

---

THURSDAY, 10 MAY 2018

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. [Interjections.] Order! I see the Chief Whip first.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to that? Agreed to.

We will then start with the Subject for Discussion in the name of the hon member Gillion. I see the hon Gillion.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hoor-hoor!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hear-hear!]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, 2018 marks the tail-end of this administration's term and the DA's decade of misrule is representative of a period of regression in service delivery for the poor. Reality is that this protracted period of disservice to our people has been marked by the deteriorating living conditions for the poor and marginalised, which forced thousands of people to take to the streets on Freedom Day, calling on the DA Government to break with the past and focus on service delivery.

The most pressing challenges faced by the people in this province include inadequate living conditions, crime, poverty, dread diseases and unemployment. These challenges seem to be colour-conscious as they affect the black majority, while the minority is well taken care of.

The flooding and the informal settlement fires will continue to kill people for as long as the DA remains in power, as its only response to the housing crisis is sending people to Wolwerivier and Blikkiesdorp. In addition, further empty promises about the Better Living Model Game-Changer, we must ask the question: how many houses were built by this Province through this Better Living Model Game-Changer? We all know what the answer is. It is

nothing!

Today is the time to evaluate how the DA has delivered on its mandate. What have been the failures of key service delivery departments?

In 2017 Crime Stats revealed that the Western Cape is home to a third of the country's police stations where the most killings are recorded and is also home to South Africa's long-standing murder capital Nyanga. Seven out of the top ten police stations where the highest numbers of murders are recorded, are also in the Western Cape.

Gang violence is out of hand, while the highest increase percentage in rape cases are reported in this province. More than 81 children have been murdered since last year to date. The response by the Provincial Government through the MEC of Community Safety has been to chastise SAPS and National Government for all the province's challenges. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They always do that.

Ms M N GILLION: There has been little to nothing done by the Provincial Government in response.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Skande!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Disgrace!]

Ms M N GILLION: Lest we forget that millions were spent in the Zille Commission, which yielded no positive outcomes as this Government failed to fully implement its recommendations. The Premier and the Social Development MEC... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The absent Premier.

Ms M N GILLION: ...who have been forced to institute a Children's Commissioner, are now trying to persuade NGOs to back down on their calls for an inquiry into the hike in child murders. Cape Town estimates more than a quarter of a million households live in informal settlements. There are more than 400 informal settlements in this province, yet we have an MEC that does not want to build proper houses for the poor. No wonder under his watch Cape Town fails to spend the Urban Settlement Development Grant and order funds and other funds annually. This year the DA-run metros lost nearly R540 million meant to cover costs of provision of infrastructure to poor households due to non-performance. Members of the public say closing the Provincial Department of Human Settlements would not make a difference because it is useless.

Health is one of the worst run departments in this Province. During the Budget debate I highlighted the key issues which the MEC chose to be emotional about instead of addressing it. [Interjections.]

The unannounced oversight visit by the NCOP to the Khayelitsha District

Hospital discovered that service at this hospital was in a state of collapse. There are shortages of beds and staff and this is only the tip of the iceberg. Patients say the entire healthcare system in this province is in a state of paralysis.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Do you believe it to be?

Ms M N GILLION: We are still waiting for the MEC to tell us where the replacement hospital is that was promised to the Manenberg community to replace G F Jooste.

The crisis in the forensic services and EMS is set to worsen as the MEC continues cutting down staff. The responses of the Provincial Government to all these challenges were the so called Game-Changers, which have not changed anything. It seems like the DA administration thinks improving the lives of our people is a game.

For a party claiming clean and good governance its infighting negatively impacts on service delivery. The investigation by the Hawks in some of the DA municipalities... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Like George.

Ms M N GILLION: ...for fraud and corruption proves the opposite. Look at

what they have done to the City of Cape Town and George Municipalities. [Interjections.] The DA's inability to deal with racism has caused multiple incidents of racial tensions across the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: When they are racist themselves, how can they deal with that?

Ms M N GILLION: The DA is obviously to blame for the violence between Siqalo informal settlement and Mitchells Plain residents... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes.

Ms M N GILLION: While this ANC is committed to the preamble of the Constitution, which focuses on South Africa's unity in diversity, the DA continues to sow racial divisions through colonialism-praising Tweets or defending of white privilege by Natasha Mazzone. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just one second.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just to ask the member, Mr Deputy Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Whether she wants to take a question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, a question.

An HON MEMBER: Do you want to ask a question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, can I ask the member a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The member is prepared, yes, you may.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You must ask for a caucus. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you saying, hon member Gillion...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you saying, hon member Gillion, that all of these social ills are happening in the best-run DA Government... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: You are away from the topic.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...that gets a clean audit every year? [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Can you speak to the Speaker?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, the answer is yes.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Sies, sies! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Siss, siss! [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, are you finished with your speech?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the next speaker, hon member Botha.  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Is that all?

An HON MEMBER: That is all.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...for her whole debate?

Ms M N GILLION: I am talking facts here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Kom nou Lorraine, kom!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Come on now, Lorraine, come on!]



Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is understandable why this is an ANC sponsored debate. When you are a master in failure you are constantly looking for others to be part of your failing circle. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh please, Lorraine.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daai is nie, Lorraine!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not so, Lorraine!]

Ms L J BOTHA: What is important though would be for us to understand what is meant by the topic - the DA's failure to address social challenges in the Western Cape. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle kan nie eers water kry nie, man. Wat gaan julle doen?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You cannot even get water, man. What are you going to do? ]

Ms L J BOTHA: In fact before we get there, we must ask the question what is meant by social challenges. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Waar is die water?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Where is the water?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please!

Ms L J BOTHA: This can be defined as issues such as poverty, inability to access schooling, access to the public health sector, access to basic services such as water, sanitation and electricity, access to social grants, access to other social services such as drug rehabilitation centres, access to early childhood development centres, access and care for the elderly and access to job and skills development opportunities for not only young people, but also those who are unemployed and unskilled. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle gee nie om nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not care.]

Ms L J BOTHA: The ANC is then saying that the DA-led Government is failing across all of these areas. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit is waar, ja.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is true, yes.]

Ms L J BOTHA: While the truth is, things are not perfect. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh thank you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Things are not perfect and we are not saying for one minute that it is perfect. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: So she is admitting!

Ms L J BOTHA: But where the DA governs things are better and for not one moment are we saying that it is perfect. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L J BOTHA: Now if we are failing in addressing poverty, Mr Deputy Speaker, then why do we have the lowest poverty rate in the country? Stats South Africa's *Poverty Trends in South Africa, an examination of absolute poverty between 2006 and 2015* report ...[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will tell you. †Ons sal vir jou sê. [We will tell you.]

Ms L J BOTHA: ...which was released in August 2017, clearly states that our headcount in the Multi-Dimensional Poverty Index of 2,7% in 2016 is the lowest in the country. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons weet wat dit sê.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: We know what it says.]

Ms L J BOTHA: In fact in 2011 it was at 3,6%. The closest to this province is Gauteng with a 4,6% in 2016 but beyond that the Eastern Cape and Limpopo are standing at 12,7 and 11,5% respectively. [Interjections.]

It is important to highlight this because when you address poverty, when you work towards eradicating it you are also addressing wider issues that contribute to social challenges.

Let us however stay with the alleviation of poverty theme for a moment. The agency which falls under the National Government that is responsible for poverty alleviation is SASSA. The past few years have been quite horrendous for our grant recipients. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have it wrong. You cannot [Inaudible.]

Ms L J BOTHA: It has been horrendous as firstly they had a Minister who did not care about them... [Interjection.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Eina!

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Ouch!]

Ms L J BOTHA: ...and who was more concerned about ensuring security of her family at the expense of taxpayers to the tune of R2 million. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L J BOTHA: Then just over a month ago, Mr Deputy Speaker, we learnt that SASSA in 2014 made an unlawful payment of R316 million to Cash Paymaster Services, which the Courts have now said must be repaid. This tragedy, is that not a single official or the Minister herself who is being held accountable? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L J BOTHA: To make matters worse we also learnt that grant... [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I agree with you hon member Botha, there is too much uncontrolled interjections coming from the ANC's side. Please contain yourselves a little bit more. Hon member Botha, you may continue.

Ms L J BOTHA: To make matters worse we also learnt that grant beneficiaries are now liable for the R10.00 Grindrod Bank charges. On top of this we continue to have CPS with their various deductions from the accounts of beneficiaries.

Ms M N GILLION: What is the relevance?

Ms L J BOTHA: How does the ANC-led National Government expect to alleviate poverty... [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, please, I cannot even hear myself.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. [Interjections.] Order! Order! I want to appeal to the ANC's side. I have allowed some latitude but it is getting out of control now. Please contain yourselves. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, the interjections from the other side relating to the member's relevance, this is about social challenges... [Interjections.]

The member is speaking about social grants, which is directly allied to that so these frivolous interjections are nothing but trying to suppress my member from continuing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, member, I take your point. The hon member Botha's speech is not irrelevant, she can continue.

Ms L J BOTHA: And hon member Gillion must go and check, her topic is wide.

Ms M N GILLION: Excuse me... [Inaudible.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Ensuring that residents have access to job opportunities also serves as a catalyst to addressing social challenges as employment ensure that people are able to put food on their tables. It contributes to improving people's lives and it also steers you away from a life of crime, gang activities, drug and alcohol abuse. Therefore the creation of these job

opportunities are vital.

How can I move on without mentioning that the Western Cape created 106 000 more jobs in the fourth quarter of 2017 compared to the same period in 2016? Yet, the masters' of failure are telling us we are failing the people of the Western Cape.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Beslis!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Definitely!]

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, job creation ties in to reducing unemployment. As a reminder to the ANC members across the floor, the expanded unemployment rate in the Western Cape as at February 2018 is 23%. It is still the lowest in the country. The masters of failure are looking for others to be part of their failing circle. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So that is why you [Inaudible.] us now.

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, having access to basic services is a constitutional right. In fact, if this is not provided, you are setting communities up to contract various diseases. Contracting these diseases then in turn places pressure on both our health and social services sector. Health, as people will need medication and care, social services as this could lead to people needing to access a social grant. The difference in the Western Cape is that we do deliver these basic services as we spend our budgets where it is

needed. [Interjections.] The Auditor-General makes it clear, during the 2015/16 financial year the Western Cape achieved the highest proportion of clean audits with 80% of our DA-led municipalities accounting for every penny spent. ANC-led municipalities - well, we all know the story there.

The 2016/17 report states that our clean audits soared to 85%. The General Household Survey released by Stats South Africa on 31 May 2017 shows that almost 95% of residents in this province have access to improved sanitation. In addition, *The State of Basic Service Delivery in South Africa* report, which was released on 30 March 2017, shows that 93,4% of Western Cape residents have access to a fully-flush toilet system.

In fact 14 out of the top 20 best performing municipalities with the highest household access to improved sanitation are in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Which ones?

Ms L J BOTHA: The report goes on to say that 99% have access to piped water; almost 90% of refuse is being collected regularly and 92,7% have access to electricity. Mr Deputy Speaker, we do all of this because the DA cares. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Uh-uh, hulle gee nie om nie, asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Uh-uh, they do not care, please!



Ms L J BOTHA: We will continue to work towards improving the lives of all residents of the Western Cape. The DA has, and it is not failing. The ANC are the masters of their own failure.

I thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die DA gee nie om nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA does not care.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dyantyi, allow me to say that the hon member Christians will now speak.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, our province is facing many social challenges and spiralling out of control, due to political instability and fiscal irresponsible behaviour. When I talk about political instability, we do not even know who the Mayor of Cape Town is. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] And the question is... [Interjections.] And the question is, is the Mayor in waiting in this House? That is the question! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi, gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw, throw coals!]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, Cape Town's budget must be

passed by the end of May and the MayCo members do not even know if they have a job. That is the political instability that this province is facing.

[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, throw coals!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dyantyi, please!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The fiscal irresponsibility that this province is facing is the situation in George. It is alleged that the Mayor of George awarded a contract to a supplier... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Christians, I am just looking at the content of the motion... [Interjections.] Order! Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I am coming to that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you coming to that?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I am coming to that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Fine.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: My question is, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: My question is, Mr Deputy Speaker, I am coming to this because we have the Minister of Local Government here and people are suffering. He has oversight on those municipalities and that relates to my question. My question is that there was a contract awarded to a person for R600 000 a month and the Mayor accepted a bribe, a kickback of R100 000 a month and the person was not staying in George and he then had to pay for an address in George. People, money is taken and services are not delivered...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, order! I have given you a long latitude but you must get to the social consequences of that, if you want to. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I am talking about the fiscal irresponsibility of this Province. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, just one second. Hon Deputy Chief Whip.  
[Interjections.] Order!

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. This is not a budget speech, this is about the social challenges. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I have allowed the member some latitude,

but he is coming to the point now, his last couple of seconds.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: My two minutes are almost up, but, Mr Deputy Speaker, you will understand why I am asking the question, what is Minister Bredell doing about this? The Mayor is still in his job. The Municipal Manager is still in his job and the people of this province are suffering. [Interjections.] What is Minister Bredell, what is the leader of the DA in this province doing about this? [Interjections.] Our people are suffering and money is going down the drain. We are facing political and financial instability in this province, so let me conclude because my two minutes are almost up. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: But let me conclude with this, Mr Deputy Speaker. The problem is that our people in the Western Cape are suffering and money is being squandered and that is the point that I want to bring to this House. The Mayor is still in his job.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No action has been taken against the Mayor of George.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No action has been taken against the Municipal Manager of George, but yet they got rid of Patricia de Lille. That is my point, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! The member's time has expired. I see Minister Mbombo, the Minister of Health. [Interjections.] Order! Order! I want the House to come to order before the Minister starts.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, members in the House, the guests in the gallery, people of the Western Cape. I want to thank hon member Gillion for introducing this debate to the House. It would have been a good apolitical debate to demonstrate to the public out there that the legislators in this province take cognisance of the social challenges the country is facing, namely poverty, inequality, unemployment, all of course due to the slow and low economic growth, thus impacting on these social challenges that we are debating. Social and economic challenges are twins, but now you are reducing it to a blaming approach. [Interjections.]

It pains me when we as leaders seek political relevance at the expense of people's pains, yet we all know that it is a result of the ANC Government's failures to boost the economy that we find ourselves in this situation. For example the United Nations habitat report shows that 75% of cities across the world have become more unequal over the past two decades. In South Africa all metros show a high level of inequality except for Cape Town...

Ms P MAKELENI: That is not true.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...where it is less unequal than the rest of the country.

An HON MEMBER: It is true.

Ms P MAKELENI: Not true!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Then you may wonder why an ANC member will want to debate social change, when we know that it is the ANC Government that has performed dismally in all the provinces and cities where they govern. Let me qualify my statement. [Interjections.]

Let me qualify my statement using the evidence... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In terms of the evidence, let me share the stats. Inequality, where the gaps between the haves and the have-nots have widened, with the poor getting poorer, and in turn the Premiers' bank accounts getting fatter and fatter. Ekurhuleni, for example, moved from bad to worse, 0,64 to 0,65. These are the 2016 statistics – Johannesburg, from better to worse.

An HON MEMBER: Joburg is not in the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Buffalo City, my hometown place of birth, from bad to worse. Cape Town is the least unequal and actually it even improved from 0,62 to 0,61 according to the statistics provided by the South African Government on inequality. [Interjections.] Now let us go to the Human Development Index, the HDI. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In terms of looking at the Human Development Index, which is an international tool to measure quality of life, based on life expectancy, the average schooling years and education, and also income... [Interjections.] For example the Western Cape, and zooming to Cape Town, ranks the highest.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: You must intervene there.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: If you look at the eThekweni, Mangaung, Buffalo City is at the lowest when it comes to that. It means that the people die prematurely in these provinces. Of course one of the reasons, and it is a reflection of the health system, is that they cannot manage the diseases. This is a reflection of the oncology crisis that is happening for example in KZN

where the people die prematurely. It is a reflection of poor standards, inequality and education... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, just one second, Minister Mbombo, just one second. Hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I unfortunately cannot quote a rule.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You cannot?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I cannot quote a rule for the question I am ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you standing on a point of order in other words?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: For the question I would like to ask you: For how long are we expected to sit here quietly listening to a National Assembly debate on other provinces when we are supposed to be talking about the Western Cape?



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This is the Western Cape!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! You have made your point, but that is not a point of order. [Interjections.] Order! Order! The Minister may continue. She is still busy with the topic. Minister Mbombo, you may continue. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: (Cell phone music) Shut-up! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Do you think... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I am not sure who said that but...

An HON MEMBER: Hon member Tyatyam.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, you know that is unparliamentary. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Tyatyam, please stand up, please stand up! Did you say that? [Interjections.] Withdraw that please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Pardon?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you say “shut-up”?

Mr S G TYATYAM: A song, yes, a song.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you did say that to somebody across the floor...

Mr S G TYATYAM: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...that is unparliamentary.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, to Steenhuisen, not to him, to Steenhuisen. It is a new song.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot hear you, say again.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is a song. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a new song.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You sang the song?

Mr S G TYATYAM: I will forward it to you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If the member said he did not refer to another member, then it is fine.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, I will never do that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Minister Mbombo, you may continue. Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: What you cannot measure, you cannot be able to implement. You think globally, you contextualise regionally and you implement locally. You cannot read the statistics or the progress of the Western Cape without relating to what is happening outside. [Interjections.] So therefore, if we are talking about the social challenges, even the programmes that we implement are based on the taxes that go to National and are then sent to the Province, as according to the indicators. The indicators are developed by National, and how we are supposed to follow them. That is the case.

As I was talking about the issue of the life expectancy, one of those things are about when parents die prematurely due to the Government failures, as I indicated. It means that we are creating more orphans and if we look at the statistics where the most orphans are, these are the kinds of challenges that we are talking about. Also lest we forget, for example the trade agreements related to the access to the murder scenes that were signed by the National Government; now we talk about people who cannot access the anti-cancer drugs, people who cannot access renal dialysis because of the expenses of these kinds of drugs. I want to now zoom into health, specifically maternal health. Why? Because we do know that maternal death, it is an indicator; it is

a measure; it is a test of the women status - not only for the pregnant ones; especially from the 19 to the 49-years old. It reflects on women empowerment, complete development and quality of health services generally as according to the national definition. So I am pleased to report that the number of maternal deaths continues to fall in the Western Cape and we have the lowest figure in the whole country. Of course there are strategies that we have put in place, for example the safe caesarean-section deliveries; the prevention of the unwanted pregnancies; access to contraception; access to termination of pregnancy. In case, you probably have forgotten, we are the only province that provides the medical termination pill at all of our primary healthcare services, for example, and this is what... [Interjections.]

We offer medical TOP, and surgical. This is to realise the sexual and reproductive rights of women as per the Constitution. If we talk about HIV/AIDS specifically among women of the reproductive age 15 to 24, we found that it is the lowest since 2009 and if we look at the statistics in other provinces - again we have to compare [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Bring the others where we are leading.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: KwaZulu and Mpumalanga and all of those, they are part of that. [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Bring the others on.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And not only that, 30% of the new HIV infections come from sex-workers and their clients. We are the only province who renders services in the middle of the night at two a.m. on the street, especially when those are supposed to access for example the ARVs, because it is all about the harms reduction, which is a human rights issue. Do you know that globally we are the only one who receive the fund where we can give incentives to the girls aged 19 to 24 in terms of HIV-infection as well as in terms of empowerment.

Why? It is a reflection of the trust in Government by the private sector.

Ms M N GILLION: Ah, please!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The health outcomes for example do not reflect, as I have already indicated - I can talk more about health outcomes - a department that is failing the clients. In fact it speaks directly to our aim to provide person-centred quality care and these strategies and interventions are built on a health system that although it is resource-constrained in many aspects, our knowledgeable and skilled healthcare professionals who have to account make us look so good. Unfortunately, for example, in nursing, out of the ten categories of health professionals it is the one that is the lowest paid, poorly paid, than any. The question must be: why are we only focussing on the annual Bargaining Council for the increase of the salaries in terms of reviewing the whole of nursing? It cannot be.

The same applies to the teachers. The teachers and the nurses, they are the lowest paid and yet the South African Nursing Council is appointed by the National Minister. They report to the National Minister. They can change that.

The same applies to the working hours for the doctors - 30 hours. This has been happening for donkey's years. The question is, if the Health Professions Council is appointed and reporting to the National Minister, how come we still have these issues? So Mr Deputy Speaker, as I indicated that the three challenges that the country is facing - unemployment, inequality and poverty - are all absorbed by health.

Poor people are prone to ill-health and ill-health contributes to poverty, especially when it affects the person who is the breadwinner. Wealth and health, they go glove-in-hand. When the economy is at a low, and especially now where we are, it means that poor people have to bear the brunt. The price of medicine goes up as the salaries of the workers go up, and whose fault is it that we find ourselves in this situation, and whose fault is it now that we are talking, discussing the issues related to social changes, whose fault is it around that?

I can mention many examples, but I am not trying to run away from the responsibility. We do have pressures in the emergency centres, in our primary healthcare facilities, in the emergency medical services, but we are not folding our arms. For example, regarding emergency medical services, the

pickup points, we are the only province that picks up people from their homes through HealthNet in the rural areas and then drive them to hospital. In that regard we are the only one. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: What, we? Oh, my word!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: With the other provinces, how they operate is go from the Clinic, an inter-facility from the Clinic in Libode, to the St Barnabas Hospital. From St Barnabas Hospital they go to Mthatha, for example. Nobody picks up people across the river in terms of the HealthNet. We are the only province. We are reaching out to people in the far corners of the province to ensure rural access.

Actually, Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape has the highest percentage of households to access a health facility within 30 minutes at 91,5% and the one that follows that is Gauteng and the national average figure in terms of the poor communities to access health services within 30 minutes is 75,4%.

We therefore, as I indicated, provide all these facilities to the people and again, just to properly address the issue... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister, your time has almost expired, you must finish off now.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Oh, okay. I was now going to address the

issues the member has alluded to in some of the other hospitals, but in conclusion, we are committed to our goal of transforming the health system and we have the need to move not only around the issue of the service delivery...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...but also to improve the patient experience.  
[Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. The hon Makeleni.

†Me M N GILLION: Gooi kole!

[Ms M N GILLION: Throw coals!]

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Today we are discussing the social ills and the DA failures and we understand why the MEC Fritz and the Premier are not here.

Nearly 25 years after the end of apartheid and ten years since the DA took power millions of people in the Western Cape remain excluded from the economic mainstream and deprived opportunity to truly prosper. Too many people suffer poor service delivery under this Government of the DA that appears to have lost touch with the people of this province, while they are busy with their internal factionalism and purging of black and coloured



middle-class workers.

This Government has no interest or political will. The reality of the Western Cape is that some members of the society, especially in the townships, the Cape Flats, the rural areas are vulnerable and require immediate social protection provided by a government that is committed to ensuring access to basic services and prevention of poverty-induced danger. Children face an uphill battle in the province.

Malnutrition remains a serious problem and the Western Cape has a high percentage of children who are underweight, whilst thousands of children under the age of six years are not in Early Childhood Development Programmes, because there are not enough ECD in the province, and a lot of them are failing to meet the required standard to receive assistance from this Government.

Unfortunately the research indicates that half of the three-year-old children did not participate in ECD Learning Programmes and close to 30% of children aged four did not attend ECD Learning, while 15% did not go to any facility or participate in ECD-related programmes. This leaves children vulnerable to rape and abuse and by the time they enter the basic education they are already disadvantaged as they cannot follow instructions and not properly develop as their peers.

This study reveals that 15% of Western Cape children are stunt and

underweight and this is more prevalent in the black and coloured communities. We are losing many children along the way before they become teenagers and young adults to malnutrition, poverty and alcohol and drug abuse. This Government has failed dismally in this regard.

The most important time in a person's life to equip them with tools they need to further themselves is between the age of birth and 35 years. While we understand that young people need support from their parents, family, Committee and Government, we note that the Western Cape Government Youth Development Strategy promises to create more support and this support is based on the five pillars.

Let me take you through these pillars. Firstly, strengthening families, which we all know, and see how dismally they fail. In fact I am not surprised and they don't have a clear plan to do this. Secondly is improving education and training. They are doing this by ensuring that 40% of children who enters the education system drops out of education at Grade 4 and another 40% at Grade 10 before they could read or write properly. In rural areas like Hermanus children are taught not to choose PO Maths as they would not be able to pass.

If you look at subject determination in Quintile 1 and Quintile 4 schools, which are in the poor communities, you will see the kind of future the evil DA has for our children. They want the cycle of poverty to continue to repeat itself.

The third pillar is economic opportunities. As such 48% of our youth is unemployed. Total number of jobs created in the Western Cape has not increased. Jobs for low-skilled people have declined. 32% of youth are not in education or training. Our communities have been turned into breeding grounds for gangsters. Our children have no hope. They turn to alcohol and drugs. They are angry and violent. We have seen violent protests that continue to destroy and divide our communities. Young women fall victim to rape and many forms of abuse. Others are selling themselves to older men who they call the Blessers. Many young women continue to use drugs and abuse alcohol during pregnancy. As such we have a high prevalence of foetal alcohol syndrome. The research indicates that the people of the Western Cape are depressed; hence there are more alcohol and drug users in the province than anywhere else in this country.

The fourth pillar is identity and belonging - another failure, Mr Deputy Speaker. Families are disintegrated. More than 32% of Western Cape learners live with single parents and 24% with another family member. Our children are exposed with high levels of criminality and violence in their families. 25% of learners live in a house where caregivers have been to jail and with some who use drugs and 15% lives with someone who is a gang member.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Clearly you know that.

Ms P MAKELENI: Fifthly, the last pillar; lastly is the reconnection opportunities. The risk-taking profile of the Western Cape youth is higher

than in any other province. The DA failures leaves the province with a prospect of another generation of children born to parents who cannot provide for them financially, who cannot raise them effectively and guide them towards productive adulthood. We can no longer keep quiet or watch while the cycle of malnutrition, poverty, drug and criminality repeats itself. The DA Government has failed in pursuing Mandela's vision of a society which remembers its past, listens to all its voices and pursues social justice.

In Mandela we remain inspired and unfortunately the DA Government is responsible for killing a generation through rendering poor services and ignorance. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! The hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. The DA Western Cape Government will leave a lasting uplifting legacy for the young people of this province, from Murraysburg in the Central Karoo... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Makeleni, when you spoke there was absolutely dead silence on the other side and I expect the same from you now. Member, you may continue.

Mr D G MITCHELL: From Murraysburg in the Central Karoo to Touws River in the Cape Winelands, from Bitterfontein on the West Coast to Atlantis in the City of Cape Town; from Bredasdorp in the Overberg to Oudtshoorn in

the Eden District - the DA is there.

An HON MEMBER: Where?

Mr D G MITCHELL: In all these towns and regions the DA-led Western Cape Government works with its NGOs, the City of Cape Town's programmes and recreational hubs, neighbourhood school programmes, Grade 4 remedial programmes, eLearning programmes, MOD year-beyond programmes and centres, DSD centres and partial aftercare, peer education, Youth Cafés and no-fee schools to uplift youth at risk.

The aim of this Government is to ensure that by the age of 25 the youth are inspired, educated, responsible, independent, healthy and productive citizens with positive personal family and social relations through the five pillars, which are family foundations, education, economic opportunities, identity and belonging and reconnection.

The Western Cape Government's 2017/2018 goal was that 85 000 learners have regular and consistent attendance at quality after-school programmes. By the end of the 2017/18 financial year, 85% of learners were attending regularly and consistently with a 70% attendance rate. The DA-led Western Cape Government is helping youth at risk to build passion and resilience, broaden their socio-economic networks, improve school retention and learner outcomes, encourage them to dream and explore their passions, close the opportunity gap between the rich and the poor, and provide them with an

opportunity to engage in smaller groups with a caring adult.

