically children’s institutes. All the credible institutions on child research in this province were involved and if the member wants to see those, then we will give all the stuff to the Petitions Committee and give all the facts to her. She did not ask me that in the first question, so I do not know who they are.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your last opportunity, hon member Gillion?

†Me M N GILLION: My laaste opvolgvraag, sal die agb LUR vir sy HOD vra om ‘n *revised team of researchers* te vra om te kyk of dit dieselfde uitkoms gaan hê?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Ms M N GILLION: My last follow-up, will the hon MEC ask his HOD to request a revised team of researchers to see if it will have the same outcome?]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb Minister?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?]

†Die MINISTER VAN SOSIALE ONTWIKKELING: Ongelukkig was die –

[The MINISTER VAN SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Unfortunately, the]

†research was done, you see. It was extensive research that was done ...

[Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: We will come back to that.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The mortuary has the same bodies. The other researchers will probably find the same.

Ms M N GILLION: It has got nothing to do with mortuaries.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It has got everything to do with dead bodies.

Ms M N GILLION: Nothing!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, you know, some people have this notion that this type of research gets that outcome. [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: You see [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You know, just stop doing ideological ... [Interjection.]

†Me M N GILLION: Nee! Nee-nee [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Ms M N GILLION: No! No-no [Interjection.]]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let us focus on stopping the killing of children in this province. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let us stop the killing of children.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let us do research and stop the killing and stop having political motives and stuff and all this nonsense.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to new questions. Number 1, hon Mackenzie to Minister Schäfer. Minister Schäfer.

*New questions*

*Mitchells Plain: acts of vandalism*

**1. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether any acts of vandalism occurred at schools in Mitchells Plain during the holiday period of December 2017 and January 2018; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Two cases of burglary and vandalism at schools in Mitchells Plain were reported during the holiday period of December 2017 and January 2018. In one case part of the inner perimeter fence was stolen, three panels. Estimated cost of the damages and the loss was R4 500. The matter was reported to the local SAPS.

The second case: the school reported a burglary in one of their workshops during the weekend of 25 December. Someone went Christmas shopping. Entry was gained through the roof. Two gas tanks, one cutting machine was stolen, tools, welding masks, a motor and additional equipment also in the workshop were stolen. Estimated cost was just over R100 000. The matter was reported to the SAPS as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are we done? Thank you. We move on to the – so Question 2 will stand over. Similarly Question 3 will stand over. Question 4 will stand over. Question 5 will stand over. Question 6 will stand over and Question 7 and Question 8. That brings us then to the end of question time. We move to Statements by Members. I first see the DA. Hon Simmers.



*[Questions 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 7 and 8 stand over.]*

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, over the last few weeks I have had the privilege to be part of the Standing Committee of Local Government, which held public hearings on a Bill which has awoken so many questions of identity and self-worth across many communities in our province.

†Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, “die soeke en verstaan oor waar kom ons vandaan” spreek van ‘n uitroep deur ons gemeenskappe aan alle verkose publieke verteenwoordigers, ongeag ons sfeer waarin ons verkies is om hulle te dien, om hul diverse uniekheid met die aanspraak om gelyke erkenning te balanseer met regverdigheid.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr Deputy Speaker, “the searching and understanding of where do we come from” speaks of a cry by our communities to all elected public representatives, irrespective of our sphere we have been elected in to serve them, to balance their diverse uniqueness with the claim to equal recognition with fairness.]

†As the question of identity and self-worth has and will become more

prominent within the microsphere within our community, servanthood leadership from across all party lines is what is needed now to ensure more than ever that South Africa belongs to us all and it is time that we as public representatives need to remember this.

The struggle for freedom was not so that some may be served and others not, but the struggle for freedom was for all to be served at the end of the day. Mr Deputy Speaker, as the DA we believe that an efficient political and public administration is a critical enabler for creating an open opportunity society for all, as it lays the foundation for a partnership approach between the Government and South African citizens, in which the Government works to deliver these opportunities and citizens take responsibilities to use these opportunities to improve their own lives, but the key stakeholder or partner in all of this is all elected representatives and we therefore need to remember that we are here to serve every community and each individual within its microsphere. I thank you.

†AGB LEDE: Mooi!

[HON MEMBERS: Good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC. Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Yes, thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The DA lurches directionless between problems for many years now. The latest is another embarrassing defeat in the Western Cape High Court where it lost against one of its own.

The ink was barely dry on Patricia de Lille's interdict judgement, when DA leaders declared the Judge did not restore her as Executive Mayor, which he did, but that she is ceremonial only.

