
THURSDAY, 14 SEPTEMBER 2017

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, I see the Chief Whip.

(Notice of motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the subject for discussion please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. There is no objection to that motion. Agreed to. We will then move on to the subject for discussion in the name of the hon Wenger. The first speaker, hon Wenger, I see the hon Wenger.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

(The findings of the Urban Safety Report which, inter alia, places the spotlight on the failure of SAPS to reduce the availability of guns and drugs in Cape Town communities and which is contributing to a breakdown in relations with civil society due to increased crime and gang violence)

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Today we are debating the 2017 State of Urban Safety in South African Cities Report, which was drafted by the Urban Safety Reference Group. The report raises some serious concerns about safety nationally, but the report is also relevant to the Western Cape and in particular, the urban hub of Cape Town.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which is where the problems are?

Ms M M WENGER: Cape Town has a population that is growing and it has the lowest level of poverty and the lowest level income inequality...

[Interjections.]

According to the report, read the report, hon member, and the second lowest youth unemployment rate of all the cities that were measured. And yet, Cape Town has extremely high levels of crime. The murder rate has increased by 40% in the last five years. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not just say [Inaudible.]. That is the problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Ms M M WENGER: Why? Why? The answer may lie, according to the report, in the disproportionate access to alcohol, drugs and guns, which is double that of any other city. It in turn means that access to drugs and guns in particular should be the focus of our crime reduction strategies.

The academics tell us that the easy access to guns in crime hotspots considerably contributes to the likelihood of crime, as the presence of a gun may lead to an increased possibility of violent behaviour.

Philippi East was used as a case study where one in ten people said they carry a gun for self-protection. Even neighbourhood watch members fear for their lives, when they are on patrol, as it is a case of “batons against guns”. One of the study’s participants said:

“There are guns all over our township. For every three people you meet one of them has an illegal gun with them”.

Here, more people than in Hillbrow say that they or a member of their household had been a victim of crime in the previous year. Almost two-thirds of those interviewed had been personally affected by robberies.

Philippi East is actually our murder capital. While Nyanga might have the highest number of murders in terms of total cases, Speaker, we must also look at the number of murders in proportion to the population. A larger population may be expected to record higher murder rates, so if we look at the number of murders in relation to the population, we have a real problem in Philippi East. Using the report's comparison, Philippi East's murder rate in 2015 was 217 murders per 100 000 of the population compared with Hillbrow's 74.

The sad reality is that we do have the tools we need to detect and prosecute guns that are killing communities and creating webs of fear. When the Standing Committee visited the Forensic Science Laboratory a few weeks ago, we saw a world-class ballistics section. They have firearm and tool mark examination & identification and do a lot of research for firearms and ammunition technology. We saw how a single weapon had been linked to a network of serious crimes. So why then has the individual using this weapon not been arrested?

Well, Mr Deputy Speaker, the problem lies in the fact that the technology that we have is not being used or not properly used and not managed. Station level detectives are not working across police boundaries and they are not looking at a holistic picture and finding clues at each crime scene to link weapons and DNA at each scene to look at the broader picture and catch the culprits. A case is often investigated in isolation by detectives that are woefully overburdened. This is why we need specialised units that can

operate across boundaries and which understand gang networks and modus operandi. Let us use this good technology that we have.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Cape Town has the highest rate of crime detected through police action, which is largely as a result of the rise in drug-related crime.

Over the last five years, the number of drug-related crimes has increased by 22% from 76 600 to 93 900. It means that police are actively looking for drugs. As this indicator suggests, numbers for this type of crime are driven by police action. This is good, you might say, and to some extent it is, but it could be much, much better.

Let us look at the data: 72% of the huge volume of drug cases analysed are for cases of less than one gram of substance. If we look at the difference between possession and dealing cases, we see that the overall number of cases analysed in the last four years is for drug possession; not dealing. Possession cases being sent for analysis increased dramatically from approximately 66 500 in 2013 to 82 500 in 2016. But, if we look at the number of dealing cases in the same timeframe, the number of cases increased from approximately 9200 to 9500. So surely, the focus should be placed on increasing the dealing cases and big hauls, on targeting the so called "high flyers" and distributors, and not small time drug users of less than one gram.

If we are serious about combating the availability of drugs in our communities, we have to be serious about stopping distribution.

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please switch on now. This is your debate and I am trying to listen to you [Inaudible.]

Ms M M WENGER: By way of example, where there have been successes and to show how a shift in focus can yield significantly better results...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Ms M M WENGER: ...in 10% of cases analysed, equalled 98% of the total mass of drugs. This is where we should be focusing, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Where?

Ms M M WENGER: So the problem is not that we do not have the ability or the technology. We do. We have to adjust our priorities and our strategies to align them to where there can be the largest impact in the interests of safety in our communities.

Increased crime and violence also contribute to a breakdown in relations with civil society, which is another concern indicated in the report. Communities that have good levels of trust of the police tend to be more willing to report crime. Conversely communities that have poor relations with the police tend to report less.

Some community members surveyed said that they do not report crimes to the police because they fear retaliation from the perpetrators or from the police themselves!

A participant in the study said “that the police do many dealings with criminals; the community needs to know where to report the police; not to report a corrupt police to another police because you cannot report Satan to the Devil.”

There is no clearer indication of mistrust between the community and the police and this is something that should be investigated by the Ombudsman. Community members said that greater police visibility and law enforcement can help deal with violence and crime.

A respondent said: “We want more police visibility because skollies move in numbers and we cannot win the battle on our own.” [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: There we go again!

Ms M M WENGER: “Police visibility lacks in our area, they also take a long time to come when there is a crisis.”

This is unsurprising as Philippi East has a police to population ratio of one officer to every 444 citizens. That is less officers than the average for the province, which is at 385 citizens per officer, and if we look at detectives, each detective is dealing with an average of 116 dockets each, which is three times higher than the norm. So in conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, the report makes several recommendations. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please conclude.

Ms M M WENGER: It suggests that there should be a strong focus on the quality and appropriateness of the strategy in question, rather than its quantity. And so I wish to quote from Richard Rumelt’s book *Good Strategy, Bad Strategy* as it neatly summarises our strategic misalignment.

“When organisations are unable to make new strategies - when people evade the work of choosing among different paths in the future - you get vague mom-and-apple-pie goals everyone can agree on...” [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just like your speech, very vague.

Ms M M WENGER: “Such goals are direct evidence of leadership’s insufficient will or political power to make or enforce hard choices,

but...” he said: “Most organisations will not create focused strategies. Instead, they will generate laundry lists of desirable outcomes and ignore the need for coordinating and focusing their resources. Good strategy requires leaders who are willing and able to say no to a wide variety of actions and interests. Strategy is at least as much about what an organisation does not do as it is about what it does.”

Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker. [Interjection.] Order!

An HON MEMBER: She is talking the truth. That is the problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nou gooi ons kole! Nou gooi ons kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now we are throwing coals! Now we are throwing coals!]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Dyantyi. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We want a solution! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order. Allow the hon member Lekker to †gōoi kole [throw coals], not the hon member Dyantyi. [Interjections.] Please continue.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to pay tribute to many victims of violent murders in the province. Equally I salute the men and women in blue who lost their lives in the line of duty in pursuit of criminals who are constantly terrorising our communities.

The Urban Safety Report released in August 2017 exposes what we have been arguing in these Chambers. The report acknowledges that on average there are less than half of people likely murdered today than there were in the 1994/95 period. This must be applauded. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is true.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The ANC-led Government in this province managed to work so hard and reduce the murder rate from 55% to 40% between 2005 and 2009. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is your [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is on the record.

Ms P Z LEKKER: In contrast, the murder rate has since increased from 40%

to 62% between 2009 and 2016.

Ms M M WENGER: [Inaudible.] the national murder rate. [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: You had your time to speak, now keep quiet.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Clearly, the ANC gains were reversed by the DA-led Government. I was appalled by the reaction of honourable MEC Plato who in his statement conveniently left out some of the key observations of the report. The report highlights the fact that interpersonal crimes of violence are often described as “social fabric crimes”, which are not always premeditated. They are the reflection of socio-economic factors such as alcohol, substance abuse, drug abuse, unemployment and poverty, than a mere ineffectiveness of policing.

Cape Town has the highest rate of crime detected through police action. This is commendable. Cape Town has a lower rapid population growth than Johannesburg and Tshwane, a lower population density than Johannesburg and Ekurhuleni, whilst it has the lowest income inequality and the second-lowest youth unemployment rate.

Mr R T OLIVIER: That is so true.

Ms P Z LEKKER: His concentration became confined into the number of SAPS police officers in the province, whilst ignoring the positive role played

by policing as mentioned in the report. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We want police, not [Inaudible.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: His Government undermines the very Alcohol Harms Reduction Game Changer by wanting to introduce selling of alcohol on school premises for whatever reason. This will never augur well with the law abiding citizens of this province.

The 50 Walking Buses is a complete failure. Youth programmes, Chrysalis Academy, Youth Safety and Religious Partners are a drop in the ocean considering the magnitude of the crime rate and youth unemployment in the province. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What about Bambanani?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Many of the CPFs are undermined by the very department which it is supposed to give support to. Instead they want to interfere with their operation including influencing their elections into office. This practice is not going unnoticed and will be challenged at all times.

Under the DA-led Government and contrary to the rest of South Africa, Western Cape's murder rate is on the rise. Cape Town has doubled the rate since 2009/10 by 40%.

Mr M G E WILEY: And I wonder why.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The report further suggests that the City's extremely high levels of crime are as the result of access to alcohol, drugs, and firearms. On the other hand the DA-led Government closed one of the successful Bambanani Community Projects, which was instrumental in reducing...

[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What are the numbers?

Ms P Z LEKKER: ...the levels of crime under the ANC-led Government.

[Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: Why did your Premier want to shut them down then?

Ms M N GILLION: You had your time to speak.

Ms P Z LEKKER: These community volunteers were the eyes and ears on the ground, they were everywhere; on the streets, on school premises, clinics and hospitals and worked hand-in-glove with the security agents, such as SAPS. They turned the SAPS stations to be community police stations, and changed the perception that police officers are enemies of the people.

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC is nowhere. The ANC is nowhere.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Indeed, with the stipend that was awarded to them, the essence of the Bambanani project, lessened unemployment and poverty...

[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And the reservists?

Ms P Z LEKKER: And what hon member Wenger is not saying in this House is that with the visit that were paid at Delft it was indeed highlighted that poverty, high levels of unemployment are indeed the cause of many violent crime. She omitted to tell it deliberately.

Although relatively below national average, robberies in residential premises are reportedly on the rise. Burglaries has been stubbornly high in Cape Town since 2008/09. The carjacking rate has gone up since 2013/14.

According to the South African Banking Risk Information Centre it was reported that in August 2017, cash-in-transit heists rose by 135%, while countrywide it is only 49%.

The Philippi East case study confirms this reality. In 2015/16 Philippi East recorded 217 murders and 843 robberies, whilst property-related crimes were 704, which is behind Hillbrow by 1 376; the sexual offences rate was topping at 225, followed by Kwamashu at 126. The survey found that there is a low level of education, which is a contributor of the high unemployment rate in this province amongst the youth. Equally, there is a lack of community

cohesion, which has a potential of undermining crime prevention efforts and interventions.