Mr Deputy Speaker, let us move on to the Chrysalis Academy. The DA-led Government further supports the youth through the Chrysalis Academy. Chrysalis is an intensive personal development course that helps young people develop skills to avoid being drawn into destructive habits and situations. It teaches physical and mental wellbeing, nutrition, conflict resolution, life and leadership skills. It is combined with training skills which can be used to start a business or enter an internship in hairdressing, cooking, carpentry, public safety, child and youth care and sports coaching - to name a few.

Another way in which this DA Government supports and uplifts youth at risk is through the Premier's Advancement of Youth Project. The project provides work experience in the public sector, work references, a network within their field and a skill set. It has provided 2 251 internships so far, contributing, mentoring career guidance, on-the-job training, and general exposure to skills training in one of our 13 Government Departments. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, among our alumni is a gentleman called Mr Jonas McCarthy. Jonas matriculated from the Southern Suburbs Youth Academy at the end of 2011 and was an intern from 2012 to 2013. Jonas is a victim of foetal alcohol syndrome and was expected not to live very long or a normal life. Jonas defied his circumstances. He applied to the Department of Social Development and gained experience in general administrative work and data

capturing but after Jonas completed his paying internship he got a learnership for 12 months at the Learning Cape Initiative and the LCI recognised his potential and offered him a position as an admin clerk. That is real change, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, it is the one where we are saying yes. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: We must also ensure that young people such as Jonas are not deprived because of their ableness, socio-economic circumstances, race, religion or creed. It was recently reported in an article that for two years the ANC-led Government has failed to pass into law the White Paper on the People with Disabilities Rights' Act. [Interjections.]

Consequently South Africa has no single framework to monitor, intervene, and provide justice where necessary for people with disabilities, without which people with disabilities are made dependent on Government, NPOs and private stakeholders, fostering dependence on welfarist approaches and excluding those with cognitive and physical disability from participation in the workforce. The ANC-led National Government is failing to include youth at risk who have disabilities.

Existing legislation or the Employment Equity Act sets out an employment target for people with disabilities at 2% but, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D G MITCHELL: ...in 2016 less than 1% of the national workforce was identified as having disabilities. Whilst the hon members in the seats in front of me goes on, they ignore the blatant fact that this DA-led Government is including the youth at risk not only through the after-school programmes, PAY or Chrysalis, but also by employing them and including them in the province's law-making structures. Since 31 January 2018 people under 35 years have been employed by the Western Cape Government. They are employed predominantly in Provincial Treasury at 50,4%, Social Development at 39,1%; Environmental Affairs and Development Planning at 43,4%...

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is the DA Government.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Cultural Affairs and Sport at 38,7% and Economic Development and Tourism at 42,4%. [Interjections.]

Among the youth at risk are our children in foster-care. Shockingly the number of children found in need of care and protection, who are in residential care, has increased from 453... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just finish off. [Interjections.]



Ms P MAKELENI: Ja, your time is up.

Ms M N GILLION: Your time is up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. Hon member Mitchell, your last sentence please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Mr Deputy Speaker, unlike the ANC-led National Government this DA-led Government will leave a lasting uplifting legacy for the youth in this province from Laingsburg in the Central Karoo to De Doorns in the Cape Winelands; from Piketberg on the West Coast to Khayelitsha in the City of Cape Town...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D G MITCHELL: ...from Hermanus in the Overberg and to Mossel Bay, we are there! [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mitchell, your time has expired. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Please allow the hon member Joseph some silence.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B D JOSEPH: I would like to raise my concern to this topic for debate. This topic is vague and can have different facets that can be addressed separately. Two issues come to mind. That is housing and crime, which require urgent intervention from both Provincial and National Government.

It is clear that the sponsor of this topic does not value the lives of people and rather focus on party-politics and not on social re-engineering. I want to start with a quote from Frantz Fanon a psychiatrist, a philosopher, revolutionary and writer, who said:

“Each generation must out of relative obscurity discover its mission, fulfil it or betray it.”

The governing party in the Western Cape as well as its predecessors betrayed their mission. The gang and drug-related warfare in the Western Cape are the result of failed social engineering by politicians and Government officials. Towns all over the Western Cape were designed by locating employment generating institutions, factories and transport routes in such a way that blacks and whites would not mingle. These laws that prevented blacks from freely competing for white jobs, a policy of providing public education, and housing of a lower standard than in the white areas and policy that prevented the investment by whites in black areas that would have provided jobs and increase the general standard of living in the Western Cape. One gets marginalised communities. Areas of marginalised, unemployed disillusioned youth are the recruiting ground for gangs and social ills. That is the Western

Cape remains a hotbed for gang-related crime, alcoholism, drug-abuse, violence against women and children, which is not addressed by this DA Government and National. To address these social ills the dignity of the marginalised should be restored. The Provincial Government must be at the forefront of creating and protecting industries for the economy, to shift from an economy dependent on imports to an economy which is export-focused.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, your time has almost expired. Just finish off.

Mr B D JOSEPH: The expropriation of land without compensation is key to a dignified community. We as the EFF are and will always be in the forefront for bringing on changes so that our communities can live in a dignified way.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Joseph, your time has expired.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Unemployment in the Western Cape is 19,5%, which is the lowest in South Africa.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hear-hear!

Ms M M WENGER: Gauteng is ten points above us at 29% and the Eastern Cape is 16 percentage points higher than the Western Cape at 35%. So hon member Gillion's claim on unemployment is therefore debunked.

On the burden of disease the Western Cape has the highest TB-cure rate in South Africa. The Western Cape Health Services service 4,7 million of the Western Cape's six million population. We have an 80% immunisation coverage rate for children, and 190 000 clients on ARV-treatment. Hon member Gillion's claim on healthcare is therefore debunked.

On living conditions, despite a 46% population growth, the Western Cape has the highest access to basic services in South Africa and the highest proportion of households receiving free basic water, electricity and sanitation. So hon member Gillion's claim on living conditions therefore is debunked.

An HON MEMBER: Debunked.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Ms M M WENGER: As our debaters have put forward the Western Cape Government's budgets and efforts are geared to address social challenges in this province. It is what departments do day in and day out. So the only failure in this debate then, Mr Deputy Speaker, is the ANC's failure to properly debate this topic. The topic should have been the DA's successes in

addressing very difficult social challenges... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not to celebrate.

Ms M M WENGER: ...and before I continue I would just like to remind honourable Christians that the Hawks' investigation in George is as a direct result of DA Government's initiated investigation because we will not tolerate corruption and we do not do like the ANC does and shift corruption from one place to another. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Because of the factions in the DA.

Ms M M WENGER: Perhaps the ACDP could also explain why their Councillor in George only managed to find his voice after the Hawks arrived, but if we are really going to debate social challenges we cannot neglect the important elements of crime and justice, because justice is an essential instrument to forge improvement, to make right social challenges. Through justice we right the wrongs of unabated gunfire that kill small children. Through justice we right the wrongs of murder and rape. Our police, our prosecuting authority and correctional services are tasked with delivering justice for the most acute social challenges and are therefore bestowed the title of the criminal justice system. But are they delivering justice, because as a British philosopher once said... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: What are you delivering?

Ms M M WENGER: “If we do not maintain justice, justice will not maintain us.” [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Keep quiet!

Ms M N GILLION: People must be safe in this province.

Ms M M WENGER: So gang violence is likely one of the major gauges and sites of social challenges. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M M WENGER: Gang violence has steadily increased and now accounts for almost one-fifth of all murders in our province.

An HON MEMBER: And where is the DA?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Where is your policing?

Ms M M WENGER: So how well is the National Government managing to bring justice for those murdered by gang violence? [Interjections.] The answer, Mr Deputy Speaker, is dismally - dismally!

An HON MEMBER: Not the police.

Ms M N GILLION: Where is the DA? They are [Inaudible.]

Ms M M WENGER: Between 2011/12 and 2015/16 there were 1 886 reported gang-related murders in our province. In that same time frame the criminal justice system only managed to convict 61 cases. That is 3%. [Interjections.] We see the same for gang-related attempted murders. This means that in 97% of cases there is simply no justice. [Interjections.]

At the top of any list of failures to address social issues is surely a 3% conviction rate for gang murders. Convictions are important because they provide justice for the families of those that have been killed. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are failing to provide a safe environment.

Ms M M WENGER: It is also a deterrent for gang violence. Chronic failures in the criminal justice system have led to these low conviction rates. For every three members behind bars, almost a 100 walk free. [Interjections.] This means that more drugs, more guns and more deaths because the ANC Government will not give the resources needed... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: And what is Dan Plato doing about it? [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: ...to make sure that gang members are put behind bars, and Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M M WENGER: ... it is not only gang-related murder that has such a placid response. For murders generally only 17% of murders are detected in our province. That is an 83% failure rate. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: 81 children have been killed in our province.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: As Amartya Sen noted that... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: 81.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M M WENGER: “Reticence has appealed throughout history to those who are unsure of the grounds for action, or unwilling to scrutinise the basis of their policies...”

It is almost as though he was writing about South Africa. We have a Correctional Services Department... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Exactly!



Ms M N GILLION: Exactly!

Ms M M WENGER: ...that as we speak in this province we have a prison population of 158% capacity. Pollsmoor Medium B is overcrowded at 211% and Pollsmoor Females at 245%. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: People must answer [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: There are more than double the amount of incarcerated individuals than these prisons can actually cater for, but this might seem incongruous with the appallingly low conviction rate. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What is the root of the problem?

Ms M M WENGER: I am getting there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M M WENGER: But the trouble is that 40%, so almost half of the prison population, are remand detainees. They are still awaiting trial. The other trouble is the high rate of recidivism, which is compounded by the Department's failure to rehabilitate offenders, so while the ANC Government may wax lyrical about the imperative rehabilitating offenders and its policy offer, they certainly have not put their money where their mouth is. [Interjections.] Less than R2 billion of a R25 billion budget is actually set

aside for rehabilitation... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Gillion, order!

Ms M M WENGER: And so what exactly is fuelling this violence, you ask. Many put it down to the considerable availability of firearms. When we asked SAPS in our Standing Committee recently where all these guns are coming from, SAPS senior management made the most startling confession. They said “us.”

†n AGBARE LID: Sjoe!

[An HON MEMBER: Well!]

Ms M M WENGER: SAPS senior management said...

Ms P Z LEKKER: At least they are not in denial! They are not in denial!

[Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: ...that the single largest consistent source of illegal firearms in the Western Cape comes from the SAPS itself. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Stop pointing fingers, MEC.

Ms M M WENGER: The single largest consistent source of illegal firearms available in the Western Cape comes from the SAPS itself... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Do not point at our leaders.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Chief Whip? [Interjections.]  
Order! [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Why? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Because you are in charge of  
the police.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Gillion, please contain yourself.

An HON MEMBER: SAPS is not a leader [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! There is a point of order, a point of order  
being taken. Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Ja, Mr Deputy Speaker, with respect my member would  
like to make a speech. It is an important speech, but the hon members on the  
other side are not allowing her to do so. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, please continue hon member.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Can I address you?

An HON MEMBER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: On a point of order?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes. MEC Plato is pointing fingers the whole time and you are allowing him and then he said "I will continue doing that."

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, I will have a look at that in future but please take your seat... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Please, it is not this side alone.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, please stand up. I will not allow that type of comment made in this House. The Chair is impartial and the Chair will remain impartial. Please take your seat. [Interjections.] Please continue hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: The single largest consistent source of illegal firearms available in the Western Cape comes from the SAPS itself. At this point, Mr Deputy Speaker, we should probably end this debate because illegal firearms, which arguably contributes to some of the most grave and most cruel social

challenges... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are debunked. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: You are debunked.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are debunked.

Ms M M WENGER: ...literally life and limb are prolific because of the police.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a new word [Inaudible.] ...debunked.

Ms M M WENGER: The very institution meant to be the guardians of the people.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Get a dictionary and see what it means.

Ms M M WENGER: What larger and more tragic failure of addressing social challenges could we even begin to discuss in this House. [Applause.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are debunked.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Olivier.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nou gooi ons kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now we are throwing coals!]

†n AGBARE LID: O hene.

[An HON MEMBER: Oh dear.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Vreet hulle, vreet hulle!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Chew them, chew them!]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Before I start, you know, one understands that maybe the Blue Waves are still in the sky that side. [Laughter.] And sometimes you and I know, Mr Deputy Speaker, when you are under so much confusion in your party, sometimes it is clouded by that confusion when you give input to a debate. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Because they do not know where Patricia is, where Patricia is going, Mmusi Maimane is raising issues which they do not support. So there is a lot of confusion and I accept... [Interjections.] There is another failure of social challenges there.

An HON MEMBER: Bear with Mmusi.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your first minute is gone, member.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC in the Western Cape has been critical about schools in the province and the administration thereof for many years now. [Interjections.]

Our concern was confirmed by an independent report, recent findings of a human rights activist organisation, Equal Education. This report further illustrates that the DA Western Cape Government has failed to address social challenges in the province. Equal Education conducted an audit of 244 no-fee schools with 217 388 pupils across the province.

An HON MEMBER: How many?

Mr R T OLIVIER: They acquired the data of 912 questionnaires which were answered by pupils, 220 which were answered by school administrators and 229 physical inspections. According to the studies at least one of six learners and administrators felt unsafe in public schools because of violent incidents they had either witnessed or were involved in, and I know the Minister who walked out knows about it.

An HON MEMBER: You do not know.

Mr R T OLIVIER: And I am worried she walks out now. The report also revealed that at least 4% of administrators in this sample school said an incident of rape occurred in their schools in the past year. The report went to say corporal punishment still takes place at a number of schools in this province. The Department and the MEC will always have excuses for the dire schools in our province. They normally say there is no money and I think that is the main headlines when she responds to me when I ask questions: "Give me money."

"It is not the fault of... it is not my fault, it is the teacher's fault, it is SADTU's fault." It is someone else's fault. It is never her fault or the Department's or the DA's fault. This is more evident that the DA-run Western Cape Government has failed to address the social challenges in this province.

Principals and teachers and school governing bodies already take the responsibility of this demanding sector without the support of this Government and are left with this bulk of responsibilities on their own. Educators particularly of poorer schools are not capacitated for the development and execution of the crime prevention strategy. That is what the report says. One of the schools they audited was the Weltevrede High School in Wellington. That was in a dire condition and those from Wellington will know the condition of perimeter fencing and walls, there are massive open holes in walls and people were entering the school grounds freely. A school with zero access to control cannot be considered safe especially if they are in



a gang-infested area.

The brick wall meant to secure the school premises had holes which are used by several people to gain access into the school-yard. This was despite, there was a pile of rubbish “skroot”, near the netball courts where learners must practice and play. The grass is overgrown and so you can continue. There were traces of extreme... and school ground near the building.

Two days ago we visited this school and hon member Botha was present and I am worried when she made her input. Zeekoevlei - here we heard the horrible story which the principal told us. 85% of the Zeekoevlei have to walk daily between four to six kilometres to school and they heard this themselves. The WCED has declined the request for transport for these learners. These are greatly vast distances for these young learners to walk. [Interjections.]

The school academic performance is confirmed to be steadily declining due to this unattended social challenge learners are facing, yet the Department... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What have you done?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yet the Department stands to introduce the availability of alcohol on these premises. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R T OLIVIER: We iterate calls of the Freedom Charter that aims that education shall be to teach the youth and love their culture, to honour human brotherhood, liberty and peace; education shall be free compulsory, universal and equal for our children. The colour bar of cultural life in sport and education shall be abolished.

How will the youth be able to learn about how to love their people and culture, to honour human brotherhood, liberty, while the Premier of this Western Cape is the prime suspect of racial divide and reminds our young people of the painful colonialism past? This just shows that the DA Western Cape Government has failed to address these social challenges in the province.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, in conclusion, the Zeekoevlei report indicates out of 20 learners that were tested for drug abuse, 15 of those learners were found to be positive and these are primary school learners, primary school learners and we are saying all is well. The Blue Wave says all is well. [Interjections.]

15, 15 Grade 3 learners, Grade 2 learners are tested positive in using of dagga and sniffing of glue. This is in the primary school level. These learners are held in classrooms to ransom and this is what we have learnt. Teachers cannot manage this unacceptable behaviour at our schools and yet the MEC of Education seem not to be able to deal with these issues and always puts the money issue at the forefront of dealing with this issue. We are calling on

this DA Government to execute the constitutional mandate which they were given, to deal with the social challenges in the Western Cape and if they fail allow Mmusi Maimane your leader, as we support what he said, to lead you. We will see today if you do not want to listen to your leader, because your leader acknowledged that there is a problem in this Blue Wave that needs to be addressed. It is only you... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daai ding is niks, wat hy sê.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That thing means nothing, what he says.]

Mnr R T OLIVIER: It is only you who sit here, who does not want to listen, and what you are doing, what you do...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, your time is running out.

Mr R T OLIVIER: What you do, you first get rid of Mazibuko. You get rid of De Lille. You have a blue question mark on Maimane's chest because the Boys Club, the Boys Club wants to lead this organisation. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Olivier, your time has expired. That brings us to the end of this debate. [Interjections.] Order!

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Interpellations. The first

interpellation is in the name of hon member Botha to Minister Mbombo. I see Minister Mbombo. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Please allow the Minister to continue.

## **INTERPELLATIONS:**

### *Joint Steering Committee: integration of health services*

#### **1. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Health:**

What progress has been made with the establishment of the joint steering committee pertaining to the integration of the health services of the City of Cape Town and the province and (b) what does this integration entail?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: A joint steering committee has been established and the members from Health include the HOD, the Chief of Operations, Dr Keith Cloete and the Chief Director for the Metro Health Services, which is Dr Perez, and from the City we have the Executive Director, Mr E Sass, the Director, plus also another person. So they have already processed everything and commenced everything and for now the next thing is for them to report to us with regard to where their progress.

What has happened now is about all the nine primary healthcare facilities where the Provincial Government and the City of Cape Town share the same facility... [Interjections.] It is about how now we can make it as one, instead of having one facility and two spheres of Government.

Ms M N GILLION: Held at ransom by your factions.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So first of all that is where we are. However, also in the process as we have done with the other facilities where there are some, there is much pressure in terms of the communities asking for more of the package like the Bothasig, the Retreat Dental Clinic, they have already been provincialised. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Botha.

Ms P MAKELENI: Uh-uh, it is factions, holding them at ransom.  
[Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Minister, for that response, and given the Department's vision it is important for this Committee to function. When we refer to person-centred quality care it cannot happen in isolation. It is imperative that when a client walks into any of our health facilities in the Western Cape, whether it be in an urban, peri-urban, rural or peri-rural community the service should remain the same. It has been person-centred quality care as envisioned by this Department. In saying this, it does not mean that there has not been an effort on the part of the Department to ensure that health services are integrated. An example of this is the integrated data system, which is a unique patient identifier for each patient who is utilising health services.

In addition to this, since the 2016/17 financial year the Department also embarked on an integrated service delivery pilot with other provincial departments in the Drakenstein Municipality. These efforts by the Minister and her Department must be commended as it clearly demonstrates the commitment to achieving that person-centred quality care as promised to the communities of the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Based on the Drakenstein pilot project alone, the Department have been able to develop a governance framework. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I will protect you if it gets worse than this but you can still continue.

Ms L J BOTHA: I just want a bit of silence. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Please allow the member that silence. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: She is never quiet. [Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, these efforts by the Minister and her Department must be commended as it clearly demonstrates the commitment to achieving that person-centred quality care. Based on the Drakenstein pilot project alone, they have been able to develop a governance framework.

An HON MEMBER: Is she a former principal?

Ms L J BOTHA: It must further be added that both the Drakenstein pilot project and the integrated data system is also allowing the Department to improve its patient management, while ensuring that their endeavour to provide a quality comprehensive and cost effective package of health services, is achieved.

*[The Speaker takes the chair.]*

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms L J BOTHA: Minister, I am of the view... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Thank you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Minister, I am of the view that we are in a unique position and this is why more and more people across our country are using our health facilities as they see the level and quality of services they receive. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Botha. I now see the hon Gillion. Good afternoon.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I do not know, what does Drakenstein have to do with this interpellation? When the ANC was in power in this province the integration... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members!

Ms M N GILLION: My Chairperson just asked for silence. Now she is the first one to make a noise. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Gillion, kindly take your seat please. [Interjections.] Members, hon members, we are busy with serious business and I expect that you understand it is my duty to protect the speaker on the floor and that you will respect each other throughout these proceedings. So I am asking you to cooperate and let us work together. You may proceed, hon member Gillion. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Welcome, Madam Speaker.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you. Thank you. Thank you. Now when the ANC was in power in this province the integration of all other municipalities ran very smoothly and before we could finalise the integration... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: ...of the City of Cape Town the accident of history happened in this province. The DA took over power. [Interjections.]



An HON MEMBER: No, the ANC was [Inaudible.]

Ms M N GILLION: Ten years later we are still expected to debate the establishment of a Joint Steering Committee. The MEC must tell us, what have been the obstacles in the process of integrating the City and what efforts did she make to accelerate this process? What took so long? In the final analysis this has an impact on the competence of the MEC. She must tell us if she is competent or not to lead such a big Department... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: She is competent.

Ms M N GILLION: ...if she takes such a long time to finalise a simple process such as integration of primary healthcare services, which is very important to the people of the Western Cape, or is there no political will because it is not my faction? [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is DA-factionalism.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Gillion.

An HON MEMBER: Zille accosted us.

Mr M G E WILEY: That is your contribution?

An HON MEMBER: Ja, exactly.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes, because you failed them.

Ms P MAKELENI: And there is none from you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: We want to hear from her.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, please! Thank you. I see the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, the integration of services between the Western Cape Department of Health and the City of Cape Town is centred on the enhancement of the package of care available at facilities across the Metro. There is a general understanding amongst all stakeholders involved that there are several facilities that offer a limited package of care and in order to offer equal access to services the most feasible and efficient way to do so was by the Department of Health and the City of Cape Town deciding to align their service offerings. I have further been informed that this has been implemented in all five rural districts. I welcome and commend this decision as the idea is centred on ensuring that each and every single resident in our province has equal access to quality healthcare as provided by the Department of Health.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Botha. I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes Madam Speaker, the integration of the healthcare facilities services is a very important issue. It is important so that you can eliminate all the duplication. It is important so that you can transfer all the important services to where they belong. I think the slow pace in the City shows that there is no political will on the part of the DA-run administration. What the Minister needs to tell us is how far are they in this process, not only about the Joint Steering Committee. She must give us a breakdown of progress made in all the things that the integration entails.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you Madam Speaker. Minister, when is the finalisation of the aligning of services by the City and the Province, when will that be finalised, and what is the time frame attached to that? What mechanisms are used by the City to account to the Department on the budget spent, as received on an annual basis by the Department of Health, and the complaints received from communities pertaining to health services rendered by the City, what are examples of that and how often does the Joint Steering Committee meet and what is the status now of this Joint Steering Committee?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon, the Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. For two minutes. As I indicated earlier, the Steering Committee is working on various parts because health - although hon member Gillion indicated that it is so simple - it is not, because

health has about six building blocks that we have to integrate.

Ms M N GILLION: Excuse me! For ten years?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The information system has already been integrated.

Ms M N GILLION: For ten years?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The issue of the leadership within the substructures is already integrated and also some of the pockets of care, as I indicated, where others are integrated. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.] Try and answer the questions.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Again, when the member politicises it, then it also makes me to want to politicise it because the question would be if it is really crucial for the ANC to integrate the Metro and the provincial services. How come eThekweni, Joburg, Ekurhuleni, Mangaung, Tshwane, all are not integrated, so it is all about that, because for us the issue of the integration is about where it does matter; if it is about substructure for example, Khayelitsha or East that the City can be able to manage on its own, it is fine. The same applies if it so happened that the other substructure or the half of

those we can manage, are all fine, but what we want is to improve the patient outcomes. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Nomafrench, is that fine?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: That is where we are supposed to start from. [Interjections.] We have heard about that one... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry Minister, kindly take your seat. Hon member Dyantyi, we have hon Ministers.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And I only have two minutes.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, no-no, the member called you by name. He said Nomafrench.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Nomafrench.

The SPEAKER: And I was just reminding, so hon member Dyantyi. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja. Hon Nomafrench.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: He is a slow learner.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The principle is not about whether the cat is black or white, what matters is whether the cat is able to catch the mouse, and if we want to improve the health outcomes. [Interjection.] We want to improve the health outcomes as we have done already, we are already working around that. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. That concludes - I take it. Sorry, are you still busy?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, I stand for the other one.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: That was Interpellation 1. We now move to Interpellation 2, which is from the hon member Gillion to the Minister of Health. I see the Minister.

*Khayelitsha District Hospital: people-centred health services*

**2. Ms M M Gillion asked the Minister of Health:**

What steps is she taking to provide people-centred health services and equitable access to quality health services at the Khayelitsha District Hospital?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question, hon member Gillion, but just to put it on record that when it comes to South Africa, to Khayelitsha, it is actually one of the best district hospitals; not only in the country. It is one of the best hospitals not only in the country but even across, and when we talk about the issues because sometimes we hear about people are dying... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is one of the best; the best!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In the Metro out of ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... the district hospitals that we have - for example the major district hospitals we have are the Victoria, we have False Bay, Wesfleur, Eerste River, Helderberg and Karl Bremer and so on - Khayelitsha is the one where the mortality rates actually are slightly less than the average of all others. [Interjections.] And when we talk about the complaints... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: When we talk about complaints...

The SPEAKER: Sorry, the Minister is responding to a question please. Mamela, listen. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Regarding the client satisfaction rate, that is not even conducted by us, 78% has been achieved. However, having said that, the issue of improving the patient experience matters because if you have to wait longer, it does not matter whether at the end when you meet a clinician you will be treated very well, you will be given treatment and then it is yielding better health outcomes. So far what we have done, we have built a new ward; we have the ward now that is supposed to be operational by 1 June. This at least will alleviate bed pressures.

The psychiatry unit; 30 beds at the psychiatry unit for 72 hours, which is the same that we have done in Mitchells Plain, it is also under construction. The CT Scan Suite; that has already been operational from 1 June. With regard to child health, we are appointing a registrar as part of the Tygerberg Hospital, plus also it will assist with Khayelitsha. In terms of the nursing staff we have a phased approach. The first year we will have more professional nurses; the second year enrolled nurses; the third year enrolled nursing assistants. Now we are changing those who are appointed by agents to make them full-time and all the vacancies have been filled.



In terms of the emergency services we have appointed a head of emergency services to coordinate the whole of the management of Emergency Medical Services.

Orthopaedic surgery; an additional surgeon is being added. General surgery; an additional surgeon is being added. Anaesthetics, we are appointing a district anaesthetist so that we can be able to cover the theatre cases.

In terms of women's health, we have appointed two additional registrars in obstetrics and to assist in collaboration also with Tygerberg.

Outpatients; we made changes at Eerste River because we wanted to reduce the service pressure at Eerste River, and we now diverted emergencies at Mfuleni to go to Khayelitsha. So now it means that we are going to have more additional elective patients that are referred from Mfuleni, so there are lots of things that I can mention. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Mbombo. I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I hope that the MEC has got hold of the statement issued by Parliament after the unannounced visit to Khayelitsha District Hospital. This visit follows a petition received from Ms Nobuntu Fuzane directing complaints against the KDH staff for negligence and findings in relation to the submissions made during hearings that there has been poor and incomplete record-keeping from the KDH staff. Allegations by

Dr Engelbrecht were false. Members of the Select Committee on Petitions and Executive Undertakings must be commended for its visit to the KDH and the way they conducted themselves during the unannounced visit to this hospital. The nurses spoke freely to members of the Committee about challenges which they said do not only hamper service delivery but are also causing a strain on hospital personnel. Staff shortages relating to the high number of disciplinary hearings and firing of senior staff members at the Khayelitsha District Hospital are some of the major issues hampering service delivery to the community of Khayelitsha.