This is contempt of our judicial system, in breach of the court order and in contradiction of the DA's claim that it believes in the rule of law and constitutionality. When the Court's judgment is uncomfortable for the DA, it attacks the Judge and reinterprets the finding. Not only Nielsen but also MEC Madikizela joined in this.

Now the DA says the Cape Town Mayor may not take decisions, but the DA caucus will do that, which is not a statutory council structure, but the Mayor is suspended from DA structures. This is typical DA double standards.

The whole of South Africa is disgusted with the DA's misrule and terrible governance. The supporters of that party have every reason not to vote DA again, as it is in turmoil and it lost its way. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I see the DA. Hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The uncertainty in the economic conditions for investment and job opportunities is caused by the policy uncertainty in the ruling party. On the one hand the President is encouraging investments into South Africa and on the other hand the very same ANC makes policies that scare investors away and allow state owned

entities like SAA to create a big hole in Treasury budgets – money that should be used for service delivery.

A year ago, the ANC voted against the EFF motion on land without compensation and almost a year later, because they are scared by the EFF's emotional threats, voted to support the EFF on the review of ... [Interjection.] Section 25 of the Constitution. When allegations of maladministration surfaced in the City of Cape Town, it was the ANC who called for heads to roll, yet it was the same ANC who, months later, changed their stance on the matter trying to score political points.

†Indien die ANC omgee vir die mense van die Wes-Kaap, sal hulle die DA ondersteun en die ANC President vra om spesiale eenhede weer in te stel om die bendegeweld en dwelmsindikate wat ons gemeenskappe verwoes, tot 'n einde te bring en waar nodig die Weermag te gebruik om die polisie te beskerm sodat hulle hul werk kan doen.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[If the ANC cares for the people of the Western Cape they will support the DA and ask the ANC President to reintroduce special units to stop the gang violence and drug syndicates destroying our communities, and where necessary use the Defence Force to protect the police so that they can do their job.]

Double standards, ANC, double standards!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In the absence of the EFF, again the DA. Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, as we embark on an awareness month for the elderly which commenced on 15 May until 15 June 2018 as part of the “Go Turquoise 4 the Elderly” campaign, I am pleased that the Western Cape Department of Social Development has a specific service to older persons programme.

Among others, this programme has a developmental approach to ageing and seeks to keep older persons in their families and communities for as long as possible. I also welcome the Department’s commitment to increasing the funding levels over the medium-term expenditure framework to ensure that care and support for older person, who are in residential facilities and community based care support service centres, continue throughout the province.

This is once again a clear demonstration of the DA-led Western Cape Government’s caring nature. I call on the Provincial Minister of Social Development, Albert Fritz, to ensure that programmes for the elderly are not neglected, are implemented effectively and that they remain a priority for the Department.

It is vital that we continue utilising the wisdom and skills of our older persons in our society, while as per the Older Persons Act 13 of 2006, we continue to protect the rights, status, wellbeing, safety and security of the aged.

Stats South Africa reveals that we have more than 640 000 persons aged over 60 years and it is estimated that this will grow to more than 755 000 by 2021. As the DA in the Western Cape, we call on all stakeholders to, throughout this month, support this Turquoise initiative and to celebrate and protect our elderly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ANC. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM (ANC): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ongoing genocide perpetuated in the Palestinian territories must come to an end immediately. In this week alone 80 people were killed and thousands wounded at the Gaza Border. Unarmed men, women and children were shot, mostly in the back. Others left maimed and disfigured.

The Netanyahu regime deserves condemnation, but some in the world still offer all sorts of excuses, even here. The killings are reminiscent of apartheid-style state murders, in order to oppress the people in the land of their birth.

However, the DA is soft on this issue as it continues to do business with Netanyahu's country and supports companies that aid the genocide.

An HON MEMBER: So does the ANC Government.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The horrific Palestinian killings continue relentlessly. [Interjection.] USA President, Mr Donald Trump's opening of his office in Jerusalem added fuel to the fire, but it will not last long as 300 years like the apartheid system and the colonial system here in South Africa. It is coming to an end.

The ANC supports our Government's recalling of our ambassador to the area and calls for more measures, including diplomatic and otherwise, against those atrocities and an urgent independent investigation into the slaughter of the people of Palestine, to hold anyone responsible, accountable for the atrocities.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, member. The DA, hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Quarterly Labour Force Survey released by Statistics South Africa revealed that the Western Cape has created 123 000 new jobs.