Cape Town is also rated as the second city after Mangaung for violent interpersonal crimes, and also recorded the highest of both violent and non-violent property crimes.

The City of Cape Town's five year IDP Plan offers very little, if any, strategies to fight violent crimes in the City. The ceasefire project has been a complete failure in many cases than one. In fact gang fights are a major contributing factor in increasing the rate of murder in the City of Cape Town. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: If it was not for J P Smith...

Ms P Z LEKKER: The VPUU Programme needs to redirect to hotspot communities such as Nyanga, Philippi and Manenberg where crime activities are rife.

In March 2016, Cape Town introduced CCTV cameras under their Integrated Safety and Security. What was a disappointment was the fact that those cameras were installed in the CBD areas; neglecting areas like Philippi East and in the same time they put fire Shot Spotters, which are not even used to collate evidence to this effect, and are not effective for that matter.

Further, the City of Cape Town's own Social Development Strategies acknowledges that income inequality are persistent in the region and economic growth have not benefited the poorer communities and the racial profile of poverty is expressed in the City's spatial dimension, but offers no tangible solutions, hence the report found that areas like Philippi lacks social cohesion and integration. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it. [Inaudible.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: The strategy is quiet on the question of youth unemployment. This shows how this DA-led Government has no clue of how to take young out of the social ills, namely the abject poverty and hopelessness. [Interjections.]

Driving under the influence of alcohol is squarely under the Municipality's mandate and has seen it going up by 60%. Where are the City Law Enforcement Agencies with all their resources at their disposal and the DA-led Municipality, which is failing the people of Cape Town?

The recommendations are quite instructive in that they are calling for the development of long term urban safety strategies, developing capacity within local government, activating resources, active communities, design cohesion and safety, and promote adequate resources and capacity.

I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Basil Kivedo. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Basil Kivedo. [Interjections.]]

An HON MEMBER: And the solution?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, hon fellow members.
[Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: You are in Government. You must do [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: Please protect me, your protection please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will protect you, yes. I am not sure what is happening now but you may... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Just now you were making a noise. Now you are asking for protection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon Lekker.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon fellow members, support staff,

members of the media and especially our distinguished guests in the gallery, and I feel particularly honoured and privileged to have my constituents from Tygerberg 1 here today, the ward councillors and the activists and also the other distinguished guests. Very welcome in this House.

The 2017 State of the Urban Safety Report highlights that many people living within the Western Cape live in high levels of fear on a day-to-day basis and are increasingly losing faith in our justice system to adequately address the issue of crime and violence in our province.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the people living within our communities are truly suffering to the extent that they have been held ransom to gangsters, many of the high crime areas remind me of the days when I was a soldier myself. Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker, many of these areas closely resemble war zones similar to what I was exposed to while fighting for the freedom of this country, except today the war being fought is between the gangs, which hold our province hostage in the crossfire.

My heart cries for our people. No longer can our children freely roam the streets playing sport or simply walk down the road to visit a family member without fear of being killed by a stray bullet.

Our children are being deprived of the simple pleasures that they should be afforded in our country. Where a child once played he now cocks a gun. Where a young boy once aspired to be a sportsman, a fireman or a lawyer, he

now seeks the approval of the older peers and the sense of belonging that comes from their gang. Our communities are fractured when our children are too easily sucked into a life-changing web of illegal activity instead of prosperous and dignified opportunity.

Police corruption and involvement in criminal activities need to be investigated and an anonymous reporting channel for our people should be created. In many instances we find that our so called trusted police officers are protecting the criminals that people report and in fact pose a greater danger to citizens as they act as whistle-blowers to gangsters.

In a report earlier this year it was revealed that 706 police officials had been arrested for criminal activity in the 2016/17 financial year compared to 725 in 2015/16.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this is a very worrying statistic when we consider that in the light of these findings over 1400 officers cannot be trusted. Furthermore, at a time when police resources are limited as it is, we need to put a stop to the large number of police officers who are on the payroll of ganglords, to the extent that many officers share intimate friendships with the very gang members killing our innocent people in our province. When coming to terms with reality and putting these numbers into perspective it does not come as a surprise that the conviction rate for gang-related murders and violence is as low as 3% in the Western Cape.

I am gravely concerned with regard to how the President of our country has a complete disregard for the lived experiences of the people of our province. In May this year, President Jacob Zuma blamed the police for the tragedy of the murder victim Courtney Pieters, three years old, in [Inaudible.] Elsie's River. Furthermore, the President's response to the young child's murder was to simply hand over R10 000 in cash as a form of weaker compensation to the family as if to say that the young girl's life is merely worth a sum of money. That is pocket change for him and the Guptas. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, if Jacob Zuma believed that this is a viable solution to such tragedies being witnessed amongst the people of our province on a day-to-day basis, why are the families of other victims of similar cases not also being compensated for? To beg the question is simply not necessary as it is clear that he used this tragedy which is quickly becoming a norm due to the failure of police to address such issues, as a mayhem way of scoring political points.

†En hy het die vermetelheid gehad om ons in Tygerberg 1 te sê hoe om bendegeweld te stop. Hy en Fikile "Cowboy" Mbalula. [Tussenwerpsels.]
[And he had the audacity to tell us in Tygerberg 1 how to stop gang violence. He and Fikile "Cowboy" Mbalula. [Interjections.]]

†Die feit is President Zuma kan sy hoenders in Nkandla gaan vertel hoe om dit te doen, dan glo hulle hom ook nie eens nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Ja. [The fact is President Zuma can go and tell his chickens in Nkandla how to do it, then they also do not even believe him. [Interjections.]]

Mr Deputy Speaker, on 9 September, Aqeel Davids, a nine-year old boy was in a crossfire between gangs, while in the Ocean View home, and he died later in hospital. On 3 August Ezra Daniels, a seven-year old boy was shot dead in Grassy Park. My heart cries out and cannot even fathom the actual extent to the trauma and suffering these children and their families are going through.

Only a holistic approach through the efforts of all spheres of society can put a stop to these demonic acts of violence being witnessed in our communities. We are in desperate need of the parents of these perpetrators to step in, where possible. Too many times we hear that parents are covering up for their children who are either gangsters or are in fact the perpetrators of these acts of violence. In doing so they are just as guilty as those committing the crimes. Thus, parents have a major role to play in fighting both crime and gang violence.

Today's children will be the adults of the future. Will their children face the same woes in which they now live; the same violent realities of their everyday lives? At this rate many of our children will only make it to adulthood if they can successfully dodge the bullets.

Parents, family, friends and other support structures can help these children. So can police officers, honest police officers, who make it through a gauntlet of politics, vendettas and internal conflicts and who legitimately works to snuff out crime and clamp down on illegal firearms.

I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.] [Interjection.]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Mooi, mooi!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good, good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On Monday evening I was alerted to another shooting in the community of Ocean View. The victim was the 23-year old trainee fireman, apparently with no obvious gang connection. He has stepped out of his flat just metres away to buy a sweet at a shop in the flat next door. As he turned to exit the little fenced-off yard his assailant shot him three times in the head. He died instantly where he fell, the sweet still clutched in his hand.

Who shot him? The community is not saying because they are terrified.

†Te veel ooggetuies is vermoor in daardie gemeenskap en die bendeleiers bly nog net waar hulle altyd was. Die enigste tyd dat hulle vasgevat word is wanneer hulle mekaar uitroei in bendegevegte.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Too many eye witnesses were murdered in that community and the gang leaders still remain where they have always been. The only time that they are taken on is when they wipe out each other in gang fights.]

†This is the second killing in three days in that township. A nine-year old was shot in his own home through a closed door in the early hours of Saturday morning by gangsters chasing a victim. The horrible truth is that Ocean View, a small community serviced by a poorly resourced police station, has seen an explosion of violence in recent years. Just last year that precinct saw 41 murders, up from 26 the previous year. Most are gunshot victims within Ocean View. Many are innocent bystanders.

I take note of the comment made by member Lekker with regard to the Walking Bus being a failure. I take even more note, hon member Dyantyi's comment to say that the Walking Bus Initiative is for the rich. You tell that to the Walking Bus people present here today. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: The question is where did these gangs come from?
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member, order!

Mr M G E WILEY: ...guns that seem so readily... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, order. Hon member Wiley, just one second. Hon member Gillion, I am listening.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, can you ask the Chief Whip to stop pointing fingers and talking to our members. He must talk to you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member. Hon member Wiley, just refer to the members as hon members when you continue. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: We speak to everybody [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: As difficult as it may be, yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. The question is, where do these guns come from - the ones that seem so readily available and so publicly carried and often used by juveniles? They cannot be stolen from local residents as the statistics do not bear that out. So they are either smuggled into the country or illegally procured from official sources. We all know about the thousands of firearms surrendered to SAPS for destruction but we all also know that they are sold to gangs and criminals. Over 2000 in the Prinsloo-case were admitted to and he has been jailed for 18 years. Over the years I have personally surrendered four firearms and I wonder how many of these have landed in the hands of killers.

We all know about SAPS officers and private cash-in-transit guards being

killed for their firearms but this is often proved to be lone individuals and not necessarily organised gangs. Cash-in-transit robberies in the Western Cape as Pat Lekker - the hon Lekker has said, they have gone up to 135% from last year as opposed to the national average of 42. She uses this as a motivation.

Ms M N GILLION: Who is she? [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: The police and intelligence agencies are only a national competence. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No man, it cannot be.

Mr M G E WILEY: We also know of state weapons being taken out of armouries, a crime being committed and then weapons being returned for safe-keeping. Through Project Impi, which investigated these matters, it is alleged that some 1 066 murders were committed with smuggled firearms. By now in the last few years a new phenomenon has started to take hold. Wholesale raids and State armouries and the theft of large quantities of weapons ammunitions have become commonplace. Bellville South and Mitchells Plain SAPS are mentioned in recent weeks.

The Deputy Police Minister admitted:

“SAPS officers are stealing the guns and giving it to the gangs.”

These thefts are not just handguns but automatic assault rifles and high-power ammunition. In a recent report tabled in Court it identifies 261 children in the Western Cape who have been shot between 2010 and 2016 with guns stolen from police, often with active police complicity; and not just SAPS, but the SANDF as well.

A few weeks ago several assault rifles in quantities and ammunition apparently disappeared from a duty shift at Silvermine Military Base. Other cases from supposedly high security depots have been reported, most notably the one from the Navy Ammunition Depot in Simons Town last year - guns, grenades, mortar-rounds and artillery ammunition were involved, and these are just some of the cases. There are many more.

How on earth is this possible? We are meant to be in a sophisticated country that abides by the rule of law, has a strict Constitution and other legal instruments to ensure that our security forces are just that, secure! And yet, in truth it is not. It is a common thread in this disintegration of any acceptable standard and national pride, and that is the ANC National Government.

Former President Kgalema Motlanthe earlier this week said as much...
[Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Who are you to go there?

Mr R T OLIVIER: There is no such...

Mr M G E WILEY: The apathy, sloth, duty-averse and ill-discipline of deployed ANC cadres within the security forces has ensured its mutual destruction. [Interjections.]