Head-nurses in various departments complained of the immense pressure faced by staff on a daily basis. In the antenatal clinic sister Elizabeth Brock said the agency which appoints staff sends a different person on a daily basis, which means that they have to supervise and train new staff every day and this causes delays in delivering services to the people. During their walkabout the Committee witnessed a number of patients lying on the floor and a large number of patients slumped up in chairs, having been there since twelve noon on the previous day. The hospital is set to face a severe shortage of beds as patients are assisted according to severity of their illness.

Dr Anwar Kharwa, Chief Executive Officer of the hospital, said that it becomes especially challenging over the weekends when the hospital faces a spike in trauma cases relating to violence.

“KHD is also having to carry the burden of patients from surrounding areas

such as Mfuleni and Mitchells Plain...” said Dr Kharwa.

The community compared the hospital to Jooste, saying people merely go there to die. The buildings and equipment at KDH are of a high standard, but the service delivered to the community of Khayelitsha is displeasing and unacceptable.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly. That is how I know it as a resident of Khayelitsha, by the way.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, the Provincial Governments in South Africa have a critical responsibility in terms of population health... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon Mitchell and...

Ms L J BOTHA: ...providing people-centred health services is imperative to any successes in the healthcare sector. As part of my oversight role over the Western Cape Department of Health it is of vital importance that I hold the Minister and her Department accountable at all times so as to ensure that the people of our province receive healthcare services that are people-centred and that the services received are of the highest quality. That the Department has adopted a people-centred healthcare approach in the province, represents a major shift in thinking.

The Department has been making concerted efforts to re-orient healthcare services to make it a practical reality. The approach adopted by the Department has focused on creating a healthcare system to encapsulate the needs, wants and expectations of individuals, families and our communities. During my tenure as the Chairperson on the Standing Committee on Health I have experienced a healthcare system to be one that provides equitable access to health systems, effective treatments and psychosocial support.

In efforts to ensure that the people of our province receive equitable access to quality healthcare services, the Department has allocated over 40% of its budget this financial year to District Health Services. This amounts to a nominal increase of approximately R551.9 million or 6.3%. I would like to thank the Department for this allocation as District Health Services' core mandate is to render comprehensive healthcare services to those who are the most vulnerable in our province. This reaffirms our Government's commitment to deliver quality, affordable, accessible and efficient health service to all the people of our province.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you Madam Speaker. I for one take oversight very seriously and I really want to challenge the MEC if she does not have this report, to get hold of this report, because it was an unannounced oversight visit by national members of Parliament. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Just give her a copy now.

Ms M N GILLION: If she does not have it – no matter if it's the ANC or the DA, whoever made the oversight. This is an oversight report and I really want the MEC to investigate this.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They need to [Inaudible.].

Ms M N GILLION: MP Ximbi, on that oversight visit, instructed Dr Kharwa and the Hospital Board members present to provide the Committee ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: How can he instruct ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... with a comprehensive report on a large number of cases relating to disciplinary hearings ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: When [Inaudible.].

Ms M N GILLION: ... firing of staff and the various obstacles faced by the Hospital.

Madam Speaker, please protect me from your Chief Whip, because he must make sure his members also do this oversight.

Now the question here is ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, take your seat, please. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: What is the point?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are wasting our time.

Mr M G E WILEY: When can a Member of Parliament instruct an official?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ah, sit down.

Ms M N GILLION: Ag, please man. No, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: If I may ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Am I protected?

An HON MEMBER: But she said members, not officials.

The SPEAKER: You are protected, except to say that as the Speaker I also do not want to take instruction, so ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: She needs to be protected against her [Inaudible.].

An HON MEMBER: She said members not officials.

The SPEAKER: You are protected, hon member Gillion, you may proceed.

Ms M N GILLION: I need protection from your Chief Whip on the other side.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Not like he is saying that I need protection from myself.

The SPEAKER: You are protected, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: This thing of the DA just saying what they want in this House must come to an end.

Mr R T OLIVIER: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Now I want to continue ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I am sorry, hon member Gillion, hon member Olivier is on the floor.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, thank you for recognising me. I just wanted to assist us. The Chief Whip stood up and said something. Can you just guide us what that was. Is it a point of order, addressing you? Where is that in the Rules? Or can ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... he just stands and says something and then you continue? [Interjections.] Because I am not sure what he was doing and for me, as a young Member of Parliament, I want to learn. What was he doing? [Interjections.] So that in future I do not repeat what he is doing.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He might have to teach you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Olivier. Four years into a term, a point of order should be just that.

An HON MEMBER: That was not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: It should not be a debating point or a statement or a comment or an opinion.

So I am going to leave it at that and just ask that as we proceed, if we do rise on a point of order we come with a clear understanding of what constitutes a point of order. Yes, Chief Whip?



Mr M G E WILEY: May I address you please?

The SPEAKER: Yes, of course you may. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: When a member on the other side ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Now you are [Inaudible.].

Mr M G E WILEY: ... addresses me in my capacity as the Chief Whip, I am entitled to defend myself. They are attacking me in my capacity as Chief Whip ... [Interjections.] not just in my capacity as a member ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: In other words I have a right to defend myself.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Chief Whip, hon members, sorry, hon member Lekker, will you kindly take your seat. I think the issue – please, take your seat. What is at issue here is the fact that we refer to each other as hon members. It was the same as I called out hon member Dyantyi for saying Nomafrench. He stood up and acknowledged he should have said hon Minister or hon French or whatever it is he would have wanted to do.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which I did.

The SPEAKER: The idea of saying Chief Whip, it should be the hon Wiley and the hon Uys, if that is the manner in which we are going to conduct ourselves in the House. For ease of purpose I am asking let us respect each other in our roles as MPs in a debate. So we are not all of the other stuff today, we are hon members and please, I am trying to guide the House and be as ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.]. He is out of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, you – that is casting aspersions, you cannot say that, hon member Tyatyam. [Interjections.] If you have got – no, no. You just said now: “We are not dealing with an honourable man,” and you pointed your finger at ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, but ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No.

Ms M N GILLION: He did not say that.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, you did not hear.

Ms M N GILLION: He did not say that.

The SPEAKER: Okay. So, okay it will reflect on Hansard and the audio, and

once I have done that I will revert to the House.

Mr S G TYATYAM: But Madam Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Yes ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... what I am saying ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: You are not dealing with the conduct of the hon member.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Exactly.

The SPEAKER: No ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is fine that you are generalising but there is a particular issue and that was raised by the hon member, and, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... [Inaudible.] out of order.

The SPEAKER: Sorry. Well, you see you cannot fix one out of order with

another out of order, because, sorry, two wrongs do not make a right. That is just ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: The first ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... so ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... the first thing I am saying is rule on the issue.

The SPEAKER: But that is exactly what I have tried to do. I have tried to say let us treat each other ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: No, hon member Tyatyam, you – please, take your seat. Please, take your seat.

We address each other as honourable and we manage ourselves in a way that is honourable.

So you cannot call each other out by name and say that one is not honourable. That is casting aspersions and that is the next level. [Interjections.] I have pointed out what constitutes a point of order and I think the Chief Whip has taken that, and if he should do it again, I will tell him that that is not a point of order, but a debating point, but you cannot, hon member Tyatyam, stand

on the floor and engage me in the manner in which you are doing now. That too is inappropriate.

An HON MEMBER: Hey ...

The SPEAKER: So I like said, two wrongs do not make a right. Hon member Olivier, if you could take your seat, hon member Lekker wanted to address me.

An HON MEMBER: Ja [Inaudible.].

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Ndiyabulela Somlomo.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you very much, Speaker.] †I would like to address you.

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The first one is around the issue of members of this House that are treating each other with disdain. I am particularly concerned with the manner in which you tend to handle issues and points of order in this House. I want to state that hon member Gillion said: "Can you protect me from Wiley." Then hon member Wiley stood up. In trying to defend whatever he displayed here, he says: "I am allowed to protect myself and therefore somebody cannot just stand up and say whatever he wants to say," but, Madam Speaker, the basis of the issue here is that at no point have I ever

heard you reprimanding hon member Wiley.

He continuously stands up and says whatever he wants to say, even if you did not recognise him, and I find it difficult to sit here and say, with honour, that the Speaker is never biased.

Now I would like to request, at all costs, that – we understand you are a member of the DA, but you happen to be a Speaker of this House, which means we are all at your mercy - please, please, you be patient and conduct yourself unbiasedly. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you for the guidance, hon member Lekker. I always try to manage myself in a way that is impartial, [Interjections.] but as I said to – sorry, hon member Mitchell, is it a point of order?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Yes, yes, Madam Speaker. If there is an issue with the Speaker or the Chair or casting aspersions on the Chair, it is unparliamentary and there is a process to do that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We know the Rules.

The SPEAKER: Okay. So the [Interjections.] – order, please, hon members. [Interjections.] There is a contradiction of terms. Earlier hon member Olivier

asked for help to explain the Rules, and now we get told: “We know the Rules.”

Let us proceed in a manner that is befitting this institution. All it takes is respect ...[Interjections.] You belong to different parties, we should not be here name-calling and throwing mud at each other. We should actually be dealing with the issues that affect citizens of this province, and I fail to see why week after week I have to go through the same drama around what is a point of order. Let us manage ourselves with dignity and decorum, and actually get on with the business of doing what we are paid to do, and that is making a difference in this province.

So, hon member Gillion, I have heard your point. Chief Whip Wiley, if you do rise on a point of order, do not just suddenly go off. Please, speak to me as the Chair.

The Deputy Speaker earlier said you cannot address the Presiding Officer in that manner. There is a rule which you must bring to the House if you want to question the role of the Presiding Officer, but we cannot go and cast aspersions and say: “You are fair and you are unfair.”

So I have now ruled on this matter. I am going to ask hon member Gillion to proceed, and I am expecting your cooperation for the rest of the day. You may proceed, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: I hope I have got time left.

The SPEAKER: You do still have time left, hon member Gillion. We will let you know when the time is up.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Madam Speaker. No, Madam Speaker, this is a very important issue. When an unannounced visit at such a big hospital happened, and one of the issues raised is the firing of staff and disciplinary hearings being the order of the day.

My question to the MEC is: these issues of firing of staff, DCs, did not only happen at Khayelitsha Hospital. It is happening all over, throughout the Health Department. What is the MEC doing about this? [Interjections.] Because it is creating havoc in service delivery to the poor people.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Botha.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jy is 'n amper MEC. [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are almost an MEC. [Onhoorbaar.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Botha, just before you go. I just gave a little talk and guidance now around how we manage ourselves, and not five seconds later it starts up again.

Ms M N GILLION: But Mackenzie does not listen.



The SPEAKER: The hon Mackenzie, thank you. You may proceed, hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, Khayelitsha District Hospital is just one of the many state of the art healthcare facilities provided ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Built by the ANC.

Ms L J BOTHA: ... in the province. [Interjections.] The hospital is capable of providing quality healthcare to over one million people in the Khayelitsha area. This hospital ensures that people in the Khayelitsha area have easy access to quality healthcare services right on their doorstep.

I have reason to believe that the Minister and her Department remain committed to ensuring that the hospital offers people-centred services to the Khayelitsha community. Just last month the Department of Health Head, Dr Beth Engelbrecht, highlighted in an interview with *Cape Talk*, that for every 300 compliments the hospital receives each month, only 10 complaints are made each month.

I would like to welcome that the hospital maintains a channel of communication where residents can register their grievances and complaints. Not only does this reaffirm the Department's commitment to being people-centred, but it also allows hospital officials and the Department ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Kindly finish please, hon member.

Ms L J BOTHA: ... to constantly have a channel of communication that serves to help them improve in the areas where there are indeed shortfalls.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Once again, Madam Speaker, †sy kan die mooiste gebou hê, sy kan alles hê, maar as die mense nie gedien word nie, beteken dit absoluut niks.

Khayelitsha Hospitaal, ek het dit gelees, ek het dit hier gesê, ek het dit genoem, die *report* is beskikbaar en ek wil een en elke *hon member* in die Wetgewer uitdaag om 'n *unannounced visit* by enige hospitaal te gaan doen binne die provinsie. Die *MEC* se persoon in haar kantoor, Dr Valentine, kan vir haar sê hoeveel keer maak ek met hom kontak oor wat werklik binne-in ons hospitale en *health* fasiliteite aangaan.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[...she can have the most beautiful building, she can have everything, but if the people are not serviced it means absolutely nothing.

Khayelitsha Hospital, I have read it, I have said it here, I have mentioned it, the report is available and I want to challenge each and every hon member in

the Legislature to go and do an unannounced visit at any hospital within the province. The MEC's person in her office, Dr Valentine, can tell her how many times I contact him on what really happens inside our hospitals and health facilities.]

†I am not going to sugar-coat here.

An HON MEMBER: You do not.

Ms M N GILLION: Khayelitsha District Hospital is one of the most beautiful hospitals that we have in the province, †maar met die stinkste diens vir ons mense, en ek wil julle uitdaag, een en elke *hon member* in die Huis, voordat julle net *praises* sing, gaan kyk hoe word ons mense behandel in die Khayelitsha Distrikshospitaal. Gaan in daai hospitaal in sonder om te sê jy is 'n *Member of Parliament*.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[... but with the most stinking service to our people, and I want to challenge you, each and every member in the House, before you just sing praises, go and look at how are people are being treated in the Khayelitsha District Hospital. Go into that hospital without mentioning you are a Member of Parliament.]

†I thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Gillion. I see the hon Minister, Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much. I just want to praise the Standing Committee for Health in this province for how they conduct their visits, whether announced or not. I think it is high time that they teach the NCOP in terms of how to conduct unannounced visits.

If the hon member will read the statement from the South African Medical Association, the group of the doctors who shared their sentiments in terms of what happened during that time, where these members not only reduced the staff members to nothing, brutally attacked their dignity, but also [Interjections.] impacted on patient confidentiality, going to the Women's Health Centres where they opened all those doors.

So I really urge the hon member to teach them all of those courtesies. [Interjections.] Again I say, as always – she must not politicise health, because it affects the people at their weakest moments. Just because it is an election year does not mean that now we have to do all of these things. For example, the issue of the Fuzane ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.] do unannounced visits.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The issue of the Fuzane comes from 2012 and it was done, all done, but now all of a sudden, because it affects one's

relative and whatever .. [Interjections.] then with the result that one staff member now has to resign because of the whole issue, and on that day of the unannounced – I felt so ashamed that politicians could make the ... [Interjection.] the officials feel like that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: My colleagues, if you are saying that we take care of our health professionals, how can you reduce staff ... [Interjection.] people and conduct services. I mean, announce a visit like that. Announce the visit. They still believe in the democratic accountability, we welcome it ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... but it must be done professionally, because those health professionals they are human beings, too. So we welcome that as part of it.

An HON MEMBER: And you must treat them as such.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The issues of the disciplinaries ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... and all of those, speak to accountability.

So that is why in those other provinces we find that the health system is ailing, because they do not hold people accountable.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So the processes that we follow...  
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Then it must be fair.

The SPEAKER: ... kindly finish up.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... the rules that we follow are according to the Labour Relations Act. We always follow that.

Ms M N GILLION: It needs to be fair.

The SPEAKER: Your time ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Mbombo. I appreciate that. That is the end of Interpellations. We now move to Questions for Oral Reply. The questions standing over. The first one I see is labelled Question number 7, and it is from the hon member Dugmore to the Minister of Transport and Public Works, Minister Grant. I see the hon the Minister.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Questions standing over from Thursday, 3 May 2018, as agreed to by the House:*

*Helen Bowden Nursing College: additional security*

**7. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Which security companies were contracted by his Department to provide additional security at the Helen Bowden Nursing College since the occupation of the building and (b) how much has each company been paid to date?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The answer to the question, question part (a): Masiqhame Trading 540 CC was contracted by this Department to provide additional security at the Helen Bowden Nursing College since the unlawful occupation of the building.

And part (b): R18,015,323.14 has been paid to Masiqhame Trading 540 CC to date.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Just as a follow-up I would like to ask MEC Grant who are the directors of Masiqhame Trading?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I do not know the answer to that question. I can certainly get the answer for hon member Dugmore, but I do not have that information with me.

An HON MEMBER: You do not know who it is?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, one just wonders that when the MEC prepares for such a question that an obvious issue that he should have his Department research is who is actually, because clearly ... [Interjections.] we are very focused on empowerment, we are very focused on economic transformation, and those issues are important. The second follow-up I would like to ask, which links to the answer is: who is currently providing security and what is the monthly cost?



The SPEAKER: I see the Minister. [Interjections.] Order, please, hon members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, the current cost increased originally when the unlawful occupation took place, which was in August 2017, from R342,839 per month, where we had six guards on shift, and the latest is basically we have now had to increase the number of guards and dogs and everything else, and the current cost is R2,919,490.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Minister. In regard to that R2 million a month which is now being paid, how many guards are employed and how many dogs?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, security costs are inclusive of batons, two-way communication, there are 36 guards and there are 12 dogs per 24-hour shift, and four toilets. All of those costs are included in that monthly rate.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Sjô.

The SPEAKER: This is the fourth question, the final one.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Just to confirm, is it, Masiqhame, the same company that was originally appointed to provide additional security to Helen Bowden? Is that the company that is currently providing the service and for how long is their contract?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, this is part of a framework contract and it is the same company.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Grant. That concludes Question number 7. We now move to Question number 9.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] there is something very wrong.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I see – the question is from the hon member Davids to Minister Madikizela. I see the Minister.

*Gatesville Flats: water supply*

**9. Ms S W Davids asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

- (1) What are the reasons for the disconnection of the water supply at the Gatesville Flats that has left tenants without water for more

than three weeks;

- (2) whether his Department has taken steps to ensure that the water is reconnected; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank very much, Madam Speaker. There was no disconnection at Gatesville Flats. What was happening though is that there was a very low flow of water supply, particularly on the top floor flats, because of the low water pressure, and this happened after the City installed those water devices, but the problem was addressed, Madam Speaker, and everything now is currently working as it should. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, the Minister was just saying there was a connection, but are you aware there no connection, because you explained that the top floor had water, They did not have water, there was no water, Minister, for three weeks. Those people have to go and buy water and they do not have the money.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, I am aware. I mean I think I just responded to that question. In fact we experience this, hon member Davids, in a number of other flats as well. I conducted a site visit after receiving that complaint. Those water devices resulted in a situation where in most top floors of the flats the water was not coming out because of those water devices, but as I said, this matter was reported to the City and the

City has since addressed the matter.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. My follow-up, my last question to the Minister is, does his Department have a relationship with the City with this system that they are putting into flats and people do not have water after they have put in the systems?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Look, it must be understood, Madam Speaker, that we have different responsibilities as different spheres of government. I am sure you would know, hon member Davids, that water supply is the primary responsibility of the local authority or the municipality, but of course in terms of inter-governmental relations, when we receive complaints from our tenants, we do work together with the City to address those concerns.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela. That is Question 9 concluded. Then I have been told that in the absence of the Minister of Education, and Cultural Affairs and Sport, that Questions 1 to 4 will stand over.

So we now move to Question number 5 of the new questions. It is from the hon member Dugmore to Minister Grant. I see the hon the Minister.

*New questions:*

*Government Garage: relocation*

**5. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

(a) What progress has been made with the relocation of the Government Garage from its existing location to Maitland and (b) what is the expected date of the relocation?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Madam Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question.

In terms of section (a), the first phase of construction of a new office block at 3 Rusper Street, Maitland, has been completed and handover is expected during May 2018.

Part (b) of the question, the relocation of the Government Motor Transport Directorate: Fleet Services is in the planning stage, subject to the handing over of the completed first phase. The relocation date is anticipated to be towards the end of July 2018.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, and thank you very much MEC Grant for the answers. I would, as a follow-up, like to ask whether the MEC can, at this point in time, or if he needs to provide it in writing, just indicate what was the cost of the completion of the first phase,

and what is the anticipated cost of the remaining period of construction which needs to be completed before the relocation, and whether these amounts are consistent with what has been voted in the Legislature under these particular programmes?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I am afraid I do not have that information. I can gladly give it to you, but I can also say that I had first sight of this question at 15 minutes past 12 this afternoon – that is when the Order Paper came through to my office.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, that is the Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: So I will gladly ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... that is the Speaker's problem, *nè?*

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... provide you – I happened to be in a meeting with my HOD. I will provide that information to him, it is no problem.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Sorry ...

Mr P UYS: You cannot [Inaudible.]. On a point of order, Madam Speaker. We must understand that comment ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes.

Mr P UYS: ... of only receiving the question at 12 o'clock today. It is ...

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It cannot be, it cannot be.

Mr P UYS: It cannot, it can never be.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It cannot be.

Mr P UYS: And here I must protect yourself and the staff ... ..

[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, it cannot be.

Mr P UYS: It can never be, because we all received it well in time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it.

Mr P UYS: All of us.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit kan nie wees nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It cannot be.]

Mr P UYS: It can never be.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit kan nie wees nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It cannot be.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, so ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The problem is in his office ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Uys, for talking to that point, but I do not understand, I cannot say to you right now. I had an Order Paper when it was distributed, but the question does not deal with costs. The question – so I see the cost as an almost new question, linked to the question.

If the question was posed with what progress and at what cost, I am certain the Minister would have been able to prepare, but there is a response, hon member Dugmore, that the Minister can provide you the costs since he only had – the issue of the Order Paper, that I will have to take up after the sitting ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Yes, please.

The SPEAKER: I will certainly do that, hon member Uys. Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. If I could just address you.



I think the convention in the House, as I understand it, but subject to your guidance, is that if an MEC, like MEC Grant, has not got a problem with answering what, as you say, is essentially a second question, then they are free to either say no or like MEC Grant said when I asked if he would not mind providing that, because I think everyone is interested in this issue around the Government Garage.

But just as a follow-up question, and once again I am sure if that convention applies, would the MEC be prepared to indicate to us what are the plans of the Department in regard to this relocation in regard to the site? The MEC is aware that I have submitted correspondence in terms of the, I have got this right, the Paarden Island property which used to be used, and then obviously from where the relocation is happening. What is the Department's plan for the Paarden Island property and what is the Department's plan in regard to where GG is currently located?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, that would be phase 2 of that project. My Department has budgeted about R1 million in the current financial year for planning and design, but that is really to then take the vehicles out of the Top Yard to free up Top Yard for development in time to come, once people move to Rusper Street, but that obviously will be in the next financial cycle, not in the current financial year.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Could I just ask whether the MEC is aware of any proposal by any social housing group or the Provincial Department of Human Settlements or the City of Cape Town, to in fact use Top Yard for social housing?

The SPEAKER: Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: As Minister of Transport and Public Works, Madam Speaker, I am acutely aware of the need for social housing within the City of Cape Town within the area and obviously Cabinet will look at all of our assets in time, and work out the best and most feasible way to address that.

Madam Speaker, may I just say in response, that if there was not an unlawful occupation of Helen Bowden, as soon as the rezoning application through to the City is finished, there are more than basically – how many housing opportunities ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can check it, check it.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... are going to be supplied? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can check it.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I just want to have a look ... I want to say ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You will get the time to check [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... what those illegal ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Anyway, you will come back and do it. Leave it.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, I am not going to.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, relax. Let me just find it. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is wasting our time.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, I am not

wasting your time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You should know it actually.

The SPEAKER: There is no “he” and “she”.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: There are 180 occupiers who are putting on hold at least 300 affordable housing opportunities in the Somerset precinct.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is the last one?

The SPEAKER: I think this is your final, thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Would the MEC admit that ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, definitely not.

An HON MEMBER: Definitely [Inaudible.].

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... the Cabinet has actually then made the wrong decision to try and sell Tafelberg, which could have in fact been used for social housing? [Interjections.] Does he admit that they made a mistake?

An HON MEMBER: You are fishing again.

An HON MEMBER: Bongile.

The SPEAKER: Minister ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, definitely not. I moved that matter in the Cabinet, that we go ahead with our plans. [Interjection.] So I am acutely aware, as far as I am concerned we made the right decision. The matter is headed to the courts and let us just leave it there.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, before we proceed to Question 6, there is an opportunity for four follow-up questions, but please do not put three questions in one and then call it one follow-up, because at the end of the day there are like eight or nine questions asked of the four bites of the cherry, and this is no reflection on hon member Dugmore. I am just giving you guidance, because we have quite a few questions to work through.

So keep the questions short and sharp and to the point, and then we can proceed.

So Question 6 is from the hon member Schäfer to the hon Minister of Economic Opportunities, I see Minister Winde.

*Crimes against tourists in the province*

**6. Ms B A Schäfer asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:**

What is his Department doing to mitigate the ongoing perpetrating of crimes against tourists in the province?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: In a blue T-shirt today.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and to hon member Schäfer for the question.

Addressing tourist-directed crime is complex and must be approached from the perspectives of abating crime directly and appreciating that crime against tourists is often symptomatic. Crime is born of a combination of socio-economic conditions in areas adjacent to tourist hotspots and communities not feeling that they benefit from tourism growth. When communities benefit from or feel that they are involved in tourism, this acts as a powerful inhibitor against crime.

My Department is leading and facilitating the development of a comprehensive tourism safety plan in collaboration with all stakeholders, including communities, businesses in the tourism industry, banks, private and

state policing, and state-owned agencies such as SANPARKS and the NPA.

The plan will see improved collaboration amongst role players, pooling of resources for most effective utilisation, more efficacious communication amongst role players, communities and tourist establishments, better use of technology in preventing crime and enhancing cooperation with National Government departments such as the NDT.

Furthermore, the Department is putting forward a request to establish a unit dedicated to ensuring collaboration amongst all stakeholders which seeks to abate crime against tourists.

While the plan is being fast-tracked, the Department has successfully implemented its own programmes in fighting crimes directed at tourists. In collaboration with the Department of Community Safety and the CCID, it has seen a dramatic reduction in ATM crime against tourists. This project was piloted last financial year with a budget of R466,000, and then during the 2018/19 financial year, the Department allocated a further R1,26 million towards this project. In addition to reducing ATM crime, our intention is that the additional 50 CCID officers on the beat make tourists feel more welcome in the city.

And then the Department's current safety and support programme is actively engaging with establishments and embassies promoting responsible tourism. This programme, with its effective tourist reactive capabilities, is on standby

24/7, 365 days per year to assist, should a tourist become a victim of crime, accident or any other misfortune.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Winde. I see the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Through you to the Minister. Minister, obviously we saw a number of bus attacks that happened over a period of a week or two weeks. While it may not be related, how are you as a Department assisting to, as best as possible, prevent any attacks on tourists in buses?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you for the follow-up. Yes, we are aware, seven so far and it seems that all seven were linked to the bus strike that is on the go at the moment. Luckily no one was badly injured or anything in these attacks on these buses, and if I remember correctly, five, I think, were empty vehicles going back to parking bays and facilities like that, but the two that did have tourists on board, our teams were there to mitigate. That is the team that I spoke about in the last part of the answer. They were there to try and mitigate the risk as best as possible, interact with those tourists and if any other support was needed it was then activated at that stage.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Winde. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thanks, Madam Speaker. Minister, we know that 42% of



respondents rule out a destination because of crime and that an impact of crime on a tourist takes approximately 20 months to reverse. Bearing that in mind, what is the potential impact, even though we know that the numbers in comparison to crime in South Africa generally is small, but what is the economic impact should our tourists be targeted in crime situations?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I think that is the main reason why we are tackling this issue. Of course we do it in conjunction with my colleague for Community Safety, but if you look at crime in general across the city, the tourist-related crime generally is seen as small numbers, but as you say, the messaging impact is, or can become quite a big negative or something that dissuades tourists from making that decision, and that is why we now have in my Department a budget. We actually have a team and we are even now considering actually having someone, a director, a post, a position within the Department, whose job is around safety of tourists and of course this is something that is evolving.