Our province managed to produce more jobs than any other province, despite

grappling with the effects of a devastating once in every 400 years drought in a water intensive, provincial economy and a weak economic climate created by the National Government.

In light of the survey's disclosure, the Western Cape remains the province with the lowest extended unemployment rate in South Africa at 22,5% - a whopping 14,2% below the national average and 11,1% below our nearest competitor, Gauteng Province, which is supposed to be South Africa's economic power house.

This, Mr Deputy Speaker, is a fine line between the DA's good governance and the ANC's rot. [Interjection.]

Compared with other provinces the survey furthermore revealed that the Western Cape boasts the lowest number of discouraged work seekers with the lowest number of economically inactive citizens while ANC-led governments in the Western Cape, Mpumalanga and the North West consistently record a year on year increase in unemployment and economically inactive citizens.

What is clear, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that the results of the Labour Force Quarterly Survey by Stats South Africa are a vindication of the Western Cape's Government's unwavering commitment to empower and service residents through creation of sustainable jobs and employment opportunities.

Our DA-led Government has managed to yet again pull a rabbit out of a hat



amid a devastating drought, anti-investment policies by a corrupt ANC National ... [Interjection.] Government in a volatile economic environment. To this one end, one can only come to the conclusion that where the DA governs, people enjoy the dignity of work, whereas where the ANC governs people are condemned to a life of poverty and hardship. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP welcomes the sentencing of former Western Cape Police Commissioner, Arno Lamoer, with businessman Saleem Dawjee and former police brigadiers, Darius van der Ross and Colin Govender.

Arno Lamoer and Saleem Dawjee were jailed for corruption, sentenced to 8 years with 2 years suspended. Darius van der Ross was jailed for 4 years, with 2 years suspended and Colin Govender was sentenced to 6 years, with 2 years suspended.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this proves again that no-one is above the law. Making an example of these high-ranking police officers is the right message to send out to the police officials that are still corrupt, and the message sent out to them is that they will be caught, convicted and jailed. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI (ANC): Thank you. The DA painted itself into a stupid corner. It is shameful to the DA when its ousted Cape Town Executive Mayor, Patricia de Lille was reinstated by the Western Cape High Court. It is because the DA failed the residents of the Mother City and caused service delivery to suffer. [Interjections.]

The DA shenanigans were evident when amidst a severe drought ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... De Lille was removed by the DA-meddling mini-leader, Mmusi Maimane, to be replaced by a clueless Ian Neilson and team. DA postulation aside, the admission in newspapers since the weekend by its spokesperson on De Lille and the fake Deputy Party Leader, Natasha Mazzone, is that the failure on water management was by the DA itself. [Interjection.] That was a startling revelation.

So, it was not the National Government, the rain fairy tale stories or anyone else the DA blamed before. It was the DA. The DA's own poor management and sluggish responsiveness to other problems are responsible for the mess the Cape finds itself in and all other things, like the false Days Zero, are just smoke and mirrors. Lies, lies and more lies of the DA. [Interjections.]

The DA lied all along ... [Interjections.] to hide its own bad governance,

failed service delivery and bad management of a scarce resource. Lies, lies, lies! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And more lies!

*[The Speaker takes the Chair.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA. [Interjections.] Order please members. Hon Makeleni, there is also a naughty corner.

An HON MEMBER: Welcome back, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Kivedo, you may continue.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. We need to increase our efforts around making it a priority to tackle racism in early childhood education if it is to encourage young people to appreciate all different forms of diversity.

These early years of a child is a period of intense learning for children. It is therefore a critical opportunity to begin the process of learning to appreciate each other equally and to be positive about people who are different from themselves as well as those who are similar to them.

National Government should endeavour and be encouraged to make the necessary links between the way our young children learn racial attitudes and behaviour and its own commitment to issues around social cohesion and nation building.

While it is hard to be optimistic about race in our country, in the face of constant reminders that all is not well, we need to enthusiastically promote civil rights and diversity in our schools and the rest of the education sector.

Madam Speaker, diversity in schools and in education in whatever form, whether whites teach in black schools and blacks teach in white schools, provides powerful examples of how minds and hearts are opened by virtue of engaging meaningfully with diverse peers, both inside and outside classrooms.

As the DA in the Western Cape we believe that promoting diversity in schools and education ultimately needs to be included in any attempts to achieve true national building. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kivedo. That is the end of Members Statements. We now move to Notices of Motion. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon member Joseph.