Negligence, dereliction and a total lack of accountability are obvious to all. How else can one explain SAPS losing 7 829 firearms between 2009 and 2014? Where is the Ministerial and Presidential outrage, the suspension, the boards of inquiry; the reassurance to the public that accountability will prevail and order be restored? [Interjections.] Just ongoing bickering amongst rivals in the top structures of SAPS and allegations of plots to oust the Minister and any manager who wants to stand up to thugs, malcontents and criminally inclined in the service, without fail, ANC factionalism is at the root of these fights. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What about your [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: What about the DA?

Mr M G E WILEY: What about looking after the ordinary constable on the ground, who has to live with daily violence, public distrust and under-resourcing? No wonder they are stressed to hell and the public tolerance level is not far behind. Society is traumatised and frustrated. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Haai, haai, haai!

Mr M G E WILEY: How do you explain the armed insurrection against the Oudtshoorn SAPS station, led by the SANDF general with dozens of troops in 2014, has yet to be finalised in Court, albeit on reduced minor charges. The SANDF refuse to lay departmental charges. On the contrary, the general was promoted. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is better than the [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Why did the Minister and the SAPS management not insist on due process being followed and stand by their men in blue?

Similarly, the SANAD thefts have yet to see any demonstrated accountability. No release of a board of inquiry report, no demotions, no court martial. By stark contrast, when two US navy collisions happened, occurred early this year, the world knew within weeks that the Admiral in charge of the fleet was relieved of duty, loss of command, and every person from the command of the ship to the lowly watch crew by name and rank were either suspended, demoted or sent to an off-site post pending final findings.

Similar prompt and measured actions occur in every security service worth its salt with the specific intent that the integrity of that service is internally and to the public at large greater than the individual sensitivities and/or partisan loyalties. It is the only way to restore public confidence in an essential

service. Why do we find this basic concept so difficult, or is it because it is part of a destabilisation that is deliberate?

It is so blatant; the terrible societal consequences are so obvious: 18 000 murders so far this year in South Africa, that no-one can be blamed for asking the question if it is deliberate. The problem with fomenting violence and civil unrest is at the first part it is easy. It is the normalisation afterwards that is so elusive. The ANC constantly says the problem is firstly a socio-economic problem, as hon Lekker said. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: And we do not believe that. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: It is not!

Mr P UYS: Ja, that is true.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is first and foremost a sovereign constitutional obligation for the State... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Where do you go to school?

Mr M G E WILEY: ...to provide a safe environment for its citizens to live and work in. [Interjections.] One can have the best schools in the world but it

means nothing if they are constantly trashed and teachers and pupils are threatened and killed. You can have the best health-services, but if the ambulance gets attacked and gunfights break out afterwards it means nothing. You can have the prettiest neighbourhood with the nicest houses but it means nothing if criminals rape, murder and steal at will without retribution.

When will the ANC own up to their mistakes and simply do what the public would like to demand... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr M G E WILEY: And for which the public pays for in blood and taxes. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, your time has expired also now.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Where did you go to school? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I hope it is a place that taught you something!

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am very much disappointed by the two hon members ... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: He is a victim of [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! You can only have one speaker on the floor. Hon member Dijana. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: This is a victim of [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, please come to order.

Ms T M DIJANA: I am very much disappointed by the two hon members... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: What a dummy!

Ms T M DIJANA: ...because there is no plan of action. They are just complaining. The other one is talking about the President. [Interjections.] I do not know where does President Zuma feature in the Western Cape? [Interjections.] We must face the reality here. [Interjections.]

The 2017 State of Urban Safety in South Africa Report highlights the disproportionate access to alcohol, drugs and firearms, which is more than twice that of any other city as the driving force behind the City's extremely

high levels of crime. [Interjection.]

Today the DA Government is trying to blame the high levels of crime on the SAPS for not being able to reduce the availability of guns and drugs in Cape Town communities. They conveniently forget to include the availability of alcohol, which was one of the findings of the report.

Drug and alcohol abuse are serious social ills which need the prevention through educational awareness programs and campaigns. Since the DA failed to govern the people they are now resorting to blame the SAPS for not curing the illness they cannot prevent.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it. Tell them!

Ms T M DIJANA: The SAPS is not responsible for liquor sales or drug abuse. These addictions fall in the offices of the Social Development and Health Departments. When you ask the MECs or the Premier why there is extraordinary substance abuse in the province, without mentioning progress on combating these social ills, they reply, “clean audits.” Clean audits do not prevent the abuse of drugs and alcohol in Cape Town and the entire province.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we note the recent theft of guns in Bellville South and Mitchells Plain Police Departments and welcome the head-on approach by the Minister and his Deputy by placing the blame on police officers that stole the guns. We welcome the approach that seeks to improve the challenges

currently facing the SAPS and encourage them to trace the weapons which should be destroyed without fear or favour.

The SAPS has various services which enable the public to contact them regarding service complaints, reporting a crime, reporting of a missing person, reporting of sexual offences, applying for protection order and how to become a reservist.

Through these services there is public engagement and communication which allows the public to participate in the operations and efficient function of policing.

With these services and functions in place one cannot make a wild statement that SAPS is responsible for failing to reduce the availability of alcohol, drugs and guns in Cape communities which is contributing to a breakdown in relations with civil society. An example of this is the high reporting rate of crime detected through police actions, where Cape Town police stations have the highest rate as seen in Figure 14.

Another point of active police visibility is the low car jacking and residential robbery rate compared to other cities, the report notes this is as a result of an increase in police activity.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we should point out that the availability of drugs and illegal firearms have doubled since 2009. Why is this relevant; because the

DA took over the Province in 2009.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because your Minister is useless.

Ms T M DIJANA: This rate has been multiplying year-on-year and the last two years is evidence thereof. The amount of female children and adults murdered in the province were nowhere near the high levels where they are today under DA governance. Johannesburg was Gangsters Paradise. Today under DA rule, Nyanga and Cape Town is the murder capital of South Africa. Cape Town always had good social and structural indicators, which have been known to have an impact on crime, the only conclusion we can draw is that under the DA Government they have not invested time, human resources and development in our Cape Flats and townships. Crime is not running loose in your affluent areas, just where our people stay. We all know and acknowledge the shortage of resources at SAPS, which makes it difficult to deploy more officers in our communities, but with the limited resources, SAPS is doing what they reasonably can in fighting crime and gangs.

We read week in and week out how suspects are arrested and guns have been confiscated. We read about how drugs and illegal alcohol are confiscated. So the subject for debate is not only deliberate untruth, but it is also misleading and opportunistic.

It seeks to hide DA failures of not investing in crime and in the fight against

drugs. When gangs terrorise communities, killing school children, the response from this DA Government is the establishing of Walking Buses.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, just one sentence. Hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: A point of order. In terms of the interpretation of this topic... [Interjection.]

†UNksz T M DIJANA: Haibo! [No way!] Sit down! Because †wena ubuthethe ngoZuma. [you spoke about Zuma.] Can you please sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms T M DIJANA: Can you please sit down! [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...that we are misleading the House. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Can you please sit down. Can you please sit down?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: You are misleading the House. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: You are wasting my time. You must go to an old age home.

Sit down. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms T M DIJANA: Sit down. †Thyini hayi suka! Khawuhlale phantsi. [No man! You must sit down.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: You are misleading the House!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dijana.

†n AGBARE LID: Jy kry pak! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: You are getting a hiding! [Interjections.]]

Mr B D KIVEDO: I am on my feet.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: I am on my feet. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, he is raising a point of order and

giving the... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: I am on my feet.

Ms T M DIJANA: And what?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He has to raise the point of order before I can rule on it. [Interjections.] Hon member Kivedo, what are you saying? Hon member Kivedo? [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: The point of order is that our facts were based on statistical verifiable facts. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order hon member Kivedo, that is not a point of order. The member may continue.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. You are out of order, Ma'am, because when you were speaking about Jacob Zuma which is not in the stats. I am talking about the stats. Can you please sit down? Keep quiet or you must go to an old age home. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: It seeks to hide the DA failures of not investing ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana, order! Address the Chair please and not the member on the other side.

Ms T M DIJANA: It seeks to hide DA failures of not investing in crime and in the fight against drugs when gangs terrorise communities, killing schoolchildren, the response from this DA Government is establishing of Walking Buses. Why are you not deploying Metro Police? Why are you not sending your Ghost Squad?

The DA is killing CPFs who have a critical role to play in this fight. Instead they are funding Neighbourhood Watches with no training. I believe the Urban Safety Report exposed the failures of this Provincial Government.

I thank you. [Applause.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hoor-hoor!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hear-hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member. The hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. First of all it is an

honour to be able to speak in this debate today and I speak in the place of Minister Dan Plato, who is as we speak up the coast a little bit dealing with an issue there around policing and making sure that we have safe communities. So I take part in this debate and I would also like to echo the words of the hon Lekker when she started by saying she would like to pay tribute to the victims of crime in this province and I will do exactly the same thing.

I think it must be horrendous living in some of the communities that we or our people live in, in this province, and you know, we stand here and we quote numbers and these numbers are people. These numbers are families. These numbers are people and families who have lost loved ones and I really do take and use this opportunity to give tribute to every single one of them.

This debate I think needs me to start off by a short little story. I had the honour of being with some community members who are actually here today and I spent a short time with them and listening to their story. In their community in the last year 41 people have been murdered. This is a small community. This is a small community living by the ocean. This is a small community, when you think of that community you would think of a community who is out of the hustle and bustle that actually have really the kind of life that we all strive for to move to some coastal town, some coastal community to live a relaxed life and enjoy this amazing place that we call home.

The murder rate in this community called Ocean View has been climbing exponentially year-on-year and when you speak to people in this community they rattle off names like Jesus, Ebie, Timer, Peppy, Dirkie, Road Hog. These are the guys who carry guns around in this small community taking people's lives. People live in fear. The stories that you hear that the police station itself is closed and barricaded by nine o'clock at night because the policemen or women inside are too scared to have a police station open. Where is a community able to go when they are fearful and scared? They cannot go to their police station. They do not trust... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It has been like that for more than 20 years.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They do not trust... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Keep quiet. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It has been like that for over 20 years!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Keep quiet, the Minister is talking.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Keep quiet, sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, you may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Why are you performing now? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. This is a very, very serious debate. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You must come back to Cape Town now. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...a very serious debate. People's lives are lost on a daily basis in this province. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: This is a debate, we have gone there... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa! [Interjection.] Hon member Magaxa, allow the Minister to respond to the debate.

An HON MEMBER: You upset the people in the gallery.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The horrendous part is in our communities we should be able to trust our police. We should be able to trust our police and it does not matter whether it is this community. In all communities you will hear the same story: police are in the pockets of the criminals. The police are scared themselves. Society is not able to speak up. We are in a very, very difficult space in our province. If you listen to the debate you would have heard lots of numbers quoted today. The hon Lekker spent a lot of time talking about numbers. The hon Chief Whip the same thing. The hon Wenger the same thing. We spoke about this study. We speak about other Commissions of Inquiry. If I take some of these numbers, if we look at it and the words from the ANC, we are sitting in the worst crime stats in South Africa here.