We have involved ourselves at the end of last year in the ATM fraud. The project that we are involved in now is specifically with Table Mountain, but of course what we have learnt as well in pulling together all the information, it is not about the mountain, but communities around the mountain.

So that is where the work is happening. We have got quite a strict timeline between now and August for rolling this out. We actually had a good meeting

yesterday with DOCS, with the City, with SANPARKS, starting to pull the partnership together. It now goes into the Prov Joints where there will be a stream. We are busy trying to set that up at the moment and I think once the project around the ATM fraud, on average of R45,000 a hit and between 40 and 50 hits a month, was put in place those are down to one and zero hits a month.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I just want to understand from the Minister in terms of the tourism in the townships, what are the plans there? We have seen in places like Mzoli's and even then many things that have happened particularly to tourists. So what are the plans, what are the engagements that you have with those communities?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I think I am going to answer that question twofold.

One is the 24/7 support is across the whole province. Wherever anybody is affected that support moves in and so it is irrelevant where it is. It does not matter. You know, if it is at Mzoli's or it is on the mountain or wherever it is, the team moves in to offer that support. We connect them to embassies or to hospitals or to whatever is necessary in that specific space. That is the one part of the answer.

The second is it is critical that specifically - and that was part of my earlier answer - people who are involved in tourism, it does not matter where you are, and specifically people in poorer areas, that we involve people in poorer areas to understand the economy, and where I learnt the lesson that I brought back for this was I was told that at the Sabi Reserve the safest place on the African continent for a rhino was there.

So that interested me, I wanted to see what they do, and really it is about involving the community, and that is why I said it is not about the mountain, it is actually about the communities around the mountain.

So does the community in Hout Bay value the mountain as much as the community in Masi or the community in Newlands? Wherever it is, around the mountain, the city, and what they did was they, for example, made sure to use the services by those business supplying that specific area of Sabi, so for instance, a hotel in Sabi would not buy its bread from Nelspruit anymore, it would buy its bread from a bakery in Bushbuckridge. The plumbing company would be the plumbing company in Bushbuckridge, and so what happened is you actually use communities around the space and then you get ownership, and through that process they actually made sure that the security programme is owned by everybody. Everybody understands and sees the value in it.

So it is very, very critical that you involve people across all communities around an area where you are trying to find safety or security for a specific issue, specifically linked now to tourism and of course anything that we learn

in this, how can we – and that is why we do it with all of our partners - then make sure that that gets learnt and used in other parts of our city or of our province where crime is an issue.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Tyatyam, the last follow-up, thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank, Madam Speaker. MEC, you spoke about the 24/7 unit which is good, as part of response, but is there any plan actually to grow because as it is at the moment I think it is about three people?

So is there any plan to increase that unit in order to also reach a wider gap?  
Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: There are in the province at the moment three people and this is a programme that we put in place during the 2010 World Cup, and it definitely was very successful, so we continued with it.

We also then partner with, for example, Cape Town Tourism, who have a similar programme called Band Aid, and we partner with them and we are busy engaging with every municipality. If they have a similar programme we will engage with them, if not we will start to then look at budgeting, but it

also will depend on demand.

So if we see hotspots developing then we might put a person into that area. At the moment the team seems to be managing it quite well, but of course, we just have to monitor that and definitely would not see it reducing, and especially if you pick up these issues and more and more come about, then definitely we will expand it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes Question 6. We now move to Question 7. The hon member Uys to the Minister of Local Government. I see Minister Bredell.

*Berg River: theft of water*

**\*7. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

What he, his Department and municipalities are doing to halt the theft of water from the Berg River and (b) what steps have been taken against offenders?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, agb Speaker, en baie dankie aan die agb lid vir die vraag. Dis 'n baie lang antwoord, maar dis 'n baie belangrike item, dus.

Die voortslepende waterkrisis in die Wes-Kaap het dringende aandag benodig van alle rolspelers om die verskaffing van water vir drinkdoeleindes, industriële- en besproeiingsdoeleindes vir al die burgers te verseker.

Die fokus van die Departement Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning, en veral die Direkoraat: Omgewingswetstoepassing se Groen Skerpioene se fokus het as 'n prioriteit skerp verskuif na die bekamping van waterverwante oortredings.

Die Departement Omgewingsake werk hand-aan-hand met die Nasionale Departement van Water en Sanitasie, CapeNature en die plaaslike munisipaliteite, en het ook die Weskus se droogtestrategie Imbizu op 31 Oktober 2017 bygewoon.

Departement Omgewingsake het ook 'n hoofrol gespeel tydens die interowerheid-wetstoepassingsoperasie langs die Olifants/Doringrivier, Clanwilliamdam area gedurende die tydperk 31 Oktober tot 2 November. Die oortredings wat ontdek is sluit in die onwettige onttrekking van water, onwettige strukture, die uitgraving, die invulling en die konstruksie van damme binne die waterloop.

Op 6 Maart 2018 het die Provinsiale Departement van Plaaslike Regering hulp van die Departement Omgewingsake versoek om onwettige strukture te identifiseer wat water uit die Bergrivier ontgin, aangesien die watertoevoer na die Swartland-, Bergrivier- en Saldanha Munisipaliteit teen 25 April 2018

uitgeput sou wees.

Weens die uiters dringende aard van die situasie en die lesse wat ons tydens die Olifantsrivier-handhawingsproses geleer het, het die Direkoraat onmiddellik 'n interowerheid-wetstoepassingsoperasie vir die tydperk 22 tot 23 Maart 2018 langs die Bergrivier gereël. Die Groen Skerpioene en die Weskus Distriksmunisipaliteit en CapeNature het deel gevorm van die span. Die Departement Waterwese kon nie by die operasie aansluit nie weens die kapasiteitsbeperkings, maar hulle het hulle seën uitgespreek oor die operasie.

Die Direkoraat het 'n sleutelrol gespeel in die interowerheid-wetstoepassingsoperasie rakende die oordrag van water vanaf die Bergrivierdam na die Misverstanddam. Die doel van die operasie was om die oordrag van die water tussen die twee damme te monitor en te beveilig in die tydperk wat dit die water geneem het om van die Bergrivierdam die Misverstanddam te bereik, naamlik 18 tot 30 April 2018.

Sewe terreine is gedurende die bogenoemde Bergrivier wetstoepassingsoperasie ondersoek, en die meeste gevalle van hulle word steeds ondersoek. Die Direkoraat is besig om drie administratiewe kennisgewings aan beweerde oortreders uit te reik in verband met die eienaars wie se plase ondersoek is. Oor die algemeen het landbou hul samewerking gegee en ondersoekers toegang verleen tot die persele. Verskeie beweerde onwettige en ontwikkelingsaktiwiteite, insluitend uitgrawings en die invulling binne die waterloop is geïdentifiseer. GPS-koördinate is geneem

van die terreine wat geïnspekteer is en fotografiese bewyse is tydens verdere ondersoek ingesamel.

Die Groen Skerpioene en Departement Waterwese se Direkoraat sal voortgaan met gesamentlike afdwingingsoperasies en sal, waar nodig, administratiewe en / of kriminele wetstoepassings insluit.

Die Direkoraat gaan voort om die ondersoek van waterverwante oortredings te prioritiseer. Ondersoeke met betrekking tot misdrywe rakende die gebruik en die verlies van water begin dadelik, en 'n voldoeningskennisgewing kan sonder vooraf kennisgewing of waarskuwing in toepaslike omstandighede uitgereik word. Sulke gevalle sal na 'n kriminele ondersoekteenheid verwys word vir kriminele wetstoepassing en vir die vervolging.

Oortreders wat nie voldoen aan die voldoeningskennisgewing nie, loop die risiko om deur die Groen Skerpioene in hegtenis geneem te word en vervolgt te word vir sulke nie-nakoming.

Tans is een van ons sake *Die Staat teen die Tierhoekboerdery (Eiendoms) Beperk* in die Clanwilliamse landdroshof. Die Departement Omgewingsake en die Departement Waterwese is die aanklaers wat die ondersoek uitgevoer het en die vervolging ingestel het met betrekking tot die aanvang van 'n gelyste aktiwiteit ingevolge die Wet op Nasionale Omgewingsbestuur 1998, te wete die onwettige konstruksie van 'n dam met kapasiteit van meer as 50,000 kubieke meter, of meer – en die onwettige gebruik van water ingevolge die



Nasionale Wet 1998. By skuldigbevinding kan die beskuldigde met die boete van R10 miljoen of 'n gevangenisstraf vir 'n tydperk van hoogstens 10 jaar gevonniss word, of beide. Die saak word op 14 Augustus 2018 aangehoor.

Die wetstoepassingsoperasies wat tot dusver uitgevoer is het 'n effektiewe kommunikasienetwerk tussen plaaslike-, provinsiale- en nasionale omgewingswetstoepassingsagentskappe gevestig om in die toekoms doeltreffend op waterverwante oortredings in die provinsie te reageer en te bekamp. Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Madam Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question. It is a very long reply, but it is a very important item, so.

The ongoing water crisis in the Western Cape required urgent attention from all role players to ensure the provision of water for drinking, industrial and irrigation purposes to all citizens.

The focus of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, and especially the Directorate: Environmental Law Enforcement's Green Scorpions's focus have sharply shifted as a priority to combat water-related violations.

The Department of Environmental Affairs works hand-in-hand with the Department of Water and Sanitation, CapeNature and the local municipalities, and also attended the West Coast drought strategy Imbizo on 31 October 2017.

The Department of Environmental Affairs also played a major role during the intergovernmental law enforcement operation along the Olifants/Doring River, Clanwilliam Dam area during the period 31 October to 2 November. The violations that were uncovered include the illegal withdrawal of water, illegal structures, the excavation, filling in and construction of dams in the waterway.

On 6 March 2018 the Provincial Department of Local Government requested assistance from the Department of Environmental Affairs to identify illegal structures drawing water from the Berg River, as the water supply to the Swartland, Berg River and Saldanha Municipalities would by 25 April 2018 have been depleted.

Due to the very urgent nature of the situation and the lessons we have learnt during the Olifants River maintenance process, the Directorate immediately organised an inter-governmental law enforcement operation for the period 22 to 23 March 2018 along the Berg River. The Green Scorpions and the West Coast District Municipality and CapeNature formed part of the team. The Department of Water Affairs could not join the operation due to capacity restrictions, but they gave their blessing to the operation.

The Directorate played a key role in the inter-governmental law enforcement operation with regard to the transfer of water from the Berg River Dam to the Misverstand Dam. The purpose of the operation was to monitor and safeguard the transfer of water between the two dams in the period which it took for the water to reach the Misverstand Dam from the Berg River Dam, namely 18 to 30 April 2018.

Seven sites were investigated during the abovementioned Berg River law enforcement operation, and most of these cases are still being investigated. The Directorate is in the process of issuing three administrative notices to alleged transgressors in connection with the owners whose farms had been investigated. In general agriculture has cooperated and allowed investigators access to the sites. Various alleged illegal and development activities, including excavations and filling in within the waterway were identified. GPS coordinates were measured of the sites that were inspected and photographic evidence collected for further investigation.

The Green Scorpions and the Department of Water Affairs's Directorate will continue with joint enforcement operations and will, where necessary, include administrative and/or criminal law enforcements.

The Directorate continues to prioritise the investigation of water related violations. Investigations with regard to violations concerning the use and loss of water start immediately, and a notice of adherence can be issued without prior notice or warning in applicable circumstances. Such cases will

be referred to a criminal investigation unit for criminal law enforcement and the prosecution.

Transgressors who do not fulfil the notice of adherence run the risk of arrest by the Green Scorpions and prosecution for such non-adherence.

Currently one of our cases is *Die Staat teen die Tierhoekboerdery (Eiendoms) Beperk* in the Clanwilliam Magistrate's Court. The Department of Environmental Affairs and the Department of Water Affairs are the complainants that conducted the investigation and instituted the prosecution with regard to the commencement of a listed activity in terms of the National Environmental Management Act 1998, namely the illegal construction of a dam with a capacity of 50,000 cubic metres, or more – and the illegal use of water in terms of the National Act 1998. On conviction the accused can be sentenced to a fine of R10 million or jail sentence for a period of 10 years maximum, or both. The hearing will take place on 14 August 2018.

The law enforcement operations conducted thus far have established an effective communications network between local, provincial and national environmental law enforcement agencies to react and fight water related violations in the province in future. Thank you.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Agb lid Uys.

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Uys.]

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie, Voorsitter. Baie dankie vir die antwoord, LUR. Die vraag is dat ons hoor, as ek korrek verstaan het, dat daar nog net een persoon aangekla is; is daar verdere klagtes wat teen addisionele mense gelê kan word, en in verband met hierdie klag, weet u hoeveel van die water gesteel is?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Chairperson. Thank you for the reply, MEC. The question is, if I understood correctly, that only one person has been charged; are there further charges that can be laid against additional people, and in connection with this charge, do you know how much water was stolen?]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Agb Minister Bredell.

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister Bredell.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ja, agb Voorsitter, daar is meer as een vraag daar. Daar is meer mense aangekla, dit is die een saak wat ons baie fyn monitor, want dit gaan vir ons rêrig rigting gee in die toekoms.

Daar is ook twee ander aangekla. Ek wil nie te veel op die name uitbrei nie, want jy is ook onskuldig tot jy skuldig bevind word, maar wat betref hierdie sewe wat ons gekry het is ons saam met Nasionaal nou indringend besig om dit te ondersoek, en ons het 'n opvolgaksie. Ons het ook vir die ander rivier,

die Olifants / Clanwilliamdam, die hele dossier opgestel van al die onwettige aktiwiteite daar wat ons ook dan opvolg.

Om die hoeveelheid water wat onwettig uit die stelsel geneem is te bepaal, is regtig amper onmoontlik. Wat betref die sukses van hierdie operasie, is ek, en kan ons almal, rêrig baie trots wees daarop. Met die aanvanklike idee, die onderhandeling om die water uit die Bergrivier losgelaat te kry, die 5 biljoen liter water na die Misverstanddam, het ek en Minister Nkwinti vir mekaar gesê ons teiken is om 2 biljoen liter water in die Misverstanddam te kry, en met hierdie gesamentlike operasie het ons al 3,1 biljoen liter water daar gekry. Wat ek dink gewys het op die sukses.

Die spanne wat gewerk het kan ek ook vir u sê het 24 uur, 24/7 die water opgepas. Hulle het fisies langs die rivierbanke geloop, onwettige strukture is verwyder met stootskrapers, ons het redelik hard ingegaan om te verseker dat ons hierdie water daar kry.

So die sake is tans besig om ondersoek te word. Al die dossiere word opgestel en ons sal aanhou met die vervolgingsaksie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, hon Chairperson, there is more than just one question there. There were more people that were charged, it is the

one case we are monitoring carefully, because it is really going to give us direction in future.

There were also two others who were charged. I do not want to expand too much on the names, because you are not guilty until proven guilty, but with regard to these seven we have found, we are now investigating it thoroughly with National, and we have a follow-up action. We have also for the other river, the Olifants / Clanwilliam Dam, drawn up a whole dossier of all the illegal activities there which we can follow up.

To determine the amount of water that had been taken out of the system illegally is really almost impossible. Regarding the success of this operation, I am, and we all can be, very proud of it. With the original idea, the negotiation to get water released from the Berg River, the 5 billion litres of water to the Misverstand Dam, Minister Nkwinti and I said to each other our target is to release 2 billion litres of water into the Misverstand Dam, and with this joint operation we have already released 3,1 billion litres of water in there. Which I think points to the success.

The teams who have worked, I can tell you, have for 24 hours, 24/7 guarded the water. They have physically walked along the river banks, illegal structures were removed with bulldozers, we have gone in reasonably hard to ensure that we get this water there.

So these cases are being investigated. All the dossiers are being drawn up and

we will continue with our prosecution action.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Enige verdere opvolg? Abg lid Uys?

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Any further follow-up? Hon member Uys?

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie, Voorsitter. LUR, die indruk is dat u net opgetree het nou omdat die water van die Bergrivierdam na die Misverstanddam toe gevloei het en natuurlik moes vloei. Beplan u enige ander proaktiewe optrede, nie net in daardie gebied nie, maar in alle ander gebiede, en watter tipe tegnologie gebruik u? Want mens kry die indruk dat u Departement en ander departemente glad nie bewus was van die water wat so gesteel word nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Chairperson. MEC, the impression is that you only acted now because the water has flowed from the Berg River Dam to the Misverstand Dam and of course had to flow. Are you planning any proactive action, not only in that area but in all other areas, and what type of technology are you using? Because one gets the impression that your Department and other departments were not at all aware of the water that was being stolen like this.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Agb Minister Bredell?



[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister Bredell?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die persepsie is verkeerd. Die probleem wat ons het is r̄rig mannekrag. Onthou die Groen Skerpioene het ons opgebou van drie na 54 tans, en ek wens r̄rig ons het die kapitaal om hulle te verdubbel, want ons het tans soveel omgewingsdiefstal – ons moet onthou daar is geweldige omgewingsdiefstal.

Ek kan u terugneem na die Knersvlakte waar ons die mense gevang het wat 2,000 plantjies gesteel het, en, en, en. Hulle steel van plante regdeur tot wat ookal – so dis 'n geweldige veld en die Wes-Kaap is 'n groot gebied om te dek.

Nasionaal het in die Wes-Kaap drie Blou Skerpioene en dis hulle kapasiteit.

So ons het die fokus geskuif na spesifiek water omdat ons redelik nou in 'n droogte is, maar hulle ander werk kom nie tot stilstand nie. Dis definitief 'n verkeerde persepsie, ons het voor die Misverstanddam die Olifantsrivier gedoen en ons het geweet toe ons die water loslaat dat ons baie vinnig moet verseker dat soveel as moontlik van die water in die Misverstanddam kom, anders is dit 'n futiele oefening. So voor dit het ons die Olifantsrivier gedoen. Ons het die dossier en ons is besig om al daardie onwettige strukture op te volg.

Daar was 'n hofsaak en ek het hom nog nie gelees nie, maar ek kan vir u sê dat landbouers in die onderloop van die rivier die landbouers in die bo-rivier hof toe gevat het, en die onder-rivier landbouers het gewen weens die onwettige onttrekking van water, en ons gaan moet hard wees met die bestuur van onwettige onttrekking van water sodat ons dié wat water wettig neem, kan beskerm.

Minister Nkwinti is nuut daar. Ons gaan ons eerste Water Minmec hê en ons gaan ook baie hard kyk na die rol van waterrade en hoe moet water in die toekoms bestuur word, want ons word baie keer beskuldig, maar eintlik is hier 'n klomp rolspelers wat ons kan sê het nie hulle werk oor 'n klomp jare gedoen nie, en daarom is die bepaling van hoeveel water waarheen moet skuif baie moeilik op hierdie stadium, en Minister Nkwinti en ekself is baie, baie ...

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The perception is wrong. The problem that we have is really manpower. Remember we have built up the Green Scorpions from three to 54 currently, and I really wish we had the capital to double that, because we have so much environmental theft – we have to realise there is huge environmental theft.

I can take you back to the Knersvlakte where we caught people who have

stolen 2,000 small plants, and, and, and. They steal from plants to whatever – so it is a very extensive field and the Western Cape is a large area to cover.

National has three Blue Scorpions in the Western Cape and that is their capacity.

So we have shifted the focus to water specifically because we are fairly in a drought, but their other work does not come to a standstill. That is definitely a wrong perception; before the Misverstand Dam we dealt with the Olifants River and we knew that when we released the water we have to quickly ensure that as much of the water as possible should get into the Misverstand Dam, otherwise it would be a futile exercise. So before that we dealt with the Olifants River. We have the dossier and we are following up all those illegal structures.

There was a court case and I have not read it yet, but I can tell you that the farmers in the lower part of the river have taken the farmers in the upper river to court, and the lower river farmers won the case because of the illegal withdrawal of water, and we will have to be strict with the management of the illegal withdrawal of water, so that we can protect those who are taking water legally.

Minister Nkwinti is new there. We are going to have our first Water Minmec and we will have a hard look at the role of water boards and how water should be managed in future, and we are often accused, but actually there are

a lot of role players of whom we can say they have not done their work over a number of years, and therefore determining how much water have to shift to wherever is very difficult at this stage, and Minister Nkwinti and I are very, very ...]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Tjommies.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Pals.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... ons is rêrig baie doeltreffend en toegewyd om hierdie probleem op te los sodat ons watersekuriteit kan kry vir die toekoms.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... we are really very effective and dedicated to solve this problem so that we can gain water security for the future.]

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie, Voorsitter.

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Chairperson.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Agb lid Uys?

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Uys?]

†Mnr P UYS: Voorsitter, dankie vir die antwoord. Beplan u of het u reeds met georganiseerde landbou geskakel? En miskien kan u vir ons sê wat is die reaksie, want mediaberigte probeer die teendeel sê, dat hulle hulleself probeer verontskuldig en sê hulle was eintlik geregtig om te doen wat hulle gedoen het.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Chairperson, thank you for the reply. Are you planning to, or have you already liaised with organised agriculture? And perhaps you can tell us what the reaction is, because media reports are trying to say the opposite, that they are trying to excuse themselves and are saying that they were actually entitled to do what they have done.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Agb Minister Bredell?

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister Bredell?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek dink die persepsie is weereens verkeerd en dis waar die media dit soms verkeerd kry. Dit hang af met wie jy praat.

Georganiseerde landbou is 100% aan boord dat ons die onwettige onttrekking van water gestaak kry, want dit sal die wettige bestuur van water en langtermyn landbou-aktiwiteite verseker. Hulle is 100% aan boord - hulle het

ons eintlik gevra om streng op te tree.

So georganiseerde landbou is rêrig aan boord. Ek dink wat hier gebeur is dat die media gaan praat met baie mense wat in beheer is van waterrade, en ons het 'n probleem daar. Ons het 'n probleem dat daar nie die regte metertoestelle ingesit is oor die afgelope paar jaar nie, soos versoek deur die nasionale en provinsiale departemente nie, en ons gaan 'n ernstige en warm debat hê oor die bestuur van water. Ons gaan 'n ernstige debat hê oor die bestuur van kanale. Ons het nou baie positiewe nuus gekry dat die bouwerk aan die Clanwilliamdam voortgaan, maar die kanaal is die volgende groot risiko, want ons moet die water kan skuif anders gaan ons nie nuwe landbouers in die stelsel kan kry nie, en dis die hoofrede hoekom ons die damwal tog verhoog.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I think the perception again is wrong and that is where the media sometimes gets it wrong. It depends on who you are talking to.

Organised agriculture is 100% on board that we stop illegal withdrawal of water, because it will ensure the legal management and long term agricultural activities. They are 100% on board - they have actually asked us to act strictly.

So organised agriculture is really on board. I think what is happening here is that the media goes and talks to many people who are in charge of water boards, and we have a problem there. We have a problem that over the past few years the correct meter appliances have not been installed, as requested by the national and provincial departments, and we are going to have a serious and hot debate on the management of water. We are going to have a serious debate on the management of canals. We have just received positive news that the construction work on the Clanwilliam Dam is going ahead, but the canal is the next big risk, because we have to be able to shift the water otherwise we are not going to get new farmers into the system, and that is the main reason why we are actually raising the dam wall.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Agb lid Uys?

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Uys?]

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie vir die antwoord, LUR. Ons het nou gepraat van die Weskus, maar die Bergrivierdam is belangrik, wyer as dit, en kon u enige diefstal van water opspoor of het u u al toegespits op die Stad Kaapstad, want dit is een van ons regtigwaar groot bekommernisse, dat dit ook hier gebeur.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you for the reply, MEC. We have now spoken about the West Coast, but the Berg River Dam is important, wider than that, and could you trace any theft of water or have you focused on the City of Cape Town,

because it is really one of our big concerns, that it is also happening here.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Agb Minister Bredell?

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Bredell?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Wel, ons gaan, as ons hande kan versterk, as ons ons Groen Skerpioene kan versterk, want dit is nie hulle hooffunksie nie. Hulle moet, soos ek sê, die hele biodiversiteit beskerm, dan sal ons graag by al die riviere wil uitkom. Dis 'n proses wat ons gaan deurloop en ons gaan rêrig 'n voorbeeld moet maak van die studies wat ons gedoen het in die Olifants- en Bergrivier, en hopelik sal mense dan agterkom dat, soos ek hier genoem het, die boetes is R10 miljoen of 10 jaar gevangenisstraf, dis nie kleingeld nie. Wie jy ook al is. Dis rêrig groot boetes. Omgewingsboetes is baie groot.

Ons hele strategie op hierdie stadium wat ons doen, is dat ons op 'n weeklikse basis navrae by al die munisipaliteite doen. Ek het gister weer met al die burgemeesters gepraat en gevra help ons om seker te maak dat die inligting wat ons kry korrek is, want ons het 'n risikoregister wat ons monitor om langtermyn watervoorsiening te beplan, en natuurlik is die onwettige onttrekking uit enige bron vir ons 'n kommer, dis kommerwekkend, daarom het ons ook die hidroloë aangestel wat vir ons al die wettige boorgate op 'n kaart geïdentifiseer het. So ons weet daarvan, en nou kan ons begin oorskuif en kyk waar die onwettiges is, en ek weet die Stad Kaapstad het alreeds op



die onwettige vervoer van water begin beslag lê, ensovoorts. So daardie operasies is in beweging.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Well, we are going to, if we can strengthen our hands, if we can strengthen our Green Scorpions, because it is not their main function. They have to, as I have said, protect the whole biodiversity, then we would like to attend to all the rivers. It is a process that we will be going through and we will really have to make an example of the studies we have conducted in the Olifants and Berg River, and hopefully people will then realise that, as I have mentioned here, the fines of R10 million or 10 years imprisonment are not small change. No matter who you are. These are really big fines. Environmental fines are very big.

Our whole strategy at this stage is that we make enquiries at all the municipalities on a weekly basis. I have spoken to all the Mayors again yesterday and asked them, help us to ensure that the information we receive is correct, because we have a risk register that we monitor to plan long term water supply, and of course the illegal withdrawal from any source is a concern to us, it is worrying, therefore we have also appointed the hydrologists who have identified all the boreholes for us on a map. So we know about it, and now we can begin to shift and see where the illegal ones are, and I know the City of Cape Town has already begun to clamp down on

the illegal transport of water, etc. So those operations are moving.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Goed. Dit was dan nou die laaste antwoord op Vraag 7. Dit is Vraag 8. Ek sien die agb Minister Bredell.

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Good. That then was the last reply to Question 7. This is Question 8. I see the hon Minister Bredell.]

*George Municipality: reason for Hawks' crackdown*

**\*8. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

(a) What is the reason for the Hawks' crackdown on the George Municipality and (b) what action is he taking in this regard?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Weer baie dankie aan die agb lid Uys vir die vraag.

Die Departement van Plaaslike Regering het die forensiese dienste versoek om die bewerings van onder andere korrupsie en wanadministrasie by die George Munisipaliteit te ondersoek. Die uitkoms van die omvangsbepalings het sterk bewyse getoon wat die waarheid van die bewerings ondersteun het.