## **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates rural economic development in the Western Cape. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the continued support of the Netanyahu regime by the DA-run Western Cape Government. [Interjections.]

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon Wenger and then the hon member Joseph.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the SAPS human resource and manpower challenges at police station level in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. [Interjections.] I see the hon member Joseph.

An HON MEMBER: Sorry. If we can listen to the speech

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the damage caused to South Africa under the leadership of the previous President Jacob Zuma. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: We are still on Jacob Zuma?

The SPEAKER: We now move to Motions without Notice. Are there any motions ... [Interjections.] Sorry? Hon member Tyatyam, are you on Notices of Motion?

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.] hon member Dugmore.

The SPEAKER: So, it is not you even?

Mr P UYS: Hon Dugmore is not with us.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore is clearly not with us. Member Joseph, you may proceed in the meantime.

Mr D JOSEPH: Member Dugmore is still looking for his motion.  
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You cannot speak for someone else.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Dugmore. Member Joseph is on his feet. If you could hold on, please.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You had a proxy there.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the unemployment of youth with reference to education, skills training and job opportunities. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the escalating taxi violence in the Western Cape under the rule of the Democratic Alliance.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is a national problem. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any more notices ... [Interjections.] Order please! Are there any more notices of motion? Hon Tyatyam, my last call. Notices of Motion?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No.

The SPEAKER: You are not with me. I am now moving on to Motions with Notice. I see the hon Hinana. I see hon Tyatyam. [Interjections.] Sorry. No-no, I am now at Motions without Notice. I am moving along. I see the hon Hinana, I see hon Tyatyam and hon Kivedo. That three first. Next round hold



on please. The Table will help me.

### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends MyCiti Bus for providing commuters whose tickets expired during the bus strike services with reimbursements for the number of days that they could have made use of the services due to the recent strike action; further calls on all other bus service providers to follow suit. I so move.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They are all doing that. They are going up in flames.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved ...  
[Interjections.] Okay. There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, this is a sitting of Parliament, not a school yard. Can we just compose ourselves here?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That side!

The SPEAKER: This is serious business we are busy with. Hon member Tyatyam, speak to me please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I move without notice:

That the House notes the holy month of Ramadan started today. Notes further that for the Muslim community; this is an annual event representing a time of fasting and devotion with a particular focus on prayer, purification, charitable acts and wishes Muslim communities in the Western Cape, Al Ramadan Kareem.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is no objection. I see the hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the brutal and violent attack on the Verulum Mosque near Durban, hoping that the perpetrators of this cowardly act will be arrested, prosecuted and sentenced. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. The next round is hon Dijana, hon Botha and hon Makeleni. That is the next three.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the changes and improved procedural policies that Minister Gugile Nkwinti introduced to the Department of Water and Sanitation, which are intended to cut down bureaucratic hassles and speed up the implementation of infrastructure projects; notes further that through this new work regime the Minister pledged to provide the budget to start the Clanwilliam Dam Project, which has been put on hold for the past 8 years and commends the Minister for his action. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Sorry, Minister Madikizela? [Interjections.] Minister Madikizela. I posed a question. You were involved in a conversation.

An HON MEMBER : It I only asked when ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: I put the question: are there any objections to the motion being moved – there is no objection. The next individual was ...

[Interjections.] sorry, it is member Botha. Member Hinana if you could just hold on. I had called three. I am asking the Table staff to guide me after member Botha is done? Member Makeleni and then member Mackenzie. Have we got that? And then member Hinana takes the next first round. I see you, hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the heroic and compassionate gesture by two taxi drivers, Yaseen Abrahams and Ashraf Cassiem, who are offering free taxi rides for pensioners according to “Good Things Guy.com”;

The pair initiated free rides for the elderly, because they were tired of losing money to gang members who intimidated them for free fares opting to help the elderly instead. Since their story broke, the two taxi drivers have been working hard in persuading other taxi drivers to start offering the same service;

The duo’s taxi boss, David Roman, has supported the efforts to the extent that he launched a programme called “Taxi Give Back”, which was launched on 2 May 2018 and have already signed up 30 taxi drivers. I move that the House acknowledges and lauds the benevolent efforts of Mr Abrahams and Mr Cassiem. They are the agents of change which the City and the Western Cape needs. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. The next person is hon Makeleni. I see the hon Makeleni, after which it is hon member Mackenzie.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes National Social Development Minister Susan Shabangu's assistance to the Khayelitsha family who lost 8 people in a fire last week; notes further that Minister Shabangu committed to help the family by providing burial assistance, food parcels and paying for DNA tests and commends the Minister for her visit and assistance.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections.] There is an objection. [Interjections.] Order please. It will be printed. Hon member Mackenzie. [Interjections.] Ladies, hon members, there is a member on the floor. Hon Makeleni, please.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Government on their success in creating 123 000 jobs in quarter one.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Hinana. [Interjections.] Order, order please.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. I move without notice:

That the House condemns ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There is too much noise. Hon member Hinana kindly take your seat please. There is too much noise. Minister Madikizela, you are not being a very good example here today, please. [Interjections.] Do not engage them because, do not engage outside of this sitting. Please, Minister. And to the members who are responding, hon members, please. You may proceed hon Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns, in the strongest terms possible, the illegal land invasions, the violent protests and the destruction of municipal, private and public properties; this has spanned from Vrygrond to Masiphumulele to Zwelihle in Overstrand, Siqalo and any other place in

the country. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Ms P MAKELENI: We want our land!

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? Is that an objection? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon Tyatyam after which I see the hon member Nkondlo.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Madam Speaker, it is me and Netanyahu today. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns in the strongest possible terms the latest acts of violence and aggression carried out by the armed forces which resulted in the death of more than 80 people and thousands injured; further notes that the Netanyahu government kills innocent people, protesting against illegal occupation of their land. This Netanyahu act is similar to the apartheid regime; also notes that this regime continues to enjoy massive support from the DA and calls on the Provincial Executive to cut all ties with heinous governments and welcomes the withdrawal of South Africa's ambassador to the area, following the murder of protesters at the Gaza border.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There are objections. [Interjections.] Hon members, before I get to hon Nkondlo ... [Interjections.] I just want to draw your attention. There is a difference between a statement and a motion without notice. Let us be very clear ... [Interjection.] I am speaking to the House at large, hon member Tyatyam. If the shoe fits you wear it. Hon member Nkondlo? Thank you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the failure of the DA-led Government in the City of Cape Town that has sold land in Scottsdene meant for social housing to private developers, whilst thousands of families are in need of houses; notes further that this untenable situation has led to violence and injury of ordinary people of whom some have been shot by live ammunition by the private security appointed by developers and calls on the DA Government to explain this insatiable hunger to sell off Government land to private hands instead of using it to redress the imbalances of the past, including providing the poor with affordable houses, and calls for calm in our communities as people and children are forced to sleep in plastic tents. Where is the right to shelter? Such is freedom under the DA Government.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the ... [Interjection.]



An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Lekker, I saw your hand. Members, there's a member on the floor please. You may proceed, hon member Lekker.

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the recent announcement by National Police Minister, Bheki Cele, that he and National Police Commissioner, Khehla Sitole, have agreed to prioritise the Western Cape in terms of support, with the police personnel as well as resource allocation; notes further that the promise was made at a police imbizo held in Philippi East to deal with residents' safety concerns; and commends the Ministers and Commissioner for prioritising the Western Cape, especially Cape Flats areas where gangs are terrorising communities while the DA Government is ignoring the people's plight.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objection? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon

Kivedo. [Interjections.] You may proceed, hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the resignation of Mrs Tshepo Motsepe, General Secretary of Equal Education, amidst allegations of sexual harassment. This raises serious concerns regarding NGO's working in our schools and calls on the WCED to ensure that there are adequate measures in place to ensure the safety of our learners. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. I see the hon Tyatyam after which I see the hon member Lekker.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Detective Pieter Williams and Constable Alfredo Lucas who responded to a robbery in De Doorns and notes that they fought the robbers gallantly and arrested six of them, yesterday.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

†AGB LEDE: Mooi! Mooi!

[HON MEMBERS: Well done! Well done!]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There is no objection. †Daar is geen beswaar. [There is no objection.]Hon member Lekker, you may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: †Enkosi, [Thank you,] †Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the rising numbers of innocent young people dying at the hands of gangs in the Cape Flats, following the slaying of Gary Fourie (30) who was shot 17 times at St Montague Village, near Lavender Hill last week as he refused to join a gang in the area; condemns his killing and conveys condolences to his family. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is no objection. I see the hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

The SPEAKER: With notice.

Ms D GOPIE: Motion without.

The SPEAKER: Without notice.

Ms D GOPIE: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that a DA councillor is accused of organising jobs for pals by interfering with a City of Cape Town contract worth R2 million to paint council rental houses in Hanover Park and calls on the ... [Interjection.]