Ms P Z LEKKER: This is true.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The sad part was that when the hon Lekker spoke she spoke about these high numbers, she just said this is true, and she speaks almost with pride that these numbers are so high. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Ja. Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Almost with pride that these numbers are so high. It is shocking. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is because of your leadership.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The number 78 per 100 000 murders in Hillbrow versus 217 per 100 000 murders, not in Philippi, but in Philippi East. 40% of South Africa's drug related crime is here in the City of Cape Town. The highest crime rate of any metro - Cape Town is actually double than the crime rate of other metros in our country. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You should be ashamed. You should be ashamed!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Under your alliance.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But now we have a look at these numbers: 85% of the Western Cape Police stations are under-resourced.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Under-resourced.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Under-resourced, we have got some of the highest levels in the country but 85% are under-resourced. [Interjections.] The hon member Wiley says that 7 829 guns were lost or stolen.

The hon Lekker talks about CCTV. She talks about CCTV and let me tell you

about CCTV. She says no CCTV - did you say no CCTV cameras in Khayelitsha? [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible.] Were you not listening? Why do you ask me?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So in Mitchells Plain there are 14 CCTV cameras.

Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible.] that you listen to the speeches.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: In Sea Point there are 14; in Khayelitsha there are 16. Khayelitsha has got the second-most CCTV cameras of any suburb in the City of Cape Town, the only part that has more than that is the Central CBD which is paid for by private business. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Only five of them are working and there are no... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But let us talk about those CCTV cameras and the police force. Did you know that in the last ten years they have only gone and taken CCTV footage for crime five times, only five. I mean these numbers are truly

shocking and unbelievable. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, just one second. Hon member Magaxa is it a question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I ask the question to the Minister?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, are you prepared to take a question? The Minister is prepared, you may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Okay. I just want to ask, if we found a dead body next to a camera and that camera is not working, who shall be blamed? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The ward council.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is your City of Cape Town. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It depends on whose camera it is, I suppose. I am not sure how to answer that question. We need real questions here in this House. [Interjections.] So let us get back to the real numbers, Mr Deputy Speaker, so we hear how these numbers of high crime rates are because of this Government.

Ms P Z LEKKER: And what are you doing about it? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister, just a second. Order! Hon member Magaxa, is that a follow-up question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, are you prepared?

Mr K E MAGAXA: I need the answer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Minister Winde, are you prepared to take another question?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Try again. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: What are you doing about it?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Give us a plan of action.

Mr K E MAGAXA: A camera which is put there by the City of Cape Town and that camera we found a body there... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Blame the ANC!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...who must take responsibility for that... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The murderer!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...if that camera is not working?

An HON MEMBER: The criminals of the system. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I want the Minister who is in Government in this province to answer me. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. You have put your question. Minister, you may proceed if you want to.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...only one question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I said to him and I answered whoever owns that camera will take

responsibility for that camera. If you go and read the report 76% of those cameras were visited and checked, were to be working, and obviously if something fails you have got to go and fix it. That is the simple answer. But let us get to the real issue here. Let us get to the real issue. So this side of the House keeps on saying that it is this Government's responsibility.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But let us finish with the numbers, so the Constitution says that this House has an oversight role... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Give us a solution. Do not tell us about...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...and that oversight role gets a budget. That oversight role gets a budget of R302 million. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Lekker and hon member Dijana, order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Both of those members have had an opportunity to talk in this debate and I did not interrupt them with ongoing conversation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you are quite correct. [Interjections.] Order! Order members, I want the Minister to continue now and I want some silence in the House from the back there.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, so the budget is R302 million in this province for oversight. The overall policing budget is R82 388 million, R82 388 million.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Jo! Where is the money?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That buys a 192 400 police officers. Not one of those police officers are appointed by this Government; not one. They are all appointed by the National Government. It is a National Government competency. The R82.388 billion is their budget, not our budget, is their budget and what that buys in this province, in this province it buys 16 500 active policemen. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why do we have an MEC?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It buys 16 500 active policemen in a province with 40% of its crime drug-related of the highest metro crime in the country, of these levels that the hon member Lekker feel so proud about that her own Government

only gives 16 500 police officers to this province of the 192 000.

[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Come back to this province.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They give a miniscule amount of the R82 billion, the R82 388 million rand that is spent on policing in this country, and then one wonders... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: The Western Cape is this debate.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... because you know that when you hear all of these things it is about management. It is about management and resource and when management sits down and have a look at where the big problems are, where communities are suffering because people are dying because of drugs, because of alcohol abuse, because of crime, management takes a decision and says we will apportion action plans. We will put resource into this and we will send police force and we will seriously attack or tackle these issues. This Government run by the ANC putting that kind of resource into this problem shows us that there is no will to fix the crime in this province... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That they stand there and very proudly talk about these high numbers of crime. The ANC proudly talks about these high numbers of crime. That is totally unacceptable and they need to wake up to the fact that they are responsible for these crime levels... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...and they need to put the resource in because the people of this province deserves way better. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister. Order, order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: We want the solution.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, just one second. Hon member Magaxa, is that another question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, the last question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, are you prepared? [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I just want to ask the Minister...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Magaxa. Unfortunately the Minister's time has expired at this point so there is no time for another question. [Interjections.] We have reached the end of this debate.

[Debate concluded.]

We move on to the Question Paper, to Interpellations. The first Interpellation the hon member Wenger to Minister Plato. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, as mentioned by the Acting Premier that Minister Plato is busy at the moment in Kleinmond assisting with trying to de-escalate the violence there, and he has asked whether this could stand down and he has liaised with hon member Wenger in this regard.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So this one will not be dealt with now. We move then on to the third one. I understand the second one is also not being dealt with. Is that correct?

Mr M G E WILEY: That is correct. Minister Bredell is unfortunately ill at the moment.

[Interpellations 1 and 2 to stand down.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The third one is hon member Dyantyi to Minister Mbombo. I see Minister Mbombo.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek wag vir Bredell as hy terugkom. Ek sal hier wees.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am waiting for Bredell when he comes back. I will be here.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek gaan nêrens nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am not going anywhere.]

INTERPELLATIONS

Health Indicators in Critical Health Districts

3. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked Ms N Mbombo, Minister of Health:

Whether the Province is on track to improve the health indicators in critical health districts; if not, what intervention is being done?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. Yes, the province is on track to improve health indicators in all health districts as documented in the 2016/17. Just to make an example of a few: those related to children, mothers and communicable diseases, that is HIV and TB.

If we look at the total children remaining on ARTs for example for the last year, we are at about more than 90% in terms of coverage. TB clients lost to

follow-up rate, which is above 80%; the TB death rate which we have managed to reduce in the province, because now TB is the second highest cause of death in the province. The TB-MDR confirmed treatment initiation rate, we have made progress but it is not enough in terms of that because when it comes to the MDR some patients drop out - not always drop out, but also the prognosis is poor.

The mother post-natal visits within six days, there has been progress but again it is not satisfactory, although we are still around 60% when our target is 27% for mummies coming within six days of their delivery. I can talk later, time permitting, in terms of what the interventions are.

Immunisation coverage, under one year we are doing good. We are above 80%. Children under five years - diarrhoea case fatality rates: this one we have come a long way where we had quite a lot children affected by diarrhoea but now we have improved tremendously. Children under five years suffering from pneumonia in terms of the case fatality rate, also this one there were cases where we plateaued but there has been an improvement around that.

Maternal mortality, we are doing fine with that. The inpatient early neonatal death rate, there has been progress in terms of the improvement. Again the issue in terms of the figures is not necessarily satisfactory because of the denominator, because we are talking about a target of five cases, we had seven cases in the previous year.

The Measles under one year coverage, we are at 95%. The Pneumococcal vaccines or the third dose we are above 85%, The Rotavirus for the second dose coverage - I am just capturing some of those that are sort of crucial. So that is where we are. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Dyantyi.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker.]

†Thank you very much to the Minister for that response. Hon Minister, you know that I have asked you this question in 2015, and said cover for us 2011/12, 12/13 and 13/14. I have again in 2017 asked you the question to say what has been the progress in two years, and I have been very specific to say the critical district. You did say that you just did an overall, because when you say you are improving, I want to give you back that question, next time when you stand up to really respond to that.

Do you think that you are making progress as a province in terms of these health indicators? Can you confirm some of the things that I am going to share with you, that indicate that you are not making progress? And the districts that I have chosen are the Khayelitsha district, Mitchells Plain and Tygerberg, because part of my question referred to critical health districts. That as part of your entire thing, you do know that these districts are very critical in a number of areas.

For example, on infant mortality rates in 2013 to be exact, 11 015 mortality rates of one year olds. As we speak today, you have got 11 223. That cannot be fine. That is not progress. Even one child lost is one too many. I am giving you that as an example, and I want to go further and share with you in terms of two years later in 2015. You are quite correct in saying that there has been a steady decline in a number of these indicators, but there are clearly sharp ones that show there are problems.

In those three districts that I wanted to share with you, and I just want to take the HIV and AIDS rate. In the health district of Mitchells Plain and in the Tygerberg health district in 2017, from 2014 up to 2017, it started at 32 000, 35 000 and it is now at 39 000. That is Khayelitsha, your HIV and AIDS rate. That is not progress. That cannot be fine. It is getting worse, and I want you to speak about that. If you go to the Mitchells Plain health district, it was 17 000, 18 000 the next year, and now it is 21 000.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It cannot be fine.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired in this slot. I see the hon member Botha.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay. Just give your time to me, because I have got so much to deal with here. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms L J BOTHA: Okay, I will consider it. Mr Deputy Speaker, the vision of the Department of Health, in this province, is to ensure that all residents have access to person centred quality care. It is therefore critical that we continue improving on the delivery of health services across the province.

In saying that, one cannot but commend Minister Mbombo and her Department for working so hard to ensure that those using health services only get quality care, but by the same token or means, we are not saying that there are no gaps, and I want to ask the Minister, in terms of the quality service care to patients, what are the complaints that the Department receives in terms of the quality care rendered to patients?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Get smart with your questions, you are wasting my time now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Ms L J BOTHA: But I also want to allude, Mr Deputy Speaker, to the example of the state of the art clinic in Beaufort West... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please.]

Ms L J BOTHA: ... which replaced the old Hillside [Interjection.] Clinic in May in this year. You had your chance, did you not?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dyantyi, order!

Ms L J BOTHA: The Green Clinic, as it is called... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please come to order now.

Ms L J BOTHA: ... because it is an environmental friendly building, now has corridors that are wide enough to incorporate patient waiting areas, and furthermore, through the Back-to-Basic initiative at the Mitchells Plain CDC, the overall waiting times for chronic medication have been reduced from 185 minutes to 76 minutes, while collecting prepacked medication now takes patients about five to 10 minutes, and this is all part of delivering person-centred care in this Department.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, now it is your turn.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Quickly, Mr Deputy Speaker, I hope that those wasted two minutes... Just on the diarrhoea, MEC. Again, those three districts. Khayelitsha from 102 to now 137, Mitchells Plain from 95 to 138. I mean, I

clearly cannot see that is improvement. Let me share this with you. A quote from one professor:

“Cape Town alone has more TB each year, than the US, Canada, UK and Germany put together.”

An HON MEMBER: Yôh!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Cape Town, not South Africa. Cape Town. Just listen to that. Surely that is a crisis, and we know it is so, and yet you come here and say we are making progress. You did allude to the fact that you have challenges in TB, but you are not coming out to say these are the challenges that we have or the problems that we have.