Nadat ek oor hierdie bewerings ingelig is, het ek opdrag gegee dat die bewyse vir ondersoek aan die Valke beskikbaar gestel word. Die Valke het op

grond van *prima facie* bewyse 'n soektog en 'n beslagleggingsbevel by die George Munisipaliteit en by die huis van die burgemeester en die munisipale bestuurder en sekere diensverskaffers uitgevoer. Die bewerings ...  
[Tussenwerpsels.]

**[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]**

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you again to the hon member Uys for the question.]

The Department of Local Government has requested the Forensic Services to investigate the allegations of amongst others corruption and maladministration at the George Municipality. The outcomes of the scoping have shown strong evidence that supported the truth of the allegations.

After I had been informed of these allegations, I gave instructions that the evidence for investigation had to be made available to the Hawks. On the basis of *prima facie* evidence the Hawks conducted a search and an attachment order at the George Municipality and at the home of the Mayor and the municipal manager and certain service providers. The allegations ...  
[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Soos jy laas week gesê het. Gaan maar aan.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: As you have said last week. Just carry on.]

†'n AGB LID: Luister nou, man.

[An HON MEMBER: Listen now, man.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Jy moet mooi luister [Onhoorbaar.]. Ons kom mooi daarby.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: You must listen carefully [Inaudible.]. We are getting there properly.]

†'n AGB LID: Luister.

[An HON MEMBER: Listen]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Miskien sal die agb ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Perhaps the hon ... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell ... [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... miskien sal die agb lid Uys die agb ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... perhaps the hon member Uys will ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... please, talk to me.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... lid Dyantyi toelaat om 'n opvolgvraag te vra. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die (b) gedeelte. Rakende die bewerings en die samewerking tussen die Valke en die forensiese eenheid en my Departement oor hierdie aangeleentheid, is ek besig om Artikel 106 van die Wet op Munisipale Stelsels, 32 van 2000, op die munisipaliteit te implementeer. Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... allow member Dyantyi to ask a follow-up question. [Interjections.]

The (b) section. Regarding the allegations and the cooperation between the Hawks and the Forensic Unit and my Department on this matter, I am busy implementing Section 106 of the Municipal Systems Act, 32 of 2000, on the municipality. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Uys.

†Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Dankie, LUR. Kan u vir ons sê, u het nou 'n forensiese verslag laat doen. Ek aanvaar dis deur die Premier se Departement gedoen. Dis mos waar hulle geleë is, en dan die tweede ding, u sê u het op beweerde korrupsie en bedrog afgekom, daarom het u die Valke gevra om op te tree of in te gryp. Wat was hierdie beweerde bedrog en korrupsie? Wat behels dit? As u net vir ons 'n prentjie wil gee, want u het nou al die inligting by u.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thank you, MEC. Can you tell us, you have now asked for a forensic report. I assume it has been done by the Premier's Department. That is where they are situated, and then the second thing, you say you have found alleged corruption and fraud, therefore you requested the Hawks to act or intervene. What was this alleged fraud and corruption? What does it entail? If you can just give us a picture, because you now have all the information with you.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gee alles, asseblief, alles wat u het.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Give everything, please, everything you have.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, the next follow-up.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: *Hon member Uys vandag, moenie worry nie.*

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon member Uys, today do not worry.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... eerstens, ek dink ons almal is eens dat enige vorm van korrupsie is verkeerd. Kan ek net miskien 'n tree terug gee?

Wat ons doen, omdat daar baie bewerings by ons uitkom, baie stories kom by ons uit, ons het 'n stelsel begin waar ons vir die Forensiese Eenheid gevra het: “Kyk net oorhoofs en sê vir ons wat is, soos ons nou sê, jou *gut feel*? Is daar moeilikheid of is daar nie?” Dis eintlik wat hulle vooraf gedoen het, toe sê hulle maar daar is moeilikheid en toe gaan hulle vir die forensiese ondersoek.

En dan tydens die ondersoek met forensies kom daar inligting na vore. Ons

het met die Valke gesit, hulle het opgetree. Ek dink regtig nie dis my plek om daardie inligting bekend te stel nie, want die inligting word nou ondersoek, hieruit gaan 'n hofsaak voortspruit en die inligting sal bekend gemaak word.

Ek is 'n groot voorstaander dat jy onskuldig is tot jy skuldig bevind word. Ek het nog altyd gesê en ek kan gaan terugkyk in al die Hansards, ongeag watter politieke party betrokke is, ongeag wie betrokke is, ons sal ondersoek doen en ons sal die loop van die reg respekteer, en ons moet nou dat die Valke hierdie inligting verwerk, en ons moenie op mense trap voordat ons nie al die bewyse het nie, want soos die agb lid daar van die ACDP in sy toespraak netnou gesê het, ek dink ons is te vinnig as ons begin oordeel. Ons moet regtig toelaat dat die Valke hulle werk doen. Hulle het vir twee dae beslag gelê op inligting. Ek kan my net indink hoeveel inligting dit is, en my groot versugting is daar moet geen politieke inmengery wees nie.

Ek doen nie navrae hieroor by die Valke nie, hulle moet hulle werk doen en ons sal met die resultaat en die uitval daarvan mee handel. [Tussenwerpsels.] Ek het gister dieselfde boodskap vir al 30 burgemeesters gegee, want ons gaan meer munisipaliteite ondersoek, ons gaan aanhou ondersoek. Ons moet verstaan dat, en ek het die ouditeur-generaal gevra om my te kom sien hieroor, ons nie die waarde van 'n skoon oudit kan laat verval deur hierdie tipe goed wat uitkom nie. Ouditeure is nie forensies nie.

So ons gaan 'n stelsel moet implementeer dat ons ook die bestuursbriewe van munisipaliteite onder die oë moet kry van 'n forensiese afdeling voordat



mense begin pleisters plak en toeplak en die ding mooimaak. Ek wil die rowwe verslae begin kry wat ons wetlik tans nie mag kry nie, maar ek gaan rêrig die debat op 'n nasionale vlak hê, want ek dink die *management report* gaan vir ons baie vinniger bring op korrupsie, en laat forensies kyk daarna en dat die Valke dan daarna inskop, en dan is ek ook besig om te kyk na ons vervolgingsgesag om vinniger op te tree.

So daar is net ander munisipaliteite, behalwe George, waarna ons tans ook forensies besig is om na te kyk.

***[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]***

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... firstly, I think we all agree that any form of corruption is wrong. May I perhaps just take a step back?

What we do, as there are many allegations reaching us, many stories reach us, we have started a system where we have asked the Forensic Unit: “Just look broadly and tell us, as we now say, what is your gut feel? Is there trouble or is there not?” That is actually what they have done in advance, then they said there is trouble and then they went for forensic.

And then during the investigation with forensic, information comes to the fore. We sat with the Hawks, they acted. I really think it is not up to me to make that information public, because the information is now being

investigated, a court case will flow forth from this and the information will be made public.

I am a great believer in one's innocence until proven guilty. I have always maintained, and I can go back and look in all the Hansards, irrespective of which party is involved, irrespective of who is involved, we will investigate and will respect the course of the law, and we now have to allow the Hawks to process this information, and we should not tread on people before we have the evidence, as the hon member there of the ACDP said in his speech a while ago, I think we are too quick if we start judging. We must really allow the Hawks to do their job. For two days they had confiscated information. I can only imagine how much information that is, and my great wish is that there should be no political interference.

I am not making enquiries to the Hawks about this, they must do their job and we will deal with the result and the fallout of that. [Interjections.] yesterday I gave the same message to all 30 Mayors, because we are going to investigate more municipalities, we will continue to investigate. We have to understand that, and I have asked the Auditor General to come and see me about this, we cannot allow the value of a clean audit to lapse through these type of things emerging. Auditors are not forensics.

So we will have to implement a system that we can also get to see the governing letters of municipalities from a forensic division before people can stick plasters and cover up and tidy up something. I want to get the rough

reports that we legally are not allowed to get, but I am really going to have a debate at national level, because I think the management report will much sooner get us onto corruption, and let forensics look at it and let the Hawks kick in after that, and then I am also busy looking at our prosecuting authority to act quicker.

So there are other municipalities, apart from George, that we are also looking at forensically.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Uys, second.

†Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, Madam Speaker. Dankie vir die antwoord. Wat ek nie gevra het nie, ek het nie gevra wie dit gedoen het nie, ek het gevra wat het gebeur.

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thank you for the reply. What I did not ask, I did not ask who had done it, I have asked what has happened.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go.]

†Mnr P UYS: So wat belangrik is hierso, LUR, en agb Speaker, ons sal moet weet wat was die projekte. Was dit 'n pad wat gebou is? Was dit 'n behuisingontwikkeling wat plaasgevind het? Want die vraag wat ek vir u vra is eintlik in watter mate word dienslewering en die besteding van fondse wat toegeken is aan George Munisipaliteit gestaak en kom daardie dienste nie by

die gemeenskap uit nie, en ek dink dis vir ons baie belangrik.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: So what is important here, MEC, and Madam Speaker, we will have to know what the projects were. Was it a road that was built? Was it a housing development that took place? Because the question I want to ask is actually to what extent are service delivery and the spending of funds allocated to George Municipality terminated and do those services not reach the community, and I think that is very important to us.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see Minister Bredell.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, ek dink ons almal moet ook eens wees daaroor dat enige vorm van korrupsie impakteer op dienslewering, want dis waarheen die geld eintlik moes gegaan het.

So dis hoekom ek baie hard is op korrupsie, want aan die einde van die dag gaan ons nie ons diensleweringskwessies kan oplos as ons nie hard is op korrupsie nie.

Die bewerings is tenderbedrog. Dat daar ingemeng is met tenders. Dat daar agteraf terugbetalings was op tenders; die bedrae is nie die bedrae wat in die koerant was, die bedrae wat ek gesien het nie, en weereens die Valke moet

daardie bedrae bevestig, so ons hele [Tussenwerpsels.] stelsel van *supply chain* wil inmeng in administrasie, wil inmeng in tenders. Ek dink dit is waar in George die groot ...

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, I think we all agree that any form of corruption impacts on service delivery, because that is really where that money should have gone to.

So that is why I am hard on corruption, because at the end of the day we will not be able to solve our service delivery problems if we are not hard on corruption.

The allegations are tender fraud. That there had been interference in tenders. That there had been paybacks on tenders, the amounts are not the amounts that were in the newspapers, the amounts that I have seen, and again the Hawks have to confirm those amounts, so our whole [Interjections.] system of supply chain wants to interfere in administration, interfere in tenders. I think that is where in George the big ...]

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.] 100,000.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN

ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... dit is waaroor die *whistle-blower* gegaan het in George.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... that is what the whistle-blower was about in George.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see [Interjections.] ... Hon members, hold on, you have hon member Uys on the floor to pose a question. You may proceed, hon member Uys, and then I see the hon member Dyantyi.

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie, agb Speaker. Die vraag was ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The question was ... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: There are only four.

†Mnr P UYS: ... juis om agter te kom watter projekte nou gestaak en gestop is, en mens sal graag dit wil weet, want is dit 'n behuisingsprojek, is dit 'n padbouprojek, is dit 'n dam of 'n brug of 'n wat? En ek dink dit was die belangrike een, maar laat ek daarmee saam vir u vra, want dit is ook belangrik en dit gaan daaroor dat u sê as daar korrupsie is, stop funksionering of in 'n groot mate het dit 'n invloed daarop.

Wat betref die burgemeester, wat is die status van die burgemeester en het u dan nou as die LUR vir Plaaslike Regering, miskien ook met die hoed as

Voorsitter, vir hom gevra: “Staan opsy,” want ek sien die stadsraad van die munisipaliteit van George het nou alweer ontaard in ’n vergadering wat nie kon plaasvind nie, en dit is ’n impak daarvan.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr P UYS: ... especially to find out what projects have now been terminated and stopped, and one would like to know that, was it a housing project, was it a road building project, is it a dam or a bridge or what? And I think that was the important one, but along with that let me ask you, because it is also important and it is about what you say that if there is corruption, functioning stops or has an influence on it.

Regarding the Mayor, what is the status of the Mayor and have you now as the MEC for Local Government, perhaps also wearing the hat as Chairman, asked him: “Step aside,” because I see the Town Council of the Municipality of George had again degenerated into in a meeting that could not take place, and that is an impact thereof.]

An HON MEMBER: Three questions in one.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ja, u vra baie, baie vrae in een en ek het niks om weg te steek nie ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, you ask many, many questions in one and I have nothing to hide ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nou maar antwoord almal.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: But then reply to all.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... so ek sal baie graag alles wil antwoord.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... so I would like to reply to all.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Hierdie spesifieke een was 'n skoonmaakprojek gewees. Ek hou by my standpunt, as daar geld is wat te veel betaal is of agteraf gegaan het, daardie geld kon gegaan het na enige ander projek toe wat dienslewering sou gegee het, so daarom moet ons nie sag wees op korrupsie nie.

Toe dit bekend geword het, het ek persoonlik die burgemeester gebel as 'n kollega. Ek werk met die burgemeesters, ek ken hulle, en vir hom gesê ek is nie 'n regter nie. My aanbeveling aan jou sal wees neem verlof, staan eenkant dat die Valke hulle werk doen ... [Tussenwerpsels.]



*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: This specific one was a cleaning project. I stand by my view, if there was money that was overpaid or went around the back, that money could have gone to any other project that delivered service, so therefore we should not be soft on corruption.]

When it became known, I personally phoned the Mayor as a colleague. I work with the Mayors, I know them, and I said to him I am not a Judge. My advice to you would be to take leave, stand aside so that the Hawks can do their job ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Neem verlof nogal.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Take leave *nogal*.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ja, dis wat ek vir hom gesê het.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, that is what I told him.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Why not dismiss him?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: En toe – want jy is onskuldig totdat jy

skuldig bevind word, en ek sien die agb lid Uys wil jou nie 'n vraag [Tussenwerpsels.] laat vra het nie.

En, agb Speaker, wat die party besig is om te doen, die party het reeds 'n besluit geneem om die agb lid 48 of 72 uur te gee om redes aan te voer hoekom hy nie geskors moet word nie, so ek dink die party sal daardie roete inslaan.

Wat die raad se ontaarding betref, dis jammer en dis 'n interessante een, en laat ek dit maar sommer op die tafel sit. Ons almal weet van Regulasie 5.2 wat sê dat indien daar ernstige bewerings is, dat die raad binne sewe dae ingelig moet word. Ek het die Speaker kennis gegee en ja, die DA-komponent het besluit hulle gaan nie die raad inlig nie. Ek het 'n regsopinie gekry [Tussenwerpsels.] – ja, en ek het 'n regsopinie gekry daarop, en die regsopinie is dat ek nie *locus standi* as LUR het om hulle te dwing nie, en dis basies waarom die raad toe ontaard het dink ek, want die opposisie het dit toe aangeval, ten regte uit my perspektief uit. Daar is 'n regulasie wat vir jou sê jy moet die raad binne sewe dae inlig en hulle behoort dit te gedoen het.

***[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]***

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And then – because you are innocent until proven guilty, and I see the hon member Uys did not want to let you ask a question [Interjections.]

And, Madam Speaker, what the party is doing, the party had already decided to allow the hon member 48 or 72 hours to provide reasons why he should not be expelled, so I think the party will follow that route.

Regarding the council's degeneration, it is a pity and an interesting one, and let me put it on the table right away. We all know about Regulation 5.2 that says that if there are serious allegations, the council should be informed within seven days. I gave notice to the Speaker and yes, the DA component decided they are not going to inform the council. I acquired a legal opinion [Interjections.] – yes, and I acquired a legal opinion on that, and the legal opinion is that I have no *locus standi* as MEC to force them, and that is basically why the council degenerated I think, because the opposition attacked that, rightfully from my perspective. There is a regulation that tells you that you have to inform the council within seven days, and they should have done that.]

†Mnr P UYS: Ja, dankie daarvoor.

[Mr P UYS: Yes, thank you for that.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please address the Chair, thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, thank you, Madam Speaker. This is just the tip of the iceberg, there is more coming.

†Die LUR sê hy werk baie hard op korrupsie. [The MEC says he works very hard on corruption.] †I just want to give him this point. You are talking hard about corruption, you are doing very little. This is the question I want to follow up with you.

An HON MEMBER: Well, at least he is doing it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have come in in George, obviously as I have asked you before, after people tipped you, they raised the issues with you, it is not just the Department that had seen these things.

My question is, the amounts involved in the George corruption of that forensic audit that forced you to bring in the Hawks, the amounts and the extent of that problem compared to what has happened previously in other municipalities that I can give you a list of, is [Interjections.] chalk and cheese. Why did you not intervene in the other municipalities and in George you intervene when in fact there are millions that have been kind of stolen, wasted? Whether it is Knysna ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... whether it is Oudtshoorn – the question is already

there, are you not listening?

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

An HON MEMBER: What is the question?

An HON MEMBER: He asked him why did you not [Inaudible.].

An HON MEMBER: You were not listening.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because he says he is very hard on corruption.

The SPEAKER: Okay ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And I am saying to him there has been more and bigger corruption than George that he has done nothing about up to this point.

An HON MEMBER: Sorry, you need to ask.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I have already asked [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, I am also worried that this might be the tip of the iceberg and we will clamp down on corruption, and therefore I had all the 30 Mayors yesterday in a room ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Clamp on [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and I told them we are going to start to change the processes, but I am also bound to the legal framework, where we currently sit with our seventh Minister on a national level in nine years.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: So that office is dead.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Because, you see you can hand it out, but you cannot take it. [Interjections.] The problem that I have got is that you cannot just intervene in a council. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why did [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: You – I am busy with a 106 in two municipalities. [Interjections.] You must first do a 106 ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... before you can do an administrative process, a 139. It is a very lengthy process, it is a very difficult process.

I am busy with more municipalities, Madam Speaker, and we will act as we get proof, and I do not have to find the proof, the Hawks must do that job, the forensics is doing ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why must [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... their investigation. They sit with the Hawks and if there is *prima facie* evidence, they will act. The Hawks acted in

this case within eight days. I must give them that, I am very impressed.

Ms M N GILLION: And Knysna?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Within eight days.

Ms M N GILLION: Nothing happened in Knysna.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: You see, and it is easy and ...

An HON MEMBER: And Mossel Bay.

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And in Bitou. There are lots of them.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It is easy to shout out any municipality's  
name ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are not shouting, we are giving you a list.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS



AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Give us the list ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and the detail ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... your interjection is ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... so that we can investigate. One thing  
that the DA does not do, we do not hide corruption and ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle doen [Onhoorbaar.]. [Tussenwerpsels.].

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.].]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We are out there ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle doen niks [Onhoorbaar.]. [Tussenwerpsels.].

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are doing nothing [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... we will fight it.

An HON MEMBER: So you just look at it?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Look at Oudtshoorn. We have got there.

An HON MEMBER: Tell that to [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Two hon members on the other side, the hon members Uys and ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... were previously MECs of this province. They did nothing in Oudtshoorn.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We acted on Oudtshoorn when we were there.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We have acted in Oudtshoorn.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jy weet dit.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You know that.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We have acted in Oudtshoorn.

The SPEAKER: ... your interjection, please.

Ms M N GILLION: Oudtshoorn was [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We have acted in Kannaland. The Hawks  
report is handed over to the Prosecuting Authority, we await the outcome. We  
will not prejudge, we will work with the facts, and if people must go to jail,  
they will go to jail, because ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: What about Knysna?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... we will clamp down on corruption.

Ms M N GILLION: What about Knysna?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And there are more municipalities that we do investigate ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And do nothing.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and we will keep on.

Ms M N GILLION: Nothing [Inaudible.].

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So you know there are more?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Bredell.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] too late.

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Is there another opportunity ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Wiley, sorry. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ... to ask a question? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No. [Interjections.] Sorry, are you asking ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This was the last question.

The SPEAKER: No, hold on, hold on, hon members.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] question.

The SPEAKER: The ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: How many questions have been asked [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: There are four ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Four!

The SPEAKER: ... follow-up questions ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It was four.

The SPEAKER: That was four questions, Chief Whip, thank you.

[Interjections.]

So that concludes Question 8. I am told and I have been advised, hon member Gillion, that in the absence of Minister Fritz, Question 9 will stand over, so we will now move to Question 10, which is the question by hon member Dijana to Minister Dan Plato. I see the Minister.

*Central Karoo: community safety initiatives*

**10. Ms T M Dijana asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether his Department has any community safety initiatives in the Central Karoo area; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, thank you, and also the hon member for the question.

Yes. My Department continues with youth outreach events in the Central Karoo area. Since the start of 2017 the Department had four youth outreach events in Laingsburg, Murraysburg and Merweville.

Safety initiative events in Beaufort West since 2017 include the Liquor Authority Public Hearings on the Liquor Regulations, a youth event, partnering with the Human Rights Commission for Nelson Mandela Day, as well as a Safety Walkabout.

Additionally the Department also had a parent and child event in Nelspoort as well as Merweville, at which particular focus was placed on the role of the parent in the household. These safety initiatives followed on additional youth outreach events in Beaufort West and Merweville which had been hosted in 2016.

A total of five youth were trained at the Chrysalis Academy during the past financial year. All five youth were placed in a 12-month youth work opportunity being paid an EPWP stipend.

We currently have youth from Beaufort West, Nelspoort and Merweville attending our Chrysalis Academy, as well as youth from these towns, including Murraysburg, awaiting confirmation of their acceptance at Northlink College and other FET colleges. There are already youth from the town of Beaufort West studying at Northlink College and this emanates from our events in the past financial years.

My Department has also embarked on a rollout of rehabilitation programmes together with the Department of Social Development in Beaufort West, focusing on getting youth off the streets and back onto the school benches, as well as into drug and alcohol rehabilitation centres and this was spearheaded after my recent walkabouts in the known hot spot areas of Beaufort West, where we spent quite some time.

Monthly update reports are provided by the Department of Social

Development in Beaufort West on all progress made with the current cases identified.

It is also important to note that youth from these towns, specifically Merweville with special talents in the field of the Arts and Culture, Sport as well as visual art or sketching have been brought to Cape Town by my Department, and offered opportunities to further their skills with specialised training. I am proud to add that an exhibition of these works will be on display at the Artscape Theatre as from 11 June this year, next month onwards, for a period of a month as part of our 2018 youth month programmes. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Dijana.

†UNksz T M DIJANA: Enkosi Somlomo. Somlomo ndicel' ukubuza. NdivuMphathiswa ethetha ngezinye iindawo: iMaritzburg, (Murraysburg) iLaingsburg, iBeaufort West, iNelspoort. Andimvanga ethetha ngeKlaarstroom, iLeeu-Gamke okanye iPrince Albert. Ingaba bezikhona na ezi programs eKlaarstroom, eLeeu-Gamka okanye nasePrince Albert. Enkosi.

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]*

[Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I would like to ask something. I heard the Minister speak about Maritzburg, Laingsburg, Beaufort West, Nelspoort. I have not heard him speak about Klaarstroom,



Leeu-Gamka or Prince Albert. Will these programs be in Klaarstroom, Leeu-Gamka or Prince Albert? Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Pardon me, Madam Speaker, I must apologise. I did not follow what the hon member said unfortunately. I am struggling again with the translation. If the hon member could please just repeat ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana, sorry, the Minister has not picked up the essence of your follow-up. Would you care to repeat that, please?

†UNksz T M DIJANA: Enkosi Somlomo. Ndicela ukuva – ndiyabulela uba uMphathiswa uthethe ngeBeaufort West, iMaritzburg, iLaingsburg, kodwa khange ndive ethetha ngeKlaarstroom neLeeu-Gamka okanye iPrince Albert. Ngoku ndicel' ukwazi: Ngaba ezo programs zizobakhona na kwezi ndawo zintathu? Kuba umbuza wam ububuza ngeCentral Karoo iyonke.

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]*

[Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Speaker. I would like to hear – I appreciate that the Minister has spoken about Beaufort West, Maritzburg, Laingsburg but I have not heard him speak about Klaarstroom, Leeu-Gamka or Prince Albert. So now I would like to ask: Will those programs also be there in

those three places? Because I am asking about the whole central Karoo.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, the hon member is quite correct. There is still a lot to do in the areas mentioned, I think ... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Still a lot to do.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, that is correct. There will always be a lot to do, our job will never be finished.

Ms P MAKELENI: Ja. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Because the issues are vast and huge, and I will definitely pay attention to the other areas mentioned. What happened in the areas I raised, the other areas need that as well. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dijana?

†UNksz T M DIJANA: Ndiyabulela, Somlomo. Iyingxaki indaba yaseCentral Karoo, kuba uMphathiswa uphinde wasinika i-report ye-youth ezintlanu. Andiyazi ke ngoku kula Central Karoo ine-high crime rate ne-unemployment, sizoxelelwa nge-youth, abantu abyi5. Omnye umbuzo wam wesibini,

ndizohlala phantsi: ndifun' ukwa into yokuba ezi advertisements zakhe zenziwa njani na xa ene-programs eCentral Karoo.

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]*

[Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Speaker. There is a problem in Central Karoo, but the Minister gives us a report about five youths. I do not know what that helps for him to tell us about five youths because Central Karoo has a high crime rate and unemployment. My second question before I sit down is: I would like to know about these advertisements of his, how he will do them if there are programs in Central Karoo.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dijana. Minister Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am very encouraged, Madam Speaker, with the amount of youngsters currently at Chrysalis and the amount of youngsters from those areas currently at the FET colleges.

If we can just get that right, it is difficult to do a lot due to staff constraints, we do not have enough staff to be all over the Western Cape at once. That is a limitation unfortunately, but I agree, if we can get the educational issues right that will empower the youngsters to go ... [Interjection.] and look for themselves. Five is five, if at least in one area but ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You are not taking the Central Karoo seriously.

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We cannot take a lot ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The hon members must realise that the Chrysalis Academy can only house 200 youth at one time for a period of three months. It is unfortunately all we can do, but ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: They are not doing their job.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... looking at Chrysalis, there are many FET colleges, and let me say to you, Madam Speaker, if the youngsters do not want to take up the opportunities to go and study, and all these courses are for free, we cannot force them.

Then the hon members will have to – how many youngsters have they sent to any FET college to assist those youngsters to go and study?

Ms P MAKELENI: Five.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They are never there, I do not see them ... [Interjection.] doing anything like that. [Interjections.]

So instead of complaining to us, I want to know what they are doing for their own unemployed people in their communities. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: They sent five. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana. Order, please, hon members.

†UNksz T M DIJANA: Enkosi Somlomo.

[Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: There is a speaker on the floor.

†UNksz T M DIJANA: Enkosi, Somlomo. *I think* uMphathiswa udiniwe. Kufuneka arizayine ehlale phantsi, because ayikho le nto ayithethayo apha. Asizanga ukuzodlala apha. And iCentral Karoo mayingathathwa ingathi yindawo yokudlala. Umntu xa efuna mna, kufuneka athetha kakubi ngeCentral Karoo. Into yoba abantu...ndimbuzile into yoba iadvertisement zakhe zenziwa njani na akandiphendulanga. Ulibele ukuthetha into engavakaliyo apha. Makangazodlala ngamazwi apha. Sithetha ngeCentral Karoo. Sithetha ngabantu abahluphekielyo abaseCentral Karoo. Makadilive i-services angalinge azoyenze imbudede apha. Enkosi.