†'n AGB LID: Al weer!

[An HON MEMBER: Again!]

Ms D GOPIE:

...and calls on the Provincial Government to investigate the ...  
[Interjection.]

†'n AGB LID: Hulle wil nie hoor nie!

[An HON MEMBER: They do not want to listen!]

Ms D GOPIE:

...conduct of the councillor, Antonio van der Rheede.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. I see the hon Kivedo, then hon Tyatyam. And then hon Lekker in that order.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy diepe skok en walging uitspreek teenoor die wrede en tragiese wyse waarop die 15-jarige leerder aan die Hoërskool John Ramsay in Bishop Lavis, Robin November, haar lewe onlangs verloor het. Ons innigste medelye aan haar gesin, geliefdes, die skoolgemeenskap van die Hoërskool John Ramsay en haar talle vriende. Mag haar siel in vrede rus. Ek stel so voor.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deep shock and disgust on the cruel and

tragic manner in which the 15-year old learner at the John Ramsay High School in Bishop Lavis, Robin November, had lost her life recently. Our sincerest condolences to her family, loved ones, the school community of the John Ramsay High School and her many friends. May her soul rest in peace. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

†Die SPEAKER: Is daar enige beswaar teen die voorstel? Geen beswaar.  
 [The SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion? No objection.] †I see the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Department of Labour for opening an office in De Doorns and hosting a successful open day on Saturday; further notes the overwhelming attendance at the exhibits and also recording the high need of services by the exploited farm workers.

†‘n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without

notice? There are no objections. Hon Lekker and then hon Nceba Hinana.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Cape Town discontinued the Hanover Park Ceasefire Project. Notes further that the project was designed to reduce gun violence on the Cape Flats and also notes that by not budgeting for this project the DA-run City admitted the failure of the project. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. I see the hon Hinana, after which I see hon Kivedo and then hon member Dugmore.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House appreciates the public condemnation of ANC NEC member, Manana Mduduzi, without any sympathy for his continuous abuse and cruelty against women, I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. I see the hon ... [Interjection.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Kivedo, I think you might have got it wrong. It was member Dugmore and then you.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I am sorry.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice – I mean, excuse me, sorry Speaker.

The SPEAKER: It happens to the best of us.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Okay. Thank you. My sincere apologies.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo! Haibo!

The SPEAKER: Order please. Member Joseph.

Ms M N GILLION: He is a Deputy Chief Whip and he is like that! He casts aspersions on our members.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon member Dugmore. The Chairperson



has spoken.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the breakthrough in Hermanus today where the developer who bought the Schulphoek land for only R6 million, has agreed to enter into negotiations for the return of this land to the Hermanus Municipality and salutes all those involved in helping to bring about a lasting peace, unity and development of the Overstrand.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. I now see the hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: And I say thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I hereby move without notice:

That the House congratulates Philasanda Madjikela, a matric learner at Eerste River High School, Western Cape, who recently won the accolade as best performing artist in 4 dramas at the National Drama Festival held at Artscape in Cape Town. Well done! I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections. I see the hon Nkondlo after which I see the hon Mitchell and then the hon member Dugmore.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with dismay that yesterday, Wednesday, 16 May, the DA councillor, Mr Grant Twigg, decided to cancel a planned meeting with North Pine community, supposed to discuss issues of water tariffs and meters, because Scottsdale community was in attendance; condemns the cancellation of the meeting as the DA councillor felt his safety was at risk, despite the entourage of Metro Police at the venue and condemns that a councillor running away from his own community is a shame and surely it is time for him to go and the DA to go too.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections.] Yes, there is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice that the House notes with deep concern and shock another case of misconduct against an Equal Education management member, Mr Luyolo Mazwembe,

after he allegedly offered a job for sex to a volunteer. I so move.  
[Interjections.] Another one! [Interjections.] Another one! Another one!

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without ... [Interjections.] There is no objection. I see the hon Dugmore after which I see hon Kivedo.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the end of the protracted national bus strike, which started on 18 April 2018 and has finally come to an end after unions and employers reached an agreement and notes further that this is a victory for the employees, especially those of MyCiti who were subject to difficult labour conditions by the companies under the City of Cape Town and commends the National Ministers of Labour and Transport for their interventions to bring the strike to an end. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. I see the hon member Kivedo.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Jolene Hahn van die Laerskool Ebenezer in die Wes-Kaap gelukwens, wie die prys as beste akteur in die junior afdeling van die Nasionale Toneelspel Kompetisie te Artscape in Kaapstad verower het. Welgedaan!