It should also be noted that the high rate of TB stands in sharp contrast to the statistics, which show that the province has the lowest HIV and AIDS prevalence. This might lead to an assumption that poverty levels, unemployment and social challenges lead to the TB infection rate in the Western Cape, hon member Wiley.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The thing that he did not understand. It is not a health problem, it is a problem of conditions. I thought I would come back and share that with you [Interjection.] so that you understand it better. It is not

her problem, as the MEC for Health. It is about those kinds of conditions.

Let me proceed. [Interjection.] Still on TB, which is the biggest killer. Just in terms of the distribution of high beds in TB clinics - you would know in your Department, even across the province. You would have in Knysna, you would have in Bitou, you would have in Ceres, you would have in Theewaterskloof, you will have the bulk of that in the Metro of Cape Town. I am sure you know that better than me. Now... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time has expired. Hon member Botha.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief, man. [Tyd verstreke.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please, man. [Time expired.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Botha. [Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, there is progress within this Department.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh really?

Ms L J BOTHA: This Department... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I have just spoken about... [Interjection.]

Ms L J BOTHA: ... has embarked on an exciting project called Catch-and-Match, that ensures that selected services are brought to the people that need them. The project brings selected services [Interjection.] to people through community health workers, by making home visits, to catch those that are at a greater risk. The community health workers do door-to-door health promotions and support services, where one community worker visits 20 to 250 households in the three pilot sites, which is Nyanga, Delft and Site C, [Interjection.] ensuring that we are actually getting to the people.

The Department achieved 93% of its retention of care after 12 months, with 89% achieved after 48 months. This implementation strategy is proving to be quite successful. 91% of male condom distribution has also been achieved, and I want to ask the Minister, what is the feedback to your Department from the ground in terms of this male condom distribution project that you have, and the... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired.

Ms L J BOTHA: ... lessons learned from the Catch-and-Match project. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Botha, your time has expired. Hon member Dyantyi, your last opportunity.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Is dit die laaste een? Asseblief, man.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is this the last one? Please, man.]

†Hon MEC, because it is my last bite, going through the responses which are very comprehensive, between 2015 and 2017. It clearly shows that if you have got eight districts they are uneven. I have picked up the three critical ones, and my interest, standing here, is surely you can pick up that in certain districts things are going very well. Dare I say that it is that well-off district. I did not want to go there.

Now what is that you want to do as an MEC and this Government to ensure that the positive things happening in those districts are spread across other districts, and what is it? Because you do have plans. How do you refocus your plans, resources and priorities in terms of the Mitchells Plain health district, the Khayelitsha health district, the Tygerberg health district, and when it comes to other indicators, even your Eastern district and the challenges that we have? What is it that you will do to bring them on par?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The Minister to respond.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: For two minutes?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, two minutes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You wish for more, *nè*?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It should have been an oral. Okay, firstly the question, as the member said, in critical health districts, so the districts in terms of its seats. So it is the five rural districts plus the Metro. The Metro is a district on its own. If you wanted to zoom to the Metro, the substructures within the Metro, when you take Metro as one district, it gives you the figures that I gave, and now if you... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I know. My question [Inaudible.] Metro... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Now, within the eight substructures within the Metro, for example, the questions he asks about infant mortality, it will give that as being an improvement, but when you zoom in some specifics, as he has quoted, the problem is when you quote the figures, not a percentage, it is because they are the denominator, in which the population of Khayelitsha is related.

So if last year or in 2014 there were three out of 10, and then today there are five out of 20, then it means that percentage wise – you might say, if you only say three versus five, then you think that is an increase, but if you do not quote the denominator, it is problematic. Hence you have to use... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] lies.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So that is why it is usually better to use the

rates or the ratios or the percentages, so that you can understand it in terms of the trends. Same issue with the... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In other words, you [Inaudible.]. You have [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No-no, no, what I saying is that within the Metro, when you zoom into the specific substructures, you will have the epidemiology where HIV might be high in others. Like if you go to Masiphumelele/Ocean View you can get that interpersonal violence is the highest, TB probably the third. So you will get all those fluctuations.

So it is easier when you zoom per each substructure within the Metro so that you could be able to answer such, not focus on the number of cases, but you should on the percentage.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do you agree TB is a crisis... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And then the issue of the TB. Out of the four provinces, the Western Cape is one of the four provinces that has the highest TB, and I am talking about the current figures. In terms of where we are it is the second biggest killer in the Western Cape. In all other provinces, TB is the ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... biggest killer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So we have improved 80%... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired unfortunately.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:... in the successful treatment rate. We have improved TB. Bye-bye TB and HIV AIDS.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: To be continued.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to Questions.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: To be continued.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The first question, I take it the Minister Winde will then respond to this. Minister Winde?

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Hermanus and Gansbaai: progress on special economic zone

1. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Premier:

What progress has been made since she promised on 20 June 2014 to apply to the national Department of Trade and Industry to declare the area between Hermanus and Gansbaai a special economic zone so that abalone farmers can receive special tariffs and incentives in order to increase their production, grow real jobs and reduce poaching?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM/ACTING PREMIER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As – and I see that hon member Dugmore is not here - but as the hon member Dugmore is well aware, after a general election, the Premier delivers the State of the Province speech at the opening of a new Parliament. This speech sets out the new Government's plans for its term of office, by outlining the Government's vision and policy for the term, and by highlighting some concrete proposals which it hopes to implement.

These proposals are submitted by Provincial Departments for inclusion into the speech, and indicate new ideas and areas where the Government would like to focus its attention. The hon member will also be aware that as Provincial Government we must also work with other spheres of Government, and especially where there are concurrent or overlapping powers. This is acknowledged in his question.

In addition, although the Premier, as head of Government, reads the speech in Parliament, the Premier is not the implementing agent of every programme included in the speech. I can assure the hon member that the Western Cape Government supports the establishment of special economic zones, and this has been demonstrated by the commitment, both financial and non-financial, of the Saldanha Bay IDZ, and the Atlantis Special Economic Zone.

There has been initial conceptual work done on the establishment of other SEZs for sectors such as aquaculture, health technology and agri-processing. The establishment of an SEZ has high initial input costs, which include both prefeasibility studies and feasibility studies, which require a very strong degree of certainty that the application will meet the stringent scrutiny and approval of the SEZ Advisory Board.

Consideration must also be given to whether the application will get approval from the various National Departments, including National Treasury. In my capacity as Economic Opportunities, I can tell you, hon members, that this issue of SEZs was discussed at the MINMEC, which I attend. This is the MINMEC of Trade and Industry and of Economic Development, and at that MINMEC at the beginning of this term, we were advised that each province would be limited to one SEZ application.

Our application for the Green SEZ in Atlantis was therefore accepted, and we have had to park our other plans for the aquaculture, health technology and agri-processing SEZs. Cooperative governance means making compromises,

and we have had to compromise on this issue.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank, Mr Deputy Speaker. Question one refers specifically to the SEZ between Hermanus and Gansbaai, and it wants to know what progress has been made so that abalone farmers can receive special tariffs and incentives in order to increase their production? I would like to get that answer, please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, you may respond.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So if the hon member listened to the... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I did.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... the answer... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I did.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... it was exactly the same, whether it was the aquaculture SEZ, or the health tech SEZ, or even the work that is still carrying in the agri-

processing SEZ space. But we were advised to only submit the one, so therefore in the aquaculture space, there is no Special Economic Zone in the approval process, or even in the application process, because, as I also said, that it was agreed at that MINMEC level, although we wanted to submit three and four applications, it was agreed that each province should only submit one.

Through our process of looking at which one it would be, or stand the best chance of getting a successful answer, we then did the work and came out with the Green SEZ, which is the one that has actually been signed off by Minister Davies and is out for public comment at the moment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a further follow-up, hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, that longwinded response, the answer is actually no. No progress has been made, but my follow-up question is: What is now going to happen to the promise that was made to these people in 2014, by the Premier?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So I will not, without reading the answer again... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, you do not have to. I heard it the first time.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You know, exactly the same thing was said about health tech, exactly the same thing is said at the moment around agri-processing and Halal, and of course in each of those, the answer would be: No special rates or taxation benefits would go to those industries, because they would not be in a Special Economic Zone until we could get one right.

So perhaps the hon member, if she wanted to get more detail on it, could perhaps engage with both of the hon Ministers at a national level of the economy or DTI... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I am asking you the question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and they could then tell us if we could get to have more than one Special Economic Zone.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the second question. Hon Dugmore to Minister Madikizela. Minister Madikizela?

Resident in Eagle Park on subsidised housing waiting list

2. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

When will a certain person, whose name has been furnished to his Department for the purpose of this reply, who lives in a Wendy house at 10 Lavender Close, Eagle Park, and whose name has been on the waiting list since the early 1980s, receive a subsidised house from the Government?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The City of Cape Town who maintains the Housing Demand Database has confirmed that the person in question has not registered an application with the City.

It was further established that the said gentleman previously owned a property in Uitenhage, and will therefore not qualify for a housing subsidy from Government again.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Uitenhage?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on. In the absence of further questions. Question 3, I understand will stand over in the absence of Minister Bredell. Question 4, hon member Tyatyam to Minister Marais. Minister Marais?

“Tweede Nuwejaar”: Second New Year’s celebrations

4. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

What is her Department’s plan to make the Second New Year’s celebrations (“Tweede Nuwejaar”) and other related activities successful and (b) how much money will be spent?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: †Dankie [thank you] for the question. The Department annually makes a contribution to the Minstrel bodies, Malay choirs and Christmas bands for the end-of-year festivities.

The Department annually supports the second New Year celebration by providing medical assistance, in conjunction with the Department of Health, and further contributes towards the transport costs of Minstrel Boards for the second New Year festivities. Further, a financial contribution is made towards the competitions of all compliant boards, for venue hire, transport, sound, security and auditing fees.

To facilitate a successful event, there are interactions with the City of Cape Town and other key role players, to ensure the success of the events. Internally, the Department has rendered support in formalising processes by introducing a scorecard and templates for the recipients which address issues of compliance to ensure the effective and efficient management of

Government resources, and a common understanding of the purpose and reporting requirements by recipients of funding, and the total budgetary allocation for the 17/18 financial year, is R2 100 000. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then move onto the next question, Question 5. Hon member Tyatyam to Minister Winde. Minister Winde?

Protecting farm workers from eviction

5. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

What is his intervention for protecting farm workers from eviction and for improving their wellbeing?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. All legal and illegal evictions are dealt with according to specific processes as per the Extension of Security of Tenure Act 62 of 1997.

These processes are the mandate of the National Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, and administered as such by them. This Department maintains the database of all evictions pertaining to agri workers and farm dwellers.

However, over and above that, my Department has a sub-programme, called Farm Worker Development, the only one of its kind in the country, and this sub-programme assists evicted agri workers through the facilitation of access, to appropriate departments and municipalities through its Referral System, in order to link them with services and support structures during this process, as and when this Department is made aware of such cases.

This sub-programme also focuses on various strategic projects geared towards social upliftment and the development of agri workers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are no follow up questions. We then move on to Question 6, hon member Uys to Minister Grant. Minister Grant?

Leeuwenhof: Municipal water consumption

6. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

What was the municipal water consumption of Leeuwenhof, the official residence of the Premier, per month in 2017;

whether any water-saving measures and/or equipment have been put in place at Leeuwenhof; if so, (a) what and (b) at what cost?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the answer to Question number 1 is that the City of Cape Town

provides in its municipal service accounts, a combination of actual water meter readings and estimates.