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]*

[Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Speaker. I think the Minister is tired. He must just resign because there is no sense to what he is saying. We have not come here to play. If someone wants to say negative things about Central Karoo, they will get a piece of me. I asked him about how he will do the advertisement and he didn't answer me. His answers are not understandable. He must not come play with words here. We are talking about Central Karoo. We are speaking about the poor people that are in the Central Karoo. He must deliver the services and not give a meaningless speech.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Sorry ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, on that one ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That, there was no question, but ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I just want to say ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, Minister Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... to the hon member, that the FET college in Beaufort West ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Advertisement.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That FET college is underutilised. No, I am very serious ... [Interjections.] about this ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I want the hon member to listen ... [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Point of ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana, kindly take your seat, the Minister is ... [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: I want the hon member ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... responding.

Ms T M DIJANA: ... to listen. This is a very important point ... [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: What is the relevance?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker.

Ms T M DIJANA: That is not part of the question.

The SPEAKER: Order, please! The Minister is responding.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The – it is part of the broader question.

Ms T M DIJANA: He is not responding.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Instead of attacking, why is it ... [Interjections.] under the watch of the hon member in Beaufort West, her home town, is that college ... [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: That is not [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... underutilised? Why is it that the hon member has not started ... [Interjections.] a process ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] advertisement?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... of getting many, many of her own youth to go and study at the FET college? Instead I go and fetch them in kombis and I bring them to Cape Town ... [Interjections.]



An HON MEMBER: You are messing with the people. That is all you are doing.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dijana?

An HON MEMBER: For the second time now.

†UNksz T M DIJANA: Enkosi, Somlomo. Ndiyaphinda: uMphathiswa ingathi udiniwe. Phofu ufanele, ulala kakhulu kula ndawo ahleli kuyo. Akandiphenduli. Ndibuza i-advertisement zakhe zenziwa njani eCentral Karoo. *Hence last time* wayene-programme eHillside. *Even* i-youth yaseHillside yayingayazi lo nto. Iholo lali-empty, emosha emali yalapha e-parliament-e, eyokwenza iinto zakhe pha zeDA. Ndibuza i-advertisement zakho uzenza njani. Makangathethi enye ndingakhange ndiyibuze.

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]*

[Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Speaker. Again I say: The Minister must be tired. Well it would make sense to say he is tired because he sleeps quite a lot of the time in that seat of his. He has not answered my question. I am asking how he does his advertising in the Central Karoo? Last time he had a programme in Hillside that even the youth in Hillside did not know about. The hired hall was empty. He was wasting Parliament's money and instead

busied himself with his duties for the DA. I am asking about how he does his advertisements? He must not talk about things that I have not asked about.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dijana. Minster Plato, are you going to respond?

An HON MEMBER: This [Inaudible.] is a scheme.

The SPEAKER: Sorry?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: What the hon member was saying is exactly what we are doing. I can show recordings. Our halls are packed and full. How did they get there? [Interjections.] Someone needs to tell them, they need to read it in the local newspapers and they must receive leaflets. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Sorry, I just need to check in terms of follow-ups. This is the last follow-up. So if it is not a follow-up is it a point of order?

Ms P MAKELENI: It is a point of order, yes.

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I do not think it is fair that hon member Dijana can raise the same question twice and both, in fact three times, and both the times the response is not coming. All she wants to know is the advertisement and the Minister is just not responding to that, and that is all she has been asking.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni – sorry, that is actually not a point of order, it is a debating point, because I procedurally cannot account for how the Minister is going to respond ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: ... to a question. No [Interjections.] ... just be calm, hon members.

An HON MEMBER: Jôh.

The SPEAKER: All I am saying is there is a question that is posed and how the Minister responds is his prerogative. So as a Speaker I cannot tell the Minister to respond in a manner that is different to the way he has responded. [Interjections.] But – excuse me?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Even if it is not relevant, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: No-no, it is not a question of relevance. The member posed a question, the Minister responded as he deemed fit and necessary.

An HON MEMBER: But he has not responded.

The SPEAKER: And all I am doing is maintaining order. So there is another question which comes up now for hon member Dijana, and hopefully you will get the desired answers, but I cannot vouch for the answers that Ministers give to members unfortunately.

So the next question, now that that one is concluded, again is to the Minister of Community Safety. It is question 11 and, Minister Plato, I see you.

*Klaarstoom: refurbishment or new police station*

**11. Ms T M Dijana asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether there are plans for the refurbishment or the building of a new police station at Klaarstroom; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, South African Police Services inform me as follows: No, there are no plans for the building of a new police station in Klaarstroom in the next financial year or the two, three follow-up financial years unfortunately.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, so that is – we proceed to the next question. It is now Question number 12, from the hon member Beerwinkel to the Minister of Finance. I see the hon the Minister Meyer.

*City of Cape Town: negative ratings and increased municipal levies*

**12. Ms C F Beerwinkel asked the Minister of Finance:**

In his role as Minister providing strategic financial leadership to the province, what has he done regarding the City of Cape Town's negative ratings outlook and increases in municipal levies that are five times above the inflation rate?

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie, agb Speaker, en ook dankie aan die agb lid vir hierdie vraag.

Die Stad se graderingsvooruitsig het negatief gebly, hoofsaaklik vanweë die uitdagings rakende die watersituasie, en die Stad se graderingsvooruitsig kan slegs verbeter indien die watersituasie verbeter of deur middel van finansiële bystand in die vorm van toelaes wat die verantwoordelikheid van die Nasionale Regering is.

Die Stad moes noodgedwonge verskeie waterprojekte uit eie interne fondse en lenings befonds wat bygedra het tot die hoë munisipale heffings. Ek is uit die aard van die saak uiters bekommerd hieroor in hierdie verband.

Die Provinsiale Begroting wat op 6 Maart deur my ter tafel gelê is, maak ook voorsiening vir R257 miljoen ter ondersteuning van die droogte-, water- en brandrampe in die Wes-Kaap wat direk of indirek bystand aan die Stad kan verleen vanweë die kompleksiteit van die droogte, en die Wes-Kaapse watertoevoerstelsel.

Ek het ook, na konsultasie met die Wes-Kaapse Kabinet, R100 miljoen van die bedrag tersyde gestel uit die Provinsiale Reserwefonds, om aangewend te word vir aansuiweringsbegroting vir verdere droogtehulp, waardeur die Stad van Kaapstad ook direk of indirek kan baat om watervoorsiening in die stad aan te vul of aan te pas.

Die Provinsiale Tesourie het ook, via die Plaaslike Regering se Medium Termyn Uitgawe Komitee-proses wat jaarliks 'n munisipaliteit se begroting ingevolge Hoofstuk 4 van die Wet op Munisipale Finansiële Bestuur assessee, gevolg.

Agb Speaker, daar was ook gesprekvoering tydens die vergaderings oor die begroting met die Stad en ons het hoofsaaklik daarop gefokus op die konsep munisipale begroting en of dit voldoen aan die drie breë beginsels van onder meer:

1. Goeie finansiële regeerkunde;
2. Goeie finansiële volhoubaarheid;
3. Ekonomiese volhoubaarheid; en
4. Of dit ook voldoen aan die skepping van openbare waarde.

So daardie indikatore aanwysers het ons gebruik vir die evaluering in waardeskatting van hierdie begroting.

Agb Speaker, ten opsigte van die tariefverhogings wat deur die Stad voorgestel is, is daar ook bepaalde indikatore aanwysers, riglyne, kriteria ingevolge die begrotingsriglyne en inflasionistiese perke wat daar gestel is deur die Nasionale Tesourie en beheerliggame soos onder meer NERSA. Beide die Provinsiale Tesourie en die Nasionale Tesourie gaan ook omvattende kommentaar lewer op die Stad Kaapstad se begrotings- en verwante dokumentasie. Ek het ook, agb Speaker, 'n vergadering bygewoon, so drie ure lank, waar ons ook die Stad se begroting bestudeer het, en die implikasies daarvan op hulle kredietgradering.

Ons het ook, agb Speaker, omvattend verslag gedoen oor die Stad se konsepbegroting, want dit is tans nog 'n konsepbegroting. Ons het ook gekyk na die implikasies van die verskillende tariefverhogings wat daargestel is. Ek

het ook spesifiek gekyk na die verhogings in terme van salarisverhogings. Ons het ook die 17% salarisverhoging van amptenare bevraagteken, en ons is daarop gewys dat dit 7% is, en ons is nog steeds met die Munisipaliteit van Kaapstad in hierdie verband in gesprek.

Agb Speaker, ons het ook gekyk na die verskillende ander fasette ten opsigte van die begroting, spesifiek hier ten opsigte van die infrastruktuurkomponent. Ek het spesifiek ook gekyk na die top 10 infrastruktuurprojekte van die Stad. Ek het ook opgemerk dat agt van die top 10 infrastruktuurprojekte van die Stad spesifiek geormerk is vir watersituasies en ons het ook spesifiek gekyk na die Stad se situasie ten opsigte van die besteding op instandhouding en herstelwerke. Soos u weet is daar ook 'n bepaalde norm wat daargestel is deur die Nasionale Tesourie op besteding, op infrastruktuur ten opsigte van instandhouding en herstelwerke, en daardie norm moet gevolg word.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Madam Speaker, and also thank you to the hon member for this question.

The City's rating prospect remained negative, mainly because of the challenges regarding the water situation, and the City's rating prospect can only improve if the water situation improves or through financial support in the form of grants which is the responsibility of the National Government.



The City had to necessarily fund several water projects from its own internal funds and loans which contributed to the high municipal levies. I am of course very concerned about this in this regard.

The Provincial Budget tabled by me on 6 March also makes provision for R257 million in support of the drought, water and fire disasters in the Western Cape that can directly or indirectly lend support to the City because of the complexity of the drought, and the Western Cape water supply system.

After consultation with the Western Cape Cabinet I have also set aside R100 million of the amount from the Provincial Reserve Fund to be utilised for the budget adjustment for further drought support, whereby the City of Cape Town can benefit either directly or indirectly to supplement or adjust water supply in the city.

The Provincial Treasury has also followed the Local Government's Medium Term Expenditure Committee process that annually assesses a municipality's budget in terms of Chapter 4 of the Municipal Financial Management Act.

Madam Speaker, there has also been discussions during the meetings with the City on the budget and we have then mainly focused on the draft municipal budget and whether it adheres to the three broad principles of amongst others:

1. Sound financial governance;
2. Sound financial sustainability;
3. Economic sustainability; and
4. Whether it also adheres to the creation of public value.

So those indicators we have used for the evaluation in value estimation of this budget.

Madam Speaker, with regard to the tariff increases suggested by the City, there are also specific indicators, guidelines, criteria in terms of the budget guidelines and inflationary limits set by the National Treasury and control bodies such as amongst others NERSA. Both the Provincial Treasury and the National Treasury are going to comment extensively on the City of Cape Town's budget and related documentation. I have also, Madam Speaker, attended a meeting, about three hours long, where we have also studied the City's budget and the implications thereof on their credit rating.

We have also, Madam Speaker, reported extensively on the City's draft budget, because it is currently still a draft budget. We have also looked at the implications of the various tariff increases that were set. I have also specifically looked at the increases in terms of salary increases. We have also questioned the 17% salary increase of officials, and it was pointed out to us that it is 7%, and we are still in discussions with the Municipality of Cape

Town in this regard.

Madam Speaker, we have also looked at the various other facets with regard to the budget, specifically here with regard to the infrastructure component. I have specifically looked at the top 10 infrastructure projects of the City. I also noticed that eight of the top 10 infrastructure projects of the City are specifically earmarked for water situations and we have also specifically looked at the City's situation with regard to the spending on maintenance and repair works. As you know there is also a specific norm set by the National Treasury on spending, on infrastructure with regard to maintenance and repair works, and that norm should be adhered to.]

†In English we say it is 8% of the value of the property, plant and equipment, and I have monitored that, and in this case the City of Cape Town, the ratio of current 8% for maintenance and repairs of your property, plant and equipment is adequately covered in the draft budget in this particular regard.

So in addition, because the second part of the question was about increases in municipal levies, both Minister Winde, the Premier and myself and the CFO of the City of Cape Town have also dealt with that. We have met with the rating agency, we discussed the issue of water together with the City of Cape Town. I have looked at the liquidity, the cash ratio, the cash flow of the City of Cape Town. We have also looked at the ability of the City of Cape Town to pay back the long term loans and I have even as early as today, this morning, personally met with the Mayor, the new Mayor of Cape Town,

discussed the budget with him this morning [Interjections.] ...

An HON MEMBER: The new Mayor?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The new Mayor ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I have met with the new Mayor this morning ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members!

An HON MEMBER: For how long? Is he a one day mayor?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I have met ...

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You asked me what have I done ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I need to protect the speaker on the floor, both sides of the House. You may proceed, Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, the question was what have I done. The Executive Mayor of Cape Town is responsible for the strategic financial management ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] Patricia de Lille.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and I have engaged with the Mayor ... [Interjection.] today on the budget and the implications of the budget.

So I am quite confident that we will still continue to work in terms of further engagements with the City. We are in continuous engagements with the rating agencies, further meetings have been set up. I have received the report, I have also seen the specific issues in the report, and we have made some substantive comments about the engagements with the municipality and, as you know, our comments must also, when the draft budget is actually tabled in the Council, both the comments from the National Treasury and the comments of the Provincial Treasury must also appear before the Council when they table the budget, which is scheduled for the end of this month.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Sjoë, Madam Speaker, that was such a mouthful.

At the end the MEC says their comments and that of National must be accommodated when the budget is tabled – it is strange that the MEC makes

this almost acceptance that they have a right to comment, yet here where the Blue Book is dumped on us ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...we cannot even comment, and we cannot move from that point ... [Interjections.] but get back, hold on, hold on ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Relax, relax, relax. Steenhuisen, Steenhuisen. [Interjections.] Steenhuisen ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. Hon member Tyatyam, that is not Steenhuisen. Sorry. [Interjections.] Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, my question to the MEC is, why, if all of this looking and discussing and meeting have happened, why is there so much dissatisfaction across the City of Cape Town, about the City of Cape Town's draft budget and what is the MEC going to propose is done with the underspend on the City of Cape Town's budget, especially when it comes to infrastructure spend, which could have subsidised – let me not give him ideas – which could have subsidised the increase that has been placed on the poor, who are already heavily laden in the City of Cape Town.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Beerwinkel. That was two questions you posed to the Minister. Minister Meyer, I see you.

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie aan die agb lid. Die agb lid vra, hoekom is mense so ongelukkig as gevolg van die klomp insette wat daar gelewer [Tussenwerpsels.] is. Agb Speaker, dit is die ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you to the hon member. The hon member asks, why are the people so unhappy as a result of all the input that has been given [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, it is the ... [Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You do not listen to your own MEC. Listen.

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie, agb Beerwinkel. Ek sal vir u 'n drukkie gee later. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon Beerwinkel. I will give you a hug later. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Please do that after the sitting.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I will do it after the sitting. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Agb .. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon .. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, if you wish to pose a question, please do it through the Chair.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Nothing. This MEC is [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. I think you have somehow got everything wrong today. If there is a question you wish to ask of the Minister, please direct it through the Chair. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister Meyer. [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie, agb Speaker. Die agb lid vra, hoekom is daar so baie mense ongelukkig oor die begroting en hoekom is daar so 'n hewige debat in hierdie verband.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The hon member asks, why are there so many people unhappy about the budget and why is there such a heavy debate in this regard.]

†Ek dink, [I think] we live in a very vibrant democratic space. The National



Development Plan is quite clear. If we want to move South Africa forward, we need active citizenship and I think, as we have seen with the concept of a drought levy, there was huge public contestation, huge unhappiness [Interjections.] and subsequently that matter was withdrawn. [Interjections.]

The question about, I think, why are there so many comments? I think the hon member will know that South Africans raise their voices if they are unhappy with certain matters. They will certainly do it and I think we must acknowledge and respect participatory democracy. It is in the spirit of the National Development Plan. [Interjections.] It is in the spirit of active citizenship in line with the National Development Plan.

So, hon member Beerwinkel will agree with me, we must encourage more citizen engagement, citizen participation. It is healthy for democracy. It is healthy for your party. [Interjections.] It is healthy for my party. It cuts both ways and I certainly think we must learn, one of the principles of good governance, and I like hon member Gopie – I learn from her – that it is important to have responsive governance. Listen. And I think we must listen to whatever comes out of this. So, thank you, hon member Gopie. [Interjections.] I like to learn from you as well. The second question, hon member ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member, Madam Speaker, there was also

a second question and that relates to the underspending of the infrastructure and I think the hon member is correct. There is huge underspending on infrastructure. I am concerned about it.

I have communicated it already at the PCF, the Premiers Coordinating Forum, and we are now monitoring the top ten infrastructure projects of every MEC here, as well as in all 30 municipalities and we have also implemented a Ministerial Infrastructure Committee. I reported it in the last Cabinet meeting and Minister Grant is also a member of that Infrastructure Committee. Minister Madikizela is a member of that committee, Minister Mbombo and the Minister of Education, Ms Schäfer, are members of that committee.

We are monitoring infrastructure spending and I have to be honest, when I last looked at the infrastructure spending of not only the City of Cape Town, but many municipalities, I was not happy. That is why we are working together with the National Treasury. We are now also implementing, rolling out the IDMS, Infrastructure Delivery Management System to municipalities, with the specific purpose of trying to fast-track infrastructure delivery within the municipal space. I am very thankful to Minister Grant, through the work that he is doing, through the IDMS, that we are seeing great improvements as a result of executive monitoring over infrastructure spending.

So, hon member, yes, you are absolutely correct. There is some underspending. We are concerned about the underspending. Minister Madikizela also reported underspending in specific areas, but we have now

put measures in place to ensure that this underspending does not further impact negatively on the citizens of Cape Town.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Beerwinkel? Your third follow-up.

An HON MEMBER: Second.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, Madam Speaker, do not be unfair. This is my second one.

The SPEAKER: There were two questions in one.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But it was a long question, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: It is your third follow-up, thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, no, this is my second one. Madam Speaker, would the MEC admit ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...that because public participation – this MEC, not that one – that because public participation and your IDP process and your Ward Committee systems in municipalities – especially in the City of Cape Town - do not work? That is the reason why you have so much

underspending because the community would have made you aware long ago about where projects were supposed to have happened and they did not.

Mr C M DUGMORE: They do not like public participation.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, the question whether public participation impacts negatively on the IDP and on the Ward Committee – I understand that the Ward Committee is a system that is being monitored by the office of the Speaker of the municipality.

I also happen to know that the Speaker of the City of Cape Town also monitors the ward allocations of the various councillors, but I think the hon member speaks wider than just simply the ward allocations, but substantively in terms of the infrastructure.

I am afraid, I do not have an exact answer as to whether there is a specific reason why the infrastructure spending is low or whether the public participation is not working, but what we do with part of our time, is technical integrated management, engagement with the municipality. One of those documents has a paragraph that deals substantively with public participation and I will certainly engage with the Minister of Local Government in this particular regard.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. One last follow-up. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Mr P UYS: No, Madam Speaker. There were two questions, follow-ups asked by hon member Beerwinkel. This is the third one now. You are counting differently now, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Uys. I must explain why I say it is the fourth one. There were two components to the first question and the Minister answered it. [Interjections.] No-no, remember ... [Interjections.] Okay. I am going to allow the fourth one, but the guidance I gave after hon member Dugmore spoke was to say, do not ask three or four questions when you have four follow-up chances because ultimately you then end up asking eight or nine questions and that was the guidance to the House. I will allow the hon member Beerwinkel. Remember, one question at a time. Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, if I use the word “and” in a question, it does not mean it is another question. It is another part of the question, but it is still one question.

The SPEAKER: You have used five “and”.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Public participation – I appreciate the MEC’s openness and admittance to things that are not happening, so maybe why I am basing my statement and question on the fact that Ward Committees and IDP processes are not working is because that is where the community’s input

starts – with the Ward Committee giving input to the IDP which influences the budget, which then tells you where you have and you have not done things.

So, all I was asking is that the MEC admits the possibility that the problem lies there, that your public participation sections are not working. But, to get to my question: how is the MEC going to influence so that the underspend in the City's budget can be utilised differently if it is not already committed to a project, because only then can it roll over? What if it is not committed and there is a definite underspend at the end of the financial year?

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Yes, the hon member asked a very difficult question, but what I can say? I think we appreciate the situation that the City is currently in the specific context of the budget. So, I welcome this specific question. I think there are statutory ... [Interjections.] No-no, there are statutory ... [Interjections.] You were a former mayor and you were an excellent mayor and because you were an excellent mayor ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... you know that there are statutory requirements for roll-overs in this particular regard. They know this ... [Interjections.] But, also, hon member ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I have spoken to the new Mayor today about this specific ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: The new Mayor?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The new Mayor.

Mr P UYS: Patricia would not speak to you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I have spoken to the new Mayor today about this Budget. I was also informed yesterday that there was ... [Interjection.] He understands the Budget very well. He also informed me that there was a budget workshop and that there are still refinements of the Budget, because we have also given them some ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: When are you going to do a workshop?

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Dugmore.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Whenever you invite me, I will attend. [Interjections.] I wait for your invitation. [Interjections.] So, we have also looked at both the positive cash flow and the cash equivalents. We have also looked at the expenditure management framework, honourable.

We have also looked at one of the serious issues that the City has currently, the issue of the debt collection rate because we know that if your debt collection rate is below 95%, as per the norm of the National Treasury, there are some risks in this particular regard and so we are trying to do the best we can. But the City also, Madam Speaker, intends to use R5,6 billion of its total capital funding for the new capital assets and R3,6 billion for the renewal of the existing assets.

We are particularly happy because we do not want to see new assets without maintenance and repairs on the current assets. For example, Madam Speaker, one of the issues that I have also asked about is the investment account.

I was also given an assurance that the money that is in the investment account of the City of Cape Town is also earmarked for the repayment of long term loans that the City of Cape Town has made, and I am therefore quite happy with that specific answer, but there are detailed, technical comments that we have made, and we certainly do not agree with everything they have said, but the City is taking that into consideration.

I will, through my staff, when this Budget is ultimately tabled in the City of Cape Town, work together with the National Treasury, also be present in the Council Chamber when the Budget is debated in the City of Cape Town Chamber.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. This is the final question. Hon member



Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Based on the response which was unrelated to my question, the MEC repeatedly refers to speaking to the new Mayor. Now, my question to the MEC, do you and the new Mayor clearly understand what is in the Systems Act, the Structures Act and the Electoral Act regarding this new Mayorship in the City of Cape Town? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, it is a question not related to my portfolio but I will answer it. [Interjection.] Yes, I am there, and I am happy to answer that question. Madam Speaker, the Act is quite clear: when a person is no longer a member of a political party, that political party informs the Speaker, the Speaker informs the municipal manager. The municipal manager declares a vacancy. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The ANC.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No, not the ANC. No, no. This is where the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This is where the ANC is weak! I think my friend from the ACDP understands it better.

The SPEAKER: Order, please. There is one person on the floor.  
[Interjections.] Sorry, Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat. Hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: A member ceases to be a member of a party, a party informs the Speaker. The Speaker informs the municipal manager. The municipal manager in terms of the Structures Act declares a vacancy. The municipal manager informs the provincial ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Workshop!

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I will repeat because I think that the workshop is necessary, Madam Speaker. I repeat. [Interjections.] When a vacancy exists ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...a political party informs the Speaker. The Speaker informs the municipal manager. The municipal manager declares a vacancy. [Interjections.] Once the municipal manager has declared a vacancy, he informs the IEC. [Interjections.]

The IEC then fills the vacancy, and this is a procedure. Then in terms of the Structures Act, the Deputy Mayor assumes the responsibilities of the Mayor.

The Act is quite clear in this particular regard. So, I have in terms of the law, met the new Mayor, as per the Structures Act.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Meyer. [Interjections.] That is the end of questions. Sorry Chief Whip, is it a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: I did not get the answer. Could the Minister please repeat the answer, please? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, sorry. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We know how clued up the Chief Whip is about rules, laws and rules and regulations. [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: A point of order, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, this is a matter of ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hold on, let us not ... [Interjections.] No-no. Kindly take your seat please. [Interjections.] This is not a frivolous matter at all. There are four follow-up questions. All four have been utilised. I am about to say

that is the end of questions for oral reply.

If the Chief Whip was standing on a point of order, I would have taken that, but we cannot indulge another question. So, any outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard, and we now proceed to Statements. Members the day is going on. Let us get on with it, statements. I see the DA.

### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr D G MITCHELL (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. The youth of South Africa are battered down daily by stagnation in the formal sector ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, there is too much noise. [Interjections.] Sorry, hon member Mitchell. Kindly take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members, there is too much noise. Your private conversations are now affecting the speaker on the floor. Ministers, members. There is too much noise. You may proceed, hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The youth of South Africa are battered down daily by stagnation in the formal sector; skills mismatch; poor school syllabuses and infrastructure; low school retention rates and general unemployment. At the end of the second quarter of 2017, South Africa's youth unemployment rate was at an astounding 32,2%.

Madam Speaker, despite this, we are not victims to this fate. The world we were born into has made us inherently sceptical and challenge authority and so we are more engaged than ever in the informal sector, and we dominate the digital economy and tech start-ups. We are hungry, and we believe in the future of this country.

We are supported by the DA-led Western Cape Government who provides us with MOD Centres, the Chrysalis Academy, the PAY Project, Afterschool Game-changers, Neighbourhood Schools Programmes, Grade 4 remedial programmes, e-Learning Programmes, Peer Education and Youth Cafés, to name a few.

This is especially evident given that the Western Cape's "Not in Education, Employment or Training" (NEET) percentage for those between 15 to 24 years, is lower than any other province of comparable population size. Gauteng and KZN, Madam Speaker, is 20%, the Eastern Cape is 13,6% and Limpopo is 11%; whilst the Western Cape is at 9.8%

Madam Speaker, my heart is with the young single mothers, the child headed households, children living on the streets and the historically disadvantaged youth whose constant struggle is seemingly met with limited employment opportunities; denied by an apathetic ANC-led National Government.

My message to you, to the young people of this province, is that the DA-led Western Cape supports you. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS (ANC): Thank you, Madam Speaker. The ANC is the only choice for thinking, reasonable and informed voters as the positive leadership of the ANC with President Cyril Ramaphosa grows.

Our President proved that he can stabilise and steer South Africa on a better growth path and optimism with hope and faith in the ANC as leader of society. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P UYS: President Ramaphosa as a successful businessman and the leader of the National Planning Commission of South Africa ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr P UYS: ...is set to fight poverty, inequality and create jobs. The President is hailed by Opposition parties and also offered to protect DA leader Maimane against his own people who resist his recognition of white privilege and black poverty. [Interjections.]

Under President Ramaphosa and the ANC ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, our country can prosper. Markets reacted favourably, and Government bonds grew strongly with initiatives which include the economy, tourism, youth employment and good governance. [Interjections.]

The ANC has also recaptured the hearts of the international community at various summits as well as advancing peace. Madam Speaker, the ANC remains the party of the future and South Africa is a much better place today. Now is the time to join the ANC to ensure a better life for all. [Interjections.] Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: You just watch this space! [Interjections.]

Mr N E HINANA (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Now, members please be respectful. There is a member on the floor and he only has two minutes. I am speaking to both sides of the House now. You may proceed, hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I call for a swift and peaceful resolution to the ongoing bus strikes and the possibility of violent mass action by bus drivers. During the State of the Nation Address, the State President, Matamela Cyril Ramaphosa, requested the nation to call

him whenever there is a need and quoted the late jazz singer legend, to call him by saying “Thuma Mina”. [Interjections.]

I therefore call on the President of the Republic of South, Cyril Ramaphosa to take action as negotiations between unions and both his Ministers, Blade Nzimande and Mildred Oliphant, have failed in intervening. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, the predicament places incredible strain on commuters. School children ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Mr N E HINANA: ... struggle to get to their classes and businesses suffer as their employees cannot get to work. Moreover, Madam Speaker, commuters are forced to pay for more expensive transport which contributes to traffic congestion. Hence, I call on the President to act swiftly as his Cabinet members have failed to bring stability to the industry.