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Jolene Hahn of the Ebenezer Primary School in the Western Cape, who won the prize as the best actress in the junior division of the National Acting Competition at Artscape in Cape Town. Well done!

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

†Die SPEAKER: Is daar enige beswaar teen die voorstel? Geen beswaar. [The SPEAKER: Are there any objection to the motion? No objection.] †The next person? That is it. Anybody else? No? So, there we go.

Sorry, do we still have? Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: So I am guided by the Table staff. Forgive me. Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that yet again Provincial Government's inaction and actual reluctance to intervene in the dispute over lucrative taxi routes in the province have resulted in a blood bath and notes further that commuters' lives continue to be at risk as the fighting and feuding taxi drivers shoot randomly at the Delft Taxi Rank and elsewhere and calls on the hon MEC to do his job and to speedily intervene to halt the taxi violence by focussing on governance issues which have remained unresolved in the Western Cape Taxi industry.  
[Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the ... [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that when the ANC candidate in Ward 13 in Oudtshoorn visited 25 houses yesterday, that 21 of those houses

indicated their support for the ANC whereas last year 15 of those houses indicated their support for the DA which indicates, and this House would take note, of growing momentum towards the ANC.  
[Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Sorry. Are there any objections to the motion? There are objections. [Interjections.] Hold on, hold [Interjections.] members hold on. The objection will be printed but the Chief Whip is on his feet. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I want evidence that the hon member has actually written that statement. He has handed over one now. He has made two statements. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. It is noted.

Mr M G E WILEY: The Rules are clear. The statements have to be written.

The SPEAKER: Noted, Chief Whip Wiley. The Table will check. It is indeed two motions without notice.

### **RULINGS**

Hon members, Last week I undertook that I would apply my mind and there

were certain matters that arose during the sitting and so I have now come back to the House and the first one is a considered ruling. So, I am going to ask the hon member Lekker to stand please. [Interjections.]

If you could bear with me please, members. On 10 May 2018 during Motions, the hon member Lekker raised a point of order requesting me to rule on whether it was parliamentary for the hon Mackenzie to refer to hon Tyatyam as stupid.

This was after hon Tyatyam had objected to a motion without notice moved by hon Mackenzie. I enquired from hon Mackenzie whether he did make such a remark and if so, whether it was directed to hon Tyatyam. Hon Mackenzie's response was that he did not refer to a member in the House.

I accepted the word of hon Mackenzie. I assumed that hon Lekker was not satisfied with the response from hon Mackenzie, when she argued that hon Mackenzie repeated this remark twice and that he was not telling the truth by saying, he did not refer to a member in this House.

During ensuing interjections, hon Lekker said, and I quote "Drunkard". Firstly, I want to ascertain from hon Lekker, whether her remark was directed to hon Mackenzie? [Interjections.]

Order please. I am busy with a ruling. Hon members, kindly take your seats. I am busy with a considered ruling. No, Chief Whip, I am sorry, until I finish

this ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: I was [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No. I am not Hon member Lekker, will you rise please. Please take your seat, Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Take your seat please. Hon Lekker, I put the question to you, were you referring to the hon Mackenzie?

Mr S G TYATYAM: He never raised that.

Ms P Z LEKKER: No, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Okay. So, hon Lekker, I have to accept your word. Thank you. I now move ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, Sir.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, why did you let hon Lekker stand up, almost like try to humiliate her in front of everybody? Normally the question would be put. The member will rise, and the member will respond. Right from the Premier, every single member. This round, a member from the ANC must stand up.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, there was no humiliation intended. It is a



considered ruling. I will now get to the second considered ruling for the day and that was the adoption of the report of the Ad Hoc Committee on the recommendation for appointment of the Public Service Commissioner.  
[Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr S G TYATYAM: We are begging you not to be biased. There is an issue about member Mackenzie here.

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr S G TYATYAM: You said you would listen to Hansard and then come back and rule on that and it was the first issue ... [Interjection.] Speaker, and we are expecting that you must rule on it before we go to this one.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I do not know what the first ... [Interjection.] Sorry. The issue of hon Mackenzie when he stood up and he said, no he did not say that, I had to accept his word. Same as I had to accept hon Lekker's word.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can I address you on ... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: What you talking about?

Ms M N GILLION: Sorry Madam Speaker, on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Okay, so now I have got four members standing on a point of order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, can I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may. Hon member Gillion kindly take your seat please.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, the first altercation arose as a result of member Mackenzie denying his utterances. I then put it to you that member Mackenzie uttered such a statement repeatedly. You then indicated that you are going to listen to the Hansard and come back with a ruling.