The monthly municipal water accounts for the official residence of the Premier at Leeuwenhof, some of which includes estimates, are as follows:

- January '17, which was an estimate, 26.61 kilolitres.
- February '17, actual, 18.39 kilolitres.
- March 2017, an estimate, 19.63 kilolitres.
- April '17, actual, 21.37 kilolitres.
- May '17, an estimate, 20.81 kilolitres.
- June '17, an estimate, 21.53 kilolitres.
- July '17, an estimate, 32 kilolitres.
- Then in August '17, actual, 14 kilolitres.
- And then September 2017, month-to-date, 10 kilolitres.

The average water monthly consumption for the residence, in terms of the above-mentioned billing, amounts to 20.48 kilolitres, which is below the monthly average of 21 kilolitres per household, in terms of level 5 water restrictions.

Then the answer to the second question, Mr Deputy Speaker, is:

1. The existing borehole/well point at Leeuwenhof was reinstated and registered with the City of Cape Town in 2016, as a measure to manage

water consumption in respect of the gardens.

2. A water purification installation to purify the stream water on the site, was installed earlier this month at a cost of R92 754.56.

Once the City of Cape Town's water inspectorate has assessed the installation and approval has been obtained, the water will be directed to the residence for drinking water.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Yes. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We all know that there is a cap on all households of 20 kilolitres per month, but may I ask the hon Minister Grant, what is the number of people residing at Leeuwenhof? Because that is important, because we know the restriction is 87 litres per day per individual. Can you just tell us, because it is important to calculate that?

Mr M G E WILEY: Do they not have their own water supply?

Mr P UYS: There is no [Inaudible.] water supply.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy

Speaker, this is speculation based on my knowledge, but obviously I am very seldom at Leeuwenhof, but obviously the Premier, her husband and at least one or two other people in the main residence. In other words, a total of four.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: I think there is speculation there, and we will have to clarify that, but that is still very concerning, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is well over the limit set by the City of Cape Town. 87 litres per day per individual, and you can make your calculations now.

But let me ask, what is happening around the swimming pool at Leeuwenhof, Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is a new question. I do not know.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your third opportunity.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, when we look at the water management of all people in the Metro, a swimming pool is integrated into what you do. Is it covered, do you circulate it, do you add new water to it every day? It is important to know that, and please answer that question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a fire pool. [Laughter]

Mr P UYS: It is a fire pool, that is the answer.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am happy to answer the question. It will have to be a written reply. I have no idea. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then move on to the next question, the last question. Hon Uys again to Minister Grant. I see Minister Grant.

Leaking pipes at Western Cape Government premises: water lost

***7. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

- (a) How much water is being lost due to leaking pipes at premises of the Western Cape Government and its entities, (b) how is this measured and (c) what measures have been put in place to limit leakages?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The answer to question (a), how much water is being lost due to leaking pipes at premises of the Western Cape Government and its entities?

The answer to that question is until recently it has not been technically possible for my Department, as custodian, across an extensive system reliant

on municipal billing, to identify water loss and to relate this loss to specific causes, whether leaking pipes, leaking and broken taps, malfunctioning toilets, etcetera.

In some cases, any water loss becomes apparent only because of unusual variations in water consumption, as reflected in water accounts. Even then the leakage may be located in infrastructure, for which the local municipality is responsible, and not the custodian of the property.

This difficulty is aggravated by the fact that approximately 80% of the entire provincial immovable asset portfolio, comprises social infrastructure, in particular, health and education facilities with multiple users, and different legal entities responsible for settling water accounts. For example, in respect of the Western Cape Education Department, the accounts for water usage are paid direct by either the school governing bodies, or by the WCED, and monitored and managed by that Department.

In respect of health facilities, the Department of Health is responsible to ensure that mechanisms to measure, monitor and control water usage are in place. All cases of identified and reported water leakages are classified by my Department as emergencies, and dealt with accordingly.

In response to question 7(b): How is this measured? The response to (a) above has indicated what has, until recently, been the situation in relation to the measuring of water leakages.

However, as custodian works, Education Infrastructure has undertaken research into leak detection initiatives. This has included the installation at 67 schools of Aquatrip, which is a permanently installed leak detection system, monitoring the flow of water into a property, which is programmable, so that the water will automatically switch off in the event of a burst geyser, burst pipes, taps left running, etcetera.

Leaks are even detected after-hours, resulting in the shutting off of the water supply, thereby eliminating any possible water wastage. Initial monitoring indicates significant water savings and the successful early identification of water loss. In many cases the cost of installation is rapidly recouped. Once the pilot system has been completed, decisions on the further rollout of the system can be made.

In addition, using another technology, my Department is rolling out the installation of meters for the remote measuring of utility usage, that is for both water and electricity, in all its provincially owned buildings, so that by the end of the current calendar year, water and electricity usage can be measured in real-time, and monitored far more effectively than is currently the case. That is by means of relying on municipal accounts, unexplained high usage such as caused by leakages, can be identified immediately and the problem investigated and addressed.

And portion (c) of the question: What measures have been put in place to limit leakages? As the custodian of provincial properties, the Department of

Transport and Public Works has since 2011/12, implemented initiatives measuring and monitoring the consumption, cost and behaviour of users in specific leased and owned accommodation, exceeding 1 000 square meters.

It was found in 2015/16 that the usage in respect of the buildings measured and monitored by the Department of Transport and Public Works in the Property Efficiency Report, was lower than the benchmark averages across South African corporate offices. The Property Efficiency Report measures, amongst other things, water consumption per square metre, per person and per portfolio. This is within the CBD and outside the CBD, against industry benchmarks.

Although this initiative focuses on water savings and not leakage management per se, it has led to the identification and correction of leakages, as well as to the identification of the new technology referred to above.

All existing taps in all bathrooms in provincial buildings are being fitted with flow restrictors, which significantly limit water leakage and wastage. Internal communication campaigns... [Interjection.] are regularly run across the Western Cape Government departments, highlighting the importance of reporting leaks effectively, so that they can be dealt with urgently. It is broadly accepted that water conservation measures save more water than the fixing of leaks on their own.

I am happy to supply the hon member with a full list of the water

conservation measures implemented across the Western Cape Government.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am very concerned. Minister Grant started off and said, “We do not know because it is in the hands of Department of Health and Education.” I think I must just ask a very simple question. What is the water consumption and what is your target to reduce the water consumption?

Because that is the norm that you put to all in industry, and they are all working towards 20% reduction in water consumption. What is the water consumption now of Provincial Government, and what is the aim of the consumption of water? And it seems like you are far behind private sector in this province, and not showing leadership.

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is true.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, with respect to the hon member, I said exactly the contrary. Most of our figures that we have at our disposal, are lower than the private sector.
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Give it to us.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I am happy to do so, but that is a new question, and I will give it to you. It is no problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your second question?

Mr P UYS: We asked it. You knew you were coming here to answer the question, why do you not give us the figures? [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, get to the question.

Mr P UYS: It is easy. Mr Deputy Speaker, now you say you respond to burst pipes. Now what do you do? Do you have an emergency unit? Do you have a couple of plumbers to do that? What is your response, and how quickly do you respond to it?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Answer that, please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He outsources that.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Answer that.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I will give the hon member Uys a copy of my reply, because if you had listened properly... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: I did.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... I said we are measuring the flow of both water and electricity in real-time on handheld devices.

Mr P UYS: Handheld?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: So the answer is instantaneous.

Ms M N GILLION: Oh my word!

An HON MEMBER: Instantaneous.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Hon Minister Grant, can you take out one of those handheld devices and tell us what is happening in this building now? You cannot and that is the problem, but let me ask you this: What is your decision around swimming pools in the Western Cape belonging to and under the support of the Provincial Government of the Western Cape? Are they open? Are they closed as they are supposed to be? What is happening?

No, do not look around. It is an easy question. [Laughter.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Just answer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Grant, you may respond.

Mr P UYS: That is what we... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P UYS: ... we as citizens must answer that. You must answer it too.

Mr M G E WILEY: No, but you threw him in the deep end, man.
[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Ah! Thank you! [Applause, laughter.] I like that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister Grant, you may – order!
Minister... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: I like that.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy
Speaker, he threw me in the deep end with a drip. [Laughter.]

Mr P UYS: Not even a drip, a snorkel maybe.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Ja, that is what you are, whether you like it or not. [Interjections.] Which swimming pool is the hon member Uys referring to, Mr Deputy Speaker?

Ms M N GILLION: Oh my word!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your last opportunity now.

Mr P UYS: If you do not know which swimming pools fall under your Department, that is a problem, but let me ask a very simple question: What is the percentage of water losses of the Provincial Government in the Western Cape? The percentage, because everybody can tell you that, the City of Cape Town can tell you - July 2017, 17.7%.

Now you tell us what is the water loss of your services that you rendered? Tell us that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a very difficult question. He will not know that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Grant, you may answer.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is a different question [Interjection.], but let me say there is not one answer which suits all buildings, but let me tell you what we are doing in our building in 9 Dorp Street. For example [Interjections.] where what we

are trying to do is to take the entire building, except for potable water, and that is the air-conditioning systems as well as the toilets, taking it completely off grid by recycling the underground water.

So these are other questions which the hon member Uys is dreaming up, which he does not put on the Order Paper [Interjections.], because if he had to specify all these additional questions, I would gladly have given him the answer. [Interjections.]

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, these are new questions... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Water is a scarce.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, we move on. Order. We have reached the end of questions, we now move on to Statements by Members. I see the DA, hon member Botha.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. September is the month where communities across the world commemorate the deaf as part of International Month for Deaf People. This vital month forms part of the first World Congress of the World Federation of the Deaf, which took place in September 2015.

It is important that we continue to create awareness of the various challenges that our fellow citizens who are deaf are facing, so that whatever difficulties they might have, can be addressed.

This is where I would like to commend the various schools, institutions and organisations across the country, that serve as champions for their rights. I further applaud them for ensuring that the challenges and needs of the deaf are being addressed.

It is estimated that there are over 600 000 deaf people in our country, with more than 1,4 million suffering from hearing loss. It is, however, concerning that only one in two, worldwide, are educated in sign language.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as members of this House we have to make a concerted effort to at least attempt to learn how to sign. Furthermore, we have to rally behind the deaf in their quest of making sign language the 12th official language in South Africa.

I was extremely humbled when I recently read a story in the media about 40-year old Baronesa Michaels from Worcester, who even though deaf for most of her life, is a successful entrepreneur, designing and selling wall clocks.

Finally, when we recognise the positive contributions that the deaf are making to our society, we are celebrating them. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Magaxa, the ANC.

Mr K E MAGAXA (ANC): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. There is an empty bench of the absent hon Premier Helen Zille in this Legislature. She is travelling all around the world in her last remaining months as the Premier.

On Twitter she enjoys healthy food [Interjections.], poses with bottles of wine [Interjection.] and is driven in a flag-decorated car, compliments of the taxpayer, while her province faces disasters like drought, together with water shortages, devastating fires and the killing of innocent people.

It seems like she is more taken up with the work of Liberals International, than the Cape poor. She even ignores her errant MECs, like the hon member Debbie Schäfer, insulting people.