South Africa needs to consider a new protesting culture that holds exploitative employers to account, while not holding commuters at ransom. In Okayama, Japan ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.



Mr N E HINANA: ... for example, bus drivers are protesting by continuing to drive their routes while refusing to take any fare. This ensures that passengers get to work and school, drivers are paid and employers are forced to take remedial action. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, the DA in the Western Cape is committed to ensuring that residents have safe and reliable transport services; enabling employment, educational and economic opportunities. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr N E HINANA: I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] In the absence of the EFF – members, please compose yourself. You know an interjection is okay, but a running commentary is not going to cut it. In the absence of the EFF, I see the DA. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA (DA): Madam Speaker, I would like to thank the Standing Committee on Local Government for conducting proper and successful public hearings on the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill [B23B – 2015].

The Khoisan communities were eager to participate and frustrated at the same time, for the centuries of victimisation and isolation. They were delighted to receive an opportunity to express themselves on the objectives of the Bill.

The Khoisan people, namely the Cape-Khoi, Nama, Korana, Griqua and other affected traditional, cultural and indigenous communities have all welcomed this opportunity with a very clear conviction and were resolute to make this Bill a better piece of legislation, in order to realise their rightful status in terms of the international law and the rule of natural justice.

Khoisan communities told us, Madam Speaker, that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament has been warm to them. That it is the only Parliament that have consulted them on this Bill ... [Interjections.] despite the National Assembly being the custodian and the first ones to go out on public hearings on this Bill in 2015. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr M MNQASELA: This Province is serious about the rights of the Khoisan people. We are serious about all people. We stand for all the people, not just for some people. We conducted six public hearings, with an average of 200 people in most sessions across the province, where we had almost 400 people in attendance in Caledon and the Overberg where all of those people were the custodians of the culture and traditions and original indigenous people of the Khoisan. The last public hearing was on 8 May 2018 ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr M MNQASELA: I must say, Madam Speaker, that when we were there,

the only other political party that was present, the ANC, did not see it as important to be there. The problem with that is it is the same ANC that has been going around, trying to hijack this process and politicise it.

The SPEAKER: Kindly ... [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and I like the fact that the Democratic Alliance ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time ...[Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...Members of Parliament that were there, came to support all the royalty and the traditional leaders ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mngqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...that were present there and for that I thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thanks to the hon members.

The SPEAKER: I see the ANC.

Ms S DAVIDS (ANC): Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms S DAVIDS: The DA is so deep in real trouble, it now even tries to trick Cape Town Mayor Patricia de Lille into accepting all sorts of deals after the DA publicly humiliated and axed her from the party.

The desperate alliance of old liberal Progs and *verkrampte* Nats tried to redeploy her and even to keep her position vacant for three months without reinstating her as the Mayor of the Mother City. She duly rejected these deals invented in the backrooms by the pink boys' club.

In fact, the DA lurches between disasters as its communication blunders backfire on the DA brand and it blames leader Mmusi Maimane. To add fuel to the fire the whites in the embattled DA gang up against Maimane, who is blamed for the outflow of traditional supporters.

The DA is so deep into this mess it created all by itself, it can no longer win even one minor clash in the bigger war. The infightings in the DA are now beyond repair and the party will suffer more losses in the run-up to the 2019 elections. More supporters start to publicly distance themselves from the racist and sexist DA.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA. I see the hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX (DA): Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

Mr L H MAX: Every year the Provincial ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Max. Kindly take your seat please. Minister Madikizela and this side of the House, we actually have a speaker on the floor and you are just blatantly carrying on. It is completely inappropriate. [Interjections.] Hon member Dugmore, I am trying to provide the House with guidance. Compose yourself and your opinions. You may proceed, hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, every year the Provincial Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport, Anroux Marais, hands out ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

Mr L H MAX: ... cheques to sports councils who give young people access to sports. [Interjections.] On Wednesday 25 April 2018 ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Disrespectful.

Mr L H MAX: ... Minister Marais handed the last cheque of R1,7 million to the Cape Metro federations. So far, the Minister has given R4 million to the

Eden, Overberg and Cape Winelands sports councils.

I am pleased that the Department is supporting and uplifting our future Lucas Radebes, Bryan Habanas, Benni McCarthys, Caster Semenyas, Penny Heynses and Siphiwe Tshabalalas. It is clear that the DA-led Western Cape Government is committed to the development of its young people through sport. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, among those who have benefited from the programmes are Shela Lekalakala who has been involved in sports administration for a long time. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Ladies, your conversation is too loud please.

Mr L H MAX: She was a champion hurdler and provincial netball player before using her talents in sports administration, following the completion of her Human Movement Studies at UWC.

The Department is also supporting young athletes by expanding MOD Centres in vulnerable communities, assisting sport councils and increasing sporting opportunities. Hence, the Department aims to give 79 000 learners the opportunity to participate in sporting programmes.

Madam Speaker, practicing makes learners resilient, broadens their networks, ensures they stay in school, encourages them to dream and explore their

passions, and closes the opportunity gap between wealthy and poorer learners.

The DA in the Western Cape will continue to support the advancement of sports participation across the Province. Our vision is to ensure ...  
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Max, please finish up.

Mr L H MAX: ...that everyone is given a fair opportunity to participate in a sport of their choice and excel in it. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of Members' Statements.  
[Interjections.] Have I missed something?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: I am sorry hon members. I believed that we were at the end. Are we at Statement number 8 now? Sorry? It is still the ANC and then the DA and then we will get to the end of Members' Statements. I am trying really hard to maintain focus. Please work with me, members. Thank you.  
The hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE (ANC): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Every member of this House signs an oath of office and attests or takes that oath,

clearly committing to upholding the Constitution and all its laws. Our Constitution is very clear that life itself is sacrosanct and that in pursuing our responsibilities we should all endeavour at all times to value human life.

We have seen in Buttskop a clear example of past and previous members of this House who have failed to uphold that very oath of office because it is common cause, Madam Speaker, that previous MEC Robin Carlisle was the MEC at the time in 2010 when a terrible tragedy at the crossing killed ten school children. A mere year later in 2011, two more vehicle drivers died at the same crossing and in 2014 there were 80 near misses that were recorded in simply 10 months.

We are also aware that under MEC Grant, the successor to Robin Carlisle, that on Worker's Day, seven more people lost their lives and the DA Government, under the leadership of Premier Helen Zille, is silent. Silent on the promises and the undertakings that were made to eliminate this dangerous crossing. There is a clear case here that these members have defied and defiled the oath of office that all of us as members – because when we begin to disregard and neglect the very essence ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Kindly finish up, hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...of our responsibility to preserve life, we have failed the people of the Western Cape.



The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have blood on your hands!

The SPEAKER: I see the DA.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have blood on your hands!

Mr M G E WILEY: Tell that to the people of Overstrand.

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: A reply to a recent written question of mine shows a worrying trend in the number of police officers leaving the service in the Western Cape. In the last financial year ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms M M WENGER: In the last financial year, 207 Police Act personnel ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Wenger kindly take your seat. Hon members, it is disrespectful to howl the way you are doing right

now, just because a member takes the floor. Please let us engage in a manner that is respectful. That is blatant disrespect. You may proceed, hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In the last financial year, 207 Police Act personnel left the service and if we look at the last five financial years, the number is closer to 2 257 officers that have left the service, that being mainly through resignation and discharge.

The number of police officers that left the service in:

- 2012/13: 324
- 2013/14: 478
- 2014/15: 689
- 2015/16: 559
- 2016/17: 207

Now, in a context of severe under-resourcing ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M M WENGER: ... this is cause for serious concern and the concern is borne out by the very slow rate of filling these posts. By way of example, on a recent oversight visit to the Parow Police Station, we learned that this station has 30 vacancies as a result of resignations and these posts have not been filled since 2013. So, for the last 4 years this station has been 30

members short, and in addition they have about an equal number of officers, that being 30 that are on duty arrangements and are assigned elsewhere in the province.

So, we really must put this matter under the spotlight and put pressure on the National Head Office to ensure that these vacant posts are filled and that they are filled quickly. There is no excuse for this level of administrative weakness which puts additional strain on an already stretched police service. It results in operational weaknesses and the ultimate outcome is a negative crime outcome.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Wenger. That is the end ... [Interjections.] So, at what point – hon members, are you going to start behaving honourably or shall we wait? That is the end of Members' Statements.

We now move to Notices of Motion. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon Davids, I see the hon Wenger and hon Maseko. Hon member Davids, you may proceed.

#### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the slow pace of proper housing development under the DA in poor communities in the province.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Not hon member Maseko, no. Hon member Wenger, no. [Interjections.] Hon member Gopie, I see you. I see hon Nkondlo. We are busy with Notices of Motion. I am going by a show of hands. If I do not see hands, I am guided by the papers in the air. So, I see hon member Gopie and then I see hon member Nkondlo after that and then I see the hon member Mnqasela. Thank you.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the increasing cases of femicide in the DA-run Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the negative impact of crime on tourism in the

province and recognises the selective response by the DA Government that once again ignores such effects to townships where mainly the poor and working class reside.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the significance of the process of public hearings on the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill [B23B-2015].

[Interjections.] I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. [Interjections.] Hon member Dyantyi, there is an opportunity for you to stand up with Notices of Motion. [Interjections.] Do you have a notice of motion? Thank you. Okay, if there are no more Notices of Motion, I now move to Motions without Notice. I see the hon Maseko, I see the hon Hinana. I see hon Davids. You now need to work with me. I am taking three hon members at a time and I need the Table to guide me please. Hon member Maseko, you may proceed.

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with great sadness the passing of the Bangani Family who perished in a fire in their home. The family of eight, including five children, lived in Taiwan informal settlement in Khayelitsha. Rest well; Nontlupheko Bangani; Dumile Bangani; Wanda Bangani, Sisipho Bangani; Abongile Bangani; Athi Bangani; Endlinako Bangani and Lili Bangani; May their spirits rest in peace. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. The hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its gratitude to the greatest woman, Nokhawulezile Jadi Siyahlala, from Philippi, who celebrated a successful 100-year birthday party on 5 May 2018, last Saturday. May the community drink from her well of wisdom. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without

notice? No objections. I see the hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the inaction of the DA led to tensions between the residents of Sigalo Informal Settlement and those of Mitchells Plain; notes further the tension could have been avoided if the DA had been responsive to the basic needs that the residents were complaining about, and condemns the DA's divide and rule tactics in the province which turned residents against one another in the area.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be recorded on the Order Paper. I see the hon Mitchell, then I see the hon Makeleni and then I see the hon Botha for the next three. Thank you. Okay, so hon member Simmers. Ja.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Dankie, jammer.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, sorry.]

The SPEAKER: Guys, work with me here, please.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Sorry, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the success of the Eden District Municipality's firefighters who outshone 10 other Western Cape firefighters in an obstacle course competition to celebrate International Firefighters' Day on 4 May 2018. The Firefighters of the Western Cape offer an invaluable service to us, to which we are ever grateful. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. The next hon member is hon Makeleni and then it is hon Botha. Then our next round.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA's double standards and hypocrisy in handling the issue of alcohol abuse in the province; notes further that while the party spends a lot of money and resources on the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-Changer, it still views the sale of liquor in the province as a viable business, to the extent that the party plans to allow the sale of alcohol on school premises, as well as Premier Zille planning to increase the liquor prices in the province as an additional source of



income, and condemns the DA's double standards and hypocrisy in handling the issue.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the tragic murder of 20-year old Zenith Daniels from Delft. Zenith was last seen on Sunday evening by her family when she left home with friends. Her body was later found in an open field; that this House extends its condolences to the family and friends of Zenith Daniels and calls on SAPS to find and arrest those behind her gruesome murder. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There is no objection. I see the hon Dijana, hon Lekker and hon Mackenzie, the next three.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that the average dam levels in the province are at 21% and residents may face an even worse summer in 2019; notes further that despite these realities the Provincial Government and the City are failing to cut down water consumption levels which remain very high and calls on National Government to continue with its interventions in the province. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Lekker.

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you, Speaker.] Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the killing of a young man in the Siqalo Informal Settlement service delivery protest; notes further that a man died when a taxi drove into a group of protestors; and conveys condolences to the family and friends of Mohammad Tauriq Mohamed (19). I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. I see the hon Joseph, sorry, hon Mackenzie is on the floor. You may proceed, hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends and congratulates Mr Freddie Blom on celebrating his birthday and reaching his milestone of 114 years; furthermore, wishes him and his wife, Auntie Netta, well and also congratulates them for reaching 48 years of marriage. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are no objections. I see hon Botha, I see hon Hinana, I see hon Gillion and then member Beerwinkel you will be the start of the next round. So, we have got three, there we go.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the celebration of International Nurses Day which will be celebrated around the world on 12 May 2018. Not only does this day celebrate the contributions made by these groupings of individuals who play such a pivotal role in our society, but this day also marks the anniversary of Florence Nightingale's birth each year. It is on this note that I would like to end with a quote from Florence Nightingale which

encapsulates the contributions that nurses make to our society,

“I attribute my success to this: I never gave or took any excuse. The greatest heroes are those who do their duty in the daily grind of domestic affairs whilst the world whirls as a maddening dreidel.”

I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends Mr Earl Hendricks for his caring, thoughtful and compassionate initiative in leading and coordinating a campaign of ensuring that Oom Freddie Blom's 114 birthday celebration was dignified and exciting. Further wishes to thank all other individuals for their contribution in making Oom Freddie's 114 birthday a very special one. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Are there any objections to the

motion? There is no objection. Sorry, is there any objection? Hon member Tyatyam has objected. It will be noted and recorded on the Order Paper. I see the hon Gillion after which I will see the hon Hinana and then hon Beerwinkel.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Ja, you must be stupid yourself.

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, members just work with me. Hon member Gillion kindly take your seat please. Hon member Lekker, is it a point of order?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes, Madam Speaker. I would like to get clarity. I am sitting here and observing a conversation between member Tyatyam and member Mackenzie. He asked after member Tyatyam objected to his motion, "What? You are stupid." I want to request you to rule whether it is parliamentary for him to utter such a statement in the House. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, thank you for your point of order. I did not hear that myself, because I was busy rearranging, but I am going to take the liberty of asking the hon member Mackenzie if you did indeed utter those words and if you did, it is unparliamentary. Could you withdraw please?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Just withdraw.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I did not refer to a member in this House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] He did not refer to a member in this House. [Interjections.] Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, I would really appeal to member Mackenzie to do the honourable thing and admit to a statement that he uttered, because he said it twice. So, can you please ask the member to be honourable?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, thank you. I cannot go beyond ... [Interjections.] I have asked the question, and if we are honourable members one would have to accept that if that is what the member says, that your word is your honour, that is how I understand it. He has indicated that he has not said that but I will revert to Hansard and if I do pick up anything, I will come back to the House.

Sorry, now we have just lost our sequence. Was it hon member Gillion who was on the floor? And then after that hon Hinana. And then hon Beerwinkel. [Interjections.] †Kom mense, bedaar asseblief. Dis nou – raak rustig. Asseblief. [Tussenwerspels.] [Come on, people, calm down please. This is now – calm down. Please. [Interjections.]]

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I move that this House ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie, maintain your composure please.

Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible.] drunkard.

An HON MEMBER: Drunkard!

The SPEAKER: Members, it is inappropriate! We simply cannot have you carrying on like this. There is a member on the floor and despite a member on the floor we are having this cross ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: You forget about [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: It simply cannot be. So, I am appealing to hon Mackenzie as well as the members on this side. [Interjections.] Notice. I have said “honourable” Mackenzie as well as the members, I am addressing both sides of the House. Hon member Gillion is on the floor. I need to protect her as someone who is about to speak at the same time. Let us cooperate and be respectful. [Interjections.] Hon member Gillion you may proceed

Ms P Z LEKKER: Please tell the member he must stop insulting us here! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, this is not the time to hurl insults at each other. Let us behave in a manner that is dignified. Please. Hon member Gillion, you may proceed.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I move that this House ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members.

Ms M N GILLION: I am busy with a very serious note. Madam Speaker ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: So, when hon member Wenger stood up, I cautioned the members on the other side of the House to say that is inappropriate behaviour. I now have to do exactly the same thing to the other side of the House. Hon members, you know, we are mature adults here. We are busy doing serious work and we are acting – let me not even go down that road.

All that is required of you is to behave in a manner that does not bring down the dignity and decorum of the work that we are doing. I cannot believe that adults can behave in the way that you do. Now can we please get ourselves composed and behave in a manner with dignity and decorum?

You know, this is going out live on YouTube. The world is watching, and people are beginning to think, “Is that where our tax monies go?” Please members. Hon member Gillion, you may proceed. I trust we now have the attention of everyone in the Chamber.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:



That the House extends its sincere condolences to the family of the late Bobby von Doring who died on Tuesday in Hermanus and further notes his tireless efforts to bring about sustainable human settlements in Overstrand. Hamba Kahle, comrade Bobby. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are no objections. The next hon member is Hinana, after which I see the hon member Beerwinkel.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the Minister of Human Settlements, Bonginkosi Madikizela, whose Department yesterday handed over 2 000 keys to homes and title deeds in Leiden Delft. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. The hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates and supports Badisa in Kuils River who together with Kuils River Police and schools in the area initiated a walk

and a concert for awareness of the realities of child abuse. The proceeds of this concert were all donated to Badisa to continue their sterling work.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. The next hon member, hon Botha. Sorry, hon Botha, then hon Lekker. The Table is guiding me. It has been a long day. You may proceed.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that 5 May is the internationally recognised day for highlighting the work of midwives. The International Day of Midwifery recognises the vital role played by midwives in their capacity as antenatal healthcare professionals; and further commend all midwives for their hard work and dedication to the health of new-borns and their mothers. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There is no objection. I see the hon member Lekker.

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you, Speaker.] Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the killing of women and children continues unabated in the province, following the discovery of an unidentified body of a young woman who was apparently raped, stabbed to death and dumped on a field in Delft and demands that the Provincial Government creates more awareness programmes for a safer environment for women and children who are targeted in the province. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. I see the hon member Dugmore, after which I see the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the killing of the elderly parents of education expert, Professor Graeme Bloch, and the parents-in-law of his wife, ANC stalwart and political activist comrade Cheryl Carolus, as well as their children; and notes that it is suspected that the two were robbed and murdered in their house in Rosebank over the weekend; and this House therefore conveys sincere condolences to the family, friends and comrades and calls on police to speedily bring the perpetrators to book.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Sorry?

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: There are no objections. I see the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends and congratulates Shoprite Checkers, Charlies Bakery, Alabaster Box Perfumes, The Daily Voice, Cape Talk and the following individuals:

Ms Liezel van der Westhuizen

Ms Doreen Morris

Mr Marlon Parker

Mr Kieno Kammies

Mr Adrian de Kock

Ms Genevieve Serra

Ms Wiedaad Philander

for their generous contribution in ensuring that Oom Freddie Blom's 114 birthday celebration was dignified; furthermore, commends the broader community of Cape Town for coming together in the spirit of Ubuntu

and contributing to uplifting the spirit of Oom Freddie, Auntie Netta and the Blom Family during the special period. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are no objections. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Sorry members. I heard something. Is there an objection or is ... [Interjection.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Beerwinkel was next. [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please, members. Hon member Tyatyam, thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates and supports the newly formed Action to Action Group in Kuils River who have registered themselves with the Department of Social Services so that they can fill the gap of services not rendered and projects that will uplift the local community but also to build strong community and family values; also to assist community members to equip themselves with the necessary skills to become self-sufficient.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. The next round. I see the hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the principal of Zeekoeivlei for being one of the few principals who still do physical visits to houses to ensure that learners who have challenges, that those issues are being addressed and are visited. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are no objections. That concludes motions without ... [Interjections.] Sorry. I do not see hands or papers or ... [Interjections.] Hon member Dugmore, I see you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern the rising tensions between competing taxi associations operating from the Delft taxi rank, which threatens to spiral out of control; and notes further the tension that arose from the lucrative Delft to Cape Town route which both associations claim to have permits to operate on and this House therefore calls on the hon MEC Donald Grant to speedily intervene and not to delay further as human lives are at stake.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Okay. So that does not constitute an objection. There is no objection. I see the hon member Beerwinkel. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, play nicely now man.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the organisation “Cool Play” for initiatives in sport being introduced at schools to enhance life skills and to strengthen strong community values. They are also hosting a family sports day on 20 May in the Northern Suburbs to get the message out to the broader community.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are no objections. [Interjections.] I take it there is no more. I can now say that concludes motions without notice. We now move to the Orders of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration and finalisation of the Western Cape Housing Development Amendment Bill [B2 - 2017]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary. I see the hon, the Minister, I see Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, just to remind this House the purpose of tabling this Amendment Bill: This Bill will provide powers for the Department of Human Settlements to acquire and dispose of immovable properties for human settlement development.

As we all know, that for us to be able to do what we are supposed to be doing as a Department, land is very, very important and any other asset that can be turned into a shelter for the people of the Western Cape. It also seeks to disestablish the Western Cape Housing Development Fund, which is a process that we started some time ago.



I mean, again, this House will remember that we inherited a fund that was in a mess and a lot of work was done to make sure that we identify the properties within that fund and some of those properties were then disposed in terms of allocating them to the relevant people and relevant municipalities, but also to effect a number of tactical corrections and administration amendments to tidy up the Western Cape Housing Development Act.

Madam Speaker, we have discussed this matter with the Human Settlements Committee and it has also gone through the Cabinet. As I said, it is a process that we started some time ago. We definitely need this particular vehicle to actually replace the fund that we have as we are disestablishing it, so that we will be in a position, as I said, to do what we are expected to do.

*[Hon member Gillion takes the Chair as the Temporary Chairperson.]*

I must also add, House Chair, that this Department went to public participation. The Standing Committee on Human Settlements resolved to undertake public hearings on this matter. There were hearings that were heard in George, in Saldanha, in Cape Town and we have taken note of the submissions that were made by a number of people and we have taken into cognisance all those submissions. We believe that some of these submissions are speaking to what we want to achieve and some of the concerns that were raised will be incorporated into the establishment of this particular vehicle.

So, with those few words I would like to table this Western Cape Human

Settlements Amendment Bill, House Chair. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, MEC. I see the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Chair. The Western Cape Housing Development Amendment Bill will improve housing opportunities for residents in the province.

It will allow the Provincial Minister of the Department of Human Settlements to buy or sell land. This will allow more homes to be built more quickly. The Western Cape Housing Development Act must be amended for more land to be bought or sold. Only then can more homes be built for the residents of this province.

In particular it is the buying of land that is needed for the DA-led Western Cape Government to respond to its constitutional mandate of providing housing to the people of the province. Without land it would not be possible to build homes.

The Bill will also replace the fund, which no longer receives funding, with the Provincial Revenue Fund. This means that the money can more easily be directed to buy and sell land, scrapping restrictive red tape. Submissions were given by parties including [Inaudible.] Tourism, SALGA and various councillors, farmers and community members. Overall, the public's engagement with the Bill was positively received. These opportunities to

engage with residents clearly demonstrated the need for amendments to the current Act.

The Provincial Department of Human Settlements then responded to their comments. To ensure that more residents and stakeholders had an opportunity to engage with the Bill, the Committee extended the written submission deadline to 5 October 2017. Once we received them, collated all written and oral submissions, the Standing Committee on Human Settlements then considered and deliberated their decision on the Bill. [Coughing.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Drink some water. There is water on the table in front of you.

Ms L M MASEKO: Sorry. On the – do not mother me, it is irritating. [Interjection.] On 6 February 2018, the Standing Committee supported this Bill as it was decided the Bill was desirable to provide for the abolition of the Western Cape Housing Development Amendment Board, to determine general principles applicable to housing in the local spheres of government in housing development to establish a Western Cape advisory panel to ensure that housing development is integrated with all other phases of the development in a holistic manner.

Consequently on 8 March 2018 the Standing Committee on Human Settlements, having considered the subject of the Bill, referred it in terms of Standing Rule 171 without amendment. Chair, it must be noted that the fund

is dormant, and no funds are deposited in it. All income and expenditure currently flow through the Provincial Revenue Fund. Therefore, all stakeholders have agreed that the fund should be disestablished.

The National Department of Human Settlements is also in the process of amending the National Act regarding the implementation of the Amendment Act. The Act will come into operation on a day determined by the Premier by a proclamation in the *Provincial Gazette*. The Provincial Department of Human Settlements is currently preparing a document that will be issued in terms of the Act, to give consent to the matters prescribed therein.

In conclusion, I call on the House to support the Western Cape Housing Development Amendment Bill [B2 - 2017]. As the DA in the Western Cape, we remain committed to not only delivering houses but to building inclusive communities, which residents can be proud of and enjoy. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: I see the hon member Davids.

*[The Speaker takes the Chair.]*

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Housing Amendment Bill contains many vague provisions and concerns regarding the acquisition and disposal process of land. The explanation the Department provided sounds good, but they are not clearly stated within the Bill. Spatial development plans are omitted from the Bill and they do not feature in any of the Bill's

policy mechanisms.

Section 22 (a) and 22 (b) are the most vague and problematic amendments of the Bill. The Bill further provides that the Provincial Government or Provincial Minister may dispose of immovable property for less than market value or for no consideration in terms of a prescribed process. This process should have been detailed in the Bill.

Any such disposals must be in accordance with the PFMA and undertaken after certain factors have been considered. The Provincial Government's interpretation of fair may differ from that of the national or local governments. The word "fair" should have been defined more, in order to give a greater understanding of the Provincial Government's intent.

Further criticism of the acquisition and disposal mechanisms of the Bill was raised many times during the limited consultation period. Provision for openness, transparency and accountability when land or property is acquired or sold are omitted.

Provisions should be made in the Bill that all property bought and sold by the Province be beneficial to the community at large and not be sold to individual developers. What are the interests of the Provincial Government compared to the interests of the communities, the poor and the working class and society at large?

There should be a clear provision which determines land should be acquired in the interest of the relevant communities that need the land and housing and not in the interest of 021-Towers and a R10 billion harbour anchor development.

It is important to note SALGA's concern regarding determination of whether to dispose of land for less than market value or no cost is narrowly based on the interests of the Provincial Government alone and not that of national or local government development objectives, or the best interests of the state as a whole.

The Provincial Government's interests have proven to be luxury apartments and mixed used residential developments at the expense of the environment and the poor and the working-class residents of the Western Cape. The ANC therefore does not support this vague and non-transparent amendment.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the ACDP supports this Bill. I do not sit on this Committee, but I know the fund was in a mess and the Department got the fund out of a mess. I sit in SCOPA ...[Interjections.] and this was presented at SCOPA many a times. But, Madam Speaker, reading the Bill, it makes sense. It gives the Department power to acquire and also dispose land and we as the ACDP support this Bill fully because it is just common sense. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] In the ... [Interjections.] Order please. Hon members, in the absence of the hon EFF, I see the Minister, Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Olivier and hon Christians, after the sitting please. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Allow the Minister to proceed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... thank the Chairperson for outlining the process followed and quoting the relevant legislations which are very, very important for the Department of Human Settlements. I do want to responnd, Madam Speaker, to some of the concerns that are raised by member Davids because I honestly want to appeal to this House, so that they understand the importance of passing this Bill.

Now, the Department of Human Settlement's responsibility is only that of building houses for poor people. This Department does not build houses for rich people. It only builds houses for poor people. Now if you talk about the interests of the poor people, this is exactly the mandate of this Department.