I was sitting here, what happened was something else. You committed to listen to the Hansard. Now, I think we must remind you what you said on that specific day. So, if you expect to humiliate me because of what I said whilst I was sitting here, you are expected to revert back to your word. I urge you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, I understood it to be that when hon Mackenzie said he did not say that, that that matter had been addressed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is not what you said on that day, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: No-no, no but ... [Interjection.] what I will do now is go back to Hansard and actually look. [Interjections.] No. No-no, fair is fair [Interjections.] I did not, I do not have a ruling. I am sorry. So, I will at your request go back and I will deal with it when I come back to the House, hon member Lekker. [Interjections.] Yes, Sir?

Mr P UYS: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker. I would like you to apologise to hon member Lekker.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr P UYS: You let her stand up and then sit down and then ask, did you say and then she said no and then you accepted it. You know it has never been done in this House in the last 4, 5 years.

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes it has!

Mr P UYS: Never ever. And I would like you to really apologise to a member and also your members in this House, for the way you treated her today. It was bad.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, in the interest of fairness and proving that I am not biased, hon member Lekker, I apologize unreservedly to you. The intention was not to humiliate you. Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, can I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, can you please prove to this House your unbiasedness? I am going back to the issue of member Mackenzie and I also know what your words were. Now you must go back to Hansard, Madam Speaker, to go and listen to your own words, that you uttered in this House. Please show us as the members in this House, this side of the House, that you are not biased.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, your point is noted. I have already undertaken that I will certainly go back and peruse Hansard and come back to the House once I have established what it is I had committed to.

An HON MEMBER: My question does not follow on.

The SPEAKER: It is not easy picking up on everything and I am sorry if I have slipped up on this one.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Big time! You slipped up big time!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, the fact that you are perfect. I am not ashamed to admit my imperfections and the fact that I am human. Let us deal

with the second considered ruling for the day.

On Thursday 10 May 2018, the House considered a report from the Ad Hoc Committee established in terms of the Rule 1141 of the Standing Rules, to give effect to section 196(8)(b)(1) of the Constitution 1996. As agreed in the programme authority meeting, parties were given the opportunity to make declarations of vote prior to the adoption of the Committee's report being considered.

After declarations, a vote was made on behalf of the ANC, ACDP and the DA, the question "Are there any objections to the report?" was put to the House. Having heard the Aye's and the No's, I declared that in my opinion the Aye's were in the majority after which the ANC Chief Whip, demanded a division.

After the tellers had concluded the counting of members on both sides of the House, I announced the result of the Division and announced that the report had been adopted by a majority of 16 against 13. Hon member Uys then rose on a point of order and indicated that the requisite majority for approving a nominee for appointment as a Public Service Commissioner has not been attained and therefore they, the ANC defeated the DA here clearly.

I responded that in my view, the question that the report be adopted, was approved in terms of the rules and in line with the guidance I had received from the table staff. Having heard further points of order, *inter alia* from Messrs Joseph and Wiley and also having suspended proceedings to again

consult with procedural services staff, I undertook to further apply my mind and come back to the House with a considered ruling on the status of the resolution taken by the House and the way forward.

Let me say at the outset that hon member Uys was correct in his submission that the resolution of the House approving a nominee for appointment as Public Service Commissioner for the province, required a supporting vote of the majority of the members of the House as contemplated in Rule 36(5)(a) of the Standing Rules.

The question I had to consider was whether the adoption of the above report of the Committee constituted a resolution of the House as contemplated in Rule 36(5)(b) of the Standing Rules.

The adoption of the report of the Ad Hoc Committee in question or the adoption of any other committee report for that matter, does not require a special majority and such questions before the House are decided in terms of Rule 36(1) of the Standing Rules.

To give effect to the recommendation contained in the report, pertaining to the nomination of Mr Leonardo Goosen for appointment as Public Service Commissioner, however requires a resolution of the House with a supporting vote of at least 22 members.

In light of the above I wish to rule as follows: The adoption on 10 May 2018

of the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on the appointment of a Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape with the supporting vote of 16-13 does not constitute a resolution of the House as contemplated in Section 196(8)(b)(2).

That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

Ms M N GILLION: No-no-no! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: The House is adjourned, hon member Uys. [Interjections.]

No, I am not going to. [Interjections.]

The House adjourned at 17:10.