Under the Premier's leadership, confidential Cabinet minutes are leaked, abused for narrow party political games, like yesterday in Scopa when the hon member Denis Joseph supposedly quoted from it.

Even here she is not defended by her caucus anymore. [Interjection.] Just one lackey tries to protect her, the hon member Mark Wiley, who is behaving like an old apartheid military general.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baas [boss] Wiley, ja.

Mr K E MAGAXA: His role in this democratic Parliament is to intimidate opponents, both inside the DA and in this Parliament in the Opposition. He uses any opportunity to close any democratic space to force everybody who happens to be against or criticise him. The hon member regularly jumps up to attempt and shield her. He will soon come again with another trick to cover for her. [Interjection.] The hon member Wiley will try repeatedly, but... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr K E MAGAXA:... he will not succeed as he only exposes his Premier to more public ridicule.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time has expired.

Mr K E MAGAXA: My last sentence, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is disgraceful that at this moment in our democratic position, we still have a person like hon member Wiley... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... who does not even acknowledge any relationship [Inaudible.][Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired. Hon member

Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just would like to raise a point of order. The hon member [Interjections.] that has spoken now is misleading the House.

Ms M N GILLION: This is a statement.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is incorrect and it is untruth that he spoke. It was a memorandum to Cabinet, and it was an unclassified document. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Yes, that is not a point of order, but you have made your point, and that is the end of the story. That is not a point of order. I see then the DA.

Ms M N GILLION: No, I...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am sorry. Yes, I am listening, sorry.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, is it right for the hon member Joseph to say that the Leader of Opposition is lying? He... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... is speaking... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear that. He used the word “untruth” which is parliamentary. That is quite normal, quite acceptable. We move to the DA now. I see the hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Metrorail continues to fail the people of the Western Cape, and this is a very serious concern that has been highlighted every day by many people, commuters and the working places where the people are supposed to be.

It has come to the point where practically every day approximately 700 000 people, who rely on Metrorail to provide a good service, are stranded, frustrated and confused.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this entire year, PRASA has been talking about working towards stabilising and restoring the Metrorail service. Yet just over the past two weeks, even our staff members who rely on the services have highlighted that trains have in fact become more unreliable over the past year, and are posing a threat to their workplace, their safety and are breaking their relationships with their families.

We cannot expect anything less from a service that primarily relies on

railway infrastructure that is over three decades old. Furthermore, Metrorail requires at least 80 trainsets to run efficiently - that is hoping that many of the other problems with the service are not going to pop up. At this particular point, PRASA only has 60 working trainsets. This indicates therefore that Metrorail only have 75% of the trains needed to run at a minimum rate of efficiency.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the challenges in the greater Cape Town Metropolitan area, in relation to public transport, especially commuter rail, remain a considerable concern to the DA led Western Cape Government.

While commuter rail falls within the national mandate of the National Department of Transport and PRASA railway agency, I am however pleased to hear and take consolation from the fact that the Department of Transport and Public Works and City of Cape Town... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr N E HINANA: ... continue to try to get... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish off, your time has expired. Your last sentence.

Mr N E HINANA: They continue to engage with management structures in these organisations to make the process of commuting people safely and on

time, to become the reliable thing that it was before. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has now really expired. I again see the DA in the absence of one of the smaller parties. Hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, we are on the verge of a technological revolution that will fundamentally alter the way we live, work and relate to one another. The rapid expansion of technology and high levels of innovation means we are more connected than ever before.

This has brought increased pressure for us to equip and prepare for the ‘4th Industrial Revolution’. In its scale, scope and complexity, the 4th Industrial Revolution will be disruptive, and while we do not yet fully know its implications, we do need to prepare for it. Our response must be integrated and comprehensive to ensure that as we move into this new revolution, we improve equality and do everything that we can to bring all citizens into the technological age, less we further entrench inequality.

To do this we need a whole of society approach. The Western Cape Government has adopted initiatives that fuse technology and human capital to attempt to solve a range of societal, safety and business problems. For example, since the DA took over government in this province, we understood the importance of using technology to promote inclusivity. That is why we aim to get all our citizens connected online and to the world.

To date, over 1 000 sites have been completed, consisting of either wireless or fibre optic cable. Broadband services have been activated at over 900 of these sites, and more than 600 schools, across both rural and urban areas in our province, have been connected, as well as 90 libraries and 160 corporate sites. In addition, to prepare our youth and teachers through E-learning programmes, to provide a competitive and quality education similar to many of the leading economies in the world.

At Government internet hubs in rural areas and Youth Cafés across the province, online tools and resources help the people of our province, and in particular the youth, to be part of the future and to integrate them into a technology driven future, where the youth can participate in the economy, have choices, and not be captured by poverty or violence, because, Mr Deputy Speaker, we have to prepare for tomorrow today.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the ANC, hon member Dyantyi.

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor.

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI (ANC): The sorry state of affairs in Mossel Bay reveals just how bad the DA... [Interjection.]

†Mnr K E MAGAXA: Gooi kole.

[Mr K E MAGAXA: Throw coals.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... is for local government.

†n AGB LID: Ja man.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes, man.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mossel Bay Chief Financial Officer, Marius Botha, was eventually fired after his jail sentence of five years... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Good governance.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... for contraventions of the Municipal Finance Management Act including fraud and money laundering. Now listen to this... [Interjection.] The DA deployed Botha against warnings, and after he was found guilty, the DA continued to protect him.

Municipal Manager, Thys Gilliomee, is also redeployed to Mossel Bay after he left the Provincial Liquor Authority as CEO, with two forensic reports of irregular expenditure presently at SCOPA. Gilliomee has succeeded Dr Michele Gratz who also left under a cloud.

As if that is not enough, the DA Ward 102 councillor in Cape Town's northern suburbs of Brackenfell and Kraaifontein, Carin Brynard, resigned after eleven years ahead of the DA internal factional fight to find new metro and provincial leaders. And another councillor jumps the DA ship. [Interjections.]

Brynard cites the dictatorial and bully management style of former provincial leader, Patricia de Lille, Cape Town Mayor, who ignores her caucus and middle class areas that do not get value for their tax money, as even roads are not maintained. Shame, *skande* on the messing up of local government, DA. [Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: Haai nee man, *shame* man.

[An HON MEMBER: Hey, no man, shame man.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Die DA.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The DA.] Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As we are a week away from Heritage Day... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Shh, the leader is speaking.

Mr L H MAX: ... I want to encourage this entire House to make their heritage the building block to improve South Africa, and thus move us forward. We

can do this because we are truly blessed as a nation to have a multitude of cultures and traditions in our country.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You better listen.

Mr L H MAX: An effort is, however, needed across all sectors of society, including Government and the various political parties we have. We should see this as an opportunity in the Western Cape to demonstrate that although we have different cultures and traditions, although we are from different political parties, together we can drive our province and country forward.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy, daarsy.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go, there you go.]

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, we should not just see the day as another opportunity to braai... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nou praat jy.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now you're talking.]

Mr L H MAX: ... but utilise it to engage each other about how we can optimally use our heritage, our history, to propel us forward... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, yes, yes.

Mr L H MAX: ... so that we can reach heights that might never before have been possible. As a province and a country we have come a long way, but I am of the view that there is more on the horizon. [Interjections.]

Our forefathers laid the foundation by recognising and respecting each other's heritage. Let us use it now as a building block and move South Africa forward.

Ms M N GILLION: That is my home, boy!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hoor-hoor!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: He is our member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order. The ANC.

An HON MEMBER: That is a good member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, in welcoming the statement by hon member Max, teachers and workers, parents and learners in various areas of the province daily duck-and-dive to dodge bullets in real life war zones to get to school, and back to their homes. The crisis in Western Cape education

escalates as almost nothing is done by the province to alleviate their life-threatening situation, except to complain.

Altogether 13 schools in Hanover Park and Lansdowne recently thanked National Government for engaging with their communities to try and find lasting solutions to those problems.

Amongst the problems are learners involved in gangs, substance abuse, bullying and aggression that adds to instability. The high-risk schools say learning under these circumstances is almost impossible. Schools cannot be used after-hours and the communities are hostages in their own homes as violence and deaths cries out for action and attention. Fear and uncertainty is now part of the dangerous lives people lead. The constitutional rights of these people are denied unfairly.

Communities ask that programmes should aid them, community workers trained to assist them in the absence of Bambanani workers, which the DA Government dissolved, and that bullet reflective fences be erected next to measures like CCTV cameras. When will the DA Government take the lives of our people in poor communities seriously to really help them out of this disaster?

†n AGB LID: Hulle gee nie om nie.

[An HON MEMBER: They do not care.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The DA, hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. A decision by the United Kingdom Public Relations and Communications Association to expel the controversial Gupta linked agency, Bell Pottinger, is a victory for the people of South Africa against racially divided tactics of the ANC to deliberately divide and harm our society.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The ANC... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: This outcome proves that President Jacob Zuma [Interjection.] and the Gupta family have done to our country a shameful and unethical attempt to exploit racism and racial tension in South Africa.

†Die samestelling van so veldtog was doelbewus beplan om rassisme en ook die wonde van die verlede wat ons besig is om te heel in Suid-Afrika, weer oop te maak. Dit is politieke wanhopigheid van 'n korrupte en onbevoegde regering wat deur die Guptas gebruik was en Bell Pottinger wat gebruik was. Dit is 'n manipulering van die demokratiese prosesse en korrupte ANC Regering wat in mag wil bly. [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The constitution of such a campaign was planned deliberately to again open up racism and the wounds of the past that we are busy healing in South

Africa. It is political desperation of a corrupt and incompetent government used by the Guptas and Bell Pottinger that has been used. It is manipulation of the democratic processes and the corrupt ANC Government that wants to stay in power. [Interjection.]

The DA has challenged the shameful and unethical act by reporting Bell Pottinger to their industry's governing board, and this agency was expelled as a sign that the ANC and the Gupta family were corrupt. They were dividing the voters on racial lines. The fall of Bell Pottinger is a victory for truth and democracy, and the people of our South Africa.

This is also a victory for the people against the ANC and against the ANC Government who has become a corrupt government. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That ends the Statements. We move on to Motions printed on the Order Paper and I am trying to find the Chief Whip to move his motion.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy is orals.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is everywhere.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before I see the Chief Whip, I will allow parties, who want to take the opportunity, three minutes to speak on the motion.

Mr P UYS: Just a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: May I address you on that, please? Mr Deputy Speaker, this motion, and if you just bear with me and it is important what I am going to say; this motion with notice was submitted by hon member Wiley on 15 June this year. Consequently it was with notice, so it was below the line, if I may say that.

Now that motion was put on the Order Paper, and when you put a motion on the Order Paper, Mr Deputy Speaker, that motion must be the same motion as you put forward on the date, and the date was 15 June 2017. The problem that we have is this motion I now see printed on the Order Paper, is not the same motion as was submitted on 15 June ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Uitgevang.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Caught out.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are cheating.

Mr P UYS: ... by the hon Chief Whip at that time. Therefore I have a major problem with this motion serving here today, because we cannot amend a motion before coming to this House for consideration. I would therefore ask that we not consider this motion, it gets rectified if it is still valid, and

replaced on the Order Paper.