The second concern that you are raising, disposal of land at less than market value or no value at all - I mean it is very, very crucial, because remember we can only dispose land to two types of people.

1. It can be disposed with the municipality as an implementing agent and the municipality can then in turn build houses for poor people or;
2. It can only be disposed directly to the end users, who are beneficiaries in projects where we are directly implementing the projects.

So, there is no other disposal that can happen of land by this Department. It can only go to the municipality, to the beneficiaries that we are building houses for, because in some projects the municipalities are our implementing agents and some projects we are the developers directly.

So, it will then be important that once we acquire this land we cannot expect the poor people to pay for the disposal of it. That is why we are saying, we will dispose this land at less than market value to municipalities for example or at no value at all to the end users, which are beneficiaries. [Interjections.]

Now, when you talk about the interests, as I said, I think I touched on this matter, because you are raising the interests of the people. This is exactly what we aim to do, because as things stand, you know the biggest danger, now we are busy with the process to disestablish the fund because remember this arrangement is more or less the same as the arrangement that we had before the Western Cape Housing Development Fund, which was used to



house our properties.

We started the process with the support of the National Department to disestablish the fund which means we now have no mechanisms whatsoever to acquire the land that we need to be able to build houses and that is why we started this process, to be able to have a vehicle that will assist us to acquire the land that we need to build houses.

Otherwise, without that, it would be very, very difficult for this Department to do what it is supposed to do and that is really the reason for my appeal. It is not about playing politics on this matter. This is a very, very important decision that we need to make.

This is a very important decision that we need to make because the only mandate of this Department is to build houses and any property that will be acquired will be exactly for that. I do not want us to confuse the mandate of the Department as custodian of the land of the entire Provincial Government which can do any other thing, which is the Department of Public Works, with this particular Department.

So, my appeal then is for us to support this Bill so that we can be able to do what we are supposed to do as the Department of Human Settlements to build houses for poor people. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela. That concludes the debate

on this Order. Are there any objections to the Bill being finalised?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be recorded. Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: I would like you to follow the Rules, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Okay. So, since there is an objection we are now going to go to ayes and the nays. Shall I put the questions? Those in favour of the motion being agreed to will ... [Interjections.] – †nee wag, ek kom nog, [no wait, I'm still getting there] - the division. [Interjections.] I put the question: Those in favour of the motion being agreed to will say "aye".

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The SPEAKER: Those against say "no".

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: Okay. The ayes have it. Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: I now call a Division on behalf of the ANC, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. A Division has been called. The bells will be

rung for three minutes. Can we hear the bells for three minutes? We will reconvene after three minutes. Shall we wait for three minutes?

[Business of the House suspended at 18:29 and resumed at 18:32.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon members, a Division has been called for. I am going to ask that those in favour of the question should take their seat to my right and those against should take the seats to the left. As tellers I appoint the Whips of the parties. Thank you.

*[A Division was called and the House divided.]*

The SPEAKER: I have appointed the Whips as tellers. [Interjections.] Order please members. The House is in session. [Interjections.] Hon member Tyatyam, and hon – I forget your name Mr ACDP, maintain your composure – †asseblief man. [please, man.] Gosh. [Interjections.] Hon Christians – thank you. [Interjections.] No-no, I am just asking you to cooperate. Do not allow hon member Tyatyam to ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The speaker says thank you for joining the DA.

The SPEAKER: I never said a word. Do not put words in my mouth, hon member Dyantyi, please. Thank you. We will have a count in just a minute. Okay. Thank you. Hon members, the result of the Division is as follows: the aye's 16, the no's 13. The motion is therefore agreed to. The Secretary will

read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Housing Development Amendment Bill.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary. The Bill will now be sent to the Premier for assent. I thank you. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of the Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B2 – 2018] NCOP. Ratification of final mandate.

The SPEAKER: Order please. The House received the Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to not support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. I see the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.] Huh?

The SPEAKER: Sorry. Your microphone.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is annoying. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: That is what I am going to do to you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, please speak to me.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes. But tell the Chief Whip to leave me, Madam Speaker. He is messing with me. Madam Speaker, the ANC component of this House gives notice that it fully supports and appreciates the National Treasury allocation to the Province in the form of the Division of Revenue Bill as presented.

The National Treasury DORA Allocation to all provinces makes up 43% of the total National Fiscus, with the miniscule reduction in Provincial Equitable Share of 0.3%. It is just ludicrous and disingenuous for the DA to object to the DORA allocation without forwarding substantial reasons.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Biting the hand that feeds you.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Exactly. Though tax is predominantly collected in urban areas, the distribution by the DORA concentrates on the rural areas and that is rightly so. Earlier in the debate we heard how the DA boasted about the wonderful services they deliver, but with which money to they do that? [Interjections.] This very DORA – aah!

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.] Hon members, order please. There is a speaker on the floor.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...allocation comes from the tax money of all of us. A formula is used to determine the allocation and unless you as the DA apply that formula, you have no basis for your statement of unfair distribution. [Interjections.] The fact that you boast about title deeds as an example – Madam Speaker, they boast about title deed handovers. It is the very allocation from this DORA that allows them to do that. [Interjections.] The basis ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The fact that the Western Cape has allocated less, means the need here is less. [Interjections.] The DORA allocation to this province makes up 95% of the Provincial Budget, which automatically then means that to make up your 100% your own revenue only contributes a measly 5%. [Interjections.]

What possible, sensible motivation can you have for objecting to the DORA Bill? The DA does nothing about finding more innovative ways to increase own revenue opportunities. Instead they rely on the evils of society, namely, gambling and liquor license applications, increases in motor vehicle licenses, fees to up their game on own revenue ... [Interjections.] especially using the over collection to their advantage. [Interjections.]. These ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...will impact on the already burdened population of the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Over the MTEF period the allocation to this province increases year on year from R59 billion to R67 billion in the outer year. So where is your concern about an allocation that has decreased? Of concern though, is that by the end of the third quarter, the Conditional Grant allocated to education for HIV and AIDS ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, sorry to interrupt you. Your three minutes you have been allocated have expired. If you could finish your sentence, please. Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Okay. Let me just use this one then. Of concern though is, by the end of the third quarter the Conditional Grant allocated to education for HIV and AIDS life skills education, had only spent 42% of its budget and learners with disabilities only 58% of its budget.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Beerwinkel. [Interjections.] The ACDP. Do I see the ACDP? Yes, I do.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the allocation is not done fairly because it does not take into consideration people that come to this province.

[Interjections.] Our schools ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... are overcrowded. Our clinics are overcrowded and yet the money does not follow the people. [Interjections.] So, Madam Speaker, a fair allocation would be ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... when the numbers are adjusted. It is common sense. We complain about overcrowding in classrooms, but we receive 20 000 pupils annually. Now with those 20 000 pupils that we receive annually we also get families, but giving more money is not taken into consideration for the Western Cape. So, we cannot support it, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you ...

The SPEAKER: I see the DA. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you to the Committee for the Declaration of the



Division of Revenue Bill. Firstly, Madam Speaker, I would like to thank the members, the Budget Committee, the Minister of the Department for understanding the circumstances and continuing in difficult circumstances to make sure that the Western Cape remains in good hands.

This institution, the Western Cape Provincial Government with the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, received the mandate to govern and to interact with National Government, to ensure that the equitable share to the Western Cape is just and fair. The Western Cape Government is concerned about the fiscal pattern taken by National Government on the Division of Revenue. The total debt has increased from R2,2 trillion to R3 trillion meaning the GDP ratio is on the increase.

Mr Deputy Speaker, a snap-shot from research from National Parliament indicated R57 billion for free higher education, R6,6 billion for drought in the Eastern Cape, Western Cape, Northern Cape and the Free State and the impact on DORA for VAT is around R22 billion. The ruling party, the ANC, on behalf of the state, is placing a burden on taxpayers by increasing VAT by 1% from 14 to 15%. The state continues to budget for failed state-owned entities, in particular SAA and Eskom, at the expense of the poor. The state capturing of SARS by the previous President has resulted in a R48 billion under collection in SARS. The Western Cape Government opposed the DORA on its final mandate due to the equitable sharing showing a reduction of a R144 million in the 2018/19 Budget.

The cut on the Western Cape Conditional Grant is R184 million in the 2018/19 financial year and the allocation process and criteria to inform the Conditional Grant lacks transparency and fairness to the Western Cape. The DORA increases the fiscal centralisation at the expense of the poor in the Western Cape [Interjections.]. For the ANC to say the need for the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D JOSEPH: For the ANC to say the need in the Western Cape is less, is not true. All cities are affected by the increase or migration of people [Interjection.]. We are expected to build more schools, more hospitals, increase in crime is affecting us, we are waiting on Government to introduce specialised units, where is the money for more teachers, where is the money for more policemen and for schools? Local Government and the District Municipalities are at the coal face of service delivery and the DA will not sit back, we will continue the fight for an increased equitable share so that we can deliver more ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... services to the poor. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Can we have some order please? Are there are objections to the ratification of the Conferment of Authority on

the Western Cape's Delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill? There are objections. Shall I put the question? I put the question. Those in favour of the report being adopted and that the mandate conferred to the Western Cape Provincial Delegation in the NCOP not to support the Amendment Bill be ratified will say 'aye', those against will say 'no'.

HON MEMBERS: No!

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The SPEAKER: I think the 'ayes' have it. A Division?

Mr P UYS: Will you just note the ANC not supporting it please.

The SPEAKER: The objection of the ANC is noted and will be recorded. Thank you. [Interjections.]. †Agb Dyantyi ek gaan vir jou in hierdie stoel sit, man. Hene! [Hon Dyantyi, I am going to put you in this chair, man. Goodness!] The Secretary will read the third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of the Report of the Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture on the Plant Improvement Bill [B8D – 2018] NCOP. Ratification of final mandate.

The SPEAKER: The House received the Report of the Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture on the Plant Improvement

Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. I see the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, honourable Speaker. The ANC continues to call for radical social economic transformation as an effective and holistic approach to eliminate the effects of the legacy of apartheid, that of racial dispute and exclusionary economy. It is for this reason that as an ANC, we do not support this Bill as it fails to use this legal instrument to effectively redress the constitutional obligation of the state by opening and enabling the transformation of the seed industry.

We argue that this Bill is more biased to commercial entities and will continue the dominance of multi-nationals already existing in this space. It places stringent provisions and red-tape on emerging and small-holder farmers who must be subjected to tedious application processes for exemptions in order to register their own varieties. The Bill does also not promote ease of exchange of seeds amongst small-holders that may not have significant material effect and as such may constrain trade and innovation.

It also ignores the existence of this as a cultural practice already existing amongst our traditional practitioners. We thus call upon National Government but also the Provincial Government to undertake a thorough investigation of the seed industry and its transformation as a matter of urgency. This must consider a special regime to promote and develop emerging and local small-

holder farmers to be active in the seed industry, bringing diversity of race and gender in a quest to realise an inclusive seed industry and creating an inclusive economy.

This must be done to harmonise both the regulatory intent of this proposed legislation to the policy objectives of the National Plan for the Conservation and Sustainable use of plant genetic resources. I thank you.

The SPEAKER. Thank you. I do not see the ACDP. I see the DA.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Plant Improvement Bill [B8D of 2015], Section 76, aims to replace that Plant Improvement Act which really is about how business is cultivating and selling plants, how they register them, put standards on them, establish a system for the list of varieties and control the import and export of plants and propagating material.

Madam Speaker, the Standing Committee held three public hearings and received more than 430 submissions from the public. Our full Committee conferred on this House and to the Western Cape's Delegation in the NCOP that the authority not support the Bill for the following reasons. This Bill remains problematic in that it not only effectively eliminates a long established practice among small-holder farmers to exchange seed varieties but it also criminalises small farmers' practice of exchange. It also prohibits the sale of exchange of seed which does not meet stringent or highly

industrialised certification standards as stipulated in the Bill. And, Madam Speaker, while this Committee understands the market-driven economy, it must be observed that multi-national seed companies do dominate the South African seed industry. It does imply that South Africa's food security is well in the hands of these multi-national corporations which we believe places some kind of risk on South Africa's food and nutritional security.

It is further observed that South Africa's economic partners within the Brics community, India and Russia, have actively taken steps to protect the sovereignty of their seed suppliers in the interest of national security, therefore it is submitted that the Bill may compromise the constitutional right to food and nutritional security and refer to Section 27 of the Constitution in 1996.

The Bill does not recognise farmers' on-going seed pre-production practices, as my colleague over the other side says, nor does it recognise the role of farmers in maintaining and promoting seed diversity. Farmer based experimentation, maintenance, reproduction of seed as well as farmer-to-farmer exchange are core activities that ensure agriculture bio-diversity, an adaptation of varieties to local conditions. The Plant Improvement Bill not only fails to make provision for the protection and promotion of these activities but also serves as an attempt to criminalise the activities involved in seed exchange. Given the above reasons, for not supporting the Bill, the Committee recommends that the entire contents of the Plant Improvement Bill should be revised or that there should be separate legislation that speaks

to and addresses the concerns and interests of informal small-scale and part-time farmers. Madam Speaker, I ask that the House supports our recommendations.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Schäfer. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of authority on the Western Cape's Delegation in NCOP not to support the Bill? There are no objections. Agreed. [Interjection.] Hon member Dyantyi. No objections, agreed to. We now move to the Fourth Order – it is getting late I can understand – the Secretary will read the Fourth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of the Report of the Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture on the Plant Breeders' Rights Bill [B11D 2018] NCOP. Ratification of final mandate.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The House received the Report of the Standing Committee Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture on the Plant Breeders' Rights Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. I see the hon member Nkondlo. I see the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO: History is made, the DA is supporting the ANC [Interjections.]. An inclusive and transformed economy requires the state to [Inaudible.] legislative and regulatory regime that frames such an

environment. Inclusivity in the SA context has to embrace the diversity of our communities including their economic activities, both formally and informally. It is for this reason we note that this Bill falls short in protecting the traditional seed breeders. The Bill ignores the existing and old practices of small-scale farmers who are bartering, trading and sharing seeds for ages with no monetary value attached to such.

The extended scope and duration of breeders' rights are not considerate of the space needed by small-scale and emerging farmers to deal and develop new varieties which could result in them being beholden to large-scale commercial farmers and in a way, promoting indirect dominance and monopolistic behaviour. It is for this reason, that as the ANC, we do not support this Bill as it fails as a proposed legal instrument to effect, redress as a constitutional obligation. We thus call upon National Government, including the Province to conduct a thorough investigation into the industry.

Our legislative and regulatory framework must help us to enable and enforce competitiveness and diversity which is much needed to realise an inclusive seed industry and build that inclusivity of our domestic economy. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. This really is just an example of good working together as a Committee, focused on the principle



and not on the political. So, Madam Speaker, the Plant Breeders' Rights Bill is really about ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Keep quiet. Hon member Schäfer kindly take your seat. You know just for a minute we had agreed and I thought that was a hallelujah moment and now hon member Dyantyi is going down the road, so can we please afford the hon member Schäfer the opportunity to do her three minutes please. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She supports the ANC.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi I was talking to a procedural issue, you may proceed hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. So the Plant Breeders' Rights Bill is really about breeders' rights and again we had 430 submissions and we did not support this Bill because once again, it had specific issues and outlawed the age-old practice of exchanging seed which we believe was very important. But it has been submitted that it is unfair to subject the small-scale farmers to a system of royalty payments. Clause 10.2 of the Bill provides for exceptions for empowering the Minister to devise regulations which identify a category of farmers or plant varieties which will be exempted from Plant Breeders' Rights. However in practice, Madam Speaker, regulations can take an unreasonably long time to be devised and implemented through a legislative system. Therefore in the absence of such regulations, small-scale

farmers once again remain the most vulnerable community in agriculture remaining unprotected. The Constitution provides for the recognition of customary law and that is for the rights of farmers to save and exchange and to claim proprietary rights over seeds of traditional crop varieties and/or any associated knowledge.

It is submitted that the proposed Plant Breeders' Rights Bill is also at odds with the intended purpose and effect as envisioned in Chapter 6 of the National Environmental Management Biodiversity Act 10 of 2004. This Act provides for access and benefit sharing for indigenous biological resources and traditional knowledge and it excludes genetic resources. So, questions have been raised as to whether this Bill makes provision to protect farmers rights and local knowledge from being appropriated and with these reasons, the entire contents of the proposed Plant Breeders' Rights Bill should be revised or there should be once again separate legislation that speaks to and addresses the interests of the informal small-scale and part-time farmers. Madam Speaker, I ask that the House supports our recommendations.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of authority on the Western Cape's Delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill? There are no objections. [Interjections.]. Order please members, we are doing really well here, just hang in there. The Secretary will read the Fifth Order of the Day.

THE SECRETARY: Consideration of the Ad-hoc Committee Report on the

Nomination of the Public Service Commissioner.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are on your own.

The SPEAKER: Order please hon member Dyantyi. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration on the Report for a maximum of three minutes per party. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. Do I see the ANC?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, it is indeed disappointing that a tabling in this House described as a Committee Report does not in fact accurately reflect the discussions in the Committee. The concern that I and hon member Uys, in particular, had – I do not want to talk on his behalf, member Joseph and on behalf of the hon member from the ACDP – was that very clearly in this whole process, as opposed to all the provisions in the Constitution, as apropos to how members need to conduct themselves with integrity and due diligence, that clearly a decision had been made by the DA caucus to inflate the marks that were allocated to a particular candidate, irrespective of how various candidates performed in this election. That is a fact and if members are honest they will actually concede that. [Interjections.] Now clearly people have ...

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... preferences, people have ... [Interjections.] I am not casting aspersions, it is actually true. It is true. So the reality is that obviously people have preferences but when you have, Madam Speaker, a deliberate pattern, of each particular member of the Democratic Alliance, because if you look at the allocation of marks by hon member Joseph, if you look at the allocation of marks by hon member from the ACDP, you will see that there was at least an attempt to look at the merits of those ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] to be objective.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Exactly, hon Dyantyi, to be objective. So in that process, Madam Speaker, and I attended the last meeting, member Uys had apologised. We specifically asked that that particular concern – and that is why the ANC abstained from this particular vote or indication of support – that our view actually be reflected and when we look at this Committee Report we are shocked to see that that particular concern is not noted. We are here appointing a Western Cape Nominee for the Public Service Commission. It is absolutely important, given that this is literally a constitutional provision in terms of the Public Service Commission, that there can be no questions around the integrity of this process. So for those reasons, we from the ANC want to record our strong objection and actually ask you, Madam Speaker to guide in regard what remedies are now available to us ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please people.

Mr C M DUGMORE: What remedies are available to us, do we need to approach the Public Protector, do we need to approach the Courts, can you request that at least our comments which were asked to be recorded, are recorded so that we can at least have a proper discussion about it because I think the hon members and the Chief Whip of the DA and the leader of the DA must tell this House truthfully about what they did before they came to these Committee meetings. I think it is disgusting the behaviour that we saw. I think it is illegal, I think it is unconstitutional, I think it is a shame. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ACDP. Order please members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the important thing is that we were very unhappy with the scoring. The point is that I said to the DA – and everybody supported different candidates – I gave the score to this candidate that is now recommended. I gave the highest score to that candidate. I gave the highest score, so irrespective of how I feel, I still feel that the best person got the recommendation. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, there is a member on the floor.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No, no, Mr Deputy Speaker. I was there, member Dugmore, member Uys and the other members who were not there, they do

not even know what is happening and now – because they want to speak – but this is what I want to say. You can go and check the records. I gave this candidate the highest marks and I spoke to the Committee about the unhappiness and told them that I am not supporting a particular candidate but I feel that this candidate has the qualifications and experience to do the job. So I do recommend this person to the position of Public Service Commissioner. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Christians. I now see the DA.  
[Interjections.] Order please.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The vacancy of the Public Service Commissioner that came to an end in December 2017 brought us to this point where this House will nominate a candidate to the Premier. The Ad-hoc Committee was established according to Rule 114 and under the guidance of the Speaker, and I take this opportunity to thank all parties who served on this Committee, nine members from all political parties participated in this process.

The post was advertised in various newspapers, we received applicants from across South Africa ... [Interjections.] and most applicants showed that they have reasonable, general experience or knowledge of the position and we thank all applicants for their interest in the position in the Western Cape. Out of the six short-listed candidates who were interviewed, the two candidates who scored the highest points were recommended for full vetting by the State

Security Agency SSA to ensure that there are no defaults against the candidates names.

The Committee Report does reflect the accuracy of the process that the members view their decisions in the final outcome of the Committee. The ANC's preferred decision is noted in this House and the scores in the final result, as part of the process, is important. The process is credible, the result is credible, the candidates are credible. Madam Speaker, the Ad-hoc Committee met on 4 May 2018 to consider and conclude its business on the appointment of the Public Service Commissioner.

In the meeting the members deliberated on the two candidates, namely Mr Timothy Layman and Mr Leonardo Goosen. Three political parties participated in this final process, namely the DA, the ANC and the ACDP. Mr Deputy Speaker the majority of the members present voted in favour of Mr Goosen and as per Standing Rule 230 (a) the Committee recommends to the House, for approval, Mr L Goosen as the Premier's nominee for appointment as the Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape. I move that this House adopts this recommendation of the Ad-hoc Committee. Madam Speaker, I take this opportunity to thank the Senior Committee Co-ordinator, Lizette Cloete and the support staff for the service they rendered to the Committee. I so move. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the debate on this Report. Are there any objections to the Report? And now I put the question, those in

favour of the Report being adopted will say 'aye'.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The SPEAKER: Those against say "no".

HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the 'ayes' have it.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I call for a Division.

The SPEAKER: A Division having being called for, the bells will be rung for three minutes. Hon members a division, three minutes. You cannot leave. Thank you. [Interjections.]

[Business of the House suspended at 19:07 and resumed at 19:10.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. A Division has been called for. I am going to ask that those in favour of the question should take their seats to my right and those against, to my left. As tellers I appoint the Chief Whips of the parties. Thank you. [Interjections.]

*[A Division was called and the House divided.]*



The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members. The result of the Division is as follows. The ‘ayes’ 16, the ‘nos’ 13. The Report is therefore adopted. [Interjections.] Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, I rise in terms of Rule 36 and Section 196 of the Constitution. I refer you to sub-paragraph B of Rule 36, “A Supporting Vote of the Majority of the Members of the House”, meaning 22, we defeated the DA today here clearly. †Gaan huistoe and gaan sê julle is verloor. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Go home and tell that you were murdered. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Uys. Sorry, order please, hon members. If I could just address you. My understanding of being quorate and the 50 plus 1 as per the Rule – so if we have 16 as a majority, then that is the majority, same as with the others. [Interjections.] Sorry I am giving you the guidance that I received from the Table. [Interjections.].

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, there are different Rules for different sections. This one is a very specific one. In the Constitution, 8 (b) 2:

“Approved by the Legislator by a resolution adopted with a supporting vote of a majority.”

Then you would have been right. A majority of its members and we are 42 members, so you need 22 to let this succeed and you failed. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Sorry I see the hon member Joseph on his feet.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, thank you very much ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: We are busy with a principle here that was applied for four other reports. Hon Joseph now wants ... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker I would just like to confirm Rule 230 (a) of the Rules of this House and that was the responsibility of this Committee, under that Rule, that we have made the recommendation. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, if I may address you again.

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr P UYS: "Votes required for Decisions", Rule 36. That spells out everything but, Madam Speaker, there is a specific sub-section 5 here that is different to all others and that is sub-section 5 and it takes its line from the Constitution because it is different. It is so important that this Public Service Commissioner must be nominated, not by the majority of members present, but of the majority of members and I think it is very important that we refer to the others then where there is reference. Let me refer you to Section 21, I think it is in the Western Cape Constitution. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr P UYS: And, Madam Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

Mr P UYS: ... and this is where I want to help you and show you the difference. Section 21 of the Western Cape Constitution 1 (c):

“A question before the Provincial Parliament is decided by a majority of the votes cast.”

Votes cast, that is normal voting but this is an exception and there they make a very clear distinction, not by the votes cast but they clearly say “by the members of this Legislature”, both in the Constitutions, both in our Rules. There is no uncertainty. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Uys. Hon Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In addition to Rule ...  
[Interjections,]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members. It is a serious matter.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In addition to Rule 230 (a) that I

quoted from our Rules ... [Interjections.] I want to add to say that the nomination to the Premier for the appointment of Public Service Commissioner is in accordance with sub-section 7(b), 8(b) of 196 of the National Constitution. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys. Sorry, hon member Uys. Members, please let us try and get some order.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, I quoted the Rules, I quoted Section 21 of the Provincial Constitution with a very clear distinction there and let us go back to the section, 196 Public Service Commission, there is a specific section. There is a section identifying and indicating how National Assembly must do it and there is one section saying how the Provincial one must do it.

Now Section 196 8 (b) “A commissioner nominated by the Premier”, meaning before she can nominate any person, any commissioner and that must go to the President of the Province, must be approved by the Legislature – this is the Legislature – by a resolution – there was a resolution – but adopted with a supporting vote of the majority of its members. If you clearly read Section 21 1 (c) you will say there is a very clear distinction between the two. The one is saying “majority of members” and the other one is saying “majority of votes cast” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Could I, sorry Chief Whip, order please members.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, there is obviously a difference of interpretation on this matter and we would ask that the Speakers consult with the Table Staff and advise us on an opinion please.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Hon member Uys I have heard all your - order please members - I have recorded as you have given the direction around which aspects of the Constitution and the Act and I deem it appropriate at this stage, considering that there seems to be a different interpretation of the Rule, that I be afforded the opportunity to take this back to the Table Staff and possibly the legal people, if needs be, and then revert to the House at the soonest possible next opportunity, if that is appropriate.

Unfortunately we cannot do it this evening. I will not be able to do it this evening. [Interjections.]. Sorry, Chief Whip? Are you of the opinion that I should consult now and come back to the House? [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes you must come back to the House.

Ms T M DIJANA: We are waiting.

Mr M G E WILEY: I do not know. Are you able to do that tonight still, because it is not going to be resolved?

The SPEAKER: Hon members I can understand that you are keen to get an outcome. I too do not like to leave things hanging in the air. Unfortunately I

do not have access to our legal people right now. I would imagine that they would have left and it might entail ... [Interjections.]. No, no hold on.

Ms P MAKELENI: You must call them.

The SPEAKER: Can we adjourn the House for five minutes? Sorry, Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I would suggest that we adjourn pending a proper opinion and that if another decision has to be taken then we will do so. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon member Tyatyam raised a valuable point. He does not want to leave [Inaudible.]. I am going to ask that we adjourn the proceedings for five minutes to give us an opportunity to try and come to an understanding based on everything that was raised here and we will get back to the House within the next five minutes I thank you.

[Business of the House suspended at 19:22 and resumed at 19:37]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon members allow me to thank you for your patience. I have had deliberations with the Table Staff. Hon member Uys, I have taken your points of order, which are very pertinent, into consideration and at this point in time, I myself am not comfortable because there is a matter of interpretation, there is a matter of technicality. So, I am going to

have to apply my mind and I am going to request that I come back to the House after I have applied my mind, made an informed decision and we will then deal with the matter then.

So, that concludes the debate, the House is adjourned. [Interjections.] Hon member Uys, I have adjourned the House. [Interjections.] That is the Business of the Day.

[The House adjourned at 19:38.]

*[Recorded after formal adjournment]*

Mr P UYS: Can't take that hey? Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr P UYS: Just the position of the ANC. The ANC is very clear. There was no proper resolution to take that forward and that is where we stand. If the DA or yourself wants to prove otherwise, I think you will have to do that. We stand with the resolution and the outcome of that, that was taken today.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Uys.