I am very concerned and I would like to ask the question, and I would like to believe it was not done deliberately.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Maybe the Chief Whip of the ANC can just assist us to say in which respect the motion differs. I am just aware of the numbering. Is there anything else in it?

Mr P UYS: No, it is substantially – sections left out here, but you know, in terms of the separation of power, I do not want to do the job of the officials.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I am not aware that the motion is different. If that is the case, then certainly the Chief Whip has a point. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you very much... [Interjection.] I am surprised that the Chief Whip is complaining this way, without any substance, because I would love to know in what way it has changed. I would ask the Table in what way ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just ask the Table.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... if in any, it has changed, because I actually have an amendment here which I will distribute to the House at the appropriate time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just ask the Table.

Mr M G E WILEY: So I would love to know exactly where the difference lies.

Ms M N GILLION: The Table must now serve the people of the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I ask the Chief Whip, hon member Uys, just to give an indication in what respects this motion differs from the one that was originally moved?

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, would you agree if the motion that is now on the table is not similar to the motion that was submitted on 15 June, that this motion cannot proceed?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot agree without knowing exactly what we are talking about. The numbering is one, that is a technical change to the motion. There is nothing substantive to that. What other changes are there?

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I refer you to the Order Paper of 22 June 2017, and that is the Order Paper where the motion was printed in. That was also my notes in terms of the motion, and that is the correct motion I believe, that was tabled, and that is the motion.

What is happening here, Mr Deputy Speaker, under motion 20, there are four sections. I hear what you say about numbering - 1, 2, 3 and 4 and I have no problem adding numbers to it, because it just makes it much better to engage with. But, Mr Deputy Speaker, what was deleted and what was not in this motion that we see today is the one that I am going to read to you. And I am going to read from this blue one. It is not my blue one, and that is:

“And that the committee consists of 4 members of the DA, 2 members of the ANC and 1 member of the ACDP.”

And that was the motion, Mr Deputy Speaker, and it is not here and I am very-very concerned and I would like you to not consider this motion today.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. I am afraid the hon Chief Whip is correct. I am sitting with the minutes of the House in front of me, on page 25 of 22 June. He is correct that there was a resolution taken on the composition of this committee as well, or that was the way it was moved and it is not on the Order Paper now.

Chief Whip, the way out of this one is to not move the motion and move it at a next meeting in the correct form, or you can try and move an amendment to the motion as it stands, but I am uncomfortable with the fact that the motion is not in the same format as previously.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would ask though that the

Paper Section of Parliament explains to us at a later stage how this came about, because all that we asked was that the motion that was below the line be taken above the line. So, I would like to know how that happened, but I take in good faith what my hon colleague on the other side has said and we accept and we will stand down until the next time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, thank you. I think that is the way to go forward. I am not aware of any motives about this. It was simply a technical omission but we will correct it next time. We then move on to the other motions. We move to Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Magaxa?

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the unbecoming behaviour of the hon Premier Zille in the House which has led to her being booted out of the House in two consecutive sittings for undermining the authority of the Speaker and disregarding House Rules by refusing to withdraw unparliamentary comments. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M G E WILEY: You must learn a lesson from that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any further? Hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the mandate and sustainability of district municipalities.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am ready for that! I can take them [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Lekker?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You had better do your homework.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the efficiency and effectiveness of the Western Cape Police Ombudsman.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the progress in the allocation of housing opportunities in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact that the influx of international tourists will have on our water shortages in the province, and mitigating strategies adopted by the Provincial Government. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that one. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVDEO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the unscrupulous, criminal and barbaric actions of violence, protest, destruction, looting and anarchy on our campuses, state buildings, residential areas and open spaces. I so move.

[Interjection.]

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? For the last time. Hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates urban and rural development relating to budget allocation.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that one. Any further? Can we then move on to the next section? Are there any Motions without Notice? Hon member Magaxa?

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that Tuesday marked 40 years since the leader of the Black Consciousness Movement, Stephen Bantu Biko, was killed while in police custody in 1977; further notes that Biko was one of the sharpest thinkers of his generation. He was a philosopher and activist and an organic intellectual, whose ideas like “the most potent weapon in the hands of the oppressor is the mind of the oppressed,” still influence and inspire young people today; acknowledges Nelson Mandela’s charge that they had to kill him to prolong the life of apartheid; remembers him and conveys condolences to his family and friends.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the Department of ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just start again, hon Wenger. I could not hear you. Just, order.

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice;

That the House condemns the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries for its handling of the fishing quotas in the Western Cape, which is resulting in the marginalisation of historic fishing communities, such as Hangberg, and requests the National Government to revise the quotas and allocations.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deepest condolences to the bereaved family, loved ones, friends and the school community of Hyde Park Primary in Parkwood Estate. The 7-year old Ezra Daniels, a learner, had been fatally wounded in gang cross fire and was laid to rest on 9 September 2017. May his dear soul rest in peace. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon

member Gillion?

Ms M M GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the increase in attacks on paramedics has led to the Provincial Government increasing so-called red zones from 12 to 16, which means that the lives of people endangered as a result of paramedics taking longer to arrive, are also increasing; condemns the attacks on emergency personnel; and calls on communities to protect emergency workers.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates College of Cape Town student, Aviwe Mvoko, who was crowned as the best male speaker during the recent National Student Debate competition that was held in East London, Eastern Cape. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Simmers first.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Martin Borg, 'n adjutant-offisier van George gelukwens met 'n welverdiende derde plek tydens 'n toekenningsgeleentheid van die nasionale konferensie van die Gesinsgeweld, Kinderbeskerming en Seksuele Misdrywe-eenheid, 'n eer wat nie sommer enige een toekom nie. Ek plaas dit so op die tafel.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie? Goedgekeur. Agb Lekker?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Martin Borg, an adjutant officer of

George, on a well-deserved third place during an award ceremony of the national conference of the Family Violence, Child Protection and Sexual Offences Unit, an honour that does not befall just anyone. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon Lekker?]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that the killing of women and children continues unabated in the province as a result of the hon Premier Zille's refusal to take action as requested by the citizens; notes further that more women were killed in recent weeks: Laurina Ryk (26) from De Doorns died after she was allegedly beaten with a shovel by her boyfriend; Zanele Sandlana (21) ... [Interjection.] whose body was dumped in an open field ... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER:

“... in TR Section Lingeletu West last week. She was found with a bottle stuffed in her mouth; Shannon Mozes who was strangled to death by her boyfriend in Heinz Park and Asive Sizani (19) who was found strangled to death at her boyfriend's house in Delft on Sunday morning; condemns the senseless killing of women in the province; welcomes the

arrests of the killers in all the above cases; and conveys our condolences to their families. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without – is there an objection?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed. Hon member Olivier first.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns incidents of abuse of learners by teachers at Western Cape Schools after a Grade 1 learner at Grosvenor Primary in Atlantis was stripped naked in the class in front of her classmates and another Grade 9 learner at another school was called a “magosha”, which means a whore, by her teacher; and calls for speedy investigations and disciplinary action against the teachers. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without

notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Kivedo?

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy opregte gelukwense uitspreek teenoor ons kollega en Parlementêre diensbeampte, mnr Charles Breda, wie onlangs 31 jaar ononderbroke diensjare in die staats- en wetgewende sektor, asook sy 50ste verjaarsdag op 8 September 2017 gevier het. Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel? Goedgekeur.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its sincere thanks to our colleague and Parliamentary officer, Mr Charles Breda, who recently celebrated 31 years continuous service in the state and legislative sector, as well as his 50th birthday on 8 September 2017. I so move.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion? Agreed to.] Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Day Zero, when the province's dams run dry could arrive in December; notes further that the province is in this predicament as a result of failures by the DA-led municipalities and Provincial Government to plan for and better manage daily water consumption; and allowing agriculture, business and construction to waste water while the poor are forced to abide by water limits; and calls on the National Department of Water and Sanitation to intervene. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to that. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, please protect me from MEC across the road. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think you need protection from the member next

to you. Hon member Dijana.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes, I am going to her, but that one that side. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] *snotklap*.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

†Me M N GILLION: Wie makeer 'n snotklap?

[Ms M N GILLION: Who needs a *snotklap*?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: What!

Ms M N GILLION: Excuse me!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Order, hon Chief Whip. I think you must temper that word.

Mr M G E WILEY: I withdraw that.\

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Gillion, you may now proceed.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the devastating effects the outbreak of Avian Flu has on businesses and the economy, notes further that the economy lost more than R50 million and some businesses like the Duck Farm in Joostenbergvlakte were forced to close down; calls on relevant authorities to put measures in place to contain this disease that has a potential to also affect the human population; and calls for an urgent intervention to prevent the disease from affecting people. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Lekker first and then I will come back to hon member Max.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the High Court judgement to dismiss an application by the DA-led Cape Town to evict 60 000 people in Marikana Informal Settlement in Philippi; notes further the City is ordered to enter into negotiations with the owners to purchase the land,

and calls on the Provincial Government to ensure that the City respects and abides by the decisions of the court by immediately initiating a process to implement the ruling.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates South African tennis star, Kevin Anderson, for reaching the final of the 2017 US Open. Mr Anderson became the first South African to reach a Grand Slam singles final since Kevin Curren reached the Australian Open final in 1984. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Premier Helen Zille's latest trip to Thailand and Vietnam with 3 other Government officials came at a cost of R540 000; condemns the waste of taxpayers' money on international journeys that have no economic benefit for the poor of this province ... [Interjections.] and calls on the Premier to give a ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA:

...detailed breakdown of what the money was spent for. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion being moved?
There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Olivier first.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the KZN Education Department for its swift action to suspend 7 teachers this week for abusing learners; and calls on the Western Cape Education Department to take a firm stand against teachers who are caught abusing learners, including the Steenberg High teacher who was caught giving corporal punishment to a learner and the teacher from Thandokhulu High School who was accused

of sexual misconduct which led to learners boycotting classes on Friday last week. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Emmanuel Athipila Mtombotu, a student at the College of Cape Town in Crawford, who is selected to represent South Africa in the International Cup of the Australian Football League, that is Aussie Rules – as they call it - in Melbourne, Australia. We wish him well with this fine achievement. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Gopie first and then I will come back to hon member Lekker after that.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the discrimination towards patients in psychiatric

hospitals across the province; notes and demands that the signage boards reading “Isibhedlele sabagula ngengqondo” translated means “hospital for people who are sick in the brain”, be immediately changed as it disrespects the patients. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the Khayelitsha rapist, Sikhangele Mki, who pleaded guilty to 30 counts of rape, 27 counts of kidnapping, 4 counts of serious assault, was today sentenced in the Western Cape High Court to 15 life terms and 120 years in prison; welcomes this judgement and applauds Judge P L Goliath for this judgment. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deepest condolences to the bereaved family, loved ones, friends and the school community of Kleinberg Primary in Ocean View. The 9-year old learner, Aqeel David, had been fatally wounded in gang cross-fire and was laid to rest on 9 September 2017. May his dear soul rest in peace. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that there are more CCTV cameras on the ground floor and entrances of this very building that houses the hon Premier Zille, than in the whole of Khayelitsha, where most of the 60 crime fighting cameras do not even work.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Are there any further? We have come to the end of that.

That concludes Motions without Notice. Before we adjourn can I just remind members that the Budget Committee will sit immediately after the adjournment. That then brings us to the end of the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:32.